

The Linacre Quarterly

Volume 70 | Number 1

Article 1

February 2003

Letter to the Editor

Mary C. Geach

Follow this and additional works at: <http://epublications.marquette.edu/lnq>

Recommended Citation

Geach, Mary C. (2003) "Letter to the Editor," *The Linacre Quarterly*: Vol. 70: No. 1, Article 1.

Available at: <http://epublications.marquette.edu/lnq/vol70/iss1/1>

Letter to the Editor

To the Editor:

I wish to protest the misrepresentation of my views by the Rev. Frances M. de Rosa in the August, 2002 issue of *The Linacre Quarterly*. In his article he discusses various views on the subject of embryo rescue, and tries to summarize my arguments as given in my address to the Linacre Centre's 1997 Conference in Cambridge (published in Luke Gormally [ed.] *Issues for a Catholic Bioethic*, London: The Linacre Centre, 1999, pp. 341 – 346). His summary falsifies what I say in the following way:

Firstly, he says that I argue that embryo rescue is unchaste. I do not.

Secondly, he argues as though I say that the proposed embryo rescue would be surrogacy. I do not.

Thirdly, I mention in my paper a possibility arising from existing techniques: that a woman might have her child, conceived in marriage, transferred from her womb (because of that womb's unfitness to bring the child to term) and placed in the womb of another woman. If it is not wrong to rescue embryos from the freezer, then it is hard to see why this kind of rescue would be wrong. Fr. de Rosa makes nonsense of some my remarks by treating them as statements of the consequences of embryo rescue from the freezer rather than as statements of the consequences, seen in the light of this example, of saying that there is no intrinsic evil in a woman's allowing herself to be made pregnant with a child not her own. Among these consequences is the lawfulness, in the case envisaged, of what would be surrogacy by the first of the *Donum Vitae* definitions.

Those who want to know what I actually think should read what I say, and not rely on those who, like Fr. de Rosa, represent me as arguing to the conclusion that embryo rescue would be unchaste.

– **Dr. Mary C. Geach**
London