

The Linacre Quarterly

Volume 45 | Number 2


Article 16

5-1-1978

[Book Review of] *Ethics in Medicine: Historical Perspectives and Contemporary Concerns*, edited by Stanley J. Reiser, Arthur J. Dyck, and William J. Curran

Thomas A. Shannon

Follow this and additional works at: <http://epublications.marquette.edu/lnq>

 Part of the [Ethics and Political Philosophy Commons](#), and the [Medicine and Health Sciences Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Shannon, Thomas A. (1978) "[Book Review of] *Ethics in Medicine: Historical Perspectives and Contemporary Concerns*, edited by Stanley J. Reiser, Arthur J. Dyck, and William J. Curran," *The Linacre Quarterly*: Vol. 45: No. 2, Article 16.
Available at: <http://epublications.marquette.edu/lnq/vol45/iss2/16>

all; they do not arise *ex vacuo*. But how should medicine, as a profession, respond when parents refuse life-saving or life-sustaining measures for their newborn children, even supposing that the parents' decision is morally a reasonable one? Asking questions like this, I have found, brings medical students to think about medicine in the way that Hauerwas recommends so persuasively. Attempting to answer these sorts of questions is a frustrating business to be sure, but doing so will enable physicians to discover what shape and character of their basic convictions, as physicians, ought to take. This is the task that Hauerwas has set for us, one indeed that medicine must—quite literally—“live out.” Though he disclaims having a solution to understanding what medicine's story should be, Hauerwas in these essays advances our inquiry and thus more firmly engages us in it. It is for this reason that his work is worth the task that it demands. This book is a rich gift indeed.

— Laurance B. McCullough, Ph.D.
Texas A & M University

Ethics in Medicine: Historical Perspectives and Contemporary Concerns

Stanley J. Reiser, Arthur J. Dyck, and William J. Curran, Editors

The MIT Press, 28 Carleton St., Cambridge, Mass. 02142, 1977. xii + 679 pp., \$40.00 cloth, \$19.95 paper.

The editors of this volume have presented an extremely rich and valuable collection of documents and essays on ethical problems in medicine. Topics include: the physician-patient relationship, the moral basis of medical ethics, regulation and consumer protection in public health, truth-telling, human experimentation, procreative decisions which include population policy, genetics, abortion and fetal experimentation, suffering and dying, rights and priorities in medical care which include health care as a right, the allocation of scarce resources, and the economics of resource allocation.

Since detailed commentary on even some of the 103 articles/documents included in this volume is impossible, this review will focus on the quality of the collection and its strengths. First, several elements are included here which are unavailable in other similar anthologies. Primarily, these are the historical documents. A good sample of a variety of codes of medical ethics is provided so that the reader can gain a perspective on continuing elements of concern in such codes. Second, a variety of government documents such as reports, guidelines, and policy statements are included. This policy dimension is valuable because it describes the more active role the government is now playing in the area of health policy. Third, there is an international dimension in that articles and documents from other countries are included. Many will find this material helpful both for giving a different perspective and for broadening the discussion. Fourth, the inclusion of a section of the economics of resource allocation is an excellent step in the correct direction, for this area is most critical and deserves more attention by the people in medical ethics. Finally, with the exception of certain “classic” articles in medical ethics, the reprinted articles were published after 1970, and thus represent the best of contemporary scholarship.

The physical size of the book may be a drawback for some (it weighs almost five pounds). The total price of the book may also be a detriment, but on a cost per article basis, the book is relatively inexpensive. All in all, this volume ought to serve for many years as one of the standard texts in medical ethics. It is a pleasure to recommend this volume to those in medical ethics.

— Thomas A. Shannon
Department of Humanities, Worcester Polytechnic Institute

Counseling the Homosexual

John Cavanagh, M.D.

Our Sunday Visitor Inc., Huntington, Ind. 46750. 352 pp., \$14.95.

Dr. Cavanagh's popular and useful book published in 1966 and then titled *Counseling the Invert* reappeared with some revisions, a changed title, and a new publisher in September, 1977. The price has doubled since the first edition, but then inflation has hit hard in the publishing industry.

Economic inflation has not nearly matched the inflation of interest and genuine concern about homosexuals and their problems since 1966. Not only have great numbers of individual homosexuals come "out of the closet" but militant homosexual organizations are lobbying for their civil rights. Attempts to control the possibly harmful role of homosexuals as school teachers are met with tremendous hostility, as Anita Bryant can attest.

In his book, Dr. Cavanagh speaks to the clergy and other counselors from his perspective as a psychiatrist who believes in the objective immorality of homosexual actions. Because of that belief his book will be rejected by those in contemporary society who take a more permissive position on homosexuality. They will consider his outlook a "voice from the past" and look upon the new edition of this book as a useless repetition of antiquated views.

Unfortunately Dr. Cavanagh's critics will be able to correctly argue that his new edition does not adequately reflect the tremendous research and debate about homosexuality which have occurred since 1966. For example, the 25 page bibliography at the end of the book contains predominantly his pre-1966 references with only scattered insertions of more recent research. It even fails to include an important article by Fr. John Harvey in *American Ecclesiastical Review* ("The Controversy Concerning the Psychology and Morality of Homosexuality," Nov., 1973), although Fr. Harvey contributed two chapters to this book. Likewise the text of the book relies primarily on pre-1966 data with some very useful exceptions. For example, the revisions of chapters 13, 14, and 15 (Homosexuality and the Law, Homosexuality and Government Agencies, and Homosexual Organizations) do provide some important and useful new information.

Furthermore, the very significant material carried over from the first edition on causes and clinical features of homosexuality, on homosexuality and marriage, on homosexuality and the religious life, and on pastoral counseling of homosexuals has continuing relevance for priests and counselors today. Also, the two excellent chapters written by Fr. John Harvey for inclusion in this book ("Changes in Nomenclature and Their Probable Effect" and "Contemporary Theological Views") help immensely in updating the book.

Since the book first offers 17 chapters about homosexuality before the 18th