# Using Robots and SLAM for Indoor Wi-Fi Mapping in Indoor Geolocation 

Biao Zheng<br>Worcester Polytechnic Institute<br>James Lincoln Castro<br>Worcester Polytechnic Institute<br>Sean Biao Zheng<br>Worcester Polytechnic Institute<br>Umair Abdul Rehman<br>Worcester Polytechnic Institute

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.wpi.edu/mqp-all

## Repository Citation

Zheng, B., Castro, J. L., Zheng, S. B., \& Rehman, U. A. (2013). Using Robots and SLAM for Indoor Wi-Fi Mapping in Indoor Geolocation.
Retrieved from https://digitalcommons.wpi.edu/mqp-all/1025

# Using Robots and SLAM for Indoor Wi-Fi Mapping in Indoor Geolocation 

A Major Qualifying Project Report

Submitted to the faculty of
Worcester Polytechnic Institute
In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
Degree of Bachelor of Science

By<br>James Castro<br>Umair Rehman<br>Biao Zheng


#### Abstract

Recently, Wi-Fi localization for indoor and outdoor applications has been a successful field for research and development due to its increasing demand. Companies such as Ekahau, Helsinki, Finland and Skyhook, Boston, MA design products around this concept. As more applications using these technologies are emerging in the market, the need for accurate and reliable localization increases. In response to this need, a number of technologies and associated algorithms have been introduced in the literature.

With the ever-increasing demand for navigation tools indoor navigation has become very popular. With the prices of smartphones and smart devices steadily declining, many people now have access to technology that was once out of reach and with the increase of consumers using smart devices there comes a demand for various applications for said devices. In the past navigation was mainly done for vehicles using GPS but since there has been an increase in localization being done with Wi-Fi, there has been an interest of making use of the various wireless access points throughout various buildings, department stores and public areas that are available. This kind of localization can be done without the need of having access to the various access points but rather use their RSS (Received Signal Strength) to calculate position. This kind of unobtrusive accessing can be done in places outside of one's home and will guarantee that the localization can be done anywhere there is a signal even places where GPS cannot.


In this project we want to compare the performance of a human collected database and a robot collected database for indoor localization systems with other commercially available systems (such as Wi-Fi Compass, Google Maps, etc.) and determining whether a human can be replaced with a robot for this kind of data collection.

## Additional Notes

This report was prepared by a group of three students, one of which, James Castro, will be submitting the first draft of the report at the end of D Term of 2012-13 academic year for partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Bachelor of Science. The other two students, Biao Zheng and Umair Rehman, will continue to work on this project and submit the modified version of this report by the end of A Term of 2013-14 academic year.

## Table of Contents

ABSTRACT .....
Additional Notes ..... ii
CHAPTER I Introduction ..... vi
1.1Background of Wi-Fi Localization ..... 1
1.2 Project Description. ..... 3
1.3 Project Report Outline ..... 3
Chapter II Background ..... 4
2.1 Traditional Localization Techniques ..... 6
2.2 Localization: Outdoor vs Indoor. ..... 8
2.3 Localization Algorithms ..... 12
2.4 SLAM Algorithms ..... 14
CHAPTER III Performance of Database Methodology ..... 17
3.1 Introduction (What Was Selected) ..... 17
3.2 Data Collecting Techniques ..... 18
3.2.1 Human Collected Database ..... 18
3.2.2 Robot Collected Database ..... 19
3.3 Algorithm Development and Implementation ..... 20
CHAPTER IV Results and Discussion ..... 22
4.1 Human vs Robot Collected Data Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.2 Results of Data Collection ..... 22
4.2.1 Database Creation: Human ..... 22
4.2.2 Database Creation: Robot Database ..... 22
4.2.3 Database Creation: Wi-Fi Compass ..... 23
4.2.4 Database Creation: Google Maps ..... 23
4.3 Performance Analysis ..... 24
4.3.1 Scenario for Performance Evaluation ..... 24
Wi-Fi Compass. ..... 25
Google Maps ..... 27
SLAM ..... 30
Overall Performance ..... 31
Chapter V Conclusions and Future Work ..... 32
Conclusions ..... 32
Future Work ..... 32
Appendices ..... 33
Appendix A Human Collected Database ..... 33
Appendix B Robot Collected Database ..... 42
Appendix C Matlab Code ..... 52
Appendix D Atwater Kent Eight Locations Coordinates. ..... 52

## Table of Figures

Figure 1: Google Indoor Map employing Wi-Fi Localization ..... 5
Figure 2: Wi-Fi vs. GPS in Indoor Environments ..... 6
Figure 3: Google Car Collecting Data ..... 7
Figure 4: Google Cars Collecting Data ..... 8
Figure 5: Slam Mapping AK 3rd Floor ..... 16
Figure 6: SLAM Iterations ..... 16
Figure 8: Human Collecting Database ..... 18
Figure 9: Robot Collecting Database ..... 19
Figure 10: Matlab Implementation of NNA ..... 21
Figure 11: Trajectory ..... 22
Figure 12: Sample Robot Database ..... 23
Figure 13: Data Collecting Points ..... 24
Figure 14: WiFi Compass Trajectory ..... 25
Figure 15: Wi-Fi Compass generated Database ..... 26
Figure 16: Wi-Fi Compass vs. Robot vs. Human ..... 27
Figure 17: Localization using Google Maps ..... 28
Figure 18: Google Map Eight Testing Locations ..... 28
Figure 19: Robot vs. Human vs. Google Maps Error Analysis ..... 29
Figure 20: Robot SLAM Trajectory ..... 30
Figure 21: Position Error Human vs Robot ..... 30
Figure 22: Overall Analysis ..... 31

## CHAPTER I Introduction

In this report you will find an introduction stating the reasons behind choosing this project as well as section about current work being done in this field. Next, there is a chapter on the background of this technology, the current methods being used and the applications in which they are being used. The third chapter is the methodology. In it we describe in detail our procedures as well as any other work that was done either by a member of the team, a robot or some code (Matlab). The fourth chapter deals with the results we acquired as well as what the results mean to the project's validity and its worth. The fifth chapter is a section devoted to the conclusions that we have determined to be important and what they imply about our project, followed by a section that explains any future work that we perceive to be feasible and worthwhile for any future project teams or areas of research. In the very end of this report you will find appendices related to the various additional data acquired as well as any code that was developed or used in this project. There is also a reference section stating all the various references and sources used to complete this project and report.


Figure 1: Entity Relationship Diagram Showing Performance Methodology

### 1.1Background of Wi-Fi Localization

Localization has generally been done outdoors but as technology advances and as the need of consumers' changes there is an increased interest in indoor localization. For this kind of localization there are various tools that are available in order to localize. Localization can be done using a few different methods. Three of the most common methods are using RSS (received signal strength) from wireless access points to triangulate position and track movement, 2-D mapping is another in which a given map is used to navigate through with known obstacles and markers and another is 3-D mapping using some form of visual guidance that allows for dynamic adjustment as the position of the person, robot or object changes. Precise localization techniques have been the interest of study for decades. Until recently, Global Positioning System (GPS) has been developed and widely used in commercial applications. However, its performance in indoor area is significantly deteriorated due to path loss and other signal degenerating agents. Due to the inaccuracy of GPS in indoor applications, there is an increasing demand for precise localization inside buildings. Wi-Fi based localization technology makes use of Received Signal Strength (RSS) to determine the position of an object inside a building. One of the advantages of Wi-Fi localization is that it uses an existing infrastructure, which makes it an inexpensive sensor with extremely low power consumption. Lastly, since it is also a software-based sensor, it is far easier to debug, test, and modify as opposed to hardware-based sensors.

Traditionally, indoor localization algorithms were mainly developed for tracking people and assets as. However, with the emergence of robotics, more and more applications involving automated tasks require precise localization of the robot. The main motivation behind robotic indoor localization is that such an application allows robots to be location aware. With modern software techniques, a robot can be automated to perform certain jobs inside a building as long
as the location is known. The unpredictable variation of RSS in the indoor environment is the major technical challenge for the RSS-based WLAN positioning systems. There are four main reasons that lead to the variation of RSS. First, due to the structures of the indoor environment and the presence of different obstacles, such as walls and doors, etc. the WLAN signals experience severe multi-path and fading and the RSS varies over time even at the same location. Secondly, since the WLAN uses the licensed-free frequency band of 2.4 GHz , the interference on this band can be very large.

After the release of Google Indoor Maps, Wi-Fi localization has had an increase in demand. Various companies have had an interest in indoor Wi-Fi localization such as Skyhook Wireless, Apple and Google. These companies are trying to map Wi-Fi access points by surveying inside buildings either by employees of their our companies or by having the management of these building provide them with the necessary blueprints and locations of their wireless access points. We want to find an inexpensive and accurate method to map Wi-Fi access points inside buildings by using robots to do this task.

Depending on the necessary accuracy needed and limitations presented these methods can be used standalone or combined in various forms in order to produce a better mapping and an overall better tracking of position and guidance. One of the more common combinations is using Wi-Fi localization and a 2-D map in order to navigate. This creates a stable and accurate mapping that can be used although it does have some faults. A couple of its major faults are the inherent nature of wireless signals to dissipate at varying rates according to its surroundings and is further hindered by the number of access points available in the vicinity. Another major fault is since the map is static, any changes to the environment will have to be manually added and navigation will have to adjust to the change by going around, through or over the obstacle. The
new method of using visual aids in order to navigate through an area and track movement has been increasing in popularity due to needing but a single sensor in order to perform its task. This method is currently being worked on at Worcester Polytechnic Institute.

### 1.2 Project Description

In this project we first collected two kinds of reference databases, one collected by hand using the program WirelessMon to accumulate the RSS values and their corresponding MAC addresses measured as the human walked through the third floor of Atwater Kent. The person's location was also manually tracked throughout the entire process. The other reference database was collected by Turtlebot using WirelessMon to collect the Wi-Fi information we needed while having the SLAM algorithm running to navigate through the third floor and collecting its path using its odometry values. These databases were then later used to compare the position error calculated using the Nearest Neighbor Algorithm with other localization methods. With these results we hope to be able to determine whether a human can be replaced by a robot for this kind of data collection.

### 1.3 Project Report Outline

In this report you will find an introduction stating the reasons behind choosing this project as well as section about current work being done in this field. Next, there is a chapter on the background of this technology, the current methods being used and the applications in which they are being used. The third chapter is the methodology. In it we describe in detail our procedures as well as any other work that was done either by a member of the team, a robot or some code (Matlab). The fourth chapter deals with the results we acquired as well as what the results mean to the project's validity and its worth. The fifth chapter is a section devoted to the conclusions that we have determined to be important and what they imply about our project,
followed by a section that explains any future work that we perceive to be feasible and worthwhile for any future project teams or areas of research. In the very end of this report you will find appendices related to the various additional data acquired as well as any code that was developed or used in this project. There is also a reference section stating all the various references and sources used to complete this project and report.

## Chapter II Background

In this section, a comprehensive synopsis of Wi-Fi localization with respect to our project is provided. The main localization methods and their respective algorithms are discussed. An overview of Wi-Fi localization for indoor and outdoor applications is described and how everything is interrelated with the database and applied algorithm is also explicated. Later in the sections our motivation to choose indoor environments for this project is reasoned, traditional localization techniques like Wi-Fi Compass and Google Maps utilized in this project are also explained and the background of our applied Nearest Neighbor Algorithm (K-NN) in this project is given.

Localization refers to the process of determining an object's location in space. It helps people in so many fields such as locating a building or an object on the earth. The localization system is used in many areas, the best known is the Global Positioning System (GPS). Today GPS makes outdoor localization so easy. The system provides critical capabilities to military, civil and commercial users around the world. GPS is a space-based satellite navigation system that locates four or more of the GPS satellites, figure out the distance to each, and use this
information to deduce the GPS's location; with the time information such as the speed of the object, it can navigate the object from one location to another. The accuracy of a position determined with GPS depends on the type of receiver. Most hand-held GPS units have about 1020 meter accuracy which is great for outdoor use. For indoor and even outdoor use we employ Wi-Fi localization techniques which are another big area of research and development. Wi-Fi localization is used in billions of smart devices and companies in Wi-Fi Localization receive several billions hits per day. Wi-Fi Localization according to many statistics is the $2^{\text {nd }}$ most popular after GPS and more popular than cell tower localization. It is used in thousands of Smartphone Apps and current Wi-Fi localization which was traditionally being employed in outdoor Google Maps is also used in Google's recently released indoor maps.


Figure 1: Google Indoor Map employing Wi-Fi Localization

Indoor positioning technology is an important issue to be addressed for providing any kind of location based services. There were lot of approaches for this technology by the user of active sensors like active badge, active bat, etc. (Hightower and Borriello, 2001), and some approaches use the in-building Wi-Fi networks for indoor positioning. The use of Wi-Fi signals as a potential positioning system within buildings has opened doors for many applications. Lot of research is being undertaken in this domain to find a more viable solution of location positioning using the Wi-Fi signals within the building with higher accuracy. This is because of the ubiquitous availability of Wi-Fi signals in almost all the buildings, so no additional hardware is required to install a positioning system in the buildings.


Figure 2: Wi-Fi vs. GPS in Indoor Environments
(Shin, 2006)

### 2.1 Traditional Localization Techniques

In order to perform the localization, first we need to collect data as reference or use the data to compare with reference. The data collecting for outdoor and indoor have different method.

For the outdoor data collecting, we often see a Google car running around the city to collect data from Wi-Fi networks. While taking pictures for its Street View project, Google also recorded Internet traffic from open Wi-Fi networks in homes and businesses. To capture the
images and the data, Google used cars equipped with roof-mounted cameras and computer hardware. There are 4 steps of this data collecting method.


Figure 3: Google Car Collecting Data
(Mobile, 2013)

The Google car's on-board computer listens for wireless routers, recording each router's unique hardware ID as well as its approximate GPS coordinates.

If a Wi-Fi network is not password- protected, the car's computer also saves any data transmitted across the network. That traffic can include e-mails and information from passwordprotected sites, which are not necessarily encrypted. If the network is password-protected, the computer does not save any of the network's traffic

The car's computer maintains a connection with a given network for only about one-fifth of a second, because the software cycles through 11 Wi-Fi channels every 2.2 seconds. A Wi-Fi router generally broadcasts on a single channel.

In the one-fifth of a second that the computer is connected to a network in each cycle, the amount of data collected could be as much as 250 kilobytes, equal to roughly 25 e-mails, or more. It is also possible that a car may connect with a network multiple times, if, for example, it is stopped at a red light.


Figure 4: Google Cars Collecting Data
(GRÖNDAHL, How Google Collected Data From Wi-Fi Networks, 2012)

### 2.2 Localization: Outdoor vs Indoor

Likewise, research location systems like RADAR and Cricket are limited to be functional in indoor environments and require a great amount of effort to use them in a greatly larger area. The systems in indoor environments can give accurate estimates of users' positions within about four meters. However the accuracy comes at the cost of much time spent on installation and calibration, thus the systems are deployed in limited areas.

Possibly for a large class of location-aware applications, ubiquitous availability of location information is important. However the main obstacle would be to control the cost of installation and calibration while deploying the system across an entire city for example.

With the increasing number of people using laptops and wireless Internet, the deployment of Wi-Fi access points is almost omnipresent in every major city. Ubiquity and a large number of Wi-Fi device users are two characteristics that make Wi-Fi localization viable.

So basically the process of RSS based Wi-Fi Localization employed in this project can be easily defined as the procedure of finding a user's location solely based on RSS readings. It involves two steps

- Collecting databases by surveying access point readings in known locations
- Comparing new RSS/MAC addresses while war driving with a known database and using an algorithm to approximate a user's location

Since its inception in the 1980s, Wi-Fi has become one of the wonders of the wireless revolution, nurturing ground-breaking innovations in popular applications. Always seeking higher data rates (now on the order of 100 Mbps ), Wi-Fi users employ the technology for wireless Internet access and the ever-growing multimedia applications that it supports.

These Internet applications are commonly used in indoor areas, where extensive multipath conditions require robust methods to achieve high data rates. As a result, WLANs introduced the first popular commercial application of spread spectrum technology, orthogonal frequency division multiplexing (OFDM), and more recently multi-input multi-output (MIMO) antenna systems.

In the second half of 1990s the Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency (DARPA) launched its small unit operation situation awareness system (SUO/SAS) program aiming at onemeter accuracy for indoor geolocation in military and public safety operations.

About the same time, venture capitalists started funding startup companies such as PinPoint in Woburn, Massachusetts, and WhereNet, based in Santa Clara, California. Both were seeking to develop and implement indoor geolocation technologies with high accuracies.

The idea of Wi-Fi localization created substantial enthusiasm in the industry. Various companies filed numerous patents targeting TOA-based indoor geolocation, and the general idea of using a wireless networking infrastructure for associated applications spread to standardization activities such as IEEE 802.15.3 for UWB communications and IEEE 802.15.4 for sensor networks using ZigBee technology.

Although TOA-based Wi-Fi localization uses an existing infrastructure, designers still need to modify the mobile devices' hardware to extract the TOA estimate from a received Wi-Fi signal. Moreover, implementation of a precision TOA-based system faces the same multipath challenges encountered previously, demanding complex algorithms and solutions.

The first generation of RSS-based RTLS products were software programs running on laptops and palm-top computers equipped with $\mathrm{Wi}-\mathrm{Fi}$ devices used for indoor tracking applications. The system included localization software and a graphical user interface (GUI). The localization software operated in two modes: data collection, in which the user builds up the reference database, and localization, when the software locates a terminal based on the relative strengths of RSS readings. The GUI in the mobile devices shows the map of building and estimated location of the terminal.

In metrowide Wi-Fi localization, a database is collected by wardriving the streets of a metropolitan area, using GPS to tag the location and time of measurements. Later, when a WPS mobile terminal reads the RSS of surrounding $\mathrm{Wi}-\mathrm{Fi}$ access points, it sends a request to a server to calculate the terminal's location by comparing its RSS readings with the database and previous GPS readings using a pattern-recognition algorithm.

One of the fundamental advantages of WPS is that it can be used as a standalone software solution for netbooks and laptops when they are not equipped with GPS or cell phone chipsets. This solution is natural, because netbooks and laptops use Wi-Fi chipsets to establish Internet connections. When a Wi-Fi network is available, WPS works.

Smart phones have cellular network connections as well as Wi-Fi chipsets. Wi-Fi signals from hot spots, home routers, and public access and enterprise wireless networks cover most of the indoor and urban areas where Internet applications are commonly used. In locales such as interstate highways, where Wi-Fi signals may not be available all the time, less accurate celltower localization can complement this coverage.

The size of a Wi-Fi AP database can be huge compared to the database of a RTLS system in a single building. On a national basis, the collection procedure requires many wardrivers across many metropolitan areas. In general the distribution of the actual Wi-Fi access points in metropolitan areas forms a stochastic process with particular spatial and temporal characteristics, because the number of the access points and their locations are constantly changing. During any given time interval, new access points are installed and some old access points are re-located or even disestablished.

Wi-Fi localization is emerging as a new technology that complements GPS in coverage, time to fix, and power consumption. This began with the introduction of RTLS technology tailored for more precise indoor applications in specific buildings and then extended to WPS technology with less rigorous requirements for accuracy but a wider geographic coverage- i.e., a metropolitan area.

RTLS is currently combined with GPS to provide accurate indoor tracking and coarser outdoor tracking when the asset or personnel is moving between two specific building destinations. WPS is integrated with GPS to provide for a comprehensive coverage in numerous everyday consumer applications. To extend the Wi-Fi localization applications to the military and public safety, we need to understand the effects of electromagnetic and radio frequency interference in this technology to have an optimum solution for its integration with GPS techniques.

Due to the limited reliability of GPS in indoor environments, we must use other techniques in order to track our position indoors as well as record specific locations of interest for later use. For indoor mapping and localization many people turn to one of the most used methods available, SLAM. SLAM stands for Simultaneous Localization and Mapping in which a robot uses various sensors and actively tracks its position and creates a map of its surrounding environment at the same time. This effectively acts as a substitute for human manually tagging positions onto a database and can make a map for an environment that does not have one already. By keeping track of its odometry, the robot can then use its collected data to navigate through the now known map essentially using its own collected data as GPS.

### 2.3 Localization Algorithms

Wi-Fi localization has gained much popularity over the recent years. Many indoor localization applications have revolved around the notion of using received signal strength measurements. Although there are methods to implement Wi-Fi localization using TOA, AOA, and RSS, the most widely used algorithm involves using RSS. There are typically two basic WiFi localization techniques that are generally used in indoor localization. These two methods
are the nearest neighbor method and the kernel method, as suggested by. The nearest neighbor method basically revolves around the notion of taking the measurements of many points inside of a building, and by using the RSS of the access points (AP), it estimates which point in the building the object is closest to simply by calculating the distance as shown in. The nearest neighbor method is an efficient method but is sometimes unpractical. The second method, Kernel method, is based on the idea of using a probability mass function and the Gaussian curve to estimate the position of the object.

Essential elements for Wi-Fi localization include MAC address and RSS. The MAC address can be used to identify surrounding APs and the RSS can be used to estimate the distance between specific AP and the terminal. Moreover, SSID and time stamps are usually recorded to provide a clear vision or the Wi-Fi localization process. System $\log$ are usually maintained and with a carefully trained database, real time Wi-Fi localization can be achieved.

Wi-Fi coverage analysis supports both open source software on laptop and application on Android phones for the RSS measurement. Since carrying a laptop is more difficult, in this project, we designed an Android application to measure and record the MAC address, and RSS of access points in close proximity as a provision for Wi-Fi localization. We used the same application for the android device and the robot so that comparison could be vindicated.

There are three major techniques to obtain the location estimate from the RSS.

Triangulation: The RSS can be translated into distance from the particular AP according to a theoretical or empirical signal propagation model. Then, with distance measurements from at least 3 APs with known positions, lateration can be performed to estimate the locations. This
approach does not give accurate estimate, as the indoor radio propagation channel is highly unpredictable and thus the use of the propagation model is not reliable.

Proximity: This method finds the strongest RSS from a specific AP and determines the location to be the region covered by this AP. This method only gives a very rough position estimate but it is easy to be implemented.

Scene Analysis: This method first collects RSS readings at known positions, which are referred to as fingerprints, in the area of interest. Then, it estimates the locations by comparing the online measurements with the fingerprints through pattern recognition techniques. This method is used by most WLAN positioning systems, as it is able to compute accurate location estimates. This is the approach used by the positioning and tracking system proposed in this report.

### 2.4 SLAM Algorithms

There are many SLAM algorithms that are used for mapping. The main difference amongst them is the addition of various filters that allow for more accurate results. While adding more filters does provide with a clearer picture, the resulting map is generally created the same way. The major component of SLAM is the use of occupancy grids analysis portion of the SLAM algorithm. During this time the various readings that the ranging sensor, usually a camera or an IR sensor, in our case a Kinect camera, are put into a series of grids. These grids can be X number of pixels in size but typically take the shape of a square because they are easier to handle when generating a map. The size of these squares correlate to the resolution necessary for the robot to traverse through an environment avoiding the edges of objects. This "cushion" is then used as the resolution of these occupancy grids that will allow the robot to map an environment
safely. These newly made squares have sub-squares inside that are assigned values to determine their existence in the physical world. By first predicting if there is an object present in the given square, the algorithm allows itself to adjust for any changes in the environment either from detecting a static object or an object that has crossed the path of the scan as it moves through an environment. Once these initial predictions are set any future scans will continuously update the probability of an object existing in a given grid until there is a high enough probability of an object existing, usually an average of 0.7 , and this grid is replaced with an occupied grid that is denoted on a map by a solid line segment. At times there are grids that overlap and if their combined probabilities dictate that there is a high chance of an object being in there, they are combined and filled in as a series of solid line segments resulting in a solid line. This procedure is repeated over the course of the robot's navigation through an area. After there are no longer any areas that have not been exposed to the ranging sensor, the robot stops and saves the map. Generally the robot would return to its start location or another designated area on the map that it might have found. Below you can see a near finished map created by the Turtlebot using its SLAM algorithm.


Figure 5: Slam Mapping AK 3rd Floor
Below is a pseudo example of how the SLAM does its mapping. The procedure is repeated until there no longer is any empty space in the observed "world" of the robot.


Figure 6: SLAM Iterations

## CHAPTER III Performance of Database Methodology

### 3.1 Introduction (What Was Selected)

In this chapter you will find the major steps taken when doing localization, step one: collecting a database and steps two is doing a performance analysis on the collected database. The first step in this project was to select an existing platform that could collect the database. In this search we came across various different mobile platforms that ranged heavily in accuracy and in price. We decided to be cost-effective and decided to use a platform that was relatively cheap and that could be easily reprogrammed to do additional tasks, add extra features such as Wi-Fi localization and increase accuracy by manipulating the code all while being open source. This platform proved to be exactly what we needed since its given features were enough to perform the tasks necessary in our project.

Since Turtlebot is an off-the-shelf mobile platform, not much setup was required. The only setup needed was that of a workstation computer that would communicate with the Turtlebot while it performed its tasks and would relay information in the form of visual data, numerical data or graphical data. The other tool being used for this project is a laptop that can easily be mounted on top of the robot when necessary. Since it is a stand-alone device, a simple USB cable connection is needed to connect the laptop to the laptop that runs the operations of the Turtlebot. The actual parsing of data being collected needed to be done using software manipulation and implementation to allow the Turtlebot to actually send its odometry to the laptop to be added to the database.

With the completion of the databases we then input all of our databases into Matlab to do the performance analysis using our localization algorithm.

### 3.2 Data Collecting Techniques

In this section we will discuss the various ways we collected the data and how we used them for performance analysis. This is the first process done when trying to do any kind of localization.

### 3.2.1 Human Collected Database

Below you can see an overview of how Biao collected the database by hand. This process was very time consuming and took 10 minutes to go through the designated path. Ten minutes may not sound like much time but the third floor of Atwater Kent is small compared to the whole building. The time taken to do this data collection is directly proportional to the size of the environment being mapped; it can take a couple of hours or more.


Figure 7: Human Collecting Database

The database created by going around the third floor by hand was accurate to say the least. It has many data points and can be used to compare various other instances of RSS values and MAC addresses effectively and reliably.

### 3.2.2 Robot Collected Database

Below you can see an overview of how we had our Turtlebot collect its own reference database. The path it would collect and use to associate the RSS values and MAC addresses was recorded using its odometry which then could be converted into the same coordinate system that the other reference database used. Its odometry would later be used to map its trajectory through the third floor and see how off course the robot was compared to the human.


Figure 8: Robot Collecting Database

The database created by the Turtlebot while it was performing its SLAM algorithm was comparable to that of the human collected database. Although this database has a few less data points collected, it odometry has provided us with an example to compare the two.

### 3.3 Algorithm Development and Implementation

For our project we chose to use the Nearest Neighbor Algorithm to calculate our position error. Using the pseudo code below, we develop a Matlab version of the code that would take in a reference database and a new database that did not contain any position information. The code would execute and produce a graph staying the position error between the measured location and the expected location. Each graph shows the eight points that were used for testing the performance of the databases when the algorithm was applied.

Observation in known locations: $O_{i}=\left[\begin{array}{lll}\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{i}}^{T} & x_{i} & y_{i}\end{array}\right], \quad i=1,2, \ldots . . N$
Data Base of Observations: $\mathbf{O}=\left[O_{1}, \ldots \ldots ., O_{M}\right]$
Observation in unknown location: $(x, y) \Rightarrow \mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{i}}=\left[\begin{array}{c}p_{i, 1} \\ : \\ p_{i, M}\end{array}\right]$
Localization algorithm:
$d_{i}=\frac{1}{M} \sqrt{\sum_{j=1}^{M}\left(O_{j}-p_{i, j}\right)^{2}}, \quad i=1,2, \ldots . N$
$(\hat{x}, \hat{y})=\left(x_{i}, y_{i}\right)$ for which $d_{i}$ is minimized.
Below is the Matlab code that was implemented to calculate the nearest neighbor.

```
1 - load ReferenceDatabase.mat; %clatabase
2 - load NewValues.mat; %unknown points
3- Rss = RSS(:,3:10);
4- find = values(:,3:10);
5 - M = length(Rss(1,:));
5 - s = zeros(1, length(Rss(:,1)));
7- sum = zeros(length(Rss(:, 1)),M);
- \square for j = 1: length(find(:,1))
- - for i = 1 : length(Rss(:,1))
J -
1-
2-
3-
4-
5-
5-
7-
3-
-
J -
1 -
+1)
plot(error);
grid on;
- xlabel('Unknown point');
3- ylabel('Distance Measurement Error');
- title('Distance Measurement Error vs Unknown point');
```

Figure 9: Matlab Implementation of NNA
The resulting graphs will be discussed in a later chapter of this report in which their significance will be explained and validated.

## CHAPTER IV Results and Discussion

## Introduction

In this chapter discusses the various database collecting methods we did as well as the proposed plan of how we were going to collect the data.

### 4.1 Results of Data Collection

Designated Path


Figure 10: Trajectory

### 4.1.1 Database Creation: Human

The database created by going around the third floor by hand was accurate to say the least. It has 48 data points and can be used to compare various other instances of RSS values and MAC addresses effectively and reliably.

### 4.1.2 Database Creation: Robot Database

The database created by the Turtlebot while it was performing its SLAM algorithm was comparable to that of the human collected database. It generated a total of 56 data points.

Although this database's position values are not the same as the designated path's position values, the difference between the two was minimal.


Figure 11: Sample Robot Database

### 4.1.3 Database Creation: Wi-Fi Compass

The database created from the information provided to us by the Wi-Fi compass application was recorded and placed into a database with only RSS values and MAC addresses being recorded. Since the scenario called for eight specific locations, there are eight indices containing 16 unique MAC addresses that could be verified against the two reference databases collected.

### 4.1.4 Database Creation: Google Maps

The database for the Google Maps locations did not contain any RSS values associated to the eight locations due to not having the information available. It does contain the ( $\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y}$ ) coordinate position of each of the eight locations. Using these coordinates, we then used the position generated from the nearest neighbor algorithm and determined the distance between them.

### 4.2 Performance Analysis

Once the database collection phase was completed, we moved onto analyzing how accurate the databases were compared to other applications that perform localization. The two applications we compared them to were Wi-Fi Compass and Google Maps.

### 4.2.1 Scenario for Performance Evaluation

To make a performance analysis, we needed to designate specific locations in the third floor. Below, the eight locations selected are shown by red dots on the map. These points will be used for the two performance analyses done in our project.


Figure 12: Data Collecting Points

## Wi-Fi Compass

Using Wi-Fi Compass's database containing the eight points, we then performed a position error analysis, first with the human collected database then with the robot collected database.


Auto-rotate


Figure 13: WiFi Compass Trajectory

As can be seen, the Android application works well up to a point. The point in which it makes a fatal error is where there is a metal structure that throws the Wi-Fi localization off and begins giving it false readings from the access points. The error is so great is because the two different sensors being used are both affected by the structure that the application keeps adding in more and more error values into its calculations. Even though the overall path seems to be accurate, the scaling is off and does not recover at any point after this disturbance is encountered.

```
WPI-Wireless 78:1 9:f7:78:f8:43 -58dBm 51 80MHz [WPA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
WPI-WVireless 78:1 9:f7:79:47:83-74dBm 5785MHz [WPA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
WPI-WVireless 78:1 9:f7:77:e7:42 -70dBm 2462MHz[WPA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
PEDERSEN-PC_Network 20:aa:4b:4f:d3:d9 -57dBm 2462MHz
[WPA2-PSK-CCMP][WPS][ESS]
WPI-Wireless 78:1 9:f7:79:47:82 -61 dBm 2462MHz [W\PA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
WPI-Guest 78:1 9:f7:78:f8:41 -57dBm 51 80MHz [ESS]
WPI-Guest 78:19:f7:79:47:81-76dBm 5785MHz [ESS]
WPI-Guest 78:1 9:f7:77:e7:40-67dBm 2462MHz [ESS]
WPI-Guest 78:1 9:77:79:47:80-62dBm 2462MHz [ESS]
WPI-WWireless 78:1 9:77:77:6f:83-62dBm 5745MHz[WWPA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
WPI-Guest 78:1 9:f7:77:6f:81 -63dBm 5745MMHz [ESS]
WPI-WVireless 78:1 9:f7:78:f8:42 -55dBm 2437MHz[WPA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
WPI-Guest 78:1 9:f7:78:f8:40-55dBm 2437MHz [ESS]
WPI-Wireless 78:1 9:f7:78:d0:02 -63dBm 241 2MHz [WPA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
WPI-Guest 78:1 9:f7:78:d0:00-62dBm 241 2MHz [ESS]
WPI-WVireless 78:1 9:f7:77:e7:43 -70dBm 5745MHz [WPA2-EAP-
CCMP][ESS]
```

Figure 14: Wi-Fi Compass generated Database
This database was generated at every foot step. Wi-Fi compass has a simple method of providing the RSS values and MAC addresses. At every step there is an option to scan which results in a generation of a similar database. The RSS values and MAC addresses of the chosen points are manually extracted for the K-NN algorithm application into a spreadsheet file.


Figure 15: Wi-Fi Compass vs. Robot vs. Human
This position error analysis shows that Wi-Fi Compass can be very inaccurate. When we analyze this graph we see that the maximum error is roughly 25 meters which is huge. The average error is very large as well mounting up to approximately 13.5 meters. The error was low in reading points 2 and 3 where the Robot and Human almost produced negligible error. Wi-Fi compass probably had triangulation error and the scaling was probably off. It can be concluded that it gave us the most error and could be not totally suitable for indoor environments.

## Google Maps

Since Google Maps did not provide us with any RSS values we had to devise a different approach to test for accuracy. We first took the eight locations and gave them position vectors corresponding to their location. These position vectors are in our own coordinate system that we used to have all the position data easily interpreted through the various databases. We then proceeded to do the same with the locations that Google Maps showed us. We transposed them onto our coordinate system to create vectors for their individual locations. We then compared the two vectors and found the distance between them essentially telling us the difference between the
actual location and the location shown by Google Maps. We generated graphs showing the disparity between the locations and compared them to the other databases.


Figure 16: Localization using Google Maps


Figure 17: Google Map Eight Testing Locations


Figure 18: Robot vs. Human vs. Google Maps Error Analysis
The above position error analysis shows how inaccurate Google Maps is compared to the Robot and Human Collected Database. The main reason to justify such high inaccuracy is the fact that such user assisted localization techniques like Google Maps are basically employed for outdoor environments where an error of 8 meters or above is not considered considerable to cause any precision hitches but in indoor environments this is highly inexact. Analyzing the graph we see that the maximum error of Google Maps is roughly 9.3 meters and the average error around 5. At reading point number 7 there is no error at all. While we determined that the error difference between the Robot and Human was very little; after analyzing this graph we come to the conclusion that Google Maps produced a comparatively higher error difference of roughly 4 m .

cro tobnyl: yniocyo 5005

Figure 19: Robot SLAM Trajectory
As it can be seen, the SLAM algorithm that the Turtlebot runs is as accurate as a human who might go through the same corridors.


Robot
Human

Figure 20: Position Error Human vs Robot


Wi-Fi Compass
Google Maps
Robot
Human

Figure 21: Overall Analysis
Here is a position error analysis done on all the different platforms at once. Ultimately the human and robot produced better localization results than applications that do not do indoor surveying

## Chapter V Conclusions and Future Work

## Conclusions

In conclusion we designed, implemented and tested a system of Wi-Fi localization on robots and other wireless devices. We concluded that having a robot to do this kind of data collection is more efficient than having a paid employee do this kind of work because collecting data manually is time consuming. While the results obtained by using a robot are not as precise as a human, they are accurate enough to be usable for indoor geolocalization.

## Future Work

In the future, we can further improve the Nearest Neighbor Algorithm (NNA). We can test other indoor localization algorithms. Besides the NNA, there are some other widely used algorithms for indoor localization such as the Extended Kalman Filter Algorithm, Centroid Algorithm and the Particle Filter Algorithm. In order to process it, we have to implement the Extended Kalman Filter Algorithm, Centroid Algorithm and the Particle Filter Algorithm in Matlab, with the collected data from the previous data collecting to evaluate the performance of the different algorithms. The resulting locations could be compared back to the actual and empirical locations to see which of the four algorithms is best for indoor environment. Besides algorithm improvement, we can also develop both autonomous and manned movement applications using our multi-sensor location aware robot. Some of the autonomous applications that we can implement include guided tours to provide better tour experience. In our vision, such applications can be employed at museums, art galleries as well as universities. In terms of manned movement applications, telecommunication can be developed upon the algorithm we have already designed and these types of application can be used in factories and science lab to provide firsthand experience for those who are not able to travel. With the aid of location information, many indoor robotics services can be made possible.

## Appendices

## Appendix A Human Collected Database

Access Point Information


RSSI
MAC Address
First Seen Time
78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-4 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 78-19-F7-78-EE-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42

78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 78-19-F7-78-EE-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43

78-19-F7-78-F8-43

78-19-F7-78-8D-40
78-19-F7-78-F8-40

78-19-F7-77-FB-80
78-19-F7-79-96-C0

78-19-F7-78-EE-80

| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 1 | 23:41:28:796 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
|  | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 2 | 23:41:34:708 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |

78-19-F7-77-EE-C0
78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41

78-19-F7-78-F8-41 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 78-19-F7-78-EE-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 78-19-F7-78-EE-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83

78-19-F7-78-8D-43

78-19-F7-78-F8-43
78-19-F7-78-8D-40

| 2 |  | $23: 41: 34: 708$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |  |
|  | 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 2 | $4 / 10 / 2013$ | $23: 29$ | $4 / 10 / 2013$ 23:41


| -35 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 |
| :---: | :---: |
| -62 | 78-19-F7-77-FB-80 |
| -78 | 78-19-F7-79-96-C0 |
| -76 | 78-19-F7-78-EE-80 |
| -75 | 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 |
| -58 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 |
| -70 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 |
| -59 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 |
| -84 | 78-19-F7-79-47-81 |
| -73 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 |
| -32 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 |
| -57 | 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 |
| -68 | 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A |
| -29 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 |
| -44 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 |
| -51 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 |
| -59 | A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 |
| -43 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 |
| -72 | 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 |
| -76 | 78-19-F7-79-47-82 |
| -56 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 |
| -68 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 |
| -59 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 |
| -81 | A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03 |
| -63 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 |
| -77 | 78-19-F7-79-47-83 |
| -26 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 |
| -82 | 78-19-F7-77-EE-C3 |
| -29 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 |
| -44 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 |
| -51 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 |
| -59 | A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 |
| -43 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 |
| -72 | 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 |
| -76 | 78-19-F7-79-47-82 |
| -56 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 |
| -68 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 |
| -59 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 |
| -81 | A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03 |
| -63 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 |


| 3 |  | $23: 41: 37: 329$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |  |
|  | 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 3 | $4 / 10 / 2013$ | $23: 29$ | $4 / 10 / 2013$ 23:41

$-72$

78-19-F7-79-47-83
78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-77-EE-C3 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-00 78-19-F7-78-AE-40 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-77-EE-C1 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83

78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-77-EE-C3 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-E7-42

78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:31 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:31 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 4 | 23:41:43:241 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |

78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-77-EE-C3 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-00 78-19-F7-78-AE-40 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-77-EE-C1 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-E4-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83

78-19-F7-79-47-83

78-19-F7-78-8D-43
78-19-F7-78-F8-43

| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 5 | 23:41:45:940 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 6 | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 6 | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
|  | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 6 | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 6 | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
|  | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 6 | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 6 | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
|  | 23:41:51:853 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |

78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-78-D0-00 78-19-F7-77-FB-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-E4-42

78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A

20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9

78-19-F7-78-F8-42
78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-E4-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

78-19-F7-79-47-82


| -76 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 |
| :---: | :---: |
| -56 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 |
| -60 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 |
| -79 | 78-19-F7-79-47-83 |
| -72 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 |
| -27 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 |
| -11 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 |
| -44 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 |
| -46 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 |
| -43 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 |
| -75 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-00 |
| -60 | 78-19-F7-77-FB-80 |
| -66 | 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 |
| -71 | 78-19-F7-79-47-80 |
| -76 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 |
| -56 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 |
| -60 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 |
| -79 | 78-19-F7-79-47-81 |
| -73 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 |
| -27 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 |
| -11 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 |
| -44 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 |
| -47 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 |
| -73 | 78-19-F7-78-E4-42 |
| -44 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 |
| -60 | 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 |
| -73 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 |
| -66 | 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 |
| -70 | 78-19-F7-79-47-82 |
| -76 | 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 |
| -56 | 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 |
| -60 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 |
| -79 | 78-19-F7-79-47-83 |
| -72 | 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 |
| -27 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 |
| -65 | 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A |
| -41 | 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 |
| -76 | 20-AA-4B-2C-20-38 |
| -42 | 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 |
| -34 | 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 |



78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-77-E7-40

78-19-F7-77-FB-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-77-FB-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41

78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43

78-19-F7-77-6F-83

78-19-F7-77-FB-83
78-19-F7-78-8D-43

| 7 | 23:41:54:458 10-Apr-2013 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 7 | 23:41:54:458 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 7 | 23:41:54:458 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:41 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:31 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
|  | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
| 88 | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
|  | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:31 4/10/2013 23:42 |
|  | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:42 |
| 8 | 23:42:00:370 10-Apr-2013 |

78-19-F7-79-47-83
78-19-F7-78-F8-43 $20-\mathrm{AA}-4 \mathrm{~B}-2 \mathrm{C}-20-38$ $20-\mathrm{AA}-4 \mathrm{~B}-2 \mathrm{C}-20-38$ 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83

78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-77-FB-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-77-FB-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-4 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-FB-82

78-19-F7-78-D0-02

## Appendix B Robot Collected Database

Access Point Information


78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 00-16-CA-32-8F-00 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 00-1B-BA-A5-D4-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 00-16-CA-32-8F-00 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-79-47-82

78-19-F7-79-96-C2 00-1B-BA-A5-D4-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43

78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-77-FB-80

| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:49 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 1 | 23:49:21:375 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:30 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:31 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
|  | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 2 | 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |
|  | 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 |

A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-00 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-78-D0-00 78-19-F7-78-E8-80 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-79-96-C0 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82

78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 00-16-CA-32-8F-00 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 00-1B-BA-A5-D4-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 00-16-CA-32-8F-00 78-19-F7-78-D0-02

78-19-F7-79-47-82

| 3:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| /2013 23:30 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:31 | 4/10/2013 23 |
| 3:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:2 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| /10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:30 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:49 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:30 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:27:304 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:30 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 |  |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 10/2013 23:29 | 4/1 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |
| 23:49:29:831 10-Apr-2013 |  |
| 4/10/2013 23:29 | 4/10/2013 23:49 |

78-19-F7-79-96-C2
00-1B-BA-A5-D4-80

78-19-F7-77-EE-C2
78-19-F7-78-D0-03
78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83

78-19-F7-78-8D-43

78-19-F7-79-47-83
78-19-F7-78-F8-43
78-19-F7-78-8D-40
78-19-F7-77-6F-80
78-19-F7-77-FB-80
A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-00
78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-78-D0-00 78-19-F7-78-E8-80 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-79-96-C0

78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-78-D0-01

78-19-F7-77-E7-41

78-19-F7-77-6F-81
78-19-F7-78-8D-41
78-19-F7-79-47-81
78-19-F7-78-F8-41
74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A

20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9
78-19-F7-78-8D-42

78-19-F7-78-F8-42
78-19-F7-77-E7-42
78-19-F7-77-FB-82

78-19-F7-77-EE-C2
78-19-F7-79-47-82
78-19-F7-79-96-C2
78-19-F7-77-E7-43

78-19-F7-78-D0-03
78-19-F7-77-6F-83
A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03

78-19-F7-79-47-83
78-19-F7-78-8D-43


78-19-F7-77-EE-C3
78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-77-E7-40

78-19-F7-77-FB-80 78-19-F7-78-EE-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-77-EE-C1 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-78-8D-42

78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-77-EE-C3 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

78-19-F7-79-47-82

| 4 | $23: 49: 35: 743$ | $10-A p r-2013$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 4 | $4 / 10 / 2013$ | $23: 30$ | $4 / 10 / 2013$ 23:49

78-19-F7-79-96-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-77-EE-C3 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-77-FB-80 78-19-F7-78-EE-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-77-EE-C1 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-78-8D-42

78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-79-96-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-03 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43

78-19-F7-77-EE-C3

78-19-F7-78-F8-43
74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A


20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 20-AA-4B-2C-20-38 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-84-42 78-19-F7-78-92-82 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43

78-19-F7-78-F8-43

20-AA-4B-2C-20-38
78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-78-D0-00

78-19-F7-77-FB-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-78-92-80 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-77-FB-81 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-82

78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-78-F8-42

78-19-F7-77-E7-42


78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-84-42 78-19-F7-78-92-82 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 78-19-F7-79-84-44 20-AA-4B-2C-20-38 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-79-84-42 78-19-F7-78-92-82 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-78-D0-03 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 $20-\mathrm{AA}-4 \mathrm{~B}-2 \mathrm{C}-20-38$ 78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-78-8D-40

78-19-F7-78-F8-40

78-19-F7-77-E7-40
78-19-F7-78-D0-00

| 6 |  | 23:49:44:370 10-Apr-2013 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 6 | $4 / 10 / 2013$ | $23: 29$ | $4 / 10 / 2013$ 23:49

78-19-F7-77-FB-80
78-19-F7-77-EE-C0 78-19-F7-78-92-80 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-78-D0-01 78-19-F7-77-E7-41 78-19-F7-77-FB-81 78-19-F7-77-6F-81 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2

78-19-F7-79-84-42 78-19-F7-78-92-82

78-19-F7-79-47-82

78-19-F7-77-E7-43
78-19-F7-78-D0-03

78-19-F7-77-6F-83
78-19-F7-77-FB-83
78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9

78-19-F7-79-84-44 20-AA-4B-2C-20-38 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-79-47-82

| 7 |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 7 |  | $23: 49: 46: 991$ |
| 7 |  |  |
| 7 | $4 / 10 / 2013$ | $23: 29$ |

78-19-F7-77-EE-C2
78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83

78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A

78-19-F7-77-6F-80 78-19-F7-78-F8-40 78-19-F7-78-8D-40 78-19-F7-77-FB-80 78-19-F7-77-E7-40 78-19-F7-79-47-80 78-19-F7-77-EE-C0

78-19-F7-77-E7-41

78-19-F7-77-6F-81
78-19-F7-77-FB-81 78-19-F7-78-8D-41 78-19-F7-79-47-81 78-19-F7-78-F8-41 20-AA-4B-2C-20-38 20-AA-4B-4F-D3-D9 $20-\mathrm{AA}-4 \mathrm{~B}-2 \mathrm{C}-20-38$

78-19-F7-78-F8-42
$8 \quad 23: 49: 52: 903$ 10-Apr-2013
4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49
$8 \quad$ 23:49:52:903 10-Apr-2013 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49 23:49:52:903 10-Apr-2013 4/10/2013 23:29 4/10/2013 23:49

78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 78-19-F7-78-F8-42 78-19-F7-77-6F-82 78-19-F7-78-8D-42 78-19-F7-77-FB-82 78-19-F7-77-E7-42 78-19-F7-78-D0-02 A8-D0-E5-C3-5B-02 78-19-F7-79-47-82 78-19-F7-77-EE-C2 78-19-F7-77-E7-43 78-19-F7-77-6F-83 78-19-F7-77-FB-83 78-19-F7-78-8D-43 78-19-F7-79-47-83 78-19-F7-78-F8-43 74-DE-2B-8E-13-5A

78-19-F7-77-6F-80

78-19-F7-78-F8-40
78-19-F7-78-8D-40

## Appendix C Matlab Code

```
load RSS.mat; fdatabase
load values.mat; %unknown points
Rss - RSS (:,3:10);
find - values (:, 3:10);
M = length(Rss(1,:));
s - zeros (1, length(Rss (:,1)));
sum - zeros(length(Rss (:,1)),M);
for j - 1: length(find(:,1))
for i - 1 : length(Rss (:,1))
    sum(i,:) - find(f,:)- Rss(i,:);
    s(i) = norm(sum(i,:),2)/M;
    figure(j);
    xlabel('database');
    ylabel('d_i');
    stem(s);
    legend('d_i with respect to the points in database');
end
[C,I] = min(s);
d(j) = I;
hold on;
plot(I,C,'--rs','LineWidth',2,...
                                    'MarkerEdgeColor','k',...
                                    'MarkerFaceColor','g',...
                    'MarkerSize',10);
legend('Predicted point on database');
xlabel('Known points from the Database');
ylabel('Distance error of the unknown point ');
str - sprintf(' Comparision RSS values of unkown point ofd to Database', f);
title(str);
hold off;
X = (RSS (I, 1) -values (j, 1))^2+(RSS (I, 2) -values (j, 2))^2;
error(j) - sqrt(X);
end
figure(j+1);
plot(error);
grid on;
xlabel('Unknown point');
ylabel('Distance Measurement Error');
title('Distance Measurement Error vs Unknown point');
```


## Appendix D Atwater Kent Eight Locations Coordinates

--------------------------------------------------

| xpixel | ypixel | x | y |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 260 | 81 | 184.1939547 | 58.27338129 |
| 321 | 81 | 227.4086902 | 58.27338129 |
| 390 | 81 | 276.290932 | 58.27338129 |
| 433 | 81 | 306.7537783 | 58.27338129 |
| 488 | 81 | 345.7178841 | 58.27338129 |
| 530 | 81 | 375.4722922 | 58.27338129 |
| 530 | 114 | 375.4722922 | 82.01438849 |
| 530 | 155 | 375.4722922 | 111.5107914 |
| 530 | 231 | 375.4722922 | 166.1870504 |


| 530 | 280 | 375.4722922 | 201.4388489 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 497 | 280 | 352.0938287 | 201.4388489 |
| 471 | 280 | 333.6744332 | 201.4388489 |
| 430 | 280 | 304.6284635 | 201.4388489 |
| 395 | 280 | 279.8331234 | 201.4388489 |
| 329 | 280 | 233.0761965 | 201.4388489 |
| 261 | 280 | 184.9023929 | 201.4388489 |
| 261 | 241 | 184.9023929 | 173.381295 |
| 261 | 199 | 184.9023929 | 143.1654676 |
| 261 | 171 | 184.9023929 | 123.0215827 |
| 261 | 117 | 184.9023929 | 84.17266187 |
|  | 8438 | 0.71 |  |

