

Masthead Logo

University of Rhode Island
DigitalCommons@URI

Graduate School of Oceanography Faculty
Publications

Graduate School of Oceanography

2017

Global evaluation of particulate organic carbon flux parameterizations and implications for atmospheric pCO₂

Lucas Gloege

Galen A. McKinley

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/gsofacpubs>

**The University of Rhode Island Faculty have made this article openly available.
Please let us know how Open Access to this research benefits you.**

This is a pre-publication author manuscript of the final, published article.

Terms of Use

This article is made available under the terms and conditions applicable towards Open Access Policy Articles, as set forth in our [Terms of Use](#).

Citation/Publisher Attribution

Gloege, L., McKinley, G. A., Mouw, C. B., and Ciochetto, A. B. (2017), Global evaluation of particulate organic carbon flux parameterizations and implications for atmospheric pCO₂, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 31, 1192–1215, doi: 10.1002/2016GB005535. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1002/2016GB005535>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School of Oceanography at DigitalCommons@URI. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate School of Oceanography Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@URI. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@etal.uri.edu.

Authors

Lucas Gloege, Galen A. McKinley, Colleen B. Mouw, and Audrey B. Ciochetto

1 **Global Evaluation of Particulate Organic Carbon Flux Parameterizations and**
2 **Implications for Atmospheric pCO₂**

3 Lucas Gloege^{1*}, Galen A. McKinley¹, Colleen B. Mouw²⁺, Audrey Ciochetto²⁺

4
5 ¹University of Wisconsin-Madison
6 1225 W. Dayton Street
7 Madison, WI 53706
8 USA

9
10 ²Michigan Technological University
11 1400 Townsend Drive
12 Houghton, MI 49931
13 USA

14
15 ⁺Now at: University of Rhode Island, Graduate School of Oceanography
16 215 South Ferry Road
17 Narragansett, RI 02882

18
19 *Corresponding author: gloege@wisc.edu
20
21
22

23 **Key words:** Biological pump, POC flux, ballast hypothesis, Martin curve
24

25 **Key points:**

- 26
- 27 • Three parameterizations for particulate organic carbon (POC) export are compared to global data.
 - 28 • POC fluxes estimated from the Martin curve and the ballast hypothesis capture observations equally well at all depths.
 - 29 • Globally, data constrain Martin's *b* to a range from 0.70 to 0.98. This range
30 could modify atmospheric pCO₂ by only tens of ppm.
31
32

33 **Abstract**

34 The shunt of photosynthetically derived particulate organic carbon (POC) from the
35 euphotic zone and remineralization at depth comprises the basic mechanism of the
36 “biological carbon pump.” POC raining through the “twilight zone” (euphotic depth
37 to 1km) and “midnight zone” (1 km to 4 km) is remineralized back to inorganic form
38 through respiration by heterotrophs and bacteria. Accurately modeling POC flux is
39 critical for understanding the “biological pump” and its impacts on air-sea CO₂
40 exchange and, ultimately, long-term ocean carbon sequestration. Yet, the
41 parameterizations of POC flux commonly used in simulations have not been tested
42 quantitatively against global datasets using the same modeling framework. Here, we
43 use a single one-dimensional physical-biogeochemical modeling framework to assess
44 the skill of three common POC flux parameterizations in capturing POC flux
45 observations from moored sediment traps and thorium-234 depletion. The
46 exponential decay, Martin curve, and ballast model are compared to data from 11
47 biogeochemical provinces distributed across the globe. In each province, the model
48 captures satellite-based estimates of surface primary production within uncertainties.
49 Goodness-of-fit is measured by how well the simulation captures the observations,
50 quantified by bias and the root-mean-squared-error and displayed using “target
51 diagrams.” Comparisons are presented separately for the twilight zone and midnight
52 zone. We find the parameterization based on the ballast hypothesis shows no
53 improvement over a globally or regionally parameterized Martin curve. For all
54 provinces taken together, Martin’s b that best fits the data is [0.70, 0.98]; this finding
55 reduces by at least a factor of 3 previous estimates of potential impacts on
56 atmospheric pCO₂ of uncertainty in POC export to a more modest range [-16 ppm,
57 +12 ppm].

58

59 **1. Introduction**

60 The biologically-mediated removal of organic carbon from surface waters against a
61 dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) gradient and its subsequent remineralization at
62 depth is termed the “biological pump” [Broecker and Peng, 1982; De La Rocha,
63 2006], which can be separated into a “carbonate pump” and a “soft-tissue pump”
64 [Volk and Hoffert, 1985] as well as a “microbial pump” [Jiao et al., 2010]. The
65 percentage of net primary production (NPP) exported from the euphotic zone as
66 particulate organic carbon (POC) is at least 5%, with some estimates higher than 40%
67 [Martin et al., 1987; Buesseler, 1998; Schlitzer, 2000; Boyd and Trull, 2007;
68 Buesseler and Boyd, 2009; Henson et al., 2011]. Much of this material is respired,
69 primarily by bacteria and zooplankton, within the “twilight zone” (euphotic depth to
70 1000 m) [Steinberg et al., 2008]; only ~3% of exported NPP reaches the 1000 m
71 depth horizon [De La Rocha and Passow, 2007]. On timescales of days to weeks the
72 flux of POC is controlled by sinking speed and degradation rate. If in steady state,
73 POC flux should be balanced by the input of limiting nutrients to the euphotic zone
74 [Passow and Carlson, 2012; Giering et al., 2017].

75

76 POC flux to depth is the hallmark of the biological pump, and is critical to setting
77 surface ocean pCO₂ [Parekh et al., 2006; Kwon et al., 2009; Kwon et al., 2011;
78 DeVries et al., 2012]. The pCO₂ gradient across the air-sea interface determines the
79 direction of carbon flux across the surface. By converting DIC to organic carbon,
80 biological activity reduces surface ocean pCO₂ and promotes CO₂ uptake by the
81 ocean. The downward POC flux then sequesters carbon at depth. Changes in the
82 efficiency of the biological pump, measured as the ratio of exported POC to primary

83 production has the potential to alter ocean carbon storage and atmospheric CO₂
84 [*Marinov et al.*, 2008a, 2008b; *Kwon et al.*, 2009; *Henson et al.* 2011]. *Parekh et al.*
85 [2006] estimate the atmospheric pCO₂ would be 150-200 μatm greater than the
86 current value if not for the biological control on the vertical DIC gradient. *Kwon et*
87 *al.* [2011] separate the sensitivity of atmospheric CO₂ to changes in the carbonate
88 pump versus the soft-tissue pump. They find that for a globally-averaged respired
89 carbon increase of 10 μmol kg⁻¹, the carbonate pump increases atmospheric CO₂ by
90 about 3.4% while the soft-tissue pump decreases atmospheric CO₂ by 5.3%, thus there
91 is a net 2% reduction in atmospheric CO₂ when both pumps are accounted for.

92

93 Projections using earth system models show a sizeable uncertainty across various
94 models with respect to the biological pump's response to 21st century climate change
95 [*Bopp et al.*, 2013; *Laufkötter et al.*, 2015; *Hauck et al.*, 2015; *Krumhardt et al.* 2016].
96 Accurate estimation the sensitivity of the biological pump to future climate change is
97 critical to economic evaluations of the impacts of climate change on ecosystem
98 services [*Barange et al.*, 2017]. Parameterizations used in earth system models would
99 ideally capture both the mean POC attenuation and the variability found in available
100 observations, and do so in a mechanistically-realistic manner, in order to reliably
101 predict future change in the strength and efficiency of the biological pump.

102

103 Early parameterizations of POC flux relate export either at a reference depth [*Martin*
104 *et al.*, 1987] or the euphotic zone primary production [*Suess*, 1980; *Betzer et al.*,
105 1984; *Pace et al.*, 1987] to the vertical POC flux through an empirically-derived
106 relationship. Although these parameterizations lack mechanistic realism, the *Martin*
107 *et al.* [1987] power law parameterization, in some cases with adjustment to different

108 ocean regions [*Henson et al.* 2012; *Guidi et al.* 2015], has been used widely to predict
109 carbon flux >2000m [*François et al.*, 2002; *Honjo et al.*, 2008]. Alternative to a
110 power law parameterization, an exponential curve has been used to describe
111 attenuation through an empirical fit to observations [*Lutz et al.*, 2002; *Boyd and Trull*,
112 2007; *Marsay et al.*, 2015]. Parameterizations assuming first-order kinetics and a
113 constant sinking speed have been used in biogeochemical models [*Walsh et al.*, 1988;
114 *Banse*, 1990; *Dutkiewicz et al.*, 2005; *DeVries and Weber*, 2017], which implies an
115 exponential decay of POC. More mechanistic parameterizations, such as those based
116 on the “ballast hypothesis” [*Armstrong et al.*, 2002] assume minerals associated with
117 POC increase the POC flux at depth, have been proposed.

118

119 To directly compare the various choices available for POC parameterization, a global
120 dataset with consistent treatment and a consistent model framework is required. The
121 choice of seasonal normalization in datasets [*Lutz et al.*, 2002; *Lutz et al.*, 2007;
122 *Honjo et al.*, 2008] can impact statistical fits, and simulated POC fluxes are dependent
123 both on the POC flux parameterization, and also on the simulated surface ocean
124 productivity. In a previous model-data comparison, *Howard et al.* [2006] used a three-
125 dimensional ocean model in which surface NPP responds to the POC
126 parameterization. They find that the ballast model captures observations more
127 accurately than the Martin curve, and that the geochemical distribution in the deep
128 ocean is sensitive to the parameterization used. However, there has not yet been a
129 comparison across all three common parameterizations in which the modeling
130 framework is identical, including identical surface NPP and POC production to drive
131 the vertical fluxes estimated by each parameterization.

132

133 In this study, we compare three common POC flux parameterizations using a single
134 one-dimensional numerical modeling framework in which NPP is not responsive to
135 the parameterization used; i.e. each parameterization is driven by the same surface
136 POC source. This model is applied in 11 *Longhurst* [2006] provinces for which
137 adequate POC flux data are available (Figure 1). We quantitatively evaluate, using a
138 suite of statistical tests, the exponential decay model, Martin curve, and the ballast
139 hypothesis against the recently released global POC flux dataset [*Mouw et al.*, 2016a]
140 that consists of POC flux observations from sediment traps supplemented with
141 thorium-234 depletion observations (2% of the data) spanning years 1976 to 2012.

142

143 **2. Methodology**

144 **2.1 Model Description**

145 The Massachusetts Institute of Technology general circulation model (MITgcm)
146 [*Marshall et al.*, 1997a, 1997b] is configured as a one-dimensional column with 77
147 vertical layers. Depths increase from a resolution of 10m in the surface to 650m in
148 the deepest layer. K-profile parameterization (KPP) simulates vertical mixing [*Large*
149 *et al.*, 1994]. The model uses a nutrient-restoring scheme with a relaxation time scale
150 of 30 days to approximate advection and diffusive processes that are not directly
151 simulated. Nutrients are restored towards the climatology appropriate for each
152 province in the euphotic zone when the simulated nutrient concentration falls below
153 the climatological value, while nutrients below the euphotic zone are constantly
154 restored towards climatology. Sediments are not included in the model, and thus
155 detritus slowly accumulates in the bottom grid cell; the bottom grid cell is ignored in
156 analyses.

157

158 The model is initialized with physical and biogeochemical observations and forced at
159 the surface with monthly climatological meteorological and radiative fields
160 appropriate for each province. Temperature, salinity, and nutrients are prescribed by
161 World Ocean Atlas 2013 [Boyer *et al.*, 2013]. Alkalinity and DIC are prescribed
162 using GLObal Ocean Data Analysis Project (GLODAP) atlas [Key *et al.*, 2004].
163 Photosynthetically active radiation (PAR) is prescribed using Sea-viewing Wide
164 Field-of-view Sensor (SeaWiFS) data [Frouin *et al.*, 2002]. Surface dust deposition
165 is provided by Mahowald *et al.* [2005]. Surface wind stress is prescribed using
166 National Center for Environmental Prediction (NCEP) reanalysis 1 [Kalnay *et al.*,
167 1996].
168
169 The ecosystem model embedded in MITgcm is that of Dutkiewicz *et al.* [2005]. The
170 model includes two phytoplankton functional groups (diatoms and small
171 phytoplankton) and one zooplankton class. Phytoplankton growth can be light and
172 nutrient limited. Mortality rate and maximum growth rates of diatoms and small
173 phytoplankton are tuned for each province (supplementary Table S1) to best fit
174 satellite-based estimates of primary productivity (Table 1). The remineralization rate
175 (k) is set to $1/10 \text{ d}^{-1}$ for POC and $1/150 \text{ d}^{-1}$ for biogenic silica (opal). The dissolution
176 rate for particulate inorganic carbon (PIC) is $1/300 \text{ d}^{-1}$. The sinking speed (w) for
177 POC, PIC, and opal are fixed constants: POC and opal sink at a rate of 10 m d^{-1} while
178 PIC sinks at 15 m d^{-1} . These POC sinking speeds lie within the range of other
179 models, 2.5 m d^{-1} [Yool *et al.*, 2010], 8 m d^{-1} [Dutkiewicz *et al.*, 2005], $11\text{-}85 \text{ m d}^{-1}$
180 [DeVries and Weber., 2017]. The POC remineralization rate and sinking speed used
181 here imply a remineralization length scale ($\lambda = wk^{-1}$) of 100 m, similar to the Lima
182 *et al.* [2014] value of 130 m and within the range assumed by Moore *et al.* [2004].

183 This remineralization length scale is within the 50-200 m range that *Mouw et al.*
184 [2016b] found for most provinces, and the 69-265m range derived from the
185 optimization of *DeVries and Weber* [2016].

186

187 The model assumes 7% of phytoplankton are calcifiers, and therefore produce PIC.
188 Production of POC, PIC, and opal are due to mortality of phytoplankton and
189 zooplankton, as well zooplankton grazing on phytoplankton. The tendency of POC,
190 PIC, and opal production are shown below:

191
$$\frac{d[X^{prod}(z)]}{dt} = P_X^{prod}(z) + Z_X^{prod}(z) \quad (1)$$

192 where X=POC, PIC, or opal. $P_X^{prod}(z)$ represents production of X ($\text{mgX m}^{-2} \text{d}^{-1}$) at
193 depth (z, m) by phytoplankton (P) and $Z_X^{prod}(z)$ represents production of X (mgX m^{-2}
194 d^{-1}) at depth (z, m) by zooplankton (Z).

195

196 A 10-year simulation is run after a 10-year model spin up. The model uses a time
197 step of 200 seconds with an 8-day averaging period. This averaging period is chosen
198 to coincide with the time step of the vertically integrated production model (VGPM)
199 [*Behrenfeld and Falkowski*, 1997] which is used for comparison to modeled NPP.

200 VGPM satellite-based NPP estimates are obtained from

201 <http://www.science.oregonstate.edu/ocean.productivity/> and the modeled NPP is
202 calculated as the integrated productivity in the euphotic zone.

203

204 **2.3 Exponential Decay Model**

205 The exponential decay model assumes that all the POC is labile with a constant
206 sinking speed, expressed in equation (2) [*Banse*, 1990].

207
$$F(z) = w_{poc}[POC(z)] \quad (2)$$

208 where $F(z)$ is the POC flux ($\text{mgC m}^{-2} \text{d}^{-1}$) at depth (z , m), w_{poc} is the sinking speed
 209 of labile POC (m d^{-1}), and $[POC(z)]$ is the volume concentration of labile POC (mgC
 210 m^{-3}) at depth. The tendency of POC to sink and remineralize is expressed in the
 211 following form:

212
$$\frac{d[POC(z)]}{dt} = w_{poc} \frac{d[POC(z)]}{dz} - k_{poc}[POC(z)] \quad (3)$$

213 where the first term represents vertically sinking POC while the second term
 214 represents a first-order remineralization scheme where POC is instantly remineralized
 215 at each depth level (z) with k_{poc} being the remineralization rate. An expression for
 216 the flux of labile POC is derived by applying equation (2) to a steady state version of
 217 equation (3): $F(z) = F(z_o)EXP[(z - z_o)/\lambda]$, where $F(z_o)$ is the flux at reference
 218 depth z_o and $\lambda = \frac{w_{poc}}{k_{poc}}$ is the remineralization length scale (e-folding length scale).

219 Table 2 provides definitions of all equation parameters.

220

221 The ecosystem model of *Dutkiewicz et al.* [2005] treats particulate organic matter as
 222 exponentially decaying throughout the water column and assumes all POC is labile.

223 The full tendency of POC is defined in equation (4):

224
$$\frac{d[POC(z)]}{dt} = \frac{d[POC^{prod}(z)]}{dt} + w_{poc} \frac{d[POC(z)]}{dz} - f_T k_{poc}[POC(z)] \quad (4)$$

225 where the first term is the tendency of POC production (equation (1)) and the last two
 226 terms represent sinking and remineralization (equation (3)). Temperature dependence
 227 on remineralization rate is taken into account through an Arrhenius function: $f_T = A *$
 228 $EXP[T_{AE}(T^{-1} - T_{ref}^{-1})]$, where A , T_{AE} , and T_{ref} are constants and T is the local
 229 temperature (supplementary Table S2). POC flux at each level is calculated using

230 equation (2). This framework will be termed the “exponential decay model” for POC
231 flux.

232

233 **2.4 Martin Curve**

234 Using data obtained from free-floating sediment traps, *Martin et al.* [1987] describe
235 POC flux attenuation using a normalized power function of the following form,
236 commonly referred to as the “Martin curve”:

$$237 \quad F(z) = F(100) \left(\frac{z}{100} \right)^{-b} \quad (5)$$

238 where $F(100)$ is the POC flux at 100m and b is the flux attenuation coefficient. The
239 Martin curve is equivalent to a decreasing remineralization rate with depth or an
240 increasing sinking speed with depth [*Lam et al.*, 2011]. *Villa-Alfageme et al.* [2016]
241 observed an increase in sinking speed with depth, possibly due to the gradual loss of
242 slow-sinking particles with depth. Small values of b imply a higher transfer
243 efficiency where more carbon remineralizes at deeper depths. Transfer efficiency is
244 defined as the fraction of exported organic matter that reaches a given depth below
245 the depth of export, with 100 m below the depth of export being where transfer
246 efficiency is typically estimated [*Buesseler and Boyd*, 2009]. Transfer efficiency and
247 b are inversely related: large values of b imply a small transfer efficiency with more
248 carbon remineralizing at shallower depths. *Martin et al.* [1987] calculated a global b
249 value of 0.858 using observations from nine locations in the Northeast Pacific.
250 Regional variations in the b parameter have been found to improve the statistical fits
251 at the scale of ocean provinces [*Henson et al.*, 2012; *Guidi et al.*, 2015] and across
252 ocean basins [*Berelson*, 2001; *Schlitzer*, 2002], implying regional variability in the
253 flux attenuation and transfer efficiency. *Marsay et al.* [2015] showed the b parameter,
254 and hence the flux attenuation, correlates with temperature. This pattern is plausibly

255 explained by a slowdown of microbial utilization of carbon as temperature decreases
256 [*Pomeroy and Diebel, 1986; Pomeroy et al., 1991*]. Changes in b , when applied
257 globally in a biogeochemical model, have been shown to significantly impact
258 atmospheric CO₂ concentrations [*Kwon et al., 2009*].

259

260 In this study, POC fluxes at depth based on the Martin curve are calculated offline
261 from surface production in MITgcm. In keeping with the original intent of the Martin
262 curve, we use equation (5) to calculate the flux at each depth level (z) using an export
263 depth of 100 m and export flux, $F(z_{100})$, from the exponential decay model runs.

264 Due to nutrient restoring below the euphotic zone, feedback of shallow
265 remineralization on surface production is negligible; thus, this approach is robust.

266 Runs with both the *Martin et al.* [1987] global b value of 0.858 as well as the *Guidi et*
267 *al.* [2015] and *Henson et al.* [2012] regional b values are performed for comparison.

268

269 **2.5 Ballast Hypothesis**

270 The ballast hypothesis proposed by *Armstrong et al.* [2002] asserts that “ballast”
271 minerals (PIC, opal, and dust), qualitatively associated with POC, increase the deep
272 ocean POC flux. Using observations from the equatorial Pacific, *Armstrong et al.*
273 [2002] observed that the ratio of organic carbon flux to total mass flux was nearly
274 constant below 1800 m and concluded ballast minerals are intimately related to the
275 POC flux. Mechanistically, the role of ballast minerals is not entirely clear. It has
276 been proposed that they act to increase the sinking speed and/or protect POC from
277 microbial respiration and zooplankton grazing. Thus, POC that is associated with
278 ballast minerals induces a higher transfer efficiency, delivering more POC to depth.

279 The ballast hypothesis asserts that sinking POC is a composed of “free” and ballast

280 mineral associated fractions (supplementary Figure S1). The free fraction has a
281 remineralization length scale as labile POC while POC qualitatively associated with
282 ballast minerals is partitioned between a “soft” and “hard” subclass, which represent
283 external and internal protection mechanisms, respectively [Armstrong *et al.*, 2002].
284 External protection constitutes physical removal from hydrolyzing enzymes by
285 adsorption of POC into mineral micropores and increasing sinking speed [Mayer,
286 1994]; POC associated with the soft fraction has the same remineralization profile as
287 its associated ballast mineral. Internal protection occurs when POC is encased in PIC
288 or opal, sheltering it from degradation until the mineral has dissolved [Armstrong *et*
289 *al.*, 2002; and references therein]. For this reason, the hard fraction has a very deep
290 remineralization length scale, representing refractory POC. However, Iversen and
291 Robert [2015] concluded that ballast minerals act only to increase sinking speed and
292 do not provide any protection to organic matter.

293

294 *Klaas and Archer* [2002] used a global dataset of sediment trap observations in the
295 midnight zone to distinguish three forms of ballast with the following carrying
296 capacities (grams of organic carbon per gram of ballast): PIC (0.094), opal (0.025),
297 and dust (0.035). Additionally, *Klaas and Archer* [2002] observed 80% of the POC
298 flux to the seafloor was associated with PIC, suggesting it is a more efficient ballast
299 mineral compared to opal and dust. There are three reasons why the carrying capacity
300 of PIC has been suggested to be greater than that of opal and lithogenic dust:

- 301 1. PIC sinks ~50% faster than opal for an equivalent particle radius [*Sarmiento*
302 *and Gruber*, 2006], since the density of PIC (2.71 g cm^{-3}) is ~30% greater than
303 the density of opal (2.1 g cm^{-3}) [*Klaas and Archer*, 2002].

- 304 2. Opal production and export is not as spatially uniform as PIC production and
305 export [*Sarmiento and Gruber, 2006*]. The ratio of opal flux to carbon flux
306 also varies regionally [*Ragueneau et al., 2000 Figure 5*].
- 307 3. Lithogenic fluxes are generally too small to significantly impact the transfer
308 efficiency of organic carbon [*François et al., 2002*].

309 However, some studies find evidence that does not support PIC having a higher
310 carrying capacity compared to opal or dust [*De La Rocha et al., 2008*] or show
311 regional variability in the carrying capacity of each ballast mineral [*Wilson et al.,*
312 *2012; Pabortsava et al., 2017*].

313

314 Published parameterizations for the ballast hypothesis have important differences:
315 *Moore et al. [2004]* and *Armstrong et al. [2002]* include PIC, opal, and lithogenic
316 material (dust) as ballast minerals while *Yool et al. [2010]* and *Dunne et al. [2013]*
317 omit ballasting from dust. The reader is referred to *Moore et al. [2004]* and *Lima et*
318 *al. [2014]* for a detailed description of the implementation of the ballast hypothesis in
319 a three-dimensional ocean model with dust.

320

321 For this study, the ecosystem model of *Dutkiewicz et al. [2005]* is augmented to
322 include ballasting from PIC, opal, and dust in a manner similar to that of *Moore et al.*
323 *[2004]* and *Lima et al. [2014]*. The implementation of the ballast hypothesis is based
324 on *Armstrong et al. [2002]* and assumes a portion of the POC production is associated
325 with PIC and opal production and surface dust deposition. Flux of POC is calculated
326 by multiplying the sinking speed by the concentration of POC associated with each
327 mineral (equation (6)):

328
$$F(z) = w_{poc}[POC(z)] + w_{pic}[POC_{PIC}(z)] + w_{opal}[POC_{opal}(z)]$$

329
$$+ w_{dust}[POC_{dust}(z)] \quad (6)$$

330 where w_X is the sinking speed of X=POC, PIC, opal, or dust, $[POC_Y(z)]$ is the
 331 concentration of POC associated with Y=PIC, opal, or dust, and $[POC(z)]$ is the
 332 concentration of free or labile POC. The tendency of POC associated with ballast
 333 mineral Y is separated into a hard and soft subclass (equation (7)):

334
$$\frac{d[POC_Y(z)]}{dt} = \frac{d[POC_Y^{soft}(z)]}{dt} + \frac{d[POC_Y^{hard}(z)]}{dt} \quad (7)$$

335 POC in the soft subclass decays exponentially with a remineralization rate as its
 336 associated ballast mineral while POC in the hard subclass decays exponentially with a
 337 very long remineralization rate; POC in each subclass has the same sinking speed as
 338 its associated ballast mineral. Each term in $\frac{d[POC_{PIC}(z)]}{dt}$ is defined in Table 3 and each
 339 term in $\frac{d[POC_{opal}(z)]}{dt}$ is defined in Table 4. The source of dust in the model is from
 340 surface deposition ($dust^{dep}$, mgDust m⁻² d⁻¹). POC associated with dust solely
 341 occurs in the surface grid cell ($\Delta z_{surf}, m$) and is separated into a hard and soft
 342 subclass which decay exponentially. Each term in the tendency equation for POC
 343 associated with dust ($\frac{d[POC_{dust}(z)]}{dt}$) is defined in Table 5. The tendency of free POC

344 production is calculated by subtracting ballast associated POC from the total POC

345 production:
$$\frac{d[POC_{free}^{prod}(z)]}{dt} = \frac{d[POC^{prod}(z)]}{dt} - \left[\omega_{PIC} \left(\frac{d[PIC^{prod}(z)]}{dt} \right) + \right.$$

346
$$\left. \omega_{opal} \left(\frac{d[opal^{prod}(z)]}{dt} \right) + \omega_{dust} \left(\frac{dust^{dep}}{\Delta z_{surf}} \right) \right],$$
 where $\frac{d[X^{prod}(z)]}{dt}$ is the production of

347 X=PIC or opal by phytoplankton and zooplankton (equation (1)) and ω_Y is the POC
 348 carrying capacity for Y=PIC, opal, or dust. Each term in the tendency equation for
 349 free POC ($\frac{d[POC(z)]}{dt}$) is defined in Table 6.

350

351 **2.6 Analysis**

352 An 8-day climatology of POC flux within each province is created using the *Mouw et*
353 *al.* [2016a] data compilation of *in situ* sediment trap and thorium-234 based
354 measurements. PIC and opal fluxes are not analyzed due to insufficient spatial and
355 temporal resolution in the field data. Dates are converted to day of year and aligned
356 in time using the midpoint of the deployment. POC flux observations within each
357 biogeochemical province as defined by *Longhurst* [2006] (provided by *VLIZ* [2009])
358 are aggregated and grouped by depth and day of year into 8-day segments.
359 Observations are then aggregated to the model vertical grid in order to quantitatively
360 compare to model output. In order to be considered in our comparison, observations
361 must be available at depths greater than 1000 m and the model must capture the
362 surface ocean production in a manner consistent with satellite retrievals. Coastal
363 provinces are omitted.

364

365 Model performance is assessed by investigating the model-data misfit, defined as
366 $\Delta(i) = \log[M(i)] - \log[O(i)]$ where $M(i)$ and $O(i)$ represent the i^{th} model
367 prediction and i^{th} observed value respectively. Each observation is log base 10
368 transformed to alleviate skewedness from large values. The water column is
369 partitioned into the twilight zone (100-1000m) and midnight zone (1000-4000m),
370 with each analyzed separately. For consideration of variability, the full range of
371 variability for the model and observations across each zone is compared. A set of six
372 summary statistics are used as univariate measures of model performance [*Stow et al.*,
373 2009]:

374 1. Correlation:
$$r = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^N \{\log[M(i)] - \overline{\log[M(i)]}\} \{\log[O(i)] - \overline{\log[O(i)]}\}}{\left\{ \sum_{i=1}^N [M(i) - \bar{M}]^2 \sum_{i=1}^N [O(i) - \bar{O}]^2 \right\}^{\frac{1}{2}}}$$

375 2. Root Mean Squared Difference:
$$RMSD = \left[\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \Delta(i)^2 \right]^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

376 3. Bias:
$$B = \overline{\log[M(i)]} - \overline{\log[O(i)]}$$

377 4. Average Absolute Error:
$$AAE = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^N |\log[M(i)] - \log[O(i)]|}{N}$$

378 5. Model Efficiency:
$$ME = 1 - \frac{\sum_{i=1}^N \{\log[M(i)] - \log[O(i)]\}^2}{\sum_{i=1}^N \{\log[O(i)] - \overline{\log[O(i)]}\}^2} = 1 - \left(\frac{RMSD}{s_o} \right)^2$$

379 6. Reliability index:
$$RI = 10^{RMSD}$$

380 The correlation (r) is a measure between -1 and 1 quantifying the degree to which the
 381 simulation and observations linearly vary. The correlation only expresses how well
 382 the simulation and observations vary together and does not account for systematic
 383 biases; a correlation of 1 does not preclude a mean offset between the simulation and
 384 observations. Additionally, this value is related to the coefficient of determination
 385 (r^2), which expresses the variance explained by a linear regression.

386

387 Root mean squared difference (RMSD), bias (B), and average absolute error (AAE)
 388 are all measures of the discrepancy between the simulated and observed mean.

389 Values near zero imply “good” model performance and large values imply “poor”
 390 model performance using these metrics. The modeling efficiency (ME) can be used
 391 as a transition value between good and poor model performance [*Nash and Sutcliffe,*

392 1970]. A skillful model by this metric has an ME value near one. Modeling

393 efficiency is related to RMSD: $ME = 1 - \left(\frac{RMSD}{s_o} \right)^2$, where s_o is the observed

394 variance. The reliability index (RI) quantifies the average factor by which the model

395 differs from observations. For example, an RI of 2 implies the model predictions

396 need to be multiplied by 2 in order to reconstruct the observations.

397

398 Model performance is visualized using normalized “target diagrams” [Jolliff *et al.*,
399 2009]. Target diagrams visualize bias and variability together (Figure 2a), giving
400 them an advantage over the commonly used “Taylor diagram” [Taylor, 2001], which
401 summarizes only the variability. Normalized target diagrams are based on the
402 following quadratic relationship:

$$403 \quad \left(\frac{RMSD}{s_o}\right)^2 = \left(\frac{B}{s_o}\right)^2 + \left(\frac{uRMSD}{s_o}\right)^2 \quad (8)$$

404 where $uRMSD = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N [\Delta(i) - B]^2$ is the unbiased RMSD (or variance of the
405 model-data misfit), which measures the degree to which the model captures the
406 observed variance, bias (B) is a measure of how well the simulated mean captures the
407 observed mean, and s_o is the observed variance. Target diagrams provide a novel
408 way of visualizing B and uRMSD on a single plot: bias (B) on the y-axis and
409 unbiased RMSD (uRMSD) on the x-axis. The radial distance, $\left(\frac{RMSD}{s_o}\right)^2$, is related to
410 the modeling efficiency (ME): $\left(\frac{RMSD}{s_o}\right)^2 = 1 - ME$. ME is negative when the radial
411 distance is greater than one and modeling efficiency is positive when the radial
412 distance is less than one. Therefore, ME is visualized by plotting a circle with a
413 radius of one on a normalized target diagram; skillful models are within the circle.
414 Under- or over-estimation of the variability is quantified by multiplying uRMSD by
415 the sign of the observed variance (s_o) subtracted from the modeled variance (s_M).
416 Equation (9) shows the relationship used to construct target diagrams presented in this
417 manuscript, which is equivalent to equation (8):

$$418 \quad (1 - ME) = B^{*2} + uRMSD^{*2} \quad (9)$$

419 where $B^* = \frac{B}{s_o}$ and $uRMSD^* = \frac{uRMSD}{s_o} \text{sign}(s_M - s_o)$. Normalized target diagrams
420 allow the display of multiple models on a single plot. They also visualize how well
421 each model captures the observed mean and variance along with the modeling
422 efficiency (ME). Target diagrams have previously been used to assess satellite
423 derived NPP estimates [Friedrichs *et al.*, 2009; Saba *et al.*, 2010; Saba *et al.*, 2011;
424 Lee *et al.*, 2015], surface chlorophyll [Hofmann, 2008; Lazzari *et al.*, 2012], and
425 physical variables such as temperature and salinity [Hofmann, 2008; Pairaud *et al.*,
426 2011].
427
428 The final component of our analysis is to determine the range of Martin’s b that is
429 globally consistent with POC flux observations; and then to use this range to constrain
430 previous estimates of the potential sensitivity of atmospheric pCO₂ to uncertainty in
431 the biological pump [Kwon *et al.* 2009]. The normalized bias (B^*), the vertical axis in
432 normalized target diagrams, is our metric for best fit. As discussed in detail in section
433 3, the three parameterizations are better able to capture the observed mean POC flux
434 rather than POC flux variability, motivating the choice of B^* as a metric. For this
435 analysis, the model is run for each province with a range of b values from 0.40 to 1.40
436 (with increments of 0.01), the range of b from Kwon *et al.* [2009]. B^* is calculated
437 using observations only in the midnight zone, and in both the midnight and twilight
438 zones. A particular value of b “accurately” captures the observed mean if the B^* for
439 that model is within the range [-1,1] (supplementary Figure S2). The best-fit global b
440 range is taken as the interquartile range of all province-specific b values.
441 Atmospheric pCO₂ as a function of b is taken from the global 3-D biogeochemical
442 modeling study of Kwon *et al.* [2009]. In their most realistic model formulation
443 (“nutrient restoring”, Supplementary Text T1), biological productivity changed in

444 response to export change and a constant rain ratio (PIC/POC) of 0.08 was used. For
445 our analysis, their results are digitized and interpolated with a cubic spline [*Kwon et*
446 *al.*, 2009, their Figure 3c]. The change in atmospheric pCO₂ (referenced to pCO₂
447 with $b=0.858$) is then inferred from this curve for the range of b values that we find to
448 best fit POC flux observations.

449

450 **3. Results**

451 Four biogeochemical provinces out of eleven are selected to be presented in the main
452 text since they span a range of latitudes (Figure 1). Simulated POC fluxes for each
453 parameterization in the selected provinces are shown alongside observations in Figure
454 3; all provinces are presented in supplementary Figures S3-S16, and considered in the
455 discussion and conclusions. Two provinces, Eastern Pacific subarctic gyres (PSAE)
456 and North Atlantic drift (NADR), were selected for focus because of their expected
457 collocation with the study regions for the Exports Processes in the Ocean from
458 RemoTe Sensing (EXPORTS) field campaign that is presently being planned [*Siegel*
459 *et al.*, 2016]. These sites also cover a range of ecosystem states. The simulated mean
460 annual primary production in each province captures the climatological range of mean
461 annual primary production, calculated using VGPM (Table 1). Although the model
462 does not fully capture the observed seasonality across some provinces (supplementary
463 Figure S17), it does capture the annual primary production, indicating the model is a
464 useful tool to study mean annual export, as done here.

465

466 **3.1 Twilight Zone**

467 For each province, the Martin curve, exponential model, and ballast hypothesis have
468 similar reliability indexes in the twilight zone (Figure 4), illustrating that these

469 parameterizations capture observations equally well within the twilight zone. This
470 corroborates *Buesseler and Boyd* [2009], who show that the Martin curve and
471 exponential model capture observations at shallow depths. The exponential decay
472 model has a tendency to underestimate the flux deep in the twilight zone in some
473 provinces such as the Pacific Equatorial Divergence (PEQD) (Figure 3). The
474 exponential model assumes a constant sinking speed and remineralization rate (i.e.
475 constant remineralization length scale) throughout the water column, which often
476 results in fluxes that decrease too quickly with depth [*Armstrong et al.*, 2002; *Lutz et*
477 *al.*, 2002]. The amount of variability in the modeled flux varies between provinces,
478 much due to variability in primary production.

479

480 The interquartile ranges for the three parameterizations overlap for each of the
481 univariate statistics (Figure 5), quantitatively supporting that these parameterizations
482 are equally good at capturing observations in the twilight zone. However, the
483 parameterizations tend to underestimate the observed variability in the twilight zone,
484 evident through negative uRMSD* values (Figure 6). Depending on the location, the
485 models either show a slight positive or negative bias (Figure 5, Figure 6). Overall, all
486 the models perform well in the twilight zone and are more skillful than simply setting
487 the POC flux to be the observed average (Figure 6).

488

489 3.2 **Midnight Zone**

490 The Martin curve and ballast hypothesis each capture observations well in the
491 midnight zone, while the exponential model underestimates the observed flux at these
492 depths (Figure 3; Figure 4). The exponential model underestimates the flux at depth
493 since a constant remineralization length scale does not allow for slowdown of

494 remineralization with depth or increasing sinking speed with depth. The global
495 Martin curve slightly underestimates the observed flux in some provinces, such as
496 PEQD (Figure 3), resulting from either too low POC fluxes out of the euphotic zone
497 or the use of a b parameter that is too large.

498

499 In the midnight zone, the interquartile range for summary statistics overlap for both
500 the Martin curve and ballast hypothesis (Figure 5); however, not for the exponential
501 model. Each summary statistic suggests the exponential model performs poorly in the
502 midnight zone compared to the Martin curve and ballast hypothesis:

- 503 1. Correlation interquartile range nearly symmetric about zero.
- 504 2. Large RMSD, AAE compared to Martin curve and ballast hypothesis.
- 505 3. Large negative bias compared to Martin curve and ballast hypothesis.
- 506 4. Large negative ME, suggesting poor model performance.

507 The exponential model for the midnight zone generally lies far from the origin in the
508 fourth quadrant in the target diagram (Figure 6), consistent with its underestimate of
509 the observed mean and overestimate of variability. However, if only one depth level
510 is resolved in the midnight zone then the normalized target diagram suggests the
511 exponential model reasonably captures the variability while underestimating the mean
512 (e.g. PSAE). For all provinces, the Martin curve and ballast hypothesis both have a
513 radial distance near unity on the normalized target diagram (Figure 6), suggesting
514 these models are equally skillful.

515

516 3.3 Regional Attenuation Parameter

517 Regional Martin curves, using attenuation parameters from *Henson et al.* [2012] and
518 *Guidi et al.* [2015], qualitatively agree with each other and with the global b estimates

519 (Figure 7, Figure 8). Regional b parameters can lead to an improved fit in the
520 midnight zone in specific provinces. For example, the *Guidi et al.* [2015] regional b
521 parameter reduces the bias in PEQD relative to the *Martin et al.* [1987] global b value
522 (Figure 2). This is further supported by the reliability index (RI) in the midnight zone
523 decreasing from 2.24 using *Martin et al.* [1987] global b value to 1.97 using the *Guidi*
524 *et al.* [2015] regional b parameter (Figure 8). However, when all 11 provinces are
525 considered, the interquartile range for each summary statistic overlaps (Figure 5),
526 which suggests on a global scale regional b values produce no statistically significant
527 improvement over the *Martin et al.* [1987] global b value.

528

529 4. Discussion

530 We use a consistent modeling framework to compare estimates of vertical POC flux
531 from three common parameterizations to a globally distributed dataset. We find that
532 the Martin curve and the ballast hypothesis capture observations equally well at all
533 depths. The exponential model is as skillful as the Martin curve and the ballast
534 hypothesis in the twilight zone (100-1000m), but not as skillful in the midnight zone
535 (1000-4000m).

536

537 Vertical attenuation of POC flux is ultimately controlled by particle sinking speed and
538 remineralization rate, each of which can change as the particle descends through the
539 water column. Potential processes influencing sinking speed and remineralization
540 rate include: mineral ballasting [*Armstrong et al.*, 2002; *François et al.*, 2002],
541 temperature [*Laws et al.*, 2000; *Marsay et al.*, 2015; *DeVries and Weber*, 2017],
542 oxygen concentration [*Devol and Hartnett*, 2001; *Van Mooy et al.*, 2002; *Keil et al.*,
543 2016; *Sanders et al.*, 2016; *DeVries and Weber*, 2017], and particle aggregation [*Burd*

544 *and Jackson, 2009*]. Some of these processes have been explicitly parameterized into
545 the “stochastic, Lagrangian aggregate model of sinking particles (SLAMS)”, which
546 was able to reproduce sediment trap observed POC fluxes and some of its regional
547 variation [*Jokulsdottir and Archer, 2016*]. The relative and global importance of
548 these processes is unclear [*Burd et al., 2016*] and their influence on sinking speed is
549 still an active area of research. For example, *Mari et al., [2017]* show transparent
550 exopolymer particles (TEP) accumulates in the surface microlayer and needs to be
551 ballasted to overcome its low density in order to promote aggregation, which brings
552 into question the classic view that TEP increases POC flux by promoting aggregation
553 through its role as a “biological glue.” Attenuation of POC flux is also effected by
554 surface processes that modify the character and lability of the POC that is exported.
555 For example, episodic events [*Lebrato et al., 2012; Smith et al, 2014*], community
556 structure [*Guidi et al., 2009; Guidi et al., 2016*], and zooplankton processes [*Giering*
557 *et al., 2014; Cavan et al., 2015; Cavan et al., 2017; Steinberg and Landry, 2017*] are
558 all likely important.

559

560 That we find that this implementation of the ballast hypothesis captures observations
561 in the twilight zone and midnight zone no better than the global and regional Martin
562 curves does not invalidate the ballast hypothesis. It simply indicates that the
563 interaction of ballast minerals with POC, as parameterized using standard approaches,
564 is not necessary to model POC flux in a manner that is statistically consistent with
565 observations from water column. A major issue here is, of course, the limited
566 coverage of these data in space and time [*Mouw et al. 2016a,b; Siegel et al. 2016;*
567 *Burd et al. 2016*]. The ballast hypothesis is based on a long-known correlation
568 between the flux of POC and the flux of ballast minerals [*Deuser et al., 1981*] which

569 has been used to suggest ballast minerals are responsible for the flux of POC at depth,
570 either by increasing the sinking speed or protecting organic matter from oxidation
571 [*Armstrong et al.*, 2002; *François et al.*, 2002; *Klaas and Archer*, 2002]. The organic
572 matter content of sinking particles in the midnight zone is observed to be
573 approximately 5% by weight [*Armstrong et al.*, 2002]. An alternative view of this
574 correlation is that sinking POC scavenges neutrally-buoyant minerals [*Passow*, 2004],
575 which has been corroborated with a laboratory study [*Passow and De La Rocha*,
576 2006]. Additionally, *Passow and De la Rocha*, [2006] observed the POC to dry
577 weight percent concentration to be 2-3%, which is similar to the 5% observed by
578 *Armstrong et al.* [2002] in deep sediment traps, suggesting this may be the carrying
579 capacity of suspended minerals for POC. Many studies support the claim that ballast
580 minerals increase the sinking speed of aggregates [*De La Rocha and Passow*, 2007;
581 *Ploug et al.*, 2008; *Iversen and Ploug*, 2010]. However, the literature provides both
582 supporting [*Arnarson and Keil*, 2005; *Engel et al.*, 2009; *Le Moigne et al.*, 2013] and
583 opposing [*Ingalls et al.*, 2006; *Ploug et al.*, 2008; *Iversen and Robert*, 2015]
584 mechanistic evidence with respect to the degree to which ballast minerals protect
585 organic matter from oxidation.

586

587 **4.1 Modeling Recommendations**

588 Each parameterization investigated in this study may be useful in modeling studies,
589 but should be selected with consideration of the time and depth scales of interest. All
590 three parameterizations capture mean observations within the twilight zone and
591 therefore would be suitable for studies investigating the surface ocean on annual to
592 decadal time scales, i.e. where accurately capturing the deep ocean is not crucial.
593 However, for studies of the carbon cycle on centennial to millennial time scales,

594 including assessments of long-term ocean carbon sequestration, carbon supply to the
595 deep ocean should be important. In this case, the Martin curve and the ballast
596 hypothesis capture observations at depth equally well on the mean and therefore
597 would both be suitable.

598

599 We find that the empirical Martin curve has a predictive power comparable to the
600 mechanistic ballast hypothesis, despite the fact that it lacks a mechanistic foundation.
601 Though regional variability in the b parameter may improve the realism of the Martin
602 curve [Henson *et al.* 2012; Guidi *et al.*, 2015], it is still not mechanistic. The
603 exponential decay model's first-order kinetics are mechanistic to a degree, but this
604 approach excludes suggested mechanisms such as increasing sinking speed and
605 remineralization length scale with depth [Villa-Alfageme *et al.*, 2016]. The ballast
606 hypothesis is more mechanistic by allowing for refractory POC and allowing ballast
607 associated POC to sink faster with a longer remineralization length scale. However,
608 sinking speed and remineralization length scale of POC and ballast minerals still do
609 not increase with depth. Even though the ballast hypothesis is more mechanistic than
610 the exponential model and the Martin curve, it does not explain the observed
611 variability in POC flux at depth, which highlights a need for more complete
612 quantification of export mechanisms (see section 4). If simplicity is desired, our
613 recommendation would be to use the Martin curve in ecosystem models, but this
614 evaluation indicates that the ballast hypothesis would be an equally good choice.

615

616 In order to improve simulations of the biological pump, the relative significance of
617 mechanisms driving POC flux attenuation need to be better understood. The primary
618 limitation on this understanding is the lack of observational data with sufficient

619 spatio-temporal resolution to resolve ecosystem processes in the surface ocean that
620 generate POC and at the same time the processes driving remineralization at depth
621 [Buessler and Boyd, 2009; Siegel et al. 2016; Burd et al. 2016]. Drivers of temporal
622 variability in these mechanisms need also to be elucidated. To better constrain a
623 model on seasonal timescales, having sediment trap data with higher temporal
624 resolution and more sampling depths would be of great utility.

625

626 4.2 Impacts on Atmospheric pCO₂

627 The biological pump plays an important role regulating atmospheric pCO₂ [Parekh et
628 al., 2006; Kwon et al., 2009] and may help explain the drawdown of atmospheric
629 pCO₂ during glacial periods [Sigman and Boyle, 2000; Buchanan et al., 2016] by
630 sequestering carbon in the deep ocean [Yu et al., 2016]. Carbon raining to the
631 “midnight zone” (>1000 m) can be considered sequestered because it will be out of
632 contact with the atmosphere for at least 100 years [Primeau, 2005; Ciais et al., 2013].
633 Using earth system model experiments, Buchanan et al., [2016] find that the
634 biological pump explains about 58% of the increase in atmospheric pCO₂ from the
635 last glacial maximum to pre-industrial times. The current uncertainty with respect to
636 the biological carbon pump’s role in setting atmospheric pCO₂ has significant
637 implications for our understanding of global climate regulation on time frames
638 ranging from centennial to millennial.

639

640 Applying B* as a metric to limit Martin’s *b* to a range consistent with the
641 observations in each province (section 2.6) reveals that Martin’s global *b* (=0.858)
642 value is contained within the range of reasonable estimates for each province (Figure
643 9A). When data in the twilight zone and midnight zone are considered, and all

644 provinces b values collected, the interquartile range of b values is 0.68 – 1.13 (Figure
645 9C) while the range is 0.70 – 0.98 when only considering observations solely in the
646 midnight zone (Figure 9D). The midnight zone contains 25-75% of observations in
647 each province (>33% mean, Figure 9B) indicating sufficient data are available for the
648 latter comparison.

649

650 Thus, the best-fit global range for b is 0.68 – 1.13 across both the twilight and
651 midnight zone, and 0.70 – 0.98 for only the midnight zone. These ranges are
652 substantially less than 0.4 to 1.4 used in the model of *Kwon et al.* [2009] to estimate
653 potential impacts on atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$. In their most realistic model configuration,
654 this range of b leads to a range of equilibrium atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ of almost 100 ppm [-
655 46ppm, +52ppm]. Since only the carbon that reaches the midnight zone is
656 sequestered on the long-term, our data-constrained range of b that is most applicable
657 to the control of atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ is 0.70 – 0.98. This constrained range leads to
658 change in atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ from -16 ppm to +12 ppm in the *Kwon et al.* [2009]
659 model (supplementary Table S3). This indicates that uncertainty in the biological
660 pump, as globally constrained by the available POC flux data, has the potential to
661 vary modern atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ by approximately 1/3 the range suggested by *Kwon et*
662 *al.* [2009], i.e. only a few tens of ppm [-16 ppm, +12 ppm].

663

664 **5. Conclusions**

665 The *Mouw et al.* [2016a] dataset is a comprehensive collection of POC flux
666 measurements that allows a regional assessment of the skill of the Martin curve,
667 exponential decay model, and ballast hypothesis parameterizations. When these three

668 parameterizations are compared to observations throughout the water column in 11
669 biogeochemical provinces we find:

- 670 1. Twilight zone observations are captured equally well by the all three
671 parameterizations.
- 672 2. Midnight zone observations are captured equally well by the Martin curve and
673 ballast hypothesis.

674 All three parameterizations would be equally good choices for modeling studies
675 addressing the upper ocean, but only the ballast hypothesis or Martin curve should be
676 selected if export to depths below 1000m is of interest.

677

678 Parameterizations using the global b value of *Martin et al.* [1987] were compared
679 with province specific b values of *Guidi et al.* [2015] and *Henson et al.* [2012].
680 Province-specific b values can reduce the bias in the midnight zone POC fluxes in
681 some regions relative to Martin's global b value (Figure 2). However, when all
682 provinces are considered, the interquartile range for each summery statistic overlaps
683 (Figure 5), indicating no global benefit of province-specific b values. Province-
684 specific b values may still be suitable for studies with a regional focus. For all
685 provinces taken together, the range of Martin's b that best fits data from the midnight
686 zone where long-term carbon sequestration occurs is [0.70, 0.98]. Based on previous
687 global biogeochemical modeling [*Kwon et al.*, 2009], this limited range of b has the
688 capacity to change atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ by only a few tens of ppm [-16 ppm, +12 ppm].

689

690 The paucity of high-resolution observations makes it impossible to discern the relative
691 importance of various export mechanisms, many of which are discussed in Section 4.

692 At a given depth level, the *Mouw et al.* [2016a] dataset shows variability spanning an

693 order of magnitude (Figure 3) that cannot yet be mechanistically explained, and thus
694 cannot yet be accurately modeled. The role of ecosystem structure on export, the
695 biotic and abiotic transformation of particles to different class sizes, and variability
696 through space and time are key areas of research [*Burd et al.*, 2016; *Mouw et al.*,
697 2016b]. There is also a great need for seasonally resolved observations at a variety of
698 locations for more complete elucidation and quantification of export mechanisms
699 [*Siegel et al.* 2016].

700

701 **Acknowledgments**

702 The authors thank The National Aeronautics and Space Administration (grant #:
703 NNX11AD59G) and Wisconsin Research Foundation for funding this research. We
704 thank Darren Pilcher for initially setting up the model. Comments from two
705 anonymous reviews greatly improved the manuscript. Data used to create model
706 forcing fields are listed in the references and POC flux data is available at
707 doi:10.5194/essd-2016-22.

708 **6. References**

- 709 Armstrong, R. A., C. Lee, J. I. Hedges, S. Honjo, and S. G. Wakeham (2002), A
710 new, mechanistic model for organic carbon fluxes in the ocean based on the
711 quantitative association of POC with ballast minerals, *Deep Sea Res.*,
712 *Part II*, 49(1), 219-236, doi:10.1016/S0967-0645(01)00101-1.
- 713 Arnarson, T. S., and R. G. Keil (2005), Influence of organic-mineral aggregates on
714 microbial degradation of the dinoflagellate *Scrippsiella trochoidea*,
715 *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 69(8), 2111-2117,
716 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2004.11.004.
- 717 Banse, K. (1990), New views on the degradation and disposition of organic particles
718 as collected by sediment traps in the open sea, *Deep Sea Res., Part A.*
719 *Oceanographic Res. Papers*, 37(7), 1177-1195,
720 doi:10.1016/0198-0149(90)90058-4.
- 721 Barange, M., M. Butenschön, A. Yool, N. Beaumont, J. A. Fernandes, A. P. Martin,
722 and J. I. Allen (2017), The cost of reducing the North Atlantic Ocean
723 biological carbon pump, *Front. Mar. Sci.*, 3, 290,
724 doi: 10.3389/fmars.2016.00290.
- 725 Behrenfeld, M., and P. Falkowski (1997), Photosynthetic rates derived from satellite-
726 based chlorophyll concentration, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 42(1), 1–20,
727 doi:10.4319/lo.1997.42.1.0001.
- 728 Berelson, W.M. (2001), The flux of particulate organic carbon into the ocean interior:
729 A comparison of four U.S. JGOFS regional studies, *Oceanography*, 14(4),
730 59–67, doi:10.5670/oceanog.2001.07.
- 731 Betzer, P. R., W. J. Showers, E. A. Laws, C. D. Winn, G. R. DiTullio, and P. M.
732 Kroopnick (1984), Primary productivity and particle fluxes on a transect of the
733 equator at 153 W in the Pacific Ocean, *Deep Sea Res., Part A. Oceanographic*
734 *Res. Papers*, 31(1), 1-11, doi:10.1016/0198-0149(84)90068-2.
- 735 Bopp, L. *et al.* (2013), Multiple stressors of ocean ecosystems in the 21st century:
736 projections with CMIP5 models. *Biogeosciences* **10**, 6225–6245.
- 737 Boyd, P. W., and T. W. Trull (2007), Understanding the export of marine biogenic
738 particles: Is there consensus?, *Prog. Oceanogr.*, 72, 276–
739 312, doi:10.4319/lo.1990.35.6.1376.
- 740 Boyer, T.P., et al. (2013): World Ocean Database (2013), NOAA Atlas NESDIS 72,
741 S. Levitus, Ed., A. Mishonov, Technical Ed.; Silver Spring, MD, 209pp.,
742 doi:10.7289/V5NZ85MT.
- 743 Broecker, W. S., and T.-H. Peng (1982), Tracers in the Sea, *Eldigio Press*,
744 Palisades, N.Y.
- 745 Buchanan, P. J., R. J. Matear, A. Lenton, S. J. Phipps, Z. Chase, and D. M. Etheridge
746 (2016), The simulated climate of the Last Glacial Maximum and insights into
747 the global marine carbon cycle, *Climate of the Past*, 12(12), 2271-2295,
748 doi:10.5194/cp-12-2271-2016.
- 749 Buesseler, K. O. (1998), The decoupling of production and particulate export in the
750 surface ocean, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 12(2), 297–310,
751 doi:10.1029/97GB03366.
- 752 Buesseler, K. O., and P. W. Boyd (2009), Shedding light on processes that control
753 particle export and flux attenuation in the twilight zone of the open
754 ocean, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 54(4), 1210-1232, doi:10.4319/lo.2009.54.4.1210.
- 755 Burd, A. B., and G. A. Jackson (2009), Particle aggregation, *Annu. Rev. Mar. Sci.*, 1,
756 65–90, doi:10.1146/annurev.marine.010908.163904.

757 Burd, A.B., A. Buchan, M. Church, M. Landry, A. McDonnell, U. Passow, D.
758 Steinberg, and H. Benway. (2016), Towards a transformative understanding of
759 the biology of the ocean's biological pump: Priorities for future research,
760 *Report of the NSF Biology of the Biological Pump Workshop, February*
761 *19–20, 2016 (Hyatt Place New Orleans, New Orleans, LA)*, 67 pp.,
762 doi:10.1575/1912/8263.

763 Cavan, E. L., F. A. C. Le Moigne, A. J. Poulton, G. A. Tarling, P. Ward, C. J.
764 Daniels, G. M. Fragoso, and R. J. Sanders (2015), Attenuation of particulate
765 organic carbon flux in the Scotia Sea, Southern Ocean, is controlled by
766 zooplankton fecal pellets. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 42(3), 821–830,
767 doi:10.1002/2014GL062744.

768 Cavan, E. L., S. A. Henson, A. Belcher, and R. Sanders (2017), Role of zooplankton
769 in determining the efficiency of the biological carbon pump, *Biogeosciences*,
770 14(1), 177-186, doi:10.5194/bg-14-177-2017.

771 Ciais, P. et al. in *Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of*
772 *Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental*
773 *Panel on Climate Change (eds. Stocker et al.) 1–106 (Cambridge University*
774 *Press, 2013).*

775 De La Rocha, C. L. (2006), The biological pump, *In: Elderfield, H. (Ed.), The oceans*
776 *and marine geochemistry*, 6, 83-111, doi:10.1016/B0-08-043751-6/06107-7.

777 De La Rocha, C., and U. Passow (2007), Factors influencing the sinking of POC and
778 the efficiency of the biological carbon pump, *Deep Sea Res., Part II*, 54(5),
779 639-658, doi:10.1016/j.dsr2.2007.01.004.

780 De La Rocha, C. L., N. Nowald, and U. Passow (2008), Interactions between diatom
781 aggregates, minerals, particulate organic carbon, and dissolved organic matter:
782 Further implications for the ballast hypothesis, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*,
783 22(4), GB4005, doi:10.1029/2007GB003156.

784 Deuser, W. G., E. H. Ross, and R. F. Anderson (1981), Seasonality in the supply of
785 sediment to the deep Sargasso Sea and implications for the rapid transfer of
786 matter to the deep ocean, *Deep-Sea Res.*, 28A, 495–505,
787 doi:10.1016/0198-0149(81)90140-0.

788 Devol, A. H., and H. E. Hartnett (2001), Role of the oxygen-deficient zone in transfer
789 of organic carbon to the deep ocean, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 46(7), 1684–1690,
790 doi:10.4319/lo.2001.46.7.1684.

791 DeVries, T., F. Primeau, and C. Deutsch (2012), The sequestration efficiency of the
792 biological pump, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 39, L13601,
793 doi:10.1029/2012GL051963.

794 DeVries T., and T.S Weber (2017), The export and fate of organic matter in the
795 ocean: New constraints from combining satellite and oceanographic tracer
796 observations, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 31, doi:10.1002/2016GB005551.

797 Dunne, J. P., et al. (2013), GFDL's ESM2 global coupled climate-carbon Earth
798 System Models Part II: Carbon system formulation and baseline simulation
799 characteristics, *J. Clim.*, 26(7), 2247–2267, doi:10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00150.1.

800 Dutkiewicz, S., M. J. Follows, and P. Parekh (2005), Interactions of the iron and
801 phosphorus cycles: A three-dimensional model study, *Global Biogeochem.*
802 *Cycles*, 19, GB1021, doi:10.1029/2004GB002342.

803 Engel, A., J. Szlosek, L. Abramson, Z. F. Liu, and C. Lee (2009), Investigating the
804 effect of ballasting by CaCO₃ in *Emiliana huxleyi*: I. Formation, settling
805 velocities and physical properties of aggregates, *Deep Sea Res., Part II*,
806 56(18), 1396–1407, doi:10.1016/j.dsr2.2008.11.027.

807 François, R., S. Honjo, R. Krishfield, and S. Manganini, (2002), Factors controlling
808 the flux of organic carbon to the bathypelagic zone of the ocean, *Global*
809 *Biogeochem. Cycles*, 16(4), doi:10.1029/2001GB001722.

810 Friedrichs, M. A., et al. (2009), Assessing the uncertainties of model estimates of
811 primary productivity in the tropical Pacific Ocean, *J. Mar. Syst.*, 76(1),
812 113-133, doi:10.1016/j.jmarsys.2008.05.010.

813 Frouin, R., B. A. Franz, and P. J. Werdell (2002), The SeaWiFS PAR product, In:
814 S.B. Hooker and E.R. Firestone, Algorithm Updates for the Fourth SeaWiFS
815 Data Reprocessing, NASA Tech. Memo. 2003–206892, Volume 22, NASA
816 Goddard Space Flight Center, Greenbelt, Maryland, 46-50.

817 Giering, S. L., et al. (2014). Reconciliation of the carbon budget in the ocean's
818 twilight zone. *Nature*, 507(7493), 480-483, doi:10.1038/nature13123.

819 Giering, S. L. C., R. Sanders, A. P. Martin, S. A. Henson, J. S. Riley, C. M. Marsay,
820 and D. G. Johns (2017), Particle flux in the oceans: Challenging the steady
821 state assumption, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 31(1), 159–171,
822 doi:10.1002/2016GB005424.

823 Guidi, L., L. Stemmann, G. A. Jackson, F. Ibanez, H. Claustre, L. Legendre, M.
824 Picheral, and G. Gorsky (2009), Effects of phytoplankton com-
825 munity on production, size, and export of large aggregates: A world-ocean
826 analysis, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 54(6), 1951–1963.

827 Guidi, L., L. Legendre, G. Reygondeau, J. Uitz, L. Stemman, and S. Henson (2015),
828 A new look at ocean carbon remineralization for estimating
829 deepwater sequestration, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 29, 1044–1059,
830 doi:10.1002/2014GB005063.

831 Guidi L., et al. (2016), Plankton networks driving carbon export in the oligotrophic
832 ocean, *Nature*, 532, 465–470, doi:10.1038/nature16942.

833 Hauck, J., et al. (2015), On the Southern Ocean CO₂ uptake and the role of the
834 biological carbon pump in the 21st century, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 29,
835 1451-1470, doi:10.1002/2015GB005140.

836 Henson, S. A., R. Sanders, E. Madsen, P. J. Morris, F. Le Moigne, and G. D. Quartly
837 (2011), A reduced estimate of the strength of the ocean's biological carbon
838 pump, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 38, L04606, doi:10.1029/2011GL046735.

839 Henson, S. A., R. Sanders, and E. Madsen (2012), Global patterns in efficiency of
840 particulate organic carbon export and transfer to the deep
841 ocean, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 26, GB1028, doi:10.1029/2011GB004099.

842 Hofmann, E. E., J. N. Druon, K. Fennel, and M. Friedrichs (2008), Eastern US
843 continental shelf carbon budget integrating models, data assimilation, and
844 analysis, *Oceanography*, 21(1), 86-104, doi:10.5670/oceanog.2008.70.

845 Honjo, S., S. J. Manganini, R. A. Krishfield, and R. Francois (2008), Particulate
846 organic carbon fluxes to the ocean interior and factors controlling the
847 biological pump: A synthesis of global sediment trap programs since 1983,
848 *Prog. Oceanogr.*, 76, 217–285, doi:10.1016/j.pocean.2007.11.003.

849 Howard, M. T., A. M. E. Winguth, C. Klaas, and E. Maier-Reimer (2006), Sensitivity
850 of ocean carbon tracer distributions to particulate organic flux
851 parameterizations, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 20, GB3011,
852 doi:10.1029/2005GB002499.

853 Ingalls, A. E., Z. Liu, and C. Lee (2006), Seasonal trends in the pigment and amino
854 acid compositions of sinking particles in biogenic CaCO₃ and SiO₂
855 dominated regions of the Pacific sector of the Southern Ocean along 170°W,
856 *Deep Sea Res., Part I*, 53(5), 836–859, doi:10.1016/j.dsr.2006.01.004.

857 Iversen, M. H., and H. Ploug (2010), Ballast minerals and the sinking carbon flux in
858 the ocean: carbon-specific respiration rates and sinking velocity of marine
859 snow aggregates, *Biogeosciences*, 7(9), 2613-2624,
860 doi:10.5194/bg-7-2613-2010

861 Iversen, M. H., and M. L. Robert (2015), Ballasting effects of smectite on aggregate
862 formation and export from a natural plankton community, *Mar. Chem.*, 175,
863 18-27., doi:10.1016/j.marchem.2015.04.009.

864 Jiao, N., et al. (2010), Microbial production of recalcitrant dissolved organic matter:
865 Long-term carbon storage in the global ocean, *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 8,
866 593–599, doi:10.1038/nrmicro2386

867 Jokulsdottir, T. and D. Archer (2016), A stochastic, Lagrangian model of sinking
868 biogenic aggregates in the ocean (SLAMS 1.0): model formulation, validation
869 and sensitivity, *Geosci. Model Dev.*, 9(4), 1455-1476,
870 doi:10.5194/gmd-9-1455-2016

871 Jolliff, J. K., J. C. Kindle, I. Shulman, B. Penta, M. A. Friedrichs, R. Helber, and R.
872 A. Arnone (2009), Summary diagrams for coupled hydrodynamic-ecosystem
873 model skill assessment, *J. Mar. Syst.*, 76(1), 64-82,
874 doi:10.1016/j.jmarsys.2008.05.014.

875 Kalnay, E., et al. (1996), The NCEP/NCAR 40-Year Reanalysis Project, *Bull. Am.*
876 *Meteorol. Soc.*, 77(3), 437 – 471,
877 doi:10.1175/1520-0477(1996)077<0437:TNYRP>2.0.CO;2.

878 Keil, R. G., J. A. Neibauer, and A. H. Devol (2016), A multiproxy approach to
879 understanding the "enhanced" flux of organic matter through the oxygen-
880 deficient waters of the Arabian Sea, *Biogeosciences*, 13(7), 2077-2092,
881 doi:10.5194/bg-13-2077-2016.

882 Key, R. M., A. Kozyr, C. L. Sabine, K. Lee, R. Wanninkhof, J. Bullister, R. A. Feely,
883 F. Millero, C. Mordy, and T.-H. Peng (2004), A global ocean carbon
884 climatology: Results from GLODAP, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 18,
885 GB4031, doi:10.1029/2004GB002247.

886 Klaas, C., and D. E. Archer (2002), Association of sinking organic matter with
887 various types of mineral ballast in the deep sea: Implications for the rain ratio,
888 *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 16(4), 1116, doi:10.1029/2001GB001765.

889 Krumhardt, K. M., N. S. Lovenduski, M. C. Long, and K. Lindsay (2016) Avoidable
890 impacts of ocean warming on marine primary production: Insights from the
891 CESM ensembles. *Global Biogeochem Cy* 31, 114–133

892 Kwon, E. Y., F. Primeau, and J. L. Sarmiento (2009), The impact of remineralization
893 depth on the air–sea carbon balance, *Nat. Geosci.*, 2(9), 630-635,
894 doi:10.1038/ngeo612.

895 Kwon, E. Y., J. L. Sarmiento, J. R. Toggweiler, and T. DeVries (2011), The control of
896 atmospheric pCO₂ by ocean ventilation change: The effect of the oceanic
897 storage of biogenic carbon, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 25, GB3026,
898 doi:10.1029/2011GB004059.

899 Lam, P. J., S. C. Doney, and J. K. B. Bishop (2011), The dynamic ocean biological
900 pump: Insights from a global compilation of particulate organic carbon,
901 CaCO₃, and opal concentration profiles from the mesopelagic, *Global*
902 *Biogeochem. Cycles*, 25, GB3009, doi:10.1029/2010GB003868.

903 Large, W. G., J. C. McWilliams, and S. C. Doney (1994), Oceanic vertical mixing: A
904 review and a model with a nonlocal boundary layer parameterization, *Rev.*
905 *Geophys.*, 32, 363–403, doi:10.1029/94RG01872.

906 Laufkötter, C., et al. (2015), Drivers and uncertainties of future global marine primary
907 production in marine ecosystem models, *Biogeosciences*, *12*, 6955-6984,
908 doi:10.5194/bg-12-6955-2015

909 Laws, E. A., P. G. Falkowski, W. O. Smith Jr., H. Ducklow, and J. J. McCarthy
910 (2000), Temperature effects on export production in the open ocean, *Global
911 Biogeochem. Cycles*, *14*(4), 1231 – 1246, doi:10.1029/1999GB001229.

912 Lazzari, P., C. Solidoro, V. Ibello, S. Salon, A. Teruzzi, K. Béranger, S. Colella, and
913 A. Crise (2012), Seasonal and inter-annual variability of plankton chlorophyll
914 and primary production in the Mediterranean Sea: A modelling approach,
915 *Biogeosciences*, *9*(1), 217–233, doi:10.5194/bg-9-217-2012.

916 Le Moigne, F. A. C., M. Gallinari, E. Laurenceau, and C. L. De La Rocha (2013),
917 Enhanced rates of particulate organic matter degradation by microzooplankton
918 are diminished by added ballast minerals, *Biogeosciences*, *10*, 5755–5765,
919 doi:10.5194/bg-10-5755-2013.

920 Lebrato, M., K. A. Pitt, A. K. Sweetman, D. O. Jones, J. E. Cartes, A. Oschlies, R. H.
921 Condon, J. C. Molinero, L. Adler, C. Gaillard, and D. Lloris (2012), Jelly-falls
922 historic and recent observations: a review to drive future research directions,
923 *Hydrobiologia*, *690*(1), 227-245, doi:10.1007/s10750-012-1046-8.

924 Lee, Y. J., P. A. Matrai, M. A. Friedrichs, V. S. Saba, D. Antoine, M. Ardyna, I.
925 Asanuma, M. Babin, S. Bélanger, M. Benoit - Gagné, and E. Devred (2015),
926 An assessment of phytoplankton primary productivity in the Arctic Ocean
927 from satellite ocean color/in situ chlorophyll-a based models, *J. Geophys. Res.
928 Oceans*, *120*(9), 6508–6541, doi:10.1002/2015JC011018.

929 Lima, I. D., P. J. Lam, and S. C. Doney (2014), Dynamics of particulate organic
930 carbon flux in a global ocean model, *Biogeosciences*, *11*(4), 1177–1198,
931 doi:10.5194/bg-11-1177-2014.

932 Longhurst, A.R. (2006), *Ecological Geography of the Sea*. 2nd Edition. Academic
933 Press, San Diego, 560p.

934 Lutz, M. J., R. Dunbar, and K. Caldeira (2002), Regional variability in the vertical
935 flux of particulate organic carbon in the ocean interior, *Global
936 Biogeochem. Cycles*, *16*(3), doi:10.1029/2000GB001383.

937 Lutz, M. J., K. Caldeira, R. B. Dunbar, and M. Behrenfeld (2007), Seasonal rhythms
938 of net primary production and particulate organic carbon flux to depth
939 describe the efficiency of biological pump in the global ocean, *J. Geophys.
940 Res.*, *112*, C10011, doi:10.1029/2006JC003706.

941 Mahowald, N. M., A. R. Baker, G. Bergametti, N. Brooks, R. A. Duce, T. D. Jickells,
942 N. Kubilay, J. M. Prospero, and I. Tegen (2005), Atmospheric global dust
943 cycle and iron inputs to the ocean, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, *19*, GB4025,
944 doi:10.1029/2004GB002402.

945 Mari, X., U. Passow, C. Migon, A. B. Burd, and L. Legendre (2017), Transparent
946 exopolymer particles: Effects on carbon cycling in the ocean, *Prog.
947 Oceanogr.*, *151*, 13-37, doi: 10.1016/j.pocean.2016.11.002.

948 Marinov, I., A. Gnanadesikan, J. L. Sarmiento, J. R. Toggweiler, M. Follows, and B.
949 K. Mignone (2008a), Impact of oceanic circulation on biological carbon
950 storage in the ocean and atmospheric pCO₂, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, *22*,
951 GB3007, doi:10.1029/2007GB002958.

952 Marinov, I., M. Follows, A. Gnanadesikan, J. L. Sarmiento, and R. D. Slater (2008b),
953 How does ocean biology affect atmospheric pCO₂? Theory and models, *J.
954 Geophys. Res.*, *113*, C07032, doi:10.1029/2007JC004598.

- 955 Marshall, J., A. Adcroft, C. Hill, L. Perelman, and C. Heisey (1997a), A finite-
956 volume, incompressible Navier Stokes model for studies of the ocean on
957 parallel computers, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *102*(C3), 5753–5766,
958 doi:10.1029/96JC02775.
- 959 Marshall, J., C. Hill, L. Perelman, and A. Adcroft (1997b), Hydrostatic, quasi-
960 hydrostatic, and nonhydrostatic ocean modeling, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *102*(C3),
961 5733–5752, doi:10.1029/96JC02776.
- 962 Moore, J. K., S. C. Doney, and K. Lindsay (2004), Upper ocean ecosystem dynamics
963 and iron cycling in a global three-dimensional model, *Global Biogeochem.*
964 *Cycles*, *18*, GB4028, doi:10.1029/2004GB002220.
- 965 Nash, J. E., and J. V. Sutcliffe (1970), River flow forecasting through conceptual
966 models part I—A discussion of principles, *Journal of hydrology*, *10*(3),
967 282-290, doi:10.1016/0022-1694(70)90255-6.
- 968 Pairaud, I. L., J. Gatti, N. Bensoussan, R. Verney, and P. Garreau (2011), Hydrology
969 and circulation in a coastal area off Marseille: validation of a nested 3D model
970 with observations, *J. Mar. Syst.*, *88*(1), 20-33,
971 doi:10.1016/j.jmarsys.2011.02.010.
- 972 Ploug, H., M. H. Iversen, M. Koski, and E. T. Buitenhuis (2008), Production, oxygen
973 respiration rates, and sinking velocity of copepod fecal pellets: Direct
974 measurements of ballasting by opal and calcite, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, *53*,
975 469–476, doi:10.4319/lo.2008.53.2.0469.
- 976 Pomeroy L. R., and D. Deibel (1986), Temperature regulation of bacterial activity
977 during the spring bloom in newfoundland coastal waters, *Science*, *233*,
978 359–361, doi:10.1126/science.233.4761.359.
- 979 Pomeroy, L. R., W. J. Wiebe, D. Deibel, R. J. Thompson, G. T. Rowe, J. D. Pakulski
980 (1991), Bacterial responses to temperature and substrate concentration during
981 the Newfoundland spring bloom, *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.*, *75*, 143–159,
- 982 Primeau, F. (2005), Characterizing Transport between the Surface Mixed Layer and t
983 he Ocean Interior with a Forward and Adjoint Global Ocean Transport Model,
984 *J. Phys. Oceanogr.*, *35*, 545–564, doi: 10.1175/JPO2699.1.
- 985 Marsay, C. M., R. J. Sanders, S. A. Henson, K. Pabortsava, E. P. Achterberg, and R.
986 S. Lampitt (2015), Attenuation of sinking particulate organic
987 carbon flux through the mesopelagic ocean, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.*,
988 *112*, 1089–1094, doi:10.1073/pnas.1415311112.
- 989 Martin, J. H., G. Knauer, D. Karl, and W. Broenkow (1987), VERTEX: Carbon
990 cycling in the northeast Pacific, *Deep Sea Res.*, *1*(34), 267–285,
991 doi:10.1016/0198-0149(87)90086-0.
- 992 Mayer, L. M. (1994), Surface area control of organic carbon accumulation in
993 continental shelf sediments, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, *58*(4), 1271–1284.
994 doi: 10.1016/0016-7037(94)90381-6.
- 995 Mouw, C.B. A. Barnett, G. A. McKinley, L. Gloege, and D. Pilcher (2016a), Global
996 ocean particulate organic carbon flux merged with satellite parameters,
997 doi:10.1594/PANGAEA.855600,
998 *Supplement to:* Mouw, C. B., Barnett, A., McKinley, G. A., Gloege, L., and
999 Pilcher, D. (2016a), Global Ocean Particulate Organic Carbon Flux Merged
1000 with Satellite Parameters, *Earth System Science Data*, *8*(2), 531–541,
1001 doi:10.5194/essd-8-531-2016.
- 1002 Mouw, C. B., A. Barnett, G. A. McKinley, L. Gloege, and D. Pilcher (2016b),
1003 Phytoplankton size impact on export flux in the global ocean, *Global*
1004 *Biogeochem. Cycles*, *30*, 1542–1562, doi:10.1002/2015GB005355.

1005 Pabortsava, K., et al. (2017), Carbon sequestration in the deep Atlantic enhanced by
1006 Saharan dust, *Nat. Geosci.*, *10*(3), 189-194, doi:10.1038/ngeo2899

1007 Pace, M. L., G. A. Knauer, D. M. Karl, J. H. Martin (1987), Primary production, new
1008 production and vertical flux in the eastern Pacific Ocean, *Nature*, *325*(6107),
1009 803-804, doi:10.1038/325803a0.

1010 Parekh, P., S. Dutkiewicz, M. J. Follows, and T. Ito (2006), Atmospheric carbon
1011 dioxide in a less dusty world, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, *33*, L03610,
1012 doi:10.1029/2005GL025098.

1013 Passow, U. (2004), Switching perspectives: Do mineral fluxes determine particulate
1014 organic carbon fluxes or vice versa? *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, *5*, Q04002,
1015 doi:10.1029/2003GC000670.

1016 Passow, U., and C. L. De La Rocha (2006), Accumulation of mineral ballast on
1017 organic aggregates, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, *20*, GB1013,
1018 doi:10.1029/2005GB002579.

1019 Passow, U., and C. A. Carlson (2012), The biological pump in a high CO₂ world,
1020 *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.*, *470*, 249–271, doi:10.3354/meps09985.

1021 Ragueneau, O., et al. (2000), A review of the Si cycle in the modern ocean: Recent
1022 progress and missing gaps in the application of biogenic opal as a
1023 paleoproductivity proxy, *Global Planet. Change*, *26*, 317–365.

1024 Saba, V. S., et al. (2010), Challenges of modeling depth-integrated marine primary
1025 productivity over multiple decades: A case study at BATS and HOT, *Global
1026 Biogeochem. Cycles*, *24*, GB3020, doi:10.1029/2009GB003655.

1027 Saba, V. S., et al. (2011), An evaluation of ocean color model estimates of marine
1028 primary productivity in coastal and pelagic regions across the
1029 globe, *Biogeosciences*, *8*, 489-503, doi:10.5194/bg-8-489-2011.

1030 Sanders RJ, et al. (2016), Controls over Ocean Mesopelagic Interior Carbon Storage
1031 (COMICS): Fieldwork, Synthesis, and Modeling Efforts, *Front. Mar. Sci.*, *3*,
1032 136, doi: 10.3389/fmars.2016.00136.

1033 Sarmiento, J.L., and Gruber, N. (2006), *Ocean Biogeochemical Dynamics*, Princeton
1034 University Press, Princeton, N.J.

1035 Schlitzer, R. (2000), Applying the adjoint method for biogeochemical modeling:
1036 Export of particulate organic matter in the world ocean, *Geophys. Monogr.*,
1037 *114*, 107–124, doi:10.1029/GM114p0107.

1038 Schlitzer, R. (2002), Carbon export fluxes in the Southern Ocean: Results from
1039 inverse modeling and comparison with satellite-based estimates, *Deep Sea
1040 Res., Part II.*, *49*, 1623–1644, doi:10.1016/S0967-0645(02)00004-8.

1041 Siegel, D. A., et al. (2016), Prediction of the export and fate of global ocean net
1042 primary production: The EXPORTS science plan, *Front. Mar. Sci.*, *3*(22),
1043 doi:10.3389/fmars.2016.00022.

1044 Sigman, D. M., and E. A. Boyle (2000), Glacial/interglacial variations in atmospheric
1045 carbon dioxide, *Nature*, *407*(6806), 859-869, doi:10.1038/35038000.

1046 Smith K. L., Jr., A.D. Sherman, C. L. Huffard, P. R. McGill, R. Henthorn, S. Von
1047 Thun, H. A. Ruhl, M. Kahru, M. D. Ohman, (2014), Large salp bloom
1048 export from the upper ocean and benthic community response in the abyssal
1049 northeast Pacific: Day to week resolution, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, *59*,
1050 doi:10.4319/lo.2014.59.3.0745.

1051 Steinberg, D. K., B. A. V. Mooy, K. O. Buesseler, P. W. Boyd, T. Kobari, and D. M.
1052 Karl (2008), Bacterial vs. zooplankton control of sinking particle flux in the
1053 ocean's twilight zone, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, *53*(4), 1327,
1054 doi:10.4319/lo.2008.53.4.1327

1055 Steinberg, D. K., and M. R. Landry (2017), Zooplankton and the Ocean Carbon
1056 Cycle, *Ann. Rev. Mar. Sci.*, 9, 413-444,
1057 doi:10.1146/annurev-marine-010814-015924

1058 Stow, C. A., J. Jolliff, D. J. McGillicuddy, S. C. Doney, J. I. Allen, M. A. Friedrichs,
1059 K. A. Rose, and P. Wallhead (2009), Skill assessment for coupled
1060 biological/physical models of marine systems, *J. Mar. Syst.*, 76(1), 4-15,
1061 doi:10.1016/j.jmarsys.2008.03.011.

1062 Suess, E. (1980), Particulate organic carbon flux in the oceans—surface, *Nature*, 288,
1063 261, doi:10.1038/288260a0.

1064 Taylor, K. E. (2001), Summarizing multiple aspects of model performance in a single
1065 diagram, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 106(D7), 7183–7192, doi:10.1029/2000JD900719.

1066 Yu, J., et al. (2016), Sequestration of carbon in the deep Atlantic during the last
1067 glaciation, *Nat. Geosci.*, 9(4), 319-324, doi:10.1038/ngeo2657.

1068 Van Mooy, B. A. S., R. G. Keil, and A. H. Devol (2002), Impact of suboxia on
1069 sinking particulate organic carbon: Enhanced carbon flux and preferential
1070 degradation of amino acids via denitrification, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*,
1071 66, 457–465, doi:10.1016/S0016-7037(01)00787-6

1072 Villa-Alfageme, M., F. C. Soto, E. Ceballos, S. L. C. Giering, F. A. Le Moigne, S.
1073 Henson, J. L. Mas, and R. J. Sanders (2016), Geographical, seasonal, and
1074 depth variation in sinking particle speeds in the North Atlantic, *Geophys. Res.*
1075 *Lett.*, 43(16), 8609-8616, doi:10.1002/2016GL069233.

1076 VLIZ (2009), Longhurst biogeographical provinces. [Available at
1077 [http://www.marineregions.org/.](http://www.marineregions.org/)]

1078 Volk, T., and M. I. Hoffert (1985), Ocean carbon pumps: Analysis of rela- tive
1079 strengths and efficiencies in ocean-driven atmospheric CO2 changes,
1080 *Geophys. Monogr. Ser.*, 32, 99–110, doi:10.1029/GM032p0099.

1081 Walsh, I., J. Dymond, and R. Collier (1988), Rates of recycling of biogenic
1082 components of settling particles in the ocean derived from sediment trap
1083 experiments. *Deep Sea Res., Part A*, 35(1), 43-58,
1084 doi: 10.1016/0198-0149(88)90056-8

1085 Wilson, J. D., S. Barker, and A. Ridgwell (2012), Assessment of the spatial variability
1086 in particulate organic matter and mineral sinking fluxes in the ocean interior:
1087 Implications for the ballast hypothesis, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 26,
1088 GB4011, doi:10.1029/2012GB004398.

1089 Yool, A., E. E. Popova, and T. R. Anderson (2011), Medusa-1.0: A new intermediate
1090 complexity plankton ecosystem model for the global domain, *Geosci. Model*
1091 *Dev.*, 4, 381–417, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-381-2011.

1092 **Tables**

1093

1094 **Table 1.** Annual primary production.

Province [short name]	VGPM ^{†,‡} [g m ⁻²]	Simulation [†] [g m ⁻²]
NPSW	96 ± 53	137 ± 1
PSAW	148 ± 55	113 ± 113
SPSG	108 ± 29	71 ± 34
NADR*	251 ± 88	249 ± 100
NASW	113 ± 23	134 ± 2
NPPF	202 ± 61	230 ± 140
PNEC	128 ± 37	118 ± 58
PEQD*	155 ± 53	114 ± 58
ANTA	51 ± 31	39 ± 49
SANT*	100 ± 59	83 ± 88
PSAE*	148 ± 45	108 ± 99

1095 * indicates province is presented in the main text.

1096 † Uncertainty is one standard deviation.

1097 ‡ VGPM is satellite-observed net primary production.

1098

1099 **Table 2.** Definition of equation parameters.

Parameter	Units	Definition
$F(z)$	$\text{mgC m}^{-2} \text{d}^{-1}$	POC flux
$[\text{POC}(z)]$	mgC m^{-3}	Volume concentration of labile POC
$[\text{POC}_Y(z)]$	mgC m^{-3}	Volume concentration of POC associated with Y
$[\text{POC}_Y^{\text{hard}}(z)]$	mgC m^{-3}	Volume concentration of POC associated with Y in the hard subclass
$[\text{POC}_Y^{\text{soft}}(z)]$	mgC m^{-3}	Volume concentration of POC associated with Y in the soft subclass
$[X^{\text{prod}}(z)]$	mgC m^{-3}	Volume concentration of production of X
$P_X^{\text{prod}}(z)$	$\text{mgC m}^{-3} \text{d}^{-1}$	Production of X at depth z by phytoplankton
$Z_X^{\text{prod}}(z)$	$\text{mgC m}^{-3} \text{d}^{-1}$	Production of X at depth z by zooplankton
w_X	m d^{-1}	Sinking speed of X
w_{dust}	m d^{-1}	Sinking speed of dust
$k_X = \frac{w_X}{\lambda_X}$	d^{-1}	Remineralization rate of X
$k_Y^{\text{hard}} = \frac{w_Y}{\lambda_{\text{hard}}}$	d^{-1}	Remineralization rate of hard subclass for Y
λ_X	m	Remineralization length scale of X
λ_{hard}	m	Remineralization length scale of hard subclass
ω_Y	gC gY^{-1}	POC carrying capacity of Y
f_Y^{hard}	dimensionless	Fraction of Y routed to hard subclass
dust^{dep}	$\text{mgDust m}^{-2} \text{d}^{-1}$	Surface dust deposition
Δz_{surf}	m	Depth of surface grid cell
b	dimensionless	Flux attenuation parameter

1100 X = POC, PIC, or opal

1101 Y = PIC, opal, or dust

1102

1103 **Table 3:** Tendency equation for POC associated with PIC at depth z $\left(\frac{d[POC_{PIC}(z)]}{dt}\right)$.
 1104 The summation of the parameter column produces the full tendency equation.
 1105

Parameter	Definition
$\omega_{PIC} f_{PIC}^{hard} \left(\frac{d[PIC^{prod}(z)]}{dt}\right)$	Tendency of hard POC associated with PIC
$\omega_{PIC} (1 - f_{PIC}^{hard}) \left(\frac{d[PIC^{prod}(z)]}{dt}\right)$	Tendency of soft POC associated with PIC
$w_{PIC} \left(\frac{d[POC_{PIC}^{hard}(z)]}{dz}\right)$	Sinking of hard POC associated with PIC
$w_{PIC} \left(\frac{d[POC_{PIC}^{soft}(z)]}{dz}\right)$	Sinking of soft POC associated with PIC
$-k_{PIC}^{hard} [POC_{PIC}^{hard}(z)]$	Remineralization of hard POC associated with PIC
$-k_{PIC} [POC_{PIC}^{soft}(z)]$	Remineralization of soft POC associated with PIC

1106
 1107

1108 **Table 4:** Tendency equation for POC associated with opal at depth z $\left(\frac{d[POC_{opal}(z)]}{dt}\right)$.
 1109 The summation of the parameter column produces the full tendency equation.
 1110

Parameter	Definition
$\omega_{opal} f_{opal}^{hard} \left(\frac{d[opal^{prod}(z)]}{dt} \right)$	Tendency of hard POC associated with opal
$\omega_{opal} (1 - f_{opal}^{hard}) \left(\frac{d[opal^{prod}(z)]}{dt} \right)$	Tendency of soft POC associated with opal
$w_{opal} \left(\frac{d[POC_{opal}^{hard}(z)]}{dz} \right)$	Sinking of hard POC associated with opal
$w_{opal} \left(\frac{d[POC_{opal}^{soft}(z)]}{dz} \right)$	Sinking of soft POC associated with opal
$-k_{opal}^{hard} [POC_{opal}^{hard}(z)]$	Remineralization of hard POC associated with opal
$-f_T k_{opal} [POC_{opal}^{soft}(z)]$	Remineralization of soft POC associated with opal

1111 f_T is the temperature-dependency function [supplementary Table S3]

1112

1113 **Table 5:** Tendency equation for POC associated with dust at depth z $\left(\frac{d[POC_{dust}(z)]}{dt}\right)$.
 1114 The summation of the parameter column produces the full tendency equation.
 1115

Parameter	Definition
$\omega_{dust} f_{dust}^{hard} \left(\frac{dust^{dep}}{\Delta z_{surf}}\right)$	Tendency of hard POC associated with dust
$\omega_{dust} (1 - f_{dust}^{hard}) \left(\frac{dust^{dep}}{\Delta z_{surf}}\right)$	Tendency of soft POC associated with dust
$w_{dust} \left(\frac{d[POC_{dust}^{hard}(z)]}{dz}\right)$	Sinking of hard POC associated with dust
$w_{dust} \left(\frac{d[POC_{dust}^{soft}(z)]}{dz}\right)$	Sinking of soft POC associated with dust
$-k_{dust}^{hard} [POC_{dust}^{hard}(z)]$	Remineralization of hard POC associated with dust
$-k_{dust} [POC_{dust}^{soft}(z)]$	Remineralization of soft POC associated with dust

1116
 1117

1118 **Table 6:** Tendency equation for labile POC at depth z $\left(\frac{d[POC(z)]}{dt}\right)$ used in the ballast
 1119 model. The summation of the parameter column produces the full tendency equation.
 1120

Parameter	Definition
$\left(\frac{d[POC^{prod}(z)]}{dt}\right)$	Tendency of POC production by phytoplankton and zooplankton
$-\omega_{PIC} \left(\frac{d[PIC^{prod}(z)]}{dt}\right)$	Tendency of POC associated with PIC production
$-\omega_{opal} \left(\frac{d[opal^{prod}(z)]}{dt}\right)$	Tendency of POC associated with opal production
$-\omega_{dust} \left(\frac{dust^{dep}}{\Delta z_{surf}}\right)$	Tendency of POC associated with dust deposition
$w_{poc} \left(\frac{d[POC(z)]}{dz}\right)$	Sinking of labile POC
$-f_T k_{poc}[POC(z)]$	Remineralization of labile POC

1121 f_T is the temperature-dependency function [supplementary Table S3]
 1122

1123

1124 **Figure 1.** Simulated provinces presented in the paper are shown in dark gray. Light
1125 gray provinces are presented in supplementary. Red dots are locations of flux
1126 observations from sediment traps and thorium-234 depletion.

1127

1128 **Figure 2.** Target diagrams displaying average model skill at each region (SANT,
1129 PEQD, PSAE, NADR) for the *Martin et al.* [1987] global b value (Martin), *Henson et*
1130 *al.* [2012] regional b values (Henson), and *Guidi et al.* [2015] regional b values
1131 (Guidi) in the twilight zone (red) and midnight zone (blue). The black circle is the
1132 normalized standard deviation of the observed POC flux. Symbols within the circle
1133 indicate that the parameterization captures the observed POC flux more accurately
1134 than using the mean of the observed data (modeling efficiency > 0) at each region.

1135

1136 **Figure 3.** Simulated POC flux (black) with standard deviation (gray) compared with
1137 observed POC flux (blue) for the Martin curve (column 1), exponential model
1138 (column 2), and ballast model (column 3) at four provinces (SANT, PEQD, PSAE,
1139 NADR). Depth is relative to the surface. Twilight zone extends from 100m – 1000m
1140 and midnight zone is >1000 m.

1141

1142 **Figure 4.** Cross plot of simulated POC flux versus observed POC flux for the Martin
1143 curve, exponential model, and ballast model at four provinces (SANT, PEQD, PSAE,
1144 NADR). Colors represent depth below surface: the upper twilight zone (100-500m),
1145 lower twilight zone (500-1000m), upper midnight zone (1000-2500m), and lower
1146 midnight zone (2500-4000m). The reliability index (RI) for each zone is indicated at
1147 top left in each panel.

1148

1149 **Figure 5.** Box and whisker plots of summary statistics in the twilight zone (red) and
1150 midnight zone (blue) for each parameterization (Exponential, Ballast, *Martin et al.*
1151 [1987] global b value, *Henson et al.* [2012] regional b values, and *Guidi et al.* [2015]
1152 regional b values). These box and whisker plots account for all simulated provinces
1153 (11 total).

1154

1155 **Figure 6.** Target diagrams displaying average model skill at each region (SANT,
1156 PEQD, PSAE, NADR) for the exponential model, Martin curve, and ballast model in
1157 the twilight zone (red) and midnight zone (blue). The black circle is the normalized
1158 standard deviation of the observed POC flux. Symbols within the circle indicate that
1159 the parameterization captures the observed POC flux more accurately than using the
1160 mean of the observed data (Modeling Efficiency (ME) > 0) at each region.

1161

1162 **Figure 7.** Simulated POC flux (black) with standard deviation (gray) compared with
1163 observed POC flux (blue) using the global b value of *Martin et al.* [1987] (column 1),
1164 regional b value of *Henson et al.* [2012] (column 2), and regional b values of *Guidi et*
1165 *al.* [2015] (column 3) at four provinces (SANT, PEQD, PSAE, NADR). Depth is
1166 relative to the surface. Twilight zone extends from 100m – 1000m and midnight zone
1167 is >1000 m.

1168

1169 **Figure 8.** Cross plot of simulated POC flux versus observed POC flux using the
1170 global b value of *Martin et al.* [1987], *Henson et al.* [2012] regional b values, and
1171 *Guidi et al.* [2015] regional b values at four provinces (SANT, PEQD, PSAE,
1172 NADR). Colors represent depth below surface: the upper twilight zone (100-500m),

1173 lower twilight zone (500-1000m), upper midnight zone (1000-2500m), and lower
1174 midnight zone (2500-4000m). The reliability index (RI) for each zone is indicated at
1175 top left in each panel.

1176

1177 **Figure 9.** A: Range of b values for each province. Light gray bar uses data in the
1178 twilight and midnight zone while dark bars only use data in the midnight zone. B:
1179 percentage of observations in the midnight zone for each province. C: Histogram of
1180 normalized occurrence of b values fit to observations in the twilight and midnight
1181 zone D: Histogram of normalized occurrence of b values fit to observations in the
1182 twilight and midnight zone. Red line is at *Martin et al.* [1987] global b value of 0.858.
1183 Dotted lines are the 25th percentile and 75th percentile. Solid black line is the median.
1184 $\Delta p\text{CO}_2$ is relative to $p\text{CO}_2$ with $b=0.858$ [*Kwon et al.*, 2009].