



Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences

Volume 20 | Issue 1

Article 15

2017

Volume 20, Full Contents

JASS Staff

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.butler.edu/jiass>

Recommended Citation

Staff, JIASS (2017) "Volume 20, Full Contents," *Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences*: Vol. 20 : Iss. 1 , Article 15.

Retrieved from: <https://digitalcommons.butler.edu/jiass/vol20/iss1/15>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Digital Commons @ Butler University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences by an authorized editor of Digital Commons @ Butler University. For more information, please contact digitalscholarship@butler.edu.

ISSN 1522-7030 (print)
ISSN 1937-7770 (online)

J-I-A-S-S JOURNAL OF THE I-N-D-I-A-N-A A-C-A-D-E-M-Y OF THE S-O-C-I-A-L S-C-I-E-N-C-E-S

Anthropology • Business • Criminology • Economics • History • Political Science • Psychology



Sociology • Environmental Studies • Gender Studies • International Studies • Urban Studies

Volume 20 (2017)

www.iass1.org

SENIOR EDITOR IN CHIEF
Kenneth Colburn, Jr.
Butler University

SENIOR DEPUTY EDITOR
Surekha Rao
Indiana University Northwest

ISSN 1522-7030 (print)
ISSN 1937-7770 (online)

JIASS JOURNAL OF THE INDIANA ACADEMY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

Volume 20 (2017)
www.iass1.org

SENIOR EDITOR IN CHIEF
Kenneth Colburn, Jr.
Butler University
editor@iass1.org

SENIOR DEPUTY EDITOR
Surekha Rao
Indiana University Northwest

COPY EDITOR
Stephanie R. S. Stringham

EDITORIAL OFFICE/ADDRESS:
SOCIOLOGY & CRIMINOLOGY DEPARTMENT
BUTLER UNIVERSITY
JORDAN HALL 272-B
4600 SUNSET AVENUE
INDIANAPOLIS, IN 46208
(317) 940-9767

Objectives of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences

The objectives of the Academy shall be to facilitate a more effective cooperation among social scientists, to promote the interests of the several social sciences, and to increase the usefulness and advance the effectiveness of both teaching and research in the several social sciences in Indiana.

© 2017 The Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences <www.iass1.org>



INDIANA ACADEMY *of* *the* SOCIAL SCIENCES

FOUNDED 1929 - INCORPORATED 1937

Established in 1929 and incorporated in 1937, the Academy exists to foster communication and collaboration among social scientists across the public and private colleges and universities of Indiana. The Academy is dedicated to the objectives of supporting social science research and dialogue and to promoting the value and visibility of the social sciences in Indiana while providing an environment in which social scientists across the state can interact in cooperation and friendship. The Academy holds an annual meeting and produces *Endnotes* (IASS Newsletter) and publishes the *Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences*.

The Academy currently recognizes the following social science disciplines: anthropology, business, criminology, economics, history, geography, psychology, political science, and sociology. Environmental studies, gender studies, urban studies, and international studies utilizing social science perspectives and methods are also represented by the Academy. Others may be added by approval of the Board.

BOARD OF DIRECTORS, 2016–2017

Executive Officers

- **Jaishankar Raman**
President
Valparaiso University
- **Young Kim**
Vice President/President-Elect
University of Evansville
- **Diane Wille**
Administrative Secretary
Indiana University Southeast
- **Nirupama Devaraj**
Executive Secretary
Valparaiso University
- **Jim Thomas**
Treasurer
Indiana University Northwest
- **Ken Colburn**
Senior Editor in Chief of the Journal
Butler University
- **Jonathan Swarts**
Past President
Purdue North Central

- ❖ **Bharath Ganesh-Babu**
Webmaster
Valparaiso University

At-Large Members

- **Bruce Bigelow**
Butler University
- **Katharine Bohley**
University of Indianapolis
- **Christie Byun**
Wabash College
- **Ethan Hollander**
Wabash College
- **Surekha Rao**
Indiana University Northwest
- **Dulce Maria Scott**
Anderson University
- **Cliff Staten**
Indiana University Southeast
- **Kathleen Tobin**
Purdue University Calumet

MISSION AND EDITORIAL POLICY

The purpose of the *Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences* is to promote and advance the social sciences in Indiana by publishing the highest-quality social science theory and research papers available. The *Journal* recognizes and supports the many diverse perspectives and methods across the several social sciences; it neither espouses nor champions any specific ideological, theoretical, methodological, or political commitments. The *Journal* is committed to intellectual integrity, rigorous standards of scholarship, and rational and civil discourse. It encourages the presentation and free exchange of diverse viewpoints and seeks to foster open and critical inquiry that privileges no particular standpoint, while operating within the limits of a standard of discourse and reason that distinguishes between the pursuit of knowledge and truth versus mere assertions of dogma.

Although every effort will be made to publish issues that represent a fair balance of scholarship across the entire spectrum of social science disciplines, the *Journal's* first priority will always be to publish the best social science research available at any given time, regardless of disciplinary representation. Toward this end, papers will be accepted for editorial review and publication in the annual issue of the journal at any time of year, whether or not they were presented at the Annual Conference. Persons who submit articles for review are expected to adhere to Author Submission Guidelines detailed elsewhere in this journal and online at www.iass1.org.

The *Journal* has been published annually in the fall both in print and online since Volume 14 (2010–2011). Articles submitted for possible publication are subject to a double-blind review process. The Senior Editor in Chief alone is responsible for making the final decision on all manuscripts and content for publication in the *Journal*, and the Senior Editor's decision on publication content is not subject to review by any other member, officer, or body of the IASS.

SENIOR EDITOR'S NOTE

I am pleased to present Volume 20 (2017) of the *Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences*. Our latest issue leads off with a thought-provoking essay about disaster management and the roles of nongovernmental organizations and local government with a case study of several catastrophes that struck Japan in March 2011. Although this article focuses on Japan, it is not hard to see how it might be applied to the very recent situation of Hurricanes Harvey and Irma hitting Texas and Florida this past September, demonstrating the relevance of a social science perspective for understanding our contemporary world.

In addition, Volume 20 (2017) of JIASS offers eight impressive research articles exploring a wide variety of topics from several different social science perspectives. Professors Dulaney and Gunn analyze the strategic use of apologies by businesses in response to several food-poisoning incidents. Professor Gao examines the emergence and development of a public sphere during China's May Fourth Era (1915–1926). Professor Hare reports on her interesting study of the gender ratio of characters in more than 100 popular animated films from 1980 through 2016, asking whether any significant change has occurred during this long period. Professor Kordsmeier offers an in-depth analysis based on participant observation and interviews with theater workers about how stage managers establish leadership authority informally through emotion work. Professors Schnarre and Adam address parasocial relationships (perceived friendships with media figures that are not reciprocated), comparing men's and women's views of such relationships. Professors Statham and Greider offer a compelling analysis of the importance of unions in contemporary times, focusing on UAW Local 72, which represents factory workers in Kenosha, Wisconsin, based on qualitative data collected over a 20-year period. Professors VanAlstine, Cox, and Roden, with Doctor Boothby, continue in their study of the social impacts of diversity (ethnicity, religion, and language), with a focus on Indiana. Finally, Doctors Vergo and Poulakis, along with several graduate students, explore African American undergraduate students' perceptions of factors that influence their decisions to attend doctoral programs in psychology. All of these papers represent a wide-ranging and provocative set of studies sure to be of interest to all social scientists!

The current volume represents the second issue published since I was reelected as senior editor in chief, and the seventh volume I have edited and published since I assumed the editor's role in 2010. Much has been accomplished over the past seven years, including moving the journal to an online as well as a print publication. Since my first year as editor, beginning with Volume 14 (2010–2011), papers submitted to JIASS are no longer limited to those presented at the annual meeting and conference. While authors of papers presented at our annual conference continue to be encouraged to submit their work for possible publication, we also encourage social scientists from anywhere in the world to submit papers for review. To ensure quality and fairness, papers submitted for possible publication undergo, after a preliminary review by the editorial staff, a double-blind peer-review process involving two referees. The high quality of submitted papers

has increased in recent years, with the pleasing result of an abundance of extremely fine selections for the journal and its readers.

The journal no longer identifies papers as it once did by disciplinary subject heading. This is because we no longer attempt to publish in every volume at least one paper from each or most of the disciplines represented by the IASS. Since 2010, we have published papers strictly on the basis of merit, with the result that in some issues, some disciplines have more than one paper represented and other disciplines, none. We encourage submission of exceptional research by students and over the years have published more than a few outstanding examples of student scholarship.

JIASS is published simultaneously online, as previously noted, and in an attractive print edition. As of this past summer, the online edition of our journal has been moved to and is available at digitalcommons.butler.edu/JIASS and includes back issues. The hosting of our journal at the Digital Commons website makes our journal available to a very large national and international audience and provides tracking of downloads (currently 1,595).

Print copies are no longer mailed to members; instead, copies are available for members to pick up at the annual meeting (print copies may be ordered for additional cost plus a shipping-and-handling charge). Volume 20 will, as usual, be indexed and available through EBSCO. JIASS is also listed in Cabell's directory (of special interest for scholars in business, economics, and finance). All of these developments represent important milestones for both the journal and the Academy and will ensure their successful transition to the 21st century of scholarly communication.

I have been fortunate during my time as senior editor to have been able to work with a talented and dedicated staff of coeditors, referee-reviewers, and, of course, authors. I would like to publicly acknowledge and thank my editorial staff in particular for their assistance, insight, and guidance throughout the previous year. The editorial staff underwent some change this year, as I welcomed a new senior deputy editor, Surekha Rao (Indiana University Northwest), who has served for several years as deputy editor. Surekha has been an outstanding editor over the years, and I am very happy to have her ongoing support as a senior editor, where she may continue to contribute her good judgment and hard work, helping to make every issue of JIASS a success.

I have also been very fortunate to have the editorial assistance of Stephanie Seifert Stringham, who has been our copy editor since 2010 (Volume 14). Stephanie continues to be a major editorial presence and power behind the scene, ensuring that every graph, table, bibliographic reference, and line of text meets all professional and technical standards prior to publication. Stephanie's perseverance, intelligence, dedication, and competence all seem just as amazing to me today as they did seven years ago. *Thank you, Stephanie!*

I also want to publicly recognize and thank the many *referees* who serve without fanfare, reading and evaluating papers submitted for publication. Quite simply, JIASS would not be possible without their professional dedication and commitment. Our reviewers deserve everyone's thanks; their names are published at the end of the journal.

Last but not least, I would like to acknowledge and thank Jay Howard, Dean of the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences, Butler University, for his support of IASS and

of my work as editor since I took the role in 2010. Dean Howard has provided some modest funds to support the hiring of a student to assist my editorial work, and I am grateful for his support.

Kenneth D. Colburn, Jr., PhD
Senior Editor in Chief, *Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences*
Butler University
September 2017

CONTENTS

Essay

- Strategies of Political Institutions and Civil Society Actors
in the Post-3/11 Era: The Case of Japan 1
M. Todd Bradley

Research Articles

- Situational Crisis Communication Theory and the Use of Apologies
in Five High-Profile Food-Poisoning Incidents 13
Emmett Dulaney and Rebecca Gunn
- Building *Fukan* as a Chinese Public Sphere: Zhang Dongsun
and *Learning Light* 34
Nuan Gao
- Still No Jetpacks or Gender Parity: Animated Film from 1980 through 2016 50
Sara C. Hare
- The Importance of Seeming Earnest: Emotion Work and Leadership
in Theater Worlds 64
Gregory T. Kordsmeier
- Parasocial Romances as Infidelity: Comparing Perceptions of Real-Life,
Online, and Parasocial Extradysadic Relationships 82
Payton Schnarre and Aimee Adam
- The Importance of Unions in Contemporary Times 94
Anne Statham and Paul Greider
- Diversity in the Heartland of America: The Impact on Human Development
in Indiana 110
Jason VanAlstine, Steven R. Cox, Dianne M. Roden, and Lisa Boothby
- African American Students' Perceptions of Influential Factors for Attendance
in Doctoral Psychology 127
*Jeffery M. Vergo, Mixalis Poulakis, Tj Leshner, Samreen Khondker,
Pansorn Benyasut, and Sebastian Del Corral Winder*

- Authors' Biographical Notes* 146
Reviewers and Referees (2011–2017) 149
JlASS Submission Guidelines 152

Essay

Strategies of Political Institutions and Civil Society Actors in the Post-3/11 Era: The Case of Japan^{*}

M. TODD BRADLEY
Indiana University Kokomo

ABSTRACT

Japan is at a crossroads of public administration and disaster management, especially in the aftermath of the catastrophic events of March 11, 2011: a major earthquake near Tōhoku, and the subsequent tsunami and nuclear reactor meltdown at the Fukushima Daiichi nuclear facility. There have been advocates for more top-down governance to handle such crises (and the ongoing residuals of such crises), while others have touted more decentralization—that is, more governance at the local level. Nevertheless, Japan still faced myriad public policy challenges three years after the catastrophic events. This article investigates the role of nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) in Japan’s local governance in the aftermath of March 11, 2011, addressing broadly the theme of disaster management and, more specifically, the impact (or lack thereof) of NGOs (nonprofits) on the local governance processes in Japan in the midst of the debates regarding top-down and bottom-up approaches to disaster management.

KEY WORDS NGOs; Nongovernmental Organizations; Nonprofits; Civil Society; Disaster Management

CONFORMITY AS A THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This article is grounded in societal conformity as a perspective to view the roles and constraints of political institutions (in particular the Japanese legislature, the Diet) and civil society actors, also known as nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) or nonprofit organizations (NPOs). Familial relationships are very important in Japan, meaning “outsiders” such as NGOs are not necessarily received with open arms—at least not initially. The catastrophic events of March 11, 2011—the Tōhoku earthquake, tsunami, and nuclear plant meltdown at the Fukushima Daiichi facility—were a seismic test for governmental and nongovernmental entities. The unspeakable

^{*} Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to M. Todd Bradley, Indiana University Kokomo.

aftermath and cleanup were, I would argue, somewhat minimized by the inability of well-intentioned NGOs playing a more active role. The constraints could be characterized as culturally bound. For example, in African American and Latino cultures, family ties and strong reliance on one's immediate and extended family for support are much more important than is outside help (Chia et al. 1994). Additionally, people in a disaster are more likely to view their needs as physical (rather than psychological or emotional), especially in non-Western cultures such as that of Japan (Satel 2005). Thus, the use of a Western framework as a standard for evaluating a non-Western society could be seen as problematic.

Culturally, Japan generally tends to conform partly because of its ideological/cultural/top-down governance roots grounded in a sense of conformity. I would argue that this is conformity not in the sense of irrational conformity (herd behavior) but in the sense of rational conformity (compliance/obedience): "Rational conformity is behavior guided by thinking, judgment, or reasoning. It occurs as a result of the influences exerted by the object's behavior or attitude and includes abidance, compliance, and obedience" (Song et al. 2012:1366). Such rational conformity is embedded in Japan's historical and political allegiance to the emperor and to political institutions. To be fair, leeringness of outside intervention is not unique to Japan and can also be viewed historically in many conservative communities in the United States, including in the areas of education, civil rights, and health care.

Moreover, rational conformity has implications for civil society vis-à-vis the state in natural or manmade emergency-management issues. Additionally, Japan's relatively nascent (compared to its Western counterparts) NGO culture is one of the consequences of conformity to the state; however, Ayumi Suzuki suggests that "it is not so much that Japan lacks a culture of giving as much as it lacks a culture of asking" (Kingston 2010). That is, NGOs need to be more aggressive in seeking grants and subsidies to raise money for their activities.

Generally, various factors in Japan contribute to conformity, not the least being the history of an emperor or a top-down political system. Furthermore, Japan's Disaster Countermeasures Basic Act of 1961 and the updated (1997) version are clearly top-down approaches to disaster-management emergencies, with the state and prefectures (regional governing bodies) taking the lead role rather than working in tandem with civil society actors. Designated public corporations, such as utilities, the Bank of Japan, and the Japanese Red Cross, however, cooperate with the state to minimize the damage of natural disasters, although, unlike civil society actors such as NGOs which tend to be more adaptable to particular societal needs, public corporations are more beholden to the state and thus may have particular legislative constraints. Nevertheless, Japan is considered to be at the forefront globally in the area of natural-disaster management.

The impetus for Japan's considerable expertise in natural-disaster management came in the aftermath of the Kobe earthquake in 1995. The technical (e.g., engineering, excavation) expertise has been more present, but thernontechncial expertise (e.g., community-led initiatives), or what Nakagawa and Fujibayashi call "soft issues" (2010:338) have not. Thus, community-led groups such as nonprofits and NGOs began to appear in the emergency-management sector. In particular, SEEDS Asia was established

in 2006 as a nonprofit resource for nontechnical issues, which include operational issues, the media's role, skills and capacities to execute strategies, and public policies to curtail the effects of natural disasters. Conformity for Japanese citizens may play a role in the principle of *cheng-ming* (a principle of Confucianism), which means knowing one's place in society and accepting the authority of the state (and not civil of society actors) in administering goods and services in the face of disaster. Additionally, a country's social capital (e.g., skill sets and organizational strength) can enhance or inhibit disaster-management efforts.

Moreover, a recent study by Veszteg, Funaki, and Tanaka (2015), similar to Putnam's (1993) work, has revealed that social capital in the form of norms, networks, and mutual trust actually increases after natural disasters such as Japan's Tōhoku earthquake and the subsequent tsunami. The data revealed in the researchers' "disaster survey" that respondents were more likely to "pay back a favor to someone who did a favor for him or her in a crisis situation than in a normal situation" (2015:131). Thus, perhaps trusting the government to come to one's aid is context-driven in the case of Japan and many Western societies, including conservative communities in the United States, in terms of natural-disaster relief. Such conservative communities in the United States may not want government or NGO "intrusion" in an area such as civil rights but may welcome such "intrusion" when natural disasters such as tornadoes and floods occur.

Nevertheless, the lingering effects of conformity and the 1925 Peace Preservation Act in Japan may play a role in the lack of institutional cooperation between the state and civil society actors. More specifically, the act prohibited Japanese citizens from conducting political discussions and forming societies (e.g., civil society groups). One can even consider stifling effects on civil society actors as far back as the Meiji era (1868–1912), in which "laws were promulgated to prevent the workers from forming organizations" such as labor unions, which "have long been suppressed by the state" (He 2010: 278). Thus, "civil society has been constrained by the deeply embedded, state-centric institutions" (He 2010: 274). A seam may nevertheless be opening, in terms of holding government more accountable in a public setting, not just in casual private conversations. For example, Dr. Kiyoshi Kurokawa, chairman of the National Diet of Japan Fukushima Nuclear Accident Independent Investigation Commission (NAIIC) from December 2011 to July 2012, when asked by a reporter on October 17, 2012, "Has Japanese society taken to heart the lessons of the disaster, beyond the humanitarian aspects that it has so clearly embraced?" replied:

"I'm not so sure". ... There's one grassroots development that may signal change. Starting last summer, groups of people have held quiet demonstrations across from the prime minister's office every Friday at 6 p.m. Often whole families are present with children; the atmosphere is almost like a picnic. Could it be a sign of change? One journalist thinks yes, because it shows "they are willing to protest to the authority." (Hyde 2012)

SHIMIN SHAKAI (CIVIL SOCIETY) IN JAPAN

Japan is a relative latecomer to NGO activism, in part because of cultural norms and political (statist or top-down politics model) and socio-economic reasons. Japan did not become an active NGO participant until the early 1990s. As a result of Japan's cultural, political, and socioeconomic mix, activists such as civil society actors were seen as unimportant and not in alignment with state economic industrialization goals. The state was forced to take a second look at these new players (NGO activists) in the aftermath of the Tōhoku earthquake and subsequent tsunami and nuclear reactor fallout, however. In addition, Japanese cultural norms of conformism began to be liberalized: norms and identity issues were being challenged by the international politics of Huntington's third wave of democratization of the 1980s and 1990s. "International 'social' mechanisms through which norm diffusion and policy change" (Reimann 2010:160) began to take shape. Moreover, Reimann makes a strong argument that the growth of Japan's NGO sector can be attributed to not only international factors but also domestic factors. The interface of the two realms has stimulated the growth of civil society activism in Japan. The devastating Tōhoku earthquake occurred a year after Reimann's book was published and forever changed, I believe, the face of civil society activism in Japan.

With the passage of the Law to Promote Specified Nonprofit Activities (NPO Law) on March 19, 1998, Japan's civil society actors were given more space. The law gave NGOs more legal standing, placing them on the same footing as political institutions and for-profit corporations. The stimulus for the new law was the January 1995 Hanshin–Awaji earthquake. The Coalition for Legislation to Support Citizens' Organizations played a significant role in helping to establish the NPO law.

The new law helped decentralize (bottom-up approach to public policy issues) the role of NGOs so they could work with prefectural governments (as opposed to having mandates or top-down approaches from Tokyo). The NGOs could tailor their expertise to given prefectures or regions in Japan. For example, NGOs could publicly investigate (and seek public feedback) for disaster management, in contrast to traditionally closed (private) investigations of politicians. Moreover, the NPO law was meant to help minimize ethnic or clan-prone politics, which have been prevalent historically in Japan. That is, the law could help citizens move beyond the notion of considering only one's own "backyard" and to see Japan as a singular unit, not in a nationalistic way but as a "community of citizens" who happened to be Japanese citizens, regardless of clan.

The Japan NGO Center for International Cooperation (JANIC) is a nonprofit, nonpartisan networking NGO founded in 1987 by a group of NGO leaders who saw the need to better coordinate activities in Japanese society when the country was faced with natural disasters. JANIC works to facilitate communication with groups overseas to ameliorate and manage the aftermath of natural disasters. Additionally, the Task Force for Disaster Response, established by the Diet a day after the catastrophic events of March 11, 2011, helped to ensure that NGOs can effectively apply their technical and nontechnical knowledge and experience from overseas aid activities to domestic relief activities. As of March 30, 2014, the task force had officially ended its three-year

mission, though some of the projects undertaken by the task force have been included in or become part of existing projects of JANIC and other NGOs.

Civil society in Japan has grown exponentially since the 1990s in spite of a culture of conformism. Civil society actors have grown in part because of a more positive perception based on public opinion about NGOs, and there has been more support from the Diet in terms of treating NGOs as juridical persons. Additionally, NGOs have begun to extend their networks internationally in the areas of economic development, environmental awareness, human rights, and conflict resolution. Nevertheless, NGOs in Japan continue to struggle with credibility, at least in terms of the federal government. For example, Japan's Finance Ministry gives approval to organizations that want to be classified as NGOs and has been reluctant to make NGO involvement in natural or man-made disasters the norm. Thus, "NPOs (Nonprofit Organizations, aka NGOs) are kept financially weak, limiting their capacity and effectiveness, suggesting that the government remains leery of organized citizen groups" (Kingston 2010:1).

Moreover, according to Kingston (2010), Akihiro Ogawa posited that:

[t]he Japanese NPO world is becoming bifurcated. On the one hand, you see NPOs that become service providers as subcontractors to the local government. Since they have money from the government, they are still surviving. But participants are totally lost and frustrated in terms of their visions and organizational missions. Apparently they are miserable. The government's commitment is not enough. I believe it is time that the government reconsiders its NPO policy. Otherwise, these kinds of NPOs will disappear since the volunteers will leave. ...

On the other hand, I also see something like the opposite extreme; some NPOs are trying to establish themselves as social enterprises (*shakaiteki kigyo*). People who are empowered enough see NPOs as a chance to achieve social entrepreneurship in local communities. I feel the dynamism recently. They do not get any money from the government; basically they are collecting money by themselves, mostly membership fees, money from foundations by writing funding proposals, and selling originally invented goods.

Obviously, Ogawa's sentiments were expressed pre-3/11. Thus, perhaps there is more of an impetus for more NGO-to-NGO partnerships in terms of collaborative fund-raising while NGOs' credibility is raised in the average Japanese citizen's mind.

Perhaps beyond cultural notions of conformism and *okami*, "those above" (i.e., the government) may or may not know what is best in post-disaster-management scenarios in Japan. For example, survey data illustrate a lack of awareness of or an unwillingness to get involved with NGOs:

More than 70 percent of people in Japan are unwilling to take part in the activities of nonprofit organizations, a Cabinet Office survey revealed. The proportion of such people stood at 71.6 percent up 22.7 percentage points from the survey in 2005. By contrast, people who are willing to participate in NPO activities accounted for 17.5 percent, down 26.4 points, the government agency said. The interview-based survey, the second of its kind, was conducted between June 20 and 30 (2013) on 3,000 adults across the country. Valid answers were received from 59.5 percent. With respondents allowed to give multiple answers, the largest group of 43.6 percent said they have no time to participate in NPO activities, followed by 29.9 percent who said they have no opportunities and 24.1 percent who are not interested in NPO activities. Asked whether they are ready to make donations to NPOs, 23.2 percent said they want to do so, against 62.4 percent who gave the opposite answer. Of those who do not want to donate to NPOs, 37.0 percent said it is difficult to see the effects and 35.8 percent said they [cannot] afford to make donations. Also in the survey, 19.7 percent said they are familiar with NPOs. By contrast, 69.3 percent said they only know the term and 10.0 percent said they don't know about NPOs." (Japan Times 2013)

Perhaps we need to reconsider how we think about NPOs and other civil society actors in Japan. For example, one Western observer indicated, "The difference is that, in Japanese community organizations, volunteers generally help people they know, not strangers," wrote Tish Robinson (2011), an American professor teaching at Hitotsubashi University in Tokyo, discussing ten NPOs helping in recovery efforts in the immediately impacted areas of the Tōhoku earthquake. Some of the NPOs were involved in rebuilding homes, providing fishing nets (fishing is one of the main occupations along the coast), and psychosocial counseling services. One notable example of conformism and thinking about the community as a whole, rather than as an individual or single family unit, is illustrated in one particular NPO's experience (which is not an exception to other NPOs working in the impacted areas). Robinson noted that the NPO Second Harvest Food Bank Japan

is the largest food bank in Japan, gathering surplus food from companies and providing it to people in need. Second Harvest has been operating in Japan for eleven years, and helping out with the disaster in Tohoku since March 13 (2011), from Iwaki-shi in the south all the way up to Yamada-machi in the north, reaching out to different

locations in the region. Recently, Second Harvest has forwarded 300 boxes (each one weighing 20 to 25 kilograms) to Minami-Sanriku and 100 boxes to Shinchi-Machi and Minami-soma. Charles McJilton, head of Second Harvest Japan, noted, “Whenever we go to an area, we look for two different things. Is there a need? Is there someone we can work with in that area? Without both of those key pieces in place we find that we have no traction.”

Second Harvest has adapted their response to this disaster from their normal approach to food distribution. In response to the Tohoku disaster, they have adjusted to the Japanese concept of “fukohei ni naranai you ni,” meaning everything equal to everybody. McJilton noted, “If Japanese organizations receive 300 boxes, they all have to be the same. That means that 70 to 80% of the food delivered has to be purchased. On a normal basis, all the food that Second Harvest receives is free. There is no reason for us to buy it, it is there. But because of the requirement on the ground in Tohoku, Second Harvest is spending anywhere between 4,500 to 7,500 yen per box per household up there, which can run anywhere from 1.5 to 2.25 million yen a week, just to get food up there to one location.”

The second adjustment Second Harvest has made in Tohoku is to “enryo,” people’s being reserved. McJilton notes, “If Second Harvest goes to a community in Tohoku and says, ‘I have 2,000 peaches,’ the local people will say, ‘Well, we’ll take five cases.’ I know that their situation in the next six to nine months is not going to change dramatically. So they could actually use all 2,000 peaches. They don’t want to waste. They don’t want to show they are using more than the next person and they don’t want to be concerned about neighboring communities. Are they taking more than other people? That has also been a major challenge for us as an organization. We have had 90 different shipments up there with our own trucks and other organizations providing food up there and we will continue to do that. Regarding ‘enryo,’ every time you talk to a community and say you are going to provide a service for them, they ask about the community next to them. Are we going to get to them too? Because I don’t want to be first. Don’t give me too much. Don’t take too much. It is very real.” (Robinson 2011:paras. 9–11)

DECENTRALIZATION IN THE UTILITY SECTOR: A POTENTIAL STEP TOWARD INCREASED CIVIL SOCIETY ACTIVISM

In a move that will open up competition in the utility sector of Japan (and that might open up prospects for NGO actors to have a say in feasibility and environmental impact studies), the Japanese Cabinet recently announced reform in the utility sector. This effort will at least be an attempt at decentralization from the top:

“The cabinet has approved a bill to reform Japan’s power industry in what will be the biggest industry shake-up in 60 years.

The Economy, Trade and Industry Minister Yoichi Miyazawa told a news conference on [March 3, 2015] that the bill will remove a monopoly by regional utilities by separating power generation from transmission in 2020.

The main part of the reforms will be the opening up of the 7.5 trillion yen residential and small business market from March 2016, the centerpiece of the plan to boost competition, lower power prices and cut energy imports. Households will be able to choose among power companies.

After the Fukushima disaster crippled Japan’s nuclear energy sector four years ago, the government then pledged the biggest shake up in the history of the fragmented electricity industry to boost competition and contain a surge in power prices.

Prime Minister Shinzo Abe’s plan is to set up a national grid company to allow new suppliers to sell electricity to the residential sector. The original government aim was to set up a company that could guarantee equal access to all participants. But plans to give the nationwide grid management body more control over the system of distribution and transmission lines were scaled back, amid lobbying from power utilities. ...(*Japan Today*, March 4, 2015)

Tokyo Gas Co Ltd., for example, Japan’s biggest city gas supplier, aims to grab a 10% share of the retail power market in the Tokyo metropolitan area by 2020, doubling its power generation capacity to 3,000 megawatts. The company already supplies power to larger customers after an earlier phase of liberalization.

The final stage of the reforms involves splitting up the generation and transmission units under holding companies but utilities won't be forced to shed operations under the current plans, creating further doubts about the scope of changes. (*Japan Today* 2015:paras. 1–5, 15–16)

There is a cautionary tale here, however: “Adding to the grid body’s difficulties, is the uncertainty over when and how many of Japan’s 48 nuclear power plants will be restarted after the post-Fukushima shutdown” (*Japan Today* 2015: para. 17).

Additionally, there may be other avenues to buttress civil society activism. For example, in an independent investigation committee report published in the aftermath of the Fukushima Daiichi nuclear plant accident (July 6, 2012), the committee suggested in their list of recommendations to the National Diet:

Recommendation 7:

Develop a system of independent investigation commissions

A system for appointing independent investigation committees, including experts largely from the private sector, must be developed to deal with unresolved issues, including the decommissioning process of reactors, spent fuel issues, limiting accident effects and decontamination. (National Diet of Japan 2012:23)

Moreover, ongoing reconstruction efforts in the Tōhoku region include

A system of collaboration and cooperation with a broad range of actors such as private business operators, NPOs and individual volunteers needs to be established. The sharing of understanding on the necessary to develop integrated measures against damages as a social system should be promoted among those such as the national government, economic circles, local governments, and academic circles. With securing the understanding of residents, capability to quickly respond to massive and extensive disasters should be strengthened. Furthermore, with a view to strengthening resilience of the country, we aim at developing network systems complementing the hierarchical response, in the light of initiatives taken in foreign countries to respond to crises. (Reconstruction Program Committee 2013:30)

It is important to note that NPOs and NGOs are mentioned as a collaborative partner in disaster recovery efforts, though the hierarchical (top-down) response is ever present. The interaction of domestic and outside (i.e., international) voices is evident. For example, other efforts include public-private partnerships:

In order to revitalize each initiative of the activity in the disaster-afflicted areas and expand its range in future, it is necessary to share the expertise of excellent examples of initiatives in the disaster-afflicted areas. It is also necessary to improve the environment for themselves to be able to voluntarily and spontaneously undertake smooth and active collaboration among residents, organizations of regional bond such as neighborhood councils and neighborhood associations, shopping mall associations, societies of commerce and industry, NPOs, universities, private business operators, business groups and the administration, through exchange of information such as expertise, human resources and experiences, exchange of opinions and exchange of human resources. (Reconstruction Program Committee 2013:44)

Nonetheless, cultural norms are difficult to change; paradigm shifts are never easy.

CONCLUSION

The historical, top-down, vertical state-centric decision making may be somewhat waning (at least in the utility sector) in Japan, which may indirectly create opportunities for civil society actors. We must be careful as researchers to not impose a Western framework as a standard for evaluating non-Western societies, however. Countries have diverse histories, cultures, norms, and traditions. Even so, Japan's civil society sector still faces myriad challenges, including rational conformity (abidance, compliance, and obedience), directed by top-down government authority and familial ties. In addition, NGOs in Japan (like many NGOs around the world) face economic challenges (i.e., *adequate* funding and credibility from local residents).

The March 11, 2011, earthquake, tsunami, and nuclear reactor meltdown catastrophes are still presenting political, economic, and social issues, including the rehousing of residents in the shadow of the Fukushima nuclear plant. Additionally, social norms, conformism, and familial links must be considered when developing long-term relationships with impacted communities in disaster-management plans in Japan. Thus, civil society actors will have multiple opportunities to have their voices heard, but perhaps in the Japanese cultural context, the expressions may have to be in the form of public-private-civil society partnerships. As civil society actors in Japan continue to move forward, creating space, we should keep in mind the thoughts of Louisa Rubenfien, a scholar of Japan society. According to Tish Robinson, Rubenfien

shared an intriguing idea for providing psycho-social support to disaster victims in Tohoku. She suggested pairing Tokyo housewives with other Tohoku housewives through short visits several times a year. In keeping with the Japanese preference for human relationships, the relationships should be long-term, not just one-off meetings. This raises the question of how to make these relationships long-term and ongoing. Rubenfien suggested that an exchange of some kind is necessary to allow the relationships to blossom and endure over time. Her idea was to have Tohoku wives open their home to 2–3 Tokyo wives once a quarter, where they could exchange local recipes of knowledge of some sort. Surely, it is relationships that will help provide the psycho-social care so desperately needed in times of great loss.

NPOs provide the bridge for people to volunteer, playing a critical role in coordinating projects with local governments and overseeing safety. The NPOs that are the most successful in these types of situations are the ones where relationships are often long-term. As we move into rebuilding and rehabilitation, long-term relationships between organizations such as companies, chambers of commerce, and schools, as well as between individuals, may be the key. (Robinson 2011: paras. 38–39)

Civil society actors will have to be more intentional, in spite of cultural norms, in their efforts. Additionally, increased trust from citizens regarding NGOs (even though NGOs may still be viewed as “outsiders” or strangers) must be nurtured in a non-paternalistic manner by the state. Patterns of non-patronizing attitudes include positive public service announcements via television, radio, and print and social media, as well as ongoing partnerships.

REFERENCES

- Chia, R. C., K. L. Wuensch, J. Childers, C. Chuang, B. Cheng, J. Cesar-Romero, and S. Nava. 1994. “A Comparison of Family Values among Chinese, Mexican, and American College Students.” *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality* 9:249–58.
- He, Lichao. 2010. “Social Movement Tradition and the Role of Civil Society in Japan and South Korea.” *East Asia* 27:267–87.
- Hyde, Katherine. 2012. “NAIIC Report on Fukushima: Lessons Learned & Next Steps Forward.” JapanSociety.org. Retrieved (<http://www.japansociety.org/multimedia/articles/naic-report-on-fukushima-lessons-learned-next-steps-forward>).

- Japan Times*. 2013. "70% in Poll Cool to NPO Activities." *Japan Times*, August 27. Retrieved (www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2013/08/27/national/70-in-poll-cool-to-npo-activities/).
- Japan Today*. 2015. "Cabinet Approves Bill to Reform Power Sector." *Japan Today*, March 4. Retrieved (<https://japantoday.com/category/politics/cabinet-approves-bill-to-reform-power-sector>).
- Kingston, Jeff. 2010. "The Untapped Potential of Japanese Civil Society." Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs. Retrieved (https://www.carnegiecouncil.org/publications/archive/policy_innovations/commentary/000203).
- Nakagawa, Yuko, and Nina Fujibayashi. 2010. "Sharing Japanese Non-technical Knowledge for Disaster Risk Reduction in Asia: Challenges for Non-profit Organizations." *Asian Journal of Environment and Disaster Management* 2(3):337–50.
- National Diet of Japan. 2012. The Fukushima Nuclear Accident Independent Investigation Commission. *The Official Report of the Fukushima Nuclear Accident Independent Investigation Commission*. Retrieved (https://www.nirs.org/wp-content/uploads/fukushima/naiic_report.pdf).
- Putnam, Robert. 1993. "The Prosperous Community: Social Capital and Public Life." *The American Prospect* 13:35–42.
- Reconstruction Program Committee (Japan). 2013. *Towards the Creation of "New Tohoku" (The Interim Compilation of Discussions)*. Retrieved (http://www.reconstruction.go.jp/english/topics/2013/08/20130823_Towards_the_Creation_of_New_Tohoku.pdf).
- Reimann, Kim D. 2010. *The Rise of Japanese NGOs: Activism from Above*. London: Routledge.
- Robinson, Tish. 2011. "NPOs on the Ground in Tohoku—6 Months after March 11." *Japan Today*, September 10. Retrieved (<https://japantoday.com/category/features/lifestyle/npos-on-the-ground-in-tohoku-6-months-after-march-11>).
- Satel, S. 2005. "Bread and Shelter, Yes, Psychiatrists." *New York Times*, March 29, p. 5.
- Song, Guandong, Qin Hai Ma, Fangfei Wu, and Lin Li. 2012. "The Psychological Explanation of Conformity." *Social Behavior and Personality* 40(8):1365–72.
- Veszteg, Robert Ferenc, Yukihiko Funaki, and Aiji Tanaka. 2015. "The Impact of the Tohoku Earthquake and Tsunami on Social Capital in Japan: Trust before and after the Disaster." *International Political Science Review* 36(2):119–38.

Research Articles

***Situational Crisis Communication Theory and the Use of Apologies
in Five High-Profile Food-Poisoning Incidents****

EMMETT DULANEY
Anderson University

REBECCA GUNN
Oral Roberts University

ABSTRACT

This article examines the role that apologies play in situational crisis communication theory (SCCT) and focuses on a number of recent food-poisoning incidents. The article first establishes the importance of trust to firms with a marketing orientation, and the harm that comes when that trust is lost. This is followed by an overview of apologies versus pseudo-apologies and how both factor into the principles of SCCT. Finally, examples of five high-profile apologies related to food-poisoning incidents are provided and the way that the principles of SCCT were applied in each instance, along with the outcome, is explored.

KEY WORDS Situational Crisis Communication Theory (SCCT); Apology; Pseudo-apology; Public Relations; Crisis Management

THE TRANSITION OF FIRMS TO A MARKET ORIENTATION

Many organizations today employ the philosophy of relationship marketing, which is a move away from transaction-based marketing and toward recognition of the lifetime value of the customer. The philosophy that a firm chooses to embrace is based on the firm's organizational and personal values (including such factors as the firm's culture, goals, motive, mission, personal philosophy, and belief about the customer), and, to be genuine, it represents more than just a mantra (Day 1999). The marketing philosophy that the organization chooses drives its marketing strategy, which in turn drives the marketing

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Emmett Dulaney, Professor, Marketing, Anderson University, 1303 E. 5th Street, Anderson, IN 46012; eadulaney@anderson.edu; (765) 641-4126.

tactics the company employs. According to Peter Drucker, “True marketing starts out ... with the customer, his demographics, his realities, his needs, his values” (2001:21), and the philosophy of the firm then determines what tactics it uses to address these.

Arthur Felton defined the marketing concept as being “a corporate state of mind that insists on the integration and coordination of all the marketing functions which, in turn, are melded with all other corporate functions, for the basic purpose of producing maximum long-range corporate profits” (Kohli and Jaworski 1990:2). Thus, to be successful, an organization must be backed by a solid foundation—a commitment throughout the firm to creating, delivering, and communicating customer value to chosen target markets (Kotler 2003). The commitment should be evidenced by an outside-in perspective that is apparent throughout the firm’s mission and vision statements, as well as the company’s culture (referred to by some authors as *esprit de corps*) and overall beliefs about the customer.

Accepting the philosophy of the marketing concept, the firm uses this philosophy as its driver in crafting and executing marketing strategies and tactics. Rather than focusing on quick one-time revenue-producing transactions, the firm looks more to capturing customer loyalty and customer (not necessarily market) share. Day maintains that it is necessary for the firm to be closer to the market than its rivals are and defines the market-driven firm as requiring “a superior ability to understand, attract and keep valuable customers” (1999:5). If a firm is market-driven, at least three elements are required: an externally oriented culture, distinctive capabilities in understanding the market, and a configuration within the firm that allows it to anticipate and respond to market conditions (Day 1999). The focus on customers and competition is fundamental: “Customer-related and competitor-related responsiveness both affect market performance” (Homburg, Grozdanovic, and Klarmann 2007:21).

One of the primary goals of market orientation is to ensure that the entire organization understands the importance of customer satisfaction and strives to optimize it. There is significant empirical evidence that employee work satisfaction has a positive impact on customer satisfaction, and there is a positive relationship between customer satisfaction and financial performance (Homburg and Furst 2005). As such, Fornell et al. (2006:11) point out that “investments based on customer satisfaction produce sizable excess returns.” Kotler, Rackham, and Krishnaswamy (2006:74) indicate that “the first step inevitably involves improving communication”: The wording is not increasing communication but is improving communication and making certain the message is on target and meaningful to the audience. As the organization embraces the philosophy of market orientation, the needs of employees and customers should be treated with equal importance (Papasolomou-Doukakis 2002).

Market-oriented firms differ from non-market-oriented firms in every aspect of their organization. Philosophy drives strategy, and strategy drives tactics; thus, market-oriented firms not only have different values but also, through their dissimilar philosophy, utilize distinct strategies and tactics. Rather than focusing on the transaction (which can be successful in the short term but can harm the firm in the long term), a market-oriented firm focuses on the customer and the value that the customer holds for the firm throughout the term of their relationship. The market-oriented firm wants to keep

the customer and to benefit from the customer's repeat business. To be truly market oriented, a firm must focus on the target market, customer needs, integrated marketing, and profitability. Crucial to the successful realization and implementation of this philosophy is an ability to acquire and disseminate information, and to use that information in decisions ranging from product development to promotion, pricing, and distribution. The visible manifestation of a market orientation should be witnessed by higher employee satisfaction, price premiums, higher profitability, and an increased likelihood of long-term success (Best 2000; Jaworski and Kohli 1993; Slater and Narver 1994).

THE VALUE OF TRUST

Trust can be described as a key element in establishing relationships with consumers (Kang and Hustvedt 2014). Trust in a company is considered to be taking a company at its word—that whatever a company says it will do, it will do—and that the company will do all it can to maintain its promises (Chaudhuri and Holbrook 2001). With an emphasis in market orientation on the lifetime value of the customer, it is important that the customer trust the organization. It is when trusting that they will be treated equitably and fairly—and with the same level of satisfaction—that customers opt to return repeatedly and to increase their value to the organization.

If a customer chooses not to return to the organization when in need of a good or service—if the customer opts to sever the relationship that previously existed—the firm loses the lifetime value of that customer through churn. Turnover is costly, and studies in trust indicate that the cost of acquiring a new customer is as much as 500 percent higher than the cost of keeping an existing customer (Covey 2006). Studies indicate that high-trust organizations, on average, outperform low-trust organizations in total return to shareholders by 286 percent (Covey 2006). For example, in the case the E.coli breakout experienced by Chipotle, the loss of two or three loyal customers has been estimated to be the equivalent of the loss of ten other customers (Jargon 2016).

WHEN MISTAKES HAPPEN

When mistakes are made, trust is eroded. Customers who may have never thought twice about eating at a particular restaurant may choose to go elsewhere. The mistakes can be intentional (an out-of-control employee, for example), unintentional (preparing the wrong meal), and even well outside of the control of the organization (a supplier delivered tainted product), but the customer will associate those mistakes with the organization and will either reevaluate future transactions or will want assurances that the mistake will not happen again. Customers will question their agreement of common values and mutual worth (Battistella 2014).

Although trust can take years to be built, that same trust can be lost in a moment (Covey 2006), and how the organization responds to a crisis can make all the difference in whether that trust is diminished. According to Covey, sometimes when you violate trust with a customer, you lose that customer forever, but other times, the incident, when handled correctly, actually builds trust.

OVERVIEW OF SITUATIONAL CRISIS COMMUNICATION THEORY

Situational crisis communication theory (SCCT) attempts to map out “how crisis response strategies can be used to protect reputational assets” (Coombs 2008:263) and builds on what was once referred to as image restoration but is now known as image repair (Benoit and Pang 2008:255). SCCT incorporates attribution theory and is divided into crisis, response strategies, and recommendations. The crisis can be divided into types based on level of responsibility, factoring in crisis history, relationship history, and severity. Ten possible response strategies, grouped into three postures (deny, diminish, and deal), are available to the manager. The crisis-response recommendations offer guidelines based on the situation and on the chosen response strategy. Although every crisis is unique and must be responded to accordingly, the prescriptive guidelines offered by SCCT can help crisis managers protect reputational assets and can assist managers in preparing for and responding to a crisis (Coombs 2008:263).

THERE is a fair amount of overlap between SCCT and the theory of crisis communication and image repair discourse used for “image repair” (Benoit and Pang 2008:255), and both subscribe to the belief that the name and reputation of an organization are valuable assets that should be protected. One way to protect those assets is to bestow the organization with emotion, allowing it to express compassion for victims (Augustine 1995) without accepting responsibility (Cohen 1999). For example, Chipotle’s announcement of its \$50 million marketing campaign, continued expansion, and aggressive investments in staff and management do little to reflect compassion for the victims of the E.coli outbreak and could be interpreted by some as the exact opposite of concern.

APOLOGIES AND PSEUDO-APOLOGIES

Genuine Apologies

Apologies offer the opportunity to express emotion, and the wording is important, as “injuries are frequently unavoidable, but an offender’s compounding an injury with the insult of failing to apologize is not” (Cohen 1999:1069). It is, however, important to never ruin an apology with an excuse (Bovens 2008). The wording of the apology, and the sincerity expected to accompany it, matter, and it is important to not apologize for the wrong thing (Weeks 2003). In other words, don’t apologize just to be doing so, but be purposeful and intentional in assuring that it will never happen again (Koehn 2013) and pay attention to illocutionary phrasing and wording (Skytt 2015).

For an apology to be genuine, at a minimum, the offender is required to accept responsibility for the act in question and to offer an expression of regret to the offended party (Benoit 1995). Some argue that taking responsibility for the wrongdoing is only a portion of what needs to be done and that the wrongdoer must apologize promptly, conveying a settled/just/prudent character, creating a supportive/consistent context, personally delivering the apology, exhibiting empathy, and following through on the apology (Koehn 2013). The element of atonement—including such elements as repentance, prayer, charity, and public confession (Koesten and Rowland, 2004)—can

further substantiate the sincerity of the apology. The party conveying the message also matters: For an apology to be effective, a senior leader needs to be the one expressing remorse, candor, and a commitment to change (Schweitzer, Brooks, and Galinsky 2015).

According to Lazare (2004), the most accepted view is that there are four components to an effective apology: the acknowledgment of wrong, a description of how the wrong occurred, an expression of remorse and commitment to keep it from happening again, and offers of reparation. Each of the four components can be broken into further parts. For example, the acknowledgment of wrong can be divided into correctly identifying both parties (wronged and responsible), acknowledging the offense, recognizing the impact, and confirming that it was a societal wrong (Lazare 2004). As such, the expression of sorrow and regret should not only be present in the apology but also serve as its centerpiece (Taft 2000).

Pseudo-Apologies

A pseudo-apology is not a genuine apology but rather an attempt at image repair. Image repair is thus a persuasive set of messages responding to an attack or incident that could reflect negatively on the organization. Among the main strategies are evading responsibility, reducing offensiveness, taking corrective action, and expressing mortification. By reducing offensiveness, a person accused of misbehavior may attempt to reduce the degree of ill feeling experienced by the wronged; the accused does not deny committing the offense, or attempt to lessen his or her responsibility but instead attempts to increase the audience's positive feelings and reduce its negative feelings toward the accused or the offense (Benoit 2014).

Pseudo-apologies are usually issued in the hope that attention to the situation will go away. These non-apologies, or simulated atonement, not only can work in some circumstances but also can be more effective than genuine apologies at repairing public image under the right circumstances, when they are worded in such a way as to tell the offended what they want to hear (Bentley 2015). Two commonly employed methods of this are disassociation and dispersion (Boyd 2011). Dissociation is an attempt to avoid responsibility, whereas diminution downplays the offense as not being that serious. Dispersion suggests that others are (also) guilty of the offense, and displacement involves apologizing for an offense other than the one in question.

Pseudo-apologies are often nothing more than "rhetorical expressions of redress (in which blame is denied, hidden, or diffused over multiple parties) ... a ritualistic act of contrition designed to repair damaged relations of trust" (Greenberg and Elliott 2009:201). Pseudo-apologies include wording intended to look like an apology but are not genuine and usually fail to take responsibility. In some instances, the non-apology may be worded with the intent of minimizing the incident and of downplaying the incident to look as if it could simply have been a misunderstanding (Kampf 2009). Any apology not prompted by a feeling of remorse lacks sincerity (Kimoga 2010). A genuine apology needs to name the wrong but avoid minimizing it. Explanations given in conjunction with an apology, for example, usually offer external mitigating

circumstances, but this is not so much a part of an apology as a part of an excuse (Scher and Darley 1997).

Striving to Regain Trust

The effectiveness of any apology depends on an understanding of the audience and of what the audience considers appropriate and effective in the given situation (Meier 2004). Any corporate apology lacking an expression of sympathy should not be considered a genuine apology (Lee and Chung 2012). Regret alone is not enough; regret needs to be accompanied by an explicit statement of responsibility in order to benefit the organization (Pace, Fediuk, and Botero 2010).

It is important to note that reputations fall in the category of “soft variables” that are difficult to manage but have great value and need to be protected (Ott and Theunissen 2015). When a wrong needs to be righted, the organization should consider righting the wrong in such a way as to maximize the organization’s exposure from it (Page 2014). For example, if a customer complaint is resolved privately (such as by a customer calling a hotline and dealing one-on-one with a representative), then only the previously unhappy customer knows that the company apologized and righted the situation. By apologizing and righting the situation through Twitter, however, the company can gain public recognition for its actions.

Whether a sincere apology or a pseudo-apology is issued, the goal is the same: to regain the trust that was lost and to keep customers returning. Some have contended that corporate social responsibility (CSR) requires trust and reciprocal influence between an organization and its audience (Brennan, Merkl-Davies, and Beelitz 2013). As such, a failure to apologize, or lack of response to an incident, can be a detriment to CSR.

Studies have shown that the medium in which the organization communicates its crisis-response messages can factor in to the stakeholders’ perception of the content. Although there may not be a perceived difference between the use of video or print in the expression of sympathy or compensation (Coombs and Holladay 2009), social media can have “the most positive effect on secondary crisis communication and reactions” (Schultz, Utz, and Göritz 2011:26). Twitter can, and should, factor strategically into the channel choices that can be used to target stakeholders (Schultz, Utz, and Göritz 2011).

The speed and ability of an organization in regaining trust are greatly affected by the feelings that existed about the organization before the crisis (Claeys and Cauberghe 2015). Although the act of apologizing is important for expressing contrition, it is imperative that sincerity be genuine, or else the apology serves no lasting purpose (Smith 2013).

ILLUSTRATING SITUATIONAL CRISIS COMMUNICATION THEORY THROUGH CASE STUDIES

The best way to illustrate the concepts discussed in this article is to examine five high-profile cases in which SCCT was employed and apologies were issued. Only recent incidents (occurring within eight years of this writing) involving food poisoning were examined. The cases are discussed in chronological order.

Maple Leaf Foods

A Toronto-based producer of lunchmeat, Maple Leaf Foods faced an outbreak of listeria in the middle of August 2008 that led to the suspected deaths of twenty-two and the illness of myriad others (Charlebois and Horan 2010). On August 25, 2008, CEO Michael McCain released a video (available at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zIsN5AkJ1AI>) in which he apologized and offered his deepest sympathies:

My name is Michael McCain. As you may know, listeria was found in some of our products. Even though listeria is a bacteria commonly found in many foods and in the environment, we work diligently to eliminate it. When listeria was discovered in the product, we launched immediate recalls to get it off the shelf; then we shut the plant down. Tragically, our products have been linked to illnesses and loss of life. To the Canadians who are ill and to the families that have lost loved ones, I offer my deepest sympathies. Words cannot begin to express our sadness for your pain. Maple Leaf Foods has 23,000 people who live in a culture of food safety. We have an unwavering commitment to keeping your food safe with standards well beyond regulatory requirements. But this week our best efforts failed, and we are deeply sorry. This is the toughest situation we've faced in one hundred years as a company. We know this is shaking your confidence in us. I commit to you that our actions are guided by putting your interests first.

The apology did not try to shift blame or minimize the situation. The CEO stepped forward as the face of the organization and admitted that the crisis could shake the consumer's confidence in the company; he apologized for failing and assured people that everything that could be done would be. In later discussions of the event, he stated, "Going through the crisis there are two advisers I've paid no attention to. The first are the lawyers, and the second are the accountants. It's not about money or legal liability; this is about our being accountable for providing consumers with safe food" (Lamont 2012).

The Canadian Press named McCain its business newsmaker of 2008, and David Dunne, a professor at the University of Toronto's Rotman School of Management, remarked, "A lot of what they did was technically perfect. I think they've done as much as could be done, and it's a real example to other companies that face crises. Most companies are way too slow to deal with these things and they're afraid of admitting responsibility and so on, so this is a real example of how to do it right" (Ewing 2009). Ruth Davenport of CJNI radio in Halifax added, "The listeria crisis was a headline story in and of itself, but McCain's sincerity in trying to reach out to the victims and consumers elevated it even further" (Ewing 2009).

With more than 200 products recalled, the outbreak was considered one of the worst ever, and the apology, though only approximately one minute in length, "illustrates

how communication can generate widespread support even after an error with tragic consequences has occurred” (Greenberg and Elliott 2009:201).

Fat Duck Restaurant

In January and February 2009, an outbreak of norovirus was blamed for more than 500 illnesses at the Fat Duck restaurant, which is owned by celebrity chef Heston Blumenthal (Morris 2009), in Bray, Berkshire, England. An investigation published in September of that year by the Health Protection Agency (HPA) pointed to oysters as the probable cause. The report also blamed the practices of the restaurant for allowing the illness to continue to spread over a six-week period (Manos 2009). Blumenthal fired back and blamed the HPA for a sloppy investigation (Kuhn 2009), and also issued an apology to diners:

Dear Sir/Madam

I am writing to you regarding your visit to my restaurant, The Fat Duck earlier this year.

I am so sorry that I have not been able to write before. I have wanted to contact you personally for many months, ever since the problem first emerged. But I was advised by the official bodies carrying out the investigation, our lawyers and insurers that I could not do so until both the factual and legal situation had been established.

We all thought that the HPA report would come in months ago, but it was held up by the swine flu outbreak. Now that the report has finally been released I can at last apologise personally.

I am so very sorry that you or any of your guests had a bad experience in any way in my restaurant, The Fat Duck. I have spent my entire adult life trying to create a dining experience that would delight and entertain my guests and my whole team are focused on this one aim. It was deeply upsetting to all of us that your enjoyment of The Fat Duck was not as we had intended it to be.

Irrelevant of the outcome of reports or advice it was always my intention, as I made clear at the outset, to invite anyone affected by the unfortunate incident earlier this year, back to the restaurant as my guest. I would be delighted if you would consider returning to The Fat Duck at a time that is convenient for you. Please contact my assistant Deborah

who will assist with your reservation. If this is not appropriate to you personally, please contact us and we will address each individual situation with our insurers.

Once again please accept my sincerest apologies.

Kindest regards,
Heston Blumenthal

Whereas the CEO of Maple Leaf Foods claimed that he ignored the suggestions of attorneys and issued his apology when they advised against it, Blumenthal used attorney suggestions as a reason for not apologizing for more than half a year (“I was advised by ... lawyers and insurers”). He did not come out and apologize directly for the guests being infected with a virus that causes severe diarrhea and vomiting but instead was “writing ... regarding [their] visit to my restaurant” and “a bad experience” that they may have had. He shifted the focus from the patron to the employees: “It was deeply upsetting to all of us that your enjoyment of The Fat Duck was not as we had intended it to be.”

In this letter, there is no guarantee that the situation can never happen again, that standards have been changed, or that any substantial measures have been put in place. Instead, guests are invited to come back again and to coordinate doing so with an assistant. The letter offers a free meal as compensation for the shortcomings of the previous meal, in the same way a fast-food restaurant would give free fries to someone who found the fries soggy. All told, this makes for a very poor apology, and in 2012, after eight years in the top ten of the World’s 50 Best list, the Fat Duck fell to number thirteen. In February of 2015, it closed and a new incarnation of it opened in Melbourne, Australia (Rayner 2015).

Foster Farms

From May 2012 to April 2013, 134 individuals in 13 states were afflicted by salmonella poisoning, and the source of the outbreak was traced to Foster Farms chickens slaughtered at two separate facilities. While efforts were being made to find the cause, a separate outbreak occurred, from February to October 2013, that infected another 338 individuals with salmonella—this time across twenty states and in Puerto Rico. The investigation traced the cause back to Foster Farms chicken once more (CDC 2013).

Some stores voluntarily removed the products from their shelves, but the contamination continued to spread and an estimated 40 percent of those who became ill required hospitalization (Hylton 2015). It was not until July 2014 that officials from the USDA were able to make a genetic match to the chicken and to truly identify Foster Farms as the culprit. By that time, there were 621 confirmed cases of salmonella infection and it was suspected that as many as 18,000 may have been sickened (Hylton 2015).

In the midst of the crisis, the president of the company, Ron Foster, issued an apology but defended the company’s lack of action. Rather than recall the chicken

products, the company had continued to sell them after it was clear that consumers were becoming ill. His reason was that the company already met or exceeded industry standards and the food would be safe to eat if cooked to a minimum of 165 degrees Fahrenheit (Pierson and Hsu 2013). “If we had pulled our product from the market and put someone else’s in, we’d be lying to the consumer because you’re saying someone else is better,” Foster said (Pierson and Hsu 2013).

This pseudo-apology fails to meet most standards for an apology. It blames the consumers for not heating the food to a temperature high enough to kill the bacteria. It also defends the company’s actions by stating that the company met current standards (which allow for 7.5 percent salmonella in chicken carcasses); subsequent tests by the Food Safety and Inspection Service showed a 25 percent rate of the bacteria at Foster Farms (Sifferlin 2013).

In 2015, the PBS show *Frontline* ran an episode entitled “The Trouble with Chicken” that focused on problems with food safety and Foster Farms. Although Foster Farms disputed the allegations, the company declined to make any representatives available to discuss the issues publicly (Metz 2015).

Blue Bell Ice Cream

In 2015, an outbreak of listeria was traced to Blue Bell ice cream. Blue Bell issued a voluntary recall for all its products (not only ice cream but also frozen yogurt, sherbet, and frozen snacks) that came from suspected facilities. The president and CEO of the company, Paul Kruse, released an apology (the video of which can be found at <http://cdn.bluebell.com/ceo-video-message>):

We’re committed to doing the 100 percent right thing, and the best way to do that is to take all of our products off the market until we are confident that they are all safe. At every step, we have made decisions in the best interest of our customers based on the evidence we had available at the time. We have brought in one of the world’s most respected food-safety microbiologists to inspect our plants and systems to help us get to the bottom of this issue.

Through further internal testing, we learned today that *Listeria monocytogenes* was found in an additional half gallon of ice cream in our Brenham facility. While we initially believed this situation was isolated to one machine in one room, we now know that was wrong. We need to know more to be completely confident that our products are safe for our customers.

As Blue Bell moves forward, we are implementing a procedure called “test and hold” for all products made at all

of our manufacturing facilities. This means that all products released will be tested first and held for release to the market only after the tests show they are safe.

In addition to the “test and hold” system, Blue Bell is implementing additional safety procedures and testing, including

- expanding our already robust system of daily cleaning and sanitizing of equipment,
- expanding our system of swabbing and testing our plant environment by 800 percent to include more surfaces,
- sending samples daily to a leading microbiology laboratory for testing,
- providing additional employee training.

At this point, we cannot say with certainty how listeria was introduced to our facilities. We continue to work with our team of experts to eliminate this problem.

We urge consumers who have purchased Blue Bell products to return them to the place of purchase for a full refund. Consumers with any concerns or questions should call 979-836-7977 Monday through Friday, eight a.m. to five p.m. CST or go to www.bluebell.com for the most up-to-date information.

We are heartbroken about this situation and apologize to all of our loyal Blue Bell fans and customers. Our entire history has been about making the very best and highest-quality ice cream, and we intend to fix this problem. We want enjoying our ice cream to be a source of joy and pleasure, never a cause for concern, so we are committed to getting this right.

The facility where the contamination occurred, in Broken Arrow, Oklahoma, was closed immediately after the problem was found. Subsequent testing showed listeria in a Texas facility as well, but this was traced to items that had originated in Oklahoma and then moved to Texas (Newman 2016). That facility was temporarily shut down until the issue could be resolved.

Blue Bell, one of the largest ice cream makers in the United States, kept its products from store shelves for four months while it focused on cleaning its plant and enhancing sanitation and testing procedures. The company took to social media to

reassure consumers of its safety practices (Newman and Gasparro 2015) and promoted those practices on its website. Transparency was a key to Blue Bell's strategy to keep consumer confidence, and, according to the *Wall Street Journal*, once the product was reintroduced, "Blake Rizzo, an IT professional in Houston, drove to a nearby Randalls grocery store at 6 a.m. Monday to stock up on Blue Bell before it could sell out ... the store was packed" (Newman and Gasparro 2015).

Chipotle

In October of 2015, Chipotle Mexican Grill was linked to an outbreak of E. coli that affected more than 50 people across several states (Jargon 2015). The outbreak led to extensive national coverage in the media, particularly because this epidemic followed two other problems that had occurred with Chipotle since the summer: California had seen 234 individuals sickened by norovirus in August, and Minnesota had seen 64 people affected by a salmonella outbreak in August and September (Zuraw 2015). The norovirus occurrence was attributed to a sick employee violating company policies (Rhodan 2016) and the salmonella was linked to a batch of tainted tomatoes (Garcia and Goldschmidt 2015), but no direct link to the E. coli contamination was ever found (Hauser 2016).

In early November 2015, Chipotle addressed the public directly about the incidents and released a press release announcing that it was temporarily closing 43 restaurants in Oregon and Washington. The company was also, according to the release, taking additional cleaning and sanitizing steps, testing distribution centers, replacing all food items in the closed stores, batch-testing some ingredients, helping with the Centers for Disease Control investigation, and retaining two consulting firms "to help the company assess and improve upon its already high standards for food safety" (Arnold 2015). In December 2015, Steve Eells, chairman and co-CEO, issued an apology:

As a chef, nothing is more important to me than serving my guests food that is safe, delicious, and wholesome. From the beginning, all of our food safety programs have met or exceeded industry standards. But recent incidents, an E. coli outbreak that sickened 52 people and a norovirus outbreak that sickened approximately 140 people at a single Chipotle restaurant in Boston, have shown us that we need to do better, much better.

The fact that anyone has become ill eating at Chipotle is completely unacceptable to me and I am deeply sorry. As a result, we are committed to becoming known as the leader in food safety, just as we are known for using the very best ingredients in a fast food setting. I want to share with our customers specifics about some of the significant steps we are taking to be sure all of the food we serve is as safe as it can be.

To achieve our goal of establishing leadership in food safety, we collaborated with preeminent food safety experts to design a comprehensive food safety program that dramatically reduces risk on our farms, throughout our supply chain, and in our restaurants. The process began with a farm-to-form risk assessment of every ingredient and all of our restaurant protocols and procedures.

Throughout our supply chain, we are implementing high-resolution sampling and testing of many of our ingredients to prevent contaminants, including E. coli, from getting into our restaurants. Testing of this kind is unprecedented in the restaurant industry because of the large number of samples tested. We are also working without our supplier partners to further enhance their food safety programs.

We have also designed many improvements within our restaurants to ensure our food is as safe as possible. This includes the introduction of additional microbiological kill steps to eliminate microbial risk. Additionally, we are rolling out new sanitation procedures in our restaurants and implementing additional food safety training for all of our restaurant employees. More information about these changes is available online at chipotle.com/foodsafety.

In the end, it may not be possible for anyone to completely eliminate all risk with regard to food (or from any environment where people congregate), but we are confident that we can achieve near zero risk. Chipotle is an incredibly focused company. Our menu has remained virtually unchanged for the last 22 years and we only have 64 ingredients in our food. Rest assured that we have looked at each of these ingredients, where they come from, and how they can be made even safer. I believe our restaurants are safer today than they have ever been.

The last 22 years have been an incredible journey and we are not going to shy away from this new challenge. I'd like to take this opportunity to apologize on behalf of all of us at Chipotle, and to thank our loyal customers who have stood by us through this difficult time.

Steve Ells
Founder, Chairman, and Co-CEO

SCCT was applied when Chipotle apologized for the outbreak, put a face with the company (Steve Ells), and tried to assure the various publics that Chipotle was doing everything in its power to control and correct the situation. The apology was carefully worded and released through a plethora of outlets, including social media, to make sure it received maximum exposure. Ells made himself available to a number of news organizations for interviews and follow-ups to further put a human face with the organization. When it became apparent that no one malefactor could be identified for causing the E. coli contamination, the company announced through an equally large number of outlets that it would close its stores for a day to roll out the safety changes and make that meeting public. Transparency of this magnitude is aligned with the SCCT, and the company applied it well.

Chipotle has always prided itself as serving “food with integrity”; synonyms for integrity include *honest*, *truthful*, and *reliable*. What worked in Chipotle’s response to the crisis was that the company stuck to being honest, truthful, and transparent. It not only kept communication open through press releases, its website, an FAQ on the outbreak, social media, and making key executives available for discussion but also asked the farmers and ranchers who were their vendors to be open and transparent as well. This kept the dialogue going between the corporation and its publics and allowed them to walk through the investigation and remedies together (Jargon 2015).

DISCUSSION

Although those in the legal profession have traditionally often discouraged apologies for fear that apologies be construed as admissions of guilt and used against the issuers in court proceedings (Patel and Reinsch 2003), others have come to view apologies as expected rituals. Trust is gained through transparency (Kang and Hustvedt 2014), and when a problem occurs, apologies allow transparency to occur, enabling consumers to begin trusting again. Regardless of the view taken, apologies offer opportunities to repair public images, but to be genuine, apologies must acknowledge responsibility for the offense, as well as include remorse and a promise not to let the offense happen again (Hearit 2006). When an apology will help the situation, it is important that the organization issue one, but it is critical that the apology be issued at the right time. If the apology is issued too early, the audience is not yet ready for it and it will not be as effective as if issued when the situation is understood and the stakeholders are receptive (Ebesu Hubbard et al. 2013).

Whether an apology is accepted or not can be partially attributed to evaluative expressions and positive tone of voice (Jiang 2013). A bad apology can strain relationships and lead to bitterness or cause bitterness to remain (Hargie, Stapleton, and Tourish 2010). In most situations, the words are just the first step—there is a need to move beyond apologia (Coombs et al. 2010).

Lazare (2004:107) outlines four components to a successful apology: (1) acknowledgment of the offense; (2) communication of remorse and the related attitudes of forbearance, sincerity, and honesty; (3) explanations that do not diminish the seriousness of the offense; and (4) reparations. Table 1 examines each of the five cases

discussed above, and these four components in the companies' public apologies. Areas of weakness are in italics.

The companies that issued true apologies rather than pseudo-apologies have done well at protecting their reputations and restoring trust. Recently, Maple Leaf Foods' stock price rose 31 percent over the previous two years, and the company has zero debt and has reorganized with a lean corporate structure (Atkins 2015). Blue Bell ice cream "is again being supplied to a large area of the southeast, including most everything south of a line stretching from New Mexico to the Carolinas" (Flynn 2016).

Foster Farms, in contrast, continues to draw scrutiny and was recently the focus of a Frontline episode on PBS looking into food-borne dangers. The Fat Duck restaurant has closed its flagship location and moved to Australia.

Although the outbreaks have been too recent for accurate reflection on the long-term effects at Chipotle, studies have shown that previously faithful customers were the ones who changed their eating habits the most and were 50 fifty more likely to stay away than were occasional customers during the outbreak. Those once-loyal customers have also been "even harder to lure back in" now that the crisis has passed (Jargon 2016).

Table 1. Apology Components in Food-Poisoning Apologies

Company and Type of Apology	Acknowledgment	Remorse	Explanation	Reparation
Maple Leaf Foods Apology	"Listeria was found in some of our food products."	"I offer my deepest sympathies. Words cannot begin to express our sadness for your pain."	"Our best efforts failed"	"We launched immediate recalls to get it off the shelf; then we shut the plant down." "I commit to you that our actions are guided by putting your interests first."
Fat Duck Restaurant Pseudo-apology	<i>refers to "the unfortunate incident" rather than using the word "norovirus"</i>	"I am so very sorry that you or any of your guests had a bad experience in any way in my restaurant."	<i>discusses being unable to contact individuals because of advisers and unable to respond until much later because of HPA not being expedient</i>	"invite anyone affected ... back to the restaurant as my guest"
Foster Farms Pseudo-apology	<i>agrees that salmonella is in the product but says that salmonella is also in products from others and company is meeting current standards (later found to not be the case)</i>	<i>continues to sell product even though some grocery chains voluntarily remove it from their shelves</i>	<i>transfers blame to the customer for not heating the product to a high enough temperature</i>	<i>none given</i>

Concluded next page

Table 1. Apology Components in Food-Poisoning Apologies, Concl.

Company and Type of Apology	Acknowledgment	Remorse	Explanation	Reparation
Blue Bell Ice Cream Apology	“We learned today that ... listeria ... was found in our Brenham facility.”	“We are heartbroken about this situation and apologize to all of our loyal Blue Bell fans and customers.”	“We cannot say with certainty how listeria was introduced to our facilities. We continue to work with our team of experts to eliminate this problem.”	“Consumers with any concerns or questions should call ... or go to ... for the most up-to-date information.” “We intend to fix this problem. We want enjoying our ice cream to be a source of joy and pleasure, never a cause for concern, so we are committed to getting this right.”
Chipotle Apology	“an E. coli outbreak that sickened 52 people and a norovirus outbreak that sickened approximately 140 “	“The fact that anyone has become ill eating at Chipotle is completely unacceptable to me and I am deeply sorry.”	“It may not be possible for anyone to completely eliminate all risk with regard to food (or from any environment where people congregate).”	“We are committed to becoming known as the leader in food safety.” “I want to share with our customers specifics about some of the significant steps we are taking to be sure all of the food we serve is as safe as it can be.”

CONCLUSION AND LIMITATIONS

This article contributes to the literature by examining how the principles of SCCT were applied in each of five high-profile food-poisoning cases. One of the biggest components of SCCT is the expression of sympathy and connection with the various publics to acknowledge what has happened (though not necessarily accepting liability) and to assure them that it will not happen again. This works best with the publics’ belief that the organization is genuinely empathetic and is going above and beyond to make sure that the situation cannot happen again.

Although all of the companies examined utilized SCCT and apologies to respond to food-borne crises linked to their products, three of the apologies meet the criteria for genuine apologies whereas two are more appropriately classified as pseudo-apologies. Those organizations that issued apologies containing the four components of a successful apology appear to have fared better than those that did not. The successful apology requires (1) acknowledgment of the offense; (2) communication of remorse and the related attitudes of forbearance, sincerity, and honesty; (3) explanations that do not diminish the seriousness of the offense; and (4) reparations.

There are a number of limitations inherent in this study, the first being that only five organizations were examined and the outbreaks were of various sizes (one involved

only a single restaurant, whereas another involved recall of 200 products from the market). Time was also a significant difference: Cases ranged from 2008 to 2015. Additionally, the scale of severity of each outbreak could factor in: Both Maple Leaf Foods and Blue Bell battled listeria, whereas the Fat Duck dealt with norovirus and Foster Farms had salmonella. The outbreak at Chipotle was the most serious of all in terms of danger of the malady—E. coli—and it came on the heels of problems that the company faced with both norovirus and salmonella.

REFERENCES

- Arnold, C. 2015. "Chipotle Moves Aggressively to Address Issues in Washington and Oregon [Press Release]. *CNN Money*. Retrieved March 22, 2016 (<http://ir.chipotle.com/mobile.view?c=194775&v=203&d=1&id=2106211>).
- Atkins, E. 2015. "Maple Leaf Foods Finding Success after 7-Year Organizational Overhaul." *Globe and Mail*. Retrieved March 31, 2016 (<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/leaner-maple-leaf-foods-starts-to-see-light-after-dark-times/article24181279/>).
- Augustine, N. R. 1995. "Managing the Crisis You Tried to Prevent." *Harvard Business Review* 73(6):147–58.
- Battistella, E. L. 2014. *Sorry about That: The Language of Public Apology*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Benoit, W. L. 1995. *Accounts, Excuses, and Apologies: A Theory of Image Restoration Strategies*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Benoit, W. L. 2014. *Accounts, Excuses, and Apologies: Image Repair Theory and Research*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Benoit, W. L., and A. Pang. 2008. "Crisis Communication and Image Repair Discourse." Pp. 244–61 in *Public Relations: From Theory to Practice*, edited by T. Hansen-Horn and B. Dostal Neff. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Bentley, J. M. 2015. Shifting Identification: A Theory of Apologies and Pseudo-apologies. *Public Relations Review* 41(1):22–29. doi:10.1016/j.pubrev.2014.10.011.
- Best, R. 2000. *Market-Based Management: Strategies for Growing Customer Value and Profitability*. 2nd ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Bovens, L. 2008. "Apologies." *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 108(1):219–39.
- Boyd, D. P. 2011. "Art and Artifice in Public Apologies." *Journal of Business Ethics* 104(3):299–309.
- Brennan, N., D. Merkl-Davies, and A. Beelitz. 2013. "Dialogism in Corporate Social Responsibility Communications: Conceptualising Verbal Interaction Between Organisations and Their Audiences." *Journal of Business Ethics* 115(4):665–79. doi:10.1007/s10551-013-1825-9.
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). 2013. Outbreak of Salmonella Heidelberg Infections Linked to a Single Poultry Producer—13 States, 2012–2013. *MMWR: Morbidity & Mortality Weekly Report* 62(27):553–56.

- Charlebois, S., and H. Horan. 2010. "Institutional and Relational Determinants in High- and Medium-Extent Food Product Crises: The Inner Perspective of a Public Health Crisis." *International Journal of Environmental Health Research* 20(4):299–312. doi:10.1080/09603123.2010.482151.
- Chaudhuri, A., and M. B. Holbrook. 2001. "The Chain of Effects from Brand Trust and Brand Affect to Brand Performance: The Role of Brand Loyalty." *Journal of Marketing* 65(2):81–93.
- Claeys, A., and V. Cauberghe. 2015. "The Role of a Favorable Pre-crisis Reputation in Protecting Organizations during Crises." *Public Relations Review* 41(1):64–71. doi:10.1016/j.pubrev.2014.10.013.
- Cohen, J. R. 1999. "Advising Clients to Apologize." *Southern California Law Review* 72:1009–69.
- Coombs, T. 2008. "The Development of the Situational Crisis Communication Theory." Pp. 262–77 in *Public Relations: From Theory to Practice*, edited by T. Hansen-Horn and B. Dostal Neff. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Coombs, W. T., F. Frandsen, S. J. Holladay, and W. Johansen. 2010. "Why a Concern for Apologia and Crisis Communication?" *Corporate Communications* 15(4):337–49. doi:10.1108/13563281011085466.
- Coombs, W. T., and S. J. Holladay. 2009. "Further Explorations of Post-crisis Communication: Effects of Media and Response Strategies on Perceptions and Intentions." *Public Relations Review* 35(1):1–6. doi:10.1016/j.pubrev.2008.09.011.
- Covey, S. M. 2006. *The Speed of Trust: The One Thing That Changes Everything*. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Day, G. 1999. *The Market Driven Organization: Understanding, Attracting, and Keeping Valuable Customers*. New York: The Free Press.
- Drucker, P. F. 2001. *The Essential Drucker*. New York: Collins.
- Ebesu Hubbard, A. S., B. Hendrickson, K. S. Fehrenbach, and J. Sur. 2013. "Effects of Timing and Sincerity of an Apology on Satisfaction and Changes in Negative Feelings during Conflicts." *Western Journal of Communication* 77(3):305–22. doi:10.1080/10570314.2013.770160.
- Ewing, B. 2009. "Maple Leaf Foods CEO Business Newsmaker of the Year." *Digital Journal*. Retrieved April 5, 2016 (<http://www.digitaljournal.com/article/264355>).
- Flynn, D. 2016. "Blue Bell Reports on Root Causes of Five-Year Listeria Outbreak." *Food Safety News*. Retrieved April 25, 2016 (http://www.foodsafetynews.com/2016/03/blue-bell-reports-on-root-causes-of-five-year-listeria-outbreak/#.Vx5rP_krLIU).
- Fornell, C., S. Mithas, F. V. Morgeson III, and M. S. Krishnan. 2006. "Customer Satisfaction and Stock Prices: High Returns, Low Risk." *Journal of Marketing* 70(1):3–14.
- Garcia, A., and D. Goldschmidt. 2015. "Tomatoes the Cause of Chipotle's Salmonella Outbreak in Minnesota." *CNN Money*. Retrieved March 19, 2016 (<http://money.cnn.com/2015/09/17/news/chipotle-salmonella-minnesota-tomatoes/>).
- Greenberg, J., and C. Elliott. 2009. "A Cold Cut Crisis: Listeriosis, Maple Leaf Foods, and the Politics of Apology." *Canadian Journal of Communication* 34(2):189–204.

- Hargie, O., K. Stapleton, and D. Tourish. 2010. "Interpretations of CEO Public Apologies for the Banking Crisis: Attributions of Blame and Avoidance of Responsibility." *Organization* 17(6):721–42. doi:10.1177/1350508410367840.
- Hauser, C. 2016. "C.D.C. Ends Chipotle Case with Illness Still a Mystery." *New York Times*, February 2, p. B5.
- Hearit, K. M. 2006. *Crisis Management by Apology: Corporate Responses to Allegations of Wrongdoing*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Homburg, C., and A. Furst. 2005. "How Organizational Complaint Handling Drives Customer Loyalty: An Analysis of the Mechanistic and the Organic Approach." *Journal of Marketing* 69(3):95–114.
- Homburg, C., M. Grozdanovic, and M. Klarmann. 2007. "Responsiveness to Customers and Competitors: The Role of Affective and Cognitive Organizational Systems." *Journal of Marketing* 71(3):18–38.
- Hylton, W. S. 2015. "A Bug in the System: Why Last Night's Chicken Made You Sick." *New Yorker* 90(46):30–31.
- Jargon, A. J. 2015. "Chipotle Shares Rise after Chief Apologizes, Reiterates Food-Safety Plan." *Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved (<https://www.wsj.com/articles/chipotle-shares-rise-after-chief-apologizes-reiterates-food-safety-plan-1449763853>).
- Jargon, J. 2016. "Chipotle Banks on Freebies." *Wall Street Journal*, April 25, p. B2.
- Jaworski, B. J., and A. K. Kohli. 1993. "Market Orientation: Antecedents and Consequences." *Journal of Marketing* 57(3):53–70.
- Jiang, F. 2013. "A Comparative Investigation into Interpersonal Meaning of Two Corporate Apology Letters." *English for Specific Purposes World* 41(14). Retrieved April 5, 2016 (http://www.esp-world.info/Articles_41/Doc/Interpersonal_JIANG.pdf).
- Kampf, Z. 2009. "Public (Non-) Apologies: The Discourse of Minimizing Responsibility." *Journal of Pragmatics* 41(11):2257–70. doi:10.1016/j.pragma.2008.11.007.
- Kang, J., and G. Hustvedt. 2014. "Building Trust between Consumers and Corporations: The Role of Consumer Perceptions of Transparency and Social Responsibility." *Journal of Business Ethics* 125:253–65. doi:10.1007/s10551-013-1916-7.
- Kimoga, J. 2010. "Remorseless Apology: Analysing a Political Letter." *Journal of Pragmatics* 42(8):2181–88. doi:10.1016/j.pragma.2010.02.003.
- Koehn, D. 2013. "Why saying 'I'm Sorry' Isn't Good Enough: The Ethics of Corporate Apologies." *Business Ethics Quarterly* 23(2):239–68. doi:10.5840/beq201323216.
- Koesten, J., and R. C. Rowland. 2004. "The Rhetoric of Atonement." *Communication Studies* 55(1):68–87. doi:10.1080/10510970409388606.
- Kohli, A. K., and B. J. Jaworski. 1990. "Market Orientation: The Construct, Research Propositions, and Managerial Implications." *Journal of Marketing* 54(2):1–18.
- Kotler, P. 2003. *A Framework for Marketing Management*. 2nd ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Kotler, P., N. Rackham, and S. Krishnaswamy. 2006. "Ending the War between Sales & Marketing." *Harvard Business Review* 84(7/8):68–78.
- Kuhn, K. 2009. "Blumenthal Slams HPA for Its Handling of Norovirus Report." *Caterer & Hotelkeeper* 199(4597):5–37.

- Lamont, R. 2012. "The Power of an Open and Honest Apology." *The Buzz Bin*. Retrieved April 19, 2016 (<http://www.buzzbinpadillact.com/the-power-of-an-open-and-honest-apology/>).
- Lazare, A. 2004. *On apology*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lee, S., and S. Chung. 2012. "Corporate Apology and Crisis Communication: The Effect of Responsibility Admittance and Sympathetic Expression on Public's Anger Relief." *Public Relations Review* 38(5):932–34. doi:10.1016/j.pubrev.2012.08.006.
- Manos, J. 2009. "Food Handler Health Checks Would Have Limited Fat Duck Norovirus Outbreak." *Occupational Health* 61(10):30.
- Meier, A. J. 2004. "Conflict and the Power of Apologies." *PhiN: Philologie Im Netz* 30:1–17.
- Metz, A. 2015. "Editor's Note: Foster Farms and 'The Trouble with Chicken.'" *Frontline*. Retrieved April 20, 2016 (<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/frontline/article/editors-note-foster-farms-and-the-trouble-with-chicken/>).
- Morris, S. 2009. "National: Fat Duck Offers Free Meals to Food Victims." *Guardian* (London, England).
- Newman, J. 2016. "Business News: Blue Bell: Outbreak's Sources Partly Known." *Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved (<http://search.proquest.com/docview/1777885386?accountid=38223>).
- Newman, J., and A. Gasparro. 2015. "Blue Bell Ice Cream Returns to Store Shelves in Select Cities; Company Begins Ambitious Recovery Effort Following a Deadly Listeria Outbreak in April That Nearly Put It out of Business." *Wall Street Journal* Retrieved (<http://search.proquest.com/docview/1708276155?accountid=38223>).
- Ott, L., and P. Theunissen. 2015. "Reputations at Risk: Engagement during Social Media Crises." *Public Relations Review* 41(1):97–102. doi:10.1016/j.pubrev.2014.10.015.
- Pace, K. M., T. A. Fediuk, and I. C. Botero. 2010. "The Acceptance of Responsibility and Expressions of Regret in Organizational Apologies after a Transgression." *Corporate Communications: An International Journal* 15(4):410–27.
- Page, R. 2014. "Saying 'Sorry': Corporate Apologies Posted on Twitter." *Journal of Pragmatics* 62:30–45. doi:10.1016/j.pragma.2013.12.003.
- Papasolomou-Doukakis, I. 2002. "Internal Marketing: A Means for Creating a Sales or Marketing Orientation? The Case of UK Retail Banks." *Journal of Marketing Communications* 8(2):87–100.
- Patel, A., and L. Reinsch. 2003. "Companies Can Apologize: Corporate Apologies and Legal Liability." *Business Communication Quarterly* 66(1):9–25.
- Pierson, D., and T. Hsu. 2013. "Foster Farms Apologizes for Salmonella Outbreak." *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved April 12, 2016 (<http://articles.latimes.com/2013/oct/18/news/chi-foster-farms-apologizes-for-salmonella-outbreak-20131018>).
- Rayner, J. 2015. "Heston Blumenthal Interview: The Fat Duck Flies Again." *Guardian* Retrieved April 17, 2016 (<http://www.theguardian.com/lifeandstyle/2015/aug/23/the-fat-duck-flies-again-heston-blumenthal>).

- Rhodan, M. 2016. "Chipotle Blames Sick Employees for Norovirus Outbreaks." *Time* Retrieved March 20, 2016 (<http://time.com/4212692/chipotle-closed-stores-norovirus-burrito/>).
- Scher, S. J., and J. M. Darley. 1997. "How Effective Are the Things People Say to Apologize? Effects of the Realization of the Apology Speech Act." *Journal of Psycholinguistic Research* 26(1):127–40.
- Schultz, F., S. Utz, and A. Göritz. 2011. "Is the Medium the Message? Perceptions of and Reactions to Crisis Communication via Twitter, Blogs and Traditional Media." *Public Relations Review* 37(1):20–27. doi:10.1016/j.pubrev.2010.12.001.
- Schweitzer, M. E., A. W. Brooks, and A. D. Galinsky. 2015. "The Organizational Apology." *Harvard Business Review* 93(9):44–52.
- Sifferlin, A. 2013. "USDA Criticized for Not Closing Farms Linked to Salmonella Outbreak." *Time*. Retrieved (<http://healthland.time.com/2013/10/11/usda-criticized-for-not-closing-farms-linked-to-salmonella-outbreak/>).
- Skytt, F. 2015. "Sorry Seems to Be the Hardest Word: A Case Study of Corporate Apologies on Twitter." Dissertation, Department of English, Stockholm University. Retrieved (<http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:su:diva-118088>).
- Slater, S. F., and J. C. Narver. 1994. "Market Orientation, Customer Value, and Superior Performance." *Business Horizons* 37(2):22–28.
- Smith, N. 2013. "Just Apologies: An Overview of the Philosophical Issues." *Pepperdine Dispute Resolution Law Journal* 13(1):35–103.
- Taft, L. 2000. "Apology Subverted: The Commodification of Apology." *The Yale Law Journal* 109(5):1135–60.
- Weeks, H. 2003. "The Art of the Apology." *Harvard Management Update* 8(4):10–11.
- Zuraw, L. 2015. "A Timeline of Chipotle's Five Outbreaks." *Food Safety News*. Retrieved March 22, 2016 (http://www.foodsafetynews.com/2015/12/a-timeline-of-chipotles-five-outbreaks/#.VvF_n-IrLIU).

*Building Fukan as a Chinese Public Sphere: Zhang Dongsun and Learning Light**

NUAN GAO
Hanover College

ABSTRACT

This article attempts to explore the relevance of the public sphere, conceptualized by Jürgen Habermas, in the Chinese context. The author focuses on the case of *Learning Light* (*Xuedeng*), one of the most reputable *fukans*, or newspaper supplements, of the May Fourth era (1915–1926), arguing that *fukan* served a very Habermasian function, in terms of its independence from power intervention and its inclusiveness of incorporating voices across political and social strata. Through examining the leadership of Zhang Dongsun, editor in chief of *Learning Light*, as well as the public opinions published in this *fukan*, the author also discovers that, in constructing China’s public sphere, both the left and moderate intellectuals of the May Fourth era used conscious effort and shared the same moral courage, although their roles were quite different: The left was more prominent as passionate and idealist spiritual leaders shining in the center of the historic stage, whereas in comparison, the moderates acted as pragmatic and rational organizers, ensuring a benevolent environment for the stage.

KEY WORDS Jürgen Habermas; Public Sphere; *Fukan*; May Fourth; Zhang Dongsun

On March 4, 1918, the *China Times*, one of the most popular daily newspapers in Shanghai, delivered the opening announcement for its *fukan*, which literally means “the minor part of the newspaper” or “newspaper supplement.” This *fukan*, titled *Xuedeng*, or *Learning Light*, was the earliest of the “Four Big *Fukans*”¹ during China’s May Fourth era.² All four of these *fukans* offered comprehensive introductions to and played crucial roles in spreading new ideas and customs. These *fukans* provided overviews of international trends in the arts and organized prompt discussions and debates on contemporary events both inside and outside China in the late 1910s and early 1920s.

Fukan is a tradition unique to Chinese newspapers, included with the main part of the newspapers and sent to subscribers every day. “Newspaper supplement” is only a

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Nuan Gao, Assistant Professor of East Asian History, Department of History, Hanover College, Hanover, IN 47243; gaosalome@gmail.com; (812) 599-4758.

rough translation, as it is hard to find counterparts in the West. *Fukans* first appeared in late Qing, and in the beginning, these early-stage newspaper supplements were considered to be of low prestige because they mainly published articles of leisure and amusement. Around the turn of the twentieth century, however, both constitutional reformers and revolutionaries began to remodel the *fukans* into propaganda tools similar to flyers, and to bring their contents more in line with the main part of newspapers. By 1919, the supplements had evolved into substantial parts of newspapers, with their own appeal; compared to the main papers, the supplements provided coverage of greater depth in a much smaller size.

Fukans are significant in examining the relevance of the concept of the public sphere, originally theorized by Jürgen Habermas, in the context of Chinese history. In this article, I will take *Learning Light* as a model, by looking at the leadership of its chief editor, Zhang Dongsun, as well as looking at its publication of the discussion about the patriotic student demonstration in 1919, to exemplify how *fukans* served a very Habermasian function and how May Fourth intellectuals put conscious effort into constructing and disciplining China's public sphere. Primarily, we need to review the original definition of public sphere and justify the *fukan*'s qualification as a model.

PUBLIC SPHERE AND FUKANS

Jürgen Habermas (1989) gave a thorough and systematic conceptualization of “public sphere” in his milestone scholarship, according to which Joan Landes succinctly summarized the definition of public sphere as an “informal association of private persons oriented to general interests, [that] served to mediate between the economy and network of intergroup relations and the state” (Landes 1988: 5–6). This suggests three key features of the public sphere. The first is independence, which means that the public sphere is a mechanism independent from both the government and society, so that it stands neutral to the interests of the two. The second is a disregard of status, which means every participant in the public sphere should be seen as an equal member, regardless of social class or professional title. The third is inclusivity, suggesting that the public sphere should incorporate various voices and all levels of participation, denying any monopoly or domination. The public sphere was also a mark of modernity. According to Habermas, the rise of a liberal democratic public sphere was central to the modernization of late-eighteenth-century societies (Landes 1988: 5). Besides Habermas, other scholars have contributed to theorizing the public sphere. A common thread in their work is that political action is steered by the public sphere and that the only legitimate governments are those that listen to the public sphere. Democratic governance rests on the capacity of and opportunity for citizens to engage in enlightened debates.

Habermas proposed various types of the public sphere that had helped foster Western democracy and, in a broader sense, modernity. Salons and coffee shops of eighteenth-century France were typical examples. Another important form of the public sphere was print media—newspapers in particular. Early Western newspapers did not touch upon political issues, because of government pressure and censorship, but their wide readership and capability to evoke public emotions allowed them to contribute to

the formation of later revolutions from which modern society was forged. Since the 1980s, scholars have been applying the concept of the public sphere to Chinese studies, mainly in urban history and in studies of the history of print media. It is not coincidental that print media becomes the research focus in this regard for both Western and Chinese scholars, as it contains a much larger volume of the accessible records of public opinions than any other source.

Among the various types of print media, the *fukan* is an ideal and in some ways better Habermasian model than newspapers and journals. Firstly, *fukans* flourished in the May Fourth era, which is generally regarded as the most “free” period for literature in Chinese history, with the exception of the Spring and Autumn and the Warring States periods (which together lasted from approximately 771 BC to 221 BC). New dictatorship was not yet established in this chaotic warlord era after the collapse of the Qing dynasty, which allowed *fukans* to be largely free from government control. Secondly, they had much more inclusive readership and authorship. For example, in high-profile journals such as *La Jeunesse (New Youth)*, the authors were mainly famous scholars and distinguished students, but the voices from lower social classes were seldom presented, and the circulation volume of such journals was obviously much less than for daily newspapers and *fukans*. For popular daily newspapers such as *Shenbao*, in spite of its huge readership, authors were mainly employed journalists and editors, and the writings were often “reporting” and brief commentaries rather than in-depth discussions. In comparison, *fukans* won out in that the audience for and contributors to them came from the entire literary population, and their circulation was no less than that of the parent newspaper. Moreover, *fukans* published both segmented opinions and large-scale debates on specific topics. Members of the elite read and wrote for *fukans*, but they were outnumbered in these roles by members of other groups, such as primary- and middle-school teachers, rural and urban students, local gentry, urban professionals, merchants, artisans, and so on. Even those belonging to more marginal groups were involved with *fukans*. I have found examples, for instance, of a poor Buddhist nun expressing her aspiration of “serving the new society” (*Learning Light*, April 1920) and of a low-ranking soldier using a *fukan* as a medium for describing his dislike of warlords (*Awakening*, May 1920). Thirdly, the editors of *fukans*, the people in charge of discussions and debates by way of selecting writings to be published and adding editorial comments, were mostly moderate in their respective political and cultural standings, which enabled them to avoid arbitrariness or prejudice like that of the extreme left or right.³ This moderateness also made the editors appear more approachable, which in turn added to the potential readership and authorship.

Now let us start to focus on the particular *fukan*, *Learning Light*, under examination in this article. Its parent newspaper, *Shishi xinbao* (the *China Times*), was initially the mouthpiece of late-Qing constitutional reformists, headed by Liang Qichao. After the 1911 Revolution, Liang Qichao and his followers used *Learning Light* to advocate republicanism, and the *fukan*'s pages were filled with pieces by authors actively involved in the campaigns against Yuan Shikai. *Learning Light* started its publication as a weekly supplement but became daily in January 1919. It was the first newspaper supplement to publish vernacular literature, such as Guo Moruo's poems and Mao Dun's

translations of Russian short novels. Its major authors included Zhang Dongsun, Kuangseng, Yu Songhua, Li Shicen, and Zheng Zhenduo, among which Zhang Dongsun, who was born into a culturally elite family and once studied Western philosophy in Japan, served as the chief editor. *Learning Light* under Zhang's leadership bore an obvious moderate color, with no less critical strength than its contemporary pro-left newspapers, journals, and *fukan* (*Awakening*, for example).

In the opening announcement of *Learning Light*, Zhang Dongsun stated, "These days, society is a den of whores and gamblers, politics suffers from the poison of wanton selfishness, [and] we few good men are left without a place to abide. Rather than contend with them, I would open up a new world for us. ... [Our purposes are] first, promote the cause of education and foster the growth of culture; second, prevent factionalism and solicit many topics for discussion; third, this [*Learning Light*] is not just for the editors and the editors' friends to publish their articles, but for people from the whole of society to voice their opinions" (*Learning Light*, March 4, 1918).

This announcement conveyed two messages. The first stated purpose indicated that *Learning Light* would practice the tenets of the New Culture Movement. The last two of the stated purposes emphasized *Learning Light's* inclusiveness, implying that this *fukan* was to be remarkably different from late-Qing revolutionary pamphlets and even from those influential new culture journals such as *La Jeunesse* and *New Tides* (*Xin Chao*); *Learning Light* was not just a propaganda organ of a certain political or cultural faction. This feature qualifies *Learning Light* as a possible model of the public sphere, whereas, in comparison, most of the late-Qing and New Culture print media could be seen only as "civil societies."

In the following two sections, I will show how *Learning Light*, with the keynote established by Zhang Dongsun, advocated principles of rationality, tolerance, openness, and pragmatism, which are crucial to the construction of the public sphere. I pay attention to the discussants' language as well as arguments. By comparing their tone, phrasing, and argumentation, we can also see the different influences exerted by the moderate and left-wing intellectuals.

DISCIPLINING THE PUBLIC SPHERE: HEALTHY PERSONALITY, TOLERANCE, AND RATIONALITY

Zhang Dongsun never systematically described the specifics of what a public sphere was; in his words, it was "the mechanisms that check the government and are responsible to society." Through his writings and editorials, however, people can see how he consciously tried to set rules, though sometimes implicitly, to construct *Learning Light* as a public sphere, according very closely with two basic characteristics formulated by Habermas: "disregard of status" and "inclusivity." Specifically, the "disregard of status" means treating each discussant with an equal attitude and courtesy, which was part of his conceptualization of a "modern people" with a healthy personality. This was especially significant for the chief editor of the newspaper supplement as a moderator of the public sphere. "Inclusivity," just as Zhang Dongsun stated in the opening announcement, means

preventing factionalism and incorporating as many discussion topics as possible, which could be achieved only in an atmosphere of tolerance and rationality.

As early as September 1918, Zhang Dongsun proposed that an ideal personality should be refined and kind, as opposed to vulgar and arbitrary (*Learning Light*, September 16, 1918). To achieve such a personality, a liberal arts education was essential: “Look at British people; even a hairdresser knows John Milton’s poems, so no wonder their courtesy is so desirable.” (*Learning Light*, September 16, 1918). Zhang Dongsun believed that acquiring such a personality was a precondition to participating in the discussions of a public sphere. This belief enabled his style as chief editor to be polite, mild, and significantly more low-key than many left-wing editors. From the May Fourth era and throughout the 1930s, left-wing intellectuals, such as Lu Xun and Chen Duxiu, tended to be honored as “advisors of the youth” (*qingnian daoshi*), partly because their forthright arguments against social injustice sparked hero worship in the minds of many young people. The left wing possessed an elitist consciousness as vanguards and leaders, often implicitly positioning themselves above the common man or woman, and they tended to “preach” to and “teach” the masses (*baixing*). People, especially young intellectuals, admired and “listened to” them. In comparison, moderate intellectuals, such as Zhang Dongsun and Hu Shi,⁴ tended to show up with a more mild attitude. They were the ones whom common people and young intellectuals felt they could have easy conversations with. For example, in December 1919, a young rank-and-file soldier wrote to Zhang Dongsun to question his arguments on the military situation of the world. In his reply, Zhang Dongsun used honorifics to address the soldier and in the end modestly stated that the soldier’s opinions were not necessarily correct (*Learning Light*, December 20, 1919). The moderates also differed from the left wing in that they tended to avoid face-to-face confrontations and preferred to comment on the actual facts rather than on particular objects. For instance, in November 1919, an anonymous reader revealed a scandal that might involve a famous publishing house. Zhang Dongsun, in his comments, did not even mention the name of the publisher as the reader had done; instead, he referred to it as “some book company” and then focused on the scandal itself.

Numerous “unknown” people developed an affinity toward Zhang Dongsun’s mild and polite style and thus were attracted to the discussions in *Learning Light*, where they could talk about their opinions freely without fearing public humiliation. Sensitive young intellectuals did not need to worry that their fragile academic egos would be hurt when facing Zhang Dongsun and his coeditors. The discussions were mostly concentrated in the correspondence section. The layout of *Learning Light*, like that of many other journals and newspaper supplements of that era, carved out different sections for political commentaries, translations, new literature, and others. Most of the journals and newspaper supplements had a correspondence section, which was a column for publishing letters from the audience as well as editors’ replies. Thanks to the approachable personality of Zhang Dongsun, the volume of the letters in the correspondence section of *Learning Light* was among the top of its peers. The other most popular correspondence section was in *Awakening*, the *fukan* of *Republican Daily*, whose chief editor was Shao Lizi, serving as the “peacemaker” for the negotiations between the Nationalist Party and the Communist Party at several crucial historical junctures during

his life. Obviously, Zhang Dongsun and Shao Lizi shared a competence of communicating with different groups of interests.

The correspondence section not only strengthened the feature of the *fukan* as a model for a public sphere but also bore out the goals of the New Culture–May Fourth Movement. The correspondence section had its counterparts in China’s earliest newspapers, such as the *Shenbao*, but at that time, the letters in the section were written in classic Chinese and the topics were quite limited. In the correspondence section of left-wing journals such as *La Jeunesse*, the tone, wording, and structure of the letters were formal, and the topics were mostly about serious academic and intellectual issues. In contrast, the letters in the correspondence section of *Learning Light* and *Awakening* were written in a vivid colloquial style. This certainly went far to encourage the development of vernacular Chinese, a cornerstone of the New Culture Movement. Moreover, these letters did not have to be well organized essays or focus on a certain thesis or argument. They flowed organically with the contours of the writer’s (in some cases untrained) mind. One letter could touch several random topics. Objectively, this sped up the spread and exchange of information and formed a virtual network among the readers. For instance, one could talk about religion and church schools in the letter and end by soliciting a book from Zhang Dongsun, or he could deliver his opinions on breaking social events at length and in depth and then share information on applying for colleges in France, which might interest the readers who sought to study abroad. The correspondence section therefore worked in a fashion similar to online electronic message boards today, and the editors played the role of discussion leaders of these message boards.

As the readership and topics of debate broadened, discrepancies, contentions, and even conflicts naturally emerged. Zhang Dongsun and his coeditors realized the lack of civility in the discussions and sensed that if they did not approach issues with discipline, the nascent public sphere would be ruined. They adopted a guideline based on tolerance and rationality.

The major writers to realize the lack of civil discourse were Lan Gongwu and Kuang Seng. Both of them were Zhang Dongsun’s friends, and Kuang Seng was also the coeditor of *Learning Light*. Lan Gongwu pointed out, “In Europe and America, the more people argue, the closer people are to the truth. In China, that is a totally different story. People only get more confused. The reason is that everyone fears to lose face and would not admit that other people are stronger than themselves, which is totally irrational. Thus any kind of debate turns out to be a political struggle ... people like to compare others’ defects with their own strength. ... The only purpose is to win. In so doing, they attack trivial things rather than look at the general argument so that sometimes in the end they forget what they are arguing about” (*Learning Light*, February 28, 1919). Kuang Seng used a metaphor to describe this situation: “When Westerners argue, they act like two cars driving toward the same direction along different parallel lanes, so they are always moving forward and making progress, while we Chinese are like two cars driving face-to-face in the same lane, only to end in a crash” (*Learning Light*, March 1, 1919).

Both Lan Gongwu and Kuang Seng attributed the existence of such attitudes to the left-wing intellectuals associated with *La Jeunesse*, including Chen Duxiu.⁵ In January 1920, Chen published “An Open Letter to the Comrades of the New Culture

Movement,” and soon, a couple of “comrades” replied to the open letter, complaining that Chen Duxiu was so eager and hasty to attack that he did not even look through each comrade’s opinions and then confused the two (*China Times*, January 1920). The left wing’s style could be seen as a continuity of the tradition of Chinese political culture that the oppositional party could never substantially exist—as the saying goes, “one mountain cannot accommodate two tigers.” There are studies even attempting to relate the Chinese left to the Jacobins of the French Revolution, arguing that the culture of intolerance implied genealogical connections between the two (Gao 1991).

Learning Light was the first among its contemporaries to point out that the culture of intolerance would negatively influence the New Culture and May Fourth Movements and, in the longer term, the future of public life in China, whether in public debate or public policy. In contrast, though Lan Gongwu and Kuang Seng did criticize the language style of left-wing intellectuals, they objectively stated that it was the dark social reality, rather than the left-wing intellectuals, that should take the blame. Lan Gongwu believed “it is no doubt that the achievement of *La Jeunesse* in this intellectual revolution is paramount ... some people said that *La Jeunesse* curses too much, but I do not agree. Today’s China is full of things that deserve to be cursed ... cursing is unavoidable as long as the decaying old things still exist” (*Learning Light*, March 1, 1919). He further explained that he was not justifying cursing but that “we just should learn to discern different curses. It is reasonable to curse social injustice; however, if you intended to use mean words to attack your rival, then it makes an ill habit. ... The debate itself was to show the audience the opinions from both sides, not to eradicate either one of the two sides. ... Were *La Jeunesse* to delete those mean words, their reputation would be doubled” (*Learning Light*, March 1, 1919).

In setting the rule of language use in this public sphere, Kuang Seng specifically wrote an editorial, “The Attitudes of Debaters,” and Zhang Dongsun placed the article in the most prominent position of that issue of *Learning Light*: “The debate is not for honor but for truth. ... To reach truth, we need to ‘eliminate self and work for public interests (*Quji Shanggong*).’ ... Any kind of hegemony or disregard of others is only to degrade oneself. ... So we should respect rationality and hold back emotion, pursue truth rather than unnecessary conflicts” (*Learning Light*, March 20, 1919). According to this rule advocating rationality and tolerance, Zhang Dongsun and his colleagues moderated multiple discussions and debates on contemporary social and political issues and events, among which the discussion on the “student wave” in 1919 was the most influential one.

DISCUSSION ON THE “STUDENT WAVE (*XUECHAO*)”

The term “student wave” refers to the student demonstration that happened on May 4, 1919, as well as the strikes in the following months. During this turbulent time, various print media in China expressed their concerns in their own ways. What is worth noting is the differences between newspapers and *fukans* in the treatment of the student wave. In most cases, newspapers such as the *Shenbao* performed the basic job of print media: reporting the breaking news in a timely fashion, combining pictures, vivid descriptions, sometimes exaggerating for eye-catching purpose, with random comments from famous

pressmen, distinguished scholars, or senior officials. To a large degree, their treatment of these issues was based on commercial interests. *Fukans*, on the other hand, solicited viewpoints and suggestions from every possible reader the circulation could reach. In this sense, the discussions published in *fukans* were more representative of public opinion, and *fukans* are therefore a closer definition of the public spheres than are big commercial newspapers.

Learning Light followed the student wave from March, when the tensions between Peking University and the warlord government emerged, until the student wave's final pacification in September. The articles selected by Zhang Dongsun and his coeditors proposed concrete and pragmatic measures and suggestions, trying to protect the interests of the students and to avoid any unnecessary loss and destruction. It should be pointed out that holding back radicalism does not mean they exhibited less courage or bore less responsibility for patriotic endeavors. The moderate intellectuals were unlike the left wing, which, both in language and action, glorified sacrifice and devotion regardless of the price.

Compared to those in other *fukans*, the articles about the student wave published in *Learning Light* possessed three prominent characteristics. First, many of them consciously regulated the relations between the different interests involved, including government, students, teachers, and all levels of civil societies, which highlighted the role of *Learning Light* as part of the public sphere. Second, they not only recognized the patriotic contribution of the student wave but also (and perhaps more so) emphasized its significance in Chinese enlightenment. The articles published in *Learning Light* gave credit to the students' courage but were cool-headedly aware that students alone could not make much of a difference. They cared more about the development of people's civic values than about the call for "all Chinese to unite to fight." The authors of these articles valued the experiences of self-government that emerged among student organizations, which in their eyes was part of the same continuum of local self-government that had started to emerge in the late Qing period. The young students' practice might prepare for building democracy in China. In other words, the student wave was an enlightenment movement with a patriotic face. Third, as the student wave began to come to a close, *Learning Light* was one of the earliest among all *fukans* to reflect upon this movement's legacies, including both positive and problematic ones.

The earliest two related pieces on student activism appeared in March 1919, when the student wave was being fermented. *Learning Light* agreed with the left wing on criticizing the dictatorship of the warlord government but also pointed out the defects within the intelligentsia (*xuejie*). The first article was entitled "Voicing Discontent on Behalf of Expelled University Professors" and argued that it was a violation of the freedom of speech to expell Chen Duxiu and Hu Shi from Peking University for their writings against the warlords (*Learning Light*, March 5, 1919). This was followed by "The Expulsion of University Professors Should Serve as a Warning to All Parties Involved," written by Zuo Xuexun, a professor of Fudan University (*Learning Light*, March 11, 1919). Zuo mentioned that because the government was already unpopular, the intelligentsia should not hurt itself with internal factional struggles: "I heard that the professors and students at Peking University were divided into two groups: the new

faction and the old faction. The two cannot stand with each other under the same roof and often generate emotion-driven conflicts (*ganqing yongshi*). ... The government will take advantage of this to turn down our appeals” (*Learning Light*, March 11, 1919). “Emotion-driven” was used, as opposed to rational treatment, which *Learning Light* had advocated all along. Zuo Xuexun also used the term *dangtongfayi*, which literally means “form cliques with those similar and destroy those who dissent,” to describe how intense the relation between the two factions could be.

As the student movement progressed, it became more and more apparent that left and moderate intellectuals played sharply different roles. The left intellectuals more often acted as spiritual leaders while the moderates were better in taking care of pragmatic issues. The students of early May 1919 sometimes engaged in radical acts, including injuring their bodies (e.g., writing out a slogan in one’s own blood) to demonstrate their passion for the cause. After that, throughout May and June, the left wing continued their heroic acts of radicalism. Chen Duxiu and his student followers spread pamphlets in parks and teahouses in Beijing, activities that eventually led to Chen Duxiu’s arrest in mid-June. During this period, besides *La Jeunesse*, Chen Duxiu edited another famous journal called *Weekly Commentaries (Meizhou Pinglun)*. In this journal, he published “Research Room and Jail,” one of his most inspiring pieces: “World civilization originated from two kinds of places: scientific research rooms and jails. We young people must learn to take turns to live in research rooms and jails, and this is the true high-minded life. Civilization born out of these two places is true civilization” (*Weekly Commentaries*, June 8, 1919).

The left wing was generally more gifted than the moderates in writing and in using rhetorical devices. Though many of these writers had long advocated vernacular Chinese, they often combined traditional poetic writing skills with their vernacular prose to make their articles more phonetically pleasant, a practice reminiscent of late-Qing revolutionary pamphlets written by Zou Rong and Chen Tianhua, and thus appealing to ardent young people. For example, Li Dazhao used to passionately exclaim, “I wish for nothing more for my beloved youth than to live in youth and die in youth” (*La Jeunesse*, September 1, 1916), and Chen Duxiu claimed that “we shall never decline (our responsibility) even if we must be beheaded and shed blood” (*La Jeunesse*, January 15, 1919). Of course, this was indispensable in creating the great and symbolic historic events that are remembered and celebrated by later generations. When it came to realist struggles, however, this radicalism might cause unnecessary losses.

With no less moral courage than intellectuals on the left, moderate intellectuals, often using plain language, paid more attention to the actual effects of concrete measures. By May 19, 1919, groups of students had been arrested, and Cai Yuanpei, then president of Peking University, was forced to leave office. The original purpose of the student strike had been to support Cai retaining his position and to protest against Japanese attempts at formalizing its acquisition of Shandong. The moderates agreed with the left on the just nature of the strike but were reserved in terms of strategy. Their primary concern was controlling the scale of the strike:

We need to be clear that the purpose of student strike is to ask Sir Cai (Yuanpei) back. ... We should unite with other

powers to press the government to release the arrested students rather than limitlessly broaden the scale of the strike. ... In Shanghai, many primary school students joined the strike, and they do not even understand what is happening. ... Also we need to consider how long should the strike last, and after all, study should be the major task for students. (*Learning Light*, May 21, 1919)⁶

Some stated frankly that the student strike was not an effective measure at all: Japanese encroachment could not be stopped, but the education of Chinese youth, who were the hope of China, was being delayed (*Learning Light*, May 23, 1919).

On May 27, 1919, *Learning Light* published a formal announcement soliciting opinions about how to solve the problem of the student strike:

Since the college students in Beijing started the strike, other cities followed. The patriotic affection should be commended. However, the overall strike was a huge sacrifice to our society and country. We must reach a desirable effect worth this sacrifice. So we hereby solicit opinions about (1) What measures should the students take during the strike? (2) What kind of attitude should college professors and staff have? (3) How do all the sections of society view the strike?

This announcement recognized the justice of the strike, which was no different than the left wing, but it made clear, by noting, “one-sided accounts of events would not be published” (*Learning Light*, May 27, 1919), that the moderates cared more about the actual effect, such as how to avoid or diminish unnecessary loss by all means. There was nothing wrong with pursuing justice and progress, yet to prepare for the future in the event that their pursuits could not be immediately realized, it was important that every part of their forces be protected—that is to say, the security of hundreds of thousands of individual students be secured. Furthermore, the announcement stated clearly that what the *fukan* wanted was concrete solutions, not slogans. Chow Tse-tung mentioned in his book (1960) that *Shishi Xinbao* (the *China Times*) and *Minguo Ribao* gained popularity for their follow-up on the student wave. The reason for the popularity of *Shishi Xinbao* lay at least in part in the opinion soliciting of *Learning Light*, which made every effort to make the interests of the students a priority.

Opinions, most of which were quite detailed, swarmed in during the following days. The authors of these articles were Shanghai citizens from various backgrounds. For example, a writer with a Daoist pen name, *guanyu*, suggested that students should divide their labor, with energetic ones going to other cities to lecture and bookish ones staying local (*Learning Light*, May 29, 1919). Another writer, with the pen named *zongyuan*, with a Buddhist stylization, contributed tips on public lecturing:

Students are unable to avoid passionate words in their lectures, but I hope you guys can be a little more reserved:

Japanese are seeking excuses to send troops, do not give them any. They also cannot wait to see us behave like the Boxers and spread rumors to the international community, so never express xenophobic emotions. Some people think the strike is meaningless; then you need to explain your grievances patiently. (*Learning Light*, May 31, 1919)

Chow Tse-Tsung (1960) pointed out that one reason for Shanghai to take Beijing's place as the center of the student wave was that the students in Shanghai "seemed" to know more clearly the power of the classes of merchants and workers and thus were the first across the country to unite with the two groups. This argument could not be more accurate, but Chow did not examine the question of how, as it was not the focus of his book. The answer to this question can be found from the opinions published in response to *Learning Light*'s solicitation of opinions on the student strike.

At the beginning, the students themselves did not realize that they could mobilize the merchants—not until it was later suggested: "Now the students [are] striking, but they alone cannot make it. [They] have to unite the merchants and the industrialists to intimidate the government. Now the chamber of commerce has been controlled by national traitors, so [the students] must make every effort to push the reorganization of the chamber" (*Learning Light*, May 28, 1919). This opinion was published on May 28, which means by then, the students and merchants had not yet united, which accords with Chow's (1960) description that the merchants and the industrialists "seemed" to not support the students. Following that opinion, more people gave concrete suggestions, such as "Though somebody has suggested reorganizing the chamber of commerce, how can we persuade those merchants who only care about profits? Hometown fraternity is an easy way to go (*xiangyi jihou, lianluo jiaoyi*). Cantonese students should turn to the guild of Canton (*yuebang*), and Ningpo students should turn to the guild of Ningpo (*yongbang*). ... We should notice that a great portion of our students' fathers and brothers are merchants or industrialists, why not go home often" (*Learning Light*, May 29, 1919).

Later news reports showed that these suggestions were effective, and this fact can, at least to some degree, demonstrate the role of the *fukan* as a part of the public sphere that regulated civil societies. *Learning Light* helped students negotiate with, besides the merchants and industrialists, all other parties involved. There were opinions meant to persuade the government and simultaneously remind the students not to propose too many appeals for the government to handle at once (*Learning Light*, May 28, 1919). Some parents of the students requested university professors to not stop teaching, even though teaching time had to diminish. A self-proclaimed "insider" suggested that the students could unite with all other members of society except the military, because the complexities within military troops were beyond the reach of young students (*Learning Light*, May 30, 1919). There were even compliments on a certain group of the police for their maintenance of order to avoid casualties during the strike (*Learning Light*, May 29, 1919).

Throughout the student wave, the left wing emphasized the theme of national salvation and sacrifice for truth, while the moderates, through their continuing concerns

for concrete and pragmatic issues that emerged during the strike, found that the real significance of this movement, labeled as patriotic and anti-imperialistic by left-wing elites, lay in its practice of the enlightened principles that had been advocated since the beginning of the New Culture Movement around 1915. In other words, the left wing focused on high ideals, while the right wing cared more about the implications of changes that affected countless people. Metaphorically speaking, the left wing stood on center stage to be worshiped and memorialized, while the moderates made up the backdrop. From June to July 1919, Zhang Dongsun and his coeditors published several opinions that dealt with the enlightenment dimension of the student strike, and it seemed a gesture to their left-wing counterpart: No matter how pressing the call of national salvation was, the pursuit of enlightenment should not be abandoned.

Many of these opinions were about the National Student Union established during the student wave—a mark of progress in self-consciousness and gender equality. The union was the first student organization in China that recruited both male and female members (Chow 1960). “This great union across the nation marks a great awakening of college students. This was not just made for the issue of Shandong or for the secret diplomacy with Japan. It is a congregation that strives for themselves, not just to fight against the authority of the warlord government” (*Learning Light*, July 7, 1919). John Dewey, the world-renowned American educator, also joined this discussion. He wrote his opinions to Dr. Jiang Menglin, a top administrator at Peking University, and then *Learning Light* published the translation by Jiang. Dewey suggested that the union system be kept forever and expected that all the female students in China take this as the first step and then start their own course of participation in politics, just like women in the United States (*Learning Light*, May 31, 1919).

The performance of college students during this turbulent time was also seen as an example of the practice of local self-government, following trends that had started to emerge since the late Qing period. The power of students to influence the government might be limited, but people found a silver lining:

Dr. Dewey said that a school is a miniature of society. At school, students should learn how to behave in society as well as textbook knowledge. Students should be able to manage themselves. We taught local self-government in the textbook of politics, but before the student wave, they never had a chance to practice it. This time they organized themselves, and they did even better than a conference of college professors in terms of maintaining order and division of labor. ... Our China has tried the experiment of local self-government in the late Qing and were promised a good future in the beginning of the Republican period. But since Yuan Shikai took the throne, the first thing he did was to abolish local self-government. When it comes to the election of the legislature, people could sell their personal dignity and citizenship for a bribe of a three-hundred silver

certificate. ... Merchants belong to the upper middle class of society; [they should have taken more responsibilities] but they always claimed “businessmen only do business (*zai shang yan shang*).” So our people do not take any responsibilities for local society. Now when we want to restore local self-government, the student wave provides a precious opportunity for practice. This time the students formed a union, and they actually put the knowledge of “separation of powers” learnt from textbooks into place, such as setting up elections and organizing the board of executives, which helped them accumulate rich experiences for the future. ... One day when they stepped out of the school gates, they could go ahead to continue ideals we have had since the late Qing. (*Learning Light*, June 3, 1919).

Kuang Seng, as coeditor of *Learning Light*, in his commentary, added other details regarding the development of civic values (see *Learning Light*, July 3–4, 1919). For example, the students aided the citizens of Shanghai in identifying fake and inferior goods when they delivered lectures on boycotting Japanese goods. Students also paid great attention to the maintenance of sanitation in the city.

Kuang Seng emphasized that a remarkable achievement made by the student wave was that people changed the custom of simply obeying their superiors and instead learned to work as a team, which implied equal participation of all members. Since the New Culture Movement had begun, various scholars had advocated liberty and equality on paper, but most people, including students, did not have many opportunities to experience them in everyday life or as a political reality. Most of them still had to obey family patriarchs in choosing their spouses. Consequently, many articles against arranged marriages were published in journals and newspapers. Even Sun Yat-sen, the “progressive” national father, still compelled his followers to pledge allegiance to him in 1914, not to mention the despotic bureaucracy of the warlord government. Kuang Seng, through his interview with the students participating in the strike, sensed that “they have learned to tell the difference between ‘respect’ and ‘obey.’ They respect the decisions made by the board of the student union, which also include their own will by voting, but never obey blindly” (*Learning Light*, July 3–4, 1919).

In September, after Chen Duxiu was released from jail, both the left and the moderates began to reflect on the student wave. The left wing concluded that “truth eventually won over might,”⁷ but Zhang Dongsun and his coeditors again took a different approach, describing the student wave with disenchantment and attempting to show future generations the truth behind the beginning of the wave. Zhang Dongsun believed that there must be reasons, other than nationalist sentiment, that made the student demonstrations spread so quickly from Beijing to Shanghai and other cities, and he thus called for articles on this topic. Among all the articles in response, Zhang Dongsun expressed appreciation for an article titled “Student Demonstration and Mass Psychology,” authored by Ms. Ma Jiandong. This pen name

literally means “strengthen the East,” with a masculine connotation. It is easy to imagine that the author was a typical “new woman” during the May Fourth era.

Ma Jiandong gave this account of the rapid formation of the national-scale student demonstration:

Everyone has individual consciousness based on their own choice. However, individual consciousness disappears when a mass psychology is formed. When the masses gather and take to the street, even most quiet people would follow, without knowing that their own individual consciousness has disappeared. ... People without consciousness are brave ... they just do what the masses do. ... For example, if a scientist mistakenly reports that Halley’s Comet will hit the earth, then everyone will feel that the end of the world is near. Similarly, when an eloquent scholar delivers a moving lecture and sends out posters with giant characters stating that their mission is the “salvation” of China, then everyone will feel that the time to destroy the old world has come, regardless of reality, and will believe that Rome can be built in one day so long as everyone goes onto the street. (*Learning Light*, September 26, 1919)

Ma also argued that the demonstration based on this kind of approach ran the risk of either disintegrating, being taken advantage of by enemies of the students, or leading to blood being shed in vain.

Learning Light was the one of the few, if not the only, intellectual-edited publications that revealed the problematic side of the student wave. Zhang Dongsun’s articles in this regard actually resonated with the rising tide of iconoclasm in 1919 and 1920. When the left-wing cultural elites called on people to beat down various religious and secular icons, many of them just ignored a simple fact that they were minting the name “May Fourth” as a new icon, in that the May Fourth Movement was synonymous with justice and victory. Whenever the government violates its duty, following the precedent of the May Fourth Movement, people can take to the street and demonstrate, believing that their actions must invariably lead to success because the people who participate all bear indomitable truth in their hearts. This was a misleading mythologized narrative. Zhang Dongsun and the authors of *Learning Light* attempted to counteract this narrative, trying to leave a more realistic record for future generations. In this sense, the moderates went further in the enlightenment project than did the left wing. Actually, during the movement, they had already done similar work: The publishing of opinions on how to mobilize merchants indicated that it was the lineage and native place networks, rather than patriotic passions, that finally put things into place.

CONCLUSION

The *fukan*, as a tradition unique to Chinese newspapers, functioned as a very to-the-point model of the public sphere in late 1910s and early 1920s, thanks to both extrinsic and intrinsic causes. The extrinsic lies in the fact that the May Fourth era was the most “free” period in Chinese history since the Autumn and Spring and the Warring States periods. The last imperial dynasty had collapsed and the new authoritarian regime of Chiang Kai-Shek was yet to be established, and the power vacuum in this interim allowed *fukan* to remain free from harsh censorship. The intrinsic cause was obviously the conscious efforts of leading intellectuals who served as chief editors, with Zhang Dongsun as a typical representative. Under the leadership of and the discipline set by Zhang Dongsun and his colleagues, *Learning Light* incorporated voices across the social stratum and the political spectrum, denying monopoly and disrespect, which demonstrated a strong Habermasian feature. In this sense, *fukan*, as a print public sphere, could also be regarded as one achievement of the May Fourth Movement.

Both left and moderate intellectuals contributed to construct this public sphere, in their respective ways. The left were more glamorous as spiritual leaders, offering high ideals shining in the spotlight of the historical stage. In comparison, the moderates served as pragmatic organizers, building the blocks and setting a benevolent environment for the stage. The left pointed out the direction for the youth to pursue, while the moderates helped the youth more with overcoming specific difficulties down the road. In spite of the differences, the left and moderates shared the same moral courage regarding public affairs.

ENDNOTES

1. The other three, respectively, were the *fukans* of *Chenbao (Morning News)*, *Jingbao (Capital News)*, and *Minguo ribao (Republican Daily)*, which was titled *Juewu*, or *Awakening*.
2. On May 4, 1919, college students in Beijing (Peking) led a protest against what was regarded as the spineless acquiescence of the Chinese delegation to the Versailles Peace Conference in ceding the former German concessions in China to Japan. Soon, student protests sprang up in other big cities as well. The May Fourth Incident gave its name to the broader and lengthier era of cultural renewal from the collapse of the Qing empire in 1911. This era spanned from 1915, when Hu Shi, Chen Duxiu, and their peers first launched the New Culture Movement, up to around 1926. Later generations call this era the May Fourth era and often refer to the New Culture Movement as the May Fourth–New Culture Movement. Hu Shi and Chen Duxiu were, respectively, the liberalist and left-wing leaders of the movement.
3. For example, though Zhang Dongsun was a liberal intellectual and Liu Yazhi, editor in chief of *Awakening*, was pro-left (in many historical occasions during life), they shared a similar centrist editorial style.
4. Hu Shi had a famous saying: “Tolerance is more important than freedom.”

5. Chen Duxiu and Li Dazhao, both distinguished professors of humanities and social sciences of Peking University, were two of the most prominent left-wing leaders of the time.
6. For an extended discussion of Shanghai demonstrations of this period, see Wasserstrom (1991).
7. These are Li Dazhao's words.

REFERENCES

- Awakening* [*fukan*]. 1919–1922.
- Chenbao* (*Morning News*) *Fukan*. 1919–1926.
- Chow, Tse-tsung. 1960. *The May Fourth Movement: Intellectual Revolution in Modern China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University.
- Gao, Yi. 1991. *Falanxi Fengge: Da Geming de Zhengzhiwenhua* (*The French Style: The Political Culture of the Revolution*). Hangzhou: Zhejiang People's Publishing House.
- Habermas, Jürgen. 1989. *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society*. Translation. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Jingbao* (*Capital News*) *Fukan*. 1920–1924.
- La Jeunesse* [Chinese culture journal] 1919.
- Landes, Joan. 1988. *Women and the Public Sphere in the Age of the French Revolution*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Learning Light* [*fukan*]. 1919–1924.
- Meizhou Pinglun* (*Weekly Commentaries*) [Chinese journal]. 1919.
- Minguo ribao* (*Republican Daily*) [Chinese newspaper]. 1919–1923.
- Shenbao* [Chinese newspaper]. 1919.
- Shishi xinbao* (*China Times*). 1911–1937.
- Wasserstrom, Jeffrey N. 1991. *Student Protests in Twentieth Century China: The View from Shanghai*. Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press.

***Still No Jetpacks or Gender Parity:
Animated Film from 1980 through 2016****

SARA C. HARE
Indiana University Southeast

ABSTRACT

This study examines the gender ratio of characters in the 150 top-grossing full-length animated films from 1980 through 2016. Results show that males hold an overwhelming majority of both central and auxiliary roles. Male characters fill significantly more of the lead or protagonist roles, the speaking roles, the members of the protagonist's main gang, and the film's titles. No significant change has occurred over the years (1980–2016) to alter the gender balance; however, an increase in female authors and screenwriters corresponds with an increase in female characters in all of these roles. The underrepresentation of female characters in animated films exemplifies the ways in which popular media reflects and reproduces social inequality.

KEY WORDS Content Analysis; Gender Roles; Children's Media; Stereotypes

Films from Hollywood's Disney, Pixar, DreamWorks, and other studios are among the current-day storytellers for children. Whereas children in the past listened to family stories or books read by adults, children today are increasingly spending time watching stories produced by large film and television studios (Kaiser Family Foundation 2010). In fact, television viewing is displacing one-on-one communication between children and adults in the United States (Christakis et al. 2009). Now with DVD players, computers, and handheld devices, the time that US children spend with entertainment media has increased to an average of 7.5 hours daily for youth 8–18 years old, and with "media multitasking," they consume almost 11 hours of content daily (Kaiser Family Foundation 2010).

The purpose of this content analysis study is to assess the number of male and female characters in a medium that is very popular with children: animated film. In animated film, there should be no limits to the abilities of characters; female swashbucklers can be drawn as easily as male swashbucklers. In a medium in which insects can talk and tasty food can drop from the sky, our imaginations need not be

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Sara C. Hare, Associate Professor of Sociology, Indiana University Southeast, 4201 Grant Line Road, New Albany, IN 47150; schare@ius.edu; (812) 941-2161.

confined to traditional and tired gender stereotypes. Animals and inanimate objects brought to life in animated film are not inherently male.

This study is not limited to one particular film studio (such as Disney) but includes all major studios producing popular animated movies. Although most of these films are developed by US companies, their influence and distribution are worldwide (MPAA 2015). The current study uses the 150 top-grossing animated films (based on US and Canadian box office receipts) from 1980 through 2016, assessing the sex of characters in the lead roles, film-title roles, main entourage, and speaking roles. It asks whether the sex ratio has changed with more recent films or when more of the screenwriters and authors are female. This study contributes to the existing literature by incorporating a large sample of the most popular animated films released since 1980. By exposing the distorted proportion of male to female characters in these films, this study raises awareness about the marginalization of females in stories predominantly consumed by children.

Most stories for children teach important moral lessons while they entertain. Moskalenko (2008) states that children are socialized through interactions with adults, other children, and material such as fairy tales. Mass media influences the cultivation of values, beliefs, dreams, and expectations (Swindler 1986). Gender development is one of the key aspects of socialization (Gooden and Gooden 2001). Children learn about gender through observation of others, personal experiences, and stories. As social cognitive theorists contend, people learn about the world through interactions and personal experiences, and media functions as a form of interaction (Bandura 1986). Children learn from media just as they learn from real-world models of behavior. For example, girls' participation in archery has doubled since 2012, and 70 percent of those girls have said that the female protagonists in *The Hunger Games* and *Brave* influenced their decision to take up the sport (Geena Davis Institute on Gender in Media 2016a). Children learn conceptions of masculinity and femininity and the expected characteristics that are appropriate for each gender. Bian, Leslie, and Cimpian (2017) find changes in girls between ages five and seven. At five years old, both boys and girls think that their own gender can be "really, really smart." By the next year or two, girls (but not boys) are significantly less likely to associate brilliance with their own gender. Social learning is increased by the repetition of the message that occurs when children watch videos repeatedly. These stereotypes that children absorb have lasting effects on how they see and process social information and, as Bandura (1986) notes, how they use their capabilities.

Studies have found that children (as well as adults [Signorielli 1989]) who spend more time watching television exhibit greater gender-role stereotyping than do children who spend less time (Frueh and McGhee 1975). They pick up on the media differences at an early age; US children as young as four years notice that boys appear more often than girls in television cartoons (Thompson and Zerbinos 1997). Preschool boys who watch more superhero programs play in more male-stereotyped ways, and the impact is still evident a year later (Coyne et al. 2014). A longitudinal panel survey of 396 children found that increased television exposure correlated with decreased self-esteem for African American children and for white girls. White boys' self-esteem, however, increased with television viewing (Martins and Harrison 2011). Other studies (Tognoli,

Pullen, and Lieber 1994) contend that gender bias in children's media gives boys a sense of entitlement and lowers girls' self-esteem. Furthermore, Thorne (1993) notes that children's understandings of gender are constructed as social processes involving groups of kids. Children police each other in delineating the boundaries of what is acceptable behavior for girls and boys. Thus, the children who do absorb greater quantities of children's media and the subsequent stereotypes spread their understanding of gender roles to other children. Signorielli (1989) argues that children, in perceiving these differences, learn that females are less important than males.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Because media are a primary source of gender socialization (Bandura 1986), it is important to know how (and how often) males and females are portrayed in these works for children. Research on this topic began in earnest in the 1970s, focusing initially on children's books. Weitzman et al. (1972) analyzed Caldecott (1938–1972) and Newbery (1922–1972) award-winning children's books as well as the best selling of the inexpensive Little Golden Books and found that male characters outnumbered females three to one. Other studies mirrored these findings (Czaplinski 1972; Davis and McDaniel 1999; LaDow 1976). The Notable Children's Books list of picture books (selected by the American Library Association) have more equal representation, as Gooden and Gooden (2001) found with books from 1995 through 1999, as do Coretta Scott King Awards books (illustrated by African Americans) and Pura Belpré books (illustrated by Latinos and Latinas), according to a study by Clark et al. (2007). Nonetheless, in a comprehensive study of several thousand children's books published throughout the twentieth century, McCabe et al. (2011) found that males were represented in the titles nearly twice as often as females.

Studies of the male-to-female ratio in US children's television shows produce similar findings. Male characters are used two to three times more often than are female characters, as Baker and Raney (2004) found in 44 animated Saturday-morning children's programs. Smith and Cook (2008) had similar findings with 1,034 television shows for children broadcast in the United States in 2005, in that roughly twice as many male as female characters were represented. Furthermore, they found that animated programs in particular were more likely to have higher rates of male characters. Findings by Thompson and Zerbinos (1995) concurred: Males had three times as many leads as females in 41 different children's cartoons broadcast in the United States in 1993. Educational television for children provides the best balance of characters (based on 23 educational programs aired on PBS in 1997), but even here, males outnumber females 59 percent to 41 percent (Barner 1999).

Studies of children's films are similar to those of films for adults. Smith et al. (2010) examined the top-grossing 1990–2005 G-rated films released theatrically in North America and found that 72 percent of the characters were male. Other studies by Smith (Smith and Cook 2008) show that films for children use slightly more female characters than do films for older audiences. Of 400 popular North American films released between 1990 and 2006, G-rated films had a 2.5:1 ratio of male to female characters, a slightly

better ratio than for films rated PG, PG-13, or R. A new software program that automatically records the screen and speaking time for characters was used to analyze the 100 top-grossing non-animated films from 2015 and found that males got almost twice the screen and speaking time as females (Geena Davis Institute 2016b). For films with male lead characters, the differences were exacerbated: Males spoke three times longer and had nearly three times the screen time. When females led films, the speaking and screen times of males and females was roughly equal. Similarly, Smith, Choueiti, and Pieper (2016) found that males were given 69.7 percent of the speaking roles from the top 800 films released from 2007 to 2015. Thus is posed the first hypothesis of this study:

H₁: Male characters will outnumber female characters in protagonist roles, film titles, members of the main gang, and speaking characters.

The next research area focuses on whether there has been an improvement over time (1980–2016) in the number of female characters that populate our children’s stories. The assumption in starting with films from 1980 was that the second and third waves of the women’s movement would increase the number and prominence of female characters. Findings to date are conflicting, however. The studies of American children’s books over the same time span found no improvement (Davis and McDaniel 1999; Hamilton et al. 2006), nor did the Smith et al. (2010) study of 101 G-rated North American animated and live-action films from 1990 to 2005. Other studies note changes in the gender balance, however. Clark et al. (2007) noticed a curvilinear pattern with highs in visibility for females in children’s books in the early 1980s and lows in the 1960s and 2000s. There was some noted improvement in a study of US cartoons from 1935 through 1992, which found that from 1980 on, males were used 2 to 1, an improvement from the earlier 3 to 1 (Thompson and Zerbinos 1995). Thus, I pose the second hypothesis:

H₂: The gender composition of characters in the roles of protagonist, film title, members of the main gang, and speaking characters will become more equal over time (1980–2016).

In addition, this study looked for factors that influenced the male-to-female ratio in these films, focusing on the specific question of whether the gender of the authors and screenwriters had an impact on the number of male and female characters. There are conflicting findings from children’s books. Earlier studies found that regardless of the gender of the author, the lead character in children’s stories—when a gender could be determined—was usually male (Keintz 1987; Kolbe and LaVoie 1981; Tognoli et al. 1994). In a more recent study (Hamilton et al. 2006), male authors of children’s books published in the United States from 1995 through 2001 were three times more likely to use male than female title characters, and female authors produced books with only slightly more male title characters (55 percent compared to female title characters at 45

percent). Female authors may be a key factor in giving more female characters a chance at the central roles.

How do the numbers of male and female characters compare when females write for animated film? Unfortunately, women fill few of the author and screenwriter roles for popular film, ranging from 8 percent to 18 percent of employed screenwriters in recent US studies (Bielby and Bielby 1996; Eschholz, Bufkin, and Long 2002; Smith et al. 2008, 2009). Lauzen (2016), in following behind-the-scenes employment on the top 250 US films annually, notes that female writers have decreased from 13 percent in 1998 to 11 percent in 2015. While Smith et al.'s (2008) study of Academy Award-nominated films (1977–2006) found no significant relationship between the numbers of females onscreen and the writers' genders, Smith et al.'s (2009) 2007's top films found a significant pattern that movies written by one or more female screenwriters depicted a higher percentage of females on screen (34.9 percent) than did films written by solely male screenwriters (28.1 percent). Of the 18 female-driven films in 2007, Smith et al. (2009) noticed that half had one or more women on the writing team. Furthermore, in recent studies of prime-time US television shows, increases in women holding important behind-the-scenes roles (writer, creator, or executive producer) correlated with significant increases in female characters in scripted (but not reality) programming (Lauzen, Dozier, and Cleveland 2006). Glascock (2001) found that increases in female executive producers correlated with increases in female main characters, and increases in female writers correlated with increases in female characters overall. Thus, I pose the third hypothesis:

H₃: An increase in the percentage of female writers is correlated with an increase in females in the protagonist role, film title, members of the main gang, and speaking characters.

DATA AND ANALYSIS

The list of the 200 top-grossing animated full-length films from 1980 through 2016 was compiled according to www.boxofficemojo.com's September 2016 ranking. [Boxofficemojo.com](http://www.boxofficemojo.com) uses the lifetime North American theater grosses to determine a film's ranking. Lifetime gross was then calculated using 2016 inflation-adjusted dollars and retained the top 150 films after excluding those films without cohesive plot lines (*Fantasia 2000*) and those not child-friendly and receiving R ratings (*Sausage Party* and *South Park: Bigger, Longer, and Uncut*). Under the genre of animation, [boxofficemojo.com](http://www.boxofficemojo.com) includes computer-generated animation (*Shrek*), stop-motion animation (*Coraline*), and films that blend live action and animation, such as *Space Jam* (with Michael Jordan playing basketball with Bugs Bunny). Most, but not all, of the top films are US productions, but British Aardman Animation's films made the top 150, as did Japanese anime Pokemon movies.

The names of the writers for each film were retrieved from the films' credits and from the websites IMDbPro, inBaseline, Freebase.com, and Wikipedia. Included was anyone listed in a writing capacity, including authors, writers, screenwriters, story creators, and authors of earlier literary pieces.

Research assistants and I operationalized the variables, coded each film separately, and then met to discuss any discrepancies. We refined the category definitions until the tallies were consistent. Films were re-watched when necessary to validate the counts. Inter-coder reliability was sufficiently high for all variables.

To assess the films' central characters, we used three separate variables. First, we coded whether the film's title was gendered—that is, named after a male or males (*Shrek*, *Mr. Peabody & Sherman*), a female (*Finding Dory*, *Mulan*, *Coraline*), both male(s) and female(s) (*Lilo & Stitch*, *Gnomeo and Juliet*)—or not (*Ice Age*, *Bee Movie*, *Zootopia*). Second, we coded the gender of the lead character in the film. The lead character, or protagonist, was defined as the character whose journey was followed throughout the film and through whose eyes we saw the world. Although the backstory or life history of other characters was frequently included, we coded as lead character the one whose more complete story was told. Third, we coded the gender(s) of the characters in the main gang. In most films, the protagonist has an entourage, a group of friends who travel along and help with the lead's journey. These are the lead character's buddies or sidekicks who make the adventure more fun. For example, in *Madagascar*, Alex finds himself shipwrecked along with his buddies Marty, Gloria, and Melman, and in *Monsters, Inc.*, Sully, Mike, and Boo discover a new source of energy to fuel the city. Parents and older mentors are rarely included in the gang. This variable is admittedly a subjective one, so the coders had to collectively agree on the members of the entourage for each film before coding was completed.

In addition to the central characters, we examined the gender(s) of all the characters that spoke or were named. Even though these characters were frequently animals, robots, or other nonhuman beings, their genders were easily determined by their names, voices, appearances, and mannerisms. Any character whose gender could not be determined was excluded from the analysis. Nonverbal communications and utterances such as booing, hissing, or laughing were not considered speaking. We did not consider singing to be speaking. Furthermore, we needed to see the character onscreen in order to count him or her as a speaking character.

DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS

The 150 North American top-grossing full-length animated films from 1980 through 2016 include many of the films that children have watched and loved over the years. Most of these films are targeted to and appropriate for children, with G and PG ratings (37 percent and 61 percent, respectively). A few films (*The Simpsons Movie*) received the more adult rating of PG-13. As stated earlier, films with an R rating were excluded from the sample. Recent films made the top 150 more often than earlier ones, with nearly one third of the films released from 2011 through 2016, compared to only nine films (6 percent) from the 1980s.

One of our fundamental research areas involved the genders of the central characters. We found that males held the protagonist or lead role in 84.7 percent of the films, many of which were installments of a series of movies. The *Shrek* series had five movies in the top 150 (*Shrek*, *Shrek 2*, *Shrek the Third*, *Shrek Forever After*, and the spin-

off *Puss in Boots*), as did the Ice Age series. The Madagascar series had four, including the spin-off *Penguins of Madagascar*, and the Toy Story and Kung Fu Panda series had three each. Females led in 13.3 percent of the films (*The Little Mermaid*, *Mulan*, *Brave*), but none of these had a sequel that grossed enough to make the top 150 films. Three films (2 percent) centered on the relationship of a mixed-gender lead pair (including *Lilo & Stitch* and *Gnomeo and Juliet*). When the title of the film referred to a character, as nearly half of them did, it was much more likely to be a male character ($n = 51$, or 70.8 percent) than a female character ($n = 7$, or 9.7 percent). Several of the films ($n = 14$, or 19.4 percent) were named for a mixed-gender couple or group, such as *The Incredibles* and *The Simpsons*.

We counted 680 characters in the entourages for the 150 films. The size of the entourage ranged from 1 to 12 characters, with a mean of 4.5 characters per film. Ebenezer Scrooge, the protagonist in *A Christmas Carol*, had no companions on his journey of self-redemption. Several films ($n = 16$) had only two characters (including the lead) in the posse, and they exemplified the classic buddy films, with, for example, SpongeBob and Patrick, or Kuzco and Pacha from *The Emperor's New Groove*. A few of the posse-pairs were male-female love affairs, with WALL-E and Eve, and with the rats Rita and Roddy in *Flushed Away*. On the other end of the continuum, *Toy Story 3* had 12 characters holding hands until the end, and *A Bug's Life* had a whole circus troupe, with 11 characters.

Males dominated in the auxiliary roles as well as the lead roles. In total, 6,039 characters with speaking roles were counted. Males had an average of 29.7 speaking roles per film, ranging from a low of five in *The Croods* to a high of 79 in *The LEGO Movie*. Females had a much lower average number of 10.5 speaking roles per film, with a low of only one in *The Tigger Movie* to a high of 33 in *Monsters University*.

Looking behind the camera at the sex of the creative staff, we found that of the 924 writing credits, 90.8 percent were male. Only 9.2 percent of the writers, cowriters, screenwriters, and authors of the original material were female. In nearly two thirds ($n = 96$) of the films, there were no female writers at all, compared to one film that was written solely by females (*Rugrats Go Wild*).

RESULTS

In H_1 , we examined the gender proportion of characters in central and auxiliary roles. Four variables were used to compare the number of male and female characters: the protagonist role, the title of the film, entourage roles, and speaking roles. The gender differences were significant for all four variables at the $p < .001$ level.

The film's protagonist, the individual followed throughout the film, was significantly more likely to be male than female ($X^2 = 77.8$, $df = 1$, $p < .001$). (The three mixed-gender coleads were excluded from the chi-square test because of their low number.) An overwhelming 84.7 percent of the protagonist roles in these films went to males, from Lewis, the orphan in *Meet the Robinsons*, to the neurotic Z in *Antz*. In a few of these male-led films, two males shared the protagonist role. For example, in *The Road to El Dorado*, Tulio and Miguel were almost inseparable, as were Mr. Peabody and

Sherman. Many of the films featured a male-female couple as central characters but followed the male's experiences more than the female's. *The Simpsons Movie* followed Homer's adventures much more than Marge's. Both Bob and Helen Parr (*The Incredibles*) were superheroes relegated to a boring suburban life, but the film followed Bob's struggles with this more than Helen's. The 20 films with female leads covered the range of princess stories, from those in which a commoner became a princess (*The Princess and the Frog*, *Mulan*, and *Beauty and the Beast*) to those in which girls were born princesses (*The Little Mermaid*, *Frozen*, *Brave*, and *Pocahontas*) to those in which girls were born princesses but did not know it (*Tangled*); however, occasional female-led stories (*Finding Dory*, *Zootopia*, *Chicken Run*, *Monsters vs. Aliens*, *Coraline*) did not involve princesses.

We also assessed whether the films' titles referred to males or females. The titles were coded as referring to a male character, a female character, both male and female characters, or no character at all. Overall, 48 percent of the film titles referred to characters. A chi-square analysis found that titles were significantly more likely to refer to male characters than to female or both male and female characters ($X^2 = 46.58$, $df = 2$, $p < .001$). That is, 70.8 percent of the film titles referred to male characters (*Shrek* and *Aladdin*) and 19.4 percent to both male and female characters (*The Incredibles*), while only 9.7 percent referred to female characters (*The Little Mermaid*, *Mulan*).

Furthermore, males filled more of the entourage roles than did females. All films had at least one male in the main posse, while *Toy Story 3* had a high of 10 males. More than half of the movies ($n = 79$) had only one female in the entourage. The largest female posse was four; one such posse was found in *Chicken Run*. The average size of the posse or entourage was 4.5 characters per film. Males held an average of 3.2 of these roles (71.9 percent), and females held an average of 1.3 (28.1 percent of the roles). The t -test was significant ($t = 13.21$ $df = 149$, $p < .001$). In 16 percent of the films ($n = 24$), there were no female members in the entourage at all. For example, in the original *Ice Age* film, three male animals—Manny, Sid, and Diego—show that predator and prey can work together to achieve a goal: that of returning a human baby to his clan. There was not a lactating female in the gang or even in sight during the entire journey, however. The animals in the barnyard (*Barnyard: The Original Party Animals*) did indeed party, just not with girls. The hens were sleeping in the chicken coop while the party was happening.

Moreover, 73.2 percent of all the 6,039 speaking roles went to males. Males had a significantly higher average (assessed with a t -test) of 29.8 speaking roles per film than females' 10.5 ($t = 18.17$, $df = 149$, $p < .001$). Within individual films, the speaking roles held by males ranged from 40.7 percent (*Coraline*) to 92.7 percent (*The Adventures of Tintin*). In *Aladdin*, the Disney film about the petty thief Aladdin and the sultan's daughter Jasmine, 91.7 percent of the speaking roles went to males. Surprisingly, *Pocahontas*, the story about a Native American woman who yearned for adventure, gave 86.7 percent of its speaking roles to male characters. Thus, even in stories that focus on females' adventures, the world in which they strive is composed overwhelmingly of males. Only three films had males in fewer than 50 percent of the speaking roles, and these films barely dipped below the 50 percent mark, ranging from 40.7 percent to 48.8 percent.

Hypothesis 2 examined whether the gender proportion of characters in the central and auxiliary roles changed over time (1980–2016). We found no significant change in the percentage of female and male characters per film throughout the years. In the first test, a binary logistic regression test found no significant change in the gender of the lead characters over the years. There was no significant change in the number of female-led films from 1980 through 2016. In the 1980s, 88.9 percent of the films had male leads, compared with 80.0 percent in the 1990s, 87.3 percent in the 2000s, and 85.7 percent from 2010 through 2016. Similarly, there was no significant change in the number of films named after female characters from 1980 through 2016. The question of whether the gender composition of those in the entourage would change over the years had no support; the OLS regression test found no significant difference over time. There was no significant increase in the female proportion of the posse from 1980 through 2016. In the 1980s, 35.7 percent of the posse was female, decreasing to 25.5 percent in the 1990s and 27.6 percent in the 2000s before increasing to 28.5 percent in the 2010s. Nor was there any support for the hypothesis that the gender composition of speaking roles would change over the years. The OLS regression test was, again, not significant. In the 1980s, female characters had 29.4 percent of the speaking roles, which decreased to 26.0 percent in the 1990s and wavered in this realm, with 25.7 percent in the 2000s and 27.9 percent in the 2010s.

Thus, we found no significant differences for any of the variables in H₂ that the gender balance of characters changed in the central and auxiliary roles over the years from 1980 through 2016. The percentage of male and female characters did not significantly change in the lead roles, film titles, entourage, or speaking roles in thirty-six years.

Hypothesis 3 asked if the gender of the writers influenced the gender composition of characters in the protagonist, film title, entourage, and speaking roles. Increasing the female writing staff has a significant impact on the percentage of females in central and ancillary roles. The OLS regression found that increasing the percentage of female writers on a film significantly increased the percentage of female characters with speaking roles ($\beta = .138$, $SE = .054$, $p < .05$) and the percentage of females in the entourage ($\beta = .205$, $SE = .098$, $p < .05$). An increase in the percentage of female writers had a marginally significant effect on whether the lead character was female. The logistic regression (excluding the three mixed-gender leads) returned a significance value of $p = .052$; however, in an interesting twist of findings, an increase in the percentage of female writers was significantly correlated with a decrease in the film being titled after a female ($\beta = -.068$, $SE = .032$, $p < .05$). With the exception of *Finding Dory*, most recent female-led films (*Zootopia*, *Brave*, *Inside Out*, *Frozen*, *Tangled*) avoid referring to gender in their titles, whereas earlier female-led films (*Mulan*, *The Little Mermaid*, *Pocahontas*, *Coraline*) highlighted the gender in their titles.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Our sample included a wide range of films, some intended for very young audiences (*Oliver & Company* and the three Rugrats movies), and some more appropriate for older children (*The Simpsons Movie* and *Beavis and Butt-Head Do America*). The films were

examined to determine the prevalence of male and female characters in various film roles. Because animated films target a young audience, it is important to identify biases, as the media could potentially be seen by children as reflections of reality. The construction of a society of predominantly males is misleading. Ignoring female characters in animated films is homogenizing and no less hazardous than promoting all white characters, all Christian, or all heterosexual. Animated films reflect “symbolic annihilation” of women and girls, according to McCabe et al. (2011), because they do not accurately portray a society in which women hold up half the sky. These films only serve to exaggerate male dominance. The problem lies in the contradiction between the espousing of equality between the sexes in Western society, and the reality represented in animated films, where males are favored over females.

Recent studies—including the current one—have found that females are marginalized in children’s animated films, as they are in all other genres. It is particularly disappointing that animated film, which has the capacity to be the most liberating, as it is not tied to the abilities of human actors, maintains the staid imbalance of male and female characters. North American children are viewing a great deal of media (Kaiser Family Foundation 2010), including these very popular films. Thus, we are promoting stereotypes in gender roles for the next generation of citizens through this heavy viewing of lopsided films. As Bandura (1986) and others contend, we are socializing boys and girls into limited and limiting roles.

Our findings for H_1 confirm previous research about US children’s books, television, and films, that females are reduced to secondary characters and are often marginalized in both speaking roles and plot development. In our sample, males held the lead role in the vast majority of the films (84.7 percent) and were seven times more likely than females (51 versus 7) to have the film titled after them. Males were more likely to fill the roles of the main posse, at an average of 3.2 males to 1.3 females per film. Males also had a higher percentage of speaking roles than females (73.2 percent compared to 26.8 percent). Our findings are on the high end of the consistent 66–75 percent male bias in children’s media that has been found in studies of US children’s books (McCabe et al. 2011), children’s television programs (Smith and Cook 2008), and superheroes (Baker and Raney 2004). Our findings mirror those of studies of popular North American G-rated films (1990–2004), in which 72 percent of the speaking roles went to males (Smith et al. 2010), and of cartoons (1935–1992), with males having 75 percent of the leads (Thompson and Zerbinos 1995). American educational television for children still provides the best mix available, with males holding only 59 percent of the roles (Barner 1999).

Furthermore, we did not find an increase in female characters over the years of the study (1980–2016), which was the focus of H_2 . Other studies note a lack of improvement in the balance of male and female characters in children’s media over time (Davis and McDaniel 1999; Hamilton et al. 2006; Smith et al. 2010); however, television cartoons experienced an improved 2:1 male-to-female ratio starting in the 1980s, from an earlier 3:1 ratio (Thompson and Zerbinos 1995). It is interesting to note that commercial Saturday-morning cartoons offer a better gender balance than do top-grossing animated films.

Can the disparity between male and female characters in animated films be explained by the genders of the authors and screenwriters? H₃ addressed this question. The vast majority of authors and screenwriters were male (90.8 percent), with 96 of the 150 films having all-male writing teams. Thus, females held 9.2 percent of the writing positions in these films, which is similar to the 8–18 percent in other recent studies (Bielby and Bielby 1996; Eschholz et al. 2002; Lauzen 2016; Smith et al. 2008). Although the percent of female writers was small, it had a significant impact on the presence of females in central and auxiliary roles. Increase in the percentage of female writers is correlated with an increase in females with speaking roles and of female membership in the entourage. There is a marginally significant increase in females in the lead role as the percentage of female writers increases. We thus have support for the studies finding that women authors and screenwriters use female characters somewhat more than male authors do (Glascock 2001; Hamilton et al. 2006; Smith et al. 2009) or that female writers are hired when a film has a considerable number of female characters.

With female authors and screenwriters overwhelmingly outnumbered, organizations such as Women Make Movies (WMM) may help in improving gender bias in film. Similarly, WET Productions (wetweb.org) develops, produces, and promotes new material for theater, film, and television that both challenges female stereotypes and advocates for gender equality. The See Jane program, founded by actor Geena Davis, produces press reports highlighting the findings about gender composition and stereotyping in children's media. Finally, this study's focus on the top-grossing films reflects what is consumed most heavily—a choice made by the American theater-going audience—not all that is produced by the film studios. With a little consciousness-raising, parents may reassess their children's media options.

Nonetheless, several top-grossing animated films have engaging female characters. *Finding Dory* (2016), *Frozen* (2013), *Inside Out* (2015), and *Zootopia* (2016) feature female leads and rank in the top 10 grossing (non-inflation-adjusted) films as of early 2017. The 2013 film *Frozen*, which is currently the fifth highest in theater gross sales, captivated audiences with the saga of two sisters, Elsa and Anna. Disney's *Lilo & Stitch* also focuses on the relationship between sisters; furthermore, these sisters, who live in Hawaii, are shown in swimsuits and hot-weather clothes without being sexualized. In *The Wild Thornberrys*, Eliza can talk with animals and saves elephants from the villains. *Chicken Run* features females working together to save themselves from becoming chicken potpie. In the DreamWorks film *Monsters vs. Aliens*, the female lead, Susan (aka Ginormica), starts out as a bride willing to sacrifice her honeymoon (and her own dreams) to support her future husband's career. Even though she is portrayed as highly sexualized throughout the film, she does choose independence and self-reliance after a series of self-affirming challenges.

Notwithstanding the inclusion of smart, adventurous female protagonists as mentioned above, the underrepresentation of female characters may have negative consequences with respect to children's development. Stereotypes and traditional values are passed on through books, television, and films. Children who repeatedly view films in which males consistently outnumber females, speak more than females, and comprise the majority of the lead characters are learning that females are not as worthy as males. At

this point, animated films are not challenging our society's perception that females are less valuable than males; they are perpetuating it.

REFERENCES

- Baker, Kaysee, and Arthur Raney. 2004. "Toons, They're Not A-Changin': Sex-Role Stereotyping on Saturday Morning Animated Programs." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Communication Association, New Orleans, LA.
- Bandura, Albert. 1986. *Social Foundations of Thought and Action: A Social Cognitive Theory*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Barner, Mark R. 1999. "Sex-Role Stereotyping in FCC-Mandated Children's Educational Television." *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media* 43:551–64.
- Bian, Lin, Sarah-Jane Leslie, and Andrei Cimpian. 2017. "Gender Stereotypes about Intellectual Ability Emerge Early and Influence Children's Interests." *Science* 355(6323):389–91.
- Bielby, Denise D., and William T. Bielby. 1996. "Women and Men in Film: Gender Inequality among Writers in a Culture Industry." *Gender & Society* 10:248–70.
- Christakis, Dimitri A., Jill Gilkerson, Jeffrey A. Richards, Frederick J. Zimmerman, Michelle M. Garrison, Dongxin Xu, Sharmistha Gray, and Umit Yapanel. 2009. "Audible Television and Decreased Adult Words, Infant Vocalizations, and Conversational Turns." *Archives of Pediatric Adolescent Medicine* 163(6):554–58.
- Clark, Roger, Pamela J. Keller, April Knights, Jennifer Nabar, Theil B. Ramsbey, and Thomas Ramsbey. 2007. "Let Me Draw You a Picture: Alternate and Changing Views of Gender in Award-Winning Picture Books for Children." *International Review of Modern Sociology* 33:68–96.
- Coyne, Sarah, Jennifer Ruh Linder, Eric E. Rasmussen, David A. Nelson, and Kevin M. Collier. 2014. "It's a Bird! It's a Plane! It's a Gender Stereotype! Longitudinal Associations between Superhero Viewing and Gender Stereotyped Play." *Sex Roles* 70(9):416–30.
- Czaplinski, Suzanne. M. 1972. *Sexism in Award Winning Picture Books*. Pittsburgh, PA: Know.
- Davis, Anita P., and Thomas R. McDaniel. 1999. "You've Come a Long Way, Baby—or Have You? Research Evaluating Gender Portrayal in Recent Caldecott-Winning Books." *The Reading Teacher* 52:532–36.
- Eschholz, Sarah, Jana Bufkin, and Jenny Long. 2002. "Symbolic Reality Bites: Women and Racial/Ethnic Minorities in Modern Film." *Sociological Spectrum* 22:299–334.
- Frueh, Terry, and Paul E. McGhee. 1975. "Traditional Sex-Role Development and Amount of Time Spent Watching Television." *Developmental Psychology* 11:109.
- Geena Davis Institute on Gender in Media. 2016a. "Hitting the Bullseye: Reel Girl Archers Inspire Real Girl Archers." Retrieved February 28, 2017 (<https://seejane.org/gender-in-media-news-release/new-study-geena-davis-institute-finds-archery-catches-fire-thanks-inspiring-hollywood-images/>).

- Geena Davis Institute on Gender in Media. 2016b. "The Reel Truth: Women Aren't Seen or Heard: An Automated Analysis of Gender Representation in Popular Films." Retrieved February 28, 2017 (<https://seejane.org/research-informs-empowers/reel-truth-women-not-seen-heard/>).
- Gluscock, Jack. 2001. "Gender Roles on Prime-Time Network Television: Demographics and Behaviors." *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media* 45:656–69.
- Gooden, Angela, and Mark Gooden. 2001. "Gender Representation in Notable Children's Picture Books: 1995–1999." *Sex Roles* 45:89–101.
- Hamilton, Mykol C., David Anderson, Michelle Broaddus, and Kate Young. 2006. "Gender Stereotyping and Under-Representation of Female Characters in 200 Popular Children's Picture Books: A Twenty-First Century Update." *Sex Roles* 55:757–65.
- Kaiser Family Foundation. 2010. "Generation M2: Media in the Lives of 8- to 18-Year-Olds." Retrieved February 5, 2012 (<https://kaiserfamilyfoundation.files.wordpress.com/2013/04/8010.pdf>).
- Keintz, Katherine E. 1987. "An Examination of the Sex- and Occupational-Role Presentations of Female Characters in Children's Picture Books." *Women's Studies in Communication* 10:67–78.
- Kolbe, Richard, and Joseph C. LaVoie. 1981. "Sex-Role Stereotyping in Pre-School Children's Picture Books." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 44:369–74.
- LaDow, Stephanie. 1976. *A Content-Analysis of Selected Picture Books Examining the Portrayal of Sex Roles and Presentations of Males and Females*. East Lansing, MI: National Center for Research on Teacher Learning.
- Lauzen, Martha M. 2016. "The Celluloid Ceiling: Behind-the-Scenes Employment of Women on the Top 100, 250, and 500 Films of 2015." Retrieved February 28, 2017 (http://womenintvfilm.sdsu.edu/files/2015_Celluloid_Ceiling_Report.pdf).
- Lauzen, Martha M., David M. Dozier, and Elizabeth Cleveland. 2006. "Genre Matters: An Examination of Women Working Behind the Scenes and On-Screen Portrayals in Reality and Scripted Prime-Time Programming." *Sex Roles* 55:445–55.
- Martins, Nicole, and Kristen Harrison. 2011. "Racial and Gender Differences in the Relationship between Children's Television Use and Self-Esteem: A Longitudinal Panel Study." *Communication Research* 39(3):338–57.
- McCabe, Janice, Emily Fairchild, Liz Grauerholz, Bernice A. Pescosolido, and Daniel Tope. 2011. "Gender in Twentieth-Century Children's Books: Patterns of Disparity in Titles and Central Characters." *Gender & Society* 25(2):197–226.
- Moskalenko, Sophia. 2008. "Moral Mires and the Grip of the Group: Morality as Internalized Group Norms." *Counseling Psychology Quarterly* 21:301–308.
- MPAA. 2015. "Theatrical Market Statistics 2015." Retrieved February 28, 2017 (http://www.mpa.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/MPAA-Theatrical-Market-Statistics-2015_Final.pdf).
- Signorielli, Nancy. 1989. "Television and Conceptions about Sex Roles: Maintaining Conventionality and the Status Quo." *Sex Roles* 21:341–60.
- Smith, Stacy, Marc Choueiti, Amy Granados, and Sarah Erickson. 2008. "Asymmetrical Academy Awards? A Look at Gender Imbalance in Best Picture Nominated Films

- from 1977 to 2006.” Retrieved February 28, 2017 (<http://annenberg.usc.edu/pages/~media/MDSCI/Academy%20Awards%201.ashx>).
- Smith, Stacy L., Marc Choueiti, Amy D. Granados, and Laurel Felt. 2009. “Gender Oppression in Cinematic Content? A Look at Females On-Screen & Behind-the-Camera in Top-Grossing 2007 Films.” Retrieved February 5, 2012 (<http://annenberg.usc.edu/pages/~media/MDSCI/Gender%20Inequality%202007.ashx>).
- Smith, Stacy, Marc Choueiti, and Katherine Pieper. 2016. “Inequality in 800 Popular Films: Examining Portrayals of Gender, Race/Ethnicity, LGBT, and Disability from 2007–2015.” Retrieved February 28, 2017 (<http://annenberg.usc.edu/pages/~media/MDSCI/Dr%20Stacy%20L%20Smith%20Inequality%20in%20800%20Films%20FINAL.ashx>).
- Smith, Stacy, and Crystal Cook. 2008. “Gender Stereotypes: An Analysis of Popular Films and Television.” Retrieved February 5, 2012 (https://seejane.org/wp-content/uploads/GDIGM_Gender_Stereotypes.pdf).
- Smith, Stacy, Katherine Pieper, Amy Granados, and Marc Choueiti. 2010. “Assessing Gender-Related Portrayals in Top-Grossing G-Rated Films.” *Sex Roles* 62:774–86.
- Swindler, Ann. 1986. “Culture in Action: Symbols and Strategies.” *American Sociological Review* 51:273–86.
- Thompson, Teresa, and Eugenia Zerbinos. 1995. “Gender Roles in Animated Cartoons: Has the Picture Changed in 20 years?” *Sex Roles* 32:651–73.
- Thompson, Teresa, and Eugenia Zerbinos. 1997. “Television Cartoons: Do Children Notice It’s a Boy’s World?” *Sex Roles* 37:415–32.
- Thorne, Barrie. 1993. *Gender Play: Girls and Boys in School*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
- Tognoli, Jerome, Jane Pullen, and Judith Lieber. 1994. “The Privilege of Place: Domestic and Work Locations of Characters in Children’s Books.” *Children’s Environments* 11:272–80.
- Weitzman, Lenore, Deborah Eifler, Elizabeth Hokada, and Catherine Ross. 1972. “Sex Role Socialization in Picture Books for Preschool Children.” *American Journal of Sociology* 77:1125–50.

*The Importance of Seeming Earnest:
Emotion Work and Leadership in Theater Worlds**

GREGORY T. KORDSMEIER
Indiana University Southeast

ABSTRACT

Although leaders can always use formal power to establish their authority, they do so at risk of alienating group members. By studying theater workers who must establish authority without having the opportunity to establish their expertise, I find a third way of establishing authority: through emotion work that shows commitment to the group and its goals. By employing in-depth interviewing, participant observation, and qualitative content analysis, I find that stage managers establish their concern for the show and key actors by acting as emotional buffers, creating a safe psychological space, and preparing actors for the transition to performance. All of this work comes out of an emotional ideology that puts the good of the show first. Other leaders may be able to employ a similar emotional ideology to influence group members.

KEY WORDS Emotion Work; Leadership; Authority; Theater; Stage Managers

Leaders draw upon a number of resources to get others to follow the decisions they make. As Lovaglia et al. (2008) describe, leaders can draw upon both power and influence to accomplish their goals. Sociologists have studied the many power bases that individuals may draw from in order to claim that they have power over other individuals. These bases may stem from their positions in organizations, such as formal bureaucratic power, or from their control over resources such as expertise. Using formal power, however, risks alienating group members and makes drawing on influence a better strategy for most leaders. Drawing on influence is particularly important for managers when they do not have access to traditional power bases and yet still need to manage other people (Lovaglia et al. 2008; Pescosolido 2002). What happens when individuals have less authority in some situations yet need to develop authority over time? The case of theatrical stage managers provides an opportunity to explore this question. Stage managers start with limited authority over the casts that they manage in the rehearsal process, because directors exercise primary authority over a cast. After opening night,

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Dr. Gregory T. Kordsmeier, Indiana University Southeast, 4201 Grant Line Road, Crestview Hall 025, New Albany, IN 47150-6405; gkordsme@ius.edu; (812) 941-2860.

however, the director has often left the show, leaving the stage manager with the sole responsibility for maintaining the show.

Stage managers are responsible for ensuring that actors keep their performances consistent over the run of the show. This task is made even more difficult because most directors and actors expect that the way an actor plays a role will change and develop over the course of a run. Consistent performances, therefore, are not identical performances, and the stage manager must balance the intentions of the director against the need for a production to change and grow within the limits set by the director. Without the ability to exert authority over the actors, the stage manager cannot hope to accomplish his or her job. Thus, stage managers must find ways to develop and maintain authority over the course of the production process. This paper describes the importance of emotion work even in formal work organizations. More specifically, stage managers take on the role of caretakers¹ for the show and the people in it. This allows them to demonstrate their commitment to the overall success of the show; this commitment in turn can stand in for artistic expertise as a base of power in art worlds.

Stage managers establish themselves as caretakers in a number of ways. They act as emotional buffers for members of the cast and the production team—the designers, workshop employees, and others charged with creating all of the aspects of the play beyond acting. For example, stage managers allow actors and other artists involved in the creation of theater to behave brusquely toward members of the stage-management team if it will allow the process of creating the play to run more smoothly. A stage manager might accept an actor swearing instead of calling for a line. Unlike members of the stage-management team, actors are not expected to consider the feelings of others in their interactions. Stage managers absorb emotional abuse and smooth over interpersonal conflicts between individuals. Stage managers also work to create a safe psychological space for the actors and director during the rehearsal process, shielding the actors and director from the realities of the outside world. They pride themselves on anticipating the needs of the director and cast, believing that the room should be free of anything that might distract the actors from their work. Finally, technical rehearsals entail a long and often grueling process for actors. Stage managers have work responsibilities that keep them from interacting closely with actors; they prepare actors for this process by making the actors feel as safe as possible and by reminding them of the long hours of technical rehearsals that they will face.

These caretaking actions are motivated by a specific emotional ideology of the stage manager: to work for “the good of the show.” Stage managers state that the best way to establish their authority is to demonstrate to the artistic staff that their loyalties are to the show as a whole rather than to a particular aspect of it. They argue that the most important factor in their ability to gain authority over a cast is earning the cast’s trust. Stage managers take this ideology to heart. They judge their success or failure by, and gain their greatest enjoyment from, the overall success of the show.

METHODS

I employed qualitative methods, including semi-structured interviews, participant observation, and qualitative documentary analysis. I obtained my interview sample by cold-calling or e-mailing production directors of theater companies and theater programs in two Midwestern cities and one Southern city and expanded my sample through snowball sampling. I interviewed thirty-seven theater world members, including twenty-three stage managers. In addition to interviewing stage managers, I interviewed actors, directors, and stagehands affiliated with the productions I observed. Interviews ranged anywhere from forty-five minutes to two hours, with interviews with stage managers typically being one and half to two times longer than those with other theater professionals.

I also conducted extensive participant observation of two full productions, following (in each case) a three-person stage-management team through their activities at work, arriving when they arrived, and leaving when they left. As a part of these observations, I accumulated a number of documents that I analyzed along with my interview and field-note transcripts. Stage managers, as a part of their jobs, generate an enormous amount of paperwork. For every day of rehearsal, production meeting, and day of performances, a stage manager generally writes and distributes, via e-mail, a rehearsal or performance report to all of the personnel involved in the production. I was able to obtain all of these reports for both productions that I observed.

Guided by the grounded theory methods suggested in *The Discovery of Grounded Theory* (Glaser and Strauss 1967) and Anselm Strauss's *Qualitative Analysis for Social Scientists* (1987) and developed by other theorists (Charmaz 2006), I coded my data thematically and looked for themes to emerge. I did this coding iteratively throughout the process, developing my focus in both interviews and observations based on the emergent themes. One of the questions from the interview guide asked, "What is your relationship with the company? The director? Other theatre staff? ... What should these relationships be?" Based on the answers to these questions, an emergent theme was that of issues around leadership and authority.

AUTHORITY, LEADERSHIP, AND BASES OF POWER

Many sociologists have catalogued the bases of power upon which leaders draw to elicit compliance from others. In general, these bases can come from a number of sources based on organizational position or resource control. Resource control may include control over rewards (French and Raven 1959), punishments (French and Raven 1959), or expertise (Eulau 1962; French and Raven 1959; Mukerji 1976; Presthus 1960; Weick, Sutcliffe, and Obstfeld 1999).

Control of resources is one of the more effective bases of power, but wielding of that power is not equally available to all potential leaders. Not every leader has the ability to punish or reward individuals under their control, and even when they do, doing so risks alienating their followers (Lovaglia et al. 2008). Leaders may also have expertise that makes them invaluable to others, allowing them to demand respect for their power within the realm of their expertise. Within art worlds, would-be leaders often express this

expertise as having particular artistic skills or vision. Mukerji (1976), for example, argues that specialized knowledge as an artist is one power base that members of student film crews draw upon. The filmmakers express this by being particularly creative or expressive in their ideas. This artistic ability is a particularly important base of power in all art worlds. Although stage managers may or may not be able to claim artistic abilities (Kordsmeier 2011), they are not usually given opportunities to express such abilities in the rehearsal process.

EMOTION WORK AND LEADERSHIP

When stage managers act as caretakers for the show, they focus both on the mundane tasks involved in running the show and on the social and emotional needs of the cast and artistic staff. Stage managers use positive socioemotional interaction to establish themselves as the socioemotional leaders of the group during the rehearsal process in order to legitimize their own instrumental leadership once performances begin. Stage managers use the caretaking role to show commitment to the cast and to the show, and in the process, they are able to gain authority over cast members. My ethnographic research provides new evidence that displaying positive socioemotional behavior is one way in which low-status members can improve their status in small group settings.

Managing the emotional outcomes of interaction is something that members of society do in every face-to-face interaction. As Goffman (1959) noted, we create performances that must both facilitate our instrumental goals and at the same time prevent either party from experiencing negative emotional reactions. Work groups are an important situational context in which socioemotional work is exhibited and experienced by members of the group.

Leaders are expected to perform emotion work as a key component of their jobs and may be called upon to enact a variety of emotions depending on the circumstance (Humphrey, Pollack, and Hawver 2008; Rogalin and Hirshfield 2013). Leaders who can understand and respond to group members' emotional states have happier and higher-performing groups (George 2000; Humphrey et al. 2008; Rogalin and Hirshfield 2013). Group members find leaders' emotion work most effective when the leaders seem to have a sincere investment in the success and well-being of the group (Dasborough and Ashkanasy 2002; Humphrey 2008). All of the evidence points to the idea that skilled leaders are also skilled emotion managers. Indeed, emotional skills can serve as a viable way of obtaining leadership positions. Côté et al. (2010) found that emotional intelligence was a key path to emergent leadership (that is, leadership in groups with no set organizational structure), and that this emotional intelligence was distinct from cognitive traits, personality, and gender.

Other research offers insight into the mechanisms that allow socioemotional behavior to translate into power. First, research has shown that sentiments—that is, liking or disliking another—affect competency expectations. Group members who are liked are more likely to be assessed by other group members as the most capable to perform a given task (Shelly 2001). Second, perceived group orientation has a considerable effect

on the status of individuals within a group. Individuals who appear to be highly group-motivated are afforded higher status within the group, particularly when they start out as a low-status member (Ridgeway 1982). Positive socioemotional behavior includes exhibiting a strong commitment to the group and to the task at hand and thus affords low-status members a higher status. Thus, the experimental literature seems to suggest that positive socioemotional behavior may lead to greater status and leadership within small groups. This status can be used to influence group members to do what the leader wants them to do. One way in which this positive socioemotional behavior can be understood is as a successful display of emotion work.

EMOTION WORK AND STAGE MANAGERS

The idea that stage managers are important emotion managers in the theater is not a new idea. In his study of actors as emotion managers, Orzechowicz (2008) notes that many individuals in the theater who are involved in the production of a play are also engaged in emotion work:

Actors, engaged in *primary* feeling management, focused on their own emotions, are responsible for only a few aspects of the show. They rely on ushers, house managers, stage managers, dressers, crew, and directors to oversee many other parts of the production. People in these roles, responsible for managing many offstage sources of emotion and distraction, are engaged in *secondary* feeling management, the management of others' emotions. These rarely acknowledged layers of *emotional buffers* structurally enable actors' feeling management. (146, emphasis in the original)

Although Orzechowicz astutely identifies the role that all members of a company have in managing the emotions of others, his focus on the emotional labor required of actors leaves the emotional labor of others largely undifferentiated. Stage managers engage in emotion management not only with actors but also with most of the other emotion managers mentioned above. Stage managers are the main emotion managers for directors and serve as both the socioemotional and instrumental leaders of the production staff, which includes house managers, crew, and dressers.

The caretaker role can be understood as a special case of feeling rules, as described by Hochschild (1979, 1983). Feeling rules help individuals know which emotions are appropriate to display or even feel within a given situation. Hochschild writes that feeling rules may become a part of a larger emotional ideology that serves as an interpretive framework to condition responses to events in interaction. These feeling rules can legitimize or delegitimize our emotional reactions, allowing us to evaluate how to feel about what we are feeling (Hochschild 1979). This is central to an understanding of which emotions are appropriate to be displayed and felt within certain environments. Yet, drawing

upon the work of researchers such as Bolton and Boyd (2003), this does not necessarily indicate that such emotional ideologies are in some sense inauthentic. Indeed, these emotional ideologies may be part of what attracts an individual to a particular career. In the case of stage managers, the emotional ideology that they take on is that of caretaker. This ideology shapes their emotional reactions such that they interpret success and gain their greatest satisfactions by adhering to this ideology.

THE PRODUCTION PROCESS AND THE CHANGING CONTEXT OF AUTHORITY

In order to understand why stage managers draw upon emotion work and the caretaker identity to create authority, it is important to understand the changing context of authority inherent in the work that stage managers do. As stated in the introduction, stage managers are present for all of the acting rehearsals and are responsible for keeping things running smoothly and assisting the director and actors in their jobs. At this stage of the process, however, the director is clearly in charge of the rehearsal, setting the agenda, deciding when a particular scene has been rehearsed enough times, and acting as final arbiter of artistic disputes. The stage manager has some authority in this context; he or she is the one who calls actors if they are late for rehearsal and, in Equity companies, is the individual responsible for ensuring that breaks occur with enough frequency to meet union rules. Their authority, however, is limited to these nonartistic management tasks, and a stage manager is never asked to make artistic decisions. Indeed, stage managers are rarely asked to offer artistic input. In production meetings, the director and stage manager take on a dynamic similar to the one in the rehearsal room. In these meetings, the stage manager is second in command to the director, never making artistic decisions and rarely offering artistic input. Instead, the stage manager is often called upon to help the director report on anything that might have developed within rehearsals and that will have an impact on the larger production.

The second part of the process, technical rehearsals, is when the behind-the-scenes and acting elements of the play begin to merge. The stage manager now must keep track not only of actors but also of all of the members of the technical crew who are crucial to the production: light board operators, sound board operators, the running crew, and others. Here, stage managers begin to display more authority, although that authority is primarily over the technical crew rather than the actors. The director is still present throughout technical rehearsals and is the one who gives notes to the actors on their performances.

After the technical rehearsal period come the performances. In most professional theater, the director leaves after opening night. After the play has opened, the stage manager then becomes the sole authority for both cast and crew. It is the stage manager who decides whether the actors need a brush-up rehearsal and who schedules that rehearsal for the cast. The stage manager also calls shows during production, cueing the crew and occasionally the cast about when they are supposed to perform specific tasks. The stage manager is there to maintain the tempo of the show set by the director, much like a conductor maintains the tempo of an orchestra that is set by the composer. Stage managers' responsibility to direct both the technical activities of the crew and the acting

of the cast, as well as their responsibility for the entire show once it enters performances, requires them to have authority over both the cast and crew. This shift in stage managers' authority over the course of a production presents a problem for the stage managers.

STAGE MANAGERS AND AUTHORITY OVER THE CAST

Although stage managers may be limited in their authority in the preproduction rehearsal process, there are several mundane aspects of the rehearsal process that fall under their authority from the very beginning, as discussed previously. Still, stage managers do not have control over any of the creative activity during rehearsals. When I spoke with one stage manager, Alex,² about the relationship between stage managers and the director in the rehearsal hall, and whether she would consider them equals, she said,

I wouldn't say equal; I'd say we work next to each other. The director has a different job in that room; they have a different kind of authority; their role is definitely an entirely different category. The stage manager gets to tell the director, "We need to stop now," and "We need to start now," but other than that, you know, two totally different things, and I mean, depending upon the director; some of them can get off topic or off goal, and the stage manager kind of needs to push them back and say, "We're not getting as far as we need to." I guess, you work side by side in two different categories; I mean, the director has the artistic ability and gets to say, "Let's try it this way, let's line this way." The stage manager really has no right to say that.

Stage managers do not have the opportunity to display any artistic ability in the rehearsal room—Alex goes so far as to suggest that directors are the ones who have the actual artistic ability—yet the stage manager is going to need to wield this type of authority once performances begin, telling actors how to deliver their lines (even if it is only to say that they need to deliver how they were delivering it before). Thus, stage managers must find another basis for their authority over the cast.

Stage managers argue that the only way to obtain this authority is to display a commitment to the overall show that inspires the other members of the production to trust in them. One stage manager, Wendy, relates,

When you're in a position where you have to go up to an actor and tell them that ... the director is gone and you can't do that on stage ... they have to be able to trust you to know that you're making a decision based on what happened in rehearsal and what's happening in the play as it's growing, and the only way to do any of those things ...

[is] if you say that you're going to do something, do it!
(Laugh) ... I just feel that the only way to gain people's
trust is to be trustworthy.

By showing dependability and respect from the very beginning, this stage manager shows herself to be not only a good stage manager but also someone the actors can trust to take care of them. From this perspective, it is important for a stage manager to show that he or she is an ally of the actors.

Stage managers must build this relationship through rapport because they have limited opportunities to display that they have an artistic sensibility. Rehearsals do not offer stage managers the opportunity to display creative expertise. Actors, directors, and stage managers alike frown upon a stage manager offering unsolicited opinions about creative aspects of the show to the director or actors. When I asked one stage manager, Ella, if she thought that an artistic sensibility was important, she replied, "Yes, but it's important, especially early on, that you remember to keep that in check, because you are not there to contribute, really, your artistic sensibility." Because they are not afforded the opportunity to display their artistic expertise, stage managers rely on emotion work to display care for the production and the cast, and in this way substitute one source of authority for another. Stage managers acting in the service of the show lets cast members know that the stage managers have the best intentions at heart for the show, and thus that the decisions they make reflect the best interests of the show.

This commitment to the show forms the core of the emotion work that stage managers do in establishing their power. One stage manager, Hal, when asked how he maintained authority, stated,

The stage managers who just are there because they want to feel authority and they want to feel power, and they want to feel that they're in control, are not there for the play. The thing about a stage manager, as far as I'm concerned, ... is that we are there to be of service, we are there to be of service to the play and to the production, first and foremost, and falling into all of that comes helping the director, comes being a resource for the actors, comes being someone that's the hub of communication for all the different areas, but it all comes from being of service to the play, it has to originate with that. Otherwise, if it's like a personal power play that you're doing, then you're just full of bullshit, you need to go somewhere else, work somewhere else.

This stage manager suggests that even wanting to have that control over others indicates that a stage manager has overstepped his or her bounds. Instead, the stage manager should focus on making the show the best it can be. From this commitment to the production, he suggests, the stage manager will find much more success both professionally and personally. This includes having the proper amount of authority to complete his job.

Stage managers might employ other, more formal, power bases in order to obtain compliance from actors. Stage managers have formal rules that allow them to maintain power over the actors with whom they work. The Actors' Equity Association (AEA) Stage Manager Packet contains a page titled "Responsibilities of the Actor," which at the top has written in bold, "Please Post." Among the responsibilities that the actor has toward the production are these:

- Observe all reasonable rules of the management not in conflict with Equity rules.
- Cooperate with the Stage Manager and Assistant Stage Managers, Dance Captain and Fight Captain.
- Maintain your performance as directed.

...

Your Stage Manager is obligated to report violations to Equity and Equity will, when necessary, call before a Membership Relations Committee any member who violates these rules.

Discipline is a sign of professionalism. Pleases maintain a professional attitude at all times. (Actors' Equity Association 2006:4, emphasis in the original)

The stage managers I observed, however, did not make recourse to such rules in their dealings with actors. Notes were always couched in terms of what was best for the show; for instance, the actor notes in one performance report by Rebecca states, "Barry: P. 39 Dancing Men (Ent. UL/Ext. DL 'Excuse me, where is the bathroom?') Don't rush the exit, leaving Horatio alone." The stage manager offers a note that lets Barry know that if he is not careful with his exit, he risks making Horatio look foolish by leaving him alone on stage. Rebecca, through her phrasing of the note, shows both Barry and Horatio that the note is not an arbitrary decision on her part but rather has consequences for Horatio. In turn, this demonstrates that the notes that she offers come from her concern for the good of the show.

Three major ways that stage managers do emotion work let the actors know that the stage manager's first concern is the good of the show. Stage managers act as emotion buffers for the cast, create a safe psychological space, and prepare actors for any potential disruptions, particularly at the transition to technical rehearsals.

Emotional Buffers

Stage managers serve as emotional buffers for actors over the course of a show, particularly during the rehearsal process. The stage manager has to be ready to serve as

an outlet for the emotions that actors may be feeling, sometimes going so far as to accept any abuse that comes his or her way. For instance, Wendy recounts,

You anticipate the way that [actors] like things, the way that they need to be spoken to, the way that ... certain situations have to be handled. Like, for instance, there's an actor that we work with; his name is Nathan Pittman. He is a sweet older man, and I think very, very highly of him. When he's frustrated, he tends to really bark at people, but it's not personal. And Andrew Rogers, when he is calling for a line, he tends to shout, "What?" or "Fuck!" ... And he tends to be looking right at you when he's shouting these things—it's not personal, and ... we know these things.

Stage managers anticipate that actors will use them as emotional buffers from time to time, and they even learn how to anticipate those occurrences as they work with the same actors more than once. Indeed, part of the job for Wendy, as she sees it, is to learn the quirks of the actors with whom she works, especially those with whom she works regularly. Thus, the emotion work is seen as part of a learning process. One way to discern whether there is a valid complaint behind the curses that flow from the actor's lips is to know whether that person's behavior is congruent with his or her past behavior. Stage managers are often called upon to act as the emotional buffers for actors in order to help actors stay in character during the rehearsal process. To ensure that an actor can concentrate all of his or her energy on creating a fully realized performance, the stage manager allows that actor to breach normal expectations of decorum. The actor is allowed to make emotional displays that violate those expectations.

The stage manager serves as an emotional buffer for members of the production staff as well. The stage manager needs to ensure that the rest of the members of the company are able to work with each other and avoid emotional conflict. Sometimes this means taking the brunt of someone's emotional outburst. Other times, it may require the stage manager to step in and head off conflict. One stage manager, Karen, relates,

The head of the costume shop is very sensitive about things being his fault—he will blame everyone else, yelling at actors for missing fittings. I have to make them understand what they need to do, that it's not their fault, and also to pacify Micah. A lot of times it comes down to being the mediator, taking the blame sometimes even when it's not your fault.

A good stage manager may choose an uncomfortable position. Making the emotional sacrifice of taking responsibility for someone else's mistake is not easy to do, especially when tempers are running high between the designer and the actor, but doing so allows

the show to function. The stage manager either must step in and act as the mediator or even go to the extreme of taking the blame upon himself or herself.

Serving as an emotional buffer continues into the performances. The actors may encounter all kinds of interpersonal conflicts over the course of a performance, and the stage manager must act as an emotional buffer and relieve the stresses that come up in the course of a show. Rebecca, for instance, offered this note in the performance notes one night:

I was surprised to be met after the show by a distressed Erica. She was in tears and presented me with a list of five notes she wanted me to give Elena regarding responses that have appeared during the course of the run. I hadn't found these as problematic as she did because, frankly, it was nice to see Elena open up and become more responsive. Erica and I discussed it and I'll find a happy medium with Elena.

Here, Rebecca finds that she must satisfy the emotional needs of one of her actors by stepping into the situation and having a conversation with another actor. This is a part of maintaining the show that requires any stage manager to balance his or her own ideas about what is for the good of the show and what needs to be done in order to ensure that the actors feel as though they are accordant with the other actors in the play. It is important to note here that Rebecca feels that her artistic judgment of the play is just as important as satisfying the emotional needs of the actor. The two must be balanced—"[she'll] find a happy medium"—because at this point in the production, the emotional needs of the actors cannot outweigh the attendant artistic needs of the show. The stage manager is now the ultimate authority when it comes to the artistic maintenance of the show, and the maintenance of the show must remain her primary responsibility.

By taking emotional abuse from actors or other members of the production staff, stage managers allow those other individuals to go about their work without pausing to consider how best to express their needs and desires. Stage managers may also take on emotional abuse to head off conflict between individuals, or may serve as sounding boards in order to accomplish the same goal. In all of these cases, stage managers, by acting as emotional buffers, help to lubricate the interpersonal machinery of theatrical productions, allowing the creative work to be done much more smoothly than would otherwise be possible, while also displaying to the actors that someone cares for them.

Creating a Safe Psychological Space

Another way in which the stage manager embodies the caretaker role is working ensure that everyone involved in the production has what he or she needs in order to do the best job possible. Wendy, when asked about the importance of the role of stage managers, remarked,

I think it allows people like the director and actor to do their work without having to worry about extraneous

matters. ... Theater ... has expanded so much and involves so many different areas and different mediums that it requires someone who can help coordinate all of those different aspects and still maintain a sense of wholeness to it, and that directly comes under the auspices of the director, but I think that the stage manager can assist the director in that regard, as well as taking care of details and minutiae that the director doesn't need to be worried about—[for example,] communicating to the costume shop how long that quick change is going to be.

Stage managers are there to make sure that everyone else can do their jobs. Their commitment is to the entire production, and part of that means having a commitment to assisting all of the individuals who are involved with the production.

As stage managers described their duties, one phrase occurred repeatedly: “good environment.” Many stage managers saw the good environment as something that was crucial for them to create. Will, for example, describes his duties like this:

Well, even though it seems like coffee and a lot of things like that, there's a lot of preparation involved as far as pleasing actors and directors and making sure that ... I would call more of that creating a good environment. I mean, you want to make sure that everything's ready so they can come into the space and they're ready to go, they're ready to work. So I mean everything ... I mean, it's the idea of going to a hotel and everything's clean and it's furnished.

For Will, his job is to ensure that the physical space is prepared in such a way that the director and actors do not have to worry about the mundane concerns that might otherwise occupy them. It is interesting to notice that Will uses the metaphor of a hotel in describing how the room is set up for the director and actors. It brings to mind the idea of walking into a room where you do not have to think about the mundane chores that are necessary to maintain your own room at home: At home, you are the one ensuring that things are clean and furnished; at a hotel, the work of cleaning and furnishing your room is done when you are not present, which frees you from thinking about the work that is being done on your behalf.

Creating a psychological barrier between the mundane world and the activities of the theater and the theatrical process is something that is intimately tied to the creation of a physical space separated from the outside world. Wendy describes how taking care of physical needs also means taking care of psychological needs:

I feel responsible, very much so, for the rehearsal hall and the setting up of all of that and making the environment

there as accurate as possible and as comfortable as possible for any of the actors that are there as well as the director. So that they can create as best they can without having to worry about little details. ... So that they are free to do what they need to do and don't get bogged down.

By creating a space where the actors feel as if someone is taking care of them, meeting their needs so that the technical details will not distract them, the stage manager ensures that the actors are able to do what they need to do.

Actors often talk about this atmosphere as the creation of a safe space. Tom relates,

You can really feel when a stage manager is on top of a production, from the very beginning. And ... when rehearsing theater, when performing theater, how important it is to have a safe playground, a safe place to create, and the stability of the stage manager is a huge piece of that, to establish that place, that place of safety.

For Tom, this feeling of safety is the biggest part of the emotion work that a stage manager does over the course of the production. Here, he relates the need for a safe place from the very beginning of rehearsals. It is crucial for an actor to have a safe space to play and create, in order to do his or her job.

The importance of maintaining that workspace involves managing the emotions of the actors and directors, because the workspace is not just a physical place for the artists involved but is also a psychological one. For instance, stage managers like to anticipate any needs that directors or actors might have, and to meet the needs of those individuals before they can say something about the issue. Sometimes it is as simple as anticipating that it is too noisy outside the rehearsal hall for actors to concentrate. From my rehearsal notes:

Leslie [an assistant stage manager] jumps up and runs out as a din arises outside the rehearsal room. She says, "Ladies and gentlemen, we have started rehearsal, so please keep the noise down." As she walks back into the room, Bethany [an actor] says to her, "I love that. You did that before I had to ask."

Other times, it can be as simple as anticipating that actors or a director might want a certain prop with which to rehearse. One stage manager, Rebecca, told a story to the other members of the stage management team that, to her, exemplified the pride that people at this particular theater took in anticipating the needs of actors. When she was the stage manager for *Glengarry Glen Ross*, a play in which the first act takes place in a Chinese restaurant, she was so proud on the day in rehearsal that the director asked if stage management could maybe get some fortune cookies with which the actors could rehearse in the next rehearsal and she was able to tell the director that she already had fortune cookies in the room. Stage managers see anticipating the needs of directors and actors as

an important component of allowing the actors and directors to concentrate on working on the scene that they are rehearsing, rather than on logistical queries that take them out of the scene. By preparing the physical space of the rehearsal room, as well as themselves, to take care of tasks efficiently during rehearsal, stage managers help create safe psychological spaces in which actors can work, yet stage managers also work to prepare actors themselves for transitions in the production process.

Preparation for the Transition to Technical Rehearsals and Beyond

Preparation takes many forms as the cast makes the transition to technical rehearsals. One aspect of technical rehearsals that stage managers must consider is that this is the first time that actors will spend time in the actual stage area. The stage has a different configuration from the rehearsal room, a problem that is often compounded by low lights and many new obstacles in the path of the actors. In the shows I followed, one of the first things that happened when actors finally arrived onstage was a safety walk-through. Led in part by stage management, these walk-throughs highlighted potential hazards for the actors. Stage managers emphasized repeatedly that actors should not hesitate to call, “Hold!” if they felt unsafe. Stage management was on hand to allay any actors’ fears about their safety. For instance, during the first technical rehearsal of one play, the actors were not used to coming on for a scene change in such low light. Because of this, Carrie, the main stage manager, had Abby, the assistant stage manager, place glow tape on the stairs. The fact that this was done in front of the actors but before any of them requested it only helped to illustrate to the actors that they were in safe hands with this group of stage managers.

This preparation allows stage managers to show actors that they care, while also preparing the actors for the production itself. Whereas once the stage manager prepared the rehearsal room so the wishes and needs of actors would be anticipated and fulfilled, now the stage manager prepares the actors for the performances beyond the technical rehearsal. The actors are now more responsible than ever for the maintenance of their performance, and the stage manager, in turn, is the one responsible for ensuring that the performance is in line with everything that came before.

EMOTIONAL IDEOLOGY: THE GOOD OF THE SHOW

Stage managers base the elements of emotion work that they use in obtaining authority on an overarching emotional ideology: that they are there to work for the good of the show. This ideology informs everything they do, from taking emotional abuse to defining success. This means that the stage manager is the one who is ultimately responsible for the success of the show as a whole. When asked what she was responsible for in a production, one stage manager answered,

Everything. (Laughs) Pretty much everything ... you know, even if we’re not directly responsible for it, we are responsible for making sure it happens. You know ... I

can't fix all the little [problems, like] this hole in the wall, but I can make sure that the production manager knows that there is a hole in the wall that needs to be fixed and they make sure that the crew knows that it needs to be fixed and have a work call scheduled to make it be fixed and before our next tech [as well], or whatever.

Even for this stage manager, the job is so all-encompassing and varied that it is hard to conceive of a part of the production that is beyond her purview. Thus, the good of the show is the most important goal for stage managers.

Ultimately, the best defense that a stage manager has against the emotional vagaries of the job is this commitment to the good of the show. A deep commitment to the show helps sustain one stage manager, Hal:

Well, as far as myself personally, I know that I have to take my own personal feelings out of it, which keeps me from having a lot of conflict, so I find that helps me deal with my own personal conflict with other people because it's not personal, I'm not here for me. Again, I can't speak from myself, my own feelings; I have to speak from the play, from the production, what the production needs, and if I do that, and if I sincerely do that, honestly speak in that way, then that's something that the other people will recognize, or that's my belief, at any rate. So if I have to give an actor a note, he may get frustrated with me for giving him a note, or they just [may] not like getting notes, you know I can't take that personally—I have to give them the note because that's what's best for the show.

A commitment to the show helps in two ways. First, it allows the stage manager another chance to display to the cast that he or she is there with a higher purpose in mind. Second, it allows the stage manager to ignore any anger directed at him or her, knowing that he or she was only doing what was best for the production. The successful completion of the production is key to the stage manager's emotional well-being.

The emotional rewards that stage managers receive from their jobs stem from their commitment to the show. While the emotional rewards are numerous, when they were asked, "What do you like best about being a stage manager?" or "What was your best experience as a stage manager?" a similar theme surfaced: Stage managers derive their greatest satisfaction from having the production as a whole succeed. Their emotional investment is in the seamlessness of a production, seamlessness that they themselves are responsible for orchestrating.

Even the smallest successes can bring about great joy for stage managers. As incredibly detail-oriented individuals, they take pride in things that might not even be

obvious to the audience. One stage manager, when talking about experiences that were the best, said,

I mean right now, I have happy moments every night, if I call light cue 46 just right, and the light cue just comes up and he just finishes that harmonica note and it's just like, "Ahh." And every night he does it a little differently, so you really need to play it out and see what's happening, and you know sometimes it's that small and I'm like, "Yeah!"

For this stage manager, emotional rewards come from small details done well. She remembers the exact number of the light cue. It also highlights that her greatest joy comes from one of the most technically challenging moments of calling the show. It suggests not only an extreme attention to detail but also a sense of perfectionism. Her happiest moments are when she is able to get the cue just at the right moment, something that demands her attention and skills in ways that are noticeable only, at best, to the other members of the cast and production team. The emotional rewards that this stage manager receives, then, are tied to the fact that she is at least partially responsible for the successful running of the show.

CONCLUSION

The emotional ideology of stage managers offers us clues about how they establish their authority in the eyes of their casts. Stage managers adopt an emotional ideology that causes them to judge all of their actions through the prism of how well they serve as caretakers for the show. The emotional rewards that stage managers receive from their work come from taking care of the show as a whole. Caretaking, in turn, is manifested through emotion work.

Specifically, stage managers act as caretakers in three ways: They act as emotional buffers absorbing the negative emotions of those around them in order to maintain a well-functioning workplace, work to create a safe place that shelters the actors and director from forces both beyond and within the rehearsal room, and prepare actors for the transition from the rehearsal room into technical rehearsals and performances, when the stage manager will not be able to offer the same level of emotional support.

The emotion work of being a caregiver is something that stage managers can engage in to display their commitment to the show, and it serves as a substitute for another important power base that they cannot display in the presence of actors: artistic expertise. Stage managers use this emotion work to develop authority over actors during the production process. In turn, this suggests a way in which individuals, particularly those with lower status, who do not have access to other bases of power, may use emotion work to elevate their status and gain authority over others.

ENDNOTES

1. In this case, I use “caretaker” to mean that stage managers value the play and value the skills of the director and actors. That said, the work that stage managers do in demonstrating this valuation comprises in part some of the same activities traditionally thought of as care work (England 2005), including care of both the physical and emotional needs of the director and actors.
2. All names used are pseudonyms, and other identifying information about the people and plays has been changed to preserve confidentiality.

REFERENCES

- Actors' Equity Association. 2006. “AEA Stage Manager's Packet.” Retrieved July 1, 2006 (http://www.actorsequity.org/docs/production/aea_sm_packet.pdf).
- Bolton, Charon C., and Carol Boyd. 2003. “Trolley Dolly or Skilled Emotion Manager? Moving on from Hochschild's Managed Heart.” *Work, Employment and Society* 17:289–308.
- Charmaz, Kathy. 2006. *Constructing Grounded Theory: A Practical Guide Through Qualitative Analysis*. London: Sage.
- Côté, Stéphane, Paulo M. Lopes, Peter Salovey, and Christopher T. H. Miners. 2010. “Emotional Intelligence and Leadership Emergence in Small Groups.” *The Leadership Quarterly* 21:496–508.
- Dasborough, Marie T, and Neal M. Ashkanasy. 2002. “Emotion and Attribution of Intentionality in Leader-Member Relationships.” *The Leadership Quarterly* 13:615–34.
- England, Paula. 2005. “Emerging Theories of Care Work.” *Annual Review of Sociology* 31:381–99.
- Eulau, Heinz. 1962. “Bases of Authority in Legislative Bodies: A Comparative Analysis.” *Administrative Science Quarterly* 7:309–21.
- French, John R. Jr., and Bertram H. Raven. 1959. “The Bases of Social Power.” Pp. 150–67 in *Studies in Social Power*, edited by D. Cartwright. Ann Arbor, MI.: Institute for Social Research.
- George, Jennifer. 2000. “Emotions and Leadership: The Role of Emotional Intelligence.” *Human Relations* 53:1027–55.
- Glaser, Barry G., and Anselm L. Strauss. 1967. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. New York: Aldine Pub. Co.
- Goffman, Erving. 1959. *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. New York: Doubleday.
- Hochschild, Arlie. 1979. “Emotion Work, Feeling Rules, and Social Structure.” *The American Journal of Sociology* 85:551–75.
- Hochschild, Arlie. 1983. *The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

- Humphrey, Ronald H. 2008. "The Right Way to Lead with Emotional Labor." Pp. 1–17 in *Affect and Emotion: New Directions in Management Theory and Research*, edited by R. H. Humphrey. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.
- Humphrey, Ronald H., Jeffrey M. Pollack, and Thomas Hawver. 2008. "Leading with Emotional Labor." *Journal of Managerial Psychology* 23:151–68.
- Kordsmeier, Gregory T. 2011. "The Play's the Thing: Stage Managers as Support Personnel and Their Role in the Creation of Art." PhD dissertation, Department of Sociology, University of Wisconsin–Madison.
- Lovaglia, Michael J., Christabel L. Rogalin, Shane D. Soboroff, Christopher P. Kelley, and Jeffrey W. Lucas. 2008. "Humor and the Effectiveness of Diverse Leaders." Pp. 21–35 in *Social Structure and Emotion*, edited by J. Clay-Warner, and D. T. Robinson. San Diego, CA: Elsevier.
- Mukerji, Chandra. 1976. "Having the Authority to Know." *Sociology of Work and Occupations* 3:63–87.
- Orzechowicz, David. 2008. "Privileged Emotion Managers: The Case of Actors." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 71:143–56.
- Pescosolido, Anthony T. 2002. "Emergent Leaders as Managers of Group Emotion." *The Leadership Quarterly* 13:583–599.
- Presthus, Robert V. 1960. "Authority in Organizations." *Public Administration Review* 20:86–91.
- Ridgeway, Cecilia. 1982. "Status in Groups: The Importance of Motivation." *American Sociological Review* 47:76–88.
- Rogalin, Christabel L., and Laura E. Hirshfield. 2013. "Emotion and Leadership: What Scholarship on Status and Identity Can Tell Us." *Sociology Compass* 7(6):487–501.
- Shelly, Robert. 2001. "How Performance Expectations Arise from Sentiments." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 64:72–87.
- Strauss, Anselm L. 1987. *Qualitative Analysis for Social Scientists*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Weick, Karl E., Kathleen M. Sutcliffe, and David Obstfeld. 1999. "Organizing for High Reliability: Processes of Collective Mindfulness." *Research on Organizational Behavior* 21:81–123.

Parasocial Romances as Infidelity: Comparing Perceptions of Real-Life, Online, and Parasocial Extradyadic Relationships*

PAYTON SCHNARRE
University of Southern Indiana

AIMEE ADAM
University of Southern Indiana

ABSTRACT

Parasocial relationships are perceived friendships with media figures that are not reciprocated (Horton and Wohl 1956). Although parasocial relationships can be romantic (Adam and Sizemore 2013), it is unclear whether parasocial romances are perceived as infidelity. In this study, we compared men's and women's perceptions of offline, online, and parasocial extradyadic behavior. The sample included 188 undergraduate college students, who were administered one of three versions of a two-sentence story prompt about a couple in which one partner is involved in either an offline, online, or parasocial relationship. The participants were asked to write a brief story based on the prompt. Stories were content-analyzed for whether the behavior was seen as betrayal, reasons why it was or was not seen as such, and the impact on the couple's relationship. The majority of participants in the parasocial condition identified the parasocial relationship as an act of betrayal, although this percentage was smaller compared to the offline and online conditions. The majority of participants in this condition also described the "victim" as being hurt or upset by the behavior. These results indicate that even parasocial extradyadic relationships may have negative consequences on real-life relationships.

KEY WORDS Parasocial relationships; infidelity; story completion

Relationships are an important aspect of social interaction for many people. Stable romantic relationships are positively correlated with mental health factors such as happiness (Braithwaite, Delevi, and Fincham 2010) and are negatively correlated with depression (Coombs 1991). Partner infidelity, however, can result in lower life

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Aimee Adam, Department of Psychology, 8600 University Blvd, Evansville, IN 47712.

satisfaction and self-esteem (Spanier and Margolis 1983), and it is a leading cause of divorce (Amato and Previti 2003). How people define infidelity is complex, and different people view different behaviors as more distressing than others. Although sexual and emotional infidelity have been well studied, it is less clear whether imagined relationships are perceived as examples of infidelity, and whether such relationships influence real-life romantic relationships. Parasocial relationships are attachments to figures in the media that are not reciprocated (Horton and Wohl 1956), and they can be romantic in nature (Adam and Sizemore 2013; Tuchakinsky 2010). In the current article, we report on a study in which we investigated whether participants viewed offline, online, and parasocial behaviors as infidelity, why or why not, and potential influences of these behaviors on real-life relationships.

TYPES OF INFIDELITY

Although most people associate infidelity with extradyadic sexual intimacy, recent research distinguishes between emotional and sexual infidelity (Buss et al. 1992). Emotional infidelity refers to forming an intimate emotional attachment to someone, whereas sexual infidelity refers to sexual intimacy with another, in which an emotional connection may or may not be present (Buss et al. 1992). Overall, attitudes toward different types of infidelity differ across cultures, gender, and prior experience (for a review, see Blow and Hartnett 2005).

Some research has focused on less-traditional definitions of infidelity. Whitty (2003) investigated perceptions of offline and online behaviors such as cybersex, hot chat, pornography use, and emotional and sexual intimacy. Porn use was seen as a factor separate from sexual or emotional infidelity and was seen as less worrisome (Whitty 2003); in contrast, cybersexual behaviors were perceived similarly to offline sexual behaviors regarding infidelity, suggesting that what is perceived as betrayal in a romantic relationship is more complex than originally thought. Even sexually fantasizing about someone can be perceived as infidelity (Feldman and Cauffman 1999; Yarab, Allgeier, and Sensibaugh 1999) and as jealousy-provoking (Yarab et al. 1999). The more sexual fantasizing is seen as a threat to a relationship, the more it is considered to be infidelity (Yarab and Allgeier 1998).

PARASOCIAL RELATIONSHIPS

Many people report forming parasocial relationships with real-life celebrities and fictional characters. These relationships, which are marked by intense emotional (and sometimes physical) attraction and feelings that one could be friends with, date, or turn to media figure in times of need, are formed through media use but are mentally maintained outside of the media environment. Although this is a well-established area, possible effects of parasocial relationships on real-life relationships have not been well studied. To further examine whether romantic parasocial relationships (parasocial romance) are perceived as infidelity, we extended research conducted by Whitty (2005) in which she used Kitzinger and Powell's (1995) story-completion task to investigate perceptions of

online relationships as cheating. Whitty demonstrated that about 84 percent of people considered having an Internet relationship to be an act of betrayal (compared to 90 percent if “seeing someone” offline, according to Kitzinger and Powell 1995). When people did not define cyber relationships as cheating, it was because of a lack of physical sexual intimacy (Whitty). In the current study, we also used Kitzinger and Powell’s story-completion task to compare participants’ reactions to parasocial romances with having an offline relationship or a cyber relationship. The first goal of the current study was to extend the research conducted by Kitzinger and Powell and by Whitty to investigate overall perceptions of parasocial romances as acts of betrayal compared to offline or cyber relationships.

SEX DIFFERENCES IN PERCEPTIONS OF INFIDELITY

Men and women differ in what they define as infidelity and in how distressing they find those behaviors. Overall, women define a wider range of behaviors as infidelity (Hackathorn 2009; Whitty 2003). Some research has demonstrated that men are more likely to find physical, sexual infidelity upsetting, whereas women find emotional infidelity more distressing (Buss et al. 1992; Cann, Mangum, and Wells 2001); however, other research indicates that both men and women find sexual infidelity, at least, to be equally distressing (Yarab et al. 1999). As previously indicated, cyber cheating can also be seen as an act of betrayal. Online relationships are considered by many to be as hurtful and detrimental to real-life relationships as offline infidelity (Whitty 2003, 2005). Women in particular are more likely to be distressed by both online infidelity (Hackathorn 2009; Whitty 2005) and sexual fantasizing (Yarab et al. 1999).

In the current study, we predicted that, similarly to cyber relationships, women would be more likely than men to identify romantic parasocial relationships as betrayal, via the story-completion task, and would also be more likely than men to voice negative effects of the parasocial relationship on a couple’s relationship.

METHOD

Participants

One hundred eighty eight (188) students from a medium-sized regional university in the Midwest were recruited via the SONA system (an online research pool) from introductory psychology classes and were given access to a link to Survey Monkey to take part in an online study. Participants were age 18 and above ($M = 19.39$, $SD = 2.71$). The sample consisted of 137 women and 51 men, who were primarily white (89 percent). Participants were granted research credit through SONA upon completion of the study, which counted toward extra credit or course requirements.

Design/Procedure

We conducted a between-subjects experiment using Kitzinger and Powell’s (1995) story-completion method, in which participants were given a two-line scenario describing

different behaviors. The independent variable in this study was type of behavior (parasocial, online, or offline infidelity). The scenario was worded the same for every condition except for when it came to the type of cheating. All participants' scenarios began, "Jennifer and Mark have been going out for over a year." In the offline condition, the second sentence reads, "Then Jennifer realizes that Mark is seeing someone else." This scenario was used in the original study by Kitzinger and Powell (1995), who used the names John and Claire. In the online condition, the second sentence is "Then Jennifer realizes that Mark has developed a relationship with someone else over the Internet." This scenario was used by Whitty (2005). In the parasocial condition, the second sentence reads, "Then Jennifer notices that Mark still talks all the time about his favorite celebrity and how attractive she is." Participants were randomly assigned to each condition.

Following this prompt, participants were asked to complete the story by writing one or two paragraphs. The two authors then blindly coded the stories separately. Any discrepancies in coding were discussed and reconciled. We coded for three dependent variables: whether the participant viewed the scenario as an act of betrayal (from the viewpoint of Jennifer), why or why not, and what (if any) the impact on the relationship was. Whitty's (2005) results were used as initial coding categories, but other common reasons for why the behavior was or was not betrayal, and other frequently portrayed effects of the behavior on the relationship were also noted. If participants described multiple effects on the relationship, we noted all of them. Participants were also asked about their romantic relationship status, gender, age, and ethnicity.

RESULTS

Behavior as Betrayal

Thirteen (13) participants did not complete the task as instructed; they did not write a story but instead discussed possible actions that Jennifer could or should do. These participants were excluded from analyses. In Whitty's (2005) study, 84 percent of the sample perceived the online condition to be an act of betrayal. In the current study, we found that 90 percent of participants in the online condition perceived the behavior as an act of betrayal from the viewpoint of Jennifer. In addition, we found that 95 percent of participants in the offline infidelity condition saw Mark's behavior as a definitive act of betrayal, which was similar to the 90 percent found by Kitzinger and Powell (1995). Finally, 76 percent of participants in the parasocial condition saw the behavior as an act of betrayal. Thus, although there was a difference in how parasocial behaviors were perceived, most participants still felt that it was a behavior harmful to the real-life romantic relationship (Table 1). Some participants wrote stories indicating that although Jennifer was suspicious and hurt at first, she later found out that her worries were unfounded. Because in these stories Jennifer still felt that she was being betrayed, we did not classify them as straightforward acts of betrayal or lack of betrayal, instead giving them their own category.

Table 1. Frequency of Perceptions of an Act as Betrayal

Act of Betrayal	Offline	Online	Parasocial
Yes	70	53	34
No	1	0	11
First yes, then no	3	6	0
Did not complete	4	4	5

Behavior as Infidelity: Why or Why Not?

In the original Whitty (2005) study, the categories used for why the behavior was an act of betrayal included that the partner couldn't have a relationship with more than one person, that the behavior constituted emotional or sexual infidelity, or that the partner was keeping secrets. In the current study, participants rarely discussed sexual behavior, focusing on other reasons that Jennifer was upset. For both the offline and cyber scenarios, the most common reason given for the behavior being an act of betrayal included betrayal of trust or emotional betrayal (Table 2). For example:

Jennifer gets really upset with Mark because she trusted him. Now the trust between Mark and Jennifer is gone or at least damaged. (female, offline)

She confronts Mark about the other relationship and he denies it. She gets really upset because he broke her trust. She decides to break up with him. (male, online)

Table 2. Explanations for Why the Behavior Was Seen as Betrayal

Why Betrayal?	Offline	Online	Parasocial
	<i>N (%)</i>	<i>N (%)</i>	<i>N (%)</i>
Betrayal of trust/emotion	29 (41.1)	21 (35.5)	1 (2.9)
There can be only one	18 (25.7)	11 (18.6)	1 (2.9)
Feelings of inadequacy	2 (2.9)	6 (10.2)	26 (76.5)

Similar to Whitty's (2005) findings, another common reason that the offline and online behaviors were seen as betrayal was that the partner can't have a relationship with more than one person:

After thinking about it, Jennifer decided it was best for them to break up. She reasoned with him that if he did like her, then the other girl would have never been in the picture. They each went their separate ways and they never spoke again. (female, offline)

Interestingly, only one person indicated that offline cheating was *not* an act of infidelity:

Jennifer was okay with this because she has always wanted to be a swinger. She decides to come clean to Mark that she actually finds this to be a great idea and says she would like to start seeing another man on the side but remain committed to Mark. Mark loves this idea as well and they both become swingers who love each other. They live their lives in this manner and get married. They live in reasonable comfort and are moderately happy till the end of their days.

In addition, *no* participants explicitly indicated that online infidelity was *not* an act of betrayal, unlike in Whitty's (2005) study, in which 9 percent of responses indicated that the online scenario was not cheating. Four participants completed the story in such a way that Jennifer was hurt at first but then found out that it was all some kind of mistake. For example:

Jennifer did not want to jump to any conclusions before she knew and understood the whole story. Jennifer read Marks [sic] conversions and learned that he was not cheating on her and that he had just met a new friend online. Their conversations were harmless and just friendly conversations. (female, online)

In the parasocial scenario, a theme that emerged was that most people viewed the behavior to be an act of betrayal because it made the victim (Jennifer) feel worse about herself and question her worth in the relationship. For example:

Mark is trying to picture himself with this celebrity. He must believe he could see himself with this celebrity, and believes she is an all-around, perfect girl. Therefore, Jennifer decides that Mark is trying to low-key tell Jennifer how he would like her to act or change to better meet Mark's desires. Jennifer becomes jealous. (female, parasocial)

However, this theme also emerged in the other conditions as well:

Anna also suggests that no matter what Mark says, it is NOT Jennifer's fault and she must try to move on because both people have to be trying in a relationship to make things work and no women [sic] as beautiful as she should let someone do that to her. Jennifer agrees to take her sister's advice, but she can't help the feeling of worthlessness that has come over her. (female, online)

The only condition in which more than one participant explicitly indicated that the behavior was not an act of betrayal was the parasocial condition ($N = 11$). Responses for why the parasocial scenario would *not* be considered infidelity included “because everyone does it” ($N = 4$), “because it’s not real/just a celebrity” ($N = 4$), and that it was innocent/not harmful ($N = 3$). For example:

Jennifer decides that when Mark talks about his favorite celebrity that she has nothing to worry about. Yes it hurts her feelings when he constantly talks about how attractive she is, but it’s not like he is ever going to actually be with her. (female, parasocial)

Impact on Relationship

In all three scenarios, more than half of participants explicitly indicated that Jennifer was upset by Mark’s behavior, and in both the offline and cyber conditions, participants indicated more than half the time that Jennifer broke up with Mark (Table 3). Different themes emerged depending upon the scenario viewed, however. In the offline scenario, Jennifer tended to be very upset and to confront Mark, who often lied about his behavior (30 percent of the time), which resulted in Jennifer breaking up with Mark (79 percent). In the online scenario, Jennifer was upset but often hid her knowledge of the online affair for a while (32 percent of the time) prior to confronting Mark, who often lied (29 percent of the time). Upon demonstrating the truth via technology (e-mails and messages, for example), Jennifer would then break up with Mark (51 percent); in this scenario, a quarter of respondents indicated that some kind of revenge or karma took place (and three participants indicated that Mark was physically harmed as a result of his infidelity). Again, this is very similar to Whitty’s (2005) study, in which she found that 46 percent of couples in the cyber condition broke up.

In the parasocial scenario, a different theme emerged: Often, Jennifer was depicted as upset and feeling inadequate, but when she confronted Mark, they discussed her feelings (38 percent) and reconciled (33 percent). Generally, participants indicated that Mark didn’t understand the impact of his behavior and would change his behavior. For example:

Jennifer decides that when Mark talks about his favorite celebrity that she has nothing to worry about. Yes it hurts her feelings when he constantly talks about how attractive she is, but it’s not like he is ever going to actually be with her. Jennifer one day tells mark that it hurts her feelings. Mark then realizes how it would hurt his feelings if Jennifer did the same. They both talk about it and move on with a happier and better relationship. (Female, parasocial)

Table 3. Descriptive Statistics for How Mark's Behavior Affected Jennifer and Mark's Relationship

Effect on Relationship	Offline	Online	Parasocial
	<i>N</i> (%)	<i>N</i> (%)	<i>N</i> (%)
J. upset/hurt	43 (60.6)	30 (50.8)	31 (68.9)
Confrontation	45 (63.4)	45 (76.3)	25 (55.6)
Increased communication	1 (1.4)	8 (13.6)	17 (37.8)
Reconciliation	4 (5.6)	6 (10.2)	15 (33.3)
Breakup	61 (85.9)	40 (67.8)	7 (15.6)
None	0 (0.0)	0 (0.0)	6 (13.3)
Hid knowledge	7 (9.9)	19 (32.2)	5 (11.1)
Negative outcome	2 (2.8)	0 (0.0)	5 (11.1)
Revenge/M. hurt	6 (8.5)	17 (28.8)	0 (0.0)
M. lies	21 (29.6)	17 (28.8)	0 (0.0)
Shock	2 (2.8)	4 (6.8)	0 (0.0)
M. angry at J.	6 (8.5)	4 (6.8)	0 (0.0)

Interestingly, the parasocial scenario still resulted in the dissolution of the relationship by one or both parties 16 percent of the time, compared to 80 percent for the offline scenario and 68 percent for the cyber scenario.

Jennifer tends to get discouraged by what Mark says and begins to compare herself to him [*sic*]. After a few months, they end up [breaking] up because she feels she is not good enough for him. (female, parasocial)

Sex Differences in Perceptions of Infidelity

Across all prompts, women wrote significantly more in response to the prompt ($M_{\text{Women}} = 121.51$ words, $SD = 43.15$) than did men ($M_{\text{Men}} = 75.17$, $SD = 67.08$); $t(173) = 5.37$, $p < .001$, $d = .82$. Women also discussed more ways in which the behavior affected the relationship ($M_{\text{Women}} = 3.14$, $SD = 1.15$) than did men ($M_{\text{Men}} = 2.69$, $SD = 1.25$); $t(173) = 2.24$, $p = .02$, $d = .37$. As previously stated, in both the offline and cyber scenarios, there was little variation in whether the behavior was seen as betrayal—participants, both male and female, saw Mark's behavior as infidelity. Only in the parasocial condition did more than one person explicitly indicate that there was no betrayal. In this condition, 27 women indicated that it was an act of betrayal, and 8 indicated that it was not. Of the men, 4 indicated that it was betrayal, and 3 indicated that it was not. The differences between the genders were not significant ($\chi^2(1) = 1.20$, $p = .27$); thus, this prediction was not supported. There were so few men in this condition that conclusions should be drawn cautiously, however.

Regarding reasons why the behavior was seen as an act of infidelity, in the offline condition, men were more likely to indicate that the offline extradyadic relationship was

an act of betrayal because there could be only two people in a relationship (47 percent compared to women's 17 percent). In comparison, women were more likely to indicate that it was an act of betrayal because it violated the trust between partners (37 percent, compared to men's 11 percent). A similar pattern was found for the online condition. This is similar to the results of Whitty's (2005) study, which found that women were more likely to indicate that online relationships were considered betrayal because of the emotional impact. In the parasocial condition, 43 percent of men and 61 percent of women indicated that the act was betrayal because it made Jennifer feel badly about herself (this was also the only reason that men gave). These results may indicate that men and women may view extradyadic parasocial crushes similarly; however, additional research is needed to draw stronger conclusions.

A subset of relationship outcomes was selected to compare between genders. Specifically, we were interested in whether participants described Jennifer as being hurt or upset by the behavior, in order to test our hypothesis. We also combined all breakup outcomes for comparison between genders and compared positive outcomes (reconciliation). Across all conditions, a greater percentage of women described Jennifer as being hurt by the behavior (Table 4); however, a chi-square test conducted to see if more women than men described Jennifer as hurt (out of all women and men in that condition) was not significant: $\chi^2(1) = .53, p = .47$. This hypothesis was not supported. There were no other differences in how men and women described the impact of the extradyadic behavior on Jennifer and Mark's relationship (Table 4).

Table 4. Gender Differences in How the Behavior Affected Jennifer and Mark's Relationship (Selected Categories)

Effect	Offline		Online		Parasocial	
	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women
	(<i>N</i> = 19) <i>N</i> (%)	(<i>N</i> = 52) <i>N</i> (%)	(<i>N</i> = 21) <i>N</i> (%)	(<i>N</i> = 38) <i>N</i> (%)	(<i>N</i> = 7) <i>N</i> (%)	(<i>N</i> = 38) <i>N</i> (%)
J. upset	6 (31.6)	37 (71.2)	10 (47.6)	20 (52.6)	4 (57.1)	27 (71.1)
Breakup	16 (84.2)	41 (78.9)	14 (66.7)	26 (68.4)	2 (28.6)	5 (13.2)
Reconciliation	2 (10.5)	2 (3.8)	1 (4.8)	6 (15.8)	0 (0.0)	7 (18.4)

One theme that emerged only in the parasocial condition and was expressed only by women was that Jennifer changed her appearance to please Mark and win him back from his parasocial crush. Four (4) of the 38 women in the parasocial condition indicated that Jennifer changed to please Mark. For example:

Jennifer seems to feel a bit threatened and starts to wonder why Mark seems to be attracted to her. Jennifer then starts to think that Mark likes the way the celebrity looks and starts to change her appearance so she can resemble that

celebrity. Mark starts to notice Jennifer's changes and comments on how he likes how she has changed. Jennifer feels better about herself and Mark now that she has done this. (female, parasocial)

DISCUSSION

First, we replicated Whitty's (2005) findings, in that most participants portrayed online extradyadic behavior as an act of betrayal and as negatively affecting real-life romantic relationships (including dissolution of the relationship). An interesting finding that emerged from the cyber/online condition was that participants indicated that Jennifer often initially waited to confront Mark and used technology to spy on him to verify her suspicions. Participants had Jennifer read his text messages and e-mails, check out his discussion forums and social media posts, go through his browser history, usurp his media accounts, and even create fake online profiles in order to investigate Mark. In this scenario, Mark often blames Jennifer for violating his privacy. Although Whitty (2005) indicated that some of her participants responded similarly, this trend seems in direct conflict with a main theme of the parasocial condition, which is that Jennifer brings her fears to Mark, they discuss his behavior, and they reconcile. Further research on how participants understand and use technology to deal with online infidelity is warranted.

A main goal of this research was to expand what is known about perceptions of offline and online infidelity to explore perceptions of parasocial romances. We demonstrated that although parasocial behavior was less likely to be seen as infidelity than were offline or cyber infidelity, most participants *did* perceive extradyadic parasocial relationships to be a form of betrayal and as potentially harmful to real-life romantic relationships. Almost all participants in the parasocial condition (96 percent) mentioned some kind of negative effect of the attachment, including being upset, feeling inadequate, breaking up, or other negative outcome, even if Jennifer and Mark eventually increased communication and reconciled. It is clear that participants felt that Jennifer's self-esteem might be threatened by Mark's parasocial romance; however, further research is needed to examine the role of participant self-esteem on perceptions of extradyadic parasocial relationships. It is important to note that not all participants were convinced that parasocial romances would ever affect real romantic relationships: Four out of five of participants who were in the parasocial condition and did not complete it correctly indicated that they did not see anything wrong with the scenario. It is evident, however, that many young people do view this type of mental infidelity as distressing and potentially harmful to a relationship. Participants also suggested that the key to diminishing the effect of this type of behavior is honest communication between partners.

Although we hypothesized gender differences in perceptions of extradyadic parasocial romances, these hypotheses were not supported, though we found that some women in the parasocial condition indicated that Jennifer changed her physical appearance or behavior to be more like Mark's parasocial ideal, which did not happen in the other two conditions. This could be due to how sensitive young women are to perfected celebrity depictions. Celebrities are more accessible than ever and have a lot of

control over their appearance through their own social media accounts, which could change how people form and strengthen parasocial relationships. Instant access to a multitude of perfected celebrity images could also increase upward appearance-based social comparisons to a partner's parasocial crush, which can negatively affect self-esteem (Martin and Gentry 1997; Richins 1991). Comparing oneself to a celebrity when one is constantly bombarded by celebrity images may be largely automatic (Lyubomirsky and Ross 1997). More research is needed to further understand the role of media use, social comparison, and self-esteem in perceptions of a partner's romantic parasocial relationship as infidelity.

Limitations

One limitation of this study was the young age of the participants. Most participants from this age group have had few long-term romantic relationships, which could affect the way the participant responds to the scenarios. Future researchers could expand this area to better understand how older adults view both parasocial and online extradyadic behavior. In addition, the small number of male participants, particularly in the parasocial condition, limits the interpretation of gender differences in perceptions of parasocial behaviors. Additional research is needed to further explore gender differences in perceptions of extradyadic parasocial romances.

In the current study, Mark was always depicted as the betrayer. In both Whitty's (2005) study and the original Kitzinger and Powell (1995) study, the partner enacting the extradyadic behavior varied, and the researchers found that the gender of the betrayer did influence perceptions of betrayal. This dynamic should be further explored regarding parasocial behaviors; it seems likely that if Jennifer were the betrayer, participants might evaluate her actions differently as well.

REFERENCES

- Adam, Aimee, and Brittany Sizemore. 2013. "Parasocial Romance: A Social Exchange Perspective." *Interpersona* 7(1):12–25.
- Amato, Paul R., and Denise Previti. 2003. "People's Reasons for Divorcing: Gender, Social Class, the Life Course, and Adjustment." *Journal of Family Issues* 24(5):602–26.
- Blow, Adrian J., and Kelley Hartnett. 2005. "Infidelity in Committed Relationships II: A Substantive Review." *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy* 31(2):217–33.
- Braithewaite, Scott R., Raquel Delevi, and Frank D. Fincham. 2010. "Romantic Relationships and the Physical and Mental Health of College Students." *Personal Relationships* 17(1):1–12.
- Buss, David M., Randy J. Larsen, Drew Westen, and Jennifer Semmelroth. 1992. "Sex Differences in Jealousy: Evolution, Physiology, and Psychology." *Psychological Science* 3(4):251–55.

- Cann, Arnie, Jessica L. Mangum, and Marissa Wells. 2001. "Distress in Response to Relationship Infidelity: The Roles of Gender and Attitudes About Relationships." *The Journal of Sex Research* 38(3):185–90.
- Coombs, Robert. 1991. "Marital Status and Personal Well-Being: A Literature Review." *Family Relations* 40(1):97–102.
- Feldman, Shirley S., and Elizabeth Cauffman. 1999. "Your Cheatin' Heart: Attitudes, Behaviors, and Correlates of Sexual Betrayal in Late Adolescents." *Journal of Research on Adolescence* 9(3):227–52.
- Hackathorn, Jana. 2009. "Beyond Touching: The Evolutionary Theory and Computer-Mediated Infidelity." *The New School Psychology Bulletin* 6(1):29–34.
- Horton, Donald, and Richard Wohl. 1956. "Mass Communication and Para-social Interaction." *Psychiatry* 19:215–29.
- Kitzinger, Celia, and Deborah Powell. 1995. "Engendering Infidelity: Essentialist and Social Constructionist Readings of a Story Completion Task." *Feminism and Psychology* 5(3):345–72.
- Lyubomirsky, Sonja, and Lee Ross. 1997. "Hedonic Consequences of Social Comparison: A Contrast of Happy and Unhappy People." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 73(6):1141–57.
- Martin, Mary C., and James W. Gentry. 1997. "Stuck in the Model Trap: The Effects of Beautiful Models in Ads on Female Pre-adolescents and Adolescents." *Journal of Advertising* 26(2):19–33.
- Richins, Marsha L. 1991. "Social Comparison and the Idealized Images of Advertising." *Journal of Consumer Research* 18(June):71–83.
- Spanier, Graham B., and Randie L. Margolis. 1983. "Marital Separation and Extramarital Sexual Behavior." *Journal of Sex Research* 19(1):23–48.
- Tuchakinsky, Riva. 2010. "Para-Romantic Love and Para-Friendships: Development and Assessment of a Multiple Parasocial Relationships Scale." *American Journal of Media Psychology* 3:73–94.
- Whitty, Monica T. 2003. "Pushing the Wrong Buttons: Men's and Women's Attitudes toward Online and Offline Infidelity." *Cyberpsychology & Behavior* 6(6):569–79.
- Whitty, Monica T. 2005. "The Realness of Cybercheating: Men's and Women's Representations of Unfaithful Internet Relationships." *Social Science Computer Review* 23(1):57–67.
- Yarab, Paul E., and Elizabeth R. Allgeier. 1998. "Don't Even Think About It: The Role of Sexual Fantasies as Perceived Unfaithfulness in Heterosexual Dating Relationships." *Journal of Sex Education and Therapy* 23(3):246–54.
- Yarab, Paul E., Elizabeth R. Allgeier, and Christine C. Sensibaugh. 1999. "Looking Deeper: Extradynamic Behaviors, Jealousy, and Perceived Unfaithfulness in Hypothetical Dating Relationships." *Personal Relationships* 6:305–16.

*The Importance of Unions in Contemporary Times**

ANNE STATHAM
University of Southern Indiana

PAUL GREIDER
Florida Southwestern State College

ABSTRACT

This article examines the importance of unions in contemporary times. Our research focuses on United Auto Workers Local 72, a union representing workers at a factory in Kenosha, Wisconsin, during several plant closings. Using qualitative data collected over a span of more than 20 years, we examine the role of the local union in helping the workers respond to the plant closing in ways that would produce the most beneficial results for them. We trace stories of the workers' and union's resistance, cooperation, and pride in their work. The workers' continued commitment to quality and their strong work ethic seemed to be key factors in persuading the company to keep some work on the site and, later, to add more. These tactics were successful through several changes in ownership and economic cycles until the Great Recession of 2008, at which point the work destined for the plant in Kenosha was finally sent to Mexico, yet most of the workers affected by the original plant closing in 1988 were eventually able to come back to work and to retire with full pensions from the company. Our evidence suggests the roles that unions may continue to play in this age of globalization.

KEY WORDS Factory Closing; Autoworkers; Job Loss; Unions;
Management Relations

Shifts in a global economy conforming to hypercapitalism have put pressure on unions and their members to rethink their role in relating to the companies they work for. This paper frames the struggle of a group of autoworkers and their union (United Auto Workers Local 72) during two Chrysler plant closings in Kenosha, Wisconsin, located on

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Anne Statham, Department of Sociology, University of Southern Indiana, 8600 University Blvd. Evansville, IN 47712; (812) 465-1203.

The authors are grateful for research assistance received from Ben Sarabia.

the shores of Lake Michigan just 65 miles north of Chicago. We focus on the workers' fight to keep their factory open and then trace their journey after the initial job loss. Over ensuing decades, Local 72 union officials worked continuously to maintain jobs at the site and to attract new jobs by working cooperatively with the company to improve the bottom line.

The Chrysler plant in Kenosha was once part of the ailing American Motors Corporation (AMC), which in the early 1980s was nearly bankrupt. When the French automaker Renault decided to join forces with AMC, Renault was viewed as a lifeline to help the company until it could get back on its feet. Renault bought controlling interests of AMC shortly thereafter, but those years were demoralizing for the workers. According to union representatives, the French company did not think very highly of American unions, and their cars were disastrous for AMC in terms of reliability, which damaged their reputation with buyers. After sales of Renault cars faltered, the French wanted to close the Kenosha plant, but fortunately for the workers, Chrysler came into the picture and contracted with Renault to build cars for them in the mid-1980s. By 1987 Chrysler had bought controlling interest in AMC and, in the weeks that followed, received millions of dollars from the state of Wisconsin in exchange for promising that they would keep auto production in Kenosha for at least five years. Near the end of 1987, however, the bottom dropped out of the auto market and Chrysler suddenly had too much production capacity; in a hotly contested move, it announced it was closing the Kenosha assembly and stamping plants in 1988 while maintaining production in a small engine plant there for a time. After a flurry of attempts to dissuade the company from closing any plants in Kenosha, the leadership of Local 72 began various attempts to influence the company as well as state and local officials to keep auto production going in Kenosha at any level.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Throughout industrial history, an ongoing struggle has existed between management and workers. In the beginning of auto manufacturing, the common laborer was considered to be underproductive, even lazy, needing oversight to maintain the needed level of productivity. Managers believed their workers "deliberately work[ed] slowly as to avoid doing a full day's work," which was called "soldering," or "underworking" (Taylor 1911:3). Factory workers often sought to diminish management's control over them and their amount of physical exertion on the job; Goffman (1959) used the terms "make work" and "work control" in describing this type of worker-manager relationship. The shop floor was permeated with a culture of conflict, as both managers and workers viewed the other with distrust, each considering the other to be an adversary. Hughes (1958) suggested that managers were influenced by their higher position in the division of labor prompting them to treat workers as subservient objects, while workers considered managers to be mere watchdogs overseeing their property (Halle 1984).

In the history of auto production, this conflict is apparent. Auto titans went to great lengths to keep unions out of their factories in attempts to keep unconditional control of the shop floor. For example, Henry Ford hired underworld figures to threaten

workers and disrupt organizing efforts (Lacey 1986; Lasky 1981), and Alfred P. Sloan hired secret police and Pinkerton detectives to do the same at General Motors (Mann 1987). The use of spies and strikebreakers to control workers has been the norm in auto plants since the 1930s (Curcio 2000; Lasky 1981; Mann 1987). At some point, autoworkers were not even allowed to speak to one another while at work (Lacey 1986; Lasky 1981), and many were subjected to intimidation, harassment, and even murder.

This adversarial relationship persisted even after unions were established. Lee Iacocca once described the interaction with workers as “the usual adversarial relationship between workers and management” (Iacocca 1984:175), and some believed that promoting conflict and distrust on the shop floor was healthy (Walton 1997). Autoworkers themselves said, “There was always that struggle between management and union; we were enemies” (Milkman 1997:2), and many workers complained that they were belittled and denigrated. “Managing by conflict” was actually part of the curriculum in business schools throughout the 1950s and 1960s, based largely on the culture of conflict in the auto industry (Walton 1997).

METHODS

We began studying the closings in Kenosha in 1988, when the first closing occurred. At that point, we began three longitudinal annual telephone interviews with a representative sample of the workers affected by the shutdown. The baseline interview was conducted as the plant was closing on December 23, 1988, and two follow-up interviews were done one and two years later, in the spring of 1990 and 1991, respectively. At the conclusion of our longitudinal surveys, we conducted in-depth interviews during the 1992–1993 academic year with nearly 40 individuals involved in some way with the shutdown. This sample included workers, managers, union and local governmental officials, and community leaders. These interviews explored respondents’ connections to both Chrysler and American Motors, their experiences with and perceptions of the shutdown, and their views of the aftermath. Throughout the interviews, constructions of reality were probed, as were various influence attempts, such as a threatened lawsuit against the company by various governmental units, bargaining for the termination package, and attempts to persuade the company to reverse its decision. A great deal was said about meaning-making, networking, and social perceptions. These data helped us a great deal in both framing the story and interpreting results from the quantitative longitudinal study.

We stayed in touch with union officials in the more than twenty years since the initial plant closing in 1988 and began interviewing them again in 2006. We conducted eight additional interviews between 2006 and 2010, when the second shutdown of the engine plant occurred. We conducted several more interviews in 2016, at which point we discovered that the workers had maintained a social club at the union hall in Kenosha, with several hundred meeting once a month for a social activity. We conducted approximately 25 more interviews and focus groups during that year with the former workers involved with these activities. These interviews and focus groups have been fully transcribed and analyzed using the constant comparison method, developed by Glaser and Strauss (1967). In addition to these data, we have also collected existing community

records, particularly those showing economic and employment trends before and after the plant shutdown, and a sizable file of newspaper clippings. We use these qualitative data for the analysis presented in this article. The more than 25 years of these data give a comprehensive picture of the trajectory of impact beyond what most studies can offer.

RESULTS

The Culture of Conflict in Kenosha Auto Production

The president of Local 72 at the time of the plant shutdown in 1988 had been working at American Motors for 38 years. In his dealings with management and his fight to save jobs in Kenosha, his philosophy was to give respect to management if they were respectful to workers. For two years, he was even a member of management as a foreman for the trim department in the early 1970s. He described the department superintendent (his immediate superior at the time) as “an idiot.”

He stated “that was the war mentality” on the shop floor back then. A visceral condition facilitated by anger or hostility can produce reflexive and often sudden reactions (Mead 1934). He said that the stewards in the union, knowing that so many of these managers had that kind of disdain for workers, were just looking for ways to get back at them:

Yeah, it was a war. If everything was going smooth, there were people in management and people in the union who would get together and figure a way to start a fight. If you disrespect the people you're working with so badly that you think they're the effin' enemy and every day you're trying to fire your foremen up to go out and demean them and attack them, that's the kind of culture that American Motors had. It was just self-destructive. You couldn't get anything done that way. The Chrysler culture was much better.

A former manager indicated that he didn't miss working at American Motors at all, saying, “No ... never one day I wished I was back as supervisor.” He said AMC had some “bad” bosses and superintendents working for them who often acted like “marine drill sergeants.” He concluded by saying, “I worked for some real nasty people on that shop floor.”

Another union official at Local 72 said before the Japanese gained market share in the American car market, nobody at AMC cared what the workers on the shop floor thought. They never asked workers for help or for their opinions because management wasn't under any pressure to manage any differently.

Our interviewees reported that it wasn't the company but the union that first made overtures to promote an “employee involvement” program at the AMC factory in Kenosha when the company was in financial difficulty and on the verge of collapse in the 1970s. Sales were down and there were rumors of plant closings. This resulted in a totally

different approach in the way Local 72 interacted with management. It was a paradigm shift, from an adversarial relationship to one that coalesces behind management to improve the company. Union officials believed they needed to get involved in the process of quality for self-preservation. They felt they had nothing to lose by working with the company because the alternative was a plant closing and loss of jobs.

The “partnership in progress” program at AMC did not go smoothly, as management had a hard time partnering with workers whom they considered the enemy. At this particular time, AMC was supported by sales at Jeep, so they saw no need to change their management style. The former president of the local pointed out that the partnership was disappointing because management “didn’t want to give up any of their prerogatives” and wanted the program in name only, and it failed.

Working with Different Companies

By 1980, AMC was losing millions; it didn’t have money for product development, and its cars were considered stuffy and outdated (Foster 1993). As a result, AMC began to lose market share, and by 1982, more than 4,000 Local 72 workers had been laid off from the Kenosha plant because of a drop in auto sales (Gunn 2010). In the face of the impending plant closing, Renault stepped into the picture. The company was looking to get into the American car market and bought 46 percent of AMC (Foster 1993).

By 1985, it was the worst of times for Local 72. The company was now controlled by Renault, and the French proved to be very aggressive toward the union and the workers (Gunn 2010). According to the former president of the local, when Renault took control of AMC, it was like jumping from one sinking ship to another. Still, the union tried to initiate the “partnership in progress” program with the new managers, but this proved to be even more difficult than with AMC.

When it was first produced in 1983, the Renault Alliance assembled in Kenosha was listed as *Motor Trend’s* Car of the Year and was on the list of *Car and Driver’s* ten best cars, mainly because of the quality of fit and finish attributed to the Kenosha workers who assembled the cars. Engineering issues with the car plagued the company because of the cost of warranty repairs, however. Additionally, “Renault was like a national treasure in France,” and the French didn’t want them in the United States. The French-designed Alliance was shipped from France to AMC in Kenosha as a kit for assembly, which was problematic because the cost of the kit and shipping was more than AMC could recoup when the car was sold. The Americans lost money on every car they sold; the more cars they sold, the more money they lost. These same problems plagued Alliances and Encores, and damaged AMC’s reputation with consumers. As the former president put it, “the cars were junk.”

But AMC’s relationship with Renault “kept the [Kenosha] plant open ... [and] kept things going. ... It gave us a chance to demonstrate what we could do in terms of quality of production. So when Chrysler needed a place to assemble autos, they said, ‘Let’s try there,’” in Kenosha.

Chrysler came into the picture at just the right time; when it contracted with AMC to build cars, Chrysler likely saved the Kenosha plant from closing. By the middle of

1986, AMC began making the Chrysler Fifth Avenues, Dodge Diplomats, and Plymouth Gran Fury for Chrysler (Gunn 2010), and the company was apparently impressed by the quality that the Kenosha workforce was producing at the urging of its union. A former manager recalled that because the factory in Kenosha was old, when Chrysler officials saw the plant, “They didn’t see how we could build a car there.”

In March 1987, Chrysler announced its plans to purchase AMC, and a short time later, the AMC and Renault lines were renamed the Eagle division of Chrysler. The Kenosha facility began producing Chrysler’s Dodge Omnis and Plymouth Horizons as well as engines for Jeep. Soon, the company moved its L-body (for the Omni-Horizon) cars there as well. A Local 72 union official said,

We had had a very good experience with the Chrysler managers that were in here supervising that endeavor [building the M-body cars] and they were very pleased with Kenosha. ... In May of ‘87 we were called to Detroit for a meeting with [Chrysler management and representatives of the UAW International Union] ... and all the locals of the AMC facilities, and [Chrysler] said that they were very pleased with their experience in Kenosha and although Kenosha was not gonna receive the new Jeep, they were gonna get the L-body and between the L-body and the M-body [cars,] Chrysler planned three to five years of high-level production in Kenosha. The L-body was sourced here from Belvedere; we recalled all our members who we laid off. We began hiring new people, and everyone was very encouraged that the plant had a chance to survive. The company represented to us at all times that they were doing this because they were pleased with the labor relations, the quality of workmanship, the work ethic of the workforce, and they did not desire any changes in the [contract] agreement to continue here in Kenosha.

Chrysler was also much more receptive to the “employee involvement” programs initiated by Local 72 and aimed at improving quality. Lee Iacocca already had a history of working with UAW teams on quality issues (see Iacocca 1984), so partnership programs were implemented and quality levels improved to a point that the Kenosha factory was producing higher-quality cars than were most of the other plants in the Chrysler system.

A union official said that when “they first put Omnis and Horizons and M-body [cars] in [Kenosha],” the fit and finish were of the “highest quality.” Workers told us that Chrysler rated cars according to several factors based on fit and finish and warranty issues. In fact, it was Chrysler officials themselves who checked and inspected the cars coming off the line. They would post the weekly results, and week after week, results showed that the AMC Kenosha facility was producing Chryslers, Dodges, and Plymouths

of better quality and at a cheaper cost than all the other Chrysler factories were. He added, “So we built a much better car than they had ever built in any of their plants, [and] we broke all kinds of records building quality in their cars.”

Another union official said the differences in management ideologies between AMC and Renault, compared to Chrysler, was like night and day. For example, if there was a problem in production and meeting the quota, AMC management had acted as an adversary and blamed the employee, focusing on the employee’s performance and disciplining the employee. In contrast, when Chrysler management was confronted with a similar production problem, it focused on the job itself, trying to figure out why the job was keeping the employee from making his or her quota.

The First Plant Shutdown

The future had finally started to look bright to Kenosha autoworkers when, on October 10, 1987, now known as Black Monday, the stock market crashed and dropped 1,000 points; car sales plummeted. Chrysler soon realized it had too many factories and not enough car sales. On January 27, 1988, Chrysler announced that it was ending production in Kenosha and closing the plant; about 5,500 workers in Kenosha would lose their jobs. The cars that were being built in Kenosha would be moved to other factories: the popular L-body compacts to the Jefferson Avenue Plant in Detroit, and the big M-body cars to Mexico. A Chrysler representative said, “We had to close the Kenosha assembly and stamping operations to keep competitive” (Ross 1988). Chrysler’s decision to close the auto plant in Kenosha was met with a firestorm; Local 72, in particular, did not take the plant-closing announcement lightly. The union fought with whatever means it could. It enlisted the help of state and local officials to pressure Lee Iacocca, then CEO of Chrysler, to change his mind. They threatened legal action against Chrysler for renegeing on its pledge to keep the Kenosha facility operating for five years. They even rented a billboard on the interstate highway that Iacocca took to his office, vilifying him for closing the Kenosha plant and throwing autoworkers on the street. Most of our respondents were shocked when the announcement of the plant closing came; one person said, “I didn’t anticipate anything like this plant closing coming.” According to the former president of the local, the governor of Wisconsin felt betrayed by Chrysler. Local 72 urged state officials to file a lawsuit against Chrysler, but Wisconsin officials came to the conclusion that it would not be economically feasible or politically expedient to sue the company (Gunn 2010).

Local 72 Fights to Save Jobs in Kenosha: Improving Quality

Local 72 took a positive route to prevent the plant from closing, urging its members to continue working with management to increase productivity by improving quality and reducing absenteeism, demonstrating the values of the Kenosha workforce. The union was following a trend in labor leadership of building more cooperative, rather than strictly adversarial, relationships with the company, even after the company announced that auto production would cease the following year. Local 72 tried in vain to change the

decision, presenting to the company various plans that would keep all or some of the manufacturing plants open.

Once it was clear that the shutdown would happen, and once the workers were over the shock of the announced plant closing, union officials convinced workers to approach the closing with the same work ethic they had demonstrated before. They continued to work on the “partnership in progress” programs and quality teams so they could continue to improve quality, hoping to demonstrate that they were a workforce worth keeping. As one union official put it, “If management wasn’t going to save union jobs, it would have to be the workers themselves.” Another told workers not to concentrate on a boss who was “looking at you funny,” and to instead “concentrate on doing your job.” The workers may have doubted this approach at first, but they later said, “In the long run, you were right.” It was a long process of convincing the workers that it was in their best interest to work on quality because it would help the union to convince the company to not leave and to perhaps return some work to Kenosha. As the former local president said, “It’s the membership that did it. I always said ... every president in the UAW, it’s almost obligatory. They say, ‘I’ve got the best membership in the world.’ My membership proved they were the best.”

Our initial survey data had indicated that many of the workers clung to the hope that the company management would change its mind and bring more work to Kenosha after all. We thought the workers were in denial and were not facing the reality of what was happening. The union told its membership that they were not doing it for the company but for themselves, to keep their jobs, to take care of retirees and to get laid-off workers back to work. If the demand for the product increased because of quality or the company noted that the Kenosha workforce was dedicated, if it saved jobs, it would be an avenue to success. The union took the position that increased productivity by working smarter would keep jobs. The former president said, “I went to the company and said, ‘Let’s try to improve these processes here.’” Management accepted the union’s overtures and worked well with the union once they saw the effort that others in the plant were putting in to build good cars. Another union official said that everybody in the plant “wanted to go out on a high note” and build the best cars they could, even though they were about to become unemployed:

Even though everybody knew it, everybody did the best job they could. Nobody slacked off or tried to sabotage anything. ... People wanted to show that ... we built a good car. ... It was amazing because there was a lot of hard feelings. ... They did the right thing. ... It’s like a family. ... Everybody stuck together. ... They did their job, they didn’t slip off or say, “Screw this place; they are screwing us up by closing this place.” Everybody did their job and built a car to the best quality they could.

Many observers were astonished by the announcement of the award-winning quality produced by the Kenosha workers. The workers in Kenosha were making the

highest-quality cars of all the Chrysler factories and were producing cars more cheaply than the other plants because they had fewer quality issues with the cars and low absenteeism. They criticized Iacocca, saying all he wanted was the Jeep.

One worker thought that with the kind of quality coming off the line, “they’re not going to close” the plant. Even though the facility was old, it shouldn’t matter because they were producing top-quality cars for Chrysler. A supervisor confessed that Kenosha workers were at a disadvantage because “we were at the older and outdated facility,” but he reiterated, “It’s not because of the quality. ... They didn’t close it because of that. They could never say that. ... We were number one at the time, so they couldn’t say that.” One female worker recalled her determination to build the best car she could:

I did the best job I could till the day I left, and so did my husband. I believe that was one of the things that came out in the end, that they were really amazed that the quality continued to remain as high as it did right down to the very last one. Hey, we’re just going to do the best we can till it’s over. ... In my job I could have done a real lot of damage, but it’s the farthest thing from my mind because who would I be hurting? ... I’d be hurting people like me and you. ... Why would I want to do that? ... That thinking is totally wrong ... totally off the wall. ... There’s probably a percentage of people—small—but all the people I knew were all good people.

An office worker said she was proud of the way the union handled the situation, trying to keep the plant open in spite of the mandate from the company to close it. She was impressed with the way the workers continued to work on quality until the day the plant closed: “That kind of gave us a good feeling in the office because that meant a lot to us too.”

Many other workers said the same thing, that they could build a car as good as anybody; they broke records on quality and hoped Chrysler would notice the quality of the work they were doing and the value they were adding to the company as a whole. Even if it was an old plant, it was very clean and up to date, and it was a shame to close it. One manager said his workforce was the best workforce he’s ever had: “Out of all the years I’ve been with Chrysler, this is the best workforce.” Another manager said,

It didn’t make a difference ... we ... broke records that they had set building cars as far as quality. ... They had a big board up and they would list every plant, I think eight or nine plants they had on there ... what range they came in today or yesterday or whatever ... and this plant [Kenosha] ... was on top of their plants—even broke records that their plants had never had before—so that proved there that they weren’t really looking for where the quality was coming from, they just wanted to close the plant.

A worker said the union really did its best to keep work in Kenosha: “I’m very grateful to the union for aggressively fighting to keep the plant open and negotiating a good severance package for us with the Chrysler Corporation.” Another worker thought unions were the fabric of the country: “The union holds the stability of the country. America has to protect the small communities, protect people from companies like Chrysler.”

Economically, the settlement package for the first shutdown in 1988 was the largest provided for an auto-plant shutdown to that point in US history—more than \$250 million, according to union officials. Additionally, the Kenosha facility had beaten all the other Chrysler assembly plants in quality. A union representative stated that management was impressed by the Kenosha workers and the way Local 72 officials promoted partnership programs and worked for the betterment of the company. This local union thus had some success in the face of its overall failure to keep all plants open in Kenosha.

After the Closing: Continued Efforts

After the assembly and stamping plants closed, union officials continued to partner with management to make the engines they were still building in Kenosha even better. They took the old in-line six engines built in Kenosha from the worst engine in the auto industry in terms of warranty to a world-class engine. The former local president said the workers in Kenosha “can build an engine just as good as anybody else in the world.” In many ways, the workers are responsible for their own success. He said their solidarity was “unbelievable.” They all stuck together, focusing on quality, unlike in the old days when AMC management wanted quantity over quality. He also speculated that the engine plant would not be open [now] if the workers had decided to build junk cars when the announcement of the auto plant’s closing came. According to union records, the quality-improvement programs initiated by skilled trades had saved the company \$15 million by 1992 and the quality-improvement programs by other shop floor workers had saved the company another \$23 million by 1996 (Gunn 2010). Perhaps as a direct result, Chrysler decided to double production and invest \$100 million on quality improvements for the 4.0 Jeep inline motor being produced in Kenosha at that time (Gunn 2010).

As new jobs were created by these moves, Local 72 made sure that laid-off workers were recalled to either the Kenosha plant or one of the other Chrysler plants around the country. They made sure that contact information was up to date for those laid-off workers so when it was time to replace someone in the factory, they brought in someone from their recall list. Eventually, all of the laid-off Kenosha Chrysler workers who were eligible were offered a chance to come back to the factory, though some of them chose not to come back as they had established themselves in other jobs in the decade or more since the plant had closed.

In 1997, through the diligence of Local 72 urging its members to improve quality and reduce costs, Chrysler decided to bring more work to Kenosha in the form of a new engine line to produce the 2.7-liter V6 engine. By 1999, Chrysler had expanded the engine facility by 516,000 square feet to accommodate production for the new 3.5-liter V6 engine (Gunn 2010). These two investments alone were valued at nearly half a billion dollars. By the time the company closed the engine plant, it was approximately two

million square feet on 109 acres of land and employed nearly 2,000 people (Gunn 2010). The new production resulted in hundreds of millions of dollars being pumped into the local community. In fact, they were building so many engines that many workers from other Chrysler factories, such as the Jeep plant in Toledo and the Chrysler plants in Detroit, transferred to the Kenosha engine plant because they thought there was a future there (Gunn 2010). As one worker described it, “We were doing fantastic.”

Local union officials worked against the odds to keep some work in Kenosha and to bring more work there, to ensure that all those with rights to be recalled would eventually be recalled and then be able to retire with pensions from Chrysler. We were not aware of these efforts when we were doing the original surveys and so were surprised when some workers said they expected to be recalled. We thought they were not facing reality. Later, however, we saw that most of them were brought back to work and were able to retire.

A retired worker we interviewed in 2016 said she was grateful to Local 72 officials for their determination to get back everybody who wanted to come back. She had originally been laid off in the first plant closing in 1988 and had been laid off for more than ten years before she was eventually recalled in 1999. She said she actually was reestablished and had a couple of good jobs with paid vacations and benefits:

Yes, I had a couple of jobs in that ten and a half years [of being laid off]. Actually just shortly after the plant closed [in 1988], I started working at a car wash. I started as a cashier and ended up managing the place. I left to go work for the post office. I was a letter carrier for just shy of three years. [I] went back to the car wash because I made better money running the car wash than I did as a letter carrier.

She said a former coworker and a friend of her mother [who also had worked at Chrysler] persuaded her to take the recall, telling her that she had too much to lose in the way of retirement and health benefits if she walked away from the callback. She continued:

Well we didn't know that at the time. For years I'd contemplate, “When the time comes, will I or won't I?” The decision was made for me. I never had to think about it. ... I would have been 28 [in 1988]. I got called back in '99. ... So I was 39 when I got called back.

She added that the union did a good job and that by 2002, everybody on the master recall list who wanted a job was recalled:

As a matter of fact ... we got called back in '99, and in 2000, we were laid off for a bit again. ... No, I think 2002 is when they ended up calling everybody back that had ever worked there [or] had at least offered [a job]. I believe that was in 2002. ... But I was at the car wash and ... I

remember a friend of my mother, she was a '73 seniority person, she'd come in there all the time. I told her, "Ruthie, I don't know if I want to go back." "You're going back; your retirement and everything." So I went back. ... I worked for about a year and then again I got laid off in 2000. And at that point they told us it could be six months or it could be two years, you're going to be laid off. It was three months. I actually even went and got a different job, part-time job. That is just how I was. And I always thought I wanted to go into real estate, so I worked at a real estate office doing some stuff. [In] three months they call you back. And they call you on a Thursday; "We want you here tomorrow morning." "Well I can't." "Well why not?" "Well because I'm working for somebody [and] I'd like to tell them ... at least." It's the same way it was after they called me back after ten and a half years: "We want you here tomorrow." "Well I'm sorry ... I haven't been sitting here by the phone for ten and a half years. ... I've got to give this person some notice." Even then I only gave them the weekend notice. And that's where I had been for seven years. ... But yeah ... "We want you here now."

Local 72 was successful in bringing back its workers. Within twelve years, everyone who had been laid off was called back to work—and most were able to gain enough seniority to collect their pensions, especially since the union had bargained for the workers to count their time laid off toward their pension time.

The 2010 Chrysler Engine Plant Closing: The Group Survives

Some twenty-two years after the first Chrysler plant closing in Kenosha, the newspaper headline read, "Chrysler Engine Plant will close in 2010" (Gunn 2010). It was the end of line for auto manufacturing in this once-historic automaking community of Kenosha. Before that, the company had continued to change hands. In 2001, Chrysler was purchased by the German company Daimler-Benz and formed the Daimler-Chrysler Corporation, which was run by the German firm. According to union officials, the Kenosha plant was one of four plants slated to receive the new Phoenix Engine [this next-generation V6 engine was renamed the Pentastar Engine], the others being Trenton, Michigan; Mexico; and Germany. By 2007, however, Daimler had sold off Chrysler to Cerberus Capital Management. Then, unfortunately for the Kenosha autoworkers, the Great Recession of 2008 was the final blow as Chrysler, along with GM, lurched toward bankruptcy and was rescued by the federal government. The Italian firm Fiat then bought the company, and the Kenosha plant was slated for closing. Chrysler received billions of dollars in a government bailout that, according to a union representative, was used to build a new engine plant in Saltillo, Mexico.

We revisited several union officials from Local 72 and the UAW in 2010 and discussed this final closing. One representative said,

China doesn't help. It has its own financial rules. The way they value their yen ... how do you compete with a person [making] 50, 60, even 70 cents an hour? Mexico making two bucks an hour. ... Fiat has stepped into a beautiful situation. ... They've basically got all the dealerships; all the choice factories ... all the fat they let go to the bankruptcy side; [and] government money to help them through. Yet they're not putting the work in this country. And I think that's where I'm very troubled by it. I'm a taxpayer. My job depends on this. My kids' college [education] depends on this.

He said that companies and workers were treated differently:

You know we ... made the argument that it was unfair that they were going to continue with their plans for the [engine] plant in Mexico while basically killing the plans for [the engine plant in] Kenosha. ... That was a great argument. It ... brought into focus the fact that taxpayer dollars were being used to keep Chrysler in business. We were totally in favor of that. But that there was an injustice. ... The plan was that the Mexican plant was to stay and Kenosha was going to go. Now there was a certain reality in play that they [Chrysler] had already spent \$550,000,000 to build that plant [in Mexico] and equip it. And it wasn't likely that they were going to walk away from that investment and duplicate that in Kenosha. But we certainly did make a lot of noise and we fought hard on that issue, but ultimately, we weren't able to prevail on that because ... [of] the cold hard economic facts that the plant had already been built and was online and ready to go and move forward.

The Chrysler Engine Plant in Kenosha did close. The last engine came off the end of the line on October 22, 2010. Recently, Fiat announced that it was going to end all auto production in the United States and move it to Mexico; only some trucks and Jeeps would be built in the United States. Ford just announced that it would move the production of all small vehicles to Mexico as well. A union official said recently:

Let's put it this way, I'd like to see them [Fiat/Chrysler] continue to make a full line of vehicles in the U.S., but Fiat/Chrysler because they're smaller than the other ones,

are in a little more precarious position. They may not survive as a standalone entity. At some point they may get bought out by one of the other companies.

Many of those we interviewed discussed their good fortune to have “made it” to retirement with the Chrysler company, despite some longer layoffs for some of them, especially given this global picture.

CONCLUSION

The closing of the former American Motors Corporation’s auto manufacturing facility, which was by then (the end of 1988) a Chrysler auto manufacturing facility, was “high-profile.” The news media shined a spotlight on the issues of those affected by the closing because Chrysler had received grant money from the state of Wisconsin after promising to stay in the community for five more years. A UAW official said this particular plant closing brought changes to the way the Big Three auto companies and the UAW handled plant closings thereafter. He said Local 72 had to cobble a plant-closing package together to prevent its members from “being left out in the cold.” The UAW package included an extensive income-protection program for workers who were laid off. Buyout programs that offered high-seniority employees retirement packages in order to get lower-seniority people recalled to work became the norm, and in most cases, the closing package gave workers nationwide seniority for seeking jobs at other Chrysler-owned plants.

Economically, the settlement package negotiated between the union and Chrysler for the first shutdown in December of 1988 was the largest provided for an auto-plant shutdown to that point in US history: More than \$25 million in a trust fund was set up for displaced workers, to fund education and training and to provide other services they might need (Holley 1989, 1990), and each worker would be paid \$8,000–\$10,000 in profit sharing that AMC had failed to pay them. According to union officials, when it was finally over, the total package for the plant closing cost Chrysler about \$250 million.

In addition, at the union’s urging, quality continued to improve with the 4.0 Jeep motor that was still being produced at the engine plant in Kenosha at the time of the first shutdown. Later, the union negotiated more work for this engine plant in Kenosha in the form of two new types of V6 engines. Instead of losing all of the jobs, the company increased production with a total investment of nearly one billion dollars. Engines manufactured at the Kenosha facility were sent to assembly plants throughout the United States and were even exported to Canada, Venezuela, Egypt, Thailand, and Austria.

The result was that instead of more than 5,500 total workers losing their jobs in 1988, roughly 1,000 workers continued on at the Chrysler engine plant at any one time, at one point increasing to nearly 2,000 workers. As workers retired and more were called back, all laid-off workers with recall rights were eventually recalled, and most were given the opportunity to retire. The union negotiated to diminish the damage that a long layoff would have on a worker’s pension by counting time on layoff as time toward retirement. Even most of the workers who had been laid off for ten years or more were able to recoup most of it and actually retire with full pensions.

One interesting aspect of the union's role in relation to the plant shutdown was to persuade workers to not passively accept whatever came their way. They organized workers to influence the process and perhaps forestall the closing. The union pressed for a more favorable outcome for the workers and the community. Additionally, the closing experience may have expanded workers' consciousness about social functioning. In the future, they may try to influence changes in our economic and/or social structures for the benefit of all working-class families.

The union negotiated to establish a state-of-the-art center to help displaced workers obtain training and find new jobs. Many workers were able to transfer to other Chrysler facilities because of the union, and most of the workers were able to retire because of the union. Several office workers and foremen, and even some managers, made positive comments about how well Local 72 took up the challenge to fight for all of the jobs in Kenosha. In fact, they respected the union so much that in 2001, Local 72 organized clerical workers and engineers at the Kenosha plant under the UAW banner.

Our data shed light on the ways that workers can influence the repercussions of corporate decisions, and the impact that such efforts might have on their own adjustment and future well-being. Years earlier, Local 72 had started a transition from a confrontational in-your-face mode of relationship with the company, where wildcat strikes might happen at the drop of a hat, to that of a congenial partnership with management to save the company and increase the number of jobs. The union began this type of negotiation in 1985 when it compressed or eliminated unneeded classifications and reduced the number of union stewards on the shop floor. Even staunch advocates of unionism within Local 72's leadership changed their ways, and a new era of employee/managerial relations began.

Working with management not only for the betterment of employees but also for increasing jobs may be the only way unionism will be able to combat the threat that a global economy poses for the American workforce. Hopefully, those in corporate America will come to understand that competition from a global economy does not automatically call for the replacement of the American worker.

REFERENCES

- Curcio, Vincent. 2000. *Chrysler: The Life and Times of an Automotive Genius*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Foster, Patrick R. 1993. *American Motors: The Last Independent*. Iola, WI: Krause Publication.
- Glaser, Barney, and Anselm Strauss. 1967. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. New York: Aldine Publishing Company.
- Goffman, Erving. 1959. *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday.
- Gunn, Erik. 2010. *Born Fighting: 75 years of Unionism: The History of United Auto Workers Local 72, 1935–2010*. Publication printed for Local 72, Kenosha, WI.
- Halle, David. 1984. *America's Working Man*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Holley, Paul J. 1989. "1989: The Year in Business." *Journal Times*, December 31, 1989.

- Holley, Paul J. 1990. "Ex-Chrysler Workers Ask for Help." *Journal Times*, April 7, 1990.
- Hughes, Everett C. 1958. *Men and Their Work*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.
- Iacocca, Lee. 1984. *Iacocca: An Autobiography*. New York: Bantam Books.
- Lacey, Robert. 1986. *Ford: The Men and the Machine*. Boston: Little, Brown and Company.
- Lasky, Victor. 1981. *Never Complain, Never Explain: The Story of Henry Ford II*. New York: Richard Marek Publishers.
- Mann, Eric. 1987. *Taking on General Motors: A Case Study of the Campaign to Keep GM Van Nuys Open*. Los Angeles: University of California.
- Mead, George Herbert. 1934. *Mind, Self, and Society: From the Standpoint of a Social Behaviorist*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Milkman, Ruth. 1997. *Farewell to the Factory: Automobile Workers in the Late 20th Century*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Ross, Philip E. 1988. "Chrysler Sets Plant Closing in Wisconsin." *New York Times*, January 28, 1988.
- Taylor, Frederick W. 1911. *The Principles of Scientific Management*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Walton, Mary. 1997. *Car: A Drama of the American Workplace*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.

*Diversity in the Heartland of America:
The Impact on Human Development in Indiana**

JASON VANALSTINE
Indiana University Kokomo

STEVEN R. COX
Indiana University Kokomo

DIANNE M. RODEN
Indiana University Kokomo

LISA BOOTHBY
Indiana University Kokomo

ABSTRACT

This article is the third in a series of studies measuring the impact of cultural diversity on human development. We disaggregate cultural diversity into three components: ethnicity, language, and religion. The first study examined the impact of diversity internationally. We found that countries are worse off with greater diversity, especially religious diversity; however, we found that more-prosperous countries with strong institutions benefited from increased diversity. We concluded that strong institutions are essential to maximize the benefits of diversity while mitigating the associated costs.

The second study examined the impact of diversity within the United States, where institutional strength was assumed to be relatively great and similar between states. We found an overall negative impact from diversity. Ethnic diversity was negatively associated with human development, while religious and language diversity had a positive impact. We concluded that in the United States, there is more tolerance for religious and language differences compared to ethnic differences.

In this third study, we examine the impact of diversity within the state of Indiana. As with our national results, we find a generally negative

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Jason VanAlstine, Associate Professor of Economics, School of Business, Indiana University Kokomo, 2300 South Washington Street, Kokomo, IN 46904; javanals@iuk.edu; tel: (765) 455-9279; fax: (765) 455-9348.

relationship between human development and diversity. Ethnic diversity has a negative impact, while religious and language diversity are generally positive influences. Strong political and legal institutions may not be sufficient to extract net benefits from diversity if social attitudes that guide behavior are not supportive. The results suggest that net benefits from diversity in Indiana may depend on improvement of social attitudes and in commitment to social services that support historically disadvantaged minority groups.

KEY WORDS Indiana; Diversity; Human Development; Ethnicity; Language

Diversity is often promoted as a positive outcome and pursued as a goal by organizations, communities, and governments. Diversity provides exposure to a variety of experiences, ideas, and skills; however, while some diverse societies seem to thrive, others seem to struggle. Diverse societies may suffer from difficulty in communication, difference in preferences, and conflict between polarized groups. Because of these potential costs and benefits of diversity, it is not surprising that previous research into the relationship between diversity and economic development has yielded mixed results. Most studies have found a negative relationship between diversity and economic development, whereas others have reported positive, mixed, or no relationship.

This paper is the third in a series of studies measuring the impact of cultural diversity on human development. We disaggregate cultural diversity into three components: ethnicity, language, and religion. The first study (VanAlstine, Cox, and Roden 2013) examined the impact of diversity internationally. We found that countries are worse off with greater diversity, especially religious diversity; however, we found that more-prosperous countries with strong institutions benefited from increased diversity. We concluded that strong institutions are essential to maximize the benefits of diversity while mitigating the associated costs.

The second study (VanAlstine, Cox, and Roden 2015) examined the impact of diversity within the United States, where institutional strength was assumed to be relatively high and similar between states. Despite the apparent institutional strengths, we found an overall negative relationship between diversity and human development that is driven by ethnic diversity. In fact, when it comes to both religious and language diversity, we found a positive relationship with human development. We conclude that people in the United States are more tolerant of religious and language differences, and less tolerant of ethnic differences.

In this third study, we examine the impact of diversity within the state of Indiana. As with our national results, we find a generally negative relationship between human development and diversity. More specifically, we find that ethnic diversity has a negative impact while religious and language diversity are generally positive influences. Strong political and legal institutions may not be sufficient to extract net benefits from diversity if social attitudes that guide behavior are not supportive.

PREVIOUS RESEARCH

Many researchers have reported a negative relationship between cultural diversity and economic performance, typically measured as growth in per capita income (Alesina et al. 2003; Annet 2001; Barro and McCleary 2003; Easterly and Levine 1997; Grafton, Knowles, and Owen 2004; Montalvo and Reynal-Querol 2005). In contrast, some researchers reported a positive impact (Florida and Tingali 2004), some found no significant impact (Lian and Oneal 1997), and still others reported mixed results (Alesina and La Ferrara 2005; DiRienzo, Das, and Burbridge 2007).

These inconsistent results may reflect the presence of both costs and benefits relating to diversity. Although diversity can enhance creativity and innovation by introducing a variety of ideas and skills, it can also result in inefficiencies due to difficulty in communication, differences in preferences, and conflicts between polarized groups.

Costs of Diversity

Ethnic, language, and religious differences can introduce social barriers to communication that can reduce productivity. Barro (1999) found that language diversity raises transaction costs and results in public policies that retard growth. Grafton et al. (2004) pointed out that lack of trust and barriers to communication can prevent mutually beneficial exchange of ideas. As a result, linguistically homogenous societies may be more effective in communicating ideas among themselves, allowing for faster technological development and economic growth.

Ethnic groups may have different preferences regarding their choice of public goods. Greif (1993) found that it is more efficient to transact with members of one's own type and that diversity introduces costs and inefficiencies due to competing demands of disparate groups. Alesina and La Ferrara (2000) found that increased diversity lowers the utility from public good consumption.

History is replete with examples of social conflict caused by cultural diversity. Conflicts such as these have the clear potential to retard economic development. Easterly and Levine (1997) found that ethnic diversity is a predictor of potential conflict and political instability. Shleifer and Vishny (1993) showed that ethnically diverse societies are likely to have higher rates of corruption. Collier (2000) found that cultural heterogeneity hampers growth because ethnically divided societies are prone to polarization and social conflict. Religious differences are often a barrier to social integration and are also a common source of stress and conflict (Warf and Vincent,, 2007). Grim and Finke (2007) found that restriction of religious freedom correlates with diminished well-being and with violent social conflict.

Benefits of Diversity

A diverse populace provides different perspectives and opportunities for the exchange of new ideas that can stimulate innovation and creativity. The concept of collective intelligence describes the positive historical relationship between the amount of

interaction between diverse individuals and the inventiveness and rate of cultural change of a population (Ridley 2010).

A diverse mix of people brings together complementary abilities and experiences that may lead to productivity gains. Lazear (1999) found that higher diversity levels lead to innovation by increasing the number of ways that groups frame problems, producing a richer set of alternative solutions. Florida and Tingali (2004) found that a more diverse society leads to a more creative and innovative workforce that increases competitiveness. Interaction among different cultures encourages competition and exchange of ideas from different worldviews. Sobel, Dutta, and Roy (2010) showed that higher levels of cultural diversity increase the rate of entrepreneurship in the presence of good institutions.

MOTIVATION AND CONTRIBUTION

The contribution of this third article in a series centers on the study of the impact of diversity in the state of Indiana. The first study found a negative relationship between human development and religious diversity internationally, and an overall benefit to diversity in prosperous countries with strong institutions. The assumption of the second study was that institutions in the United States are relatively strong and are likely similar between states and that as a result, the United States might be better positioned to handle the conflict and inefficiencies and to take advantage of the variety of skills and perspectives that come with higher levels of diversity. The second study found an overall negative relationship between human development and diversity in the United States that was driven by cultural diversity, however. We therefore concluded that strong political and legal institutions may not be sufficient to extract net benefits from diversity if social attitudes that guide behavior are not supportive.

Indiana, located in the heartland of America, should exhibit similar institutional strength across the state. For example, on the legal side, the state is divided into 92 counties, each led by a board of county commissioners. Ninety (90) counties in Indiana have their own circuit court with a judge. The remaining two counties, Dearborn and Ohio, are combined into one circuit. If social attitudes are driving the net impact of diversity in an environment of institutional strength, Indiana allows for a study of “Midwest values,” a “red state,” the “Bible Belt,” the Rust Belt, a “flyover state,” and “Hoosier hospitality.”

In addition to focusing our attention on the costs and benefits of diversity specifically in Indiana, this study utilizes three important contributions that were also used in the first two studies. First, we use a human development index (HDI) as a robust measure of societal prosperity. Sen (1993) argued that human development is a process of expanding capabilities and choices. He encouraged a shift in focus from indicators of economic progress to indicators that come closer to reflecting the well-being and freedom enjoyed by populations. As an alternative to focusing only on productivity, the HDI also considers education and health. These three components of HDI allow us to test whether diversity has selective impact on society that might be missed using only productivity measures. Second, we measure and consider three components of cultural diversity: ethnicity, language, and religion. The majority of previous studies have neglected one or

more aspects, typically focusing on ethnic or ethnolinguistic differences. Loh and Harmon (2005) presented the first global measure of biocultural diversity, measured as the average of indices of diversity in ethnicity, language, and religion. In a cross-country analysis, DiRienzo et al. (2007) found that ethnic, linguistic, and religious diversity each have a different impact on a nation's level of competitiveness. The three separate components of cultural diversity allow us to investigate whether certain elements of diversity are associated with higher or lower levels of social prosperity. Third, although virtually all previous studies have utilized one mathematical measure of diversity, diversity of any kind can be measured in multiple ways. Budescu and Budescu (2012) demonstrated that the choice of diversity measure can affect the conclusions that can be drawn, which limits the ability to compare and generalize results across studies. In response, we utilize four mathematical measures for each component of diversity. Comparing our results across the four measures ensures that our results are robust and are not dependent on the method of measurement.

DATA

As mentioned previously, we assume that similarly strong institutions should exist across the 92 counties in Indiana. These counties show a surprising amount of diversity of demographic compositions, however. In Indiana, there are farm communities and manufacturing communities, diverse college towns and struggling inner cities, prosperous suburbs and shrinking small towns. The amount of diversity and the attitudes toward it are likely to vary accordingly.

Indiana has significant diversity in terms of rural and urban populations. As of the 2010 US census, the population of Indiana was 6,483,802. The average population of Indiana's 92 counties is 70,456, with Marion County as the most populous (903,393) and Ohio County the least populace (6,128). Seventeen (17) counties have populations exceeding 100,000, five of which exceed 250,000; and four counties have fewer than 10,000 people.

In terms of ethnic diversity, according to the 2010 census, Indiana is 81 percent white (non-Hispanic). The black/African American population is approximately 9 percent statewide, and 6 percent of the population is Hispanic/Latino. In most counties, the percentage white (non-Hispanic) population is greater than the state average: in 44 counties, it is greater than 95 percent, and in 66 counties, greater than 90 percent. In contrast, in two counties, the African American population is greater than 25 percent; in four counties, the Hispanic population exceeds 10 percent; and in two counties, the Asian American population is above 5 percent.

English is the dominant language in 95 percent of Indiana households. Spanish is spoken predominantly in 3 percent of households. In three counties over 10 percent of household have Spanish as their dominant language. In three other counties, more than 10 percent of households speak a European language other than English. In two counties, more than 4 percent speak an Asian/Pacific language.

Christianity is the dominant religion in Indiana among those who profess an affiliation (unaffiliated citizens range from 20 percent to 70 percent, depending on the county). Among Christians, Protestants are most common. Mainstream Protestants are more than 50 percent of the population in two counties, and more than 20 percent of the population in 33 counties. Evangelical Protestants are more than 20 percent of the population in 10 counties. Catholics represent more than half of the population in one county and more than 20 percent of the population in 11 counties.

Measures of Human Development

Our cross-sectional study is based at the county level. Each of the 92 counties is a data point. To broadly measure social prosperity by county, we utilize the definition of the American Human Development Index (Social Science Research Council 2013–2014). This composite HDI utilizes data primarily from 2010 and is calculated as the simple average of indices based on health, education, and income. Each index is scaled to range between 0 and 10 based on the minimum and maximum state values. Higher values reflect greater levels of well-being. The health index is based on life expectancy at birth. The education index is based on school attainment. The income index is based on median personal income. This data allows for separate investigation of the relationship between diversity and health, diversity and education, and diversity and income. In addition, the composite index allows for measurement of the broader impact of diversity on overall prosperity.

Components of Diversity

Similar to how we measure human development, we use a composite measure of cultural diversity defined as the simple average of ethnic, language, and religious diversity. The data for ethnic diversity come from the U.S. Census Bureau (2010). For each county, we utilize the percentage of the following ethnic groups: White not Latino, Latino, African American, Asian American, Native American, and Other. The data for language diversity also come from the U.S. Census Bureau (2010). For each county, we utilize the percentage of homes where the following categories represent the primary language spoken: English, Spanish, European, Asian, and Other.

The U.S. Census Bureau has been prevented by law and administrative rules from collecting even basic information on religious affiliation. As a result, the data for religion come from the U.S. Religious Landscape Survey (Pew Research 2008). For each county, we utilize the percentage of adults who associate with the following religions: Evangelical Protestant, Mainline Protestant, Historically Black Protestant, Catholic, Mormon, Orthodox, Jehovah's Witness, Jewish, Muslim, Buddhist, Hindu, and Other.

Mathematical Measures of Diversity

In our analysis, we utilize four mathematical measures of diversity for language, religion, and ethnicity. For consistency, all indices are defined so that higher values reflect greater diversity. The first measure is the percentage of the largest demographic group compared to the population (p_i) subtracted from one:

$$\text{proportion index} = 1 - p_i \tag{1}$$

The maximum value is attained when the largest group is very small, implying a very large number of groups.

The second measure is the Shannon index, commonly used to measure species diversity in biology:

$$\text{Shannon index} = - \sum_{i=1}^N p_i \ln(p_i) \tag{2}$$

where p_i is the proportion of a county's population in demographic group i and N is the number of groups in the county. The maximum value is attained when all demographic groups have the same proportion.

The third mathematical measure utilizes the Simpson index, which measures the probability that two individuals drawn at random from a county will not belong to the same demographic group. We calculate this measure of fractionalization as:

$$\text{Simpson index} = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^N p_i^2 \tag{3}$$

where p_i is again the proportion of a county's population in demographic group i and N is the number of groups in the county. The maximum value is attained when there are many small groups and no dominant group, reflecting more diversity.

The fourth measure of diversity reflects that polarized groups may be more likely to engage in conflict. Specifically, if a state has two dominant cultural groups, there may be more conflict than if the county has many equally sized groups. Montalvo and Reynal-Querol (2005) proposed a polarization index:

$$\text{polarization index} = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^N \left(\frac{\frac{1-p_i}{2}}{\frac{1}{2}} \right)^2 p_i \tag{4}$$

where p_i is the proportion of a county's population in demographic group i and N is the number of groups in the county. This index measures the normalized difference from a

bimodal distribution and reaches a maximum when two equally sized groups dominate the demographic.

Control Variables

Control variables are included in our regressions to increase the likelihood that we are measuring the impact of diversity and no other extraneous factors. We control for differences in urban and rural areas between counties by including the natural log of population density obtained from the U.S. Census Bureau (2010). We control for income inequality by using the Gini coefficient obtained from the 2010 American Community Survey. Zero (0) represents total equality, and 1 represents maximal inequality.

RESULTS

Our basic linear regression model used throughout this article has the following form:

$$development = \alpha + \beta_X \mathbf{X} + \beta_D \mathbf{D} + \varepsilon \quad (5)$$

where \mathbf{X} is a vector of control variables described above, \mathbf{D} is a vector of diversity measures; α and β are the coefficients to be estimated, and ε is the error term. To make the analysis sample representative of the target population, we utilize the weighted least squares method to estimate the coefficients in the model. The population of each county is used as the basis for the weighting. Solon, Haider, and Wooldridge (2015) caution that weighting to correct for heteroskedastic error terms to achieve more precise estimation of coefficients in linear regression models of causal effects can sometimes harm the precision of the estimates. One recommendation they make is to also use a non-weighted regression. In results not shown, we also utilized a non-weighted ordinary least squares regression. Adjusted R^2 s and models' significance are similar, but coefficient estimates were more likely to be significant with the weighted model.

Table 1 presents the results from the regression described in Equation 5 to estimate the impact that our composite measure of cultural diversity (calculated using the proportion index) has on HDI and its three component indices of health, education, and income. Overall, cultural diversity has a significant negative impact. The control variable, population density, is positively associated with each of the HDIs. This indicates that a higher level of human prosperity is found in urban areas. Consistent with expectations, the Gini coefficient, which represents income inequality, has a significantly negative coefficient.

Tables 2 through 4 repeat this analysis using three alternative mathematical measures for our composite measure of cultural diversity. The results are very consistent with those presented in Table 1. The coefficient on cultural diversity is negative using all four mathematical measures of diversity. All results are statistically significant except when using the Shannon index. The coefficients on each of the components of health, education, and income are also consistently negative.

Table 1. Cultural Diversity (Composite Measure) in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variables	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Cultural Diversity	-3.843 (-2.16)**	-4.60 (-2.49)**	-8.121 (-3.72)***	1.196 (0.52)
Ln (Population Density)	0.385 (3.19)***	0.114 (0.91)	0.529 (3.57)***	0.513 (3.25)***
Gini Coefficient	-6.839 (-2.10)**	-2.811 (-0.83)	9.084 (2.27)**	-26.79 (-6.29)***
Constant	6.632 (5.75)**	7.839 (6.55)***	-0.467 (-0.33)	12.524 (8.32)**
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.08	.086	.24	0.31

Notes: Diversity for each county measured using the proportion index, which is the percentage of people who are not members of the dominant language/religion/ethnicity.

t-values shown in parentheses.

* significant at the 10% level ** significant at the 5% level *** significant at the 1% level

Table 2. Cultural Diversity (Composite Measure) in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variable	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Cultural Diversity	-1.131 (-1.14)	-1.061 (-1.02)	-2.315 (-1.83)*	-0.018 (-0.01)
Ln (Population Density)	0.333 (2.27)**	0.016 (0.55)	0.409 (2.19)**	0.574 (3.05)***
Gini Coefficient	-6.189 (-1.86)*	-2.116 (0.10)	10.435 (2.46)**	-26.887 (-6.29)***
Constant	6.556 (5.55)**	7.785 (6.29)***	-0.618 (-0.41)	12.502 (8.25)***
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.04	.03	.16	.30

Notes: Diversity measured for each county using the Shannon index, which is at a maximum value when all groups have the same proportion.

t-values shown in parentheses.

* significant at the 10% level ** significant at the 5% level *** significant at the 1% level

Table 3. Cultural Diversity (Composite Measure) in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variable	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Cultural Diversity	-3.481 (-2.17)**	-3.530 (-2.11)**	-6.690 (-3.36)***	-0.224 (-0.11)
Ln (Population Density)	0.423 (3.17)***	0.117 (0.84)	0.565 (3.41)***	0.586 (3.37)***
Gini Coefficient	-6.536 (-2.01)**	-2.444 (-0.72)	9.728 (2.40)**	-26.893 (-6.32)***
Constant	6.590 (5.71)***	7.808 (6.46)***	-0.535 (-0.37)	12.497 (8.29)***
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.08	.07	.22	.30

Notes: Diversity measured for each county using the Simpson index, calculated as one minus the probability that two individuals drawn at random will be from the same group.

t-values shown in parentheses.

* significant at the 10% level ** significant at the 5% level *** significant at the 1% level,

Table 4. Cultural Diversity (Composite Measure) in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variable	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Cultural Diversity	-2.815 (-2.57)**	-1.533 (-1.30)	-8.121 (-3.72)***	-2.189 (-1.53)
Ln (Population Density)	0.427 (3.50)***	0.013 (0.10)	0.529 (3.57)***	0.750 (4.73)***
Gini Coefficient	-6.602 (-2.05)**	-2.4671 (-0.71)	9.084 (2.27)**	-26.963 (-6.42)***
Constant	6.810 (5.96)***	7.9778 (6.51)***	-0.467 (-0.33)	12.593 (8.464)***
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.10	.040	.24	.32

Notes: Diversity measured for each county using the polarization index, calculated as one minus the normalized difference from a bimodal distribution.

t-values shown in parentheses.

* significant at the 10% level ** significant at the 5% level *** significant at the 1% level

Tables 1 through 4 demonstrate that cultural diversity is negatively associated with all measures of human development. In Tables 5 through 8, we display how the specific components of cultural diversity (language, religion, and ethnicity) affect human development.

Table 5, using the proportion index to compute diversity, shows that ethnic diversity has a significant negative coefficient for each of the three measures of human development and the composite measure. Language diversity is positively associated with health, and religious diversity is positively associated with income.

Table 5. Elements of Cultural Diversity in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variable	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Language Diversity	2.192 (1.18)	7.199 (4.11) ^{***}	0.050 (0.02)	-0.672 (-0.26)
Religious Diversity	1.540 (1.75) [*]	0.668 (0.81)	-0.100 (-0.87)	4.051 (3.37) ^{***}
Ethnic Diversity	-5.920 (-5.26) ^{***}	-8.081 (-7.64) ^{***}	-6.774 (-4.60) ^{***}	-2.905 (-1.88) [*]
Ln (Population Density)	0.680 (5.52) ^{***}	0.501 (4.32) ^{***}	0.790 (4.90) ^{***}	0.750 (4.44) ^{***}
Gini Coefficient	-5.330 (-1.82) [*]	-1.194 (-0.44)	10.446 (2.74) ^{***}	-25.241 (-6.31) ^{***}
Constant	3.620 (3.04) ^{***}	4.454 (3.97) ^{***}	-3.173 (-2.04) ^{**}	9.579 (5.86) ^{***}
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.27	.41	.32	.39

Notes: Diversity for each county measured using the proportion index, which is the percentage of people that are not members of the dominant language/religion/ethnicity.

t-values shown in parentheses.

^{*} significant at the 10% level ^{**} significant at the 5% level ^{***} significant at the 1% level

Table 6, using the Shannon index to compute diversity, shows ethnic diversity with a significant negative coefficient for each of the three measures of human development and the composite measure. Language diversity has a significant positive coefficient for each of the three measures of human development and the composite measure. Religious diversity is positively associated with income.

Table 7, using the Simpson index to compute diversity, shows ethnic diversity with a significant negative coefficient for each of the three measures of human development and the composite measure. Language diversity has a significant positive coefficient for the composite measure of diversity that is driven by a positive

relationship with health. Religious diversity has a significant positive coefficient for the composite measure of diversity driven by a positive relationship with income.

Table 6. Elements of Cultural Diversity in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variable	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Language Diversity	2.566 (3.43) ^{***}	4.149 (5.62) ^{***}	1.764 (1.68) [*]	1.785 (1.83) [*]
Religious Diversity	1.995 (3.10) ^{***}	1.046 (1.65)	1.106 (1.23)	3.833 (4.57) ^{***}
Ethnic Diversity	-3.543 (-5.45) ^{***}	-4.264 (-6.65) ^{***}	-3.430 (-3.77) ^{***}	-2.936 (-3.47) ^{***}
Ln (Population Density)	0.663 (4.67) ^{***}	0.451 (3.22) ^{***}	0.688 (3.46) ^{***}	0.849 (4.59) ^{***}
Gini Coefficient	-4.530 (-1.57)	-0.388 (-0.14)	11.804 (2.91) ^{***}	-25.005 (-6.64) ^{***}
Constant	2.177 (1.67) [*]	3.812 (2.96) ^{***}	-4.188 (-2.29) ^{**}	6.907 (4.06) ^{***}
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.29	.36	.24	.47

Notes: Diversity measured for each county using the Shannon index, which is at a maximum value when all groups have the same proportion.

t-values shown in parentheses.

* significant at the 10% level ** significant at the 5% level *** significant at the 1% level

Table 8, using the Polarization index to compute diversity, shows that ethnic diversity has a significant negative coefficient for each of the three measures of human development and the composite measure. Language diversity is positively associated with health, and religious diversity is positively associated with income and negatively associated with education.

Overall, the results are robust across the four mathematical measures of diversity. Ethnic diversity is consistently associated with lower levels of human development (health, education, income, and the composite measure), with significant negative coefficients for all four human development measures using all four mathematical measures of diversity (16 regressions). Language and religious diversity are consistently associated with positive human development outcomes or, in some cases, inconclusive results. Language diversity is related to better health outcomes, with significant positive coefficients across all four mathematical measures of that diversity. Religious diversity is related to higher income, with significant positive coefficients across all four mathematical measures of that diversity.

Table 7. Elements of Cultural Diversity in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variable	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Language Diversity	3.012 (2.39)**	6.110 (5.01)***	0.050 (0.02)	1.538 (0.93)
Religious Diversity	2.877 (2.55)**	1.257 (1.15)	-0.100 (-0.09)	6.872 (4.64)***
Ethnic Diversity	-5.559 (-5.57)***	-7.09 (-7.33)***	-6.774 (-4.60)***	-3.834 (-2.93)***
Ln (Population Density)	0.720 (5.44)**	0.536 (4.18)**	0.790 (4.90)***	0.817 (4.71)**
Gini Coefficient	-4.313 (-1.50)	-0.332 (-0.12)	10.446 (2.74)***	-23.969 (-6.33)***
Constant	2.182 (1.64)	3.689 (2.86)***	-3.173 (-2.04)**	6.620 (3.79)***
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.29	.39	.32	.46

Notes: Diversity measured for each county using the Simpson index, calculated as one minus the probability that two individuals drawn at random will be from the same group.

t-values shown in parentheses.

* significant at the 10% level ** significant at the 5% level *** significant at the 1% level

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Many previous studies have found a negative relationship between diversity and economic growth, whereas others have reported positive, mixed, or no relationship. In a series of three studies, we utilized a broad measure of human development that includes health, education and income. We also disaggregated cultural diversity into separate components of ethnic, language, and religious diversity. Finally, we utilized four mathematical measures of diversity to ensure that our results were not dependent on the method used to calculate diversity. Our first study (VanAlstine et al. 2013) found that, internationally, countries are worse off with greater diversity, especially religious diversity; however, we found that more-prosperous countries with strong institutions benefited from increased diversity. Our second study (VanAlstine et al. 2015), which looked at the impact of diversity in the United States, found that individual states are worse off with greater diversity, particularly ethnic diversity. In contrast, both religious and language diversity exhibit generally positive relationships with human development, but not enough positive to offset the costs of ethnic diversity.

This third study investigated whether diversity also has an overall negative impact in Indiana. We used county-level data to examine the tradeoffs between the costs and benefits of diversity in the presence of assumed consistently strong institutions. We found that cultural diversity (a composite of ethnic, language, and

religious diversity) is negatively associated with our composite measure of human development (health, education, income). Ethnic diversity is consistently associated with lower levels of human development, including health, education, and income. Language diversity is positively associated with human development, especially health outcomes. Religious diversity is also generally positively associated with human development, especially income.

Table 8. Elements of Cultural Diversity in Indiana Explaining Four Measures of Human Development Using Weighted Least Squares Regression

Independent Variable	Dependent Variable			
	HDI	Health Index	Education Index	Income Index
Language Diversity	1.424 (1.75)*	3.134 (3.88)***	1.233 (1.18)	-0.672 (-0.26)
Religious Diversity	-0.354 (-0.18)	-0.575 (-0.29)	-5.670 (-2.21)**	4.051 (3.37)***
Ethnic Diversity	-3.795 (-4.55)***	-4.750 (-5.74)***	-4.132 (-3.84)***	-2.905 (-1.88)*
Ln (Population Density)	0.755 (5.27)***	0.496 (3.50)***	0.789 (4.28)***	0.750 (4.44)***
Gini Coefficient	-5.095 (-1.61)	-0.670 (-0.21)	8.794 (2.16)**	-25.241 (-6.31)***
Constant	4.499 (2.05)**	5.447 (2.50)**	2.247 (0.80)	9.579 (5.86)***
Observations	92	92	92	92
Adjusted R-squared	.21	.28	.28	.39

Notes: Diversity measured for each county using the polarization index, calculated as one minus the normalized difference from a bimodal distribution.

t-values shown in parentheses.

* significant at the 10% level ** significant at the 5% level *** significant at the 1% level

Perhaps it should not be a surprise that the results in this article are consistent with those of our national study. Although less diverse than some states, Indiana is the home of farm communities and manufacturing communities, diverse college towns and struggling inner cities, prosperous suburbs and shrinking small towns. Apparently, in Indiana and the rest of the United States, this diversity generates potential benefits from the variety of experiences, ideas, and skills but also generates potential costs resulting from inefficiencies due to difficulty in communication, difference in preferences, and conflict between polarized groups. The benefits from language and religious diversity are garnered without equal costs related to potential intolerance and conflict. In comparison, the benefits from ethnic differences are exceeded by the associated costs from inefficiencies and potential conflicts. Unfortunately for human development, the net losses from ethnic diversity exceed the net gains from language and religious diversity.

These results call for comparison to the results from our first study (Van Alstine et al. 2013), which found a similar negative relationship between cultural diversity and human development using international data. More specifically, religious diversity was responsible for the negative relationship. So why is religious diversity generally negative internationally but positive in the United States and Indiana, and why is ethnicity neutral internationally but negative in the United States and Indiana?

The answer may be found in history and politics. Although internationally there is a long history of wars based on religious differences, the United States was formed (at least in part) on the basis of religious freedom. While the United States continues to be very sensitive to religious freedoms (the Census Bureau is not allowed to ask about religion), it has been slower to adapt to ethnic and racial differences. Racial tension and conflicts have been prominent throughout American history, from the Civil War to the race riots in the 1960s, to the high-profile controversies in 2016. Although Indiana has significant legal protections for ethnic-minority citizens, implementation of the laws and attitudes toward racial diversity may continue to lag the respect for religious diversity.

Of course, there is also an inherent problem with studying the benefits from ethnic diversity in the United States. In Indiana, the largest minority ethnic group is African American. This group has obvious historical disadvantages that explain, at least in part, lower levels of health, education, and income. As a result, counties in Indiana with higher levels of cultural diversity are likely to have higher levels of African Americans who have historically worse outcomes. Thus, it might not be surprising that a negative relationship is observed. Worse, this relationship can be readily observed and might result in some people believing that ethnic diversity is causing poor outcomes, thus reinforcing certain biases against diversity. Furthermore, because this study occurs at the county level, it is clear that “moving” costs would be much smaller when moving to another county to avoid such diversity than moving to another state. This can exacerbate the problem of lower human development outcomes, as, typically, more affluent people will have more resources to make such moves away from low-performing counties.

As discussed above, strong political and legal institutions may not be sufficient to extract net benefits from diversity if social attitudes that guide behavior are not supportive. If significant mistrust for diversity develops, there is greater likelihood of polarization and conflict between ethnic groups. Our results have implications for policies on race relations and immigration. If diversity is to be encouraged and accepted, strong institutional support is needed to ensure that the benefits can be extracted while costs are mitigated. The results suggest that net benefits from diversity in Indiana may depend on improvement of social attitudes and in commitment to social services that support historically disadvantaged minority groups.

REFERENCES

- Alesina, Alberto, Arnaud Devleeschauwer, William Easterly, Sergio Kurlat, and Romain Wacziarg. 2003. “Fractionalization.” *Journal of Economic Growth* 8(2):155–194.
- Alesina, Alberto, and Eliana La Ferrara. 2000. “Participants in Heterogeneous Communities.” *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 115(3):847–904.

- Alesina, Alberto, and Eliana La Ferrara. 2005. "Ethnic Diversity and Economic Performance." *Journal of Economic Literature* 43:762–800.
- Annett, A. 2001. "Social Fractionalization, Political Instability, and the Size of Government." *IMF Staff Papers* 48(3):561–92.
- Barro, R. 1999. "Determinants of Democracy." *Journal of Political Economy* 107(2):158–83.
- Barro, R., and R. McCleary. 2003. "Religion and Economic Growth Across Nations." *American Sociological Review* 68:760–81.
- Budescu, David, and Mia Budescu. 2012. "How to Measure Diversity When You Must." *Psychological Methods* 17(2):215–27.
- Collier, Paul. 2000. "Ethnicity, Politics, and Economic Performance." *Economics and Politics* 12(3):225–45.
- DiRienzo, Cassandra, Jayoti Das, and John Burbridge. 2007. "Does Diversity Impact Competitiveness? A Cross Country Analysis." *Competitiveness Review* 17(3):135–52.
- Easterly, William, and Ross Levine. 1997. "Africa's Growth Tragedy: Policies and Ethnic Divisions." *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 112(4):1203–50.
- Florida, R., and I. Tingali. 2004. *Europe in the Creative Age*. Pittsburg, PA: Carnegie Mellon Software Industry Center.
- Grafton, R. Q., Stephen Knowles, and P. D. Owen. 2004. "Total Factor Productivity, per Capita Income and Social Divergence." *Economic Record* 80:302–13.
- Greif, Avner. 1993. "Contract Enforceability and Economic Institutions in Early Trade: The Maghribi Traders' Coalition." *American Economic Review* 83(3):525–48.
- Grim, B., and R. Finke. 2007. "Religious Persecution in Cross-National Context: Clashing Civilizations or Regulated Economies?" *American Sociological Review* 72:633–58.
- Lazear, Edward. 1999. "Globalisation and the Market for Team-Mates." *Economic Journal* 109:15–40.
- Lian, Brad, and John Oneal. 1997. "Cultural Diversity and Economic Development: A Cross-National Study of 98 Countries, 1960–1985." *Economic Development and Cultural Change* 46:61–77.
- Loh, J., and D. Harmon. 2005. "A Global Index of Biocultural Diversity." *Ecological Indicators* 5:231–41.
- Montalvo, J., and M. Reynal-Querol. 2005. "Ethnic Diversity and Economic Development." *Journal of Development Economics* 76:293–323.
- Pew Research. 2008. "U.S. Religious Landscape Survey." Retrieved October 10, 2014 (<http://religions.pewforum.org>).
- Ridley, Matt. 2010. "Humans: Why They Triumphed." *The Wall Street Journal*, May 22, p. W.1.
- Sen, Amartya. 1993. "Capability and Well-Being." Pp. 30–53 in *The Quality of Life*, edited by A. Sen, and M. Nussbaum. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Shleifer, A., and R. Vishny. 1993. "Corruption." *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 108(3):599–618.

- Sobel, R., N. Dutta, and S. Roy. 2010. "Does Cultural Diversity Increase the Rate of Entrepreneurship?" *Review of Austrian Economics* 23:269–86.
- Social Science Research Council. 2013-2014. "American Human Development Index." Retrieved October 10, 2014 (<http://www.measureofamerica.org>).
- Solon, Gary, Steven J. Haider, and Jeffrey M. Wooldridge. 2015. "What Are We Weighting For?" *Journal of Human Resources* 33(2):301–16.
- U.S. Census Bureau. 2010. "2010 Census Data." Retrieved October 20, 2014 (<http://www.census.gov/2010census/data>).
- VanAlstine, Jason, Steven Cox, and Dianne Roden. 2013. "The Costs and Benefits of Diversity: Are Religious Differences Most Important?" *Journal of Global Business Issues* 7(2):9–20.
- VanAlstine, Jason, Steven Cox, and Dianne Roden. 2015. "Cultural Diversity in the United States and Its Impact on Human Development." *Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences* 18:125–43.
- Warf, Barney, and Peter Vincent. 2007. "Religious Diversity Across the Globe: A Geographic Exploration." *Social and Cultural Geography* 8(4):597–613.

*African American Students' Perceptions of Influential Factors
for Attendance in Doctoral Psychology**

JEFFERY M. VERGO
University of Indianapolis

MIXALIS POULAKIS
University of Indianapolis

TJ LESHER
University of Indianapolis

SAMREEN KHONDKER
University of Indianapolis

PANSORN BENYASUT
University of Indianapolis

SEBASTIAN DEL CORRAL WINDER
University of Indianapolis

ABSTRACT

This study explores African American undergraduate students' perceptions of factors influencing their decision to attend doctoral programs in psychology. There is a scarcity of literature examining perceptions held by specific minority groups in regard to influential factors used to make a significant step toward their career development. Eight undergraduate students interested in pursuing a doctoral degree in psychology were interviewed. A semi-structured interview and two paper-pencil measures were used. Interviews were analyzed utilizing the consensual qualitative research (CQR) method. The following themes

* Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Mixalis Poulakis, University of Indianapolis School of Psychological Sciences, 1400 East Hanna Avenue, Indianapolis, IN 46227.

emerged: reasons for pursuing a doctoral degree, navigating the application process, factors influencing interest in psychology, perception of a program's commitment to diversity, importance of ethnic minority representation in a program, financial concerns, family view of psychology, most important factor for attendance, and prior school experiences outside of psychology. The study found that issues related to African American representation and research, as well as the presence of financial aid, are highly relevant in students' evaluation of which doctoral programs they prefer to attend. This information will pave the way for further studies focusing on how to increase the number of African American students in doctoral programs around the country.

KEY WORDS Consensual Qualitative Research Method; CQR; African American; Students; Psychology

The enrollment of African American students in graduate programs has been a struggle despite continuing efforts. As professional psychology programs place greater emphasis on training students to work with multicultural populations, it is necessary to increase minority representation in the field. (Henceforth, the term "minority" in this article represents racial minorities within the United States.) There are several important reasons for increasing the minority representation in psychology. These include enhanced quality and sensitivity of services to clients, increased quality of education programs to students, new perspectives generated for theory development and application related to contemporary social issues, and greater congruence with the field's commitment to social justice (Maton et al. 2006).

Between the years 2000 and 2010, the number of Caucasian Americans increased by 5.7 percent, while the number of African Americans and Hispanics increased by 12 percent and 43 percent, respectively (U.S. Census Bureau 2010a). Because minority populations are increasing in the United States, it suffices for psychology doctoral programs to increase recruitment of minorities to better serve diverse clients. Despite this, recruitment of African American doctoral-level students in clinical psychology has failed to match the induction rates of other minorities (Maton et al. 2006).

In 1865, a controversy regarding the education of African Americans began after the thirteenth amendment of the U.S. constitution outlawed all forms of involuntary servitude. The Civil War began a period of Reconstruction, in which the South was forced to rejoin the Union and the northern ruling class was tasked with providing citizenship to African Americans (Kliebard 1987). Education for African Americans would emerge as a central issue in efforts to structure a segregated South (Arnove 1980). The 1860s also saw the development of the Freedmen's Bureau, a government agency tasked with aiding in freeing slaves and implementing public education for African Americans (Watkins, Lewis, and Chou 2001). The struggle for equal curriculums in African Americans' education would become a political and ideological battle (Watkins et al. 2001). In the South, a special kind of education system was implemented to

“reconcile Negro subservience with the new arrangements of power, defuse potential turmoil, and pacify diverse elements” (Watkins et al. 2001:42). An “accommodationist-styled” system included cultural and political elements from the South’s internal colonization structure and the possibility for corporate wealth to influence government (Peery 1975). This movement caused northern hegemonists and their southern supporters to reconcile an increasing demand for African American education with realities of oppression that still existed (Watkins et al. 2001).

From the abolitionist movement emerged a philanthropic group that held beliefs in the dignity of all humanity, the possibility of redemption, and the need for socialization and began to draw other church missionaries to the issues surrounding African American education (Anderson 1988). Religious ideology would continue to play a crucial role, as these missionaries’ goal was to create an African American leadership (Anderson 1988). Although conditions were improving as the twentieth century drew to a close, several issues required attention. The climate between the North and South gave way to the development of a specialized education system highlighting labor and character training as the most moral and socially uplifting system for the “American Negro” (Harlan 1983).

Despite the lack of funds for teacher training, building construction, and community programming, the United States saw policy initiatives become more focused as it moved into the twentieth century (Butchart 1994). A contribution toward African American education was the Hampton Social Studies (HSS; Bullock 1967). Dr. Thomas Jones established a series of articles concerning the place of African Americans in greater society that highlighted earlier assertions whereby education for African Americans needed to be centered upon moral development and occupational integration, placing them into a subservient role compared to “Whites” (Bullock 1967). Dr. Jones maintained that the supremacist position that African Americans are inherently inferior and that the African American desire for full equality were both incorrect. He blamed evolution for this racial gap and asserted that only time would break the inequality, by allowing Negroes to develop in the same way that Caucasians had (Watkins et al. 2001). The HSS were adopted by corporate bodies that outlined an African American curriculum based on black inferiority. In 1964, the U.S. Supreme Court decreed that the practice of educational segregation was unconstitutional (*Brown v. Board of Education* 1954). Thus, America heralded the beginning of the civil rights movement and a reformulation by providing education in the same classrooms for African and Caucasian Americans.

Following the civil rights movement, the African American population has integrated more into American society. Beginning in the 1970s, added attention has been given to the sociological impact of race and education with more African American students seeking higher education. According to the National Center for Education Statistics (2015), African American students’ enrollment in higher education institutions has grown from 10 percent to 15 percent between 1976 and 2012. Although this trend suggests that a greater number of African American students are seeking higher education, a significant gap still exists in enrollment when compared to the students’ white counterparts.

The concept of the graduate pipeline for minorities has been introduced as a systemic way of examining trends, strategies, and tactics for the recruitment of individuals from diverse

backgrounds (Maton et al. 2006). This concept follows the rationale that by increasing the percentage of minorities who attain bachelor's degrees, you naturally increase the number of potential candidates for graduate study at both the master's and doctoral levels (Maton et al. 2006); therefore, as more minorities attend graduate school, the presence of more minority students should facilitate recruitment of new minority graduate students. The larger the pool of minorities who receive doctoral degrees, the greater chance that those graduates go on to reach faculty positions. The presence of minority faculty in a department can enhance recruitment and retention of both graduate and undergraduate students as well as enhance the pool of available mentors.

Historical efforts to increase minority receptivity to the field of psychology in the United States date back to 1960s. In 1968, the publication *Black Rage* by African American psychiatrists Grier and Cobbs introduced a fierce debate concerning the mental health establishment and its treatment of African Americans (Spurlock 1999). A number of historically black colleges and universities (HBCUs) began offering summer programs for students to stimulate African American interest in psychology (Pickren 2004). Also in 1968, the Association of Black Psychologists was formulated by the American Psychological Association after demands were made to increase minority representation (Guthrie 1998). These actions started a powerful movement in which Howard University and the APA worked to develop fellowship and financial-assistance options for black graduate students (Pickren 2004). During the 1970s, the number of minority students enrolled in clinical psychology programs began to increase, though minorities were still underrepresented (Boxley and Wagner 1971).

Researchers have sought answers for why the recruitment of minority students seems particularly difficult. Byrd, Razani, Suarez, Lafosse, Manly, and Attix (2010) looked at specific challenges in recruitment and retention within the subfield of neuropsychology. They identified one of the challenges to be a lack of opportunities for exposure to the discipline (Byrd et al. 2010). This is partially explained by a lack of prominence and visibility of the field of neuropsychology in comparison to other specialties. Although this example remains specific to neuropsychology programs, other barriers to recruitment were cited as having strong effects. Data collected by the APA Center for Workforce studies shows that approximately 68 percent of psychology doctorates report educational debt, 35 percent of whom report student loan balances in excess of \$75,000 (Kohout and Wicherski 2009). Thus, earning a doctoral degree is a substantial financial commitment, especially for minority students more likely to have limited financial resources (U.S. Census Bureau 2010b). Another identified challenge was the lack of minority faculty mentors (Byrd et al. 2010). Studies have shown that programs with more minority faculty are likely to attract higher numbers of minority students (Munoz-Dunbar and Stanton 1999).

Another deterrent is the rigid threshold of scores that must be achieved on the Graduate Record Examinations (GRE). Although data on the relationship between GRE scores and minority admission to doctoral programs is unavailable, testimonial evidence underscores a limitation that score cutoffs may place on minority students (Byrd et al. 2010). Excellent GPA, research experience, and recommendation letters can be overshadowed by low GRE scores, which may act as a cutoff for qualified students. This

is regrettable, given evidence that GRE scores have limited predictive validity for graduate success among minority students (Sampson and Boyer 2001).

Central to the issue of minority access to graduate education is whether entry prerequisites are accurate predictors of success in graduate school. In 2001, Sampson and Boyer (2001) sought to determine how predictive GRE scores were of minorities' achievement in graduate study. The most crucial portions of an admissions application are the undergraduate transcript, personal statement, letters of recommendation, and GRE scores. They found that GRE scores were significantly associated with the first-year GPA of minority students but maintained that the GRE is not equipped to determine one's level of success in graduate school (Sampson and Boyer 2001). GRE scores may be only slightly to moderately predictive of first-year GPA (Grandy 1994).

The issue of mentorship was touched upon as an important aspect of graduate school. In their study of recruitment practices among clinical psychology doctoral programs, Munoz-Dunbar and Stanton (1999) found that both minority faculty representation and student representation were important for the recruitment of minority students. The presence of minority faculty members in graduate programs is key because these faculty members can provide support in intimidating situations. Faculty mentoring has been shown to be a crucial element to the success of graduate students (Munoz-Dunbar and Stanton 1999). Data have suggested that minority students respond to role models who share specific characteristics with them and who can identify with personal aspects that encompass their experiences (Byrd et al. 2010).

A critical element to understanding how to increase African American representation in doctoral psychology programs is a comprehensive awareness of what strategies have already been employed with some success. Rogers and Molina (2006) sought to identify these strategies in their study of commendable efforts by programs to increase minority participation, with the goal of providing a guideline for programs interested in building minority pipelines into their programs. They conducted semi-structured interviews with faculty and students at 11 identified programs and departments in an exploratory effort to obtain a picture of their recruitment and retention experiences and strategies. All programs identified employed at least one full-time minority faculty member, ranging from 4 percent to as high as 33 percent of faculty makeup. Additionally, minority students accounted for approximately 27 percent of the student bodies in participating departments and 39 percent for participating programs (Rogers and Molina 2006).

Recruitment techniques for enrollment used to attract minority students were also considered. Results showed that faculty and students both believed that the most influential factors were the presence of financial aid, involvement of existing students and faculties in recruitment efforts, and presence of personal contact between faculty and prospective minority students (Rogers and Molina 2006). In this study, financial-aid packages ranged from full tuition waivers and stipends to periodically distributed stipends without tuition waivers. Almost all (91 percent) of these programs advertised such opportunities in their recruitment brochures and school web pages. Student and faculty involvement in the recruitment process showed some variability in tactics across institutions. A strength identified in one program was the employment of minority faculty who were active researchers in areas related to minority concerns, and another program

used student peer groups during interviews to create discussion among minority and prospective students. Yet other institutions had existing graduate students recruit from their undergraduates (Rogers and Molina 2006).

Aside from these differences, a number of other strategies employed by multiple programs had some success: 91 percent of institutions had faculty who made personal contact with prospective students, 82 percent reported established relationships with HBCUs, 73 percent recruited minority undergraduates at their home institutions, and 64 percent sponsored students to come tour their facilities, speak with faculty, and speak with students. Of this final group, 86 percent covered the expenses of such visits and 64 percent had created recruitment materials specifically catered to minority students (Rogers and Molina 2006).

Significant findings from a literature review suggest areas for further study. It has been 21 years since the Ponterotto et al. (1995) study in which minority students were interviewed concerning their thought processes on applying to graduate programs in psychology, and limited studies since have addressed the ways in which African Americans select psychology graduate programs. Further research suggested by Ponterotto et al. (1995) highlights the need for examination of perceptions of minority and majority students toward the application and admission processes. Currently, no studies have been found that employ qualitative methods to directly ascertain the perceptions and motivations of African American undergraduate students to pursue specific clinical psychology programs. Although other studies have continued on the work of Bernal, Barron, and Leary (1983); Yoshida et al. (1989); and Ponterotto et al. (1995), they used quantitative methods and did not look at African Americans specifically (Bidell, Turner, and Casas 2006). Research studies pertaining to African American recruitment into graduate psychology programs are also sparse, which is significant, as African Americans are underrepresented in doctoral psychology programs (Maton et al. 2006). This study represents the most recent attempt to understand the motivating factors behind African American students' selection of graduate schools for clinical psychology.

Ponterotto et al. (1995), whose work has significant influence on the current study, used a sample of recently graduated master's students, gathering no information from undergraduate students, who make up the majority of students applying to psychology graduate programs (Maton et al. 2006). Currently, much of the research has focused on school and counseling psychology programs rather than on clinical psychology programs. It is important for clinical psychology programs to be represented in the literature, as diagnostic evaluation is a key procedure in the field (Lawson 2005; Ruiz and Primm 2010).

This study utilized a semi-structured interview and two paper-pencil questionnaires to elicit the perceptions and motivating factors that influence African American students' decisions to apply to specific clinical psychology doctoral programs. The following research questions were proposed: (1) Does availability of scholarships, grants, and fellowships present as the most important factor identified by potential students as contributing to their decision on which programs to apply? (2) Are African American students more likely to apply to programs that have scholarships, grants, and

fellowships targeting minority students? (3) Are African American students more likely to apply to schools they feel are committed to diversity? (4) Would the number of African American students present in a doctoral program be influential in student choice? (5) Would African American students be more ambivalent in their decision to apply to a doctoral psychology program if they had lower support from their family for their desire to study psychology rather than another profession?

METHODS

Participants and Recruitment

The CQR method states 8 to 15 participants to be optimal for a study so the researcher can focus in depth on each participant's information (Hill 2012). This study recruited eight undergraduate students over the age of 18 from universities in the Midwest by offering each participant an incentive of a \$15 gift card. Participants were English-speaking undergraduate students (at least junior year) who identified their ethnicity or race as African American. Participants must have been interested in attending a psychology doctoral program. Exclusion criteria included participants already enrolled in a graduate program for psychology, students interested strictly in pursuing a master's degree, and individuals interested in pursuing graduate degrees in other related areas (psychiatry, social work, etc.).

Recruitment involved utilizing contacts within universities in Indianapolis and surrounding states to find willing participants. Mass e-mails including the purpose, procedures, and incentives of the study went out to undergraduate psychology students. Face-to-face interviews were conducted in private rooms, at libraries, designated for the purpose of the research. The interviews were considered highly confidential, which helped the participants provide honest answers to the questions. Consent forms were given and discussed prior to participation in the study. These forms allowed the interviewer to audio-record the interview and informed the participant that recordings would be transcribed by the coinvestigator to further protect privacy. The interviewer discussed the implications of the study and answered any questions before the interview began. All participants were assured that identifying information would be kept confidential and omitted from all written materials. To ensure the highest level of confidentiality, each packet of questionnaires was coded rather than labeled with identifying information. The participants were then given the paper-and-pencil demographic questionnaire and the Multigroup Ethnic Identity questionnaire before beginning the 60–90-minute interview.

Measures

Two questionnaires and one semi-structured face-to-face interview were used. One questionnaire assessed demographic information, and the other assessed ethnic minority identification and perceived importance of that identification. The contents of the semi-structured interview were generated from a review of the relevant literature (Bernal et al.

1983; Bidell et al. 2006; McIlvried et al. 2010; Ponterotto et al. 1995; Yoshida et al. 1989). The studies used identified in their research several themes and important factors of how programs attempt to recruit minority students that carry over to the current study.

The demographic questionnaire assessed basic information such as age, education, and employment. It was also used to identify specific doctoral areas of interest for potential students, adding to the comprehensiveness of students' choices for attendance. Inclusion and exclusion criteria were verified using this as well. This study used the Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure (MEIM; Phinney 1992) was used in this study. The MEIM is a 15-item self-report measure designed to assess ethnic identity, belonging, affirmation, and commitment to that identity. The MEIM uses a Likert scale ranging from 4 ("Strongly agree") to 1 ("Strongly disagree").

The semi-structured interview was based on prior research that has sought to identify major themes and important considerations in the recruitment of minority students into graduate psychology programs, with additional questions added. The following topics comprised the interview: student understanding of the psychology field, students' perception of a program's commitment to diversity, importance of African American representation by a program in student choice, available noncontingent financial aid, and student perceptions of family support for the chosen field of study.

Procedure

The interviews were held in private conference rooms in several settings across the Midwest. Written and verbal consent were obtained following a discussion of confidentiality, purpose and goals of the study, and potential risks and benefits. Following consent, participants were given the demographic questionnaire, followed by the MEIM and the semi-structured interview. After completion of the interview, participants were offered the chance to ask questions.

CQR Methodology

The CQR method uses a consensus process to establish findings based on the participants' responses to open-ended question regarding their beliefs, attitudes, and experiences (Hill 2012). The CQR method consists of a semi-structured interview using open-ended questions to collect data to be used for the consensual data-analysis process. The author created the semi-structured interviews and transcribed the responses verbatim in order to facilitate accurate analysis. After de-identification, the transcribed responses were analyzed by the primary research team using CQR process. Team members were encouraged to consider and discuss their viewpoints until a consensus was reached. This was done in order to prevent a biased analysis of the data (Hill 2012).

The CQR method comprises the data-collection phase and the data-analysis phase. The data-analysis phase comprises the within-case analysis and the cross-analysis. For the within-case analysis phase, data is first grouped into *domains* by reviewing transcripts and identifying common themes. Then summaries are created

within each domain to create a *core idea*. In the cross-analysis phase, themes and patterns across participants are determined. The similarities are then grouped into *categories* (i.e., subdomains) and *subcategories*. Each category and subcategory is then assigned a *frequency label* based on the number of participants who endorsed each category. The steps discussed include the development of the domain list, the coding of data into each domain, the creation of core ideas, the development of categories and subcategories, and the assigning of frequency labels. The team comprised nine graduate and undergraduate psychology students who were all educated on the CQR method prior to beginning analysis.

Two auditors were also included, in accordance with the CQR method (Hill 2012). These two auditors were in addition to the primary research team and were not involved with the primary data analysis or consensus process. Auditors are separated from the primary research team to maintain the fidelity of the process and serve as overseers throughout the process (Hill 2012). At each step of the process, the auditors reviewed the results from the primary data analysis team and provided feedback based on the raw interview data.

RESULTS

Demographic Characteristics

Two men and six women self-identified as African Americans and residing in the Midwest participated in the study. The participants had an average age of 22.3 years (range: 20–28 years). Four participants were in their junior year of college, and four were in their senior year. Participants had interests in various areas, including counseling, social, clinical, industrial/organizational, school, experimental, and developmental psychology. Each participant in this study, with the exception of one, reported a high level of identification with his or her ethnic group.

Analysis of Data

The interview transcripts were recorded verbatim and de-identified. Nine domains were created based on collective ideas represented across transcripts. Where possible, the research team developed a category structure to represent the raw data. Unavoidably, some blocks of data did not fit into any category and were assigned to “Other” (Hill 2012); this category is not discussed here because of its lack of relevance. In the CQR’s final step, frequency labels (*general*, *typical*, and *variant*) are assigned to categories and subcategories. Categories present in all or all but one of the transcripts were assigned as *general*. *Typical* categories were those found in more than half of the transcripts, and *variant* were found in at least two but fewer than half of the transcripts.

Overview of Findings

The master domain list included (1) Reason for Pursuing a Doctoral Degree in Psychology, (2) Navigating the Application Process, (3) Factors Influencing Interest in the Field of Psychology,

(4) Perception of a Program's Commitment to Diversity, (5) Importance of African American Representation in a Program, (6) Financial Concerns, (7) Family View of Psychology (8) Most Important Factor for Attendance, and (9) Prior School Experiences Outside of Psychology. (See Table 1.)

Reasons for Pursuing a Doctoral Degree in Psychology. The questions were intended to be broad to elicit participants' thoughts and beliefs. Of the five categories for this domain, there were no general categories, one typical category, and four variant categories. These responses suggested that the reasons for pursuing a psychology doctoral degree were not consistent among participants. Five of the participants reported that they wished to obtain a doctoral degree in psychology because they believed that the degree would allow them to work with individuals with different needs from various populations. Two of the participants reported that they would be the first doctoral recipients in their families, which served as a motivation, and two other participants believed that the financial stability afforded to psychologists was their primary motivation.

Navigating the Application Process. Participants were asked to elaborate on the strategies they would use to research and plan their application process. One category emerged as a general response, and one category emerged as a typical response. All but one participant indicated that they would rely heavily on personal and professional contacts within a variety of healthcare fields to understand the application process. This finding emerged as the first general category in the study. Several participants stated that they would approach the application process through doing research on programs via the Internet and subject-related books. This method of information gathering emerged as a typical response among participants.

Factors Influencing Interest in the Field of Psychology. The line of questioning was designed to inquire about reasons of interest in the field of psychology apart from the doctorate. Four categories emerged in this domain—namely interest in other people's behaviors, thoughts, and emotions; professional interest in psychology (three subcategories emerged); previous life experiences' impact; and family views/perceived influences. Two categories elicited enough responses to be labeled typical. The first was a subcategory under professional beliefs, related to a desire to work in a profession in which one is actively helping others. This was identified by half the participants as a primary influential factor on their interest. The other typical category was the impact that family view/perceived influence had on their interest in psychology. Three other variant categories and subsequent subcategories emerged under the professional-beliefs category. A small number of participants expressed extrinsic/material reasons for pursuing psychology. Another variant category was related to the intrinsic satisfaction derived from listening to others' problems and providing solutions.

Table 1. Frequency Analysis

Domain, Category, and Subcategory	Frequency
1 Reasons for Pursuing a Doctoral Degree in Psychology	
Views of First-generation Doctoral Degree Completion	Variant
Financial Stability	Variant
Impact of Psychology on Self and Others	Variant
<i>Providing Help to Individuals from Various Populations with Different Needs</i>	Variant
2 Navigating the Application Process	
Impact of Life Experiences on Pursuit of Psychology	Variant
<i>Perceived Impact of Family Experiences</i>	Variant
Research/Information Gathering	Typical
Communicating with Personal and Professional Contacts	General
3 Factors Influencing Interest in Field of Psychology	
Personal Beliefs/Interest in Psychology	General
<i>Extrinsic/Material Reasons</i>	Variant
<i>Intrinsic Satisfaction</i>	Variant
<i>Desire to Help Others</i>	Typical
Previous Life Experiences' Impact on Pursuit of Psychology	Variant
Family Views/Perceived Influence	Typical
4 Perception of a Program's Commitment to Diversity	
Minority Coursework	General
<i>Influence</i>	Typical
<i>No Influence</i>	Variant
Diversity Statement in Recruitment Materials	General
<i>Positive</i>	General
<i>Negative</i>	Variant
<i>Neutral</i>	Variant
5 Importance of Ethnic Minority Representation in a Program	
African American Faculty	General
<i>Positive Influence</i>	Typical
<i>Not Important</i>	Variant
<i>Faculty Competence More Important than Ethnicity</i>	Variant
African American Students	General
<i>Positive Influence</i>	General
<i>Not Important</i>	Variant
African American Research	General
<i>Positive Influence</i>	General
<i>Most Important Influence</i>	Variant

Concluded next page

Table 1. Frequency Analysis, Concl.

6 Financial Concerns	
Financial Aid a Positive Impact on Decision to Attend Program	General
Minority-Specific Aid	General
<i>Positive Impact</i>	General
<i>Less Important than Other Variables</i>	Variant
7 Family View of Psychology	
Perception of Participant	Variant
Perception of the Field	General
<i>Good Understanding</i>	Typical
<i>Poor Understanding</i>	Variant
Family Opinion	Typical
<i>Supportive</i>	Variant
<i>Suitability as a Profession</i>	Variant
Family Impact on Participant	Variant
<i>Influence</i>	Variant
<i>No Influence</i>	Variant
8 Most Important Factor for Attendance	
Investment in Individual Student	Variant
Accepting and Comfortable Environment	Variant
Racial Diversity	Variant
<i>Racially Diverse Student Body</i>	Variant
Financial Aid	Variant
9 Prior School Experiences Outside of Psychology	
Lack of Racial Diversity among Previous Teachers	Variant

Perception of a Program's Commitment to Diversity. This domain resulted in two categories: namely minority coursework and a diversity statement in recruitment materials. Within the minority-coursework category, two subcategories—positive influence and no influence—emerged. More than half of the participants indicated that the availability of minority coursework would positively influence their consideration of a psychology doctoral program. Within the Diversity Statement in Recruitment Materials category, three subcategories emerged: positive, negative, and neutral. The positive subcategory elicited enough responses to be considered general. Only one participant indicated that a statement of commitment to recruiting diverse students would not influence the decision to apply to a program. An interesting perspective from one participant was that the manner in which the diversity statement was delivered could negatively influence her evaluation of a program. Other variant subcategories emerged under both the minority-coursework category and the diversity-statement category. Two or three participants reported that neither the availability of minority coursework nor a commitment-to-diversity statement would be influential to their application decisions.

Importance of Ethnic Minority Representation in a Program. Participants were asked about three main areas related to representation in a program—African American students, African American faculty, and faculty with African American research interests—that would influence their application decisions. Two subcategories elicited enough responses to be general categories; one subcategory was typical.

All but one participant stated that the presence of other African American students would positively influence their decisions to apply to a particular program, and one indicated that the presence of program faculty who supported or were involved in African American research was a key factor in determining which program to attend, emerging as a general subcategory. This highlighted the most important facet: African American representation as compared to student body or faculty. This subcategory was endorsed by half of the participants, making it a variant response. The importance of African American faculty was seen as a positively influencing factor for application and attendance. More than half of participants reported that they would actively seek a program that had African American faculty members. Other variant subcategories emerged related to the relative importance of one aspect of African American representation over another, with two or three participants stating that faculty or students were not of high importance relative to research interests; however, the most interesting variant responses were related to feeling that a low census of African American students may actually serve to motivate them for success, as there would be a desire to “prove” themselves as deserving.

Financial Concerns. Participants were asked about their views regarding the presence of general and minority-specific financial aid offered by a program, which elicited responses regarding how much priority participants would place on managing the financial commitment often taken on by graduate students. Out of two categories and subcategories in this domain, one of each emerged as a general category. All of the participants except for one identified both the presence of general and minority-specific financial aid as highly influential for application to a program. The sole variant subcategory that emerged from this domain related to the idea that financial aid is less important than other factors. Two participants endorsed this idea, with one stating that although financial aid was still important, other factors would be more influential.

Family View of Psychology. Participants were asked to elaborate on their families' opinions of their pursuit of psychology, as well as the impact that those opinions had on them. This domain produced four categories and six subcategories. One subcategory emerged as a typical category. Six of the participants reported that their families had a good understanding of the field of psychology and were supportive of their decisions to pursue graduate degrees. Two participants believed their families to have only a basic understanding of psychology. Variant categories in this domain emerged under limited understanding of psychology as a field, support of the participant in any academic endeavor, belief that psychology is a suitable profession, and family perception having no influence on the participant. These categories were endorsed by at least two participants but fewer than half. Of the variant categories, the closest to a typical category within this

domain was related to family members being supportive of the participants, with half indicating their families as approving of their career choice.

Most Important Factor for Attendance. Four variant categories emerged, namely investment in the individual student, accepting and comfortable environment, racially diverse student body, and financial aid. Three participants identified financial aid as the most important factor in choosing a program. Three participants stated that feeling that the program is invested in individual students was most important. Two participants identified feeling that the program was accepting and comfortable was most important, and two participants identified a racially diverse student body as the most important.

Prior School Experiences Outside of Psychology. Previous educational experiences emerged as a common theme, and one variant category emerged. Three participants indicated that they had experienced a lack of racial diversity among previous teachers at various education levels. In some cases, this caused them to acclimate to having majority Caucasian American teachers. Others expressed some dismay over this realization.

DISCUSSION

The goal of this study was to gain insight into how African American undergraduates who are interested in obtaining doctoral degrees in psychology will select and apply to specific programs and how those decisions are influenced by diversity factors and program characteristics. The semi-structured interviews of eight African American undergraduates provided insights on factors related to the initial research questions and are grouped by financial concerns, followed by the importance of diversity, African American representation, and family support.

Financial Concerns

Despite financial aid having an impact, the current data suggest a divergence from the work of Ponterotto et al. (1995), in that financial aid did not emerge as the most important factor. Programs with minority-specific aid appeared more attractive to the participants, though they placed equal importance on the presence of minority-specific aid and other financial aid. The emergence of these findings would suggest that although the presence of financial aid matters to African American students considering doctoral degrees in psychology, other factors play an important role as well.

Importance of Diversity

The presence of minority topics in coursework and a statement reflecting the program's commitment to diversity were positive factors for application to and attendance of doctoral programs. The perceived importance of the diversity statement was a general finding, whereas the presence of minority coursework was a typical finding, suggesting that students may value a program's overall stance on diversity

more than the presence of minority coursework. The way a program promotes diversity does affect how a student will respond, however. Two participants stated that the method could dissuade them from applying. Although this confirms that students are more likely to apply to schools they believe are committed to diversity, programs need to pay specific attention to how they address inclusiveness and acceptance in recruitment materials.

African American Representation

The results are corroborative with previous findings that the presence of other African American students in a program would positively influence a student's decision to apply to a program. More interestingly, the variant response that the presence of African American faculty members was not important to a participant's decision suggests that the presence of African American students is more influential than the presence of African American faculty. An unexpected finding was related to the presence of African American-specific research interests, demonstrating that its presence was just as important as the presence of African American students or faculty. Although all but one participant reported that African American research interests in a program would positively influence their decisions to apply to that program, four of the participants indicated that this was the most important area related to African American representation. Participants positively related to the presence of African American research interests regardless of the ethnicity of the professor. This finding is highly relevant to doctoral programs, as it emphasizes the need for openness to African American issues and research.

Family Support

Findings suggest that the questions in this area were irrelevant. The most highly endorsed theme was that participants felt that their families had a good understanding of the field of psychology and saw it as worthwhile to pursue as a career. Other responses suggested that even if parents or family members had little understanding of the role of a psychologist, they were willing to support the participant. A final finding was the variant theme that the opinion of the family was of little influence to the participant. This may indicate that African American students today have less concern for familial influence in choosing careers than previously thought. Additionally, the findings suggest that the general attitude toward the field of psychology may be steadily improving as mainstream acceptance of psychology increases.

Limitations

The current study's participant sample is heterogeneous in several ways. The data do not reflect the opinion of older individuals or students pursuing psychology as a second career. The study was also conducted in a limited geographical area, which may constitute sample

selection or participation bias. It is possible that themes related to the importance of diversity or the consciousness around diversity issues would not have emerged or would have been more prominent if recruitment and/or data collection had occurred in different parts of the country. Caution should therefore be taken in any attempt to apply findings to the larger African American population in the United States. The data-analysis team included only one African American individual. This could potentially pose a difficulty if the homogeneity of the research team decreases the diversity of comprehension, interpretation, and insight into the particular group of study. To control for the effect of researcher bias in data analysis, the use of auditors' feedback and team effort was employed (Hill 2012). The sample in this study comprised undergraduate students who had not yet applied to doctoral psychology programs. It is quite possible that motivating factors may change for students at different points in the educational process. It is important to keep this in mind when considering the results for implementation.

Implications and Future Research

The present study was consistent with previous research, with additional findings for future directions. It could be theorized that the differences reflect group variations with the African American community. Furthermore, one could hypothesize that the relevance of diversity and African American representation is contingent on one's own identification with one's ethnic identity. African American undergraduates who are considering doctoral degrees in psychology value a program's commitment to diversity as part of the decision-making process. There are specific areas that doctoral programs can target to make themselves more appealing to African American undergraduates. Specifically, students highly valued minority-specific financial aid packages, the presence of other African American students, and openness to and encouragement of African American-centered research.

In addition, African American students respond positively to statements in application materials that highlight commitment to diversity and encouragement of all individuals to apply. A small sample of the data also suggests that statements suggesting inclusiveness across a broad range beyond the identification of ethnic minority groups may be more positively received by African American students. African American students feel more positive toward a program if they see other African American faculty or students within it, but the presence of faculty research interests related to African American concerns may be a more important factor. Responses suggested that individuals would still consider applying to a school with a scarcity of African American faculty as long as they felt the program was receptive and interested in them as well as the psychological/sociological concerns of their ethnicity.

Although the data on what factors are most important to African American students suggested significant within-group differences, several participants reported that believing a doctoral program was genuinely invested in students on an individual level would be the key determination in their university selection. These qualitative findings introduce an additional perspective to extant literature that is not primarily representative of the dominant Caucasian American culture. In accordance with APA guidelines and

recommendations (APA 2004, cited in Hill 2012), multicultural perspectives and indigenous psychologies have been incorporated into the present study's design and data analysis. The results of the present study provide rationale for the development of a specific set of ideals that schools can communicate that will help appeal to African American students. Academic institutions can utilize this information to not only attract more African American students to their programs but also provide an environment that focuses on promoting growth and individual attention through a willingness to engage in discussions and research with individuals of a wider variety of backgrounds.

Areas of future research include investigation of the theme of a program's desire for diversity as potentially dissuading to students. It emerged in the data that participants could feel both hopeful toward their acceptance into a program based upon a program's commitment to diversity but also hesitant if that commitment appeared desperate in nature or somehow less genuine.

The present study was a direct response to the limitations and suggestions for future research highlighted by Ponterotto et al. (1995) indicating a need for more qualitative research among specific ethnic groups. In reference to one of the study limitations, future research could consider the potential differences between first- and second-career candidates. This study was limited to participants with an average age of 22 years; therefore, differences may be observed with older candidates. The data represent an effort to represent the direct experiences and beliefs of African American students. Future areas of research could seek to reproduce similar studies with different ethnic groups and thus form a basis for comparison. Such studies would continue to build upon the mission to increase ethnic minority representation in the field of psychology so that as the population we serve becomes more diverse, we, too, change and grow as a professional community to reflect those needs.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, James D. 1988. *The Education of Blacks in the South, 1860–1935*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Arnove, Robert F. 1980. *Philanthropy and Cultural Imperialism: The Foundations at Home and Abroad*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Bernal, Martha E., Bridget M. Barron, and Cheryl G. Leary. 1983. "Use of Application Materials for Recruitment of Ethnic Minority Students in Psychology." *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice* 14(6):817–29.
- Bidell, Markus P., Joseph A. Turner, and J. Manuel Casas. 2006. "First Impressions Count: Ethnic/Racial and Lesbian/Gay/Bisexual Content of Professional Psychology Application Materials." *Training and Education in Professional Psychology* 2(1):75–81.
- Boxley, Russell, and Nathaniel N. Wagner. 1971. "Clinical Psychology Training Programs and Minority Groups: A Survey." *Professional Psychology* 2(1):75–81.
- Brown v. Board of Education*, 347 U.S. 483 (1954).
- Bullock, Henry A. 1967. *A History of Negro Education in the South*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

- Butchart, Ronald E. 1994. "Outthinking and Outflanking the Owners of the World: A Historiography of the African American Struggle for Education." Pp. 85–122 in *Too Much Schooling, Too Little Education: A Paradox of Black Life in White Societies*, edited by M. J. Shujaa. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press.
- Byrd, Desiree, Jill Razani, Paola Suarez, Jose M. Lafosse, Jennifer Manly, and Deborah K. Attix. 2010. "Diversity Summit 2008: Challenges in the Recruitment and Retention of Ethnic Minorities in Neuropsychology." *The Clinical Neuropsychologist* 24(8):1279–91.
- Grier, William H., and Price M. Cobbs. 1968. *Black Rage*. New York: Basic Books.
- Grandy, J. 1994. *Trends and Profiles: Statistics about General Test Examinees by Sex and Ethnicity*. Princeton, NJ: Educational Testing Service.
- Guthrie, R. V. 1998. *Even the Rat Was White: A Historical View of Psychology*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Harlan, Louis R. 1983. *Booker T. Washington: The Wizard of Tuskegee, 1901–1915*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Hill, Clara E. 2012. *Consensual Qualitative Research: A Practical Resource for Investigating Social Science Phenomena*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Kliebard, Herbert. 1987. *The Struggle for the American Curriculum, 1893–1958*. New York: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Kohout, J., and M. Wicherski. 2009. *2009 Graduate Study in Psychology: Faculty and Student Data Discussion of Results*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Lawson, William B. 2005. "Bipolar Disorder in African Americans." Pp. 135–42 in *Perspectives in Cross-Cultural Psychiatry*, edited by A. Georgiopoulos and J. Rosenbaum. Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Maton, Kenneth I., Jessica L. Kohout, Marlene Wicherski, George E. Leary, and Andrey Vinokurov. 2006. "Minority Students of Color and the Psychology Graduate Pipeline: Disquieting and Encouraging Trends, 1989–2003." *American Psychologist* 61(2):117–31.
- McIlvried, E. John, Jacqueline Remondet Wall, Jessica Kohout, Stephany Keys, and Anthony Goreczny. 2010. "Graduate Training in Clinical Psychology: Student Perspectives on Selecting a Program." *Training and Education in Professional Psychology* 4(2):105–15.
- Muñoz-Dunbar, Rocio, and Annette L. Stanton. 1999. "Ethnic Diversity in Clinical Psychology: Recruitment and Admission Practices among Doctoral Programs." *Teaching of Psychology* 26(4):259–63.
- National Center for Education Statistics. 2015. "Total Fall Enrollment in Degree-Granting Institutions, by Level of Student, Sex, Attendance Status, and Race/Ethnicity: Selected Years, 1976 through 2010." Retrieved January 1, 2015 (http://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d11/tables/dt11_237.asp).
- Peery, Nelson. 1975. *The Negro National Colonial Question*. Chicago, IL: Workers Press.

- Phinney, Jean S. 1992. "The Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure: A New Scale for Use with Adolescents and Young Adults from Diverse Groups." *Journal of Adolescent Research* 7(2):156–76.
- Pickren, Wade E. 2004. "Between the Cup of Principle and the Lip of Practice: Ethnic Minorities and American Psychology 1966–1980." *History of Psychology* 7(1):45–64.
- Ponterotto, Joseph G., Alan Burkard, Roland K. Yoshida, Anthony A. Cancelli, Giovanni Mendez, Lynn Wasilewski, and Lynn Sussman. 1995. "Prospective Minority Students' Perceptions of Application Packets for Professional Psychology Programs: A Qualitative Study." *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice* 26(2):196–204.
- Rogers, Margaret R., and Ludwin E. Molina. 2006. "Exemplary Efforts in Psychology to Recruit and Retain Graduate Students of Color." *American Psychologist* 61(2):143–56.
- Ruiz, Pedro, and Annelle Primm. 2010. *Disparities in Psychiatric Care: Clinical and Cross-cultural Perspectives*. Baltimore, MD: Lippincott Williams & Watkins.
- Sampson, Charles, and Patricia G. Boyer. 2001. "GRE Scores as Predictors of Minority Students' Success in Graduate Study: An Argument for Change." *College Student Journal* 35(2):271–79.
- Spurlock, Jeanne. 1999. *Black Psychiatrists and American Psychiatry*. Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Association.
- U.S. Census Bureau. 2010a. "The Black Population: 2010." Retrieved January 1, 2015 (<http://www.census.gov/prod/cen2010/briefs/c2010br-06.pdf>).
- U.S. Census Bureau. 2010b. "Population Distribution and Change: 2000 to 2010." Retrieved January 1, 2015 (<http://www.census.gov/prod/cen2010/briefs/c2010br-01.pdf>).
- Watkins, William H., James H. Lewis, and Victoria Chou. 2001. *Race and Education: The Roles of History and Society in Educating African American Students*. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Yoshida, Roland K., Anthony A. Cancelli, John Sowinski, and Regis Bernhardt. 1989. "Differences in Information Sent to Minority and Nonminority Prospective Applicants to Clinical, Counseling, and School Psychology Programs." *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice* 20(3):179–84.

AUTHOR BIOGRAPHICAL NOTES (IN ORDER OF APPEARANCE)

M. Todd Bradley, PhD, is an associate professor of political science at Indiana University Kokomo. His research areas include civil society actors, such as nonprofits and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), and the roles they play in democratization efforts in “developing” countries. Additionally, his research focus considers the role of NGOs in societies, such as that of Japan, that have traditionally marginalized (or overlooked) civil society actors in “mature” democracies.

Emmett Dulaney is a professor of marketing in the Falls School of Business at Anderson University. His areas of interest include consumer behavior, public relations, and social media.

Rebecca Gunn is an assistant professor of marketing in the College of Business at Oral Roberts University. She received her DBA in marketing from Anderson University (Indiana). Her research interests include marketing communications, consumer behavior, eWOM, and social media.

Nuan Gao is Assistant Professor of East Asian History, Department of History, Hanover College, Indiana. Her research interests focus on the cultural and social transformations of late-nineteenth-century and early-twentieth-century China.

Sara Hare is an associate professor of sociology at Indiana University Southeast. She received her PhD in sociology from Indiana University Bloomington in 2002. Dr. Hare teaches courses in gender roles, social movements, statistics, and research methods, and she researches topics in the area of gender and media.

Gregory T. Kordsmeier is Assistant Professor of Sociology at Indiana University Southeast. His research focuses on social interaction in culture industries. He utilizes qualitative methods in that research, focusing on in-depth interviewing, participant observation, and qualitative content analysis of documents. In particular, he is interested in understanding the social-psychological and micro-sociological forces that affect work processes in arts organizations, and the effects this has on artists and the art that they make.

Payton Schnarre graduated with a bachelor’s degree in psychology from the University of Southern Indiana in 2015. She is currently pursuing a master’s degree in social work at the University of Southern Indiana.

Aimee Adam is an assistant professor in the psychology department at the University of Southern Indiana. Her research focuses on the impact of the media on romantic relationships, the formation of parasocial relationships, and teaching-related issues.

Anne Statham received her PhD in sociology from Indiana University in 1976 and has taught at the University of Southern Indiana since 2007. Before that, she was on the faculty at University of Wisconsin–Parkside for many years; there, she led a multiyear

study of the Chrysler plant shutdown that occurred in late 1988. She was inducted into the Kenosha Labor and Education Hall of Fame in 1996 in honor of her work on this project. She has published a number of books and articles on a range of issues, including gender and work, women and poverty, identity in interaction, and environment and society.

Paul Greider received his PhD in sociology from Loyola University Chicago in 2006 and taught at St. Cloud State University and Florida Southwestern State College before retiring in 2015. His interests include the sociology of work, along with the impact of race, class, and education on members of the working class. In his past life, he spent more than 30 years on a shop floor as a factory worker and union steward. He is currently working on a manuscript about his tenure in the factory.

Jason VanAlstine is an associate professor of economics in the School of Business at Indiana University Kokomo, where he teaches undergraduate courses in economics and statistics. He is a member of the Faculty Colloquium on Excellence in Teaching and has won multiple teaching awards. Jason's research, which has resulted in six publications, focuses on the economics of diversity and the scholarship of teaching and learning.

Steven R. Cox is a professor of finance in the School of Business at Indiana University Kokomo. He teaches graduate and undergraduate courses in finance, accounting, and economics. He also teaches in the Freshman Learning Community and the Honors Program. He is an award-winning teacher whose publication outlets include the *Journal of Money, Credit, and Banking*, the *Journal of Banking and Finance*, and the *Journal of Corporate Finance*.

Dianne M. Roden is a professor of finance in the School of Business at Indiana University Kokomo. She has taught both undergraduate and graduate courses in finance and accounting, and she has received eight awards for teaching excellence. Dianne's major focus of research centers on issues of corporate ownership and control and has resulted in more than 20 refereed articles published in high-quality journals.

Lisa Boothby is Executive Director of Pharmacy and Outpatient Services at Dukes Memorial Hospital/Lutheran Health Network in Peru, Indiana. She holds an MBA from Indiana University Kokomo and a PharmD from the University of Florida.

Jeffery M. Vergo, PsyD, graduated from the University of Indianapolis with a degree in clinical psychology. He currently works at the Captain James A. Lovell Federal Healthcare Center in North Chicago, where he treats our veterans in their residential PTSD program. His research interests include minority mental health, providing psychological care to traditionally underserved populations, and graduate training in psychology.

Dr. Mixalis Poulakis, PsyD, is an assistant professor at the University of Indianapolis School of Psychological Sciences. He immigrated to the United States from Greece in 1992. Dr. Poulakis graduated from the University of Indianapolis with a degree in clinical

psychology. His research interests lie in the areas of multiculturalism, addictions, South Asian psychology, and LGBT issues.

Tj Leshner, MA, graduated from the University of Indianapolis with a degree in clinical psychology. She is currently a doctoral candidate for the clinical psychology program at the University of Indianapolis. Her research interests include addictions, law enforcement, and offender populations.

Samreen Khondker, MSc, graduated from Middlesex University London with a degree in applied psychology. She is currently a doctoral candidate for the clinical psychology program at the University of Indianapolis. Her research interests include multicultural psychology, neuropsychology, and psychometric testing.

Pansorn Benyasut, BA, is a doctoral student in clinical psychology at the University of Indianapolis. She is currently working on her dissertation on the barriers of help seeking in Thai international students in the United States. Her research interests include multicultural issues in counseling, coping and resilience, and psychotherapeutic processes and outcomes.

Sebastián Del Corral Winder, BA, is a doctoral candidate for the clinical psychology program at the University of Indianapolis. He immigrated to the United States from Chile in 2013. His research interests include multiculturalism in mental health, therapeutic alliance, and trauma in children.

JIASS REVIEWERS AND REFEREES (2011–2017)

Gratitude and appreciation are expressed to the following persons, among others, who served as reviewers and referees for papers. The publication of this journal would not be possible without their professional dedication and support. Thank you!

Demetra Andrews, Marketing, Kelley School of Business Indianapolis

Robert Barrows, History, Indiana University at Indianapolis

Subir Bandyopadhyay, Business and Economics, Indiana University Northwest

Suchandra Basu, Economics and Finance, Rhode Island College

Kim Bays-Brown, Psychology, Ball State University

Sedefka Beck, Economics, Valparaiso University

Bruce Bigelow, History and Geography, Butler University

Tom Boyt, Management and Business, Valparaiso University

Margaret Brabant, Political Science, Butler University

Todd Bradley, Political Science, Indiana University Kokomo

Daniel Briere, Modern Languages, University of Indianapolis

Christie Byun, Economics, Wabash College

Bernardo J. Carducci, Psychology, Indiana University Southeast

Michael G. Cartwright, Philosophy and Religion, University of Indianapolis

Cory Clasemann, Institutional Research, University of Indianapolis

Krista Cline, Sociology and Criminology, Butler University

William L. Colburn, Psychology, Northern Illinois University

Cheryl W. DeLeon, Psychology, Purdue University North Central

Nirupama Devaraj, Economics, Valparaiso University

Elise Edwards, History and Anthropology, Butler University

Joseph Ferrandino, Criminal Justice, Indiana University Northwest

George Geib, History and Anthropology, Butler University

Angela J. Grippo, Psychology, Northern Illinois University

Peter Z. Grossman, Economics, Butler University

Paul Hanson, History, Butler University

Wei He, Business and Leadership, Purdue University Northwest–North Central

Gihoon Hong, Economics, Indiana University South Bend

Hisaya Kitaoka, Economics, Franklin College

Robert S. Main, Economics, Butler University

Katharine Bohley Martin, Business, University of Indianapolis

Siobhan McEvoy-Levy, Political Science, Butler University

John McIlvried, Psychological Sciences, University of Indianapolis

Philip Michelbach, Political Science, West Virginia University

Randy Mills, Social Sciences, Oakland City University

Mary C. Moore, Sociology, University of Indianapolis

Matt Murphy, Political Science, Centenary College of Louisiana

Katherine B. Novak, Sociology and Criminology, Butler University

James Pennell, Sociology, University of Indianapolis

Josh Petrusa, Library Sciences, Butler University

Jaishankar Raman, Economics, Valparaiso University

Surekha Rao, Economics, Indiana University Northwest

D. Eric Schansberg, Economics, Indiana University Southeast

Dulce Maria Scott, Sociology and Criminal Justice, Anderson University

Arun Kumar Srinivasan, Economics, Indiana University Southeast

Cliff Staten, Political Science and International Studies, Indiana University Southeast

Jonathan Swarts, Political Science, Purdue University Northwest–North Central

James C. Thomas, Business, Indiana University Northwest

Kathleen Tobin, History, Political Science, and International Studies, Purdue University Northwest–Calumet

Paul Vasquez, Political Science, University of Central Florida

Jacqueline R. Wall, American Psychological Association, Washington, DC

Diane E. Wille, Psychology, Indiana University Southeast

Jeffrey Woods, Economics, University of Indianapolis

Lissa Yogan, Sociology, Valparaiso University

Litao Zhong, Business and Economics, Indiana University East

AUTHOR INSTRUCTIONS AND MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION GUIDELINES

(Effective September 1, 2016)

The following statement provides an overview of the submission requirements and is designed to assist authors in the preparation of their manuscripts for possible publication in the journal. It covers details of the review process and of the presentation and formatting style required for all paper submissions and that will be checked in copyediting if your manuscript is accepted for publication. To avoid delays in manuscript processing, all authors and coauthors who wish to have their papers considered for publication should review and observe the following submission requirements:

1. All manuscripts submitted for review must include a nonrefundable processing fee. The fee is \$10 for IASS members (waived for members who submit papers presented at previous IASS Annual Meeting) and \$25 for non-IASS members. There is no cost for students or for associate members. Papers will not be processed without payment.

2. Make all checks payable to Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences (IASS) and attach to letter and manuscript submission. Payment may also be made online via PayPal and indicated in the submission letter.

3. Be sure to include a COVER LETTER, ABSTRACT with KEY WORDS, and PROFESSIONAL BIOGRAPHY with both e-mail/electronic and hard-copy submission of manuscripts. Failure to do so will delay processing of your paper.

- Authors must provide full and complete contact information as follows: (1) name, (2) status as faculty (including rank) or student (undergraduate or graduate), (3) discipline and department affiliation, (4) university institution, (5) institutional mailing address, (6) e-mail address, and (7) work and alternate phone numbers.
- Cover letter should state that the author/coauthors is/are submitting the paper for review for possible publication in the *Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences*. The author and/or coauthors must state that the work has not been published anywhere previously and must agree to comply with all requirements outlined in these guidelines, including a willingness to publish the paper in the journal if it is accepted, and to assign full copyright to IASS should the paper be accepted.

4. Papers must be submitted electronically via e-mail as Microsoft Word document attachments to <editor@iass1.org>. One print (hard) copy of the manuscript must also be mailed to the editor:

Dr. Kenneth Colburn
Editor, Journal of the Indiana Academy of the Social Sciences
Butler University, Jordan Hall 272-B
4600 Sunset Avenue
Indianapolis, IN 46208

5. All papers submitted for publication must be prepared according to the *American Sociological Association Style Guide* (5th ed.) as modified below. Most university libraries have copies. Summaries are available online from many sources, and any current sociology journal (for example, *American Sociological Review*, *Sociological Quarterly*, *Sociological Focus*, *Sociological Inquiry*) may be consulted for examples. A summary review of the ASA style guide as modified for the IASS, in addition to other requirements, is provided below.

6. The senior editor in chief is responsible for making the final decision on all manuscripts and content for publication in the journal. The senior editor's decisions on all publication matters and content are not subject to review by any other member, officer, or body of the IASS.

GUIDELINES FOR MANUSCRIPT PREPARATION

(modified ASA style)

Paper length should be limited to about 30 pages total, including title page, abstract, all text, graphs, tables, endnotes, and references.

All pages must be created using **Microsoft Word** in **12-point Times New Roman** only and must be **double-spaced** (including **endnotes** and **references**).

All margins (left, right, top, and bottom) must be 1.25 inches.

Use **normal settings** when word processing. Do not create special characters on the keyboard.

Biography

Include a short professional biography (five or six lines) for each author, which should include the author's name, title, department, institution, and a brief description of current research interests, publications, or awards.

Abstract

The abstract appears on a separate page headed by the title. It should be brief (one paragraph of 150 to 200 words), descriptive (a summary of the most important contributions in a paper), and accessible (jargon-free and clear to the general reader). A good test of the quality of an abstract is if it can serve as a press release for the research.

Title Page

Include the full **title** of the article, the **author(s) name(s)**, **department and disciplinary affiliation(s)** and **institution(s)** (listed vertically if there is more than one author), a

running head (60 characters or less), the **word and page count** for the manuscript, and a title footnote.

An asterisk (*) by the title refers to the **title footnote** at the bottom of the title page. The title footnote must include the name and address of the corresponding author and may also include other contact information, acknowledgments, credits, and/or grant information.

First Page

The first page of the text should start with the title page, and the running head should be on every subsequent page of text in the header with a page number. The first page of text would be page 3 (title page = 1; abstract page = 2).

Text

Length. Papers should be limited to about 30 pages total, including all text, graphs, tables, endnotes, and references. *No* personal or institutional or other identifying information should be contained in the manuscript outside of the title page.

Subheadings. Generally, three levels of subheadings are sufficient to indicate the organization of the content. See recent journal issues for subheading formats.

Text citations. Include the last name of the author and year of publication. Include page numbers when you quote directly from a work or refer to specific passages. Cite only those that provide evidence for your assertions or that guide readers to important sources.

- If author's name is in the text of the sentence, follow the name with the year of publication in parentheses: "...Duncan (1959)"; if author's name is not in the text of the sentence, enclose both the last name and the year in parentheses: "... (Gouldner 1936)."
- Pagination follows the year of publication after a colon: "... (Ramirez and Weiss 1979:239–40)."
- Give both last names for joint authors: "... (Martin and Bailey 1988)."
- For works with three authors, list all last names in the first citation in the text; thereafter use "et al.": "... (Carr, Smith, and Jones 1962)" and later, "... (Carr et al. 1962)." For more than three authors, use "et al." throughout.
- Place a series of parenthetical references in alphabetical (not chronological) order, separated by semicolons: "... (Burgess 1968; Marwell et al. 1971; Smith 1843)."
- For unpublished materials, use "forthcoming" to indicate material scheduled for publication. For dissertations and unpublished papers, cite

the date. If no date, use “N.d.” in place of the date: “... Smith (forthcoming) and Jones (N.d.)”

Mathematical symbols and equations. Use consecutive Arabic numerals in parentheses at the right margin to identify important equations. Align all expressions, and clearly mark compound subscripts and superscripts. Clarify all unusual characters or symbols. Use italic type for variables in equations and in the text; use bold type for vectors.

Endnotes (No footnotes permitted)

Use endnotes only when necessary. Notes (particularly long ones) can be distracting to the reader. As an alternative, consider stating in the text that information is available from the author.

- Begin each note with the superscript numeral to which it is keyed in the text.
- Type notes (**double-spaced**) in a separate section titled “Endnotes” at the end of the document.

References

All references cited in the text and endnotes must be listed in the reference list, and vice versa. Double-check spelling and publication details—*the JLASS journal editor is not responsible for the accuracy of authors’ reference lists.*

- List references in alphabetical order by authors’ last names. Include full names of all authors—use first name initials only if the author used initials in place of name in the original publication.
- For multiple authors, invert only the name of the first author (e.g. “Jones, Arthur B., Colin D. Smith, and Barrie Thorne”).
- For two or more references by the same author(s) or editor(s), list references in order of the year of publication. Give the author’s (or editor’s) full name in all subsequent references. Arrange references for the same single author from the earliest to the latest. All single-author references precede references by that author with coauthors, even though they may have been published earlier. References with multiple authors are arranged in alphabetical order of authors’ last names.
- To list two or more works by the same author(s) from the same year, distinguish them by adding letters (a, b, c, etc.) to the year or “Forthcoming” (e.g., 1992a, Forthcoming a). List in alphabetical order by title.

A few examples follow. See recent ASA journal issues for further examples.

Books

Mason, Karen O. 1974. *Women's Labor Force Participation and Fertility*. Research Triangle Park, NC: National Institutes of Health.

Periodicals

Aseltine, Robert H. Jr., and Ronald C. Kessler. 1993. "Marital Disruption and Depression in a Community Sample." *Journal of Health and Social Behavior* 34(3):237–51.

Collections

Clausen, John A. 1972. "The Life Course of Individuals." Pp. 457–514 in *Aging and Society*. Vol. 3, *A Sociology of Age Stratification*, edited by M. W. Riley, M. Johnson, and A. Foner. New York: Russell Sage.

Web Site (No Author)

American Anthropological Association. 2006. "Race." Retrieved July 10, 2010 (http://www.aaanet.org/_cs_upload/resources/14737_1.pdf).

Tables, Figures, Etc.

Include tables and figures only when they are critical to the reader's understanding.

Tables

- Number tables consecutively throughout the text. Insert tables in the text as appropriate.
- Include a descriptive title for every table. (The title must *not* be part of the table itself but should be placed in the text before the table.)
- Include headings for all columns and rows (see recent journal issues for examples).
- Always use the same variable names in tables as in the text.
- Include standard errors, standard deviations, *t* statistics, and so forth in parentheses under the means or coefficients in the tables.
- Gather general notes to tables as "Note:" or "Notes:" (or "Source:" or "Sources:") at the bottom of the table; use a, b, c, etc., for table footnotes.
- Use asterisks (*, **, and/or ***) to indicate significance at the $p < .05$, $p < .01$, and $p < .001$ levels, respectively; note if tests are one-tailed or two-tailed. Generally, only those results significant at the $p < .0$ level or better should be indicated as significant in the tables or text.

Figures and Other Artwork

Number figures or illustrations consecutively throughout the text. Each should include a title. If the manuscript is accepted for publication, submit figures and illustrations electronically. All labels on figures and illustrations must be typeset (not within the figure, but part of the text preceding the figure).

IMPORTANT: Before submitting a figure or illustration for publication, contact the journal editorial office to discuss size specifications and/or disk and file formats. All artwork and type must be legible when sized to fit a 6" width.

Author(s) must secure permission to publish any copyrighted figure, illustration, or photograph.

Appendices

No appendices will be permitted without express permission from the senior editor.

Review Your Manuscript!

Although authors should note that these functions may not always be reliable, run spelling and grammar checks on your manuscript from your word processing software. Double-check that formatting conforms to ASA style.

Carefully read through the entire manuscript one final time before submitting, as no substantive changes in title or text will be permitted once paper is submitted and accepted for review.

Authors/Coauthors will be responsible for paying the cost of any excessive copy and/or proof editor fees that may be required because of a failure to observe these guidelines *prior* to their paper being published.

JOURNAL OF THE INDIANA ACADEMY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES
VOLUME 20 (2017)
CONTENTS

Essay

Strategies of Political Institutions and Civil Society Actors in the Post-3/11 Era:
The Case of Japan *M. Todd Bradley*

Research Articles

Situational Crisis Communication Theory and the Use of Apologies
in Five High-Profile Food-Poisoning Incidents
Emmett Dulaney and Rebecca Gunn

Building *Fukan* as a Chinese Public Sphere: Zhang Dongsun and *Learning Light*
Nuan Gao

Still No Jetpacks or Gender Parity: Animated Film from 1980 through 2016
Sara C. Hare

The Importance of Seeming Earnest: Emotion Work and Leadership in Theater Worlds
Gregory T. Kordsmeier

Parasocial Romances as Infidelity: Comparing Perceptions of Real-Life, Online,
and Parasocial Extradysadic Relationships
Payton Schnarre and Aimee Adam

The Importance of Unions in Contemporary Times
Anne Statham and Paul Greider

Diversity in the Heartland of America: The Impact on Human Development in Indiana
Jason VanAlstine, Steven R. Cox, Dianne M. Roden, and Lisa Boothby

African American Students' Perceptions of Influential Factors for Attendance
in Doctoral Psychology
*Jeffery M. Vergo, Mixalis Poulakis, Tj Leshner, Samreen Khondker,
Pansorn Benyasut, and Sebastian Del Corral Winder*

Authors' Biographical Notes

Reviewers and Referees (2011–2017)

JIASS Submission Guidelines