



National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Number of microfiches

Number of microfiche

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

Canada

Modulations of Voice and Translations of Text:
The Victorian Background of
James Joyce's *Ulysses*

Daniel O'Leary

A Thesis
in
The Department of English

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of Master of Arts
Concordia University
Montréal, Québec, Canada

February 1994
© Daniel O'Leary, 1994



National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Author: Author's name

Author: Author's name

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-90920-X

Canada

ABSTRACT

Modulations of Voice and Translations of Text:
The Victorian Background of
James Joyce's *Ulysses*

Daniel O'Leary

James Joyce was estranged from the Irish Renaissance by his rigorous education. The *Telemachiad* reveals that a major component of Joyce's education was a study of late-Victorian philology. Etymological study, particularly by William Walter Skeat and Friedrich Max Müller, influenced Joyce's early writing and became particularly important in *Ulysses*. This study exposed Joyce to earlier work by James Harris, John Horne Tooke, and Lord Monboddo. Ethnology also influenced racial themes in *Ulysses*. Philological texts were sources of Joyce's Middle English and Renaissance prose models in "Oxen of the Sun." Richard Ellmann's catalogue of Joyce's Trieste library is a misleading guide to sources, but reveals interest in empiricist philosophy. Georg Brandes, Edward Dowden, and Walter Raleigh are the Shakespearean critics used in "Scylla and Charybdis." Joyce knew Grimm's Law and Verner's Law and understood Middle English orthography. Joyce would have read

Locke, Berkeley, and the less-remembered Scots Common Sense philosophers. The relationship of Haines to the philologist Richard Chenevix Trench is important. The attitudes of historians and geographers is revealing in the context of *Ulysses* sources. Bloom's Jewishness is exaggerated by Irish bigotry. Haines's dream is a coda for understanding race in the novel. Joyce privileges maternity throughout *Ulysses*. Joyce Judaicizes rather than Hellenizes Ireland. *Ulysses* reflects belief that language is "fossil poetry." Ernst Cassirer illuminates Joyce's linguistic understanding. Thomas Reid and Dugald Stewart are philosophical authorities for Joyce's philological instructors. Robert Scholes' "structuralist" reading of *Ulysses* is unsatisfying. *Ulysses* preserves many Victorian works that otherwise would be lost.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Modulations of Voice and Translations of Text:
The Victorian Background of
James Joyce's *Ulysses*

Chapter One: <i>Ulysses</i> , Victorian Philology and James Joyce's Estrangement from Ireland	1
Chapter Two: Philology and Race in <i>Ulysses</i>	23
Chapter Three: Historians, Geographers, and Ethnologists	70
Chapter Four: The Irish <i>Maschiach</i>	96
Conclusion: <i>Ulysses</i> , <i>la linguistique</i> , and the Philosophers	114
Bibliography	130
Appendix: A short chronology of some important events in the history of English philology before the publication of the <i>Telemachiad</i> .	151

Chapter One:
Ulysses, Victorian Philology and James Joyce's
Estrangement from Ireland

Number one swung lourdily her midwife's bag, the other's gamp poked in the beach. From the liberties, out for the day. Mrs. Florence MacCabe, relict of the late Patk MacCabe, deeply lamented, of Bride Street. One of her sisterhood lugged me squealing into life. Creation from nothing. What has she in the bag? A misbirth with a trailing navelcord, hushed in ruddy wool. The cords of all link back, strandentwining cable of all flesh. That is why mystic monks. Gaze in your omphalos. Hello. Kinch here. Put me on to Edenville. Aleph, Alpha: nought, nought, one.

Spouse and helpmate of Adam Kadmon: Heva, naked Eve. She had no navel. Gaze. Belly without blemish, bulging big, a buckler of taught vellum, no, whiteheaped corn, orient and immortal, standing from everlasting to everlasting. Womb of sin.¹

To say that the relationship of James Augusta Joyce with the nation of Ireland was anything less than abnormally complex would be to understate. And of a generation that saw hand in glove both mitigated liberation and the casual atrocity of perpetual war, it would be ridiculous to expect that the various sentiments of its sensitives be anything other than relentlessly sceptical. But whereas the leading figures of the (Anglo-)Irish Renaissance were sceptical of all things English, and took refuge in a romanticizing cult of the Irish primitive, Joyce was sceptical of the Irish Renaissance itself; and he chose on his own terms a program whose

¹James Joyce, *Ulysses*, the corrected text, edited by Hans Walter Gabler, with Wolfhard Steppe and Claus Melchior (London: Penguin Books, 1986), pp. 31-32.

curricula included works and subjects overlooked by and possibly antithetical to the main literary interests of Yeats's generation. This formed Joyce as an intellectual in a European rather than an Irish context, and led to his estrangement from those who should have been his peers in Ireland. To some extent this was a matter of personality, an off-putting intensity of ambition that made Joyce aloof and proud. But it was also a result of ability and of a range of intellectual interests that quickly outstripped his literary *confrères*.

Frank Budgen says that Joyce's "tenacity of purpose" would have been useless,

...if he had not possessed the faculty of shutting out at will all noises in the street, if he had not been able not to be unduly distressed about what he could not alter.²

We know from *A Portrait*, and from Garrett Deasy's office in the "Nestor" episode, and from "Scylla and Charybdis," that one noise in the street is God: the "rabblement" make another, and the shouted curse of the Citizen in Barney Kiernan's tavern is still another. That he could not alter the tone of the noise made by the rabblement, the tenor of the Citizen's curse, did distress Joyce to the extent that he felt compelled to leave the country of his fathers. The *Telemachiad*--"Proteus" particularly, and indeed all of *Ulysses* to some extent--is the record of a critical moment of a distress that

²Frank Budgen, *James Joyce and the Making of Ulysses* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1967), p. 191.

led Joyce into exile from Ireland.

In the *Telemachiad*, just after leaving Mr. Deasy, and Deasy's workaday concerns about apthous fever, Stephen Dedalus steps into the "Ineluctable modality of the visible."³ What follows is one of the great passages in literature. But it is also a passage in which we see Joyce in ontological struggle with himself and with the world created by a *demiurgos* manifested variously in Roman Catholicism, Irish nationalism, and literary provincialism. And with a dialectical intensity the passage surrenders in turn to alternate convictions: those of a renegade Catholic unbeliever and those of a metaphysician schooled by Mahaffy's Kant and by the Duns Scotus and Thomas Aquinas of Belvedere and Clongowes Wood; those of the creator of an Hebraic Epic Hero and those of an Irish prisoner of conscience; and, perhaps most especially, those of an Irish-born exile. As David Pierce, among scores of others, reminds the reader of *Ulysses*, the work is "unfailingly demanding."⁴

Joyce tells us, through Larbaud, Benoist-Méchin, and Linati, that the "Proteus" episode is one whose art is philology. In the episode, Joyce's philological propensities manifest themselves by etymologically charging language to create a wavering dialogue between a coarsened, satyric

³*Ulysses*, p. 31.

⁴David Pierce, *James Joyce's Ireland* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992), p. 24.

atheism and a Manichaeian-Pythagoreanism, one that does not relent in its heterodoxy, but that does transcend the Benthamite dreariness of British materialisms and positivisms current in 1904 and in 1918. Texts like the now nearly forgotten William Walter Skeat's *Principles of English Etymology*, Richard Chenevix Trench's *English, Past and Present* and *On the Study of Words*, John Earle's *The Philology of the English Tongue*, F. Max Müller's *Lectures on the Science of Language* and Henry Sweet's *History of English Sounds*, are representative of the textual culture Joyce would have encountered in his researches into matters etymological and philological both for the "Proteus" episode and during his early years as a student of language. To a great extent, the influence of this culture of discourse on the literature of the nineteenth and early twentieth century has been occluded by a post-Holocaust bias against work tainted by its vocabulary; a vocabulary Comparative Philology or the Science of Language shared with the ethnological studies later distorted by any number of ultra-nationalist and racist movements active before the Second World War.

As a result, it has become a commonplace to paint eighteenth and nineteenth century philologists with totalitarian racist colours in the recent studies in which their names figure, and to underestimate the extent of their influence on figures we continue to admire. For instance, in *The Aryan Myth*, a well-known history of modern nationalist

racisms published in 1971, Léon Poliakov goes so far as to call Max Müller a "propagandist for the Aryan Myth."⁵ In his tract, Poliakov also includes Jacob Grimm, James Monboddo, and both von Humboldts--all of whom would have been familiar to Joyce--in a long list of eminent philologists whose works he holds to reveal prejudices held in common with Nazi propagandists. More recent studies, when they mention the Victorian philologists at all, take much the same view. In *Racial Myth in English History*, Hugh MacDougall also includes Max Müller, as well as Franz Bopp and Jacob Grimm, among the proponents of "Aryan" racism, and calls Max Müller "[by] far the most successful publicist for the Aryan myth."⁶

To some extent MacDougall's position is tenable. Max Müller was an eminent figure in philological studies during a period in which the Science of Language, like its sister science ethnology (also sometimes called ethnography or Natural History), was very popular among the educated classes; and Max Müller does occasionally use the term Aryan in an ethnological rather than a philological sense. But he was also one of the most distinguished of the liberal humanists of his day. In the same lectures that Poliakov and MacDougall quote to his disadvantage, Max Müller explicitly attacks the use of comparative philology to justify bigotry and "the

⁵Léon Poliakov, *The Aryan Myth* (New York: Basic Books Inc., 1974), p. 206.

⁶Hugh A. MacDougall, *Racial Myth in English History* (New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1982), p. 120.

unhallowed theory of slavery."⁷ And he does so in England in 1861, a year in which English sympathy for the Confederacy was widespread, and a time in which the taking of a position against slavery, publicly at the Royal Academy, would have been controversially political.

In any event, *Ulysses* was written before the twentieth century had revealed how evil the application of racial mythology might become when coupled with an effective technology. And in "Proteus," Joyce's philological and etymological interests are everywhere apparent. The episode takes place on Sandymount Strand, a shore upon which Joyce himself must have stood before he committed himself to self-banishment. Joyce makes green the episode's colour and tide its governing symbol; and both clearly mark the physical severing of Stephen from Mother Ireland. Monologue is ostensibly the governing "technique" of the episode, by which Joyce seems to have meant partly a semi-mimetic rendering of patterns of human thought, and partly a soliloquy of the sort favoured by Elizabethan dramatists. And soliloquy is surely rhetorically appropriate to exile.

Although the "Proteus" episode is so consistently pressurized formally and emotionally as to repel any attempt at abstract or digest, the passage from the episode quoted at the outset serves as well as any other toward the *deciphering*

⁷Friedrich Max Müller, *Lectures on the Science of Language*, first series (New York: Charles Scribner, 1863), p. 22.

of the text. In looking at this passage, it is well to keep in mind the comprehensive nature of Joyce's reading and understanding of the immense amount of work done in the science of philology in the nineteenth century, and of the powerful authority after about 1795 that classical philologists were granted by etymologists, lexicographers, ethnologists, and by intellectuals and artists generally, during the hundred and fifty years that followed.⁸

For Joyce, the literature of the nineteenth century scientists of language, of the schoolmasters of Saussure, one might say, begins even earlier, running from James Harris's *Hermes, A Universal Grammar*, to the work of Johann Gottfried Herder, Étienne Condillac, Wilhelm von Humbolt, and Jacob Grimm; to John Horne Tooke's *Diversions of Purley*, through George Crabb's *English Synonymes*, Max Müller's *Lectures on the Science of Language*, and Henry Sweet's *Anglo-Saxon Primer*, *New English Grammar*, *History of English Sounds* and *History of Language*; and also, most importantly in this context, to William Walter Skeat's etymological dictionaries, his edition

⁸This date might reasonably be pushed back as far as 1751, the year of the publication of James Harris's *Hermes*. But the advances of etymological studies proper, rather than of universal grammar, are attributable to the publication and wide-spread popularity of John Horne Tooke's *Epea Pteroenta, or the Diversions of Purley*, a flawed but seminal study whose influence on subsequent philology in England cannot be over-estimated. Horne Tooke's work was intended, however, as a rebuttal of Harris's work. Cf. *The Diversions of Purley*, and Christian Charles Josias Bunsen's *Outlines of the Philosophy of Universal History*, vol. i (London: Longman, Brown, Green, and Longmans, 1854), pp. 44-6.

of Chaucer and his *Principles of English Etymology*. These were the works an English-speaking student of language at the turn of the twentieth century would have encountered in their initial studies. In *Stephen Hero*, Joyce writes, "[Stephen] read Skeat's *Etymological Dictionary* by the hour"⁹ and four pages later adds that:

"It was not only in Skeat that he found words for his treasure-house, he found them also at haphazard in the shops, on advertisements, in the mouths of the plodding public. He kept repeating them to himself till they lost all instantaneous meaning for him and became wonderful vocables."¹⁰

After looking for any length of time at the Skeat dictionaries it becomes clear how such an exquisite enjoyment of "vocables" may be fostered.¹¹ And for illustration it is interesting to look to Skeat for a clue to Joyce's choice of the term *vocable*. In the 1884 Second Edition of *An Etymological*

⁹James Joyce, *Stephen Hero* (New York: New Directions, 1963), p. 26.

¹⁰ *Stephen Hero*, p. 30.

¹¹Skeat's own use of the term *vocables* as a philological convention, seems to come from the 1861 lectures of Max Müller. See *Lectures on the Science of Language* (First Series) p. 34 and throughout; although, according to the O.E.D., the word was "revived" late in the eighteenth century. In his *James Joyce and the Making of Ulysses*, Frank Budgen also comments on the quality of Joyce's interest in etymology:

"Every artist loves his material as well as the design to which it gives body--the painter his precious colour; the sculptor his stone, metal, wood; the stained glass artist his tinted hyaline; the poet words. But to Joyce words are more than a pleasurable material out of which agreeable patterns can be made, or thought and emotion communicated. They are quick with human history as pitchblende with radium, or coal with heat and flame," (p. 175).

Dictionary of the English Language, Skeat writes of vocable:

VOCABLE, a term, word. (F., - L.) 'This worde angell is a vocable or worde signifying a ministre;' Udall, on Hebrews, c.I (R.) - F. vocable, 'a word, a tearm;' Cot. -Lat. *vocabulum*, an appellation, designation, name. - Lat. *voca-re*, to call. - Lat. *voc-*, stem of *vox*, voice; see **Voice**. Der. *vocabul-ar-y*, from F. *vocabulaire*, 'a vocabulary, dictionary, world of words,' Cot., from Low Latin *vocabularium*.¹²

In a very clear sense, it is philology and etymology themselves which recapture the "world of words" that lives even in the commonplaces of Joyce's "plodding public."¹¹

It should be recalled, of course, that the discussion of an intimate aspect of Joyce's life, that of his alienation from his own nation, in a passage arguably as autobiographical as any in the novel, could only be couched in a language electric with an understanding of itself; and also that Joyce was canny enough philosophically to read Skeat at a Kantian velocity. And it is because of this sophistication that the language of "Proteus" is as close in sensibility to that of

¹² Skeat, *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1884) p. 689. In Skeat's definition, the abbreviation "Cot." stands for: "Cotgrave.--A French and English Dictionary, composed by Mr. Randle Cotgrave; with another in English and French; ed. J. Howell. London, pr. by Wm. Hunt, in Pye-Corner, 1660." Cotgrave's dictionary was an extremely important source for later lexicographers and etymologists.

¹³In his *Lectures On the Science of Language*, first series (New York: Charles Scribner, 1863), Max Müller again seems to anticipate Joyce: "The study of words may be tedious to the school-boy, as breaking stones is to the wayside labourer; but to the thoughtful eyes of the geologist these stones are full of interest; --he sees miracles on the high-road, and reads chronicles in every ditch. Language, too, has marvels of her own" (p. 12).

Heidegger as to that of any of Joyce's literary contemporaries, especially those contemporaries writing before *The Cantos*, *The Waste Land*, and the major work of H.D. and Djuna Barnes, among others, had taken further advantage of the space cleared for experimental writing by the early publication of the *Telemachiad* in the Spring of 1918.

In the *Introduction to Metaphysics*, Heidegger posits an historic Hellenic culture whose language possessed a grammatical intensity creating for the speaker of the Attic tongue a range of perceptions lost to later speakers of Greek: lost through a degeneration or degradation of speech through contact with Latin; and through the work of Roman grammarians whose weak renderings of decontextualized Greek literary culture created the ground for later European scholastic misreadings. In the work, Heidegger writes:

But now let us skip over this whole process of deformation and decay and attempt to regain the unimpaired strength of language and words; for words and language are not wrappings in which things are packed for the commerce of those that write and speak. It is in words and language that things first come into being and are. For this reason the misuse of language in idle talk, in slogans and phrases, destroys our authentic relation to things. What does the word *physis* denote? It denotes *self-blossoming* emergence.¹⁴

¹⁴Contemporary with Heidegger's work, is his colleague Ernst Cassirer's discussions of both similar and inverse phenomena in his *Language and Myth* (New York: Dover, 1945), particularly in his essays "Language and Conception" and in "Word Magic," in which he writes:

In mythic conception...things are not taken for what they mean indirectly, but for their immediate appearance; they are taken as pure presentations, and embodied in the imagination, (p. 56).

Heidegger might have said self-Blooming. In Stephen Hero, through his cocking of a philologist's ear, Joyce has already recovered language from the misuse of the "instantaneous meaning" of "advertisement" and commerce; the "noise in the street" through which Stephen and Bloom walk, the street where linguistic sensibilities profit from a humane refinement inherent in vocabulary, a refinement not in the manner of the neo-Epicurean or the well-heeled English Paterian, but in the manner of both the mythic, and the historical, Hellene.¹⁵

The connection drawn here between Joyce's and Heidegger's notions of the existential condition of the Homeric or Herodotan Greek is not so slight as it may at once appear. Like those of his important colleague Ernst Cassirer, Heidegger's conclusions were influenced in their nascent stages by that same, immensely important, philological flowering that took place all over Europe following the publication of the Port Royal Grammar, of Harris's *Hermes* and, a little later, of Johann Gottfried Herder's *On the Origin of Language*. Harris's book was extremely influential in fostering after 1750 a Romantic literary sensibility sufficiently sophisticated in matters of language to

¹⁵The notion of an underlying ethical *ab grund* in the etyma of contemporary vocabularies is at least as old as the third and fourth books of Locke's *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding*, and is accepted or assumed by Harris, Lord Monboddo, Thomas Reid, Adam Smith, Dugald Stewart, and even J.S. Mill. The idea also survives in the Victorian philologists' constant assumption that speech is a form of social contract.

anticipate the linguistic self-consciousness that is the main characteristic of Modernism. Robert Lowth, one-time chaplain to the Lord Lieutenant of Ireland, William Cavendish, was a staunch admirer of the *Hermes* universal grammar during his stay as professor of Hebrew Poetry at Oxford.¹⁶ In Germany, in answer to a request for important books on linguistics, von Humbolt suggested in a letter to Schiller that the famous poet should read Harris's book. There were translations of *Hermes* in both German and French by 1795.¹⁷ It was a seminal work for nineteenth century philologists and it is improbable that Joyce would have missed it.

The result of this philological and etymological sensitivity is that Joyce enters with ability and enthusiasm a tradition of discourse that stretches from at least as late as 1918 back through Skeat, Sweet, Crabb,¹⁸ Frederick

¹⁶J.L. Blake, *General Biographical Dictionary Comprising a Summary Account of the Most Distinguished Persons of All Ages, Nations, and Professions* (New York: J.P. Peaslee, 1835), p. 581.

¹⁷Hans Aarsleff, *From Locke to Saussure* (Minneapolis: U. of Minnesota Press, 1982), p. 350.

¹⁸George Crabb shared with James Harris a pleasure in the little-noted Eclectic grammarian Saccus Ammonius, whose reputation has down to our time scathed by his rejection in adulthood of Christianity. Ammonius, Grammaticus of Alexandria, who died as a Gnostic exile from the destruction of heathen temples in that city in 389 C.E., "wrote, in Greek, a valuable work, *On the Differences of Words of Like Signification*," cf. *Dr. Smith's Classical Dictionary* (London; John Murray, 1853), p. 44. Crabb's own *English Synonymes* (second ed., London: Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy, 1818), a work usually mutilated in later editions, aided the clearing of ground for a nineteenth century more fruitful than our own for
(continued...)

Furnivall, and the like, back further to Herder, Étienne Condillac, and Harris, and even beyond to the Alexandrians Ammonius Grammaticus and Apollonius Rhodius, as well as to the routinely-cited Aquinas.¹⁹ In his *Hermes*, the eighteenth century universal grammarian James Harris writes:

Time and space have this in common, that they are both of them by nature things continuous, and as such they both of them imply extension. Thus between London and Salisbury there is the extension of space, and between yesterday and tomorrow the extension of time. But in this they differ, that all the parts of space exist at once and together, while those of time only exist in transition or succession. Hence we may gain some idea of time, by considering it under the notion of a transient

¹⁸(...continued)

popular philological science in English. In his preface, Crabb denies any debt to Dr. Johnson (p. vi.) but everywhere reveals both his respect for Ammonius as a master in method and his knowledge of Harris's work as a path to Ammonius and other Hellenist grammarians otherwise nearly obscured by history. As an aside, it is also interesting to mention Charles Buck's temperate description of the Eclectics as, "ancient philosophers, who, without attaching themselves to any particular sect, took what they judged good and solid from each," cf. Buck's *Theological Dictionary* (Philadelphia: J. & J. Woodward, 1847) p. 161. There is some question as to whether these Eclectics are to be seen as distinct from the Eclectics who were the New Platonicks of the Alexandrian Christian school, those better known as the neo-Platonists (cf. Buck, p. 408). In any event, all the Eclectics followed Ammonius insofar as they tried to "reconcile the tenets of Aristotle and Plato...if not so far as to become Apostates uniformly," cf. J.L. Blake, *Biographical Dictionary* (New York: J.P. Peaslee, 1835, p. 45). Saccas and Joyce are linked by this philosophical heresy.

¹⁹One must also remember the place of linguistic and "Poetic" studies in Italy by Vico, and by his Hermetic precursors Pico Della Mirandola, Ficino, Pompanazzi, Vives, a Spaniard, and, of course, Giordano Bruno. See Cassirer, Kristeller, and Randall's *the Renaissance Philosophy of Man* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1948), and Frances Yates' *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964).

continuity.²⁰

In "Scylla and Charybdis," Stephen evokes the force of this passage when he suggests, "Hold to the now, the here, through which all future plunges to the past,"²¹ and, again, in "Proteus":

Open your eyes now. I will. One moment. Has all vanished since? If I open and am forever in the black adiaphane. *Basta!* I will see if I can see.

See now. There all the time without you: and ever shall be, world without end.

This is *transient continuity* for Harris. And in "Proteus," it is the moment rendered "aleph" and "alpha" in a privileging of the present that the less heterodox, though equally Pythagorean, Harris does not grant.

The manner in which Joyce handles the pre-eminence of *time present*, and Joyce's embedding of the notion in the passage quoted at the outset of this discussion, deserves close notice. It may be of use to annotate briefly some aspects of this passage as it unfolds. To repeat part of the opening quotation:

Number one swung lourdily her midwife's bag, the other's gamp poked in the beach. Mrs. Florence MacCabe, relict of the late Patk MacCabe, deeply lamented, of Bride Street.

To begin, "Number one," names and encapsulates the force that demands its authority through its (or, as an *anima*, her)

²⁰James Harris, *Hermes; or A Philosophical Inquiry Concerning Universal Grammar* (London: W. M'Dowall, 1816), p. 39.

²¹*Ulysses*, 9.89.

impervious inescapability. For Joyce it/she is the mathematical imperative, *physis*, birth, or hunger: the brutality of fact.²² The passage reflects especially the force of this inescapability for Stephen on a strand both ocean's margin and state of Being. It is a numerical singularity, a "one," physical insofar as Stephen's psychical struggle must continuously encounter it. Hugh Kenner has remarked that many people miss the fact that Bloom moves and reacts in the way he does not because he is Bloom and it is eternally Bloom's manner to move in such a way, but rather, because he is a study of a man "virtually in shock."²³ Stephen maintains the oft-cited father-son theme of *Ulysses* in that he too, on the strand between Ireland and an unknown, de-tribalized, future of exile, is also in a state of shock. The passage struggles between realities: the bloodied reality of the midwife and the shock of having been born in a country in which one cannot stay; and a more Popean reality, or ontology, of an exquisitely Epicurean artist, one whose aesthetic self-consciousness, gained through syncretic readings of *The Dunciad*, Pater's *Marius the Epicurean*, and of Skeat's philological revelations of the early English text and

²²See also Martin Heidegger, *An Introduction to Metaphysics* (New Haven: Yale U. Press, 1959), p. 13.

²³Hugh Kenner, *Ulysses* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1980), p. 51.

tongue,²⁴ turns all prayer at time of crisis into satiric travesty, into parody, and into sophisticated, multi-valent, puns and riddles that pre-figure the mind of the Wake.²⁵

Stephen's phone number, "Aleph, Alpha: nought, nought, one,"²⁶ is a superb example of this. It is interesting to note that Don Gifford cannot suppress an interpretive comment in this instance:

3.39 (38:4). *Aleph, alpha*--initial letters of the Hebrew and Greek alphabets, respectively. (sic)
 3.39 (38:5). *nought, nought, one*--Creation (as only God can create) from nothing.²⁷

The strain on Gifford of writing a cyclopaedic commentary is clear here. Gifford risks a reading that "nought, nought,

²⁴ For instance, the "Ayenbyte of Inwit" in *Specimens of Early English*, eds. Richard Morris and W.W. Skeat, fourth edition (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1898), pp. 98-106.

²⁵ It is interesting to note that Walter Pater's *Gaston De Latour*, published in 1897, or his article in the *Fortnightly Review* in August, 1889, may have been the source(s) of the youthful Joyce's first information about Giordano Bruno. See Charles Shadwell's preface to *Gaston De Latour*, (London: Macmillan, 1897) p.v. Joyce spoke of Bruno as early as 1901 in "the Day of the Rabblement." And although Mason and Ellmann note that Joyce's quotation of Bruno in the essay was "probably borrowed" from I. Frith's *Life of Giordano Bruno*, the same notion is also found in Pater, as is "the Nolan" as a name for Bruno. It seems much more likely that Joyce would have been led to Frith from his reading of Pater given Pater's immense popularity among the *illuminati* of the 1890s. John Addington Symonds, another author whose popularity during the *fin de siècle* was extensive among fashionable intellectuals, also wrote a chapter on Bruno that Joyce is likely to have read in part two of "the Catholic Reaction," his supplement to *Renaissance in Italy* (London: John Murray, 1886).

²⁶ *Ulysses*, p. 32.

²⁷ Gifford, *Ulysses Annotated* (London: University of California Press, 1989), p. 46.

one" is an assertion, parodic or otherwise, of *ex nihilo* creation by a deity. Gifford's reading is obvious enough save the fact that the "belly without blemish" later in the passage seems to belong to a female deity rather than to a "God."

The Dedalus phone number does obliquely comprehend or comprise the notion of "ex nihilo creation." But the insufficiency of such a gloss is apparent in the very solecism, in this context, that suffers *Aleph* a letter of the "Hebrew Alphabet," rather than of the *alephbeth*.²⁸ Even as encyclopedic shorthand this is a slight handling of the passage. One of the most important details pertaining to this phone number is the fact that in Heideggerian, or Viconian, periods of Hebrew and Greek culture, Arabic numbers had yet to be substituted for the dual figurative roles of both character and numeral served by the symbols *Aleph* and *Alpha*. And, of course, the purely numerical equivalent of these pre-Arabic numerals corresponds with the modern usage of the number 1.²⁹ Gifford does note that the two symbols are initial. Joyce goes further. He connects the history of the primary number-letter with the "midwife" and "the belly without blemish."

Aleph and *Alpha* also reflect the basic dialectic of the

²⁸*Alphabet* is misnomer for the Hebrew *alephbeth* that Joyce apparently recognized. In the opening sequence to "the Lotus Eaters" one finds: *He crossed Townsend street, passed the frowning face of Bethel. El, yes: house of: Aleph, Beth.*

²⁹"Arabic" numerals is also a misnomer. See chapter one of De Lacy O'Leary's *Arabic Thought and Its Place in History* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd., 1922).

passage; both represent *physis* insofar as they are numeral, and metaphysics in that it is the *Logos* that is represented by the written letter. Interestingly, Alpha is also a symbol for beginning and deity, as in the biblical expression, "I am Alpha and Omega."³⁰ And Aleph and Alpha, in their merging of alphabetic and numeric primaries and singularities, also recall for the reader the animistic, primordial feminine, the *Heva* at the beginning of the *entwined strands* of all *cables of flesh* or *navelcords*.

I believe that the reader also discovers in this passage the earliest impulse of what later would become one of Joyce's great post-Ulyssean characters, Anna Livia Plurabelle, or ALP: the abbreviation for the character merging Aleph and Alpha, Hebrew and Greek, in the same way in which Aleph and Alpha merge the scriptural and the numeral. Anna Livia is certainly approached with the same language as the "Proteus" passage:

In the name of Annah the Allmaziful, the
Everliving, the bringer of Plurabilities, haloed be
her eve, her singtime sung, her rill be run,
unhemmed as it is uneven.³¹

Here, one finds the same ALP/aleph/alpha correspondences, and a feminine deity, the female force that is Alpha and Omega, is again suggested. This time with the implicit conflation of Annah the Allmaziful with a male deity, the "h" added to Anna

³⁰Revelations i, II. Alpha was also used by Oliver St. John Gogarty during the time of the composition of *Ulysses*, the pseudonym "Alpha and Omega" shared by Gogarty and Joseph O'Connor in *The Tragedy of Dublin*.

³¹*Finnegans Wake* (London: Penguin Books, 1976), p. 104.

to suggest *Allah* in a female guise. This passage, like the passage from "Proteus," refers again to Eve and heaven, and also ironically echoes the Roman Catholic form of the Our Father prayer. Instead of "Everlasting," here is found "Everliving," but the underlying suggestion, the pre-eminence of the female generative force--a constant theme in Joyce's work-- is richly and powerfully evoked. In *Ulysses*, this notion will be given an ultimate primacy in Molly's soliloquy at the end of the novel.

In the Dedalus phone number, Joyce is also historically canny, and makes a suggestion about his epic Ulyssean hero even from this Telemachian remove. Bloom, the Irish Jew, Greek by way of being a tropic metempsychosis of Odysseus,³² is Jewish first because for Joyce the Hebrew (aleph) was closer to a pre-Homeric source, even earlier than the Indo-Arian, pre-Sanskrit originals in which we find fossilised

³²Joyce's choice of ethnic background for his hero is extremely important, of course. The fact of Bloom's Irish Jewishness makes Bloom a kind of walking paradox according to the nationalist wisdom of the Eireann of the day. As the Very Reverend Ulick J. Bourke M.R.I.A., in an unlikely citation of Arnold, put it in 1876 in *The Aryan Origin of the Gaelic Race and Language* (London: Longmans, Green & Co., 1876):

At this moment, as Matthew Arnold observes, 'there exists in the mind of many Englishmen, yea, and of many Irishmen in Ireland, such a sense of mutual repulsion, such a feeling of incompatibility, of radical antagonism between the two races that the Jew seemed, at least not long ago, nearer than the Gael to Englishmen....,' p. 4.

cognates of Gaelic as well as of the younger English language.³³ This is the Skeatsian world in which tracings of etymology are allowed to map the forgotten migrations, the "strandentwining cable" of the last eight to twelve thousand years, through the use of data gained by the study of Vedic Sanskrit, and through creative historical projections allowed by linguistic laws discovered through the use of that data.³⁴

³³Joyce's view of Hebrew as a language historically prior to Greek also reflects his adherence to a tradition as old as St. Isidore of Seville, who in the seventh century assumed in his *Etymologiae* that Hebrew was the language spoken by Adam and Eve in the Garden, cf. *The Oxford Companion to the English Language* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992), ed. Tom McArthur, pp. 384-85. Hans Aarsleff, in *From Locke to Saussure* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1982), speaks of a similar belief of Herodotus, who gave Phrygian precedence to Greek, and also of an eighteenth century experiment in which it was proposed that children raised without other linguistic stimulus would speak Hebrew on their own (p. 230).

³⁴See *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*, Rev. Walter W. Skeat, pp. v-xxii. For an example of the kind of history made possible by philological advances the following passage, from Max Müller's "Prehistoric Antiquities of Indo-Europeans" is illustrative:

"Professor (Rudolph von) Jhering brings some new arguments in support of the belief that the First Aryan Home was somewhere in Asia, or at all events, in a hot country. It had been pointed out by others that there are no common Aryan terms for stable, for hay or straw, and that, therefore in all probability the early Aryas lived in a climate where stables and straw were not required, but where cows and sheep were able to live in the open air. The common name for cattle, *pasu* in Sanskrit and *pecus* in Latin, seems to have meant tied or tethered cattle, and its presence in the north-western and south-eastern branches shows at all events that the Aryas, before they separated, were not mere hunters, but kept their flocks together, either tethered or with the help of the dog, the earliest of domesticated animals, the *svan* in Sanskrit, *canis* in Latin, the Gothic *hunds*, the Irish *cú*." *Collected Works of F. Max Müller, Last Essays, First Series* (London: Longmans Green and Co., 1901), p. 193.

The racist abuse of philological data by enthusiasts of closely-aligned Victorian ethnological science has done much to mitigate for the late-twentieth century historian any too unalloyed pleasure in the fields of study avidly opened by the philology of figures like Max Müller, Bunsen, A.H. Sayce, and Skeat. And political sensitivities have obscured the powerful intellectual impact of those studies on Joyce's generation. It was out of this *zeitgeist* that both nineteenth century Zionism and the Celtic Revival were wrought, as were the collateral attempts at reviving colloquial Hebrew and Gaelic. But for Joyce, the ideological impact on Irish nationalism had by the historiography fashioned out of philological discoveries was much less attractive than its formal, aesthetic, and linguistic impact on his own work.

"Put me on to Edenville," is a cry of desperation even in its parodic clowning, Edenville a kind of *Big Rock Candy Mountain* for post-Decadent literary intellectuals whose sophistication has left them outside the Garden. But the garden Joyce would contact given the adequacy of a linguistic phone line, a tropic construction in which the psyche might be at peace with the *daimon*, reaches back with the velocities of expression first known to the Reverend Skeat, Henry Sweet, F. Max Müller, A.J. Ellis, and, to reiterate, back further to Étienne Condillac, Gottfried Herder, and James Harris; themselves products of a textual culture flowing back through two thousand years of public and private library holdings much

like a telephone current moving towards some kind of Eden.

In the following pages an attempt will be made to reconstruct this textual culture to some extent by looking at both the strengths of its scholarship and the revealing aspects of its occasional lapses and eccentricities. There are probably hundreds of books that Joyce perused whose titles will never be mentioned in Joyce scholarship. And Joyce almost certainly did not read every book that will be mentioned here. But equally certainly, he did see most of them.

Chapter Two:
Philology and Race in *Ulysses*

Joyce's critical writings and letters give only the vaguest hint of the enormous amount of reading of which he was capable as an apprentice *filid* reaching his sixteenth year in 1898. Some might plausibly defend his near-contemporary Yeats's position as a literary or artistic near-equal, but not on the basis of comparison of degrees of familiarity with the intellectual culture and history of Western Europe. And Joyce's notions of that intellectual history were, naturally, those of a figure of his own time. For instance, Joyce jested about racial connections between the Phoenicians and the Irish, but he also believed in that connection, and on the same evidence, as did T.S. Eliot:

This language [Irish] is Oriental in origin, and has been identified by many philologists with the ancient language of the Phoenicians, the originators of trade and navigation, according to historians. This adventurous people, who had a monopoly of the sea, established in Ireland a civilization that had decayed and almost disappeared before the first Greek historian took his pen in hand."³⁵

But whereas Eliot must fastidiously drown his Phoenician, to keep his line unsoiled one supposes,³⁶ Joyce displays his

³⁵"Ireland, Island of Saints and Sages," *Critical Writings*, p. 156.

³⁶T.S. Eliot, "The Waste Land," *Selected Poems* (London: Faber and Faber, 1982), l.47 and l.312-21, pp.52 and 63.

refinement by making his conclusions strictly according to his readings in the Victorian historical sciences. And it is clear that he intends an undercutting of Hiberno-centric ethnologies. Joyce holds the theory of Phoenician Irishmen and Irish Phoenicians on what was good archaeological authority, in 1904 at any rate; on the relatively strong grounds for belief in a coastal Asia Minor connection to Phoenician Carthage through its use of Brythonic tin. At least according to the wisdom then current among the most respectable of the practitioners of the inductive historical sciences in the British Islands. The venerable Dr. William Smith, encyclopaedist, editor of G.P. Marsh's *Lectures on the English Language*, and author of the Victorian standard *A New Classical Dictionary*, wrote that in "early times the Phoenicians visited the Scilly islands and the coast of Cornwall."³⁷ The historian and lexicographer John Eadie agreed that Phoenician "commerce by sea extended from their own shores even to the British islands," a position also echoed by Canon Rawlinson in 1900.³⁸ P.W. Joyce points out

³⁷William Smith LL.D., *A New Classical Dictionary of Biography, Mythology, and Geography*, second edition (London: John Murry, 1853), p. 126.

³⁸John Eadie, D.D., LL.D., *A Biblical Cyclopædia; or Dictionary of Eastern Antiquities, Geography, Natural History, Sacred Annals and Biography, Theology, and Biblical Literature, Illustrative of the Old and New Testaments*, twenty-fourth edition (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1885), p. 526; and George Rawlinson, "Phoenicia," *Chambers's Encyclopædia*, new edition (Edinburgh: William and Robert Chambers, Limited, 1902), v. viii, p. 135.

that both the Irish and Scots Highlanders both worshipped BÉl or Bail, the Phoenician idol-god BÉl or Ba'al.³⁹ Around 1860, the ethnologist Stephen H. Ward even went so far as to adopt a Phoenician etymology for the name Britain, claiming that it "is said to be derived from the Phoenician *baratanac*, and signifies 'the land of tin.'"⁴⁰ Ward goes on to claim that the Phoenicians had "settlements in the mining districts of Cornwall," and quotes Davis and Thurnam's *Crania Britannica*:

"A tincture of Semitic blood and manners, it is very probable, may thus have been communicated to the south-west of Britain; and it may be fairly questioned whether certain eastern peculiarities in the Druidical institutes and doctrines, and in the mythology and religious rites of the Britons, are not in this way to be accounted for."⁴¹

The historical accuracy of such accounts matters little to this discussion.⁴² What is important is that such ideas were

³⁹P.W. Joyce, *A Smaller Social History of Ancient Ireland*, p.120-21. Both the "Baile" of Baile's Strand and "Balor of the Evil Eye" have been said to be descendants of this god.

⁴⁰Stephen H. Ward, *The Natural History of Mankind* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1860[?]), pp. 24-26.

⁴¹Ward, *The Natural History of Mankind*, p.26.

⁴²More contemporary scholars are much less apt to claim for the Phoenicians extensive contact with the ancient Celts of Hibernia and Britain, and the Phoenician character of the Cornish sites is now considered very debatable. In his book *The Celts* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1975), Gerhard Herm speaks of regular trade between Iberian Celts and Phoenicians but does not mention any such contact with Irish or British Celts. Ronald Hutton, in *The Pagan Religions of the Ancient British Isles* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1991), thoroughly examines the archaeological record for evidence of external influences (continued...)

in the air, so to speak, and Joyce's choice of a Semitic hero rises out of concerns fostered by these same Victorian preoccupations.

That there is a clear connection to be made between Victorian philology and ethnology and Joyce's much-discussed "fatherhood motif" will be discussed more extensively below. For now, it is enough to point out that by the time he wrote *Ulysses* Joyce had come to maintain Max Müller's distinction between *language* culture and *racial* culture; a distinction that can be seen throughout the novel, and personified in his only slightly satiric portrayal of Michael Cusack as the Citizen. Max Müller's mature position was that there is a great difference between speaking of Aryans and speaking of "Aryan speakers," and that it is contact *between* peoples that accounts for linguistic migration and common vocabularies.⁴³ In *Ulysses*, Joyce contrasts Leopold Bloom's nationality, Ireland being his country in all respects, with the grudging acceptance and prejudice he receives from his countrymen.

The continuum of academic discourse of which Max Müller's

⁴²(...continued)

on Irish and British cultic practice, but feels no need to address the question of Phoenician or Carthaginian importations.

⁴³See Max Müller, "Prehistoric Antiquities of Indo-Europeans," *Collected Works*, vol. 12 (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1901), pp. 182-217. It must, however, be allowed that Max Müller was occasionally inconsistent in applying this principle, sometimes speaking as if migrations of races, tribes, or peoples were illustrated by the movements of dialects or languages.

view of history and language was a part had lasted through at least the last seventy years of the nineteenth century, and its ostensible method, that of strict induction from concrete evidence, was beginning to be adopted by the Scottish philologists and philosophers by 1750, and had existed, in a more elastic form, since the latter part of the period of the English Restoration. The effect of advances made in the archaeological and palaeological sciences, and in the deciphering of Near-Eastern languages subsequently, has been the submergence of a rich view of nineteenth century intellectual practice; a view available now only through the study of discourses, once orthodox but now superannuated, which took place in what we might now call the human, social, or "soft" sciences.

Traces of eighteenth century intellectual history, also now in Stygian obscurity though cited frequently as recently as ninety years ago, gleam as well in the corpus of Joyce's relevant print and manuscript remains. For example, parody of the dominant mid-Victorian prose style, rich in subordinate clauses and adjectival and adverbial phrases, abounds in *Ulysses*. The opening passage of the "Oxen of the Sun" episode, described by Gifford as an "imitation of the Latin prose styles of the Roman historians Sallust and Tacitus,"⁴⁴ can as easily be read as an exaggerated variety of the dense, latinate, prose of the scholars of the language and history of

⁴⁴Gifford, *Ulysses Annotated*, p. 409.

Imperial Britain; scholars of the like of George Saintsbury, Henry Morley, Chenevix Trench, John W. Draper, G.P. Marsh and Richmal Mangnall.

To some extent at least, it is true to say that the Victorian tendency toward an ornate prose style in both scholarly and popular writing has been one cause for the current obscurity of many of the practitioners of that style. This approach to expository prose becomes particularly common after the euphuistic revival wrought by Cardinal Newman, Walter Pater, and by the plethora of decadent enthusiasts of Walter Savage Landor, Thomas Browne and Robert Burton who flourished at the *fin de siècle*. By the time Joyce entered this literary culture in the late 1890s, elaborate prose models were ubiquitous. To see the early influence of this kind of writing on Joyce himself one need only look at his juvenilia, as in this passage from his essay, written in 1898 or 1899, "The Study of Languages":

First he assumes that the primary science is Grammar, that is, that science which is the first and most natural one to man, and also that Arithmetic is the last, not exactly as the culmination of the other six, but rather as the final, numbered expression of man's life.⁴⁵

In *Ulysses* Joyce, having matured beyond an unselfconscious use of it, affects or satirizes this style again and again. In "Aeolus," for instance, Joyce uses Dan Dawson's speech as an example of the common pseudo-literary bombast that attempted

⁴⁵*The Critical Writings*, p. 25.

to imitate the periodic prose measures of more accomplished writers of the time:

--Or again, note the meanderings of some purling rill as it babbles on its way, tho' quarrelling with the stony obstacles, to the tumbling waters of Neptune's blue domain, 'mid mossy banks, fanned by gentlest zephyrs, played on by the glorious sunlight or 'neath the shadows cast o'er its pensive bosom by the overarching leafage of the giants of the forest.⁴⁶

Of course this kind of writing was by no means unusual in Ireland. The following passage by Ulick J. Bourke, which is about the Irish language rather than about planting grain, might have come from Dan Dawson's cloying pen:

Hence, the sun must bestow its fostering warmth on the sown grain ; the rains must necessarily fall ; the air contribute, even as it sustains animal life, its share of gaseous nutritive support ; the earth must, like a nursing mother, feed the young roots which, with so many sucking mouths, drink in that which supports the growing plant. The summer weather must be favourable, nay, propitious to the proper development of the ear, and warm ripening breezes must come to crown all the forgone labours.⁴⁷

And nor is it an accident that A.E. makes an appearance in the "Aeolus" episode. More so even than the early prose of Yeats, Russell's expository writing is convolutedly florid:

Watts wished to ennoble art by summoning to its aid the highest conceptions of literature ; but in doing so he seems to me to imply that art needed such conceptions for its justification, that the pure artist mind, careless of these ideas, and only careful to make for itself a beautiful vision of

⁴⁶*Ulysses*, p. 102.

⁴⁷Ulick J. Bourke, *The Aryan Origin of the Gaelic Race and Language* (London: Longmans, Green, & Co., 1876), second edition, p. 31.

things, was in a lower plane, and had a less spiritual message. Now that I deny.⁴⁸

In A.E.'s defense, the lushness of his writing, though it may strike the contemporary reader as unnecessarily euphonious and antique, never descends to the empty-headed, long-winded, cliché of the Dan Dawson speech, nor to the superfluous grandiloquence of a Ulick Bourke.⁴⁹

As has been mentioned, the use of similarly dense periodic styles to report real and imagined scientific advances led in part to the subsequent eclipsing of figures in any number of

⁴⁸A.E., *Imaginations and Reveries* (Dublin: Maunsel and Company, 1915), p. 49.

⁴⁹Examples of this style of writing in the later Victorian period might be expanded almost infinitely. There were some writers, often Americans, who did not use it. Emerson, for instance, uses it very sparingly. But it can be viewed as a typical prose style of the period, and one that is sometimes even labelled "Victorian," as if it were the dominant style. There are many reasons for its being a congenial one to the Victorian *zeitgeist*. For one thing, it allowed scientific and historical writers the graceful compression of a great deal of information into the briefest possible space. In any case, one of its signal practitioners was the polymath John W. Draper who provides a lovely example in the second volume of his *History of the Intellectual Development of Europe*, two vol. revised (London: George Bell and Sons, 1875). Speaking of the religious atmosphere in England just before the civil war, he writes:

On a community thirsting after the waters of life were still inflicted wearisome sermons respecting "the wearing of surplices, position at the Eucharist, or the sign of the cross at baptism," things that were a stench in the nostrils of the lank-haired puritan, who, with his hands clasped on his bosom, his face corrugated with religious astringency, the whites of his eyes turned upward to heaven, rocking himself alternately on his heels and the tips of his toes, delivered, in a savoury prayer uttered through his nose, all such abominations of the Babylonish harlot to the Devil, whose affairs they were (p. 243).

fields of Victorian study; figures whose once-extensive fame proved fleeting and whose works are seldom recalled today.

Toward the illumination of the relationship of these submerged discourses to Joyce, there are two useful catalogues, the second a rearrangement of the first. These catalogues make for an interesting beginning. The original was included as an appendix to *The Consciousness of Joyce* by Richard Ellmann.⁵⁰ Basically, the second catalogue, published in 1983, is simply the Ellmann catalogue divided into three categories in three appendices to *Inverted Volumes Improperly Arranged* by Michael Patrick Gillespie.⁵¹ Gillespie divides Ellman's list into books Joyce owned in Zurich, books he consulted while writing *Ulysses*, and books referred to in the text of the novel itself.

As any person with a library knows, it is one thing to own a book and another to study one. And in Joyce's case, one must always keep in mind that he was a peculiar type of reader, approaching books consistently as means towards the enriching of his own texts rather than as a scholar or academic. One book that Joyce does seem to have read thoroughly, Walter Raleigh's *Shakespeare*, includes a description of the Bard that also suits Joyce with a peculiar

⁵⁰Richard Ellman, *The Consciousness of Joyce* (Toronto and New York: Oxford University Press, 1977), pp. 97-134.

⁵¹Michael Patrick Gillespie, *Inverted Volumes Improperly Arranged; James Joyce and His Trieste Library* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1983), pp. 93-102.

aptness:

Shakespeare was one of those swift and masterly readers who know what they want of a book ; they scorn nothing that is dressed in print, but turn over the pages with a quick discernment of all that brings them new information, or jumps with their thought, or tickles their fancy. Such a reader will perhaps have done with a volume in a few minutes, yet what he has taken from it *he keeps for years*. He is a live man ; and is sometimes wrongly judged by slower wits to be a learned man.⁵²
(emphasis added)

This quality of mind makes the cartography of Joyce's sources and influences more difficult than much of the standard critical work of the New Critical period would have one believe. But although an alternate approach demands an investigation further afield, it is also a key to a richer understanding of the intertextuality of *Ulysses*. Since evidence of Joyce's contact with many texts can only be conjectural, this approach must remain a species of historical contextualization rather than a direct bibliographical study. On the other hand, enough is known about the ambition and personality of Joyce, and about the general availability of certain texts between 1898 and 1917, to make conjecture in many cases reasonably certain. One principle that will be adhered to in the discussion to follow is one of exclusion. Books and authors that Joyce could have easily missed--small press runs, obscure American editions, volumes rare in his time--will be ignored, unless a text of this sort is

⁵²Walter Raleigh, *Shakespeare* (London: Macmillan and Co., 1907), pp. 66-7.

specifically referred to in the literature or correspondence, or in the memoirs of those who knew Joyce, though he undoubtedly saw many books of this kind.

In any event, the books listed in the Ellmann-Gillespie appendices offer a convenient entry into discussion of the wider horizon of *Ulysses* source literature. The first of these Gillespie's appendices, "Books Joyce Owned in Zurich," is not controversial. But "Appendix B, Books Joyce Consulted while writing *Ulysses*," books Joyce also owned, is another matter. Despite Gillespie's confidence in listing them, the question of the texts Joyce consulted before the publication of the novel, and of the texts paraphrased or quoted in it, are much more complicated ones than the question of which books he had with him in Europe. Joyce's memory was prodigious, and the breadth, if not the depth, of his twenty years of reading impressive. Joyce was not a scholar in the sense that Skeat was, but his interests were manifold and he retained in encyclopaedic detail the minutiae of many of the subjects he had read about. *Finnegans Wake*, written when Joyce's failing eyesight had left him *sandblind* and made his memory vitally important, is eloquent proof of his powers of recollection. The works that Gillespie cites in his second and third appendices come entirely from Ellmann's catalogue.

In "Appendix C, Books Referred to in *Ulysses*," Gillespie writes:

A number of books in the Trieste catalogue are paraphrased or are quoted at length in *Ulysses*, e.g., Georg Brandes's *William Shakespeare*. They must also have been in Joyce's hands during this period and can be included among those to which Joyce referred in the creative process.⁵³

Here, one of the limitations of Gillespie's approach begins to become obvious. It is quite true that Joyce had a copy of Brandes' fascinating study of Shakespeare and that he certainly used it at the time of the composing of *Ulysses*.⁵⁴ "Scylla and Charybdis" reflects it amply. But on the question of Ulyssean source material on the subject of Shakespeare, there are in "Scylla and Charybdis" other works clearly

⁵³Gillespie, *Inverted Volumes*, p. 101.

⁵⁴Georg Brandes is himself a fascinating personage. A Danish Jew, he began his career as a writer on aesthetic and philosophic subjects and his writing reflected a skepticism profound enough to arouse the hostility of the public. He was among the very first critics to recognize the value of Kierkegaard's work, and he lectured to very large audiences between 1872 and 1875. These lectures were eventually published as *The Great Tendencies of Nineteenth-Century Literature*, his first widely influential study. He was a controversial figure throughout the 1870's and was the object of a number of shrill attacks that forced him to leave his country for Berlin. In 1877, he produced *Danske Dictere*, a work on analytical psychology that was acknowledged as a triumph in the science as late as the 1920s. While in Berlin he began writing literary biographies, and in 1882 he published *Den Romantiske Schole i Frankrig*. In the same year, a change in public sentiment towards Brandes, precipitated by a lecture tour to Norway and Denmark, led the Danes to offer him an income of 4,000 crowns a year. The one condition attached to the grant was that he work on literary subjects. *William Shakespeare* is part of the fruition of this generous grant. Brandes brother Carl was also a figure of eminence. An Oriental and comparative philologist at the University of Copenhagen, he was also very active as a political radical and published a number of plays and character sketches of which *Dansk Skuespilkunst* was the most notable. Both Georg and Carl Brandes were also early champions and friends of Ibsen.

paraphrased, or closely parodied, that Joyce did not have in his Trieste library. One instance is that of Oscar Wilde's *Portrait of W.H.* In this story, mentioned in "Scylla and Charybdis," one finds a theory not at all unlike that which Stephen unsuccessfully attempts delivering to the assemblage at the National Library. Another instance, again in "Scylla and Charybdis," is Joyce's use of the Corkman Edward Dowden's work on Shakespeare in a chapter in which Dowden himself is handled somewhat roughly, the butt of a coarse joke of Mulligan.⁵⁵ Dowden and Walter Raleigh, along with Georg Brandes, are responsible for the very smell of that air which is part of the everything that Stephen knows about "England in Shakespeare's Youth" in the National Library of Ireland:

In the closing years of the sixteenth century the life of England ran high. The revival of learning had enriched the national mind with a store of new ideas and images; the reformation of religion had been accomplished, and its fruits were now secure; three conspiracies against the Queen's life had recently been foiled, and her rival, the Queen of Scots, had perished on the scaffold; the huge attempt of Spain against the independence of England had been defeated by the gallantry of English seamen, aided by the winds of heaven.⁵⁶

Dowden's telling of what *he knows*. "Carry your learning as

⁵⁵Interestingly, Dowden succeeded F. Max Müller as President of the English Goethe Society in 1888, and like Max Müller, held a Taylorian professorship at Oxford. See *Irish Literature*, Section One, v. iii, eds. Wm. J. O'Neil Daunt & Alice Furlong (New York[?]: P.F. Collier and Son, 1904), p. 866.

⁵⁶ Edward Dowden, "England in Shakespeare's Youth," *Irish Literature*, Section One, v. iii, eds. Wm. J. O'Neil Daunt & Alice Furlong (New York[?]: P.F. Collier & Son, 1904), p. 869.

does the mimic his face," as the Renfrewshire Poet Douglas Dunn counselled more recently. But the cadences and syntax of Dowden's own 1875 sketch are, like those of Brandes to follow, very close to the carefully weighted balance of Stephen's own rehearsed utterances:

--It is this hour of the day in mid June, Stephen said, begging with a swift glance their hearing. The flag is up on the playhouse by the bankside. The bear Sackerson growls in the pit near it, Paris garden. Canvasclimbers who sailed with Drake chew their sausages among the groundlings.

Local colour. Work in all you know. Make them accomplices.⁵⁷

(emphasis added)

Gillespie follows Don Gifford in citing Brandes solely as the source of Stephen's Elizabethan portraiture. But in reading Dowden's essays one quickly notices numerous other elements echoed by Joyce in the same section in which he employs snatches of Brandes:

--He died dead drunk, Buck Mulligan capped. A quart of ale is a dish for a king. O, I must tell you what Dowden said!

--What? asked Besteglinton.

William Shakespeare and company limited. The people's William. For terms apply: E. Dowden, Highfield House....

--Lovely! Buck Mulligan suspired amorously. I asked him what he thought of the charge of pederasty brought against the bard. He lifted his hands and said: All we can say is that life ran very high in those days. Lovely!⁵⁸

The section quoted above from Dowden, first published in his *Shakespeare: A Critical Study of His Mind and Art*, is

⁵⁷*Ulysses*, 9.154-160.

⁵⁸*Ulysses*, 9.726--33.

definitely being echoed here. It is not clear whether the mild hostility Joyce apparently harboured towards Dowden is more reflected in having Dowden quote himself in Mulligan's account, his apparent softness on the question of catamitism, or in Joyce's having him quote his most generally available text, one that would be an embarrassment in a company of literate Irishmen:

...the huge attempt of Spain against the independence of England had been defeated by the gallantry of English seamen, aided by the winds of heaven. English adventurers were exploring untravelled lands and distant oceans; English citizens were growing in wealth and importance; the farmers made the soil give up twice its former yield; the nobility, however fierce their private feuds and rivalries might be, gathered around the Queen as their center.⁵⁹

West Briton indeed. The question of Dowden's appearance in *Ulysses* is a relatively minor one. Most importantly, it reflects the fact that Joyce's textual sources for *Ulysses* extend beyond the limited scope of the Gillespie appendices. As far as Dowden is concerned, it is sufficient for the present to say that his book on Shakespeare did not fail to supplement Joyce's biographical considerations of the English Dante, and it is likely that Joyce was also familiar with Dowden's *A History of French Literature* and its chapter on

⁵⁹"Edward Dowden," *Irish Literature*, ten vol., Justin McCarthy, ed., Maurice P. Egan, Lady Gregory, and Douglas Hyde, associate eds. (Philadelphia: John D. Morris and Co., 1904), Section One, v. iii, pp. 869-70.

Diderot's *Encyclopædia*,⁶⁰ his *Life of Shelley*, and even with his poetry, which was praised, reservedly, by Yeats in his 1904 essay "Modern Irish Poetry."⁶¹

But to be fair to Gillespie and Gifford, neither is it true that Brandes is ever far from Joyce's mind in his sketch:

The frequenters of the pit with their coarse boisterousness, were the terror of the actors. They all had to stand--coalheavers and bricklayers, dock-labourers, serving-men, and idlers. Refreshment-sellers moved about them, supplying them with sausages and ale, with apples and nuts. They ate and drank, drew corks, smoked tobacco, fought with each other, and often, when they were out of humour, threw fragments of food, and even stones, at the actors. Now and then they would come to loggerheads with the fine gentlemen on the stage, so that the performance had to be interrupted and the theatre closed. The sanitary arrangements were of the most primitive description, and the groundlings resisted all attempts at reform on the part of the management. When the evil smells became intolerable, juniper-berries were burnt by way of freshening the atmosphere.⁶²

What should be kept in mind is that this passage from

⁶⁰Edward Dowden, *A History of French Literature* (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1897), pp. 294-301.

⁶¹*Irish Literature*, section one, v.111, eds. Wm. J. O'Neil Daunt and Alice Furlong, New York(?): P.W. Collier and Sons, 1904, p. xiv. By 1904, Dowden, born in 1843, was a grand old man of the study of English literature. The extent of his reputation can be gauged by the fact that Dowson was responsible for the study of Southey included in John Morley's prestigious *English Men of Letters* series as early as 1879. The influential series of monographs was written by such luminaries as James Anthony Froude (Bunyan), Leslie Stephen (Pope and Johnson), J.A. Symonds (Shelley), T.H. Huxley (Hume), Anthony Trollope (Thackeray), Henry James (Hawthorne), and the eminent classicist F.W.H. Myers (Wordsworth).

⁶²Georg Brandes, *William Shakespeare* (London: William Heinemann, 1911), p. 105.

Brandes's *William Shakespeare* was first published in English in 1898, at a time when Brandes was a friend and champion of Ibsen. As early as February of 1905 Joyce, in a letter to his brother Stanislaus, writes:

"I think that by the time my novel [*Stephen Hero*] is finished I shall be a good German and Danish scholar, and, if Brandes is alive, I shall send it to him."⁶³

One imagines the young Joyce led from Brandes to Ibsen, and perhaps by 1899 or towards the time of his writing "Ibsen's New Drama" in 1900. It was *de rigeur* to know one's Shakespearean criticism at the turn of the century. The Oxbridge foundation of literary Canon rule on the standard of Shakespeare, to some extent a contingency of the rapid spread of the language with the Empire, made a knowledge of figures like Brandes, Dowden, Raleigh, George Saintsbury, and Henry Morley at least as common as the secret of the shrimp fork, and as necessary to advancement in Victorian English literary circles.

But to return to the Ellmann-Gillespie catalogues, there are factors to consider other than Joyce's superior memory in determining the accuracy of their reflection of the author's reading and research for *Ulysses*. First of all, financial pressures early in Joyce's career made public and university

⁶³*Selected Joyce Letters*, ed. Richard Ellmann (New York: Viking Press, 1975), p. 56.

library holdings extremely important to his apprenticeship.⁶⁴ Given the sort of reader Joyce was, Raleigh's Shakespearean reader, comprehensively sampling books rather than thoroughly digesting every text, the extensive holdings of the National Library allowed wide scope for Joyce's pursuit of his lines of research.⁶⁵ Later, when financial hardship was at least partially eased, the availability of books was affected

⁶⁴Reputable philological texts at the turn of the century were mostly, though by no means exclusively, published by either Oxford's Clarendon Press or by Longmans, Green, and Co. Prices for these books were relatively steep, particularly for half-starved Irishmen. The following list of prices for 1898-1902 is representative:

- W.W. Skeat's *Concise Etymological Dictionary*, 5s. 6d.
- Specimens of English Literature*, 7s. 6d.
- Principles of English Etymology (first series)*, 10s. 6d.
- Principles of English Etymology (second series)*, 10s. 6d.
- H. Sweet's *Student's Dictionary of Anglo-Saxon*, 8s. 6d.
- Short Historical English Grammar*, 4s. 6d.
- Anglo-Saxon Reader*, 9s. 6d.
- History of English Sounds*, 14s.
- J. Earle's *Philology of the English Tongue*, 8s. 6d.
- F. Max Müller's *The Science of Thought*, 21s.
- The Science of Language (two vol.)*, 10s.
- Biographies of Words, and the Home of the Aryas*, 5s.
- The Six Systems of Indian Philosophy (eight vol.)*, 18s.
- Introduction to the Science of Religion*, 5s.

To give some notion of what these prices mean, Bloom's five shilling donation to the Dignam family was considered a generous one, a pint of Guinness in 1904 was 1d., and a glass of whiskey two pence. In "Ithica" Joyce tells us that a pork kidney, tramfare, or copy of the *Freeman's Journal* was 1 d., and a decent dinner could be had for 2s.

⁶⁵Joyce spent a great deal of time in the National Library which, aside from its use for studies by the students of University College, was also a place for "social life as well as an intellectual life," as Padraic Colum writes in *Our Friend James Joyce* (p. 21). The Colums' book is interesting in that it provides gentler first-hand portraits of many of the minor figures in *Ulysses*.

instead by war and by living in countries where English was not generally spoken. The books that Joyce owned in Trieste, listed in the Ellmann-Gillespie catalogues, reflect Joyce's interests, but in a skewed manner, having been acquired somewhat haphazardly as they turned up in European bookshops, or as they were sent or lent to Joyce by friends and relatives. That the catalogues distort the relative importance of certain authors to Joyce is particularly true of books on subjects as specialized as English philology and philosophy, both of which would have been more difficult of acquisition than English Literature or criticism. Early in Joyce's career, during his time in Rome, Joyce in a letter to Stannie alludes to the difficulties caused by his lack of books and to his reliance on libraries:

I can get all the dictionaries I want in the Bib. Vitt. Emann. (blast the long name) including a dictionary of English slang. What a pity I am so handicapped.⁶⁶

Both Joyce's interest in grammar and his need for books are perhaps reflected in another letter written to his brother in March of 1905:

Would you be surprised if I wrote a very good English grammar some day?⁶⁷

In this case it seems likely that Joyce's consideration of the possibility of writing a grammar comes, at least partly, from

⁶⁶*Selected Letters*, p. 56.

⁶⁷James Joyce, *Selected Joyce Letters*, Richard Ellmann, ed. (New York: the Viking Press, 1975), p. 58.

his not having had access to one by someone else; that is, no access except to the cruder sort of grammar used to teach English as a second language.⁶⁸

All of this is not to say that the catalogues are not of value as a starting point. For instance, they reveal Joyce's philological interests despite the difficulty of acquiring English philological texts on the Continent. It is more likely that Joyce collected Adam of Cobsam's *The Wright's Chaste Wife* because it was edited by F.J. Furnivall than out of any prior dynamic interest in Adam of Cobsam.⁶⁹ Skeat's

⁶⁸Near the turn of the century, any number of very elaborate historical grammars of English had been published in England and America. Some notable ones likely of interest to Joyce were those offered by T.R. Lounsbury in 1894, by the irascible Henry Sweet in 1900, and by the illustrious W.W. Skeat in 1911. Sweet also published *The Practical Study of Languages* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1906) in which he makes a distinction between alternate approaches to linguistic study that is very useful in understanding the species of Joyce's interest in the subject. Distinguishing between *practical* and *theoretical* study, Sweet writes:

The scientific basis of the practical study of languages is what may be called 'living philology,' which starts from the accurate observation of spoken languages by means of phonetics and psychology, and makes this the basis of all study of language, whether practical or theoretical. The opposite of living is 'antiquarian' philology, which regards the present merely as a key to the past, subordinating living to dead languages and sounds to their written symbols (p. 1).

Joyce's work primarily reflects his interest in "antiquarian philology" in that it is as a "key to the past" that such studies engrossed him. But unlike the antiquarian philologist for whom such a key is an end in itself, for Joyce it was a key to a mineshaft out of which ore was taken; not simply to reveal a lost past, but as language to be renewed or revived or reclaimed.

⁶⁹Adam of Cobsam, *The Wright's Chaste Wife*, ed. F.J. Furnivall (London: Early English Text Society, 1865).

and Morris's editing of *The Ayenbyte of Inwit* is similarly significant. The books reflect interests Joyce had already acquired and reading he had already done rather than forming basic textual sources for the composition of *Ulysses*. And taken in this light the Ellmann-Gillespie catalogues become much richer ground.

To see what this ground yields a select list of relevant catalogued texts becomes useful:

Adam of Cobsam, *The Wright's Chaste Wife*, ed. F.J. Furnivall.

Francis Bacon, *The Wisdom of the Ancients and the New Atlantis*.

Victor Bérard, *Les Phéniciens et l'Odysée*.

Geoffrey Chaucer, *The Complete Works*, ed. W.W. Skeat.

Alexander Fraser Campbell, *Selections from Berkeley*.

David Hume, *Essays: I. An Inquiry Concerning Human Understanding; II. An Inquiry Concerning the Principles of Morals*.

John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty*.

R. Morris, *Specimens of Early English*.

George Saintsbury, *A History of English Prose Rhythm*.

[?] Sauer, *Englische Grammatik*.

[?] Schlüssel, *Englische Grammatik*.

Richard Chenevix Trench, *Proverbs and Their Lessons*.⁷⁰

In this list of thirteen texts three related interests are reflected: English and comparative philology, eighteenth century empiricist (so-called common-sense or Scots') philosophy, and English grammar. Furnivall, Skeat, Morris, Saintsbury, and Trench represent five of the most important English philologists in the late nineteenth century, and Bérard's book is based upon an historical approach that relies heavily on advances made in philological studies. Berkeley,

⁷⁰Ellmann, *The Consciousness of Joyce*, pp. 97-134.

J.S. Mill, and Hume are the three who, thus far, are most enduringly famous, and, as a result, also the most accessible of the contributors to the philosophical discourse centred around the Edinburgh school that included Thomas Reid, Dugald Stewart and Lord Monboddo; a discourse that can be seen as beginning with Bacon's *The Advancement of Learning* and, more importantly, with Locke's *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding*, particularly the third and fourth books of that essay.⁷¹ That Joyce was forced to settle for obscure German grammars, not having written his own, is simply a reflection of his situation as far as access to books was concerned. Early in his stay in Trieste Joyce complained in a letter to Stannie:

I want an English Dictionary badly. I don't know how I could correct proofs at present.⁷²

Since refugees seldom travel with their libraries, the First World War certainly did nothing to mitigate this difficulty in Zurich. In Furnivall's edition of the *Chaste Wife*, Morris's *Specimens*, and Skeat's *Chaucer*, Joyce found extensive glossarial indices to partially satisfy this want, as is abundantly evident from his use of them in "Oxen of the Sun"

⁷¹The sixteenth edition of Locke's *Essay* (in two volumes) was printed in 1768, and at this time the work was more popular than it had ever been. Much of the discussion of the Scottish philosophers at this time centred on problems and errors in Locke's work, with Bacon standing before him, and in Berkeley's analysis of those problems. The work of Hume and Mill both descends directly from these interests.

⁷²Ellmann, *Selected Joyce Letters*, p. 126.

and "Proteus " particularly."⁷³ Skeat's Chaucer was an especially rich vein of vocabulary for Joyce. In the opening section of the "Oxen of the Sun" episode, composed in an imitative satire of Middle English prose, Joyce writes:

In ward wary the watcher hearing come that man mildhearted eft rising with swire ywimpled to him her gate wide undid. Lo, levin leaping lightens in eyeblink Ireland's westward welkin. Full she drad that God the Wrecker all mankind would fordo with water for his evil sins. Christ's rood made she on breast bone and him drew that he would rathe infare under her thatch. That man her will wotting worthful went in Horne's house.

Loth to irk in Horne's hall hat holding the seeker stood. On her stow he ere was living with dear wife and lovesome daughter that then over land and seafloor nine years had long outwandered. Once her in townhithe meeting he to her bow had not doffed. Her to forgive now he craved with good

⁷³Another text that was obviously important to the writing of "Oxen of the Sun" was P.W. Joyce's *Social History of Ancient Ireland*. P.W. Joyce is certainly among the Celtic historians alluded to by James Joyce in the following passage:

It is not why therefore we shall wonder if, as the best historians relate, among the Celts, who nothing that was not in its nature admirable admired, the art of medicine shall have been highly honoured. Not to speak of hostels, leperyards, sweating chambers, plaguegraves, their greatest doctors, the O'Shiels, the O'Hickeys, the O'Lees, have sedulously set down the divers methods by which the sick and the relapsed found again health whether the malady had been the trembling withering or loose boyconnell flux (*Ulysses*, pp.314-15).

Compare this to a passage from P.W. Joyce's chapter on "Medicine and Medical Doctors" in *A Smaller Social History of Ancient Ireland*:

From the earliest times reached by our records the kings and great Irish families had physicians attached to their households, whose office was, as in other professions, hereditary. The O'Callahans were physicians to the Mac Carthys of Desmond;...the O'Lees, to the O'Flahertys of Connaught; and the O'Hickeys, to the O'Briens of Thomond...[the] O'Shiels were physicians to the Macnamaras of Clare (pp. 266-7).

ground of her allowed that of him swiftseen face,
hers, so young then had looked. Light swift her
eyes kindled, bloom of blushes his word winning.⁷⁴

In this beautiful passage, and in the eight or nine fascinating paragraphs that follow, the Skeat glossarial index can be used nearly exclusively to explain the archaisms Joyce employs: *eft*, *swire*, *levin*, *welkin*, *drad*, *rathe*, *infare*, *loth*, *swart*, *adread*, *grameful*, *algate*, *housel*, *unneth*, *nighed*, *misericord*, *yclept*, *avis*, *repreved*, and *swinking* are just a few of the words Joyce takes directly from Skeat. Probably in an effort to hide the extent of his wholesale appropriation of vocabulary from a single source, Joyce does alter the spellings of the words he has taken.⁷⁵ But his orthography is in complete accord with orthographic and phonological law; with Grimm's Law of Consonantal Transition (*Lautverschiebung*) and Verner's Law of Sound Shiftings as they are explained by Skeat in *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language* and in his *Principles of English Etymology* (first series), and with Richard Chenevix Trench's discussions of changes in orthography, in his *English Past and Present* which is cited by

⁷⁴*Ulysses*, 14.81-90.

⁷⁵In *James Joyce and the Making of Ulysses*, Frank Budgen outlines the content of the imitations in the "Oxen of the Sun" episode at some length but does not mention Chaucer (pp. 215-23). Budgen does, however, recount Joyce's reading aloud of the "Prologue" to the *Canterbury Tales* during this period and also speaks of Joyce's admiration for Chaucer, who was, said Joyce, "as precise and slick as a Frenchman" (p. 181).

Skeat.⁷⁶ As Skeat puts it:

Instead of giving Grimm's law in the usual form, I have adopted Fick's modification of it, as being much simpler...As far as *English* philology is concerned, the 'German' forms are comparatively small consequence; and, by not attempting to account for them exactly, we are usually able, with sufficient accuracy, to bring the various spellings of a word under one 'Teutonic' form...Let the student learn by heart (it is easy enough) the following scheme.

Gutturals; viz. g, k, gh, g.

Dentals; viz. d, t, dh, d.

Labials; viz. b, p, bh, b.⁷⁷

and,

§126. Verner's Law. Notwithstanding all exceptions, some of which are real and some apparent, the Teutonic-sound-shiftings exhibit, on the whole, a surprising regularity; and every

⁷⁶For a fascinating discussion of orthographical changes in the English Language see "Lecture V" of Richard Chenevix Trench's *English, Past and Present* (London: Parker, Son, and Bourn, West Strand, 1862), fifth edition revised, pp. 217-261. In this lecture Chenevix Trench writes:

Take for instance the word 'sudden;' which does not seem to promise any great scope for variety. I have myself met with this word spelt in the following fifteen ways among our early writers: 'sodain,' 'sodaine,' 'sodan,' 'sodayne,' 'sodden,' 'sodein,' 'sodeine,' 'soden,' 'sodeyn,' 'suddain,' 'suddaine,' 'suddein,' 'suddeine,' 'sudden,' 'sudeyn.' Again, in how many ways was Raleigh's name spelt, or Shakespeare's? The same is evident from the spelling of uneducated persons in our own day. They have no other rule but the sound to guide them. How is it that they do not all spell alike; erroneously, it may be, as having only the sound for their guide, but still falling into exactly the same errors? (p. 225 [emphasis added]).

It is the quality of this sameness that Joyce fully understands. His variation of the spellings of archaic words recognizes the limits that such variation could conceivably take.

⁷⁷W.W. Skeat, *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*, second edition revised and corrected, (London: Clarendon Press, 1884), p. 730.

anomaly deserves careful consideration, because we may possibly learn from it some useful lesson....⁷⁸

Joyce is aware of the details of this regularity. He also understood that Middle English words might be spelled in various ways, but not in any manner whatever. The variant spellings Joyce uses of the words taken from Skeat are entirely plausible, while at the same time they convey the appearance that he was using a number of Middle-English sources rather than a single glossary. Gifford seems to miss this in his annotations, and contents himself with pointing out that these words are Anglo-Saxon, Middle-English, or archaic.⁷⁹ The fact that Joyce is able to create perfectly plausible variant spellings of Midlands Middle-English dialect argues strongly for his possession of a philological knowledge of some sophistication.

An excellent illustration of the effects Joyce is able to achieve through the use of this knowledge can be seen in his use of the "agenbite of inwit" in a number of places in *Ulysses*. Joyce uses this spelling for a phrase taken from the title of Dan Michel of Northgate's *Ayenbite of Inwyt*, a work edited in a new edition by Richard Morris in 1866 and republished numerous times in the 1890s in the university-standard *Specimens of Early English Prose*, edited by Morris and Skeat.

⁷⁸W.W. Skeat, *Principles of English Etymology*, first series, the Native Element (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1887), p. 146.

⁷⁹*Ulysses Annotated*, pp. 410-11.

Joyce freshens the spelling of this archaism to clarify the meaning of the phrase simply by changing "y" as a consonant to "g" and "y" as a vowel to "i." This immediately reveals the still-contemporary resonance of the component words of the compound while maintaining the force of the original thought. Had Joyce settled for "remorse of conscience," it is unlikely that his effect would have been achieved, *remorse* being a poor substitute for the compound substantive *agenbite*, and *conscience* an even poorer evocation of the Saxon *inwit*. However, since there is no record of Joyce's having had access to a copy of Dan Michel's work during the composition of *Ulysses*, it will never be known for certain whether Joyce's revivification of the phrase was fully intentional or, rather, a happy misprision caused by an imperfectly remembered spelling. But in either case Joyce's familiarity with historical English orthographical convention is clear.

The small philosophical library owned by Joyce also points to a more extensive philological background than has been previously noted. In approaching any sort of provisional historiography of the comparative philology or of the Science of Language that had its first flourishing at the end of the eighteenth century, one must always keep in the foreground the fact that it was out of a series of philosophical insights that the new science was born. It was in Berkeley, Locke, Hume, and Adam Smith, and in the now less-often remembered Thomas Reid and Dugald Stewart, that discussions of language

in English turned from theology and Christian metaphysic towards empiricist and inductive approaches to the subject.⁸⁰

As will be discussed more fully below, the resulting paradigm shift in the study of language, one that made the Johnson dictionary obsolete, represents a profound altering of focus that may be viewed as the true birth of Modernism; at least insofar as a distinctive and primary characteristic of Modernism is hypersensitivity to the multi-valence and nuances of single words--as in a word for an image or in the ideogram or hieroglyph.⁸¹ Using the logical principle of *induction*, a word that more than any other isolates the governing principle of the Victorian sciences, *philologists* for the first time approach language without assuming the truth of biblical models by which all languages must be reduced philologically to Hebrew, or using the same basic model, to Phoenician,

⁸⁰Thomas Reid and Dugald Stewart were perhaps the most prominent moral philosophers of their successive generations, and in Germany and France as well as in Great Britain. Reid succeeded Adam Smith to the professorship of moral philosophy in the University of Glasgow, and Dugald Stewart was famous enough in the nineteenth century that it was enough to say of Viscount Palmerston's excellent education that he "attended the lectures of Dugald Stewart." Cf. *Chambers's Encyclopædia* (1902), v. vii., p. 725.

⁸¹Joyce's fascination with philology as an historical tool began very early. In his juvenile essay "The Study of Languages," dating from 1898 or 1899, Joyce wrote, "in the history of words there is much that indicates the history of men, and in comparing the speech of to-day with that of years ago, we have a useful illustration of the effect of external influences on the very words of a race," (*Critical Writings*, p. 28).

Illyrian, or Greek; a philological opinion that was as old as Herodotus, was revived by St. Isidore of Seville, and was held in a slightly altered form by the influential Charles Josias Bunsen as late as 1854.⁸² In the 1770s the study of etymology began to emerge from folk etymologies and the failings of unscientific analogy, and from labyrinthian searchings for a universal grammar, a meta-grammar that would prove the descent of all languages from the speech of the first parents in Eden and prove the existence of God in the inherent morality of primitive vocabulary. The method of the nascent industrial revolution--mechanistic hard-headedness--was turned toward the study of language in a way that

⁸²Bunsen's fascinating and learnedly perverse *Outlines of the Philosophy of Universal History* (London: Longman, Brown, Green, and Longman, 1854) competes with the most outrageous flights of the much earlier Monboddo's *Of the Origin and Progress of Language*. Undoubtedly an extremely well-read man, Bunsen attempted to fashion a Christian metaphysics out of an enormous catalogue of data garnered from philological and ethnological science. He based much of his work on tracing linguistic differences according to biblical genealogy and attempted to resolve the languages of the world into an ancient "Japhetic" tongue. Despite the absurdity of Bunsen's work in its broader outline--its governing theses worthy of a medieval hermeticist--its immense learning was recognized even by Max Müller (though, admittedly, early in his career). Bunsen was one of the earliest comparative philologists to take advantage of the then newly-acquired knowledge of human speech on a global level, and he compared the vocabulary of no less than ninety-seven different languages. His *Egypt* was similarly ambitious and no less occult. One aspect of Bunsen's work that remains very useful is his "Historical Research as to Language," published in the first of the two volumes of his *Outlines*. This section of his work gives an extensive survey of the history of the subject and is particularly useful in its discussion of eighteenth century philology and philosophy of language. His history is particularly interesting in juxtaposition with Hans Aarsleff's modern accounts of the subject.

completely revolutionized not only the study of philology but also of history. In its transitional figures--personages like James Harris, Monboddo, Condillac, Herder, Thomas Astle and Horne Tooke--this paradigm shift is particularly interesting.⁸³ In their work one does still find decidedly antique notions like universal grammar and philological theology. But one also finds a level of scholarship, and a comprehensive detail and refinement of cross reference of information in the study of language, that was new to European philological studies.

Whether Joyce knew the work of all of these figures will never be known for certain. What is clear is that even a relatively slight acquaintance with the philological literature of the turn of the twentieth century suffices to make familiar a number of names of persons whose work was widely known at the time. They were not so famous as to be

⁸³Thomas Astle's *The Origin and Progress of Writing* (London: T. Bensley, Bolt Court, 1803) is exceptional in the scope of its collation of materials. It follows in great detail the development of writing from hieroglyphics, including American examples, through Classical and medieval writing, to modern orthography showing examples in encyclopedic detail. But Astle also seriously debates the position that Moses invented writing and solemnly declares, after an investigation of the problem running to four folio pages:

"If this art had been a new discovery in his time, he would probably have commemorated it, as well as the other inventions of music, &c.; nor is there any reason to suppose, that God was the immediate revealer of the art; for Moses could never have omitted to have recorded the history of so important a circumstance, as the memory of it would have been one of the strongest barriers against idolatry," (pp. 14-15).

easily collected in Italian Trieste, but their work was to be found in any decent university or public library in the British Islands in 1904. Working backwards from that date, Max Müller's *Last Essays*, and Henry Sweet's *The History of Language* and *A New English Grammar*, published in 1901 and 1900 respectively, are the first texts of note that Joyce is likely to have seen. Following the authorities cited in these works, and tracing a path of citations back from this point, the frequency of mention of certain names and texts reflects a clear picture of the science as it stood in Victorian, Williamite, and Georgian England. It may be of use to briefly outline the basic figures and texts that appear when one surveys this territory of discourse.

One might first be led to the revised and augmented fifth edition of John Earle's *The Philology of the English Tongue*, published in 1892.⁸⁴ This work was a standard introduction to the subject and may have been an alternate source for Joyce's understanding of orthographical laws. A highly readable text, it incorporates the advances made in the field in the late 1880s, particularly those made by Skeat in his etymological dictionaries. One important element of Skeat's unabridged dictionary that Joyce had obviously read was its "Canons for Etymology," the first of which was: "Before attempting an Etymology, ascertain the earliest form and use

⁸⁴For a somewhat fuller description of the development of comparative philological science, see the chronology appended to the end of this discussion.

of the word; and observe chronology."⁸⁵ These "canons" were followed by Earle and remained the rule of etymological enquiry for many years, C.T. Onions deferring to Skeat's method in the still-standard *Oxford Dictionary of English Etymology*.

Worthy of note is the fact that even at that late date in the history of the science (1892), the early work of James Harris, Monboddo, and Horne Tooke had yet to be submerged or forgotten. In his *Philology of the English Tongue*, Earle quotes a once-famous encomium of Harris from Monboddo's *Origin and Progress of Language*:

The truly philosophical language of my worthy and learned friend Mr. Harris, the author of *Hermes*, a work that will be read and admired as long as there is any taste for philosophy and fine writing in Britain.⁸⁶

Earle also follows the reasoning of Horne Tooke's *Diversions of Purley* in his discussion of "syntax by symbolic words" and of "explicit verbs,"⁸⁷ and playfully revives a controversy once heated in quoting from the *Diversions* in an example:

There will be no end of such fantastical writers as this Mr. Harris, who takes fustian for philosophy.-
-*Diversions of Purley*, Part.II ch. vi.⁸⁸

Horne Tooke wrote his *Diversions* largely as a response to the

⁸⁵Skeat, *An Etymological Dictionary*, pp. xxiii-iv.

⁸⁶John Earle, *The Philology of the English Tongue*, fifth edition (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1892), p. 417.

⁸⁷Earle, pp. 561-4.

⁸⁸Earle, p. 481.

kind of *linguistique* practised by Harris and Monboddo. His own work would eventually draw the same kind of criticism that he offered Harris's *Hermes*.⁸⁹ And despite his own extensive and long-lasting--some later etymologists would say baneful--popularity, and in spite of his attacks on Harris and Monboddo, both Horne Tooke and the Georgian philologers would maintain their authority well into the later part of the Victorian era. In Joyce's time these were still the texts that one would discover quickly even in a fairly superficial perusal of the subject. Monboddo's popularity was such, for instance, that as late as 1848 the Religious Tract society would capitalize on the still-considerable contemporary authority of his *Of the Origin and Progress of Language*, first published 1773, by publishing their own study of *linguistique* anonymously under the misleading title *The Origin and Progress of Language*. Doubtless, this was done with the hope that neophytes, mistaking the work for Monboddo's authoritative though less Presbyterian text, might be led to understand on

⁸⁹The importance of *The Diversions of Purley* to nineteenth-century intellectual history is difficult to overestimate. Some sixty-five years after Horne Tooke's publication of the first part of the work the eminent Richard Chenevix Trench could still write: "Whatever may be Horne Tooke's shortcomings (and they are great), whether in details of etymology, or in the philosophy of grammar, or in matters more serious still, yet, with all this what an epoch in many a student's intellectual life has been his first acquaintance with *The Diversions of Purley*," (*On the Study of Words*, p. vii). Some of the radical Horne Tooke's hostility towards Harris may have been political rather than intellectual in its source, the conservative Harris having been at the political pole diametrically opposed to Horne Tooke, who was tried for treason in 1794.

his authority that language was ultimately "the last seal of dignity impressed by Deity upon his most favoured earthly creature."⁹⁰ Works of this kind were easily accessible to Joyce at the National Library where he spent a great deal of time as a student between 1898 and 1903. And Joyce's early essay, "The Study of Languages," shows that his interest in grammatical and philological matters was keen and relatively informed even at that early stage of his career.

Between 1903 and 1879, the leading figures in English philology were undoubtedly Sweet, Skeat, Earle, Chenevix Trench (who died in 1886), the Americans George Perkins Marsh (d. 1881) T.R. Lounsbury, and O.F. Emerson, A.H. Sayce, A.J. Ellis, Richard Morris and Frederick Furnivall. Milestones in the field include the above-mentioned *Principles of English Etymology* by Skeat, *Lectures on the English Language* by G.P. Marsh, and Sweet's *History of English Sounds*, his *New English Grammar*, and his dictionaries of Anglo-Saxon. In the closely related field of comparative philology A.H. Sayce's *Principles*

⁹⁰Anonymous, *The Origin and Progress of Language* (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1848), p. 10. This work, like most of those published by the society, reflected the high standard of scholarship of its time despite its fundamentalist theological stance. Though militantly Protestant, this account of language is philologically informed, taking full advantage of the advances made by 1845 in Sanscrit and Persian studies and using comparative vocabulary and (the then) modern etymological studies to support its contentions. On the other hand, a literal acceptance of the longevities of human existence asserted in the Genesis account, an historical frame separated into post and antediluvian times, and a serious contemplation of the assumed fact of the industrious, though disastrous, construction project at Babel made for a philology of limited worldly usefulness.

of *Comparative Philology* (1874), dedicated to Max Müller, was an important introductory text although it failed ultimately in its attempt to introduce "Glottology" as a less unwieldy term for the Science of Language.⁹¹ Max Müller remained a philological avatar throughout this period, and an extremely productive one, from the time of his student days with the

⁹¹There was a great deal of discussion among philologists as to what a proper name for their science might be. Most hoped it would be an exact single term like chemistry or biology. Max Müller insisted on the phrase "the science of language" to the end of his career. The famous ninth or "scholars' edition" of the *Encyclopædia Britannica*, a major source of information for Joyce particularly notable in the "Ithica" section of *Ulysses*, begins its "philology" entry with a discussion of the controversy. Gifford inexplicably denigrates this edition of *Britannica*, inaccurately describing it as "middlebrow." In fact, the first rank of European and American intellectual life contributed articles of a very high order, and placed this edition of the encyclopædia among the highest examples of collective scholarly accomplishment in history; alongside Chamber's *Cyclopædia*, Diderot's *Encyclopédie*, Brockhaus' *Konversations Lexicon*, Ersch and Gruber's *Allgemeine Encyclopädie der Wissenschaften und Künste*, the Grimms' *Deutsches Wörterbuch*, and the *Oxford English Dictionary* by Furnivall et.al. In his *J.G. Frazer* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), Robert Ackerman says of *Britannica*'s ninth edition that it "has generally been seen as the high-water mark of Victorian rationalism" (p. 71). What Gifford apparently misunderstands is the office of the Victorian compendium. They were not primarily intended for introductory materials for students, particularly not for very young students. They were used as reference works for scholars who needed comprehensive information, descriptive and bibliographical, and who might use a work like *Chambers's Encyclopædia* or *Britannica* to answer questions of some complexity. For instance, the ninth *Britannica*'s article on "infinitesimal calculus" runs to sixty-eight double-columned pages of tiny print. Many articles are extensive enough to have their own indices. The "Ireland" article, which runs to fifty-eight pages, has statistics on livestock, landownership, exports, shipping, income, population, illnesses, mortality rates, crime, education, and religion, and a relatively even-handed and detailed history covering the period between neolithic and Victorian times.

enormously important Bunsen and Franz Bopp in the 1840s until his death in 1900. So productive, in fact, that it is difficult to risk any surmise as to which of his later works Joyce might have seen.⁹² It is likely that Joyce's knowledge of Kant was at least partially owed to Max Müller whose translation of the *Critique of Pure Reason* was the standard one, but the existence of Dubliner J.P. Mahaffy's translation of *The Prolegomena to any Future Metaphysic* makes this uncertain.⁹³ What is certain is that Max Müller did "more than the labours of any other single scholar to awaken in England a taste for the science of language in its modern sense," as a contemporary source has it.⁹⁴ It is indeed quite probable that Joyce would have at least perused the influential *Science of Thought* in which Max Müller traces the

⁹²During this period the astonishing Friedrich Max Müller published: *The Science of Religion* in 1870, a six volume translation of the Rig Veda in 1874, the four volume *Chips from a German Workshop* in 1875, *The Origin and Growth of Religion* in 1878, *Selected Essays* and a translation of Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason* in 1881, *Biographical Essays* in 1883, the multi-volume *Sacred Books of the East* between 1883 and 1888, *The Science of Thought* in 1887, and *Natural Religion, Physical Religion, Anthropological Religion, and Psychical Religion* between 1888 and 1892. He also wrote a series of Sanskrit grammars, *Biographies of Words*, and *Home of the Aryas*, the last an anthropological study of the probable living conditions of the early Indo-European peoples as these conditions are reflected in the primitive roots of the Indo-European languages. Skeat relied on the eighth edition of Max Müller's two volume *Lectures On the Science of Language* (1875) in compiling his dictionary.

⁹³J.P. Mahaffy and J.H. Bernard, *Kant's Critical Philosophy*, second edition (London: Macmillan and Co., 1889).

⁹⁴*Chambers's Encyclopædia*, vol. vii (Edinburgh: William and Robert Chambers Ltd., 1902), p. 100.

philosophical advances that led to the early development of inductive philology and then outlines the history of Sanskrit studies as both rise out of the habits of mind fostered by Lockean and Berkeleyan philosophy.⁹⁵ And even more certainly Joyce would have seen Max Müller's extremely popular two volume *Lectures on the Science of Language*. These lectures, delivered in the Spring semesters of 1861 and 1863 at the Royal Institution of Great Britain, were attended by the elite of English philological science. It has already been mentioned that Joyce's use of "words of the marketplace" is likely inspired by Max Müller's "language of commerce" and that modern historians of the subject, particularly Poliakov and Hugh MacDougall, generally vilify Max Müller as a crypto-racist. For instance, Poliakov accuses him of confounding philology and ethnology and describes Max Müller's explicit attack on such a position at the University of Strasburg in 1872 as a "timid retraction" of a long-held position:

What Müller failed to make clear was that, for the last quarter of a century, he himself had been taking this degree of licence in a systematic manner and had sown confusion among his Anglo-Saxon and continental readers who had followed him with enthusiasm. Needless to say his timid retraction

⁹⁵That Joyce was indeed interested in this line of philosophical investigation is reflected in the Ellmann-Gillespie catalogue. Joyce's library contained copies of Berkeley, Hume, and Adam Smith, the Berkeley selections in the Alexander Campbell Fraser edition in which Berkeley's connection to Hume and Locke, and to Thomas Reid and the Scots Common Sense philosophers is fully emphasized. See Fraser's *Selections from Berkeley* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1884), pp. vii-xlviii. See below.

passed almost unheeded.⁹⁶

In fact, Max Müller's Strasburg address simply reiterates the his own position on the matter as it had stood from at least the time of his first series of lectures on the science of language at Oxford in 1860. Aside from his use of the term Aryan to describe the Indo-European "family of languages," It is difficult to find a single passage in Max Müller's writings that is not remarkably enlightened for his time. For instance, the following comments from the 1860 lectures, no doubt inspired by the events then transpiring in the United States, are typical:

In modern times the science of language has been called in to settle some of the most perplexing political and social questions. "Nations and languages against dynasties and treaties," this is what has remodelled, and will remodel still more, the map of Europe ; and in America comparative philologists have been encouraged to prove the impossibility of a common origin of languages and races, in order to justify, by scientific arguments, the unhallowed theory of slavery. Never do I remember to have seen science more degraded than on the title-page of an American publication in which, among the profiles of the different races of man, the profile of the ape was made to look more human than that of the negro.⁹⁷

This is not to say that bigotry is not distressingly commonplace in the philological writings of the time. The term "savages" crops up frequently, and hierarchies of tongues are commonplace. But enlightened opinion among Victorian

⁹⁶Leon Poliakov, *The Aryan Myth* (New York: Basic Books, 1974), pp. 213-14.

⁹⁷Max Müller, *Lecture on the Science of Language*, first series, p. 22.

philologists is also hearteningly frequent. For example, as early as 1885 Max Müller had already written an essay in which he brought into question the existence of such a thing as a "savage," and aligns himself with what we might now call revisionist or alternative history:

Of course the Spaniards called the inhabitants of America savages, though it is now quite generally conceded that the Spanish conquerors supplanted a higher civilization than they established.⁹⁸

Max Müller's catholicity is again apparent in remarks he makes about the quality of Darwin's ethnological linguistics in his important, though now seldom read, *The Science of Thought*:

If therefore Darwin and other ethnologists tell us that there are savages who have not a single abstract term in their language, they ought first of all give us the names of the savages to whose languages they refer, and secondly they ought to explain how these savages could possibly have formed the simplest names, such as father, mother, brother, sister, hand and foot, etc., without previously possessing abstract concepts from which such names could be derived.⁹⁹

The problem of the possible racism of the Victorian philologists is not so remote from discussions of *Ulysses* as one might initially be inclined to conclude. Race is a central question in *Ulysses*, the Irish epic with its Jewish Odysseus with his Republican sympathies. Many of Joyce's own conclusions about nationhood and race appear to have been

⁹⁸F. Max Müller, "The Savage," reprinted in *Collected Works XVII, Last Essays* (London: Longmans, Green, & Co., 1901), p. 143.

⁹⁹F. Max Müller, *The Science of Thought* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1887), p. 437.

highly refined and greatly influenced by his reading in philology.¹⁰⁰ Joyce's attitudes about the subject are more sophisticated than those of most of his Irish contemporaries precisely because of considerations stimulated by comparative philology and its study of cultures distant from the Hiberno-Celtic and the Anglo-Saxon. That contemporary readers of these texts might be uncomfortable with the *Europocentrism* of some of the writings of that science has no bearing on their historical importance. A passage from Stanislaus Joyce's *Dublin Diary*, dated 13 August 1904, is illuminating about his brother's attitude towards science in general:

The golden mean is as abhorrent to me as to Jim. It will be obvious that whatever method there is in Jim's life is highly unscientific, yet in theory he approves only of the scientific method...I call it

¹⁰⁰It was a typical in the earlier part of the nineteenth century to draw ethnological conclusions from philological data. But by the 1870's reputable scholars can be neatly divided from cranks by whether they use *linguistic cultures* to speak of races, this advance in the science largely due to constant reassertions by Max Müller of the fallacy inherent in such an approach. His student A.H. Sayce in his *Principles of Comparative Philology* makes the point very strongly:

Even the term "family" itself calls up erroneous ideas. The days are passed indeed when philological and ethnological unity were imagined to be identical, but we still picture to ourselves a "family of languages" like a family in social life, except that it springs not from two ancestors, but from one. Such pictures, however, are but the convenient symbols of working science, and if pressed to literally, lead to conclusions the reverse of the truth. Simplicity and unification are the latest result of time, and instead of forcing all the known dialects of the world under a few neatly-labelled classes or "families," we should rather wonder that more waifs and strays have not come down to us out of the infinite essays of early speech (p. xiii).

a lack of vigilant reticence in him that he is ever-ready to admit the legitimacy of the scientist's raids outside his frontiers. The word 'scientific' is always a word of praise in his mouth.¹⁰¹

It is clear that Joyce does not share the late-Romantic hostility to modern science that can be seen in Yeats and Russell, in most of the poets of the Irish Renaissance and in the so-called Decadents of the *Yellow Book* period, Arthur Symons, Lionel Johnson, Ernest Dowson, and the like. In this, as in a number of other respects, Joyce is aligned with George Bernard Shaw, another Irish writer who avoided having the "peal smoke" go "to his head," and left Ireland for a more congenial intellectual atmosphere.¹⁰² This attitude towards science, and a belief in the "advantage of scientific inventions," also surfaces Bloom's ruminations about possible technological improvements, to Glasnevin cemetery for instance, and in "Ithaca" in which science is the art which informs the episode according to the Linati schema.¹⁰³

¹⁰¹Stanislaus Joyce, *The Dublin Diary*, ed. G.H. Healy (London: Faber and Faber, 1962), p. 49.

¹⁰²*Ulysses*, p. 153.

¹⁰³That "Ithica" takes the form of a question and answer dialogue is quite logical. Notwithstanding the Linati schema's description of the technique of the episode as "catechism," the technique also resembles any number of scientific primers written in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in which the form served as a mnemonic aid. The primary example, Richmal Mangnall's *Historical and Miscellaneous Questions* (first edition, 1800; eighty-fourth edition, 1848), was a standard school primer and is mentioned in the first chapter of *A Portrait* (p. 53). Another work which used the device was J.L. Blake's *Conversations on Natural* (continued...)

A number of other scientists and texts from the latter half of the nineteenth century can also be mentioned in this context, if only for their proximity to Joyce. In the *Dublin Diary* passage just quoted there is in the same paragraph a reference to Herbert Spencer. Spencer was a British philosopher and anthropologist who based his system "on the facts and theoretical views of modern science."¹⁰⁴ He was a close friend of George Eliot and G.H. Lewes, and was to anthropology and sociology what Max Müller had been to Comparative Philology. The influence of Spencer's *The Principles of Psychology* (1855) and his *Principles of Sociology* (1897) extended to William James, J.G. Frazer, and even to Darwin who used Spencer's *Principles of Biology* in

¹⁰³ (...continued)

Philosophy in Which the Elements of that Science are Familiarly Explained (Boston: Lincoln and Edmands, 1831). Andrew Jackson Davis also uses it in *The Penetralia: Being Harmonial Answers to Important Questions* (Boston: William White & Company, 1868). Other examples are common, particularly in texts intended for use in teaching Natural Philosophy or Science. It is, however, true that the approach of the *Catechism Ordered by the National Synod of Maynooth and approved by the Cardinal, the Archbishop and the Bishops of Ireland for General Use Throughout the Irish Church* (Dublin: M.H. Gill & Son, 1884) is very similar to the technique of "Ithaca." But the same approach is also taken in *A System of English Ecclesiastical Law* (third ed., London: E. and R. Nutt, 1735), a primer for Anglican students published throughout the nineteenth century.

¹⁰⁴Charles Morris, *Encyclopædia Britannica*, ninth ed., "American Supplement" (New York: Henry G. Allen & Co., 1898), pp. 554-55.

writing *The Descent of Man*.¹⁰⁵ With the typical eclectic comprehensiveness of the Victorian scientist, Spencer also wrote treatises on engineering, politics and government, fashion, aesthetics, evolution, and zoology. His philosophy divided phenomena into two classes, the *Unknowable* and the *Knowable*, and by the turn of the century he had a large following who bowed to his authority on both. Bloom's scientific interests and curiosities in *Ulysses*, although less technically learned, share the scope of Spencer's interests, a scope that can also be seen in the work of people like Draper and, earlier, William Whewell, Bunsen, and von Humboldt.

To return to the science of Comparative Philology, particularly interesting in looking at connections between philology and Irish subjects is the already mentioned Ulick J. Bourke's *The Aryan Origin of the Gaelic Race and Language*.¹⁰⁶ Although Joyce may have found this book useful for the lore it contains, the work represents nearly the worst sort of Victorian philology, propping up with generally unsound scholarship linguistic and racial theories of the flimsiest

¹⁰⁵For a discussion of Spencer's influence on the latter see Robert Ackerman's excellent study *J.G. Frazer: His Life and Work*, pp. 40-44 and *passim*. Ackerman's work is also an interesting introduction to the *milieu* of Victorian scientific rationalism and gives a good deal of information about a number of forgotten academicians whose works Joyce may have seen.

¹⁰⁶Ulick J. Bourke, M.R.I.A., *The Aryan Origin of the Gaelic Race and Language* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1876).

kind. Bourke's most obvious error is one that a closer reading of Max Müller, whom he extensively cites, would have prevented. Bourke believed that the findings of philological science might be transferred without comment to ethnological science.¹⁰⁷ Invoking a virtual cyclopedia of authorities in contexts that must have left them aghast, Bourke proceeded to make what is finally a sincere, if flawed, argument in favour of the preservation of the Irish language and against the many abuses suffered by the speakers of that language. Despite its failures, Bourke's book offers a revealing portrait of the prevailing educated Irish Catholic view of philological and ethnological matters during the latter part of the nineteenth century. It is also valuable for the prospect it offers of the importance of comparative philology for students of history in the late nineteenth century:

Comparative philology is a pillar tower of light on the highway of ancient history. It is like photography: nay, it is a stereoscope of past and forgotten events. Under its view the hidden periods of the past are flung out in the fulness of their reality, and in the light which clothed their forms in the days of their actual existence.¹⁰⁸

Needless to say, Max Müller is a central philological authority for Bourke.

Probably owing to his affiliation with the alien church, Bourke's near-contemporary, and countryman if not compatriot,

¹⁰⁷Ulick J. Bourke, *The Aryan Origin of the Gaelic Race and Language* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1876), p. 121.

¹⁰⁸Bourke, *Aryan Origins*, p. 175.

Archbishop Chenevix Trench of Dublin is studiously ignored by the Canon of Tuam Cathedral. Trench's own comments about Roman Catholics and Catholicism are certainly enough on the hither side of enlightenment to warrant Bourke's maintenance of distance. As had the most prominent American philologist George Perkins Marsh, Trench had written a book on the miracles of the church. Although not so virulent as Marsh's anonymous anti-papist diatribe,¹⁰⁹ Trench certainly appears to have developed little sympathy for the religion of the majority of his neighbours.

In the context of *Ulysses* this is an important point. One misses a whole aspect of the treatment of the "ponderous Saxon" Haines if the question of his identity is left at his being modelled on Samuel (Dermot) Chenevix Trench.¹¹⁰ The Irish-language enthusiast is not only an Oxford-educated

¹⁰⁹Marsh was a true Victorian Renaissance man though not without the flaws of his time. A philologist, a naturalist, an ecologist, and a diplomat, his *Mediæval and Modern Saints and Miracles* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1876), "Not *Ab Uno E Societate Jesu*," begins:

Many American Protestants are inclined to look with favour, or at least with indulgence, on the pretensions of Catholicism; and not a few have been persuaded to exchange the Scriptural faith and the simple ritual of their fathers for the traditions, the dogmas, and the gaudy material worship of the Romish Church.

The work goes on to debunk the hagiology of that Church, to decry Mariolatry, and to reveal the "ecclesiastical forgeries" by which Christians have been led from the true path. In general, the work is mean-spirited and reflects a more small-minded intelligence than does any of Marsh's philological work which was of the first rank in the 1860s.

¹¹⁰Ellmann, *James Joyce*, pp. 172-73.

Briton, but the son of the Archbishop of Dublin, a very eminent English philologist and poet.¹¹¹ Samuel's father did not make "his tin by selling jalap to Zulus or some bloody swindle or other,"¹¹² but by selling the services of the English Episcopal church in the Land of Ita, Bridget, Columba, and Patrick. And although an agent of the *sassenach* oppressor, he was also born in Dublin. But he was a Dubliner with an elder brother who held a important position in the British military in India.

This information enriches the incident of the Panther in the Martello tower immensely. Like Stephen's, Haines's psychology is profoundly affected by the question of paternity. With the knowledge of the biographical Haines's father, knowledge that most readers in Dublin would have had when the work was written, the dream of the panther, Haines's passion for Gaelic studies, and his change of name becomes far more resonant. In the following chapter, these resonances will be more closely attended. And aside from outlining some of the illuminations offered by such information, an attempt will also be made to ascertain some of the concrete technical

¹¹¹Ulick O'Connor, *Oliver St. John Gogarty*, p. 70.

¹¹²*Ulysses*, 1:157. The elder Trench's fame as a philologist was very widespread and his works went through numerous editions even after the First World War. As a poet, Trench is described by contemporary Richard Garnett as "the most gifted of the immediate disciples of Wordsworth (*E. Brit. [9th] XXIII*, pp. 540-1)," but Saintsbury gives him only a cursory notice in his history. Trench was in the center of the controversy that raged in the 1860s over the relationship of the English and Irish Episcopal churches.

and thematic effects had on the text of *Ulysses* by the interests discussed above.

Chapter Three:
Historians, Geographers, and Ethnologists

The policy of Constantine the Great inevitably tended to the paganization of Christianity. An incorporation of its pure doctrines with decaying pagan ideas was the necessary consequence of the control that had been attained by unscrupulous politicians and placemen. The faith, thus contaminated, gained a more general and ready popular acceptance, but at the cost of a new lease of life to those ideas. So thorough was the adulteration, that it was not until the Reformation, a period of more than a thousand years, that a separation of the true from the false could be accomplished.¹¹³

In the general character of the Irish, many traits are completely national, and are common to all ranks. To say that they are brave, lavish in hospitality, warmhearted, sensible, eloquent, witty, possessing an uncommon cheerfulness of disposition, and a people with whom it would be desirable to reside, would be paying them no compliment. They have all these qualities, and some of them in an eminent degree ; but the impartial observer must describe them as loquacious, and extravagantly prodigal, though often parsimonious. In whatever they undertake, there is no moderation ; all is in extremes ; their vanity predominates, and like the French, they entertain a high idea of themselves, and of the advantages of their country. Hence, their appetite for praise is unbounded, and censure always mortifies their pride, and irritates their feelings. They are irascible, easily offended, violent and impetuous in their resentments. In gaiety, they enjoy the present moment without any care for the future; and from the same thoughtless habit, readily embark in extravagant schemes. From these causes they are unsteady in their conduct,

¹¹³J.W. Draper, *The Intellectual Development of Europe*, Chapter Ten, "The European Age of Faith," p. 308.

often grasping at objects, which when attained afford not the expected gratification, and are, therefore, abandoned almost as soon as tried.¹¹⁴

In the first chapter it was suggested that Joyce's estrangement from *fin de siècle* literary Ireland was at least partly caused by the thoroughness of his study of European intellectual culture. With the intensity of purpose that marked his entire life, this extraordinary personage, by nature an auto-didact, set out to immerse himself in the intellectual history of the West and in the politics of academic discourse as they stood in the period falling roughly between Gladstone's Irish University Bill (1873) and the birth of Samuel Beckett (1906). As Ellmann puts it:

He set himself to master languages and literatures, and read so widely that it is hard to say definitely of any important creative work published in the late nineteenth century that Joyce had not read it.¹¹⁵

An errant *mick on the make*, but one "touched with that queer

¹¹⁴Rev. J. Goldsmith, *A Geographical View of the World, Embracing the Manners, Customs and Pursuits of Every Nation*, eighth American edition (New York: Pratt, Woodford & Co., 1849) pp. 181-82. Goldsmith's works, particularly his *Grammar of Geography* and *Grammar of British Geography*, were standard reference works long after his death. New editions of the *Geographical View*, first published in 1826, appeared throughout the first half of the nineteenth century, and went through innumerable printings. In fact, Goldsmith's approach is an early example of attempts at "universal" studies of history, geography, and natural science. As the nineteenth century progressed, the theoretical overview of universal grammarians and historians would become more and more grandiose, culminating in Draper's *Intellectual Development of Europe*, Von Humboldt's *Cosmos*, and C.C.J. Bunsen's *Outlines of the Philosophy of Universal History*.

¹¹⁵Ellmann, *James Joyce*, p. 75.

thing genius," it would be equally hard to say definitely of any important *intellectual* work that Joyce had not read it.¹¹⁶

The first text quoted at the head of this chapter, written by the venerable J.W. Draper in his old age, is typical of what the young Catholic, with "[p]riests...included in the broad charter of [his] vituperation,"¹¹⁷ would have encountered at every turn in his forays into the largely Episcopal district of the dialect of the *sassenach* intelligentsia. Here an eminence's gibe against the miracles of the Church, there an apology for their "quarrel...with Romanism, as another name for Jesuitism, which is not a religion, in any good sense of the word."¹¹⁸ It is a small tragedy that we are unlikely ever to know for certain whether Joyce handled copies of works such as Max Müller's *Science of Thought* or the university-standard Walker edition of (Dugald) Stewart's *Philosophy of the Active and Moral Powers of Man*. An account of his impressions of such books would surely enlighten us about his reaction to the work of parties who had no native contact with the wiser aspect of the Roman Catholic

¹¹⁶*Ulysses*, p. 158. For a discussion of the phenomenon of what Roy Foster calls "the mick on the make," of Irish ambition in the atmosphere here described, see *The Times Literary Supplement*, October 1, 1993, "The love-hate relationships of marginal Englishmen and micks on the make," pp. 3-6.

¹¹⁷Stanislaus Joyce, *My Brother's Keeper*, p. 192.

¹¹⁸Anonymous (G.P. Marsh), *Mediæval and Modern Saints and Miracles* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1876), p. 18.

Church, who were not renegades but Protestant heretics, but who also represented the elite rank of the intellectual culture of the English-speaking world. Such men (and women like Richmall Mangnall and George Eliot), filling the dominant roles in their intellectual culture, shared ethnic, national, and social prejudices at least as virulent as an Irish Catholic's own were likely to have been. But they also held the means to a scientific knowledge more quickly advancing than the world had yet seen; an unfettered knowledge freed for Darwinism, with Von Humboldt's view of the *Kosmos*, rich in data, and sentimentally attached to the Reformation, the Enlightenment, and to the Archbishopric of Canterbury.

It is easy to overlook the wide extent of the ingrained contempt fostered by educators in post-Napoleonic England for the Celtic, particularly the Catholic Celtic, subjects of the realm. Very often, it was a quiet prejudice. For instance, in Philip Smith's *A Smaller History of England*, a standard school text with the virtues as well as the vices of nineteenth century comprehensive histories, one finds this description of the society of Saxon England during the reign of Alfred:

These institutions were derived from those of the Old Germans. Their leading principle was that of personal liberty, regulated for the common good by a discipline chiefly military. The form of government was an elective monarchy, which was generally retained in one family, but not in strict lineal succession. The chieftain (*Heretoga*, i.e. army leader) became afterwards *king* (*Cyning*, probably son of the nation, from *cyn*, race, and *ing*, the patrynomic suffix), and his sons and

kindred were *nobles* (*athelings*, from *Aethel* or *Ethel*, i.e. noble). The rest of the people were divided into *earls* (*eorls*) and *churls* (*ceorls*), that is, *gentle* and *simple*. The *Ealdormen* (*aldermen*, i.e. *elder-men*) were originally the chief nobles, but afterwards persons of official rank, such as governors of shires. Next came the *thanes* (*theyn*, from *thegnian*, to serve), a kind of *knights*, whose rank depended on the possession of a certain estate, and who were liable to serve in war as cavalry. The *churls* (*ceorls*) were the rest of the freemen; and the *serfs* (*theowas*, or *esnas*) were slaves, chiefly of the conquered Celtic race.¹¹⁹

Of this passage a number of remarks, aside from a mention of its compression and thoroughness, might be made. This interpretation of tenth century feudal society rhetorically plays toward the Victorian assumption of that tradition of "liberty" said to be a primary love of the Anglo-Saxon people. But this *liberty* is enjoyed in the context of a strictly regimented caste system in which the aristocracy and gentry are treated with appropriate circumspection. There is in this passage no attempt at socio-historical interpretation of the place of the majority of the population in such a government. And the potential objection to the society's basis on a system of slavery is softened by pointing out that the slaves were "chiefly Celts." This subtlety creates a situation in which the British student, or reader, of any class, is left with the impression that the subjugated Celts were foreigners in any event, and that Celts as a race are prone to the state of serfdom or slavery. In other words, the socio-political

¹¹⁹Philip Smith, *A Smaller History of England, from the Earliest Times to the Year 1878*, ed. Wm. Smith, (London: John Murry, Albemarle Street, 1886), twenty-fifth edition, p. 19.

impact of Saxon feudalism is hidden behind anachronistic (Victorian) notions of race. Even the supposed etymology of Cyn (as "race" instead of the more etymologically obvious "kin" or tribe) underlines a belief that the late iron-age forbears of the British Empire were conscious of racial differences which are in fact purely the product of nineteenth century ethnological abstractions. Abstractions formed in part to bolster European imperialist models of social progress and political consolidation and expansion.

As an Irishman maturing in an extremely politicized atmosphere, Joyce could not but have reacted to the subtext of this order of subtle historical propaganda, as surely as he would have chuckled at the reductionist psychology of Goldsmith's sketch of the Irish as "irascible, easily offended, and violent and impetuous in their resentments."¹²⁰

¹²⁰It should also be recalled that by 1904 the Irish student would be well provided with texts with equivalent Celtic biases. At Joyce's old school, Belvedere College, one text that was used in 1904 to teach history to the fourth and fifth standards was the Christian Brothers' *Irish History Reader* (Dublin: M.H. Gill & Son, c.1903). Although admittedly an "extra reader," it still gained great circulation, no doubt owing to the fact that the *Fifth Book of Lessons for the Use of Schools* (Dublin: Commissioners of National Education of Ireland, 1846) fails to mention Ireland at all. Nor is a single Irish writer represented in its selection of literature. In the Christian Brothers' reader, Irish history is related from a point of view which is both Catholic and Nationalist, and the Young Ireland movement is well represented in its pages, giving illustrative fragments of verse and prose to enliven the basic text. The reader also includes a very interesting account of the National Education Board's approach to education after Catholic Emancipation:

The question of school books occupied the attention
of the board immediately after its formation

(continued...)

The biographical remains do, however, suggest that such a description might be somewhat appropriate to Joyce himself.¹²¹

¹²⁰(..continued)

[October, 1831]. A nation's school books wield a great power ; they find their way to the remotest districts, and to all classes of people ; they are read by the young and listened to by the old, and the sentiments they express take deep root. Dr. Whatley and the Rev. Mr. Carlisle well understood their power, and they set, at once, to the task of compiling books for the youth of Ireland. In all their books every allusion to the Catholic religion, and to every event of the past history of our land, was carefully avoided ; and their great aim seemed to be to efface from the minds of the Irish children all idea of their distinct nationality, and to make each imagine that he or she, in the words of one of Dr. Whatley's verses, was "a happy English child" (pp. 309-10).

Richard Whatley preceded Chenevix Trench as Archbishop of Dublin and also published interesting (and very well-known) works on rhetoric and logic that Joyce certainly would have known.

¹²¹Goldsmith's attitude towards the Irish was a very widely-held one even a hundred years after his death. For instance, in his *Natural History of Mankind* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1860) Stephen H. Ward wrote of the Celts that their "temperament is bilious, or of mixed bilious and nervous character," and that they:

possess great rapidity of thought, restlessness and activity of mind, much enthusiasm, a wonderful play of imagination, and not a little volatility: they are distinguished, in short, by brilliancy rather than solidity of mind. They are hasty, extremely sensitive to insult, possessed of much national pride, and deeply attached to historical antecedents (p. 33).

Dowden's interest in Robert Southey perhaps justifies also including an anecdote from a letter of Southey in which much the same stereotype is revealed:

An Irishman who was abroad came in one day and said that he had seen that morning what he had never seen before--a fine crop of anchovies growing in the garden. 'Anchovies?' said an Englishman, with a half laugh and a tone of wonder. And from this the other, according to the legitimate rules of Irish logic, deduced a quarrel, a challenge, and a

(continued...)

In studying late-Victorian British intellectual attitudes toward the Celtic population of Great Britain, one may also discover a dank corner of the Reverend Skeat's presentation of Chaucer and his England. For instance, Skeat's insistence on the paucity of Celtic remains in the tongue spoken in the realm of the Plantagenet kings, though in broad outline correct, is unnecessarily firm.¹²² Skeat's notes to Chaucer and Langland also tend to be more fastidious about the activities of the natural man and woman than a contemporary reader might desire. In a sense, Skeat, like many Victorian critics, tends to project a Protestant morality at Medieval and Renaissance Catholic writing. What Joyce adds to his own middle-English passages in *Ulysses* is a phonologically appropriate brogue that undermines the view of the history of English speech and literature that figures like Skeat, Draper, and Dowden would have implicitly embraced:

And not few and of these was young Lynch were in doubt that the world was now right evil governed as

¹²¹(...continued)

duel, in which the poor Englishman, who did not believe that anchovies grew in the garden, was killed on the spot. The moment he fell, the right word came into the challenger's head. 'Och! what a pity!' he cried, 'and I meant capers all the while!' (From *The Life and Correspondence of Robert Southey*, ed. C.C. Southey [New York: Harper & Brothers, 1851], p. 241).

Without entering into a discussion of the universal accuracy of such portraits, it might be allowed that many of Joyce's own Dubliners are painted in just such a fashion.

¹²²See Walter W. Skeat's *Principles of English Etymology, Second Series*, "The Foreign Element," pp. 241-43 (§168) and *passim*.

it was never other howbeit the mean people believed it otherwise but the law nor his judges did provide no remedy. A redress God grant. This was scant said but all cried with one acclaim nay, by our virgin Mother, the wife should live and the babe so die. In colour whereof they waxed hot upon that head what with argument and what for their drinking but the franklin Lenehan was prompt each when to pour them ale so that at the least way mirth might not lack. Then young Madden showed all the whole affair and said how that she was dead and h v for holy religion sake by rede of palmer and bedesman and for a vow he had made to Saint Ultan of Arbraccan her goodman husband would not let her death whereby they were all wondrous grieved.¹²³

Joyce claimed to have been imitating Malory's *Morte d'Arthur* in this passage, and in a letter to Frank Budgen dated 20 March 1920 he also lists Mandeville, Milton, Taylor, Hooker, Burton, Browne, Bunyan, Pepys, and Evelyn as other sources for the episode.¹²⁴ Joyce's choice of models reveals a clear understanding of English canonical conventions of the period. Joyce chose writers at the very core of the conservative British tradition formulated after the death of Johnson, writers valorized in the nineteenth century by such orthodox historians and critics of English literature as George Saintsbury, John and Henry Morley, and Matthew Arnold.

The use to which Joyce puts the styles he imitates is, however, intentionally subversive, irreverently imitating the manner and syntax of the English, and Christian, tradition with matter that is Irish and Catholic, or Irish and profane. One does not find a celebration of the bacchanal in (Robert)

¹²³*Ulysses*, ll. 14 212-15, pp. 318-19.

¹²⁴*Selected Letters*, pp. 251-52.

Burton or Browne. Later in "Oxen of the Sun," Joyce again uses Bloom's Jewishness to help combine these contraries. In a passage in which Joyce attempts a composite imitation or parody of Milton, Hooker, Browne, and Taylor, the language of Old Testament Hebraicism is conflated with the rhetoric of current republican mythologists:

And all the people shall say, Amen. Remember, Erin, thy generations and thy days of old, how thou settedst little by me and by my word and broughtedst in a stranger to my gates to commit fornication in my sight and to wax fat and kick like Jeshurum. Therefore hast thou sinned against my light and hast made me, thy lord, to be the slave of servants. Return, return, Clan Milly: forget me not, O Milesian.¹²⁵

P.W. Joyce, among a legion of others, informs us that the Milesians were among the five successive colonies (with the Parthalonians, Nemedians, Firbolgs, and Dedannans) that arrived in Ireland before the Christian Era.¹²⁶ The Hebraic tone, intended to raise yet again the question of Bloom's identity, is also the favoured tenor of Puritan forms of Protestantism, and sits well with the pseudo-Miltonian prose Joyce claimed to be imitating. Identifying Milly with the

¹²⁵*Ulysses*, 14.334-428. See Gifford's *Ulysses Annotated*, p. 417. Of "Oxen of the Sun," and in *Ulysses* elsewhere, it is too simplistic to claim that Joyce writes "parodies" of writing styles or "satires" of individuals or subjects. Very often, even in the Boschian "Circe," and especially in "Oxen of the Sun," Joyce instead affects a mask behind which he is able to speak perfectly seriously, if in a language that evades direct statement.

¹²⁶P.W. Joyce, *A Smaller Social History of Ancient Ireland*, p. 31. The opening passage of "Oxen of the Sun" ("Deshil Holles Eamus...") was also undoubtedly suggested to Joyce by this work of P.W. Joyce. See pp. 127-128).

ancient Milesians, Joyce also suggests that Bloom's *Irishness*, always challenged in a tribalized Dublin, is actually beyond question, his daughter doubly identified with Ireland as a Milesian and as "Erin." Milly's relationship to Molly is also obliquely referred to in the pun on Milly's name. As Thomas Moore's dreadful poem tells us about the Milesians:

They came from a land beyond the sea
And now o'er the western main,
Set sail in their good ships gallantly
From the sunny land of Spain.¹²⁷

Molly Bloom, born in Gibraltar, also comes from Spain in a sense. And perhaps the correspondences can be pressed further to include a Jewish context given that Spain's proverbial "golden age" is also intimately connected with Jewish history. Joyce's later mention of Spinoza, the *Sephardi*, might support this reading. This would also once again cunningly undo Irish racial mythology by giving both the Jews and the Irish a mutual historical connection to Spain.¹²⁸ Interestingly, and

¹²⁷Thomas Moore, "Coming of the Milesians," from the Christian Brothers' *The Irish History Reader*, p. 10.

¹²⁸It was a commonplace in English geography, natural history, and ethnology to firmly assert a Spanish genesis for the early Irish and to greatly exaggerate the ethnic impact of marooned Spanish sailors from the Armada on the Irish population. In enumerating the three races which combine to make the Irish population, J. Goldsmith speaks of the "Spanish found in Kerry, and a part of Limerick and Cork" (*A Geographical View of the World*, p. 131.). Neolithic Celts did come to Ireland from the Iberian peninsula, perhaps before the territory of Ireland had been cut off by the sea from the mainland. But, as the *Encyclopædia Britannica* tells us, "many hundreds of unfortunates (from the Armada) who were saved from the sea were slain by the Irish," (ninth ed., v.II, p. 544). What Goldsmith, and those of his school, really intend their
(continued...)

appropriately given that the scene is hard by a maternity ward, Joyce also maintains a Jewish resonance in speaking of "clan Milly." In Jewish law the lines of descent are matrilineal, a further means of undermining the fanatical race-pride and bigotry of a nationalist Irish type, one that based its claims on names and on what Joyce saw as a legal fiction of paternity. Bloom's fear of Stephen's revealing his name later in the cabman's shelter is also intended to reflect this atmosphere of zealotry. What this amounts to is that Joyce manages to confront Irish bigotry thematically while at the same time he maintains a satire of English bigotry, stylistically or structurally. "Eumaeus" does not, however, mimic Tudor prose models after the manner of "Oxen of the Sun." Instead it affects the style of the Victorian purveyors of a certain reading of those models such as a Thomas Hughes' notion of Chaucer as a jowly Saxon, or a Langland as an athletic Puritan cousined to Bunyan.¹²⁹

¹²⁸(...continued)

readers to understand is that much of the Irish people "is made up of mongrels," (*Geographical View*, p. 132). This widely-held point of view could only have intensified the racial pre-occupations of the Irish nationalists of the time.

¹²⁹Hughes' *Tom Brown's Schooldays*, first published in 1856, went through innumerable editions in the nineteenth century. A portrait of both the cruelties and the positive aspects of English public school life at Rugby, it had a great influence on national school policy despite its ultimately sentimental point of view. The book formed part of the basic library of schoolboys in Joyce's day, along with *Treasure Island*, *Robinson Crusoe*, *The Last of the Mohicans*, *Ivanhoe* and *The Count of Monte Cristo*; all, except for the last perhaps, devoted to didactic romance in pursuit of the Victorian virtues.

For Joyce, with an extensive familiarity with English natural scientific discourses and literatures, and acquainted with probably the most productive three generations of grammarians, etymologists, philologists, and rhetoricians in English history, richer understanding of the Middle English literature he imitated was possible. With a poetic facility more than the rank of perhaps every contemporary poet except Yeats and Pound, and with a familiarity with lexicography and *linguistique* advanced even for a student of the subject (if not for a specialist), Joyce was able to produce "Proteus," "Oxen of the Sun" and "Eumaeus." The parameters of the various discourses Joyce used were so closed comparatively, and the wider literature of the linguistic and other sciences so apparent because of cross citation, that Joyce would have been able to find the raw information for just about any machine that could be built with the material history of the English language and the tribal lore of the ethnologists and universal historians.

It should perhaps be said that any degree of exposure to British scholarly literature of the period of Joyce's apprenticeship makes it difficult to avoid developing an admiration for the learned Victorian apologists of Imperial Britain. Joyce himself displays many traces of an affection for aspects of English cultures of discourse, not particularly surprising given the coarseness of many of the productions of the Irish Nationalists, and the grandeur of Joyce's own aims.

It is possible to say that Joyce looked toward this literature with a practised and jaundiced eye. But the urbane geniality and masonic precision of the governing Victorian style at its best, notwithstanding its biases, could not help but affect Joyce's native allegiances. Joyce would always be an Irishman of an Ireland part of Greater Britain, the West Britain of "The Dead." The new Eire was never to be his country, a future he was never to visit.

The complex relationship of Joyce to British literary history and culture is richly illustrated in the "Oxen of the Sun" passage immediately following "forget me not, O Milesian." It is a passage in which Joyce again refers to the curious correspondence of Stephen and Haines, and, by extension, to Chenevix Trench senior:

Why hast thou done this abomination before me that thou didst spurn me for a merchant of Jalaps and didst deny me to the Roman and to the Indian of dark speech with whom thy daughters did lie luxuriously? Look forth now, my people, upon the land of behest, even from Horeb and from Nebo and from Pisgah and from the Horns of Hatten unto a land flowing with milk and money. But thou hast suckled me with a bitter milk: my moon and my sun thou hast quenched forever. And thou hast left me alone for ever in the dark ways of my bitterness: and with a kiss of ashes hast thou kissed my mouth.¹³⁰

The mention of "Pisgah" in the same paragraph as the "merchant of Jalaps" is a perfect example of the nearly bewildering complexity of Joyce's text. Pisgah is a peak in Palestine on the northern extremity of the Dead Sea. But is also part of

¹³⁰*Ulysses*, p. 322.

the title of Fuller's *A Pisgah Sight of Palestine*, a work known more for its having been extensively used by nineteenth century English philologists than for its own literary merit.¹³¹ One philologist who often used the work as a source of examples was Richard Chenevix Trench, the "merchant of jalaps" himself. In Trench's *Select Glossary*, Fuller is quoted throughout the work. One quotation of the work by Trench bears repeating if only for its similarity to Victorian descriptions of the Irishry:

The people [of Ephraim] thereof were active, valiant, ambitious of honour; but withal, *humourous*, hard to be pleased; forward enough to fight with their foes, and too forward to fall out with their friends.¹³²

Fuller is, of course, also one of the authors Joyce imitates in the passage just quoted from "Oxen of the Sun."

There is much in the elder Trench's work that seems also to have interested Joyce. One fascinating possibility is that Joyce had read the following allusion from Trench's *Study of Words* when he was composing the Haines section of *Telemachus*: "or with Pliny, [deduce] 'panthera'...because the properties

¹³¹In his *A Short History of English Literature* (London: Macmillan and Co., 1898) Saintsbury writes of Fuller, "The range of Burton and the depth of Browne are both denied to Fuller; his temper is a very little childish in the bad sense as well as childlike in the good" (p. 443). Fuller was, however, very highly regarded by Coleridge, Southey, and Lamb. Joyce mentions *A Pisgah Sight of Palestine* three times in *Ulysses*, two of these references attributed to Stephen in "Aeolus" and "Ithica" who uses the title as another name for the "Parable of the Plums" (*Ulysses*, pp. 122 and 561).

¹³²R. Chenevix Trench, *Select Glossary*, second edition (London: John W. Parker and Son, 1859), p. 107.

of all beasts meet in the panther."¹³³ As Gifford and many others have pointed out, Panther, or Pantherus, is the name Celsus gave to the Roman centurion who he claimed had actually fathered Jesus. If in having Haines (Chenevix Trench the younger) dream of shooting the Panther, Joyce also had in mind the note on "panthera" of the elder Chenevix Trench, the Protestant Archbishop of Dublin, the ironies become exceedingly rich:

--He was raving all night about a black panther, Stephen said. Where is his guncase?
 --A woful lunatic! Mulligan said. Were you in a funk.
 --I was, Stephen said with energy and growing fear. Out here in the dark with a man I don't know raving and moaning to himself about shooting a black panther. You saved men from drowning. I'm not a hero, however. If he stays on here I am off.¹³²

That Joyce had Archbishop Trench's notion of the panther in mind is suggested by a later passage in "Proteus":

He rooted in the sand, dabbling, delving and stopped to listen to the air, scraped up the sand again with a fury of his claws, soon ceasing, a pard, a panther, got in spousebreach, vulturing the dead.¹³³

Joyce borrows here from a passage from John de Trevisa's *De Proprietatibus Rerum*, in which that author writes "Leopardus is a cruel beast and is gendered in spousebreche of a parde

¹³³Chenevix Trench, *Study of Words*, thirteenth edition (London: Macmillan and Co., 1869), p. 265.

¹³²*Ulysses*, p. 4.

¹³³*Ulysses*, p. 39.

and a lionas."¹³⁴ The association of Leopardus, an animal of combined attributes, with Trench's Pliny's panthera (Pantherus) would not too greatly force the matter, particularly given Joyce's customary *modus operandi*. In any case, it is clear that Joyce intends an allegorical dimension to the panther which is to represent the fiction of paternity. Haines, which Gifford suggests, probably correctly, is a pun on the French *la haine*, relies on his race, or descent, to maintain the position which that background guarantees.¹³⁵ His fear of the panther (black to further emphasize the point) is a fear of having the foundations of his superiority--that is, his race--eroded by the true state of things, by the ultimate irrelevance of one's paternity to personal virtue.¹³⁶ As the elder Trench succinctly notes, the properties of all beasts meet in the panther; and if the panther is the real father, a single issuance comes to inseminate the germ of every possible manifestation of the human being. The effect of the truth of such a proposition is a profound levelling of the human condition, a levelling more

¹³⁴*De Proprietatibus Rerum*, XVIII, lxxxiii. Cf. *The Compact Edition of the Oxford English Dictionary*, p. 2076.

¹³⁵Gifford, *Ulysses Annotated*, pp. 14-15.

¹³⁶Joyce's use of the colour black in the context of paternity and race is morally multivalent or polyvocal. Joyce also had the unfortunate Irish habit of using the word "nigger" in a, supposed, neutral manner. Joyce used the word at least five times in *Ulysses* and, without apparent consideration, used it in his correspondence. But in Ireland Joyce would have known even fewer Africans or Bermudans or Jamaicans, than he would have known Jews.

profound than "Haines" could endure psychically, despite his daylight passion for things Celtic.¹³⁷ It is also worth noticing that in "Calypso," just a couple of pages after Stephen, somewhat strangely, calls to mind a "pard" as he watches a *dog* on the beach, Bloom is introduced in a scene in which his first concern after preparing Molly's breakfast is to feed a *cat*:

Mr Bloom watched curiously, kindly the lithe black form. Clean to see: the gloss of her sleek hide, the white button under the butt of her tail, the green flashing eyes. He bent down to her, his hands on his knees.

--Milk for the pussens, he said.¹³⁸

In this context it is relatively easy to see the obeisance to a principle intended by Bloom's bending down, "his hands on his knees," to a *black* cat. The correspondence to Haine's black panther is obvious. The suggestion of maternity is also clear. It is no surprise to find a cat lapping a bowl of milk. But Joyce's use of the incident is as heavily fraught with significance as anything else in the novel. Joyce could choose to feed the cat anything he wanted. He chooses milk because it is an entirely maternal substance, and the feline principle in the novel is one entirely at odds with paternity. That Bloom kneels and feeds the cat as he prepares Molly's

¹³⁷Haines is truly a tragic, if minor, character. The inner conflict that Joyce is sketching is one that drove the real Haines, Diarmuid (or Dermot) Trench or Samuel Chenevix Trench, to suicide; the ultimate sundering of oneself from the flock, and from his tribe, for a clergyman's son.

¹³⁸*Ulysses*, p. 45.

breakfast only emphasizes the fact that Bloom's chthonic theology is, even if only parodically, a worship of the mother goddess; the cat a recollection of the ancient Levantine remembrance of that animal as sacred to Isis and identified with the feminine cycles of the moon. In this way, Bloom is again shown to be free from the atavistic cult of fatherhood tacit in the other Irishmen of his time.

The question of fatherhood in *Ulysses* is also greatly illuminated by a fuller notion of who Haines' prototype and his prototype's father were. Haines, for all of his "Oxford manner" and *sassenach* ways, is a gentrified pretender with an "old fellow" who made "his tin by selling jalap to Zulus or some bloody swindle or other."¹³⁹ The reference to tin is as canny and sculpted as one comes to expect from Joyce. In

¹³⁹*Ulysses*, p. 6. The tuber of the Jalap plant was used to make a powder used in cathartic drugs and as a strong hepatic and intestinal stimulant, though it performs these offices only when combined with bile. Jalap was first brought to Europe from Mexico around 1600 and was a common ingredient in cures for dropsy in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries:

Dropsy Purging Powder

"Take a pound of Jalap, in powder ; a pound of cream of tartar, and an ounce of bole armenic, in fine powder. Mix them well together.

"The dose is from thirty to forty grains in broth, or warm beer, two or three days together ; or oftener, if necessary."

This "receipt," taken from *The British Chronicle* (London: Feb. 14-16, 1763, p. 3), is identical to the one used at least as late as 1890 (cf. , ninth ed., v. XIII, p. 547). That Joyce would choose to connect an ingredient in purgatives with the Archbishop is, of course, quite suggestive. In 1904, Joyce already had "purgatives" on his mind, the speaker of "The Holy Office" being one Katharsis-Purgative: "Thus I relieve their timid arses,/ Perform my office of Katharsis" (*Critical Writings*, p. 151).

Ireland in Joyce's time, tin was still the provenance of the tinker, a caste rather than a profession, and one at the bottom of the social (and racial) scale.¹⁴⁰ Despite his education, Haines is of no better "breeding" than those to whom he has been drilled to feel superior. It has already been mentioned that the "jalap" that Haine's "old fellow" actually sold in Victorian Ireland was Episcopal Protestantism (and the Queen's English). If Haines's father is Trench senior, the "Zulus" represent the Irish. These two tribes were only grudgingly distinguished in terms of civilization by the natural scientists of the empire. And the deathrates were higher in Dublin than in Calcutta or in the kraals of South Africa. Haines is a Celtophile, but not the sort that goes native. His Celtophilia is of the misty, gentrified, Fiona MacLeod, variety, romantic and of the *decadence*, as remote from the truly Irish milkwoman as she herself is from the old Celtic tongue. And the behaviour and attitude of the "Imperial British state" towards the mere Irish is one of two main factors deciding Stephen's exile.¹⁴¹ He is alien to

¹⁴⁰In an entry on the life of John Bunyan, Macaulay remarks of the tinkers that they "then formed a hereditary caste, which was held in no high estimation. They were generally vagrants and pilferers, and were often confounded with gipsies, whom in truth they nearly resembled" (*Encyclopædia Britannica*, ninth edition, vol. iv, p. 526). In Ireland, tinkers, whose ranks were continuously swelled by the injustices concomitant with British rule of the country, continued to live the same kind of life long after they had disappeared in England.

¹⁴¹*Ulysses*, p. 17.

the psychological culture of male Ireland, but as an Irishman himself he is also alienated from British culture; by their "unfair treatment" of the Irish nation, and by their consistently, if quietly, expressed contempt for the Irish in their intellectual culture.

To an extent, the chasm between Haines and the *gaidhealtachd*, the object of his affection, has to do with his not being locked into that state of servitude incumbent upon the native Irish, in reality as well as in the histories of the likes of Philip Smith:

--Cracked lookingglass of a servant! Tell that to the oxy chap downstairs and touch him for a guinea. He's stinking with money and thinks you're not a gentleman. His old fellow made his tin by selling jalap to Zulus or some bloody swindle or other. God, Kinch, if you and I could only work together we might do something for the island. Hellenise it.¹⁴²

Haines, like Bloom, is also separated from the Irish because he does not fit the self-perpetuated stereotypes, the Carletonite *Paddyism* of the Irish themselves that has too often hardened into bigotry and violence. Within twenty years of 1904, and just after the period of the composition of *Ulysses*, Ireland, and Dublin in particular, would witness the early symptoms of the same genus of political cancer that would eventually afflict Europe with the Warsaw Ghetto and with Stalingrad. Even Yeats, in one of his occasional bouts of confusion, would write marching songs for the Irish

¹⁴²*Ulysses*, 1.153-158, p. 6.

blueshirts.¹⁴³ To her credit, Ireland's extremists would, for the most part, retain enough political subtlety to behave in a way that offered no active service to Nazism. Irish troops would continue to die alongside the British in British uniforms. The majority of the highly politicized country's people were well represented by Dubliner, I.R.A. operative, and litterateur Brendan Behan's words, as reported by C.A. Joyce, on Behan's being paroled out of an English gaol during the Second World War:

I'll promise not to do anything until we've done with that bastard Hitler and after that I can always consider it again, can't I?¹⁴⁴

But insularity and a sometimes vicious attention to ethnic and religious background were even more common in Dublin in 1904 than in Derry in 1994. As Hugh Kenner has gently put it, "the Irish can be great overlookers of non-Celts."¹⁴⁵ Haines is a non-Celt. As was Dermot or Diarmuid Trench, who, despite his having been born in Ireland remains the "English child" of Richard Whatley's poem.

James Joyce had no doubt about the existence of human bigotry. And more particularly, his sympathies for Ireland's nationalist movement were sapped by the movement's inherent

¹⁴³Richard Ellmann, *Yeats: the Man and the Masks* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1979), pp. 280-2.

¹⁴⁴Brendan Behan, *Confessions of an Irish Rebel* (London: Arena, 1965), p. 14. One supposes that Behan's gaoler is only distantly related to Joyce.

¹⁴⁵ Hugh Kenner, *Ulysses*, p. 43.

tribalism, if not by its racism. In *Ulysses*, the question of race, and Joyce's answer to that question, is predictably and carefully convoluted. "paternity" is a "legal fiction," and the hero of the Irish epic is half a Hungarian "of Israel's folk."¹⁴⁶ Stephen Dedalus, who at the end of *A Portrait* invokes the "Old father," has come to a point at which he can, in the heat of discussion, view fatherhood as an "instant of blind rut."¹⁴⁷ The handling of paternity in *Ulysses* is also, if only tangentially, a para-feminist one, the "strandentwining cable of all flesh" leading back to the "belly without blemish" so as to suggest that Joyce viewed maternity as being more substantial than paternity. If all human beings are traced to the first mother, pretensions to any superiority based upon paternity are illusory. Of course, this idea is closely related to the "black panther" trope discussed above. The dream that bedevils Haines has its source in the anxiety caused by an unknown quality or quantity that undoes the whole structure of his notion of selfhood. Joyce expands on this point by returning in "Oxen of the Sun" to images of Eve first introduced in "Proteus":

Know all men, he said, time's ruins build
eternity's mansions. What means this? Desire's
wind blasts the thorn tree but after it becomes from
a bramblebush to be a rose upon the rood of time.
Mark me now. In woman's womb word is made flesh
but in the spirit of the maker all flesh that

¹⁴⁶*Ulysses*, p. 315.

¹⁴⁷Joyce, *Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* (London: Penguin, 1987), p. 253, and *Ulysses*, p. 171.

passes becomes the word that shall not pass away. This is the postcreation. *Omnis caro ad te veniet*. No question but her name is puissant who adventured the dear corse of our Agenbuyer, Healer and Herd, our mighty mother and mother most venerable and Bernardus saith aptly that She hath an *omnipotentiam deiparae supplicem*, that is to wit, an almightiness of petition because she is the second Eve and she won us, saith Augustine too, whereas that other, our grandam, which we are linked up with by successive anastomosis of navelcords sold us all, seed, breed and generation, for a penny pippin.¹⁴⁸

The question of whether the Eve story could be taken literally, or whether all human beings were descended from a single maternal parent, had been taken up in a lively manner by the natural historians and ethnologists of the nineteenth century. In 1860, Stephen H. Ward described his view of the question succinctly:

If it were possible to bring together in one group representatives of each of the races of man, the fair-complexioned German, the darker Celt, with his high cheek-bones, the swarthy Italian or Moor, the black, woolly-headed Negro, the copper-coloured Malay, the flat-faced Chinese, the degraded Australian, the Esquimaux, and the Red Indian of America, and if each were clad in characteristic costume, the effect produced would be at once grotesque and motley. However strong might be our prepossession in their favour, we should find it difficult to believe that they were in any way allied, still more that they were intimately related, and all to be regarded as men and brothers, of like flesh and blood, sprung from the same common source, and endowed with similar mental and religious capacities.¹⁴⁹

¹⁴⁸*Ulysses*, p. 320.

¹⁴⁹Stephen H. Ward, *The Natural History of Mankind* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1860), p. 2. The most influential and extensive investigation of this question in the nineteenth century was undoubtedly Charles
(continued...)

Joyce's "successive anastomosis of navelcords" that connects us to Eve contradicts the reaction that Ward anticipates here, and, with the word *anastomosis* carefully chosen, insists upon the connection shared in the rivers of blood in the intertwining arteries of all human beings, living and dead.¹⁵⁰ That this idea is extremely important to Joyce is underscored by the fact that it raised in nearly identical context in the very first sentence of *Finnegans Wake*:

riverrun, past Eve and Adam's, from swerve of shore to bend of bay, brings us by a commodius vicus of recirculation back to Howth Castle and Environs.¹⁵¹

Here, Eve maintains that precedence over Adam with which Joyce subverts traditional mythologies of paternity.

The aim of the paternity motif in *Ulysses* is to sketch a sociology of Dublin's and Ireland's specific psychic ills. It does violence to the text to extricate any feminist or quasi-Freudian contemplation of fatherhood from *Ulysses* without also understanding the question of paternity in its relationship to

¹⁴⁹ (...continued)

Darwin's *The Descent of Man* (Second edition, London: John Murry, 1874, rpt. 1913). Darwin was himself uncertain about whether to speak of "races or species of men" (p. 7 and *passim*), but did allow finally that "man is descended from some [single] lowly organized form" (p. 946).

¹⁵⁰The *Pocket Oxford Dictionary* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1924) tells us that anastomosis is a cross "connexion between arteries, rivers, &c," p. 26.

¹⁵¹*Finnegans Wake*, p. 3.

the vicious clannishness that Joyce diagnoses in Ireland.¹⁵² A precondition for a new "Bloomusalem in the Nova Hibernia of the future" is that the insular family romances of both the Irish Catholic nationalists and of the more conventionally literate, and sometimes pan-Celtic, Anglo-Irish must be attacked with the scholastic subtlety of a renegade Jesuit and a *philologist* of at least middling strength.¹⁵³ It may be of use to discuss in more detail the impact of the attitudes outlined above on the main characters of *Ulysses*, and to sketch how Bloom and Stephen illustrate, and perhaps offer a kind of resolution to the patriarchal cult of atavism that forms a central thematic concern of the novel.

¹⁵²For an interesting example of a discussion of the psychoanalytic reading of Joyce's dealings with the father, see Jean-Michel Rabate's "A Clown's Inquest into Paternity: Fathers, Dead or Alive, in *Ulysses*," *James Joyce, Authorized Reader* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1991). For a feminist reading of the question see Suzette Henke's *James Joyce and the Politics of Desire* (New York: Routledge, 1990).

¹⁵³*Ulysses*, p. 395.

Chapter Four:
The Irish *Maschiach*

It is a critical commonplace to apply Mulligan's "fearful jesuit" to Joyce himself.¹⁵⁴ In *Stephen Hero*, Joyce speaks of Stephen's "genuine predisposition in favour of all but the premisses of scholasticism."¹⁵⁵ In *Ulysses*, the various manifestations of this scholastic tendency express themselves in a myriad of angles of focus, all addressing the malaise that forced Joyce into exile.¹⁵⁶ The design of *Ulysses* is such that performing an autopsy, extracting "proofs" of Joyce's own premises from the inner organs of his texts, is perhaps to place oneself outside the gates of Joyce's ideal commonwealth. As Stephen says in *Stephen Hero*,

An artist is not a fellow who dangles a *mechanical heaven* before the public. The priest does that. The artist affirms out of the fulness of his own life, he creates... Do you understand?¹⁵⁷

(emphasis added)

At the risk of committing the sin of a literary coroner, or of

¹⁵⁴Which like the word "jew" Joyce writes in lower case.

¹⁵⁵James Joyce, *Stephen Hero*, (New York: New Directions, 1963) p. 77.

¹⁵⁶Aside from the dissonance of their aims and theology, the scholastic logic of the Jesuits and the inductive model of investigation of the Victorian rationalists were quite congenial.

¹⁵⁷*Stephen Hero*, p. 86.

looking for springs in the machinery, it may be useful to isolate some of the more direct references to the paternity motif in order to understand more fully the connection between an ill-conceived myth of fatherhood and the oppressiveness of sectarian notions of nationhood. Although it has been traditional to think of "Mother Ireland," and of Erin as a female, in practice nationalist personifications of Ireland resemble closely the "fatherlands" of other militant national mythologies. If Fenian Eire is a woman, she is Boadicea.¹⁵⁸

In *Ulysses*, one of the qualities of characterization that connects Stephen to Bloom is a state of internal exile. Both are subjected to varieties of shunning by nationalist xenophobes: Bloom because, in the eyes of the ethnocentric Irish, he is a Jew; and Stephen because he is an intellectual and artist outside of the province of Irish Renaissance letters. The relationship between Bloom and Stephen has been much discussed. Harold Bloom sees Leopold Bloom as Sancho Panza to Stephen's Don Quixote.¹⁵⁹ Richard Ellman speaks of "Bloom's common sense" joining "Stephen's acute intelligence."¹⁶⁰ What is clear in the novel is that Joyce

¹⁵⁸Eireann may also be the "Old Hag of Beare" from the tenth century poem. Cf. *Poems from the Irish* (London: Ernest Benn Ltd., 1925), ed. Humbert Wolfe, pp. 13-16. But in either case the personification is too pugnacious to allow easy acceptance of an adoption of "motherland."

¹⁵⁹*Modern Critical Interpretations, James Joyce's Ulysses*, ed. Harold Bloom, (New York: Chelsea House Publishers, 1987), pp. 4-5.

¹⁶⁰Ellman, *James Joyce*, p. 372.

is sparing in his affirmation of the virtue of the character of individuals, and neither Stephen nor Bloom has any of the sort of purity of agency one expects of a Romanticist hero. But though both are flawed, or perhaps damaged, to a degree, nonetheless they are meant to represent aspects of desirable or positive human development. And in both cases it is a variety of traumatic isolation that has led to that development: Stephen's caused by his gifts and attainments in an unpromising situation; and Bloom's by his Jewishness (at least to Irish eyes), by his experience and humanity, and because of a temperament ill-suited to the blustery conviviality of the Dubliners with whom he lives.

Leopold Bloom is a Jew primarily because of his name and because of the treatment that name ensures him from the citizens of Dublin. Aside from his somewhat Edward Fitzgeraldine vision of the Levant, Bloom evinces no interest in Herzl's Zionist program nor does he feel any anxiety of the diaspora.¹⁶¹ Bloom's knowledge of Jewish custom is

¹⁶¹The philological work of John Wilkins, Sir William Jones, Theodor Benfey, Franz Bopp, Colebrooke, Amelung, Brugmann, and others to open West Oriental literature and languages to a European audience had an extensive impact on nineteenth century literature. Indian, Persian, and Arabic subjects were exploited by poets and writers much in the same way as Mediæval subjects had been after Victorian advances in historical philology and the new availability of Middle English and Anglo-Saxon grammars and texts. Long before Burton's scandalizing, and comparatively accurate, translation of *The Thousand and One Nights*, Antoine Galland had published a French translation that was in its turn translated numerously. E.W. Lane also published a very popular Victorian translation of the work. Fitzgerald's *Rubaiyat*, George Eliot's
(continued...)

limited to what he remembers of his father and grandfather and to a few imperfectly recalled snatches of Hebrew. The hoary adage that you can tell a man by his books is certainly what Joyce had in mind in "Ithaca" when he lists the books that Bloom has in his house. We know from "Calypso" that Molly's taste in literature is limited to salacious romances of the *Ruby: the Pride of the Ring* and the "Paul de Kock" sort.¹⁶² So the "inverted volumes improperly arranged" that Joyce lists in "Ithaca" can be directly connected to Bloom himself and may be viewed as a type of portraiture.¹⁶³ The first book mentioned, coyly given Joyce's extensive use of the text during the composition of *Ulysses*, is *Thom's Dublin Post Office Directory*.¹⁶⁴ That this is the first work mentioned is suggestive of Bloom's being a Dubliner before all else, a metonymy for the precedence of his *citizenship* over his ethnicity. Bloom's use of *Thom's*, possibly in connection with his work, is not described by Joyce. Of the twenty-three books that Joyce mentions, five are connected to Ireland in one way or other. Only two have anything to do with Jews or

¹⁶¹ (...continued)

The Spanish Gypsy, R.L. Stevenson's *New Arabian Nights*, Thomas Moore's neglected masterpiece *Lalla Rookh* and James Clarence Mangan's "To the Ingleezee Khaffir," are only a very few of a wide range of works that profited from the filtering down of West Oriental lore from the work of Comparative philologists.

¹⁶²*Ulysses*, pp. 52-3.

¹⁶³*Ulysses*, p. 581.

¹⁶⁴*Ulysses*, p. 582-3.

Judaism, one a "sewn pamphlet" on the "Philosophy of the Talmud" and the other the ambivalently Hebraic *Thoughts from Spinoza*.¹⁶⁵ Three others have to do with astronomy, and altogether there are six which are scientific or mathematics texts. There is one other religious book, *The Secret Life of Christ*, the text of which rests occultly between "black boards," and an inevitable edition of Shakespeare's *Works*. The rest are a selection of historical, biographical, and travel narratives which reveal Bloom's curiosity without displaying any governing passion. Of all the titles mentioned, only the humble sewn pamphlet, a symbol of Bloom's very slight contact with Judaism, would give any hint of the paternal descent that is the basis of so much hostility towards Bloom.¹⁶⁶

And Bloom himself is uncertain about his Jewish status. In "Eumaeus," Bloom even says, "his God, I mean Christ, was a jew too and all his family like me though in reality I'm not"

¹⁶⁵The extent of the Victorian popularity of Spinoza's work is difficult to comprehend in an age in which philosophy has been so effectively marginalized. The two main English texts dealing with Spinoza at the turn of the century were Frederick Pollok's *Spinoza, His Life and Philosophy* (second ed., 1899) and James Martineau's *A Study of Spinoza* (1882). But by 1890 the literature on the subject of Spinoza had "become so extensive as to forbid quotation" (*Encyclopædia Britannica*, ninth ed., v.xxii, p. 204).

¹⁶⁶The book that forms the most concrete evidence for Bloom's Jewish antecedents, an "ancient haggadah book in which a pair of hornrimmed convex spectacles inserted marked the passage of thanksgiving in the ritual prayers for Pessach," is kept hidden in a locked drawer (*Ulysses*, p. 594).

(emphasis added).¹⁶⁷ And since Jewish law judges Jewish status according to the distaff, Bloom would not be Jewish as far as the Jews are concerned either. Though his maternal grandfather Julius (Judah) Higgins was Jewish, his grandmother Fanny Higgins was not. As a result, according to *Halakhah*, neither Bloom's mother nor Bloom himself is legally Jewish.

In many ways, Bloom fits an Irish stereotype even more than Stephen does. In the hallucinatory *Circe* episode, Bloom, consistently more of an Irish republican than Stephen, embraces John Howard Parnell and speaks of "Erin, the promised land of our common ancestors."¹⁶⁸ He also thinks of using the crossed keys of an ad to suggest the Manx Parliament, a symbol of freedom from Britain. Bloom has also been, nominally, both Protestant and Catholic, born into the former because of his father's conversion and converted himself to the latter. In "Ithaca," Joyce gives us a passage in which both Bloom's religious and political history is explicitly described:

To Master Percy Apjohn at High School in 1880 he had divulged his disbelief in the tenets of the Irish (protestant) church (to which his father Rudolf Virag (later Rudolph Bloom) had been converted from the Israelite faith and communion in 1865 by the Society for promoting Christianity among the jews) subsequently abjured by him in favour of Roman catholicism at the epoch of and with a view to his matrimony in 1888. To Daniel Magrane and Francis Wade in 1882 during a juvenile friendship (terminated by the premature emigration

¹⁶⁷*Ulysses*, p. 525.

¹⁶⁸*Ulysses*, p. 394.

of the former) he had advocated during nocturnal perambulations the political theory of colonial (e.g. Canadian) expansion and the evolutionary principles of Charles Darwin, expounded in *The Descent of Man* and *The Origin of Species*. In 1885 he had publicly expressed his adherence to the collective and national economic programme advocated by James Fintan Lalor, John Fisher Murray, John Mitchel, J.F.X. O'Brien and others, the agrarian policy of Michael Davitt, the constitutional agitation of Charles Stewart Parnell (M.P. for Cork City), the programme of peace, retrenchment and reform of William Ewart Gladstone (M.P. for Midlothian, N.B.) and, in support of his political convictions, had climbed up into a secure position amid the ramifications of a tree on Northumberland road to see the entrance (2 February 1888) into the capital of a demonstrative torchlight procession of 20,000 torchbearers, divided into 120 trade corporations, bearing 2000 torches in escort of the Marquess of Ripon and (honest) John Morley.¹⁶⁹

But despite Joyce's liminalization of Bloom from the center of the Jewish community, and Bloom's concrete if mild republicanism, Bloom's Jewishness is maintained negatively with an atmosphere of sectarian Irish hostility to the insufficiently Irish.

That Joyce make Bloom Jewish, aside from obvious traditional associations of Jewishness with exile and persecution, and despite the tenuousness of Bloom's Hebraism, is vital to the implicit sociological critique of Joyce's Ireland's poisonous bigotry. According to Frank Budgen, it was Joyce's belief that Jews "are better husbands than we are, better fathers, and better sons," and that a "Jew is both king

¹⁶⁹*Ulysses*, pp. 558-9.

and priest in his own family."¹⁷⁰ Joyce's analysis of fatherhood from the mouth of Stephen, is both specific to the Irish context and provisional.¹⁷¹ Bloom reflects Joyce's notions of Jewish men in that he 's not a poor husband, he is a poor lover, and as a father he is above reproach. In comparison, Irish Simon Dedalus is a brute who hides money from his half-starved children. In "Eumaeus," in a typically cunning and complex passage, Joyce encourages a view of Simon as a member of the Irish rabble with a bit of play about names:

--Sounds are impostures, Stephen said after a pause of some little time, like names. Cicero, Podmore. Napoleon, Mr. Goodbody. Jesus, Mr. Doyle. Shakespeares were as common as Murphies. What's in a name?

--Yes, to be sure, Mr. Bloom unaffectedly concurred. Of course. Our name was changed too, he added, pushing the so-called roll across.¹⁷²

After Bloom unaffectedly concurs, the red-bearded, sea-going,

¹⁷⁰Ellman, *James Joyce*, p. 373.

¹⁷¹Joyce is of course careful that Stephen's meditations are marred by the enthusiasms and naivete of a twenty-one year old. But Stephen is also more than the Jim Joyce who wrote his Paris notebook on aesthetics in 1903-4. The character Stephen Dedalus always wavers between the naivete of his provincialism and the insight of James Joyce at the age of thirty-eight. Joyce's mature attitudes are often reflected in his projection of his younger self. Stephen's pronouncements concerning fathership are *specific* in that they are meant in remonstrance of Irish fathers, and *provisional* in the sense that *Ulysses* can be said to have a prognostic or prescriptive intention, as S.L. Goldberg also argues in his *The Classical Temper: A Study of James Joyce's Ulysses* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1961): a prognostication that presumably posits a potential for improvement of the Irish situation and of the human condition more generally.

¹⁷²*Ulysses*, p. 509.

cousin of the Citizen asks Stephen's name. Bloom is aware of the potential provocation of having a foreign name, but Stephen disregards his warning and answers the seaman's question. Instead of causing an unpleasant scene the seaman simply remarks, "He's Irish...All Irish."¹⁷³ He then launches into a ludicrous account of Si Dedalus's heroic exploits as a marksman. That the seaman's name is then revealed to be D.B. Murphy underscores the fact that for the Murphies of the rabble's mobs and factions, for those whose ignorance makes them capable of the nearly indiscriminate violence that Bloom fears for Stephen, Si Dedalus is not an enemy. This does not stand in the favour of Si Dedalus nor of the Murphies. Later in the seaman's storytelling, Joyce obliquely connects the Irish with "savages" by again echoing the "cracked lookingglass of a servant" from "Telemachus."¹⁷⁴ The seaman remarks that "Glass. That boggles 'em. Glass."¹⁷⁵

Here, as elsewhere, Stephen is not exempted from this Irishry. Earlier in the day he himself has been, in a sense, *boggled* momentarily by glass. And the servile old woman delivering the milk just afterwards in "Telemachus" slights Stephen because he is not of those whose voices "speak to her

¹⁷³*Ulysses*, p. 509.

¹⁷⁴*Ulysses*, p. 511.

¹⁷⁵*Ulysses*, p. 512.

loudly."¹⁷⁶ In other words, Stephen is of her world and not of the world of the usurper and betrayer, and he suffers the traditional servitude that Haines escapes, the same servitude that the universal historian H. White and the other academicians of Imperial Britain worked to maintain.¹⁷⁷ So the sources of Stephen's alienation from Dublin are not the same as Bloom's. They are matters of sensibility and not of tribal exclusion. And this sensibility is heightened by what he knows of the oppressor's culture and science, which is a

¹⁷⁶*Ulysses*, p. 12.

¹⁷⁷ Some notion of how biased English history could be can be seen in the following passage from White's *Elements of Universal History*:

IRELAND was fondly supposed by its antiquarians to have been peopled by Phoenicians. But the songs of the minstrel are an imperfect substitute for genuine history, and sober truth must confess that the green island was little more than a battlefield for its uncivilized inhabitants even long after its invasion by the English. The doctrines of Christianity are said to have been first proclaimed in it by Palladius in 430, and by St. Patrick in 450; but perpetual intestine war among the various chieftains, and the incursions of the Danes, soon checked its progress towards civilization. About the middle of the twelfth century, the country was divided into the five hostile kingdoms of Leinster, Munster, Ulster, Meath, and Connaught, besides several inferior principalities. One monarch was chosen to preside over a kind of deliberative assembly held at undetermined periods, and which possessed little power. The deposition of the King of Leinster and his flight to England, led to one of the most fortunate events in the history of Ireland. After the successful expedition of Earl Strongbow, who restored Lermud with an inconsiderable troop of knights and archers, Henry himself landed in 1172, and effectually established the English pale. Druids existed in Ireland as late as the year 1166" (p. 263).

great deal.

The question of names and ethnic consciousness is an extremely important one in *Ulysses*. In the library, Stephen reacts against the affectation of names other than their own by A.E. and Eglinton. If names are "impostures" to begin with, this reaction might be considered somewhat inconsistent. But Joyce reacts not because Magee or Russell may be hiding their background. Instead he objects because to affect a new name is to perpetrate a double imposture. Joyce makes no quarrel with a particular Mr. Doyle or a particular Mr. Shakespeare because their name is Doyle or Shakespeare. Nor does he allow that a man is a good man just because he happens to be a Doyle, or a bad one because his name is Cromwell. This is the level of the assumptions the Citizen makes. It is also another reason behind Stephen's refusal to call Magee John Eglinton in "Scylla and Charybdis," and the source of his occasional and often satiric use of Russell's *alias*, A.E. For Magee, with his typical Victorian Anglo-centrism ("Give me my Wordsworth"),¹⁷⁸ to think that he can avoid the contradiction of his *mere Irish* name by affecting an Episcopal one is to display a moral weakness, at least as far as Joyce is concerned.¹⁷⁹

¹⁷⁸*Ulysses*, p. 170.

¹⁷⁹*Ulysses*, p. 170. Joyce's own sensitivity towards names may be seen in his choice of the common "Mulligan" for the less usual, though no less Irish, Gogarty. The choice was made very early in the genesis of the novel and may have been
(continued...)

The notion the "sounds are impostures...like names" is aligned with the notion of redeeming the "words of the marketplace" discussed in the first chapter. The strategy is analogous to that used by Heidegger in *An Introduction to Metaphysics* to recapture the genius of the language of Herakleitos and Thales, a language obfuscated as well as obscured by Latin Grammarians for nearly two millennia according to the German philosopher. A Logos, a word, or name, perpetually invoked in the commission of crimes is no longer useful to a necessarily radical semantics. As Geoffrey Hill puts it in "Annunciations":

The Word has been abroad, is back, with a tanned look
From its subsistence in the stiffening-mire.¹⁸⁰

The source of this complex relation to language can be traced to Joyce's very early interest in etymology and philology. Once it is clear that simple words have a history during which they have metamorphosed perhaps many times, language becomes a flux in which multivalent intention becomes not only possible but necessary and useful to heightened expression.

This is also the root of Stephen's preference for Aquinas over Plato. Lies are a form of artifice, and the use of artifice is patently the poet's skill. But that Plato would

¹⁷⁹ (...continued)

chosen before Joyce had fully developed his own critique of this order of distinction, or it may have been simply a gibe that Joyce knew Gogarty would feel.

¹⁸⁰Geoffrey Hill, *Somewhere Is Such a Kingdom* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1975), p. 52.

keep poets out of his ideal Commonwealth offends Stephen because the exclusion posits a society in which language would not reflect upon itself, would not approach poetic discussion of an advance potentially invoked; since sounds are impostures, all language, like Plato's poet, lies.

In "Ecce Puer" Joyce writes for his son:

Calm in his cradle
The living lies.
May love and mercy
Unclose his eyes.¹⁸¹

The unclosing of eyes with love and mercy seems to be frustrated in *Ulysses* by the fact that Dublin is ruled by the rhetoric of the Creator, the deity of a murderous and perfunctory mythology, rather than "at the name of the fabulous artificer."¹⁸² In *Ulysses*, this rhetoric is consistently placed under siege. For example, Bloom's nationality, Irish, or citizenship, Dubliner, is at least as important as his Jewishness, despite his not belonging to those who would speak of *Sinn Féin*. He was born and has lived his whole life in Ireland. His politics are patriotic without being murderous. And in "Circe" we are told that Bloom is not even circumcised, is without "a bit off the top."¹⁸³

That it is possible for Bloom to be both Irish and Jewish, despite the common Irish opinion to the contrary, is

¹⁸¹ James Joyce, "Ecce Puer," from *Collected Poems* (New York: Viking Press, 1969), p. 63.

¹⁸² *A Portrait of the Artist*, p. 169.

¹⁸³ *Ulysses*, p. 240.

reaffirmed consistently in *Ulysses*. Stuart Gilbert was among the first to point out that Bloom's daughter is named Milly as a play on Milesian.¹⁸⁴ As has been already mentioned, the Milesians are quasi-mythological founders of Ireland much cited by Celto-centric ethnologists of the T.W.Rolleston and Ulick Bourke school.¹⁸⁵ In *Circe* one also finds the passage:

A Voice
Bloom, are you the Messiah ben Joseph or ben David?

Bloom
(darkly) You have said it.¹⁸⁶

Here, the "Messiah ben Joseph," as distinguished from ben David, is the redeemer of the gentiles, a messiah dissociated from the national *maschiach* of the peoples of David, Judah and Israel. But Bloom is both and neither, a gentile and a Jewish messiah. Later in "Circe," in another allusion to Haines' dream, we are told by Bloom's father Virag that "Panther, the Roman centurion, polluted her (Mary) with his genitories."¹⁸⁷

¹⁸⁴Stuart Gilbert, *James Joyce's Ulysses* (New York: Vintage, 1955), p. 66.

¹⁸⁵T.W. Rolleston formed the Irish Literary Society of London with W.B. Yeats in December of 1891. In 1911, he published *Myths and Legends of the Celtic Race* (second edition, London: George G. Harrap & Co., 1912). One of the theses of Rolleston's work is that there remains a very substantial admixture of Celtic culture and blood in so-called Anglo-Saxon Britain.

¹⁸⁶*Ulysses*, p. 403.

¹⁸⁷*Ulysses*, p. 425. Here it is also interesting that Joyce extends his judgement of the paternal fiction to Bloom himself, whose relation to his own father is guilt-ridden and complex. Since Bloom's only connection to Jewishness is through his father, such a connection is made even more tenuous by Virag's own raising of the spectre of the panther.

In other words, Jesus/Bloom, the Messiah ben Joseph/Virag, is not the son of his father. The "Messiah ben David," the *mashiach* awaited by the Jews, and the "Messiah ben Joseph," Jesus of the gentiles, are both conflated in the *Messiah ben Pantherus*, or the messiah of everyman. That Bloom is capable of this catholicity of messianic function, even if only in the telescopic inflations of "Circe," is an assertion of the inapplicability modern notions of race to the case of the hero of Joyce's epic of Ireland. As has been discussed, Haines' nightmare about the black panther in "Telemachus" is also intended in this sense. Haines, preoccupied with the descendants of the Milesians, views his own background with a similar distortion of the true state of paternity and descent. By day he is a convert to Celticism moving away from his ethnic identity because of an educated liberalism. But by night he is tortured by the fear that the power he acquires by right of birth may be completely illusory.

It is interesting to note that as late as 1907 Joyce himself still indulged in a tenuously constructed, Rollestonian, historiography of national descent. It has been noted that Joyce, in his essay, *Ireland, Island of Saints and Sages*, argues that early Irishmen were Phoenicians.¹⁸⁸ The difference between Joyce's essay and the xenophobic Celticism of a figure like Standish O'Grady is that Joyce scrupulously

¹⁸⁸Joyce cites Charles Vallancey, an eighteenth century historian, as his source for the essay but the belief was a widely held one. See Chapter Two above.

avoids making anything other than a historical point. These Irish "Phoenicians" disappeared before the Greek historians began to write. What all this means in a larger sense, in its relation to the Ireland of 1904 or 1922, is that Irish Catholic hostility to ethnic outsiders is based on a destructive fiction.¹⁸⁹ In a sense, the Irish Catholics of *Ulysses* are anti-Jews. They have Latin rather than Hebrew for a holy tongue, Gaelic rather than Yiddische for a profane one, and are a conquered rather than a conquering people. Both the Irish and the Jews are more numerous in their respective diasporas than in their homelands, and both are insular, inward-looking, ethnicities. But the Irish have a country; and the political and social ramifications of this are that the "mobs and factions" can insist upon their own national stereotypes.

The national religion is part of the dominant stereotype. For Joyce the disease of Irish Catholicism, the faith cognate with Judaism, is not Jansenism precisely, but the constriction of catholicity that Jansenist Catholicism engenders. In *Ulysses*, however, the Church is never accused of the anaemia

¹⁸⁹It is perhaps important to keep in mind that Joyce's portrait of Irish hostility towards the Jews presents a relatively passive variety of anti-Semitism. In Hugh Kenner's *Ulysses* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1980), he notes that "anti-Semitic must be qualified, implying as it now does a biological mystique of which the 1904 Irish cynophiles are innocent....(The) Bloom of the book and his tormentors pre-date racial purity and death-camps, and they victimise him chiefly out of xenophobic passions, which Joyce represents as pervasive and unquestioning" (p. 103).

that Joyce seemed to have seen in Quakers, Presbyterians, and in various other protestantisms. This is another aspect of Roman Catholicism that makes Catholics more like Jews than other Christians. It is, for example, impossible to be a renegade protestant because one is simply no longer a protestant if faith is lost. But a Catholic is always a Catholic in the sense that a Jew is always a Jew, and no matter what metamorphoses occur in one's personal theology. Joyce is heretically ambivalent rather than heretically hostile to the Roman Church.

In *Ulysses*, Catholicism and Judaism are consistently connected. For instance, in "Telemachus" Buck Mulligan refers to "the islanders" speaking "frequently of the collector of prepuces."¹⁹⁰ The god that collects prepuces is Yahveh, not God the Father of a gentile Holy Trinity. In this way Joyce *Judaicizes*, rather than *Hellenizes*, "the Island." Finally, however, it can only be argued that a triangulated admixture of the Wandering Jew, of Ulysses, and of an unnamed, perhaps unborn, Irishman, is provisionally named Bloom in Joyce's "national epic," an epic written towards the new Bloomusalem of Nova Hibernia.¹⁹¹ On this Utopic Island sectarianism is unknown. Speech is an act of poiesis, of artifice; and fatherhood, insofar as it can be determined, earns no claim on a son simply by virtue of a

¹⁹⁰*Ulysses*, p. 12.

¹⁹¹*Ulysses*, p. 158.

common name. And if Bloom and Stephen are kept apart by the "four separating forces" of "[n]ame, age, race, [and] creed," Stephen remains Telemachus to Bloom's Odysseus.¹⁹²

¹⁹²*Ulysses*, p. 554.

Conclusion:
Ulysses, la linguistique, and the Philosophers

In *Ulysses on the Liffey*, Richard Ellmann writes:

Ulysses was in fact designed to be related to other large works, encyclopedias and dictionaries. It is lexical in its regard for English, as it takes in words from all periods, social levels, expressive stances. As its title suggests, it makes the major works of western culture, beginning with the *Odyssey*, tributary to it as it is tributary to them; it also marks the outlines of western history and philosophy.¹⁹³

If what Ellmann says is true--and a very casual acquaintance with *Ulysses* would point to it being so--a primary point of critical departure becomes a labour of tracing the tributary relationships of *Ulysses* to the specific encyclopedias, dictionaries, histories, and philosophies that Joyce had in mind and in hand. In the late twentieth century this approach to the novel's sources and glossarial annexes has become even more difficult than Joyce probably anticipated. The enormous cultural changes wrought by American mass culture and television have had the effect of immersing, if not submerging completely, a large section of an intellectual culture that in Joyce's day must have seemed much less friable. The study of source materials to supplement *Ulysses* has become the work of the historian or archaeologist as well as the literary critic.

¹⁹³Richard Ellmann, *Ulysses on the Liffey* (London: Faber and Faber, 1974), corrected edition, p. xii.

And in a work as intensely intertextual as *Ulysses*, this is an extensive labour to say the least.

But there are a number of factors that can be kept in mind to open approaches to source literature for *Ulysses* studies without making the process completely random. First of all, it should be remembered that despite Joyce's position as a Modernist titan, his primary education is fundamentally one of the late Victorian period or the *fin de siècle*. The young Joyce did an astounding amount of reading, mostly unrecorded, between 1896 and 1906. The intellectual culture of this period had a corresponding impact on all of Joyce's later work. And Joyce's memory allowed him to exploit this material even long after *Ulysses* had already been completed. Another factor in tracing *Ulysses* sources was mentioned at the outset of this discussion. James Joyce's curricula during his apprenticeship differed a good deal from those of the other major figures of the Irish Renaissance. His reading tended to be more rigidly or austerely intellectual, and despite the early influence of aestheticism Joyce found rationalist scientific discourse congenial and rejected neo-Romanticist hostility to Victorian materialism. Combined with a natural intellectual voraciousness this scholastic rigour led the young Joyce further afield from literature proper than even Yeats with his *Isis Unveiled* or A.E. with his Swedenborg. Joyce certainly read a great deal of literature, both classic and modern. But his eclectic interests, perhaps poetic in

themselves, led him also into fields remote from poetry literature in any traditional sense of the terms. And Joyce's reading was never governed by political considerations in the way in which had been the reading of those who had let "the peat smoke go to their heads."¹⁹⁴

All this is not to say that Joyce's non-alignment with the main vanguard of the national literature made him any less an Irishman of his time.¹⁹⁵ But Victorian and turn of the century Ireland was still very substantially British, more so even than the still staunchly Loyalist Canada. And a *rapprochement* to a monolithic and dominant Anglo-European intellectual culture, not a necessity for Yeats or A.E., was inescapable for the young and still fundamentally Roman Catholic Joyce. And for a very important reason. The excellence of the scholarship of England for a period of a century and a half was so manifest that an ambition of Joyce's sort could have no alternate intellectual Jerusalem. Of course, the ambitious also looked to Europe and to European scholarship. And Joyce eventually exiled himself from England as well as from Ireland, and from the morality of the Victorian middle classes.

But before Joyce left the British Islands behind he had read the works of perhaps dozens of scholars who are now

¹⁹⁴*Ulysses*, p. 153.

¹⁹⁵See for example, Seamus Deane's "Joyce the Irishman" in *The Cambridge Companion to James Joyce* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), pp. 31-53.

historical obscurities unattended even by those Joycean scholars who revel in obscurity. In the twenty-first century J.P. Mahaffy has a meagre chance of a popular vogue, but his name will be remembered in Irish literary scholarship. The equally useful and diverting Richard Chenevix Trench is unlikely to demand even such a hearing as that. The same Chenevix Trench who articulated this very Joycean sentiment:

Language then is fossil poetry; in other words, we are not to look for the poetry which a people may possess only in its poems, or its poetical customs, traditions, and beliefs. Many a single word also is itself a concentrated poem, having stores of poetical thought and imagery laid up in it.¹⁹⁶

This passage, expanded from a phrase of Emerson's,¹⁹⁷ also recalls a more ephemeral exploration of the thought in George Eliot's *The Spanish Gypsy*, a poem as famous in Joyce's day as it is unread in our own:

Speech is but broken light upon the depth
 Of the unspoken : even your loved words
 Float in the larger meaning of your voice
 As something dimmer.¹⁹⁸

¹⁹⁶ R. Chenevix Trench. *On the Study of Words*, p. 6.

¹⁹⁷In his essay "The Poet," Emerson writes: "The poets made all the words, and therefore language is the archives of history, and, if we must say it, a sort of tomb of the muses. For though the origin of most of our words is forgotten, each word was at first a stroke of genius, and obtained currency because for the moment it symbolized the world to the first speaker and to the hearer. The etymologist finds the deadest word to have been once a brilliant picture. Language is fossil poetry." Cf. *The Complete Essays and Other Writings of Ralph Waldo Emerson*, ed. Brooks Atkinson (New York: The Modern Library, 1940), p. 329.

¹⁹⁸George Eliot, *The Spanish Gypsy, The Legend of Jubal, and Other Poems, Old and New* (Edinburgh: William Blackwood And Sons, 1901), p. 104.

This is the thought Joyce had in mind when he called names and sounds impostures. Joyce's preoccupation with this notion is the result of a great deal of consideration of language: from historical, etymological, poetic, and psychological points of view. As early as 1899, Joyce had already come to conclusions very similar to Chenevix Trench and Emerson:

...in the history of words there is much that indicates the history of men, and in comparing the speech of to-day with that of years ago, we have a useful illustration of the effect of external influences on the very words of a race.¹⁹⁹

In *Stephen Hero*, Joyce speaks also of Stephen's being "often hypnotised by the most commonplace conversation"²⁰⁰ because of his interest in etymology.

These ideas of language have to an extent become a central tropic of European literature and philosophy. Ernst Cassirer speaks of words at this frequency of intention as "momentary gods."²⁰¹ Cassirer is also a preternatural critic of Joyce's *linguist'que* when he discusses an aspect of the science of language that is adjacent to Joyce's bestowing of primitive linguistic status on the maternal:

The modern science of language, in its efforts to elucidate the "origin" of language, has indeed gone back frequently to Hamann's dictum, that poetry is "the mother-tongue of humanity"; its scholars have emphasized the fact that speech is rooted not in the prosaic, but in the poetic aspect of life, so

¹⁹⁹*Critical Writings*, "The Study of Languages," p. 28

²⁰⁰*Stephen Hero*, p. 26.

²⁰¹Ernst Cassirer, *Language and Myth*, trans. Suzanne K. Langer (New York: Dover Publications, 1946), p. 34.

that its ultimate basis must be sought not in preoccupation with the objective view of things and their classification according to certain attributes, but in the primitive power of subjective feeling.²⁰²

Cassirer cites the very distinguished Otto Jespersen, a transitional figure both Victorian philologist and twentieth century analytic grammarian, as his authority for the claim.²⁰³ But it would be taking Cassirer out of context to overlook his remarks that follow the just cited passage:

But although this doctrine may seem, at first sight, to evade the vicious circle into which the theory of logical expression is ever lapsing, in the end it also cannot bridge the gulf between the purely denotative and the expressive function of speech. In this theory, too, there always remains a sort of hiatus between the lyrical aspect of verbal expression and its logical character; what remains obscure is exactly that *emancipation* whereby a sound is transformed from an emotional utterance into a denotative one.²⁰⁴

In *Ulysses*, Joyce's use of other texts, or language *fossils*, is to place them into contexts in which this *hiatus* is emphasized, the "emancipation" or resolution of the language of the text arising out of the collective force that a lexicon of such fragments creates. Since Joyce's lexicon is nearly infinitely rich, this resolution can only be transitory and

²⁰²Cassirer, *Language and Myth*, pp. 34-35.

²⁰³Otto Jespersen's *Language: Its Nature, Development, and Origin* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1931) remains one of the finest digests of linguistic history and an excellent primer to the fundamental questions of linguistic study. This late work of Jespersen's is particularly valuable in that it rests on the cusp between traditional philology and modern structuralist linguistics and phonology.

²⁰⁴*Language and Myth*, p. 35.

incomplete, a linguistic equivalent of the younger Joyce's peculiar use of *epiphany*.

The "outlines of western history and philosophy" mentioned by Ellmann are at a remove similar or even greater than that between *Ulysses* and its cognate "encyclopedias and dictionaries." And though enlightening when answered, the canon of philosophers Joyce was working with is a particularly involved question. Aristotle, Plato, Thomas Aquinas, St. Augustine, and even Nietzsche, are obvious points of departure. But their bearing on some of the questions of epistemology in *Ulysses* is more tangential than that of Locke or Hume, for example. Some very distinct philosophical influences on *Ulysses* also come from second-hand sources. For instance, the kind of philology penned by a figure like Chenevix Trench owes much of its plangency, and even aspects of its prose style, to Scottish empiricists already nine decades dead in Joyce's youth. Thomas Reid, Dugald Stewart, and Lord Monboddo, all friendly to the neo-Platonist philologist and universal grammarian James Harris, and all part of a philosophical discussion obsessed with discovering weaknesses in Locke and Berkeley, though not necessarily in Hume, formalized ontological assumptions that cleared the ground for Victorian ethnology, philology, Natural Science, and even for the Oxford English Dictionary. They were also notably responsible for the intellectual culture that Joyce reflects in the *boggling glass* of *Ulysses*.

This ground clearing in the later--second and third--generations of the Enlightenment, was first an isolation of linguistic singularities or *etyma*; and secondly, a comprehensive description of the wider prospect afforded by catalogued detail; a process always taking recourse to an *abgrund* of fact after the manner of the inductive method. As the natural philosopher John Frederick William Herschel (son of the Herschel who first glimpsed Uranus) later wrote in his essay, "Of the higher Degrees of Inductive Generalization, and of the Formation and Verification of Theories," in 1851:

As particular inductions and laws of the first degree of generality are obtained from the consideration of individual facts, so theories result from a consideration of these laws, and of the proximate causes brought into view in the previous process, regarded all together as constituting a new set of phenomena, the creatures of reason rather than sense, and each representing under general language innumerable particular facts. In raising these higher inductions, therefore, more scope is given to the exercise of pure reason than in slowly groping out our first results. The mind is more disencumbered of matter, and moves as it were in its own element.²⁰⁵

This distinction between reason and sense, or intellect and sense, was already an old one and had been central to David Hartley, Thomas Reid, and Dugald Stewart, among others, in the

²⁰⁵John Frederick William Herschel, *A Preliminary Discourse on the Study of Natural Philosophy*, new edition (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1851) p. 142. The planet Uranus, first seen on March 13, 1781 by William Herschel on a telescope of his own devising, was for some time called Herschel after its discoverer. John F. W. Herschel gained an eminence of his own in the nineteenth century sufficient to warrant a commonly made distinction in scientific scholarship between Herschel and "Herschel the Younger."

eighteenth century. Thomas Reid's philosophical analysis of the operations of the human mind in 1750s, like Kant's, inspired by David Hume, fully demonstrates tenor of the Scottish school's brand of empiricist prolegomena to a post-Lockean metaphysic:

For my own satisfaction, I entered into a serious examination of the principles upon which this sceptical system is built ; and was not a little surprised to find, that, it leans with its whole weight upon a hypothesis, which is ancient indeed, and hath been very generally received by philosophers, but of which I could find no solid proof. The hypothesis I mean is, That nothing is perceived but what is in the mind that perceives it: That we do not really perceive things that are external, but only certain images and pictures of them imprinted upon the mind, which are called *impressions* and *ideas*.²⁰⁶

That Joyce was sensitive to the abstruse philosophical niceties of this school is perhaps most striking in *Stephen Hero*. But it is also apparent in Joyce's mature work, and even as late as *Finnegans Wake*.

And that Berkeley and Hume were indeed on Joyce's mind during his time in Trieste can be seen in a passage in his essay "William Blake," written in 1912:

If we must accuse of madness every great genius who does not believe in the hurried materialism now in vogue with the happy fatuousness of a recent college graduate in the exact sciences, little remains for art and universal philosophy. Such a slaughter of the innocents would take in a large part of the peripatetic system, all of medieval metaphysics, a whole branch of the immense symmetrical edifice constructed by the Angelic

²⁰⁶Thomas Reid, *An Inquiry into the Human Mind, On the Principles of Common Sense*, fifth edition (Edinburgh: Bell & Bradfute, and William Creech, 1801), pp. vi-vii.

Doctor, St. Thomas Aquinas, Berkeley's idealism, and (what a combination) the scepticism that ends with Hume.²⁰⁷

Joyce's interest in John Stuart Mill is also interesting. Mill's father James, among the most notable of the students of Dugald Stewart, had carefully planned the younger Mill's education to develop those faculties which he felt would best prepare his son for a philosopher's life.²⁰⁸ Possibly Mill's single most influential achievement was his enunciation of the principle of induction in book iii of his *Logic*. In its careful setting down of the principle this work set the rule by which subsequent rationalist scientific practice would proceed and be judged. The scientific investigations that followed from a general rigour in the application of this standard, in various forms of inductive procedure, detected new principles and corollaries in subjects as various as entomology, phrenology, etymology and glottology, and led to an enormous dispersion and cross-referencing of scientific

²⁰⁷*Critical Writings*, p. 220.

²⁰⁸The story of J.S. Mill's education is a fascinating one. In a manner that we would now probably consider abusive, Mill's father set his child to intensive studies normally reserved for much older children. The boy began his study of Greek at the age of three and by his eighth year he had already read widely in the Greek classics. William Minto writes that Mill had also read "a great deal of history in English--Robertson's histories, Hume, Gibbon, Watson's *Philip II. and III*, Hooke's *Roman History*, Rollin's *Ancient History*, Langhorne's *Plutarch*, Burnet's *History of My Own Times*, thirty volumes of the *Annual Register*, Millar's *Historical View of the English Government*, Mosheim's *Ecclesiastical History*, M'Crue's *Knox*, and two histories of the Quakers" (*Encyclopædia Britannica*, ninth ed., v. xvi, p. 308).

information, the kind of information Joyce collected for the "Ithaca" episode.²⁰⁹

There are any number of reasons for the silence of most Joyce scholars about this aspect of Joyce's intellectual background. The generation of Pound, Eliot, Djuna Barnes, and Joyce were educated by a nineteenth-century intellectual culture, but it was a twentieth century generation obsessed with the new. Pound's dictum "make it new" represents an attitude that extended beyond aesthetic matters to matters of scholarship as well. The generations of critics that have studied *Ulysses* subsequently have also tended to reflect this posture. For instance, in the very first sentence of Ellmann's monumental biography *James Joyce*, he asserts that we "are still learning to be James Joyce's contemporaries."²¹⁰ That *Ulysses* is the starting point of the modern, and even the

²⁰⁹One interesting form of scientific activity that followed the paradigm shift centred in the rigorous general application of the principle of induction was the Diffusion of Useful Knowledge Society. This society, whose proceedings suspended in 1846, published its "Library" between 1827 and 1848 and "patronised the publication of the Penny Magazine and the Penny Cyclopædia (see Benjamin Vincent's *Haydn's Dictionary of Dates and Universal Information*, fourteenth edition, "Containing the History of the World to August, 1873 [London: E. Moxon, Son, & Co.]), p. 209. This society embodied the inductive principle in one of its most intellectually productive forms, and the society's members greatly influenced the development of the *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Established by Lord Brougham, the Society's members included William Tooke and Charles Wright. Providing books at a relatively obtainable price for the lower middle classes and, perhaps unwittingly, to the hedge schools, was probably the most substantial of the Society's achievements.

²¹⁰Ellmann, *James Joyce*, p. 3.

post-modern period has been the assumption of the vast majority of approaches to the novel. Discussions of Joyce's *linguistique* have also reflected this. Replying to Ellmann's remark that we are not yet Joyce's contemporaries, Robert Scholes remarks:

My response to this...is a very simple thesis. I believe that the most important thing we have learned in the past fifty years [since the publication of *Ulysses*] is a way of thinking called "structuralism," which is based on linguistics and cybernetics, and has profoundly altered our ontology and our epistemology.²¹¹

Scholes' handling of Joyce's linguistic sensibility proceeds to suggest that Joyce's "intellectual position...has much in common with Lévi-Strauss, or Piaget, or Bateson."²¹² And although he mentions Saussure, it is the structuralist, post-Lévi-Strauss Saussure, and not the continental philological colleague of Max Müller, A.J. Ellis, and W.W. Skeat, that Scholes has in mind. Scholes' only other references to intellectuals historically antecedent to Joyce are to Carlyle, Flaubert, and Dickens.

In Michael Brian's essay on Joyce's use of etymology in "Ivy Day in the Committee Room," he cites a remark of Derek Attridge which is useful towards explaining the stance of many critics of *Ulysses*:

...Saussure's theories repudiated etymology as

²¹¹Robert Scholes, "Ulysses: A Structuralist Perspective," from *Fifty Years: Ulysses*, ed. Thomas F. Staley (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1974), p. 161.

²¹²"Ulysses: A Structuralist Perspective," p. 163.

significant for an understanding of meaning. I think this is one of the reasons why those of us who were educated when Saussure's influence was at its height resist interpretations based on etymology.²¹³

The result of this resistance to etymology in Joyce studies has included marginalization not just of etymology in a narrow sense, but also of the philology (and its contiguous philosophical discourse) that formed a not inconsiderable part of Joyce's intellectual background. It might be suggested that it is possible to become Joyce's contemporary by looking backward as well as forward. *Ulysses* is a major transitional work in western history, but it comes at the end as well as at the beginning of an era.

That the Victorian scientists of language's own merits have been largely ignored since at least the second world war is perhaps irrelevant to discussions of their usefulness in the context of reconstructing the culture of courses out of which *Ulysses* arose. But since their obscurity is significant in assessing their impact on Joyce's sensibility, it should be noted that the charge of proto-fascism and racism has been levelled against many eminent philologists; most of them known to Joyce and intellectually respectable until at least the

²¹³Brian, Michael, "A Very Fine Piece of Writing: An Etymological, Dantean, and Gnostic Reading of Joyce's 'Ivy Day in the Committee Room'." *Style*, 25, No.3 (Fall, 1991), pp. 466-87. Other specific discussions of Joyce's relationship to Skeat and etymology are Hugh Kenner's in *The Pound Era* and Stephen Whittaker's "Joyce and Skeat," in *James Joyce Quarterly*, v.24 (2), Winter 1987, pp. 177-92.

early 1930s in circles well-withdrawn from Heidelberg. Post-war reservations about the achievements of Max Müller and the rest have arisen despite the fact that the first rank of philologists early pointed out that slavery was insupportable from a philosophical point of view and that the mappings of migrations of linguistic cultures were distinct from racial history.²¹⁴ In other words, most serious philologists recognized that linguistic continuity did not amount to racial continuity. Indo-European, Indo-Aryan, Indo-Germanic language clusters, though fascinating as residues of earlier forms of language, could only be bullied by misapprehension into giving data towards the racial biases now commonly cited against even the most eminent representatives of Victorian linguistic science. As Max Müller wrote in his *Biographies of Words and the Home of the Aryas*:

To me an ethnologist who speaks of Aryan race, Aryan blood, Aryan eyes and hair, is as great a sinner as a linguist who speaks of a dolicephalic dictionary or a brachycephalic grammar.²¹⁵

In any case, the ingenuous projects of an A.H. Sayce or Max Müller might be anthropologically blunt and graceless from the point of view of a fully enlightened cosmopolite of the late twentieth century. But they must be viewed, *anthologically* at least, as influential and relevant to the understanding of Joyce's work. Particularly since Joyce himself is not

²¹⁴See Chapter Two above.

²¹⁵F. Max Müller, *Biographies of Words and the Home of the Aryas* (London: Longmans & Co., 1888), pp. 120-1.

entirely free of the flaws which have been pointed out in the work of the Victorian scientists of language. For instance, Joyce writes that the ancient Irish "from the time of our ancestors...called themselves Aryans and Nobles."²¹⁶ And *Ulysses* is clearly of a stature in modern global culture that it casts light towards many prospects of *gematria* of Joyce's text even humbler than that of the science of language.

It may be that the unrelenting tone of scholastic sobriety affected the nineteenth century scientists of language, all of whom believed with varying degrees of intensity in the taking of Chemistry as a model for their discourse, were responsible in some measure for the highly-structured, even geometrical, intellectualism of Joyce's mature aesthetic. In order that the Poets not fall behind the professors of language and literature, Poetry, or pressurized prose, must reflect the advances made in understanding of the word. In a sense, the "word known to all men" is the first word, the primordial, Adam Kadmonic (perhaps Heva Kadmonic) and pre-Aryan, etymon. It is the first word of the *lexicon* of *Ulysses*, its *aleph* and *alpha*, but a word whose language is that of the "strandentwining cables of all flesh."

To make this point more precisely, it would be of use in any *prolegomena* to future studies of *Ulysses* source material to first sketch a map of the texts and individuals that would

²¹⁶Joyce, "Ireland, Land of Saints and Sages," *Critical Writings*, p. 154.

have figured most prominently in the reading in 1904 of a *filid* striving for an Oxford-calibre education in Dublin. Perhaps without money for books, but well-served by the National Library. It will not do to expect that Joyce would have been personally familiar with every text that will be recovered in such a cartographical effort, but that it would be surprising if he had missed very many of them. It is perhaps just that *Ulysses* should act as such a buoy, keeping afloat these works so as to keep them from being lost entirely. *Ulysses*, being an epic of the physical world, is a work that profited nearly as much from the labours of the scientists and their lexicographers as from the poets and the critics of literature.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

- Aarsleff, Hans. *From Locke to Saussure*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1982.
- . *The Study of Language in England, 1780-1860*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1967.
- Ackerman, Robert. *J.G. Frazer: His Life and Work*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Arnold, Bruce. *The Scandal of Ulysses*. London: Sinclair-Stevenson, 1991.
- Attridge, Derek, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to James Joyce*. Cambridge: Cambridge University press, 1990.
- Beckson, Karl. *Aesthetes and Decadents of the 1890's: An Anthology of British Poetry and Prose*. New York: Vintage Books, 1966.
- Benstock, Bernard. "Scandal in a Teacup." *The Irish Literary Supplement*, Vol. 11, No. 2 (Fall, 1992), p.9.
- Blamires, Harry. *The Bloomsday Book: A Guide Through Joyce's Ulysses*. London: University Paperbacks, 1966.
- Bloom, Harold. *Yeats*. London: Oxford U. Press, 1978.
- Brian, Michael. "A Very Fine Piece of Writing: An Etymological, Dantean, and Gnostic Reading of Joyce's 'Ivy Day in the Committee Room'." *Style*, 25, No. 3 (Fall, 1991), pp.466-87.
- Brown, Carole. "Laughing at the Linguists." *A Wake Newsletter; Studies in James Joyce's Finnegans Wake*, Vol. 2 (March, 1983), pp. 4-5.
- Budgen, Frank. *James Joyce and the Making of Ulysses*. Intro.. Hugh Kenner. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1967.
- Burgess, Anthony. *Re Joyce*. New York: Ballantine Books, 1965.

- Bynon, Theodora, and Palmer F.R., eds. *Studies in the History of Western Linguistics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986.
- Byrne, J.F. *Silent Years, An Autobiography with Memoirs of James Joyce and Our Ireland*. New York: Farrar, Strauss, and Young, 1953.
- Campbell, Joseph & Robinson, Henry Morton. *A Skeleton Key to Finnegans Wake*. London: Penguin, 1977.
- Carens, James F. *Surpassing Wit: Oliver St. John Gogarty*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1979.
- Cassirer, Ernst. *Language and Myth*, trans. Susanne K. Langer. New York: Dover Publications, 1946.
- . *The Philosophy of Symbolic Forms*, v.ii, trans. Ralph Manheim. New Haven: Yale U. Press, 1955.
- Cheyette, Bryan. "'Jewgreek is Jewgreek': The Disturbing Ambivalence of Joyce's Semitic Discourses in Ulysses." *Joyce Studies Annual*, Vol. 3 (Summer, 1992), pp. 32-56.
- Colum, Mary and Padraic. *Our Friend James Joyce*. New York: Doubleday and Company, 1958.
- Dowling, Linda. *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1986.
- Eco, Umberto. *The Aesthetics of Chaosmos: the Middle Ages of James Joyce*. Trans. Ellen J. Esrock. Oklahoma: University of Tulsa Press, 1982.
- Edel, Leon. *James Joyce: the Last Journey*. New York: The Gotham Book Mart, 1947.
- Ellman, Richard. *The Consciousness of Joyce*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- . *James Joyce, New and Revised Edition*. London: Oxford University Press, 1983.
- . *Yeats: the Man and the Masks, With a New Preface*. London: W.W.Norton & Co., 1979.
- . *Ulysses on the Liffey*. London: Faber and Faber, 1974.
- Foster, John Wilson. *Fictions of the Irish Literary Revival: A Changeling Art*, New York: Syracuse University Press, 1987.

- Gifford, Don. *Notes for Joyce*. New York: E.P. Dutton & Co., 1967.
- . *Ulysses Annotated*, Second Edition, Revised and Enlarged. With Robert J. Seidman. Berkely: University of California Press, 1989.
- Gillespie, Michael Patrick. *Inverted Volumes Improperly Arranged: James Joyce and His Trieste Library*. Michigan: UMI Research Press, 1983.
- . *Reading the Book of Himself*. Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1989.
- Gogarty, Oliver St. John. *As I was Going Down Sackville Street*. New York: Harcourt, Brace, & World, 1937.
- Goldberg, S.L. *The Classical Temper: A Study of James Joyce's Ulysses*. London: Chatto and Windus, 1963.
- Groden, Michael. *Ulysses in Progress*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1977.
- Hall, James and Steinmann, Martin, eds. *The Permanence of Yeats*. New York: Collier Books, 1961.
- Hanley, Miles. *Word Index to James Joyce's Ulysses*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1962.
- Henke, Suzette A. *James Joyce and the Politics of Desire*. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Herr, Cheryl. *Joyce's Anatomy of Culture*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1986.
- Hickey, Kieran. *Faithful Departed: The Dublin of James Joyce's Ulysses*, intro. Des Hickey. Dublin: Ward River 1982.
- Jeffares, A. Norman. *The Circus Animals*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1970.
- Joyce, James. *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*. New York: Penguin Books, 1977.
- . *Collected Poems*. New York: Viking Compass Books, 1969.
- . *Dubliners*. London: Granada Publishing, 1979.
- . *Exiles*. Intro.. Padraic Colum. London: New English Library Ltd., 1962.

- . *Finnigans Wake*. New York: Penguin Books, 1976.
- . *Giacomo Joyce*. Intro. Richard Ellman. London: Faber and Faber, 1983.
- . *Selected Joyce Letters*. Ed. Richard Ellman. New York: Viking Press, 1975.
- . *Stephen Hero*. New York: New Directions Books, 1963.
- . *Ulysses: the Manuscript and First Printings Compared*. Annotated Clive Driver. New York: Octagon Books, 1975.
- . *Ulysses* (in two volumes). Paris: The Odyssey Press, 1933.
- . *Ulysses*. London: The Bodley Head, 1967.
- . *Ulysses, A Critical and Synoptic Edition*, Ed. Hans Walter Gabler with Wolfhard Steppe and Claus Melchior. New York: Garland Publishing, 1986.
- . *The Critical Writings*. Ed. Ellsworth Mason and Richard Ellmann. New York: The Viking Press, 1968.
- Joyce, Stanislaus. *The Dublin Diary*. Ed. George Harris Healy. London: Faber and Faber, 1962.
- . *My Brother's Keeper*, Ed. Richard Ellman, preface by T.S. Eliot. London: Faber and Faber, 1958.
- Joyce, Stanislaus, and Mason, Ellsworth, eds. *The Early Joyce: the Book Reviews, 1902-1903*. U.S.A.: Norwood Editions, 1978.
- Kelly, John. "The Modernity of Henry Sweet." *Henry Sweet Society Newsletter*, Vol. 2 (November, 1984), pp. 3-9.
- Kenner, Hugh. *A Colder Eye*. New York: Penguin Books, 1983.
- . *Samuel Beckett: A Critical Study*. Berkely: U. of California Press, 1968.
- . *Ulysses*. London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1980.
- Kestner, Joseph A. "Before Ulysses: Victorian Iconography of the Odysseus Myth." *James Joyce Quarterly*, Vol. 28, No. 3 (Spring, 1991), pp.565-615.

- Land, Stephen K. *The Philosophy of Language in Britain: Major Theories from Hobbes to Thomas Reid*. New York: AMS Press, 1986.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude. *Myth and Meaning*. New York: Schocken Books, 1979.
- MacDougall, Hugh A. *Racial Myth in English History*. Montreal: Harvest House, 1982.
- Maddox, Brenda. *Nora: A Biography of Nora Joyce*. London: Minerva Press, 1990.
- MacMahon, M.R.C. "Henry Sweet's System of Shorthand," in *Towards a History of Phonetics*, eds. R.E. Asher and J.A. Henderson. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1981, pp. 265-281.
- Michels, James. "The Role of Language in Consciousness: A Structuralist Look at 'Proteus' in Ulysses." *Language and Style: An International Journal*, Vol. 15, No. 1 (Winter, 1982), pp. 23-32.
- O'Connor, Ulick, ed. *The Joyce We Knew*. Cork: The Mercier Press, 1967.
- , *Oliver St. John Gogarty*. London: Mandarin Paperbacks, 1990.
- O'Donnell, E.E. *The Annals of Dublin--Fair City*. Dublin: Wolfhound Press, 1987.
- Olender, Maurice. *The Languages of Paradise: Race, Religion, and Philology in the Nineteenth Century*, trans. Arthur Goldhammer. London: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- Pedersen, Holgen. *The Discovery of Language: Linguistic Science in the Nineteenth Century*, trans. John Webster Spargo, rpt. 1931, London: Indiana University Press, 1962.
- Pierce, David. *James Joyce's Ireland*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992.
- Poirier, Richard. "The Pater of Joyce and Eliot." In *Addressing Frank Kermode: Essays in Criticism and Interpretation*, eds. Margaret Tudeau-Clayton and Martin Warner. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1991, pp. 169-88.
- Poliakov, Leon. *The Aryan Myth*. New York: Basic Books, 1971.

- Pound, Ezra. *Selected Poems of Ezra Pound*. New York: New Directions Books, 1957.
- Power, Arthur. *Conversations with James Joyce*, Ed. Clive Hart. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- Probyn, Clive T. "James Harris to Parson Adams in Germany: Some Light on Fielding's Salisbury Set." *Philological Quarterly*, Vol. 64, No. 1 (Winter, 1985), pp. 130-139.
- Pugliatti, Paola. "The New *Ulysses* between Philology, Semiotics and Textual Genetics." *Dispositio: Revista Hispanica de Semiotica Literaria*, Vol. 12, No. 30-32, pp. 113-140.
- Rabaté, Jean-Michel. *James Joyce, Authorized Reader*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1991.
- Raleigh, Walter. *Shakespeare*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1907.
- Senn, Fritz. "History as Text in Reverse." *James Joyce Quarterly*, Vol. 28, No. 4 (Summer, 1991), pp. 765-75.
- Soderlind, Johannes. "James Joyce and the Linguistic Theories of His Time." *Orientalia Suecana*, Vol. 33-35 (1984-86), pp. 415-419.
- Spoof, Robert. "A Bibliography of Criticism on Joyce and History." *James Joyce Quarterly*, Vol. 28, No. 4, pp. 903-35.
- Staley, Thomas F., ed. *Fifty Years: Ulysses*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Steppe, Wolfhard. *A Handlist to James Joyce's Ulysses*, with Hans Walter Gabler. New York: Garland Publishing, 1986.
- Stock, Noel. *The Life of Ezra Pound*. London: Routledge, 1970.
- Svevo, Italo. *James Joyce*. Trans. Stanislaus Joyce. San Francisco: City Lights Books, 1969.
- Tallis, Raymond. *Not Saussure*. London: Macmillan Press, 1988.
- Titley, E. Brian. *Church, State, and the Control of Schooling in Ireland 1900-1944*. Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1983.
- Vendryes, J. *Language: A Linguistic Introduction to History*,

- trans. Paul Radin. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1925.
- Voelker, Joe and Arner, Thomas. "Bloomian Pantomime: J.A. Dowie and the 'Messianic Scene'." *James Joyce Quarterly*, Vol. 27, No. 1990.
- Weintraub, Stanley. *The Yellow Book: Quintessence of the Nineties*. New York: Anchor Books, 1964.
- Whittaker, Stephen. "Joyce and Skeat." *James Joyce Quarterly*, Vol. 24, No. 2 (Winter, 1987), pp. 177-92.
- Winwar, Francis. *Oscar Wilde and the Yellow Nineties*. New York: Harper and Bros., 1940.
- Yates, Frances A. *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990.
- Zacchi, Romana. "Discourse Types, Discourse Objects in *Ulysses*," in *Myriadminded Man: Jottings on Joyce*, ed. Rosa Maria Bosinelli (Bologna: Cooperative University Library), pp. 185-193.

Secondary Sources

- Alford Henry. *A Plea for the Queen's English, Stray Notes on Speaking and Spelling*, second edition (Tenth thousand). London: Strahan, 1864.
- Arnold, Matthew. *On the Study of Celtic Literature and Other Essays*. London: J.M. Dent & Sons, 1910.
- Astle, Thomas. *The Origin and Progress of Writing, As Well Hieroglyphic as Elementary, Illustrated by Engravings Taken from Marbles, Manuscripts, and Charters, Ancient and Modern: Also Some Account of the Origin and Progress of Printing*, second edition with additions. London: J. White, at Horace's Head, Fleet Street, 1803.
- Beattie, James. *Elements of Moral Science*, two volumes. Edinburgh: William Creech, 1790.
- Berkeley, George. *Selections from Berkely with an Introduction and Notes*, ed. Alexander Campbell Fraser. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1884.
- Blake, J.L. *General Biographical Dictionary, Comprising a Summary Account of the Most Distinguished Persons of All Ages, Nations, and Professions*. New York: J.P. Peaslee,

1835.

- Bloss, C. A. *Ancient History*, illustrated by coloured maps, and a chronological chart, for the use of families and schools, revised by John J. Anderson. New York: Clark & Maynard, 1869.
- Bourke, Ulick J. *The Aryan Origin of the Gaelic Race and Language. The Round Towers, the Brehon Law, Truth of the Pentateuch*, second edition. London: Longmans, Green, & Co., Paternoster Row, 1876.
- Boyle, Andrew, Ed. *The Everyman Encyclopædia*, twelve volumes, New York: E.P. Dutton & Co., 1913.
- Brandes, George. *William Shakespeare*. Trans. William Archer, Mary Morison, and Diana White. London: William Heinemann, 1898.
- . *Revolution and Reaction in Nineteenth Century French Literature*. New York: Russell & Russell [no date].
- Buck, Rev. Charles. *Theological Dictionary, Containing Definitions of all Religious Terms*. Philadelphia: J. & J. Woodward, 1847.
- Bullfinch, Thomas. *The Age of Fable, or Beauties of Mythology*, a New, Revised and Enlarged Edition. Ed. Rev. J. Loughran Scott, D.D. Philadelphia: David McKay, Publisher, 1898.
- Bunsen, Christian Charles Josias. *Outlines of the Philosophy of Universal History, Applied to Language and Religion*, two volumes. London: Longman, Brown, Green, and Longmans, 1854.
- Burnet, James [Lord Monboddo]. *Of the Origin and Process of Language*, six volumes. Edinburgh: A. Kincaid & W. Creech, 1773.
- Butler, William Archer. *Lectures on the History of Ancient Philosophy*, two vol. Philadelphia: Parry & McMillan, 1857.
- Cambray, Archbishop [François de Salignac de la Mothe Fénelon]. *The Adventures of Telemachus, the Son of Ulysses*, trans. Mr. Des Maizeaux, with "A Discourse of Epic Poetry, and the Excellence of the Poem of Telemachus" by Mr. [Andrew] Ramsay. London: R Ware, T. and T. Longman, et al., 1755.

- Carleton, William. *Traits and Stories of the Irish Peasantry*, four volumes. London: J.M.Dent and Co., 1896.
- Chambers, Robert. *Vestiges of the Natural History of Creation, With a Sequel*, published anonymously. New York: William Colyer, 1846.
- Chambers eds., William & Robert. *Chambers's Encyclopædia: A Dictionary of Universal Knowledge*, ten volumes. Edinburgh: W.& R. Chambers Ltd., 1902.
- Chambers, William & Robert. *Chambers's Information for the People: Sciences--Arts, &c.*, Edinburgh: William and Robert Chambers, 1848.
- . *Chambers's Information for the People: History--Geography, &c.*, Edinburgh: William and Robert Chambers, 1849.
- The Christian Brothers. *Irish History Reader*. Dublin: M.H. Gill & Son, no date (c. 1904).
- Clodd, Edward. *The Story of "Primitive" Man*. London: George Newnes, Ltd., 1905.
- Combe, George. *Lectures on Phrenology*, with notes, introductory essay, and an historical sketch by Andrew Boardman. New York: Edward Kearney, 1846.
- Courtney, W. L. *Life of John Stuart Mill*. London: Walter Scott, 1889.
- Crabb, George. *English Synonymes Explained, in Alphabetical Order; with Copious Illustrations and Examples Drawn from the Best Writers*, second edition, Greatly Enlarged and Corrected. London: Printed for Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy, 1818.
- Cruttwell, Rev. Clement. *The Universal Gazetteer; or, Geographical Dictionary: Containing a Description of all the Empires, Kingdoms, States, Provinces, Cities, Towns, Ports, Seas, Harbours, Rivers, Lakes, Mountains and Capes, in the Known World; with the Government, Customs, Manners, and Religion of the Inhabitants*, in three volumes. London: G.G. and J. Robinson, 1798.
- D., T., A.M., and D.B. Sullivan. *Speeches from the Dock, or Protests of Irish Patriotism*, forty-eighth edition. Dublin: M.H. Gill & Co., 1894.
- D'Annunzio, Gabriele. *The Flame of Life*. London: L.C. Page & Co., 1900.

- Davis, Andrew Jackson. *The Penetralia: Being Harmonial Answers to Important Questions*. Boston: William White & Company, 1868.
- Dawes, Richard. *Miscellanea Critica*, second edition. London: J. and J.J. Deighton, 1827.
- Dowden, Edward. *A History of French Literature*. New York: D. Appleton & Co., 1897.
- . "England in Shakespeare's Youth," "The Humor of Shakespeare," "Shakespeare's Portraiture of Women," pp.869--76, *Irish Literature*, sect. i, v.iii, Managing ed. Charles Welsh. New York(?): P.F. Collier & Son, 1904.
- . Southey, English Men of Letters series, ed. John Morley. London: Macmillan and Co., 1879.
- . "William Shakespeare," from *Chambers's Encyclopædia*, v.ix, pp.363-70. Edinburgh: Wm. & Robert Chambers Ltd., 1902.
- Dowson, Ernest. *The Poems and Prose of Ernest Dowson*, memoir by Arthur Symons. New York: Modern Library, 1938.
- Draper, John William. *A History of the Intellectual Development of Europe*, revised edition, two vol. London: George Bell and Sons, 1875.
- Duffy, Charles Gavan. *Young Ireland, A Fragment of Irish History*. London: T. Fisher Unwin, 1896.
- Eadie, John. *A Biblical Cyclopædia; or, Dictionary of Eastern Antiquities, Geography, Natural History, Sacred Annals and Biography, Theology, and Biblical Literature, Illustrative of the Old and New Testaments*. London: The Religious Tract Society, 1885.
- Earle, John. *The Philology of the English Tongue*, fifth ed., revised and augmented. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1892.
- Eglinton, John. *Anglo-Irish Essays*. New York: John Lane Company, 1918.
- . *A Memoir of AE: George William Russell*. London: Macmillan & Co., 1937.
- Emerson Jr., Edwin. *A History of the Nineteenth Century Year By Year*, Intro. Georg Gottfried Gervinus. New York: P.F. Collier & Son, 1902.

- Falloon, Rev. D. *History of Ireland, Civil and Ecclesiastical, from the Earliest Times till the Death of Henry II.* Montreal: John Lovell, 1863.
- Fenby, Thomas. *Dictionary of English Synonyms.* Liverpool: Edward Howell, 1864.
- Ferguson, Lady. *The Story of the Irish Before the Conquest, from the Mythical Period to the Invasion Under Strongbow.* Dublin: Sealy, Bryers, and Walker, 1903.
- Fifth Book of Lessons for the Use of Schools.* Dublin: Published by Direction of the Commissioners of National Education in Ireland, 1846.
- Fitzpatrick, Samuel A. Ossory. *Dublin: A Historical and Topographical Account of the City.* New York: E.P. Dutton & Co., 1907.
- Forbes, Duncan. *A Grammar of the Hindustani Language, in the Oriental and Roman Character, with Numerous Copper-plate Illustrations of the Persian and Devanagari Systems of Alphabetic Writing.* London: Wm. Allen & Co., 1846.
- Froude, James Anthony. *Science and Technology, Ancient and Modern.* Toronto: Rose-Bedford Publishing, 1879.
- Gems of the Cork Poets: Comprising the Complete Works of Callanan, Condon, Casey, Fitzgerald, and Cody.* Cork: Joseph Barter & Sons, c. 1865.
- Goldsmith, Rev. J. *A Geographical View of the World, Embracing the Manners, Customs and Pursuits of Every Nation; Founded on the Best Authorities, revised with an appendix by James G. Percival.* New York: Pratt, Woodford, & Co., 1849.
- Gregory, Lady Augusta. *Cuchulain of Murthemne: the Story of the Men of the Red Branch of Ulster Arranged and Put into English, with a preface by W.B. Yeats.* London: John Murry, 1902.
- Grey, Richard. *Gibson's Codex Abridg'd.* London: E. and R. Nutt Printers, 1735.
- Guthrie, William. *A New Geographical, Historical, and Commercial Grammar; And Present State of the Several Kingdoms of the World, fourteenth edition, corrected and considerably enlarged.* London: Charles Dilly, 1794.
- Gwynn, Stephen. *Today and Tomorrow in Ireland.* Dublin: Hodges, Figgis, & Co., 1903.

- Hare, Augustus and Julius. *Guesses at Truth, by Two Brothers*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1884.
- Harris, James. *Hermes; or A Philosophical Enquiry Concerning Universal Grammar*. London: W. Simprin & R. Marshall, 1816.
- . *Philosophical Arrangements*. London: Printed for John Novres, 1775.
- . *The Works of James Harris Esq. with an Account of his Life and Character by his Son the Earl of Malmesbury*. Oxford: Thomas Tegg, 1841.
- Herschel, John Frederick William. *A Preliminary Discourse on the Study of Natural Philosophy*, a new edition. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1851.
- Hirst, Francis W. *Adam Smith*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1904.
- Hornesley, Samuel, Lord Bishop of Rochester. *On the Prosodies of the Greek and Latin Languages*, ded. to Lord Thurlow. London: J. Robson, 1796.
- Horne Tooke, John. *The Diversions of Purley*, ed. Richard Taylor. London: Willian Tegg, 1860.
- Huxley, Thomas H. *Hume, with Helps to the Study of Berkeley*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1898.
- . *Man's Place in Nature, and Other Anthropological Essays*. New York: D. Appleton and Co., 1898.
- Hyde, Douglas. *Beside the Fire, a Collection of Irish Gaelic Folk Stories*, with additional notes by Alfred Nutt. London: David Nutt, 1910.
- . *Legends of Saints & Sinners*. Dublin: Talbot Press, 1902.
- Jespersen, Otto. *Language: Its Nature development and Origin*. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1931.
- Johnson, Samuel. *A Dictionary of the English Language: in which Words are Deduced from their Originals, Explained in Their Different Meanings, and Authorized by the Names of the Writers in Whose Works They are Found*, stereotype edition, improved by the addition of many thousand words from the best authorities. London: A. Wilson, 1812.

- Joyce, P.W. *A Smaller History of Ancient Ireland Treating of the Government, Military System, and Law; Religion Learning, and Art; Trades, Industries, and Commerce; Manners, Customs, and Domestic Life, of the Ancient Irish People.* Dublin: M.H. Gill & Son, Ltd., 1906.
- . *Atlas and Cyclopædia of Ireland.* New York: Murphy & McCarthy, 1905.
- . *English As We Speak It In Ireland,* second ed. Dublin: M.H. Gill & Son, 1910.
- . *The Story of Ancient Irish Civilization,* second ed. Dublin: The Educational Company of Ireland, 1908.
- Kettle, T.M., Ed. *Irish Orators and Oratory.* Dublin: The Talbot Press, 1914(?).
- Knight, Charles, Ed. *The English Cyclopædia, Biography, Volume V.* London: Bradbury, Evans, & Co., 1867.
- Knight, William. *Lord Monboddo and Some of His Contemporaries.* London: John Murry, 1900.
- Langhorne, John and William. *Plutarch's Lives.* London: [Unknown], 1768.
- Lancelot, Claude et. al. *Port Royal Greek Grammar: A New Method of Learning with Facility the Greek Tongue, translated from the French of the Messieurs De Port Royal, trans. Thomas Nugent, a new edition, revised and corrected.* London: F. Wingrave, Successor to Mr. Nourse, 1797.
- Latham, Robert Gordon. *A Handbook of the English Language, for the use of students of the universities and higher classes of schools.* New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1872.
- . *The English Language,* third edition, revised and greatly enlarged. London: Taylor, Walton, and Maberly, 1850.
- Locke, John. *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding, in four books, sixteenth edition, two volumes.* London: Printed for H. Woodfall, A. Millar, J. Beecroft, J. and F. Rivington, et al., 1768.
- Lounsbury, T.R. *History of the English Language.* New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1894.
- MacKay, Charles. *The Lost Beauties of the English Language,*

- fourth edition. London: Chatto & Windus, 1879.
- Maeterlinck, Maurice. *The Buried Temple*. Trans. Alfred Sutro. London: Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1902.
- Mahaffy, J.P. *Euripides*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1879.
- . *A History of Classical Greek Literature: The Poets, Dramatic, Epic, and Lyric*. 1890; rpt., 2 vols. London: Macmillan and Co., 1903.
- . *A History of Classical Greek Literature: The Prose Writers from Herodotus to Plato, and from Isocrates to Aristotle*. 1890; rpt. 2 vols. London: Macmillan and Co., 1904.
- . *A Survey of Greek Civilization*. New York: The Chatauqua-Century Press, 1896.
- . *Greek Life and Thought*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1887.
- Mahaffy, J.P. and Bernard, J.H. *Kant's Critical Philosophy for English Readers*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1889.
- Mangan, James Clarence. *The Poets and Poetry of Munster: A Selection of Irish Songs by the Poets of the Last Century with Poetical Translations by the Late Clarence Mangan, and the Original Music; Biographical Sketches of the Authors; and Irish Text Revised by W.M. Hennessey*. Dublin: James Duffy and Co., 1884.
- Mangnall, Richmall. *Historical and Miscellaneous Questions*. New York: D. Appleton & Company, 1860.
- Marsh, George Perkins. *Lectures on the English Language*, ed. William Smith LL.D. London: John Murry, 1862.
- . *Mediæval and Modern Saints and Miracles*, published anonymously. New York: Harper & Brothers, Publishers, 1876.
- Mather, J. Marshall. *Popular Studies of Nineteenth Century Poets*. London: Frederick Warne and Co., 1892.
- McCarthy, Justin, Ed. *Irish Literature*, in ten volumes, Maurice P. Egan, Lady Gregory, and Douglas Hyde, associate Ed.'s. Philadelphia: John D. Morris and Co., 1904.
- McCarthy, Michael J.F. *Five Years in Ireland, 1895-1900*,

- sixth ed. Dublin: Hodges, Figgis, & Co., 1901.
- McGee, J.A. *Glories of Ireland, Irish Priests, Poets, Patriots, Orators, Wits, and Soldiers*. Philadelphia [?]: Unknown, c. 1875.
- McWade, Robert M. *The Uncrowned King: The Life and Public Services of Hon. Charles Stewart Parnell*. Philadelphia: Edgewood Publishing, 1891.
- Meringer, Rudolf. *Indogermanische Sprachwissenschaft*. Leipzig: G.J. Göschen'sche Verlagshandlung, 1903.
- Miller, J.R. *The History of Great Britain, from the Death of George II to the Coronation of George IV, Designed as a Continuation of Hume and Smollett*. London: Jones & Company, 1825.
- Mitchell, John. *The Life and Times of Aodh O'Neil*. Dublin: James Duffy and Co., 1845.
- Moncalm, M. *The Origin of Thought and Speech*, trans. G. S. Whitmarsh. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, & Co., 1905.
- Moon, George Washington. *The Dean's English: A Criticism on the Dean of Canterbury's Essays on the Queen's English*, fourth edition. London: Hatchard and Co., 1865.
- Moore, Thomas. *Poetical Works of Thomas Moore, with Memoir and Notes*. New York: The American News Company, no date (c.1865).
- Moran, Patrick Francis. *Historical Sketch of the Persecutions Suffered by the Catholics of Ireland under the Rule of Cromwell and the Puritans*, original ed. reprinted. Callan: For the Sisters of Mercy, 1903.
- Morley, John. *Burke*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1894.
- Morley, Henry. *English Writers: An Attempt Towards A History of English Literature*, two volumes. London: Cassell & Co., 1887.
- Morris, Rev. Richard. *Specimens of Early English*, part I, second edition, preface by Rev. Prof. Skeat, preface to second edition by Walter W. Skeat and A.L. Mayhew.
- Morris, Richard, and Skeat, Walter W. *Specimens of Early English*, part II, with introduction, notes, and glossarial index, fourth edition. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1898.

- Müller, Max. *Collected Works, Last Essays, First Series*, London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1901.
- . *Last Essays, First Series*. London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1901.
- . *Lectures On the Science of Language Delivered At the Royal Institution of Great Britain in April, May, and June, 1861, first series*. New York: Charles Scribner, 1863.
- . *Lectures On the Science of Language Delivered At the Royal Institution of Great Britain in February, March, April, and May, 1863, second series*. New York: Charles Scribner, 1871.
- . *The Science of Thought*. London: Longmans, Green, And Co., 1887.
- . *My Autobiography*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1901.
- Murray, Lindley. *Murray's English Grammar*. York: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown, 1812.
- N., J.E. *Lessons in Gaelic, for the Use of Schools and Self-Instruction, No. 4*. Dublin: Gaelic Union Publications, 1881.
- O'Grady, Standish. *The Bog of Stars and Other Stories and Sketches of Elizabethan Ireland*. Ed. Sir Charles Gavan Duffy. Dublin: T. Fisher Unwin, 1893.
- The Origin and Progress of Language*, (Anon). London: Religious Tract Society, 1848.
- Pater, Walter. *Appreciations, with an Essay on Style*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1889.
- . *Miscellaneous Studies*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1895.
- . *Plato and Platonism*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1893.
- . *The Renaissance*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1893.
- Patrick, David, ed. *Chambers's Cyclopædia of English Literature*, v.iii. Edinburgh, 1906.
- Pinkerton, John. *Modern Geography: A Description of the*

- Empires, Kingdoms, States, and Colonies with the Oceans, Seas, and Isles in all Parts of the World including the Most Recent Discoveries, and Political Alterations, Digested on a New Plan*, new ed., greatly enlarged. London: T. Cadell and W. Davies, 1807.
- Pope, Alexander. *The Works of Alexander Pope Esq., Volume V. containing the Dunciad in Four Books*. London: Printed for A. Millar et al., 1766.
- Reid, Thomas. *An Inquiry Into the Human Mind On the Principles of Common Sense*, fifth edition. Edinburgh: Printed for Bell & Bradfute, and William Creech; and for T. Cadell jun. & W. Davies, 1801.
- Roget, John Lewis. *Thesaurus of English Words and Phrases Classified and Arranged so as to Facillitate the Expression of Ideas and Assist in Literary Composition*, new edition. Boston: DeWolf, Fiske, & Co., 1879.
- Rolleston, T.W. *Myths & Legends of the Celtic Race*. London: George G. Harrap & Co., 1911.
- Russell, George (A.E.). *Collected Poems*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1919.
- . *Homeward Songs By the Way*. Portland, Maine: Thomas B. Mosher, 1895.
- . *Imaginations and Reveries*. Dublin: Maunsel and Co., 1915.
- . *The National Being*. Dublin: Maunsel and Co., 1916.
- Sacher-Masoch Von Lemberg, Leopold Von. *Venus in Furs*. New York: The Sylvan Press, 1947.
- Saintsbury, George. *A Short History of English Literature*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1898.
- Sayce, Archibald Henry. *The Principles of Comparative Philology*. London: Trübner & Co., 1874.
- Schleicher, August. *A Compendium of the Comparative Grammar of the Indo-European, Sanskrit, Greek and Latin Languages*, trans. from the third German edition by Herbert Bendall, two vol. London: Trübner & Co., 1874.
- Selby-Bigge, L.A., ed. *British Moralists: Being Selections from Writers Pricipally of the Eighteenth Century*, with an introduction and analytical index, two vol. Oxford:

Clarendon Press, 1897.

Simcox, George Augustus. *A History of Latin Literature from Ennius to Boethius*. 2 vols. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1883.

Skeat, Walter W. *A Concise Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*. 1882; rpt. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978.

----- . *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1884.

----- . *English Dialects from the Eighth Century to the Present Day*. London: Cambridge University Press, 1911.

----- . *Principles of English Etymology*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1887.

Smith, Philip. *A Smaller History of England, from the Earliest Times to the Year 1878*, twenty-fifth edition. London: John Murry, 1886.

Smith, R.M. *Modern Geography: For the Use of Schools, Academies, etc. On a New Plan by Which the Acquisition of Geographical Knowledge is Greatly Facilitated*, illustrated with maps and numerous engravings. Philadelphia: Grigg and Elliot, 1849.

Smith, William. *A New Classical Dictionary of Biography, Mythology, and Geography*. London: John Murray, 1853.

Southey, Charles Cuthbert. *The Life and Correspondence of Robert Southey*. New York: Harper and Bros., 1851.

Spencer, Herbert. *The Philosophy of Style, Together with an Essay on Style*, by T.H. White, second edition, ed. with introduction and notes by Fred, N. Scott. Boston Allyn and Bacon, 1892.

----- . *The Principles of Sociology*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1897.

Stewart, Dugald. *Philosophical Essays*, third ed. Edinburgh: Archibald Constable and Co., 1818.

----- . *The Philosophy of the Active and Moral Powers of Man*, revised with omissions and additions by James Walker, tenth ed. Philadelphia: E.H. Butler & Co., 1870.

Stratmann, Francis Henry. *A Middle English Dictionary, containing words used by English writers from the twelfth*

to the fifteenth century, new edition, revised and enlarged by Henry Bradley. London: Oxford University Press, 1891.

- Sullivan, M.F. *Ireland of Today*, intro. Thomas Power O'Connor. Philadelphia: J.C. McCurdy & Co., 1881.
- Sullivan, Robert. *Geography Generalized; or, An Introduction to the Study of Geography on the Principles of Classification and Comparison, with Maps and Illustrations, and an Introduction to Astronomy*. Dublin: William Curry, Jun., and Company, 1846.
- Sweet, Henry. *A History of English Sounds from the Earliest Period*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1888.
- . *Anglo-Saxon Reader in Prose and Verse*, with grammatical introduction, notes and glossary, third ed., revised. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1881.
- . *The History of Language*. London: J.M. Dent & Co., 1900.
- . *A New English Grammar, Logical and Historical*, two vol. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1900.
- . *The Practical Study of Languages: a Guide for Teachers and Learners*. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1906.
- . *Second Middle English Primer, Extracts from Chaucer*, with grammar and glossary, second edition, revised. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1905.
- Symonds, John Addington. *Miscellanies*, edited with an introductory memoir by his son. London: Macmillan and Co., 1871.
- Symonds (jr.), John Addington. *Renaissance in Italy; The Catholic Reaction*, in two parts. London: John Murry, 1886.
- Symons, Arthur. *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*. Intro. Richard Ellman. New York: E.P. Dutton and Co., 1958.
- . *Studies in Prose and Verse*. London: J.M. Dent & Co., 1904 [?].
- Taylor, Isaac. *Words and Places, or Etymological Illustrations of History, Ethnology and Geography*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1893.

- Tennyson, Alfred Lord. *Locksley Hall and Other Poems*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1895.
- Thébaud S.J., Rev. Aug. J. *The Irish Race in the Past and Present*. New York: Peter F. Collier, 1879.
- A Tour of Connaught: Comprising Sketches of Clonmacnoise, Joyce Country, and Achill, by the Author of "Sketches in Ireland."* Dublin: William Curry Jun., and Co., 1839.
- Trench, Richard Chenevix. *A Select Glossary of English Words Used Formerly in Senses Different from their Present*, second edition, revised. London: John W. Parker and Son, 1859.
- . *English Past and Present, Five Lectures*, fifth ed., revised. London: Parker, Son, and Bourn, West Strand, 1862.
- . *Notes On the Miracles of Our Lord*, second American edition. New York: D. Appleton & Co., 1870.
- . *On the English Language Past and Present*, new edition, revised and enlarged. New York: Redfield, 1859.
- . *On the Study of Words*, thirteenth edition, revised and enlarged. London: Macmillan and Co., 1869.
- . *On the Study of Words*, twenty-first edition, revised by the Rev. A.L. Mayhew, with added footnotes and corrected etymologies. New York: Macmillan, 1891.
- . *Synonyms of the New Testament*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1865.
- Tooke, John Horne. *The Diversions of Purley*, ed. Richard Taylor. London: William Tegg, 1860.
- Vincent, Benjamin. *Haydn's Dictionary of Dates and Universal Information, Relating to All Ages and Nations*, fourteenth edition, containing the history of the world to August, 1873. London: E. Moxon, Son, & Company, 1873.
- Ward, Stephen H. *The Natural History of Mankind*. London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1860(?).
- Whatley, Richard. *Elements of Logic: Comprising the Substance of the Article in the Encyclopædia Metropolitana, with additions, &c.* New York: Harper & Brothers, 1854.
- . *Elements of Rhetoric: Comprising an Analysis of the Laws of Moral Evidence and of Persuasion, with Rules*

for *Argumentative Composition and Elocution*. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1859.

Whitaker, Joseph. *An Almanack for the Year of Our Lord 1904, Containing an Account of the Astronomical and Other Phenomena, a Vast Amount of Information Respecting the Government Finances Population Commerce and General Statistics of the British Empire throughout the World, with Some Notice of Other Countries &c. &c.* London: Whitaker's Almanack, 1904.

White, H. *Elements of Universal History, On a New and Systematic Plan, from the Earliest Times to the Treaty of Vienna*. Philadelphia: Jas. B. Smith & Co., 1859.

White, Richard Grant. *Every-day English, a sequel to "Words and Their Uses."* Boston: Houghton, Mifflin, and Co., 1890.

----- . *Words and Their Uses*, new ed. New York: Sheldon & Co., 1890.

Whitney, William Dwight. *The Life and Growth of Language*, fifth ed. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, & Co., 1885.

Wilkins, John. *Mercury: Or the Secret and Swift Messenger, Foundations of Semiotics*, with intro. Brigitte Asbach-Schnitker, rpt. 1707 ed. Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing, 1984.

Yeats, William Butler. *The Autobiography of William Butler Yeats*. New York: Collier Books, 1965.

----- . *Essays and Introductions*. New York: Collier Books, 1968.

----- . *Letters to the New Island*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1934.

----- . *Yeats's Poems*. Ed. and annotated by A. Norman Jeffares, appendix by Warwick Gould. London: Macmillan and Co., 1989.

Appendix

A short chronology of some important events in the history of English and comparative philology before the publication of the *Telemachiad*.

c.350 B.C.E.--Aristotle (384-322) writes *De Interpretatione*.

c.120 B.C.E.--Aristarchus of Samothrace (160-88) writes his *Critique of Homeric Poems* at Alexandria.

c.100 B.C.E.--Dionysius Thrax, author of *He Grammatike Tekhne*, goes to Rome from Alexandria.

c.80 B.C.E.--At Rome, Marcus Terentius Varro (116-28) begins *De lingua latina*, eventually to run to twenty-five volumes.

117 C.E.--Apollonius Dyscolus "the ill-tempered" of Alexandria born. Before his death in 116, he writes *de Constructione Orationis* or *de Ordinatione sive Constructione Dictionum*, *de Pronomine*, *de Conjunctionibus*, and *de Adverbiis*, amongst other works that are now lost. Called by Priscian the "greatest of all grammarians." Apollonius holds that the soul's disposition is peculiarly explained by verbs, a notion that suggesting both Adamic or "natural" language and Universal Grammar.

c.350 C.E.--At Rome, Aelius Donatus writes *Ars Grammatica*.

389 C.E.--Ammonius Grammaticus, author of *On the Differences of Words of Like Signification*, leaves Alexandria for Constantinople after the suppression of heathen temples.

c.450 C.E.--At Constantinople, Priscianus Caesariensis (c.468-562) writes *Institutiones Grammaticae*.

c.560 C.E.--At Seville, Isidorus Hispalensis (c.590-636) writes *Originum seu Etymologiarum Libri*.

820--At Constantinople, Photius (820-891) completes his *Lexicon* and the *Myriobyblon*.

915--The University of Cambridge founded.

c.950--Suidas writes his *Lexicon* and compiles his encyclopaedic dictionary.

991--The "figures in Arithmatick are brought into Europe by the Saracens from Arabia. Letters of the alphabet were hitherto used." from the Guthrie Grammar, 1794.

1070--Musical notes invented.

1470--Priscian's *Grammaticae* printed.

1545--Konrad von Gesner's (c.1516-1558) *Bibiloteca Universalis*, a bibliography of all known Greek, Latin, and Hebrew books, published.

1555--Gesner's *Mithradates* published in Switzerland.

1564--Joseph Scaliger (1540-1609) writes *Conjectanea in Varronem*.

1587--Sanctius's (Francisco Sanchez, 1523-1601) *Minerva* published in Salamanca.

1590--Friedrich Sylburg's (1536-1596) Frankfurt edition of Appolonius's *de Constructione*.

1592--Hieronymus Megiser's *Specimens of Forty Languages* published in Stuttgart.

1597--Bonaventura Vulcanius cites twenty-two instances of agreement between Persian and Gothic.

1605--Francis Bacon's (1561-1626) *The Advancement of Learning* published.

1606--Scaliger's *Thesaurus temporum* published.

1641--John Wilkins's (1614-1672) *Mercury: Or the Secret and Swift Messenger* published.

1660--Claude Lancelot (dates unknown) and Antoine Arnauld's (1612-1694) *Grammaire générale et raisonnée* (the Port-Royal grammar) published.

1663--Pedr Syv's (1631-1702) *Remarks on the Cimbric [Danish] Language* published.

1665--Franciscus Junius's (1589-1677) edition of *The Codex Argenteus*, Ulfilas's Gothic Gospels, published.

1690--John Locke's (1632-1704) *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding* published.

1710--Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz's (1646-1716) *Miscellanea Berolinensia* published.

1721--Nathaniel Bailey's (d. 1742) *An Universal Etymological English Dictionary* published.

1730--Bailey supervises publication of the *Dictionarium Britannicum*.

1739--Lodewyk Kaspar Valckenaer (1715-1785) edition of Ammonius's *On the Differences of Words*.

1744--James Harris's (1709-1780) *Three Treatises: I. Concerning Art: A Dialogue. II. Concerning Music, Painting, and Poetry. III Concerning Happiness* published. Lord Monboddo praises the dialogue on art as "the best specimen of the dividing, or diæretic manner, as the ancients called it, that is to be found in any modern book with which [he is] acquainted."

1746--Étienne Condillac's (1715-1780) *Essai sur l'origine des connoissances humaines* published.

1747--Dr. Samuel Johnson's (1709-84) *Plan of an English Dictionary* published.

1751--James Harris's *Hermes, or a philosophical inquiry concerning universal grammar* published. In his own grammar, Bishop Lowth praises Hermes as "the most beautiful example of analysis that has been exhibited since the days of Aristotle."

1755--Dr. Johnson's *Dictionary of the English Language* published.

1761--Adam Smith's (1723-1790) *Dissertation on the Origin of Languages* published.

1765--Charles de Brosses's (1709-1777) *Traité de la formation mécanique des langues, et des principes physiques de l'étymologie* published in two volumes.

1768--Publication in two volumes of the sixteenth edition of Locke's *Essay*.

1768-71--First Edition of *Encyclopædia Britannica*, edited by William Smellie (1740-1795), and conceived by Colin Macfarquhar (dates unknown) and Andrew Bell (1753-1832), published in Edinburgh.

1769--Johan Ihre's (1707-1780) *Glossarium Suio-Gothicum* published.

1770--James Beattie's (1735-1803) *Essay on Truth* published.

1771--William Jones's (1746-1794) *Grammar of the Persian*

Language published.

1771--Johann Gottfried Herder's (1744-1803) *Abhandlung über den Ursprung der Sprache* published.

1773-92--James Burnett (1714-1799), Lord Monboddo's *The Origin and Progress of Language* published in six volumes.

1775--James Harris's *Philosophical Arrangements* published.

1781--James Harris's *Philological Inquiries* published.

1783--James Beattie's *Dissertations Moral and Critical* published.

1784--Thomas Astle's (d. 1803) *The Origin and Progress of Writing* published.

1785--Herder's preface to *On the Origin and Progress of Language* published with the German translation of Monboddo's work.

1786--John Horne Tooke's (1736-1812) first part of *Epea Pteroenta, or the Diversions of Purley* published.

1792--Dugald Stewart's (1753-1828) *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind* published.

1794--D. Jenisch wins Berlin Academy prize for his essay *Philosophisch-Kritische vergleichung und würdigung von vierzehn ältern und neuern sprachen Europens*.

1796--Jenisch prize-essay published.

1797-1803--Isidore of Seville's *Works* published in the seven-volume Arevallo edition at Rome.

1799--Karl Wilhelm von Humboldt's (1767-1835) *Ästhetische Versuche* published.

1805--Second part of Horne Tooke's *Diversions* published.

1806--Posthumous publication of Johann Christoph Adelung's (1732-1806) *Mithradates*.

1808--Friedrich von Schlegel's (1772-1829) *Über die Sprache und Weisheit der Indier* published in Heidelberg.

1810--Dugald Stewart's *Philosophical Essays* published.

1816--George Crabb's *English Synonymes Explained* published.

1816--Franz Bopp's (1791-1867) *A System of Conjugation of Sanscrit compared with those of Greek, Latin, Persian, etc.* published at Frankfort.

1817--First edition of Rasmus Rask's (1787-1832) *A Grammar of the Anglo-Saxon Tongue* published, in Danish, in Copenhagen.

1817--Becker's Berlin edition of Appolonius's *de Constructione*.

1817--Publication of last volume of Adelung's *Mithradates*.

1819--Jakob Grimm (1785-1863) publishes *Deutsche Grammatik*.

1819--Horace Hayman Wilson's (1786-1860) *Dictionary, Sanskrit and English* published.

1819-20--Krehl edition of Priscian's *Grammaticae*.

1822--Schäfer edition of Ammonius's *On the Differences of Words*.

1822-25--Walter Whiter's *Etymologicon Universale or Universal Etymological Dictionary* published.

1822-40--Grimm's *Grammatik* entirely recast.

1823--Posthumous publication of Alexander Murray's *A History of the European Languages ; or, Researches into the Affinities of the Teutonic, Greek, Celtic, Sclavonic, and Indian Nations*.

1826--Rasmus Rask's *Orthography* published.

1830--Benjamin Thorpe English translation of Rask's *Grammar of the Anglo-Saxon Tongue, With a Praxis* published at Copenhagen.

1828--Carl O. Müller's (1797-1840) *Die Etrusker* published.

1833-52--Bopp's *Comparative Grammar* published.

1836--Posthumous publication of K. W. von Humboldt's *On the Variety of Structure in Human Speech*, an introduction to his study of the Kawi language of Java.

1836-44--Frierich Diez's (1794-1876) *Grammatik der romanischen Sprachen* published.

1839-43--H.L. Ahrens's (1808-1881) *De Graecae linguae dialectis* published.

1841--The Earl of Malmesbury publishes his father's collected writings, *The Works of James Harris*.

1841-52--Publication in seven volumes of K. W. von Humboldt's *Collected Works*.

1842--Edwin Guest (1800-80) founds the Philological Society with Thomas Arnold, A.P. Stanley, F.J. Furnivall, R.C. Trench, and J.A.H. Murry.

1844--Alexander John Ellis (1814-1890) publishes *Phonetics: A Familiar System of the Principles of that Science*.

1851--Dublin-born Richard Chenevix Trench's (1807-1886) *The Study of Words* published.

1853--Johann Kaspar Zeuss's (1806-1856) *Grammatica Celtica* published in Leipzig.

1853--Diez's *Etymologische Wörterbuch der romanischen Sprachen* published.

1854--The German Baron Christian Charles Josias Bunsen's (1791-1860) two-volume *Outlines of the Philosophy of Universal History, Applied to Language and Religion* published in London.

1854-8--Dugald Stewart's *Works*, edited by W. Hamilton, published in eleven volumes.

1854--Publication of Anders Uppström (1806-1865) edition of the *Codex Argenteus*.

1855--Trench's *English, Past and Present* published.

1857--Trench reads "On Some Deficiencies in Our English Dictionaries" to the Philological Society. The paper forms the basis for the principles that will govern the compilation of the Oxford English Dictionary.

1858--Georg Curtius's (1820-1885) *Grundzüge der griechischen Etymologie* published.

1859-67--Hensleigh Wedgwood's (dates unknown) *Dictionary of English Etymology* published.

1859-76--August Pott's (1802-1887) ten volume *Etymologische Forschungen* published.

1860--Richard Taylor's annotated edition of Horne Tooke's *Diversions* published.

1860--George Perkins Marsh's (1801-82) *Lectures on the English Language* published.

1861-2--August Schleicher's (1821-1868) *Compendium der*

vergleichenden Grammatik der indogermanischen Sprachen published.

1862--John William Draper's (1811-82) *A History of the Intellectual Development of Europe*, in two volumes, published.

1862--Robert Gordon Latham's (1812-1888) *Elements of Comparative Philology* published.

1862--G.P. Marsh's *The Origin and History of the English Language*, edited by cyclopædist William Smith (1813-93), published.

1863--Friedrich Max Müller's (1823-1900) first series of *Lectures on the Science of Language*, delivered in 1860 at Oxford, published.

1864--Max Müller's *Second Series of Lectures on the Science of Language*, delivered at Oxford in 1863, published.

1864--Frederick J. Furnivall (1825-1910) founds Early English Text Society.

1866--Out of exasperation at the bewildering variety of conjectures, the Société de Linguistique de Paris bans all communication on the subject of the origin of language.

1868--Walter William Skeat's (1835-1912) *A Mæso-Gothic Glossary* published.

1868--August Fick's (1833-1916) *Wörterbuch der indogermanischen Grundsprache in ihrem Bestande vor der Völkertrennung* published in Göttingen.

1868--Wilhelm Scherer's (1841-1886) *Zur Geschichte der deutschen Sprache* published.

1869--Theodor Benfey's (1809-1881) *Geschichte der Sprachwissenschaft* published.

1869-1889--A.J. Ellis's (1814-1890) *On Early English Pronunciation*, in five volumes, the last of these five entitled *The Existing Phonology of English Dialects* published.

1872--Johannes Schmidt's (1843-1901) *Die Verwandtschaftsverhältnisse der indogermanischen Sprachen* published.

1874--Sayce's *The Principles of Comparative Philology* published.

1875-89--Ninth edition (the so-called "scholar's edition") of

the *Encyclopædia Britannica*, under the general editorship of Thomas Spencer Baynes (1823-1887), published.

1876--Henry Sweet's (1845-1912) *An Anglo-Saxon Reader* published.

1877--Sweet's *A Handbook of Phonetics* published.

1878--Ferdinand de Saussure's (1857-1913) *Mémoire sur le système primitif des voyelles dans les langues indo-européennes* (dated 1879) published.

1878--Karl Brugmann (1849-1919) and Hermann Osthoff (1847-1909) begin publication of *Morphologische Untersuchungen*.

1879--Skeat's first edition of *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language* published.

1880--Archibald Sayce (b. 1846) publishes his *Introduction to the Science of Language*.

1882--Skeat's *A Concise Etymological Dictionary of the English Language* published.

1884--Publication of Uhlig's Leipzig edition of Dionysius's *Grammatike*.

1886--Brugmann's *Grundriss der vergleichenden Grammatik der indogermanischen Sprachen* published.

1887--Skeat's first series ("the Native Element") of his *Principles of English Etymology* published.

1888--Henry Sweet's *A History of English Sounds* published.

1892--John Earle's *The Philology of the English Tongue* published.

1894--Otto Jespersen's (1860-1943) *Progress in Language* published.

1899--Sweet's *The Practical Study of Languages* published.

1900--Sweet's *The History of Language* published.

For a more conventional view of the subject of the history of the science of language on its own terms, Holger Pedersen's *The Discovery of Language* (trans. J.W. Spargo), the two studies by Hans Aarsleff, and his introduction to K.W. von Humboldt, Stephen K. Land's *The Philosophy of Language in Britain*, or perhaps better, Bunsen's *Outlines of the*

Philosophy of Universal History,²¹⁷ may be consulted. This appendix outlines a limited temporal mythology of discourse held in common, to an extent, by figures as remote from one another in time as Locke and Berkeley are from Müller and Joyce; figures united by having entered a discourse that centred around a core of considerations of language and mind.

The approach to these questions taken by this culture, or society, of discourse has probably had a much greater impact on subsequent Western intellectual history than did any contemporary advance in physics, or in the so-called hard sciences in general, save perhaps that of gaining of control over electricity.

²¹⁷See particularly "The Nature and Principle of Development in Language," *Philosophy of Universal History*, p.35-49 and *passim*.