UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHERN QUEENSLAND

EVALUATING THE CONTRIBUTION OF COMMUNITY INFORMATICS TO RURAL DEVELOPMENT: THE CASE OF MALAYSIA'S RURAL INTERNET CENTRES

A dissertation submitted by MARHAINI MOHD NOOR

For the award of Doctor of Philosophy

2012

ABSTRACT

Telecentres in Malaysia were a policy response from the Malaysia government to address the digital divide between urban and rural communities. In the first instance, the main goal of the rural internet centres (RIC) program was to enhance rural access to information and communications technologies (ICTs) and to build human capital in ICT knowledge and skills in rural communities. The main goal of RIC program was extended over time and the RICs in each community were seen as a means for developing economic activity in rural communities through local entrepreneurship. The adoption of ICTs in rural regions may further enhance the effectiveness of RICs to the local communities. Social and economic benefits have been identified as important outcomes (perceived benefits). The objective of this study is to evaluate the perceived affects of RIC program on quality of rural life (QoRL). This study assesses the perceptions of stakeholders (RIC end-users and program managers) in regard to the impact of the RIC program on human capital of rural communities in Malaysia. The research questions were translated into three specific testable hypotheses. Despite that, the main research problem is, "Can rural internet centres be an effective tool in bridging the digital divide for rural communities and improving rural quality of life?." Thus this study is not evaluating if the divide is closing, however, it is evaluating if people perceived there is an improvement in their digital skills due to their use of RIC services.

This study is an evaluation of the RIC program in Malaysia, using a program logic framework to identify and evaluate inputs, outputs and outcomes of RIC program from multiple key stakeholder perspectives. Community informatics, end-user computing and social capital provided the theoretical lens for the program logic evaluation of the RIC program. An online survey of RIC users across 42 RICs was the main data collection method used to determine RIC users' perceptions and level of satisfaction with the services provided by RICs. And furthermore whether there is evidence of outcomes from the use of RIC services which could result in enhanced human capital. The main data collection phase was supplemented by a series of interviews with program managers and RIC managers from different regions and locations, some non-users and members of local RIC management committees. Finally some general observations about how RICs were operating were made during site visits to 11 RICs conduct interviews. The results of statistical analysis of the quantitative survey data and narratives determined from a content analysis of the interviews (qualitative) along with some RIC site observations (qualitative) are presented and discussed. The program logic framework of (1) inputs and outputs and (2) outcomes was used to guide these analyses in order to evaluate the RIC program. The quantitative and qualitative data collected for each stage of program logic framework were analysed, interpreted and triangulated in determining the key findings of this study.

There is generally strong support for the benefits of the RICs in building human capital, including improving job prospects and business opportunities for rural communities in Malaysia. The key findings also show that RICs are strongly associated with enhanced social capital although the causation effects may run both ways. The results are used to propose a model of the effects of community informatics, noting that many of the potential benefits may be intangible. Theoretically, this study has shown that the RIC improved the individual community QoRL with the use of ICT applications and services. Meanwhile, this thesis developed a comprehensive theoretical framework drawn from community informatics, end user computing and social capital theories to evaluate the RIC program. This is a new empirical contribution to the growing literature on the relationship between community informatics and social capital. The majority previous empirical studies on social capital have been conducted in sociology, whereas there is dearth of empirical studies which have evaluated the contribution of community informatics and social capital in telecentre programs; especially in developing countries such as Malaysia. Furthermore, there are few if any previous studies have evaluated an entire telecentre program such as the RIC program using program logic theory.

The research gap is whether the people perceive that there is an improvement in human and social capital as a result of the RICs. Thus these contribute to perceived effectiveness of the RIC program and improve in digital knowledge and skills in rural Malaysia. Hence, the contribution to practice is to build social capital policy while emphasise more on human capital approach in rural Malaysia. With the improvement on RIC program in Malaysia, i.e.; inputs, outputs and outcomes, this will leads to improvement on ICT for rural development. Therefore, this study makes a contribution primarily to the field of community informatics, drawing concepts from social capital, economic development, quality of rural life and rural development with reference to local rural communities in Malaysia.

CERTIFICATION OF THESIS

I certify that the ideas, analysis, results and conclusions reported in this thesis are entirely my own effort, except where otherwise acknowledged. This work has not previously been submitted for a degree or diploma in any university. To the best of my knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the thesis itself.

Signature of Candidate

ENDORSEMENT

Signature of Supervisor

Signature of Supervisor

Date

Date

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

بيئ م التقا الجواري

ALLAH S.W.T, syukur Alhamdullilah...praise Allah for giving me the strength and thoughts to complete this thesis.

Deepest thanks to all who have taught, support, advice, encourage and guidance me throughout my 4 years at University of Southern Queensland (USQ). Specially dedicated to my principal supervisor; Professor Dr Geoff Cockfield who always encouraged and guided me with patience and most importantly as a friend. He guide and advice all the way through from the beginning until the end of this dissertation. Thank you so much Prof Geoff; my work would not have been possible without your support, advice and guidance. I value your guidance. My second special thanks to my associate supervisor, Dr Michael Lane who provided critical support and informed comments at different stages of my study. His instant availability helped me move through obstacles in the whole thesis. His expertise serves as a role model for me and continues to influence me in my future academic development. I value his guidance. Dr Michael, thank you; without your support and guidance I could not finished this thesis.

The Ministry of Information, Communication and Culture (MICC), the Warisan Global (WG) Sdn. Bhd., the RIC managers, the RIC management committees, the RIC non-users and the local communities involved in this study; thank you very much. I thank each of them for their patience, kindness, valuable information and time. All of the participants/respondents were most helpful. I really appreciate the warm welcome and support during my site visits at the 11 RICs. The managers are very much helpful and assist whenever needed. Through the interviews, visits and observations made at the RICs, I value all the helped and assistance made by this multiple stakeholders. My sincere appreciation and many thanks to Associate Professor Dr Abdul Raufu Ambali for his support and assistance in proofread my final draft chapters. Special thanks to Associate Professor Dr NorAziah Alias for her motivation and support at the final stage of my study. Not forgetting my proofreaders; Helen Whittle and Chris O'Neil, thank you to both of you. To all my friends and administrative staffs at USQ; especially Michelle Griffith, Liz Whatson and Sophia Imran, many thanks to your efficient support, valuable assistance, sincere thoughts and motivation, thanks to all.

I would like to thank the following organizing committees for accepting papers based on this research for presentation and publishing:

 The ICT for development (ICTd) conference, 13 December 2010 at Royal Holloway University of London, UK: "Assessing the impacts of Rural Internet Centre programs on quality of life in rural areas of Malaysia" presented the paper and the electronic conference proceeding available at DiVA-portal on the Kalstad University website: <u>http://kau.diva-portal.org</u> ISBN: 978-91-7063-369-0 Co-Authors: Professor Dr Geoff Cockfield and Dr Michael Lane. This paper had won the Best Paper Award on IPID Postgraduate Strand.

- 2) The book chapter (open access) 2012, Book Title: "ICT and Social Change: The Impact of Public Access to Computers and the Internet" Francisco J. Proenza (ed.)-Chapter Title: "Impact of Public Access to computers and the Internet on the connectedness of Rural Malaysians" Authors: Associate Professor Dr NorAziah Alias, Marhaini Mohd Noor, Dr Francisco J. Proenza, Associate Professor Haziah Jamaluddin, Izaham Shah Ismail and Sulaiman Hashim. Publisher: International Development Research Centre (IDRC),-CRDI, Canada.
- 3) Recently submitted an article title: "Assessing significant role of community informatics to rural internet centre in Malaysia" The Journal of Community Informatics (JoCI), 15 October 2012. Acknowledged the submission and in review process by the Editor: Professor Michael Gurstein. Manuscript URL: http://ci-journal.net/index.php/ciej/author/submission/988 Co-Author: Associate Professor Dr Abdul Raufu Ambali.

Azrul Nizar A.Manaf, my husband, and our children, Azmin Hariz, Adam Zarif, NurDini Hana and Amin Zharfan were my home support team, tolerant of my time on the computer. I thank them for being such patient company. I am deeply indebted to my husband, who encouraged me to pursue my PhD; he gave me support, encouragement and assistance. Thank you 'Abang'. My profound thanks to my mum, dad, sisters and brother for their moral support and encouragement. Finally, I wish to thank the Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE), Malaysia and University of Technology MARA (UiTM) for providing me with full scholarship, without which this thesis would have been impossible.

Table of Contents

CERTIFIC ACKNOW LIST OF A	CTCT OF DISSERTATION CATION OF DISSERTATION VLEDGEMENTS ABBREVIATIONS CT	iii iv .xiii
	R 1: INTRODUCTION	
1.0 Backg	round	1
1.1 The Po	licy Problem	3
1.1.1	Public policy related to community e-centres and telecentres	5
1.2 Researce	ch Problem	6
1.2.1	Research objectives	7
1.2.2	General research question	8
1.2.3	Hypotheses	8
1.3 Contrib	outions of this Study	10
1.4 Study I	Regions and Sites	10
1.5 Program	m Objectives and Management	11
1.5.1	MICC settings	12
1.5.2	Malaysia Post Berhad	12
1.5.3	Warisan Global Sdn Bhd	13
1.6 Method	dology	13
1.7 Limitat	tions/Delimitations of the Study	14
1.8 Thesis	Structure	15
1.8.1	Definition of core terms	15
1.9 Conclu	isions	18
CHAPTE	R 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	20
2.0 Introdu	action	20
2.1 Econor	nic Development	21
	The Role of Information and Communications Technology (ICT) in opment of human and social capital	23
2.1.2	Rural under-development and development	24
2.2 Social	Capital	26
2.2.1	Contribution of social capital to economic development	30
2.2.2	Social capital in rural communities	31
2.3 Comm	unity Informatics	34
2.3.1	Role of Community Informatics in building social capital	36
2.3.2	Telecentres in rural areas	38
2.4 Comm	unity Informatics in Practice	42

2.5 RIC Pr	ogram Logic Framework– Conceptual Model	44
2.5.1	Program goal and objectives	44
2.5.2	Research Questions and Hypotheses	46
2.6 Conclu	sions	52
CHAPTE	R 3: METHODOLOGY	55
3.0 Introdu	action	55
3.1 Malays	sia's ICT policy and RICs	56
3.2 Justific	ation for research philosophy and epistemology adopted in this study	59
3.2.1	Research paradigm and philosophy	59
3.2.2	Research Epistemology	61
3.3 Resear	ch Approach and Design	62
3.4 RIC Si	tes Population and Sample	64
3.5 Phase (One - Online Survey Design of RIC Users	68
3.5.1	Quantitative sample selection	68
3.5.2	Questionnaire development and design	69
3.6 Phase	Γwo – RIC Program Interviews and Site Observation Design	72
3.6.1	Qualitative sample selection procedure	74
3.6.2	Administration of the interviews and observations	75
3.7 Data A	nalysis	77
3.7.1	Descriptive and inferential statistics/analysis	78
3.7.2	Reliability and validity measurement scales	80
3.7.3	Hypotheses testing	83
3.8 Ethical	Considerations	85
3.9 Conclu	sions	85
	R 4: FINDINGS ON RIC PROGRAM GOAL, INPUTS AND	
	S	
	iction	
	purces	
-	m managers' perceptions of the RIC program goal	
-	of the RIC program	
4.3.1	Key stakeholders in the RIC program	
4.3.2	Technology and physical environment	
	RIC Users' Characteristics	
	s of the RIC program	
	Perceptions of usage by the key stakeholders in the RIC program	
4.4.2	ICT-based services	
4.4.3	Social Entrepreneurs Club	125

4.5 Conclusions	129
CHAPTER 5: PERCEPTIONS OF RIC OUTCOMES	131
5.0 Introduction	131
5.1 Intermediate Outcomes of the RIC Program	133
5.1.1 Perceptions of Computer Skills at RICs	133
5.1.2 Perceptions of Employment Opportunities at RICs	136
5.1.3 Perceptions of Business Opportunities at RICs	138
5.2 Ultimate Outcomes of the RIC Program	141
5.2.1 Perceptions of Social Capital at RICs	142
5.2.2 Economic Benefits of RICs	152
5.2.3 Quality of Rural Life at RICs	156
5.3 Perceived Benefits at RICs	161
5.4 Overall Perceptions of Services & Satisfaction	166
5.4.1 Perceptions of Satisfaction with Performance of the RIC Program	170
5.5 Conclusions	171
CHAPTER 6: DISCUSSION OF DATA ANALYSIS FINDINGS	173
6.0 Introduction	173
6.1 RIC program goal	175
6.2 Perceptions of inputs into RIC program	175
6.2.1 RIC key stakeholder input (people)	177
6.2.2 RIC infrastructure	178
6.2.3 RIC input impediments	180
6.3 Perceptions of activities and program (outputs)	181
6.3.1 RIC Usage	183
6.3.2 RIC ICT-based services	183
6.3.3 RIC Social Entrepreneurs Club	186
6.4 Perceptions of outcomes in the RIC program	188
6.4.1 RIC intermediate outcomes	189
6.4.2 RIC ultimate outcomes	192
6.5 Potential improvements of RIC program	196
6.5.1 People's perceptions of RIC input improvements	196
6.5.2 People's satisfaction and improvements of RIC outputs	199
6.5.3 People's satisfaction and improvements of RIC outcomes	199
6.6 Conclusions	200
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION & IMPLICATIONS	205
7.0 Introduction	205
7.1 Summary of this study	205

7.1.1	Statement of the problem	
7.1.2	Review of the methodology	
7.1.3	Summary of key findings – RIC program	
7.1.4	Developing RICs-program logic components model	
7.2 Contrib	outions to theory	
7.3 Contrib	outions for policy and practice	
7.4 Limitat	ions	
7.5 Further	research and recommendations	
REFEREN	NCES	

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: The RIC theoretical framework – hypotheses testing	7
Figure 1.2: RICs in every region/state	
Figure 2.1: Literature review sequence	20
Figure 2.2: Association of economic development and social capital	31
Figure 2.3: The interrelated concepts applied in this study	32
Figure 2.4: The RIC conceptual framework – program logic model	50
Figure 3.1: RIC methodology workflow	55
Figure 3.2: Thrusts and strategies of NSF-BDD (Azizah Hamzah, 2008)	58
Figure 3.3: Multi-stakeholder partnership at RIC	59
Figure 3.4: RIC program logic methodological flow	63
Figure 3.5: Matrix of research methods for data collection in this study	64
Figure 3.6: Distribution of states and regions in Malaysia	65
Figure 3.7: Malaysian rural population by age group & regions 2010 (adapted fro	om
Department of Statistics Malaysia 2010)	66
Figure 3.8: Purpose and type of research question related to the type of statistic	
applied in this study (adapted from Leech et al. (2008))	79
Figure 4.1: RIC program logic and chapter overview	
Figure 4.2: RIC users' perception on RIC Internet speed and reliability (n=199)	
Figure 4.3: Average Internet usage per week by RIC users	
Figure 4.4: Additional family members who use the RIC	
Figure 4.5: Types of training	
Figure 4.6: SEC awareness among RIC users	
Figure 4.7: RIC Model 1	. 130
Figure 5.1: RIC program logic	
Figure 5.2: Proportion of RIC users' perception knowledge & skills, employmen	
opportunity and income gained by age	
Figure 5.3: Perceived benefits (SEC) of SEC member	
Figure 5.4: Types of contacts made at RIC	
Figure 5.5: RIC users' services satisfaction	. 167

Figure 5.6: RIC model 2	172
Figure 6.1: RIC program logic conceptual model	174
Figure 7.1: Structure of conclusions and implications overview	205
Figure 7.2: RIC program logic components model	213

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Summary of major critical elements in the top-down approach (adapte	ed
from ESCAP, 2006)	
Table 1.2: Constructs measured	9
Table 1.3: Summary of research program	14
Table 2.1: Theories of capital (adapted from Lin (2001))	24
Table 2.2: Factors contributing to rural poverty	26
Table 2.3: The geographical distribution of rural ICT projects (adapted from Dig	ital
Dividend Report (2004))	
Table 2.4: Summary of impediments on inputs and outputs, and expected	
intermediate and ultimate outcomes from previous studies	
Table 2.5: Key literature based on main variables from the program logic framew	
	53
Table 3.1: Characteristics of study sites sample	67
Table 3.2: Methods used in quantitative approach	
Table 3.3: Measurement instruments	
Table 3.4: Summary of the questionnaire content (adapted from Lane (1998))	
Table 3.5: Methods used in qualitative approach	
Table 3.6: Summary of 11 RIC locations selected for interviews and site visits	
Table 3.7: Summary of interview locations	
Table 3.8: Reliability analysis and factor analysis for social capital	
Table 3.9: Variables for hypotheses testing	
Table 3.10: Test of significance (adapted Leech et al. (2008))	
Table 4.1: Summary of survey responses	88
Table 4.2: Summary of interview responses	89
Table 4.3: Summary of program managers' perspectives on the RIC program goa	al. 90
Table 4.4: RIC managers' perceptions of the program goal	
Table 4.5: Summary of RIC inputs	
Table 4.6: Key stakeholders' relationships	95
Table 4.7: RIC Internet speed and reliability	98
Table 4.8: RIC Internet speed and reliability	
Table 4.9: Summary of main issues identified in relation to technology	
Table 4.10: Summary of main issues identified in relation to physical environme	
Table 4.11: RIC respondent users' gender	
Table 4.12: RIC respondent users' age groups	
Table 4.13: RIC users' ethnicity	
Table 4.14: Cross-tabulation between RIC users' highest level of education and	
monthly income (%)	. 106

Table 4.15: RIC users' employment status	107
	107
Table 4.16: Comparison between age and location where Internet is accessed (a. 100)	107
(n=199)	107
Table 4.17: Purpose of use (information and communication functions) by age	111
groups	
Table 4.18: Purpose of use (information and communication functions) by house	
income	
Table 4.19: Purpose (information and communication functions) by gender	
Table 4.20: Purpose of use (information and communication functions) by education	ation
level	113
Table 4.21: Purpose of use (information and communication functions) by	
employment status	114
Table 4.22: Purpose of use (information and communication functions) by RIC	
regions	115
Table 4.23: Most frequently used RIC services	
Table 4.24: Summary of main issues identified by RIC managers in relation to	
communication pathways	122
Table 4.25: Summary of main issues identified by MICC director, WG officer a	
RIC management committee members in relation to communication pathways	
Table 4.26: Summary of SEC (Entrepreneurial Program)	
Table 4.20: Summary of SEC (Entrepreneuriar Frogram) Table 4.27: Proportion of Users' SEC awareness and SEC members	
Table 4.27. I Toportion of Osers' SEC awareness and SEC members	127
Table 5.1, DIC users' dimensions on using computers	122
Table 5.1: RIC users' dimensions on using computers	
Table 5.2: Computer/Internet competency level	
Table 5.3: RIC users' perceptions of employment opportunity, income, knowled	
and skills obtained from use of RIC	
Table 5.4: Regularly met online friends or contacts	
Table 5.5: LCA by age groups	
Table 5.6: LCA by highest level of education	
Table 5.7: LCA by income groups	
Table 5.8: LCA by employment status groups	
Table 5.9: RIC regions and social capital mean	
Table 5.10: Comparative mean scores of SC	149
Table 5.11: Correlations between improved education (Ed), income (I) and	
employment (E)	
Table 5.12: Regression model summary – Economic Benefits (DV-Employment	:) 153
Table 5.13: Summary of main outcomes identified in relation to economic benef	
·	
Table 5.14: RIC managers' perceptions of contributions to community informati	ics.
EB & SC	
Table 5.15: Summary of main issues regarding digital divide	
Table 5.16: Perceived benefits - Social capital and economic benefits contribution	
Tuble 3.10. Teleerved benefits Social capital and economic benefits contribute	
Table 5.17: Correlation	
Table 5.17. Correlation Table 5.18: Regression model summary – Perceived benefits (Hi)	
Table 5.19: Summary of RIC users' perceptions on RIC perceived benefits	
Table 5.20: Summary of main issues identified in relation to services and satisfa	
Table 5.21: Regression model summary – Services satisfaction (Hii)	
Table 5.22: Overall satisfaction with the RIC program	170

Table 6.1: Summary on RIC program logic data triangulation	
Table 6.2: Summary on RIC program logic data triangulation	
Table 6.3: Summary on RIC program logic data triangulation	
Table 6.4: Summary on RIC program logic data triangulation	
Table 6.5: Hypotheses testing results	
Table 7.1: Main themes from the data analysis findings	

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1: Secondary data on rural/urban household use of Internet/ by state	s227
APPENDIX 2: Districts of Malaysia (Secondary data)	239
APPENDIX 3: Regions descriptive statistics	242
APPENDIX 4: Online questionnaire	243
APPENDIX 5: Interviews and site visits schedule at MICC, WG and RICs	
APPENDIX 6: Interview questions for program managers and non-users/ex-user	s260
APPENDIX 7: General observations from 11 RIC site visits	. 264
APPENDIX 8: Issues on site visits observation	. 269
APPENDIX 9: Ethical clearance approval letter	. 271
APPENDIX 10: Permission letter to conduct research at RIC/PID from Ministry	of
Information, Communications and Culture Malaysia	. 272
APPENDIX 11: Data analysis on RIC Inputs	. 274
APPENDIX 12: Data Analysis information and communication functions vs	
Demographic characteristics using Tukey Tests	. 277
APPENDIX 13: Perceptions of Employment Opportunities & type of contacts m	ade
	288
APPENDIX 14: Data analysis on factor analysis and individual social capital	
components	. 289
APPENDIX 15: Data analysis on LCA vs. Demographic characteristics using on	e-
way ANOVA and Tukey tests	. 303
APPENDIX 16: Data analysis on multiple regression and assumptions	. 311
APPENDIX 17: Photos during site visits at 11 RICs (2010)	

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

D (777	
BCT	Basic Computer Training
BDD	Bridging Digital Divide
BOC	Bonding Capital
BRC	Bridging Capital
CI	Community Informatics
DST	Digital Story Telling
E	Employment
EB	Economic Benefits
Ed	Education
ED	Economic Development
EG	Electronic Government
Email	Electronic Mail
EP	Electronic Procurement
EPU	Economic Planning Unit
ES	Electronic Services
EUC	End User Computing
FB	Face Book
GEW	Global Entrepreneurship Week
I	Income
IC	Information Centres
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
IT	Information Technology
ITU	International Telecommunication Union
LCA	
MEWC	Local Community Association
MICC	Ministry of Energy, Water & Communication
	Ministry of Information, Communication & Culture
MMDG	Malaysian Millennium Development Goals
MP MO-L	Malaysian Plan
MQoL	Malaysian Quality of Life
MRRD	Ministry of Rural Regional Development
MSP	Multi Stakeholder Partnership
PB	Perceived Benefits
PID	"Pusat Internet Desa"
PMR	Certificate of Lower Secondary Examination
PPPs	Public-Private Partnerships
QoRL	Quality of Rural Life
RIC	Rural Internet Centre
SC	Social Capital
SEC	Social Entrepreneurs Club
SMI	Small and Medium Industry
SPM	Certificate of Malaysian Education Examination
SS	Services Satisfaction
STPM	Certificate of Malaysian Higher Education Examination
UK	United Kingdom
US	United States
USP	Universal Service Provider
WG	Warisan Global Sdn. Bhd.
YM	YahooMessenger