



University of Southern Queensland
Faculty of Engineering & Surveying

**Initial Development of Ice Crystal Ice Accretion at
Conditions Related to Turbofan Operation at High
Altitude**

A thesis submitted by

Khalid Hashim Saleh

in fulfilment of the requirements of

Doctor of Philosophy

2013

Abstract

Ice accretion on external surfaces of aircraft is a widely recognised problem, but more recently identified problem of ice crystal ice accretion within aero-engine compressors during flight through deep convection systems also represents a significant hazard and forms the motivation for the present work. The experimental studies targeting solid phase ice accretion are very limited due to the high wind tunnel facilities operational cost and safety concern for in-flight icing testing, which requires flight through severe weather conditions.

In this study, a small wind tunnel was established to simulate some of the conditions relevant to aircraft engine icing from ice crystals and explore the application of a model for the initiation of ice accretion. In this facility, liquid nitrogen was used to freeze liquid water droplets generated using an ultrasonic nozzle. The liquid nitrogen section reduces the droplet temperature to less than -40°C and maintains this temperature for sufficient time to ensure complete freezing occurs. The particle diameters were controlled by the air and water pressure delivered to the ultrasonic nozzle and particle diameters around $50\ \mu\text{m}$ were generated. The ice water content was also measured experimentally and it was found to be around $0.42\ \text{g}/\text{m}^3$. A temperature controller was developed to keep the specimen surface temperature essentially constant and four specimen surface temperatures were tested: -9 , -5 , 0 , and 5°C .

The wind tunnel duct had a diameter of $70\ \text{mm}$ and was operated at the relatively low flow speed of $6.5\ \text{m}/\text{s}$. A cylinder with diameter of $10\ \text{mm}$ and flat plate surface with length of $3.6\ \text{cm}$ and a leading edge diameter of $3\ \text{mm}$ were used as the test specimens. A microscope video camera was used to visualise a small area on the specimen surface of

9×9 mm and record the initiation of the accretion process. The experimental data were analysed using image processing techniques, and different locations around the centre line of the test specimens in the vicinity of the stagnation point were investigated. Two regions with different roughness were used on both specimens with an average roughness (R_a) for the smooth side of 0.5 μm and 1.0 μm for the rough side, but no effect of the surface roughness was observed in the experimental accretion results for these conditions.

The mathematical model for accretion initiation which was developed considers the aerodynamic, adhesive, and friction force affecting the particles in contact with the surface. The model indicates that ice accretion can occur at subfreezing conditions in the stagnation region and this effect was observed in the present experiments. The model also indicates that accretion is less likely to occur as the temperature increases due to reductions in the coefficient of friction. Such an effect was also observed in the experiments: accretion occurred most rapidly in the -9°C case but virtually no accretion was registered in the 0°C and 5°C cases.

Although the mathematical model suggested the accretion could also initiate on a flat plate with a laminar boundary layer, this was not observed experimentally. The lack of the accretion in the laminar boundary layer configuration is attributed to the finite leading edge diameter on which substantial ice accretion was observed. The rate of accretion development on the leading edge of the flat plate was comparable to that on the large diameter cylinder specimen which is not consistent with the trends suggested by the mathematical model.

The new wind tunnel duct conditions can be controlled and solid ice particles of a uniform shape and known size distribution can be produced. The development of the new facility and the force-balance model has established useful tools which can be further enhanced in future ice accretion studies.

Associated Publications

The following publications were produced during the period of candidature:

Saleh, Khalid H. and Buttsworth, David R. and Yusaf, Talal , “Development of a small icing wind tunnel for simulating the initial stages of solid phase ice accretion”, *17th Australasian Fluid Mechanics Conference*, 5-9 Dec 2010, Auckland, New Zealand.

Buttsworth, DR, Saleh, KH & Yusaf, T, “Discrete particle simulation for the initial stages of ice accretion in aircraft engines: initial model development”, *3rd International Conference on Energy and Environment (ICEE)*, 7-8 December 2009, Malacca, Malaysia.

Certification of Dissertation

I certify that the ideas, designs and experimental work, results, analyses and conclusions set out in this dissertation are entirely my own effort, except where otherwise indicated and acknowledged.

I further certify that the work is original and has not been previously submitted for assessment in any other course or institution, except where specifically stated.

KHALID HASHIM SALEH

W0079456

Signature of Candidate

Date

ENDORSEMENT

Signature of Supervisor/s

Date

Acknowledgments

First and foremost I would like to extend my sincere appreciation and gratitude to my supervisor Prof. David Buttsworth for his support and guidance throughout my Ph.D. study. I am also grateful to him for giving me the opportunity to work on this research project which has helped me to broaden my knowledge and develop new skills.

I acknowledge the contribution of technical staff of the University of Southern Queensland for their contributions to the work resulting in this thesis. I would like to thank FoES Associated Dean (Research) A/Prof. Armando Apan and his assistant Mrs Juanita Ryan for their support. Also my deep appreciation goes to Ms Angela Windsor and Mrs Kelly Baron for helping me through my language course and for proof reading of this thesis.

I would like also to thank all of my friends and the Iraqi students at USQ especially Ahmed Al-Sabawy for his encouragement and thoughtful opinion in my personal and study issues.

Finally, I am very grateful to my father and my mother for all their efforts to raise me. Thanks to my wife for taking care of me and my son Anas through my study.

KHALID HASHIM SALEH

University of Southern Queensland

2013

Contents

Abstract	i
Associated Publications	iii
Acknowledgments	vii
List of Figures	xi
List of Tables	xii
Notation	xiv
Acronyms & Abbreviations	xvi
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Research Aim	5
1.3 Thesis Objectives	5
1.4 Scope of the Dissertation	6

Chapter 2 Literature Review	9
2.1 Introduction	9
2.2 Ice Crystal Engine Icing Meteorological Conditions	10
2.3 Engine Icing Physics	13
2.4 Engine Icing Experimental Work	15
2.5 Engine Icing Simulation	17
2.6 Icing Wind Tunnels	21
2.7 Conclusion	24
Chapter 3 Mathematical Model	27
3.1 Introduction	27
3.2 Ice Coefficient of Friction	27
3.2.1 Literature Review	27
3.2.2 Application of Ice Friction Results to Current Study	31
3.3 Adhesion Force of Ice Particles	33
3.3.1 Literature Review	33
3.3.2 Adhesion Force Formula	36
3.3.3 Application of Adhesion Results to Current Study	37
3.3.4 Saffman Force	40
3.3.5 Electrostatic Adhesion Force	40
3.4 Aerodynamic Forces	41

CONTENTS	xi
3.4.1 Stagnation Point	41
3.4.2 Flat Plate	46
3.5 Results	49
3.5.1 Ice Adhesion and Friction Force Results - Two Limiting Cases .	49
3.5.2 Friction and Aerodynamic Results	51
3.6 Discussion	57
3.7 Conclusion	59
Chapter 4 Apparatus Design and Characterisation	60
4.1 Introduction	60
4.2 Experimental Apparatus Dimensions and Operation	61
4.3 Thermal Conditions for Liquid Freezing	64
4.4 Characterisation Tests	66
4.4.1 Droplet and Ice Particles Sizes	67
4.4.2 Apparatus Temperature Distribution	68
4.4.3 Wind Tunnel	70
4.4.4 Cylinder and Flat Plate Specimen	72
4.4.5 Temperature Controller	77
4.5 Illustration Accretion Results	78
4.6 Conclusion	79

Chapter 5	Measurement of Ice Water Content	82
5.1	Introduction	82
5.2	Experimental Setup	82
5.3	Ice Water Content	84
5.4	Threshold Effects	88
5.5	Capture Efficiency	91
5.6	Conclusion	94
Chapter 6	Ice Accretion on Cylindrical Specimen	96
6.1	Introduction	96
6.2	Motivation and Experiment Design	96
6.3	Testing Methods	99
6.4	Analysis methods	102
6.5	Cold Surface Temperatures	104
6.5.1	Surface Temperature -9°C	105
6.5.2	Surface Temperature -5°C	109
6.6	Warm Surface Temperatures	113
6.6.1	Surface Temperature 0°C	113
6.6.2	Surface Temperature 5°C	117
6.7	Test Variability	121
6.8	Accretion Development	121

6.9	Discussion	125
6.9.1	Subzero Ice Accretion	125
6.9.2	Role of Surface Temperature	126
6.10	Conclusion	127
Chapter 7 Ice Accretion on Flat Plate Specimen		128
7.1	Introduction	128
7.2	Motivation and Experiment Design	128
7.3	Testing Methods	132
7.4	Analysis Methods	134
7.5	Cold Surface Temperatures	134
7.5.1	Surface Temperature -9°C	134
7.5.2	Surface Temperature -5°C	140
7.6	Warm Surface Temperatures	143
7.6.1	Surface Temperature 0°C	144
7.6.2	Surface Temperature 5°C	147
7.7	Post-Test Ice Removal	152
7.8	Test Variability	153
7.9	Accretion Development	153
7.10	Flat Plate Stagnation Region	157
7.11	Discussion	157

7.12 Conclusion	159
Chapter 8 Conclusion	160
8.1 Motivation	160
8.2 Approach	161
8.3 Model Outcomes and Questions Arising	163
8.4 Experiments Performed and Knowledge Generated	164
8.5 Limitations and Further Work	165
References	168
Appendix A First Experimental Apparatus Arrangement	178
A.1 Introduction	178
A.2 Arrangement	178
A.3 Nozzles Droplet Size Distribution	182
Appendix B Particle Image Velocimetry	184
B.1 Introduction	184
Appendix C Hardware and Software Specification	187
C.1 LabView System	187
C.2 Ultrasonic Nozzle Data sheet	190
Appendix D Cylindrical Specimen Tests Results	191

D.1	Introduction	191
D.2	Surface Temperature -9°C	193
D.3	Surface Temperature -5°C	199
D.4	Surface Temperature 0°C	209
D.5	Surface Temperature 5°C	219
 Appendix E Flat Plate Specimen Tests Results		229
E.1	Introduction	229
E.2	Surface Temperature -9°C	231
E.3	Surface Temperature -5°C	241
E.4	Surface Temperature 0°C	249
E.5	Surface Temperature 5°C	259

List of Figures

1.1	Photograph showing ice deposits on surface of a marine vessel and spray which can contribute to ice accretion. (Photo courtesy of the Fishing Vessel Safety Division of the USCG.)	2
1.2	Photograph of power transmission line and structure with ice deposits. (Photo courtesy of the Landsnet (Transmission lines).)	3
1.3	Photograph of ice deposits on the wing of the NASA Twin Otter. (http://www.wearherjackwilliams.com)	3
2.1	Illustration of a typical turbo fan engine system and potential ice accretion areas. Reproduced from Mason, Strapp and Chow (2006).	10
2.2	Plan view of NASA IRT. Reproduced from Irvine, Kevdzija, Sheldon and Spera (2001).	21
2.3	Illustration of Cox Icing Research Laboratory Wind Tunnel. Reproduced from Al-Khalil and Salamon (1998).	22
2.4	CIRA icing wind tunnel layout. Reproduced from Bellucci (2007).	23
2.5	Illustration of Boeing Research Aerodynamic Icing Tunnel. Reproduced from Chintamani, Delcarpio and Langmeyer (1997)	24

3.1	Temperature dependence of coefficient of friction of ice as a function of sliding velocity, data from Kennedy, Schulson and Jones (2000).	32
3.2	Temperature dependence of coefficient of friction of ice as a function of sliding velocity, results from Colbeck (1988).	32
3.3	Temperature dependence of coefficient of friction of fresh water granular ice as a function of sliding velocity, combined results from Kennedy et al. (2000) and Colbeck (1988) including a velocity offset of 100 times on the data of Kennedy et al. (2000).	33
3.4	Illustration of the liquid bridge between a sphere and a flat plate.	36
3.5	Adhesion force variation with particle diameter and contact angle (ϕ) at constant liquid bridge volume fraction of 0.05.	38
3.6	Adhesion force variation with liquid bridge volume fraction and contact angle (ϕ) at a constant particle diameter of $50 \mu\text{m}$	39
3.7	Illustration showing stagnation point flow field.	41
3.8	Illustration of a particle in the vicinity of the stagnation point.	42
3.9	The average flow velocity to which a particle in the stagnation region boundary layer is exposed for different ice particle diameters and free stream speeds.	44
3.10	Variation of aerodynamic force on particles in the stagnation region boundary layer with the particle diameter and free stream speeds.	45
3.11	Illustration of a particle in the flat plate boundary layer.	46
3.12	The average flow velocity to which a particle in a flat plate boundary layer is exposed for different ice particle diameters and free stream speeds.	48
3.13	Variation of aerodynamic force on particles in a flat plate boundary layer with particle diameter and different free stream speeds.	48

3.14	Illustration of the forces applied to the ice particle.	49
3.15	Friction force relation with the particle diameter for $\mu = 0.6$, $u_p = 0$ m/s, $x = d_p$, volume fraction of 0.05, and different contact angles.	50
3.16	Friction force relation with the particle diameter for $\mu = 0.07$, $u_p =$ 0 m/s, $x = d_p$, volume fraction of 0.05, and different contact angles. . . .	50
3.17	Drag force and the friction force variation with particle diameter for $\mu = 0.07$, $x = d_p$, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05, at specified contact angles, and free stream speeds.	51
3.18	Drag force and the friction force variation with particle diameter for $\mu = 0.07$, $x = 1$ mm, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05, at specified contact angles, and free stream speeds.	52
3.19	Drag force and the friction force variation with particle diameter for $\mu = 0.6$, $x = 1$ mm, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05, at specified contact angles, and free stream speeds.	53
3.20	The relation between ice particle size which can accumulate on the cylinder surface and distance from the stagnation point for $\mu = 0.07$, $u_p = 0$ m/s, volume fraction of 0.05, $\phi = \pi/3$, and different free stream speeds.	54
3.21	The relation between ice particle size which can accumulate on the cylin- der surface and the distance from the stagnation point for $\mu = 0.07$, $u_p = 0$, $U_\infty = 200$ m/s, volume fraction of 0.05, and different contact angles.	54
3.22	Drag force and friction force variation with particle diameter for $x = d_p$, $\mu = 0.6$, volume fraction of 0.05, at specified contact angles and free stream speeds.	56

3.23	Drag force and friction force variation with particle diameter for $x = 1$ mm, $\mu = 0.6$, volume fraction of 0.05, at specified contact angles and free stream speeds.	56
3.24	The relation between ice particle size which can accumulate on the flat plate surface and the distance from the leading edge for $\mu = 0.6$, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05, $\phi = \pi/6$, and different free stream speeds. . . .	57
4.1	Schematic diagram for the icing wind tunnel arrangement.	61
4.2	Droplets size distribution histograms for different nozzle operating pressures.	68
4.3	Illustration of the wind tunnel duct showing thermocouples, pressure transducers, and microscope camera locations.	69
4.4	Air-water droplet flow temperature measurements within the apparatus upstream of the wind tunnel duct for a wind tunnel flow speed of 6.5 m/s. (Representative result.)	69
4.5	Air-water droplet flow temperature measurements within wind tunnel duct for a wind tunnel flow speed of 6.5 m/s. (Representative result.) . .	70
4.6	Velocity profiles across the wind tunnel duct at the test specimen position for peak flow speeds of 8.4 m/s and 10.2 m/s.	71
4.7	Photograph of the wind tunnel duct showing laser light source, high speed and microscope camera locations.	72
4.8	Illustration of the cylindrical test specimen: (a) Photograph, (b) Schematic diagram.	73
4.9	Temperature distribution around the cylindrical test specimen flow speed of 10 m/s and an ambient temperature of 22 °C.	74

4.10	Illustration of the flat plate test specimen: (a) Photograph, (b) Schematic diagram, (c) Location in the tunnel.	75
4.11	Temperature distribution on the flat plate test specimen (centreline profile) at flow speed of 10 m/s and an ambient temperature of 20 °C. . . .	76
4.12	Facility temperatures with time for the cylinder model, surface temperature -4°C , air flow speed 6.5 m/s, and cold room temperature -10°C	77
4.13	Temperature controller performance with time for the cylinder model, surface temperature -4°C , air flow speed 6.5 m/s, and cold room temperature -10°C	78
4.14	Frames extracted from the video record of ice accretion on the cylinder model with a surface temperature of -9°C and a 30 f/s recording rate.	79
4.15	Ice area deduced from the video record on the cylindrical model near the stagnation region. The symbols represent the frames shown in Figure 4.14.	80
5.1	Illustration of the sampling apparatus located in the wind tunnel at the test specimen location.	83
5.2	Photograph of an ice sampling slide obtained from sampling conditions of 6.5 m/s flow speed and ultrasonic nozzle water tank pressure of 3.5 bar.	84
5.3	The value image after changing the original image to the HSV format. (6.5 m/s flow speed and water tank pressure was 3.5 bar.)	85
5.4	The example image after choosing the threshold value of 0.62.	86
5.5	The binary image for the example image after choosing the threshold value of 0.62.	87
5.6	Average normalised particle diameter for the centre of the slide specimen.	87

5.7	Average normalised particle diameter for the edge of the slide specimen.	88
5.8	Ice particle reoccurrence per total number of particles at different threshold values.	89
5.9	Variation of ice particle diameter for maximum reoccurrence with different threshold values.	89
5.10	Variation of ice particle roccurance per total number of particles with different threshold value.	90
5.11	Apparent ice water content variation with threshold value.	91
5.12	Illustration of the particle capture efficiency geometry.	91
5.13	Streamlines around the sampling test specimen obtained using ANSYS software, and particle trajectories for $1\ \mu\text{m}$ and $5\ \mu\text{m}$ particle diameters.	92
5.14	Ice capture efficiency as a function of particle diameter at $6.5\ \text{m/s}$ flow velocity.	93
5.15	Ice capture efficiency with respect to the y/y_{max} for different particle diameters at a flow speed of $6.5\ \text{m/s}$	94
6.1	Aerodynamic drag force and the friction force variation with particle diameter for $\mu = 0.07$, $x = 2\ \text{mm}$, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05 , $\phi = \pi/2$, and different free stream speeds.	98
6.2	Variation of the maximum particle diameter that can adhere in the vicinity of the stagnation point with temperature for stagnation region of $10\ \text{mm}$ diameter specimen, $u_p = 0.5\ \text{m/s}$, volume fraction of 0.05 , $\phi = \pi/2$, and free stream speed of $6.5\ \text{m/s}$	99
6.3	Annotated photograph of the cylindrical reference model with $1 \times 1\ \text{mm}$ grid.	100

6.4	Annotated photograph of the cylindrical model after removing the plastic protector.	101
6.5	Illustration of the viewing angle and depth effect correction analysis. . .	103
6.6	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -9°C . (Test: SM9T1HP)	105
6.7	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C . (Test: SM9T1HP)	106
6.8	Test1. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C . (Test: SM9T1HP)	107
6.9	Test1. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C . (Test: SM9T1HP)	107
6.10	Frames for ice accretion on the cylinder at -9°C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: SM9T1HP)	108
6.11	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature -5°C . (Test: SM5T2HP)	109
6.12	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C . (Test: SM5T2HP)	110
6.13	Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C . (Test: SM5T2HP)	110
6.14	Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C . (Test: SM5T1HP)	111
6.15	Frames for ice accretion on the cylinder at -5°C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: SM5T2HP)	112
6.16	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 0°C . (Test: S0T5HP)	113

6.17	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0 °C. (Test: S0T5HP)	114
6.18	Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0 °C. (Test: S0T5HP)	114
6.19	Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0 °C. (Test: S0T5HP)	115
6.20	Frames for ice accretion on the plate at 0 °C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: S0T5HP)	116
6.21	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C. (Test: SP5T1HP)	117
6.22	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0 °C. (Test: SP5T1HP)	118
6.23	Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C. (Test: SP5T1HP)	118
6.24	Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C. (Test: SP5T1HP)	119
6.25	Frames for ice accretion on the plate at 5 °C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: SP5T1HP)	120
6.26	Number of samples with at least 10 % ice coverage as a function of time. Lines of the best fit (forced to pass through the origin) are also presented for three surface temperatures: -9 °C, -5 °C, and 0 °C.	123
6.27	Number of samples with at least 80 % ice coverage as a function of time.	123
7.1	Aerodynamic drag force and the friction force variation with particle diameter for $\mu = 0.07$, $x = d_p$, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05, $\phi = \pi/2$, and different free stream speeds.	129

7.2	Aerodynamic drag force and the friction force variation with particle diameter for $\mu = 0.07$, $x = 1$ mm, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05, $\phi = \pi/2$, and different free stream speeds.	130
7.3	Particle distance variation to stop with particle diameter for different friction coefficient μ , and at initial conditions of $u_p = 6.5$, volume fraction of 0.05, $\phi = \pi/2$, and free stream speeds 6.5 m/s.	131
7.4	Annotated photograph of the flat plate reference model with a 1×1 mm grid.	132
7.5	Annotated photograph of the flat plate model after removing the plastic protector.	133
7.6	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -9°C . (Test: FM9T4HP)	135
7.7	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C . (Test: FM9T4HP)	135
7.8	Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C . (Test: FM9T4HP)	137
7.9	Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C . (Test: FM9T4HP)	137
7.10	Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C . (Test: FM9T4HP)	138
7.11	Frames for ice accretion on the plate at -9°C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: FM9T4HP)	139
7.12	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -5°C .(Test: FM5T1HP)	140

7.13	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C . (Test: FM5T1HP)	141
7.14	Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C . (Test: FM5T1HP)	141
7.15	Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C . (Test: FM5T1HP)	142
7.16	Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C . (Test: FM5T1HP)	142
7.17	Frames for ice accretion on the plate at -5°C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: FM5T1HP)	143
7.18	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 0°C . (Test: F0T1HP)	144
7.19	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0°C . (Test: F0T1HP)	145
7.20	Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0°C . (Test: F0T1HP)	145
7.21	Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0°C . (Test: F0T1HP)	146
7.22	Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0°C . (Test: F0T1HP)	146
7.23	Frames for ice accretion on the plate at 0°C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: F0T1HP)	147
7.24	Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 5°C . (Test: FP5T2HP)	148

7.25	Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C. (Test: FP5T2HP)	149
7.26	Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C. (Test: FP5T2HP)	149
7.27	Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C. (Test: FP5T2HP)	150
7.28	Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C. (Test: FP5T2HP)	150
7.29	Frames for ice accretion on the plate at 5 °C with 30 f/s recording rate from the beginning of the test. (Test: FP5T2HP)	151
7.30	Frames for the aerodynamic effect on the accumulated ice on the plate at -9 °C with 30 f/s recording rate from the end of the test. (Test: FM9T1HP)	152
7.31	Number of samples with at least 10% ice coverage in the stagnation region of the flat plate specimen as a function of time. Lines of the best fit (forced to pass through the origin) are also presented for three surface temperatures: -9 °C, -5 °C, and 0 °C.	155
7.32	Number of samples with at least 80% ice coverage in the stagnation region of the flat plate specimen as a function of time.	156
7.33	Stagnation region aerodynamic drag force and the friction force variation with particle diameter for $\mu = 0.07$, $x = 1$ mm, $u_p = 0$, volume fraction of 0.05, $\phi = \pi/2$, cylinder diameter of 3 mm, and different free stream speeds.	156
7.34	Lines of best fit for the number of samples with at least 10% ice coverage of the cylinder (10 mm diameter) and the leading edge of the flat plate (3 mm diameter) at different surface temperatures.	158

A.1	Schematic diagram for the experimental apparatus with dry ice tube heat exchanger.	179
A.2	Schematic diagram for the experimental apparatus with dry ice box heat exchanger.	180
A.3	Photograph of the glaze ice accretion on the wind tunnel duct and test specimen viewed from the wind tunnel inlet. Configuration using the dry ice heat exchanger.	181
A.4	Photograph shows the glaze ice accretion around the test specimen remaining in the place of after the test specimen is removed. Wind tunnel configuration using the dry ice heat exchanger.	182
A.5	Photograph of water droplets on a microscope slide with identification of droplet diameters	183
A.6	Droplets size distribution histograms for different nozzle operating pressures, Nozzle type UniJet model TX.	183
B.1	Air flow streamline at 500 f/s recording rate and flow speed 6.5 m/s. . .	185
B.2	Frames for flow stream and particles around the cylinder at 500 f/s recording rate and flow speed 6.5 m/s.	186
C.1	LabView data acquisition interface screen shot.	188
C.2	LabView data acquisition system diagram.	189
C.3	Data sheet for the ultrasonic nozzle used in primary experiments. . . .	190
D.1	Test SM9T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -9°C	193

D.2	Test SM9T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C	193
D.3	Test SM9T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C	194
D.4	Test SM9T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C	194
D.5	Test SM9T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -9°C	195
D.6	Test SM9T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C	195
D.7	Test SM9T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C	196
D.8	Test SM9T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C	196
D.9	Test SM9T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -9°C	197
D.10	Test SM9T3HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C	197
D.11	Test SM9T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C	198
D.12	Test SM9T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -9°C	198
D.13	Test SM5T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	199

D.14 Test SM5T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	199
D.15 Test SM5T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	200
D.16 Test SM5T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	200
D.17 Test SM5T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	201
D.18 Test SM5T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	201
D.19 Test SM5T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	202
D.20 Test SM5T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	202
D.21 Test SM5T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	203
D.22 Test SM5T3HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	203
D.23 Test SM5T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	204
D.24 Test SM5T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	204
D.25 Test SM5T4HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	205

D.26 Test SM5T4HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	205
D.27 Test SM5T4HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	206
D.28 Test SM5T4HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C	206
D.29 Test SM5T5LP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	207
D.30 Test SM5T5LP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	207
D.31 Test SM5T5LP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C and at lower IWC.	208
D.32 Test SM5T5LP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature -5°C and at lower IWC.	208
D.33 Test S0T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 0°C	209
D.34 Test S0T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0°C	209
D.35 Test S0T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C	210
D.36 Test S0T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C	210
D.37 Test S0T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 0°C	211

D.38 Test S0T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0°C.	211
D.39 Test S0T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C.	212
D.40 Test S0T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C.	212
D.41 Test S0T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 0°C.	213
D.42 Test S0T3HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0°C.	213
D.43 Test S0T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C.	214
D.44 Test S0T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C.	214
D.45 Test S0T4HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 0°C.	215
D.46 Test S0T4HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0°C.	215
D.47 Test S0T4HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C.	216
D.48 Test S0T4HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0°C.	216
D.49 Test S0T5HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 0°C.	217

D.50 Test S0T5HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0 °C.	217
D.51 Test S0T5HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	218
D.52 Test S0T5HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	218
D.53 Test SP5T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	219
D.54 Test SP5T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	219
D.55 Test SP5T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	220
D.56 Test SP5T1HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	220
D.57 Test SP5T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	221
D.58 Test SP5T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	221
D.59 Test SP5T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	222
D.60 Test SP5T2HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	222
D.61 Test SP5T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	223

D.62 Test SP5T3HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	223
D.63 Test SP5T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	224
D.64 Test SP5T3HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	224
D.65 Test SP5T4HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	225
D.66 Test SP5T4HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	225
D.67 Test SP5T4HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	226
D.68 Test SP5T4HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	226
D.69 Test SP5T5HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	227
D.70 Test SP5T5HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	227
D.71 Test SP5T5HP. Ice accretion area within regions 1 and 4 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	228
D.72 Test SP5T5HP. Ice accretion area within regions 2 and 3 on the cylindrical specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	228
E.1 Test FM9T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature −9 °C.	231

E.2	Test FM9T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C	231
E.3	Test FM9T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	232
E.4	Test FM9T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	232
E.5	Test FM9T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	233
E.6	Test FM9T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature -9°C	233
E.7	Test FM9T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C	234
E.8	Test FM9T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	234
E.9	Test FM9T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	235
E.10	Test FM9T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	235
E.11	Test FM9T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature -9°C	236
E.12	Test FM9T3HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C	236
E.13	Test FM9T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	237

E.14 Test FM9T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	237
E.15 Test FM9T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	238
E.16 Test SM9T4HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature -9°C	238
E.17 Test SM9T4HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -9°C	239
E.18 Test SM9T4HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	239
E.19 Test SM9T4HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	240
E.20 Test SM9T4HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -9°C	240
E.21 Test FM5T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	241
E.22 Test FM5T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	241
E.23 Test FM5T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	242
E.24 Test FM5T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	242
E.25 Test FM5T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	243

E.26 Test FM5T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	243
E.27 Test FM5T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	244
E.28 Test FM5T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	244
E.29 Test FM5T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	245
E.30 Test FM5T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	245
E.31 Test FM5T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature -5°C	246
E.32 Test FM5T3HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of -5°C	246
E.33 Test FM5T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	247
E.34 Test FM5T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	247
E.35 Test FM5T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature -5°C	248
E.36 Test F0T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 0°C	249
E.37 Test F0T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0°C	249

E.38 Test F0T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	250
E.39 Test F0T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	250
E.40 Test F0T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	251
E.41 Test F0T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 0 °C.	251
E.42 Test F0T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0 °C.	252
E.43 Test F0T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	252
E.44 Test F0T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	253
E.45 Test F0T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	253
E.46 Test F0T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 0 °C.	254
E.47 Test F0T3HP. Temperature data acquisition reading of the specimen area for the surface at test temperature 0 °C.	254
E.48 Test F0T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	255
E.49 Test F0T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	255

E.50 Test F0T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	256
E.51 Test F0T4HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 0 °C.	256
E.52 Test F0T4HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 0 °C.	257
E.53 Test F0T4HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	257
E.54 Test F0T4HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	258
E.55 Test F0T4HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 0 °C.	258
E.56 Test FP5T1HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	259
E.57 Test FP5T1HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	259
E.58 Test FP5T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	260
E.59 Test FP5T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	260
E.60 Test FP5T1HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	261
E.61 Test FP5T2HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	261

E.62 Test FP5T2HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	262
E.63 Test FP5T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	262
E.64 Test FP5T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	263
E.65 Test FP5T2HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	263
E.66 Test FP5T3HP. Temperatures within the facility upstream of the wind tunnel duct. Specimen temperature 5 °C.	264
E.67 Test FP5T3HP. Temperatures within the wind tunnel duct for the test specimen temperature of 5 °C.	264
E.68 Test FP5T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 1 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	265
E.69 Test FP5T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 2 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	265
E.70 Test FP5T3HP. Ice accretion area within region 3 on the flat plate specimen at test temperature 5 °C.	266

List of Tables

3.1	Velocity profile in the stagnation point boundary layer.	43
3.2	Velocity profile in the boundary layer on a flat plate at zero incidence	47
6.1	Operating conditions for the cylindrical specimen tests, uncertainties quoted correspond to $\pm 2\sigma$ values.	122
7.1	Operating conditions for the flat plate specimen tests, uncertainties quoted correspond to $\pm 2\sigma$ values.	154
D.1	Operating conditions for the cylindrical specimen tests, uncertainties quoted correspond to $\pm 2\sigma$ values.	192
E.1	Operating conditions for the flat plate specimen tests, uncertainties quoted correspond to $\pm 2\sigma$ values.	230

Notation

A_s	Water droplet surface area in mm^2
A_T	Particle cross sectional area in mm^2
C	Specific heat of water in J/kg.K
C_D	Drag coefficient
D	Leading edge diameter in mm
D_{force}	Drag force in N
d_{par}	Ice particle diameter in μm
d_w	Water droplet diameter in μm
F_{ad}	Adhesion force in N
g	Gravitational acceleration in m/s^2
Gr_d	Grashof number
h_c	Convection heat transfer coefficient in $\text{W/m}^2.\text{K}$
H	Shortest distance between ice particle and the surface in μm
k	Air thermal conductivity in W/m.K
Nu_d	Nusselt number
R_a	Centre line average value in μm
Re	Reynolds number
R_z	Average peak to valley height in μm
t	Time in s
T	Temperature in $^{\circ}\text{C}$
T_s	Air and water mixture temperature in $^{\circ}\text{C}$
T_{∞}	Cold stream temperature in $^{\circ}\text{C}$
u_e	Air speed external to the boundary layer in m/s
u_p	Ice particle speed in m/s

\bar{u}	Air speed in the boundary layer in m/s
U_∞	Free stream flow velocity in m/s
V	Water droplet volume in m ³
V_L	Liquid bridge volume in m ³
β	Air coefficient of thermal expansion in K ⁻¹
γ	Dimensionless boundary layer thickness
δ	Boundary layer thickness in μm
ϵ	Embracing angle
η	Collection efficiency
μ	Friction coefficient
ν	Kinematic viscosity in m ² /s
ρ	Density in kg/m ³
σ	Surface tension coefficient in N/m
ϕ	Contact angle

Acronyms & Abbreviations

AERTS	Adverse Environment Rotor Test Stand
AIWT	Altitude Icing Wind Tunnel
BRAIT	Boeing Research Aerodynamic Icing Tunnel
CIRA	Italian Aerospace Research Centre
C-MAPSS40K	Commercial Modular Aero-Propulsion System Simulation 40K
FAA	Federal Aviation Administration
FENSAP-ICE	Finite Element Navier-Stokes Analysis Package
FSSP	Forward Scattering Spectrometer Probe
GRC	Glenn Research Centre
HSV	Hue Saturation Value
IRT	Icing Research Tunnel
IWC	Ice Water Content
JKR	Johnson, Kendal and Robert
LIRL	LeClerc Icing Research Laboratory
LWC	Liquid Water Content
NRC	National Research Council
RANS	Reynolds Averaged Navier-Stokes
RATFac	Research Altitude Test Facility
RGB	Red Green Blue
SLD	Supercooled Large Droplet
SLW	Supercooled Liquid Water content
TWC	Total Water Content
UHV	Ultra High Vacuum