



Universidad de Valladolid

FACULTAD de FILOSOFÍA Y LETRAS
DEPARTAMENTO de FILOLOGÍA INGLESA
Grado en Estudios Ingleses

TRABAJO DE FIN DE GRADO

A Comparative Analysis of Translated Cultural
Terms in Cervantes' Don Quixote in Thomas Shelton's
and John Rutherford's Translations.

Marta Robles Villarino

Tutor: José Manuel Barrio Marco

2015-2016

ABSTRACT

Translating any kind of text is a challenge for a translator, but if that text involves representations of a country, a culture, a language and is full of cultural references and terms, the translation process becomes even more difficult. *Don Quixote* is considered one of the greatest works of Spanish literature which Thomas Shelton and, 400 years later, John Rutherford wanted to share with the English speaking community. This paper will analyse how they translated some of the cultural terms found in *Don Quixote*, comparing the translation procedures and determining whether they convey the meaning of the original terms.

KEY WORDS: Don Quixote, Cervantes, Culture, Shelton, Rutherford, Translation.

RESUMEN

La traducción de cualquier texto es un reto para todo traductor, y si además ese texto incluye figuras representativas de un país, cultura o idioma, y está repleto de términos y referencias culturales, el proceso de traducción se complica aún más. *Don Quijote* es una de las obras más importantes de la literatura española, que Thomas Shelton y John Rutherford han traducido, con 400 años de diferencia, para que pudiera llegar al lector anglófono. En este trabajo se analizará cómo estos dos autores han traducido algunos de los términos culturales del Quijote, comparando los procedimientos de traducción y determinando si transportan el significado original a la lengua inglesa.

PALABRAS CLAVE: Don Quijote, Cervantes, Cultura, Shelton, Rutherford, Traducción.

INDEX

INTRODUCTION	3
CULTURAL TERMS	4
TRANSLATIONS OF DON QUIXOTE	5
THEORETICAL BACKGROUND	6
METHODOLOGY	10
ANALYSIS	11
CONCLUSIONS	29
BIBLIOGRAPHY	31
ANNEX	33

INTRODUCTION

Translation has always been considered an interesting topic of study albeit a controversial one. This is due to the possibility of some information getting lost during the translation procedure, meaning the final translation may not convey the same meaning as the original text or term. Furthermore, every translated text is inherently attached to the translator's soul or point of view, which is the main reason why translation can be considered so difficult. One translation may differ entirely from another, depending on the personal interpretation of the translator.

If translation in general can cause discrepancies between authors and translators, the translation of cultural terms can be considered even more problematic. Culture itself is a very special term which conveys intrinsic meanings. The Merriam Webster dictionary claims that culture is "the beliefs, customs, arts, etc., of a particular society, group, place, or time". In order to translate any cultural related term or phrase, it is necessary, first, to be familiar with the culture of the term and then with the culture of the language into which it will be translated. This enables a translator to create a suitable translation with a minimum loss of meaning.

This dissertation is a comparative analysis of a selection of the translated cultural terms in Cervantes' *Don Quixote*. In order to achieve this, it will be comparing how the cultural terms selected were translated in the first translated edition of *Don Quixote* published in 1612, by Thomas Shelton, and one of the latest translated editions from 2000, by John Rutherford.

The main motivation behind choosing this topic for the paper was the celebration of the IV centenary of Cervantes' death, and also because of the importance to understand the intrinsic link between a culture and its language.

CULTURAL TERMS

The main difficulty found when translating cultural terms is that they are attached to the language or a certain part of the tradition and heritage of that language, which is often incomparable with other languages. The term culture itself is perhaps one of the trickiest to define. In fact, its definition alters quite radically according to the language and culture in which it is perceived (Deutscher 2011:8). Sometimes an additional explanation is included in a translation, to attempt to enhance the accuracy, and so as to convey the same or similar meaning from the original term.

The difficulty of translating a cultural term depends on both the structure of the language and the “gap” between the cultures. As Newmark remarks: “There is a translation problem due to the cultural ‘gap’ or ‘distance’ between the source and the target languages” (1988:94). This means that the more different or ‘distant’ the two cultures are, the more difficult it would be to explain a cultural feature from one to the other. Bearing that in mind, Spanish and English are becoming ever closer, but they still have their cultural differences and particularities that can become an issue for any translator.

This essay will also be referring to cultural terms as ‘culturemes’, which the Oxford Reference Dictionary defines as “any portion of cultural behaviour apprehended in signs of symbolic value that can be broken down into smaller units or amalgamated into larger one”. The word ‘cultureme’ has been widely used in different translation thesis or studies, Lucia Molina offering her own example of a definition of a cultureme. “A cultureme is every verbal or paraverbal element which contains a cultural baggage specific from a certain culture, that when contacting another culture by means of translation can cause a cultural issue between the source and the target text,” she wrote (Molina 2006:79) (Translation mine).

TRANSLATIONS OF DON QUIXOTE

Don Quixote is considered one of the greatest books in the history of Spanish literature, and as such it has been translated several times into various languages. For example, there are around 12 English translated editions of Don Quixote, and even one in *Spanglish*, published in 2002. Every translation varies in one way or another and each one has some interesting features that make it unique.

Peter Motteux (1719) is one of the early translators of Don Quixote, who admitted that his version was a joint effort between numerous of translators. This makes the homogeneity and consistency of the text impressive, although some of the details have been eliminated and they have added some complementary jokes or sentences that do not coincide with the original text (Rutherford 2007:484-485).

Another interesting translation is the one by Charles Jarvis (1742), which is substantially different as he avoids the social class differentiation between the humble servant Sancho Panza and the knight Don Quixote. This is made clear in the original text by the use of the language and expressions. In this case, Jarvis decides to use standardised English for both characters, making Sancho look more educated than he really is (Rutherford 2007:485).

Samuel Putnam (1949) is the first American translator of Cervantes' Don Quixote. He pays close attention to semantics and avoids archaisms, making his translation appear modern when compared to the others, which maintained the archaic language of Cervantes (Rutherford 2007:488).

These are just some of the many translations to English of Don Quixote available. Nevertheless, this essay will be focusing on Shelton's and Rutherford's translation, the first and one of the more modern versions respectively, in order to see if there is a difference in the translation techniques used between them and to compare which of the two offers a closer cultural translation of the original.

The first translation of Don Quixote was carried out by Thomas Shelton in 1612. It is said that he only needed two months to finish the first part, which could be seen as quite a feat, considering that at that time there were not a lot of dictionaries available to help

with the translation. Whether that is true or not, it caught Rutherford's attention since he needed six months to create a draft and then two more years of reviewing. Nevertheless, there are many mistakes and mistranslations in Shelton's version, which can make the reader believe that it was a quick translation. It was however, the basis for further translations and it was to be edited several times (Rutherford 2007:483).

John Rutherford's translation (2000) is one of the more modern translated versions. He tried to maintain the different speaking styles of Don Quixote and Sancho Panza and also the comic situations their language brings. He bases his translation on some of the previous ones, also adding his personal touch (Rutherford 2007:489).

This essay will present a comparative analysis of these two translations, looking at cultural expressions or words, so as to judge the differences between the texts and their place in time.

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

Translation is not an exact science, as one text can have as many translations as there are translators. Every translator influences the original text with their own personal touch, making them authors in a sense as well. Nonetheless, there are some structured and defined ways of translating, known as translation procedures and methods. This essay will base its analysis of the cultural terms on Newmark's translation methods and procedures, explained in his *Textbook of Translation* from 1988. This book was chosen as the theoretical base because of its prestige in the field, and also because of the well-structured and defined classification it gives regarding the different translation techniques.

Regarding the methods, Newmark distinguishes eight main ones, which he would organise in a V-diagram in order to explain more visually each method and their distance with the source language or the target language. The first four methods are the ones closer to the source language and the last four are closer to the target language (Newmark, 1988:45).

SOURCE LANGUAGE

TARGET LANGUAGE

Word-for-word

Adaptation

Literal

Free

Faithful

Idiomatic

Semantic

Communicative

- **Word-for-word translation:** In this case, the word order of the original text is preserved. Every word is translated by their most common meaning, out of context, which sometimes makes the translated text difficult to understand. It could be used as a pre-translation step in order to help the translator in future and final translations (Newmark, 1988:45-46).
- **Literal translation:** This type of translation is the next step from the word-for-word translation. It translates the words one by one, using their most common meaning without taking into account the context. The difference is that this time, the translator would take the grammatical structure of the source language and convert it into the closest equivalent in the target language. It could also be used as a pre-translation step (Newmark, 1988:46).
- **Faithful translation:** This translation method tries to recreate the contextual meaning of the source language, arranged by the grammatical rules of the target language. It could be said that it is a type of transference. The main goal of this method is to be faithful to the author of the source text and bring the author's intentions into the target text. This would be the first method that tries to respect the idea of the source text (Newmark, 1988:46).
- **Semantic translation:** This specific translation method is more flexible than the previous one. It is used taking into account the aesthetic value of the source text, and trying to express it in the target text (Newmark, 1988:46).
- **Adaptation:** This is considered one of the freest methods, due to the fact that every author can have a different interpretation of the source text and, at the same time, another purpose. They can modify and adapt the target text as they wish (Newmark, 1988:46).

- **Free translation:** It is a way of transporting the meaning but not the form of the original. A free translation is normally longer than the original text. It can be considered as a “translation of content” (Newmark, 1988:46-47).
- **Idiomatic translation:** It is normally used to translate idioms and colloquial expressions, which are some of the hardest aspects to translate. The idiomatic translation attempts to reproduce the idiomatic expression from the source language into its equivalent or a similar version in the target language (Newmark, 1988:47).
- **Communicative translation:** This last method tries to combine the best of the others. It takes into account the content, the meaning and the form in which it will be provided. It tries to make the translated text as similar and comprehensive as the original one. This is one of the methods that better fulfils the goals of translating, that is, to be accurate and economic (Newmark, 1988:47).

Newmark wrote that “while translation methods relate to whole texts, translation procedures are used for sentences and the smaller units of language” (1988:81). There are several translation procedures; nevertheless, the following are the ones that will be later used in this essay for analytical purposes.

- **Transference:** Also called ‘loan’. It consists of the transference of a term from the source language into the target language, and that term is often called a ‘loan word’. It is normally used for cultural terms or objects that are too difficult to translate into the target language. Despite respecting the source language and the original term, some say that translators should translate, not just use the same word for the target language (Newmark, 1988:81-82). Example: “meeting” and “mitin”.
- **Naturalization:** It is the transference of a term followed by an adaptation on two levels; phonetic and morphologic. After transferring a term, it would be adapted to the pronunciation patterns of the target language and then to its morphology, to make it sound more natural in that target language (Newmark, 1988:82). Example: “football” and “fútbol”.
- **Cultural equivalent:** It is the use of a similar cultural term or an expression with a similar meaning in both languages (Newmark, 1988:81-83). Example: “Pausa para el café” and “tea break”.

- **Functional equivalent:** This procedure is widely used among translators. It is applied to cultural words, and sometimes to technical words. It consists of translating a cultural word by using non cultural terms in the target language (Newmark, 1988:81-83). Example: “Sociedad Anónima” in Spain, “Corporation” in the US and “Public Limited Company” in the UK.
- **Descriptive equivalent:** The meaning of the source language word is explained or described in several words in the target language. It is the same term but more explicative and expansive in the target language (Newmark, 1988:83). Example: “Archery” and “tiro con arco”.
- **Synonymy:** It is used when there is not a suitable equivalent between the languages. This procedure is about finding an adequate synonym in the target language. Synonymy is one of the bases for a translation, but too much synonymy in a text can make the translation inaccurate (Newmark, 1988:84). Example: “gentil” and “kind”.
- **Through-translation:** It is the word-for-word translation of fixed structures, collocations or acronyms. This type of translation should be used when the terms are already known or part of the common knowledge of both languages. Example: “OTAN” and “NATO”. Sometimes, the order of the words can be switched when doing a through-translation, due to the grammatical structure of both languages (Newmark, 1988:84-85).
- **Shifts and transpositions:** In this case, there is a grammatical modification of the translation from the source language to the target language. This procedure is necessary when the structure of the source language does not exist in the target language - be it, from singular to plural, changing the grammatical structure of the sentence, or the morphology of the word (Newmark, 1988:85-88). Example: “She likes swimming” and “le gusta nadar”.
- **Modulation:** It is used when there is a different point of view of the same thing in the two languages. It can be said that modulation is a transposition of meaning instead of a transposition of form (Newmark, 1988:88-89). Example: “Te lo dejo” and “you can have it”.
- **Recognised translation:** It is the use of the official version of the translation of a term. It is a generally accepted translation and is normally used for institutional terms. It can be a type of through-translation (Newmark, 1988:89). Example: “The Tory Party” and “el Partido Conservador Británico”.

- **Compensation:** This procedure is normally used when there is a loss of meaning in the translation. It usually appears in the translation of metaphors or sentences with a sound effect attached. The compensation procedure would be to add an explanation or further information in another part of the text in order to balance the translation (Newmark, 1988:90). Example: “I am good. Okay! Okay! Uh, I got the pillow! I got the bag! You got the keys?” and “¡Soy buenísimo! Bien, vamos a ver... Bien, tengo la almohada. Tengo la bolsa. ¿Tienes las llaves?” (Baños, 2013:78). This example is taken from the television series ‘Friends’. In this case the compensation is found in the first sentence. The fact that “I am good” is not contracted implies an emphasis in the meaning that disappears if it is translated as “soy bueno.” In order to compensate that, the translators made the adjective “bueno” a superlative, so as to maintain the emphasis of the sentence and not to lose meaning.
- **Paraphrase:** It is a kind of compensation. It consists of adding more information or enlarging an explanation of the meaning of a part of the text (Newmark, 1988:90). Example: “Scone” and “Scone, el postre típico inglés que normalmente se toma acompañado de nata y mermelada de frutos rojos”.
- **Couplets:** It is the use of two or more translation procedures at the same time. Sometimes it is not enough with one in order to achieve a suitable translation (Newmark, 1988:81-91). Example: “football” and “fútbol”, there is transference and naturalization.
- **Notes:** This is the use of foot notes or explanatory notes in order to inform the reader of the translation, the meaning or the background of the term or expressions translated (Newmark, 1988:81-91-92).

METHODOLOGY

Throughout the analysis of different 'culturemes' from Cervantes' Don Quixote, the order in which they will be arranged will be the order in which they are found in the book.

These 'culturemes' were selected because of their cultural relevance and how they were translated into English in Shelton's or Rutherford's translations.

In this essay the source text (ST) or language (SL) will always be Spanish and the target text (TT) or language (TL) will be English.

ANALYSIS

In this section, the following 30 words or phrases are those which have been selected for analysis. In order to analyse these 'culturemes', they will be presented in a chart, containing the original Spanish word in isolation and Shelton's and Rutherford's translation.

They will be analysed one by one in four steps. Firstly, the Spanish term will be given in its context, followed by its definition given by the Real Academia Española (RAE) dictionary. Secondly, the term Shelton proposed will be presented, with its definition in the Merriam Webster dictionary (MW), or other dictionaries in case the term is not available in the Merriam Webster, and the translation method and procedure he used. Thirdly, the same procedure will happen with Rutherford's proposal before a final analysis of the two translations.

	CERVANTES	SHELTON¹	RUTHERFORD
1	Hidalgo (1999a:97)	Knight-errant	Hidalgo (2000:25)
2	Salpicón (1999a:97)	Gallimaufry	Leftovers (2000:25)
3	Duelos y quebrantos (1999a:97)	Collops and eggs	Lardy eggs (2000:25)
4	Quijada o Quesada (1999a:98)	Quixada, or Quesada	Quixada o quesada (2000:25)
5	Hanegas (de tierra) (1999a:98)	Acres (of arable land)	Acres (of arable land) (2000:26)
6	Tener más cuartos que un real (1999a:101)	To have more quarters than pence in a sixpence.	To have more corns that a barleyfield (2000:28)

¹ These terms were taken from an online version of the book, making it impossible to provide the page number reference. The complete sentence in which they were found and their reference will be in the Annex.

7	Rocinante (1999a:102)	Rocinante	Rocinante / Hackafore (2000:28)
8	Caraculiambro (1999a:102)	Caraculiambro	Caraculiambro (2000:29)
9	No menos ladrón que Caco (1999a:109)	No less thievish than Cacus	Less a thief than Cacus (2000:33)
10	Curadillo (1999a:110)	Poor-john	Humble salt cod (2000:34)
11	Maravedís (1999a:143)	Dodkin	Brass farthings (2000:63)
12	Bota (de vino) (1999a:149)	Bottle	Leather bottle (2000:66)
13	Vizcaíno (1999a:151)	Biscaine	Basque (2000:69)
14	Caballero (1999a:151)	Knight / Gentleman	Knight (2000:69)
15	El agua tan presto verás que al gato llevas (1999a:152)	Thou shalt see the water as soon as you carry away the cat	Soon see you monkey making (2000:69)
16	Morisco aljamiado (1999a:158)	Moor turned Spaniard thereabouts	Spanish-speaking moor (2000:75)
17	Sudar el hopo (1999a:163)	Sweat for it	Sweat blood (2000:79)
18	3 Azumbres (1999a:164)	3 Gallons	12 pints (2000:80)
19	Y los demás días se os pasaban en flores (1999a:166)	Days passed over with herbs and roots	They used to live on next to nothing (2000:81)
20	(Sentarse sobre un) dornajo (1999a:168)	Sit upon a trough	Sit on an upside-down bowl (2000:83)
21	La ley del encaje aún no se había sentado en el entendimiento del juez... (1999a:170)	Law of corruption, or taking bribes, had not yet possessed the understanding of the judge...	As yet the judge could not make his whim the measure of the law... (2000:85)

22	Rabel (1999a:171)	Rebec	Fiddle (2000:86)
23	Hijodalgo (1999a:176)	Gentleman	Hidalgo (2000:90)
24	Dejándonos de andar de Ceca en Meca y de zoca en colodra (1999a:227)	Omitting to leap thus, out of the frying-pan into the fire	Stop gallivanting about from pillar to post and from the frying-pan into the fire. (2000:138)
25	Alfana (1999a:230)	Courser	Steed (2000:140)
26	Un cuartal de pan, o una hogaza y dos cabezas de sardinas arenques (1999a:235)	A quarter of a loaf, or a cake, and two pilchard's heads	A two-pound loaf of white bread or indeed an eight-pound loaf of bran bread and a couple of dozen salted pilchards (2000:145)
27	De noche todos los gatos son pardos (1999b:281)	In the night Joan is as good as my lady	In the dark all cats are grey (2000:715)
28	Olla podrida (1999b:374)	Olla podrida (A pot with all kind of flesh sod together)	Olla podrida / Hotch-potch stew (2000:798)
29	Gaspacho (1999b:429)	Gaspacho	Bread and meat soup (2000:849)
30	Esto me parece argado sobre argado y no miel sobre hojuelas (1999b:545)	Heyday, this is sour upon sour	That wouldn't be so much gilding the lily as piling codswallop on top of stuff and nonsense (2000:953)

1. **Hidalgo:** Found in the title of chapter I, of the first part. "Que trata de la condición y ejercicio del famoso *hidalgo* don Quijote de la Mancha" (Cervantes, 1999a:97). The definition that the RAE provides is: "Persona que por linaje pertenecía al estamento inferior de la nobleza" (RAE). Shelton translates this term as *knight-errant*: "a knight who travelled in search of adventures in the Middle Ages" (Merriam Webster), and then again as *gentleman*: "a man of high

social status” (Merriam Webster). Rutherford uses the word *hidalgo*: "a member of the lower nobility of Spain" (Merriam Webster).

In this case, Shelton uses a cultural equivalent in English for the word *hidalgo* in Spanish and then a synonym in *gentleman* and Rutherford uses the transference procedure, by using the same Spanish word. Shelton's option of *knight-errant* seems to be adequate for the time the translation was made, due to the fact that it is an English term that the reader would recognise. It also makes the reader picture what kind of person is being talking about and the period of time in history in which he belongs. However, there is a status difference between a Spanish *hidalgo* and an English knight, the Spanish *hidalgo* coming from a lower social position. Rutherford has chosen a loan for this specific word, which makes his option explain faithfully what Cervantes was trying to explain. Nevertheless, as the term is in Spanish, it makes it more difficult for the English reader to understand.

2. **Salpicón:** Found in chapter I, of the first part, in the description of Don Quixote's alimentation. "Una olla de algo más vaca que carnero, *salpicón* las más noches, *duelos y quebrantos* los sábados, lantejas los viernes, algún palomino de añadidura los domingos, consumían las tres partes de su hacienda" (Cervantes, 1999a:97). The definition of this term is "guiso de carne, pescado o marisco desmenuzado, con pimienta, sal, aceite, vinagre y cebolla" (RAE). Shelton uses the term *gallimaufry* "any mix or jumble of things", which developed from the 16th Century French meat stew called 'gallimafree' (Merriam Webster) Rutherford, meanwhile, chooses the word *leftovers* "food that has not been finished at a meal and that is often served at another meal: a thing that remains after something is finished or ended" (Merriam Webster).

Again, Shelton is using a cultural equivalent in order to translate this term. It is said that during the 16th Century the Middle-French chefs would prepare a meat stew that the English population did not like, since it seemed to be just a nonsense potpourri, which is quite similar to Cervantes' *salpicón*. Taking into account the time in which Shelton translated the text, his choice of *gallimaufry* as a translation is adequate. *Leftovers* is Rutherford's choice. He used a functional equivalent this time, and there is a loss of meaning since *leftovers* can

be made out of anything and not necessarily dressed with vinaigrette, as the Spanish term implies. It is true that most of the time, that specific Spanish dish is made with the leftover meat of fish, and this feature is seen in Rutherford's choice.

3. **Duelos y quebrantos:** [Included in number 2]. This term refers to "Fritada hecha con huevos y grosura de animales, especialmente torrezno sesos, alimentos compatibles con la abstinencia parcial que por preceptoeclesiástico se guardaba los sábados en los reinos de Castilla" (RAE). Shelton translates this dish as *collops and eggs*, referring to "a small piece or slice especially of meat" or "a fold of fat flesh" (Merriam Webster). Rutherford opts for *lardy eggs*, which derives from *lard*, which is "a soft white substance that is made from the fat of pigs and used in cooking" (Merriam Webster).

Collops and eggs are a cultural equivalent. Collop is "a Middle-English word for an egg fried on bacon and later for the slice of bacon itself" (Merriam Webster). This choice is a similar dish but there is a loss of meaning, because the eggs in *duelos y quebrantos* are scrambled and in Shelton's dish they are fried. Instead, Rutherford uses a functional equivalent derived from the word lard, that is pig's fat, in order to give the dish a heavy and fatty look. Both of them are close equivalents, but there is still a loss of meaning. This term is especially difficult to translate, apart from what it is as a dish, as for what the words really mean in Spanish, something like "fights and sorrow". Maybe a descriptive equivalent or a paraphrase would have compensated for that loss of meaning.

4. **Quijada o quesada:** Found in chapter I, of the first part, when the narrator is discussing the origins of Don Quixote's name. "Quieren decir que tenía el sobrenombre de Quijada, o Quesada, que en esto hay alguna diferencia en los autores que deste caso escriben; aunque por conjeturas verosímiles se deja entender que se llamaba Quejana" (Cervantes, 1999a:97). The definition for *quijada* is "Cada una de las dos mandíbulas de los vertebrados que tienen dientes" (RAE), and for *quesada* "Cierta género de pastel, compuesto de queso y masa" (RAE). Shelton and Rutherford both use Quixada or Quesada, neither of which are found in the dictionary.

Shelton decides to make a transference and then a naturalization for the first term and continue with the translation, which causes a complete loss of meaning as those terms are not understandable in English. Rutherford adds something to Shelton's idea. He is using couplets as well, as he transfers and naturalises before adding a paraphrase: "as if he were a jawbone or a cheesecake" (Rutherford, 2000:25). In this case, Rutherford compensates for the loss of meaning that taking the Spanish words causes by the inclusion of a further explanation. For that reason, his translation fits better and explains to the reader what is missing in Shelton's.

5. **Hanegas:** Found in chapter I, of the first part, when the narrator is explaining how Don Quixote sold his belongings to buy chivalry books. "[Y] llegó a tanto su curiosidad y desatino en esto, que vendió muchas hanegas de tierra de sembradura para comprar libros de caballerías en que leer [...]" (Cervantes, 1999a:97). *Hanegas* is "Medida agraria que, según el marco de Castilla, contiene 576 estadales cuadrados y equivale a 64,596 áreas, pero varía según las regiones" (RAE). Both Shelton and Rutherford use the same translation for this term, that is, *acres*, which means "a measure of land area in the U.S. and Britain that equals 4,840 square yards (about 4,047 square meters)" (Merriam Webster).

Hanegas is a very interesting term, since it is a variable measure; however the RAE specifications say that it is about 4192 m². Shelton and Rutherford's choice is a cultural equivalent very close to the original. This translation has barely lost meaning, which makes it more than adequate.

6. **Tener más cuartos que un real:** Found in chapter I, of the first part, in Rocinante's description. "Fue luego a ver a su rocín, y aunque tenía más cuartos que un real y más tachas que el caballo de Gonela, que tantum pellis et ossa fuit, le pareció que ni Bucéfalo de Alejandro ni Babiaca del Cid con él se igualaban" (Cervantes, 1999a:97). Shelton translates this expression as '*to have more quarters than a pence in a sixpence*' and Rutherford as '*to have more corns than a barleyfield*'.

In this case, Cervantes has created a pun. The word '*cuartos*' has a double meaning in this situation, which are: "Moneda de cobre española cuyo valor era el de cuatro maravedís de vellón" (RAE) and "Abertura longitudinal larga y

profunda, que anormalmente se produce en las partes laterales de los cascos de las caballerías" (RAE). Shelton conveys just one of those two meanings, by using a word-for-word translation. That only allows the reader to see the meaning regarding currency. Rutherford, on the other hand, uses the cultural equivalent of *cuartos*, referring to the illness, which in English is *corns*. Taking this word as a starting point, he creates his own idiomatic expression, to convey what Cervantes wanted. He uses another meaning of corn, "a small hard seed — usually used in combination <peppercorn> <barleycorn>" (Merriam Webster) and then he added the sense of belonging to something bigger, of being a portion of something. Cervantes' expression is the sum of Shelton and Rutherford's, however, Rutherford mimicked the original's structure and sense, and came up with a witty idiomatic alternative.

7. **Rocinante:** Found in chapter I, of the first part, when the story of how Don Quixote named his horse is told. "[A]l fin le vino a llamar Roninante, nombre, a su parecer, alto, sonoro y significativo de lo que había sido cuando fue rocín, antes de lo que ahora era, que era antes y primero de todos los rocines del mundo" (Cervantes, 1999a:102). In this case, *rocín* is the main part of the term, which means "caballo de trabajo, a distinción del de regalo" (RAE). *Rocinante* is also the word Shelton uses, which has no meaning in English. Rutherford uses *Rocinante* as well, but also *hackafore* which has no meaning.

Shelton transfers Cervantes' invention and then adds an explanation. He uses notes to explain the meaning, adding, "a horse of labour or carriage in Spain is called Rozin, and the word 'ante' signifies before; so that Rocinante is a horse that sometime was of carriage" (Gavilan Edu, 2005). Rutherford, on the other hand uses *hackafore* a term that does not mean anything at first. Nevertheless, it can be broken down into parts. *Hack* means "A horse used for riding or driving" (The Free Dictionary), and *afore* means "before" in chivalry language (Merriam Webster). Together that creates 'that was a hack before' which is the same meaning as *Rocinante*. Rutherford has created his own *Rocinante* for the English language, which is a clever creation, but maybe difficult for the reader to interpret.

8. **Caraculiambro:** Found in chapter I, of the first part, as the name of the giant. "Yo, señora soy el gigante Caraculiambro, señor de la ínsula Malindrana" (Cervantes, 1999a:102). This term itself has no meaning in Spanish but both Shelton and Rutherford use *Caraculiambro* in their translations.

Caraculiambro is an exaggeration of 'cara culo' which is an insult in Spanish. Shelton simply transferred the term in his translation, which makes the version lose some meaning, as the English speaking reader would not perceive the nuance of the insult it contains. It is not possible to know why Shelton used a transference, but maybe he did not completely understand Cervantes' intention. Meanwhile, Rutherford uses *Caraculiambro* as well, but he adds a note to explain what it really means "strong overtone of 'Arse-face'" (Rutherford, 2000: 986). With this explanatory note, Rutherford shows his readers the interesting meaning of the term.

9. **No menos ladrón que Caco:** Found in chapter II, of the first part, in the description of the host from Seville. "[É]l era andaluz, y de los de la playa de Sanlúcar, no menos ladrón que Caco, ni menos maleante que estudiantado paje" (Cervantes, 1999a:108). Caco in Spanish means "Coloq. Ladrón" (RAE). Shelton uses the expression "no less thievish than Cacus" and Rutherford a similar one, "less a thief than Cacus". Cacus has no meaning in English.

The Spanish word *caco* derives from the Latin *Cacus*, who was a mythological thief from Dante's *Inferno* (RAE), but *caco* itself means thief. On the contrary, *Cacus* does not have that meaning in English, other than of a mythological thief. For that reason, their choice to translate this expression word-for-word makes its own understanding very difficult, since *Cacus* is not so recognisable. The suggestion of a thief is in the English version as well, but it is less transparent than in the Spanish version. Adding notes or paraphrasing would have helped the reader to understand the expression better.

10. **Curadillo:** Found in chapter II, of the first part, when the narrator describes the menu at the inn that night. "A dicha, acertó ser viernes aquel día, y no había en toda la venta sino unas raciones de un pescado" (Cervantes, 1999a:110). Curadillo means "bacalao: Carne de bacalao, curado y salado para su conserva"

(RAE). Shelton translates it as *poor-john* that is "archaic: small cod or hake dried and salted" (Merriam Webster). "Humble salt cod" is Rutherford's choice.

Shelton here is very accurate as he uses a cultural equivalent relevant to his reader. This *poor-john* term was widely used during the 17th Century; Shakespeare uses it several times in different plays. Rutherford preferred to use a descriptive equivalent to explain the term. Both of them convey the meaning of the cultural term; however, Shelton's translation is more culturally adequate, since the term itself resembles a type of dish, rather than Rutherford's descriptive equivalent.

11. **Maravedís:** Found in chapter VII, of the first part, when Sancho is speaking about his wife becoming a queen. "Sepa, señor, que no vale dos maravedís para reina, condesa le caerá mejor, y aún Dios y ayuda" (Cervantes, 1999a:143). *Maravedís* are "moneda antigua española, efectiva unas veces y otras imaginaria, que tuvo diferentes valores y calificativos" (RAE). *Dodkin* is what Shelton uses, which is "archaic: a coin of little value" (The Free Dictionary). Rutherford prefers to say *brass farthings* which are "a former British coin that had a value equal to 1/4 of a penny" or "something of small value" (Merriam Webster).

Maravedís here gives the sense of something of little value. Shelton uses *Dodkin*, a cultural equivalent, but not equivalent for the English culture. *Dodkin* was another name for the Dutch coin *doit*, which had a very small value, "old Dutch coin equal to about 1/8 stiver" (Merriam Webster). Rutherford also uses a cultural equivalent, this time, one for the English culture, which seems to be a better translation than Shelton's. One possible reason for Shelton using a foreign currency for this translation would be that he lived in north Belgium, and at that time, it was the currency he was familiar with (Knowles, 1958).

12. **Bota:** Found in chapter VIII, of the first part, when Don Quixote and Sancho wake up after the fight against the windmills. "Al levantarse dio un tiento a la bota, y hallóla algo más flaca que la noche de antes, afligiósele el corazón, por parecerle que no llevaban camino de remediar tan presto su falta" (Cervantes, 1999:149). *Bota* is "recipiente de cuero para contener vino, en forma de pera y con un tapón en la parte más estrecha por el que sale el líquido en chorro muy

fino" (RAE). Shelton uses the term *bottle*, whilst Rutherford uses *leather bottle* instead.

Shelton's procedure is a functional equivalent with a great meaning loss, since a bottle can be "a glass or plastic container that has a narrow neck and usually has no handle" (Merriam Webster). Rutherford's procedure is a descriptive equivalent. He also uses the word *bottle* but adds the material it is made of, which makes his translation a better one when compared to Shelton's.

13. **Vizcaíno**: Found in chapter VIII, of the first part, when Don Quixote meets a squire. "Todo esto que don Quixote decía escuchaba un escudero de los que el coche acompañaban, que era vizcaíno; el cual [...] le dijo, en mala lengua castellana y pero vizcaína [...]" (Cervantes, 1999a:151). *Vizcaino* is "natural de Vizcaya, provincia de España" (RAE). Shelton uses the word *biscaine* which does not exist in English. Rutherford prefers to use the word *basque* "a member of a people inhabiting the western Pyrenees on the Bay of Biscay" (Merriam Webster).

Shelton chooses a transference and a naturalization for this term, and gives no further explanation. Rutherford decides to use Basque, which is a kind of modulation since he prefers to name the whole instead of the part for describing *vizcaíno*. Shelton's option is culturally correct since a person from Vizcaya is not the same as a *basque* person, however, that concrete denomination is unknown in English, so the meaning it has will not be understood. On the contrary, Rutherford chooses the option that everyone would understand, although he is losing meaning. In both cases, adding an explanatory note would have solved the problem of meaning loss and help the reader understand.

14. **Caballero**: Found in chapter VIII, of the first part, when Don Quixote is talking with the 'vizcaíno'. "Anda, caballero, que mal andes; por el Dios que criome que, si no dejas coche, así te matas como estás ahí vizcaíno" (Cervantes, 1999a:151). *Caballero* has two meanings, "hombre, generalmente adulto" and "hidalgo de reconocida nobleza" (RAE). Shelton and Rutherford both use the word *knight* "a soldier in the past who had a high social rank and who fought while riding a horse and usually wearing armour" (Merriam Webster).

They both use synonymy in order to translate this term, but the main difference between the two authors is that Shelton adds a note to the term: "*Cavallero*, in Spanish, is taken as well for a gentleman as for a knight" (Gavilan Edu, 2005). This makes his version more faithful to the original, by giving the readers the possibility to know that this specific term can be understood as two different things. Rutherford, in this case, is not showing the other possible meaning.

15. **El agua tan presto verás que al gato llevas:** Found in chapter VIII, of the first part, when the 'vizcaino' and Don Quixote are about to start a fight. "¿Yo no caballero? Juro a Dios tan mientes como cristiano. Si lanza arrojas y espada sacas, ¡el agua cuán presto verás que al gato llevas!" (Cervantes, 1999a:151). This expression makes reference to the fact that cats are afraid of water and are likely to avoid it. Shelton translates this as "*thou shalt see the water as soon as you carry away the cat*", and Rutherford as "*soon you see you monkey making*".

By the use of this expression, Don Quixote is being called a coward, something which is difficult to disentangle from Shelton's version, since he translated it word-for-word. Rutherford changes the meaning of the sentence, using a modulation or an idiomatic translation. *Monkey making* is synonym of "fool, trifle" (Merriam Webster), which makes Rutherford's translation lose the original meaning. Cervantes wanted to express a lack of courage, not ridicule, and for this reason, in terms of meaning, Shelton is more accurate.

16. **Morisco aljamiado:** Found in chapter IX, of the first part, when Don Quixote finds papers written in Arabic. "Y puesto que aunque los conocía no los sabía leer, anduve mirando si parecí por allí algun morisco aljamiado que los leyese [...]" (Cervantes, 1999a:158). *Aljamiado* is a person able to read *aljamía*, that is a "Texto morisco en romance, pero transcrito con caracteres árabes" (RAE). *Moor turned Spaniard thereabouts* and *Spanish-speaking moor* are Shelton and Rutherford's translation, respectively.

Both of them are using a descriptive equivalent in order to translate the word *aljamiado*. Shelton's option is difficult to understand and not completely accurate, because it does not imply that it is a person able to read *aljamía*. On the other hand, Rutherford's version is better in this case, as it is easier to understand and it conveys the meaning the original word has.

17. **Sudar el hopo:** Found in chapter X, of the first part, when Sancho and Don Quixote are talking about going to jail because of their previous battle. "Pareceme, señor, que sería acertado irnos a retraer a alguna iglesia; que, según quedó maltrecho aquel con quien os combatisteis, no será mucho que den noticia del caso a la Santa Hermandad y nos prendan; y a fe que si lo hacen que primero que salgamos de la cárcel , que nos ha de sudar el hopo" (Cervantes, 1999a:163). This expression means "Costar mucho trabajo y afán la consecución de algo" (RAE). Shelton uses the expression *sweat for it* that means work hard for something. Rutherford translated it as *sweat blood*.

In the case of Shelton, his version is a functional equivalent that expresses that something is hard to achieve. However Rutherford's option is stronger in its meaning. Rutherford achieves the meaning by using an idiomatic translation which means the same as *sudar el hopo*. Shelton's translation is lacking some intensity, he expresses that it is something hard to achieve but not as hard as Cervantes expressed.

18. **Azumbres:** Found in chapter X, of the first part, when Don Quixote and Sancho are talking about the Fierabras balsam. "Con menos de tres reales se pueden hacer tres azumbres" (Cervantes, 1999a:163). *Azumbres* in Spanish means "medida de capacidad para líquidos equivalente a unos dos litros" (RAE). Shelton decides to use the term *gallons*, which is "a unit of liquid measurement equal to four British quarts or 4.546 litres" (Merriam Webster) and Rutherford, *pints*, which is "a unit for measuring liquids that is equal to 0.473 litres" (Merriam Webster).

Both of them use a cultural equivalent for this term. In the source text the measure is about 6 litres in total. Shelton translated it as 3 gallons, which is 12 litres approximately and Rutherford as 12 pints which are, 6 litres more or less. Rutherford's cultural equivalent is the correct one. The possible explanation for Shelton to translate *azumbres* this way is that he only took into account the word as a measure and not as the litres it contains, so he chose an English measure and forgot about how much it is.

19. **Pasarlo en flores:** Found in chapter X, of the first part, when Don Quixote and Sancho talk about a hidalgo diet. "[H]ágote saber, Sancho, que es honra de los

caballeros andantes no comer en un mes, y, ya que coman, sea de aquello que hallaren más a mano; y esto se te hiciera cierto si hubieras leído tantas historias como yo; que aunque han sido muchas, en todas ellas no he hallado hecha relación de que los caballeros andantes comiesen, si no era acado y en algunos suntuosos banquetes que les hacían, y los demás días se los pasaban en flores" (Cervantes, 1999a:163). This expression means "mantenerse con cosas de poca sustancia" (Cervantes, 1999:163). Shelton decides to translate this expression as *days passed over with herbs and roots*, and Rutherford as *they used to live on next to nothing*.

Shelton uses a synonym for flowers, which causes the expression to lose its idiomatic nature, but the reader can still understand what it means. Rutherford uses a functional equivalent that captures the meaning of the original expression, but again it loses some of its idiomatic nature. In this case, Rutherford is straightforward with his expression which better suits the situation in the book.

20. **Sentarse sobre un dornajo:** Found in chapter XI, of the first part, when Don Quixote and Sancho meet the goatherds. "Sentáronse a la redonda de las pieles seis de los, que eran los que en la majada había, habiendo primero con groseras ceremonias rogado a don Quijote que se sentase sobre un dornajo que vuelto del revés le pusieron" (Cervantes, 1999:168). A *dornajo* is a "especie de artesa, pequeña y redonda, que sirve para dar de comer a los cerdos, para fregar o para otros usos" (RAE). Shelton translates it as *trough*, that is "a long, shallow container from which animals (such as cows, pigs, horses, etc.) eat or drink" (Merriam Webster). Rutherford uses the term *bowl*, which is "a concave usually nearly hemispherical vessel; specifically: a drinking vessel (as for wine)" (Merriam Webster).

Shelton's procedure is a cultural equivalence that perfectly fits the text and is the right translation for the Spanish term. On the other hand, Rutherford uses the term *bowl*, which is too general and is not completely what Cervantes was talking about in his book. The size of a *dornajo* is better represented through the use of *trough* rather than a *bowl*.

21. **La ley del encaje:** Found in chapter XI, of the first part, when Don Quixote was with the goatherds. "La ley del encaje aún no se había sentado en el

entendimiento del juez, porque entonces no había que juzgar, ni quien fuese juzgado" (Cervantes, 1999a:168). This 'law' is a "dictamen o juicio que discrecionalmente forma el juez, sin atender a lo que las leyes disponen" (RAE). Shelton translates this as the *law of corruption or taking bribes*, and Rutherford as *yet the judge could not make his whim the measure of the law; whim* is "a sudden wish, desire, decision, etc" (Merriam Webster).

Shelton's option is very different from the original. It can be a functional equivalent and a paraphrase, but he adds the idea of corruption, which is not necessary or even mentioned in the original text. It makes his translation weak and distant from the original. Rutherford on the other hand uses the word *whim*, which means the judge's decision, without adding any other nuance. Neither of them truly reflect the original, but Rutherford is closer with his translation as he includes the nuance of instantaneity that Shelton lacks.

22. **Rabel:** Found in chapter XI, of the first part, when Don Quixote is talking with the goatherds. "Apenas había el cabrero acabado de decir esto cuando llegó a sus oídos el son del rabel [...]" (Cervantes, 1999a:171). *Rabel* is "Instrumento musical pastoril, pequeño, de hechura como la del laúd y compuesto de tres cuerdas solas, que se tocan con arco y tienen un sonido muy agudo" (RAE). Shelton uses the term *rebec* and Rutherford the term *fiddle*. A *rebec* is "an ancient bowed usually 3-stringed musical instrument with a pear-shaped body and slender neck" (Merriam Webster) and a *fiddle* a "violin"(Merriam Webster).

Both of the translations are cultural equivalents, however Shelton's is more precise than Rutherford's. A *fiddle* is a violin, which has little to do with the original term. Maybe Rutherford wanted to express the idea that it was a string instrument, and for him the instrument itself was irrelevant. *Fiddle* can be used in this context, since they were used from the 13th Century onwards, but a *fiddle* and a *rabel* are not the same instrument, which is why Shelton's choice is better (Merriam Webster).

23. **Hijodalgo:** Found in chapter XII, of the first part, when Don Quixote finds a dead body. "Y don Quijote rogó a Pedro le dijese qué muerto era aquél [...] el muerto era un hijodalgo rico, vecino de un lugar que estaba en aquellas sierras

[...]" (Cervantes, 1999a:171). *Hijodalgo* is another way to say *hidalgo* (RAE). This time, Shelton translates it as *gentleman* and Rutherford as *hidalgo*.

Shelton is not translating the term correctly. He uses *gentleman*, maybe because he did not make the connection between *hijodalgo* and *hidalgo*. Were he to connect them, he would have used the term *knight-errant* or *knight* as he had done previously for the word *hidalgo*. On the contrary, Rutherford sees the synonymy between the two Spanish terms and maintains his previous translation, which, in this case, is the correct one.

24. **De Ceca en Meca y de zoca en colodra:** Found in chapter XVIII, of the first part, when Sancho wants to go back home. "Y lo que sería mejor y más acertado, según mi poco entendimiento, fuera el volvernós a nuestro lugar, ahora que es tiempo de la siega y de entender en la hacienda, dejándonos de andar de Ceca en Meca y de zoca en colodra, como dicen" (Cervantes, 1999a:227). This expression is explained in a footnote in the same page, and it says "Ceca era, para los moros, la mezquita de Córdoba, así que andar de Ceca en Meca equivale a andar de una parte a otra. De zoca en colodra, de plaza en taberna" (Cervantes, 1999a:227). Shelton translates it as *out of the frying-pan into the fire*, which means "when you move from a bad or difficult situation to one that is worse" (Cambridge Dictionary). Rutherford uses *gallivanting about from pillar to post and from the frying-pan into the fire*, which means "from one thing or place to another" (The Free Dictionary).

Both of them rely on an idiomatic translation and modulation for the translation of this term, and both of them convey the meaning of the original. It is true that although both of them mean the same, Rutherford's is the best, because it contains both parts of the expression that is found in the original text. This intensifies the sense of movement whereas Shelton's omission of the second part nullifies Cervantes's intention.

25. **Alfana:** Found in chapter XVIII, of the first part, in the description of the flocks Don Quixote encounters. "[E]l otro, que carga y oprime los lomos de aquella poderosa alfana, [...] es un caballero novel, de nación francés, llamado Pierres Papín.[...]" (Cervantes, 1999a:230). An *Alfana* is "caballo corpulento, fuerte y brioso." (RAE). Shelton uses the word *course* for his translation which means "a

swift or spirited horse” (Merriam Webster), and Rutherford *stead*, “horse; especially: a spirited horse (as for war)” (Merriam Webster).

They have both used synonymy as the translation procedure, and neither of them really conveys the original meaning of the term. It can be said that Shelton’s *courser* was first used in 1600 so it could have been a very adequate synonym at the time he translated it (Merriam Webster). Nevertheless, both options are equally correct for the translation of the terms.

26. **Un cuartal de pan, o una hogaza y dos cabezas de sardinas arenques:** Found in chapter XVIII, of the first part, when Don Quixote and Sancho are talking about what they want to eat. “[T]omara yo ahora más aína un cuartal de pan, o una hogaza y dos cabezas de sardinas arenques [...]” (Cervantes, 1999a:235). As it is explained in the book, a *cuartal* is “la cuarta parte de una hogaza, tal vez dos libras” (Cervantes, 1999:230), and *hogaza* is a “pan grande que pesa más de dos libras” (RAE). Shelton version is a quarter of a loaf or a cake, and two pilchard’s heads. Rutherford choice is a two-pound loaf of white bread or indeed and eight pound-loaf of bran bread and a couple of dozen salted pilchards.

Shelton uses a cultural equivalent and translates *pan* as *loaf*, which can be acceptable since a loaf is “an amount of bread that has been baked in a long, round, or square shaped” (Merriam Webster); and *hogaza* as *cake*, which is completely wrong. A *hogaza* in Spanish is round-shaped bread and not a cake. He has probably chosen *cake* because of the similarity of the shape.

Rutherford uses a cultural equivalent together with a descriptive one, since he explains the weight of that first loaf, and also the ingredients of the second one. His translation is very accurate and significantly better, as a *hogaza* is “pan de harina mal cernida, que contiene algo de salvado” (RAE) which is why Rutherford translated it as bran bread.

27. **De noche todos los gatos son pardos:** Found in chapter XXXIII of the second part, when Sancho is talking about food. “Tan buen pan hacen aquí como en Francia; y de noche todos los gatos son pardos; y asa de desdichada es la persona que a las dos de la tarde no se ha desayunado [...]” (Cervantes, 1999b:281). This expression means that in the dark everything seems to be the

same (Centro Virtual Cervantes). Shelton used the expression *in the night Joan is as good as my lady* and Rutherford *in the dark all cats are grey*.

Both translators rely on an idiomatic translation and modulation, the only difference is that Shelton's is invented and Rutherford exists. The intention and meaning is the same, which make both translations acceptable. Maybe since Shelton's is invented, it is more creative and a bit harder to understand for the reader.

28. **Olla podrida:** Found in chapter XLVII of the second part, when Sancho is talking about food. "Aquel platonazo que está más adelante vahando me parece que es olla podrida que por la diversidad de cosas que en tales ollas podridas hay, no podré dejar de topar con alguna que sea de gusto y de provecho" (Cervantes, 1999b:281). This dish is an "olla que, además de la carne, tocino y legumbres, tiene en abundancia jamón, aves, embutidos y otras cosas suculentas" (RAE). Shelton uses the same term as in Spanish, although it has no meaning in English, and Rutherford uses the Spanish term once before using *hotch-potch* stew. This last term "a thick soup or stew of vegetables, potatoes, and usually meat" (Merriam Webster).

Shelton transfers the Spanish term and then adds an explanatory note "a pot with all kind of flesh together" (Gavilan Edu, 2005), which makes the reader understand the term perfectly. Rutherford is more varied this time, as he uses a transference for the first time the term appears and then he uses the idea of a *hotch-potch stew* which is a cultural equivalent, yet far from the original. In the Spanish dish the predominant ingredient is meat from different animals and in Rutherford's term the main ingredients are vegetables. For this reason, Shelton's choice is more adequate.

29. **Gazpacho:** Found in chapter LIII of the second part, when Sancho is sick. "[...] más quiero hartarme de gazpachos que estar sujeto a la miseria de un médico impertinente que me mate de hambre [...]" (Cervantes, 1999b:429). *Gazpacho* is a typical Spanish dish, which has several versions. The one from this region in Spain is also called *galiano* and it is a "guiso que hacen los pastores con diversas carnes de cacería, troceadas y deshuesadas, extendido sobre un fondo de masa de

pan" (RAE). Shelton decides to use the term *gaspacho* which has no meaning in English, and Rutherford uses the sentence *bread and meat soup*.

Shelton transfers the term and then makes a naturalization procedure in order for it to be correctly pronounced in English. He gives no explanation, which makes it incomprehensible for the English speaking reader. Rutherford, on the other hand, has created a descriptive equivalent in order to explain the dish, and it is a very clever option. Nowadays the word *gazpacho* is widely known among the English speaking community, but that *gazpacho* is not the one Cervantes was talking about, rather the Andalusian recipe (bread, tomatoes, cucumbers, peppers, and onions). In this case Rutherford is the most accurate.

30. Parece argado sobre argado y no miel sobre hojuelas: Found in chapter LXIX of the second part, when Don Quixote and Sancho are arguing about Dulcinea. "Esto me parece argado sobre argado y no miel sobre hojuelas. Bueno sería que tras pellizcos, mamonas y alfilerazos viniesen ahora los azotes" (Cervantes, 1999b:545). *Argado* is "Enredo, travesura, dislate" (RAE), and *miel sobre hojuelas* means something nice. Sour upon sour is Shelton's choice. Rutherford opts for *that wouldn't be so much gilding the lily as piling codswallop on top of stuff and nonsense*.

Shelton is omitting a part of the sentence, the one that talks about something pleasant, and just translates the negative part by using a functional equivalent. *Sour* means unpleasant or unfriendly" (Merriam Webster). With this, Shelton is able to convey the original meaning, but he is still missing half of the sentence.

Rutherford is more elaborate in his translation, as he changes the order of the original and says first the pleasant part and then the negative. He creates his own sentence by using an idiomatic translation at first and then a functional equivalent. His idiomatic translation is *gilding the lily*, that means "to improve or decorate something that is already perfect and therefore spoil it" (Cambridge Dictionary). His functional equivalent is *piling codswallop on top of stuff and nonsense*, which is difficult to understand for the reader, but it is a mimic sentence of the original Spanish one, since *codswallop* means nonsense as well (Merriam Webster), so as such translates nonsense with nonsense.

In this case, both translations can be accepted, but neither of them are completely accurate, and they are difficult to understand. The best translation is the part of *gilding the lily* that Rutherford uses.

CONCLUSIONS

This paper tries to analyse the translating procedures used by Thomas Shelton and John Rutherford in their own translations of Don Quixote, more specifically in the translation of cultural terms. The results obtained in the analysis have been simplified in the following table, to make them more visual and easier to understand.

TRANSLATION PROCEDURE	SHELTON	RUTHERFORD
Transference	1	3
Transference + Naturalization	3	0
Transference + Notes	2	2
Cultural equivalent	9	5
Functional equivalent	2	3
Descriptive equivalent	2	5
Cultural + Descriptive equiv.	0	1
Synonymy	3	2
Synonymy + Notes	1	0
Modulation	3	7
Word-for-word	3	1
Omission	1	1
TOTAL	30	30

This table shows the number of times that each translator has used the translating procedures discussed before.

Shelton uses significantly more cultural equivalents in his work, which can be understood as a sign of cultural closeness and equivalence because Cervantes and Shelton lived through the same era. Shelton lived in Cervantes' Spain and learned his Spanish, one possible reason for him to finish the translation so quickly, and also for finding more cultural equivalencies. The other most used procedures would be word-for-word, synonymy, modulation and transference together with naturalization. Some of the transferences could be explained by the lack of dictionaries and resources available

to him, or even by the fact that he probably understood those terms himself, and thus did not find it necessary to add an explanation or to paraphrase them.

Rutherford's translation is 400 years apart from the original book, which means he uses different translation procedures, as nowadays English culture is notably different from the era of Don Quixote's. Rutherford relies more on modulation, which in his case normally implies an idiomatic translation. The next most used procedures are cultural and descriptive equivalents, with the occasional expression translated by a combination of the two procedures. Rutherford, in general, uses more explicative devices, probably due to the time gap between the original text and his translation.

Having analysed these two translations from a cultural perspective, it is palpable that they vary in the procedures used for the translation. This essay has proven that it is always important to take into account various factors that influence the translation and its process, such as, the period of time, the available resources, the country, the personal interpretation of the translator, etc. Therefore whilst both translations differ from one another they must both be considered as valid since there are as many translations as there are translators (Ruiz, 2005). Despite the mistakes that have been found in Shelton's translation it must still be considered a valuable contribution, especially bearing in mind the lack of resources he had at his disposal. Rutherford's, on the other hand, is clearly a more thorough translation. Nevertheless, both translations provide an insight into the context in which they were translated and the complexities of translating cultural terms.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Baños, Rocío. '*La Compensación Como Estrategia Para Recrear La Conversación Espontánea En El Doblaje de Comedias de Situación*'. Revista de Traductología (2013): 71–84. Print.
- Cambridge Dictionary - '*Cambridge Dictionary Online*'. N.p., n.d. Web. 22 May 2016. <http://dictionary.cambridge.org/es/>
- Centro Virtual Cervantes, *Refranero* N.p., n.d. Web 23 May 2016. <http://cvc.cervantes.es/portada.htm>
- Cervantes, Miguel de. *Don Quijote de La Mancha*. John Jay Allen. Barcelona: RBA Coleccionables, S.A., 1999a. Print.
- Cervantes, Miguel de. *Don Quijote de La Mancha*. John Jay Allen. Barcelona: RBA Coleccionables, S.A., 1999b. Print.
- Collins Dictionary. '*Collins Dictionary | Always Free Online.*' N.p., n.d. Web. 16 May 2016. <http://www.collinsdictionary.com/>
- García Yebra, Valentín. '*El Quijote Y La Traducción <En Otras Cosas Peores Se Podía Ocupar El Hombre Y Que Menos Provecho Le Trujesen>*'. *Panace@* 21–22. Septiembre-Diciembre (2005): 277–283. Print.
- Gavilan Edu '*Shelton's Don Quixote, Gavilan College*' 2005. N.p., n.d. Web. 16 May 2016. <http://hhh.gavilan.edu/fmayrhofer/spanish/shelton/>
- Knowles, Edwin B. *Thomas Shleton, Translator of Don Quixote*. The University of Chicago Press 1958
http://cvc.cervantes.es/literatura/cervantistas/congresos/cg_VII/cg_VII_16.pdf
- Kunz, Marco. "*In Un Placete de La Mancha of Which Nombre No Quiero Remembrearme*": Don Quijote En Spanglish Y Los Desafios de La Traducción Bilingüe.' 2005: n. pag. Print.
- Maestro, Jesús G. '*El Sistema Narrativo Del Quijote: La Construcción Del Personaje Cide Hamete Benengeli*'. 1995: n. pag. Print.

- Merriam-Webster. 'Dictionary and Thesaurus / Merriam-Webster'. N.p., n.d. Web. 16 May 2016. <http://www.merriam-webster.com/>
- Molina, Lucía. *El Otoño Del Pinguino. Análisis Descriptivo de La Traducción de Los Culturemas*. Castelló de la Plana: Publicacions de la Universitat Jaume I. Book Print Digital, SA, 2006. Print.
- Newmark, Peter. *A Textbook of Translation*. Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press, 1988. Print.
- Ordudari, Mahmoud. 'Translation Procedures, Strategies and Methods'. *Translation Journal Cultural Aspects* (2010): Print.
- Oxford Reference. 'Cultureme - Oxford Reference'. N.p., n.d. Web. 17 May 2016. <http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/oi/authority.20110803095652765>
- RAE- 'Diccionario de La Lengua Española - Edición Del Tricentenario'. *Diccionario de la lengua española*. N.p., n.d. Web. 16 May 2016. <http://dle.rae.es/?w=diccionario&origen=REDLE>
- Ruiz Casanova, José Francisco, Partzsch, Henriette, and Pennone, Florence. *De Poesía Y Traducción*. Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, S.L., 2005. Print.
- Rutherford, John. *Brevísima Historia de Las Traducciones Inglesas de Don Quijote*. N.p., 2007. Print.
- Rutherford, John. *Don Quixote*. London: Penguin Books, 2000. Print.
- The Free Dictionary- 'The Free Dictionary by Farlex'. N.p., n.d. Web. 21 May 2016. <http://www.thefreedictionary.com/>

ANNEX

These terms were taken from the web page Gavilan Edu,

(<http://hhh.gavilan.edu/fmayrhofer/spanish/shelton/>). Here they are presented in context.

1. **Knight-errant / Gentleman:** (Part I Chapter I) The History of the Valorous & Witty *Knight-Errant* Don Quixote of the Mancha. / Wherein is Rehearsed the Calling and Exercise of the Renowned *Gentleman*, Don Quixote of the Mancha
2. **Gallimaufry:** (Chapter I) His pot consisted daily of somewhat more beef than mutton: a *gallimaufry* each night, *collops and eggs* on Saturdays, lentils on Fridays, and now and then a lean pigeon on Sundays, did consume three parts of his rents; the rest and remnant thereof was spent on a jerkin of fine puce, a pair of velvet hose, with pantofles of the same for the holy-days, and one suit of the finest vesture; for therewithal he honoured and set out his person on the work-days.
3. **Collops and eggs:** (Part I Chapter I) [Included in number 2].
4. **Quixada, or Quesada:** (Part I Chapter I) Some affirm that his surname was *Quixada, or Quesada* (for in this there is some variance among the authors that write his life), although it may be gathered, by very probable conjectures, that he was called Quixana.
5. **Acres (of arable land):** (Part I Chapter I) And his curiosity and folly came to that pass, that he made away many *acres* of arable land to buy him books of that kind, and therefore he brought to his house as many as ever he could get of that subject.
6. **To have more quarters than pence in a sixpence:** (Part I Chapter I) Then did he presently visit his horse, who (though *he had more quarters than pence in a sixpence*, through leanness, and more faults than Gonella's), having nothing on him but skin and bone; yet he thought that neither Alexander's Bucephalus, nor the Cid his horse Babieca, were in any respect equal to him.
7. **Rozinante:** (Part I Chapter I) He finally concluded to name him *Rozinante*, a name in his opinion lofty, full, and significant of what he had been when he was a plain jade, before he was exalted to his new dignity; being, as he thought, the best carriage beast of the world.
8. **Caraculiambro:** (Part I Chapter I) Madam, I am the giant *Caraculiambro*, lord of the island called Malindrania, whom the never-too-much-praised knight, Don

Quixote de la Mancha, hath overcome in single combat; and hath commanded to present myself to your greatness, that it may please your highness to dispose of me according unto your liking!

9. **No less thievish than Cacus:** (Chapter II) The host thought he had called him a castellano or constable, because he esteemed him to be one of the sincere and honest men of Castile, whereas he was indeed an Andalusian, and of the commark of St. Lucars, *no less thievish than Cacus*, nor less malicious and crafty than a student or page.
10. **Poor-john:** (Part I Chapter II) It chanced by hap to be on Friday, and therefore there was no other meat in the inn than a few pieces of a fish called in Castile abadexo, in Andalusia bacallao, and in some places curadillo, and in others truchuela, and is but *poor-john*.
11. **Dodkin:** (Part I Chapter VII) ‘That do I,’ replied Sancho Panza; ‘for I am fully persuaded, that although God would rain kingdoms down upon the earth, none of them would sit well on Mary Gutierrez her head; for, sir, you must understand that she’s not worth a *dodkin* for a queen.’
12. **Bottle:** (Part I Chapter VIII) Taking out of his wallet some belly-munition, he rode after his master, travelling and eating at once, and that with great leisure; and ever and anon he lifted up his *bottle* with such pleasure as the best-fed victualler of Malaga might envy his state.
13. **Biscaine:** (Part I Chapter VIII) To all these words which Don Quixote said, a certain *Biscaine* squire, that accompanied the coach, gave ear; who, seeing that Don Quixote suffered not the coach to pass onward, but said that it must presently turn back to Toboso, he drew near to him, and, laying hold on his lance, he said, in his bad Spanish and worse Basquish.
14. **Knight / Gentleman:** (Part I Chapter VIII) ‘Sir *knight*, we are neither devilish nor wicked, but religious men of St. Benet’s order, that travel about our affairs; and we know not whether or no there come any princesses forced in this coach.’
15. **Thou shalt see the water as soon as you carry away the cat:** (Part I Chapter VIII) The Biscaine replied, with great fury: ‘Not I a gentleman! I swear God thou liest, as well as I am a Christian, If thou cast away thy lance, and draw thy sword, *thou shalt see the water as soon as thou shalt carry away the cat*’.
16. **Moor turned Spaniard thereabouts:** (Part I Chapter IX) I found them torn in the streets, borne away by this my natural inclination, took one of the quires in

- my hand, and perceived it to be written in Arabical characters, and seeing that, although I knew the letters, yet could I not read the substance, I looked about to view whether I could perceive any *Moor turned Spaniard thereabouts*, that could read them; nor was it very difficult to find there such an interpreter.
17. **Sweat for it:** (Part I Chapter X) Methinks, sir, that it will not be amiss to retire ourselves to some church; for, according as that man is ill dight with whom you fought, I certainly persuade myself that they will give notice of the fact to the holy brotherhood, and they will seek to apprehend us, which if they do, in good faith, before we can get out of their claws, I fear me we shall *sweat for it*.
 18. **3 Gallons:** (Part I Chapter X) With less than three reals, quoth Don Quixote, ‘a man may make *three gallons* of it.
 19. **Days passed over with herbs and roots:** (Part I Chapter X) For though I passed over many, yet did I never find recorded in any that knights-errant did ever eat, but by mere chance and adventure, or in some costly banquets that were made for them, and all *the other days they passed over with herbs and roots*.
 20. **Sit upon a trough:** (Part I Chapter XI) There sat down round about the skins six of them, which were all that dwelt in that fold; having first (using some coarse compliments) placed Don Quixote *upon a trough*, turning the bottom up.
 21. **Law of corruption, or taking bribes, had not yet possessed the understanding of the judge...:** (Part I Chapter XI) *The law of corruption*, or taking bribes, had not yet possessed the understanding of the judge; for then was neither judge, nor person to be judged.
 22. **Rebec:** (Part I Chapter XI) To the end that you may more assuredly know, sir knight-errant, that we do entertain you with prompt and ready will, we will likewise make you some pastime by hearing one of our companions sing, who is a herd of good understanding, and very amorous withal, and can besides read and write, and play so well on a *rebec*, that there is nothing to be desired.
 23. **Gentleman:** (Part I Chapter XII) Peter made answer, that what he knew of the affair was, ‘that the dead person was a rich gentleman of certain village seated among those mountains, who had studied many years in Salamanca.
 24. **Omitting to leap thus, out of the frying-pan into the fire:** (Part I Chapter XVIII) And that which we might do best, according to my little understanding, were to return us again to our village, now that it is reaping-time, and look to our goods, omitting to leap thus, as they say, *out of the frying-pan into the fire*.

25. **Courser:** (Part I Chapter XVIII) The other, that burdens and oppressteth the back of that mighty *courser*, whose armour is as white as snow, and also his shield without any device, is a new knight of France, called Pierres Papin, lord of the barony of Utrique.
26. **A quarter of a loaf, or a cake, and two pilchard's heads:** (Part I Chapter XVIII) I would rather have now *a quarter of a loaf, or a cake, and two pilchard's heads*, than all the herbs that Dioscorides describeth, although they came glossed by Doctor Laguna himself
27. **In the night Joan is as good as my lady:** (Part II Chapter XXXIII) Here is as good bread made as in France; and *in the night Joan is as good as my lady*; and unhappy is that man that is to break his fast at two of the clock in the afternoon and there's no heart a handful bigger than another.
28. **Olla podrida (A pot with all kind of flesh sod together):** (Part II Chapter XLVII) Then quoth Sancho, 'That great dish that stands fuming there before me, methinks 'tis an *olla podrida* (A pot of all kind of flesh sod together); and by reason of the diversities of things it hath in it, I cannot but meet with something that will do me good'.
29. **Gaspacho:** (Part II Chapter LIII) I had rather fill myself with a good dish of *gaspachos* than be subject to the misery of an impertinent physician, that would kill me with hunger.
30. **Heyday, this is sour upon sour:** (Part II Chapter LXIX) *Heyday, this is sour upon sour*; 'twere good after these pinchings, tucks, and pins-prickings, that lashes should follow; there's no more to be done, but even take a good stone and tie it to my neck and cast me into a well, for which I should not grieve much, if so be that, to cure other folks' ills, I must be the pack-horse. Let me alone; if not, I shall mar all.