

Cognitive behaviour therapy for anxiety in psychosis: A systematic review and meta-analysis

David Heavens^{a*}, Kesley Odgers^a and Joanne Hodgekins^b

*^aCentral Norfolk Early Intervention Team, Norfolk and Suffolk
NHS Foundation Trust, Norwich, U.K.*

*^bDepartment of Clinical Psychology, University of East Anglia,
Norwich, U.K.*

**Corresponding author: Dr David Heavens, Central Norfolk Early Intervention
Team, Norfolk and Suffolk NHS Foundation Trust, 80 St. Stephen's Road, Norwich,
NR1 3RE, U.K. Tel: +44 330 058 1840; e-mail: dave.heavens@nsft.nhs.uk.*

Cognitive behaviour therapy for anxiety in psychosis: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Abstract.

Background: Anxiety is common in people with psychosis. Cognitive Behaviour Therapy (CBT) is an effective treatment for anxiety in people without psychosis. Given the prevalence of anxiety in those with psychosis, the efficacy of CBT in this population is important to consider. This review and meta-analysis therefore investigates the efficacy of CBT for anxiety in people with psychosis.

Method: Twenty-nine studies were identified through systematic review, including controlled, uncontrolled and case report designs. Seventeen controlled and uncontrolled studies were included in the quantitative synthesis.

Results: A medium, significant effect was found at post-treatment and follow-up when controlled and uncontrolled data were combined. For controlled between-groups data only, a small, significant effect was found at post-treatment and follow-up. The effect of CBT for anxiety on psychotic symptoms was investigated, resulting in a medium, significant effect for controlled and uncontrolled post-treatment data and a small, significant effect for controlled between-group data.

Conclusions: CBT might have some effect in treating anxiety in people with psychosis. However, this review highlights a lack of scientifically rigorous studies in this area. Further research is required, including the use of well-designed randomised controlled trials (RCTs).

Keywords: psychosis; schizophrenia; anxiety; cognitive behaviour therapy; systematic review, meta-analysis

Introduction

Anxiety is common in people with psychosis, resulting in distress and poor clinical outcomes (Pallanti et al., 2004). Although anxiety may be understood as a response to the experience of psychosis, it can also predate psychosis and present as co-morbid conditions (Howells et al, 2017). Achim et al. (2011) found that 38.3% of individuals with schizophrenia also met criteria for at least one anxiety disorder. Rates varied, with social anxiety being the most prevalent at 14.9%, followed by post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD; 12.4%) and obsessive compulsive disorder (OCD; 12.4%).

The role of anxiety is highlighted in cognitive-behavioural models of psychosis. Garety et al. (2001) suggest that anxiety leads to a ‘search for meaning’ in relation to psychotic symptoms, resulting in interpretations associated with threat. In support, Freeman et al. (2002) note that psychological processes involved in anxiety, such as threat, are implicated in the content of persecutory delusions. In further support, Morrison’s (2001) model describes psychotic symptoms as ‘intrusions into awareness’ and argues that these intrusions are maintained by common anxiety processes, such as attentional bias, safety behaviours and thought suppression.

Cognitive Behaviour Therapy (CBT) has been shown to be effective for anxiety in people without psychosis. In a meta-analysis of randomised placebo-controlled trials of CBT for anxiety disorders, Hofmann and Smits (2008) reported a

pooled effect size of 0.73 (95% confidence interval (CI), 0.88-1.65). Effect sizes ranged from 0.35 for panic disorder to 1.37 for OCD. More recently, Carpenter et al. (2018) found a pooled effect size of 0.56, with a small effect on quality of life (Hedges' $g = 0.30$). As found by Hofmann and Smits (2008), the largest effects were found in studies of CBT for OCD (Hedges' $g = 1.13$, 95% CI = 0.58-1.68, $p < .001$).

Whilst systematic reviews and meta-analyses investigating CBT for different types anxiety have been conducted (e.g. OCD; Schirmbeck and Zink, 2013; Tundo and Necci, 2016; PTSD; Brand et al., 2017; Sin and Spain, 2016; Sin et al., 2017; Swan et al., 2017; social anxiety; Michail et al., 2017), no meta-analysis has explored the effectiveness of CBT across the range of anxiety presentations in people with psychosis. A number of systematic reviews have investigated CBT for anxiety in people with psychosis (Braga et al., 2013; Opoka and Lincoln, 2017; Opoka et al., 2018). However, these include limited search strategies and omit relevant studies. The current study aims to extend and update these reviews and use a meta-analysis to explore the pooled effect size. Given the potential role of anxiety in psychosis, we are also interested in examining the impact of CBT for anxiety on psychotic symptoms.

Methods

Protocol and registration

The review was registered with the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO). Registration number CRD42017056250, http://www.crd.york.ac.uk/PROSPERO/display_record.php?ID=CRD42017056250.

Search strategy

Studies were identified via CINAHL Complete, MEDLINE (EBSCO), PsycINFO (EBSCO) and Web of Science. The Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, the UK Clinical Research (UKCRN) Study Portfolio and the ISRCTN Registry were also searched. Reference lists were scanned for studies not found electronically.

Literature was searched from the date of inception until 12th November 2018. Automatic alerts were used to identify studies following the database search. The following search terms were used: cognitive behavio* (therap* OR treatment* OR intervention*) OR cognitive (therap* OR treatment* OR intervention*) OR behavio* (therap* OR treatment* OR intervention*) OR CBT AND psychosis OR psychotic OR schizo* OR hallucination* OR delusion* OR paranoi* AND anxi* OR OCD OR "obsessive-compulsive" OR obsession* OR compulsion* OR panic OR agoraphobi* OR "acute stress" OR PTSD OR "post-trauma*" OR "posttrauma*" OR GAD OR "general* anxi*" OR worr* OR phobi* OR "social* anxi*" OR "social* phobi*".

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

Studies were included in the review if they met the following criteria: (1) full text articles in English; (2) randomised controlled trials (RCTs), open trials and case reports; (3) investigating a type or component of CBT; (4) participants (all ages) with a diagnosis of psychosis (including an episode of psychosis, schizophrenia spectrum disorder or mood disorder with psychotic features) or clinically significant levels of psychotic symptoms; (5) participants with a diagnosis of anxiety (as per search terms noted above) or clinically significant levels of anxiety symptoms. For studies with

‘severe mental illness’ samples, only data for participants with psychosis were included, when provided by the corresponding author(s).

Exclusion criteria were as follows: (1) studies primarily focused on ‘at risk’ or ‘ultra high risk’ populations; (2) investigation of stand-alone ‘third-wave’ interventions (e.g. compassion focused therapy, mindfulness); (3) anxiety was not the primary outcome measure; (4) no standardized measure of anxiety was used. Case reports were included in the review to provide an overview of the existing evidence base. However, they were not included in the quantitative synthesis.

Risk of bias

The Cochrane risk of bias tool (Higgins et al., 2011) was used to assess risk of bias within controlled and uncontrolled studies. A rating of ‘low’, ‘high’, or ‘unclear’ risk was provided for random sequence generation; allocation concealment; blinding of outcome assessors, incomplete outcome data; selective outcome reporting.

Data analysis

Comprehensive Meta-analysis 3.0 was used to analyse data from controlled and uncontrolled trials. Effect sizes (Hedges’ g), the 95% CI and p value were computed using means and standard deviations (SD), standard error or Cohen’s d . A random effects model was used to account for potential heterogeneity.

The primary outcome was anxiety severity and the secondary outcome was psychotic symptom severity. For controlled trials, between-group post-treatment means and SD were used. For uncontrolled trials, pre-post means and SD were used. To enable inclusion of controlled and uncontrolled trials in the same analysis, pre-post

means and SD were also used for the treatment group for controlled trials. Pre-treatment to follow-up and between-groups follow-up data (including follow-ups conducted up to six months post-treatment) were used to investigate treatment efficacy over time. Additional analyses were conducted for each type of anxiety using the pre-post data for all studies and between-group data for the controlled trials.

Where repeated measures correlations were not available, a conservative estimate of 0.7 was used, as suggested by Rosenthal et al. (1993). Heterogeneity was assessed using I^2 . As suggested by Higgins et al. (2003), an I^2 statistic of 25% or less was considered low, 50% was considered moderate and 75% was considered high. Publication bias was assessed by visual inspection of funnel plots and Fail-safe N.

Where data were available, reliable and clinical change were calculated for anxiety and psychosis data in the case reports at post-treatment and (up to six months) follow-up using standardised formula (Jacobson et al., 1984; Jacobson and Truax, 1991). As suggested by Wise (2004), outcomes were summarised as follows: reliable and clinical change (Recovered); reliable or clinical change (Improved); no reliable or clinical change (Unchanged); reliable change in a negative direction (Deteriorated).

Results

Search results and study selection

The study selection process is outlined in Figure 1. The initial search identified 4617 papers, of which 1408 were duplicates. Twenty-nine studies were included in the review and 17 controlled and uncontrolled trials were included in the quantitative

synthesis. Secondary outcome data for van den Berg et al. (2015) was also included in the quantitative synthesis, extracted from de Bont et al. (2016).

Some raw data for participants with psychosis from ‘severe mental illness’ samples were not suitable for inclusion due to insufficient participant numbers (Lu et al., 2012) or no information about diagnosis (Lu et al., 2009; Mueser et al., 2007; Rosenberg et al., 2004). Another study was excluded from the quantitative synthesis due to insufficient data to calculate effect size (Trappler and Newville, 2007).

Study characteristics

Study characteristics are outlined in Tables 1 and 2. Of the 29 studies included in the review, nine are controlled trials, eight are uncontrolled trials and 12 are case reports. The 17 studies in the quantitative synthesis involved 664 participants. The most studied type of anxiety was PTSD (n = 7), followed by social anxiety (n = 4), worry (n = 3), OCD (n = 1), panic disorder (n = 1) and anxiety (n = 1). For the controlled studies comparisons were typically made between CBT and treatment as usual (TAU) or wait-list (n = 8). One study (Mueser et al., 2015) compared CBT to a brief intervention including relaxation and psychoeducation. The 12 case reports included 15 participants. Most reports investigated CBT for PTSD (n = 5), followed by OCD, (n = 3), social anxiety (n = 2), panic disorder (n = 1) and specific phobia (n = 1).

Most studies used individual CBT (n = 22) but some used group CBT (n = 6). One study (Freuh et al., 2009) used both individual and group CBT (four vs. eight sessions). Treatment length varied from three (Hagen et al., 2014) to 66 sessions (Keen et al., 2017). Most studies (n = 22) used both cognitive and behavioural components. Two studies (Grubaugh et al., 2016; van den Berg et al., 2015) used

Prolonged Exposure (PE), two studies (Marcello et al., 2009; Mueser et al., 2015) used Cognitive Restructuring (CR), one study used written elaboration and CR (Kevan et al., 2007), one study used systematic desensitisation (Dudley et al., 2005) and one study used Exposure and Response Prevention (ERP; Ekers et al., 2004). Within a programme of CBT, two studies used Imagery Rescripting (ImRs; Callcott et al., 2004; Kayrouz et al., 2015) and one study used Virtual Reality (Gega et al., 2013).

Risk of bias assessment

Risk of bias assessment for the controlled and uncontrolled studies is displayed in Table 1. For the controlled studies, risk of bias was mostly low or unclear. Risk of bias varied across the uncontrolled studies, but was mostly high.

Synthesis of results

Effect size (Hedges' g), the 95% CI, p values and I^2 for each of the outcomes are shown in Table 3. Forest plots are displayed in Figure 2.

Primary outcomes

A medium effect was found for the pre-post controlled and uncontrolled anxiety data. However, when only between-group controlled study data were included, a small effect was found. Heterogeneity was moderate to high for the pre-post data, but reduced to low to moderate when only between-group data were included.

Effect size for pre-post controlled and uncontrolled data ranged from medium for panic disorder to large for clinical anxiety. For between-group controlled data, effect size ranged from small for PTSD to medium for social anxiety. At follow-up, a

medium effect was found for pre-post data and a small effect was found for between-group data. Again, heterogeneity was moderate to high for pre-post data, but reduced to low to moderate when only between-group data were included.

Secondary outcomes

A medium effect was found for the pre-post controlled and uncontrolled psychosis data. When only the between-group controlled study data were included, a small effect was found. Heterogeneity was moderate to high for the pre-post data and low when only the between-groups data were included.

Publication bias

Visual inspection of funnel plots did not reveal significant asymmetry for anxiety. For anxiety at post-treatment for the pre-post data, Fail-safe N revealed that 1110 ‘null’ studies would be needed to bring the overall treatment effect to non-significance. However, for the between-group data, Fail-safe N revealed that only 19 ‘null’ studies would be needed to bring the overall treatment effect to non-significance.

Discussion

This review identifies 29 studies that investigate CBT for anxiety in psychosis, with a total of 679 participants. Controlled (n = 9) and uncontrolled (n = 8) studies and case reports (n = 12) were included to provide an overview of the evidence base. Overall, this work highlights the paucity of scientifically rigorous studies in this area. Of the 29 studies included in the review, the following types of anxiety were represented: PTSD (n = 12); social anxiety (n = 6); worry (n = 3); OCD (n = 4), panic disorder (n = 2); clinical anxiety (n = 1) and specific phobia (n = 1).

The quantitative synthesis resulted in a pre-post effect size of 0.74 and a between-groups effect size of 0.35. The between-groups effect size is smaller than those reported in meta-analyses of CBT for anxiety in people without psychosis (i.e. Carpenter et al., 2018; Hedges' $g = 0.56$; Hofmann and Smits, 2008; Hedges' $g = 0.73$). Although this suggests that CBT for anxiety is less effective in psychosis compared to those without psychosis, only a small number of between-groups studies were available. Although a larger effect size was found for pre-post data, high heterogeneity was found. This is expected given variation in methodology across studies, but suggests these data should be interpreted with caution.

For psychotic symptoms, a medium effect size of 0.57 for pre-post data and a small effect size of 0.37 for between-group data was found. Although the latter finding suggests that CBT for anxiety only has a small effect on psychotic symptoms, a limited number of studies were used in the analysis ($n = 6$). As with the anxiety data heterogeneity was moderate to high for the pre-post data. Again, this is expected given varied methodology, but it should be considered in interpretation.

Only 13 out of the 29 studies included in the review used measures of psychosis. Although the aim of the studies was not to target psychotic symptoms, including measures of psychosis is important. Omitting such measures means that the overall impact of CBT for anxiety in people with psychosis will not be clear.

Limitations

Despite a comprehensive review, only a small number of controlled studies were found. Most studies were uncontrolled trials or case reports, limiting the conclusions that can be drawn. A high risk of bias was found in the uncontrolled studies and high

heterogeneity was found in the combined pre-post data and data for the different types of anxiety. Furthermore, only a small number of data were available for psychotic symptoms and follow-up.

Future research

Despite the prevalence and impact of anxiety in people with psychosis, the number of scientifically rigorous studies in this area is low. It is hoped that this work will encourage further research, including well-designed RCTs. The majority of studies identified investigated CBT for PTSD or social anxiety. It is hoped that interested researchers will investigate CBT for other types of anxiety in people with psychosis.

Interestingly, the between-groups effect size found in this meta-analysis is similar to the effect sizes found in meta-analyses investigating CBT for psychosis (e.g. Jauhar et al., 2014, 0.33; van der Gaag et al., 2014, 0.36 for delusions, 0.44 for hallucinations; Wykes et al., 2008, 0.40). It is possible that in people with psychosis CBT is as effective for anxiety as it is for psychotic symptoms. However, due to the lack of scientifically rigorous studies investigating CBT for anxiety in psychosis, this is not clear. Further research is required to gain a better understanding of the efficacy of CBT for anxiety in people with psychosis.

Conclusion

This is the first meta-analysis investigating CBT for anxiety in people with psychosis. The review provides an overview of the current evidence base, but in doing so highlights the paucity of scientifically rigorous studies in this area. Further research, including well-designed RCTs, is clearly warranted.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Catherine Bell and Sarah Howell from the Frank Curtis Library at Norfolk and Suffolk NHS Foundation Trust, for their assistance in sourcing journal articles for the systematic review.

Disclosure of interest

The authors report no conflict of interest.

Funding

There was no funding for this piece of work.

Complying with ethics of experimentation

No studies with human participants or animals were performed by the authors.

Consent

It was not possible or necessary to gain informed consent from any participants.

Health and safety

No experimental work was conducted by the authors.

References

- Achim, A. M., Maziade, M., Raymond, É., Olivier, D., Mérette, C., & Roy, M. A. (2009). How prevalent are anxiety disorders in schizophrenia? A meta-analysis and critical review on a significant association. *Schizophrenia Bulletin*, 37 (4), 811-821. doi:10.1093/schbul/sbp148
- Arlow, P. B., Moran, M. E., Bermanzohn, P. C., Stronger, R., & Siris, S.G. (1997). Cognitive-behavioral treatment of panic attacks in chronic schizophrenia. *Journal of Psychotherapy Practice Research*, 6(2), 145-150. doi:10.1016/S0920-9964(97)2982628-X
- Braga, R. J., Reynolds, G. P., & Siris, S. G. (2013). Anxiety comorbidity in schizophrenia. *Psychiatry Research*, 210(1), 1-7. doi:10.1016/j.psychres.2013.07.030
- Brand, R. M., McEnery, C., Rossell, S., Bendall, S., & Thomas, N. (2017). Do trauma-focussed psychological interventions have an effect on psychotic symptoms? A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Schizophrenia Research*, 195, 13-22. doi:10.1016/j.schres.2017.08.037
- Callcott, P., Standart, S., & Turkington, D. (2004). Trauma within psychosis: using a CBT model for PTSD in psychosis. *Behavioral and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 32(2), 239-244. doi:10.1017/s1352465804001249
- Carpenter, J. K., Andrews, L. A., Witcraft, S. M., Powers, M. B., Smits, J. A. J., & Hofmann, S. G. (2018). Cognitive behavioural therapy for anxiety and related disorders: a meta-analysis of randomized placebo-controlled trials. *Depression and Anxiety*, 35(6), 502-514. doi:10.1002/da.22728
- de Bont, P. A. J. M., van den Berg, D. P. G., van der Vleugel, B. M., de Roos, C., de

- Jongh, A., van der Gaag, M., & van Minnen, A. M. (2016). Prolonged exposure and EMDR for PTSD v. a PTSD waiting-list condition: effects on symptoms of psychosis, depression and social functioning in patients with chronic psychotic disorders. *Psychological Medicine*, 46(11), 2411-2421. doi:10.1017/S0033291716001094
- Dudley, R., Dixon, J., & Turkington, D. (2005). CBT for a person with schizophrenia: systematic desensitization for phobias led to positive symptom improvement. *Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 33(2), 249-254. doi:10.1017/s13524658 04002024
- Ekers, D., Carman, S., & Schlich, T. (2004). Successful outcome of exposure and response prevention in the treatment of obsessive compulsive disorder in a patient with schizophrenia. *Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 32(3), 375-378. doi:10.1017/S135246580400147X
- Foster, C., Startup, H., Potts, L., & Freeman, D. (2010). A randomised controlled trial of a worry intervention for individuals with persistent persecutory delusions. *Journal of Behavior Therapy and Experimental Psychiatry*, 41, 45-51. doi:10.1016/j.jbtep.2009.09.001
- Freeman, D., Dunn, G., Startup, H., Pugh, K., Cordwell, J., Mander, H., ...Kingdon, D. (2015). Effects of cognitive behaviour therapy for worry on persecutory delusions in patients with psychosis (WIT): a parallel, single-blind, randomised controlled trial with a mediation analysis. *Lancet Psychiatry*, 2(4), 305-313. doi:10.1016/S2215-0366(15)00039-5

- Freeman, D., Garety, P. A., Kuipers, E., Fowler, D., & Bebbington, P. E. (2002). A cognitive model of persecutory delusions. *British Journal of Clinical Psychology, 41*(4), 331-347. doi:10.1348/014466502760387461
- Frueh, B. C., Grubaugh, A. L., Cusack, K. J., Kimble, M. O., Elhai, J. D., Knapp, R. G. (2009). Exposure-based cognitive-behavioral treatment of PTSD in adults with schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder: a pilot study. *Journal of Anxiety Disorders, 23*(5), 665-675. doi:10.1016/j.janxdis.2009.02.005
- Garety, P. A., Kuipers, E., Fowler, D., Freeman, D., & Bebbington, P. E. (2001). A cognitive model of the positive symptoms of psychosis. *Psychological Medicine, 31*(2), 189-195. doi:10.1017/S0033291701003312
- Gega, L., White, R., Clarke, T., Turner, R., & Fowler, D. (2013). Virtual environments using video capture for social phobia with psychosis. *Cyberpsychology, Behavior and Social Networking, 16*(6), 473-479. doi:10.1089/cyber.2013.1510
- Good, J. (2002). The effect of treatment of a comorbid anxiety disorder on psychotic symptoms in a patient with a diagnosis of schizophrenia: a case study. *Behavioral and Cognitive Psychotherapy, 30*(3), 347-350. doi:10.1017/S1352465802003090
- Grubaugh, A. L., Clapp, J. D., Frueh, B. C., Tuerk, P. W., Knapp, R. G., & Egede, L. E. (2016). Open trial of exposure therapy for PTSD among patients with severe and persistent mental illness. *Behaviour Research and Therapy, 78*, 1-12. doi:10.1016/j.brat.2015.12.006
- Gruber, E. N., Dordević, V., Biocina-Martić, S., & Agius, M. (2006). "My new Alfa

- Romeo GT is not in the garage any more": cognitive behaviour therapy of panic disorder with agoraphobia co morbid with psychosis. *Psychiatra Danubina*, 18(3-4), 205-211. Retrieved from http://www.hdbp.org/psychiatria_danubina/
- Hagen, K., Solem, S., & Hansen, B. (2014). Cognitive behaviour therapy for obsessive-compulsive disorder with comorbid schizophrenia: a case report with repetitive measurements. *Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 42(3), 374-378. doi:10.1017/S1352465813000519
- Halperin, S., Nathan, P., Drummond, P., & Castle, D. (2000). A cognitive-behaviour, group-based intervention for social anxiety in schizophrenia. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*, 34(5), 809-813. doi:10.1080/j.1440-1614.2000.00820.x
- Hamblen, J. L., Jankowski, M. K., Rosenberg, S. D., & Mueser, K. T. (2004). Cognitive-behavioral treatment for PTSD in people with severe mental illness: three case studies. *American Journal of Psychiatric Rehabilitation*, 7(2), 147-170. doi:10.1080/15487760490476192
- Higgins, J. P. T., & Altman, D. G. (2008). Assessing risk of bias in included studies. In Higgins, J. P. T., & Green, S. (Ed.), *Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions* (pp. 187-241). West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Higgins, J. P., Thompson, S. G., Deeks, J. J., & Altman, D. G. (2003). Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. *BMJ*, 327(7414), 557-560. doi:10.1136/bmj.327.7414.557
- Hofmann, S. G., Bufka, L. F., Brady, S. M., Du Rand, C., & Goff, D. C. (2000).

- Cognitive-behavioral treatment of panic in patients with schizophrenia: Preliminary findings. *Journal of Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 14(4), 381-392.
- Hofmann, S. G., & Smits, J. A. (2008). Cognitive-behavioral therapy for adult anxiety disorders: a meta-analysis of randomized placebo-controlled trials. *Journal of Clinical Psychiatry*, 69(4), 621-632.
- Howells, F. M., Kingdon, D. G., Baldwin, D. S. (2017). Current and potential pharmacological and psychosocial interventions for anxiety symptoms and disorders in patients with schizophrenia: structured review. *Human Psychopharmacology: Clinical and Experimental*, 32(5), e2628.
doi:10.1002/hup.2628
- Isham, L., Grafahrend, H., Nickless, A., Pugh, K., Pleasants, S., Smedley, N., ... Mulligan, A. (2018). Group-based worry intervention for persecutory delusions: an initial feasibility Study. *Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 1-7. doi:10.1017/S1352465818000383
- Jacobson, N. S., Follette, W. C., Revenstorf, D. (1984). Psychotherapy outcome research: methods for reporting variability and evaluating clinical significance. *Behavior Therapy*, 15(4) 336-352. doi:10.1016/S0005-7894(84)80002-7
- Jacobson, N. S., & Truax, P. (1991). Clinical significance: a statistical approach to defining meaningful change in psychotherapy research. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 59(1), 12-19. doi:10.1037/0022-006X.59.1.12
- Jauhar, S., McKenna, P. J., Radua, J., Fung, E., Salvador, R., & Laws, K. R. (2014). Cognitive-behavioural therapy for the symptoms of schizophrenia: systematic review and meta-analysis with examination of potential bias. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 204, 20-29. doi:10.1192/bjp.bp.112.116285

- Kayrouz, R., & Vrkleviski, L. P. (2015). Fatal torment—from psychosis-driven index offence to trauma: a case study in forensic psychotherapy, trauma therapy and matricide. *Australasian Psychiatry*, 23(1), 54-58.
doi:10.1177/1039856214563850
- Keen, N., Hunter, E., & Peters, E. (2017). Integrated trauma-focused cognitive-behavioural therapy for post-traumatic stress and psychotic symptoms: a case-series study using imaginal reprocessing strategies. *Frontiers in Psychiatry*, 8(92), 1-17. doi:10.3389/fpsyt.2017.00092
- Kevan, I. M., Gumley, A. I., & Coletta, V. (2007). Post-traumatic stress disorder in a person with a diagnosis of schizophrenia: examining the efficacy of psychological intervention using single N methodology. *Clinical and Psychology and Psychotherapy*, 14(3), 229-243. doi:10.1002/cpp.534
- Kingsep, P., Nathan, P., & Castle, D. (2003). Cognitive behaviour group treatment for social anxiety in schizophrenia. *Schizophrenia Research*, 63(1-2), 121-129.
doi:10.1016/S0920-9964(02)900376-6
- Kobori, O., Sato, H., Katsukura, R., & Harada, S. (2008). Cognitive behaviour therapy for obsessive compulsive symptoms affected by past psychotic experience of schizophrenia: a case report. *Behavioral and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 36(3), 365-369. doi:10.1017/s1352465808004360
- Liberati, A., Altman, D. G., Tetzlaff, J., Mulrow, C., Gøtzsche, P. C., Ioannidis, M. C., ... Moher, D. (2009). The PRISMA statement for reporting systematic review and meta-analysis of studies that evaluate healthcare interventions: explanation and elaboration. *BMJ Open*, 339, b2700. doi:10.1136/bmj.b2700
- Lu, W., Fite, R., Kim, E., Hyer, L., Yanos, P. T., Mueser, K. T., & Rosenberg, S. D.

- (2009). Cognitive-behavioral treatment of PTSD in severe mental illness: pilot study replication in an ethnically diverse population. *American Journal of Psychiatric Rehabilitation*, 12(1), 73-91. doi:10.1080/15487760802615863
- Lu, W., Yanos, P. T., Gottlieb, J. D., Marcello Duva, S., Silverstein, S. M., Xie, H., ...Mueser, K. (2012). Use of fidelity assessments to train clinicians in the CBT for PTSD program for clients with serious mental illness. *Psychiatric Services*, 63(8), 785-792. doi:10.1176/appi.ps.201000458
- Marcello, S. C., Hilton-Lerro, K., & Mueser, K. T. (2009). Cognitive behavioral therapy for posttraumatic stress disorder in persons with psychotic disorders. *Clinical Case Studies*, 8(6), 438-453. doi:10.1177%2F1534650109355188
- Michail, M., Birchwood, M., & Tait, L. (2017). Systematic review of cognitive-behavioural therapy for social anxiety disorder in psychosis. *Brain Sciences*, 7(5), 45-55. doi:10.3390/brainsci7050045
- Montreuil, T. C., Malla, A. K., Jooper, R., Bélanger, C., Myhr, G., & Lepage, M. (2016). Manualized group cognitive-behavioral therapy for social anxiety in at-risk mental state and first episode psychosis: a pilot study of feasibility and outcomes. *International Journal Group Psychotherapy*, 66(2), 225-245. doi:10.1080/00207284.2015.1106190
- Morrison, A. P. (2001). The interpretation of intrusions in psychosis: an integrative cognitive approach to hallucinations and delusions. *Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 29(3), 257-276. doi:10.1017/S1352465801003010
- Mueser, K. T. (2007). Integrating psychosocial treatment for PTSD and severe mental illness. *Psychiatric Times*, 24(7), 33-33.

- Mueser, K. T., Gottlieb, J. D., Xie, H., Lu, W., Yanos, P. T., Rosenberg, S. D.,
...McHugo, G. J. (2015). Evaluation of cognitive restructuring for post-
traumatic stress disorder in people with severe mental illness. *British Journal
of Psychiatry*, 206(6), 501-508. doi:10.1192/bjp.bp.114.147926
- Mueser, K. T., Rosenberg, S. D., Xie, H., Jankowski, M. K., Bolton, E. E., Lu, W.,
...Wolfe, R. (2008). A randomized controlled trial of cognitive-behavioral
treatment for posttraumatic stress disorder in severe mental illness. *Journal of
Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 76(2), 259-271. doi:10.1037/0022-
006X.76.2.259
- Opoka, S. M., Lincoln, T. M. (2017). The effect of cognitive-behavioural
interventions on depression and anxiety symptoms in patients with
schizophrenia spectrum disorders: a systematic review. *Psychiatric Clinics of
North America*, 40(4), 641-659. doi:10.1016/j.psc.2017.08.005
- Opoka, S. M., Ludwig, L., & Lincoln, T. M. (2018). A systematic review of trials
targeting depression and anxiety in patients with delusions: an emotion-
focused perspective. *Zeitschrift für Psychologie*, 226(3), 142-151.
doi:10.1027/2151-2604/a000331
- Pallanti, S., Cantisani, A., & Grassi, G. (2013). Anxiety as a core aspect of
schizophrenia. *Current Psychiatry Reports*, 15(5), 354-359.
doi:10.1007/s11920-013-0354-7
- Rosenberg, S. D., Mueser, K. T., Jankowski, M. K., Salyers, M. P., & Acker, K.
(2004). Cognitive-behavioral treatment of PTSD in severe mental illness:
results of a pilot study. *American Journal of Psychiatric Rehabilitation*, 7,
171-186. doi:10.1080/15487760490476200

- Rosenthal, R. (1993). *Meta-analytic procedures for social research*. Newbury Park: Sage.
- Schirmbeck, F., & Zink, M. (2013). Cognitive behavioural therapy for obsessive-compulsive symptoms in schizophrenia. *Cognitive Behaviour Therapy*, 6(4) 1-13. doi:10.1017/S1754470X13000123
- Sin, J., & Spain, D. (2017). Psychological interventions for trauma in individuals who have psychosis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Psychosis*, 9(1), 67-81. doi:10.1080/17522439.2016.1167946
- Sin, J., Spain, D., Furuta, M., Murrells, T., & Norman, I. (2017). Psychological interventions for post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) in people with severe mental illness. *Cochrane Library*, 1, 1-25. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD011464.pub2
- Steel, C., Hardy, A., Smith, B., Wykes, T., Rose, S., Enright, S., ...Rose, D. (2016). Cognitive-behaviour therapy for post-traumatic stress in schizophrenia. a randomized controlled trial. *Psychological Medicine*, 47(1), 43-51. doi:10.1017/S0033291716002117
- Swan, S., Keen, N., Reynolds, N., & Onwumere, J. (2017). Psychological interventions for post-traumatic stress symptoms in psychosis: a systematic review of outcomes. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 8(341), 168-181. doi:10.3389/fpsyg.2017.00341
- Trappler, B., & Newville, H. (2007). Trauma healing via cognitive behavior therapy in chronically hospitalized patients. *Psychiatry Quarterly*, 78(4), 317-325. doi :10.1007/s11126-007-9049-8
- Tully, P. J., & Edwards, C. J. (2009). Schizophrenia, obsessive covert mental rituals

- and social anxiety: case report. *Clinical Psychologist*, 13(2), 75-77.
doi:10.1080/1328420 0902810460
- Tundo, A., & Necci, R. (2016). Cognitive-behavioural therapy for obsessive-compulsive disorder co-occurring with psychosis: systematic review of evidence. *World Journal of Psychiatry*, 6(4), 449-455.
doi:10.5498/wjp.v6.i4.449
- Tundo, A., Salvati, L., Cieri, L., Daniele, M., Di Spigno, D., Necci, R., & Parena, A. (2014). Effectiveness and outcome predictors of cognitive-behavioural therapy for obsessive-compulsive disorder co-occurring with psychosis. *Journal of Psychopathology*, 20, 127-133. doi:10.5498/wjp.v6.i4.449
- van den Berg, D. P., de Bont, P. A., van der Vleugel, B. M., de Roos, C., de Jongh, A., Van Minnen, A., & van der Gaag, M. (2015). Prolonged exposure vs eye movement desensitization and reprocessing vs waiting list for posttraumatic stress disorder in patients with a psychotic disorder: a randomized clinical trial. *JAMA Psychiatry*, 72(3), 259-267.
doi:10.1001/jamapsychiatry.2014.2637
- van der Gaag, M., Valmaggia, L.R., & Smit, F. (2014). The effects of individually tailored formulation-based cognitive behavioural therapy in auditory hallucinations and delusions: a meta-analysis. *Schizophrenia Research*, 156, 30-37. doi:10.1016/j.schres.2014.03.016
- Welfare-Wilson, A., & Newman, R. (2013). Cognitive behaviour therapy for psychosis and anxiety. *British Journal of Nursing*, 22(18), 1061-1065.
doi:10.12968/bjon.2013.22.18.1061
- Williams, M. T., Capozzoli, M. C., Buckner, E. V., & Yusko, D. (2015). Cognitive-

treatment of social anxiety disorder and comorbid paranoid schizophrenia.

Clinical Case Studies, 14(5), 323-341. doi:10.1177/1534650114559717

Wise, E.A. (2004). Methods for analysing psychotherapy outcomes: a review of clinical significance, reliable change and recommendations for future directions. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, 82(1), 50-59.
doi:10.1207/s15327752jpa8201_10

Wykes, T., Steel, C., Everitt, B., & Tarrrier, N. (2008). Cognitive behavior therapy for schizophrenia: effect sizes, clinical models, and methodological rigor. *Schizophrenia Bulletin*, 34(3), 523-537. doi:10.1093/schbul/sbm114

Table 1. Study characteristics (controlled and uncontrolled trials).

Author	Design	N	Diagnoses	Mean age (SD) ^a	% Male ^b	Treatment	Max no. of sessions (mean)	Control group	% attrition ^c	Outcome measures used	Follow-up (months) ^d	Risk of bias
<i>Controlled trials</i>												
Foster et al. (2010)	RCT	24	Schizophrenia/schizoaffective disorder/delusional disorder and worry	40.0 (10.0)	58	CBT	4 (*)	TAU	16.7	PSWQ PSYRATS - delusions	2	LLHHL
Freeman et al. (2015)	RCT	150	Schizophrenia/schizoaffective disorder/ delusional disorder and worry	40.9 (10.5)	58	CBT	6 (5.5)	TAU	6	PSWQ PSYRATS- delusions	4	LLULL
Halperin et al. (2000)	RCT	16	Schizophrenia and social anxiety	39.6 (*)	81.3	CBGT	8 (*)	Waitlist	0	BSPS	1.5	UUUHL
Kingssep et al. (2003)	RCT	33	Schizophrenia and social anxiety	* (*)	69.7	CBGT	13 (*)	Waitlist	24.2	SIAS	2	UULHL
Isham et al. (2018)	RCT	13	Schizophrenia-spectrum disorder and worry	48.0 (*)	*	CBGT	8 (5.7)	Waitlist	7.69	PSWQ PSYRATS - delusions	1	UUHLL
Mueser et al. (2008) ^e	RCT	17	Schizophrenia/schizoaffective disorder and PTSD	44.2 (10.6)	21.3	CBT	12-16 (*)	TAU	49.1	CAPS	6	LLLLL
Mueser et al. (2015) ^e	RCT	67	Schizophrenia/schizoaffective disorder and PTSD	43.0 (10.5)	33	CR	12-16 (*)	Brief intervention	22.4	CAPS PANSS (Positive)	6, 12	LLLLL

Steel et al. (2016)	RCT	61	Schizophrenia/schizoaffective disorder and PTSD	42.3 (10.2)	62.3	CBT	16 (12.3)	TAU	23	CAPS-S PANSS (Positive)	6	L L L H L
van den berg et al. (2015)	RCT	155	Schizophrenia spectrum/psychotic disorders and PTSD	41.2 (10.5)	45.81	PE	8 (7.1)	Waitlist	17.4	CAPS PSYRATS - delusions	6	L L L L L
<i>Uncontrolled trials</i>												
Arlow et al. (1997)	OT	8	Schizophrenia and panic disorder	38 (*)	75	CBGT	16 (16)	N/A	27.28	WASPA	0	H H H H L
Freuh et al. (2009)	OT	20	Schizophrenia/schizoaffective disorder and PTSD	42.3 (8.4)	25	CBT (4 sessions) and CBGT (8 sessions)	22 (17.1)	N/A	35	CAPS	3	H H H H U
Gega et al. (2013)	OT	6	Psychosis and social phobia	* (*)	100	CBT with VR	12	N/A	0	SIAS GPTS	3	H H H L L
Grubaugh et al. (2016)	OT	34	Psychotic disorder/bipolar disorder or mood disorder with psychotic features and PTSD	47.8 (13.4)	88.2	PE	10-15 (7.2)	N/A	*	CAPS	6	H H U H L
Keen et al. (2017)	OT	9	Psychosis and PTSD	37 (11.3)	56	CBT	25-66 (median = 41)	N/A	22	PDS PSYRATS - delusions	6	H H H L L
Montreuil et al.	OT	29	Psychosis (n = 23)/ARMS (n = 6) and social anxiety	* (*)	*	CBGT	14 (12)	N/A	10	SIAS SAPS	6	H H U H L

(2016)												
Tundo et al. (2014)	OT	21	Schizophrenia/schizoaffective disorder and OCD	29 (5.4)	61.9	CBT	8-41 (34.3 schizophrenia; 31.1 schizoaffective)	N/A	24	Y-BOCS	12	H H U L L
Welfare-Wilson and Newman (2013)	OT	7	Psychosis and anxiety	25 (*)	57	CBGT	12 (12)	N/A	0	DASS-21	3	H H H H L

Note: * = data not available, ARMS = At-Risk Mental State; BSPS = Brief Social Phobia Scale, CAPS = Clinician Administered PTSD Scale, CAPS-S = Clinician Administered PTSD Scale for Schizophrenia, CBT = Cognitive behavioural therapy, CBGT = Cognitive behavioural group therapy, CR = Cognitive Restructuring, DASS-21 = Depression, Anxiety, Stress Scale – Short Form, GPTS = Green et al. Paranoid Thoughts Scale, H = High, L = Low, N/A = not applicable, OCD = obsessive compulsive disorder, OT = open trial, PANSS = Positive and Negative Syndrome Scale, PDS = Post-traumatic Diagnostic Scale, PE = Prolonged Exposure; PSYRATS = Psychotic Symptom Rating Scales, PSWQ = Penn State Worry Questionnaire, PTSD = post-traumatic stress disorder, RCT = randomised controlled trial, SAPS = Scale for the Assessment of Positive Symptoms, SIAS = Social Interaction Anxiety Scale, TAU = Treatment as usual, U = Unclear, VR = Virtual Reality, WASPA = Westergaard Assessment Scale for Panic Attacks, Y-BOCS = Yale-Brown Obsessive Compulsive Scale.

^{a, b} Whereby mean age and gender data presented for intervention and control group only, intervention data are used.

^c% attrition based on longest follow-up data available.

^dLongest follow-up point recorded.

*Only participants with psychosis were included in the quantitative synthesis. The data presented in the table are for the full sample, as raw data on these characteristics were not made available.

Table 2. Study characteristics (Case reports).

Study	N	Diagnoses	Age	Gender	Treatment	No. of sessions	Outcome measures used	Follow-up (months)	Clinical change	Reliable change	Outcome
Callcott et al. (2004)	1	Psychosis and PTSD	34	F	CBT with ImRs	17	IES SANS	0	* *	* *	N/A
Dudley et al. (2005)	1	Paranoid schizophrenia and specific phobia	38	M	Systematic desensitisation	38	MIA PSYRATS	6	* *	* *	N/A
Ekers et al. (2004)	1	Schizophrenia and OCD	31	M	ERP	20	Y-BOCS	6	Y ^b	Y ^b	Recovered
Good (2002)	1	Schizophrenia and social phobia	*	M	CBT	16	MFQ Agoraphobia Social phobia KGV	2	Y ^c Y ^c *	Y ^c Y ^c *	Recovered Recovered N/A
Gruber et al. (2006)	1	Psychosis and panic disorder with agoraphobia	*	M	CBT	19	BAI	3	Y ^d	Y ^d	Recovered
Hagen et al. (2014)	1	Paranoid schizophrenia and OCD	Late 20's	M	CBT with ERP	3	Y-BOCS	6	Y ^e	Y ^e	Recovered
Hamblen et al. (2004) ^a	2	Bipolar with psychotic features/schizoaffectiv	43, 56	F, M	CBT	16, 16	CAPS	3, 3	*	*	N/A

		e									
		disorder/schizophrenia and PTSD									
Kayrouz et al. (2015)	1	Paranoid schizophrenia and PTSD	53	M	CBT with ImRs	19	IES-R	0	Y	*	Improved
Kevan et al. (2007)	1	Schizophrenia and PTSD	31	F	Written trauma elaboration and CR	7	PDS	1	Y ^f	Y ^f	Recovered
Kobori et al. (2008)	1	Schizophrenia and OCD	26	M	CBT	18	Y-BOCS	0	Y	Y	Recovered
Marcello et al. (2009)	1	Schizoaffective disorder and PTSD	In 50's	M	CR	16	PCL-S	0	Y	Y	Recovered
Williams et al. (2015)	1	Paranoid schizophrenia and social anxiety	22	M	CBT	20	LSAS IHS	0	Y N	Y Y	Recovered Improved

Note: * = data not available to calculate reliable and/or clinical change, BAI = Beck Anxiety Inventory, CAPS = Clinician Administered PTSD Scale, CBT = Cognitive Behavioural Therapy, CR = Cognitive Restructuring, ERP = Exposure and Response Prevention, F = female, IES = Impact of Events Scale, IES-R = Impact of Events Scale – Revised, IHS = Inventory of Hostility and Suspiciousness, ImRs = Imagery Rescripting, KGV = Krawiecka Goldberg Vaughan Scale, LSAS = Liebowitz Social Anxiety Scale, M = male, Mobility Inventory for Agoraphobia, MFQ = Modified Fear Questionnaire, N = No, N/A = Not applicable, OCD = obsessive compulsive disorder, PDS = Post-traumatic Diagnostic Scale, PCL-S = PTSD Checklist - Stressor specific version, PSYRATS = Psychotic Symptom Rating Scales, PTCI – Post-traumatic Cognitions Inventory, PTSD = post-traumatic stress disorder, SANS = Scale for the Assessment of Negative Symptoms, Y = Yes, Yale-Brown Obsessive Compulsive Scale.

^aOnly two cases used as the first participant did not have a diagnosis of psychosis.

^bClinical change significant only at six month follow-up and not post-treatment.

^cReliable and clinical change found at post-treatment and eight week follow-up.

^dReliable and clinical change found at post-treatment and three month follow-up.

^eReliable and clinical change calculated from six-month follow-up data (post-treatment data not presented).

^fTotal symptom severity on the PDS used to calculate reliable and clinical change.

Table 3. Results from the quantitative synthesis.

Study Design	Time Point	Division criteria	Outcome	N	Study codes	Hedges' g	95% CI	p	I ² (%)
Within-group (pre-post analysis)	End of treatment	All studies	Primary measure of anxiety	17	All studies	0.74	0.56, 0.92	<.001	73.25
		All studies	Positive psychotic symptoms	9	De Bont, Foster, Freeman, Gega, Isham, Keen, Montreuil, Mueser, Steel	0.57	0.36, 0.78	<.001	65.31
		Type of anxiety	PTSD	7	Frueh, Grubaugh, Keen, Mueser, Mueser, van den Berg, Steel	0.70	0.37, 1.03	<.001	82.97
			Social Anxiety/Social Phobia	4	Gega, Halperin, Kingsep, Montreuil	0.71	0.39, 1.02	<.001	57.98
			Worry/GAD	3	Foster, Freeman, Isham	0.70	0.20, 1.20	.006	77.19
			Panic	1	Arlow	0.66	0.12, 1.20	.017	0
			OCD	1	Tundo	1.06	0.65, 1.46	<.001	0
		Anxiety NOS	1	Welfare-Wilson	1.14	0.46, 1.83	.001	0	
	Follow-up (1- 6 mths)	All studies	Primary measure of anxiety	12	Foster, Freeman, Frueh, Gega, Grubaugh, Isham, Keen, Montreuil, Mueser, Steel, Tundo, van den Berg	0.78	0.56, 0.99	<.001	73.80
	Between-group (RCTs)	End of treatment	All controlled studies	Primary measure of anxiety	9	All controlled studies	0.35	0.07, 0.64	.015
All controlled studies			Positive psychotic symptoms	6	de Bont, Foster, Freeman, Isham, Mueser, Steel	0.37	0.16, 0.57	<.001	0

	Type of anxiety	PTSD	4	Mueser, Mueser, van den Berg, Steel	0.09	0.50, 0.67	.771	63.10
		Social Anxiety/Social Phobia	2	Halperin, Kingsep	0.58	0.03, 1.14	.041	0
		Worry/GAD	3	Foster, Freeman, Isham	0.54	0.25, 0.84	<.001	0
Follow-up (1-6 mths)	All controlled studies	Primary measure of anxiety	6	Foster, Freeman, Isham, Mueser, Steel, van den Berg	0.34	0.05, 0.63	.022	40.88
