

EU wide campaign exercise on bioassays and chemical mixture effects

Lettieri, Teresa; Carvalho, R. N. ; Arukwe, A.; Ait-Aissa, S.; Bado-Nilles, A.; Balzamo, S.; Barbizzi, S.; Buchetti, M.; Baun, Anders; Belkin, S.; Belli, M.; Benisek, M.; Blaha, L.; dalla Bona, M.; Brion, F.; Calabretta, E.; Conti, D.; Creusot, N.; Essig, Y.; Ferrero, V.; Flander-Putrlle, V.; Fährhacker, M.; Grillari, R.; Haldorsen, A.-K.; Hogstrand, C.; Hopkins, C. ; Jonas, A.; Jug, B.; Lavado, R.; Loss, R.; Martone, C.; Masner, P.; Nekvapilova, A.; Olsson, P.-E.; Pati, A.; Pillai, S.; Polak, N.; Potalivo, M.; Pipal, M.; Bury, N. R.; Sanchez, W.; Schifferli, A.; Schnell, S.; Søftelund, L.; Sturzenbaum, S.; Tavazzi, S.; Turk, V.; Viarengo, A.; Werner, I.; Yagur-Kroll, S.; Zounkova, R.

Published in:

Science Across Bridges, Borders and Boundaries

Publication date:

2014

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link back to DTU Orbit](#)

Citation (APA):

Lettieri, T., Carvalho, R. N., Arukwe, A., Ait-Aissa, S., Bado-Nilles, A., Balzamo, S., ... Zounkova, R. (2014). EU wide campaign exercise on bioassays and chemical mixture effects. In Science Across Bridges, Borders and Boundaries: Programme Book Basel, Switzerland: SETAC-Europe.

DTU Library

Technical Information Center of Denmark

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

EU wide campaign exercise on bioassays and chemical mixture effects

Teresa Lettieri¹, Raquel N. Carvalho¹, Augustine Arukwe², Selim Ait-Aissa³, Anne Bado-Nilles³, Stefania Balzamo⁴, Sabrina Barbizzi⁴, Monica Buchetti⁴, Anders Baun⁵, Shimshon Belkin⁶, Maria Belli⁴, Martin Beníšek⁷, Ludek Blaha⁷, Mirco dalla Bona⁷, François Brion³, Elisa Calabretta⁴, Daniela Conti⁴, Nicolas Creusot³, Yona Essig⁸, Valentina Ferrero¹, Vesna Flander-Putrlé⁹, Maria Fürhacker¹⁰, Regina Grillari¹⁰, Anne-Katrine Haldorsen¹¹, Christer Hogstrand¹², Chris Hopkins⁸, Adam Jonás⁷, Bogdan Jug¹⁰, Ramon Lavado¹, Robert Loos¹, Cristina Martone⁴, Petr Masner⁷, Carina Modig¹³, Alena Nekvapilová⁷, Per-Erik Olsson¹³, Alessandra Pati⁴, Smitha Pillai¹⁴, Natasa Polak⁸, Monica Potalivo⁴, Marek Pípal⁷, Nic R. Bury¹², Wilfred Sanchez³, Andrea Schifferli¹⁵, Sabine Schnell¹², Shirmer¹⁴, Liv Søfteland¹¹, Stephen Sturzenbaum⁸, Simona Tavazzi¹, Valentina Turk⁹, Aldo Viarengo¹⁶, Inge Werner¹⁵, Sharon Yagur-Kroll⁶, Radka Zounková⁷

¹European Commission – DG Joint Research Centre, Institute for Environment and Sustainability, T.P. 270, Via E. Fermi 2749, 21027 Ispra (VA), Italy

²Norwegian University of Science & Technology, Trondheim, Norway

³National Institute for Environmental Technology and Hazards, Verneuil en Halatte, France

⁴Istituto Superiore per la Protezione e la Ricerca Ambientale (ISPRA), Rome, Italy

⁵University of Technical University of Denmark (Department of Environmental Engineering), Kgs Lyngby, Denmark

⁶The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel

⁷Research Centre for Toxic Compounds in the Environment, Masaryk University, Brno, Czech Republic

⁸Analytical and Environmental Sciences Division, King's College London, United Kingdom

⁹Marine Biological Station Piran - National Institute of Biology, Slovenia

¹⁰University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences, Vien, Austria

¹¹National Institute of Nutrition and Seafood Research, Bergen, Norway

¹²Diabetes and Nutritional Sciences Division, King's College London, United Kingdom

¹³Life Science Center, Örebro University, Sweden

¹⁴Swiss Federal Institute for Environmental Science and Technology / ETH, Switzerland

¹⁵Oekotoxzentrum/Eawag, Dübendorf, Switzerland

¹⁶Università del Piemonte Orientale, Alessandria, Italy

E-mail contact: teresa.lettieri@jrc.ec.europa.eu

1. Introduction

Thousands different chemicals are discharged into the environment from agriculture, industry, medical facilities, house-holds. Currently, there is an increasing concern for the environmental impact of mixture of compounds since the additive and eventual synergistic effects are unknown and could produce serious adverse effects. Indeed, it is virtually impossible to analyse, detect and quantify all chemicals present in the water bodies, including transformation products.

So far, the effects of mixture has been described in literature for combination of few compounds e.g. for Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons PAHs, pesticides and only for few model organisms. Recently, a document from the European Commission on combination effects of chemicals highlighted the need to ensure that risks associated with chemical mixtures are properly understood and assessed.

In 2012, European Commission JRC launched an EU-wide Exercise to test the effects of chemical mixture using existing and innovative bioassay applied to aquatic environment. The chemical Mixtures included pesticides, pharmaceuticals, heavy metals and polyaromatic hydrocarbons. The mixtures included each compound at Equivalent Quality Standard (EQS)^{1,2} value, the safety limit concentration allowed by the European Water Framework Directive, (WFD) and distributed to 16 laboratories to test on bioassays routinely in use in each laboratory.

2. Materials and methods

Chemicals: Reference materials for Mix14 and Mix19 have been prepared as 1000-fold concentrated mixtures, with the organic solution (in methanol) prepared separately from the inorganic (in 2% nitric acid in water). Additional reference materials were prepared for Mix14 as 10,000-fold concentrated solutions, to allow the assessment of effects at a wider range of concentrations. The chemicals used for the preparation of the reference mixtures were of the highest purity ($\geq 96\%$).

Bioassays were performed according to each laboratory protocol, some of them according to the OECD guidelines or ISO standards.

3. Results and discussion

The mixtures were analysed for their stability up to four months to -20°C before being distributed. The bioassays were *in vivo*, *in vitro* assay including reporter gene assays and Estrogen Receptor binding and activity assays for the detection of endocrine disruptor chemicals.

Bioassay (<i>in vivo</i>)	Bioassay (<i>in vitro</i>)	Endpoints (measured in more than one bioassay)
Marine Microcosm (bacteria /phytoplakton)	Zebrafish embryo	Mortality
Bacteria	Frog embryo	Reproduction
Green algae	Fish cell lines	Development
Diatom	Mammalian cell lines	Teratogenicity
Yeast	Yeast (reporter genes)	Photosynthesis
Nematode	Bacteria (reporter genes)	Motility
Amoeba	Estrogen Receptor binding and activity assay	Immune response
Crustacean		Hormone interference
Fish		Zona radiata protein
Frog		CYP1A
		Stress response

Table 1: List of the test *in vivo* and *in vitro* performed in the 16 laboratories

3.1. Low trophic level

Mix14 and Mix19 were exposed to the marine bacterial/plykton community, three algae (two freshwater and one marine) and the curstacean *Daphnia magna* to test the effects on photosynthesis, growth and motility respectively. The mixture could influence the microcosm at very low concentration impairing the composiiton of the communiy (bacteria>>>phytoplakton). The three algae showed a growth inhibition following exposure for 24h with a slight sensitivity for the marine diatom *Thalassiosira pseudonana*. The acute immobilisation assay in *Daphnia* was significant and comparable among the laboratories showing an effect at 10XEQS for the Mix14.

3.2. Higher trophic level

Going up in the evolution scale, we analysed the effects on fish and frog embryo development while other assays on nematode, fish, mammalian and fish cell lines were performed for endpoints e.g. growth, biomarker expression, immunotoxicity. At 1X EQS value Mix14 and Mix19 showed an effect during the development in both fish and frog.

3.3 Reporter gene system

In our exercise, reporter gene systems were tested in nematode, bacteria, yeast and mammalian cell lines for metal, stress and DNA damage response, among others. Among them, four bioassays were dedicated to the detection of endocrine disruptor chemicals. There was good agreement among the laboratories performing the EDC assays, and Mix19 showed higher responses in these assays, as expected from the presence of additional endocrine disruptor chemicals.

4. Conclusions

We showed that the exposure to mixtures of chemical with dissimilar mode of actions and at the annual average environmental quality standard (AA-EQS), induced effects in both chronic and acute toxicity tests, affecting not only single organisms but population and potentially the entire ecosystem.

5. References

- [1] European Directive 2008/105/EC on environmental quality standards in the field of water policy; Official Journal of the European Union, L384/84; 24.12.2008.
- [2] European Directive 2013/39/EU amending Directives 2000/60/EC and 2008/105/EC as regards priority substances in the field of water policy; Official Journal of the European Union, L226/1, 24.8.2013.

Acknowledgement - The authors thank Marina Ricci (JRC-IRMM, Geel, Belgium) for the preparation of the reference mixtures. Robert Kase (Oekotoxzentrum; Swiss Centre for Applied Ecotoxicology; Eawag/EPFL; Dübendorf, CH) for the environmental quality standards for the emerging compounds. Joaquin Pinto grande for the technical assistance.