1	RECONCILING THE GREENLAND ICE-CORE AND RADIOCARBON
2	TIMESCALES THROUGH THE LASCHAMP GEOMAGNETIC EXCURSION
3	
4	Author affiliations:
5	Richard A. Staff ^{a,b*} , Mark Hardiman ^c , Christopher Bronk Ramsey ^b , Florian Adolphi ^{d,e} , Vincent
6	J. Hare ^{b,f} , Andreas Koutsodendris ^g , Jörg Pross ^{g,h}
7	
8	^a Scottish Universities Environmental Research Centre (SUERC), University of
9	Glasgow, Rankine Avenue, Scottish Enterprise Technology Park, East Kilbride G75 0QF, UK.
10	^b Research Laboratory for Archaeology and the History of Art (RLAHA), University of
11	Oxford, Dyson Perrins Building, South Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3QY, UK. ^c Department of
12	Geography, University of Portsmouth, Buckingham Building, Lion Terrace,
13	Portsmouth PO1 3HE, UK.
14	^d Climate and Environmental Physics, University of Bern, CH-3012 Bern, Switzerland.
15	^e Department of Geology, Quaternary Sciences, Lund University, Sölvegatan 12, 22362 Lund,
16	Sweden.
17	^f Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY
18	14627, USA.
19	^g Paleoenvironmental Dynamics Group, Institute of Earth Sciences, Heidelberg University, Im
20	Neuenheimer Feld 234, 69120 Heidelberg, Germany.
21	^h Biodiversity and Climate Research Centre (BiK-F), Senckenberg, Senckenberganlage 25,
22	60325 Frankfurt, Germany.
23	* Corresponding author. Tel.: +44 (0)1355 270198.
24	E-mail address: richard.staff@glasgow.ac.uk (R.A. Staff)
25 26	

27 Keywords:

- 28 Radiocarbon (¹⁴C) dating
- 29 Beryllium-10 (10 Be)
- 30 Relative paleointensity
- 31 Laschamp geomagnetic excursion
- 32 Tenaghi Philippon, Greece
- 33 Campanian Ignimbrite (C.I.) tephra

34

- 36 Abstract:
- 37

Cosmogenic radionuclides, such as ¹⁰Be and ¹⁴C, share a common production signal, with their formation in the Earth's upper atmosphere modulated by changes to the geomagnetic field, as well as variations in the intensity of the solar wind. Here, we use this common production signal to compare between the radiocarbon (IntCal) and Greenland ice-core (GICC05) timescales, utilising the most pronounced cosmogenic production peak of the last

100,000 years – that associated with the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion circa 41,000 years 43 ago. We present 54 new ¹⁴C measurements from a peat core ('TP-2005') from Tenaghi 44 Philippon, NE Greece, contiguously spanning between circa 47,300 and 39,600 cal. BP, 45 demonstrating a distinctive tripartite structure in the build up to the principal Laschamp 46 production maximum that is not present in the consensus IntCal13 calibration curve. This is 47 the first time that a continuous, non-reservoir corrected ¹⁴C dataset has been generated over 48 such a long time span for this, the oldest portion of the radiocarbon timescale. This period is 49 critical for both palaeoenvironmental and archaeological applications, with the replacement of 50 Neanderthals by anatomically modern humans in Europe around this time. By placing our 51 Tenaghi Philippon ¹⁴C dataset on to the Hulu Cave U-series timescale of Cheng et al. (2018) 52 via Bayesian statistical modelling, the comparison of TP-2005 ¹⁴C with Greenland ¹⁰Be fluxes 53 also implicitly relates the underlying U-series and GICC05 timescales themselves. This 54 comparison suggests that whilst these two timescales are broadly coherent, the IntCal13 55 timescale is likely some ~1000 years too old circa 40,000 cal. BP. 56

- 58
- 59 **1. Introduction**
- 60

Among the most pressing questions in palaeoenvironmental research today is the reliable identification of synchronies or asynchronies of past climatic and environmental changes across the globe. A fundamental problem in identifying such temporal relationships in palaeorecords, however, is an inability to reliably compare inter-regional records beyond the limits of chronological uncertainty.

Arguably, the best and most-widely cited record of palaeoclimatic change – the key 66 global reference 'type site' – is that provided by the Greenland ice-cores, due to their highly 67 resolved suite of multi-proxy palaeoenvironmental data (NGRIP members, 2004; Steffensen et 68 al., 2008), and their annual resolution, layer-counted chronology (Andersen et al., 2006; 69 70 Rasmussen et al., 2006; Svensson et al., 2008). Conversely, the most utilised geochronological technique applied to late Quaternary palaeoenvironmental (and archaeological) sites elsewhere 71 in the world is provided by radiocarbon (¹⁴C) dating (Brauer et al., 2014). However, in order to 72 compare data between the two timescales, one must assume that the respective ¹⁴C and icecore 73 layer-counted chronologies are consistent – an assumption that must undoubtedly incorporate 74 75 uncertainties (Adolphi and Muscheler, 2016).

Here, we utilise the common production signal of the cosmogenic radionuclides ¹⁰Be
(beryllium-10) and ¹⁴C (radiocarbon) to link together the Greenland ice-core and radiocarbon
timescales for the oldest ~10,000 years of the radiocarbon timescale (i.e. the last ~50,000
years), taking advantage of the most pronounced cosmogenic production peak of the last
100,000 years – that associated with the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion circa 41,000 years
ago.

- 82
- 83
- 84 **1.1 Cosmogenic radionuclides and the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion**
- 85

Cosmogenic radionuclides, such as ¹⁰Be and ¹⁴C, are formed in the Earth's upper atmosphere through the interaction of incoming high-energy cosmic rays with target nuclides (Lal and Peters, 1967). The cosmic ray flux is modulated by both the shielding effect of the Earth's magnetic field and the solar-induced interplanetary magnetic field (the 'solar wind'). The lower the strength of either the geomagnetic field or solar wind, the deflection of incoming cosmic rays is reduced, and the production of cosmogenic radionuclides is therefore greater (Elsasser et al., 1956).

93 The geomagnetic field exhibits long-term secular variation, including major reversals of the Earth's magnetic (dipole) field between normal and reversed configurations, which occur 94 during periods of progressive decay in the Earth's dipole moment (Cox, 1969; Valet and 95 Meynadier, 1993). Additionally, shorter-term ($<10^4$ years) 'stability crises' occur whereby the 96 intensity of the geomagnetic field decreases more or less dramatically, but the field does not 97 undergo a long-term reversal. These may coincide with geomagnetic excursions – periods of 98 99 distorted dipole geometry when the virtual geomagnetic poles (VGPs) move away from the area of normal high-latitude secular variation – or even short-term (10^2 - 10^3 years) complete 100 reversals (where VGPs temporarily migrate to higher latitudes of the opposite hemisphere) 101 (Nowaczyk et al., 2012). The most prominent of these geomagnetic excursions over the past 102 100,000 years is known as the 'Laschamp event', dated to circa 41,000 years ago (Bonhommet 103 and Babkine, 1967; Guillou et al., 2004; Singer et al., 2009). This event is characterised by a 104 short-term full reversal of the geomagnetic field (Nowaczyk et al., 2012) and the lowest 105 geomagnetic field intensities of the past 100,000 years, falling to approximately 10% of today's 106 value (Laj et al., 2000; Nowaczyk et al., 2013). 107

Such geomagnetic events can provide global, temporally synchronous signals in palaeoenvironmental archives, observable directly in records of relative palaeointensity, as well as in records of cosmogenic nuclides (including ¹⁰Be and ¹⁴C). Thus, it is theoretically possible

5.

to link palaeoenvironmental archives using these isochronous signals (Brauer et al., 2014). ¹⁰Be 111 has a short (1-2 year) atmospheric residence time (McHargue and Damon, 1991), providing an 112 excellent record of past cosmogenic nuclide production variation, and has been measured 113 directly in the Greenland ice-cores (Yiou et al., 1997; Muscheler et al. 2004) (unlike ¹⁴C, which 114 is too low in abundance to detect within the ice). ¹⁴C provides a less direct production marker, 115 however, because of its incorporation into the global carbon cycle system and consequent 116 exchanges between the global carbon reservoirs, thus complicating the intercomparison of such 117 records. 118

119

120

121 **1.2 The Greenland ice-core chronology**

122

The Greenland ice-core chronology 'GICC05' is the most recent timescale applied to the 123 Greenland ice-cores, tying together the GRIP (Johnsen et al. 1992), GISP2 (Grootes et al., 124 1993), NGRIP (NGRIP members, 2004) and NEEM (NEEM Community Members, 2013) 125 records (Seierstad et al., 2014). For the entire time period covered by the ¹⁴C dating technique, 126 i.e., the last circa 50,000 years, GICC05 is based on direct counting of the annual layers within 127 128 the ice (Andersen et al., 2006; Rasmussen et al., 2006; Svensson et al., 2008; Brauer et al., 2014). The uncertainty on the timescale is based upon the 'maximum counting error' (MCE) 129 concept, whereby each uncertain layer is counted as $\frac{1}{2} \pm \frac{1}{2}$ year and added linearly. Thus, 130 throughout the Last Glacial period, the MCE on GICC05 amounts to approximately 5%. It 131 should be noted that GICC05 uses the notation 'b2k' - i.e., 'calendar years before its datum, 132 AD 2000' - whereas herein we convert this to years 'BP' (before present, AD 1950), enabling 133 more direct comparison with the Hulu Cave uranium (U-)series and IntCal13 timescales 134 (below). 135

Since its introduction in 2005, GICC05 has now been utilised for over a decade, 136 demonstrating the robustness of the chronology, though there have been recent suggestions of 137 small scale errors. For example, Sigl et al. (2015) presented evidence, making use of the 138 distinctive 'AD 775 and 994 events' recorded as both ¹⁰Be and ¹⁴C production spikes, as well 139 as using tephra marker horizons, that the ice-core chronology is 7 years too old by the late first 140 millennium AD. Over a longer time range, Buizert et al. (2015) presented evidence that 141 GICC05, on average, misses 6.3 out of every 1,000 annual layers. This conclusion is based 142 upon comparison of the respective oxygen isotope (\Box^{18} O) records of the NGRIP ice-core and 143 Hulu Cave (China) speleothem, which is independently U-series dated. However, this 144 comparison of \Box^{18} O records assumes synchroneity of the respective palaeoclimatic signals – 145 an assumption that may not necessarily hold true (Lane et al., 2013; Brauer et al., 2014). 146

147

148

149 **1.3 Radiocarbon dating and the IntCal timescale**

150

In order to generate meaningful ages from the ¹⁴C dating method, a calibration stage is required since the concentration of ¹⁴C (relative to stable ¹²C and ¹³C) in the environment changes through time. This is the result of both the variations in production rate (Lal and Peters, 1967) outlined above and carbon cycle effects, which alter the global distribution of relatively older or younger carbon sources between the respective reservoirs of Earth's carbon cycle system through time (Broecker et al., 1960; Siegenthaler et al., 1980).

157 Calibration involves the comparison of samples' raw isotopic measurements with the 158 internationally ratified, consensus radiocarbon calibration curve 'IntCal13' (Reimer et al.,

159 2013), which itself is comprised of 'known age' material from a variety of palaeo-archives. For

the last ~12,500 years, the IntCal curve is composed of independently dendro-chronologically

dated wood. Previous research (Muscheler et al., 2004, 2008, 2014a; Adolphi and Muscheler, 161 2016) has utilised this high-resolution, continuous record of past variation in atmospheric 14 C 162 concentrations (\Box^{14} C) to tie this most recent period of the IntCal timescale to the ¹⁰Be signal in 163 Greenland. These authors found an offset of approximately 65 years between GICC05 and 164 IntCal during the Preboreal (i.e. circa 12,500 to 10,000 years ago), with GICC05 seemingly 165 including a small over-count – an offset consistent in scale with that proposed by Sigl et al. 166 (2015). Since this latest portion of the ¹⁴C calibration curve is composed of robustly 167 dendrochronologically dated records, Muscheler et al. (2008) attributed this 65 year offset to 168 uncertainties in the ice-core layer counting. 169

Further back in time, through to the methodological limit of radiocarbon dating (circa 170 50,000 years ago), however, the ¹⁴C calibration curve is less certain. The central archive for 171 this earlier period is that provided by plant macrofossils picked from the annually laminated 172 sediments of Lake Suigetsu, Japan (Staff et al., 2011; Bronk Ramsey et al., 2012). Additional 173 data are provided by speleothems (Hoffmann et al., 2010; Southon et al., 2012), marine corals 174 (e.g. Fairbanks et al., 2005), and foraminifera from marine sediment cores (e.g. Hughen et al., 175 2006), all of which incorporate (marine- or dead carbon) 'reservoir effects' that require 176 correction and thereby introduce additional uncertainties. These reservoir effects would also be 177 expected to 'smooth' the atmospheric \Box^{14} C signal, making comparison to ¹⁰Be records more 178 complicated. Unlike these latter records, the Lake Suigetsu data provide a direct record of 179 atmospheric $\Box^{14}C$, and have previously been used to compare to both records of 180 palaeomagnetic intensity (e.g. Nowaczyk et al., 2013) and to ¹⁰Be in the Greenland ice-cores 181 (e.g. Bronk Ramsey et al., 2012; Muscheler et al., 2014b). However, the Lake Suigetsu data are 182 necessarily discontinuous – limited by the stochastic finds of plant macrofossil remains in the 183 sediment profile – as well as being potentially less reliable due to the methodological problems 184 associated with dating such small samples close to the radiocarbon detection limit (Muscheler 185

et al., 2014b). As with the Greenland ice-cores (above), the Lake Suigetsu dataset also has
relatively large cumulative counting uncertainties by ~40,000 years BP.

188 The promise of more reliable, continuous data for this older time period comes from floating tree-ring sequences, most notably long-lived New Zealand kauri (Agathis australis) 189 (Turney et al., 2010, 2016; Hogg et al., 2013). Such records are limited in duration, however, 190 by the up to ~2,000 year life-spans of individual trees, limiting their utility for comparison to 191 the Greenland ¹⁰Be record to relatively short periods of time (Muscheler et al., 2014b; Turney 192 et al., 2016). Recently, Muscheler et al. (2014b) presented such a comparison, arguing that the 193 Greenland ice-core and ¹⁴C (IntCal) timescales were discordant circa 40,000 years ago, with 194 the calibrated ¹⁴C timescale apparently 1,200 years too old. This would be a highly significant 195 finding, if true, since it compromises the inter-comparison of ¹⁴C-dated palaeoenvironmental 196 records with those dated by other methods. It also directly affects the interpretation of ¹⁴C data 197 through this time period across other disciplines, such as archaeological applications, with the 198 replacement of Neanderthals by anatomically modern humans in Europe around this time 199 200 (Higham et al., 2014). However, the study of Muscheler et al. (2014b) was necessarily limited to a short record (1,350 years), minimising the \Box^{14} C structure that could be compared with the 201 equivalent ¹⁰Be-inferred signal, and thereby reducing the reliability of the correlation drawn. 202 Recently, Cheng et al. (2018) have provided an extended record from Hulu Cave (China) based 203 upon radiocarbon data from two new speleothems ('MSD' and 'MSL'), adding to the 204 previously published dataset of Southon et al. (2012) from speleothem 'H82' which covered 205 the period ~10.7 to 26.9 ka BP. As with the Lake Suigetsu dataset (above), this new Hulu Cave 206 record now extends across the entirety of the radiocarbon dating method. The latter has the 207 advantage of a highly precise U-series derived calendar age scale, and will provide the central 208 209 archive of the next iteration of the consensus calibration curve, IntCal (Reimer et al., in prep., 210 Radiocarbon).

As noted above, speleothems incorporate a reservoir effect, which requires correction, 211 and therefore introduces further uncertainty into the ¹⁴C values. Southon et al. (2012) and 212 Cheng et al. (2018) both describe the "unusually small and stable" (450 ± 70^{-14} C years) 'dead 213 carbon fraction' (DCF) registered in these Hulu Cave speleothems, which makes them 214 particularly attractive for radiocarbon calibration purposes. However, it would seem that this 215 small and stable DCF is a result of the unique geological setting of the site, such that the 'inbuilt 216 age' recorded by the speleothem dripwater is more of a 'soil reservoir effect', rather than a 217 DCF, sensu stricto. The consequence of this is the favourable low and stable 'DCF'; however, 218 the pay-off is that the atmospheric ${}^{14}C$ signal is effectively smoothed at this resolution (~450 219 220 years), meaning that higher frequency signal is consequently lost.

Thus, there are both strengths and weaknesses in all of the aforementioned calibration 221 records. To add to this current state of knowledge, therefore, we herein exploit new ¹⁴C data 222 223 from a continuous peat sequence from Greece, extending over a significantly longer time period (circa 47,300 to 39,600 cal. BP) than the kauri dataset utilised by Muscheler et al. (2014b). This 224 enables us to use the entirety of the \Box^{14} C signal associated with the build-up to- and peak of 225 the Laschamp excursion to enable more robust comparison of the calibrated ¹⁴C and Greenland 226 ice-core time scales. Our dataset also provides a direct record of atmospheric ¹⁴C concentration, 227 unlike the Hulu Cave speleothems, and provides continuous material for ¹⁴C dating, unlike the 228 stochastic Lake Suigetsu dataset, without the issues of small sample sizes associated with the 229 latter record. The drawback of our new dataset, however, is the lack of independent chronology, 230 which we necessarily need to obtain through Bayesian statistical modelling (section 3.2, 231 below). 232

233

Tenaghi Philippon is situated in the Philippi peatland within the Drama Basin of NE 237 Greece (Fig. 1). Since its discovery and initial exploitation in the 1960s, the site has become 238 widely recognised as harbouring one of the best terrestrial archives of Quaternary climatic and 239 environmental change in Europe (Wijmstra, 1969; Tzedakis et al., 2006; Pross et al., 2015 and 240 refs. therein). Scientific drilling campaigns at the site have yielded a peat-dominated sequence 241 that extends to a depth of nearly 200 m and covers the last ~1.35 Ma continuously. This 242 sequence represents an extremely sensitive recorder of rapid climatic change both during 243 244 glacial and interglacial boundary conditions, which is ascribed to the site's intermediate 245 position between higher-latitude (i.e., North Atlantic Oscillation- and Siberian Highinfluenced) and lower-latitude (monsoonally influenced) climatic regimes, its intramontane setting, and its 246 247 proximity to the glacial refugia of thermophilous plant taxa (Pross et al., 2009, 2015).

In 2005, a new, 60 m long core ('TP-2005'; 40°58'24" N, 24°13'26" E, 40 m asl) was 248 249 recovered from Tenaghi Philippon (Pross et al., 2007). The core consists primarily of fen peat 250 and is believed to represent continuous accumulation throughout the last circa 310 kyrs (Fletcher et al., 2013). A previous study (Müller et al., 2011) presented 20 accelerator mass 251 spectrometry (AMS) ¹⁴C dates, spanning the majority of the approximately 50,000 year ¹⁴C 252 253 dating time period, from the uppermost 15.28 m of the TP-2005 core (Table S1). Additionally, three tephra layers have been identified at 7.61 m, 9.70 m and 12.64-12.87 m core depths, and 254 respectively geochemically correlated to the Y-2 tephra (resulting from the Cape Riva eruption 255 256 of Santorini), Y-3 tephra (resulting from an eruption from the Campi Flegrei), and Y-5 tephra (from the regionally widespread Campanian Ignimbrite eruption, also from the Campi Flegrei) 257 (Müller et al., 2011; Albert et al., 2015 Pross et al., 2015; Wulf et al., 2018). Accompanying 258

palaeoenvironmental data are provided by a centennial resolution pollen record spanning
Marine Isotope Stages (MIS) 4 to 2 (Müller et al., 2011).

261

262

- 263 **3. Methods**
- 264

265	3.1	Radiocarbon	dating
-----	-----	-------------	--------

266

Contiguous peat sub-samples (maximum 5 cm thick) from Tenaghi Philippon core 267 'TP2005' were taken from 12.87 to 14.80 cm depth -i.e. spanning the time period immediately 268 preceding the deposition of the visible Campanian Ignimbrite (C.I.) tephra, back to the 269 methodological limit of ¹⁴C dating (circa 50,000 cal. BP). Each sub-sample was physically 270 homogenised prior to a standard acid-base-acid (ABA) chemical pre-treatment for radiocarbon 271 272 dating, following the method of Brock et al. (2010). The three main stages of this process (successive acid-, base-, and acid washes) are similar across most radiocarbon laboratories and 273 are respectively intended to remove: (i) sedimentary- and other carbonate contaminants; (ii) 274 organic (principally humic- and fulvic-) acid contaminants; and (iii) any dissolved atmospheric 275 CO₂ that might have been absorbed during the preceding base wash. In this way, any potential 276 secondary carbon contamination is removed, leaving the samples pure for subsequent 277 combustion, graphitisation and accelerator mass spectrometry (AMS)¹⁴C dating. At the Oxford 278 279 Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit (ORAU) ABA chemical pre-treatment of peat samples (laboratory pre-treatment code 'VV') involves successive 1 M HCl (20 mins, 80 °C), 0.2 M 280 NaOH (20 mins, 80 °C) and 1 M HCl (1 hr, 80 °C) washes, with each stage followed by rinsing 281 (≥3 times) with ultrapure MilliQTM deionised water. From five samples, the base-soluble humic 282 acid component extracted from the peat was additionally dated to provide supporting 283

information on the likely contribution of mobile- (presumably, downward-percolating young) contaminant to the primary base-insoluble ('humin') component of the peat samples.
Specifically, this involved the collection of the base-soluble fraction of these samples and
reacidification through the addition of 1 M HCl, followed by centrifugation and rinsing (twice)
with ultrapure MilliQTM deionised water (ORAU laboratory pre-treatment code 'HW'). AMS
¹⁴C dating was subsequently performed on the 2.5 MV HVEE tandem AMS system at ORAU
(Bronk Ramsey et al., 2004; Staff et al., 2014).

- 291
- 292

293 3.2 Chronological modelling

294

The TP-2005 ¹⁴C data were analysed with the Bayesian statistical software OxCal ver. 295 4.3 (Bronk Ramsey, 2019), implementing a Poisson-process ('P_Sequence') deposition 296 model (Bronk Ramsey, 2008). The P_Sequence model takes into account the complexity 297 (randomness) of the underlying peat accumulation process, and thus provides the most realistic 298 299 age-depth model for the TP-2005 peat profile on the calibrated radiocarbon timescale. For comparison purposes, we herein modelled our TP-2005 ¹⁴C data on to both the recently 300 published Hulu Cave dataset of Cheng et al. (2018), as well as the current consensus (IntCal) 301 calibration curve (Reimer et al., 2013). The rigidity of each P_Sequence (i.e., the regularity 302 of the peat accumulation rate) is determined iteratively within OxCal through a model 303 averaging approach, based upon the likelihood (i.e., calibrated ¹⁴C) data included within the 304 model (Bronk Ramsey and Lee, 2013). 'Boundary' functions were applied at the top and 305 bottom of the 'P_Sequence' (at 12.87 m and 14.80 m core depth, respectively) – the former 306 providing a modelled, ¹⁴C-derived age for the C.I. tephra. Objective outlier analysis was applied 307 to down-weight any statistically anomalous data points (Bronk Ramsey, 2009; Bronk 308

Ramsey et al., 2010). An 'r-type' Outlier_Model was selected, allowing for short-term 309 fluctuations in the ¹⁴C concentrations between the respective radiocarbon reservoirs of the 310 Tenaghi Philippon, Hulu Cave and IntCal13 datasets. (N.b., a premise of this paper is that the 311 IntCal and Hulu Cave curves currently smooth out real, higher frequency 'wiggles' in 312 atmospheric radiocarbon concentration, $\Box^{14}C - i.e.$, that the datasets have short-term offsets in 313 their apparent ¹⁴C concentrations compared to the TP-2005 record – which is allowed for by 314 the r-type Outlier_Model.) A prior 'Outlier' probability of 5% was applied to all of the 315 TP-2005 ¹⁴C determinations, since there was no reason, *a priori*, to believe that any samples 316 were more likely to be statistical outliers than others. As noted, both the Hulu Cave (Cheng et 317 al., 2018) and IntCal13¹⁴C calibration curve (Reimer et al., 2013) were used, with alternative 318 319 comparison datasets from Lake Suigetsu (Bronk Ramsey et al, 2012), Bahamas speleothem 320 (Hoffmann et al., 2010), and Cariaco Basin foraminifera (Hughen et al., 2006) plotted for comparison purposes only. The coding of these primary deposition models and the model 321 322 output are given in the Supplementary Material (S1 and Tables S3 and S4).

Similar Poisson-process modelling was applied to the original TP-2005 ¹⁴C determinations of Müller et al. (2011), using two successive P_Sequences for the lower and upper core sections, cross-referencing the upper Boundary of the lower P_Sequence (12.87m core depth; the lower contact of the C.I. tephra) to equal the lower Boundary of the upper P_Sequence (12.64m core depth; the upper contact of the C.I. tephra). Again, the model coding is given in the Supplementary Material (S2).

329

330

One consideration with the P_Sequence deposition model is that it produces an inevitable attenuation of the authentic \Box^1 C maxima and minima by 'pulling' the data to more

¹ C production rates using the production rate model of Herbst et al. (2017) and the Local Interstellar Spectrum of Potgieter et al. (2014), assuming a constant solar modulation potential closely fit the Hulu Cave or IntCal calibration datasets. Therefore, supporting age-depth models
were subsequently generated in OxCal, simply applying a uniform ('U_Sequence')
deposition model (Bronk Ramsey, 2008), rather than the P_Sequence. The coding of these
supporting deposition models is also given in the Supplementary Material (S3), as is the model
output (Tables S3 and S4). In reality, the two differing model assumptions (P_Sequence or
U_Sequence) produce similar output (Figs. S1 and S2), reflecting the insensitivity of our
conclusions presented herein to the choice of chronological model construction.

338

339

340 3.3. □¹⁴C modelling from GRIP ¹⁰Be fluxes and Black Sea and GLOPIS-75 VADM

341

GRIP ¹⁰Be fluxes (Yiou et al., 1997; Muscheler et al., 2004) and estimates of the Earth's virtual axial dipole moment (VADM) from both the individual Black Sea record (Nowaczyk et al., 2012, 2013) and the GLOPIS-75 stack (Laj et al., 2004, 2014) were converted into \Box^{14} C using previously applied methods (Muscheler et al., 2004, 2005). First, VADM was converted into (~300‰ between 48,000 and 40,000 cal.BP), we ran the carbon cycle model with slightly reduced ocean diffusivity (70% of the preindustrial value, resembling reduced ocean ventilation

of 800 MeV that resembles the modern average solar activity (Muscheler et al., 2016). In a second step, $\Box^{14}C$ was modelled from GRIP ¹⁰Be fluxes and VADM-based ¹⁴C production rates using a box-diffusion carbon cycle model (Siegenthaler et al., 1980; Muscheler et al., 2004). We assume a ¹⁰Be/¹⁴C production rate ratio of 1:1 which is in agreement with ¹⁰Be/¹⁴C comparisons from the Holocene (Adolphi and Muscheler, 2016) as well as production rate models (Herbst et al., 2017). To match the amplitude of the overall $\Box^{14}C$ increase in IntCal

in the Glacial) and reduced air/sea exchange rates (75% of the preindustrial value, resembling increased sea ice extent). Note, that this only affects the overall amplitude of the modelled \Box^{14} C change, but not the shape of the curve, since these parameters were kept constant over the entire timeframe.

- 352
- 353
- **4. Results**
- 355

Our 54 new ¹⁴C determinations from TP-2005 are presented in Table S2 and, having been modelled against both the Hulu Cave dataset and IntCal13 (see section 3.2, above), are plotted against depth in Fig. 2. These new data suggest that the previous ¹⁴C-based chronology of Müller et al. (2011) underestimated the true age of the peat sequence for the time period before circa 39,000 cal. BP; this may be due to insufficient chemical pre-treatment to remove (young/modern) contaminant carbon, which has an increasing influence on ¹⁴C measurements with increasing age.

The inferred \Box^{14} C values from our new TP-2005 data show three periods of increasing 363 \square^{14} C values (Fig. 3). On the Hulu Cave U-series timescale these successive increases occur 364 from circa 47,300 cal. BP to 45,600 cal. BP, reaching a maximum of approximately 450%; 365 from circa 44,900 cal. BP to 43,700 cal. BP, reaching a maximum of approximately 400%; 366 and from circa 43,200 cal. BP to 42,000 cal. BP, reaching a maximum of approximately 650‰. 367 This final elevation represents the peak of the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion in TP-2005, 368 and continues until at least the timing of the Campanian Ignimbrite (C.I.) tephra, dated to circa 369 39,600 cal. BP (Fig. 4), interrupted by a(t least one) depression in \Box^{14} C values between circa 370 41,000 and 40,400 cal. BP. 371

374 5. Discussion

375

An initial observation is that our new TP-2005 data provide no evidence for the extremely 376 high \Box^{14} C values associated with the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion that have been 377 suggested by some previous studies (e.g. Voelker et al., 2000; Hughen et al., 2006; Hajdas et 378 al., 2011). There are also no data identified as being statistical outliers (Bronk Ramsey, 2009; 379 Bronk Ramsey et al., 2010), demonstrating the integrity of the peat sequence both for 380 reconstructing past variation in \Box^{14} C as well as for palaeoenvironmental research. We note that 381 the age-depth profile for TP-2005 is more linear (especially at the younger end) when modelled 382 on to the Hulu Cave dataset rather than the IntCal13 curve (Fig. 2), which implies greater 383 congruence of the TP-2005 ¹⁴C data with the Hulu Cave record (Cheng et al., 2018) rather than 384 IntCal13 (Reimer et al., 2013). 385

Our new data (Fig. 3) show higher frequency \Box^{14} C variability than the 'smoothed' 386 IntCal13 curve, which inevitably loses authentic signal when the contributing ¹⁴C datasets are 387 averaged into the consensus curve (Reimer et al., 2013; Fig. S4). The ¹⁴C data from the two 388 individual, non-reservoir corrected atmospheric ¹⁴C datasets (TP-2005 and Lake Suigetsu) 389 match each other within the bounds of statistical uncertainty. The Lake Suigetsu dataset shows 390 higher frequency variability, however. One reason for this is the ~150 year smoothing of the 391 392 TP-2005 data (due to the contiguous sub-sampling methodology applied), as compared to the annual signal contained within the individual Japanese terrestrial plant macrofossil samples. 393

The other reason is the statistical 'noise' in the Lake Suigetsu data, which is the result of the methodological problems of dating very small individual plant macrofossil samples so close to the limit of ¹⁴C detection (Muscheler et al., 2014b). For this latter reason, we prefer the TP2005 dataset (as compared to the Lake Suigetsu record) as more reliably representing the authentic

signal in past variability of atmospheric radiocarbon concentration for this earliest portion of 398 the ¹⁴C time frame. We also reiterate that our TP-2005 data demonstrate a direct atmospheric 399 signal, therefore avoiding the additional uncertainties associated with the reservoir effects of 400 401 either the marine or speleothem datasets. The tripartite structure seen in the Tenaghi Philippon data also demonstrates higher amplitude shifts in the build-up to the principal Laschamp peak 402 than the Hulu Cave dataset. As noted above (section 1.3), we suggest that this attenuation in 403 the Hulu Cave record is the result of the longer ~450 year smoothing effect of the soil reservoir 404 effect at the site. 405

However, since the TP-2005 data have necessarily been modelled on to the Hulu Cave 406 407 and IntCal13 timescales (see section 3.2), such errors currently contained within these 408 calibration datasets will propagate through into the placement of our TP-2005 data in calendar time and hence on the amplitude of the reconstructed \Box^{14} C. That said, the general shape of the 409 \Box^{14} C data will be largely unaffected by this process and, consequently, we can compare TP2005 410 \Box^{14} C to the equivalent signal inferred from Greenland ¹⁰Be to assess the concordance (or lack 411 thereof) between the underlying Hulu Cave (U-series), IntCal, and Greenland ice-core 412 (GICC05) timescales themselves. 413

Significantly, the general shape of the TP-2005 \Box^{14} C data, consisting of three successive rises in atmospheric ¹⁴C concentration in the ~6,000 years leading up to the peak values associated with the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion (from circa 42,000 cal. BP in the TP2005 record), broadly tracks equivalent increases calculated from ¹⁰Be flux measured in the GRIP ice-core (Yiou et al., 1997; Muscheler et al., 2004, 2014b) (Fig. 3). This is the first time

that this clear, tripartite structure in □¹⁴C has been directly observed in the build-up to the
Laschamp excursion.

We can additionally compare our record with estimates of the Earth's dipole moment 421 (virtual axial dipole moment, VADM) obtained from relative palaeointensity studies, to 422 provide assessment of the role of the geomagnetic field in contributing to cosmogenic 423 424 radionuclide production. To this end, we utilise both the Black Sea sediment record of Nowaczyk et al. (2013), drilled ~1000 km East of Tenaghi Philippon, as well as the GLOPIS75 425 globally-averaged curve (Laj et al., 2004, 2014). The Black Sea dataset is not truly independent, 426 in that it has been tuned to the GICC05 timescale using palaeoenvironmental proxy data from 427 the two archives (Nowaczyk et al., 2012). Likewise, the GLOPIS-75 dataset is composed of 428 429 records aligned on to a single timescale (Laj et al., 2004, 2014). However, the inferred $\Box^{14}C$ from both of these records closely mimics the variations evident in the Greenland ¹⁰Be-inferred 430 \Box^{14} C in both structure and amplitude, and also shares similar characteristics with the TP-2005 431 \Box^{14} C data from Tenaghi Philippon (Fig. 3). 432

Despite this general coherence in the $\Box^{14}C$, ¹⁰Be, and palaeomagnetic intensity records, 433 there are also distinct differences evident. Firstly, the amplitude of the successive $\Box^{14}C$ 434 increases is vastly different in the ¹⁰Be and VADM-inferred data, as compared to the TP-2005 435 dataset. And, whilst ¹⁰Be and VADM indicate that the first two □¹⁴C increases are about a 436 factor of three smaller than the final rise circa 42,500 to 40,000 cal. BP, the initial two \Box^{14} C 437 maxima in TP-2005 (as modelled on to the Hulu Cave dataset) are approximately $\frac{2}{3}$ the 438 amplitude of the final Laschamp peak (Fig. 3d). When instead modelled on to IntCal13 (Fig. 439 3e), the TP-2005 data show a comparable magnitude \Box^{14} C increase for all three steps, which 440 clearly accords less well with the ¹⁰Be and VADM-inferred signals. This is another line of 441 argument in support of the Hulu Cave dataset as providing the more accurate \Box^{14} C record 442 through this time interval compared to the current consensus calibration curve (IntCal13). 443

In terms of timing, the earliest \Box^{14} C maximum (circa 45,600 cal. BP) in TP-2005, as 444 modelled on to the Hulu Cave U-series timescale, is represented by concomitant increases in 445 both the Greenland ¹⁰Be and Black Sea palaeointensity-inferred \Box^{14} C records. However, the 446 second □¹⁴C maximum (circa 46,000 43,700 cal. BP) does not demonstrate such a correlation 447 to the ¹⁰Be or VADM-inferred records. Conversely, the third and final increase in TP-2005 448 \Box^{14} C to the principal Laschamp peak does appear similar in structure to the ¹⁰Be and 449 VADMinferred records, with an interruption to the rising \Box^{14} C trend circa 42,800 cal. BP 450 451 evident in all of the records, before a resumption of increasing values up to the principal Laschamp production maximum. Again, we see a better fit of our TP-2005 data against these 452 alternative ¹⁰Be and palaeointensity-inferred \Box^{14} C records when modelled on to the Hulu Cave 453 dataset rather than IntCal13 (Fig. 3). This is likely due to the IntCal13 curve containing 454 incorrect structure, particularly around the timing of the principal Laschamp peak itself. This 455 is unsurprising since the constituent datasets of IntCal13 are themselves in disagreement at this 456 time (Fig. S4). It would appear that the DCF of the independently U-series dated Bahamas 457 speleothem record (Hoffmann et al., 2010) is being over-corrected at this time. Conversely, the 458 \Box^{14} C of the Cariaco Basin dataset (Hughen et al., 2006) appears too high, and it is likely that 459 errors in either the marine reservoir correction or, more likely, the climatically wiggle-matched 460 timescale of this latter record is responsible for the erroneous structure in IntCal at this time. 461 As noted above, the second maximum in the TP-2005 \Box^{14} C data circa 43,700 cal. BP is 462

463 not represented by equivalent signal in the ¹⁰Be or VADM-inferred datasets. We therefore 464 hypothesise that the signal evident in the direct (TP-2005) \Box^{14} C record at this time is the result 465 of processes internal to the global carbon cycle. We note that, as with all such radiocarbon 466 calibration datasets, firm conclusions should not be drawn until corroboration is provided from 467 further archives. Such support is provided for the subsequent \Box^{14} C minimum, however, with an equivalent minimum seen in the New Zealand kauri record of Turney et al. (2010; which was also utilised by Muscheler et al. 2014b) when that record is also modelled on to the Hulu Cave dataset. Interestingly, a similar interruption to the longer-term $\Box^{14}C$ increase to the principal Laschamp $\Box^{14}C$ maximum is also seen in both the TP-2005 and kauri records circa 42,800 cal BP, providing further corroboration for the authenticity of this signal.

One further difference between the structure of the TP-2005 and Greenland ¹⁰Be-inferred 473 \Box^{14} C occurs in the aftermath of the principal Laschamp peak. Whereas the ¹⁰Be data show a 474 steady decline from circa 41,000 to 39,000 cal. BP, the TP-2005 \Box^{14} C data exhibit an initial, 475 equivalent decline (which is not seen in the Hulu Cave or IntCal13 datasets; Fig. S4), but then 476 return to higher \Box^{14} C values again at around 40,200 cal. BP. Similar structure is hinted at in the 477 Lake Suigetsu record; however, it remains unclear as to how much of the higher frequency 478 signal in the Suigetsu record is genuine and how much is noise. The lack of a comparable signal 479 in the ¹⁰Be flux suggests that, if genuine, this \Box^{14} C signal would also be related to processes 480 internal to Earth's carbon cycle. Even more speculatively, we note the approximate coincidence 481 of this return to higher \Box^{14} C with Heinrich Stadial 4, during which the Atlantic Meridional 482 Overturning Circulation (AMOC) is believed to have been significantly reduced in strength 483 (Böhm et al., 2015; Eggleston et al., 2016). The AMOC reduction would have less efficiently 484 removed relatively ¹⁴C-enriched CO₂ from the atmosphere and less efficiently returned 485 relatively ¹⁴C-depleted CO₂ from the deep ocean. Therefore, there is a theoretical expectation 486 that $\Box^{14}C$ would increase at about this time, which would not be seen in the ¹⁰Be and 487 VADMinferred records. The afore-mentioned period of divergence in \Box^{14} C and 10 Be circa 488 43,800 cal. 489

BP does not coincide with a Heinrich Stadial, but it does coincide with a 'non-Heinrich' Stadial (Greenland Stadial 12), which we again speculate as being related to the signal seen in TP2005 \Box^{14} C.

With regard to the alignment of the palaeointensity and TP-2005 \Box^{14} C signals, the Black Sea and Tenaghi Philippon datasets can be unambiguously synchronised at the younger end of the TP-2005 data via the presence of the C.I. isochron in both records. Our TP-2005 ¹⁴C-derived age of 39,556 ± 310 cal. BP for the C.I. (as modelled on to the Hulu Cave timescale; 39,87739,165 cal. BP, 95.4% highest probability density range; Fig. S5) is within statistical agreement

(at 95.4% confidence) with the GICC05-implied age in the Black Sea record of 39,350 years 499 BP (Nowaczyk et al. 2012, 2013), providing additional support for the alignment of our TP2005 500 dataset with the Black Sea record at this point in time. We further note the statistical agreement 501 between our TP-2005 inferred age for the C.I. (at 95.4% confidence) with both the widely 502 quoted ${}^{40}\text{Ar}/{}^{39}\text{Ar}$ age of $39,230 \pm 110$ years BP (2 \square) presented by De Vivo et al. (2001) and the 503 more recently published ${}^{40}\text{Ar}/{}^{39}\text{Ar}$ age of $39,850 \pm 140$ years BP (2D) given by Giaccio et al. 504 (2017), noting that our TP-2005 inferred age falls centrally between these two ${}^{40}\text{Ar}/{}^{39}\text{Ar}$ age 505 estimates. Significantly, our TP-2005 inferred age for the C.I. on the IntCal13 timescale 506 $(38,725 \pm 239 \text{ cal. BP}; \text{Fig. S5})$ is too young compared to these alternative age estimates (by 507 ~1,100 years as compared to the Giaccio et al. 2017 ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age). This provides further 508 support for the key finding above that IntCal13 is not accurate circa 40,000 years ago, and that 509 the Hulu Cave speleothem provides a better representation of the authentic radiocarbon 510 511 calibration curve at this point in time.

512

We have presented a record of atmospheric radiocarbon concentration (\square^{14} C) from 516 Tenaghi Philippon core TP-2005 that provides a unique, continuous and direct (non-reservoir 517 corrected) record of \Box^{14} C for the earliest ~10,000 years of the ¹⁴C dating method. Our data 518 demonstrate higher frequency variability than the smoothed IntCal13 consensus calibration 519 curve (Reimer et al., 2013) or the recently published Hulu Cave speleothem dataset (Cheng et 520 al. 2018), yet lack the noise of the Lake Suigetsu dataset (Bronk Ramsey et al., 2012) or the 521 additional reservoir uncertainties of the marine (Fairbanks et al., 2005; Hughen et al., 2006) 522 and speleothem (Hoffmann et al., 2010; Cheng et al. 2018) datasets. Thus, we have been able 523 to compare $\Box^{14}C$ with the shared cosmogenic production signal of ¹⁰Be in the Greenland ice 524 cores and direct palaeo-magnetic intensity records from the Black Sea (Nowaczyk et al., 2013) 525 and the GLOPIS-75 stack (Laj et al., 2004, 2014). These datasets demonstrate a similar pattern 526 527 in the build up to and through the principal peak of the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion. By placing our ¹⁴C dataset on to both the Hulu Cave U-series and IntCal13 timescales via Bayesian 528 statistical modelling, the comparison of our TP-2005 \Box^{14} C dataset with these alternative records 529 also implicitly relates the underlying U-series, IntCal13 and GICC05 timescales themselves. 530 We suggest that, whilst the timescales are in broad agreement, the TP-2005 \Box^{14} C data match 531 the Greenland ¹⁰Be-inferred data more closely when modelled on to the Hulu Cave dataset 532 rather than the IntCal13 curve. This suggests that there is erroneous structure currently included 533 within the IntCal curve, which will be significantly improved upon with the addition of the 534 Hulu Cave dataset to the upcoming iteration of the IntCal calibration curve. It is unsurprising 535 536 that we would find erroneous structure within IntCal13 given that the underlying, contributing ¹⁴C datasets to IntCal are themselves in significant disagreement with each other at this time, 537 and we deem it most likely that the main error is incorporated from the climatically 538

wigglematched timescale of the Cariaco Basin dataset. Our TP-2005 data also suggest that there
is missing structure from the smoothed IntCal and Hulu Cave curves between circa 47,000 cal.
BP and 43,000 cal. BP. Thus, we provide a revised approximation of the authentic structure of
the radiocarbon calibration curve for the earliest ~10,000 years of the ¹⁴C dating method, which
will have implications for all users of the technique over this time period.
Acknowledgments:

545

The authors would like to thank K. Christanis, S. Kalaitzidis and U. Müller for logistical and 546 technical support during the TP-2005 drilling campaign, as well as J. Graystone, M. Humm 547 and P. Leach at the Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit (ORAU) for running the ¹⁴C samples 548 on the AMS. The ¹⁴C dates were funded as part of the UK NERC (Natural Environment 549 Research Council)-funded project 'RESET' (Response of Humans to Abrupt Environmental 550 Transitions; grant number NE/E015670/1). RAS was supported by an Early Career Fellowship 551 from the Leverhulme Trust (ECF-2015-396). JP and AK acknowledge support through the 552 German Research Foundation (DFG). FA is supported by the Swedish Research council (VR 553

grant: 4.1-2016-00218). We would like to thank two anonymous reviewers for their
constructive comments on a previous version of our manuscript, and the editor, Prof Michael
Bickle, for facilitating the peer review process. This study is a contribution to the 'INTIMATE'
('INTegrating Ice-core, MArine and TErrestrial records for the period between 60,000 to 8000

558 years ago') initiative (<u>http://intimate.nbi.ku.dk</u>).

559 **References:**

560

Adolphi F, Muscheler R (2016) Synchronizing the Greenland ice core and radiocarbon
timescales over the Holocene – Bayesian wiggle-matching of cosmogenic radionuclide records.
Clim Past 12:15–30.

565	Albert PG, Hardiman M, Keller J, Tomlinson EL, Smith VC, Bourne AJ, Wulf S, Zanchetta G,
566	Sulpizio R, Müller UC, Pross J, Ottolinim L, Matthews IP, Blockley SPE, Menzies MA (2015)
567	Revisiting the Y-3 tephrostratigraphic marker: a new diagnostic glass geochemistry, age
568	estimate, and details on its climatostratigraphical context. Quat Sci Rev 118:105-121.
569	
570	Andersen KK, Svensson A, Johnsen SJ, Rasmussen SO, Bigler M, Röthlisberger R, Ruth U,
571	Siggaard-Andersen M-L, Steffensen JP, Dahl-Jensen D, Vinther BM, Clausen HB (2006) The
572	Greenland Ice Core Chronology 2005, 15-42 ka. Part 1: constructing the time scale. Quat Sci
573	<u>Rev 25:3246-3257</u> .
574	
575	Böhm E, Lippold J, Gutjahr M, Frank M, Blaser P, Antz B, Fohlmeister J, Frank N, Andersen
576	MB, Deininger M (2015) Strong and deep Atlantic meridional overturning circulation during
577	the last glacial cycle. <u>Nature 517:73-76</u> .
578	
579	Bonhommet N, Babkine, J (1967) Sur la pre'sence d'aimantations inverse'es dans la Chai^ne
580	des Puys, C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris, B 264:92-94.
581	
582	Brauer A, Hajdas I, Blockley SPE, Bronk Ramsey C, Christl M, Ivy-Ochs S, Moseley GE,
583	Nowaczyk NN, Rasmussen SO, Roberts HM, Spötl C, Staff RA, Svensson A (2014) The
584	importance of independent chronology in integrating records of past climate change for the 608
585	ka INTIMATE time interval. Quat Sci Rev 106:47-66.
586	
587	Brock F, Higham T, Ditchfield P, Bronk Ramsey C (2010) Current pre-treatment methods for
588	AMS radiocarbon dating at the Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit (ORAU). Radiocarbon
589	52:103-112.

25.

591	Broecker WS, Gerard R, Ewing M, Heezen BC (1960) Natural radiocarbon in the Atlantic
592	Ocean. J Geophys Res 65:2903-2931.

- 593
- Bronk Ramsey C (2008) Deposition models for chronological records. <u>Quat Sci Rev 27:42-60</u>.
- 595
- Bronk Ramsey C (2009) Dealing with outliers and offsets in radiocarbon dating. <u>Radiocarbon</u>
 597 51:1023-1045.
- 598
- 599 Bronk Ramsey C (2019) OxCal ver.4.3, <u>https://c14.arch.ox.ac.uk/oxcal/OxCal.html</u>.
- 600
- Bronk Ramsey C, Lee S (2013) Recent and planned developments of the program OxCal.
- 602 <u>Radiocarbon 55:720-730</u>.
- 603
- Bronk Ramsey C, Higham TFG, Leach P (2004) Towards high-precision AMS: progress and
 limitations. Radiocarbon 46:17-24.
- 606
- Bronk Ramsey C, Dee M, Lee S, Nakagawa T, Staff RA (2010) Developments in the calibration
 and modeling of radiocarbon dates. Radiocarbon 52:953-961.
- 609
- 610 Bronk Ramsey C, Staff RA, Bryant CL, Brock F, Kitagawa H, van der Plicht J, Schlolaut G,
- 611 Marshall MH, Brauer A, Lamb HF, Payne RL, Tarasov PE, Haraguchi T, Gotanda K,
- 612 Yonenobu H, Yokoyama Y, Tada R, Nakagawa T (2012) A complete terrestrial radiocarbon
- 613 record for 11.2-52.8 kyr BP. <u>Science 338:370-374</u>.
- 614

- Buizert C, Cuffey KM, Severinghaus JP, Baggenstos D, Fudge TJ, Steig EJ, Markle BR,
- 616 Winstrup M, Rhodes RH, Brook EJ, Sowers TA, Clow GD, Cheng H, Edwards RL, Sigl M,
- 617 McConnell JR, Taylor KC (2015) The WAIS Divide deep ice core WD2014 chronology Part
- 618 1: Methane synchronization (68–31 kaBP) and the gas age–ice age difference. <u>Clim Past</u>
 619 <u>11:153-173</u>.

- 621 Cheng, H, Edwards, RL, Southon, J, Matsumoto, K, Feinberg, JM, Sinha, A, Zhou, W, Li, H,
- 622 Li, X, Xu, Y, Chen, S, Tan, M, Wang, Q, Wang, Y, Ning, Y (2018) Atmospheric ¹⁴C/¹²C
- 623 changes during the last glacial period from Hulu Cave. <u>Science 362, 1293-1297</u>.

624

625 Cox A (1969) Geomagnetic reversals. <u>Science 163:237-245</u>.

626

De Vivo B, Rolandi G, Gans PB, Calvert A, Bohrson WA, Spera FJ, Belkin HE (2001) New
constraints on the pyroclastic eruptive history of the Campanian volcanic Plain (Italy). <u>Mineral</u>
Petrol 73, 47-65.

630

- Eggleston S, Schmitt J, Bereiter B, Schneider R, Fischer H (2016) Evolution of the stable
 carbon isotope composition of atmospheric CO₂ over the last glacial cycle. <u>Paleoceanography</u>
 31:434-452.
- 634
- Elsasser W, Ney EP, Winckler JR (1956) Cosmic ray intensity and geomagnetism. <u>Nature</u>
 <u>178:1226-1227</u>.

637

638 Fairbanks RG, Mortlock RA, Chiu T-C, Cao L, Kaplan A, Guilderson TP, Fairbanks TW,

639	Bloom AL, Grootes PM, Nadeau M-J (2005) Radiocarbon calibration curve spanning 0 to
640	50,000 years BP based on paired ²³⁰ Th/ ²³⁴ U/ ²³⁸ U and ¹⁴ C dates on pristine corals. Quat Sci Rev
641	<u>24:1781-1796</u> .

644

- Fletcher WJ, Müller UC, Koutsodendris A, Christanis K, Pross J (2013) A centennial-scale 643 record of vegetation and climate variability from 312 to 240 ka (Marine Isotope Stages 9c-a, 8
- 645 and 7e) from Tenaghi Philippon, NE Greece. Quat Sci Rev 78:108-125.
- 646
- Giaccio B, Hajdas I, Isaia R, Deino A, Nomade S (2017) High-precision ¹⁴C and ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar 647
- 648 dating of the Campanian Ignimbrite (Y-5) reconciles the time-scales of climatic-cultural processes at 40 ka. Sci Rep 7:45940. 649
- 650
- 651 Grootes PM, Stuiver M, White JWC, Johnsen SJ, Jouzel J (1993) Comparison of oxygen isotope records from the GISP2 and GRIP Greenland ice cores. Nature 366:552-554. 652
- 653
- Guillou H, Singer BS, Laj C, Kissel C, Scaillet S, Jicha BR (2004) On the age of the Laschamp 654
- geomagnetic excursion. Earth Planet Sci Lett 227:331-343. 655
- 656

657 Hajdas I, Taricco C, Bonani G, Beer J, Bernasconi SM, Wacker L (2011) Anomalous radiocarbon ages found in Campanian Ignimbrite deposit of the Mediterranean deep-sea core 658

- 659 CT85-5. Radiocarbon 53:575-583.
- 660
- Herbst K, Muscheler R, Heber B (2017) The new local interstellar spectra and their influence 661 on the production rates of the cosmogenic radionuclides ¹⁰Be and ¹⁴C. J Geophys Res Space 662
- Phys 122:23-34, http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2016JA023207. 663
- 664

- 665 Higham TFG, Douka K, Wood RE, Bronk Ramsey C, Brock F, Basell L, Camps M,
- 666 Arrizabalaga A, Baena J, Barroso-Ruíz C, Bergman C, Boitard C, Boscato P, Caparrós M,
- 667 Conard NJ, Draily C, Froment A, Galván B, Gambassini P, Garcia-Moreno A, Grimaldi S,
- 668 Haesaerts P, Holt B, Iriarte-Chiapusso M-J, Jelinek A, Jordá Pardo JF, Maíllo-Fernández J-M,
- 669 Marom A, Maroto J, Menéndez M, Metz L, Morin E, Moroni A, Negrino F, Panagopoulou E,
- 670 Peresani M, Pirson S, de la Rasilla M, Riel-Salvatore J, Ronchitelli A, Santamaria D, Semal P,
- 671 Slimak L, Soler J, Soler N, Villaluenga A, Pinhasi R, Jacobi R (2014) The timing and
- 672 spatiotemporal patterning of Neanderthal disappearance. <u>Nature 512:306-309</u>.
- 673
- Hoffmann DL, Beck JW, Richards DA, Smart PL, Singarayer JS, Ketchmark T, Hawkesworth
 CJ (2010) Towards radiocarbon calibration beyond 28 ka using speleothems from the Bahamas.
 Earth Planet Sci Lett 289:1-10.
- 677
- Hogg AG, Turney CSM, Palmer JG, Southon J, Kromer B, Bronk Ramsey C, Boswijk G,
- 679 Fenwick P, Noronha A, Staff RA, Friedrich M, Reynard L, Guetter D, Wacker L, Jones RT
- (2013) The New Zealand Kauri (Agathis Australis) Research Project: A radiocarbon
 intercomparison of Younger Dryas wood and implications for IntCal13. <u>Radiocarbon</u>
 55:20352048.
- 683
- Hughen KA, Southon JR, Lehman SJ, Bertrand C, Turnbull J (2006) Marine-derived ¹⁴C
 calibration and activity record for the past 50,000 years updated from the Cariaco Basin. <u>Quat</u>
 <u>Sci Rev 25:3216-3227</u>.
- 687

- Johnsen SJ, Clausen HB, Dansgaard W, Fuhrer K, Gundestrup N, Hammer CU, Iversen P,
 Jouzel J, Stauffer B, Steffensen JP (1992) Irregular glacial interstadials recorded in a new
 Greenland ice core. <u>Nature 359:311-313</u>.
- 691
- Laj C, Kissel C, Mazaud A, Channell JET, Beer J (2000) North Atlantic palaeointensity stack
- since 75 ka (NAPIS-75) and the duration of the Laschamp event. <u>Phil Trans R Soc of Lond A</u>
 <u>358:1009-1025</u>.
- 695
- 696 Laj C, Kissel C, Beer J (2004) High Resolution Global Paleointensity Stack Since 75 kyr
- 697 (GLOPIS-75) Calibrated to Absolute Values. Timescales of the Paleomagnetic Field, eds
- 698 Channell JET, Kent DVK, Lowrie W, Meert JG (AGU Monogr. Ser. vol. 145) (Washington,
- 699 DC: American Geophysical Union), pp.255-265.
- 700
- Laj C, Guillou H, Kissel C (2014) Dynamics of the earth magnetic field in the 10–75 kyr period
- comprising the Laschamp and Mono Lake excursions: New results from the French Chaîne des
- 703 Puys in a global perspective. <u>Earth Planet Sci Lett 387:184-197</u>.
- Lal D, Peters B (1967) Cosmic ray produced radioactivity on the Earth. pp. 551-612 in Flügge
- 705 S (ed.) <u>Handbuch für Physik</u>. Springer, Berlin, Germany.
- 706
- Lane CS, Brauer A, Blockley SPE, Dulski P (2013) Volcanic ash reveals time-transgressive
- abrupt climate change during the Younger Dryas. <u>Geology 41:1251-1254</u>.
- 709
- 710 McHargue LR, Damon PE (1991) The global beryllium 10 cycle. <u>Rev Geophys 29:141-158</u>.
- 711

712	Müller UC, Pross J, Tzedakis PC, Gamble C, Kotthoff U, Schmiedl G, Wulf S, Christanis K
713	(2011) The role of climate in the spread of modern humans into Europe. Quat Sci Rev
714	30:273279.

- 715
- 716 Muscheler R, Beer J, Wagner G, Laj C, Kissel C, Raisbeck GM, Yiou F, Kubik PW (2004)
- 717 Changes in the carbon cycle during the last deglaciation as indicated by the comparison of 10 Be

718 and ¹⁴C records. Earth Planet Sci Lett 219:325-340.

719

- 720 Muscheler R, Beer J, Kubik PW, Synal H-A (2005) Geomagnetic field intensity during the last
- 60,000 years based on ¹⁰Be and ³⁶Cl from the Summit ice cores and ¹⁴C. <u>Quat Sci Rev</u>

722 <u>24:1849-1860</u>.

723

724 Muscheler R, Kromer B, Björck S, Svensson A, Friedrich M, Kaiser KF, Southon J (2008) Tree

rings and ice cores reveal ¹⁴C calibration uncertainties during the Younger Dryas. <u>Nat</u>

- 726 <u>Geosci 1, 263-267</u>.
- 727 Muscheler R, Adolphi F, Knudsen MF (2014a) Assessing the differences between the IntCal

and Greenland ice-core time scales for the last 14,000 years via the common cosmogenic
radionuclide variations. Quat Sci Rev 106:81-87.

730

- 731 Muscheler R, Adolphi F, Svensson A (2014b) Challenges in ¹⁴C dating towards the limit of the
- method inferred from anchoring a floating tree ring radiocarbon chronology to ice core records
- around the Laschamp geomagnetic field minimum. <u>Earth Planet Sci Lett 394:209-215</u>.

- 735 Muscheler R, Adolphi F, Herbst K, Nilsson A (2016) The Revised Sunspot Record in
- 736 Comparison to Cosmogenic Radionuclide-Based Solar Activity Reconstructions. Solar Phys

737	29	1:30	025	-30)43	
	-					

NEEM Community Members (2013) Eemian interglacial reconstructed from a Greenland
folded ice core. Nature 493:489-494.

741

NGRIP members (2004) High-resolution record of Northern Hemisphere climate extending
into the last interglacial period. <u>Nature 431:147-151</u>.

744

- Nowaczyk NR, Arz HW, Frank U, Kind J, Plessen B (2012) Dynamics of the Laschamp
- 746 geomagnetic excursion from Black Sea sediments. Earth Planet Sci Lett 351-352:54-69.

747

- Nowaczyk NR, Frank U, Kind J, Arz HW (2013) A high-resolution paleointensity stack of the
 past 14 to 68 ka from Black Sea sediments. <u>Earth Planet Sci Lett 384:1-16</u>.
- 750 Potgieter MS, Vos EE, Boezio M, De Simone N, Di Felice V, Formato V (2014) Modulation
- of Galactic Protons in the Heliosphere During the Unusual Solar Minimum of 2006 to 2009.
- 752 Sol Phys 289:391-406, <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11207-013-0324-6</u>.

753

Pross J, Tzedakis P, Schmiedl G, Christanis K, Hooghiemstra H, Müller UC, Kotthoff U,
Kalaitzidis S, Miller A (2007) Tenaghi Philippon (Greece) Revisited: Drilling a Continuous
Lower-Latitude Terrestrial Climate Archive of the Last 250,000 Years. <u>Scientific Drilling 5:44-</u>

757 <u>46</u>.

758

Pross J, Kotthoff U, Müller UC, Peyron O, Dormoy I, Schmiedl G, Kalaitzidis S, Smith AM
(2009) Massive perturbation in terrestrial ecosystems of the Eastern Mediterranean region
associated with the 8.2 kyr BP climatic event. Geology 37:887-890.

763	Pross J, Koutsodendris A, Christanis K, Fischer T, Fletcher WJ, Hardiman M, Kalaitzidis S,
764	Knipping M, Kotthoff U, Milner AM, Müller UC, Schmiedl G, Siavalas G, Tzedakis PC, Wulf
765	S (2015) The 1.35-Ma-long terrestrial climate archive of Tenaghi Philippon, northeastern
766	Greece: Evolution, exploration, and perspectives for future research. <u>Newsl Stratigr 48:253276</u> .
767	
768	Rasmussen SO, Andersen KK, Svenson AM, Steffensen JP, Vinther BM, Johnsen SJ, Clausen
769	HB, Larsen LB, Bigler M, Röthlisberger R, Andersen M-LS, Fisher H, Ruth U, Goto-Azuma
770	K, Hansson M (2006) A new Greenland ice core chronology for the last glacial termination. \underline{J}
771	Geophys Res Atmos 111:D06102.
772	Reimer PJ, Bard E, Bayliss A, Beck JW, Blackwell PG, Bronk Ramsey C, Buck CE, Edwards
773	RL, Friedrich M, Grootes PM, Guilderson TP, Haflidason H, Hajdas I, Hatté C, Heaton TJ,
774	Hoffmann DL, Hogg AG, Hughen KA, Kaiser KF, Kromer B, Manning SW, Niu M, Reimer
775	RW, Richards DA, Scott EM, Southon JR, Staff RA, Turney CSM, van der Plicht J (2013)
776	IntCal13 and Marine13 radiocarbon age calibration curves 0-50,000 years cal BP. Radiocarbon
777	<u>55:1869-1887</u> .
778	
779	Sanchez Goñi MF, Harrison SP (2010) Millennial-scale climate variability and vegetation
780	changes during the Last Glacial: Concepts and terminology. Quat Sci Rev 29:2823-2827.
781	
782	Seierstad IK, Abbott PM, Bigler M, Blunier T, Bourne AJ, Brook E, Buchardt SL, Buizert C,
783	Clausen HB, Cook E, Dahl-Jensen D, Davies SM, Guillevic M, Johnsen SJ, Pedersen DS, Popp

- 784 TJ, Rasmussen SO, Severinghaus JP, Svensson A, Vinther BM (2014) Consistently dated
- records from the Greenland GRIP, GISP2 and NGRIP ice cores for the past 104 ka reveal

regional millennial-scale δ^{18} O gradients with possible Heinrich event imprint, <u>Quat Sci Rev</u> 106:29-46.

- Siegenthaler U, Heimann M, Oeschger H (1980) ¹⁴C variations caused by changes in the global
 carbon cycle. Radiocarbon 22:177-191.
- 791
- Sigl M, Winstrup M, McConnell JR, Welten KC, Plunkett G, Ludlow F, Büntgen U, Caffee M,
- 793 Chellman N, Dahl-Jensen D, Fischer H, Kipfstuhl S, Kostick C, Maselli OJ, Mekhaldi F,
- Mulvaney R, Muscheler R, Pasteris DR, Pilcher JR, Salzer M, Schüpbach S, Steffensen JP,
- Vinther BM, Woodruff TE (2015), Timing and climate forcing of volcanic eruptions for the
- 796 past 2,500 years. <u>Nature 523:543-549</u>.
- 797
- ⁷⁹⁸Singer BS, Guillou H, Jicha BR, Laj C, Kissel C, Beard BL, Johnson CM (2009) ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar, K–
- Ar and ²³⁰Th–²³⁸U dating of the Laschamp excursion: A radioisotopic tie-point for ice core and
- 800 climate chronologies. <u>Earth Planet Sci Lett 286:80-88</u>.
- 801
- 802 Southon J, Noronha AL, Cheng H, Edwards RL, Wang Y (2012) A high-resolution record of
- atmospheric ¹⁴C based on Hulu Cave speleothem H82. <u>Quat Sci Rev 33:32-41</u>.
- 804
- 805 Staff RA, Bronk Ramsey C, Bryant CL, Brock F, Payne RL, Schlolaut G, Marshall MH, Brauer
- A, Lamb HF, Tarasov P, Yokoyama Y, Haraguchi T, Gotanda K, Yonenobu H, Nakagawa T,
- 807 Suigetsu 2006 project members (2011) New ¹⁴C determinations from Lake Suigetsu, Japan:
- 808 12,000 to 0 cal BP. <u>Radiocarbon 53:511-528</u>.
- 809

- Staff RA, Reynard L, Brock F, Bronk Ramsey C (2014) Wood Pretreatment Protocols and
 Measurement of Tree-Ring Standards at the Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit (ORAU).
 <u>Radiocarbon 56:709-715</u>.
- 813
- Steffensen JP, Andersen KK, Bigler M, Clausen HB, Dahl-Jensen D, Fischer H, Goto-Azuma
 K, Hansson M, Johnsen SJ, Jouzel J, Masson-Delmotte V, Popp T, Rasmussen SO,
 Röthlisberger R, Ruth U, Stauffer B, Siggaard-Andersen M-L, Sveinbjörnsdóttir AE, Svensson
 A, White JWC (2008) High-Resolution Greenland Ice Core Data Show Abrupt Climate Change
 Happens in Few Years. <u>Science 321:680-684</u>.
- 819
- 820 Svensson A, Andersen KK, Bigler M, Clausen HB, Dahl-Jensen D, Davies SM, Johnsen SJ,
- 821 Muscheler R, Parrenin F, Rasmussen SO, Röthlisberger R, Seierstad I, Steffensen JP, Vinther,
- BM (2008) A 60 000 year Greenland stratigraphic ice core chronology. <u>Clim. Past 4, 47-57</u>.
- 823
- Turney CSM, Fifield LK, Hogg AG, Palmer JG, Hughen K, Baillie MGL, Galbraith R, Ogden
 J, Lorrey A, Tims SG, Jones RT (2010) The potential of New Zealand kauri (Agathis australis)
 for testing the synchronicity of abrupt climate change during the Last Glacial Interval
 (60,00011,700 years ago). Quat Sci Rev 29:3677-3682.
- 828

Turney CSM, Palmer JG, Bronk Ramsey C, Adolphi F, Muscheler R, Hughen KA, Staff RA,
Jones RT, Thomas ZA, Fogwill CJ, Hogg AG (2016) High-precision dating and correlation of
ice, marine and terrestrial sequences spanning Heinrich Event 3: Testing mechanisms of
interhemispheric change using New Zealand ancient kauri (Agathis australis). <u>Quat Sci Rev</u>
<u>137:126-134</u>.

835	Tzedakis PC, Hooghiemstra H, Pälike H (2006) The last 1.35 million years at Tenaghi
836	Philippon: revised chronostratigraphy and long-term vegetation trends. Quat Sci Rev
837	25:34163430.

- Valet J-P, Meynadier L (1993) Geomagnetic field intensity and reversals during the past four
 million years. Nature 366:234-238.
- 841
- Vinther BM (2008) A 60 000 year Greenland stratigraphic ice core chronology. <u>Clim Past 4:47-</u>
 57.
- 844
- Voelker AHL, Grootes PM, Nadeau M-J, Sarnthein M (2000) Radiocarbon levels in the Iceland
 Sea from 25-53 kyr and their link to the Earth's magnetic field intensity. <u>Radiocarbon</u>
 42:437452.
- 848
- Wijmstra TA (1969) Palynology of the first 30 metres of a 120 m deep section in northern
 Greece. Acta Botanica Neerlandica 18:511-527.

- 852 Wulf S, Hardiman MJ, Staff RA, Koutsodendris A, Appelt O, Blockley SPE, Lowe JJ, Manning
- 853 CJ, Ottolini L, Schmitt AK, Smith VC, Tomlinson EL, Vakhrameeva P, Knipping M, Kotthoff
- U, Milner AM, Müller UC, Christanis K, Kalaitzidis S, Tzedakis PC, Schmiedl G, Pross J
- 855 (2018) The Marine Isotope Stage 1–5 cryptotephra record of Tenaghi Philippon, Greece:
- towards a detailed tephrostratigraphic framework for the Eastern Mediterranean region. <u>Quat</u>
 Sci Rev 186, 236-262
- 858
- 859 Yiou F, Raisbeck, GM, Baumgartner S., Beer J, Hammer C, Johnsen S, Jouzel J, Kubik PW,
- 860 Lestringuez J, Stiévenard M, Suter M, Yiou P (1997) Beryllium 10 in the Greenland Ice Core

- Project ice core at Summit, Greenland. J Geophys Res 102:26783-26794.
- **Figure Captions:**
- 863
- **Fig. 1.** Location of the Tenaghi Philippon site, Eastern Macedonia, NE Greece. Inset shows the
- location of sediment core TP-2005 within the Drama Basin.



867

Fig. 2. Revised age-depth profile (green) for core TP-2005 from Tenaghi Philippon, as 868 compared to the previously published dataset of Müller et al. (2011; red), generated by 869 independent P_Sequence deposition modelling in OxCal ver.4.3 (Bronk Ramsey, 2008, 870 2019; Bronk Ramsey and Lee, 2013) on to the Hulu Cave ¹⁴C calibration dataset of Cheng et 871 al. (2018). Equivalent age-depth profiles are additionally plotted for the same TP-2005 datasets 872 873 (this study, blue; and Müller et al., 2011, grey) as modelled on to the IntCal13 calibration curve (Reimer et al., 2013). Modelled probability density functions are plotted with the 68.2% highest 874 875 probability density range interpolations overlain. For the unmodelled data, see Supplementary Figure S3. 876



Fig. 3. Comparison of the shared production signals of the cosmogenic nuclides ¹⁴C and ¹⁰Be with relative palaeointensity. (a) NGRIP \Box^{18} O (NGRIP members, 2004; light blue data series);

(b) Inferred \Box^{14} C from the GLOPIS-75 stack (Laj et al., 2004, 2014; blue data series) and Black 881 Sea (Nowaczyk et al., 2013; as 'tuned' to GICC05, red data series) relative palaeointensity 882 datasets; (c) Inferred \Box^{14} C from Greenland ¹⁰Be flux (Yiou et al., 1997; Muscheler et al., 2004, 883 2014b); (d) Reconstructed atmospheric ¹⁴C concentrations (\Box ¹⁴C) based on Tenaghi Philippon 884 core TP-2005 (dark green data points; this paper), as well as the kauri dataset of Turney et al. 885 (2010; purple data series), as modelled against the Hulu Cave ¹⁴C calibration dataset (Cheng et 886 al., 2018; pink curve); (e) Reconstructed atmospheric ¹⁴C concentrations (\Box ¹⁴C) based on 887 888 Tenaghi Philippon core TP-2005 (dark green data points; this paper) as modelled against IntCal13 (red curve). For comparison, the Lake Suigetsu (Bronk Ramsey et al., 2012) (blue 889 dataset) is additionally plotted. For clarity, all data are plotted at 68.2%/1 probability ranges. 890 (a-c) are all plotted on the GICC05 timescale BP (Andersen et al., 2006; Rasmussen et al., 891 892 2006; Svensson et al., 2008); (d) is plotted on the Hulu Cave U-series timescale; and (e) is plotted on the IntCal13 cal. BP timescale. Additionally, the shaded light blue boxes mark the 893 approximate timings of Heinrich stadials HS4 and HS5 (Sanchez Goñi and Harrison, 2010); 894 895 the hashed brown line marks the position of the Campanian Ignimbrite (C.I.) tephra in the

896 Tenaghi Philippon and Black Sea records.



40.