1	Assessing the impact of peat erosion on growing season $\mathbf{CO}_2$
2	FLUXES BY COMPARING EROSIONAL PEAT PANS AND SURROUNDING
3	VEGETATED HAGGS
4	
5	Naomi Gatisa, Pia Benauda, Josie Ashea, David J. Luscombea, Emilie Grand-
6	Clement <sup>a</sup> , Iain P Hartley <sup>a</sup> , Karen Anderson <sup>b</sup> and Richard E Brazier <sup>a</sup> .
7	
8	<sup>a</sup> Geography, University of Exeter, Rennes Drive, Exeter, Devon, UK, EX4 4RJ.
9	<sup>b</sup> Environment and Sustainability Institute, University of Exeter Penryn Campus, Penryn,
10	Cornwall, UK, TR10 9FE.
11	
12	Corresponding author
13	Naomi Gatis, Geography, University of Exeter, Rennes Drive, Exeter, Devon, UK, EX4
14	4RJ. +44 (0) 1392 725892 <u>N.Gatis@exeter.ac.uk</u>
15	
16	N.Gatis@exeter.ac.uk (N. Gatis), P.Benaud@exeter.ac.uk (P. Benaud),
17	J.Ashe@exeter.ac.uk (J. Ashe), D.J.Luscombe@exeter.ac.uk (D.J. Luscombe), E.Grand-
18	Clement@exeter.ac.uk (E. Grand-Clement), I.Hartley@exeter.ac.uk (I.P. Hartley),
19	Karen.Anderson@exeter.ac.uk (K. Anderson) and R.E.Brazier@exeter.ac.uk (R.E.
20	Brazier).
21	
22	
23	

# ASSESSING THE IMPACT OF PEAT EROSION ON GROWING SEASON CO2 FLUXES BY COMPARING EROSIONAL PEAT PANS AND SURROUNDING VEGETATED HAGGS

### 27 **ABSTRACT**

Peatlands are recognised as an important but vulnerable ecological resource. Understanding the effects of existing damage, in this case erosion, enables more informed land management decisions to be made. Over the growing seasons of 2013 and 2014 photosynthesis and ecosystem respiration were measured using closed chamber techniques within vegetated haggs and erosional peat pans in Dartmoor National Park, southwest England. Below-ground total and heterotrophic respiration were measured and autotrophic respiration estimated from the vegetated haggs.

35 The mean water table was significantly higher in the peat pans than in the vegetated 36 haggs; because of this, and the switching from submerged to dry peat, there were 37 differences in vegetation composition, photosynthesis and ecosystem respiration. In the 38 peat pans photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake and ecosystem respiration were greater than in the 39 vegetated haggs and strongly dependent on the depth to water table ( $r^2>0.78$ , p<0.001). 40 Whilst in the vegetated haggs, photosynthesis and ecosystem respiration had the 41 strongest relationships with normalised difference vegetation index (NDVI) ( $r^2=0.82$ , 42 p<0.001) and soil temperature at 15 cm depth ( $r^2=0.77$ , p=0.001). Autotrophic and total 43 below-ground respiration in the vegetated haggs varied with soil temperature; 44 heterotrophic respiration increased as water tables fell. An empirically derived net ecosystem model estimated that over the two growing seasons both the vegetated haggs 45  $(29 \text{ and } 20 \text{ gC m}^{-2}; 95 \% \text{ confidence intervals of } -570 \text{ to } 762 \text{ and } -873 \text{ to } 1105 \text{ gC m}^{-2})$  and 46 the peat pans (7 and 8 gC m<sup>-2</sup>; 95 % confidence intervals of -147 to 465 and -136 to 47 436 gC m<sup>-2</sup>) were most likely net CO<sub>2</sub> sources. This study suggests that not only the 48 49 visibly degraded bare peat pans but also the surrounding vegetated haggs are losing

- 50 carbon to the atmosphere, particularly during warmer and drier conditions, highlighting a
- 51 need for ecohydrological restoration.

### 52 **Keywords**

53 Photosynthesis; Ecosystem respiration; Heterotrophic respiration; peatland; carbon 54 dioxide; blanket bog;

### 55 **HIGHLIGHTS**

- The effect of peatland erosion on CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes was studied to support land
  management
  Closed chamber measurements from blanket bog haggs and eroding peat pans,
  Dartmoor
- Peat pans were intermittently dry with less vegetation cover and species diversity
- P<sub>G</sub> and R<sub>Eco</sub> were driven by WTD in the pans and NDVI & soil temperature in the
   haggs
- Vegetated haggs & peat pans were growing season net CO<sub>2</sub> sources; carbon is
   being lost

### 65 **1** INTRODUCTION

Peatlands are recognised as valuable ecological resources providing a range of ecosystem services including food provision, flood alleviation, drinking water supply, amenity value and carbon sequestration (Grand-Clement et al. 2013). However, many peatlands are damaged, putting these ecosystem services at risk (Holden et al. 2007). Projects aimed at restoring the ecohydrological functioning of mires are more likely to set realistic targets and succeed where the effects of existing damage are understood (Bonnett et al. 2009).

Blanket bogs form in cool (< 15 °C mean summer temperatures) and wet (>1000 mm rain 73 74 annually) conditions (Lindsay et al. 1988). They consist of multiple peat-forming 75 conditions (e.g. raised bogs, watershed mires, flushes etc.) which have spread laterally and joined together smothering the underlying topography. As they rise 76 77 above the influence of groundwater they are dependent on precipitation for both water and nutrients (Moore 1987) resulting in acidic nutrient poor conditions. In the UK, 78 79 ecohydrologically functioning blanket bogs are dominated by Sphagnum species 80 which maintain the water table at or above the ground surface (Clymo 1983; Evans et al. 1999; Holden et al. 2011). The UK has 10-15 % of the world's blanket peat 81 82 resource (Tallis 1997) primarily located in upland areas, consequently they are 83 globally important.

84 Burning, grazing, deposition of atmospheric pollutants (Yeloff et al. 2006), thawing 85 permafrost (Schuur et al. 2008) and climate change (Stevenson et al. 1990) have all been 86 proposed as causes of peatland erosion. These can initiate a feedback loop where peat 87 erosion reduces vegetation cover leaving bare peat more susceptible to further erosion by 88 fluvial, aeolian and freeze-thaw processes forming erosional features (Bragg and Tallis 89 2001). These features are of great concern as they drain the peat, resulting in particulate 90 organic carbon losses downstream (Evans et al. 2006) and water table draw-down in the 91 surrounding vegetated areas (Daniels et al. 2008), altering vegetation composition and 92 CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes beyond their extent (Clay et al. 2012).

Lower water tables have been shown to alter the vegetation present away from *Sphagnum* towards vascular plants such as *Molinia caerulea, Calluna vulgaris* and *Eriophorum* species (Coulson et al. 1990; Bellamy et al. 2012). These species have larger and more dynamic CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes (McNamara et al. 2008; Otieno et al. 2009) but are more readily decomposed (Coulson and Butterfield 1978; Wallen 1993; Thormann et al. 1999) and therefore contribute little to the long-term carbon store compared to *Sphagnum*.

Additionally vascular plants can have extensive root systems which may stimulate the
decomposition of more recalcitrant deeper peat (Fontaine et al. 2007).

101 To date, studies on CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes from eroding blanket bogs (McNamara et al. 2008; Clay et 102 al. 2012; Dixon et al. 2013; Rowson et al. 2013) have been focused in northern England 103 where erosional gullies are steeper, deeper and wider (up to 3 m) than the peat pans of 104 Dartmoor (up to 1.5 m wide and typically < 50 cm deep). It is unclear what initiated erosion 105 on Dartmoor but peat pans (shallow, sparsely vegetated, hydraulically-connected, 106 intermittently saturated depressions) and haggs (surrounding vegetated blocks) are 107 limited to flat areas with insufficient erosional energy for gullies to form. They expand as 108 the water level is lowered around the edges of the vegetated haggs destabilising the peat 109 (Luscombe, pers. comm. 2018).

110 The deep peats of Dartmoor store an estimated 13.1 Mt of carbon (Gatis et al. 2019) but 111 are vulnerable to climate change as they lie at the southern limit of the UK blanket bog 112 climatic envelope (Clark et al. 2010). This makes them invaluable as indicators of the 113 potential effects of climate change on other, more northerly, maritime peatlands. 114 Understanding the controls on CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes on Dartmoor may provide an indication of the future for other deep peats as temperatures rise potentially initiating more erosion. The 115 116 aim of this study was to investigate the controls on CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes in peat haggs and peat 117 pans and quantify CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes from these landscape components.

### 118 2 MATERIAL AND METHODS

### 119 **2.1 STUDY SITE**

The study site is located in an area of degraded blanket bog in Dartmoor National Park (Figure 1A and B), southwest England (50°36N, 3°57'W). At Princetown (Figure 1B) the long-term average annual precipitation is 1974 mm and has a mean monthly temperature range of 0.8 to 17.7 °C. The site lies at 515 m above sea level and is classified as National Vegetation Classification class M17 *Scirpus cespitosus-Eriophorum vaginatum* blanket mire (Rodwell 1991). Peat at the study site is estimated to be between 3.6 and 4.0 m thick (Gatis et al. 2019) above the average for Dartmoor (0.81 m) (Parry et al. 2012). The study site is within an extensive area of erosional peat pans and vegetated haggs (Figure 1C and D). The areas is currently used for extensive sheep grazing.

# 129 2.2 NET CO<sub>2</sub> ECOSYSTEM EXCHANGE MEASUREMENTS

130 Net CO<sub>2</sub> Ecosystem Exchange (NEE) measurements were taken on 10 separate dates at 131 six locations in the vegetated haggs in a randomised pattern approximately every month 132 between 05/06/2013 and 20/09/2013 and 10/04/2014 and 10/09/2014. A 20 cm diameter, 50 cm tall Perspex collar was attached to the peat surface prior to each measurement 133 134 using silicon putty (Evo-Stick "Plumbers Mait", Stafford, UK), and subsequently removed at the end of the measurement. The collar was 50 cm tall to allow for the expected mid-135 136 summer vegetation height. The collar was not inserted into the peat as this severs fine surface roots (Heinemeyer et al. 2011) and alters the hydrological and micro-137 138 meteorological properties of the peat. Due to limited moss coverage it was possible to 139 ensure a good seal with the peat surface directly using silicon putty. A LiCOR-8100 infra-140 red gas analyser (LiCOR, Lincoln, Nebraska) connected to a 8100-104C transparent 141 chamber (with a rubber gasket to ensure an airtight seal) measured variation in CO<sub>2</sub> 142 concentrations every 2 seconds over 2 minutes concurrently with photosynthetic photon 143 flux density (PPFD) (LiCOR Li-190 Quantum Sensor). In order to limit the weight of 144 equipment carried to site it was not possible to control chamber temperature, therefore 145 temperature may have increased during the test potentially stressing the plants resulting 146 in an underestimate of photosynthesis. The variation in chamber temperature over the tests ranged from 0.0 to 1.4 °C. To further limit this effect the chamber was removed 147 148 between measurements to restore ambient conditions.

149 In the peat pans CO<sub>2</sub> measurements were taken on 15 separate dates at six locations in 150 a randomised pattern approximately every two weeks (concurrent with soil respiration 151 measurements) from 29/05/2013 to 07/10/2013 and 14/04/2014 and 11/09/2014. The 152 8100-104C transparent chamber was too heavy to float so CO<sub>2</sub> concentration was 153 measured from a 16 cm diameter, 13 cm tall floating collars every 9 seconds over 90 154 seconds using an EGM-4 infra-red gas analyser and a transparent CPY-4 canopy assimilation chamber (2.427I) (PP Systems, Hitchin) concurrently with chamber air 155 156 temperature and PPFD. No ebullition or sudden increases in CO<sub>2</sub> suggestive of ebullition 157 were observed so it is assumed CO<sub>2</sub> was not released via this mechanism. Measurement of the same location via the two different methods resulted in an uncertainty of 158 0.2 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. 159

160 CO<sub>2</sub> measurements were taken on sunny days at 100, 60, 40, 10 and 0 % light levels 161 using a combination of shade cloths. It is acknowledged that shade cloths can 162 underestimate photosynthesis at low light levels compared to naturally low light conditions. 163 However, this seemed the most practical solution given the remoteness of the site and 164 labour availability. The net  $CO_2$  exchange at each light level was calculated from the linear 165 change in chamber  $CO_2$  concentration. Linear accumulation rates with an  $r^2$  of less than 166 0.7 were discarded unless the maximum change in  $CO_2$  concentration was  $\leq 1$  ppm in which case a flux of 0  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> was assigned. Of the 1041 samples collected, 8 were 167 168 discarded from the vegetated haggs and 25 from the peat pans at this stage.

To account for variability in solar radiation between measurements, net CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes were fitted to a hyperbolic light response curve (Equation 1) using a non-linear least-squares fit across the different light levels measured for each plot for each month.

172 Equation 1

173 
$$NEE = R_{ECO} - \frac{P_{max} .PPFD}{k + PPFD}$$

where NEE is the net CO<sub>2</sub> ecosystem exchange ( $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), P<sub>max</sub> is the rate of light saturated photosynthesis ( $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), k is the half-saturation constant of photosynthesis ( $\mu$ mol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), PPFD the incident photosynthetic photon flux density (PPFD) ( $\mu$ mol Photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) and R<sub>Eco</sub> ecosystem respiration ( $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>). Only light response curves with an r<sup>2</sup> > 0.7 were accepted therefore a further 11 and 171 measurements from the vegetated haggs and peat pans respectively were discarded.

180 R<sub>Eco</sub> was determined for each plot from each light response curve (one per sample day) 181 using equation 1. Photosynthesis and net ecosystem exchange were then determined for a PPFD of 1000  $\mu$ mol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (P<sub>G1000</sub> and NEE<sub>1000</sub>), the light saturated 182 183 photosynthesis rate, using Equation 1 and the parameters P<sub>max</sub> and K previously 184 determined from each light response curve. As different PPFD meters were used in the 185 peat pans and vegetated haggs, a cross-calibration with a continuous (every 15 minute) onsite global irradiation meter (r<sup>2</sup>>0.90, n=284; Adcon, Klosterneuburg, Austria) was used 186 187 to ensure that fluxes were being standardised to the same light intensity.

# 188 2.3 SOIL CO<sub>2</sub> EFFLUX MEASUREMENTS

At each vegetated hagg plot four Polyvinyl Chloride collars (16 cm diameter, 8 cm height)
were installed within 50 cm of the NEE plots (



194 Figure 2). These were sealed to the peat surface in March 2013 using non-setting putty 195 (Evo Stick "Plumbers Mait", Stafford, UK). All collars (n=24) had above-ground vegetation 196 removed by regular clipping so they measured below-ground fluxes only. In addition, 56 197 cm diameter, 20 cm deep trenches were cut around half the collars to exclude live roots 198 enabling measurement of the below-ground heterotrophic component. At each of six 199 plots, the two replicates of each treatment were averaged to produce a single value for 200 total soil (clipped) and heterotrophic soil (trenched and clipped) respiration. Repeated 201 trenching was used to prevent root re-growth, rather than a barrier, to minimise the effect 202 on the hydraulic properties of the peat.

Trenching and clipping were chosen as inexpensive, simple and established methods subject to well documented uncertainties (Kuzyakov and Larionova 2005; Subke et al. 2006) such as severing roots which decompose leading to an overestimation of heterotrophic respiration. Collars were installed 2 months prior to the start of sampling to reduce disturbance effects.

Soil CO<sub>2</sub> flux measurements were taken on 17 separate dates in a randomised pattern approximately every two weeks from 13/05/2013 to 1/11/2013 and 14/04/2014 to 11/09/2014. CO<sub>2</sub> flux was measured over 2 minutes using an EGM-4 infra-red gas analyser and a CPY-4 canopy assimilation chamber (PP Systems, Hitchin, UK). The autotrophic component of soil respiration was calculated from the difference between total and heterotrophic soil respiration measured at each location for each sample round.

# 214 2.4 AUXILIARY MEASUREMENTS

215 Concurrently with both NEE and soil CO<sub>2</sub> flux measurements soil temperature was 216 recorded down a single vertical profile at 5, 10, 15, 20, 25 and 30 cm (Electronic 217 Temperature Instruments, Worthing) below the peat surface in the vegetated haggs. In 218 both the peat pans and the vegetated haggs the water table depth below the peat surface 219 was measured using a ruler in a perforated tube. Water table depths were measured at 220 nearby dipwells automatically every 15 minutes with *in-situ* submersible water pressure 221 transducers (IMSL Geo100 Impress, UK). Soil temperature was continuously measured 222 at a depth of 15 cm every 15 minutes (Gemini Data Loggers, Chichester, UK) at vegetated 223 plot 4. Rainfall was measured using a tipping bucket rain gauge (0.2 mm tip, RT1, Adcon 224 Telemetry, Austria). Global irradiation was measured every 15 minutes (Adcon, 225 Klosterneuburg, Austria). Data gaps were filled in by correlation ( $r^2=0.91$ , p<0.001) to the 226 closest meteorological station, 18 km to the northwest and 340 m lower in elevation than 227 the study site; North Wyke (UK Meteorological Office 2012) (50°46'N 3°54'W).

# 228 **2.5 VEGETATION COMPOSITION, SEASONAL DEVELOPMENT AND** 229 **PRODUCTIVITY**

### 230 2.5.1 Vegetation Composition and Productivity

231 Visual inspection of the area inside the NEE collars in August 2013 assessed the 232 percentage coverage of each species as well as total cover of bare ground, standing 233 water, herbs (forbs), grasses, sedges, non-Sphagnum moss and Sphagnum moss. The 234 number of species present at each location was counted to derive the species richness. 235 The Shannon Diversity Index (Shannon 1948) (Equation 2) and Inverse Simpson Diversity 236 Index (Simpson 1949) (Equation 3) were calculated; the first quantifies the uncertainty in 237 predicting the next species, whilst the second describes the richness of a community increasing from 1, a community containing only one species. 238

Equation 2

240

Shannon Diversity Index = 
$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} P_i . ln P_i$$

241 Equation 3

242 Inverse Simpson Diversity Index = 
$$\frac{1}{\sum N_i(N_i - 1)}$$

Where n is the number of species encountered and P<sub>i</sub> the fraction of the entire population made up of species I, N<sub>i</sub> is the total area of species i present and N the total area of vegetation.

Ellenberg's Moisture Indicator Values (Hill et al. 1999) were determined for each location. Vascular species have been classified according to their ecological niche on a 12 point scale ranging from 1 (extreme dryness) to 12 (submerged plants). The classification values for the vascular species identified in this study were looked up and the average value for the species present at each location was calculated.

251 Destructive samples were collected to measure annual net primary productivity (ANPP) 252 on 29/08/2013 and 07/08/2014. The timing was selected to coincide with flowering and 253 peak biomass of the dominant vegetation, *Molinia caerulea*. All green material in a 0.2 x 254 0.2 m area near the CO<sub>2</sub> collars (different location each year) was collected and oven 255 dried at 78°C to constant mass.

256

## 2.5.2 Vegetation Seasonal Development

Proxies for vegetation seasonal development were derived from Moderate Resolution
Imaging Spectoradiometer (MODIS). MOD15A2 fPAR (1000 x 1000 m resolution) and
MODIS9A1 surface reflectance (500 x 500 m resolution) were downloaded from USGS
Earth Explorer (http://earthexplorer.usgs.gov). The normalised difference vegetation
index was derived from bands 1 (Red) and 2 (near infra-red) of the surface reflectance
where NDVI = (Band 2 - Band 1) / (band 2 + Band 1).

Data were screened and poor-quality data (cloudy, high aerosol concentrations or poor geometry) given a weighting of 0 and all other data a weighting of 1. To minimise variation due to atmospheric conditions, illumination and observation geometry a third order Fourier smoothing filter was applied. Points outside the 99 % confidence interval were excluded. All remaining points (30 in 2013 and 23 in 2014) were then weighted equally and a Fourier third order series fitted to form a continuous daily timeseries (Gatis et al. 2017).

# 269 2.6 SEASONAL NET CO<sub>2</sub> ECOSYSTEM EXCHANGE ESTIMATION

270 Seasonal NEE was modelled directly rather than modelling photosynthesis and 271 ecosystem respiration separately and then combining them. Modelling the components 272 separately requires the derivation of gross photosynthesis for each measurement based 273 on the assumption that the full dark measurement represents ecosystem respiration. This 274 adds additional uncertainty. As the closed chamber method measures NEE it was 275 decided to work with these data directly. Given the binary nature of the system, NEE was 276 parameterised for peat pans (n=398) and vegetated haggs (n=423) separately, using all 277 the quality controlled closed chamber measurements collected at a range of light levels.

Linear, exponential, Arrhenius, Lloyd-Taylor and tolerance relationships were tested using combinations of NDVI, soil temperature at a range of depths and water table depths. The models selected had the greatest coefficient of regression, smallest root mean square errors and were the most parsimonious.

The NEE model for the vegetated haggs (Equation 4) had two components, the first is dependent on NDVI and the second shows an Arrhenius relationship with soil temperature at 15 cm, the soil depth with the greatest correlation with ecosystem respiration). Equation 4

286 
$$NEE = \frac{P_{max}.NDVI.PPFD}{K+I} + a.exp^{-b}/_{T_{15}}$$

The NEE model for the peat pan (Equation 5) is also made up of two components, the first is dependent on NDVI; the second is dependent on soil temperature at 15 cm depth and water table depth.

290 Equation 5

291 
$$NEE = \frac{P_{max}.NDVI.PPFD}{K+I} + c.exp^{d.T_{15}}.exp^{f.WTD}$$

292 Where NEE is the net CO<sub>2</sub> ecosystem exchange ( $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), P<sub>max</sub> is the rate of light 293 saturated photosynthesis ( $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup>s<sup>-1</sup>), NDVI the normalised difference vegetation index, 294 PPFD the incident PPFD ( $\mu$ mol Photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), k the half-saturation constant of 295 photosynthesis ( $\mu$ mol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), T<sub>15</sub> soil temperature at a depth of 15 cm, a, b, c, d 296 and f (dimensionless) are coefficients.

An hourly timeseries of PPFD was created by correlating episodic measurements taken concurrently with the flux measurements to global irradiation measured onsite (section 2.4). Water table depths and soil temperature measured every 15 minutes (section 2.4) were averaged to produce hourly timeseries. The growing season was defined as from the first three consecutive days with daily mean soil temperature > 10°C till the first three consecutive days with daily soil temperature < 10°C as this is the temperature at which root initiation and subsequent leaf growth occurs (Taylor et al. 2001).

Seasonal estimates were determined by the accumulation of hourly fluxes over the duration of the growing season. Model confidence intervals (95 %) were determined from the root mean squared error of modelled values compared to measured values. Input parameter uncertainty was accounted for by using lower and upper 95 percentile values in the model. These two sources of uncertainty were summed together for each hour over the duration of the growing season. By convention  $CO_2$  fluxes are reported relative to the atmospheric pool so the peatland is a net  $CO_2$  source if positive.

311 2.7 STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

To assess temporal and spatial variation in water table depth and soil temperature, a twoway repeated measures ANOVA was carried out with time as the within subject factor and landscape component (hagg or peat pan) as the between subject factor. To investigate potential temporal controls on  $CO_2$  fluxes, stepwise linear regressions were carried out on photosynthesis at a PPFD of 1000 µmol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (P<sub>G1000</sub>), ecosystem respiration (R<sub>Eco</sub>) and total, heterotrophic and autotrophic below-ground respiration as measured and natural log-transformed. The temporal variables tested were water table depth, soil
temperature at 5, 10, 15, 20, 25 and 30 cm, fPAR, NDVI, total PPFD in the preceding day
and hour, total rainfall on the day of measurement (Rain0) and preceding 1,7,14 and 28
days. Exponential, Arrhenius and Lloyd-Taylor relationships between below-ground
respiration and soil temperature at 5, 10, 15 20, 25 and 30 cm were also tested.

# 323 **3 RESULTS**

# 324 3.1 WATER TABLE DEPTH

325 Water tables were on average deeper and less variable in the vegetated haggs; mean of 326  $9.1 \pm 5.4$  cm and varying from 28 cm below to 1 cm above ground level compared to a 327 mean of  $7.1 \pm 10.1$  cm and varying between 23 cm below to 21 cm above ground level in 328 the peat pans (



330 Figure 3). During the 2013 growing season water table depths fell to a maximum low in 331 July then rose again until late October 2013. Water table depths were generally higher in 332 2014 reaching a maximum in early June and a minimum in early July. Water tables 333 dropped below the ground surface at all plots within the peat pans in July 2013. However, 334 plots 5 and 6, which were located at a lower elevation than the other plots, had greater 335 standing water depth and were more often saturated than the other bare peat plots. Water 336 table depth varied significantly with time (two-way ANOVA p<0.001) and between haggs 337 and pans (p=0.004).

338

# **3.2 VEGETATION COMPOSITION**

Molinia caerulea was present in all vegetated NEE collars (8 to 50 % coverage) and was the dominant vegetation in 5 out of 6 collars covering 20-50 %. In vegetated collar 6 *Narthecium ossifragum* was the most common species (50 %). *Erica tetralix* was the only other species present in all collars (3 to 20 % coverage). In the peat pans either *Eriophorum angustifolim* and/or *Sphagnum denticulatum* was present. A full species list is provided in the supplementary material (Table 1). Shannon Diversity index, Inverse



347 Figure 4a, b & c). This is due to the presence of herbs, grasses and mosses in the 348 vegetated haggs but not the in peat pans (



Figure 4f, g & i). Although there was some vegetation present in all collars, bare ground and standing water were present in the peat pans but not the vegetated haggs (



Figure 4k & I). Ellenberg's Moisture indicator values denoted the vegetated haggs were damp and the peat pans wet and often water saturated as observed. In the vegetated haggs above-ground annual net primary productivity (ANPP) was not significantly different between 2013 (217  $\pm$ 39 g m<sup>-2</sup>) and 2014 (214  $\pm$ 23 g m<sup>-2</sup>). ANPP was not assessed for the peat pans.

# 358 3.3 SEASONAL CO<sub>2</sub> FLUXES

359 Photosynthesis at a PPFD equivalent to 1000  $\mu$ mol Photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (P<sub>G1000</sub>) and ecosystem



361

362 Figure 5) in the vegetated haggs, with  $R_{Eco}$  and photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake ( $P_{G1000}$ ) increasing through late spring into summer. The greatest R<sub>Eco</sub> was recorded in July 2014 363 364 (3.6±0.9 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) whilst the greatest photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake was measured in September 2013 (-6.1±2.2 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>). Photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake peaked towards the 365 366 end of the growing season (August and September) whilst R<sub>Eco</sub> peaked in mid-summer 367 (July) reflecting seasonal temperature variation.

368

369

vegetated

In the peat pans R<sub>Eco</sub> and photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake (P<sub>G1000</sub>) were lower than in the haggs



370

(

- Figure 5) except in July 2013 when there was a notable increase coinciding with low water
- 372 tables



(

- 374 Figure 3). Neither  $P_{G1000}$  nor  $R_{Eco}$  showed a clear seasonal pattern.
- 375 Total and heterotrophic below-ground respiration in the vegetated haggs showed similar
- 376 seasonal patterns generally rising from mid-May to late-August then decreasing to late-
- 377 October in 2013 and rising from mid-April to mid-August in 2014 (



380 Figure 6). There was noticeably greater respiration in July 2013 when the soil temperature 381 was greatest (17.6 °C), corresponding to the spike in photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake and 382 ecosystem respiration observed the in peat pans ( b С d 8 6 5 4 3 2 1 0 10 а 10 Shannon Diversity Species Richness Simpson Diversity 9.5 8 Т Ellenberg's 9 6 I 8.5 4 8 þ ட 2 7.5 ∟ 0 7 ΡP ΡP ΡΡ VH ΡP VH VH VH f h е 60 50 60 60 g 50 50 50 Leaf Litter (%) 40 (%) 40 30 20 Sedge (%) 40 30 Grass (%) 40 30 30 20 20 20 10 10 10 10 T Ι þ 0 0 0 0 VH ΡΡ VH ΡР VH ΡΡ VH ΡΡ i 100 120 k 120 100 I j 30 Standing Water (%) Brown Mosses (%) Bare Ground (%) 100 Sphagnum (%) 80 80 80 20 60 60 60 40 40 40 10 20 20 20 0 0 0 0 ΡP ΡP ΡP VH ΡР VH VH VH 383

Figure **5**c). Heterotrophic respiration was greater than autotrophic respiration except during October 2013 and July and August 2014. The proportional contribution of autotrophic respiration to total soil respiration varied between 1 and 66 % with the lowest contributions occurring in May 2013 and April 2014 and greater contributions later in the growing season. During the growing season autotrophic contributed on average 42 %.

# 389 3.4 TEMPORAL CONTROLS ON CO<sub>2</sub> FLUXES

Ecosystem respiration and photosynthesis showed no significant relationships with water table depth in the vegetated haggs (p>0.57) however, in the peat pans ecosystem respiration and photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake significantly increased when the water table fell (Table 1). This relationship was strongly driven by the high CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes (





Figure 3). In the vegetated haggs photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake showed the strongest relationship with NDVI (Table 1), increasing when NDVI increased. Ecosystem respiration showed a significant exponential relationship with soil temperature at a depth of 15 cm (Table 1). Additional variables did not increase the coefficient of regression for photosynthesis or ecosystem respiration in the vegetated haggs or peat pans.

402 Of the soil temperature depths measured, total and heterotrophic below-ground 403 respiration showed the strongest regression coefficients with an exponential function 404 dependent on soil temperature at a depth of 5 cm (Figure 7a & b) with respiration 405 increasing as temperature increased. Autotrophic respiration, although significantly 406 related to soil temperature at 5 cm (Figure 7c), showed the strongest exponential 407 relationship with soil temperature at 30 cm (Table 1, Figure 7e). Multiple regression 408 analysis indicated that water table depth was a stronger factor than soil temperature in 409 controlling heterotrophic respiration (Table 1). Adding total rainfall on the preceding day 410 increased the proportion of variability explained by 8 %. Total and autotrophic below-411 ground respiration were also significantly related to water table depth (Figure 7a & e) with 412 higher respiration rates during dry conditions but their relationships with soil temperature 413 were dominant (Table 1).

## 414 **3.5 SEASONAL NET CO2 ECOSYSTEM EXCHANGE ESTIMATION**

The model for the vegetated haggs (Equation 4, Table 2), based on all the  $CO_2$  flux measurements collected explained a greater proportion of the variability (76 %) than the model (Equation 5, Table 2) for the peat pans (67 %) however, it also had greater root mean square errors (Table 2). It can be seen that the model errors (Table 2) are large when compared to  $P_{G1000}$  and  $R_{Eco}$  (Figure 5) resulting in great uncertainty in the seasonal estimates (Table 3). It is estimated that it is most likely both the vegetated haggs and the peat pans were net  $CO_2$  sources over the 2013 and 2014 growing seasons (Table 3).

# 422 4 DISCUSSION

# 423 4.1 HAGGS AND PANS: A BINARY SYSTEM

# 424 **4.1.1 Water Table Depths and Vegetation Composition**

Average water table depth in the vegetated haggs (9.1±0.4 cm) was shallower than those 425 426 reported for inter-gully areas (23.4±8 cm) (McNamara et al. 2008) and upslope of drainage ditches (19.8±0.38 cm) (Coulson et al. 1990) in Calluna vulgaris dominated British blanket 427 428 bogs. In addition, peat pans were frequently inundated (



430 Figure 3) suggesting these peat pans function differently to both gullies (McNamara et al. 431 2008; Dixon et al. 2013) and drainage ditches (Cooper et al. 2014) where the water table 432 is more commonly below ground level except during storm events. It is likely the shallow 433 topographic gradients and poor connectivity between peat pans (Figure 1C) resulted in 434 less water table drawdown in the peat pans when compared to both erosional gullies and 435 drainage ditches (Parry et al. 2014). Despite this, hydrological monitoring at this site has 436 shown that in the vegetated haggs the water table drops lower adjacent to the peat pans 437 than further away (Luscombe, pers. comm. 2018). Sphagnum cover was <20 % in the vegetated haggs whilst cover of grasses and herbs reached 53 and 50 % respectively ( 438



Figure 4f, g & j) further indicating the deterioration of ecohydrological function in the vegetated haggs.



Figure **4**). This could be because active erosion (Foulds and Warburton 2007) removed peat preventing a continuous vegetation cover from developing (Ingram 1967). In addition, intermittent dry conditions (



Figure 3) may have made re-colonisation impossible for Sphagnum species (Price and 448 449 Whitehead 2001). Eriophorum vaginatum has been shown to recolonise gullies starting 450 from zones of redeposited peat (Crowe et al. 2008) and facilitate recolonization by other 451 species (Tuittila et al. 2000). On Dartmoor, in nearby areas where lower connectivity has 452 limited erosion and maintained more stable water tables, dense areas of Eriophorum 453 angustifolim have formed. This suggests that if erosion could be halted and water tables 454 stabilised then vegetation would be expected to recolonise these sparsely vegetated 455 areas.

# 456 4.1.2 CO<sub>2</sub> Fluxes

458

457 Photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake and ecosystem respiration were lower in the peat pans than



459

Figure **5**) even allowing for a 0.2  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> uncertainty due to different CO<sub>2</sub> chambers (15.7 I compared to 2.4 I) and analysers (Li-8100 compared to EGM-4) (section 2.2). This difference was most likely driven by significant variation in vegetation diversity, species

cover

(



464



467 Figure 3).

Summer mean P<sub>G1000</sub> (-1.0 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) from the peat pans was similar to an *Eriophorum* 468 469 spp., Vaccinium myrtillus and bare peat naturally revegetating gully (-1.1 to -1.6 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Clay et al. 2012; Dixon et al. 2015) but photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake 470 was less than a rewet cut-away *Eriophorum spp.* dominated peatland (-2.3 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) 471 472 (Wilson et al. 2016) and much less than a rewet cut-away Eriophorum spp. tussock (-15.5 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Tuittila et al. 1999). Given these annual results include large periods 473 474 with PPFD levels below saturation it can be seen that these peat pans have low primary productivity even when compared to other damaged peatlands. 475

There was a notable spike in R<sub>Eco</sub> in late July 2013 (2.1 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Figure 5) coincident 476 477 with warmer and drier conditions (Figure 3). Although notably higher than other values 478 recorded in this study, it is approximately half that reported for *Eriophorum vaginatum* in 479 a naturally revegetated erosional gully (4.1 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (McNamara et al. 2008) under 480 similar water table and temperature conditions. Growing season mean ecosystem respiration from the peat pans (0.5 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) was greater than annual (0.2 to 481 482 0.4 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Clay et al. 2012; Wilson et al. 2013; Dixon et al. 2015) and summer (0.04 483 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Tuittila et al. 1999) R<sub>Eco</sub> rates for bare peat most likely due to some, albeit 484 sparse, vegetation cover. However, compared to annual mean R<sub>Eco</sub> for an *Eriophorum* spp. and bare peat channel floor (0.6 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Clay et al. 2012) and Eriophorum spp. 485 and Sphagnum spp. rewet cut-away peat (0.5 m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Wilson et al. 2016) the summer 486 mean R<sub>Eco</sub> from the peat pans seems low. Again this probably reflects variation in 487 vegetation cover and low primary productivity rather than differences in water tables 488 directly, as the rewet peatland was wetter (-9.5 to -15.5 cm) (Wilson et al. 2016) than this 489 490 study and the natural channel (13.9 cm) (Clay et al. 2012) drier.

491 Maximum  $R_{Eco}$  in the vegetated haggs (3.6 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) was similar to August  $R_{Eco}$  from 492 Moor House, a *Calluna vulgaris, Eriophorum vaginatum* and *Sphagnum spp.* upland

- 493 blanket bog, (3.3 to 3.4  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Hardie et al. 2009; Lloyd 2010). Summer mean
- 494  $R_{Eco}$  (2.4 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) was smaller than for a *Vaccinium spp., Eriophorum vaginatum,*
- 495 *Molinia caerulea* and *Calluna vulgaris* upland bog (3.1 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Urbanová et al. 2012)
- 496 however, the mean water table was deeper in this drained bog (19.5 cm).
- 497 Heterotrophic respiration rates (



500 Figure 6) were generally lower on Dartmoor (mean and maximum of 0.8 and 2.7 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) compared to those from August and September at Moor House (1.0 to 501 1.7  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (Hardie et al. 2009; Heinemeyer et al. 2011). This is surprising given the 502 503 difference in water table depths; 0 to 8 cm at Moor House (Hardie et al. 2009) compared 504 to -1 to 28 cm in this study. It is possible variation in leaf litter quality (Ward et al. 2010) and quantity affected heterotrophic respiration rates. However, as the two studies at Moor 505 506 House were based on only four sample events there is insufficient data to fully understand 507 these differences.

508 Clipping and trenching severs roots which decompose leading to an overestimation of 509 heterotrophic respiration (Kuzyakov and Larionova 2005; Subke et al. 2006) and therefore 510 an underestimation of autotrophic respiration. Collars were installed 2 months prior to the 511 start of sampling to reduce disturbance effects and the data do not show a systematic 512 decrease in the proportion of heterotrophic respiration over time (Figure 6) suggesting the 513 effects were minimal.

Summer mean  $P_{G1000}$  (3.8 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) in the vegetated haggs was similar to summer 514 515 mean photosynthesis for a Vaccinium spp., Eriophorum vaginatum, Molinia caerulea and 516 Calluna vulgaris upland bog (-4.2 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Urbanová et al. 2012), however this 517 includes periods with lower PPFD so it is difficult to compare these values. Maximum 518 photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake ( $P_{G1000}$ ) (-6.1 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) in this study was greater than 519 maximum potential photosynthesis (P<sub>max</sub>) from Calluna vulgaris, Erica tetralix, Molinia caerulea and Sphagnum spp. hummocks in Irish blanket bog (-4.2 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Laine et 520 al. 2006) but less than those reported for a Calluna vulgaris, Eriophorum vaginatum and 521 Sphagnum spp. upland blanket bog (Moorhouse (-16.3 to -16.9 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) (Lloyd 2010). 522 523 The bogs in these studies had similar vegetation to this study (Molinia caerulea, Erica 524 Tetralix, Eriophorum angustifolium, Calluna vulgaris) but given the sensitivity of photosynthesis to vegetation composition it is likely much of this variation is due to 525 526 differences in the vegetation community present. However, above-ground annual net primary productivity was greater at Moor House, (approximately 300 g m<sup>-2</sup>) (Ward et al.
2007) than Dartmoor (214±23 g m<sup>-2</sup> in 2014) so the greater rates of photosynthesis may
also in part be due to greater biomass, reflecting more optimum growing conditions.

530 The summer maximum photosynthetic  $CO_2$  uptake ( $P_{G1000}$ ) and  $R_{Eco}$  measured in this 531 study (



Figure 5a & b) were lower than those found on Exmoor (-23.1 and 10.9 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> 533 534 respectively) (Gatis 2015), an upland also located within the south west of England. On 535 Exmoor Molinia caerulea is more dominant and grows taller (up to 60 cm) than on 536 Dartmoor (up to 20 cm). This is reflected in greater above-ground annual net primary productivity (ANPP); 517±30 g m<sup>-2</sup> on Exmoor. A greater quantity of leaf litter resulting 537 538 from greater ANPP may also explain the higher rates of heterotrophic respiration on 539 Exmoor  $(1.5 \pm 0.1 \mu \text{mol m}^2 \text{ s}^{-1})$  (Gatis 2015) where peat thickness is shallower (<0.56 m). 540 As high rates of photosynthesis have been found to increase autotrophic respiration 541 (Subke et al. 2006) the difference in photosynthetic rates observed between these moors 542 may explain the lower average autotrophic respiration rates from Dartmoor (



545 Figure **6**) than Exmoor  $(1.3 \pm 0.2 \mu \text{mol m}^2 \text{ s}^{-1})$ . No other values for autotrophic respiration 546 could be found for comparison in this region, reflecting the large uncertainty in measuring 547 autotrophic respiration (Subke et al. 2006).

# 548 4.2 DRIVERS OF TEMPORAL VARIATION IN CO<sub>2</sub> FLUXES

549 In the vegetated haggs and peat pans, photosynthetic uptake at 1000 µmol Photons m<sup>-</sup> 550 <sup>2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> became significantly greater during periods of higher NDVI (Table 1). Photosynthesis 551 has been related to vegetation seasonal development measured by NDVI in northern 552 peatlands (up to 71 % of variation explained) (Kross et al. 2013), NDVI in alpine 553 grasslands (71 % of variation explained) (Rossini et al. 2012), leaf area (Nieveen et al. 1998; Street et al. 2007; Otieno et al. 2009), vegetative green area (Riutta et al. 2007; 554 555 Urbanová et al. 2012) and leaf biomass (Bubier et al. 2003). In the peat pans P<sub>G1000</sub> showed no significant relationship with NDVI most likely due to the minimal vegetation 556 557 cover.

558 In the peat pans, both ecosystem respiration and  $P_{G1000}$  (Table 1) showed the strongest 559 relationships with water table depth. Photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake increased in the peat 560 pans during dry periods (Table 1). Although Eriophorum angustifolium is a wetland 561 species, evolved to live in waterlogged conditions, vegetation often close stomata in 562 response to raised water tables, limiting gases exchange through the leaf surface 563 (Pezeshki 2001). Photosynthetic uptake from *Eriophorum vaginatum* plots has been found to increase as water levels fall from 16.8 cm to a maximum at 14.6 cm below ground 564 565 surface (Riutta et al. 2007). Where Eriophorum spp. plots were submerged following re-566 wetting of a cut-over peatland, vegetation cover initially decreased before increasing in 567 the second year following re-wetting (Tuittila et al. 1999) suggesting Eriophorum spp. can 568 adapt to submerged conditions but not instantaneously.

569 Water table depth has commonly been found to influence ecosystem respiration (Tuittila 570 et al. 1999; Laine et al. 2006, 2007; Riutta et al. 2007; Wilson et al. 2007, 2013; Soini et al. 2010) with greater respiration occurring during drier conditions. Lowering the water
table increases the depth to which oxygen can diffuse, thus enabling more rapid aerobic
heterotrophic respiration to occur (Clymo 1983; Moore and Dalva 1993). In addition,
greater rates of photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake and consequently autotrophic respiration also
occurred during periods with lower water tables.

576 Total, heterotrophic and autotrophic below-ground respiration all showed significant 577 exponential increase with soil temperature at 5 cm (Figure 7a, b & c). Soil temperature 578 measurements from shallower depths have been shown to be better predictors of respiration (Lafleur et al. 2005; Lloyd 2010) especially when the proportion of autotrophic 579 580 respiration is greater, although autotrophic respiration showed the strongest exponential 581 relationship with soil temperature at 30 cm; the deepest depth measured in this study 582 (Table 1). Perhaps reflecting a mix of autotrophic and heterotrophic sources, ecosystem 583 respiration showed the strongest exponential relationship with soil temperature at 15 cm. 584 This is similar to the depth found by Updegraff *et al.* (2001) but deeper than other studies 585 which found air temperature (Schneider et al. 2012); an average of air temperature and 586 soil temperature at 20 cm (Laine et al. 2006); soil temperature at 5 cm (Bubier et al. 2003; 587 Lund et al. 2007; Wilson et al. 2007) and 10 cm (Blodau et al. 2007; Otieno et al. 2009; 588 Lloyd 2010) to have the strongest relationships.

589 Soil temperature and water table depths commonly co-vary and interact to amplify effects 590 on below-ground respiration. For example, warm and dry conditions are often concurrent, with both conditions increasing rates of below-ground respiration (Figure 7). Water table 591 592 depths did show a significant relationship with total, heterotrophic and autotrophic soil 593 respiration (Figure 7) indicating respiration increased during periods of lower water tables. 594 However, multiple regressions indicated that soil temperature was the primary control on 595 below-ground autotrophic and total soil respiration suggesting the apparent relationship 596 with water table depth may have been due to co-variation of water table depths and soil 597 temperature.

598 Water table depth was the strongest control on heterotrophic respiration possibly due to 599 increased aerobic heterotrophic respiration (Clymo 1983; Moore and Dalva 1993) and 600 enhanced gas diffusion through oxygenated peat (Blodau and Moore 2003). Although 601 below-ground respiration varied with water table, ecosystem respiration did not (Table 1) 602 possibly due to different drivers affecting the multiple respiration sources that contribute 603 This is consistent with other studies that have found to ecosystem respiration. 604 temperature to be the main control on ecosystem respiration under wet conditions 605 (Updegraff et al. 2001; Bubier et al. 2003) and within Molinia caerulea dominated systems 606 (Nieveen et al. 1998) but in contrast to studies that found water level to have the strongest 607 control over respiration (Silvola et al. 1996) or a small but significant effect (Lafleur et al. 608 2005; Otieno et al. 2009).

# 609 4.3 SEASONAL NET CO<sub>2</sub> ECOSYSTEM EXCHANGE

610 Given the sparse vegetation cover (Figure 4) it was unsurprising that the peat pans were 611 gaseous CO<sub>2</sub> (Table 3) as well as aquatic carbon sources (Malone, pers. comm. 2018) 612 over the growing season. NEE fluxes (0.1 gCO<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>) were lower than those observed for bare Canadian cut-over peat (0.6 to 2.1 gCO<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>) (Waddington et al. 2010) and 613 614 Eriophorum spp. tussock and inter-tussock plots in a Finnish cut-over peatland (0.3 to 1.2 615 gCO<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>) (Tuittila et al. 1999). This might be due to the limited vegetation cover as a 616 closed *Eriophorum spp.* cover has been found to be a smaller net CO<sub>2</sub> source (or even a 617 net CO<sub>2</sub> sink) compared to a non-vegetated surface under the same environmental 618 conditions (Tuittila et al. 1999).

619 It was unexpected that the vegetated plots were a greater net  $CO_2$  source over the growing 620 season (Table 3) given the greater vegetation cover (Figure 4). However, Hardie et al. 621 (2009) found 37-35 % of summer ecosystem respiration flux to be from soil ( $R_{BG-ToT}$ ) 622 suggesting 63-66 % was from the vegetation so although the vegetated haggs had greater 623 photosynthesis much of this would be rapidly re-released. In addition, root exudates add fresh organic matter to the subsurface stimulating microbes to decompose more recalcitrant peat (Fontaine et al. 2007). This would be enhanced by deeper water table depths in the vegetated haggs (Figure 3) allowing oxygen to penetrate deeper into the peat resulting in increased decomposition (Silvola et al. 1996).

628 Other studies in a range of peatlands have also reported vegetated plots to be growing 629 season net CO<sub>2</sub> sources (Tuittila et al. 1999; Waddington et al. 2010; Urbanová et al. 630 2012; Strack and Zuback 2013). During measurements all sites were net CO<sub>2</sub> sinks, 631 however, these were collected during bright, daytime conditions. It should be noted that 632 this model assumes the dependency of ecosystem respiration on temperature is the same 633 in the day and night. Daily variation in autotrophic respiration (and primed heterotrophic 634 respiration) has been shown to result in significant differences between day and night  $R_{Eco}$ 635 at the same temperatures (Juszczak et al. 2012; Wohlfahrt and Galvagno 2017). 636 Therefore, it is most likely ecosystem respiration is overestimated by this model. In 637 addition, shade cloths underestimate photosynthesis at low light levels compared to 638 naturally low light conditions and a lack of temperature control within the chamber may 639 have resulted in plant stress also underestimating photosynthesis. Consequently, this 640 experimental design is biased towards overestimating CO<sub>2</sub> release.

641 The models explained 76 % of the variability in observed NEE in the vegetated haggs and 642 67 % in the peat pans (Table 2) however, the root mean square errors are large in 643 comparison to P<sub>G1000</sub> and R<sub>Eco</sub> fluxes observed (Figure 5). This has resulted in 644 uncertainties many times larger than seasonal NEE estimates (Table 3). This uncertainty consists of both natural variability which is known to be significant when using multiple 645 646 plots (Laine et al. 2009) and uncertainty associated with modelling. It has been shown 647 that different treatment of closed chamber data can result in variation in estimated NEE of 648 0.25 gCO<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> over annual estimates (Huth et al. 2017) sufficient to change the 649 estimate of ecosystem exchange from a net CO<sub>2</sub> source to a net CO<sub>2</sub> sink. Accepting this

650 uncertainty, the models suggest both landscape components are losing carbon with651 greater loss from the haggs even with a greater vegetation cover.

Given, that in this study, NEE was modelled for the growing season only, when the majority of carbon uptake occurs, Dartmoor would be expected to be a larger source over the whole year. This suggests peat pan formation and expansion has altered the ecohydrological functioning of the whole mire not just the eroded pan areas, altering the balance of  $CO_2$  uptake and release towards carbon loss. Ecohydrological restoration is required to prevent further carbon loss and promote a return to carbon sequestration.

658 In the UK restoration schemes have blocked erosional gullies using a combination of 659 materials (peat, wood, stone, plastic piling and heather bales) to slow water flow, trap 660 sediment and raise local water tables (Parry et al. 2014). This would be expected to halt 661 the expansion of the peat pans and encourage peat deposition behind dams which should 662 provide zones for colonisation by pioneering species such as *Eriophorum spp.* (Crowe et 663 al. 2008) which may facilitate recolonization by other species (Tuittila et al. 2000). In rewet 664 cut-away peatlands high and stable water tables have been found to rapidly increase 665 Eriophorum spp. cover but also shift Eriophorum spp. dominated plots towards growing 666 season net CO<sub>2</sub> sinks (Tuittila et al. 1999; Waddington et al. 2010). In the vegetated haggs 667 the response would be expected to vary with vegetation type (Komulainen et al. 1999) 668 with raised water tables reducing respiration but also possibly photosynthesis. It should 669 be noted that this study has focused on CO<sub>2</sub>, raising water tables has been shown to increase the release of CH<sub>4</sub> particularly in areas of open water (Best and Jacobs 1997; 670 671 Komulainen et al. 1998; Strack and Zuback 2013; Cooper et al. 2014; Wilson et al. 2016). 672 However, in the longer-term, higher and more stable water tables might alter the 673 vegetation present towards those associated with wetter conditions (Bellamy et al. 2012) 674 and carbon sequestration.

### 675 **5 CONCLUSION**

This study aimed to investigate the spatial and temporal controls on CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes in a climatically marginal, eroding blanket bog and to quantify CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes from these landscape components. Understanding the effects of existing damage and the potential effects of restoration should enable more informed management choices to be made.

680 The water table was significantly higher in the peat pans than in the vegetated haggs 681 resulting in clear differences in vegetation composition and productivity which lead to 682 significant differences in photosynthesis and ecosystem respiration between these 683 landscape components. CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes in the peat pans were dominated by changes in water 684 table depths whilst photosynthesis in the drier vegetated haggs was related to normalised 685 difference vegetation index (a proxy for vegetation seasonal development). Although 686 ecosystem respiration was strongly related to temperature, heterotrophic below-ground 687 respiration significantly decreased as water tables rose suggesting higher, more stable 688 water tables may reduce the peat being respired. An empirically derived net CO<sub>2</sub> 689 ecosystem exchange model suggests that over the growing seasons studied the drier 690 vegetated haggs were a greater net CO<sub>2</sub> source than the peat pans despite greater 691 vegetation cover.

Peat pan formation and expansion has affected the ecohydrological functioning of the
whole mire not just the eroded pan areas. This demonstrates the need to limit the spread
of bare peat pans to protect the biodiversity of the mire, prevent further loss of stored
carbon and promote a return to carbon sequestration.

# 696 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The authors would like to thank the members of the Dartmoor Peatland Partnership for
their help. This research received financial support from South West Water Ltd, The
University of Exeter (SK05284 & SK04809) and the Knowledge Transfer Partnership

- 700 programme (KTP 8099). This KTP was funded by the Technology Strategy Board and
- 701 the Natural Environment Research Council.

# 702 DATA ACCESS

- The research data supporting this publication are openly available from the University of
- Exeter's institutional repository at: https://doi.org/10.24378/exe.1143.

### 705 **References**

- Bellamy PE, Stephen L, Maclean IS, Grant MC (2012) Response of blanket bog vegetation to
   drain-blocking. Appl Veg Sci 15:129–135. doi: 10.1111/j.1654-109X.2011.01151
- Best EPH, Jacobs FHH (1997) The influence of raised water table levels on carbon dioxide
   and methane production in ditch-dissected peat grasslands in the Netherlands. Ecol Eng
   8:129–144. doi: 10.1016/S0925-8574(97)00260-7
- Blodau C, Moore TR (2003) Experimental response of peatland carbon dynamics to a water
  table fluctuation. Aquat Sci Res Across Boundaries 65:47–62. doi:
  10.1007/s000270300004
- Blodau C, Roulet NT, Heitmann T, et al (2007) Belowground carbon turnover in a temperate
   ombrotrophic bog. Glob Biogeochem Cycles 21:GB1021. doi: 10.1029/2005gb002659
- Bonnett SAF, Ross S, Linstead C, Maltby E (2009) A review of techniques for monitoring the
   success of peatland restoration. Technical Report. Natural England, SWIM- MER. Bristol
- Bragg OM, Tallis JH (2001) The sensitivity of peat-covered upland landscapes. Catena
   42:345–360. doi: 10.1016/S0341-8162(00)00146-6
- Bubier JL, Bhatia G, Moore TR, et al (2003) Spatial and temporal variability in growing-season
   net ecosystem carbon dioxide exchange at a large peatland in Ontario, Canada.
   Ecosystems 6:353–367. doi: 10.1007/s10021-003-0125-0
- Clark JM, Gallego-Sala A V., Allott TEH, et al (2010) Assessing the vulnerability of blanket
   peat to climate change using an ensemble of statistical bioclimatic envelope models. Clim
   Res 45:131-U462. doi: 10.3354/cr00929
- Clay GD, Dixon S, Evans MG, et al (2012) Carbon dioxide fluxes and DOC concentrations of
   eroding blanket peat gullies. Earth Surf Process Landforms 37:562–571. doi:
   10.1002/esp.3193
- Clymo RS (1983) Peat. In: Gore AJP (ed) Mires, Swamp, Fen and Moor. General Studies.
   Ecosystems of the World 4a. Elsevier Scientific, Amsterdam, pp 159–224

Cooper MDA, Evans CD, Zielinski P, et al (2014) Infilled ditches are hotspots of landscape
methane flux following peatland re-wetting. Ecosystems 17:1227–1241. doi:
10.1007/s10021-014-9791-3

- Coulson JC, Butterfield J (1978) An investigation of the biotic factors determining the rates of
   plant decomposition on blanket bog. J Ecol 66:631–650. doi: 10.2307/2259155
- Coulson JC, Butterfield JEL, Henderson E (1990) The effect of open drainage ditches on the
   plant and invertebrate communities of moorland and on the decomposition of peat. J Appl
   Ecol 27:549–561. doi: 10.2307/2404301
- Crowe SK, Evans MG, Allott TEH (2008) Geomorphological controls on the re-vegetation of
   erosion gullies in blanket peat: implications for bog restoration. Mires Peat 3:
- Daniels SM, Agnew CT, Allott TEH, Evans MG (2008) Water table variability and runoff
   generation in an eroded peatland, South Pennines, UK. J Hydrol 361:214–226. doi:
   10.1016/J.JHYDROL.2008.07.042
- Dixon SD, Qassim SM, Rowson JG, et al (2013) Restoration effects on water table depths and
   CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes from climatically marginal blanket bog. Biogeochemistry 118:1–18. doi:
   10.1007/s10533-013-9915-4
- Dixon SD, Worrall F, Rowson JG, Evans MG (2015) *Calluna vulgaris* canopy height and
   blanket peat CO<sub>2</sub> flux: implications for management. Ecol Eng 75:497–505. doi:
   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2014.11.047
- Evans MG, Burt TP, Holden J, Adamson JK (1999) Runoff generation and water table
   fluctuations in blanket peat: evidence from UK data spanning the dry summer of 1995. J
   Hydrol 221:141–160. doi: 10.1016/S0022-1694(99)00085-2
- Evans MG, Warburton J, Yang J (2006) Eroding blanket peat catchments: Global and local
   implications of upland organic sediment budgets. Geomorphology 79:45–57. doi:
   10.1016/J.GEOMORPH.2005.09.015
- Fontaine SS, Barot SS, Barré P, et al (2007) Stability of organic carbon in deep soil layers
   controlled by fresh carbon supply. Nature 450:277–280. doi: 10.1038/nature06275
- Foulds SA, Warburton J (2007) Wind erosion of blanket peat during a short period of surface
   desiccation (North Pennines, Northern England). Earth Surf Process Landforms 32:481–
   488. doi: 10.1002/esp.1422
- Gatis N (2015) Determining the effects of peatland restoration on carbon dioxide exchange
   and potential for climate change mitigation. University of Exeter
- Gatis N, Anderson K, Grand-Clement E, et al (2017) Evaluating MODIS vegetation products
   using digital images for quantifying local peatland CO2 gas fluxes. Remote Sens Ecol
   Conserv 3:217–231. doi: 10.1002/rse2.45
- Gatis N, Luscombe DJ, Carless D, et al (2019) Mapping upland peat depth using airborne
   radiometric and LiDAR survey data. Geoderma 335:78–87
- Grand-Clement E, Anderson K, Smith D, et al (2013) Evaluating ecosystem goods and
   services after restoration of marginal upland peatlands in South-West England. J Appl
   Ecol 50:. doi: 10.1111/1365-2664.12039
- Hardie SML, Garnett MH, Fallick AE, et al (2009) Bomb-C<sup>14</sup> analysis of ecosystem respiration
   reveals that peatland vegetation facilitates release of old carbon. Geoderma 153:393–
   401. doi: 10.1016/j.geoderma.2009.09.002
- Heinemeyer A, Di Bene C, Lloyd AR, et al (2011) Soil respiration: implications of the plant-soil
   continuum and respiration chamber collar-insertion depth on measurement and
   modelling of soil CO<sub>2</sub> efflux rates in three ecosystems. Eur J Soil Sci 62:82–94. doi:

- 777 10.1111/j.1365-2389.2010.01331.x
- Hill MO, Mountford JO, Roy DB, Bunce RGH (1999) Factors controlling biodiversity in the
   British countryside (ECOFACT), Volume 2: Technical Annex Ellenberg's indicator
   values for British plants. Institute of Terrestrial Ecology, Huntingdon
- Holden J, Shotbolt L, Bonn A, et al (2007) Environmental change in moorland landscapes.
   Earth-Science Rev 82:75–100. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2007.01.003
- Holden J, Wallage ZE, Lane SN, McDonald AT (2011) Water table dynamics in undisturbed,
  drained and restored blanket peat. J Hydrol 402:103–114. doi:
  10.1016/j.jhydrol.2011.03.010
- Huth V, Vaidya S, Hoffmann M, et al (2017) Divergent NEE balances from manual-chamber
  CO2 fluxes linked to different measurement and gap-filling strategies: A source for
  uncertainty of estimated terrestrial C sources and sinks? Zeitschrift fur
  Pflanzenernahrung und Bodenkd 180:302–315. doi: 10.1002/jpln.201600493
- 790 Ingram HAP (1967) Problems of hydrology and plant distribution in mires. J Ecol 711–724
- Juszczak R, Acosta M, Olejnik J (2012) Comparison of daytime and nighttime ecosystem
   respiration measured by the closed chamber technique on a temperate mire in Poland.
   Polish J Environ Stud 21:643–658
- Komulainen V-M, Nykänen H, Martikainen PJ, Laine J (1998) Short-term effect of restoration
   on vegetation change and methane emissions from peatlands drained for forestry in
   southern Finland. Can J For Res 28:402–411
- Komulainen VM, Tuittila ES, Vasander H, Laine J (1999) Restoration of drained peatlands in
   southern Finland: initial effects on vegetation change and CO<sub>2</sub> balance. J Appl Ecol
   36:634–648. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2664.1999.00430.x
- Kross A, Seaquist JW, Roulet NT, et al (2013) Estimating carbon dioxide exchange rates at
   contrasting northern peatlands using MODIS satellite data. Remote Sens Environ
   137:234–243. doi: 10.1016/j.rse.2013.06.014
- Kuzyakov Y, Larionova AA (2005) Root and rhizomicrobial respiration: A review of approaches
   to estimate respiration by autotrophic and heterotrophic organisms in soil. J plant Nutr
   soil Sci 168:503–520. doi: 10.1002/jpln.200421703
- Lafleur PM, Moore TR, Roulet NT, Frolking S (2005) Ecosystem respiration in a cool
   temperate bog depends on peat temperature but not water table. Ecosystems 8:619–
   629. doi: 10.1007/s10021-003-0131-2
- Laine A, Byrne KA, Kiely G, Tuittila E-SS (2007) Patterns in vegetation and CO<sub>2</sub> dynamics
  along a water level gradient in a lowland blanket bog. Ecosystems 10:890–905. doi:
  10.1007/s10021-007-9067-2
- Laine A, Riutta T, Juutinen S, et al (2009) Acknowledging the spatial heterogeneity in modelling/reconstructing carbon dioxide exchange in a northern aapa mire. Ecol Modell
   220:2646–2655. doi: 10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2009.06.047
- Laine A, Sottocornola M, Kiely G, et al (2006) Estimating net ecosystem exchange in a patterned ecosystem: Example from blanket bog. Agric For Meteorol 138:231–243. doi: 10.1016/j.agrformet.2006.05.005
- Lindsay RA, Charman DJ, Everingham F, et al (1988) The flow country; the peatlands of Caithness and Sutherland. Nat Conserv Counc Peterbrgh 163. doi: 10.1016/0006-

- 820 3207(89)90043-8
- Lloyd AR (2010) Carbon fluxes at an upland blanket bog in the north Pennines. Durham University
- Lund M, Lindroth A, Christensen TR, et al (2007) Annual CO<sub>2</sub> balance of a temperate bog.
  Tellus B 59:804–811. doi: 10.1111/j.1600-0889.2007.00303.x
- McNamara NP, Plant T, Oakley S, et al (2008) Gully hotspot contribution to landscape
   methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) fluxes in a northern peatland. Sci Total Environ
   404:354–360. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2008.03.015
- Moore PD (1987) Ecological and hydrological aspects of peat formation. Geol Soc London,
   Spec Publ 32:7–15. doi: 10.1144/gsl.sp.1987.032.01.02
- Moore TR, Dalva M (1993) The influence of temperature and water table position on carbon
   dioxide and methane emissions from laboratory columns of peatland soils. J Soil Sci
   44:651–664. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2389.1993.tb02330.x
- Nieveen JP, Jacobs CMJ, Jacobs AFG (1998) Diurnal and seasonal variation of carbon
  dioxide exchange from a former true raised bog. Glob Chang Biol 4:823–833. doi:
  10.1046/j.1365-2486.1998.00189.x
- Otieno DO, Wartinger M, Nishiwaki A, et al (2009) Responses of CO<sub>2</sub> exchange and primary
   production of the ecosystem components to environmental changes in a mountain
   peatland. Ecosystems 12:590–603. doi: 10.1007/s10021-009-9245-5
- Parry LE, Charman DJ, Noades JPW (2012) A method for modelling peat depth in blanket
   peatlands. Soil Use Manag 28:614–624. doi: 10.1111/j.1475-2743.2012.00447.x
- Parry LE, Holden J, Chapman PJ (2014) Restoration of blanket peatlands. J Environ Manage
  133:193–205. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2013.11.033
- Pezeshki SR (2001) Wetland plant responses to soil flooding. Environ Exp Bot 46:299–312.
  doi: 10.1016/S0098-8472(01)00107-1
- Price JS, Whitehead GS (2001) Developing hydrologic thresholds for Sphagnum
  recolonization on an abandoned cutover bog. Wetlands 21:32–40. doi: 10.1672/02775212(2001)021[0032:DHTFSR]2.0.CO;2
- Riutta T, Laine J, Aurela M, et al (2007) Spatial variation in plant community functions
   regulates carbon gas dynamics in a boreal fen ecosystem. Tellus Ser B-Chemical Phys
   Meteorol 59:838–852. doi: 10.1111/j.1600-0889.2007.00302.x
- Rodwell JS (1991) British plant communities: mires and heaths, 2nd edn. Cambridge
   University Press, Cambridge
- Rossini M, Cogliati S, Meroni M, et al (2012) Remote sensing-based estimation of gross
   primary production in a subalpine grassland. Biogeosciences 9:2565–2584. doi:
   10.5194/bg-9-2565-2012
- Rowson JG, Worrall F, Evans MG (2013) Predicting soil respiration from peatlands. Sci Total
   Environ 442:397–404. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.10.021
- Schneider J, Kutzbach L, Wilmking M (2012) Carbon dioxide exchange fluxes of a boreal peatland over a complete growing season, Komi Republic, NW Russia. Biogeochemistry 111:485–513. doi: 10.1007/s10533-011-9684-x

- 861 Schuur EAG, Bockheim J, Canadell JG, et al (2008) Vulnerability of permafrost carbon to 862 climate change: Implications for the global carbon cycle. Bioscience 58:701–714
- Shannon CE (1948) A mathematical theory of communication. Bell Syst Tech J 27:379-423
   and 623-656
- Silvola J, Alm J, Ahlholm U, et al (1996) CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes from peat in boreal mires under varying
   temperature and moisture conditions. J Ecol 84:219–228. doi: 10.2307/2261357
- 867 Simpson EH (1949) Measurement of diversity. Nature
- Soini P, Riutta T, Yli-Petäys M, et al (2010) Comparison of vegetation and CO<sub>2</sub> dynamics
   between a restored cut-away peatland and a pristine fen: evaluation of the restoration
   success. Restor Ecol 18:894–903. doi: 10.1111/j.1526-100X.2009.00520.x
- 871 Stevenson AC, Jones VJ, Battarbee RW (1990) The cause of peat erosion: a 872 palaeolimnological approach. New Phytol 114:727–735
- Strack M, Zuback YCA (2013) Annual carbon balance of a peatland 10 yr following restoration.
  Biogeosciences 10:2885–2896. doi: 10.5194/bg-10-2885-2013
- Street LE, Shaver GR, Williams M, Van Wijk MT (2007) What is the relationship between
  changes in canopy leaf area and changes in photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> flux in arctic
  ecosystems? J Ecol 95:139–150. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2745.2006.01187.x
- Subke J-AA, Inglima I, Cotrufo MF (2006) Trends and methodological impacts in soil CO<sub>2</sub>
  efflux partitioning: A metaanalytical review. Glob Chang Biol 12:921–943. doi:
  10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006.01117.x
- Tallis JH (1997) The southern Pennine experience: an overview of blanket mire degradation.
  In: Tallis JH, Meade R, Hulme PD (eds) Blanket mire degradation-causes, consequences
  and challenges. Proceedings of a conference at University Of Manchester, 9-11 April,
  1979. The Macaulay Land Use Research Institute on behalf of the Mires Research
  Group., Aberdeen, pp 7–15
- Taylor K, Rowland AP, Jones HE (2001) *Molinia caerulea* (L.) Moench. J Ecol 89:126–144.
   doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2745.2001.00534.x
- Thormann MN, Szumigalski AR, Bayley SE (1999) Aboveground peat and carbon
   accumulation potentials along a bog-fen-marsh wetland gradient in southern boreal
   Alberta, Canada. Wetlands 19:305–317. doi: 10.1007/BF03161761
- Tuittila E, Rita H, Vasander H, Laine J (2000) Vegetation patterns around Eriophorum
   vaginatum L. tussocks in a cut-away peatland in southern Finland. Can J Bot 78:47–58.
   doi: 10.1139/b99-159
- Tuittila ES, Komulainen VM, Vasander H, Laine J (1999) Restored cut-away peatland as a sink for atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Oecologia 120:563–574. doi: 10.1007/s004420050891
- 896 UK Meteorological Office (2012) Meteorologial Office Integrated Data Archive System
   897 (MIDAS) land and marine surface stations data (1853-current).
   898 http://badc.nerc.ac.uk/view/badc.nerc.ac.uk\_ATOM\_dataent\_ukmo-midas
- Updegraff K, Bridgham SD, Pastor J, et al (2001) Response of CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from
   peatlands to warming and water table manipulation. Ecol Appl 11:311–326. doi:
   10.2307/3060891
- 902 Urbanová Z, Picek T, Hájek T, et al (2012) Vegetation and carbon gas dynamics under a

- 903 changed hydrological regime in central European peatlands. Plant Ecol Divers 5:89–103.
  904 doi: 10.1080/17550874.2012.688069
- Waddington JM, Strack M, Greenwood MJ (2010) Toward restoring the net carbon sink
   function of degraded peatlands: Short-term response in CO<sub>2</sub> exchange to ecosystem scale restoration. J Geophys Res Biogeosciences 115:G01008. doi:
   10.1029/2009jg001090
- Wallen B (1993) Methods for studying below-ground production in mire ecosystems. Suo
   43:155–162
- Ward SE, Bardgett RD, McNamara NP, et al (2007) Long-term consequences of grazing and
   burning on northern peatland carbon dynamics. Ecosystems 10:1069–1083. doi:
   10.1007/s10021-007-9080-5
- Ward SE, Ostle NJ, McNamara NP, Bardgett RD (2010) Litter evenness influences short-term
   peatland decomposition processes. Oecologia 164:511–520. doi: 10.1007/s00442-010 1636-y
- Wilson D, Farrell C, Mueller C, et al (2013) Rewetted industrial cutaway peatlands in western
   Ireland: a prime location for climate change mitigation? Mires Peat 11:1–22
- Wilson D, Farrell CA, Fallon D, et al (2016) Multiyear greenhouse gas balances at a rewetted
   temperate peatland. Glob Chang Biol 22:4080–4095. doi: 10.1111/gcb.13325
- 921Wilson D, Tuittila E-S, Alm J, et al (2007) Carbon dioxide dynamics of a restored maritime922peatland.Ecoscience14:71–80.doi:10.2980/1195-9236860(2007)14[71:CDDOAR]2.0.CO;2
- Wohlfahrt G, Galvagno M (2017) Revisiting the choice of the driving temperature for eddy
   covariance CO2 flux partitioning. Agric For Meteorol 237–238:135–142. doi:
   10.1016/J.AGRFORMET.2017.02.012
- Yeloff DE, Labadz JC, Hunt CO (2006) Causes of degradation and erosion of a blanket mire
   in the southern Pennines, UK. Mires Peat 1:
- 929

- 931 Table 1 Most significant variables from stepwise multiple regression analysis of temporal controls on
- 932 average CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes; photosynthesis at 1000 µmol Photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (P<sub>G1000</sub>), ecosystem respiration (R<sub>Eco</sub>),
- 933 total (BGR<sub>Tot</sub>), heterotrophic (BGR<sub>Het</sub>) and autotrophic (BGR<sub>Aut</sub>) below-ground respiration.

Landscape Component	CO <sub>2</sub> Flux	Variable		Coefficier		2	
		1	2	1	2	P	I
Vogotatod	P <sub>G1000</sub> (n=10)	NDVI		-8.951		<0.001	0.82
vegetateu	LnR <sub>Eco</sub> (n=14)	T15		0.172		0.001	0.77
Poot	P <sub>G1000</sub> (n=10)	WTD		-0.111		<0.001	0.87
Peat	R <sub>Eco</sub> (n=14)	WTD		0.077		<0.001	0.78
Vegetated	LnBGR <sub>Tot</sub> (n=17)	T5		0.21		<0.001	0.72
	BGR <sub>Het</sub> (n=17)	WTD	Rain1	0.125	0.084	<0.001	0.75
	LnBGR <sub>Aut</sub> (n=17)	Т30		0.474		<0.001	0.69

Input variables: water table depth (WTD), soil temperature and natural log-transformed soil temperature at 5, 10, 15, 20, 25 and 30 cm, fraction of photosynthetically active radiation (fPAR), Normalised Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI), total PPFD in the preceding day and hour, total rainfall on the day of measurement (Rain0) and preceding 1,7,14 and 28 days.

934

936 Table 2 Sample number (n), regression coefficient (r<sup>2</sup>), root mean squared error (RMSE) and coefficient

937
-----

estimates (standard errors) used in net CO<sub>2</sub> ecosystem exchange models (Equation 4 and 5)

		Vegetated Hagg	Peat Pan		
n		423	398		
r <sup>2</sup>		0.76	0.67		
RMSE (umol m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> )		1.39	0.37		
	$P_{max}$	-13.05 (0.67)	-2.25 (0.19)		
Coefficient	K	1299.27 (241.05)	2606.31 (649.86)		
estimate (standard	a or c	11.49 (1.98)	0.05 (0.02)		
error)	b or d	19.49 (2.31)	0.15 (0.03)		
	f		0.06 (0.01)		

941 Table 3 Estimated seasonal CO<sub>2</sub> flux. Positive values indicate the ecosystem is a net CO<sub>2</sub> source to

# 942 the atmosphere.

Growing Season		CO <sub>2</sub> Flux (g C m <sup>-2</sup> )	95 % Confidence Interval
06/06/2013	Vegetated Haggs	29	-570 to 762
to 28/10/2013	Peat Pans	7	-147 to 465
16/05/2014 to 12/10/2014	Vegetated Haggs	20	-873 to 1105
	Peat Pans	8	-136 to 436

- 944 Figure 1. Location of A, Dartmoor National Park (shaded area) within the south west of England, B, Study site
- 945 (red square) within the national park (grey), C, the study site (black square) within an area of erosion, and D, the
- 946 arrangement of plots and monitoring equipment; vegetated (grey squares) and bare (white squares) net CO<sub>2</sub>
- 947 ecosystem exchange and total (white circles) and heterotrophic (black circle) below ground respiration. In panels
- 948 C and D the green vegetated areas are the vegetated haggs and the grey, watery areas are the peat pans.



- 952 Figure 2 Schematic equipment layout. Perspex net ecosystem exchange collar (NEE) co-located with dipwell
- 953 (DW) in both the vegetated haggs and peat pans. In the vegetated haggs polyvinyl chloride collars were also
- 954 located measuring total (T) and heterotrophic (H) below ground respiration.



956 Figure 3 Water table depth (cm below ground level) in the peat pans (top) and vegetated haggs (bottom) over the

957 2013 and 2014 growing seasons the six replicate plots within the study site (Figure 1D)



959 Figure 4 Comparison of vegetation composition indices between the vegetated haggs (VH) (n=6) and the peat

pans (PP) (n=6). Error bars reach the maximum and minimum recorded values. The vertical box extends from the
25<sup>th</sup> to the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile with a horizontal line at the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile.



- 963 Figure 5 Seasonal variation in ecosystem respiration and photosynthesis and net ecosystem exchange at
- 964 1000  $\mu$ mol Photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> in the vegetated haggs (a & b) and peat pans (c & d) ( $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), error bars are 1
- 965 standard error, n=6.



969 Figure 6 Seasonal variation in mean total and heterotrophic soil respiration rates (n=6) (µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>). Error bars

970 are 1 standard error.



- 972 Figure 7 Temporal relationship between soil temperature (°C) at a depth of 5 cm (a, b & c) or water table depth (cm
- 973 below ground surface) (d, e & f) and total (a & d), heterotrophic (b & e) and autotrophic (c & f) below-ground
- 974 respiration from the vegetated haggs (n=6). p<0.001.



978 Supplementary Material Table 1 Percentage cover of species observed at sites (1-6) in vegetated haggs and peat

979 pans

	Vegetated Haggs					Peat Pan						
Species	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Calluna vulgaris	1	5	3	5								
Drosera rotundifolia		1										
Erica tetralix	4	7	20	15	8	3						
Narthecium ossifragum						50						
Polygala serpyllifolia	1			4	1							
Molinia caerulea	30	40	50	20	35	8						
Trichophorum cespitosum	30			4								
Eriophorum angustifolium		5	1	8	2	2	3	3	4	5		8
Campylopus introflexus	1	1										
Hypnum cupressiforme	30	1		18	2							
Racometrium langinosum			2									
Sphagnum												
capillifolium/rubellum		20										
Sphagnum denticulatum										30	95	20
Bare Ground	8	20	40	30	35	40	97	47				
Standing Water								50	96	65	5	72

981

Supplementary Material Figure 1 Modelled net ecosystem exchange ( $CO_2 \mu molm^{-2}s^{-1}$ ) against measured net ecosystem exchange ( $CO_2 \mu molm^{-2}s^{-1}$ ) and model residuals ( $CO_2 \mu molm^{-2}s^{-1}$ ) against modelled net ecosystem exchange ( $CO_2 \mu molm^{-2}s^{-1}$ ) for the vegetated haggs and peat pans.



Vegetated Haggs

