Holocene fire activity during low-natural flammability periods reveals scale-dependent cultural human-fire relationships in Europe

3	Elisabeth Dietze ^{a,b} *, Martin Theuerkauf ^c , Karolina Bloom ^d , Achim Brauer ^a , Walter Dörfler ^e , Ingo
4	Feeser ^e , Angelica Feurdean ^f , Laura Gedminienė ^g , Thomas Giesecke ^h , Susanne Jahns ⁱ , Monika
5	Karpińska-Kołaczek ^j , Piotr Kołaczek ^k , Mariusz Lamentowicz ^k , Małgorzata Latałowa ^l , Katarzyna
6	Marcisz ^k , Milena Obremska ^m , Anna Pędziszewska ^l , Anneli Poska ⁿ , Kira Rehfeld ^o , Migle
7	Stančikaitė ^g , Normunds Stivrins ^{n,p} , Joanna Święta-Musznicka ^l , Marta Szal ^q , Jüri Vassiljev ⁿ , Siim
8	Veski ⁿ , Agnieszka Wacnik ^r , Dawid Weisbrodt ^s , Julian Wiethold ^t , Boris Vannière ^u , Michał Słowiński ^v
9	^a Section 5.2 Climate Dynamics and Landscape Evolution, GFZ German Research Centre for
10	Geosciences, Telegrafenberg, D-14473 Potsdam, Germany
11	^b Present address: Alfred-Wegener-Institute Helmholtz Centre for Polar and Marine Research,
12	Telegrafenberg, D-14473 Potsdam, Germany
13	^c Institute of Botany and Landscape Ecology, University of Greifswald, Domstraße 11, D-17489
14	Greifswald, Germany
15	^d Institute of Marine and Coastal Sciences, Faculty of Geosciences, University of Szczecin, Adama
16	Mickiewicza 16, PL-70-383 Szczecin, Poland
17	^e Institute of Prehistoric and Protohistoric Archaeology, Christian-Albrechts-University, Johanna-
18	Mestorf-Straße 2-6, D-24118 Kiel, Germany
19	^f Senckenberg Research Biodiversity and Climate Research Centre, Senckenberganlage 25, D-60325
20	Frankfurt/Main, Germany
21	^g Institute of Geology and Geography, Nature Research Centre, Akademijos Str. 2, LT-08412 Vilnius,

22 Lithuania

23	^h Department of Palynology and Climate Dynamics, Albrecht-von-Haller-Institute for Plant Sciences,
24	University of Göttingen, Wilhelm-Weber-Str. 2a, D-37073 Göttingen, Germany
25	ⁱ Heritage Management and Archaeological Museum of the State of Brandenburg, Wünsdorfer Platz
26	4-5, D-15806 Zossen, Germany
27	^j Centre for the Study of Demographic and Economic Structures in Preindustrial Central and Eastern
28	Europe, University of Białystok, Pl. Uniwersytecki 1, PL-15-001 Białystok, Poland
29	^k Institute of Geoecology and Geoinformation, Faculty of Geographical and Geological Sciences,
30	Adam Mickiewicz University in Poznań, Dziegielowa 27 and Bogumiła Krygowskiego 10, PL-61-
31	680 Poznań, Poland
32	¹ Laboratory of Palaeoecology and Archaeobotany, Department of Plant Ecology, Faculty of Biology,
33	University of Gdańsk, ul. Wita Stwosza 59, PL-80-308 Gdańsk, Poland
34	^m Institute of Geological Sciences, Polish Academy of Sciences, Twarda 51/55, PL-00-818 Warsaw,
35	Poland
36	ⁿ Department of Geology, Tallinn University of Technology, Ehitajate tee 5, EE-19086 Tallinn,
37	Estonia
38	^o British Antarctic Survey, High Cross, Madingley Road, UK-CB3 0ET Cambridge, United Kingdom
39	^p Department of Geography, Faculty of Geography and Earth Sciences, University of Latvia, Jelgavas
40	street 1, LV-1004, Riga, Latvia
41	^q Institute of Biology, University of Białystok, ul. Ciołkowskiego 1J, PL-15-245 Białystok, Poland
42	^r W. Szafer Institute of Botany, Polish Academy of Sciences, Lubicz 46, PL-31-512 Kraków, Poland
43	^s Faculty of Oceanography and Geography, University of Gdańsk, PL-80-952 Gdańsk, Poland

44	^t Institut national des recherches archéologiques préventives (Inrap), Direction Grand Est, Laboratoire
45	archéobotanique, 12, rue de Méric, CS 80005, F-57063 Metz cedex 2, France
46	^u CNRS, MSHE CN. Ledoux USR 3124, Chrono-environnement UMR 6249, Univ. Bourgogne
47	Franche-Comté, F-25000 Besançon, France
48	^v Institute of Geography and Spatial Organization, Polish Academy of Sciences, Twarda 51/55, PL-
49	00-818 Warsaw, Poland
50	* Correspondence: Elisabeth Dietze, email: <u>edietze@gfz-potsdam.de</u> , edietze@awi.de
51	Keywords: sedimentary charcoal; fire; human impact; central Europe; land cover; Holocene,
52	archaeology
53	Highlights
54	• We report sedimentary charcoal composites for the Central European lowlands (CEL).
55	• Holocene fire activity shows convergence and divergence across three spatial scales.
56	• Divergence in low-flammability periods reflects cultural fire use in land management.
57	• Since 8,500 cal. BP, humans affected CEL-biogeochemical cycles beyond the local scale.
58	
50	

60 Abstract

Fire is a natural component of global biogeochemical cycles and closely related to changes in human 61 62 land use. Whereas climate-fuel relationships seem to drive both global and subcontinental fire 63 regimes, human-induced fires are prominent mainly on a local scale. Furthermore, the basic 64 assumption that relates humans and fire regimes in terms of population densities, suggesting that few 65 human-induced fires should occur in periods and areas of low population density, is currently 66 debated. Here, we analyze human-fire relationships throughout the Holocene and discuss how and to 67 what extent human-driven fires affected the landscape transformation in the Central European 68 Lowlands (CEL). We present sedimentary charcoal composites on three spatial scales and compare 69 them with climate model output and land cover reconstructions from pollen records. Our findings 70 indicate that widespread natural fires only occurred during the early Holocene. Natural conditions 71 (climate and vegetation) limited the extent of wildfires beginning 8,500 cal. BP, and diverging 72 subregional charcoal composites suggest that Mesolithic hunter-gatherers maintained a culturally 73 diverse use of fire. Divergence in regional charcoal composites marks the spread of sedentary 74 cultures in the western and eastern CEL. The intensification of human land use during the last 75 millennium drove an increase in fire activity to early-Holocene levels across the CEL. Hence, 76 humans have significantly affected natural fire regimes beyond the local scale – even in periods of 77 low population densities – depending on diverse cultural land-use strategies. We find that humans 78 have strongly affected land-cover- and biogeochemical cycles since Mesolithic times.

79 **1. Introduction**

Major questions in the global debate on climate and environmental change are when, how and to what extent humans have affected land cover and global carbon cycles beyond their natural variability (Ruddiman et al., 2015; Strandberg et al., 2014; Waters et al., 2016). Fire is a key

83 component of many natural ecosystems and biogeochemical cycles worldwide (Jaffé et al., 2013; 84 Randerson et al., 2006) and closely linked to climate (Daniau et al., 2012). However, fire usage has 85 also been key in human evolution (Bowman et al., 2009; Roebroeks and Villa, 2011) and an 86 important tool in anthropogenic land cover change across the globe (Bowman et al., 2011), at least 87 until the time of active fire suppression and the notion of fire being a threat to society (Marlon et al., 88 2008; Pyne, 2016). As fire risk and socioecological damage are currently increasing in many parts of 89 the world, human-fire relationships are highly debated (Balch et al., 2017; Syphard et al., 2017; Ward 90 et al., 2018). One of the assumptions accounting for humans as drivers of fire regimes is a close 91 relationship between human population densities and fire, where humans act first as ignition triggers. 92 Then, after reaching a certain threshold, humans act as fire suppressors by increasing landscape 93 fragmentation or by taking active suppressive measures (Guyette et al., 2002; Lasslop and Kloster, 94 2017; Ward et al., 2018). Given the low population densities throughout the early and mid-Holocene 95 (Kaplan et al., 2011; Klein Goldewijk et al., 2011), fire histories derived from sedimentary charcoal 96 (CHAR) compilations have been primarily associated with climatic factors (Daniau et al., 2012; 97 Marlon et al., 2013) and natural vegetation compositions (Blarquez et al., 2015). Only in the most 98 recent centuries, humans seem to have influenced natural fire regimes on global to regional scales 99 (Marlon et al., 2008; Pechony and Shindell, 2010).

100 However, local CHAR records and some regional CHAR compilations show divergent Holocene fire 101 regimes in adjacent European regions that cannot be explained solely by natural factors (climate, 102 vegetation) (Rius et al., 2011; Vannière et al., 2011). Instead, diverse local to regional fire regimes 103 (characterized by fire frequency, seasonality, intensity, and amount of biomass burned) could indicate 104 human fire use in diverse cultural subsistence traditions and land use practices at least since the last 105 7,000 to 3,000 years (Molinari et al., 2013; Rius et al., 2011; Vannière et al., 2016; Vannière et al., 106

2011). However, to what extent early hunter-gatherer and farming societies altered natural fire

107 regimes and landscapes beyond the local scale remains poorly understood (Kaplan et al., 2016; 108 Marlon et al., 2013; Ruddiman, 2013; Vannière et al., 2016). The impacts of future climate change, 109 such as changing fire risk, will be highly variable at the regional scale and dependent on 110 preconditions that have shaped a landscape. Considering cultural dependencies in human-fire 111 relationships over multiple spatial scales relevant to political decision processes is important to (i) 112 unravel the long-term interactions between natural and human drivers on fire regimes and the 113 associated human impact on biogeochemical cycles (Arneth et al., 2017; van der Werf et al., 2013) 114 and (ii) enable informed discussions on future land management and nature conservation efforts 115 (Whitlock et al., 2018).

Here, we aim to provide (i) a long-term perspective of fire activity in the central European lowlands that allows assessment of the preconditions of current and future fire risk, and (ii) an analysis of the dependence of fire activity on natural and anthropogenic drivers. By comparing millennial-scale fire trends at nested spatial scales to known Holocene climate, land cover, and archaeological histories, we aim to determine and discuss when and how sociocultural characteristics such as foraging and agricultural land management have altered the natural occurrence of fire and affected regional biogeochemical cycles.

123 **2.** Study area and assumption

We analyze new sedimentary charcoal composites of the Central European Lowlands and the Baltic States (CEL, Fig. 1), a temperate region with a well-studied Holocene land-cover and settlement history (Marquer et al., 2017; Roberts et al., 2018; Trondman et al., 2015). Compared to other regions of the world, the CEL are a low-flammability landscape; currently, spring and summer fire events are rare and burned areas are small, usually < 5 ha (Archibald et al., 2013; FAO, 2007), except for Poland, where slightly larger and more frequent fires have occurred during the last three decades

- 130 (San-Miguel-Ayanz et al., 2012). The low flammability of the CEL is due to active fire suppression
- 131 (Pyne, 2016), and several natural factors.





- 141 semi-arid, more fire-prone regions (Marlon et al., 2013). Lightning strikes (natural ignition triggers)
- 142 occur at comparably low frequencies, i.e., <5 flashes km⁻² yr⁻¹ (Christian et al., 2003) and 44 % of
- 143 the recorded fires in Poland between 1990 and 2006 were related to arson (FAO, 2007). Second,
- 144 natural fires require sufficient and connected flammable biomass (fuel), even during prolonged shifts
- 145 to dry conditions. Following a climatic gradient from more warm to more cool climate from the
- 146 western to the eastern CEL, respectively (Fig. 1), the natural dominance of temperate mixed
- 147 broadleaf trees decreases towards the eastern CEL and Norway spruce (*Picea abies*) becomes more

148 abundant in the temperate hemiboreal zone (Caudullo et al., 2016; Giesecke and Bennett, 2004). 149 Temperate mixed broadleaf forests of the western CEL rarely burn naturally, because of their high 150 leaf moisture and less-flammable tree compounds (Bowman et al., 2011; Rogers et al., 2015). In the 151 eastern CEL, the prevailing hemiboreal forests are mainly mixtures of broadleaf trees and Norway 152 spruce. The long-term fire ecology of Norway spruce is still under discussion: similar to other 153 conifers, the tree is easily flammable because of its resin-rich needles and canopy structure (Brown 154 and Giesecke, 2014; Caudullo et al., 2016; Feurdean et al., 2017), but it is generally regarded as a fire 155 avoider or even suppressor because it suffers in periods of frequent droughts and fires and its moist 156 understory limits fire (Caudullo et al., 2016; Ohlson et al., 2011; Rogers et al., 2015). In contrast, 157 Scots pine (*Pinus sylvestris*) is better adapted to dry soils and regenerates after a fires; its lighter 158 canopy results in rapid drying of its understory and, hence, increased flammability (Houston Durrant 159 et al., 2016; Rogers et al., 2015).

Given these natural background conditions in the CEL, we expect higher-than-average fire activity in times of dry climate and widespread pine-dominated forests. In times of fully established temperate broadleaf or spruce-dominated hemiboreal forests and wet climate, we expect lower-than-average fire activity. Human alteration of natural fire regimes should result in diverging fire activity trends over various spatial scales (Bowman et al., 2011; McWethy et al., 2013), as exemplified by (i) opposing fire activity trends in adjacent regions, and/or (ii) fire activity trends that contrast the expected natural flammability based on climate and vegetation trends.

- 167 **3. Material and methods**
- 168 **3.1 Sedimentary charcoal composites**

We compiled 61 (39 published and 22 unpublished) microscopic charcoal influx records (CHAR, number of particles $cm^{-2} yr^{-1}$) from lake sediment and peatland cores (Table S1). As 80% of the 171 records derive from basins smaller than 90 ha, individual CHAR records represent fires with 172 potential source areas within 100 kilometers of the sampling site (Adolf et al., 2018; Marlon et al., 173 2016) and thus integrate fire events of an extra-local area. We used only microscopic charcoal 174 records from pollen slides, as few continuous macroscopic charcoal records have been published 175 from this region (Feurdean et al., 2017; Marcisz et al., 2015; Pedziszewska and Latałowa, 2016). 176 Evaluation of individual age-depth models considering amount and quality of age control points and 177 type of calculation of age-depth models (see references in Table S2) showed a high diversity of age-178 depth models. To improve consistency, we recalculated age-depth models for 33 sites using CLAM 179 in R (Blaauw, 2010) following the approach of Giesecke et al. (2014) and IntCal13 (Reimer et al., 180 2013). For 9 Baltic sites, we recalculated age-depth models using OxCal 4.2.4 and IntCal13 (Reimer 181 et al., 2013) and for the remaining 19 sites, we used the original, high-quality age-depth models (i.e., 182 based on more than 100 age control points, Table S2).

183 As the resolution and quantity of CHAR vary between sites, established statistical methods of data 184 transformation and compositing allow the detection of common fire trends (Marlon et al., 2016; 185 Power et al., 2008). All available charcoal flux records were transformed with the R paleofire 186 package (Blarquez et al., 2014) using the boxcox, minmax and z-score transformations and a 187 Holocene base period from - 50 to 11,500 years before 1950 AD (cal. BP) with the zero line 188 representing the Holocene mean of all transformed records. Prior to resampling sites, transformed 189 charcoal records were pre-binned in non-overlapping 100-year bins (i.e., at the approximate median 190 resolution across all records). CHAR composite anomalies were calculated for groups over different 191 spatial scales by fitting a robust locally-weighted scatterplot smoother (LOESS) to 1000-year 192 windows using the transformed charcoal records (Blarquez et al., 2014; Daniau et al., 2012). 193 Composite anomaly records are presented as medians and 95 % confidence intervals from 1000 194 bootstrap realizations (Figs. 2 - 4). Fig. S1 shows data availability for the 100-year bins.





CHAR composite anomalies relative to the Holocene average of all CEL sites represent fire activity,
fire occurrence, or biomass burnt (Harrison et al., 2018; Marlon et al., 2016), with smaller confidence
intervals reflecting greater agreement between records, especially when only few samples were
available in a certain time window (Fig. S1). We interpret CHAR composite anomalies as being
primarily derived from forest fires, with secondary sources being understory, grass, and crop residue
burning (Whitlock and Larsen, 2001).

213 **3.2 Spatial scale representation**

214 We aim to identify the spatial extent of human fire usage in the CEL during the Holocene at nested 215 subcontinental, regional, and subregional scales (Fig. 1), which have received little attention to date. 216 The subcontinental CHAR composite (covering ~1,300 x 500 km) integrates all records. The two 217 regional scale CHAR composites (~500 x 500 km) each represent half of the charcoal records as 218 separated according to modern climate and vegetation gradients. The latter is represented by the 219 natural spread of Norway spruce, whereas the climatic gradient is represented by the first principal 220 component (PC1) of the modern environmental stratification (EnS) of Europe (Fig. 1), which 221 represents temperature-related parameters of ecological relevance, such as altitude, slope, sunshine 222 duration, and monthly temperatures (Metzger et al., 2005). We calculated the average EnS PC1 223 values of 14 spatial buffers (1 - 50 km around each site) in QGIS and grouped sites into the eastern 224 and western CEL groups (E CEL and W CEL, respectively) according to the median of the data 225 distribution (Figs. 1, S1a). Some northern central Poland sites were included within the E CEL group 226 to account for the uneven spatial representation of records. Subcontinental and regional CHAR 227 composites are shown in Fig. 2.

Five subregional CHAR composites (~200 x 400 km) represent spatial clusters of charcoal records
 from northern Germany, northwestern Poland/eastern Germany, north-central Poland and

230	northeastern Poland, and the Baltic States (Figs. 1, 3, 4). This grouping is based on the west-to-east
231	climatic-ecological gradients that affect fuel flammability and considers general knowledge of
232	cultural histories (Fig. S2, Table S3). For example, the Lithuanian sites were grouped together with
233	the Latvian and Estonian sites, because of the steep environmental gradient towards northeastern
234	Poland (Fig. 1) and the closer cultural similarities of present-day Lithuania and the other Baltic
235	States. Sample and site availabilities per 100-year bin are shown in Fig. S1 for all CHAR composite
236	anomaly records at the subcontinental scale ($n = 61$; Fig. S1b), regional scale (W CEL, $n = 31$; E
237	CEL, n = 30; Fig. S1b) and subregional scales (N Germany, n = 12; NW Poland/E Germany, n=8; N
238	Poland, $n = 20$; NE Poland, $n = 7$; Baltics, $n = 14$; Fig. S1c), suggesting that further records are
239	needed to approve or disprove the trends discussed below, especially those during the early Holocene
240	in northeastern Poland.



Fig. 3. Subregional Holocene fire activity, lake levels, soil erosion, and land cover reconstructions of the western CEL. a),
f) and h) N Germany, NW Poland/E Germany and N Poland CHAR composites, respectively, (median and 95%
confidence interval, this study) based on *n* available sites (see Fig. S1 for sample availability per time); b) relative lake



- probability density function of ¹⁴C ages of colluvial deposits, Mecklenburg Lake District, Germany (Küster, 2014); d)
- absolute number of dated colluvial deposits across northern Germany (Dreibrodt et al., 2010); e), g), and j) REVEALS-
- transformed (Theuerkauf et al., 2016), 1000-year LOESS-smoothed pollen taxa (sums) of lakes Belauer See (Dörfler et
- al., 2012), Krebssee (Jahns, 1999, 2000) and Gościąż (Ralska-Jasiewiczowa et al., 1998), respectively; i) depth-to-water
- table (DWT) of Tuchola mire, north-central Poland (Lamentowicz et al., 2008). Archaeological periods (from Table S3
- and Fig. S2) are: MP, Mesolithic Period (EM/MM/LM, early/mid/late Mesolithic); EN/LN: early/late Neolithic Period;
- 252 BA and IA, Bronze and Iron Ages (EB/LB, early/late Bronze Age); RM: Roman and Migration Period; and MA,
- 253 Medieval Age. Red and blue framed boxes at top-right mark warm and cool periods during the last 3,000 years (IAC, Iron
- Age Cold Period, RWP, Roman Warm Period, and LIA, Little Ice Age) after Moffa-Sánchez and Hall (2017). Arrows
- 255 mark divergence in CHAR composites from expected natural trend.



257 Fig. 4. Subregional Holocene fire activity, land cover, lake levels, and soil erosion reconstructions of the eastern CEL. a) 258 and d) NE Poland and Baltic states CHAR composites, respectively (median and 95% confidence interval, this study), 259 based on n available sites (see Fig. S1 for sample availability per time); b) cumulative thickness of colluvial deposits, 260 Masurian Lake District, Poland (Smolska, 2011); c and f) REVEALS-transformed (Theuerkauf et al., 2016), 1000-year 261 LOESS-smoothed pollen taxa (sums) of lakes Miłkowskie (Wacnik, 2009; Wacnik et al., 2012) and Ähijärv (Poska et al., 262 2017), respectively; and e) percentage of Estonian lakes with high water levels (Harrison and Saarse, 1992) with ¹⁴C dates 263 recalibrated using IntCal13 (Reimer et al., 2013). Archaeological periods (from Table S3 and Fig. S2) are: MP, Mesolithic 264 Period; EN/LN, Early/Late Neolithic Period; BA and IA, Bronze and Iron Ages; and MA, Medieval Age). Arrows mark 265 divergence in CHAR composites from expected natural trend.

266 **3.3 Data for comparison**

We compared CHAR composite anomalies with climate and land cover data as well as archeological knowledge from the literature to discuss natural and human drivers of fire activity in the CEL. The impact of past anthropogenic fire activity on regional biogeochemical cycles is discussed via comparison with soil erosion and water level changes.

271 3.3.1 Climate model output

272 During the Holocene, climatic conditions have responded to seasonal insolation (Laskar et al., 2004) 273 and the loss of the last remnants of the large glacial ice sheets, inducing sea level rise. We used 274 seasonal temperature and precipitation variations derived from a transient climate simulation of a 275 global coupled atmosphere-ocean-model (CCSM3-Trace21k; Liu et al. (2009)) to assess millennial-276 scale climate variability. The modeled temperature evolution closely correlates with climate 277 reconstructions from terrestrial pollen on millennial and centennial time scales (Marsicek et al., 278 2018). Summer (June to August) temperatures and precipitation represent the climate of the major 279 fire season and were averaged over all grid cells that contain charcoal records of the subcontinental 280 and regional groups (grid cell resolution: 3.75 x 3.75°). We extracted individual grid cells covering

281	the areas of the subregional CHAR composites (N Germany to NE Poland, Fig. S1) and calculated
282	the 99-year running mean of the three grid cells covering the Baltic States (centered at 22.5° E,
283	57.52° N; 26.25° E, 57.52° N, and 26.25° E, 53.81° N). Then, we calculated a 1000-year running
284	mean $\pm 2\sigma$ relative to the Holocene averages (0 – 11,500 cal. BP), as with the CHAR composites.
285	Fig. S3 shows that the climate model output (both averages and individual grid cell values) is not
286	significantly different between adjacent subregions over millennial timescales. The mean
287	subcontinental climate model output of the CEL is shown in Fig. 2.

288 3.3.2 Land cover reconstructions

289 We assessed natural vegetation and human deforestation using quantitative land cover 290 reconstructions from Holocene pollen records (Fig. 1, Tables S1-S2). We used the longest, most 291 representative, and best-resolved pollen records available for each subregion; these were chosen from 292 lakes with basin areas >50 ha to allow application of the REVEALS model (Sugita, 2007). Hence, 293 pollens from a source area of 100 km² and larger appropriately represent land cover at our 294 subregional scale appropriately. We used the REVEALSinR function with pollen productivity 295 estimates from the PPE.MV2015 data set and the default (LSM) dispersal model (Theuerkauf et al., 296 2016) to convert pollen% into land cover. We calculated the sums of arboreal taxa including Corylus 297 avellana, but excluding the coniferous, flammable taxa Picea abies and Pinus sylvestris (discussed 298 and shown separately in the text and Figs. 3, 4). The sum of open land includes all non-arboreal taxa, 299 but excludes the sum of direct human indicators (HI: Artemisia, Plantago major/media, Plantago 300 lanceolata, Rumex acetosa/ acetosella, and cereals according to Reitalu et al. (2013); Figs. 3, 4). We 301 interpolated noncontinuous pollen records and *Picea abies* and *Pinus sylvestris* coverages by 302 calculating the mean coverage in the same 100-year bins used for transformation of the CHAR 303 records. Then, we fitted a LOESS to 1000-year windows for each taxon (sum) using the stats package in R and rescaled to one to fulfill the constant-sum constraint of the compositional pollen data (Figs.305 3, 4).

306 3.3.3 Archeological periods

Cultural histories on millennial to centennial time scales are discussed using a compilation of
representative archeological classifications per subregion based on archeological literature or, where
archeological information was limited, land cover reconstructions from pollen. We provide here only
a rough overview of the timing and duration of certain archeological periods (Table S3, Fig. S2).
While a comprehensive review and data compilation that considers dating uncertainties and the
spatial spread and interaction of past cultures would be helpful and relevant, it is beyond the scope of
this work.

314 3.3.4 Records of soil erosion and water level changes

315 To discuss the impact of increased human fire usage and human land cover change on landscape 316 transformation and regional biogeochemical cycles, we compare CHAR composite anomalies with 317 records of land surface processes and hydrological processes in subregions with available 318 reconstructions covering most of the Holocene. We derived soil erosion composites from 319 compilations of colluvial deposits for N Germany and NE Poland, comprising a probability density function of ¹⁴C dates from the sandur plains of northeastern Germany (Küster, 2014), a record of 320 321 dated deposits across northern Germany, including the northeast (Dreibrodt et al., 2010), and a record 322 of cumulative colluvial deposit thickness in northeastern Poland (Smolska, 2011).

Water level changes in northeastern Germany are based on the only available, continuous Holocene
lake level reconstruction inferred from carbonate deposition in lake Fürstenseer See (Dietze et al.,
2016), from which we reassembled the µXRF-Ca record considering 1000 age-depth models within

the 2σ range of the ¹⁴C dates (Fig. 3b shows the median and 95 % confidence interval). We derived
water level changes in northern Poland from a testate amoebae-inferred depth-to-water table record
of Tuchola mire (Lamentowicz et al., 2008). The changes in Baltic lake levels are based on a
compilation of Estonian lake level records that were classified into high, intermediate, and low lake
status by Harrison and Saarse (1992). We recalibrated their age-depth model using IntCal13 (Reimer
et al., 2013) and present the percentage of high-level lakes in approximate 500-year bins (Fig. 4e).

332 4. Results

The CHAR composite anomalies show common trends and divergences at different spatial scales relative to the Holocene average of all records (Figs. 2 – 4). The subcontinental CHAR composite anomalies indicate three phases of CEL fire activity: (i) an early Holocene increase to above-average fire activity, (ii) a mid- to late Holocene decrease to and stabilization at below-average fire activity, and (iii) a late Holocene increase to above-average fire activity.

338 During the early Holocene (11,500 – 8,500 cal. BP), fire activity increased strongly to above-average 339 levels in all CHAR composites, independent of spatial aggregation (Figs. 2 - 4). At the 340 subcontinental and regional scales, this increase parallels increasing summer temperatures during 341 maximum summer insolation and seasonality as shown by the analyzed climate model output (Fig. 342 2a-d). Summer precipitation was rather low throughout the CEL (Fig. 2b), and flammable vegetation, 343 i.e., the sum of pine and open land (mainly grasses), reached their maximum coverage during the 344 Holocene in both regions (Figs. 2e, f). Although the absolute timing of positive CHAR anomalies 345 varies among subregions, increased fire activity was most pronounced in NW Poland/E Germany 346 (Fig. 3f).

After c. 8,500 cal. BP, subcontinental and regional CHAR composites declined to below-average
values by 7,000 cal. BP, following summer insolation and seasonality (Fig. 2a-d). The TraCE21k-

349 climate model data suggest a strong increase in summer precipitation after 8,500 cal. BP across the 350 CEL (Figs. 2b, S3). At 8,500 cal. BP, pine and open land coverages reduced to their Holocene 351 minima, while broadleaf forests expanded (Figs. 2e, f; 3e, g, j; 4c, f), reducing the area of flammable 352 vegetation. However, at the subregional scale, fire trends started to diverge significantly. NW 353 Poland/E Germany (Fig. 3f) and NE Poland CHAR composites (Fig. 4a) show continuously 354 declining trends since 9,000 cal. BP and until 6,500 and 4,500 cal. BP, respectively. The adjacent N 355 Germany and N Poland composites indicate fire maxima between 8,500 and 6,500 cal. BP (Fig. 3a, 356 h) and the Baltic CHAR composite values stabilize around the Holocene average between 7,500 and 357 6,500 cal. BP (Fig. 4d).

358 Although climate and forest composition did not change strongly, we note marked divergences 359 between the regional CEL fire trends after 6,500 cal. BP that are not evident at the subcontinental 360 scale (Fig. 2a). CHAR composites in the western CEL, especially N Germany, increased from c. 361 6,500 cal. BP, peaked at 5,800 cal. BP and declined afterwards (Figs. 2c; 3a, f, h). Human land use 362 indicators, including cereals, appeared in pollen records and soil erosion increased (Fig. 3e, g, j). In 363 contrast, CHAR composites in the eastern CEL, especially the Baltic States, show a minimum around 364 5,800 cal. BP and a slight increase in fire activity around 5,500 cal. BP (Figs. 2d; 4a, d). Furthermore, 365 Norway spruce expanded across the Baltic region during that time (Fig. 4f), gradually replacing parts 366 of the broadleaf forest.

367 During the late Holocene (after 4,000 cal. BP), fire activity increased continuously until present day 368 throughout the eastern CEL, especially in the Baltic subregion (Figs. 2d, 4d). Regional and 369 subregional composites in the western CEL showed several periods of positive and negative CHAR 370 anomalies. The climate model output suggests that cooler and wetter conditions were established 371 across the entire CEL (Fig. 2b). Flammable, but fire-avoiding and suppressing spruce spread and 372 reached its maximum coverage between 3,500 and 2,000 cal. BP in the eastern CEL, and human

indicator pollen records increased during that time (Figs. 2f; 4c, f). Between 2,500 and 1,000 cal. BP,
regional and subregional composites (especially in the western CEL) show pronounced negative
CHAR anomalies of various timings and durations (Figs. 2c, d; 3a, f, h) that follow a trend towards
cooler and wetter summers (Fig. 2b). During that time, human indicator taxa in pollen records
decreased (Fig. 3e, g, j).

During the last millennium, fire activity increased markedly until present day, reaching burning levels similar to those during the early Holocene, although recent natural conditions were less favorable for fire (Fig. 2). Human-indicator pollen records show that farming intensified in all subregions (Figs. 3e, g, j; 4c, f) and soil erosion increased (Fig. 3c, 4b). However, we observe a significant divergence in subregional CHAR composites. Whereas fire activity in N Poland and the Baltic States increased until present day (Figs. 4a, d), N Germany CHAR anomalies peak around 800 cal. BP and decline afterwards (Fig. 3a).

385 **5. Discussion**

386 **5.1 Natural burning conditions**

387 Fire has been an important component of the CEL landscape in the past (Figs. 2 - 4). Absolute values 388 of N Germany CHAR composite anomalies (Fig. 3a) were lower than those of the Baltic CHAR 389 composite anomalies (Fig. 4d), especially during the last millennium. Thus, the natural climatic and 390 vegetation gradient across the CEL influences biomass flammability: northern Germany is more 391 oceanic and has less pine coverage (Figs. 3, 4) than the more continental areas towards the east, 392 which have more coniferous forest cover, are more affected by summer droughts (Lindner et al., 393 2010) and, hence, are more fire-prone (Marcisz et al., 2017). However, we focus on the interpretation 394 of trends in CHAR composite anomalies, because absolute anomalies can only be linked to relative 395 and not quantitative differences in fire regime properties.

396	Subcontinental fire activity trends followed major changes in climate/vegetation across the CEL
397	since the last glacial period, similar to southern Scandinavia (Olsson et al., 2010) and northeastern
398	Europe (Marlon et al., 2013). Previous (sub)continental CHAR composite anomalies of Europe and
399	central Europe have shown increasing fire activity throughout the Holocene (Marlon et al., 2013;
400	Molinari et al., 2013; Power et al., 2008). However, we find alternating periods of high and low fire
401	activity, similar to southern European CHAR compilations (Vannière et al., 2011). The CEL fire
402	activity trends are sometimes divergent between adjacent areas at various spatial scales (Figs. $2-4$)
403	and could be related to both, natural (i.e., climatic and fuel-related) and human drivers.
404	During the early Holocene, fire activity paralleled increasing summer temperatures (Figs. 2 – 4, S3)
405	similar to fire trends at the global scale (Daniau et al., 2012; Marlon et al., 2013; Power et al., 2008).
406	Frequent droughts related to dominating continental air masses have been reported from regional
407	hydrological reconstructions mainly based on geochemical and paleoecological proxies (Dietze et al.,
408	2016; Harrison et al., 1993; Lauterbach et al., 2011; Väliranta et al., 2015). Hence, the climate and
409	natural land cover (dominated by extensive pine forests and grasslands) favored natural fires.
410	The natural flammability of the CEL landscape reduced after a shift towards wetter summers around
411	8,500 cal. BP (Fig. 2b), probably related to the increasing influence of north Atlantic air masses
412	across the CEL, similar to the present-day air mass dominance (Lauterbach et al., 2011; Rust et al.,
413	2018). However, proxy data does not consistently show increased summer wetness after 8,500 cal.
414	BP (Dietze et al., 2016; Gałka et al., 2014; Latałowa et al., 2013) (Figs. 3b, i; 4e), which we attribute
415	at different sensitivity and temporal resolution of the proxies. Furthermore, with the establishment of
416	mixed broadleaf forests across the CEL, less-flammable fuel was available, with pine forests
417	dominating only in very wet or very dry sites. The slight increase in Baltic CHAR anomalies after
418	5,500 cal. BP is synchronous with lake level reductions that suggest drier conditions (Harrison and
419	Saarse, 1992). Climatic conditions became even less favorable for fire during the last 4,000 years,

420 when climate model output and proxy reconstructions suggest that cooler and wetter conditions

421 established across the entire CEL (Figs. 2 – 4) (Dietze et al., 2016; Wanner et al., 2008). However,

422 fire activity did not decrease accordingly: CHAR composites diverged from the expected natural

423 trend at the subregional scale since 8,500 cal BP (Figs. 3, 4), at the regional scale since 6,500 cal BP,

424 and at the subcontinental scale since 1,000 cal BP (Fig. 2).

425 We propose that the divergence of CHAR composite anomalies from the expected natural trends and 426 between adjacent subregions indicates human alteration of natural fire regimes. We assume spatially 427 homogeneous climatic trends across the CEL because modern short-term climatic events show strong 428 spatial coherence (Merz et al., 2018; Rust et al., 2018) and long-term (i.e., millennial-scale) climate 429 models and available land-cover data do not suggest a spatial heterogeneity of natural trends between 430 adjacent regions. This assumption is limited by some constraints: first, available climate proxy data is 431 heterogeneous concerning archive type, temporal coverage, and the type and spatiotemporal extent of 432 the proxy-climate relationship (Mauri et al., 2015; Salonen et al., 2012; Väliranta et al., 2015); 433 second, we lack comparable and independent syntheses of climate-proxy and land cover data on 434 similar spatiotemporal scales (Marquer et al., 2017; Trondman et al., 2015); and third, the analyzed 435 climate model output only provides larger-scale trends based on the first-order effects of CO_2 and 436 orbital forcing (Rehfeld and Laepple, 2016; Zhang et al., 2017) and does not consider regional 437 climate-land cover feedbacks (Qian et al., 2015).

During periods of low natural flammability but increased fire activity after 8,500 cal. BP, we assume
that humans set fires for multiple purposes by taking advantage of dry fuel during short-term
droughts that occur in both wetter and drier climates. As proof of concept, we discuss two examples
of human-fire relationships that affected fire activity even in periods and areas of low population
densities.

443 **5.2 Fire use by hunter-gatherers**

444 Superimposed on the naturally occurring fire trends, we suggest that maxima in the subregional 445 CHAR composites between 8,500 and 6,000 cal. BP indicate forest fires started by Mesolithic and 446 early Neolithic Baltic hunter-gatherers. So far, there is little direct evidence that Mesolithic groups 447 drove fire activity on larger spatial scales, as archaeological sites document only localized fire use 448 (Bishop et al., 2015) and the open-land signal in vegetation reconstructions is barely distinguishable 449 from natural disturbances (Bishop et al., 2015) such as wind throw and forest grazing by large 450 herbivorous mammals (e.g., Birks (2005). However, the presence of local Mesolithic groups and 451 social interactions between them are well known across the CEL (Latałowa, 1992; Wacnik et al., 452 2011; Zvelebil, 2006, 2008). Increasing knowledge of Mesolithic (and early Neolithic) cultures 453 around the Baltic Sea indicates that their subsistence mainly relied on marine or freshwater fishing, 454 but always included forest-based resources (Meadows et al., 2016; Rimantienė, 1992; Zvelebil, 2008) 455 that required maintaining open space in forests (Bishop et al., 2015). Fire is regarded as an important 456 tool, for example, to selectively support food production, especially hazel (Corylus avellana) (Holst, 457 2010; Wacnik et al., 2011; Zvelebil, 2008), or to keep clearings open to attract game (Bishop et al., 458 2015).

The degree of intentional forest disturbance and use of forest resources probably varied in space and time (Meadows et al., 2016; Poska and Saarse, 2002; Wacnik et al., 2011; Zvelebil, 2008) and in relation to access to other resources from, e.g., rivers, the sea, or early contacts with sedentary cultures (Krause-Kyora et al., 2013; Silva and Vander Linden, 2017). For example, new analytical approaches in archaeology suggest that Mesolithic forest-based diets were reduced in favor of waterbased diets in the Baltic hinterland (Meadows et al., 2016). Accordingly, Baltic CHAR anomalies (Fig. 4d) suggest that fire usage of the mid-Neolithic Narva hunter-gatherers (Table S3, Fig. S2) 466 might have reduced their fire usage around 5,800 cal. BP, when the Baltic CHAR composite declines467 to a minimum.

We argue that diverse extents of woodland alteration by hunter-gatherers can explain the offset from the expected natural fire trends on the subregional scale, which represents roughly the territories that Mesolithic hunter-gatherers occupied (Zvelebil, 2006). Hence, we support earlier interpretations that Mesolithic communities could have significantly affected landscapes by burning forest to construct their niche (Bishop et al., 2015; Latałowa, 1992; Poska and Saarse, 2002; Wacnik et al., 2011). We propose that fire activity was linked not only to human population densities, but also to cultural subsistence strategies that were based on diverse usage of terrestrial resources.

475 **5.3 Fire as an agrarian land management tool**

476 Divergent regional CHAR composite anomalies after 6,500 cal. BP mirror divergent rates in

477 Neolithisation and agricultural land use, as previously suggested by discrete charcoal data (Robin and

478 Nelle, 2014). CHAR composites allow determination of the spatial spread of human fire usage in

479 prehistoric and historic agrarian land management, which was previously described using

480 archaeological compilations (Feeser and Dörfler, 2015; Poska et al., 2004; Silva and Vander Linden,

481 2017) and quantitative land cover reconstructions (Marquer et al., 2017; Trondman et al., 2015).

482 During the transition from foraging to sedentary cultures that adopted pastoralism and agriculture,

483 western CEL CHAR composites, especially N Germany and NW Poland/E Germany, show

484 increasing and declining anomalies that coincide with a known societal cycle of increasing and

485 declining population development between 6,500 and 5,000 cal BP (Feeser and Dörfler, 2015;

486 Latałowa, 1992) (Figs. 2 – 4), as inferred from archeological remains (Warden et al., 2017). During

487 that time, the temperature in the Baltic Sea area increased towards the mid-Holocene thermal

488 optimum and subsequently decreased after 5,500 cal BP, suggesting a response of cultural

development to climate change on millennial time scales (Warden et al., 2017). However, despite
continued decreases in overall population densities and Baltic Sea temperatures between 5,000 and
3,000 cal. BP (Warden et al., 2017), fire use increased on regional and subregional scales after the
transition from the Funnel Beaker towards the Corded Ware culture around 4,800 cal. BP.

493 Yet, the role of fire in Neolithic land management is strongly debated in the western CEL (Feeser et 494 al., 2012), because of lacking evidence for slash-and-burn practices that were common in other 495 regions (Bowman et al., 2011; Vannière et al., 2016). Although fire probably helped to alter 496 woodland structures during the initial period of adoption of animal husbandry (Feeser and Dörfler, 497 2014; Feeser and Dörfler, 2015), further regional land management strategies without fire usage 498 evolved for deforestation and agricultural maintenance (Feeser et al., 2012; Latałowa, 1992). Hence, 499 fire usage seems to depend more on the variable cultural practices than on population densities (see 500 archeological phases in Figs. 3, S2).

501 In the eastern CEL, fire activity increased after 5,500 cal. BP but only reached or exceeded the 502 Holocene average after 3,000 cal. BP (Figs. 2, 4). Lake levels in the Baltic States decreased between 503 5,200 and 4,000 cal. BP, suggesting a drier climate possibly related to increasing Baltic Sea 504 temperatures (Warden et al., 2017). Eastern CEL fire activity might therefore be influenced by a 505 climatic shift. Although the first traces of cereals and pastoralism appear in the region during that 506 time (Madeja et al., 2010; Poska et al., 2004; Trondman et al., 2015) as a result of the appearance of, 507 e.g., the Funnel Beaker and Corded Ware cultures (Table S3), archeological and land cover data 508 suggest that Baltic cultures still relied primarily on forest- and water-based resources (Meadows et 509 al., 2016; Poska et al., 2004; Rimantienė, 1992; Wacnik, 2009). Only after the onset of the Bronze 510 Age (4,000 cal. BP) do human indicator pollen and soil erosion records show increasing agricultural 511 land use (Gałka et al., 2013; Poska et al., 2004; Reitalu et al., 2013; Smolska, 2011) (Fig. 4). Hence,

- 512 increasing CHAR composite anomalies parallel the major onset and spread of farming in the eastern
- 513 CEL more than 2,000 years later than in the western CEL (Figs. 2 4).

514 Whereas eastern CEL CHAR composites continuously increased towards present day, western CEL 515 CHAR composites follow known archaeological phases of altered land management and 516 technological transitions, such as those occurring during the Bronze and Iron Ages (Fig. 3). Most 517 prominently, negative fire anomalies of varying timings and durations in adjacent regions between 518 2,500 and 1,000 cal. BP follow a millennial-scale climatic cooling (Helama et al., 2017; Wanner et 519 al., 2008) (Fig. 2). Additionally, the expansion of beech (*Fagus sylvatica*) and hornbeam (*Carpinus* 520 betulus) in Germany and northern Poland further reduced fire-prone pine forest cover (Marquer et al., 521 2017; Pedziszewska and Latałowa, 2016). Although societal responses to climatic changes are 522 complex and difficult to decipher at millennial time scales (Haldon, 2016), the reduction in fire 523 activities during that time suggests an altered use of fire in land management. In many areas, reduced 524 human land use per se during the Migration Period can explain the minimum CHAR composite 525 anomalies (Figs. 3, S2). Although debated, large-scale human reorganization during this period was 526 probably related to less-favorable climatic conditions of the Dark Age cold period (Helama et al., 527 2017; Kaplan et al., 2009; Zhang et al., 2011) and led to the reforestation of large areas, mainly with 528 broadleaf taxa (Marguer et al., 2017) (Figs. 2 - 4).

The strong increase of fire activity in all CHAR composites during the last millennium (Figs. 2 – 4) parallels population growth after the Migration Period (Helama et al., 2017). This increase clearly overrides the millennial-scale cool and wet climatic trends (Fig. 2), similar as suggested for recent times over shorter time scales (Syphard et al., 2017). Farming extended into previously unsuitable sites and intensified in all subregions, as reflected in pollen and soil erosion records (Dreibrodt et al., 2010; Kaplan et al., 2009; Marquer et al., 2017) (Fig. 3). Fire activity driven by human land cover change reached early Holocene levels, even at the subcontinental scale (Fig. 2). 536 The pattern in N German CHAR composites, which diverges from other subregional composites, 537 follows the generally assumed relationship between fire and population densities: increasing 538 population first lead to increased fire activity, and eventually to landscape fragmentation that 539 indirectly limited the spread of fires (Marlon et al., 2008; Pechony and Shindell, 2010). The 540 landscape in northern Germany seems to have become fragmented by around 1200 AD: land cover 541 reconstructions from pollen data and models suggest that more than 60 % of the land was deforested 542 in northern Germany by that time, compared to less than 40 % in the Baltic states (intermediate 543 estimates based on Kaplan et al. (2009), Kaplan et al. (2017), Marquer et al. (2017) and Figs. 3, 4). 544 All other analyzed subregions did not reach this extent of open land (Figs. 3, 4) and, within 545 uncertainty, most still show an upward trend in fire activity (Figs. 3, 4). This trend might not only 546 relate to land openness and associated landscape fragmentation, but also to forest composition and 547 biomass flammability, as coniferous taxa cover a greater extent in the continental eastern CEL than in 548 the western CEL (Figs. 1, 3, 4; Marcisz et al. (2017). We note that the Lake Miłkowskie pollen 549 record (Fig. 4c) shows representative land openness trends in NE Poland, but locally reconstructed 550 openness was exceptionally high already since ca. 800 cal. BP, whereas other areas remained 551 strongly forested (Wacnik et al., 2016).

552 Our relative CHAR composite anomalies do not allow us to infer absolute changes in past fire regime 553 properties in terms of fire frequency, area, or the amount and type of biomass burned (Marlon et al., 554 2016). Uncertainties in our reconstructions are still large due to limited data availabilities during 555 certain periods, especially at the subregional scale (Fig. S1), indicating the need for more and highly 556 resolved Holocene fire records that allow better characterization of past fire regimes (Feurdean et al., 557 2017; Vannière et al., 2016). Hence, the impact of human-driven fires and associated human land 558 management on biogeochemical cycles can only be discussed in general terms.

559 5.4 The roles of fire and human land cover change in Holocene landscape transformation and 560 biogeochemical cycles

561 Our results suggest that humans have increased fire activity beyond the local scale in the CEL 562 throughout the Holocene. Accordingly, humans could have significantly affected biogeochemical 563 cycles in this landscape of low natural flammability. Since the divergence of CHAR composites from 564 the expected natural trends at the transition from the early to mid-Holocene, the increased occurrence 565 of fire in a landscape of low natural flammability probably increased carbon release and altered 566 albedo and vegetation composition and, hence, regional climate-carbon cycle feedbacks (Harrison et 567 al., 2018; Schimel and Baker, 2002).

568 In addition to the indirect feedback with regional climate (Strandberg et al., 2014), human fire usage 569 in land management probably affected biogeochemical cycles also via other landscape components in 570 the CEL such as soil erosion and water budgets (Latałowa, 1992). Indeed, observations have shown 571 increased erosion on the catchment scale (<100 km²) following fires (Allen, 2007; Bodí et al., 2014; 572 Leys et al., 2016), with charcoal remains being a classical diagnostic property of central European 573 hillslope, i.e., colluvial, sediments (Robin and Nelle, 2014). Hoffmann et al. (2013) quantified 574 significant carbon burial and storage in floodplain and hillslope sediments due to Holocene human-575 induced soil erosion. Our lake- and peatland-derived CHAR composite anomalies mirror soil erosion 576 trends in N Germany and NE Poland (Dreibrodt et al., 2010; Dreibrodt and Wiethold, 2015; Smolska, 577 2011) after Neolithisation (6,500 and 4,000 cal. BP, Fig. 3) and, hence, provide an independent 578 record of human-induced and biogeochemically-relevant soil erosion and land cover change. 579 Water level changes are generally interpreted in terms of precipitation-evaporation ratios (Harrison et 580 al., 1993; Shuman et al., 2010). In northern Germany, we observe that significant lake level changes 581 (considering age uncertainties from Dietze et al. (2016) parallel the CHAR composite anomalies

during the Neolithic period (Fig. 3a, b). Thus, human fire usage in land management may have
resulted in regionally increased groundwater recharge and higher water levels, as shown by
Woodward et al. (2014) on the global scale. Further intense lake level fluctuations related to human
water management (Dietze et al., 2016) occurred at the time of maximum land openness and fire
activity during the last millennium (Fig. 3).

Hence, human land cover change could have significantly affected regional hydrological and sediment budgets, especially since the Neolithic time (Dietze et al., 2016; Latałowa, 1992; Ruddiman et al., 2015). Integration and compilation of land, ecosystem, and paleoclimate records over different spatial and temporal scales are needed to better understand and quantify the interactions between climate and human drivers of past landscape transformation (Marquer et al., 2017) and the role of cultural fire use.

593 **6.** Conclusions and implications

We provide a new reconstruction of Holocene fire activity in the low-flammability landscape of the Central European Lowlands. When natural conditions (climate and land cover) limited widespread fire occurrence, millennial-scale fire activity seems well explained by the cultural use of fire suggesting that humans have affected natural terrestrial systems at varying intensities over several millennia, and providing new insights into past human-environment interactions.

We have identified convergences and divergences (i) among nested subregional to subcontinental CHAR composites and (ii) from the expected natural flammability across spatial scales. This approach provides a step forward in determining early human-fire-land use relationships (Fig. 5) when high-resolution macrocharcoal records are lacking, i.e., beyond the assumption of direct firepopulation density relationships and independent of classical pollen-derived human impact

- 604 indicators. This approach adds to previous studies in other areas of the globe where natural
- 605 conditions did not support the frequent occurrence of fire (McWethy et al., 2013).



Fig. 5. Scale dependency of millennial fire trends in low-flammability landscapes, based on CEL CHAR composites.
Early human fire usage can be detected with composites aggregating sedimentary charcoal records at small spatial scales.
Whereas the impact of Mesolithic hunter-gatherers is archaeologically well known at the local scale, CHAR composites
allow detection of Mesolithic impacts at the subregional scale under less suitable natural burning conditions, despite low
population densities (Kaplan et al., 2009; Klein Goldewijk et al., 2011).

- 612 Our reconstructions have two major implications. First, past human-fire relationships were
- 613 multifaceted. Hunter-gatherer subsistence strategies in the CEL seem to have altered natural fire
- regimes beyond the local scale despite low population densities, supporting previous hypotheses
- 615 (Kaplan et al., 2016; White, 2013). In agrarian societies, millennial CHAR composite anomalies
- 616 seem closely associated with cultural land use strategies, which is difficult, but possible to
- 617 parameterize in fire models (Lasslop and Kloster, 2017; Pfeiffer et al., 2013).
- 618 Second, our millennial scale paleofire perspective provides long-term background information on the
- 619 interplay of natural and human drivers of land-cover change, a prerequisite to inform future land
- 620 management and nature conservation efforts (Whitlock et al., 2018). At the spatial scales relevant to
- 621 political decisions in the CEL, the last millennium seems key to understanding the preconditions that

622 determine future fire risks. Although during the last century only minor fire events have occurred in 623 the CEL compared to other areas of the world, forest cover is expected to increase in the future and 624 fuel will accumulate in widespread human-planted pine and spruce monocultures (Caudullo et al., 625 2016; Houston Durrant et al., 2016). Future climate change scenarios predict drier and warmer 626 summers, and the frequency of natural ignition by lightning might increase (Douville and Plazzotta, 627 2017; Lhotka et al., 2018; Romps et al., 2014). These factors increase fire hazard and fire risk 628 (Hardy, 2005), leading to a much more flammable landscape—a situation comparable to the early 629 Holocene. Our study supports previous suggestions that natural and/or human-driven substitution of 630 flammable coniferous for broadleaf forests could outpace the increasing fire danger in the continental 631 and hemiboreal CEL (Feurdean et al., 2017).

632 Acknowledgements

633 We thank J. Gadziszewska, S. Lauterbach, M. Wieckowska-Lüth for contributing charcoal data and 634 C. Herking for the unpublished pollen record of lake Wustrow. M. Metzger provided the 635 environmental stratification PCs for regional grouping. This is a contribution of the Virtual 636 Helmholtz Institute of Integrated Climate and Landscape Evolution Analyses (ICLEA), grant number 637 VH-VI-415. The study was developed as part of the Global Paleofire Working Group phase 2 638 (GPWG2) that is supported by Past Global Changes, which received funding from the US National 639 Science Foundation and the Swiss Academy of Sciences. Research was provided by the Poland 640 National Science Center grants no. 2015/17/B/ST10/03430, 2015/17/B/ST10/01656, NN305 062 641 240, NN306 061740 (by J. Mirosław-Grabowska), NN306 228039 (by E. Zawisza), 2P04G 049 29 642 (M.O.), Swiss grant PSPB-013/2010 through the Swiss Contribution to the enlarged European Union, 643 the Swiss Government Excellence Postdoctoral Scholarship for the year 2016/2017 to K.M., project 644 FIRECO 2016.0310, and the Scientific Exchange Program from the Swiss Contribution to the New 645 Member States of the European Union (Sciex-NMSch)-SCIEX Scholarship Fund, project RE-FIRE

646	12.286, the statutory funds of the W. Szafer Institute of Botany, Polish Academy of Sciences and of
647	the University of Guelph530-L145-D581-17; by the Polish Ministry of Science and Higher Education
648	under subsidy granted to the Faculty of Biology and Chemistry University of Bialystok for R&D and
649	related tasks aimed at development of young scientists and PhD students; by the German Research
650	Foundation (DFG) grants RE3994-1/1 and FE-1096/4-1, grants S-MIP-17-133 from the Research
651	Council of Lithuania, Y5-AZ03-ZF-N-110, ZD2010/AZ03, AAP2016/B041 of the Latvian National
652	basic funding and the Latvian Council of Science project No. LZP-2018/1-0171, and the Estonian
653	Research Council grant no. IUT1-8. The text benefited from discussions with N. Dräger, and M.
654	Dietze. K. Cook and R. Dennen (rd-editing.com) improved English phrasing.

655 **Data Availability**

- 656 Charcoal data of this study will be available via the Global Charcoal Database, hosted by the
- 657 Laboratoire Chrono-environnement (UMR 6249 du CNRS) at the University of Bourgogne /
- 658 Franche-Comté (Besançon, France): https://paleofire.org/index.php.

659 Author Contributions

- ED, MT, MS and BV designed the study. MT, ML, IF, SJ, PK, ML, LG, KM, MKK, TG, MO, AP,
- MS, NS, JS, MS, SV, AW, DW, and MW provided charcoal data, AW, AP, and JW provided pollen
- data. ED and MT performed the data analyses of charcoal and pollen data. JV analyzed Baltic age-
- depth models. KR analyzed CCSM3-TraCE21k model output. All authors participated in the data
- 664 interpretation. ED wrote the paper with contributions from all authors.

665 **References**

- Adolf, C., Wunderle, S., Colombaroli, D., Weber, H., Gobet, E., Heiri, O., Leeuwen, J.F.N.v., Bigler,
- 667 C., Connor, S.E., Gałka, M., Mantia, T.L., Makhortykh, S., Svitavská-Svobodová, H., Vannière, B.,

- 668 Tinner, W., Poulter, B., 2018. The sedimentary and remote-sensing reflection of biomass burning in
- 669 Europe. Global Ecology and Biogeography 27, 199-212.
- 670 Allen, C.D., 2007. Interactions Across Spatial Scales among Forest Dieback, Fire, and Erosion in
- 671 Northern New Mexico Landscapes. Ecosystems 10, 797-808.
- 672 Archibald, S., Lehmann, C.E.R., Gómez-Dans, J.L., Bradstock, R.A., 2013. Defining pyromes and
- 673 global syndromes of fire regimes. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 110, 6442-6447.
- Arneth, A., Sitch, S., Pongratz, J., Stocker, B.D., Ciais, P., Poulter, B., Bayer, A.D., Bondeau, A.,
- 675 Calle, L., Chini, L.P., Gasser, T., Fader, M., Friedlingstein, P., Kato, E., Li, W., Lindeskog, M.,
- Nabel, J.E.M.S., Pugh, T.A.M., Robertson, E., Viovy, N., Yue, C., Zaehle, S., 2017. Historical
- 677 carbon dioxide emissions caused by land-use changes are possibly larger than assumed. Nature678 Geosci 10, 79-84.
- Balch, J.K., Bradley, B.A., Abatzoglou, J.T., Nagy, R.C., Fusco, E.J., Mahood, A.L., 2017. Humanstarted wildfires expand the fire niche across the United States. Proceedings of the National Academy
 of Sciences 114, 2946-2951.
- Birks, H.J.B., 2005. Mind the gap: how open were European primeval forests? Trends in Ecology &
 Evolution 20, 154-156.
- 684 Bishop, R.R., Church, M.J., Rowley-Conwy, P.A., 2015. Firewood, food and human niche
- 685 construction: the potential role of Mesolithic hunter–gatherers in actively structuring Scotland's
- 686 woodlands. Quaternary Science Reviews 108, 51-75.
- 687 Blaauw, M., 2010. Methods and code for 'classical' age-modelling of radiocarbon sequences.
- 688 Quaternary Geochronology 5, 512-518.

- Blarquez, O., Ali, A.A., Girardin, M.P., Grondin, P., Fréchette, B., Bergeron, Y., Hély, C., 2015.
- Regional paleofire regimes affected by non-uniform climate, vegetation and human drivers. ScientificReports 5, 13356.
- Blarquez, O., Vannière, B., Marlon, J.R., Daniau, A.-L., Power, M.J., Brewer, S., Bartlein, P.J., 2014.
- 693 paleofire: An R package to analyse sedimentary charcoal records from the Global Charcoal Database
- to reconstruct past biomass burning. Computers & Geosciences 72, 255-261.
- 695 Bodí, M.B., Martin, D.A., Balfour, V.N., Santín, C., Doerr, S.H., Pereira, P., Cerdà, A., Mataix-
- 696 Solera, J., 2014. Wildland fire ash: Production, composition and eco-hydro-geomorphic effects.
- 697 Earth-Science Reviews 130, 103-127.
- Bowman, D.M.J.S., Balch, J., Artaxo, P., Bond, W.J., Cochrane, M.A., D'Antonio, C.M., DeFries,
- 699 R., Johnston, F.H., Keeley, J.E., Krawchuk, M.A., Kull, C.A., Mack, M., Moritz, M.A., Pyne, S.,
- Roos, C.I., Scott, A.C., Sodhi, N.S., Swetnam, T.W., 2011. The human dimension of fire regimes on
- Earth. Journal of Biogeography 38, 2223-2236.
- 702 Bowman, D.M.J.S., Balch, J.K., Artaxo, P., Bond, W.J., Carlson, J.M., Cochrane, M.A., D'Antonio,
- 703 C.M., DeFries, R.S., Doyle, J.C., Harrison, S.P., Johnston, F.H., Keeley, J.E., Krawchuk, M.A., Kull,
- C.A., Marston, J.B., Moritz, M.A., Prentice, I.C., Roos, C.I., Scott, A.C., Swetnam, T.W., van der
- Werf, G.R., Pyne, S.J., 2009. Fire in the Earth System. Science 324, 481-484.
- Brown, K.J., Giesecke, T., 2014. Holocene fire disturbance in the boreal forest of central Sweden.
 Boreas 43, 639-651.
- 708 Caudullo, G., Tinner, W., de Rigo, D., 2016. Picea abies in Europe: distribution, habitat, usage and
- threats, in: San-Miguel-Ayanz, J., de Rigo, D., Caudullo, G., Houston Durrant, T., Mauri, A. (Eds.),

- European Atlas of Forest Tree Species. Publications Office of the European Union, Luxembourg, p.
 e012300+.
- 712 Christian, H.J., Blakeslee, R.J., Boccippio, D.J., Boeck, W.L., Buechler, D.E., Driscoll, K.T.,
- 713 Goodman, S.J., Hall, J.M., Koshak, W.J., Mach, D.M., Stewart, M.F., 2003. Global frequency and
- 714 distribution of lightning as observed from space by the Optical Transient Detector. Journal of
- 715 Geophysical Research: Atmospheres 108, ACL 4-1-ACL 4-15.
- 716 Daniau, A.L., Bartlein, P.J., Harrison, S.P., Prentice, I.C., Brewer, S., Friedlingstein, P., Harrison-
- 717 Prentice, T.I., Inoue, J., Izumi, K., Marlon, J.R., Mooney, S., Power, M.J., Stevenson, J., Tinner, W.,
- 718 Andrič, M., Atanassova, J., Behling, H., Black, M., Blarquez, O., Brown, K.J., Carcaillet, C.,
- 719 Colhoun, E.A., Colombaroli, D., Davis, B.A.S., D'Costa, D., Dodson, J., Dupont, L., Eshetu, Z.,
- 720 Gavin, D.G., Genries, A., Haberle, S., Hallett, D.J., Hope, G., Horn, S.P., Kassa, T.G., Katamura, F.,
- 721 Kennedy, L.M., Kershaw, P., Krivonogov, S., Long, C., Magri, D., Marinova, E., McKenzie, G.M.,
- Moreno, P.I., Moss, P., Neumann, F.H., Norström, E., Paitre, C., Rius, D., Roberts, N., Robinson,
- 723 G.S., Sasaki, N., Scott, L., Takahara, H., Terwilliger, V., Thevenon, F., Turner, R., Valsecchi, V.G.,
- Vannière, B., Walsh, M., Williams, N., Zhang, Y., 2012. Predictability of biomass burning in
- response to climate changes. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 26, GB4007.
- 726 Dietze, E., Słowiński, M., Zawiska, I., Veh, G., Brauer, A., 2016. Multiple drivers of Holocene lake
- 127 level changes at a lowland lake in northeastern Germany. Boreas 45, 828-845.
- 728 Dörfler, W., Feeser, I., van den Bogaard, C., Dreibrodt, S., Erlenkeuser, H., Kleinmann, A., Merkt, J.,
- 729 Wiethold, J., 2012. A high-quality annually laminated sequence from Lake Belau, Northern
- 730 Germany: Revised chronology and its implications for palynological and tephrochronological
- 731 studies. The Holocene 22, 1413-1426.

Douville, H., Plazzotta, M., 2017. Midlatitude Summer Drying: An Underestimated Threat in CMIP5
Models? Geophysical Research Letters 44, 9967-9975.

734 Dreibrodt, S., Lubos, C., Terhorst, B., Damm, B., Bork, H.R., 2010. Historical soil erosion by water

- in Germany: Scales and archives, chronology, research perspectives. Quaternary International 222,
 80-95.
- Dreibrodt, S., Wiethold, J., 2015. Lake Belau and its catchment (northern Germany): A key archive
 of environmental history in northern central Europe since the onset of agriculture. The Holocene 25,
 296-322.
- 740 EUFORGEN, 2018. Picea abies, Norway spruce. Europen Forest Genetic Ressource Programme of

741 European Forest Institute (EFI), http://www.euforgen.org/species/picea-abies/.

742 FAO, 2007. Fire management - global assessment 2006. FAO, Rome.

743 Feeser, I., Dörfler, W., 2014. The glade effect: Vegetation openness and structure and their influences

on arboreal pollen production and the reconstruction of anthropogenic forest opening. Anthropocene8, 92-100.

746 Feeser, I., Dörfler, W., 2015. The Early Neolithic in pollen diagrams from eastern Schleswig-

747 Holstein and western Mecklenburg – evidence for a 1000 years cultural adaptive cycle?, in:

- 748 Kabaciński, J., Hartz, S., Raemaekers, D.C.M., Terberger, T. (Eds.), The Dąbki Site in Pomerania
- and the Neolithisation of the North European Lowlands (c. 5000–3000 calBC). Marie Leidorf GmbH,

750 Rahden/Westf., pp. 291-306.

- 751 Feeser, I., Dörfler, W., Averdieck, F.R., Wiethold, J., 2012. New insight into regional and local land-
- vse and vegetation patterns in eastern Schleswig-Holstein during the Neolithic, Siedlung,

- 753 Grabenwerk, Großsteingrab. Studien zu Gesellschaft, Wirtschaft und Umwelt der
- 754 Trichterbechergruppen im nördlichen Mitteleuropa., Bonn, pp. 159-190.
- 755 Feurdean, A., Veski, S., Florescu, G., Vannière, B., Pfeiffer, M., O'Hara, R.B., Stivrins, N., Amon,
- L., Heinsalu, A., Vassiljev, J., Hickler, T., 2017. Broadleaf deciduous forest counterbalanced the
- 757 direct effect of climate on Holocene fire regime in hemiboreal/boreal region (NE Europe).
- 758 Quaternary Science Reviews 169, 378-390.
- 759 Flannigan, M.D., Krawchuk, M.A., de Groot, W.J., Wotton, B.M., Gowman, L.M., 2009.
- 760 Implications of changing climate for global wildland fire. International Journal of Wildland Fire 18,761 483-507.
- 762 Gałka, M., Miotk-Szpiganowicz, G., Goslar, T., Jęśko, M., van der Knaap, W.O., Lamentowicz, M.,
- 763 2013. Palaeohydrology, fires and vegetation succession in the southern Baltic during the last 7500
- years reconstructed from a raised bog based on multi-proxy data. Palaeogeography,
- 765 Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 370, 209-221.
- 766 Gałka, M., Tobolski, K., Zawisza, E., Goslar, T., 2014. Postglacial history of vegetation, human
- 767 activity and lake-level changes at Jezioro Linówek in northeast Poland, based on multi-proxy data.
- 768 Veget Hist Archaeobot 23, 123-152.
- Giesecke, T., Bennett, K.D., 2004. The Holocene spread of Picea abies (L.) Karst. in Fennoscandia
 and adjacent areas. Journal of Biogeography 31, 1523-1548.
- 771 Giesecke, T., Davis, B., Brewer, S., Finsinger, W., Wolters, S., Blaauw, M., de Beaulieu, J.-L.,
- Binney, H., Fyfe, R.M., Gaillard, M.-J., Gil-Romera, G., van der Knaap, W.O., Kuneš, P., Kühl, N.,
- van Leeuwen, J.F.N., Leydet, M., Lotter, A.F., Ortu, E., Semmler, M., Bradshaw, R.H.W., 2014.

- Towards mapping the late Quaternary vegetation change of Europe. Veget Hist Archaeobot 23, 75-86.
- Guyette, R.P., Muzika, R.M., Dey, D.C., 2002. Dynamics of an Anthropogenic Fire Regime.

777 Ecosystems 5, 472-486.

- Haldon, J., 2016. Cooling and societal change. Nature Geoscience 9, 191.
- Hardy, C.C., 2005. Wildland fire hazard and risk: Problems, definitions, and context. Forest Ecology
 and Management 211, 73-82.
- 781 Harrison, S.P., Bartlein, P.J., Brovkin, V., Houweling, S., Kloster, S., Prentice, I.C., 2018. The

biomass burning contribution to climate-carbon cycle feedback. Earth Syst. Dynam. Discuss. 2018,
1-22.

- Harrison, S.P., Prentice, I.C., Guiot, J., 1993. Climatic controls on Holocene lake-level changes in
 Europe. Clim Dyn 8, 189-200.
- Harrison, S.P., Saarse, L., 1992. Holocene lake-level changes in the eastern Baltic region, in: Kaare,
- 787 T., Mardiste, H., Merikalju, L., Punning, J.-M. (Eds.), Estonia: man and nature. Estonian Academy of
- 788 Sciences and Estonian Geographical Society, Tallinn, pp. 6-20.
- 789 Helama, S., Jones, P.D., Briffa, K.R., 2017. Dark Ages Cold Period: A literature review and
- directions for future research. The Holocene 27, 1600-1606.
- 791 Hoffmann, T., Schlummer, M., Notebaert, B., Verstraeten, G., Korup, O., 2013. Carbon burial in soil
- result sediments from Holocene agricultural erosion, Central Europe. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 27,

793 828-835.

- Holst, D., 2010. Hazelnut economy of early Holocene hunter–gatherers: a case study from Mesolithic
- 795 Duvensee, northern Germany. Journal of Archaeological Science 37, 2871-2880.
- Houston Durrant, T., de Rigo, D., Caudullo, G., 2016. Pinus sylvestris in Europe: distribution,
- habitat, usage and threats., in: San-Miguel-Ayanz, J., de Rigo, D., Caudullo, G., Houston Durrant, T.,
- Mauri, A. (Eds.), European Atlas of Forest Tree Species. Publications Office of the European Union,
- 799 Luxembourg, p. e016b094+.
- Jaffé, R., Ding, Y., Niggemann, J., Vähätalo, A.V., Stubbins, A., Spencer, R.G.M., Campbell, J.,
- 801 Dittmar, T., 2013. Global Charcoal Mobilization from Soils via Dissolution and Riverine Transport
- 802 to the Oceans. Science 340, 345-347.
- Jahns, S., 1999. Pollenanalytische Untersuchungen am Großen Krebssee, Ostbrandenburg. Ein
 Beitrag zur Siedlungs- und Vegetationsgeschichte der Neuenhagener Oderinsel. Germania 77, 637659.
- Jahns, S., 2000. Late-glacial and Holocene woodland dynamics and land-use history of the Lower
 Oder valley, north-eastern Germany, based on two, AMS14C-dated, pollen profiles. Veget Hist
 Archaeobot 9, 111-123.
- 809 Kaplan, J.O., Krumhardt, K., Gaillard, M.-J., Sugita, S., Trondman, A.-K., Fyfe, R., Marquer, L.,
- 810 Mazier, F., Nielsen, A., 2017. Constraining the Deforestation History of Europe: Evaluation of
- 811 Historical Land Use Scenarios with Pollen-Based Land Cover Reconstructions. Land 6, 91.
- Kaplan, J.O., Krumhardt, K.M., Ellis, E.C., Ruddiman, W.F., Lemmen, C., Goldewijk, K.K., 2011.
 Holocene carbon emissions as a result of anthropogenic land cover change. The Holocene 21, 775-
- 814 791.

- 815 Kaplan, J.O., Krumhardt, K.M., Zimmermann, N., 2009. The prehistoric and preindustrial
- 816 deforestation of Europe. Quaternary Science Reviews 28, 3016-3034.
- Kaplan, J.O., Pfeiffer, M., Kolen, J.C.A., Davis, B.A.S., 2016. Large Scale Anthropogenic Reduction
 of Forest Cover in Last Glacial Maximum Europe. PLOS ONE 11, e0166726.
- 819 Klein Goldewijk, K., Beusen, A., van Drecht, G., de Vos, M., 2011. The HYDE 3.1 spatially explicit
- database of human-induced global land-use change over the past 12,000 years. Global Ecology and
 Biogeography 20, 73-86.
- 822 Krause-Kyora, B., Makarewicz, C., Evin, A., Flink, L.G., Dobney, K., Larson, G., Hartz, S.,
- 823 Schreiber, S., von Carnap-Bornheim, C., von Wurmb-Schwark, N., Nebel, A., 2013. Use of
- domesticated pigs by Mesolithic hunter-gatherers in northwestern Europe. Nature Communications 4,
 2348.
- 826 Küster, M., 2014. Holozäne Landschaftsentwicklung der Mecklenburgischen Seenplatte: Relief- und
- 827 Bodengenese, hydrologische Entwicklung sowie Siedlungs- und Landnutzungsgeschichte in
- 828 Nordostdeutschland. Universität Greifswald, Greifswald, p. 304.
- 829 Lamentowicz, M., Obremska, M., Mitchell, E.A.D., 2008. Autogenic succession, land-use change,
- and climatic influences on the Holocene development of a kettle-hole mire in Northern Poland.
- Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 151, 21-40.
- 832 Laskar, J., Robutel, P., Joutel, F., Gastineau, M., Correia, A.C.M., Levrard, B., 2004. A long-term
- numerical solution for the insolation quantities of the Earth. A&A 428, 261-285.
- 834 Lasslop, G., Kloster, S., 2017. Human impact on wildfires varies between regions and with
- 835 vegetation productivity. Environmental Research Letters 12, 115011.

- Latałowa, M., 1992. Man and vegetation in the pollen diagrams from Wolin Island (NW Poland).
 Acta Palaeobotanica 32, 123-249.
- Latałowa, M., Pędziszewska, A., Maciejewska, E., Święta-Musznicka, J., 2013. Tilia forest
- 839 dynamics, Kretzschmaria deusta attack, and mire hydrology as palaeoecological proxies for mid-
- 840 Holocene climate reconstruction in the Kashubian Lake District (N Poland). The Holocene 23, 667-841 677.
- 842 Lauterbach, S., Brauer, A., Andersen, N., Danielopol, D.L., Dulski, P., HÜLs, M., Milecka, K.,
- 843 Namiotko, T., Plessen, B., Grafenstein, U.V., Participants, D., 2011. Multi-proxy evidence for early
- to mid-Holocene environmental and climatic changes in northeastern Poland. Boreas 40, 57-72.
- Leys, B., Philip, E.H., Kendra, K.M., Paul, V.D., 2016. Wildfires and geochemical change in a
 subalpine forest over the past six millennia. Environmental Research Letters 11, 125003.
- Lhotka, O., Kyselý, J., Farda, A., 2018. Climate change scenarios of heat waves in Central Europe
 and their uncertainties. Theoretical and Applied Climatology 131, 1043-1054.
- 849 Lindner, M., Maroschek, M., Netherer, S., Kremer, A., Barbati, A., Garcia-Gonzalo, J., Seidl, R.,
- 850 Delzon, S., Corona, P., Kolström, M., Lexer, M.J., Marchetti, M., 2010. Climate change impacts,
- adaptive capacity, and vulnerability of European forest ecosystems. Forest Ecology and Management
 259, 698-709.
- Liu, Z., Otto-Bliesner, B.L., He, F., Brady, E.C., Tomas, R., Clark, P.U., Carlson, A.E., Lynch-
- 854 Stieglitz, J., Curry, W., Brook, E., Erickson, D., Jacob, R., Kutzbach, J., Cheng, J., 2009. Transient
- 855 Simulation of Last Deglaciation with a New Mechanism for Bølling-Allerød Warming. Science 325,

856 310-314.

- 857 Madeja, J., Wacnik, A., Wypasek, E., Chandran, A., Stankiewicz, E., 2010. Integrated palynological
- and molecular analyses of late Holocene deposits from Lake Miłkowskie (NE Poland): Verification
- of local human impact on environment. Quaternary International 220, 147-152.
- 860 Marcisz, K., Gałka, M., Pietrala, P., Miotk-Szpiganowicz, G., Obremska, M., Tobolski, K.,
- 861 Lamentowicz, M., 2017. Fire activity and hydrological dynamics in the past 5700 years reconstructed
- 862 from Sphagnum peatlands along the oceanic–continental climatic gradient in northern Poland.
- 863 Quaternary Science Reviews 177, 145-157.
- 864 Marcisz, K., Tinner, W., Colombaroli, D., Kołaczek, P., Słowiński, M., Fiałkiewicz-Kozieł, B.,
- 865 Łokas, E., Lamentowicz, M., 2015. Long-term hydrological dynamics and fire history over the last
- 866 2000 years in CE Europe reconstructed from a high-resolution peat archive. Quaternary Science
- 867 Reviews 112, 138-152.
- 868 Marlon, J.R., Bartlein, P.J., Carcaillet, C., Gavin, D.G., Harrison, S.P., Higuera, P.E., Joos, F.,
- 869 Power, M.J., Prentice, I.C., 2008. Climate and human influences on global biomass burning over the
- 870 past two millennia. Nature Geosci 1, 697-702.
- 871 Marlon, J.R., Bartlein, P.J., Daniau, A.L., Harrison, S.P., Maezumi, S.Y., Power, M.J., Tinner, W.,
- 872 Vanniére, B., 2013. Global biomass burning: A synthesis and review of Holocene paleofire records
- and their controls. Quaternary Science Reviews 65, 5-25.
- 874 Marlon, J.R., Kelly, R., Daniau, A.L., Vannière, B., Power, M.J., Bartlein, P., Higuera, P., Blarquez,
- 875 O., Brewer, S., Brücher, T., Feurdean, A., Romera, G.G., Iglesias, V., Maezumi, S.Y., Magi, B.,
- 876 Courtney Mustaphi, C.J., Zhihai, T., 2016. Reconstructions of biomass burning from sediment-
- 877 charcoal records to improve data-model comparisons. Biogeosciences 13, 3225-3244.

- 878 Marquer, L., Gaillard, M.-J., Sugita, S., Poska, A., Trondman, A.-K., Mazier, F., Nielsen, A.B., Fyfe,
- 879 R.M., Jönsson, A.M., Smith, B., Kaplan, J.O., Alenius, T., Birks, H.J.B., Bjune, A.E., Christiansen,
- J., Dodson, J., Edwards, K.J., Giesecke, T., Herzschuh, U., Kangur, M., Koff, T., Latałowa, M.,
- Lechterbeck, J., Olofsson, J., Seppä, H., 2017. Quantifying the effects of land use and climate on
- Holocene vegetation in Europe. Quaternary Science Reviews 171, 20-37.
- 883 Marsicek, J., Shuman, B.N., Bartlein, P.J., Shafer, S.L., Brewer, S., 2018. Reconciling divergent
- trends and millennial variations in Holocene temperatures. Nature 554, 92.
- Mauri, A., Davis, B.A.S., Collins, P.M., Kaplan, J.O., 2015. The climate of Europe during the
- 886 Holocene: a gridded pollen-based reconstruction and its multi-proxy evaluation. Quaternary Science
- 887 Reviews 112, 109-127.
- 888 McWethy, D.B., Higuera, P.E., Whitlock, C., Veblen, T.T., Bowman, D.M.J.S., Cary, G.J., Haberle,
- 889 S.G., Keane, R.E., Maxwell, B.D., McGlone, M.S., Perry, G.L.W., Wilmshurst, J.M., Holz, A.,
- 890 Tepley, A.J., 2013. A conceptual framework for predicting temperate ecosystem sensitivity to human
- impacts on fire regimes. Global Ecology and Biogeography 22, 900-912.
- 892 Meadows, J., Bērziņš, V., Legzdiņa, D., Lübke, H., Schmölcke, U., Zagorska, I., Zariņa, G., 2016.
- 893 Stone-age subsistence strategies at Lake Burtnieks, Latvia. Journal of Archaeological Science:894 Reports.
- Merz, B., Dung, N.V., Apel, H., Gerlitz, L., Schröter, K., Steirou, E., Vorogushyn, S., 2018. Spatial
- coherence of flood-rich and flood-poor periods across Germany. Journal of Hydrology 559, 813-826.
- 897 Metzger, M.J., Bunce, R.G.H., Jongman, R.H.G., Mücher, C.A., Watkins, J.W., 2005. A climatic
- stratification of the environment of Europe. Global Ecology and Biogeography 14, 549-563.

- 899 Moffa-Sánchez, P., Hall, I.R., 2017. North Atlantic variability and its links to European climate over
- 900 the last 3000 years. Nature Communications 8, 1726.
- 901 Molinari, C., Lehsten, V., Bradshaw, R.H.W., Power, M.J., Harmand, P., Arneth, A., Kaplan, J.O.,
- 902 Vannière, B., Sykes, M.T., 2013. Exploring potential drivers of European biomass burning over the
- Holocene: a data-model analysis. Global Ecology and Biogeography 22, 1248-1260.
- 904 Ohlson, M., Brown, K.J., Birks, H.J.B., Grytnes, J.A., Hörnberg, G., Niklasson, M., Seppä, H.,
- 905 Bradshaw, R.H.W., 2011. Invasion of Norway spruce diversifies the fire regime in boreal European
- 906 forests. Journal of Ecology 99, 395-403.
- 907 Olsson, F., Gaillard, M.-J., Lemdahl, G., Greisman, A., Lanos, P., Marguerie, D., Marcoux, N.,
- 908 Skoglund, P., Wäglind, J., 2010. A continuous record of fire covering the last 10,500 calendar years
- 909 from southern Sweden The role of climate and human activities. Palaeogeography,
- 910 Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 291, 128-141.
- Pausas, J.G., Ribeiro, E., 2013. The global fire–productivity relationship. Global Ecology and
 Biogeography 22, 728-736.
- 913 Pechony, O., Shindell, D.T., 2010. Driving forces of global wildfires over the past millennium and
- the forthcoming century. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 107, 19167-19170.
- 915 Pędziszewska, A., Latałowa, M., 2016. Stand-scale reconstruction of late Holocene forest succession
- 916 on the Gdańsk Upland (N. Poland) based on integrated palynological and macrofossil data from
- 917 paired sites. Veget Hist Archaeobot 25, 239-254.
- 918 Pfeiffer, M., Spessa, A., Kaplan, J.O., 2013. A model for global biomass burning in preindustrial
- 919 time: LPJ-LMfire (v1.0). Geosci. Model Dev. 6, 643-685.

- 920 Poska, A., Saarse, L., 2002. Biostratigraphy and 14C dating of a lake sediment sequence on the
- 921 north-west Estonian carbonaceous plateau, interpreted in terms of human impact in the surroundings.
- 922 Veget Hist Archaeobot 11, 191-200.
- 923 Poska, A., Saarse, L., Veski, S., 2004. Reflections of pre- and early-agrarian human impact in the
- pollen diagrams of Estonia. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 209, 37-50.
- 925 Poska, A., Väli, V., Kama, P., Tomson, P., Vassiljev, J., Kihno, K., 2017. The postglacial history of
- vegetation and land use dynamics in Karula upland, in: Järvet, A. (Ed.), Yearbook of the Estonian
- 927 Geographical Society pp. 25-43.
- 928 Power, M.J., Marlon, J., Ortiz, N., Bartlein, P.J., Harrison, S.P., Mayle, F.E., Ballouche, A.,
- 929 Bradshaw, R.H.W., Carcaillet, C., Cordova, C., Mooney, S., Moreno, P.I., Prentice, I.C., Thonicke,
- 930 K., Tinner, W., Whitlock, C., Zhang, Y., Zhao, Y., Ali, A.A., Anderson, R.S., Beer, R., Behling, H.,
- 931 Briles, C., Brown, K.J., Brunelle, A., Bush, M., Camill, P., Chu, G.Q., Clark, J., Colombaroli, D.,
- 932 Connor, S., Daniau, A.L., Daniels, M., Dodson, J., Doughty, E., Edwards, M.E., Finsinger, W.,
- 933 Foster, D., Frechette, J., Gaillard, M.J., Gavin, D.G., Gobet, E., Haberle, S., Hallett, D.J., Higuera, P.,
- Hope, G., Horn, S., Inoue, J., Kaltenrieder, P., Kennedy, L., Kong, Z.C., Larsen, C., Long, C.J.,
- 935 Lynch, J., Lynch, E.A., McGlone, M., Meeks, S., Mensing, S., Meyer, G., Minckley, T., Mohr, J.,
- 936 Nelson, D.M., New, J., Newnham, R., Noti, R., Oswald, W., Pierce, J., Richard, P.J.H., Rowe, C.,
- 937 Sanchez Goñi, M.F., Shuman, B.N., Takahara, H., Toney, J., Turney, C., Urrego-Sanchez, D.H.,
- 938 Umbanhowar, C., Vandergoes, M., Vanniere, B., Vescovi, E., Walsh, M., Wang, X., Williams, N.,
- 939 Wilmshurst, J., Zhang, J.H., 2008. Changes in fire regimes since the Last Glacial Maximum: an
- 940 assessment based on a global synthesis and analysis of charcoal data. Clim Dyn 30, 887-907.
- 941 Pyne, S.J., 2016. Fire in the mind: Changing understandings of fire in western civilization.
- 942 Philosophical transactions Royal Society. Biological sciences 371, 8.

- 943 Qian, C., Deyong, Y., Matei, G., Zhe, H., Jianguo, W., 2015. Impacts of land use and land cover
- 944 change on regional climate: a case study in the agro-pastoral transitional zone of China.
- 945 Environmental Research Letters 10, 124025.
- 946 Ralska-Jasiewiczowa, M., Goslar, T., Madeyska, T., Starkel, L., 1998. Lake Gosciaz, Central Poland
- 947 A Monographic Study Part 1. W. Szafer Institute of Botany Polish Academy of Sciences, Krakow.
- 948 Randerson, J.T., Liu, H., Flanner, M.G., Chambers, S.D., Jin, Y., Hess, P.G., Pfister, G., Mack, M.C.,
- 949 Treseder, K.K., Welp, L.R., Chapin, F.S., Harden, J.W., Goulden, M.L., Lyons, E., Neff, J.C.,
- Schuur, E.A.G., Zender, C.S., 2006. The Impact of Boreal Forest Fire on Climate Warming. Science
 314, 1130-1132.
- Rehfeld, K., Laepple, T., 2016. Warmer and wetter or warmer and dryer? Observed versus simulated
 covariability of Holocene temperature and rainfall in Asia. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 436,
 1-9.
- 955 Reimer, P.J., Bard, E., Bayliss, A., Beck, J.W., Blackwell, P.G., Bronk Ramsey, C., Buck, C.E.,
- 956 Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., Friedrich, M., Grootes, P.M., Guilderson, T.P., Haflidason, H., Hajdas, I.,
- 957 Hatté, C., Heaton, T.J., Hoffmann, D.L., Hogg, A.G., Hughen, K.A., Kaiser, K.F., Kromer, B.,
- 958 Manning, S.W., Niu, M., Reimer, R.W., Richards, D.A., Scott, E.M., Southon, J.R., Staff, R.A.,
- 959 Turney, C.S.M., van der Plicht, J., 2013. IntCal13 and Marine13 Radiocarbon Age Calibration
- 960 Curves 0–50,000 Years cal BP. Radiocarbon 55, 1869–1887.
- 961 Reitalu, T., Seppä, H., Sugita, S., Kangur, M., Koff, T., Avel, E., Kihno, K., Vassiljev, J., Renssen,
- 962 H., Hammarlund, D., Heikkilä, M., Saarse, L., Poska, A., Veski, S., 2013. Long-term drivers of forest
- 963 composition in a boreonemoral region: the relative importance of climate and human impact. Journal
- 964 of Biogeography 40, 1524-1534.

- 965 Rimantiene, R., 1992. The Neolithic of the eastern Baltic. Journal of World Prehistory 6, 97-143.
- Rius, D., Vannière, B., Galop, D., Richard, H., 2011. Holocene fire regime changes from multiplesite sedimentary charcoal analyses in the Lourdes basin (Pyrenees, France). Quaternary Science
- 968 Reviews 30, 1696-1709.
- 969 Roberts, N., Fyfe, R.M., Woodbridge, J., Gaillard, M.J., Davis, B.A.S., Kaplan, J.O., Marquer, L.,
- 970 Mazier, F., Nielsen, A.B., Sugita, S., Trondman, A.K., Leydet, M., 2018. Europe's lost forests: a
- 971 pollen-based synthesis for the last 11,000 years. Scientific Reports 8, 716.
- 872 Robin, V., Nelle, O., 2014. Contribution to the reconstruction of central European fire history, based
- 973 on the soil charcoal analysis of study sites in northern and central Germany. Veget Hist Archaeobot
- 974 23, 51-65.
- 975 Roebroeks, W., Villa, P., 2011. On the earliest evidence for habitual use of fire in Europe.
- 976 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 108, 5209-5214.
- 977 Rogers, B.M., Soja, A.J., Goulden, M.L., Randerson, J.T., 2015. Influence of tree species on
- 978 continental differences in boreal fires and climate feedbacks. Nature Geosci 8, 228-234.
- 879 Romps, D.M., Seeley, J.T., Vollaro, D., Molinari, J., 2014. Projected increase in lightning strikes in
 800 the United States due to global warming. Science 346, 851-854.
- Ruddiman, W.F., 2013. The Anthropocene. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences 41, 45-68.
- Ruddiman, W.F., Ellis, E.C., Kaplan, J.O., Fuller, D.Q., 2015. Defining the epoch we live in. Science
 348, 38-39.

- Rust, W., Holman, I., Corstanje, R., Bloomfield, J., Cuthbert, M., 2018. A conceptual model for
 climatic teleconnection signal control on groundwater variability in Europe. Earth-Science Reviews
 177, 164-174.
- 988 Salonen, J.S., Ilvonen, L., Seppä, H., Holmström, L., Telford, R.J., Gaidamavičius, A., Stančikaitė,
- 989 M., Subetto, D., 2012. Comparing different calibration methods (WA/WA-PLS regression and
- 990 Bayesian modelling) and different-sized calibration sets in pollen-based quantitative climate
- reconstruction. The Holocene 22, 413-424.
- 992 San-Miguel-Ayanz, J., Schulte, E., Schmuck, G., Camia, A., Strobl, P., Libertà, G., Giovando, C.,
- Boca, R., Sedano, F., Kempeneers, P., McInerney, D., Withmore, C., de Oliveira, S., Rodrigues, M.,
- Houston Durrant, T., Corti, P., Oehler, F., Vilar, L., Amatulli, G., 2012. Comprehensive monitoring
- 995 of wildfires in Europe: the European Forest Fire Information System (EFFIS), in: Tiefenbacher, J.
- 996 (Ed.), Approaches to Managing Disaster Assessing Hazards, Emergencies and Disaster Impacts.
- 997 InTech, http://effis.jrc.ec.europa.eu/.
- 998 Schimel, D., Baker, D., 2002. The wildfire factor. Nature 420, 29.
- Shuman, B., Pribyl, P., Minckley, T.A., Shinker, J.J., 2010. Rapid hydrologic shifts and prolonged
 droughts in Rocky Mountain headwaters during the Holocene. Geophysical Research Letters 37,
 L06701.
- 1002 Silva, F., Vander Linden, M., 2017. Amplitude of travelling front as inferred from 14C predicts
- 1003 levels of genetic admixture among European early farmers. Scientific Reports 7, 11985.
- 1004 Smolska, E., 2011. Relation between radiocarbon, archaeological dating and sediment properties on
- 1005 the example of colluvial deposits (NE Poland). Geochronometria 38, 325-333.

- 1006 Strandberg, G., Kjellström, E., Poska, A., Wagner, S., Gaillard, M.J., Trondman, A.K., Mauri, A.,
- 1007 Davis, B.A.S., Kaplan, J.O., Birks, H.J.B., Bjune, A.E., Fyfe, R., Giesecke, T., Kalnina, L., Kangur,
- 1008 M., van der Knaap, W.O., Kokfelt, U., Kuneš, P., Lata\l owa, M., Marquer, L., Mazier, F., Nielsen,
- 1009 A.B., Smith, B., Seppä, H., Sugita, S., 2014. Regional climate model simulations for Europe at 6 and
- 1010 0.2 k BP: sensitivity to changes in anthropogenic deforestation. Clim. Past 10, 661-680.
- 1011 Stroeven, A.P., Hättestrand, C., Kleman, J., Heyman, J., Fabel, D., Fredin, O., Goodfellow, B.W.,
- 1012 Harbor, J.M., Jansen, J.D., Olsen, L., Caffee, M.W., Fink, D., Lundqvist, J., Rosqvist, G.C.,
- 1013 Strömberg, B., Jansson, K.N., 2016. Deglaciation of Fennoscandia. Quaternary Science Reviews 147,
- 1014 91-121.
- 1015 Sugita, S., 2007. Theory of quantitative reconstruction of vegetation I: pollen from large sites
- 1016 REVEALS regional vegetation composition. The Holocene 17, 229-241.
- 1017 Syphard, A.D., Keeley, J.E., Pfaff, A.H., Ferschweiler, K., 2017. Human presence diminishes the
- 1018 importance of climate in driving fire activity across the United States. Proceedings of the National1019 Academy of Sciences.
- 1020 Theuerkauf, M., Couwenberg, J., Kuparinen, A., Liebscher, V., 2016. A matter of dispersal:
- 1021 REVEALSinR introduces state-of-the-art dispersal models to quantitative vegetation reconstruction.
- 1022 Veget Hist Archaeobot, 1-13.
- 1023 Trondman, A.K., Gaillard, M.J., Mazier, F., Sugita, S., Fyfe, R., Nielsen, A.B., Twiddle, C., Barratt,
- 1024 P., Birks, H.J.B., Bjune, A.E., Björkman, L., Broström, A., Caseldine, C., David, R., Dodson, J.,
- 1025 Dörfler, W., Fischer, E., van Geel, B., Giesecke, T., Hultberg, T., Kalnina, L., Kangur, M., van der
- 1026 Knaap, P., Koff, T., Kuneš, P., Lagerås, P., Latałowa, M., Lechterbeck, J., Leroyer, C., Leydet, M.,
- 1027 Lindbladh, M., Marquer, L., Mitchell, F.J.G., Odgaard, B.V., Peglar, S.M., Persson, T., Poska, A.,

- 1028 Rösch, M., Seppä, H., Veski, S., Wick, L., 2015. Pollen-based quantitative reconstructions of
- 1029 Holocene regional vegetation cover (plant-functional types and land-cover types) in Europe suitable
- 1030 for climate modelling. Global Change Biology 21, 676-697.
- 1031 Väliranta, M., Salonen, J.S., Heikkilä, M., Amon, L., Helmens, K., Klimaschewski, A., Kuhry, P.,
- 1032 Kultti, S., Poska, A., Shala, S., Veski, S., Birks, H.H., 2015. Plant macrofossil evidence for an early
- 1033 onset of the Holocene summer thermal maximum in northernmost Europe. Nature Communications1034 6, 6809.
- 1035 van der Werf, G.R., Peters, W., van Leeuwen, T.T., Giglio, L., 2013. What could have caused pre-
- 1036 industrial biomass burning emissions to exceed current rates? Clim. Past 9, 289-306.
- 1037 Vannière, B., Blarquez, O., Rius, D., Doyen, E., Brücher, T., Colombaroli, D., Connor, S., Feurdean,
- 1038 A., Hickler, T., Kaltenrieder, P., Lemmen, C., Leys, B., Massa, C., Olofsson, J., 2016. 7000-year
- human legacy of elevation-dependent European fire regimes. Quaternary Science Reviews 132, 206-212.
- 1041 Vannière, B., Power, M.J., Roberts, N., Tinner, W., Carrión, J., Magny, M., Bartlein, P.,
- 1042 Colombaroli, D., Daniau, A.L., Finsinger, W., Gil-Romera, G., Kaltenrieder, P., Pini, R., Sadori, L.,
- 1043 Turner, R., Valsecchi, V., Vescovi, E., 2011. Circum-Mediterranean fire activity and climate changes
- 1044 during the mid-Holocene environmental transition (8500-2500 cal. BP). The Holocene 21, 53-73.
- 1045 Wacnik, A., 2009. From foraging to farming in the Great Mazurian Lake District: palynological
- 1046 studies on Lake Miłkowskie sediments, northeast Poland. Veget Hist Archaeobot 18, 187-203.
- 1047 Wacnik, A., Goslar, T., Czernik, J., 2012. Vegetation changes caused by agricultural societies in the
- 1048 Great Mazurian Lake District. Acta Palaeobotanica 52, 59–104.

- 1049 Wacnik, A., Ralska-Jasiewiczowa, M., Madeyska, E., 2011. Late Glacial and Holocene history of
- 1050 vegetation in Gostynin area, central Poland. Acta Palaeobotanica 51, 249–278.
- 1051 Wacnik, A., Tylmann, W., Bonk, A., Goslar, T., Enters, D., Meyer-Jacob, C., Grosjean, M., 2016.
- 1052 Determining the responses of vegetation to natural processes and human impacts in north-eastern
- 1053 Poland during the last millennium: combined pollen, geochemical and historical data. Veget Hist
- 1054 Archaeobot 25, 479–498.
- 1055 Wanner, H., Beer, J., Bütikofer, J., Crowley, T.J., Cubasch, U., Flückiger, J., Goosse, H., Grosjean,
- 1056 M., Joos, F., Kaplan, J.O., Küttel, M., Müller, S.A., Prentice, I.C., Solomina, O., Stocker, T.F.,
- 1057 Tarasov, P., Wagner, M., Widmann, M., 2008. Mid- to Late Holocene climate change: an overview.
- 1058 Quaternary Science Reviews 27, 1791-1828.
- 1059 Ward, D.S., Shevliakova, E., Malyshev, S., Rabin, S., 2018. Trends and Variability of Global Fire
- 1060 Emissions Due To Historical Anthropogenic Activities. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 32, 122-142.
- 1061 Warden, L., Moros, M., Neumann, T., Shennan, S., Timpson, A., Manning, K., Sollai, M., Wacker,
- 1062 L., Perner, K., Häusler, K., Leipe, T., Zillén, L., Kotilainen, A., Jansen, E., Schneider, R.R., Oeberst,
- 1063 R., Arz, H., Sinninghe Damsté, J.S., 2017. Climate induced human demographic and cultural change
- 1064 in northern Europe during the mid-Holocene. Scientific Reports 7, 15251.
- 1065 Waters, C.N., Zalasiewicz, J., Summerhayes, C., Barnosky, A.D., Poirier, C., Gałuszka, A., Cearreta,
- 1066 A., Edgeworth, M., Ellis, E.C., Ellis, M., Jeandel, C., Leinfelder, R., McNeill, J.R., Richter, D.d.,
- 1067 Steffen, W., Syvitski, J., Vidas, D., Wagreich, M., Williams, M., Zhisheng, A., Grinevald, J., Odada,
- 1068 E., Oreskes, N., Wolfe, A.P., 2016. The Anthropocene is functionally and stratigraphically distinct
- 1069 from the Holocene. Science 351.
- 1070 White, S., 2013. Grass páramo as hunter-gatherer landscape. The Holocene 23, 898-915.

- 1071 Whitlock, C., Colombaroli, D., Conedera, M., Tinner, W., 2018. Land-use history as a guide for
- 1072 forest conservation and management. Conservation Biology 32, 84-97.
- 1073 Whitlock, C., Larsen, C., 2001. Charcoal as a Fire Proxy, in: Smol, J.P., Birks, H.J.B., Last, W.M.
- 1074 (Eds.), Tracking Environmental Change Using Lake Sediments. Terrestrial, Algal, and Siliceous
- 1075 Indicators. KluwerAcademic Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, pp. 75-97.
- 1076 Woodward, C., Shulmeister, J., Larsen, J., Jacobsen, G.E., Zawadzki, A., 2014. The hydrological
- 1077 legacy of deforestation on global wetlands. Science 346, 844-847.
- 1078 Zhang, D.D., Lee, H.F., Wang, C., Li, B., Pei, Q., Zhang, J., An, Y., 2011. The causality analysis of
- 1079 climate change and large-scale human crisis. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 108,1080 17296-17301.
- 1081 Zhang, Y., Renssen, H., Seppä, H., Valdes, P.J., 2017. Holocene temperature evolution in the
- 1082 Northern Hemisphere high latitudes Model-data comparisons. Quaternary Science Reviews 173,
 1083 101-113.
- Zvelebil, M., 2006. Mobility, contact, and exchange in the Baltic Sea basin 6000–2000 BC. Journal
 of Anthropological Archaeology 25, 178-192.
- 1086 Zvelebil, M., 2008. Innovating Hunter-Gatherers: The Mesolithic in the Baltic, in: Bailey, G.,
- 1087 Spikins, P. (Eds.), Mesolithic Europe. Cambridge University Press, New York, pp. 18-59.