

1 **Type of article:** Original research article

2

3 **Title:** Biochemical composition of freshwater mussels in Malaysia: a neglected nutrient source for  
4 rural communities

5

6 **Abbreviated title:** Heavy metals and nutritional value of Malaysian freshwater mussels

7

8 **Authors:** Alexandra ZIERITZ<sup>\*a</sup>, Susan AZAM-ALI<sup>b</sup>, Andrew Lewis MARRIOTT<sup>c</sup>, Nurul Anati  
9 binti Mohd NASIR<sup>b</sup>, Quee Nie NG<sup>b</sup>, Nur Aina Afrina Binti Abdul RAZAK<sup>b</sup>, Michael WATTS<sup>c</sup>

10 <sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author: [Alexandra.zieritz@nottingham.edu.my](mailto:Alexandra.zieritz@nottingham.edu.my)

11

12 **Affiliations:**

13 <sup>a</sup> University of Nottingham Malaysia Campus, School of Environmental and Geographical  
14 Sciences, Jalan Broga, 43500 Semenyih, Selangor, Malaysia. Phone: +60-1127509700.

15 [Alexandra.zieritz@nottingham.edu.my](mailto:Alexandra.zieritz@nottingham.edu.my)

16 <sup>b</sup> University of Nottingham Malaysia Campus, School of Biosciences, Jalan Broga, 43500  
17 Semenyih, Selangor, Malaysia. [Susan.AzamAli@nottingham.edu.my](mailto:Susan.AzamAli@nottingham.edu.my)

18 <sup>c</sup> Inorganic Geochemistry, Centre for Environmental Geochemistry, British Geological Survey,  
19 Keyworth NG12 5GG, UK. [anma@bgs.ac.uk](mailto:anma@bgs.ac.uk); [mwatts@bgs.ac.uk](mailto:mwatts@bgs.ac.uk)

20 **Abstract**

21 Nutrient deficiency is still prevalent in Southeast Asia. Freshwater mussels (Unionida) are  
22 widespread and consumed by low-income, rural and indigenous communities, but their  
23 biochemistry is poorly known. We assessed concentrations of nutrients and harmful heavy metals  
24 in Malaysian freshwater mussels. Three replicate batches of 5-10 specimens of native  
25 *Pilsbryconcha compressa* and non-native *Sinanodonta woodiana* were collected from one and  
26 three habitats, respectively, i.e. a rice paddy channel (both species), a lake and an abandoned mining  
27 pool (only *S. woodiana*). Macro- and micronutrient concentrations were determined on freeze-  
28 dried, ground mussel meat powder using established methods, including inductively coupled  
29 plasma mass spectrometry and direct mercury analyser. Concentrations differed significantly  
30 between and within species, but all populations were excellent sources of essential micronutrients.  
31 A serving of six mussels on average covered >100% of the recommended daily intake for adults of  
32 chromium, iron and manganese, and about 40-60% of calcium, copper, selenium and zinc.  
33 However, three of the four populations exceeded permissible levels of some heavy metals,  
34 especially arsenic and lead. Protein levels were low with 5-9 g 100 g<sup>-1</sup> wet weight. Freshwater  
35 mussels may therefore represent an important nutrient source for rural, low-income communities,  
36 but should not be eaten in large quantities.

37

38 **Keywords:** food analysis; food composition; heavy metals; invertebrates; macronutrients;  
39 micronutrients; Mollusca; nutrient deficiency; Unionidae; Unionida

40

## 41 **1. Introduction**

42 Southeast Asia has seen a vast improvement in human development over the last few  
43 decades, including a steep decrease in poverty and improved access to drinking water (United  
44 Nations Development Programme, 2016). However, nutrient deficiency and malnutrition is a  
45 persistent problem in the region, which exhibits the world's highest prevalence of inadequate  
46 calcium (Ca) and magnesium (Mg) intake (Beal et al., 2017). Even in Malaysia, one of the most  
47 developed countries in Southeast Asia, inadequate intake of both macro- and micronutrients is  
48 considerable, particularly for Ca (72% prevalence in 2015), but also zinc (Zn) (8%), iron (Fe) (6%),  
49 Mg (2%), copper (Cu) (1%) and protein (Khor, 1997; United Nations Development Programme,  
50 2016; Beal et al., 2017). Deficiency in these nutrients can lead to impairment of physical growth  
51 and neuropsychological development, as well as a number of diseases, including osteoporosis and  
52 anaemia (Fujita, 2000; Hambidge, 2000; Stoltzfus, 2003).

53 In Malaysia, aboriginal and other rural communities living in the interior of the peninsula  
54 and Borneo are particularly vulnerable to nutrient deficiency (Khor, 1997; Sagin et al., 2002; Wong  
55 et al., 2014). These communities rely mostly on natural, unfortified foodstuffs collected from the  
56 forest, palm plantations, rivers and lakes, including terrestrial mammals, plants and fungi, as well  
57 as freshwater fish and shellfish (Dentan, 1991). Scientific knowledge on the nutritional content of  
58 these food items is incomplete. Hoe and Siong (1999) showed that most indigenous fruits and  
59 vegetables growing in Sarawak's forests are highly nutritious, particularly with respect to energy,  
60 protein and potassium (K). Indigenous small freshwater fish species, which are more affordable  
61 and accessible to these communities compared to larger fish species, have been shown to be  
62 particularly good sources of protein, Fe, Zn and Vitamin A (Kawarazuka and Béné, 2011).  
63 However, the nutritional content of other freshwater food sources in this region, such as molluscs  
64 and other shellfish, is poorly studied.

65           Freshwater mussels (order Unionida) are bottom-dwelling, filter-feeding bivalves that are  
66 commonly found in lakes and rivers across the globe (Zieritz et al., 2018a and references therein).  
67 Malaysia hosts 17 native and one non-native species – the Chinese pond mussel (*Sinanodonta*  
68 *woodiana*), which is now the most widespread and common species in the country (Zieritz et al.,  
69 2016, 2018b; Zieritz and Lopes-Lima, 2018). Besides their ecological importance and economic  
70 value for ornamental and other purposes (Chowdhury et al., 2016 and references therein),  
71 freshwater mussels are regularly collected as a food source by people particularly in Southeast Asia  
72 (Hamli et al., 2012; Zieritz et al., 2018a). Due to their filter-feeding life mode, freshwater mussels  
73 are also very efficient bioaccumulators and known indicators for metal contamination in the water  
74 (Zuykov et al., 2013). In Malaysia, as in many other developing countries, mining of tin, sand,  
75 bauxite and other resources has been known to cause particularly high heavy metal concentrations  
76 in the water and sediment (Shuhaimi-Othman et al., 2008; Madzin et al., 2015).

77           A good understanding of nutrient and potentially harmful heavy metal concentrations in  
78 freshwater mussels is particularly important for regions where these animals are regularly  
79 consumed by people. However, data available in this respect are almost exclusively restricted to  
80 Europe, North America and Australia; regions where freshwater mussels are not part of the human  
81 diet anymore (Parmalee and Klippel, 1974). Data on nutrient and harmful metal concentrations in  
82 natural (sub)tropical freshwater mussel populations are confined to a handful of studies on the  
83 macronutrient concentrations of two common genera of Indian freshwater mussels (e.g.  
84 Shafakatullah et al., 2013) and heavy metal concentrations in one Vietnamese species (Wagner and  
85 Boman, 2004).

86           This study aims to determine the benefits and risks associated with the consumption of  
87 freshwater mussels in Malaysia. This is achieved by determining concentrations of macronutrients,  
88 micronutrients and potentially harmful heavy metals across two species and three habitats. The data  
89 collected is subsequently used to assess potential dietary intakes, exceedance of legal toxicity

90 thresholds of harmful heavy metals and contributions to estimated daily requirements of macro-  
91 and micronutrients.

## 92 **2. Materials and Methods**

### 93 **2.1. Study sites and sampling of specimens**

94 Freshwater mussels were collected by hand in October/November 2016 from three sites in three  
95 different river catchments in Peninsular Malaysia (Fig. 1). Sites were selected to reflect different  
96 environmental conditions. All sites are regularly frequented by locals who collect mussels as a  
97 source of food.

98 (1) The rice paddy channel (site “channel”; 4.0844N, 100.9509E) within the River Perak catchment  
99 near the village of Kampung Gajah is very narrow (<5 m wide) and shallow (<50 cm depth), with  
100 a pH of about 6.3 and specific conductivity of 98 uS/cm (Zieritz et al., 2016). It is inhabited by two  
101 freshwater mussel species, i.e. the native *Pilsbryconcha compressa* (Pc) and the non-native  
102 *Sinanodonta woodiana* (Sw) in moderate densities (<50 mussels/m<sup>2</sup>).

103 (2) Semenyih Lake (site “lake”; 2.9475N, 101.8596E) within the Langat River catchment is a  
104 eutrophic, man-made lake located in a recreational zone for an adjoining residential area about 3  
105 km from Semenyih, a town of a population of about 90,000. The lake is about 600 m in length,  
106 60,000 m<sup>2</sup> in surface area and reaches a maximum depth of about 2 m. Sw, the only freshwater  
107 mussel inhabiting the lake, is present at very high densities of up to 100 individuals/m<sup>2</sup> (Zieritz et  
108 al., 2016).

109 (3) The third site was an abandoned mining pool in the former tin mining area Bestari Jaya (site  
110 “pool”; 3.4177N, 101.4441E), which covers an area of 360 ha and is part of the Selangor River  
111 catchment (Ashraf et al., 2012). The abandoned mining pool is about 250 m in length, 16,000 m<sup>2</sup>  
112 in surface area and 1.5 m in depth, with a pH around 6 and chloride concentrations about 1.5 mg/L  
113 (Ashraf et al., 2012). Sw, the only freshwater mussel inhabiting the mining pool, is present at high  
114 densities of approximately 50 individuals/m<sup>2</sup> (Zieritz et al., 2016).

115 At each of the three sites, we randomly selected three spots that were at least 20 m apart from each  
116 other. At each of these spots, we collected 5-10 specimens from each mussel species present,  
117 resulting in a total of 12 batches of 5-10 specimens each. Mussels were kept alive and held in  
118 buckets with water during transportation to the laboratory.

## 119 **2.2. Preparation of samples in the laboratory**

120 Samples were processed in 12 batches of 5-10 specimens each (see 2.1). On the day of sampling,  
121 in the laboratory, mussels were opened by cutting through the adductor muscles. Meat was removed  
122 from shells using a scalpel, weighed to  $\pm 0.0001$  g and freeze-dried (Freeze dryer: Alpha 1-2LDplus,  
123 CHRiST, Osterode am Harz, Germany) for 48h to remove water. After freeze-drying, mussel  
124 samples were weighed again, ground into powder using a Phillips mixer grinder and sieved through  
125 53  $\mu\text{m}$  mesh size to obtain a homogenous, fine powdered sample. Mussel powders were stored in  
126 the 12 batches at  $-70^\circ\text{C}$  until analysis.

## 127 **2.3. Macronutrient analyses**

128 Total protein, lipid and ash contents were measured in triplicate for each of the 12 dried samples.  
129 Protein content was determined by Kjeldahl method on 0.1 g mussel powder following guidelines  
130 by the Association of Official Analytical Chemists (2016) and Sáez-Plaza et al. (2013) using K-  
131 415 Scrubber, K-446 KjelDigester, K-360 KJelFlex Distillation unit and Titanium tabs (Buchi,  
132 Flawil, Switzerland),  $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$  and  $\text{NaOH}$  (R&M Chemicals, Semenyih, Malaysia),  $\text{H}_3\text{BO}_3$  (Merck  
133 KGaA, Bandar Sunway, Malaysia) and  $\text{HCl}$  (Fisher Scientific, Shah Alam, Malaysia). Fat content  
134 was determined for 0.05 g samples following Bligh and Dyer (1959) using  $\text{CHCl}_3$  (Merck KGaA,  
135 Bandar Sunway, Malaysia),  $\text{CH}_3\text{OH}$  (RCI Labscan, Cheras, Malaysia), Centrifuge 5430  
136 (Eppendorf, Hamburg, Germany) and Whatman GF-C filter papers. Ash content was determined  
137 by incineration of pre-weighed samples ( $\sim 1$  g) at  $650^\circ\text{C}$  for 24 h and subsequent weighing of the  
138 samples. Carbohydrate content was calculated by difference (total weight – (ash + lipid + protein)).

139 **2.4. Micronutrient and heavy metal analyses**

140 Mussel tissue samples (0.5 g) were digested in HNO<sub>3</sub>:10mL/H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>:1mL mixed solution (Romil,  
141 Cambridge, UK) in a closed vessel microwave heating system (MARS Xpress, Cambourne, UK)  
142 using the protocol of Joy et al. (2015). Subsequent total elemental analysis was carried out by  
143 inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry ((ICP-MS; Agilent 7500cx, Cheadle, UK) using (i)  
144 collision cell mode (He-gas) for Al, As, Ca, Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Fe, Mg, Mn, Mo, Ni, K, Pb, Sb, Sn, V  
145 and Zn; and (ii) H<sub>2</sub>-reaction cell mode for selenium (Se) as described by Joy et al. (2015). Total  
146 mercury (Hg<sub>T</sub>) was measured using a DMA-80 (direct mercury analyser Milestone Inc., Thaxted,  
147 UK), using 0.05 g of dried mussel tissue. Samples were weighed into individually pre-cleaned  
148 (heated to 550 °C for 5 minutes) nickel weighing boats, randomised in batches of 10 and thermally  
149 decomposed (using O<sub>2</sub> rich furnace) at 650 °C and quantifiably measured through atomic  
150 absorption. Certified reference materials (CRMs) were used for a variety of sample matrices as a  
151 check on data quality (Table 1). Limits of detection (LODs) were derived for each element from  
152 three blank digests per microwave batch and calculated as 3x standard deviations of these blanks.  
153 All samples were handled according to good laboratory practice, for example, avoidance of sample  
154 contamination in a clean laboratory environment.

155 **2.5. Statistical analyses and comparison with legal limits and published results**

156 Differences between populations in concentrations of macronutrients, micronutrients and  
157 potentially harmful heavy metals were assessed using ANOVA, fitting “population” as a factor  
158 with four levels, followed by a Tukey’s posthoc test for pairwise comparisons. Statistical analyses  
159 were performed in R version 3.4.1.

160 Previously published macro- and micronutrient concentrations of other freshwater mussel  
161 populations, freshwater (shell)fish and marine bivalves were collected for comparison. We further  
162 gathered information on Recommended Daily Intakes (RDIs), Legally Permissible Limits (LPLs)  
163 and Provisional maximum tolerable intakes (PMTIs), which were used to calculate the proportion

164 of RDIs covered by a serving of freshwater mussels and identify potential health hazards associated  
165 with freshwater mussel consumption. For this purpose, macronutrient and heavy metal content per  
166 g mussel tissue was calculated for each of the four mussel populations separately using the average  
167 concentration obtained for each population.

## 168 **3. Results**

### 169 **3.1. Figures of merit of the analysis**

170 All measurements were well above limits of detection (LODs) with the exception of Sb, which was  
171 commonly measured as 0.00  $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$  (Tables 1 and 3). Comparison of measured results from certified  
172 reference materials (CRMs) with certified reference values generally indicated good recovery  
173 above 90% (Table 1). Mean percent variation of duplicate measurements was relatively high for  
174 Al (34 and 94%) and Sn (85 and 102%).

### 175 **3.2. Description of data, including comparisons between populations and with previously** 176 **published data**

#### 177 **3.2.1. General description of samples**

178 Dry weight per mussel after freeze-drying ranged from 0.07 (Pc) to 5.5 g (Sw), averaging about 2  
179 g dry weight and 10 g wet weight per mussel. Water content ranged from 75 to 85% of wet weight  
180 but was visibly highly dependent on the amount of water left inside the valves. In the following,  
181 we refer wherever possible to dry weight (DW) data, whilst wet weight (WW) data for all four  
182 study populations were calculated assuming an average water content of 80% (i.e. using a  
183 conversion factor of 0.2).

184 Significant differences in concentrations of macro- and micronutrients as well as harmful heavy  
185 metals were found both between species at the same location as well as within the same species at  
186 different locations, and are presented in detail in the following (Figures 2 and 3, Tables 2 and 3).

#### 187 **3.2.2. Macronutrients (proteins, carbohydrates, lipids)**

188 Protein concentrations of the study populations ranged from about 25-45 g 100  $\text{g}^{-1}$  DW or 5-9 g  
189 100  $\text{g}^{-1}$  WW (Fig. 2, Table 2). This was within the range of previously reported values from  
190 freshwater mussels from India and the USA, which lie between 40 and 51 g 100  $\text{g}^{-1}$  DW (Table 2),  
191 and was exceeded by freshwater fish from the region by about 15-50 g 100  $\text{g}^{-1}$  DW (Puwastien et  
192 al., 1999; Bogard et al., 2015) (Table 2). Lipid and ash concentrations, ranging from about 2-10

193 and 2-25 g 100 g<sup>-1</sup> DW, respectively, were similar to previously reported values for freshwater  
194 mussels and fish (Table 2).

195 Protein, carbohydrate and ash content differed significantly between the four study populations  
196 (ANOVA: protein: F=22.87, df=3, P<0.0001; carbohydrates: F=9.01, df=3, P=0.006; ash: F=14.4,  
197 df=3, P=0.001). Protein was significantly higher in populations Pc-channel and Sw-lake compared  
198 to Sw-channel and Sw-pool (Fig. 2). Carbohydrate content was highest in the Sw-pool population,  
199 and ash content was highest in the two channel populations. No differences were found in the fat  
200 contents between mussel populations (ANOVA: F=0.61, df=3, P=0.63).

### 201 3.2.3. Micronutrients

202 Concentrations of seven essential micronutrients with exclusively or predominantly positive effects  
203 in humans were in the same range or higher than previously published data on freshwater mussels  
204 and other freshwater and marine organisms (Table 3). Ca, Fe and Zn content was particularly high  
205 in our study populations. Ca concentrations, ranging from about 16,000-80,000 µg g<sup>-1</sup> DW, were  
206 exceeded only by some *Unio mancus* populations in Lake Maggiore, Italy (Ravera et al., 2003a),  
207 and some freshwater fish in Bangladesh (Bogard et al., 2015) (Table 3). Fe concentrations, ranging  
208 from 6,000-17,000 µg g<sup>-1</sup> DW, were exceeded only by some *Hyridella menziesi* populations from  
209 the Waikato River, New Zealand (Hickey et al., 1995), but were at least one magnitude lower in  
210 freshwater fish (Roos et al., 2007; Bogard et al., 2015). Zn concentrations, ranging from 100-600  
211 µg g<sup>-1</sup> DW, were exceeded by several other freshwater mussel populations but no other organisms  
212 in our dataset (Table 3).

213 With regard to differences between our study populations, the two rice paddy populations (Pc-  
214 channel and Sw-channel) showed significantly higher levels of Ca, Mg and Zn compared to those  
215 from the lake and abandoned mining pool (Sw-lake and Sw-pool; Fig. 3). Population Sw-lake was  
216 particularly high in K and Mo, whilst Sw-pool was comparatively low in almost all micronutrients  
217 (Fig. 3).

#### 218 3.2.4. Harmful heavy metals

219 With a maximum observed concentration of 69  $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ , lead (Pb) concentrations were exceptionally  
220 high in all our study populations when compared to previously published data (Table 3). The same  
221 was true for aluminium (Al), though previously published data on freshwater mussels in this respect  
222 are restricted to only two studies from Australia and Italy, respectively (Hickey et al., 1995; Ravera  
223 et al., 2003a). Arsenic (As) and cadmium (Cd) concentrations were in the same range of those  
224 reported in other freshwater mussel populations and exceeded by a few, whilst Hg levels were low  
225 (Fig. 3, Table 3). Little to no comparable data were available for antimony (Sb) and tin (Sn) (Table  
226 3).

227 Sw-pool in general showed the lowest heavy metal concentrations with the exception of Cu, which  
228 significantly exceeded levels of Sw-channel and Sw-lake (Fig. 3). Sw-lake showed particularly  
229 high levels of Al, As, mercury (Hg) and Sb, whilst Sw-channel was particularly high in Cd and Hg  
230 (Fig. 3).

### 231 3.3. Estimated dietary intakes and exceedance of legal toxicity thresholds

#### 232 3.3.1. Macronutrients

233 Applying an average weight of 2 g DW and 10 g WW per mussel (see section 3.2.1), a serving of  
234 six mussels (equalling ~12 g DW and 60 g WW) would on average provide 3.9 g protein and 5.8 g  
235 carbohydrates, corresponding to <10% of the recommended daily intake (RDI) for adolescents and  
236 adults (Table 4), as well as 0.6 g fat.

#### 237 3.3.2. Micronutrients

238 Based on our dataset, a serving of six mussels would on average provide 462 mg Ca, 80  $\mu\text{g}$   
239 chromium (Cr), 390  $\mu\text{g}$  Cu, 119 mg Fe, 29 mg manganese (Mn), 13.5  $\mu\text{g}$  selenium (Se) and 3.1 mg  
240 Zn. This corresponds to a contribution of >100% of the RDIs for adolescents and adults of Cr, Fe  
241 and Mn, and about 40-60% of Ca, Cu, Se and Zn (Table 4). The contribution for K, Mg and  
242 molybdenum (Mo) would be comparatively low with <1-18%.

243 3.3.3. *Harmful heavy metals*

244 Three of the four study populations exceeded the standards set by the Ministry of Health Malaysia  
245 (1985) for at least one heavy metal (Fig. 3, Tables 3 and A.1). Specifically, Pc-channel and Sw-  
246 lake exceeded levels of As and Pb, and Sw-channel exceeded levels of As and Zn. In addition,  
247 standards set in other countries were exceeded by Sw-pool for As, Pb and cobalt (Co), Sw-channel  
248 for Pb, and Pc-channel and Sw-lake for Cr (Fig. 3, Tables 3 and A.1). Concentrations of Sb and Sn  
249 were far below the maximum permissible level thresholds (Fig. 3, Tables 3 and A.1).

## 250 **4. Discussion**

### 251 ***4.1. Benefits and hazards of consuming freshwater mussels***

252 Ca, Fe and Zn deficiencies are prevalent amongst Malaysians, particularly amongst the lower socio-  
253 economic groups (Beal et al., 2017). Ca deficiency is widely known as a cause for osteoporosis,  
254 but is also connected with hypertension, diabetes mellitus, neurodegenerative diseases and  
255 degenerative joint disease (Fujita, 2000). Fe<sup>2+</sup> deficiency is the most important contributor of  
256 anaemia, causing impaired muscle function and physical performance, as well as being associated  
257 with elevated maternal mortality (Stoltzfus, 2003). Due to its importance in subcellular metabolism,  
258 inadequate intake of Zn can cause impairment of physical growth and neuropsychological  
259 development, and is associated with gastrointestinal and respiratory infections (Hambidge, 2000).  
260 Our data indicate that freshwater mussels could be a very important source for these and other  
261 micronutrients. On average, a serving of mussels covers >100% of RDIs for adolescents and adults  
262 of Fe, 40-60% of Ca and Zn. This is of particular relevance for indigenous and other rural  
263 communities, who do not have access to milk products and fortified foods. It should be noted,  
264 however, that the proportion of heme-iron in freshwater mussels, which has higher bioavailability  
265 than non heme-iron (Taniguchi et al., 2017), has never been assessed. That said, the RDIs by the  
266 Ministry of Health Malaysia (2005), which our calculations are based on, presume that 15% of  
267 dietary iron is received in heme form. This value is at the lower end of the scale of heme-iron  
268 content measured in marine mussels, ranging from about 10 to 60% (Kongkachuichai et al., 2002;  
269 Taniguchi et al., 2017), suggesting that freshwater mussels are likely to be an excellent source of  
270 heme-iron.

271 Unfortunately, all our study populations also exhibited very high levels of harmful heavy metals  
272 and may therefore present a health hazard. Levels were particularly high for As and Pb. Long-term  
273 exposure to As can lead to chronic As poisoning, skin lesion, cancer and a multitude of other  
274 dermatological, neurological and gastrointestinal effects (Tchounwou et al., 2004). That said, As

275 is much less toxic in its organic forms, such as arsenosugars, which represent 80-100% of arsenicals  
276 in freshwater mussels (Koch et al., 2001; Francesconi and Kuehnelt, 2004; Soeroes et al., 2005;  
277 Schaeffer et al., 2006). Chronic exposure to Pb commonly causes anaemia, headache, irritability,  
278 lethargy, convulsions, muscle weakness, ataxia, tremors and paralysis (WHO World Health  
279 Organization, 2010). In children, even relatively low levels of exposure can cause serious and, in  
280 some cases, irreversible neurological damage.

281 Whilst levels of these and some other heavy metals were high in our study populations and other  
282 freshwater mussel populations across the globe (see Table 3), it is unlikely that current levels of  
283 consumption are causing health issues. In contrast to rice, fish and vegetables, freshwater mussels  
284 are eaten only on an occasional basis rather than being part of the daily diet (Dentan, 1991; A.  
285 Zieritz, personal observation). However, provisional maximum tolerable intakes (PMTIs) for  
286 adults of 50 kg as set out by the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA)  
287 (2014) would be exceeded at a regular and/or high intake of freshwater mussels (>14 mussels per  
288 week for adults and >7 mussels per week for children; Table 5). This would be expected to cause  
289 health problems due to a dietary overload of Fe, and, in some populations, excess Al and/or Pb  
290 intake. Especially children should therefore eat freshwater mussels only occasionally and in small  
291 portions.

292 The contribution of freshwater mussels to the human protein diet is probably rather small, as one  
293 serving would provide less than 10% of the RDI (Table 4). That said, whilst freshwater mussels  
294 may not be a particularly useful source of protein, they are valuable for their lipid and  
295 micronutrients they provide.

#### 296 ***4.2. Potential causes for variation in nutrient and heavy metal content***

297 Mussels collected from the abandoned mining pool at Bestari Jaya exhibited the lowest levels of  
298 all study populations for almost all heavy metals assessed in the present study. It is unlikely that  
299 this is due to lower background levels in the soil and water at the site compared to the two other

300 sites, particularly when considering that the site lies within a former tin mining area. We rather  
301 suspect that these intraspecific, inter-site differences in heavy metal concentrations might be  
302 associated with differences in either feeding and/or age structure of populations. For example,  
303 higher availability of suitable food at a site could be expected to lead to lower filtration activity  
304 and/or faster growth rate and/or younger maximum age, resulting in a lower concentration of  
305 accumulated heavy metals in mussel tissue. Similar mechanisms might be responsible for the  
306 significant differences in heavy metal concentrations observed between *P. compressa* vs. *S.*  
307 *woodiana* at the rice paddy channel.

#### 308 **4.3. Importance of freshwater mussel research and conservation**

309 Our study has shown that freshwater mussels may act as an important source of micronutrients, in  
310 particular Ca, Fe and Zn, for rural, low-income communities in Southeast Asia. Further studies will  
311 be needed to validate our results in other Southeast Asian countries and river basins. In addition,  
312 future research on this matter should be concentrated in sub-Saharan Africa, which is the region  
313 with the highest prevalence of insufficient nutrition, particularly with regard to Ca, Zn, Se and  
314 iodine (I) (Joy et al., 2014, 2015). Freshwater mussels, including the freshwater oyster *Etheria* spp.,  
315 are commonly consumed in that region (D. Akele, personal communication), but their nutritional  
316 content and concentrations of harmful elements is unknown. Data on nutrient and toxin content  
317 from various species and habitats should ideally be collected in combination with quantification of  
318 intake rates, determination of relative content of particular species of essential and toxic macro-  
319 and micronutrients (e.g. Fe<sup>2+</sup>, inorganic As, Cr(VI)), as well as exposure levels to harmful  
320 elements *via* other routes such as drinking water, air or other food sources.

321 Due to pollution and habitat destruction, many native freshwater mussels are declining and  
322 endangered (Zieritz et al., 2016). Of the 17 native Malaysian species, nine are considered  
323 threatened by the International Union for Conservation of Nature, four could not be assessed due  
324 to a lack of data and only four are considered to persist in healthy population numbers (Zieritz and

325 Lopes-Lima, 2018). However, in Southeast Asia and many other regions of the world, no  
326 legislations to protect endangered freshwater mussel species are in place (Zieritz et al., 2018a).  
327 Apart from the importance of mussels to their ecosystems, ecosystem services they provide to  
328 people (such as purifying water) and value as pearl producers, the present work has shown that  
329 freshwater mussels are valuable as a source of micronutrients for rural populations and safe to be  
330 consumed in moderation.

### 331 **Acknowledgements**

332 This work was supported by the Ministry of Higher Education, Malaysia (Project  
333 FRGS/1/2015/WAB13/UNIM//1). We are grateful to SNK Che Samsuddin, SNA Musa, SN  
334 Muhamad Nor and S Shyamala for their assistance in laboratory analyses.

335

### 336 **Conflict of interest**

337 Conflicts of interest: none.

338 Ethical statement not applicable for this work on invertebrates.

339 **References**

- 340 Ashraf, M.A., Maah, M.J., Yusoff, I., 2012. Morphology, geology and water quality assessment of  
341 former tin mining catchment. *Sci. World J.* 2012, 369206. doi:10.1100/2012/369206
- 342 Association of Official Analytical Chemists, 2016. *Official Methods of Analysis*, 20 edition. ed.  
343 Washington D.C.
- 344 Beal, T., Massiot, E., Arsenault, J.E., Smith, M.R., Hijmans, R.J., 2017. Global trends in dietary  
345 micronutrient supplies and estimated prevalence of inadequate intakes. *PLoS One* 12,  
346 e0175554. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0175554
- 347 Beckvar, N., Salazar, S., Salazar, M., Finkelstein, K., 2000. An in situ assessment of mercury  
348 contamination in the Sudbury River, Massachusetts, using transplanted freshwater mussels  
349 (*Elliptio complanata*). *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* 57, 1103–1112. doi:10.1139/f00-042
- 350 Bligh, E.G., Dyer, W.J., 1959. A rapid method of total lipid extraction and purification. *Can. J.*  
351 *Biochem. Physiol.* 37, 911–917.
- 352 Bogard, J.R., Thilsted, S.H., Marks, G.C., Wahab, M.A., Hossain, M.A.R., Jakobsen, J.,  
353 Stangoulis, J., 2015. Nutrient composition of important fish species in Bangladesh and  
354 potential contribution to recommended nutrient intakes. *J. Food Compos. Anal.* 42, 120–133.  
355 doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfca.2015.03.002>
- 356 Chan, H.M., Trifonopoulos, M., Ing, A., Receveur, O., Johnson, E., 1999. Consumption of  
357 freshwater fish in Kahnawake: risks and benefits. *Environ. Res.* 80, S213–S222.
- 358 Chowdhury, G.W., Zieritz, A., Aldridge, D.C., 2016. Ecosystem engineering by mussels supports  
359 biodiversity and water clarity in a heavily polluted lake in Dhaka, Bangladesh. *Freshw. Sci.*  
360 35, 188–199. doi:10.1086/684169
- 361 Dentan, R.K., 1991. Potential food sources for foragers in Malaysian rainforest: sago, yams and  
362 lots of little things. *Bijdr. tot Taal-, Land- en Volkenkd.* 147, 420–444.

- 363 Francesconi, K.A., Kuehnelt, D., 2004. Determination of arsenic species: a critical review of  
364 methods and applications, 2000-2003. *Analyst* 129, 373–395. doi:10.1039/b401321m
- 365 Fujita, T., 2000. Calcium paradox: Consequences of calcium deficiency manifested by a wide  
366 variety of diseases. *J. Bone Miner. Metab.* 18, 234–236. doi:10.1007/pl00010637
- 367 Greseth, S.L., Cope, W.G., Rada, R.G., Waller, D.L., Bartsch, M.R., 2003. Biochemical  
368 composition of three species of unionid mussels after emersion. *J. Molluscan Stud.* 69, 101–  
369 106.
- 370 Haldar, A., Dey, T.K., Dhar, P., Chakrabarti, J., 2014. Exploring the nutritive values of the fresh  
371 water mussel *Lamellidens marginalis* as potential functional food. *IOSR J. Environ. Sci.*  
372 *Toxicol. Food Technol.* 8, 1–7.
- 373 Hambidge, M., 2000. Human zinc deficiency. *J. Nutr.* 130, 1344S–1349S.
- 374 Hamli, H., Idris, M.H., Hena, M.K.A., Wong, S.K., 2012. Taxonomic study of edible bivalve from  
375 selected division of Sarawak, Malaysia. *Int. J. Zool. Res.* 8, 52.
- 376 Hickey, C.W., Roper, D.S., Buckland, S.J., 1995. Metal concentrations of resident and transplanted  
377 freshwater mussels *Hyridella menziesi* (Unionacea: Hyriidae) and sediments in the Waikato  
378 River, New Zealand. *Sci. Total Environ.* 175, 163–177. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0048-  
379 9697(95)04722-0
- 380 Hoe, V.B., Siong, K.H., 1999. The nutritional value of indigenous fruits and vegetables in Sarawak.  
381 *Asia Pac. J. Clin. Nutr.* 8, 24–31. doi:10.1046/j.1440-6047.1999.00046.x
- 382 Hossen, M.F., Hamdan, S., Rahman, M.R., 2015. Review on the risk assessment of heavy metals  
383 in Malaysian clams. *Sci. World J.* ID 905497, 1–7.
- 384 Jimoh, A.A., Clarke, E., Ndimele, P.E., Kumolo-Johnson, C.A., FA, A., 2011. Concentrations of  
385 heavy metals in *Macrobrachium vollenhovenii* (Herklots, 1857) from Epe lagoon, Lagos,

- 386 Nigeria. Res. J. Environ. Earth Sci. 3, 197–202.
- 387 Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA), 2014. Evaluations of the Joint  
388 FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) [WWW Document]. URL  
389 <http://apps.who.int/food-additives-contaminants-jecfa-database/search.aspx>
- 390 Joy, E.J.M., Ander, E.L., Young, S.D., Black, C.R., Watts, M.J., Chilimba, A.D.C., Chilima, B.,  
391 Siyame, E.W.P., Kalimbira, A.A., Hurst, R., Fairweather-Tait, S.J., Stein, A.J., Gibson, R.S.,  
392 White, P.J., Broadley, M.R., 2014. Dietary mineral supplies in Africa. *Physiol. Plant.* 151,  
393 208–229. doi:10.1111/ppl.12144
- 394 Joy, E.J.M., Broadley, M.R., Young, S.D., Black, C.R., Chilimba, A.D.C., Ander, E.L., 2015. Soil  
395 type influences crop mineral composition in Malawi. *Sci. Total Environ.* 505.  
396 doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2014.10.038
- 397 Kawarazuka, N., Béné, C., 2011. The potential role of small fish species in improving micronutrient  
398 deficiencies in developing countries: building evidence. *Public Health Nutr.* 14, 1927–1938.  
399 doi:10.1017/S1368980011000814
- 400 Khor, G.L., 1997. Nutrition status of children in Malaysia: persistence of old problems. *Malaysian*  
401 *J. Child Heal.* 9, 130–150.
- 402 Koch, I., Reimer, K.J., Beach, A., Cullen, W.R., Gosden, A., Lai, V.W.-M., 2001. Arsenic  
403 speciation in fresh-water fish and bivalves. *Arsen. Expo. Heal. Eff.* IV.
- 404 Kongkachuichai, R., Napatthalung, P., Charoensiri, R., 2002. Heme and nonheme iron content of  
405 animal products commonly consumed in Thailand. *J. Food Compos. Anal.* 15, 389–398.  
406 doi:<https://doi.org/10.1006/jfca.2002.1080>
- 407 Lau, S., Mohamed, M., Tan Chi Yen, A., Su'ut, S., 1998. Accumulation of heavy metals in  
408 freshwater molluscs. *Sci. Total Environ.* 214, 113–121. doi:[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-9697(98)00058-8)  
409 [9697\(98\)00058-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-9697(98)00058-8)

410 Madzin, Z., Shai-in, M.F., Kusin, F.M., 2015. Comparing heavy metal mobility in active and  
411 abandoned mining sites at Bestari Jaya, Selangor. *Procedia Environ. Sci.* 30, 232–237.  
412 doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.proenv.2015.10.042>

413 Manly, R., George, W.O., 1977. The occurrence of some heavy metals in populations of the  
414 freshwater mussel *Anodonta anatina* (L.) from the River Thames. *Environ. Pollut.* 14, 139–  
415 154. doi:[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0013-9327\(77\)90106-9](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0013-9327(77)90106-9)

416 Ministry of Health Malaysia, 1985. Malaysian Food Regulations 1985.

417 Ministry of Health Malaysia, 2005. RNI Recommended Nutrient Intakes for Malaysia. A Report  
418 of the Technical Working Group on Nutritional Guidelines. National Coordinating Committee  
419 on Food and Nutrition (NCCFN), Ministry of Health Malaysia, Putrajaya, Malaysia.

420 National Academy of Sciences (USA), 2011. Dietary Reference Intakes (DRIs): Recommended  
421 Dietary Allowances and Adequate Intakes [WWW Document]. URL  
422 <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK56068/table/summarytables.t3/?report=objectonly>

423 Parmalee, P.W., Klippel, W.E., 1974. Freshwater mussels as a prehistoric food resource. *Am.*  
424 *Antiq.* 39, 421–434. doi:10.2307/279431

425 Pourang, N., Richardson, C.A., Mortazavi, M.S., 2010. Heavy metal concentrations in the soft  
426 tissues of swan mussel (*Anodonta cygnea*) and surficial sediments from Anzali wetland, Iran.  
427 *Environ. Monit. Assess.* 163, 195–213.

428 Puwastien, P., Judprasong, K., Kettwan, E., Vasanachitt, K., Nakngamanong, Y., Bhattacharjee,  
429 L., 1999. Proximate composition of raw and cooked Thai freshwater and marine fish. *J. Food*  
430 *Compos. Anal.* 12, 9–16. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1006/jfca.1998.0800>

431 Rahouma, M., Shuhaimi-Othman, M., Cob, Z.C., 2013. Assessment of selected heavy metals (Zn,  
432 Mn, Pb, Cd, Cr and Cu) in different species of *Acetes* shrimp from Malacca, Johor and  
433 Terengganu, Peninsular Malaysia. *J. Environ. Sci. Technol.* 6, 50.

- 434 Ravera, O., Beone, G.M., Cenci, R., Lodigiani, P., 2003a. Metal concentrations in *Unio pictorum*  
435 *mancus* (Mollusca, Lamellibranchia) from of 12 Northern Italian lakes in relation to their  
436 trophic level. J. Limnol. 62, 121–138.
- 437 Ravera, O., Cenci, R., Beone, G.M., Dantas, M., Lodigiani, P., 2003b. Trace element  
438 concentrations in freshwater mussels and macrophytes as related to those in their environment.  
439 J. Limnol. 62, 61–70.
- 440 Roos, N., Thorseng, H., Chamnan, C., Larsen, T., Gondolf, U.H., Bukhave, K., Thilsted, S.H.,  
441 2007. Iron content in common Cambodian fish species: Perspectives for dietary iron intake in  
442 poor, rural households. Food Chem. 104, 1226–1235.  
443 doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2007.01.038>
- 444 Rzymiski, P., Niedzielski, P., Klimaszuk, P., Poniedziałek, B., 2014. Bioaccumulation of selected  
445 metals in bivalves (Unionidae) and *Phragmites australis* inhabiting a municipal water  
446 reservoir. Environ. Monit. Assess. 186, 3199–3212. doi:10.1007/s10661-013-3610-8
- 447 Sáez-Plaza, P., Navas, M.J., Wybraniec, S., Michałowski, T., Asuero, A.G., 2013. An Overview of  
448 the Kjeldahl Method of Nitrogen Determination. Part II. Sample Preparation, Working Scale,  
449 Instrumental Finish, and Quality Control. Crit. Rev. Anal. Chem. 43, 224–272.  
450 doi:10.1080/10408347.2012.751787
- 451 Sagin, D.D., Ismail, G., Mohamad, M., Pang, E.K.H., Sya, O.T., 2002. Anemia in remote interior  
452 communities in Sarawak, Malaysia. Southeast Asian J. Trop. Med. Public Health 33, 373-377.
- 453 Schaeffer, R., Francesconi, K.A., Kienzl, N., Soeroes, C., Fodor, P., Váradi, L., Raml, R., Goessler,  
454 W., Kuehnelt, D., 2006. Arsenic speciation in freshwater organisms from the river Danube in  
455 Hungary. Talanta 69, 856–865.
- 456 Shafakatullah, N., Shetty, S., Lobo, R.O., M., K., 2013. Nutritional analysis of freshwater bivalves,  
457 *Lamellidens* spp. from River Tunga, Karnataka, India. Res. J. Recent Sci. 2, 120–123.

- 458 Shafakatullah, N., Krishnamoorthy, M., 2014. Nutritional analysis of freshwater bivalves,  
459 *Parreysia* spp. of Periyar River, Kerala, India. Res. J. Recent Sci. 3, 267–270.
- 460 Shetty, S., Tharavathy, N.C., Lobo, R.O., Shafakatullah, N., 2013. Seasonal changes in the  
461 biochemical composition of freshwater bivalves, *Parreysia* spp. from Tungahadra River,  
462 Karnataka. Int. J. Pahrma Sci. Res. 4, 94–99.
- 463 Shuhaimi-Othman, M., Mushrifah, I., Lim, E.C., Ahmad, A., 2008. Trend in metals variation in  
464 Tasik Chini, Pahang, Peninsular Malaysia. Environ. Monit. Assess. 143, 345–354.  
465 doi:10.1007/s10661-007-9937-2
- 466 Soeroes, C., Goessler, W., Francesconi, K.A., Schmeisser, E., Raml, R., Kienzl, N., Kahn, M.,  
467 Fodor, P., Kuehnelt, D., 2005. Thio arsenosugars in freshwater mussels from the Danube in  
468 Hungary. J. Environ. Monit. 7, 688–692. doi:10.1039/b503897a
- 469 Stoltzfus, R.J., 2003. Iron deficiency: global prevalence and consequences. Food Nutr. Bull. 24,  
470 S99–S103. doi:doi:10.1177/15648265030244S206
- 471 Taniguchi, C.N., Dobbs, J., Dunn, M.A., 2017. Heme iron, non-heme iron, and mineral content of  
472 blood clams (*Anadara* spp.) compared to Manila clams (*V. philippinarum*), Pacific oysters (*C.*  
473 *gigas*), and beef liver (*B. taurus*). J. Food Compos. Anal. 57, 49–55.  
474 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfca.2016.12.018
- 475 Tchounwou, P.B., Centeno, J.A., Patlolla, A.K., 2004. Arsenic toxicity, mutagenesis, and  
476 carcinogenesis – a health risk assessment and management approach. Mol. Cell. Biochem.  
477 255, 47–55. doi:10.1023/B:MCBI.0000007260.32981.b9
- 478 United Nations Development Programme, 2016. The Human Development Report 2016. Human  
479 Development Report.
- 480 Wagner, A., Boman, J., 2004. Biomonitoring of trace elements in Vietnamese freshwater mussels.  
481 Spectrochim. Acta Part B At. Spectrosc. 59, 1125–1132.

- 482 doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sab.2003.11.009>
- 483 WHO World Health Organization, 2010. Exposure to lead: a major public health concern [WWW  
484 Document]. URL [http://www.who.int/ipcs/assessment/public\\_health/lead/en/](http://www.who.int/ipcs/assessment/public_health/lead/en/)
- 485 Wong, H.J., Moy, F.M., Nair, S., 2014. Risk factors of malnutrition among preschool children in  
486 Terengganu, Malaysia: a case control study. *BMC Public Health* 14, 785. doi:10.1186/1471-  
487 2458-14-785
- 488 Yap, C.K., Ismail, A., Tan, S.G., 2004. Heavy metal (Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn) concentrations in the  
489 green-lipped mussel *Perna viridis* (Linnaeus) collected from some wild and aquacultural sites  
490 in the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia. *Food Chem.* 84, 569–575.
- 491 Yap, C.K., Khairul, I., 2010. A comparative study of heavy metal concentrations in the clam  
492 *Corbicula javanica* and surface sediments collected from clean and polluted sites of Langat  
493 River, Selangor. *Malaysian Appl. Biol.* 39, 57–61.
- 494 Zieritz, A., Bogan, A.E., Froufe, E., Klishko, O., Kondo, T., Kovitvadhi, U., Kovitvadhi, S., Lee,  
495 J.H., Lopes-Lima, M., Pfeiffer, J.M., Sousa, R., van Do, T., Vikhrev, I., Zanatta, D.T., 2018a.  
496 Diversity, biogeography and conservation of freshwater mussels (Bivalvia: Unionida) in East  
497 and Southeast Asia. *Hydrobiologia* 810, 29–44. doi:10.1007/s10750-017-3104-8
- 498 Zieritz, A., Bogan, A.E., Rahim, K.A.A., Sousa, R., Jainih, L., Harun, S., Razak, N.F.A., Gallardo,  
499 B., McGowan, S., Hassan, R., Lopes-Lima, M., 2018b. Changes and drivers of freshwater  
500 mussel diversity and distribution in northern Borneo. *Biol. Conserv.* 219.  
501 doi:10.1016/j.biocon.2018.01.012
- 502 Zieritz, A., Lopes-Lima, M., 2018. Handbook and National Red-List of the Freshwater Mussels of  
503 Malaysia. IUCN.
- 504 Zieritz, A., Lopes-Lima, M., Bogan, A.E., Sousa, R., Walton, S., Rahim, K.A.A., Wilson, J.-J., Ng,  
505 P.-Y., Froufe, E., McGowan, S., 2016. Factors driving changes in freshwater mussel (Bivalvia,

506 Unionida) diversity and distribution in Peninsular Malaysia. *Sci. Total Environ.* 571, 1069–  
507 1078. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.07.098

508 Zuykov, M., Pelletier, E., Harper, D.A.T., 2013. Bivalve mollusks in metal pollution studies: from  
509 bioaccumulation to biomonitoring. *Chemosphere* 93, 201–208

510

511

512

## Figures captions

**Figure 1.** Location of the three study sites in Peninsular Malaysia. (1) Rice paddy channel in Perak River catchment. (2) Semenyih Lake in Langat River catchment. (3) Abandoned mining pool in Selangor River catchment.

**Figure 2.** Boxplots of macronutrient concentrations in dry tissues of freshwater mussels sampled in Oct/Nov 2016 from four sites in Peninsular Malaysia, showing medians (bold line), first and third quartiles (box) and 95% confidence intervals of median (whiskers) (n=3, 10-15 mussels per replicate). Different letters above bars indicate statistically significant difference between populations ( $p < 0.05$ ). Abbreviations: *Pc*, *Pilsbryconcha compressa*; *Sw*, *Sinanodonta woodiana*.

**Figure 3.** Metal concentrations with exclusively/predominantly positive effects (Ca, Fe, K, Mg, Mo, Se, Zn), exclusively negative effects (Al, As, Cd, Hg, Pb, Sb, Sn) and both positive and negative effects (Co, Cr, Cu, Mn, Ni, V) in dry tissues of freshwater mussels sampled in Oct/Nov 2016 from four sites in Peninsular Malaysia, showing medians (bold line), first and third quartiles (box) and 95% confidence intervals of median (whiskers) (n=3, 10-15 mussels per replicate). Different letters above bars indicate statistically significant difference between populations ( $p < 0.05$ ). Abbreviations: *Pc*, *Pilsbryconcha compressa*; *Sw*, *Sinanodonta woodiana*.

\* exceeding permissible limits set by Malaysian Food Regulation (1985)

<sup>s</sup> exceeding permissible limits set by at least one other national or international standard listed in Table A.4

**Table 1.** Limit of detection (LOD) and results of duplicate/triplicate measurements of (A) 19 elements obtained by ICP-MS (isotope measured given) and (B) Hg obtained by DMA Hg analyser from Certified Reference Material: BCR-627 (Tuna fish tissue, Merck, Darmstadt, Germany), ERM-BB422 (Fish Muscle, Merck, Darmstadt, Germany), HR1 (River sediment), MESS3 (Marine sediment, Evisa, Canada), TH2 (Lake Sediment). All units in  $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ . na, data not available.

<b>A</b>	<sup>27</sup> Al	<sup>75</sup> As	<sup>42</sup> Ca	<sup>111</sup> Cd	<sup>59</sup> Co	<sup>52</sup> Cr	<sup>63</sup> Cu	<sup>56</sup> Fe	<sup>24</sup> Mg	<sup>55</sup> Mn	<sup>95</sup> Mo	<sup>60</sup> Ni	<sup>39</sup> K	<sup>208</sup> Pb	<sup>121</sup> Sb	<sup>78</sup> Se	<sup>118</sup> Sn	<sup>51</sup> V	<sup>66</sup> Zn
LOD	0.4	0.007	15	0.003	0.002	0.02	0.3	2	0.3	2	0.005	0.008	3	0.02	0.01	0.002	0.005	0.02	0.2
BCR-627 x5	14	4.361	414	0.198	0.042	0.276	2.266	70	1034	0.590	0.034	0.442	11450	0.501	0.007	1.778	0.717	0.033	17.480
BCR-627 Dup x5	10	4.497	395	0.215	0.067	0.292	2.310	69	1026	0.722	0.026	1.356	11823	0.491	0.007	1.661	1.781	0.030	17.661
Average	12	4.429	405	0.206	0.054	0.284	2.288	70	1030	0.656	0.030	0.899	11636	0.496	0.007	1.720	1.249	0.031	17.571
mean % variation	34	3	5	8	45	5	2	2	1	20	25	102	3	2	4	7	85	10	1
certified value	na	4.800	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	2.800	na	na	na
%recovery	na	92	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	61	na	na	na
ERM-BB422 x5	1	11.518	316	0.008	0.015	0.175	1.615	10	1423	-0.006	0.015	0.183	17985	0.004	0.007	1.138	0.010	0.009	13.841
ERM-BB422 Dup x5	0	11.932	332	0.011	0.017	0.098	1.635	9	1525	0.176	0.013	0.184	19140	0.001	0.006	1.167	0.003	0.012	14.910
Average	1	11.725	324	0.009	0.016	0.137	1.625	10	1474	0.085	0.014	0.183	18563	0.002	0.006	1.152	0.007	0.010	14.376
mean % variation	94	4	5	34	13	56	1	7	7	214	16	1	6	118	18	3	102	32	7
certified value	na	12.700	330	na	0.015	na	1.670	9.4	1400	0.368	na	na	21700	na	na	1.330	na	na	16.000
%recovery	na	92	98	na	109	na	97	104	105	23	na	na	86	na	na	87	na	na	90

<b>B</b>	Hg
LOD	0.01
MESS3	0.08
MESS3 Dup	0.10
Average	0.09
%difference	21
Expected value	0.091
%recovery	97

---

HR1	0.33
HR1 Dup1	0.33
HR1 Dup2	0.34
Average	0.34
%difference	4
Expected value	0.342
%recovery	98

---

TH2	0.63
TH2 Dup1	0.54
TH2 Dup2	0.68
Average	0.61
%difference	22
Expected value	0.620
%recovery	98

---

BB442	0.59
BB442 Dup1	0.61
BB442 Dup2	0.59
Average	0.60
%difference	3
Expected value	0.601
%recovery	100

---

**Table 2.** Macronutrient concentrations (averages or ranges, respectively, in g 100 g<sup>-1</sup> Dry Weight) of freshwater mussels (Unionida) and fish populations.

nd, no data

Species	Protein	Carbohydrates	Lipids	Ash	n	Samples size per replicate	Reference
<i>Pilsbryoconcha compressa</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	36.2	43.3	3.8	16.6	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	28.2	41.2	6.8	23.8	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Lake, Malaysia)	37.5	51.6	4.8	6.1	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Pool, Malaysia)	27.4	57.7	4.6	10.3	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Actinonaias carinata</i> (USA)	43.3	25.0	3.9	16.7	1	nd	Parmalee & Klippel (1974)
<i>Elliptio dilatata</i> (USA)	28.9	44.7	3.1	23.3	30	5 individuals	Greseth et al. (2003)
<i>Lamellidens marginalis</i> (India)	41.5	40.1	5.1	13.2	nd	nd	Haldar <i>et al.</i> (2014)
<i>Lamellidens jenkinsianus</i> (India)	48.8	26.0	6.2	19.0	24	nd	Shafakatullah <i>et al.</i> (2013)
<i>Lamellidens generosus</i> (India)	49.4	28.0	6.3	16.5	24	nd	Shafakatullah <i>et al.</i> (2013)
<i>Lamellidens marginalis</i> (India)	48.5	28.5	5.4	17.7	24	nd	Shafakatullah <i>et al.</i> (2013)
<i>Lampsilis cardium</i> (USA)	24.2	45.2	3.8	26.8	32	5 individuals	Greseth et al. (2003)
<i>Parreysia corrugata</i> (India)	44.4	30.7	5.5	19.5	12	nd	Shafakatullah & Krishnamoorthy (2014)
<i>Parreysia favidens</i> (India)	41.2-60.8	14.8-42.3	3.8-8.2	na	nd	nd	Shetty <i>et al.</i> (2013)
<i>Proptera alata</i> (USA)	41.3	33.9	3.5	18.7	1	nd	Parmalee & Klippel (1974)
<i>Quadrula pustulosa</i> (USA)	17.9	61.5	2.7	17.9	32	5 individuals	Greseth et al. (2003)
<i>Radiatula khadakvaslaensis</i> (India)	40.6-57.2	18.3-40.2	3.2-7.6	na	nd	nd	Shetty <i>et al.</i> (2013)

Several freshwater fish (Thailand)	51.0-94.9	0	2.8-42.1	3.2-8.1	1 per species	1-2 kg	Puwastien <i>et al.</i> (1999)
Several freshwater fish (Bangladesh)	51.9-91.1	0	2.0-43.7	2.3-22.7	1 per species	~2 kg	Bogard <i>et al.</i> (2015)
Several freshwater fish (Canada)	80.6-89.4	0	4.9-14.6	4.8-6.8	2-30 per species	10 individuals	Chan <i>et al.</i> (1999)

---

**Table 3.** Ranges of (heavy) metal concentrations measured in (A) dried and (B) wet tissue [ $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ ] of freshwater and marine organisms.

Population	Exclusively/predominantly positive effects							Exclusively negative effects						
	Ca	Fe	K	Mg	Mo	Se	Zn	Al	As	Cd	Hg	Pb	Sb	Sn
(A) DW														
Freshwater mussels (Unionida)														
<i>Pilsbryconcha compressa</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	38,900-45,600	6,730-7,060	1,860-2,030	1,500-1,520	0.28-0.38	1.19-1.45	302-313	1,050-1,310	6.8-7.6*	0.69-0.94	0.06-0.08	10.3-69.4*	0.00-0.01	4.57-8.11
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	50,800-79,200	11,400-16,400	1,930-2,030	1,270-1,580	0.33-0.43	0.99-1.25	348-628*	1,040-1,480	9.6-13.0*	1.78-3.35	0.11-0.13	6.9-9.3 <sup>s</sup>	0.00-0.01	4.54-9.18
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Lake, Malaysia)	16,600-25,500	8,410-17,200	2,200-2,510	710-766	0.54-0.91	1.11-1.77	107-125	1,860-2,240	22.7-32.0*	0.28-0.47	0.09-0.13	12.1-33.0*	0.01-0.03	0.80-9.87
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Pool, Malaysia)	17,400-28,400	6,250-7,680	1,980-2,240	598-688	0.49-0.55	0.40-0.41	97-156	91-160	3.6-4.6 <sup>s</sup>	0.09-0.15	0.04-0.06	2.9-6.9 <sup>s</sup>	0.01-0.01	0.90-7.15
Unionidae (Italy)	39,100-74,100					0.5-1.0		361-642*		12-13*	5-10*	11-23*	0.1-0.2	
Unionidae (Poland)		67-78					31-51			0.04-0.08		0.15-0.21		
<i>Anodonta anatina</i> (UK)							152-3500*			0.1-21.1	0.1-11.8*	0.1-45.9*		
<i>Actinonaias carinata</i> (USA)		122	260											
<i>Anodonta cygnea</i> (Iran)										0.01-0.12		0.03-0.26		
<i>Elliptio complanata</i> (USA)											0.64			
<i>Hyridella menziesi</i> (New Zealand)	11,600-26,900	6,620-27,800	1,210-2,140	592-1010		1.9-9.6	164-313	49-363	15-153*	0.21-0.74	0.09-13.1*	0.51-14*		
<i>Pletholophus swinhoei</i> (Vietnam)	5,200-7,600	390-1,900	3,100-3,200			0.5-0.6	120-150		3.4-4.9 <sup>s</sup>	0.05-0.08		0.49-0.53		

<i>Proptera alata</i> (USA)	125	410												
<i>Unio mancus</i> (Italy)	989- 265,000	166- 16,700					136- 1,120*	1-708						
Other organisms														
<i>Corbicula javonica</i> (freshwater bivalves; Malaysia)							155-205			0.08- 0.62		5.5- 11.5*		
Several freshwater gastropods (Malaysia)							0-185		0-225*		0-0.13	0-2.16		
Several marine bivalves (Malaysia)							24-368			0.18- 8.51		0.1- 19.1*		
<i>Perna viridis</i> (marine bivalve, Malaysia)							75-129			0.68- 1.25		2.5-8.8 <sup>s</sup>		
<i>Acetes</i> sp. (marine shrimp, Malaysia)							29-46			0.04- 0.55		0.07- 0.59		
Several freshwater fish (Cambodia)	20,400- 60,400	27-451					40-203							
<i>Macrobrachium vollenhovenii</i> (freshwater prawn, Nigeria)		1.67- 3.88					9-15					0.45- 1.56		
<hr/>														
(B) WW														
Freshwater mussels (Unionida)														
<i>Pilsbryconcha compressa</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	7,780- 9,110	1,350- 1,410	372-406	299-304	0.06- 0.08	0.24- 0.29	61-63	210-262	1.36- 1.52*	0.14- 0.19	0.01- 0.02	2.0-13. 9*	0.00- 0.00	0.91- 1.62
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	10,170- 15,900	2,270- 3,290	387-407	255-316	0.07- 0.09	0.20- 0.25	70-126*	208-296	1.91- 2.61*	0.36- 0.67	0.02- 0.03	1.4-1.9 <sup>s</sup>	0.00- 0.00	0.91- 1.84
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Lake, Malaysia)	3,330- 5,100	1,680- 3,450	440-503	142-153	0.11- 0.18	0.22- 0.35	21-25	372-448	4.53- 6.39*	0.06- 0.09	0.02- 0.03	2.4-6.6*	0.00- 0.01	0.16- 1.97

<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Pool, Malaysia)	3,480-5,690	1,250-1,540	396-449	120-138	0.10-0.11	0.08-0.08	19-31	18-32	0.72-0.93 <sup>\$</sup>	0.02-0.03	0.01-0.01	0.6-1.4 <sup>\$</sup>	0.00-0.00	0.18-1.43
Other organisms														
Several freshwater fish (Bangladesh)	93-17,000	4.1-190	580-3,500	210-570		0.05-0.49	6-47							
Several freshwater fish (Canada)	66-598	1.4-6.5				0.26-0.60	4.03-5.81		0.01-0.37	0.00-0.01	0.14-0.53*	0.01-0.03		

\*exceeding permissible limits set by Malaysian Food Regulation (1985)

<sup>\$</sup> exceeding permissible limits set by at least one other national standards listed in Suppl. Table 3

Table 3 continued

Population	Both positive and negative effects						n	Sample size per replicate	Source
	Co	Cr	Cu	Mn	Ni	V			
DW									
Freshwater mussels (Unionida)									
<i>Pilsbryconcha compressa</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	0.70-0.75	3.0-12.0 <sup>s</sup>	32.9-70.2	1,530-2,210	1.45-6.92	0.8-1.05	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	1.09-2.24	2.1-2.3	9.2-14.9	2,200-2,840	1.71-2.36	0.31-0.59	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Lake, Malaysia)	0.46-0.62	7.0-17.4 <sup>s</sup>	7.1-8.5	3,240-3,600	3.26-3.76	0.81-0.9	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Pool, Malaysia)	0.38-0.52	1.9-4.6	12.4-110 <sup>s</sup>	1,070-1,850	0.98-1.83	0.18-0.35	3	5-10 individuals	this study
Unionidae (Italy)	0.7-1	0.4-2	13-34	5,090-11,300	5	0.6-2	1	10 individuals	Ravera et al. (2003b)
Unionidae (Poland)	0.06-0.21	0.3-1.1	4.6-9.3	10-61	0-1.32		1	5 individuals	Rzymiski et al. (2014)
<i>Anodonta anatina</i> (UK)			8.2-250 <sup>s</sup>		0.1-45.9		14-16 per population	1 individual	Manly and George (1977)
<i>Actinonaias carinata</i> (USA)							1	na	Parmalee and Klippel (1974)
<i>Anodonta cygnea</i> (Iran)			0.21				3	0.5g DW	Pourang et al. (2010)
<i>Elliptio complanata</i> (USA)							3 per time	Several individuals	Beckvar et al. (2000)
<i>Hyridella menziesi</i> (New Zealand)	0.35-0.83	1.5-2.9	5.8-12.7	1,670-5,110	0.61-1.2		1 per site	8 individuals	Hickey et al. (1995)
<i>Pletholophus swinhoi</i> (Vietnam)		0.14-0.36	2.4-3.2	520-1,600	0.42-0.88		10 per site	1 individual	Wagner and Boman (2004)
<i>Proptera alata</i> (USA)							1	na	Parmalee and Klippel (1974)

<i>Unio mancus</i> (Italy)			4-90	111-32,000			na	na	Ravera et al. (2003a)
Other organisms									
Several freshwater gastropods (Malaysia)			0-115 <sup>s</sup>				na	na	Lau et al. (1998)
<i>Corbicula javonica</i> (Bivalvia, Corbiculidae; Malaysia)			9-19				na	na	Yap and Khairul (2010)
Several marine bivalves, Malaysia)			0.84-36	1.25-7.8			na	na	Hossen et al. (2015)
<i>Perna viridis</i> (marine bivalve, Malaysia)			7.8-20.1				na	na	Yap et al. (2004)
<i>Acetes</i> sp. (marine shrimp, Malaysia)	0.91-1.34		39-56	0.89-1.77			na	8 individuals	Rahouma et al. (2013)
Several freshwater fish (Cambodia)							3	variable	Roos et al. (2007)
<i>Macrobrachium vollehovenii</i> (freshwater prawn, Nigeria)	0.56-1.33		9.63-13.6				na	na	Jimoh et al. (2011)
<hr/>									
WW									
Freshwater mussels (Unionida)									
<i>Pilsbryconcha compressa</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	0.14-0.15	0.59-2.39 <sup>s</sup>	6.57-14.05	306-443	0.29-1.38	0.16-0.21	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Channel, Malaysia)	0.22-0.45	0.42-0.46	1.84-2.98	439-568	0.34-0.47	0.06-0.12	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Lake, Malaysia)	0.09-0.12	1.39-3.47 <sup>s</sup>	1.42-1.69	648-719	0.65-0.75	0.16-0.18	3	5-10 individuals	this study
<i>Sinanodonta woodiana</i> (Pool, Malaysia)	0.08-0.10	0.37-0.93	2.47-21.90 <sup>s</sup>	214-370	0.20-0.37	0.04-0.07	3	5-10 individuals	this study
Other organisms									

Several freshwater fish (Bangladesh)	0.15-1.2	0.18-23	1 per species	~2 kg	Bogard et al. (2015)
Several freshwater fish (Canada)	0.22-0.37		2-30 per species	10 individuals	Chan et al. (1999)

---

**Table 4.** (A) Recommended daily intake and (B) average proportion of RDIs covered by a serving of ~6 freshwater mussels (12g DW or 60g WW) (based on values obtained by the present study)

	Protein	Carbo- hydrates	Ca	Cr	Cu	Fe*	K	Mg	Mn	Mo	Se	Zn
(A) RDIs	[g d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[g d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[mg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[µg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[µg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[mg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[g d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[mg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[mg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[µg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[µg d <sup>-1</sup> ]	[mg d <sup>-1</sup> ]
Adolescents (10-18 yrs)	45-65 <sup>1</sup>	130 <sup>2</sup>	1000 <sup>1</sup>	21-35 <sup>2</sup>	700-890 <sup>2</sup>	9-22 <sup>1</sup>	4.5-4.7 <sup>2</sup>	240-410 <sup>2</sup>	1.6-2.2 <sup>2</sup>	34-43 <sup>2</sup>	23-28 <sup>1</sup>	7.5-9 <sup>1</sup>
Adults (>19 yrs)	51-65 <sup>1</sup>	130 <sup>2</sup>	800-1000 <sup>1</sup>	20-35 <sup>2</sup>	900 <sup>2</sup>	9-20 <sup>1</sup>	4.7 <sup>2</sup>	310-420 <sup>2</sup>	1.8-2.3 <sup>2</sup>	45 <sup>2</sup>	23-33 <sup>1</sup>	4.3-6.7 <sup>1</sup>
(B) % of RDIs covered by a serving of ~6 mussels based on average concentrations of our dataset												
Adolescents (10-18 yrs)	6-9	4	46	229-382	44-56	542-1330	1	3-6	1310-1790	14-18	48-59	35-41
Adults (>19 yrs)	6-8	4	46-58	229-401	43	596-1330	1	3-4	1250-1600	13	41-59	46-72

<sup>1</sup> Ministry of Health Malaysia (2005)

<sup>2</sup> National Academy of Sciences (USA) (2011)

\*assuming 15% bioavailability

**Table 5.** Provisional maximum tolerable intakes (PMTIs) Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) (2014) for nine heavy metals and corresponding average intake values for low intake and high intake of freshwater mussels from four populations in Peninsular Malaysia at sites 1-3 (see Fig. 1 for location of sites). Abbreviations: Pc, *Pilsbryconcha compressa*; Sw, *Sinanodonta woodiana*.

	Al [mg/kg bw/w]	As* [mg/kg bw/w]	Cd [µg/kg bw/m]	Cu [mg/kg bw/d]	Fe [mg/kg bw/d]	Hg [µg/kg bw/w]	Pb [mg/kg bw/w]	Sn [mg/kg bw/w]	Zn [mg/kg bw/d]
PMTI	2	0.015	25	0.5	0.8	4	0.025	14	0.3-1
Low intake (6 mussels per week per 50 kg adult)									
Pc1	0.273	0.000	0.813	0.002	0.237	0.016	0.007	0.002	0.011
Sw1	0.305	0.000	2.670	0.000	0.465	0.030	0.002	0.002	0.016
Sw2	0.498	0.001	0.391	0.000	0.403	0.027	0.005	0.001	0.004
Sw3	0.029	0.000	0.118	0.002	0.248	0.012	0.001	0.001	0.005
High intake (30 mussels per week per 50 kg adult)									
Pc1	1.366	0.001	4.065	0.009	<b>1.184</b>	0.081	<b>0.037</b>	0.008	0.053
Sw1	1.527	0.001	13.350	0.002	<b>2.326</b>	0.151	0.010	0.009	0.080
Sw2	<b>2.490</b>	0.003	1.955	0.001	<b>2.015</b>	0.133	<b>0.027</b>	0.004	0.020
Sw3	0.146	0.001	0.590	0.011	<b>1.242</b>	0.058	0.007	0.006	0.023
Mussels per day to reach PMTI for 50 kg adult/20 kg child									
Pc1	6/3	76/30	26/11	239/96	3/1.2	213/85	3/1	7640/3050	24/10
Sw1	6/2	47/19	8/3	1090/436	2/1	114/46	11/5	7010/2800	16/6
Sw2	3/1	20/8	55/22	1620/647	2/1	129/51	4/2	14900/5600	64/26
Sw3	59/23	133/53	182/73	188/75	3/1	295/118	15/6	10800/4300	56/22

\* assuming a proportion of 10% inorganic (toxic) As in freshwater mussels, which exceeds most of the values obtained to date and is therefore a conservative estimate (Koch et al., 2001; Soeroes et al., 2005; Schaeffer et al., 2006)

