School of Communication and Cultural Studies

Nation, Culture and Family: Identity in a Scottish/Australian Popular Song Tradition

Josephine Kathleen Dougal

This Thesis is presented for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
of
Curtin University of Technology

April 2010

Declaration

To the best of my knowledge and belief this thesis contains no material previously published by any other person except where due acknowledgement has been made.

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university.

Josephine Dougal

May 2011

Contents

Acknowledgements

This project would not have been possible without the involvement of my sisters and brother and their willingness to assist me in 'recovering' and documenting our family song traditions.

I would also like to acknowledge the assistance given to me over the course of this project, and in the years before it became a PhD thesis. Many people in Australia, Scotland, England, the USA and elsewhere provided advice, responded to queries and gave generously of their time and expertise. I am especially grateful to David Atkinson, Valentina Bold, Janey Buchan, John Burnett, John Connell, Ron Day, David Francis, Ian Gadd, Vic Gammon, Jessica Hemming, Marie Hamilton, Jim Hammerton, Peter Hughes, Miriam Jones, Gregory Lauder-Frost, Tim Lawrence, Emily Lyle, Patricia Lysaght, Cathlin Macaulay, Kirsteen McCue, Gavin MacDougall, Ruth Lee Martin, Ed Miller, Martin Moonie, Andrew Newby, Malcolm Prentis, Eric Richards, Jean Ritchie, Steve Roud, Ian Russell, Caroline Scott, Eoin Shalloo, Pete Shepheard, Catherine Shoupe, Jonathan Stock, Robert Strachan, Mark Trewin, Alex Tyrrell, and Sheena Wellington.

In particular, I would like to thank my PhD Supervisor Professor Graham Seal for his wisdom, support and guidance.

1

Introduction

Summary

This study arose out of an interest in my own family's Scottish song traditions and a desire to understand them within a wider cultural context. Its purpose is to create a critical account of music and migrant identity that brings insights from folklore studies, cultural studies, and migration and diaspora studies together to shed light on transcultural identity formation and maintenance. More specifically, it seeks to 'discover' an explanation for why and how the cultural resources/traditions that migrants bring with them continue to have force in migrant family life. It examines the complex of ways in which homeland and hereland are implicated in migrant identities, the role of cultural tradition and family in the migrant experience, and their part in shaping migrant memories, identities and concepts of 'home'.

In examining the salience of homeland culture in migrant family life, this study addresses one of the core questions in migration theory and research, that is, why and how migrants maintain connections to their homeland.[1] Much of the migration theory and research that addresses this question focuses on the role of migrant communities and institutions, ethnic networks, and transnational social, economic and political ties, often stressing the connections between kinship groups and families across borders. Some of this work, in the fields of transnational migration and diaspora studies, has placed greater emphasis on the role of 'imagined' connections, and on the ways in which migrants make symbolic connections to a sense of homeland as a means of supporting new identities.[2] It is these symbolic connections with homeland, rather than the social,

political and economic that this study seeks to investigate. This investigation will focus on music as a source of symbolic connections to homeland, and its role in the construction of family and migrant identity.

The study posits that national/cultural identity is not determined by membership, nor pervasive cultural constructions of identity, but is rather a process in which people draw upon, appropriate and customise these discourses in an active process of self-making. Its guiding proposition is that national/cultural identity arises in the intersection between the 'nation' and the individual, between the 'public' and 'private', and is mediated by the particular social and cultural contexts in which people operate - migration being one such context.

The ways in which the 'nation' comes to have personal relevance at the local level is explored through the interchanges between public song traditions and localised forms of song tradition. The focus of the thesis is on the role of Scottish song culture in constructing representations of national/cultural identity, and how such cultural constructions, their modes of production and dissemination interact with local practices and meanings, and how these dynamics play out in the construction of migrant cultural identity.

In pointing to how the 'nation' is made local in the context of migration, the study challenges the idea that cultural traditions are backward looking and regressive, and frozen in time in diaspora, arguing instead that tradition and the past are actively deployed as key cultural strategies in migrants' creation of home and belonging. In doing so, it makes a case for how collective ideas of nation are appropriated and customised at the local level, and how the cultural construction of Scottishness in song, deployed in a Scottish/Australian migrant family, acted as important referents to their identity and gave shape and meaning to their formulations of Scottish/Australian identity.

Research Context and Rationale

This study brings migration and its impact on families, ethnicity and cultural tradition to bear on family folklore traditions; and draws into the analysis the role of music, memory, and narrative in considerations of identity. This reflects a strategic purpose, that is, to conduct a project that investigates the cross-disciplinary benefits of bringing together folklore, cultural studies and migration studies to a critical investigation of the relationship between culture and identity in the context of migration.[3] In doing so it addresses research areas that have been identified as deserving further attention.

With respect to this project's attempt to bring insights from various fields to bear on this issue, Caroline Brettell and James Hollifield argue that migration is a subject that 'cries out for an interdisciplinary approach'.[4] Elliott Oring, as well as Harris Berger and Giovanna Del Negro also refer to the interdisciplinary nature of folklore, and the contributions of ethnomusicology, performance studies, cultural studies, anthropology, and sociology.[5] The common ground that can be addressed through an interdisciplinary approach is that of 'identity' - a pervasive concept in contemporary folklore studies, and one that is a focus in migration studies. Oring states that 'the definition of folklore has been anchored to a concept of identity. That is to say, when we define and redefine folklore, we are conceptualizing and reconceptualizing a set of cultural materials and their privileged relation to the identities of individuals and groups'.[6] Oring suggests that:

> "Folklorists can begin to explore in what ways their studies augment, deepen, or contradict those depictions of identity delineated by other disciplines using other methods and materials … Situations in which identity is challenged or denied - that is, situations of identity conflict - may prove particularly promising for investigation, as they are arenas in which the contours of identity become most prominent and visible." (Oring, 1994, p 226)

This study brings a long overdue explicit focus on identity to the field of folklore. Oring has argued that identity is under theorised and that 'folklorists need to examine the concept of identity in a more explicit and deliberate manner', and that 'personal identity and its articulation with folklore forms and processes should merit increasing attention'.[7] He also notes that 'when the concept of identity is explicitly confronted, the greatest emphasis is often given to sociological markers, rather than to orienting values, goals, and meanings'.[8] Berger and Del Negro argue that in the field of folklore, identity is 'often used in an uncritical fashion and requires greater attention'.[9]

In the anthropology of migration, questions are also framed in relation to ethnicity, the construction of identity, and a sense of belonging.[10] As Caroline Brettell and James Hollifield remark, 'anthropologists who study migration … want to capture through their ethnography the experience of being an immigrant and the meaning, to the migrants themselves, of the social and cultural changes that result from leaving one context and entering another', including the impact of migration on cultural change, ethnicity and families.[11]

Attention to the experiences of migrants and their formulations of identity, of Scottish migrants in particular, has been patchy. The gaze of scholarship on the Scots across the globe has been, until relatively recently, concerned with broad patterns of population movements and settlement focusing predominantly on the transatlantic linkages with Canada and the USA, and Canada in particular. Moreover, the bulk of these studies look to eighteenth and nineteenth century developments, and the migration of Scottish highlanders rather than lowlanders.[12] The experience of twentieth century Scottish migrants is a major research gap, a fact that Angela McCarthy finds especially surprising given that over 2 million people left Scotland in the twentieth century, and in the period after 1921 around 1.5 million people left Scotland to destinations that included Canada, USA, Australia, and New Zealand.[13] As a consequence, research has largely neglected the experiences of the 600,000 Scots who settled in Australia, notably the 170,000 who did so in the post-war period, most of whom were working class from the industrialised urban lowlands and who settled in the urban part of Australia, as my family did.[14] These

post-war Scottish migrants, like their other British counterparts are, what James Hammerton and Alistair Thomson refer to as, Australia's 'invisible migrants'.[15]

Of the few contemporary studies that do exist, in Australia or elsewhere, the emphasis has tended to fall on the public manifestations of Scottishness, such as participation in Scottish clubs and associations, highland games, pipe bands, and Burns clubs, often relying on public and documentary sources, such as newspapers, magazines, and society records, rather than the experiences of migrants themselves.[16] As McCarthy notes, explanations of Scots identity abroad 'tend to ignore the self-representations of participants, preferring instead to focus on formal and group oriented expressions of ethnic identity', and that few scholars have drawn on the personal testimony of migrants to examine Scottish identities.[17] The result has been that academic considerations of Scottish migration have largely excluded 'the interior sense of Scottishness articulated by many migrants'.[18]

The paucity of contemporary and experiential studies of Scots in diaspora and in Australia in particular, brings with it both advantages and disadvantages to this study. On the positive side of the ledger, one might expect that an absence of established findings and viewpoints might allow for a more unencumbered approach. Such openness could bring the potential for fresh perspectives and the application of insights from fields that have hitherto not played a role in interpretations of Scottish migrant identities. On the down side is that without a body of work to draw from, to 'think' with and without, there is little guidance on how to approach such a subject, with reduced opportunities to build on what has gone before - to engage in an interpretative debate. But these pros and cons are not clear cut. There is in fact a set of well entrenched 'conventional wisdoms' about the Scots, Scottish culture, and the Scots in diaspora. Ironically, it is the weight of that received wisdom, in both the discursive and popular stereotyping of Scottish culture and identity, rather than its absence, which has provided much of the impetus for this study to draw upon fresh perspectives and insights in order to challenge pervasive assumptions.

The idea that diasporas are responsible for preserving homeland culture in aspic remains a widely held view, particularly when it comes to the Scots across the globe.[19] In many ways this view begs the important question of why migrants continue to be engaged with their homeland culture. Moreover, such cultural analysis and criticism tends to focus on public representations and national traditions, thus turning attention away from more localised and privatised forms of traditionality. Such a focus on 'public Scottishness' has typically been used as the basis for judgments about the importance, role and nature of Scottish identity in the lives of Scottish migrants.[20] Compounding and confounding the 'easy' association made between public culture and private culture and meaning is a wider critique of Scottish popular culture and 'invented' highland tradition. That critique continues to exert a surprising tenacity within prevailing discourse, both in domestic accounts of Scottish culture and in diaspora.[21] It makes a powerful claim on the questions that are pursued, and the lenses through which opinions, accounts and research is conducted. The few studies that do address the actual experiences of contemporary Scots often need first to clear away well entrenched assumptions and untested hypotheses.[22]

As will be examined in more detail in subsequent chapters, the traditions, icons, symbols, and images associated with the highlands and a domestic 'hearth and home' Scotland have come to signify the degradation of Scottish culture at home and abroad. The critique focuses on the public personae of Scottishness in popular culture, product marketing, tourism, heritage industries, and forms of display. It is Scotland as a land of kilts, haggis, whisky and heather - of *Brigadoon*, *Dr Finlay's Case Book*, *Brave Heart*, Harry Lauder and Andy Stewart, and the cult of national heroes like Robert Burns and Sir Walter Scott. In the critique of Scottish culture, the signifiers of national distinctiveness are judged kitsch and tokenistic, as 'tartan monsters', and forms of 'display identity' - substitute forms of culture.[23] This 'sub-cultural Scotchery' as Tom Nairn has described it, is a 'mindless popular culture revolving in timeless circles', 'a kind of pervasive, second-rate, sentimental slop associated with tartan, nostalgia, Bonnie Prince Charlie, Dr Finlay, and so on'.[24] The popular Scottish song culture that my family drew on for its singing entertainments, the songs of Harry Lauder, Andy Stewart and

Robert Burns, are emblematic of what Nairn would describe as 'a huge virtually self-contained universe of *Kitsch*'.[25] On the face of it these family songs are the archetypal sentimental Scottish songs that critics of Scottish culture deplore. These songs participate in and celebrate the universal Scottish stereotypes of kilts, highlands, history and heather, brave soldiers and bonnie laddies and lassies, and comic music hall caricature.

These popular representations and pervasive national identifiers of Scottishness are viewed as signifiers of 'a reductive and limiting stereotype', manufactured for export to diaspora markets, and one that has come to dominate Scottish culture.[26] David McCrone, who has perhaps done more to challenge this critique of Scottish culture in the domestic context, nevertheless suggests that the 'role of the diaspora in preserving the homeland in aspic is especially important'.[27] The false and invented culture that is 'consumed' in diaspora is judged backward looking, parochial and conservative, primarily serving the needs of the market place and the nostalgic and sentimental needs of Scots abroad. What is consumed is a Scotland frozen in time - an invented eighteenth/nineteenth century time that is disconnected from a contemporary Scotland.[28] For critics like Nairn, this Scotland - 'largely defined by émigrés'- looks 'constantly backwards and inwards, in a typical vein of deforming nostalgia - constantly confirming a false, 'infantile' image of the country quite divorced from its 'real problems' '.[29]

The popularity and engagement of Scots abroad with these 'invented' traditions and popular forms is seen as particular evidence of a 'false' and stereotyped Scottishness. It is a form of 'commodity nationalism', and 'display identity' where, as Richard Zumkhawala-Cook asserts, 'national identity is reflected through the consumption of tokens of the nation', and of 'mass-marketed artifacts of culture'.[30] At its worst it 'embraces a narrow version of Scottish culture and transforms it into a hobby', or as Duncan Sim suggests, a leisure time activity that is 'merely symbolic'.[31]

One important consequence of these discourses and the focus of migration studies on Scottish associations, clubs and display is that it is the public and visible manifestations

of Scottishness that have shaped interpretations of Scottish identity in diaspora (and in the domestic context). Such research orientations and discourses present an 'homogeneous portrait of collective group identity' that interprets and judges Scottishness by its outward manifestations.[32] As David McCrone argues, the problem with prevailing discourses on Scottish culture is that they often rest on 'a set of comfortable assumptions', are often outmoded, and seek to 'essentialise' a national identity through its cultural forms.[33] In diaspora, visible Scottishness is taken as a marker, a surrogate measure, of the extent or otherwise of cultural assimilation, and the nature, depth and strength of Scottish identity for migrants. In countries where such 'public Scottishness' has been observed to be in decline, such as in Australia, the assumption has been that Scottishness was no longer an important aspect of migrants' identities.[34] McCarthy observes that, 'despite the lack of sustained and systematic scrutiny … scholars have been content to reinforce the view that Scottishness among migrants declined in the twentieth century, allegedly continuing an erosion that had begun the century before'.[35]

One such account of post-war Scots in Australia, presents a view of Scottish migrants as quietly assimilating into Australia culture 'eager to blend in' and showing 'little interest in presenting displays of 'Scottishness' '. Its author, Irene Bain, makes her argument by drawing a line between the 'lifestyle of post-war Scots' and 'public Scottish culture' - a line that seeks to demarcate migrant Scots from 'the 5.73 million Australians with some Scottish ancestry'. It is the latter who participate in and promulgate the 'invented traditions' of a nineteenth century highland romantic tradition of 'bagpipes, dances, games and tartan', where such public Scottishness is 'the prerogative of Australians in search of their heritage'.[36] This public Scottishness 'popularly styles the Scot as a dour and discreet, industrious and independent individual with a strong sense of morality and pride in tradition'.[37] On the other hand, the migrant Scot described by Bain, appears little different from this popular stereotype. The migrant Scot lives a quiet, reserved family-oriented life with a 'distaste for pretentiousness', who prefers to sing at home rather than take to the stage as a performer, and who's 'pride in Scotland and kinship links with the country are more likely to be expressed by a Scottish landscape calendar in the home

than by public display'.[38] Scottish migrants' preference for homeland Scottish culture in the form of 'Scottish soccer, magazines and recorded music' exemplifies, according to Bain, how they 'hark back to Scotland rather than create or identify with an Australian version'.[39]

This account, of necessity a highly condensed overview for inclusion in an encyclopaedia of the Australian people, first published in 1988 and updated in 2001, in many ways falls prey to the kind of stereotyping that the piece seeks to separate from the daily lives of 'ordinary' Scottish migrants. While pointing to the private, family-oriented and domestic contours of Scottish migrant identity, the impression given is one of a private Scottishness that is static, parochial, backward looking and tokenistic with Scottish wall calendars, magazines, music, soccer and Robert Burns representing the sum of Scottishness for migrants.

Whether it is in the context of the domestic Scottishness of migrants or the public Scottishness of Australians in search of their heritage, this account like many others, interprets Scottishness by its cultural forms, as artifacts of identity. The outward manifestations of Scottishness - whether they be in the form of wall calendars, recordings of popular Scottish music, or in the public display of highland games, dancing and tartan - are read off as 'signs' of a largely undifferentiated Scottishness, where the meanings of ubiquitous tokens, icons and symbols of Scottishness are 'assumed' rather than 'discovered'. While Bain's account lifts the curtain on the public personae of Scottishness to glimpse the existence of a more private and domestic sense of Scottishness, it renders it less central to migrant identity. The very ordinariness and ubiquitous nature of personal and domestic cultural forms are interpreted as reflecting an equally mundane and tokenistic personal Scottish identity, and the interior world of Scottishness for migrants remains largely unexamined in the shadows of a fixed stereotype. The implication of this is that if Australian Scottish migrants are keen to 'blend in', to assimilate and maintain only tokens of their Scottish identity; and if participation in 'public Scottishness' in the form of highland games, Scottish associations and so on is the preserve of Australians seeking their heritage then, by

inference, Scottishness plays a weak role in the lives of migrant Scots - it remains a tokenistic affair.

Whether visible Scottishness is on the rise or the wane, it is the public manifestations that have largely shaped interpretations of Scottish identity in diaspora. It is somewhat of an irony that where Scottishness is highly visible such as increasingly in the USA, it is judged false and not 'true Scottishness'. It is seen as 'paying lip service' to an 'adopted' Scottish identity - one that is invented, fabricated and turned into a leisure activity or hobby. The idea that Scots in diaspora pay lip service to their identity continues as a common theme, and one that frames the accounts of Bain, Zumkhawala-Cook, and Sim discussed above. Tom Devine, recently appointed director of the Scottish Centre of Diaspora Studies at Edinburgh University, dismisses the resurgence of highland celebrations and associations in diaspora as a modern phenomenon. He appears to suggest that since the Scots in the USA 'assimilated quickly' and have not 'retained the same level of expatriate ethnic identity as Irish Americans', they only pay lip service to their Scottish identity: 'This recent thing we have seen is an invention of the last quarter of a century, not the continuation of an ancient sense of identity dating back into the 19th century. It is new, the invention of tradition: Tartan Day, tartan week, the Highland games phenomenon - all of that is of recent vintage'.[40]

McCarthy counters theses views with her argument that such 'highly visible displays of stereotypical Scottish symbols and icons … via clans, societies, pipes, kilts, and dancing' while 'centered on the celebration of traditions exported from their homeland', were 'constantly negotiated and adapted, both privately and publicly, according to the purpose they were intended to serve'.[41] Moreover, while 'the Scots in North America were more likely to highlight the public character of their ethnicity', elsewhere, such as in Australia, 'Scottishness was more likely to be a private affair'.[42] Yet even for the Americans, their 'colourful and noisy' public expressions of cultural identity was no mere 'lip service' to their Scottish heritage and identity. Their Scottishness, like the Australian Scots in her study, was 'deeply social and cultural', and although these Scots 'proclaimed an external identity through their societies, they also internalised their

constructions of Scottishness', where language, custom and family played key roles in the fashioning of their Scottish identities.[43] A personal sense of Scottishness was thus both external and internal, public and private, blending, blurring and influencing each other. The inter-war migrant Scots in both North America and Australasia:

> "… exhibited both an institutional, as well as an emotional, mental and social version of Scottishness. The fashioning of an intimate, personal sense of Scottishness is discernible in their language, customs and interaction with other Scots, while the main institutional expression of Scottishness was migrant participation in Scottish societies." (McCarthy, 2006 (a), pp 204-205)

Hammerton's recent study of the post-war Scottish migrants in Australia, that also draws on personal testimony, similarly complicates 'common stereotypes of migrant identity' and interpretations of national and cultural identity that rely upon public display and 'institutional records of church and national loyalty organizations for their chief perspective', where the contingent nature of identity is rarely evident. The mere existence of these organisations, he argues, 'tells us little about Scottish-Australian migrant identity' and that 'it is easy to overestimate their heritage role as nurturers of enduring Scottish national identity among new migrants'. As he notes, 'at its most simplistic this can be an exercise in simply counting the number of Scottish societies and taking their vitality and importance for granted'.[44] Hammerton's work illustrates how, in the Australian context, 'migrants' evolving valuation of their Scottish identity was played out in the family rather than in public institutions' - a domestic context that McCarthy also acknowledges as playing a key role in Scottish migrant identities.[45]

Hammerton's and McCarthy's work serves to contradict Devine's provocative suggestion, at least for the Scottish migrant experience in the United States, that they 'may have paid lip service to their identity … but they no longer required it, and haven't needed it since'.[46] In the American case, as McCarthy argues, the high visibility of 'display identity', apparently disconnected from an overt political agenda does not imply that 'Scottishness was redundant among the Scots abroad'.[47] In the Australian case, the

fact that Scottish identities were played out predominantly in the private sphere and in family contexts, within a declining 'public Scottishness', also does not mean that Scottishness was unimportant for migrants. As Hammerton's work reveals, although it may be less visible, more personalised and 'nuanced', Scottishness played a complex part in migrant identities.[48]

This recent work that draws on personal experiences and testimony of migrants also points to how 'monolithic' and 'homogenous' portraits of collective Scottish identity and discourses can fail to grasp the meanings that a national culture has for migrants themselves, and the reasons that homeland cultural forms may continue to have force in migrant life. As will be argued in this study, much of those arguments are predicated on the notion that people are simply passive 'consumers' of popular culture, that people are cultural dupes falling for the fake instead of the real thing - arguments that reflect a certain anxiety about popular culture in general, and an emphasis on the determining power of cultural forms and processes (structure) over individual and group meaning making (agency). They also fail to recognise the distinction between the icons of a culture that are seen to represent it and the multivocality, malleability and contingent nature of those symbolic forms. The meanings of cultural forms are not sets of fixed, naturally occurring characteristics of a people or place. Their meaning resides in what people do with them. As McCrone argues, cultural forms ought not be seen as reflecting an essential national identity, but rather their importance lies in how they help to construct and shape identity.[49] Anthony Cohen also draws an important distinction between the 'icons' of a culture that represent ethnic identity at the collective level as 'apparently monolithic', and the 'continual reconstruction of ethnicity at the personal level'.[50] His argument provides a powerful corrective to the view, discussed above, that Scottish identity in diaspora is 'merely symbolic'. Indeed, to dismiss the 'iconization of culture' as 'merely symbolic' is to miss the powerful meaning making role that symbols serve across all cultural contexts:

"It would be quite incorrect to construe as cynical these representations of identity in somewhat contrived cultural terms: their expression and use speaks rather of a

commitment to the integrity of culture and group. It is only by making the culture visible, so to speak, that its bearers can gain some awareness of what they have to defend, and those to whom it is vulnerable can be made aware of what they might otherwise damage, unwittingly or deliberately. So far as indigenes are concerned, the iconization of culture is no more than a means of agreeing on a very limited number and range of symbols as a kind of lowest common denominator, which can be interpreted and rendered privately by each of them in ways to suit themselves. Apparent uniformity in the terms of public discourse glosses over an uncountable multitude of divergences of meaning. But for outsiders, it is a caution against their cultural blindness." (A P Cohen, 1993, pp 24-25)

Moreover, while a culture is represented *as* identity through symbolic form, those forms are the *means* not the *ends* of expression and representation - they are carriers or vehicles of meaning. 'One can easily posit the icons of a culture - tartanry, cuisine, costume, music - but what these mean is unspecifiable, because their meanings vary among all those who use them'.[51] Cohen cautions against reading culture as 'a body of substantive fact (which it is not)'. Culture is 'a body of symbolic form which provides means of expression but does not dictate what is expressed or the meaning of what is expressed'.[52] In this way, as Cohen notes, culture is a matter less for 'documentation' than for 'interpretation'.

The import of Cohen's warning against reading culture as 'a body of substantive fact' is, as McCrone advises, that we not only 'have to be cautious in assuming that Scottishness denotes the same thing through both time and place' but also that we need to be clear about whose Scottishness we are talking about.[53] In talking about cultural forms of Scottishness, we also need to recognise that culture is not a form of consumption, but a form of production. Individuals and social groups appropriate, interpret, make meaningful, and use cultural forms, in the lived practices of everyday life.[54] Michael Pickering and Tony Green suggest that in localised and privatised forms of tradition, cultural forms are 'actively deployed', and assimilated into day-to-day life. They argue that while localised and privatised forms of tradition may be 'indistinct in practice from

dominant constructions … (they) … are not wholly identical with them'.[55] They constitute 'ways of handling experience' that can be used to 'inform people's sensibilities and social identities, their own understandings and social values'.[56] Their position, together with recent conceptualisations of tradition in folk song and folklore scholarship, also challenges the notion of popular tradition being 'an unambiguously conservative process of serial repetition' - a position that also finds support in performance theory that sees each repetition of a 'cultural performance' as creating new meaning, and not as mere repetition of something static and fixed.[57]

Writers such as Pickering and Green, Anthony Cohen, and Jonathan Hearn emphasise the personalised and localised dimensions of identity. Pickering and Green point to the ways in which dominant cultural constructions and their modes of production and dissemination interact with local practices and meanings. At the local level, 'people develop a sense of belonging through the use of cultural resources that are available to them in a process of individual meaning-construction within group contexts'.[58] For Cohen, attachment to nation is not determined by membership, but rather by the personal meanings that nation has for individuals. People interpret and construct the nation in terms of personal and local experience. Thus, individuals 'interpretively construct their identities as members of collectives through their unique experience of them'.[59] For Hearn, national identity becomes salient for people, drawn upon and made personally relevant when it resonates with experiences of agency in particular social contexts. Such localised social contexts, such as that of family, work, leisure activities, clubs and associations, are important in what he describes as 'the practical, everyday instantiation of Scottishness'.[60]

While the idea of diaspora can tend to imply a unity across the larger group, such a 'unity' may not necessarily be the primary agent in migrants' quest for kin and community. Several accounts and studies in the fields of diaspora, migration and transnationalism stress that it is often in smaller local groups, within families and within each generation that migrants find ways to construct identities. Research in this area has emphasised the specific social, structural and economic contexts, the lived social

interactions, through which migrant groups shape their identities and destinies.[61] Mark Slobin suggests that it is at the local level of 'diasporic neighborhoods' that much of the meaning of diaspora lies, and Brettell states that it is often through family life that migrants 'articulate the world they have left with the world they have entered'.[62] Nancy Foner, for example, addresses the question of why migrants' cultural traditions continue to have force in migrant family life. She argues that the cultural understandings, meanings, and symbols that migrants bring with them from their homeland are critical in understanding migrant family life. These cultural patterns continue to have a 'powerful influence in shaping family values and norms as well as the actual patterns of behavior that develop in the new setting'.[63] As migrants reconstruct and redefine family life, old cultural patterns play a critical role in the family's 'creative culture-building'. McCarthy's and Hammerton's studies also underscore the ways in which Scottish identities in diaspora are shaped by migrants' particular life histories and circumstances, and family relationships.[64]

The conceptualisation of transnational identities also points to the ways in which migrant identity is often tied to connections between the local and specific networks that link host country with home country. Anne-Marie Fortier's study, for example, examines 'the formation of local particularity in relation to local, national and transnational connections'. She describes her work as part of a growing body of work that explores how a 'diasporic mode of existence mediates the formation of localized cultures, identities or communities'.[65] At that local level, as James Clifford remarks, 'diaspora cultures work to maintain community, selectively preserving and recovering traditions, 'customizing' and 'versioning' them in novel, hybrid … situations'.[66] Akhil Gupta and James Ferguson observe that although 'homeland' remains one of the most powerful unifying symbols for migrant groups, 'the relation to homeland may be very differently constructed in different settings' and that 'aspects of our lives remain highly 'localized' in a social sense'. We therefore need to 'remain sensitive to the profound 'bifocality' that characterizes locally lived lives in a globally interconnected world, and the powerful role of place'.[67]

It is these sets of relationships between the private and the public, between privatised localised tradition and public national tradition, between homeland and hereland that this study attempts to map. It explores the theoretical question of the relationship between the public and personal constructions of identity through an analysis of the relationship between the song culture of a nation and the song culture of a suburban family. Such a focus on how public constructions of national and cultural identity play out in the construction of family and migrant identity seeks to bridge the gap between public and personal formulations of national identity. Hearn, for example, notes that although the conceptual question of how public and personal formulations of national identity interact is widely recognised, there has been 'a relative lack of attention to the role of the structures and contexts through which the social and personal interact'.[68] He also notes the bias in social research towards the public manifestations of national identity - 'when it comes to actually studying nationalisms and national identities, it is publicly accessible discourses and their social distributions that we normally turn our attention to'.[69]

The bias in both cultural analysis and criticism, and migration studies toward public representations and manifestations of identity has drawn attention away from more localised and privatised forms of traditionality, as Pickering and Green have argued. But it has also not drawn into the analysis of identity insights from popular culture studies and folkloric approaches that can assist in making the connections between the 'public' and 'private'. In addressing this issue, this study also brings an historical dimension to the study of popular culture, and adds to the small body of work on the cultural history of popular music forms. As Barbara Henkes and Richard Johnson have observed, cultural studies has often been 'insufficiently concerned with the longer-term past of cultural forms and the ways they have changed their meanings and use with social or geographical location'.[70]

While much of popular culture studies eschews the past in examining how audiences, listeners, and readers make sense of the material they encounter, this study will address the importance of the past in shaping the cultural representations that people work with.

Popular music studies tend to focus on the contemporary, new media and the young, and an explicit recognition of the complex relationships between culture, politics and economics. Folklore and folk music studies typically look to people's traditions, especially oral traditions, and to relationships between past and present. The cultural study of music thus has tended to fall into two camps, that which is concerned with music as an industry and that which is concerned with music as a cultural tradition.[71]

One of the significant challenges in the field of contemporary folklore research is to find a language for talking about the localised culture of groups that does not rely on these well entrenched distinctions, while at the same time acknowledging and taking into account the intersections between the commerce of music and the use of music in local settings. As Henkes and Johnson argue, both the public media forms and the 'lived experiences' of individuals and groups need to be analysed together.[72] This would mean attending to the ways in which dominant cultural constructions and their modes of production and dissemination interact with local practices and meanings. Both perspectives are pertinent to an account of Scottish song culture and its relationship to family song culture.[73]

Writers such as Martin Stokes, Mark Slobin, John Connell and Chris Gibson point out that how and why different musical styles are embraced by migrant groups is affected by varied and complex factors, not all of which are fully understood.[74] Many studies have focused on music's role in the active assertions of migrant identity and as a vehicle of ethnic, cultural or political agency or defiance.[75] Fewer studies have focused on the ways in which migrant groups use music in more benign ways, as might be said of the role of music in my family. A focus in many migrant studies has also been with the experiences of people who have moved to a new country that is culturally different from their homeland. Far less attention has been given to those who migrate to a country that is culturally similar, as in the case of British migrants to Australia.[76] Hammerton and Catharine Coleborne make the point that it is this similarity that probably accounts for much of the scholarly neglect.[77]

The songs themselves also pose a challenge for analysis since they were derived from Scotland's urban song culture of the twentieth century, a culture that is not particularly well documented. While the past history of traditional Scottish music and its influence on Scottish culture and the culture of other countries has received research attention, information on the social uses of more recent song culture has attracted less interest. The song traditions of suburban families have also been generally absent from contemporary scholarship in cultural studies of music, ethnomusicology, and folkloric studies. There is little existing work that deals specifically with the social role of music in domestic intimate family settings.[78] As Gary West notes, the impact of popular music, in terms of its 'ongoing relationship between people, music and the home has yet to be uncovered'.[79] This is despite the fact that the domestic Scottish home acts a 'hub of the onward transmission, through both time and space, of received traditions of whatever form'.[80] Moreover, household music 'is a basic ingredient in the complex web of ethnicity'.[81]

This study will contribute to the literature on the cultural analysis of the role of music in everyday life, and the role of families in perpetuating musical and migrant culture. It will also bring memory studies, narrative and performance theory to bear on the analysis of music in family and migrant life.[82] In addition, studies of Scottish music in Australia tend to focus on the traditional music in early settlement times. There is little work on contemporary Scottish/Australians, and that which does exist tends to focus on the public records and/or public display. Information on the cultural life of suburban families in Scotland is also scant.[83] This study will therefore provide new material on both Scottish family life and migrant life; and will add to the comparatively small information base on the characteristics of Scottish migrant groups in Australia.

---

[1] See Brettell and Hollifield's recent survey of interdisciplinary theory and research on migration, and specifically their summary of key research objectives (Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p vii).

[2] For useful summaries see Schmitter Heisler, 2008, pp 96-97; and Brettell, 2008, pp 121-122.

[3] See Denzin and Lincoln: 'Over the past quarter century, a quiet methodological revolution has been occurring in the social sciences; a blurring of disciplinary boundaries is taking place. The social and policy sciences and the humanities are drawing closer together in a mutual focus on an interpretive, qualitative approach to research and theory' (Denzin and Lincoln, 2005, p ix).

[4] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p vii.

[5] Oring, 1994, p 225. Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p x. See also Barbara Henkes and Richard Johnson, who suggest that possibilities for cross-disciplinary learning exist in cultural studies, folklore studies, and social history; and that cultural studies itself 'may be inspired and deepened by the empirical engagements that folklore and history may bring' (Henkes and Johnson, 2002, p 139). Thomas McKean also notes the increasing multidisciplinary nature of folkloric fields such as ballad studies (McKean, 2003 (b), p 1).

[6] Oring, 1994, p 223.

[7] Oring, 1994, p 226.

[8] Oring, 1994, p 229.

[9] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 129.

[10] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, pp 20-21.

[11] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 5.

[12] See McCarthy, 2004, 2006 (a) and (c). She notes that 'although the broad sweep of Scottish migration provides an important context, by and large the experiences of those involved in the processes of relocation and settlement have been astonishingly neglected' (McCarthy, 2006 (b), p 2). She also notes 'the palpable dearth of research into the Scots in Australasia and the United States, compared with sustained study of the Scots in Canada' (McCarthy, 2006 (a) p 203).

[13] McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 203.

[14] See Malcolm Prentis, 2008, pp 73-76. In 1947 almost 15 % of the Australian population was of Scottish origin based on place of birth census data (Lucas, 2001, p 668). In 1978 it was estimated that approximately 2 million Australians were of predominantly Scottish 'ethnic origin' (Prentis, 2008, p 76).

[15] Hammerton and Thomson, 2005. See also Prentis for how Australian studies of migration and ethnicity have also 'bypassed' the British (Prentis, 2008, p 1). In addition, the folklore of Australians has also remained 'hidden' (see Graham Seal, 1998).

[16] McCarthy, 2006 (c), p 206. See also McCarthy, 2004.

[17] McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 205.

[18] McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 209.

[19] This study employs the term 'diaspora' broadly to encompass what Tololian describes as a large 'semantic domain' that includes 'words like immigrant, expatriate, refugee, guest-worker, exile community, overseas community, ethnic community' (Tololian 1991, pp 4-5, quoted in Clifford, 1994, p

302). The utility of 'diaspora' for this study is in the way that it has fruitfully been deployed as an analytical tool by writers such as Brah, 1996; Fortier, 2000; Clifford, 1994; Gilroy, 1993; Slobin, 2003; Appadurai and Breckenridge, 1989; Gupta and Ferguson, 1992; Ganguly, 1992; Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1994.

[20] Historical accounts of Scottish migration and settlement in Australia have looked to Scottish associations and societies for evidence of such. See, for example, Bain, 2001; Prentis, 2008; Jim Hewitson, 1998; Stephen Constantine, 2003, p 24, and pp 29-30. This point has been made by McCarthy, 2006 (a) and (c); Hammerton, 2006 (a); Hammerton and Thomson, 2005.

[21] See David McCrone for a detailed examination of these discourses on Scottish culture (McCrone, 2001, pp 127-148). McCarthy also notes the pervasive influence of these discourses in interpretations of Scottish identities abroad (McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 201). For examples of recent accounts that focus on 'Highlandism' in the American Scottish diaspora see Zumkhawala-Cook, 2005; Sim, 2005; Celeste Ray, 2001; E Hague, 2002 (a) and (b). See also Prentis, 'Caledonian activities have been criticised for trivialising or romanticising static notions of Scottishness' (Prentis, 2008, p 197).

[22] See, for example, McCarthy 2006 (a) and (c); Hammerton, 2006 (a); Ray, 2001.

[23] 'Tartan monster' and 'display identity' are concepts developed by Tom Nairn in The Break-up of Britain. Nairn's book is described by McCrone as being 'the most powerful and dominant analysis of Scottish culture' (McCrone, 2001, p 129). In it, Nairn describes the tartan monster as 'vulgar Scottishism, or tartanry', a form of cultural sub-nationalism, that 'appears to represent a national-popular tradition' (Nairn, 2003, p 150).

[24] Nairn, 2003, p 151 and p 102.

[25] Nairn, 2003, p 150.

[26] David Goldie, 2000, p 11.

[27] McCrone, 2001, p 138.

[28] See McCrone, 2001, and Andrew Nash, 1997, for accounts of these arguments that have been espoused by writers such as, Nairn, 2003; Colin McArthur, 1981 and 1982; Christopher Harvie, 1988 (a) and (b). Some recent studies (though few that deal with the Scottish diaspora) provide a corrective to this view by attending to the contemporary meanings that such engagement with tradition and custom have for migrants themselves. See, for example, McCarthy, 2006 (a) and (c); Fortier, 2000; James, 2000; Shelemay, 1998; Ray, 2001; Connell and Gibson, 2004. Also see Alex Tyrrell, 2006.

[29] Nairn, 2003, pp 148-149.

[30] Zumkhawala-Cook, 2005, p 113 and p 116.

[31] Zumkhawala-Cook, 2005, p 132; and Sim, 2005, p 4. Here, Sim is drawing on H Gans' (1979) notion of 'symbolic ethnicity', ie a chosen or adopted identity.

[32] McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 205.

[33] McCrone, 2001, p 173 and p 143.

---

[34] See, for example, Bain, 2001. Hammerton, 2006 (a), notes the general findings about the decline of 'public Scottishness' in Australia, but does not accept that Scottish identity was less important for migrants, neither does McCarthy, 2006 (a).

[35] McCarthy, 2006 (a), pp 203-204.

[36] Bain, 2001, p 668.

[37] Bain, 2001, p 668.

[38] Bain, 2001, p 674.

[39] Bain, 2001, p 674.

[40] Devine, quoted in '*Diaspora in Europe 'real homecoming story''*, *Times Online*, 27 November, 2008.

[41] McCarthy, 2006 (b), p 13, and 2006 (c), p 213. See also Tyrrell, 2006.

[42] McCarthy, 2006 (c), p 222.

[43] McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 219.

[44] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 228.

[45] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 229. McCarthy notes, 'Scottishness was also amplified within a family context, for families were frequently the transmitter of identities' (McCarthy, 2006 (c), p 214).

[46] McCarthy quoting Devine reported in '*Scotland's Exiles Can Follow Irish Lead', The Scotsman*, 27 October, 2001, (McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 202).

[47] McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 202.

[48] Hammerton, 2004, p 233.

[49] McCrone, 2001, p 145.

[50] A P Cohen, 1993, p 198.

[51] A P Cohen, 1993, p 201.

[52] A P Cohen, 1993, p 207.

[53] McCrone, 2001, p 154.

[54] Storey, 2003 (a), p 58.

[55] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 17.

[56] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 3.

[57] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 39. See also Deborah James, 2000, and Paul Gilroy, 1993, for similar positions with respect to the music of migrants, and the role of music in diaspora. James argues that 'links with custom and continuity serve not to make for something static and unchanging … but to maintain a sense of identity despite the changes and adaptations for which tradition allows' (James, 2000, p 189). See David Atkinson, 2004 (b), for a detailed analysis of the concept of tradition in folk song study; and, Berger and Del Negro, 2004, for the role of tradition in the practices of everyday life. For perspectives in performance theory see Richard Bauman, 1984 and 1986; Bauman and Charles Briggs, 1990; Judith Butler, 1993 and 1999.

[58] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 12.

[59] A P Cohen, 1996, p 812.

---

[60] Hearn, 2007, pp 671-672.

[61] See, for example, Brettell, 2008, p 132-133; Schmitter Heisler, 2008, pp 85-89; Foner, 1997 (a); Fortier, 2000; Shelemay, 1998; Slobin, 2003, pp 289-290.

[62] Slobin, 2003, p 290. Brettell, 2008, p 124.

[63] Foner, 1997 (a), p 962.

[64] McCarthy, 2006 (a) and (c), and Hammerton, 2006 (a).

[65] Fortier, 2000, p 17.

[66] Clifford, 1994, p 317, reflecting on Paul Gilroy's analysis of diaspora in *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*, 1993.

[67] Akhil Gupta and James Ferguson, 1992, p 11.

[68] Hearn, 2007, p 659.

[69] Hearn, 2007, p 658. A similar point has been made by Anthony Cohen. He argues that in the failure to distinguish adequately between collective representations and personal interpretations of them, the 'agency of the self in the construction of the nation' is understated, and moreover, risks misunderstanding nationalism itself (A P Cohen, 1996, p 804).

[70] Henkes and Johnson, 2002, pp 138-139.

[71] The inheritance of these distinctions can also be seen in the divergence of academic disciplines, see Henkes and Johnson, 2002, and Storey, 2003 (a). Kirshenblatt-Gimblett remarks that because folklore is understood as oral tradition, it 'tends to be defined over and against technology, first writing and print, then recording and broadcast technologies, and finally digital media' (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998, p 283). Also see Pickering and Green's view that the folk-urban polarity should be rejected, and also the commercial/vernacular polarity (Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), pp 10 and 15). Also see Berger and Del Negro, 2004, and Oring, 1994, for conventional/traditional and contemporary accounts of folklore. David Hesmondhalgh also discusses the bias in popular culture music studies towards the young and the neglect of other audiences and other domestic uses of music (Hesmondhalgh, 2002).

[72] Henkes and Johnson, 2002, p 140.

[73] Some recent studies that embrace a broad notion of 'popular' and recognise the interactions between oral and print traditions, between commercial and non-commercial dissemination processes; and challenge the dichotomy of oral versus literate/elite versus popular provide useful examples and concepts. See Storey, 2003 (a); I Russell and Atkinson, 2004; Atkinson, 2004 (a) and (b); Pickering and Green, 1987; Richard Middleton, 1985; Martin Clayton, et al, 2003; Thomas Crawford, 1979; Dianne Dugaw, 1996; Cathy Preston and Michael Preston, 1995. Insights from the field of cultural geography and the place of music in social and economic processes will also help to frame this analysis, see John Connell and Chris Gibson, 2004, and Andrew Leyshon, et al, 1998.

[74] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 164. See also Martin Stokes, 1997, and Slobin, 1994.

[75] Also noted in Shelemay, 1998, p 90. See discussion of examples in Connell and Gibson, 2004, pp 160-191, and Stokes, 1997, p 18. See also Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, for discussion of examples of more benign uses of music by migrant groups.

[76] Tim Phillips and Robert Holton, 2004, p 732.

[77] Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001, p 86. Published accounts from one recent project based on the oral histories of post-war British migrants to Australia is yielding a number of British and specific Scottish examples of migrant experience, see Hammerton, 2006 (a) and (b); Hammerton and Thomson, 2005; Hammerton, 2004; Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001. See also McCarthy 2006 (a) and (c), and her other accounts of Scottish migrants to Australia 2004, and 2008. Also see Mary Rose Liverani's memoir of growing up in Scotland and Australia in the 1950's (Liverani, 1976).

[78] West notes the paucity of studies of music in domestic settings in Scotland (West, 2006, p 130). Pickering and Green also note that singing in domestic contexts has not received sufficient attention (Pickering and Green, 1987 (c), p 177). Ian Russell has also commented that the lack of attention to the performative aspects of song traditions in settings, such as, family gatherings, weddings and Christmas celebrations is 'a scholarly disgrace' (I Russell, 1987 (a), p 73). In addition, studies of local song traditions have tended to focus on individual singers, their repertoires, narrative song, relationships between performer and audience, and less so on the group, the participatory and spontaneous (Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 145). Dave Russell notes that 'despite exceptional work on Irish and Scottish folk traditions, the general social history of music in Scotland, Wales and Ireland has been hugely neglected' (D Russell, 1993, p 148). See also Peter Symon, 1997, pp 203-216. Scottish children's rhymes of the street and playground (that form part of my family's song traditions) have been collected and published, but less so been the subject of contemporary cultural analysis, other than as children's lore. There is a lack of research on the songs of Robert Burns compared to his poetry, see McCue, 1997; McQuirk, 2006; Davis, 2004; R Crawford, 2009; T Crawford, 1979; Low, 1993, for such commentaries. There is, however, some work that allows an insight into the social and cultural history of popular song cultures, see Davis, 1998 and 2004; Middleton, 1985; D Russell, 1987 and 1993; D Johnson, 2003; Maloney, 2003; Nott, 2002; Newman, 2002; McGuirk, 1997 and 2006; McCulloch, 2003; McCue, 1997; Munro, 1996; Symonds, 1997; Dugaw, 1996; Preston and Preston, 1995; T Crawford, 1979; Collinson, 1966; Donaldson, 1976 and 1988. Also some recent perspectives in the cultural study of music that examine music, place and identity and everyday culture and music offer some relevant analytical approaches, see Berger and Del Negro, 2004; Clayton, et al, 2003; Connell and Gibson, 2004; Hesmondhalgh and Negus, 2002; Tia DeNora, 2000; Leyshon, et al, 1998; Stokes, 1997.

[79] West, 2006, pp 120-121

[80] West, 2006, p 127.

[81] West, 2006, p 124.

---

[82] Shelemay notes the dearth of cultural music studies that explicitly deal with memory (Shelemay, 1998, p 6). Also see Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, who note that 'migrant memories are not part of the regular scientific tool kit for studying migration' (Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 228).

[83] A generalised picture of the cultural life of Scottish suburban families may be gleaned from broad historical and social accounts of Scotland, and in literary fiction, but it has less been the subject of more detailed cultural, ethnographic studies. A recent project, based at the *European Ethnological Research Centre*, University of Edinburgh, Scotland, is producing a fourteen volume series, *Scottish Life and Society: A Compendium of Scottish Ethnology*, which provides some useful perspectives. There are also a number of recent oral history project publications dealing with Scottish tenement life, see Clark and Carnegie, 2003, and Faley, 1990.

2

Overview of the Study's Analytical Framework

The study sets out to examine how formulations of national identity emerge in the interplay between large scale/public and small scale/private domains of social interaction. This poses a significant research and theoretical challenge. This dual focus on public and private formulations of national identity requires a suitable investigative framework that can accommodate and assist in making sense of how national identity works across different scales and contexts of social life. What this involves for this study is twofold: the application of insights from a range of fields in cultural studies, folklore studies, migration, anthropology, sociology and history; and an analytic frame for understanding identity that can usefully embrace these insights.

The study's overarching theoretical stance is that nations, groups and individuals interpret and construct identities in various ways within available cultural representations and within a larger social context. Identity is both constrained and enabled by those contexts and can only be understood in terms of those contexts. The emphasis is on the social and cultural contexts in which national identities are constructed and interpreted. The study adopts a situated view of identity, that is, it seeks to understand how identity arises within and through social interaction. It reflects the direction taken in recent cultural studies scholarship and in approaches to identity in folkloric and performance studies, anthropology, sociology and history, and the work of theorists such as Stuart Hall, Benedict Anderson, John Storey, Margaret Somers, Hearn, McCrone, Berger and Del Negro, Anthony Cohen, and Richard Bauman. The proposal that nations and persons construct and express identity through narrative is developed through this analysis.[1]

A number of implications, relevant to this study, flow from these accounts of identity:

° cultural identity draws upon the received past and memory in a creative, constructive and emergent process;

° individuals and groups personalise national identity in ways that are shaped by both the immediate and wider social and cultural context in which people operate;

° cultural representations of national identity mediate how personal national identity is constructed, interpreted and expressed;

° cultural representations have context and history, and therefore an understanding of how those representations have been shaped and interpreted over time will help to shed light on what they might mean in the present;

° culture is not a form of consumption, but a form of production. Individuals and social groups appropriate, interpret, make meaningful, and use cultural forms in the lived practices of everyday life.[2]

As noted above, it will be proposed that the cultural resources that my family drew upon, in particular Scottish songs, acted as important referents to their identity and gave shape and meaning to their formulations of Scottish/Australian identity. This means a focus on the interplay between formulations of national identity inscribed in the songs and the family's formulations of identity. The history and social context that shaped my family's songs is integral to an understanding of what those songs came to mean for the family. That context is relevant for two reasons.

Firstly, it helps to explain the broader cultural meanings that these songs have carried over time, the changing characteristics and cultural status of the songs, the

circumstances in which they came to be available to the family, and how they might have had appeal to the family.

Secondly, that context was also my family's cultural context prior to their migration to Australia. It was within that context that the songs first became part of family life and within which my family's Scottish identity first evolved. It was also in that context that the decision to leave Scotland was made. But that prior context provides only part of the picture of how my family formulated its Scottish identity in Australia. What the songs came to mean for my family in Australia also requires an examination of the changed context and circumstances in which my family continued to draw upon those songs - the ways and extent to which that new context shaped or informed the role of the songs for the family and their sense of identity.

A key focus for this study will be the role of music in the public narrative of nation. The perspectives of Anderson, McCrone, Cohen, Somers, Hearn, Richard Middleton, and Pickering and Green will be particularly useful for establishing how cultural representations, such as music, participate in and construct pervasive ideas about national and cultural identity. An appreciation of the role of these songs in the wider narrative of nation poses questions, but not yet answers, for how these collective ideas of nation are appropriated and customised at the local and personal level. This question will be addressed through several levels of analysis, through investigation of theoretical accounts of the relationship between public and personal dimensions of identity, the dynamics between public song culture and local song culture, the role of music in formulations of migrant identity, and the application of these insights to song performance in a migrant family. Through this multi-level analysis it will be argued that the experience of migration provided a specific 'contextual motivation' for drawing on the resource of national identity in song.[3] Drawing on the work of Somers, Hearn, and Anthony Cohen, the study will examine how the experience of migration was an important mediating influence that had implications for how the songs were used and the meanings that they came to have in family life. Hearn's 'embedded nationalism' provides a particularly useful conceptual frame for bridging the gap between national

identity as a cultural resource and national identity as an expression of self. He proposes that the relationship between the social and personal dimensions of national identity is mediated by specific contexts; and that the contexts in which individuals draw upon the cultural resources of social (national) identities and incorporate them into their own self-understandings are crucial to understanding how identity works. A key social context, that of family, is one in which national identity comes to have personal relevance.[4]

Family life is also shaped by the experience of migration. Studies of migrant experience identify families as a key part of the migrant's social world through which they 'articulate the world they have left with the world they have entered'.[5] It is often through family life that the processes of change and adaptation, that are part of being a migrant, are played out and mediated. Families also play a significant role in the complex of ways in which migrants define their sense of identity and belonging, and in the perpetuation of homeland cultural traditions.[6] The centrality of family in the migrant experience also underscores how migrant identities can be 'influenced by family dynamics as much as attachment to national heritage and loyalty'.[7] This study will examine how a particular family dynamic, revealed in song performance, served to articulate and reinforce attachment to both family and heritage, and how the Scottish songs that were assimilated into family life became a resource for constructing a new sense of home and identity in Australia. This will also draw on studies of the particular role of music in the migrant experience, which suggest that the music of the homeland can serve to connect the past with present, and to support new identities.[8] Slobin suggests that music is central to the diasporic experience, and that migrants 'identify themselves strongly, even principally, through their music'.[9] For migrant groups, it is often through musical performance that images of homeland and hereland are 'enunciated, dramatised and maintained'.[10] For many migrants, it is the music of the homeland that provides sources of tradition and origin, creates crucial linkages with a distant homeland, and provides the building blocks for identity.[11]

In studies focusing on the affective and experiential aspects of migration, particularly diaspora and transnational studies, attention has been given to the role of memory, story,

and relationships between past and present in the migrant experience - what Paul Gilroy refers to as issues of 'temporality and historicity, memory and narrativity'.[12] In studies with this orientation a focus has been on how migrants 'imagine' and construct a sense of community and belonging, using 'memory of place to construct imaginatively their new lived world'.[13] It is well recognised that the family plays an important role in shaping our memories and our identity.[14] Mary Chamberlain and Selma Leydesdorff's account of transnational migrant families examines how families use and understand their memories to construct 'coherent narratives of the self and kin'. Chamberlain and Leydesdorff argue, that in the context of migration, the family narrative can 'reveal how migrants reflect on their lives and on the families that surround them'; a process that 'often (and often only)' is expressed in the emotional and imaginative world of narrative.[15] In this sense, especially for migrant families, the family story or family narrative plays a central role. Storytelling, or narrative, may be manifest in many forms, not only in the more literal sense of telling a story.[16] As Somers' and Hearn's analysis of narrative, and Anderson's 'imagined' nation suggest, the narratives of nations, families or individuals can be expressed in various symbolic forms, not only through language, but also through other expressive forms such as music and song. It will be argued that music and song provided the key narrative plots and themes through which our family story was enacted.

It is this notion of a family's cultural identity as constructed in story that will provide a means of examining the functions that song performance served in our family. Kristin Langellier and Eric Peterson argue that family storytelling assumes a particular significance for migrant families in narrating the 'we' of family and cultural identity. As they note, 'immigration is a narrative disruption of roots, language, and social connections that anchor family and cultural identity'. The challenge for migrant families is in constructing and reconstructing 'their complex history and positioning in terms of cultural uniqueness' in a new multicultural setting.[17] For migrant families, in particular, storytelling serves to ensure the survival of family culture. For migrant families, such as ours, the goal of cultural continuity and survival can be considered as one of the key motivations for drawing on the symbolic resource of national identity in song.

An examination of the cultural history of the song traditions that my family drew upon will address where conceptions of being Scottish have come from, how they are generated and reproduced, and how this plays out in family life. The study will bring together relevant insights from historical accounts, popular culture studies, folk music and folkloric studies to shed light on the complexity of these Scottish song traditions.[18] It will be shown that these songs represent a complex of overlapping song traditions and song types, that have themselves been subject to shifting 'articulations', having being 'made over' and also subject to shifting valuations of their cultural meaning and merit over time and context. Through an examination of contemporary discourses that posit that Scottish cultural traditions are relics of the past, and evidence of a stagnating culture, it will be argued that they continue to act as important referents to Scottish identity in both public and private domains of life.[19] Of particular interest here will be the re-evaluations of the traditional and popular culture of Scotland that my family drew upon for its singing entertainments.[20] This argument will also be supported with evidence from migration, folklore and cultural studies that suggest that drawing upon the past, from tradition and custom, is not simply a matter of conservation, nor cannot it be reduced to a nostalgia for things gone before. Deborah James', and Kay Kaufman Shelemay's studies, for example, demonstrate how the music of migrants can be both a source of connection to tradition and origins, and also a means of anchoring and validating the present, and of constructing the future, or articulating aspirations.[21]

Middleton's analysis of 'articulation' together with Pickering and Green's analysis of the 'vernacular milieu' will serve to highlight the dynamics, the differences and intersections between public song traditions and personalised/localised traditions.[22] In the light of their analyses it will be argued that the cultural repertoire of music and song that is available to be 'made over' in any particular context is already the product of 'cultural work' and its forms and meanings mediated through historical/social processes and through modes of production, dissemination and consumption. The meanings and cultural significance that a song brings with it thus affect how it is perceived, understood and 'made over' in new contexts. While cultural forms, are not 'absolute determinants of consciousness or culture', as Pickering and Green argue, the symbolic associations that

arise out of their use in new or local contexts *are* mediated by them, as Middleton argues. In this way the forms and meanings of music are re-shaped, and their meanings shifted in different contexts. But, as Middleton argues, while the new context mediates more precise meanings, the overall 'parameters of meaning' move with it and are not lost. This has particular relevance for the songs that my family sang since they carry with them what Middleton would describe as 'connotation clusters' shaped by their particular social and cultural histories, or as Pickering and Green would describe them, 'symbolic associations', that mediate any new reception, and are, in turn, also mediated by that new context.

Drawing on this rationale, the study will examine how long established Scottish song traditions and contemporary songs were 'made over' in the particular context of family singing and migration. It will seek to demonstrate that in the process of incorporating popular and traditional songs into the day-to-day life of family singing a new context was set up that mediated the forms, meanings and reception of the songs. It will be argued that while the family songs share many of the features of the songs that are their sources, the selection and shaping of the songs over time within the family has produced a particular repertoire of songs with its own characteristics and local familial/cultural meanings.

The examination of the family's song culture will be informed by approaches in folklore, performance and cultural studies that emphasise the performative and narrative dimensions of identity.[23] This core area of the study will analyse the characteristics of the family songs, how they were used and the role they played in the family's life in Scotland and in Australia. While the performance context is an important consideration, the patterns in the song material itself - the collective and cumulative qualities of songs that have been sung and shared over time - can provide a useful focal point for performative analysis. Drawing on the work of Barre Toelken, Mary-Ann Constantine and Gerald Porter, and, Jerome Bruner and Carol Fleisher Feldman, the patterns in song material, in the repertoire of family songs, will be examined as part of the larger analysis of the role of the songs in the family. That analysis will be based on the conception that

a song repertoire that is common to members of a group may be understood as a form of shared narrative that gives expression to the cultural preoccupations and sense of identity of a group.[24] Moreover, when songs are sung and shared, they are, as Stokes suggests, 'a patterned context in which other things happen'.[25] Drawing upon these writers and insights from performance theory, the study will analyse the performance of the songs in the family - the 'patterned context' - to examine how the singing of these songs served to construct crucial senses of cultural continuity, family and belonging.

Research Objectives

By situating a specific family's experience within a wider critical context, the study seeks to answer the following central research question:

What can an examination of the song traditions of one Scottish family reveal about the role of homeland cultural tradition in formulations of migrant cultural and family identity?

This question is framed to reflect the project's broad strategic purpose to conduct a cross-disciplinary inquiry into the role of cultural traditions in migrant family life. The project approaches the central research question through an investigation of the relationship between the cultural construction of Scottishness in popular song and the negotiation of Scottish identity in a Scottish/Australian family.

The research objectives are designed to address the strategic purpose of this study through the focus of the central research question, and are predicated on the project's critical examination of various forms and constructions of 'identity'.

The inquiry will be guided by the following interrelated objectives that seek to:

° Establish the role of a specific song culture in constructing representations of national/cultural identity.

° Identify, through an examination of the dynamic relationship between public song culture and local song culture, how such cultural constructions interact with local practices and meanings.

° Understand how these dynamics play out in the construction of migrant cultural identity.

Research Methodology

The methodological approach of this project combines a critical reading of theory, research and documentary material with my own experience of song performance in family life to produce a synthesised interpretive account of music, migration and identity.[26] This represents a broad theoretical and conceptual pursuit that also engages with a specific and localised experience, that of an account and analysis of my own Scottish family life in Scotland and Australia. It is here that the study interweaves the autobiographical with the theoretical and conceptual, bringing each forward as sources of questions, tools and arguments. The autobiographical serves not only as a source of 'evidence' for the arguments posed but also as a means of engaging with the evolving ideas and arguments raised, illustrating, reflecting upon and grounding them.

Adopting a dialectical approach to the relationship between 'theory' and 'data', the study draws on the 'theoretical' and 'empirical' to bring the evolving understandings from one part of the inquiry to bear on the development of understandings in the other. The research focus on a specific family is both a starting point, that stimulates broader

questions of culture, identity and migration, and a returning point for reviewing and developing those questions further in order to construct a critical account of the role of music in the construction migrant identity.[27] The 'data' for this project derives from the literature, documentary material, oral tradition and personal testimony which, in this study, are the means of generating concepts, arguments and explanations.[28] As Norman Denzin and Yvonna Lincoln set out, qualitative research involves the 'studied use and collection' of a variety of 'empirical' materials, that may encompass cultural and historical texts, artifacts and cultural productions, personal experience, introspection and case study.[29]

The study takes the form of a multi-layered account that folds personal experience into a critical reading and interpretation of family song performance within a broader investigation of migrant culture and identity.[30] The project is thus not a conventional 'field work' study that collects 'data' to be analysed. The project's 'field work' is primarily an investigation of issues, concepts, and ideas; its process is one of critical interpretation and synthesis; and its objectives are oriented towards the project's goal of developing/augmenting theoretical perspectives and conceptual schema. Its form is more that of an essay than a field report. The essay, a genre of choice for cultural critics pursuing interpretation over measurement, and 'thick description' over observation, serves also as a form of 'personal witness' to one's own culture.[31]

This approach stems from both a desire to understand my family's song culture and to locate it within a wider sphere of cultural criticism. It represents an inside-out, bottom-up approach to identity that seeks to challenge 'monolithic' views of Scottish culture and Scottish identity. In this way I am conducting what Ruth Behar describes as 'native anthropology' in which 'scholars claim a personal connection to the places in which they work, often studying their home communities and nations', and attempting to reconcile 'a range of ambivalent connections to their abandoned and reclaimed 'homelands' '. This stance is not only about inserting the personal into a wider account. The importance of this stance, as Behar observes, is that it has shifted theory and practice towards identification rather than difference.[32] These research orientations that adopt a bottom-

up, insider perspective represent more than a change in process or methodology, they are also reflected in the way in which identity is addressed theoretically and conceptually. For this study it means viewing national/cultural identity as a bottom-up process where attachment to 'nation' is not determined by membership, nor pervasive cultural constructions of national identity, but is rather a process in which people draw on, appropriate and customise these discourses in an active process of self-making.

In doing so, the study draws the research focus to the private and the public, the micro and the macro and the relationships between them. In the anthropological/social study of migration, the micro, that of the individual or family group or household, has typically been the primary unit of analysis.[33] Increasingly, though, migration research and theorising has moved to merge the micro and macro in order to encompass the range of social and cultural factors that have an impact on, and are affected by, the migrant experience.[34] Similarly, in the study of folklore, a focus on the micro - a 'folk group' - such as an individual family, has also been located within larger contextual issues that have brought folklore more into the realm of cultural studies.[35] But, as Barbara Kirshenblatt-Kimblett has noted, those who work in the field of folklore generally still 'anchor' their work 'in a particular community (or some other version of folk group) and circle within it'.[36] What cultural studies brings to this 'micro' or local focus on a particular performance context is explicit attention to both the immediate and wider social/cultural environment in and through which those local forms and meanings are made. This study adopts such a 'holistic' perspective combining micro and macro units of analysis to address broader questions of culture and identity through the lens of a particular migrant experience.[37]

Participant Researcher and Personal Testimony

I will be drawing upon examples from my own family's song culture, within a larger examination of culture and identity. In this, I will be in effect 'bearing witness' to my family's migration experience.[38] Being a participant in this study and drawing upon personal experience for some of the project's evidence presents some research

challenges. Some of the limitations and problems of using my own experience as subject matter are addressed in a number of ways. Autoethnography, a research and writing approach in the social sciences, provides a means for embedding autobiographical material into a wider cultural study. The literature on this methodology is extensive and a variety of emphases in the field has evolved to suit different research and writing purposes.[39] The use of this approach in research, Behar insists, does not mean that 'anything personal goes' - it has to 'take us somewhere we couldn't otherwise get to'.[40] The accounts must be essential to the argument and such material needs to be open to critical scrutiny. Such writing 'does not require a full-length autobiography, but it does require a keen understanding of what aspects of the self are the most important filters through which one perceives the world and, more particularly, the topic being studied'.[41] Carolyn Ellis and Arthur Bochner also suggest that the use of personal information in the social sciences typically serves an analytic purpose and is situated within an analytic frame.[42] In this study, personal testimony and reflections will be open to critical scrutiny in several ways. They will be presented subject to their relevance to the topic, and will be located within the project's analytic framework. These reflections will be presented and considered in the light of other accounts drawn from existing relevant research, and will be used to reflect upon and illuminate issues raised.

Brettell and Hollifield refer to the way in which personal testimony has been employed in migration studies 'to access the rich texture of the lived experience of being a migrant'.[43] They quote Rina Benmayor and Andor Skotnes for the way personal testimony:

> "… speaks … to how immigrant subjects constantly build, reinvent, synthesize, or even collage identities from multiple sources and resources … Knowing something about the utter uniqueness of particular individual migrant experiences certainly enhances our generalizations about the group experience, but it also elicits humility about the adequacy of these generalizations and a realization that few actual individual lives fully conform to the master narratives." (Benmayor and Skotnes, 1994, p15, quoted in Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 13)

McCarthy notes that the use of personal testimony enables an 'exploration of aspects of the migration experience through individual stories that would otherwise be lost to scholars'.[44] Rather than presenting 'a homogeneous portrait of collective group identity' the use of personal testimony 'enables a more nuanced interpretation of Scottish national identity to be conveyed'.[45] Hammerton and Thomson suggest that 'by illuminating aspects of the migrant experience which might otherwise be disregarded, life history enables us to ' 'carve theory out of ... complex personal histories', to challenge simplistic theories ... and to reshape the ways in which migration is understood'.[46]

Regarding questions of validity, reliability, and generalisability in the use of personal testimony and life history, Denzin and Lincoln, argue that innovations in qualitative research methodologies have led to a rethinking of what is meant by validity, generalisability, and reliability, and that there are now multiple criteria for evaluating research interpretations, including 'credibility', 'trustworthiness', 'transferability', 'confirmability'.[47] Key criteria, such as plausibility, credibility, and relevance, all of which require 'social judgments', are arrived at through consensus and discussion in the research community rather than by appeal to 'positivist' measures of validity and objectivity.[48] With respect to the use of life stories and oral histories of migrants, as Hammerton and Thomson explain, they are not, 'strictly speaking, 'representative samples' and they are not intended to provide numerical 'proof' for our arguments, but they do indicate patterns and themes'. A single case study that draws on personal testimony might not be typical or representative but 'offers deep and intimate insights and which suggests new questions which might be taken to other sources'.[49] They also address concerns that memory is 'an unreliable historical source because narrators remember selectively and self-censor the stories they tell, and because these stories about the past are inevitably influenced by the present circumstances and attitudes of the narrator'.[50] Their response to these concerns about reliability is that migrant memories can be subject to the same critical scrutiny that would apply to any other historical source, and that the 'apparent flaws' in memory are forms of evidence in themselves. While such stories are 'about past experience and the history of migration, they are also about what that migration experience means in the present life of the narrator',

illuminating 'the contemporary significance of migration for the individual, for a family and in the wider society'.[51] Hammerton and Thomson also acknowledge, as I do with respect to this study, that their own life histories as migrants have brought them to their migration project and affected the themes of their research and writing.

---

[1] See Somers, 1994; Hearn 2002 and 2007; Langellier and Peterson 2005 and 2006; Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004.

[2] The idea is that identity is not a 'given' but is negotiated within culture and in social interaction. See Hall, 1996; Storey, 2003 (a); Bauman, 1972; Butler, 1993; Berger and Del Negro, 2004.

[3] This concept of 'contextual motivation' has been developed by Jonathan Hearn, 2007.

[4] See Hearn, 2007, pp 671-672.

[5] Brettell, 2008, p 124.

[6] .See Fortier, 2000; Foner, 1997 (a); Ganguly, 1992; Brettell, 2003 and 2008; Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004; Hammerton, 2004 and 2006 (a); Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001.

[7] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 239.

[8] See James, 2000; Shelemay, 1998; Connell and Gibson, 2004; Stokes, 1997; Slobin, 1994 and 2003; Clayton, et al, 2003; Leyshorn, et al, 1998; Hesmondhalgh and Negus, 2002.

[9] Slobin, 1994, p 243.

[10] James, 2000, p 36.

[11] See Connell and Gibson, 2004; Shelemay, 1998; James, 2000.

[12] Gilroy, 1993, p 19.

[13] Gupta and Ferguson, 1992, p 11.

[14] See Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004; Langellier and Peterson, 2005 and 2006; Baddeley and Singer, 2007; Duke, et al, 2003; Shore, 2003.

[15] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 237. See also Brettell, 2003; Hammerton, 2004 and 2006 (a); A Thomson, 1999.

[16] See Ochs and Capps, 1996. See also Baddeley and Singer, 2007; Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004; Toelken, 1995; Somers, 1994; Langellier and Peterson, 2006; Rubin, 1996; Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, 1996.

[17] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 122.

[18] Together with historical, social and cultural accounts of Scottish song culture, additional information has been sourced from song collections and recordings, and consultation with researchers in the field,

institutions and folkloric organisations. Documentary song materials are used as reference points, as contextual information on Scottish song culture.

[19] See McCrone, 2001, for a comprehensive study of the sociology of Scotland and a detailed account of the dominant cultural narratives and discourses. See also Nash, 1997; Maloney, 2003; Goldie, 2006; Hearn, 2002.

[20] See McCrone, 2001; Goldie, 2000 and 2006; Maloney, 2003; R Crawford, 1997; T Crawford, 1979; Nash, 1997; D Johnson, 2003; Davis, 1998 and 2004; McCulloch, 2003; McGuirk, 2006; Newman, 2002; McCue, 1997.

[21] See James, 2000; Shelemay, 1998; Gilroy, 2003; Connell and Gibson, 2004. For other accounts of the dialectics between tradition and innovation in the practices of everyday life, see Berger and Del Negro, 2004; I Russell and Atkinson, 2004; I Russell, 1987 (b); Bauman, 1986; Pickering and Green, 1987.

[22] See Middleton, 1985, and Pickering and Green, 1987 (b).

[23] For performance and narrative theory, and methodological approaches in folklore, see Bauman, 1984 and 1986; Berger and Del Negro, 2004; Pickering and Green, 1987; Constantine and G Porter, 2003; Toelken, 1995; Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, 1996; McKean, 2003 (a); Oring, 1994. In cultural studies of music, see Clayton, et al, 2003; Hesmondhalgh and Negus, 2002; Stokes, 1997; DeNora, 2000; James, 2000; Shelemay, 1998; Leyshon et al, 1998; Storey, 2003 (a) and (b). For narrative construction of identity, see Somers, 1994; Langellier and Peterson, 2005 and 2006; Clandinin, 2007; Baddeley and Singer, 2007; Rubin, 1996; Ochs and Capps, 1996.

[24] See Constantine and G Porter, 2003; Toelken, 1995; Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, 1996.

[25] Stokes, 1997, p 5.

[26] Foner describes her account of the theory and research pertaining to migrant families as 'an interpretive synthesis' (Foner, 1997 (a), p 961).

[27] ' 'Theory' does not refer to a static collection of concepts that regulate research behavior but a set of practices in its own right … ideally, the content of our empirical research impinges back on our theorizing, shaping and informing the very ideas that are supposed to guide it. If this were not the case, it is not clear what the point of empirical research might be … social insights are best gleaned when scholars take a flexible and dialectical approach to the relationship between theory and data' (Berger and Del Negro, 2004, pp ix-xi).

[28] 'In historical, ethnographic, interpretive, or critical research, for example, the data are the means of generating explanations for what is observed' (Rennie and Gribble, 2006, p 15).

[29] Denzin and Lincoln, 2005, p 3. Sandra G Harding also argues that the 'beliefs and behaviors of the researcher are part of the empirical evidence for (or against) the claims advanced in the results of the research. *This* evidence too must be open to critical scrutiny no less than what is traditionally defined as relevant evidence' (Harding, 1987, p 9).

[30] See Denzin, who describes his essay 'Cowboys and Indians' as a narrative that 'folds my biographical experiences into a critical reading of a cultural performance involving cowboys and Indians in a small

Montana town in summer 2000. Informed by critical race theory and poststructuralism, this narrative attempts to deconstruct racial stereotypes associated with Native Americans and their presence in America's movies and popular culture' (Denzin, 2002, p 251).

[31] 'Thick description' is a concept developed by Clifford Geertz, 1973. Jeff Titon suggests that the best way to understand 'thick description' is as 'a method by which to apprehend and interpret cultural texts' - a method 'very much opposed to the then-dominant model based on the natural sciences (hypothesis, observations, measurements, conclusions)' (Titon, 2003, p 174). In cultural anthropology, Geertz takes 'cultural representations and their meanings as its points of departure' where 'the essay as an art form' replaces 'the scientific article'(Denzin and Lincoln, 2005, p 18). The idea of the essay being an act of 'personal witness' comes from Graham Good. The essay is 'at once the *ins*cription of a self and *des*cription of an object' (Good, 1988, p 23). Behar has used the essay form in this way as a research and writing method in ethnography, as a means of bringing the 'self ' and the 'other' together (Behar, 1996, p 20).

[32] Behar, 1996, p 28.

[33] 'For sociologists, anthropologists, and some economists it is the individual or household that is the primary unit of analysis' (Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 10). Brettell argues that a focus on the micro, such as households, families and social networks, is important, not only as a means for gaining insights into the personal experience of migration, but also because it is through such social networks that the relationship between the individual and the wider social/cultural/economic variables of migration is mediated (Brettell, 2008, p 125). Brettell also argues that a focus on the micro or local, the study of a specific group or community, is often 'implicitly, if not explicitly theoretical', and can make a 'significant and sometimes unique contribution to our theoretical conversations across the disciplines' (Brettell, 2008, pp 136-137).

[34] Brettell, 2008, p 136.

[35] Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett refers to the widening parameters in folklore studies as 'topic drift' (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998, p 282). For example, the 'subject' of folklore studies has come to be embraced by other disciplinary approaches, such as in cultural studies, as 'popular culture', 'common culture', 'everyday culture'. Ethnography and folkloric studies share tools and methodologies (see Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998; Henkes and Johnson, 2002; Berger and Del Negro, 2004). Thomas McKean has also made the observation that the increasing emphasis on contextual and performance approaches has been a fruitful one in the field of folk song and ballad study (McKean, 2003 (b), pp 5-7).

[36] Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998, p 308. This study also recognises that analysis of song tradition in a domestic family context typically deals with the 'unique' or 'duplicated', with distinct and localised forms of tradition, 'that must carry the weight of scrutiny' (see Toelken, 1995, p 147).

[37] Brettell refers to the 'holistic perspective' (Brettell, 2008, p 136).

[38] In order to capture the fullest possible documentation of the family's song repertoire, consultation with immediate family members has been conducted.

[39] See, in particular, Ellis and Bochner, 2000, for a detailed consideration of autoethnography and the literature in the field. Also see Clandinin, 2007; Denzin, 2002; Denzin and Lincoln, 2005; Rubin, 1996; Fivush and Haden, 2003.

[40] Behar, 1996, p 14.

[41] Behar, 1996, p 13.

[42] Ellis and Bochner, 2000, p 753.

[43] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 12.

[44] McCarthy, 2006 (b), p 4.

[45] McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 20.

[46] Hammerton and Thomson, 2005, pp 16-17, paraphrasing Benmayor and Skotnes, who state that 'native' oral historians have been 'carving theory out of their complex personal histories and experiences of migration' (Benmayor and Skotnes, 1994, p 13).

[47] Denzin and Lincoln, 2005, pp 19-26.

[48] Denzin and Lincoln, 2005, pp 910-911.

[49] Hammerton and Thomson, 2005, p 20. As McCarthy acknowledges, 'complications include debates surrounding the validity, reliability and interpretation of memory and the construction of collective memory. … Yet these issues and processes of self-interpretation are themselves forms of evidence' (McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 205).

[50] Hammerton and Thomson, 2005, p 18.

[51] Hammerton and Thomson, 2005, p 17.

3

A Framework for Identity

This thesis seeks to understand and explain the relationship between collective and individual formulations of national identity. More specifically it represents an endeavour to find a conceptual means of articulating the relationship between public Scottishness and personal Scottishness. In this chapter, theoretical and conceptual issues in considerations of identity are examined and positioned with respect to both national identity as a cultural construct and national identity as a constituent of the self. It draws attention to the idea that a personal sense of national identity is informed and mediated, but not determined, by collective cultural constructions of national identity. This stance situates culture and identity in an active relationship - one in which neither culture nor identity is static or fixed. This analysis provides not only a guiding framework for the study but also a platform of ideas about identity that will be developed and refined as the study progresses.

Identity

Underpinning this framework is the conception of identity as not fixed and coherent, but as constructed, multi-dimensional, constituted in history and culture, and not something inherited from nature. In this sense, identity is, as John Storey suggests, a form of production, of making meaning, rather than the consumption of a fixed inheritance.[1] The cultural critic Stuart Hall has argued that 'identities are about questions of using the resources of history, language and culture in the process of becoming'. In that process of 'becoming' how we are represented bears on how we might represent ourselves, so that

identities are 'constituted within, not outside of representation'.[2] It is not that representation or culture outside of ourselves determines who we think we are, but rather that our identities arise in a negotiation between ourselves and the cultural world. Or as Storey puts it, our identities are not the expression of our 'nature', they are 'staged and performed in culture and with culture'.[3]

Our identities are also social. Richard Bauman has emphasised that identity is 'inherently situational and relational'.[4] Identity is more than just the outcome of internal, meaning making activities with respect to the cultural world. It comes to light in social interaction, in the performance of ourselves with respect to others.[5] As Storey has also argued, who we are is typically a compromise, a negotiation between how we see ourselves and how we are seen by others.[6] Identity arises, as David McCrone suggests, out of a complex interplay between how people define themselves, how they attribute identity to others, and how, in turn, they think others attribute identity to them.[7] In other words, the world outside the self, the social and cultural world that we are part of, plays an important part in who we think we are.

National Identity as a Cultural Construct

McCrone's account of Scottish identity is particularly useful in examining how national identity works. He points out that many considerations of national identity tend to focus on the 'national' rather than on 'identity', with the weight of the question 'conventionally placed on the existence or otherwise of the 'nation' rather than on the mechanisms where actors themselves do the defining and constructing'.[8] This is not to suggest that 'nation' is an unimportant consideration in understanding national identity, but rather that what constitutes 'nation' is a complex of historically and culturally shaped meanings and representations.[9] In the case of Scotland, for example, different levels of meaning are attached to it - as country, as society, as nation. Each of these conceptions carries considerable political and cultural weight and continues to play out

in constructions of Scottish identity. McCrone also points to the different ways in which 'nation' can refer to ethnic (place of origin) identifications or civic (social and cultural) identifications, or a mixture of both. His recent Scottish population studies reveal that being Scottish is defined through a mix of different weightings given to class, gender, political orientation, as well as birth, ancestry and residence. Being Scottish has also become stronger as well as more culturally diverse in recent decades. In this, Scotland is not alone, as this increasing diversity and complexity in the ways that people formulate their national identity is reflected in modern societies generally.

McCrone, like Anthony Cohen, suggests that the idea of 'nation', that plays out in people's sense of national identity, 'does not reside in geographical or even social territory so much as in people's minds'.[10] It is essentially symbolically constructed. Following Benedict Anderson's conception of nation as 'imagined community', McCrone's view is that nations are imagined, 'interpreted as ideas, made and remade, rather than simply as actual 'places' '.[11] The idea of 'nation' is made possible through real, imagined or remembered connections, however distant in time and space. In this sense, 'nation' is a place of the mind, and a set of meanings that attach to it.

Those meanings - ideas and images of a place, its people, its characteristics and values - are culturally constructed, are often contested, and are not sets of fixed, naturally occurring characteristics of a people or place. They form part of the stocks of cultural knowledge that are selectively brought into play in formulations of national identity, whether that be in the context of national ideological struggles or in family get-togethers. What it is to be, for example, Scottish, or Australian, or German, or Canadian means different things in different situations and at different points in history, and may depend in large measure on who is making the claim and under what circumstances. The point being made here is that national identity operates at different levels of meaning in different contexts and settings, and that there is no 'one size fits all' national identity. The question to ask, according to McCrone, is not 'how best do cultural forms reflect an essential identity, but how do cultural forms actually help to construct and shape identity, or rather, identities'. Moreover, as he adds, 'these identities themselves, in turn,

cannot be defined or understood without reference to the cultural forms which give them shape and meaning'.[12]

Harris Berger and Giovanna Del Negro also emphasise that various, and often competing ideas about national identity emerge and are played out across all domains of social activity, large and small, in different settings and for different purposes.[13] For example, national identities are regulated and codified in law and government policy; promulgated by community leaders, activists and politicians; framed through social and cultural institutions such as schools, the church, galleries and museums; turned to material advantage by publishers, tourism bodies, and the music industry; expressed in literature, art and song; disseminated in folklore, popular culture, and supermarket products; fought over at football games, and in ideological debates and wars; celebrated in public performances and in family reunions; and studied and explained by researchers. Through social processes such as these, ideas about national identity are expressed, interpreted, affirmed or resisted, reformulated, passed on and disseminated.

Ideas and interpretations of national identity can also exert considerable social force. They are brought into play to rally support for social or political action, and enhance social position; to regulate, dictate or control behaviour and assign rights and privileges; to attribute certain qualities to groups of people and to explain the behaviour of individuals or groups; to foreground special skills or attributes; to assert group attachment or difference; to invoke authenticity and authority to speak or act on behalf of others. As Berger and Del Negro note, 'reconfirming, nuancing, adumbrating, resisting or overturning previous visions, the interpretation of identity is one of the prime battle grounds upon which ideological struggles are played out'.[14] In the context of identity politics and nationalism, for example, 'the sense of being a nation is a powerful political force', as McCrone notes.[15] Here, national categories are adopted and mobilised as a means of appealing to the population at large. McCrone explains that 'nationalism does not derive from a distinctive culture. Rather, it seeks to manufacture and make distinctive such a culture for political ends'.[16] And, as McCrone reminds us, if

national identity is above all a set of meanings, then much depends on whose meaning wins out.

Some meanings 'win out', or at least become pervasive, attain wider currency and valency through being sustained in social discourse, disseminated through popular culture, and embedded in institutional arrangements. McCrone, Berger and Del Negro, Storey, and Michael Billig draw attention to the ways in which cultural meanings and ideas that are articulated and circulated through these types of mechanisms can take on a common sense, taken for granted quality. Billig's 'banal nationalism' underscores how the idea of nation is 'flagged' in daily life, and is implicitly and symbolically reinforced.[17] One of the important ways that ideas about national identity become routinised and 'naturalised' is, as McCrone observes, through the 'civil institutional apparatus' - the education system, the legal system, the press, the church, the financial system and so on - that 'provides a social template' that sustains ideas about nation and national identity.[18] This 'social template' can take more or less explicit form, and be more or less regulated. As Berger and Del Negro's account of identity highlights, in some institutional arrangements, highly regulated representations of identity, such as identity cards, visas, work permits or legal privileges, are explicit and restrictive; whereas ideas about national identity may be framed in more implicit ways in social institutions such as schools and the church.[19] Cultural institutions too, such as, museums and galleries can act as cultural gatekeepers even where aspects of culture and identity are explicitly framed as arenas for debate and re-interpretation. While highly institutionalised and regulated representations of identity are more obvious examples of the social order, Berger and Del Negro stress that power relations play a key role in all interpretations of identity, including those that would seem to be neutral or more open for consideration. All representations of identity are informed by implicit or explicit interpretations of the social world, and 'gain their valences and meanings through their relationship with a larger social history and social context':

> "Pre-existing social structures and stocks of cultural knowledge (native social
> theories, images and icons and narratives) are the ideological raw material and

informing context in which even the newest and most idiosyncratic interpretations are made. … And while actors may produce interpretations that resist dominant ideas, none may do so independently of the larger social field." (Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 142)

Storey addresses how that larger social world produces dominant discourses that generate powerful cultural meanings that can assume a certain authority or status of 'truth'. His focus is on how dominant discourses play out in popular culture. His analysis recognises that 'the culture industries are a major site of ideological production, constructing powerful images, descriptions, definitions, frames of reference for understanding the world'.[20] But he also rejects the view that people are passive consumers of culture. Storey's work serves to highlight the ways that cultural narratives about nation and identity are produced and made available in culture, but also that the process is neither homogenous, nor all one way.

Ideas about national identity that emerge and circulate in culture are both shared and conflicting networks of meanings. According to Storey, 'cultures are arenas in which different ways of articulating the world come into conflict and alliance'.[21] While public processes of representation and cultural dissemination act as repositories and sources of ideas about national identity, they are also sites for the negotiation the re-interpretation of those ideas. It is through mechanisms such as these that ideas about national identity are reinterpreted, challenged, and reformulated. But these more widespread and public processes are by no means the only ways in which ideas about national identity are constructed, nor do they operate in isolation from other scales of social interaction. As Storey notes, 'culture is not something ready-made which we 'consume' '.[22] People appropriate, make meaningful, and use cultural ideas and forms, in the lived practices of everyday life.

Personalising National Identity

Ideas about national identity that emerge or prevail in the wider social context are not free floating meanings that exist in culture to be just picked up and taken on board by people. As Storey argues, people are not cultural dupes and cultural meanings are not simply passively consumed. They act as cultural reference points through which people construct and negotiate their own sense of national identity. The idea that identity is not a 'given' but is negotiated within culture and in social interaction is also encapsulated by Berger and Del Negro, where 'pre-existing cultural identities are actively negotiated and renegotiated through interactions that are situated in the contexts of past social histories, repertoires of expressive resources, and existing social orders and relations of power'.[23] Several studies have also demonstrated that people negotiate and mobilise identities that are open to them - responding to, collaborating with, or subverting existing ideas about identity in response to social, political or cultural change.[24]

Anthony Cohen explores this idea of negotiated identity further. He emphasises that people construct ideas about national identity through the medium of their own experience, and in ways that are as much influenced by their own circumstances as the wider context.[25] People make their own sense of 'nation' in ways that have personal meaning to their lives, 'making it a resource and repository of meaning and a referent to their identity'.[26] Thus, the 'nation' is mediated through the self. Nor does 'nation' need to be made explicit. It 'survives rather by being taken for granted and continuously expressed implicitly'.[27] McCrone adopts a similar line of argument. National identity is not like 'a badge pinned to the lapel, there for everyone to read … (it) is frequently opaque and implicit … It operates indirectly through the culture and habits in which people are engaged'.[28] Berger and Del Negro make a similar point in their analysis of the dynamics of identity where identity arises in the lived meanings of social interaction. One of the key dynamics that they describe is the varying degrees to which people foreground or background different dimensions of their identity and their interpretation of others' identity in social interactional processes. Their analysis highlights that

people's formulations of identity in social interaction are often expressed indirectly, operating as an informing background to what is said and done. In such situations, multiple dimensions of identity - personality, kin group, region, ethnicity, gender, and class - 'shift fluidly from foreground to background, reflection to embedded perception, explicit to implicit communication'.[29]

While people 'personalise' national identity, it is worth re-iterating that they do so within a social and cultural context. As Storey observes, 'although we may be inventors of our selves, identities are made in conditions and circumstances that are rarely of our own making. Therefore, although identities are a sign of agency, identities are always made within structures and discourses, which both enable and constrain the making of identities'.[30] Although national identities are not handed down in non-negotiable form, neither are they a free-for-all. The 'nation' may be mediated through the self, and in ways that are influenced by immediate circumstances, but even the most unique or abstract conceptions of 'nation' require some kind of affirmation in experience or 'reality'.[31] Whatever it is to be Scottish, for example, requires some notion of what being Scottish means. As McCrone observes, 'nation' may be continuously expressed implicitly - as Cohen and Billig argue - but 'one might add that there has to something to be expressed, and that this something is sustained by social discourse around the idea of Scotland'.[32] He argues that:

> " 'Scotland' is not simply what you want it to mean. It is a complex theatre of memory in which different ways of 'being Scottish' are interpellated and handed down, constructed and mobilised by social and political forces which seek to naturalise them. There is a complex interaction of social process and cultural meaning." (McCrone, 2001, p 3)

Acknowledging that people interpret and construct identities in various ways, McCrone (after Hall) argues that they do so within available cultural representations, where national identities are constructed out of received popular ideas. He examines where conceptions of Scottishness have come from, how they are generated and reproduced,

how they compete with one another, and the extent to which they are engines of social and cultural change. His analysis demonstrates the ways in which cultural forms such as cultural images, myths and narratives have helped to construct and shape Scottish identity at points in history. But he also reveals the ways in which these cultural forms have continued to be adopted and recreated in various ways to sustain the changing aspirations of Scotland.

Arguing against the grain of contemporary discourse that Scottish cultural traditions are relics of the past, and evidence of a stagnating culture, he argues that they continue to act as important referents to Scottish identity in both public and private domains of Scottish life. He cites the folk music revival, one of the key carriers of Scottish culture, as an example of how Scottish musical traditions (traditions that were already hybrid) continue to be cross-fertilised in terms of styles, tunes and instruments to express new ideas of Scottishness. So that today Scottish 'traditional' music is no longer that pre-dating the nineteenth century nor confined to oral conventions.[33] Scottish cultural traditions also continue to feature positively in people's sense of Scottishness. His recent studies of the Scottish electorate indicate a strong pride in being Scottish, in Scottish community spirit, and in Scottish icons such as Scottish landscape, tartan, historical figures and Scottish music. He concludes that there is little evidence that Scottish culture is held in low esteem, that people see it as tainted in some way, or that it is viewed suspiciously by Scottish people.[34]

His point here is that dominant discourses about societies and national identity are 'frequently locked into a set of comfortable assumptions', are often outmoded and 'at odds with the complex reality of the society'.[35] In other words, how a national identity is represented discursively is not only historically and culturally contingent, but is also not necessarily how people view it or their own identity.[36]

This means that we not only 'have to be cautious in assuming that Scottishness denotes the same thing through both time and place' but also that we need to be clear about whose Scottishness we are talking about.[37]

Implications for the Study

The import of McCrone's analysis is threefold. Cultural forms do not embody an essential and fixed national identity, but they are intrinsic to how people construct and shape their own identity. An understanding of national identity in either its collective or personal dimensions needs to take into account the cultural forms that give them shape and meaning. This requires attention not only to the cultural forms themselves but also importantly to the history and social context in which they are generated and reproduced, represented and interpreted.

McCrone's analysis is echoed by Storey's view that we need to consider both 'structure' and 'agency', a stance that keeps both production and consumption in an 'active and critical relationship'.[38] That is, we need to seek, not just an understanding of how cultural forms are produced and made available, but also an understanding of the range of meanings that such forms makes possible - their social meanings - the meanings people make of them in their daily lives.[39] To do so is to keep in mind the dialectical interplay between culture and identity.

To these accounts, Berger and Del Negro would add that *all* identity formulations, in large or small scale domains of social life, are situated within a social context, history and a set of given cultural resources. They are both constrained and enabled by those contexts and can only be understood in terms of those contexts. It is within the wider social context that much of their meaning lies.[40]

There are a number of implications arising from these accounts of identity that are pertinent to this study. Firstly, is the recognition that culture is not a form of consumption, but a form of production in which meanings are made and re-made. Secondly, with respect to national identity, individuals and groups personalise national identity in ways that are shaped by both the immediate and wider social and cultural context in which people operate, where cultural representations of national identity

mediate how personal national identity is constructed, interpreted and expressed. And thirdly, as cultural representations themselves have context and history, an understanding of how those representations have been shaped and interpreted over time will help to shed light on what they might 'mean' in the present.

These insights, derived from perspectives in folkloric, performance and cultural studies, and sociology, emphasise that national or cultural identity is not determined by membership, nor pervasive cultural constructions of national identity, but is rather a process in which people draw upon and customise these cultural forms in an active process of self-making. Such a view of national identity acknowledges the importance of cultural resources in the personal construction of identity, and how those resources shape and mediate personal meaning. If a personal sense of Scottishness requires some notion of what being Scottish means, as Cohen and McCrone argue, then it is relevant to ask, what kind of Scottishness did my family draw upon in song? Addressing this question in this study is not a quest to define Scottishness *per se*, but rather, it is a matter of being clear about *whose* Scottishness we are talking about. Charting how Scottishness has been constructed, represented and interpreted in the public realm, and the role of the songs in this process is a quest to better understand the nature of those songs as 'shared instruments' of culture and as vehicles of Scotland's imagined community.[41]

How those songs have participated in and constructed pervasive ideas about Scottish national and cultural identity; how those ideas of nation and culture have been generated, reproduced and disseminated in song; and how those representations have been interpreted in cultural discourse is an equally important area for investigation as that of the particular use of the songs in the family. Understanding what those songs came to mean in family life requires attention to both the resources themselves and their localised uses. For this study that means a dual focus on the macro and the micro, public culture and private culture, and the relationships between them. The family's songs have participated in both domains, as cultural resources that have shaped a collective Scottishness, and in turn a family's Scottishness. Neither that public Scottishness nor my family's can be understood without reference to the cultural forms that have given them

shape and meaning. The part played by those cultural resources in the cultural and critical construction of Scottishness is the subject of the next two chapters. In Chapter 4, accounts of the cultural narratives of Scotland are examined and critiqued in terms of their explanations of both collective Scottishness and personal Scottishness. Chapter 5 focuses specifically on the role of Scottish song culture in the cultural construction of Scottishness, and considers how the relationship between public song culture and local song culture can be conceptualised.

---

[1] Storey, 2003 (a), p 79.

[2] Hall, 1996, p 4.

[3] Storey, 2003 (a), p 88.

[4] Bauman, 1972, discussed in Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 131.

[5] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 143.

[6] Storey, 2003 (a), p 80.

[7] McCrone, 2001, p 153.

[8] McCrone, 2001, p 153.

[9] While there is some utility in using the term 'national identity' to capture the idea of identity associated with affiliations to a place, its people and its culture, it is also problematic. The term itself implies a unity, a collective identity, which is at odds with much of contemporary explanations of culture and identity. The concept of 'national identity' carries its historical roots in the eighteenth century Enlightenment notion of the sovereignty of nation states and an essentialist distinctive national culture (McCrone, 2001, p 142). (See also Wodak, et al, 1999). For this reason the study will use the term 'cultural identity' interchangeably with 'national identity', and will use the more specific terms 'Scottish identity' or 'Scottishness' except where the concept of national identity is discussed in broad theoretical terms.

[10] McCrone, 2001, p 51.

[11] McCrone, 2001, p 49.

[12] McCrone, 2001, p 145.

[13] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 143.

[14] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 142.

[15] McCrone, 2001, p 177.

[16] McCrone, 2001, p 191.

[17] Billig, 1995, p 6.

[18] McCrone, 2001, p 47.

[19] The trend appears to be shifting in favour of more explicit declarations, as recent debates in the USA and Australia would indicate.

[20] Storey, 2003 (a), p 52.

[21] Storey, 2003 (a), p x.

[22] Storey, 2003 (a), p 59.

[23] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 139.

[24] See, for example, McCrone, who refers to his joint studies that show that 'actors have considerable capacity to construct and negotiate national identities especially in contexts where they have leverage' (McCrone, 2001, p 153). Also see discussions in Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 132; Stokes, 1997; Connell and Gibson, 2004.

[25] A P Cohen, 2000, p 146.

[26] A P Cohen, 1985, p 118.

[27] A P Cohen, 2000, p151.

[28] McCrone, 2001, p 174.

[29] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 153.

[30] Storey, 2003 (a), p 80.

[31] McCrone, 2001, p 52 and p 154. Here McCrone draws on Anthony Cohen's 'objective correlative' (A P Cohen, 2000).

[32] McCrone, 2001, p 154.

[33] McCrone, 2001, p 144.

[34] McCrone, 2001, p 147.

[35] McCrone, 2001, p 173.

[36] The idea of the discursive construction of national identity has been more fully developed by Wodak, et al. As they argue, discursive national identities are 'context-determined', and 'should not be perceived as static, but rather as dynamic, vulnerable and rather ambivalent entities' (Wodak, et al, 1999, p 187).

[37] McCrone, 2001, p 154.

[38] Storey, 2003 (a), p 60. This is also important in migration studies, as Brettell suggests (Brettell, 2003, p 7).

[39] Storey, 2003 (a), p 58.

[40] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, pp 137-138.

[41] The 'shared instruments of the culture' is a term used by Jerome Bruner and Carol Fleisher Feldman to refer to culturally recognisable narrative properties like genre and plot type that are widely shared within a culture (Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, 1996, p 293). I use it here to also encompass cultural images and symbols, what Toelken refers to as 'a pool of culturally recognizable resources in language' (Toelken, 1995, p 39).

4

Narratives of Nation: Scottishness, Rarely of Our Own Making

My heart's in the Highlands, my heart is not here;
My heart's in the Highlands a chasing the deer;
A chasing the wild deer, and following the roe,
My heart's in the Highlands, wherever I go.
Farewell to the Highlands, farewell to the north,
The birth place of Valour, the country of Worth,
Wherever I wander, wherever I rove,
The hills of the Highlands for ever I love.

(*Farewell to the Highlands* by Robert Burns)[1]

Narratives of Nation

Anthropologists and others who seek to understand the culture of groups, societies and nations have often found that attention to the symbolic offers important insights to the construction and expression of meaning, social structure and behaviour. As Caroline Brettell advocates, those engaged in this search for symbolic meaning must recognise and understand 'core or key symbols as part of their efforts to understand the society that uses them'.[2] This chapter examines how pervasive ideas about nation and national identity come to be symbolically constructed through narrative, focusing specifically on the dominant cultural narratives of Scotland and their role in imagining and representing Scotland and Scottishness. These narratives are considered in the light of recent cultural criticism about Scottish culture and identity and its implications for interpretations of

Scots culture in diaspora. It is argued that such critiques and discourses, which focus on a collective and an homogenous view of cultural identity, offer a limited explanation for how cultural narratives become connected to personal identities. That is, how the nation is imagined discursively is not necessarily how the nation comes to be imagined by individuals and social groups. This argument is built on perspectives that suggest that individuals and groups appropriate, customise and tailor cultural narratives to make sense of their life experiences. The main purpose of this chapter is to provide the broad cultural and critical context in which the family's song traditions can be located. This also provides important background for specifically addressing the place of those song traditions in the cultural construction of Scottishness in the next chapter.

The previous chapter discussed how the nation comes to be represented in various cultural forms and that some of these representations become more pervasive than others, attain wider currency and valency through being sustained in social discourse, disseminated through popular culture, and embedded in institutional arrangements. Such cultural representations of nation take many forms but many writers speak of the power of symbols, myths, and narratives in imagining the nation:

> "It is a commonplace in the study of nationalism that the construction of national identity inevitably relies on the creation and use of narratives - part history, part myth - that imbue nations and nationalist projects with coherence and purpose." (Hearn, 2000, p 745)

In this idea of narratives of nation as part history, part myth, lies a characteristic tension in historical discourse, that is, the extent to which the narratives of nation are to be viewed as invented, or evolving out of existing culture. For Ernest Gellner, 'nationalism is not the awakening of nations to self-consciousness; it invents nations where they do not exist'.[3] As Jonathan Hearn has noted, in some contemporary analyses of the formation of nations, there is a focus on the role of the state in creating invented traditions 'that put a patina of antiquity on newly formed nationalities, and on unifying political symbols in the form of monuments and public rituals'.[4] This 'invented

tradition', as Anthony Cohen has observed, is also often manifest in 'the expedient use of a kind of folkloric 'culture': the projection of the enlarged icons of an idealized peoplehood … a pragmatic politics in which a contrived version of a culture is employed *tactically* in a political encounter'.[5] Eric Hobsbawm's argument, that modern nations assert their legitimacy and authority through claims to historical roots that become expressed in 'invented' traditions, is reflected in many of these positions, and has had a major influence on the critiques of Scottish culture and research perspectives on the Scottish diaspora.[6]

Like Hobsbawm's emphasis on historical roots, Bendedict Anderson too argues that a sense of historical connection with the past is crucially important for the nation to be imagined as a community that exists over time and place.[7] But Anderson is not saying that the nation is 'invented' or 'imaginary', but 'imagined'. Nations are not invented, fabricated or false, but rather, nations are an 'idea' - an idea of fellow 'communion' - a sense of 'kinship'. David McCrone too suggests that nation is akin to community 'in so far as the search for its 'real' parameters is less significant than the set of symbolic meanings which attach to it'.[8] Nations are places of the mind, 'they have to be interpreted as ideas, made and remade'.[9] In a similar vein, Anthony Smith argues that in the creation of nation, the past is adapted and reformulated, rather than 'invented'. The nation is forged out of 'shared ancestry myths, histories and cultures, having an association with a specific territory and a sense of solidarity'.[10]

Whether the nation is 'imagined' or 'imaginary', it is represented and expressed through culturally constructed ideas that 'imbue nations and nationalist projects with coherence and purpose'. As Anderson has argued, 'communities are to be distinguished, not by their falsity/genuineness, but the style in which they are imagined'.[11] In other words, 'how' the nation is imagined is what marks one nation or national identity from another. Such collective ideas of nation and identity, in the form of symbols, myths and narratives do not determine personal identity but act as cultural reference points through which people negotiate and construct their own sense of national identity. In Margaret Somers' work on narrative and identity, it is through narratives that people construct

social identities, where people construct identities by locating themselves or being located within a repertoire of available narratives. Somers argues that 'social actors' use narratives to 'make sense of - indeed, to act in - their lives'. Narratives are 'used to define who we *are*; this in turn can be a precondition for knowing what to *do*'.[12] As she explains:

> "… people make sense of what has happened and is happening to them by attempting to assemble or in some way to integrate these happenings within one or more narratives; and that people are guided to act in certain ways, and not others, on the basis of the projections, expectations, and memories derived from a multiplicity but ultimately limited repertoire of available social, public, and cultural narratives." (Somers, 1994, p 614)

Such narratives may range from micro to macro scales - from the narratives of family, to the narratives of nation. The narrative of a nation, how it is represented and given symbolic expression, arises out of specific historical and cultural conditions, and the kinds of narratives that will socially predominate is contested politically and will depend in large part on the distribution of power. Even those narratives of nation that persist over time and that may appear fixed will be adapted or tailored to accommodate shifting social, economic and political circumstances. Importantly, for Somers, 'struggles over narrations are struggles over identity'.[13]

A specific and useful example of this constructed, contested and shapeshifting feature of cultural narrative is provided by Caroline Brettell's account of the emigrant as a potent symbol of Portuguese identity.[14] In the Portuguese context, the emigrant, as a symbol of national identity, has been appropriated to serve various political and economic ends, often serving to synthesise complex and sometimes conflicting ideas about the colonial and postcolonial Portuguese state and its relationship with Brazil. Over the course of several centuries the emigrant has been manifest in Portuguese culture in various guises, at times lauded, and at others, ridiculed by different groups in society. The emigrant narrative is full of contradictions and variations in meaning, shifting to and fro between

positive and negative attributes, and at times arousing an ambivalent response. Drawing on the work of Abner Cohen, Victor Turner, and Sherry Ortner, Brettell examines how the emigrant functions as a multivocal symbol. It is often ambiguous, standing for a multiplicity of disparate meanings that evoke 'varied sentiments and emotions, and impel men to action'.[15] The emigrant symbol also satisfies the conditions of being a key symbol that is 'central to the organisation of specific cultural systems', that is, 'the 'natives' say it is culturally important; they are positively or negatively aroused by it; it comes up in different contexts; it is the object of great cultural elaboration'.[16] For Brettell, the emigrant, as a key cultural symbol, serves as the vehicle for Portugal's imagined community, for those who remain and those who have left. It is a vehicle through which the Portuguese can think about their attachment to homeland and their identity, through which they can find their roots in their past, and through which they can represent the political, social and spiritual dimensions of being Portuguese that transcends physical boundaries.[17]

Somers' analysis of narratives of nation and Brettell's account of national cultural symbols reinforce the arguments introduced previously in this study. The meanings that attach to a nation are culturally constructed, are often contested, and are not sets of fixed, naturally occurring characteristics of a people or place. They form part of the stocks of cultural knowledge that are selectively brought into play in formulations of national identity. For Somers and Brettell the meanings of a nation are given expression through narratives or symbols that are culturally shaped and constructed, evolving over time and context. That shaping and construction of meaning 'evokes sentiments and emotions' that 'impel men to action' where 'people are guided to act in certain ways, and not others'. In these 'struggles over identity', as has been noted by McCrone previously, different political, social and cultural agendas may draw upon similar cultural materials to serve different purposes and to draw different conclusions.[18]

This has certainly been the case with the cultural materials that are the focus of this study. The Scottish songs, as icons of a culture and national identity, have been drawn into, and at times been the focus of, long standing debates about: what it means to be

Scottish, Scotland's cultural standing in the wider world, and as elaborated metaphors for Scotland's political status. At the same time, these icons of Scottishness have moved in and out of musical and cultural fashion and popularity, shifting at points in time from 'hits' to 'relics', while being sustained by the music industry and popular choice as 'golden oldies'.[19] These multivocal symbols of Scottishness have been part and parcel of how Scotland has been symbolically constructed and imagined in song. In seeking to understand those symbols and 'the society that uses them', this chapter focuses on the wider cultural narratives that these songs participate in. Here, as in Brettell's analysis of the emigrant, it is the prolific discourse on Scottish culture that supplies the 'data' for the discussion on these narratives and their role as vehicles for Scotland's imagined community.[20] If, as Brettell argues, Portuguese culture, literature and discourse is preoccupied with one dominant symbol (that of the emigrant), then Scottish culture, it could be said, is preoccupied with the multivocal symbol of the highlands and the discourses that attempt to explain it.

In the case of Scotland, a number of writers have pointed to the resilience of cultural narratives forged in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries - commonly referred to as 'Highlandism' and 'Kailyardism'.[21] These narratives have been central to accounts of Scottish culture and national identity, domestically and abroad, and have been the subject of considerable analysis. Much of the analysis of Highlandism and Kailyardism has focused on what are judged to be the pervasive and negative effects of Scotland being imagined as a land of kilts, tartan and the highlands, and couthy rustic folk, and their expression in popular culture. In these critiques of Scottish culture, cultural traditions are deemed backward looking and deformed stereotypes. The traditions, icons, symbols, and images associated with the highlands and a Kailyard domesticity have come to signify the degradation of Scottish culture at home and abroad. Those same traditions have in other contexts and times signified considerably more positive ideas about Scottish culture and identity. But, in the contemporary critique of Scottish culture, the signifiers of national distinctiveness and pride become 'nostalgic facsimiles',[22] 'commodity nationalism',[23] or worse, 'tartan monsters'.

Highlandism and Kailyardism are of course cultural constructs, ways of describing, accounting for, explaining and making sense of Scottish culture. They are terms that historians and others have used to describe and explain cultural formations of Scottishness. They are abstractions or metaphors for aspects of the culture, and which function at different levels of meaning. As cultural terminology they serve, on the one hand, to classify or group certain national narratives or cultural traditions for the purposes of analysis, and on the other hand, they serve to classify the critiques of these narratives and traditions. Or to put it another way, Highlandism and Kailyardism are narratives about narratives. As McCrone has argued, the contemporary critiques of the narratives of Highlandism and Kailyardism have become their own cultural discourses about Scottish culture.[24] To complicate matters further writers like McCrone and others are challenging these critical discourses and voicing a counter narrative about Scottish culture, as will be discussed below.

Somers offers a useful way of teasing out these complexities of narratives within narratives. She makes a conceptual distinction between different but interrelated dimensions of narrative – between personal (or 'ontological' narratives), public narratives (or cultural traditions), metanarratives and conceptual narratives.[25] Personal narratives are ways in which individuals make sense the world, drawing upon public narratives in the process. Public narratives are those that attach to 'cultural or institutional formations larger than the individual' and can be likened to traditions; metanarratives are the 'masternarratives' that embrace the sum of human history; and conceptual narratives are the analytical frameworks and explanations devised by social researchers. In each case, these narratives function as, what Somers calls, 'multiple plots in the narrative of nation'. Moreover, personal, public, metanarratives and conceptual narratives are not separate but interact in shifting relationships to each other over time and circumstance. Thus, Highlandism and Kailyardism can be understood as embodying multiple plots, different ways of making sense of the nation that operate at different, but intersecting levels of meaning. Within both Highlandism and Kailyardism are multiple and competing public narratives of Scottish culture and identity that 'social actors use to make sense of … their lives', a process that involves customising and tailoring public

narratives. It is this relationship, between public narratives and personal narratives, which this chapter will return to later.

Another useful way of understanding how these narratives operate is through the analysis of national symbols offered by Brettell. Taking the highlands first as an example: like the Portuguese emigrant, the highlands have functioned as a complex multivocal symbol of Scottish identity. The highlands have been invoked, both positively and negatively, as a national icon that stands for a number of different meanings, evokes varied sentiments and emotions, and is the object of cultural elaboration. Over several centuries the highlands have been endowed with cultural meanings that range from barbarian, barren and desolate, to idealised romantic and sublime, heroic and tragic. At various times the highlands have also been invoked in attempts to re-imagine the Scottish nation and to synthesise complex and sometimes conflicting ideas about Scottish national identity.

The highlands narrative, like that of the Portuguese emigrant, is full of contradictions and variations in meaning. In the critiques of Scottish culture, the highlands stand for an invented tradition, of romanticised and false or distorted traditions, signified by 'tartan mania',[26] and a sentimental vision of Scotland of the past, to be found in tourist brochures, souvenirs and in Hollywood films. In contrast, tourism industries mark the highlands as the 'authentic' Scottish experience and a unique wilderness; and for heritage industries, the highlands are part of a proud history.[27] In histories of the highland clearances, the highlands may stand for the decimation of a culture or the site of agricultural improvement and modernity.[28] The icons of the highlands, such as highland dress and tartan, also function as multivocal symbols. They can signify military valour and a vigorous masculinity, and at the same time be the source of jokes about Scotsmen's underwear. In the presence of a kilted piper - tradition, dignity and respect are evoked at weddings and funerals; while in other contexts, tartan becomes a statement of radical punk ballet dress, and twenty-first century Hollywood fashion.[29] As a source of poetic expression, in the Scottish emigrant songs of eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the highlands are a locus of yearning, loss and exile; in the songs of Robert

Burns, the highlands are a site of romantic love and patriotic sentiment; and in the ballads and novels of Sir Walter Scott the highlands are mystical places, heroic and tragic, emblematic of the imagined Scottish nation. In contemporary Scottish song, the highlands (and Scotland) are being re-imagined as Celtic and Gaelic.[30]

Like the highlands narrative, the Kailyard narrative too has become an elaborated multivocal symbol of Scottish culture. It derives its reference point from a particular school of literature in the late nineteenth century. The Kailyard writers, as they came to be known, produced immensely popular fictional and idyllic accounts of Scottish highland and rural village life for an enthusiastic domestic and international market. In its vision of a stable and orderly, pre-industrial community-based society, Kailyard literature serves as one of the multiple plots in the highland narrative, but it has also since evolved into a more generalised motif of an idealised Scottish rural and community life. The Kailyard has become the 'model' for numerous other fictional and idealised portrayals of Scottish life, in song, literature, film and television, and taking on the form of a 'popular-national tradition'.[31]

Within the Kailyard critique itself is a multiple and complex narrative encompassing accounts of the quality or otherwise (typically the latter) of a literary style, other similar formulaic portrayals of Scottish life, and a concern for their implications for Scottish culture. That concern has been extended and further elaborated to encapsulate all renditions of Scottishness that are judged parochial, sentimental and kitsch. In contrast to the critique, is the popularity of the cultural forms that the critique condemns, in particular popular forms of entertainment. The view of the critique is that Scottish culture is overly dependent on Kailyard themes and values, which are deemed largely responsible for a deformed and distorted sense of Scottishness.[32] When the Kailyard and highland narratives of critique intersect, as they typically do, their effect is even more far reaching. In these dominant discourses, Scottish culture dresses Scotland in tartan and the Scottish people in sentiment. The 'shrewd, merry, honest, hospitable folk' of the Kailyard and the heroes of the highlands all wear kilts; and 'display identity' becomes a substitute form of culture.[33]

As with the case of Highlandism, there is also a growing reconsideration of this pessimistic Kailyard account of Scottish culture.[34] Of particular interest to this study are the re-evaluations of the popular culture of twentieth century Scotland that my family drew upon for its singing entertainments. That music is considered in more detail in the next chapter, but first, it will be useful to explore Highlandism and Kailyardism further and to examine the issues they raise for formulations of national identity. Both of these narratives and their critiques are especially relevant to this study since the songs that my family sang arose out of the music that is typically associated with these cultural formulations. While it is not the purpose of this chapter to provide a comprehensive account, a consideration of them will help to illuminate how Scottishness has been constructed and viewed over time, and lay the groundwork for an examination of Scottish popular song traditions.

Highlandism

According to the historian Fitzroy Maclean, the popular notion of Scottishness owes a great deal to the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries and to Robert Burns and Sir Walter Scott:

> "In particular both writers helped create a new, popular image of Scotland and the Scots, which, though not always very closely related to reality, certainly served to put our country and nation back on the map. … the Scots soon became in the popular imagination paragons of all the virtues, at once fearless heroes and shrewd, merry, honest, hospitable folk with their hearts in the right place and their heads screwed on the right way, while Scotland and the Highlands in particular became the goal for innumerable enthusiastic sightseers from all over the world. Soon … in place of the harsh, bloodstained reality, a happy many-hued mythology of Celtic heroes, Robert the Bruce, Mary Queen of Scots, Rob Roy, Bonnie Prince Charlie and Flora Macdonald, which, at some slight cost to the cause of historical accuracy, has held the limelight ever since." (Maclean, 2002, pp 202-204)

Maclean's colourful description of the popular image of Scotland and the Scots captures, what for many recent historians and scholars, has become the subject of considerable analysis and review. There is hardly a work of Scottish history or culture that does not address in some fashion the legacy of the cultural appropriation of highland symbols, motifs and myths and its long term impact on Scottish culture and Scottish identity, at home and abroad. Highlandism is, for many writers, the invention of tradition, based on mostly imagined and false highland 'traditions' that were adopted by lowland elites to form the basis of a new Scottish identity.[35] As Hugh Trevor-Roper has argued, the very idea of a highland culture was a 'retrospective invention' that artificially created new highland traditions that were presented as 'ancient, original and distinctive'.[36] In McCrone's analysis of the cultural appropriation of the highlands he captures, in a quote from Marinell Ash, this common theme of an invented highland tradition:

> "The time that Scotland was ceasing to be distinctively and confidently herself was also the period when there grew an increasing emphasis on the emotional trappings of the past … its symbols are bonnie Scotland of bens and glens and misty shieling, the Jacobites, Mary Queen of Scots, tartan mania and the raising of Scottish statuary." (Ash, 1980, p 10, quoted in McCrone, 2001, p 39)

It is this identity, made up of highland images, that has, in turn, become the public personae of Scotland in tourism, heritage industries and popular music and media culture. But, as Andrew Hook has argued, these 'invented' traditions of a romanticised highland image of Scotland can also be understood as attempts to re-imagine Scotland and to reconfigure its cultural symbols, myths and narratives in the context of significant social, cultural and economic change:

> "What has to be recognized is that these familiar images whatever their subsequent fate in terms of nationalistic self indulgence, commercial exploitation, or the development of the Scottish tourist industry were in their origins imaginative responses to the realities of Scottish life and culture at a particular historical moment … Romantic images of Scotland and the mythology they helped to create … began

life as necessary fictions: imaginative attempts to order and interpret historical realities." (Hook, 1987, p 307)

The eighteenth century brought unprecedented change to Scotland.[37] From being one of the poorest countries in Europe, it became prosperous and the most highly urbanised country in Europe. The Union with England had opened up massive trade opportunities with the New World and Europe. For the elite, the new wealth was manifesting itself in high levels of expenditure on lifestyle commodities, grand homes, luxury goods and education. New forms of skilled and professional employment supported the growth of the middle class. Changes in agricultural practices, land tenure and industrialisation also brought masses of people into the major centres of Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen. But, as the historian Tom Devine points out, the Union with England also brought with it cultural pressures. On the one hand there was a desire and good reasons for closer links with England, and London, in particular. On the other hand serious concerns grew in Scotland about the culturally damaging effects of anglicisation. There were also parallel concerns south of the border at the increasing presence and influence of the Scots in English affairs. By the late 1800's anti-Scots feeling, 'Scottophobia', reached a new intensity, most notable in the popular English 'Scotch' songs and in Wilkes' English political cartoons that attacked Scottish immigrants as ignorant, grasping and corrupt.[38] These perceived pressures on Scottish cultural identity made the Scots even more determined to mark their distinctiveness - a process that was to be manifest through cultural means with music and song taking a leading role.

It was in this context, as Scotland became increasingly industrialised and its lowlands more like England, that it turned to its past to define its cultural identity, and to the highlands to 'maximise its difference'.[39] The symbols, myths and tartans of the highlands were appropriated by lowland Scots, with the result that 'an urban society adopted a rural face'.[40] The irony of this shift, as McCrone observes, was that the part of Scotland 'which had been reviled as barbarian, backward and savage found itself extolled as the 'real' Scotland - land of tartan, kilts and heather'. The consequence being

that 'what was taken to be a barren and desolate landscape of mid-century becomes a romantic and tragic icon of late eighteenth century'.[41]

While invoking a highland mythology, these 'necessary fictions' or 'invented traditions' of the eighteenth century did, however, draw upon a national past and regional popular traditions, building upon an already varied and elaborated cultural symbol of the highlands. The highlands had captured the popular imagination well before the eighteenth century, expressed in music and literature, reflecting both positive and negative sentiments. For centuries there existed a tradition of popular song depicting the courageous highlander, alongside a long tradition of songs and poetry of anti-highland satire that can be traced back to middle ages.[42] The eighteenth century drew on those traditions and more recent historical events associated with the highlands in a further elaboration of the highlands symbol. That elaboration was significantly enhanced through the cultural interpretation and representation of Jacobitism and the Jacobite rebellion of 1745, events that Devine notes as engendering a new more positive awareness of the highlands in the eighteenth century, and one that has continued to permeate popular culture:

> "The story includes the exploits of Charles Edward Stuart, 'Bonnie Prince Charlie', the drama of the '45 rebellion and the epic last stand of the Highland clans at Culloden. These are all the stuff of myth, romance and legend … created by poets, song writers, novelists, dramatists, film-makers and songwriters, all of whom have found the rise and fall of Scottish Jacobitism a beguiling source for their own creative work." (Devine, 1999, p 31)

Buoyed by the wide-spread interest in folk culture and oral tradition, a flourishing lowland song culture made a significant contribution to the dissemination of the Jacobite myth and the mythology of the highlands. As Devine notes, the songs of Robert Burns, Lady Nairne and James Hogg 'were vital in placing Jacobitism and so the Highlands at the centre of the new national consciousnesses which was emerging in Scotland after the union'.[43] These Jacobite songs - *Charlie He's My Darling*, *Will Ye No Come Back*

Again, Farewell to the Highlands, *The Campbells are Comin*, *A Hundred Pipers*, *O're the Water to Charlie*, and the many versions of *The Highland Laddie* - that contributed to the family's song traditions, were written as an act of self-conscious nationalism and were immensely popular, second only to love songs.[44] The 'Bonny Highland Laddie' of earlier tradition provided a ready archetype to which the Jacobite Prince Charles could be reconfigured as the gallant, charming, and courageous highlander, in the process of creating a new national icon in song. It was also in this process that Bonnie Prince Charlie came to be imbued with the erotic qualities of the highlander as the 'active amorist'.[45] In Burns' *Charlie He's My Darling*, as Carol McGuirk notes, the Jacobite rising is seen 'from the perspective of Edinburgh lassies dazzled by 'Charlie and his men' during their brief but triumphant occupation of the city':[46]

Charlie He's My Darling by Robert Burns [47]

'Twas on a Monday morning,
Right early in the year,
That Charlie came to our town,
The young Chevalier.

Chorus
An' Charlie he's my darling,
My darling, my darling,
Charlie he's my darling, the young Chevalier.

As he was walking up the street,
The city for to view,
O there he spied a bonie lass
The window looking thro'.

Sae light's he jimped up the stair,
And tirled at the pin;
And wha se ready as hersel,
To let the laddie in.

He set his Jenny on his knee,

All in his highland dress;

For brawlie weel he ken'd the way

To please a bonie lass.

It's up yon hethery mountain,

And down yon scroggy glen,

We daur na gang a milking,

For Charlie and his men.

But, as Devine and McCrone point out, the vision of a Jacobite Scotland did not achieve wide appeal until Jacobitism itself was finally crushed and politically harmless:

> "As such, it became politically acceptable and the wide dissemination of the Jacobite myth with its potent mixture of themes of love, loyalty, exile and loss was now possible. Jacobitism came to be regarded as representing the heroic Scottish past, the more seductive because it was so recent, and was of course seen as synonymous with the Highlands." (Devine, 1999, p 237)

It was also in this cultural climate that Scottish lowland song culture, came to depict 'a romantic, heroic and egalitarian nation, proud of its Jacobite past, and yet safe in the stability of the unionist present'.[48] Through the songs of Lady Nairne and others, Scottish identity was translated into 'nostalgia' - into a rural and unthreatening Scotland.[49] These songs exalted traditional ways of Scottish life, and harked back to 'a lost world of loyalty and honour'.[50] It was a vision of Scotland that was to prove durable and influential, and one that is now judged to anticipate and inform a Kailyard Scottish culture in the Victorian era.[51]

By the nineteenth century Sir Walter Scott, through his ballads and novels, was also disseminating the myth of the Jacobites and the highlands to a worldwide audience. His 1802 ballad collection, the Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border, sold out in Scotland and England within six months, was translated into German, Danish, and Swedish, and sold in North American editions.[52] Scott's works, according to Devine, generated an alluring

myth that 'invested the Scottish past with magical appeal and satisfied the powerful emotional needs for nostalgia' in a society searching for an identity amid unprecedented economic and social change.[53] Scott also played a key role in the appropriation and gentrification of tartanry by lowland Scotland. Scott's grand stage management of King George IV's kilted pageantry visit to Edinburgh in 1822, together with the well publicised deeds of the kilted regiments of empire, and later, Queen Victoria's love affair with the highlands, all contributed to the popularity and fashion for highland dress.[54] The kilt came to be associated with the heroic deeds of the Scottish soldier, and tartan came to be 'recognized as the badge of Scottish identity'.[55] Here too, an existing tradition - a military one - provided fertile ground for the creation of a new national icon:

> "The military tradition had long been an important part of the Scottish identity; now that was being decked out in Highland colours and the kilted battalions depicted as direct descendants of the Highland clans … they now represented the martial spirit of the Scottish nation as a whole rather than a formerly despised part of it." (Devine, 1999, p 234)

Devine argues that the exploits of the highland soldier made him 'a standard bearer for long-held beliefs about the martial virtues of the Scottish nation' and that the Highland regiments were crucial to the development of Highlandism.[56] Devine and McCrone acknowledge Scott as a key force in helping to promote tartanry and translate highland images and identities into Scotland as a whole. Devine's perspective is that Scott, as a brilliant pioneer in the invention of tradition, helped to develop a new set of national symbols and icons, and to renew others 'of venerable antiquity in the contemporary image of Victorian Scotland'.[57]

But Scott is also widely seen as a touchstone for an inauthentic nationalism. As Leith Davis, Ian Duncan and Janet Sorensen, note:

"With remarkable unanimity nationalist cultural histories identify the nineteenth century as the era when the Scottish tradition became extinct - or at the very least, went into hibernation. They converge, in particular, on Scott, anathematized for replacing a living heritage with a reactionary effigy." (Davis, et al, 2004, pp 6-7)

These writers draw attention to Scott's critics such as Edwin Muir, Tom Nairn and Murray Pittock, alluding to Pittock's accusation of Scott, as 'ringing down the 'tartan curtain' upon a populist and revolutionary Jacobitism - an authentic tradition - and replacing it with a nostalgic facsimile'.[58] Pittock's appropriately theatrical, for Scott, 'tartan curtain' metaphor reflects the tenor of much of the critique of Highlandism, and Scottish culture more generally. In Tom Nairn's assessment, the appropriation of highland symbols by lowland elites created the 'tartan monster'. Nairn's 'tartan monster' represents a widespread view of Scottish culture as split, divided and deformed, with an overemphasis on the past, resulting in what Nairn describes as a form of 'sub-nationalism'.[59] And according to McCrone, it is this 'sense of separation, of fragmentation' that 'runs through much intellectual analysis of Scotland.[60] As he notes, 'the conventional wisdom has been that since Scotland lost its formal political independence in 1707, it could not have a national culture worthy of the name … and as a result became 'deformed' and fragmented'.[61] The 'tartan monster' motif has been taken up by others in the critique of Scottish culture, notably by Christopher Harvie. He too characterises Scottish culture as deformed, 'schizoid', split between outward looking entrepreneurial intelligentsia, and reactionary and parochial homebodies. The parochial locals live in the kailyard and tend the 'tartan monster':

"If anything characterized post-Union … Scottish culture it was its essentially schizoid quality. The 'red' Dr Jekyll part of the intelligentsia - Hume, Carlyle, Geddes, Reith - was cosmopolitan, self-avowedly 'enlightened,' and, given a chance, authoritarian, expanding into and exploiting greater and more bountiful fields than their own country could provide. Back home, in his kailyard, lurked Hyde, demotic, parochial and 'black' reactionary, keeper of Tom Nairn's 'great Tartan monster', reader of the *Sunday Post*." (Harvie, 1998 (a), p 90)

In Harvie's elaborate metaphor is the common theme of an inward and backward looking, parochial Scottish home culture, epitomised by tartanry and the Kailyard. In accounts such as Harvie's and Nairn's, tartanry and the Kailyard collude in the degradation of Scottish culture. As David Goldie observes, for many critics of Scottish culture, it is these 'two complementary attitudes that have stunted Scottish culture and held it back from achieving authentic expression: the kitsch vulgarity of tartanry and the sentimental couthiness of the Kailyard'.[62]

Kailyardism

> "It is an accepted thesis that the term Kailyard refers to a much wider spectrum of Scottish culture than the fiction which traditionally bears its name. … Kailyard is in truth a complex and widespread phenomenon, elusive of definition. … Kailyard has become stretched to describe a general condition of Scottish culture." (Nash, 1997, p 180)

As Goldie, McCrone, and Andrew Nash have noted, Highlandism and Kailyardism are closely linked conceptualisations of Scottish culture, with each informing a wider complex critique. In that wider critique, the 'sentimental couthiness of the Kailyard' embraces much of the invented tradition of the highlands, such that Highlandism and Kailyardism become two faces of the same coin, and where Kailyardism is frequently used as synonym for tartanry or Highlandism. As McCrone suggests, tartanry was 'turned into a musical joke', with Harry Lauder representing 'the fusion of both tartanry and Kailyard - the jokes and mores from the latter, the wrapping from the former', as this example of a Lauder song, like others that also appear in the family's repertoire, might be seen to exemplify: [63]

I Love A Lassie by Harry Lauder [64]

I love a lassie, a bonnie hielan' lassie,
If you saw her you would fancy her as well:
I met her in September, popped the question in November,

So I'll soon be havin' her a' to ma-sel'.

Her faither has consented, so I'm feelin' quite contented,

'Cause I've been and sealed the bargain wi' a kiss.

I sit and weary weary, when I think aboot ma deary,

An' you'll always hear me singing this.

Chorus
I love a lassie, a bonnie bonnie lassie,

She's as pure as a lily in the dell,

She's sweet as the heather, the bonnie bloomin' heather,

Mary, my Scots bluebell.

I love a lassie, a bonnie hielan' lassie,

She can warble like a blackbird in the dell.

She's an angel ev'ry Sunday, but a jolly lass on Monday:

She's as modest as her namesake the bluebell.

She's nice, she's neat, she's tidy and I meet her ev'ry Friday:

That's a special nicht, you bet, I never miss.

I'm enchanted, I'm enraptured, since ma heart the darlin' captur'd,

She's intoxicated me with bliss.

I love a lassie, a bonnie hielan' lassie,

I could sit an' let her tease me for a week:

For the way she keeps behavin' well, I never pay for shavin',

'Cause she rubs ma whiskers clean off with her cheek.

And underneath ma bonnet, where the hair was, there's none on it,

For the way she pats ma head has made me bald.

I know she means no harm, for she'll keep me nice and warm,

On the frosty nichts sae very cauld.

Although Highlandism and Kailyardism can each be seen to have their own historical trajectories, with one predating the other, their histories overlap and merge. As Harvie has suggested, 'tartanry reached its fullest extent in the shrewd marketing of the Kailyard authors in the 1890's'.[65] At its height in the late Victorian era, the Kailyard school of writing produced hugely successful best sellers for the domestic, British, and Scottish expatriate markets. The key Kailyard authors, J M Barrie, Ian MacLaren and S

R Crocket, created fictional and idyllic accounts of Scottish highland life characterised by the sentimental and nostalgic treatment of rustic community scenes. The stories:

"… often centred on the church community, often on individual careers which move from childhood innocence to urban awakening (and contamination), and back again to the comfort and security of the native hearth. … The parishioners themselves, their dialect sometimes translated for an English audience, sprinkle their exchanges with native wit, and slip easily from the pettiness of village gossip to the profundities of rustic philosophizing." (Knowles, 1983, quoted in Devine, 1999, pp 296-297)

In its rural highland idyll the Kailyard drew upon and fed into the multiple strands of the highland narrative, reinterpreting and synthesising aspects of highland mythology to suit Victorian middle class tastes. In the Kailyard, the mystique of the highlands as scenery and landscape becomes peopled with village folk. The heroic and tragic highlands is now the site of industrious rural working communities, in which 'domesticity, rusticity, humour, humility, modesty, decency, piety and poverty' are the order of the day.[66] Like Scott's highlands that 'began a new era of comfort in every spot which his magic touched', the Kailyard highlands are made 'comfortable' and the setting for cosy tales of parish life - a life, which in reality, was rapidly disappearing.[67] As the historian T C Smout describes the period, the cultural influence of the churches as centres of local life was diminishing, and the grim reality of highland life was that of the poverty, oppression, suffering and depopulation, and fervent over land rights.[68] In the Kailyard vision, highland life is stable and orderly, the peasants hardworking, reliable and obedient. In this idealised notion of a pastoral past, community life and social order is maintained through the church minister, schoolmaster and industrious peasant workers.

The Kailyard portrayal of the highland peasant was a development of an already well established set of responses to the highlander in Scottish and English culture. As Smout notes:

"Some thought of the highlanders almost as savages … Others, more charitably, thought them more ignorant and fearful of the outside world than wicked and idle, so isolated by possession of Gaelic speech and adherence to the traditions of subsistence living that they found themselves unable to cope with any alternative way of life." (Smout, 1997, p 65)

The highlander peasant could be heroic, poor, and worthy; or hardworking, virtuous, poor and worthy; or lazy, ignorant and poor, and, therefore, unworthy. The unworthy peasant was to be blamed for the unfortunate circumstances that he might find himself in and was often the subject of ridicule and comic portrayal. When treated as comic and lampooned for his ignorance and laziness, the unworthy peasant was to be found in anti-highland satirical Scottish song; in the early seventeenth century 'Scotch' songs produced in England; and caricatured as 'Sandy' in Punch magazine. [69] His more worthy alter ego was the 'Scotch peasant', the paragon of virtuous poverty, who featured in Victorian writing on social problems:

"Self-reliant, poor and pious, paradoxically at once too proud to accept charity from the rate-payers and too respectful to question the ways either of Providence or of his earthly superiors. He was the imaginary paragon against which real Scots of the lower classes were often measured, and invariably found wanting." (Smout, 1997, p 10)

The Kailyard drew on these archetypes blending some of the comic the qualities of 'Sandy' with the worthy peasant to capture a portrayal of the rural Scot as self-reliant, poor and pious but equally shrewd, merry and hospitable. The epitome of the worthy peasant, in the Kailyard narrative, is the 'lad o'pairts', 'a talented youth (almost always male) who had the talent but not the financial means to improve himself'. [70] He exemplified the image of small-town conservative Scotland and embodied the idea of the Scottish myth of social advancement. But, as McCrone points out, 'the Kailyard with its homely celebration of … the virtues of independence, hard work and 'getting on' became a celebration of a doomed culture and way of life. The parish, the community, was no longer the typical locus of social existence; the industrialised and anonymous

city was now dominant'.[71] Yet, as Devine notes, 'for a society that was one of the most urbanized in the world but which had strong and recent roots in the countryside the Kailyard tales had an irresistible attraction'.[72]

That attraction may be at least partially explained by growing middle class anxieties about the effects of urban moral decay. In Smout's account of late nineteenth century Scotland, industrialisation, changes to agricultural practices and economy, and the displacement of highland crofters and Irish rural workers, brought huge numbers into the cities. Major centres became stretched to their limits as hundreds of thousands moved into the overcrowded cities to find poorly paid work, or experience unemployment. Conditions were widely recognised as appalling. Urban poverty, overcrowding, squalor and crime, and the growth of a large working class fuelled middle class fears and anxieties about moral degradation in the cities and the risks of socialism arising out of a disgruntled working class.[73] The typical response of educated middle-class opinion to urban growth was that 'the inhabitants appeared dangerous because uncontrolled - dangerous not only to themselves, but to property, to order, and to the State itself'. People who lived in villages and farms were, 'at least in theory, the more amenable to the traditional social control exercised by the minister, laird and immediate employer'. Although the reality of rural life was changing, the country 'still stood for stability, as the town did for insecurity'. Many believed that 'the salvation of Scotland would lie not merely in preserving traditional rural values but in somehow reintroducing them to the towns'.[74]

The Kailyard tales provided their middle class readership with a vision of those 'traditional rural values' in the form of a worthy folk culture, and a vision of Scottish national identity with its origins in a pastoral past. As such, the Kailyard can be seen as a manifestation of nineteenth century emerging European nationalisms that viewed folk culture as the very embodiment of the nature and character of a nation. In Storey's account, folk culture 'allowed middle-class intellectuals to imagine a lost national and natural identity and to dream of the possibility of a new 'authentic' national unity of a people bound together once again by the organic 'ties of land and language' '.[75] A

mythologised folk culture offered a kind of 'pastoral fantasy' of a world before industrialisation and urbanisation, and an alternative to the 'troublesome spectre of the urban-industrial working class'.[76] In that lost world, the mythologised peasant or highlander provided a link to a purer and more stable past where workers knew their place in the social order. The new urban-industrial worker, on the other hand, 'was fixed firmly in the present, completely detached from any salvation the past may have been able to offer'.[77]

But as Smout notes, the middle classes in Scotland (and elsewhere) did in fact seek to redeem the working classes, at least those that were judged respectable and worthy of salvation. They felt that they 'must pull the redeemable working man out before it was too late - with better housing, cleaner streets, better schools - and give him better habits and more deferential and orthodox views'.[78] One of the paths to redemption was through the inculcation of 'traditional rural values' to counteract the pernicious effects of urban life and the corrupting effects of the new forms of mass popular entertainment - music hall and theatre, football, cinema and dancing.[79]

In contrast to a worthy folk culture, the popular culture of the new urban working class was seen as corrupt and degraded. The new forms of urban working class popular entertainment were seen as evidence of a moral and cultural fall from grace that 'was there for all to see in the urban-industrial worker's unquenchable taste for the corrupt and corrupting songs of the music hall'.[80] According to Paul Maloney, in his account of the Scottish music hall, 'the first half of the nineteenth century saw a renewal of clerical attacks on all forms of commercial entertainment' and 'disposed a formidable body of opinion against entertainments such as music hall'.[81] The widespread public perception of music halls as disreputable or immoral places had eased somewhat by the late nineteenth century, but 'while music hall was still … a stone's throw away from its disreputable fairground past, it remained damned by association'.[82] By the turn of the century, what had been regarded as a tawdry working-class form was 'reborn as a mainstream popular theatre genre, offering 'respectable' family entertainment aimed at middle-class audiences'.[83]

Ironically, it is in the mass the appeal of urban popular culture - in the 'fall from grace' from an 'authentic' national culture - that the Kailyard critique is focused. While its symbolic point of departure is a middle class celebration of a mythical folk culture, the Kailyard critique has become a much wider critique of Scottish culture with much of it condemning contemporary Scottish culture as corrupted by the global market place and anglicisation which, in turn, is deemed to have resulted in an inward-looking, backward-looking parochialism. Moreover, as John Storey notes:

> "If we listen carefully it is possible to hear in the debates on the impact of the global on the local, echoes of earlier debates about folk culture being destroyed by industrialism and urbanism. It is as if the local is an authentic folk culture and the global is an homogenizing mass culture." (Storey, 2003 (a), p 116)

McCrone makes the point that, while the Kailyard school itself 'probably failed to survive the Great War, its influence on Scottish culture has been adjudged to be long-lasting and malevolent', with the implication that all of Scottish culture has become 'overwhelmingly the Kailyard'.[84] Nash suggests that the reason why the Kailyard literature and what is represents has become a cultural touchstone with such continuing significance is because of 'its perceived potential to market and validate an authoritative identity for Scotland'.[85] Referring to its many critics, Nash makes the observation that Kailyard is now seen as:

> "… part of a false stereotype which is marketed as Scotland's true national distinctiveness; a 'deformed' and 'pathological discourse'; readily ploughed in forms of culture, that is 'inadequate to the task of dealing with the reality of Scottish life'."
> (Nash, 1997, p 180, and quoting Colin McArthur, 1982, pp 2-3)

The Kailyard has become a catch phrase for 'bad art, cultural degeneracy and sloppy sentimentality and mawkish parochialism in depictions of Scottish culture'.[86] The idea of the Kailyard has become so negatively laden and so readily applied to such a wide spectrum of Scottish culture, that all Scottish popular cultural traditions tend to be

stereotyped by it, tainted and marginalised as sentimental and backward looking. Popular culture, product and tourism marketing are bundled together as signifiers of the degradation of Scottish culture. Films, television programs, performers and music, and popular literature and customs - visions of Scotland in films like *Brigadoon* and *Local Hero*, Harry Lauder's stage Scot, television's *Dr Finlay's Case Book*, Burns Clubs and Burns Suppers - are seen as evidence of a retreat into a sentimental, backward looking culture. In contemporary critiques, these popular representations of Scottishness are viewed as signifiers of 'a reductive and limiting stereotype' of Scottishness that has come to dominate Scottish culture.[87] It is a Scottishness too, that is seen as manufactured for export, in order and to satisfy the nostalgic needs of Scots abroad.[88]

The Kailyard has become emblematic of what is seen as a widespread cultural malaise that in many ways echoes eighteenth and nineteenth century middle class anxieties about working class culture and popular forms of entertainment. In the Kailyard critique, as David Goldie notes, arguments have often turned on the ways popular forms impoverish the culture and 'disparage the cultural tastes of ordinary Scots in the name of a high nationalist aesthetic'.[89] In his account, the Kailyard school of writing and popular entertainers like Harry Lauder were seen by early critics such as Hugh MacDiarmid as, 'part of a cultural racket that panders unashamedly to a debased popular taste and thus makes the work of serious art impossible'.[90] Goldie describes MacDiarmid as setting himself the task of rescuing Scottish cultural standards from what MacDiarmid described as the 'rhymesters of the kail-yard-cum-Harry-Lauder-school'.[91] These types of attacks on Scottish popular culture by Hugh MacDiarmid and Edwin Muir in the early part of the twentieth century have informed much of the criticism that was to follow by Tom Nairn, Christopher Harvie, and Colin McArthur.

Writers like Goldie, McCrone and Devine suggest that within that critique, Kailyardism has come to represent 'a profound crisis in Scottish nationhood' arising out of the consequences of the union with England.[92] Kailyardism is seen as symbolising a nation out of step with its own history and with the wider world. At a time when other countries around it, especially Europe, were asserting their rights to independence, political

nationalism failed to merge in Scotland. As Devine, notes, the argument is that the Scottish middle classes 'had been seduced in Scotland by the economic benefits of union and empire, but at the heavy cost of anglicization and cultural assimilation'.[93] At the same time, as Scotland was being transformed by industrialisation, urbanisation, and agricultural reform, it became separated from its historic national past with what are judged to have been devastating cultural consequences:

> "Loss of confidence led to an eventual collapse of Scottish culture: literature degenerated into mawkish 'kailyard' parochialism and painting into uninspired 'ben and glen'." (Ferguson, 1968, p 137, quoted in Devine, 1999, p 285)

In contrast to this pessimistic view, Devine asserts that the 'the descent of Scottish culture into the abyss of the sentimental parochialism of the Kailyard has been grossly exaggerated by modern critics'.[94] Drawing on the work of recent revisionist accounts of the Victorian period, Devine argues that Scottish national identity did not disappear in the Victorian period but adapted itself to new circumstances. This was a period of tremendous national pride and self congratulation associated with Scotland's role in empire and cultural, scientific and technological achievements. The Victorian era also saw 'the reinvention of Scotland, when new or refurbished icons continued to provide the nation with crucial symbols of identity and distinctiveness within the union'.[95] The adoption of highland symbolism, the fashion for Scotch Baronial architecture, and the cult of national heroes, like Robert Burns and William Wallace served to reinforce 'the idea of Scotland as a national entity through appeals to the nation's distinctive past'.[96]

Devine and McCrone also emphasise that Scottish culture in later nineteenth century was much more than the Kailyard school, and that it represents only a small part of the diversity of Scottish culture in the Victorian period. They refer to William Donaldson's analysis of popular fiction in the Victorian period that produced several thousand serialised novels in vernacular Scots for a largely domestic working class market:

"On the whole popular fiction in Scotland was not overwhelmingly back-ward looking; it is not obsessed with rural themes; it does not shrink from urbanisation or its problems; it is not idyllic in its approach; it does not treat the common people as comic or quaint. The second half of the 19th century is not a period of creative trauma or linguistic decline; it is one of the richest and most vital episodes in the history of Scottish popular culture." (Donaldson, 1986, p 149, quoted in McCrone, 2001, pp 137-138)

Maloney too, presents a more complex picture of the popular culture of Victorian Scotland in his account of Scottish music hall. He stresses that music hall was the principal popular medium of nineteenth century Britain, 'its songs were the popular currency of the era … its humour and styles penetrated the Victorian and Edwardian mind … as well as providing much of the vocabulary for everyday life'.[97] Scottish music hall reached its peak in the years leading up to World War 1 and was a vital medium of national as well as local identities. Maloney's analysis draws attention to the fact that Scottish music hall encompassed a wide range of ideas and attitudes that 'offered a more rounded and varied representation of Scottish culture than the predominance of the Scotch comic caricature has lead us to expect'.[98] In the cause of empire, for example, Scottish music hall embraced both British and Scottish sensibilities that served a useful double purpose, 'offering both a pretext for chauvinistic Scottish patriotism under the umbrella of support for imperial causes, and a vehicle for implicit criticism of the English establishment'.[99] In contrast to the English music hall, the Scottish music hall used home grown Scots songs and local patriotic imagery to sell the idea of empire, with tartan and the kilted highlander featuring as a shorthand indication of shared Scottish identity.

Maloney argues that the stage Scotch comic, notably portrayed by Lauder, can be seen as 'having had an influence on modern Scottish identity that went far beyond the biscuit-tin tartanry alleged by Lauder's accusers'.[100] He challenges the idea that the Scotch comic was a cultural travesty. Far from debasing Scottish culture, it represented a composite image of Scottish identity - 'a unifying personification of Scottish nationhood

where none had previously existed'.[101] These Scottish cultural stereotypes served to reconcile and appeal to the diversity of the new urban cultural mix of rural lowland incomers, Gaelic speaking highlanders, and urban industrial workers. These stereotypes also grew out of a long established tradition in Scottish theatre, literature and song, including the multivocal highlander symbol. The stage Scott was not simply a commercial response to a wider British and transatlantic market, but in fact drew upon on a well established Scottish tradition predating the music hall. Moreover, as Maloney points out, the idea that 'Scotch comics arose purely as a response to English variety audiences' need for a handle on Scottish identity seems simplistic, given their enormous popularity in Scotland'.[102]

For Maloney, Scottish music hall bridged the gap between old and new cultures and established a 'new urban folklore'. Its songs dealt with the current issues of working people's lives, and, together with the incorporation of traditional Scottish folk idioms and traditions, meant that Scottish music hall served as 'a continuation rather than an interruption of oral traditions'.[103] These features, together with its participatory nature, including amateur nights, and the incorporation of its songs and idioms into wider family and social life, point to music hall's achievement in re-establishing 'a continuum with older pre-industrial notions of community disturbed by the effects of urbanisation and the trauma of social displacement'.[104]

Maloney's account of Scottish music hall is taken up by David Goldie who also makes a similar case for a reassessment of Lauder and other popular Scottish entertainers who shaped Scotland's popular song culture in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. In Goldie's view, the critiques of Lauder and Scottish popular culture more generally suggest a kind of 'queasiness about the cultural and recreational tastes of contemporary working-class Scotland, that might be put down simply to old fashioned prejudice and snobbism'.[105] Goldie takes MacDiarmid to task for his condemnation of Harry Lauder and attacks on popular culture, characterising MacDiarmid as 'a joyless Victorian reformer for rational recreation - a kind of humourless, tutting public moralist disapproving the irresponsibilities of music hall and cheap literature'.[106] Goldie argues

that what the critiques of Scottish culture 'gain in theoretical rigour they lose in an awareness of the complexities of the exchange that is involved' and that it is insulting to audiences 'to suggest that they lacked the ironic distance to mistake it (tartanry) for a representation of authentic culture'.[107] In Goldie's view, the critics of Scottish popular culture's insistence that lightweight humour is devastating to Scottish esteem seem to be getting things 'a little out of proportion'. He refers to critics like MacDiarmid, Muir, McArthur, Beveridge and Turnbull, and Nairn who 'arguably overplay their hand in suggesting that tartanry and the kailyard have duopolised Scottish culture to the extent that there could be no intellectual or cultural practices that weren't in some way tainted by them'.[108]

This idea that the contemporary critiques of Scottish culture have overstated their case is an important part of McCrone's analysis of the narratives of Highlandism and Kailyardism. According to McCrone, contemporary accounts of Scottish culture are disproportionately dominated by attention to the narratives of Highlandism and Kailyardism and that they have become their own limiting cultural discourse about Scottish culture. The theme of a deformed nature of Scottish culture is one which has dominated discussions about Scottish culture for much of the last fifty years. In it 'a narrow set of discourses - crucially tartanry and Kailyardism - has been employed in the cultural analysis of Scotland, and the end result is a fairly pessimistic and misleading account of Scottish culture'.[109]

The problem for McCrone is that the search for a distinctive Scottish identity has been dominated by these discourses and, moreover, that the search is misdirected. In the cultural analysis of Scotland, these discourses seek to locate the 'essence' of the national culture, to define an essential national identity through its cultural forms. By applying tartanry and Kailyardism 'as the essentials of our national culture, albeit negative ones' they act as limiting discourses, simplifying and in effect freezing the culture.[110] As a consequence, the cultural traditions that are embraced by these nationalist discourses are reduced to backward looking and deformed stereotypes. In his assessment, McCrone believes that 'much of the attack on tartanry and Kailyard has depended on an uncritical

assumption that their impact has been comprehensive and undifferentiated'.[111] In contrast, he argues that the effects of tartanry and Kailyardism 'are far less dominant than is made out, and that their influence is not quite as unproblematic and pernicious as has been claimed'.[112]

McCrone is not arguing that these dominant discourses or the cultural narratives they critique are false, or that they can or should be replaced by others that attempt to essentialise Scottishness. Rather, he suggests, we should be seeking 'to identify the social and cultural forces that keep them alive, for often they serve key legitimatory purposes'.[113] The important question to ask is why some narratives are retained and others disappear.

Narratives of Nation and Agency

Jonathan Hearn attempts to address this question of how narratives of nation gain and retain their salience. His thesis is that narratives can be understood according to how they explain, justify, and resonate with our experiences of agency, of empowerment and disempowerment. Narratives of nation:

> "… get their normative and ideological pull by being bound up with terms and sensations of power and efficacy, not simply by defining membership in shared identities. Without the promise of power, of self-determination, or an explanation for one's disempowerment, such identities are hollow." (Hearn, 2002, p 764)

Hearn is primarily interested in how such narratives become connected to personal identities, that is, why and how people invest themselves in nations and nationalisms. An important part of the answer for Hearn has to do with the ways 'that constructions of narrative and agency at the collective level articulate with experiences of narrative and

agency at a personal level', that is, 'how actual people connect with the collective narratives that their lives and particular circumstances present to them'.[114] How narratives of nation become connected to personal identities is also a core focus for this study, and will be further explored in subsequent chapters. For the purposes of this chapter it will suffice to concentrate primarily on Hearn's analysis of public narratives.

Hearn draws upon Somers' analysis of narrative to investigate how the Scottish nation has been portrayed in historical discourses. These shifting portrayals of Scotland convey certain historical 'moods' towards the nation as 'a continuous actor on the historical stage'. These moods reflect a sense of agency on the part of the nation and are expressed through different symbols and icons, which are disseminated and reinforced through a wide array of means - through speeches and debates, in literature, the arts, the media, and everyday conversation. He identifies a number of recurring clusters of sets of symbols and icons (distinctive tropes) that attach to the different ways in which Scotland has been portrayed. His argument is that it is possible to detect a pattern in these clusters of symbols and icons that suggest moods of 'empowerment', 'disempowerment', or 'conflicted feelings about agency'.

Hearn's mood of *empowerment* is characterised by 'a kind of triumphal pride in Scotland's association with empire and cultural achievements'. In empowerment narratives, Scottish cultural icons, symbols and historical figures are represented as objects of pride, as icons of national achievement. As he notes, both Scott and Burns 'were seen as proof of Scotland's substantial contribution to the civilized world of letters, and Wallace and Bruce as defenders of a national vigor'. Hearn also makes the point that more recently these historical figures have often been shaped as 'symbols of dissent' (less so Scott), but 'this only highlights the multivocality and contextual nature of symbols'.[115]

The mood of *disempowerment* articulates a loss of national agency. It 'reflects a tragic-romantic understanding of the Scottish experience' expressed in elegiac symbols. In elegiac narratives there is typically a strong romantic attachment to a bygone era. The

history of the Scottish highlands - the defeats of Bonnie Prince Charlie and the highland clearances - provide a 'primary symbolic resource'. The theme of tragedy and loss has also blended with that of triumph, as can be seen in the fusing of the Jacobite highland symbology in the nineteenth century with Scotland's martial role in the empire. Hearn suggests that this represents not just an invention of tradition, 'but a significant inversion of symbolism, transforming elegy into triumph for a new national middle-class'. The theme of disempowerment can also be found in more contemporary developments, with 'the recent vintage of elegiac symbols to be found in the decline of Scottish heavy industry and an associated communal working-class culture'.[116]

Hearn's third mood refers to narratives that reflect a *conflicted sense of national agency*. In these narratives, Scottish identity and culture is viewed as a series of unresolved contradictions that are expressed in binary oppositions: for example, between triumph and loss, between outward looking innovators and conservative homebodies, and between British and Scottish identities. It suggests, 'a conflicted internally divided self and will that provides the framework for thinking about and generating nationalist rhetoric'.[117] Hearn typifies this mood with examples of the critiques of Scottish culture, discussed in this chapter, that view Scottish culture and identity as split, deformed and fragmented, such as MacDiarmid's 'Caledonian antisyzygy', Nairn's 'tartan monster' characterisation of Scotland, and Harvie's 'schizoid' Jekyll and Hyde metaphor, which Hearn cites as a classic example of this conflicted mood.

Hearn stresses that these shifting historical moods are 'not a simple sequence of replacements' with one mood giving way to another over time, rather they are 'an attempt to sketch the unfolding evolution of ideas, highlighting what is new at given periods'.[118] His analysis underscores the points made at the opening of this chapter, that in the narratives of nation, different and often competing versions interact in shifting relationships to each other over time and circumstance. In Hearn's terms the shifting portrayals of Scotland reflect shifts in the sense of national agency. His framework of historical moods provides a useful way for understanding the multiple and competing versions of Scottish culture and national identity embodied in the highland and Kailyard

narratives discussed above. In particular, his historical moods help to explain how cultural icons, images and symbols become invested with different meanings through their association with shifting attitudes towards the nation. For example, the meaning of the highlands, its icons and symbols, have been variously attached to national moods of triumph and pride, but also to moods of tragedy and loss, expressed in elegiac symbols, and to a sense of national cultural degradation where those cultural traditions are viewed as false, or corrupted. Similarly the sense of national pride associated with figures such as Robert Burns and Scott has shifted in the historical discourse. There are similar shifts to be found in the Kailyard narrative, from elegy to triumph, to kitsch. The Kailyard writers' highlands idyll can be seen as an example of Hearn's inversion of the symbolism of elegy into triumph, where the tragedy of highland experience becomes the site of a kind of middle-class moral triumph of 'traditional rural values'. The sense of triumphal pride in the Victorian era associated with the age of empire can also be seen in the new forms of popular urban entertainment, such as music hall. In the Victorian era, Scotland struts the world stage in a kilt, which by the twentieth century becomes 'sub-cultural Scotchery', and 'the frittering away of the national spirit in a few cheap laughs and a sentimental song'.[119]

Hearn's argument, that narratives of nation gain their salience to the extent that they explain, justify or resonate with feelings of empowerment has important implications for this study's dual focus on public and private formulations of national identity. In particular, his analysis raises questions about how the critiques of Scottish culture reflect different dimensions of agency. On the basis of Hearn's analysis, the critiques of Scottish culture account only for a conflicted and divided sense of agency, or a disempowered one. In these critiques, where traditions are characterised as relics of the past, or deformed stereotypes, little, if any room is available for a positive sense of agency. They are silent with respect to the possibility that cultural traditions may evoke feelings of empowerment or, for that matter, as Goldie has suggested, pleasure and entertainment that is not symptomatic of cultural degradation. To the extent that these discourses account for how the cultural forms that are the subject of their critique connect to people's lives and sense of identity, it is predominantly in a restricted and

negative sense. They offer a limited explanation for the relevance that people continue to find in traditional cultural forms.

The implication that can be drawn from these critiques is that people find in traditions, icons, symbols a sense of relevance that can only be backward looking, conflicted and distorted; and/or that people are cultural dupes, accepting nostalgic facsimiles in place of 'the real thing'. Either way, these critiques portray not only an impoverished culture, but also one that is 'consumed' by a culturally impoverished people. McCrone's evidence, and the evidence that this study intends to provide, is to the contrary. As noted in the previous chapter, Scottish cultural traditions continue to act as important referents to Scottish identity in both public and private domains of Scottish life. In McCrone's view contemporary critiques of Scottish culture are often at odds with this reality and offer a fairly pessimistic and misleading account of Scottish culture. Moreover, (to paraphrase McCrone), the other revisionist accounts of Scottish culture discussed in this chapter also help to undermine the view that the cultural narratives of the highlands and the Kailyard have led to a deformed and distorted sense of Scottishness.[120]

This chapter has sought to tease out some of the features in the multiple plots of Scottish culture and national identity that have given meaning to, and been shaped by, various cultural images, myths and narratives. It has been important to attempt to differentiate, to the extent that this is possible, the ways in which cultural traditions have been generated and reproduced, constructed and mobilised in the often competing and contradictory narratives of nation. In particular, it has been important to underscore how often similar cultural materials or forms come to be valued in different ways, and are held to signify different meanings. The investigation of the dominant cultural narratives of Highlandism and Kailyardism and their critiques has served to provide this focus.

The investigation has also raised the issue of how such public narratives become connected with people's lives. As Somers reminds us, narratives 'are used to define who we *are*; this in turn can be a precondition for knowing what to *do*'. The idea has also been introduced that cultural or national symbols, icons, myths, traditions and narratives

not only represent, describe or symbolically define the nation but 'get their normative and ideological pull by being bound up with terms and sensations of power and efficacy, not simply by defining membership in shared identities'.[121]

The exploration of the contemporary critiques of Scottish culture in this chapter has argued that these discourses devalue the culture that people actually use and choose to make a part of their lives. These critiques of Scottish culture take little account for the ways in which people appropriate, customise or tailor 'the salient narratives that people participate in and the network of social relations in which this happens'.[122] As Somers has argued, 'the kinds of narratives people use to make sense of their situations will always be an empirical rather than a presuppositional question. It is essential, in other words, that we explicate, rather than assume or take for granted, the narratives of groups and persons'.[123] This study seeks to address this need for explication, rather than assumption, by exploring how one family appropriated and customised the cultural narratives of Scotland embodied in popular song, and the key social relations in which this happens. Having considered the dominant narratives that are expressed in Scottish culture, the following chapter turns to a specific focus on how these cultural narratives of Scottishness have been constructed and expressed in song, in order to better understand the nature of the relationship between these songs and my family's narrative.

---

[1] First part of *Farewell to the Highlands*, in *The Scots Musical Museum*, vol 3, originally published in 1790. This version taken from James Johnson and Robert Burns, eds, 1853 edition, reprinted as facsimile edition 1991. Carol McGuirk's comment on this Burns song is: 'the text draws its images from painful and recent Scottish historical experience: Jacobite defeat and exile, followed by the clearance of the Highlands' (McGuirk, 1993, p 260). She notes that 'Ashmead and Davison praise this as one of Burns's (sic) most inspired (as well as most popular) syntheses of music, words and feelings' (McGuirk, 1993, p 260). It has a 'nostalgic, even melancholy outpouring … Its slow ornaments are, in fact, reminiscent of a bagpipe lament' (McGuirk, 1993, p 260, quoting Ashmead and Davison, 1998, p 242).

[2] Brettell, 2003, p 16.

---

[3] Gellner, 1964, p 169.

[4] Hearn, 2000, p 747.

[5] A P Cohen, 1993, p 202. See also David Harker's argument concerning the bourgeois invention of folk song/folk culture in support of an ideology of national unity (Harker, 1985). Other writers have argued against the idea of a one-way appropriation underlying this late twentieth century 'critical orthodoxy' (see, for example, Atkinson, 2004 (b); Newman, 2002; Davis, 2004; T Crawford, 1979).

[6] Hobsbawm, 2003, pp 1-2. Hobsbawm draws a distinction between 'custom' that allows for change and adaptation, and 'invented tradition' that does not (Hobsbawm, 2003, p 2).

[7] Anderson, 2006, pp 6 and 26.

[8] McCrone, 2001, p 51.

[9] McCrone, 2001, p 49.

[10] Smith, 1988, p 32.

[11] Anderson, 2006, p 6.

[12] Somers, 1994, p 618.

[13] Somers, 1994, p 631.

[14] Brettell, 2003, pp 15-21.

[15] Brettell, 2003, p 16, quoting Abner Cohen, 1974, p ix.

[16] Brettell, 2003, p 16, drawing on Turner, 1967, and Ortner, 1973.

[17] Brettell, 2003, p 19.

[18] McCrone, 2001, p 191.

[19] Dianne Dugaw describes the 'life cycle' of popular song in these terms. The stages in a song's popularity are characterised as: a 'new hit' that has 'topical resonance and immediacy'; a 'golden oldie', that is a 'well-known standard whose familiarity keeps on selling'; a 'relic' or 'antique', that is a curious and 'valuable cultural heirloom' (Dugaw, 1996, p 43).

[20] Brettell, 2003, p 9.

[21] Kailyard means cabbage patch or garden. The term, adopted from Burn's poem, *The Cotters Saturday Night*, and used as a motif by one of the Kailyard writers, became associated with that literary genre (see Devine, 1999, p 297). Andrew Nash describes an elaborated relationship between the family and community oriented tenor of the Burns poem and the similar focus of the Kailyard school (Nash, 1997, pp 180-197).

[22] Leith Davis, Ian Duncan and Janet Sorensen, 2004, p 8. They are referring here to Murray Pittock's critique of invented Scottish traditions (Pittock, 1991).

[23] Zumkhawala-Cook, 2005, p 113.

[24] McCrone, 2001, p 31.

[25] Somers, 1994, pp 617-620.

[26] 'tartan mania' in Marinell Ash, 1980, p 10, quoted in McCrone, 2001, p 39.

[27] See, for example, R A Houston and W W J Knox, 2001, p lvi, for a similar description of the Scottish heritage industry.

[28] See, for example, Smout, 1997, pp 58-84; and Devine, 1999, pp 170-195, and p 241.

[29] For example, the punk fashion designer Vivienne Westwood's formal tartan bridal dress; Michael Clark, the punk ballet dancer, who performed bare chested in a kilt; and, the 'Dressed To Kilt' celebrity fashion show in New York, a highlight of the 2007 Tartan Week.

[30] Devine refers to how the highland exodus is portrayed in terms of 'tragedy, pathos and involuntary exile', and where the songs of Scottish emigrants express the emotions of 'nostalgia, loss and yearning for the old country' (Devine, 2003, p 190). He also notes a similar association with the highlands in contemporary popular song (Devine, 2003, p 213). Connell and Gibson note the adoption of Gaelic language and Celtic themes in contemporary Scottish song (Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 38 and 132). See also Munro, 1996, for Gaelic and Celtic influences in the folk music revival in Scotland. More broadly, Malcolm Chapman (1978 and 1992) has examined how a Gaelic and Celtic vision for all of Scotland was developed during the eighteenth century.

[31] 'national-popular tradition' (Nairn, 2003, p 150), and also discussed in McCrone, 2001, p 137.

[32] McCrone, 2001, p 138.

[33] Nairn's (2003) concept of 'display identity' is also discussed in McCrone, 2001, p 146.

[34] See Ian Campbell, 1981; Donaldson, 1986; McCrone, 2001; Devine, 1999; Goldie, 2000 and 20006; Maloney, 2003.

[35] Devine, 1999, p 233.

[36] Hugh Trevor-Roper, 2003, pp 15-16.

[37] See Devine, 1999, for this history of the period.

[38] Herman, 2001, p 118; and Devine, 1999, pp 27-30.

[39] Devine, 1999, pp 244-245, quoting Womack, 1988, p 145.

[40] Devine, 1999, p 231.

[41] McCrone, 2001, p 39.

[42] Devine, 1999, p 232; T Crawford, 1979, pp 104-105; and Donaldson, 1988.

[43] Devine, 1999, pp 237-238.

[44] See D Johnson, 2003, p 4; and Donaldson, 1988, p 94, for Jacobite song as the dominant cultural form of the period.

[45] See Donaldson, 1976 and 1988; and T Crawford, 1979, p 105, for the highlander as 'active amorist' in popular song. Also discussed in D Johnson, 2003, p 137; and Devine, 1999, p 236.

[46] McQuirk, 1993, p 290.

[47] From *The Scots Musical Museum*, vol 5, (1796), 1853 edition, 1991 reprint. 'tirled' = turn or pull; 'pin' = bolt; 'brawlie' = very, thoroughly; ken'd = knew; 'scroggy' = bushy, scrubby; 'daur' = dare; 'gang' = go (*Scottish National Dictionary* (SND)).

[48] West, 2006, p 122.

[49] Davis, 2002, pp 6-7.

[50] McQuirk, 2006, p 281.

[51] See West, 2006, p 122; Davis, 2002, pp 6-7; Sweeney-Turner, 1998, p 162. See also McGuirk, who says that Nairne's songs 'did display a leaning towards nostalgia and sentimentality, almost stretching into the expression of the Kailyard writers'. She adds, however, that Nairne's best songs are comparable with those of Burns (McGuirk, 1997, p 52).

[52] Details from the *Walter Scott Digital Archive*, Edinburgh University Library; and Herman, 2001, p 298.

[53] Devine, 1999, p 292.

[54] McCrone, 20001, p 133. Devine, 1999, p 234.

[55] Devine, 1999, p 234 and p 293.

[56] Devine, 1999, p 240.

[57] Devine, 1999, p 292.

[58] Davis, et al, 2004, p 8.

[59] Nairn, 2003, p 150; and also discussed in McCrone, 2001, pp 129-130.

[60] McCrone, 2001, p 138.

[61] McCrone, 2001, p 129.

[62] Goldie, 2000, p 10.

[63] McCrone, 2001, p 132.

[64] From the album, *Harry Lauder, Roamin' in the Gloamin': Original Recordings, 1926-1930*, Naxos, 2004. Written by Harry Lauder and Gerald Grafton (1905). 'hielan' ' = highland; 'ma-sel' ' = myself; 'nicht' = night (SND).

[65] Harvie, 1988 (b), p 27, quoted in McCrone, 2001, p 132.

[66] Shepherd, 1988, summarised in McCrone, 2001, p 136.

[67] This account of Scott is quoted in Smout, 1997, p 10. Smout identifies it as a quote from J Murdoch, *A Guide to the Highlands of Speyside* (Forres, 1825, p 324), and used by R W Butler in 'The Development of Tourism in the Highlands in the 18th and 19th Centuries' - an unpublished paper from the Annual Meeting of the Canadian Association of Scottish Studies, Montreal, June, 1980.

[68] Smout, 1997, p 10 and pp 62-69.

[69] See also Devine, 1999, p 232; and Goldie, 2000, p 7.

[70] McCrone, 2001, p 20.

[71] McCrone, 2001, p 137.

[72] Devine, 1999, p 297.

[73] Smout, 1997, pp 44-46.

[74] Smout, 1997, pp 9-10.

[75] Storey, 2003 (a), p 14, quoting Martin-Barbero, 1993, p 12.

[76] Storey, 2003 (a), p 14.

[77] Storey, 2003 (a), pp 10-11. See also Devine, 1999, pp 240-241.

[78] Smout, 1997, p 31.

[79] See also Devine, 1999, pp 360-361; Maloney, 2003, pp 4-8; Finlay, 2004, p 136.

[80] Storey, 2003 (a), p 11.

[81] Maloney, 2003, p 4 and p 6.

[82] Maloney, 2003, p 53.

[83] Maloney, 2003, p 57.

[84] McCrone, 2001, p 37.

[85] Nash, 1997, p 181.

[86] Devine, 1999, p 297.

[87] Goldie, 2000, p 11.

[88] See, for example, Nairn, 2003, pp 148-149; and McCrone, 2001, p 137. McCrone also comments that the role of the Scottish émigré as both producer and consumer was vital in the success of Kailyard literature (McCrone, 2001, p 137). Nash suggests that it was the 'predisposition for nostalgia' of emigrant Scots that afforded the 'Kailyard, and popular entertainers like Harry Lauder, an immense following' - and for Robert Burns (Nash, 1997, p 188).

[89] Goldie, 2006, p 9 and p 17.

[90] Goldie, 2006, p 1, quoting a line from one of MacDiarmid's poems.

[91] Goldie, 2006, p 3.

[92] Devine, 1999, p 285.

[93] Devine, 1999, p 285.

[94] Devine, 1999, p 296.

[95] Devine, 1999, p 287.

[96] Devine, 1999, p 292.

[97] Maloney, 2003, p 1.

[98] Maloney, 2003, p 163.

[99] Maloney, 2003, p 218.

[100] Maloney, 2003, p 161.

[101] Maloney, 2003, p 171.

[102] Maloney, 2003, p 170.

[103] Maloney, 2003, p 161.

[104] Maloney, 2003, p 222.

[105] Goldie, 2006, p 1.

[106] Goldie, 2006, p 4.

[107] Goldie, 2000, pp 12-13.

[108] Goldie, 2000, p 12.

[109] McCrone, 2001, p 140.

[110] McCrone, 2001, p 143.

[111] McCrone, 2001, p 141.

[112] McCrone, 2001, p 131.

[113] McCrone, 2001, p 132.

[114] Hearn, 2002, p 745 and p 747.

[115] Hearn, 2002, pp 758-759.

[116] Hearn, 2002, p 760. See also McCrone, 2001, pp 139-140, for a discussion of contemporary Scottish elegaic myths.

[117] Hearn, 2002, p 763.

[118] Hearn, 2002, p 757. This is also the point with respect to how Highlandism and Kailyardism intersect.

[119] Goldie, 2006, p 3, is alluding to MacDiarmid's critique.

[120] McCrone, 2001, p 138.

[121] Hearn, 2002, p 764.

[122] Hearn, 2002, p 748.

[123] Somers, 1994, p 630.

5

Singing the Nation: Dancing to a Tune Laid Down by Others

Nothing connects us all but imagined sound.

(Benedict Anderson, 2006, p 145)

Hall stresses that we work within cultural representations whether we know it or want it ... we may think that we are making it up as we go along, but we are in fact dancing to a tune laid down by others.

(David McCrone, 2001, p 152)

Song (and music) has been one of the major cultural forms through which ideas about a place and its people have played out in the narrative of nation. Indeed, it has been through song itself that ideas about nation have been generated and provided a rallying focus for various versions of nationalism and national identity. This chapter examines how the song traditions that formed the basis of my family's repertoire have participated in the shaping of pervasive ideas of Scottish national identity, and how that shaping has shifted and been viewed over time. It considers how such songs have been seen to function as both 'authentic' and 'invented' icons of nationhood and national identity. It locates this discussion within broader arguments about 'authentic' Scottishness, and the role of popular song culture in its representation and dissemination. This analysis is introduced and framed by a conception that, as shared instruments of a culture, songs

carry with them cultural meanings that play an important mediating role in how they are used and understood locally.

A Shared Voice - The Nation in Song

Much of the analysis and critique of Scottish culture discussed in the previous chapter revolves around debates about the 'authenticity' or otherwise of the cultural representation of nation. Anthony Cohen makes the pertinent point that differences of view over what the nation is and how it should be authentically expressed is evidence that national identity is ambiguous and ambivalent, that it is never so 'secure' that it can be left to look after itself - we are continuously working with it through ritual, myth and symbol.[1] Here, Cohen is referring primarily to collective ideas of nation, expressed in a myriad of symbolic forms, and where the 'nation' is, in his terms, 'a grand generalization'. Whereas the nation is a grand generalisation, Cohen makes the pertinent point that the individual is highly specific and interprets and constructs the nation in terms of personal and local experience. By this, he does not mean that people construct the nation in cultural isolation, but rather that individuals 'interpretively construct their identities as members of collectives through their unique experience of them'.[2] He emphasises that not only do individuals construe their attachment to nation on different terms but also that each person's experience and understanding of nation is unique. Although collective ideas of nation are to be distinguished analytically from the personalised nature of the construction and interpretation of the nation, they are interdependent - it is through collective forms that individuals locate and depict their selves.

Like Somers and Hearn discussed previously, Cohen places the emphasis on the authorial agency of the individual for explaining people's attachment to nation. Attachment to nation is not determined by membership, but rather by the personal meanings that nation has for individuals. Cohen suggests that the nation is one of the

resources on which individuals draw to formulate their sense of selfhood - 'a compelling formulation of the self':

> "It is to say, 'I am Scottish', when Scottishness means everything that I am; I substantiate the otherwise vacuous national label in terms of my own experience, my reading of history, my perception of the landscape, and my reading of Scotland's literature and music, so that when I 'see' the nation, I am looking at myself." (A P Cohen, 1996, p 805)

The important point that Cohen is making is that the attachment to nation arises out of the meaning that an individual makes of the collective ideas. However, while the collective is experienced as 'shared', its meaning may not be. The 'sharing' of cultural forms is what underpins a sense of nation - not the consistency/agreement of the meaning of those cultural forms. Their power 'lies in providing us with the means to think rather than in compelling us to think certain things'.[3] The shared attachment to nation is not to deny the different ways in which the nation is interpreted, but rather to emphasise that a sense of connectedness to nation comes about through the experience of its collective forms:

> "The histories, literatures, folklores, traditions, languages, musics, landscapes and foods of Scotland are social facts on which individuals draw in providing themselves with a shared vocabulary … Even though these items may be interpreted differently, it is on the sharing of them that the sentiment of and attachment to the nation is predicated." (A P Cohen, 1996, p 805)

Benedict Anderson too has attempted to explain attachment to nation, especially the strength of that attachment that can lead people to make significant sacrifices in its name. He places particular importance on the role of language in forging attachment to the nation as community.[4] A special kind of community is suggested through language - 'a contemporaneous community' - one that connects us to a shared past and present. Through language, the nation is expressed as an idea of 'kinship', and 'home', creating a

sense of community as 'family' that can inspire unselfish love. It is through poetry and song, in particular, that this sense of connectedness and attachment to nation as community is expressed and experienced. For Anderson, poetry and song, above all, play a powerful role in generating the 'imagined community' of the nation, and in realising the attachment that people feel for it. It is here that the composing and singing of national songs provides a sense of a shared voice, of 'unisonality', where a sense of community through time and space is expressed and experienced.[5] In such a way, the music of my family's homeland, the Scottish songs that they brought with them to Australia, can be seen as the 'imagined sound' of nation. These songs were not simply a reflection of cultural ideas about Scotland, but in many cases were the source and the explicit means through which such ideas were constructed and disseminated. These songs arose out of a conscious effort to create, express and disseminate a Scottish national identity. They represent what Anderson describes as the 'cultural products of nationalism'.

The assemblage of national folk song traditions, what Cohen refers to as 'the expedient use of a kind of folkloric 'culture' ', has typically served this function, constructing powerful ideas about what it is to be 'Scottish', or 'English', 'German', and so on, through 'the projection of the enlarged icons of an idealized peoplehood'.[6] Such traditions typically make appeals to the past, often a rural past, as the source of an authentic national unity and national character. In the case of Scotland, both this music of a 'folk' tradition and that of a more contemporary and urban music hall tradition have served to construct ideas and images about what it is to be Scottish; and what for some have become limiting cultural stereotypes. In these songs and their discursive interpretation, the nation is, in Cohen's terms, 'a grand generalization'. These songs that have played a major role in the narrative of nation, also played an important role in my family's life, and as such there is first a question to be considered before looking more closely at the songs as expressions of a collective national identity. The question that arises here is - are those songs that speak of Scottishness in collective 'grand' and generalised terms the 'same' songs (or indeed the same Scottishness) that my family drew upon for their singing entertainments? Or to put it another way, if it is in the

'sharing' of cultural forms that underpins a sense of nation and attachment to a national identity, how can what is 'shared' be understood in a way that does justice to both their collective *and* individual meanings, and importantly to the relationships between them?

Michael Pickering and Tony Green in their study of vernacular song culture provide some useful guidance here. They draw a distinction between the song traditions of a nation and more localised, privatised traditions - vernacular traditions - (or folklore). They caution that cultural analysis and criticism tends to focus on public representations and national song traditions, thus turning attention away from more localised and privatised forms of traditionality. They argue that while localised and privatised forms of tradition may be 'indistinct in practice from dominant constructions … (they) … are not wholly identical with them'.[7] Their point of departure is the public representations of 'Englishness' in song and how the assemblage of a national folk song tradition has constructed not only a sense of 'Englishness' but also importantly a sense of what an 'authentic' song tradition is. While their example is an English one, the principles they develop apply equally well to the song traditions of Scotland. They distinguish between 'invented' traditions - the conscious manufacture of a national musical culture - and more localised and privatised forms of tradition, the 'uncontrived involvement in the active, indigenous usage of objects from the past for the sake of a progressively oriented social present'. They argue that 'what is drawn from and made of the material of the past at a national level works predominantly in favour of established, dominant interest groups'.[8] By contrast, more localised and privatised forms of traditionality are part of the structure of everyday life and serve as a basic source of collective identity. In these more localised and privatised forms of tradition, cultural forms such as songs are 'actively deployed', and assimilated into day-to-day life, in a process that Pickering and Green encapsulate as 'making our own', where the meanings of those forms arise out of social interaction.

They do, however, recognise that in the process of 'making our own', the cultural resources at our disposal 'define the opportunities and possibilities for action'. The meanings that cultural forms pose are both social and historical in nature and what has

traditionally been made of cultural forms affects how they can be 'made over' within any given present. We therefore need to pay attention to the social arenas in which 'symbolic associations' that attach to cultural forms are constructed and reproduced: 'the dialectical interplay between the national and local in terms of interdependence, orientation, organization, and distribution of power and resources'.[9]

Richard Middleton makes a similar case in his analysis of the history of popular music by stressing that the 'weight of received connotations' is important in understanding how musical meanings become culturally embedded or get shifted:

> "… however arbitrary musical meanings and conventions are - rather than being 'natural', or determined by some human essence or by the needs of class expression - once particular musical elements are put together in particular ways, and acquire particular connotations, these can be hard to shift." (Middleton, 1985, p 8)

For example, as Middleton suggests, it would be difficult to shift the meanings that attach to the *Marseillaise* - 'which derive from the history of the revolutionary French bourgeoisie', or to shift the connotations of folk song - 'constituted by bourgeois romanticism as signifying (sentimentalised) 'community', an organic social harmony'.[10] Middleton's point is that the musical field is not 'a pluralistic free-for-all'. It is not '*un*determined', but '*over*-determined', where established musical traditions and social conditions produce repertoires of available cultural elements. In the case of music, its forms and meanings are 'assemblages of elements from a variety of sources, each with a variety of histories and connotation-clusters'.[11] Middleton draws a parallel here with Gramsci's idea of the 'national-popular' - 'the repertoire of cultural/ideological elements which are available to, and at stake in, attempts to build or subvert hegemony'.[12] This is not to suggest that elements of culture, such as music, are fixed or exclusively tied to specific groups or owned by particular groups for all time. Cultural forms are the product of negotiation and transformation. They are the outcome of 'cultural work' and are mediated through social factors, such as class, age, gender, ethnicity and nationality. Existing elements of the cultural repertoire become combined into new patterns and new

connotations attached to them in a process that Middleton describes as 'articulation' (after Gramsci, and Hall). In class societies this process will be mediated primarily through class relationships:

> "The classes fight to articulate together constituents of the cultural repertoire in particular ways so that they are organised in terms of principles or sets of values determined by the position and interests of the class in the prevailing mode of production." (Middleton, 1985, p 7)

In this way the forms and meanings of music can be re-shaped, and their meanings shifted in different contexts. But, as Middleton argues, while the new context mediates more precise meanings, the overall 'parameters of meaning' move with it and are not lost. A particularly salient example is the way in which parody is used to shift the 'original' meaning or 'connotation cluster' that a musical style or song brings with it. Middleton uses the example of a mid-nineteenth century singer/song writer to demonstrate how the meanings of established song traditions were re-worked to produce new local relevance. Ned Corvan performed his songs in the working class concert halls and pubs of north-east England, transforming the meaning of existing tunes, mostly folk tunes, through new words and performance methods, and, in particular, parody. With few musical resources to draw upon, Corvan took existing folk tunes, many of which had been appropriated by bourgeois writers and publishers, and shifted their meaning back to working class interests. As Middleton puts it, Corvan rescued tunes 'from the hands of the collectors and anthologisers of traditional 'folk' song, and those of 'refined' performers, with piano accompaniments, in bourgeois parlours', and in setting them to new words transformed their meaning and articulated them 'to the needs of *his* class, at a particular moment in its history'.[13] A similar process can be seen in Maloney's account of the early Scottish music hall performers discussed in the previous chapter of this study. Maloney shows how an array of pre-industrialisation/urbanisation cultural traditions were re-shaped or 'articulated' into a new urban folklore for a predominantly working class audience.[14] Such a process of 'articulation' is also evident in the appropriation of folk song traditions in various nationalism projects that shift the local

meanings of folk song to satisfy national, political purposes - a process that has been said to characterise the national songs of Scotland that will be considered further below.

Middleton's analysis of 'articulation' together with Pickering and Green's analysis of the 'vernacular milieu' serve to highlight the dynamics, the differences and intersections between public song traditions and personalised/localised traditions. Their work also underscores the important point made by James Porter that folklore is not simply a product of communal imagination or individual aesthetic sense. Rather, the production of folklore is also intimately related to 'power relations in society, to economic factors, to public institutions and to academic disciplines'.[15] In the light of Middleton's, and Pickering and Green's analyses, a similar point can be made about the production of local song traditions. The cultural repertoire of music and song that is available to be 'made over' in any particular context is already the product of 'cultural work' and its forms and meanings mediated through historical/social processes and through modes of production, dissemination and consumption. The meanings and cultural significance that a song brings with it thus effect how it is perceived, understood and 'made over' in new contexts. The migrant studies, and the specific example of my family, that will examined in this study also demonstrate how established, or homeland music traditions are articulated or 'made over' by migrant groups as a means of making sense of their new environment and assembling a new migrant identity.[16]

This idea of 'articulation' has particular relevance for the songs that my family sang since they all carry with them what Middleton would describe as 'connotation clusters' shaped by their particular social and cultural histories, or as Pickering and Green would describe, 'symbolic associations', that mediate any new reception, and are, in turn, also mediated by that new context. In the case of my family, long established Scottish song traditions and contemporary songs were 'made over' in the particular context of family singing and migration**.** This process of 'making over' will be the subject of later chapters, but first, it will be useful to consider the song traditions that formed the basis of my family's repertoire in order to better understand the 'connotations clusters' or

'symbolic associations' - the 'weight of received connotations' - that these songs may have carried with them.

A Vivid Scots Graffiti - Scottish Popular Song Traditions [17]

The family songs may be aptly characterised by what Pickering and Green describe as a vernacular 'hotchpotch', reflecting a diverse set of song traditions that in themselves are hybrid, intersecting with borrowings and crossovers, deriving from the diverse song culture of Scotland. The songs were borrowed from a range of different sources including those that came from the family's local social world and those that had a wider reach. Some are part of the traditional song culture of Scotland - folk songs, ballads, children's songs, street songs, and national songs - notably those of Robert Burns. Others bear more recent hallmarks, in the tradition of Scottish music hall and variety, like the songs of Harry Lauder, Will Fyfe and Jimmy Shand, and other twentieth century Scottish popular singers and performers, like Robert Wilson and Andy Stewart. Some of the older songs were the popular hits of their time in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, and have continued as the core of the national song repertoire. The more recent songs, like those of Lauder, Fyfe, Shand, Wilson and Stewart were also significant hits of the twentieth century and continue to provide the mainstay of contemporary popular collections of Scottish songs.[18]

Of all the songs that formed my family's repertoire, those evolving from two song traditions, in particular 'national' songs, and those of the music hall tradition have made a significant contribution. Others, like the street songs and children's rhymes that my family sang, drew the attention of early collectors as part of a wider effort to imagine the nation through its folk heritage, and in subsequent revivals of interest in folk culture, its collection and documentation, and in general studies of children's lore. Scottish children's rhymes of the street and playground have thus been collected and published,

but less so been the subject of wider contemporary cultural analysis.[19] These songs will be considered in Chapter 8 in the context of family singing.

National Songs

Many of the songs that my family sang were drawn from what Pickering and Green, and others characterise as 'invented' song traditions, in particular the assemblage of Scotland's national song tradition. Songs such as, *My Love is Like a Red, Red Rose, The Banks o' Doon*, *Charlie He's My Darlin', Farewell to the Highlands*, *The Campbells are Comin*, and *A Hundred Pipers*, once the outstanding 'hits' of their time, have since become 'standards', finding a permanent place in Scotland's song culture, and generating hosts of other songs of a similar type and style.[20] Created, disseminated and popularised as quintessentially Scottish, songs such as these played a central role in defining and shaping Scottish song culture, and through it, Scottishness.

According to Francis Collinson, Scotland's national heritage of song is made up of two types of songs: the 'traditional'- folk song, and the 'national' - songs of known authorship, 'written for and disseminated by the printing press and not by oral or aural transmission'.[21] The latter, 'national songs', were composed or 'patched' from old songs by song writers like Allan Ramsay and Robert Burns, and later Lady Nairne, James Hogg, and Sir Walter Scott. These 'national songs', as Collinson, and later, David Johnson describe them were a literary creation and invention of the eighteenth century:

> "… a kind of pseudo-folk-song, designed for a genteel class of people … to which they can attach the feelings of tradition and national identity. A national song is usually made by taking a folk-song and rewriting the words and then the tune … However the dividing line between the two genres is sometimes indistinct, and it is not unknown for national songs to be sucked back into oral circulation and so become new folk songs in their own right." (D Johnson, 2003, p 131)

In the light of other recent popular song scholarship, Collinson's and Johnson's distinctions may seem too polarised, but they do serve to emphasise the constructed nature of a 'national song tradition'. Thomas Crawford, while not accepting a sharp divide between 'folk song' and 'national song', does acknowledge that national songs were a 'deliberate, creative and systematic attempt by the professionals', notably Ramsay and Burns, 'to produce a new corpus of song for the whole people of Scotland'. He sees Ramsay and Burns as 'cultural engineers', who set about 'consciously preserving and recreating the nation's songs'.[22] In that process, national songs drew upon, and became part of, the 'live tradition' of Scotland's rich lyric song culture - a song culture that was part of the daily lives of people of all classes.[23] It is this music of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, made up of the interplay between folk songs and 'composed' songs, that has continued to feature in the popular song culture of Scotland, and which made a significant contribution to my family's singing.

According to Richard Middleton, the music that arose out of this period was one in which 'old and new elements were articulated into a variety of patterns and meanings', leading to 'the development and eventual predominance of new musical types associated with the new ruling class'. In this 'bourgeois revolution', the new popular music, which started as 'heroic' and 'progressive', shifted over time towards 'a stifling, oppressive conservatism'.[24] This period also saw the permeation of the market system through almost all musical activities, in particular, music printing. Music publishing became a significant part of a growing Scottish publishing industry. Regular music publishing started in Edinburgh in the early part of the eighteenth century and developed into a major business by the middle of the following century, by which time Edinburgh was producing the second largest number of titles of any city in Britain.[25] It was also at this time that a new national vision would be widely disseminated through songs in print, making it possible for the creation of a national 'vernacular space' through print capitalism.[26] As Leith Davis, Ian Duncan and Janet Sorensen observe, it was during this period, when Scotland was establishing itself as a literary cultural centre, that its poets, song writers and scholars:

"… began to invoke the national past, ancestral origins, and regional popular traditions in a series of attempts to reimagine Scottish identity in the conditions of imperial Union." (Davis, Duncan and Sorensen, 2004, p 3)

Scottish songs were sought out by collectors, poets, musicians and publishers for song collections that were to form the basis of what was to become Scotland's national song repertoire. Scottish song traditions were swept up by urban lowland Scotland in a publishing bonanza. At the end of the eighteenth century, something like 74 song books and song collections were published in Scotland, all nationalistic in spirit, and comprising approximately 3,000 separate songs. Fifty years later the number of song books had risen to closer to 200.[27] This was part of what Johnson describes as the 'self conscious wholesale documentation of the folk tradition', that also manifested itself in antiquarian collections of folk songs, ballads and children's rhymes. Many song publications included detailed discussion of Scottish song asserting its antiquity and authenticity, as hallmarks of the nation's unique heritage, especially in contrast to English song:

"Our Scottish songs have already been published in so many and so varied forms, that any further issue may well seem superfluous. Our intention, however, is not to add to the number of these editions, but to reclaim *Melodies which primarily and properly belong to Scotland,* and to renounce others erroneously supposed to be Scottish productions. The necessity for such a work will be apparent when it is understood that a considerable number of our National Melodies have been claimed for England, while on the other hand many Anglo-Scottish tunes manufactured in London and elsewhere for the English market, have found admittance into our national collections, and so given rise to perplexities and misunderstandings." (Glen, 1900, p vii)

But even the scale of song book publication is dwarfed by the mass sales of cheap song sheets, broadsides and chapbooks. It is estimated that in Scotland, from about 1750 to 1850, during the period of their greatest popularity, over 200,000 chapbooks were

produced each year. Cheap mass produced broadsides and chapbooks were the staple reading material of a very large proportion of the population of Scotland for over a century, and by the eighteenth century, this type of publication was one of the few pieces of non-religious reading available to the poor. By the end of the eighteenth century, every provincial town had its printer of broadsides and chapbooks.[28] Typically, the same sort of songs that appeared in the song book collections were published in broadsides and chapbooks. Folk songs from oral tradition made their way into printed song collections and mass produced broadsides and chapbooks, and composed or national songs, in turn, made their way back into oral tradition.[29]

In the earlier part of the eighteenth century, however, it was London that was taking the lead in publishing collections of Scottish songs. A flourishing genre of popular song, 'Scotch songs', dominated the market. These 'Scotch songs' were, as Johnson describes them, 'somewhat debased popular songs of allegedly Scottish origin, some with fake tunes, all with fake words', and where the subject matter was either political satire, or sexual comedy with stock Scottish characters Jockey and Jenny:[30]

A Scotch Song [31]

'Twas within a furlong of Edinborough Town,
In the Rosie time of year when the Grass was down;
Bonny Jockey blith and gay,
Said to Jenny making hay,
Let's sit a little (Dear) and prattle,
'Tis a sultry day:
He long had Courted the Black-Brow'd Maid,
But Jockey was a Wag and would ne'er consent to Wed;
Which made her pish and poo, and cry out it will not do,
I cannot, cannot, cannot, wonnot, monnot, Buckle too.

These early collections took Scottish songs as popular commodities into a wide British market. According to Leith Davis, they also served to place Scottish songs and Scotland

within a London-based British culture. 'Scotch songs' were designed to appeal to a metropolitan interest in the 'novelties' of the 'rustic' provinces:

> "Such Scottish identity as is acknowledged in these collections is designed to appeal to an audience interested in a distinctive but harmless Scottish or 'Highland humour' … For the most part this 'humour' is characterized as natural, simple and rural, in opposition to the artificiality of metropolitan culture." (Davis, 2004, p 189)

Out of this early bonanza in song book publication, the first to be published in Scotland was to eclipse all others. Allan Ramsay's Tea-Table Miscellany became the best seller of the century both in genteel Edinburgh and across Britain.[32] Johnson describes Ramsay's motives as a combination of regional pride and identity, and competitive publishing interests to compete with the English popular publications of 'Scotch song'. Ramsay's approach was to take existing Scots tunes and add new words, producing what Johnson describes as 'an oil-and-water mixture of London fashionable verse and Scots folk-song'.[33] Many of the songs that have come to epitomise Scottish traditional music can be attributed to the work and legacy of Allan Ramsay, 'the man, who more than anyone else, was responsible for the creation of the national song genre'.[34] Ramsay's work came to be regarded all over Britain as synonymous with Scots song and formed the basis of many other popular collections. Its significance to the history of Scottish song is such that writers such as Johnson have suggested that:

> "Scholars ever since have had great difficulty in forming a picture of Scots folk-song prior to 1723, largely because Ramsay's work obliterated the traces of it." (D Johnson, 2003, p 134)

Recent re-appraisals of Ramsay suggest that his idea of Scottish culture is more complex than his critics have suggested. Leith Davis, for example, argues that Ramsay did not cater merely to a London audience, and that he represented Scottish songs in a very different context to those of the London-based 'Scotch songs'. Ramsay's songs were an attempt to assert a positive contemporary identity for Scotland, one that was not attached

simply to a nostalgic past or a rustic identity. Unlike the dominant antiquarian impulse of the time, that emphasised a fixed oral culture in print as word and poetry, Ramsay represented Scottish song 'not as fixed corpus, but as part of a dynamic and ever-changing tradition'.[35] As Davis stresses, 'it is important to keep in mind that Ramsay was establishing this repertory in conjunction with maintaining aspects of the oral tradition'.[36] Drawing upon both oral and print sources, and newly composed songs, Ramsay represented Scottish songs as an accessible and 'unique combination of words and music' that emphasised performance and familiarity over the fixity of text. These songs were 'designed for a population who take pleasure in singing' who have knowledge of the song culture from which the songs derive:[37]

The Highland Laddie by Allan Ramsay [38]

The lawland lads think they are fine;
But O they're vain and idly gaudy!
How much unlike that gracefu' mien,
And manly looks of my highland laddie?

Chorus
O my bonny, bonny highland laddie,
My handsome, charming highland laddie;
May Heaven still guard and Love reward
Our lawland lass and her highland laddie.

If I were free at will to choose
To be the wealthiest lawland lady,
I'd take young Donald without trews,
With bonnet blue, and belted plaidy.

The brawest beau in borrows-town,
In a' his airs with art made ready,
Compar'd to him he's but a clown;
He's finer far in's tartan plaidy.

O'er benty hill with him I'll run,

And leave my lawland kin and dady;

Frae winter's cauld and summer's sun,

He'll screen me with his highland plaidy.

A painted room, and silken bed,

May please a lawland laird and lady;

But I can kiss, and be as glad,

Behind a bush in's highland plaidy.

Few compliments between us pass,

I ca' him my dear highland laddie,

And he ca's me his lawland lass,

Syne rows me in beneath his plaidy.

Nae greater joy I'll e'er pretend,

Than that his love prove true and steady,

Like mine to him, which ne'er shall end,

While Heav'n preserves my highland laddie.

Like Davis, Steve Newman argues that while Ramsay did elevate songs from the 'street' to the 'tea table' they were not turned into 'reliques'. Ramsay placed his work in the world of the present, 'in the songs that circulate in the streets and country lanes of the United Kingdom' and not in the misty world of bard and minstrel.[39] Ramsay intended his songs to be sung, to be a participatory medium. Unlike the prevailing fashion for Italian classical musical treatments, Ramsay's idea of Scots songs was that they were 'ideal catalysts of sociability … not demanding the connoisseurs ear', and 'with hearing and singing songs they do not need to be taught because they are simple and familiar'. In this way, according to Newman, Ramsay's songs 'engender an 'imagined community' and realize that community in performance'.[40] In Ramsay's songs is a 'cultural nationalism', in which the past and the present, and Scotland's relationship with England, are in a dynamic relationship. Ramsay also had a wider community in mind, with the songs being Ramsay's 'vehicle for making Scottish culture a profitable export'.[41] Newman suggests that Ramsay's songs play an important but neglected part in

the history of the complex relationship between popular and elite cultures, and that Ramsay's work testifies to the 'unpredictability' in this 'high-low' dialogue. As such, it challenges recent theorisations of the elite appropriation of popular culture as a one way street.[42] Ramsay's work enabled 'imagined communities' beyond the polite audiences targeted by his song collections. Not only did his songs become widely popular on the street as well as in the drawing room, but his songs were also taken up by the Jacobites and Robert Burns. For Newman, this points to the 'residual power of songs to generate alternate, even radical communities'.[43]

Ramsay's work was to have a considerable influence on the course of Scotland's national song repertoire and its fuller expression through Robert Burns, and the more recently recognised contribution of other song writers, particularly women, such as Lady Nairne.[44] Burns extended the national song repertoire established by Ramsay by hundreds of songs, largely through his work for *The Scots Musical Museum*, and according to Johnson, 'national songs in Scotland have been identified with Burns, and no one else, ever since'.[45] Carol McGuirk acknowledges that 'when we hear any Scottish song … the chances are better than fifty percent that it was written by Burns'. But her work also sheds light on the fact that 'most of the lyrics that have been *preserved and remembered as Scottish*' were the work of both Burns and Nairne, although Burns' output far exceeded that of Nairne.[46] Johnson's and T Crawford's earlier accounts give Burns the credit for reintegrating the oral and literary tradition in Scottish song, that Burns 'summed up and transcended'.[47] For T Crawford, Burns was the Allan Ramsay of the end of the eighteenth century, but a musically more successful one. Through his composition in the 'folk mode' and wide lyric range, Burns took traditional melodies and borrowed lines and verses 'from here there and everywhere', drawing upon all of eighteenth century Scottish song: broadside, folk song, bacchanalian, love songs, pastoral, rustic courtship, comedy, Jacobite, art lyric, propagandist parody, and national songs. As he notes:

> "Burns' work especially fed back into the tradition that nourished him, so that some of his songs are now thought of as folk song, and indeed, it is nearly impossible to

separate what Burns took from tradition and what tradition took from Burns." (T Crawford, 1979, p 185)

A Red, Red Rose by Robert Burns [48]

O my Luve's like a red, red rose,
That's newly sprung in June.
O my Luve's like the melodie
That's sweetly play'd in tune.

As fair art thou, my bonie lass,
So deep in luve am I;
And I will luve thee still, my Dear,
Till a' the seas gang dry.

Till a' the seas gang dry, my Dear,
And the rocks melt wi' the sun:
And I will luve thee still, my Dear,
While the sands o' life shall run:

And fare thee weel, my only Luve!
And fare thee weel, a while!
And I will come again, my Luve,
Tho' it were ten thousand mile!

A similar point, in relation to both Burns and Nairne, is made by McGuirk: 'what we think of today as Scottish folk song is precisely the kind of hybrid text that they popularized'.[49] As 'active 'reconstructors', Burns and Nairne brought together art song and folk song, dialect Scots and standard English, lowland and highland cultures. Their blend of Scots vernacular and English diction, made up of an 'overlay of the parlor language of standard English … with a vivid graffiti of demotic Scots', produced a distinctive vernacular style.[50] This lyric vernacular in national songs though, did not impose detailed prescriptions for Scottish identity, but rather promoted a Scottish 'distinctiveness' - a Scottish cultural 'consciousness'.[51] Scottishness in the songs is portrayed as a 'stubborn yet evocative dissonance', where 'fish vendors inspire art

songs, royal princes weep as homeless outcasts, and every single speaker … has a problem with social consensus and/or historical outcome'.[52]

McGuirk argues that although national songs, in particular the Jacobite songs of Burns and Nairne, reference Scottish history, they have less to do with the 'wearing of the tartan or following one king and not another' than in making broad appeals to emotion and sentiment:

The Campbells are Comin by Robert Burns [53]

The Campbells are comin Oho, Oho!
The Campbells are comin Oho, Oho!
The Campbells are comin to bonie Lochleven,
The Campbells are comin Oho, Oho!
Upon the Lomons I lay, I lay,
Upon the Lomons I lay, I lay,
I looked down to bonie Lochleven
And saw three bonie perches play.

Chorus
The Campbells are comin Oho, Oho!
The Campbells are comin Oho, Oho!
The Campbells are comin to bonie Lochleven,
The Campbells are comin Oho, Oho!

Great Argyle he goes before,
He maks his cannons and guns to roar,
Wi' sound o' trumpet, pipe and drum
The Campbell's are comin Oho, Oho!

The Campbells they are a' in arms
Their loyal faith and truth to show,
Wi' banners rattling in the wind,
The Campbells are comin Oho, Oho!

The Hundred Pipers by Lady Nairne [54]

Wi' a hundred pipers an' a', an' a',
Wi' a hundred pipers an' a', an' a';
We'll up an' gie them a blaw, a blaw,
Wi' a hundred pipers an' a', an' a'.
Oh! It's owre the Border awa, awa,
It's owre the Border awa, awa,
We'll on and we'll march to Carlisle ha',
Wi' its yetts, its castell, an' a', an' a'.

Chorus
Wi' a hundred pipers an' a', an' a',
Wi' a hundred pipers an' a', an' a';
We'll up an' gie them a blaw, a blaw,
Wi' a hundred pipers an' a', an' a'.

Oh! our sodger lads looked braw, looked braw,
Wi' their tartans, kilts, an' a', an' a',
Wi' their bonnets, an' feathers, an' glittering gear,
An' pibrochs sounding sweet and clear.
Will they a' return to their ain dear glen?
Will they a' return, our Hieland men?
Second-sighted Sandy looked fu' wae,
And mothers grat when they marched away.

Oh wha is foremost o' a', o' a'?
Oh wha does follow the blaw, the blaw?
Bonnie Charlie the king o' us a', hurrah!
Wi' his hundred pipers an' a', an' a'.
His bonnet an' feather, he's wavin' high,
His prancin' steed maist seems to fly,
The nor' wind plays wi' his curly hair,
While the pipers blaw in an unco flare.

The Esk was swollen, sae red and sae deep,
But shouther to shouther the brave lads keep;

Twa thousand swam owre to fell English ground,

An' danced themselves dry to the pibroch's sound.

Dumfounder'd, the English saw, they saw,

Dumfounder'd, they heard the blaw, the blaw;

Dumfounder'd, they a' ran awa', awa',

From the hundred pipers an' a', an' a'.

What Burns and Nairne do, according to McGuirk, is to define 'resistance', rather than the actual details of history, as the ground of Scottish national consciousness. Although dramatised in different ways - Nairne, in many of her songs, with an elegaic 'retrospective glance', compared with Burns' 'hopeful projections forward' - in their songs Scotland is 'not so much a culture but a 'counterculture' '.[55] In a similar vein, Marilyn Butler's account of Burns points to the Jacobite songs as conveying a cultural nationalism - one that arises as a 'grassroots movement'. She accords Burns status as the inventor of modern cultural nationalism 'through his brilliantly-imagined construction of modern Scotland'.[56] Butler suggests that, through his considerable endeavours to seek out and re-shape Scottish song of all types, Burns recognised 'the radical power of the notion that the masses too had a culture'.[57] In the broadest cultural sense, 'political', Burns' work raises questions about 'hierarchy, class and cultural authority'.[58] As Leith Davis argues, Burns saw in Scottish song a radical potential and used Scottish song to destabilise British literary values, to 'create an alternative cultural economy to that of the 'genteel (English) world'.[59] Robert Crawford's assessment is that Burns' endeavour to 'make new the vernacular culture of his old' represents 'a cultural project with lasting political overtones'.[60]

But, this radical Burns, who had 'so slyly contested cultural authority in his work', has, according to R Crawford, also been made into 'a posthumous patron whose name might validate a bewildering variety of projects', including those that have sought a none-too-contemporary or radical Burns.[61] Andrew Nash's account of the literary and critical reception of Burns in late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries traces how Burns was appropriated 'by forces eager to impose their own patterns of cultural authority'.[62] Burns was taken up and articulated to the needs of philosophical/political theories and literary

markets and was molded to signify a nostalgic Scottish past. In the Enlightenment period, the rural and domestic characteristics of Burns' work enabled him to be 'accommodated' to primitivist theories, and, as such, Burns could be marketed as the 'heaven taught ploughman'. Later critics and publishers in the nineteenth century aligned Burns with the 'real' Scotland - a Scotland that was rural, peasant, domestic, and patriotic. Burns became Scotland personified - 'what was said about Burns character was understood as Scottish character', and what he wrote about was seen as 'recording' Scotland as a place and a people.[63] In this way, Burns' work was received as 'social history', and Burns' poetic topography - exploited by the tourist industries - *was* Scotland. Scotland came to be identified as the land of Burns (and that of Sir Walter Scott). As industrialisation and urbanisation changed the physical and social landscape of Scotland, Burns became a lingering relic of a fast disappearing Scotland, with the Burns cult forming part of the nostalgic reminiscing for the past. By the end of nineteenth century Burns was performing an ennobling and ethical function, being marketed as national poet and 'national messiah'.[64]

It was also this nineteenth century reception of Burns that was used to 'mold and validate Kailyard visions of Scotland'.[65] Nash's argument is that the process of reception that was applied to Burns, which identified him as the national expression of Scotland, 'helped to prioritise certain subject matter as peculiarly distinctive to the Scottish literary capacity - subject matter that would be utilised by the Kailyard writers'. The idea, which had been applied to Burns, that his work was 'a mimetic description of life in Scotland and of what it meant to be Scottish', was also applied by and to the Kailyard writers.[66] Their work reflected the now established idea that literature provided an authoritative identity for Scotland and that literature, as a core of national identity, should serve a moral function. The Kailyard novels' sentimental celebration of the values of ruralism, family and community were thus received as Scottish values, at the heart of Scottish character and identity. And, as Nash comments, 'such an emphasis on essentialism with regard to the definition of Scotland has left a sometimes troublesome, sometimes enabling legacy'.[67]

116

It may also be the case that it was this cultural environment, in which a sentimentalised, conservative and safe Burns was molded, that shaped the reception and performance of Burns' songs. Despite continuous publication and performance of his songs over centuries, it would seem that in the main, Burns songs have been widely disseminated in 'genteel' renditions, in drawing rooms and by trained singers in concerts and recordings.[68] Burns and his collaborators on *The Scots Musical Museum* were concerned to present his songs without the influence of European/Italian treatments, that were so popular in drawing room and concert hall renditions of Scottish songs - to present Scottish music 'unencumbered with useless accompaniments and graces depriving them of the sweet simplicity of their native melodies'.[69] By the nineteenth century, however, 'purified from their coarse eighteenth-century origins', Burns songs came to serve a moral and uplifting purpose, and were seen as the 'ultimate example' of a fast disappearing Scotland that could be 'rescued' and preserved in song.[70]

Recent re-assessments of Burns and of his music, such as those of Davis, McGuirk, and Butler are drawing attention to a far less genteel Burns**.**[71] Donald Low's study of Burns' songs also endeavours to go behind and beyond the hackneyed image of Burns - as Burns Suppers songs.[72] The music of the bourgeois drawing room is also a long way from 'Work, Sex and Drink: Scots and Their Songs', the title of a series of recent Burns music concerts attached to the 2000 Edinburgh Festival. That event was promoted as offering a 'busky' feel, closer to the way that Burns may have intended his music to be experienced, according to its musically well-qualified organisers.[73] Davis, Duncan and Sorensen, have also noted the move by critics and scholars 'to salvage an attractively bawdy, rough, insurgent Burns from the Victorian cult of sentimentality that so exasperated Hugh MacDiarmid'. This very much male Burns personifies the 'masculine values of muscular assertiveness, virile heterosexuality, and 'horizontal brotherhood' that typify emergent nationalisms'.[74] Perhaps the most telling appraisal though comes from Robert Crawford's recent biography of Burns, where he suggests that, compared to those who say Burns' songs are 'sublime', or those who see in them a masculine brotherhood, a more accurate judgment is to be found in Burns' Ayrshire contemporaries 'who laughed with, read aloud and sang his work'.[75] According to R Crawford,

alongside and bound up with Burns' radicalism is a 'piercingly lyrical' and 'playfully companiable' Burns, one of the world's greatest love poets and poets of friendship, excelling 'nowhere more than in popular song'.[76] The songs he created would go on to 'articulate and quicken the values of the Scottish people, pleasing future generations in Scotland and beyond'.[77]

Whether it is the grass roots political Burns, the Scottish patriot Burns, the moral Burns, the 'everyman's' Burns, the bawdy or romantic Burns, the nostalgic rural and domestic Burns, or the refined sensibility-learned Burns, it would be difficult to imagine that there could be a reception of Burns that was not heavily shaped by Burns *as* Scotland even if that Scotland is inflected in different ways to emphasise different Scotlands. Suffice it to say that Burns and Scotland are inextricably intertwined - that Scottishness, Scottish cultural and national identity are predicated on received ideas of Burns as Scotland, and vice versa. When it comes to Scottish song, and in particular a national song tradition, the connection between it and Robert Burns is perhaps even more pronounced. It might be said that the 'weight of received connotations' associated with Burns is dug deep into an imagined Scotland. That metaphor may also apply to Scotland's 'national songs'. Their centrality in attempts to configure Scottish cultural identity continue to provide pervasive collective ideas of Scottishness. Their 'parameters of meaning' carry a 'weight of received connotations' firmly linked to imagining Scottish identity in song.

Songs of the Music Hall Tradition

What print and music publishing did to construct the 'national-popular' in song in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the newer technologies of radio and recordings, together with the growth of leisure and entertainment industries in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century took Scottish song into an era that Middleton describes as that of 'mass culture'. This period in the history of popular music was characterised by monopoly capitalism with the 'productive apparatus increasingly in the hands of the large industrial concerns'. Together with new forms of mass production, distribution and publicity, there was 'a drive towards 'one-way communication' in homogeneous

markets'.[78] While 'national lineages' remained important in this period, there was a growing internationalisation of culture, associated particularly with the music from America - ragtime, jazz, Tin Pan Alley songs, and new dance forms. Much of this music was, according to Middleton, articulated to 'an ideology of consumerist escapism'. Gary West also makes the point that this new mass culture of music was to 'revolutionise the music of the Scottish home' through radio, the gramophone, and television, that 'brought a huge range of hitherto little known musical genres into the domestic setting'.[79]

A great number of family songs and musical interests were drawn from this popular song mass culture of early twentieth century urban Scotland. Several writers have noted (with some exceptions, such as music hall studies) that there has been little attention given to the social study of the popular music of the time, nor to local or informal music settings.[80] What is known about popular song is sketchy, but there is some information that contributes to building a picture of the song culture of the time, and some can be inferred from the inclusion of particular songs in my family's repertoire and our parents' musical interests. Certainly the influence of American music can be seen in the family's wider musical interests, but the bulk of the songs that my family sang and continued to sing after their move to Australia were Scottish songs.

Ailie Munro's account of the twentieth century folk music revival in Scotland provides an indication of the nature of the Scottish music environment in the early part of twentieth century urban Scotland. According to Munro, two kinds of Scottish music flourished in the urban centres. One was that of the concert hall, salon and conservatoire - polished and highly developed 'art' music including genteel renditions of the songs of Robert Burns. The other was Scottish 'popular' music, that of the music hall tradition, and popular Scottish performers and entertainers who drew on its participatory and theatrical qualities. According to Munro, 'unvarnished' folk or traditional music was rarely heard, except in rural areas and within highly localised family/friendship groups where the 'auld songs' continued to be sung. It was to take some years before the 'auld songs' would be heard more widely in the cities in radio broadcasts, recordings and in performance in folk clubs and pubs as the folk music revival took hold from the mid

1950's onwards - and sometime after the bulk of my family's repertoire became well established.[81] Other kinds of 'unvarnished' song - industrial protest songs, trade union verse and songs 'expressing a typically proletarian outlook'[82] - that were also to be drawn into the folk revival - made an indirect impact on the family's repertoire through the 'unvarnished' songs of the urban street, tenement and playground.

The Scottish 'popular' music, to which Munro refers, was the source of many of my family's songs, providing not only contemporary compositions, but also renditions and re-workings of traditional songs, including the national songs of Robert Burns and others. Until the 1920's most sung performances of Scottish songs were by classically trained singers drawn from the concert stage whilst folk dance music was usually performed by military and brass bands.[83] Although there was a large number of recording companies producing Scottish music, the repertoire tended to focus narrowly on a few popular 'standards' - Harry Lauder hits, Burns' ballads by baritones and sopranos, and bagpipe performances. But with the establishment of a Scottish recording label, Beltona, there was a marked shift, not only in the number of Scottish performers in recording, but also a shift to a more 'vernacular style':

> "Between 1928 and 1945 more than one thousand different records were issued that covered almost all types of Scottish popular music. Always good sellers were Burns' ballads, patriotic songs, sentimental items about mother and home and comic songs by Harry Gordon and other Scots music hall artists. More unusual records were also issued - unaccompanied Gaelic singers, *puirt-a-beul*, Scots dance music played by solo pianists, mouth organs, melodeons, accordions, dulcimers, fiddles and small bands, short plays by the miner playwright Joe Corrie, dialect monologues and humorous sketches and, of course, bagpipe solos and pipe bands." (Bill Dean Myatt, 2004, np)

Drawing upon the corpus of national songs, folk songs and ballads, music hall and country dance music, and their own compositions, popular entertainers like Will Fyfe, Harry Gordon, Harry Lauder, Jimmy Shand and later, Andy Stewart made successful

live performance and recording careers.[84] Some of these performers were musically untrained, but other popular artists, such as Kenneth McKellar, Robert Wilson and Moira Anderson, were classically trained singers performing in a drawing-room style with piano accompaniments, although Wilson maintained more of a variety style.[85] These performers took Scottish song into huge musical markets both within Scotland and beyond through live performance, radio, recordings and subsequently television. All of these performers, in one way or another, had an impact on my family's song repertoire, partly because many performed the other's songs, and all of them shared in traditional songs. But of them, Lauder, Wilson and Stewart are most notable in the family's repertoire. Harry Lauder achieved the reputation of being the most popular entertainer of his time, both at home and abroad. He toured the world for forty years including 22 times to the USA, and several times to Australia. He was the first British entertainer to sell a million records with hit songs like, *Roamin' in the Gloamin'* and *I Love a Lassie*. He was knighted in January 1919, and Sir Winston Churchill referred to him as 'Scotland's greatest ever ambassador'.[86]

Roamin' in the Gloamin' by Harry Lauder [87]

I've seen lots of bonnie lassies travellin' far and wide,
But my heart is centred noo on bonnie Kate McBride.
And altho' I'm no a chap that throws a word away,
I'm surprised mysel' at times at a' I've got to say.

Chorus
Roamin' in the gloamin' on the banks o' Clyde,
Roamin' in the gloamin' wi' ma lassie by ma side,
When the sun has gone to rest, that's the time that we love best,
O, it's lovely roamin' in the gloamin'!

One nicht in the gloamin' we were trippin' side by side,
I kissed her twice, and asked her once if she would be my bride.
She was shy, and so was I, we were baith the same,
But I got brave and braver on the journey comin' hame.

Last nicht efter strollin' we got hame at half-past nine,

Sittin' at the kitchen fire I asked her to be mine.

When she promised I got up and danced the Hielan' fling,

I've just been to the jewellers and I've picked a nice wee ring.

Robert Wilson, another kilted performer, also had a successful radio, recording and performance career with *A Gordon for Me*, *The Toorie on His Bonnet,* and *Westering Home*. Like Lauder and Stewart, Wilson performed and recorded popular 'traditional' songs, like *Loch Lomond*, *The Road to The Isles*, *Skye Boat Song*, and many Burns songs.[88]

A Gordon for Me by Robert Wilson [89] © 1950 Lawrence Wright Music Co Limited

I'm Geordie MacKay of the H L I,

I'm fond of the lassies and a drappie forby,

One day when out walking I chanced to see,

A bonnie wee lass wi' a glint in her ee'.

Says I to the lassie "Will you walk for a while?

I'll buy you a bonnet and we'll do it in style,

My kilt is Mackenzie o' the H L I."

She look'd at me shyly and said wi' a sigh:

Chorus
A Gordon for me, a Gordon for me,
If ye're no a Gordon ye're no use to me.
The Black Watch are braw, the Seaforths and a',
But the cocky wee Gordon's the pride o' them a'.

I courted that girl on the banks of the Dee,

I made up my mind she was fashioned for me,

Soon I was a' thinking how nice it would be

If she would consent to get married to me.

The day we were wed, the grass was so green,

The sun was as bright as the light in her 'een,

Now we've two bonnie lassies who sit on her knee,

While she sings the song she once sang to me:

Andy Stewart also drew on music hall and variety traditions, combining comic character pieces, like *Donald, Where's Your Troosers ?* (that plays on the Scotsman's kilt joke), traditional folk renditions, and sentimental contemporary ballads like *A Scottish Soldier*. *A Scottish Soldier* lasted for 40 weeks in the 1961 hit parade and topped the charts in Canada, Australia and New Zealand. A re-release of *Donald, Where's Your Troosers ?* was in the top 10 on the UK hit parade as recently as 1989. In his kilted personae as the 'Tartan Trouper', Stewart too maintained a hugely successful international career spanning over 40 years, touring in the US, Canada, Australia, New Zealand and South Africa, and was awarded an MBE in 1976.[90]

Donald, Where's Your Troosers? by Andy Stewart [91] © 1960 James S Kerr Music Publishers

I just got in from the Isle of Skye,
I'm not very big and I'm awfully shy.
The lassies shout as I go by,
Donald where's your troosers?

Chorus
Let the winds blow high,
Let the winds blow low,
Down the street in my kilt I go,
And all the ladies say hello!
Donald, where's your troosers?

A lady took me to a ball,
And it was slippery in the hall,
I was afraid that I would fall,
'Cause I didn't have on my troosers.

They'd like to wed me everyone,
Just let them catch me if they can,
You canna put the breeks on a highland man,
Who doesn't like wearing troosers.

To wear the kilt is my delight,

It isn't wrong, I know it's right,

The highlanders would get a fright,

If they saw me in my troosers.

Well I caught a cold and me nose was raw,

I had no handkerchief at all,

So I hiked up my kilt and I gave it a blow,

Now you can't do that with troosers.

It has been said of Harry Lauder, that he 'may have been responsible for making permanent in the popular imagination more images of Scottish life than the work of an entire tourist board'.[92] For both his critics and admirers Lauder's musical legacy remains a potent force in shaping both popular and scholarly notions of Scots and their music. Together with his own distinctive compositions, Lauder's music hall ditties recycled traditional Scots songs including those of Robert Burns from over 200 years before, and which Burns often drew from even earlier Scottish sources. The example below of a Lauder version of a Burns song, *Ay Waukin O*, shows the transition - the 'articulation' - from one sort of Scottish song to another. In the Burns song we have a new 'folk' song recycled from an old ballad into a national song. Lauder's parody of the Burns song draws on these traditions and reshapes them in the form of a comic music hall ditty:

Ay Waukin, O, by Robert Burns [93]

Simmer's a pleasant time,

Flow'rs of ev'ry colour;

The water rins o'er the heugh,

And I long for my true lover!

Chorus

Ay waukin, O,

Waukin still and weary:

Sleep I can get nane,

For thinking on my Dearie.

Aye Wakin, O, by Harry Lauder [94]

Once upon a time,

I was very bonnie.

I used tae hae a bonnie wee lad,

But noo I hivna' ony.

Chorus

I'm aye wakin', O!

Wakin', aye an' eerie.

Sleep I canna get,

For thinkin' on my dearie.

When I sleep I dream,

When I wauk I'm irie;

Sleep I can get nane

For thinking on my Dearie.

Lanely night comes on,

A' the lave are sleepin:

I think on my bony lad

And I bleer my een wi' greetin.

I'm aye wakin', O!

When winter time comes on,

And ev'rybody body's sleepin',

I think on my bonnie wee lad,

And bleer my een wae greetin'.

He was very nice,

And kind tae to me was Sandy.

He used tae buy me ginger snaps,

And lumps o' sugar candy.

He took me for a walk,

One nicht roon' the yardy.

Then he sat me doon on a seat,

An' gan tae gi' me beardy.

Once he said tae me,

"Maggie, ye're my soorok!"

And then he kiss'd me on the nose,

An' took me doon to Gourock.

This example may also illustrate why some historians and other scholars were led to criticise Lauder as 'a stage Scot' who made the Scot 'a figure of fun throughout the world'.[95] For some critics, Lauder epitomises a process of Scottish traditional culture retreating into self-caricature during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.[96] But, as Maloney's analysis suggests, the popular music of the music hall 'was not a commercially sponsored aberration but rather part of the continuing evolution of a living song tradition'.[97] Harry Lauder and other popular Scottish performers of the time can be seen as articulating traditions from the past to meet the needs of a new urban audience through contemporary urban Scottish idiomatic expression and a playful irreverence toward authority. Drawing upon parody, satire, sentiment and a humorous take on the tribulations of day-to-day life, the music hall song articulated 'the voice and life experience of the individual and inviting the audience's empathy, provides a direct link with song-based folk traditions'.[98] The music hall song, in particular, 'reinforced and

exploited the sense of the audience as a collective entity', providing a 'sense of communal well-being and 'oneness' - of instant community', or what Anderson would call 'unisonality'.[99] It might also be argued that the recorded popular music that grew out of the music hall tradition also served to provide a sense of 'shared voice'. That voice may have been as much anglicised as it was idiomatically Scots, but there is no doubting that these songs claimed and proclaimed their Scottishness in a widely accessible manner.[100]

As for this popular Scottish music of the music hall tradition and more 'varnished' popular drawing room style, Munro, acknowledges that 'some of it is good stuff … but one cannot ignore the mawkish, kitsch element in it'. Quoting Kenneth Elliot, the Scottish music historian, Munro suggests a certain level of agreement with his view that popular Scottish music is 'the persistent curse of Scottish music at the international cultural level'.[101] It was in fact a reaction against the kind of Scottish popular music epitomised by Lauder, Fyfe, Stewart, Wilson, McKellar and Anderson, which Munro identifies as a significant factor in the post-war folk music revival in Scotland. At the same time, Munro acknowledges that the dividing line between popular Scottish music, 'aimed partly at the tourist market', and the music of the folk revival - traditional music - is not always clear cut.[102]

The New 'Folk'

The concern for the 'mawkish', and the 'kitsch' in Scottish popular music and its capacity to stereotype all Scottish music and culture continues to run deep, not only in scholarly, but also, in musical fields. In many cases this has taken the form of attempts to redefine not only 'popular' but also the 'traditional' - to challenge and refresh what is seen as the hackneyed in Scottish music and song.[103] As one recent album, *A Celebration of Scottish Music*, notes:

"This album celebrates the musical heritage of Scotland, a noble and exciting heritage often hidden, not only from the visitor, but even from the native of this country. All too often you will have offered to you music more suited to the vaudeville stage, the drawing room or the tourist pub; something quaint that does not question preconception and would probably be very much at home in 'Brigadoon'. Here, Temple records present the broad sweep of Scottish traditional music, played by the best musicians and singers in this field. Musicians who don't view their tradition as something of the past, of interest only to antiquarians, but as a vibrant contemporary music as relevant and entertaining today as it ever was." [104]

The Scottish musicians featured in this recording and others, such as Jock Tamson's Bairns (of the recent past), Capercaillie, Runrig, Malinky, and Salsa Celtica are taking their inspiration from the Scottish past, contemporary musical experimentation, and in some cases, the musical traditions of other places, blending styles like, jazz, rock, hip hop, Latin and African rhythms with traditional Scottish music to create new forms of Scottish song - to articulate a new contemporary 'authentic' voice in response to the 'inauthentic' culture of 'Brigadoon'.[105]

Distinctions between 'authentic' and 'inauthentic' culture, between commercially popular music and 'traditional' music or folk music continue to fuel discussion and debate in folkloric and cultural studies circles, and lie at heart of much of the critique of Scottish culture and identity discussed in this study. Distinctions between traditional Scottish song or folk song, and 'popular' Scottish song, signified by 'national' songs and the songs of music hall, reflect two apparently conflicting historically shaped ideas about popular culture - one that values the past traditions of the rural folk and the other that dismisses, or is suspicious of, the present culture of the urban 'folk'.[106]

As John Storey, and others like Michael Pickering and Tony Green explain, the origins of this schism can be traced to the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries and the cultural construction of 'folk culture':

"In the late eighteenth, throughout the nineteenth, and into the early part of the twentieth century, different groups of intellectuals, working under the different banners of nationalism, Romanticism, folklore, and finally folk song, 'invented' the first concept of popular culture. In fact, these debates eventually produced two definitions of popular culture. The first was popular culture as quasi-mythical rural 'folk culture', and the other - and it was very much the 'other' - was popular culture as the degraded 'mass culture' of the new urban-industrial working class." (Storey, 2003 (a), p1)

Both of these ideas of popular culture work together to draw a distinction between songs that are judged as authentic and genuine, and naturally arising out of local circumstances, and those that are a product of widely disseminated forms of public entertainment that are shaped primarily by the market place. The former implies cultural value, the latter, the lack of it. In these ideas, popular culture - as degraded mass culture - is pitted against the inherent cultural value of not only a mythologised folk culture but also the culture of the elite, that is, culture that is not popular. In other words an additional distinction is implied by the concept of popular culture, and that is the distinction between high culture and popular culture, or to put it another way, between high art and low art. As Storey suggests, 'the idea of popular culture is often a way of categorizing and dismissing the cultural activities of 'ordinary' people' '.[107]

Embedded in these distinctions is also the split between culture as meaning and culture as commodity, or between cultural expression and commercial/economic interests.[108] In this duality, the songs of the folk arise from the people's own interests, creativity and agency, with 'authenticity' deriving from oral traditions, whereas commercially produced hit tunes are 'manufactured', 'invented' and 'artificial'. Where folk culture is seen to have history, is slow to change, is based on local intergenerational dissemination, and serves personal and community needs; mass culture is seen to be of the moment, transient, disconnected to the reality of people's lives, serving only the needs of the market place and powerful groups.[109]

This setting apart of folk culture from mass culture, and of the alignment of popular culture with mass culture is deeply ingrained in the cultural lexicon and continues to influence contemporary scholarship:

"The influence of seeing popular culture as mass culture is very difficult to overestimate: for more than a century it was undoubtedly the dominant paradigm in cultural analysis. Indeed it could be argued that it still forms a kind of repressed 'common sense' in certain areas of British and American academic and nonacademic life. The principal problem is its working assumption that popular culture as mass culture always represents little more than an example of cultural decline and potential political disorder." (Storey, 2003 (a), pp 30-31)

These distinctions, between a worthy folk culture and a debased popular culture, that often lie hidden and unacknowledged within cultural discourse, pose a significant conceptual challenge for attending to the ways in which dominant cultural constructions and their modes of production and dissemination interact with local practices and meanings. As Barbara Henkes and Richard Johnson have argued, such value-laden dichotomies of 'authentic' and 'mediated' cannot be sustained, 'except analytically', since 'local, everyday life or 'lived' forms of culture and cultural practice are today always framed and interpenetrated by forms of public communication'.[110] What is needed is a way of conceptualising the localised culture of groups that does not rely on these well entrenched distinctions, while at the same time acknowledging and taking into account the intersections between the commerce of music and the use of music in local settings.

Pickering and Green's vernacular culture goes some way toward providing such a conceptualisation. Their formulation emphasises what people *do* with the cultural resources at their disposal, and how popular song, wherever it may have arisen, becomes woven into the fabric of everyday life. As they explain in their introductory remarks: 'what is most distinctive about the kind of song studied in this volume is that its performance occurs in small groups and that it is rooted in shared, immediate, everyday

experience'.[111] In the vernacular context the cultural transmission of songs has not 'been bracketed off from general social and cultural processes of everyday life'.[112] Neither are songs merely entertainment. At the local level, 'people develop a sense of belonging through the use of those resources in the process of individual meaning-construction within group contexts'.[113] For Pickering and Green songs constitute ways of handling experience, and can be used to 'to inform people's sensibilities and social identities, their own understandings and social values'.[114] Songs offer 'symbolic realities' of other worlds that interact in a dialectical process with everyday reality. In doing so, they may support or challenge 'how things are', or how they are represented ideologically, 'their role may be either affirmative or subversive, confirming or contesting existing patterns of social relationships and organization'.[115]

What also marks off the vernacular, in Pickering and Green's analysis, is that the performance and reception of songs typically embraces material that has no commercial value or conserves older material that is no longer of interest to the market place.[116] This appropriation and usage of popular song in 'non-commoditized manifestations' and the persistence of the outmoded is certainly true of my family's long standing repertoire of songs that was made up predominantly of songs from the family's past. My family adopted, adapted and 'took over' songs that had been 'popular' both within and without the music market place. In this process new local vernacular song traditions were established that continued to draw upon songs from the past in the context of the present. Pickering and Green emphasise an active process in taking from the past what may assist in making sense of the present. In other words, the persistence of objects from the past is conditional on their meeting the needs of the new. In this way, Pickering and Green pose a challenge to the 'oft-criticized but still powerful notion of popular tradition as an unambiguously conservative process of serial repetition':[117]

"The contemporaneity of the tradition-receiver must be viewed … as the vital site of tradition-making, a ground on which the so-called ideal object is not only received in active reception which *makes* relevant, makes *contemporary* … active reception permits the persistence of the old but only on condition that the needs of the new are

satisfied." (Frank Lentricchia, 1983, p 141, quoted in Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 17)

While the vernacular use of song is predicated on the local and 'shared, immediate, everyday experience' it also needs to be understood in relation to the broader social context. For Pickering and Green, 'the situated contexts of performance must be understood not only in relation to their own immediate dynamics, but also in relation to the broader structural forces which shape the character and course of everyday social interaction'.[118] In this study, the song traditions that were assimilated into my family's everyday life have been examined as part of that wider social context. At the very least, it can be said that these song traditions have been widely 'shared' in Scottish life. They have also served to construct pervasive collective ideas and images about what it is to be Scottish, evoking Scotland through its topography, its history and language, and the dispositions and character of its people. While these cultural forms, are not 'absolute determinants of consciousness or culture', as Pickering and Green have argued, the symbolic associations that arise out of their use in new or local contexts *are* mediated by them, as Middleton has argued.[119] Similarly, in my family context, one might argue that the experience of migration was not an 'absolute determinant of consciousness or culture' but an important mediating influence that had implications for how the songs were used and the meanings that they came to have.

The next chapter takes the ideas developed thus far about the relationship between culture and identity a step further by focusing on the mediating role of context, in particular migration. It draws on the work of Jonathan Hearn that underscores the importance of context - the 'contextualised motivations' - for understanding people's attachments to national identities. Through this analysis, the chapter posits that the experience of migration for my family provided a specific 'contextual motivation' for drawing on the resource of national identity in song. That proposition, arising from an expanded conception of identity that brings culture, identity, *and* context together, establishes an important conceptual bridge between the public and the private, between the 'macro' and 'micro', that frames further considerations of the impact of migration on

family and identity in Chapter 7, and the detailed examination of family song performance in Chapters 8 and 9.

---

[1] A P Cohen, 1996, p 806.

[2] A P Cohen, 1996, p 812.

[3] A P Cohen, 1996, p 812.

[4] See also Homi Bhabha, 1990, pp 1-7, regarding literature as the privileged site for the construction of national identity.

[5] Anderson, 2006, pp 141-146.

[6] A P Cohen, 1993, p 202. See also Storey, 2003 (a), pp 1-15; and Connell and Gibson, 2004, pp 117-118.

[7] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 17.

[8] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 17.

[9] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 11.

[10] Middleton, 1985, p 8.

[11] Middleton, 1985, p 13.

[12] Middleton, 1985, p 7.

[13] Middleton, 1985, p 26. See also I Russell, 1987 (a), for a detailed examination of parody in song performance. He also notes that the use of parody in vernacular song performance has been largely overlooked (I Russell, 1987 (a), p 71).

[14] A further 'articulation' process of music hall can be seen in the focus on Harry Lauder's music in the 2001 Prom Concerts in London.

[15] J Porter, 1998, p 1.

[16] See, for example, James, 2000, and Shelemay, 1998.

[17] The expression, 'a vivid Scots graffiti' is a paraphrase of McGuirk's description of Scottish vernacular song as 'a vivid graffiti of demotic Scots' (McGuirk, 2006, p 255).

[18] As an example of this music's continuing popularity, *Andy Stewart with his 20 Scottish Favourites* was number 3 in the Amazon top Scottish 'folk' albums of 2005.

[19] See Opie, 1985, 1997, and 2001; Ritchie, 1999 and 2000; McVicar, 2007. See Collinson for a discussion of early collectors that include Chambers; Moffatt; Greig and Duncan; Montgomerie; Gomme. Collinson notes that children's songs 'have always formed a considerable and not unimportant part' of Scottish song culture (Collinson, 1966, p 155).

[20] Collinson, 1966, p 3. Collinson also remarks that since the time of Robert Burns' 'epoch making' song writing and collecting, Scottish songs have 'poured out in a steady never-ending stream' (Collinson, 1966, p 131). See also Dianne Dugaw's (1996) analysis of popular balladry. In Dugaw's terms these national songs often drew on 'relics', ie cultural curios, became 'hits' and went on to become 'golden oldies', and in some cases back to 'relics', ie objects of collection and study.

[21] Collinson, 1966, p 3.

[22] T Crawford, 1979, p 172.

[23] T Crawford argues that 'it is wrong to think of the lowland Scottish song-culture of the eighteenth century as split down the middle into 'good' folk-song and 'bad' tea-table or art song … Tea-table songs were the popular songs of the upper and middle classes, and if they were any good at all they gradually became known among the whole people. Everybody high and low, was aware of the folk and stall (ie broadside and chapbook) songs' (T Crawford 1979, p viii-ix). All of these types of songs appealed in varying degrees to all of lowland Scotland.

[24] Middleton, 1985, p10.

[25] D Johnson, 2003, p 13. Houston and Knox, 2001, p 328.

[26] See Anderson, 2006, pp 37-46, for his thesis about print capitalism's role in the creation of the national vernacular. See also McCrone, 2001, p 181, for this idea applied to publishing and broadcasting creating a 'vernacular space' in Scotland.

[27] See D Johnson, 2003; T Crawford, 1979; Glen, 1900.

[28] Information from the *Scottish Chapbook Project,* University of South Carolina website; *The Word on the Street*, National Library of Scotland website; *Glasgow Broadside Ballads*, University of Glasgow website; and, T Crawford, 1979, pp 5-7.

[29] T Crawford, 1979, p viii, and pp 6-7. McCulloch, 2003, p 454.

[30] D Johnson, 2003, pp 130-131.

[31] From Henry Playford and Thomas D'Urfey, *Wit and Mirth: or Pills to Purge Melancholy*, vol 1, 1719. 'blith' = cheerful, pleasant (SND).

[32] D Johnson, 2003, p 114.

[33] D Johnson, 2003, p 139.

[34] D Johnson, 2003, p 130.

[35] Davis, 2004, p 191.

[36] Davis, 2004, p 190.

[37] Davis, 2004, p 192. See also Collinson, who remarks that Ramsay's songs presume the singer's knowledge of the tunes (Collinson, 1966, p 126).

[38] From Allan Ramsay, *The Tea-Table Miscellany: a Collection of Choice Songs, Scots and English*, vol 1, 1762. 'lawland' = lowland; 'trews' = trousers; 'plaidy' = highland patterned woven cloth worn as draped and belted covering, that became the kilt (SND).

[39] Newman, 2002, p 313.

[40] Newman, 2002, pp 293-294.

[41] Newman, 2002, p 308. Collinson also argues that Ramsay was the first Scot to realise that there could be 'some value, cultural and commercial' in Scottish song (Collinson, 1966, p 126).

[42] Newman, 2002, p 281-282. See also T Crawford, who argues that Ramsay 'was as much a laureate of the streets as of the drawing room' (T Crawford, 1979, p 173). He, at times, 'proved himself a gifted artist in popular song, uniting antiquarian folk-lore with other traditions' (T Crawford, p 176).

[43] Newman, 2002, p 314.

[44] See McGuirk, 2006; McCue, 1997; McCulloch, 2003; Davis, 1998 and 2002. McCulloch suggests that 'with the outstanding exception of Burns' late song collecting, women were at the heart of the transmission and composing of songs' (McCulloch, 2003, p 460). Davis argues, with respect to Lady Nairne's song writing, that she 'served as a model for a way in which women could contribute to the imagining of the nation. Her activities suggest that women can play a necessary part in the construction of the national image' (Davis, 2002, pp 7-8).

[45] D Johnson, 2003, p 149. See also Collinson, who asserts that *The Scots Musical Museum* 'was, and still is, in many ways the standard and definitive collection of Scots songs' (Collinson, 1966, p 13).

[46] McGuirk, 2006, p 255.

[47] T Crawford, 1979, p 149. Collinson also acknowledges that Burns 'changed the whole face of Scottish song' (Collinson, 1966, p 128).

[48] From *The Scots Musical Museum*, vol 5, (1796), 1853 edition, 1991 reprint.

[49] McGuirk, 2006, p 255.

[50] McGuirk, 2006, p 255. See also Leith Davis, Ian Duncan and Janet Sorensen, who argue that 'Robert Burns crafted the first modern vernacular style in British poetry' (Davis, Duncan and Sorensen, 2004, p 3). Also note T Crawford's argument that 'it is misleading to see in Burns the victim of a paralysing linguistic dichotomy ('good' Scots for ever at war with 'effete', unnatural English)' (T Crawford 1979, p viii).

[51] McGuirk, 2006, p 255. McGuirk is drawing here on William Donaldson's argument that Burns' songs symbolised a 'Scottish national and historical distinctiveness in contradistinction from the 'British' and assimilationist ethos of the Whigs' (Donaldson, 1988, p 89).

[52] McGuirk, 2006, p 254.

[53] From *The Scots Musical Museum*, vol 3, (1790), 1853 edition, 1991 reprint.

[54] From Nairne, *Songs of Baroness Nairne*, 1902. 'sodger' = soldier; 'unco' = strange, unfamiliar; 'pibroch' = Scottish pipes (SND).

[55] McGuirk, 2006, p 254.

[56] Butler, 1997, p 111.

[57] Butler, 1997, p 109.

[58] Butler, 1997, p 87.

[59] Davis, 2004, p 196.

[60] R Crawford, 2009, p 277. It is also a project that continues to make him 'awkward for a British establishment which has constantly tried to tame him' (R Crawford, 2009, p 406).

[61] R Crawford, 1997, p ix. See also Tyrrell, 2005.

[62] Nash, 1997, p 181. See also Devine, 1999, p 294.

[63] Nash, 1997, p 186.

[64] Nash, 1997, p 192.

[65] R Crawford, 1997, p xii.

[66] Nash, 1997, p 181. See also Davis, 2002; Sweeney-Turner, 1998; McGuirk, 2006; West, 2006, who argue that, after Burns, lowland song culture (in particular the songs of Lady Nairne, and others) anticipates the Kailyard. Sweeney-Turner suggests that Nairne's work 'can easily be read as one of the main determinants of its eventual development' (Sweeney-Turner, 1998, p 162). McQuirk draws a comparison between Burns' work that looks to the future, and Nairne's work that 'stands up for traditional ways of Scottish life' (McQuirk, 2006, p 281).

[67] Nash, 1997, p 184.

[68] See McGuirk, 1997; Low, 1993; and Butler, 1997.

[69] Inscription on the title page of *The Scots Musical Museum*, vol 6, (1803), 1853 edition, 1991 reprint. Although this volume was published after Burns' death, its sentiments echo those of Burns himself. Donald Low (1991, p 8) attributes these earlier editorial words to Burns: 'Ignorance and Prejudice may perhaps affect to sneer at the simplicity of the poetry or music of some of these pieces; but their having been for ages the favorites of Nature's Judges - the Common People, was to the Editor a sufficient test of their merit' (Preface to vol 2, *The Scots Musical Museum* (1788), 1853 edition, 1991 reprint). See also D Low, 1991, pp 1-26; and D Johnson, 2003, pp 148-9, for discussion of Burns' approach to Scottish song.

[70] Nash, 1997, p 190.

[71] Davis, 2004; McQuirk, 2006; Butler, 1997. See also T Crawford, 1979; R Crawford, 2009; McCue, 1997.

[72] D Low, 1993, p 1. He comments that 'the sometimes hackneyed favourites of Burns Suppers and recording companies are only a tiny sample of a large and impressive body of work' (Low, 1993, p 1). He argues that Burns' achievement in song has seldom been fully understood.

[73] From *Guardian* newspaper report, *Rough and Ready*, 14 August 2000: 'The informal concerts, under the banner of Work, Sex and Drink, have been programmed by singers Kirsteen McCue - an academic specialist on 18th-century music publishing who frequently presents on BBC Radio 3 - and Sheena Wellington, a driving force behind the current renaissance of Scottish traditional music, who was invited to sing at the inauguration of the Scottish parliament.'

[74] Davis, Duncan and Sorensen, 2004, p 6.

[75] R Crawford, 2009, p 406.

[76] R Crawford, 2009, p 406.

[77] R Crawford, 2009, p 277.

[78] Middleton, 1985, pp 10-11. See also Finlay, 2004; Devine, 1999; Devine and Finlay, 1997.

[79] West, 2006, pp 120-121. See also Devine, 1999, p 360.

[80] See D Russell, 1993; I Russell, 1987 (a); West, 2006; Pickering and Green, 1987 (c).

[81] Munro, 1996, pp 3-6.

[82] T Crawford, 1979, p 159.

[83] Bill Dean Myatt, 2004. See also Munro, 1996, p 21; and West, 2006, p 128.

[84] As Myatt notes, 'Jimmy Shand too had had considerable success with his records for Beltona for whom he recorded from 1935 until 1945 but this was totally eclipsed by his subsequent sales for Parlophone. Until the Beatles released their first records, Shand was their best selling artist' (Myatt, 2004, np.)

[85] See Myatt, 2004, and Munro, 1996.

[86] See Szasz, 2000, pp 141-143; *Sir Harry Lauder 1870-1950*, University of Glasgow, Special Collections; Lauder-Frost, *Biographical Notes on Sir Harry Lauder*, *Electric Scotland* website.

[87] From the album, *Harry Lauder, Roamin' in the Gloamin': Original Recordings, 1926-1930*, Naxos, 2004. Written by Harry Lauder (1911). Also sung by Jimmy Shand, and Andy Stewart. 'gloamin' ' = evening twilight, dusk (SND).

[88] Information on Robert Wilson's performance career drawn from Wilson's record album sleeve notes.

[89] See, for example, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 1, Legacy, 2005. Written by Robert Wilson (1950). Also sung by Jimmy Shand, Kenneth McKellar, and Andy Stewart. 'HLI' = Highland Light Infantry. 'Seaforths' and 'The Black Watch' were famous Highlander Regiments, as was the 'Gordon' of the song. 'drappie' = a wee drink; 'forby' = also, in addition; 'ee' = eye (SND).

[90] *Scotsman.com*, 13 January, 2005.

[91] See, for example, *Andy Stewart: 20 Scottish Favourites*, EMI, 2001. Written by Andy Stewart (1960). 'breeks' = trousers (SND).

[92] Szasz, 2000, p 143, quoting Orel, 1981, p 19.

[93] From *The Scots Musical Museum*, vol 3, (1790), 1853 edition, 1991 reprint. 'waukin' = awake; 'simmer' = summer; 'heugh' = cliff, steep hill; 'irie' = eerie, uneasy; 'lanely' = lonely; 'lave' = the rest, remainder.

[94] Written by Harry Lauder, 1906. From *Francis and Day's 3rd Album of Harry Lauder's Popular Songs*, Francis and Day, London, 1912. A more traditional version of the song was sung by Kenneth McKellar, *Kenneth McKellar: 20 Favourite Songs*, Lismor, 2002; and Moira Anderson, *The World of Moira Anderson*, Decca, 1974.

[95] Szasz, 2000, p 142, quoting C A Oakley, 1946, p 265.

[96] Herman, 2001, p 416.

[97] Maloney, 2003, p 219.

[98] Maloney, 2003, p 219.

[99] Maloney, 2003, p 218.

[100] See Sweeney-Turner (1998) for an account of the 'bilingual' nature of Scots song.

---

[101] Kenneth Elliott, *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 1980, vol 17, p 70, quoted in Munro, 1996, p 21.

[102] Munro, 1996, p 21.

[103] See, for example, Peter Symon's analysis of contemporary approaches to traditional Scottish music (Symons, 1997).

[104] *A Celebration of Scottish Music*, Temple Records, 1988. Album notes from the *Scottish Music Centre* website.

[105] See Symon, 1997, pp 203-216; and McCrone, 2001, p 144. Connell and Gibson cite Jock Tamson's Bairns as an example of this revival in Scottish music that 'rejected the myths of tartanry and 'shortbread tin' representations of Scotland prominent in tourism and marketing campaigns' (Connell and Gibson 2004, p 131).

[106] See also Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), who draw similar parallels with regard to the twentieth century folk song revival. Also see McCrone, who observes that 'a considerable amount of effort has gone into discovering the 'real' Scottish culture, especially in the pre-industrial past … when it was possible to argue that this 'Scottish culture' was a communal culture, reflected in the sturdy vernacular of Ramsay … and Robert Burns'. This search is frequently retrospective and romantic (McCrone, 2001, p 143). A more contemporary version of this quest can be seen in the celebration of a fast disappearing working class culture, spurred by the decline of Scottish heavy industry (McCrone, 2001, pp 139-140).

[107] Storey, 2003 (a), p xii.

[108] See Connell and Gibson, 2004.

[109] For example, see D Johnson's view of folk song culture, 2003, p 6, and pp 14-15. Also see Pickering and Green's, 1987 (b), analysis of 'the folk' as an invented concept; and, Berger and Del Negro, 2004, for an account of how the 'folk' have been constructed. Connell and Gibson discuss how music circulates as both 'commercial' and 'cultural' value (Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 6).

[110] Henkes and Johnson, 2002, p 140.

[111] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 4.

[112] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 16.

[113] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 12.

[114] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 3.

[115] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 13. See also Berger and Del Negro's discussion of Paul Willis' concept of 'symbolic work' as the 'production of meaning through the employment of a repertoire of signs and other devices', that 'may reflect upon and critique the social order' (Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 8, referring to Willis, 1990, pp 9-10).

[116] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 3 and 34.

[117] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 39.

[118] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 11.

---

[119] See also Anthony Cohen, 'we must resist the temptation to depict culture as the monolithic determinant of our behavior' (A P Cohen, 1993, p 207).

6

The Nation in Context

... national identities, like all identities, are rendered salient for persons when they seem to address personal issues of power over one's life, and that the various social organisational settings through which people realise control over their lives ... are thus crucial contexts for understanding people's attachments to identities, national and otherwise.

(Jonathan Hearn, 2007, p 657)

The previous chapter considered the role of song in imagining the nation and how national identity, specifically Scottish identity, has been manifested in song. The Scottish popular song traditions, that were the source of my family's songs, were examined to demonstrate their role in imagining the nation over time through their widespread penetration into popular culture. That analysis focused largely on the wider social and cultural context in which cultural forms such as music and song participate, and may often play a significant role in the narrative of nation. A key theme in the chapter was that it is the 'sharing' of and 'attachment' to cultural forms, such as songs, that the 'nation' is predicated on. Such attachment to nation is not determined by membership, but rather by the personal meanings that nation has for individuals, where the individual interprets and constructs the nation in terms of personal and local experience. The ways in which the nation may be shared in song at the local level was explored through the interchanges between public song traditions and localised forms of song tradition, and how the local meanings of the songs arise out of that interplay. Consideration was given to how the songs of a nation can be 'made over' in new

contexts and given new meanings. More generally that chapter sought to further explore this study's guiding proposition that national identity arises in the intersection between the 'nation' and the individual, between the 'public' and 'private'. This chapter will take that exploration a step further by focusing on the role of specific contexts in mediating the intersection between the nation and the individual.

The question of how national identity is realised in daily life has been recently addressed by Jonathan Hearn building on his earlier work previously discussed in this study. Hearn's later work focuses on the relationship between national identities 'as social categories that people use to divide up and make sense of the social world, and as an aspect of self-identity, partially constitutive of personhood'.[1] For Hearn (and Anthony Cohen) nation-ness is one of the resources upon which individuals draw to formulate their sense of selfhood or personal identity. Like Cohen, Hearn recognises that nation-ness operates as 'a broad and rather abstract social category', but at the same time it can become particularly salient in the individual's sense of self. Why and how people draw upon nation-ness - why personal identities become invested in national identities - is the question that Hearn attempts to answer. He builds his argument on the proposition that 'national identities, like all identities, are rendered salient for persons when they seem to address personal issues of power over one's life'.[2] What he adds in this later work is the importance of context - the 'contextualised motivations' - for understanding people's attachments to national identities. He proposes that the relationship between the social and personal dimensions of national identity is mediated by specific contexts; and that the contexts in which individuals draw upon the cultural resources of social (national) identities and incorporate them into their own self-understandings are crucial to understanding how identity works. Using ethnographic field work from a study of a merger between a Scottish and an English bank, Hearn explores how a specific social context mediates the use of nation-ness as a basis for identity. He examines how the cultural resource of Scottishness was deployed by the Bank of Scotland employees to help articulate a narrative of anxiety and discomfort in regard to the experience of the merger.

Drawing on the work of Michael Billig, Anthony Cohen, and Derek Layder, Hearn sets out to bridge the gap between national identity as a cultural resource and national identity as an expression of self. He argues that many discussions of (national) identity reduce the matter to a conceptual opposition between personal and social identities - 'a variant of much larger theoretical debates about the relationships between macro and micro processes, and structure and agency'.[3] In these debates, he argues, there has been 'a relative lack of attention to the role of the structures and contexts through which the social and personal interact'.[4] He proposes that attention to these structures and contexts provides an important way of understanding how national identity works.

Hearn begins by contrasting Billig's concept of 'banal nationalism' with Cohen's 'personal nationalism'. The distinction that Hearn draws is that Billig is concerned with nationalism as a social identity, while Cohen is concerned with it as personal identity. In Billig's 'banal nationalism', national identities are 'patterns of practice and habit built into the material and social environment' where nation-ness is reproduced implicitly and symbolically reinforced. Here, nationalism appears 'banal' when it is informal, apolitical and part of everyday life. Hearn argues that Billig's 'banal nationalism' is dealing with 'how the social category of national identity is actually constituted, and why it persists'.[5] For Hearn, Billig's work is 'concerned more with the implicit and naturalised social reproduction of social categories than with how we invest ourselves in them'.[6]

On the other hand, as Hearn points out, Cohen's 'personal nationalism' is about how individuals draw on the social category of national identity to locate and depict their selves. It is 'about using the social category of the nation to help situate the self and interpret personal circumstances'.[7] Here, attachment to nation is not determined by membership, but rather by the personal meanings that nation has for individuals. Nor are people simply dupes to nationalist discourses – 'individuals appropriate these discourses in active processes of self-making with deep personal significance'.[8]

Hearn suggests that Billig and Cohen are useful for examining the two different sides of the relationship between personal and social identity, but that neither adequately bridge

the gap between the personal and the social. What remains to be addressed is the question of how and why personal identities become invested in social (national) identities:

> "Beyond its general availability as an ideological resource (Billig), and its highly personal significance (Cohen), there lie questions about the contextualised motivations for drawing on that resource." (Hearn, 2007, p 666)

Hearn argues that Layder's model takes us further toward answering the question of why people draw upon the 'nation' as a key dimension of the self. To bridge the gap between the social and personal - between Billig's 'banal nationalism' and Cohen's 'personal nationalism' - Hearn draws upon Layder's concept of personal identity as embedded in the social world. Here, personal identity is negotiated within embedded layers, or 'domains', of social interaction. Hearn summarises Layder's model in this way:

> "The first layer of the self's immediate episodic interactions with others he labels 'situated activity'. The next layer out includes the more enduring patterns of ongoing social relations found in institutions and organisations of all types, which he calls 'social settings'. Finally, there is a layer he labels 'contextual resources' which refers to the encompassing environment of socially created material and ideational artefacts that both structure, and can be drawn upon in, social interactions. The distinctions are analytic - any instance of social interaction occurs across all domains at once." (Hearn, 2007, p 667)

Layder's formulation embraces the idea that identity arises not only in day-to-day social interaction, but also within more enduring forms of social organisation, and also within the larger environment of social/cultural resources. Hearn's particular interest is in the role that forms of social organisation (Layder's social settings) play in personal identity. Hearn proposes that it is through organisational contexts that the personal and social interact. Between pervasive constructions of (social) identity and the self lie the various forms of social organisation that frame people's 'particular lives and circumstances'. It

is these organisational contexts through which people 'succeed or fail to empower themselves'. Hearn argues (following Layder) that the striving for a sense of agency or personal power is 'always conditioned by the multiple organisational contexts in which the self is situated'. In this way personal identity and its relationship to pervasive social and cultural structures is mediated by 'the more specific organisational contexts through which people realise their needs, wants and aspirations'.[9]

Drawing on Layder's view of identity as embedded in aspects of the social world, Hearn proposes the concept of 'embedded nationalism'. In Hearn's formulation, national identity is a cultural resource available to be drawn upon in various ways, in various social contexts. The focus here is on the socially 'contextualised motivations' for personal identities becoming invested in national identities. National identity becomes salient for people, drawn upon and made personally relevant when it resonates with experiences of agency, of empowerment and disempowerment in *particular contexts*. Importantly, the way people become invested in 'nation-ness' depends on how organisational contexts 'articulate' with that social identity. Hearn suggests that Layder's model helps us conceptualise more clearly the way that personal and social dimensions of national identity are 'mediated by concrete and ongoing social settings through which power relations get negotiated'.[10] In the case of the Scottish bank, employees drew on the language of national identity to articulate their concerns over the merger with the English bank, and to help account for the 'vicissitudes of power over their own lives'. In the particular context of the Scottish bank, its staff worked 'in an organisational environment that, by its very nature, was extensively furnished with routine, banal invocations of the social category of Scottish identity'.[11] National identity 'suffused' their working environment and was 'situationally relevant not just in the episodic interactions of individuals, but in the larger and more binding fate of the Bank in which people become invested'.[12]

Hearn's analysis of the relationship between social and personal identities has been given considerable attention here because it helps to pull together the various theoretical and conceptual threads that have been enunciated in this study thus far. The guiding

question of this study has been how personal formulations of national identity emerge in the interplay between large scale/public and small scale/private domains of social interaction. Various approaches to how this interplay can be understood have been examined, focusing on the general idea that identity is not a 'given' but is negotiated in social interaction. It has also been argued that while people 'personalise' national identity, they do so within a social and cultural context. In addition to Cohen, Billig and Hearn, writers such as McCrone, Berger and Del Negro, Bauman, Storey, and Somers, discussed in this study, have drawn attention to the key dimensions in the interplay between the self and the social/cultural context. As noted previously 'although identities are a sign of agency, identities are always made within structures and discourses, which both enable and constrain the making of identities'.[13] The point has also been made that national identity operates at different levels of meaning in different contexts and settings, and that there is no 'one size fits all' national identity. Often competing ideas about national identity emerge and are played out across all domains of social activity, large and small, in different settings and with different motivations. Berger and Del Negro's analysis has been useful for drawing attention to the ways that ideas about national identity emerge in varied domains of social life, and that attention to differences in scale or type of social context is important for understanding how identity works.

However, attention to scale - from small to large scale social affiliations - from families, neighbourhoods, towns, regions, to ethnic groups or nations - is not straightforward. Not all social groups can be defined in terms of scale, nor does gender, generation or class fit neatly across a parameter of scale. Moreover, a focus on scale should not draw attention away from the 'dialectical interaction' between different scales of social life, such as the relationship between the social and personal dimensions of national identity. Berger and Del Negro suggest that 'social group type' may be a more useful way of examining the social domains in which identity arises, although scale is obviously a useful parameter to consider. In addition to 'scale' and 'social group type', Berger and Del Negro also identify another parameter that focuses on the extent to which identity is either regulated/imposed or socially negotiated. This parameter distinguishes across a range of institutionalised/regulated formulations of identity, and situated/expressive formulations

where identity is achieved in social interaction. They make the point that while all ideas about identity are created or negotiated in situated social practices only a small number of them become codified in law or regulation. Institutionalised and regulating identity occurs when 'a representation of an individual or group identity is codified in law, policy or dogma and is used to dictate behaviour'.[14] Institutionalised and regulating identity primarily exist on the large scale, (in the form of identity cards, visas, work permits, legal privileges etc) but not always. The 'rules' of a family for example ('all Smith children go to bed at eight') may involve institutionalised identity as well. Situated or expressive identity refers to identity that is achieved in social interaction**.** This situated view of identity, where identity is negotiated in social interaction, may invoke any scale or type of social group. Here, Berger and Del Negro have been careful to use the term 'situated' rather than 'micro-level', 'personal' or 'interactive' in order to emphasise that all identity formulations that arise in social interaction, are '*located within* larger social contexts, are constrained and enabled by those contexts, and can only be understood in terms of those contexts'.[15] Like Hearn, Storey and Somers, Berger and Del Negro emphasise that social structures and power relations play a key role in all interpretations of identity, not only in regulating forms of identity but also in situated forms.

These accounts, variously describing and emphasising different dimensions of identity, point to the importance of the social and cultural context in which identity is formulated. What Hearn (and Layder) draw attention to is the role of *specific* social contexts in mediating the personal and the wider social/cultural context. Hearn's analysis also provides a means for locating the role of cultural resources in the process of personal identity. The other accounts of identity discussed in this study draw attention to the role of available cultural resources (discourses, stocks of cultural knowledge, expressive resources and so on) that are appropriated and made meaningful in the process of personal identity. With Hearn's contextual perspective, Storey's discourses, Berger and Del Negro's stocks of cultural knowledge, and Bauman's repertoires of expressive resources can be understood as 'contextual resources' - 'the encompassing environment

of socially created material and ideational artefacts that both structure, and can be drawn upon in, social interactions', and made meaningful in particular contexts.

In bringing together the public and the personal through a focus on the social contexts that mediate their interaction, Hearn's 'embedded nationalism' also brings a sharper contextual focus to the relationship between Somers' public and personal narratives. Importantly it provides a means for understanding the 'contextualised motivations' for public narratives becoming connected with people's lives, and, in particular, how narratives of nation become connected to personal identities. Hearn's earlier work proposed that narratives of nation become personalised and gain their salience to the extent that they explain, justify or resonate with feelings of empowerment. In his later formulation of 'embedded nationalism' the narrative of nation can be understood as a 'contextual resource' that becomes salient for people and made personally relevant when it resonates with experiences of agency in specific contexts.

The 'contextual resource' of national identity, as Hearn and Billig remind us, is often to be found in the 'little things' that assume the presence of nations. Hearn suggests that Billig's emphasis on how national identity is 'flagged' in daily life through the implicit, mundane and ordinary has shifted our understanding of the ways in which attachment to nation is created and recreated. In this 'subtle insinuation' of national identity into everyday life:

> "… nationalism is crucially sustained not so much through explicit ideological exhortation, but through implicit, repetitive, symbolic reinforcement. Nationalism abides in the little things, jokes, advertisements, street names, weather reports, and so on, which assume the presence of nations." (Hearn, 2007, p 660)

Likewise, as Cohen has suggested, it is in the shared every day experience of symbolic cultural forms such as literature, folklore, music, and food that underpins a sense of nation. For Anderson, this symbolic reinforcement is made particularly powerful through language - particularly, poetry and song.

This study is also concerned with national identity that abides in the little things - in the Scottish songs that assume the presence of a nation. In Layder's and Hearn's terms these songs can be viewed as embodying a 'contextual resource' of 'nation-ness', that was drawn upon and made personally relevant in the context of a family. Hearn notes that outside of the work context, 'networks of social relations based on family and kinship, co-residence, voluntary associations and leisure activities are likely to be just as if not more important in the practical, everyday instantiation of Scottishness'.[16] For my family, after their migration to Australia, this reinforcement of the everyday 'instantiation of Scottishness' was located primarily within the home and family. Like the bank, the home environment was 'extensively furnished with routine, banal invocations of the social category of Scottish identity', particularly, though not exclusively, through singing Scottish songs. Moreover, as Hearn suggests, not only did the bank provide a banal context for reinforcing belief in a Scottish identity, but also that Scottish identity provided a resource for reinforcing staff commitment to the bank. In the context of our family, I will be arguing that Scottish identity (through the songs) also provided a resource for reinforcing our family attachment.

Hearn's analysis of the bank merger offers another useful insight. While the Scottish bank provided an ongoing context for reinforcing belief in a Scottish identity, at the time of the merger with the English bank, that identity had 'a specific salience', an 'extra 'bite'. The merger carried implications for the fates of the Scottish bank employees, bringing with it a sense of uncertainty and loss of control in regard to their lives and careers. The extra salience that Scottishness had for the employees was that it seemed to offer a means by which they could talk about and make sense of their circumstances - that it helped to 'illuminate' their struggle for control over their lives. As Hearn argues:

> "The crucial point here is that being Scottish is not simply a matter of self-categorisation; it is a medium for making sense of personal circumstances." (Hearn, 2007, p 664)

It is this idea of a shift in circumstance, in context, that gives national identity 'specific salience', the 'extra bite', that is of interest to this study. While singing had been a feature of our family life prior to migration to Australia, the experience of migration gave our songs 'specific salience' and 'extra bite'. What I am suggesting here is that the experience of migration provided a specific 'contextual motivation' for drawing on the resource of national identity in song. I have previously suggested that the experience of migration was an important mediating influence that had implications for how the songs were used and the meanings that they came to have. I have also proposed that the Scottish songs that were assimilated into family life became a resource for constructing a new sense of home and identity in Australia. The remainder of this study will examine how both family and migration exerted an important mediating influence on how Scottishness was drawn upon and made particularly salient in the quest for home and identity.

---

[1] Hearn, 2007, p 658.

[2] Hearn, 2007, p 657.

[3] Hearn, 2007, p 671.

[4] Hearn, 2007, p 659.

[5] Hearn, 2007, p 660.

[6] Hearn, 2007, p 659.

[7] Hearn, 2007, p 666.

[8] Hearn, 2007, p 659.

[9] Hearn, 2007, p 671.

[10] Hearn suggests that although 'the social conflicts revealed in this case are relatively subdued and routine … the same principles are at work when national identities are invoked in much more intensive and volatile conflicts' (Hearn, 2007, p 670).

[11] Hearn, 2007, pp 662-663.

[12] Hearn, 2007, p 671.

[13] Storey, 2003 (a), p 80.

[14] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 136.

---

[15] Berger and Del Negro, 2004, p 137.

[16] Hearn, 2007, pp 671-672.

7

Migration, Family and Music: An Overview

Migrant stories have always been a central part of the migration experience: in the imagination of possible futures; during the physical process of passage; and as migrants have lived with and made sense of the consequences of their migration. At each stage life stories articulate the meanings of experience and suggest ways of living.

(Alistair Thomson, 1999, p 35)

In a recent comprehensive survey of the theory and literature on migration, its editors note that migrants both shape and are shaped by the political, economic, social and cultural context within which they operate.[1] This work identifies families as a key part of the migrants' social world through which they 'articulate the world they have left with the world they have entered'.[2] It is often through family life that the processes of change and adaptation, that are part of being a migrant, are played out and mediated. Families also play a significant role in the complex of ways in which migrants define their sense of identity and belonging.[3] It has also been noted that cultural factors play an important part in shaping migrant identities, with research pointing to the role of music in the lives of migrant groups and families.[4] This chapter examines the role of family and music in the migrant experience, and their part in shaping migrant memories, narratives and identities. It addresses how migrants' cultural traditions, while referring to the past, can serve as the building blocks for identity. The chapter is divided into a number of sections designed to highlight relevant issues associated with the following study themes: migration and family; migration and memory; narrative and culture; music, migrant identity, place and home; and, in conclusion, migrants' musical choices. The issues and

concepts that are raised and developed here will be applied to the detailed case study of family music, migration and identity in the chapters to follow.

James Hammerton makes the astute observation that 'the very act of migration focuses attention on its impact on kinship'.[5] This close connection between migration and kinship has become an important arena of investigation in migration studies. As noted by Caroline Brettell, anthropologists, sociologists and historians have recognised that networks of kinship and friendship play a significant role in the migration process itself, and in migrant settlement and adaptation.[6] This has led to a focus on the family, households and social networks as the primary units of analysis, rather than, for example, only broad economic, demographic, or political patterns and factors. But as Brettell points out, this emphasis on the local and more immediate migration experience is not about addressing the micro at the expense of the macro:

> "A concern with the particulars of individuals' lives (need not) imply disregard for forces and dynamics that are not locally based. On the contrary, the effects of extralocal and long-term processes are only manifested locally and specifically, produced in the actions of individuals living their particular lives, inscribed in their bodies and their words." (Abu-Lughod, 1991, p 150, quoted in Brettell, 2003, pp 23-24)

Brettell argues that a focus on the micro, such as households, families and social networks, is important, not only as a means for gaining insights into the personal experience of migration, but also because it is through such social networks that the relationship between the individual and the wider social/cultural/economic variables of migration is mediated:

> "Social networks and households simultaneously mediate macrostructural changes, facilitate responses to those changes, and perpetuate migration as a self-sustaining process." (Grasmuck and Pessar, 1991, p 13, quoted in Brettell, 2008, p 125)

As Jonathan Hearn has argued, it is through such local networks, (specific forms of social organisation), that 'people realise their needs, wants and aspirations'. These are crucial contexts for 'understanding people's attachments to identities, national and otherwise'.[7] Brettell formulates this idea in relation to migrants' ethnic identities, but a similar point is made - that the social context influences the expression of identity and that ethnicity is a 'strategic response' invoked in various situations. Ethnic identity, like identity in general, is thus viewed as fluid and contingent, as socially constituted and not simply determined by membership of an (ethnic) group. Ethnic identity is:

> "… a process whereby individuals make use of ethnicity as a manoeuvre or stratagem in working out their own life chances in an ethnically pluralistic social setting."
> (Lyman and Douglass, 1973, p 350, quoted in Brettell, 2008, p 132)

As a form of self-representation, the expression of ethnic (cultural or national) identity by migrants can become a focus for the definition of self and provide 'a foundation for constructing social cohesion and allegiance'.[8] For migrant groups especially it can assist in the construction and maintenance of kinship and community ties. Migrants will often draw upon culturally or ethnically specific symbolic resources - music, dance, dress, cultural/religious ritual and so on - around which identity is formulated and constructed. Such cultural practices - symbolic representations and performances - can be seen as 'encoding' ideas about migrants' interpretations and constructions of their evolving identities.[9]

The literature on diaspora has also brought a perspective to migrant studies that emphasises the meanings that migration has for migrants, and the role of family and community networks. Brettell, and Mark Slobin note that although the idea of diaspora can be an imprecise concept, often used to simply define groups of people living outside their homelands, it can be a useful analytical tool for examining the migrant experience. In his account of diaspora, Slobin suggests that diaspora 'leads a double life':

"At its simplest, it merely marks the existence of an identified population that feels that it is away from its homeland, however imagined, however distant in time and space. The subtler meanings of 'diaspora' acknowledge that this involves more than just demographics. Some sort of consciousness of a separation, a gap, a disjuncture must be present for the term to move beyond a formalization of census data." (Slobin, 2003, p 288)

Slobin points to various approaches that have attempted to move diaspora from a technical term emphasising demographics, to one that addresses the affective and experiential dimensions of the migration experience. He suggests that Paul Gilroy's conception is useful for accounting for both the geographic and affective dimensions of diaspora. Gilroy, states Slobin, distinguishes between 'a spatial focus on the diaspora idea' and issues of 'diaspora temporality and historicity, memory and narrativity'.[10] Brettell also notes approaches to diaspora study that emphasise the subjective meanings of displacement, where the meaning of diaspora is to be found in the 'trail of collective memory about another place and time'.[11] In other studies with this orientation, a focus has been on how migrants imagine and construct a sense of community and belonging, using 'memory of place to construct imaginatively their new lived world'.[12]

In addressing the affective and experiential aspects of migration, attention has been given to the role of memory, narrative, and relationships between past and present in the migrant experience - what Gilroy refers to as issues of 'temporality and historicity, memory and narrativity'. The migrant story or narrative has been at the centre of many studies that draw on life histories or oral narrative as a mechanism through which to comprehend the migration process.[13] Brettell suggests that attention to migrants' narratives helps to:

"… emphasize what generalizations about migration look like on the ground and to delineate how migrants make decisions, forge social relationships, and exercise agency in the face of various local, national and international constraints." (Brettell, 2003, p 32)

Brettell draws on Sarah Lamb's account of storytelling to illuminate what migrants' narratives can reveal. The telling of stories is:

"… one of the practices by which people, reflect, exercise agency, contest interpretations of things, make meanings, feel sorrow and hope, and live their lives. Storytelling, the narrative presentation of self and culture … is a creative social practice." (Sarah Lamb, 2001, p 28, quoted in Brettell, 2003, p 24)

This storytelling - the 'narrative presentation of the self and culture' - that is 'a creative social process', may be manifest in many forms, not only in the more literal sense of telling a story. The narratives of groups, families or individuals can be expressed in various expressive and symbolic forms, such as music and song. [14] Kay Kaufman Shelemay's study of Syrian Jews in Brooklyn, discussed further below, demonstrates how music can serve as cultural narrative. In this case, the sharing and transmission of musical traditions was a means through which individuals, families and the community told the story of itself. Through song performance, 'the songs can 'speak' in as cogent a manner as conventional oral testimony'.[15]

Slobin suggests that music is central to the diasporic experience, and that migrants 'identify themselves strongly, even principally, through their music'. In the context of diaspora and migration studies, music also 'offers a richness of methodological possibilities and points of view, opening new windows on diasporic neighborhoods'.[16] Indeed, it is at this local level of 'diasporic neighborhoods' that Slobin suggests that much of the meaning of diaspora lies. While the idea of diaspora can tend to imply a unity across the larger group, it may be 'salutary' to question that such a 'unity' is the primary agent in the migrants' quest for kin and community. Slobin points to evidence from recent studies, (such as Shelemay's), that shows that it is often in smaller local groups, and within each generation, that migrants find ways to construct a sense of community and belonging:

"Small groups tack with the steering winds to find their way to the communal harbor of their imagination. In doing so, they may refuse to take fellow passengers on board." (Slobin, 2003, p 290)

Migration and Family

Our family was part of the large intake of British migrants to Australia described by Hammerton as the largest planned migrations of the twentieth century. Between 1947 and 1972 it assisted more than a million British migrants, mostly, like our family, young couples with children.[17] The number of Scots making the journey was disproportionately large compared to their representation in the British population, a feature that Hammerton notes is often accounted for by the poor living conditions in Scotland, especially when compared with England. When we left to make the long six week ship voyage to Australia in 1956, we were part of a large scale decade long exodus of Scots. Between 1950 and 1960 over half million people left Scotland, roughly half of them going to England where wages were higher and unemployment levels lower than in Scotland.[18] At that time of our migration, over a quarter of the urban population in Scotland lived in two room accommodation.[19] We were one of the families to gain access to the boom in council housing, which provided us and other families with improved living conditions and a backyard, representing a significant improvement over the cities' tenement slums.[20] Like the bulk of the Scottish population, that was working-class, our parents worked in low paid jobs, our father as a ships' rigger and our mother doing domestic service.[21] For many Scottish emigrants to Australia, migration was an 'escape solution', particularly for urban families like ours who, with four children to provide for and struggling to make ends meet, saw in Australia an opportunity for a better life.[22]

With our move to Australia our family largely left behind them, what Hearn describes as, the pervasive social category of Scottish national identity. The 'implicit and

naturalised social reproduction' of Scottishness that suffused our social and material environment at home in Edinburgh was no longer available to exert the symbolic reinforcement of Scottish identity. Many of the little things, 'jokes, advertisements, street names, weather reports, and so on, which assume the presence of nations' were no longer part of our day to day lives. Nor were we any longer part of what David McCrone refers to as the 'social template' of Scottishness - 'the plethora of associations and organisations … the civil institutional apparatus' - that sustains ideas about nation and national identity.[23]

What we did have, what we brought with us, was our songs and family singing. Those songs, that were part of a family tradition and a broader Scottish musical tradition of singing at home, served to link us to Scotland and to one another. Like many other Scottish immigrants to Australia we performed our Scottishness largely for ourselves.[24] We did not participate to any large extent in Scottish events nor belong to Scottish groups, but rather, focused inwardly on the suburban nuclear family. That is not to suggest that we were generally socially insular as new migrants, far from it. Our first few years resident in a migrant hostel in Melbourne brought us into contact with other British and European migrants, and there was a lively social life within the hostel and with other immigrant and Australian friends that our parents met through work, and families associated with us as children. When we moved to our suburban house, that pattern of social life with the older established friends and our new neighbours continued. That first house in Melbourne remained the family home for 30 or so years until our mother, then a widow, moved into a smaller unit nearby. By then all of the children, myself, three older sisters, and a younger brother born in Australia, had left home and established lives and families of our own. The family gatherings that had in the early days been centred on the family home gradually shifted to gatherings at our oldest sister's house and over time extended to my other sisters' places.

Now, 54 years since we arrived in Australia, both of our parents have passed away, and the family comprises three generations of their offspring, several of whom, including myself live far from Melbourne. There are still occasions when many of us get together,

significant birthdays, weddings and so on. My sisters and I will sometimes break into an old song or two when we are together, and some of the old songs come forth when there is a new grandchild to entertain, but much of the singing that was such a feature of our family life for decades, both here and in Scotland, has diminished over recent years, as the family has become more geographically dispersed. It has become more of a 'special event' rather than part of the taken-for-granted everyday life. Where it retains its particular salience is for my sisters, brother and I. Yet we, and the subsequent Australian born generations of children in the family, continue to share a strong bond through the family songs that formed the core of our family entertainments for five decades in Australia.

The pattern of family focused Scottishness that characterised our family life reflects the picture painted by recent research on post-war Scottish migrants to Australia by Hammerton. His study of Scottish migrants draws from a larger project based on the oral and written testimony of some 1,700 post-war British migrants, of which, approximately 330 were Scottish informants.[25] His research evidence points to the fact that processes of acculturation through participation in Scottish cultural and social organisations played a far less important role in the lives of post-war Scottish migrants than might be assumed. He argues that the mere existence of such organisations tells us little about Scottish-Australian migrant identity, and that 'their heritage role as nurturers of enduring Scottish national identity among new migrants' can be easily overestimated.[26] His evidence from the personal testimony of the Scottish migrants supports his claim that migrants' Scottish identity was played out in the family rather than in group associations and organisations. The centrality of family in the migrant experience, Hammerton also suggests, underscores how migrant identities can be 'influenced by family dynamics as much as attachment to national heritage and loyalty'.[27]

The dominant theme that emerges from the migrants' stories in both the Scottish and larger British group is that of the 'quest for family'.[28] Whether it is the pain and guilt associated with the family left behind or the focus on creating a new family in Australia, family themes dominate. As was the case for my family, the post-war British migrants

came to Australia to seek a better life for themselves and their families, and their stories emphasise their determination to create a new, successful family in the new country. Typically this life project is viewed as an 'epic struggle' in the early years that brought its rewards through some measure of material success over time. For these post-war British migrants, theirs was a 'battlers' struggle that came to be seen as successful in terms of establishing a family and material improvement. Such 'success' was also often seen as a vindication of their decision to migrate.[29] My parents too, were very clear that their decision to migrate, and the benefits that they anticipated for family life, was a good thing to have done, and they were grateful for the opportunity that migration to Australia offered. This positive attitude also comes through in Hammerton's evidence where respondents expressed their commitment to their decision to migrate to Australia, at the same time being equally proud of their Scottishness. They were proud of the family that they had established and the life that they had in Australia. They felt they had made a contribution to Australia and expressed gratitude for the opportunity to build their families and lives here.[30]

The early years in Australia were, however, not easy. The post-war migration propaganda overtures to the British to come to Australia presented migration as a 'relatively easy matter, likely to have minimal strain on the family's well-being'.[31] But the reality of their new life in Australia was not the untroubled adaptation that might have been anticipated. Their stories emphasise themes of intense homesickness, 'insecurity, trauma and loss of family in the home society and the trials of alienation, adjustment, rejection and struggle to prevail in the new'.[32] The bulk of British migrants, like my family, 'experienced the shock and challenge of 'the new' ', not only upon arrival but also associated with their departure and the long ship voyage. For them, the leaving, the arriving and the new place brought 'the potential to transform their identity and national loyalties as much as their life fortunes'.[33] For many, the decision to migrate was 'an escape solution'. Most came from working class backgrounds and their financial situation was often 'precarious'. In the case of my family, who arrived in Australia with few material resources and no social support networks, the shock of the 'new', particularly in the form of migrant hostel accommodation for a family of six in half a

nissen hut in the outer suburbs of Melbourne, was immediate.[34] Our parents found work in relatively poorly paid occupations with all of their resources devoted to basic necessities and sustaining a family. With four young children to be cared for and schooled, there were few holidays or luxuries. For many migrants, a significant part of their early struggle, as it was for my family, 'was to scrape together the income to escape from the primitive hostel housing'.[35] It took us three and half years to make that move.

For us, as with other migrants, the possibility of any return travel to the homeland was 'extremely remote'. The combined effects of distance and expense of return travel, and 'the long-term project of establishing a new home tended to loosen bonds with the old family', with greater emphasis placed on creating a new family in the new place.[36] Like others, our contact with the family back in Scotland was sustained primarily through the exchange of letters and family photographs. For many, the remoteness from the homeland family and the pride associated with building a new extended family came to serve as 'compensation for what was lost'. Together with the long-term creation of a new family, a common emotional strategy for coping with family loss was 'the symbolic attachment and idealization' of what was left behind, particularly the family that was left behind.[37] Much of the emotional pain of loss and longing for the homeland was bound up in memories - especially memories of past family life and particularly those memories associated with childhood.[38] Migrants' memories were 'usually structured within a larger memory of family history, invariably stretching back well before the decision to leave'.[39]

In this, our family's experience is mirrored closely. Woven throughout our daily family life in Australia were the stories, anecdotes and jokes, associated with our earlier life in Scotland - stories about granny and grandpa, our uncles, the neighbours, visits to Princes Street and family outings in grandpa's car, the clothes we wore and the jumpers that mum knitted. These lively and colourful cameos of our lives were told and retold to us and then to the grandchildren. Together with the stories and the recountings were the family photographs, and the family songs and family concerts that also brought our

previous family life into our Australian kitchen and lounge room. Memories of the migration experience itself, and of the early years of settlement in Australia also played a large part in the migrants' stories, as they did in our family. These 'well rehearsed iconic stories' of a previous family life, and the experience of migration and early settlement in Australia by the parents of migrant families also became fashioned into the stories of their children.[40] Like in our family, our parents' 'iconic' stories became our own; their memories became our memories and became part of our family story.

As these studies of post-war British migrants demonstrate, the 'quest for family', in both Australia and for those left behind 'did much to shape their lives and is now at the centre of their memories'.[41] These Australian studies that highlight the importance of family, memory and homeland for migrants, accord with other accounts of other transnational family networks and attachments. The quest for family in the migrant experience has been explored by Mary Chamberlain and Selma Leydesdorff in their account of transnational families, memories and narratives. They describe families as the key 'sites for belonging' in the migrant experience through which an 'imaginary unity' between the homeland and the new is constructed. It is in this quest for kin and community that families serve as the sites through which a migrant family may seek its identity.[42]

For migrants, that quest is typically an ongoing one - 'a lifelong uncertainty about the nature and location of 'home' '.[43] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff point out that the experience of migrating does not end at 'the point of disembarkation' but continues through a migrant's life, demanding 'constant adjustment and appraisal'.[44] The experience of migration is never complete. It is a constant process of adjustment, of responding and accommodating to the new and linking the past with the present. Migration establishes what Chamberlain and Leydesdorff describe as a 'continuing dialogue' between the old and the new. In that 'continuing dialogue' families play an important role in mediating the past and the present, and in 'the continuing emotional adjustments in which most migrant experience is embroiled and implicated'.[45] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff's particular interest is in the role of memory in this continuing dialogue. Here, the sense of place and belonging, so acutely felt by migrants,

is 'more often than not located in the imaginary and in memory'.[46] As with the British migrants, and for my family, memories of home, family and song played a crucial role in responding and accommodating to the experience of migration.

Migration and Memory

Chamberlain and Leydesdorff suggest that migrants, 'perhaps more than many people, are made by their memories of their birthplace, their homeland, those left behind'.[47] In migrant families, those memories, deployed to construct 'coherent narratives of the self and kin', also serve to keep the 'memory of past values and cultural patterns alive'.[48] Memories, both collective and individual, also play a role in shaping the lived cultures of migrants' day-to-day lives. As Shelemay's study demonstrates, memories can play a crucial role in both constituting and perpetuating the expressive culture of migrant families and communities.[49] Memories also play an important part in identity - in our perception of ourselves and others. As John Storey remarks, 'a large part of who we are seems to belong to the past, that is, our sense of self seems grounded in our 'roots'. Our autobiographical narratives are primarily sustained by memory'.[50] For migrants, whose personal and cultural stability has been made uncertain, memories can take on a particular significance. Migrant memories are, according to Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 'necessarily implicated in the negotiations' - the continuing adjustments and appraisals - that characterise migrant life.[51]

While memories of the past are central to migrant identity, Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, Shelemay, and Storey emphasise that memories are contextualised, and mediated by the particular circumstances in which they are recalled and recounted. They base key aspects of their analysis of memory on Maurice Halbwachs' view of memory as part of shared, social recollections where 'the individual remembers by placing himself in the perspective of the group'.[52] This idea of memory as social and interpersonal highlights the importance of context, such as that of family. It stresses, as

Daniel Schacter does, that accounts of memory must 'examine the environment in which retrieval occurs just as carefully as the past events to which the memory refers'.[53] Halbwachs refers to this as the 'localization of memory', the specific contexts in which memories are recalled and recounted. Of these, Halbwachs identifies the central role of the family (and religious life) 'as the collectives most salient in shaping individual memory'.[54] Shelemay's study of American Jewish song traditions examines both family and religious life - the synagogue and the home - as sites associated with the transmission of musical memories. While the synagogue was clearly an important context for the transmission of the songs, memories of, and those associated with the songs were 'integrally linked to the family unit'. Families not only played a major role in the transmission of the songs but also 'in ensuring their place in memory'.[55]

Family memories, like all memories are also provisional, they need to be tested or confirmed by the memories of others. Halbwachs suggests that in the process of remembering, 'we appeal to witnesses to corroborate or invalidate as well as supplement what we somehow know already about an event'. Our memories are, in this way, 'supported by others' remembrances'.[56] Storey explains that it is not that individuals do not have their own memories, but that individual and collective memories are 'promiscuously entangled and intermingled'. In other words, family memory is as much collective as it is individual, where things that we have not experienced firsthand, and other people's memories are incorporated into our own. As Chamberlain and Leydesdorff point out, vicarious memories - those inherited through others - are a particular feature in family memories.[57] Storey uses the example of a family passing around the family photograph album to demonstrate how individual memories and family memories interact:

> "As the photographs are passed around, particular photographs cue memories for one family member, which are often then supported, elaborated or challenged by other members of the family. The discussions which ensue seek collectively to fix specific memories to particular photographs. In this way, family histories (and individual

histories within the family) are rehearsed, elaborated, and (temporarily) 'fixed'." (Storey, 2003, p 82)

But memories are not only socially constructed in particular contexts, such as that of the family, memories are also culturally constructed in a wider sense - what we remember is itself 'inescapably entangled in culture'.[58] Our memories are 'inherited' from family and also 'inherited' from cultural life. One of the ways in which memory is culturally constructed is in the collective memories that are embodied in the cultural world. Collective memories are anchored or embodied in artifacts, in literature, in music, in shrines and museums, in popular culture, and in the language, narratives, and songs of nations. These are what Pierre Nora refers to as 'sites of memory', something we can retrieve from external sources. To the extent that memories, embodied in artifacts like songs, are retrieved from these 'external' sources, they may act as a 'secondary memory' - a 'prosthesis-memory'.[59] Like the songs of a nation, or my family's songs, or the traditional songs of the Syrian Jews that were 'intentionally constructed sites for long-term storage of memories from the past', the songs themselves are sites of memories.[60]

In this way, songs can serve as 'cultural memories'. In Shelemay's study, the Jewish community's traditional songs in Brooklyn 'encode' historical cultural memories - memories of places, people and events past that reach backwards in time and geography to the homeland - linking the community to 'a long historical continuum'. In the context of the present, members of the community could 're-sing, re-hear and re-experience the past'.[61] These historical memories are shared by the community, even for those who have no direct knowledge of the events and people to which the songs refer. The songs 'serve as a device through which long-forgotten aspects of the past and information unconsciously carried can be evoked, accessed and remembered'.[62]

What Shelemay's study also reveals is how group and individual memories are forged in song performance. The performance of songs is a central mechanism for not only transmitting songs but also for reinforcing individual and community memory. Through song performance, individual memories overlap and intersect with collective memories.

Shelemay is concerned to demonstrate, not only how individual memory is given meaning within a social setting, but also that the intersection between individual and group memory is inseparable. In the performance of the songs, Shelemay posits, 'individual memory joins with and is transformed through the experience of the community … individual remembering is both a source for and transformed by collective memory'.[63] Shelemay argues that both individual and collective memories can occupy the same 'expressive space', within and through song. The songs provide 'a cultural space in which individual and collective memories may both be mediated and juxtaposed'.[64]

That 'cultural space' which songs provide is not to be construed as something fixed in the past. While songs may serve as 'sites' of memory, they are also themselves shaped by the act of remembering them, mediated by the contexts in which they are recalled and performed. Storey's analysis, drawn from Halbwachs, emphasises that memories are not static. What we remember, how we remember and how we express it is an act of meaning making and interpretation, it is 'always a practice of reconstruction and representation'. In the act of remembering, memories are 'forgotten, revised, reorganized, updated as they undergo rehearsal, interpretation, and retelling'. Memories (or the songs that are the sites of them) are not fixed in the past - to be preserved and recalled intact - they are 'actively and continually constructed in the context of the present'. Memories do not take us into the past, rather they bring the past into the present; and 'in order for our memories to remain meaningful to us, they have to make sense in the context of the present'. To study memory, therefore, Storey concludes, is not to study the past, but the past as it exists in the present. It is memory's 'power to use the past *to order* the present' that makes it a considerable force in shaping both personal and collective identity.[65]

This idea of the 'power of the past to order the present' is particularly salient for any consideration of the role of the past, tradition and memory in migrant life, and for the analysis of my family's song performance. The idea that my family's past was deployed to order the present, through the vehicle of song, is one that informs much of this study.

As will be further explored in the chapters to follow, the Scottish songs, as sites of memory, played a significant role in constituting and perpetuating the lived culture of family life in both Scotland and Australia. Through song performance, family and cultural memory were recalled, recounted and made meaningful. In that process of recalling and recounting, a family narrative took shape. That narrative was one in which our cultural resources - Scottish songs - shaped our family story as much as that story was shaped by us. As Anthony Cohen has argued, the power of cultural forms 'lies in providing us with the means to think' - to locate and depict ourselves. But culture not only mediates how we make sense of the world and our place in it, it also shapes the ways in which we articulate and express those meanings - how we remember and tell the stories of our lives.

Narrative and Culture

Memories are deeply embedded in culture, in symbolic structures of thought and thinking, and in cultural symbols and practices. In this way, culture not only shapes our memories, but also how we recall and recount them. Chamberlain and Leydesdorff argue that in the 'imaginative' act of remembering and recounting the narratives of our lives, the individual draws upon the symbols, plots and themes that are embedded in culture and language:

> "While the personal narrative may be seen as the property of the individual - intrinsic to and defining of the individual - the plot that it follows and the themes that are woven through it may reflect and conform to the cultural narratives to which any one individual is exposed at any one time." (Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 230)

Echoing Somers' analysis of personal and public narrative, Chamberlain and Leydesdorff's account of memory and personal narrative is grounded in the idea that it is through narrative that we understand and make sense for ourselves of the world around

us in time and place. As Somers has argued, 'people are guided to act in certain ways, and not others, on the basis of the projections, expectations, and memories derived from a multiplicity but ultimately limited repertoire of available … (cultural) … narratives'.[66] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, like Somers, recognise the role that cultural narratives play in our personal narratives and identity, noting that the extent to which our personal narratives 'conform or fail to conform' to the outside world is 'the principle mechanism through which a sense of identity is secured, acknowledged and recognized by others'.[67]

Both Somers, and Chamberlain and Leydesdorff emphasise the crucial importance of context in shaping our narrative identities, both the immediate social context and the wider social and cultural context. Somers, for example, points out that narratives are not incorporated into the self in any direct way, rather they are mediated 'through the enormous spectrum of social and political institutions and practices that constitute our social world', including social class and gender.[68] Our location in time and place is also an important part of 'the larger matrix of relations' that shape our lives:

> "Narrative identities are constituted by a person's temporally and spatially variable *place* in culturally constructed stories composed of (breakable) rules, (variable) practices, binding (and unbinding) institutions, and the multiple plots of family, nation, or economic life." (Somers, 1994, p 625)

As narratives are used to define who we are and how we act, 'this 'doing' will in turn produce new (personal) narratives and hence, new actions'.[69] In this continuous revision of the self, Chamberlain and Leydesdorff add, individuals may 'dip and weave' among their narrative choices as the circumstances of their lives shift over time and place. In other words, our narrative selves are not necessarily coherent and consistent, but 'multi-layered and polyvocal'.[70] Our personal narratives get revised and amended in response to change, and the migration experience is one that mediates and shapes them. Migration itself brings 'interruptions to life narratives' that 'require resequencing, remodelling and reinterpreting'.[71] It is perhaps the effect that migration has on migrants' sense of self that accounts for the particular salience of story and narrative in migrant life. As Alistair

Thomson has suggested, migrant stories have always been a central part of the migration experience:

"… in the imagination of possible futures; during the physical process of passage; and as migrants have lived with and made sense of the consequences of their migration. At each stage life stories articulate the meanings of experience and suggest ways of living." (Alistair Thomson, 1999, p 35)

In producing the narrative of our lives memories clearly play a key role. We select and structure our memories and experiences, and recall, recount and record them through narrative. While memories 'refer to and reflect the imaginative structures of the social mind', Chamberlain and Leydesdorff emphasise that this is not to suggest that our memories and personal narratives are culturally predetermined. Rather they are mediated by culture. The symbolic structures of thought and thinking and cultural symbols that are embedded in language and cultural narrative provide us with the tools and frameworks for recall, and the narrative devices through which our own stories are told. Chamberlain and Leydesdorff suggest that it is here that language is perhaps the most crucial in informing the 'imaginative act of remembering'. Language, 'to a large extent sculpts and makes available thought and memory'. Language and narrative affect how we think about, express and structure memories. The ways in which we recall and recount our memories, the 'metaphors, rhetoric and sayings … all signify values and priorities'. They reflect ways of looking at and interpreting the world, 'linguistic turns that provide a shorthand for a particular cultural worldview'.[72]

Chamberlain and Leydesdorff argue that to understand the fuller import of any narrative it is important not only to consider 'what' story is being told but also the 'way' in which the story is told. It is not only the content of a narrative that conveys meaning but the also the 'form' or 'genre' that a story takes. Narrative form is drawn from the different kinds of culturally specific narratives and narrative devices that a culture makes available.[73] These rhetorical devices, which in many cases are derived from popular culture, music, art and literature, provide the plots and themes through which personal

narratives are constructed. As nations or cultures may be characterised by the symbols and narratives through which they are imagined, the plots and themes we select and through which we recount our lives relies on the narrative devices and genre embedded in the culture:

"… what we relate and how we relate it is necessarily prefigured by the tools at our disposal, by the frameworks for recall and by the narratives through which a society (or a nation) tells the story of itself." (Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 230)

Oral tradition (and oral history) are no exceptions. They too rely on the narrative devices and on genre embedded in the culture.[74] In Shelemay's study, for example, the sharing and transmission of musical traditions through the performance of particular types of songs provided a means through which individuals, families and the community told the story of itself. These songs can be seen as culturally specific 'rhetorical devices', providing the plots and themes through which the story of the community and its past were remembered, recalled and recounted. The songs were 'compound aural memories' - 'a vital part of life as lived, connecting moments in the present to broader themes and historical memory'.[75] I will be arguing that the Scottish songs in our family served as cultural 'rhetorical devices', providing key plots and themes through which the narrative of our family was remembered, recalled and recounted. Moreover, our songs were 'compound aural memories', sites of not only individual and family memories, but also collective historical and cultural memories. The tools and resources of language and cultural narrative that were encoded in Scottish songs connected us to broader cultural themes and historical memory. Our songs provided an 'expressive space' in which individual, family and collective cultural memories could be 'mediated and juxtaposed.' In the performance of our songs, as in Storey's family photograph album example, family histories, individual memories within the family and cultural memories were rehearsed, elaborated, and (temporarily) fixed.

If the notion of genre serves to emphasise 'how' a story is told, then Chamberlain and Leydesdorff argue that attention to the form that a narrative takes can reveal insights into

cultural priorities and values. In the context of migration, the family narrative can 'reveal how migrants reflect on their lives and on the families that surround them'; a process that 'often (and often only)' is expressed 'in the emotional and imaginative world of narrative'. In the continuing dialogue that migration establishes, the family narrative also plays an important role in the 'continuing emotional adjustments in which most migrant experience is embroiled and implicated'. Attention to narrative allows us to 'engage with memories, with what is recalled and how those memories translate into stories people tell about their passages through their lives'.[76]

Music: Migrant Identity, Place and Home

The family story, or narrative, to which Chamberlain and Leydesdorff refer, takes many forms, not the least of which is the narrative expressed through the language of music and song. The special role of music in expressing and shaping migrant memories and identities has been the subject of recent studies in migration and identity. Writers, such as John Connell and Chris Gibson, Slobin, Martin Stokes, Shelemay, and Deborah James, identify music as one of the key ways in which migrants respond and accommodate to the new experiences and environment they find themselves in:

> "Migrants, refugees and their children all experience, to varying degrees, senses of displacement and dislocation, mediating memories of the people and places of home with the realities of their new surroundings. Music is one element of this experience. It provides a mechanism by which 'the cultural baggage' of 'home' can be transported through time and space, and transplanted into a new environment, assisting in the maintenance of culture and identity." (Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 161)[77]

As noted above, Slobin suggests that music is central to the diasporic experience. It is a cultural possession that 'people find it impossible to live without as they move from

place to place, assembling and reassembling past and present identities'.[78] Music links homeland and hereland 'with an intricate network of sound'. Whether it is through 'the burnished memory of childhood songs, the packaged passion of recordings, or the steady traffic of live bands, people identify themselves strongly, even principally, through their music'.[79]

These and other studies underscore how music can provide a key resource for migrants in their efforts to locate themselves and their identity in new surroundings. As Connell and Gibson note, 'music remains an important cultural sphere in which identities are affirmed, challenged, taken apart and reconstructed'.[80] Music can also bring direct 'voice' to the experience of migration. The music of many migrants groups involves the themes of:

> "… solitude, homesickness, loss and nostalgia, unemployment, racism (and other hardships) alongside the longing for their converse - kin, community, familiar food and sights, and a place in society." (Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 161)

In the migrant's quest for family, kin and community and a sense of home, life experience and musical performance can overlap in fundamental ways.[81] In James' study of the migrant women of the Northern Province of South Africa the women used music and dance to 'shape their choices and structure their lives'. The migrant women, scattered in the suburbs as domestic workers away from their rural families, developed their own version of traditional musical style, kiba, which they performed together in local dance team displays and competitions. The migrant women took the traditional form and made it their own. As newly autonomous wage-earning women, their performance emphasised independence and emancipation, in contrast to the 'stay-at-home women', whose performance articulated their 'domestic, dependent status, and their position within a separately defined female realm'.[82] Rather than being limited by their traditional rural social roles, the migrant women's performance of kiba 'activated a new world of experience, involving an active reconstruction of group cohesiveness in the new urban context'.[83] Kiba also served as a manifestation of the migrant women's

common experiences in the urban setting. Through the performance of their own version of the tradition, they created and affirmed a new sense of home. For them, 'musical performance was a crucial means by which this home was created'.[84]

For the Syrian Jews in Shelemay's study, life experience and musical performance were also intimately intertwined. Family life, in particular, was central to the survival of the musical tradition, for inculcating a love of music in children, and connecting members of the community to one another and to a shared heritage. The song repertory 'both reflected and shaped the experiences and sensibilities of the community that sustained it'.[85] Although the songs (pizmonim) were 'technically paraliturgical hymns that praise God', they were, in practice, multifunctional and were performed at a variety of family, social and religious occasions in the Syrian community, incorporating 'multiple levels of signification'. They were used to mark occasions large and small, formal and informal within the Jewish life cycle, commemorating and documenting births, comings of age and other rites of passage. They also performed an educative and cultural function 'revisiting aspects of Jewish law and observance practices valued by the Syrian community'.[86] That community shared a 'sound world' where the songs were not bracketed off from lived experience but 'absorbed into the fabric of everyday life'. Sung as part of religious ritual, and in family and community events, the songs sustained 'memories of meaningful moments, continuities and a celebration of positive human experience'.[87]

In the migrant experience, music can also serve to 'anchor and validate the present'. Shelemay's study highlights how the perpetuation of a musical culture provided a crucial vehicle through which a community maintained 'its Middle Eastern past whilst keeping its equilibrium in an ever-changing American setting'.[88] She suggests that the rapidly shifting life of the Syrian Jewish diaspora has been 'stabilized through perpetuating a unified vision through songs'.[89] As aspects of their culture underwent change or were discarded, the songs assumed a greater significance, and were instrumental within the social life of the community, assuming an increasingly important role as 'both celebration of and an anchor for the lives'. Through the traditional song

repertory that they 'nurtured', they sought to preserve bonds of family, community and tradition. Their performance was an important agent in building family, community and a sense of home in a community that had undergone 'extraordinary dislocation'. Song performances gave voice to:

> "… the continued vitality of a shared identity that has survived conflict and transcended political realities. Syrian Jews do not sing about the dislocations, migrations and violence that have marked their history - they sing in spite of it." (Shelemay, 1998, p 228)

As Shelemay's and James' studies reveal, the quest for home and identity 'may motivate the use of images of origin and tradition'.[90] The need for a sense of connection with tradition and 'origins' seems to characterise much of the music of migrants. For many migrants, and for my family, it is the music of the 'homeland' that provides those sources of tradition and origin, and creates crucial linkages with a distant homeland.[91] As Connell and Gibson observe, 'music is one audible example, along with language, of group solidarity and common ancestry'.[92] They note, for example, that for the Irish, who have had a long history of leaving their homelands, their music is 'replete with references to loss and longing, exile and emigration'.[93] That traditional music 'serves to stimulate collective memories of traditional Irish culture, thus becoming a crucial link with notions of heritage'.[94] These types of observations can also be applied to the music of other migrants groups, particularly the Scots who are often described as 'a nation of emigrants', and whose song traditions are woven throughout with themes of exile and absence and yearning for home.[95] In the case of my family's songs, those themes are also manifest in elegaic sentiments associated with the highlands and Scottish history. In the two examples below that were the sources of two family songs, one speaks of a longing for a highland home, and the other speaks of a longing for a lost Jacobite cause:

The Green Hills Of Tyrol (or A Scottish Soldier) [96] © James Kerr Ltd administered by Essex Music Australia

There was a soldier, a Scottish soldier,
Who wandered far away and soldiered far away,

There was none bolder, with good broad shoulders,

He fought in many a fray and fought and won.

He's seen the glory, he's told the story,

Of battles glorious and deeds victorious.

But now he's sighing, his heart is crying,

To leave those green hills of Tyrol.

Chorus
Because those green hills are not Highland hills
Or the Island's hills, they're not my land's hills,
As fair as these green foreign hills may be
They are not the hills of home.

And now this soldier, this Scottish soldier,

Who wandered far away and soldiered far away,

Sees leaves are falling, and death is calling,

And he will fade away, in that far land.

He called his piper, his trusty piper,

And bade him sound away, a pibroch sad to play,

Upon a hillside, a Scottish hillside

Not on those green hills of Tyrol.

And now this soldier, this Scottish soldier,

Will wander far no more, and soldier far no more,

Now on a hillside, a Scottish hillside,

You'll see that piper play this soldier home.

He's seen the glory, he's told the story,

Of battles glorious, and deeds victorious.

The bugles cease now, he is at peace now,

Far from these green hills of Tyrol.

The Skye Boat Song [97]

Chorus
Speed bonnie boat like a bird on the wing,
Onward the sailors cry.

Carry the lad that's born to be king,
Over the sea to Skye.

Loud the winds howl, loud the waves roar,
Thunderclaps rend the air.
Baffled our foes, stand by the shore,
Follow they will not dare.

Though the waves heave, soft will ye sleep,
Ocean's a royal bed.
Rocked in the deep, Flora will keep
Watch by your weary head.

Many's the lad fought on that day,
Well the claymore did wield.
When the night came, silently lain
Dead on Culloden field.

Burned are our homes, exile and death
Scatter the loyal men.
Yet e'er the sword cool in the sheath,
Charlie will come again.

Connell and Gibson's view, with regard to much of this music of the homeland, is that it can be seen as a kind of 'romantic nationalism … invoking populist visions of idyllic lifestyles and harmonious communities, with only tenuous relationships to the contexts that created diasporas'.[98] It has also been noted that migrant groups draw on music other than that of the homeland that has a more generalised link to tradition, where the music, as Stokes suggests, has a sentimental connection to an 'imagined' rural ideal or evokes an 'uncorrupted moral order'.[99] Connell and Gibson similarly make the case that it is the 'simple virtues, certainties and dichotomies' of country and western music that has given it a massive global following with migrant and refugee groups.[100] They also refer to other studies that refer to the way in which migrants' music can provide 'crucial senses of nostalgia (even for 'homes' never directly experienced) and identity'. Through music,

'the past, and memories of distant places, are never entirely lost' - even where the past is shaped by a 'nostalgia without memory'.[101]

Although not a feature in all of the music that Connell and Gibson, and Stokes deal with, the motif of nostalgia, or a sentimental return to an idealised past, remains a recurring theme in migration studies. It is a theme to which this study will return in the context of family singing, but some general points can be made here. The songs in Shelemay's study, for example, can in many ways be seen as examples of the kind of 'romantic nationalism' that Connell and Gibson refer to. The community's song traditions, as Shelemay describes them, served as powerful vehicles for reminiscences, including the nostalgic yearning of a return to an idealised past, where the songs 'speak deeply and emotionally of a desire to return from diaspora to the Jewish homeland'.[102] She also notes that the songs construct a history that is incomplete and valedictory, idealised and selective, and that they are also 'silent' about current national and political issues. Moreover, as the community's attachments to their specific homeland gradually weakened, there were indications that those specific ties were 'slowly being supplanted by a connection to a delocalized and, perhaps idealized 'Oriental' past'.[103] Yet, the songs did much more than this. Their meanings were not fixed in the past, but had a living and contemporary place in the community's life. It is how the songs were *used*, their social uses, that reveal what those songs meant to the community.

For other migrant groups the 'use of images of origin and tradition' in traditional music and dance are also not just simple continuities with traditional culture, not a sign of 'nostalgia', but in some cases 'a project of social advancement'.[104] In James' study, she challenges the view that the traditional music and dance of migrant groups is conservative and backward looking, diverting attention away from more pressing social and economic issues. The songs and dances from the women's rural homeland, she argues, were not 'anachronistic survivals' form from the past, but 'building blocks' in the creation of home and identity in the new urban setting:

"The stressing of the importance of 'the tradition of our home people' by migrant kiba singers does not contradict or outweigh, but rather complements and gives shape to, the equally emphatic stressing of the importance of … the modern way." (James, 2000, p 190)

In their new urban setting, the women drew upon the shared and familiar - their rural homeland cultural resources of traditional song and dance - in assembling a new migrant identity. They drew on the customary as a kind of 'given' which they changed and adapted in constructing a new sense of shared home and identity. While the structures and rhythms of their music and dance retained much of the tradition, the women invested the songs with new lyrics that provided a 'space and opportunity for commenting on present day situations and predicaments'.[105] In the process, they created a new genre of music that, while drawing upon traditional male music forms, was used to define the women in their new urban setting. Through kiba, the migrant women negotiated and created new social roles that 'transcended the domestic and rural preoccupations and marginalised status of women's performance by claiming to be part of a genre which was previously the exclusive preserve of male migrants'.[106] For the migrant women, music and dance were not merely 'passive reflectors of already constituted social relationships and identities, but play a role in formulating and cementing these'.[107]

James' study highlights a crucial aspect of the way in which music, and the music of migrants in particular, can be both a source of connection to tradition and origins, *and* a means of constructing the future, of articulating aspirations. Connell and Gibson suggest that a kind of ambiguity or duality is present in every migrant experience - between homes and destinations - and that migrant music 'epitomises dream and nostalgia combined'.[108] James' work also addresses this duality, but her argument is that the dual dimensions of 'dream' and 'nostalgia' can be mutually dependent - that one allows for the other. From this perspective, tradition itself *allows* for change and adaptation. As has previously been argued in this study, drawing from the past, tradition and custom, is not simply reducible to a nostalgia for things gone before. It is an active process of taking

from the past what may assist in making sense of the present. Drawing on the work of Terence Ranger, and Marshall Berman, James shapes a similar argument. She argues that the relationship between tradition and 'modernity' is not a stark contrast 'between a past of docile obedience to customary ways and a present of liberation and freedom'.[109] The migrant's links with custom and continuity do not make for something static and unchanging, but rather those links can serve to maintain a sense of identity and as a vehicle to 'modernity'. It is the search for identity, particularly for migrant groups, which thus motivates the use of images of origin and tradition:

"To be part of the modern world is to be involved in a process 'that destroys both the physical and social landscapes of our past and our emotional links with those lost worlds' but simultaneously to seek allegiance 'to ethnic, national, class and sexual groups which we hope will give us a firm identity'." (James, 2000, p 190, quoting Berman, 1982, p 35)

This interpretation of the relationship between tradition and identity means that the concept of tradition does not stand in opposition to modernity, nor does it reside in fixed forms of the past. Tradition, as David Atkinson has argued, is selective. It is a process in which the past is constructed or re-created in the present, where cultural forms are interpreted or reinterpreted. In this way, tradition 'expresses a relationship between the past and the present, which is both continuous and discontinuous, or both real and imaginary'.[110] Tradition matters because it allows a personal and affective engagement across time and space, to a sense of continuity expressed through symbolic form. The forms themselves are not where tradition lies, but rather, it is in their perceived connection with other times and other places that 'provides a cultural identity'.[111] As Paul Gilroy has similarly argued, tradition is a process rather than an end. It is a process that seeks 'neither to identify a lost past nor to name a culture of compensation that would restore access to it'. For migrant and diaspora groups, tradition is less about a common culture of pre-given forms, than it is about 'communicative relationships across time and space'. It is those acts of relationship that are the basis of 'identifications' rather than a fixed identity.[112]

For migrants, that search for identity, as Hammerton and others have observed, is often motivated by a lifelong uncertainty about the nature and location of 'home'. The role of music in identity formation and how music informs a sense of 'home' and 'community' has been the focus of the studies of migrant identities discussed in this chapter. For migrant groups, it is often through musical performance that images of homeland and hereland are 'enunciated, dramatised and maintained'.[113] Here, a sense of place, of home, is not just geography - it is a 'source of orientation and identification'.[114] 'Home', like 'nation' is symbolically constructed through the deep personal meanings that attach to it. It is a place of the mind, imagined and remembered through connections that span time and space. In that 'place of the mind' music plays an important role:

> "Popular music is an integral component of processes through which cultural identities are formed, both at personal and collective levels; moreover, 'the way people think about identity and music is tied to the way they think about places'."
> (Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 117, quoting Peter Wade, 2000, p 2)

Places, then, are not simply inert geographical settings for social and cultural activity. Places are 'socially and materially constructed, textually represented, thought about and reflected upon'.[115] In the construction of place and a sense of home, music can play a key role. It is one of the ways in which place is constructed, experienced or imagined. The relationship between music and place is, as Connell and Gibson note, a complex one. Musical practices themselves 'include whole constellations of social uses and meanings, with complex rituals and rules, hierarchies and systems of credibility that can be interpreted at many levels'.[116] Music is also 'linked to particular geographic sites, bound up in our everyday perceptions of place, and a part of the movements of people, products and cultures across space'.[117] At the same time places give credibility to music through claims to 'tradition', 'authenticity' and 'originality'. Myths of place can be constructed in music - the national and music hall songs of Scotland being a particularly relevant example in this study. Connell and Gibson also note that the diffusion of music has obvious links to migration, moving with migrants, made by migrants in their new homes, and also through global commercial distribution. In this way, music can link

widely dispersed diasporic groups that 'nourishes imagined communities' and 'traces links to distant and past places'.[118] And, as Harry Lauder's career attests, 'individuals can create transnational ties within their farflung diasporic communities and even beyond it'.[119]

Music, then, does not simply reflect or mark a place. Stokes suggests that music is socially meaningful largely because it 'provides means by which people recognise identities and places, and the boundaries which separate them'.[120] It is through music that we 'locate' ourselves. Music can define and construct spaces and places, creating 'notions of difference and social boundary'. It provides the means by which 'hierarchies of place are negotiated and transformed'. The places constructed through music can also 'organise hierarchies of a moral and political order'.[121] As Connell and Gibson point out, music has been exploited to serve the state, to rally support for political causes, to challenge prevailing orthodoxies, and to define alternative social, cultural or political values.[122]

By contrast, James' study provides a specifically local and community oriented example of how music and dance organised hierarchies of a moral order through the active reconstruction of small group cohesiveness - a theme that has particular relevance for my own family's song performance. Through music and dance the kiba performers 'constructed a moral community with common values and experiences'. Musical performance was used to give 'dramatic and visible shape' to a striving for a 'sense of solidarity and unity'.[123] Kiba was also used, in 'festivals of reparation' to heal ruptures between community members, with the performances invoking the imagery of 'visiting, hospitality and home'. The financial management of the kiba performances was also governed by a strong sense of 'moral correctness'. What James' work highlights is that in shared performance a sense of community and belonging is constructed:

> "It is thus within the immediacies of performance itself, and in the shared moral principles which govern the contexts where performance takes place, that a sense of a new community is created by *kiba*." (James, 2000, p 39)

As James' and Shelemay's studies demonstrate, musical images do not just reflect knowledge of places but, as Stokes argues 'perform them in significant ways'. Music and dance are not just static symbolic objects, they are 'a patterned context in which other things happen'.[124] Those 'other things' that happen within the patterned context of song performance is largely what this study is seeking to discover. For Shelemay, 'it is less the formal properties' of the songs that are meaningful 'than their connection to so many aspects of Syrian life'. She 'makes a strong case for an approach that privileges social event over formal structure' of music.[125] It is a position that accords considerable weight to the socially constructed meanings of music, while at the same time, as her extensive historical and cultural analysis of the songs makes clear, it is also one that takes into account what the songs bring to that social encounter. While Shelemay's work points to the different kinds of meanings that the 'same' songs can have in different social settings within the community through 'multiple levels of signification', it also stresses that the historical and cultural meanings that the songs encode interact with and inform their contemporary social meanings. The songs' social meanings have been mediated and shaped by the song traditions themselves, their uses in the context of family (and religious observance), and within the context of migration.

Migrants' Musical Choices

Although the mediating role of context in shaping local musical meanings is recognised and addressed explicitly in some of these studies, how and why different musical styles are embraced by migrant groups is affected by varied and complex factors, not all of which are fully understood:

> "Like migration itself, the processes acting on migrant musics - pushing, pulling, shaping and protecting it - are intense, varied and complex. As a result 'no one has formulated a worldwide viewpoint on the music in diaspora' and no straightforward view is possible." (Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 164, quoting Slobin, 1994, p 243)

One area that demonstrates the variety and complexity of music in the migrant experience is how migrant groups interact and negotiate with the music of the new 'dominant' culture into which they are placed. Studies have looked at degrees to which migrant music assimilates, resists, or borrows from the 'dominant' music culture:

> "Faced with a dominant culture, a group's music can resist or accommodate the all-pervasive sensibilities of the larger society. It can stay hidden within local confines, or move up in visibility, being noticed, or even celebrated by the commercial and governmental powers that be." (Slobin, 1994, p 245)

In some cases migrant groups might identify with the music of their new home, where it has a connection to a symbolic sense of 'home', or where it embodies aspirations of upward social mobility. What might be for some migrant groups 'a changing and unequal relationship with the world outside' may be 'controlled and symbolically dealt with' through music, where the outside world is 'domesticated' through music.[126] The music of the dominant culture may be adopted, but its meanings subverted, or homeland music may be asserted and transformed at the local level as a form of rejection against assimilation.[127] In many of these cases it is Middleton's process of 'articulation' that characterises the music of diaspora and migrant groups.[128] The incorporation and 'domestication', or rejection of musical difference can help to forge coalitions, it can also build boundaries. Many studies have focused on music's role in the active assertions of migrant identity and as a vehicle of ethnic, cultural or political agency or defiance.[129] Fewer studies have focused on the ways in which migrant groups use music in more benign ways, as might be said of the role of music in my family, and where the processes of 'articulation' are less directed towards class, religious or political assertion, than to group and cultural attachment in the context of migration.[130] As Shelemay comments:

> "Studies of other transnational musics have tended to emphasize the manner in which musical expression is a form of political agency, with music serving as a locus for political commentary and action against repressive agents … The Syrian case offered

here, in contrast, provides an example in which a transnational music serves as a locus for sustaining positive historical memories in the face of diasporization and the challenge of modern political conflicts." (Shelemay, 1998, p 90)

As noted by Connell and Gibson, and Stokes, music is seldom stable in contexts of social change, and it is rare for the music of migrant groups to remain unchanged 'fixed in the style of that community at the time of the migrants' decision to leave'. [131] Some degree of change, in lyrics and performance, is inevitable. Like music in the homeland, migrants' music is a product of synthesis and hybridity'.[132] The extent of musical conservation or dissolution, hybridity and change is influenced by such things as 'family loyalty, generational shifts, employment, class structures and personal preferences'.[133] While some degree of musical change is 'inevitable', as Connell and Gibson suggest, that change can be slow and incremental, as with the songs in Shelemay's study, and in the case of my family's songs that have changed little over decades**.** The reasons for this musical stability may be, as will be explored in subsequent chapters, a function of the very intimate role that music had in our family. Its strong connections to a specific family life produced an idiosyncratic musical form that was 'nurtured' over many years. In 'nurturing' the music we were also nurturing a sense of attachment to family and our Scottish heritage. In the face of change we sought to preserve bonds of family and tradition through music.

While music can provide crucial links with a distant homeland, and to tradition, origin and identity, migrants' attachments to the music of their homeland is not simply a badge of identity, whether that badge is attached by migrants themselves or ascribed by others. Slobin makes the point, for example, that the fact that 'the dominant culture focuses on expressive elements of diasporas to define them is only partly relevant to an internal sense of who and where we/they are'.[134] For migrants themselves, their musical choices mirror more, the complexity of their experiences that 'complicate seemingly simple moments of selections as indicators of affiliation'. The music they choose marks:

"… subtle distinctions of ours/theirs, mine/ours, yours/mine, yesterday/today, here/there, and others that bring in gender and generation. Limited incomes, limited options, internal division …" (Slobin, 1994, p 244)

That migrants' musical choices are not simple 'indicators of affiliation' is well demonstrated by the studies described here and others that this study examines. It is a means by which migrant groups respond and accommodate to the new experiences and environment they find themselves in. These migrant studies attest to the variety of motivations for drawing on homeland music, motivations that, as Jonathan Hearn has pointed out, are not simply a matter of self-categorisation, but a means for making sense of personal circumstances. The music of the homeland may become particularly salient in making sense of the experience of migration and in linking the past with the present, and in linking 'nostalgia' with 'dream'. It can play an important part in the continuing dialogue that migration establishes between the old and the new. In that continuing dialogue, homeland music can be a crucial source of memories that migrant groups use to construct 'coherent narratives of the self and kin'. This is the kind of salience that homeland music had for my family, shaped by the specific conditions of their relationship with Scotland and their experience in Australia.

The factors affecting how and why different musical styles are adopted by migrant groups are, it would seem, as varied as the different destinations that 'provided different outcomes and expectations'.[135] As Connell and Gibson remark, 'the specifics of location - economic, social, political and cultural' are 'critical to both links with home and broader processes of cultural stability and change'.[136] In general, however, the focus in many migrant studies has been with the experiences of people who have moved to a new country that is culturally different from their homeland. Such studies have 'emphasized social struggles to achieve cultural recognition and a cultural sense of self, as well as economic security and rights to full political participation … Far less attention has typically been given to the cultural identity of those who shift from the 'homeland' to a country that is culturally similar'.[137] In the context of British migrants to Australia, the 'marked cultural similarity of the British to the mainstream white Australian identity

undoubtedly accounts for much of the scholarly neglect'.[138] As Hammerton has argued, the evidence from the recent British post-war migrant studies paints a much more complex picture of migrant adjustment than such similarity would suggest.[139] In the case of British migrants to Australia, the 'challenge of the new' and the quest for family, home and belonging may be more 'nuanced' than in other migrant experience, but no less central to their migrant identity.[140]

These recent studies of British migrants to Australia also highlight 'the complex ways in which the experience of migration can inform the subtle process of identity formation in daily life', particularly in the context of family life.[141] As Hammerton has argued, family dynamics can influence migrant identities as much as attachment to national heritage and loyalty.[142] In the following chapters, I will be arguing that a particular family dynamic, revealed in song performance, articulated and reinforced attachment to both family and heritage. Through the performance of Scottish songs we constructed a narrative of family, kin and home that was expressed through our Scottishness. It was through our Scottish songs that we constructed and told the story of our family. In this way, our family attachment was expressed us much through our Scottishness, as our Scottishness was expressed through our family attachment. The songs provided that 'expressive space' where both family tradition and cultural tradition, family memory and cultural memory, could come together in a complementary way. To paraphrase Deborah James: our sense of home and identity was invoked not simply through drawing on the past and tradition, but also through the active reinforcement of family cohesiveness in the new context of life in Australia.

---

[1] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 5; and Brettell, 2008, p 136.

[2] Brettell, 2008, p 124.

[3] See Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004; Hammerton, 2004 and 2006 (a); Hammerton and Thomson, 2005; Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001; Fortier, 2000; Foner, 1997 (a); Ganguly, 1992; Brettell, 2003.

---

[4] See Brettell, 2008. Also see Connell and Gibson, 2004; Shelemay, 1998; James, 2000; Stokes, 1997; Slobin, 1994 and 2003; Clayton, et al, 2003; Leyshon, et al, 1998; Hesmondhalgh and Negus, 2002.

[5] Hammerton, 2004, p 271.

[6] Brettell, 2008, p 125.

[7] Hearn, 2007, p 657.

[8] Brettell, 2008, p 133.

[9] Brettell, 2008, p 135.

[10] Slobin, 2003, p 288, quoting Gilroy, 1993, p 191.

[11] Brettell, 2008, p 121, quoting Appadurai and Breckenridge, 1989, p 1.

[12] Gupta and Ferguson, 1992, p 11. See also Fortier, 2000.

[13] Brettell, 2003, p 26. See also in this chapter, Hammerton, 2004 and 2006 (a); Hammerton and Thomson, 2005; Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001; Alistair Thomson, 1999; Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004.

[14] See Ochs and Capps (1996), who discuss forms of personal narrative that include music and song.

[15] Shelemay, 1998, p 12.

[16] Slobin, 1994, p 243.

[17] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 230.

[18] Devine, 1999, p 570.

[19] McCrone, 2001, p 9.

[20] See Houston and Knox, 2001, p 462, for Council housing building figures.

[21] See McCrone, 2001, p 18, for details of Scottish occupational characteristics.

[22] See Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 230.

[23] McCrone, 2001, p 47.

[24] For the Scottish tradition of singing in the home, see Finlay, 2004, p 136; Fraser and Morris, 1990, p 259; West, 2006, pp 120-123. In the Australian context, see Bain, 2001, p 672. There is also some evidence regarding family singing in Emily Lyle's recordings of Scots song in Australia (Lyle, 1976).

[25] The main output from the larger British study is the book, *Ten Pound Poms: Australia's Invisible Migrants*, by Hammerton and Thomson, 2005. Hammerton's discussion of the Scottish migrants is in Hammerton, 2006 (a). See also journal articles and book chapters arising from the project: Hammerton, 2004 and 2006 (b); and Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001.

[26] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 228.

[27] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 239.

[28] See Hammerton, 2004 and 2006 (a); and Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001.

[29] Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001, p 92.

[30] Hammerton, 2006 (a), pp 235-238.

[31] Hammerton, 2004, p 274. See also Hammerton, 2005, p 128; and McCarthy, who notes that 'the perceived cultural similarities between Scotland and parts of the British empire were influential in determining their choice of destination' (McCarthy, 2006 (a), p 208). See also McCarthy, 2004.

[32] Hammerton, 2004, p 275.

[33] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 228.

[34] The 'nissen hut', a rounded, arched temporary structure made of corrugated iron, was the common form of migrant hostel accommodation. The hut often housed more than one family, separated by a thin wall, had no internal toilet or shower facilities, and no insulation.

[35] Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001, p 92.

[36] Hammerton, 2004, p 274.

[37] Hammerton, 2004, pp 275-276. At the same time there could be a growing disillusionment with that idealised homeland, especially as the bonds with it weakened or a rare return visit confronted the reality (Hammerton, 2004, p 277). This was certainly the case when my mother visited Scotland after years of scrimping and saving to make the trip. Her experience served to reinforce her commitment to Australia.

[38] Hammerton, 2004, p 272.

[39] Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001, p 96.

[40] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 233.

[41] Hammerton, 2004, p 274.

[42] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 227.

[43] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 228.

[44] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 232.

[45] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 227.

[46] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 233.

[47] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 228.

[48] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 229.

[49] Shelemay, 1998, pp 25-26. See also Fortier, 2001.

[50] Storey, 2003 (a), p 81.

[51] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, pp 231-232.

[52] Halbwachs, 1992, p 40, quoted in Shelemay, 1998, p 9.

[53] Schacter, 1996, p 105, quoted in Shelemay, 1998, p 8.

[54] Halbwachs, 1992, discussed in Shelemay, 1998, p 9.

[55] Shelemay, 1998, p 53.

[56] Halbwachs, 1980, p 22, quoted in Storey, 2003 (a), pp 81-82.

[57] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 229.

[58] Storey, 2003 (a), p 88.

[59] Nora, 1989, p 7 and p 14, discussed in Storey, 2003 (a), p 85.

[60] Shelemay, 1998, p 6.

[61] Shelemay, 1998, p 233.

[62] Shelemay, 1998, p 7. Samuel Floyd, discussed in Shelemay's study, refers to 'cultural memories' as 'a repository of meanings that comprise the subjective knowledge of a people, its immanent thoughts, its

structure, and its practices; these thoughts, structures, and practices are transferred and understood unconsciously but become conscious and culturally objective in practice and perception' (Floyd, 1995, p 8, quoted in Shelemay, 1998, pp 221-222).

[63] Shelemay, 1998, p 9.

[64] Shelemay, 1998, p 10.

[65] Storey, 2003 (a), pp 84-85.

[66] Somers, 1994, p 614.

[67] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 230.

[68] Somers, 1994, p 625.

[69] Somers, 1994, p 618.

[70] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 231.

[71] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 228.

[72] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 230.

[73] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff also draw on Jerome Bruner, 1987, p 15. See also Jenna Baddeley and Jefferson A Singer, who state that 'the stories that we create are forged from the available repertoire of cultural myths, images, symbols, settings and plotlines that we learn from family, community, literature, art, and media' (Baddeley and Singer, 2007, p 178).

[74] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 231.

[75] Shelemay, 1998, p 171. This concept of songs as 'compound aural memories' comes from Stuart Feder, 1992, p 241, discussed in Shelemay, 1998, p 213.

[76] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 237.

[77] Slobin refers to migrants' music as 'cultural baggage', in terms of its portability and its personal and cultural significance (Slobin, 1994, p 244).

[78] Slobin, 1994, p 244.

[79] Slobin, 1994, p 243.

[80] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 117.

[81] James, 2000, p 186.

[82] James, 2000, p 188.

[83] James, 2000, p 37.

[84] James, 2000, p 187.

[85] Shelemay, 1998, p 212.

[86] Shelemay, 1998, p 219.

[87] Shelemay, 1998, p 11.

[88] Shelemay, 1998, p 224.

[89] Shelemay, 1998, p 223.

[90] James, 2000, p 190.

[91] In addition to the studies discussed in this chapter, see also other studies of migrants' homeland music in Connell and Gibson, 2004, pp 139, 141, 168, and 170. Also see relevant examples in Stokes, 1997; Slobin, 1994 and 2003; Clayton, et al, 2003; Leyshon, et al, 1998; Hesmondhalgh and Negus, 2002.

[92] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 191.

[93] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 161.

[94] Andrew Bennett, 1997, p 111, quoted in Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 166.

[95] See, for example, Devine, 2003, pp 1-25 and p 190; and McGuirk's interpretations of Robert Burns' songs (McGuirk, 1993).

[96] See, for example, *Andy Stewart: 20 Scottish Favourites*, EMI, 2001. Written by Andy Stewart (1960).

[97] From Nelson-Burns, *Folk Music of England, Scotland, Ireland, Wales and America*. Song written by Harold Boulton and Annie Macleod. Cited in Boulton and MacLeod, 1884. Sung by many Scottish popular singers, such as, Andy Stewart, Moira Anderson, and Kenneth McKellar.

[98] Connell and Gibson, 2004, pp 163-164.

[99] Stokes, 1997, p 18.

[100] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 81.

[101] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 171, referring to Arjun Appadurai's concept of 'nostalgia without memory' (Appadurai, 1996, p 30).

[102] Shelemay, 1998, p 227.

[103] Shelemay, 1998, p 230.

[104] James, 2000, p 190. See also Stokes, 1997, p 4 and p 18; and Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 162.

[105] James, 2000, p 188.

[106] James, 2000, p 17.

[107] James, 2000, p 187.

[108] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 162.

[109] James, 2000, p 190.

[110] Atkinson, 2004 (b), p 148.

[111] Atkinson, 2004 (b), p 149.

[112] Gilroy, 1993, p 276. 'Today, this involves the difficult task of striving to comprehend the reproduction of cultural traditions not in the unproblematic transmission of a fixed essence through time but in the breaks and interruptions that suggest that the invocation of tradition may itself be a distinct, though covert, response to the destabilizing flux of the postcontemporary world' (Gilroy, 1991, p 126). See also Clifford's discussion of Gilroy's analysis (Clifford, 1994, pp 320-321). David Atkinson also notes that in the context of folklore studies the concept of tradition has, broadly speaking, shifted away from 'tradition as lore to tradition as process' (Atkinson, 2004 (b), p 147).

[113] James, 2000, p 36.

[114] James, 2000, p 186.

[115] Sara Cohen and Jan Fairley, 2000, p ii.

[116] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 3.

[117] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 1.

[118] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 271.

[119] Slobin, 1994, p 248.

[120] Stokes, 1997, p 5.

[121] Stokes, 1997, pp 3-4.

[122] Connell and Gibson, 2004, pp 117-143.

[123] James, 2000, pp 37-38.

[124] Stokes, 1997, p 5.

[125] Shelemay, 1998, p 170.

[126] Stokes, 1997, p17.

[127] See Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 183 and p 164, for specific examples.

[128] See also Slobin, 1994, p 245, for a discussion of this issue in the work of Paul Gilroy on the music of the African diaspora (Gilroy, 1993).

[129] See examples in Connell and Gibson, 2004, pp 160-191; and Stokes, 1997, p 18.

[130] See also examples in Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 227.

[131] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 164; and, Stokes, 1997, p 17.

[132] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 165.

[133] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 174.

[134] Slobin, 1994, p 245.

[135] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 161.

[136] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 164.

[137] Phillips and Holton, 2004, p 732.

[138] Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001, p 86.

[139] Hammerton, 2004, p 275.

[140] Hammerton, 2004, p 272.

[141] Hammerton and Coleborne, 2001, p 93.

[142] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 239.

8

Singing Home: A Vernacular Hotchpotch

In countries with a strong tradition of puritanism there has always been a tendency to look down on sung lyrics because they do not take up much room on the page and their idea-content is often slight.

(Thomas Crawford, 1979, p1)

This chapter takes as its starting point, not the Scottish songs as collected, performed, recorded or published, but the 'same' Scottish songs as lived performance in a suburban family - songs that were heard, talked about, remembered and sung over an extended period of time in family life. It examines how the processes of oral transmission and shared family performance have shaped the songs, and how their particular forms and meanings derive from that ongoing performance as much as from their sources. While the family songs share many of the features of the songs that are their sources, the selection and shaping of the songs over time within the family has produced a particular repertoire of songs with its own characteristics, narrative form and pattern. 'Repertoire' is deployed here in the sense of a corpus of songs, but also importantly in the sense of a song repertoire that functions as a participatory medium and as a vehicle for family and cultural meaning making. In this context, repertoire is less 'artifact' than 'a way of saying'.[1]

A Repertoire of Songs that has Stood the Test of Time

The family songs that are the focus of this study are those that have been in the family for over three generations. These songs came out of our immediate social world, from our parents, grandparents and our own childhood and school life in Scotland, and from popular recordings. Songs that were a commonplace part of urban life in early twentieth century Edinburgh - rhymes from the playground and the street, traditional and popular songs - were adopted and adapted in family singing.

As a family, we were largely musically untrained, with our knowledge of music deriving substantially, but not only, from the day-to-day experience of music in the home. While my family derived much of its song repertoire in much the same way as many others would have experienced the popular music of the time, through radio and recordings, many of the songs came from the culture of the street and school yard in the form of children's rhymes, from the songs of the extended family, and from the Scottish folk songs learnt at school and the Girl Guides.[2] This array of musical experience reflects, what some commentators have discussed as, the key institutions of musical socialisation - notably church, family, school and the media - noting that their respective roles exert varying influences across time and social milieu.[3] Recognition of the role of the wider social context in which music is experienced and drawn from also underscores how localised song traditions are intimately linked to the wider social/political/institutional factors, as James Porter has noted. In the case of my family, the contexts of family, school and the commercial music media in particular, not only contributed to the shaping of the family's repertoire, but each of these contexts would have had a mediating influence on the forms, meanings and reception of the songs - on how the songs were 'experienced' in these contexts.[4]

While songs were borrowed from both within and outside of the family, it was within the family context that our musical interests were nurtured and sustained over time, with much of our musical socialisation taking place through not only singing but also through

listening to radio and recordings. It is this local selection and performance that holds these songs together - their functioning as family repertoire - that this chapter focuses on.

Singing and music were pervasive in our family life. We sang to one another, together as a group, and we sang to ourselves. Spontaneous and untutored singing came to us as naturally as language. Indeed there was little that separated the two. We communicated through song, with musical quips peppering our conversations and our sense of humour. Singing and music were part and parcel of everyday family life. We sang, performed and listened to music on records, on the radio and on television, and we talked about music. Singing formed the core of our family entertainments. We sang to soothe babies, entertain children, we performed songs in family concerts, and in family sing-a-longs at Christmas and birthday parties, sometimes accompanied by Mum or Dad on the mouth organ. We knew and sang dozens of songs - a vernacular hotchpotch of songs. The songs were fun, clever, witty and topical, and sometimes wistful and poignant. With these songs, we learnt of romance and rivalry, husbands and wives, motherhood and murder, human frailty and good housekeeping. Through repeated exposure in everyday family life, they imbued us with images and ideas about Scotland, Scottish life and history, Scots language, music and humour.

These songs were not our only musical interests, which were quite broad, although classical music was not our forte. Mum and Dad were passionate about jazz and big band music from the 1940's and 1950's, and we had several precious 78 rpm recordings that were played often. Their interest in jazz also encompassed more contemporary forms and they became regular attendees at various Melbourne jazz clubs and concerts. Our small record collection not only included popular Scottish singers like Harry Lauder and Andy Stewart, but also Nat King Cole, Frank Sinatra, musicals like *South Pacific* and *Oklahoma*, and later *Hair* and *Jesus Christ Super Star*, top 40 chart hit singles, and Barbara Streisand, and Beatles albums.

Throughout the five decades since arriving in Melbourne, the old songs have continued to feature in family life. Some new songs got added to our family repertoire, some came and went, and new 'acts' were added to the family concerts, but the old songs have retained a special place. During this time, little, if any, newer Scottish music entered our repertoire, except notably the songs of Andy Stewart that came to us via the radio hit parade and television in the early 1960's. Our family song repertoire has remained grounded in the old songs, the songs that we brought from Scotland. Their continuing life in the family over an extended period of time, situation and generational changes is striking. Such a long-standing repertoire of songs suggests that these songs performed an important function in the family.

The ballad scholar Barre Toelken suggests that in intimate groups such as families, where songs have been shared and sung over time, where songs have stood the test of time, they remain in use because they continue to satisfy or articulate something shared by the group.[5] Scholars have long argued that oral tradition is no accident. Writers like Pickering and Green and others, such as Thomas McKean, and, Mary-Ann Constantine and Gerald Porter emphasise that oral tradition 'is not merely governed by chance: songs are sung because they make sense, awake some kind of 'vernacular recognition' '.[6] As McKean points out, 'numerous studies have shown, the acquisition of a song repertoire is often not a matter of happenstance'.[7] A song repertoire also says something about the time in which they developed it, the people who sang it, and why and how they did so.

Toelken suggests that such longevity 'thrives on familiarity, on repetition, and on the everyday conventions and usages of people who share close familial, social and cultural ties'.[8] His view is that the songs that people share over time give voice to shared experience, values and cultural understandings, which are expressed or revealed in the shared performance of the songs. Such songs *articulate,* not *explain* 'the shared values, assumptions, logic and sense of the normal, and discrepant that constitute any culture's system of meaning'.[9]

A song repertoire that is common to members of a group may then be understood as a form of shared narrative that gives expression to the cultural preoccupations and sense of identity of a group. Jerome Bruner and Carol Fleisher Feldman suggest that the development of shared stories or shared narratives - 'stylized genres of story, poetry, oratory, and history' - is an integral part of how a group constitutes itself as a lasting identity. Such shared narratives not only define the group's identity, but also provide a means whereby members of the group can 'give meaning to events in their own lives'.[10] How a narrative is constructed, its form and pattern, is it not dictated by the 'facts' of experience but by the meanings that a narrative seeks to express or communicate. Typically, such stories or narratives construct a narrative pattern that is distinctive, what Bruner and Fleisher Feldman describe as a 'narrative convention'. While being distinctive to a group, the form and pattern of narrative is also forged out of the 'shared instruments of the culture', culturally recognisable or shared narrative properties like genre and plot type that are widely shared within a culture.[11]

Bruner and Fleisher Feldman suggest that since there are a wide variety of narrative possibilities available in a culture, the choices that are made and the ways in which a narrative is constructed, its form and pattern, provides a means for understanding or interpreting it. Their approach is to focus on the distinctive patterning of language as a means of objectifying the narrative pattern distinctive to a group. They suggest that key words, phrases and expressions, 'distinctive lexemes', which are shared within a group narrative, can be examined as reflections of aspects of the group and individual identity. Key words, for example, tell us about shared content and about the ways in which group members construct themselves in relation to their group. This 'lexical analysis' though is not just 'scientistic, reductionist, or as leading to statistical artifacts'.[12] Bruner and Fleisher Feldman emphasise that this is a discovery process not a 'proof procedure'. It needs to be conducted with a careful reading of how such language is used in context.

As noted in the previous chapter, narratives not only draw on genre and plot type but also on cultural myths, images, symbols, what Toelken refers to as 'a pool of culturally recognizable resources in language'.[13] Like, Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, Toelken

argues that within a closely related group the persistence or recurrence of certain narrative elements and topics, expressions, images and metaphors in songs indicate 'a relatively consistent field of shared experience'.[14] They imply or reveal something about a shared meaning system, and reflect common assumptions and associations within the group who sing the songs. His idea is that the recurrence or persistence of such features in songs is important *because* they are common. In songs that have stood the test of time, aspects of song content and phrasing persist, become commonplace, because they project 'an idea appropriate to the cultural meaning of the song'.[15] Such words, phrases and topics also attain an intensity of meaning in close-knit groups, such as families:

> "… as a joke will not be repeated unless it continues to satisfy or articulate something shared by both performer and audience, so a slang term, a figure of speech, a custom, a gesture, or a dialect phrase will not remain use unless there is some function, understanding, or savoring of it among members of a closely related group." (Toelken, 1995, p 31)

Culturally commonplace expressions, images, and ideas in songs, have, as Toelken reminds us, been often been treated as intellectual or cultural weaknesses. The culturally commonplace in Scottish popular song, have indeed been seen in this way. They have been denigrated as clichéd, backward looking, mawkish and kitsch, and as fostering limited cultural stereotypes, especially those associated with the iconography of the highlands and the sentimental treatment of Scottish history and social life. But the possibilities of the meanings of commonplace cultural references in song, as has been argued previously in this study, need to be discovered rather than assumed in advance, in particular contexts. Toelken also emphasises that while it cannot be assumed that all members of a group will respond in the same way to culturally recognisable references in songs, it can be argued that where those references are recurring and persistent there is some 'generally shared coherence' or else so many of the songs would not contain the same sets of references.[16]

In their examinations of songs and narratives Toelken, and Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, take language as their point of departure. Toelken's focus is on how shared cultural understandings of figurative language and metaphor in song shapes meaning and can drive the narrative within and across songs. Bruner and Fleisher Feldman examine how the common language usage of groups may reveal distinctive narrative properties that reflect a group's identity. Both approaches address the form and patterns of language. For Toelken it is the language of song, for Bruner and Fleisher Feldman it is the spoken language of groups. These writers acknowledge that the 'words on a page', the texts of songs, or the recorded word usage of groups do not constitute the whole meaning system of the group, and that the context in which words are sung or spoken is crucial for a fuller understanding. In the context of song performance, it is widely acknowledged that the dynamics of a living tradition goes beyond songs as fixed texts, but as Toelken and others argue, while the text is not an end itself, not *the* thing, it is *a* thing.[17] The song text is, according to Toelken, like a photograph, an arrested event, that can be used as a topic of discussion. Moreover, as Constantine and G Porter point out, while the performance context is an important consideration, there are patterns in the material itself.[18]

It is the patterns in song material, in the repertoire of family songs, which this chapter addresses, as part of a larger analysis of the role of the songs in the family. This chapter will focus on the form and pattern of that song repertoire, examining firstly its narrative properties and characteristics, followed by a closer examination of the content of the songs, in particular how certain recurring and persistent features in the songs inscribe a sense of place, home and family. The next chapter will build on this song analysis by examining features of the performance context.

The Battered Appeal of a Lifetime's Use: Narrative Form and Pattern

Taken at face value, these family songs are the sentimental and couthy Scottish songs of highlands and history, heather and romance, and comic domestic life. They derive from a mix of national songs that celebrated and mourned a nationhood born out of a fusion of landscape and a Jacobite defining character, and the music hall songs of an urban, domestic and street life Scotland. Added to this mix are the children's rhymes and street songs, which draw on these and other song traditions. Taken together they represent a complex of overlapping song traditions and song types, that have themselves been subject to shifting 'articulations', having being 'made over' and also subject to shifting valuations of their cultural meaning and merit over time and context. As such, it would be inadequate to approach these family songs as simply 'Scottish songs', or songs of a particular type, tradition or genre, that is, as the 'same' songs as their sources. Like Toelken's account of folksong, these songs owe their existence and stylistic qualities to ongoing oral performance within the family.[19] They are songs that have been shaped and given a cultural meaning derived from the 'live performative contexts of oral circulation'.[20] These family songs also bear the hallmarks of what Constantine and G Porter aptly describe as the 'compact battered appeal of a lifetime's use'.[21] Often incomplete, made up of bits of other songs, in burlesque and parody, many lacking an obvious narrative, and delighting in nonsense, our family songs share many features with what have been considered as 'degraded' songs, fragments and scraps - the 'paltry leftovers of tradition'.

In their study of song fragments, Constantine and G Porter set out to return to these dog ends of tradition their 'coherence and social meaning'. They argue that fragments and scraps of songs have been ignored 'if not downright abused by many scholars of folk-song, who have treated them as artefacts rather than as ways of saying'.[22] Fragments of songs have been viewed as 'corruptions or shards of an earlier whole', the end of a process of mutation in oral transmission, 'a slow and convoluted fall from grace'.[23] They also note that such notions of corruption have also served to marginalise song repertoires

and song traditions, such as the work songs of women and girls, where songs are 'either rendered invisible, classed as lyrics or counting rhymes, or broken up into categories inappropriate'.[24] The status conferred on narrative songs has also seen performances by individuals as the leading dynamic of a singing tradition, leading to a lack of attention paid to participatory song traditions, such as that of my family, where the spontaneous and fragmentary are often to be found.[25]

Constantine and G Porter's position is that the starting point for examining fragments and very short songs is not that they are unfortunate accidents of transmission, the result of memory lapses, interruptions or carelessness, but that they should be 'presumed whole'. Toelken also contends that fragments and condensed versions of songs:

> "… should not be seen as signs of deterioration and loss, but … as hallmarks of intensification, distillation, and vernacular recognition of the smallest critical mass that can still evoke an audience's response through the appropriate cultural nuance and metaphor." (Toelken, 1995, p 103)

Like my family's songs, songs that are sung over lifetimes bear the evidence of constant erosion and abbreviation. Constantine and G Porter suggest that in the processes of song transmission the specifics of song content are likely to be lost. The loss of the local and particular such as names and settings, and plots may often give way to figurative language, and indirect storytelling where ideas and emotions take the place of a sequential narrative. They offer examples of 'partial and disrupted narratives', 'plotless narratives', 'gapped narratives', 'non-sequential narratives' and 'narrative collapse'. They cite examples of traditional songs and ballads that have evolved into what they describe as 'a real car-crash of a ballad', impacted and distorted but still recognisable. There are others where there is a total confusion of plot, switching of voices, characters and gender, and many examples where scraps of different songs are networked together. There are many similarities in my family songs with these examples of partial and non-sequential narratives; and of indirect storytelling, where figurative language, imagery and emotion play a greater role than plot lines. While it is certainly the case that the

family songs bear the evidence of erosion and abbreviation and an absence of narrative 'wholeness', they have, however, retained an emphasis on the local and particular, especially with respect to Scottish place names and settings and in depictions of human behaviour and characters. This feature of the songs is discussed later in this chapter.

The main thrust of Constantine and G Porter's argument is that the coherence of meaning is not necessarily dependent on the fullness of the narrative and that a song's story can be conveyed through means other than a sequential plot line, with many short songs, 'while obviously sacrificing the details of the plot, retain the signifying elements'.[26] Song scraps and fragments can also serve to create new meanings, and extend rather than reduce the connotations of a longer narrative. Figurative language and metaphor, for example, can expand a song's narrative possibilities. As Toelken argues, metaphor, symbol and image can work thematically and 'take the place of a plot sequence, losing neither the story's complication nor its resolution'.[27] Other means by which a story can be conveyed include what Constantine and G Porter refer to as indirect storytelling, a feature that is characteristic of certain types of traditional songs and ballads.[28] Indirect storytelling, rather than relying on plot lines, creates a sequence of concepts and feelings about events, not by directly relating the story, but by celebrating or commenting on it. Although such songs often have locatable roots in real events, they do not provide a discursive account, but rather they make reference to them thematically, foregrounding emotions over plot. It is not so much the local and specifics of the story that counts as much as 'an understanding of - a feel for - the story's parameters, the kind of narrative offered'.[29] This feature of indirect story telling can be seen in many of my family's songs, where fragments and scraps of song still retain a feel for the story's parameters, as will be discussed below.

As Constantine and G Porter point out, such indirectness, whether through thematic storytelling or through metaphor and symbol, relies heavily on shared local knowledge. Where there are shared understandings of the connotations of a song, the 'whole may be invoked' even when one or more element is missing. Such songs can function as a kind of 'intimate shorthand', a form of 'minimal communication within a tight group' where

meaning is gleaned through repeated exposure to the song and out of shared local and cultural understandings:[30]

> "… within the singing community, a song's brokenness does not stand for lack, but for a confident expectation of its opposite - for a shared understanding, for the silences of familiarity." (Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 8)

As a song's meaning is shaped by its particular performance context, scraps and fragments of songs that have been removed from their 'traditional environment' can become 'new points of narrative departure'. This feature, as Constantine and G Porter point out, is clearly observable in children's rhymes where scraps of other songs - folk songs, ballads, nursery rhymes, popular songs etc - are pared down and combined into new songs and take on new meanings. In the process, narrative structure is often disrupted, mixed up or obliterated. Words and sounds are played with and repeated, often becoming more important than straightforward storytelling and denotative meaning. This disregard of narrative structure, the networking of scraps of other songs, and the conflation, reduction, and substitution of song parts that typify children's rhymes and my family songs, is not merely a matter of stylistic interest. Constantine and G Porter suggest that it can be argued that all song fragments have a subversive element, not only because 'they represent the furtherest possible fall from grace', but because songs are 'irreverently misheard, misinterpreted, rearranged'.[31] Indeed there is a playful irreverence that runs through much of the family song repertoire, stylistically and thematically. Songs are conflated, bits of songs are combined together, and parts of songs omitted or substituted with other elements including personalised family references. Many of the songs poke fun at authority and cultural/social norms, and celebrate the absurdity of life's ups and downs. They parody other songs, switch voices and characters, and play with language, rhyme and rhythm.

This is most notable in the family songs that derive from children's rhymes and street songs. But many of the same irreverent processes can be seen in the other songs that make up our family repertoire, including the songs from the music hall tradition and

traditional songs. Like the irreverent children's rhymes, these songs too can be seen as a fall from musical grace. Certainly that accusation has more widely been made about songs from the music hall tradition and other popular Scottish songs. But in our family's versions of these songs, and the more 'noble' songs of tradition, there appears to be a further fall from musical grace. Few of these songs are 'complete', with many constituting only the choruses of the songs from which they derive, and where the colour, rhyme and rhythm of language and character is most pronounced rather than narrative detail. Some incorporate parts of other songs, made up words and refrains, and improvised and idiosyncratic versions of words, lines and phrases.

Constantine and G Porter's argument, that all such fusions and reductions act as a source of new significations and new meanings, is the feature that makes these songs 'subversive'. This is not necessarily in the political sense, but in the sense that 'corrupt' song fragments rework, reframe and at times displace their original models. This leads them to suggest that song fragments constitute a form of parody. In bringing together elements of different songs, a kind of doubling takes place, where the meaning of one song is juxtaposed with another. As Linda Hutcheon points out in her detailed analysis of parody, upon which Constantine and G Porter base their argument, the juxtaposition of texts is more than just textual comparison or contrast. When one text is set against another, something new is brought about. In this 'bitextual synthesis', the 'old' is incorporated into the new, out of which a new form and meaning develops, but the old is never entirely lost - the point that Middleton has made. Hutcheon also draws attention to that fact that parody need not always serve to ridicule. Parody can be 'playful as well as belittling', 'critically constructive as well as destructive', and can range from 'scornful ridicule' to 'reverential homage'.[32]

As the juxtaposition of parts can function as parody and perform a 'subversive function', so too can figurative language, and the absence of parts of songs. Metaphors, for example, can operate like parody in bringing two ideas together, to create a new allusion, where the shared meaning of its connotations 'can add unspoken poignancy or a twist of irony'.[33] What is left out of a song can also be as important as that what is

retained, as Constantine and G Porter note, songs are full of 'telling silences'. The stripping down of a song's narrative structure can shift the framing of a song's meaning, affecting its tone mood and connotative possibilities. They point to how more fully framed narratives tend to act as closed units, serving to encompass and define events or experiences, whereas in stripped down songs, meanings are left more open-ended. A song fragment can also shift the mood of a more a distant and formalised narrative to one of greater immediacy by reducing its discursive content and enhancing its emotional and dramatic qualities. Because of the way that song fragments can make room for new 'subject positions' they can also become instruments of parody, shedding new light on old meanings. In this way, the process of fragmentation 'can lay ideology bare' by exposing meanings that lie outside of the 'original' discourse.[34]

Constantine and G Porter also argue that where the canon of the 'complete' song is disturbed by fragmentation and fusion, the norms and conventions of literary and musical tradition may also be shifted or subverted. Hutcheon too, points to the role of parody in recontextualising and reworking norms and conventions in cultural forms, such as music, literature and art. Parody can be a means by which the established, the normal, the taken-for-granted or the outworn and hackneyed is reworked and refreshed.[35] As noted previously in this study, parody can be used to shift the 'original' meaning or 'connotation cluster' that a musical style or song brings with it. While this is particularly true of parody per se, songs and song traditions can be appropriated, customised and 'made over' in a variety of ways. As Middleton has explained in the process of 'articulation', when existing elements of the cultural repertoire become combined into new patterns in new contexts, new connotations become attached to them. Whether or not this wider process of meaning shift is at its core a complex form of parody is pertinent to the songs in this study in the light of Constantine and G Porter's analysis. What is relevant here is the idea that song fragments and fusions may create new meanings which extend rather than reduce the connotations and meanings of their original models. In doing so musical norms and conventions, the commonplace, the clichéd may also be reworked and refreshed.

This has particular relevance for my family's songs. In the process of incorporating children's rhymes, popular songs and traditional songs into the day-to-day life of family singing a new context was set up that mediated the forms, meanings and reception of the songs. The children's rhymes that my family sang, for example, were in effect displaced from their 'traditional environment' of the children's lore of the school yard and street, and deployed into the context of family lore.[36] The popular songs of the musical hall, with its tradition of group singing and participation, perhaps had little distance to travel, but nonetheless, were also reshaped as family songs. The traditional and national songs of Scotland were also subject to the effects of fragmentation and fusion in family singing. Constantine and G Porter's analysis of song fragments also offers insights into how our family songs may have served to rework, not only the song traditions from which they derive, but also the cultural conventions and norms, values that those song traditions encode. For example, the grand narratives of Scottish history, that are invoked in the national songs of Scotland, appear to be treated somewhat irreverently in my family's abbreviated, conflated versions of them. The performance of these songs can also be seen as new points of narrative departure. As Ian Russell has argued, parody functions both at the level of text *and* in performance.[37] Like all of the family songs, these songs were sung for fun. There was nothing formal in our approach; our singing was spontaneous, unrehearsed and participatory. Indeed it as much the family performance context (to be discussed in the following chapter) as much as the fragmentary form of these songs that distinguish them from their sources and mark them as an idiosyncratic and personalised song repertoire.

That repertoire has another important feature that pertains to the relationships between the songs, and to other songs, as much as to individual song characteristics. Out of irreverent children's rhymes, cheeky music hall songs, scraps and parodies of traditional songs, my family created a repertoire of songs with a distinctive form and pattern, its own narrative convention. The narrative structure that links the family songs is comparable to what Constantine and G Porter describe as a narrative 'net', a structure that is non-linear, non-sequential. It sets up multiple and shifting links amongst songs and parts of songs and within songs. They compare this composite structure to that of a

music video that sets up a narrative through its shifting focus, and synchronous non-linear narrative connections.[38] When such a narrative net is made of 'minimal' songs, the boundaries between one song and another are left more open, more susceptible to the exchange of their parts - a feature of folk songs in general where the boundaries between songs are 'endlessly erased' by the shift of stanzas, verses and phrases in the processes transmission. Where a single song is reduced to a few 'salient elements', when many of its specifics of plot and details are absent, it has the effect of leaving it 'ambiguously open to a relationship with other songs on similar themes'.[39]

It is this feature, that Constantine and G Porter draw attention to, which links these family songs together. Rather than being simply an array of individual rhymes, ditties, 'broken' fragments and bits of verses and choruses of other songs, each contributes to the meaning of the other. As a repertoire of songs they are more than the sum of their parts. Moreover, the songs not only exist in relationship to one another, but also to the songs and song traditions that are their sources. Their meaning thus also derives from what Constantine and G Porter refer to as their 'multivocal cultural extension'. The songs from various song traditions and children's lore have been reworked and inflected, creating a 'bricolage' in which the signs of their sources are 'there' and recognisable as such, but overall constitute a different whole.[40]

Not only do the songs construct a network of meanings that rely on one another and other songs for their meaning, but their form and meanings have also been shaped by their shared performance over many years within an intimate family group. Their meaning is thus both collective and cumulative. The meaning of such songs does not reside in a single performance, but 'involves maturing in a culture where such images and songs are repeated and discussed commonly throughout a person's life'.[41] The songs in our family can be seen to have a cumulative force that derives from their being heard and sung on many occasions. Their import and meaning lies not so much in their existence as words on a page, nor in a single performance, but in their ongoing performance over decades and generations.

Songs that Give Voice to Place, Home and Family

While recognising the limitations of pinning down songs as fixed texts, the collective and cumulative qualities of songs that have been sung and shared over time can provide a useful focal point for analysis. As previously noted, when songs are shared over time they can be said to articulate or 'give voice' to shared experience, values and cultural understandings. The content of songs, especially the persistent and commonplace - recurrent topics, expressions and images and so on - can be examined for the insights they offer into common values and assumptions, the sense of the normal and the discrepant in a group. In close-knit groups, such as families, particular references, words and ideas or 'semantic fields' in songs, can attain an intensity of meaning through their connection with not only local frames of reference, local values and local shared experiences, but also through shared cultural understandings.[42] In these contexts where songs are shared over time, Toelken argues that 'much of the field of reference comes from the realities and connotations of everyday life of the community'.[43] By this Toelken is not referring to songs that depict a specific local life (although some do) but rather to cultural references that are recognisable, make sense at the local level for those who sing the songs. These fields of cultural meaning connect with, and are made sense of, through local frames of reference, local values and local shared experiences, and shared cultural assumptions and understandings. Songs may allude to ways of life, customs, social and historical detail, ethnographic and biographical matters, occupational customs, and so on, but they also find their relevance through wider cultural codes of meaning through which the songs make sense.[44] Those cultural codes of meaning function not only at the level of song form, content and reference, but also through the performance context. Why and how songs are sung and responded to, who sings them and under what conditions is a critical part of understanding what songs might mean to the group who sings them, and informs this analysis of family repertoire, and will be addressed more fully in the next chapter.

What is striking about my family's repertoire of songs is the recurrent referencing of place, particularly Scotland. Scotland as a place and as a social/cultural space is inscribed throughout the songs in words, expressions, images and metaphors, narrative elements and topics. It is not only that place features so strongly in these songs, but also that these 'minimal' songs have retained such an emphasis on the local and particular, a feature that is most often lost in the process of oral transmission. Part of the explanation for this no doubt lies in the characteristics of the songs from which these derive, and which also serves to underline the interaction between public songs traditions and local traditions. As important as cultural resources are to the shaping of local traditions, the fact that my family adopted, adapted and sustained songs that 'picture' a vivid Scotland is not explained by that factor alone. As Toelken and others have argued oral tradition is no accident, it is not merely governed by the 'happenstance' of songs being readily available at any point in time. Songs remain in use because they continue to satisfy or articulate something of shared relevance and value. The things that are common across songs and the things that persist in them over time will not remain in use unless there is 'some function, understanding, or savoring of it among members of a closely related group'. In the case of my family, I would suggest that, in large part, it was Scotland and family life that was being 'savoured' in song.

The meanings that a place has is perhaps especially compelling for those whose connections to a place have been disrupted. In the songs of migrants, time and place, then and now, homeland and hereland, are often the key ingredients in a musically shaped sense of home and attachment. Sustaining attachment to a distant homeland through songs that 'picture' that place may serve to stabilise the meanings that a place has especially for migrant groups. James Porter's analysis of the role of place names suggests that a sense of attachment to place is frequently derived from the stability of meanings associated with it.[45] That stability of meaning comes, in part, from a place's identification, its name, or its description. The identity of places, inscribed in their names, also tells cultural stories 'narratives of their origin and meaning'. Porter argues that naming provides a sense of stability not only on the physical world but also on the personal, social and cultural meanings of a place.[46]

Place, in these songs, is a key organising element of meaning. As Constantine and G
Porter's work on song fragments shows, elements such as time, space and place, can act
as a structuring device for storytelling taking the place of sequential narrative, and can
carry the connotative load in the meaning of songs. Where the evocation of place in
songs is recurrent, persistent and commonplace this may offer a particularly 'telling'
story about the meanings that a sense of place has for the songs' singers. At one level in
the songs, place is constructed through a myriad of references to Scotland's natural and
urban features. Typically the songs are set in or refer to Scotland itself and a wide array
of Scottish cities, towns, regions, rivers, plants and mountains, with many situated in or
referring to the countryside, the highland and islands. The 'naming' of places in the
songs is but one of the important ways in which place is evoked. Scotland is also evoked
figuratively, and symbolically through the iconography of Scotland - in landscape, kilts
and kilt jokes, soldiers, clans, historical and cultural references and specific family
references, and in particular through language, and idiom.

While these songs evoke Scotland as a place, it is also a place with a decidedly human
face - a family's Scotland - exhibiting the contradictions, flaws, joys, ambiguities and
ironies of human dramas in familial life and a wider cultural/historical life. Here,
Scotland is both a place, and a social space in which human stories are enacted. Broadly
speaking the songs inscribe three kinds of social spaces, although these divisions are not
strict and there are significant overlaps between them. It is not that there are three
distinct song types in this family repertoire, with each reflecting a different social space,
but for analytical purposes, I have grouped together those songs that most strongly
emphasise a particular social space. Recognising that these songs and the song traditions
from which they derive also borrow from one another and have been further 'made over'
in family singing; the analysis here is not an argument for a particular one-to-one
relationship between song traditions and social space type. Across all of the songs, there
are those that focus on domestic and familial concerns typically in urban/suburban
contexts; those that picture the highlands and islands of Scotland as settings for history
and romance; and closely related to these songs are those that are set in or refer to
'foreign shores' and absence. Each of these metaphoric spaces play out across all of the

songs in one way or another and construct what I describe as a narrative of Scotland as 'home'.

Domestic and Familial

The examples of songs discussed here best capture the domestic/familial orientation that characterises much of the family's song repertoire. They also help to set the scene for how these and other songs have been shaped in family singing.

The 'domestic' social space in the songs is grounded in the activities of day-to-day life in households or on the street, and create a sense of immediacy - of life here and now. In its most tangible form it is the 'hoose', 'but-n-ben', 'garret', the 'toon', and the activities of domestic life in which washing lines, broken tables, kettles, cradles, 'humpy-back't' dressers and 'bowdy-legged' beds play their part in family life pictured in the songs. These settings are peopled with Scottish characters in name and description: wee wives, mammies, grannies, bairns, bissoms, laddies and lassies and nick names.[47]

Familial and social relationships between husbands and wives, between children, between neighbours, between boyfriends and girlfriends and their rivals, and intergenerational relationships between children and grannies are persistent themes. In many of these songs the focus of the behaviour is interpersonal, intimate and direct. It is often portrayed in comic style, slapstick, and cartoon-like in gesture, appearance and dress. Characters are 'humpity-backity', 'bowdidy-leggedy', suffer pratfalls and black eyes, and risk being haunted by ghosts, and wee bogey men. In vignettes and caricatures of family life, children mock or adore their grannies, neighbours borrow and break things, wives annoy their husbands, boyfriends are teased and scolded, people's behaviour and appearance are lampooned, and laddies are the butt of kilt jokes:

I'm Gaein' in the Train [48]

I'm gaein' in the train,
Yer no comin' wi me,

I've got a laddie o' my ain,
And I call him Bonnie Jimmie.

He wears a tartan kilt,
He wears it in the fashion,
And every time I see him,
I canna keep fae laughin'.

Comarick, comarack, comara,
Comarick, comarack, comaraurus,
Comarick, comarack, comara,
And we'll dance the hielan' chorus.

Oh, You'll No Get a Lend o' Ma Kettle Again

Oh, you'll no get a lend o' ma kettle again,
Oh, you'll no get a lend o' ma kettle again.
'Cause the last time you got it
You bissom you broke it.
You'll no get a lend o' ma kettle again.

Have You Seen Ma Maggie from the Toon?

Have you seen ma Maggie from the toon?
She wears a moleskin jacket and a moleskin hat,
A wee red bobble and she walks like that.
Have you seen ma Maggie from the toon?

When I was a Laddie

When I was a laddie I stayed wi' ma granny,
And many a doin' ma granny gave me.
She dressed me up in a comical fashion,
And tied ma knickers below ma knee.

Have You Seen My Love, My Love, My Love? [49]

Have you seen my love, my love, my love?
Have you seen my love lookin' fer me?
She's humpity-backity, bowdidy-leggedy,
Blunt o' an knee, and blind o' an ee.

Most of these lively songs derive from children's songs - play, clapping, skipping and guising rhymes - that were a common part of our school and street life in twentieth century Edinburgh.[50] *Hi, Gee Up Ma Cuddy*, and *Oh, a Doo Fell Aff*, for example, were clapping rhymes that were absorbed into the family to entertain small children and subsequently became part of family singing. This was also the case with *All the Wee Laddies in Drylaw*, which is our version of *All the Boys in Our Town*, a children's singing game found widely across Scotland since the nineteenth century.[51]

Hi, Gee Up Ma Cuddy [52]

Hi, gee up ma cuddy
Ma cuddy lives o'er the dyke.
If you touch ma cuddy
Ma cuddy'll gie ye a bite.

Och!

Oh, a Doo Fell Aff [53]

Oh, a doo fell aff, a doo fell aff, a doo fell aff a dyke, dyke, dyke.
Oh, a doo fell aff, a doo fell aff, a dyke, dyke, dyke.

Oh, a doo fell aff, a doo fell aff, a doo fell aff a dyke, dyke, dyke.
Oh, a doo fell aff, a doo fell aff, a dyke, dyke, dyke.

All the Wee Laddies in Drylaw [54]

All the wee laddies in Drylaw lead a happy life,
Except for wee (boy's name) he's looking for a wife.

A wife he shall have and a party they will hold,

Along with wee (girl's name),

A dree, a dree, a dro.

He kisses her and cuddles her and puts her on his knee.

Oh wee (girl's name) won't you marry me?

Who'll buy the kitchen drawers and who'll buy the ladle?

When wee (boy's name) goes to sleep,

We'll rock him in his cradle.

Like many children's rhymes, these are often made up of other songs, parodies of older songs folk songs and ballads, and popular songs; and include local, topical and popular culture references of the time. *Three Wee Wives*, for example, networks two rhymes (*Three Wee Wives* and *Away Down East*) and was sung to the popular American tune, *Oh Susanna*. It also weaves in a sardonic reference to the unpopular wartime introduction of margarine into the Scottish diet, 'the holy margarine'.[55] *Ye Cannae Shove Yer Granny Off a Bus* was also sung to an American tune, *She'll be Coming Round the Mountain*. As one of the many Scottish children's rhymes that moved into wider popular culture it was also recorded by Andy Stewart.[56] *In Ma Wee Gas Mask*, a commercially popular Scottish World War Two song, adapted as a children's rhyme, refers to the Air Raid Protection (ARP) Wardens appointed to assist the police in protecting the public during air raids.[57]

Three Wee Wives

Three wee wives

And three wee wives

And three wee wives

Make nine.

Said one wee wife to the other wee wife:

"Can you lend me yer washin' line?"

Said the other wee wife to the other wee wife:

"When will I get it back?"

Said the other wee wife to the other wee wife:

"I cannae tell you that."

So I went to the east,
And I went to the west,
And I went to California.
The only girl that I saw there
Was sweet haired Sussianna.

She took me to a ball one night
And sat me down to supper.
The table fell,
And she fell too,
And stuck her nose in the butter.

The butter,
The butter,
The holy margarine,
Two black eyes and a roman nose,
And the rest all painted green.

Ye Cannae Shove Yer Granny Off a Bus

Oh, ye cannae shove yer granny off a bus.
Oh, ye cannae shove yer granny off a bus.
Oh, ye cannae shove yer granny,
Cause she's yer mammy's mammy.
Oh, ye cannae shove yer granny off a bus.

Singing I will if you will, so will I.
Singing I will if you will, so will I.
Singing I will if you will,
I will if you will,
I will if you will, so will I.

In Ma Wee Gas Mask

In ma wee gas mask
I'm workin' oot a plan.
And all the bairns think that I'm a wee bogey-man.

The girls all smile
And bring their friends to see
The nicest lookin' warden in the ARP.
When there's an air raid
Listen to ma cry,
An aeroplane, an aeroplane
A way up a 'ky.

Dinnae run helter skelter
Dinnae run after me.
You'll no get in ma shelter
Fer it's far too wee.

Dirry Me Doo, another of our songs that entered the family repertoire to entertain babies, constitutes only the chorus of a traditional Scottish song that refers to the coastal holiday town of Rothesay.[58] *Come Up and See Ma Garret* was a guising rhyme that children performed door to door on New Year's Eve. The chorus that has been added at the end of this song appears to be from a popular nineteenth century Irish political ballad, *The Wearing of the Green*, which was a well known song at the time.[59] Another of our family songs, *Wee Macgreegor*, seems very likely to be based on the popular early twentieth century children's literary figure, Wee Macgreegor, by John Bell.[60]

Dirry Mee Doo

Dirry mee doo, mee doo, mee doo,
Dirry mee doo, mee daddy-o.
Dirry mee doo, mee doo, mee doo,
The day we went to Rothesay, O.

Come Up and See Ma Garret

Come up and see ma garret
Come up and see it noo.
Come up and see ma garret
Fer it's all furnished noo.

Wi' and old broken table,
A chair withoot a leg,
A humpy-back't dresser,
And a bowdy-legged bed.

Oh, the wearin' o' the green,
Oh, the wearin' o' the green.
They're hangin' men and women
Fer the wearin' o' the green.

Wee Macgreeger

Wee Macgreeger is like a neeger,
Dressed up in red and white and blue.
He wears a tammie,
To please his mammy.
So what d'you think o' wee Macgreeger noo?

These songs are striking for their sense of immediacy of life here and now. Set in the present tense, using personal pronouns, they have the qualities of speech, conversation and dialogue. The language in Scots idiom is playful, rhythmic and comic, which together with the other features of these songs, produce animated and vivid descriptions of people, places and behaviour. Something similar can be seen in the songs of the music hall tradition that we sang. In these examples - the first deriving from a Harry Lauder song, the other from Will Fyffe - the pleasures of inebriation are celebrated, with the songs playing on the stereotype of the Scot who likes a 'wee dram':

A Wee Deoch-an-doris [61]

Just a wee deoch-an-doris,
Just a wee yin that's a'.
Just a wee deoch-an-doris,
Before we gang a-wa'.
There's a wee wifie waitin',
By a wee but-an-ben.
If you can say, "It's a braw bricht moonlicht nicht"

Yer a'right, ye ken.

I Belong to Glasgow [62]

I belong to Glasgow,
Dear old Glasgow toon.
But what's the matter wi' Glasgow,
Fer it's goin' roond and roond.
I'm only a common old working chap,
As anyone here can see,
But when I get a couple o' drinks on a Saturday,
Glasgow belongs to me!

This sense of the here and now of a domestic life was also enhanced through our custom of personalising the songs, substituting family names and the names of suburbs in which we lived, and other kinds of family references. *All the Wee Laddies in Drylaw*, for example, was adapted to include our names and our Scottish suburb and subsequently, the grandchildren and their Australian home suburbs. *Gordon Where's Yer Troosers*, (originally Donald in the Andy Stewart version) and *Oh Gordy Dougal, I Love You* (originally Molly Riley), received similar treatments, in these cases acknowledging our younger brother.

Oh, Gordy Dougal, I Love You [63]

Oh, Gordy Dougal, I love you.
Tell me Gordy Dougal
Does your heart beat true?
Marry me ma darlin', I'll die if you say no,
And my ghost will come and haunt you,
Gordy Dougal, oh.

Some songs also provided a readymade personal family connection - such as Burns' *John Anderson my Jo*, (my father's name was Jo), and others, like *The Cameron Men*, which was associated with and sung to our nephew, Cameron. The music hall style song,

A Gordon fer Me, which refers to the Scottish kilted clan regiments, and the John Dougall in *The Wee Cooper o' Fife*, part of an old Scottish ballad dealing with domestic disharmony, were also family favourites.

The Wee Cooper o' Fife [64]

There was a wee cooper who lived in Fife,
Nickety, nackety, noo, noo, noo,
And he has gotten a gentle wife,
Hi Willie Wallacky, hi John Dougall,
Alane quo' rashety, noo, noo, noo.

She woudnae bake, she wouldnae brew,
Nickety, nackety, noo, noo, noo,
For spoiling o' her comely hue,
Hi Willie Wallacky, hi John Dougall,
Alane quo' rashety, noo, noo, noo.

The sense of a domestic and familial social space in these songs is also shaped in recurrent themes of courtship and romance that run like a thread through most of the family songs. Some - very much in the music hall mode, as these Harry Lauder songs - are typically humorous and cheeky, and framed in caricatures of Scottish personae and idiom:

Stop Yer Ticklin', Jock! [65]

Will you stop yer ticklin', Jock!
Will you stop yer ticklin', Jock!
Dinnae mak' me laugh so hearty,
Or you'll mak' me choke.
Oh, I wish you'd stop yer nonsense,
Just look at all the folk.
Will you stop yer tic-kl'-in', tic-kle-ic-kle-ic-kle-in'.
Stop yer ticklin' Jock!

Roamin' in the Gloamin' [66]

Roamin' in the gloamin'
By the bonnie banks o' Clyde,
Roamin' in the gloamin'
Wi' a lassie by ma side.
When the sun has gone to rest,
That's the time that I like best,
O, it's lovely roamin' in the gloamin'.

Our much reduced versions of these songs capture the mood, sentiment and declaration of the songs' romantic intent in the choruses of songs, and in opening verses. The choruses are also where the language tends to be most rhythmic and playful, no doubt adding to their appeal as songs to sing along to in the music hall tradition, and for our family.

In most of these songs of a domestic/familial orientation, the treatment is humorous and wry, although one song, *Lady Lido*, addresses the tragic consequences of courtship and romance. It tackles the theme of infanticide, albeit in the form of a deadpan children's parody of an old ballad that undercuts the theme's seriousness. This song is unlike most of the other domestic/familial songs in that it is framed as a traditional story narrative and set in the past tense, as does *The Wee Cooper o' Fife*; although it was sung to a lively, jaunty tune, unlike Lady Lido. Both are drawn from old Scottish ballads, and both have a long and widespread history of being made over as children's rhymes.[67]

Lady Lido

There was a lady dressed in green,
Poor Lady Lido.
There was a lady dressed in green,
Down by the greenwood side o.

She had a baby in her arms,
Poor Lady Lido.

She had a baby in her arms,
Down by the greenwood side o.

She had a penknife, long and sharp,
Poor Lady Lido.
She had a penknife long and sharp,
Down by the greenwood side o.

She stuck it into the baby's heart,
Poor Lady Lido.
She stuck it into the baby's heart,
Down by the greenwood side o.

The more she wiped it, the more it bled,
Poor Lady Lido.
The more she wiped it, the more it bled,
Down by the greenwood side o.

There came three policemen at the door,
Poor Lady Lido.
There came three policemen at the door,
Down by the greenwood side o.

They took her to the jail
And they hung her on a nail,
Poor Lady Lido.
They took her to the jail
And they hung her on a nail,
Down by the greenwood side o.

And that was the end of the lady in green,
Poor Lady Lido.
And that was the end of the lady in green,
Down by the greenwood side o.

In addition to the songs that deal with courtship and romance in a humorous or ironic fashion in the form of children's rhymes and music hall songs, are love songs from

tradition including those of Robert Burns. With a similar focus on courtship as the children's rhymes and music hall songs, the Burns' songs, like *Comin' Through the Rye*, were woven into, and adapted, in this domestic/familial song narrative.

Comin' Through the Rye [68]

Gin a body meet a body
Comin' through the rye.
Gin a body kiss a body
Need a body cry?

Every lassie has her laddie
Nane, they say, hae I.
Yet a' the lads they smile at me,
Comin' through the rye.

This song, and others of Burns that we sang, may seem unlikely musical 'bedfellows' with the children's rhymes and music hall songs. Take, for example, *I'm Gaein' in the Train*, Harry Lauder's *Roamin' in the Gloamin'*, and Burns' *Comin' Through the Rye*. The first is a cheeky rhyme of ribaldry and romantic rivalry; the second, a swaggering music hall caricature of Scottish romance between a bonnie lass and laddie; and the third, considered as one of Burns' finest love songs.[69] Each of them is a song about love and romance, and as such, participates in the domestic/familial orientation of the family's song repertoire. But there are other similarities. *Comin' Through the Rye*, in this family form, is also not all that far removed from *I'm Gaein' in the Train*. Both are direct, conversational and cheeky in tone, sharing also those qualities with the Lauder song.

As with the other Burns songs that we sang, such as, *Ye Banks and Braes*, and *My Love is Like a Red, Red Rose*, there is an interplay of meaning across all of the songs, with each being shaped by the other. As Constantine and G Porter have suggested, song performance brings individual songs into a relationship with one another. In that interplay, meanings become more open-ended, with the boundaries between one song

and another less fixed, so that they become more open to a relationship with other songs on similar themes. While the tone and mood of some of these traditional songs is more considered, the language more figurative and metaphoric, they share a thematic emphasis, with the other songs, on the personal experience of love and courtship, expressed in the intimacy of first person:

Ye Banks and Braes [70]

Ye banks and braes o' bonnie Doon,
How can ye bloom sae fresh and fair?
How can ye chant, ye little birds,
And I sae weary, full o' care.

You'll break my heart, you warbling bird,
That wanders thro' the flowering thorn.
Reminds me o' departed joys,
Departed, never to return.

My Love is Like a Red, Red, Rose [71]

My love is like a red, red rose
That's newly sprung in June.
My love is like a melody,
That's sweetly played in tune.

So fair art thou my bonnie lass,
So deep in love am I,
And I will love you still my dear,
Till all the seas run dry.

Till all the seas run dry my dear,
And the rocks melt with the sun.
And I will love you still my dear,
Till the sands of life are run.

These Burns songs too, like others, capture mood and sentiment in distilled form that give a 'feel' for the song's parameters, but rework them; so that the forms, conventions and meanings of 'traditional' song are displaced and shifted in the context of family singing, becoming new points of narrative departure. Importantly, these Burns love songs are also examples of where the themes of a highland and rural Scotland cross over with these domestic and courtship themes. The Burns songs, in particular, draw upon the natural landscape of Scotland as not only a setting, but also where the landscape itself serves as a key metaphor for love and lost love.

Highlands and Islands

There is no one song source type here: the music hall songs, the children's rhymes and the national and traditional songs of Scotland participate in various ways in the narrative of the highlands. The highland narrative and its iconography recurs throughout all of the family repertoire. In some, it is in the form of bonnie hieland laddies and lassies, kilts and soldiers, typically in a humorous fashion, and again, often in the context of courtship and romance:

A Gordon fer Me [72]

A Gordon fer me, a Gordon fer me,
If ye're no a Gordon ye're nae use to me.
The Black Watch are braw, the Seaforths and a'
But a cocky wee Gordon's the pride o' them a'.

I Love a Lassie [73]

I love a lassie, a bonnie bonnie lassie,
She's as pure as a lily in the dell.
She's sweet as the heather, the bonnie bloomin' heather,
Mary, my Scots bluebell.

Romance and an affectionate derision are also common treatments, with laddies in kilts being a key motif, as in *I'm Gaein' in the Train* and *Gordon, Where's Yer Troosers?*:

Gordon, Where's Yer Troosers? [74]

Oh, I just came doon from the Isle of Skye,
I'm no' very big and I'm a wee bit shy,
The lassies say as I go by,
Gordon, where's yer troosers?

Let the wind blow high,
Let the wind blow low,
Through the streets in ma' kilt I'll go.
All the lassies say, hello!
Gordon, where's yer troosers?

Where these domestic/familial songs locate highland iconography and references within the immediacy of a contemporary and day-to-day urban life, most of the songs that are set in or directly evoke the highlands, the islands, country side or foreign shores tend to be those that focus on Scottish historical/cultural themes. In many, the mood is more restrained and reflective. In our version of *A Scottish Soldier*, by Andy Stewart, there is a haunting first person 'voice' of a dying soldier, yearning for home and Scotland, that serves to heighten the patriotic sentiment of the song and the sense of personal attachment to a highland Scotland:

A Scottish Soldier [75]

There was a soldier, a Scottish soldier,
Who wandered far away and soldiered far away.
There was none bolder, with good broad shoulders,
Amongst the green hills of Tyrol.

He's seen the glory, he's told the story,
Of battles glorious and deeds victorious.
But now he's dying, his heart is crying,

To leave these green hills of Tyrol.

Because these green hills are not highland hills,
Nor the island's hills, they're not my land's hills.
As fair as these green foreign hills may be,
They are not the hills of home.

These songs of the highlands and history constitute widely recognised emblematic markers of Scottishness that have been forged out of pride in its martial traditions and brave soldiers of the kilted clan regiments; Scotland as land of pride and yearning for the return of Bonnie Prince Charlie; and the symbolic power of the Scottish landscape to shape feeling and mood. They draw on commonplace cultural references, themes and symbols that are integral to the song traditions from which they derive, particularly national songs and other traditional songs associated with a highland and Jacobite cultural view of Scottish history:

Skye Boat Song [76]

Speed bonnie boat like a bird on the wing,
Onward, the sailors cry.
Carry the lad that's born to be king,
Over the sea to Skye.

Loud the wind howls, loud the waves roar,
Thunderclaps rend the air.
Baffled our foes, stand by the shore,
Follow they will not dare.

Speed bonnie boat like a bird on the wing,
Onward, the sailors cry.
Carry the lad that's born to be king,
Over the sea to Skye.

Loch Lomond [77]

By yon bonnie banks and by yon bonnie braes,
Where the sun shines bright on Loch Lomond.
Where me and my true love will never meet again,
On the bonnie, bonnie banks o' Loch Lomond.

Oh you take the high road and I'll take the low road,
And I'll be in Scotland before ye.
For me and my true love will never meet again,
On the bonnie, bonnie banks o' Loch Lomond.

In their abbreviated distilled forms, the family songs capture the type of narrative that these song traditions offer, highlighting and intensifying the emotional and thematic core of the narrative, that can be redolent with cultural and patriot sentiment, and as much respectful as mocking. In retaining only an opening verse or more commonly only the chorus of a song, the effect becomes something like a musical snapshot in close-up. The mood of an historical moment and its metaphoric/symbolic possibilities are foregrounded in vignettes that distil and emphasise emotion and sentiment and thematic concerns over plot lines and historical detail. In songs like, *A Hundred Pipers* by Lady Nairne, and *The Campbells are Comin'* by Burns, little is retained of these Jacobite songs, but in the chant-like choruses, sung to lively catchy tunes, the celebratory tone and patriotic sentiment is clear:

The Campbells are Comin' [78]

The Campbells are comin', Yoho, Yoho,
The Campbells are comin', Yoho, Yoho,
The Campbells are comin' to bonnie Loch Leven,
The Campbells are comin', Yoho, Yoho.

A Hundred Pipers [79]

Wi' a hundred pipers, an' a', an' a',

A hundred pipers, an' a', an' a',
We'll up an' gie them a blaw, a blaw,
A hundred pipers, an' a', an' a'.

There is a sense of immediacy, and human engagement in a dramatic moment in these songs. Typically from a first person perspective, expressive and speech-like they have the qualities of an eyewitness account in real time. In them history is drawn in human terms with an emphasis on character rather than story lines. Conveyed in a conversational and direct address, the young Jacobite Prince Charles in Burns' song is a 'darlin', and 'Charlie' - an object of affection and romantic desire:

Charlie is Ma Darlin' [80]

Oh Charlie is ma darlin', ma darlin', ma darlin'.
Charlie is ma darlin', the young Chevalier.

Was on a Monday morning,
Right early in the year,
When Charlie came to our town,
The young Chevalier.

Oh Charlie is ma darlin', ma darlin', ma darlin'.
Charlie is ma darlin', the young Chevalier.

The iconic highlander, highland soldier and the kilted Scottish clan regiments too are brought to life as named individuals, as flesh and blood men who can be desired, admired, (or affectionately lampooned, as in *Gordon, Where's Yer Troosers?* and *A Gordon fer Me*). *Hi Fer Geordie*, another in a Jacobite theme, and sung to a lively traditional pipe tune, *The Cock o' the North*, is one of several family songs that chants support and pride in the Jacobite cause, in this case in the form of a children's rhyme parody:

Hi Fer Geordie [81]

Hi fer Geordie
Hi fer Geordie
Hi fer the Cock o' the North.
Hi fer Geordie
Hi fer Geordie
Hi fer the Cock o' the North.

Like their music hall equivalents, there is a mood here of triumphal pride in the bravery and physical appeal of the kilted Scot:

The Cameron Men [82]

Oh, oh, Jock but you're handsome,
And you're brave and you're braw.
With your bully beef tartan,
And you're sporran and all.
You're the pride and joy,
Of all the lassies in the glen.
And proudly you'll walk with the Cameron men.

The 'active amorist' highlander is captured somewhat tangentially in *Hielan' Laddie*, a song that bears a strong resemblance to an eighteenth century street song, popular at a time when the highland laddie was about to be reconfigured into Bonnie Prince Charlie. Although the fuller original song was sexually charged, our reduced version has more the qualities of a nursery rhyme, sung, as it was, to children, and in group singing. Its opening lines appear in many old Highland Laddie songs, including those of a Jacobite theme, and it is not possible to be certain whether our song derived from these, from the street song that it is so similar to, or perhaps a children's rhyme version.[83] Whether its 'original' highland laddie was an attractive highlander, a highland soldier, the Jacobite prince, or a children's parody of such, our *Hielan' Laddie* carries with it the same sense of personal appeal and desire associated with a highland lad, but frames it more in terms of a familial affection towards a bonnie child:

Hielan' Laddie [84]

Where have you been a' the day?
Bonnie laddie, hielan' laddie.
Where have you been a' the day?
Ma bonnie hielan' laddie.

Like all of our songs, these songs of history do not tell a fully resolved narrative, rather they capture the narratives of Scottish history in intimate moments of human exchange and response. In doing so, they serve to inflect rather than invent the qualities that to a large extent are inscribed in the songs that are their sources. Like their sources, (traditional/national song, music hall, and children's rhymes) these are not rarefied, formalised, distant accounts of history, but emblematic cameos, which make broad appeals to emotion and sentiment, which are dramatised, celebrated or parodied in song. Our family version of *There's Nae Luck Aboot the Hoose* provides a useful example of these song qualities, and also demonstrates how in many of our family songs both a domestic/familial and a wider cultural/historical sense of place are brought together and evoked:

There's Nae Luck Aboot the Hoose

There's nae luck aboot the hoose,
There's nae luck at a'.
There's nae luck aboot the hoose,
Since Charlie's gone awa'.

This song derives from one of the national songs that Burns described as 'one of the most beautiful songs in the Scots, or any other language'.[85] In the old song, of up to ten verses, a woman eagerly anticipates the return of her husband Colin after a long absence. In our family song of four brief lines, only the chorus from the original has been retained. But a new last line has been added which radically alters the song's original meaning. In the old song, the last line of the chorus refers to the husband. In our version, the core idea of absence and loss is instead attached to Bonnie Prince Charlie. What was

an intensely intimate domestic marital theme is shifted to a larger cultural theme. At the same time the song retains the connotations and associations of home, as a domestic domain in 'the hoose', but expands those to encompass a larger historical/cultural sense of home, that is, Scotland. In this song, the narrative of Scottish history, carried in the complex Jacobite myth, is distilled into a single condensed metaphor that is at once both familial and day-to-day, and at the same time redolent with cultural meaning associated with its Jacobite theme. As such, it retains the traces of those elegaic historical themes of absence and loss, but its feel is much lighter and playful. Framed in the qualities of a children's rhyme parody, and together with the lively jig tune to which it was sung, this song, like many of the others, acknowledges and recognises cultural history through frames of reference that are local, familiar and familial.

Like this song, what is distinctive about all of the songs that draw on highlands is not so much that they are set in or evoke a particular narrative of the highlands or Scottish history, but the ways in which these narratives have been constructed in national/traditional songs, 'made over' in music hall songs, children's rhymes and then further as family songs. There is also nothing especially divergent in the politics or cultural/historical position of these family songs. Their 'subversiveness' lies in the way that dominant cultural narratives have been rendered - personalised and localised - in effect 'domesticating' the grand narratives of Scottish history and culture. In doing so, these songs share a number of key features with the 'domestic/familial' songs, and in many cases are the same songs.

Foreign Shores - Home and Away

Overlaying these two broad social spheres of the domestic/familial and the highlands is a metaphoric space of 'home' and 'away'. There is kind of duality across the family repertoire of songs that plays out a tension between belonging and longing for home. The domestic/familial songs, in particular, are grounded in being at 'home', belonging, settled and safe and fun, finding humour in life's domestic travails. The Scottish landscape, the highlands and islands, towns and cities are also positioned in the songs as

icons of identity and attachment, pleasure and desire. Scotland as a 'homeland' to be proud of is captured in the mood of triumphal pride in Scotland's martial and Jacobite history, in songs like, *The Campbells are Comin'*, *The Cameron Men*, *A Hundred Pipers*, *A Gordon fer Me*, *Charlie is Ma Darlin'*; and in the swaggering positive declaration of Scots identity in the songs from the music hall tradition, *I Belong to Glasgow*, *Roamin' in the Gloamin'*, and *I Love a Lassie*.

The other face of 'home' is its absence. There are songs that speak of absence and loss, of yearning for the homeland or lost love or a lost history. Again many of these songs pick up on the wider cultural narratives that characterise many of the national and traditional songs of Scotland - the romance of the highlands, and the elegaic themes of the highlands and the Jacobite cause, in songs like *Ye Banks and Braes*, *There's Nae Luck Aboot the Hoose*, *Hielan' Laddie, Skye Boat Song*, and *Loch Lomond*. Together with these is the archetypal Scottish song of dislocation, loss and reunion, *Auld Lang Syne*, and another popular drinking song of parting, *We're No' Awa' tae Bide Awa'*:

Auld Lang Syne [86]

Should auld acquaintance be forgot,
And never brought to mind.
Should auld acquaintance be forgot,
For the sake of auld lang syne.

For auld lang syne my dear,
For auld lang syne.
We'll take a cup o' kindness yet,
For the sake of auld lang syne.

We're No' Awa' tae Bide Awa' [87]

For we're no' awa' tae bide awa',
For we're no' awa' tae leave ye.
For we're no' awa' tae bide awa',
We'll aye come back an' see ye.

The highlands and the islands are a characteristic feature of these songs that capture themes of absence and of the desire to return home from foreign shores, or to recapture something lost. In addition to those mentioned above, songs such as, *A Scottish Soldier*, *The Road to the Isles*, *Granny's Hielan' Hame*, and *Westering Home*, also tell of partings, wanderings, returnings, loss and nostalgia associated with a highland/island home.

The Road to the Isles [88]

It's a far croonin' that's pullin' me away
As take I wi' my crummack to the road.
The far Cullins are puttin' love on me
As step I wi' the sunlight for my load.

Sure, by Tummel and Loch Rannoch
And Lochaber I will go.
By heather tracks wi' heaven in their wiles.
If it's thinkin' in your inner heart the braggart's in my step,
You've never felt the tangle o' the Isles.

Granny's Hielan' Hame [89]

Away in the hielan's,
There stands a wee hoose,
And it stands on the breast of the brae.
Where we played as laddies,
So long ago,
And it seems it was just yesterday.

Westering Home [90]

And it's westering home wi' a song in the air,
Light in me heart an' it's goodbye to care,
Laughter o' love and a welcomin' there,
Isle o' my heart, my own land.

A Family's Scotland

In the previous section I proposed that it was Scotland and family life that was being 'savoured' in these songs. I also suggested that the kind of Scotland that these songs capture is one with a decidedly human face. The analysis of the songs has sought to show how Scotland is pictured and evoked in human terms that serve to attach Scotland to family life. Through both the form and content of this repertoire of songs, the cultural narrative of Scotland is personalised through local and familial frames of reference, shaping it as a family narrative as much as an historical/cultural one. In these songs, Scotland is a 'place' where a domestic and familial Scotland sits comfortably with a wider cultural and historical Scotland - where a more contemporary and urban Scotland meets a symbolic highland and historical Scotland through wit, humour and sentiment. History is brought to life in musical snapshots that foreground character, and an emotional and personal engagement with history's themes and key figures. It is also a place expressed in the immediacy of the vernacular - in the language of speech, dialogue, idiom and humour - and in musical form, in the playfulness in language, rhyme and rhythm. In these songs the grand themes of history and culture are rendered playful, as songs to be to sung and enjoyed, 'savoured' as family entertainment like all the other songs.

In them is a Scottishness that is neither 'genteel', 'polite' nor 'literary'. Neither is it a Scottishness that is especially 'ennobling' or 'radical'. It is a Scottishness that is more cheeky in feel though certainly not bawdy. The Scottishness here is one that is closer to what Donald Low and others have referred to, with respect to Burns' songs, as 'genial' or 'sociable'. Like Burns' songs, that were created as songs to be sung, these family songs were a participatory medium designed for the pleasure of singing.[91] In family performance, Scotland's national and traditional songs have taken on some of the 'unvarnished' and participatory qualities of the songs of the street and children's rhymes, and have more in common with those and the music hall, than with the parlour room or even the folk revival. In this way, the hackneyed and clichéd in all of our

Scottish songs has been reworked and refreshed. Out of the commonplace, new meanings have been engendered in which cultural narratives have been given new 'subject positions'.

The Scotland that is pictured in these family songs is constructed out of the commonplace and familiar: in the songs and songs traditions that were a commonplace feature of early twentieth Scottish urban song culture; and in the commonplace cultural references, themes and symbols that abide in the songs, and in the family's social and cultural world. The fact these songs are grounded in the commonplace, can serve to muddy any distinction between the songs themselves and social/cultural realm in which they were experienced. What I am arguing here, is that the songs can appear to be an unmediated reflection of that cultural context. This issue can be seen most particularly in the songs that focus on domestic and familial themes. These songs bear a particularly close relationship to our family life itself. They are about 'family life' and contain familiar local and cultural references to family life in Scotland and to our family life. The songs were also drawn from a Scottish family life, from the songs of childhood and other songs that were a part of the family's local, social and cultural world. Moreover our version of the songs became part of family life. Thus, these songs not only 'speak' in culturally familiar terms of family life, but they also encode the memories and associations of a particular family life - one that was intimately connected with the songs themselves.

There is, however, an important distinction to be made here between these songs and our family and cultural life. And that is, that these and the other songs in the family repertoire are 'symbolic' realities - albeit ones that closely approximate the 'real' world of culture and custom of my family. These songs do symbolic work, but it is symbolic work that draws heavily on the real world of experience. The symbolic realities that the songs picture is drawn in and from the language, cultural forms and familiar and cultural references that constituted my family's everyday life. As Pickering and Green have argued, songs are not merely entertainment; they serve as 'symbolic' realities that interact in a dialectical process with everyday life. They constitute 'ways of handling

experience' that can be used to 'inform people's sensibilities and social identities, their own understandings and social values'.[92] Where songs arise from within a community, from its needs and interests, then what they signify and stand for within that group may serve to support or challenge 'how things are' in the real word. In other words, the content of songs is not necessarily a direct reflection of what or how things are valued since a song's manifest content may serve to belie the function or role that it serves within a group.[93]

As Ian Russell has argued, with respect to the role of parody in song performance, its function may be 'conservative and normative', and 'transformative' and 'reflexive'. While allowing for the subversion of the text, or singing style of song; in the performative context, the conventions and norms of the performance itself may, in fact, be reinforced.[94] In his example, it is the conventions and norms of singing in pubs; in this study, it is the conventions and norms associated with the ritual of family singing that are reinforced. In this way, I would argue that these family songs serve a particularly supportive role - that 'family life' was being affirmed (if not celebrated) through the performance these songs. Their emphasis on the domestic and familial points to a field of shared cultural meaning, reflecting shared understanding and valuing of that domain of life. While this aspect of the songs will be considered further below, and elaborated in the next chapter, I would propose that my family drew on the *symbolic* commonplace and familiar offered in song, to confirm and affirm the commonplace and familiar in family life. They also continued that strategy in Australia, drawing on the symbolic commonplace and familiar in song, and in the tradition of family singing.

As the songs continued to be connected to family life in Australia, building new associations and memories, the continuance of songs from a family's personal and cultural past certainly indicates the importance of that past. When those songs emphasise the historical and cultural past, themes of exile and absence, and evoke a safe and valued domesticity, this may suggest a nostalgic yearning to return to an idealised past. They may also signal the kind of 'romantic nationalism' that has been observed in migrants' music.[95] In many ways the family songs, like those in Shelemay's study discussed

previously, construct a history that is incomplete and valedictory, idealised and selective, and are 'silent' about current national and political issues. These family songs do speak of a 'safe' and 'mythologised' Scottish history and culture, through commonplace myths, icons and symbols, and through its literary and musical past. But they also treat that past in particular ways. If, as Constantine and G Porter suggest, these song fragments and fusions are a form of parody, then it is a form of parody that is more playful than reverential, managing to combine a sense of pride and attachment with an affectionate mockery towards the cultural trappings of a nation. It is as if, as McCrone has observed of the Scots in general, that while my family had regard for its cultural past, it did not need to 'genuflect' at cultural icons, that no 'correct' cultural response needed to be observed.[96] In the family's songs, the same playful, ironic, mocking stance that is taken to the domestic and familial is applied to history and culture. In the playful and affectionate, is also the affirming and confirming of a domestic and cultural past and heritage.

The usage in the songs of explicit symbols of Scottishness, icons of nation and nationhood has also been noted as characteristic features in the narratives of Scottish migrants to Australia by Hammerton in his studies.[97] But, as his analysis indicates, these signs of attachment to national heritage and loyalty, if considered apart from the larger context of life stories and family history can misunderstand Scottish migrant identities. These songs 'voice' Scotland as both a national cultural heritage and history, and as a more intimate family heritage of song and memories. They speak of Scotland in commonplace cultural references, imagery, symbol and language, but they also speak of Scotland in more personal terms. Through them, an historical and cultural heritage is encoded as personalised, family understandings and memories. Integrated into family life, the songs were also connected to family biography and family history, and to the times and places in which the songs were encountered, the songs of a childhood in Scotland, and of early family life, and the popular music of the time. In this way the songs speak of an earlier twentieth century Scotland and the cultural life of a suburban family, and in doing so, they 'savour' associations and memories of family life as much as they 'savour' Scotland.

It is what my family did with these songs, and how those songs became attached to family life that can reveal more subtle understandings of *their* Scotland as a place and how that Scotland was placed, positioned in the family. The next chapter will focus on the performance of the songs in the family - the 'patterned context' - in which the singing of these songs served to construct crucial senses of cultural continuity, family and belonging.

---

[1] As Thomas McKean notes, songs arise 'from social interaction - family and community contact where song is both the catalyst and the product' (McKean, 2003 (b), p 3).

[2] See West, 2006, for an account of the varieties of music sources drawn upon in Scottish domestic settings; and Finlay, 2004.

[3] These key sites of musical socialisation are described by Finnegan, 1989, discussed in D Russell, 1993, p 147.

[4] For example, in institutional settings, such as schools, traditional and 'folk' songs were incorporated into the curriculum as part of a nationalistic cultural endeavour (Cox, 1992).

[5] Toelken, 1995, p 31.

[6] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 113.

[7] McKean, 2003 (b), p 6.

[8] Toelken, 1995, p 1.

[9] Toelken, 1995, p 32.

[10] Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, 1996, p 297.

[11] Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, 1996, p 293.

[12] Bruner and Fleisher Feldman, 1996, p 301.

[13] Toelken, 1995, p 39.

[14] Toelken, 1995, p 30.

[15] Toelken, 1995, p 31.

[16] Toelken, 1995, p 115.

[17] Toelken, 1995, p 33. See also McKean, 2003 (b), pp 7-8, for a discussion on the uses of text in song analysis; and David Engle, James Porter, and Roger de V Renwick's chapter in the same volume that examines Wilgus' argument of 'the text is the thing'. As they note, 'in exhorting us to take the 'text' as the 'thing', Wilgus was asking that we concentrate on the artifacts within their performance and traditional contexts, rather than lose sight of them' (Engle, J Porter, and Renwick, 2003, p 366). At the analytical

level this study employs the concept of 'text' in its cultural sense, that is, a song functions as a 'cultural text', a site of meaning making (see Storey's account of 'text' in cultural studies, Storey, 2003 (b), pp 1-6).

[18] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 91.

[19] Toelken, 2003, p viii.

[20] Toelken, 1995, p 12.

[21] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 86.

[22] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 8.

[23] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 77.

[24] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 13.

[25] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 145. See also Pickering and Green, 1987 (c), p 177.

[26] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 128.

[27] Toelken, 1995, p 97.

[28] Constantine and G Porter, p 115.

[29] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 116.

[30] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 94.

[31] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, pp 95-96.

[32] Hutcheon, 2000, pp 32-37. I Russell also makes a similar point in relation to song performance (I Russell, 1987 (a), pp 99-100).

[33] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 112.

[34] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 129 and p 227.

[35] Hutcheon, 2000, pp 35-36.

[36] For children's lore and its social functions, see Opie, 1985 and 2001; Ritchie, 1999 and 2000; Sutton-Smith, et al, 1999; Darian-Smith and Factor, 2005. Children's lore has, according to Brian Sutton-Smith, a strong association with 'children's own peer socialization pressures' (Sutton-Smith, 1999, p 142). Its formative role is the 'establishment and maintenance of the peer group in its antithetical relationship to adult conventions' (Sutton-Smith, 1999, p 143). Felicia McMahon and Sutton-Smith also note that a dominant theme in the scholarship is 'that of the power the children exercise over each other, and the power they seek in their relationship to adults, mythical or real' (McMahon and Sutton-Smith, 1999, p 299). Children's lore 'subverts adults and empowers children' (McMahon and Sutton-Smith, 1999, p 302).

[37] I Russell, 1987 (a), p 92. He draws a distinction between two interrelated aspects of song parody: the parody genre of song, ie songs that are parodies in 'explicit' meaning and form; and techniques of performance that convey 'implicit' meanings in which songs, styles of singing, song traditions, and aspects of life are parodied (I Russell, 1987 (a), p 92, and pp 97-99). Both of these dimensions of parody typically function together in vernacular song performance, underscoring the 'multiformed and multifaceted' nature of parody. The family's song repertoire is constituted by 'source' songs that were parodies themselves, other songs that were parodied in family performance, and 'source' parodies that

were further parodied in family singing. The family repertoire thus exhibits a 'tone' of parody, irreverence and cheekiness in both song selection and song shaping in performance.

[38] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 95. Here, they draw on Ong, 1988, and Foley, 1991.

[39] Constantine and G Porter, 2003, p 103.

[40] My paraphrase of Stokes, regarding the appropriation of mainstream music by subcultures (Stokes, 1997, p 19). Ian Russell makes the point that knowledge of a song's 'original' and its cultural connotations is not always necessary for a song to make local sense, or indeed for a parody of a song to make sense, since parody can be 'activated' through performance cues (I Russell, 1987 (a), p 93). I have no disagreement with this view, but the point that I am making is that the songs that my family drew upon were part of a familiar song culture in which its cultural references, motifs and imagery were highly recognisable and were an integral part of the family's cultural lexicon. At the same time, many of the more immediate and popular 'sources' of specific songs were known to us as part of our day-to-day musical environment. Examples of that wider song culture, such as, references to specific songs and singers, and children's rhymes, are provided throughout this chapter as contextual information.

[41] Toelken, 2003, p ix.

[42] Toelken, 1995, p 5. Toelken acknowledges Roger Renwick, 1980, for this.

[43] Toelken, 1995, p 51.

[44] Toelken, 1995, pp 50-51.

[45] J Porter draws on the work of Tilley, 1994, for his analysis.

[46] J Porter, 1998, p 4.

[47] 'hoose' = house; 'but-an-ben' = a two roomed house; 'garret' = loft, attic room in a tenement; 'toon' = town; 'mammies' = mothers; 'bairns' = babies, children; 'bissom' = a term of contempt applied to a person, generally a woman; sometimes to a woman of loose character, sometimes jocularly to a woman or young girl (*SND*).

[48] 'gaein' ' = going (SND). Ewan McVicar identifies the chorus at the end of this song as a Gaelic chorus to another song:

Come a ree come a rye come a ro
Come a ree come a rye come a ro russ
Come a ree come a rye come a rach ee oh
And that's the Fenian chorus.

My transcription is a phonetic interpretation of our sung version. McVicar also suggests that the Gaelic tune was typically used for *I'm Gaein' in the Train* (McVicar, 2007, p 174).

[49] 'ee' = eye (SND).

[50] See, for example, West, who notes the 'creative surge of rhymes, clapping songs and other ditties which enlivened the kitchen as well as the stair well, street and playground' (West, 2006, p 120). See also Finlay,

2004, p 119; and, Smout, 1997, p 149. There are a number of actuality recordings of Scottish children's songs and rhymes of the period, that include many of the songs that we sang: *Ippetty Sippetty*, Folktrax, 1978; *Here We Go Loobie Loo*, Folktrax, 1982; *Singing in the Streets: Scottish Children's Songs*, The Alex Lomax Collection, Rounder Records, 2004; and, *Chokit on a Tattie: Children's Songs and Rhymes*, produced by the School of Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh, and released through Greentrax Recordings, 2006. Also see Stanley Robertson, *Rum Scum Scoosh!: Songs and Stories of an Aberdeen Childhood*, Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, 2003. See Ritchie, 1999 and 2000; Montgomerie, 1948; Opie, 1985 and 2001; and McVicar, 2007, for other twentieth century examples in print.

[51] See n 50; and Chambers, 1842; Moffatt, 1933; Shuldham-Shaw et al, 2002; Gomme, 1964 for children's rhymes history.

[52] 'cuddy' = horse (SND).

[53] 'doo' = pigeon or dove (SND). 'a doo fell aff a dyke' = a dove fell off a wall.

[54] Drylaw was the suburb where we lived in Edinburgh.

[55] See Ritchie, 2000, p 26; *Tocher*, no 44, 1992, p 119; and, McVicar, 2007, pp 176-178.

[56] *Andy Stewart, Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[57] *The Nicest-Looking Warden in the ARP*, by Dave Willis, a Scottish comic performer (Ritchie, 2000, p 24). See also *WW2 People's War: An archive of World War Two Memories – Written by the Public Gathered by the BBC*; and, *Dave Willis (1895-1973)*, University of Glasgow, Special Collections.

[58] The song, known as, *The Day We Went to Rothesay, O*, was also made commercially popular by Scottish singers, such as, Robert Wilson, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 1, Legacy, 2005.

[59] The line 'For, they are hanging men and women for the Wearing of the Green' appears in an 1860's Irish political ballad *The Wearing of the Green* (see *Bodleian Library Catalogue of Ballads*).

[60] John Bell's humorous fictional stories of a Glasgow family, the Robinsons and its central child character, Wee Macgreegor, was first published in 1902 (see *John Joy Bell*, The Glasgow Story website).

[61] 'deoch-an-doris' = a parting drink, 'one for the road' (SND). The original song was written by Harry Lauder, Whit Cunliffe, and Gerald Grafton (1911). See, for example, *Harry Lauder, Roamin' in the Gloamin': Original Recordings, 1926-1930*, Naxos, 2004. It was also sung by Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; and Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart, Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[62] The original song written by Will Fyffe (1921). See, for example, *Will Fyffe*, Lismor, 1994. Also sung by Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; and Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart, Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[63] See Roy Palmer, 1983, p 68, for a reference to this popular song:

Oh, Molly Riley, I love you.
Tell me, Molly Riley, does yer 'eart beat true?

Marry me my darling, I'll die if you say no

And you'll never 'ave another, Molly Riley, oh.

---

[64] This traditional song was sung by popular singers of the time, such as, Kenneth McKellar, *Folk Songs from Scotland's Heritage: Kenneth McKellar's Scotland*, Vocalion, 2008; and Moira Anderson, *A Sprig of White Heather*, Phillips, 1965.

[65] Original song written by Harry Lauder and Frank Folloy (1904). *Harry Lauder, Roamin' in the Gloamin': Original Recordings, 1926-1930*, Naxos, 2004. Also sung by other popular Scottish singers, such as Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; and Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[66] *Harry Lauder, Roamin' in the Gloamin': Original Recordings, 1926-1930*, Naxos, 2004. Also sung by Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; and Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart, Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[67] See Annie G Gilchrist's discussion of children's versions of 'The Cruel Mother' ballad that includes a similar song to *Lady Lido* called *There was a Lady Drest in Green* (Gilchrist, 1919, p 80); and as sung by Vickie Whelan on the album, *Up in the North, Down in the South*, Musical Traditions, 2001. See also David Gregory, 2003; and Opie, 2001, p 33-34. General evidence of these and other ballads being 'made over' in children's songs can be found in, for example, Opie, 1985 and 2001; Sharp, 1975; Child, 2003.

[68] Also popularised by Moira Anderson, *Scotland Sings: 60 Scottish Favourites*, Universal, 2004.

[69] McCue, 1997, p 49. She includes in that judgment other songs that we sang: *John Anderson my Jo*, and *My Love is Like a Red, Red, Rose*. The latter is one that R Crawford notes as one of Burns' greatest songs, (R Crawford, 2009, p 406).

[70] Sung by Robert Wilson, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 3, Legacy, 2005; Moira Anderson, *Scotland Sings: 60 Scottish Favourites*, Universal, 2004; and Kenneth McKellar, *The Very Best of Kenneth McKellar*, Universal/Spectrum, 1997.

[71] Sung by Robert Wilson, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 1, Legacy, 2005; and Kenneth McKellar, *The Very Best of Kenneth McKellar*, Universal/Spectrum, 1997.

[72] Original by Robert Wilson (1950), *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 1, Legacy, 2005. Also sung by Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; Kenneth McKellar, *Kenneth McKellar: The Tartan and Scottish Saturday Night*, Vocalion, 2005; and Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[73] Original by Lauder and Grafton (1905), *Harry Lauder, Roamin' in the Gloamin': Original Recordings, 1926-1930*, Naxos, 2004. Also sung by Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; and Andy Stewart, *The Best of Andy Stewart*, HMV/EMI, 1966.

[74] Original by Andy Stewart (1960), *Andy Stewart: 20 Scottish Favourites*, EMI, 2001.

[75] Original by Andy Stewart (1960), *Andy Stewart: 20 Scottish Favourites*, EMI, 2001.

[76] Sung by many Scottish popular singers, such as, Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993; Moira Anderson, *Moira Anderson: A Land for All Seasons*, Lismor, 1996; and Kenneth McKellar, *The Very Best of Kenneth McKellar*, Universal/Spectrum, 1997.

[77] Believed to be written around 1746, and refers to Bonnie Prince Charlie's defeat (John Greig, 1892-1895, vol 3, p xxv). Sung by Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; Harry Lauder, *Loch Lomond*, HMV, 1916; Robert Wilson, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 3, Legacy, 2005; Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993; Kenneth McKellar, *Folk Songs from Scotland's Heritage: Kenneth McKellar's Scotland*, Vocalion, 2008.

[78] Sung by Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[79] Sung by Kenneth McKellar, *The Very Best of Kenneth McKellar*, Universal/Spectrum, 1997.

[80] As noted, Robert Burns' songs (and those of Lady Nairne) were sung by many of the popular performers identified as sources in the family song repertoire. Moira Anderson, for example, recorded Nairne's version of this song, *Scotland Sings: 60 Scottish Favourites*, Universal, 2004. Burns' songs and other traditional songs were also a core part of the singing curriculum in schools (see *The National Song Book*, 1906; and, *The Scottish Students' Song Book*, 1897).

[81] 'Geordie' = George, and specifically, George the 5th Duke of Gordon who raised the Gordon clan highlanders in 1795, and is affectionately known as the 'Cock of the North' (Brewer, 2001, p 262). In family singing, this song was also often combined (to the same tune) with the children's rhyme *Aunty Mary Had a Canary up the Leg of her Drawers* (see Ewan McVicar, 2007, pp 269-274, for a detailed account of this rhyme).

[82] We referred to this song as *The Cameron Men*, but it is not the traditional song *The March of the Cameron Men*.

[83] As noted previously, T Crawford, 1979, p 105, describes the highlander (and highland soldier) in popular eighteenth century song, as 'active amorist'. This street song that he characterises as 'jeering lines from the streets' is directed at a clansman, possibly a highland soldier, whose sexual reputation in the popular imagination was by then well established:

Where hae ye been a day
Bonny Laddie Highland Laddie
Up the Bank and down the brae
Seeking Maggie, seeking Maggie.
Where hae ye been a day
Bonny Laddie Highland Laddie
Down the back o' Bells wynd
Courting Maggie courting Maggie.

It opens with lines that are almost identical to those in one of James Hogg's Jacobite songs, *Bonnie Laddie, Highland Laddie* (Hogg, *Jacobite Relics*, 1810, and cited in Greig, 1892-1895, vol 4, p ix). Greig refers to it as the most widely sung version of the many Highland Laddie songs (that include those by Ramsay, and Burns):

Bonnie Laddie, Highland Laddie

Where hae ye been a' the day,
Bonnie laddie, Highland laddie?
Saw ye him that's far away,
Bonnie laddie, Highland laddie?
On his head a bonnet blue,
Bonnie laddie, Highland laddie?
Tartan plaid and Highland trews,
Bonnie laddie, Highland laddie?

McVicar, 2007, p 300, refers to this children's rhyme from the 1940's which, like ours, was sung to the well known march tune, *Bonny Laddie, Hielan Laddie*, which suggests that the song, or part of it, was parodied by children:

See the monkey's kickin up a row
Bonny laddie, Heilan laddie
See the monkeys kickin up a row
Bonny Heilan laddie.

[84] 'hielan' ', or 'heilan' ' = highland (SND).

[85] Burns, quoted in Allan Cunningham, 1885, p 507. Published in *The Scots Musical Museum* and many other Scottish song, music and poetry collections, chapbooks and street ballads, the song was also used for political and social parody during the late eighteenth century and throughout the nineteenth century. Steve Roud cites 43 versions of the song in song books and chapbooks (*The Roud Folk Song Index*). See also *Wighton Collection of National Music Database*; *Bodleian Library Catalogue of Ballads*; *The Word on the Street*, and *Scottish Chapbooks*: National Library of Scotland; *Scottish Chapbooks Catalogue*: University of Glasgow Library; *The Voice of Radicalism*: University of Aberdeen Library; NEFA: *North East Folklore Archive*; *British Library Integrated Catalogue*. The song remains well known, especially its chorus.

[86] McGuirk says of *Auld Lang Syne* that 'this song of displacement is framing itself around images deriving specifically from the Jacobite wars and the ensuing late-century Highland clearances'. It expresses a double loss - 'nostalgia for places as well as for times irretrievably past' (McGuirk, 1993, p 251). This song was also a 'standard' in the repertoire of many Scottish singers.

[87] 'we're no' awa' tae bide awa' ' = we're not leaving for ever. Performed and recorded by many popular singers, including Jimmy Shand, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957; Robert Wilson, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 1, Legacy, 2005; Kenneth McKellar, *Kenneth McKellar: The Tartan and Scottish Saturday Night*, Vocalion, 2005; Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[88] 'croonin' ' = sigh or song of lament, 'crummack' = shepherd's crook (SND). The Cullins are mountains on the Isle of Skye. The song was written by Kenneth MacLeod (1927), and sung by Harry Lauder, *The Road to the Isles*, HMV, 1926; Kenneth McKellar, *Kenneth McKellar: 20 Favourite Songs*, Lismor, 2002; Robert Wilson, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 1, Legacy, 2005; Moira Anderson, *Moira Anderson: A Land for All Seasons*, Lismor, 1996; Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: 20 Scottish Favourites*, EMI, 2001.

[89] 'hame' = home (SND). *Granny's Highland Hame* by Sandy McFarlane (1928), and also sung by Kenneth McKellar, *Folk Songs from Scotland's Heritage: Kenneth McKellar's Scotland*, Vocalion, 2008; and Andy Stewart, *The Best of Andy Stewart*, HMV/EMI, 1966.

[90] By Hugh S Roberton (1939), and sung by Kenneth McKellar, *Kenneth McKellar: 20 Favourite Songs*, Lismor, 2002; Robert Wilson, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vol 1, Legacy, 2005; and Andy Stewart, *Andy Stewart: Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993.

[91] Low, 1993, p 1. See also Davis, 2004, and McGuirk, 1993.

[92] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 3.

[93] Pickering and Green, 1987 (b), p 3.

[94] I Russell, 1987 (a), pp 98-99.

[95] Connell and Gibson, 2004, p 163.

[96] McCrone, 2001, p 148.

[97] Hammerton, 2006 (a), p 240.

9

Home and Attachment

Part of grasping the ubiquity and tenacity of national identity, and how people are attached to such identities, lies in appreciating that it is not something sustained by a few key carriers – state discourse, political ideologues, the media – that can be knocked off their perches with the right argument. It is more like Velcro. Not one big hook and eye, but a multitude of small ones, tiny, daily points of attachment that together can bind very tightly.

(Jonathan Hearn, 2007, p 672)

Hearn's quote above summarises his argument discussed earlier in this study - that the salience and relevance that national identity has for people is located within the social dynamics of everyday life. This 'bottom-up' view of how national identity works, posits that people's attachment to national identity is realised in daily life. Such attachment comes about not so much through 'top-down' institutionalised, regulated or pervasive cultural constructions of national identity, but rather, as constructed meaning in people's lives. In this view, national identity is a symbolic cultural resource that people draw upon, and is made meaningful in the specific social settings that 'frame people's particular lives and circumstances'. People draw on the resource of national identity to the extent that it helps to explain, justify, or connects with, people's needs, wants and aspirations in particular contexts. In other words, national identity becomes salient for people when it resonates with experiences of agency. Families are an important social context through which people make meaning and realise control over their lives, and are thus crucial contexts for understanding people's attachments to national identity. It is

through networks of social relations, such as that of family, that national identity comes to have such personal relevance.

As a symbolic resource, national identity often abides in the 'little things' through which it is implicitly, repetitively and symbolically reinforced in everyday life. As McCrone has commented, national identity 'operates indirectly through the culture and habits in which people are engaged'.[1] It is in the 'little things' that families share, in the everyday social interactions, practices and habits wherein lie the symbolic and social resources for the creation and recreation of national/cultural identity. As noted previously in this study, after our migration to Australia, the symbolic reinforcement of the everyday 'instantiation of Scottishness' was located primarily within the home and family. The shared performance of our Scottish songs, served as our 'Velcro' - daily points of attachment that simultaneously bound us to one another and to our Scottish heritage and identity. It was through our Scottish songs that we constructed and told the story of our family. We drew on the cultural resource of Scottishness in song to make sense of family life and our evolving Scottish/Australian identity. A consideration of how families tell their stories and how family attachment and identity is constructed through them will therefore be useful in setting the groundwork for the more detailed analysis of song performance to follow in this chapter.

Kristin Langellier and Eric Peterson argue that family itself emerges from 'stories, rituals, conversations, and routines of daily life' - from the little everyday things.[2] Through these everyday processes of family communication, family culture, sensibilities, values, and identity are performed and passed on. Langellier and Peterson's view is that family is enacted in narrative performance - through storytelling - where the family is the 'subject, medium, and outcome' of that performance. Family storytelling is an evolving cultural performance that produces stories that embrace a family's experiences, 'past memories, current interactions, and future aspirations'.[3] Family storytelling is conceptualised as:

"… a product of family interaction, as a way of making sense of experience, as a means to encode familial images and abstractions in stories, and as part of an ongoing struggle to create and maintain a coherent system of meanings through narrative." (Langellier and Peterson, 2005, p 99)

Family storytelling is a key means through which a family performs itself to itself, and to others. It is through family storytelling that models of identity for family and family members are created. Such models of identity arise from both within and beyond the family, drawing on not only internal resources but also the external resources of culture, cultural scripts and discourses that families enlist to make sense of experience and order meanings. Family stories are thus both inside and outside, in a world of 'texts and contexts … that order meanings for what family is, what a 'good' story is, and how to tell it'.[4]

Langellier and Peterson are primarily concerned to address the important question of what interests are served by family storytelling - a question that this chapter seeks to address. They suggest that family storytelling serves strategic functions, that the motivations for family storytelling are organised around a family's interests and goals. Storytelling orders family meaning, family roles and group identity formation. A key interest and goal for families through storytelling is to locate the possibilities for group and personal identity, to narrate the 'we' of family and cultural identity. The performance of that narrative 'we' constructs both 'the 'family we live with' - actual and empirical, and the 'family we live by' - mythic and idealized - in stories'.[5] The act of family storytelling serves to construct family life itself, while at the same time serving to construct the 'idea' of family life in its stories, so that family storytelling mediates between the actual and the ideal. In this way the family creates a story of itself that embodies a model or ideal of its values, aspirations and goals. In the enactment of family stories, those values, aspirations and goals can be legitimated or critiqued, serving to affirm, support or challenge 'existing conventions and institutional practices'.[6] Langellier and Peterson suggest that the study of family storytelling can provide access

to understanding a family's 'investments, desires, and subjectivities inscribed in particular performances'.[7]

It is this notion of the family as constructed in story that is the focus of this chapter, particularly as a means of examining the functions that song performance served in our family. Langellier and Peterson argue that family storytelling assumes a particular significance for migrant families in narrating the 'we' of family identity. As they note, 'immigration is a narrative disruption of roots, language, and social connections that anchor family and cultural identity'.[8] The challenge for migrant families is in constructing and reconstructing 'their complex history and positioning in terms of cultural uniqueness' in a new multicultural setting.[9] Through family storytelling migrant families can adapt to internal and external environmental change, as families articulate who they are for themselves and others and for future generations. Storytelling provides an important means for migrant families to embrace family experience, memories, values and aspirations in 'habitable' stories.

The cultural resources that storytelling draws upon, such as cultural conventions and cultural understandings, also serve a crucial role in the constitution of migrant identities. For migrant families, in particular, storytelling serves to ensure the survival of family culture. In the formation, maintenance, and survival of family culture, meanings must 'not only be made, but also stored, retrieved, and transmitted within and over generations'.[10] Storytelling provides a means for organising and transmitting family information, experiences, conventions and cultural understandings, so that each generation can imagine and reimagine family in 'stories for survival'. For migrant families, such as ours, the goal of cultural continuity and survival can be considered as one of the key motivations for drawing on the symbolic resource of national identity in family song performance. That is, in Langellier and Peterson's terms, our performance of Scottish songs over several generations served the crucial function of ensuring our family's cultural survival.

In Nancy Foner's analysis of migrant families, she argues that the cultural understandings, meanings, and symbols that migrants bring with them from their homeland are critical in understanding migrant family life. These cultural patterns continue to have a 'powerful influence in shaping family values and norms as well as the actual patterns of behavior that develop in the new setting'.[11] As migrants reconstruct and redefine family life, old cultural patterns play a critical role in the family's 'creative culture-building'. When the migrant family is also a young new family, as ours was, family life itself is still in the process of being shaped and constructed. Bradd Shore's research on the constitution of families points to the importance of family stories and routines in the building of families:

> "When a new family is formed, it faces not only the practical challenges of providing food and shelter for its members, but also the less commonly recognized challenge of creating a new miniature society with a distinctive set of traditions and coordinating practices." (Shore, 2003, p 6)

The stories and routines that a family constructs, its myths and rituals, play an important part, not only in the early constitution of a family, but also in its long term continuity and solidarity. The 'symbolic continuity' of the family group is achieved in its shared stories and traditions. Shore argues that as patterns of family life change, as children spend more time at school, at work and leave home, myth and ritual are key resources that families deploy in meeting these and other changes and challenges. He observes that the family, 'beginning as a mix of sentimental attachments and practical interests … ends up as almost entirely a product of its ritual performances'.[12] In shaping family culture, ritual and myth also shape meaning making in the family and provide much of the framework for family memories.

Studies of family ritual and family narrative demonstrate how family rituals establish collective loyalty, a jointly constructed shared reality, reaffirm family bonds, and verify emotional attachment. They also play key roles in family socialisation by communicating important family attitudes, values, and norms, and enhance feelings of

safety and belonging within the family and in the culture.[13] Such family interactions contribute to the current and future well being and resilience of the family unit and of its individual members.[14] In contrast to the external factors that have an impact on family life, family rituals represent an arena in which families can exercise some degree of control and agency in making sense of their lives.[15]

Family narratives, in particular, serve as a form of self representation, affirming and reinforcing the individual and shared histories of family members, and conveying a family's major affective themes. They establish a shared history created through joint remembering and provide a sense of history, lineage, and continuity. In addition, reminiscing about shared experiences creates and maintains social and emotional bonds and strengthens the network of support that members need to make meaning of their lives.[16] As a form of self representation, family narratives not only construct and perpetuate family identity, but can also serve to shape or 'control' how others view and understand a family's identity.[17]

Research on family social interactions also points to how ritual and story serve as a major source of family knowledge, 'stories of family formation and history, and implicit and explicit lessons about historical and cultural identity'.[18] Family and cultural knowledge is shared between children, between parents, between parents/grandparents and children, and shared within the whole family. Family narrative can play an important part in child rearing, the teaching of skills and procedures, and in passing on of a meaning system.[19] Parents telling stories of their own childhood and family life to their children transmits lessons about family and societal values. They also shape the parents' own identities with respect to their parenting roles.[20] Other family members' stories, those of siblings and grandparents, also embody cultural and family history. Through participating in family narrative children become 'holders and carriers' of their family stories, and they too become family story tellers.[21] When grandparents tell their stories to the grandchildren, this not only enhances familial bonds, but also contributes to the grandchild's self-understanding and cultural understandings.[22] The various narrative roles that family members assume contribute to shaping family stories, family

history, values and norms, and family and cultural identity.[23] In participating in family narrative, family members gain opportunities to 'process, review and gain validation' for their own and shared family and cultural understandings.[24]

This research on the role family ritual and family narrative is particularly relevant in the context of migrant families, and for this study. It highlights the important role that ritual and story can play in the ongoing adjustments that migrant families make in their day-to-day lives. As discussed previously families are often the key social context in which the processes of change and adaptation, that are part of being a migrant, are played out and mediated. Families are also key sites of belonging and identity in migrant life, playing a significant role in the complex of ways in which migrants define their sense of identity and belonging. The family narrative is one of the means by which a migrant family may exercise agency, make meaning, use and understand memories, and construct and represent their identity. As noted above, in the migrant family's 'creative culture-building', homeland cultural customs and patterns can play a critical role in shaping family meanings and family life.

This chapter will focus on the role of ritual and narrative, in which family song performance constructed a narrative of home, family, and attachment. It will examine how the performance of Scottish songs affirmed our attachment to one another and to a shared heritage, and contributed to our family's 'symbolic continuity' over time. It will focus on the social interactions of song performance in a number of family singing contexts: musical quips, singing to babies and young children, family concerts, and in group family singing. Through this analysis of song performance, this chapter seeks to illuminate how a narrative of 'family' and group cohesiveness was created and articulated, and how that narrative provided a touchstone for Scottish/Australian identity.

Performing Home and Attachment

Our singing was an important family ritual, a form of 'patterned family interaction' in which a range of family and cultural values were articulated and positioned, and where family identity was created and reinforced.[25] For us, music was a social activity; indeed music played a major role in shaping and building our family life. It was part of how we communicated with one another, how children and grandchildren were raised, how siblings interacted with one another and with parents, and how we presented ourselves and defined ourselves to one another and to new Australian family members. Our songs shaped our sense of humour, and our delight in language and rhythm and melody. We expressed ourselves through song and our day-to-day conversations were peppered with musical quips. Phrases, lines and bits of melody were 'quoted' and exchanged to make a joke about something, to comment on an event, to poke fun at a family member, to kick start a song, or simply to acknowledge the presence of another family member in an affectionate way. They acted as a kind of intimate and shared shorthand of attachment.

These songs were at the core of our earliest social world. Our parents sang to us as babies in Scotland and continued that practice in Australia with our brother and later the grandchildren. My sisters and I did the same. We sang to entertain, and to soothe and lull children to sleep. The songs were a form of communication and engagement with small children drawing them into an intimate exchange where they were the focus of an adult's attention or the attention of the family group. These performances were a form of play and game where the objective was to elicit children's reactions to word play, and exaggerated gesture and action that accompanied the singing. The songs' qualities of rhythm, rhyme and repetition, lively phrasing and dramatic timing were emphasised to draw a laugh, an exclamation of surprise, to see the joke or the trick, to anticipate the punch line or the tickle. There is no doubt that these events were enjoyed and pleasurable for adult and child. As an intimate shared performance, they were imbued with pleasurable features. It is hard to imagine this sort of shared experience happening at all if not for the pleasure it brings to those involved.

In family concerts, children were also placed at the centre of the event. This family ritual provided the opportunity for us as children to play a greater role in shaping and framing the performance. The lounge room was our theatrical space - we were the performers, our parents the audience. We introduced our 'acts' with flourish and expected the adults to respond with enthusiastic encouragement and applause. There were 'requests' too from the adults. Typically these concerts consisted of a mix of individual and group singing and other kinds of theatrical performance. We invented stage names for ourselves and regularly performed as The Flying Dugalls - our version of an acrobatic/tumbling act. Many of the songs we sang were those from the family's Scottish repertoire, but the concerts also introduced to our parents the songs and dances that we had learnt at school and our favourite songs from the hit parade. One of my 'acts' was a rendition of Elvis Presley's *Jail House Rock*. A favourite and long lasting item was the performance by my sisters and I of Irving Berlin's *Sisters* and our rendition of *Three Little Japanese* from the Mikado. In these family rituals we, as children, were the principle narrators of an evolving family story.

While we grew up and out of performing in family concerts, the family singing that had evolved out of our parents' singing to us babies and children continued to feature in family gatherings. Family singing was sporadic, although typically it would occur on those occasions when we were together as a group, such as around the kitchen table at meal times or after dinner in the lounge room. As Australian boyfriends and husbands and grandchildren became part of the extended family group some adjustments were made to the singing around the kitchen table. The new children became the focus of attention and were sung to and entertained as we had been, their names were incorporated into the songs as ours had been. The new boyfriends and husbands watched and listened or chatted with our dad. The singing would often go on well into the night, punctuated and interrupted by conversation, tending to babies, organising food and cleaning up. In later years when the grandchildren grew up they might be called upon to sing a particular song from their own experience for our mum, and later in the evening the focus of the music would sometimes shift to more contemporary popular music pieces that the younger family members chose.

After our parents had passed away, and family gatherings shifted to our sister's house, a similar pattern of spontaneous singing around the kitchen table continued, although now it was my sisters and brother and I who initiated and shaped the singing. There was no particular order in the songs we sang, nor how much of a song was sung, nor how many. Anything might spur one of us, in the midst of a conversation, to launch into a song that might trigger another to follow suit, which then might lead to an extended run of singing. But the singing was rarely an unbroken continuous flow. There were pauses and gaps talking about the songs and where they came from, attempts to remember the next verse, reminding one another of parts we had missed or gotten wrong, and always laughter at one another's performance. These were also occasions when we do our 'party pieces', often those that came from our childhood performances in the family concerts. In a long night there was as much talking, eating and drinking, as there was singing. On any one occasion we drew from many dozens of songs that we had come to know throughout our childhood. Dispersed within an evening's *ad hoc* array of Scottish songs there were also a small number of other old family favourites including popular American hit songs of the 1940's and 1950's. If there was a pattern in the songs that we sang at any one time it was that the old Scottish songs from childhood dominated and that late in the evening when we were running out of steam we would often conclude with a rendition of *Lady Lido* - the 'sad' song.

These various modes of family song performance, singing to young children, to one another and as a group, generated what writers on the social and cultural role of music describe as 'fellow feeling' or 'communitas'.[26] In a family experiencing the challenges and tensions associated with low income, unfamiliar social and institutional arrangements in the early days in Australia, and later the adjustments associated with children growing into teenagers and young adults, singing together provided one of the few opportunities for easy going family interaction and celebration. As Peter Parkes has observed with respect to the music performances of a very different group, our singing brought a 'relatively harmonious integration of normally competing personalities … at least temporarily overcoming' the generational and other animosities.[27]

The socially integrative effects of music have been widely recognised in the cultural study of music. Middleton, for example, suggests that music can only be grasped properly as a 'social practice', and that music constructs social activity.[28] As communal activity, Stokes argues that music 'brings people together in specific alignments' that can provide a 'powerful affective experience in which social identity is literally 'embodied' '.[29] Tia DeNora refers to the role of music as a device for 'social ordering' of bringing people into social alignment, and 'social occasioning' through which social 'scenes' are constructed, that 'afford different kinds of agency, different sorts of pleasure and ways of being'.[30] Her work demonstrates how people draw on the resource of music to cue and shape mood, feeling, conduct, and collaborative action in day-to-day social life. As a means of orchestrating social activity music can act as a 'touchstone of social relations', reinforcing particular relationships and affirming group identity. In these ways music can play an important role in establishing and renewing forms of social life.[31]

Performance theorists have also shed light on how social relationships are activated in musical performance, through social and cultural positioning. Performance theorists have argued that in performances of various kinds, telling a story, making speech, or singing a lullaby and so on, the performance is 'framed' as a particular kind of experience, and that the performance itself 'positions' the participants in a particular relationship to that performance and its meaning. As Berger and Del Negro note in their analysis, the performance implicitly locates the participants 'in the social world of the event and the larger society'.[32] The family practice of singing to babies and young children, for example, framed the experience as a positive and pleasurable one, positioning children as central to family life. In doing so it also brought children into the family's social and cultural world that was being enacted in the performance and content of the songs. That world was one in which children were the focus of family attention, pleasure and entertainment. But these songs also brought children into the family's cultural world one in which children, family and Scottishness were inextricably intertwined.

This positive social and cultural positioning of family attachment through song performance was also played out in family concerts and through group singing. All of these performance contexts were framed as occasions for fun, pleasure and positive family interaction. They were also occasions for parading our talents, taking pride in children's development, celebrating our Scottish heritage, and positioning ourselves with respect to one another and to new family members. The family concerts were events that afforded us agency as children to shape the social 'scene'. This was our defined space in which we drove the narrative. In it, we were the 'star' attraction, the lead protagonists who told our own story, rather than our parents' story of us and the family. We performed *our* version of ourselves as family members, a version that foregrounded our talents and skills, and our growing sense of self as distinctive individuals. In bringing our current social and cultural world of school experience and music into the family we were 'showcasing' to our parents other dimensions of our lives that served to embellish and update the family narrative. It was a form of intergenerational 'show and tell'. The theatrical framing of these events positioned our parents as attentive audience, fixing their attention on our representation of ourselves, ensuring for a brief time, their recognition and acknowledgement of us as individual identities. At the same time these concert performances were a jointly constructed shared 'reality'. Our parents were participants, they had a role to play in this imagined theatrical world - they were complicit in the game. Our performances were also reflecting back to them our growing competence in carrying forward family custom and values, and also served to validate our outside of the family experience. Over time, these concerts acted as milestones in our development as children and our expanding social and cultural world. As shared family interactions, they affirmed and reinforced family bonds and family history and custom, while at the same time allowing 'space' for change and growth.

In group family singing, the customs and behaviours learnt over the years of childhood were played out in group participation, where increasingly my sisters and I, and later with our brother, shaped the performance. In the earlier years these family singing events often arose out of singing to children around the kitchen table, but over time they became events in which we, as adult children, carried the event. Husbands and

boyfriends were witnesses rather than active participants, and our nieces and nephews tended to join in only later in the evening when we had exhausted our range of Scottish songs. Our brother, born in Australia, acted as a sort of musical bridge between us and other family members in these singing performances. He was an active participant in our Scottish singing, but also was more likely to introduce new songs and to encourage nieces and nephews to join in. We performed these songs largely for ourselves, affirming our sibling connection and sense of family history and bond. We were nonetheless displaying and affirming our Scottishness to other family members, increasingly aware of its entertainment value as an idiosyncratic form of family life. As we had entertained children with our Scottish songs, and strutted our evolving Australianness to our parents, we were now asserting our group identity as Scots, positioning ourselves as having a distinctive and separate group identity, to our partners and other younger family members.

These family performance contexts were also occasions where family history and memories could be captured, expressed and shared within an atmosphere of good hearted fun and 'fellow feeling'. Family lore and cultural knowledge were enacted, shared and passed on in the performances themselves, in the talk surrounding them, and through an emotional engagement with songs. In a similar way that family photographs constitute a sense of history and continuity with the past, the performance of the songs told our family history and a cultural heritage. These performances served as sites of 'compound aural memories' - sites of not only individual and family memories but also collective historical and cultural memories. The historical and cultural heritage, inscribed in song performance as personalised, family understandings and memories, has come to serve as an important source of both direct and vicarious family and cultural memories for us and new Australian family members. In continuing to be connected to an evolving family life, these performances continue to build new memories and associations, providing further sources of family attachment.

As the family has grown and dispersed, and our gatherings less frequent, our singing has become an increasingly important means of affirming our attachment to one another as

adult siblings, our shared family history and shared cultural heritage.[33] Over time, the songs, even when they are not being sung, have come to act as 'prosthetic memories' of home, family and Scotland. This is possibly most acute for my brother and myself. For me, too young when we migrated to have much in the way of direct cultural and family memories of Scotland, and for our younger brother, it could be said that our memories, cultural and family, were constructed for us in song. In many ways, the songs *were* Scotland for us. Our songs provided us with 'crucial senses of nostalgia' and a resource to our identity. Our past, and memories of a distant place were thus not lost to us, even though that past might be said to have been shaped by a 'nostalgia without memory'.

P T Wong refers to memories as a 'storehouse of wisdom, meaning and solace' that can, when shared, serve a social support function and have adaptive benefits. His work identifies six functions of reminiscing, four of which have relevance here. As a form of joint reminiscing, our singing performances served a 'transmissive' function in the sharing of traditional values and cultural heritage and the teaching of family 'lessons' from past experience. In drawing from past experience to tell a positive family story and enact its values and norms our singing also served an 'instrumental' function in using the past to address the challenges of the present, providing us with a sense of agency and mastery. In the 'fellow feeling' generated by song performance there was an 'integrative' function characterised by the 'acceptance of self and others, conflict resolution and reconciliation, a sense of meaning and self-worth, and the integration of the present and past'. In some ways family song performance can also be seen as exhibiting what Wong refers to as an 'escapist' function where comfort and pleasure were sought from a selective past providing a source of happiness and a 'buffer against present stress'.[34]

As noted previously in this study, 'it is often the family that keeps the memory of the past values and cultural patterns alive'.[35] In this sense, especially for migrant families, the family story or family narrative plays a central role in what Langellier and Peterson refer to as its cultural survival. As they argue, 'a family that fails to make stories to share and pass along will cease to exist as a culture'.[36] The process of making stories,

storytelling, is according to Langellier and Peterson, a 'multigenerational creation' that ensures a family's cultural survival through making meanings in stories that can be stored, retrieved, and transmitted within and over generations. This crucial process in family cultural survival involves three key strategic functions: ordering content to make stories, ordering participation to tell and listen, and ordering family identities. Family storytelling orders content and meanings in stories that are 'enacted tactically by storytelling tasks that serve, in turn, to locate possibilities for group and personal identity and agency'.[37] The narrative 'we' of family and cultural identity depends on successful content ordering as families make stories, and on efficient task ordering as families tell and retell them. As narrative performance, our family singing can be usefully examined through this lens to identify the behaviours, habits, practices, and conventions that produced our idea of family, and how those practices played a role in the cultural survival of our family.

Ordering Story Content

With respect to content ordering, Langellier and Peterson focus attention on: what stories are told and not told in a family, what story genres or conventions are employed, and when and under what circumstances stories are told. The relevance of these aspects of content ordering for family cultural survival is in how they work to ensure transmission across the generations, by:

- ° diffusing content among multiple participants through collective remembering;
- ° timing the distribution of the content of stories so that stories are told when they are most salient and likely to be perpetuated;
- ° deploying form conventions for stories that make for 'memorable tellings';
- ° sedimenting content in 'family classics' according to canonical or socially available genres that organise family experience and meanings, and make for 'memorable stories'.

In our family, the singing to babies and young children, family concerts and group singing served to ensure transmission across the generations from our parents to us, from our parents to grandchildren, from us to our brother and to our children. In this way, not only was our cultural content diffused across the generations in the family, but also the shared performance of the songs provided a means for collective remembering, thus reinforcing the shared meanings of family culture. In their 'timing', these song performances achieved a particular salience in the context of early parenting, grandparenting, childhood development, sibling bonding, and aunt/uncle-niece/nephew bonding. As a focus of fun, pleasure and 'fellow feeling' in family gatherings, they also became embedded as a form of positive social, familial interaction, exposing several generations to a shared family culture. The linguistic and musical delight of the songs that had been grounded in early childhood interaction with our parents, and then with the grandchildren, was reinforced in family concerts and group singing and also served to establish the songs as a shared lexicon of day-to-day communication. Moreover, as sung performance, our songs made for 'memorable tellings' being easy to perform, remember, transmit and store, and importantly through their deep emotional connection with childhood and family life in Scotland.[38] For our nieces and nephews, the songs were also connected to their childhood and their experience of family life in Australia.

As there are conventions for memorable tellings, Langellier and Peterson note, so too are there conventions for memorable stories. Families enlist culturally available narrative genres through which family experience and meanings is organised in stories that can be told and retold. The content of family stories that embrace a family's experiences is thus shaped by the storytelling conventions and genres that a family tells its story through. One such dominant cultural script in family storytelling is that of heterosexual love, marriage, and children.[39] As discussed in the previous chapter, the domestic and familial plots and themes of our family story were drawn from cultural resources and genres inscribed in song. Our songs served as cultural 'rhetorical devices', providing key plots and themes through which the narrative of our family was remembered, recalled and recounted. They 'gave voice' to shared experience, values and cultural understandings, that linked us to one another and a shared cultural heritage. We personalised and

localised the form and content of the songs, inscribing them with family understandings and memories, which told a cultural story through familial frames of reference. In that story, Scotland was constructed as a domestic familial place, playful, witty and social, as much a source of family, as heritage.

Our family story was also made from the 'myriad experiences of being family, across time and space, among multiple family members'.[40] Integrated into family life, the songs became connected to family biography and family history, and to the times and places in which the songs were encountered. The Scottish songs that had been an integral part of our previous social and cultural life were continuously used to shape the meanings that both family and heritage had for us. Through our song performances, a story of family and our family was told and retold, becoming a 'family classic' that was integrated and sedimented into family life in Australia. That story as a narrative of home and attachment is discussed in more detail below.

Ordering Family Participation

While stories need to be made, they also need to be told. As Langellier and Peterson argue, as an interactive communication process, storytelling is dependent on participation. The creation, expression and maintenance of family culture depends on a family's stories being stored, retrieved, and transmitted within and over generations. For stories to be memorable, to be told and told again, someone must 'retrieve, compose, and perform them'.[41] Who gets to tell a family's stories, and who gets to listen, how family storytelling roles are distributed and how performance contexts are constructed and by whom, are dimensions of what Langellier and Peterson refer to as task ordering. Task ordering focuses on the allocation of storytelling tasks within the family: what stories are told, by whom and to whom, and under what conditions. As the making of stories has consequences for family cultural survival, so too does the interactive work that storytelling requires. Langellier and Peterson argue that the ordering of family storytelling tasks creates and maintains productive internal relationships, through forging alliances between family members, and in the adaptation of stories and

interactional tasks to changes within the family and the broader environment. In the allocation of storytelling tasks, 'families adapt and survive environmental changes and thereby form group and individual identities'.[42] Langellier and Peterson also suggest that the group production of stories, collaborative storytelling, may better serve a family's long-term cultural survival.

Although storytelling tasks may be distributed in various ways within the family, this distribution is 'regularized and routinized in particular patterns of collaboration, competition, and specialization among family members'.[43] In this regularising and routinising of family interaction, storytelling forges alliances between various family members such as spouses, siblings, and 'outsiders'. Langellier and Peterson observe that storytelling also typically consolidates storytelling tasks in the hands of a few family members, the 'keepers of the kin', that is typically ordered in families according to generation and gender. In creating occasions for family storytelling - a form of 'kinwork' - the task is usually assumed by women.[44]

In our family, our mother was the primary 'kin keeper' for us as babies and very young children. That task was shared with our dad, but notably most of the songs that formed our family repertoire were those learnt directly from our mother. As we grew older and exercised more influence over family performance in family concerts, the 'kin keeper' role was extended to include us. Until our brother was born and grew up, the kin keeping in our family (in the context of song performance) was very much a women's task. Our father, though, was an active participant as 'audience' for our concerts, and through his musical accompaniment on the mouth organ in family concerts. As our parents aged and my sisters and I grew into independent adulthood, we increasingly took over the role and of creating 'the occasions' for song performance, with our older sister taking on 'specialist' role in this regard in hosting most of the family gatherings. In performance terms our older sister's role could be described as 'director', and together with my other sisters and I, 'star performers'. Our younger brother's role, as noted above, was that of 'casting director', bringing in the 'fresh' talent of nieces and nephews. In this way he too played a 'kin keeper' role, which also reinterpreted and innovated our family culture.

Nieces and nephews had 'walk on' roles, our aging parents 'cameo' roles, husbands and boyfriends 'captive audience'.[45]

Family cultural survival is particularly dependent on storytelling tasks and roles. Langellier and Peterson argue that the loss of a storytelling task is 'more consequential than the loss of particular content, story, storyteller or ritual'.[46] For example, when a family storyteller or keeper of the kin dies this can create 'a crisis of memory and cultural transmission'. In our case, after our parents had passed away, the main storytelling task was assumed by my sisters and I. Langellier and Peterson also make the point that internal and external changes can disrupt, or 'repunctuate' the flowlines of family culture. With the introduction of our younger brother to our family, some time after our arrival to Australia, our storytelling roles were 'repunctuated' through our brother's role as go-between, interpreter and innovator of the family story. The extension of our family to include Australian husbands and children also brought shifts in the nature of storytelling patterns, with the incorporation of grandchildren into the family storytelling circle as direct recipients of family culture, and over time their more active participation in co-narrating and extending the family story.

If family storytelling is organised around the interests and goals of a family, then it is to be expected that as those interests and goals change so too will the nature of family storytelling. In our family, the performance of songs, that had for decades been a taken-for-granted form of family interaction, has increasingly become a 'special event', an occasional, but important form of re-union for my sisters, brother and I. Our family is now made up of several families, our children now have their own children, with each in the process of constructing their own mini culture - none of which have direct experience of migration. The 'contextual motivation' of migration that I have previously discussed as exerting a strong mediating influence on the family's enduring song performance does not have the same relevance for newer family members as it does for us. While the songs continue to have a particular salience for us as siblings, and continue to affirm our bonds to family and heritage, the extended flow of family culture has been 'disrupted' by family biography. Dispersed geographically, our nieces and nephews and

their children are infrequently and increasingly rarely participants in our family song performance. At the same time, some of our family story continues to be enacted through the affectionate attachment that those nieces and nephews have to us and our parents - their grandparents. In subtle, small ways, in the jokes and anecdotes that we continue with share with them about the version of our family life that they experienced in family song performance, the family's kin keeping role is maintained and sustained even when the ritual of song performance is no longer the direct vehicle of transmission. In this way family storytelling has been further repunctuated and the next generation may become 'keepers of the kin' for their children.[47]

Ordering Family Identity

As Langellier and Peterson argue, a key interest and goal for families through storytelling is to locate the possibilities for group and personal identity - to narrate the 'we' of family and cultural identity:

> "Storytelling is one way that families become visible and audible to themselves as who 'we' are, where 'we' came from, and where 'we' are going." (Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 119)

It is in the context of making and telling of stories that family group identity is organised, ordered, defined and reinforced. Through storytelling families articulate who they are for themselves, for others and future generations. A key part of that process, especially for a migrant family, is to define its cultural or ethnic self - to locate its cultural uniqueness. As migrant families adapt to internal and external changes these identities are negotiated, reinterpreted and innovated in storytelling. Within migrant families, storytelling patterns and the construction of family identity may thus change over time as families change and as environments change, with each generation imagining and reimagining family in stories for cultural survival.

The performance of our Scottish songs gave us a means to locate, define and reinforce our family's cultural identity over time and generations. We constructed our version of Scottishness and family life in song performances that simultaneously served to articulate and reinforce a sense of attachment to one another and our cultural identity. In other words, our story of family was told as much through our Scottishness, as our story of Scottishness was told through our family. Our version of Scottishness, our cultural identity, *was* family. As such, it meant that our Scottishness, expressed in song performance, was a deeply embedded way for us to *be* a family, our way of what Langellier and Peterson refer to as, 'doing and redoing' family. While our storytelling roles changed and were adapted over time, song performance allowed us to 'imagine and reimagine' the family we lived with, and the family we lived by. It gave us a means of 'doing and redoing' family within and across generations that served to ensure our cultural survival in the sung story of our family. Through the ongoing performance of our Scottish songs we imagined and reimagined our family - its experiences, memories and aspirations. The singing of our songs connected us to one another, to an evolving family biography and family history, and to our Scottish heritage. Through the doing and redoing of family in song we could keep the memory of the past, values and cultural patterns alive. Our shared performance of songs meant that we could 're-sing, re-hear and re-experience the past'.[48] Our song performances and the memories of them, for us and subsequent generations, have thus played a crucial role in both constituting and perpetuating our family's expressive culture.

As our family circumstances underwent further change in Australia, our song performance also gave us a means of 're-ordering' family interactions, roles, story and our family identity. As Langellier and Peterson point out:

> "In the name of cultural survival, family stories hold on to and let go of familiar, familial meanings and identities, as new meanings emerge in changing environments." (Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p110)

Through song performance we incorporated and embraced new Australian family members and adapted our Scottish family identity, shifting from an intensely localised Scottish family group to one that embraced a mainstream Australia. In that process we negotiated and inflected our implicit Scottish family selves into explicit 'performance identities' as a form of family and sibling display, to define ourselves to new family members, and to attract and invite them into the family. The kin keeping roles that had once rested with our parents were adapted and redisbursed across the family allowing for reinterpretation and innovation in the family story. As song performance itself became less central to extended family life, the memories of it continued to be shared and passed along so that a newly emerging family story *about* the singing is becoming a 'family classic' that the younger generation have an equal voice in constructing and telling. Through singing and talk about the singing we constructed an evolving and jointly constructed narrative of the 'we' of family and cultural identity. Inscribed in the performance of the songs is a narrative that locates family as a source of home, belonging and identity. That story is one that tells of home and attachment.

A Narrative of Home and Attachment

These performances tell of an evolving family life in which its customs and rituals played a crucial role in affirming and maintaining family bonds and in providing the family's 'symbolic continuity' over time. Through these song performances, both family and Scottishness were positioned in a positive emotional context, where we represented ourselves at our best in the garb of the past. We drew on our stocks of shared cultural knowledge, our family and cultural resources, and employed them in a variety of ways to define and reinforce a sense of attachment to one another, to family culture and our sense of Scottishness. These performances also provided a social space for individual and group agency, where parents, children and later as adults, could positively influence and shape family dynamics and through that, family custom, tradition, and memories.

Our song performance thus served to both reflect and shape our experience of family, family values and sensibilities, as well as patterns of family behaviour.

In a context of change, economic uncertainty and a maturing family, these performances provided a sense of stability on the meaning of family life. As a struggling family that was just scraping by economically and experiencing its fair share of interfamily stresses and strains, the shared performance of songs accentuated a sense of group cohesiveness, and a sense of community with common values and experiences. Through the songs, we could articulate a narrative of family cohesion and 'taste some of the sweetness of life'.[49] In doing so a family story, or family myth - part truth/part imagined - was constructed, one in which our ideal of family life was predicated on the memories, values and customs of an earlier Scottish time.

But these performances also tell of a new sense of home and attachment, where the old Scotland, as home and family, was reframed in the context of the present. The family narrative enacted in song produced an interplay between Scotland as home of the past, and Australia as current home where the old songs were performed and enjoyed. The performance of the songs allowed for the reconstruction and representation of the past to make meaning of the present. While the songs acted as reference points to the past they were continuously brought into the here-and-now of a changing family life. As we drew on Scottishness to define family, sibling and personal identity, we inflected and adapted the 'content', 'roles' and 'group ordering' of song performances to accommodate new family experiences and new Australian family members. Our song performances, as a source of shared family memories, also gave us a language through which to speak of family, connection and attachment with one another in the present, and importantly, with the next generation of our Australian family. Our song performance thus served as both a direct and an indirect means of 'doing and redoing family', forming a deeply embedded narrative of family attachment.

The customs and rituals that we brought with us were deployed to embrace a growing Australian family and to accommodate our evolving Scottish/Australianness. As Shore

has argued, myth and ritual are key resources that families deploy in meeting the challenges of 'constructing a coherent set of stories and practices' in the making of a family.[50] Ritual and myth assist families to interpret the ongoing events of their lives and to update meaning. McCrone suggests that myth, story and narrative are like traditions, connecting to past realities, but drawing selectively from that past and acting as guides to help interpret the social world. In this they have an 'active contemporary significance', providing a 'reservoir for belief and action', and often serve to legitimate and validate those beliefs and actions.[51] The family narrative that we enacted through the performance of songs provided us with a 'reservoir for belief and action' and was an important part of how our family adjusted to life in Australia. It served as both anchor and 'moral compass', grounding and affirming family life and helping us to navigate through the uncharted waters of change brought about by migration and family biography.

In our 'continuing dialogue' between the past and the present we drew on our music from the past to construct a family narrative of home and attachment that has served us well for over five decades. Our family singing provided us with a shared performance space for sustaining and renewing family attachment and through it a means of embracing Scottish/Australian identity within the family. This analysis has examined the role of song performance in the narrative construction of family and cultural identity in the new Australian context. The next chapter will shift the emphasis to how migrant identity is shaped as much by the leaving as by arrival and settlement. It will consider how a changed relationship with Scotland, the circumstances that precipitated my family's migration to Australia, did much to define family life and identity. It will examine how the songs provided a means for my family to access and negotiate the Scotland they had left behind, and how this played a crucial role in defining the imagined ideal of family life in Australia.

[1] McCrone, 2001, p 174.

[2].Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 110. As they comment, in the 'interrupted and intertwined conversations and habits of daily life', in the 'fragmentary, fleeting and fluid, embedded amongst tasks and talk', family identity is formed and reformed (Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 110).

[3] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 111.

[4] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 110.

[5] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 110. Langellier and Peterson are drawing on Gillis, 1996.

[6] Langellier and Peterson, 2005, p 100.

[7] Langellier and Peterson, 2005, p 110.

[8] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 122.

[9] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 123.

[10] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 112.

[11] Foner, 1997 (a), p 962.

[12] Shore, 2003, p 16.

[13] Thomas-Lepore, et al, 2004, p 5.

[14] Duke, et al, 2003, p 3.

[15] Shore, 2003, p 20.

[16] Thomas-Lepore, et al, 2004, p 5.

[17] Baddeley and Singer, 2007, p 186.

[18] Duke, et al, 2003, p 9.

[19] Baddeley and Singer, 2007, p 191.

[20] Baddeley and Singer, 2007, p 191.

[21] For children as 'holders and carriers' of family knowledge and stories, see Duke, et al, 2003, p 9. Also see Bohanek, et al, 2004, p 5.

[22] Baddeley and Singer, 2007, p 196.

[23] Bohanek, et al, 2004, p 5.

[24] Thomas-Lepore, et al, 2004, p 5.

[25] The concept of 'patterned family interactions', comes from Wolin and Bennett, 1984, pp 401-420, quoted in Thomas-Lepore, et al, 2004, p 5. See also Gary West for a discussion of the 'functional' uses of family singing in a Scottish context (West, 2006, p 122).

[26] 'Communitas' is a concept developed by Victor Turner, 1977, and discussed in Finnegan, 2003, p 186. 'Fellow feeling' in Parkes, 1997, p 181. Parkes refers to Blacking's conception of 'fellow feeling' in Blacking 1976 and 1983.

[27] Parkes, 1997, p 181.

[28] Middleton, 2003, p 12.

[29] Stokes, 1997, p 12.

[30] DeNora, 2000, p 123.

[31] DeNora, 2000, pp 110-129.

[32] See Berger and Del Negro's account of performance theory, 2004, pp 89-96, and 'subject positioning' p 93; and Bauman, 1984.

[33] Stokes suggests that music performance may be one of the few occasions in which a community comes together and 'appears as such to itself' (Stokes, 1997, p 12).

[34] Wong, 1995, pp 24-35. Wong discusses six functions of reminiscing: Integrative, Instrumental, Transmissive, Narrative, Escapist, and Obsessive. Wong's Narrative function is less relevant here since it has a much more restricted definition than this study adopts, and many of its functions are covered by the other categories. The Obsessive function is associated with clinical depression.

[35] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 229.

[36] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 112.

[37] Langellier and Peterson, 2005, p 103.

[38] Langellier and Peterson suggest that content is easier 'to perform, remember, transmit, and store when it uses poetic forms and features within an aesthetic or performance frame' (Langellier and Peterson, 2005, p 107). Langellier and Peterson are drawing on Bauman, 1986.

[39] See also Baddeley and Singer, 2007, p 188.

[40] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 111.

[41] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 115.

[42] Langellier and Peterson, 2005, p 105.

[43] Langellier and Peterson, 2005, p 105.

[44] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 118.

[45] Langellier and Peterson provide examples of where outsiders, who do not share the family's racial, ethnic or class culture, 'may not understand the interactional dynamics and, consequently, may not even recognize that a story is being told' (Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 117).

[46] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 119.

[47] See research by Martin, Hagestad and Diedrick that suggests that family stories tend to disappear by fourth generation, 1988, pp 533-54. Also cited in Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 114.

[48] Shelemay, 1998, p 233.

[49] Shelemay, 1998, p 230.

[50] Shore, 2003, p 18.

[51] McCrone, 2001, p 91. McCrone is drawing on Raymond Williams, 1977.

10

At Home: Becoming Scottish in Australia

Uprootedness uproots everything except the need for roots.

(Christopher Lasch, 1981, p 22)

The previous chapter's analysis of the functions of song performance in the family focused attention on the means by which migrant families construct and reconstruct 'their complex history and positioning in terms of cultural uniqueness' in a new multicultural setting.[1] That analysis examined the role of song performance in the narrative construction of family and cultural identity in the new Australian context. It was based on the proposition that the experience of migration provided an important 'contextual motivation' for drawing on the resource of cultural/national identity in song, and that through song performance our family narrated the 'we' of family and cultural identity. The interest there, and for this study more generally, was to understand the role of homeland music in the formulation of migrant identity. This chapter will extend that analysis by exploring why this particular homeland music may have had such a salience for the family. Addressing this question leads to a closer focus on the relationship between migrants and the homeland in the pre-migration context, that is how migrant identity is shaped as much by the leaving as by arrival and settlement. Acknowledging the relevance of the pre-migration condition suggests that accommodating and adapting to the old is of equal importance in the formulation of migrant identities as adapting to the new. It also underscores the fundamental relationship between homeland and hereland in the migrant experience. As such it is pertinent to locate this discussion

within contemporary migration theory that recognises the complex of ways in which homeland and hereland are implicated in migrant identities.

In Caroline Brettell and James F Hollifield's recent survey of cross-disciplinary theory and research on migration, the editors state that their purpose is to gain a greater insight into the phenomenon of international migration, shedding light on:

- ° Why individuals move across international borders.
- ° How they are incorporated into host societies.
- ° And why some migrants return to, or at least continue to be engaged with, their countries of origin. (Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p vii)

This study has been most concerned with the third of these research foci, specifically the question of why some migrants continue to be engaged with their countries of origin. This has meant an investigation of how the music of homeland plays a crucial role in the formulation of migrant identity. The engagement of my family with their country of origin - Scotland - through song, has been investigated as a strategic response to the experience of migration, as a way of making symbolic connections *with* the past in order to make sense of the present. This chapter will explore why and how the symbolic connections *of* the past continue to impact on the present in the migrant experience.

The attention to migrants' ongoing connections with homeland reflects the shift in migration studies away from migration conceived of as a one-way movement to one where migrants operate simultaneously both 'here' and 'there'. As Brettell notes, this shift emerged from the realisation that migrants maintain their ties to their countries of origin making 'home and host society a single arena of social action'.[2] She defines this 'transnational turn' in migration studies as 'a social process whereby migrants operate in social fields that transgress geographic, political, and cultural borders'.[3] Barbara Schmitter Heisler also notes, in the same volume, that many migrants' lives today 'incorporate activities, routines, and institutions located both in a destination country and transnationally'.[4] Interest in the transnational dimensions of migration has led to a

recognition and identification of the variety transnational migrant activities, and the generation of concepts such as the 'transnational community', 'transnational social fields' and 'transnational identity'. Some of this work has stressed the connections between kinship groups and families across borders, and some has focused on the cultural and symbolic dimensions of transnational communities and identities, the latter being of particular relevance to this study.[5]

This theoretical and research emphasis on transnationalism has also been informed by a shift in the dominant paradigm of migration studies, that of assimilation.[6] As Schmitter Heisler notes, theorising in migration studies has moved from the linear, single outcome model of assimilation, to the 'coexistence of several models projecting and explaining a variety of conditions and possible outcomes'.[7] Migrant adaptation is now explained in terms of 'integration' or 'incorporation' or 'segmented assimilation'.[8] Notwithstanding this shift to a conceptualisation of migration that recognises and allows for a variety of different migration experiences, the emphasis remains on the outcomes of migration - on the types and extent of incorporation.[9] As Schmitter Heisler argues:

> "… while the concepts may have changed from assimilation to integration or incorporation, and to segmented assimilation, the primary focus of the research and the main questions asked … have not changed considerably … the driving research questions continue to center on the processes of immigrant assimilation/integration (or lack of incorporation as the case may be)." (Schmitter Heisler, 2008, p 84)

Schmitter Heisler also discusses how this shift in assimilation theory has produced new forms of the old assimilation model. She points to the work of Richard Alba and Victor Nee that discards the proposition that assimilation is a 'universal, inevitable, and straight-line outcome'. In this formulation, the emphasis on the boundary between migrants and the mainstream is qualified, taking into account the role of social and economic networks of migrant groups. This new assimilation model conceptualises the boundary between migrants and the mainstream as not fixed, as one that changes over time, becomes blurred or shifts entirely.[10] What marks the difference between this new

assimilation model, and those that challenge the assimilation paradigm, is the emphasis on that boundary. In the critique of assimilation, the key boundary is not necessarily between migrants and the mainstream, but in the boundaries between migrants and the specific social contexts in which they operate - a line of argument that echoes Hearn's formulation of embedded nationalism, where it is in the networks of social relations that identity comes to have particular salience. Moreover, the conceptualisation of transnational identities challenges the very idea of migrant assimilation or mainstream incorporation as a key factor in the formulation of migrant identities, pointing to the ways in which migrant identity is often tied to connections between the local and specific networks that link host country with home country.[11]

These shifts have also been paralleled by changes to the ways in which cultural variables such as ethnicity are understood.[12] Ethnicity is conceptualised as a resource that migrants deploy in response to environmental change, to make sense of their circumstances, and to facilitate economic and social opportunities. Research in this area has emphasised the social, structural and economic contexts through which migrant groups shape their identities and destinies.[13] Underpinning this conception of ethnicity as a resource is the conception of ethnic identity (and identity in general) as constructed, fluid and contingent, not a fixed inheritance. Ethnic identity is constructed in specific historical and social contexts, through lived social interactions that have implications for building social cohesion and allegiance, and for migrants' life chances.[14] The fluidity and contingency of ethnic identity, constructed in specific contexts recognises the variability of boundaries across which ethnic identity is negotiated. As Brettell argues, it is 'the negotiation across such boundaries, themselves shifting, that is at the heart of ethnicity and the construction of migrant identities'.[15]

Related to this view of the social constitution of ethnic identity has been the interest in the importance of social networks in migration settlement and adaptation, in the formulation of migrant identity, and how social networks provide social capital. As discussed previously in this study, it is through these social networks that the processes of change and adaptation, that are part of being a migrant, are played out and mediated.

It has been argued here that families, as a key part of the migrants' social world, play an important role these processes of change and adaptation, and in the complex of ways in which migrants define their sense of identity and belonging. It is often through family life that migrants 'articulate the world they have left with the world they have entered'.[16] Social networks, such as families, have also been of particular interest in understanding migrants' transnational links and identities. From a transnational point of view, the articulation between homeland and hereland is conceived, not as a 'bipolar' separation and opposition between sending and receiving countries, but rather as a social process that bridges homeland and hereland, through 'social and emotional relationships that link individuals and households to both areas'.[17] As Brettell notes:

> "From a transnational perspective, migrants are no longer 'uprooted', but rather move freely back and forth across international borders and between different cultures and social systems." (Brettell, 2008, p 120)

Brettell also suggests that transnationalism, as 'a theoretical construct about immigrant life and identity', makes particular sense in a world where global travel and modern telecommunications have 'shortened the social distance between sending and receiving societies'.[18]

The relevance of transnationalism as 'a theoretical construct about immigrant life and identity' to this study is not so much the 'social' as a bridge between homeland and hereland but the symbolic and affective as connections that bring 'here' and 'there' together. This study emphasises migrants' symbolic and affective connections rather than social, institutional, political, geographic or physical ones. The question posed at the opening of this chapter of why some migrants continue to be engaged with their countries of origin is treated in this study through a focus the role of the symbolic and cultural as a means of connecting the past with the present, homeland and hereland, and as a means of constructing family and cultural identity in the hereland. In this way it seeks to capture, through the symbolic, how migrants 'operate in or between two (or

more) worlds'[19], and how the symbolic and affective 'allow one to migrate but remain within one's culture'.[20]

Transnationalism is also relevant to this study in its treatment of migrant identity. As noted above, the shift in thinking in migration studies away from assimilation and towards the idea of transnational identities has challenged ideas about how migrant identities are formulated. Not only is the boundary between migrants and the mainstream viewed as fluid and contingent, subject to change and emphasis over time and circumstance, but it is also not the only or primary boundary across which migrant identities are constructed. The attention given to the importance of migrant identities being negotiated within groups such as ethnic enclaves, social networks, families and communities, across borders, and across other dimensions, such as class and gender, has provided a broader analytical perspective that takes into account the variety of migrant experience. This study has located migrant identity not so much in the boundary between migrant group and mainstream society but within the social network of the family, and between family and the symbolic homeland. The focus in transnationalism on migrants' ongoing links to the homeland - of homeland and hereland as a 'single arena of social action' - has been applied to the symbolic linkages between homeland and hereland in the social and cultural arena of family, emphasising the symbolic as a source of 'transnational identity'.[21] It has also been argued that migrants' connections to homeland, in the form of ethnic or national identity, can serve as a symbolic resource in making sense of and gaining some measure of control over the new environment. In this way, cultural identity has been posited as a 'strategic response' or stratagem in the building of family and migrant identity. In this last part of the study the symbolic relationship between the family and the homeland will be considered in the pre-migration context as an important means of making sense of and controlling the meanings that Scotland had for the family.

These shifts in migration theory and research have also brought a reconceptualisation of how place and time are experienced, imagined and represented in migrant life.[22] Of particular interest to this study have been the roles of memory, story, and relationships

between past and present in the migrant experience, and the ways in which community and belonging, and concepts of home are 'imagined' in migrant life. An important part of this investigation has been to explore how the past is actively drawn upon in the construction of migrant family life and cultural identity, and specifically to critically examine migrants' attachments to the past and homeland. Recent research has served to challenge the idea that attachment to the past, to homeland or the idea of homeland, is regressive, backward looking, or reducible to 'sentiment', but is rather an integral part of constructing community and a sense of belonging.[23]

Further, commonplace notions such migrant 'nostalgia' have come under some critical scrutiny, although as Alison Blunt notes, despite the interest in migration and memory studies on how place and time are constructed, nostalgia 'still often remains a shorthand for sentimentalism rather than as a term that is itself worthy of critical revisioning'.[24] While accepting the basic condition of nostalgia as a yearning for home, Blunt does not limit a nostalgic desire for home as 'apolitical, reactionary or confining'. She adopts the idea of 'productive nostalgia' to encompass its 'liberatory' potential and also to shift the idea of nostalgia from an experience only of the imagination. For her, nostalgia is 'embodied and enacted in practice', in relation to the present and future as well as the past. Anne-Marie Fortier's account of migrant identity, while not directly addressing nostalgia per se, also approaches migrants' attachments to the past as embodied and enacted in the present. What Fortier's analysis emphasises is that the past is re-constituted in the imaginary belongings, the cultural 'possessions', that migrants formulate and use as a means of constructing community.[25] These accounts, and others discussed in this study, including Keya Ganguly below, shift the idea of 'nostalgia' away from simply an 'idealisation' of the past to one where the past is actively constructed/created as a new source of cultural belonging in the present. The implication from these accounts is that the past is 'imagined', or rather 're-imagined', rather than simply 'idealised'.[26]

These cultural belongings, as Nancy Foner has argued, continue to have a 'powerful influence in shaping family values and norms as well as the actual patterns of behavior

that develop in the new setting' and are critical in understanding migrant family life.[27] But as Foner also stresses, the cultural belongings that migrants bring with them are not reflections of a timeless past:

> "… the cultures from which immigrants come are themselves the product of change so that it is misleading to assume a timeless past of family tradition … Indeed, family patterns in the sending society may well have undergone significant transformations in the lifetimes of the immigrants or their parents." (Foner, 1997 (a), p 963)

Foner's observation draws attention to the fact that the cultural belongings that migrants bring with them have a history and context, that those cultural understandings, meanings and symbols have already been shaped and constructed in the context of the particular settings and circumstances that migrants experience prior to migration. The symbolic resources that migrants deploy to give shape and meaning to their new life are drawn from the resources that have given shape and meaning to the old life. In other words, the salience of the cultural resources that migrants bring with them lies not only in relationship to the present but also, and integrally, in their connection to and efficacy in making meaning of life prior to migration. This part of the study, will focus on how the formulation of my family's cultural belongings, their songs, that had its genesis prior to migration, played a crucial role in how those 'belongings' came to be 'transported' and deployed in Australia.

Migrant Border Crossings

The accounts of transnationalism discussed above have directed attention towards the complex of ways in which migrants define their own sense of identity, home and belonging. They reflect the conception that migrant belonging and identity can embrace both hereland and homeland, and can also be formulated or negotiated across a variety of other fluid and shifting boundaries, within families, communities, and other forms of

social networks. As that research points to, it is the negotiations across such boundaries that is at the heart of ethnicity and the construction of migrant identities. The idea embodied in the 'assimilation' paradigm that the key relationship in migrant identity is between the migrant (or migrant group) and the 'mainstream' has been revised and expanded to acknowledge that in many cases it is other relationships, often local or cross border ones, that have a greater bearing on how migrants negotiate their new lived worlds, make sense and meanings of their lives, and exercise degrees of control and agency.

Much of the recent migration literature focuses on processes of negotiating identity in the context of the new circumstances that people find themselves in. Brettell and Hollifield explain that 'although many sociologists are interested in the causes of migration, the discipline places greater emphasis on the processes of immigrant incorporation', so that sociological questions are often 'outcome' questions. Comparing sociological and anthropological approaches, they observe that, 'sociologists have primarily worked in the receiving societies while anthropologists have often worked at the sending, receiving or both ends'.[28] One of the areas in which there is a significant degree of overlap and interchange between these disciplines is in the recognition of the importance of social relationships that cross borders as 'both causal and sustaining factors influencing the migration process', and hence a recognition of the fundamental relationship between sending and receiving societies.[29]

While this study is not primarily concerned with the causes of migration per se, nor the social networks that link migrants to their homelands, it does recognise the fundamental relationship between homeland and hereland in the migrant experience, in particular 'the articulation between the place whence a migrant originates and the place or places to which he or she goes'.[30] It has conceptualised this relationship as an 'ongoing dialogue' (after Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004) focusing on the role of memory, symbol and narrative as the vehicle for negotiating the links between the past and the present. The study has thus far examined that dialogue as it occurred in Australia, and its crucial role in constructing family and cultural identity. But an important part of that relationship

between homeland and hereland in the formation of migrant identities has yet to be examined. Attention to the processes of adjusting to the new is only part of the picture. Another dynamic in the formulation of migration identity is the process of adjusting to the old.

I am arguing here that migrant identity is shaped as much by the leaving as by arrival and settlement - that one of the crucial variables in how migrants construct their identities is located in the boundary between the symbolic 'home' that is left and the symbolic 'home' that is *anticipated* or *imagined*. The decision to leave one place and move to another carries implications for what that home place has come to mean and for what is anticipated and desired in the act of leaving it. In the 'leaving' is a changed relationship with one home and the expectations that that brings for another. The circumstances that lead to the decision to leave play an active part in how migrant identity is formulated in the new environment; and the nature of migrants' relationships with their country of origin prior to migration is an important variable to consider in migrant identity. As Brettell argues, with respect to return migration, the pre-migration mind set is an important factor not only in the decision making prior to migration but also in affecting behaviour once abroad.[31] The negotiations that migrants must make between themselves and the place they are about to leave constructs a new relationship with that place that informs the meanings that home and belonging come to have. In other words, when talking about migrants' attachments to homeland, one needs to understand what that homeland meant in the context of deciding to leave it as part of understanding what that homeland comes to mean in the new context.[32]

In the case of my family, the decision to migrate, to leave Scotland, was a turning away from the home that they had known towards one that could only be imagined. In choosing to leave, to seek a better life in Australia, there were not only implications for their lives and futures, but also for the relationship with the Scotland that they were to leave behind. The circumstances that precipitated their decision and their departure were to a very large extent bound up in their relationship with Scotland - a relationship that had let them down. The way in which my family responded to and accommodated that

changed relationship was already underway before the moment of departure. It not only reflected their aspirations of a Scottish family life, but also shaped their aspirations for the new life in Australia, and shaped the way in which Scotland and Scottishness was drawn upon in building that new life. This chapter will examine how song performance had as much to do with defining the family's Scottishness with respect to Scotland, the Scotland they had chosen to leave behind, as it had to do with defining themselves with respect to Australia. It will consider how the songs provided a means for my family to access and negotiate the Scotland they had left behind, and how this played a crucial role in defining the imagined ideal of family life in Australia. In doing so, it will also provide an expanded perspective on the family's longstanding song repertoire.

Musical Border Crossings

Much of the recent literature on the role of music in migrant life emphasises processes of negotiating identity in the context of new circumstances. Studies have looked at how communities and groups use music to accommodate and negotiate a new and changing external world. A major focus in the literature is on how migrant groups interact and negotiate with the music of the new 'dominant' culture into which they are placed. Common themes in these studies address issues such as extent of assimilation, counter-acculturation, resistance, and borrowings. As noted in Chapter 7, studies have looked at degrees to which migrant groups' music assimilates, resists, or borrows from the 'dominant' music culture. In some cases migrant groups might identify with the music of their new home, where it has a connection to a symbolic sense of 'home', or migrant groups might maintain a defiant musical difference. The music of the dominant culture may be adopted, but its meanings subverted, or homeland music may be asserted and transformed at the local level as a form of rejection against assimilation.

Reference has been made in this study to how the incorporation and 'domestication', or rejection of musical difference can help to forge community coalitions, and also build

boundaries. Music can serve as a means of asserting local identity in response to encroachments of a dominant culture, and migrant groups often use music to create their own community and identity in their own terms. In some cases, as noted previously, the incorporation of a dominant music culture can be a means of symbolically controlling 'a changing and unequal relationship with the world outside' where the outside world is 'domesticated' through music, as Stokes suggests. Stokes goes on to assert that the incorporation and 'domestication' of musical difference 'is an essential process of musical ethnicity'.[33] While not disagreeing with this point, or other observations made about the relationship between a dominant music culture and migrants' responses to it, these conceptions focus on the boundaries between migrants and the 'mainstream' or the dominant culture in which they are placed. These conceptions of music and identity in migrant groups do not adequately explain the experience of music in my family.

As noted above, the reconceptualisation of assimilation has focused attention on how migrant identity is negotiated across borders or boundaries that do not necessarily privilege the interaction between migrant and the 'mainstream' or dominant culture'. I am proposing here that an important part of the meaning of family song performances resided in the working through of a changed relationship with Scotland and Scottishness that was underway before arrival in Australia, and continued during the family's life in Australia. As such, an important part of my family's performance of Scottish identity in song can be understood in terms of accommodating and negotiating the changed Scotland that they experienced and which propelled to them to Australia. In this sense, I would suggest that my family used music, not to only define their identity within Australian culture but equally, if not more importantly, to define and assert their identity with respect to Scotland.

For my parents who took the decision to leave, it was Scotland with which they had 'a changing and unequal relationship' - a changed Scotland that they physically abandoned, but at the same time managed to find a means to continue to embrace through song. Through song, they 'negotiated' a version of Scotland for themselves. Out of the place they resisted, they incorporated and took with them what mattered to them about

Scotland. They constructed a 'flexible boundary' between themselves and the Scotland they had lost faith with, which allowed them access to the Scottishness they valued and desired. In many ways it was Scotland that was the 'dominant culture' with which they interacted through music. They incorporated and 'domesticated' the music of the homeland, assimilated the song narratives, sentiments and qualities that were imbued with what they had valued and expected of a Scottish/family life, and took them to Australia.

Another focus in migrant music studies that is pertinent to review in this context is the nature of migrants' attachments to the music of the homeland. While it is the case that my family did draw upon the music world around them in Australia, the long term attachment to the old songs is striking. The explanation often given in the literature is that this attachment to homeland music can be understood as migrant groups 'clinging tenaciously' to their traditional music as a potent symbol of identity; as expressions of nostalgia and homesickness; as a strategic and symbolic source of unity in the face of outside attacks; as a form of self conscious ethnic revivalism; or simply to maintain or negotiate boundaries in response to their new environment.[34] These explanations draw attention to the processes of adjusting to the new, or account for the perceived lack of interaction with the new as an act of defiance, of ethnic identity assertion, or clinging to the outmoded past in the face of change .

Other research, considered in this study has drawn attention to how the music of the homeland can serve as the building blocks for community and identity. Studies, such as these, challenge the idea that homeland music is merely a nostalgic return to the past. The emphasis in these studies, and in this one, is that the materials of a cultural past are not merely static reflections of a sentimental past but have an active presence in the lives of migrants and are actively deployed in making sense of the present. The direction that I now wish to take is that the conceptualisation of 'homeland' music can also be further scrutinised to better understand the nature of that cultural resource. The point being emphasised here is that homeland music, in the case of my family, the homeland music that my family brought with them to Australia, was not an unmediated selection of

Scottish songs that were simply transplanted from one place to another. My family's homeland music was *our* music - already adopted and adapted, shaped and given local cultural meaning. The songs that my family brought with them, their homeland music, was inscribed with their aspirations of family life and cultural values. In the songs and their performance was an ethos of family and cultural being. The observations from the literature that migrant groups often chose music that has a sentimental connection with an 'imagined' ideal that is past or out of reach - an uncorrupted moral order - in some ways can be applied to my family's music, in the sense that the songs represented the Scotland they desired it to be. But there is an important qualification that needs to be made here, and that is that imagining an ideal can be as much about the present and future as the past, and that for migrants in particular, that imagined ideal, or rather ethos, is an integral part of constructing community and a sense of belonging.

In our Scottish family life, our song performance constructed an 'imaginary unity' between family identity and Scottishness. In mediating our relationship with a Scotland that was a growing source of personal, social and cultural disaffection, the performance of the songs provided us with a means to adapt and make some sense of the social and cultural environmental changes that were making Scotland a less desirable place to be. For a young family in Scotland with very few monetary or material resources, and uncertain work and housing prospects, the social and cultural resources *within* the family not only had to be relied upon for entertainment and family interaction, but also took on a particular significance as a means of exerting some degree of control and agency in a stressful and uncertain world.[35] The role of family ritual in enhancing a sense of belonging, of safety, certainty and resilience becomes particularly salient when the outside world is threatening. When it is that outside world that precipitates the decision to leave one's country then that reliance and investment in family and its rituals becomes even more salient and further brings it with significant implications for the well being and cultural survival of that family.

In this way, it might then be said that the family's 'quest for kin and community', for a sense of 'home', had its genesis long before their departure and the physical disruption

of family and cultural ties, and that the family as a key site for belonging and cultural identity had already taken on a crucial role in mediating the family's relationship with Scotland. While it is true that my family experienced the sense of loss associated with what was left behind, I would also suggest that a sense of loss and a longing for a sense of connection was already underway prior to departure with respect to Scotland, and indeed played a large part in the decision making to leave, in the centrality of family life in Australia, and in the continued use of the songs. What was lost was not so such an idealised Scotland, but a 'real' Scotland that had let my family down - a loss that was felt so strongly that it precipitated the decision to leave.

For my family the decision to leave and the 'leaving' placed an even greater burden on that investment in family. The aspirations and expectations that led my parents to seek a better life in Australia all hinged on the family's cultural survival. In leaving Scotland, we not only left behind our extended family, but also all other means of social and economic support. We departed for Australia with very little in the way of monetary or material goods and with no social support networks nor employment ahead of us, other than the knowledge of the provision of migrant hostel accommodation. The willingness to leave and the expectations of a better life in Australia must have been particularly strong for migrant families such as ours, and it is not surprising that for many, as for us, the quest for family was central to their decision making to leave and in shaping their lives in Australia.

But it was not only the experience of migration *per se* that carried implications for the fate of the family, but also the changed relationship with Scotland that brought a 'specific salience' to the family's sense of Scottishness. The decision to leave Scotland meant an emotional adjustment to Scotland in 'the continuing emotional adjustments in which most migrant experience is embroiled and implicated'.[36] In Chamberlain and Leydesdorff's terms, that shift with respect to Scotland, as much as the act of migration, represented an interruption in the family's 'life narrative' that required 'resequencing, remodelling and reinterpreting'. Chamberlain and Leydesdorff have made the crucial point that the experience of migrating does not end at 'the point of disembarkation' but

continues through a migrant's life, demanding 'constant adjustment and appraisal'. When migration is also conceived as a process that originates in the pre-migration condition, the adjustment and appraisal of the homeland life narrative - its resequencing, remodelling and reinterpreting - becomes an equally important arena for investigation. In my family's case it was Scotland with which they had an ongoing dialogue - a conversation that they enacted in song performance. Through song performance they could rearticulate and reinforce their version of Scotland and Scottishness, it gave them a vehicle through which they could continue to make sense of and explain their relationship with Scotland in their own terms.

What is being argued here is that the sense of displacement and dislocation, so often felt by migrants, may not only be associated with the move to a new country, but also in terms of a disruption to their cultural sense of self and identity with respect to the home that has precipitated that move. The need to stabilise the meanings that a 'place' has in this context is thus attached to migrants' relationships with both 'home' and 'away from home', or 'home culture' and 'here culture'. A similar point has been made by Keya Ganguly in her work that suggests that a sense of cultural selfhood in the present is predicated on the ways in which migrants perceive their cultural self *of* the past. She captures this two-way relationship between the cultural past and the cultural present as: 'the authority of the past depends on people's present subjectivity and vice versa'.[37]

It is the 'vice versa' - the reciprocal nature of the relationship - that is critical here. How the cultural self comes to be represented is tied up with how the past is perceived and represented, where migrants' 'narratives of the past inflect the construction of identity in the present'.[38] In other words, the meanings and import that the cultural past comes to have are shaped by their perceived salience for making sense of the cultural present, based on their perceived salience for making sense *in* the past. The implication here is that the meaning and salience of the past *for* the present is inextricably tied up with how that past assists in 'shoring up' and stabilising a sense of cultural self and self-understanding (or as Storey has captured it, it is the power of the past to order the present). Ganguly refers to this process as the 'renovation of selfhood' where the

personal and cultural past is selectively appropriated in order to stabilise its part in the representation of self. It is in these identity 'stakes', according to Ganguly, that the cultural past is 'renovated', made less equivocal and more coherent:

> "… disambiguating the past permits people to make sense of the uncertainties of the present … to repress at least one set of uncertainties by rendering the past in coherent, unequivocal and undoubtedly artificial ways." (Ganguly, 1992, p 31)

As she notes 'the past acquires a more marked salience' for migrants, 'for whom categories of the present have been made unusually unstable or unpredictable'.[39] Where the sense of cultural self has been disrupted, where cultural values, patterns, and reference points are destabilised, the remaking of the past helps to bridge the gap between the 'ethos' that migrants would like to preserve and their lived experiences in the present. It 'helps to recuperate the sense of self not dependent on criteria handed down by others' - the past is what migrants can 'claim as their own'.[40] In my family's case it was their immediate past *in* Scotland that was 'disambiguated' and 'renovated', and made less equivocal, more coherent in song performance. Song performance helped to 'recuperate' the family's sense of cultural self with respect to Scotland and Scottishness, helped to bridge the gap between the ethos that they sought to preserve in family life and their lived experience of Scotland. In the process of 'shoring up' and stabilising a sense of cultural self and self-understanding in their Scottish life, their 'renovated' Scotland could be 'claimed as their own'- a Scottishness that was 'not dependent on criteria handed down by others'. The family's representation of its cultural self was constituted in and through its representation of its version of a Scottish past. The salience that that past had in Scotland for shoring up the family's cultural self, continued to 'inflect the construction of identity' in Australia. As will be explored further below, what my family had 'claimed as their own' took on a further salience in the context of migration and their new life in Australia, as a key strategy in locating 'home' and 'belonging'.

Locating Home

This chapter's emphasis on the role of the pre-migration condition in shaping migrant identities raises a number of implications for the study of migration and migrant identities, in particular the part played by homeland cultural frameworks and traditions in constructing a sense of home and belonging. Foner's work on migrant families is in part an attempt to understand why pre-migration cultural patterns, although adapted and reinterpreted in the new setting, continue to have force in migrant life, that is, how these cultural patterns continue to shape family values, norms, and patterns of behaviour.[41] As she argues, although migrants reconstruct and redefine family life, old cultural patterns play a critical role in the family's 'creative culture-building'. Migrants continue to draw on pre-migration family experiences, norms, and cultural frameworks as they carve out new lives for themselves.

She suggests that among the many factors that keep these homeland cultural patterns traditions alive are:

- ° Strong immigrant communities and institutions.
- ° Dense ethnic networks.
- ° Continued transnational ties to the home country such as, transnational family arrangements, and regular contact and visits that often strengthen migrants' attachments to family values and orientations in the home society. (Foner, 1997 (a), pp 963-964)

She also underscores the importance of migrants' cultural values and frameworks as a filter through which migrants view, experience and create new lives, and in helping families to cope and survive in the migrant setting.[42]

Of those factors, this study has drawn attention to the role of migrants' cultural resources as a 'filter' (in Foner's terms) through which migrants view, interpret and act, and on

their adaptive functions in family cultural survival. As Foner's and other research has demonstrated, attachment to the 'past' to the cultural patterns of the homeland can play an integral part in constructing family, community and a sense of belonging. The ways in which community and belonging, and concepts of home are 'imagined' in migrant life has been a major focus for this study as a means of understanding the role of song performance in my family. That focus on concepts of 'home' can also be brought more directly to bear on the question posed at the outset of this chapter of why some migrants continue to be engaged with their countries of origin, and the related question posed by Foner above - why migrants' cultural values and frameworks continue to have force in migrant life.

An approach to answering this question is alluded to by Foner, where she suggests that in order to better understand the role of migrant cultural resources we need studies that investigate the meanings that migrants attach to their kinship and family relations.[43] The meanings that attach to kinship and family are also, it can be argued, closely tied to the meanings that attach to 'home' and 'belonging'. Where and how 'home' is located in the migrant imagination is crucial for understanding migrant identity and can help to explain why the past, the homeland and the cultural past continue to 'have force' in migrant life. In my family's case it can help to shed further light on the longstanding 'force' of its Scottish song repertoire.

As noted previously in this study, the sense of place and belonging, so acutely felt by migrants, is 'more often than not located in the imaginary and in memory'.[44] A sense of place, of home, is not just geography; it is more akin to what Gupta and Ferguson refer to as, 'an imagined state of being or moral location'.[45] Writers, particularly in the field of migration, diaspora and cultural studies, have drawn attention to the fact that the idea of 'home' can embody a number of different but intersecting meanings: embracing home as particular homeland territory or place, and home as sense of belonging and attachment;[46] home as a symbolic homeland, or 'spiritual possibility';[47] home as 'bilocal' or 'bifocal' embracing both homeland and hereland;[48] or home as an 'in-

between place' neither homeland nor hereland, a 'deterritorialised' sense of home that reaches beyond both homeland and hereland.[49]

Fortier, for example, suggests that 'home' in the migrant imagination is not necessarily born out of a spatial opposition between homeland and hereland. She argues that the objects and the locations of migrant longing and belonging are not fully explained by the oppositional categories of 'here' and 'there' in migration theory. As she explains, this 'oppositional tendency' posits:

> "… homeland as the object of longing (in nostalgic remembrances, the myth of return, political commitment), and hostland as the efforts to belong (integrating, fitting in, politics of difference)." (Fortier, 2000, p 163)

Fortier's view is that what is longed for and where it is that migrants are striving to belong is 'not so much about the connection with a country, as it is about the creation of a sense of place, which is often uttered in terms of 'home' '.[50] That sense of 'home' is not so much a 'between' place, between 'here' and 'there', between homeland and hostland, but one that is connected to the local and the here and now, but whose 'symbolic reach is multilocal'.[51] The creation of a sense of place, of home, draws on the cultural and symbolic resources that migrants use to define community and their identity. In this way the connections that migrants have with 'over there' make a difference to migrant life and experience 'over here'. As she argues, ideas of national or cultural belonging 'are paramount in examining the way that connections 'over there' make a difference 'over here' in the formation of migrant identities. Those connections with 'over there' are often less about a physical place, a country, than a sense of origins, traditions and culture - migrants' imagined belongings.[52]

Her argument is founded on the idea that identity is a formative process, 'a longing to belong'. It is the desire for attachment and an identity, rather than that longing to belong arising from an already constituted identity. In other words, migrants' construction of 'home' is motivated by the desire for an identity that seeks attachment to places, people,

or ways of being.[53] For migrants, the practices of group identity are about 'manufacturing cultural and historical belongings that mark out terrains of commonality'. The different 'cultural belongings' that migrants formulate and use as a means of constructing community refers to both 'possessions' and 'inclusion', that is, imagining a community is both about the creation of a common culture and how that community becomes attached to, or located in a place. In marking out these terrains of commonality, the norms of belonging, the 'social dynamics and politics of 'fitting in' are delineated'.[54]

By raising the question of *what* is longed for and *where* it is that migrants are striving to belong, Fortier opens up the different ways in which migrant attachments to homeland, to culture, tradition and origins are configured to construct different and new forms of 'home':

> "This is a world constituted by the space that brings together 'where you're from', 'where you're at', and where you're going, and reconfigures them into new webs of meaning." (Fortier, 2000, p 17)

She draws on Atvar Brah's distinction between 'homing desire' and the 'desire for homeland' to capture the complex of ways in which migrants' 'belonging' and 'home' are formulated, how claims for 'home' may vary, and how the desire for homeland may be entangled with homing desire.[55] Fortier's study demonstrates that the 'desire for the homeland', for example, is no simple matter of a desire to return to a place, nor a nostalgic longing for a place or romanticised ideal. Attachment to homeland can be part of efforts to resist assimilation, to participate in the cross border political realm, and is also often a measure of migrants' equivocal relationships to the homeland - 'a gesture against oblivion in, and of, the 'homeland' ' - an idea that has particular relevance to my family's attachment to homeland. Homing desire, on the other hand, is the desire to 'feel at home', to create a sense of place and belonging 'where you're at'.[56] What Fortier points out is that homing desire and the desire for homeland often operate together. While the creation of a sense of place is local in its 'materialization', its symbolic reach

is 'multilocal'. Where a sense of community and attachment is constructed out of migrants' cultural belongings - common traditions, histories and experiences and memories - to produce new and localised grounds of belonging, the desire to feel at home draws on and reformulates these cultural resources that derive from 'homeland'. Homeland traditions and culture are physically or symbolically 're-enacted', 're-processed', 're-membered', or 're-imported' in order to shape a place to call 'home'. In this way, and for the Italian émigré culture in Fortier's study, homeland remains a 'spiritual possibility'. Homeland here manifests itself not in terms of rupture, uprooting, or discontinuity, but rather, as continuity, as a place where one *can* return, symbolically or spiritually.[57]

Fortier's account of migrant belongings offers a useful lens through which to 'unpack' how a 'longing for home' played out in my family, and in particular how desire for the homeland may be entangled with a homing desire. Firstly my family's response to its 'equivocal' relationship with Scotland can be viewed as both a desire for the homeland and a 'homing desire'. In seeking to define the Scotland they valued, that they set store by, my family's longing to belong was attached to *their* idea of homeland. In this sense 'homeland' was constructed not so much in terms of a place, but as a 'Scottishness', a space of belonging. Rather than signifying rupture, uprooting, or discontinuity, that space offered a sense of continuity - a symbolic and cultural space of attachment and belonging. It was a 'place' that they could indeed return to or rather maintain an ongoing connection to, not as a fixed territory or place but as a new space of belonging that they could access through song performance. That new space of belonging, as one constructed out of memory and the 'processing' of cultural forms, according to Fortier, 'defeats the idea that the homeland', (as a geographical place), 'is a constant object of longing or a permanent site of return'.[58] As she notes, quoting Aisha Khan:

"… the place to which one returns is not necessarily the place from which one came …" (Fortier, 2000, p 160, quoting Khan, 1995, p 96)

For my family 'there' was also continuously brought into their experience of 'here' in Australia. Song performance provided a means by which the desire for home and belonging could be enacted. Song performance was not so much the depiction or expression of a given/established identity, as the construction of a desired Scottish identity. It was a means for the family to locate and define its Scottishness, to articulate its longing to belong. In Fortier's terms, the family's song performance can be viewed as a practice of group identity formation. The songs as 'cultural belongings' or possessions marked out terrains of commonality in the creation of a collective sense of belonging.

Secondly, that desire for home, as has been argued in this study, was not only a desire for a particular kind of Scottishness, but for a Scottishness rooted in family. What was longed for and where it was that my family were striving to belong was circumscribed by family. As a manifestation of a homing desire, that is, the desire 'to feel at home', the family represented a site where that desire could be located. Feeling at home and fitting in was thus founded on a sense of belonging of attachment to both family and Scottishness. The family, it could be said, acted as a privileged site for cultural belonging, but equally I would argue, Scottishness served as a privileged site for family belonging. The role of songs in the family served as expressions of a homing desire and a desire for homeland across the dimensions of family and cultural identity. As Fortier suggests, homing desire brings the past and its cultural possessions to bear on the localised construction of a sense of place, where a collective sense of belonging and hence identity is enacted and made manifest. It is a process through which:

> "… the local is constructed to create habitual and habitable spaces grounded on different forms of remembrance, including, though not exclusively based on, remembrances of the homeland. These remembrances, in turn, take the material form of cultural artefacts … that are 're-imported … in order to shape it into a place to call 'home'." (Fortier, 2000, p 164)

Family, as Fortier argues, is a crucial and 'utterly local' site for the formulation of migrant identity. In our family, song performance was a means of 'localising' the

family's cultural identity. Song performance within the family created a 'habitual' and 'habitable space' in which different forms of 'remembrance' - family and cultural could be enacted. The songs and the performance of them, by encoding a cultural heritage as personalised, family understandings and memories, shaped family and Scottishness into a 'place' to call 'home' **-** a symbolic space that was defined as much through our version of Scottishness as it was though our version of being a family. Attached to family life in both Scotland and Australia, song performance served to stabilise (at least temporarily) the meanings of both family and cultural identity, providing what Fortier describes as 'ontological security'. Perhaps such 'ontological security' is more pressing for migrants such as my family when living in a non-Scottish world in Australia, but as I have argued, the salience of their Scottishness was not born out of a new need arising out of the family's encounter with Australia. It had its genesis prior to departure, in the shifting and equivocal relationship with Scotland.

Attachment to homeland, in song performance in my family's case, can be understood as a striving for a sense of home and belonging that did not represent a dichotomy between 'here' and 'there'. It was not a longing to return to a homeland, a desire for a better place and time of the past, whilst striving to fit in with a new present 'here'. Rather, song performance served as a means through which the family could construct a Scotland with which they could fit, in terms of family and cultural identity. That 'fit' was not predicated on a fixed past but on an ongoing dialogue with the 'past' that took place in an ever evolving present. The relationship with Scotland, with 'over there', was certainly an important site of connection, but in my family's case 'over there' was an integral part of being in the here and the now and in their aspirations for the family's future, and in their decision making. Moreover, their experience of Scotland 'over there', their attempts to make meaningful and valued connections to Scottishness, continued to articulate with their experience 'over here', and shaped their ways of being 'here', and their Scottishness in Australia. I would suggest that family song performance served to construct a sense of home and belonging by connecting a sense of enduring traditions to the lived experience of family, by locating cultural identity within a symbolic space to call home in both Scotland and Australia.

Analysis of my family's case also serves to question one of the pervasive theoretical constructs in understanding migrant identities, that is, that boundaries *and* the construction of difference are core variables.[59] This study has sought to demonstrate that identity may also arise in the quest for inclusion and in the dissolution of boundaries. For my family that meant a significant investment in building and sustaining a sense of family cohesion through a shared vision of its cultural heritage and identity. Crucial in this quest for family and cultural identity was the dissolution of the boundary between 'here' and 'there', and equally importantly the opening up of the boundary between themselves and the Scotland they had lost faith with, that allowed them to access Scottishness in their own terms, to 'fit' in. The role of song performance in the family can thus well be likened to what Fortier describes as a 'tenacious investment in seeking common grounds and configuring them in terms of identity, origins, community, and tradition'.[60]

This chapter has focused on how the desire for 'home', for a sense of belonging and community plays a fundamental role in how migrants construct their new lived world. It has also underscored how symbolic connections to the 'homeland' may provide key resources through which the desire for 'home' is configured into 'habitable' spaces of belonging. In my family's case that 'habitable space' was made local and specific in the context of family. It was a space in which memory, culture and tradition were shaped, adapted and deployed to create a 'fit' between family and cultural identity. Song performance provided a means by which the family could delineate what 'fitting in' meant for them. Song performance thus served as a key cultural strategy in the creation of 'home' and belonging - a strategy that helped the family to negotiate and locate its Scottishness through time and across both 'real' and imaginary borders.

This one example of a migrant family suggests that the cultural resources that migrants bring with them continue to have force in migrant life where they 'continue' to satisfy key identity needs and desires. In this way, migrants may carry more in their cultural luggage than music and photographs. They bring with them strategies for cultural survival that may prove to be as effective for the future as they were in the past. Their

salience and efficacy in the new context may therefore be in large part a measure of their perceived salience and efficacy in the past. The past, from this perspective, acts not as a site of longing nor nostalgia nor some kind of romanticised ideal, but as a strategic form of 'cultural calibration', a means for gauging and getting the identity fit to feel right and at home, wherever you happen to be, enabling migrants to be 'at home abroad'.[61]

---

[1] Langellier and Peterson, 2006, p 123.

[2] Brettell, 2008, p 120, quoting Margolis, 1995, p 29.

[3] Brettell, 2008, p 120.

[4] Schmitter Heisler, 2008, p 99.

[5] For useful summaries see Schmitter Heisler, 2008, pp 96-97; and Brettell, 2008, pp 121-122.

[6] 'For history, economics, sociology, anthropology, and geography one of the dominant paradigms in migration theory is the assimilation model' (Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 16). Schmitter Heisler notes that transnationalism was part of the critique of 'the unilinear assimilationist paradigm of classical migration research' (Schmitter Heisler, 2008, p 94, quoting Levitt and Glick Schiller, 2004, p 1005).

[7] Schmitter Heisler, 2008, p 85. See also Brettell and Hollifield's summary of sociological theory that 'has moved from postulating a single outcome (assimilation) to manifold outcomes that depend on such factors as social capital, labor markets, and a range of institutional structures' (Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 6).

[8] See Schmitter Heisler, 2008, pp 84-86, for a discussion of these terms.

[9] See also Brettell, 2003, p 1.

[10] Schmitter Heisler, 2008, p 90, referring to Alba and Nee, 1997 and 2003.

[11] See Schmitter Heisler, 2008, pp 94-96. See also Brettell, 2008, pp 120-125. As she notes, 'those who have adopted the transnational framework have written about … transnational identities that challenge processes of immigrant assimilation or incorporation' (Brettell, 2008, p 120). Transnationalism 'has generated new ideas about the representation and incorporation of immigrants and the deterritorialization, if not the actual disintegration, of nation-states' (Brettell, 2008, pp 122-123).

[12] See Brettell, 2008, for research studies that 'challenge unidirectional theories of assimilation, add agency and fluidity to the process of adaptation, and reinforce the theory that ethnicity is culturally constructed' (Brettell, 2008, p 135).

[13] Brettell, 2008, pp 132-133. Schmitter Heisler, 2008, pp 85-89.

[14] Brettell, 2008, p 133.

[15] Brettell, 2008, p 132.

---

[16] Brettell, 2008, p 124.

[17] Brettell, 2008, p 118.

[18] Brettell, 2008, p 120.

[19] Brettell, 2008, p 136.

[20] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 18.

[21] I use the term 'transnational identity' here as a convenient shorthand, simply to emphasise a migrant identity that embraces both homeland and hereland, and to distinguish it from a migrant identity as a hyphenated identity (an add-on identity); and an assimilated identity, where one national/cultural affiliation is replaced by another.

[22] See Brettell, 2008, for a useful summary of this work, pp 117-118, and pp 120-122.

[23] See, for example, James, 2000; Shelemay, 1998; Fortier, 2000; Ganguly, 1992.

[24] Blunt, 2002, np. See also Brettell, who attempts to tease out the features of how 'nostalgia' for the homeland - 'saudade' - underpins the return orientation of Portuguese migrants. She states that 'this return orientation was not, and is not, merely nostalgic. It is associated with a very specific goal - to leave poor but to return rich and display one's wealth to those one has left behind … it has affected the way migrants view the host society as a detoured route to social mobility and social prestige within their own society' (Brettell, 2003 p 72).

[25] Fortier, 2000, p 2. Fortier uses the term migrant 'belongings' to refer both to the idea of 'cultural possessions' (what I have referred to as cultural resources in this study), and the idea of 'belongings' as a sense of community and attachment.

[26] Ganguly's analysis allows for the idealisation of the past, but does not confine it to that. She sees it more as a process of 'renovation', where the past becomes a kind of touchstone for how things 'ought to be' in the present, so that 'the stories people tell about their pasts have more to do with the continuing shoring up of self-understanding than with 'historical truths' ' (Ganguly, 1992, p 30).

[27] Foner, 1997 (a), p 962.

[28] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 5.

[29] Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 6.

[30] Brettell, 2008, p 114.

[31] Brettell, 2003, p 59.

[32] Where there has been some interest in this perspective is in studies on return migration, although as Brettell argues, most of these studies do not 'give attention to return migration as an important element in the decision-making process of the migrant or migrant family prior to migration and as an important factor affecting behavior once abroad - that is, an important facet of the migrant's self image and of the individual or familial 'plan' of migration … in short, return migration is affected not only by the way the host society receives or accepts migrants but also by the way the migrant views his or her own society and the host society' (Brettell, 2003, p 59). She borrows from Philpott's concept of the ideology of migration

to explain the role of the pre-migration mind set: 'every migrant … carries ideas as to the nature and goals of his migration, a cognitive model … an ideology' (Brettell, 2003, p 59, quoting Philpott, 1973, p 188).

[33] Stokes, 1997, p 17.

[34].John Baily, 1997, p 47, discusses various perspectives on why groups cultivate outmoded musical practices, and refers to how immigrant groups are often seen to 'cling tenaciously to their traditional musics'. Sources of other explanations noted have been given in Chapter 7.

[35] As discussed in Chapter 9, in contrast to the external factors that have an impact on family life, family rituals represent an arena in which families can exercise some degree of control and agency in making sense of their lives.

[36] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 227.

[37] Ganguly, 1992, p 30.

[38] Ganguly, 1992, p 36.

[39] Ganguly, 1992, pp 29-30.

[40] Ganguly, 1992, p 40.

[41] Foner, 1997 (a), p 962.

[42] Foner, 1997 (a), pp 964-965.

[43] Foner, 1997 (a), p 972.

[44] Chamberlain and Leydesdorff, 2004, p 233.

[45] Gupta and Ferguson, 1992, p 10. See also Brettell, who notes that the question of how 'home' is thought about or imagined has become a topic of increasing interest in migration studies (Brettell, 2003, p 49).

[46] Atvar Brah, 1996, p 180.

[47] Fortier, 2000, p 162.

[48] 'bilocal' (and 'multilocal') Schmitter Heisler, 2008, p 97; 'multilocal' Fortier, 2000, p 163; 'bifocal', Peters (1992) in Gupta and Ferguson, 1992, p 11.

[49] 'in-between place' (Rajan and Sharman, 2006, p 3) in Brettell, 2008, p 121; 'deterritorialized' in Gupta and Ferguson, 1992, p 9; and Schmitter Heisler, 2008, p 95.

[50] Fortier, 2000, pp 163.

[51] Fortier, 2000, pp 160-161. See also Gupta and Ferguson, who discuss how identities 'are increasingly coming to be, if not wholly deterritorialized, at least differently territorialized. Refugees, migrants, displaced and stateless peoples - these are perhaps the first to live out these realities in their most complete form' (Gupta and Ferguson, 1992, pp 9-10).

[52] Fortier is drawing here on James Clifford's idea that the 'empowering paradox of diaspora is that dwelling *here* assumes a solidarity and connection *there*. But *there* is not necessarily a single place or an exclusivist nation. How is the connection (elsewhere) that makes a difference (here) remembered and rearticulated ?' (Clifford, 1994, p 322).

[53] Fortier, 2000, p 2. Fortier draws on Probyn, 1996, p 19.

[54] Fortier, 2000, p 2.

---

[55] Fortier, 2000, p 164. Brah, 1996, p 180.

[56] Fortier, 2000, p 70. Fortier's use of the terms, 'where you're from' and 'where you're at' is drawn from Gilroy, 1991. As Fortier comments: ' 'where you're from' articulates with 'where you're at' - the 'dialectics of diasporic identification', as Gilroy (1991) puts it, are about the sometimes fraught, often equivocal relationship of immigrants to their 'homeland' ' (Fortier, 2000, p 70).

[57] Fortier, 2000, pp 162-163.

[58] Fortier, 2000, p 160.

[59] Notions of boundary construction and boundary maintenance (after Barth) remain at the core of interpretations of ethnic and migrant identity, as noted by Brettell, 2008, p 132. See also Stokes for an account of this prevailing view with respect to how music 'is used by social actors in specific local situations to erect boundaries, to maintain distinctions between us and them' (Stokes, 1997, p 6). Fortier's work emphasises migrants' quest for belonging and inclusion rather than difference. See also Shelemay, 1998.

[60] Fortier, 2000, p 1.

[61] 'at home abroad' is an expression coined by Sheffer, 2003, to capture the links that diasporic communities maintain with their homelands.

11

Conclusion

The Right Storied Relationship: Carving Theory out of Experience[1]

This study has situated a specific post-war Scottish migration experience within contemporary discussions of migration, diaspora and transnationalism. Brettell's comment in the previous chapter that migrants are no longer 'uprooted', but rather 'move freely back and forth across international borders and between different cultures and social systems' implies, at least in the context of modern mobility, that migration is a relatively straightforward matter. This raises the question of the extent to which the 'transnational turn' in migration studies has a contemporary bearing on the analysis of older forms of migration, such as the post-war British migrants to Australia. It also raises the question of whether the 'transnational turn' has a contemporary bearing on the particular analysis in this study and on my own experience as a 'native' researcher of migrant song tradition. In this concluding chapter, the study's key theme of the relationship between homeland culture and identity in the context of migration is framed through this two-part question. It provides the vehicle for a summary of project issues and their implications for the study of migrant identity.

Several writers have raised the question of whether transnationalism reflects anything new in the study of migration, aids in the explanation of the migrant experience and illuminates more traditional forms of migration.[2] While transnationalism has typically been associated with more recent patterns of migration, 'the mobility of modernity' and migrations of prosperity, post-war British migration to Australia was characterised by the 'migration of austerity', and represents a more traditional form of migration typified

by the 'permanent transfer from one nation state to another'. In the Australian case, however, that transfer was seen not so much as a transnational experience but as 'a translocal one' - as a move from one part of Britain to another.[3] The reality of the new life in Australia however, as Hammerton and Coleborne have noted, represented a much more complex picture of migrant adjustment than such similarity would suggest.

Although the post-war British migrant experience, including that of my family, may appear to be at odds with the ease and adaptability suggested by the mobility of modernity, it nevertheless shares at least one important feature to which transnationalism has brought a specific and valuable focus. Here I am referring to migrants ongoing connections with the homeland in forms of, what Hammerton refers to as, 'transnational interaction', and its implications for migrant identity. As this study of one family's post-war migration experience has demonstrated, such 'transnational interaction' is, in itself, not a new phenomenon nor unique to the mobility of modernity. But the attention to it in contemporary migration studies has, I would argue, brought critical insights, a language and a conceptual apparatus for better understanding the complex of ways in which homeland and hereland are implicated in migrant identities, for migrants of the past and of the present. I would also suggest that those recent theoretical and conceptual perspectives have been further illuminated by the specifics of this case study that have generally not been the subject of detailed investigation.

As noted in the previous chapter, this study has found much relevance in the 'transnational turn' in migration studies, in its emphasis on the importance of migrants' ongoing connections with homeland and its articulation with identity; in the reframing of the ways in which cultural variables such as ethnicity are understood; and in the importance of social networks, particularly the role of family, in formulations of migrant identity. While much of the migration theory and research that takes a transnational view is founded on the activities and practices of migrants across borders, it has also opened up for consideration the role of 'imagined' connections, and the ways in which migrants make connections to a sense of homeland, community and kin through means other than direct contact with people, places or processes. Particularly relevant have been the

insights from diaspora studies that have provided the conceptual tools through which to interrogate migrants' symbolic and affective connections rather than the social, institutional, or political; and the role of memory and narrative in the formulation of 'home' and migrant identities. The analysis in this study of the ways in which concepts of home are 'imagined' in migrant life through song, and its role in the construction of family and migrant identity has benefited considerably from these insights.

Crucial in this have been the reconceptualisations of space, place and time in the migrant experience and the relationships between 'homeland' and 'hereland' in migrants' constructions of 'home' and 'belonging'. In this expanded theorisation, the boundaries between 'here' and 'there', between 'hereland' and homeland' not only blur but become less a spatial relationship than a temporal or subjective one. Such theorisation moves to obliterate the oppositional concepts of 'here' and 'there' altogether, so that migrants are seen to occupy 'in-between spaces of identity, culture, and communication' or 'negotiate new forms of belonging outside of this two-way geography'.[4] The account of my family's relationship with the homeland in this study may also be seen as a transnational one that underscores the blurring of boundaries between here and there, and one where homeland, culture, tradition and origins were re-configured to construct different and new forms of 'home'.

The transnational turn in migration studies has also brought useful perspectives for exploring the role of cultural tradition in migrant life. For this study it has rested not so much in the physical connections with homeland and ethnic group association, but in the symbolic and affective as a form of transnational interaction through an 'ongoing dialogue' with the past, tradition and origins. The factors that keep cultural traditions alive identified by Foner and others, such as migrant communities and institutions, ethnic networks, and transnational social, economic and political ties provide some explanation of the mechanisms through which attachments to homeland and cultural patterns and frameworks are sustained for many migrant groups. My family's example, however, is not explained by these structural and cross border social support mechanisms. Rather, it draws attention to the crucial role of the symbolic in the 'identity

project' in the migration experience, and how the 'longing to belong', for attachment and community in the hereland is a key motivating factor that underpins the ways in which migrants continue their connections to homeland. In this, the study has sought to shed light on a more dynamic conception of tradition in migrant life.

This study has also sought to interrogate a particular set of symbolic musical and lyrical forms and their relationship to 'home' and identity in the migrant experience. It is here that the convergence of migration, anthropology, folklore and cultural studies has proven especially useful in attempting to chart the articulation between identity and cultural forms. If the study of folklore is a process in which 'we are conceptualizing and reconceptualizing a set of cultural materials and their privileged relation to the identities of individuals and groups', then this interdisciplinary study is evidence of how the contributions of other disciplines can augment and deepen that quest.[5]

This study's investigation of that culture/identity relationship has meant attending to ways in which collective cultural constructions interact with local practices and meanings. Here I wanted to draw an important distinction between the cultural forms that mark a nation, and the meanings that those forms have for individuals. Or to put it another way, I wanted to draw attention to a more personal and domestic reception of Scottishness, one that connects with - but equally departs from - a publicly constructed Scottishness. That publicly constructed Scottishness, as a collective cultural identity, has so dominated interpretations of Scottish migrant identity (and Scottish identity more generally for that matter) that this study has needed to devote considerable attention to the cultural forms that are seen to represent it, and to the contexts in which they have been generated and reproduced, represented and interpreted. In doing so it has sought to understand how those collective forms become pervasive, widely available as 'shared instruments' of a culture.

This study has taken those 'shared instruments' of a culture, the Scottish songs as collected, performed, published, and studied; and the 'same' Scottish songs as lived performance in a suburban family, as parallel points of departure. It has done so in order

to examine how collective ideas of Scottishness, notably in song, are appropriated and customised at the local level. The rationale underpinning this dual approach has been an endeavour to find a conceptual means of bridging the gap between cultural identity as a collective social construct and cultural identity as a constituent of the self. Informed by ideas about identity developed in the work of writers such as, Cohen, Hall, Hearn, Storey, Berger and Del Negro, and Somers, that the personal and the collective are interdependent and that it is through collective forms that individuals make sense of themselves, a conceptual framework began to take shape. That framework brought both the public and private faces of culture and identity into an active relationship. But there remained the question of where to locate the intersection between these dimensions of identity. That is, how to conceptualise and explain what Hearn refers to as the 'contextualised motivation' for drawing on particular collective forms, specifically that of national/cultural identity. Hearn's formulation that the relationship between the social and personal dimensions of national identity is mediated by specific social contexts proved particularly useful in this regard, adding a further mediating variable to an understanding of how identity works.

The development of a conceptual frame that brings together culture, identity, and context has been crucial to the goal of understanding and explaining the relationship between public Scottishness and personal Scottishness. That goal has been made more acute since, although the fluidity and contingency of identity is generally accepted as a given when it comes to the identity of persons, when it comes to discourses about 'national' cultures or a collective cultural identity, such complexities and subtleties are often overlooked in favour of all too easy and comfortable stereotypes and generalisations. In the almost exclusive attention to the public and group oriented manifestations of Scottishness in diaspora, an inevitable distortion has occurred that homogenises and essentialises a collective cultural identity. I have argued that such a distortion risks misconstruing both Scottishness, and its place in the day-to-day lives of Scots abroad. This study joins others that provide a corrective to this view by attending to the contemporary meanings that such engagement with tradition and custom have for migrants themselves. The attention in this study to the domestic and the everyday in

migrant life also seeks to provide an alternative interpretation to national/cultural identity, one that attempts to 'rethink' identity within and without the cultural forms that are seen to represent it.[6]

The task of uncovering what Scottishness might look like in the lives of Scottish migrants is also made especially challenging when so often that Scottishness lies largely hidden in the private realm, is little understood in academia, nor readily recoverable in the historic or public record. As Gary West has observed, 'tracing the musical goings-on within the private household is much more problematic than conducting a parallel investigation within the public sphere'.[7] It is also a Scottishness that has typically been 'read' through its iconography - the artifacts of identity that are more readily locatable and observable to the research gaze. Artifacts, such as the songs in this study, do exist and circulate in the social world as 'mass marketed artifacts of culture', as commodities, in recordings and in performance, as tokens of nation and national identity. These ubiquitous tokens of a popular Scottishness might seem to be closer to a private and domestic Scottishness - they are at least observable - things in use - that might give an indication of what Scottishness might mean in the popular imagination and in diaspora. But here too, as I have argued, we need to be wary of assuming a straightforward relationship or equivalence between a personal sense of Scottishness, and the popular cultural forms that are so often judged to represent it. I have also argued that often lying unexamined beneath arguments that render such artifacts as tokenistic or culturally impoverished, is a concern about popular culture in general, and an emphasis on the determining power of cultural forms and processes (structure) over individual and group meaning making (agency).

On the other hand, the cultural meanings that such forms bring with them are not to be underestimated either. While I agree with Anthony Cohen that cultural forms in themselves have no meaning other than that ascribed to them, collective cultural forms are carriers of meaning. As shared instruments of a culture, they carry with them 'symbolic associations' or 'connotation clusters' that play an important mediating role in how those forms are used and understood locally. It is also through such collective forms

that individuals locate and depict their selves. Collective cultural forms shape the cultural language and cultural narrative that provide us with the tools to shape and recall memories and our personal narratives. But even the most pervasive and powerful cultural icons and symbols are not absolute determinants of our identity. Their power lies, as Cohen argues, 'in providing us with the means to think rather than in compelling us to think certain things'.[8]

Cohen has also argued such symbolic forms can all too easily be posited as 'identity', rather than as resources which individuals draw upon to formulate meaning and their own sense of selfhood and cultural identity. When the artifacts of culture are posited as identity, and where those artifacts are also judged debased or tokenistic there is a risk of both misconstruing how identity works, and of bypassing or minimising those shared instruments of the culture and their part played in identity. In their perceived 'fall from grace', as hackneyed and kitsch, the popular songs of Scotland have been deemed touchstones of an impoverished popular culture and an impoverished Scottishness. It is an imputation propped up by a kind of 'triviality barrier' towards everyday culture and aspirations for a more worthy or 'true' Scottishness. But if, as Storey, Hall and Butler remind us, identity is performance *within* culture, 'using the resources of history, language and culture in the process of becoming', then those resources demand to be considered rather than assumed if identity is to be properly understood.[9] Being Scottish is about drawing on the resource of cultural identity through those forms that make sense of one's Scottishness, when being Scottish matters in specific contexts.

For my family that meant making sense of our cultural selves, in relation to the past in the present, where our past was used to order the present. Our songs, were no mere tokenistic artifacts of identity, but rather 'vernacular ways of saying'- ways of being Scottish. They gave us a language through which to rethink the past and to rethink our cultural selves into the present - to construct a 'past we could live by'.[10] Being Scottish was not so much a badge of identity but a means of locating and depicting ourselves as a family whose life narrative had been interrupted by migration. Understanding how identity works in this one specific context may reveal principles, as Hearn has suggested,

that might better enable us to understand how identity works in other contexts. In addition, attention to the neglected voices and stories of migrants themselves, may reveal a more nuanced picture of the place of Scottishness in the lives of Scots abroad.

When I started this project, I wanted to see *if* I could explain the importance of the songs in my family. I also wanted to discover *how* I could explain that importance, especially since I initially found little to draw upon for guidance in this task. It was also important to me that what I might find and say had some relevance, made some contribution to what was already known and understood about culture and identity in the context of migration. In this I was seeking to make connections with my own past, to renew and understand them in a larger field, to situate my ordinary everyday experience of Scottish song within critical cultural discourse. It was a task that sought to 'carve theory' out of personal history and the experience of migration.[11]

If identity is an interpretative framework, a means of making sense of experience, then it applies to both the 'subjects' of the research and the 'researcher'.[12] As Rina Benmayor and Andor Skotnes have argued, oral testimony 'not only reports on, but actively participates in the process of identity construction'.[13] In this study, as both 'testifier' and 'analyst', I have both 'reported on' and 'participated in' the process of identity construction, a dual process of investigation and interpretation that has been mediated and ordered by what I have come to know in the process of doing it.[14] That process of investigation has brought insights about my own sense of Scottishness, and in particular, how that sense of Scottishness has in fact been shaped and articulated in the process of the investigation itself. In other words, the very ideas that this research has employed and investigated have been demonstrated - have played out - in the act of producing this work.

In bearing witness to my own family's migration experience, through an interpretation and analysis of cultural narrative, I have in effect been constructing my own narrative, one in which my own life story has been understood, remembered and told. As Alistair Thomson has suggested, 'migrant testimony is itself an exemplar of the processes and

difficulties of identity construction' that forges 'new understandings of the self and society'.[15] And like many other migrant narratives, the meanings which migrants ascribe to their past experience, and the ways in which the life story is understood, remembered and told, also change over time.[16] If I had written this thesis several years ago, it would have been a different one.

My desire to rehabilitate my family songs, to affirm their cultural value, has led to an enactment and public statement of my own cultural identity. I am positioning 'Scottishness' for myself and an audience at this time of my life. It is a positioning that reveals how I wish my version of Scottishness to be viewed and understood - a version of Scottishness that is not limited to hearth and home. Invoking insider status as 'Scottish', lending 'authenticity', 'plausibility' and 'relevance'; while at the same time invoking the 'objectivity' and 'credibility' of the academic research process, I can claim both as my own. It is, for me, a way of 'being Scottish', a Scottishness I can live by, not dependent on criteria handed down by others. The cultural resources that I have drawn upon to shape this Scottishness have been those of my own heritage and those of the wider discursive world. My homeland traditions and culture have been 're-enacted' and 're-processed', and importantly 're-interpreted' in order to shape both a discursive and a personal Scottishness. The 'other' Scottishness, that Scottishness of public discourse and cultural critique has also been an integral part of this process. I have drawn on it as a 'cultural resource', challenging and reinterpreting it in order to argue for a 'contrary' Scottishness, one that can make sense of two kinds of experience, both personal and academic. This process, a kind of self-making, has been made manifest in a rethinking of identity, one that endeavours to challenge monolithic views of Scottish culture and Scottish identity.

The exploration of the issues surrounding the formulation of identity and how these might illuminate cultural and family identity has been a kind of performance, in writing - of interpretation and telling - in which I have drawn on history, language and culture that has produced my own narrative of identity and attachment. This reaching for connections, of seeking attachment to place and identity, has been a symbolic journey

through story telling. Through it, I have searched for 'the right storied relationship between my past, my family, its languages, its landscapes, and its identities'.[17] The 'right storied relationship' that I have sought to capture and construct has taken explicit and physical form as a critical account of homeland narrative music performance in the context of migration. But this study also serves to demonstrate another form of 'transnational interaction' - my own narrative - that has sought to rethink my Scottish past into the present and to reconfigure it into new webs of meaning that bridge the theoretical and the personal.

---

[1] 'Carving theory' out of experience (Benmayor and Skotnes, 1994, p 13). Denzin refers to seeking 'the right storied relationship' between his past and its histories in his autoethnographic writing (Denzin, 2002, p 256).

[2] See Hammerton, 2006 (b), p 125; Brettell and Hollifield, 2008, p 17; Schmitter Heisler, 2008, pp 95-96; Foner, 1997 (b).

[3] Hammerton, 2006 (b), pp 126-127.

[4] 'in-between spaces', Brettell, 2008, p 121, quoting Rajan and Sharma, 2006, p 3; 'new forms of belonging', Fortier, 2000, p 16.

[5] Oring, 1994, p 223.

[6] Ganguly argues that the domestic and everyday are 'primary considerations for the problem of rethinking identity' (Ganguly, 1992, p 31).

[7] West, 2006, p 130.

[8] A P Cohen, 1996, p 812.

[9] Hall, 1996, p 4.

[10] Thomson refers to how migrant narratives construct 'a past we can live by' (Thomson, 1999, p 35).

[11] Benmayor and Skotnes, 1994, p 13.

[12] See particularly Berger and Del Negro, 2004, pp 124-157, for a detailed discussion of identity as an interpretive framework for making sense of experience - both as 'actor' and 'researcher'.

[13] Benmayor and Skotnes, 1994, p 15.

[14] Benmayor and Skotnes, 1994, p 17.

[15] Thomson, 1999, p 35.

---

[16] Thomson refers to older migrants who 'want to review their lives and bear witness to their histories, and to communicate these histories' to their families and to 'outsiders' (Thomson, 1999, p 35).

[17] Denzin, 2002, p 256.

Bibliography

Abu-Lughod, Lila, 'Writing Against Culture', in Richard G Fox, ed, *Recapturing Anthropology: Working in the Present*, Santa Fe, School of American Research Press, 1991.

Alba, Richard, and Victor Nee, 'Rethinking Assimilation Theory for a New Era of Immigration', *International Migration Review*, vol 31, 1997, pp 826-874.

Alba, Richard, and Victor Nee, *Remaking the American Mainstream: Assimilation and Contemporary Immigration*, Cambridge Massachusetts, Harvard University Press, 2003.

Amersfoort, Hans van, 'Gabriel Sheffer and the Diaspora Experience', *Diaspora*, vol 13, no 2/3, 2004, pp 359-374.

Anagnostou, Yiorgos, 'Metaethnography in the Age of 'Popular Folklore' ', *Journal of American Folklore*, vol 119, no 474, 2006, pp 318-412.

Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities*, London, Verso, 2006.

Appadurai, Arjun, *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*, Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1996.

Appadurai, Arjun, and Carol Breckenridge, 'On Moving Targets', *Public Culture*, vol 2, no 1, 1989, pp i-iv.

Ash, Marinell, *The Strange Death of Scottish History*, Edinburgh, The Ramsay Head Press, 1980.

Ashmead John, and John Davison, *The Songs of Robert Burns*, New York, Garland, 1998.

Atkinson, David, *English Folksong Bibliography*, 3rd edition, http:www.efdss.org/songbib3.pdf.

Atkinson, David, 'History, Meaning, and Symbol in 'The Cruel Mother' ', *Folk Music Journal*, vol 6, no 3, 1992, pp 359-380.

Atkinson, David, *The English Traditional Ballad: Theory, Method, and Practice*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2002.

Atkinson, David, 'Folk Songs in Print: Text and Tradition', *Folk Music Journal*, vol 8, no 4, 2004 (a), pp 456-484.

Atkinson, David, 'Revival: Genuine or Spurious?', in Ian Russell and David Atkinson, eds, *Folk Song: Tradition, Revival and Re-creation*, Aberdeen, Elphinstone Institute, Aberdeen University, 2004 (b).

Babcock, Barbara, 'The Story in the Story: Metanarration in Folk Narrative', in Richard Bauman, ed, *Verbal Art as Performance*, Rowley, Long Grove, Waveland Press, 1984.

Baddeley, Jenna, and Jefferson A Singer, 'Charting the Life Story's Path: Narrative Identity across the Life Span', in D Jean Clandinin, ed, *Handbook of Narrative Inquiry: Mapping a Methodology*, California, Sage Publications, 2007.

Baker, Darrell, and Larry F Kiner, *The Sir Harry Lauder Discography*, Metuchen, New Jersey, The Scarecrow Press, 1990.

Baily, John, 'The Role of Music in the Creation of an Afghan National Identity, 1923-73', in Martin Stokes, ed, *Ethnicity, Identity and Music: The Musical Construction of Place*, Oxford, Berg Publishers, 1997.

Bain, Irene, 'Post-war Scottish Immigration', in James Jupp, ed, *The Australian People: An Encyclopedia of the Nation, Its People and Their Origins,* Cambridge, University of Cambridge Press, (1988), 2001.

Barth, Frederik, 'Ethnic Groups and Boundaries', in Frederik Barth, *Process and Form in Social Life: Selected Essays of Fredrik Barth*, vol 1, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1981.

Basu, Paul, 'Hunting Down Home: Reflections on Homeland and the Search for Identity in the Scottish Diaspora', in B Barbara and M Winer, eds, *Contested Landscapes: Movement, Exile, and Place*, Oxford, Berg Publishers, 2001.

Basu, Paul, *Highland Homecomings: Genealogy and Heritage Tourism in the Scottish Diaspora*, London, Routledge, 2006.

Bauman, Richard, 'Differential Identity and the Social Base of Folklore', in Americo Paredes and Richard Bauman, eds, *Toward New Perspectives in Folklore*, Austin, University of Texas Press, 1972.

Bauman, Richard, ed, *Verbal Art as Performance*, Long Grove, Waveland Press, 1984.

Bauman, Richard, *Story, Performance, and Event: Contextual Studies of Oral Narratives*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1986.

Bauman, Richard, and Charles L Briggs, 'Poetics and Performance as Critical Perspectives on Language and Social Life', *Annual Review of Anthropology*, vol 19, 1990, pp 59-88.

Beaton, Leigh Sandra, *Westralian Scots: Scottish Settlement and Identity in Western Australia, Arrivals 1829-1850*, PhD Thesis, Murdoch University, 2004.

Behar, Ruth, *The Vulnerable Observer: Anthropology That Breaks Your Heart*, Boston, Beacon Press, 1996.

Bell, Duncan S A, 'Mythscapes: Memory, Mythology, and National Identity', *British Journal of Sociology*, vol 54, no 1, March 2003, pp. 63-81.

Benmayor, Rina, and Andor Skotnes, 'Some Reflections on Migration and Identity', in Rina Benmayor and Andor Skotnes, eds, *Migration and Identity*, International Yearbook of Oral History and Life Stories, vol 3, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1994.

Bennett, Andrew, 'Bhangra in Newcastle: Music, Ethnic Identity and the Role of Local Knowledge', *Innovation*, vol 10, 1997, pp 107-116.

Berger, Harris M, and Giovanna P Del Negro, *Identity and Everyday Life: Essays in the Study of Folklore, Music, and Popular Culture*, Middletown, Wesleyan University Press, 2004.

Berman, Marshall, *All that Is Solid Melts into Air: The Experience of Modernity*, New. York, Simon and Schuster, 1982.

Beveridge, Craig, and Ronald Turnbull, *The Eclipse of Scottish Culture: Inferiorism and the Intellectuals*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 1989.

Bhabha, Homi, 'Introduction', in Homi Bhabha, ed, *Nation and Narration*, London, Routledge, 1990,

Biddle, Ian, and Vanessa Knights, eds, *Music, National Identity and the Politics of Location*, London, Ashgate, 2007.

Billig, Michael, *Banal Nationalism*, London, Sage Publications, 1995.

Blacking, John, *How Musical is Man?*, London, Faber and Faber, 1976.

Blacking, John, 'The Concept of Identity and Folk Concepts of Self: A Venda Case Study', in Anita Jacobson-Widding, ed, *Identity: Personal and Socio-Cultural*, Uppsala, Uppsala University, 1983.

Bodleian Library Catalogue of Ballads, University of Oxford, http://www.bodley.ox.ac.uk/ballads.

Bohanek, Jennifer G, Kelly A Marin, Robyn Fivush, and Marshall P Duke, 'Family Narrative Interaction and Children's Self-Understanding', The Emory Center for Myth and Ritual in American Life, Working Paper no 34, 2004.

Boulton, Harry, and Annie MacLeod, eds, *Songs of the North: gathered together from the Highlands and Lowlands of Scotland*, London, J B Cramer, 1884.

Boyes, Georgina, *The Imagined Village: Culture, Ideology and the English Folk Revival*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1994.

Brackett, David, '(In search of) Musical Meaning: Genres, Categories and Crossover', in David Hesmondhalgh and Keith Negus, eds, *Popular Music Studies*, London, Arnold Publishers, 2002.

Brah, Atvar, *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*, London and New York, Routledge, 1996.

Brettell, Caroline, *Anthropology and Migration: Essays on Transnationalism, Ethnicity, and Identity*, Oxford, AltaMira Press, 2003.

Brettell, Caroline, 'Theorizing Migration in Anthropology', in Caroline Brettell and James F Hollifield, eds, *Migration Theory: Talking Across Disciplines*, New York, Routledge, 2008.

Brettell, Caroline, and James F Hollifield, eds, *Migration Theory: Talking across Disciplines*, New York, Routledge, 2008.

Brewer, E C, *The Wordsworth Dictionary of Phrase and Fable*, Wordsworth Editions Ltd, 2001.

British Library Integrated Catalogue, http://catalogue.bl.uk.

Brown, Mary Ellen, *Burns and Tradition*, London, Macmillan, 1984.

Bruner, Jerome, 'Life as Narrative', *Social Research*, vol 54, no 1, 1987, pp 11-32.

Bruner, Jerome, and Carol Fleisher Feldman, 'Group Narrative as a Cultural Context of Autobiography', in David Rubin, ed, *Remembering Our Past: Studies in Autobiographical Memory*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1996.

Buchan, David, *The Ballad and the Folk*, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1972.

Bueltmann, Tanya, ' 'Where the Measureless Ocean between us will Roar': Scottish Emigration to New Zealand, Personal Correspondence and Epistolary Practices, c 1850-1920', *Immigrants and Minorities*, vol 26, no 3, 2008, pp 242-265.

Burns, Robert, *Poems: Chiefly in the Scottish Dialect*, (1786), The Luath Kilmarnock Edition, Edinburgh, Luath Press, 2009.

Butler, Judith, *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of 'Sex'*, New York, Routledge, 1993.

Butler, Judith, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*, New York, Routledge, 1999.

Butler, Marilyn, 'Burns and Politics', in Robert Crawford, ed, *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, Iowa, University of Iowa Press, 1997.

Cameron, Ian, *The Jimmy Shand Story: The King of Scottish Dance Music*, Edinburgh, Scottish Cultural Press, 1998.

Campbell, Ian, *Kailyard: A New Assessment*, Edinburgh, Ramsay Head Press, 1981.

Castles, Stephen, and Alastair Davidson, *Citizenship and Migration: Globalization and the Politics of Belonging*, New York, Routledge, 2000.

Centre for Political Song, Glasgow Caledonian University, http://www.gcal.ac.uk/politicalsong.

Chamberlain, Mary, and Selma Leydesdorff, 'Transnational Families: Memories and Narratives', *Global Networks*, vol 4, no 3, 2004, pp 227-241.

Chambers, Robert, ed, *Popular Rhymes, Fireside Stories, and Amusements of Scotland*, Edinburgh, William and Robert Chambers, 1842.

Chambers, Robert, ed, *The Songs of Scotland Prior to Burns*, Edinburgh and London, W and R Chambers, (1862), Elibron Classics Replica Edition, 2006.

Chapman, Malcolm, *The Gaelic Vision of Scottish Culture*, London, Croom Helm, 1978.

Chapman, Malcolm, *The Celts: The Construction of a Myth*, London, Macmillan, 1992.

Chapman, Malcolm 'Thoughts on Celtic Music', in Martin Stokes, ed, *Ethnicity, Identity and Music: The Musical Construction of Place*, Oxford, Berg Publishers, 1997.

Child, Francis James, *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, vols 1-5, (1882-1898), New York, Dover Publications, 2003.

Clandinin, D Jean, ed, *Handbook of Narrative Inquiry: Mapping a Methodology*, California, Sage Publications, 2007.

Clark, Helen, and Elizabeth Carnegie, *She Was Aye Workin': Memories of Tenement Women in Edinburgh and Glasgow*, Dorset, White Cockade Publishing, 2003.

Clayton, Martin, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton, eds, *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, New York, Routledge, 2003.

Clifford, James, 'Diasporas', *Cultural Anthropology*, vol 9, no 3, Further Inflections: Toward Ethnographies of the Future, August 1994, pp 302-338.

Cohen, Abner, *Two-dimensional Man*, Berkeley, University of California Press, 1974.

Cohen, A P, *The Symbolic Construction of Community*, London, Routledge, 1985.

Cohen, A P, 'Culture as Identity: An Anthropologist's View', *New Literary History*, vol 24, no 1, Culture and Everyday Life, Winter 1993, pp 195-209.

Cohen, A P, 'Personal Nationalism: A Scottish View of Some Rites, Rights, and Wrongs', *American Ethnologist*, vol 23, no 4, 1996, pp 802-815.

Cohen, A P, 'Peripheral Vision: Nationalism, National Identity and the Objective Correlative in Scotland', in A P Cohen, ed, *Signifying Identities*, London, Routledge, 2000.

Cohen, Sara, and Jan Fairley, 'Introduction', *Popular Music*, vol 19, no 1, Place Issue, January 2000, pp i-ii.

Collinson, Francis, *The Traditional and National Music of Scotland*, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1966.

Connell, John, and Chris Gibson, *Soundtracks: Popular Music, Identity and Place*, London, Routledge, 2004.

Constantine, Mary-Ann, and Gerald Porter, *Fragments and Meaning in Traditional Song: From the Blues to the Baltic*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2003.

Constantine, Stephen, 'British Emigration to the Empire-Commonwealth since 1980: From Overseas Settlement to Diaspora?', in Carl Bridge and Kent Fedorowich, eds, *The British World: Diaspora, Culture and Identity*, London, Routledge, 2003.

Conzen, Kathleen Neils, 'Mainstreams and Side Channels: The Localization of Immigrant Culture', *Journal of American Ethnic History*, vol 2, no 1, 1991, pp 5-20.

Conzen, Kathleen Neils, 'The Invention of Ethnicity', *Journal of American Ethnic History*, vol 12, no 1, 1992, pp 3-41.

Cooke, Anthony, Ian Donnachie, Ann MacSween, and Christopher A Whatley, eds, *The Transformation of Scotland, 1707-1850*: *Modern Scottish History, 1707 to the Present*, vol 1, Scotland, Tuckwell Press, 2001.

Cowan, Susan, 'Contributing Caledonian Culture: A Legacy of the Scottish Diaspora (Beyond the Canon)', *Journal of Australian Studies*, issue 76, January 2003, pp 87-95.

Cox, Gordon, 'Towards the National Song Book: The History of an Idea', *British Journal of Music Education*, vol 9, no 3, 1992, pp 239-253.

Crawford, Robert, 'Introduction', in Robert Crawford, ed, *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, Iowa, University of Iowa Press, 1997.

Crawford, Robert, *The Bard: Robert Burns, A Biography*, Princeton and Oxford, Princeton University Press, 2009.

Crawford, Thomas, *Society and the Lyric: A Study of the Song Culture of Eighteenth Century Scotland*, Edinburgh, Scottish Academic Press, 1979.

Cunningham, Allan, ed, *The Complete Works of Robert Burns: Containing his Poems, Songs, and Correspondence*, Boston, Phillips, Sampson and Company, New York, J C Derby, 1885.

Darian-Smith, Kate, and June Factor, eds, *Child's Play: Dorothy Howard and the Folklore of Australian Children*, Melbourne, Museum Victoria, 2005.

Dave Willis (1895-1973), University of Glasgow Library, Special Collections, http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/sta/collections/willis.html.

Davis, Leith, 'Gender and the Nation in the Work of Robert Burns and Janet Little', *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900*, vol 38, no 4, 1998, pp 621-645.

Davis, Leith, 'Gender, Genre and the Imagining of the Scottish Nation: The Songs of Lady Nairne', in Stephen Behrendt and Nancy Kushigian, eds, *Scottish Women Poets of the Romantic Period*, Alexander Street Press, 2002, http://www.alexanderst.com/products/swrp.htm.

Davis, Leith, 'At 'Sang About': Scottish Song and the Challenge to British Culture', in Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen, eds, *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Davis, Leith, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen, 'Introduction', in Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen, eds, *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2004.

DeNora, Tia, *Music in Everyday Life*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2000.

Denzin, Norman, 'Cowboys and Indians', *Symbolic Interaction*, vol 25, no 2, 2002, pp 251-261.

Denzin, Norman, and Yvonna Lincoln, eds, *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 3rd edition, Thousand Oaks, Sage Publications, 2005.

Devine, T M, ed, *Scottish Emigration and Scottish Society*, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1992.

Devine, T M, *The Scottish Nation*, New York, Penguin Books, 1999.

Devine, T M, ed, *Being Scottish: Personal Reflections on Scottish Identity Today*, Edinburgh, Polygon, 2002.

Devine, T M, *Scotland's Empire: 1600-1815*, London, Allen Lane, Penguin, 2003.

Devine, T M, and R J Finlay, *Scotland in the Twentieth Century*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1996.

Digital Tradition, http://www.mudcat.org.

Donaldson, William, 'Bonnie Highland Laddie: The Making of a Myth', *Scottish Literary Journal*, vol 3, issue 20, 1976, pp 30-50.

Donaldson, William, *Popular Literature in Victorian Scotland*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1986.

Donaldson, William, *The Jacobite Song: Political Myth and National Identity*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1988.

Douglas, Norman, *London Street Games*, London, Chatto and Windus, 1931.

Dugaw, Dianne, *Warrior Women and Popular Balladry*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1996.

Duke, Marshall P, Robyn Fivush, Amber Lazarus, and Jennifer Bohanek, 'Of Ketchup and Kin: Dinnertime Conversations as a Major Source of Family Knowledge, Family Adjustment, and Family Resilience', The Emory Center for Myth and Ritual in American Life, Working Paper no 26, May 2003.

Early American Secular Music and Its European Sources, 1589-1839: An Index, The Colonial Music Institute, http://www.colonialmusic.org.

Edensor, Tim, *National Identity, Popular Culture and Everyday Life*, Oxford, Berg Publishers, 2002.

Ellis, Carolyn, and Arthur P Bochner, 'Autoethnography, Personal Narrative and Reflexivity', in Norman Denzin and Yvonna Lincoln, eds, *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, Thousand Oaks, Sage Publications, 2000.

Ellis, Carolyn, and Arthur P Bochner, 'Analyzing Analytic Autoethnography: An Autopsy, *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, vol 35, no 4, 2006, pp 429-449.

Engle, David G, James Porter, and Roger de V Renwick, 'The Contribution of D K Wilgus to Ballad and Folksong Scholarship', in Thomas A McKean, ed, *The Flowering Thorn: International Ballad Studies*, Utah, Utah State University Press, 2003.

English Broadside Ballad Archive, University of California-Santa Barbara, http://english.ucsb.edu.

Faley, Jean, *Up Oor Close: Memories of Domestic Life in Glasgow Tenements 1910-1945*, Dorset, White Cockade Publishing, 2003.

Feder, Stuart, 'The Nostalgia of Charles Ives: An Essay in Affects and Music', *The Annual of Psychoanalysis*, vol 10, 1982.

Ferguson, William, *Scotland 1689 to the Present*, Edinburgh, Oliver and Boyd, 1968.

Fielding, Penny, 'Burns's Topographies', in Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen, eds, *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Finlay, Richard, *Modern Scotland 1914-2000*, London, Profile Books, 2004.

Finnegan, Ruth, *The Hidden Musicians: Music-Making in an English Town*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Finnegan, Ruth, 'Music, Experience, and the Anthropology of Emotion', in Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton, eds, *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, New York, Routledge, 2003.

Fivush, Robyn, and Catherine A Haden, *Autobiographical Memory and the Construction of a Narrative Self: Developmental and Cultural Perspectives*, New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2003.

Fleming, Mary, *Clarsach, Cramasie and Crowdie: A Social History of Scottish Song*, Montrose, Bonspiel Books, 1995.

Floyd, Samuel A, *The Power of Black Music: Interpreting its History from Africa to the United States*, New York, Oxford University Press, 1995.

Foley, John Miles, *Immanent Art: From Structure to Meaning in Traditional Oral Epic*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1991.

Folktrax, http://folktrax-archive.org/index.htm.

Foner, Nancy, 'The Immigrant Family: Cultural Legacies and Cultural Changes', *International Migration Review*, vol 31, no 4, 1997 (a), pp 961-974.

Foner, Nancy, 'What's New About Transnationalism? New York Immigrants Today and at the Turn of the Century', *Diaspora*, no 6, 1997 (b), pp 355-376.

Forbes, Ruth, 'A Study in Music, Community and Identity in a late nineteenth-century Scottish Town', *Journal of Victorian Culture*, vol 11, no 2, 2006, pp 256-280.

Fortier, Anne-Marie, *Migrant Belongings: Memory, Space, Identity*, Oxford, Berg Publishers, 2000.

Fox, Adam, and Daniel Woolf, eds, *The Spoken Word: Oral Culture in Britain 1500-1850*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2002.

Fraser, W Hamish, and R J Morris, eds, *People and Society in Scotland, 1830-1914*: *People and Society in Scotland*, vol 2, Edinburgh, John Donald, 1990.

Frith, Simon, 'Music and Identity', in Stuart Hall and P DuGay, eds, *Questions of Cultural Identity*, London, Sage Publications, 1996.

Fyffe, Will, *I Belong to Glasgow*, Sheet Music, Sydney, J Albert and Son, 1921.

Gammon, Vic, ' 'Not Appreciated in Worthing?' Class Expression and Popular Song Texts in mid-nineteenth-century Britain', *Popular Music*, vol 4, 1984, pp 5-24.

Ganguly, Keya, 'Migrant Identities: Personal Memory and the Construction of Selfhood', *Cultural Studies*, vol 6, 1992, pp 27-50.

Gans, H J, 'Symbolic Ethnicity: The Future of Ethnic Groups and Cultures in America', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol 2, no 1, 1979, pp 1-20.

Geertz, Clifford, 'Thick Description: Toward an Interpretive Theory of Culture', in Clifford Geertz, *The Interpretation of Cultures, Selected Essays*, New York, Basic Books, 1973.

Gellner, Ernest, *Thought and Change*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1964.

Gilchrist, Annie G, 'Note on the 'Lady Drest in Green' and Other Fragments of Tragic Ballads and Folk-Tales Preserved amongst Children', *Journal of the Folk Song Society*, vol 6, 1919, pp 80-90.

Gillis, John R, *A World of Their Own Making: Myth, Ritual, and the Quest for Family Values*, New York, Basic Books, 1996.

Gilroy, Paul, 'Sounds Authentic: Black Music, Ethnicity, and the Challenge of a 'Changing' Same', *Black Music Research Journal*, vol 11, no. 2, Autumn 1991, pp 111-136.

Gilroy, Paul, *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*, Cambridge Massachusetts, Harvard University Press, 1993.

Glasgow Broadside Ballads, University of Glasgow,
http://www.gla.ac.uk/t4/dumfries/files/layer2/glasgow_broadside_ballads.

Glen, John, *Early Scottish Melodies*, Edinburgh, J and R Glen, 1900.

Goldie, David, ' 'Will ye stop yer tickling, Jock?': Modern and Postmodern Scottish
Comedy', *Critical Quarterly*, vol 42, no 4, 2000, pp 7-18.

Goldie, David, 'Hugh MacDiarmid, Harry Lauder and Scottish Popular Culture',
International Journal of Scottish Literature, Issue 1, 2006, pp 1-26.

Gomme, Alice Bertha, *The Traditional Games of England, Scotland and Ireland*, vols 1-
2, (1894-1898), New York, Dover Publications, 1964.

Good, Graham, *The Observing Self: Rediscovering the Essay*, London, Routledge Kegan
and Paul, 1988.

Grasmuck, Sherri, and Patricia R Pessar, *Between Two Worlds: Dominican International
Migration*, Berkeley, University of California Press, 1991.

Gregory, David, 'Forgotten Folklorist: Charlotte Burne and Shropshire Song', *British
Columbia Folklore*, Issue 18, October, 2003, pp 4-13.

Greig, John, ed, *The Scots Minstrelsie: A National Monument of Scottish Song*,
Edinburgh, T C and E C Jack, 1892-1895.

Gupta, Akhil, and James Ferguson, 'Beyond 'Culture': Space, Identity, and the Politics
of Difference', *Cultural Anthropology*, vol 7, no 1, 1992, pp 6-23.

Hague, Euan, 'The Scottish Diaspora: Tartan Day and the Appropriation of Scottish Identities in the United States', in D C Harvey, R Jones, N McInroy, and C Milligan, eds, *Celtic Geographies: Old Culture, New Times*, London, Routledge, 2002 (a).

Hague, Euan, 'National Tartan Day: Rewriting History in the United States', *Scottish Affairs*, Issue 38, 2002 (b), pp 94-124.

Halbwachs, Maurice, *On Collective Memory*, edited and translated by Lewis A Coser, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1992.

Hall, Stewart, 'Cultural Identity and Diaspora', in Jonathan Rutherford, ed, *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*, London, Lawrence and Wishart, 1990.

Hall, Stuart, 'Who Needs Identity', in Stuart Hall and P DuGay, eds, *Questions of Cultural Identity*, London, Sage Publications, 1996.

Halliwell, James, *The Nursery Rhymes of England*, London, John Russell Smith, 1846.

Hamilton-Barwick, Carole, 'A Ballot Cast for Orestes: Women's Stories of Migration from Postwar Britain', *Journal of the Oral History Association of Australia*, no 23, 2001, pp 47-53.

Hammerton, A James, 'The Quest for Family and The Mobility of Modernity in Narratives of Postwar British Emigration', *Global Networks*, vol 4, no 3, 2004, pp 271-284.

Hammerton, A James, 'A Postwar British Diaspora? Late 20th Century British Emigrants and the Mobility of Modernity', unpublished paper presented at the 'British World' conference in Auckland, New Zealand, 2005.

Hammerton, A James, ' 'We're Not Poms': The Shifting Identities of Post-war Scottish Migrants to Australia', in Angela McCarthy, ed, *A Global Clan: Scottish Migrant Networks and Identities Since the Eighteenth Century*, London, New York, Tauris Academic Studies, 2006 (a).

Hammerton, A James, 'Postwar British Emigrants and the 'Transnational Moment': Exemplars of a 'Mobility of Modernity'?', in Ann Curthoys and Marilyn Lake, eds, *Connected Worlds: History in Transnational Perspective*, ANU E Press, 2006 (b).

Hammerton, A James, and Alistair Thomson, *Ten Pound Poms: Australia's Invisible Migrants*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2005.

Hammerton, A James, and Catharine Coleborne, 'Ten-Pound Poms Revisited: Battlers' Tales and British Migration to Australia, 1947-1971', *Journal of Australian Studies*, vol 25, no 68, Scatterlings of Empire, Winter 2001, pp 86-96.

Harding, Sandra G, ed, *Feminism and Methodology: Social Science Issues*, Bloomington and Indianapolis, Indiana University Press, 1987.

Hardy, J, ed, *Stories of Australian Migration,* Kensington, New South Wales University Press, 1988.

Harker, Dave, *Fakesong: The Manufacture of British 'Folksong', 1700 to the Present Day*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press, 1985.

Harper, Marjory, *Adventurers and Exiles: The Great Scottish Exodus*, London, Profile Books, 2004.

Harvie, Christopher, 'The Devolution of the Intellectuals', in L Paterson, ed, *A Diverse Assembly: The Debate on a Scottish Parliament*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1988 (a).

Harvie, Christopher, 'Industry, Religion and the State of Scotland', in Douglas Gifford, ed, *The History of Scottish Literature: The Nineteenth Century*, vol 3, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1988 (b).

Hearn, Jonathan, 'Narrative, Agency, and Mood: On the Social Construction of National History in Scotland', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, vol 44, 2002, pp 745-769.

Hearn, Jonathan, 'National Identity: Banal, Personal and Embedded', *Nations and Nationalism*, vol 13, no 4, 2007, pp 657–674.

Henkes, Barbara, and Richard Johnson, 'Silences across Disciplines: Folklore Studies, Cultural Studies, and History', *Journal of Folklore Research*, vol 39, nos 2-3, May-December, 2002, pp 125-146.

Herd, David, ed, *Ancient and Modern Scottish Songs, Heroic Ballads etc*, vols 1 and 2, (1776), Edinburgh, Scottish Academic Press, 1973.

Herman, Arthur, *How the Scots Invented the Modern World*, New York, Three Rivers Press, 2001.

Hesmondhalgh, David, 'Popular Music Audiences and Everyday Life', in David Hesmondhalgh and Keith Negus, eds, *Popular Music Studies*, London, Arnold Publishers, 2002.

Hesmondhalgh, David, and Keith Negus, eds, *Popular Music Studies*, London, Arnold Publishers, 2002.

Hewitson, Jim, *Far Off in Sunlit Places: Stories of the Scots in Australia and New Zealand*, Melbourne, Melbourne University Press, 1998.

Hirschman, Charles, Philip Kasinitz, and Josh DeWind, eds, *The Handbook of International Migration: The American Experience*, New York, Russell Sage Foundation, 1999.

Hobsbawm, Eric, 'Introduction: Inventing Traditions', in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, eds, *The Invention of Tradition*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, (1983), 2000.

Houston, R A, and W W J Knox, eds, *The New Penguin History of Scotland*, London, Allen Lane, Penguin Press, 2001.

Hutcheon, Linda, *A Theory of Parody: The Teachings of Twentieth-Century Art Forms*, Urbana and Chicago, University of Illinois Press, 2000.

Jacksonn-Houlston, Caroline, *Ballads, Songs and Snatches: The Appropriation of Folk Song and Popular Culture in Nineteenth Century Prose*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 1999.

James, Deborah, *Songs of the Women Migrants*: *Performance and Identity in South Africa*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2000.

James Madison Carpenter Collection Online Catalogue, http://www.hrionline.ac.uk/carpenter.

John Joy Bell, *The Glasgow Story*, http://www.theglasgowstory.com/image.php?inum=TGSA05219.

Johnson, David, *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, Edinburgh, Mercat Press, 2003.

Johnson, James, and Robert Burns, eds, *The Scots Musical Museum*, *1787-1803*, vols 1-6, facsimile reprint of 1853 edition in two volumes, Aldershot, Scolar Press, 1991.

Johnston, Craig, 'A Drunk Man Looks at the Waratah: Scottish-Australian Identity and its Representations since 1945', *Australian Studies*, vol 1, no 10, 1996, pp 102-118.

Jones, Miriam, *The Cruel Mother and Mary Hamilton: From Sin to Crime in the Folkloric Ballad*, paper presented at 26th International Ballad Conference, University of Wales, July 1996.

Jupp, James, ed, *The Australian People: An Encyclopedia of the Nation, Its People and Their Origins*, Cambridge, University of Cambridge Press, (1988), 2001.

Kennedy-Fraser, Marjory, *Lowland Scots Song: Its Interpretation*, Glasgow, Paterson, 1922.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara, 'The Future of Folklore Studies in America: The Urban Frontier', *Folklore Forum*, vol 16, no 2, 1983, pp 175-234.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara, 'Spaces of Dispersal', *Cultural Anthropology*, vol 9, no 3, Further Inflections: Toward Ethnographies of the Future, August 1994, pp 339-344.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 'Folklore's Crisis', *Journal of American Folklore*, vol 111, no 441, Folklore: What's in a Name?, Summer 1998, pp 281-372.

Knowles, Thomas D, *Ideology, Art and Commerce: Aspects of Literary Sociology in the Late Victorian Scottish Kailyard*, Gothenburg, Gothenburg Studies in English, 1983.

Kuntz, Andrew, *The Fiddler's Companion: A Descriptive Index of North American, British Isles and Irish Music for the Folk Violin and other Instruments*, http://www.ibiblio.org/fiddlers/index.html.

Lamb, Sarah, 'Being a Widow and Other Life Stories: The Interplay between Lives and Words', *Anthropology and Humanism*, vol 26, no 1, 2001, pp 16-34.

Langellier, Kristin M, and Eric E Peterson, 'Narrative Performance Theory: Telling Stories, Doing Family', in Dawn O Braithwaite and Leslie A Baxter, eds, *Engaging Theories in Family Communication: Multiple Perspectives*, California, Sage Publications, 2005.

Langellier, Kristin M, and Eric E Peterson, 'Family Storytelling as Communication Practice', in Lynn H Turner and Richard L West, eds, *The Family Communication Sourcebook: A Reference for Theory and Research*, California, Sage Publications, 2006.

Lasch, Christopher, 'Mass Culture Reconsidered', *Democracy*, vol 1, no 4, October 1981, pp 7-22.

Lauder, Harry, *Francis and Day's 3rd Album of Harry Lauder's Popular Songs*, Sheet Music, Francis and Day, London, 1912.

Lauder-Frost, Gregory, 'Biographical Notes on Sir Harry Lauder', *Electric Scotland* website, http://www.electricscotland.com/webclans/htol/lauder3.htm.

Layder, Derek, *Understanding Social Theory*, 2nd edition, London, Sage Publications, 2006.

Lentricchia, Frank, *Criticism and Social Change*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1983.

Levitt, Peggy, and Nina Glick Schiller, 'Conceptualizing Simultaneity: A Transnational Social Field Perspective on Society', *International Migration Review*, vol 38, no 3, 2004, pp 1002-1039.

Leyshon, Andrew, David Matless, and George Revill, eds, *The Place of Music*, New York, Guilford Press, 1998.

Liverani, Mary Rose, *The Winter Sparrows: Growing Up in Scotland and Australia*, London, Joseph, 1976.

Lonsdale, Roger, ed, *The New Oxford Book of Eighteenth Century Verse*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2003.

Low, Donald, 'Introduction', in James Johnson and Robert Burns, eds, *The Scots Musical Museum*, *1787-1803*, vols 1-6, facsimile reprint of 1853 edition in two volumes, Aldershot, Scolar Press, 1991.

Low, Donald, *The Songs of Robert Burns*, London, Routledge, 1993.

Lucas, David, 'Scottish Immigration 1861-1945', in James Jupp, ed, *The Australian People: An Encyclopedia of the Nation, Its People and Their Origins*, Cambridge, University of Cambridge Press, (1988), 2001.

Lyle, Emily, ed, *Scottish Oral Tradition in Australia: The Emily Lyle Collection*, Sound Recording, 1976, National Library of Australia.

Lyle, Emily, ed, *Scottish Ballads*, Edinburgh, Canongate Classics, 1997.

Lyle, Emily, Kaye McAlpine, and Anne Dhu McLucas, eds, *The Song Repertoire of Amelia and Jane Harris*, Edinburgh, The Scottish Text Society, 2002.

Lyman, Stanford M, and William A Douglass, 'Ethnicity: Strategies of Collective and Individual Impression Management', *Social Research*, vol 40, 1973, pp 344-365.

MacFarlane, Sandy, *Granny's Highland Hame*, Sheet Music, Sydney, Nicholson's, 1928.

Maclean, Fitzroy, *Scotland: A Concise History*, London, Thames and Hudson, 2002.

MacLeod, Kenneth, *The Road to the Isles: Poetry, Lore, and Tradition of the Hebrides*, Edinburgh, Grant and Murray, 1927.

Maloney, Paul, *Scotland and the Music Hall*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2003.

Margolis, Maxine, 'Transnationalism and Popular Culture: The Case of Brazilian Immigrants in the United States', *Journal of Popular Culture*, vol 29, 1995, pp 29-41.

Martin, Peter, Gunhild O Hagestad, and Patricia Diedrick, 'Family Stories: Events (Temporarily) Remembered', *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, vol 50, no 2, 1988, pp 533-541.

Martin-Barbero, Jesus, *Communication, Culture and Hegemony*, London, Sage, 1993.

McArthur, Colin, 'Breaking the Signs: Scotch Myths as Cultural Struggle', *Cencrastus*, no 7, 1981, pp 21-25.

McArthur, Colin, *Scotch Reels: Scotland in Cinema and Television*, London, BFI Publishing, 1982.

McCarthy, Angela, 'Personal Accounts of Leaving Scotland, 1921-1954', *The Scottish Historical Review*, vol 83, issue 2, no 216, October 2004, pp 196-215.

McCarthy, Angela, 'Scottish National Identities among Inter-war Migrants in North America and Australasia', *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, vol 34, no 2, June 2006 (a), pp 201-222.

McCarthy, Angela, 'Introduction: Personal Testimonies and Scottish Migration', in Angela McCarthy, ed, *A Global Clan: Scottish Migrant Networks and Identities since the Eighteenth Century*, London, Tauris Academic Studies, 2006 (b).

McCarthy, Angela, 'Ethnic Networks and Identities Among Inter-war Scottish Migrants in North America', in Angela McCarthy, ed, *A Global Clan: Scottish Migrant Networks and Identities since the Eighteenth Century*, Tauris Academic Studies, London, 2006 (c).

McCarthy, Angela, ' 'The only place worth thinking about': Personal Testimony and Irish and Scottish Migrants in Australasia, 1921-61', *Social History*, vol 33, no 3, August 2008, pp 317-335.

McCrone, David. *Scotland-the Brand and The Making of Scottish Heritage.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995.

McCrone, David, *Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a Nation,* London, Routledge, 2001.

McCue, Kirsteen, 'Burns, Women, and Song', in Robert Crawford, ed, *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, Iowa, University of Iowa Press, 1997.

McCulloch, Margery Palmer, 'Women, Poetry and Song in Eighteenth-century Lowland Scotland', *Women's Writing*, vol 10, no 3, 2003, pp 453-468.

McGuirk, Carol, ed, *Robert Burns: Selected Poems*, London, Penguin Books, 1993.

McGuirk, Carol, 'Haunted by Authority: Nineteenth-century American Constructions of Robert Burns and Scotland', in Robert Crawford, ed, *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, Iowa, University of Iowa Press, 1997.

McGuirk, Carol, 'Jacobite History to National Song: Robert Burns and Carolina Oliphant (Baroness Nairne)', *The Eighteenth Century*, vol 47, no 2, 2006, pp 253-287.

McKean, Thomas A, ed, *The Flowering Thorn: International Ballad Studies*, Utah, Utah State University Press, 2003 (a).

McKean, Thomas A, 'Introduction', in Thomas A McKean, ed, *The Flowering Thorn: International Ballad Studies*, Utah, Utah State University Press, 2003 (b).

McMahon, Felicia R, and Brian Sutton-Smith, 'The past in the Present: Theoretical Directions for Children's Folklore', in Brian Sutton-Smith, Jay Mechling, Thomas W Johnson, and Felicia R McMahon, eds, *Children's Folklore*, Utah, Utah State University Press, 1999.

McVicar, Ewan, *Doh Ray Me, When Ah Wis Wee*, Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2007.

Middleton, Richard, 'Articulating Musical Meaning/Re-Constructing Musical History/Locating the 'Popular' ', *Popular Music*, vol 5, Continuity and Change, 1985, pp 5-43.

Middleton, Richard, 'Introduction', in Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton, eds, *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, New York, Routledge, 2003.

Middleton, Richard, *Voicing the Popular*, New York, Routledge, 2006.

Miller, Edward K, *An Ethnography of Singing: The Use and Meaning of Song within a Scottish Family*, PhD Thesis, University of Texas at Austin, 1981.

Moffat, Alfred, *Fifty Traditional Scottish Nursery Rhymes: Being a Collection of Fifty Scottish Nursery Rhymes, Ballads, and Songs with their Traditional Tunes*, London, Augener, 1933.

Montgomerie, William, ed, *Sandy Candy and other Scottish Nursery Rhymes*, London, Hogarth press, 1948.

Munro, Ailie, *The Democratic Muse: Folk Music Revival in Scotland*, Aberdeen, Scottish Cultural Press, 1996.

Murdoch, J, *A Guide to the Highlands of Speyside*, Forres, 1825.

Musical Traditions Internet Magazine, http://www.mustrad.org.uk.

Myatt, Bill Dean, 'Beltona Records and their Role in Recording Scottish Music', *Musical Traditions Internet Magazine*, 16 January, 2004, http://www.mustrad.org.uk/articles/beltona.htm.

Nairn, Tom, *After Britain*, London, Granta Books, 2000.

Nairn, Tom, *The Break-up of Britain*: *Crisis and Neo-nationalism*, London, Common Ground, (1977), 2003.

Nairne, Carolina Oliphant, *Songs of Baroness Nairne*, Otto Schulze and Company, Edinburgh, 1902.

Nash, Andrew, 'The Cotter's Kailyard', in Robert Crawford, ed, *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, Iowa, University of Iowa Press, 1997.

Nelson-Burns, Lesley, *Folk Music of England, Scotland, Ireland, Wales and America*, http://www.contemplator.com.

Newman, Steve, 'The Scots Songs of Allan Ramsay: 'Lyrick' Transformation, Popular Culture, and the Boundaries of the Scottish Enlightenment', *Modern Language Quarterly*, vol 63, no 3, 2002, pp 277-314.

Nora, Pierre, 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Memoire', *Representations*, vol 26, 1989, pp7-24.

North East Folk Archive, Aberdeenshire Council, http://www.nefa.net.

Northern Folk, Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, http://www.abdn.ac.uk/elphinstone/northernfolk.htm.

Nott, James, *Music for the People: Popular Music and Dance in Interwar Britain*, Oxford, Oxford Historical Monographs, 2002.

Oakley, C A, *The Second City*, London and Glasgow, Blackie and Son, 1946.

Ochs, Elinor, and Lisa Capps, 'Narrating the Self', *Annual Review of Anthropology*, vol 25, 1996, pp 19-43.

O'Connor, Patricia, *The Multiple Experiences of Migrancy, Irishness and Home among Contemporary Irish Immigrants in Melbourne, Australia*, PhD Thesis, University of New South Wales, 2005.

Olson, Bruce, *Roots of Folk: Old English, Scots and Irish Songs and Tunes*, http://www.csufresno.edu/folkore/Olson.

Ong, Walter J, *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word*, in Terence Hawkes, ed, New York, Methuen, (1982) 1988.

Opie, Iona, and Peter Opie, eds, *The Singing Game*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1985.

Opie, Iona, and Peter Opie, eds, *The Oxford Dictionary of Nursery Rhymes*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1997.

Opie, Iona, and Peter Opie, eds, *The Lore and Language of Schoolchildren*, New York, New York Review of Books, 2001.

Orel, Harold, Henry L Snyder, and Marilyn Stokstad, eds, *The Scottish World: History and Culture of Scotland*, New York, Harry N Abrams, 1981.

Oring, Elliott, 'The Arts, Artifacts, and Artifices of Identity', *Journal of American Folklore*, vol 107, no 424, 1994, pp 211-233.

Ortner, Sherry, 'On Key Symbols', *American Anthropologist*, vol 75, 1973, pp 1338-1346.

Palmer, Roy, 'The Minstrel of Quarry Bank: Reminiscences of George Dunn (1887-1975)', *Oral History*, vol 11, no 1, Spring, 1983, pp 62-68.

Parkes, Peter, 'Personal and Collective Identity in Kalasha Song Performance: The Significance of Music-making in a Minority Enclave', in Martin Stokes, ed, *Ethnicity, Identity and Music: The Musical Construction of Place*, Oxford, Berg Publishers, 1997.

Peters, John, 'Near-sight and Far-sight: Media, Place, and Culture', in Roger Rouse, James Ferguson, and Akhil Gupta, eds, *Culture, Power, Place: Explorations in Critical Anthropology*, Boulder, Colorado, Westview Press, 1992.

Phillips, Tim, and Robert Holton, 'Personal Orientations towards Australian National Identity among British-born Residents', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol 27, no 5, 2004, pp 732-756.

Philpott, Stuart B, *West Indian Migration*, London, LSE Monographs in Anthropology, 1973.

Pickering, Michael, 'The Past as a Source of Aspiration: Popular Song and Social Change', in Michael Pickering and Tony Green, eds, *Everyday Culture: Popular Song and the Vernacular Milieu*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press, 1987.

Pickering, Michael, and Tony Green, eds, *Everyday Culture: Popular Song and the Vernacular Milieu*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press, 1987 (a).

Pickering, Michael, and Tony Green, 'Towards a Cartography of the Vernacular Milieu', in Michael Pickering and Tony Green, eds, *Everyday Culture: Popular Song and the Vernacular Milieu*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press, 1987 (b).

Pickering, Michael, and Tony Green, 'Conclusion: Studying the Everyday Arts', in Michael Pickering and Tony Green, eds, *Everyday Culture: Popular Song and the Vernacular Milieu*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press, 1987 (c).

Pittock, Murray, *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present*, London, Routledge, 1991.

Pittock, Murray, 'Allan Ramsay and the Decolonisation of Genre', *Review of English Studies,* vol 58, no 235, 2007, pp 316-337.

Playford, Henry, and Thomas D'Urfey, *Wit and Mirth: or Pills to Purge Melancholy*, vol 1, London, Pearson and Tonson, 1719.

Porter, James, 'The Folklore of Northern Scotland: Five Discourses on Cultural Representation', *Folklore*, vol 109, 1998, pp 1-14.

Porter, James, and Herschel Gower, *Jeannie Robertson: Emergent Singer, Transformative Voice*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press, 1995.

Prentis, Malcolm D, *The Scots in Australia*, Sydney, University of New South Wales Press, (1987), 2008.

Preston, Cathy, and Michael J Preston, eds, *The Other Print Tradition: Essays on Chapbooks, Broadsides, and Related Ephemera*, New York, Garland Publishing, 1995.

Probyn, Elspeth, *Outside Belongings*, London and New York, Routledge, 1996.

Rajan, Gita, and Shailja Sharma, 'New Cosmopolitanisms: South Asians in the United States at the Turn of the Twenty-First Century', in Gita Rajan and Shailja Sharma, eds, *New Cosmopolitanisms: South Asians in the US*, Stanford, California, Stanford University Press, 2006.

Ramsay, Allan, *The Tea-Table Miscellany: a Collection of Choice Songs, Scots and English*, vol 1, Edinburgh, Donaldson, 1762.

Ranger, Terence, 'The Invention of Tradition in Colonial Africa', in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, eds, *The Invention of Tradition*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, (1983), 2000.

Ray, Celeste, *Highland Heritage: Scottish Americans in the American South*, Chapel Hill, University of North Carolina Press, 2001.

Rennie, Léonie J, and Joan Gribble, 'A Guide to Preparing your Application for Candidacy', Curtin University of Technology, Revised Edition, September, 2006.

Renwick, Roger, *English Folk Poetry Structure and Meaning*, Philadelphia, University of Philadelphia Press, 1980.

Répertoire International des Sources Musicales (RISM), United Kingdom and Ireland, http://www.rism.org.uk.

Riach, Alan, 'MacDiarmid's Burns', in Robert Crawford, ed, *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, Iowa, University of Iowa Press, 1997.

Riach, Alan, *Representing Scotland in Literature, Popular Culture and Iconography: The Masks of the Modern Nation*, Gordonsville, Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.

Rice, Timothy, 'Time, Place, and Metaphor in Musical Experience and Ethnography', *Ethnomusicology*, vol 47, no 2, Spring/Summer 2003, pp. 151-79.

Richards, Eric, 'Australia and the Scottish Diaspora', in J Hardy, ed, *Stories of Australian Migration*, Kensington, New South Wales University Press, 1988.

Richards, Eric, *Britannia's Children: Emigration from England, Scotland and Ireland since 1600*, London, Hambledon and London, 2004.

Ritchie, James T R, *Golden City: Scottish Children's Street Games and Songs*, Edinburgh, Mercat Press, 1999.

Ritchie, James T R, *The Singing Street: Scottish Children's Games, Rhymes and Sayings*, Edinburgh, Mercat Press, 2000.

Ritchie, Jean, *Folk Songs of the Southern Appalachians*, Kentucky, University Press of Kentucky, 1997.

Roberton, Hugh S, *Westering Home*, Sheet Music, Sydney, W H Paling and Company, 1939.

Rodger, A, *Jean Adam of Cartsdyke: Her Authorship of the Ballad 'There's Nae Luck About the House' Vindicated*, Greenock, Mackenzie, 1866.

Roud, Steve, *The Roud Folk Song Index*, Vaughan Williams Memorial Library, http://library.efdss.org/cgi-bin/query.cgi?cross=on&type=Song&index_roudbroadside=on&index_roud=on&access=off.

Rowland, Ann Wierda, ' 'The Fause Nourice Song': Childhood, Child Murder, and the Formalism of the Scottish Ballad Revival', in Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet

Sorensen, eds, *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Rubin, David, ed, *Remembering Our Past: Studies in Autobiographical Memory*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1996.

Russell, Dave, *Popular Music in England 1840-1914: A Social History*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1987.

Russell, Dave, 'The 'Social History' of Popular Music: A Label without a Cause?', *Popular Music*, vol 12, no. 2, May 1993, pp 139-154.

Russell, Ian, 'Parody and Performance', in Michael Pickering and Tony Green, eds, *Everyday Culture: Popular Song and the Vernacular Milieu*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press, 1987 (a).

Russell, Ian, 'Stability and Change in a Sheffield Singing Tradition', *Folk Music Journal*, vol 5, no 3, 1987 (b), pp 317-358.

Russell, Ian, 'Introduction', in Ian Russell and David Atkinson, eds, *Folk Song: Tradition, Revival and Re-creation*, Aberdeen, Elphinstone Institute, Aberdeen University, 2004.

Russell, Ian, and David Atkinson, eds, *Folk Song: Tradition, Revival and Re-creation*, Aberdeen, Elphinstone Institute, Aberdeen University, 2004.

Schacter, Daniel, *Searching for Memory: The Brain, the Mind, and the Past*, New York, Basic Books, 1996.

Schmitter Heisler, Barbara, 'The Sociology of Immigration', in Caroline Brettell and James F Hollifield, eds, *Migration Theory: Talking across Disciplines*, New York, Routledge, 2008.

Scottish Chapbooks, National Library of Scotland, Rare Books Collections, http://www.nls.uk/collections/rarebooks/collections/chapbooks.html.

Scottish Chapbooks Catalogue, University of Glasgow Library, Special Collections, http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/chapbooks/search.

Scottish Chapbooks Project, University of South Carolina, G. Ross Roy Collection, http://www.sc.edu/library/spcoll/britlit/cbooks/cbook.html.

Scottish National Dictionary, Electronic Edition, www.dsl.ac.uk.

Scottish Music Centre, http://www.scottishmusiccentre.com.

Scottish Students' Song Book, London, Bayley and Ferguson, 1897.

Scottish Theatre Archive, University of Glasgow Library, Special Collections, http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/sta/search.

Seal, Graham, *The Hidden Culture: Folklore in Australian Society*, 2nd edition, Perth, Black Swan Press, 1998.

Seal, Graham, and Rob Willis, eds, *Verandah Music: Roots of Australian Tradition*, Perth, Curtin University Books, 2003.

Sharp, Cecil, *English Folksong: Some Conclusions*, London, Simpkin and Co, 1907.

Sharp, Cecil, ed, *One Hundred English Folksongs*, New York, Dover Publications, 1975.

Sheffer, Gabriel, *Diaspora Politics: At Home Abroad*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Shepherd, G, 'The Kailyard', in Douglas Gifford, ed, *The History of Scottish Literature: The Nineteenth Century*, vol 3, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1988.

Shelemay, Kay Kaufman, *Let Jasmine Rain Down: Song and Remembrance among Syrian Jews*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1998.

Shore, Bradd, 'Family Time: Studying Myth and Ritual in Working Families', The Emory Center for Myth and Ritual in American Life, Working Paper no 27, May 2003.

Shuldham-Shaw, Patrick, Emily B Lyle, and Katherine Campbell, eds, *The Greig-Duncan Folk Song Collection*, vol. 8. Published by Aberdeen University Press and Mercat Press for the University of Aberdeen in association with the School of Scottish Studies, Edinburgh University, 2002.

Sim, Duncan, 'Exploring Expatriate Identities: Scots in the United States', *Scottish Association for the Study of America Conference*, St Andrews, 8 November 2005.

Sir Harry Lauder 1870-1950, University of Glasgow Library, Special Collections, http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/STA/lauder/index.html.

Slobin, Mark, 'Music in Diaspora: The View from America', *Diaspora*, vol 3, no 1, 1994 pp 243-252.

Slobin, Mark, 'The Destiny of 'Diaspora' in Ethnomusicology', in Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton, eds, *The Cultural Study of Music*, New York, Routledge, 2003.

Smith, Anthony, *The Ethnic Origin of Nations*, Oxford, Blackwell Publishers, 1988.

Smout, T C, *A Century of the Scottish People, 1830-1950*, London, Fontana Press, 1997.

Somers, Margaret R, 'The Narrative Constitution of Identity: A Relational and Network Approach', *Theory and Society*, vol 23, no 5, October 1994, pp. 605-649.

Stanford, Charles Villiers, ed, *The National Song Book: A Complete Collection of the Folk-songs, Carols, and Rounds, Suggested by the Board of Education*, London, Boosey, 1906.

Stewart, Andy, *A Scottish Soldier (The Green Hills of Tyrol)*, Sheet Music, Sydney, Essex Music of Australia by arrangement with James S. Kerr, Glasgow, 1960.

Stewart, Andy, *Donald, Where's Your Troosers?*, Sheet Music, New Zealand, Charles Begg and Company, 1960.

Stewart, Sheila, *Queen Amang the Heather: The Life of Belle Stewart*, Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2006.

Stokes, Martin, ed, *Ethnicity, Identity and Music: The Musical Construction of Place*, Oxford, Berg Publishers, 1997.

Storey, John, *Inventing Popular Culture*, Oxford, Blackwell Publishing, 2003 (a).

Storey, John, *Cultural Studies and the Study of Popular Culture*, Georgia, University of Georgia Press, 2003 (b).

Storrier, Susan, ed, *Scotland's Domestic Life*, *Scottish Life and Society: A Compendium of Scottish Ethnology*, vol 6, Edinburgh, John Donald, 2006.

Sutton-Smith, Brian, Jay Mechling, Thomas W Johnson, and Felicia R McMahon, eds, *Children's Folklore*, Utah, Utah State University Press, 1999.

Sutton-Smith, Brian, 'Overview: Children's Folklore Concerns', in Brian Sutton-Smith, Jay Mechling, Thomas W Johnson, and Felicia R McMahon, eds, *Children's Folklore*, Utah, Utah State University Press, 1999.

Sweeney-Turner, Steve, 'Borderlines: Bilingual Terrain in Scottish Song', in Andrew Leyshon, David Matless, and George Revill, eds, *The Place of Music*, New York, The Guilford Press, 1998.

Symon, Peter, 'Music and National Identity in Scotland: A Study of Jock Tamson's Bairns', *Popular Music,* vol 16, no 2, Core and Periphery: Routes in British Popular Music History 1850-1980, May 1997, pp 203-216.

Symonds, Deborah A, *Weep Not for Me: Women, Ballads, and Infanticide in Early Modern Scotland*, Pennsylvania, Pennsylvania State University Press, 1997.

Szasz, Ferenc Morton, *Scots in the North American West, 1790-1917*, Norman, University of Oklahoma Press, 2000.

Take Six, Folksong Collectors Database, English Folk Dance and Song Society (EFDSS), http://library.efdss.org/archives/#.

Teo, Hsu-Ming, and Richard White, eds, *Cultural History in Australia*, Sydney, University of New South Wales Press, 2003.

The Voice of Radicalism, University of Aberdeen, Historic Collections, http://www.abdn.ac.uk/radicalism/index.shtml.

The Word on the Street, National Library of Scotland, http://www.nls.uk/broadsides.

Thomas-Lepore, Caitlin E, Jennifer Bohanek, Robyn Fivush, and Marshall Duke, ' "Today I …": Ritual and Spontaneous Narratives During Family Dinners', The Emory Center for Myth and Ritual in American Life, Working Paper no 31, April 2004.

Thompson, E P, *Customs in Common*, New York, The New Press, 1993.

Thomson, Alistair, 'Moving Stories: Oral History and Migration Studies', *Oral History*, vol 27, no1, Spring 1999, pp. 24-37.

Thomson, Alistair, ' 'Good Migration': Place, Meaning and Identity in Audio Letters from Australia, 1963-65', *Journal of Australian Studies*, vol 25, no 68, Scatterlings of Empire, Winter 2001, pp 105-116.

Thomson, Raymond A, 'Dance Bands and Dance Halls in Greenock, 1945-55', *Popular Music*, vol 8, no 2, May 1989, pp 143-155.

Thorn, Jennifer, ed, *Writing British Infanticide: Child Murder, Gender, and Print 1722-1859*, Newark, University of Delaware Press, 2003.

Tilley, Christopher, *A Phenomenology of Landscape: Places, Paths and Monuments*, Oxford and Providence, Berg Publishers, 1994.

Titon, Jeff Todd, 'Textual Analysis or Thick Description?', in Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton, eds, *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, New York, Routledge, 2003.

Tocher: Tales, Songs and Tradition, School of Scottish Studies Archives, University of Edinburgh, no 44, 1992.

Toelken, Barre, *Morning Dew and Roses: Nuance, Metaphor, and Meaning in Folksongs*, Chicago, University of Illinois Press, 1995.

Toelken, Barre, 'Foreword', in Mary-Ann Constantine and Gerald Porter, *Fragments and Meaning in Traditional Song: From the Blues to the Baltic*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2003.

Tololian, Khachig, 1991 'The Nation State and its Others: In Lieu of a Preface', *Diaspora*, vol 1, no1, 1991, pp 3-7.

Trevor-Roper, Hugh, 'The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland', in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, eds, *The Invention of Tradition*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, (1983), 2000.

Tribute to Sir Jimmy Shand, http://www.jimmyshand.co.uk.

Trumpener, Katie, *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire*, Princeton, Princeton University Press, 1997.

Turner, Victor, *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual*, Ithaca, Cornell University Press, 1967.

Turner, Victor, *The Ritual Process: Structure and Antistructure*, Ithaca, New York, Cornell University Press, 1977.

Tyrrell, Alex, 'Paternalism, Public Memory and National Identity in Early Victorian Scotland: The Robert Burns Festival at Ayr in 1844', *History*, vol 90, no 297, January 2005, pp 42-61.

Tyrrell, Alex, 'Scottishness and Britishness: From Scotland to Australia Felix', *Humanities Research*, vol 8, no 1, Britishness and Otherness, 2006, pp 17-26.

Vaughan Williams Memorial Library, English Folk Dance and Song Society (EFDSS), http://library.efdss.org/cgi-bin/home.cgi?access=off.

Wade, Peter, *Music, Race, and Nation: Musica Tropical in Columbia*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2000.

Walter Scott Digital Archive, Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, www.walterscott.lib.ed.ac.uk/home.html.

Waltz, Robert B, and David G Engles, eds, *The Traditional Ballad Index*, http://www.csufresno.edu.

Watkins, Bill, *Scotland is not for the Squeamish*, Sydney, Flamingo: Harper Collins, 2001.

West, Gary, 'Music', in Susan Storrier, ed, *Scotland's Domestic Life, Scottish Life and Society: A Compendium of Scottish Ethnology*, vol 6, Edinburgh, John Donald, 2006.

Wighton Collection of National Music Database, Dundee Central Library, http://www.dundeecity.gov.uk/wighton/database.htm.

Will Fyffe, University of Glasgow Library, Special Collections, http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/sta/collections/fyffe.html.

Wills, Sara, and, Kate Darian-Smith, 'Beefeaters, Bobbies, and a New Varangian Guard? Negotiating Forms of 'Britishness' in Suburban Australia', *History of Intellectual Culture*, vol 4, no 1, 2004, pp 1-18.

Williams, Raymond, *Marxism and Literature*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1977.

Willis, Paul, with Simon Jones, Joyce Canaan, and Geoff Hurd, *Common Culture: Symbolic Work at Play in the Everyday Cultures of the Young*, Boulder, West View Press, 1990.

Wilson, Robert, *A Gordon for Me*, Sheet Music, Melbourne, Allan and Co, 1950.

Wodak, R, Rudolph de Cillia, Martin Reisigl, and Karin Liebhart, *The Discursive Construction of National Identity*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1999.

Wolin, S J, and L A Bennett, 'Family Rituals', *Family Processes*, vol 23, no 3, 1984, pp 401-420.

Womack, P, *Improvement and Romance: Constructing the Myth of the Highlands*, Aberdeen, Aberdeen University Press, 1988.

Wong, P T, 'The Processes of Adaptive Reminiscence', in Barbara K Haight and Jeffrey Dean Webster, eds, *The Art and Science of Reminiscing: Theory, Research, Methods, and Applications*, Washington, Taylor and Francis, 1995.

WW2 People's War: An archive of World War Two Memories - Written by the Public Gathered by the BBC, British Broadcasting Corporation, http://www.bbc.co.uk/ww2peopleswar/stories/84/a5211884.shtml.

Zumkhawala-Cook, Richard, 'The Mark of Scottish America: Heritage Identity and the Tartan Monster', *Diaspora*, vol 14, no 1, 2005, pp 109-136.

Discography

This discography does not represent a full discography of the artists listed. It provides details of specific recordings referred to in this thesis together with a selection of additional recordings by particular artists. Several are recent re-releases and compilations of original/earlier recordings.

Anderson, Moira, *The World of Moira Anderson*, vol 3, Decca, 1974 (Decca SPA 352).

Anderson, Moira, *Moira Anderson: A Land for All Seasons*, Lismor Recordings, 1996 (Lismor LCOM6022).

Anderson, Moira, et al, *A Sprig of White Heather*, Phillips, 1965 (Phillips 6382 074).

Chokit on a Tattie: Children's Songs and Rhymes, Scottish Tradition Series, vol 22, School of Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh, Greentrax Recordings, 2006 (Greentrax CDTRAX9022).

Fyffe, Will, *Will Fyffe: Scotland's Stars on 78*, Lismor Recordings, 1994 (Lismor LCOM5234).

Here We Go Loobie Loo: *Playground Games from Scotland*, Folktrax, 1982 (Folktrax FXT-190).

Ippetty Sippetty: Scots Playground Games, Folktrax, 1978 (Folktrax FXT-181).

Lauder, Harry, *Aye Waken O!*, HMV, 1909 (HMV 02202).

Lauder, Harry, *Loch Lomond*, HMV, 1916 (HMV 4-2821).

Lauder, Harry, *The Road to the Isles*, HMV, 1926 (HMV d-1085).

Lauder, Harry, *Harry Lauder, Roamin' in the Gloamin': Original Recordings, 1926-1930*, Naxos, 2004 (Naxos 8 120751).

McKellar, Kenneth, *The Very Best of Kenneth McKellar*, Universal/Spectrum, 1997 (Spectrum 552095-2).

McKellar, Kenneth, *Kenneth McKellar: 20 Favourite Songs*, Lismor Recordings, 2002 (Lismor LCOM6047).

McKellar, Kenneth, *Kenneth McKellar: The Tartan and Scottish Saturday Night*, Vocalion, 2005 (Vocalion CDLK 4319).

McKellar, Kenneth, *Folk Songs from Scotland's Heritage: Kenneth McKellar's Scotland*, Vocalion, 2008 (Vocalion CDLK 4352).

McKellar, Kenneth, Moira Anderson, Robert Wilson, Harry Lauder, et al, *Scotland Sings: 60 Scottish Favourites*, Universal, 2004 (Universal 982 199-0).

Reader, Eddie, *Eddie Reader Sings the Songs of Robert Burns*, Compass Records, 2004 (Compass COM 4368).

Robertson, Jeannie, *Jeannie Robertson: The Queen Among the Heather*, Rounder Records, 1998 (Rounder 1720).

Robertson, Stanley, *Rum Scum Scoosh!: Songs and Stories of an Aberdeen Childhood*, Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, 2003 (Elphinstone Institute EICD003).

Shand, Jimmy, *Sing With Jimmy Shand*, Parlophone, 1957 (Parlophone GEP8718).

Singing in the Streets: Scottish Children's Songs, The Alex Lomax Collection, Rounder Records, 2004 (Rounder 682161179520).

Stewart, Andy, *The Best of Andy Stewart*, HMV/EMI, 1966 (EMI CLP 3562).

Stewart, Andy, *Andy Stewart's Scotland*, Scotdisc, 1992 (Scotdisc CDIT563).

Stewart, Andy, *Andy Stewart, Forever in Song: 80 All-time Scottish Favourites*, Platinum Prism, 1993 (Prism PLATCD3921).

Stewart, Andy, *Andy Stewart: 20 Scottish Favourites*, EMI, 2001 (EMI GOLD 5329652).

Stewart, Andy, *Andy Stewart: Donald, Where's Yer Troosers?*, Delta Music, 2008 (Delta CD6253).

Various artists, *A Celebration of Scottish Music*, Temple Records, 1988 (Temple COMD2003).

Whelan, Vickie, 'There Was a Lady Dressed in Green', *Up in the North, Down in the South*: S*ongs and Tunes from the Mike Yates Collection, 1964-2000*, Musical Traditions, 2001 (Musical Traditions MTCD 311-2).

Wilson, Robert, *Robert Wilson: The Voice of Scotland*, vols 1-3, Legacy Recordings, 2005 (Legacy: vol 1 LEGACY11CD, vol 2 LEGACY13CD, vol 3 LEGACY33CD).