

1 **Title:**

2 Other race effect on amygdala response during affective facial processing in major depression

3

4 **Running head:**

5 Other race effect on amygdala response in depression

6

7 **Authors:**

8 Anjali Sankar<sup>1</sup>, Sergi G. Costafreda<sup>2</sup>, Lauren B. Marangell<sup>3</sup>, Cynthia H.Y. Fu<sup>4,5</sup>

9 1. Department of Psychiatry, Stony Brook University, Stony Brook, NY11794, USA

10 2. Division of Psychiatry, Faculty of Brain Sciences, University College London, London, UK

11 3. University of Texas Health Science Center, Houston, USA

12 4. Centre for Affective Disorders, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's  
13 College London, London, UK

14 5. School of Psychology, University of East London, London, UK

15

16 **Corresponding author:**

17 Anjali Sankar, Department of Psychiatry, Health Sciences Center T-10, Stony Brook University,  
18 Stony Brook, NY11794, USA

19 Email: [anjali.sankar@stonybrookmedicine.edu](mailto:anjali.sankar@stonybrookmedicine.edu)

**Abstract**

**Objective:** The other race effect, also known as own race bias, refers to the enhanced ability to recognize faces belonging to one's own race relative to faces from another race. The other race effect is associated with increased amygdala response in healthy individuals. The amygdala is a key node in emotion processing which shows impaired functioning in depression and has been proposed to be a marker of depressive state. We investigated the impact of the other race effect on amygdala responses in depression.

**Methods:** Participants were 30 individuals with major depression (mean age 39.4 years) and 23 healthy individuals (mean age: 38.8 years) recruited from the community. Participants were Asian, Black/African American and Caucasian. During a functional MRI scan, participants viewed Caucasian faces which displayed a range of sad expressions. A region of interest analysis of left and right amygdala responses was performed.

**Results:** Increased bilateral amygdala responses were observed in response to the Caucasian face stimuli in participants who were Asian or Black/African American as compared to Caucasian participants in both healthy individuals and individuals with major depression. There was no significant group by race interaction effect.

**Conclusions:** Increased amygdala responses associated with the other race effect were evident in both individuals with major depression and in healthy participants. Increased amygdala responses with the other race effect is a potential confound of the neural correlates of facial processing in healthy participants and in mental health disorders. The implications of the other race effect on impairments in interpersonal functioning in depression require further investigation.

**Key words**

functional MRI, BOLD, neural correlates, ORE, major depressive disorder

## 44 **Introduction**

45 The other race effect, also known as own race bias, describes the phenomenon of stronger  
46 recognition of faces to one's own race as compared to another race. While race and ethnicity  
47 are often used interchangeably, race generally refers to physical features and is associated with  
48 biology while ethnicity is associated with cultural factors such as language and customs. The  
49 other race effect has been demonstrated in healthy individuals amongst different races[25], is  
50 evident in infants[22, 23], and has been attributed to reduced exposure to other races or  
51 motivation to individuate faces of other races [33].

52 Greater amygdala activation has been linked with the other race effect in healthy individuals [8,  
53 17, 27]. The amygdala is engaged by highly salient stimuli and is a key node in emotion  
54 processing, notably in the discernment of emotional facial expressions and in particular for  
55 negative expressions[6, 7, 30].An increased amygdala response to sad facial expressions is a  
56 widely replicated finding in major depression and has been proposed to be a marker of a current  
57 depressive state[2, 14, 15, 31].

58 However, if the other race effect is present in major depression and in turn engages the  
59 amygdala during facial processing, then the effect becomes a source of variance and is a  
60 potential confound in amygdala responses to emotional facial expressions. On the other hand, if  
61 increased amygdala activation reflects engagement primarily to the emotional expression, rather  
62 than to other aspects of facial processing including race, then the effect would not be observed.

63 Behavioural evidence of the other race effect in mental health disorders has been reported in  
64 schizophrenia and autism, both disorders are associated with pervasive deficits in processing  
65 facial expressions[28, 35].However, the effect has not been examined in major depression, only  
66 in healthy individuals who had undergone a sad mood induction, in which the other race effect  
67 was not observed regardless of the emotional facial expression[20]. The findings were  
68 understood as due to participants scanning and noting more features of the face during sad

69 mood induction, which suggest that the other race effect would not be expected in major  
70 depression.

71 We sought to examine the other race effect on amygdala responsivity to sad facial expressions  
72 in major depression. We applied a region of interest analysis to the amygdala given the findings  
73 of increased amygdala activation associated with the other race effect in healthy individuals[8,  
74 17, 27] and the specificity of amygdala responses to sad facial expressions in major  
75 depression[2, 14, 15, 31]. The stimuli were standardized Ekman faces[11], a widely used set of  
76 facial expressions which are restricted to faces of Caucasian adults. We expected to observe  
77 the other race effect in healthy participants with increased amygdala activation, but whether the  
78 effect would be evident in major depression was less clear.

## 79 **Material and Methods**

80 The study was approved by the Cambridgeshire 4 NHS Research Ethics Committee, NHS  
81 Health Research Authority, and all participants had provided informed written consent.  
82 Participants were 30 individuals with major depression(mean age 39.4 years) and 23 healthy  
83 individuals (mean age 38.8 years)recruited from the community (Table 1). Participants were  
84 self-identified as Caucasian, Asian or African American, and there were no differences in age or  
85 gender between patients with depression and healthy controls (all  $p>0.05$ ), or in age ( $p=0.48$ ),  
86 gender ( $p=0.25$ ) or depressive severity ( $p=0.61$ ) between the Caucasian and the Asian/African  
87 American participants. None of the participants with major depression were taking  
88 antidepressant medication or had been in psychotherapy treatment for a minimum of 4 weeks.  
89 Healthy participants had no history of psychiatric illnesses. Full inclusion and exclusion criteria  
90 are described in Fu et al.[13].

91 During the functional MRI scan, participants viewed a series of 10 faces (5 female), all  
92 Caucasian, adapted from Ekman and Friesen's Pictures of Facial Affect [11]and morphed using  
93 a computer program to depict varying intensities of sadness: low, medium and high[14]. During

94 the task, participants were required to indicate the gender of the face by a button press such  
95 that the explicit instruction was gender identification which facilitated implicit processing of the  
96 emotion [14]. The facial stimuli were presented twice at each intensity (60 faces in total), along  
97 with 12 baseline trials consisting of a crosshair visual fixation point, for a total of 72  
98 presentations, in a pseudo-randomised order. Each stimulus was presented for a duration of 3  
99 seconds, and the interval between trials varied randomly according to a Poisson distribution,  
100 with a mean intertrial interval of 5 seconds, for a total duration of 360 seconds (6 minutes).

101 Gradient echo T2\*-weighted echoplanar images were acquired depicting blood oxygenation  
102 level-dependent (BOLD) contrast. A total of 180 volumes were acquired for the sad facial affect  
103 task. For each volume, 39 oblique axial slices parallel to the intercommissural plane were  
104 collected with the following parameters: slice thickness: 3 mm, slice gap: 0.3 mm, echo time  
105 (TE): 30 milliseconds, repetition time (TR): 2000 milliseconds, flip angle: 75°, field of view: 240  
106 mm, and matrix size: 64 x 64.

107 The left and right amygdala regions of interest were defined according to the Harvard-Oxford  
108 probability atlas distributed with the FSL package  
109 (<http://fsl.fmrib.ox.ac.uk/fsl/fslwiki/Atlases>). Statistical Parametric Mapping (SPM8, Wellcome  
110 Department of Imaging Neuroscience, London, UK: <http://www.fil.ion.ucl.ac.uk/spm>) was used  
111 to pre-process and analyse the task-related fMRI data. The images were realigned to correct for  
112 motion artefacts, spatially normalized to the Montreal Neurological Institute (MNI) template, and  
113 smoothed using an 8mm full-width at half maximum (FWHM) Gaussian kernel filter. First-level  
114 analysis was performed using the general linear model, accounting for serial autocorrelations by  
115 applying an autoregressive model. Stimuli presentation was modelled as individual events and  
116 the first level analysis produced contrast images depicting overall facial processing capacity  
117 (mean difference in response between all facial trials taken together and baseline trials)[14].  
118 Region of interest analysis was performed using the MarsBar tool in SPM8

119 (<http://marsbar.sourceforge.net/>). The BOLD responses for left and right amygdalae were  
120 extracted separately for each subject in the contrast of interest. A multivariate analysis of  
121 variance (MANOVA) was performed for left and right amygdala separately using the extracted  
122 values with ethnicity as the between group measure (Caucasian, non-Caucasian).

## 123 **Results**

124 There was a significant effect of race on amygdala activation ( $F_{2,48}=5.025$ ,  $p=0.010$ ) (Figure 1),  
125 in which the subsequent univariate analysis showed a statistically significant difference between  
126 Caucasian and non-Caucasian participants in both right ( $F_{1,49}=10.23$ ,  $p=0.002$ ) and left  
127 ( $F_{1,49}=5.13$ ,  $p=0.028$ ) amygdala responses to sad facial expressions. Non-Caucasian participants  
128 showed greater right ( $t_{51}= 2.87$ ,  $p=0.006$ ) and left ( $t_{51}= 2.17$ ,  $p=0.035$ ) amygdala activation  
129 relative to Caucasian participants. The multivariate tests did not reveal any significant effects of  
130 group ( $F_{2,48}=2.54$ ,  $p=0.089$ ) or any significant group by race interactions ( $F_{2,48}=0.935$ ,  $p=0.400$ )  
131 on amygdala responses.

132 There were no correlations between depression severity and amygdala response in Caucasian  
133 ( $n=17$ ; right amygdala:  $p=0.72$ ; left amygdala:  $p=0.91$ ) or non-Caucasian participants with  
134 depression ( $n=13$ ; right amygdala:  $p=0.49$ ; left amygdala:  $p=0.45$ ).

## 135 **Discussion**

136 The present findings highlight the strength of engagement of the amygdala associated with the  
137 other race effect irrespective of depression status. Both healthy participants and those with  
138 major depression who were Asian and African American demonstrated increased bilateral  
139 amygdala responses to sad expressions in Caucasian faces in comparison with Caucasian  
140 participants. The lack of a significant group by race interaction effect indicates that there were  
141 comparable effects in healthy participants and in individuals with depression.

142 Moreover, we did not find a relationship between depression severity and amygdala response in  
143 Caucasian or non-Caucasian participants with depression. Whether there could be dissociable  
144 effects in individuals with depression, in which those with greater depressive severity would  
145 demonstrate sustained engagement to sad facial expressions that is above the contribution of  
146 the other race effect, should be ascertained in a larger sample.

147 While the other race effect has been well established in healthy individuals, there have been few  
148 studies in mental health disorders. Reports in schizophrenia [28] and in autism [35] have found  
149 a significant other race effect for emotion recognition and face memory. Moreover, participants  
150 with autism demonstrated similar cross-racial differentiation methods in scanning faces to that  
151 observed in healthy individuals [35]. The effect though has not been examined in major  
152 depression, while findings in healthy individuals following a sad mood induction did not observe  
153 a significant other race effect which was understood as a sad mood being associated with more  
154 detailed facial scan patterns that reduce susceptibility to the other race effect[20]. However, the  
155 present findings indicate that the other race effect is evident in major depression, in contrast to  
156 the findings from the mood induction in healthy participants. How the effect relates to patterns in  
157 facial sampling though would benefit from eye-tracking measures in participants with major  
158 depression.

159 Investigations of neural mechanisms of the other race effect have largely been examined using  
160 event related brain potential (ERP) studies and in healthy individuals. In particular, the early  
161 N170 component is purported to be involved in the processing of global facial features and less  
162 likely to be modulated by individual facial parts[9, 10]. Findings have been inconsistent though  
163 with the N170 component showing little sensitivity to the race of the facial stimuli [4, 5, 18, 34]  
164 as well as higher N170 responses to one's in-group [29] or to other race group[19, 21].  
165 Modulation of N170 responses [26]by attentional demand could have contributed to the variation  
166 in responses, and impact of the other race effect may emerge in later epochs as the N200 and

167 N400 components have revealed differences in processing own versus other-race faces  
168 (see[32] for a review).

169 Functional MRI studies have revealed recruitment within the network involved in face  
170 processing including in the amygdala[8, 17, 27], which is engaged by salient emotional and  
171 social stimuli, and the fusiform cortex, a region highly specialized for face processing which  
172 shows greater activation during recognition [16, 24] and categorization [12] of faces from own-  
173 relative to another race. Intentional encoding of same- and other-race faces could be further  
174 modulated by frontoparietal networks subserving attention and cognitive control [3]. Factors  
175 which moderate the other race effect include external factors, such as familiarity of the face, as  
176 the effect on amygdala [8, 27] and fusiform [24] activations is no longer evident when the face is  
177 that of a well-known (famous) individual[24, 27], and the duration of the stimuli presentation, as  
178 the effect is not observed with extended presentations [8], suggesting that the novelty or the  
179 unfamiliarity of the faces contribute to the bias-related responses. Moreover, it is possible that  
180 the effect could be modulated by the degree of implicit racial bias for a particular individual.

181 In the present study, we had sought to focus on amygdala activation and we used sad facial  
182 expressions as the stimuli because of their particular salience in major depression [30]. Whether  
183 the other race effect would be observed with other emotional face expressions requires further  
184 investigation. As the facial stimuli were all Caucasian, we were not able to confirm whether the  
185 other race effect would be found for Caucasian participants with depression viewing non-  
186 Caucasian faces.

## 187 **Conclusion**

188 In conclusion, increased amygdala activation was associated with the other race effect in both  
189 healthy participants and in individuals with major depression. The amygdala has a key role in  
190 emotion processing, social cognition and in the regulation of social behavior[1]. The potential



191 interaction of these effects and the implications for the impairments in social interactions that  
192 are already evident in depression require further investigation.

193 **References**

- 194 [1] R. Adolphs, COGNITIVE NEUROSCIENCE OF HUMAN SOCIAL BEHAVIOUR,  
195 NATURE REVIEWS| NEUROSCIENCE 4 (2003) 165.
- 196 [2] D. Arnone, S. McKie, R. Elliott, E.J. Thomas, D. Downey, G. Juhasz, S.R. Williams, J.W.  
197 Deakin, I.M. Anderson, Increased amygdala responses to sad but not fearful faces in  
198 major depression: relation to mood state and pharmacological treatment, American  
199 Journal of Psychiatry 169 (2012) 841-850.
- 200 [3] T.I. Brown, M.R. Uncapher, T.E. Chow, J.L. Eberhardt, A.D. Wagner, Cognitive control,  
201 attention, and the other race effect in memory, PloS one 12 (2017) e0173579.
- 202 [4] R. Caldara, B. Rossion, P. Bovet, C.-A. Hauert, Event-related potentials and time course  
203 of the 'other-race'face classification advantage, Neuroreport 15 (2004) 905-910.
- 204 [5] R. Caldara, G. Thutb, P. Servoir, C. Michel, P. Bovet, B. Renault, Face versus non-face  
205 object perception and the 'other-race'effect: a spatio-temporal event-related potential  
206 study, Clinical Neurophysiology 114 (2003) 515-528.
- 207 [6] S.G. Costafreda, M.J. Brammer, A.S. David, C.H. Fu, Predictors of amygdala activation  
208 during the processing of emotional stimuli: a meta-analysis of 385 PET and fMRI  
209 studies, Brain research reviews 58 (2008) 57-70.
- 210 [7] S.G. Costafreda, P. McCann, P. Saker, J.H. Cole, S. Cohen-Woods, A.E. Farmer, K.J.  
211 Aitchison, P. McGuffin, C.H. Fu, Modulation of amygdala response and connectivity in  
212 depression by serotonin transporter polymorphism and diagnosis, Journal of affective  
213 disorders 150 (2013) 96-103.
- 214 [8] W.A. Cunningham, M.K. Johnson, C.L. Raye, J.C. Gatenby, J.C. Gore, M.R. Banaji,  
215 Separable neural components in the processing of black and white faces, Psychological  
216 Science 15 (2004) 806-813.
- 217 [9] M. Eimer, Event-related brain potentials distinguish processing stages involved in face  
218 perception and recognition, Clinical neurophysiology 111 (2000) 694-705.

- 219 [10] M. Eimer, A. Gosling, S. Nicholas, M. Kiss, The N170 component and its links to  
220 configural face processing: a rapid neural adaptation study, *Brain research* 1376 (2011)  
221 76-87.
- 222 [11] P. Ekman, W. Friesen, *Pictures of Facial Affect* (Palo Alto, CA: Consulting  
223 Psychologists), (1976).
- 224 [12] L. Feng, J. Liu, Z. Wang, J. Li, L. Li, L. Ge, J. Tian, K. Lee, The other face of the other-  
225 race effect: An fMRI investigation of the other-race face categorization advantage,  
226 *Neuropsychologia* 49 (2011) 3739-3749.
- 227 [13] C.H. Fu, S.G. Costafreda, A. Sankar, T.M. Adams, M.M. Rasenick, P. Liu, R. Donati,  
228 L.A. Maglanoc, P. Horton, L.B. Marangell, Multimodal functional and structural  
229 neuroimaging investigation of major depressive disorder following treatment with  
230 duloxetine, *BMC psychiatry* 15 (2015) 82.
- 231 [14] C.H. Fu, S.C. Williams, A.J. Cleare, M.J. Brammer, N.D. Walsh, J. Kim, C.M. Andrew,  
232 E.M. Pich, P.M. Williams, L.J. Reed, Attenuation of the neural response to sad faces in  
233 major depression by antidepressant treatment: a prospective, event-related functional  
234 magnetic resonance imaging study, *Archives of general psychiatry* 61 (2004) 877-889.
- 235 [15] C.H. Fu, S.C. Williams, A.J. Cleare, J. Scott, M.T. Mitterschiffthaler, N.D. Walsh, C.  
236 Donaldson, J. Suckling, C. Andrew, H. Steiner, Neural responses to sad facial  
237 expressions in major depression following cognitive behavioral therapy, *Biological*  
238 *psychiatry* 64 (2008) 505-512.
- 239 [16] A.J. Golby, J.D. Gabrieli, J.Y. Chiao, J.L. Eberhardt, Differential responses in the  
240 fusiform region to same-race and other-race faces, *Nature neuroscience* 4 (2001) 845-  
241 850.
- 242 [17] A.J. Hart, P.J. Whalen, L.M. Shin, S.C. McInerney, H. Fischer, S.L. Rauch, Differential  
243 response in the human amygdala to racial outgroup vs ingroup face stimuli, *Neuroreport*  
244 11 (2000) 2351-2354.

- 245 [18] Y. He, M.K. Johnson, J.F. Dovidio, G. McCarthy, The relation between race-related  
246 implicit associations and scalp-recorded neural activity evoked by faces from different  
247 races, *Social Neuroscience* 4 (2009) 426-442.
- 248 [19] M. Herrmann, T. Schreppel, D. Jäger, S. Koehler, A.-C. Ehlis, A. Fallgatter, The other-  
249 race effect for face perception: an event-related potential study, *Journal of neural*  
250 *transmission* 114 (2007) 951-957.
- 251 [20] P.J. Hills, Z. Marquardt, I. Young, I. Goodenough, Explaining Sad People's Memory  
252 Advantage for Faces, *Frontiers in psychology* 8 (2017).
- 253 [21] T.A. Ito, G.R. Urland, The influence of processing objectives on the perception of faces:  
254 An ERP study of race and gender perception, *Cognitive, Affective, & Behavioral*  
255 *Neuroscience* 1 (2005) 21-36.
- 256 [22] D.J. Kelly, S. Liu, K. Lee, P.C. Quinn, O. Pascalis, A.M. Slater, L. Ge, Development of  
257 the other-race effect during infancy: Evidence toward universality?, *Journal of*  
258 *experimental child psychology* 104 (2009) 105-114.
- 259 [23] D.J. Kelly, P.C. Quinn, A.M. Slater, K. Lee, L. Ge, O. Pascalis, The other-race effect  
260 develops during infancy: Evidence of perceptual narrowing, *Psychological Science* 18  
261 (2007) 1084-1089.
- 262 [24] J.S. Kim, H.W. Yoon, B.S. Kim, S.S. Jeun, S.L. Jung, B.Y. Choe, Racial distinction of the  
263 unknown facial identity recognition mechanism by event-related fMRI, *Neuroscience*  
264 *letters* 397 (2006) 279-284.
- 265 [25] C.A. Meissner, J.C. Brigham, Thirty years of investigating the own-race bias in memory  
266 for faces: A meta-analytic review. American Psychological Association, 2001.
- 267 [26] T.N. Mohamed, M.F. Neumann, S.R. Schweinberger, Perceptual load manipulation  
268 reveals sensitivity of the face-selective N170 to attention, *Neuroreport* 20 (2009) 782-  
269 787.

- 270 [27] E.A. Phelps, K.J. O'Connor, W.A. Cunningham, E.S. Funayama, J.C. Gatenby, J.C.  
271 Gore, M.R. Banaji, Performance on indirect measures of race evaluation predicts  
272 amygdala activation, *Journal of cognitive neuroscience* 12 (2000) 729-738.
- 273 [28] A.E. Pinkham, N.J. Sasson, M.E. Calkins, J. Richard, P. Hughett, R.E. Gur, R.C. Gur,  
274 The other-race effect in face processing among African American and Caucasian  
275 individuals with schizophrenia, *American Journal of Psychiatry* 165 (2008) 639-645.
- 276 [29] K.G. Ratner, D.M. Amodio, Seeing "us vs. them": Minimal group effects on the neural  
277 encoding of faces, *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 49 (2013) 298-301.
- 278 [30] A. Sankar, C. Fu, Psychotherapy and antidepressant treatment effects on the functional  
279 neuroanatomy of depression *Psychopathology Review* 3 (2016) 16-28.
- 280 [31] S. Surguladze, M.J. Brammer, P. Keedwell, V. Giampietro, A.W. Young, M.J. Travis,  
281 S.C. Williams, M.L. Phillips, A differential pattern of neural response toward sad versus  
282 happy facial expressions in major depressive disorder, *Biological psychiatry* 57 (2005)  
283 201-209.
- 284 [32] J.W. Tanaka, L.J. Pierce, The neural plasticity of other-race face recognition, *Cognitive,*  
285 *Affective, & Behavioral Neuroscience* 1 (2009) 122-131.
- 286 [33] L. Wan, K. Crookes, K.J. Reynolds, J.L. Irons, E. McKone, A cultural setting where the  
287 other-race effect on face recognition has no social-motivational component and derives  
288 entirely from lifetime perceptual experience, *Cognition* 144 (2015) 91-115.
- 289 [34] H. Wiese, J. Stahl, S.R. Schweinberger, Configural processing of other-race faces is  
290 delayed but not decreased, *Biological psychology* 81 (2009) 103-109.
- 291 [35] L. Yi, P.C. Quinn, C. Feng, J. Li, H. Ding, K. Lee, Do individuals with autism spectrum  
292 disorder process own-and other-race faces differently?, *Vision research* 107 (2015) 124-  
293 132.