

THE UNIVERSITY of EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

Bronze Age subsistence strategies in the southeastern Carpathian Bend area, Romania

Citation for published version:

Aguraiuja, Ü, Constantinescu, M, Lamb, A & Bonsall, C 2018, 'Bronze Age subsistence strategies in the southeastern Carpathian Bend area, Romania: Results from stable isotope analyses' Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports, vol. 17, pp. 510-519. DOI: 10.1016/j.jasrep.2017.12.013

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):

10.1016/j.jasrep.2017.12.013

Link:

Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version: Peer reviewed version

Published In: Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The University of Édinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



1 2 3	BRONZE AGE SUBSISTENCE STRATEGIES IN THE SOUTHEASTERN CARPATHIAN BEND AREA, ROMANIA: RESULTS FROM STABLE ISOTOPE ANALYSES
4	
5	
6	
7	Ülle Aguraiuja ^{a, 1} , Mihai Constantinescu ^b , Angela Lamb ^c , Clive Bonsall ^a
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports
14	17 (2018) 510-519
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22 23	^a School of History, Classics, and Archaeology, University of Edinburgh, Old Medical School, Teviot Place, Edinburgh EH8 9AG, UK
24	^b 'Francisc I. Rainer' Institute of Anthropology, Romanian Academy, Bucharest, Romania
25 26 27	^c NERC Isotope Geosciences Laboratory, British Geological Survey, Keyworth, Nottingham NG12 5GG, UK
28 29	¹ Present address: Archaeological Research Collection, Tallinn University, Rüütli 10, 10130, Tallinn, Estonia
30 31 32	Corresponding author: Ülle Aguraiuja Tel: +372 555 184 69 Email address: ulle aguraiuja@gmail.com

33 Bronze Age subsistence strategies in the southeastern Carpathian Bend area, Romania:

- 34 results from stable isotope analyses
- 35

36 Ülle Aguraiuja, Mihai Constantinescu, Angela Lamb, Clive Bonsall

37

38 Abstract

39 Here we report the results of stable carbon and nitrogen isotope analyses of human and faunal 40 remains from two Bronze Age (Monteoru culture) sites near Buzău in Romania, in the eastern 41 foothills of the Carpathian Mountains. The results for 54 humans from Sărata Monteoru and 42 10 from Cârlomănești indicate diets that were dominated by C₃ terrestrial resources, consistent with the archaeofaunal inventories from the sites and archaeobotanical data from 43 the wider region. Statistically significant differences in the average δ^{15} N values of the two 44 45 skeletal populations hint at a change in economic practices between early and late phases of the Monteoru culture. Consumer diets at the two sites were quantified using multiple mixing 46 47 models generated with the Bayesian statistical program FRUITS (Food Reconstruction Using 48 Isotopic Transferred Signals). The model outputs suggest the inhabitants of the later 49 settlement, Sărata Monteoru, were less dependent on animal-derived products and relied 50 more on cereals and legumes for energy and protein, compared to their predecessors at 51 Cârlomănești. Based on changes in the faunal record we speculate that dairying may also 52 have increased in importance between the early and later phases of the Monteoru culture.

53

54 Key words: Bronze Age, Carpathian Bend, stable isotopes, subsistence, palaeodiets

55

56 **1. Introduction**

Along the eastern flank of the Carpathian Mountains, in present-day Romania, is a zone of rolling hills and valleys known as the Sub-Carpathians. During the Bronze Age, this region was inhabited by sedentary farmers of the Monteoru culture. The presence of foreign goods among their archaeological remains hints at a society with trade contacts extending as far as the Baltic and the Aegean (Motzoi-Chicideanu, 1995), yet relatively little is known of the daily life of these people, including their dietary habits.

63 Palaeodiet studies using stable isotope data have been undertaken in Southeastern Europe 64 since the 1980s (Murray and Schoeninger, 1988), with particularly detailed research on 65 Mesolithic and Early Neolithic populations living along the Lower Danube in the 'Iron Gates' (e.g. Bonsall et al., 1997, 2004; Cook et al., 2001; Borić et al., 2004; Nehlich et al., 66 67 2010). For later periods, while there have been studies of Bronze and Iron Age communities along the Adriatic and the Aegean coasts (e.g. Triantaphyllou et al., 2008; 68 69 Petroutsa and Manolis, 2010; Vika, 2011; Lightfoot et al., 2012, 2015), these periods in 70 the northern Balkans have been comparatively neglected.

Bronze Age economies in southeast Europe can be very broadly characterized by an
 increase in cultivation intensity and crop diversity (including the spread of millet, a C₄

plant) (see Harding, 2000; Motuzaite-Matuzeviciute et al., 2013; Stika and Heiss, 2013)

- and a shift from caprine to cattle husbandry (Becker, 1999, 2000; Bartosiewicz, 2013).
- 75 The current study aims to investigate whether similar trends can be observed in the Sub-
- 76 Carpathian isotopic record.

- In this paper, we present new stable isotope data for archaeological human and animal
 remains from two Monteoru culture sites Sărata Monteoru and Cârlomănești to assess
 the dietary practices of these Bronze Age communities and to provide quantitative
 estimates of plant *vs* animal foods in Monteoru diet.
- 81

82 2. Archaeological background

83 The Monteoru culture is one of the richest Bronze Age cultures in Southeast Europe, and 84 one of the most thoroughly researched (Nestor, 1933; Vulpe, 1995; Motzoi-Chicideanu,

- 85 2011). The two sites included in our study, although only 12km apart, represent different
 86 phases in the avalution of the Manteern culture (Figure 1).
- 86 phases in the evolution of the Monteoru culture (**Figure 1**).
- 87



88

Figure 1. Map of Romania showing the area of the Monteoru culture and the locations of
Sărata Monteoru and Cârlomănești ('Location map of Romania' by Wikimedia Commons
user Dr Brains used under GNU Free Documentation Licence 1.2, modified by Ü.
Aguraiuja)

93

94 The type site, Sărata Monteoru, is a multi-layer, fortified, hilltop settlement spanning the 95 period from the Early Bronze Age to the end of the Middle Bronze Age, and has several 96 associated cemeteries - three on lower slopes of the same hill, and one on an adjacent 97 hillslope. Only the largest cemetery (no. 4) has been adequately published (Maximilian, 1962; Bârzu, 1989). Pottery typology and ¹⁴C dating (four unpublished radiocarbon dates 98 99 obtained by Mihai Constantinescu) place this cemetery in the middle of the second millennium BC, ca. 1750-1500 cal BC. Although more than half the graves documented 100 101 in cemetery no. 4 have no grave goods, there are numerous 'rich' graves containing objects made of valuable or exotic materials, such as bronze, gold, glass paste and amber 102 103 (Bârzu, 1989).

- 104 The site of Cârlomănești has a similar environmental setting to Sărata Monteoru, 105 comprising a hilltop settlement (The Citadel) with a cemetery located on an adjacent hill, the La Arman plateau. Only one radiocarbon date is available for the settlement, which 106 107 falls around 1600 cal BC (Motzoi-Chicideanu et al., 2012b), whereas 14 skeletons from the cemetery were radiocarbon dated between ca. 2280–1800 cal BC (Motzoi-Chicideanu 108 109 and Chicideanu-Sandor, 2015). However, a significant part of the cemetery remains 110 unexcavated, and may contain burials from the later period, as suggested by the discovery 111 of a grave with Late Monteoru ceramics c. 300m from the excavated area. Thus, it is likely 112 that the cemetery and the settlement are contemporaneous (Constantinescu, personal 113 observation). The range of funerary goods recovered at Cârlomănesti is similar to that 114 found at Sărata Monteoru cemetery no. 4, although there are some differences in burial 115 customs and grave constructions – for example, at Cârlomănesti there were numerous collective graves and secondary burials, and many graves had stone structures such as 116 117 stone-filled pits covered with small stone mounds, cists, or catacombs, often attributed to 118 eastern influence (Motzoi-Chicideanu, 2011; Motzoi-Chicideanu et al., 2012a).
- 119 Zooarchaeological evidence from Monteoru culture sites points to a focus on cattle and 120 caprine husbandry, supplemented by occasional hunting (Becker, 1999, 2000). Cultivation 121 of several varieties of cereals and pulses is evidenced by the presence in archaeobotanical 122 assemblages of emmer, einkorn, spelt, bread and durum wheat, barley, rye and gold-of-123 pleasure, and pea and bitter vetch (Cârciumaru, 1983, 1996). Although millet (the only 124 regularly grown C₄ plant in prehistoric Europe) has not been reported from Monteoru culture sites, direct dating of millet grains indicates that it was cultivated in some areas of 125 126 Southeast Europe as early as the Middle Bronze Age, c. 1600 cal BC (Motuzaite-127 Matuzeviciute et al., 2013).
- Aquatic resources would have been available in rivers and streams of the surrounding landscape, although Sărata Monteoru and Cârlomănești are some distance (10 and 2.8 km, respectively) from the only large river in the region, the Buzău River. While fish and shellfish may have been consumed on occasion, their remains were not found among the faunal material from the sites, suggesting they are unlikely to have been more than a very minor component of the diet.
- 134

135 **3. Stable isotope analysis for dietary reconstruction**

- 136 Stable isotopes of carbon and nitrogen, analysed from bone collagen, are commonly used 137 in archaeological research to estimate the proportion of marine vs terrestrial, or plant vs animal resources at both the individual and population level. Carbon isotope ratios (δ^{13} C) 138 139 can be used to distinguish between marine and terrestrial sources of carbon, but also between diets based on either C₃ or C₄ plants. Humans living on C₃ plants or their 140 consumers have bone collagen δ^{13} C values around -20‰, while those relying mainly on 141 C₄ resources exhibit much higher values around -10%; elevated δ^{13} C values also result 142 from regular consumption of marine foods (Schoeninger and DeNiro, 1984; Ambrose 143 and DeNiro, 1986; Sealy, 2001). Fish inhabiting freshwater rivers and lakes exhibit 144 145 widely varying C-isotope signatures. The δ^{13} C of fish bones from Mesolithic and Early Neolithic sites in the Iron Gates of the Danube, for example, was found to range between 146 147 -26.3‰ and -15.7‰ (Bonsall et al., 1997), while Fuller et al. (2012) reported bone collagen δ^{13} C values for freshwater and anadromous fish from historical period sites in 148 149 Belgium of between -28.2‰ and -14.1‰.
- 150 Nitrogen isotope ratios (δ^{15} N) primarily reflect the trophic level of the organism with 151 every step up the food chain there occurs an enrichment of ca. 3-6‰ in ¹⁵N between the

- 152 food source and its consumer (Bocherens and Drucker, 2003; Hedges and Reynard,
- 153 2007). This results in plants having the lowest and top carnivores the highest $\delta^{15}N$
- 154 values. The longest food chains and thus the highest δ^{15} N values are seen in aquatic (both 155 freshwater and marine) ecosystems (Schoeninger and DeNiro, 1984).
- 156 While δ^{15} N in animal tissues varies in a relatively predictable manner, a broad range of 157 biogeochemical processes can influence the N isotopic composition of plants and soils at 158 the base of the food chain. Perhaps the most important of these for agricultural societies 159 is the effect of animal-derived fertilizers on plant δ^{15} N ratios (see Szpak [2014] for a review). While elevated (up to 5–6‰) crop δ^{15} N values have been reported for charred 160 plant remains from prehistoric European contexts (e.g. Fraser et al., 2011, 2013; Bogaard 161 162 et al., 2013; Vaiglova et al., 2014; Bogaard, 2015), the extent to which manuring affects 163 plant δ^{15} N values seems to be highly variable, depending on the type and amount of the 164 fertilizer and the duration of the application, with more extensive and long-term manuring practices resulting in more positive values. On occasions where high-intensity 165 manuring has affected plant δ^{15} N values, misinterpretation of human stable isotope data 166 can result in the overrepresentation of animal protein in human diets, as herbivores 167 168 consuming (unmanured) forage may be indistinguishable from manured crops based on 169 their collagen δ^{15} N values alone.
- 170

171 **4. Materials and methods**

Fifty-four individuals from Sărata Monteoru cemetery no. 4 and 10 individuals from 172 Cârlomănești – La Arman were selected for stable δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N analysis. A rib bone was 173 174 sampled from most individuals, although other skeletal elements were used if a rib was not 175 available. Samples were selected to include both sexes, various age groups, and different 176 'social groups' (based on the presence and amount of grave goods). Additionally, animal 177 bones recovered from graves in cemetery no. 4 (n=17) and from the Monteoru period 178 settlement at Cârlomănești (n=39) were sampled to provide a regional terrestrial baseline of faunal isotope values. Animal bones from Sărata Monteoru are believed to relate to 179 180 burial activities (e.g. grave goods or remains of feasting), although they were not 181 documented during the original excavations. Faunal samples from Cârlomănești lack a 182 direct connection with the human burials, as they were recovered from the settlement site 183 near the cemetery, but they are assumed to be representative of the type of animal protein 184 consumed by the local inhabitants.

Approximately 1g of bone was cut from each of the human and animal bones selected for 185 analysis, using a Dremel multitool fitted with a diamond cutting wheel. Collagen for stable 186 187 isotope analysis was extracted at the University of Edinburgh Bone Chemistry Laboratory. Bone samples were first cleaned of adhering sediment and 1-2mm removed from exposed 188 189 surfaces using a sterile scalpel blade, followed by ultrasonication in ultrapure (MilliQTM) 190 water. After drying, the cleaned samples were weighed and then subjected to standard 191 acid/base/acid (ABA) pre-treatment at room temperature, comprising demineralization in 192 1M HCl, followed by 0.2M NaOH wash for 20 minutes to remove humic acids, and a final 193 1M HCl wash for 1 hour to remove any secondary carbonates that may have formed 194 during NaOH treatment – after each step, the samples were rinsed three times with 195 ultrapure water. The residue was gelatinized in a pH 3 solution at 80°C for approximately 196 20 hours. The resulting solution was filtered, evaporated until about 10ml remained.

197 freeze-dried, then weighed to determine percent yield.

- 198 Collagen samples were measured for δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N at the NERC Isotope Geosciences
- Laboratory facility at Keyworth (UK), using a Continuous Flow-Elemental Analysis Isotope Ratio Mass Spectrometry (CF-EA-IRMS) consisting of an elemental analyser
- 201 (Flash/EA) coupled to a ThermoFinniganDelta^{Plus} XL isotope ratio mass spectrometer via
- a ConFlo III interface. Collagen carbon and nitrogen isotope ratios are reported in per mil
- 203 (‰) relative to VPDB and AIR standards, respectively. δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N ratios were
- 204 calibrated using an in-house reference material M1360p (powdered gelatine from British
- Drug Houses) with expected delta values of -20.32‰ (calibrated against CH7, IAEA) and
- +8.12‰ (calibrated against N-1 and N-2, IAEA) for C and N, respectively. Analyses were
- 207 run in duplicate and the average 1-sigma standard deviation of the duplicates was $\frac{1}{200}$
- 208 $\delta^{13}C = \pm 0.06\%$ and $\delta^{15}N = \pm 0.05\%$. The 1-sigma reproducibility for mass spectrometry 200 approximate for these analysis was better then $\pm 0.14\%$ for $\delta^{13}C = \pm 0.06\%$ for $\delta^{15}N$
- controls for these analyses was better than $\pm 0.14\%$ for δ^{13} C and $\pm 0.06\%$ for δ^{15} N. 210

211 **5. Results**

- The stable isotope data for the human and animal bone samples analysed are presented in **Tables 1 & 2** and Figures 2 & 3.
- 214 Collagen yields for all samples were >1% and atomic C:N ratios between 3.2 and 3.4,
- indicative of well-preserved collagen (van Klinken, 1999). Most samples also had elemental concentrations within the range of \geq 30% for %C and \geq 10% for %N defined by
- 217 van Klinken (1999).
- In three cases, %C and %N were below that range, but still within the accepted lower
- limits of 13 for %C and 5 for %N (Ambrose, 1990). Since these samples also had C:N
 ratios indicative of well-preserved collagen, and the values themselves do not seem
- 220 ratios indicative of weil-preserved collagen, and the values themselves do not 221 abnormal, they were not discarded.
- 222



223

Figure 2. Scatterplot of human $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{15}N$ values. SM=Sărata Monteoru, CRL=Cârlomănești

225 CA

226



227

Figure 3. Scatterplot of human and animal average $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{15}N$ values, 1SD marked with error bars. Deer and hare ratios presented as individual values. SM=Sărata Monteoru, CRL=Cârlomănești

Table 1. Stable isotope results for human bone collagen from Sărata Monteoru and
 Cârlomăneşti.

Burial no	Age	Sex	Grave	δ ¹³ C _{V-PDB}	δ ¹⁵ N _{AIR} ‰	%C	%N	at C∙N
			Să	rata Monteor	u			0.11
12	9-11	N/A	Rich	-19.7	6.3	41.6	14.7	3.3
13	Adult	F	No	-19.9	9.5	29.6	10.4	3.3
24	1.5-2	N/A	No	-19.2	9.8	41.1	14.5	3.3
35a	17-19	F	Rich	-19.5	8.5	39.1	13.9	3.3
35b	1.5-2	N/A	Rich	-19.2	11.1	41.3	14.8	3.3
40	17-19	F	Rich	-19.5	5.8	39.4	13.8	3.3
41	7-9	N/A	No	-20.1	7.7	42.0	14.8	3.3
46	16-18	N/A	N/A	-19.8	9.5	32.7	11.4	3.4
48	Adult	?	Few	-19.7	8.4	41.4	14.6	3.3
50	1-3	N/A	Few	-18.8	10.8	36.5	12.8	3.3
53	Adult	F	No	-19.3	8.7	40.7	14.6	3.3

54a	Adult	F	No	-19.7	8.7	40.3	14.4	3.3
61	17-19	F	No	-19.4	7.9	42.1	14.9	3.3
62	Adult	М	No	-19.4	9.1	41.7	14.7	3.3
63	19-21	F	Rich	-19.9	7.8	40.4	14.2	3.3
64	Adult	F	No	-19.6	8.8	42.1	14.8	3.3
65	Adult	?	No	-19.3	9.1	41.6	14.8	3.3
66	Adult	?	No	-19.5	8.3	41.4	14.7	3.3
68	Adult	М	Few	-19.4	8.9	41.3	14.7	3.3
69	15-17	?	Few	-19.3	8.8	40.7	14.4	3.3
70	8-10	N/A	No	-19.4	8.5	41.6	14.8	3.3
71	Adult	М	Rich	-19.1	8.9	41.5	14.6	3.3
72	7-9	N/A	Rich	-20.0	6.9	41.5	14.6	3.3
74	Adult	F	No	-19.0	10.2	41.2	14.4	3.3
75a	Adult	F	No	-19.2	9.5	41.7	14.7	3.3
75b	1.5-2	N/A	No	-18.8	11.0	39.2	13.9	3.3
77	Adult	М	Few	-19.3	8.9	39.9	14.0	3.3
78	Adult	М	Few	-19.6	8.3	40.0	14.2	3.3
79	Adult	М	No	-19.7	8.6	40.4	14.2	3.3
80	2-4	N/A	Few	-19.4	10.1	39.5	13.7	3.4
81	Adult	?	Few	-19.4	8.2	41.1	14.6	3.3
82	15-17	?	Few	-19.5	8.5	39.9	14.0	3.3
85	Adult	F	No	-20.0	8.0	40.4	14.2	3.3
86	18-20	М	No	-19.7	8.5	42.2	14.8	3.3
88	7-9	N/A	Rich	-19.7	8.6	40.7	14.3	3.3
90b	1.5-2	N/A	No	-19.3	10.0	38.2	13.5	3.3
101	Adult	F	Few	-19.5	8.6	41.1	14.5	3.3
102	15-17	?	No	-19.8	8.1	39.3	13.8	3.3
105	Adult	F	Rich	-19.7	8.9	42.0	14.8	3.3
106	Adult	F	No	-19.4	8.6	41.2	14.5	3.3
107	Adult	F	Rich	-19.9	8.8	42.2	14.8	3.3
108	Adult	М	No	-19.4	10.4	42.2	14.8	3.3
112	18-20	М	No	-19.3	8.8	40.8	14.5	3.3
116	3-5	N/A	No	-19.5	8.9	39.4	13.9	3.3
117	2-3	N/A	No	-20.0	7.7	39.9	13.9	3.3
119	5-6	N/A	Few	-19.7	8.3	40.8	14.4	3.3
120	9-10	N/A	No	-19.6	8.8	40.0	14.0	3.3
123	17-19	М	No	-19.7	7.9	39.0	13.7	3.3
124	2-4	N/A	No	-19.9	8.2	40.3	14.1	3.3
126	Adult	М	No	-19.5	9.3	41.3	14.7	3.3
127	Adult	М	No	-19.2	8.8	41.2	14.5	3.3
128	8-12	N/A	No	-19.8	8.5	40.8	14.3	3.3
134	Adult	F	No	-19.7	8.7	39.0	13.6	3.3
135	Adult	F	No	-19.3	9.4	40.4	14.2	3.3
	Site av	erage		-19.5±0.3	8.8±1.0			
				Cârlomănești				
1	Adult	F	Rich	-19.6	9.7	42.9	15.1	3.3
2	13-15	?	Few	-19.6	9.2	42.5	15.0	3.3
5	Adult	М	Few	-19.4	9.7	42.4	14.9	3.3

19	Adult	F	Few	-19.3	10.2	42.0	14.7	3.3
24	10-12	N/A	Few	-19.5	9.2	42.4	15.0	3.3
51	9-13	N/A	Rich	-19.2	9.7	41.9	14.9	3.3
58	8-9	N/A	Few	-18.9	9.0	42.5	15.1	3.3
80a	Adult	F	Rich	-19.3	10.1	42.9	15.2	3.3
103	Adult	F	Few	-19.4	10.0	38.0	13.3	3.3
105a	8-9	N/A	Few	-19.3	9.4	41.6	15.0	3.3
Site average			-19.3±0.2	9.6±0.4				

Cârlomănești. Notes: 1. Each bone sample was given a unique identification code; 2. The description 'Sheep/goat' reflects the difficulty in distinguishing sheep (Ovis aries) from goats (Capra hircus) in the animal bone assemblages from the two sites.

Table 2. Stable isotope results for animal bone collagen from Sărata Monteoru and

Sample No. ¹	Animal ²	Species	Comments	δ ¹³ C _{V-} _{PDB} ‰	$\delta^{15}N_{AIR} \mbox{\scale}$	%C	%N	at C:N
		Să	irata Monteoru					
2-SM	Sheep/goat	Ovis aries or Capra hircus		-19.4	6.1	42.2	14.8	3.3
3-SM	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-20.0	5.9	40.0	14.1	3.3
4-SM	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus	Young individual	-19.9	7.4	40.5	14.4	3.3
5-SM	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-19.1	9.8	39.6	13.5	3.4
6-SM	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-19.1	6.4	41.8	14.9	3.3
7-SM	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-19.6	5.9	41.1	14.4	3.3
8-SM	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.0	6.6	38.1	13.6	3.3
9-SM	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-19.5	7.6	40.1	14.1	3.3
10-SM	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.0	6.3	39.9	14.1	3.3
11-SM	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-19.0	5.4	41.1	14.6	3.3
13-SM	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-18.9	5.7	34.3	12.1	3.3
14-SM	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.7	7.8	41.4	14.7	3.3
15-SM	Cattle	Bos taurus		-19.5	6.4	41.1	14.5	3.3
16-SM	Dog	Canis familiaris		-19.2	8.4	42.7	15.0	3.3
19-SM	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or Capra hircus		-20.2	7.4	40.4	14.1	3.4
20-SM	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.5	6.4	40.1	14.0	3.4
21-SM	Horse	Equus caballus		-19.9	6.4	41.1	14.4	3.3
		(Cârlomănești					
22-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.6	6.5	42.0	14.9	3.3
24-CRL	Sheep	Ovis aries		-20.1	5.8	41.8	14.9	3.3
25-CRL	Horse	Equus caballus		-19.6	4.8	16.0	5.5	3.4
26-CRL	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>	With canid gnaw marks	-19.9	6.0	41.9	14.9	3.3
29-CRL	Horse	Equus caballus		-19.5	2.8	42.4	15.0	3.3

30-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus	Young individual	-20.3	7.7	36.7	13.0	3.3
31-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-13.5	6.2	42.4	15.3	3.2
32-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus	With canid gnaw marks	-18.5	5.2	41.7	15.1	3.2
33-CRL	Deer	Cervus sp.	C	-20.8	4.3	28.8	10.2	3.3
34-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-19.5	7.9	26.2	9.1	3.4
35-CRL	Dog	Canis familiaris		-20.0	9.8	39.9	14.3	3.3
36-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-18.6	6.3	41.4	14.9	3.2
37-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.2	5.6	41.7	15.0	3.2
39-CRL	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-16.4	6.8	34.5	12.4	3.3
40-CRL	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-22.1	6.4	42.5	15.5	3.2
41-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-20.6	6.1	42.5	15.3	3.3
43-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-20.5	5.8	42.9	15.1	3.3
44-CRL	Dog	Canis familiaris		-19.2	9.0	42.0	15.0	3.3
45-CRL	Hare	Lepus sp.		-19.5	3.0	42.4	15.0	3.3
46-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus		-19.5	5.3	41.4	14.8	3.3
47-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.6	8.2	33.4	11.6	3.4
48-CRL	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>		-20.3	7.6	41.7	14.7	3.3
49-CRL	Horse	Equus caballus		-20.9	3.2	40.5	14.4	3.3
51-CRL	Cattle	Bos Taurus		-20.4	6.1	41.4	14.7	3.3
52-CRL	Dog	Canis familiaris		-19.5	9.7	41.7	14.9	3.3
53-CRL	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>	Young individual	-20.6	6.1	41.8	14.8	3.3
55-CRL	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or <i>Capra hircus</i>	Young individual	-17.1	7.9	42.1	14.9	3.3
56-CRL	Dog	Canis familiaris		-19.4	7.9	41.6	14.7	3.3
57-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-19.1	6.6	41.9	14.9	3.3
58-CRL	Pig	Sus scrofa domesticus		-19.4	6.7	41.6	14.7	3.3
59-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus		-19.4	6.1	39.7	14.1	3.3
60-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus		-20.2	7.0	38.1	13.3	3.3
61-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus	Large	-20.5	6.1	42.1	15.0	3.3
62-CRL	Dog	Canis sp.	individual (or wolf)	-19.5	8.9	41.4	14.7	3.3
63-CRL	Dog	Canis familiaris		-19.0	9.9	42.1	15.0	3.3
64-CRL	Cattle	Bos taurus		-19.8	5.5	41.8	14.9	3.3
65-CRL	Sheep/goat	<i>Ovis aries</i> or Capra hircus		-20.5	4.5	41.8	14.8	3.3
66-CRL	Dog	Canis familiaris		-19.1	9.8	42.6	15.0	3.3
67-CRL	Sheep/goat	Ovis aries or	With canid	-20.4	4.9	42.2	15.0	3.3

Capra hircus	gnaw marks	

241 **6. Discussion**

242 6.1. Sărata Monteoru

243 The average isotope values for all Sărata Monteoru individuals (n=54) were -19.5 \pm 0.3‰ 244 for δ^{13} C and +8.8 \pm 1.0‰ for δ^{15} N (**Table 1**, **Figure 3**). This is consistent with a terrestrial 245 diet based on C₃ plants and plant consumers.

246 While the δ^{13} C range is relatively small (-20.1‰ to -18.8‰), there is significant variation 247 in δ^{15} N values (from +5.8‰ to +11.1‰). The highest and lowest δ^{15} N values generally 248 belong to juveniles (here defined as between 0-15 years), although excluding the juveniles 249 has little effect on mean δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values (-19.5‰ ±0.2‰ and +8.7‰ ±0.8‰, 250 respectively).

Burial no. 40 (17–19-year-old female) is an outlier, with an exceptionally low δ^{15} N value 251 252 of +5.8%. The quality indicators for this sample are within accepted limits and, if not due to contamination or measurement error, this result would imply an almost exclusively 253 254 plant-based diet. For modern vegans, hair keratin δ^{15} N values as low as +5.5‰ have been 255 reported (Petzke et al., 2005; see also O'Connell and Hedges, 1999), but since human hair has been shown to be on average 0.86% lower in δ^{15} N than bone collagen from the same 256 257 individual (O'Connell et al., 2001), none of the modern vegans would likely have had bone collagen values as low as that seen in the Sărata Monteoru outlier. 258

- Among adolescents (here defined as from the age 15 onwards) and adults, 17 females and
- 12 males could be identified. The average values for adult females (-19.6‰ ±0.3‰; +8.6‰ ±1.0‰) and males (-19.4‰ ±0.2‰; +8.9‰ ±0.6‰) were similar; removing the outlier (burial 40) mentioned above from the female group would result in almost identical mean δ^{15} N values for both groups (mean female δ^{15} N without the outlier is +8.8‰ ±0.6). With or without the outlier, there were no statistically significant differences in δ^{13} C or δ^{15} N related to the sex of the individual (Mann-Whitney U test, p>0.05 for both variables).
- δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values also showed no statistically significant differences between 266 267 juveniles, adolescents and adults (Kruskal-Wallis H test, p>0.05 for both variables). 268 However, the difference would be statistically significant if juveniles were separated into two groups: those under 4 years old (n=9, mean values of -19.3‰ and +9.7‰); and those 269 270 over 4 years old (n=8, mean values of -19.8‰ and +7.9‰) (Kruskal-Wallis H test, H=7.392, d.f.=2, p=0.025 for δ^{13} C, and H=10.739, d.f.=2, p=0.005 for δ^{15} N; post hoc 271 analyses showed the difference to lie between the younger and older juvenile groups for 272 273 both δ^{13} C [p=0.022] and δ^{15} N [p=0.003]).
- The higher $\delta^{15}N$ (and $\delta^{13}C$) values of infants reflect the well-documented breastfeeding effect (see Fuller et al., 2006). Here, infants display $\delta^{15}N$ values up to 2.5‰ higher (and up to 1.2‰ for $\delta^{13}C$) compared to the female mean, with elevated values starting to drop from age 3 years onwards.
- The lower δ^{15} N values for older juveniles have been documented in other studies (e.g. Richards et al., 2002; Nitsch et al., 2011), and are sometimes attributed to the childhood diet containing lower trophic-level foods (e.g. cereals) as weaning foods (Tsutaya and Yoneda, 2013). An alternative explanation for the observed lower δ^{15} N values of older children involves the influence of positive nitrogen balance during growth (Katzenberg and Lovell, 1999; Fuller et al., 2004). However, Waters-Rist and Katzenberg (2010)

284 concluded that the effects of growth (i.e. positive nitrogen balance) are too minor to 285 significantly affect δ^{15} N values in juvenile bone collagen.

The quality and quantity of grave goods has traditionally been associated with social 286 287 status, with a more impressive funerary inventory taken as an indicator for wealth, power 288 and/or prestige. However, differentiating burials based on the number of grave goods is 289 subjective, as the quantity of grave goods and their value to the deceased or to the people 290 who buried them may have been unrelated either to wealth or the status of the individual. 291 In the current project, a distinction was made between those buried without grave goods, 292 those buried with 'few' grave goods (consisting of only ceramic vessels or a single 293 artefact), and those buried with a 'rich' inventory (consisting of two or more artefacts, at 294 least one of which was made from a material other than ceramics). The isotope data show 295 no statistically significant differences between any of these groups (p>0.05 for all 296 variables). The lack of a correlation between isotope ratios and the number of grave goods 297 implies that those members of the community buried without grave goods did not consume 298 significantly (i.e. isotopically) different diets from those buried with funerary objects.

300 6.2. Cârlomănești

301 The average isotope values for all Cârlomănești individuals (n=10) were -19.3‰ ($\pm 0.2\%$) for δ^{13} C and +9.6‰ (±0.4‰) for δ^{15} N (**Table 1**, **Figure 3**). Cârlomănești human values 302 303 display a more restricted range compared to Sărata Monteoru, but this may be an effect of the small sample size. Given the small data set, no statistical analyses were conducted; 304 however, it is worth noting that the δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values of the one adult male individual 305 fall entirely within the range of the four females from the same site. The Cârlomănesti 306 sample set did not include any infants (i.e. those under 4 years of age), but mean values for 307 308 older juveniles (n=4) and adults/adolescents (n=6) follow a similar trend to Sărata Monteoru where adult δ^{15} N values are slightly higher than those of younger individuals. 309 310 All individuals analysed from Cârlomănesti were buried with grave goods, but there are no 311 clear differences in the isotope values of burials according to the number or type of items included in the grave. 312

313

299

314 6.3. Faunal isotope values

Cârlomănești faunal samples (n=38) showed a much wider range of δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values 315 (-13.5% to -22.1% for δ^{13} C, +2.8% to +9.9% for δ^{15} N) compared to Sărata Monteoru 316 (n=17) (-18.9% to -20.7% for $\delta^{13}C$, +5.4% to +9.8% for $\delta^{15}N$), however, the two ranges 317 318 overlap and the mean values for livestock (cattle, caprines, pigs) from the two sites are not statistically different (Cârlomănești -19.6% [±1.7%], +6.3% [±0.9%]; Sărata Monteoru 319 -19.7% [±0.5%], +6.7% [±1.1%], for δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N, respectively) (**Table 2**). The greater 320 321 range for Cârlomănești may be influenced by the larger sample size, or by the 322 archaeological material originating from various Monteoru-era layers of the settlement site

323 (and thus potentially representing a longer period).

There is considerable variation in faunal δ^{15} N values for both sites, and in δ^{13} C values for Cârlomănești. Some of the higher δ^{15} N values may originate from suckling animals (which would thus display the nursing effect), or from selective consumption of manured plants with elevated δ^{15} N values. The lowest δ^{15} N values were seen in wild herbivores but also in (some) horses. δ^{13} C values for herbivores were generally consistent with diets based on C₃ plants. However, there are several outliers, all from Cârlomănești: two caprines (sheep or goat) have δ^{13} C values of -16.4‰ and -17.1‰, which suggest a significant contribution to

- diet from C₄ resources; while one pig has the highest δ^{13} C value (-13.5‰) of any sample 331 332 analysed. Since none of the humans nor any of the other ungulates display such high $\delta^{13}C$ 333 values, it seems likely these animals were distinct from the 'regular' Monteoru herds, 334 suggesting there was movement of livestock over large distances through long-distance 335 herding, trade activities, or gift exchange; alternatively, the outliers could represent 336 wild/feral forms. A fourth outlier is another caprine with a δ^{13} C value of -22.1‰, >1‰ 337 lower than measured in any other faunal sample from either site (including the two wild herbivores with δ^{13} C values as low as -20.8‰). 338
- 339 Dogs were kept already by the Mesolithic fishing communities of the Iron Gates 340 (Bökönyi, 1972), and their importance in Monteoru society is reinforced by their constant 341 presence in archaeozoological assemblages from the Carpathians from the Eneolithic 342 onwards (Becker, 1999, 2000). Dog isotope values from both sites are similar to those of humans (on average -19.4 $\pm 0.3\%$ [δ^{13} C]; +9.2 $\pm 0.7\%$ [δ^{15} N]), while their δ^{15} N values are 343 significantly higher than those of the (domestic and wild) herbivores analysed (Kruskal-344 345 Wallis H test, H=26.626, d.f.=5, p<0.0001). These data are consistent with the dogs 346 having been fed (or allowed to scavenge) on human food waste that included a significant 347 amount of animal protein, and this is supported by numerous finds from Monteoru 348 settlements of animal bones (e.g. of cattle, pig, caprines) with canid gnaw marks (Becker, 349 1999, 2000), including three bones from Cârlomănești (two caprines and one suid) 350 sampled for the current study (Aguraiuja, personal observation). While Becker (2000) 351 reported cut-marks on canid bones from Monteoru culture sites (including Sărata Monteoru), the similarity of dog-human δ^{15} N ratios suggests that dog meat was not 352 353 consumed in significant quantities by humans here.
- 354

355 6.4. Inter-site differences

The mean isotope values for all humans from Sărata Monteoru (-19.5‰ ±0.3‰ for δ^{13} C and +8.8‰ ±1.0‰ for δ^{15} N) and Cârlomănești (-19.3‰ ±0.2‰ and +9.6‰ ±0.4‰) are statistically significantly different for δ^{15} N (Mann-Whitney U test, U=447, p=0.001) but not for δ^{13} C (Mann-Whitney U test, U=370, p=0.063), and this is also true when juvenile individuals are excluded. If the youngest individuals (i.e. under 4-year-olds) are excluded, then the differences are statistically significant for both δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N (p<0.02 for both variables).

363 The Sărata Monteoru population is characterised by slightly lower average δ^{13} C and 364 noticeably lower δ^{15} N values compared to Cârlomănești. These differences are unlikely to 365 be due to variations in local baseline isotope values, since faunal isotope values from the 366 two sites are similar. **Figure 3** displays the average values for humans (excluding 367 juveniles) from both sites with 1SD error bars, plotted against mean values for animals 368 from both sites (excluding the above-mentioned outliers in the faunal data set with unusual 369 δ^{13} C values).

- At Sărata Monteoru, cattle and caprines the principal livestock species, according to their dominance in Monteoru archaeozoological assemblages (see Becker, 1999, 2000) – have average δ^{15} N values 2.3‰ lower than humans, while for Cârlomănești Δ^{15} N between livestock and human averages is 3.6‰. Given livestock δ^{15} N values are similar between the two sites, the higher human δ^{15} N values for Cârlomănești can be explained in several ways:
- A. The inhabitants of the earlier site, Cârlomăneşti, regularly consumed more animal
 protein than the later, Sărata Monteoru, community;

378 379 380 381	B. The two populations had diets with similar amounts of animal protein, but the inhabitants of Sărata Monteoru consumed much more animal protein in the form of dairy products, which tend to be slightly depleted in both ¹³ C and ¹⁵ N compared to meat from the same animal (Nardoto et al., 2006; Huelsemann et al., 2013);
382 383 384	C. Both communities consumed similar proportions of plant and animal protein but the Cârlomănești community grew plant food for human consumption with the aid of intensive manuring;
385 386 387 388	D. Both communities consumed similar amounts of animal protein, but the inhabitants of Cârlomănești had a strong preference for meat from very young (suckling) animals or pork from pigs that were stall fed on food waste containing animal protein and/or protein from crops grown under intensive manuring;
389 390	E. Since Cârlomănești was much closer to the Buzău River, its inhabitants had greater access to freshwater fish.
391 392 393 394 395	Hypotheses D and E lack support from the archaeofaunal data, and so are considered unlikely. Moreover, if pigs were reared on food waste, this is more likely to have occurred at Sărata Monteoru given the comparatively high δ^{15} N values of the pigs from that site (Table 2).
396	6.5. Quantitative diet reconstruction
397 398 399 400	To further explore intra-site differences, we used the Bayesian statistical program FRUITS (Food Reconstruction Using Transferred Isotopic Signals, beta 2.1.1) (Fernandes et al., 2014) to model the diets of the skeletal populations from Sărata Monteoru and Cârlomănești.
401 402 403 404	Using FRUITS, it is possible to consider more than two food groups, as well as factors such as differences in protein content between food groups. The program calculates probability estimates of the proportions of different foods in diet, given the consumer's stable isotope values and those of the different food groups.
405 406 407 408 409 410 411 412	We assumed that Bronze Age diets at Cârlomănești and Sărata Monteoru comprised three food groups: animals, cereals and legumes. The population means (excluding juveniles) were used as the consumer values. For animals, the site average for the most commonly utilized domesticated species (cattle and caprines, excluding outliers) was used. In the absence of local plant baseline data, published isotope values of Neolithic crops from Germany, Hungary and Bulgaria (Fraser et al., 2011, 2013; Bogaard et al., 2013; Bogaard, 2015) were used as proxies. Based on these published data, cereal values were set as -24‰ and +2‰, and legume values as -24‰ and 0‰, for δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N, respectively.
413 414 415 416 417 418 419 420	Two different scenarios were modelled – <i>unmanured plants</i> with 'typical' δ^{15} N values for cereals and legumes (see above), and <i>manured plants</i> with more elevated values observed in the same plants grown under intensive manuring – to allow for the possibility that regular manuring of crops intended for human consumption may have influenced the human δ^{15} N data. The values for manured plants were set as +5‰ for cereals and +2‰ for legumes, based on data from Bogaard et al. (2013), Fraser et al. (2011, 2013), and Bogaard (2015).
421 422	Table 3. Base values applied in the FRUITS model: consumer value (site average), the different food groups, and their fractions for each dietary proxy (^{13}C , ^{15}N) along with their

associated uncertainty (‰) (set as 1-sigma error for consumers and animals, and ± 0.5 for values that were not directly measured)

	Sărata M	onteoru	Cârlom	iănești
	δ ¹³ C (‰)	δ ¹⁵ N (‰)	δ ¹³ C (‰)	δ ¹⁵ N (‰)
Consumer	-19.5 ± 0.2	8.7 ± 0.8	-19.4 ± 0.1	9.8 ± 0.4
Food groups				
Animal	-19.7 ± 0.6	6.4 ± 0.7	-20.2 ± 0.4	6.2 ± 1.0
Cereal (manured)	-24 ± 0.5	5 ± 0.5	-24 ± 0.5	5 ± 0.5
Cereal (unmanured)	-24 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5	-24 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5
Legume (manured)	-24 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5	-24 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5
Legume (unmanured)	-24 ± 0.5	0 ± 0.5	-24 ± 0.5	0 ± 0.5
Food values				
Animal protein	-21.7 ± 0.6	8.4 ± 0.7	-22.2 ± 0.4	8.2 ± 1.0
Animal energy	$\textbf{-27.7}\pm0.6$	N/A	-28.2 ± 0.4	N/A
Cereal (manured) protein	-26 ± 0.5	5 ± 0.5	-26 ± 0.5	5 ± 0.5
Cereal (manured) energy	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A
Cereal (unmanured) protein	-26 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5	-26 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5
Cereal (unmanured) energy	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A
Legume (manured) protein	-26 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5	-26 ± 0.5	2 ± 0.5
Legume (manured) energy	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A
Legume (unmanured) protein	-26 ± 0.5	0 ± 0.5	-26 ± 0.5	0 ± 0.5
Legume (unmanured) energy	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A	-23.5 ± 0.5	N/A
Offsets	4.8 ± 0.5	5 ± 1	4.8 ± 0.5	5 ± 1

425

426 The isotopic composition of food group macronutrients was calculated based on 427 previously reported offsets between macronutrient and collagen isotope values, 428 summarized in Fernandes et al. (2014, 2015). For terrestrial animal meat, the offsets are Δ^{13} Cprotein-collagen = -2‰, Δ^{13} Cenergy-collagen = -8‰, Δ^{15} Nprotein-collagen = +2‰; for cereal crops 429 and legumes $\Delta^{13}C_{\text{protein-collagen}} = -2\%$, $\Delta^{13}C_{\text{energy-collagen}} = +0.5\%$. The diet-to-collagen 430 isotopic offsets for δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N were set as 4.8±0.5‰ (Fernandes et al., 2012) and 431 5±1‰ (Hedges and Revnard, 2007; O'Connell et al., 2012), respectively. The full list of 432 parameter values used for the two sites and for both scenarios is given in Table 3. 433

434 **Table 4** provides an overview of the estimates generated by FRUITS for the four different 435 scenarios. Scenarios 1 (Sărata Monteoru) and 3 (Cârlomănești) take into account the 436 potential manuring effect on both cereals and legumes, reflected in higher plant $\delta^{15}N$ values: scenarios 2 (Sărata Monteoru) and 4 (Cârlomănesti) consider unmanured values 437 for plants. The estimates represent calorie contributions for each food group, the calorie 438 contribution from each food fraction, and the calorie contribution of each food group 439 toward an isotopic proxy (either ¹³C or ¹⁵N). The estimates for ¹³C and ¹⁵N differ due to 440 441 the former including a routed carbon contribution from energy (i.e. carbohydrates and 442 lipids). The margin of error on individual estimates ranges between 12% and 25%, which 443 demands caution when interpreting the results. Combining the data for Proxy (Food) (%) 444 would reduce the errors to between 10% and 15% (see Table 4).

445

446 Table 4. Estimates generated by FRUITS (%) with 1-sigma error for Sărata Monteoru
447 and Cârlomăneşti populations and for both dietary scenarios. Energy includes both lipids

and carbohydrates. The estimates represent calorie contributions for each food group
(Food [%]), the calorie contribution from each food fraction (Fraction [%]), and the
calorie contribution of each food group toward an isotopic proxy (¹³C, ¹⁵N, and the
weighted mean of the two) (Proxy [%])

	Sărata	Monteoru	Cârlomănești		
	Scenario 1 (manured)	Scenario 2 (unmanured)	Scenario 3 (manured)	Scenario 4 (unmanured)	
Food (%)					
Animal	19 ± 14	29 ± 15	27 ± 18	37 ± 16	
Cereal	35 ± 24	38 ± 24	41 ± 25	40 ± 24	
Legume	46 ± 21	33 ± 19	32 ± 19	23 ± 16	
Fraction (%)					
Protein	21 ± 4	21 ± 4	20 ± 4	21 ± 4	
Energy	79 ± 4	79 ± 4	80 ± 4	79 ± 4	
Proxy (Food) (%)					
¹³ C (Animal)	21 ± 15	32 ± 15	30 ± 18	41 ± 16	
¹³ C (Cereal)	31 ± 23	33 ± 23	37 ± 24	35 ± 23	
¹³ C (Legume)	48 ± 21	35 ± 19	33 ± 19	24 ± 16	
¹⁵ N (Animal)	26 ± 17	40 ± 16	37 ± 20	51 ± 16	
¹⁵ N (Cereal)	20 ± 18	22 ± 19	25 ± 21	22 ± 18	
¹⁵ N (Legume)	54 ± 20	38 ± 19	38 ± 20	27 ± 16	
Combined ¹³ C+ ¹⁵ N					
Animal	23 ± 11	36 ± 11	33 ± 13	46 ± 11	
Cereal	24 ± 14	26 ± 15	30 ± 16	27 ± 14	
Legume	51 ± 14	36 ± 13	35 ± 14	25 ± 11	

453 Despite the large error range, there are apparent differences in the model estimates for 454 both sites depending on whether values for manured or unmanured plants were used. Based on high crop δ^{15} N values, some authors (e.g. Bogaard et al., 2013; Fraser et al., 455 2013; Vaiglova et al., 2014; Bogaard, 2015) have proposed that manuring was widely 456 practised among Central and Southeast European farmers since the Neolithic. However, 457 Monteoru settlements were often located on fertile black earth (chernozem) soils which 458 459 tend to maintain their fertility naturally without frequent manuring. While this does not 460 exclude the possibility that low-intensity manuring occurred incidentally, i.e. by animals 461 grazing near the farmlands or on fallow fields, without direct data from associated plant remains it is impossible to determine the real effect (if any) of manuring on Monteoru 462 δ^{15} N values. 463

464 As suggested above from the Δ^{15} N_{human-herbivore} values for each site, the model predicts 465 greater reliance on animal products at Cârlomănești. Irrespective of whether manured or 466 unmanured scenarios are compared, the contribution of animal-based foods to total calorie 467 intake, total dietary protein and total dietary energy on average are 10–14% greater for 468 Cârlomănești compared to Sărata Monteoru. When lower plant δ^{15} N values, characteristic 469 of unmanured crops, are used the model predicts on average ca. 15% greater importance in 470 both sites of animal-based protein compared to legume-derived protein.

For both sites, the model predicts that plant foods accounted for most of the calories
consumed, and in most scenarios plant protein also accounted for more than half of total
protein intake. Estimates for the cereal food group showed the least variability, suggesting

474similar contributions for both sites, irrespective of the presence or absence of a manuring475effect on plant δ^{15} N values. Manured values led to greater estimated contributions from476legumes to total calorie intake, with scenario 1 (Sărata Monteoru, manured plants)477displaying the highest contribution of legumes to both total calorie intake (ca. 46%) and to478dietary protein (ca. 54%). Even at Cârlomănești, for which the model predicts a lower479contribution from legumes, they are still estimated to account for at least a quarter of total480calorie intake, and to contribute significantly to dietary protein.

481 Based on archaeobotanical evidence from Southeast Europe from the Neolithic onwards, 482 the protein-rich legumes were grown on a consistent basis throughout the region, although 483 they are usually reported in smaller numbers compared to remains of wheat and barley 484 (e.g. Gyulai, 1993; Cârciumaru, 1996; Monah, 2007; Reed, 2013). According to Bonsall et 485 al. (2007), ethnohistorical sources suggest that a typical peasant farming society in 486 Southeast Europe commonly received most of their sustenance from cultivated plants such as cereals, legumes and fruits, with only a modest contribution from dairy products (meat 487 488 was regarded as luxury). This is in accordance with the model's predictions for the two 489 Monteoru sites

490 While the modelled estimates have large associated uncertainties, the results nevertheless 491 suggest differences in the way dietary resources were utilized between the two sites, and 492 possibly, also between the Early and Late Monteoru periods. The most likely 493 interpretation of the available data involves a modest decrease at later-period Sărata 494 Monteoru in dependence on animal-derived products and a greater reliance on plant 495 carbohydrates for energy, with legumes increasing in importance as a source of dietary 496 protein over animal protein. This trend seems consistent when comparing scenarios 1 and 497 3 (both sites, manured plants), 2 and 4 (both sites, unmanured plants), 1 and 4 (Sărata 498 Monteoru manured, Cârlomănesti unmanured), but does not hold in comparisons between 499 scenarios 2 and 3 (Sărata Monteoru unmanured, Cârlomănești manured).

500 Given the similarities of the palaeoecological and archaeological material recovered from 501 each site, a significant change in economic activities is an unlikely explanation for the 502 observed differences. While no clear trend can be discerned between Early and Middle 503 Bronze Age faunal assemblages from the Monteoru culture area, available 504 archaeozoological evidence for the Eneolithic and Bronze Age Carpathians does indicate a 505 shift from caprine to cattle husbandry during the Bronze Age, with cattle becoming the dominant species by the Late Bronze Age (Becker, 1999, 2000). The rise in the 506 507 importance of cattle husbandry during the Carpathian Bronze Age may have increased the 508 amount of milk available for dairy products; alternatively, a rise in the popularity of, or 509 developments, in dairying may have led to the preferential keeping of cows. The maturity 510 of cattle in several middle Danube sites during the second millennium BC has also been taken to imply an important role for dairy cows (Barker, 1989). Additionally, as animals 511 512 kept for dairying would be slaughtered less often than those kept for meat, it would 513 presumably reduce the amount of (cattle) meat consumed – and the calories obtained from 514 animal products. It is thus possible that a change in dietary practices between the Early 515 and Late Monteoru periods as represented by the two sites included in this study may have 516 involved a shift from a more meat-based economy to a more dairy- and plant-based 517 economy.

518

519 7. Conclusions

520 The results from stable carbon and nitrogen isotope analyses for Monteoru culture humans 521 and fauna reflect a dietary regime that was dominated by C₃ terrestrial resources. The

521 and radia reflect a dictary regime that was dominated by C_3 effectivitian resources. The 522 Sărata Monteoru population is characterised by significantly lower average $\delta^{15}N$ and

523 slightly lower average δ^{13} C compared to Cârlomănesti. Since faunal isotope values from

- 524 the two sites are similar (excluding the outliers with relatively high δ^{13} C values, which
- 525 could reflect movement of livestock over large distances), these differences are unlikely to
- be due to variation in local baseline isotope values. Estimates generated by FRUITS
 suggest that while plant foods both cereals and legumes were an important source of
- calories and dietary protein throughout the Monteoru period, inhabitants of the earlier
 settlement, Cârlomănești, were more dependent on animal-derived products compared to
 the population sampled from Sărata Monteoru.
- 531 The difference in the average δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values of the two skeletal populations 532 suggests a change in economic activities between the early and late phases of the 533 Monteoru culture, possibly characterised by a shift from a more meat-based economy to a 534 more dairy- and plant-based economy. However, as this is only the first major stable 535 isotope study conducted on osteological material from the Romanian Sub-Carpathians, 536 more data are needed to determine whether the observed shift is a true temporal trend or 537 merely reflects site-specific dietary preferences.
- 538 Interpretation of the stable isotope data are constrained by the lack of associated plant 539 remains, which are necessary to clarify the issue of the effects of manuring on human and 540 faunal isotope ratios. There is also a need for paired ¹⁴C and stable isotope measurements 541 to more fully explore changes in dietary practices throughout the Carpathian Bronze Age. 542 Further work is underway to explore other aspects of Monteoru culture subsistence,
- 543 including sulphur isotope analysis (to investigate mobility of livestock) and incremental
- 544 analysis of teeth dentine (to elucidate weaning practices).

545 546

547 Acknowledgments: The research was supported by the NERC Isotope Geosciences Facilities

- 548 Steering Committee (grant number IP-1611-0516), and the Kristjan Jaak Scholarship
- 549 programme (funded and managed by the Archimedes Foundation in collaboration with the
- 550 Ministry of Education and Research in Estonia; grant number 16-4.2/853). We thank Prof.
- 551 Gordon Cook and an anonymous reviewer for constructive comments and suggestions that
- have improved the text, and Alan Dalton and Dr Catriona Pickard for assistance with
- 553 collagen pretreatment.

- 554 References
- 555
- 556 Ambrose, S. H., 1990. Preparation and characterization of bone and tooth collagen for 557 isotopic analysis. J. Arch. Sci. 17, 431–451.
- 558 Ambrose, S. H., DeNiro, M. J., 1986. The isotopic ecology of East African mammals.
- 559 Oecologica. 69, 395–406.
- 560 Barker, G., 1989. Prehistoric farming in Europe. Cambridge University Press.
- Bartosiewicz, L., 2013. Animals in Bronze Age Europe, in: Fokkens, H., Harding, A. (Eds),
 The Oxford Handbook of the European Bronze Age. Oxford University Press, Oxford, pp.
 328–347.
- Bârzu, L., 1989. La station de Sărata-Monteoru: La nécropole n° 4 de l'époque de bronze.
 Dacia N.S. 33, 39–78.
- 566 Becker, C., 1999. Domesticated and wild animals as evidenced in the Eneolithic–Bronze Age
- 567 cultures Cotofeni and Monteoru, Romania, in: Benecke, N. (Ed.), The Holocene history of
- the European Vertebrate Fauna: Modern aspects of research, workshop held 6-9th April 1998
- 569 in Berlin, Archäologie in Eurasien 6. Rahden/Westf., Leidorf, pp. 91–105.
- 570 Becker, C., 2000. Subsistenzstrategien während der frühen Metallzeit im zentralkarpatischen
- Raum neue archäozoologische Daten zur Coţofeni- und Monteoru-Kultur. Praehistorische
 Zeitschrift. 75(1), 63–92.
- 573 Bocherens, H., Drucker, D., 2003. Trophic level isotopic enrichment of carbon and
- 574 nitrogen in bone collagen: case studies from recent and ancient terrestrial ecosystems.
- 575 Int. J. Osteoarchaeol. 13, 46–53.
- Bogaard, A., 2015. New insights into early farming practice and diet from stable isotope
 analysis of crop assemblages, in: Brink, K., Hydén, S., Jennbert, K., Larsson, L., Olausson,
 D. (Eds), Neolithic diversities: perspectives from a conference in Lund, Sweden. Acta
 Archaeologica Lundensia, 8(65), pp. 33-42.
- 580 Bogaard, A., Fraser, R., Heaton, T. H. E., Wallace, M., Vaiglova, P., Charles, M., Jones, G.,
- 581 Evershed, R. P., Styring, A. K., Andersen, N. H., Arbogast, R.-M., Bartosiewicz, L., 582 Gardeisen, A., Kanstrup, M., Maier, U., Marinova, E., Ninov, L., Schäfer, M., Stephan, E.,
- 583 2013. Crop manuring and intensive land management by Europe's first farmers. PNAS.
 584 110(31), 12589–12594.
- Bökönyi, S., 1972. The vertebrate fauna, in: Srejović, D. (Ed.), Europe's First Monumental
 Sculpture. New Discoveries at Lepenski Vir. Stein and Day, pp. 186–189.
- Bonsall, C., Lennon, R., McSweeney, K., Stewart, C., Harkness, D., Boroneant, V.,
 Bartosiewicz, L., Payton, R., Chapman, J., 1997. Mesolithic and Early Neolithic in the Iron
 Gates: a palaeodietary perspective. Journal of European Archaeology. 5(1), 50–92.
- Bonsall, C., Cook, G., Hedges, R., Higham, T., Pickard, C., Radovan, I., 2004. Radiocarbon
 and stable isotope evidence of dietary change from the Mesolithic to the Middle Ages in the
 Iron Gates: new results from Lepenski Vir. Radiocarbon. 46(1), 293–300.

- 593 Bonsall, C., Horvat, M., McSweeney, K., Masson, M., Higham, T. F., Pickard, C., Cook, G.
- 594 T., 2007. Chronological and dietary aspects of the human burials from Ajdovska Cave, 595 Slovenia. Radiocarbon. 49(2), 727–740.
- 596 Borić, D., Grupe, G., Peters, J., Mikić, Ž., 2004. Is the Mesolithic–Neolithic subsistence 597 dichotomy real? New stable isotope evidence from the Danube Gorges. European Journal of 598 Archaeology. 7(3), 221–248.
- 599 Cârciumaru, M., 1983. Considerații paleobotanice și contribuții la agricultura geto-dacilor.
 600 Thraco-Dacica. 4, 126–134.
- 601 Cârciumaru, M., 1996. Paleoetnobotanica. Iași.
- 602 Cook, G.T., Bonsall, C., Hedges, R. E., McSweeney, K., Boroneant, V., Pettitt, P. B., 2001.
- 603 A freshwater diet-derived 14 C reservoir effect at the Stone Age sites in the Iron Gates Gorge. 604 Radiocarbon. 43(2A), 453–460.
- Fernandes, R., Nadeau, M.- J., Grootes, P. M., 2012. Macronutrient-based model for dietary carbon routing in bone collagen and bioapatite. Archaeol. Anthrop. Sci. 4(4), 291–301.
- 607 Fernandes, R., Millard A. R., Brabec, M., Nadeau, M.-J., Grootes, P., 2014. Food 608 Reconstruction Using Isotopic Transferred Signals (FRUITS): a Bayesian model for diet 609 reconstruction. PLoS ONE. 9(2), e87436.
- 610 Fernandes, R., Grootes, P., Nadeau, M.-J., Nehlich, O., 2015. Quantitative diet reconstruction
- 611 of a Neolithic population using a Bayesian mixing model (FRUITS): the case study of Ostorf (Cormany) Am L Phys. Anthropol. 158(2) 225, 240
- 612 (Germany). Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 158(2), 325–340.
- 613 Fraser, R. A., Bogaard, A., Heaton, T., Charles, M., Jones, G., Christensen, B. T., Halstead,
- 614 P., Merbach, I., Poulton, P. R., Sparkes, D., Styring, A. K., 2011. Manuring and stable
- 615 isotope ratios in cereals and pulses: towards a new archaeobotanical approach to the inference
- 616 of land use and dietary practices. J. Archaeol. Sci. 38, 2790–2804.
- Fraser, R. A., Bogaard, A., Schäfer, M., Arbogast, R., Heaton, T. H., 2013. Integrating
 botanical, faunal and human stable carbon and nitrogen isotope values to reconstruct land use
 and palaeodiet at LBK Vaihingen an der Enz, Baden-Württemberg. World Archaeology.
 45(3), 492–517.
- 621 Fuller, B. T., Fuller. J. L., Sage, N. E., Harris, D. A., O'Connell, T. C., Hedges, R. E. M., 622 2004. Nitrogen balance and δ^{15} N: Why you're not what you eat during pregnancy. Rapid 623 Communications in Mass Spectrometry. 18, 2889–2896.
- 624 Fuller, B. T., Fuller, J. L., Harris, D. A., Hedges, R.E.M., 2006. Detection of breastfeeding
- and weaning in modern human infants with carbon and nitrogen stable isotope ratios. Am. J.
 Phys. Anthropol. 129, 279–293.
- Fuller, B. T., Müldner, G., Van Neer, W., Ervynck, A., Richards, M. P., 2012. Carbon and
 nitrogen stable isotope ratio analysis of freshwater, brackish and marine fish from Belgian
 archaeological sites (1st and 2nd millennium AD). J. Anal. At. Spectrom. 27, 807–820.
- Gyulai, F., 1993. Environment and agriculture in Bronze Age Hungary. Archaeolingua, 4,Budapest.
- Harding, A. F. 2000. European societies in the Bronze Age. Cambridge University Press,Cambridge.

- Hedges, R. E. M., Reynard, L. M., 2007. Nitrogen isotopes and the trophic level of humans in
 archaeology. J. Archaeol. Sci. 34, 1240–1251.
- 636 Huelsemann, F., Koehler, K., Braun, H., Schaenzer, W., Flenker, U., 2013. Human dietary 637 δ^{15} N intake: representative data for principle food items. Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 152, 58–66.
- Katzenberg, M. A., Lovell, N. C., 1999. Stable isotope variation in pathological bone. Int. J.
 Osteoarchaeol. 9, 316–324.
- Lightfoot, E., Šlaus, M., O'Connell, T. C., 2012. Changing cultures, changing cuisines:
 cultural transitions and dietary change in Iron Age, Roman, and Early Medieval Croatia. Am.
 J. Phys. Anthropol. 148(4), 543–556.
- Lightfoot, E., Šlaus, M., Šikanjić, P. R., O'Connell, T. C., 2015. Metals and millets: Bronze
 and Iron Age diet in inland and coastal Croatia seen through stable isotope analysis.
 Archaeol. Anthropol. Sci. 7(3), 375–386.
- Maximilian, C., 1962. Sărata-Monteoru. Studiu Antropologic. Academia Republicii Populare
 Romîne.
- 648 Monah, F., 2007. The spread of cultivated plants in the region between the Carpathians and 649 Dniester, 6th-4th millennia cal BC, in: Colledge, S., Conolly, J. (Eds.), The Origins and
- 650 Spread of Domestic Plants in Southwest Asia and Europe. University College, London, 651 Institute of Archaeology pp. 111–123
- Institute of Archaeology, pp. 111–123.
- Motuzaite-Matuzeviciute, G., Staff, R. A., Hunt, H. V., Liu, X., Jones, M. K., 2013. The early chronology of broomcorn millet (*Panicum miliaceum*) in Europe. Antiquity. 87(338), 1073–
- 654 1085.
 - Motzoi-Chicideanu, I., 1995. Fremdgüter im Monteoru-Kulturraum, in: Hänsel, B. (Ed.),
 Handel, Tausch und Verkehr im bronze- und eisenzeitlichen Südosteuropa, SüdosteuropaSchr. 17, Prähistorische Archäologie in Südosteuropa 11. Berlin, pp. 219–242.
 - Motzoi-Chicideanu, I., 2011. Obiceiuri funerare in epoca bronzului la Dunărea Mijlocie și
 Inferioară. Editura Academiei Române, București.
 - 660 Motzoi-Chicideanu, I., Chicideanu-Şandor, M., 2015. Câteva date noi privind cronologia 661 culturii Monteoru. Mousaios. 20, 9–53.
 - Motzoi-Chicideanu et al. 2012a = Motzoi-Chicideanu, I., Chicideanu-Şandor, M.,
 Constantinescu, M., 2012. Observatii prelimina reprivind cercetările efectuate în anii 2008–
 2009, 2011–2012 la cimitirul din epoca bronzului de la Cârlomănesti. Mousaios. 17, 47–61.
 - Motzoi-Chicideanu et al. 2012b = Motzoi-Chicideanu, I., Matei, S., Gugiu, D., 2012. O piesă
 de harnaşament din epoca bronzului descoperită la Cârlomăneşti-Cetățuia. Mousaios. 17, 65–
 95.
 - 668 Murray, M. L., Schoeninger, M. J., 1988. Diet, status, and complex social structure in Iron
 - Age Central Europe: some contributions of bone chemistry, in: Tribe and Polity in Late
 - 670 Prehistoric Europe. Springer, US, pp. 155–176.
 - 671 Nardoto, G. B., Silva, S., Kendall, C., Ehleringer, J. R., Chesson, L. A., Ferraz, E. S. B.,
 - Moreira, M. Z., Ometto, J. P. H. B., Martinelli, L. A., 2006. Geographical patterns of human
 - diet derived from stable-isotope analysis of fingernails. Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 131, 137-
 - 674 146.

- Nehlich, O., Borić, D., Stefanović, S., Richards, M. P., 2010. Sulphur isotope evidence for freshwater fish consumption: a case study from the Danube Gorges, SE Europe. J. Archaeol.
- 677 Sci. 37(5), 1131–1139.
- Nestor, I., 1933. Der Stand der Vorgeschichtsforschung in Rumänien, 22, Bericht der
 Römisch-Germanischen Kommission.
- Nitsch, E. K., Humphrey, L. T., Hedges, R. E. M., 2011. Using stable isotope analysis to
 examine the effect of economic change on breastfeeding practices in Spitalfields, London,
 UK. Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 146, 619–628.
- O'Connell, T. C., Hedges, R. E. M., 1999. Investigations into the effect of diet on modern
 human hair isotope values. Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 108, 409–425.
- 685 O'Connell, T. C., Hedges, R. E. M., Healey, M. A., Simpson, A. H. R. W., 2001. Isotopic 686 comparison of hair, nail and bone: modern analyses. J. Archaeol. Sci. 28, 1247–1255.
- O'Connell, T. C., Kneale, C. J., Tasevska, N., Kuhnle, G. G. C., 2012. The diet-body offset in
 human nitrogen isotopic values: a controlled dietary study. Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 149,
 426–434.
- Petroutsa, E. I., Manolis, S. K., 2010. Reconstructing Late Bronze Age diet in mainland
 Greece using stable isotope analysis. J. Archaeol. Sci. 37, 614–620.
- Petzke, K. J., Boeing, H., Metges, C. C., 2005. Choice of dietary protein of vegetarians and
 omnivores is reflected in their hair protein ¹³C and ¹⁵N abundance. Rapid Communications in
 Mass Spectrometry. 19, 1392–1400.
- Reed, K. A., 2013. Farmers in transition: the archaeobotanical analysis of the Carpathian
 Basin from the Late Neolithic to the Late Bronze Age (5000–900 BC). Unpublished PhD
 dissertation, University of Leicester.
- Richards, M. P., Mays, S., Fuller, B. T., 2002. Stable carbon and nitrogen isotope values of
 bone and teeth reflect weaning age at the medieval Wharram Percy site, Yorkshire, UK. Am.
 J. Phys. Anthropol. 119, 205–210.
- 701 Schoeninger, M. J., DeNiro, M. J., 1984. Nitrogen and carbon isotopic composition
- of bone collagen from marine and terrestrial animals. Geochimica et CosmochimicaActa. 48, 625–639.
- Sealy, J. C., 2001. Body tissue chemistry and palaeodiet, in: Brothwell, D. R., Pollard, A. M.
 (Eds.), Handbook of Archaeological Sciences. Wiley, pp. 269–279.
- Stika, H.-P., Heiss, A. G., 2013. Plant cultivation in the Bronze Age, in: Fokkens, H.,
 Harding, A. (Eds), The Oxford Handbook of the European Bronze Age. Oxford University
 Press, Oxford, pp. 348–369.
- 709 Szpak, P., 2014. Complexities of nitrogen isotope biogeochemistry in plant-soil systems:
- implications for the study of ancient agricultural and animal management practices. Frontiersin Plant Science 5.
- 712 Triantaphyllou, S., Richards, M. P., Zerner, C., Voutsaki, S., 2008. Isotopic dietary
- reconstruction of humans from Middle Bronze age Lerna, Argolid, Greece. J. Archaeol. Sci.
 35(11), 3028–3034.

- 715 Tsutaya, T., Yoneda, M., 2013. Quantitative reconstruction of weaning ages in archaeological
- human populations using bone collagen nitrogen isotope ratios and approximate Bayesian
- 717 computation. PLoS ONE. 8(8), e72327.
- 718 Vaiglova, P., Bogaard, A., Collins, M., Cavanagh, W., Mee, C., Renard, J., Lamb, A.,
- 719 Gardeisen, A., Fraser, R., 2014. An integrated stable isotope study of plants and animals from
- 720 Kouphovouno, southern Greece: a new look at Neolithic farming. J. Archaeol. Sci. 42, 201–
- 721 215.
- van Klinken, G. J., 1999. Bone collagen quality indicators for palaeodietary and radiocarbon
 measurements. J. Archaeol. Sci. 26, 687–695.
- Vika, E., 2011. Diachronic dietary reconstructions in ancient Thebes, Greece: results from
 stable isotope analyses. J. Archaeol. Sci. 38(5), 1157–1163.
- 726 Vulpe, A., 1995. Epoca bronzului în spațiul carpato-dunărean, privire general, in: Petrescu
- Dâmbovița, M. (Ed.), Comori ale epocii bronzului în România. București, pp. 17–23..
- 728 Waters-Rist, A. L., Katzenberg, M. A., 2010. The effect of growth on stable nitrogen isotope
- ratios in subadult bone collagen. Int. J. Osteoarchaeol. 20, 172–191.