

Sonic Defiance: The deployment of song as active heritage in post-apartheid South Africa

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Humanities
University of the Witwatersrand

in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

BY

Margaretha Langa
(0614237M)

Plagiarism Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. I have used the author date convention for citation and referencing. Each contribution to, and quotation in this thesis from the work or works of other people have been acknowledged through citation and reference.

It is being submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other university.

.....

.....

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	i
Abstract	ii
List of abbreviations.....	iii
List of figures	v
Chapter One: Introduction.....	1
Aim	3
The research journey.....	10
The influence of the political landscape.....	10
The influence of interviews on my research journey	19
The thesis question	23
Rationale	26
Terminology in this thesis	30
Research methodologies	31
Interviewing	31
Discourse analysis.....	32
Observation	33
Outline of chapters	36
Chapter Two: Literature review: Heritage	38
Introduction.....	38
The battle between history and heritage	38
Oral history and memory	42
The counter-monument	49
Heritage in South Africa.....	52
The foundation myth and heritage frameworks	52
Intangible heritage in post-apartheid South Africa.....	57
Heritage and politics: A knotty relationship.....	59
Authorised heritage discourse and ownership of the struggle	61
Challenges arising from considering struggle songs heritage	62
Chapter Three: Tracing song's lineage.....	65
Introduction.....	65
The role of struggle songs during apartheid.....	65
Restraining song and its singers	67

Song as 'theatre'	72
Empowering song and its performers.....	76
Song as a weapon of struggle	81
The notion of culture as a weapon during apartheid.....	81
Song as a weapon of struggle after 1994.....	84
The genealogy of struggle songs	86
Song's dynamism	87
Reactivating the past in the present.....	88
The "poetic license" of song	92
Song and gender	93
Domain of leaders and 'ordinary' people	96
Song in other African countries	97
The deployment of song in post-apartheid South Africa	98
Song outside the party political: The utilisation of song by AIDS activists.....	99
The interpretation of song	100
The agency of song	100
Caught in the past and the present	101
Recreating the archive	102
Power in the postcolony	104

Chapter Four: The *Dubula ibhunu* trial: The emergence of new rules of

engagement in heritage battles	107
Introduction.....	107
Discourse Sociolinguistics	108
Power battles on the heritage stage.....	109
Context and intertextuality.....	110
The ideological work of discourse	111
Hegemony	113
Disorders of discourse	114
Institutional language use	115
Modality	116
Memory as an "active process"	116
Limits of this analysis	117
The value of Discourse Sociolinguistics	117
The <i>Dubula ibhunu</i> court case	117
Background	118
The participants: AfriForum and Malema	120

Recreating a new genealogy.....	122
An unlikely consensus	130
The consensus starts to crumble	136
The judge's history.....	140
Social-cohesion, nation-building and reconciliation	143
'Afrikaner' heritage and redress	147
Ownership of the struggle – and its songs.....	152
Land reform	157
A new life for <i>Dubula ibhunu</i>	162
Conclusion.....	165
Chapter Five: The road to Mangaung and beyond	167
Introduction.....	167
Zuma and the machine gun	168
Interpretations of <i>Umshini Wami</i>	171
A methodological framework for interpreting Mangaung's songs	180
The ANC's Mangaung Conference	186
The leadership contest.....	186
The role of song at Mangaung	187
The genealogy of Mangaung's songs	190
Language.....	191
Gestures	191
The songs of Mangaung	193
Zuma's long road	200
Following in Luthuli's footsteps	207
Conclusion	209
Chapter Six: The counter-monument goes to the museum	210
Introduction.....	210
The museum as institution.....	211
The Iziko Slave Lodge	213
Navigating the reconciliation and African Renaissance ideologies.....	215
<i>Singing Freedom</i> – an overview of the exhibition	217
Oral history: Getting to the heart of the narrative	221
Oral history: A way to avoid a dominant narrative	226
The intersection of song and memories	227
Song as “people's stories”	228

The treatment of song in the exhibition	229
Practical challenges regarding sound in the museum	230
The absence of performance in the museum	232
The treatment of the post-1994 deployment of song	235
Conclusion.....	236
 Chapter Seven: Conclusion	 238
 Bibliography	 247
 Appendices	 312
Appendix A: Ayanda Dlodlo Interview	312
Appendix B: Barry Gilder Interview	317
Appendix C: Noor Nieftagodien Interview	325
Appendix D: Albie Sachs Interview	335
Appendix E: Portia Serote Interview.....	344
Appendix F: Fanyane Tshabalala Interview	347
Appendix G: Paul Tichmann and Shanaaz Galant Interview	349