

1 The application of phage-based faecal pollution markers to predict the  
2 concentration of adenoviruses in mussels (*Mytilus edulis*) and their  
3 overlying waters

4

5

6

7

8 \*Olalemi, A.<sup>1,2</sup>, Purnell, S.<sup>1</sup>, Caplin, J.<sup>1</sup>, Ebdon, J.<sup>1</sup> and Taylor, H.<sup>1</sup>

9

10

11

12

13

14

15 <sup>1</sup>Environment and Public Health Research Group, School of Environment and Technology,  
16 University of Brighton, Moulsecoomb, Brighton, BN2 4GJ, UK.

17 <sup>2</sup>Department of Microbiology, Federal University of Technology, Akure, P.M.B 704, Akure,  
18 Ondo State, Nigeria.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25 Running head: Bacteriophages as surrogates of viral pathogens

26

27

28

29

30

31

32 Author for editorial correspondence:

33

34 \*Corresponding author

35 Adewale Olalemi

36 Department of Microbiology

37 School of Sciences

38 Federal University of Technology, Akure

39 Ondo State, Nigeria.

40 Phone: 234 908 131 8677

41 [waleolas2002@yahoo.com](mailto:waleolas2002@yahoo.com)

42 **Abstract**

43 **Aim:** This study set out to determine whether phage-based indicators may provide a ‘low-tech’ alternative to  
44 existing approaches that might help maintain the microbial safety of shellfish and their overlying waters.

45 **Methods and Results:** Mussels and their overlying waters were collected biweekly from an estuary in southeast  
46 England over a two-year period (May 2013 - April 2015) (n= 48). Levels of bacterial indicators were determined  
47 using membrane filtration and most probable number methods and those of bacteriophages were determined by  
48 direct plaque assay. The detection of adenovirus was determined using real-time polymerase chain reaction. The  
49 results revealed that somatic coliphages demonstrated the most significant correlations with AdV F and G in  
50 mussels ( $\rho=0.55$ ) and overlying waters ( $\rho=0.66$ ), followed by GB124 phages ( $\rho=0.43$ ) while *E. coli* showed  
51 no correlation with AdV F and G in mussels.

52 **Conclusion:** This study demonstrates that the use of somatic coliphages and GB124 phages may provide a better  
53 indication of the risk of adenovirus contamination of mussels and their overlying waters than existing bacterial  
54 indicators.

55 **Significance and impact of study:** Phage-based detection may be particularly advantageous in low-resource  
56 settings where viral infectious disease presents a significant burden to human health.

57  
58 **Keywords:** Adenoviruses, somatic coliphages, microbial indicators, human health, shellfish, surrogates, policy  
59

60 **Introduction**

61 Adenoviruses are medium-sized (60-90 nm), non-enveloped icosahedral viruses containing linear, non-segmented  
62 double-stranded DNA, belonging to the family *Adenoviridae*. They have a worldwide distribution and they are  
63 ubiquitous in environments contaminated by human faeces or sewage. And as a result, they are most commonly  
64 transmitted through the faecal-oral route, i.e., through ingestion of faecally-contaminated food or water (Pond  
65 2005). They represent the largest non-enveloped viruses and are usually stable to chemical or physical agents and  
66 adverse pH conditions, allowing for prolonged survival in the natural environment, particularly water bodies  
67 (Thurston-Enriquez *et al.* 2003). Adenoviruses have also been proposed as viral faecal indicators because of their  
68 stability and prevalence throughout the year (Girones *et al.* 2013; Rodriguez-Manzano 2014).  
69

70 One gram of faeces may contain ten million viruses, one million bacteria, 1,000 parasite cysts and 100 parasite  
71 eggs (UNICEF 2008) and faecally-polluted waters to which humans may come into contact and faecally-polluted  
72 shellfish that are consumed therefore present a hazard (potential risk) to human health. Many pathogens of faecal  
73 origin (and human health significance) may contaminate the environment and food chain unless barriers to their  
74 environmental transmission (such as water and wastewater treatment) are sufficiently robust. Several practices,  
75 such as sanitation, hygiene and surveillance activities to monitor the microbiological quality of water and food by  
76 environmental and public health protection agencies, support efforts to control the environmental transmission of  
77 human enteric diseases. Several terms have been used to describe the microbial tools used in these monitoring  
78 exercises, including ‘microbial indicator’, ‘index organism’, ‘faecal indicator’ and ‘surrogate organism’ (Ashbolt  
79 *et al.* 2001; Sinclair *et al.* 2012). *E. coli*, faecal coliforms and intestinal enterococci represent the classic bacterial  
80 indicators of the presence of faecal pollution (faecal indicator bacteria) in the environment.  
81

82 There are, however, limitations to the use of traditional faecal indicator bacteria to predict the presence of enteric  
83 pathogens and they appear to have limited or no predictive value for many important human viral pathogens, such  
84 as enterovirus, norovirus, hepatitis A virus (Jofre 1992, Muniain-Mujika *et al.* 2003) and parasite cysts. Critically,  
85 Dore *et al.* (2003) and Griffin *et al.* (2003) suggested that shellfish may meet *E. coli* standards for human  
86 consumption but still contain infectious doses of human enteric viruses that can cause gastroenteritis.  
87

88 Human enteric viruses are found in the gastrointestinal tract and the group that causes gastroenteritis infects the  
89 epithelial cells (DiCaprio *et al.* 2013). Large numbers of these viruses are excreted in the faeces and urine of  
90 infected humans (Melnick and Gerba 1980). Indiscriminate discharge of sewage into surface waters is the most  
91 conspicuous channel through which these viruses contaminate the environment (Pouillot *et al.* 2015), where their  
92 low infectious dose may present a human health hazard (Fong and Lipp 2005). Their commonest route of  
93 transmission is faecal-oral route, principally through the consumption of contaminated drinking water and

94 shellfish (Lipp and Rose 1997). Symptoms of viral gastroenteritis include diarrhoea, vomiting, abdominal pains  
95 and nausea (Bosch 2010). Some infected individuals fail to show any symptoms but nevertheless constantly shed  
96 the virus in their faeces and urine and the existence of these asymptomatic carriers can complicate epidemiological  
97 studies of human disease transmission (Pina *et al.* 1998).

98  
99 Advances in culture-independent molecular-based approaches to monitoring the sanitary quality of shellfish,  
100 through amplification and quantification of viral nucleic acids by real-time polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) or  
101 reverse transcription polymerase chain reaction (RT-qPCR), have aided the rapid detection of pathogenic human  
102 viruses (Campos and Lees 2014). These molecular methods demonstrate high levels of sensitivity and specificity  
103 (Pina *et al.* 1998) but remain relatively expensive option, thus, less likely to be taken up in low-resource settings.  
104 The methods are also unable to distinguish readily between infective and non-infective viral particles (Bosch  
105 2010).

106  
107 Bacteriophages, such as somatic coliphages, F-RNA coliphages and phages infecting *Bacteroides fragilis* have  
108 been suggested as potentially useful indicators of viral contamination (IAWPRC 1991; Pina *et al.* 1998; Hernroth  
109 *et al.* 2002; Ebdon *et al.* 2012; Jofre *et al.* 2014, Pouillot *et al.* 2015). This is because they have several  
110 characteristics in common with enteric viruses. For instance, they are found in high concentrations in sewage,  
111 they are non-latent and their cell sizes, shapes, morphology, physiochemistry and surface chemistry are all similar  
112 to those of enteric viruses (IAWPRC 1991). They also exhibit similar patterns of persistence and do not replicate  
113 in the environment except where there is a suitable bacterial host at sufficient concentration. Phages are easier and  
114 less expensive to enumerate in the laboratory and they pose little or no risk to the health of higher organisms  
115 (Tufenkji and Emelko 2011). Phages of host-specific strains of enteric bacteria may also represent useful targets  
116 for microbial source tracking (MST) and have successfully been used to particularly identify human sources of  
117 faecal pollution (Ebdon *et al.* 2007).

118  
119 Fifty seven immunologically distinct human adenovirus serotypes have been identified and have been divided  
120 into seven groups (A–G), based on their physical, chemical and biological properties (Jones *et al.* 2007). Some  
121 reported cases of human adenoviral infection caused by various serotypes include conjunctivitis, pharyngitis,  
122 pneumonia, acute and chronic appendicitis, bronchiolitis, haemorrhagic cystitis, nephritis, acute respiratory  
123 diseases and keratitis. Only human adenovirus F serotypes 40 and 41, and adenovirus G serotypes 52, however,  
124 have been strongly associated with gastroenteritis (Pond 2005). Furthermore, adenovirus F serotypes 40 and 41  
125 have been associated with acute gastroenteritis and responsible for up to 20 % of the cases of diarrheal disease  
126 globally in children (Dey *et al.* 2011). Infections are usually mild or self-limiting but can be fatal in  
127 immunocompromised individuals (Jiang 2006).

128 The aim of this study was to examine the distribution pattern of faecal indicator bacteria, bacteriophages and AdV  
129 F and G in *M. edulis* and their overlying waters harvested from a site that could best be described as a ‘Class B’  
130 harvesting area according to the EU shellfish hygiene classification criteria (Regulation (EC) No. 854/2004) (CEU  
131 2004). This may be considered an essential first ‘hazard evaluation’ step in the chain of effective human health  
132 risk management practices of shellfish harvesting areas. The objective of this study was to examine the  
133 applicability of phage-based pathogen surrogates to predict the concentration of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* and  
134 their overlying waters. This objective was based on the widely-accepted principle that phages are (and will for  
135 some time be) easier and cheaper to detect and enumerate than viral pathogens (Hernroth *et al.* 2002; Ebdon *et al.*  
136 2012; Jofre *et al.* 2014) and the proposition that using phages to predict the risk of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* and  
137 their overlying waters could be of immense benefit to human health protection.

## 138 139 **Materials and methods**

### 140 **Sampling site and collection of samples**

141 The sampling site was situated in the village of Piddinghoe, on the estuary of the River Ouse, which is the second  
142 largest river in the county of East Sussex in southern England, draining an area of 396 km<sup>2</sup> to its tidal limit. At  
143 mid-tide, the river has a depth of approximately three to four metres at its deepest point, about eight metres at high  
144 tide and less than one metre at low tide with a fluctuating salinity of between 0.6 and 16 ppt. This estuarine site is

145 affected by fluctuating faecal input from biologically treated municipal wastewater (e.g., at Scaynes Hill, about  
146 24.32 km upstream from the sampling site) and by diffuse pollution from animal rearing (mainly cattle and sheep).

147

148 Sampling activities were carried out every two weeks over a consecutive period of twenty-four months. On each  
149 sampling occasion, a grab sample of approximately one litre of overlying water was collected in a pre-sterilised  
150 plastic bottle in accordance with standard protocol (Anon. 2012). Mussels with an approximate length (six to ten  
151 centimetre) and weight (35 to 41 g) were collected by hand-picking into transparent polyethylene bags.  
152 Approximately 1800 mussels were sampled in total (i.e., 30 – 40 mussels were analysed on each occasion  
153 depending on the size of individual mussel). Mussels and overlying water samples were transported to the  
154 laboratory in the dark at approximately 4 °C and processed immediately (within less than one hour).

155

#### 156 **Enumeration of faecal indicator bacteria**

157 The concentrations of *E. coli*, faecal coliforms and intestinal enterococci in overlying waters were determined  
158 using the membrane filtration method (ISO 9308-1, ISO 7899-2) (Anon. 2000b; 2000c). The membrane filters  
159 were placed on freshly prepared selective media (*m*-FC, *m*-Ent, MLSA and TBX). Agar plates were incubated at  
160 37 °C for 48 hours (*m*-Ent), 37 °C for 24 hours (MLSA) and 44 °C for 24 hours (*m*-FC, TBX), and colonies were  
161 counted, calculated and expressed as colony-forming units (CFU) 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> of water. Similarly, the concentrations  
162 of *E. coli*, faecal coliforms and intestinal enterococci in *M. edulis* were determined using the most probable  
163 number method (MPN) (ISO 16649-3) (CEFAS 2011). Briefly, ten to fifteen *M. edulis* were rinsed in cold water,  
164 then cut open to remove their flesh and intravalvular fluids, 0.1 % peptone solution (one ratio two) was added and  
165 homogenised using a stomacher (400 Lab System) and shaker (Stuart Scientific Ltd). A master mix (M) was  
166 prepared by adding 30 ml shellfish homogenate to 70 ml 0.1 % peptone solution and a dilution (N) was then made  
167 from the master mix. Five test tubes containing ten ml each of double-strength Mineral Modified Glutamate Broth  
168 (dsMMGB) and ten test tubes containing ten ml each of single-strength Mineral Modified Glutamate Broth  
169 (ssMMGB) were prepared. Ten millilitres of M (equivalent to one gram of tissue per tube and 10<sup>0</sup> dilutions) was  
170 inoculated into the five test tubes containing ten ml dsMMGB. One millilitre of M (equivalent to 0.1 g of tissue  
171 per tube and 10<sup>-1</sup> dilutions) were inoculated into the five test tubes containing ten ml ssMMGB. One millilitre of  
172 N (equivalent to 0.01 g of tissue per tube and 10<sup>-2</sup> dilutions) were inoculated into the remaining five test tubes  
173 containing ten ml ssMMGB. Inoculated test tubes were incubated at 37 °C for 24 hours and were then examined  
174 for acid production. Test tubes with yellow colouration throughout the medium were sub-cultured onto freshly  
175 prepared selective media (*m*-FC, *m*-Ent and TBX). Agar plates were incubated at 37 °C for 24 hours (*m*-Ent) and  
176 44 °C for 24 hours (*m*-FC, TBX), and colonies were counted, and expressed as most probable number (MPN) 100  
177 g<sup>-1</sup> of shellfish flesh and intravalvular fluid.

178

#### 179 **Enumeration of bacteriophages**

180 The concentrations of somatic coliphages, F-RNA coliphages and bacteriophages infecting *B. fragilis* GB124 in  
181 *M. edulis* and their overlying waters were determined by direct plaque assay using a standardised double-agar  
182 method (ISO 10705) (Anon. 2000a; 2001a; 2001b). Briefly, approximately 50 ml of overlying waters were filtered  
183 through a 0.22 µm cellulose nitrate filter (Millipore). Similarly, on each occasion, ten to fifteen *M. edulis* were  
184 rinsed in cold distilled water and then cut open to remove their flesh and intravalvular fluids. Their digestive  
185 glands were separated carefully from the flesh, and chopped finely to ensure proper mixing. 0.25 mol L<sup>-1</sup> glycine  
186 (pH 9.5) was then added to two grams of the digestive gland (one ratio five). The mixture was placed on a shaker  
187 (Stuart Scientific Ltd) for approximately 20 mins, and subsequently centrifuged (Heraeus megafuge 16R) at 2000  
188 g, 4 °C for 15 mins. The supernatant was filtered through a 0.22 µm cellulose nitrate filter (Millipore). The required  
189 media (MSA, TYGA, BPRMA), semi-solid agar (ssMSA, ssTYGA, ssBPRMA) and broth (MSB, TYGB,  
190 BPRMB) were prepared according to the manufacturer's specifications. Bacterial host strains (*E. coli* WG5,  
191 *Salmonella typhimurium* WG49, and *B. fragilis* GB124) were grown to ensure confluent lawns for phage  
192 detection. One millilitre of sample (filtered water or shellfish glands) was added to one millilitre of bacterial host  
193 strain and 2.5 ml of semi-solid agar in a 10 ml vial (Sterilin). The mixture was vortexed and poured onto a solid  
194 agar plate, swirled gently for even distribution and allowed to solidify. All inoculated plates were incubated  
195 appropriately and plaques (clear zones of lysis) were counted and expressed as plaque-forming units (PFU) 100  
196 ml<sup>-1</sup> of water or 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of shellfish digestive gland.

197 **Concentration of viral particles and nucleic acids extraction**

198 The basic steps adopted for quantification of viral pathogens in *M. edulis* and their overlying waters were sample  
199 concentration, nucleic acid extraction and molecular detection, as described by Harwood *et al.* (2013). AdV F and  
200 G were concentrated from 300 ml of overlying river water filtered through 0.45 µm membrane cellulose nitrate  
201 filters. Magnesium chloride (five mol L<sup>-1</sup> MgCl<sub>2</sub>) was prepared by dissolving 475 g in 1000 ml of distilled water,  
202 then filter-sterilised through 0.22 µm membrane cellulose nitrate filters. Prepared MgCl<sub>2</sub> was added to the water  
203 samples in the filter unit before filtration to increase viral recovery by facilitating and enhancing virus attachment  
204 to the filters (Mendez *et al.* 2004). In brief, six ml of five mol L<sup>-1</sup> MgCl<sub>2</sub> was added aseptically to 300 ml of sample  
205 to achieve a final concentration of 0.1 mol L<sup>-1</sup> MgCl<sub>2</sub> before filtration. The filters were stored at -80 °C until  
206 nucleic acid extraction. Again, ten to fifteen mussels to be analysed were cleaned with sterile running water and  
207 placed in a stainless steel shucking tray. Using a shucking knife and wearing a chain-mail shucking glove, *M.*  
208 *edulis* were removed from their shells. The digestive glands were separated from the flesh and intravalvular fluid.  
209 The digestive glands have been shown to bio-accumulate viruses more effectively than other parts of the organism,  
210 as demonstrated in numerous studies (Jothikumar *et al.* 2005; Le Guyader *et al.* 2009; Pinto *et al.* 2009; Westrell  
211 *et al.* 2010; Iizuka *et al.* 2010; Baker *et al.* 2011; Bosch *et al.* 2011; Lowther *et al.* 2012; Trajano Gomes Da Silva  
212 2013). Digestive glands were therefore chopped finely to expose the content and stored in centrifuge tubes at -80  
213 °C until nucleic acid extraction.

214  
215 The frozen filters were equilibrated at room temperature and the surface was scraped using a fresh scalpel blade  
216 (Fisher Scientific) into a 1.5 ml microcentrifuge tube. Viral nucleic acids were extracted using the QIAamp  
217 MinElute Virus Spin Kit (Qiagen GmbH) according to the manufacturer's instruction. The nucleic acid extracts  
218 were stored at -80°C until quantification. Similarly, the frozen glands were equilibrated at room temperature and  
219 200 µl of the finely chopped glands was placed in a 1.5 ml microcentrifuge tube. Viral nucleic acids were extracted  
220 using the QIAamp MinElute Virus Spin Kit (Qiagen GmbH) according to the manufacturer's instruction. The  
221 nucleic acid extracts were stored at -80°C until quantification.

222  
223 **Detection of AdV F and G by qPCR**

224 AdV F and G were enumerated by quantitative real-time polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) (Ogorzaly *et al.* 2009)  
225 on QIAGEN Rotor-Gene® Q thermocycler using PrimerDesign™ genesig AdV F and G Hexon gene Advanced  
226 kit (Primerdesign UK) following the manufacturer's protocol. The components of the kit were reconstituted in  
227 RNase/DNase-free water, and then vortexed to ensure complete resuspension. AdV F and G had a sequence  
228 accession number of KC632648.1, anchor nucleotide position of 790 and context sequence length of 190.  
229 Thermocycling steps were as follows: enzyme activation (95 °C for two minutes), 50 cycles of denaturation (95  
230 °C for ten seconds) and data collection (60 °C for 60 seconds). Data were analysed using Rotor-Gene 2.1.0.9  
231 software with a threshold fluorescence value of 1.000. Standards were prepared, serially diluted and quantified to  
232 make standard curves following the manufacturer's protocol. The highest concentration of AdV F and G standard  
233 was 2 × 10<sup>5</sup> copies µl<sup>-1</sup>. Standard curve was run in triplicate and the 'pooled' standard curve was then used to  
234 relate quantification cycles to copy numbers and quantity of AdV F and G in samples. Again, all data were  
235 analysed with the comprehensive Rotor-Gene® Q software, which enables quantification and enhances data  
236 security.

237  
238 **Statistical analysis**

239 Data were transformed to log<sub>10</sub>, then examined using general descriptive statistics and checked for normality using  
240 the skewness and kurtosis statistic, Shapiro–Wilk normality test and corresponding normal probability plots.  
241 Further analyses were undertaken using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) Version 20.0, and all data  
242 were subjected to the Spearman's rank non-parametric two-tailed correlation analysis (with test of significance at  
243 0.01 and 0.05) to determine whether there were positive correlations between the concentration of AdV F and G  
244 and those of bacterial and viral indicators.

245  
246  
247  
248

249 **Results**

250 **Detection of faecal indicator bacteria**

251 The concentration of *E. coli* in *M. edulis* ranged from 2.43 to 4.27 log<sub>10</sub> MPN 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of shellfish flesh and  
252 intravalvular fluid and in overlying waters the concentration ranged from 1.55 to 4.00 log<sub>10</sub> CFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup>. The  
253 concentration of faecal coliforms in *M. edulis* ranged from 2.52 to 4.30 log<sub>10</sub> MPN 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of shellfish flesh and  
254 intravalvular fluid and in overlying waters the concentration ranged from 1.56 to 4.16 log<sub>10</sub> CFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup>.  
255 Similarly, concentration of intestinal enterococci in *M. edulis* ranged from 2.23 to 3.97 log<sub>10</sub> MPN 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of  
256 shellfish flesh and intravalvular fluid and in overlying waters ranged from 0.99 to 3.50 log<sub>10</sub> CFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> (Table  
257 1).

258

259 **Detection of bacteriophages**

260 The concentration of somatic coliphages in *M. edulis* ranged from 3.43 to 5.36 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of digestive  
261 gland (mean = 4.60 ± 0.52 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup>) and 2.00 to 4.02 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> in overlying waters (mean =  
262 3.01 ± 0.54 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup>). The concentration of F-RNA coliphages in *M. edulis* ranged from 0 to 3.82 log<sub>10</sub>  
263 PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of digestive gland (mean = 1.84 ± 1.62 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup>) and 0 to 2.30 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> in  
264 overlying waters (mean = 0.60 ± 0.95 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup>). The concentration of bacteriophages infecting  
265 *Bacteroides fragilis* (GB124) in *M. edulis* ranged from 0 to 5.29 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of digestive gland (mean =  
266 1.79 ± 1.64 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup>) and 0 to 3.35 log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> in overlying waters (mean = 0.67 ± 1.13 log<sub>10</sub>  
267 PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup>). Fourteen shellfish samples (31 %) and seven overlying water samples (16 %) presented positive  
268 for both F-RNA coliphages and bacteriophages infecting *Bacteroides fragilis* (GB124). However, all the samples  
269 (100 %) of shellfish and overlying water were positive for somatic coliphages (Table 1). Statistically significant  
270 elevated levels of somatic coliphages, F-RNA coliphages and bacteriophages infecting *Bacteroides fragilis*  
271 (GB124) in *M. edulis* compared with their overlying waters.

272

273 **Detection of AdV F and G**

274 Concentration of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* ranged from 0 to 2.94 log<sub>10</sub> genome copies 100 g<sup>-1</sup> of digestive gland  
275 (mean = 0.43 ± 0.85 log<sub>10</sub> genome copies 100 g<sup>-1</sup>) and in overlying waters ranged from 0 to 1.34 log<sub>10</sub> genome  
276 copies 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> (mean = 0.22 ± 0.35 log<sub>10</sub> genome copies 100 ml<sup>-1</sup>). The limit of detection for AdV F and G was  
277 10 detectable virus genome copies 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> and 100 g<sup>-1</sup> for overlying waters and shellfish samples, respectively.  
278 Nine shellfish samples (27 %) and eleven overlying water samples (24 %) presented positive for AdV F and G  
279 (Table 1). There were statistically significant elevated levels of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* compared with levels  
280 recorded in their overlying waters.

281

282 **The relationship between bacteriophages and AdV F and G**

283 The relationships between the concentrations of bacteriophages and those of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* and  
284 overlying waters were analysed using a two-tailed Spearman's rank correlation at two levels of significance (P <  
285 0.01 and P < 0.05) representing 99 % and 95 % confidence interval, respectively (Table 2). Levels of AdV F and  
286 G in overlying waters showed a positive correlation with those in *M. edulis* (rho = 0.58, P < 0.01). Similarly,  
287 levels of AdV F and G in overlying waters showed positive correlations with levels of somatic coliphages in both  
288 overlying waters (rho = 0.66, P < 0.01) and *M. edulis* (rho = 0.48, P < 0.05). Importantly, levels of AdV F and G  
289 in *M. edulis* showed a positive correlation with levels of somatic coliphages in *M. edulis* (rho = 0.55, P < 0.01).  
290 Levels of somatic coliphages in overlying waters showed a positive correlation with those in *M. edulis* (rho =  
291 0.64, P < 0.01). Levels of AdV F and G in overlying waters also showed positive correlations with levels of  
292 bacteriophages infecting *B. fragilis* (GB124) in both overlying waters (rho = 0.43, P < 0.05) and *M. edulis* (rho =  
293 0.49, P < 0.05).

294

295 Levels of somatic coliphages in overlying waters, furthermore, showed positive correlations with levels of  
296 bacteriophages infecting *B. fragilis* GB124 in *M. edulis* (rho = 0.41, P < 0.05). Levels of somatic coliphages in  
297 *M. edulis* showed a positive correlation with levels of bacteriophages infecting *B. fragilis* GB124 in *M. edulis* (rho  
298 = 0.53, P < 0.01). Levels of F-RNA coliphages in overlying waters showed a positive correlation with those in *M.*  
299 *edulis* (rho = 0.52, P < 0.01). Levels of bacteriophages infecting *B. fragilis* GB124 in overlying waters showed a  
300 positive correlation with levels of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* (rho = 0.53, P < 0.01).

301 **Discussion**

302 This study investigated the distribution pattern of faecal indicator bacteria, bacteriophages and AdV F and G in  
303 *M. edulis* and their overlying waters, and examined whether the enumeration of bacteriophages may offer a way  
304 to predict, manage and prevent gastroenteritis caused by adenovirus contamination of mussels consumed by  
305 humans. The Shapiro-Wilk's normality test ( $P > 0.05$ ) (Shapiro and Wilk 1965; Razali and Wah 2011) and a  
306 visual inspection of histograms, normal Q-Q plots and box plots showed that levels of *E. coli*, faecal coliforms,  
307 intestinal enterococci and somatic coliphages in both overlying waters and *M. edulis* were approximately normally  
308 distributed, whereas the levels of F-RNA coliphages, GB124 phages and AdV F and G appear not to have been  
309 normally distributed (Cramer, 1998; Cramer and Howitt 2004; Doane and Seward 2011) (Table 3). Evidently, the  
310 normality tests demonstrated a variable pattern of occurrence and distribution of faecal indicator bacteria,  
311 bacteriophages and AdV F and G in *M. edulis* and their overlying waters during the study. The difference in  
312 distribution patterns were clearly influenced by the non-detection of F-RNA coliphages, GB124 phages and AdV  
313 F and G on several sampling occasion. It is worthy of note that the statistical dataset on the varying levels of faecal  
314 indicator bacteria and bacteriophages (against which the levels AdV F and G were compared) were in broad  
315 agreement with the findings of Wyer *et al.* (2012). These authors suggested that statistical models based on  
316 adequate goodness of fit may be used to predict the probability of the presence of human adenovirus from routine  
317 surveillance of European waters for faecal coliforms.

318  
319 In this study, the Spearman's rank correlation co-efficient demonstrated the bacterial indicators: *E. coli* ( $\rho = -$   
320  $0.11$ ), faecal coliforms ( $\rho = 0.07$ ), and intestinal enterococci ( $\rho = 0.03$ ) to have far less predictive value for  
321 the presence of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* (Table 4) compared with somatic coliphages (Table 2). Although,  
322 correlation analysis revealed that *E. coli* ( $\rho = 0.57$ ,  $P < 0.01$ ), faecal coliforms ( $\rho = 0.53$ ,  $P < 0.01$ ) and  
323 intestinal enterococci ( $\rho = 0.45$ ,  $P < 0.05$ ) presented positive correlations with AdV F and G in overlying waters,  
324 these were lower than those observed using somatic coliphages ( $\rho = 0.66$ ,  $P < 0.01$ ). It is interesting to note that  
325 the findings from this study contrasted with those observed by Ogorzaly *et al.* (2009) who examined the  
326 relationship between F-specific RNA phage genogroups, faecal pollution indicators and human adenoviruses in  
327 river water (that was prone to faecal pollution from anthropogenic activities that included animal rearing activities  
328 involving approximately 112,000 cows, 7,500 sheep and about 4,100 pigs) in the northeast of France, and  
329 demonstrated positive correlations between the concentration of human adenovirus and *E. coli* ( $\rho = 0.513$ ),  
330 enterococci (0.616), somatic coliphages ( $\rho = 0.593$ ) and F-RNA phage genogroup II ( $\rho = 0.493$ ) (Ogorzaly *et*  
331 *al.* 2009). This observed difference may be the result of differences in the source of the faecal pollution and the  
332 distance from the source. The difference may also be as a result of geographical variation, stability of the indicator  
333 organisms, physiochemical, hydrological and meteorological factors etc. (Formiga-Cruz *et al.* 2003).

334  
335 AdV F and G were detected on several sampling occasions in overlying waters and *M. edulis* during the study  
336 period. GB124 phages were not detected on ten sampling occasions in overlying waters and on two sampling  
337 occasions in *M. edulis*, F-RNA coliphages were not detected on twelve sampling occasions in overlying waters  
338 and on six sampling occasions in *M. edulis*, whereas somatic coliphages were detected in all cases. In the samples  
339 that tested positive for AdV F and G, all investigated phages were also consistently detected at varying  
340 concentrations. However, these phages were also detected in some samples that tested negative for AdV F and G  
341 (Figure 1). These findings are consistent with other studies (Haramoto *et al.* 2007; Ogorzaly *et al.* 2009) that have  
342 demonstrated the wide spatial distribution of human adenovirus genome in faecally-impacted aquatic  
343 environments.

344  
345 Phages were also detected in overlying waters and in *M. edulis* that presented negative results for AdV F and G  
346 (i.e., were below the detection limit of 1 PFU ml<sup>-1</sup> or g<sup>-1</sup>). Total concentrations of 32.01 log<sub>10</sub>PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> somatic  
347 coliphages, 2.00 log<sub>10</sub>PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> GB124 phages, and 4.30 log<sub>10</sub>PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> F-RNA coliphages were detected  
348 in overlying waters presenting negative results for AdV F and G. Again, 52.05 log<sub>10</sub>PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup> somatic  
349 coliphages, 12.00 log<sub>10</sub>PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup> GB124 phages, and 17.68 log<sub>10</sub>PFU 100 g<sup>-1</sup> F-RNA coliphages were detected  
350 in *M. edulis* presenting negative results for AdV F and G. Again, a number of these samples may reasonably be  
351 described as 'false negatives', because, of all the AdV F and G negative samples, GB124 phages were detected  
352 on two sampling occasions in overlying waters and on eight sampling occasions in *M. edulis*, F-RNA coliphages

353 were detected on four sampling occasions in overlying waters and on 12 sampling occasions in *M. edulis*, whereas  
354 somatic coliphages were detected in all cases. This shows the volume of samples which are positive for phages  
355 but negative for AdV F and G. In general, somatic coliphages were detected at significantly higher levels than  
356 other groups of phages (i.e., GB124 phages and F-RNA coliphages) in overlying waters and *M. edulis* presenting  
357 both positive and negative results for AdV F and G. Also, bacteriophages (especially somatic coliphages) and  
358 faecal indicator bacteria were detected at significantly higher levels in AdV F and G positive samples compared  
359 with samples that were negative for AdV F and G (Figure 1). These findings further demonstrate the abundance  
360 of somatic coliphages in faecally-polluted environments (Grabow 2004).

361

362 This work is applicable to other types of shellfish species, though different shellfish species may demonstrate  
363 varying abilities to bioaccumulate microbial indicators or pathogens. This may be the result of differences in the  
364 physiology of the shellfish or the pathogen, the rate of metabolism in the shellfish, the duration of exposure of the  
365 shellfish to the pathogen or its source, the exposure dose and other factors, such as salinity and temperature which  
366 all serve to influence filtration rates within the shellfish (Olalemi *et al.* 2016).

367

368 The current hygiene classifications for shellfisheries, which are based on levels of faecal indicator bacteria, do not  
369 appear to offer an accurate indication of risk of viral contamination. There is a clear need to target alternative  
370 indicators to maintain and improve the microbial safety of shellfish that are harvested for human consumption. In  
371 this study, the enumeration of bacteriophages by a simple phage-lysis method was demonstrated to provide a  
372 better indication of the risk of adenovirus contamination in *M. edulis* and their overlying waters than is provided  
373 by the faecal indicator bacteria prescribed in EU Directives. Some studies have demonstrated the ability of  
374 bacteriophages infecting *Bacteroides fragilis* GB124 to predict the presence of norovirus in mussels (Trajano  
375 Gomes Da Silva 2013), and mussels and oysters (Olalemi 2015). Despite the fact that enumeration of somatic  
376 coliphages better predicted the risk of viral pathogens than GB124 phages, this study demonstrates for the first  
377 time the ability of the human-specific *Bacteroides fragilis* GB124 phages to predict the presence of human AdV  
378 F and G in *M. edulis*. These findings support the use of bacteriophages as alternative faecal indicators and effective  
379 surrogates of AdV F and G in *M. edulis* and their overlying waters. This is consistent with the findings of other  
380 recent studies that have demonstrated the usefulness of bacteriophages as effective surrogates of enteric viral  
381 contamination. Incorporating this relatively simple tool into shellfish safety management and planning, especially  
382 as a component of routine monitoring of shellfish and their overlying waters would provide improved human  
383 health protection.

384

#### 385 **Acknowledgment**

386 This research was undertaken with financial support from the European Regional Development Fund (Inter-reg  
387 IV–A France (Channel) England Programme) within the project RiskManche (Risk management of catchments  
388 and coasts for health and environment).

389

#### 390 **Conflict of interest**

391 No conflict of interest declared.

392

#### 393 **References:**

394 Anon. (2000a) ISO 10705 – 2. Water Quality. Detection and enumeration of bacteriophages-Part 2: Enumeration  
395 of somatic coliphages. International Organisation for Standardisation, Geneva, Switzerland.

396

397 Anon. (2000b) ISO 9308 – 1. Water Quality. Detection and enumeration of *Escherichia coli* and coliform bacteria  
398 - Part 1: Membrane filtration method. International Organisation for Standardisation, Geneva, Switzerland.

399

400 Anon. (2000c) ISO 7899 – 2. Water Quality. Detection and enumeration of intestinal enterococci - Part 2:  
401 Membrane filtration method. International Organisation for Standardisation, Geneva, Switzerland.

402



403 Anon. (2001a) ISO 10705 – 4. Water Quality. Detection and enumeration of bacteriophages-Part 4: Enumeration  
404 of bacteriophages infecting *Bacteroides fragilis*. International Organisation for Standardisation, Geneva,  
405 Switzerland.

406

407 Anon. (2001b) ISO BS EN 10705 – 1. Water Quality. Detection and enumeration of bacteriophages-Part 1:  
408 Enumeration of F-specific bacteriophages. British Standard, European Standard, International Organisation for  
409 Standardisation.

410

411 Anon. (2012) *Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater* (22<sup>nd</sup> ed.) APHA/AWWA/WEF:  
412 Washington DC, USA.

413

414 Ashbolt, N. J., Grabow, W. O. and Snozzi, M. (2001) Indicators of microbial water quality. In Fewtrell, L. and  
415 Bartram, J. (ed.), *Water Quality: Guidelines, Standards and Health*. IWA Publishing, London, United Kingdom.

416

417 Baker, K., Morris, J., McCarthy, N., Saldana, L., Lowther, J., Collinson, A., and Young, M. (2011) An outbreak  
418 of norovirus infection linked to oyster consumption at a UK restaurant, February 2010. *J Public Health (Oxf)* **33**,  
419 205–211.

420

421 Bosch, A., Bidawid, S., Le Guyader, F. S., Lees, D. N. and Jaykus, L. (2011) Norovirus and hepatitis A virus in  
422 shellfish, soft fruit and water. In rapid detection, identification and quantification of foodborne pathogens.  
423 *Archimer*. 466 pp.

424

425 Bosch, A. (2010) Human enteric viruses in the water environment: a minireview. *Int Microbiol* **1**, 191–196.

426

427 Campos, C. J. and Lees, D. N. (2014) Environmental Transmission of Human Noroviruses in Shellfish Waters.  
428 *Appl Environ Microbiol* **80**, 3552–3561.

429

430 Commission of the European Union (CEU) (2004) EC Regulation. "854/2004 (2004). *Off J Eur Communities L*  
431 **226**, 83–127.

432

433 Cramer, D. (1998) *Fundamental statistics for social research*. London: Routledge.

434

435 Cramer, D. and Howitt, D. (2004) *The SAGE dictionary of statistics*. London: SAGE.

436

437 Dey, R. S., Ghosh, S., Chawla-Sarkar, M., Panchalingam, S., Nataro, J. P., Sur, D., Manna, B. and Ramamurthy,  
438 T. (2011) Circulation of a novel pattern of infections by enteric adenovirus serotype 41 among children below 5  
439 years of age in Kolkata, India. *J Clin Microbiol* **49**, 500–505.

440

441 DiCaprio, E., Ma, Y., Hughes, J., Li, J. (2013) Epidemiology, prevention and control of the number one foodborne  
442 illness: Human norovirus. *Infect Dis Clin North Am* **27**, 651–674.

443

444 Doane, D. P. and Seward, L. E. (2011) Measuring Skewness. *J Stat Educ* **19**, 1–18.

445

446 Dore, W. J., Mackie, M. and Lees, D. N. (2003) Levels of male-specific RNA bacteriophage and *Escherichia coli*  
447 in molluscan bivalve shellfish from commercial harvesting areas. *Lett Appl Microbiol* **36**, 92–96.

448

449 Ebdon, J. E., Muniesa, M., and Taylor, H. D. (2007) The application of a recently isolated strain of *Bacteroides*  
450 (GB-124) to identify human sources of faecal pollution in a temperate river catchment. *Water Res* **41**, 3683–3690.

451

452 Ebdon, J. E., Sellwood, J., Shore, J., and Taylor, H. D. (2012) Use of Phages of *Bacteroides* (GB-124) as a novel  
453 tool for viral waterborne disease control? *Environ Sci Technol* **46**, 1163–1169.

454

455 Fong, T. T. and Lipp, E. K. (2005) Enteric viruses of humans and animals in aquatic environments: health risks,  
456 detection, and potential water quality assessment tools. *Microbiol Mol Biol Rev* **69**, 357–371.  
457

458 Formiga-Cruz, M., Allard, A. K., Conden-Hansson, A. C., Henshilwood, K., Hernroth, B. E., Jofre, J., Lees, D.  
459 N., Lucena, F., Papapetropoulou, M., Rangdale, R. E., Tsibouxi, A., Vantarakis, A. and Girones, R. (2003)  
460 Evaluation of potential indicators of viral contamination in shellfish and their applicability to diverse geographical  
461 areas. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **69**, 1556–1563.  
462

463 Girones, R., Bofill-Mas, S. and Cook, N. (2013) Virus indicators for food and water. *Viruses in food and water:  
464 risks, surveillance and control*, 483–509.  
465

466 Grabow, W. O. K. (2004) Bacteriophages: update on application as models for viruses in water. *Water SA* **27**,  
467 251–268.  
468

469 Griffin, D. W., Donaldson, K. A., Paul, J. H. and Rose, J. B. (2003) Pathogenic human viruses in coastal waters.  
470 *Clin Microbiol Rev* **16**, 129–143.  
471

472 Haramoto, E., Katayama, H., Oguma, K., Ohgaki, S. (2007) Quantitative analysis of human enteric adenoviruses  
473 in aquatic environments. *J Appl Microbiol* **103**, 2153–2159.  
474

475 Harwood, V. J., Boehm, A. B., Sassoubre, L. M., Vijayavel, K., Stewart, J. R., Fong, T. T., Caprais, M., Converse,  
476 R. R., Diston, D., Ebdon, J., Fuhrman, J. A., Gourmelon, M., Gentry-Shields, J., Griffith, J. F., Kashian, D. R.,  
477 Noble, R. T., Taylor, H., Wicki, M. (2013) Performance of viruses and bacteriophages for faecal coliform  
478 determination in a multi-laboratory, comparative study. *Water Res* **47**, 6929–6943.  
479

480 Hernroth, B. E., Conden-Hansson, A. C., Rehnstam-Holm, A. S., Girones, R., and Allard, A. K. (2002)  
481 Environmental factors influencing human viral pathogens and their potential indicator organisms in the blue  
482 mussel, *Mytilus edulis*: the first Scandinavian report. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **68**, 4523–4533.  
483

484 IAWPRC study group on health related water microbiology (1991) Bacteriophages as model viruses in water  
485 quality control. *Water Res* **25**, 529–545.  
486

487 Jiang, S. C. (2006) Human adenoviruses in water: occurrence and health implications: a critical review. *Environ  
488 Sci Technol* **40**, 7132–7140.  
489

490 Iizuka, S., Oka, T., Tabara, K., Omura, T., Katayama, K., Takeda, N., and Noda, M. (2010) Detection of  
491 sapoviruses and noroviruses in an outbreak of gastroenteritis linked genetically to shellfish. *J Med Virol* **82**, 1247–  
492 1254.  
493

494 Jofre, J., Blanch, A. R., Lucena, F. and Muniesa, M (2014) Bacteriophages infecting *Bacteroides* as a marker for  
495 microbial source tracking. *Water Res* **55**, 1–11.  
496

497 Jofre, J. (1992) Bivalve molluscs as vectors of human enteric viruses. *Microbiologie Aliments Nutrition* **10**, 223–  
498 228.  
499

500 Jones, M. S., Harrach, B., Ganac, R. D., Gozum, M. M. A., Dela Cruz, W. P., Riedel, B., Pan, C., Delwart, E. L.,  
501 Schnurr, D. P. (2007) "New adenovirus species found in a patient presenting with gastroenteritis". *J Virol* **81**,  
502 5978–5984.  
503

504 Jothikumar, N., Lowther, J. A., Henshilwood, K., Lees, D. N., Hill, V. R. and Vinjé, J. (2005) Rapid and sensitive  
505 detection of noroviruses by using TaqMan-based one-step reverse transcription-PCR assays and application to  
506 naturally contaminated shellfish samples. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **71**, 1870–1875.

507 Le Guyader, F. S., Parnaudeau, S., Schaeffer, J., Bosch, A., Loisy, F., Pommepuy, M. and Atmar, R. L. (2009)  
508 Detection and Quantification of Noroviruses in Shellfish. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **75**, 618–624.  
509

510 Lipp, E. K. and Rose, J. B. (1997) The role of seafood in foodborne diseases in the United States of America. *Rev*  
511 *sci Off Int Epiz* **16**, 620–640.  
512

513 Lowther, J. A., Gustar, N. E., Powell, A. L., Hartnell, R. E., Lees, D. N. (2012) A two-year systematic study to  
514 assess norovirus contamination in oysters from commercial harvesting areas in the United Kingdom. *Appl Environ*  
515 *Microbiol* **78**, 5812–5817.  
516

517 Melnick, J. L. and Gerba, C. P. (1980) Viruses in water and soil. *Public Health Rev* **9**, 185–213.  
518

519 Mendez, J., Audicana, A., Isern, A., Llaneza, J., Moreno, B., Tarancon, M.L., Jofre, J., Lucena, F., (2004)  
520 Standardised evaluation of the performance of a simple membrane filtration-elution method to concentrate  
521 bacteriophages from drinking water. *J Virol Methods* **117**, 19–25.  
522

523 Muniain-Mujika, I., Calvo, M., Lucena, F., and Girones, R. (2003) Comparative analysis of viral pathogens and  
524 potential indicators in shellfish. *Int J Food Microbiol* **83**, 75–85.

525 Ogorzaly, L., Tissier, A., Bertrand, I., Maul, A., and Gantzer, C. (2009) Relationship between F-specific RNA  
526 phage genogroups, faecal pollution indicators and human adenoviruses in river water. *Water Res* **43**, 1257–1264.  
527

528 Olalemi, A., (2015) Bacteriophages as surrogates of viral pathogens: A novel tool for the shellfisheries industry  
529 (PhD thesis). University of Brighton, Brighton, United Kingdom.  
530

531 Olalemi, A., Baker-Austin, C., Ebdon, J. and Taylor, H. (2016). Bioaccumulation and persistence of faecal  
532 bacterial and viral indicators in *Mytilus edulis* and *Crassostrea gigas*. *Int J Hyg Environ Health* doi  
533 10.1016/j.ijheh.2016.06.002.  
534

535 Pina, S., Puig, M., Lucena, F., Jofre, J., and Girones, R. (1998) Viral pollution in the environment and in shellfish:  
536 human adenovirus detection by PCR as an index of human viruses. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **64**, 3376–3382.  
537

538 Pinto, R. M., Costafreda, M. I. and Bosch, A. (2009) Risk assessment in shellfish-borne outbreaks of Hepatitis A.  
539 *Appl Environ Microbiol* **75**, 7350–7355.  
540

541 Pond, K. (2005) Water recreation and disease: plausibility of associated infections: acute effects, sequelae, and  
542 mortality. World Health Organisation, IWA publishing, London, UK.  
543

544 Pouillot, R., Van Doren, J. M., Woods, J., Plante, D., Smith, M., Goblick, G., Roberts, C., Locas, A., Hajen, W.,  
545 Stobo, J., White, J., Holtzman, J., Buenaventura, E., Burkhardt, W., 3rd, Catford, A., Edwards, R., DePaola, A.,  
546 and Calci, K. R. (2015) Meta-Analysis of the reduction of norovirus and male-specific coliphage concentrations  
547 in wastewater treatment plants. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **81**, 4669–4681.  
548

549 Razali, N. M. and Wah, Y. B. (2011) Power comparisons of Shapiro-Wilk, Kolmogorov-Smirnov, Lilliefors and  
550 Anderson-Darling tests. *J Stat Model Anal* **2**, 21–33.  
551

552 Rodriguez-Manzano, J., Hundesa, A., Calgua, B., Carratala, A., de Motes, C. M., Rusiñol, M., Moresco, V.,  
553 Ramos, A. P., Martinez-Marca, F., Calvo, M., Baradi, C. R. M., Girones, R. and Bofill-Mas, S. (2014) Adenovirus  
554 and Norovirus Contaminants in Commercially Distributed Shellfish. *Food Environ Virol* **6**, 31–41.  
555

556 Shapiro, S. S. and Wilk, M. B. (1965) An Analysis of Variance Test for Normality (Complete Samples).  
557 *Biometrika* **52**, 591–611.  
558

559 Sinclair, R. G., Rose, J. B., Hashsham, S. A., Gerba, C. P. and Haas, C. N. (2012) Criteria for selection of  
560 surrogates used to study the fate and control of pathogens in the environment. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **78**, 1969–  
561 1977.

562

563 Thurston-Enriquez, J.A., Haas, C.N., Jacangelo, J., Riley, K. and Gerba, C.P. (2003) Inactivation of feline  
564 calicivirus and adenovirus type 40 by UV radiation. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **69**, 577–582.

565

566 Trajano Gomes da Silva (2013) Bacteriophages as indicators of human enteric viruses in mussels (PhD thesis).  
567 University of Brighton, Brighton, United Kingdom.

568

569 Tufenkji, N. and Emelko, M.B. (2011) Groundwater pollution: Impacts on human health: fate and transport of  
570 microbial contaminants. In *Encyclopedia of Environmental Health*, J. Nriagu, Edition, Elsevier Publishing Inc.

571 UNICEF (2008) International year of sanitation. United Nations Children’s Funds, New York, NY, USA.

572

573 Westrell, T., Dusch, V., Ethelberg, S., Harris, J., Hjertqvist, M., Jourdan-da Silva, N., Koller, A., Lenglet, A.,  
574 Lisby, M. and Vold, L. (2010) "Norovirus outbreaks linked to oyster consumption in the United Kingdom,  
575 Norway, France, Sweden and Denmark, 2010." *Euro Surveill* **15**, 19524.

576

577 Wyer, M. D., Wyn-Jones, A. P., Kay, D., Au-Yeung, H. K. C., Gironés, R., López-Pila, J., Husman, A. M., Rutjes,  
578 S. and Schneider, O. (2012) Relationships between human adenoviruses and faecal indicator organisms in  
579 European recreational waters. *Water Res* **46**, 4130–4141.

580  
581

582

583

584 **Table 1: Mean concentration of AdV F and G, bacteriophages and faecal indicator**  
585 **bacteria in *M. edulis* and overlying waters**

586 Microorganisms	587 <i>M. edulis</i>		588 Overlying waters	
	589 Mean ± SD	590 Range (% +)	591 Mean ± SD	592 Range (% +)
593 Adenovirus F and G	0.43 ± 0.85	0.00-2.94 (27%)	0.22 ± 0.35	0.00-1.34 (24%)
594 <b>Somatic coliphages</b>	<b>4.60 ± 0.52</b>	<b>3.43-5.36 (100%)</b>	<b>3.01 ± 0.54</b>	<b>2.00-4.02 (100%)</b>
595 F-RNA coliphages	1.84 ± 1.62	0.00-3.82 (31%)	0.60 ± 0.95	0.00-2.30 (16%)
596 GB124 phages	1.79 ± 1.64	0.00-5.29 (31%)	0.67 ± 1.13	0.00-3.35 (16%)
597 <i>E. coli</i>	3.37 ± 0.51	2.43-4.27 (100%)	2.75 ± 0.76	1.55-4.00 (100%)
598 Faecal coliforms	3.60 ± 0.50	2.52-4.30 (100%)	2.96 ± 0.78	1.56-4.16 (100%)
599 Intestinal enterococci	3.10 ± 0.47	2.23-3.97 (100%)	2.46 ± 0.74	0.99-3.50 (100%)

595

596 **Key:** Enteric viruses mean Log<sub>10</sub> genome copies 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> or 100 g<sup>-1</sup> digestive gland ± standard  
597 deviation; Phages mean log<sub>10</sub> PFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> or 100 g<sup>-1</sup> digestive gland ± standard deviation; Faecal  
598 bacteria mean log<sub>10</sub> MPN 100g<sup>-1</sup> shellfish flesh and intravalvular fluid or CFU 100 ml<sup>-1</sup> of overlying  
599 waters ± standard deviation; Range (Minimum-Maximum); (% +) – Percentage of occurrence. Figure  
600 in **bold** – Most abundant parameter in both *M. edulis* and overlying waters.

601

602 **Table 3: Skewness and Kurtosis, significance values for the Shapiro-Wilk normality tests based on log<sub>10</sub> transformed concentration values**  
 603 **in *M. edulis* and their overlying waters.**

604		605 Overlying waters			605 <i>M. edulis</i>			
606	606 Microorganisms	606 Skewness	606 Kurtosis	606 Shapiro-Wilk	606 Skewness	606 Kurtosis	606 Shapiro-Wilk	606 Normal distribution
607		(SE=0.472)	(SE=0.918)	(p value)	(SE=0.472)	(SE=0.918)	(p value)	
608	<i>E. coli</i>	0.146	-1.001	0.300	-0.287	-0.699	0.251	Yes
609	Faecal coliforms	-0.238	-1.073	0.256	-0.539	-0.369	0.226	Yes
610	Intestinal enterococci	-0.521	-0.859	0.138	-0.353	-0.807	0.219	Yes
611	Somatic coliphages	-0.242	-0.834	0.403	-0.480	-0.406	0.518	Yes
612	F-RNA coliphages	1.013	-1.015	0.000	-0.239	-1.957	0.000	No
613	GB124 phages	1.393	0.630	0.000	0.083	-1.218	0.000	No
614	Adenovirus F and G	2.005	3.860	0.000	2.436	5.382	0.000	No

615

616

617 Key: SE = Standard error

618

619 **Table 2: Significant Spearman's rank correlation between bacteriophages and AdV F**  
 620 **and G in *M. edulis* and overlying waters (n=48)**

	Water AdV	Water SomC	Water F-RNA	Water GB124	Mussel AdV	Mussel SomC	Mussel F-RNA	Mussel GB124
Water AdV	1.00							
Water SomC	<b>0.66**</b>	1.00						
Water F-RNA	0.17	0.19	1.00					
Water GB124	0.43*	0.25	0.18	1.00				
Mussel AdV	<b>0.58**</b>	0.40	-0.04	<b>0.53**</b>	1.00			
Mussel SomC	0.48*	<b>0.64**</b>	0.20	0.32	<b>0.55**</b>	1.00		
Mussel F-RNA	0.11	0.03	<b>0.52**</b>	0.27	0.05	0.09	1.00	
Mussel GB124	0.49*	0.41*	-0.18	0.36	0.34	<b>0.53**</b>	-0.04	1.00

621  
 622 **Key:** SomC – Somatic coliphages; F-RNA – F-RNA coliphages; GB124 – GB124 phages;  
 623 AdV – Adenovirus F and G; \*\* – **Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed);** \* –  
 624 Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed)

625  
 626 **Table 4: Significant Spearman's rank correlation between faecal indicator bacteria and**  
 627 **AdV F and G in *M. edulis* and overlying waters (n=48)**

	Water AdV	Water <i>E. coli</i>	Water FC	Water Ent.	Mussel AdV	Mussel <i>E. coli</i>	Mussel FC	Mussel Ent.
Water AdV	1.00							
Water <i>E. coli</i>	<b>0.57**</b>	1.00						
Water FC	<b>0.53**</b>	<b>0.97**</b>	1.00					
Water Ent.	0.45*	<b>0.71**</b>	<b>0.73**</b>	1.00				
Mussel AdV	<b>0.58**</b>	0.10	0.07	0.12	1.00			
Mussel <i>E. coli</i>	0.33	<b>0.75**</b>	<b>0.72**</b>	<b>0.55**</b>	-0.11	1.00		
Mussel FC	<b>0.48**</b>	<b>0.84**</b>	<b>0.84**</b>	<b>0.65**</b>	0.07	<b>0.90**</b>	1.00	
Mussel Ent.	0.16	0.38	0.38	0.39	0.03	<b>0.60**</b>	<b>0.59**</b>	1.00

628  
 629 **Key:** FC – Faecal coliforms; Ent. – Intestinal enterococci; AdV – AdV F and G; \*\* –  
 630 **Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed);** \* – Correlation is significant at the 0.05  
 631 level (2-tailed)