Oral Diseases (2010) 16, 601–612. doi:10.1111/j.1601-0825.2010.01670.x © 2010 John Wiley & Sons A/S All rights reserved

www.wiley.com

REVIEW ARTICLE

Hepatitis C virus infection and lichen planus: a systematic review with meta-analysis

G Lodi¹, R Pellicano², M Carrozzo³

¹Unita di Medicina e Patologia Orale, Dipartimento di Medicina, Chirurgia e Odontoiatria, Università degli Studi di Milano, Italy; ²Department of Gastro-Hepatology, Molinette Hospital, Turin, Italy; ³Department of Oral Medicine, School of Dental Sciences, University of Newcastle upon Tyne, UK

OBJECTIVE: Hepatitis C virus (HCV) is one of the major causes of chronic liver disease worldwide but its morbidity is also due to a variety of extra-hepatic manifestations including mixed cryoglubulinemia, non-Hodgkin lymphoma, diabetes, porphyria cutanea tarda and lichen planus. The aims of this study were to conduct a systematic review and a meta-analysis on the prevalence of HCV in lichen planus patients and on the prevalence of lichen planus in chronic HCV infection.

MATERIALS AND METHOD: Bibliographic searches were conducted in several electronic databases. Pooled data were analysed by calculating odds ratios, using a random effects model.

RESULTS AND CONCLUSIONS: Thirty-three studies comparing the seroprevalence of HCV in lichen planus patients and six reporting the prevalence of lichen planus in patients with HCV infection were included in the metaanalysis. The summary estimate showed that LP patients have significantly higher risk (odds ratio 4.85; 95% confidence interval 3.58–6.56) than controls of being HCV seropositive. A similar odds ratio of having lichen planus was found among HCV patients (4.47; 95% confidence interval 1.84–10.86). Sub-analyses indicated that variability of HCV/lichen planus association seemed only partially depending on geographic effect. *Oral Diseases* (2010) 16, 601–612

Keywords: lichen planus; oral lichen planus; hepatitis C virus; meta-analysis

Introduction

Hepatitis C virus (HCV) is presently considered as the main etiologic agent of both blood-borne and sporadic non-A and -B hepatitis, and is one of the major causes of chronic liver disease worldwide. However, morbidity associated with HCV infection is due not only to the sequelae of chronic liver disease, but also to a variety of extra-heaptic manifestations (EHM). According to a recent review, mixed cryoglubulinemia is the only EHM in which the association with HCV has been demonstrated by both epidemiological and pathogenetic evidences, while diseases strongly suspected to be linked to HCV include B-cell non-Hodgkin lymphoma, monoclonal gammopathies, porphyria cutanea tarda and lichen planus (LP) (Zignego *et al*, 2007).

Lichen planus is a relatively common disorder of the stratified squamous epithelia frequently involving the oral cavity exclusively (Eisen *et al*, 2005).

It is likely that LP represents a sterotype-cell mediated reaction to a variety of extrinsic antigens, altered selfantigens, or super antigens. Among the extrinsic factors, several infective agents, including some viruses and *Helicobacter pylori*, have been linked with LP but sometimes on the basis of equivocal data (Lodi *et al*, 2005; De Vries *et al*, 2006).

A possible link between hepatitis viruses and LP has been suggested by the frequent association between LP and chronic liver disease (CLD) in Mediterranean patients (Carrozzo and Gandolfo, 2003) but no pathogenic correlation could be found until HCV assays became available. The risk of chronic liver disorders in LP patients is in fact independent from alcohol consumption, and is still significantly high after adjustment for a positive hepatitis B surface antigen (HBsAg) reaction (GISED, 1990). Markers of past hepatitis B virus (HBV) infection [antibodies to hepatitis B surface antigen (HBsAb) and to hepatitis B core antigen (HBcAb)] have been reported in Spanish and Italian patients with LP (Ayala *et al*, 1986; Delolmo *et al*, 1990; Carrozzo *et al*, 1996), but with prevalence quite close the

Correspondence: Prof. Marco Carrozzo, Department of Oral Medicine, School of Dental Sciences, University of Newcastle upon Tyne, Framlington Place, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE2 4BW, UK. Tel: +44 191 2226797, Fax: +44 191 2226137, E-mail: marco.carrozzo@ncl. ac.uk

Received 25 September 2009; revised 4 November 2009; accepted 10 November 2009

average figure in the Mediterranean area. Moreover, the recently discovered viruses, hepatitis G virus or TTV, are not associated with LP (Nagao *et al*, 1997; Lodi *et al*, 2000; Bez *et al*, 2001; Rodriguez-Inigo *et al*, 2001).

When sensitive HCV diagnostic tests became available, a great amount of case reports (Carrozzo, 2008), cohort and controlled studies suggested a link between LP and HCV infection. A systematic review investigating HCV seropositivity in LP patients was published in 2004 (Lodi et al, 2004) and more than 20 controlled studies were published thereafter (Bokor-Bratic, 2004; Campisi et al, 2004; Chung et al, 2004; Denli et al, 2004; Harman et al, 2004; Karavelioglu et al, 2004; Asaad and Samdani, 2005; Dervis and Serez, 2005; Guerreiro et al, 2005; Laeijendecker et al, 2005; Luis-Montova et al, 2005; Rahnama et al, 2005; Das et al, 2006; Sulka et al, 2006; Ali and Suresh, 2007; Amer et al, 2007; de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007; Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007; Giuliani et al, 2007; Yarom et al, 2007). Moreover, the frequency of LP in patients with HCV infection has never been reviewed systematically.

In recent reviews devoted to HCV-EHM, conflicting statements have been made, some supporting and others discharging the link between LP and such viral infection (Sene *et al*, 2004; Ali and Zein, 2005; Palekar and Harrison, 2005; Sterling and Bralow, 2006; Galossi *et al*, 2007; Okuse *et al*, 2007; Zignego *et al*, 2007; Carrozzo, 2008) but literature was rarely reviewed with a systematic approach.

Furthermore, IFN- α and ribavirin may cause or exacerbate some muco-cutaneous disorders (Berk *et al*, 2007), including LP, sometimes leading to anti-HCV treatment withdrawal (Protzer *et al*, 1993). As a result, it is difficult to determine whether LP results from HCV, IFN- α /ribavirin, both or neither. On the other hand, there are also some concerns about the inclusion of LP patients in clinical trial of IFN- α therapy (Berk *et al*, 2007).

The aim of our study was to systematically review epidemiological data on the association between HCV infection in LP. The two null hypotheses of our study were that (ii) there is no difference between the proportion/number of anti-HCV seropositive subjects in patients affected by LP compared with control groups, against the alternative hypothesis of a difference, and (ii) there is no difference between the proportion/number of subjects affected by LP in patients HCV seropositive compared with control groups, against the alternative hypothesis of a difference.

All along the text the term LP has been used generically to indicate both skin and oral LP (OLP). When a more specific indication was opportune, the more precise terminology of skin or cutaneous LP and OLP was used.

Patients and methods

Criteria for considering studies

Studies addressing the relationship between LP and HCV seropositivity were considered. We collected either studies investigating the prevalence of HCV in LP

patients or studies assessing the frequency of LP in HCV seropositive and/or infected subjects. Studies were eligible for the inclusion in the meta-analysis when they fulfilled the following criteria:

- 1. analytical study design as indicated by Grimes and Schulz (Grimes and Schulz, 2002), i.e. an observational study with a comparison or control group;
- 2. diagnosis of LP based on clinical and histological features;
- 3. HCV seropositivity based on serological test for circulating anti-HCV antibodies

Exclusion criteria were the following:

- 1. Studies involving patients with HCV and HIV co-infection
- 2. Studies where HCV could not be excluded from other causes of liver disease
- 3. Studies using references data or data from blood donors banks or historical controls
- 4. Duplicate studies (studies originating from the same subjects by the same investigators but published in different journals)
- 5. Articles providing insufficient information to calculate the OR

Search strategy for identification of studies

To identify relevant literature, bibliographical searches were performed in PubMed (January 1966 to November 2007), EMBASE (January 1988 to November 2007) CINAHL (January 1982 to November 2007) and SCOPUS (January 1960 to November 2007) databases using the following terms: 'Hepatitis C', 'Hepacivirus', 'HCV', 'lichen planus' and 'lichen*'. To identify additional studies, references lists of previously identified published papers were searched and the World Wide Web was searched by means of a search engine (http:// www.google.com). The title and abstract of each article resulting from the literature search were independently reviewed by two investigators and when the article was considered relevant, the full report was obtained. Disagreements about eligibility were resolved by consensus with a third reviewer. Articles published in any language were included.

Methods of the review

Selection of studies and assessment of study quality.

Every study included was assessed on the basis of: (i) characteristics of the study group (consecutive, unselected patients); (ii) appropriateness of the control group: subjects belonging to the control group must not differ importantly from those of the study group (sex and age must be matched, subjects of the control group must be selected from the study base); and (iii) prospective design (i.e. data and sera collected on purpose). Each of these criteria was rated as 'met', 'unmet' or 'unclear'. The global validity of the study was assessed using three categories: (i) low risk of bias: all criteria met; (ii) moderate risk of bias: at least one criterion unmet or three criteria unclear. The critical ed out without blinding **whether**

appraisal of the studies was carried out without blinding the name of the authors, institutions or journal Final decision about inclusion or exclusion was made by mutual agreement

Data about the study, its eligibility, validity, design and outcome information, were recorded on an abstraction form.

Data extraction and statistical analysis. For each study, data on the numbers of subjects of the study group and the control group with a positive outcome (HCV seropositivity among LPs, and LP among HCV seropositives), were extracted. For each study an OR and 95% CI was calculated. Where absence of events in one of the groups caused problems with computation of OR. 0.5 was added to all values for that study, except when absence of events involved both study and control groups, in which case OR was undefined (Deeks et al, 2001). Heterogeneity was measured calculating I^2 , a statistic for quantifying inconsistency among studies. However, as heterogeneity among studies was expected on the basis of a large variability in HCV prevalence across different countries, a random effect was used to calculate the summary estimate.

Subgroup analysis was undertaken for geographical area, patients with oral lesions, age, studies excluding lichenoid reactions and researches including a confirmatory HCV test further to the screening one. Sensitivity analysis was undertaken excluding studies of lower methodological quality (i.e. studies at moderate and high risk of bias). To investigate potential for publication bias we checked for asymmetry of the funnel plot of the OR of the included studies. The statistical analysis was conducted using RevMan5, a copyrighted freeware developed by the Cochrane Collaboration, for preparing and maintaining reviews (http://www.cochrane-net.org/ revman).

Results

From 447 articles identified with different search strategies, 97 potentially eligible studies were found, of them 70 studies worldwide investigated HCV seroprevalence among LP patients (Table 1) and 27 of them investigated the frequency of LP in patients with chronic HCV infection met the criteria to be included in the review (Figure 1).

HCV prevalence among LP patients

The overall prevalence of HCV in LP patients according to the 70 studies involving 6378 patients was 22.3%, with a high variability among and within countries (Table 1). Among these studies, 33 met our inclusion criteria and were considered for the systematic review (Cribier *et al*, 1994; Santander *et al*, 1994; Bellman *et al*, 1995; Gimenez-Arnau *et al*, 1995; Tanei *et al*, 1995; Carrozzo *et al*, 1996; Sanchez-Perez *et al*, 1996; Dupin *et al*, 1997; Imhof *et al*, 1997; Serpico *et al*, 1997; Bagan *et al*, 1998; Ilter *et al*, 1998; Ingafou *et al*, 1998; Mignogna *et al*, 1998; Ibrahim *et al*, 1999; Issa *et al*, 1999; Tucker and Coulson, 1999; Kirtak *et al*, 2000; $\label{eq:table_$

| Ali and Suresh, 2007 40 0 Amer et al, 2007 30 21 Asaad and Samdani, 2005 114 30 Bagan et al, 1998 100 23 Beard et al, 2001 24 4 Bellman et al, 1995 30 7 Bokor-Bratic, 2004 48 0 Campisi et al, 2004 859 238 Carnozzo et al, 1996 70 19 Chainani-Wu et al, 2004 31 14 Chuang et al, 2004 32 14 Chinani-Wu et al, 2004 32 14 Divano et al, 2006 104 2 del Olmo et al, 2001 169 36 del Olmo et al, 2002 57 9 Das et al, 2006 104 7 Divano et al, 1991 102 8 Bupin et al, 2004 146 1 <td< th=""><th>Reference</th><th>Lichen planus patients</th><th>Number of HCV+ subjects</th></td<> | Reference | Lichen planus patients | Number of HCV+ subjects |
|--|---|---------------------------|----------------------------|
| And and Salexa, 2007 30 21 Asaad and Samdani, 2005 114 30 Bagan et al, 1994 187 28 Bagan et al, 1995 30 7 Bokan et al, 1995 30 7 Bokan et al, 2001 24 4 Bellman et al, 1995 30 7 Bokon-Bratic, 2004 859 238 Carnozzo et al, 1996 70 19 Chuang et al, 2004 32 14 Cribier et al, 1994 52 2 Daramola et al, 2002 57 9 Das et al, 2006 104 2 del Olmo et al, 2000 169 36 de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007 50 1 Deni et al, 2004 140 7 Divano et al, 1992 46 11 Divano et al, 1994 56 13 Dupon et al, 1997 29 4 Gandolfo et al, 2002 68 6 Gandolfo et al, 2002 64 0 Garg et al, 2002 64 0 Garg et al, 2002 64 | Ali and Surash 2007 | 40 | 0 |
| Asaad and Samdani, 200511430Bagan et al, 199418728Bagan et al, 199810023Beaird et al, 2001244Bellman et al, 1995307Bokor-Bratic, 2004480Carrozzo et al, 19967019Chainani-Wu et al, 20043114Chung et al, 20043214Cribier et al, 1994522Das et al, 20061042del Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Deni et al, 200416936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupin et al, 19971028Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Grarg et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Grarg et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Grarg et al, 20041467Perez-Castrillon, 2003733Giulani et al, 2007799Grott et al, 1998241Giunenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Arnau et al, 199550Issa et al, 1998750Issa et al, 1999439Itter et al, 2005 <td< td=""><td>Amer <i>et al</i> 2007</td><td>30</td><td>21</td></td<> | Amer <i>et al</i> 2007 | 30 | 21 |
| Bagan et al, 199418728Bagan et al, 199810023Beaird et al, 2001244Bellman et al, 1995307Bokor-Bratic, 2004480Carnpisi et al, 2004859238Carrozzo et al, 19967019Chainani-Wu et al, 20043114Chuang et al, 20043214Cribier et al, 1999222Daramola et al, 20043214Cribier et al, 1994522Daramola et al, 2002579Das et al, 200616936del Olmo et al, 200116936del Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Denli et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupin et al, 20041447Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Arnau et al, 1995250Itter et al, 1998750Itter et al, 1998550Itter et al, 1999439Itter et al, 1999439Itter et al, 2004442Karavelogiu et al, 2005440Giulanic et al, 20054413Ingenceiro et al, 199 | Asaad and Samdani, 2005 | 114 | 30 |
| Bagan et al, 199810023Beaird et al, 2001244Bellman et al, 1995307Bokor-Bratic, 2004480Campisi et al, 2004859238Carrozzo et al, 19967019Chainani-Wu et al, 20043114Chuang et al, 19992212Chung et al, 20043214Cribier et al, 1994522Daramola et al, 200016936del Olmo et al, 200016936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Deni et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19971028Dupond et al, 19971028Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Grober et al, 2005665Haram et al, 20041288Brahm et al, 1998241Giuereizo et al, 2005665Haram et al, 20041288Brahm et al, 1999342Karaveliogiu et al, 2005604Gandolfo et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 2005605Haram et al, 20041288Brahim et al, 2005440Karaveliogiu et al, 2005 <t< td=""><td>Bagan et al, 1994</td><td>187</td><td>28</td></t<> | Bagan et al, 1994 | 187 | 28 |
| Beaird et al, 2001 24 4 Bellman et al, 1995 30 7 Bokor-Bratic, 2004 48 0 Carrozzo et al, 1996 70 19 Chainani-Wu et al, 2004 31 14 Chung et al, 1999 22 12 Chung et al, 2004 32 14 Cribier et al, 1994 52 2 Daramola et al, 2000 169 36 del Olmo et al, 2000 169 36 de Matos Camargo et al, 2007 50 1 Denli et al, 2004 140 7 Divano et al, 1992 46 11 Divano et al, 1997 102 8 Egan and Zone, 1997 29 4 Eisen, 2002 195 0 Erkek et al, 2001 54 7 Figueiredo et al, 2002 68 6 Gandolfo et al, 1994 105 10 Garg et al, 2002 64 0 Gimenez-Garcia and 101 9 Perez-Castrillon, 2003 73 3 Gimenez-Arnau et al, 1995 2 | Bagan et al, 1998 | 100 | 23 |
| Bellman et al, 1995307Bokor-Bratic, 2004480Campisi et al, 2004859238Carrozzo et al, 19967019Chainani-Wu et al, 20043114Chuang et al, 19992212Chung et al, 1994522Daramola et al, 2002579Das et al, 20061042del Olmo et al, 200016936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Denli et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupin et al, 19971028Dupond et al, 19971028Egna nd Zone, 1997294Gandolfo et al, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Gara et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Giudiani et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arrau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Arrau et al, 1995250Iradiuni et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041467Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003604Iradiuni et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 20054413In | Beaird et al, 2001 | 24 | 4 |
| Bokor-Bratic, 2004 48 0 Campisi et al, 2004 859 238 Carrozzo et al, 1996 70 19 Chiang et al, 2004 31 14 Chuang et al, 2004 32 14 Cribier et al, 1994 52 2 Daramola et al, 2002 57 9 Das et al, 2006 104 2 del Olmo et al, 2000 169 36 de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007 50 1 Denli et al, 2004 140 7 Divano et al, 1992 46 11 Divano et al, 1997 102 8 Dupond et al, 1997 29 4 Egan and Zone, 1997 29 4 Eisen, 2002 15 0 Frigueiredo et al, 2002 64 0 Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007 73 3 Gimenez-Anrau et al, 1995 25 11 Gimenez-Anrau et al, 1995 25 11 Gimenez-Airella, 2005 66 5 | Bellman <i>et al</i> , 1995 | 30 | 7 |
| Campis <i>et al.</i> , 2004 859 258 258 258 258 258 258 258 258 258 258 | Bokor-Bratic, 2004 | 48 | 228 |
| Carlo220 <i>et al.</i> , 1990 10 19 Chainani ⁺ Wu <i>et al.</i> , 2004 31 14 Chuang <i>et al.</i> , 1999 22 12 Chung <i>et al.</i> , 2004 32 14 Cribier <i>et al.</i> , 1994 52 2 Daramola <i>et al.</i> , 2002 57 9 Das <i>et al.</i> , 2006 104 2 del Olmo <i>et al.</i> , 2000 169 36 de Mattos Camargo <i>et al.</i> , 2007 50 1 Denli <i>et al.</i> , 2004 140 7 Divano <i>et al.</i> , 1992 46 11 Divano <i>et al.</i> , 1992 46 11 Divano <i>et al.</i> , 1994 56 13 Dupoin <i>et al.</i> , 1994 56 13 Dupoin <i>et al.</i> , 1997 102 8 Egan and Zone, 1997 29 4 Eisen, 2002 195 0 Gandolfo <i>et al.</i> , 2001 54 7 Figueiredo <i>et al.</i> , 2002 68 6 Gandolfo <i>et al.</i> , 2002 64 00 Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007 73 3 Ghodsi <i>et al.</i> , 2004 146 7 Giunenz-Arnau <i>et al.</i> , 1995 25 11 Gimenez-Arnau <i>et al.</i> , 1995 25 11 Gimenez-Garcia and 101 9 Perez-Castrillon, 2003 66 Guard <i>et al.</i> , 1998 24 1 Guerreiro <i>et al.</i> , 2005 66 5 Harman <i>et al.</i> , 2004 128 8 Ibrahim <i>et al.</i> , 2005 79 9 Grote <i>et al.</i> , 2005 66 5 Harman <i>et al.</i> , 2004 128 8 Ibrahim <i>et al.</i> , 2005 66 5 Harman <i>et al.</i> , 2004 412 Kaja <i>et al.</i> , 2005 44 13 Ingafou <i>et al.</i> , 1998 75 0 Imhof <i>et al.</i> , 1998 75 0 Imhof <i>et al.</i> , 1999 34 So 0 Iker <i>et al.</i> , 1998 75 0 Imhof <i>et al.</i> , 2005 566 5 Harman <i>et al.</i> , 2004 418 28 Karavelioglu <i>et al.</i> , 2005 44 00 Karavelioglu <i>et al.</i> , 2005 50 Iker <i>et al.</i> , 1999 53 Kirtschig <i>et al.</i> , 2005 50 Gou 64 12 Kaja <i>et al.</i> , 2005 50 Gou 64 Clasanton 73 5 Kirtschig <i>et al.</i> , 2005 50 Gou 64 Clasanton 73 5 Kirtschig <i>et al.</i> , 2005 50 Gou 66 Jarman <i>et al.</i> , 2005 73 Kirtschig <i>et al.</i> , 20 | Carrozzo at al 1006 | 859 | 238 |
| Channal with a 19002111Chuang et al, 19943212Chung et al, 20043214Cribier et al, 1994522Daramola et al, 200016936del Olmo et al, 200016936del Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Denli et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupin et al, 19971028Bupond et al, 1998288Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Giumenz-Carcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750ImagaYou et al, 2005440Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Karavelioglu et al, 2004128Karavelioglu et al, 2005160IngaYou et al, 2005160Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2005160Issa et al, 1998750Im | Chainani-Wu <i>at al</i> 2004 | 31 | 19 |
| Chung et al, 20043214Cribier et al, 1994522Daramola et al, 2002579Das et al, 20061042del Olmo et al, 200016936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Denli et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupon et al, 19971028Bupond et al, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghods et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Castrillon, 2003665Harman et al, 2005665Harman et al, 2005665Harman et al, 2005665Harman et al, 2004142Kaizeligu et al, 2005440Iter et al, 1998550Ites et al, 20036044Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodold142Khaja et al, 20036016Sas et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 20051000Lodold142Khaja et al, 20031613Iter et al, 1998550Iter et | Chuang et al 1999 | 22 | 12 |
| Cribier et al, 1994522Daramola et al, 2002579Das et al, 20061042del Olmo et al, 200016936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Denli et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupon et al, 19971028Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gara et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Giumenze-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenze-Arnau et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 200 | Chung <i>et al.</i> 2004 | 32 | 14 |
| Daramola et al, 2002 57 9 Das et al, 20061042del Olmo et al, 200016936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007 50 1Denli et al, 2004140 7 Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 1994 56 13Dupond et al, 1997102 8 Bupond et al, 199729 4 Eisen, 2002195 0 Erkek et al, 2001 54 7 Figueiredo et al, 200268 6 Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 200264 0 Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 200773 3 Ghods et al, 2004146 7 Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Castrillon, 2003 66 5 Harman et al, 2004128 8 Ibrahim et al, 199875 0 Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 200441 2 Karavelioglu et al, 200441 2 Kirtschig et al, 200544 0 Ikmotoya et al, 200544 0 Ikmotoya et al, 200566 5 Parama et al, 2005100 0 Lode et al, 200544 0 Kirtschig et al, 200544 0 Karavelioglu et al, 200566 1 Ravelioglu et al, 2005 66 1 Ravelioglu et al, 2005 66 1 Ravelioglef | Cribier <i>et al</i> , 1994 | 52 | 2 |
| Das et al, 20061042del Olmo et al, 200016936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Denli et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19971028Dupon et al, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garag et al, 2002640Ghodsei et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 2005604Lassonoto et al, 20051000Luis-Montoya et al, 20051000Luis-Montoya et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005661Nagao et al, 1998752Paradi et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005 | Daramola et al, 2002 | 57 | 9 |
| del Olmo et al, 200016936de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007501Denli et al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19971028Dupond et al, 1998288Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Gare et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 2005665Harman et al, 2004112Kraavelioglu et al, 1998750Ibrahim et al, 2005440Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtak et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 2005440Klaravelioglu et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005661Mignogna et al, 2005661Narayan et al, 2005661Narayan et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 2005 <t< td=""><td>Das et al, 2006</td><td>104</td><td>2</td></t<> | Das et al, 2006 | 104 | 2 |
| de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007 50 1 Denli et al, 2004 140 7 Divano et al, 1992 46 11 Divano et al, 1994 56 13 Dupon et al, 1997 102 8 Egan and Zone, 1997 29 4 Eisen, 2002 195 0 Erkek et al, 2001 54 7 Figueiredo et al, 1994 105 10 Gara et al, 2002 64 0 Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007 73 3 Ghodsi et al, 2004 146 7 Gimenez-Arnau et al, 1995 25 11 Gimenez-Garcia and 101 9 Perez-Castrillon, 2003 - - Guerreiro et al, 2005 66 5 Harman et al, 2004 128 8 Ibrahim et al, 1999 43 9 Ilter et al, 1998 75 0 Imhof et al, 1997 84 13 Ingafou et al, 1999 34 2 Karavelioglu et al, 2004 41 2 Kirtschig et al, 2005 | del Olmo et al, 2000 | 169 | 36 |
| Deniet al, 20041407Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupin et al, 19971028Bupond et al, 1998288Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghadaeri and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003665Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 20062152Karavelioglu et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2005361Karavelioglu et al, 2005361Laeijendecker et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2005661Ravelioglu et al, 2005661Ravelioglu et al, 2005661Ravelioglu et al, 2005661Karavelioglu et al, 2005661Karavelioglu et al, 2005661Ravelioglu et al, 2005661Ravelioglu et al, 200560165N | de Mattos Camargo et al, 2007 | 50 | 1 |
| Divano et al, 19924611Divano et al, 19945613Dupond et al, 19971028Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2002650Rarayeliogli et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Naraya et al, 2005661Rabio be et al, 2005661Rabio be et al, 2005661Rabio be et al, 200566< | Denli et al, 2004 | 140 | 7 |
| Dypin et al, 19943613Dupin et al, 19971028Dupond et al, 1998288Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 20054528Narayan et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 1998752Rittak et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 20054528Narayan et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 2005661< | Divano <i>et al</i> , 1992 | 46 | 11 |
| Dupond et al, 19971026Dupond et al, 1998288Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 200366Giuliani et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imagiou et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Kirtschig et al, 2005440Kiartschig et al, 2005440Kiartschig et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2003604Lasipendecker et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prablu et al, 2002650Rahama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 1996 | Divano <i>et al.</i> 1994 Dupin <i>et al.</i> 1997 | 30 102 | 15 |
| Despine (1, 19)294Egan and Zone, 1997294Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghadsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 2005440Kintschig et al, 2005440Kintschig et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 200260165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 2002661Rabboob et al, 2002661Rabboob et al, 2002661Rabna et al, 2005661 <t< td=""><td>Dupond et al. 1997</td><td>28</td><td>8</td></t<> | Dupond et al. 1997 | 28 | 8 |
| Eisen, 20021950Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 2005665Harman et al, 2005665Harman et al, 2005665Harman et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klaai et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 2005361Maboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 2005361Mignogna et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2002650Rahama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 1996781 | Egan and Zone, 1997 | 29 | 4 |
| Erkek et al, 2001547Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 20039Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005661Maboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Rosy et al, 2000 <td>Eisen, 2002</td> <td>195</td> <td>0</td> | Eisen, 2002 | 195 | 0 |
| Figueiredo et al, 2002686Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 20030Giuliani et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeigendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 1996 </td <td>Erkek et al, 2001</td> <td>54</td> <td>7</td> | Erkek et al, 2001 | 54 | 7 |
| Gandolfo et al, 199410510Garg et al, 2002640Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 2003799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19964528Sast and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Santander et al, 19967816Santand | Figueiredo et al, 2002 | 68 | 6 |
| Garg et al, 2002 64 0 Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007 73 3 Ghodsi et al, 2004 146 7 Gimenez-Arnau et al, 1995 25 11 Gimenez-Garcia and 101 9 Perez-Castrillon, 2003 101 9 Grote et al, 2007 79 9 Grote et al, 2005 66 5 Harman et al, 2004 128 8 Ibrahim et al, 1998 24 1 Guerreiro et al, 2005 66 5 Harman et al, 1999 43 9 Ilter et al, 1998 75 0 Imhof et al, 1997 84 13 Ingafou et al, 1998 55 0 Issa et al, 1999 34 2 Karavelioglu et al, 2004 41 2 Khirak et al, 2000 73 5 Kirtschig et al, 2005 44 0 Klanrit et al, 2003 60 4 Laeijendecker et al, 2005 36 1 Mahboob et al, 2003 184 43 Mignogna et al, 1998 75 2 Parodi et al, 1996 61 13 Prabhu et al, 2002 65 0 Rahnama et al, 1992 79 21 Rossi and Colasanto, 2000 100 13 Roy et al, 2000 6 0 Santander et al, 1996 78 16 Santand | Gandolfo et al, 1994 | 105 | 10 |
| Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007733Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 20039Giuliani et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 2005661Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico | Garg et al, 2002 | 64 | 0 |
| Ghodsi et al, 20041467Gimenez-Arnau et al, 19952511Gimenez-Garcia and1019Perez-Castrillon, 20039Giuliani et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 2005440Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serptico et al, 19964528Serptico et al, 19964528Serptico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007 | 73 | 3 |
| Gimenez-Arnau et al, 1995 25 11 Gimenez-Garcia and 101 9 Perez-Castrillon, 2003 79 9 Giuliani et al, 2007 79 9 Grote et al, 1998 24 11 Guerreiro et al, 2005 66 5 Harman et al, 2004 128 8 Ibrahim et al, 1999 43 9 Ilter et al, 1998 75 0 Imhof et al, 1997 84 13 Ingafou et al, 1998 55 0 Issa et al, 2006 21 52 Kirtak et al, 2000 73 5 Kirtschig et al, 2005 44 0 Klanrit et al, 2003 60 4 Laeijendecker et al, 2005 100 0 Lodi et al, 2004 303 58 Luis-Montoya et al, 2005 36 1 Mahboob et al, 2003 184 43 Mignogna et al, 1998 75 2 Parodi et al, 1995 45 28 Narayan et al, 1996 61 13 Prabhu et al, 2002 66 1 Rebora et al, 2005 66 1 Rebora et al, 2000 6 0 Sanchez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Ghodsi <i>et al</i> , 2004 | 146 | 7 |
| Chinelez-Garcia and Perez-Castrillon, 20031019Giuliani et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Gimenez-Arnau <i>et al</i> , 1995 | 25 | 11 |
| Giuliani et al, 2007799Grote et al, 1998241Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 20062152Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serptico et al, 19953211 | Perez-Castrillon 2003 | 101 | 9 |
| Similar of et al, 1998241Grote et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Giuliani <i>et al.</i> 2007 | 79 | 9 |
| Guerreiro et al, 2005665Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klarrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prablu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 19953211 | Grote <i>et al</i> , 1998 | 24 | 1 |
| Harman et al, 20041288Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 1998752Parodi et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Guerreiro et al, 2005 | 66 | 5 |
| Ibrahim et al, 1999439Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 19953211 | Harman et al, 2004 | 128 | 8 |
| Ilter et al, 1998750Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 2005661Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 19953211 | Ibrahim et al, 1999 | 43 | 9 |
| Imhof et al, 19978413Ingafou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999342Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prablu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 19953211 | Ilter et al, 1998 | 75 | 0 |
| Ingatou et al, 1998550Issa et al, 1999 34 2Karavelioglu et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 19987528Narayan et al, 19966113Prablu et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Imhof <i>et al</i> , 1997 | 84 | 13 |
| Issa et al, 1999 54 2 Karavelioglu et al, 200441 2 Khaja et al, 2006 21 52 Kirtak et al, 2000 73 5 Kirtschig et al, 2005 44 0 Klanrit et al, 2003 60 4 Laeijendecker et al, 2005 100 0 Lodi et al, 2004 303 58 Luis-Montoya et al, 2005 36 1 Mahoob et al, 2003 184 43 Mignogna et al, 1998 263 76 Mignogna et al, 1995 45 28 Narayan et al, 1995 45 28 Narayan et al, 1996 61 13 Prabhu et al, 2002 65 0 Rahnama et al, 2005 66 1 Rebora et al, 1992 79 21 Rossi and Colasanto, 2000 100 13 Roy et al, 2000 6 0 Sanchez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1994 50 19 Sata et al, 1995 32 11 | Ingatou <i>et al</i> , 1998 | 55 24 | 0 |
| Ratavenogin et al, 2004412Khaja et al, 20062152Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahoob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19953211 | Issa et al. 1999 Karavelioglu et al. 2004 | 54 41 | 2 |
| Anigh et al, 20002132Kirtak et al, 2000735Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Khaia et al. 2006 | 21 | 52 |
| Kirtschig et al, 2005440Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19953211 | Kirtak <i>et al.</i> 2000 | 73 | 5 |
| Klanrit et al, 2003604Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19953211 | Kirtschig et al, 2005 | 44 | 0 |
| Laeijendecker et al, 20051000Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19953211 | Klanrit et al, 2003 | 60 | 4 |
| Lodi et al, 200430358Luis-Montoya et al, 2005361Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19953211 | Laeijendecker et al, 2005 | 100 | 0 |
| Luis-Montoya et al, 2005 36 1Mahboob et al, 200318443Mignogna et al, 199826376Mignogna et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19953211 | Lodi et al, 2004 | 303 | 58 |
| Mahboob et al. 200318443Mignogna et al. 199826376Mignogna et al. 2002600165Nagao et al. 19954528Narayan et al. 19966113Prabhu et al. 2002650Rahnama et al. 2005661Rebora et al. 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al. 200060Sanchez-Perez et al. 19967816Santander et al. 19945019Sata et al. 19953211 | Luis-Montoya <i>et al</i> , 2005 | 36 | 1 |
| Mignogna et al, 199826576Mignogna et al, 2002600165Nagao et al, 19954528Narayan et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Mahboob <i>et al</i> , 2003 | 184 | 43 |
| Anginogia et al. 2002600105Nagao et al. 19954528Narayan et al. 19966113Prabhu et al. 2002650Rahnama et al. 2005661Rebora et al. 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al. 200060Sanchez-Perez et al. 19967816Santander et al. 19945019Sata et al. 19964528Serpico et al. 199710036Schmitt et al. 19953211 | Mignogna et al. 2002 | 203 | /0 |
| Narayan et al, 19961920Narayan et al, 19966113Praodi et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Nagao et al 1995 | 45 | 28 |
| Parodi et al, 19966113Prabhu et al, 2002650Rahnama et al, 2005661Rebora et al, 19927921Rossi and Colasanto, 200010013Roy et al, 200060Sanchez-Perez et al, 19967816Santander et al, 19945019Sata et al, 19964528Serpico et al, 199710036Schmitt et al, 19953211 | Naravan <i>et al.</i> 1998 | 75 | 20 |
| Prabhu et al, 2002 65 0 Rahnama et al, 2005 66 1 Rebora et al, 1992 79 21 Rossi and Colasanto, 2000 100 13 Roy et al, 2000 6 0 Sanchez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1994 50 19 Sata et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Parodi <i>et al.</i> 1996 | 61 | 13 |
| Rahnama et al, 2005 66 1 Rebora et al, 1992 79 21 Rossi and Colasanto, 2000 100 13 Roy et al, 2000 6 0 Sanchez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1994 50 19 Sata et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Prabhu et al, 2002 | 65 | 0 |
| Rebora et al, 1992 79 21 Rossi and Colasanto, 2000 100 13 Roy et al, 2000 6 0 Sanchez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1994 50 19 Sata et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Rahnama et al, 2005 | 66 | 1 |
| Rossi and Colasanto, 2000 100 13 Roy et al, 2000 6 0 Sanchez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1994 50 19 Sata et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Rebora et al, 1992 | 79 | 21 |
| Roy et al, 2000 6 0 Sanchez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1994 50 19 Sata et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Rossi and Colasanto, 2000 | 100 | 13 |
| Sancnez-Perez et al, 1996 78 16 Santander et al, 1994 50 19 Sata et al, 1996 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Roy et al, 2000 | 6 | 0 |
| Santanuel et al., 1994 50 19 Sata et al., 1996 45 28 Serpico et al., 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al., 1995 32 11 | Sanchez-Perez <i>et al</i> , 1996 | /8 | 16 |
| Sata et al, 1970 45 28 Serpico et al, 1997 100 36 Schmitt et al, 1995 32 11 | Santanuer et al. 1994 | 50 45 | 19 |
| Schmitt <i>et al</i> , 1995 32 11 | Sernico et al 1997 | 100 | 20 |
| | Schmitt <i>et al</i> , 1995 | 32 | 11 |

604 Table 1 (Continued)

| Reference | Lichen planus patients | Number of HCV+ subjects |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|
| Tanei et al, 1995 | 45 | 17 |
| Tucker and Coulson, 1999 | 45 | 0 |
| van der Meij and van der Waal, 2000 | 55 | 0 |
| Yarom et al, 2007 | 62 | 3 |
| Total | 6378 | 1420 (22.26%) |

Beaird *et al*, 2001; Erkek *et al*, 2001; Daramola *et al*, 2002; Garg *et al*, 2002; Gimenez-Garcia and Perez-Castrillon, 2003; Klanrit *et al*, 2003; Bokor-Bratic, 2004; Harman *et al*, 2004; Lodi *et al*, 2004; Luis-Montoya *et al*, 2005; Rahnama *et al*, 2005; Das *et al*, 2006; Ali and Suresh, 2007; Ghaderi and Makhmalbaf, 2007; Yarom *et al*, 2007).

Characteristics of the included studies. The main characteristics of the 33 included studies are presented in Table 2. Nineteen out of 33 studies were from European countries, two from USA, two from Africa, six from Asia, two from Middle East and two from South America. Two studies were written in a language different from English: one in Portuguese and one in Italian.

Eleven included only patients with oral lesions, which were present in a variable proportion in most of the other studies. The control group was enrolled amongst dermatological patients in 12 studies, in one case some patients with potentially HCV associated dermatological conditions (porphyria cutanea tarda, cutaneous vaculitis and prurigo) were excluded, while another included psoriasis patients only. The other control groups were formed by dental patients (five studies), blood donors (four study), dental health care workers (two study), healthy subjects (two studies), patients with unrelated oral keratoses (two study), surgical patients (two studies), healthy subjects and dermatological patients (one study), HIV negative outpatients (one study); in two studies the origin of control group was not specified. The serological test adopted to detect circulating anti-HCV antibodies was a second generation ELISA in 14 studies and a third/fourth generation ELISA in 15; in four cases the characteristics of the test were not reported. Positive results were confirmed by means of another test in 14 studies (Table 2).

Critical appraisal of the included studies. On the basis of the criteria previously described, nine studies resulted at low risk of bias, 11 were judged at moderate risk of bias, and 13 at high risk of bias (Table 2). The first criterion was met in less of half the studies, since study group was clearly formed by consecutive, unselected patients with LP in only 15 of the 33 studies. Of the other two criteria, control group was adequately selected and matched in 20 cases and the study had a prospective design in 19. None of the studies published in form of letter or abstract was judged at low risk of bias.



Figure 1 Flow diagram

| Table 2 (| Characteristics o | f the studies | included in th | ne meta-analysis | investigating HCV | prevalence in lichen | planus patients |
|-----------|-------------------|---------------|----------------|------------------|-------------------|----------------------|-----------------|
|-----------|-------------------|---------------|----------------|------------------|-------------------|----------------------|-----------------|

| | | Li | chen planus group | | Control group | Sero | | |
|-----------------|----------------------------------|-----|----------------------|-----|--|-------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Country | Reference | n | Oral lesions | n | Provenience | Screening | Confirmatory | Risk of bias |
| Brazil | Issa <i>et al</i> , 1999 | 34 | 9/34 | 60 | Blood donors | ELISA 3 | Unspecified | High |
| France | Cribier et al, 1994 | 52 | 4/52 | 112 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 | Moderate |
| | Dupin et al, 1997 | 102 | 102/102 | 306 | Surgical patients ^a | ELISA 3 | RIBA 3 | Moderate |
| Egypt | Ibrahim et al, 1999 | 43 | Unspecified | 30 | Dermatology patients | Unspecified | Unspecified | High |
| Germany | Imhof et al, 1997 | 84 | 45/84 | 87 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 | High |
| India | Das et al, 2006 | 104 | Unspecified | 150 | HIV negative outpatients | ELISA 3 | Unspecified | High |
| Iran | Ghaderi et al. 2007 | 73 | Ûnclear | 150 | Blood donors | ELISA 3 | 1 | High |
| | Rahnama et al, 2005 | 66 | Unclear | 140 | Blood donors | ELISA | RIBA 2 | High |
| Israel | Yarom et al, 2007 | 62 | 62/62 | 62 | Patients with other oral conditions ^b | ELISA 3 | RIBA 3 | Low |
| Italy | Carrozzo et al, 1996 | 70 | 70/70 | 70 | Patients with other oral conditions ^c | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 | Low |
| | Serpico et al, 1997 | 100 | 100/100 | 100 | Dental patients | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 | Moderate |
| | Mignogna et al, 1998 | 263 | 263/263 | 100 | Dental patients | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 | High |
| | Lodi et al, 2004 | 303 | 303/303 | 278 | Dental patients | ELISA 3 | Line immunoassy | Low |
| Japan | Tanei et al, 1995 | 45 | 37/45 | 45 | Surgical patients (orthopedic) | ELISA 2 | Unspecified | Moderate |
| Mexico | Luis-Montoya <i>et al</i> , 2005 | 36 | Unclear | 60 | Blood donors | ELISA 3 | Unspecified | High |
| Nepal | Garg et al, 2002 | 86 | 29/86 | 43 | Unknown | ELISA 3 | e | Moderate |
| Nigeria | Daramola et al, 2002 | 57 | Unspecified | 48 | Healthy and dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | Unspecified | Moderate |
| Saudi Arabia | Ali et al, 2007 | 40 | 40/40 | 40 | Dental patients | ELISA 3 | Unspecified | Moderate |
| Serbia | Bokor-Bratic et al, 2004 | 48 | 48/48 | 60 | Dental patients | ELISA 4 | Unspecified | Low |
| Spain | Santander et al, 1994 | 50 | Unspecified | 27 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | PCR | High |
| * | Gimenez-Arnau et al, 1995 | 25 | Unspecified | 18 | Unknown | Unspecified | Unspecified | High |
| | Sanchez Perez et al, 1996 | 78 | 56/78 | 82 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | Unspecified | Low |
| | Bagan et al, 1998 | 100 | 100/100 | 100 | Healthy subjects | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 or 3 | Moderate |
| | Gimenez-Garcia et al, 2003 | 101 | 53/101 | 99 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 | Low |
| Thailand | Klanrit et al, 2003 | 60 | 60/60 | 60 | Dental health care workers | ELISA 3 | RNA | High |
| Turkey | Ilter et al, 1998 | 75 | Unspecified | 75 | Dermatology patients | Unspecified | _e | Moderate |
| | Kirtak et al, 2000 | 73 | 27/73 | 73 | Dermatology patients ^d | ELISA 3 | Unspecified | Moderate |
| | Erkek et al, 2001 | 52 | 7/52 | 54 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 3 | Unspecified | Low |
| | Harman et al, 2004 | 128 | 52/128 | 128 | Healthy subjects | ELISA 3 | Unspecified | Low |
| UK | Ingafou et al, 1998 | 55 | 55/55 | 110 | Dental health care workers | ELISA 3 | _e ^ | High |
| | Tucker et al, 1999 | 45 | 13/45 | 32 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | RIBA 3 | Low |
| USA | Bellman et al, 1995 | 30 | Unspecified | 41 | Dermatology patients | ELISA 2 | RIBA 2 | Moderate |
| | Beaird et al, 2001 | 24 | Unspecified | 20 | Dermatology patients (psoriasis) | Unspecified | Unspecified | High |

^aExcluding patients with hepatic diseases, receiving haemodialysis and transplant patients.

^bHyperkeratosis, oral candidiasis, recurrent aphthous stomatitis, pemphigus vulgaris, mucous membrane pemphigoid, benign oral growth.

^cLeukoplakia, frictional keratosis, verrucous carcinoma, nicotinic stomatitis, white spongious nevus.

^dExcluding patients with porphyria cutanea tarda, cutaneous vaculitis and prurigo.

^eAll subjects were negative.

Meta-analysis. The total number of patients of the included studies was 5404. In five studies no seropositive patients were found in either group. In these studies OR could not be calculated. The proportion of HCV-positive subjects was higher in the lichen planus group compared with controls in all the other studies but two, the OR of HCV seropositivity in patients with LP varying between 0.23 (95% CI: 0.01–5.85) and 15.94 (95% CI: 2.00–127.22). The summary estimate OR for all studies was 4.85 (95% CI: 3.58–6.56) (Figure 2), showing a statistically significant difference in the proportion of HCV seropositive subjects among lichen planus patients, compared with

controls. Interestingly, despite the high geographical variety, heterogeneity of the results was not significant $(I^2 = 10.7\%)$.

Subgroup analysis. In 11 studies all patients included had oral lesions (with and without cutaneous lesions), also in this subgroup, HCV seroprevalence was significantly more common among LP patients than controls (OR = 5.56~95% CI: 3.50-8.81). The summary estimate OR increased considerably in the Mediterranean studies (OR = 6.99~95% CI: 4.92-9.94), while, in the studies from Northern Europe, halved, becoming not significant (OR = 2.14~95% CI: 0.59-7.69). The sumLichen planus and HCV infection G Lodi et al

| | 2 | | |
|---|-----|----|--|
| 6 | () | 6 | |
| 0 | v | U. | |

| | Lichen | planus | Contr | ols | | Odds ratio | Odds ratio |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------|-----------|-----------|--------|-------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|
| Study or subgroup | Events | Total E | Events | Total | Weight | M-H, Random, 95% Cl | M-H, Random, 95% Cl |
| Ali 2007 | 0 | 40 | 0 | 40 | | Not estimable | |
| Garg 2002 | 0 | 64 | 0 | 43 | | Not estimable | |
| llter 1998 | 0 | 75 | 0 | 75 | | Not estimable | |
| Ingafou 1998 | 0 | 55 | 0 | 110 | | Not estimable | |
| Bokor Bratic 2004 | 0 | 48 | 0 | 60 | | Not estimable | |
| Tucker 1999 | 0 | 45 | 1 | 32 | 0.9% | 0.23 [0.01, 5.85] | |
| Rahnama 2005 | 1 | 66 | 3 | 140 | 1.7% | 0.70 [0.07, 6.88] | |
| Daramola 2002 | 9 | 57 | 6 | 48 | 6.1% | 1.31 [0.43, 3.99] | |
| Cribier 1994 | 2 | 52 | 3 | 112 | 2.6% | 1.45 [0.24, 8.97] | |
| Dupin 1997 | 8 | 102 | 14 | 306 | 8.5% | 1.78 [0.72, 4.36] | |
| Ibrahim 1999 | 9 | 43 | 3 | 30 | 4.1% | 2.38 [0.59, 9.67] | |
| Yarom 2007 | 3 | 62 | 1 | 62 | 1.7% | 3.10 [0.31, 30.67] | |
| lssa 1999 | 2 | 34 | 1 | 60 | 1.5% | 3.69 [0.32, 42.25] | |
| Beaird 2001 | 4 | 24 | 1 | 20 | 1.7% | 3.80 [0.39, 37.13] | |
| Erkek 2001 | 7 | 54 | 2 | 54 | 3.2% | 3.87 [0.77, 19.57] | |
| Gimenenz Garcia 2003 | 39 | 101 | 2 | 99 | 3.4% | 4.74 [1.00, 22.54] | |
| Luis Montoya 2005 | 1 | 36 | 0 | 60 | 0.9% | 5.11 [0.20, 128.90] | |
| Kirtak 2000 | 5 | 73 | 1 | 73 | 1.8% | 5.29 [0.60, 46.48] | - <u>+</u> |
| Bagan 1998 | 23 | 100 | 5 | 100 | 7.1% | 5.68 [2.06, 15.62] | |
| Serpico 1997 | 36 | 100 | 9 | 100 | 10.2% | 5.69 [2.56, 12.62] | |
| Bellman 1995 | 7 | 30 | 2 | 41 | 3.1% | 5.93 [1.14, 31.02] | |
| Ghaderi 2007 | 3 | 73 | 1 | 150 | 1.7% | 6.39 [0.65, 62.49] | |
| Lodi 2004 | 58 | 303 | 9 | 278 | 11.7% | 7.08 [3.43, 14.58] | |
| Das 2006 | 2 | 104 | 0 | 150 | 1.0% | 7.34 [0.35, 154.51] | |
| Carrozzo 1996 | 19 | 70 | 3 | 70 | 4.9% | 8.32 [2.33, 29.66] | |
| Harman 2004 | 8 | 128 | 1 | 128 | 2.0% | 8.47 [1.04, 68.71] | |
| Tanei 1995 | 17 | 45 | 3 | 45 | 4.6% | 8.50 [2.28, 31.73] | |
| Klanrit 2003 | 4 | 60 | 0 | 60 | 1.0% | 9.64 [0.51, 183.05] | |
| Sanchezperez 1996 | 16 | 78 | 2 | 82 | 3.6% | 10.32 [2.29, 46.58] | |
| Mignogna 1998 | 76 | 263 | 3 | 100 | 5.5% | 13.14 [4.04, 42.74] | |
| Gimenez Arnau 1995 | 11 | 25 | 1 | 18 | 1.8% | 13.36 [1.53, 116.50] | |
| Imhof 1997 | 13 | 84 | 1 | 87 | 2.0% | 15.75 [2.01, 123.31] | |
| Santander 1994 | 19 | 50 | 1 | 27 | 2.0% | 15.94 [2.00, 127.22] | |
| Total (95% CI) | | 2544 | | 2860 | 100.0% | 4.85 [3.58, 6.56] | • |
| Total events | 372 | | 79 | | | | |
| Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0 | 0.07; Chi ² | = 30.23 | , df = 27 | 7 (P = | 0.30); l ² = | 11% | |
| Test for overall effect: 2 | 7 = 10.24 | (P < 0.0) | 0001) | | | 0.005 | 0.1 1 10 200 |

Figure 2 Forest plot of odds ratio of HCV seropositivity (and 95% confidence intervals) in patients with lichen planus

mary estimate OR of studies from US was similar to the global one (OR = 5.09; 95% CI: 1.33–19.41) whereas the corresponding figure for Africa was even lower than in Northern Europe (OR = 1.65; 95% CI: 0.69-3.95). The pooling data of studies with a LP group with a mean age of 50 years or less showed that even in LP groups of younger age, the frequency of HCV seropositivity was significatively higher than in control groups (OR = 3.43 95% CI: 2.02–5.85).

Only 12 of the studies included in the meta-analysis clearly ruled out the possibility of a drug-induced lichenoid reaction but the OR still indicated a significant higher risk of HCV seropositivity in LP than in controls (3.91; 95% CI: 2.17–7.04) (Figure 3). Similarly, when we considered studies i including a confirmatory HCV test further to the screening one, the OR was close to the global one (4.76; 95% CI: 3.07–7.41).

Sensitivity test and publication bias. When studies with high and moderate risk of bias were excluded from all the meta-analysis the summary estimate did not change significantly (Figure 4). The visual examination of the symmetry of the funnel plot did not suggest large publication bias (Figure 5).

LP prevalence among HCV patients

From the articles resulting from the different search strategies, 27 potentially eligible studies were identified, 16 were excluded because they had no control group (descriptive design), three for the different study design and clinical diagnosis and two for lack of histological diagnosis (Figure 1). *Characteristics of the included studies.* The main characteristics of the 6 included studies are presented in Table 3. Two studies were from Brazil, and one each from France, Poland, Spain and Turkey. The control group was enrolled among dental patients in 3 studies, in two cases among healthy subjects and in one case among HCV-, HBV- and HIV- liver disease patients. In all studies HCV status was detected by ELISA and then confirmed by PCR or RIBA.

Critical appraisal of the included studies. On the basis of the criteria previously described, two studies resulted at low risk of bias, two were judged at moderate risk of bias, and two at high risk of bias. Only two studies clearly stated that the study group was formed by consecutive patients (Table 3).

Meta-analysis. The total number of patients of the included studies was 2197. In all six studies the prevalence of LP was higher among HCV-positive subjects compared with controls, the OR varying between 1.42 (95% CI: 0.13–15.94) and 7.43 (95% CI: 2.36–23.42). The summary estimate OR for all studies was 4.47 (95% CI: 1.84–10.86) (Figure 6), showing a statistically significant difference in the proportion of LP prevalence among HCV-positive subjects, compared with controls. As for the previous analysis, despite high geographical variety, heterogeneity of the results was not significant (I² = 0%).

Only three out of six studies (Bagan *et al*, 1998; Figueiredo *et al*, 2002; Cunha *et al*, 2005) reported detailed data on anti-HCV treatments. In 2 studies

| | Lichen p | lanus | Contro | ols | | Odds ratio | Odds ratio |
|--|----------------------------|------------|------------|-----------------------|--------|----------------------|---------------------|
| Study or subgroup | Events | Total | Events | Total | Weight | M-H, Random, 95% Cl | M-H, Random, 95% CI |
| Ingafou 1998 | 0 | 55 | 0 | 110 | | Not estimable | |
| Tucker 1999 | 0 | 45 | 1 | 32 | 3.0% | 0.23 [0.01, 5.85] | |
| Daramola 2002 | 9 | 57 | 6 | 48 | 15.4% | 1.31 [0.43, 3.99] | |
| Cribier 1994 | 2 | 52 | 3 | 112 | 8.0% | 1.45 [0.24, 8.97] | |
| Ibrahim 1999 | 9 | 43 | 3 | 30 | 11.6% | 2.38 [0.59, 9.67] | |
| Erkek 2001 | 7 | 54 | 2 | 54 | 9.5% | 3.87 [0.77, 9.57] | |
| Gimenenz Garcia 2003 | 9 | 101 | 2 | 99 | 10.1% | 4.74 [1.00, 22.54] | |
| Carrozzo 1996 | 19 | 70 | 3 | 70 | 13.2% | 8.32 [2.33, 29.66] | |
| Harman 2004 | 8 | 128 | 1 | 128 | 6.4% | 8.47 [1.04, 68.71] | |
| Tanei 1995 | 17 | 45 | 3 | 45 | 12.6% | 8.50 [2.28, 31.73] | |
| Klanrit 2003 | 4 | 60 | 0 | 60 | 3.6% | 9.64 [0.51, 183.05] | |
| Imhof 1997 | 13 | 84 | 1 | 87 | 6.6% | 15.75 [2.01, 123.31] | |
| Total (95% CI) | | 794 | | 875 | 100.0% | 3.91 [2.17, 7.04] | ◆ |
| Total events | 97 | | 25 | | | | |
| Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.26 | 6; Chi ² = 13.8 | 32, df = 1 | 10 (P = 0. | 18); l ² = | - 28% | ⊢ | |
| Test for overall effect: 7- | 151 (P < 0 C | 0001 | | | | 0.001 | 0.1 1 10 1000 |

Figure 3 Subanalysis: forest plot of odds ratio of HCV seropositivity (and 95% confidence intervals) in patients with lichen planus, in studies that ruled out the possibility of drug-induced lichenoid reactions



Figure 4 Sensitivity test: forest plot of odds ratio of HCV seropositivity (and 95% confidence intervals) in studies at low risk of bias



Figure 5 Funnel plot of the studies included in the review investigating HCV prevalence in lichen planus patients

(Figueiredo *et al*, 2002; Cunha *et al*, 2005), 37.5% of the patients with LP were previously exposed to IFN- α whereas the third study (Bagan *et al*, 1998) specifically stated that no significant differences were observed in the incidence of OLP between those patients who received interferon and those who did not.

Subgroup analysis. LP frequency was significantly higher among HCV-positive patients than controls either in Europe (OR = 4.26~95% CI: 1.13-16.10) or in Brazil (OR = 4.73~95% CI: 1.55-14.42).

Sensitivity test. When studies with high and moderate risk of bias were excluded from the meta-analysis the summary estimate was still statistically significant (OR = 6.9795% CI: 2.16-22.52).

The visual examination of the symmetry of the funnel plot did not suggest large publication bias.

Discussion

In this systematic review we firmly confirm the association between HCV infection and LP. According to the meta-analysis, the summary estimate of OR showed that LP patients have about a five fold higher risk than the controls of being HCV seropositive and the OR for exclusive OLP was not substantially different from the global one. Moreover, quite the same OR was found analysing the prevalence of LP among patients with CLD due to HCV infection. However, the data showed a marked study and geographical variability, with the relationship between HCV and LP being prevalent in Japan, Mediterranean countries and the USA. This figure explains the strong regional connotation of the association among LP and HCV infection that was observed mainly in Southern Europe where HCV is highly prevalent. Interestingly, a similar geographic variability has been demonstrated for other EHM linked to HCV infection, such as porphyria cutanea tarda, lymphoma and even mixed cryoglobulinemia (Gisbert et al, 2003; Dal and Franceschi, 2006; Cohen Tervaert et al, 2007).

Several factors could be potentially responsible for the observed variability in results. These may include misclassification of LP, the highly variable prevalence of HCV infection across the world, differences in the viral characteristics of HCV, differences in genetic 607

608

| | | | HCV subje | | | | | |
|---------|------------------------|-----|--|---------------------------|--------------------------|-----|--|-----------------|
| Country | | | | Serold | ogical tests | | | |
| | Reference | n | Characteristics | Screening Confirmatory | | n | Provenience | Risk of bias |
| Brazil | Figueiredo et al, 2002 | 126 | Consecutive patients with HCV diagnosis | ELISA 2 | RNA | 898 | Dental patients | Low |
| | Cunha et al, 2005 | 134 | Patients with other viral hepatitis were excluded | ELISA 3 | RNA | 95 | Dental patients | Moderate |
| France | Cribier et al, 1998 | 81 | HIV and HBV DNA excluded | ELISA 3 | RNA | 50 | HCV-, HBV- and HIV- liver disease patients | Low |
| Poland | Sulka et al, 2006 | 39 | 23 chronic hepatitis and 16 chirrosis | ELISA ^a | RIBA ^a | 29 | Dental patients | High |
| Spain | Bagan et al. 1998 | 505 | From Hepatology Unit | ELISA ^a | RIBA ^a | 100 | Healthy controls | High |
| Turkey | Dervis and Serez, 2005 | 70 | Co-existent liver disease and treatment with antiviral or immunomodulatory agents were excluded | ELISA ^a | RNA ^a | 70 | Healthy controls | Moderate |

^aNot otherwise specified.

susceptibility to HCV-induced LP, variability in the studies design and biases.

To avoid misclassification of LP, we decided to include in the meta-analysis only studies in which the clinical diagnosis of LP was confirmed histologically. Some studies have shown variability in both interobserver and intraobserver reliability in the clinicopathological assessment mainly of OLP (van der Meij and van der Waal I, 2003). However, a histological confirmation of the clinical diagnosis is worldwide accepted as a goldstandard practice in both LP and OLP studies.

Several medications including IFN- α and ribavirin can trigger mucocutaneous lichenoid reactions (McCartan and McCreary, 1997; Berk *et al*, 2007). However, IFN- α has been reported to have also no influence (Pawlotsky *et al*, 1995b) or even to ameliorate LP (Doutre *et al*, 1992; Strumia *et al*, 1993; Hildebrand *et al*, 1995; Pedersen, 1998)both clinically and histologically (Nagao *et al*, 1999). If lichenoid drug reactions are misdiagnosed and included in the samples of those with LP, it would result in an overestimation of the association between LP and HCV. Only a minority of the studies included in the meta-analysis stated clearly that a diagnosis of lichenoid reaction was excluded but when they were analysed together a significant increased risk of being HCV-seropositive in LP patients was still found. Regarding specifically the anti-HCV treatment, while in some HCV-infected patients the lichenoid lesions could be secondary to anti-HCV therapy (Giuliani et al, 2007), it is unlikely that in the majority of the published studies most of the patients were exposed to antiviral treatments. Significantly, in the largest published study on EHM in HCV-infected patients (not included in the meta-analysis because the clinical diagnosis was not histologically confirmed in all the patients) showing a significant association between LP and HCV infection (El-Serag et al, 2002), less than 5% of 32.204 studied patients received antiviral therapies. In an another study (Bagan et al, 1998), no significant differences in the frequency of OLP were observed between patients who received interferon-alpha (IFN- α) and those who did not.

Even if this meta-analysis highlighted a significant difference between Northern and Southern Europe, the pooled data from African studies with the highest HCV prevalence in the general population did not show a significant association (Ibrahim *et al*, 1999; Daramola *et al*, 2002). This suggests that any LP-HCV association



Figure 6 Forest plot of odds ratio of lichen planus prevalence (and 95% confidence intervals) in HCV seropositive patients

cannot be only explained on the basis of HCV endemicity. Indeed, the studies investigating the frequency of LP among HCV-positive subjects showed prevalences generally higher than expected, independently of the geographical origin.

Viral factors (such as genotype or viral load) seem to be ruled out by the observation that LP can be associated world-wide with the same genotypes commonly found in patients without LP (Pawlotsky *et al*, 1995a; Lodi *et al*, 1997), though mainly genotype 1b seems associated with LP, and it could be uncommon in the UK (Harris *et al*, 1999).

Genetic differences among different populations should be also taken into account. HCV-related OLP appears associated mainly with the HLA-DR6 allele in Italy (Carrozzo *et al*, 2001) whereas it does not in UK (Carrozzo *et al*, 2005). However, a comparison study of the OLP-positive/HCV-positive group with an OLPnegative/HCV-positive group is necessary to ultimately test this plausible hypothesis.

Some controversial data could have being caused by the small cohort size in a number of studies. Indeed, the majority of the studies included less than 100 subjects. As a result some studies, mainly coming from countries with low prevalence of HCV infection (Ilter et al, 1998; Ingafou et al, 1998; Garg et al, 2002; Bokor-Bratic, 2004; Laeijendecker et al, 2005; Ali and Suresh, 2007) showed the lack of any case or control positive to HCV serology. In those cases, the key question is whether the power of such studies was sufficient to detect any difference in the prevalence of HCV. For example, in one of the above studies, performed in Netherlands (Laeijendecker et al, 2005), 100 patients with OLP and 100 controls were recruited. Considering a prevalence of HCV infection in Netherlands of 0.5% (Van der Poel et al, 1991) and estimated risk of three (in this metaanalysis the odd ratio of being HCV infected in lichen planus patients from Northern Europe was 2.14), the power of such a study is only 20% (with an alpha error of 0.05, two tales). To obtain an acceptable power of 80%, more than 400 patients and 400 controls should have been recruited.

Age is a possible confounder because, in many populations, the prevalence of HCV exposure varies in different age groups (Alter, 2007), and older individuals have a higher prevalence of LP. However, the metaanalysis seems to confute the hypothesis that the high frequency of HCV seropositivity found in LP groups is caused by the increased prevalence of HCV infection in elderly patients (Campisi *et al*, 2004). Indeed, the subgroup analysis of studies with LP patients \leq 50 years still showed a significant association with HCV infection.

Given the design of most of the case-control and cohort studies published, it is impossible to establish whether the HCV exposure occurred before or after the onset of LP. As a result, HCV-infected patients might have an increased risk of developing LP or conversely, patients with LP could have an enhanced risk of HCV infection. A very recent epidemiologic study from Japan suggests that OLP prevalence in HCV-infected patients increased significantly as the subjects grew older

(Nagao et al, 2007) suggesting that the patients are very likely first infected with HCV and only later develop LP. This prospective study suggests also that the duration of the infection should be a potential source of heterogeneity in the published studies. Moreover, in countries where the prevalence among the LP-free subjects is low, the spread of the virus might be recent and not yet produced full consequences on LP development. Thus, in countries with a very low prevalence of HCV, LP should be probably better identified in HCV-infected patients rather than seeking to find HCV infection in LP patients (Carrozzo, 2001). Notably, in this meta-analysis we could not include any study looking for LP in chronic HCV infected from countries with low HCV prevalence. It has to be considered, however, that such a study could possibly require the recruitment of a large number of patients for being significant making it very difficult on a practical base and possibly clinically negligible.

Clinical implications of the results presented in this systematic review are particularly relevant. A high proportion of patients affected by HCV-associated chronic hepatitis may have persistently normal aminotransferase levels and recent data suggest that only a minority of people with HCV in Europe are aware of their infection (Merkinaite et al, 2008), thus testing for HCV patients with LP can lead to the diagnosis of a condition for which treatments are available and precautions can be useful to avoid further spread. Moreover, because chronic HCV infection can lead to cirrhosis and hepatocellular carcinoma (Eisen et al, 2005; Alter, 2007) and OLP is a potentially malignant disorder, an early diagnosis and a proper management might save lives and being beneficial in reducing health care costs.

In conclusion, this systematic review and meta-analysis shows that LP may be significantly associated with HCV infection mainly in Mediterranean countries, in Japan and USA. All the sub-analyses and the sensitivity assessments done strongly and consistently suggest this possible association. Because the HCV can replicate in the skin and in the oral mucosa and HCV-specific T cells have been found in OLP specimen (Carrozzo *et al*, 2002; Pilli *et al*, 2002), the virus could be involved in the pathogenesis of at least some OLP cases, probably via an immunological pathway still to be defined.

Finally, some of the controversial epidemiological data published could have been influenced by methodological biases (such as misclassification of the disease, small sample size, and recent acquisition of HCV, etc.) further to a generic geographic effect linked to worldwide HCV prevalence.

References

- Ali A, Zein NN (2005). Hepatitis C infection: a systemic disease with extrahepatic manifestations. *Cleveland Clin J Med* 72: 1005–1008.
- Ali AA, Suresh CS (2007). Oral lichen planus in relation to transaminase levels and hepatitis C virus. *J Oral Pathol Med* **36**: 604–608.

- Alter MJ (2007). Epidemiology of hepatitis C virus infection. World J Gastroenterol 13: 2436–2441.
- Amer MA, El-Harras M, Attwa E, Raslan S (2007). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus prevalence and clinical presentation in Egypt. J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol 21: 1259– 1260.
- Asaad T, Samdani AJ (2005). Association of lichen planus with hepatitis C virus infection. *Ann Saudi Med* **25:** 243–246.
- Ayala F, Balato N, Tranfaglia A, Guadagnino V, Orlando R (1986). Oral erosive lichen planus and chronic liver disease. J Am Acad Dermatol 14: 139–140.
- Bagan JV, Aguirre JM, del Olmo JA, *et al.* (1994). Oral lichen planus and chronic liver disease: a clinical and morphometric study of the oral lesions in relation to transaminase elevation. *Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol* **78:** 337–342.
- Bagan JV, Ramon C, Gonzalez L, et al. (1998). Preliminary investigation of the association of oral lichen planus and hepatitis C. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod 85: 532–536.
- Beaird LM, Kahloon N, Franco J, Fairley JA (2001). Incidence of hepatitis C in lichen planus. J Am Acad Dermatol 44: 311–312.
- Bellman B, Reddy RK, Falanga V (1995). Lichen planus associated with hepatitis C. *Lancet* **346**: 1234.
- Berk DR, Mallory SB, Keeffe EB, Ahmed A (2007). Dermatologic disorders associated with chronic hepatitis C: effect of interferon therapy. *Clin Gastroenterol Hepatol* 5: 142–151.
- Bez C, Hallett R, Carrozzo M, et al. (2001). Lack of association between hepatotropic transfusion transmitted virus infection and oral lichen planus in British and Italian populations. British Journal of Dermatology 145: 990–993.
- Bokor-Bratic M (2004). Lack of evidence of hepatic disease in patients with oral lichen planus in Serbia. *Oral Dis* **10:** 283–286.
- Campisi G, Fedele S, Lo RL, *et al.* (2004). HCV infection and oral lichen planus: a weak association when HCV is endemic. *J Viral Hepat* **11:** 465–470.
- Carrozzo M (2001). Oral health in patients with hepatitis C virus infection: an underestimated problem? *Oral Dis* **7:** 267–270.
- Carrozzo M (2008). Oral diseases associated with hepatitis C virus infection. Part 2: lichen planus and other diseases. *Oral Dis* **14:** 217–228.
- Carrozzo M, Brancatello F, Dametto E, *et al.* (2005). Hepatitis C virus-associated oral lichen planus: is the geographical heterogeneity related to HLA-DR6? *J Oral Pathol Med* **34**: 204–208.
- Carrozzo M, Francia Di CP, Gandolfo S, *et al.* (2001). Increased frequency of HLA-DR6 allele in Italian patients with hepatitis C virus-associated oral lichen planus. *Br J Dermatol* 144: 803–808.
- Carrozzo M, Gandolfo S (2003). Oral diseases possibly associated with hepatitis C virus. *Crit Rev Oral Biol Med* **14**: 115–127.
- Carrozzo M, Gandolfo S, Carbone M, *et al.* (1996). Hepatitis C virus infection in Italian patients with oral lichen planus: a prospective case-control study. *J Oral Pathol Med* **25**: 527–533.
- Carrozzo M, Quadri R, Latorre P, *et al.* (2002). Molecular evidence that the hepatitis C virus replicates in the oral mucosa. *J Hepatol* **37:** 364–369.
- Chainani-Wu N, Lozada-Nur F, Terrault N (2004). Hepatitis C virus and lichen planus: a review. *Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod* **98:** 171–183.
- Chuang TY, Stitle L, Brashear R, Lewis C (1999). Hepatitis C virus and lichen planus: a case-control study of 340 patients. *J Am Acad Dermatol* **41**: 787–789.

- Chung CH, Yang YH, Chang TT, Shieh DB, Liu SY, Shieh TY (2004). Relationship of oral lichen planus to hepatitis C virus in southern Taiwan. *Kaohsiung J Med Sci* **20**: 151–159.
- Cohen Tervaert JW, Van PP, Damoiseaux J (2007). Type II cryoglobulinemia is not associated with hepatitis C infection: the Dutch experience. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* **1107**: 251–258.
- Cribier B, Garnier C, Laustriat D, Heid E (1994). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection: an epidemiologic study. *J Am Acad Dermatol* **31**: 1070–1072.
- Cribier B, Samain F, Vetter D, Heid E, Grosshans E (1998). Systematic cutaneous examination in hepatitis C virus infected patients. *Acta Derm Venereol.* **78:** 355–357.
- Cunha KS, Manso AC, Cardoso AS, Paixao JB, Coelho HS, Torres SR (2005). Prevalence of oral lichen planus in Brazilian patients with HCV infection. *Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod* **100**: 330–333.
- Dal ML, Franceschi S (2006). Hepatitis C virus and risk of lymphoma and other lymphoid neoplasms: a meta-analysis of epidemiologic studies. *Cancer Epidemiol Biomarkers Prev* 15: 2078–2085.
- Daramola OO, George AO, Ogunbiyi AO (2002). Hepatitis C virus and lichen planus in Nigerians: any relationship? Int J Dermatol 41: 217–219.
- Das A, Das J, Majumdar G, Bhattacharya N, Neogi DK, Saha B (2006). No association between seropositivity for hepatitis C virus and lichen planus: a case control study. *Indian J Dermatol Venereol Leprol* 72: 198–200.
- de Mattos Camargo GS, de Aguiar MC, Teixeira R, do Carmo MA (2007). Oral lichen planus and chronic hepatitis C: a controversial association. *Am J Clin Pathol* **127:** 800–804.
- De Vries HJ, van MJ, Teunissen MB, *et al.* (2006). Lichen planus is associated with human herpesvirus type 7 replication and infiltration of plasmacytoid dendritic cells. *Br J Dermatol* **154:** 361–364.
- del Olmo JA, Pascual I, Bagan JV, *et al.* (2000). Prevalence of hepatitis C virus in patients with lichen planus of the oral cavity and chronic liver disease. *Eur J Oral Sci* **108**: 378–382.
- Deeks JJ, Altman DG, Bradburn MJ (2001). Statistical methods for examining heterogeneity and combining results from several studies in meta analysis. In: Egger M, Davey Smith G, Altman DG, editors. *Systematic reviews in health care: meta-analysis in context*. 2nd ed. BMJ Books: London, 285–312.
- Delolmo JA, Almenar E, Bagan JV, *et al.* (1990). Liver Abnormalities in Patients with Lichen-Planus of the Oral Cavity. *Eur J Gastroenterol Hepatol* **2**: 479–481.
- Denli YG, Durdu M, Karakas M (2004). Diabetes and hepatitis frequency in 140 lichen planus cases in Cukurova region. *J Dermatol* **31:** 293–298.
- Dervis E, Serez K (2005). The prevalence of dermatologic manifestations related to chronic hepatitis C virus infection in a study from a single center in Turkey. *Acta Dermatovenerol Alp Panonica Adriat* **14**: 93–98.
- Divano MC, Parodi A, Rebora A (1992). Lichen planus, liver kidney microsomal (LKM1) antibodies and hepatitis C virus antibodies. *Dermatology* 185: 132–133.
- Divano MC, Parodi A, Rebora A (1994). Anti-GOR antibodies in lichen planus. *Dermatology* **188**: 205–206.
- Doutre MS, Beylot C, Couzigou P, Long P, Royer P, Beylot J (1992). Lichen planus and virus C hepatitis: disappearance of the lichen under interferon alfa therapy. *Dermatology* **184:** 229.
- Dupin N, Chosidow O, Lunel F, Fretz C, Szpirglas H, Frances C (1997). Oral lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection: a fortuitous association? *Arch Dermatol* **133**: 1052–1053.

610

- Egan CA, Zone JJ (1997). Oral erosive lichen planus: its association with hepatitis C infection. *J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol* **9**: 9 S1–S117.
- Eisen D (2002). The clinical features, malignant potential, and systemic associations of oral lichen planus: a study of 723 patients. *J Am Acad Dermatol* **46**: 207–214.
- Eisen D, Carrozzo M, Bagan Sebastian JV, Thongprasom K (2005). Number V oral lichen planus: clinical features and management. *Oral Dis* **11:** 338–349.
- El-Serag HB, Hampel H, Yeh C, Rabeneck L (2002). Extrahepatic manifestations of hepatitis C among United States male veterans. *Hepatology* **36**: 1439–1445.
- Erkek E, Bozdogan O, Olut AI (2001). Hepatitis C virus infection prevalence in lichen planus: examination of lesional and normal skin of hepatitis C virus-infected patients with lichen planus for the presence of hepatitis C virus RNA. *Clin Exp Dermatol* **26**: 540–544.
- Figueiredo LC, Carrilho FJ, de Andrage HF, Migliari DA (2002). Oral lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection. *Oral Dis* **8:** 42–46.
- Galossi A, Guarisco R, Bellis L, Puoti C (2007). Extrahepatic manifestations of chronic HCV infection. *J Gastrointestin Liver Dis* 16: 65–73.
- Gandolfo S, Carbone M, Carrozzo M, Gallo V (1994). Oral lichen planus and hepatitis C virus (HCV) infection: is there a relationship? *A report of 10 cases. J Oral Pathol Med* **23**: 119–122.
- Garg VK, Karki BM, Agrawal S, Agarwalla A, Gupta R (2002). A study from Nepal showing no correlation between lichen planus and hepatitis B and C viruses. *J Dermatol* **29**: 411–413.
- Ghaderi R, Makhmalbaf Z (2007). The relationship between lichen planus and hepatitis C in Birjand, Iran. *Shiraz E-Med J* 8: 72–79.
- Ghodsi SZ, Daneshpazhooh M, Shahi M, Nikfarjam A (2004). Lichen planus and Hepatitis C: a casecontrol study. *BMC Dermatol* 4: 6.
- Gimenez-Arnau A, Alayon-Lopez C, Camarasa JG (1995). LIchen planus and hepatitis C. J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol 5: S84–S85.
- Gimenez-Garcia R, Perez-Castrillon JL (2003). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection. J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol 17: 291–295.
- Gisbert JP, Garcia-Buey L, Pajares JM, Moreno-Otero R (2003). Prevalence of hepatitis C virus infection in porphyria cutanea tarda: systematic review and meta-analysis. *J Hepatol* **39:** 620–627.
- GISED (1990). Lichen planus and liver diseases: a multicentre case-control study. Gruppo Italiano Studi Epidemiologici in Dermatologia (GISED). *BMJ* **300:** 227–230.
- Giuliani M, Lajolo C, Miani CM, Lodi G, Minnenna P, Mangia A (2007). Hepatitis C virus chronic infection and oral lichen planus: an Italian case-control study. *Eur J Gastroenterol Hepatol* **19:** 647–652.
- Grimes DA, Schulz KF (2002). An overview of clinical research: the lay of the land. *Lancet* **359**: 57–61.
- Grote M, Reichart PA, Berg T, Hopf U (1998). Hepatitis C virus (HCV)-infection and oral lichen planus. *J Hepatol* **29**: 1034–1035.
- Guerreiro TDT, Machado MM, de Freitas THP (2005). Association between lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection: a prospective study with 66 patients of the dermatology department of the hospital Santa Casa de Misericordia de Sao Paulo. *Ann Bras Dermatol* **80**: 475–480.

- Harman M, Akdeniz S, Dursun M, Akpolat N, Atmaca S (2004). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection: an epidemiologic study. *Int J Clin Pract* **58**: 1118–1119.
- Harris KA, Gilham C, Mortimer PP, Teo CG (1999). The most prevalent hepatitis C virus genotypes in England and Wales are 3a and 1a. *J Med Virol* **58**: 127–131.
- Hildebrand A, Kolde G, Luger TA, Schwarz T (1995). Successful treatment of generalized lichen planus with recombinant interferon alfa-2b. *J Am Acad Dermatol* **33**: 880–883.
- Ibrahim HA, Baddour MM, Morsi MG, Abdelkader AA (1999). Should we routinely check for hepatitis B and C in patients with lichen planus or cutaneous vasculitis? *East Mediterr Health J* **5:** 71–78.
- Ilter N, Senol E, Gurer MA, Altay O (1998). Lichen planus and hepatitis C-virus infection in Turkish patients. *J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol* **10**: 192–193.
- Imhof M, Popal H, Lee JH, Zeuzem S, Milbradt R (1997). Prevalence of hepatitis C virus antibodies and evaluation of hepatitis C virus genotypes in patients with lichen planus. *Dermatology* 195: 1–5.
- Ingafou M, Porter SR, Scully C, Teo CG (1998). No evidence of HCV infection or liver disease in British patients with oral lichen planus. *Int J Oral Maxillofac Surg* **27:** 65–66.
- Issa MCA, Gaspar AP, Kalil GN (1999). Liquen plano e hepatite C. *Ann Bras Dermatol* **15:** 133–136.
- Karavelioglu D, Koytak ES, Bozkaya H, Uzunalimoglu O, Bozdayi AM, Yurdaydin C (2004). Lichen planus and HCV infection in Turkish patients. *Turk J Gastroenterol* **15:** 133– 136.
- Khaja MN, Madhavi C, Thippavazzula R, *et al.* (2006). High prevalence of hepatitis C virus infection and genotype distribution among general population, blood donors and risk groups. *Infect Genet Evol* **6**: 198–204.
- Kirtak N, Inaloz HS, Ozgoztasi O, Erbagci Z (2000). The prevalence of hepatitis C virus infection in patients with lichen planus in Gaziantep region of Turkey. *Eur J Epidemiol* **16**: 1159–1161.
- Kirtschig G, Wakelin SH, Wojnarowska F (2005). Mucosal vulval lichen planus: outcome, clinical and laboratory features. *J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol* **19**: 301–307.
- Klanrit P, Thongprasom K, Rojanawatsirivej S, Theamboonlers A, Poovorawan Y (2003). Hepatitis C virus infection in Thai patients with oral lichen planus. *Oral Dis* 9: 292–297.
- Laeijendecker R, Van Joost TH, Tank B, Neumann HA (2005). Oral lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection. *Arch Dermatol* **141**: 906–907.
- Lodi G, Carrozzo M, Hallett R, D'Amico E, Piattelli A, Teo CG, Gandolfo S, Carbone M, Porter SR (1997). HCV genotypes in Italian patients with HCV-related oral lichen planus. *J Oral Pathol Med* **26**: 381–384.
- Lodi G, Carrozzo M, Harris K, *et al.* (2000). Hepatitis C virusassociated oral lichen planus: no influence from hepatitis G virus co-infection. *J Oral Pathol Med* **29:** 39–42.
- Lodi G, Giuliani M, Majorana A, *et al.* (2004). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus: a multicentre study of patients with oral lesions and a systematic review. *Br J Dermatol* **151**: 1172–1181.
- Lodi G, Scully C, Carrozzo M, Griffiths M, Sugerman PB, Thongprasom K (2005). Current controversies in oral lichen planus: report of an international consensus meeting. Part 1. Viral infections and etiopathogenesis. *Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod* **100**: 40–51.
- Luis-Montoya P, Cortes-Franco R, Vega-Memije ME (2005). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus. *Is there an association? Gac Med Mex* 141: 23–25.

- Mahboob A, Haroon TS, Iqbal Z, Iqbal F, Butt AK (2003). Frequency of anti-HCV antibodies in patients with lichen planus. *J Coll Physicians Surg Pak* **13**: 248–251.
- McCartan BE, McCreary CE (1997). Oral lichenoid drug eruptions. *Oral Dis* **3:** 58–63.
- Merkinaite S, Lazarus JV, Gore C (2008). Addressing HCV infection in Europe: reported, estimated and undiagnosed cases. *Cent Eur J Public Health* **16**: 106–110.
- Mignogna MD, Fedele S, Lo RL, Ruoppo E, Adamo D, Lo ML (2002). Extrahepatic manifestations of Hepatitis C virus infection: the slowly unraveling picture of oral lichen planus. *J Hepatol* **37**: 412–413.
- Mignogna MD, Lo ML, Favia G, Mignogna RE, Carbone R, Bucci E (1998). Oral lichen planus and HCV infection: a clinical evaluation of 263 cases. *Int J Dermatol* 37: 575–578.
- Nagao Y, Myoken Y, Katayama K, Tanaka J, Yoshizawa H, Sata M (2007). Epidemiological survey of oral lichen planus among HCV-infected inhabitants in a town in Hiroshima Prefecture in Japan from 2000 to 2003. *Oncol Rep* 18: 1177– 1181.
- Nagao Y, Sata M, Noguchi S, *et al.* (1997). GB virus infection in patients with oral cancer and oral lichen planus. *J Oral Pathol Med* **26**: 138–141.
- Nagao Y, Sata M, Suzuki H, Kameyama T, Ueno T (1999). Histological improvement of oral Lichen planus in patients with chronic hepatitis C treated with interferon. *Gastroen*terology 117: 283–284.
- Nagao Y, Sata M, Tanikawa K, Itoh K, Kameyama T (1995). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus in the northern Kyushu region of Japan. *Eur J Clin Invest* **25:** 910–914.
- Narayan S, Sharma RC, Sinha BK, Khanna V (1998). Relationship between lichen planus and hepatitis C virus. *Indian J Dermatol Venereol Leprol* **64**: 281–282.
- Okuse C, Yotsuyanagi H, Koike K (2007). Hepatitis C as a systemic disease: virus and host immunologic responses underlie hepatic and extrahepatic manifestations. *J Gastroenterol* **42:** 857–865.
- Palekar NA, Harrison SA (2005). Extrahepatic manifestations of hepatitis C. South Med J 98: 1019–1023.
- Parodi A, Divano MC, Rebora A (1996). Serologic markers of autoimmune chronic hepatitis in patients with lichen planus. *European Journal of Dermatology* 6: 30–31.
- Pawlotsky JM, Benchiki H, Pellet C, *et al.* (1995a). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus (HCV)-related chronic hepatitis: evaluation of HCV genotypes. *Br J Dermatol* **133:** 666–667.
- Pawlotsky JM, Dhumeaux D, Bagot M (1995b). Hepatitis C virus in dermatology. A review. Arch Dermatol 131: 1185– 1193.
- Pedersen A (1998). IFN-alpha cream in the treatment of oral lichen planus. *Oral Dis* **4**: 155–156.
- Pilli M, Penna A, Zerbini A, *et al.* (2002). Oral lichen planus pathogenesis: a role for the HCV-specific cellular immune response. *Hepatology* **36**: 1446–1452.
- Prabhu S, Pavithran K, Sobhanadevi G (2002). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus (HCV)–is there an association? *A* serological study of 65 cases. Indian J Dermatol Venereol Leprol **68**: 273–274.
- Protzer U, Ochsendorf FR, Leopolder-Ochsendorf A, Holtermuller KH (1993). Exacerbation of lichen planus during interferon alfa-2a therapy for chronic active hepatitis C. *Gastroenterology* **104**: 903–905.
- Rahnama Z, Esfandiarpour I, Farajzadeh S (2005). The relationship between lichen planus and hepatitis C in dermatology outpatients in Kerman, Iran. *Int J Dermatol* **44**: 746–748.
- Rebora A, Robert E, Rongioletti F (1992). Clinical and laboratory presentation of lichen planus patients with chronic liver disease. *J Dermatol Sci* **4:** 38–41.

- Rodriguez-Inigo E, Arrieta JJ, Casqueiro M, et al. (2001). TT virus detection in oral lichen planus lesions. Journal of Medical Virology 64: 183–189.
- Rossi L, Colasanto S (2000). Clinical considerations and statistical analysis on 100 patients with oral lichen planus. *Minerva Stomatol* **49:** 393–398.
- Roy KM, Dickson EM, Staines KS, Bagg J (2000). Hepatitis C virus and oral lichen planus/lichenoid reactions: lack of evidence for an association. *Clin Lab* **46**: 251–254.
- Sanchez-Perez J, De CM, Buezo GF, Fernandez-Herrera J, Borque MJ, Garcia-Diez A (1996). Lichen planus and hepatitis C virus: prevalence and clinical presentation of patients with lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection. *Br J Dermatol* **134**: 715–719.
- Santander C, De Castro M, Garcia-Monzon C, *et al.* (1994). Prevalence of hepatitis C virus (HCV) infection and liver damage in paients with lichen planus (LP). *Hepatology* **20**: 568–568.
- Sata M, Nagao Y, Suzuki H, Ide T, Itoh K, Tanikawa K (1996). Oral lichen planus and hepatitis C virus infection. *Gastroenterology* **110**: A1312–A1312.
- Schmitt EC, Mozzanica N, Finzi AF, *et al.* (1995). Hepatitis C viremia in erosive and classic lichen planus. *J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol* **5:** 584–584.
- Sene D, Limal N, Cacoub P (2004). Hepatitis C virusassociated extrahepatic manifestations: a review. *Metab Brain Dis* 19: 357–381.
- Serpico R, Busciolano M, Femiano F (1997). A statistical epidemiological study of a possible correlation between serum transaminase levels and viral hepatic pathology markers and lichen planus orale. *Minerva Stomatol* **46**: 97–102.
- Sterling RK, Bralow S (2006). Extrahepatic manifestations of hepatitis C virus. *Curr Gastroenterol Rep* **8:** 53–59.
- Strumia R, Venturini D, Boccia S, Gamberini S, Gullini S (1993). UVA and interferon-alfa therapy in a patient with lichen planus and chronic hepatitis C. *Int J Dermatol* **32**: 386.
- Sulka A, Simon K, Piszko P, Kalecinska E, Dominiak M (2006). Oral mucosa alterations in chronic hepatitis and cirrhosis due to HBV or HCV infection. *Bull Group Int Rech Sci Stomatol Odontol* 47: 6–10.
- Tanei R, Watanabe K, Nishiyama S (1995). Clinical and histopathologic analysis of the relationship between lichen planus and chronic hepatitis C. *J Dermatol* **22**: 316–323.
- Tucker SC, Coulson IH (1999). Lichen planus is not associated with hepatitis C virus infection in patients from north west England. *Acta Derm Venereol* **79:** 378–379.
- van der Meij EH, van der Waal I (2000). Hepatitis C virus infection and oral lichen planus: a report from The Netherlands. *J Oral Pathol Med* **29:** 255–258.
- van der Meij EH, van der Waal I (2003). Lack of clinicopathologic correlation in the diagnosis of oral lichen planus based on the presently available diagnostic criteria and suggestions for modifications. *J Oral Pathol Med* **32:** 507–512.
- Van der Poel CL, Reesink HW, Mauser-Bunschoten EP, *et al.* (1991). Prevalence of anti-HCV antibodies confirmed by recombinant immunoblot in different population subsets in The Netherlands. *Vox Sang* **61**: 30–36.
- Yarom N, Dagon N, Shinar E, Gorsky M (2007). Association between hepatitis C virus infection and oral lichen planus in Israeli patients. *Isr Med Assoc J* **9:** 370–372.
- Zignego AL, Ferri C, Pileri SA, Caini P, Bianchi FB (2007). Extrahepatic manifestations of Hepatitis C Virus infection: a general overview and guidelines for a clinical approach. *Dig Liver Dis* **39:** 2–17.

612