

# FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

1

2 **An Ethnographic Study Exploring Football Sessions for Medium-Secure Mental Health**  
3 **Service-Users: Utilising the CHIME Conceptual Framework as an Evaluative Tool.**

4

5 Running head: FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

6

7

Adam Benkwitz

8

Newman University

9

Mervyn Morris

10

Birmingham City University

11

Laura C. Healy

12

Nottingham Trent University

13

14 Adam Benkwitz, Sport and Health and Social Care, Newman University, Birmingham, UK.

15 Mervyn Morris, School of Health Sciences, Birmingham City University, Birmingham, UK.

16 Laura C. Healy,

17 Please address all correspondence to Laura Healy, Sport, Health and Performance

18 Enhancement (SHAPE) Research Group, Department of Sport Science, School of Science

19 and Technology, Nottingham Trent University, UK.

20

21 Corresponding Author: Dr. Laura C. Healy, Nottingham Trent University, Clifton Lane,

22 Nottingham, UK, NG11 8NS. Email: [laura.healy@ntu.ac.uk](mailto:laura.healy@ntu.ac.uk). Tel: +44 (0)115 8485516.

23 **An Ethnographic Study Exploring Football Sessions for Medium-Secure Mental Health**  
24 **Service-Users: Utilising the CHIME Conceptual Framework as an Evaluative Tool.**

25 Abstract

26 A key part of developing an understanding of ‘what works’ within the evolving mental health  
27 recovery evidence base is finding ways of service-users (and their friends and family) and  
28 practitioners working collaboratively. This interaction is slowly shifting practice, whereby  
29 care is potentially co-constructed in a setting between those involved to facilitate recovery-  
30 oriented processes. Increasingly, mental health services are appreciating the potential role of  
31 sport. This study adds to this body of literature by providing analysis of a football project in a  
32 medium-secure service context. This study also expands the methodological and theoretical  
33 scope of the literature by adopting an ethnographic approach and by utilising the CHIME  
34 conceptual framework as an evaluative tool. 47 participants were involved in the study,  
35 which included service-users, staff and volunteers. The data demonstrated that these sessions  
36 have considerable links to the CHIME processes, and can therefore be considered to enhance  
37 personal recovery for those involved.

38

39 Keywords

40 Recovery; CHIME; Ethnography; Mental Health; Service-users

41

### 42 **Recovery Context [A]**

43 The meaning of ‘recovery’ in the context of mental health is evolving, (1, 2) slowly, away  
44 from the traditional notion of ‘clinical recovery’, i.e., an outcome observed by an expert, (3)  
45 to appreciate the importance of lived experience (4) in an ongoing, personal journey (5) of  
46 ‘personal recovery’, i.e., a subjectively viewed and valued process. (6, 7) This acceptance  
47 that each individual’s experience is different suggests that there is no blueprint for recovery,  
48 (8) however, drawing on the literature pertaining to service user’s accounts, there are key  
49 facets of recovery that have been systematically identified by Leamy et al. (9) as part of the  
50 broader REFOCUS research programme on recovery. Leamy et al. (9) conducted a  
51 systematic review and narrative synthesis that provided an empirically based conceptual  
52 framework of personal recovery in mental health. 97 studies were utilised in order to identify  
53 five recovery processes that are important to recovery. These processes were articulated by  
54 the acronym CHIME, which comprised of: connectedness (including peer support, support  
55 groups, relationships, support from others, being part of the community), hope and optimism  
56 (which was having belief in the possibility of recovery, motivation to change, hope-inspiring  
57 relationships, positive thinking and valuing success, and having dreams and aspirations),  
58 identity (that involved dimensions of identity, rebuilding a positive sense of identity, and  
59 overcoming stigma), meaning in life (that involved the meaning of mental illness  
60 experiences, spirituality, quality of life, meaningful life and social roles and goals, and  
61 rebuilding life), and empowerment (that encompassed personal responsibility, control over  
62 life, and focusing upon strengths). The criticism of personal recovery is that it can be deemed  
63 ‘complex and disordered’, (10) therefore the robust development of this conceptual  
64 framework is useful to bring some order to the exploration and evaluation of mental health  
65 recovery focused practice and services. (9)

66

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

67 A key part of developing an understanding of ‘what works’ within the evolving recovery  
68 evidence base is finding ways of service-users (and their friends and family) and practitioners  
69 working collaboratively. (11) Arguably, this interaction is (slowly) shifting practice, whereby  
70 care is potentially co-constructed in a setting between those involved in order to facilitate  
71 recovery-oriented processes. (12) There is an increase in studies in mental health appreciating  
72 the experiences of service-users and staff (and others). (13, 14) However, researchers  
73 developing the evidence base for these types of practice need to remain mindful of the power  
74 relations still present, (15) for instance, staff researchers who undertake research with  
75 service-users under their care. Being mindful of this caveat, and as discussed further in  
76 subsequent sections, the current study gathered data in-situ from service-users, volunteers and  
77 staff members, and was undertaken by a researcher who was not a service-user, a volunteer or  
78 a staff member, in order to explore differing perspectives (and potential power relations)  
79 within this specific sporting context. Increasingly, mental health services are appreciating the  
80 potential role of sport, physical activity and/or exercise. (16)

81

82 Mental Health and Sport, Physical Activity and/or Exercise [B]

83 Despite some notable contributions, literature on the potential for sport and physical activity  
84 to contribute to recovery in a positive sense remains scarce, and often methodologically  
85 flawed or vague. (17) Furthermore, as Carless and Douglas (16, p140) stated “research has  
86 tended to focus on the ways exercise may alleviate symptoms, impairment, and dysfunction  
87 rather than its potential to contribute meaning, purpose, success, and satisfaction to a person’s  
88 life”, or in other words, there remains a dominance of the simplistic dose-response  
89 relationship of certain specific exercises (e.g., see 18, 19) due to the assumed authority (20)  
90 of the ‘clinical gaze’ within both health services and sport science. Often these pre- and post-  
91 intervention measures ‘explain’ positives via psychological (e.g., self-efficacy, distraction,

92 self-esteem, see 21, 22) or physiological/biological explanations (e.g., see 23), which  
93 increases the biomedical model focus at the expense of valuing and learning from the varied  
94 lived experiences of, and providing a voice for, the people actually involved. This is despite  
95 the Department of Health's (24) 'Future in Mind' policy specifically highlighting the scope  
96 available for general practitioners and other professionals to offer social prescribing of  
97 activities such as sport (but does not mention exercise or physical activity) to improve  
98 wellbeing and mental health in children and young people. Similarly, as Smith et al. (25)  
99 discussed, the Government's 'Sporting Future' strategy places emphasis on mental wellbeing  
100 within the nation's sporting agenda, with the 'measure' of the link between these elements  
101 being "improved subjective wellbeing". (26, p74) This limited, but potentially significant,  
102 change in policy rhetoric highlights a move away from the dominance of the clinical gaze  
103 towards listening to and valuing people's experiences, which could be argued to be in line  
104 with the slow but steady evolution from clinical towards personal recovery. (2, 7) However,  
105 the current evidence base in this area is "more complex and nuanced than is perhaps  
106 commonly assumed, policy-makers and practitioners face a number of challenges in seeking  
107 to provide government with evidence of the contribution made by sport participation". (25,  
108 p11) An example of the complexity could include the differences between an individual  
109 undertaking an exercise at a specific intensity but on their own (for example, long distance  
110 running), as opposed to team sports that might involve twenty or thirty people interacting  
111 together in one place but with varying levels of movement and intensity, for example, a  
112 goalkeeper in football will move far less than an outfield player, but they may benefit in  
113 many other ways due to the social nature of sport, as opposed to the potentially isolating  
114 types of exercise and physical activity that could be undertaken. Equally as important could  
115 be the context of the activity (health service or community based), how activities are run, by  
116 whom and for whom, and whether they have an underpinning focus on competition,

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

117 recreation or health. One such area that is developing a participant-focused evidence base to  
118 explore this complexity is football for mental health projects.

119

### 120 Football Specific Projects [B]

121 There has been an increase in the use of football (in various formats) to aid recovery, most  
122 often in partnership with football clubs, (27) however, literature on initiatives that are located  
123 and run solely by mental health services is limited. Furthermore, research that centres on  
124 medium-secure service-users and staff is rarer still. Rather than a distracting predominance  
125 on dose-effect style studies, the nature of a team sport like football brings the social  
126 interaction and group dynamics to the fore. (28) Therefore, existing studies have highlighted  
127 the importance of moving away from exercising for periods of time at certain intensities and  
128 instead raising issues like: football being a site and topic to break down barriers, for example,  
129 talking to new people or opening up about health concerns, (29-31) football projects tackling  
130 stigma, (4) or helping people to (re)discover their identity (17) and recover personal and  
131 social roles. (32)

132 Qualitative literature has also focused on the beneficial function of football to initially engage  
133 with people, then to have something to talk about (football), which builds rapport and enables  
134 participants to discuss issues and challenges. (33) This is especially important to engage ‘hard  
135 to reach’ populations within a mental health context. Research suggests that men’s reluctance  
136 to seek support can further exacerbate distress and can often lead to suicide, (34) and initial  
137 studies have suggested that football can be useful to engage these often ‘hard to reach’ male  
138 demographics who are most at risk. (35-36)

139

### 140 **Summary of Literature and Rationale for Study. [A]**

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

141 Whilst the existing literature is a solid starting point, it could be argued that further  
142 development of this evidence base is required, with consideration given to four areas  
143 specifically. Firstly, the context within which the project is delivered is potentially important,  
144 as it should not be assumed that projects that are delivered in the community by football clubs  
145 are synonymous with projects delivered within a therapeutic, mental health worker delivered  
146 context (e.g., the 'It's a Goal' project, 31, 37), or considered to be identical to a project that  
147 involved qualified football coaches and then a therapeutic programme running alongside. (4)  
148 Secondly, Magee et al. (4) were critical of the projects they studied as they retained a heavy  
149 biomedical model approach, which is often part of time-specific projects that inevitably  
150 become affixed with targets and outcome measures. Mental health services could take note of  
151 this small but significant idiosyncrasy, and scholars should be mindful of the underpinning  
152 aims (and therefore, potentially 'outcome measures') and the sustainability of sport projects,  
153 for instance, considering whether they are genuinely recovery focused. Thirdly, from the  
154 information available, methodological approaches in this area appear to be limited to generic  
155 questionnaire data and/or interviews, there is a lack of researcher involvement actually at the  
156 sessions (participant observation), which could be a key omission if the aim is to explore  
157 what goes on at projects. Finally, the existing literature often lacks a coherent theoretical or  
158 conceptual approach to develop analysis and inform future work.

159 Therefore, addressing those four points, this project aimed to add to this body of literature by  
160 (a) providing analysis of a sporting project that aimed to improve mental health within a  
161 certain context, which (b) adds to the qualitative data exploring lived experiences. This study  
162 also contributes by (c) expanding the methodological and theoretical scope of the literature  
163 by adopting an ethnographic approach and by (d) adopting the CHIME conceptual  
164 framework, which aims to draw together the recovery-focused literature and the relevant  
165 sport-specific studies.



166

167 **Methodology [A]**

168 In terms of the broader research context for this study, the emergent priority is the  
169 development and evaluation of interventions to support the five CHIME recovery processes.  
170 (9, 11) It therefore follows that if recovery is subjective and best judged by the person living  
171 with the experience, (3) then initiatives should be evaluated by exploring and providing a  
172 ‘partial interpretation’ (38) of those lived experiences. This approach aligns with the  
173 underpinning philosophical assumptions of this study, of a relativist ontology (assumes  
174 numerous subjective realities) and a constructionist epistemology (our understanding is based  
175 on appreciating multiple social constructions of knowledge). (39) Therefore, this study  
176 adopted a qualitative approach to explore *what it is like* (40) to experience the football  
177 sessions for those involved (service-users, staff and volunteers). This study has gained unique  
178 access to an ongoing NHS Mental Health Foundation Trust football project, which has been  
179 running for several years (as opposed to being a specific, finite project). Therefore, this can  
180 be considered a naturalistic study that seeks to explore and further understand the relationship  
181 between football and mental health for those involved (service-users, staff and volunteers) in  
182 order to inform policy and practice.

183

184 **The Football Sessions [B]**

185 Sessions run each Tuesday morning for 90 minutes, in a well-equipped indoor football arena  
186 in the centre of a large city, and are run by an occupational therapy team based within a  
187 medium-secure unit. The sessions are attended by service-users from numerous medium-  
188 secure units across the city, who have been authorised to be chaperoned by members of Trust  
189 staff in order to travel to the venue and partake in small sided games of football. There are  
190 two features of the sessions to note, firstly, there are also service-users and former service-

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

191 users who attend who have transitioned out of the medium-secure setting and are engaged  
192 with accommodation services or who are back in the community (and still engaging with  
193 services). Secondly, several members of Trust staff, and also volunteers, play football as part  
194 of the sessions alongside service-users, all of whom were eligible to be part of the study as  
195 they had lived experience of the sessions. Each week there are between 40-50 people present  
196 at the sessions, with usually between 30-40 people who play football, as some staff members  
197 (chaperones) do not play and there are also some service-users who attend but for various  
198 reasons do not play, instead there are seating areas next to the pitch for them to spectate.

199

### 200 Research Design [B]

201 A research design was required that was flexible enough to engage with the complexity of the  
202 context, given the involvement of varied demographics, given diagnoses, periods of time  
203 engaged with various services, as well as the involvement of staff and volunteers, which are  
204 challenges that have been highlighted within sport and mental health settings previously. (16,  
205 41) There were also the expectations to inform future practice of social inclusive, non-  
206 stigmatising activities (42) that aid recovery and provide a voice to participants. (43) This  
207 inclusivity began at the start of the research project via ‘co-production’, as participants  
208 (service-users, staff and volunteers) were involved in discussions regarding the nature of the  
209 research. Including participants was both beneficial to the quality of the study and also a  
210 stipulation for gaining full NHS ethical clearance, which was gained in addition to the lead  
211 researcher’s institutional ethical clearance. Central for the participants was the need not only  
212 for the researcher to interview them (provide a voice), but also to attend the sessions regularly  
213 to see what they entail. These methods, along with the underpinning philosophical  
214 assumptions and the need for flexibility to explore the complexity led to an ethnographic

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

215 research design being adopted, which included participant observation and semi-structured  
216 interviews.

217

218 Procedure [B]

219 As the sessions were already established, and as the study aimed to explore the lived  
220 experiences of everyone involved (service-users, staff and volunteers), the recruitment  
221 process began by briefing those present at the sessions on the study, giving them participant  
222 information sheets and initially asking them to consider being part of the participant  
223 observation data collection. As attendance fluctuated, and in order to attempt to inform  
224 everyone who attended prior to data collection beginning, this briefing period lasted for three  
225 weeks. During this period, participant information sheets were passed electronically to staff  
226 members who were known to accompany service-users to sessions but who were not present  
227 at the football sessions for the three weeks during the briefing period. Trust staff were also  
228 asked to pass information to anyone due to start attending sessions for the first time during  
229 the data collection period, and the researcher's contact details were provided to facilitate any  
230 discussions that were required. Those individuals that did not consent to be part of the  
231 participant observation were informed that they could continue to attend the sessions as  
232 normal, and that the researcher would not collect data (i.e., take any field notes) that related  
233 to them in any way. Once all reasonable steps had been taken to inform attendees about the  
234 study and written informed consent was gained from participants willing to take part in the  
235 study, the researcher attended the sessions as a participant-as-observer, (44) in the sense that  
236 the researcher attended sessions, played football, sat and watched others play, and had  
237 informal conversations with other attendees, but was known to be a researcher (i.e., the  
238 researcher was participating in activities but not researching 'covertly'). After several months  
239 of participant observation, and once initial themes began to emerge, participants were

240 purposively sampled (45) for semi-structured interviews in order to explore emergent themes  
241 in more depth, with a new participant information sheet and informed consent form being  
242 signed.

243

### 244 Participants [B]

245 There were 47 participants who consented for the participant observation data collection (36  
246 service-users/former service-users, nine Trust staff members, two volunteers), which lasted  
247 for 46 weeks. There were seventeen semi-structured interviews undertaken (ten service-users,  
248 five staff and two volunteers). The study did not seek to access any medical or case files, and  
249 did not ask staff about their specific roles. This was due to the study having an inductive  
250 approach that focused on the experiences of those attending without the potential distractions  
251 of the ‘clinical setting’, which is in line with a personal recovery philosophy. (9) As with  
252 other football for mental health projects, the majority of participants were male (three were  
253 female), as football remains a contested site where gender relations continue to be  
254 reproduced, maintained and resisted. (46) More broadly, in this context, this could be  
255 partially viewed as a positive, as football projects can attract ‘hard to reach’ men who are  
256 known to under-use health services. (36, 47-48)

257

### 258 Findings [A]

259 Participant observation data (from 47 participants) and interview data (from seventeen  
260 participants) were initially analysed thematically (45) through an inductive process, with first  
261 order themes identified and sub-themes developed through an interplay between data and  
262 theory throughout the ethnographic process. (49) For this article, and in a similar manner to  
263 Brijnath, (50) an additional step was taken to code data in line with the CHIME framework  
264 (9) in a deductive process, which meant that the data coded under one code name were

265 categorised into two or three sub-components within the overall analysis. This was done in  
266 order to both evaluate the football sessions against the well-established and evidence-based  
267 CHIME framework and to also locate the current study within the broader recovery literature.  
268 Table 1 provides an overview of the key themes from the initial inductive analysis, all of  
269 which were apparent throughout both the participant observation and interview data, before  
270 the discussion section focuses in more depth on the deductive analysis in order to explore the  
271 CHIME framework processes within this specific context.

272 \*INSERT TABLE 1 HERE\*

273

## 274 **Discussion [A]**

275 It is useful when considering the discussion of the CHIME processes to be mindful of the  
276 extent that service-users in medium-secure units, and those transitioning back into the  
277 community, might experience in their daily lives the opposite of these processes, in other  
278 words, feeling isolated (rather than having connectedness), feeling hopeless (rather than  
279 hopeful), lacking a sense of identity (rather than retaining a sense of their identity), and so  
280 forth. The following sections are based on the CHIME framework (9) and are structured in  
281 order of importance and relevance based on the interpretation of data in this study.

282

## 283 **Connectedness [B]**

284 The participants frequently discussed the importance of the social elements of the sessions, as  
285 they facilitated interactions (and friendships) that otherwise would not occur. This was  
286 especially significant for those from medium-secure units, as service-users highlighted that  
287 they would probably not have got out of bed if they did not have the sessions to attend, and  
288 for some it was the only time in the week that they left the unit. It was evident from the  
289 participant observation that there was a strong element of community and connectedness

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

290 amongst participants, with a welcoming and friendly culture that was very much valued, as  
291 Marty (Volunteer) suggested:

292 I've been here for a very long time, I've seen the change in people. They've made a  
293 lot of friends. They feel here they can get involved, where years ago they were very  
294 quiet, shy. They involve their self with other people, talk and communicate. Look at  
295 'Gerald' for example, when he first came, he was very quiet. He never got involved.  
296 He couldn't even touch a ball. You look at him now and he's fantastic. He's cheerful.  
297 He's happy. When you see him, he shakes your hand and he gets on with people. It  
298 wouldn't have happened if he couldn't come here and see everyone.

299 This supports previous studies, highlighting the social benefits in terms of shared experiences  
300 (30, 51) with others that provide something to talk about (football) as well as an opportunity  
301 to talk and connect, (16) which is deemed important in recovery (9, 11) especially for those  
302 involved in medium-secure units who might be, or feel, isolated.

303

304 An issue that comes with increased connectedness in this context, which was highlighted  
305 previously in a football project, (4) was the competitive nature of football and how it could  
306 lead to violence in sessions. However, it was noted that participants frequently praised these  
307 sessions and the 'culture' that meant there was very little conflict, violence or "aggro that we  
308 don't wanna see here" (Garth, Service-user). Some suggested the reason for this was the  
309 interactive, collective nature of the sessions, as staff and service-users played together and  
310 were considered, generally, to be equal, or as Jermain (Service-user) put it "on the same  
311 level, everyone is the same out on the pitch, no matter where you came from or whether you  
312 are staff or usually locked-up". Another factor is the long-standing nature of the sessions, as  
313 they have been running, in various forms, for more than a decade, with some participants  
314 being involved for that period of time. Therefore, there is a well-established culture or habitus

315 (52) that guides the behaviours, which is especially useful to inculcate new-comers to the  
316 sessions.

317

318 Empowerment [B]

319 The nature of medium-secure units means service-users have limited empowerment, but these  
320 football sessions demonstrated that this does not always have to be the case. The data  
321 supported a number of the sub-themes of the empowerment processes that Leamy et al. (9)  
322 identified as being important for recovery, with the most recognisable being ‘maintaining  
323 good physical health and well-being’. It was reported frequently in the interview data that  
324 participants were mostly sedentary during the rest of the week, but that these sessions gave  
325 them a chance to be active. The general sedentary behaviour of service-users raises questions  
326 about other service-users who do not attend these types of sessions, and whether provision  
327 (options more appealing to personal tastes than football) should be made more readily  
328 available, especially on wards where opportunities and, therefore, choices and empowerment  
329 are extremely limited. For Jimmy (Service-user), the opportunity to be active was  
330 appreciated:

331       You’ll always see me running, in the game I’m running all the time, non-stop. It’s the  
332       only chance I get so I get sweating. It’s good for my heart, and my weight, ‘cause I  
333       didn’t always look like this. But it’s hard, when I’m not here, to run around at all.

334 Being empowered enough to be able to make a choice (53) is important for ‘regaining  
335 independence and autonomy’. (9) Participants appreciated how service-users can choose to  
336 attend (albeit, if that is an authorised option for them), can be team captains (and choose their  
337 teammates), and can choose to attend and not actually play (for instance, there is one service-  
338 user who never plays football, but attends almost every week and in the short time gap  
339 between games will run a lap of the pitch). This empowerment and taking control of decision

340 making transcends just those experiences of service-users in medium secure units, as  
341 participant observation made it possible to witness over time how the sessions provided a safe  
342 and familiar space for people as they progressed on their recovery journey, (5) a journey that  
343 sometimes involved participants who had previously returned to the community becoming  
344 more ill and finding themselves back in secure care, but they benefitted from the on-going  
345 sessions and the connections they retained, as Greg (Service-user) explained:

346 I was feeling a lot better a while ago, but I had some troubles again. But you know  
347 what, I only missed like four weeks or something [of the football], and they let me  
348 keep coming, so that really helped to see the guys. Them people are my friends, it's  
349 like coming home. Some of these guys here I've known through the footie for five or  
350 six years, we wouldn't have that otherwise.

351 The football sessions appeared to be a useful tool for the process of regaining independence  
352 and autonomy for transitioning service-users who were out of the units or wards, as there  
353 remained a support network for them to cohere around whilst they made decisions and  
354 recovered their autonomy, for instance, choosing to attend, considering organisation and  
355 timing, making transport arrangements, and so on. The final element of the empowerment  
356 processes that were evident was how the positive and supportive culture encouraged  
357 'focusing on strengths'. (9) In sessions this included supportive remarks, encouragement  
358 'from the side-lines' from spectators, cheering when someone scored, and generally making  
359 people feel good about their footballing ability, which service-users reported contrasts with  
360 experiences of some of the language and interactions in clinical settings. This positivity is  
361 considered important for recovery processes and making positive changes, (3) which shall be  
362 discussed in the following sections on hope and identity.

363

364 Hope and Optimism [B]



365 Previous football and mental wellbeing studies, for instance, Lewis et al., (36) found via  
366 quantitative data analysis (often using the Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Wellbeing Scale) that  
367 participants felt more optimistic following involvement in such a project. The current study  
368 goes beyond this questionnaire and survey data to provide some qualitative elucidation to  
369 what this optimism or hope might actually entail, whilst providing a voice for the  
370 participants. It was evident that there were elements of being involved in the sessions that  
371 encouraged participants to feel more hopeful and optimistic about the future in terms of the  
372 short, medium and long-term. In the short term, service-users felt that they really benefitted  
373 from having something to look forward to each week, as Ricky (Service-user) outlined: “it’s  
374 the best bit of my week that’s for sure. If I’m honest, like, it’s the only good bit of the week  
375 mostly, keeps my health going. I’d come every day if they ran it”. Ryan (Staff) echoed this  
376 from a staff perspective:

377         These guys look forward to coming, absolutely. I can speak about the patients who I  
378         work with, and they talk about it all week, especially if they've had a good  
379         performance and scored some good goals. They don't shut up about it [laughter]. They  
380         keep telling us how brilliant it is, and it gives them a real focus, and I think that gives  
381         us as staff something to work with.

382 In the medium term, participants appreciated how (perhaps indirectly) the sessions enabled  
383 them to see beyond their current circumstances and feel more hopeful about their own health  
384 and personal recovery. This was mainly due to the incorporation of service-users who had  
385 transitioned through the stepped process and had either moved from medium to low-secure  
386 units, or into service accommodation or back into the community, but who still attended the  
387 sessions. From spending time with the participants, and seeing these transitions occur, it was  
388 possible to see the personal relationships and communication present that gave people hope  
389 that things could change. As Jon (Service-user) stated: “It definitely gives me a bit of hope,

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

390 because I see people come here that aren't even in secure services anymore. People that I  
391 know that have got out and they've come back and still chat to me and that, do you know  
392 what I mean? It makes you see what you can do, like, and be better". Hardeep (Service-user)  
393 also explained: "it gives people hope seeing others that are now back in the community.  
394 Some people that have moved on from here, they come back, and I think that's really good,  
395 but for them its good, too, so they have somewhere familiar to come, they aren't just on their  
396 own out there". There was also the benefit for being optimistic moving forwards about the  
397 therapeutic relationships between staff and service-users, as Jasper (Staff) explained:

398         It's beneficial for everybody involved. Even the members of staff who aren't involved  
399         in actually playing can see their patients in a different light, because there are a lot of  
400         patients who are stuck on the ward day in, day out and they come here and they're  
401         completely different. It's like seeing a completely different person at times.

402 Almost on a weekly basis, service-user participants expressed what can be interpreted as a  
403 longer-term hope of getting well and 'being a footballer' or just joining a local team once  
404 they are back in the community, which shall be discussed in relation to identity in the next  
405 section.

406

407 Identity [B]

408 A common theme amongst service-users was how they had played football a great deal prior  
409 to becoming ill. During the participant observation data collection there were very often  
410 discussions about the teams they had played for or the level they had reached, and it was  
411 frequently followed by a reflection of how pleased they were that these sessions were  
412 available to them to 'recover' that 'old' part of their identity, whilst providing hope that this  
413 could be enhanced further in the future. In addition to being an important element of their  
414 perception of self (16) and giving life value and meaning, (54) there is potentially a benefit to

415 their social identity in that playing football again affords them cultural capital, (55) which is  
416 valued in this different ‘field’ (52) (i.e., in a football arena in the town centre) that contrasts  
417 so markedly from their usual social environment (being in a unit or on a ward) that does not  
418 value such capital, and therefore can make that person feel undervalued. Furthermore,  
419 service-users, volunteers and staff appreciated the dynamic of everyone playing together, as  
420 Sean (Service-user) stated:

421         The power dynamics aren’t that obvious, everyone’s on one level. I can’t praise it  
422         enough. It’s good that here I’m better than the staff [at football] and we have more of  
423         a laugh about that, whereas the rest of the time I’m just ‘Sean’ the patient.

424 This is in line with the more collective, solidarity-enhancing activities that have been called  
425 for by Leamy et al. (9) and McKeown et al., (30) which highlighted the benefits of flexible  
426 inter-personal relations in settings that contrast with the ‘mainstream’ mental health service  
427 settings and relations with practitioners. This significance is perhaps intensified in medium-  
428 secure units where these relations and power dynamics are especially manifest, as Onken et  
429 al. (53, p10) suggested the “interaction among characteristics of the individual (such as hope),  
430 characteristics of the environment (such as opportunities), and characteristics of the exchange  
431 between the individual and the environment (such as choice), can promote or hinder  
432 recovery”, therefore services could benefit from reflecting on service-users’ hope and identity  
433 when considering opportunities and choices.

434

435 Meaningful [B]

436 Although the data suggested that this element of the recovery processes framework was  
437 discussed the least by participants, there was a strong consensus of football being meaningful  
438 and the sessions meaning a lot to them in terms of their health and ongoing recovery.

439 Participants felt particularly strongly when asked ‘what if the sessions stopped?’. Put simply

440 by Megan (Service-user): “If the sessions weren’t on I think I might fall back into depression.  
441 A lot of people would be lost without this, I think. I know I would”. These sentiments were  
442 echoed by staff members Lewis and Mikey: “for some of the guys who come, it’s the only  
443 physical exercise they do. It’s the only social thing they do” (Lewis, Staff); “I dread to think,  
444 mate [what would happen if the sessions stopped]. I dread to think. They say to me ‘What  
445 would I do on my own on a Tuesday?’, they all love football and want to come here” (Mikey,  
446 Staff). A functionalist perspective (56) would highlight the function of sport of being the  
447 ‘hook’ that brings people together, in order for additional benefits (such as the other CHIME  
448 recovery processes) to be enabled. The obvious limitation in a practical sense for services is  
449 that not everyone likes football and facilities might not be available, however other sports  
450 could be offered and despite the limited funding there is a growing body of evidence that is  
451 highlighting how sport can really influence people’s personal recovery, so these opportunities  
452 arguably should be made available.

453

### 454 **Academic and Practical Impact [A]**

455 In an academic sense, this study has attempted to add to the limited, but growing, evidence  
456 base in this area in four specific ways, by exploring sport in a specific mental health context  
457 (that has not previously been studied); whilst focusing on the lived experiences of those  
458 involved; via an ethnographic approach; the analysis of which is underpinned by the CHIME  
459 conceptual framework. (9) In terms of mental health practice and impact, the findings and  
460 report produced for the Trust that runs the sessions has led to a documented increased  
461 awareness (especially at a senior management level) of the benefits of the sessions for staff  
462 and service-users, as well as a formally reported appreciation of the benefits for recovery  
463 from taking part in sport. This has subsequently led to funding being secured for future  
464 football sessions (that was not previously forthcoming) and has also contributed to a strategy

465 being implemented to increase sport and physical activity across the Trust, so more people  
466 are benefitting from the sessions on a continuing basis. Considerations outside of the CHIME  
467 analysis here could adopt a critical approach and point to elements such as the gender divide  
468 during sessions, (46) competitive sport causing conflict (4) or the predominance of the  
469 biomedical model that still underpins services. (2) However, this study explored the lived  
470 experiences of those involved in the sessions, and these experiences were overwhelmingly  
471 positive. Even when probed, the only negative comments related to frustrations that funding  
472 was precarious (which caused anxiety about sessions not continuing), wanting to have more  
473 sessions during the week available and wanting to play for longer during sessions. The data  
474 demonstrated that these sessions have considerable links to the CHIME processes, and can  
475 therefore be considered to contribute to personal recovery for those involved. Therefore, this  
476 study has responded to the challenge of Leamy et al. (9, p451) to use the CHIME framework  
477 to develop an evidence base that “simultaneously helps mental health professionals to support  
478 recovery and respects the understanding that recovery is a unique and individual experience  
479 rather than something the mental health system does to a person”.

480

481 Acknowledgements: Special thanks to Robert Hipkiss and Jane Clark, and all of the service-  
482 users, volunteers and staff involved in the football sessions.

483

### 484 **References [A]**

485 (1) Ramon S, Healy B, Renouf N. Recovery from mental illness as an emergent concept and  
486 practice in Australia and the UK. *Int J Soc Psychiatry*. 2007;53(2):108-22.

487 (2) Watson DP. The evolving understanding of recovery: what does the sociology of mental  
488 health have to offer?. *Humanity Soc*. 2012;36(4):290-308.

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

- 489 (3) Slade M, Longden E. Empirical evidence about recovery and mental health. BMC  
490 Psychiatry. 2015;15(1):285.
- 491 (4) Magee J, Spaaij R, Jeanes R. "It's Recovery United for Me": Promises and Pitfalls of  
492 Football as Part of Mental Health Recovery. *Sociol Sport J.* 2015;32(4):357-76.
- 493 (5) Markowitz FE, Angell B, Greenberg JS. Stigma, reflected appraisals, and recovery  
494 outcomes in mental illness. *Soc Psychol Q.* 2011;74(2):144-65.
- 495 (6) Borg M, Davidson L. The nature of recovery as lived in everyday experience. *J Ment*  
496 *Health.* 2008;17(2):129-40.
- 497 (7) Slade M. *Personal recovery and mental illness: A guide for mental health professionals.*  
498 Cambridge University Press; 2009 May 28.
- 499 (8) Perkins R, Slade M. Recovery in England: transforming statutory services?. *Int Rev*  
500 *Psychiatry.* 2009;24(1): 29-39.
- 501 (9) Leamy M, Bird V, Le Boutillier C, Williams J, Slade M. Conceptual framework for  
502 personal recovery in mental health: systematic review and narrative synthesis. *BJ Psychiatry.*  
503 2011;199(6):445-52.
- 504 (10) Sterling EW, Silke A, Tucker S, Fricks L, Druss BG. Integrating wellness, recovery, and  
505 self-management for mental health consumers. *Community Ment Health J.* 2010;46(2):130-8.
- 506 (11) Tew J, Ramon S, Slade M, Bird V, Melton J, Le Boutillier C. Social factors and  
507 recovery from mental health difficulties: a review of the evidence. *Br J Soc Work.*  
508 2012;42(3):443-60.
- 509 (12) Sweeney A, Davies J, McLaren S, Whittock M, Lemma F, Belling R, Clement S, Burns  
510 T, Catty J, Jones IR, Rose D. Defining continuity of care from the perspectives of mental  
511 health service users and professionals: an exploratory, comparative study. *Health*  
512 *Expectations.* 2016;19(4):973-87.

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

- 513 (13) Schrank B, Brownell T, Riches S, Chevalier A, Jakaite Z, Larkin C, Lawrence V, Slade  
514 M. Staff views on wellbeing for themselves and for service users. *J Ment Health*.  
515 2015;24(1):48-53.
- 516 (14) Morera T, Bucci S, Randal C, Barrett M, Pratt D. Exploring views about mindfulness  
517 groups for voice-hearing from the perspective of service users and staff: A Q-methodology  
518 study. *Psychother Res*. 2017;27(2):179-88.
- 519 (15) Rose D, Evans J, Laker C, Wykes T. Life in acute mental health settings: experiences  
520 and perceptions of service users and nurses. *Epidemiol Psychiatr Sci*. 2015;24(1):90-6.
- 521 (16) Carless D, Douglas K. The role of sport and exercise in recovery from serious mental  
522 illness: two case studies. *Int J Mens Health*. 2008;7(2):137-156.
- 523 (17) Brawn P, Combes H, Ellis N. Football narratives: recovery and mental health. *J New*  
524 *Writing Health Social Care*. 2015;(2)1:30-46.
- 525 (18) Rosenbaum S, Tiedemann A, Ward PB. Meta-analysis physical activity interventions for  
526 people with mental illness: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *J Clin Psychiatry*.  
527 2014;75(0):964-974.
- 528 (19) Rosenbaum S, Vancampfort D, Steel Z, Newby J, Ward PB, Stubbs B. Physical activity  
529 in the treatment of post-traumatic stress disorder: a systematic review and meta-analysis.  
530 *Psychiatry Res*. 2015;230(2):130-136.
- 531 (20) Foucault M. *Discipline and Punish*, trans. Alan Sheridan (New York: Vintage, 1979).  
532 1977;191.
- 533 (21) Craft LL. Exercise and clinical depression: examining two psychological mechanisms.  
534 *Psychol Sport Exerc*. 2005;6(2):151-171.
- 535 (22) Sylvester BD, Mack DE, Busseri MA, Wilson PM, Beauchamp MR. Health-enhancing  
536 physical activity, psychological needs satisfaction, and well-being: Is it how often, how long,  
537 or how much effort that matters?. *Ment Health Phys Act*. 2012;5(2):141-147.

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

- 538 (23) Pareja-Galeano H, Mayero S, Perales M, Garatachea N, Santos-Lozano A, Fiuza-Luces  
539 C, Emanuele E, G Gálvez B, Sanchis-Gomar F, Lucia A. Biological rationale for regular  
540 physical exercise as an effective intervention for the prevention and treatment of depressive  
541 disorders. *Curr Pharm Des.* 2016;22(24):3764-3775.
- 542 (24) Department of Health. Future in mind: Promoting, protecting and improving our children  
543 and young people's mental health and wellbeing. 2015.
- 544 (25) Smith A, Jones J, Houghton L, Duffell T. A political spectator sport or policy priority? A  
545 review of sport, physical activity and public mental health policy. *International Journal of*  
546 *Sport Policy and Politics.* 2016;8(4):593-607.
- 547 (26) HM Government. Sporting future: a new strategy for an active nation. London: Cabinet  
548 Office. 2015.
- 549 (27) Henderson C, O'Hara S, Thornicroft G, Webber M. Corporate social responsibility and  
550 mental health: the Premier League football Imagine Your Goals programme. *Int Rev*  
551 *Psychiatry.* 2014;26(4):460-466.
- 552 (28) Pringle A. The growing role of football as a vehicle for interventions in mental health  
553 care. *J Psychiatr Ment Health Nurs.* 2009;16(6):553-557.
- 554 (29) Jones A. Football as a metaphor: Learning to cope with life, manage emotional illness  
555 and maintain health through to recovery. *J Psychiatr Ment Health Nurs.* 2009;16(5):488-492.
- 556 (30) McKeown M, Roy A, Spandler H. 'You'll never walk alone': Supportive social relations  
557 in a football and mental health project. *Int J Ment Health Nurs.* 2015;24(4):360-369.
- 558 (31) Spandler H, Mckeown M, Roy A, Hurley M. Football metaphor and mental well-being:  
559 An evaluation of the It's a Goal! programme. *J Ment Health.* 2013;22(6):544-554.
- 560 (32) Mason OJ, Holt R. A role for football in mental health: the Coping Through Football  
561 project. *Psychiatrist.* 2012;36(8):290-293.



## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

- 562 (33) Spandler H, Roy A, Mckeown M. Using football metaphor to engage men in therapeutic  
563 support. *J Soc Work Pract.* 2014;28(2):229-245.
- 564 (34) Doherty DT, Kartalova-O'Doherty Y. Gender and self-reported mental health problems:  
565 predictors of help seeking from a general practitioner. *Br J Health Psychol.* 2010;15(1):213-  
566 228.
- 567 (35) Spandler H, McKeown M. A critical exploration of using football in health and welfare  
568 programs: gender, masculinities, and social relations. *J Sport Soc Issues.* 2012;36(4):387-409.
- 569 (36) Lewis CJ, Reeves MJ, Roberts SJ. Improving the physical and mental well-being of  
570 typically hard-to-reach men: an investigation of the impact of the Active Rovers project.  
571 *Sport in Soc.* 2017;20(2):258-268.
- 572 (37) Pringle A, Sayers P. It's a Goal! The half-time score. *Mental Health Nursing.*  
573 2006;26(3):14-17.
- 574 (38) Klein AM. Little big men: Bodybuilding subculture and gender construction. Suny  
575 Press; 1993.
- 576 (39) Smith B, Sparkes AC. Qualitative research methods in sport, exercise and health: From  
577 process to product. Routledge; 2014.
- 578 (40) Williams TL, Smith B, Papathomas A. Physical activity promotion for people with  
579 spinal cord injury: physiotherapists' beliefs and actions. *Disabil Rehabil.* 2018;40(1):52-61.
- 580 (41) Beebe LH, Tian L, Morris N, Goodwin A, Allen SS, Kuldau J. Effects of exercise on  
581 mental and physical health parameters of persons with schizophrenia. *Issues Ment Health*  
582 *Nurs.* 2005;26(6):661-676.
- 583 (42) Horsfall J, Cleary M, Hunt GE. Stigma in mental health: Clients and professionals.  
584 *Issues Ment Health Nurs.* 2010;31(7):450-455.
- 585 (43) Mason OJ, Holt R. Mental health and physical activity interventions: a review of the  
586 qualitative literature. *J Ment Health.* 2012;21(3):274-284.

## FOOTBALL AND MENTAL HEALTH RECOVERY

- 587 (44) Gold RL. Roles in sociological field observations. *Soc Forces*. 1958;36:217.
- 588 (45) Jones I, Brown L, Holloway I. *Qualitative research in sport and physical activity*. Sage;  
589 2013.
- 590 (46) Spandler H, Roy A, McKeown M. Playing by the rules? Gender relations in a football  
591 and mental health project. *J Mens Stud*. 2014;22(2):140-154.
- 592 (47) Carroll P, Kirwan L, Lambe B. Engaging 'hard to reach' men in community based health  
593 promotions. *Int J Health Promot Educ*. 2014;52(3):120-130.
- 594 (48) White A, Witty K. Men's under use of health services—finding alternative approaches. *J*  
595 *Ment Health*. 2009;6(2):95-97.
- 596 (49) Silk M. Sporting ethnography: Philosophy, methodology & reflection. In Mason D,  
597 Andrews D, Silk ML. *Qualitative methods for sports studies*. Berg; 2005; 65-103.
- 598 (50) Brijnath B. Applying the CHIME recovery framework in two culturally diverse  
599 Australian communities: Qualitative results. *Int J Soc Psychiatry*. 2015;61(7):660-667.
- 600 (51) Fogarty M, Happell B. Exploring the benefits of an exercise program for people with  
601 schizophrenia: A qualitative study. *Issues Ment Health Nurs*. 2005;26(3):341-351.
- 602 (52) Bourdieu P. *Distinction: A social critique of the judgement of taste*. Routledge; 1984.
- 603 (53) Onken SJ, Craig CM, Ridgway P, Ralph RO, Cook JA. An analysis of the definitions  
604 and elements of recovery: A review of the literature. *Psychiatr Rehabil J*. 2007;31(1):9-22.
- 605 (54) Repper J, Perkins R. *Social inclusion and recovery: A model for mental health practice*.  
606 Elsevier Health Sciences; 2003.
- 607 (55) Bourdieu P. Sport and social class. *Information (International Social Science Council)*.  
608 1978;17(6):819-840.
- 609 (56) Giulianotti R. *Sport: A critical sociology*. John Wiley & Sons; 2016.