

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.



# **Creating a Compendium of Third Wave Therapy Strategies**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Science  
in  
Psychology

at Massey University, Palmerston North,  
New Zealand

Michelle Leanne Rous

2018



## ABSTRACT

Third Wave Cognitive Behavioural therapies have received much attention in the practice community recently. However, little has been done to understand how these therapies relate and diverge. Despite the varying theoretical models contributing to the Third Wave movement and their supposed varying therapeutic elements, studies have suggested that outcomes do not differ across these therapeutic approaches. This finding leaves room for the notion that shared or ‘common’ factors may be operating across these approaches. Exploration into common elements between these approaches is useful for identifying areas of overlap or uniqueness, shared processes of change, and perhaps components that may be particularly efficacious.

Goldfried argued the best way to identify the commonalities among diverse therapeutic approaches is to compare them by their principles of change, or change processes (Goldfried, 1980). Research has investigated change processes for many approaches, including those of the Behaviour and Cognitive tradition. However, such extensive investigations have not been applied to the Third Wave approaches. Further, a lack of quality comparisons across these approaches, even at the more specific level of therapeutic strategies, represents a gap in the field.

The present research first identified a set of strategies (84 items) within three Third Wave approaches: Dialectical Behaviour Therapy, Acceptance and Commitment Therapy and Mindfulness Based Cognitive Therapy. Strategies are sorted according to similarity in a card-sorting task, by two participant samples, a non-therapist sample (N=32) and a therapist sample (N=35). Sorting data were analysed using multidimensional scaling (MDS) to produce three three-dimensional models, representing each sample and a combined sample. The therapist sample was judged to represent the underlying relationships between strategies best.

Three dimensions were identified that classified strategies according to their internal or external orientation; response to experience (accepting or exploratory in nature); and the perspectives involved (clients or external such as therapists). Additionally, 17 clusters were identified that comprised strategies perceived to represent similar concepts, five of which contained strategies from all three paradigms

(Mindfulness; Noticing; Distress Tolerance and Acceptance; Therapist Style; and Observing and Perspective Taking).

Commonalities and differences observed across the approaches are discussed and suggestions made for future validation of this model. Applications are discussed around informing investigations of change processes in the Third Wave and the integration of Third Wave therapy elements. This research presents opportunities for mapping strategies to various characteristics of the client, therapist or disorder, for example, and then identifying effective strategy use among these variables.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr. Don Baken and Dr. Shane Harvey. Their knowledge and expertise were invaluable throughout this process, ensuring the meaningful direction this research has taken. I am thankful for the time and effort they put into every stage of this project, and the constant learning and development opportunities that came with their involvement. They were incredibly supportive and reassuring of my decisions, and their belief in my abilities is something I am truly grateful for.

I want to thank Dr. David Bimler, who conducted the statistical analyses in this research. Interpreting the data would have been a difficult task without the time and effort he spent helping me to understanding the analyses. His efforts were above and beyond and I am very grateful for his help.

Many therapists from all around the world were kind enough to devote their time and energy to this research. I would like to thank the therapists who were involved with reviewing and validating the content in this research. This was an essential element of the research, which several psychologists from Massey University were involved in. Regarding recruitment of therapists for the next stage of the research, I was overwhelmed by the response I received. The excitement that many expressed for this research being carried out was hugely encouraging, and I admire the enthusiasm of all of my participants for wanting to advance research in this area. I would also like to extend my gratitude to those who participated as non-therapists. Their efforts were exceptional.

Finally, I would like to express my love and appreciation for my Mum and Dad, my brothers Dale and Sean, and my partner Andrew. For their endless encouragement and unwavering confidence in me, for inspiring me to aim high, and for always being there and brightening up my life, I am truly grateful.

## ABBREVIATIONS

3D	Three-dimensional
CBT	Cognitive Behavioural Therapy
DBT	Dialectical Behaviour Therapy
ACT	Acceptance and Commitment Therapy
MCBT	Mindfulness Based Cognitive Therapy
BPD	Borderline Personality Disorder
CANCORR	Canonical correlation
GOPA	Grouping, opposites, partitioning, adding
HCA	Hierarchical cluster analysis
MDS	Multi-dimensional scaling
MOSS	Method of Successive Sorts



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ABSTRACT .....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>ABBREVIATIONS.....</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS .....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>LIST OF APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>x</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES.....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>LIST OF FIGURES.....</b>	<b>xii</b>
<b>CHAPTER ONE.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Three Waves of Behavioural and Cognitive Therapy .....</b>	<b>1</b>
First Wave, Behavioural Therapy: Defining Characteristics .....	1
Second Wave, Cognitive and Cognitive Behavioural Therapy: Defining Characteristics .....	2
<b>The Third Wave of Behavioural and Cognitive Therapy .....</b>	<b>3</b>
Defining Characteristics.....	3
Context and Function .....	3
Experiential and direct change strategies .....	5
Importance of empirical evidence. ....	5
Developing flexible repertoires. ....	6
Building on previous understandings .....	6
Therapeutic considerations for clinicians.....	7
What Approaches are considered Third Wave?.....	7
<b>Efficacious Components of Psychotherapy .....</b>	<b>8</b>
Common Factors .....	9
The Common Factors .....	9
Specific Factors.....	9
Common Elements in the Present Research.....	10
<b>Change Processes .....</b>	<b>11</b>
Common Change Processes .....	12
Context Engagement. ....	13
Behavioural exposure. ....	13
Behavioural activation. ....	14
Attention change.....	14

Attention training.....	15
Acceptance and tolerance .....	15
Cognitive change.....	15
Decentring or defusion. ....	15
Cognitive reframing.....	16
Specificity of change processes.....	16
A Gap in Common Factors Research.....	16
Systematic investigations. ....	16
Third wave specific investigations .....	17
Addressing the Gap.....	17
<b>Third Wave Therapies in the Present Research .....</b>	<b>18</b>
Dialectical Behaviour Therapy .....	18
DBT as a Third Wave Therapy. ....	19
Acceptance and Commitment Therapy.....	19
What makes ACT Third Wave? .....	21
Mindfulness-Based Cognitive Therapy .....	21
What Makes MBCT Third Wave? .....	22
Comparisons between ACT, DBT and MBCT .....	23
Mindfulness.....	24
Separation from Thoughts.....	26
Values and Pleasant Events.....	26
Values and Commitment to Action.....	27
Acceptance and Distress Tolerance.....	28
Dialectical Strategies.....	30
Implications for the Integration of Third Wave Therapies .....	30
Recommendations from the Literature .....	31
<b>Conclusions and Research Needs .....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>The Present Research .....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>CHAPTER TWO .....</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>Method.....</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>Item Generation .....</b>	<b>34</b>
Defining ‘Strategy’ .....	34
MBCT.....	34
DBT .....	35
ACT .....	35
Approach to Identify Items .....	35

DBT.....	36
ACT.....	36
MBCT.....	37
Item Exclusion Criteria .....	37
Initial Descriptor Validation .....	38
Expert consensus.....	38
First stage validation.....	39
Second stage validation .....	40
Changes.....	40
Third stage validation.....	41
Changes.....	41
Post-Validation Panel Revision.....	42
First Iteration.....	42
Post-Validation Panel Revision.....	42
Second iteration.....	42
<b>Card-sort Procedure.....</b>	<b>43</b>
Approach.....	43
Participants.....	44
Therapists.....	44
Non-therapists.....	44
Materials.....	45
Therapists.....	45
Non-therapists.....	45
Procedure.....	46
<b>Analysis.....</b>	<b>46</b>
Multidimensional Scaling .....	46
Data Transformation .....	47
Map Development and Verification.....	47
Map Stability.....	48
<b>CHAPTER THREE.....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>Results.....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>Statistical Analysis.....</b>	<b>49</b>
The Raw Data.....	49
Data Analysis .....	51
Hierarchical Cluster Analysis.....	51
Multidimensional Scaling.....	55

Stress.....	55
Consistency Between Samples.....	57
Canonical correlation. ....	58
Procrustes distance. ....	58
Cophenetic correlation. ....	58
Overall Inter-map Similarity.....	59
Reliability. ....	59
<b>Map Interpretation.....</b>	<b>60</b>
Clusters.....	60
Expert Clusters.....	61
Lay Clusters .....	61
Sample Comparison. ....	62
Therapeutic Paradigm Overlap .....	74
Dimensions.....	78
Rotation. ....	81
Expert Sample Dimensions. ....	81
Model Inconsistencies. ....	83
Lay Sample Dimensions.....	87
<b>CHAPTER FOUR.....</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>Discussion</b> .....	91
<b>The Need for a Compendium of Third Wave Therapy Strategies.....</b>	<b>91</b>
Expert and Lay Sample Comparisons .....	92
Clusters.....	93
Paradigm Uniqueness. ....	97
Change Processes .....	99
Context Engagement. ....	105
Attention Change.....	106
Cognitive Change. ....	108
Dimensions.....	109
Holes in the Model.....	113
Model Inconsistencies.....	115
<b>Implications and Applications of the Present Research.....</b>	<b>117</b>
Therapist Practice.....	118
Research Applications.....	119
<b>Limitations.....</b>	<b>119</b>
Item Consistency.....	121

Item Interpretation.....	122
External Validity .....	123
<b>Future Directions .....</b>	<b>124</b>
Validation.....	124
Future Research.....	125
<b>CHAPTER FIVE.....</b>	<b>127</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>127</b>
<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>129</b>
<b>APPENDICES.....</b>	<b>144</b>

## LIST OF APPENDICES

<b>Appendix A: Item Generation References .....</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>Appendix B: DBT Strategies .....</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>Appendix C: ACT Strategies .....</b>	<b>171</b>
<b>Appendix D: MBCT Strategies .....</b>	<b>186</b>
<b>Appendix E: Validation Panel Instructions.....</b>	<b>208</b>
<b>Appendix F: Similar Items across Therapy Approaches .....</b>	<b>213</b>
<b>Appendix G: Therapist Recruitment Advertisement .....</b>	<b>215</b>
<b>Appendix H: Therapist Participant Forms .....</b>	<b>216</b>
<b>Appendix I: Non-therapist Participant Forms.....</b>	<b>225</b>
<b>Appendix J: Low Risk Ethics Confirmation .....</b>	<b>228</b>
<b>Appendix K: Lay Sample Dendrogram .....</b>	<b>229</b>
<b>Appendix L: Combined Sample Dendrogram.....</b>	<b>231</b>

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>Table 1</b>	Commonalities and Differences Likely to be Evidenced Across DBT, ACT and MBCT .....	24
<b>Table 2</b>	Cluster Item Content for the Expert, Lay and Combined Samples .....	63
<b>Table 3</b>	Paradigm Overlap in the Expert and Lay Samples.....	75
<b>Table 4</b>	Clusters Present in the Expert, Lay and Combined Samples .....	76
<b>Table 5</b>	Dimensions and Polar Meanings .....	79
<b>Table 6</b>	Dimensional Characteristics and Relevant Clusters from the Expert Sample .....	80
<b>Table 7</b>	Clusters in the Present Research in Relation to a CBT Common Factors Model (Mennin et al, 2013) .....	101

## LIST OF FIGURES

### **Figure 1.**

Expert model dendrogram showing preliminary clustering.....54

### **Figure 2.**

Scree plot showing stress and dimensionality for expert, lay and combined samples....57

### **Figure 3.**

Expert sample model showing the Internally Oriented (X+) hemisphere, Octants 1-4.

Italic items represent isolated items ..... 85

### **Figure 4.**

Expert sample model showing the Externally Oriented (X+) hemisphere, Octants 5-8.

Italic items represent isolated items ..... 86

### **Figure 5.**

Lay sample model showing Externally Oriented (X+) hemisphere, octants 1-4. Italicised items represent isolated items ..... 89

### **Figure 6.**

Lay sample model showing Internally Oriented (X-) hemisphere, octants 5-8. Italicised items represent isolated items ..... 90