# **UNIVERSITYOF BIRMINGHAM**

**Research at Birmingham** 

## **Sewage Sludge Ash Characteristics and Potential for Use in Concrete**

Lynn, Ciaran; Dhir, Ravindra; Ghataora, Gurmel; West, Roger

DOI: [10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2015.08.122](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2015.08.122)

License: Creative Commons: Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs (CC BY-NC-ND)

Document Version Peer reviewed version

#### Citation for published version (Harvard):

Lynn, C, Dhir, R, Ghataora, G & West, R 2015, 'Sewage Sludge Ash Characteristics and Potential for Use in Concrete', Construction and Building Materials, vol. 98, pp. 767-779. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2015.08.122

[Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal](https://research.birmingham.ac.uk/portal/en/publications/sewage-sludge-ash-characteristics-and-potential-for-use-in-concrete(f5f339f1-30b0-4a46-a1e8-0a43a9171774).html)

#### **General rights**

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

• Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.

• Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.

• User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?) • Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

#### **Take down policy**

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.



#### **Abstract**



#### **1. Introduction**

 Sustainable waste management has been incorporated as a core principle in European (EU Directive 2008/98/EC on waste) and worldwide (United Nations Framework Convention on climate change, 1992) legislation. A more environmental friendly hierarchy of waste treatment options, of which recycling and incineration rank above disposal, is now prescribed by law.

 Sewage sludge is a by-product of waste water treatment. Past disposal methods of this waste are no longer readily acceptable, for example, in Europe, disposal at sea has been banned since 1998 (EU Urban Waste Water Directive 91/271/EC), spreading on farmland has been restricted due to cautious approaches adopted by countries for health reasons and mandatory targets have been set

to reduce the biodegradable waste landfilled fractions (EU Landfill Directive 1999/31/EC).

The incineration process reduces the waste by approximately 70% by mass and 90% by volume,

leaving behind residual sewage sludge ash (SSA) and has become one of the most appropriate

management options to deal with the volumes produced and the potentially unsafe elements the

sewage sludge contains. Approximately 10 Mt dry mass of sewage sludge is produced per annum in

the 28 European member states, of which, 22% is incinerated [1].

 Though significantly less than municipal solid waste production, this quantity is still significant at a local level and indeed environmentally acceptable treatment of all waste streams, including SSA, is needed and, where appropriate, their sustainable use as secondary materials. Indeed, the construction industry is increasingly expected to play a major role in achieving the target of zero

waste and as such, an evaluation of the use of SSA in concrete can be useful and timely.

#### **2. The Project**

 This paper examines the use of SSA in concrete and concrete related applications. A systematic review of globally published literature in the English medium is undertaken, involving analysis, evaluation and synthesis of data therein, covering the material's physical and chemical

 characteristics and its use as raw feed for cement clinker and as cement components in producing cement paste, mortar and concrete mixtures, as well as fine, filler and manufactured lightweight aggregates.

 The compendium of the data is based on a total of 156 publications, dating from 1983 - 2015 and originating in 30 countries across Europe (72 publications), Asia (65), North America (11), South America (4), Africa (3) and Australia (1), with the largest contributions from Taiwan (27 publications), UK (19), Spain (17) and Japan (16).

#### **3. SSA Characteristics**

#### **Density**

 The specific gravity of SSA has been found to range from 1.8 - 2.9, though the bulk of results were 87 skewed towards the upper end of this band with a mean value of 2.5 and standard deviation of 0.3 [2-26]. The material is somewhat comparable to light sand and less dense than Portland cement (3.15). It has been shown that density increases with the incineration temperature, though the rate 90 of increase drops off above 1000°C. The low ratio of bulk density (average 805 kg/m<sup>3</sup>) [2, 8, 9, 17, 22, 23 and 26-28] to particle density is also indicative of the porous nature of SSA.

#### **Fineness and Grading**

- For as-produced SSA, the data presented in the published literature suggests that the material
- predominantly falls in the silt (2.5 62.5µm) and fine sand (62.5 250µm) size fractions, with mean
- diameters ranging from 50 260 µm [4, 5, 8, 9, 13, 14, 29, 30 and 31].
- A selection of as-produced material grading curves is shown in Figure 1a. Though variable, for the
- most part the material is consistent within the above mean diameter range, indicating suitability for
- use as filler or fine aggregates in concrete, possibly with minor modifications.



100 Figure 1: Particle size distributions of (a) as-produced SSA with overall sand limits in concrete (BS 101 882) and (b) ground SSA with PC and fly ash samples.

102 SSA ground for use as a cementitious component (Figure 1b) can achieve well graded size

103 distributions similar to Portland cement clinker (PC) and fly ash (class F). BET specific surface area

104 and Blaine fineness however varied over a wide range from 2500 - 23100  $\text{m}^2/\text{kg}$  [4, 9, 11, 21, 24, 25,

105 36 and 38] and 500 - 3900  $m^2$ /kg [4, 12, 21, 24, 31 and 40] respectively. The marked variability and

106 discrepancies compared to typical Portland cement (e.g. BET 350 - 380 m<sup>2</sup>/kg [41]), suggest that

107 these fineness measures are not ideally suited to assess SSA as a potential cementitious material,

108 due to the effect of its irregular particle shapes and porous microstructure.

#### 109 **Morphology**

110 SSA consists of irregular particles with rough surface textures and a porous microstructure [3, 4, 7,

111 12, 13, 16, 17, 25, 31, 37, 38 and 42-46] which may lead to high absorption and an increase in the

112 water demand of concrete using SSA. Indeed, water absorption values ranging from 8 - 20% have

113 been reported [10, 13, 47 and 48], which is substantially higher than natural sand, which is typically

114 1 - 3%. Superplasticizers are one option to consider as an admixture to counteract higher water

115 demand resulting from the use of SSA in mortar and concrete.

#### **Oxide Composition**

 The oxide composition of SSA has been widely reported [2, 7, 11, 13, 14, 16-18, 20, 22-24, 28, 31, 32, 34, 36-38, 40, 44, 45, 49-102]. A breakdown of publications produced per year is presented in Figure 2, showing that the data has been published over a period of 26 years, though as a sign of growing interest in the use of sustainable materials, the majority of the research has been undertaken in the last 10 years.





Figure 2: Rate of publication of the oxide composition data on SSA

125 The main oxides in SSA are reported as  $SiO_2$ ,  $Al_2O_3$  and CaO, while Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, Na<sub>2</sub>O, MgO, P<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, SO<sub>3</sub> and others are present in smaller quantities. A ternary diagram of the main oxide contents is plotted for 157 SSA samples taken from the above 76 publications, in Figure 3, along with typical contents for more established cementitious materials. The calculated mean, standard deviation (St Dev) and 129 coefficient of variation (CV) values for  $SiO_2$ ,  $Al_2O_3$  and CaO are also given. This Figure shows that the majority of results fall around the latent hydraulic and pozzolanic regions, suggesting potential for SSA use as a cementitious component in concrete.

 The mean aluminium content of approximately 14% calculated for SSA is much greater than the typical Portland cement content (approximately 5%), suggesting natural suitability for use in aerated concrete, which typically involves the use of foaming agents such as aluminium powder to react with



Figure 3: Ternary plot of  $SiO<sub>2</sub>$ , Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and CaO contents for SSA

135

136 Note: PC = Portland cement, GGBS = ground granulated blastfurnace slag, PFA = pulverised fuel ash, 137 MK = metakaolin, SA = shale ash, NP = natural pozzolan, SF = silica fume and LS = limestone. 138 139

140 cement to bring about expansion and the formation of a lightweight material. The high aluminium 141 content of SSA may also benefit concrete resistance to chloride attack, due to the chloride binding 142 capacity of amorphous alumina.

#### 143 **Loss on Ignition (LOI)**

144 The LOI data for SSA obtained from the sourced literature yielded an average value of 3.5%, though

- 145 occasionally very high values up to 13% have been reported [2, 7, 12, 13, 15-17, 30, 31, 52, 64, 80,
- 146 81, 92, 94, 96, 103 and 104]. Thus, it is possible for SSA, as presently produced, to be generally able
- 147 to comply with the LOI limit of 5% set for cement in EN 197 (2011) and fly ash for concrete in EN 450

 (2012). Where SSA is earmarked for specific use in concrete, a thorough burn during incineration should be able to control the LOI.

#### **Mineralogy**

- Quartz and hematite have been identified as the most abundant minerals in SSA, while many other
- iron oxides, iron phosphates, calcium phosphates and aluminium phosphates have been reported to
- a lesser degree [3-5, 11-13, 16, 21, 24, 29-32, 43-45, 51, 58, 59, 64, 68, 74, 76, 77, 79, 94, 95, 99, 102
- and 105-110]. The amorphous content of SSA ranged from 35 75%, which suggests that the
- material is somewhat reactive and, when ground sufficiently fine, may have potential as a cement
- component.

#### **Trace Elements**

 Table 1 has been prepared to provide analysis of the extensively reported toxic and non-toxic element concentrations of SSA [2, 4, 12, 13, 17, 28, 30, 32, 34, 35, 42, 44, 45, 49, 55, 56, 58, 70-74, 76, 82, 83, 85, 87, 97, 100-104, 107, 108 and 111-132].

 Although the most abundant elements present are Si, Ca, Fe, Al and P, the contents of toxic trace elements such as Zn, Cu, Cr, Pb, Ni and Cd are of greater importance concerning the environmental impact of the material use. It should be noted that the lower sample numbers available at times for abundant elements such as Si, does not reflect that these elements were only present in a small number of SSA samples, but rather that the researchers focused more on reporting the contents of 166 the harmful trace elements.

 Table 1 provides target limits set for these elements in Germany (Landerarbeitsgeselschaft Abfall (LAGA) document, 1994) for the use of wastes as construction materials and the data shows that the mean values of these elements for SSA are within the targets, with the exception of cadmium, which is marginally over. Two points in this context should be noted: (i) the reported values in Table 1 are 171 simply target values and not the mandatory limits and (ii) the research suggests that the potentially

172 harmful constituents of the SSA become effectively bound and encapsulated, when used in

173 concrete.



175 in Table 1 and can be partly attributed to differences in (i) waste water treatments systems, (ii)

176 incineration conditions and (iii) method of testing (atomic absorption spectrophotometry (AAS) vs.

177 Table 1: SSA toxic and non-toxic element concentrations data from the literature



inductively coupled plasma (ICP) tests). It is suggested that supplementary processing treatments

such as ageing and acid washing can be utilized to regulate the contents of SSA, if so required.

Based on a mean chloride content value of 0.04% calculated from data in the literature, SSA

generally complies with the limit of 0.1% set for both cement in EN 197-1 (2011) and the use of fly

- ash in concrete in EN 450 (2012), respectively, whilst EN 12620 (2013) requires the producer to
- declare the chloride levels for the use of aggregate in concrete.

As stated previously, the high aluminium content of SSA may also benefit resistance to chloride

- 185 attack in concrete applications. Limited data on the sulphate content of SSA also appears to suggest
- that the material should also comply with the respective 3% limit given for fly ash in EN 450 (2012).

#### **4. Use in Concrete Related Applications**

#### **4.1 Cement**

 Two areas of research on the use of SSA in cement have generally been considered, namely as: (i) as a raw feed for cement clinker manufacture and (ii) as a component of cement. The relevant standard on cement in Europe, EN 197 (2011), allows the specifier some flexibility to incorporate certain secondary materials such as granulated blast furnace slag and fly ash as main constituents and perhaps with future developments SSA can also be included. EN 197 (2011) also allows the use of up to 5% of "minor additional constituents" and as such there is potential for SSA to be incorporated in cement at this low content under this standard.

#### **4.1.1 Raw Feed for Cement Clinker**

197 SSA can contribute to  $SiO_2$ ,  $Al_2O_3$  and  $Fe_2O_3$  requirements in the cement clinker production, whilst its 198 CaO content may also lead to minor reductions in  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  emissions by lowering the calcareous material content.

 The use of SSA has been explored at low contents from 1 - 11% [67, 69, 71-73, 104 and 133], though in one study [67], SSA had only been used in a single blend at a mere 1% and as such results from this publication are not included in the analysis. A number of review style papers [134-136], which referred to some of the above publications have also been identified in the literature. These review papers discussed the negative effects of heavy metals and phosphorus contents of SSA on cement performance and suggested pre-treatment of the material before use.

206 To analyse the trends associated with the use of SSA, a selection of key parameters for the eco-

207 cement blends produced are presented in Table 2. Brief notes on the performances of the resulting

208 cement mixes are also included. During these trials, the contents of other secondary materials such

209 as fly ash, copper slag and dried sewage sludge, varied to satisfy the required oxide quotas. As such,

210 it is difficult to directly quantify the impact of SSA, albeit certain trends can be observed from the

211 data.

Table 2: Selected results on the chemical composition of clinker blends produced with SSA







#### 234 **4.1.2 Cement Component**

235 As a cement component, the pozzolanic activity of SSA in ground form is one of the principal factors

236 affecting its potential for use. This property of SSA is assessed from strength activity index (SAI) tests

- 237 and measuring the quantity of  $Ca(OH)_2$  fixed. The reported results from standard SAI tests
- 238 undertaken based on the procedures in EN 450 and ASTM C311, which were originally adopted for
- 239 testing fly ash, are presented in Figure 4. Though not specifically in strict accordance with these
- 240 standards, SAI values calculated at a 20% SSA replacement level from additional mortar and concrete
- 241 mixes tested in the literature are also displayed in Figure 4.





243 Figure 4: Strength activity index results as a measure of the pozzolanic activity of SSA

244 In the standard tests, SSA mixes generally satisfied the respective limits outlined for fly ash of SAI

- 245 values greater than 75% at 7 or 28 days in ASTM C618 (2008) at the 20% replacement level and
- 246 greater than 75% and 85% SAI values at 28 and 90 days respectively for a 25% replacement level in

 EN 450. Similarly for the additional mortar and concrete mixes, the majority complied with the respective ASTM C618 limit.

 Though not surprisingly, the rate of strength development at up to 90 days is lower for SSA mixes than the corresponding control PC mixes, with the exception of one study [36] which can be singled out as an anomaly. Indications of typical pozzolanic behaviours of lower early strength and greater later age gains are also evident in the SSA mix results from many studies (Figure 4).

253 Measures of Ca(OH)<sub>2</sub> fixed by the pozzolanic activity SSA have been determined through saturated lime tests [8], Frattini tests [8] and thermogravimetric analysis [52 and 53], showing that significant pozzolanic reactions occurred with SSA, which increased with curing age and SSA content and again were at a level comparable to fly ash.

 Though the results suggest that SSA can perform as a capable cementitous component, additional experiments to further enhance its performance have also been undertaken. Nanomaterials 259 additions were effective in improving the microstructure and density of cement pastes containing SSA, resulting in improved mechanical performance [110, 139 and 140]. It is also expected that other materials such as silica fume or metakaolin could be used effectively alongside SSA, perhaps in high performance concrete. Silica fume would be the preferred option given that it is more chemically compatible due to its lack of alumina that could be compensated by SSA. Calcination treatment, involving the heating of SSA at temperatures ranging from 700 - 1200°C, has also been shown as an 265 effective method of increasing the amorphous content of the material and consequently enhancing the pozzlanic activity [24]. SAI values on par with control PC mixes have been achieved at up to 28 267 day curing times, after SSA had been heated from 1000 - 1200°C.

#### 268 **4.2 Aggregate**

- 269 The characteristics of SSA, specifically its fineness, suggest that the material may be suitable for use
- 270 in concrete as filler or fine aggregate. The reported performance of concrete using SSA in this form
- 271 [7, 14, 17, 35 and 53] is covered in Section 4.3 below.
- 272 SSA also has good prospects as a manufactured lightweight aggregate and many attempts have been
- 273 made in the literature to exploit this potential application [28, 42, 47, 48, 65, 66, 97, 109, 141-144].
- 274 The process typically involves pelletizing and sintering at high temperatures to produce high porosity
- 275 aggregates that retain strong surface layers.
- 276 Mechanical and lightweight properties of manufactured SSA aggregates are strongly connected to
- 277 the sintering conditions. Indeed, bulk density results after sintering at temperatures from 900 -
- 278 1150°C are presented in Figure 5 [47, 42, 65 and 109]. At 1050°C, expansion processes begin to form
- 279 resulting in large discontinuous irregular pores, which leads to a sharp decrease in density and









282 Figure 5: Bulk density of manufactured SSA lightweight aggregate

 At temperatures above 1070°C, SSA aggregates fall within the lightweight aggregate classification 284 limit of 1200 kg/m<sup>3</sup> set in EN 13055-1 (2002) and are comparable to Lytag aggregate at temperatures from 1080 - 1100°C. Increasing the sintering time, one example of which is highlighted [47] in Figure 5, also leads to a sharper decrease in bulk density.

287 The effect of additions of sewage sludge  $[42]$ , boric acid  $(H_3BO_3)$  [65] and glass cullet powder [97] in the production process have also been investigated. As shown in Figure 5, sewage sludge and in 289 particular H<sub>3</sub>BO lowers the melting points of the mix, while similar behaviour is also evident with glass cullet additions [97], thus the expansive processes and resultant weight losses are initiated 291 early, resulting in lower energy demand.

 The lightweight properties of the aggregate also need to be balanced with its strength performance. Strength has been found to increase up to a maximum at the melting point temperature of SSA (at approximately 1050°C) as the aggregate microstructure becomes well formed and dense. At higher temperatures, the strength decreases as apertures are formed. When the bulk density is comparable to Lytag aggregate, equivalent compressive strengths from 3 - 5 MPa [142] have been achieved for 297 the SSA aggregate, which falls at the lower end of the expected Lytag range. It has also been shown that additions of clay, aluminium oxide and municipal solid waste fly ash are effective options to enhance strength [97 and 142] and can be incorporated to tailor the end properties of the manufactured lightweight aggregates from SSA.

#### **4.3 Mortar and Concrete**

#### **4.3.1 Use as Aggregate**

 This use has been reported as both in the form of fine and filler aggregate components, typically at moderately low contents [7, 14, 17, 35 and 53].

The limited research undertaken [7 and 53] reports of large reduction in workability or large

increases in water contents of concrete with the use of a small proportion SSA as the sand

 component (up to 15%) because of the alleged effect of higher than normal porosity/absorption characteristics. However, it would appear that mix design has not been revised in these studies to accommodate the SSA characteristics. Furthermore, were the water demand to still increase, a water reducing admixture can be used to compensate for this deficiency.

 The introduction of SSA has led to reduction in the concrete mix density in certain cases [14 and 17], which would usually be expected given that the material density is comparable to light sand. Though in one particular case, the replacement of 10% of the denser control limestone aggregate with SSA resulted in an increase in the mix density [53] and this was attributed to the beneficial effect of the fine particles of SSA on the particle packing in the concrete mixture.

 Reported compressive strength data would initially appear to be at odds showing both decreases [17 and 35] and increases [14 and 53] with the inclusion of SSA, but this comes down to how this material has been adopted in the mix design. Indeed, this is a very common phenomenon with the evaluation of new materials for their use in concrete and for this reason the data reported often require a very careful examination. Nonetheless, on balance it would appear that any impacts of low contents of SSA on compressive strength performance are not major either way and are manageable. Flexural and tensile strength behaviours have been found to match up well with equivalent compressive strength results [14, 17 and 35].

324 Capillary water absorption coefficients ranging from 0.26 - 0.9 kg/m<sup>2</sup> h<sup>0.5</sup> have been reported for concrete mixes containing up to 20% SSA [14 and 53], compared to non-SSA control values ranging 326 from 0.55 – 0.61 kg/m<sup>2</sup> h<sup>0.5</sup>. Some level of absorption increase is expected with more porous aggregates, though the use of SSA at up to 20% does not flag any particularly negative durability effects, as these absorption coefficient values are within the normal range for conventional concrete mixes.

- Skid resistance results for concrete slabs containing up to 40% SSA as fine aggregate have been
- comparable to and, at times, outperformed the control normal sand mix [35]. This is likely due to the
- irregular nature of SSA particles and indeed, all SSA mixes are reported to be above the minimum
- skid resistance requirements outlined in ASTM E303 (1998).

#### **4.3.2 Use as Binder**

 As a cement component in ground form, research on the effects of SSA on fresh properties of mortar and concrete mixes included workability and setting time testing. No problems relating to segregation or bleeding have been reported.

 Results from flow table spread tests on mortars, presented in Figure 6 as the percentage change from the control, point to reductions in workability with a like-for-like replacement of cement with SSA [13, 21, 37, 55, 62, 145 and 146]. The average rate of decrease in workability calculated is 6% for every 10% SSA and equivalent slump reductions of 12% per 10% SSA have also been determined for concrete mixes [21, 27, 55 and 138]. Whilst this data provides an informative benchmark for SSA performance in fresh mortar/concrete, the specifier should perhaps seek to adjust the mix design to accommodate the characteristics of the material, possibly with the use of water reducing admixtures 345 to achieve satisfactory workability and the results suggest that this is very doable at low SSA contents.





Figure 6: Effect of SSA as cement replacement on mortar workability

 Setting times lengthen with increasing SSA contents [22, 40 and 138], with an average increase of 35% per 10% replacement calculated for both the initial and final setting times. Longer setting times are to be expected when using pozzolanic materials and the introduction of SSA causes no difficulties relating to the requirements of EN 197-1 (2011) for common cements, in which an initial setting time greater than 45 minutes is stated.

 Data on the effect of SSA on compressive strength (28 days) presented in Figure 7, shows reduction with increasing SSA content, on average at the rate of 1 for 1% SSA replacement of Portland cement clinker. Lower early age strengths are typical for pozzolanic materials, though an average compressive strengths of 92% of the control at 90 days [52, 53, 55 and 137], suggests a positive strength contribution from SSA in the long term. It has also been shown that SSA can be used at lower contents and achieve strength comparable to the control using a variety of mix design adjustments, including increasing the cement content [15], using superplasticizer to lower w/c ratio of the mix [4, 13 and 43], nano-materials additions [40] and increasing the fineness of SSA [21 and 81].







Reported tensile and flexural strength data emulate the compressive strength results [5, 22, 37, 46,

62, 78, 81, 137, 146 and 147], with reduction evident as SSA content is increased, though this

 became proportionally less with age. Importantly, the data also suggests that the relationship established between flexural and compressive strength in Eurocode 2 (EN 1992-1-1, 2004) is equally valid for concrete mixes containing SSA.

 Limited research has been undertaken on the effect of SSA on deformation properties of concrete such as modulus of elasticity [11] and shrinkage [27, 62, 86 and 148], which indicates that the development of the material use is still at an early stage. Elastic modulus results were found to be somewhat inconsistent [11], however, previous strength data suggests that reductions in the modulus of elasticity may occur with SSA. Marginal reduction in drying shrinkage is evident in SSA mixes [27, 62, 86 and 148], though at SSA contents less than 20%, the overall effects appear to be negligible.

 The effect of SSA on permeation properties of mortar/concrete, is reported as resulting in a decrease in absorptivity [53, 36, 138 and 27] and permeability [138], which is somewhat surprising and is at odds with the reported increase in porosity [137, 36 and 62]. One option to ease possible durability concerns due to higher porosity would be to use a composite cement in conjunction with SSA, using materials such as fly ash, metakaolin and silica fume to plug pore spaces.

 Corrosion resistance has been found to improve for SSA contents up to 20%, though for higher contents up to 60%, resistance lower than the control have been reported [137]. It would appear that two opposing factors are at play: the positive effect of chemically binding of chlorides due to the aluminium content of SSA is the overriding influence at low content, whilst, at high SSA content, the continued weakening of the pore structure from increased porosity and reduced hydration leads to net negative effects on durability. As such, at recommended lower contents of SSA, the impacts on corrosion resistance should be positive. Increased carbonation rates have also been reported [137], which is to be expected for all mixes incorporating pozzolanic materials as cement component.



- were very small (maximum of 0.008) and the compressive strength standard deviations for the
- 20% SSA blocks were below the control blocks (7% compared to 10% for the control blocks) [31].
- 415 As a cement replacement at contents up to 20%, changes in the density and compressive
- strength relative to the control mixes were very manageable (up to 4% and 6% reductions
- respectively), whilst SSA merely caused marginal differences in the water absorption and
- thermal properties. As an addition by weight of cement at contents up to 10%, no substantial
- change in strength has been reported, whilst somewhat surprisingly, reduction in the water
- absorption and capillary water absorption occurred [53].

#### **4.5 Lightweight Aggregate Concrete**

 The relationship between density and strength [26, 47 and 48] of concrete made with coarse SSA lightweight aggregate (except one where both coarse and fine were SSA lightweight aggregate) is shown in Figure 8, together with results of the corresponding reference mixes made with commercially available Leca (lightweight expanded clay aggregate).



The SSA lightweight aggregate concrete mixes achieved strength (28 days) suitable for structural

application, reaching up to 30 MPa. Strength greater than the Leca aggregates mixtures have been

reached, though SSA mixes generally had higher densities, but most remained within the

433 lightweight concrete guidelines i.e. less than 1850 kg/m<sup>3</sup>.

 As shown [47], the separation of SSA aggregates based on weight, i.e. specific gravities of 0.8 - 1.1 and 1.1 - 1.4, can be an effective method of improving the lightweight properties of concrete, without compromising strength. The research shows that a great deal of flexibility can be achieved in the use of SSA lightweight aggregates, in terms of desirable strength and lightweight properties with adjustments of the sintering process, mix design (fine:coarse aggregate ratio) and the use of additional materials such as clay in the aggregate manufacturing process [150].

 Absorption values of approximately 10%, which is typical for lightweight aggregate concrete, have been reported for SSA mixes [26 and 48]. The pelletizing process also produced more rounded and smoother SSA aggregates which in fact led to workability improvement [48 and 151] rather than the reduction that has previously been reported in other concrete applications. Thermal conductivity ranging from 0.27 - 0.49 W/m°C [26 and 48] has been reported for lightweight concrete panels containing SSA. This property improved as density decreased and it would appear that the material 446 can be used to meet the lightweight aggregate concrete requirement of 0.43 W/m°C specified in ASTM C332-87.

#### **4.6 Aerated Concrete**

 SSA appears suited for use in aerated concrete, as its high aluminium content and porous nature can contribute to delivering the desired lightweight and thermal properties. Although of filler fineness, the material has been used as replacement of cement [25, 38, 98 and 152] and PFA [153] to enhance the lightweight characteristics and thermal properties, rather than for its potential pozzolanic activity.

 A group of the same authors [25, 38, 98 and 152] have used SSA in bulk quantities (up to 80% by weight of cement) in "lightweight foamed materials" mixes. The process of casting the cubes, de-

456 moulding, curing and cutting away any excess bulging, is symptomatic of aerated concrete 457 production rather than foamed concrete, which typically involves the addition of premade foam to a 458 base mix.

 Compressive strength results (28 day) are presented in Figure 9 [25, 38, 98 and 152] for mixes with SSA contents from 60 - 80%, aluminium powder dosages from 0.1 - 0.3% and water/solids (w/s) ratios from 0.5 - 0.8, where solids represents the sum of cement and SSA. It appears that SSA content had the greatest impact on strength, though the effect of both SSA and aluminium powder is more pronounced at lower w/s ratios. It is encouraging that mixes with high SSA contents can 464 comfortably satisfy the minimum strength limit of 1.5 N/mm<sup>2</sup> of EN 771-4 (2011) for autoclaved aerated concrete masonry units.

466 Increasing the SSA and aluminium powder contents both led to higher porosity which improved the 467 thermal and lightweight properties of the products. Specific gravity from  $0.6 - 1.0$  and thermal 468 conductivity from 0.09 – 0.24 W/mK have also been achieved. The net density of autoclaved aerated 469 concrete is usually between 300 and 1000 kg/m<sup>3</sup>, according to EN 771-4, whilst thermal conductivity





471 Figure 9: Compressive strength behaviours of SSA aerated concrete mixes

 requirements of 0.12 - 0.15 W/mK have been reported in Taiwanese Standards [133], both of which are achievable with SSA mixtures.

- Interestingly, case studies have been carried out by aerated concrete producers using SSA as a
- substitute for PFA and as reported in section 5. Case Studies, blocks that were fit for use have been
- produced, though higher water contents were required in the production process [153].

#### **4.7 Foamed Concrete**

- Foamed concrete is produced with the addition of pre-formed foam into a base mix of sand, cement
- and water. The mixtures have high flowability, self compacting, self curing, lightweight, low strength
- properties and have recently grown in popularity as fill material. SSA appears to be a suitable
- candidate for use, though this has not yet been explored to a great extent.
- Based on the limited available data, the effects of SSA at 50% and 100% of the fine aggregate in foamed concrete mixes [13] are shown in Figure 10. The use of SSA led to improvement in strength (up to 70% increase) due to the filling effect from higher fines content, despite the increase in permeability of the resulting mixes. The thermal properties improved (lower thermal conductivity) due to the porous nature of SSA. Required flowability and self-compacting characteristics were maintained, despite some reductions in workability that have been reported.





Figure 10: Effects of SSA as fine aggregate on foamed concrete properties [13]

#### **4.8 Controlled Low Strength Materials (CLSM)**

Controlled low strength materials (CLSM) are also becoming more prevalently used as backfill

material. Low strength is required to facilitate future excavations, along with flowable consistence,

- self compacting and self curing properties. The American Concrete Institute guidance report (ACI
- 229R-5) recognises Portland cement and fly ash (as filler) as the conventional materials used
- alongside coarse and fine aggregate. Suitable nonstandard materials are permitted, though SSA is

not mentioned in name, as research on the material is only at the early stages.

Some initial work has been carried out [154-156] using SSA as filler material, with cement contents

498 from both ends of the spectrum expected for CLSMs (20 kg/m<sup>3</sup> – 120 kg/m<sup>3</sup>). Crushed stone powder

(CSP) has also been used in place of sand in a number of mixes [154-156].

 To achieve the target flowability, SSA mixes required higher water contents compared to the control fly ash mixes, which is expected given the benefits of the ball bearing effect of fly ash on workability. The bleeding rate also increased in the SSA mixes, though this can be partly offset with the use of CSP in place of sand and by decreasing the filler/aggregate ratio.

 Compressive strength results at 28 days from the three studies are presented in Figure 11. According to ACI 229R (1999), strengths less than 2.1 MPa and 0.3 MPa are desired to allow for machine and manual excavation, respectively. At low and moderate cement contents, SSA mixes with and without CSP, appear suitable for manual excavation applications, with strength comparable to the control fly ash mix. The strength reduction relative to the control fly ash mix, becomes more significant at high cement contents, though in areas lacking available fly ash, SSA can perhaps serve as a workable alternative, that is comparable to well compacted soil, in machine excavation applications.





512 Figure 11: Compressive strength performance of CLSMs containing SSA as filler material

### 513 **5. Case Studies**

514 The practical applications of SSA appears to be still very much in its early stages, though perhaps

515 private organisations undertaking work of this nature are reluctant to release the information

516 publically. However, the limited reported case studies are judged to be encouraging for developing

517 the use of SSA in concrete and concrete related products and are briefly described in Table 3.

#### 518 Table 3: Case studies on the use of SSA in concrete related applications



519 Indeed, the reported findings are, for the most part positive, though there have been some issues

520 that can be expected when experimenting with a new product. In concrete mixes, performance

521 similar to the control have been achieved with SSA, both as fine aggregate and in ground form as cement component, through modification of the mix designs, including superplasticizer addition with a lower w/c ratio or increased cement contents. Encouraging performance has also been achieved with SSA in the manufacture of normal weight concrete blocks, CLSM and aerated concrete, though the latter application highlighted the changes in the water demands when using SSA as a replacement of fly ash.

#### **6. Further Research Opportunities to Enhance SSA Use**

 Suggestions are offered, identifying areas where the further research could benefit the potential use of SSA, including both ideas for new innovative applications and highlighting gaps in the current literature.

 (i) **High performance concrete:** Though SSA in ground form may not be able to compete with fly ash or ground granulated blast-furnace slag as bulk replacement material for Portland clinker cement, it could add value when used in conjunction with ultrafine materials such as silica fume or metakaolin in high performance concrete. Of the two, silica fume seems most viable as (a) it is much finer and small proportion of SSA is unlikely to dilute the strength development, (b) a heavy dose of superplasticizer is required in concrete with silica fume anyway, therefore minor negative effects associated with SSA water demand will not be significant, (c) silica fume is chemically more compatible with SSA since it has virtually no alumina of its own and SSA 539 contains approximately 14%  $Al_2O_3$ , (d) the reduced cost SSA in comparison to silica fume makes the SSA/silica fume option economically attractive.

 (ii) **Concrete produced from composite cement:** Although some research has been carried out on use of SSA in combination with fly ash, this area can be strengthened to develop practical blends with fly ash and GGBS, with the aim to optimize engineering performance of concrete, whilst maximising the use sustainable materials.

- (iii) **Foamed concrete, aerated concrete and CLSM:** SSA has shown an initial promise for use in
- these three related lightweight, low strength applications and further research could benefit the
- development of the material application in these areas.
- (iv) **Concrete/mortar properties:** There is limited information available on the effect of SSA on the durability and load-dependent and load-independent deformation performance in mortar and concrete mixes and further work in these areas could improve the prospects for the material

use.

 (v) **Case studies:** An increase in the number of case studies available would assist in promoting confidence and familiarity with SSA and greatly benefit its practical application.

#### **7. Conclusions**

 An extensive systematic analysis and evaluation of published literature on the application of SSA in concrete and concrete related products revealed that the material has considerable potential for use in several different forms: as raw feed in cement clinker and lightweight aggregate production, fine aggregate, filler aggregate and in ground form as cement component. The implied suggestion of this is that realisation of these outlets should lead to the consumption of SSA produced worldwide. The specific conclusions are presented as follows:

 i. SSA has a porous microstructure with a density comparable to light sand and consists of irregularly shaped particles that predominantly fall in the silt and fine sand size fractions, suggesting suitability as fine aggregate or filler aggregate in concrete. In ground form, the material's oxide composition and amorphous content indicates potential suitability for use as a cementitous material. Due to the very nature of SSA, toxic elements are present in trace amounts, though the contents are generally below target limits for construction materials.

 ii. As raw feed in cement clinker production, SSA can be used at low contents and achieve performance comparable to control Portland cement clinker blends. At marginally higher contents, treatment of the material to extract phosphorus appears to be a reasonable option that removes inhibiting effects on strength and setting behaviour. Furthermore, the phosphorus removed can also serve as a valuable resource for agricultural purposes.

 iii. As fine aggregate and filler aggregate components in mortar and concrete, the effects on strength performance appear to be manageable at low SSA content up to 15% and through revision of the mix design to accommodate the characteristics of the material, perhaps including water reducing admixtures, satisfactory workability can also be achieved.

 iv. As a cementitious component, SSA satisfies the standard pozzolanic activity measures in the majority of cases and in this regard is comparable to fly ash. In mortar and concrete mixes, using SSA as a direct cement replacement results in lower strength and workability, though at low contents, performance on par with the control can be achieved by adjusting the cement content or using superplasticizer to lower the w/c ratio of the mix. Nano-materials addition and increasing fineness can also further enhance strength. Regarding durability, the impacts on corrosion resistance at low SSA content appears to be positive, the carbonation rate increases as is expected for all mixes using pozzolanic materials and no significant expansion occurs during sulphate resistance testing.

 v. The porous nature of SSA makes the material a good prospect for use in a range of lightweight applications, both in as-produced and ground form. A great deal of flexibility can be achieved in the performance of concrete made with manufactured SSA lightweight aggregate through adjustments of the sintering process and mix designs, with strengths suitable for structural applications attainable, along with lightweight properties comparable to commercially available Leca mixes. SSA can be used in bulk quantities in CLSM, as well as

- in aerated and foamed concrete and can satisfy the low strength, workability, lightweight
- properties and thermal requirements of the respective products.
- vi. Limited case studies reported in the literature indicate promising performances using SSA in
- the production of concrete, normal weight and aerated blocks and controlled low strength
- materials, though the development of the practical application of the material can only be
- considered at present at the initial stages.

#### **References**

- [1] Eurostat (2015) *Eurostat Database: Sewage sludge production and disposal from urban*
- *wastewater.* Available from
- [http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/tgm/table.do?tab=table&init=1&language=en&pcode=ten00030&plug](http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/tgm/table.do?tab=table&init=1&language=en&pcode=ten00030&plugin=1)
- 601 [in=1](http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/tgm/table.do?tab=table&init=1&language=en&pcode=ten00030&plugin=1) [Accessed  $20<sup>th</sup>$  April 2015]
- [2] Al-Sharif M and Attom M F. (2014) A geoenvironmental application of burned wastewater sludge ash in soil stabilization, *Environmental Earth Sciences, 71, 2453-2463.*
- [3] Bapat J D (2013) *Mineral Admixtures in Cement and Concrete*. Boca Raton: CRC Press.
- [4] Coutand M, Cyr M and Clastres P. (2006) Use of sewage sludge ash as mineral admixture in mortars, *Construction Materials*, 159, Issue CM4, 153-162.
- [5] Cyr M, Coutand M and Clastres P. (2007) Technological and environmental behaviour of sewage sludge ash (SSA) in cement based materials, *Cement and Concrete Research*, 37, 1278-1289.
- [6] Dayalan J and Beulah M. (2014) Glazed sludge tile, *Journal of Engineering Research and Applications*, 4(3), 201-204.
- [7] De Lima J F, Ingunza D and Del Pilar M. (2015) Effects of sewage sludge ash addition in Portland
- cement concretes, *International conference on civil, materials and environmental sciences* (CMES 613 2015), London 13-14<sup>th</sup> March, Atlantis Press, 189-191.
- [8] Donatello S, Tyrer M and Cheeseman C R. (2010) Comparison of test methods to assess pozzolanic activity, *Cement & Concrete Composites*, 32, 121-127.
- [9] Donatello S, Freeman-Pask A and Cheeseman C R. (2010) Effect of milling and acid washing on
- the pozzolanic activity of incinerator sewage sludge ash, *Cement and Concrete Composites*, 32, 54- 61.
- [10] Forth J P, Zoorob S E and Thanaya I N A (2006) Development of bitumen-bound waste aggregate building blocks, *Proceedings of the Institution of Civil Engineers: Construction Materials,* 159, 23-32.
- [11] Geyer A L B, Molin D D and Consoli N C. (2002) Study of use of sewage sludge ash as addition in
- concrete, *High Performance Concrete and Performance and Quality of Concrete Structures:*
- *Proceedings of Third International Conference*, 111-124, CANMET/American Concrete Institute.
- [12] Halliday J E. (2008) Properties of sewage sludge ash and its potential use in concrete. *In:* R Dhir ed. *Role for Concrete in Global Development*, IHS BRE Press, 235-244.
- [13] Halliday J E, Dyer T D, Jones M R and Dhir R K. (2012) Potential use of UK sewage sludge ash in cement-based concrete, *Waste and Resource Management Proceedings of the Institute of Civil Engineers,* 165, 57-66.
- [14] Jamshidi M, Jamshidi A, Mehrdadi N and Pacheco-Torgal F. (2012) Mechanical performance and capillary water absorption of sewage sludge ash concrete (SSAC), *International Journal of Sustainable Engineering,* 5(3), 228-234.
- [15] Kjersgaard D. (2007) The reuse of bio ash for the production of concrete. A Danish case study, *IWA Specialist Conference on Wastewater Biosolids,* 24-27 June, Moncton, New Brunswick, Canada.
- [16] Kjersgaard D, Pade C, Jakobsen U H. (2007) Bio ashes from Lynetten and Avedore waste water treatment plants: Documentation of ash properties, *IWA Specialist Conference on Wastewater Biosolids,* 24-27 June, Moncton, New Brunswick, Canada.
- [17] Koisor-Kazberuk M. (2011) Application of SSA as partial replacement of aggregate in concrete, *Polish Journal of Environmental Studies*, 20(2), 365-370.
- [18] Lin K L, Lan J Y, Luo K W, Chang J C and Sie J P. (2014) Effects of Sintering Temperature on Water Retention Characteristics of Sewage Sludge Ash- Diatomite Based Porous Ceramics, *4th International Conference on Future Environment and Energy V61*, Singapore 2014, LACSIT Press.
- 
- [19] Luo H L, Chang W C and Lin D F. (2009) The effects of different types of nano-silicon dioxide additives on the properties of sludge ash mortar, *Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association,* 59(4), 440-446.
- [20] Merino I, Arévalo L F and Romero F. (2007) Preparation and characterization of ceramic
- products by thermal treatment of sewage sludge ashes mixed with different additives, *Waste Management*, 27, 1829-1844.
- [21] Pan S C, Tseng D H, Lee C C and Lee C. (2003) Influence of fineness of sewage sludge ash on the mortar properties, *Cement and Concrete Research*, 33, 1749-1754.
- [22] Pinarli V and Kaymal G. (1994) An innovative sludge disposal option-reuse of sludge ash by incorporation in construction materials, *Environmental Technology*, 15(9), 843-852.
- [23] Tenza-Abril A J, Saval J M and Cuenca A. (2014) Using sewage sludge ash as filler in bituminous mixes, *Journal of Materials in Civil Engineering,* 04014141-1-9.
- [24] Tseng D H and Pan S C. (2000) Enhancement of pozzolanic activity and morphology of sewage sludge ash by calcinations, *Journal of the Chinese Institute of Environmental Engineering,* 10(4), 261- 270.
- [25] Wang K S, Tseng C J, Chiou I J and Shih M H. (2005) The thermal conductivity mechanism of sewage sludge ash lightweight materials, *Cement and Concrete Research*, 35, 803-809.
- [26] Yip W K and Tay J H. (1990) Aggregate made from incinerated sludge residue, *Journal of Materials in Civil Engineering*, 2(2), 84-93.
- [27] Tay J H. (1987) Sludge ash as filler for Portland cement concrete, *Journal of Environmental Engineering*, 113(2), 345-351.
- [28] Tay J H and Show K Y. (1992) Utilization of municipal wastewater sludge as building and construction materials, *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 6, 191-204.
- [29] Donatello S, Tong D and Cheeseman C R. (2010) Production of technical grade phosphoric acid from incinerator sewage sludge ash (ISSA), *Waste Management*, 30, 1634-1642.
- [30] Ottosen L M, Jensen P E and Kirkelund M (2014) Electrodialytic separation of phosphorus and heavy metals from two types of sewage sludge ash, *Separation Science and Technology,* 49(12), 1910-1920.
- [31] Perez Carrion M, Baeza-Brotons F, Paya J, Saval J M, Zornoza E, Borrachero M V and Garces P. (2013) Potential use of sewage sludge ash (SSA) as a cement replacement in precast concrete blocks, *Materials de Construccion,* 64, 313.
- [32] Anderson M and Skerratt R G. (2003) Variability study of incinerated sewage sludge ash in relation to future use in ceramic brick manufacture, *British Ceramic Transactions*, 102(3), 109-113.
- [33] Environmental & Water Technology Centre of Innovation, Ngee Ann Polytechnic, (2012) *Direct use of sewage sludge ash in paving materials*. Singapore: ECO Industrial Environmental Engineering Pte Ltd.
- [34] Franz M. (2008) Phosphate fertilizer from sewage sludge ash (SSA), *Waste Management*, 28, 1809-1818.
- [35] Khanbilvardi R and Afshari-Tork S. (1995) Sludge ash as fine aggregate for concrete mix, *Journal of Environmental Engineering*, 121(9), 633-638.
- [36] Fontes C M A, Barbosa M C, Filho R D and Gonçalves J P. (2004) Potentiality of sewage sludge ash as mineral additive in cement mortar and high performance concrete, *Proceedings of the International RILEM Conference on the Use of Recycled Materials in Buildings and Structures* 8-11
- November 2004, 797-806, RILEM Publications.
- [37] Monzo J, Payá J, Borrachero M V and Córcoles A. (1996) Use of sewage sludge ash (SSA) Cement admixtures in mortars, *Cement and Concrete Research*, 26(9), 1389-1398.
- [38] Wang K S, Chiou I J, Chen C H and Wang D. (2005) Lightweight properties and pore structure of foamed material made from sewage sludge ash, *Construction and Building Materials*, 19, 627-633.
- [39] Chindaprasirt P, Jaturapitakkul C and Sinsiri T. (2005) Effect of fly fineness on compressive strength and pore size of blended cement paste. *Cement & Concrete Composites,* 27, 425-428.
- 692 [40] Lin D F, Lin K L, Luo H L and Cai M Q. (2008) Improvements of nano-SiO<sub>2</sub> on sludge/fly ash mortar, *Waste Management,* 28, 1081-1087.
- [41] Neville A M. (1995) *Properties of Concrete.* Fourth Edition. London: Longman.
- [42] Chiou I J, Wang K S, Chen C H and Lin Y T. (2006) Lightweight aggregate made from sewage sludge and incinerated ash, *Waste Management*, 26, 1453-1461.
- [43] Dhir R K, Dyer T D, Halliday J E and Paine K A. (2002) *Value added recycling of incinerator ashes*. UK: Concrete Technology Unit (No. 39/3/476 CC 1683).
- [44] Elouear Z, Bouzid J and Boujelben N. (2010) Removal of nickel and cadmium from aqueous solutions by sewage sludge ash: study in single and binary systems, *10 th World Wide Workshop for*  701 Young Environmental Scientists, Arcueil, France, 31<sup>st</sup> May – 4<sup>th</sup> June.
- [45] Morais L C, Dweck J, Goncalves E M and Buchler P M. (2005) An experimental study of sewage sludge incineration, *Environmental Technology,* 27(9), 1047-1051.
- [46] Paya J, Monzó J, Borrachero M V, Amahjour F, Girbés, Velázquez S and Ordóňez L M. (2002)
- Advantages in the use of fly ashes in cements containing pozzolanic combustion residues: silica fume, sewage sludge ash, spend fluidized bed catalyst and rice husk ash, *Journal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology*, 77, 331-335.
- 708 [47] Bhatty J I and Reid K J. (1989) Moderate strength concrete from lightweight sludge ash aggregates, *The International Journal of Cement Composites and Lightweight Concrete*, 11(3), 179- 187.
- [48] Tay J H and Yip W K. (1989) Sludge ash as lightweight concrete material, *Journal of*
- *Environmental Engineering*, 115(1), 56-64.
- [49] Adam C, Peplinski B, Michaelis M, Kley G and Simon F G. (2009) Thermochemical treatment of sewage sludge ashes for phosphorus recovery, *Waste Management*, 29, 1122-1128.
- [50] Al Sayed M H, Madany I M and Buali A R M. (1995) Use of sewage sludge ash in asphaltic paving mixes in hot regions, *Construction and Building Materials*, 9(1), 19-23.
- [51] Anderson M, Elliott M and Hickson C. (2002) Factory-scale proving trials using combined
- mixtures of three by-product wastes (including incinerated sewage sludge ash) in clay building
- bricks, *Journal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology*, 77, 345-351.
- [52] Baeza F, Paya J, Galao O, Saval J M and Garces P. (2014) Blending of industrial waste from
- different sources as partial substitution of Portland cement in pastes and mortars, *Construction and Building Materials,* 66, 645-653.
- [53] Baeza-Brotons F, Garces P, Paya J and Saval J M. (2014) Portland cement systems with addition
- of sewage sludge ash.Application in concretes for the manufacture of blocks, *Journal of Cleaner Production,* 82, 112-124.
- [54] Bhatty J I and Reid K J (1989) Lightweight aggregates from incinerated sludge ash. *Waste Management & Research,* 7, 363-376.
- [55] Chang F C, Lin J D, Tsai C C and Wang K S. (2010) Study on cement mortar and concrete made with sewage sludge ash, *Water Science and Technology*, 62(7), 1689-1693.
- [56] CIRIA (2004) *Use of sewage sludge in construction*. London: Ciria C608.
- [57] Damtoft J S, Glavind M and Munch-Petersen C. (2001) Danish Centre for Green Concrete.
- *Proceedings of CANMET/ACI International Conference,* San Fransisco, September 2001.
- [58] Donatello S, Tyrer M and Cheeseman C R. (2010) EU landfill waste acceptance criteria and EU
- hazardous waste directive compliance testing of incinerated sewage sludge ash, *Waste*
- *Management*, 30, 63-71.
- [59] Dyer T D, Halliday J E and Dhir R K. (2011) Hydration chemistry of sewage sludge ash used as a cement component, *Journal of Materials in Civil Engineering*, 23, 648-655.
- [60] Endo H, Nagayoshi Y and Suzuki K. (1997) Production of glass ceramics from sewage sludge. *Water Science & Technology,* 36(11), 235-241.
- [61] EU Life (2007) *Project BioCrete – Chemical Composition of European bio ashes*. EU Life Project. Available from<http://www.biocrete.dk/english/20186> [Accessed 5th May 2015].
- [62] Garcés P, Carrión M P, Alcocel E G, Payá J, Monzo J and Borrachero M V. (2008) Mechanical and physical properties of cement blended with sewage sludge ash, *Waste Management,* 28, 2495-2502.
- [63] Hong K J, Tarutani N, Shinya Y and Kajiuchi T. (2005) Study on the recovery of phosphorus from waste-activated sludge incinerator ash, *Journal of Environmental Science and Health*, 40, 617-631.
- [64] Hu S H and Hu S C. (2014) Application of magnetically modified sewage sludge ash (SSA) in ionic dye adsorption, *Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association,* 64(2), 141-149.
- [65] Hu S H, Hu S C and Fu Y P. (2012) Recycling technology Artificial lightweight aggregates
- synthesized from sewage sludge and its ash at lowered comelting temperature, *Environmental Progress & Sustainable Energy*, 32(3), 740-748.
- 
- [66] Hu S H, Hu S C and Fu Y P. (2012) Resource recycling through artificial lightweight aggregates
- from sewage sludge and derived ash using boric acid flux to lower co-melting temperature, *Journal of the Air and Waste Management Association*, 62(2), 262-269.
- [67] Kikuchi R. (2001) Recycling of municipal solid waste for cement production: pilot-scale test for transforming incineration ash of solid waste into cement clinker, *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 31, 137-147.
- [68] Kozai N, Suzuki S, Aoyagi N, Sakamoto F and Ohnuki T. (2015) Radioactive fallout cesium in sewage sludge ash produced after the Fukushima Daiichi nuclear accident, *Water Research,* 68, 616- 626.
- [69] Lam C H K, Barford J P and Mckay G. (2010) Utilization of incineration waste ash residues in Portland cement clinker, *Chemical Engineering Transactions*, 21, 757-762.
- [70] Li R, Zhao W, Li Y, Wang W and Zhu X. (2015) Heavy metal removal and speciation
- transformation through the calcinations treatment of phosphorus-enriched sewage sludge ash, *Journal of Hazardous Materials,* 283, 423-431.
- [71] Lin K L and Lin C Y. (2004) Hydration properties of eco-cement pastes from waste sludge ash clinkers. *Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association*, 54(12), 1534-1542.
- [72] Lin K L and Lin C Y. (2005) Hydration characteristics of waste sludge ash utilized as raw cement material, *Cement and Concrete Research* 35, 1999-2007.
- [73] Lin K L, Chiang K Y and Lin C Y. (2005) Hydration characteristics of waste sludge ash that is reused in eco-cement clinker*, Cement and Concrete Research*, 35, 1074-1081.
- [74] Lin K L, Chiang K Y and Lin D F. (2006) Effect of heating temperature on the sintering
- characteristics of sewage sludge ash, *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, B128, 175-181.
- [75] Lin D F, Lin K L and Luo H L. (2007) A comparison between sludge ash and fly ash on the improvement in soft soil. *Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association,* 57(1), 59-64.
- [76] Lin K L, Huang W J, Chen K C, Chow J D and Chen H J. (2009) Behaviour of heavy metals

- [77] Lin K L, Lin D F and Luo H L. (2014) Sewage sludge ash on pozzolanic reaction of co-melted slag
- blended cement. Available from [http://www.researchgate.net/profile/Kae-](http://www.researchgate.net/profile/Kae-Long_Lin/publication/228539727_Sewage_Sludge_Ash_on_Pozzolanic_Reaction_of_Co-melted_Slag_Blended_Cement/links/02e7e5264da1889566000000.pdf)
- [Long\\_Lin/publication/228539727\\_Sewage\\_Sludge\\_Ash\\_on\\_Pozzolanic\\_Reaction\\_of\\_Co-](http://www.researchgate.net/profile/Kae-Long_Lin/publication/228539727_Sewage_Sludge_Ash_on_Pozzolanic_Reaction_of_Co-melted_Slag_Blended_Cement/links/02e7e5264da1889566000000.pdf)
- 781 melted Slag Blended Cement/links/02e7e5264da1889566000000.pdf [Accessed 10th May 2015].
- [78] Maozhe C, Denise B, Mathieu G, Jacques M and Rémy G. (2013) Environmental and technical assessments of the potential utilization of sewage sludge ashes (SSAs) as secondary raw materials in construction, *Waste Management*, 33, 1268-1275.
- [79] Mahieux P Y, Aubert J E, Cyr M, Coutand M and Husson B. (2010) Quantitative mineralogical composition of complex mineral wastes – Contribution of the Rietveld method, *Waste Management*, 30, 378-388.
- [80] Merino I, Arévalo L F and Romero F. (2005) Characterization and possible uses of ashes form wastewater treatment plants, *Waste Management*, 25, 1046-1054.
- [81] Monzo J, Paya J, Borrachero M V, Bellver A and Peris-Mora E. (1997) Study of cement-based mortars containing Spanish ground sewage sludge ash. In Goumans et al. (eds.) *Waste Materials in Construction: Putting Theory into Practice,* 349-354, Elsevier.
- [82] Morais L C, Dweck J, Campos V and Buchler P M. (2009) Characterization of sewage sludge ashes to be used as a ceramic raw material, *Chemical Engineering Transactions*, 17, 1813-1818.
- [83] Ohbuchi A, Sakamoto J, Kitano M and Nakamura T. (2008) X-ray fluorescence analysis of sludge ash from sewage disposal plant, *X-Ray Spectrometry*, 37, 544-550.
- [84] Rapf M, Raupenstrauch H, Cimatoribus C and Kranert M. (2012) *A new thermo-chemical*
- *approach for the recovery of phosphorus from sewage sludge*. European Commission CORDIS Project. Available from
- http://www.vivis.de/phocadownload/2012\_wm/2012\_WM\_691\_698\_Rapf.pdf [Accessed 10 May 2015]
- [85] Saikia N, Kato S and Kojima T. (2006) Compositions and leaching behaviours of combustion residues, *Fuel*, 85, 264-271.
- [86] Sasaoka N, Yokoi K and Yamanaka T. (2006) Basic study of concrete made using ash derived from the incinerating sewage sludge, *International Journal of Modern Physics B*, 20(25-27), 3716- 3721.
- [87] Schaum C, Cornel P and Jardin N. (2011) Phosphorus recovery from sewage sludge ash a wet
- chemical approach, Technische Universität Darmstadt, Germany. Available from
- <http://www.bvsde.paho.org/bvsaar/cdlodos/pdf/phosphorusrecovery583.pdf> [Accessed 17 May
- 2013].
- [88] Stark K, Plaza E and Hultman B. (2006) Phosphorus release from ash, dried sludge and sludge
- residue from supercritical water oxidation by acid or base, *Chemosphere*, 62, 827-832.

 immobilized by co-melting treatment of sewage sludge ash and municipal solid waste incinerator fly ash, *Waste Management & Research,* 27, 660-667.

- [89] Suzuki S and Tanaka M. (1997) Glass-ceramic from sewage sludge ash, *Journal of Material Sciences*, 32, 1775-1779.
- [90] Takahashi H, Asada S, Takahashi S, Ishida S, Takeuchi N and Wakamatu M. (1997) Formation

 mechanism of black core in sintered red brick using incinerated ash of sewage sludge. *Journal of the Society of Material Science Japan,* 46(7), 834-838.

- [91] Takahashi M, Kato S, Shima H, Sarai E, Ichioka T, Hatyakawa S and Miyajiri H. (2001) Technology for recovering phosphorus from incinerated wastewater treatment sludge, *Chemosphere,* 44, 23-29.
- [92] Takeuchi N, Takahashi H, Ishida S, Takahashi S and Wakamatsu M. (1999) Effect of firing
- atmosphere on extraordinary expansion of sintered brick from incinerated ash of sewage sludge, *Journal of the Ceramic Society of Japan,* 107(6), 551-554.
- [93] Takeuchi N, Okamoto Y and Kobayashi H. (2013) Fabrication of foamed porous ceramics from mixtures of fly ash and incinerated ash of sewage sludge. *Journal of the Society of Materials Science, Japan,* 62(6), 353-356.
- [94] Tantawy M A, El-Roudi A M, Abdalla E M and Abdelzaher M A (2012) Evaluation of the
- pozzolanic activity of sewage sludge ash, *ISRN chemical engineering,* 2012, 1-8.
- [95] Tantawy M A, El-Roudi A M, Abdalla E M and Abdelzaher M A (2013) Fire resistance of sewage sludge ash blended cement pastes, *Journal of Engineering Hindawi Publishing Corporation,* 2013, 1- 7.
- [96] Tay J H and Show K Y. (1994) Municipal wastewater sludge as cementitious and blended cement materials, *Cement & Concrete Composites,* 16, 39-48.
- 833 [97] Tsai C C, Wang K S and Chiou I J. (2006) Effect of  $SiO_2 Al_2O_3 flux$  ratio change on the bloating characteristics of lightweight aggregate material produced from recycled sewage sludge, *Journal of Hazardous Material,* B134, 87-93.
- 836 [98] Wang K S and Chiou I J. (2004) Foamed lightweight materials made from mixed scrap metal waste powder and sewage sludge ash, *Waste Management and Research*, 22, 383-389.
- [99] Wang L, Skjevrak G, Hustad J E and Grønli M G. (2012) Sintering characteristics of sewage sludge ashes at elevated temperatures, *Fuel Processing Technology*, 96, 88-97.
- 840 [100] Xu H, He P, Gu W, Wang G and Shao L. (2012) Recovery of phosphorus as struvite from sewage sludge ash, *Journal of Environmental Sciences*, 24(8), 1533-1538.
- 842 [101] Zhang Z, Li A, Yin Y And Zhao L. (2013) Effect of crystallization time on behaviours of glass-ceramic produced from sludge incineration ash, *Procedia Environmental Sciences*, 18, 788-793.
- [102] Zhang Z, Zhang L, Yin Y, Liang X and Li A. (2015) The recycling of incinerated sewage sludge ash as a raw material for CaO-Al2O3-SiO2-P2O5 glass ceramic production, *Environmental Technology,*  36(9), 1098-1103.
- [103] Kruger O, Grabner A and Adam C. (2014) Complete survey of German sewage sludge ash, *Environmental Science & Technology,* 48, 11811-11818.
- 849 [104] Lin K L and Lin C Y. (2006) Feasibility of using ash from sludge incineration as raw materials for eco-cement, *Journal of the Chinese Institute of Environmental Engineering,* 16(1), 39-46.
- [105] Anderson M. (2002) Encouraging prospects for recycling incinerated sewage sludge ash (ISSA)
- into clay-based building products (2002), *Journal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology*, 77,
- 352-360.
- [106] Atienza-Martinez M, Gea G, Arauzo J, Kersten S R A and Kootstra A M J. (2014) Phosphorus recovery from sewage sludge char ash, *Biomass and Bioenergy,* 65, 42-50.
- [107] Gil-Lalaguna N, Sanchez J L, Murillo M B and Gea G. (2015) Use of sewage sludge combustion ash and gasification ash for high-temperature desulphurization of different gas streams, *Fuel,* 141, 99-108.
- [108] Guedes P, Couto N, Ottosen L M and Ribeiro A B. (2014) Phosphorus recovery from sewage sludge ash through an electrodialytic process, *Waste Management,* 34, 886-892.
- [109] Lin K L. (2006) Mineralogy and microstructure of sintered sewage sludge ash as lightweight aggregates, *Journal of Industrial and Engineering Chemistry*, 12(3), 425-429.
- 863 [110] Lin K L, Chang W C, Lin D F, Luo H L and Tsai M C. (2008) Effects of nano-SiO<sub>2</sub> on sludge ash-cement mortar, *Journal of Environmental Management*, 88, 708-714.
- [111] Biswas B K, Inoue K, Harada H, Ohto K and Kawakita H. (2009) Leaching of phosphorus from incinerated sewage sludge ash by means of acid extraction followed by absorption on orange waste gel, *Journal of Environmental Sciences*, 21, 1753-1760.
- 868 [112] Cenni R, Janisch B, Spliethoff H and Hein K R G. (2001) Legislative and environmental issues on the use of ash from coal and municipal sewage sludge co-firing as construction material, *Waste Management*, 21, 17-31.
- [113] Ebbers B, Ottosen L M and Jensen P E (2015) Comparison of two different electrodialytic cells for separation of phosphorus and heavy metals from sewage sludge ash, *Chemosphere,* 125, 122- 129.
- [114] Fraissler G, Joller M, Mattenberger H, Brunner T and Obernberger I. (2009) Thermodynamic 875 equilibrium calculations concerning the removal of heavy metals from sewage sludge ash by
- chlorination, *Chemical Engineering and Processing*, 48, 152-164.
- 877 [115] Fraser J L and Lum K R. (1983) Availability of elements of environmental importance in incinerated sludge ash, *Environmental Science & Technology,* 17, 52-54.
- [116] Fytili D and Zabaniotou A. (2008) Utilization of sewage sludge in EU application of old and new methods – A review, *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 12, 116-140.
- 881 [117] Kakumazaki J, Kato T and Sugawara K. (2014) Recovery of gold from incinerated sewage sludge ash by chlorination, *ACS Sustainable Chemistry & Engineering,* 2, 2297-2300.
- [118] Lapa N, Barbosa R, Lopes M H, Mendes B, Abelha P, Gulyurtlu I and Oliveira J S. (2007)
- Chemical and ecotoxicological characterization of ashes obtained from sewage sludge combustion in a fluidised-bed reactor, *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 147, 175-183.
- 886 [119] Lin D F, Luo H L, Halao D H and Yang C C. (2005) The effects of sludge ash on the strength of soft subgrade soil, *Journal of the Chinese Institute of Environmental Engineering,* 15(1), 1-10.
- [120] Mattenberger H, Fraissler G, Brunner T, Herk P, Hermann L and Obernberger I. (2008) Sewage
- sludge ash to phosphorus fertiliser: Variables influencing heavy metal removal during
- thermochemical treatment, *Waste Management*, 28, 2709-2722.

 [121] Mattenberger H, Fraissler G, Jöller M, Brunner T, Obernberger I, Herk P and Hermann L. (2010) Sewage sludge ash to phosphorus fertiliser (II): Influences of ash and granulate type on heavy metal removal, *Waste Management*, 30, 1622-1633.

- [122] Nowak B, Perutka L, Aschenbrenner P, Kraus P, Rechberger H and Winter F. (2011) Limitations for heavy metal release during thermo-chemical treatment of sewage sludge ash, *Waste Management*, 31, 1285-1291.
- [123] Ottosen L M, Kirkelund G M and Jensen P E. (2013) Extracting phosphorus from incinerated sewage sludge ash rich in iron or aluminium, *Chemosphere*, 91, 963-969.
- [124] Paramasivam S, Sajwan K S and Alva A K. (2005) Incinerated sewage sludge products as amendments for agricultural soils: leaching and plant uptake of trace elements, *Water, Air and Pollution,* 171, 273-290.
- [125] Tateda M, Ike M and Fujita M. (1997) Loss of metallic elements associated with ash disposal and social impacts, *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 19, 93-108.
- 904 [126] Tay J H and Show K Y. (1997) Resource recovery of sludge as a building and construction material – A future trend in sludge management, *Water Science and Technology*, 36(11), 259-266.
- [127] Tempest B Q and Pando M A. (2013) Characterization and demonstration of reuse applications of sewage sludge ash, *International Journal of Geomatics and Geosciences*, 4(2), 552-559.
- [128] Vogel C, Exner R M and Adam C. (2013) Heavy Metal Removal from Sewage Sludge Ash by
- Thermochemical Treatment with Polyvinylchloride, *Environmental Science and Technology,* 47, 563- 567.
- [129] Vogel C, Adam C, Kappen P, Schiller T, Lipiec E and McNaughton D. (2014) Chemical state of chromium in sewage sludge ash based phosphorus fertilisers, *Chemosphere,* 103, 250-255.
- [130] Weigand H, Bertau M, Hübner W, Bohndick F and Bruckert A. (2013) RecoPhos: Full-scale fertilizer production from sewage sludge ash, *Waste Management*, 33, 540-544.
- [131] Zhang F S, Yamasaki S and Nanzyo M. (2002) Waste ashes for use in agricultural production: I.
- Liming effect, contents of plant nutrients and chemical characteristics of some metals, *The Science of the Total Environment*, 284, 215-225.
- [132] Zhang F S. Yamasaki S and Kimura K. (2002) Waste ashes for use in agricultural production: II. Contents of minor and trace elements, *The Science of the Total Environment*, 286, 111-118.
- [133] Lin K L, Lin D F and Luo H L. (2009) Influence of phosphate of the waste sludge on the hydration characteristics of eco-cement, *Journal of Hazardous Materials,* 168, 1105-1110.
- [134] Donatello S and Cheeseman C. (2013) Recycling and recovery routes for incinerated sewage sludge ash (ISSA): A review, *Waste Management*, 33(11), 2328-2340.
- [135] Environmental & Water Technology Centre of Innovation, Ngee Ann Polytechnic, (2008)
- *Feasibility Study on Recycling incinerated sewage sludge ash*. Singapore: ECO Industrial
- Environmental Engineering Pte Ltd.
- [136] Yusuf R O and Noor Z Z. (2012) Use of sewage sludge ash (SSA) in the production of cement and concrete – a review, I*nternational Journal Global Environmental Issues*, 12(2-4), 214-228.
- [137] Alococel E G, Garcés P, Martínez J J, Payá and Andión L G. (2006) Effect of sewage sludge ash (SSA) on the mechanical performance and corrosion levels of reinforced Portland cement mortars,
- *Construction Materials*, 56(282), 31-43.
- 932 [138] Pinarli V. (2000) Sustainable Waste Management Studies on the use of sewage sludge ash in construction industry as concrete material. *In*: R K Dhir, T D Dyer and K A Paine ed., *Sustainable construction: Use of incinerator ash*, Thomas Telford, 415-426.
- [139] Lin K L and Tsai M C. (2006) The effects of nanomaterials on microstructures of sludge ash cement paste, *Journal of the Air and Waste Management Association*, 56(8), 1146-1154.
- [140] Luo H L, Lin D F, Shieh S I and You Y F. (2014) Micro-observations of different types of nano-
- Al2O3 on the hydration of cement paste with sludge ash replacement. *Environmental Technology.* Available from<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2014.911362> [Accessed 10th May 2015].
- [141] Bhatty J I, Malisci A, Iwasaki I and Reid K J. (1992) Sludge ash pellets as coarse aggregate in concrete, *Journal of Cement, Concrete and Aggregates*, 14(1), 55-61.
- [142] Cheeseman C R and Virdi G S. (2005) Properties and microstructure of lightweight aggregate produced from sintered sewage sludge ash, *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 45, 18-30.
- [143] Federal Highway Administration. (1997) *User guidelines for waste and by-product materials in pavement construction*. USA: Federal Highway Administration (FHWA-RD-97-148).
- [144] Gunning P J, Antemir A, Hills C D and Carey P J. (2011) Secondary aggregate from waste treated with carbon dioxide, *Construction Materials Proceedings of the Institute of Civil Engineers,* 164, 231- 239.
- [145] Monzo J, Payá J, Borrachero M V and Girbés. (2003) Reuse of sewage sludge ashes (SSA) in cement mixtures: the effect of SSA on the workability of cement mortars, *Waste Management* 23, 373-381.
- [146] Monzo J, Payá J and Borrachero M V. (1999) Experimental basic aspects for reusing sewage sludge ash (SSA) in concrete production. In: R K Dhir and T G Jappy ed. *Exploiting Wastes in Concrete*, Thomas Telford, 47-56.
- [147] Monzo J, Payá J, Borrachero M V and Peris-Mora E. (1999) Mechanical behaviour of mortars containing sewage sludge ash (SSA) and Portland cements with different tricalcium aluminate content, *Cement and Concrete Research*, 29, 87-94.
- 958 [148] Cyr M, Idir R, Escadeillas G, Julien S and Menchon N. (2007) Stabilization of industrial by- products in mortars containing Metakaolin, *Ninth CANMET/American Concrete Institute Fly Ash Conference* 2007 Poland, 51-62, American Concrete Institute.
- [149] Khanbilvardi R and Afshari-Tork S. (2002) *Ash use from Suffolk County wastewater treatment plant sewer district No. 3 Phase 2*, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority.
- [150] Tay J H, Yip W K and Show K Y. (1991) Clay-blended sludge as lightweight aggregate concrete material, *Journal of Environmental Engineering,* 117(6), 834-844.
- [151] Wainwright P J and Cresswell D J F. (2001) Synthetic aggregates from combustion ashes using an innovative rotary kiln, *Waste Management*, 21, 241-246.
- [152] Chen C H, Chiou I J and Wang K S. (2006) Sintering effect on cement bonded sewage sludge ash, *Cement & Concrete Composites*, 28, 26-32.
- [153] Building Research Establishment (BRE). (2007) *Incinerated sewage sludge ash (ISSA) in autoclaved aerated concrete (AAC).* UK: Mineral Industry Research Organisation (WRT 177/WR0115).
- 971 [154] Fujita R, Horiguchi T, Kudo T and Shimura K. (2011) Applicability of CLSM with incinerated
- sewage sludge ash and crushed stone powder, *Second International Conference on Sustainable Construction Materials and Technologies,* 28-30 June, Ancona, Italy.
- [155] Horiguchi T, Fujita R and Shimura K. (2011) Applicability of controlled low-strength materials with incinerated sewage sludge ash and crushed stone powder, *Journal of Materials in Civil Engineering*, 23(6), 767-771.
- [156] Horiguchi T, Kikuchi T, Nakagawa Y and Shimura K. (2007) Physical properties of CLSM using
- high volumes of incineration ash from sewage sludge, *Ninth CANMET/ACI International Conference*
- *on Fly Ash, Silica Fume, Slag and Natural Pozzolans in Concrete* 20-25 May 2007 Warsaw, Poland.
- 351-360, American Concrete Institute.
- 

#### **Table captions**

- Table 1: SSA toxic and non-toxic element concentrations data from the literature
- Table 2: Selected results on the chemical composition of clinker blends produced with SSA
- Table 3: Case studies on the use of SSA in concrete related applications

#### **Figure captions**

- Figure 1: Particle size distributions of (a) as-produced SSA with overall sand limits in concrete (BS
- 988 882) and (b) ground SSA with PC and fly ash samples.
- Figure 2: Rate of publication of the oxide composition data on SSA
- 990 Figure 3: Ternary plot of  $SiO<sub>2</sub>$ , Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and CaO contents for SSA
- Figure 4: Strength activity index results as a measure of the pozzolanic activity of SSA
- Figure 5: Bulk density of manufactured SSA lightweight aggregate
- Figure 6: Effect of SSA as cement replacement on mortar workability
- Figure 7: Effect of SSA replacement level as a cement component on 28 day compressive strength
- Figure 8: Compressive strength (28 days) and density behaviour of concrete mixes containing
- lightweight SSA aggregate
- Figure 9: Compressive strength behaviours of SSA aerated concrete mixes
- Figure 10: Effects of SSA as fine aggregate on foamed concrete properties [13]
- Figure 11: Compressive strength performance of CLSMs containing SSA as filler material.