A COMMUNITY-BASED MODEL FOR HEALTH CARE SOCIAL WORK

by

ANNA-MARIE BEYTELL

THESIS

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

D.LITT. ET PHILL.

in

SOCIAL WORK

in the

FACULTY OF ARTS

at the

RAND AFRIKAANS UNIVERSITY

Promoter: Prof. J.B.S. Nel Consultant: Prof. A. Nolte July 2002

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express thanks and appreciation to the following people:

- The patients from the community health centres who participated in this research for their willingness, but also their friendliness, acceptance and expert input. Without you the research would not be successful;
- Prof. J.B.S. Nel, my promoter for the support, guidance and sharing of her expertise throughout these years;
- Prof. M.A. van Zyl, my co-promoter, for his contribution in the beginning of my studies. It was a pity you had to leave;
- Prof. A. Nolte, consultant form Nursing Department at RAU, a special thanks for sharing her expertise in research and theory generation and for the guidance she has provided;
- Dr. E. Gross, who acted as independent coder during data analysis for her warm and friendly assistance and sharing of expertise;
- Ms. L. Venter, RAU librarian for her guidance;
- Keagile Mangena, social worker, friend and colleague my interpreter who shared her expertise of different cultures, but also supported and assisted me during the research;
- Cheryl Warren, my best friend and colleague for many years for her support and humor during the studies but also her expertise, time and patience in editing this document;
- The following staff from the Gauteng Health Department:
- Drs. Bismillah, Mangera and the Gauteng Health Department for permission to conduct the research;
- Dr. A. Manning, CEO of Helen Joseph Hospital for his support, insightful perception and trust;
- The staff of the following community health centres where the research was done:
 - Ms. Mafora and her team at Itireleng at Dobsonville;
 - Ms. van der Schyff and her team at Discoverers in Roodepoort;
 - Ms. Ferley and her team at Lenasia South; and

• Ms. Khamanga and her team at Kliptown, Eldorado Park;

Thank you for acting as the panel of experts in evaluating the model and for contributions during the doctoral seminars, as well as for you support, friendliness and expertise during my visits at the community health centres;

- Patience Mbonane, physio-assistant at Lenasia South for her friendliness, assistance, support and for attending the doctoral seminars;
- Elsabé van Heerden and Anita Cherian, social workers and colleagues of Discoverers and Lenasia South who formed part of the research as experts in health care social work and as evaluators of the model, for their support and contribution;
- The health care social workers of Gauteng Health Department who contributed as experts during the Delphi technique and evaluation, as well as during the doctoral seminars: Beverley Kriel, Louise Winckler, Margorie Viljoen, Ria van Rensburg and Jenny Colley. I really want to thank you all, not only for participating in the research, but also for being colleagues who supported me throughout the years and on whom I can trust and rely;
- All my colleagues, the Allied Health Workers and Mr. Memee from Central Wits, for the contribution to the research with the Lickert scales, and also for your participation during the doctoral seminars;
- To Hanni du Plessis, my colleague and friend for your support, assistance and attendance during the doctoral seminars;
- The management of Helen Joseph hospital, Ms. Ramaboa, Jordan and Mr. van Wyk for their support and attendance of doctoral seminars;
- Ester Visagie, secretary of the CEO of Helen Joseph hospital and friend, for her support and advice with the typing of the document;
- Mr. Rudolf van der Berg of Information Technology at Helen Joseph hospital for support and advice;
- The Allied Health, especially physiotherapists, and other staff of Helen Joseph hospital for their support;
- The health care social workers of Gauteng Health Department who supported me and participated during the doctoral seminars;

• The staff from Gauteng Health Department (Head Office) for attending the doctoral seminars and giving input during the research;

• The following academic staff from universities:

- Prof. C. Fouché, Chairperson of the Social Work Department at RAU for her assistance and support during the research and for attending the doctoral seminars;
- Dr. E. Oliphant, of the Social Work Department at RAU for her assistance and input as expert in qualitative research;
- Prof. Mitchell, of the Social Work Department at RAU for attending the doctoral seminars;
- Prof. S. Drower, Chairperson of the Social Work Department at the University of the Witwatersrand, for her participation and guidance as part of the research, evaluation and doctoral seminars as expert in social work and health care social work;
- Dr. C. Carbonato, of the Social Work Department at the University of Pretora, for her participation and guidance as part of the research, evaluation and doctoral seminars as expert in social work and health care social work;
- My friends Rika and Mrs. Verster for their support;
- My mother, the most important person in my life, who encourages and supports me in everything I do and who has been my role model and friend for all these years; and
- To the Almighty God for the assurance: "I can do all things through Christ which strengths me" (Philippians 4:13)

ABSTRACT

Health and social issues have a reciprocal relation and this is evident in the South African context. Poverty that includes poor living conditions, unemployment and the consequent low income results in disease and malnutrition. A vicious circle exists between poverty and disease. The HIV/Aids pandemic results in people being in need of care, not being able to work nor provide for their next of kin, children being orphaned and taking over the parental role, without emotional and material means. Chronic diseases, for example tuberculosis, hypertension, diabetes and chronic psychiatric disease assume enormous proportions and influence the person-and-environment interaction, which is the social work focus. Health and social issues can therefore not be seen as separate entities. Social workers should then form an integral part of health care services.

The social work service rendering in the Health Sector should be effective, efficient and appropriate. Effective, efficient and appropriate health care social work services will encompass people-centred, developmental, preventative, promotative primary health care approaches with emphasis on participation, partnership and self-determination. An effective and appropriate service will rely on home-based and community-based strategies.

Health care social work is however fragmented and social workers in the Health Sector practice within different governmental and non-governmental organizations. Health care social work in the Gauteng Health Department where the researcher did the research, is largely curative, rehabilitative, hospital-based, individual-based and relies on institutional care. It is therefore ineffective, inefficient and inappropriate.

A shift towards an effective, efficient and appropriate health care social work service is essential especially when the reciprocal relationship between health and social issues in South Africa are taken into account. The researcher decided therefore to develop a community-based model for health care social work with emphasis on a people-centred and developmental approach emphasizing participation, partnership and selfdetermination of the people. This model will be utilized on a primary health care level within a community health centre and community context where the health care social worker will form part of a multi-disciplinary health care team. The *main goal* of this study is the development of a community-based model for health care social work.

The *objectives* to attain the main goal of describing a community-based model for health care social workers were:

- To explore and describe the thoughts and experiences regarding the perceived needs with reference to the general health of the following patients:
 - Patients who attend provincial community health centres to address their health needs;
 - Patients who are representative of the diversity of all South African citizens and therefore include White, Black, Coloured and Indian population groups;
 - Patients who qualify in terms of their income to utilize Governmental health services and who do not belong to medical schemes;
 - Patients from formal, well organized and structured communities with different community resources, as well as patients from informal settlements without structured community services;
 - Patients of different age and gender groups; and
 - Patients with acute and chronic, including life threatening medical conditions.
- To describe the needs of patients after interviews were conducted and data had been analyzed;
- To explore and describe the needs that health care social workers can address and the intervention strategies that they can utilize in doing so;
- To explore and describe the priority needs that a health care social worker could address and the intervention strategies they could utilize in doing it, in the opinion of the following multi-disciplinary health care team members:
 - Medical doctors;
 - Nursing staff;

- Allied health professionals (physiotherapists or their assistants, occupational therapists or their assistants, speech therapists, dieticians, pharmacists and community based rehabilitation workers);
- To describe specific needs and services which health care social work exclusively or most effectively can address according to ranking on a scale;
- To develop a community-based model for health care social work according to the needs that a health care social worker can address and which will result in an effective and appropriate health care social work service;
- To evaluate the tentative model; and
- To revise the intervention and describe guidelines to operationalize the model.

The *research design* utilized to attain these objectives was based on a research model that the researcher developed. The researcher developed the research model by utilizing The Intervention Design and Development model (Rothman & Thomas, 1994) qualitative research for interviews with patients, observations and field notes, data analysis and literature control. Quantitative research designs were included in the model and consisted of the Delphi technique and Lickert scale. Levels of theory generation were also included in the model and the researcher developed level of theory generation for the research based on the levels of theory generation of Dickoff et al. (1968) and Chinn and Kramer (1995). The research model that the researcher developed for developing a community-based model for health care social work encompasses certain phases and research activities, as well as theory generation and reasoning strategies. The *reasoning strategies* included analysis induction, synthesis, derivation and deduction.

The *first phase of the research was the problem analysis and project-planning phase* of the research. The researcher carried into effect the following *research activities*. The researcher determined the feasibility of the research project; gained entry to and cooperation from setting and identified and involved role-players in the research. The identification and involvement of the role-players encompassed the sampling and the pilot study.

The *second phase of the research was the information gathering, analysis and synthesis phase* of the research. This phase included research activities, as well as levels of theory generation.

The *research activities* that were followed during this phase started with the conducting of *semi-structured interviews with twenty-two patients* and *observations* and the keeping of *field notes*. *Ethical issues* were addressed during this phase and formed part of the interviewing and observation process. *Data analysis* of interviews, with an independent coder, and *literature control* to affirm the findings of data analysis followed as part of the research activities.

The researcher then utilized the *Delphi technique* with nine *experts in health care social work*. The aim of this was to establish the patient's needs, established during data analysis, that a health care social worker could address and the intervention strategies that they could utilize. These needs and intervention strategies were established by questionnaires and a group session was held to reach consensus of data.

UNIVERSITY

The above-mentioned data established from health care social work experts were then compiled into *a Lickert scale for twenty-five multi-disciplinary health care team members*. The aim of the scale was to establish the needs that health care social work could address exclusively of most effectively, as well as the intervention strategies that they could utilize in the opinion of the multi-disciplinary health care team members.

A *final literature control* completes the research activities of the information gathering, analysis and synthesis phase in order to establish if literature exist that verifying the results of the data obtained and if these could assist in the development of a community-based model for health care social work.

The *levels of theory generation* followed in the *information gathering, analysis and synthesis phase of the research* consist of the following:

The *first level* of theory generation consisted of *factor isolating theory*. The researcher utilized *concept analysis*. *Concepts* were firstly *identified* and the researcher identified the concept health. The concept health is a central concept in all the policy documents and theory that were utilized in the problem analysis of the research. The concept health was also central in the data analysis and literature control of the interviews with patients. The *concept* health was then *defined and refined* by utilizing dictionaries and thesauruses, as well as utilizing sources of evidence namely, a model and contrary case, evidence of people and professional literature. The researcher then *classified the concept* health and the related concepts.

The second level of theory generation, factor relating and structuring followed during the information gathering, analysis and synthesis phase of the research. The researcher related factors and associated them through statements that indicate interrelationships.

The third level of theory generation consisted of the situation relating level followed by predicting relationships between concepts utilizing if-then statements.

OF OF

The *third phase of the research* was the *design and early development phase*. The researcher utilized the *fourth level of theory generation* that consisted of the *situation producing level of theory generation* to conduct the *research activity* of the *creating and describing of the theoretical model* for community-based health care social work.

The last phase of the research consisted of *the theory testing and evaluation* phase of *the research*. The *research activities* that were followed encompass the *planning of evaluation, selection of evaluation methods* and then the *evaluation process*. The evaluation process was done with a panel of nine experts utilizing a specific questionnaire in the form of a Lickert scale. The panel consisted of academic staff from the Universities of the Witwatersrand, Pretoria and Randse Afrikaanse University from social work and nursing as well as multi-disciplinary health care team members from

community health centres and social workers from different practice settings. The second part of the evaluation process was done during doctoral seminars where peer evaluation was done by health care social workers, medical doctors, nursing staff and allied health workers from different levels of service rendering including the Gauteng Health Department' Head Office, community-based centres and different levels of hospitals. Participants from private hospitals also attended the doctoral seminars. The researcher then utilized the evaluation results to *identify design problems* and to *revise the community-based model for health care social work*. The *final level of theory generation* was then done in the theory testing and evaluation phase of the research to *operationalize the model* by describing guidelines for operationalization.

The methods of trustworthiness that were followed during the research included the four criteria of Lincoln and Guba (1985) of credibility, transferability, dependability and conformability.

The researcher finalized the research by indicating the conclusions from the research, specifying the limitations of the research and providing recommendations for social work practice, education and research.

The research document might be marked by repetition of content, but this was necessary because chapter six, the model, as well as chapter eight, the guidelines for operationalizing the model, form the basis for health care social work practice at community health centres. These chapters could then be extracted from the research document as a tool for implementation.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>CHAI</u>	PTER ONE: A GENERAL ORIENTATION	1
1.1 B	ackground and motivation of the study	1
1.2 P	roblem formulation	13
1.3 T	heoretical orientation	16
1.3.1	Community health approaches	16
	Factors that affect the health of a community	17
	a) Physical factors	17
	b) Social and cultural factors	20
	c) Community organization	25
	d) Individual behavior	26
	Levels of health care	28
	a) Preventative care	30
	b) Primary care	30
	c) Restorative care	32
	d) Continuing care	32
	e) Secondary and tertiary care. UNIVERSITY	33
1.3.2	JOHANNESBURG Social Development approach	35
	a) Community development as strategy for social development on	
	mezzo level	39
	b) Community organization as strategy for social development on	
	mezzo level	39
	c) Community work as strategy for social development on mezzo	
	level	40
	d) Organizational change as strategy for social development on	
	mezzo level	41
	e) Individual treatment as strategy for social development on	
	micro level	41
	f) Multi-disciplinary and intersectoral work as social development	
	strategies	42

 g) Rural development as social development strategy 	42
.4 Conceptualization	43
.5 Summary	46
.6 An overview of chapters to follow	47
CHAPTER TWO: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHOD	49
.1 Introduction	49
2.2 The goals and objectives of the study	49
	51
A Research goals	54
2.4.1 Exploratory research	54
.4.2 Descriptive research	56
2.5 Research strategy	57
2.6 Assumptions of research	58
.7 The research methods included in the development of the research	
design	61
7.1 The intervention Design and Development Model (Rothman and	
JOHANNESBURG	62
2.7.2 Theory generating	63
Type of theory development	64
The process of theory generation	68
2.7.3 Qualitative research	71
2.7.4 The Delphi technique	74
2.7.5 Lickert scales	75
8.8 Reasoning strategies	76
2.8.1 Analysis	76
2.8.2 Synthesis	77
8.3 Derivation	78
8.8.4 Induction	78

Г

2.9 The research design	
2.9.1 Problem analysis and project planning phase	
Determine feasibility	
Prepare a project plan	
Gaining entry and cooperation from settings	
Identifying and involving role-players	
The pilot study as tool in identifying and invo	olving role-players 94
Identifying and involving the interpreter	
Sampling as method in identifying and involv	ving role-players in
research	
2.9.2 Information gathering, analysis and synthesis	phase 102
a) Activities being followed during the inform	ation gathering,
analysis and synthesis phase	103
Semi-structured interviews with patients	
Observations and field notes during visits of s	settings 110
Ethical considerations during research	116
Data analysis	118
Literature control of data analysis	120
Delphi technique with experts in health care .	social work 121
Lickert scale with multi-disciplinary health c	are team members 124
Literature control	126
b) Levels of theory generation	126
Factor-isolating theory (level I)	127
Concept analysis	127
Define and refine concepts by using sources	of evidence 130
Classify concepts	134
Factor-relating and structuring of theory (le	vel II) 134
Situation-relating theory (level III)	
2.9.3 Design and early development phase	
Situation producing theory (level IV)	

2.9.4	Theory testing and evaluation phase	145
	Planning of evaluation	145
	Select evaluation methods	145
	Select methods of trustworthiness	147
	Carry out systematic evaluation	148
	Identify and address design problems	151
2.10	Summary	151
<u>CHA</u>	PTER THREE:DISCUSSION OF THE RESEARCH RESULTS	
AND	DESCRIBING THE PERCEIVED NEEDS OF PATIENTS AT	
<u>COM</u>	MUNITY HEALTH CENTRES	152
3.1 I	ntroduction	152
3.2 I	Discussion of results from analysis of semi-structured interviews	
v	vith patients at community health centres	152
3.2.1	Patient's perceptions regarding their general health	155
3.2.2.	1Physical aspects of importance to patients in their perceptions of	
	of their general health	155
	Physical distress	155
	Health as a factor influencing general lifestyle	157
	Complementary medicine as treatment procedure	159
3.2.1.	2 Mental aspects of importance to patients in their perceptions	
	regarding their general health	160
	Emotional distress	160
	Chronic psychiatric disorders	162
3.2.2	Factors influencing the general health of patients	165
3.2.2.	1Social support as influencing factor of general health	165
	Physical treatment and the multi-professional team as social support .	165
	Social support at community level	169
	The family as one of the important social support systems and	
	influencing factors of general health	170
	Spiritual/cultural support systems	172

3.2.2.2The influence of interpersonal relations on general health	176
Multiple partners influencing general health	177
Relationships with significant others	179
Parental role	179
Absent father figure	179
Young parenthood	181
The extended family	182
Physical/sexual abuse	185
Parent/child relationship	187
Cultural racial issues	189
3.2.2.3 Environmental factors influencing general health	191
Poor living conditions	191
Lack of safety and security	193
The impact of geographically separation of parents and children	195
Continuing care facilities	196
3.2.2.4Economic/financial factors as important link to health	197
The interplay of financial constraints and health	197
Scarce jobs as factor influencing general health	200
Social security as important factor in general health	203
3.3 Summary	205
CHAPTER FOUR: INFORMATION GATHERING, ANALYSIS AND	
SYNTHESIS PHASE OF THE RESEARCH WITH HEALTH CARE	
SOCIAL WORKERS AND THE MULTI-DISCIPLINARY HEALTH	
CARE TEAM	206
4.1 Introduction	206
4.2 The Delphi technique with health care social workers	206
4.2.1 Patients perceptions regarding their general health	209
4.2.2 Factors influencing the general health of patients	211
4.3 The Lickert scale implemented with multi-disciplinary health care	
team members	217

4.3.1	Patients perceptions regarding their general health	218
4.3.2	Factors influencing the general health of patients	219
4.4 S	ummary	224
<u>CHA</u>	PTER FIVE: THEORY GENERATION	226
5.1 Ir	ntroduction	226
5.2 T	heory generation for community-based health care social work	226
5.2.1	Concept analysis	227
	Identification of concepts	228
	Defining and refining of the concept 'health' by using sources of	
	evidence	232
	Definitions from dictionaries and textbooks and theoretical literature	
	as sources of evidence	232
	Textbook definitions and professional literature	236
	Cases as sources of evidence to define and refine the concept health .	245
	People as sources of evidence of the concept health and associated	
	concepts	258
	Classification and defining of concepts	265
	The agent that performs the activity	266
	The patient, next of kin and community (recipient)	273
	The context where the activity is performed	277
	The end point of the activity	285
	Intervention strategies	287
	The energy source for the activity (dynamics)	302
5.2.2	Factor relating and structuring	304
5.2.3	Situation relating theory: Predicting relationships	315
5.3 Summary		319

CHAPTER SIX: DESIGN AND EARLY DEVELOPMENT OF A	
COMMUNITY-BASED MODEL FOR HEALTH CARE SOCIAL	
<u>WORK</u>	320
6.1 Introduction	
6.2 Background of the model	321
6.2.1 The goal of the model	321
6.2.2 The rational of the model	321
6.2.3 The survey list	323
6.3 The assumptions on which the model is based	323
Assumptions regarding community health	324
Assumptions regarding social development	325
6.4 The describing of a community-based model for health care social	
work	326
6.4.1 The context of the model	326
6.4.2 Comprehensive explanations of the community-based model for	
health care social work	328
6.4.3 The structure of the model	330
6.4.3.1 Defining of central and sub-concepts	330
JOHANNESBURG	330
Sub-concepts	330
6.4.3.2 The structure of the model	334
6.4.3.3 Relationship statements of the model	344
6.5 The process description of the community-based model for health	
care social workers	345
6.5.1 The goal	346
6.5.2 The role players	346
6.5.3 Health and the community-based health care social worker	347
6.6 Summary	352

<u>CH</u>	APTER SEVEN: THEORY TESTING AND EVALUATION	354
7.1	Introduction	354
7.2	Plan evaluation and select evaluation methods	354
7.3	Select methods of trustworthiness	355
7.4	Carry out systematic evaluation	356
7.4.	Evaluation by the panel of experts	357
	Clarity of the model	357
	Simplicity of the model	359
	Generalizability of the model	362
	Accessibility of the model	363
	Importance of the model	365
7.4.2	2 Evaluation during the doctoral seminars	370
7.5	Identification and addressing of design problems	371
7.6	Summary	371
<u>CH</u>	APTER EIGHT: GUIDELINES FOR OPERATIONALIZATION OF	
TH	E COMMUNITY-BASED MODEL FOR HEALTH CARE SOCIAL	
WO	RK	373
8.1	JOHANNESBURG	373
8.2	Principles of the community-based model for health care social	
	work	373
	8.2.1 Participation	374
	8.2.2 Partnership	374
	8.2.3 Self-determination	374
	8.2.4 People-centred approach	374
	8.2.5 Developmental approach	375
8.3	The community context of the community-based model for health	
	care social work	376
	8.3.1 Physical factors	377
	8.3.2 Social and cultural factors	379
	8.3.3 Community organizations	384

385
386
387
389
390
393
394
395
396
396
397
400
401
401
402
404
404
408
415
416
418
418
422
440

9.4.4 The theory testing and evaluation phase of the research	442
9.5 Limitations of the study	444
9.6 Recommendations of the study	446
9.6.1 Recommendations for operationalization in practice	447
9.6.2 Recommendations for education	448
9.6.3 Recommendations for research	448
9.7 Summary	449

TABLES

Table 2.1: The process of theory generation	69
Table 2.2: Qualitative research	73
Table 2.3: Research design and method	81
Table 2.4: Types of samples	99
Table 2.5: Dimensions of descriptive observations	111
Table 2.6: Summary of research being done in the problem analysis,	
project planning, information gathering, analysis and synthesis	
phases	125
Table 2.7: Strategies to ensure trustworthiness	149
Table 3.1: Mental disability according to race	164
Table 3.2: Poverty profile of illness	199
Table 3.3: Unemployment rates above and below the poverty line	202
Table 4.1: Statistical data with regards to the need of social work	
intervention in addressing social support as influencing factor	
of general health	219
Table 4.2: Statistical results of the importance of health care social work	
intervention in interpersonal relations influencing the general	
health of patients	220
Table 4.3: Statistical results of environmental factors that could be	
addressed by health care social work intervention	221
Table 4.4: Statistical results of the economic and financial factors that	
health care social work intervention could address	222

Table 4.5: Statistical results of intervention strategies to be utilized by	
health care social workers as intervention	223
Table 5.1: Textbook definitions and professional literature	244
Table 5.2: Summary and comparison of the concept health as indicated	
in a model and contrary case	256
Table 5.3: Arnstein's eight-runged ladder of citizen participation	291

Т

FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Spectrum of health care delivery	29
Figure 1.2: Social development	38
Figure 2.1: Functions of conceptual framework	64
Figure 2.2: Linkages of theory development	67
Figure 2.3: Structural idea forms	144
Figure 3.1: Summary of major and sub-categories found in analysis of	
semi-structured interviews with patients at community	
health centres	154
Figure 3.2: Loesner's model of pain	156
Figure 3.3: A vicious circle of poverty and disease	198
Figure 5.1: Classification of concepts	267
Figure 5.2: Summarizing of the factors of the survey list	314
Figure 6.1: A community-based model for health care social work	335
Figure 6.2: Health as terminus	336
Figure 6.3: Continuum of health	337
Figure 6.4: Structure of health and sub-sections of health	338
Figure 6.5: The health care social worker (agent) and intervention	
strategies (procedures)	339
Figure 6.6: The context (framework) of health care social work	341
Figure 6.7: The patient, next of kin and community as recipient of	
health care social work services	343

Figure 6.8: Summary of the health care social work specific practice and	
intervention	353
Figure 8.1: A social network	388
Figure 8.2: The primary and secondary 'stars'	389
Figure 8.3: A 'loose-knit' network	391
Figure 8.4: The 'close-knit' network	391
BIBLIOGRAPHY:	450
ADDENDUM	
Addendum I: Permission for research	467
Addendum II: Consent form for research	468
Addendum III: Delphi technique	469
Addendum IV: Lickert scale	470
Addendum V: Evaluation questionnaire.	471

