

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

International African Institute

Management of Pastoral Development in the Third World by Stephen Sandford; Livestock Development in Sub-Saharan Africa: Constraints, Prospects, Policy by James R. Simpson; Phylo Evangelou

Review by: K. M. Homewood

Africa: Journal of the International African Institute, Vol. 55, No. 3 (1985), pp. 346-348

Published by: [Cambridge University Press](#) on behalf of the [International African Institute](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1160592>

Accessed: 02/08/2012 04:14

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Cambridge University Press and International African Institute are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

and man. Emmanuel Milingo, former Archbishop of Lusaka, ministered to Zambian congregations who believed in the spirit realm, and whose members could be possessed by evil spirits. These, Milingo would exorcize. Had this sort of ministry occurred outside Africa, Milingo could have been accepted by the Catholic hierarchy as a member of the charismatic movement. Within Africa, this ministry was reminiscent of witchcraft and other superstitions which generations of missionaries had sought to overcome. A political battle developed between Milingo and the expatriate Catholic hierarchy in Lusaka; Milingo was called to Rome, interrogated, and resigned his office.

The political and cultural significance of this is clearly set out by Mona MacMillan in her introduction and epilogue to Milingo's book. The book is, in fact, an edited compilation of Milingo's speeches and gestetnered pamphlets. These, while addressing the contradictions between europeanized Christianity and an African method of accepting it, were never meant to be intellectual discourses. Their impact is a cumulative one: simple statements of faith and statements of the kind often made by sociologists of religion are mixed and repeated through Milingo's constant reference to the case histories of his ministry.

The book is not a theological disquisition, but it is in many ways a cultural text. The concept of a world in between might be applied equally to the world that exists between a conservative church hierarchy and the mass of African worshippers who lead lives of material poverty. In this poverty, with its physical base, a spirit realm offers escape, a method of rebellion, or individual entities who may be blamed for the shortcomings of life. To cross the gap between church and worshipper, Milingo confronted the spirit realm.

There are many levels within this realm. Voluntary possession provides a form of short-term spiritual ecstasy. But Milingo sees clearly a darker possession that is in no way psychosomatic. In his discussion of evil spirits his antagonists are actually existing and sentient beings, with missions of evil and long practice of it. He alludes to his ministry as a form of first-century Christian work – casting out demons. But he goes further: the demons have a peculiar African habitat; it is necessary to explore the components of African spirituality. Here Milingo is certainly on dangerous political ground, if not also on unreconciled theological ground. He sees a Christianity which can be appropriated by its believer in his or her indigenous terms. This implies a distinct variation of the universal church, even though, *de jure*, Milingo remained (and still holds a 'safe' office) within the mainstream Catholic church. A form of African gnosis may be perceived here: God may be appropriated in either male or female form; Christ may be appropriated in the guise of ancestor worship.

This sort of approach is not new, though hardly conventional. Far from the centres of religious debate, intellectual in a narrow Jesuitical fashion, the Lusaka Catholic hierarchy felt the foundation of its church threatened – and acted accordingly.

Milingo's legacy is, therefore, only a local pioneering one. A more liberal and educated paradigm needs to descend on missionary colonial outposts before such work can prosper within the mainstream church. Milingo's book is best read as a memoir – although its editor sees it clearly as an exoneration of the former archbishop. It is a memoir, however, full of compassion for a flock persecuted in several spiritual senses, by a spirit realm and by an unregarding church with custody over what is or is not spiritually admissible – even if it is real; or at least real to those who suffer from it. It is a memoir, therefore, which must be read against Catholic conservatism; and treated as a source in the eventual history of the church, and in social anthropological studies of it. Circumstance has made more of these simple writings than they might otherwise have merited.

STEPHEN CHAN
University of Zambia

STEPHEN SANDFORD, *Management of Pastoral Development in the Third World*. Chichester: Wiley, in association with the Overseas Development Institute, 1983.

JAMES R. SIMPSON and PHYLO EVANGELOU, *Livestock Development in Subsaharan Africa: constraints, prospects, policy*. Westview Replica Editions. Boulder, Col.: Westview Press, 1984, 408 pp.

According to Sandford there are some 30–40 million people in arid and semi-arid areas worldwide who make their living from a primarily livestock-based economy; half of them live in Africa, and of these the majority are subsistence pastoralists or farmers to some extent caught up in national development. The two books address closely overlapping topics within this field, both drawing largely on limited-access government and development reports, but with different emphasis and in very different ways. Simpson and Evangelou have produced a collection of twenty-one papers on sub-Saharan Africa by a variety of authors. Sandford presents one man's synthesis, based on his extensive experience of practical development projects in Africa as well as using material from Asia, America and Australia. Both books are useful, but they are likely to appeal to different audiences.

Simpson and Evangelou have produced an unusually tightly edited collection: contributions are concise, similar in length, and overall make up a logical and comprehensive sequence of topics from basic constraints of environmental potential and livestock biology, through the impact of production and marketing policies and socio-economic variables, to land tenure issues. Not all papers sit well in this sequence. A substantial section of the short introductory overview (together with all its listed references) is dedicated to the potential of game ranching, barely referred to elsewhere in the book. Simpson's introductory chapter seems at odds with the rest. He uses unqualified comparisons of production figures for sub-Saharan stock with those for high-technology systems in developed countries as a basis for inferring dramatic scope for improvement, seen as needed to meet increasing demand for livestock products from a rapidly growing population. These views (and indeed the measures of productivity on which they are based) are not supported by the rest of the book. The next two chapters, by Pratt and MacDowell respectively, give clear and realistic assessments of the very major practical constraints imposed by environmental ecology and livestock biology. These chapters together with subsequent papers on livestock disease problems (Moulton), small stock production (Trevor-Wilson), and the potential for livestock breed improvement (little if any – Trail and Gregory) present little that is new but much that is extremely useful, well summarized and clearly put, making the first part of this work a handy and up-to-date background text. This run-through of basic biology is followed by revealing descriptions of Maasai livestock marketing (Evangelou) and of the impact of government price policies (Sullivan). There is a heartening if bureaucratically worded and jargon-laden review of USAID livestock development policy changes over the last thirty years (Atherton). Stryker's interesting comparative analysis of animal production in Mali and arid or semi-arid areas of the developed world gives the lie to Simpson's introductory enthusiasm: he concludes that 'research results are pessimistic concerning finding an economically viable means of increasing animal production by manipulating range resources' and that the emphasis of input must shift from the land to the people, with the development of herder associations and credit facilities. These are perhaps more likely to improve security and resilience within pastoralist production systems than to enhance production to any great extent.

At this point there is a hiccup in the hitherto smooth sequence, with a paper pursuing a somewhat unnecessary proof that cattle are not always maintained solely for subsistence, or as the sole means of subsistence (Schneider); another introducing the first note of repetition with a review of constraints ably covered earlier (Dickie and O'Rourke), and a third on design and management of livestock projects, in terms so general as to be of limited use (Teele). This last paper suffers by comparison with Sandford, who concentrates on the subject and covers it in exhaustive detail, drawing on probably unparalleled experience and knowledge: in the context of Simpson and Evangelou's volume, Teele's paper may be a legitimate if uninspiring summary. A later paper on land tenure presents 'a policy model which holds promise for sub-Saharan Africa' which might be better characterized as a summary of the *status quo* for that area (Lawry *et al.*). The book regains some impetus with Little's practical review of key sociological variables, whose survey is a necessary prerequisite to livestock development planning, and Behnke's analysis of commercialization (which again undermines Simpson's introductory premises). As

conclusion to a coherent review of sub-Saharan livestock development the final section rather peters out with a miscellany of individually interesting but unrelated papers on veterinary anthropology and animal health (Sollod *et al.*, Schillhorn van Veen), models of marketing behaviour determinants (Ariza-Nino and Shapiro) and of farming systems production (De Boer *et al.*). In the tightly controlled, almost textbook series of chapters presented by the rest of the book one somehow expects a final overview echoing the very positive introduction. The actual 'approaches for the future' final section is perhaps more realistic as it stands.

Sandford by contrast has produced a review which seems intended more as a very practical handbook for planners and government officials, but it has much of interest for the student and research worker too. While Simpson sketches a general problem of increasing population and demand for livestock products and points to productivity of developed systems as a goal to be achieved in sub-Saharan Africa by technical and socio-economic change, Sandford gives as introduction a more considered and down-to-earth review of the basic resources and the aims of development. He also presents a much needed critical look at the conventional wisdom of overstocking, overgrazing, desertification, the environmental impact of different land tenure systems, and the efficiency of subsistence pastoralist opportunism that has influenced development policy over the last fifty years. This is followed by two chapters setting out a planner's careful distinction between management objectives and the various possible strategies, components and organizations needed to bring about objectives – a breakdown that is essential for the administrator but makes cumbersome if instructive reading for those not immediately involved in implementation. Thereafter the book investigates different components one by one: water development, range management and improvement, land allocation, animal health and husbandry, marketing and processing, pastoralist and government organizations. For each component Sandford reviews the range of basic resources involved, the potential changes that different types of development can bring about, the technical and administrative aspects involved, the interactions with other components, and the many associated pitfalls and problems (from the environmental to the socio-economic and politico-legal) that have emerged in past and current development attempts.

Sandford's book is a comprehensive, balanced, practical work. The development worker or administrator could start with Sandford's framework and, using his references as pointers, plan overall strategy and execute individual projects forearmed with a good grasp of potential problems and implications. The student or research worker will find not only an informative text but also stimulating critical discussions on issues that have hitherto gone largely uncontested. The only drawback lies in Sandford's style. As is perhaps inevitable in a series on public administration in developing countries, much of the book is presented in the language of management, and it does not make easy reading. The collection edited by Simpson and Evangelou is by contrast on the whole very readable. At the expense of giving a meticulous and exhaustive framework as does Sandford, Simpson and Evangelou present a blend of state-of-knowledge review papers and individual case studies which is at its best on ideas rather than on management practice. Anyone looking for a detailed introduction to livestock development will find Simpson and Evangelou's book useful and interesting; those actually involved in the business of pastoral development will find Sandford an indispensable working reference.

K. M. HOMEWOOD
University College, London