



Determining the response of African biota to climate change: using the past to model the future

Willis, K. J., Bennett, K. D., Burrough, S. L., Macias-Fauria, M., & Tovar, C. (2013). Determining the response of African biota to climate change: using the past to model the future. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B, 368(1625), [20120491]. DOI: 10.1098/rstb.2012.0491

Published in:

Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B

Document Version: Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:

Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal

Publisher rights © 2013 The Authors

This is an open access article published under a Creative Commons Attribution License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the author and source are cited.

General rights

copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights. Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other

Take down policy The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.



rstb.royalsocietypublishing.org

Review



Cite this article: Willis KJ, Bennett KD, Burrough SL, Macias-Fauria M, Tovar C. 2013 Determining the response of African biota to climate change: using the past to model the future. Phil Trans R Soc B 368: 20120491. http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2012.0491

One contribution of 18 to a Theme Issue 'Change in African rainforests: past, present and future'.

Subject Areas:

ecology, environmental science, plant science

Keywords:

Africa, ecosystem services, climate change, aridity, precipitation, palaeoecology

Author for correspondence:

K. J. Willis e-mail: kathy.willis@zoo.ox.ac.uk

Electronic supplementary material is available at http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2012.0491 or via http://rstb.royalsocietypublishing.org.



Determining the response of African biota to climate change: using the past to model the future

K. J. Willis^{1,2}, K. D. Bennett^{3,4}, S. L. Burrough⁵, M. Macias-Fauria¹ and C. Tovar¹

¹Long-term Ecology Laboratory, Biodiversity Institute, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, Oxford OX1 3PS, UK

²Department of Biology, University of Bergen, PO Box 7803, 5020 Bergen, Norway

³School of Geography, Archaeology and Palaeoecology, Queen's University Belfast, Belfast BT7 1NN, UK
⁴Department of Earth Sciences, Uppsala University, 752 36 Uppsala, Sweden

 5 School of Geography and the Environment, University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3QS, UK

Prediction of biotic responses to future climate change in tropical Africa tends to be based on two modelling approaches: bioclimatic species envelope models and dynamic vegetation models. Another complementary but underused approach is to examine biotic responses to similar climatic changes in the past as evidenced in fossil and historical records. This paper reviews these records and highlights the information that they provide in terms of understanding the local- and regional-scale responses of African vegetation to future climate change. A key point that emerges is that a move to warmer and wetter conditions in the past resulted in a large increase in biomass and a range distribution of woody plants up to 400-500 km north of its present location, the so-called greening of the Sahara. By contrast, a transition to warmer and drier conditions resulted in a reduction in woody vegetation in many regions and an increase in grass/savanna-dominated landscapes. The rapid rate of climate warming coming into the current interglacial resulted in a dramatic increase in community turnover, but there is little evidence for widespread extinctions. However, huge variation in biotic response in both space and time is apparent with, in some cases, totally different responses to the same climatic driver. This highlights the importance of local features such as soils, topography and also internal biotic factors in determining responses and resilience of the African biota to climate change, information that is difficult to obtain from modelling but is abundant in palaeoecological records.

1. Introduction

Tropical and subtropical African biomes, in particular forests and savannas, have long been recognized for their important ecosystem services and associated human benefits. African forests are valued for both their importance in terms of regulating (e.g. CO₂ drawdown [1]) and provisioning services (e.g. timber, non-timber forest products [2]) and savannas for their potential in terms of provisioning and cultural services, for example, grazing land for both animal husbandry and ecotourism [3]. Most recently, these African landscapes have also been highlighted in terms of their provisioning services for biofuels [4]. Determination of these current ecosystem services at regional and landscape scales and the valuation of these benefits is the focus of much research presently (see examples in the electronic supplementary material, table S1). However, it is also recognized that these ecosystem services are changing in response to changes in climate and this will have a significant impact on provision of services in the future [5]. A key research challenge is to quantify the impact of these forecasted climatic changes on the African tropical and subtropical biota which are important for current and future ecosystem service provision.

© 2013 The Authors. Published by the Royal Society under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/, which permits unrestricted use, provided the original author and source are credited.

There are currently two main approaches to assess the impact of future climate change on African biota: (i) modelling the response of species and/or vegetation functional units to changes in climate, i.e. using the present distribution of biota/climate to develop models to predict future change; and (ii) analysing the palaeo-record, i.e. to examine past biotic responses to climate changes analogous to forecasted climate to determine rates and possible direction of future responses to climate change.

Modelling approaches to assess the impact of future climate change on biota include bioclimatic envelope models and dynamic vegetation models. In the first, present-day distribution of the species in relation to the climatic envelope is calculated, and this climate/distributional range is then used to predict future range shifts in response to climate change (for a review, see [6]). In Africa, a number of studies have been carried out using this approach, indicating that for some species, significant loss of suitable climate space will result in extinctions. For example, a modelling study of 227 African mammals using climate predictions for 2050 and 2080 from the HadCM3 general circulation model (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) special report on emissions scenarios A2 and B2 [7]) indicated that between 25 and 40% of the species modelled will be critically endangered or extinct by 2080 [8]. Similarly, modelled range shifts for 5197 sub-Saharan plant species, using the same general circulation model, predicted the extinction of between 25 and 42% of species by 2085 due to reduction in suitable climate space, especially in the Guineo-Congolian forest [9]. It is widely acknowledged, however, that these models are highly sensitive to the algorithms used [10,11]. Moreover, they are unable to robustly quantify vegetation responses to conditions outside the range of variability of their training datasets (i.e. non-analogous [12-14]), such as future high CO2 atmospheric concentration or temperatures not observed currently. Differences in the assumptions made regarding non-analogous conditions might result in virtually opposite forecasts of extinction risks [15]. Other problems include an often poor understanding of the full ecological tolerances of the modelled plants/animals, determination of the full spectrum of biotic interactions, and coarse spatial scales (approx. 100 km grid squares) [6].

Dynamic vegetation models surmount many of the abovementioned limitations, as they are mechanistic and explicitly formulate physiological, biophysical and biogeochemical processes as well as species interactions [16], and can thus be used to predict ecosystem response in non-analogous scenarios [17-19]. In particular, coupled vegetation dynamics and climate models have been used to demonstrate the importance of vegetation and land-cover feedbacks in the strength of the African monsoon over West Africa [20-22]. Despite their great insights and usefulness, the complexity of dynamic vegetation models means that they are very often used with plant functional types (PFTs) instead of species (e.g. tropical broadleaved evergreen, temperate needle-leaved evergreen, etc.) [19,23] and at coarse resolution: as a result, the use of PFTs does not enable these models to account for the observed individual species responses to environmental changes [24].

The use of historical and palaeo-records to determine possible biotic responses to future climate change has been less used to date. This is, in part, due to perceived circularities stemming from the use of proxies such as fossil pollen as both climatic and biological sources of information. The introduction of new tools and proxies in recent years has, however, resulted in a growing body of palaeoclimate-proxy evidence that is independent of the fossil data detailing biotic response (table 1). This paper presents a review of some of these newly emerging datasets alongside the fossil evidence for biotic responses to examine the insights that these palaeo-records can provide on the potential responses of African biota to projected future changes in climate. It focuses on three regional forecast climate scenarios in Africa, namely enhanced wetness, enhanced aridity and faster rates of climate warming. Fossil evidence for spatial variations in biota in response to climate change in Sahara, West Africa, East Africa and Southern Africa is examined and then discussed in the context of the information that they provide for determining current and future changes of biota to predicted climate changes.

2. Current and future climate change in tropical and subtropical Africa

In order to simplify the great diversity of climates across Africa, we have used the regional division used by the IPCC [25] to narrow the focus of our review, namely to consider records from Sahara, West Africa, East Africa and Southern Africa (see the electronic supplementary material, figure S1). Near the equator, within the inter-tropical convergence zone (ITCZ), high precipitation (with equinoctial maxima) is mostly modulated by insolation, and regional variability is due to the influence of orography and oceans. North and south of this region, climate is dominated by the African monsoon system ([26]; see the electronic supplementary material, figure S1). Subtropical West Africa experiences one rainy season (May to September), modulated to a great extent by El Niño-Southern Oscillation (ENSO), sea surface temperatures (SSTs) over the Atlantic, and strong landatmosphere interactions [27,28]. Subtropical East Africa in comparison experiences two rainy seasons, the 'long rains' (March to May) and the highly variable 'short rains' (September to December) [29,30], driven by the seasonal migration of the ITCZ and the movement of the Congo Air Boundary (figure 1) [34]. Finally, Southern African climate is highly variable regionally and modulated by the Atlantic and Indian oceans [35–38] as well as ENSO [39,40].

Given the diversity of the current climate in Africa, it is not surprising that climate predictions for this continent are also highly complex. From the most recent IPCC records, the following can be summarized for changes to the African climate by the end of this century (2080–2099):

- precipitation forecasts indicate high regional variability within Africa; some regions will get drier and other regions wetter. In East Africa, precipitation will probably increase during the 'short rains' season (October to December; [30,41]). In comparison, Southern Africa's climate is robustly predicted to get drier [42], especially in the austral winter [43] and to a lesser degree in spring and summer [44]. The Sahara is expected to stay dry or become drier [45]. Finally, in the Sahel and West Africa it could get wetter or drier [21,46–48], because despite recent improvements in the coupled model inter-comparison project phase 5 [49], there is still substantial inter-model spread in model projections (especially in the duration and intensity of the rainy season in the Sahel [27,50,51]);
- rate of climate change will increase. James *et al.* [52] report high inter-model agreement (from a total of 24

Table 1. Temperature and wetness phases in Africa over the past 25 000 cal year BP, based on palaeo-proxies. Information of location and references for each record and the proxies used is detailed in figure 1 and the electronic supplementary material, table 52 following the number attached to each site name. Where absolute values are provided in the source publications, these are given in the electronic supplementary material, table 52 following the number attached to each site name. Where absolute values are provided in the source publications, these are given in the electronic supplementary material, table 53. All other proxi interpretations are taken directly from the original source data. 'isotopes': isotopic and molecular climate proxy data; 'mixed': pollen (biotic response) included.

		12. Bosumtwi					warm and wet											cold and dry							
		11. Mbalang		w arm and dry			w arm and wet		cold and wet																
		10. Ngamakala		w arm and wet	me and day	waווו מוא חוץ						worm and wat	w allit allu wet								مماط معط طست	כטום מוום חוץ			
	pollen	9. Barombi Mbo	ton and mot		warm and dry					warm and wet					warm and dry	tion and mot					cold and dry				
		8. Kitina	warm and wet	und den	wai ווו מווט טו y		warm and wet																		
West .		7. Ossa	ton have more		w arm and dry	to a man			_																
		6. ODP1078		money and dev	w מוווו מווח חוץ			ter anna ann a' triat	w affil allu wel		und have smooth	w מוווו מווח נווץ			warm and wet				مملط	COID			w arm and wet		
		5. ODP1078c		warm and dry			w arm		tour bars serving	אמווון מווח אכו		COMPANY AND	W dilli			uransition warm/cold	Malillootu	cold			مماط مسط طست	כטום מווח תוץ			
	isotopes	4. GeoB6518		warm and dry					mon and mat	walili allu wet				more and dev	waini anu ui y				cold and dry						
		3. GeoB4905		warm and dry			warm		mon and mot	wai ili aliu wet				warm				cold			مماط معط طعين	cord and ury			
ara	mixed	2. Yoa		warm and very dry	ury.	w arm and dry	mone and mot	w attit allu wet																	
Sah	isotopes	1. GeoB9508			dry			wet		derv	uny	turat	wct	dan	u y	terro t	wet				dry				
region	proxy	name / age	500	1000	2000	3000	4000	5000	6000	7000	8000	0006	10 000	11 000	12 000	13 000	14 000	15 000	16000	17 000	18 000	19 000	20 000	21 000	

region					East Africa					Southern	Africa
proxy		isotop	les			lloq	en		mixed	isotoj	bes
name/age	13. Lake Challa	14. Tanganyika	15. Lake Victoria	16. Malawi	17. Lake Albert	18. Masoko	19. Lake Naivasha	20. Tanganyika	21. Lake Victoria	22. Namibia	23. GeoB9307
500									the second second second		
1000			warm and dry	worm and wat	more and dev	wint		warm and dry	warm anu very drv	deer	cold and wet
2000	dry	warm and dry		Walili allu wel	wann anu ury	wet	warm and very		ury.	ury	
3000			مماط منتط طيب				Ē				
4000				monn and dev					warm and dry		cold and dry
5000				w מו וו ז מו ח טו א						device	
6000					¢		w arm and dry	warm and wat	tear ville access	ury/wer	
7000				cold and wat		warm and dru			эсаэонану мег		
8000	wet	warm and wet	warm and wet			warm anu ury					warm and dry
0006				mond day					more and mat	wat conditions	
10 000				w מנונו מווט עניץ	more and mat		warm and wat			Wet conditions	
11 000											mone and mat
12 000	dry	warm and dry	مماط مسط طس		abrupt aridity	more mot			cold and dry		w ann anu wet
13 000	triat			warm and wet	warm and wet						mone and dev
14000	wet					cold and wet					w מוווו מווט עו y
15000							cold and dry				warm and wat
16000								cold and dry			w ann anu wet
17 000	dry	cold and dry		مماط معط سمة	مماط معط يتعظر طسر						
18 000					cord and very ury	more and wat					
19 000							cool and moist				
20 000	wat										
21000	wer										

3



Figure 1. Location of the main palaeo-records in Africa. Squares: palaeo-records explicitly mentioned in the text (numbers as in table 1). Names and description in the electronic supplementary material, table S2. Mixed proxies involved a combination of pollen, molecular proxies and/or diatoms. Circles: records from other palaeo-record compilations mentioned in the text [24,31]. Main water bodies during the African humid period obtained from [32]. Present land cover based on [33]. African regions based on [25].

global climate models, GCMs) in predictions on faster warming rates over Africa than the global average; and

— temperature projections from CIMP5 [53] for the latetwenty-first century indicate warming in all months of the year in all African regions. Scenario-dependent (ranging from RCP2.8 to RCP8.5 [53]) temperature increases range from approximately 1.0°C to 4.4°C and in some cases 5.1°C in all African regions (as defined in [25]) and in both winter and summer months.

3. Biotic responses to past climate conditions analogous to projected scenarios

Fossil proxy climate evidence indicates that many of these predicted climatic changes for the African continent (warmer and wetter; warmer and drier; and increased rates of climate warming) of similar magnitudes have also been encountered in the past. Section *3a* examines the evidence for these past climatic fluctuations and the biotic responses to them.

(a) Warmer and wetter

There is now considerable independent palaeoclimatological evidence to suggest that warmer and wetter conditions occurred throughout many parts of western Africa, eastern Africa and the Sahara between approximately 11000–4000 cal year BP, an interval commonly known as the African Humid Period (AHP) [17,31,54–60] (table 1). Current understanding of the causes of these conditions points towards a general response to changes in insolation, which in East Africa was associated with an increase in dry season precipitation (and thus a reduction in seasonality [17]) and in West Africa with an increased penetration of an enhanced west African monsoon [21], with increased overall precipitation.

Mapping and dating of palaeo-river channels, closed basins, palaeo-lake shorelines and spillways demonstrates that the vast Saharan region from approximately 11 000 to 8000 cal year BP contained a series of linked lakes, rivers and inland deltas comprising a large interlinked waterway, channelling water, plants and animals into and across it [31,32] (figure 1). In addition, deuterium/hydrogen isotopes of leaf waxes (proxy for wetness) indicate wetter conditions in Sahara and West Africa (table 1) [61,62], and alkenone-derived SST reconstructions (proxy for temperature) indicate regionally warmer conditions in West Africa [63] (table 1).

Palaeoecological evidence indicates that biotic responses to this interval of enhanced wetness were dramatic. In the Sahara and West Africa, pollen-based vegetation reconstruction from 73 sites (located between 4.3° S and 25.5° N; figure 1) [24] indicates a northward progression of many woody species into areas that are now classified as Saharan desert: a range expansion of up to 400-500 km northward of present range. This resulted in some tropical trees growing at 15°N in an area that is currently occupied by the Sahara desert [24]. Diversity reached a maximum at approximately 8.5 ka when Saharan/Sahelian elements which persisted throughout this period were mixed with savanna and forest species of Guineo-Congolian, Guineo-Sudanian and Sudanian affinities from the more humid south. All species studied indicate an individualistic rate and direction of movement, probably via water courses and gallery forests [24,32,64]. Thus, with this warmer and wetter climate, some regions that are now plantless hyperarid deserts were occupied by savanna, desert grassland [54,65] and in some places gallery forests [24], resulting in complex 'non-analogue' vegetation assemblages with mixed xeric-semimesic-mesic vegetation that has no modern counterpart.

In East Africa, palaeoenvironmental records including TEX86 (an organic palaeothermometer), deuterium/hydrogen and carbon isotope ratios of higher plant leaf waxes (proxy measures of palaeo-wetness) from Lake Tanganyika [60] (figure 1 and table 1) indicate that major changes in vegetation were highly correlated to climate trends during the wetter and warmer period 11 500–5000 cal year BP. Overall, the trend towards warmer and wetter conditions was paralleled by a shift in vegetation from one dominated by savanna and C_4 grasses [66,67] to a landscape dominated by C_3 trees and shrubs [66].

Significant, region-wide changes in vegetation therefore occurred in response to enhanced temperature and precipitation. These included large-scale range shifts, development of novel plant assemblages, higher concentrations of plant biomass in regions previously unable to support woody tree growth and extensive community turnover and assemblage change. However, the responses of plants appear to have been individualistic; there is little support, for example, for a vast 'wave' of forest migration—rather different species underwent range shift at different rates (varying in their response by thousands of years) and in different directions, and the overall response was nonlinear [24,32,64] and appears to have been strongly influenced by local abiotic factors.

(b) Warmer and drier

Palaeoclimatic evidence indicates that a transition into a significantly drier climate occurred in some parts of Africa during the period 4000–1000 cal year BP (table 1). For example, in West Africa, deuterium/hydrogen isotopes from leaf waxes (proxy for wetness) and alkenone-derived SST reconstructions (proxy for temperature) indicate a decrease in wetness from 3200 cal year BP onwards and increase in temperature [63] (table 1).

In equatorial West Africa, one of the best records depicting biotic response to enhanced aridity is found in the fossil pollen sequence from Lake Mbalang, central Cameroon at approximately 7°N (figure 1) [68]. Around this site, palaeoecological evidence indicates there was a large-scale reduction in tropical forest, and the modern savanna became established around 3000 cal year BP (figure 1 and table 1). Lakes such as Sinnda completely dried up between 4000 and 1200 cal year BP [69]. Here, the structure of the forest changed significantly to favour dry-adapted semideciduous taxa, and disappeared altogether (4000–1200 cal year BP [69]) to the current grasslands. This forest response however was not uniform, with evidence from palaeoecogical records obtained from lakes Ngakamala, Kitina and Barombi Mbo (figure 1) indicating only the fragmentation of the forest and the appearance of savanna mosaics during the same interval of aridity [70–72]. Around Lake Ossa [73], there was a change in forest composition with an increase in pioneer species (*Alchornea* and *Macaranga*), whereas at Bosumtwi, almost no response is seen in the palaeo-record of vegetation [74]. This apparently local response of vegetation across West Africa to the same climatic forcing testifies to the importance of localized edaphic and geomorphic contexts and the variability in the stability and resilience of local vegetation structure to regional-scale climatic perturbations.

In East Africa, abrupt changes towards arid conditions are also recorded in the Tanganyika basin during the mid-Holocene, where an independent precipitation proxy (deuterium/hydrogen isotopes from plant waxes) indicates moderate drying from 6200 to 5500 cal year BP and a subsequent abrupt shift to arid conditions at 4900–4500 cal year BP [60]. Despite these rapid threshold-like shifts in hydrology, the vegetation record exhibited a gradual evolution towards C₄ dominated grasslands from 11 000 cal year BP and then throughout the Holocene. At this site, xeric grassland/shrubland therefore showed an apparent strong internal ecosystem control, being to some extent resilient to observed climatic swings [60]. From around 2700 cal year BP to present, however, a reduction of arboreal species and expansion of the current grasses occurred [75].

Direction and timing of past vegetation change in response to warmer and drier climate in Africa was therefore often nonlinear, highly variable spatially and appears to have been dependent on specific ecosystem resilience to aridity at the local and regional scale. Assemblage change occurred in some areas, but there is little evidence to indicate a uniform change from forest to savanna or grassland; rather local factors seemed to strongly influence both the type and also timing of the response with some vegetation assemblages/ areas displaying far greater resilience to enhanced aridity than others.

(c) Faster rates of warming

IPCC GCMs indicate that Africa will undergo a net warming of 3-4°C by 2100, with mean predicted rates of warming more than 0.3°C per decade. These rates are a conservative number, because they are higher regionally (subtropics), under larger emissions scenarios and vary seasonally (i.e. June to July) [52,53]. A useful interval in time to examine past biotic responses to similarly rapid warming rates is during the transition coming into the present interglacial (for a review, see [76]). Palaeoclimatic estimates indicate that the rates encountered at this interval are roughly comparable with estimates of warming over the twenty-first century [76,77]. For example, at the higher latitudes of the Northern Hemisphere, the rapid warming at approximately 11.7 to 11.5 ka produced increases of 5°C and more over a few decades [78], and data from Greenland ice cores suggest that a more than 10°C warming may have occurred in a period of 20-60 years [79]. Evidence from Lake Masoko, East Africa (see the electronic supplementary material, figure S2), indicates an equally dramatic climate change

coming out of the Younger Dryas, interpreted as a rapid increase in precipitation and/or temperature [80].

In East Africa, the most predominant response to this interval of rapid warming was ecological turnover and range adjustment. In the record from Lake Masoko [81], for example, a switch from forest dominated by taxa intolerant of a dry season to one containing species tolerant of a dry season occurred in less than 100 years at around 11 800 cal year BP (see the electronic supplementary material, figure S2). A similarly rapid turnover to climate warming is also seen in the palaeoecological record from Lake Kashiru in Burundi at this interval in time. Here, there was a switch from a grassland dominated ecosystem to woodlands [82] (see the electronic supplementary material, figure S2). Interestingly, at both sites, only a few local extinctions are noted associated with this rapid climatic transition. Instead, the main response was the rapid change in abundance of different taxa, a pattern similar to that seen throughout the Northern Hemisphere at this interval in time [76]. African plant species, at least in the regions studied thus far, appear to have had a level of tolerance and environmental plasticity to this interval of rapid climate change that enabled them to persist.

4. Discussion

The palaeoecological records presented here indicate some important additional factors that need to be taken into account when attempting to determine biotic response to future climate change; these are nonlinear features that will not necessarily be determined through modelling approaches alone, and can be summarized as follows.

First, there is a nonlinearity in the timing of the response of vegetation change to the same climatic driver. It would appear that slow climate trends can result in abrupt shifts in vegetation, and rapid climate changes may not incur rapid vegetation changes. For example, Tierney et al. [60] used paired compound-specific isotope records from the Holocene climate transition to show that major shifts in vegetation cover in the Tanganyika basin at 6.2-5.5 ka occurred during a time of only moderate drying. Prior to this, vegetation response was characteristically gradual, despite changes in wetness being typically abrupt [60]. This mismatch in the nature and timing of the relationship between climate variables and vegetation response is also noted in other regions of Africa [83]. Understanding this nonlinear behaviour is critical to understanding the level of confidence that can be placed in current and future predictions on the rate of response of African biota to climate change.

Second, there is nonlinearity in terms of the spatial response. In equatorial West Africa, for example, the interval of enhanced aridity between 4000 and 1000 cal year BP resulted in dramatic vegetation shifts from forest to savanna and to grassland in some areas, whereas other areas with the same climatic trigger saw little vegetation response. Reasons for these differences are important for determining spatial patterns of resilience across landscapes and, in particular, the sustainability of ecosystem service provision through time in response to climate change.

Third, there is nonlinearity in terms of the response of individual species and communities to climate change. In response to the AHP, for example, a large number of datasets from across West Africa indicate that while many woody species migrated north leading to the 'greening of the Sahara', they did so at individual rates and often following their own individual spatial trajectories, influenced by local topographical conditions [24,32,64]. Evidence for a large 'wave-like' biome movement in response to enhanced precipitation is totally lacking. These individual diffuse patterns of movement across landscapes in the fossil record, resulting in novel species assemblages and mosaic vegetation communities, provide a realistic representation of vegetation movement across the African landscape that could provide an important framework for future modelling studies.

All of the above is very important information for the current and future management of African landscapes because while at the broadest scale we might see extrinsic forcing leading to widespread turnover, the vast majority of evidence emerging from fossil records suggests that the rate and nature of this change is spatially highly variable and nonlinear. To date, palaeoecological data have provided qualitative information on the regional envelope of environmental variability for use in modelling [84], but it has enormous potential to be used in a quantitative sense to validate and hindcast models that project responses forwards into the future from the biome to the species scale [85]. The difficulty of obtaining the required lengthy, high temporal resolution data series that is required by such models may potentially be overcome by using combinations of high-resolution palaeoecological data and independent climate records during key periods analogous to forecast changes in climate.

Two other sources of information that are often not considered in modelling approaches but can be obtained from historical and palaeoecological records are the legacy of human impact and increasing atmospheric CO_2 concentrations on the African landscapes. Both have clearly had an impact and continue to have a significant impact on African biota, and the potential for using a longerterm perspective to obtaining information necessary for modelling of these two drivers will briefly be discussed in the following section.

Predicted future levels of anthropogenically induced atmospheric CO2 indicate values ranging from 467 to 567 ppmv by 2050 and from 540 to 970 ppmv by the end of the twenty-first century. Ranges result from using different emission socio-economic scenarios [7,53]. Increasing CO₂ combined with warming affects photosynthesis and plant productivity, in what is known as the CO2 fertilization process [76,86-88]. When the fertilization effect is implemented in dynamic vegetation models for future climatic scenarios, the output predicts enhanced plant growth, an increase in ecosystem productivity and higher diversity [89]. Historical records based on long-term monitoring plots, remote sensing and forest inventories largely agree with these predictions [90,91]. In the savanna biome of Southern and Eastern Africa, for example, historical photographs over the past 100 years indicate increased woody thickening of the savanna [13,92,93]. Evidence indicates that this thickening is due to the CO₂ fertilization process, through a mechanism of which fire survival and suppression is a key component [12,13,93-95]. Moreover, the observed increase in woody shrubs and trees in these savannas has involved a reduction of C4 grasses in the understorey, implying fundamental changes of the species and functional assemblage of these communities [96]. This agrees with theorized increased competitiveness of trees and C3 plants in general under increased atmospheric

 CO_2 concentrations [97]. To add further support to this suggestion, *Acacia karroo* and *Terminalia sericea*, typical species of African savanna, were grown in growth chambers using a gradient of CO_2 treatments including that at the last glacial maximum (180 ppm) and above-ambient (450 ppm). In both species, as CO_2 concentration was increased, there was a significant increase in the mass of the root and shoot material [95].

Palaeoecological and historical records can also provide important additional information to understand impacts of future human activities upon the landscape. For example, changes in savanna fire regime of Southern Africa have been observed as a result of agro-pastoralism, especially in the past 4000 years, which may have potentially affected forest expansion [98]. In addition, in central West Africa, a recent study [99] has challenged the common belief that an arid event at around 2500 cal year BP caused a major decrease in forest [100–102], proposing instead that human land-use change was responsible for this vegetation change. Although this hypothesis remains under debate [103,104], it highlights the fact that more attention should be paid to past human impacts and their legacy on the current vegetation/climate of tropical Africa. This is a point often missed in modelling approaches and something that future studies should address when considering the relationship between vegetation and climate in Africa.

Funding statement. M.M-F. was financially supported by a Marie Curie Research Fellowship during the completion of this study (grant agreement no. 254206, project ECOCHANGE: creating conditions for persistence of biodiversity in the face of climate change). S.L. Burrough was funded by The Leverhulme Trust.

References

- Saatchi SS *et al.* 2011 Benchmark map of forest carbon stocks in tropical regions across three continents. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **108**, 9899–9904. (doi:10.1073/pnas.1019576108)
- 2. Hoare AL. 2007 *The use of non-timber forest products in the Congo Basin: constraints and opportunities*. London, UK: The Rainforest Foundation.
- Notenbaert A, Davies J, De Leeuw J, Said M, Herrero M, Manzano P, Waithaka M, Aboud A, Omondi S. 2012 Policies in support of pastoralism and biodiversity in the heterogeneous drylands of East Africa. *Pastoralism: Res. Policy Prac.* 2, 14. (doi:10. 1186/2041-7136-2-14)
- Walter A, Segerstedt A. 2012 International trade of biofuels: current trends and the potential role of Africa. In *Bioenergy for sustainable development in Africa* (eds R Janssen, D Rutz), pp. 147–162. Dordrecht, the Netherlands: Springer.
- Conway D, Allison E, Felstead R, Goulden M. 2005 Rainfall variability in East Africa: implications for natural resources management and livelihoods. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. A* 363, 49–54. (doi:10.1098/rsta. 2004.1475)
- Elith J, Leathwick JR. 2009 Species distribution models: ecological explanation and prediction across space and time. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* 40, 677–697. (doi:10.1146/annurev.ecolsys. 110308.120159)
- Nakicenovic N et al. 2000 Special report on emissions scenarios. Cambridge, UK: Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.
- Thuiller W, Broennimann O, Hughes G, Alkemade JRM, Midgley GF, Corsi F. 2006 Vulnerability of African mammals to anthropogenic climate change under conservative land transformation assumptions. *Glob. Change Biol.* 12, 424–440. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006.01115.x)
- McClean CJ *et al.* 2005 African plant diversity and dimate change. *Ann. Missouri Bot. Garden* 92, 139–152.

- Araújo MB, Pearson RG, Thuiller W, Erhard M. 2005 Validation of species – climate impact models under climate change. *Glob. Change Biol.* **11**, 1504 – 1513. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2005.01000.x)
- Hijmans RJ, Graham CH. 2006 The ability of climate envelope models to predict the effect of climate change on species distributions. *Glob. Change Biol.* 12, 2272 – 2281. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006. 01256.x)
- Bond WJ, Midgley GF, Woodward FI. 2003 The importance of low atmospheric CO₂ and fire in promoting the spread of grasslands and savannas. *Glob. Change Biol.* 9, 973–982. (doi:10.1046/j. 1365-2486.2003.00577.x)
- Bond WJ, Midgley GF. 2012 Carbon dioxide and the uneasy interactions of trees and savannah grasses. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B* 367, 601–612. (doi:10.1098/ rstb.2011.0182)
- Keenan T, Maria Serra J, Lloret F, Ninyerola M, Sabate S. 2011 Predicting the future of forests in the Mediterranean under climate change, with niche- and process-based models: CO₂ matters! *Glob. Change Biol.* **17**, 565–579. (doi:10.1111/j. 1365-2486.2010.02254.x)
- Feeley KJ, Silman MR. 2010 Biotic attrition from tropical forests correcting for truncated temperature niches. *Glob. Change Biol.* **16**, 1830–1836. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.02085.x)
- Smith B, Prentice IC, Sykes MT. 2001 Representation of vegetation dynamics in the modelling of terrestrial ecosystems: comparing two contrasting approaches within European climate space. *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* **10**, 621–637. (doi:10.1046/j. 1466-822X.2001.00256.x)
- Tierney JE, Lewis SC, Cook BI, LeGrande AN, Schmidt GA. 2011 Model, proxy and isotopic perspectives on the East African Humid Period. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **307**, 103–112. (doi:10.1016/j.epsl. 2011.04.038)
- Gritti ES, Cassignat C, Flores O, Bonnefille R, Chalié F, Guiot J, Jolly D. 2010 Simulated effects of a

seasonal precipitation change on the vegetation in tropical Africa. *Clim. Past* **6**, 169–178. (doi:10.5194/ cp-6-169-2010)

- Hély C, Braconnot P, Watrin J, Zheng W. 2009 Climate and vegetation: simulating the African humid period. *Comptes Rendus Geosci.* 341, 671–688. (doi:10.1016/j.crte.2009.07.002)
- Braconnot P, Harrison SP, Kageyama M, Bartlein PJ, Masson-Delmotte V, Abe-Ouchi A, Otto-Bliesner B, Zhao Y. 2012 Evaluation of climate models using palaeoclimatic data. *Nat. Clim. Change* 2, 417–424. (doi:10.1038/nclimate1456)
- Kageyama M *et al.* 2012 Mid-Holocene and last glacial maximum climate simulations with the IPSL model. I. Comparing IPSL_CM5A to IPSL_CM4. *Clim. Dyn.* 40, 2469-2495. (doi:10.1007/s00382-012-1488-8)
- Vamborg FSE, Brovkin V, Claussen M. 2011 The effect of a dynamic background albedo scheme on Sahel/Sahara precipitation during the mid-Holocene. *Clim. Past* 7, 117–131. (doi:10.5194/ cp-7-117-2011)
- Hély C, Bremond L, Alleaume S, Smith B, Sykes MT, Guiot J. 2006 Sensitivity of African biomes to changes in the precipitation regime. *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* **15**, 258–270. (doi:10.1111/j.1466-8238. 2006.00235.x)
- Watrin J, Lézine A-M, Hély C. 2009 Plant migration and plant communities at the time of the 'green Sahara'. *Comptes Rendus Geosci.* 341, 656–670. (doi:10.1016/j.crte.2009.06.007)
- 25. Seneviratne SI *et al.* 2012 Changes in climate extremes and their impacts on the natural physical environment. In *Managing the risks of extreme events and disasters to advance climate change adaptation a special report of Working Groups I and II of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (<i>IPCC*) (eds CB Field *et al.*), pp. 109–230. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- 26. Polcher J *et al.* 2011 AMMA's contribution to the evolution of prediction and decision-making systems

for West Africa. *Atmos. Sci. Lett.* **12**, 2–6. (doi:10. 1002/asl.320)

- Cook KH. 2008 Climate science: the mysteries of Sahel droughts. *Nat. Geosci.* 1, 647–648. (doi:10. 1038/ngeo320)
- Cook KH, Vizy EK. 2006 Coupled model simulations of the West African monsoon system: twentiethand twenty-first-century simulations. J. Clim. 19, 3681–3703. (doi:10.1175/JCLI3814.1)
- Black E, Slingo J, Sperber KR. 2003 An observational study of the relationship between excessively strong short rains in coastal east Africa and Indian ocean SST. *Mon. Weather Rev.* 131, 74–94. (doi:10.1175/ 1520-0493(2003)131<074:AOSOTR>2.0.CO;2)
- Shongwe ME, van Oldenborgh GJ, van den Hurk B, van Aalst M. 2011 Projected changes in mean and extreme precipitation in Africa under global warming. II. East Africa. J. Clim. 24, 3718–3733. (doi:10.1175/2010JCLI2883.1)
- Lézine A-M, Hély C, Grenier C, Braconnot P, Krinner G. 2011 Sahara and Sahel vulnerability to climate changes, lessons from Holocene hydrological data. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **30**, 3001–3012. (doi:10.1016/j. quascirev.2011.07.006)
- Drake NA, Blench RM, Armitage SJ, Bristow CS, White KH. 2011 Ancient watercourses and biogeography of the Sahara explain the peopling of the desert. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **108**, 458–462. (doi:10.1073/pnas.1012231108)
- Mayaux P, Bartholomé E, Fritz S, Belward A. 2004 A new land-cover map of Africa for the year 2000.
 J. Biogeogr. 31, 861–877. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2699.2004.01073.x)
- Tierney JE, Russell JM, Sinninghe Damsté JS, Huang Y, Verschuren D. 2011 Late quaternary behavior of the East African monsoon and the importance of the Congo air boundary. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **30**, 798–807. (doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2011.01.017)
- Hansingo K, Reason CJC. 2008 Modelling the atmospheric response to SST dipole patterns in the South Indian Ocean with a regional climate model. *Meteorol. Atmos. Phys.* **100**, 37–52. (doi:10.1007/ s00703-008-0294-7)
- Hansingo K, Reason CJC. 2009 Modelling the atmospheric response over southern Africa to SST forcing in the southeast tropical Atlantic and southwest subtropical Indian Oceans. *Int. J. Climatol.* 29, 1001–1012. (doi:10.1002/joc.1919)
- Hermes JC, Reason CJC. 2009 Variability in seasurface temperature and winds in the tropical south-east Atlantic Ocean and regional rainfall relationships. *Int. J. Climatol.* 29, 11–21. (doi:10.1002/joc.1711)
- Rouault M, Richard Y. 2003 Intensity and spatial extension of drought in South Africa at different time scales. *Water SA* 29, 489–500.
- Pohl B, Fauchereau N, Reason CJC, Rouault M. 2010 Relationships between the Antarctic oscillation, the Madden-Julian oscillation, and ENSO, and consequences for rainfall analysis. J. Clim. 23, 238–254. (doi:10.1175/2009JCLI2443.1)
- 40. Vigaud N, Richard Y, Rouault M, Fauchereau N. 2009 Moisture transport between the South Atlantic

Ocean and southern Africa: relationships with summer rainfall and associated dynamics. *Clim. Dyn.* **32**, 113–123. (doi:10.1007/s00382-008-0377-7)

- Shongwe ME, van Oldenborgh GJ, van den Hurk BJJM, van Aalst MK. 2010 Projected changes in mean and extreme precipitation in Africa under global warming. II. East Africa. J. Clim. 24, 3718–3733. (doi:10.1175/2010JCLI2883.1)
- Giannini A, Biasutti M, Held I, Sobel A. 2008 A global perspective on African climate. *Clim. Change* 90, 359-383. (doi:10.1007/s10584-008-9396-y)
- Engelbrecht CJ, Engelbrecht FA, Dyson LL. 2013 High-resolution model-projected changes in midtropospheric closed-lows and extreme rainfall events over southern Africa. *Int. J. Climatol.* 33, 173–187. (doi:10.1002/joc.3420)
- 44. Shongwe ME, van Oldenborgh GJ, van den Hurk BJJM, de Boer B, Coelho CAS, van Aalst MK. 2009 Projected changes in mean and extreme precipitation in Africa under global warming.
 I. Southern Africa. J. Clim. 22, 3819–3837. (doi:10. 1175/2009JCLI2317.1)
- Chou C, Tu J-Y, Tan P-H. 2007 Asymmetry of tropical precipitation change under global warming. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 34, L17708. (doi:10.1029/ 2007GL030327)
- Rowell DP. 2012 Sources of uncertainty in future changes in local precipitation. *Clim. Dyn.* **39**, 1929 – 1950. (doi:10.1007/s00382-011-1210-2)
- Taylor CM, Gounou A, Guichard F, Harris PP, Ellis RJ, Couvreux F, De Kauwe M. 2011 Frequency of Sahelian storm initiation enhanced over mesoscale soil-moisture patterns. *Nat. Geosci.* 4, 430–433. (doi:10.1038/ngeo1173)
- Taylor CM *et al.* 2011 New perspectives on land atmosphere feedbacks from the African monsoon multidisciplinary analysis. *Atmos. Sci. Lett.* 12, 38–44. (doi:10.1002/asl.336)
- Lee J-Y, Wang B. In press. Future change of global monsoon in the CMIP5. *Clim. Dyn.* (doi:10.1007/ s00382-012-1564-0)
- Ibrahim B, Polcher J, Karambiri H, Rockel B. 2012 Characterization of the rainy season in Burkina Faso and it's representation by regional climate models. *Clim. Dyn.* 39, 1287–1302. (doi:10.1007/s00382-011-1276-x)
- Roehrig R, Bouniol D, Guichard F, Hourdin F, Redelsperger J-L. In press. The present and future of the West African monsoon: a process-oriented assessment of CMIP5 simulations along the AMMA transect. J. Clim. (doi:10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00505.1)
- James R, Washington R. 2012 Changes in African temperature and precipitation associated with degrees of global warming. *Clim. Change* **117**, 859–872. (doi:10.1007/s10584-012-0581-7)
- Taylor KE, Stouffer RJ, Meehl GA. 2012 An overview of CMIP5 and the experiment design. *Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc.* 93, 485–498. (doi:10.1175/BAMS-D-11-00094.1)
- Ritchie JC, Eyles CH, Haynes CV. 1985 Sediment and pollen evidence for an early to mid-Holocene humid period in the eastern Sahara. *Nature* **314**, 352–355. (doi:10.1038/314352a0)

- Lézine A-M, Watrin J, Vincens A, Hely C. 2009 Are modern pollen data representative of west African vegetation? *Rev. Palaeobot. Palynol.* **156**, 265 – 276. (doi:10.1016/j.revpalbo.2009.02.001)
- 56. Hoelzmann P, Gasse F, Dupont LM, Salzmann U, Staubwasser M, Leuschner DC, Sirocko F. 2004 Palaeoenvironmental changes in the arid and sub arid belt (Sahara–Sahel–Arabian Peninsula) from 150 kyr to present. In *Past climate variability through Europe and Africa* (eds RW Battarbee, F GasseCE Stickley), pp. 219–256. Dordrecht, the Netherlands: Springer.
- Gasse F. 2000 Hydrological changes in the African tropics since the last glacial maximum. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 19, 189–211. (doi:10.1016/S0277-3791(99)00061-X)
- Jolly D *et al.* 1998 Biome reconstruction from pollen and plant macrofossil data for Africa and the Arabian peninsula at 0 and 6000 years. *J. Biogeogr.* 25, 1007 – 1027. (doi:10.1046/j.1365-2699.1998. 00238.x)
- Berke MA, Johnson TC, Werne JP, Grice K, Schouten S, Sinninghe Damsté JS. 2012 Molecular records of climate variability and vegetation response since the Late Pleistocene in the Lake Victoria basin, East Africa. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 55, 59–74. (doi:10.1016/j. quascirev.2012.08.014)
- Tierney JE, Russell JM, Huang Y. 2010 A molecular perspective on Late Quaternary climate and vegetation change in the Lake Tanganyika basin, East Africa. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 29, 787–800. (doi:10. 1016/j.quascirev.2009.11.030)
- Niedermeyer EM, Schefuß E, Sessions AL, Mulitza S, Mollenhauer G, Schulz M, Wefer G. 2010 Orbitaland millennial-scale changes in the hydrologic cycle and vegetation in the western African Sahel: insights from individual plant wax δD and δ¹³C. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 29, 2996–3005. (doi:10.1016/j. quascirev.2010.06.039)
- Collins JA, Schefuß E, Mulitza S, Prange M, Werner M, Tharammal T, Paul A, Wefer G. 2013 Estimating the hydrogen isotopic composition of past precipitation using leaf-waxes from western Africa. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 65, 88–101. (doi:10.1016/j. quascirev.2013.01.007)
- Schefuß E, Schouten S, Schneider RR. 2005 Climatic controls on central African hydrology during the past 20,000 years. *Nature* 437, 1003 – 1006. (doi:10. 1038/nature03945)
- Lézine A-M, Zheng W, Braconnot P, Krinner G. 2011 Late Holocene plant and climate evolution at Lake Yoa, northern Chad: pollen data and climate simulations. *Clim. Past* 7, 1351–1362. (doi:10.5194/ cp-7-1351-2011)
- Ritchie JC, Haynes CV. 1987 Holocene vegetation zonation in the eastern Sahara. *Nature* 330, 645-647. (doi:10.1038/330645a0)
- Edwards EJ, Smith SA. 2010 Phylogenetic analyses reveal the shady history of C₄ grasses. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **107**, 2532–2537. (doi:10.1073/pnas. 0909672107)
- 67. Edwards EJ, Osborne CP, Strömberg CAE, Smith SA, Consortium CG. 2010 The origins of C₄ grasslands:

integrating evolutionary and ecosystem science. *Science* **328**, 587–591. (doi:10.1126/science.1177216)

- Vincens A, Buchet G, Servant M, ECOFIT Mbalang collaborators. 2010 Vegetation response to the 'African humid period' termination in Central Cameroon (7° N): new pollen insight from Lake Mbalang. *Clim. Past* 6, 281–294. (doi:10.5194/cp-6-281-2010)
- 69. Bertaux J, Sifeddine A, Schwartz D, Vincens A, Elenga H (eds) 1996 Enregistrement sédimentologique de la phase sèche d'Afrique Equatoriale C. 3000 BP par la spectrométrie IR dans les lacs Sinnda et Kitina (Sud Congo). In *Dynamique à Long Terme des Ecosystèmes Forestiers Intertropicaux : Symposium; 1996/03/20-22;* Paris: Orstom.
- 70. Elenga H, Schwartz D, Vincens A, Bertaux J, de Namur C, Martin L, Wirrmann D, Servant M. 1996 Diagramme pollinique holocène du lac Kitina (Congo): mise en évideice de changements paléobotaniques et paléoclimatiques dans le massif fores tierdu Mayombe. *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie de Sciences. Série Ila: Sciences de la Terre et des Planétes* **1322**, 403–410.
- Elenga H, Schwartz D, Vincens A. 1994 Pollen evidence of late Quaternary vegetation and inferred climate changes in Congo. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* **109**, 345–356. (doi:10.1016/0031-0182(94)90184-8)
- Maley J, Brenac P. 1998 Vegetation dynamics, palaeoenvironments and climatic changes in the forests of western Cameroon during the last 28,000 years BP. *Rev. Palaeobot. Palynol.* 99, 157–187. (doi:10.1016/S0034-6667(97)00047-X)
- Reynaud-Farrera I, Maley J, Wirrmann D. 1996 Végétation et climat dans les forêts du Sud-Ouest Cameroun depuis 4 770 ans BP: analyse pollinique des sédiments du Lac Ossa. *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie de Sciences Série IIa: Sciences de la Terre et des Planètes* **1322**, 749–755.
- 74. Talbot MR, Livingstone DA, Palmer PG, Maley J, Melack JM, Delibrias G, Gulliksen S. 1984 Preliminary results from sediment cores from Lake Bosumtwi, Ghana. In *Palaeoecology of Africa and the surrounding islands* (eds JA Coetzee, EM Van Zinderen Bakker), pp. 173–192. Amsterdam, the Netherlands: Balkema.
- Vincens A. 1993 Nouvelle séquence pollinique du lac Tanganyika: 30,000 ans d'histoire botanique et climatique du bassin Nord. *Rev. Palaeobot. Palynol.* 78, 381–394. (doi:10.1016/0034-6667(93)90072-3)
- Willis KJ, MacDonald GM. 2011 Long-term ecological records and their relevance to climate change predictions for a warmer world. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* 42, 267–287. (doi:10.1146/ annurev-ecolsys-102209-144704)
- 77. IPCC. 2007 Climate change 2007: the physical science basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge, UK: IPCC.

- Kobashi T, Severinghaus JP, Barnola J-M. 2008 4 ± 1.5°C abrupt warming 11,270 yr ago identified from trapped air in Greenland ice. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 268, 397–407. (doi:10.1016/j.epsl. 2008.01.032)
- Steffensen JP *et al.* 2008 High-resolution Greenland ice core data show abrupt climate change happens in few years. *Science* **321**, 680–684. (doi:10.1126/ science.1157707)
- Garcin Y, Vincens A, Williamson D, Buchet G, Guiot J. 2007 Abrupt resumption of the African monsoon at the Younger Dryas – Holocene climatic transition. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 26, 690–704. (doi:10.1016/j. quascirev.2006.10.014)
- Vincens A, Garcin Y, Buchet G. 2007 Influence of rainfall seasonality on African lowland vegetation during the Late Quaternary: pollen evidence from Lake Masoko, Tanzania. *J. Biogeogr.* 34, 1274– 1288. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2699.2007.01698.x)
- Bonnefille R, Chalié F, Guiot J, Vincens A. 1992 Quantitative estimates of full glacial temperatures in equatorial Africa from palynological data. *Clim. Dyn.* 6, 251–257. (doi:10.1007/BF00193538)
- Kröpelin S *et al.* 2008 Climate-driven ecosystem succession in the Sahara: the past 6000 years. *Science* **320**, 765–768. (doi:10.1126/science. 1154913)
- Willis KJ, Bailey RM, Bhagwat SA, Birks HJB. 2010 Biodiversity baselines, thresholds and resilience: testing predictions and assumptions using palaeoecological data. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 25, 583–591. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2010.07.006)
- Bailey RM. 2011 Spatial and temporal signatures of fragility and threshold proximity in modelled semiarid vegetation. *Proc. R. Soc. B* 278, 1064–1071. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2010.1750)
- Willis KJ, Bhagwat SA. 2009 Biodiversity and climate change. *Science* **326**, 806–807. (doi:10.1126/ science.1178838)
- Norby RJ *et al.* 2005 Forest response to elevated CO₂ is conserved across a broad range of productivity. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **102**, 18 052 – 18 056. (doi:10.1073/pnas.0509478102)
- 88. Woodward Fl. 2008 Ecology: forest air conditioning. *Nature* **454**, 422-423. (doi:10.1038/454422a)
- Woodward FI. 2010 Carbon dioxide: more cause célèbre than bête noire? *Clim. Change* **100**, 211–213. (doi:10.1007/s10584-010-9820-y)
- Lewis SL, Lloyd J, Sitch S, Mitchard ETA, Laurance WF. 2009 Changing ecology of tropical forests: evidence and drivers. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* 40, 529-549. (doi:10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.39. 110707.173345)
- Pan Y *et al.* 2011 A large and persistent carbon sink in the world's forests. *Science* 333, 988–993. (doi:10.1126/science.1201609)
- Marchant R, Finch J, Kinyanjui R, Muiruri V, Mumbi C, Platts PJ, Rucina S. 2010 Palaeoenvironmental perspectives for sustainable development in East

Africa. *Clim. Past Discuss.* **6**, 963-1007. (doi:10. 5194/cpd-6-963-2010)

- Wigley BJ, Bond WJ, Hoffman MT. 2010 Thicket expansion in a South African savanna under divergent land use: local versus global drivers? *Glob. Change Biol.* **16**, 964–976. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.02030.x)
- 94. Wakeling JL, Cramer MD, Bond WJ. 2012 The savanna-grassland 'treeline': why don't savanna trees occur in upland grasslands? *J. Ecol.* **100**, 381–391. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2745.2011. 01921.x)
- Kgope BS, Bond WJ, Midgley GF. 2010 Growth responses of African savanna trees implicate atmospheric [CO₂] as a driver of past and current changes in savanna tree cover. *Austral Ecol.* 35, 451–463. (doi:10.1111/j.1442-9993.2009. 02046.x)
- Parr CL, Gray EF, Bond WJ. 2012 Cascading biodiversity and functional consequences of a global change-induced biome switch. *Divers. Distrib.* 18, 493–503. (doi:10.1111/j.1472-4642.2012.00882.x)
- 97. Ripley BS, Cunniff J, Osborne CP. 2013 Photosynthetic acclimation and resource use by the C₃ and C₄ subspecies of *Alloteropsis semialata* in low CO₂ atmospheres. *Glob. Change Biol.* **19**, 900–910. (doi:10.1111/gcb.12091)
- Archibald S, Staver AC, Levin SA. 2012 Evolution of human-driven fire regimes in Africa. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **109**, 847–852. (doi:10.1073/pnas. 1118648109)
- Bayon G, Dennielou B, Etoubleau J, Ponzevera E, Toucanne S, Bermell S. 2012 Intensifying weathering and land use in iron age central Africa. *Science* 335, 1219–1222. (doi:10.1126/science. 1215400)
- 100. Vincens A *et al.* 1999 Forest response to climate changes in Atlantic equatorial Africa during the last 4000 years BP and inheritance on the modern landscapes. *J. Biogeogr.* **26**, 879–885. (doi:10. 1046/j.1365-2699.1999.00333.x)
- Maley J. 2002 A catastrophic destruction of African forests about 2500 years ago still exerts a major influence on present vegetation formations. *IDS Bull.* **33**, 13–30. (doi:10.1111/j.1759-5436.2002. tb00003.x)
- 102. Neumann K, Bostoen K, Höhn A, Kahlheber S, Ngomanda A, Tchiengué B. 2012 First farmers in the central African rainforest: a view from southern Cameroon. *Quat. Int.* **249**, 53–62. (doi:10.1016/j. guaint.2011.03.024)
- Neumann K *et al.* 2012 Comment on 'intensifying weathering and land use in iron age central Africa'. *Science* **337**, 1040. (doi:10.1126/science. 1221747)
- 104. Maley J, Giresse P, Doumenge C, Favier C. 2012 Comment on 'intensifying weathering and land use in iron age Central Africa'. *Science* 337, 1040. (doi:10.1126/science.1221820)