# An Explicit Study on Walking Speeds of Pedestrians on Stairs 

Taku Fujiyama, MPhil/PhD student, Nick Tyler, Chadwick Professor of Civil Engineering

Centre for Transport Studies, University College London United Kingdom

## SUMMARY

In order to predict a pedestrian's walking speed on stairs from his/her characteristics of and those of the stairs, the relationship between the walking speed of a pedestrian on stairs and his/her characteristics, and the relationship between the pedestrians' walking speeds on stairs and the stair-gradients were investigated. It is suggested that Leg Extensor Power shows a strong correlation to walking speeds of elderly people on stairs, the stair-gradient has a linear relationship with horizontal walking speeds on stairs, and Leg Extensor Power could be used to represent a unique walking speed of an elderly pedestrian on stairs. The obtained data to be used in our pedestrian simulation model take account of personal characteristics as well as stair characteristics when predicting the walking speed of a pedestrian.

Keywords: Pedestrian, Walking Speed, Stair
Definition of words, abbreviation
In this paper, we define some usage/abbreviation of words as follows:
Horizontal walking speed
Vertical walking speed
Inclined walking speed
Fig. 1 is a schematic representation of these speeds.
LEP: Leg Extensor Power (unit: Watt)
Walking patterns:
In the experiment, we have four walking patterns, namely normally ascending, normally descending, fast ascending and fast descending.


Fig 1. Definition of speeds

## 1. INTRODUCTION

## 1-1. Background

Understanding movements of pedestrians is essential to plan and design transport facilities. Hitherto, many studies on pedestrians have been conducted, and the walking
speed has been one of the major topics in that research. Research on this issue has been basically observational and has regarded pedestrians as a flow: e.g. (Hankin, 1958), (Older, 1968) and (Daly, 1991). Only a limited number of studies have been done on the walking speed of pedestrians and their characteristics with the intention of designing pedestrian crossings (signal timing) (e.g. Bennett, 2001). Their findings were that people aged 62-65 yr or more walk more slowly than younger people: (Knoblauch, 1996), (Peschel, 1957), (Tregenza, 1976), and that the walking speed of women tends to be lower than that of men (Peschel, 1957). While these studies focused on walking speed on a flat surface, Fruin (1971) looked at the walking speeds of pedestrians on stairs. (Fruin's results are compared with ours in the discussion section of this paper).

In physiology, several studies on the walking speed on a flat surface have been conducted in laboratory environments. They have investigated factors affecting the walking speed. Himann (1988) reported that the walking speed was associated with height before 62 yr old, and with height and age after 62 yr old. Bendall (1989) suggested that calf strength and some other factors accounted for the walking speed. Although there have been studies on the walking speed on a flat surface, physiological research has seldom considered the walking speed on stairs. Physiological interest has gone rather to the maximum climbable riser-height of a single step: e.g. (Voorbij, 1998). In architecture, Templer (1992) proposed an equation to predict the walking speed on stairs based on the proportions of stairs, namely riser-height and tread-length. However, he did not consider the characteristics of pedestrians, and the background for the equation is obscure.

Some indices have been used to describe strength or outputs of leg muscle. Among them, Bassey (1992) showed that Leg Extensor Power (LEP) was well correlated with the walking speed on a flat surface with $r=0.80$ among elderly people. The relationship between LEP and the walking speed on a flat surface was examined also by Mockett (1996), who found a significant relationship between LEP and categorised descriptors of the walking speeds, where the sample size was 1980 . There has been a study of the relationship between LEP and the speed of a stair climbing activity among elderly people (Bassey, 1992). However, this result could not infer a direct relationship between the walking speed on stairs and LEP because the experiment did not distinguish between ascending and descending speeds, and the stairs in the experiment consisted only of four steps. This was understandable in the light of Bassey's primary aim, which was to validate LEP by examining relationships between LEP and various physical performances, one part of which was stair climbing.

## 1-2. Objectives of this research

This paper focuses on the relationship between the characteristics of pedestrians and their walking speed in order to predict pedestrians' walking speed by their characteristics. We concentrate on the walking speed on stairs because stairs are a critical path in multi-floor transport facilities in terms of being a barrier both for elderly people and for the evacuation of all pedestrians. Especially, we are interested in the characteristics of pedestrians related to ageing because of the expectation that more elderly people may use public transport facilities, and their walking characteristics may be different from those for younger people. Based on existing studies of walking speeds on a flat surface, it is hypothesised that LEP may show a relationship with the walking speed on stairs. Also, we presume that the proportion of stairs may influence the
walking speed on the stairs. We select the stair-gradient as an index of the stair proportion, and examine the relationship between the walking speed and the stair-gradient. Obtained knowledge/data will be of use in our heterogeneous simulation model of pedestrians, which can represent a variety of pedestrians including the elderly.

## 2. METHOD

Data were drawn from two study groups.
Group 1) 6 healthy men and 12 healthy women, aged between 60 and 81 . The participants were recruited at meetings of societies for elderly people. All of them could walk and ascend/descend stairs in their daily lives without any significant problems.
Group 2) 7 healthy men and 8 healthy women, aged between 25 and 60 . They were students and staff at University College London.

In the first stage of the experiment, each participant's personal characteristics, namely height, weight and LEP were measured. To measure LEP, we used the leg power rig, developed by University of Nottingham, with which LEP can be measured without any medical operation. The measurement procedure of LEP was in line with Bassey (1990). Each participant's age and any current significant health problem were obtained by means of a questionnaire.

After the measurement stage, each participant was instructed to ascend/descend four sets of stairs, as well as to walk on a flat surface, inside buildings of University College London. A description of the stairs is given in Table 1. Each set of stairs consisted of one flight. All participants wore comfortable clothes and flat walking shoes. At each set of stairs, the participants were asked 1) to ascend the stairs at his/her normal speed, 2) to descend at his/her normal speed, 3) to ascend at his/her fast speed, and finally 4) to descend at his/her fast speed. Participants could use the handrail and miss stairs according to their preference. Between procedures 2 ) and 3), participants took a rest sitting on a chair for more than two minutes so that fatigue would not affect the results. The time taken to ascend/descend the stairs was measured by a stopwatch to calculate the walking speed. In order to avoid any effects from acceleration, participants were asked to start walking on the landing one metre before the first stair, and to finish walking one metre after the last stair. For the walking speed on a flat surface, participants were asked to walk twice for each normal and fast speed, and the averaged time was used to calculate the walking speed.

Table 1. Characteristics of the stairs used in the experiment

| Stair No. | Number of steps | Proportion |  |  | Total length |  | Availability of handrail |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Riserheight | Treadlength | StairGradient | $\begin{array}{\|c} \text { Horizontal } \\ \text { length } \end{array}$ | Vertical length |  |
|  |  | mm | mm | deg | m | m |  |
| Stair1 | 12 | 185 | 230 | 38.8 | 2.76 | 2.22 | $\checkmark$ |
| Stair2 | 12 | 175 | 250 | 35.0 | 3.00 | 2.10 | $\checkmark$ |
| Stair3 | 15 | 157 | 267 | 30.5 | 4.01 | 2.36 | $\checkmark$ |
| Stair4 | 9 | 152 | 332 | 24.6 | 2.99 | 1.37 | $\checkmark$ |
| Flat surfac |  |  | - |  | 8.00 | - | $\times$ |

## 3. RESULTS

## 3-1. Physical characteristics

The participants' physical characteristics are displayed in a summary form in Table 2. The significance of difference was tested by unpaired $t$ tests. Between the two study groups, there was a significant difference in age, height and LEP. No participant reported notable illness affecting his/her walking on stairs. One participant in Group 1 was not able to ascend/descend No. 2 stairs at her fast speed. A wide variation of LEP was observed both in Group 1 and in Group 2.

Table 2. Characteristics of the participants

|  | Group 1 | Group 2 | Significance <br> of difference |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sample number | 18 | 15 | - |
| (male sample) | 6 | 7 | - |
| (female sample) | 12 | 8 | - |
| Age (yr) | $71 \pm 5.9$ | $34.5 \pm 12.7$ | $<0.001$ |
| Height (cm) | $161 \pm 7.2$ | $174 \pm 8.2$ | $<0.001$ |
| Weight (kg) | $67.3 \pm 11.7$ | $66.4 \pm 13.9$ | NS |
| LEP $(\mathrm{W})$ | $64.1 \pm 38.6$ | $197.7 \pm 78.5$ | $<0.001$ |

Results are given as mean $\pm$ SD.
Significance of difference tested using unpaired $t$ tests.
NS = not significant

## 3-2. Performance

Performances of the participants are shown in Table 3. The significance of difference was tested by unpaired $t$ tests. More significant differences were observed for ascending/descending at fast speed than at normal speed.

## 3-3. Relationship between the walking speeds on stairs and the walking speeds on a flat surface

The correlation between the walking speed on a flat surface and the horizontal walking speed on stairs is displayed in Table 4. The results for Group 1 showed a strong correlation regardless of the walking patterns.

## 3-4. Relationship between the walking speeds and physical characteristics

The correlation between horizontal walking speeds and physical characteristics is presented in Table 5. To illustrate the comparison, we have selected Stair 2, as this stair-gradient is the steepest within the UK building regulations (DETR, 1998). LEP showed a strong correlation with all speeds in Group 1, whereas age and other characteristics did not. Fig. 2 shows the relationship between LEP and the horizontal speed for ascending at a normal speed. Although there may be a linear relation between LEP and walking speed in Group 1, this is not so clearly the case in Group 2. Fig. 3 displays the relationship between speed and age. No obvious relation was suggested between age and walking speeds in either group. These trends were confirmed also in other sets of stairs.

Table 3. Horizontal walking speeds of the participants
(unit: m/s)

| Patterns of speeds | Stairs |  | Group1 | Group2 | Significance of Difference |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Stair No | Degree |  |  |  |
| Normally ascending | Stair 1 | 38.8 | $0.44 \pm 0.12$ | $0.48 \pm 0.10$ | NS |
|  | Stair 2 | 35 | $0.52 \pm 0.12$ | $0.56 \pm 0.13$ | NS |
|  | Stair 3 | 30.5 | $0.59 \pm 0.13$ | $0.63 \pm 0.14$ | NS |
|  | Stair 4 | 24.6 | $0.73 \pm 0.17$ | $0.76 \pm 0.17$ | NS |
| Normally descending | Stair 1 | 38.8 | $0.47 \pm 0.13$ | $0.59 \pm 0.14$ | $<0.05$ |
|  | Stair 2 | 35 | $0.58 \pm 0.16$ | $0.65 \pm 0.14$ | NS |
|  | Stair 3 | 30.5 | $0.64 \pm 0.15$ | $0.74 \pm 0.17$ | NS |
|  | Stair 4 | 24.6 | $0.80 \pm 0.23$ | $0.87 \pm 0.19$ | NS |
| Fast ascending | Stair 1 | 38.8 | $0.61 \pm 0.18$ | $0.78 \pm 0.24$ | $<0.05$ |
|  | Stair 2 | 35 | $0.69 \pm 0.20$ | $0.91 \pm 0.31$ | $<0.05$ |
|  | Stair 3 | 30.5 | $0.79 \pm 0.20$ | $0.97 \pm 0.28$ | $<0.05$ |
|  | Stair 4 | 24.6 | $1.00 \pm 0.23$ | $1.16 \pm 0.31$ | NS |
| Fast descending | Stair 1 | 38.8 | $0.62 \pm 0.17$ | $0.87 \pm 0.20$ | $<0.001$ |
|  | Stair 2 | 35 | $0.70 \pm 0.18$ | $0.92 \pm 0.19$ | $<0.01$ |
|  | Stair 3 | 30.5 | $0.84 \pm 0.18$ | $1.08 \pm 0.23$ | $<0.01$ |
|  | Stair 4 | 24.6 | $1.01 \pm 0.26$ | $1.18 \pm 0.20$ | $<0.05$ |
| Normal walking on a flat surface |  |  | $1.31 \pm 0.23$ | $1.40 \pm 0.17$ | NS |
| Fast walking on a flat surface |  |  | $1.71 \pm 0.29$ | $1.84 \pm 0.15$ | NS |

Results are given as mean $\pm$ SD.
Significance of difference tested using unpaired $t$ tests.
NS $=$ not significant
Table 4. Correlation coefficients between horizontal walking speed on stairs and on a flat surface

|  | Group 1 |  | Group2 |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Walking on a flat surface | Walking on a flat surface |  |  |
|  | Normal speed | Fast speed | Normal speed | Fast speed |
| Normally Ascending | 0.90 | 0.80 | 0.52 | 0.41 |
| Normally Descending | 0.73 | 0.67 | 0.46 | 0.55 |
| Fast Ascending | 0.70 | 0.85 | 0.55 | 0.77 |
| Fast Descending | 0.72 | 0.74 | 0.68 | 0.78 |

Table 5. Correlation coefficients between physical characteristics and horizontal walking speeds on Stair2 and walking speed on a flat surface

|  |  | Group 1 |  |  |  |  | Group2 |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Age <br> (yr) | Weight <br> (kg) | Height <br> (cm) | LEP <br> (W) | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { LEP/ } \\ \text { weight } \\ \text { (W/kg) } \\ \hline \end{array}$ | Age <br> (yr) | Weight $(\mathrm{kg})$ | Height <br> (cm) | LEP <br> (W) | LEP/ weight (W/kg) |
| Speed on stair 2 | Normally Ascending | -0.34 | 0.03 | 0.08 | 0.79 | 0.76 | -0.23 | -0.25 | 0.12 | 0.23 | 0.17 |
|  | Normally Descending | -0.37 | 0.04 | -0.09 | 0.68 | 0.71 | -0.07 | -0.60 | -0.09 | -0.05 | -0.03 |
|  | Fast <br> Ascending | -0.14 | 0.18 | -0.02 | 0.76 | 0.82 | -0.43 | -0.07 | 0.29 | 0.37 | 0.27 |
|  | Fast <br> Descending | -0.32 | 0.25 | 0.09 | 0.71 | 0.71 | -0.20 | -0.22 | 0.17 | 0.36 | 0.37 |
| Speed <br> on a <br> flat <br> surface | Normally | -0.23 | 0.23 | 0.16 | 0.89 | 0.82 | -0.11 | 0.11 | 0.25 | 0.52 | 0.58 |
|  | Fast | -0.14 | 0.41 | 0.03 | 0.81 | 0.80 | -0.45 | -0.20 | 0.15 | 0.24 | 0.23 |



Fig 2. Relation between LEP and normally ascending speed (horizontal speed, Stair 2)


Fig 3. Relation between age and normally ascending speed (horizontal speed, Stair 2)

## 3-5. Relationship between walking speeds on stairs and stair characteristics

Fig. 4 shows the relationship between stair-gradients and the study groups' mean ascending speeds: horizontal/ vertical/ inclined speeds at both normal and fast speeds to ascend Stair 2. The results suggested a linear relationship between the stair-gradient and the horizontal walking speed. This trend was also confirmed in other walking patterns in the other sets of stairs.


Fig 4. Relation between stair-gradients and ascending speeds on Stair 2: Horizontal/ Vertical/ Inclined speeds

## 4. DISCUSSION

The purpose of this study was to investigate the relationship between the walking speed and physical characteristics to predict the walking speed of a variety of pedestrians by their characteristics and the stair-gradient. The main results may be summarised by pointing out, first, that as shown in Table 5 LEP displayed a strong correlation with walking speeds of pedestrians on stairs among the elderly participants (Group1), whereas it did not among the young participants (Group 2). This result is similar to that in a study on the relationship between the walking speed on a flat surface and the leg strength (Buchner, 1996). These results can be explained by "reserved capacity" proposed by Buchner, where from 0 to a certain point ("threshold") leg power is necessary for a certain task and therefore the performance corresponds to the leg strength, but above this point further increase of leg strength does not necessarily improve the performance (Fig. 5 is a schematic representation of this model.). As the young participants may have had a greater LEP than this required amount, they did not show a strong correlation.

Bassey (1992) used "LEP divided by weight" as an index to examine a leg power function, based on the assumption that during the performance leg power is used to move body mass, and consequently the index should be related also to the body mass. However, in our experiment "LEP" alone showed a higher correlation. Table 5 shows that in each walking pattern LEP alone has almost the same correlation coefficient for walking speed as does LEP/weight. For simplicity, we used LEP for the further analyse.


Fig.5. Threshold model by Buchner

Height did not show a high correlation with the walking speed on stairs either in the elderly or the younger group. This contrasts with Himann (1988), which suggested that height was associated to the walking speed on a flat surface for all ages. On the other hand, Voorbij (1998) reported that whereas at the comfortable step-height the leg length had the most influence, at the maximum step-height age seemed to have the strongest influence. The results can be explained by assuming that for tasks which do not require much vertical movement of body mass, height is the dominant factor, but for tasks where body mass movement is essential, the importance of height becomes relatively small.

Age also failed to show a high correlation with the walking speed on a flat surface. The correlation efficient of our study was similar to that of Bendall (1989), which examined the relationship between the walking speed on a flat surface and a variety of indices. Meanwhile, LEP is supposed to have a strong correlation with the age. For simplicity, we may use only LEP for prediction of the walking speed in order to avoid the duplication of variables (Scalfia, 1987).

An interesting result in our experiment was that the participants showed a high correlation between their walking speeds on a flat surface and on stairs. The choice of the walking speed is a function of the step frequency and the step length used (Himann 1988). For walking on stairs, the step length is restricted by tread length of stairs, unless people miss stairs. The strong correlation may mean that people use the same or similar step frequency both for stairs and for a flat surface.

Also, we have found that horizontal walking speeds may have a linear relationship with the stair-gradient. Inclined speed showed the same tendency, but we can consider that the inclined speed was affected by the tendency of the horizontal speed. Although we have not examined this relationship statistically because of the shortage of sample stairs, it may be reasonable to include the stair-gradient as a variable for the prediction of the walking speed on stairs.

The elderly participants showed a strong correlation between LEP and the walking speed, and therefore LEP can be a variable to predict their walking speed. However, the young participants did not show such a strong correlation between the walking speed and any personal characteristics. How can we predict walking speeds of young people? Given that the step length is restricted on stairs, the step frequency may be a dominant
factor to decide the walking speed. One solution is to find a factor which determines step frequency, which may be an index of agility of the body. Cunningham (1982) reported that the speed of selected walking paces on a flat surface was associated with maximal aerobic power among people aged from 19 to 66 . An index which describes aerobic capacity may show a higher correlation with the walking speed on stairs. Sports Council (1992) has conducted a national fitness survey including these indices, but consideration of cultural differences may be necessary when using these data.

Comparison of mean walking speeds on stairs between this study and Fruin (1971) was not consistent (See Table 6). Fruin's result was slower than ours for the elderly group. One possible reason is the difference between individual laboratory experiments and observation in actual facilities where people also consider surrounding people. This suggests that in prediction of the walking speed on stairs it may be reasonable to take account of the effect of the surrounding people.

Table 6. Comparison between our results and Fruin (1971)

|  | Stair gradient | Ascending |  |  |  | Descending |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Elderly |  | Young |  | Elderly |  | Young |  |
|  |  | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| This study | 38.8 | 0.41 | 0.46 | 0.50 | 0.47 | 0.46 | 0.48 | 0.61 | 0.57 |
|  | 35.0 | 0.50 | 0.53 | 0.57 | 0.56 | 0.60 | 0.57 | 0.62 | 0.67 |
|  | 30.5 | 0.56 | 0.60 | 0.65 | 0.62 | 0.64 | 0.64 | 0.72 | 0.76 |
|  | 24.6 | 0.68 | 0.76 | 0.77 | 0.75 | 0.80 | 0.80 | 0.82 | 0.91 |
| Fruin(1971) | 32 | 0.43 | 0.39 | 0.69 | 0.51 | 0.57 | 0.47 | 0.69 | 0.51 |
|  | 27 | 0.41 | 0.45 | 0.81 | 0.65 | 0.60 | 0.56 | 0.81 | 0.65 |

Horizontal walking speeds ( $\mathrm{m} / \mathrm{s}$ )
(Stair-gradient: (degree))
Data of Fruin: Data of pedestrians aged more than 50 is applied into "Elderly" Data of pedestrians aged from 30 to 50 is applied into "Young"

In our experiment, some people used the handrail when ascending/descending stairs, while others did not. Also, some younger participants passed a step especially when ascending in "fast mode." Further analysis on effects of the handrail will appear elsewhere.

In conclusion, LEP showed a strong correlation with the walking speed on stairs among the elderly participants, as well as with the walking speed on a flat surface, and consequently LEP can be used to predict the walking speed for elderly people on stairs. Age, height, weight may be unnecessary variables to predict the walking speed. However the wide variation of LEP scores suggests that although it might be ignored when predicting walking speeds on stairs for younger people, it should be recorded individually for elderly people. Thus, our simulation model will need to be able to model individual participants explicitly in order to be able to investigate the effect of stairs on their walking ability and the effect of their presence in a group of people using a given flight of stairs. Based on the presented results, we are now developing an explicit pedestrian simulation model, which can represent a variety of pedestrians including elderly people on stairs with different stair-gradients. Prediction of the walking speed from the characteristics of pedestrians and demographic data will be presented in another paper.

## REFERENCES

Bassey, E. J. et al, (1992), Leg power and functional performance in very old men and women, Clinical science, Vol. 82, pp321-327
Bendall, M. J. et al, (1989), Factors affecting walking speed of Elderly people, Age and aging, Vol. 18, pp327-332
Benntt, S. et al, (2001), Pedestrian movement characteristics at signalised intersections, paper presented at $23^{\text {rd }}$ Conference of Australian Institute of Transport Research, Monash University, Melbourne, Australia, December
Buchner, D. M. et al, (1996), Evidence for a non-linear relationship between leg strength and gait speed, Age and ageing, Vol.25, pp386-391
Cunningham, D. A. et al, (1982), Determinants of self-selected walking pace across age 19 to 66, Journal of gerontology, Vol.37, pp560-564
Daly, P. N. et al (1991), Pedestrian speed/flow relationship for underground stations, Traffic engineering and control, Vol. 32(2), pp75-77
DETR (1998), The Building Regulations 1991: Approved document M, (1999 edition), The stationary office, London, UK
Fruin, J. J. (1971), Pedestrian planning and design, Metropolitan association of urban designers and environmental planners, New York, USA
Hankin, B. D. and Wright, R. A. (1958), Passenger flow in subways, Operational research quarterly, Vol. 9(2), pp81-88
Himann, J. E. et al, (1988), Age-related changes in speed of walking, Medicine and science in sports and exercise, Vol.20(2), pp161-166
Knoblauch, R. L. et al, (1996), Field studies of pedestrian walking speed and start-up time, Transportation research record, Vol. 1538, pp27-38
Mockett, S. P. et al, (1996), Leg extensor power and walking pace, Medicine and science in sports and exercise, Vol.28(5)S, pp188s
Older, S. J. (1968), Movement of pedestrians on footways in shopping streets, Traffic engineering and control, Vol. 10(4), pp160-163
Peschel, R. (1957), Untersuchungen über die leistangsfähigkeit ungeschützter fussgängerüberwege, (Research into the capacity of unprotected pedestrian crossing) (in German), Sttassertechnik, Vol 6, pp63-7
Scalfia, C. T. and Edholm, O. G. (1987), Problems with step-wise regression in research on aging and recommended alternatives, Journal of gerontology, Vol.42, pp579-583
Sports Council et al, (1992), Allied dunbar national fitness survey, London, UK
Templer, J. A. (1992), The staircase, MIT Press, Massachusetts, USA
Tregenza, P. (1976), The design of interior circulation, Crosby lockwood staples, London
Voorbij, A. I. M. and Steenbekkers, L. P. A. (1998), Step height, Design-relevant characteristics of ageing users, (ed.) Steenbekkers, L, P, A and van Beijsterveldt, C, E, M, Delft university press: Delft, Netherlands

## ACKNOWLEDMENTS

The cooperation of Dr. S. Harridge at Department of Physiology, University College London, Mr A. Kemp at Camden Council and Ms M. Bieber at University of Third Age is gratefully acknowledged. This work would not have been possible without enthusiastic cooperation of Design/Age Class at University Third Age in London and other volunteers living in London borough of Camden.

## AUTHORS' CONTACT

T. FUJIYAMA (e-mail: taku.fujiyama@ucl.ac.uk)
N. TYLER (e-mail: n.tyler@ucl.ac.uk)

Accessibility Research Group, Centre for Transport Studies, University College London, Gower Street, London, WC1E 6BT, United Kingdom

