

The Church in Andalusia during the Franco regime.

O'Hare, Philip J.

Award date: 1983

Awarding institution: University of Bath

Link to publication

### **Alternative formats**

If you require this document in an alternative format, please contact: openaccess@bath.ac.uk

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
  You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
  You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal?

**Take down policy**If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Download date: 11. May. 2021

#### THE CHURCH IN

### ANDALUSIA DURING

### THE FRANCO REGIME

submitted by Philip J. O'Hare for the degree of Ph. D. of the University of Bath.

#### COPYRIGHT

Attention is drawn to the fact that copyright of this thesis rests with its author. This copy of the thesis has been supplied on condition that anyone who consults it is understood to recognise that its copyright rests with its author and that no quotation from the thesis and no information derived from it may be published without the prior written consent of the author.

This thesis may be made available for consultation within the University
Library and may be photocopied or lent to other libraries for the purposes of consultation.

ProQuest Number: U641725

#### All rights reserved

#### INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.



### ProQuest U641725

Published by ProQuest LLC(2015). Copyright of the Dissertation is held by the Author.

All rights reserved.

This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code.

Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

ProQuest LLC 789 East Eisenhower Parkway P.O. Box 1346 Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346

UNIVERSITY OF BATH LIBRARY

14 14 OCT 1983

PHD

X602053969/2

IN MEMORY OF

DAMIAN CONNOR

#### PREFACE

This study was prompted by an interest in the role played by one of the cornerstones on which Francoist Spain was built - the Spanish Church during a period of approximately forty years which saw Spain undergo far-reaching social and economic changes (industrialisation, growing affluence, an emerging middle-class) while remaining politically static under a dictatorship which disapproved of opposition. Unprecedented changes within the Church occured through the reformist papacy of John XXIII (and his successor Paul VI) and the Second Vatican Council. From being the supporter of a regime to which it had every reason to feel grateful after the persecutions of the Second Republic and during the Civil War, the Church steadily realised its potential as a vehicle for social change in line with the Council's teachings; and this was accompanied by a recognition of the need of independence from state control or interference. It was inevitable that the effects of such changes in attitude should be traumatic both for Church and Government in Spain, and this work attempts to analyse the forces at work throughout this process.

As a study of the Church in Spain as a whole throughout this period could not have been comprehensively detailed through constraints of size, and thereby imperilling academic rigour, it was felt necessary to restrict the study to one, particular region. Andalusia was the choice for two reasons: no work devoted specifically to the Andalusian Church had been published, a fact which helps make this study original; and Andalusia, with its history of underdevelopment socially

and economically, seemed especially appropriate for a study such as this.

After an introductory chapter surveying the region's economic geography and its inhabitants' social make-up as well as the ecclesiastical realities involved, leading up to the outbreak of civil war. the work is divided into five chapters thus: (a) the Civil War and its aftermath, amidst an atmosphere of ecclesiastical gratitude and triumphalism; (b) the period from the late forties to the opening of the Second Vatican Council in 1962, when the euphoria of the cruzada wanes somewhat at the first signs of stated episcopal concern with social problems; (c) the years from Vatican II to the episcopal declaration of a desire for a break between Church and State, in 1971; (d) the final years of the regime which, like the period under (c), are punctuated by difficulties between Church and Government; (e) a final chapter which, by examining developments since Franco, attempts to look to the future in the light of conclusions that may be drawn from the study.

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The compilation of a work such as this cannot be undertaken without the help of many other people, and I wish to thank the following for their invaluable assistance: my thesis supervisor, Dr. J. W. Gilmour, of the University of Bath, and Professor D. W. Lomax of the University of Birmingham for invaluable advice both on sources and approach; Velia and Quintín Aldea Waquero; the diocesan offices of Almeria, Granada, Jaen, Malaga and Seville; the courteous staff of Ecclesia, HOAC, Proyección, Razón y Fe and Vida Nueva; the library staff of the Buckinghamshire College of Higher Education, Leeds Polytechnic and the British Newspaper Library of Colindale, London; Mr. B. Mogford, of the Buckinghamshire Vollege of Higher Education, with whose help I was able to obtain a small scholarship which enabled me to research in Andalusia; priests in Andalusia and England, too numerous to mention; also Janet Blackburn, Elizabeth Foster, Elizabeth and Glyn Wainwright, and last but certainly not least my wife Carole.

#### CONTENTS

# Introduction P.1. P.62. Chapter One. From persecution to re-establishment: from the outbreak of Civil War (1936) to the late forties. P.136. Chapter Two. The era of uncertainty: from the first signs of concern of the late forties to the arrival of the Second Vatican Council in 1962. P.200. Chapter Three. Metamorphosis: from the Church of the Cruzada to the Church of the Council. P.281. Chapter Four. The last years of problems with the regime: from attempts at desenganche to Franco's death - 1972-1975. Chapter Five. P.332. The Church in Andalusia since Franco - ... its future.

#### INTRODUCTION

#### THE REGION

The land.

Consisting of 87,268 square kilometres, and thereby occupying 17.33 per cent of the country's area, Andalusia is the largest region of Spain. It is also the southernmost region of peninsular Spain, with a population of over six million, or about onesixth of the national total, and comprises the provinces of Almeria (385,000 people), Cadiz (945,000), Cordoba (718,000), Granada (736,000), Huelva (400,000), Jacn (647,000), Malaga(914,000) and Seville(1,370,000). Geographically the region may be divided into two distinct areas, Andalucía Bética and Andalucía Penibética: these areas in turn, however, have physical subdivisions, the former consisting of the valley of the River Guadalquivir, or campina, and the mountainous Sierra Morena, the latter comsisting of the sistema bético to the east and the coastal area to the south of this. Although the climate has a certain uniformity in that it is characterised by hot summers- the area within a triangle formed by Seville, Penarroya and Jaen normally has Spain's highest summer temperatures, oscilating betweem 29 and 37 degrees centigrade(I)rainfall is more varied, ranging from 626 mm. per annum im Jaer to a mere I80-300 mm.im Almeria, making this area the driest im Spain(2). Such variations in topography and rainfall have given rise to variations in soils, in turm probably determining the utilisation

and the division of the land, as will be seen.

# The economy.

region, Andalusia has tended to exhibit all those traits said to typify socio-ecomomic backwardness: a low level of industrial development, with a correspondingly high over-dependence on an agricultural sector having a poorly remunerated workforce, high levels of unemployment, unsatisfactory living conditions, high rates of illiteracy and inadequate educational facilities— all comparing unfavourably with the national average—with a consequently high rate in figures for emigration, either to other parts of Spain or abroad. Statistics presented by E. Sevilla Guzmán(3) for the region's working population in 1930 testify to the agrarian bias of the region's economy in the years prior to the Civil War and the Franco regime:

province	working population engagei
	im agriculture- percentages
Almeria	60.7
Cadiz	44.I
Cordoba	58 <b>.3</b>
Granada	67.6
Huel <b>v</b> a	5I.9 ·
Jaen	<b>65.</b> 8
Malaga	59.0
Seville	49.0
(national average	47.4)

The figures show that all of the Andalusian provinces

had a percentage of their workforce engaged im agriculture higher than the national average, with the exception
of Cadiz- though this was not offset by a correspondingly high figure in the sphere of industry, Cadiz's
figure of 30.9 per cent for services being bettered
only by those for Madrid, Guipuzcoa and Vizcaya.

If these figures are compared to those given by the same writer for 1960, two decades after the establishment of the Franco regime and immediately after the abandonment of economic self-sufficiency or autarquía, it is evident that the economic pattern of Andalusia had remained basically unchanged, with Almeria, Granada and Jaen again showing percentages appreciably higher than the national average (4):

Almeria	60.6
Cadiz	42.9
Cordoba	56.2
Granada	64.2
Huelva	5I.I
Jaen	61.5
Malaga	52.0
Seville	42.0
(mational average)	41.6)

Even in the early seventies, after more than a decade of intensive industrialisation unsurpassed in any other European country, the proportion of the region's working population engaged in agriculture was higher than the national average— with the exception of Seville, as will be mentioned further— according to

data for 1971 supplied by A. de Miguel and J. Salcedo(5):

province	percentage
Almeria	<b>4</b> 8
Cadiz	26
Cordoba	36
Granada	42
Jaen	<b>3</b> 8
Huelva	33
Malaga	29
Seville	24
(national average	25)

Figures supplied by <u>Cáritas Española</u> for a period from 1975 to 1977 and published by the Catholic magazine <u>Vida Nueva</u> to coincide with the 1980 referendum on Andalusian autonomy (6) show the same trend in that they are again higher than those for the national average for the same period given by J.M.López Zumel(7):

province	percentage
Almeria	44.81
Cadiz	20.90
Cordoba	38.06
Granada	41.32
Huelva	29.18
Jaen	44.29
Malaga	23.23
Seville	21.55
(national average	23.06)

It may be seen from the tables above, therefore, that agriculture has played a greater role in the Andalusian economy than it has nationally, not only in the years preceding the Franco regime but also throughout its duration.

Agriculture in Andalusia is traditionally conceived by commentators such as J. Naylon (8) as being dominated by large estates, or latifundios, belonging to a single owner and worked by a landless labour force employed only seasonally and earning rates of pay considerably lower than those pertaining to other sectors, and that such an unfortunate situation has been largely responsible for the ills besetting Andalusian society, with a consequent rejection by the poorer classes of those social values regarded by them as bourgeois, Christianity included. However, on the basis of a definition of latifundios offered by P. Carrión (a prime mover behind the reforma agraria of the Second Republic) that a latifundio in the strict sense of the term can only be applied to a property of 200 hectares or more (9), an analysis of land division in the region comes up with results which give the lie to the general belief of Andalusia as being overwhelmingly latifundista. Writing in 1932, and thereby offering data which give an interesting perspective of Andalusian land division in the years immediately preceding the Civil War, he gives figures which show that the predominance of latifundismo within the eight Andalusian provinces varies to such an extent that holdings larger than 250 hectares - larger in size than his previous definition - occupy 57.97% of the area of the province of Cadiz, yet only 17.09% of Almeria province (10). Figures for other provinces admittedly, are high -Seville 50.45% or Huelva 47.64%, for example - yet

Malaga's figure of 37.47% is less than two thirds that of the Cadiz percentage. He states, further, that fincas medianas (10 - 100 hectares) occupy as much as 34% of the land area of Almeria (and Murcia)(11), and that fincas pequeñas (less than 10 hectares) account for as much as 33% of the land area of Almeria compared to only 22% in the region betica provinces of Jaen, Cordoba, Seville, Cadiz and Huelva (12). Furthermore the situation was to remain unaltered for four decades: if, writing in 1971, A. Burgos can show that in Almeria only 0.4% of explotaciones agrarias of 200 hectares or more cover only 5.3% of the land whereas, for example, 0.7% cover 49.7% of Jaen's land area (13), then it is demonstrably plain that Almeria is not a latifundista province, and its discrepancy is so marked as to warrant some examination.

Although P. Carrión concedes that "no guarda relación estrecha la calidad del terreno con su parcelación" (14), he nevertheless goes on to admit that the division of the better land into large estates and of the poor land into smallholdings worked by peasants may have a certain logic - "...pues los buenos terrenos procuran acapararlos los ricos... y los obreros no tienen acceso fácil más que a los arenales, sierras y demás sitios en donde sólo con mucho trabajo es posible sacar algún fruto" (15) - and points out further that climate may well be the ultimate deciding factor in that soil quality depends to a large extent on rainfall (16).It has already been pointed out that Almeria has the lowest rainfall in Spain. Low rainfall, poor soil, together

with a geographical isolation produced by a mountainous terrain - these are factors unattractive, presumably, to prospective owners and buyers, either during the granting of lands in the <u>Reconquista</u> or the disamortisation of ecclesiastical and municipal lands in the first half of the nineteenth century, and which help explain the lack of <u>latifundismo</u> in Almeria. It also highlights the dangers of applying any ills inherent in this phenomenon to Andalusia as a whole.

Nevertheless, it is undeniable that these estates have constituted the most characteristic feature of Andalusian agricultural life; data given by P. Carrión for the percentage of surface area occupied by large estates in Andalusia are matched only by the Región Manchega and Extremadura (17). The perpetuation of this system of land tenure is illustrated by percentages for estates of more than 200 hectares given almost four decades later by A. Burgos, the most outstanding of which include Cadiz 66.4%, Huelva 66.3%, Seville 57.1% and Jaen 49.7% (18).

One of the criticisms levelled at the large estates is that they have helped perpetuate an almost feudal social structure: their owners, having at their disposal a rural work force with supply far exceeding demand through a lack of industrial development and subsequent job opportunities, have tended to exploit their employees, wh have had to accept low wages exacerbated by enforced lay-offs through the seasonal nature of agricultural work. According to G. Brenan, an agricultural labourer in 1930 received an average of only 3 - 3.5 pesetas for

an eight hour day for five months of the year, with 4 - 6 pesetas for a twelve hour day, with unemployment awaiting them the rest of the year(19); nor had the situation improved appreciably by 1932, with 5 pesetas being the norm (20). If one accepts the premise of P. Carrión that the basics of life then cost 5 - 6 pesetas per day, or 2,000 pesetas per annum (21), it meant that the agricultural labourer customarily earned less than half that amount. But to accuse the <u>latifundios</u> as being solely responsible for the poverty of many would be mistaken: indeed, those working their own small plot of land were in even greater economic hardship, if G. Brenan's claim of a yearly income of only 161 pesetas is to enjoy any veracity (22).

Nevertheless, working conditions for casual labourers in agriculture were to remain a polemical issue: research carried out in nine parishes of Cadiz in 1958, almost three decades after Brenan's work, was to show that only a matter of years before the beginnings of the milagro económico the most a casual labourer could expect to earn was 45 pesetas per day, with unemployment for up to five months of the year (23). Moreover, even subsequent wage increases could not alter the fact that pay for casual farm labourers in Andalucía Occidental was still less than half of that of their counterparts in the Basque Country at the beginning of the 1970s (24). Given the conditions described above, it is not surprising that the history of the landless labourers of Andalusia should be marked by desperate measures ranging from strike action to land occupation, as will be discussed later.

The predominance of agriculture in the Andalusian economy has inevitably resulted in low levels of industrialisation which, despite marked growth during the second half of the Franco regime, have persistently lagged behind the national average and been vastly inferior to those areas of greatest industrial development such as Catalonia. One problem with Andalusian industry is that it has tended to be controlled by interests outside Andalusia: J. Nadal cites the example of the lead-ore mining industry which had developed around Almeria as early as the mid- nineteenth century, but controlled as it was by the foreign capital of investors prompted more by self-interest rather than a truly entrepreneurial attitude - "The exploitation of the subsoil and, in the same fashion, that of the factories, was in the hands of speculators rather than in those of true industrialists"(25)- it had by the end of the century been relegated to "an industry of colonial type" (26). Other factors militating against development in Andalusia during the era of Spain's incipient industrialisation were lack of foreign demand and costs of production and transport comparing unfavourably with those of the Basque Country. J. Fontana and J. Nadal have indicated how a drop in foreign demand during 1913-19 led to a crisis in the Spanish mining industry, followed by unemployment and hardship. In Huelva, for example, the figure of 22,061 miners employed fell to 17,245 from 1913 to 1918(27). Also, the lodal iron industry, after a promising start, disintegrated at the rise of the industry in the Basque Country which was nearer to Europe, with coal in nearby Asturias (28).

The percentage of the working population engaged in industry has traditionally been appreciably lower than the national average, as is shown by the following figures supplied by E. Sevilla Guzmán for 1930 and 1960(29):

province	1930-%	1960-%
Almeria	19.7	17.9
Cadiz	25.0	26.6
Cordoba	25.5	21.7
Granada	16.7	14.0
Huelva	29.4	26.8
Jaen	21.1	19.4
Malaga	20.5	19.1
Seville	31.4	26.6
(national average	31.6	30.0)

Although a striking point is the relatively high industrialisation enjoyed by Seville - perhaps to be expected in the region's largest city - a comparison of the above figures with those for agriculture already given for the same years indicates the limited role played by industry in the Andalusian economy: for example, in 1930 industry gave employment in Granada to less than a quarter of those engaged in agriculture and to less than a third in Almeria and Jaen. Furthermore, by 1960, after years of crisis which had seen the failure of autarquía as a viable economic system, the imbalance between agriculture and industry had become marginally worse in some provinces, with only Cadiz recording an increase in its industrial workforce. The backwardness of industrial development strikes one even more forcibly when the figures are compared to those for the most

industrialised areas of Spain: the 1930 figure for Seville, the Andalusian province with the highest percentage of industrial workforce, is less than half that of the 67.8% of Barcelona and less than two-thirds of the 47.0% recorded by Vizcaya; and the 1960 percentage for Huelva, then the highest in Andalusia, is less than half that of Barcelona(58.8%), Guipuzcoa(55.3%) and Vizcaya(55.4%) The onset of industrialisation in Spain from the early sixties onwards was to make its mark in Andalusia as elsewhere, but not enough to convert Andalusia from an agrarian - based to an industrially based society. Although A. de Miguel and J. Salcedo are correct to state that "Con anterioridad a 1950 sólo se puede decir que existen tres núcleos industrializados, las dasicoras de Barcelona, Vizcaya - Guipúzcoa y Madrid" (30), their claim that Cordoba, Jaen, Granada and Almeria (along with the other more industrially developed provinces) may be described under "etapa semi-industrial"(31) - by their own definition when industrialisation has grown to such an extent that the agricultural workforce falls below 35% - this claim is to be disputed in the light of information for 1975 - 77 supplied by Caritas Española (32):

province	(a)total workforce	(b)agric. workforce	(b) as % of (a)
Almeria	130,131	58,315	44.81
Cordoba	242,361	92,254	38.06
Granada	237,944	98,339	41.33
Jaen	210,567	93,264	44.29

Moreover, figures from the same source for the workforce engaged in the industrial sector show the region as a

whole, and the above mentioned provinces in particular, as being vastly inferior to the national average of 37.07% given by J. M. López Zúmel (33), whereby the percentages for Almeria, Cordoba, Granada and Jaen come out as 8.78, 16.78, 13.63 and 14.78 respectively. If the data offered by <u>Cáritas Española</u> is correct, then the region's industrial development had regressed to the level of the 1930's by the mid to late seventies, partly the result of the crisis in Western capitalism caused by the Oil Crisis and other factors.

It has been traditional to blame the local landowning elite for the lack of industrial growth in the region - "Históricamente, no ha habido en Andalucía una burguesía emprendedora, una clase empresarial que supiera aprovechar los recursos naturales asserts the Marxist R. Tamames (34). Yet it may be erroneous to cite <u>latifundismo</u> as a direct cause of limited industrialisation: Almeria, consistently one of the least industrially developed provinces of the region, has already been shown to be also the least latifundista province: while, conversely, Cadiz - "el reino del latifundio" in the opinion of A. Burgos (35) - has traditionally enjoyed one of the highest percentages for its industrial workforce. One of the main obstacles to industrialisation in the area is that it has traditionally suffered from an attitude bordering on cynical indifference from the authorities in Madrid during the years of growing industrialisation: the economist G. Stewart points out that whereas in 1800 the Andalusian gross product was 25% of the national total, it was only 12% in 1980, with Madrid alone

accounting for 17% (36).

The development of industry in the Madrid Catalonia - Basque Country axis, argues N. Salas (37),
has been at the cost of potential industrial development
in Andalusia, in that capital accrued by company branches
and subsidiaries is reinvested in the company which is
usually based outside Andalusia - a ploy also used,
G. Stewart alledges, by national banks (38) - so that
Andalusian industry has not only tended to be under the
control of foreigners, as has been mentioned citing
J. Nadal, but of fellow Spaniards exercising a more subtle
form of industrial colonialism.

The paucity of Andalusian industry is evidenced by a report of the Banco de Bilbao in 1970, in which only six companies out of 261 regarded as being the major ones of Spain were based in the south (39), thereby demonstrating that a decade of the milagro económico and various development plans such as that for Jaen had made little headway in correcting the geographical imbalance of Spanish industrialisation. The situation was to remain unchanged ten years later, with only fifty-nine of Spain's 1,200 largest companies being based in Andalusia (40) Also, many home - based industries in Andalusia have tended to be small: even after the growth years of the sixties, there were in 1971 only eighty-one firms employing 500 workers or more in the whole of Andalusia, a total exactly doubled by Barcelona alone (41), with any potential development and subsequent job opportunities presumably being hampered by the greater difficulty experienced by small firms in obtaining access to credit.

Wages in the industrial sector have traditionally been higher than in agriculture - by the beginning of the thirties, the average wage for a male employee was from 5.65 to 10.87 pesetas per day, with 2.81 to 4.39 pesettas for a woman (42), twice or more the aforementioned wages of an agricultural worker. A marked gap between the salaries earned in each sector was also evident by the sixties: wages per capita for miners in Huelva province, for instance, were on average 23,378 pesetas(43), a figure far in excess of that earned by agricultural labourers in the aforementioned report by Cadiz diocesis in note twenty-three. However, the wage for Huelva miners was lower than the estimated average of 35,200 pesetas for Asturian miners for virtually the same per capita value of production. Whether one accepts or not the reason for this apparent anomaly given by the Marxist commentator on Andalusian affairs A. Comín (and unsupported by factual evidence) - "Bien podemos pensar para explicar esta considerable diferencia ... en la combatividad obrera que siempre ha preponderado en Asturias ... mientras que, en Huelva, ... la menor combatividad sindical explica el bajo nivel de las rentas del trabajo"(44) - there is evidence to suggest that industry in Andalusia has been characterised, not only by lack of development and reduced job opportunities, but also by wages lower than elsewhere in Spain.

Indeed, an examination of earnings per capita will show how Andalusia has consistently compared unfavourably with the national average, and particular provinces markedly so. Three periods are chosen, from the mid-

fifties to the end of the Franco regime so as to illustrate how per capita earnings have compared with figures nationally before, during and after the injection of foreign capital into Spain and the growth of industrialisation.

province	<u>1955</u> (45)	<u>1967</u> (46)	<u>1975</u> (47)	pesetas
Almeria	5 <b>,</b> 88 <b>7</b>	23,074	101,110	ti
Cadiz	9,743	31,.842	105,103	
Cordoba	7,974	28,812	93,926	11
Granada	5,513	26,833	85,993	11
Huelva	9,616	31,133	114,367	11
Jaen	6,171	24,385	89,491	11
Malaga	7,204	31,934	108,427	11
Seville	11,098	32,521	115,858	11
(national	av11,195	<b>42 ,</b> 855	144,731	" )

The most outstanding fact to emerge from the above is: that never does a single province show figures higher than the national average. Closer analysis and further information make even more disturbing reading: the figures for Granada in 1955 and for Almeria in 1967 were the lowest in Spain for each year. Moreover, if the average per capita income for the region as a whole is assessed and then compared to the national average, it will be seen that the years 1955 and 1975 show almost identical percentages, i.e. 70.5% and 71.5% respectively. This figure, according to J. Bosque Maurel, Professor of Geography at Granada University, was also no less than 58% lower than that of Catalonia, Spain's richest province (48). In other words, after two decades of unparallelled industrialisation in Spain, Andalusia itself was no better off in comparative terms, than in the days of autarquía, with wages in the province of highest pay, Seville, as much as 20% lower than the

national average.

A lower standard of living engendered by lower than average per capita incomes has also been exacerbated by unemployment levels which, as in the case of per capita income above, have failed to make any improvement when compared to figures nationally. Whereas by April 1934 Jaen and Cordoba were recording levels fifty per cent higher than the national average. according to P. Preston (49) - Andalusia's exportorientated agricultural industry was especially harmed by the world depression - by 1980 the figures for Andalusia as a whole were twice the national average at twenty-two per cent (50), which, according to Vida Nueva, was in reality closer to twenty-five per cent if additional factors such as a large casual workforce unemployed for some of the year are borne in mind (51): indeed the left-wing Noticias Obreras of the Hermandades Obreras de Acción Católica claimedin 1979 that of Andalusia's 420,000 day labourers only nine per cent had fixed employment (52).

The socio-cultural.

#### (a) Education.

Given the pessimistic picture described above, one could argue that a possible avenue of escape for the young Andalusian of humble origins could be the attainment of educational qualifications and the self-improvement this could then entail. However statistics available point to a continued shortfall of educational provision in the region at all levels with a resulting rate of illiteracy which has consistently compared unfavourably with other areas of Spain.

Figures for the period before the Civil War show the situation to be especially critical. Indeed, in the

first decade of the twentieth century Spanish illiteracy was at its highest in Malaga, Almeria and Jaen, affecting over seventy per cent of their populations (53) and even the addition of 164 schools in Malaga province in the period 1920-30 still left Malaga with only one maestro per thousand inhabitants by 1930 (54), only one third of the generally accepted minimum ratio (55). Moreover, even by 1935, only one year before the uprising, only Almeria of all the Andalusian provinces could boast of an average of more than three maestros per thousand inhabitants, the figure being 3.12, with only Cordoba being remotely near this with 2.24, the ratios for Cadiz and Seville being as low as 1.16 and 1.25 respectively (56). The situation in Cadiz in the pre - Civil War period was especially precarious, with an actual drop of 285 to 209 in the number of schools from 1923 to 1930 (57). The programme of school building much vaunted by the left-wing government of 1931-33 at the introduction of the Second Republic failed in its target of 5,533 new schools for Andalusia, creating only 1,466 (58).

An examination of recorded levels of illiteracy in Andalusia after the coming to power of the Franco regime will show that, despite an improvement which in some provinces was most marked, the region still generally compared unfavourably with the national average. The province of Cordoba exemplifies this, with improving percentages for those of fifteen years or more of 28.8%, 23.6% and 15.8% for the years 1950, 1960 and 1970 respectively, yet still inferior to national levels of 14.2%, 11.2% and 8.9% for the same three years (59).

Indeed, all eight provinces were included in the top thirteen places in the national illiteracy tables for 1960 and 1970 with the following positions and percentages (60);

	1960			<u>1970</u>	
position	.province.	%illiter-	position	.province.	%illiter-
		acy			acy
1	Jaen	23.2	1	Jaen	18.0
2	Cordoba	21.5	3	Cordoba	16.6
6	Malaga	19.4	5	Huelva	15.7
7	Huelva	19.3	7	Seville	15.2
9	Seville	19.2	8	Malaga	15.1
10	Almeria	18.8	10	Granada	14.8
11	Granada	17.9	12	Almeria	14.4
13	Cadiz	17.0	13	Cadiz	13.2
(natt.	average	11.2	nat.	average	8.9)

The Church - organised <u>Semanas Sociales</u> of 1978 in Seville paid special attention to the problem of educational development and attainment in Andalusia, and published data showing how trends in the region as a whole have always compared unfavourably with levels nationally and in the wealthier areas of Spain. In the year 1963, for instance, while 148 pupils per 10,000 inhabitants received <u>Enseñanza Media</u> in the region, the national ratio was 199:: moreover by 1966, the region was even more disadvantaged, comparatively, in that although its ratio had increased to 154, the national ratio had increased even more to 211 (61). By the end of the Franco regime statistics for those receiving <u>Educación General Básica</u> were not only on a par with, but actually exceeded, national figures:

however, in other sectors of education, both pre-school and advanced, numbers were below the national average and in some cases showed a marked inferiority to those for Catalonia (62):

# academic year 1974-5

level	pupils	per 1,000 in	habitants
	Spain	Andalusia	Catalonia
E.G.B.	1,514	1,654	1,411
Enseñanza Preescolar	241	162	334
Facultades y Escuela Técnicas Superiores	s 92	73	99

It is evident from these figures that appreciables differences occur at either end of the educational spectrum: the same source also shows that Catalonia, with an estimated total population approximately 470,000 less than that of Andalusia, was offering pre-school education to almost double the number of children(188,000 compared to 99,500), with the obvious result that many Andalusian children start school seriously disadvantaged compared to their northeastern counterparts; and the higher education sector shows the same sort of anomalies, with only 45,000 andaluces at Escuelas Técnicas Superiores and similar centres, compared to 65,300 in Catalonia.

An examination of facilities available in recent years will show that, although the region no longer suffered from the severe lack of teaching recources in the first third of the century discussed above, education provision in certain sectors still compared unfavourably with levels nationally, there being a close correlation between extent of provision and student numbers: for instance, the total of schools in Andalusia specialising in E.G.B.

for the academic year 1979-80 in the region came to 32,493 out of a national total of 175,635(63),i.e., 18.5%,a figure more or less in line with Andalusia's population as a national percentage and thereby helping to explain the satisfactory ratio of E.G.B. students in Andalusia in terms of national figures. Furthermore, of an extra 789 centres for E.G.B. opened for the following academic year, 397 (more than half) were in Andalusia, thereby assisting still further the ratio of E.G.B. provision(64).

However, data for pre-school provision offer a more sombre picture: the total number of centres in the region for the academic year 1979-80 was 4,916, which out of a national total of 34,735 gave a percentage of 14.15%, apprecaiably less than that for the region's population vis-à-vis that of Spain(65).0f the additional 875 created in Spain the following year,330(more than one-third) were in Andalusia(66)- a welcome and much-needed injection into pre-school provision there, though still short of solving the crisis. Accepting the educationalists' contentiom that the most valuable years for intellectual development are the pre-school years, one can see how many infant andaluces approach schooling comparatively disadvantaged, thereby perhaps nullifying the satisfactory provision for E.G.B.

Furthermore, relatively low student numbers are matched by lack of provision not only before <u>E.G.B.</u>, but also beyond. Centres preparing students for the <u>bachillerato</u> (such as the <u>Institutos Nacionales de Bachillerato</u>the so-called <u>Extensiones</u>, and similar institutions) in 1979-80 totalled only 334 in Andalusia out of a national total of 2,425, the resulting 13.77 percentage again

falling short of the necessary provision(67).

Indeed, the more advanced and/or specialised the education, the worse off Andalusia has tended to be in terms of provision of resources, exemplified by the following brief references to the advanced education sector: of the thirty-eight Escuelas Técnicas Superiores listed by the Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia in 1980, only three -7.9%- were based in Andalusia, viz. two in Seville and one in Cordoba(68); and of Spaim's 185 Facultades Universitarias listed by the said Ministry the same year, only twenty-four belonged to Andalusian universities (69). A striking lack of provision has also beem evident in the area of educación especial (for the subnormal), with provision approaching remotely satisfactory levels only recently. In the academic year 1955-56 Andalusia had a total of only seven centres, out of a national figure of sixty-five. Even the additional provision of forty-seven centres for the year 1968-69 still meant that the proportion was unaltered, the national total having risen to four hundred and forty-nine (70). Not until 1979-80 is percentage of provision and attendance on a par with percentage of population, there being 11,550 pupils in Andalusia out of a national total of 75,892 (71).

The above statistics on the various sectors of education offer disturbing evidence as to a comsistent lack of educational provision in Andalusia when compared to the national avetage and especially so when compared to the traditionally wealthier areas of Spain.

The solution has already been stated in the aforementioned Semenas Sociales - "Em consecuencia, deberán aumentarse las inversiones em Educacióm en Andalucía

hasta crear la infraestructura adecuada"(72) - this being especially the case, it would appear, for pre- and post-E.G.B. provision.

# (b) Housing.

Brief mention must be made about living conditions: in Andalusia, which again give the same sad picture as that offered by statistics on the economy and education. Although great strides were made to improve housing after the war in order to counteract the inhuman conditions experienced especially by the families of landless labourers during the 1930s as described by E. H. G. Dobby, who claimed that families were sharing at times virtually the same living quarters as the animals (73), the general situation has still given cause for concern, with repeated calls for further action punctuating the sixties especially. A survey carried out under the auspices of Cadiz diocese in 1967 showed that, of 27,349 families, no fewer than 3,160 incorporating 15,600 people lived in one room (an average of five people per room), and another 4,475 families comprising 22,375 people lived in only two rooms, again an average of five people per room (74).

Another problem of housing in Andalusia has been the age of many of the dwellings. A survey in 1960 showed that almost three-quarters of Andalusia's housing was pre- 1940, thereby illustrating not only the poor condition many houses must have been in by then but also the relative paucity of new housing to replace the old and also to cope with the demand of a growing population. The figures, for capitales de provincia only, are as follows(75):

total no.	of dwellings	ellings date of construction		
		before 1940	0 1940-50	1950-60-(%)
Almeria	18,340	74.86	9.87	15.27
Cadiz	23,135	77.89	5.10	17.01
Cordoba	42,735	62.70	17.18	20.12
Granada	35,135	71.32	8.94	19.74
Huelva	15,990	61.01	7.54	28.45
Jaen	14,180	69.04	13.93	17.03
Malaga	61,705	<b>7</b> 8. <b>6</b> 8	6.95	14.37
Seville:	94,375	66.67	8.09	25.24
Andalusia	305,970	70 <b>.3</b> 8	9.35	20.27
Nat.tot. 2	2,124,385	63.85	10.60	25.55

However, this problem appears even more acute away from big cities, illustrated by data for <u>municipios</u> of 10,000 inhabitants and over (76):

	date of construction		
	before 1940	1940-50	1950-60-(%)
Andalusia	81.72	6.47	11.81
National average:	74.43	7.74	17.83

Other aspects of housing also manifest levels inferior to the national average: a survey in Andalucía Occidental in 1968 showed that 61% of houses had running water, 61% a toilet, 29% a shower and 14% bath, compared to national averages of 66%, 65%, 37% and 21% respectively (77). Housing was at its most basic for many in Andalucía Oriental, however, with 25% of the inhabitants of the La Chanca suburb of Almeria living in cavernas (78). Moreover, J. Naylon's figures for new housing developments in the mid - to - late sixties offer pessimistic reading, in that although an improvement was recorded it was still less than in

other parts of the country: whereas Andalusia had 103,633 state-subsidised new houses built during the period 1965-68, the figures for Madrid and Barcelona alone were 121,761 and 110,594 respectively(79). Figures for the final years of the Franco regime do seem encouraging in themselves: in 1973, for example, no fewer than 348,000 new houses were built in Spain, compared to only 144,000 in 1960(80), and according to the housing census of 1970, there were actually more houses than families in Spain, so that certain cities had a housing surplus, among them two in Andalusia -Seville with 18,380 and Granada with 9,984 vacant houses (81). However, the Fundación FOESSA counsels caution as regards accepting such data at face value, arguing that many buildings were unoccupied simply because many families could not afford new housing through economic hardship - the minimum prices fixed by builders at Seville and Malaga, for example, were especially prohibitive (82) - as evidenced by the fact that in 1973, 37% of families in Spain lacked the basic capital for a new home costing 425,000 pesetas (83).

### The human reaction.

Given the social and economic conditions long prevelant in Andalusian society, it is not surprising that the region has not only experienced heavy migration by those in search of better life, but has also been the scene of various acts of desperation ranging from concerted strike action to outbursts of civil disorder, which, while mostly confined to the pre-Civil War period, have begun to recurr of late, albeit on a smaller scale.

# (a) emigration.

An examination of statistics available will show that, although the population of Andalusia has steadily increased from the years preceding the Franco regime to the present day, its rate of increase has usually been inferior to the national average, as is illustrated by the following table of a twenty-five year period beginning with the forties (84):

	(a) Andalusia	(b)Spain	(a) as % of (b)
1940	5,219,362	25,877,971	20.17
1950	5,605,857	27,975,755	20.04
1960	5,893,396	30,430,698	19.37
<b>1</b> 965	5,938,226	31,965,565	18.58

The cause of the steady percentage drop is emigration, not a low birth rate - a total of 16,753 left Andalusia in 1978 and 1979, of which the provinces of Granada and Jaen accounted for over half(85) - for it is a high birth rate which has prevented the region from suffering further depopulation: in 1960 Andalusia had the highest birth rate of mainland Spain, with figures of 100.0 and 102.2 live births per 1,000 women of 15-49 years of age for western and eastern Andalusia respectively, figures surpassed nationally only by that of 104.5 for the Canaries (86). Figures for 1970 also point to a high birth rate in comparison with the national average (87):

average	number	of	children	per	married	mother:
Cadiz			3.47			
Jaem			3.16			
Seville			3.14			
Granada			3.13			
Cordoba			3.10			
Almeria			3.06			
Malaga			3.02			

Huelva

2.80

(national average 2.69).

The above figures stand in even greater relief when one considers that the figures for Barcelona and Vizcaya are 2.26 and 2.56 respectively; that Cadiz's figure is the highest in mainland Spaim(topped only by that of Lass Palmas of 3.65); and that Huelva, the least fecund Andalusian province, still has a higher figure than thirty-three other Spanish provinces (88).

All these figures suggest, therefore, that Andalusia's relatively low rate of population increase is due to emigration, an out-migration which often affects the very sector of society most required by the region, i.e., those capable of working - 68% of those who migrated within Spain in 1964, for example, were between 15 and 65 years, with those older than this accounting for only 3% of those who left (89) - and thereby impairs any social balance that might exist, with towns and villages left with am above-average number of very young and very old within their population, with the added pressure that this can mean on local social services and other facilities.

#### (b) social unrest.

It is not surprising that the history of a region with a tradition of poverty, unemployment, illiteracy and other socio-economic ills should be marked by outbursts of violence against what the poor saw as an uncaring establishment. This rejection of the status quo was to be crystallised in the later parts of the last century into various movements, the main one being anarchism, a socio-political creed which was to attain a quasi-religious significance for many of the poor. It differed from socialism, as G. Brenan has observed, in that it believed in the transformation of

society by a higher standard of principles, not just a higher standard of living, for all - though this idealism was based on a total rejection of the existing order and therefore the violent overthrow of it. The messianic fervour of its extremism had a special relevance for the poor of Andalusia, as G. Hills points out (90), and by the 1880s it had gained such a foothold in Andalusia that a congress was organised in Seville in 1882, and during the nineteenth and well on into the twentieth century anarchistinspired movements had grown so strong in the region that they were able to organise strikes on such a scale that the local economy was at times paralysed. Although some strikes were urban - indeed, A. Calero opines that all except four of fifty strikes in the period 1870-73 were artisan or industrial (91) - most of the labour unrest well into the twentieth century was rural, with anarcho-syndicalist groups advocating not only strike action but also land occupation in crude attempts to divide up the estates into smaller entities. Particularly violent were the disturbances of 1917, when a wave of strikes hit virtually every province of Andalusia: in Huelva province, for instance, there were four deaths in Nerva and two in Salvochea, with others: injured(92).

Strikes and attempts at land occupation arguably hit their peak in terms of occurence and ferocity in the period of the Second Republic, immediately prior to the Civil War. As has been stated above, the destruction of the <u>latifundios</u> was perceived by the Left -and especially anarchists and communists- as being fundamental to a more just and egalitarian division of wealth, with the land-owners seen as the exploiters of the nural poor. The socialist administration which came to power in 1931

attemped to rectify the situation by means of its Ley de Reforma Agraria, by which it was planned to settle 75,000 campesinos on lands forming part of the great estates. Wet by the end of 1933, by which time the Right were im power, only 2,500 campesinos had been formally settled, and P. Carrión. one of the moving forces behind the proposed reform, was to admit that the venture was a failure (93). Many decided to take the law into their own hands, however, and forcibly occupied tracts of land: A. Bernal lists eleven occupations between August 1931 and Jume 1936 im Andalucía Occidental alone -six in the province of Seville, four in Huelva and one in Cordoba (94). Attacks on property were even greater in number, however, with forty-seven separate incidents being recorded in damage to crops, animals and machinery (95), while the area also suffered one hundred and eight strikes (96). Such was the violence engendered by these incidents that forty-three workers, thirteen members of the armed forces and five owners were killed, with more than fifty people: wounded (97). With the Nationalist victory in the Civil War, the measures passed by the Left during the Second Republic were annulled and all illegal land occupations ended.

During the Franco regime, except for incidents involving strikes in the industrial and agricultural sector, Andalusia was never again the scene of such violent disorders; however, Spain was to be no exception in the Western World as regards the difficulties occasioned by the Oil Crisis of the 1970s, and the chronic underdevelopment of Andalusia was to continue unabated, with the region's per capita income being some twenty-seven per cent lower than the mational average by 1977(98)

with, as has been mentioned, unemployment figures at twice the national average. This mew critical situation has been marked by sporadic outbursts of rebelliousness, as in 1979, when twenty-four alcaldes from the province of Seville locked themselves in their diputación as a sign of protest at rural unemployment(99); on 14 August 1980 the village of Marinaleda, near Seville, was the scene of a mass hunger strike which was to win international coverage(100); and various violent encounters between unemployed jornaleros and the forces of law and order -"En los últimos meses se han conocido acciones en el campo andaluz que nos recuerdan a aquellas otras de los jornaleros cenetistas en tiempos no muy lejanos" was the chilling echo of the past given by HOAC (101).

It may be seen from the above, them, that the region has traditionally been beset by acute socio-economic problems before, during and since the Franco regime, resulting in an economically and culturally deprived society. This study now proceeds to an examination of the resources that the Andalusian church has had at its disposal, in order to estimate its impact on this particular society and thereby asses the more accurately any achievements or failures.

### THE CHURCH

The Andalusian Church consists of ten sees: the two archdioceses of Seville and Granada, and the dioceses of Almeria, Cadiz, Cordoba, Guadix-Baza, Huelva, Jaen, Jerez and Malaga. The dioceses of Jerez was formed after the end of the Franco regime, as recently as 1980, and so is not the

direct concern of this study; while of those in existence during the Franco regime, the youngest is that of Huelva, formed in 1953.

Given the highly volatile nature of Spanish contemporary history —the proclamation of a Republic in 1931, and the defeat of a democratically elected government of the Left in a Civil War by a military movement which was to hold power without toleration of opposition for almost four decades —studies on the Sanish Church have tended to bepolemical in tone, especially so in view of the fact one of the cornerstones of Francoist Spain was to be Catholicism. In such a situation, hyperbole can run riot: myths attain reality, with repeated generalisations holding sway over details.

Of the criticisms levelled at the Spanish Church by its detractors, the principal ones have traditionally been wealth, dominance, and indifference to the plight of the downtrodden, and that these have been the main factors accounting for the negative attitude of the poorer classes towards it, ranging from indifference at best to outright hostility. It is only by examining the Church's situation, in Andalusia especially, upto, during and since the Civil War, that one may determine the truth or otherwise of such contentions.

Speaking of the Church nationally, M. Gallo makes the claim that anticlericalism gained ground at the beginning of the twentieth century because "the Church was an important landowner (ll,000 estates, valued at about 130,000,000 pesetas) and had formed ...a close alliance with the big landlords "(102), yet serious doubts should be raised about both the validity of the figures and the

evocation of local wealth portrayed in such a statement. The Church had lost its wealth through state confiscation only half a century earlier, during the reign of Isabel II, when its lands were put up for sale by public auction and so lost to the Church at great profit to the State - A.Lazo Díaz points out that biggest profits were made in Seville, with more tham a 300% rate being recorded im the difference between initial valuation and final selling (103)- thereby giving rise to many of the latifundios of the present day. The impact that this must have had on the Church's organisation is evoked thus by J.M.Cueca (104):

"Más de 3.000 casas religiosas, con sus correspondientes propiedades en fincas...pasaba a poder del Estado...

Varias decenas de miles de frailes y monjas se veían envueltos en las órdenes de exclaustración, arrumbados en una operación sin precedentes en los anuales hispanos."

He goes on to state that this also meant the confiscation of 321 monasteries and 2,706 mendicants houses (105).

Nor was this the only occasion on which the Church suffered at the hands of the State in the nineteenth century: the revolutionary government which came to power im 1868 reduced the number of convents by half with no offer of compensation (106). Indeed, such actions were particularly detrimental to the Church in Andalusia, given that the religious orders had always helped the secular clergy in parish work, owing to a relative shortage of priests there compared to other areas of Spain, which

is discussed in more detail further. The local hierarchy were fully aware of the new legistic difficulties these measures would impose on the Church in the region, the most vociferous Andalusian bishop, according to J. M. Cuenca, being Bishop Alburquerque of Cordoba, who was to make the following plea to the new Minister of Justice (107):

"Créame V. E. Excmo Sr., que le hablo con leal franqueza; la causa de la revolución pierde mucho en España con las órdenes dadas sobre materias eclesiásticas."

The Church in other Andalusian cities was to lose property: in Seville, for instance, fifty-seven churches were ordered to be demolished by the local revolutionary council (108). Such deprivations at the hands of the State do not point to an institution of untold wealth, as commentators such as M. Gallo would have one believe.

Accusations of ecclesiastical wealth were also extended to individuals within the Church, especially by the anarcho-syndicalists, as is illustrated by these criticisms in the following extract from the Seville newspaper La Solidaridad, in 1889 (109):

El clero predicar la mansedumbre a los desheredados para que se dejen desplumar con paciencia...

Ellos predican la pobreza a los demás, para ellos nadar en la abundancia: 'Los pobres son los hijos de Dios' - dicen - pero ellos

no quieren serlo ..."

But again, analysis of facts available must lead one again to question the validity of such accusations. In 1900, only a decade after the publication of the above extract, the parish priests of Almeria -to quote just one of the dioceses- received a stipend of 1,500 pesetas per annum (110), a figure which meant that a parish priest's pay was roughly comparable to that of a textile worker at the same period (111), and a figure which was not to improve appreciably for the majority of the clergy thirty years later. Just before the birth of the Second Republic, no less than 78% of the clergy were receiving less than 2,000 pesetas per annum (112), a figure not only inferior to the minimum wage for male workers in industry, but half their maximum wage (113). If the comparison is to be extended to a period during the Franco regime, then the relative penury of the clergy appears even more acute: parish priests received 16,920 pesetas per annum in 1969 a figure not only vastly inferior to the national average wage recorded two years previously of 42,855 pesetas(114), but also only two-thirds that of the 23,074 recorded as average per capita income in Spain's poorest province (115).

The hierarchy, of course, faired better in this respect - but not as well as their foreign counterparts, according to E. A. Peers, who reminds us in 1939 that the hierarchy of the State Church in England received up to nine times the income of the members of the Spanish episcopacy (116). Yet myths of wealth probably abounded because of the apparent wealth of the Church

through the magnificence of its buildings, a somewhat deceptive magnificence, opines E.A.Peers -"But behind its facade of rich hierlooms, the Church in Spain is pitiably poor"(117). Furthermore, given the poverty endured by many of the region's inhabitants, one can imagine that any financial support given to the Church to offset these difficulties would be minimal: when, for instance, Eustaquio Cardinal Ilundain, Archbishop of Seville, asked his flock to contribute an extra peseta per month, even this modest target was not reached(118).

Nor were the clergy immune from such difficulties through coming from monied backgrounds: the assertion of S.Aznar that "no era la clase obrera la que daba el mayor contingente a los Seminarios españoles"(119) is only partly correct, for an analysis of the class origins of seminarists in Spain in 1934 will show that a sizeable proportion were of humble origins - 30.40% - and by far outnumbered those of solid middle-class background - 13.20% - the largest category being the so-called petit-bourgeois, accounting for 54.77% (120). However, it is in the Andalusian seminaries under the archdioceses of Granada and Seville that figures appear even more interesting, in that the percentage for those of working-class backgrounds are much higher than the afore-mentioned national average, 38.95% for Granada and 39.86% for Seville, figures inferior only to those for Tarragona and Valencia and far in excess of the 15.47% for Burgos, the 16.95% for Santiago de Compostela, the 23.35% for Zaragoza and the 20.00% for Ciudad Real (121). By 1947, eight years after the end of the Civil War, figures for

the working-class sector decrease to 22.47%, yet here Granada and Seville again show percentages above the national averages with 28.55% and 40.30% for Granada and Seville respectively, with only Tarragona splitting the two figures with 30.04% (122). An analysis of the data for 1934 and 1947 will show the percentages for the categories ricos and nobles to be minimal, at times with nil returns, both in Spain generally and in Andalusia in particular. The evidence collated above must therefore help dispel the myth, advanced by detractors, of a Spanish clergy accustomed to an existence of luxury.

A second criticism of the Church, as has been stated, is a numerical dominance responsible for Spain supposedly being a priest-ridden country. Again, an examination of available data will demonatrate that in Andalusia, especially, this charge is not only inaccurate but fallacious in that it is a reversal of the truth, a truth which has its origins centuries before the birth of the Second Republic or the Franco regime, indeed in the turbulent years of the Reconquista. Andalusia was to remain under Moorish, and therefore Moslem, rule longer than any other region of Spain: by the time of the final unification and consequent Christianisation of Spain, the dioceses in regions other than Andalusia were already well established; however, this was yet to be accomplished in Andalusia - worse, the Church, as S. Payne has pointed out (123), failed to follow up the impetus of the Reconquista in practical terms in that the establishment of sees in the newly

occupied territories was to fail to satisfy the increasing demand of a steadily growing Christian population, and so ecclesiastical personnel did not keep pace with this growing population: the introduction of twenty new sees in central Spain was matched by that of only seven in Andalusia (124). Data supplied by J. Sáez Marín shows this sacerdotal paucity of Andalusia compared to the country as a whole; 778 parishes consisted of 2,182,947 people, out of a national total of 18,176 parishes consisting of 9,306,749 people, the then population of Spain (125). A breakdown of the figures gives Andalusia 23.45% of Spain's population, yet only 4.28% of its parishes. The same author succinctly outlines, not only the difficulties such a discrepancy must have meant for the Church there at the time, but also the consequences emanating from such a situation in more contemporary times (126):

"Se aprecia ya con claridad un sector que abarca, mas o menos, la mitad norte de la península y que, dentro de la tónica general, se halla suficientemente cuidado en lo espiritual ... Si miramos en cambio el sector meridional, observaremos un fenómeno inverso: elevado número de fieles por cura, con máximo desequilibrio en Murcia y Andalucía. No es preciso señalar, por sobradamente conocida, la trayectoria posterior de la zona en el terreno socio-político."

Indeed, the situation was to continue, both up to and even after the coming to power of the Franco regime An examination of priest/parishioner ratios in 1931, the year of the coming to power of Azaña's government, shows that the situation in Andalusia had barely changed; according to information supplied by V. Cárcel Ortí (127), the figures for Andalusia are as follows:

diocese	population	no. of dioc.	ratio
		priests	
Almeria	290,200	283	1024.73
Cadiz	310,000	160	1937.5
Cordoba	525,000	402	1305.97
Granada	454,000	457	99 <b>3.</b> 4
Guadix	130,938	171	765.71
Jaen	437,783	338	1128.31
Malaga	525,440	279	1944.23
Seville	1,300,000	692	1878.61

It is when the priest/parishioner figures in the right-hand column are compared nationally that the parlous state of church resources in Andalusia can be truly appreciated: Guadix, the Andalusian diacese with by far the best ratio was still inferior in this respect to no fewer than seventeen other dioceses in Spain. Indeed, a detailed comparison with figures for dioceses of the north makes even more disturbing reading-for example: Burgos 275.74, Jaca 360.10, León 271.99, Pamplona 270.65 and Vitoria 254.16 (128).

Nor at this time were future perspectives . conducive to optimism, as may be seen from the

following comparisons of numbers of seminarists for Andalusian dioceses and others of similar populations, randomly selected: Almeria 109 compared to Pamplona 534, Guadix 101 compared to Tarazona 182, Seville 245 compared to Valencia 727 - figures pointing to a vicious circle, in that a region least served by priests was producing less potential priests.

The Church in Andalusia was to be similarly disadvantaged throughout the Franco regime; data published in the mid-seventies shows that Cordoba, the Andalusian diocese with the best priest/parishioner ratio of 686, was relatively impoverished when compared to dioceses such as those with the following figures: Barbastro 451, Huesca 507, Jaca 486, León 482, Lugo 527, Pamplona 357 - while averages such as 1,571 for Granada, 1,250 for Guadix, 2,353 for Huelva or 1,607 for Seville are surely self-explanatory (129). It is evident from the above statistics, therefore, that Andalusia has always suffered from a severe shortage of priests in comparison to more northern regions of Spain, and the significance of this phenomenon on the labours of the Church in Andalusia cannot be too strongly emphasised.

A third criticism traditionally advanced by anti-clerical groups has been that of a marked indifference on the part of the Church to problems in the social domain - an area of special significance in the context of Andalusia, given both the acute nature of socio-economic problems there and the shortage of ecclesiastical resources. This criticism was particularly emphasised by various factions of the Left during the

period roughly coinciding with the rise of amarchosyndicalism through to the establishing of the Second Republic, where the Church, viewed as the ally of the rich and the influential through its position as the established Church, was to be for ever identified with the conservative status quo -the Concordat of 1851, though virtually a peace treaty between two sides (Church and State) no longer able to have the fullest trust in eachother, was presumably seen by anticlericals as concrete proof of their suspicions of the so-called binomio 'Altar-Trono' of reciprocal support which had existed for centuries.

However, the Church's reaction to the injustices suffered by the masses was not one of uncaring disinterest: it would be unfair to claim that the Church made little attempt to improve the material lot of its impoverished flock. But it has to be admitted, with hindsight, that the Church, at this time, by limiting itself to organising intermittent acts of charity, did not place on this area an importance it was to place in the social Catholicism of years to come, which was to see a more direct criticism of the social order -"La sustitución por los principios de justicia social de los anteriores puramente benéficos"is how J. Tussell views the difference(130). But this is not to say that a socially-minded Catholicism was non-existent: the socially-orientated teachings of Pope Leo XIII had made some enlightened members of the Andalusian hierarchy aware of the existing problems -the most committed in this respect perhaps being the Bishop of Cordoba, Ceferino González, who made attempts to win the confidence

of working-class people by organising, through his own initiative, the Círculos Católicos de Obreros in 1877. During that year, the movement's centres were established in various areas of Cordoba diocese, such as at Montilla (1 April), Pozoblanco (8 April), Hinojosa (1 May), Fuente Ovejuna (10 June), Villaviciosa (24 June) and Aguilar (15 July). Attempts to attract the workers into these circulos included the establishing of a system of medical care as well as provision for financial support whenever absence from work was unavoidably occasioned through illness. These circulos prospered for two years or so, but then went into a slow decline through lack of funds, personnel, organisation and cooperation from local dignitaries -though they appear to have flourished again by 1882:on 29 April of that year, at an assembly at the Bishop's Palace at Cordoba, the Bishop spoke of the importance of "el reinado social de Jesucristo sobre los hombres" (131). The inefficacy and scarcity of these circulos is in sharp contrast to those elsewhere in Spain, especially the North, which is hardly surprising, given the disadvantaged position of the Andalusian Church interms of personnel and monetary support compared to the rest of the country, as has been seen. An under-manned clergy would have had difficulty administering the purely spiritual: in an area with a plethora and depth of Socio-economic problems such as in Andalusia, successful pastoral work beyond these confines would be virtually impossible.

The setting-up of other religious organisations involved with workers also occurred in the early part of the twentieth century: in 1907, the Consejo Nacional

de: los Sindicatos Católicos was organised in Granada by Fr.A. Vincent with the help of the Marqués de Comillas (132) and by the following year there were 166 sindicatos agricolas -yet only ten sindicatos industriales, all under the auspices of the afore-mentioned Consejo Nacional (133) perhaps suggesting that the urban areas were less susceptible to Church influence, Another province where similar efforts were made was Cordoba: movements such as Acción Social Católica and La Juventud de Propaganda Social Católica were founded at Pozoblanco and Belalcázar respectively in 1912, and the Sindicato Agrícola de San José at Benamejí in 1913(134). The next venture of any significance was the establishing of the Sindicatos Católicos Profesionales towards the end of 1916, organised on a diocesan basis throughout Spain -though of the 139 listed by J.N.García-Nieto París, the sole Andalusian representatives are the Casa del obrero at Jerez de la Frontera, and the Centro Católico and the Consejo diocesano de corporaciones católico-obreras at Cordoba (135). The syndicate at Jerez de la Frontera merits special mention in that, founded by a Dominican Called Pedro Gerard, its members had complete freedom of choice as regards the practice of their faith (136):members of similar syndicates were usually practicing Catholics.

But such laudable attempts by the Church to concern itself with the problems of the poor only scratched the surface, especially in Andalusia: in 1915, of eighty-five 'Catholic-Social' periodicals on sale, only one of the sixteen main ones was Andalusian, this being El Obrero in Seville (137). Also, it was really of no surprise when the Sindicato Católico got least votes of all in

the municipal elections of 1920 in Cordoba province (138), while later the same year in Almodóvar (again in Cordoba province) a large section of the working-class used Holy Week for taking part in anticlerical demonstrations (139).

However, it is undeniable that the Catholiccontrolled syndicates did have some success in improving the lot of the downtrodden. The work of visionaries such as Bishop Ceferino Gonzáez and of priests such as Fr. Correas and Fr. Nevares, who were aware of the causes of discontent, did make some impact, and must have been of great practical and spiritual help. The fruits of the labours of such far-sighted men were movements such as the Federación Provincial Católico-Agraria (Cordoba province) which was a federation of ten Sindicatos Católicos, eight of which were from the sierra (those of Montilla and Fernán-Núñez being the exceptions)(140) and the Federación Nacional Católica Agraria (Seville province) comprising the syndicates of Lora del Río and Villaverde, where Fr. Nevares obtained tracts of land to be worked by members (141). This sudden upserge of a socially-orientated Catholicism is described thus by E. E. Malefakis (142):

"The Southern countryside was suddenly overrun with Catholic organisers and the propertied classes were bombarded with pleas that they help the poor by voluntarily turning over some of their lands to them."

Church involvement in the region's social problems was by no means restricted to the labour area: education,

the care of the old and sick, the sheltering of orphans work such as this was undertaken by priests and nuns inspired by the desire to translate the gospel message into a living reality. Restrictions of space and the danger of repetitiveness militate against the drawing up of a truly exhaustive list, but it is only proper to name some of their founders and their movements, to give an idea, albeit sketchy, of the work achieved by them, work which continued beyond the deaths of these founders in many instances: Sor Angela de la Cruz, Seville, founder of the Hermanas de la Compañía de la Cruz, working among the sick from 1875 onwards (143); Encarnación Carrasco Tenorio, Huelva, founder of schools for poor children at Cadiz in 1876 (144); Francisco de Asís Medina, Cadiz, founder in 1878 of centres for the education of orphans and help for the sick (145); Petra de San José Pérez Florido, founder of the Madres de los Desamparados, Malaga, 1881, involved in work for the old and sick (146); Andrés Manjón, founder of the Escelas de Avemaría, Granada, 1888, for the education of poor children (147); Bishop Manuel González García of Malaga, founder there of the Hermanas Marías Nazarenas in 1921, devoted to the education of the poor (148); Asunción Soler Gimeno, founder of the Terciarias Carmelitas, Malaga, 1924, helping the sick and aged (149). At the risk of labouring the ,point it must be added that the above-mentioned constitute a fraction of those in the Church who saw their vocation as being extended to the service of the most vulnerable: members of society.

But such overtures by the Church were to meet with failure, on the whole. To begin with, such social involvement by the Church was not on a large scale through shortage of resources, and so whatever impact was made was limited. The implacable enmity of the socialists and the anarchists also ensured that any efforts by the Church to win back a place in the hearts of the proletariat were to meet with a negative response; and the syndicates were also suspected by the landowners, many of whom questioned this role of the Church in a field which they considered foreign to it, especially when their own immediate interests were threatened. as E. E. Malefakis has pointed out (150). Given the suspicion of the rich and the hostility of the poor, it is not surprising to learn that the Catholic syndicates and other socially orientated ventures were to be abortive: for instance, of the ten syndicates set up by the abovementioned federation in Cordoba only three (those from Montilla, Añora and Villanueva de Cordoba) managed to establish any meaningful rapprochement between workers and landowners. Even the federation's own newspaper, La Tierra, had to admit in its issue of 15 January 1923 that very little had in fact been achieved - "... se habla costantemente de fraternidad, de Caridad, de conciliación de intereses, pero que en la práctica nada se hace por los obreros" (151). Such awareness of lack of achievement in the socio-economic field illustrates that, even within some quarters of the Church, there was the nagging worry that some of the wounds might be selfinflicted because of the Church's failure to fully appreciate and act upon the problems of the workingclasses over a period of time. The Church tended to place more emphasis on the importance of observing the more stereotyped forms of ritual rather than attempting to promote apostolado social - "Se había saturado al pueblo de exterioridades em el culto y en las solemnidades" opines J. Ordóñez Márquez (152), while his comments on the failure of certain quarters within the Church to put the social Catholicism of Pope Leo XIII into effect are as follows (153):

"Las inquietudes sociales de Leóm XIII habían sonado a simples consejos de perfección en la mentalidad de muchos sacerdotes que carecían de capacidad apostólica para comprender la gravedad del problema ... Ello, y las viejas tradiciones, no desechadas en la formación de los seminarios, hizo que en un cien por cien aquel clero apareciera ayuno de cuestiones apostólico-sociales e incapaz de orientar en este sentido el apostolado de los seglares."

Nor did the standing of the Church improve in the eyes of the landless poor with the immovable stance of certain Catholic landowners over the problem of land ownership and division of wealth at that time. The Jaen Catholic newspaper El Pueblo Católico of 19

January 1928, for instance, carried an article entitled La tierra es de quien la cultiva?" by a local landowner defending the established order by theologically based arguments (154):

"El derecho de adquirir la propiedad tiene su fundamento más profundo en la naturaleza racional del hombre, a quien la sabiduría y voluntad de Dios proveyó de la facultad moral de tomar posesión de los mismos bienes raíces necesarios para la existencia ..."

Such attitudes, together with the Church's failure to properly organise, in the south especially, a concerted programme of pastoral care in the area of social problems: (albeit unavoidably so anyway through a shortage of priests) - all this, fuelled by the tendentious anti-clerical demagogy of the Left, helped make the Church appear an establishment-type institution uncaring as to the sufferings of the downtrodden - "largely identified with the 'haves' rather than the 'have nots' of Spanish society" in the words of A. Brassloff (155). In the volatile atmosphere of the 1930s, especially, such opinions were to gain currency by leftist political groups, to such an extent that the Church was to be blamed for practically every evil in society. The stance adopted by the Church both during and after the Civil War - a stance which confirmed its critics' view of it as an ally of the wealthy and powerful - can only be appreciated, however, in the light of the events of the years of the Second Republic, and particularly the leftist governments of 1931-33 and 1936. Hence it is deemed appropriate, indeed indispensable, to devote some lines specifically to Church-State relations during this period.

## The Church and the Second Republic.

The Church, in Andalusia as elsewhere in Spain viewed the possibility of an overtly anti-clerical government coming to power with trepidation. Given the rabid anti-clericalism of certain sectors of the Left, it was natural that the Church's support in the municipal and parliamentary elections of 1931 should be for the Right. None of the Andalusian pastorals written before these elections state overt political support for the Right; however, pastorals such as that addressed to Granada archdiocese on 25 April 1931, and from which the following is an extract, exhort Catholics to be mindful of the question of religious freedoms and, presumably, therefore mindful of the consequences of a vote for the Left (156):

"En atención a las actuales circunstancias, hemos tenido a bien disponer lo siguiente: l. En todas las parroquias ... se celebrarán rogativos públicos ... por las necesidades de la patria .... 4. Esperamos de la singular piedad de las comunidades religiosas ... encomendrán al Señor todos los días estas intenciones, cuya ejecución consideramos tan beneficiosos para la Religión y para la Patria."

Bad feeling between the Church and leftist factions had increased with a number of petty anti-religious laws, passed by local socialist councils in the short period between the proclamation of the Second Republic and the

parliamentary elections. In Huelva, to offer just one example, the local corporation decided on 18 April 1931 to change all religious names of streets to those of a socialist or revolutionary nature (157); but anticlerical feeling in the new Republican state was to reach new heights with the violence unleashed against Church property on the evening of 11 May, when leftist mobs attacked and set fire to churches in Madrid, Levante and Andalusia, with the fury of the mobs being greatest in Andalusia - in Malaga, where forty-one churches were burnt, with four in each of Seville, Cadiz (and Murcia), and two in Algeciras. The next day was to bring more sporadic violence such as the sacking of the convent and school (specialising in the care of poor children) of the Religiosas Adoratrices in Huelva (158). Perhaps even just as striking as the barbarity of these actions was their significance, in that they were not committed by isolated and unknown individuals, but by anti-clerical left-wing groups who could apparently perpetrate such acts in the face of government inaction and seeming indifference. The Archdiocese of Granada, for instance, issued a statement to this effect in that it not only bitterly criticised the mobs but also the forces of law and order - "Una y otra vez se le dieron (al Obispo de Málaga) seguridades de que no pasaría nada absolutamente... Y dueñas de las calles las turbas, comenzaron su obra destructora" (159) - words which illustrate how Catholics were antagonised, or certainly alienated, by the indifference of the authorities, or, in the words of S. Ben-Ami, "thrown into a mood of panic" (160).

If Catholics were to feel that their Church was at

then mercy of politically-motivated mobs in the streets, then this was underlined for them by officially legislated harassment once the leftist coalition government under the leadership of Manuel Azaña came to power, for the years immediately following were to witness a whole succession of anti-clerical laws which were especially provocative: a decree for the dissolution of the Jesuits was passed on 23 January 1932, and later the same year the Cortes voted to end all clerical salaries by 11 November 1933. Other laws included the abolition of religious education, and the consequences that this was to have for the poorly organised state education sector is perhaps best summed up by R. A. H. Robinson (161):

"According to Catholic statistics, education and welfare work of the Orders affected 1,312,000 people.

The Orders gave primary education to 601, 950 pupils in comparison with the 1,774,400 in state schools, while they provided secondary schooling for 27,000, compared with the State's 25,000."

The same author adds that replacing the Orders' education would cost another 200,000,000 pesetas annually. According to statistics given by M. Pérez Galán for 1932, the period in which these laws were being promulgated, in Andalusia no fewer than 53,084 pupils in primary education and 2,425 in secondary education would be affected - and in the latter sector 1,521 of them (or 62.72%) were classed as alumnos libres (162).

Given the aforementioned dearth of educational facilities in Andalusia, one can imagine the harmful effect of such legislation on the region's schooling.

The secularisation of cemeteries was another polemical issue, in that it became difficult for the bereaved to give a Christian burial to the departed in areas where the laws secularising cemeteries were interpreted locally as the forbidding of religious ceremonies altogether, and of many such examples perhaps two will suffice:taxes on church burials were approved by the new town council in Huelva, for instance, which meant that the poor had to forego them (163), while in Seville two priests were arrested in 1932 for conducting a funeral procession and subsequently charged with violating the law prohibiting public manifestations of religion (164), a law which was: translated in Huelva, for example, into the withdrawl of all holy images and any other outward signs of religion from public places (165). Indeed, many councils attempted to enforce the secularisation laws on the use of buildings - in Huelva, again, the church of Nuestra Señora de la Merced was the target of such an attack (166), but the same city offers one of many examples of where such policies caused great human suffering: the Hermanas de la Caridad, after a five year fight, finally lost their convent devoted to the care of the sick and the old.in June 1936 (167).

Violence in the streets by mobs acting with the apparent carte blanche of a disinterested government, accompanied on a more legalistic level by a plethora of restrictions ranging from the petty to the severe only helped to convince Catholics that their faith was under attack and thereby place them in the position of having

to decide between those who would protect their Church and those who would destroy it, a choice which meant the formation of the Confederación Española de Derechas Autónomas, or CEDA.

The philosophy behind CEDA was the sociallyorientated Catholicism of Pope Leo XIII, somewhat akin to the Christian Democrat ideal of post-war Europe, and defined by G. Jackson as "the defence of Catholic sentiments and interests against the anticlerical attitudes and laws of the constituent Cortes (168), but perhaps what makes the formation of CEDA especially interesting in a study on the Andalusian Church is that its guiding mind was to become one of the best-known figures among the Andalusian episcopacy this century, namely Angel Herrera Oria, then a brilliant journalist. It was at a dinner of the Catholic movement Acción Nacional on 12 July 1931 that Herrera, its founder, publicised his plans for the creation of a nation based on the ideals of Leo XIII, and it was Acción Nacional which was to be the precursor of CEDA - as R.A.H. Robinson beautifully says, "... it was not a political party, though it could be the midwife for one" (169)- and CEDA came into being on 4 March 1933 with the ideals of an end to the class struggle, greater distribution of wealth, a just minimum wage, and the right to join a free trade union. Indeed, in answer to the tendentious accusations of being reactionary by its critics in the volatile atmosphere of Spain of the 1930s, it is salutary to remember that the leaders of CEDA repeatedly criticised the hypocritical behaviour of many of the Catholic property-owning elite in general (170), while it fought to prevent employers from

abusing the Conservative administration's term in office of 1933-36 in their attempts to cut the wages of working people in Andalusia in particular (171). It is worth adding here that agricultural labourers in Andalusia were to suffer even greater unemployment in the mid-1930s when the region's export-orientated economy (oranges, olives, etc.) was hit by the world slump, problems intensified by the already mentioned occupations of land by peasants (172) whose despair at their situation had hardened into militancy through the demagogy of the Federación Española de Trabajadores de la Tierra.

Moreover, the return of a left-wing government in 1936 under Azana was to signal a repetition of the Church-State polemic, with many of those inciting others to commit acts of violence against the Church enjoying legalised status, as the following examples of many such instances will illustrate: Communists at the Casa del Pueblo at Almeria in March 1936 declared their intention to "matar a toda la gente de iglesia, desde el cura de aldea hasta los obispos de las ciudades" (173); and at Niebla, Huelva, the newly elected Socialist deputy González Peña thanked his followers for their votes before inciting them to burn the local parish church (174). Indeed, events such as these were to occur throughout Spain in the period from the election of the leftist Popular Front to the military uprising beginning the Civil War. According to R.A.H. Robinson, no fewer than 160 churches were totally destroyed and another 251 sacked between 16 February and 15 June, with a further ten burnt in the month 16 June-13 July (175), again all perpetrated by those committed in varying degrees to the

cause of the Popular Front - hence it is not surprising that the Church should become identified with anti-Republican elements, in this case the military insurgents who were to rise in revolt on 17 July 1936.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- (1) Sopena, R.ed., <u>Geografía de España</u>, vol.1, Barcelona 1974, p. 75.
- (2) ibid., vol. II, p. 274.
- (3) Sevilla Guzmán, E., <u>La Evolucióm del Campesinado en</u>
  España, Barcelona 1979, p. 260.
- (4) ibid., p. 263.
- (5) de Miguel, A., and Salcedo, J., <u>Dinámico del</u>

  <u>desarrollo industrial de las regiones españolas</u>,

  Madrid 1972, p. 160.
- (6) Vida Nueva, 23 February 1980, no.1, 217, pp. 26-28.
- (7) López Zumel, J.M., "Una medición de los desequilibrios en la infraestructura económica y social de las regiones españolas", <u>Información Comercial</u>
  Española, no. 561, p.11.
- (8) Naylon, J., Andalusia, Oxford University Press, p.11 seq.
- (9) Carrión, P., Los latifundios en España, Valencia 1932, p.84.
- (10) ibid.,pp.80-81.
- (11) ibid.,p.82.
- (12) ibid.,p.82.
- (13) Burgos, A., Andalucía, ¿Tercer Mundo?, Barcelona 1971, pp.95,96.
- (14) op.cit.,p.278.
- (15) ibid.,p.278.
- (16) ibid.,p.280.
- (17) ibid.,pp.80-81.
- (18) op.cit.,pp.92-97.
- (19) Brenan, G., The Spanish Labyrinth, Cambridge 1943, p. 120.
- (20) Preston, P., The Coming of the Spanish Civil War Reform and Reaction and Revolution in the Second Republic 1931-1936, London 1978, p.74.

- (21) op.cit.,p.342.
- (22) op.cit.,p.117.
- (23) Boletín HOAC, May 1960, no. 304, pp. 8,6.
- (24) Carrión, P., La reforma agraria de la Segunda República y la situación actual de la agricultura española,

  Barcelona 1973, p.168.
- (25) Nadal, J., "Spain, 1830-1914", The Fontana Economic

  History of Europe, vol. IV, part II, London 1973, p. 573.
- (26) ibid.,p.574.
- (27) Fontana, J. and Nadal, J., "Spaim 1914-1970", The

  Fontana Economic History of Europe, vol. VI, part II,

  London 1973, p. 463.
- (28) Nadal, J., op. cit., pp. 601, 602.
- (29) op.cit.,pp.260,263.
- (30) op.cit.,p.156.
- (31) ibid.,p.157.
- (32) Vida Nueva, op. cit., pp. 26-28.
- (33) op.cit.,p.ll.
- (34) Requoted in Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 120.
- (35) ibid.,p.92.
- (36) Stewart, G., "Andalusia's Challenge to Spain", The World Today, May 1981, p. 195.
- (37) Salas, N., Andalucía: los siete círculos viciosos del subdesarrollo, Barcelona 1972, p.127.
- (38) op.cit.,p.195.
- (39) Salas, N., op. cit., p. 127.
- (40) Stewart, G., op. cit., p. 195.
- (41) Salas, N., op. cit., p. 128.
- (42) García-Villoslada, R. ed., <u>Historia de la Iglesia en España. V. La Iglesia en la España contemporánea</u>, Madrid 1979, p. 654.

- (43) Comin, A., España del Sur, Madrid 1965, p. 52.
- (44) ibid.,p.52.
- (45) ibid., p. 32.
- (46) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 202.
- (47) Vida Nueva, op. cit., pp. 26-28.
- (48) Bosque Maurel, J., "Nivel de desarrollo y dependencia en Andalucía", in Lombao, M. and Sacaluga, M.A. ed.,
  Andalucía, Barcelona 1977, p.14.
- (49) Preston, P., op. cit., p. 94.
- (50) The Economist, 6 September 1980, pp. 44-45.
- (51) op.cit.,p.24.
- (52) Noticias Obreras, 16-30 September 1979, no. 768, p. 11.
- (53) Samaniego Bonew, M., La política educativa de la Segunda República, Madrid 1977, p. 233.
- (54) ibid.,p.245.
- (55) ibid.,p.235.
- (56) ibid.,p.245.
- (57) ibid.,p.244.
- (58) ibid.,p.246.
- (59) <u>Semanas Sociales de España XXXI semana: Sevilla 1978</u>, Madrid 1978, p. 264.
- (60) Fundación FOESSA, Estudios sociológicos sobre la situación social de España, 1975, Madrid 1976, p. 214.
- (61) Semanas Sociales de España, op. cit., p. 270.
- (62) ibid.,p.272.
- (63) Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, <u>Datos y Cifras de la</u> Enseñanza en España, 1980, Madrid 1981, pp. 44-45.
- (64) Nevertheless, some regions still fare badly when compared to the traditionally wealthier parts of Spaim: in the academic year 1979-80, Cadiz and Vizcaya, for instance, had similar numbers on roll (179,003 for Cadiz and 180,146 for Vizcaya), yet Vizcaya had 5,705 schools

- for <u>E.G.B.</u> as opposed to <u>Cadiz's 5,123. (<u>Datos y</u> cifras....1980, op.cit., pp.44-45.</u>
- (65) ibid.,p.41.
- (66) Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, La Educación Preescolar,

  General Básica, Especial y Permanente de Adultos, Curso

  1980-81 Madrid 1981, p. 54.
- (67) <u>Datos y cifras...1980</u>, op. cit., pp. 58-59.
- (68) ibid.,pp.86-87.
- (69) ibid.,pp.84-85.
- (70) Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, Datos y Cifras, 1969, Madrid 1970, pp. 38-39.
- (71) La Educación Preescolar....1980-81, op. cit., pp. 48-49.
- (72) op.cit.,p.275.
- (73) Dobby, E.H.G., "Agrarian Problems in Spain", Geographical

  Review of the American Geographical Society, April 1936,
  and requoted in Brenam, G., op. cit., p. 121.
- (74) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 139.
- (75) Estudios del Instituto de Desarrollo Económico,

  Estudio Socioeconómico de Andalucía, vol.1, Madrid 1970,
  p.275.
- (76) ibid.,p.275.
- (77) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 138.
- (78) Gallo, M., Spain Under Franco, Londom 1973, p. 272.
- (79) Naylon, J., op. cit., p. 21.
- (80) Fundación FOESSA, op. cit., p. 125.
- (81) ibid.,p.125.
- (82) ibid.,p.126.
- (83) ibid.,p.127.
- (84) Estudios del Instituto de Desarrollo Económico,,op. cit.,pp.34-35.
- (85) Banco Español de Crédito, Anuario Banesto del Mercado Español, 1981, p. 317.

- (86) Fundacióm FOESSA, Estudios sociológicos sobre la situación social de España, 1970, Madrid 1970, p. 160.
- (87) Fundación FOESSA, Estudios...1975, op. cit., p. 43.
- (88) ibid.,p.43.
- (89) Estudios del Instituto de Desarrollo Ecomómico, op.cit., p.81.
- (90) Hills, G., Spain, London 1970, p. 107.
- (91) Calero, A., Movimientos Sociales en Andalucía (1820-1936), Madrid 1976, p. 21.
- (92) Ordóñez Márquez, J., La apostasía de las masas y la persecución religiosa en la provincia de Huelva 1931-1936, Madrid 1968, pp. 238-9, footnote 28.
- (93) Carrión, P., La reforma agraria..., op. cit., p. 140.
- (94) Bernal, A., La propiedad de la tierra y las luchas agrarias andaluzas, Barcelona 1974, p.178.
- (95) ibid., pp.176-7.
- (96) ibid.,p.174.
- (97) ibid.,p.175.
- (98) Bosque Maurel, J., op. cit., p. 14.
- (99) Boletín HOAC, 16-30 September 1979, no. 768, p. 12.
- (100) Cambio 16,31 August 1960,no.456,pp.12-13.
- (101) Noticias Obreras, 16-30 September 1979, no. 768, p. 12.
- (102) Gallo, M., op. cit., p. 22.
- (103) Lazo Díaz, A., La desamortización eclesiástica en Sevilla, Seville 1970, p.6.
- (104) Cuenca, J.M., Aproximación a la historia social de la Iglesia española contemporánea, Escorial 1978, p. 56.
- (105) ibid.,pp.55-56.
- (106) Peers, E.A., Spain, the Church and the Orders, London 1939, p. 87.
- (107) Cuenca, J.M., La Iglesia Española ante la Revolución Liberal, Madrid 1971, p. 212, footnote 14.

- (108) Peers, E.A., op. cit., p.88.
- (109) "Autoridad y Anarquía", La Solidaridad, 3 November 1889, p.2.
- (110) Aldea Vaquero, Q., Marín Martínez, T. and Vives Gatell, J., ed., Diccionario de Historia Eclesiástica en España, Madrid 1972-75, p.1, 905.
- (111) Balcells, A., Trabajo industrial y organización obrera en la Cataluña contemporánea, Barcelona 1974, p. 33.
- (112) García-Villoslada, R., ed., op. cit., p. 655.
- (113) ibid.,p.654.
- (114) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 202.
- (115) ibid.,p.202.
- (116) Peers, E.A., op. cit., pp. 28-29.
- (117) ibid.,p.31.
- (118) Sanchez, J.M., Reform and Reaction, University of North Carolina Press 1963, p.142.
- (119) Aznar, S., La Revolución Española y las Vocaciones Eclesiásticas, Madrid 1949, p. 50.
- (120) ibid.,p.50.
- (121) ibid.,pp.50,54.
- (122) ibid.,p.128.
- (123) Payme, S.G., A History of Spain and Portugal, University of Wisconsin 1973, pp.137-8.
- (124) ibid.,p.138.
- (125) Sáez Marín, J., <u>Datos sobre la Iglesia Española</u>
  Contemporánea, Madrid 1975, p. 95.
- (126) ibid.,p.294.
- (127) García-Villoslada, R., ed., op. cit., pp. 338-9.
- (128) ibid.,pp.338-9.
- (129) Aldea Vaquero, Q. et al., ed., op.cit., pp. 303, 617,

- 60 -1,046, 1,058, 1,107, 2,455.
- It is surely worth adding that of 638 new priests
- in 1962-63, only 50 (7.8%) were Andalusian (Guía de la Iglesia en España 1963, p.22).
- (130) Tussell, J., Historia de la democracia cristiana en España, I, Madrid 1974, p. 72.
- (131) Díaz del Moral, Historia de las Agitaciones Campesinas Andaluzas, Madrid 1967, p.142.
- (132) García-Nieto París, J.N. El Sindicalismo Cristiano em España, Bilbao 1960, p.62.
- (133) ibid.,p.74.
- (134) Díaz del Moral, op. cit., p. 373.
- (135) op. cit.,pp.91-96.
- (136) ibid.,p.104.
- (137) ibid.,pp.90-91.
- (138) Díaz del Moral, op. cit., p. 373.
- (139) ibid.,p.376.
- (140) ibid.,p.402.
- (141) García-Nieto París.J.N., op.cit.,p.104.
- (142) Malefakis, E.E., Agrarian Reform and Peasant Revolution in Spain, University of Yale 1970, p. 434.
- (143) Aldea Vaquero, Q. et al., ed., op. cit., p. 65.
- (144) ibid.,p.361.
- (145) ibid.,p.957.
- (146) ibid..p.1.378.
- (147) ibid.,p.1,407.
- (148) ibid.,p.1,085.
- (149) ibid.,p.2,551.
- (150) op cit.,p.434.
- (151) Díaz del Moral, op. cit., p. 402.
- (152) Ordónez Márquez, J., op. cit., p. 233.
- (153) ibid..p.233.
- (154) Calero.A., op. cit., pp. 144-6.
- (155) Brassloff, A. "Church-State relations in Spain

- since the Civil War", <u>Iberian Studies</u>, vol.II, no.2, Autumn 1973, pp.88-92.
- (156) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado de</u>
  <u>Granada,1931</u>,pp.606-7.
- (157) Ordóñez Márquez, J., op. cit., p. 2.
- (158) ibid.,pp.4-6.
- (159) Boletin...Granada, 1931, op.cit., pp.645-651.
- (160) Ben-Ami, S., The Origins of the Second Republic in Spaim, Oxford 1978, p. 258.
- (161) Robinson, R.A.H., The Origins of Franco's Spain,
  Newton Abbott 1970, p.123.
- (162) Pérez Galán, M., La enseñanza en la Segunda República Española, Madrid 1975, pp.172-3,174-5.
- (163) Ordónez Márquez, J., op. cit., p.8.
- (164) Sanchez, J., op. cit., p. 145.
- (165) Ordóñez Márquez, J., op. cit., pp. 13-16.
- (166) ibid.,p.43.
- (167) ibid.,p.40,note 112.
- (168) Jackson, G., The Spanish Republic and the Civil War, 1931-39, Princeton University Press 1965, p.116.
- (169) Robimsom, R.A.H. op. cit., p. 71.
- (170) ibid.,p.115.
- (171) ibid.,p.359,note 72.
- (172) see notes 94-97.
- (173) Montero Moreno, A., <u>Historia de la Persecución</u>
  Religiosa en España, Madrid 1961, p. 39, note 67.
- (174) ibid.,p.39,note 65.
- (175) Robisom, R.A.H., op. cit., p. 395, note 178, and p. 397, note 192.

# CHAPTER ONE

From persecution to re-establishment: from the outbreak of Civil War (1936) to the late forties.

## The Historical Perspective.

It would be incorrect to assume, from the identifying of the Church with the rebel forces of the Right, that the uprising of 17 July which plunged Spain into three years of Civil War had as its foremost aim the defence of Catholicism. Such a view, espoused thus by A. Brassloff -"Nor was it illogical that the military uprising begun on 17 July 1936 ... to counter-attack in the name of religion as well as patriotism"(1) - is partly correct in that this development began to occur as the war went on, but it must be questioned if such thoughts were at the front of the minds of the insurgents. J.de Iturralde points out that in his first manifesto of 18 July 1936, Franco made no mention of the hardships suffered by the Church - "De religión, ni media palabra" are his words (2) and that a directive written by Mola, and carrying Franco's agreement, in Madrid on 5 June 1936 (just six weeks before the uprising) even advocated separation of Church and State together with the idea of religious freedom for all, in the tenth of eighteen decretosleyes: (3). However, on close scruting perhaps such an attitude is not surprising, given both the traditional 'lukewarm' approach to Catholicism by many who at best could only probably be called nominal Catholics, and their possible realisation of the need to appeal to a wider circle than committed Catholics for their cause. Moreover, a more exact appraisal of the Church-Nationalist relationship is that as it became clear that

the rising had not been fully successful and that more support would be needed as the war developed, then a more overtly favourable policy towards the Church became the norm as it was increasingly obvious that a hierarchy who had seem the Church endure not only harassment but persecution for five years not unnaturally received the rebels with fervour born of gratitude, among them the Andalusian archbishops Ilundain of Seville and Parrado y García at Granada, as will be seen. This helped convince the insurgents of the support of a beleagured Church for their cause, and may well have been instrumental in Franco -who until then, it would seem, was somewhat remiss in his religious practice (4)citing the defence of the Church as one of the reasons for the uprising, within a week on 25 July (5). Against accusations that the Nationalists' espousal of Catholicism was therefore born more of pragmatism than of commitment, it must be added that several officers were practicing Catholics, that Franco himself seems to have undergone a religious conversion (remaining a practicing Catholic until death), and that the savagery of the attacks on the Church once the uprising was declared was enough to make even many of the hither to less-committed rally to the Church's aid.

However, such niceties were irrelevant to those with a traditional hostility to the Church — it is not without significance that at the outset of what was to be a three-year Civil War (and at the rapid success enjoyed by the rebels in many parts of southern Spain) there was an outbreak of church-burning throughout Spain and in Andalusia in particular: even in Seville, a city which fell to the insurgents within twenty-four

hours of the <u>alzamiento</u>, there were thirty-five churches totally destroyed and more than two hundred others partially destroyed (6).

The left-wing commentator I.Moreno Navarro feels that such acts of violence were nothing more than a kind of desperate reprisal by those who saw that the uprising against the elected government of the day would put an end to their dreams of a socialist society, and, hapless before the suddenness of these new events, wented their anger and frustration on what they considered to be one of the cornerstones of the reactionary establishment (7):

"Fue una represalia desesperada, fruto de la impotencia para luchar com éxito contra los poderosos intereses...Ante la imposibilidad de destruir estos intereses y a las personas que los encarnaban, que ahora se alzaban violentamente contra ellos, destruyeron el símbolo mismo del orden que éstos defendían: la Iglesia."

However, this argument has little validity in the light of the evidence of A.Montero Moreno cited in the previous chapter (8) that elected officers of the Republic were inciting their followers to kill priests and ruin churches even before the uprising. Also, such acts of aggression were to prove counter-productive, in that they helped polarise opinion against the Republic and its policies - a fact admitted even by Republican apologists, for instance F.Borkenau, who, writing not long after the outbreak of the war, saw the folly of

such violence (9):

"I do not think many people will approve of the church-burning which occurred in many parts of Spain in July:it was a barbarism and a political mistake. Where Catholicism was on the decline the measure was useless; where it was vigorous it must have created increased artagonism to the Republican cause."

Certainly, the ferocity of the attacks on the Church, coupled with the recent history of governmental hostility, must have convinced even the more moderate of churchmen that their best course of action was to side with the Nationalist insurgents. Indeed, dioceses which fell to the rebels were freed of persecution and harassment: Seville, for instance, lost only 3.6% of its diocesan priests; while Malaga, which remained under Republican control for much longer, lost the staggering total of 47.9% (fuller details on the loss of priests and other persecutions are given later in this chapter). The latter diocese is an example of how the killing of clergy went on unabated in areas which were yet to fall to the Nationalists: by mid-September 1936, only two months into the war, almost 3,400 clergy had been killed, plus the seventeen priests killed in the period immediately prior to the war (10). Given this background of violence against personnel and sacrilege against buildings, the Church could not remain silent, and it was not surprising that the joint

pastoral published on 1 July 1937 -whose signatories included the Andalusian hierarchy - should welcome the uprising, with continued ecclesiastical support throughout the remainder of the conflict until its end on 1 April 1939 with a Nationalist victory and the re-establishment of former Catholic rights.

The years which followed witnessed a fusion of the religious and the patriotic, a phenomenon commonly known as nacional-catolicismo, where to be a patriot meant being a Catholic, and vice versa, in an atmosphere of religious-based nationalism. The Church was to enjoy the new religious liberties of the Francoist state liberties in the sense of provision of facilities by the state to enable the Church to broadcast its message and influence practically every apparatus of society, but at the cost of Franco obtaining the privilegio de presentación in the appointment of bishops, a concession which seemed appropriate in the triumphalist era of the forties but which later was to appear anacronistic when the values of nacional-catolicismo were to be questioned. The post-Civil War period also saw the Spanish state, with the defeat of the Axis powers in the Second World War and repeated condemnations of Franco's regime at the United Nations (such as at the meetings of 19 July 1945 and 9 February 1946) become increasingly inward-looking, with its economic policy of autarquía and its political policy of reprisal against the defeated and repression of potential enemies. The Spanish Church during this period, both in Andalusia in particular and in Spain in general, continually expressed its gratitude to the victors while endeavouring to win back those who had

lapsed with a well-planned campaign of missions, devotions, processions and pilgrimages.

However, the ecclesiastical euphoria of this era begins to wane towards the late forties: certainly, there is a change of tone, in that all is no longer imbued with triumphalism. A slight hint of concern at Spain's socio-economic problems is manifested, in Andalusia especially, by more charismatic prelates like Angel Herrera Oria, ex-editor of El Debate and supporter of CEDA, and by now Bishop of Malaga. This period also sees the founding of HOAC - Hermandades Obreras de Acción Católica - a movement initiated by the Primate Pla i Deniel and actively and openly supported by him from attacks from ultra-conservative quarters for its interest in Spain's socio-economic problems and its concern as to how these affected the more vulnerable members of society. Such instances perhaps reflect a growing disillusionment with Falangist policies which had little success socially. The Concordat of 27 August 1953 is commonly regarded as the next milestone of importance, as it were, from the re-establishment of the Catholic Church at the Nationalists' victory of 1939. But for some years before the signing of the Concordat, there was already evidence that the Church was no longer the monolithic bloc that it had appeared to be in its years of somewhat belligerent rejoicing; though change itself did not occur, there appeared signs of change, tentative though they were; therefore, although most commentators accept that the period upto 1953, the year of the Concordat, marked the apogee of nacional - catolicismo, considerable evidence exists to suggest otherwise.

- I. During the Civil War.
- a) The Church in Nationalist held areas.

The insurgents made rapid progress in many parts of Andalusia, successfully occupying great tracts of the region within a few months of the uprising. Perhaps the most stunning success of all was in Seville, where within only twenty-four hours of the rebellion General Gonzalo Queipo de Llano had arrested the commanding officer there, General Villa-Abrille, along with the civil governor and chief of police. Almost immediately afterwards the victorious general was to be publicly photographed alongside Eustaquio Cardinal Ilundain, Archbishop of Seville - indeed, the prelate's support for the general was unwavering, as J. de Iturralde indicates (II):

"No hubo acto de resonancia en que no apareciese al lado del general Queipo, y la vez primera que se presentó allá el general Franco, lo hizo con sus calurosas felicitaciones....."

On I5 September a solemn ceremony took place commemorating the return of religious freedom symbolised by the return of the crucifix to the walls of all classrooms in the diocese - "Asistiran todas las autoridades, presididas por Su Eminencia el Cardinal Ilundain y por el heroico y glorioso General Queipo de Llano", in the words of El Correo de Andalucía(I2), while the sacristan of the Sagrario Church in Seville, Francisco Olmedo, planned to present to the victorious general an album in his honour (I3). All this show of ecclesiastical and military friendship and co-operation was against a background of processions where

the religious and the nationalistic were slowly being fused, as in the report of a procession on 8 September in honour of Our Lady by El Correo de Andalucía - "Ella haga que Espana, libre de las tristezas de la guerra, vuelva a gozar de paz y de prosperidad y que vuelva a ser, como lo fue antaño, la nación católica por excelencia" (I4). Also. Requiem Masses were being celebrated for those who had died in the fighting, though, given the support of the Nationalist cause, one assumes that, in the highly charged atmosphere of a Civil War which had attained religious overtones, such prayers for the departed were perhaps somewhat selective as to one particular faction, as the wording from the same newspaper would indicate (I5) - "Se celebra todos los viernes en el altar del Privilegio Gregoriano, en sufragio de los que han dado su vida por la Patria y para atraer la bendición de Dios sobre los que luchan" - all of which would be in line with the request by Ilundain to the faithful to pray "por el remedio de las necesidades de la Iglesia y de la Patria" (I6).

Other Andalusian areas fallen to the Nationalists experienced similar rejoicing, as in Granada, where Archbishop Parrado y García informed his diocese that true peace lay in obedience and not in desiring the material wealth of this world - a philosophy which, one could argue, the <u>latifundista</u> allies of his Church and of the insurgents would have done well to put into practice, but which nevertheless may be interpreted as a sincere attempt among many to heal the wounds of a fratricidal conflict (I7);

"Pero la paz de Cristo unicamente puede hallarse en el reino de Cristo....no puede existir la paz si no se observan fielmente las enseñanzas, los preceptos y los

ejemplos de nuestro divino Salvador
....Ylos hombres, dejadas a un
lado la justicia y la caridad,
hambrientos con locas ansias de los
bienes de la tierra..... se han
olvidado de las enseñanzas de
Cristo, han arrojado a Dios de
sus almas...."

The Archbishop of Granada was to demonstrate his gratitude to the liberating General Valera similar to that shown by Ilundain to Queipo de Llano, both being photographed at a joint banquet held in Granada on 25 August 1936 (18). A report of an open-air mass for I,500 Falangists at Viznar, in this diocese, on the feast of the Assumption shows how the religious and the nationalistic for some could be almost completely fused. The newspaper El Ideal (19) stated that the Mass was celebrated "para comemorar la festividad de la bandera roja y gualda" during which "el sacerdote oficiante, despues de convertir el pan y el vino en el Cuerpo y Sangre de Jesucristo, eleva a Dios y todas las fuerzas rinden sus armas .....y la orquesta interpreta el himno de Falange" - one of many reports of a similar nature.

With the passing of time, the occupying forces were able to become more established in the areas gained, and it became customary to celebrate the first anniversary of the fall of each area to the Nationalists by means of Masses, processions and other manifestations of a religious nature together with acts of charity by Catholic groups, as in the report in El Correo de Andalucía headlined "Fregenal de la Sierra - El primer aniversario de la liberación del dominio rojo - Varios actos religiosos, comidas a los pobres" (20).

The phrase "liberación del dominio rojo" is also significant; the Nationalists viewed themselves liberators in that, given the polarisation which by now presumably divided people into Catholics or Communists, a philosophy given substance by the statement of Antoniutti, the new papal nuncio ("Me siento especialmente honrado en esta hora solemne del renacimiento católico de España") on presenting his credentials at Burgos, the seath of the rebel government, in October 1937 (21). Jerez was the scene of a Te Deum, celebrating the anniversary of the fall of that city, by Teodoro Molina Escribano in October 1937 (22), and the baptism of a local Jew, which won great publicity (23). Such were the shows of religious fervour in areas newly occupied by the invading forces of the Nationalists, perhaps occasionally emotional or hyperbolistic in nature or tone but to be viewed against a backcloth of savage enmity, as will be appreciated in the following survey on the position of the Church in areas in Andalusia still under Republican control.

## b) The Church in Republican-held areas.

In the zones still under Republican control, those considered as enemies of the proletariat and therefore obstacles to the realization of the proletariat's aim were killed - with priests and nuns, as often as not, being the main victims. Figures varied from region to region, but Andalusia, already with a history of bitter anticlericalism, witnessed massacres of religious on a wide scale, as is illustrated by the following figures of the killings of Diocesan clergy, supplied by A. Montero Moreno (24):

1	víctimas	clero incardinado 1936	porcentaje victimas
Almería	65	200	32
Cádiz	5	-	-
Córdoba	84	257	32,6
Granada	43	415	10,3
Guadix	22	130	16,9
Jaén	124	365	33 ,.4
Málaga	1 <b>1</b> 5	240	47,9
Sevilla	24	657	3,6"

The number of victims among the Andalusian clergy therefore amounted to 482, or 17.02% of the total number of diocesan clergy for the region obtained from the figures advanced by V.Cárcel Ortí for 1931 (25) -it being impossible to ascertain total numbers for 1936 because of the lack of statistics for Cadiz which is a much higher percentage than the 11.52% of diocesan priests lost nationally (4184 out of a total of 34,176(26)). Given the severe shortage of priests in Andalusia compared to elsewhere in Spain, a loss of more than one priest in six in the region was catastrophic. This is not to play down the persecution suffered by the Church elsewhere in Spain:a total of 6,832 religious were killed, constituting 4,184 diocesan clergy, 2,365 regular clergy and 283 nuns, testifying as to the scale of the atrocities .

The depth of anticlerical feeling in many areas may be gauged by the fact that Malaga lost almost half of its priests in only six months of Republican domination, though perhaps 'domination by mob rule' would be a fairer description of those areas yet to be

won by the Nationalists. Describing the situation in Huelva once the uprising was declared (and the city still remaining under Republican jurisdiction)

J. Ordóñez Márquez makes the following observation (27):

"Un síntoma característico distingue este período del inmediato anterior.

Hasta aquí había sido una persecución taimada, que partía de la clase dirigente, y que iba incubando y haciendo eco en las masas apóstasas. Desde el día 18 de julio, en cambio, es la masa la que realiza consignas, sin ser controlada por nadie..."

Priests captured by bands of Republican sympathisers. were imprisoned before being tried before local tribunals though, in many cases, such formalities were dispensed with - and often said Mass among themselves while in captivity, supplying fellow prisoners with various spiritual needs before being shot. According to A.Montero Moreno (28), this was the usual pattern of events in areas under long Republican control such as Jaen, which was the scene of spirited resistance by groups of Catholics against the forces of the Republican authorities before it fell to the Nationalists, the most famous of which being the nine-month seige by Republicans of the village of Santa María de la Cabeza where 1,500 Catholics were marooned and which was first thought to have ended by a massacre of all survivors by the Republicans (29), but which, in fact, according to H. Thomas, ended with the women and children being taken away in lorries and the other defenders being taken prisoner (30). Indeed, according

to the ultra-rightist J. Pérez de Urbel, in an account of religious persecution during the war which is at times highly emotional and therefore perhaps not totally accurate in that it is possibly prone to exageration, Andalusia was where persecution and death on purely religious grounds was at its height - "En Andalucía, el 75 por ciento de los crímenes cometidos, lo fueron en olor de martirio cristiano"(31) -whether or not one wishes to question the veracity of such a high calculation. However, the writer does give a vivid picture of some of the personal tragedies which occured, such as: the arrest and execution of the Estévez family while attempting to escape from Republican-held Malaga to the nearest Nationalist zone - evidence that Catholics saw their sefety assured whenever or wherever the insurgents gained control (32), a point also made by J. Ordóñez Márquen concerning the fall of Huelva to the Nationalists by 29 July (33). Mention of Malaga is a reminder of the atrocities committed there against priests and nuns while the city was under Republican control - Franco in a speech on 25 July 1936 was to speak of "Malaga la mártir, con sus templos quemados, sus sacerdotes martirizados"(34) - and the execution of eight priests who helped run the mental hospital Sanatorio de San José, described thus by the newspaper Ayer, is a chilling reminder of the suffering of humble priests who lived to the full their vows of self-denial and service to others and yet who, in the volatile and polarised atmosphere of the time, were labelled by mobs and other factions as the enemies of the people (35):

"Por fin, después de una dolorosa y emocionada despedida de su padre superior y de sus queridos enfermos, los pobres religiosos partieron para el lugar del suplicio, encomendando sus almas a Dios...."

Guadix, too, suffered in terms of church personnel and property, one of the greatest attacks there being the sacking of the church of Santiago on 2 August 1936 - "En Guadix, se vive en régimen comunista" (36) stated El Ideal sympathetically from a Granada now saved, thanks to its fall to the Nationalists, from such attacks - and the following data on attacks against church buildings taken from national statistics given by A. Montero Moreno illustrate the scale of destruction the Andalusian Church had to suffer (37):

	churches totally destroyed	churches partly destroyed
Almeria	4	all
Cadiz	1	16
Cordoba	4	<b>2</b> 88
Granada	8	46
Guadix.	3	118
Jaem	several ("varias")	95%
Malaga	6	282
Seville	35	211

Official rejection of Christianity by authorities in areas still under Republican control also took on a bizarre aspect at times: one instance is that at the village of Güéjar, where the local mayor, called Galván, had begun the custom of baptising children in Marxism

while using the rituals of Catholicism, a novelty which was to quickly disappear at the fall of the area to the insurgents -"El último día socialista de Güéjar, es decir el día 17 de julio" in the words of El Ideal (38). The innovation of such a blasphemous act is a reminder, nevertheless, of how left-wing extremism had attained a quasi-mystic meaning in the minds of its adherents many years previously.

Perhaps nowhere in all Spain was such rejection of Catholicism more accutely felt than in Andalusia, and it is not surprising that the violence unleashed against the hierarchy in Spain should include bishops in Andalusia: of the thirteen bishops murdered during the Civil War, three were from Andalusian dioceses, these being Manuel Basulto Jiménez (Bishop of Jaen), Diego Ventaja Milán (Bishop of Almeria) and Manuel Medina Olmos (Bishop of Guadix-Baza). All three were killed during the first few weeks of the war; no other Andalusian prelates were killed as the war went on, either because they escaped (for example, Bishop Santos Olivera of Malaga) or because their dioceses were relatively quickly won by the Mationalists (such as Cardinal Ilundain's Seville) and thereby made safe for them.

A brief account of the killings of the three bishops mentioned above will show the degree to which the hierarchy was hated by the Left and its supporters. Bishop Manuel Basulto Jiménez was forced to leave the episcopal palace on 2 August 1936 and then taken by train by Madrid. He was then led by a mob to be shot, together with his sister Doña Teresa and some 250 others, on 11 August 1936 (39). Bishop Diego Ventaja Milàn

was regarded by many Catholics in Spain as an exemplary martyr in that he refused to escape from his diocese when help was offered - in the form of an offer of refuge on an English ship moored nearby made by two Englishmen, Geoffrey Wesdale and William Smith, on 24 July 1936. He was forced to leave the bishop's palace that same day and had to face a jeering crowd as he underwent his own via crucis through the streets of Almeria on the way to the prison ship "Astoy Mendi". He was joined by Bishop Medina who had been brought from Guadix after his palace there had been attacked by a mob led by David Salvador, Mayor of Guadix. At eleven o'clock on the night of 29 August, both bishops were taken from the ship and on the Malaga-Motril road, near the village of Vicar, they were killed, their bodies being thrown to the bottom of a ravine (40).

Such violence against the priests of the Church, after a history of antagonism against the Church from the Republic, an antagonism translated into that administration's -or the leftist factions of that administration - anticlerical laws, coupled with the street violence unleashed against the Church's officers and its property which increased once the uprising began - all this was to result in the war assuming religious as well as political overtones in the eyes of those committed to the Church, and from here it was a short step to the cruzada concept alluded to by Fr. Menéndez Reigada, a description which prompted the French theologian Jaques Maritain to make the following condemnation of such a philosophy (41):

"Qu'on invoque donc, si on la croit juste, la justice de la guerre qu'on fait. Qu'on n' invoque pas sa sainteté. Qu'on tue, si on croit tuer, au nom de l'ordre social ou de la nation, cela est déjà horrible. Qu'on ne tue pas au nom du Christ-Roi, qui n'est pas un Chef de guerre, mais un roi de grâce et de charité, mort pour tous les hommes, et dont le royaume n'est pas de ce monde."

The reaction from ABC de Sevilla, in its issue of
25 August 1938, offers an example from Andalusia of the
passionate feelings of those who saw the war as a crusade"El judío Maritain es el capitoste de esta infame campaña
contra la España auténticamente católica y tradicional" (42)
- thereby illustrating that whereas there were Catholics
in other countries critical of the war enjoying the Church's
blessing, in Spain itself, after years of parliamentary
harassment and street violence, such criticism from those
without first-hand knowledge of the situation was not to
be tolerated.

## c) The Church's relief at Nationalist victory.

In those areas of Andalusia where the Church had had to undergo the rigours of Republican rule and the violence of the mobs, victory by the Nationalists was particularly welcoming. One Andalusian bishop who had the good fortune to escape the fate of the three Andalusian bishops mentioned above was Balbino Santos Olivera, Bishop of Malaga, who managed to escape onto an Italian ship,

with the help of the Italian consul, and thence to Tangiers, where he stayed until the fall of Malaga to the Nationalists. A study of the pastorals written by Santos Olivera before and after the capture of Malaga by Nationalist troops throws interesting light on the close relationship which existed between the hierarchy and the insurgents, in Andalusia particularly and in Spain generally, A pastoral written during his temporary exile in Tangiers on 1 November 1936 and addressed to those areas of Malaga diocese which have already fallen to the Nationalists - "los pueblos ya pacificados" to use his words - demonstrates his praise for the Nationalist cause and condemnation of the Republican one (43):

"Aunque no puedan oír todavía la voz insinuante del Pastor la mayor parte de los diocesanos Nuestros, que gimen aún aprisionados bajo el ominoso yugo del terror y de la iniquidad, sois ya un gran número los que habéis sido liberados de tan funesto régimen merced a la divina Providencia, que para ello se ha valido del invencible y glorioso brazo del ejército español...."

It is self-evident that the insurgents are regarded as the liberators and protectors of the Church and its followers. Other phrases directed to the faithful speak of "el momento venturoso de vuestra liberación", "el inicuo despojo de vuestras casas y haciendas" and "la nueva era de paz y bienandanza.....en España para la Religión y para la Patria" (already with echoes of the nacional-catolicismo to come ). The tone of the document, though

militant and self-congratulatory, also alludes to the basic Christian precepts of forgiveness, love and brother-hood as the bishop exhorts his flock to reject all thoughts of enmity: "Ahora debéis ser y sentiros todos más crist-ianos y hermanos... que nunca, por la estrecha y fraternal unión que debe reinar entre todos....borrando para siemprelos odios y rencores que motivaron la presente catástrofe..." The pastoral ends with instructions for it to be read the first Sunday after the fall of each parish in the diocese to the Nationalists.

The pastoral written by Santos Olivera on 30 March 1937, after the fall of Malaga to the Nationalists and the subsequent re-establishment there of an ecclesiastical administration, is similar in tone, eulogising and even sanctifying the efforts of the Nationalists (44);

"Gracias muy rendidas sean dadas a Dios Nuestro Señor, que Nos ha concedido el suspirado favor de reintegrarnos a Nuestra Sede.....

Honor y gratitud al glorioso

Ejército nacional que tan rápida y brillantemente conquistó el territorio entero de esta Diócesis para Dios y para la Patria."

After what seemed an interminable wait for the fall of Malaga - "Siete siglos Nos parecieron los siete meses que hubimos de estar alejados de vosotros" - and the suffering and sacrifice of the people which this entailed - "cohibido y aherrojado bajo la tiránica dominación de la impiedad y del ateismo" - all is now well, and plans for the regeneration of the Church and its winning of the masses lost to it are

high on the list of priorities;

- (i) "iLoado sea el Señor !Hoy como nunca podemos en la España liberada del yugo marxista practicar nuestros cultos y hacer professión y ostentación de nuestras creencias cristianas a banderas desplegadas..."
- (ii) "Se impone ante todo desterrar

  de nuestro suelo ese libertinaje

  de costumbres; esa inmoralidad

  en el hablar, en el vestir....ese

  paganismo, en fin, repugnante y

  exótico, que había invadidos todas

  las esferas de la sociedad..."

The winning of Malaga by the Nationalists also occurred within four days of the fifteenth anniversary of the coronation of Pope Pius Xl. Santos Olivera duly sent to the Vatican the following telegram (45);

"Nombre propio Diocesis entera felizmente liberada tiranía muscovita, dígnese elevar solio Augusto Pontífice filial homenaje rendido acatamiento, anhelando numerosos aniversarios gloríosisimo pontificado."

The reply from the Vatican's Secretary of State confirmed Rome's pleasure at the good news - Soberano Pontífice profundamente conmovido filial homenaje Diocesis felizmente libertada..." - but perhaps the most significant aspect of this congratulatory message is that the signatory was Eugenio Cardinal Pacelli, soon to become Pope Pius XII.

Supports from the Church for the Nationalist cause, then, seemed assured - not just from the Spanish hierarchy, but from the Chair of St. Peter.

Certainly, the Church in the newly-won areas had cause to be grateful to the Nationalists. In Andalusia, especially, where the military campaign had met with relatively speedy success, the Church was able to exercise freely its rights and privileges, as may be seen in the afore-mentioned pastoral of 30 March 1937 by Santos Olivera;

"Nunca hemos presenciado los hijos de la generación actual ....tanto respeto y consideración hacia la Iglesia, tanta libertad de acción en el ejercicio de sus derechos...."

Along with this new liberty given to the Church, the insurgents began to rescind all those laws of the Second Republic considered harmful to Church interests, from as early as September 1936 (46).

The fall of Almeria to the Nationalists after a long period of Republican rule was also an occasion of great rejoicing, especially as the celebration of this event also coincided with the end of the war and a Nationalist victory that had daily looked more inevitable. The Falange organ Nueva España, published in Almeria, urged Catholics to go to a Mass celebrating the fall of the city to the Nationalists (47).

"Hoy a las diez de la mañana se celebrará en el parque una misa de campaña en acción de gracias por la liberación de Almería. Es de esperar

que a este acto acudirá la población en masa, para mostrar nuestro entusiasmo por nuestra liberación."

Do phrases like "es de esperar que" suggest that the new ecclesiastical and civic authorities were not altogether sure of a spontaneous acceptance of the idea by many of the people in an area which had witmessed almost frenzied anticlericalism? Perhaps, on mature thought, they merely express the wish for Catholics to demonstrate their unity and show public gratitude for having reached the end of the excesses they must have suffered, as in the following announcements of the forthcoming requiems for priests killed by Republican sympathisers before the fall of Almeria (48):

"El sábado, 22 de abril, a las diez de la mañana, se celebrarán solemnes funerales...en memoria de los RR.PP. de la Compañía de Jesús, Alfonso Payán, Jesús Martínez Santaella y Manuel Luque, martirizados por odio de la fe católica y de la Iglesia en Almería... Se ruega a la asistencia a dichos funerales a todos los católicos de Almería..."

Indeed, the Church in Almeria is an example of how the concept of martyrdom was emphasised in the ceremonies of thanksgiving, with notices of the times of Masses in <a href="Nueva España">Nueva España</a> and Yugo being accompanied by phrases such as "Tened un recuerdo para nuestros mártires" (49).

As in the case of Seville and Granada, local ecclesiastical

dignitaries met with the heads of the occupying forces, this being on 12 April 1939 (50), by which date the war was already over.

Members of the Andalusian hierarchy, along with their colleagues throughout Spain, had pastorals published to celebrate the end of the war, and an examination of the pastorals written by the leaders of Andalusia's three biggest dioceses - Seville, Granada and Malaga - will illustrate the episcopal relief at the welcome outcome. Balbino Santos Olivera, Bishop of Malaga, two of whose pastorals written during the conflict have already been examined, looked on the war as a holy crusade, as may be seen from the title of his pastoral of 12 April 1939 - "Exhortación Pastoral con motivo de la terminación de nuestra Santa Cruzada" (51). The document is imbued with a tone of victorious jubilation, claiming that the victory achieved is not just for Spain, but for the whole of Christianity:

"Esta es.... la victoria que vence al mundo: nuestra fe, nuestra religiosidad, nuestros elevados y firmísimos ideales. Con ellos ha triunfado en España, y por España en el mundo, la causa de la verdad, de la justicia, de la civilización cristiana."

Happy are those who have been able to play an active part from the very beginning of the uprising to its glorious end under the guidance of Franco, and just is the final reward of those who had to suffer behind Republican lines:

"Verdad es que no fuimos nostros tan afortunados como aquellos hermanos nuestros que, al estallar el Movimiento salvador, quedaron desde el primer instante bajo la égida gloriosa y paternal de su invicto CAUDILLO; pero tampoco tan desventurados como tantos otros que..... hubieron de vivir oprimidos y aherrojados en campo dominado por el enemigo. "

Although it could be argued that the document seems devoid of any reference to the theme of reconciliation or understanding between the warring factions or is somewhat belligerent in tone, again one must appreciate the times in which it was written, where with the greatest will in the world those who had seen fellow priests murdered would find it difficult to feel any profound rapprochement with their erstwhile persecutors. There are a few vague phrases asking for unity in the new state - ".....que, unidos todos sus hijos - de todas clases y categorías - en apretado haz, colaboremos en la obra gigantesca y trascendental de la restauración de nuestras glorias...." but the underlying theme is one of joy at the victory of one side over another and determination that the new State, if it is to be a healthy one, should have religious elements as its base:

"Mostraos, amadísimos diocesanos, dignos de vuestra historia y de vuestra acendrada fe. Haced ante todo Religión, si queréis hacer Patria, y una Patria grande

e imperial."

The pastoral of Parrado y García, Archbishop of Granada, on the outcome of the war was similarly jubilant in tone (52). The end of the war is seen as the end of the sufferings of committed Catholics — "Bendito sea el Señor, que ha puesto fin a vuestro largo y pemosísimo cautiverio!" — and pleas for compassion and understanding are accompanied by disapproval of the doctrines of the Republican enemy:

"Al poner fin a este punto, queden expresados nuestros sentimientos de exhaltación y santa envidia para todos nuestros queridos mártires.... y de cristiana compasión hacia quienes, engañados y envenenados por falsos apóstoles de insanas utopías y monstruosos errores, revelaron al perpetuar esos crímenes una miseria moral inmensa."

Other pastorals were often tinged with a certain biblical obscurantism, perhaps the best examples coming from the pen of Pedro Cardinal Segura - successor of the now deceased Ilundain at Seville and who formally took possession of his cathedral in a ceremony at which all the local military and civic dignitaries enjoyed what was to become a customary place of honour, on 12 September 1937 (53) - who, on the official date of the end of the war, on 1 April 1939, wrote a pastoral (54) in which he made a somewhat tortuous analogy between the sufferings of the Church during the Civil War and the sufferings of the Israelites and various figures in

the Old Testament, using the analogy to illustrate how the debt owed to God by the Spaniards equalled that of the Israelites for their deliverance. Segura, too, is confident of the new era of revived religious values which will be ushered in by the newly-established authorities - "...indudablemente inicia una nueva época de restauración religiosa en España" though it was later to be seen that his idea of the restoration of religious values totally precluded any interference in ecclesiastical affairs by the secular authorities, an independent attitude which was to be the cause of continued hostility between the regime and the one troublesome priest of the Andalusian hierarchy (as will be seem in the examination of the immediate post-war period). But the general attitude in ecclesiastical circles in April 1939 was one of profound gratitude to, and unstinting praise of, the success of the insurgents, the support of the Andalusian bishops equalling that of the Primate, Gomá, who had a pleasant exchange of telegrams with Franco (55).

Indeed, such was the hatred for the Republic by many Nationalist-Catholic 'ultras' at the time that even those Catholics who had attempted some form of rapprochement or modus vivendi with the Republic (such as the parliamentary approach of CEDA) were bitterly criticised in some quarters: the writer José Pemartín was particularly scathing, and his censure even extended to Angel Herrera, editor of the right-of-centre <u>El Debate</u> and afore-mentioned co-founder of CEDA. Pemartín accused the future Bishop of Malaga, and those like him, of too conciliatory an approach (56):

"...y aquí en España, se produce bajo la inspiración de Don Angel Herrera el Ralliement español, el acatamiento y colaboración de numerosos católicos-políticos españoles con la República de ladrones y asesinos."

It is indeed significant that the first signs of a change in tone, away from the euphoria of victory to a concern with social problems, was to emanate precisely from Herrera, thereby giving one grounds for thinking that conflicting ideas existed within the upper echelons of Spanish Catholicism as early as the immediate post-Civil War period, in a minority though they were. Such criticism by Pemartín also illustrates the bitterness felt by many at the sacrifices and compromises that the Church and its faithful felt they had been forced to make in the period of the Second Republic, and his own example of such indignities is of special relevance in that it concerns Andalusia, namely the duty which Ilundain had felt himself obliged to carry out when welcoming Azana to the Cathedral in Holy Week of 1936 (57):

"Dos meses después, las turbas armadas por el Gobierno de Azaña ....asesinaban -en pago- a millares de sacerdotes y destruían y profanaban sistemáticamente todos los templos que podían..."

At the end of the war, therefore, Franco was in an apparently unassailable position, enjoying both

the fruits of victory and the grateful support of the Church, a situation described by J. Georgel as follows (58):

"En 1937, il s'est presenté comme un croisé, comme un restaurateur du catholicisme, et à partir de 1939 il a effectivement rendu à l'Eglise une place de premier plan en Espagne, ce qui lui vaut le soutien de la hiérarchie..."

In the new Spain, where the Church could now operate with freedom after a number of years of travail, the scene was set for an upsurge in traditional Spanish Catholic values with the support of the State, commonly called <a href="mailto:nacional-catolicismo">nacional-catolicismo</a>, a fusion of the religious and the nationalistic.

## 2. Nacional-catolicismo in Andalusia.

## (a) The fusion of the military and the spiritual.

W.Ebenstein argues that the 'authoritarian' nature of Francoism -as opposed to the 'totalitarian' mature of one-party regimes of the Left- was a strong reason for its appeal to an institution as conservative as the Spanish Church, arguing that totalitarianism tends to be radical (59). In such a situation, the gratitude and support of the episcopacy were of inestimable value to the new regime in its attempts to consolidate its military might by a more socially acceptable image in the minds of the people, as A.de Miguel indicates (60):

"Los teóricos y líderes del

franquismo utilizan la
religión católica, en su
expresión más tridentina
y nacionalista, como un
aparato ideológico central
para conseguir apoyo en
amplios sectores del campesinado
y las clases medias."

The corollary is also true, in that Catholics who had helped Franco win the war were in a position to help bring about a re-organisation of society in line with Catholic thinking. It was inevitable that the line between the political and the religious should become increasingly blurred - "um cierto confusionismo entre Iglesia y Estado" in the words of M. Fernández-Areal (61) - with the state slowly acquiring a monolithic politico-religious character which permeated all areas of society and which was vigorously defended by apologists such as J. Pemartím and J. Soto de Gangoiti (62).

One of the most visible manifestations of the gradual fusion of the religious and the nationalistic was the repeated appearance of the military and civic authorities at religious ceremonies, Andalusia supplying ample evidence. Indeed, this fusion of the two areas was to reach such a point that as early as 1939 the faithful at Malaga had to be advised as to their behaviour at religious processions, in a circular issued by Santos Olivera, in rather concerned tones (63):

"Una procesión religiosa...no
es um desfile militar, profano
o patriótico, sino una manifestación

de fe, de piedad ...¿ Debe hacerse ante las sagradas imágenes y como manifestación de respeto y religiosidad, los mismos saludos y reverencias que hoy se hacen ante los símbolos o ante: las autoridades de la Patria? ... Estos saludos y reverencias, que tan oportunamente se han introducido en el nuevo régimen que disfruta España, y que todos hacemos - la Iglesia la primera - como demostración de nuestro patriotismo y firme adhesión al actual estado de cosas. están fuera de lugar cuando se aplican a fines puramente religiosos -Y así como dentro del templo ..."

The document throws up some interesting points when analysed from a linguistic point of view. The emphatic affirmation of the Church's adherence to the Fascist-style mode of greeting in Spain - "la Iglesia la primera" - and the rather vague and temporary implication behind phrases such as "el actual estado de cosas" - does it suggest a certain unease, a concern at the difficulties involved in such a close association between the secular and the religious? Or is such a suggestion (especially in view of the early date of the statement) bordering on the sensationalist? Of course, even if the document does betray a certain unease, it could still be argued that it was purely a personal reaction from Santos Olivera - though again

it must be remembered that the same prelate had undergone considerable hardship and anxiety during the war:that his document perhaps demonstrates that even some of those with cause to be grateful to the new regime were sometimes wont to question the validity of nationalistic euphoria impinging on the religious.

One prelate whose attitude to this question was quite unequivocal was Pedro Segura, the new Archbishop of Seville, who was to be the only member of the entire hierarchy to dare show dissent, and also was to continually, speak with a more independent voice on Church-State issues in the years to come. But the first problem arose through the question of the phrase "José Antonio Primo de Rivera - Presente" being painted on the walls of churches throughout Spain (introduced by the Falange in 1938) as an act of homage to the founder of the movement, in that Segura refused to comply with this innovation where churches in his own diocese were concerned. In 1940, a group of <u>falangistas</u> painted an the walls of the episcopal palace at Seville the words "¡Franco! ¡Franco! ¡Franco! José Antonio Primo de Rivera - Presente". Segura immediately wrote to the Civil Governor of Seville, demanding that the defacement to the wall be removed, under threat of excommunication. The Civil Governor, in his reply, suggested that the words in question be put on a cathedral wall. But again Segura was adamant, claiming in his reply of 30 March 1940 that this was contrary to Canon Law (64).

An order finally came from the Pope to comply with the decree of 1938, and only then did Segura

on two counts: the name of José Antonio was placed on a wall together with a list of <u>sevillanos</u> who had died fighting for the Nationalists; and Segura also published a pastoral of 13,000 words on 2 April 1940 entitled "Por los fueros de la verdad y de la justicia" (65), in which he made quite clear that he saw his jurisdiction as bishop being independent of more secular considerations. Referring to St.

Isidor - also once Archbishop of Seville - Segura praised him for his refusal to comer before secular pressure, in an obvious parallel to his own situation:

"Ni pudo jamás ser intimidado por el poder de sus adversarios ni por sus amenazas e insidias, continuando constantemente en la libre confesión de su fe ..."

Segura also made it quite clear that he had stepped down only through the intervention of the Pope, again underlining the fact that he had very clear views on what should be rendered unto Caesar and unto God.

A few years later, however, an even more explosive situation arose when Segura, during one of his famous <u>sabatinas</u>, stated that the word <u>caudillo</u> originally meant <u>capitán de ladrones</u> (66). The pejorative significance of such a remark was not lost on Franco, who wanted to exile him, though Serrano Suñer persuaded Franco that such a course of action would do more harm than good, the minister stating that "el cardenal era una isla, un caso especial" (67) and reminding Franco of the declaration of the

Papal Nuncio Cicognani - "El mismo día que el cardenal salga por Gibraltar, el nuncio apostólico lo hará por Irún" (68) - and the affair was finally smoothed over again only by the intervention of the Pope, who in a letter to Segura on 28 May urgently requested him to adopt a more conciliatory and diplomatic tone (69) - "...en interés de la tranquilidad y de la concordia de los ánimos, hará cuanto esté de su parte, mediante una actitud de reserva y de prudencia, para allanar el desagradable incidente ocurrido con Su Excelencia el jefe del Estado, general Franco" - to which Segura, ever obedient to the Vatican (and, by now, obviously obedient only to the Vatican) replied in the following terms (70):

"Extremaré en vista de los deseos del Santo Padre la reserva y la prudencia que vengo guardando en el asunto conocido, que soy el primero en desear encuentre una solución satisfactoria."

In light of such a determined stance by the Cardinal, R. Garriga suggests that the fact that Segura did not sign the Carta Colectiva on 1 August 1937 also may be not insignificant (71). Garriga points out that, although Segura was then a member of the Curia and therefore not of the Spanish hierarchy as such (and therefore not to be expected to add his signature), he was nevertheless in Toledo on 2 May of the same year on having been given authorisation by Pius XI to pray at the tomb of his brother Emiliano, a canon, who had just died, and therefore would have been available, presumably, to add his

signature. Whether or not such hipotheses are to be condemned as belonging to the realm of mere speculation, it is possible that Segura knew that Pius XI's dislike of one-party states of the Right was as great as his dislike of those of the Left (his encyclical Mit bremnender Sorge was as scathing on Nazism as his emcyclical Divini Redemptoris had been om Communism), and that therefore felt he would have Watican support in following a line more independent than that of the rest of the Spanish bishops. Certainly, Ildebrando Cardinal Antoniutti felt that Segura's view of the Nationalists was to become more critical through the post-war years-"Poi la simpatia per i nazionali andò adquanto diminuendo fino ad assumere, più tardi, un tono di franco disseno" (72) while Garriga again feels it is significant, with the benefit of hindsight, that Segura's first pastoral as Cardinal Archbishop of Seville had peace as its central theme and was not published by the press (73), giving his own view thus (74):

"Som las cosas que ocurren a la vista de todos y que sólo pueden entenderse cuando el factor tiempo permite enjuiciarlas."

It can be argued, of course, that the choice of the theme of peace had no ulterior motive - indeed, had been chosen for the best of motives, namely the desire to appeal to a society that had just torm itself apart in a fratricidal conflict to unite in the peace of Christ.

The somewhat blurred lines of demarcation that constituted <a href="mailto:nacional-catolicismo">nacional-catolicismo</a> also gave rise to difficulties between the secular and the ecclesiastical

powers on a more local level. At Aljaraque in Huelva province, for example, the mayor fined the local parish priest five hundred pesetas for having a procession without previously seeking permission (75). The mayor was removed from office and the priest, José Delgado, had his fine repaid, as the action of the mayor had been contrary to articles three and four of the 1851 Concordat, ratified by the Convenio of 7 July 1941. The ecclesiastical report emphasises church rights -"Considerando que la Iglesia es una verdadera y perfecta Sociedad, soberana, libre e independiente en el cumplimiento de su elevada misión moral y religiosa" - while at pains to stress the special relationship it had with the authorities -" la cordialidad de relaciones que debe de existir y la mutua asistencia que se ha de prestar entre las autoridades civiles y eclesiásticas" a spirit with which Segura presumably would have agreed.

Another source of difficulty was the <u>derecho de</u>

<u>presentación</u> whenever bishoprics became vacant, a

traditionally accepted privilege which Franco wanted

to continue, as in this way there would be more chance
of ensuring that the appointees would be more malleable
than the likes of Segura. The Vatican saw the position
as: fundamental to the Church's freedom, namely the
unfettered nomination and appointment of its leaders
in a given country - "Spanish churchmen found that
this latest Constantine kept just as firm a grip
on them as the first one had done", opines D. Nicholl
(76) - and by 1941, twenty Spanish dioceses were without
a bishop, the Andalusian ones being Almeria, Guadix and
Jaen (through their bishops being murdered during the

war) and Cadiz-Ceuta, whose bishop had died. Finally the Vatican acceded to Franco's wishes in the Convenio of 1941, and although the conclusion of these negotiations was satisfactory, the amount of time taken for an agreement to be reached perhaps implied that both sides, although grateful to eachother for the mutual support that their relationship engendered, may not have been in absolute harmony over what each side considered to be religious freedom, as P. Jobit suggests (77):

"Tout allait bien - apparement au moins - mais aux évêques qui mouraient on ne donnait pas de successeurs bien qu'il y eût à Madrid un représantant du Saimt-Siège. Preuve que l'accord avec Rome n'était pas parfait."

Vatican or the Spanish hierarchy were more than counter-balanced by the overt support for the new state by the vast majority of ecclesiastics, whose main concern was the re-establishment of church influence. Satisfied with their militant brand of Catholicism born of relief at the end of oppression, they continued to criticise the Republic even some years after the war was finished, as in a twenty-eight page attack against the Left in a pastoral of Archbishop Parrado y García of Granada published on 26 February 1941, from which the following are extracts:

"El año 1931 lograron, al fin, apoderarse del mando en España los cabecillos de tres corrientes intelectuales que de muy atrás venían

aspirando en la dirección de nuestro pueblo y a la formación de la conciencia nacional.

(Institución libre de Enseñanza, los sedicientes intelectuales de la generación del 98,el conglomerado de fuerzas del socialismo y comunismo ...que pretendía crear un paraíso nacido del odio...."

Praise for the events which put an end to it all is summed up thus:

"Una guerra que desde sus primeras jornadas reviste el carácter de Santa Cruzada...Por Dios y por la Patria,"

The same prelate was to publicly acknowledge a year later the Church's debt to Francoism as regards economic help in the replacement or repair of church property damaged (as outlined by a law passed on 1 January 1942) "por consecuencia de las disposiciones arbitrarias en que abundó el sectarismo antireligioso de la República" (79).

Despite petty problems such as that at Aljaraque already mentioned, Church and State enjoyed much co-operation the presentation of events such as processions, which, with priests and civic or military dignitaries praying side by side, were the most visible proof of such harmony. From abundant examples the following two reports concerned with plans for the Semena Santa processions of 1945 at (i) Malaga and (ii) Huelva illustrate how these events in

Andalusia were directly linked, either by representation or patronage, to the head of government at Madrid:

- (i)"Ha salido para Madrid la comisión
  ejecutiva de la Agrupación de Cofradías
  de Semana Santa, así como todas las
  autoridades malagueñas; Gobernador civil,
  Gobernador Militar,...Obispo de la
  Diócesis, etc., para entregar en la capital
  ...una placa de plata en la que se hace
  constar el nombramiento de presidente
  de honor de dicha agrupación a S.E.
  el Jefe del Estado." (80).
- (ii) "Su Excelencia el Jefe del Estado ha concedido al alcalde su representación en la procesión de la Hermandad de Nuestro Padre Jesús de las Cadenas..." (81).

Processions -often looking more like parades commemorating the anniversary of the Nationalist
victory also came into vogue in the forties. Even as late
as six years after the end of the war, for example,
a parade followed by a misa de campaña took place in
Malaga on 1 April 1945 (82), and events such as this
must have run the danger of underlining to one sector
of Spanish society that the Church had formed a
closely-knit alliance with the other sector, their
conquerors, while the Church itself was understandably
happy to be the "cómplice y colaboradora", in the words
of J.de Esteban and L.López Guerra (83), of a regime
which had rescued it from persecution.

# (b) The promotion of religious propaganda in Andalusia.

At the same time, the Church was aware of the gap which had grown between itself and a large sector of Spanish society. Many of the working-classes, especially, had to be coaxed back into the fold from which they had strayed, either through lack of personal commitment or the anticlerical demagogy of various factions of the Left, and steps were taken to remedy this. The best course of action to take involved methods which would have most impact on the mass of the population which had been accustomed to the so-called popular forms of religion. Therefore various events were organised, including missions, grandiose and colourful processions (often in honour of a local patron saint), a revival of the Marian tradition, meetings for the singing of hymns - all the more demonstrative and therefore more emotional, aspects of popular religion, which, despite any limitations it could have on an intellectual level, was perhaps the most appropriate form of relaying the Christian message to a poorly educated people.

A well organised campaign of missions was perhaps the main method used to impress the Church's message on the people. Teams of priests and lay helpers were sent to parishes lacking a priest and/or church through the violence of the Civil War, as well as to factories and prisons. Strenuous efforts were made to re-establish the Church's influence - cynically but perhaps aptly described as "la captación de las masas" by S. Petschem (84), and in this operation the importance of the role played by Acción Católica cannot be over-estimated. It became one of the main propaganda machines of

nacional-catolicismo, seeing its aim as the re-Christianisation of all aspects of Spanish society. Thus spoke <u>Ecclesia</u> in its New Year editorial of 1941:

"El instrumento providencial para ayudar a la Iglesia y al Estado en esta ingente obra de recristianización es la Acción Católica."

Perhaps a special effort in this area was made in Andalusia, the majority of its people regarding the Church with at best a sullen indifference, immersed as they were in a tradition of virulent anticlericalism. One of the keenest promoters of missions was Archbishop Parrado y García of Granada, and his determination to organise successful missions is illustrated in a pastoral written only two months after the end of the war, on 22 June 1939 (85):

"...los sacerdotes a quienes el Señor nos ha dispensado la gracia de sobrevivir a la catástrofe, debemos ver en esta gracia una segunda vocación a las sublimes funciones del sacerdocio... Triste cosa sería... que cuando en todo el ámbito nacional no se oyen sino voces de reconstrucción imperial de nuestra querida Patria, fuésemos nosotros precisamente quienes olvidásemos que la base y fundamento de esa reconstrucción es lo espiritual y religioso..."

The campaign in Seville diocese was well organised by Segura, as a report in <u>Ecclesia</u> of a mission throughout the diocese in March 1941 indicates (86):

"Su Eminencia dio las últimas instrucciones a los 200 misioneros y a los 500 seglares de las 4 ramas de A. C. encargadas de auxiliarlos... y no ha quedado preso en la cárcel sin comulgar."

This concerted action by the Church was not restricted to the immediate post-war era - in Andalusia certainly: even as late as 1951, a mission organised in Malaga attracted 200,000 people (87). Another point worthy of note about the missions was the florid and emotional way in which they were described. Yet although it could be cynically claimed that at the heart of this apparent emotionalism was a form of hard hitting sales technique whereby popular forms of religion were marketed by ecclesiastical representatives, nevertheless the sincerity of such men of conviction inspired by the resolve to preach the gospel to those long deprived of it cannot be questioned-"Desde el 9 al 19 de abril de 1942, misionaron con gran celo... y óptimo fruto, los Rvdos. PP. de la Compañía de Jesús José María Medina y Manuel Hueso" (88)with the same priests often conducting various missions (probably through the notorious shortage of priests in Andalucia), exemplified by the mention of the Jesuit Medina at several other missions besides the one at Atarfe mentioned here (89).

The importance with which the Church viewed these

missions is reflected in the urgency of the language used both in pastorals exhorting the faithful to attend future missions and in reports of details of those just celebrated. An example of the former is illustrated by an extract from a pastoral of Bishop Tomás Gutiérrez Díez of Cadiz on 21 January 1947 (90):

"Esta misión mariana es algo más importante y trascendental. Es una gracia extraordinaria... que la misericordia de Dios os envía porque quiere salvaros. Son fulgores de luz divina que alumbrará vuestras inteligencias, fuertes aldabonazos que llamarán a las puertas de vuestros corazones..."

A perusal of the many reports of missions just celebrated indicates the emotive atmosphere engendered, the citing of one of which - at Bracana in Granada diocese in 1939 - will suffice (91):

"...todos los ejercicios se vieron concurridísimos... Si emocionante era ver aquel numeroso auditorio, más todavía la piedad y fervor con que escuchaban la predicación...

Para conservar este fruto y fervor... se han establecido algunas asociaciones piadosas para las diversas clases de personas."

But were the missions successful in their aim of winning back to the fold those who had strayed? A first glance at reports, with all the emotive language of

jubilation, commitment and endeavour, would suggest that the campaign had enjoyed resounding success. But an analysis of more soberly worded documentation leads to misgivings as to the number reconverted. A report of a mission of 6-15 November 1939 at Lachar, Granada diocese, for instance, shows that, whereas eighty children and one hundred and seventy women received the sacraments, only approximately forty men did so, and the report concludes with a rather guarded statement (92):

"Aunque no haya cumplido todo el pueblo, ha sido sin embargo provechosa la Santa Misión."

Another effort made in the winning back of the lapsed was a renewed emphasis placed on Spain's traditional veneration of Our Lady. The first week of June 1943 was dedicated to devotion of the Sacred Heart of Mary in the dioceses of Cadiz and Granada (93), and in the same week in Seville the Asamblea Mariana (a group of priests whose special interest was Marian devotion) declared that devotion to the Sacred Heart of Mary should be turned into a national feast-day (94). By 1943 in Cordoba diocese there was already established a series of parish rosaries (95). As in the case of the programme of missions, the bishops endeavoured to foster this devotion with a series of pastorals and organised processions vividly described, as in the following extract of a report on a procession in honour of Nuestra Señora de Angustias in Granada in October 1939(96):

"....entre el voltear jubiloso de las campanas y las ovaciones clamorosas de una muchedumbre, que, llena de emoción

indescriptible, volcaba con
arrebatado entusiasmo sus
encendidos sentimientos de
amor, de devoción y reverencia
... Un rosario ininterrumpido
y mágnifico de plegarias, de
lágrimas y suspiros, de sollozos
y fervores acompañó a la Patrona
de Granada... Los acordes del
Himno nacional mezcláronse al
griterío anhelante de la multitud..."

From the above extract it may be seen that the promotion of the Marian tradition was imbued with <u>nacional-catolic-ismo</u>the rendition of the national anthem lending to the event a patriotic as well as a spiritual dimension. Writtem communications between the ecclesiastical and secular authorities indicate the agreement of the civic and the ecclesiastical authorities in the success of such plans, as this extract from the letters of reply of the Civil Governor of Cadiz on 13 January 1947 to the invitation by the bishop to take part in the celebrations in honour of Our Lady indicates (97):

"Por estimar esta iniciativa del más alto interés en beneficio del perfeccionamiento de las virtudes cristianas de nuestro pueblo, vengo en ordenar a todas las autoridades dependientes de la mía, singularmente a los Señores Alcaldes de los Ayuntamientos comprendidos en la diócesis de Cádiz, presten la más

eficaz colaboración...Mi
autoridad verá con el mayor agrado
la presencia física de las
autoridades municipales y de
enseñanza en los actos en cuestión."

Even the offer of prizes was used in the attempt in a revival of interests in religious themes, as can be seen with the offer of three prizes of 500 pesetas by Cadiz diocese to those who could write the best essays on the following themes (98):

"l.Actuación y eficacia de la población escolar en el éxito de la Misión mariana ...

2.Fruto peculiar que de la Misión mariana se puede esperar en las costumbres de la población escolar ... 3.La Misión mariana como recurso pedagógico en manos de los Sres. Maestros ..."

Another form of <u>nacional-catolicismo</u> was the veneration of those in religious orders who had been killed during the Civil War. An example of this is offered by Almeria diocese, where in 1942 Rafael Ortega Barrios issued an edict proclaiming the sanctity and martyrdom of the Jesuits Santaella, Luque and Payán, with a view to eventual beatification or canonisation. (Ortega was the <u>Vicario General</u> of Almeria, which was still without a bishop). Such a process always involves lengthy examination of private history and other factors which can determine whether or not the cause is worthy, and anyone who could help in any way was invited to

contact the <u>Tribunal del Obispado</u> (99). A reminder of Andalusia's social problems, however, comes forcibly in the last sentence of the edict (100):

"Que los fieles que no sepan escribir lo manifiesten al Párroco, que a su vez dará cuenta como antes queda expresado."

Relations with the Vatican, despite any difficulties over the question of <u>derecho de presentación</u>, were always cordial - as was to be expected, given Pius XII's message expressing his pleasure at the outcome of the Civil War (101) - and the hierarchy were at pains to demonstrate their loyalty to Rome, none more so, perhaps, than Archbishop Parrado y García of Granada, who organised celebrations in honour of the episcopal jubilee of Pius XII in May 1942 at Almeria, a diocese for which he was responsible (102).

Christmas was also used by the Church and the authorities for public acts of devotion. The Christmas period of 1942 in Andalusia witnessed, for instance, the unveiling of statues of the Sacred Heart in Seville and Jaen dioceses, together with the great displays of devotion which these well-organised events entailed (103).

However, not all efforts made by the Church to recapture the souls and hearts of the lapsed involved purely external devotion. There was also promoted a programme of ejercicios espirituales to be practised by the faithful and including private prayer, fasting, abstinence and examination of conscience as to one's behaviour and standards. Teachings on the area of

morality reached excessive proportions, with bishops issuing pastorals advising as to dress, reading habits and accompaniment of the opposite sex. These pastorals had a strong moralising tone, exemplified by the pastoral "El sagrado deber de la obediencia" by Parrado y García in 1940 (104) - a theme which, in the era of <a href="mailto:nacional-catolicismo">nacional-catolicismo</a>, was dear to the hearts of churchmen and statesmen alike:

. "... enseñaban los clásicos que el único linaje de perfecta y acabada obediencia ... es el que no tiene ojos, la obediencia ciega, bien entendida, en cuya ceguedad - decían - consiste la sabiduría ..... La democracia es un sistema ideal, pero para hombres irreales, no inclinados al mal ... En nuestra propia casa e historia hallamos la síntesis más conforme a la realidad humana entre la autoridad y la libertad, por tanto, la más perfecta y de resultados más positivos ... A la autoridad se debe, sin duda alguna, amadísimos diocesanos, gratitud, obediencia, respeto y amor. Sí, también amor."

One of the areas most emphasised by the hierarchy was moral behaviour, in that strictures as to how to

dance and what to read, for instance, were often punctuated by shrill warnings and condemnations of anything departing from the strict limits laid down. Of the Andalusian pastorals concerned with such matters, those of Cardinal Segura were the most vociferous, his Lenten pastoral of 27 March 1946 perhaps being one of the most explicit, entitled "Sobre los bailes" (105). The thirty-three page document speaks of the dangers of sin in dancing, together with a synopsis of ststements on the same by various Councils of the Church and encyclicals, as well as an attack on arguments in favour of dancing.

One's first reaction on reading the document is of incredulity that a cardinal of the Church should busy himself with such apparent trivialities in possibly the most depressed area of Spain. However, there is no evidence to suggest that the pastoral is representative of the Andalusian episcopacy, for Segura's stance on such matters always tended to be most conservative. Nor was it written with a callous disregard for the problems of the region's poor — indeed, Segura would claim that the aim of the document was their well-being.

Segura also had very set ideas as to the suitability or otherwise of reading matter. On 15 July 1942, he issued a pastoral forbidding Spaniards to read the book Tú y la Vida (by a Professor K.V. Frisch of Munich University, translated into Spanish) because the work claimed that man may have evolved from other animals as opposed to being created directly into his present state by God (106).

Dress was another preoccupation of the hierarchy, in their fight to prevent what they considered immoral standards tainting Spanish society. Asin the case of dancing, there was a fear that any innovations were a sign of, or could lead to, promiscuity and other forms of immoral behaviour. In Andalusia one of the most reactionary elements in this respect was Cardinal Parrado y García of Granada, whose circular of 24 November 1942 perhaps best illustrates how this matter was regarded with great concern (107):

"Recordamos al venerable Clero de las cuatro díócesis encomendadas a Nuestra solicitud pastoral que... en la fiesta de la Inmaculada Concepción, en todas las iglesias ...se rezará la oración a la Santísma Virgen, publicada en el Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del año 1939..., no omitiéndose en la predicación solemne al pueblo exhortaciones oportunas acerca de la modestia cristiana en el vestir de las mujeres."

# (C) Efforts of internal reorganisation of the Church in Andalusia.

Despite the jubilation in ecclesiastical quarters at the victorious end of the Civil War and the influence and power thereby afforded to the Church, there were several problems of a practical nature to surmount, one of the most immediate and fundamental being a severe

shortage of priests. Over four thousand diocesan priests and 2,365 members of religious orders were killed during the conflict - through its traditional shortage of secular priests, the Andalusian Church had had to rely on the religious orders to make up for this deficiency, as has been pointed out - as well as the thirteen bishops already mentioned, with the result that the Andalusian dioceses were probably the worst affected of all. A programme for the training of a new generation of priests was begun immediately after the cessation of hostilities. A look at the efforts made by the Archdiocese of Granada will illustate this. A circular by Parrado y García to all churches in the archdiocese on 20 July 1939 illustrates, clearly, how the Church was to make every effort to attract the young to the priesthood (108):

"Pongamos todos el mayor empeño en que se nos llenen nuestros Seminarios de niños que dan señales de vocación .... procúrese escoger niños pertenecientes a familias cristianas, con preferencia de la clase media.

Although at first glance the underlined words (in italics in the original text) appear to betray a clasista mentality, Presumably they are meant to imply that such seminarists would be better prepared for a lay course of study through having already attained a certain level of education: footnotes 120-122 of the previous chapter have already given the lie to the accepted myth in anticlerical circles of

seminaries being reserved for middle-class recruits, especially in Andalusia. Further to this circular, a 'colecta extraordinaria' was made at churches throughout the archdiocese on 8 December 1939 to help towards the costs of the diocesan seminary (109).

Further pronouncements by the same bishop were to show the important role that Acción Católica was playing in the promotion of new seminaries and of campaigns for new vocations. Praising Acción Católica for its work in this field, Parrado y García went on to make an impassioned appeal for support in this venture, in a pastoral of 10 January 1941 (110):

"¡Católicos! La Obra de las
Obras es el Seminario. El problema
fundamental de nuestras diócesis y,
en particular, de nuestras parroquias
y nuestros pueblos, es el problema
de tener un buen Seminario."

A year later, the diocesan bulletin was to express its delight at the new vocations resulting from its campaña pro seminario, while reminding the faithful of how their predecessors had suffered (111):

"El fruto de la semilla de nuestros mártires son las florecientes vocaciones sacerdotales y las vocaciones del apostolado de la Acción Católica, principalmente en las ramas juveniles."

Other seminaries founded in Andalusia were at Jaen and Malaga. The last-named is described thus by F. Urbina - "Se trata de una espiritualidad de elevado tono heroico y ascético " - thereby giving a

picture of the ascetic nature of a seminary founded on the precept of the <u>nacional-catolicismo</u> of the era(112) Although the future priests produced by such seminaries were to be, in Franco's words, "forjadores de hombres para la Patria" (113), their training was, according to the experience of A. Marzal (114) insufficient for a full appreciation of socio-economic problems (a failing to be recognised later by the far-sighted Angel Herrera, as will be seen):

"Bien apoyada por el brazo secular, la iglesia jerárquica española de entonces ... hizo de nosotros todos ... unos escolares perfectos ... Nos enseñaron todas las soluciones, sin enseñarnos ningún problema."

The upkeep of its clergy was another problem for the Church, despite help which it received from the State, and the hierarchy made repeated requests to the faithful to offer the Church more money to alleviate the problem, which was not helped by the penury in which the majority of Andalusians found themselves in the early forties. Indeed a decree by Parrado y García on 1 December 1940, to be applied to the diocese of Jaen (of which he was Apostolic Administrator, as the diocese still had no bishop) began by mentioning the shortage of food and other essentials and the inflated prices that such shortages occasioned, put in terms of pastoral concern for the practical everyday needs of the clergy.(115).

Diocesan concern for priests was not restricted

to the strictly practical, however: a series of 'ejercicios espirituales' for the clergy began to be organised, to prepare them better for the day-to-day running of parishes and for specially organised campaigns, within the framework of Acción Católica, to win back the lapsed into the sphere of the Church. These exercises were either in the form of a course of one week to ten days duration - such as the one organised at the Cartuja by the Archdiocese of Granada in 1942 (116) - or of a one-or ten-day colloquium sometimes referred to as 'jornadas sacerdotales', one of which was addressed by Parrado y García underlining the importance of the venture in the following terms, in 1942 (117):

"Os es bien conocido el interés que hemos puesto siempre en que la Acción Católica .... no sólo sea iniciada en todas y cada una de vuestras parroquias, sino que florezca y se intensifique .... en todos los ámbitos de Nuestra amada Diócesis .... Por eso mismo, os hemos exhortado tantas veces a que os preparéis a laborar en este nuevo y más selecto campo de su celo sacerdotal con un conocimiento lo más perfecto posible de la naturaleza y del funcionamiento de la Acción Católica..."

Another area which had to undergo examination, and subsequent reorganisation in many cases, was the

question of civil marriage. The Church considered the united Christian family, logically, as the base on which a stable society is to be built an idea laudable in itself, of course, but which could perpetuate a situation of acute embarrassment for those who had contracted civil marriage during the years of the Republic. Steps were taken to . 'legitimize' such marriages - and the children of them - in the eyes of the Church-State apparatus. A secretariado de matrimonios was organised under the auspices of Acción Católica in each diocese to carry out the scheme of legitimización . To give some idea of the numbers involved, in only three and a half years (from the end of the Civil War to the end of 1942) in the diocese of Malaga alone, 2,219 marriages were sanctified, involving 4,392 children (118).

Those presumed widowed during a Civil War in which deaths were not always meticulously recorded also had to undergo a detailed examination by the ecclesiastical and civil authorities of details of themselves and those presumed dead, whenever they wished to re-marry, to avoid the very real chance of bigamy, and before they could re-marry, an official declaration had to be made of the Church's acceptance of the death of the former partner, as in the following pronouncement in Jaen diocese in 1947 (119):

"Decreto de muerte presunta de Enrique Martínez Sánchez - Que debía declarar y declaraba

suficientemente probada la

presunta muerte de Enrique Martínez

Sánchez, natural de Jaén ....

la cual muerte ha debido de ocurrir

en Julio de mil novecientos treinta

y siete .... en los combates habidos

en nuestra guerra de liberación de

España .... se concede licencia a

Cesarea Molina Iniesta para paser

a segundas nupcias, sin perjuicio

alguno de la unidad e indisolubilidad

del vínculo."

But amid the general euphoria of <u>nacional-catolicismo</u>, the Church also had to officiate at the orders of separation for those marriages which had failed. The make-up of the new state meant that the Church had a legal, as well as spiritual, jurisdiction over such matters and could use such powers accordingly, as is illustrated in the following case at Granada in 1942 (120):

"Tribunal Metropolitano del Arzobispado de Granada - Divorcio Galán-del Saz. - Vistos los cánones .... de acuerdo con el Ministerio Fiscal, 'Christi nomine invocato':

Fallamos que debemos declarar y declaramos haber lugar a la demanda deducida por D. Rogelio Galán Sánchez contra doña Concepción del Saz y de la Rosa y que existe el adulterio de ésta en orden a la separación perpetua 'quoad torum et

cohabitationem', condenando a la demandada en los costes del juicio y daños causados a la parte actora."

# (d) The Andalusian Church and its attitude to non-Catholics.

Given the atmosphere of belligerent euphoria reigning in ecclesiastical circles in a post-war era which saw the Church regaining what it considered its rightful privileges and influence throughout all strata of society, it is not surprising that the non-Catholic minority groups should suffer as a result, losing the greater degree of religious liberty and social acceptance they had gained under the Republic. Hostility to anything 'non-Catholic' - which in the terms of nacional-catolicismo implied 'unpatriotic' as well as 'ungodly' - is evident both nationally and in Andalusia. While Spanish writers such as J. Sotto de Gangoiti were to speak of Protestantism with great intolerance (121), the hierarchy, too, occasionally showed no less blinkered a mentality, the most infamous Andalusian bishop in this respect being Segura, whose fanatical adherence to the sanctity and independence af the Catholic Church precluded any tolerance for or sympathy with any forces which he saw as trying to impede its unique mission, be they governmental (as has already been seen) or sectarian. The first pastoral that he was to devote to this 'problem' in September 1947 - in years to come he was to return to this theme guite often - displayed both an irrational dread and deep-seated hostility of his fellow Christians (122):

"En esta ciudad de Sevilla nos

vemos ante una creciente propaganda protestante. No queremos deprimiros con menciones de la herejía difundida por los protestantes entre las personas de condición humilde, mediante una literatura seductora que propaga las doctrinas más subversivas .... Este aumento de propaganda coincide con el hecho de que se están autorizando oficialmente muchas iglesias protestantes ....
Estimamos que los millares y millares de católicos que murieron por su fe, nos dan el derecho de pedir que esas iglesias no sean toleradas."

In order to assess the extent of Protestantism on which Segura's fears were grounded, some data may help - though it is to be added that information on Protestants in Spain, especially during this period, has always been sketchy and therefore at times containing only approximations. The estimated numbers for evangelists in Andalusia in 1933 were as follows (123):

	population	no. of members	school enrolment
Cadiz	551,878	147	228
Cordoba	<b>6</b> 55 <b>,</b> 576	23	118
Granada	639,465	31	106
Jaen	662,718	<b>2</b> 93	<b>45</b> 0
Malaga	612,456	151	285
Seville	810,135	120	537
Huelva	351,544	20	unavailable
Almeria	380,406	unavailable	unavailable:
Andalusia	4,664,178	785	1,724

To these figures are to be added those for other non-Cathlic groups such as Baptists and Quakers the latter were active in works of mercy for both sides during the Civil War (124); both were so small as to be minimal: national totals for the late forties were estimated to be in the region of only 12,000 adults and 20,000 children (125). Therefore, it can be assumed that Protestants figured as a tiny minority in the years of the Republic, and their cause was not helped by the loss of buildings caught up in the general destruction of the Civil War: the British and Foreign Bible Society in its report no. 136 stated that of 147 groups of evangelical persuasion, only 33 still had a church by the end of the conflict (126). Even by the sixties the Protestant population in Spain had not risen to much over 30,000 (127), and in the light of such figures. Segura's alarm does seem to be exaggerated and ill-founded.

# (e) The Andalusian Church and the 1947 Referendum.

The posture of the Church during the 1947 referendum campaign is included under the theme nacional-catolicismo because its support for it underlined its continued support for the regime. While the lead to support the proposed Ley de Sucesión was given by the Primate, Pla i Deniel, in a pastoral appearing as an editorial in Ya (128), the Andalusian bishops also urged their flock to give an affirmative vote, in common with their colleagues. Santos Olivera, for instance, in a directive issued a short time before the referendum, underlined the importance of a positive vote (129):

"El Obispo de Granada y administrador apostólico de Málaga, doctor Santos Olivera, ha dirigido a los fieles un llamamiento, en el que hace notar la importancia del próximo referéndum, excitando a los fieles el cumplimiento de sus deberes de ciudadanía y exhortándoles a orar por el éxito de este acto y el bien de nuestra Patria."

Other episcopal messages included that of the Bishop of Jaen, who asked Catholics to remember the debt owed by them to the new regime when voting in the referendum -"no olvidéis las lecciones de la experiencia e inspiraos en los altos ideales del bien común de la paz y de la grandeza de España" (130). Not surprisingly, the endorsement of Franco at the polls was warmly welcomed by the hierarchy: in Andalusia for instance, Bishop Angel Herrera Oria of Malaga interpreted it as a victory over the doctrines of communism and freemasonry (131). The programme of fervent religious propaganda fused with ultra-conservative Nationalism was not limited to Andalusia alone: it was a national phenomenon - the description of similar events in post- Civil War Catalonia by C. Barral exemplified this (132). But was this all that the Church, especially in Andalusia, had to offer to a people dazed from a bloody internal conflict which had as its aftermath food shortages and socio-political repression?

### 3. The Social Message of the Church in Andalusia.

The main instrument of the Church in the social field was Acción Católica, which helped organise events concerned with hermandades, which were 'brotherhoods' or Catholic 'lodges' with a common interest (usually based on certain socio-religious traditions or geographical area) under the auspices of local Church dignitaries and enjoying a long history of popularity in Andalusian church circles. Indeed, the hermandades in Andalusia were to enjoy phenomenal growth, mostly due to the combined efforts of Acción Católica and the civil authorities, and their first congress after the war took place in Seville in 1941, with 1,180 different associations attending, But these brotherhoods, too, were often imbued with clasista overtones, in that they were often under the direction of the local landed gentry - for example, the processions of the hermandades in Cordoba in 1942 in honour of St. Isidore of Seville were under the organisation of the Marqués de Purchena (133).

However, the <u>hermandades</u> did attempt to better the lives of the poor by organising collections and distributing money and various necessities to those considered the most needy, even if an élitist leader—ship made the exercise appear more of a paternalistic act of charity by the more wealthy to quieten their social consciences, than a serious analysis of the problems involved and the solutions needed — criticisms of the previous failure of such organisations to extend the gospel message to the area of social problems and thereby possibly win more people back

into the Church is made by J. Ordófiez Márquez in an assessment of their past work in Huelva (134) - and the fact that Santos Olivera was able to distribute no less than eight thousand pesetas among needy families at the parish of San Felipe in Malaga at Easter in 1945 (135), money raised by just one of 1,180 similar organisations in Andalusia, shows that the effect of such work of charity could not have been inconsiderable.

Education was another area marked by grave: deficiencies. The contribution of the clergy to primary and secondary education that had been ruined by the anticlerical measures during the Republic have already been mentioned in the previous chapter, and every effort. was made in the post-Civil War period not only to redress that situation by the re-establishment of those schools, but to actually improve it. This work was organised not only on a diocesan level - an appeal to parish priests to organise collections to this end, was made by Granada archdiocese immediately after the war in 1939, for instance (136) - but also through the efforts of various orders and even the individual efforts of clergy inspired to provide education, with the poor especially in mind. Examples are numerous, with the following perhaps the most outstanding: the guarderías infantiles founded by the Siervas de los Pobres of Almeria, themselves founded by María Aznar in 1945, and also operating in Cordoba, Granada, Jaen and Seville (137): technical centres and reformatories founded by the Hermanos Obreros de María, with almost 500 pupils, at Granada in 1950 (138); a school of 500 pupils founded by the Madres de los Desamparados, at

Hermanitas de los Pobres, Malaga (140), as well as the diocesan de patronato mixto (Church - State ) giving education to over 11,000 pupils (141); the education of poor female children, mostly in State-run centres, done by the Misioneras del Divino Maestro, founded in Baza in 1944, which was to grow into 22 houses throughout Spain (142) plus a host of others which could be listed only at the cost of repetitiveness - work which leads one to question P. Tamames' assertion that education in the Church's hands was for the formation of emly a social elite (143).

Mention must also be made of the Church's stance vis-à-vis the many social problems which existed. Efforts made by the Church to alleviate the misery of the poor were often the province of the orders and, as in education, the inspiration of certain individuals to found houses devoted to the care of the old, the sick, the orphaned, with diocesan help and co-operation; there is little criticism of society's inequalities from bishops, with perhaps the one striking exception of the pastoral written by Rafael García y García de Castro, Bishop of Jaen, on January 1945, (144) who measured criticism of the situation with warnings against any 'unorthodox' interpretation of the Church's teaching on the subject - "No es justo atribuir a frases de San Clemente Romano.....sentido marxista".

Nevertheless it would be unfair and misleading not to stress the positive aspects of this pastoral, which, for its concern at manifest injustices, is in the vanguard of social Catholicism at that time. The indifference of the wealthy and lack of entrepreneurial spirit for the general good are criticised;

"Urge... que abandonen los poderosos la vida de lujo u ostentación...
Urge también...que se acometan empresas, a fin de que al hombre honrado no le falta trabajo ni carezca de los medios necesarios para su sustento y el cristiano bienestar de su familia. "

Absenteeism of the <u>latifundistas</u>, he asserts, is also responsible for many problems, both material and spiritual:

"...es un grave mal...los habitantes de sus cortijadas viven en la más espantosa ignorancia religiosa. No tienen medios de oír Misa, carecen de escuela...Añadamos a esto la extrema pobreza en que muchos de ellos viven...."

The pastoral is an admirable attempt at a critical analysis of the socio-economic ills besetting Andalusia in the 1940's, and is to be commended if only for the uniqueness of its content during this period.

Indeed, this question of the Church's interest in, and commitment to, social problems has been left until the end of this study of the Civil War and immediate aftermath to throw into greater relief the relative failure of the Church to involve itself with the problems suffered by the faithful - its action being mostly limited to the area of re-establishing itself in the euphoric era of nacional - catolicismo, in that

joy at the end of persecution may have overshadowed its concern for the social, with the exception of individuals as the above-mentioned Bishop of Jaen. But there is also a link with the following chapter, covering the time from the late forties to the start of the Vatican Council, in that the steadily growing involvement of the Church in the field of social problems - the development of the Hermandades Obreras de Acción Católica (HOAC), the arrival on the Andalusion scene of Angel Herrera and a few other bishops of social orientation (cautious though it may sometimes be ) - delineates this next period from the Civil War and forties; one begins to detect more an air of concern and less an air of triumphalism.

#### CHAPTER ONE

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

- (1) op.cit., p.88.
- (2) de Iturralde, J., <u>El Catolicismo y la Cruzada de</u>
  <u>Franco</u>, vol. 11, (Vienne, 1960), p.27.
- (3) ibid., vol, 1. p.102.
- (4) Nicholl, D., "Religious liberty in Spain"; a survey to 1968", <u>Iberian Studies</u>, vol, 1.

  no. 1. Spring 1972, pp. 4-14, p.7.
- (5) de Iturralde, J., op.cit (vol 11), p.57.
- (6) Montero Moreno, A., <u>Historia de la Persecución</u>

  Religiosa en España 1936-1939, (Madrid, 1961).

  pp. 629-630.
- (7) Moreno Navarro, I., <u>Propiedad, clases sociales y</u>
  <u>hermandades en la Baja Andalucía, (Madrid, 1972)</u>
  pp. 297-8
- (8) see notes 173,174 of the previous chapter.
- (9) Borkenau, F., The Spanish Cockpit, (London, 1937) p.201.
- (10) Carcel Ortí, V., op.cit., p.376.
- (11) de Iturralde, J., op.cit., p.463.
- (12) <u>El Correo de Andalucía</u>, 6.9.36., no. 12, 554, p.5.
- (13) El Correo de Andalucía, 4.9.36., no. 12, 552, p.10.
- (14) <u>El Correo de Andalusía</u>, 6.9.36., no. 12, 554, p.8.
- (15) ibid., p. 10.
- (16) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado de Sevilla</u>, 1936, p.240.
- (17) <u>El 1deal</u>, 28.7.36., no. 1. 187, p.5.
- (18) El Ideal, 26.8.36., no. 1. 214, p.1.
- (19) El Ideal, 17.8.36., reproduced in Gibson, I.,

  La represión nacionalista de Granada en 1936 y la

- muerte de Federico García Lorca, Paris 1971, p.18.
- (20) El Correo de Andalucía, 25.9.37., no.12,882, p.2.
- (21) El Correo de Andalucía, 9.10., 37., no. 12, 894, p.1.
- (22) <u>Diario de Cádiz</u>, 3.10.37., no.31,386, p.3.
- (23) Ayer, 3.4.37., no.233, p.2.
- (24) Montero Moreno, A., op. cit., pp. 763-4.
- (25) op.cit., pp.338-9.
- (26) ibid., pp.337,370.
- (27) op.cit., p.46.
- (28) op. cit., pp.179-181.
- (29) Foss, W. and Geraghty, C., The Spanish Arena, London 1939, pp.263-4.
- (30) Thomas, H., The Spanish Civil War, Harmondsworth 1977, pp. 630-1.
- (31) Pérez de Urbel, J., Los Mártires de la Iglesia,
  Barcelona 1956, p. 39.
- (32) ibid., pp.261-277.
- (33) op.cit., p.51.
- (34) El Ideal, 26.7.36., no.1, 183, p.2.
- (35) Ayer, 3.4.37., no.233, p.2.
- (36) El Ideal, 5.8.36., no.1,193, p.3.
- (37) op.cit., pp.629-630.
- (38) El Ideal, 20.8.36., no. 1,208, p.6.
- (39) Aguirre Prado, L., <u>La Iglesia y la Guerra Española</u>, Madrid 1964, pp.76-7.
- (40) Aguirre Prado, L., op. cit., pp. 77-8.
- (41) Georgel, J., Le Franquisme, Paris 1970, p.249.
- (42) Southworth, H., El Mito de la Cruzada de Franco, Madrid 1963, p.110.
- (43) Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de

- Málaga, 1936, pp. 345-6.
- (44) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de</u>
  <u>Málaga, 1937</u>, pp. 2-3.
- (45) ibid., p.2.
- (46) Such new legislation was to apply whenever any area fell to the Nationalists. In the field of education, for instance, religious instruction was made compulsory in elementary schools on 21 September 1936 and in secondary schools on 7 October 1936, while co-education (introduced during the Republic) was abolished on 22 September 1936.
- (47) Nueva España, 30.3.39., no.2, p.1.
- (48) <u>Yugo</u>, 21.4.39., no.19, p.2.
- (49) Yugo, 16.4.39., no.15, p.2.
- (50) Yugo, 12.4.39., no.11, p.3.
- (51) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de</u>
  <u>Málaga,1939</u>, pp.237-9.
- (52) <u>Yugo</u>,19.4.39.,no.17, p.3; 20.4.39.,no.18, p.4; 21.4.39.,no.19, p.4; 22.4.39.,no.20, p.2; 23.4.39.,no.21, p.3; 25.4.39.,no.22, p.4.
- (53) Hoja Oficial de los Lunes, 11.9.37., no.181, p.3.
- (54) <u>Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Sevilla, 1939</u>, pp.166-174.
- (55) On the official cessation of hostilities bringing
  Franco victory, Gomá expressed his joy and gratitude
  to Franco in the following telegram: "Excelentísimo
  y distinguido amigo: Reitero mi telegrama del día
  24 con motivo de la Victoria final sobre los
  enemigos de España...Que Dios y la Patria paguen
  al glorioso Ejército español, y especialmente a
  Vuencencia, que tan espléndidamente lo ha llevado

a la victoria...". In his reply of 20 May 1939,
Franco expressed his gratitude to the Church for
its support in what he claimed had been a war on
behalf of Christianity: "...es mi deseo destacar
...el callado martirio que sufrieron los representantes de nuestra fe,que sin una sola abjuración,
y gozosos de recibir la palabra de los elegidos,
acompañaron desde el comienzo al final de nuestra
campaña a esa legión de creyentes...Nuestra lucha
tuvo carácteres de Cruzada, en la que cayeron,
jalonando etapas, prelados eminentes..."

- (56) Pemartín, J., Qué es lo nuevo, Santander 1938, p.72.
- (57) ibid.,p.72,footnote 1.
- (58) op.cit.,p.45.
- (59) Ebenstein, W., Church and State in Franco Spain, Princeton 1960, p.2.
- (60) de Miguel, A., 40 millones de españoles 40 años después, Barcelona 1976, pp.204-5.
- (61) op.cit., p.125.
- (62) J.Pemartín left no room for doubt as to his ideal of <a href="macional-catolicismo">nacional-catolicismo</a>; "...una unidad absoluta entre el ideal del Estado y el ideal de la Iglesia....una Nacionalidad cuyo fondo ideológico no ha de permitir la existencia oficial....de ideologías no coincidentes en la ideología fundamental del Estado-Nación" (op.cit.,p.73). The view of J.Soto de Gangoiti of the new ideal state ran along similar lines: "El Nuevo Estado español....funde en una gram fuerza las dos fuerzas nacionales:la de la Patria y la de la Religión..." Soto de Gangoiti,J.,

- Relaciones de la Iglesia Católica y el Estado Español, Madrid 1940, p.295.
- (63) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado de</u>

  <u>Granada,1939</u>, pp.283-6.
- (64) Diaz-Plaja, F., <u>La España Franquista en sus Documentos</u>, Barcelona 1976, p.44.
- (65) Garriga, R., El Cardenal Segura y el Nacional Catolicismo, (Barcelona, 1977), p.273.
- (66) ibid., p.274.
- (67) ibid., p.275.
- (68) ibid., p.275.
- (69) ibid., p.275.
- (70) ibid., p.275.
- (71)Garriga certainly presents an interesting case; "....merece comentar que el cardenal Segura tampoco figura entre los signatorios... No fue invitado a firmarla? ..... Aunque oficialmente pertenecía a la Curia romana, no se puede olvidar que había ocupado la Sede toledana y que su gran deseo era volver a tener una diócesis en tierra española; él había sido la primera gran victima del sectarismo religioso del régimen republicano y contra el anticlericalismo había luchado con todas sus fuerzas. Sin embargo, el ex primado tenía sus ideas personales sobre la religión y la política, además de conocer bien el pensamiento de la Santa Sede, que a mediados de 1937 no era de total entrega a la causa de Franco. ك Quiso reservarse su opinión ?... ف No aceptaba el carácter de cruzada que se había dado a la guerra civil ? (ibid., pp.249-250).

- (72) ibid., p.253.
- (73) ibid., p.256.
- (74) ibid., p.256.
- (75) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1942, p.458.
- (76) Nicholl, D., "Religious Liberty in Spain; a Survey to 1968", <u>Iberian Studies</u>, vol.1, no.1, Spring 1972, p.7.
- (77) Jobit, P., <u>L'Eglise d'Espagne à l'Heure du</u>
  Concile, Paris 1965, p.71.
- (78) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1941, pp. 127-155.
- (79) <u>Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada</u>, 1942, pp.145-6.
- (80) El Pueblo Gallego, 27.2.45., no.6,709, p.1.
- (81) <u>El Pueblo Gallego</u>, 29.3.45., no.6,735, p.l.
  - (82) <u>Sur</u>, 1.4.45., no. 3,594, p.5.
  - (83) de Esteban, J.and López Guerra, L., <u>La Crisis</u> del Estado Franquista, Barcelona 1977, p.81.
  - (84) Petschen, S., <u>La Iglesia en la España de Franco</u>, Madrid 1977, p. 38.
  - (85) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado de</u>
    <u>Granada, 1939</u>, pp. 312-329.
  - (86) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 1.4.41., no.7, pp.8-9.
  - (87) Urbina, F., "Formas de vida de la Iglesia en España: 1939-1975", in Urbina, F. et al., ed., Iglesia y Sociedad en España, Madrid 1977, p.13.
  - (88) Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado de Granada, 1942, p. 489.
  - (89) The missions of January 1942 in Granada had "espléndidos resultados" ibid., p.212.
  - (90) <u>Boletín Oficial del Obispado de Cádiz-Ceuta, 1947</u>, pp. 45-6.

- (91) <u>Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada</u>, 1939, p.338.
- (92) ibid., p.657.
- (93) Urbina, F., op.cit., pp.14-15.
- (94) ibid., p.15.
- (95) Petschen, S., op.cit., p.42.
- (96) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1939, pp.550-551.
- (97) <u>Boletín Oficial del Obispado de Cádiz-Ceuta</u>, 1947, p.47.
- (98) ibid., p.48.
- (99) This Jesuit appeared in a report in Yugo (already mentioned in footnote 48) as Jesús Martínez

  Santaella; however, as A. Montero (op.cit., p.868) refers to him as Martín Santaella, in common with the Archdiocesan Bulletin, then the name appearing in Yugo must be deemed incorrect, presumably due to a printing error.
- (100) <u>Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada</u>, 1942, pp. 43-5.
- (102) <u>Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada</u>,1942, pp. 460-461.

- (103) Urbina, F., op.cit., pp.14-15.
- (104) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1940, pp. 111-140.
- (105) Garriga, R., op.cit., p.286.
- (106) ibid., pp.567-9.
- (107) ibid., p.652.
- (108) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1939, p.350.
- (109) ibid., p.619.
- (110) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1941, pp.49-52.
- (111) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1942, p.625.
- (112) Urbina, F., op.cit., p.31.
- (113) Chao Rego, F., La Iglesia que Franco quiso, Madrid.

  1976, p.39.
- (114) Marzal, A., "Iglesia española. Del triunfo a la soledad", <u>Hechos y Dichos</u>, December, 1975, pp. 13-16.
- (115) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1940, pp.529-530.
- (116) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1942, p. 359.
- (117) ibid., p.506.
- (118) Petschen, S., op. cit., p.51.
- (119) Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Jaén, 1947, p.288.
- (120) Boletín Oficial del Arzobispado de Granada, 1942, p. 265.
- (121) The attitude of J. Soto de Gangoiti was typical of the aggressive stance taken by Catholic

Nationalists at the end of the war, denigrating the Freedom of Worship decree that had been passed by the Republic on May 22, 1931 in the following terms: "....cosa absurda, ya que en España no existen cultos; no hay más que uno, profundamente arraigado en el corazón del español, que es el católico, porque el español o es católico o es ateo..." -Soto de Gangoiti, J., op. cit., p.9.

- (122) Garriga, R., op. cit., p.294.
- (123) Araujo García, C., and Grubb, K.G., Religion in the Republic of Spain, London 1933, p.94.
- (124) Jackson, G., The Spanish Republic and the Civil War, 1931-39, Princeton 1967, pp. 446,448.
- (125) Welles, B., Spain The Gentle Anarchy, London 1965, p.172.
- (126) López Rodríguez, M., <u>La España Protestante</u>, Madrid 1976, p.24.
- (127) Estruch, J., "How can there be Protestants in Spain? ", The Ecumenical Review, vol. XX, no.1, Jan. 1968, p.54.
- (128) The language used was the usual mixture of the political and the religious: "Dejar de votar es faltar a un deber de conciencia....hay que tener en cuenta la experiencia pasada....Hay que votar a quienes garanticen que los derechos de Dios y de la Religión van ser respetados" Ya, 4.7.47., p.l.
- (129) Ecclesia 5.7.47, no. 312, p.7.
- (130) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Jaén,</u>
  1947, p. 286.
- (131) Fernández Areal, M., op. cit., p.158.
- (132) Barral, C., <u>Años de Penitencia</u> (Madrid, 1975), pp.16-17, and p.22.

- (133) Urbina, F., op. cit., p.13.
- (134) Ordóñez Márquez, J., op.cit., p.244.
- (135) <u>Sur</u>, 27.3.45., no.3,590, p.1.
- (136) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado</u>
  de Granada, 1939, p. 420.
- (137) Aldea Vaquero, Q. et al. ed., op.cit., p.44.
- (138) ibid., p.1,046.
- (139) ibid., p.1,047.
- (140) ibid., p.1,399.
- (141) ibid., p.1,399.
- (142) ibid., p.1,495.
- (143) op.cit., pp.342-3.
- (144) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Jaén, 1945</u>, pp.1-19.

#### CHAPTER TWO

The era of uncertainty: from the first signs of concern of the late forties to the arrival of the Second Vatican Council in 1962.

## The Historical Persective.

Although the period from the late forties to the early sixties is not marked by any cataclysmic event such as a civil war and subsequent abrupt changes in political and ecclesiastical affairs, to suppose that these years were ones of an unchanging, static situation for both Government and Church in Spain would be too facile and superficial a view. Changes do occur, but in an almost imperceptible way, and what makes them harder to pin down is that they are changes in attitude, 'internal' changes brought about by a gradual social and psychological metamorphosis, rather than 'external' changes imposed by more tangible events. Another difficulty encountered when attempting to analyse the period following the post-Civil War triumphalism of the forties is deciding when this next period ends:it can be argued that 1962 is an arbitrary choice, as one could claim that 1965 (the closing of the Council) is just as significant a date. Such are the limits and pitfalls of chronological compartmentalisation. However, 1962 has been chosen on the grounds that the beginning of Vatican II meant a new era of self-questioning by the universal Church. N. Cooper's assertion that only the Civil War has had a greater impact on the Spanish Church this century is perhaps no exaggeration (1), while J.J.Ruiz Rico also feels that 1962 is the key date for compartmentalisation , though at the same time

admitting that there are difficulties involved in an analysis of an apparently unchanging period - though his starting point was 1953 (2):

"...muy posiblemente 1953 culmina un período y 1962 abre otro diferente. Hay un cierto grado de insustancialidad, si así se me permite decirlo, entre 1953 y 1962."

In the previous chapter, it was stated that the culmination of the post-Civil War period was towards the end of the forties, with the first signs of stated episcopal concern, in the form of pastorals, with social problems. But another reason for not regarding 1953, the year of the Concordat, as a watershed is that the Concordat merely ratified an already existing state of affairs and was not a new departure as such in Church-State relations - though it was a formal seal of approval by the Vatican, and Pla i Deniel was to see the pact with the United States which gave the regime political respectability as an act of Divine Providence in the light of the signing of the Concordat one month previously (3). The fifties were the years of the 'cold war', and the anti-communism of Francoist Spain was a boon to the dictatorship - "any increase in international tension promoted anti-communism and strengthened Franco's regime, states M. Gallo (4). But the fifties also constituted a period of change within Spain itself, of latent socio-economic change, as M. Gallo has pointed out (5), with the incipient growth of a new middle-class and the first signs of

economic growth, a growth which was to gain momentum with the abandonment of autarquía and the introduction of foreign investment. Critics of the regime - like M. Gallo - consider that this modest economic growth of the fifties had its negative side, in that it was achieved at the expense of human suffering, with wage freezes, inflation and other ills. It was only when the Stabilisation Plan of 1959 was passed, officially abandoning autarquía and thereby opening the doors to Western European capitalism (membership of the International Monetary Fund and of the Organisation for European Economic Cooperation) and an unprecedented tourist boom, that any real growth was a achievedyet even this was accompanied by a growing militancy by workers and their sympathisers in the face of unresolved social problems already mentioned which were virtually traditional in Andalusia especially. The growing number of tourists in Spain also added a foreign dimension to the previously hermetically sealed existence of most Spaniards, and other novelties such as television helped to generate change, again as commentators such as M. Gallo (6) have pointed out.

But this period was also one of change and innovation for the Church. Behind the facade of monolithic unity, there began to appear within the Church disparate forces which were to speak with an increasingly independent voice as the years went by. The poverty endured by many Spaniards as the country tried to improve its economy after the trauma of the Civil War, together with the socio-economic inequalities which

existed - and which in impoverished Andalusia were possibly at their most obvious - became more and more an area of concern for these new forces at work within the Church, forces such as the organisation Hermandades Obreras de Acción Católica (HOAC) which evolved out of Acción Católica to be a more outspoken critic of the socio-economic system. This was to be one of the more striking aspects of preconciliar Catholicism in Spain, a situation perhaps best summarised by C. Giner - "Durante este perado se apuntan algunos signos de renovación con la aparición de dirigentes laicos... que serán los que pongan las bases de la futura transformación conciliar" (7).

Moreover, although the hierarchy appeared united, there were signs that a minority, admittedly small, were increasingly prepared to speak at times critically on social issues, though great care was taken never to extend such criticism to the government itself. This emerging voice of social concern comes to the fore with the Papacy of John XXIII, whose encyclicals Mater et Magistra and Pacem in Terris - both basically advocating democracy and other concepts having only a relative meaning in the minds of Francoists - were to cause shock waves in a state nurtured on the tenets of nacional-catolicismo. Similar consternation arose from John's statement of 4 September 1961 that the Civil War was a "lamentable guerra fratricida": the concept of the cruzada was hearing its own death knell. This period, then, though at first sight one of immobility and uniformity, is really one of latent change and evolution, a prelude to the watershed of

Vatican II.

## 1. The stance of the Andalusian hierarchy.

The preamble to this chapter in no way implies that there was internecine strife within the hierarchy as to the new ideas being propagated: even those prelates, such as Herrera, who displayed an avid interest in the social problems of the time did not do so in any militant manner - at least, not until the awakening caused by John XXIII's papacy was there an increase, either quantitatively or qualitatively, in episcopal criticism of the socio-political domain, either in Andalusia or in the country at large. Indeed, while there still existed the spirit of the cruzada any meaningful criticism of any aspect of the status quo was impossible, stated thus by F. Lannon (8):

"Catholicism tended to be seen as a package deal: acceptance of Catholic doctrine also implied acceptance of certain intellectual traditions, political commitments,... which were more often derived from the peculiarly embattled and archaic nature of Spanish Catholicism than from the teaching of the universal Church. A rejection of any component part of the package was inevitably, in these circumstances, interpreted as destructive of the whole..."

#### (a) The spiritual.

Pastoral letters and other directives of the Andalusian hierarchy still laid great emphasis on

adherence to accepted social mores and public behaviour in tones typical of nacional-catolicismo: Segura's obsession with the sinfulness of dancing, for instance, led him to threaten the mayor of a pueblo in his diocese with excommunication for having allowed dancing such as the agarrao at the local fair(9), while as late as the beginning of the tourist boom Herrera initiated a campaign against the bikini (10). The hierarchy also emphasised the traditional importance of prayer and good works. A perusal of pastorals will illustrate the emphasis placed on this -Segura, for instance, pointed out in July 1953 the value of Acción Católica in promoting works of charity, calling the organisation "la Vanguardia de los ejércitos de Dios" (11) - and messages such as this reflect the growing concern of the hierarchy with social problems. Pastorals concerned with the necessity of prayer lay special emphasis on devotion to Mary, and with the decision of the Vatican to nominate 1954 Año Mariano , the Spanish hierarchy devoted much time to the traditional eminence afforded to Our Lady as Mother of God, among the Andalusian bishops Segura perhaps being the most prominent in this regard, with exhortations on the spiritual value of prayers such as the rosary (12). The significance of the marian tradition and any externals associated with it was as great in Andalusia as elsewhere in Spain - for example, more than 3,000 people attended a special pilgramage in Granada organised by the parish church of Alhendín (13), while an important part of the ejercicios espirituales at Almeria organised by Acción Católica included special

devotion to Our Lady (14).

However, such preoccupations also ran the danger of relegating to a much lower level of importance the pressing social problems endured by many of the poor, with certain churchmen as yet seemingly incapable of appreciating the reasons for widespread dissatisfaction and murmurings of social unrest. This consideration of the preoccupation of the poor with the basic, material aspects of life led at times to condemnation of their concerns for materialistic gains, manifesting itself in various pastorals, one being that of Bishop Rafael Alvárez Lara of Guadix-Baza, at the beginning of 1954(15):

"¡Qué necesidad tan grande tenemos hoy de la fe! .... por todas partes estamos rodeados de distracciones y peligros, de preocupaciones y cuidados,... de ambiciones desorbitadas y de infinidad de quehaceres intrascendientes que han hecho que el hombre esté demasiado entretenido en las cosas de la tierra..."

The tenor of such statements showed that there was still a gap between certain members of the hierarchy and the poor, with any sign of mass interest in church activities by many of the poor tending to be superficial—with perhaps Andalusia best embodying this attitude with the somewhat garish extrovertism of its <a href="mailto:semana santa">semana santa</a>, described by a critical A. Comín as a "deformación increíble de la Pasión y Muerte de Cristo" (16), a type of religion emphasising externals to the possible

cost of a deeper appreciation of the Christian message, condemned by the French writer E. de la Souchère the same year as the publication of the above mentioned pastoral of Alvárez Lara (17).

An emphasis on the areas of religious observance was not peculiar to the Andalusian hierarchy: while all its individual members obviously gave invaluable support to various schemes and inspirations attempting to better the lot of the poor (such as those already mentioned in the previous chapter), the hierarchy as a body maintained silence on matters concerned with the nation's socio-economic problems - indeed the only joint pastorals were the somewhat tendentiously worded ones of 28 May 1948 (Sobre la propaganda protestante en España) and 25 July 1950 (Sobre crítica, propaganda y publicidad de obras literarias, teatrales, cinematográficas de caracter heterodoxo o inmoral), the only occasions on which the bishops were to speak collectively since the pastoral of 1 July 1937 defending the uprising, and thereby leading F. Gil Delgado to describe the situation as "Iglesia del silencio, en armonía" (18). It is not until the second half of the fifties that the hierarchy is to give a more social dimension to its spiritual message by collectively voicing concern with the social problems of the disadvantaged.

# (b) The political.

The hierarchy's adherence to the traditional values peculiar to Spanish Catholicism was matched by its support for the status quo, and in the eyes of

leftists such as Comín a Church obsessed with the militant crusading spirit of the Civil War and its aftermath was too blinkered to appreciate the daily struggle for existence waged by working people (19):

"El anticomunismo dominante paraliza muchas buenas intenciones y se identifica lucha obrera con marxismo, sin más distinciones."

The faithful were encouraged to accept and have respect for the status quo, as was not surprising, given the painful memories of the painful past. Although this is the era of a certain questioning by the Church of the conditions endured by many Spaniards, it would be erroneous to believe that the Church extended any such concern, and with it any implied criticism, to the regime. The duty of the citizen to respect authority and those who dispense it could be likened to the duty of Mary in her calling as the Mother of God, and her submissive obedience in accepting that duty - so stated the Bishop of Malaga, in his pastoral "María y las virtudes cívicas" in rebruary 1954 (20):

"Nos referimos al deber de actar y obedecer el poder civil establecido...Para un católico la suprema autoridad civil tiene siempre una doble representación: por una parte, representa a Dios, y por otra, representa el bien común de la sociedad. Y porque representa

a Dios merece el actamiento, la
veneración y el amor de los
súbditos....Uno de los sillares
fundamentales de ese mundo mejor
que, dirigida por el Papa, trata
de levantar la Iglesia, tiene
que ser precisamente el sentir y
practicar la obediencia al poder
civil con la perfección con que
la practicó María. Bien comprendéis,
por otra parte, que la Iglesia
apoya a la autoridad como tal sea
quien fuere el que la personifique."

Moreover, the same bishop was to welcome Franco at Malaga during his tour of Andalusia in April 1956 with the following words of praise: "¿Con qué palabras agradecerá el obispo de Málaga.... al Jefe del Estado el bien singular que este orden nos ha hecho?" (21) - and went on to emphasise to Franco the value he attached to Church-State links(22):

"Me ha parecido que cuando
Vuestra Excelencia avanzaba por
la nave os ha acogido benévola
desde su trono la imagen de
Santa María de la Victoria,
patrona de Málaga. Ha sido,
sin duda, una muestra de gratitud
....Inmensos son los servicios
prestados por Vuestra Excelencia
a la Iglesia y a España. Pocos
podrán estimarlos en su conjunto
como el prelado que os habla."

Nor was Herrera Oria the only Andalusian prelate to publicly affirm his appreciation of the Franco government: in December 1958, for example, on receiving his cardinal's hat from Franco, José María Bueno Monreal, Archbishop of Seville, was to speak in the following laudatory terms (23):

"Después de este honor, ninguno
puede ser para mí más estimable
que recibir el birrete, atributo
de la dignidad cardenalicia, de
las augustas manos de Vuestra
Excelencia, suprema encarnación
de mi Patria por designio de Dios
... El honor que recibo de Vuestra
Excelencia en este momento...
inunda mi alma de emoción y agradecimiento profundo hacia Vuestra
Excelencia y hacia vuestro gobierno..."

Three years later, Bueno Monreal was to speak in similar terms before Franco during the latter's tour of Andalusia, this time emphasising the themes of justice and peace under Francoism and the atmosphere of concord between Church and State — though there were already some churchmen who would question those sentiments (24):

"Cuando la Iglesia encuentra un gobernante de profundo sentido cristiano, de honestidad acrisolada en su vida individual, familiar y pública, que con justa y eficaz rectitud favorece su misión espiritual al tiempo que,

con total entrega, prudencia y
fortaleza, trata de conducir la
Patria por los caminos de la
justicia, del Orden y de la paz.....
que nadie se sorprenda de que la
Iglesia bendiga no solamente en el
plano de la concordia, sino con
afectuosidad de Madre a ese hijo
que, elevado a la suprema jerarquía,
trata honesta y dignamente de servir
a Dios y la Patria."

What is remarkable about this declaration of overt support for the Francoist state in tones still reminiscent of national-catolicismo is its date: it was made in 1961, when John XXIII had already been Pope for three years, and only one year before the opening of Vatican II. Franco himself was ready to emphasise the theme of the cruzada throughout this tour (from 20 April to 4 May ): at Huelva he spoke of "la conciencia de España y de los católicos" (25): while at Pilas, in Seville province he clearly reminded all of the debt that Catholicism owed to the 1936 uprising - "....aquellos hombres que predicaban que iban a elevar el nivel de vida, que iban a lograr el paraíso en una España republicana, ¿qué hicieron por el pueblo ?.... perseguir a la Iglesia, intentar la destrucción de todo lo espiritual que tenía España..." - sentiments with which bishops whose feelings to the regime were tinged with gratitude. such as Bueno Monreal, would concur.

Such thinking had been encouraged by the signing of the Concordat in August, 1953, after some years of

negotiation. Franco had been anxious for the Concordat to be signed — a seal of respectability on his regime, both spiritually and politically. Steps taken to project a favourable image of the Spanish regime to the Vatican included a journey to Rome by Herrera, where he had an audience with the Pope. Indeed, Herrera played a rather prominent part in these plans, having already praised Franco in the following terms on Vatican Radio in March 1951 (26):

"....el gran patriota que rige los destinos de la nación es tan amante del pueblo como fiel hijo de la Iglesia."

What was to prove ironic about this agreement - which, of course, only underlined or made official an already existing relationship between Church and State, as S. Petschen among others, has already pointed out (27) - was that some articles of it were to give rise to controversy in the near future, particularly article XXXIV, which gave the Church the right to conduct its apostolate through <a href="Acción Católica">Acción Católica</a> without state interference - and as the increasingly militant <a href="HOAC">HOAC</a> had been born of <a href="Acción Católica">Acción Católica</a>, this was to have great significance, especially in Andalusia.

In Andalusia, certainly, there were few official declarations by the hierarchy on the signing of the Concordat; although the occasional statement of support was made by bishops individually — the Archbishop of Granada, for instance, particularly welcomed article XXVIII, which gave universities the right to run courses on theology and Canon Law, a gratifying innovation given the unpleasant memories of the past, described as "la terrible escisión de la cristiandad, causada por

la secularización de las instituciones y el advenimiento del espíritu laico" (28) - an examination of the diocesan bulletins of Andalusia meets with no pastoral or official statement of any sort on the Concordat or its importance, except for a reproduction of the official text. Does this have significance? Does it merely mean that, as the agreement was only the legalisation of a previous situation, no comment was felt necessary? Surely to interpret the silence as having more ominous implications would be bordering on the sensationalist ? The editorial of Ecclesia (29) the same week as the signing of the Concordat, while showing pleasure at the outcome - "nacido de una victoriosa cruzada, en la cual los caídos se decian muertos por Dios y por España" - also tempered its language somewhat - "Un ambiente de cordialidad y mutua cooperación" - thereby evoking a sense of quiet satisfaction rather than exhuberant It is possible that the misgivings on the value of the Concordat - for example P. Lain Entralgo implied as much to the Vatican under-Secretary of State Montini, one day to be Pope Paul V1 (30) - were felt by many more people within the Church than is commonly supposed, and that the silence of the Andalusian hierarchy is a reflection, perhaps subconsciously, of those misgivings.

### 2. Signs of dissension within the hierarchy.

However, any doubts that may have possibly existed or otherwise concerning the acceptance of the Concordational belong to the realm of theorizing or supposition.

What is beyond doubt is the continued public support and praise of the Head of State by the hierarchy. There was only one exception to this - and the exception

other regions - namely, Pedro Cardinal Segura, Archbishop of Seville, whose concept of the Church as <u>sociedad</u> <u>perfecta</u> raised it above the level of the political or the secular and, by extension, free from any signs of state interference. As has been seen, Segura had already experienced brushes with the regime over his refusal to have the inscription to José Antonio Primo de Rivera painted on the walls of his Cathederal, and - in a more personal vein - by his derogatory remarks on the etymology of the word <u>caudillo</u>. But in October 1948 there arose another situation which had personal overtones - not to Franco, but to his wife, Carmen Polo, and therefore perhaps even more unpalatable to the Spanish leader.

On the occasion of the seventh centenary of the conquest of Seville by King San Fernando (and the unveiling of a monument to the Sacred Heart), a banquet was organised, at which Franco naturally had pride of place. But the problem arose when Segura, obeying to the letter the unquestionable (to him ) traditions and directives of the Church - which stated that a Cardinal of the Church was to give place of prominence only to a king, queen, heir to the throne or head of state - steadfastly refused to grant Doña Carmen the same privilege at the banquet. Segura was, as always, adamant, and the banquet was finally cancelled. According to R. Garriga (31), Franco never forgave Segura for this slight on his wife.

It may also help to explain another event which involved Segura - and which also helps to set the Andalusian hierarchy apart from the rest of the Spanish

hierarchy in that it is possibly the only recorded case, certainly in the period under examination in this chapter, of open dissent, not only between bishop and state, but between bishop and bishop in the same see. Though the incident about to be recounted had its dénouement, really speaking, in the Clínica del Kosario in Madrid on 7 April 1957 when Segura died as Cardinal Archbishop of Seville the first act began back in 1937, when Segura publicly announced his disapproval when the apostolic delegate to Spain, Antoniutti, failed to oppose the execution of Basque priests by the insurgents. Segura had also made clear that if any similar incidents occurred he would denounce them personally to Pope Pius Xl. When Antoniutti was made papal nuncio to Spain in 1953, the relationship between the two men remained cold, according to R. Garriga, to the extent that Segura steadfastly refused Antoniutti's suggestions that an auxiliary bishop was needed at Seville, presumably seeing it as a plot between Antonuitti and Franco to have him removed because of his past disagreement with the regime (32):

"No era nada fácil silenciar a
Segura y apartarlo de Sevilla;
por una parte, se creía en la
necesidad de acabar definitivamente
con esa voz tan discordante
en el gran coro eclesiástico
que se dedicaba, sin descanso,
a entonar loas al Caudillo. "

The only solution to the problem posed by this turbulent priest was to remove Segura, as any form of compromise with such a determined character was impossible

- "En este panorama de unidad e identificación era menester silenciar la voz discordante de Sevilla." states R. Garriga (33), and so a plot was hatched by Artajo, Castiella and Antoniutti to lure Segura away from Spain and thereby rid Franco of Segura - whom he once referred to as "una cruz que Dios me mandaba" (34) - and so while Segura was in Rome to see Pius XII in October 1954, Bueno Monreal left his diocese of Vitoria and, without previous notice, entered Seville Cathedral on 2 November, where he showed the necessary documents proving his nomination as auxiliary bishop to the cathedral chapter, together with right of succession as Archbishop of Seville (35). When Segura discovered that he would find Bueno Monreal installed as auxiliary bishop on his return to Seville from Rome, his reaction, given his temperament, was predictable: he left for Seville, arriving there on 9 November, and in an address to a large crowd on 21 November he made clear his own feelings on the situation - "No obstante lo que hayáis oído, sigo siendo vuestro padre. único, el encargado del bien de vuestras almas, el responsable ante Dios de todas vuestras necesidades, soy yo..." (36) - Segura was obviously determined to remain as Archbishop, and remained an implacable critic of the regime whenever he considered it to have usurped the authority and liberty of the Church - "Ni aun la Guardia Civil me sacará de mi diócesis." he stated on one occasion (37), and he was to die as Cardinal Archbishop of Seville, on 7 April 1957. It is significant, but not surprising, that obituaries in the Spanish Press recounted with great detail his fight with the Second Republic, but made no mention: of

the affair in any other source, ecclesiastical or state. If this account were correct, the affair would put Bueno Monreal, especially, in a most unfavourable light: such devious behaviour ill becomes a prince of the Church.

## 3. Signs of Catholic dissension outside of the hierarchy.

One of the most interesting aspects of Church affairs in the late forties onwards is the increasing involvement, by individuals and groups linked to the Church, in the socio-economic problems of the time. This involvement, timid and esoteric at first, was to become increasingly militant and widespread as the fifties went on, attaining even greater impetus with the winds of change blowing over the Pyrenees from the openminded papacy of the new Pope, John XXIII. This awareness of socio-economic problems was also more acutely felt, or appeared to be so, amongst the laity and some priests than among the hierarchy: the bishops, both in Andalusia and elsewhere, were more cautious in becoming involved with the socio-economic ills of the state, the more outspoken criticisms appearing in that sector of the Church to be known as la base, namely groups such as HOAC, prominent individuals, and those priests in daily contact with the more oppressed sectors of society.

### (a) HOAC in Andalusia.

The organisation Hermandades Obreras de Acción Católica founded by the Primate, Cardinal Pla. Deniel, out of Acción Católica in 1946, was lay in nature but also an integral part of the Church's apostolate, and became steadily more vocal in its comments on Spain's social problems and the inequalities which existed. Its growing involvement in such matters, while care-

fully emphasising its spiritual links, blossomed in the fifties, its activities in Andalusia being chiefly concerned with cursillos and various discussion groups. The emphasis was always on a more practical Christianity from the point of view of the worker, and it enjoyed a rapid increase in membership and participation. The newly-formed branch of Cadiz diocese sent members known as militantes - to the national congress in Madrid for the first time in 1953 (39), while Cadiz itself was the stage for a more localised meeting a year later, when a group from La Linea came to discuss various problems at the Centro León XIII (40). Another meeting in Andalusia, this time at Cordoba, in January 1956, was honoured by the presence of that diocese's bishop, who received with interest a detailed account of activities in the social and spiritual sphere (41). A sign of the growing multifaceted composition of HOAC from the social point of view was a joint meeting of workers and students at the cursillos nocturnos at Granada that same month (42). But such interest in social affairs attracted the suspicion, if not hostility, of many establishment groups, and Pla i Deniel was forced to reiterate the rights of HOAC to organise its lay apostolate through the terms of the Concordat in a speech in the feast of San José Obrero, 27 April 1958. A group having roughly the same aims as HOAC was JOC (Juventud Obrera Cristiana), the Spanish branch of an international organisation founded by Joseph Cardijn, a Belgian priest; and this group, too, was to endure the hostility of a Church establishment suspicious of the new wave of trans-Pyrenean sociotheological thought, as illustrated by a most unsympathetic editorial in Ecclesia on 27 March 1954.

But the increasing openness and militancy of HOAC's work was inevitable, given that the milagro económico of the fifties and early sixties was partly achieved at the expense of the more vulnerable members of society, as 'stabilisation' of the economy meant 'stabilisation' of wages but not of prices, thereby exacerbating the already precarious economic situation of the working-classes.

The other point to be remembered is that the economic growth enjoyed by Spain as a whole in the midfifties onwards was not shared by Andalusia: as has been pointed out in the previous chapter, although Andalusia was to grow steadily wealthier during the second half of the fifties onwards, the gap between Andalusia and the traditionally wealthier parts of Spain remained virtually At the risk of repetition, in 1955, for instance, the Andalusian province with the highest per capita income was Seville, yet Seville was only in seventeenth place in a table of fifty provinces, while three of the bottom four places were also occupied by Andalusian provinces (Jaen, Almeria and Granada), the last named having less than half of the national average per capita income, whereas Guipuzcoa had more than double the national average. By 1960, the top three Andalusian provinces (Seville, Cadiz and Huelva ) showed further regression, comparatively, in that their percentage of the national average had fallen, with the wealthy Basque Provinces drawing further away.

The problems confronted by <u>HOAC</u> in Andalusia, therefore, were more acute than in most areas of the country, and <u>HOAC's</u> interest in the region was proportionately greater, Andalusia receiving great attention by the fortnightly editions of <u>Boletín HOAC</u>. Examples

are articles such as "¡Andalucía - la gran promesa y la gran amenaza! " (43), or prominent reports of meetings organised by <u>HOAC</u> such as that discussing the necessity of <u>descanso dominical</u> for the fishermen of Almeria at the parish church of San Roque on 29 May 1960 (44).

Work such as this also helped to make the Church more credible in the eyes of a proletariat that had justifiably grown cynical of a Church that had linked itself with the ruling establishment, as G. Hermet points out (45):

"Perçues un temps comme inoffensives
....ces organisations furent en
réalité le foyer de la renaissance
de la conscience ouvrière et l'unique
structure de rassemblement et de
formation critique offerte non
seulement aux catholiques de gauche,
mais aussi aux travailleurs de
filiation socialiste et anarchiste
qui y trouvaient un refuge point trop
exposé a la répression..."

But the movement, although public in name, was still circumspect in operation — and had to be, given the political reality of Spain at that time, and given the political sympathy of the vast majority of the Spanish episcopacy, who would not look upon a questioning, analytical group of Catholic affiliation with the most favourable of attitudes. Another factor to be noted is that the majority of the newly-enrolled hoacistas of the fifties tended to be young people who had no first-hand experience of the Civil War — and

consequently tended to see the conflict in a frame of mind somewhat less emotional than perhaps that of their forbears. This more 'psychological'analysis of the feelings common to many Catholic liberals is best summed up by F.Urbina (46):

"Em 1950-54 estamos en los linderos de una nueva época: la transición hacia elemundo moderno. Una nueva generación de jóvenes que mo han participado personalmente en la guerra va llegando a la adultez. El clima heroico-espiritualista de la A.C. anterior ya no les va... Mientras siguen de hecho las antiguas estructuras, dos nuevas líneas parecen ofrecerse como vías de renovación: los 'cursillos de cristiandad' y los 'movimientos apostólicos'..."

Similar thinking by such groups is indicated by C.Martí, with reference to a <u>JOC</u> motion of 1959 (47). By the sixties, a gap had grown between the <u>grupos</u> de base like <u>HOAC</u> and a more cautious hierarchy prepared to defend the status quo. But when, in 1961, Pope John published his encyclical <u>Mater et Magistra</u>, which declared that employees were free to organise their own unions in any society claiming to adhere to Christian principles, <u>HOAC</u>'s reaction was jubilant, their bulletin of September 1961 bearing the provocative front-page headline "Juan XXIII proclama Ta necesidad de que los obreros dirijan sus propios sindicatos"—though no hierarchical reaction was noted.

#### (b) Individual Catholics in Andalusia.

Individuals not enjoying the legal or psychological protection of Church-linked groups also begin to appear within the more critical wing of Andalusian Catholicism in the forties. One of the main commentators on Andalusia during this period was the writer A. Comín, a freelance writer on socio-economic affairs, His conception of the role of the Church vis-à-vis the poor - which was to win him few friends within the Spanish establishment (48) - is heavily tinted with the bias of his Marxism. Nevertheless he is interesting in that his work in the socio-economic realm of Catholicism - he has always claimed to be a Catholic despite his political beliefs, a stance defended in his book Cristianos en el Partido, Comunistas en la Iglesia Barcelona 1977 - had its roots before the new wave of socially-minded Catholicism of the Johannine papacy. Perhaps one of the most striking instances where comin relates his feelings for the poor to a specific circumstance is his description of the baptism of a baby in 1962 whose father was an industrial worker in Malaga earning 600 pesetas a week, with seven children to support. Comin's account is a fine balance between awe at the supranatural gifts being bestowed upon the child in the act of baptism, and sadness at what the future may hold for such a child. The quote is lengthy, but the beauty and strength of the passage is such that any drastic shortening would do it an injustice (49):

"Sin embargo, lo esencial se cumplía. Ahí se encierra la fuerza y el misterio sacramental, que viene de Dios, no de los hombres. Aquel niño recibía también la marca imborrable, nacía a la divinidad.... quedaba embarcado en esta barca en la que vamos tanta gente de tantos colores y medios, la barca de Pedro el Pescador. Pensé también: qué será de este niño? Y nosotros, los demás de la barca, qué le ofreceremos? vacío, la opresión, la soledad, el abandono? ... Señor, ¿ qué piensas de que embarquemos tantos pobres de Dios. para dejarlos luego pudrirse en un rincón? 'Evangelizar a los pobres'. Bautizarlos. Pero a la vez hagamos vida activa de la caridad. Si no, hacemos trampa... Sí, Cristo está ya con ellos para siempre... aunque quizá muchos de ellos no lo sepan."

At the same time, one could argue that such a theology is concerned so much with the material that it can be to the detriment of the spiritual, thereby relegating the Church to the level or function of a political party.

## (c) Individual priests in Andalusia.

A lot of <u>HOAC's</u> work was done with the help and cooperation of priests aware of the social problems which existed and sympathetic to the movements ideas

of a more questioning apostolate. However, concern at the ills besetting Spanish society and the injustices which the poor had to face was not limited to priests directly involved with HOAC. One of the most outspoken documents in Andalusia showing concern at the apathy of the working class towards the Church appeared in October 1951, its author being Antonio Ferreiro, Canon of Jaen cathedral. Entitled La Vida Económico-social en la Provincia de Jaén (50), it is am attempt both at analysing the causes of such apathy and at offering possible solutions. His concern at the attitude of the poor to the Church is made obvious by language which makes no attempt to play down the seriousness of the situation:

"Causa verdaderamente pavor el
examen detenido del estado religioso
de nuestra clase obrera. Ciñéndonos
exclusivamente a lo más elemental en
el cumplimiento de los deberes religiosos,
...la proporción entre el exiguo
número de obreros que cumplen con los que
no cumplen es aterradora....Si, pues, el
porcentaje aproximado del total que
cumple en la provincia es un 25 por 100,
teóricamente apenas es perceptible el
de la masa obrera que cumpliría con
sus deberes religiosos."

The document goes on to list the possible reasons for such disinterest, which are not only general religious ignorance, the aforementioned shortage of priests and shortage of rural parishes, but also the poor example:

of Christianity given by the social élite of the region. The last named is mentioned in language quite to the point:

"...el incumplimiento, en general, por parte de las clases ricas que frecuentan la Iglesia, de sus deberes sociales, y la grave repercusión de esta conducta en los obreros que conocen por intuición y confunden la doctrina católica con la conducta de muchos católicos."

But perhaps the most astounding information to be gleaned from the document, given its early date, is a reference to solutions which certain priests had obviously suggested to their poverty-stricken flock:

"Desgraciadamente se ha oído decir en los púlpitos de Jaén a sacerdotes y religiosos, que a los obreros parados y con hambre no les queda más solución que tomar la tea y la pistola para quemar olivares y hacer soltar a los ricos sus cuantiosas rentas."

It would seem, therefore, that there existed elements within the Church - unfortunately there exists no further evidence, either in episcopal or other sources, to corroborate in any way such incidents - more than a decade before the opening of the Vatican Council

that could be considered as militant as any in the twilight years of the Francoist dictatorship.

The document itself is evidence of a questioning within Catholic circles during the period preceding the Second Vatican Council, of a concern at social problems, of a growing realisation of the need of a certain autocrítica with particular regard to work in the social domain:

"Dominados por un egoísmo sin límites, por un individualismo feroz, ni sentimos ni obramos como miembros de una sociedad, de un mismo Cuerpo Místico. De ahí la necesidad de formar esa conciencia social..."

Such words were really the negation of the triumphalist Catholicism of only, a few years previously. The concluding words of the document, moreover, convey a message of compassion and concern for the underprivileged:

"En una sociedad civil rectamente organizada, nadie debe estar tendido a la vera del camino, asaltado por el hambre y por el paro. La justicia social invita a descender de una clase social privilegiada y elevar el nivel de vida de las clases pobres,"

Articles voicing similar concern also appeared at this time, one which analysed the problem in Spain generally, with occasional reference to Andalusia, appearing in 1952 with the significant title &Hemos

perdido la clase obrera en España? and written by a priest with experience of the lay apostolate, Florentino del Valle (51). As the title suggests, the document is imbued with self-questioning as to how the Church seemingly has failed to have the relevance for the poor that it has for the rich, and paying particular attention tocAndalusia, states that "este fenómeno de práctica religiosa está intimamente relacionado con la pobreza" - though the document also lays the blame for indifference to religion on new attitudes entering Spanish society:

"To que sí hay que lamentar, como triste 'avance' moderno, es la conducta de la joven...

El pudor se ha roto y acobardado ante la audacia del cine ..."

However, this document has generally a tone of sober self-analysis, and is therefore a reversal of the somewhat brash and confident moralising and triumphalism of only a few years previously.

A few years later, in the mid-fifties, there also appeared a brilliant young priest whom the poor of Andalusia were to regard with love and gratitude for his growing commitment to the eradication of socio-economic injustice. Rafael González Moralejo, one day to become Andalusia's best known and most charismatic prelate, arguably, of his time, he was co-founder (with Herrera ) of the Escuela Sacerdotal at Malaga, which was later to become the Instituto Social León XIII in Madrid. In his work El Momento Social de España, he spells out his ideas of what

constitutes true Christianity (52):

"Sentir con el débil. Es decir,
acortar las distancias sociales,
unir los corazones, suprimir
diferencias, equilibrar y pacificar
la sociedad, restablecer la
verdadera comunidad cristiana."

The essence of these words implied a change of Spanish society as it was then. To preach values of brotherhood and equality to a society nurtured on social divisions and a peace imposed dictatorially, could be claimed to be, if not revolutionary, then certainly, innovatory. In an article in Ecclesia just a few weeks after the publication of a joint pastoral in 1956 "Sobre la situación social en España" - more of which later - González Moralejo claimed that the Church had every right and duty to comment on matters outside of the strictly religious - while alluding to Pius XII's statement on the same during a meeting he had held with Spanish bishops on 2 November 1954, and thereby using a pontifical declaration to back up his own liberal views (53), but also showing himself, as events were to show during the next pontificate, to be a true visionary. The problems to be considered as he saw them, were six in number: a fair distribution of wealth, a just wage, the moral responsibility of employers, a fair share of profits, state intervention, and the trade union question. His view was that the Church had repeatedly failed the less well off - "no niego que los eclesiásticos hemos callado demasiadas veces, cuando deberíamos hablar" (54) -

but even more scathing criticism was reserved for the Church in the second of five addresses at the <u>Instituto</u>

<u>Social León XIII</u> during a course there from 8 to 12

April 1957 (55):

"La realidad, nos guste o no nos guste, es ésa: la Iglesia, a los ojos de los obreros, aparece como cómplice de aquellos a quienes ellos mismos consideran como enemigos y explotadores suyos .... Tal vez la actitud personal de algunos eclesiásticos haya podido dar pie a aquel supuesto de complicidad..."

This, surely, was a new departure: here was a priest not only openly allying himself with those whom he saw as the victims of an uncaring society — he was also openly castigating the attitudes and behaviour of his fellow priests for their failure to live up to the standards that they claimed to have as representatives of the Church. Also significant is the fact that this young priest, unlike the authors of the previously mentioned documents of <a href="mailto:autocritica">autocritica</a>, was to one day enter the hierarchy (he was a future Bishop of Huelva) — an example of how the psychological composition of the Spanish Church was to undergo gradual change, as will be seen in the examination of later years.

Another priest in Andalusia whose commitment was to a more militant and highly politicised theology was the canon of Malaga cathedral, José María González

Ruiz, for whom Christianity was to be concerned with the freeing of the oppressed in every way, politically and socially as well as Spiritually, a philosophy akin to the so-called 'liberation theology' now associated with left-wing priests of Latin America and broadly similar to that of laymen like Comín, as A.L.Oresanz states in his comparison of the two (56):

"Alfonso Carlos Comín y José
María González Ruiz representan
la radicalización cristiana desde
dos profesionalidades dispares.
La sociología en el primero, el
estudio bíblico en el segundo. En
ambos se da una posición crítica y
replanteadora de las actuales bases
de la conformación social y religiosa
en España."

González Ruiz's commitment to the realisation of a more politically-motivated Christianity was to meet with the disapproval of the establishment:like Segura, he was to incurr the wrath of those sympathetic to the regime. But from claims made by A.Sáez Alba, opposition to González Ruiz was also to come from the ecclesiastical establishment. According to Sáez Alba (57), Herrera was to attempt to have him removed as canon of Malaga cathedral in a show of episcopal disapproval at teachings which were considered dangerously unorthodox as regards their social content -a claim, one is compelled to add, not corroborated by evidence from other quarters. Indeed, Sáez Alba implies that the bishop was successful in having González Ruiz removed

from his post as canon - yet the Guía de la Iglesia en España still lists González Ruiz as camon at Malaga in its edition for 1963, and he is referred to as such as late as 1967 by Cuadernos de Ruedo Ibérico in a report of a speech given by him at a conference of the Ecumenical movement AGAPE at Turin: evidence which certainly leads one to question the truth.or at least accuracy.of Sáez Alba's allegations. Whatever the degree of truth or otherwise behind the claims of episcopal-sacerdotal disharmony in this case, the fact remains that the presence of priests such as the canon of Malaga Cathedral within the Spanish Church during this period demonstrates again that a new spirit of questioning had begun to emergesome time before Pope John XXIII's Second Vatican Council and its message of a more socially-orientated Christianity. Shows of misunderstanding between bishop and priests were occuring elsewhere in Spain-the joint letter of 339 Basque priests on 30 May 1960 criticising the socio-economic structures of Spain and lack of civil liberties perhaps springs most quickly to mind - and which did meet with a somewhat reactionary response from above (58).

# 4. The hierarchy's interest in social questions.

The indifference of the poor to the Church, together with the unpleasant conditions in which they lived, was certainly appreciated by some of the hierarchy, though criticism was not expressed as forcefully as by organisations more militant in tone such as <u>HOAC</u>. But comments devoted entirely to social questions were to grow apace among the hierarchy throughout the

fifties, until these pastorals in the early sixties were no longer the rarity they had once been. This is not to say that until these later years nothing had been done or achieved by the Church in the social domain, as has already been seen with the mention of groups and orders within the Church doing tireless work for the poor, old, sick and uneducated, more often than not with unqualified diocesan support. But what differentiates these later years is a growing tendency for bishops to actively criticise or question the socioeconomic reality of the country: there seems to appear an incipient desire for change and improvement of the basic structures of society, rather than accepting those realities and hoping that by schemes of charity, laudable though they were, the disadvantaged will be able to be protected somewhat from their harmful effects. It was slowly becoming clear to some members of a hierarchy nurtured on the tenets of nacional-catolicismo that, with the disappearance of the days of triumphal relief at the end of the Civil War, the Church had little significance for many of the poor. Perhaps nowhere was this more true than in Andalusia, where patterns of inequality were more starkly etched than elsewhere in Spain, as well as the already-mentioned myth of a clasista Church, as P. Broué and E. Témime suggest (59):

"Il est d'ailleurs intéressant de noter ici que c'est seulement dans les régions ou l'inégalité sociale est moins frappante, soit que tout le monde y soit pauvre comme en Galice, soit que le niveau general de la vie

Basque...que l'Eglise conserve une audience dans les masses rurales. Ailleurs, dans l'Espagne des latifundia, l'Église est considerée comme l'instrument de propagande et d'encadrement des riches, comme le défenseur d'un ordre sociale et d'une propriété iniques..."

Moreover, the bishop who was to concern himself more than any other with the social problems of the poor in Spain during this period happened to be a bishop of Andalusia, namely Angel Herrera Oria. From as early as the late forties Herrera was the most progressive Spanish bishop in the field of social problems, as W. Ebenstein has declared (60), and it is the vision of Herrera which put him ahead of many of his peers who seemed unable to appreciate to the same extent as he the effect that the living and working conditions of many Spaniards was having on their social and spiritual lives, in that the poor repeatedly identified their oppressors with the Church.

Born in 1886, Herrera's first career was in journalism, and he rose to become editor of the Catholic newspaper El Debate. His unswerving commitment to the social Catholicism of Pope Leo XIII led to such an involvement with the social problems of the thirties that, as has already been mentioned, he founded in 1931 Acción Nacional, the precursor of CEDA. This party encapsulated all of Herrera's ideals for a Christian Democrat party working in opposition to the Left within the parliamentary system of the day.

He then entered a seminary at Friburg,
Switzerland, and was ordained priest five years later.
W. Ebenstein (61) opines that this absence from Spain
during the Civil War may have freed him of any
association with the victors, which in turn may have
helped his credibility with those of social
involvement. At the same time, it can be argued that
the point is merely academic, in that he was openly
favourable to the Franco regime for the debt that
Catholicism in Spain owed it, and did not see such
acceptance of the regime as being incompatible with
his desire for social justice.

He was made bishop of Malaga within only six years of ordination, and quickly made his mark by becoming involved in the housing problems of Malaga's slums, persuading the government and the local authorities to act with the utmost celerity in the provision of new housing. He publicly thanked the Civil Governor of Malaga for his help in this venture, in a speech given at the Asamblea de Labradores on 15 February 1948, stating that the provision of decent housing was so urgent that it was more important than the building of new churches - an innovatory statement indeed, from a bishop of the Spain of the forties (62):

"A las escuelas y la iglesia les llegará su turno, pero delante tiene que ir una vivienda digna de seres humanos."

Nor was Herrera solely concerned with living conditions in Malaga alone: in the same speech, he made critical reference to the poverty endured by the fishermen of San Andrés in phraseology that could not have

#### been stronger:

"Viendo donde viven y cómo vivem aquellas pobres gentes, uno constata afligido que no puede tener entre ellos virtual—idad efectiva ninguna idea evangélica ni civilizadora. El medio ambiente mata todo germen de dignificación humana."

But Herrera's main area of concern was the plight of the <a href="bracero">bracero</a>, the landless labourer of the <a href="latifundio">latifundio</a> system. As has been seen, the <a href="bracero">bracero</a> was paid minimal wages, offered work less than half of the year because of the seasonal nature of agricultural work and often the virtual serf of an absentee landlord. Herrera's criticism of the socio-economic reality of rural Andalusia was to figure repeatedly in various pastorals and speeches from 1948 onwards, and given that Herrera was the only bishop to continually utter such concern, not only of Andalusia but of all Spain, his statements on the <a href="latifundio">latifundio</a> system merit some examination.

Within the first year of his consecration, Herrera made two important speeches in which he strongly criticised certain aspects of <u>latifundismo</u>. On 6 March 1948, at the closing ceremony of a week-long conference on political and social studies at Malaga, Herrera made the following virulent comments (63):

"Porque no cabe ni moral, ni religión, ni cultura cuando las familias viven hacinadas, peor que los animales con que labran la tierra....La Iglesia no puede solidarizarse en manera alguna

conocer ni menos aplicar el pensamiento pontificio acerca de la justicia social."

Moreover, although he took care never to criticise the government for allowing the existence of the sad situation - indeed praised the government whenever the occasion arose, such as his already quoted greeting to Franco during the latter's tour of Andalusia - his outspoken criticism of the latifundist system made him a singular figure in the Spanish hierarchy. On 19 March 1948, at the closing ceremony of the Jornadas Sociales which had taken place in Malaga, Herrera used the encyclical Quadragesimo Anno of Pope Pius XI to again attack the ills besetting Andalusian society (64):

"La encíclica denuncia que una gran clase social, la que vive de su trabajo, no tiene el lugar que le corresponde en el humano consorcio; que pesa sobre los hombros de los obreros un yugo que difiere poco del de los esclavos..."

He added, making special reference to Andalusia:

"Que el propietario abandone de un modo permanente el campo para vivir de sus rentas lejos de la tierra que se las dio, con olvido de los braceros y colonos que la labran, en una vida de egoísta y estéril comodidad....en modo ninguno puede justificarse."

What helped lift Herrera above his peers was his

analytical understanding of the cause of working-class disinterest and even animosity towards the Church, and steps were to be taken, he felt, to alter the iniquitous socio-economic structure of Andalusia, with the Church necessarily being in the vanguard of such change, as he reiterated in a speech at Antequera on 21 May 1948 (65):

"Huelga decir que todo el inmenso campo que llamamos de izquierda es enemigo declarado de la gran propiedad." yo no dudo em deciros que la Iglesia tampoco se puede solidarizar con el actual estado de cosas."

Herrera also saw the re-establishment of Catholicism in Francoist Spain as a splendid opportunity to apply its teachings to the social problems of the time, even if this entailed criticism of the existing social order. His criticism of the indifference of establishment Catholics to social problems was almost always accompanied by praise of those Catholics who had fought for the Nationalist cause; and his attacks on the social order in Andalusia and those sustaining it were usually tempered by public recognition of the power and prestige of the ruling classes together with the special responsabilities therefore thrust upon them. His policy was one of persuasiveness for change based on the social teaching of the Church, rather than any carping criticism reminiscent of the militant political Left. A speech which perhaps best illustrates this approach is that of 8 June 1949 in Madrid, at a meeting held in honour of Cardinal Tedeschini, former Papal Nuncio to Spain (66):

"Añadiré que el espíritu religioso, que ha producido en España tantos tipos ejemplares en el orden individual y en el orden familiar, no ha logrado crear católicos cultos y consecuentes para la vida social y pública en número bastante para garantizar el triunfo de la verdad y de la justicia en nuestra vida racional."

But, he added, Catholics were mindful of their obligations in the Civil War and played a most important part in the victorious outcome:

"A torrentes corrió la sangre generosa de nuestra juventud, alegremente derramada en los campos de batalla por defender los derechos de Dios."

It is in his reference to the upper classes where the dual approach of gratitude to those who have helped in the defence of Catholicism and of dismay at their failure to translate their beliefs and principles into positive action for the reform of social injustices is most evident: whereas he makes it abundantly clear that he holds them responsible, more than any other group, for the social ills prevalent in Spain generally and in Andalusia in particular (a), he also appeals (b) to their innate sense of superiority and patriotism by praising their ideas of morality and their commitment to the ideals of Catholic Spain:

(a)"No dudo en afirmar que nuestras clases altas en conjunto son...

las principales causantes de

nuestra desgracia....En conjunto, dichas clases, no se puede negar, si bien se cubrieron de gloria en la guerra, no cumplieron con su deber en los años anteriores a la catástrofe. Ni en el campo, ni en la fábrica, ni en la universidad .... Es urgentísimo que todos los que tenemos responsabilidad en el caso procuremos formar rectamente la conciencia de las clases altas."

(b)"...para mí esas clases son la esperanza más segura de la restauración de Es paña.

Creo que en el orden religioso y moral están en conjunto por encima de las de cualquier otro país."

This balanced approach was also prevalent in Herrera's pastorals. In his pastoral Sobre las Enseñanzas Sociales de León XIII (67), he uses that Pope's encyclical Rerum Movarum as a reminder that both owners and workers (again showing a balanced approach) have equal, if different, obligations:

"Los obreros deben esforzarse por aumentar la producción y han de huir de movimientos sediciosos, de cuyas funestas consecuencias ellos serían las primeras víctimas .....Los empresarios y labradores, los patronos todos, deben procurar

con su conducta estimular la potencia productiva del obrero y devolverle la satisfacción interior."

His references to "movimientos sediciosos" illustrates: how his concern for the conditions of the Andalusian poor arose not just from an undoubted displeasure at the injustices of the situation, but also from a pragmatic concern at how the situation could be exploited by possible extremist elements. This social concern for the disadvantaged accompanying a desire for political stability by adherence to the prevailing status quo was a hallmark, a cornerstone, of Herrera'a 'Christian Democrat' variety of Catholicism, and on his return from a private audience with Pope Pius XII he gave a sermon, with the rather urgent title Despertad del Sueño at Malaga Cathedral on 24 February 1952 (68), in which he gave the warning that, unless there was to be a concerted programme of agrarian reform in Andalusia, the region could become as big a breedingground for Communism as parts of Italy - "No debemos desaprovechar la lección que nos da el fenómeno alarmante que se produce en Italia" - hence the need for urgent action.

At the same time, it must be remembered that his concern with social injustice was not prompted merely by the pragmatic desire to stave off the extremism of any factions of the Left: he was a visionary of his time who clearly saw that the situation was contrary to any basic Christian precepts - "la actual estructura social no es conforme al espíritu del Evangelio" were

his words on the ills of Andalusian society, during a sermon in Malaga Cathedral on 9 September 1959 (69) and what makes him so interesting a figure is that just as this vision was not tainted by any ideological hostility towards the regime, so his acceptance of Franco was not incompatible with a critical view of the socio-economic reality of the time. For instance, in his speech of welcome to Franco at Malaga during the Spanish leader's tour of Andalusia in 1956, Herrera welcomed him in effusive tones, true, as has already been noted (70), but then used the occasion to underline to Franco the gravity of the agrarian situation in the region and the importance of prompt action by those with the power to assuage it, thereby giving a sober reminder that a lot more was to be done before the authorities could feel truly satisfied with the situation - thus comments P. Jobit in his assessment of Herrera's speech (71):

"Son discours de bienvenue au chef de l'Etat, venu visiter le grand port d'Andalousie, est, après toutes les formules d'usage - sincères à coup sûr - une forte et judicieuse leçon sur la réforme agraire dans la campagne andalouse, qui doit se fire sans faiblesse du côté des autorités, sans esprit de paternalisme facilement satisfait."

Herrera also became involved in the area of press censoreship and freedom - an involvement perhaps not really surprising, given his former experience as editor of

El Debate. After a statement by Gabriel Arias Salgado, Minister of Information, on 12 December 1954 concerning the validity and necessity of Spain's rigid laws of press censorship, Herrera, by way of reply, issued a statement entitled <u>Hacia una Ley de Prensa</u> on 12 January 1955, in which he questioned the existing laws of press censorship in the following words (72):

"La Iglesia no puede callar en este punto ... porque en el discurso muy pensado del señor ministro, no lego en doctrinas fundamentales, se consigna que el régimen actual de Prensa y las ideas por él vertidas se ajustan con fidelidad al pensamiento pontificio. El silencio de la Iglesia podía interpretarse como un asentimiento puro y simple a las palabras del señor ministro..."

Herrera was not for complete press freedom, however, and made this clear in the same statement, citing the anticlerical outbursts of the Republican press and its predecessors as an example of how press freedom can be abused:

"Al amparo de una licencia sin límites, un sector de la prensa nacional, durante más de un siglo, realizó día por día una tarea demoledora y perversa."

Herrera wanted press cencorship to be maintained, in line with article 34 of the <u>Fuero de los Españoles</u>,

but modified in such a way as to be more in line with article 12 as regards its application - "Todo español podrá expresar libremente sus ideas, mientras no atentan a los principios fundamentales del Estado" - thereby making it clear that he wanted adaptability, or room for manoeuvre, rather than complete change. Whereas M. Tuñón de Lara dismisses the disagreement with the minister as being merely "a nivel institucional" and really irrelevant when compared to what the Church should have been busying Itself with (73), the fact remains that once again there is evidence of Herrera speaking with an independent voice whenever he felt the occasion warranted it : there is a hint of outspokenness in phrases such as "La Iglesia no puede callar" (a phrase used quite often in Herrera's writings and a pointer to his view of the Church as an authority in its own right )- the Church of Christ was to speak openly when the occasion demanded. Moreover, as in his pleas for better housing in Malaga. Herrera's thinking on this particular matter was to prove influential, in that the government set up a special commission (in 1959) to study the possible reform of the Ley de Prensa, though continued censorship was still to put constraints on press freedom.

The new wave of radical thinking which was to enter the Spanish Church with the teachings of Pope John's encyclicals and the ideas of his Vatican Council later were to receive a cautious, tempered response from Herrera, however: the encyclical Mater et Magistra

of 1961, declaring that employees should have the freedom to organise themselves in a truly democratic way, did not receive from Herrera the excited enthusiasm that it received from more radical quarters within the Church, as he claimed that the encyclical's teachings did not necessarily apply rigidly to all countries (Spain, presumably, he saw as one of those exceptions) and that care was needed not to lay too much emphasis on the more material and mundane aspects of life touched on by the document (74):

"....las conclusiones de aplicación de la encíclica no pueden ser tomadas al pie de la letra para todas las naciones y para todas las circunstancias....dar preferencia a los bienes de orden económico sobre los bienes espirituales no es propio de una sana filosofía ni de una sana política, y menos de una concepción cristiana de la vida."

In reply to Herrera's critics that such thinking before a document of Christian love for the disadvantaged only merits the faint praise of H.Thomas (75) - "at best only a cautious friend of political change, even though he is referred to in his diocese as the Red Bishop" - it must be remembered that the same bishop brought the deep-rooted social problems of Andalusia to the attention of the

country as a whole by means of his pastorals and other declarations in language which not only refused to disguise the gravity of the situation but which also showed a sincere, committed, Christian concern at the injustices suffered by many of the poorer members of society. In this respect he can be considered to be ahead of his time: for, in the late forties, days of despair for the poor, he tended to be the lone voice of the Spanish, let alone the Andalusian, hierarchy which continually questioned the exploitation of those for whom he felt a pastoral responsability. He differed from the likes of González Ruiz in that he attempted to mould society in line with the teachings of the Gospel - whereas it could be claimed that the politicised approach of the canon of Malaga Cathedral was virtually to shape Christianity and its message to the mould of the realm of the socio-political. Hence, even given his somewhat lukewarm reception to the more radical 'social' theology of the Johannine or postconciliar Church, it would be churlish to end this brief survey of his work of the forties and fifties in any negative or critical tone : the poor of Malaga had much to be grateful for to their 'Red Bishop'.

Although certain lay organisations and priests were more aware of the problems besetting Spanish society during these years, or appeared to be, than their episcopal superiors, there were signs from the early fifties onwards that interest in social problems was not confined to Herrera - especially

within the Andalusian hierarchy. There were signs that the confident triumphalism of the post-Civil War era was being toned down by a more sober questioning and assessment of those areas of Spanish society where the Church knew it enjoyed little support. This crise de conscience was to manifest itself with a shift im emphasis from the authoritarian to the pastoral on the part of many bishops. Perhaps one of the best illustrations of this is offered by the report of the XIII Semana Social de España, which took place 13-19 April 1953 at Cordoba under the direction of Bishop Albino González y Menéndez-Reigada and which had as its theme "Los problemas sociales del campo andaluz" (76). At the end of the conference, which had discussed and examined problems pertaining to rural Andalusia and had noted the work that the Church in Cordoba particularly was undertaking in the housing field (such as that carried out by the Asociación Benéfica de la Sagrada Familia founded a few years earlier, care was taken that this modest examination of social problems should not be misunderstood as subversion by some :

"Por último, (el obispo) hace
una alusión a los rumores lanzados
sobre las tareas de la Semana
Social de que allí se plantean
ideas subversivas, y rechaza estas
falsas acusaciones."

The first pastoral of Bishop Cantero Cuadrado at his newly-created diocese of Huelva in April 1954, while stressing the spiritual aspects of the job in hand,

and the confidence he had in the recently-signed Concordat in helping in this process, made manifest his awareness of the human problems involved (77):

"Ardua, delicada y bella al mismo
tiempo es la tarea de organizar
y regir una nueva diócesis...
En nuestra tarea fundacional los
problemas de orden material son
ingentes, pero mayores y más
trascendentales son las tareas
del orden espiritual para
infundir y mantener un alto
espíritu sobrenatural...mas
por grandes que sean nuestras
necesidades, nuestras flaquezas
y nuestras miserias, mayores han
de ser, y lo son, nuestras esperanzas
en Dios..."

Furthermore, the Cardinal Archbishop of Granada, only two months later, was to make the following plea to his diocese (78):

"La predicación sacerdotal ha de
extenderse a ciertas 'zonas'
espiritualmente más necesitadas...

Error insigne sería concretarse
el apostolado fácil y agradable de
la ciudad atractiva,...de las
personas finas y educadas. La sangre
del Redentor corre lo mismo por los
suburbios que por los paseos elegantes,
llega por igual al palacio que al tugurio..."

It must be emphasised that by no stretch of the imagination could Cantero or García be called 'progressives', to use the post-conciliar term. But the plight of the poor, suffering wage freezes, unemployment and inflation as the government endeavoured to put the economy on its feet within the limits of <a href="mailto:autarquía">autarquía</a>, as well as their notorious indifference to the Church, was so acute that bishops were bound to recognise it and attempt to think of solutions. Two areas singled out for episcopal comment were housing and working conditions, the latter with particular reference to the situation of the <a href="mailto:bracero">bracero</a>. (a) housing.

# Probably the

Probably the most visual aspect of the poverty endured by the lower paid was their housing situation. Andalusia especially offered stark contrasts between the stately dwellings of the landowners and the basic hovels of many of the braceros. Nor were living conditions for urban dwellers any better. Even in areas enjoying the sudden boom in tourism, many andaluces still lived often short of the bare necessities, with the extravagance of the new hotels on the Costa del Sol contrasting vividly with the slums of Malaga or Almeria. The La Chanca area of Almeria still had 25% of the population of 80,000 living in shanties or cavernas (79), some of whom had left the land to come to the city in search of work and therefore had the hope of bettering their lives, but still had to endure unsatisfactory living conditions. Also, the benign climate either hid such harsh realities or made them quite irrelevant to the wealthy visitor from northern climes in search of a cheap and exotic holiday hence the ironic title "Malaga, city of paradise", in an

article for would-be tourists, in <u>The Times</u> in 1956 (80).

Bishop Menéndez—Reigada of Cordoba singled out housing as being the most pressing problem for the poor - his work in this field has already been mentioned in the 1953 conference at Cordoba - and the following appeal illustrates the concern with which he viewed the situation (81):

"... un problema del que no se puede prescindir, porque es gravísimo y aun parece agravarse cada día ... Ciertamente que también en orden a la solución de este problema se trabaja con afán ... Trabajan, apoyadas en esta legislación ... algunas entidades de derecho público... y no pocas entidades patrocinadas por la diócesis ... Aquí en Córdoba ... nos quedan en nuestro archivo más de 12,000 peticiones de viviendas, que aumentan cada día, todas ellas tales y de carácter tan trágico que piden urgentísima solución."

Indeed, the following year at Cordoba the same <u>semana social</u> devoted the session to a study of the housing problem under the theme "<u>crisis de la vivienda</u>" (82), when sociologists, economists and entrepreneurs of the building industry studied the situation in Cordoba, paying particular attention to the immensity of the problem.

Similar recognition of this problem was made by Bueno Monreal, Auxilliary at Seville and one day to be Cardinal Archbishop there, who in a pastoral in May 1955 expressed his determination that organisations under his control would do all in their power to alleviate such misery (83):

"Este problema y carga de justicia social pesa sobre toda la sociedad ...Por este motivo queremos excitar en los cristianos sentimientos de caridad y de justicia social... El Secretariado de Caridad... piensa tomar a su cargo un determinado número de dichas viviendas para adjudicar a aquellas personas necesitadas."

But perhaps the most heartfelt and desperate appeal on behalf of those in dire need was made a few months after that of Menéndez - Reigada, in the autumn of 1954, by Rafael Cardinal García y García de Castro, Archbishop of Granada (84):

"La necesidad de viviendas es tal que no se puede perder minuto...

Cuando visitamos los suburbios feísimos de esta bellísima Granada ...y cuando recorremos los pueblos en nuestra misión apostólica, se nos clavan como cuchillos en el alma las peticiones, hechas más con lágrimas que con palabras, de los que viven en tugurios infectos, en cuevas nauseabundas....; Y son

seres humanos y hermanos nuestros los que en las pajas del rincón de una cueva se amontonan sin espacio.sin ventilación...!"

## (b) working conditions.

This newly found concern for the poor was not limited to Andalusia: even in the relatively opulent Basque Country, for example, Bishop Casimiro Morcillo of Bilbao made manifest his commitment to the material betterment of the poor in a pastoral in June 1954 (85), and on 15 August 1956 the hierarchy issued a collective pastoral Sobre la situación social en España in which much emphasis was put on the need for social justice, as J.J. Ruiz Rico points out (86). But this newly found concern for the material needs of the disadvantaged was not limited to housing conditions. Working conditions - both facilities and remuneration - came under the scrutiny of the bishops . The majority of pastorals and other statements on this particular subject in this period have as their theme the plight of the bracero, and it was the new Bishop of Cadiz, Antonio Añoveros Ataún, who was, after Herrera, to become the greatest defender of these landless labourers. Unlike Herrera, Anoveros' concern was not balanced by declared admiration of the aristocracy or status quo: although Herrera will be remembered as the precursor of socially minded thinking in the post-Civil War Andalusian hierarchy, he was to be matched by Añoveros - and others such as Bishop González Moralejo of Huelva - in that they gave criticism of perhaps more one-sided incisiveness.

In a speech on 27 April 1958 (the feast of San José Obrero), Añoveros made an impassioned plea for an examination of conscience by all connected with the socio-economic reality of Andalusia. The speech was to appear, significantly, in a bulletin of HOAC, together with detailed statistics of the casual employment of agricultural labourers - all of which has been mentioned in the introduction (87).

These statistics, part of an article entitled

Los obreros eventuales del campo y los paros estacionales,

(88), were followed by a denunciation of a society

that could not call itself Christian in allowing such

flagrant exploitation to exist, as it was a denial of

the spirit of the Gospel:

"Tan sólo deseo poner delante de:
los ojos un hecho de extraordinaria
gravedad, al que es necesario
buscar remedio. Porque lo reclama
el derecho natural, la ley santa
de Dios, la justicia, la caridad, el
Evangelio y la mera calidad de
seres humanos .... me enfrento a una
realidad claramente injusta, para
levantar mi débil voz en favor de
miles de familias que difícilmente
sobreviven a la situación en que les
ha colocado una sociedad que, mientras
existan tales realidades, con
dificultad puede decirse cristiana."

But his criticism was not confined to the local dignitaries of Andalusian society: he declared - and

it was here where his vision possibly exceeds Herrera's that ultimate responsibility is that of the state.

Perhaps here we have the first example of a bishop
who makes the logical but bold step from criticism
of society to criticism of the state which has shaped
that society:

"Todo hombre tiene derecho natural a la vida. Por tanto, a los medios para sostenerla....De ellos, el primero y fundamental es el trabajo ...'La sociedad y, por tanto, el Estado que la rige, debe satisfacer ese derecho' (Breviario de Pastoral Social , no. 60)."

Suggested solutions by Añoveros include the financing of more industries, unemployment subsidies, small cooperatives and a fairer division of land.

Another detailed exposé of the social injustices peculiar to Andalusia in the area of employment and everyday living is the lengthy pastoral Algunos

Problemas Sociales de la Archidiócesis de Sevilla, by Bueno, the fundamental argument of which is that unjust wages and other intolerable conditions of work are the cause of much of the abject poverty of the region — while also citing Pope John XXIII's Mater et Magistra for support for his own denunciation of these injustices (89):

"Estos salarios insuficientes, que amargan al Papa, son triste realidad en nuestra diócesis.

Tanto en el campo como en la

industria, pero, sobre todo en aquél. Y lo peor es que, con demasiada frecuencia, la pobreza en la remuneración por el trabajo de muchos obreros encuentra un irritante contraste con el lujo desorbitado de algunos a quienes sobra casi todo lo que tienen..."

He goes on to denounce a rate of forty-five pesetas a day as contrary to Christian teachings of fairness, and castigates those managers and landowners who pay wages which, while fulfilling legal requirements, are not morally sound or justifiable. The long periods of employment also exacerbate an already serious situation for the worker - "El paro estacional es un verdadero azote de nuestra tierra andaluza" - and declares that action is necessary to right this sad situation - "No podemos resignarnos ante tal estado de cosas... Son hermanos nuestros los que así malviven"for common Christian decency demands it - "Las dificultades son... muchas, pero hay que afrontarlas y no seguir sesteando en una situación anticristiana" ending the study with a criticism of the emphasis on mere externals, to the detriment of a deep, true Christianity, as had happened in the past.

M.Tunon & Lara, like A. Comin, classified such outspoken pastorals (indeed, he was referring to this very one) as still being in a small minority (90). Certainly, there were still many senior churchmen - both in Andalusia and elsewhere in Spain - ready to denounce the injustices suffered by the poor, yet

either incapable of criticising, or unwilling to criticise, the socio-political system greatly responsible for such inegalitarianism because of their timorous respect for, and gratitude to, that system's government, strengthened by the myth of the Cruzada. At the same time, younger bishops of the ilk of Anoveros and González Moralejo were succeeding the Civil War generation' of bishops who were more attached to the past: these were the men concerned at the social problems of the poor, or the irrelevance of the Church in the eyes of many - a survey in Malaga showed that on 11 February 1962, only 28% of malagueños over seven years attended Mass (91).

The interest of bishops in the area of working conditions, and the growing militancy of workers to improve them, was necessarily drawing them into action of a more 'political' nature: 1962 was a particularly bad year for strikes, mostly because of pay freezes and inflation, both of which had made it virtually impossible for the lower paid to enjoy basic necessities, and there were signs that certain bishops in Andalusia - presumably emboldened or inspired by the precepts of Mater et Magistra were beginning to publicly affirm their support of the workers who resorted to strike action. In the Jerez region, some 10,000 agricultural workers went on strike, and laws passed in the Cortes on 22 April designed to improve the inadequate cultivation of the latifundia did little to either alleviate their hardship or mitigate their militancy. Working hours was another

area of employment in which Bueno Monreal played an important role, especially the question of Sunday rest, which, in a statement in 1961, he saw as an essential element of a Christian society, again citing Mater et Magistra in support of his arguments (92).

#### 5. The hierarchy and non-Catholics.

In a quieter way, but no less real, the changing attitude of bishops towards Spain's non-Catholic minorities also illustrated how the teachings of Pope John influenced the mentality of a body who had shown an implacable resistance, even hostility, against those who had dared embrace beliefs different to their own. Indeed, perhaps nowhere was this hostility, unfortunately, more manifest than in Andalusia, personified by Cardinal Segura, who on 20 February 1952 again wrote a pastoral condemnatory of Protestantism and the tolerance accorded to it (93):

"Dos son los 'hechos' que toma como base principal de sus consideraciones, El primero es la campaña de benevolencia hacia el protestantismo, que se ha iniciado con motivo de las manifestaciones de dolor y de condolencia universal por la muerte del rey de Inglaterra, que.... era jefe del protestantismo de su nación... El segundo es el recrudecimiento de la campaña protestante en España..."

However, as has already been stated, the conciliatory attitude of the new Pope to all, irrespective of political, religious or ethnic differences, had some impact in Spain. Pope John's reference to non-Catholics as "separated brethren" (with the emphasis on the noun) began a process emphasising those values and beliefs all Christians had in common and relegating those which divided them. In 1962, Bueno Monreal openly pledged his support for moves by the Primate, Pla i Deniel, to give Protestants in Spain greater freedom. Cautious contacts between bishops and non-Catholic church leaders began to take place, at times not on any profoundly theological level, but on perhaps just as important a level of tolerance and Christian love: in Andalusia, for instance, a group of Protestants led by Fr. Schutz and Max Thuriam (who had had meetings with Catholic theologians at Taizé in France) visited Almeria in 1962 and gave money that they had earned towards facilities for the barrio of La Chanca, as well as being received by Bishop Alfonso Ródenas and being invited by him to attend Mass in his diocese (94). When one considers that Segura's anti-Protestant outburst was only ten years previously, such happenings were innovatory, to say the least.

By 1962, the year of the Second Vatican Council's opening session, it was apparent that varying schools of thought of different nuances were taking root within the Church, some of which implied a growing awareness of inequalities within society. The years

1961 and 1962, especially, saw the first signs. albeit almost imperceptible, of tensions in Church-State relations in Spain: John XXIII's statement regretting the Civil War, the publication of Mater et Magistra and its unquestionable influence on the thinking of many churchmen in the depressed region of Andalusia, the open support given by churchmen to greater freedoms for religious minorities and those employed, the commitment of many clerics to social change as a way of furthering social justice - all these factors, despite the declarations of praise and gratitude to Franco by various bishops, were indications that the elaborate Church-State edifice built by the bricks and mortar of the Cruzada was showing signs of wear. The Second Vatican Council, at which all the Spanish bishops would attend, in company with their peers throughout the world, was about to begin, and time was to show that this historic meeting was to leave an indelible mark on the Spanish Church and its relations with the Franco regime.

### CHAPTER TWO

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- (1) Cooper, N., "The Church: From Crusade to Christianity",

  <u>Spain in Crisis</u> (Ed. P. Preston, London 1976) pp.48
  81, p. 61.
- (2) Ruiz Rico, J.J., <u>El Papel Político de la Iglesia</u>

  <u>Católica en la España de Franco</u>, Madrid 1977, p.139.
- (3) Chao Rego, J., <u>La Iglesia en el Franquismo</u>, Madrid 1976, pp. 93-4.
- (4) op. cit., p. 221.
- (5) ibid., p.283.
- (6) ibid., p.283.
- (7) Giner, C., "España en vías de secularización", <u>Mundo</u>
  Social, 1968, no. 152, pp. 25-27.
- (8) Lannon, F., "A Basque Challenge to the Pre-Civil War Spanish Church," <u>European Studies Review</u>, vol. 9, no. 1, January 1979, pp. 29-48, p. 45.
- (9) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 145.
- (10) Sáez Alba, A., <u>La ACNP La Otra 'Cosa Nostra'</u>

  Paris 1974, p.LXIV of introduction, footnote 97.
- (11) Ecclesia, 11.7.1953, no. 626, p.5.
- (12) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 17.10.1953, no. 640, p.15.
- (13) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 6.3.1954, no. 660, p.19.
- (14) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 24.4.1954, no. 667, p.27.
- (15) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 30.1.1954, no. 655, p.8.
- (16) Comín, A., España, ¿ País de Misión?, Barcelona

  1966, p.129 (and reproduced from El Ciervo, May 1962)
- (17) De La Souchère, E., "Un Catholicisme Totalitaire", Temps Modernes, March 1954, no.100, pp.1690-1711.
- (18) Gil Delgado, F., Conflicto Iglesia-Estado, Madrid

- 1975, p.182.
- (19) op. cit., p.87.
- (20) Ecclesia, 20.2.1954, no. 658,p.7.
- (21) Petschen, S., op. cit., p.127.
- (22) Gómez Pérez, R., Política y Religión en el Régimen de Franco, Barcelona 1976, p. 138.
- (23) ibid., p. 137.
- (24) ibid., pp. 134-5.
- (25) Franco Bahamonde, F., <u>Discursos y Mensajes del Jefe</u>
  <a href="mailto:del Estado">del Estado</a>, 'Madrid 1964, p.162.
- (26) Fernández Areal, M., op.cit., p.163.
- (27) op. cit., p. 25.
- (28) Ecclesia, 31.10.1953, no. 642, pp. 41-2.
- (29) Ecclesia, 29.8.1953, no. 633, p. 3.
- (30) Lain Entralgo, P., <u>Descargo de Conciencia</u>, Barcelona. 1976, p. 429.
- (31) op. cit., p. 295.
- (32) ibid., p. 295.
- (33) ibid., p. 313.
- (34) ibid., p. 313.
- (35) ibid., p. 313.
- (36) ibid., p. 316.
- (37) ibid., p. 318.
- (38) ibid., p. 320.
- (39) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, 21.5.1953, no. 88, p.13.
- (40) Boletín HOAC, 21.6.1954., no. 127, p.6.
- (41) Boletín HOAC, 21.1.1956., no. 184, p.11.
- (42) ibid., p.ll.
- (43) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, April 1960, no. 302, p.24.
- (44) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, June 1960, no. 306A, p.3.

- (45) Hermet, G., L'Espagne de Franco Paris 1974, p.173.
- (46) Urbina, F., "Reflexión histórico teológica sobre los movimientos especializados de A.C.," <u>Pastoral Misionera</u>, May August, 1972, pp. 268-364, p. 305.
- (47) Martí, C., "La Iglesia en la sociedad española a partir de 1939", <u>Pastoral Misionera</u>, March April, 1972, pp.15-16.
- (48) Nicholl, D., op. cit., p.12.
- (49) ibid., p.131 (original article in <u>El Ciervo</u>, March 1962).
- (50) Ferreiro, A., "La vida económico-social en la provincia de Jaén" <u>Fomento Social</u>, vol. VII, no.25, pp. 57-73.
- (51) Del Valle, F., "¿Hemos perdido la clase obrera en España?", Razón y Fe, May June 1952, pp.484-504 and pp. 597-611 respectively.
- (52) González Moralejo, R., El Momento Social de España, Madrid 1959, p.12.
- (53) ibid., p.14.
- (54) ibid., p.36.
- (55) ibid., p.51.
- (56) Orensanz, A.L., Religiosidad Popular Española,

  1940-1965 Madrid 1974, p.50.
- (57) Saez Alba, A., op. cit., pp. 80-82.
- (58) Ramírez, L., <u>Nuestros Primeros Veinticinco Años</u>,
  Paris 1964, p.278.
- (59) Broué, P. and Témime, E., <u>La Révolution et la Guerre</u> d'Espagne, Paris, 1961, p.26.
- (60) Ebenstein, W., op.cit., p.13
- (61) ibid., p.16.
- (62) Herrera Oria, A., Obras Selectas de Mons. Angel

# Herrera Oria, Madrid 1963, p.438.

- (63) ibid., p. 65.
- (64) ibid., p. 372.
- (65) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 85.
- (66) Herrera Oria, A., op. cit., p.86.
- (67) ibid., p. 342.
- (68) ibid., p. 459.
- (69) ibid., p. 464.
- (70) See footnotes 21, 22 of this chapter.
- (71) op. cit., pp. 79-80.
- (72) Ruiz Rico, J.J., op. cit., p. 154.
- (73) op. cit., p. 159.
- (74) Herrera Oria, A., op. cit., p. 345.
- (75) Thomas, H., "The Spanish Church as a Power for Progress"

  New Society, 29.4.1965., no. 135, pp. 11-13, p.13.
- (76) Ecclesia, 25.4.1953, pp. 15-17.
- (77) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 17.4.1954, no. 666, p.8.
- (78) Ecclesia, 12.6.1954, no. 674, p.7.
- (79) Gallo, M., op. cit., p. 272.
- (80) The Times, 8.12.1956, no. 53, 709, p.9.
- (81) Ecclesia, 19.6.1954, no. 675, p.10.
- (82) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 6.3.1954., no. 660, p.19.
- (83) Ecclesia, 14.5.1955, no. 722, p.8.
- (84) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 2.10.1954, no. 690, p.10.
- (85) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 3.7.1954, no. 677, p.13.
- (86) op. cit., p. 165.
- (87) see note 23.
- (88) Boletín HOAC, May 1960, no. 304, pp.8 and 6.
- (89) Bueno Monreal, J.M., Archidiócesis de Sevilla, 1962 (pamphlet).
- (90) Tuñón de Lara, M., "L'Espagne des Grèves", Esprit,

- July August 1972, nos. 7-8, pp. 114-138, p.123.
- (91) Hills, G., op. cit., p. 422.
- (92) Petschen, S., op. cit., p. 130.
- (93) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 22.3.1952., no. 558, p.8.
- (94) Martín Descalzo, J.L., <u>Un periodista en el Concilio</u>, vol. 1, Madrid 1963, p. 177.

#### CHAPTER THREE

Metamorphosis: From the Church of the Cruzada to the Church of the Council.

The Historical Perspective.

The decade roughly spanning the early sixties to the early seventies is of particular interest in that there are forces at work which are not only disparate but opposite : while socio-economic factors such as the influx of foreign tourists or political factors such as the adventurous foreign policy of the new technocrat Gregorio López Bravo make Spain more open than ever to outside influences and appear to presage a more liberalising climate, internal oppression continues to be the norm as a means of counteracting any serious attempts from opposition groups at real political change. First attempts at entry into the Common Market are made on 9 February 1962 and are finally rewarded (after rejections by the Community in March 1964 and December 1966) with the signing of the acuerdo preferencial on 28 June 1970. Religious freedom is granted to non-Catholics on 28 June 1967, and independence is given to the colony of Equatorial Guinea on 12 October 1968. Yet this period also sees the execution of the Communist Julian Grimau (20 April 1963) and of two Anarchists (17 August 1963), as well as various measures by the authorities against the riding tide of social unrest as working people try to obtain higher wages to combat inflation, such as in the spring of 1962 and 1964, culminating in the deaths of three demonstrators in Granada in the summer of 1970. The Basque Provinces

were beginning to pose acute problems for the regime, as demands for better working conditions were fused with Basque nationalism, resulting in a state of emergency being imposed there on several occasions, the most crucial time perhaps being in December 1970.

But the Church, too, was to suffer its own traumas. The changes in attitude brought about by the Second Vatican Council, with a greater emphasis on the more social and practical aspects of Christianity, while naturally asserting the importance of the spiritual, were to leave an indelible mark on the universal Church. As has been seen, there already existed, both in the Church generally and in Andalusia in particular, both the 'social' and the 'spiritual': this has always been the case in the Catholic Church and in most of the Christian denominations. But the effect of the Council was such as to influence the relative balance of this mélange of elements to varying degrees among different churchmen. Therefore, this period is to witness an internal wrangling within the Spanish Church between those wanting to alter the weighting of this 'social'-'spiritual' mix to a greater or lesser degree, with the almost inevitable labelling of churchmen as 'progressive' or 'conservative', 'posconciliar' or 'integrista'.

However, to compound matters even further, divisions within the Church were not limited to the merely horizontal: younger elements active within the Church, both ecclesiastic and lay, who were of the post-Civil War generation and therefore, through having no

experience or memories of the sufferings endured by the Church before and during the conflict, were unable to fully appreciate, perhaps, the peculiar nature Catholicism in Francoist Spain - these were especially influenced by the teachings of the Council, such as a greater role given to lay people or a preference for a break of ties between Church and State. The council's views on the desirability of government by democracy rather than dictatorship also could not go unnoticed in Spain, and was eagerly seized upon by those favouring political change. Papal policy was also in agreement with such thinking - Pope John XXIII's encyclicals Mater et Magistra (1961) and Pacem in Terris (1963) stressing the dignity of man and his right to political and civil liberty, as well as Pope Paul VI's Octogesima Adveniens (1971) advocating political pluralism, were to encourage that wing of the Spanish Church (and usually the wing of 'politicised' religion) advocating change. These various pressures resulted in desenganche, virtually amounting to an intention to attain its own disestablishment, approved by majority vote in the asamblea conjunta of 13-18 September 1971. An analysis of the role played by the Andalusian Church in this process is attempted in the following pages.

# 1. The Second Vatican Council itself.

It is no exageration to state that the Second Vatican Council had on the Church as traumatic an effect as the Protestant Reformation. Its teachings and ideas, suspected by those against change, acceptable to those broadly in favour of change, and exciting to those longing for change, transformed the whole ethos of what

had been a somewhat introverted and static institution, making it more outward-looking and not a little self-critical. To the Spanish Church, especially, ideas such as the Church being a vehicle for social change as well as of spiritual guidance came as a deep shock which was to play havoc with the hitherto untroubled nervous system of a basic part of the Spanish body politic. Its impact is described thus by N. Cooper (1):

"The event that was to give most cause for hope among progressive Spanish Catholics, and for dismay among the Francoist hierarchy, was the inauguration of the Second Vatican Council in October 1962.

Only the Civil War itself has had more effect on the Spanish Church this century."

The Catholic hierarchy in Spain was to meet other bishops from countries where the position of the Church differed markedly to that of the Spanish Church, and any influence of the Council would be of immeasurably greater importance in Spain than in most other countries precisely because of the Church's special ties, through the workings of recent Spanish history, to the government.

J. J. Ruiz Rico states (2):

"...tiene para el sistema eclesial español un significado y unas consecuencias muy superiores a las producidas para otros sistemas ... porque la situación fuerte de nuestro sistema eclesial respecto al político

y su peso social ofrecían unas posibilidades de actuación mucho mayores que las que se daban en otras latitudes."

Declarations by the Spanish bishops at the various meetings of the Council were usually cautions in tone whenever any innovation was touched upon, the Andalusian bishops illustrating this as much as their counterparts from other areas of Spain. Bueno Monreal was suspicious of certain attempts to allow complete freedom of religion for non-Catholic groups on the grounds that this could enable the spread of erroneous views (3), and supported the right of a Catholic government to curtail such proposed freedom, or at least limit it. Attitudes such as this caused the New York Times to affirm that "In Rome Protestants are 'separated brethren' (Pope: John's term); in Spain they are damned souls still agitating for the right of public worship" (4). Not only the Spanish bishops thought along these lines, however: Cardinal Spellman of New York had for long been an admirer of what Franco had done for the Church in Spain and had repeatedly attempted to offer explanations for the Spanish Church's stance vis-à-vis non-Catholics there (5). The schemata on Christian Unity met with the same reservations from the Spanish bishops as did the discussions on religious liberty: Bueno Monreal (18 November 1963) counselled extreme caution (6), while Bishop Romero of Jaen (22 November) warned against the danger of unorthodox theologies that can cause confusion from within the ecumenical movement (7), these being the Andalusian prelates with most to say

on this subject, along with Bishop Cantero Cuadrado of Huelva who, despite his own reservations on the same matters, was co-opted onto the Secretariat for promoting Christian Unity (8). Another appointment involving the Andalusian episcopacy was that of Herrera to the Commission for the Lay Apostolate, Press and Entertainment (9), presumably in light of his interest and experience in these fields.

It was in the debates on social problems that certain Andalusian bishops showed a keener interest than some of their compatriots. In the debate on ownership of property, Bueno Monreal adopted a much more flexible attitude than that of Bishop Aurelio Pino Gómez of Lerida, for example (who stated that ownership of property is a means of honouring God), by expressing his desire for an official statement favouring a more equitable distribution of wealth, as has been pointed out by N. Cooper, who underlines the reasoning behind such thinking (10):

"Coming from the latifundio area of Andalusia..., the Cardinal was aware of the problems arising from the traditional link between the Church and the richer, more powerful groups in society."

Bueno Monreal also adopted a liberal attieude to the Council's document on the laity, expressing pleasure at a Council of the Church making special mention of the role and importance of the laity in the life of the Church (ll), while Bishop Manuel Fernández-Conde of Cordoba stated that the layman, as well as the priest,

has the mission of giving the Christian message to the world (12). In debates on the organisation of the Church, Bishop Cirarda Lachiondo (auxiliary at Seville) stated that the episcopal powers of teaching and governing a diocese emanate from the episcopal consecration and do not depend on the Pope directly (13), one of many attempts by bishops to emphasise their collegiality within a less rigid structure, but the only one by a Spaniard.

But perhaps mention must also be made of Rafael González Moralejo, now a bishop, who, while not as yet attached to an Andalusian diocese: - he was auxiliary at Valencia - was to become Bishop of Huelva some years after the closing of the Council. In the debate "On the Church", he was the first to present the question of papal elections, stating that the election of a Pope should not be the exclusive right of the College of Cardinals, but be for the entire body of bishops (14). His intervention in the debate on ecumenism was just as innovatory, yet logical: he asked for the principles of religious freedom to come at the beginning of the schema on ecumenism, as without them ecumenical dialogue was inconceivable (15) - an attitude opposed to that of other Andalusian bishops already mentioned (16).

The Spanish press was sometimes defensive where the Council was concerned, a defensive attitude which often turned into outright indignation (17).

A balanced assessment of the Council and the significance of its teachings for the Spanish context appeared in Ecclesia, however (18):

"El hecho de que a los veinticinco años de enmudecer las armas sigamos apelando a la fraternidad entre los españoles, supone que, en este trecho, no hemos logrado cumplir suficientemente el más imperioso de nuestros deberes colectivos.

La paz de España sólo tendrá garantías si se purifica y ensancha cada día más el corazón de los españoles."

Another moving description, if somewhat exaggerated, is that of the left-wing commentator J. A. Cajigal who described the Council as "un bisturí clavado en la misma carne de la Iglesia universal" (19), and it was precisely through this operation performed by bishops, priests and members of the lay apostolate that new ideas arose and with them tensions, both within the Church itself, and between the Church and its erstwhile ally, the Spanish State.

#### 2. The Bishops and Ecclesiastical Matters.

The first changes put into effect by Vatican II were those immediate to the Church: liturgical, organisational, theological and canonical, as well as externals such as priests' dress. The views of certain Andalusian bishops concerning such topics is interesting, as it gives an insight into their reaction to the new changes. In a pastoral entitled

Relaciones Obispos-Sacerdotes in September 1969, Bishop Añoveros of Cadiz-Ceuta emphasised his acceptance of the Council's statement in favour of a more democratic dialogue between bishop and priest or between priest and layman (20):

"Hay quienes piden ampliación de más consultas, entre sacerdotes y seglares. Estoy dispuesto a oír cuantos pueden aportar reflexiones positivas ... Desde luego que las puertas de mi residencia se hallan abiertas, sin limitación alguna, para recibiros."

He was even more enthusiastic about the new comunidades parroquiales in a pastoral devoted entirely to this subject, feeling that such groups could breathe new life into the Church - "El hecho nos llena de gozo y alegría" (21) - and this new spirit of dialogue between various hierarchical levels was to become a salient feature, as F. Gil Delgado points out in his report of the Conferencia Episcopal of 7 March 1966 (22), where it was decided to make a study of the various problems confronting the priest in the modern world, a prelude to the decision of the asamblea plenaria of November-December 1968 to plan an encuesta-consulta of Spanish priests - the Andalusian dioceses, together with those of Murcia and Valencia, being the first to undertake this (23).

Priestly celibacy also became a polemical issue, and here Añoveros seemingly refuses to commit himself to a bold statement of opinion, preferring instead to quote the rule of the Church on this matter, in a pastoral of June 1966 (24):

"Pero las leyes de la Iglesia, como ésta del celibato eclesiástico pueden ser suavizadas y de suyo aun suprimidas por la misma Iglesia. Esto no quiere decir que la Iglesia vaya a suprimirla. El Santo Padre ha manifestado rotundamente su decisión de mantener con firmeza la ley del celibato eclesiástico..."

In the same pastoral, however, Añoveros shows himself to be totally open to peripheral matters such as priests' mode of dress; for him such items are mere externals (25):

"Son formas externas, usos
de una época, que pueden experimentar cambios y reformas
según las distintas circunstancias y costumbres de los tiempos..."

Ecclesiastical matters potentially more polemical, however, were those involving the new spirit of tolerance between Rome and other Christian Churches: this was of double significance to Spain, as recognition of such fellow-Christians involved legal as well as theological considerations.

That contacts were being made - albeit on a small scale - in this area before Vatican II began has already been illustrated in the last chapter by the meeting between the Bishop of Almeria and a Protestant group (26); but such tentative yet exciting moves towards tolerance and understanding were inspired by Pope John, and the Council was to give these ideals shape and weight. Meetings with non-Catholic leaders were to become more frequent during the sixties: the Moderator of the Church of Scotland, James S.Stewart, had a cordial interview with Herrera in Malaga on 4 April 1964, and two days later Stewart was to have talks with Bueno Monreal in Seville (27) - only on a somewhat superficial level of cordiality and recognition, true, but the significant fact was that these meetings were taking place at all. Only fourteen years previously, a Cardinal Archbishop of Seville had been fulminating against Protestantism's presence in his diocese: times were changing.

# 3. The bishops and the social implications of Vatican II for the Church.

Probably the bishop to most appreciate the extra-spiritual effects that the Council's teachings were to have on the Church was the socially-minded Bishop Añoveros of Cadiz. In a long pastoral of 21 February 1966, with the significant title El verdadero rostro social del Concilio, Añoveros underlines the Council's teaching — in the decree Gaudium et Spes — that agricultural and industrial production are not to be considered as ends in themselves, but are to be harnessed for the general well-being of man,

quoting from the decree and adding his own comment (28):

"Penetrar el claro significado y

las importantes consecuencias de

estas afirmaciones es justo deber

de conciencia para todo hombre

inteligente, de buena voluntad, que

no padezca la ceguera de su orgullo

intangible o de su egoísmo suicida."

An essential aspect of fairness and justice is a decent wage, he adds, stating that this prerequisite is still not met in areas of Spanish industry (29):

"No es fácil determinar la concreción del salario suficiente. Es más fácil proclamar la insuficiencia de un salario ante el coste de vida. Y debemos decir que padecemos todavía una aguda crisis de salarios insuficientes, según las condiciones antedichas por el Concilio, y habida cuenta del aumento en los artículos de primera necesidad y los complementarios para una vida digna....Quien pudiendo abonar el salario suficiente, supuestas las condiciones expresadas, no lo hace, bien sea por egoísmo individualista o por un sistematización de salarios o beneficios carente de equidad, es indudable que falta a la justicia."

He goes on to deal with the question of free and democratic representation in the firm, again quoting from the Council's teaching on the rights of workers.

to form free trades unions - <u>Gaudium et Spes</u>, nos. 68,75 - adding that in the running of a firm should be at all levels (30):

"Es natural que así sea. Todos contribuyen al desarrollo económico de la empresa. Justo es que todos sean parte en la gestión."

The Council has stated, he goes on, that this is not a favour but a basic human right - "un derecho inherente a la persona humana" (31) - and in furtherance of obtaining it, the strike can be justified in certain cases -again requoting from <u>Gaudium et Spes</u> (32).

He ends the pastoral on the distribution of property - "Recordemos que Dios ha destinado la tierra y cuanto ella contiene al uso de todos los hombres" (33) - paying particular attention to the usual thorny question of the <u>latifundios</u>, where he states that the criticisms of Council decrees - such as <u>Dignitatis</u>

<u>Humanae</u> - of the injustices suffered by many alongside the comforts of the privileged few apply unfortunately to Spain(34):

"Estas graves acusaciones, son aplicables a nuestro país? Nos basta activar nuestra memoria recordando lo que hemos visto y oído para afirmar, con harto dolor por nuestra parte, que todavía hay situaciones similares a las indicadas."

He expresses the hope that his pleas will be heard sympathetically, so that the ideas of the Council may

be put into practice for true social reform - reminiscent of the decree Ad Gentes no. 21 - in a true brotherhood of man (35).

The caution and indecision of those willing to accept the new social-Catholic message of the Council is criticised in the starkly named pastoral <u>Fl Miedo</u> a la Verdad also of February 1966. He accepts that the changes brought about by the Council are likely to cause confusion or distrust in the minds of many: but the truth itself, he feels, is only harmful to those who try to ignore it (36):

"Es una grave obligación de la Iglesia proponer la verdad con diligente caridad, pero sin olvidar que la verdad es apoyo de la justicia y de la paz y que la verdad produce tanto mayor dolor cuanto es más débil la voluntad de aceptarla."

He ends by affirming that it is only through love, charity and truth that the spirit of Vatican II will be realised (37):

"El Vaticano II ha sido expresión del precepto del amor y nos hemos empeñado en que la verdad se abra paso, sea reconocida y aceptada, con la reverencia que inspira la sincera caridad."

But perhaps one of the most moving statements on the new-found awareness of the post-Vatican II

Church was to come from the lips of another Andalusian prelate, this time the newly-appointed Archbishop of Malaga, Emilio Benavent Escuin, on taking possession of his diocese in April 1967. It is an eloquent confession of the mistakes that he feels the Church has made in the past and an outspoken criticism of the ills besetting a Spanish society which, for him, is still failing to put the new ideas into practice (38):

"Las instituciones nuevas que acabamos de describir,...las organizaciones apostólicas, las fuerzas espirituales de los planes de pastoral han de tender siempre hacia una meta: la evangelización de los pobres ....Si no conseguimos incorporarlos a la Iglesia, por mucho que trabajemos y por grandes que sean las obras que hagamos, nunca podremos estar satisfechos ni tranquilos...Si están ellos lejos de la Iglesia, no tienen ellos la culpa...Porque un vivo sentido de justicia les hace estar disconformes con una sociedad que pretende ser cristiana y que dista mucho de serlo en las estructuras y económicosociales. Fue nuestra inconsecuencia personal y colectiva la que levantó la barrera que separa...a los pobres de la Iglesia..."

Benavent also defends the interest in social matters of this growing spirit within the Church, stating its new raison d'etre in the words of the decree Gaudium et Spes (39):

"Lo único que pretende (la Iglesia)
con su Magisterio y sus exhortaciones
es 'continuar, bajo la guía del
Espíritu Paraclito, la obra de Cristo,
que vino al mundo para dar testimonio
de la verdad, para salvar y no para
juzgar, para servir y no para ser
servido' (A.S.3)".

To the socially-minded element in the Andalusian hierarchy, the contradiction between profession of Christianity and its practice was ever more acute - again due to Vatican II decrees such as <u>Gaudium et Spes</u> and <u>Dignitatis Humanae</u>. Thus spoke José María Cirarda Lachiondo, Auxiliary Bishop of Seville, at the <u>Jornadas Internacionales de la ACE (Acción Católica Española)</u> at Seville in August 1967, in a <u>conferencia</u> on "<u>Nuestra Fe</u>"entitled "Especiales Problemas en España Hoy", in much the same terms as Benevent above (40):

"....son no pocos los españoles que están muy lejos de la Iglesia, cuando no abiertamente enfrentados con ella....El más grave problema religioso de España está muy relacionado con lo que venimos diciendo. Consiste, a mi entender, en la acusada contradicción que

observamos demasiadas veces entre: nuestra realidad social y la feque profesamos....La gravedad viene de dos factores: de lo mal distribuida que tenemos nuestra pobreza (mala distribución que se da en los bienes materiales y en los espirituales) y de la aguda sensibilidad con que nuestro pueblo....siente hoy las injusticias....En este caso, la poca eficacia de los creyentes para trasformar el orden social, les convierte en contrasigno de su fe....Podemos encontrarnos con la ruina espiritual de muchos en ese abismo de irreligión....Nuestro quehacer eneste orden de cosas es urgente. Tiene que ser llevado adelante con decisión y a fondo. La constitución 'Gaudium et Spes' y la Encíclica 'Populorum Progressio' marcan el rumbo para nuestra acción."

A Lenten pastoral by Bueno Monreal, was printed in full by <u>HOAC</u> in their newsletter, 25 February 1967. The title of the letter was significantly direct - <u>El sacerdote debe denunciar con aliento profético</u> <u>las injusticias de nuestro mundo</u> - and its content was provocatively stimulating, to say the least, and the first words even re-quote the Council:

"Dice el Concilio que 'la Iglesia peregrinante es, por su naturaleza,

misionera'....Por eso la Iglesia no puede ser jamás un grupo cerrado, una institución asequible solamente a un sector privilegiado.... El grupo humano más alejado de la Iglesia es, con todo, el del mundo del trabajo. Su alejamiento se hace más sensible por tratarse de un grupo cuantitativamente mayor y porque el fenómeno del alejamiento se produce en él de una forma que pudiéramos llamar corporativa..."

Why have the poor deserted the Church, he asks. Even the efforts of the Seville branch of Acción

Católica have failed to bear fruit in this respect.

But such reaction should not be surprising, given the failure of the Church to champion the poor, a failure exacerbated by its courship of the establishment, admits the Cardinal:

"Pesa sobre el grupo la convicción de que la Iglesia no ha entrado en su mundo, de que desconoce y hace caso omiso de su dinamismo....Y la convicción se agrava con la idea de que, por el contrario, la Iglesia ha convivido con otros grupos, a los que ellos atribuyen la causa de su situación injusta...."

Such a sober, objective resumé of the situation would not have occurred in the days of <a href="mailto:nacional-catolicismo">nacional-catolicismo</a>. It was evident that, in certain circles

of the hierarchy at least, a new spirit of penitential self-questioning was being born. It was also a spirit of realism and awareness: the whole of the working classes would be lost to atheism at worst, or indifference at best, unless a positive plan of action was put into operation and, he feels, any mistakes of the past are to be corrected. In this Church of renewal there is to be a Church for all, especially the poor - thinking reminiscent of the decree <u>ad Gentes</u> no. 21:

"Es preciso,...que en el interior de la Iglesia aceleremos una renovación a fondo para llegar a ser la Iglesia de todos, pero especialmente de los pobres..."

Bishop Alfonso Ródenas of Almeria, already mentioned for his far-sighted ecumenism, was another Andalusian prelate who allied himself with the Church of the poor, an attitude which won the gratitude and respect of those working for the poorer sectors of society, such as  $\underline{HOAC}$ , who gave him a generous and moving obituary on his death in  $N_0$ vember 1965 (41):

"Podemos decir que ya contamos con sordas oposiciones en varias esferas y que son escasas las simpatías de importancia que se muestren decididas. Pero la del Señor Obispo era algo más que declarada y algo más que simpatía, era empeño en que fuésemos con paso firme hacia la meta. Por todo eso

la clase obrera debe rendirle el agradecimiento que merece su persona."

Statements such as these make manifest the new social awareness of the post-Vatican II Church. The practice of Christianity was no longer to be limited to the fulfilling of the pious externals, but to be extended to a sincere evangelising of the world in which the Church found itself. Hence the Church was fit to comment on matters of a more temporal nature, outside the constraints of its spiritual mission, for if its spiritual mission was to have any meaning, then it could not be divorced from the temporal reality such was the thinking behind the decree Apostolicam Actuosistatem, no. 5. This growing interest in the social affairs becomes almost commonplace during the sixties, with criticism of the socio-economic system in Spain, and in Andalusia particularly, being so outspoken as to be almost abrasive. Certainly, the socalled 'economic miracle' did not work the same wonders for the rural braceros or urban unemployed in Andalusia that it appeared to work for the property developers of the Costa del Sol, and the Andalusian bishops' criticisms in the years between the Council and the early seventies are best appreciated in this context.

# 4. The Bishops and the socio-economic problems of Andalusia.

It has already been stated that Andalusia in the sixties was still chronically underdeveloped compared to other parts of Spain. Lack of capital, unemployment, low wages and other problems led many bishops in Andalusia to denounce the situation in pastorals and other statements.

## (a) The wages problem.

Añoveros, predictably, was one of the foremost critics of the low wages that many Andalusians had to suffer. A pastoral entitled simply Las Desigualdades Económicas y Sociales appeared on 26 September 1966, in which the bishop, after pointing out that sixty pesetas per day was a normal wage for more than one million braceros and peones (42) spoke in no uncertain terms of his views on this (43):

"....no es moral que haya ese gran número de hogares españoles, que viven con tan marcado acento deficitario, mientras otros viven con holgura y no pocos nadan en la abundancia... Muchos españoles derrochan sin cuento e invierten en diversiones y atenciones, absolutamente superfluas, lo que falta como mínimo suficiente a millones de hermanos."

Adding the words of the Council, he reinforces his point (44):

"Os lo digo con palabras del Concilio: 'Para responder a las exigencias de la justicia, de la equidad, hay que hacer todos los esfuerzos posibles para que dentro del respecto a los derechos de las personas y

a las características de cada

pueblo, desaparezcan lo más

rápidamente posible las diferencias

económicas verdaderamente monstruosas...'..."

That such ills persist in Spanish society, he feels, is an indictment of its failure to live up to the Christian standards it had always proudly proclaimed, and as well as moral reasons there are sound, pragmatic reasons for desiring a more equal distribution of wealth, he argues, giving them in the following list (45):

"Mejor estabilidad social.

Un desarrollo más equilibrado
entre los distintos sectores de
la sociedad.

Mayor acercamiento entre las clases sociales.

Disminución de la emigración.
Un nivel de vida más equitativo.
Evitar el escándalo de una
religiosidad sin proyección
social.

Más estímulo para la productividad.

Consolidación de la paz, de la

fraternidad entre todos los hijos
de Dios."

Similar criticisms from Añoveros formed the substance of pastorals such as (i) Fe y Acción Social of October 1968 (46), in which his scathing attack on the Catholic ruling classes of Andalusia is followed by an exhortation on the necessity of giving a just

wage to one's employees; and (ii) Salario Minimo Legal of 24 December 1969 (47), where he defends his interventions into purely temporal matters -Anoveros and the Council would argue that the moral implications necessarily make such matters more than' purely temporal', for, in his words, "Lo social es una parte importante del mensaje cristiano" - and asks God for help in the efforts of himself and others to put into practice the ideals of the Council. Añoveros was to make further criticisms of the socio-economic ethos of rural Andalusia, indicating in November 1968 that even the legal minimum wage was not being paid to some workers and that unemployment in Cadiz province in urban and rural areas had increased by 100% between 1962 and 1968 (48). Not all the Andalusian hierarchy were as outspoken as Añoveros, however, and N. Cooper interprets, perhaps unwisely, in that silence is difficult to analyse, that an absence of any declared support by his peers implied tacit support for the landowners (49). However, one colleague to publicly agree with Anoveros was Bishop Gabino Díaz Merchán of Guadix-Baza, who in a pastoral entitled La dignidad de la persona humana in 1969 denounced the fact that 41% of braceros and their families used caves as dwellings in the slums around Guadix, and defended the right of the Church to attack injustice (50). N. Cooper feels that the criticism of Díaz Merchán of lack of politicization of the proletariat did not include advocacy of political parties - a significant

omission, perhaps, though more of this subject later.

## (b) <u>Unemployment</u>.

Many underpaid workers, unjust though their plight was, were inahappier situation than the unemployed or the casual farm labourers. Rural unemployment is not only seasonal, but permanent, for of the 25,000 new workers that come onto the Andalusian labour market every year, an estimated 10,000 have no option but to become casual labourers in a society dominated by an overloaded agricultural sector and poorly developed industrial sector, as J. Naylon has already pointed out (51):

"In any district the labouring mass invariably accounts for more than three-quarters of the farming population, and of this labour at least 75% is casual, hired and fired by the day. This is the highest proportion in Europe and gives Andalusia, with less than 18% of Spain's economically active population, 39% of the casual farm workers..."

Certainly, the case study of J.R.Mintz of the fictitiously-named <u>pueblo</u> of Valle in Cadiz province offered little optimism as regards improvement of the situation (52): he states that there is little incentive for any of the local landowners to invest capital in the land, for the owner himself had decided its value and potential, and the lower the official classification of the land, the lower

were the taxes to be paid (53). J.R. Mintz also makes the point that the labourers who have fixed employment - I. Moreno Navarro makes the distinction by calling the two types <u>jornaleros permanentes</u> and <u>jornaleros eventuales</u> (54) - have what little security the permanent nature of their job offers them offset by the fact that they receive less money than their casual counterparts (55).

Given such a situation, it is hardly surprising that the more progressive and socially aware Church leaders should express their displeasure and concern. Unemployment is centainly a recurring theme in Añoveros' many criticisms of the system: in his already quoted pastoral Fe y Acción Social of October 1968 (56), he indicates that Cadiz had 9,579 unemployed out of 818,847 inhabitants in 1962, and 12,111 was the new figure in 1966, with the figure having risen to more than 20,000 by 1968. Unemployment and underdevelopment, unfortunately, showed no improvement in Andalusia in the period being examined in this chapter. Not only was underemployment on the increase in Cadiz, but in the region as a whole. In 1962, before the Council, Bueno Monreal was criticising the Andalusian situation in these terms (57):

"El que los ragos del ordenamiento económico denunciado por la 'Rerum Novarum' hace setenta anos puedan ser aplicadas todavía, al menos en parte, a nuestra situación social es la prueba del retraso con que

avanzamos por el camino de las reformas sociales insistentemente reclamadas por los Papas."

But eight years later, in May 1970, the Andalusian bishops were denouncing the same injustices (58):

"...la ardua y compleja situación
en que se encuentra la población
trabajadora, en su mayor parte
agrícola, que no puede experimentar
los beneficios de una adecuada
renovación en la estructura agraria,
...que no tiene a su alcance los
medios de mejorar su situación, por
falta de las indispensables
infraestructuras económico-sociales."

At the same time, the <u>latifundios</u> cannot be blamed for all Andalusia's ills, as N. Salas mentions (59):

"La clave reside en la justa redistribución de la riqueza dinámica, las rentas, y no en el simple reparto de la riqueza estática, las tierras."

This may be true, but experience has shown that in Andalusia land means power, either real or imagined: there is the feeling that for many Andalusian landowners the mere ownership of land is just as important as, if not more important than, its economic value, thereby conferring psychological as well as material weight: and the continuance

of vast tracts of land in the hands of a nonentrepreneurial élite will ensure their nonprofitability - though Bueno Monreal is opposed to the other extreme (60):

"....el minifundismo no es en modo alguno deseable. A los técnicos toca concretar en cada tierra.... cuál es la dimensión deseable."

## (c) Housing Conditions.

Pastorals critical of the subhuman housing conditions which the Andalusian poor had to tolerate had been written some years before the new-found socially-based Christianity of Vatican II, back in the mid-fifties, as has been indicated in the previous chapter. But, in reality, little had been achieved in the succeeding years to improve the housing situation which was still parlous, all of which has been mentioned in the Introduction. Again it was Añoveros who spoke most eloquently against these conditions. Two pastorals devoted entirely to this question are La Vivienda en Cádiz of April 1967 (61), and Insistiendo sobre la Vivienda of 4 May 1968 (62). In the former, he made known the intentions of himself, his clergy and the Cadiz branch of HOAC to eradicate the squalor and degradation that was the lot of many gaditanos (63):

"Desde el mes de octubre de 1966, las parroquias de Cádiz, ciudad, han trabajado con vivo interés en el estudio sociológico de la vivienda... Así comprendieron

los párrocos, coadjutores, militantes de apostolado seglar, asistencias sociales, que han cooperado con verdadero entusiasmo...para descubrir los aspectos más acuciantes de la vivienda..."

It was also found that bad housing conditions caused various serious side-effects: the bishop went on to state that no less than 30.95% of Cadiz children under fourteen years of age were in some way affected by tuberculosis (64), while 3,160 out of 27,349 families lived in one room (in a survey of twelve parishes in the city of Cadiz) - "condiciones a todas luces infrahumanas" (65). The pastoral ends with a plea to the Ministerio de la Vivienda for urgent help, together with a prayer that all may attain conditions consistent with the dignity of man (66).

In the second pastoral, Añoveros makes no apology for returning to the question - "Mi deber de obispo me obliga a tratar nuevamente este gravísimo problema" (67) - and is quite prepared to carry out this task even though there are those who find it improper or inappropriate (68):

"Es posible que alguien juzgue inoportuno mi reiterado llamamiento. Bien quisiera no tener que hablar de estas cosas. El deber y el derecho de aplicar los principios morales cristianos a situaciones concretas de vida me obliga a

ello....tenemos que proclamar que muchos de nuestros hijos en Cádiz, ciudad, y en numerosos lugares de la Diócesis, por lo que hace a la vivienda, apenas son estimados como personas humanas.... Ante estos hechos el Obispo no puede, no debe callar."

The Council's decree <u>Gaudium et Spes</u> supports him in this respect, he claims (69), and ends the message with an offer of 100,000 pesetas from diocesan funds for future use. The allusion to those who question his zeal in the area of social problems is significant in that it recognises and makes public the subsequent tension arising from the hostility between the traditionalists, those of varying opinions either political or ecclesiastical, on the extent of what should be the Church's interest in the area of social problems.

### (d) Education.

As has been stated in the Introduction, educational standards in the sixties, while showing some improvement when compared to earlier years, still lagged behind the rest of Spain. Salas' figures for the year 1965 demonstrate the depth of the problem (70): 40.4% of the Andalusian workforce was classed no calificados but only 4.2% was classed técnicos superiores y medios, and Andalusia has been at a marked disadvantage to other areas of Spain in the area of educational provision and literacy attainment; illiteracy comparisons with other areas of Spain are covered in the Introduction.

Many efforts of the authorities succeeded in improving the situation. In a study of seven <u>pueblos</u> of Eastern Andalusia - Pueblo Nuevo, Serena, Villar, Don Diego, Dehesa, Castrillo and Negrilla - M. Siguán Soler has shown that the well-publicised <u>campaña de alfabetización</u> of 1965-66 and 1966-67 did bring gratifying results in some cases, as is illustrated by the following table where three of the villages show an appreciable drop in illiteracy (71):

	Antes	<u>Después</u>
Pueblo Nuevo	?	12%
Serena	?	18.80%
Villar	12.7%	10%
Don Diego	-	_
Dehesa	32.6%	20%
Castrillo	35%	6%
Negrilla	25%	18%

According to his figures, illiteracy is also linked to age, in that the older the age group, the higher the proportion of illiteracy there appears to be, with women each time showing greater numbers than men (72).

In the sixties, the Church was to view such data with the greatest concern. But at a local level, many laudable efforts of the parish priest to provide basic educational facilities for their parishioners usually met with the stubbornness of the local landowner, as S. Siguán Soler indicates (73):

"Todos los ejemplos de propietarios
bien intencionados que han establecido
algún tipo de enseñanza en sus cortijos
o para sus dependientes, o que han

permitido que otros - sacerdotes- las estableciesen, no modifican el hecho general de que los propietarios en tanto que clase dominante y directiva.... no han sentido la necesidad ni han visto el interés de que los campesinos adquieran una instrucción básica."

What made as much cause for concern was the great gap in facilities and services between the schools run by the religious bodies and those run by the state.

Writing in 1965, H. Thomas (74) pointed out that, in Spain as a whole, Church-run schools had a most favourable pupil-teacher ratio, eleven to one compared to the national average of twenty-two to one.

At the beginning of the 1970-71 school year, of the 500,000 Spanish children without basic schooling, 80,000 were from Seville province, 41,000 from Cadiz province, and 34,000 from Malaga province (75) - that is to say, almost one third of the total were from just three Andalusian provinces, a state of affairs which prompted the Andalusian bishops to make the following joint declaration in May 1970 (76):

"Los indudables progresos que observamos en la promoción de la cultura básica, profesional y superior, presentan un ritmo todavía insuficiente y no bastan a eliminar la persistencia de altos porcentajes de analfabetismo y de alfabetización precaria, que dificultan notablemente el desarrollo

humano, económico y social de la región, así como su promoción religiosa."

The tone, though critical, is not really outspoken. The criticism is prefaced by - and therefore balanced by - recognition of what the authorities have already achieved. As was observed in the last chapter, criticism of anything directly involving government policy tends to be more muted. It is only a courageous minority like Añoveros, among the hierarchy, who maintain and exhibit a frankness in their views - though this was not to be true of priests, who were increasingly showing greater courage and outspokenness than their ecclesiastical superiors, more of which will be examined in the pages to come. Indeed, it was Anoveros who, in his pastoral Fe y Acción Social, emphasised the pressing need for improvements in Cadiz province, which, according to his calculations was short of 800 schools, or 30,000 school places. Again, he uses the message of the Council as support for his pleas (77):

"Uno de los deberes más propios
de nuestra época, sobre todo de
los cristianos, es trabajar con
ahínco para que se reconozca en
todas partes y se haga efectivo
el derecho de todo a la cultura,
exigido por la dignidad de la
persona (!Gaudium et Spes' no.60)."

Given the endemic evils of Andalusian society - high unemployment, poor wages, maldistribution of land and other resources, poor housing conditions and limited educational facilitiés - it is small wonder,

as has already been stated, that the sixties witness a massive wave of emigration to other European countries and to other parts of Spain, as for many <u>andaluces</u> this was the only solution for a better life for themselves and their dependants.

## (e) Emigration.

The striking effects of the emigration drain on Andalusia's population have already been noted and examined: although the population of the region has increased throughout the Franco regime, there has been a steady drop in percentage terms when it is compared to demographic growth nationally. Forecasts are unanimous that this trend will continue, to such an extent that only Seville will have increased its population by the 1980s beyond the national average. What exacerbates this stuation is that the emigrants are often precisely those whom are most valuable for the development of the region, namely the younger and often better educated work-force, so that a whole series of chain events is then set in motion: the pueblos lose their riqueza humana and are left with the more 'passive' members of society, those too old or too young to work. The receiving area then has problems of a different nature, however, as has been experienced by provincial capitals such as Seville and Cadiz (78):

"Por otra parte tenemos las
zonas inmigratorias, la capital
de la provincia, los pueblos
más cercanos o mejor comunicados
con ella, donde el aluvión de
emigrantes multiplica los
problemas de infraestructura humana..."

F. Lara Sanchez salutes the efforts particularly of those priests who have tried to share the experiences of Andalusian emigrés by providing shelter and advice as well as spiritual care, with the aid of diocesan organisations (79):

"Algunos han tenido con ellos trabajando un sacerdote y les ha parecido una experiencia muy positiva. Hay casos en que sacerdotes indígenas les han prestado ayuda. Pero siempre en casos aislados. No hay quien se preocupe seriamente."

The last sentence, however, is open to argument, as the Church has always provided help for them newcomer, in these situations.

Añoveros devoted an entire pastoral to the topic of the rural exodus, entitled <u>La Huida del</u> <u>Campo</u>, on the feast of <u>San Isidro Labrador</u>, 1965. Conditions are so atrocious, he declares, that it is only natural that one's first thoughts are of emigration - "En estas condiciones...,; quién no va a pensar en la huida?" (80) - and denounces the injustices prevalent in this type of society (81):

"¿La actual organización agrícola
de nuestro país puede calificarse
de cristiana? Por lo que conozco,
en muchos casos estimo que no. No
es cristiana, porque en esos casos
no es humana...El contraste de vida
de los campesinos con las manifestaciones
suntuosas dentro de las mismas fincas

es, en demasiadas ocasiones, motivo constante de clamor consciente o inconsciente, de injusticia, de descontento."

Urgent solutions are necessary, he warns, both from the moral and the economic point of view, for agriculture is an important part of the nation's livelihood. Another pastoral on the same themes was Día del Emigrante (82) of October 1968, in which he named thethree main reasons for emigration from Andalusia as being economic, cultural and social deprivation, and again quoted from Vatican II on the need for a more just society whereby emigration would be unnecessary (83).

But Añoveros was not the only Andalusian bishop to pronounce on the emigration issue. Bueno Monreal and González Moralejo showed their concern in speeches made at the <u>Día de las emigraciones</u> of 28 November 1971. Bueno Monreal maintained that any examination of the topic must necessarily include an examination of its causes, to be done by us all (84):

"....como cristianos del ingente problema social de las migraciones; por años que pasen, la realidad emigratoria sigue tocándonos muy al vivo, y sólo podremos en conciencia desinteresarnos de ella cuando el problema está resuelto."

González Moralejo was more to the point, unhesitatingly apportioning the blame to the authorities and the employers (85):

"No es la Iglesia la llamada a dar a este problema la solución adecuada. Si nuestros hombres emigran por falta de puestos de trabajo, por carecer de preparación adecuada para ocupar los que se crean, porque les falta la debida seguridad en ellos o el salario remunerador....Son los hombres responsables de este orden, los proprietarios, los dirigentes, los que tienen en sus manos los resortes que mueven el mundo economicosocial, quienes deben sentirse interpelados por esa voz que clama: 'Yo también soy tu hermano'."

Moreover, as with all the burning issues discussed in this chapter, the Andalusian bishops were not the only ones to show great concern, but problems more peculiar to Andalusia such as a disproportionate sharing of wealth or emigration tend to loom large in their pastorals (86).

By the early seventies, the era generally accepted as being that of <u>desenganche</u>, the Andalusian bishops were meeting frequently to discuss the socioeconomic problems of their region, and their awareness is best summed up by Bishop Dorado Soto of Guadix-Baza, who denounced "las realidades sociales apremiantes: escasez de puestos de trabajo, emigración, predominio del sector agrícola, bajo nivel de alfabetización y otras indigencias de las

clases populares" (87). It was clear that within the Andalusian hierarchy there was a growing number of men moulded by the principles of nacional-catolicismo, who were now adding a new dimension to their philosophy through the socially-slanted teachings of the Second Vatican Council. But at the same time, they still showed no tendency to criticise the regime directly; the object of their criticism tends to be limited to the socio-economic domain - the social and economic inequalities within Andalusian society - and not extended to the political field. An example of this approach is the recognition of the government's success in improving educational opportunities - which, indeed, was true in Andalusia, as has been demonstrated, even though the region still continued to lag behind other regions of Spain - prefacing the Andalusian bishops' joint declaration on education in May 1970 (88). Nevertheless, it is obvious that there is a new spirit of criticism where socio-economic problems are concerned, a criticism which steadily grows in size and in volume as the sixties progress and as the teachings and directives of the Council are digested and appreciated.

### 5. More 'cautious' attitudes by Andalusian bishops.

Within the hierarchy, there were certainly those who adopted a more cautious stance when confronted by the changes of attitude occasioned by Vatican II.

Although it is customary to divide the bishops into different camps of 'progressives' and 'conservatives', this crude categorising can be vague and therefore misleading: many bishops who would be called, by

this shorthand, 'progressive' in the field of social injustices would also be called 'conservative' in the area of theology or personal morality. Nor is this apparent dichotomy to be surprising, for (a) many of these topics are fundamental to Christianity and therefore unchanging, despite any interpretation they may undergo, and (b) to the charge of a lack of interest in social problems, many of these matters - such as abortion - are, as well as being fundamental truths, of the realm of the 'social' anyway. Hence Añoveros demonstrates the traditional Catholic view on the sanctity of human life in his pastoral Para el Hombre de la Calle of June 1966 (89):

"La vida ya concebida ha de ser salvaguardada con extremos cuidados. El aborto y el infanticidio son crímenes abominables."

Inmoralidad Publica, written on the feast of SS. Peter and Paul, 1969 (90), criticises the growth of the so-called 'permissive society' in Spain, and makes a plea for all (especially the young) to treat sexual relationships with the utmost respect, and marriage with the utmost seriousness. He is also aware of the dangers of being labelled 'reactionary' for embarking on this theme with an attitude of admonition, but defends his attitude on the grounds that it is based on principles concerned with the good of society (91):

"Pienso que hasta nos domina el miedo al ridículo, a ser motejados de anacrónicos, si abordamos este tema o lo estudiamos someramente en su diagnóstico, consecuencias y tratamiento adecuado, en razón de los preceptos cristianos y del bien común."

There were teachings and attitudes which could not therefore be altered, based on the timelessness of Christian ethics. Anoveros was also aware of the possible pitfalls of the new-found temporal interest of the Church: he warns against going from one extreme of failing to apply the Gospel message to society to the other of using it purely for political motives, stripping it of its spirituality (92):

"La otra posición es la de aquellos que entienden esas frases como invitación a la denuncia permanente de situaciones sociales..., reduciendo el Evangelio, casi exclusivamente, a una doctrina de carácter social, de concreta denuncia a la injusticia."

But there were other bishops who showed caution in most matters emanating from Vatican II. Indeed, many writers of this period feel that this 'more cautious' element among the hierarchy, while accepting - or appearing to accept - in principle the teachings and new ideas of the Council, did not apply them to the immediate situation of Francoist Spain, as is maintained by J. J. Ruiz Rico (93):

"La acogida del Concilio por parte de la jerarquía espanola se produce de una forma deliberadamente vaga y sin obtener del mismo las obvias consecuencias estructurales que para España se habrían de generar."

One of those bishops wary of the Church's possible over-involvement with social questions once Vatican II had commenced was Herrera. In May 1963, during a visit to Málaga by Cardinal Riberi, Papal Nuncio to Spain, Herrera assiduously pointed out that he felt the Church should not involve itself in temporal affairs and that he was satisfied at what the State was doing to alleviate socio-economic problems (94):

"La reforma de las estructuras sociales del campo no es propiamente un problema de la Iglesia sino del Estado, y el Estado lo está acometiendo en España."

However, in 1967 at the <u>Semana Social</u> conference at Málaga, Herrera was to publicly ask why the social order in Spain did not reflect the Christian principles that the country claimed to be inspired by in its institutions (95):

"¿Por qué nuestro catolicismo, tan fecundo en frutos admirables, como queda dicha, no ha logrado influir en la vida pública national? ¿Quiénes son los responsables de esta hiriente paradoja? ¿Quiénes son los causantes de la zona débil que existe en la conciencia publica española?"

What makes Herrera's tirade even more significant is that the entire <u>Semana Social</u> - organised by the Church and with more than seven hundred participants - was devoted to the theme of democracy. Was this, as S. Petschen suggests, evidence of a change of attitude by Herrera? Did it mean that the new ideas emanating from the Council were even influencing some of those who embraced the new socially-minded Catholicism of the Council more warily? One could reply to this, of course, by stating that Herrera's views on social justice had always been such as these.

#### 6. The attitudes of Andalusia's priests.

Perhaps the greatest innovation in the Spanish priesthood in the sixties was the introduction of the sacerdote-obrero, a priest who, in line with the Council's insistence that the Church's priests should be less remote from the world in which they practise their ministry, was the embodiment of the priest of the early Church, a man who shared the same life-style as his parishioners. This new ministry was not limited to Andalusia, but, given the social problems peculiar to the region, its potential significance there was perhaps greater than in the more wealthy areas of Spain. surprisingly, the idea met with distrust in some quarters, but most of the Andalusian hierarchy accepted the innovation of the worker-priest as an

extra dimension to the Church's work; they were all too aware - as has already been seen in various quotes - of the gap which existed between the Church and the proletariat, and worker-priests would therefore form the ideal bridge over that gap. severe shortage of priests in Andalusia, already alluded to in the Introduction, also made any innovation advantageous and beneficial. The workerpriests were few in number when first introduced there were four in Cádiz diocese, for example, by September 1969 (96) - and normally attached to a team of priests working in the poorer quarters. Anoveros was most enthusiastic about the idea, stating that their attitude to their own particular ministry could be synthesised as follows (97):

"El Evangelio me lleva a mí
personalmente a compartir mi
vida con los pobres. Hoy,
según el sentir general, los
pobres se encuentran entre los
obreros manuales. Por eso
quiero compartir en lo posible
su vida."

The worker-priests tended to be socialistminded - not surprisingly, given that their ministry
was one of as great a sharing as possible of the
experiences and life-style of the poor - and this
often led them into conflict with the authorities.
They were few in number - for instance, the stonemason Alfonso Sola was the only worker-priest in all
of Almeria diocese (98), while the Archdiocese of
Granada, according to José Morillas, a teacher, only

had ten during the late sixties-early seventies period (99). Perhaps the most publicised example of worker-priest involvement with social problems is that of Granada diocese on 2 July 1970, when three building workers were killed by the police in a demonstration for higher wages and democratical worker-representation, and the right-wing accused worker-priests of inciting the workers to violence. The right-wing newspaper <u>Pueblo</u> was especially vehement in its editorial of the following edition:

"En principio, y con la insuficiente información que tenemos todavía delante, parecen culpables en primer lugar ciertos sacerdotes que incitaron a los obreros a la violencia, proporcionándoles, incluso, medios con que atacar a la fuerza pública. El hecho es, sencillamente, escandaloso, intolerable....En effecto, es preciso saber hasta cuando van a tolerarse estas posturas agresivas, violentas, insolidarias, de miembros de nuestro clero...."

The reaction to such a piece of literature was immediate and overwhelming; the more liberal Vida

Nueva and El Correo de Andalucía all demanded that such charges be supported by proof, but Pueblo remained silent. Vida Nueva of 8 August 1970 absolved the strikers of any blame, stating that they were merely requesting something which is a

basic right in other countries of Western Europe (100):

"¿Pedían mucho, exigían mucho los obreros de la construcción granadina? ¿Con qué rostro podríamos ahora limitarnos a condenar un estallido de violencia quienes antes habíamos tolerado en silencio ese otra larga y permanente violencia...?....Este problema es especialmente importante en España. Otros países que tienen legalizada la huelga dejan en manos de los obreros este instrumento de presión del que el Concilio dijo que era un medio 'necesario aunque extremo para la defensa de los derechos y el logro de las aspiraciones justas de los trabajadores'."

But the most vehement defence of all came from the cardinal Archbishop of Granada, Emilio Benavent Escuin, who warmly praised the integrity of the worker-priests, especially in their role in this incident (101):

"En cuanto a la actuación de los sacerdotes obreros en los acontecimientos del día 21, puedo asegurar que es una calumnia atribuirles el papel de promotores de la violencia. La verdad es todo lo contrario. La vocación de estos sacerdotes no todo el mundo la comprende....Bien sabe Dios que los

sacerdotes obreros de Granada....

autorizados desde hace años por sus
superiores para realizar su
específica vocación, siempre han
sido alentadores de la fe de los
instintos cristianos y
misioneros con el testimonio de
su vida..."

A more spirited defence of the Andalusian worker-priests would be hard to find. Moreover, there is the explicit comment that the movement is misunderstood in certain quarters, a hint to <u>Pueblo</u> and others of similar political persuasion to think carefully before criticising any innovation of the Church and any behaviour of its ministers.

However, other priests were showing an active interest in socio-economic affairs, and perhaps the most militant and therefore the greatest critic of the establishment continued to be José María González Ruiz, whose identification with the anti-Francoist faction within the Church was to cost him dear (literally as well as metaphorically, for he was fined several times, the biggest fine being 100,000 pesetas on 6 October 1974).

As <u>canónigo lectoral</u> at Málaga, González Ruiz delivered a homily on 1 May 1966, of which the following is an extract (102):

"Durante mucho tiempo, los católicos como legítimos descendientes de aquellos paisanos y parientes de Jesús, nos hemos escandalizado de

que los propios trabajadores levantaron la voz para proclamar su derecho a la más elemental justicia humana; y aquel grito....'Proletarios del mundo uníos', lo hemos intentado apagar con el agua bendita de nuestros hipócritos exorcismos, mientras bendecíamos el oro acumulado de los opresores y la potente artillería de los agresores .... Pero hoy, mis queridos hermanos, no es solamente la fiesta del trabajo, sino la fiesta de todas las libertades humanas....Cuando hablo así no estoy haciendo una interpretación personal y privada del Evangelio. En el Concilio Vaticano II ha sido la propia Iglesia la que nos he dado esta pauta inevitable en la predicación Evangélica: 'El Evangelio - dice el esquema 13 - anuncia y proclama la libertad de los hijos de Dios, rechaza todas las esclavitudes....' ....Pidamos a Dios que abra los ojos de tantos hermanos nuestros que creen poder seguir llamándose cristianos reprimiendo positivamente el ejercicio de las más elementales libertades..."

The speech is really a synthesis of the thinking of González-Ruiz, that the Church is to ally itself completely with the poor to the extent of rejecting all ties with the rich and influential. However, despite his recourse to the teachings of the Second Vatican Council — which presumably he uses to give greater weight to his arguments — his words demonstrate a very politicised theology which runs the danger of making Christ and his message the preserve of only one sector of society, and thereby of falling into the very error of which he accuses the Right.

Given radical ideas such as these and his readiness to express them, it was not surprising that he should fall foul of the authorities. Sometimes he was fined, as has already been mentioned, though on other occasions he was acquitted, as in March 1969, when on a charge of publicación de información religiosa peligrosa for an article he had written entitled El Cristianismo y la Revolución in the Boletín HOAC of February 1968 (103).

Other priests became well-known for various published criticisms of the socio-economic order.

José María de Llanos of Seville was a witness for A.Comín at his trial of 16 January 1968 when the latter was accused of illegal propaganda for an article he had published in the French weekly Témoignage Chrétien criticising various aspects of the regime (104). The trial was reported in full in El Correo de Andalucía, then under the directorship of another priest of radical views, José María Javierre, who criticised the derecho de presentación, on 4 June 1969 (105):

"La intervención civil en la designación de jerarquías eclesiasticas choca fuertemente con la sensibilidad religiosa actual y se opone de frente al estilo y pensamiento que la Iglesia ha escogido en el Concilio. Representa una de las más tristes servidumbres que la Iglesia ha padecido a lo largo de su historia, quizá la servidumbre más triste..."

The list of priests who publicly proclaimed their displeasure at the socio-economic ethos on which Franco's Spain was based would be interminable: among them figure Carlos Ros. who spoke of the subtle violence of the government in El Correo de Andalucía, 28 November 1969 (106); Jesús Montero Tirado, who repeatedly expressed his wish for a true, profound Christianity to take the place of the brash, superficial, showy religiosity of Semana Santa, as in a letter to the same newspaper on 18 December 1969 (107), and scores of young priests, many of them barely ordained, unappreciative of the traumas of the thirties and the nacional-catolicismo of the forties and early fifties. Moreover, such young priests were becoming numerous: by 1963, the first full year of the Council, priests up to and under 35 in age - therefore mere children during the Civil War and therefore possibly not as emotionally tied to the notion of the Cruzada - formed the following proportions of the Andalusian clergy, which as the table for Andalusia overleaf shows, were slightly above the national average (108):

	Total no.	No. aged 35	% aged <b>3</b> 5
	of priests	and under	and under
Almería	218	70	32.11
Cádiz	170	58	34.11
Cordoba	340	145	42.64
Granada	343	89	25.94
Guadix	133	58	43.61
Huelva	150	50	33.33
Jaen	299	133	44.48
Malaga	297	117	39.39
Seville	548	171	31.20
TOTAL	2,498	891	35.67
(Spain	24,739	8,474	34.25)

## 7. HOAC and similar movements

As has already been stated, the various organisations which made up the lay apostolate among which HOAC was the most prominent through its active commitment to the area of socio-economic questions - had formed strong links with many of the clergy whose ministry was devoted to the poorer sectors of the community, and were especially pleased at the introduction of the worker-priest movement. But it is also important to remember that many bishops supported movements like HOAC in their attempts to build a bridge between the working classes and the Church that, to their way of thinking, had abandoned them. As early as 1 May 1964, when the Vatican Council was still in progress, Bueno Monreal, the Cardinal Archbishop of Seville, was to address the JOC (Juventud Obrera

<u>Cristiana</u>) congress in Seville in the following sympathetic terms (109):

"....no he vacilado de respaldar con mi responsabilidad vuestro periódico 'Juventud Obrera'. Yo me hago responsible para defenderlo donde sea y ante quien sea, amparándole con la púrpura cardenalicia que se honra en amparar la causa..."

He went on to denounce certain evils of
Andalusian society; such as minors under fourteen
being obliged to work to help their families
financially, the existence of a large number of
casual workers having to suffer unemployment for
long stretches of each year, and the lack of a just
wage for many. But perhaps more controversial - at
that time - was his call for free representation at
various levels of society:

"Que se respete el:

- Derecho de asociación.
- Derecho de libre expresión.
- Derecho de libre información."

Bishop Dorado Soto of Guadix-Baza was to underline the spiritual side of the work of the lay apostolate (110):

"¿Qué es lo que hace que un grupo de seglares pueda considerarse grupo eclesial y apostólico y no grupo profano? A mi modo de ver, la respuesta teológica ha de venir de la natureleza de la acción que

el grupo se propone: sería
eclesial y no profano si lo que
pretende es difundir y aplicar
en la práctica los principios
doctrinales de la enseñanza
dogmática, moral y social de
la Iglesia."

HOAC and similar groups - an emphasis which thereby enabled these movements to operate more freely than would have been otherwise under the jurisdiction of the Concordat - had repeatedly been made in defence of HOAC by their founder, Cardinal Pla i Deniel, and the gratitude of HOAC was evident in their generous obituary to him on his death in 1968, headlined Gracias, Eminencia Humilde (111). But perhaps the greatest recognition of the spiritual worth and importance of their work in the socio-economic domain came from Añoveros, who, in an address in April 1969 to the lay apostolate members (112), made manifest the support he gave to them and the scant regard he had for those who misunderstood them (113):

"Sois conscientes de que 'es
obligación de toda la Iglesia el
trabajar para que los hombres se
vuelvan capaces de restablecer
rectamente el orden de los bienes
temporales y de ordenarlos hacia
Dios por Jesucristo' (Decreto
'Apostolicam actuositatem', num.7)
A pesar de las muchas críticas y
malentendidos, de las persecuciones

y quebrantos sufridos...es
notable la decisión y la mesura
de un gran número de militantes
seglares, 'por verlo, juzgarlo y
hacerlo todo a la luz de la fe'."

In an organisation as politically conscious as <u>HOAC</u>, however, there was always the chance that it could be open to Marxist propaganda, as opposed to Christian ethics, as José María Cirarda Lachionda, when auxiliary bishop of Seville, was to point out (114):

"Es triste registrar una aguda fermentación social de signo marxista, en grupos minoritarios pero muy operantes, tanto a nivel intelectual, como obrero y especialmente entre la juventud."

But others, such as Benevent Escuin, publicly affirmed their support for such groups which, when properly guided, gave greater life to the Church (115), a view shared by his primate Enrique y Tarancón (116).

Moreover, <u>HOAC</u> itself was to extend its influence - in the field of labour problems, particularly, where it achieved much, gaining the respect and gratitude of the poor as it strove to demonstrate that Spanish Catholic social movements were authentic and sincere in their fight for better conditions for the poor.

Certainly, the entry of <u>HOAC</u> into the workers' struggle for true representation, decent conditions and just remuneration became increasingly evident throughout the sixties, and even before the end of the

Vatican Council, HOAC's interest in Andalusia was evident in articles such as Disquisiciones en torno al problema del campo en Andalucía and Problemas de los trabajadores de la construcción en la Costa del Sol in their boletines of February and March 1963 (117), which criticised the working conditions of the rural and urban proletariat. The latter was especially condemnatory in tone:

"Una mayoría de trabajadores semianalfabetos están enriqueciendo a
una minoría de magnates....Lo que
ocurre con los peones clama al
cielo, con jornadas hasta de 14
horas diarias de trabajo agotador
y embrutecedor."

But living conditions and property maintenance by the local Councils were also criticised whenever HOAC thought fit: the lack of resources provided to prevent the River Genil flooding in May 1963 - with subsequent damage to many homes, alleviated only by the efforts of a Fr. Celestino, along with HOAC, to give temporary accommodation to six hundred people in the guardería infantil which he directed - led HOAC to make the following comment (118):

"Por lo visto, nuestras leyes carecen de recursos para obligar a la propiedad privada que se ponga al servicio del bien común."

But <u>HOAC</u>'s aims were for man's spiritual as well as temporal good: in direct contact with the working-classes, they were only too aware of the cynicism and indifference of this sector of society towards

the Church and the fulfilment of any of its ordinances. The movement was determined both to break down this apathy and to eradicate its principal causes, namely what it saw as the 'clasismo' and traditional piety of Spanish Catholicism. These objectives are expressed succinctly at the conference of the Apostolado Seglar in Almeria, in July 1967 (119):

"El Cristianismo es un mensaje: lo Individual,....2º - Social, del
que se deduce la obligación de
todos los cristianos de trabajar
por la edificación de una sociedad,
según el plan de Dios....Así, pues,
el cristianismo da origen a una
Teología Social, uno de cuyos
capítulos sería el del
Compromiso Temporal de los
Seglares."

The efforts of HOAC to apply their 'Social Theology' to the problems of everyday life took various forms, such as the setting up of two cooperatives at Ecija and Seville in footwear and industrial machinery, called 'La Yedra' and COISE respectively (120); the intervention on behalf of a fourteen year old boy, Manuel Flores, being dismissed without pay by Teófilo Rodríguez S.A., for wearing long hair (121); the aid given to the president of the Union de Técnicos y Trabajadores del Sindicato Provincial de Banca y Borsa de Córdoba, Enrique Rodríguez Linares, charged for being in possession of illegal literature (122) - though HUAC

failed to specify the exact nature or contents of the literature. The last two cases, especially, were instances of how <u>HOAC</u> acted in a more militant way than the state-controlled <u>sindicatos verticales</u>. At the same time, many efforts were doomed to failure, as K.N. Medhurst declares (123):

"...hopes of transforming the Sindicatos from within, which were particularly high amongst Catholic unionists, proved illusory. This was especially true of attempts to explore the possibilities of strike action. The Government viewed most strikes as essentially 'political' and the courts upheld the right of employers to dismiss strikers."

The only way out of such an impasse would have been for <u>HOAC</u> to throw in its lot with the outlawed underground movements, according to R. Mesa Garrido (124):

"La première question que l'on pose devant le refus de régime de reconnaître des organisations syndicales différentes des organisations obligatoires et officielles, porte sur l'activité future des <u>HOAC</u>...et sur la forme que prendra leur action courageuse et périlleuse...Il semble bien que le seul chemin qui leur reste.... soit de s'unir dans la clandestinité à d'autres organisations..."

Whether <u>HOAC</u> members actively participated in the various underground movements, and to what measure, is difficult to ascertain. What is beyond doubt is the open sympathy <u>HOAC</u> had for the aspirations of these movements, perhaps one of the best examples in the Andalusian context being the poignant way in which <u>HOAC</u> reminded Spaniards of the tragedy at the demonstration for free trades unions at Granada in the summer of 1970 already mentioned, on the first anniversary of the event in a front-page editorial (125):

"En esta triste efemérides, queremos reiterar nuestro dolor ante aquellas pérdidas de vidas humanas y también insistir en nuestra repulsa de las condiciones sociales que hicieron posible aquel desastre. Unas condiciones que por desgracia persisten en tantos lugares....

Honremos a los muertos en el campo de honor del trabajo y esforcémonos por desarraigar para siempre la injusticia y la explotación."

Given such a plethora of different forces and attitudes within the Church, it is not surprising that what once appeared a monolithic rock of immutability and internal accord should become a battleground of polemical debate and acute tensions, both among the ecclesiastics themselves and between them and their laity.

# 8. Tensions within the Church

In the years succeeding the Second Vatican Council, it became apparent that the ideas of the younger clergy untainted by nacional-catolicismo tended to be at variance with those of their older superiors. This gap assumed greater significance as the Spanish priesthood was swelled by more and more priests unfamiliar to the triumphalist ethic of the immediate post-Civil War era. In 1964, sixty-eight per cent of Spanish bishops were sixty or over, with some of the Andalusian bishops considerably older. Indeed, three-quarters of the Andalusian hierarchy were 60 or over, as the following table indicates: Herrera (Málaga) 78, García y García de Castro (Granada) 69, Romero (Jaén) 63, Alvárez (Guadix-Baza) 62, García Lahiguera (Huelva) 61, Bueno Monreal (Seville) 60, Añoveros (Cádiz) 59, Fernández-Conde (Córdoba) 55 (126) - an age range comparable with that of the Spanish hierarchy in general. As R. Gómez Pérez states, although age is not a wholly decisive factor, it nevertheless remains that an episcopacy with an average age as high as Spain's, and composed of men who were mostly self-confessed admirers of Francoism, would be a little wary of implementing the reforms of Vatican II.

By 1966, one year after the ending of the Council, 64.8% of Spanish bishops were over 60 years of age (127) - while at the same time the greatest percentage of priests were those under 40 years of age (128).

At the assertion above that there is a distinct correlation between age and attitudes - supported also by H. Thomas, as regards the Spanish episcopacy of

the mid-1960's (129) - then a growing gap between hierarchy and younger priests is reasonable to expect, especially when one takes into account the massacres of priests by the Left in the Civil War who would have formed an 'intermediate' group in terms of age.

Bueno Monreal spoke for many bishops when he recognised the value of the Vatican Council, though he was also well aware of the difficulties that such a mental and psychological upheaval entailed. Thus he affirmed this view in his prologue to F. Gil Delgado's Conflicto Iglesia-Estado of 1976 (130):

"El Vaticano II supondría para la Iglesia universal el paso de un umbral histórico, pero para la Iglesia en España supuso también una primera e importante 'apertura'. Demasiado encerrada tras la fuerte cortina de los Pirineos, la Iglesia española tuvo en aquella ocasión la primera oportunidad moderna de ponerse en contacto.... con el resto de las Iglesias del mundo. Esta experiencia le costaría muchos esfuerzos de cambio, pero fue un acontecimiento para todos...."

Generally, however, the episcopacy - for reasons of age and mentality mentioned above - tended to be much more cautious towards the new ideas emanating from Vatican II than did their younger priests.

Perhaps the Andalusian priest who best personified the impatience of younger priests at the inability

or unwillingness of their ecclesiastical superiors to translate the ideas of Rome into facts in Spain was the already mentioned José María González Ruiz; in his somewhat flippant, light essay Mi Tío, El Obispo (131), González Ruiz speaks with warmth of his uncle, Manuel González García, once Bishop of Seville, yet pointedly implies that the kind avuncular figure that González García was to him does not always apply to other prelates that he has met (perhaps an allusion to Herrera?) - which is unfortunate, as the foremost quality of a bishop is to be approachable, available and kindly (132):

"Naturalmente, esta visión episcopal esta tremendamente condicionada por unos hechos familiares. La vida posteriormente me enseñó que en el venerable cuerpo episcopal había muchas diferencias y enormes matizaciones...puedo decir que mis largos estudios eclesiológicos no me han destruido el esquema fundamental de obispo, que representaba para mí la figura sencilla, amable, sonriente y, sobre todo, auténtica del tío Manolo, el obispo."

The progressive encyclicals <u>Pacem in Terris</u> and <u>Mater et Magistra</u> of John XXIII and <u>Populorum</u>

<u>Progressio</u> of Paul VI also gave rise to controversy within certain sectors of the Church, however.

Although Pope John's first encyclical - <u>Mater et</u>

<u>Magistra</u> in May 1961 - was disappointing for Spanish conservatives in that it advocated political

pluralism through democracy, it was not as explicit as the next well-known encyclical of John XXIII, namely Pacem in Terris, in April 1963, which caused great consternation with its greater insistence on the fundamental human rights of free expression and association for all, especially ethnic minorities, and desire for peaceful coexistence with communism.

The conservatives among the hierarchy were certainly perplexed as to how they should react to such a document, perhaps the best example in Andalusia - indeed, perhaps in the whole of Spain - being Herrera. In a letter to the New York Times of 28 October 1963, he tried to point out that his agreement with the principles of the encyclical did not in any way imply criticism of the socio-political reality of Spain - which had been claimed by that newspaper - an example of how Pacem in Terris caused some embarrassment in Spain (133):

"Me aparto en mi comentario expresamente de los publicistas que dan a la encíclica un valor político concreto y de actualidad. Menos hay en mi escrito intención de juzgar la política del gobierno español...No se puede decir que el gobierno español se muestre indiferente ante las necesidades del pueblo. Es de justicia afirmar todo lo contrario."

Indeed, the efforts of Herrera to defend the principles of Francoism by questioning any political message or value given to the encyclical demonstrates

the dilemma that many apologists of the regime found themselves in.

For more outspoken critics such as Añoveros, no such dilemma existed. The encyclicals of John XXIII and Paul VI were to be applied to the concrete situation of Francoist Spain, not merely being limited to the area of theory. A glance at Añoveros' pastorals elicits testimony of this: his pastoral El Campo ofrece socialmente un Panorama sombrío (134) uses John's Mater et Magistra as a source of reference in his criticism of land division. claiming that if the teachings of the encyclical were put into practice many injustices of rural Andalusia would be eradicated. In his pastoral Fe y Acción Social (135) he attributes the causes of social injustice to a lack of "formación social" and "auténtico sentido cristiano", all of which would be corrected if the teachings and spirit of Mater et Magistra were put into practice. The list of examples would be endless. F. Gil Delgado opines that the documents on socioeconomic problems of the sixties were inspired by the ideas of Mater et Magistra (136), while S. Petschen declares that the publication of the document was "un impulso de la mentalización social del país" (137).

Priests influenced by the innovations of the Council welcomed the encyclicals of John XXIII. In Andalusia, one of the best analyses of the significance of Mater et Magistra was that by a priest in Málaga and consiliario of HOAC, José María García-Mauriño, S.J., in an article entitled Reflexiones sobre la 'Mater et Magistra' (138):

"Son....los obreros los que pueden y deben elegir las formas de organización sindical, sin paternalismos ni colonialismos trasnochados.... Así que una estructura sindical en consonancia con nuestros tiempos. será aquella en que los obreros se hallan 'presentes en los organismos que más influyen en las determinaciones económico-sociales' (M.M., 99)....Este es el avance de Juan XXIII sobre Pío X y sobre Pío XII. Los pontífices anteriores hablan de los intereses obreros, representados conjuntamente en corporaciones....Parece evidente que si se ponen en juego todos estos factores de que habla el Papa en la encíclica, hacen posible una promoción colectiva de la clase trabajadora, hasta tal punto que su voz tenga un eco eficaz en aquellos sectores que son de trascendental importancia para la clase obrera que es mayoría en número, pero que es minoría o casi nulidad en la estructuración actual de la sociedad."

The influence of Vatican II and the above-mentioned encyclicals played a major part in the growth of awareness and involvement by the Church in temporal problems, but the ideas emanating from them were of greater significance in that they perforce implied criticism of the Francoist state which encompassed

those problems. This led to statements by clergy which at times contradicted or even admonished the views of fellow clerics. An example in Andalusia concerns the rebellious José María González Ruiz, who dismissed the praises of a Monsenor Moll for Franco in the following terms (139):

"Podemos no estar de acuerdo con la posición de Mons. Moll, pero creo que es injusto dudar de su sinceridad."

The different strains within the post-Vatican II Church, certainly, often reached the point of open hostility, the Church in Andalusia being no different from the Spanish Church as a whole in this respect. At the <u>Semana de Pastoral Social</u> at Seville in April 1967, this point was forcefully made by the radical priest Tomás Malagón, in the presence of other radical, if not militant, priests such as Ricardo Alberdi, José Domínguez and Mariano Gamó (140):

"Es un hecho evidente que los católicos estamos divididos. No existe hoy una comunidad católica, sino dos. Estas dos comunidades, aunque se junten en los mismos templos para la recepción de los mismos sacramentos, aunque reconozcan a los mismos pastores y aunque profesen los mismos dogmas, mantienen entre sí posiciones muchas veces irreconciliables. Son tan opuestas las posturas, tan diversificadas sus

ideas en torno a problemas vitales
....que hoy nos hallamos tan
distanciados los unos de los otros
como podemos estarlo en
relación con los no católicos
o no creyentes."

The new forces at work within Catholicism by the end of the sixties, then, are diametrically opposed to the previously accepted triumphalist ideas of the Francoist Church. Hierarchy, priests and laity are split into various groups and persuasions.

### 9. Moves towards desenganche.

The new movements within the Church inspired by

Vatican II were disturbing to the traditional

elements adhering to the values of nacional-catolicismo,

But nacional-catolicismo and postconciliar

Catholicism, though one was born of the other, were

irreconcilable, as M. Aguilar Navarro declares 
"....un catholicisme de croisade, qui devait si mal

se concilier avec ce 'rajeunissement' de l'Eglise"

(141) - and these tensions became manifest in

Andalusia, as elsewhere in Spain, by statements from

bishops which must have bewildered their flock: Bueno

Monreal, for instance, stated that the spirit of

Vatican II was not being properly put into practice

(142), while Herrera denied that any problem existed.

Even Ecclesia was beginning to express, if not criticism, then certainly feelings of self-doubt, of its past neglect of socio-economic problems (143), while outside Andalusia too, there were clerics ready to voice criticism of the socio-political reality of Spain (144).

Indeed, by the late sixties it had become obvious to all that the right to nominate freely any bishop to a vacant see as laid down by Vatican II in the decree Christus Dominus was being denied in supposedly Catholic Spain - even Pope Paul VI's plea to Franco in this respect on 29 April 1968 was abortive - and the progressive elements within the Church viewed Franco's repeated prevarications with growing frustration and impatience, as is seen in this extract from an article in the Boletín HOAC printed just four days before Paul VI's letter to Franco (145):

"El panorama eclesiástico español presenta en los últimos años una situación de especial anomolía, que se va acentuando progresivamente. En el momento actual, seis diócesis españolas....- el 10 por 100 del total - están jurídicamente vacantes.... No olvidemos que el Concilio Vaticano II ha proclamado claramente....'que el derecho de nombrar e instituir a los obispos es propio, peculiar y por sí exclusivo de la autoridad eclesiástica competente.... ¿ Por qué en 1968 no ha aparecido todavía ninguna indicación.... de que el Estado español vaya a restituir a la Iglesia esta plena libertad....? ¡Fuerte paradoja la de esa continua profesión de catolicismo por parte del Estado español, en contraste con ese reiterado silencio!"

Such misgivings were shared in Andalusia by Añoveros in his pastoral Al Habla con el Hombre de la Calle of March 1969 (146):

"El sentir de la Iglesia es claro.
El nombramiento de obispos debe
ser asunto exclusivo de la misma
Iglesia...Los Obispos deben sentir
y manifestarse con respetuosa
atención a la autoridad; eso sí,
con absoluta independencia del
poder politico en su actuación
pastoral...En todo caso la
jerarquía...debe estar muy cerca
de los oprimidos, de los que
sufren. Su misión es ser
mensajera de la paz, de justicia
y de amor."

The pastoral is particularly significant in that, not only is there rejection of State control over Church affairs, but also an overt statement of intent as regards those with whom the Church should ally itself instead of with the establishment. The document is a resumé of the principal shortcomings of the traditional Catholicism of Francoist Spain, and particularly in regions of chronic social injustice such as Andalusia, as well as an expression of regret at the stifling ties between Church and State.

As the sixties went on, the Vatican attempted to solve the problem of presentation of Bishops by appointing auxiliaries to vacant sees, a move within the jurisdiction of the Concordat. In this way, the

Vatican was able to appoint those whom it wished, without having to undergo intervention by the State, hence resolving (though not in a totally satisfactory way) the impasse - while also promoting to the Spanish episcopacy bishops in a new mould, or, in the words of R. Gómez Pérez, "poco concordes con la situación político - religiosa anterior a 1965, deseosos de hablar un lenguaje diverso" (147). Such changes would only cause Church-State relations to deteriorate, and the years immediately after Vatican II witness an uneasy bickering between twó erstwhile allies, with the regime showing dismay as well as anger at the new initiatives either by the Spanish Church as a whole or by individuals enjoying the support of the hierarchy (148).

Indeed, it was obvious that revision of the Concordat was now a necessity: the message of religious freedom in Council decrees such as Christus Dominus and the difficulty of putting into practice in Spain a basic part of this decree - the right to nominate bishops without hindrance, interference or intervention by the State - meant that the agreement responsible for such an anachronistic anomaly - the Concordat - was no longer truly valid, as Añoveros was to declare (149):

"El Concordato y el Concilio son dos momentos distintos, bastante distanciados entre sí (ideológica e históricamente), a pesar de los pocos años que los separan. El momento del Concordato español yo lo fijaría como interesante muestra

de un final de etapa, y el Concilio, como inicio o apertura de otra.

Evidentemente, es tal el replanteamiento de ideas e instituciones exigido por el Concilio, que se impone un reajuste, en el sentido mismo del espíritu que le impulsa y anima."

Nor was Añoveros the only Andalusian prelate to publicly affirm his desire for a speedy revision of the Concordat concerning the nomination of bishops. Bueno Monreal was to make similar criticism (150):

"....después de los deseos
manifestados por el decreto
concilar 'Christus Dominus',
el concordato no refleja el
espíritu de la Iglesia, que
busca una libertad auténtica de
la designación de los pastores
sin que quede sujeta a
limitaciones civiles."

González Moralejo, Bishop of Huelva, felt that a new modus vivendi between Church and State was the only practical solution (151):

"....contribuiría notablemente a perfeccionar las relaciones entre ambas potestades y, por añadidura, sería un valioso testimonio ante el mundo de ejemplar fidelidad a la fe cristiana de nuestro país."

These views were echoed by other bishops

throughout Spain (152) as well as by observers such as A. Vázquez in his book <u>Posconcilio, Crisis de</u>

<u>Estructuras</u> (153).

The bishops as a body were aware of the contradiction in their support of Vatican II and their dependance on the State - even as early as 12 July 1966, just one year after the ending of the Council, they announced at their Second Plenary Assembly their desire to renounce privileges as and when the Pope saw fit - a statement which was gratifying in Vatican circles, as 'privileges' also entailed state interference, which the Vatican wanted to curtail.

However, the nomination of bishops within the context of the Concordat was just one area in which Church-State relations steadily deteriorated in the years following Vatican II. The Church, desperately keen to win back an indifferent proletariat, became more daring in its criticisms of socio-economic problems. A survey in 1970 showed that, on average, three times more 'workers' than 'professional people' classified themselves as 'indifferent' to the Church; while amongst housewives, whereas only three per cent of upper and upper-middle-class housewives confessed to having no interest or attachment to the Church, the figure was eighteen per cent for those of the working-class (154).

The area of trade-unionism was a particularly delicate area for the Church to concern herself with, as it automatically implied criticism of the country's political structure and not just of its economic policies. In Andalusia, several bishops made their feelings quite plain on this problem,

perhaps none more so than Añoveros, who in the short pastoral message <u>Saliendo al Paso de Algunos</u>

<u>Comentarios</u> of 28 August 1968 made the following remarks (155):

"Con motivo de la Declaración del Episcopado español sobre 'Principios cristianos relativos al sindicalismo'....han surgido comentarios de personas representativas en los medios sindicales....que no responden a la realidad....En sana doctrina sindical es difícil admitir que la declaración del Episcopado coincida en lo fundamental con las directrices y programas del actual desarrollo sindical.... Es muy de desear que la vida sindical vaya creciendo en línea de más fiel coincidencia con la doctrina social de la Iglesia....Será, sin duda, la consecución de un bien anhelado por muchos y de evidente contribución a la paz social."

The joint statement to which Añoveros' pastoral alludes was that of 12 July 1968, in which the body of bishops formally approved that workers should be freely represented and that they should be free to participate in workers' associations without fear of reprisal or harrassment by the authorities.

Such pressure by the hierarchy-along with other groups like <u>HOAC</u> - resulted in the government decreeing a new ley-sindical which, in reality, did

little to improve the inadequate machinery in the industrial sphere, and was attacked as such by the Andalusian bishops - and others - in the joint conference of the Comisión Permanente de Apostolado Seglar, with Benavent Escuin being particularly vehement in his opposition to it (156). Benavent was to be similarly outspoken in 1970, at the aforementioned riots in Granada where three strikers had been killed by the police: he criticised the syndicalist system in Spain on the grounds of its blatant lack of democratic representation, and showed no objection to his cathedral at Granada being used as a sanctuary for Spaniards (157).

Other Bishops, both in Andalusia and elsewhere in Spain, were either publicly supporting and defending those whose actions had been interpreted by the regime as subversive, or were criticising beliefs which had always been held as sacrosanct. José María Cirarda Lachiondo, Bishop of Córdoba, volunteered evidence for Alfonso Comín when the latter was sentenced to sixteen months imprisonment for an article published in Témoignage Chrétien which was severely critical of the Franco regime (158). González Moralejo, Bishop of Huelva, headed the Justitia et Pax commission of 1971 which severely criticised social conditions in Spain and the helplessness of the poor to do anything about it, as well as expressing regret at the Civil War and its aftermath. It was to have been read in all dioceses throughout Spain on 19 December 1971, but was suppressed by the government (159).

At the same time, relations between the two power

bases did not reach the point of outright rejection by either side. Indeed, care was always taken, opines J.J. Ruiz Rico (160), that criticism was often indecisive, without any threat of removing the apoyo of the Church for the regime, and that it was not until the early seventies that there was a pronounced change of attitude, and only then by certain individual bishops (161). Nevertheless, the atmosphere between Church and State was a most troubled one by the time the Bishops' Assembly took place from 13 to 19 September 1971, where the hierarchy finally decided that separation between Church and State was not only desirable but necessary if the Church were to carry out its mission of making the Gospel message a reality.

Nevertheless, the spirit of the Second Vatican Council had truly implanted itself into the soul of the Spanish Church, and the sniping and skirmishing which marred Church-State relations after the Council was nothing more than the logical outcome of applying, or attempting to apply, the Council's message of change and greater freedoms. At the Bishops' assembly of 13 to 19 September 1971, the Church, finding itself in an impossible position to fulfil its mission to bring the Gospel alive and make it relevant to all Spaniards, particularly those who were indifferent to it through no fault of their own, opted for desenganche, so that it would free itself of the fetters of nationalism and Francoism and be more in harmony with the ideals that had renovated it less than a decade before. As a postscript to this account of how the Church formally declared itself free of Francoism after a decade of growing

doubt and uncertainty amid internal squabbles, it is appropriate to quote Bueno Monreal and Montero Moreno, archbishop and auxiliary bishop of Andalusia's biggest diocese. The Cardinal's pleasure at the decision to opt for desenganche was obvious (162):

"Es para dar gracias a Dios....

Lo mejor de la Asamblea, el

clima de corresponsabilidad..."

Montero Moreno spoke in the following terms (163):

"España ganará mucho con una Iglesia renovada y cercana al pueblo...Se busca una mayor clarificación de competencias, respetando las autonomías recíprocas,....sin que el Estado tenga que otorgar privilegios arcaicos; sin que la Iglesia hipoteque lo más mínimo su libertad profética."

Before the commencement of Vatican II in 1962, cracks had already begun to appear in what had been a static and triumphant Church. Only nine years later, that monolithic element had begun to change more and more in outlook through the onslaught of the ideas of the Second Vatican Council, and perhaps nowhere in Spain had this been more apparent than Andalusia.

#### CHAPTER THREE

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- (1) Cooper, N., The Church: From Crusade to Christianity, op. cit. p. 61.
- (2) op. cit., p. 182.
- (3) Cooper, N., The Church: From Crusade to Christianity, op. cit. p. 62.
- (4) New York Times, 14.10.64.
- (5) Blanshard, P., Paul Blanshard on Vatican II (London, 1967), p. 77.
- (6) Anderson, F. (ed.), <u>Council Daybook</u> (Washington, 1975), p. 272.
- (7) ibid., p. 294.
- (8) ibid, p. 317.
- (9) ibid., p. 43.
- (10) Cooper, N., <u>The Church: From Crusade to</u> Christianity, p. 62.
- (11) Anderson, F. (ed.), op. cit., p. 188.
- (12) ibid., p. 208.
- (13) ibid., p. 178.
- (14) ibid., p. 236.
- (15) ibid., p. 305.
- (16) ibid., p. 62.
- (17) ABC of 13.11.62 was especially critical of the behaviour of some of the younger bishops applauding Cardinal Alfrink in his argument with the arch-conservative Cardinal Ottaviani over the question of the reglamentary tenminute limit for each intervention.
- (18) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 28.3.64, no. 1, 185.
- (19) Comín, A. et al., <u>Buscando la Iglesia Conciliar</u> (Barcelona, 1968), p.27.

- (20) Añoveros, A., <u>Pastorales</u> (Madrid, 1970), pp. 248-9.
- (21) ibid., p. 233.
- (22) op. cit., p. 26.
- (23) ibid., p. 26.
- (24) op. cit., p. 65.
- (25) ibid., p. 63.
- (26) See footnote (118) of Chapter 2.
- (27) <u>The Times</u>, 6.4.64, p. 9.
- (28) op. cit., p. 26.
- (29) ibid., p. 28-9.
- (30) ibid., p. 30.
- (31) ibid., p. 31.
- (32) ibid., p. 32.
- (33) ibid., p. 33.
- (34) ibid., p. 34.
- (35) ibid., pp. 34-5.
- (36) ibid., pp. 38-9.
- (37) ibid., p. 42.
- (38) Boletín HUAC, May 1967, no. 472-3, pp. 8 and 11.
- (39) ibid., pp. 8 and 11.
- (40) <u>Boletin HOAC</u>, August-September 1967, nos. 478-479-480-481, pp. 26 and 45.
- (41) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, November 1965, no. 436A, p. 3.
- (42) op. cit., p. 77.
- (43) ibid., p. 78.
- (44) ibid., p. 79.
- (45) ibid., p. 84.
- (46) ibid., pp. 159-178.
- (47) ibid., pp. 255-260.
- (48) Cooper, N., The Church From Crusade to Christianity, op. cit., p. 66.

- (49) ibid., p. 66.
- (50) ibid., p. 66.
- (51) op. cit., p. 18.
- (52) Mintz, J.R., "Trouble in Andalusia", Natural History, 1972, vol. 81, pp. 54-64.
- (53) ibid., p. 59.
- (54) op. cit., p. 122.
- (55) Mintz, J.R., op. cit. p. 60.
- (56) see footnote (46).
- (57) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 200.
- (58) ibid., p. 200.
- (59) op. cit., p. 211.
- (60) <u>Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado</u> de Sevilla, 1962, pp. 85-101.
- (61) op. cit., pp. 97-103.
- (62) ibid., pp. 141-149.
- (63) ibid., p. 97.
- (64) ibid., p. 98.
- (65) ibid., p. 99.
- (66) ibid., pp. 101 and 103.
- (67) ibid., p. 141.
- (68) ibid., p. 142.
- (69) ibid., p. 145.
- (70) op. cit., p. 83.
- (71) Siguán Soler, M., El Medio Rural en Andalucía
  Oriental (Barcelona, 1972), p. 172.
- (72) ibid., p. 173.
- (73) ibid., pp. 179-180.
- (74) op. cit., p. ll.

  It would be wrong, from H. Thomas' statement, to deduce that Church-run education in Spain was therefore for a tiny minority, as the following

- 276 **-**

table for <u>segunda enseñanza</u> in <u>enseñanza media</u> alone for 1962-63 shows:

	<u>male</u>	<u>female</u>
Alme <b>rí</b> a	749	754
Cádiz	1389	999
Córdoba	1881	1343
Granada	1533	2049
Guadix	_	193
Huelva	256	325
Kálaga	2692	2082
Seville	4604	3065
Andalusia (Total)	13,959	11,781

The male total is 12.32% that of the national total of pupils receiving <u>segunda enseñanza</u> in Church schools, the female total 13.61%.

(Guía de la Iglesia en España, 1963, p. 8).

- (75) Burgos, A., op. cit., pp. 187-188.
- (76) ibid., p. 187.
- (77) op. cit., p. 170.
- (78) op. cit., p. 66.
- (79) Lara Sánchez, F., <u>La Emigración Andaluza</u> (Madrid, 1977), p. 138.
- (80) op. cit., p. 16.
- (81) ibid., pp. 18-19.
- (82) ibid., pp. 153-157.
- (83) ibid., p. 156.
- (84) Vázquez, J.M, Medín, F., and Méndez, L.,

  <u>La Iglesia Española Contemporánea</u> (Madrid, 1973),

  pp. 313-314.
- (85) ibid., p. 314.
- (86) The theme of emigration was also treated by

bishops in other areas undergoing depopulation: for example, Bishop Araújo Iglesias of Mondonedo-El Ferrol, Galicia, speaking at the same meeting, blamed uncontrolled capitalism as being the main cause of this phenomenon - "provoca y mantiene la injusticia de la situación creada por la emigración" - ibid., p. 315.

- (87) Burgos, A., op. cit., p. 201.
- (88) See footnote (76).
- (89) op. cit., p. 53.
- (90) ibid., pp. 217-224.
- (91) ibid., pp. 217-218.
- (92) ibid., p. 240.
- (93) op. cit., p. 196.
- (94) Gómez Pérez, R., op. cit., p. 132.
- (95) Petschen, S., op. cit., p. 140.
- (96) Añoveros, A., op. cit. p. 251.
- (97) ibid., p. 251.
- (98) Interview at Piedras Redandas, Almería,
  April 1979.
- (99) Interview at Granada, April 1979.
- (100) Vida Nueva, 8.8.70, p. 6.
- (101) Ecclesia, vol. 11, 1970, pp. 1079-1080.
- (102) Boletín HOAC, June-July 1966, nos. 447-448A, p. 1.
- (103) <u>Boletin HOAC</u>, March-April 1969, nos. 516-518, p. 9.
- (104) Sáez Alba, A., op. cit., p. 230.
- (105) ibid., p. 239.
- (106) ibid., p. 250
- (107) ibid., pp. 251-252.
- (108) Guía de la Iglesia en España, 1963, pp. 14-15.
- (109) Boletín HOAC, July 1964, no. 404A, p. 5.

- (110) Vázquez, J. M. et al., op. cit., p. 182.
- (111) Boletín HOAG, June-July 1968, nos. 498-500, p. 3.
- (112) op. cit., pp. 207-212.
- (113) ibid., pp. 207-208.
- (114) Sáez Alba, A., op. cit., p. 218, footnote 1.
- (115) Vázquez, J.M. et al., op. cit., p. 198.
- (116) Ruiz Kico, J.J., op. cit., p. 195.
- (117) <u>Boletín HOAC</u> (i) February 1963, no. 370A, pp. 4-5; (ii) March 1963, no. 372A, p. 3.
- (118) Boletín HOAC, May 1963, no. 376A, p. 6.
- (119) Boletín HOAC, July 1967, nos. 476-7, pp. 9 and 25.
- (120) Boletín HOAC, August 1971, no. 574A, p. 6.
- (121) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, September 1971, no. 576A, p. 6.
- (122) ibid., p. 6.
- (123) Medhurst, K.N., Government in Spain (Oxford, 1973), p. 36.
- (124) Mesa Garrido, R., "Faux et Vrai Dialogue", Esprit, October 1965, no. 10, pp. 407-8.
- (125) Boletín HOAC, July 1971, no. 572A, p. 1.
- (126) Gómez Pérez, R., op. cit., p. 179.
- (127) Ruiz Rico, J.J., op. cit., p. 190.
- (128) ibid., p. 191.
- (129) op. cit., p. 13.
- (130) op. cit., p. 21.
- (131) Comín, A. et al., <u>Buscando la Iglesia Conciliar</u> (Barcelona, 1968), pp. 301-303.
- (132) ibid., p. 303.
- (133) Arbeloa, V.M., <u>Aquella España Católica</u> (Salamanca, 1975), p. 263.
- (134) op. cit., pp. 111-125.
- (135) ibid., pp. 159-178.
- (136) op. cit., p. 190.

- (137) op. cit., p. 127.
- (138) Boletín HOAC, February 1965, no. 417A, p. 7.
- (139) Gómez Pérez, R., op. cit., p. 141, footnote 55.
- (140) Arbeloa, V.N., <u>Aquella España Católica</u>, op. cit., p. 66.
- (141) Aguilar Navarro, M., "Les Chrétiens Espagnols et la Démocratie", Esprit, October 1965, no. 10.

  pp. 433-446, p. 437.
- (142) Cooper, N., The Church: From Crusade to Christianity, op. cit., p. 68.
- (143) One extract which perhaps best illustrates this point is the following: "No podemos negar que de aquí nace cierta disociación interior, que a veces nos preocupa un tanto, entre lo que hemos de vivir y lo que hemos de enseñar....

  Agudamente conscientes de la fugacidad y limitación de lo mundano, hemos de resaltar los aspectos positivos del quehacer terreno..."

   Ecclesia, 13.3.65, in Benzo Mestre, M., op. cit., p. 83.
- (144) The Abbot of Montserrat, Aureli Escarré, in an interview with J.A. Nováis of Le Monde in December 1965, was to make the following damning comment on Francoist Spain: "Allí donde no hay libertad auténtica no hay justicia, y esto es lo que sucede en España....No tenemos tras de nostros veinticinco años de paz, sino sólo veinticinco años de victoria...".
- (145) Boletín HOAC, August 1968, no. 502A, p. 3.
- (146) op. cit., pp. 191-205.
- (147) op. cit., p. 288.

- (148) R. Gómez Pérez feels that the massive publicity given to Paul VI's message to Franco in 1964

  (ano jubilar paulino) "Salve, España

  Católica" is significant, in that what was only a formal courtesy was portrayed in Spain as support for the regime: "Se acercan tiempos nuevos: se ve necesario defender cosas consideradas obvias hasta entonces" op. cit., p. 128, footnote 23.
- (149) Ruiz Rico, J.J., op. cit. p. 199.
- (150) Vázquez, J.M. et al., op. cit., p. 382.
- (151) <u>Ya</u>, 27.8.68, and reprinted in J.M. Vázquez et al., op. cit., p. 383.
- (152) The Bishop of Menorca spoke disparagingly of the "anacrónico privilegio de presentación, totalmente inaceptable hoy" <u>Ultima Hora</u>, 3.2.71, and reprinted in J.M. Vázquez et al., op. cit., p. 383.
- (153) Vázquez, A., <u>Posconcilio, Crisis de</u>
  Estructuras, (Madrid, 1973), pp. 18-24.
- (154) Fundación FOESSA, op. cit., p. 447.
- (155) op. cit., pp. 151-2.
- (156) Cooper, N., <u>The Church: From Crusade to</u>
  <u>Christianity</u>, op. cit., pp. 69-70.
- (157) ibid., p. 70.
- (158) Nicholl, D., op. cit. p. 12.
- (159) Brassloff, A., op. cit., p. 89.
- (160) op. cit., pp. 239-242.
- (161) ibid., p. 242.
- (162) Gil Delgado, F., op. cit., p. 36.
- (163) ibid. p. 36.

#### CHAPTER FOUR

The last years of problems with the regime: from attempts at desenganche to Franco's death - 1972-1975.

#### The Historical Perspective.

The three years following the formal expression of the Church's wish for desenganche, which are to be the twilight years of Francoism in that they end with the death of Franco, are marked, on the political level, by events which seem to presage the changes to come under the new Head of State: changes in the make-up of the government, in that, while it grimly attempts to maintain the status quo, it introduces pseudo-reformist measures such as the nomination of a Prime Minister and the toleration of 'political associations' within the limits of the principles of the Movimiento - this virtually a tacit admission of the existence of differing opinions, albeit slight, within franquismo and a hint of the post-Franco years to come. Like its erstwhile ally the Church, then, the government was no longer a completely monolithic unit: members of the Cortes, like members of the episcopacy, were open to innovation, dialogue and change. Moreover, the necessity of the regime to remove the relatively liberal Diez Alegria from his post as Chief of Staff did nothing to allay fears, in the minds of Francoists. that even the upper echelons of the armed forces were not immune to more liberal tendencies.

Even the decision to introduce a Prime Minister

was to meet with disaster, in that Carrero Blanco, designated premier on 9 June 1973, was to meet his death in a bomb blast engineered by <a href="ETA">ETA</a> on 20

December that same year. The violent demands of the Basque secessionists were to increase to such an extent that a <a href="Decreto-Ley">Decreto-Ley</a> on the prevention of terrorism was passed on 26 August 1975, to be followed by the execution of five <a href="ETA">ETA</a> terrorists a month later amid a storm of protests, both national and worldwide, and despite pleas for clemency by the Church.

But the government's problems with law and order were not limited to the secessionist question. The last years of Francoism were to witness a continuation of the labour troubles of former years, the only change, if anything, being that the workingclasses became more vociferous in their demands and the government more ferocious in its response: two shipyard workers were killed during a demonstration for better conditions and freer trade union representation in El Ferrol on 10 March 1972, while: a host of other violent confrontations were to take place throughout the country, Andalusia being no exception, as will be seen. The underpaid and the unemployed regarded programmes such as the Third Development Plan (initiated 9 May 1972) as empty promises, and certainly it met with little sucess: by the end of 1972, although 381 new firms had been established in the designated polos de desarrollo, for every two jobs that had been lost in these areas only one was created in their place (1), and

unemployment was still rife in many areas. Spanish society, by now strongly imbued with the manifold influences of societies of western democracies, had undergone a remarkable transformation in a relatively short period of time, and the young Spaniard of the early seventies was a different species from his counterpart of a decade or so before who had lived in a more hermetically sealed state virtually immune to trans-Pyrennean influences.

Nor was the effect of this socio-political maelstrom mitigated in any way by a Church which, no longer expressing unqualified support for the regime and with bishops not even maintaining a diplomatic silence, repeatedly criticised many aspects of the status quo and at times even appeared to side with what the regime regarded as illegal opposition. The election of Enrique y Tarancón as president of the Conferencia Episcopal signalled the transfer of power within the hierarchy from the old order to the new, an expression of the Church's wish to preach the Gospel unencumbered by adherence to any one political philosophy or bias and to champion the cause of true freedom for all, succinctly expressed in the document La Iglesia y la comunidad política of 23 January 1973 and reiterated in Andalusia at the Seville Synod in June the same year. The dismay of the Francoist right on seeing their former ally seemingly abandon them was to quickly turn to anger, the slogans of "Tarancón al paredón" given formal expression by the speech of Carrero Blanco on 7 December 1972 in which he bitterly criticised the

ingratitude of the Church. At the same time, the Church itself continued to be beset by internal conflicts as controversy raged within as to the degree of the implementation of the Council's message in the temporal sphere. The role of the Church while such complex forces were at work, together with their impact on the Church, is described in the following pages.

# 1. The attitude of the hierarchy.

It has already been seen how the hierarchy became more critical of certain aspects concerned with the regime since Vatican II, and how the call for desenganche was consequently inevitable, However, opinions differed within the episcopacy as to how and to what extent this line should be pursued. Under the presidency of Enrique y Tarancón, the bishops as a body were to appear to adopt an approach of cautious reform within the Spanish socio-political system, in that they attempted to shape or mould that system to be more liberal and outward-looking, with a Church independent of it as regards its rights - for example, the unqualified freedom to appoint its bishops - and, while not enjoying any formal or official priveleges, yet maintaining a certain pre-eminence in its aim to unify and evangelise a disunited and in some cases anticlerical people, as A. Sáez Alba describes (2):

"El 'taranconismo'....revela sus preferencias por la implantación de un sistema 'suavemente autoritario', sin el pasado del actual....Un sistema en el que la Iglesia pueda seguir ocupando el centro de la

escena social, esta vez como elemento unificador."

This is not to say that the hierarchy under Tarancón lacked any commitment to the draft of September 1971: the same feelings were to be reiterated in March 1972, when the bishops stressed their determination to "llevar a la práctica en el plano nacional las conclusiones de la Asamblea Conjunta de Obispos y Sacerdotes" (3).

Yet it must be stressed that within the hierarchy there were those who for reasons of conservatism or radicalism did not entirely share this 'middle ground' approach, though according to J. Chao Rego (4) one of the bishops best symbolising taranconismo is Bueno Monreal, Cardinal Archbishop of Seville. The same writer, in his line-up of bishops under categories ranging from <u>búnker</u> to <u>centro izquierda</u>, omits Andalusian bishops from the far-right categories of búnker and integrismo, and places only Rafael Bellido Caro (auxiliary at Seville) and Miguel Peinado Peinado (Bishop of Jaen) under derecha and lists the remainder in categories to the left of this, mostly in the centre. However, Chao Rego himself adds that such divisions are neither watertight nor beyond question as different points of view will place bishops under different 'categories'. The picture becomes even more blurred when, as has been said before, certain bishops who are 'cautious' or even 'conservative' in one area - say Church-State relations or personal morality - appear 'progressive' or even 'radical' in the social domain. In Andalusia, such had been the case with Herrera

and such was the case in this period with a prelate such as Bueno Monreal. The Spanish hierarchy in the whole period between Vatican II and Franco's death practically defies straightforward analysis, and it is only by a breakdown of the attitudes of bishops in separate areas that any meaningful and rigorous examination may be made.

### 2. The bishops and the government.

To the charge that the gradual move away from
Francoism was prompted more by a pragmatic sense of
survival because of the beginnings of socio-political
change in Spain than by a profound sense of principle
because of the new dimension given to the mission of
the Church by the Council, it was an Andalusian bishop,
José María Cirarda Lachiondo of Cordoba, who made
the following spirited yet logical reply (5):

"La asimilación - dicho de otra manera - de la Constitución 'Gaudium et Spes' debe tener especiales repercusiones en una nación profundamente religiosa y anchamente católica, como la nuestra. Mucho más si tenemos en cuenta que la historia socio-política de España ha marchado, durante siglos, .... íntimamente ligada a la historia cristiana del pueblo, mucho más que en otras latitudes.... La Jerarquía trata de hacer suyo el gran principio conciliar de 'una sana colaboración salva una mutua independencia'. No se trata, pues,....como se critica en

determinados sectores, de un oportunismo de desenganche. Es mucho más: es el convencimiento de que es obligada una actitud nueva, diferente en no pocos puntos de la habitual en otros tiempos, como exigencia de una Iglesia, que quiere ser más pobre, más libre y más espiritual para poder estar más presente, aunque parezca paradójico, en la información de toda la vida individual, familiar y social, incluso en sus aspectos más materiales y temporales precisamente por más libre y espiritual."

However, perhaps it is not inappropriate, despite the above quoted denial by Cirarda Lachiondo, to discuss this charge: the Caudillo was now ageing, and under his appointed successor- to be a King - some degree of political change not only seemed likely to some, but inevitable. Hence, were there those in the Church whose personal prognostications of such occurrences were such that they were preparing to disassociate. themselves from the regime before it could become discredited, and therefore they with it? A report of the Assembly of 1971 in 'The Economist' spoke of the episcopacy possessing "sober-minded pragmatists more concerned with securing for the Church a trouble-free passage from the present system to the more democratic one they feel will be installed under Don Juan Carlos" (6); therefore the possibility did occur to several commentators on the Spanish scene outside Spain as well as within. Of course such reasonings can only

be of the realm of speculation or conjecture, and any reply that the Church was sincere in its new approach to relations with the State must mention the fact that the influence of Vatican II's teachings for some form of disestablishment for the Church to preach its message free of any political trappings was widely accepted by the Church universally, and so the same would be the case in Spain. Moreover, this new approach in Church-State relations by no means rejected Francoism outright, nor did it necessarily imply that the Church was henceforth to subscribe to any other political doctrine.

This determination by the Church to win the right of self-government was to continue into the following year, and Andalusian bishops were to play a prominent role in much of this (7). The beginning of 1973 was to be another testing time for Church-State relations with the publication of the document La Iglesia y la Comunidad Política on 23 January, as an appendix of the seventeenth Plenary Assembly of November - December the previous year. Its drafting committee of seven bishops included three from Andalusia - Cirarda of Cordoba. González Moralejo of Huelva and Monterro Moreno, auxiliary at Seville - and, in the words of N. Cooper, had "the now inevitable liberal bias" (8). The text, calling for the right to nominate bishops, the termination of the Church's economic and political benefits and the withdrawal of bishops from the Cortes, was passed by fifty-nine votes to twenty, with four abstentions. The language used was straightforward and unwavering (9): the document also called for an end to,

or certainly modification of, the Concordat - "....no responde ya ni a las verdaderas necesidades del momento ni a la doctrina establecida por el **C**oncilio Vaticano II"(10).

But the document brought a storm of protest from quarters who were to remain unconvinced of the desirability of the increasing involvement of certain members of the Church in the area of social problems. The editorial of El Correo de Andalucía of 27 June 1973 gave an account of Alfredo López's concern at this new direction that many in the Church were taking — the same writer had already criticised the involvement of certain churchmen in this field in 1972 (11):

"...ponderar las condiciones de la empresa para comprobar hasta qué punto es viable elevar el nivel de un salario...todo esto es lo que tiene que hacer el laico y lo que no puede hacer ni debe hacer la Jerarquía de la Iglesia, porque si lo hiciera entraría en un campo ajeno a su competencia..."

The same writer was also to accuse the more radical members of the priesthood of being influenced by Marxism, criticising their "su afán destructor, de inspiración marxista, contra las estructuras temporales" (12).

Even within the hierarchy, including that sector commonly accepted as being more open to the socially based Christianity of the Council, there was some concern at the Church's involvement with more temporal matters.

For example, while Cirarda was to reject any criticism from the extreme right over the Church's interest in social questions - "otros aferrados a ideas y situaciones de ayer, y que se resisten al cambio hasta el extremo de que nos encontramos con un 'antijerarquismo' de derechas" (13) - only a year later in 1973, the same bishop was to reject a petition signed by eighty priests in his diocese in which they stated that any posture of neutrality by the Church was an implied acceptance of the established order and that the only solution was open solidarity with the working classes (14). Cirarda's rejection was based on their excessive concern with the temporal to the detriment of the spiritual - "...obsesión por la lucha de clases" + and the distortion that such a posture could bring about as regards Christ being the Saviour of all irrespective of political opinions. The bishops reply would appear to be at one with taranconismo - in other words, Cirarda, while favouring a severing of ties with a dictatorship of the Right, was making it manifestly clear that he was against the Church lurching over to the other side of the political spectrum with perhaps equally dire consequences. For churchmen like him, the Church in its mission to bring the message of Christ to man was therefore to be an agent of unity, and any bias politically would surely compromise it in this work. Certainly, the criticisms of writers such as López are to be seriously considered, in that a Church fired only with the politicised theology of González Ruiz, for example, could well be a force of disunity and bias.

The independent, 'centrist' attitude of taranconismo was also underlined at the Synod of Bishops in Rome in October and November of 1974, and Bishop Dorado Soto of Cadiz (along with Cardinal Jubany) publicly supported Cardinal Tarancón in his defence of the Church's role in calling for freedom and attacking oppression (15). However, to many on the Left, this cautious steering of the hierarchical ship between the Scylla of Francoism and the Charybdis of the Left was a sign of indecisiveness. Thus spoke J. Chao Rego on the Seville Synod of June 1973(16):

"Se trata de un reformismo renovador, no revolucionario, y de un posibilismo: sacarle todo el partido posible a la Institución."

But, if anything, the Church was acting with great decisiveness: it was fully aware of the difficulties involved in acting as a force for unity in the new Spain, and a programme of moderation, in the minds of what may be called 'radical moderates' such as Bueno Monreal and Cirarda Lachiondo, was the only way to achieve this objective, even though it might attract the hostility of the Right and the criticism of the Left. Those involved in the Seville Synod were fully aware of the difficulties involved, as R. Canales was to point out in an article written shortly before the Synod opened (17):

"Es evidente la tensión en que se debate la población. Sobre mentalidades tan diferentes van a caer unos Documentos sinodales que quieren presentar una Iglesia de nuevo cuño. Lógicamente, lo que a unos agrade va a otros desagradar ....Lo cual,.... dificulta en grado sumo las decisiones pastorales."

Again, Antonio Dorado Soto, then Bishop of Guadix, wrote, in an article entitled El Cristiano w la Política in May 1972 (18) that Christianity is not to be associated with any one political system -"...deben ser muy cautos todos los cristianos que se comprometan en una acción política determinada para no presentarla como la única forma posible" and that the lay apostolate is to be a spiritual movement first and foremost - "...sin adoptar opciones políticas concretas" - while also emphasising the desirability of genuine political pluralism. While warning against the proclivity of more radical churchmen to politicise religion, he also defends the Church's interest in this domain by quoting from Pope Paul VI's Progressio Populorum on the duty of the hierarchy to teach and interpret moral issues.

Emphasis has been placed by commentators such as F. Gil Delgado on the declaration by the Plenary Assembly of 26 November - 1 December 1973, which expressed the wish to governors and governed for "el espíritu de paz y de amor a que nos invitan el Adviento, la Navidad y el Año Santo", the beginnings of an attempt by the hierarchy to

repair the damage done to Church-State relations in the recent past (19), but the fact remains that the hierarchy as a whole was aware that political pluralism was not only desirable but necessary, as R. Gómez Pérez points out (20):

"Los aires que soplan en la jerarquía eclesiástica después del Concilio Vaticano II coinciden con la previsión de que el postfranquismo no puede tardar."

He also adds (21):

"En esa situación de pluralismo político, la Jerarquía eclesiástica tenía que estar por encima de las cuestiones partidistas y, a la vez cuando fuese necesario y oportuno, emitir juicios morales sobre aspectos de problemas temporales..."

It is by continued criticism of socio-economic injustices, while maintaining a non-aligned stance politically, that the Andalusian hierarchy exerts perhaps greatest pressure on the regime.

# 3. The Bishops and social problems.

It has already been seen that many Andalusian bishops were well aware of the pressing social problems - problems worsened by unemployment and inflation resulting from the Oil Crisis and world recession, as has been mentioned. They made every effort to help eradicate them by supporting various projects or by exhorting their flock, through

pastorals, to do everything possible to change any unjust situation. The problems covered in the previous chapter were to remain in Andalusia up to (and beyond) Franco's death, and so it was inevitable that the region's bishops, priests and lay apostolate groups should continue giving them their attention.

# (a) Unemployment.

Unemployment continued to be the scourge of both rural and urban Andalusia, as has been seen in the examination of this problem in the Introduction. The hierarchy, both national and local, recognised the seriousness of the problem, giving it perhaps more attention than any other topic. In a paper entitled Actitudes Cristianas ante la actual Situación Económica published by the Comisión Permanente on 16 September 1974, a member of which was Antonio Montero Moreno, auxiliary at Seville, mention was made of the unemployment problem:

"El paro no se hace presente solamente cuando los obreros quedan sin trabajo; en situaciones en que la economía de los trabajadores está, en parte importante, apoyada en horas extraordinarias, la supresión de éstas repercutirá inevitablemente en el equilibrio de los presupuestos familiares..."

Figures published by <u>HOAC</u> in their bulletin of April 1974 showed that unemployment had steadily

grown in Granada by almost 50% from 1970 to 1973 (22), but nor was the situation any better in other parts of Andalusia. In Cordoba, a meeting was called by workers in March 1975 to discuss unemployment: on 4 March Bishop Cirarda Lachiondo offered to put their petition for more work and better pay to the authorities, and permission was in fact given for an official meeting to take place (23). A month previously, Bishop Ramón Buxarrais Ventura of Malaga publicly declared his sympathy for the demands for more job opportunities made by a group of striking employees on behalf of their unemployed friends. After a meeting in the barrio of El Palo on 13 February, they took refuge in the cathedral on being dispersed by riot police. At five o'clock the bishop arrived and informed them of his support for their cause - "si desalojan lo harán sin mi permiso" was his assurance to the group in the cathedral. As it was, at 11.15 the police forced their way into the cathedral and took to the policestation those without an identity-card. Moreover the bishop denied categorically that he had given the police permission to enter the cathedral to make arrests, and it was only later that it was discovered that a sacristan had given them a key (24). This incident is perhaps one of the most spectacular examples of how the hierarchy were ready to help the unemployed make their voice heard; certainly, it shows the commitment of Buxarrais to the cause of justice for the disadvantaged and his determination to maintain an independent posture before the authorities - though at the same time it shows yet again, here in the figure of the sacristan, that there were those within the Church concerned at the social involvement of the Church.

A situation similar to the one above, in that chrches were used as a sanctuary by demonstrators with the permission and support of the bishop, occured in Granada in April 1975. A group of unemployed workers had had talks with the local delegado de trabajo on 21 April, but nothing was agreed or promised, and so on 27 April they decided to write to the authorities, and decided also to hand in a petition concerned with the problems of unemployment. Thirty-five of them took refuge in the local curial offices, and Benavent Escuin refused entry to the police. As a sign of solidarity, Christian sympathisers occupied the Church of San Isidro on 30 April and the parish priest, like his bishop, refused to allow the police to enter in pursuit of the demonstrators (though the police entered on 1 May and forced their way into the curial offices later). Those finally arrested included priests, and such were Benavent's feelings at the action by the authorities that he gave the following sermon, received with applause, at Granada Cathedral on 4 May (25):

"...es necesario que, antes de que se adopten las medidas que han de ordenar la vida económica, se escuchen los puntos de vista y las iniciativas de los trabajadores,

ya que la ordenación económica de la comunidad afecta de modo directo de su bienestar...Finalmente, agredezco de corazán la presencia de los sacerdotes que han venido a manifestar su comunión de fe y de caridad conmigo en esta santa misa y siento con ellos, por razones de fraternidad sacerdotal, que no puedan estar aquí con nosotros dos hermanos nuestros que se encuentran privados de libertad y a los que encomendamos muy especialmente al Señor en la celebración de esta Eucaristía."

This episode is of great significance for various reasons: it demonstrates the solidarity of Benavent with his priests involved in the problems of the unemployed - the same bishop, it must be remembered, had declared his support of priests in his diocese accused of complicity during the Granada riots of summer 1970 - and therefore his support for the demands of the demonstrators; but it is also significant for its date, in that it occurs only six months before the death of Franco, thereby questioning the idea that there was a marked imprevement in relations between the Church and the State after the call for reconciliation among all Spaniards at the Flenary Assembly of 1973 (26).

# (b) Wages and other conditions.

Mention has already been made of the allusion

to the problem of loss of pay suffered by workers deprived of the option of working overtime in the document of 16 September 1973 of the Comisión Permanente, which included Montero Moreno, But many workers, they stated, were permanently underpaid, and therefore unable to share in the benefits produced by their labour:

"Todavía es posible identificar en nuestro país grupos humanos y aún regiones que no han logrado salir de una situación de pobreza y de insuficiencia material...el crecimiento económico ha producido diferencias desmesuradas entre los ingresos de quienes participan en el proceso de la producción."

The document goes on to criticise the inadequate machinery that its authors feel exist for industrial democracy and the way in which inflation has harmed the poor, together with the reminder that the document must not be seen as another example of <a href="mailto:meterse">meterse</a> en <a href="mailto:politica">politica</a> - "Queremos ser delicadamente respetuosos de la autonomía propia de las realidades temporales ...Pero,... queremos también ser fieles cumplidores del mandato recibido de Dios" - again indicative of the hierarchy's determination to pronounce upon temporal problems and readiness to defend this area of interest.

Dorado Soto, among other Andalusian bishops felt that poor pay was the key to many of the problems of the Cadiz working-classes, and on 15

March 1975 he addressed his diocese on the plight of the poor and the need for a diocesan programme to alleviate their hardship, and the responsibility that Christians have in this respect (27):

"Se trata de avivar la sensibilidad de todos ante las situaciones concretas, atraer la atención comunitaria al prójimo pero en las condiciones reales en que se está desarrollando su vida actual, estimular la realización de un análisis objetivo de los problemas que agobian a nuestros hermanos en el trabajo, la vivienda, la asistencia sanitaria..."

For many Andalusians the only escape, as has been stated, was emigration, either to wealthier and more developed parts of Spain or to northern Europe. Yet this too had its problems, both for the emigrant, who often had to settle in a strange place without his family, and for his native area, which was losing a young, vigorous population that could be a work-force of great potential.

#### (c) Emigration.

Emigration has always been a feature of Andalusian life, as has already been pointed out in the previous chapter (28), and the seventies were to prove no exception. The favourite pole of attraction was Barcelona and its environs, a fact which prompted the Andalusian writer José María Osuna to publish the book La Novena Provincia

Andaluza in 1973. He justifies the hyperbole of the title thus (29):

"Escribo estas líneas desde
Ripollet,...a poco más de 10 km.
de Barcelona y a 5 de Sabadell.
En el autobús que cuarto de
hora hace el recorrido desde el
pueblo a la capital..., el ambiente,
las conversaciones, los dichos,
varían muy poco de los que se pueden
encontrar en cualquiera de los
transportes colectivos que hacen
el servicio de viajeros entre Sevilla
y La Algaba, Dos Hermanas o Coria.
En alguna ocasión nos extrañamos
incluso al escuchar a alguien que
se expresa con acento catalán..."

He goes on to give the reason for the existence of this Andalusian predominance in the area (30):

"...el aluvión de trabajadores que desde los campos andaluces y extremeños empezaron a llegar, cada vez en mayor número, recelosos y esperanzados, a unas tierras abiertas como promesa de otras formas de vida más justas que les ofreció la propia región donde nacieron."

The author goes on to speak of the problems endured by the Andalusians in 'foreign' Catalonia: the uncertainty of finding accommodation and work on arriving, and then of retaining them in an effort to forge a new life, the heartache of leaving loved ones in Andalusia, the trauma of adjusting to life in urban Catalonia after so many years spent in a rural area of Andalusia.

When he was Bishop of Cadiz, Anoveros repeatedly drew attention to the malaise of forced emigration, as has already been seen (31). On 1 March 1973, these efforts were succeeded by a collective statement of concern at the problem by the whole College of Andalusian bishops, plus those of Badajoz, the Canaries, Cartagena-Murcia and Tenerife - that is to say, what may be termed the entire south of Spain. Entitled La Conciencia Cristiana ante la Emigración, this joint pastoral is a detailed account of the reasons for large-scale emigration, together with an examination of the root causes and concern for the victims. It is therefore, in many ways, a companion work to that of J.N.Osuna quoted above. Attention is drawn to the high incidence of emigration: it is pointed out that, whereas the average growth of population for Spain was 11.1% in the decade 1961-70, that of Andalusia was a mere 1.3%. The reasons are wellknown - "una emigración forzada por factores que no dependen del propio emigrante" - and these factors in turn are listed -"pueden senalarse una desigual distribución de las riquezas materiales dentro de la comunidad social, una inadecuada explotación de los recursos existentes, un difícil acceso a los bienes de la cultura" - all of which, the writers feel, could be mitigated by a greater national and

regional desire and determination to establish greater prospects for employment.

An interesting aspect of the pastoral, however, is the emphasis given to the human factor. The emigrant is a victim of circumstances, and is often the most defenceless and inadequate member of society precisely because of the need to emigrate:

"Notemos, en primer término, que los protagonistas del hecho migratorio son normalmente los pobres y necesitados, carentes, las más de las veces, de un mínimo bagaje de cultura y de soltura para desenvolverse en un ambiente extraño."

The sadness experienced on leaving one's native region is made even deeper when loved ones are left behind: it is this destruction of the family unit which gives the situation greater poignancy—an account of which is in the chapter El tren de las lágrimas of the above—quoted work by J.M.Osuna (32)—all of which can have harmful and hurting effects both on the emigrant and on those left behind:

"La emigración equivale, las más de las veces, cuando se dirige al extranjero, a una separación familiar forzosa, con sus secuelas de soledad de los cónyuges y de dificultades de la joven madre para educar a unos hijos que

apenas conocen a su padre."

Such traumatic experiences can have harmful effects on the practice of the emigrant's faith, the bishops assert, and mention is made of schemes whereby Andalusian priests are directed to areas of high Andalusian immigration to assist in both the practical and the spiritual sphere. Indeed, the bishops humbly concede that the Church is not blameless as regards its lack of positive action in the past - "Confesamos que hasta ahora, a nivel del Sur de España, los esfuerzos de la Iglesia en esta materia han sido débiles y desconectados entre sí" - and although the style does not have the biting, incisive criticisms of Anoveros, there is a comprehensive survey of the ills which cause, and result from, emigration; and the fact that it is written by the whole body of bishops within the affected areas gives it great weight and significance.

### (d) Housing.

In this period the housing question receives less ecclesiastical attention than before, possibly because churchmen saw other problems such as unemployment as being more crucial. One particular problem, however, was the overcrowding of inner-city working-class areas, which was made worse by immigration from the surrounding countryside. Such has been the case with Seville, as N.Salas has pointed out (33):

"Sevilla recibe fuertes contingentes

de clase trabajadora, de
personal que busca ansiosamente
la tabla de salvación que
suponen un puesto de trabajo en
la industria o en los servicios..."

He goes on to say that what exacerbates the situation is that those who leave Seville are not the same category of workers as those who arrive in search of a job, but are for the most part trained people desirous of moving elsewhere in Spain where their skills and training can have greater financial reward. Hence cities such as Seville possess a high rate of slum areas with families living on or below the poverty line.

One of the champions for the need to promote housing improvements was Añoveros. Hence it was only appropriate that Dorado Soto, his successor at Cadiz, should continue this interest: in January 1975 he published a pastoral entitled Ante la Campaña pro-vivienda del Necesitado (34), in which he indicated the seriousness of the problem and the responsability for it of the whole Christian community:

"....entiendo que la caridad cristiana no queda limitada a esta ayuda (la campaña provivienda) de emergencia, sino que nos obliga a plantearnos, comunitariamente y con toda sinceridad, el gravísimo problema gaditano de viviendas,

hasta que la diócesis entera
tome más clara y eficaz conciencia
de las responsabilidades que, a
todos y a cada uno, nos conciernen
en tan primordial asunto."

He goes on to say that the problem is especially pressing in Andalusia because of the shortage of housing and also because many people earn such a low wage that decent accomodation is often impossible to obtain. The language is calmer than that of his predecessor: there is no angry denouncing or condemning, simply a reasoned resumé of the problems existing, with suggestions for their solution. The pastoral is a succinct yet comprehensive analysis of the problem, demonstrating that its writer is a worthy successor to that champion of the disadvantaged, Antonio Añoveros Ataún.

Dorado Soto was also anxious to make his flock aware of the living conditions of those beyond the confines of Andalusia: in the pastoral No es la paz la que deja morir de hambre, the first sentences are to the point (35):

"Queridos diocesanos: nadie
en el mundo civilizado actual
podrá sentirse excusado alegando
ignorar el hecho brutal, el más
brutal de todos los datos....;
millones de hombres, de mujeres
y de niños mueren de hambre cada
año. La mayor parte de la
humanidad yace en la miseria o
el subdesarrollo."

This theme of the right to enjoy decent living conditions was also taken up by priests and lay apostolate groups, as will be seen.

### (e) The spiritual.

It would be erroneous to claim that the documents and other statements of the members of the Andalusian hierarchy were concerned with temporal problems alone. They were constantly aware of the importance to stress the spiritual - indeed the rebuke of Cirarda to the eighty priests of Cordoba diocese who produced the document urging the Church to side entirely with the Left was based on the fact that it was inspired more by factional politics than the Gospel, "un antropocentrismo muy diferente del auténtico humanismo cristiano" (36) - and were consequently cognisant of the distance that had grown between themselves and their flock over the years. Therefore every effort was made to appear more approachable: Bishop Buxarrais of Malaga, for instance, took part in the processions of Semana Santa dressed in an ordinary clerical suit, without any signs of episcopal trappings (37), in keeping with the line adopted by Bueno Monreal at the seventh National Eucharistic Congress in Seville some years previously (38).

This rejection of the more traditional modes of dress was more formally made in a joint document of Bueno and Benavent, the product of a meeting of all the bishops of the south (including those of Badajoz and Cartagena-Murcia) a little before

Christmas 1975. Entitled El Catolicismo Popular en el Sur de España, the document offers a definition of what is meant by religiosidad popular, its origins, its strengths and weaknesses, and some suggestions as to how it may be shaped into a relevant and useful means of evangelisation and pastoralism in Andalusia (39).

Care is taken not to equate 'popular religion' with only the less educated sector of society:

"También es difícil precisar quien es el sujeto de la religiosidad popular. Hay algunos que lo reducen, desde el punto de vista ... sociológico, a las gentes menos dotadas de ingresos, estudios o poder en la sociedad. Sin embargo, los rasgos de este tipo de religiosidad aparecen también en las vivencias y comportamientos de no pocos que, en otros órdenes de la cultura, del poder o posición social pertenecen a los grupos selectos y no a las masas."

The term can only be used broadly, it is asserted,
"al conjunto de fieles que participan de un modo
más irregular y menos instruido en los diferentes
aspectos de la vida de la Iglesia". One of the basic

criticisms to be made of the phenomenon is its lack of depth of conviction in many instances: the postconciliar Church was anxious to rid itself of 'religion through habit' or the pietistic displays of religious feeling reminiscent of the forties, and the Andalusian bishops show themselves to be no exception:

"...se pueden observar también, ...ciertos modos de interpretarla y de vivirla que revelan, a veces muy claramente, rasgos heredados de las distintas religiones que se establecieron aquí y lograron configurar la religiosidad de pasadas generaciones....Andalucía, en especial, ha vivido a lo largo de los siglos muy intensas y diversas experiencias de 'religión'. Con dramáticas alternativas de pluralismo o de intolerancia, han predominado desde muy antiguo las formas de 'religiones de sumisión', caracterizadas por el ejercicio de prácticas externas fuertemente institucionalizadas, y por comportamientos sociales y legales ....y estaban escasamente abiertas a una fe personal, basada en la conversión interior, la decisión libre y la responsabilidad de conciencia. La acción evangelizadora actual de la Iglesia católica, al tratar de configurar la religiosidad de la presente y de futuras generaciones, no puede ignorar este dato histórico..."

The writers emphasise, however, that their criticisms are not levelled at religión popular itself, only its "formas reducidas": the phenomenon itself is of great cultural value and interest, and can be as efficacious a way of attaining communion with God as the more stylistic forms of worship:

"...constituye uno de los accesos más directos y penetrantes hasta el corazón y el ser de un pueblo. De aquí también que el pueblo se reconozca en aquellas formas y expresiones que le evocan sus experiencias religiosas y que le permiten realizar sus valores humanos."

Moreover, although the <u>fiesta</u> has been abused, for reasons of tourism at times, it can nevertheless be a real source of spiritual regeneration when properly treated:

"....la cultura de la fiesta está en íntima relación real con la vida del trabajo y de la producción; ofrece condiciones óptimas para una vida cristiana integral...."

The bishops do feel that the "formas reducidas" of popular religion possess certain shortcomings, however. One danger is that of a primitive religion based on superstition, while another potential danger is of a legalistic nature, in that religious practice could be reduced to a code of laws followed unthinkingly. The greatest danger, however, is of narrowness or shallowness, either collectively - "las creencias católicas de carácter político-religioso que responden a diversas concepciones del Catolicismo como religión nacional...De ahí,...la confusión entre lo católico y lo patriótico" - or individually - "el devocionismo individual que acentúa la perfección ética privada y olvida la ética social" - which agaim reminds one of past years.

The document synthesises the thinking of the hierarchy - and especially in Andalusia - since the influence of the Council. There is a more measured, sober assessment of the region's spiritual life, together with the role of the Church in its growth. There is an appreciation of the changing face of society, an emphatic realisation that the Church's teachings are to be applied to the temporal and not be solely for private stylised worship - this is not to say that the spiritual is to be relegated or forgotten, but that it is to attain a new dimension in the area of pastoral work, thereby enjoying a plethora of expression.

### 4. The priests.

It has already been seen, both in this period (as in the rejection of the document of eighty priests in Cordoba) and in the period between Vatican II and the Episcopal Conference of 1971, that the more openly committed to the cause of social justice in an overtly militant way appeared to be the priests rather than their superiors: whereas the hierarchy wished to stand independently from politics in their call for greater liberty and socio-economic justice, their priests who were involved in similar issues tended to side openly with the Left. Was this because, by their ministry, the priests could better appreciate the travails of their parishioners, as many of them continually claimed? Or was it a deliberate attempt by the hierarchy not to make the Church appear to give itself to one political faction? Certainly, the reply of Cirarda in the affair quoted above would seem to suggest that the latter was more the case. However, this period does contain instances of priests involved in demonstrations on behalf of working people receiving the unconditional support of their bishop - such as in the troubles in Granada in April 1975 already mentioned (40).

S. Petschen describes the period 1966-68 as the most 'optimista', to use his word and therefore his view of the situation, for the increase of priest participation in the area of human rights (41); but the years immediately preceding Franco's

death also witnessed a striking increase in priest involvement, During this period it became almost commonplace for radical clergy to allow their churches to be used as meeting places for leftist groups, with the result that sympathisers of the far right occasionally entered these churches, with ensuing violence (42). These priests, who served in working-class areas, and who are often worker-priests themselves - José Godoy in Granada or Andrés Alfambra in Malaga, for example - saw themselves as attempting to live a life more akin to that of the early Christians than those whom they would term priests of the 'establishment' Church.

In Andalusia, as elsewhere in Spain, it was in the field of industrial relations where several priests made a considerable impact in the fight for better wages for the low paid. An example of this occurred in Malaga, where, after requests by the workers at the <u>CITESA</u> plant for a rise of 2,500 pesetas per month on their then salary of 4,080 per month and a forty-six hour week were refused, fifty-two priests from Malaga diocese had the following statement published on the front page of Sol de España on 10 February 1972:

"...conscientes de nuestra responsabilidad de servir a la verdad....
manifestamos nuestro apoyo a las
aspiraciones legítimas que han provocado el conflicto....Todos nosotros
somos conscientes de las dificultades
económicas de los trabajadores, que

van en aumento día a día con las subidas de precios, y creemos que es totalmente justo que el mundo del trabajo logre unas condiciones que les permitan llevar una vida más humana y más justa."

This declaration also carried the support of the Bishop of Malaga.

But there were priests who were even prepared to take to the streets in their fight for social justice: the demonstration by a group of unemployed for the right to work in Granada from 27 April to 1 May 1975, and which has already been mentioned for the support that Bishop Benavent gave his priests (43), involved the support of priests and theology students. After the police had entered the Church of San Isidro to eject the demonstrators' sympathisers who had taken refuge there, another demonstration began in the square, and a workerpriest, José Godoy López, and two theology students were arrested, Godoy being sent to prison on 6 May and having to pay a 450,000 pesetas fine (44). The same day, police managed to enter the curia where the original demonstrators had taken refuge, and arrested ten, all of whom were fined, among them the priests Antonio Quitián and Angel Aguado, who were given the fines of 500,000 and 400,000 pesetas respectively (45). It was on behalf of these three priests that Bishop Benavent gave his sermon which brought applause from the congregation.

Elsewhere in Andalusia there were other priests prepared to speak on behalf of the poorly paid or unemployed. In Malaga, for example, a study done by a Fr. Roig demonstrated that fishermen got an average wage of 7,000 pesetas for a forty-two day stint, with the greater share of the money accruing from the catch going to owners and buyers (46). Fines and sometimes imprisonment were to become the norm for priests whom the authorities considered as being helpers or instigators in strikes, demonstrations and other anti-government actions. J. Chao Rego gives a list of those priests fined between the anti-terrorist Decreto Ley of August 1975 and Franco's death, and of the forty priests listed, fourteen - more than one third - are from Andalusia, who are named below and may be added to the names of the above-mentioned José Godoy, Antonio Quitián and Angel Aguado (47):

Place	<u>Name</u>	Fine (Pesetas)
Malaga	Andrés Alfambra	500,000
Granada	Elías Alcalde Martín	400,000
Granada	José A.Rosillo Posadas	400,000
Granada	José Ubag Ruiz	300,000
Granada	José Antonio Morales	100,000
Cadiz	Luis Conde de la Blanca	100,000
Cadiz	José M.Arriaga González	100,000
Cadiz	Serafín Martínez Cuervo	150,000
Algeciras	Andrés Avelino González	100,000
Algeciras	Ramón Pérez Perea	100,000
Algeciras	Manuel Gaitero Casado	100,000
Algeciras	Jésús Casado Benito	100,000

Place Fine (Pesetas) Name José Rodríguez Quirante Granada 400.000 Granada Juan Quiles 100,000 Nor were these the only priests to be fined, with perhaps the best known Andalusian priest being José María González Ruiz at Malaga, who was given a fine of 100,000 pesetas for anti-government statements on 6 October 1974 (48). A survey in Vida Nueva showed that, throughout Spain, more than one hundred fines had been imposed because of the content of sermons alone in less than three years between 1972 and 1975 (49).

However, although the bishops usually supported their priests, as has been seen with Benavent in Granada, Buxarrais in Malaga, and the Capitular Vicar of Cadiz, who was to defend the parish priest of Nuestra Señora de la Paloma (accused of throwing anti-government material from a car) by demanding a public apology and withdrawl of the charge (50), occasionally this was not the case - again, the example of Cirarda's refusal to accept the content of the joint declaration of eighty priests in Cordoba. Certainly, there were occasions when it seemed that certain priests were closer to their parishioners than to their superiors, seen by J. Chao Rego as a situation between "una jerarquía alejada" and "un clero batallador" (51). It goes without saying that this applied to other areas of Spain besides Andalusia (52). To commentators such as Chao, the hierarchy often appeared equivocal in their reaction to, priest participation in the

temporal sphere, in that while they usually gave support in matters belonging strictly to the area of socio-economic problems, they were more muted in matters which directly touched on the field of politics. However, it would appear that Chao does not take into account the determination by the hierarchy in its view of the Church as a unifying force throughout society, as has been stated, not to appear partidista either one way or the other. It is this more balanced approach which differentiates the hierarchy from more militant priests and lay groups embracing a more politicised theology, this being the case in Andalusia as elsewhere in Spain.

#### 5. HOAC and other lay groups.

Of the various lay groups attached to the Church, it was HOAC, as in the previous period covered by this study, which made strongest impact in the area of socio-economic and political problems, and particularly in the field of labour relations and conditions of employment. The bulletins of HOAC constantly refer to the poor pay of many areas of employment, some of which have already been mentioned - for example, the poor rate of pay for fishermen in the Malaga region. A report on the pay and conditions for young women in domestic service in the Granada area stated that many of them worked extremely long hours, having to spend practically the entire day away from their homes (some of them with children of their own who have to be cared for by relatives or neighbours) and

receiving each month a maximum pay of 3,000 pesetas and often as little as 2,000 pesetas. Moreover, they were unable to claim any social security benefits through not being employed by a registered firm (53). The organisation was always ready to defend those sacked or suspended for legitimate pay grievances, as in the case of ten workers who were sacked along with sixteen of their colleagues who had been suspended without pay by Westinghouse of Cordoba for striking on 26 September 1974 (54). Indeed, HOAC was to report that in only one month (15 December 1974 - 15 January 1975) there had been a total of 2,256 sackings and well over a hundred arrests in labour troubles throughout Spain, possibly the worst being at Cadiz, at Astilleros Españoles, where over 5,000 workers were involved in a strike over pay and conditions, the outcome of which was a six-day suspension without pay for the leaders (55).

HOAC. The Cordoba strike of March 1975 by workers on behalf of the unemployed and to which Cirarda gave his moral support (56) involved a number of HOAC members. Moreover, the sense of triumph of HOAC at the victory of the demonstrators (their meeting was finally authorised and those detained were set free) is obvious in the militantly-worded report on the events, in language of a highly politicised register (57):

"Todo lo que la clase obrera

ha conseguido a lo largo

de su historia ha sido por

medio de la lucha, el esfuerzo

y el sacrificio. Nada le han

dado o regalado....Una vez más

se ha puesto de manifiesto

como el Sindicato no consigue

defender nuestros derechos

frente al capitalismo y pone

dificultades que nos reunamos....

Sigamos la lucha."

As in the case of many radical priests, <u>HOAC</u> members were often fined or imprisoned. In the demonstrations against unemployment in Granada in April-May 1975 already alluded to (58), Miguel Heredia, a <u>HOAC</u> militante, was fined 300,000 pesetas, along with Antonio Quitián (500,000) and Angel Aguado (400,000), priests and <u>consiliarios</u> of <u>HOAC</u>.

Also, the efforts of <u>HOAC</u> extended to living and other social conditions. It was pressure by <u>hoacistas</u> which led the authorities to provide services such as a fleet of refuse disposal lorries for the Tomillo district of Jaen (an area notorious for insanitary conditions) after a vigorous campaign (59), or a regular bus service for the outlying area of Cartuja at Granada (60). Also in the area of public transport, <u>HOAC</u> helped organise a boycott of buses in Granada in protest at a fare increase of fifty per cent on 1 July 1973; again, demands were met, with the provision of a more efficient fleet of buses. It was clear from the

final sentence of the report - "Pero lo fundamental: la lección aprendida de la solidaridad..." - that HOAC and those they worked with were taking on an increasingly politicised stance (61) in their tendency to see Christianity more and more as a means to the building of the new Jerusalem in practical everyday living, to the extent that the political at times appeared to enjoy more importance than the spiritual: - perhaps a significant hint of this is to be seen in the change of title of HOAC's organ from Boletín HOAC to Noticias Obreras.

While not manifesting the militancy of <u>HOAC</u>, other Church organisations such as <u>Cáritas</u> made great efforts to help improve the living conditions of the poor. The Easter collections directed to the provision of better homes in Cadiz organised by Dorado Soto were given to <u>Cáritas</u>. However, the same organisation also offered economic help to the families of detainees (usually convicted of having taken part in, or organised, labour troubles) who had found themselves without their major wage earner (62), while at the National Assembly of 1975 the eighth motion read as follows (63):

"Cáritas Española...apoyará...
la revisión de la situación penal
de aquellos que están recluidos
por la restricción de unos derechos
que ahora se tienden a reconocer
más plenamente, la abolición de las
discriminaciones motivadas por la
guerra civil y la solicitud de un

generoso gesto de clemencia en favor de todas las personas privadas de libertad."

The lay apostolate movements enjoyed the support and even the gratitude of those members of the hierarchy most influenced by the socially-orientated message of the Council, for their commitment to bring the message of Christ the Redeemer to the poor in all meanings of the phrase. Dorado Soto, when Bishop of Guadix-Baza and president of the Comisión Episcopal del Apostolado Seglar, spoke of their value to the Church in these terms (64):

"Yo senalaría la progresiva incorporación de los seglares a la acción de la Iglesia, que deberá continuar en puestos de cada vez mayor responsabilidad, con lo que, por otra parte, se podrá suplir el déficit de vocaciones sacerdotales."

### 6. The Church's spiritual influence.

The profound social changes which have taken place in Spain with the advent of the seventies have already been mentioned in the introductory historical perspective to this chapter. In light of the profound changes which the Church underwent in the period after the Second Vatican Council with the consolidation of post-conciliar innovations within the Church, it is interesting to examine whether, wherever possible, a changed society and changed Church was to have any effect, positive

or negative, on the Church's moral and spiritual influence. Was the new society more receptive to the spiritual teachings of a rejuvenated Church, or was the new society, now filled with the materialism of a 'consumer' philosophy, even more indifferent to the Church's teachings and cynical of the claims made by that Church to be utterly non-partisan in the area of politics?

That the Church in Andalusia was fully, aware of the complexities facing its pastoral mission is illustrated in an article by R, Canales (65) on the Seville Synod that was to take place in June: 1973:

"No es fácil la respuesta. Sobre todo si si tiene presente la complejidad del momento actual. La Iglesia como cuerpo social ha de ser comprendida hoy a partir del fenómeno que afecta a toda la sociedad: el cambio sociocultural. Sociológicamente hablando, este cambio se traduce, sobre todo, en enfrentamiento de mentalidades.

De ahí que para comprender a la Iglesia, en su verdadera complejidad sociológica, sea necesario tener muy en cuenta esta situación cultural enfrentada."

He added that these changes are evident in Seville itself (66):

"Tal vez Sevilla sea la expresión más acabada de esa Andalucía...

de la España de 'charanga y pandereta', hogar del sentimiento mediterráneo y expresión masiva del subdesarrollo peninsular....Pero Sevilla ha cambiado en los últimos años. Y con ella,

lógicamente, los sevillanos..."

The problem is made even more complex through the socio-cultural disparities which the new Church has to fuse or unify in its efforts to present the message of Christ as a message common to all (67):

"Los problemas que se perciben son muy distintos, e incluso para abarcarlos hay que clasificarlos y situarlos en las diversas perspectivas sociales. Hay una clase acomodada especialmente sensible a los problemas de urbanización de la ciudad. Para la clase media se presentan como urgentes la falta de viviendas y de escuelas. Para el mundo laboral el sentimiento de explotación e injusticia pelea con el afán de un falso consumo."

One of the most interesting parts of the article is the overt criticism of pietistic love of ritual and deep regret at the failings that may have existed in a past where <u>nacional-catolicismo</u> was the dominant religious feature (68):

"En unos y en otros domina una religiosidad de siglos expresada con notable superficialidad.

Católicos porque han sido
bautizados, tienen su expresión
religiosa más acabada en la
Semana Santa y en otras costumbres
religiosas sociales.... La gran
dosis de sentido religioso, de
relación con lo divino....no ha
fraguado suficientemente en unas
ideas claras sobre el sentido del
cristiano y de la Iglesia en la
sociedad."

The task ahead is realistically assessed: the mistakes of the past are clearly evident in Seville: "Fuertemente anclada en una religiosidad tradicional aparece como un pueblo por evangelizar" (69) which, as Andalusia's biggest diocese, may be taken for the situation in Andalusia as a whole,

Certainly, figures for religious practice in Malaga in the early seventies gleaned from a study of religous practice from the point of view of social class or employment of those examined would seem to support this view: the survey, compiled by the <u>Instituto de Sociología y Pastoral Aplicadas</u> (70) shows that whereas 52.4% of landowners and 50.4% of those in the professions went to Mass and Communion regularly, the figures were only 11.7% for farm labourers and 10.5% for other manual workers. Conversely, those who stated that they did not practise their religion at all included only 4.9% of landowners and 10.6% of those in the professions, but 23% of farm labourers

and 35% of manual workers. The figures, while fractionally better than the totals of 90% and more for people not practising their religion given for areas of Huelva province for the 1930's by J.Ordóñez Márquez (71), are basically consistent with others from different sources for the 1970's. Religious practice in Andalusia repeatedly showed averages lower than other parts of the country: according to C.Giner (72), whereas those fulfilling their Easter duties accounted for 80% in the north and 50% in Catalonia, the figure was often lower than 10% in the south. Again. R. Duocastella (73) states that whereas the Basque Country and Navarre had 14.6% of practising Catholics of all Spain while having only 7.1% of the population, Andalusia with 17.1% of the population had only 12.9% of the total number of practicantes. Although the charge could therefore be levelled at the Church that very little if any progress had been made in winning back certain sectors of the population to its fold, it must be pointed out that such a process normally can only occur over a long period of time, besides the fact that those areas of highest practice are normally those with the highest ratio of priests per capita of population. This problem has been discussed in the introduction,

A further problem for the Church was that the changes undergone by Spanish society from the sixties onwards had made that society as a whole more consumer-orientated and seemingly materialistic than ever before, with the result that it was possibly less inclined to the spiritual and

thereby tending to be more indifferent as a whole to the teachings and authority of the Church that is to say, that the problem of indifference to religion was not limited to the working-classes or to one particular region. In 1974, the results of a survey conducted in Seville showed that 43% of the interviewees felt that pre-marital sexual relations were not necessarily sinful (74), while figures for nullity of marriage showed a remarkable rise throughout the country from 88 in 1966 to 357 in 1974. Other recorded marital separations for the same period showed a rise from 1.275 to 3,341 (75). Both Church and society had undergone great changes since the first days of the Franco regime, and Franco was to die witnessing unparalleled innovations in a society and a Church which he had attempted to link together for almost four decades.

## 7. The death of Franco.

The tributes to Franco from Spanish Church leaders - Andalusian and others - were generous and expressed gratitude for the debt owed to the regime by a Church which had been saved from persecution by its efforts. Statements of praise made by members of the hierarchy linked with Andalusia included the following from Añoveros (76):

"...es, sin duda, un hombre para la historia; es también, y sobre todo, un hombre para Dios."

And from Cirarda:

"España ha cambiado su faz en

estos últimos cuarenta años...

Son hechos evidentes, acaecidos
durante los años de gobierno
de Franco."

González Moralejo gave the following accolade:

"Francisco Franco, cristiano,

creyente, iluminado cada vez

más por la luz de la fe...."

Bueno Monreal's obituary contained the following:

"Que Dios Padre acoja en su seno a su hijo Francisco y éste encuentre allí el sosiego definitivo de una vida tan intensa y tan extensa."

Such were the panegyrics afforded to Franco on his death by the bishops of the Church into whose bosom he had commended his soul before death. The above quotations, while limited to members of the Andalusian hierarchy for the purposes of this study, are nevertheless indicative of the feelings of the hierarchy as a whole, who spoke of him with the Christian love and sincere condolence one would expect of the princes of the Church.

In vivid contrast to these statements, <u>HOAC</u> made no mention whatsoever of Franco's death in its bulletins at the end of 1975, the only allusion to the passing of Franco being made in the most oblique way, namely a hope that the new government under King Juan Carlos would usher in the changes that many were hoping for. In fact, the only possible direct allusion to the previous regime is somewhat

sardonic in tone; commenting on the new King's declaration that justice is the cornerstone of peace, the article adds the following (77):

"Lo que equivale a decir que la paz es obra de la justicia y no de las medidas de orden público, como se ha afirmado con obras y con palabras hasta ahora."

These epitaphs on the founder of the regime which had ruled Spain for four decades demonstrated the gap which had developed between the hierarchy desirous of eschewing all political partidismo in their relations with the State in the years following the Council, and more militant groups attached to the Church who saw the message of the Council in terms which precluded compromise or taranconismo.

# CHAPTER FOUR BIBLIOGRAPHY.

- (1) Harrison, J., An economic history of modern

  Spain, Manchester University Press 1978, p.167.
- (2) op. cit., p. LXLVI of Introduction.
- (3) Brassloff, A., op.cit., p.90.
- (4) op. cit., pp.314-5.
- (5) Almerich, Aranguren, Duocastella, Lorente,
  Ruiz-Rico ed., Cambio Social y Religión en España,
  Barcelona 1975, pp. 55-56.
- (6) "Unpredictable Priests", The Economist, 25.9.71., no. 6,683, p.35.
- (7) The Tablet, 8.1.72., p.17.
- (8) Cooper, N., The Church: From Crusade to Christ-.
- (9) An example of this is the bold way in which interest in temporal matters is defended:

  "No podrá, pues, decirse...que un obispo o un sacerdote 'hacen política' cuando en virtud de su misión pastoral enjuician hechos, situaciones u obras de la sociedad civil desde la perspectiva de la fe...Pero tengan todos presente que el silencio por falsa prudencia, por comodidad o por miedo a posibles 'reacciones adversas' nos convertiría en cómplices de los pecados ajenos; seríamos pastores infieles a la misión que Cristo nos encomendó...."
- (10) Iribarren, J., op.cit., p.542.
- (11) López, A., <u>La Iglesia desde el Estado</u>, Madrid 1972, pp. 58-59.

- (12) ibid., p.70.
- (13) Almerich et al., ed., op.cit., pp.55-56.
- (14) Chao Rego, J., <u>La Iglesia en el Franquismo</u>, op.cit., pp.243-4.
- (15) Cooper, N., "The Church; From Crusade to Christianity", op.cit., p.78.
- (16) op.cit., p.334.
- (17) Canales, R., "¿Hacia dónde va la Iglesia de Sevilla?", Razón y Fe, May 1973, no.904, pp. 461-472.
- (18) El Ideal, 21.5.72., and reprinted by J.Angulo Uríbarri, in Documentos Socio-Políticos de Obispos Españoles, 1968-1972, Madrid 1972, pp. 102-5.
- (19) op.cit., p.254.
- (20) op.cit., pp.287-8.
- (21) ibid., p.310.
- (22) Boletín HOAC, April 1974, no. 638A, p.7.
- (23) Boletín HOAC, April 1975, no. 661, pp.16-17.
- (24) ibid., pp.18-19.
- (25) Boletín HOAC, 15-30 May 1975, no.664, pp.16-19.
- (26) See footnote 19.
- (27) <u>Boletín Oficial del Obispado de Cádiz y Ceuta</u>, April-May 1975, pp.137-143.
- (28) See footnotes 78-86.
- (29) Osuna, J.M., <u>La Novena Provincia Andaluza</u>,
  Barcelona 1973, p.24.
- (30) ibid., p.24.
- (31) See footnotes 80-83 of chapter three.
- (32) op.cit., pp.121-8.
- (33) op.cit., p.169.

- (34) Appended to the <u>Boletín Oficial del Obispado</u> de Cádiz y Ceuta, no.2,336, January 1975.
- (35) <u>Boletín Oficial del Obispado de Cádiz y Ceuta</u>, no. 2,337, April- May 1975, p.136.
- (36) Chao Rego, J., La Iglesia en el Franquismo, op.cit., p.244.
- (37) Petscen, S., op.cit., pp.158-9.
- (38) ibid...p.168.
- (39) Obispos del Sur, <u>El Catolicismo Popular en el Sur de España</u>, Madrid 1975, published by PPC.
- (40) See footnote 25.
- (41) op. cit., p.142.
- (42) Preston, P., "General Franco's Rearguard",
  New Society, 29.11.73., no.582, pp.519-521.
- (43) See footnote 25.
- (44) Boletín HOAC, 15-30 May 1975, no.664, pp.16-19.
- (45) ibid., pp.16-19.
- (46) Boletín HOAC, December 1974, no. 654A, p.6.
- (47) op. cit., pp.266-7.
- (48) ibid., p.271.
- (49) Petscen. S., op. cit., p.163.
- (50) Gil Delgado, F., op. cit., p.236.
- (51) Chao Rego, J., <u>La Iglesia en el Franquismo</u>, op. cit., p.212.
- (52) An example of open hostility between bishop and priest was the suspension of Fr. Wiberto Delso of the parish at Fabara by Archbishop Cantero Cuadrado of Zaragoza (formerly Bishop of Huelva), which provoked the resignation of some thirty priests as a sign of support for their colleague. (ibid., p.243).

- (53) Boletin HOAC, December 1972, no.606A, p.2.
- (54) Boletín HOAC, November 1974, no.652A; p.7.
- (55) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, February 1975, no.658A, p.6.
- (56) See footnote 23 of chapter three.
- (57) Boletin HOAC, April 1975, no. 661, pp.16-17.
- (58) See footnote 25.
- (59) Boletín HOAC, January 1974, no. 632A, p.6.
- (60) Boletín HOAC, April 1975, no. 662, p.14.
- (61) Boletín HOAC, July 1973, no. 620A, p.4.
- (62) Petschen, S., op. cit., p.187.
- (63) ibid., p.187.
- (64) Ya, 8.12.72.
- (65) op cit., p.461.
- (66) ibid.,p.,464.
- (67) ibid., pp.464-5.
- (68) ibid., p.465.
- (69) ibid., p.463.
- (70) Instituto de Sociología y Pastoral Aplicadas, (ISPA), <u>El Fenómeno Religioso y sus Condicionamientos Socioculturales</u>, Madrid 1972, p.183.
- (71) op. cit., p.84, p.87 footnote 1.
- (72) Giner, C., "España en vías de secularización", Mundo Social, no. 158, 1968, p. 26.
- in Almerich et al., op. cit., p.158.
- (74) Petscen, S., op. cit., pp. 193-4.
- (75) ibid., p. 180.
- (76) All these quotes are from R.Gómez Pérez, op cit., pp.315-6.
- (77) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, 15-30 December 1975, no. 678, p.3.

#### CHAPTER FIVE

The Church in Andalusia since Franco - its future.

The Historical Perspective.

Given the far-reaching and profound political changes in Spain since the death of Franco and the accession of Juan Carlos as Head of State of what was to become a constitutional monarchy and full parliamentary democracy, any study of the Church during the Franco regime must have as a form of epilogue an examination of the Church's attitude to these reforms and of its role in the new democratic state. The post-Franco era was to witness innovations resulting from new civic and political liberties, from which the Church itself was not exempt - indeed nowhere was this more so than in Andalusia, attested by the development of the Comunidades Populares de Andalucía, groups consisting of both priests and lay people who rejected the traditional position enjoyed by the Church and its priests in society, and who therefore wished to see a Church imbued with what they saw as the primitive purity of its early days, devoid of any Establishment connotations and desirous of translating the Gospel message into the reality of everyday living. Such a posture was largely similar to that of HOAC, but the difference between HOAC and Andalusia's comunidades populares - which, though Andalusian in origin, were to take root elsewhere in Spain - was that under Francoism HOAC had really only been able to function under the auspices of the official Church, while in the freer climate:

of the second half of the seventies these newer groups felt they were able to proclaim and exercise their mission without the protection or jurisdiction of the recognised Church. Some priests sympathetic to the cause of groups such as <u>HOAC</u> and the <u>comunidades</u> were to incur the wrath of the more conservative members of the hierarchy, while others enjoyed varying degrees of episcopal support, as will be seen - thereby exemplifying the continuing divisions within the Church after Franco's death.

The most profound change experienced by the Church as an institutional entity was its virtual disestablishment, by its own consent, by means of the new acuerdos signed in the Vatican on 3 January 1978 - the culmination of much diplomatic activity that had even included a visit to Pope Paul VI by Juan Carlos in February 1976 (1) - a renunciation of old privileges welcomed by the Church, as Ecclesia itself declared (2), for in rejecting privilege the Church was gaining independence and therefore freedom. The concise declaration of article 16,3 of the new constitution ratified by Cortes on 27 December 1978 -"Ninguna confesión tendrá carácter estatal" - was, in a way, an ironic echo of Azaña's claim almost half a century previously that "España ha dejado de ser católica", only this time the Church was a willing accomplice and not an unwilling victim.

However, it would be erroneous to assume that the return of a healthy democracy was also the immediate antidote to Spain's economic ills, Andalusia's in particular. The chronic under-development of the

area, already evidenced by data in the previous chapters, was to continue unabated, with Andalusia's per capita income 27% lower than the national average. This led to human suffering, and many Andalusians' resorted to all sorts of means to focus attention on the region's problems: in 1979, twenty-four alcaldes from Seville provinces locked themselves in the Seville Diputación as a sign of protest at the rural unemployment (3), while on 14 August 1980 in the village of Marinaleda, near Seville, began a mass hunger-strike which was to win international coverage (4). Moreover, the post-Franco years were to witness in Spain a renaissance of regional identity, a desire for autonomy, not only of the Catalans and Basques, but of the Andalusians themselves, culminating in a referendum held on 28 February 1980 where all but two provinces (Almeria and Jaen) obtained the necessary majority for the statute to become law - which in turn caused great polemical debate between the government and the pro-autonomy faction, as technically all provinces were to gain a majority for the autonomy statute to be approved, though the issue was finally resolved in October the same year.

The death of Franco, then, was to presage an era of great change and innovation in Spain, while in Andalusia the traditional problems accruing from socio-economic under-development were to exist side by side with the new philosophies of democratic Spain. The role of the Church throughout all this activity, together with tentative forecasts of the future, is described and discussed in these final pages.

### 1. The hierarchy and political change.

As political change in Spain involved the growing desire for regional autonomy in areas including Andalusia, this examination of the Andalusian bishops' attitude to the said changes includes their attitude to the autonomy question.

(a) The advent of democracy.

## (a) The advent of democracy.

In the uncertain lacuna between the death of Franco on 20 November 1975 and the elections of 15 June 1977 in which the right-of-centre Unión de Centro Democrático came to power, the Church was manifestly aware of the importance of making any decision concerning its role in the new situation - this concern being evidenced by the emphasis put on the theme La Iglesia ante el momento actual in the twenty-fourth plenary assembly held in Madrid 23-28 February 1976. A questionnaire on the subject was sent to all the archbishoprics in Spain, yet only four were to reply in any detail, two of these being both the Andalusian archbishoprics (Seville and Granada) thereby demonstrating that the Andalusian hierarchy, more than most others in Spain, viewed this matter with special attention (5). The position adopted by the Church was that of a diplomatic observer at pains to maintain impartiality on the new political spectrum that was forming for the forthcoming elections, and Cardinal Tarancón went so far as to publicly voice doubts as to the desirability or efficacy of a Christian Democrat party (6).

Bueno Monreal, in a Maundy Thursday pastoral in April 1977, stated that the elections constituted a historic moment for Spain, and that Catholics were to be guided by the Christian precepts of love, brotherhood and tolerance in any decision they made at the polls. In line with the thinking of Tarancón, he emphasised that such an attitude did not necessarily preclude or endorse any one particular party (7):

"Los católicos saben que tienen que participar en las tareas de buscar el bien para todos sus ciudadanos...y saben también que pueden optar, según sus ideales sociales y políticos, por alguno de los programas y partidos que no se opongan a su fe ni contradigan a la conciencia cristiana."

The statement is indicative of the general thinking of the hierarchy, in that the only guide suggested for the Christian is one's own conscience.

Infantes Florido - his views can be regarded as relevant to Andalusia, in that, although Bishop of the Canaries, he was soon to be transferred to Cordoba - emphasised the need for true objectivity and tolerance, making no secret of his joy at the disappearance of the dictatorship and imploring all to go to the polls "sin ánimo de revancha"(8). Cirarda Lachiondo also published a Lenten pastoral in which he reminded Christians of their right and duty to analyse critically and soberly the programmes

and manifestos of all parties (9). Again, care was taken to avoid either implicit support or rejection of any area of the political spectrum, and he was thus possibly more circumspect than Infantes Florido in that no mention was made of the previous regime.

The result of the election - a victory for Suárez and his <u>UCD</u> - was received by the Church without comment, the only pronouncements being ones of satisfaction at the successful transition from dictatorship to democracy. Indeed, among the Andalusian bishops, José María Cirarda Lachiondo declared that the election was a victory for the Spanish people in their quest for a new system of government - "Parece, en fin, que el pueblo español ha iniciado en las recientes elecciones caminos de renovación y de justicia" (10) - which was also echoed by Rafael González Moralejo, Bishop of Huelva, who added that the Church was now to forever remain outside of politics (11):

"....parece claro que todo el cambio político culminado en las recientes elecciones ha puesto de relieve ya el propósito de la Iglesia de mantenerse alejada de la política de los partidos y de no apoyar su acción apostólica en el favor de la autoridad civil."

The proposed new Constitution - finally ratified in December 1978 - was of special interest to the Church in that it contained proposals for the end of

confesionalidad. All bishops consulted by Ecclesia on the question were in agreement with Tarancón's line of thinking — namely, that this particular proposal corresponded to the ideals laid down in the Second Vatican Council of a Church totally independent of the State and therefore of any one political philosophy. Among the Andalusian bishops interviewed, Montero Moreno (auxiliary at Seville) was particularly anxious to point out that aconfesionalidad did not necessarily mean that the Church was to avoid socio-political matters at all costs — on the contrary, he felt that the Church had a very real role to play in various areas of life in the new Spain (12):

"Todos recordamos, porque han pasado muy pocos años, cómo ....se nos pedía a los obispos que no fuéramos 'perros mudos', que ....'comprometiéramos' en una valiente defensa de los derechos humanos en nuestro país....¿Por qué hemos de enmudecer ahora, en el momento preciso en el que toda nuestra sociedad, con voluntad de concordia, intenta construir su futuro sin excluir a nadie?"

The words echoed those of his Primate, who had stated his wish for a Church independent of the State but which should nevertheless be considered as still having a part to play in the building of a new

socio-political reality (13). Similarly, the bishops refused to commit themselves to any one particular faction during the elections of March,1979. They did, however, issue a communiqué to all Spaniards to use their vote in the cause of the democratic process, the most outspoken Andalusian bishops in this respect being Bueno Monreal and Infantes Florido (14).

## (b) The advent of Andalusian autonomy.

If, in the years immediately following the death of Franco, the hierarchy as a body and on an individual basis refrained from indulging in any political polemic, the one exception to this attitude was the posture of the Andalusian bishops towards the autonomy question; for, if they tended to be circumspect as regards the national situation, they made no secret of their support for autonomy for Andalusia, thereby showing themselves to have attained a degree of politicisation possibly unmatched by any other body of Spanish bishops, in that this meant that they were operating in an area where theological and moral implications had very little, if any, significance. A pro-autonomy demonstration was organised for 4 December 1977, the so-called Día de Andalucía, which was to be described thus by Vida Nueva (15):

"La Iglesia andaluza se ha solidarizado con las manifestaciones masivas pro-autonomía de una de las regiones más postergadas de nuestro

país."

This support was perhaps most eloquently given by Bishop Manuel Buxarrais Ventura of Malaga, in the following extract of a statement issued the week before the <u>Día de Andalucía</u>, which was to herald the beginning of episcopal support for Andalusian regionalist aspirations (16):

"Ante la próxima celebración del Día de Andalucía, el obispo de Málaga y su Consejo Presbiteral se solidarizan com quienes vienen trabajando para que al pueblo andaluz le sea reconocida su personalidad jurídica, sus derechos autonómicos...Nos sentimos integrados en el pueblo andaluz, en su defensa y en la promoción de cuanto es desarrollo total de sus hombres .... Es necesario despertar en todos la conciencia propia de sus valores, de sus capacidades y la urgencia de organizarse comunitaria y responsablemente para la búsqueda y desarrollo de soluciones justas a sus problemas....Al Estado y a los más favorecidos les recordamos que tienen el deber, no solamente por amor, sino por

justicia, de invertir sus
bienes para el desarrollo y
bienestar de nuestro pueblo."

The philosophy of regional autonomy to areas such as Andalusia which for long had laim dormant and underdeveloped under the centralisation of many decades imposed from Castile was to appear steadily more attractive to a growing proportion of the population — indeed, demands for the right to embrace or reject autonomy grew to such an extent that the Suárez administration saw little alternative but to grant wishes for a regional plebescite to be held on the matter, the day for referendum being 28 February 1980. The Andalusian bishops made manifest their support for autonomy in a joint communiqué issued from Cordoba on 2 February 1980 (17):

"Los obispos de Andalucía nos sentimos solidarios con la esperanza colectiva que está viviendo nuestro pueblo...El paso hacia una unidad de convivencia más amplia que la de cada una de las ocho provincias puede contribuir, sin duda, al redescubrimiento de nuestra identidad y de nuestros valores como pueblo, y a superar la inercia, el aislamiento y la desesperanza, que, junto a otros

factores externos, han hecho de nuestra tierra una zona subdesarrollada ...el proceso autonómico pone en juego importantes opciones de futuro sobre nuestros problemas endémicos..."

It was an approach shared by Vida Nueva itself hence the magazine's heading " Andalucía mía! Pide justicia y le dan limosnas" to a special pliego devoted to Andalusia the week before the referendum (18). It was also a view publicly shared by González Moralejo in Huelva, who endorsed the declaration by his fellow bishops by publishing a paper by José María Javierre (once editor of Correo de Andalucía) on the subject which was in turn issued to all parishes of the diocese for public consumption (19). The aspirations of the pro-autonomy lobby were frustrated by a technicality, however, with Almeria, and, it was then thought, Jaen, failing to record the necessary 50% of possible votes in favour because of high abstention. Furthermore, moves to change the Ley Orgánica del Referéndum so that the referendum could be repeated in Almeria (the government had rechecked the Jaen figures and confirmed that the necessary majority had been achieved in Jaen on 12 April) were thwarted by one vote in the Cortes on 12 June, with the PNV (Partido Nacionalista Vasco) deputies absent. The question was finally resolved by a vote of approval in parliament on 24 October 1980.

## 2. The hierarchy and social questions.

## (a) <u>Unemployment</u>.

With unemployment in Andalusia rising to twice the national average, thereby exacerbating an already difficult situation for the poorer members of Andalusian society, it is not surprising that it should be the main social concern of the hierarchy, the leading exponent in this respect again being Bishop Buxarrais of Malaga, who publicly fasted in April 1976 with a group of unemployed workers at the Church of <u>Dulce Nombre de María</u>, with the following message of support (20):

"Sois cristianos y sé que, como tales, vuestro ayuno tiene, ante todo, un sentido religioso. Por ser cristianos no es un atentado ni a vuestra salud ni a vuestras vidas. Vosotros creéis en la vida como un don de Dios y precisamente porque creéis en la vida, la vuestra y la de los pobres expuesta tantas veces en peligro, como en el caso del paro forzoso, por eso ayunáis."

The bishop's individual action was to precede a joint pastoral by the Andalusian episcopacy (together with the bishops of Badajoz, Murcia and the Canaries) issued the following month (21), in which the harm done by unemployment to personal, family and community life was stressed, together with strong criticism of the socio-economic structure of

Andalusian society - "los defectos de unas estructuras socio-económicas que redundan en perjuicio de los más débiles" - and also of the state for having allowed such unequal development within Spain to have occurred.

The following year, in September, the Andalusian bishops met at El Puerto de Santa María, near Cadiz, where they decided to do all in their power to help improve the region's disastrous unemployment situation (22):

"...apoyar las medidas contra el paro y resaltar como positiva la toma de conciencia regional para que Andalucía desempeñe su papel con plenitud de derechos y deberes en el conjunto de los pueblos de España..."

They also reiterated their desire to remain free of any political categorisation - nevertheless, it must be pointed out that, given that the main support for subsidies to combat unemployment was at that time coming from the socialist opposition in the <u>Cortes</u>, charges of politicization being made by Catholics opposed to this social interest of the Church were perhaps not unjustified.

As one of the most direct consequences of unemployment is emigration, two months later, to mark the <u>Día de las Migraciones</u> set for 27 November, the <u>Comisión Episcopal de Migraciones</u> made a statement deploring the lack of real positive action taken to avoid the situation, and called upon all Christians

to translate the Gospel message of help for the unfortunate into a concrete reality (23). Significantly for Andalusia, the seven-man commission contained two Andalusian bishops, namely González Moralejo (the president of the commission) and Manuel Casares Hervás, Bishop of Almeria.

Moralejo as the cause of delinquency and drugaddiction by the young, stated by him in a pastoral
in 1979 on paro juvenil (24). His warnings to heed
the desperation of the young unemployed - "Que no
los empujéis a la frustración" - was directed as
much to the Christian community at large and to
businessmen (whom he accused of lacking entrepreneurial spirit for the development of wealth)
as to parents, whom, he maintained, were to understand and attempt to tolerate any ensuing rebelliousness from their unemployed children.

## (b) Working conditions.

The only other area of a social nature which underwent particular scrutiny by the Andalusian hierarchy in the years following the Franco regime was that of working conditions — though this did not necessarily mean that housing conditions and education ceased to be regarded as priorities by the hierarchy: rather they saw these problems as being part and parcel of a general poverty caused by massive unemployment. One of the most prominent interventions by the Andalusian hierarchy into industrial affairs concerned the troubles at the

Cadiz shipyards, where workers complained (a) of general working conditions, (b) of the insecurity of not knowing whether their jobs were going to continue - yet again, the spectre of unemployment loomed large - and (c) of the apparent refusal of the authorities to enter into meaningful negotiations. The diocese of Cadiz publicly declared its support for the shipyard workers and its determination to ensure that conditions would be improved and jobs safeguarded as much as possible (25).

## 3. The hierarchy and Church affairs.

The arrival of democracy was also to have various effects on the Church's spiritual mission and ecclesiastical organisation, the most evident feature of the latter being the freedom granted to the Church to appoint bishops without the privilegio de presentación, an agreement finally reached in July 1976. Of the eleven bishops directly appointed by the Pope that year, one was in Andalusia, namely Bishop Ignacio Noguer Carmona of Guadix-Baza, who took formal possession of his see on 11 September. The steady fall in vocations since the mid-sixties - already pointed out in some detail by commentators such as S.Petschen (26) - was a source of concern to the Church. A practical solution, in practical terms, to a shortage of priests could be a lay deaconate, concluded a conference of Andalusian bishops in Huelva in February 1977 (27), while the diocese of Guadix-Baza, in 1979, devoted the year to re-establishing the diocesan seminary, with twelve

young people expressing interest in the priest-hood (28).

The decision of many priests to leave the priesthood exacerbated this situation, a decision which often prompted criticism and even hostility from both clerical and lay quarters, who tended to regard such priests as failures. Ramén Buxarrais Ventura, Bishop of Malaga, however, made manifest his sympathy and understanding towards them in a document published on 23 February 1977 (29), in which, far from criticising their decision, the bishop emphasised the rich role that such people can play in the life of the Church at lay level, approaching their decision with compassion and vision:

"Con vuestras esposas e hijos continuáis en el empeño de seguir a Jesucristo.....La Iglesia de Málaga necesita seglares conscientes y activos, para que ni los presbíteros, ni los religiosos, ni el mismo obispo monopolicen la animación de la fe..."

He ended his message with words of love and concern which typified the compassionate approach of this bishop to those whom he felt were in need of solace or support:

"Me ofrezco a vosotros como amigo y Pastor de la Comunidad cristiana que os quiere y a la

que, me consta, vosotros también amáis. Agradezco vuestra atención. Para vuestras esposas e hijos un cariñoso saludo. Para vosotros un fuerte abrazo del amigo de siempre."

Buxarrais showed the same pastoral concern in a statement on unmarried mothers, emphasising the duty the Church has for instructing society in the virtues of tolerance and acceptance, and criticising the normal solution of a marriage which is often doomed to failure (30) - "Es preferible" una madre soltera que un matrimonio 'nulo' o, lo que es peor, un aborto" - while adding that he felt that the Church could do more in the field of marriage counselling by approaching those marriages which had failed in a less dogmatic frame of mind. In the post-Franco period, it is Buxarrais who tends to be the prominent voice of the Andalusian Church in both the social and spiritual field thereby making himself a worthy successor as Bishop of Malaga to figures such as Herrera and Benavent - though the later appointment of the charismatic Infantes Florido at Cordoba was to mean that Buxarrais was by no means to be a lone voice in this respect.

## 4. Andalusia's priests.

If the later years of Francoism were to see many priests more ready than their ecclesiastical superiors to engage in polemical discussion and

criticism of social injustice in Spanish, and particularly Andalusian, society, the immediate post-Franco years were really a continuation of this trend, with several priests (particularly worker-priests) being active in the area of living conditions. The stance of such priests, therefore, is more partidista, a politicised theology of of socio-spiritual liberation of the so-called Iglesia Revolucionaria rather than the apolitical taranconismo claimed by the Iglesia Reformista.

The same day as Bishop Buxarrais' public fast with unemployed people in Malaga, a demonstration in support of the unemployed and led by the Jesuit worker-priest, José Godoy, was broken up by police in Granada Cathedral (31). Leaflets carried a statement of support for the unemployed and of determination to fight for an improvement in the living standards of the region as a whole - "...a que Andalucía salga del subdesarrollo, la incultura y la margenación que viene padeciendo durante tantos años" - and Godoy and the three young seminarians with him ware detained and later freed after questioning.

From reports of such incidents in publications such as the relatively impartial <u>Vida Nueva</u> or the more politicised <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, the majority of the priests involved were worker-priests shunning, as they would claim, the 'professional priesthood' for what they considered to be a priesthood more faithful to that of the early Church in that it attempted to share the life-style of the parishioners,

but which obviously ran the risk of assuming a political militancy. Some of these worker-priests are in the professions, mostly teaching - for example, José Antonio Morillas in Granada, who in an interview with the writer declared that "los curas tienen que trabajar si quieren estar más cerca del pueblo"(32) - while others have opted for skilled manual jobs, such as Alfonso Sola at Almeria, who works in the day as a stone-mason in the working-class suburb of Piedras Redondas, using his flat as a small centre for religious services and discussion(33).

Perhaps one of the most striking examples of all is a worker-priest known as Diamantino who chose to be a jornalero in the pueblo of Los Corrales, to better experience, he argues, the poverty of his flock (34) - though his decision has also had practical consequences in the shape of the founding, with his guidance, of a small brick-making cooperative. Commitment to this sector of society and those critical of the authorities for allowing it to develop necessarily had political overtones in a region with the problems and socio-economic contrasts of Andalusia, an example of this being the attempt by Alfonso Sola to make a speech against the forces of law and order at the funeral service of the student Javier Verdejo who was shot on Almeria beach in August 1976 while painting anti-Francoist slogans on walls (35) - though Sola was stopped from making his speech by the officiating priest of San Pedro church .

Any stand taken by a priest usually had the support of his bishop - it has been seen that in the last years of Francoism bishops such as Benavent Escuín and Anoveros Ataún did not hesitate to defend their priests from charges of "hacer política" whenever they felt it necessary. But, this was not always so: indeed, one incident occurred near Jaen, in the barrio Santa Bárbara de Linares, where according to HOAC - and the incident is not corroborated elsewhere - the bishop, Miguel Peinado Peinado, not only failed to give support to a priest who had aroused the anger of local elements opposed to his work for the poor (such as the promotion of an Asociación de Vecinos), but actually sided with his detractors and had the priest, Tomás Rivas, transferred elsewhere (36).

It would, however, be misleading to end this section on Andalusia's priests with an allusion to sacerdotal - episcopal hostility. Priests interviewed in the diocese of Almeria for instance, discounted the suggestion that innovatory thinking at parish level raised ire or even suspicion in the bishop's palace. However, there was widespread agreement, from José Amat Cortés in the parish of Santiago in Almeria city centre to Enrique Silva in the parish of La Virgen del Rosario at the developing holiday resort of Roquetas del Mar, that bishops often became more progressive simply because they had to be, pressurised by what Enrique Silva called "el empuje de la base" (37).

The last-named priest, indeed, had introduced a radical concept of the <u>iglesia base</u> within the structure of his parish, in that in 1972 he had invited a team of the order <u>Hermanos del Evangelio</u> (led by a French worker-priest and consisting of three Americans, two Italians and some Spaniards) to live and work with the <u>marginados</u> living a gypsy-type existence in the nearby countryside, celebrating Mass in their homes.

### 5. HOAC in Andalusia.

HOAC was particularly active in the area of political and social liberties in the period during the run-in to the 1977 elections, defending the rights of the previously illegal opposition against attempted repression by those sympathetic to the old guard, both in Andalusia and elsewhere. An example of HOAC's links with the emerging opposition occurred in May 1977 in the village of Alhama, near Granada, where HOAC defended the right of the local branch of the Partido Socialista Obrero Español (PSOE) to hold a public meeting in defiance of a ban imposed by the local mayor (38). At the same time, HOAC's involvement with social injustices did not diminish - indeed, HOAC saw social development and political liberty as being inextricably linked, HOAC's most forthright criticism of the forces of law and order being in August 1977, when a peaceful demonstration near Carmona (Seville) against living and working conditions ended with one dead and several injured when the security forces intervened (39).

The plight of the <u>jornalero</u> on the Andalusian estates also continued being a cause of concern, and occupations of areas of land in Cadiz and Seville provinces in February 1978 under the organisation of the <u>Sindicato de Obreros</u> enjoyed great publicity in the <u>HOAC</u> bulletins. But <u>HOAC</u> was not the only group with Church links dedicated to evolving society to the absolute ideals of the Christian message: the <u>Comunidades Populares</u> de Andalucía held their first ever Conference 23-25 July 1977 in Granada, and their raison d'être and subsequent development merit some detailed analysis, especially as regards comparison with HOAC.

#### 6. The Comunidades Populares de Andalucía.

A year after Franco's death, the Spanish sociological publication FOESSA (40) was to remark that the most salient recent innovation in Spanish Catholicism was the birth and growth of 'base' groups who rejected the institutionalised aspect of the traditional Church and thereby attempted, not only to influence society with th teachings of a socialist-orientated view of the Gospel (as in the case of HOAC), but also to influence the very fabric of the Iglesia Institución by relegating its rituals to the areas of everyday living and adapting its traditional precepts of theology to a more spontaneous outpouring of a less dogmatised spirituality. The theological nature of the comunidades can be seen in their origins; their founders had

taken part in the Semana de Teología at Malaga in July 1976 (41), and the first items under discussion at their first conference in Granada the following year approached the question of Church and Society from a strictly 'theological' rather than 'social' angle, such as themes on different ways of celebrating the Eucharist, the merits of Baptism of very young children, and the Christian ideal in marriage (42). However, the conference also examined the role of the comunidades in society, and came to the conclusion that "el compromiso político del cristiano sólo puede ir en una línea anticapitalista" (43) an attitude which again may attract accusations of a left-wing, and therefore political, bias. There therefore exists the very real danger of reducing the theological to the political, as J.M.Castillo, Professor of Theology, was to point out (44):

"...a mí me da la impresión
que en muchos casos existe
el peligro real y nada
imaginario de una auténtica
'reducción' de la fe cristiana
a determinados planteamientos
políticos."

The writer goes on to say that a movement concerned with translating the Gospel message of love and justice into the reality of everyday living necessarily runs this risk, despite the statement by the comunidades in the final

communiqué at the meeting that the movement rejected any idea of alignment with one political party (45) - certainly, for Castillo the appearance of the Andalusian <u>blanquiverde</u> on the altar did nothing to allay such fears (46):

"En el Encuentro de Granada hubo cosas que me molestaron.

Por ejemplo, que la bandera andaluza se pusiera sobre el altar de la Eucaristía; o el que al terminar la celebración un grupo de gente entonara la 'Internacional'."

Certainly, such incidents are an ironic reminder of the <u>nacional-catolicismo</u> of the past, a form of religion which the participants at Granada would presumably reject totally for the fusion of the spiritual with the political.

Another problem concerns the relationship of such groups with the ecclesiastical hierarchy. A philosophy bent on returning to the pristine simplicity of the first Christian groups, or so they would argue, must necessarily question a hierarchical institution having a power base within the established framework of society; as Castillo again points out (47):

"...lo que separa y crea el abismo entre Iglesia oficial, por una parte, y grupos comunitarios populares, por otra, no es propiamente lo doctrinal, sino la

forma fundamental de vivir el evangelio. Porque está visto que la Iglesia oficial está empeñada a seguir siendo una gran institución de servicios religiosos en la que tenga cabida el mayor número de gente ...De ahí que la Iglesia oficial tiende a ser tolerante, de hecho, y hasta 'legitimadora' del orden establecido..."

Remarking that the present institutionalised Church was not what Christ had ordained, Castillo correspondingly feels sympathy for the aims of the <u>comunidades</u>, while mindful of the attendant risks (underlined words being italicised in the original ) (48):

"Es verdad que la Iglesia institucional habla de esas cosas, en términos más o menos generales. Pero el hecho es que no ofrece ese modelo de convivencia y de solidaridad.

Y ahí está la gran intuición que, con todos los fallos que se quiera, están teniendo los grupos comunitarios. El peligro está em que un día se llegue de verdad a la 'escisión'. Dios quiera que en todos haya sensatez y paciencia."

There are, according to Castillo, grounds for thinking that a wide gap exists between the way of thinking of these grupos de base and the hierarchy, not only in Andalusia but throughout Spain - "en la práctica, buena parte de la jerarquía española se desentiende del gran moviimiento de comunidades cristianas"(49) -citing as proof the fact that only one of all the Andalusian bishops who had been invited decided to attend the meeting at Granada, this being Buxarrais, Bishop of Malaga. The news of the bishop's attendance at the meeting was received by the participants with joyful appreciation (50). As he was the only Andalusian bishop present, moreover, his opinions on the event are of great importance and significance. Writing in the early hours of the morning after spending the first day at the meeting - he had had to return to Malaga unexpectedly - Buxarrais wrote of the doubts and optimism he experienced through being there, a state of mind perhaps best summed up in the headline of his letter to the comunidades printed in full in Vida Nueva, Me habéis dejado un sabor agridulce (51). Among his criticisms - stated, it must be added, in language of tolerance and humility - the following appeared to be particularly emphasised: a lack of detailed preparation with regard to theological themes; the presence of a large number of curiosos with no permanent or deep commitment to the Christian message; a lack of prayer, making the event more like a political than a spiritual or religious gathering - "Como

me preguntó un turista, no sabremos en que se distingue una asamblea sindical o de partido, de una asamblea cristiana"(52), in the bishop's words; and - another area where his language reflects great concern - the 'quasi-separatist' approach of many of the participants, whom, he felt, tended to regard the movement almost as a substitute for the Church, rather than complementing it. His warning on this point is worded thus (53):

"...creo que se detectaron
rebrotes de 'ruptura' peligrosa.
Y eso tanto en las ponencias
como en los pequeños grupos y
asambleas menores. Es grave."

It must be emphasised that Buxarrais found much of potential value in the assembly. He was particularly struck by the evangelising fervour of the groups and their commitment to translating the Gospel message of love and justice to the socio-economic reality of Andalusia. Nevertheless, while not wishing to emphasise a negative note, it is interesting that Buxarrais' main reservations should coincide with those of Castillo, namely the dangers of politicisation of theology and of schismatic tendencies. At the same time, both Castillo and Buxarrais share the optimistic view that, if properly organised and guided, these movements may have a lot to offer the Church - the bishop's criticisms are not made in any high-handed or paternalistic manner, but in the language of a humble and intimate friend (the document ends with "un abrazo") - and Castillo, while mindful of the

theological dangers and suspicious of the political overtones, sees the <u>comunidades</u> as an interesting, and perhaps exciting, development within the Church (54):

"...es innegable que el
Encuentro celebrado este
verano en Granada ha
venido a poner de manifiesto,
entre otras cosas, que la
vitalidad de la fe que
expresan estos grupos es
mucho más fuerte de lo que
algunos se imaginan...He
aquí, en mi opinión, lo
nuevo y esperanzador que
está surgiendo entre nosotros."

Nor is the movement narrowly based: the first meeting at Granada attracted seven hundred and sixteen people from all provinces of the region - ranging from more than two hundred from Malaga to only three from Almeria, with twelve observers from outside (55) - and while students and teachers between them accounted for almost half of the participants, almost a fifth were classed as <u>obreros</u>, a not inconsiderable total defying charges, the group would claim, of social elitism(56). Sexes were almost equally divided, with males accounting for slightly over half of those present (57). In view of the breadth of base of the movement, and its determination to organise itself by frequent contact - meetings tend to take place at least once a year and sometimes

more - it would appear to be by no means a transient phenomenon.

The comunidades are one of several groups of varying size proliferating within or on the borders of the Church which have appeared within recent years. Some, while not enjoying the publicity or attaining the growth of the comunidades, have attempted to emphasise some aspect of the faith which they feel has suffered neglect, and are centered mostly around Madrid and Catalonia, the largest of these being the Comunidades Catecumenales and Comunidades de la Renovación Carismática (58). Perhaps the group next in importance and size to the comunidades in Andalusia is Ekumene, based in Fuentes de Andalucía in the province of Seville and devoted to an apostolate of creating work for the poor for both their material and spiritual gain, with the money received from their efforts being shared throughout the group (59). As the name of the group suggests, it is not limited to Catholics, though they comprise the majority of participants.

#### 7. Schismatics in Andalusia.

The dangers of schism within the Church arising from the birth and growth of groups such as the <a href="mailto:comunidades">comunidades</a> has already been mentioned as part of the reservations of Buxarrais and Castillo. Such possible misunderstandings, however, would occur due to the view, of such radical groups, of the Church being over-conservative. What is interesting

about a group centred near Seville is that it has declared itself totally separated from the official Church for precisely the opposite reason that is to say, that it considers the post-conciliar Church to be no longer true to the traditions and teachings of Catholicism. The group is based at Palmar de Troya, near where an apparition of Our Lady is supposed to have appeared to four young children on 30 March 1968. Despite efforts by Bueno Monreal to dismiss the children's claims or to at least play down the situation, the area has become quite well known. It was there that Clemente Domínguez Gómez, a pilgrim to the spot, claimed to have been told by God to found an order los Carmelitas de la Santa Faz - and to establish it there, under his own jurisdiction and quite separate from the 'mistaken' Church of Vatican II. Condemnation by Bueno Monreal was followed by excommunication by Rome. At the time of writing, the group is about one hundred strong, with Dominguez the self-appointed Cardinal Archbishop who, he claimed, was told by God that he was the rightful successor of Pope Paul VI (60). Repeated warnings not to associate with the group were given by Bueno Monreal, the most extensive being a pastoral of 15 December 1976 (61). The existence of this group is an interesting example of the varying forces at work in religious circles in Andalusia, as elsewhere, since the reforms of Vatican II. It is indeed ironic that the modern Iglesia Institución, while criticising, or certainly distrusting, the

innovations of the <u>comunidades</u> and other groups (62) should at the time be pilloried by the followers of Domínguez for what they consider to be the same reason.

# 8. The future - possible developments for the Andalusian Church.

Any attempt to forecast future developments, especially in a situation where both Church and Society are in a state of flux, is fraught with difficulties. It is only in the light of past developments and shifts of attitude that any projection into the future is possible, and then. necessarily, in the most tentative way. In the course of this study we have seen how the evolution of Catholicism in Spain, with particular reference to Andalusia, has been dependent on both outside or external events - such as the traumas of persecution before and during the Civil War and subsequent gratitude to its liberators, with an accompanying tendency to be somewhat inwardlooking for the psychological shock of Vatican II and the revision of attitudes this was to bring about (these being the two outstanding influences) - and a self-questioning and self-analysis which, we have seen, was to begin before the Council (contrary to general belief) but which was to develop as a result of the Council. All this later development was taking place against a background of unprecedented social change whereby Spain was fast acquiring all those aspects associated with

a consumer society, change which was to grow apace with the disappearance of the dictatorship.

But the most devastating influences were to be those of the Council. The shock that its sociallyorientated theology was to have on a regime and hierarchy accustomed to a Catholicism "en su expresión más tridentina y nacionalista", to use the words of A. de Miguel (63), was considerable, to say the least. Moreover, in Andalusia, perhaps more than anywhere else in Spain because of the striking socio-economic inbalances prevailing, the concept of Catholicism as a vehicle of social change was to develop, not only into a desire by the hierarchy to reject the privileges of the Iglesia integrista, but also the desire of groups of a radical nature such as the comunidades to reject the non-political stance of the Iglesia reformista. Rejection of the elitist position enjoyed by the Church in the days of nacional-catolicismo has necessarily entailed a change in status and attitude, with the Church no longer a somewhat remote institution demanding obedience, but instead a personalised faith seeing its function as being to serve others and not to be served by them.

In its role as a force for unity and love within society - which was expressed at the assembly which opted for <u>desenganche</u> - the Church will have to continue the posture or approach of <u>taranconismo</u> if it is to develop its socially-based theology without wishing to compromise itself at the same time with any one political faction. If this delicate

balance is not maintained, there is the very real danger of an over-politicised theology such as that propounded by Comín, González Ruiz or the comunidades. Perhaps this fine balance between commitment to social justice but rejection of political partidismo was best highlighted recently by the attitude of the Church before the recent elections of late 1982 which were virtually certain to bring the socialist PSOE of Felipe González to power; an illustration from an Andalusian context is the statement at a conference in Cordoba by Archbishop González Martín at the beginning of the election campaign (64):

"Yo pediría a un Gobierno
Socialista mucho respeto
en las exigencias de la
convivencia de unos con
otros, y que en valores
religiosos no invaden un
campo que no les corresponde.
En todo lo demás, yo no
entro. Pero en los aspectos
culturales y sociales donde
se manifiesta la fe,...el
hombre tiene el derecho de
ser respetado."

The victory of González's <u>PSOE</u> at the polls was met by no comment from church leaders, either nationally or in Andalusia, except for a few general statements of satisfaction at the peaceful and orderly way in which the elections took place.

However - and this again shows how the Church, while avoiding any political polemic, is to continue to denounce openly and unreservedly injustice or immorality in the social field - the bishops as a body were to condemn the planned bill legalising abortion in the <u>Cortes</u>. The document drawn up by the <u>Comisión Episcopal</u> was entitled <u>La vida y el aborto</u>, and among its condemnation was the following (65):

"No podrá escapar a la calificación moral de homicidio lo que hoy se llama aborto provocado o, de forma encubierta, interrupción voluntaria del embarazo. Porque es verdad que el hombre transmite la vida, pero ni la crea ni es dueño de ella."

The document, consisting of nineteen sections or paragraphs, is an articulate defence of the sanctity of human life, and ends with a plea to all Catholics and all in authority to accept the Church's teachings on this most important of questions:

"...exhortamos a los católicos a una aceptación sincera y unánime de la doctrina de la Iglesia en este punto...Rogamos a los gobernantes y legisladores que ponderen en conciencia la trascendencia de sus decisiones y que no introduzcan en nuestra sociedad un principio de descomposición moral como el que supone la vulneración del derecho de todos a la vida."

Of the Andalusian bishops, Montero was the most involved publicly, as he drafted the final statement and acted as the assembly's spokesman.

As regards the socio-economic domain, the present outlook for Andalusia itself is not promising with, as has been stated, unemployment there approximately double the national average. At the beginning of this study we have seen how the doctrine of anarchism at times replaced that of Catholicism for those for whom the Church had ceased to have any beneficial significance; given this, it is not insignificant that, in three separate articles on Andalusia's parlous unemployment situation, mention should be made of a possible resurgence of anarchism. In a study on unemployment and living conditions in rural parts of Cordoba, the communist Mundo Obrero opined that "el Gobierno debería tener en cuenta la historia y la combatividad de los campesinos andaluces" (66) - a warning reiterated by HOAC in a special study on Andalusia (67):

"En los últimos meses se han conocido acciones en el campo andaluz que nos recuerdan a aquellas otras de los jornaleros cenetistas en tiempos no muy lejanos."

Although such statements, given their leftist sources, can be accused of bias or scaremongering, a similar warning was issued by the conservative-orientated

The Economist in an article dealing with the mass hunger-strike at Marinaleda, which stated that

Andalusia, given its "tradition of social violence" (68), could well constitute for the government a bigger problem than the Basque Country. Whether anarchism has atavistic strains strong enough to re-emerge as the force it once was, it is incontrovertible that, given the social dimension of postconciliar theology, the future of the Church in Andalusia is inextricably bound up with the future development of the region. Will the recent progress made towards some measure of autonomy exert any influence? José María Javierre, priest and once editor of El Correo de Andalucía, while recognising that autonomy is not necessarily the antidote of the region's ills, feels that any move away from the traditional centralism of Castile can only be beneficial (69):

"...el concepto de autonomía andaluza es muy importante desde el punto de vista político, en cuanto a lo que significa de posibilitar decisiones, porque ...Andalucía no encontrará un remedio social hasta que no se produzca un cambio político, entre otras cosas, porque los representantes del pueblo no existen."

It was presumably in line with such thinking that the Andalusian bishops threw their weight behind the moves for autonomy, as has been mentioned, one of many attempts to ally themselves with the people of the

region, while mindful of the accusations of political meddling that such actions can understandably provoke. Whatever the shortcomings of a pronounced social involvement, it means that the Church must cease to be the alien or remote institution it sometimes tended to appear to the poor and disadvantaged, be part of a greater sense of adventure — "una aceptación más decidida, más arriesgada, de la función profética de la Iglesia", in the words of J.González-Anleo (70) — encouraging and interesting signs of which include, on an ecumenical level, the welcome given by bishops, priests and laity to Brother Roger of Taizé on his recent visit to Seville (71), or the permission given to Muslims to pray at Cordoba Cathedral by its bishop (72).

The Andalusian Church, like the Church in the remainder of Spain, has had to live through periods of repression, persecution, triumph, self-questioning and self-imposed separation from the State in its tireless quest to spread the teachings of Christ. What makes the Andalusian Church arguably more interesting than the Church in other areas is its social involvement resulting from the problems traditionally peculiar to the region, together with the tensions that this involvement or apparent lack of it has sometimes provoked, and the development of highly politicised and socially-orientated theological ideas, such as those expounded by the comunidades, concerned with translating the Gospel to these realities. It would therefore seem reasonable to assume that any future innovations and developments within the Andalusian Church will entail both social and spiritual considerations.

#### CHAPTER FIVE

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- (1) Ecclesia, 19.2.77., no.1,826, p.3.
- (2) Ecclesia, 4.6.77., no.1,840, p.3.
- (3) Boletín HOAC, 16-30.9.79., no.768, p.12.
- (4) <u>Cambio 16</u>, 31.8.80., no.456, pp.12-13.
- (5) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 28.2.76., p.11.
- (6) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 19.2.77., no.1,826, pp.14-15.
- (7) ABC, 14.4.77., no.1,424, p.20.
- (8) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 11.6.77., no.1,841, pp.11-12.
- (9) Vida Nueva, 26.3.77., p.12.
- (10) Ecclesia, 23.7.77., no.1,847, pp.23-24.
- (11) ibid.,pp. 23-24.
- (12) Ecclesia, 24.12.77., no.1,867, pp.20-21.
- (13) ibid., p.19.
- (14) Ecclesia, 3.3.79., no.1,924, p.29.
- (15) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 10.12.77., p.9.
- (16) Ecclesia, 17.12.77., no.1,866, p.13.
- (17) Vida Nueva, 23.2.80., pp.28-29.
- (18) ibid., p.23.
- (19) ibid., pp.28-29.
- (20) Boletín HOAC, 15-30.4.76., no.686, pp.10-11.
- (21) "Obispos y Paro Obrero en el Sur", <u>Cuadernos</u>
  Para El Diálogo, 29.5.76., p.59.
- (22) Ecclesia, 24.9.77., no. 1,854, p.27.
- (23) Ecclesia, 26.11.77., no.1,683, pp.13-14.
  - (24) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 22.7.78., p.12.
  - (25) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 22.10.77., no. 1,858, p.30.
  - (26) Petschen, S., op. cit., p.101.
  - (27) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 26.2.77., no. 1,827, p.34.

- (28) <u>Nuestro Seminario Hoy</u>, Diócesis de Guadix-Baza (pamphlet, 1979).
- (29) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 5.3.77., p.14.
- (30) <u>Ecclesia</u>, 5.2.77., no. 1,824, p.19.
- (31) <u>Boletín HOAC</u>, 15-30.4.76.,no. 686, pp.10-11.
- (32) Interview in Granada, April 1979.
- (33) Alfonso Sola, at the time of writing, is the only worker-priest in Almeria diocese.
- (34) <u>Boletin HOAC</u>, 16-30.9.79., no. 768, p.13.
- (35) The Guardian, 16.8.76., p.4.
- (36) Boletín HOAC, 16-31.10.77., no. 722, p.25.
- (37) Interview in Roquetas del Mar, Almeria province, April 1979.
- (38) Boletín HOAC, 16.5.77.-17.6.77., no.712-3, p.8.
- (39) Boletín HOAC, 1-31.8.77., no. 717-8, pp. 22-23.
- (40) Fundación FOESSA, <u>Estudios Sociológicos sobre</u>

  <u>la Situación Social de España 1975</u>, Madrid

  1976, p.541.
- (41) Grupos Cristianos de Andalucía, <u>Encuentro 1977</u>, Granada 1977, p.3.
- (42) ibid., p.12.
- (43) ibid., p. 17.
- (44) Castillo, J.M., "Iglesia de Andalucía: una alternativa que hace pensar", Proyección, no. 107, October-December 1977, p.224.
- (45) ibid., p.225.
- (46) ibid., p.225.
- (47) ibid., p.225.
- (48) ibid., p.226.
- (49) ibid., p.222.
- (50) ibid., p.222.

- (51) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 10.9.77., pp.17-18.
- (52) ibid., p.18.
- (53) i.bid., p.18.
- (54) op. cit., p. 219.
- (55) Grupos y Comunidades Cristianos de Andalucía, op. cit., p.5.
- (56) ibid., p.6.
- (57) ibid., p.6.
- (58) Vida Nueva, 4.3.78., pp. 23-30.
- (59) Vida Nueva, 26.2.77., p.13.
- (60) Motti, A., "Padre Clemente Sforna Vescovi Come Noccioline", Oggi, 29.11.76., pp.38-44.
- (61) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 8.1.77., p.16.
- (62)Perhaps brief mention may be made here of the Pastoreros, a more or less economically selfsufficient group based at Fuente Vaqueros at Granada. Originally founded in the 1930s by José Castillo, an illiterate shepherd, it has managed, after many difficulties with the authorities during the Franco years, to assert itself and develop. Without being formally Christian, the group's philosophy follows Christian ethics, and its aim is a way of life attempting to attain some form of personal perfection through adherence to the natural laws of love and brotherhood. - Mestre Alonso, J., Modernización y Cambio en la España Rural, Madrid 1975, p.226.
- (63) See footnote 60 of chapter one.
- (64) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 6.11.82., no. 1,351, p.33.
- (65) <u>El Correo Español</u>, 6.2.83., no. 22,959, p. 24.

- (66) Mundo Obrero, 16-22.3.78., p.24.
- (67) Boletín HOAC, 30.9.79., no.768, p.14.
- (68) op.cit., p.45.
- (69) Javierre, J.M., in interview in <u>Andalucía</u>,
  Lombao, M. and Sacaluga, M.A., op.cit., p.120.
- (70) González-Anleo, J., <u>Catolicismo Nacional:</u>

  <u>Nostalgia y Crisis</u>, <u>Madrid 1975</u>, p.270.
- (71) <u>Vida Nueva</u>, 22.3.80., p.15.
- (72) Ecclesia, 25.11.78., no.1,911, p.30.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aguirre Prado, L., <u>La Iglesia y la Guerra</u>
<u>Española</u>, Madrid 1964.

Aldea Vaquero, Q., Marín Martínez, T. & Vives Gatell, J., ed., <u>Diccionario de Historia</u>

<u>Eclesiástica de España</u>, Vols. I - IV, Madrid
1972 - 75.

Almerich (et al), <u>Cambio Social y Religión en</u>
<u>España</u>, Barcelona 1975.

Anderson, F., (ed.), <u>Council Daybook</u> vols. I, II, Washington 1965, 1966.

Angulo Uríbarri, J., <u>Documentos Socio-Políticos</u>
de Obispos Españoles 1968-1972, Madrid 1972.

Añoveros, A., Pastorales, Madrid 1970.

Araujo García, C.and Grubb K.G., Religion in the Republic of Spain, Eondon 1933.

Arbeloa, V.M., <u>Aquella España Católica</u>, Salamanca 1975.

Arbeloa, V.M., <u>Socialismo y Anticlericalismo</u>, Madrid 1973.

Aznar, S., <u>La Revolución Española y las</u>
<u>Vocaciones Eclesiásticas</u>, Madrid 1949.

Balcells, A., <u>Trabajo industrial y organización</u> obrera en la Cataluña contemporánea, Barcelona 1974.

Banco Español de Crédito, <u>Anuario Banesto del</u>
<u>Mercado Español</u>, 1981.

Barral, C., Años de Penitencia, Madrid 1975.

Ben-Ami, S., The Origins of the Second Republic in Spain, Oxford 1978.

Benzo Mestre, M., <u>Pastoral y Laicado a la Luz del</u> Vaticano II, Madrid 1966.

Bernal, A., <u>La propiedad de la tierra y las luchas</u> agrarias andaluzas, Barcelona 1974.

Blanshard, P., Paul Blanshard on Vatican II, London 1967.

Borkenau, F., The Spanish Cockpit, London 1937.

Bosque Maurel, J., "Nivel de desarrollo y dependencia en Andalucía", in Lombao, M.and Sacaluga, M.A., ed., Andalucía, Barcelona 1977.

Brassloff, A., "Church-State relations in Spain since the Civil War", <u>Iberian Studies</u>, vol. II, no. 2. Autumn 1973.

Brenan, G., <u>The Spanish Labyrinth</u>, Cambridge University Press, 1969.

Broué, P., and Témime, E., <u>La Révolution et la Guerre d'Espagne</u>, Paris 1961.

Broué, P., and Témime, E., <u>The Revolution and the Civil War in Spain</u>, London 1970.

Burgos, A., <u>Andalucía, ¿Tercer Mundo?</u>, Barcelona 1971.

Calero, A., <u>Movimientos Sociales en Andalucía</u> (1820-1936) Madrid 1976.

Canales, R., "¿Hacia dónde valaiglesia de Sevilla?", Razón y Fe, no. 904, May 1973.

Carr, R., Spain 1808-1939, Oxford 1966.

Carrión, P., <u>La reforma agraria de la Segunda</u>

República y la situación actual de la agricultura española, Barcelona 1973.

Carrión, P., <u>Los Latifundios en España</u>, Barcelona 1972.

Castillo, J.M., "Iglesia de Andalucía : una alternativa que hace pensar", <u>Proyección</u>, no. 107, October - December 1977.

Chao Rego, J., <u>La Iglesia en el Franquismo</u>, Madrid 1976.

Chao Rego, J., <u>La Iglesia que Franco Quiso</u>, Madrid 1976.

Comín, A., et al., <u>Buscando la Iglesia Conciliar</u>, Barcelona 1968.

Comín, A., España del Sur, Madrid 1965.

Comín, A., España, ¿País de Misión?, Barcelona 1966.

Cooper, N., Catholicism and the Franco Regime, London 1975.

Cooper, N., "The Church: From Crusade to Christianity", Spain in Crisis (ed. P. Preston), London 1976.

Cuenca, J. M., Aproximación a la historia social de la Iglesia española contemporánea, Escorial 1978.

Cuenca, J. M., <u>La Iglesia Española ante la Revolución</u>
<u>Liberal</u>, Madrid 1971.

De Esteban, J., and López Guerra, L., <u>La Crisis</u> del Estado Franquista, Barcelona 1977.

De Iturralde, J., <u>El Catolicismo y la Cruzada de</u> <u>Franco</u>, vol.I, Bayonne 1956; vol.II, Vienne 1960.

De La Souchère, E., "Un Catholicisme Totalitaire", Les Temps Modernes, no.100, March 1954.

De Miguel, A., 40 Millones de Españoles 40 Años Después, Barcelona 1976.

De Miguel, A., and Salcedo, J., <u>Dinámico del</u> desarrollo industrial de las regiones españolas, Madrid 1972.

Del Valle, F., "¿Hemos perdido la clase obrera en España?" Razón y Fe, May-June 1952.

Diaz del Moral, <u>Historia de las Agitaciones</u> Campesinas Andaluzas, Madrid 1967.

Díaz-Plaja, F., <u>La España Franquista en sus</u> Documentos, Barcelona 1976.

Dobby, E.H.G., "Agrarian Problems in Spain",

Geographical Review of the American Geographical

Society, April 1936.

Duocastella, R., "Reflexiones Sociológicas sobre el Mapa Religioso de España", <u>Cambio Social y Religión en España</u> (Almerich et al), Barcelona 1975.

Ebenstein, W.G., <u>Church and State in Franco</u> Spain, Princeton 1960.

Estruch J., "How can there be Protestants in Spain?", The Ecumenical Review, vol. XX, no.1, January 1968.

Estudios del Instituto de Desarrollo Económico, Estudio Socioeconómico de Andalucía, vol.I, Madrid 1970.

Ferreiro, A., "La vida económico-social en la provincia de Jaén", <u>Fomento Social</u>, vol.VII, no. 25.

Fontana, J., and Nadal, J., "Spain 1914-1970"

The Fontana Economic History of Europe, vol. VI, partII, London 1939.

Foss, W., and Gerahty, C., The Spanish Arena, London 1939.

Franco Bahamonde, F., <u>Discursos y Mensajes del Jefe</u> del Estado 1964-67, Madrid 1968.

Fundación FOESSA, <u>Informe Sociológico sobre la</u> Situación Social de España 1970, Madrid 1970.

Fundación FOESSA, <u>Informe Sociológico sobre la</u> Situación Social de España 1976, Madrid 1976.

Gallo, M., Spain under Franco, London 1973.

García-Nieto París, J.N., <u>El Sindicalismo Cristiano</u> en España, Bilbao 1960.

García-Villoslada, R., ed., <u>Historia de la Iglesia</u> en España. V. La Iglesia en la España contemporánea, Madrid 1979.

Garriga, R., <u>El Cardenal Segura y el Nacional-</u> <u>Catolicismo</u>, Barcelona 1977.

Georgel, J., Le Franquisme, Paris 1970.

Gibson, I., <u>La Represión Nacionalista de Granada</u> en 1936 y la Muerte de Federico García Lorca,
Paris 1971.

Gil Delgado, F., <u>Conflicto Iglesia-Estado</u>, Madrid 1975.

Giner, C., "España en vías de secularización", Mundo Social. no. 152, 1968.

Gomá y Tomás, I., <u>Pastorales de la Guerra de España</u>, Madrid 1955.

Gómez Pérez R., <u>Política y Religión en el Régimen</u> de Franco, Barcelona 1976.

González-Anleo, J., <u>Catolicismo Nacional: Nostalgia</u> y Crisis, Madrid 1975.

González Moralejo, R., El Momento Social de España, Madrid 1959.

González Ruiz, J.M., "Del Diálogo a la Lucha Revolucionaria", <u>Cuadernos de Ruedo Ibérico</u>, no.12, April-May 1967.

Guía de la Iglesia en España, 1963.

Harrison, J., <u>An Economic History of Modern Spain,</u>
Manchester University Press, 1978.

Hermet, G., L'Espagne de Franco, Paris 1974.

Herrera Oria, A., <u>Obras Selectas de Mons. Angel</u> Herrera Oria, Madrid 1963.

Hills, G., Spain, London 1970.

Instituto de Sociología y Pastoral Aplicadas (ISPA),

El Fenómeno Religioso y sus Condicionamientos

Socioculturales, Madrid 1972.

Iribarren, J., <u>Documentos Colectivos del Episcopado</u>
<u>Español 1870-1974</u>, Madrid 1974.

Jackson, G., <u>The Spanish Republic and the Civil</u> War, 1931-39, Princeton University Press, 1965.

Jobit, P., <u>L'Eglise d'Espagne à l'Heure du Concile</u>, Paris 1965.

Laín Entralgo, P., <u>Descargo de Conciencia</u>, Barcelona 1976.

Lannon, F., "A Basque Challenge to the Pre-Civil War Spanish Church", <u>European Studies Review</u>, vol. IX, no. 1, January 1979.

Lara Sánchez, F., <u>La Emigración Andaluza</u>, Madrid 1977.

Lazo Díaz, A., <u>La desamortización eclesiástica en</u> Sevilla, Seville 1970.

Lida, C.E., <u>Anarquismo y Revolución en la España</u> del XIX, Madrid 1972.

López, A., La Iglesia desde el Estado, Madrid 1972.

López Zumel, J.M., "Una medición de los desequilibrios en la infraestructura económica y social de las regiones españolas", <u>Información Comercial Española</u>,561.

López Rodríguez, M., <u>La España Protestante</u>, Madrid 1976.

Lorente, S., "Dos tipos de sacerdotes españoles", Mundo Social, no. 190,1971.

Maestro Alfonso, J., <u>Modernización y Cambio en la</u> España Rural, Madrid 1975.

Malefakis, E.E., Agrarian Reform and Peasant Revolution in Spain, University of Yale, 1970.

Martín Descalzo, J.L., <u>Un Periodista en el Concilio</u>, Madrid 1963.

Martinez-Alier, J., <u>Labourers and Landowners in</u>
<u>Southern Spain</u>, London 1971.

Marzal, A., "Iglesia Española, Del Triunfo a la Soledad", <u>Hechos y Dichos</u>, December 1975.

Matthews, H.L., The Yoke and the Arrows, London 1958.

Maurel, J.B., "Nivel de desarrollo y dependencia en Andalucía", in Lombao, M., and Sacaluga, M.A., Andalucía, Barcelona 1977.

Medhurst, K.N., <u>Government in Spain</u>, Oxford 1973.

Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, <u>Datos y Cifras</u>
de la Enseñanza en España, 1980, Madrid 1981.

Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, <u>La Educación</u>

<u>Preescolar, General Básica, Especial y Permanente</u>

<u>de Adultos, Curso 1980-81</u>, Madrid, 1981.

Mintz, J.R., "Trouble in Andalusia", <u>National</u> <u>History</u>, no.81, 1972.

Montero Moreno, A., <u>Historia de la persecución</u> religiosa en España 1936-1939, Madrid 1961.

Moreno Navarro, I., <u>Propiedad, Clases Sociales y</u>
Hermandades en la Baja Andalucía, Madrid, 1972.

Motti, A., "Padre Clemente Sforna Vescovi Come Noccioline", Oggi, 29.11.76.

Nadal, J., "Spain, 1830-1914", The Fontana Economic History of Europe, vol. IV, part II, London 1973.

Naylon, J., Andalusia, Oxford 1975.

Nicholl, D., "Religious Liberty in Spain; a survey

to 1968", <u>Iberian Studies</u>, vol. I, no. 1, Spring 1972.

Ordóñez Márquez, J., <u>La apostasía de las masas y</u> <u>la persecución religiosa en la provincia de Huelva</u> <u>1931-1936</u>, Madrid 1968.

Oresanz, A.L., <u>Religiosidad Popular Española 1940-1965</u>, Madrid 1964.

Osuna, J.M., <u>La Novena Provincia Andaluza</u>, Barcelona 1973.

Payne, S.G., <u>A History of Spain and Portugal</u>, University of Wisconsin 1973.

Peers, E.A., Spain, the Church and the Orders, London 1939.

Pemartín, J., Qué es 'lo nuevo'.... Santander 1938.

Pérez de Urbel, J., <u>Los Mártires de la Iglesia</u>, Barcelona 1956.

Pérez Galán, M., <u>La enseñanza en la Segunda</u> República Española, Madrid 1975.

Petschen, S., <u>La Iglesia en la España de Franco</u>, Madrid 1977.

Pitt-Rivers, J.A., The People of the Sierra, London 1954.

Preston, P., "General Franco's Rearguard", New Society, 29.11.73.

Preston, P., The Coming of the Spanish Civil War-Reform and Reaction and Revolution in the Second Republic 1931-1936, London 1978.

Ramírez, L., Nuestros primeros veinticinco años,

Paris 1964.

Robinson, R.A.H., <u>The Origins of Franco's Spain</u>, Newton Abbott 1970.

Ruiz-Giménez, J., <u>El Concilio y los Derechos del</u> Hombre, Madrid 1968.

Ruiz Rico, J.J., <u>El papel político de la Iglesia</u> Católica en la España de Franco, Madrid 1977.

Sáez Alba, A., <u>La ACNP - La Otra 'Cosa Nostra</u>', Paris 1974.

Sáez Marín, J., <u>Datos sobre la Iglesia Española</u>
<u>Contemporánea</u>, Madrid 1975.

Salas, N., Andalucía: los 7 círculos viciosos del subdesarrollo, Barcelona 1972.

Sanchez, J.M., <u>Reform and Reaction</u>, University of North Carolina 1962.

Samaniego Boneu, M., La pólítica educativa de la Segunda República, Madrid 1977.

Semanas Sociales de España - XXXI semana: Sevilla 1978, Madrid 1978.

Setién J.M., "Relaciones Iglesia - Estado", <u>Razón y</u>
<u>Fe</u>, no. 935, December 1975.

Sevilla Guzmán, E., <u>La Evolución del Campesinado en</u> España, Barcelona 1979.

Siguán Soler, M., <u>El Medio Rural en Andalucía Oriental</u>, Barcelona 1972.

Sopena, R., ed., <u>Geografía de España</u>, vols. I,II, Barcelona 1974.

Soto de Gangoiti, J., <u>Relaciones de la Iglesia</u> y el Estado Español, <u>Madrid 1940</u>.

Southworth, H., El mito de la cruzada de Franco, Madrid 1963.

Stewart, G., "Andalusia's challenge to Spain", The World Today, May 1981.

Tamames, R., <u>La República. La Era de Franco</u>, Madrid 1973.

Thomas, H., "The Spanish Church as a Power for Progress", New Society, 29.4.65.

Thomas, H., The Spanish Civil War, Harmondsworth 1977.

Tunon de Lara, M., "L'Espagne des Grèves", Esprit, July-August 1972, nos. 7-8.

Tussell, J., <u>Historia de la democracia cristiana</u> en España,vol.I, Madrid 1974.

Urbina, F., "Formas de vida de la Iglesia en España", in Urbina, F. et al., <u>Iglesia y Sociedad en España</u>, Madrid 1977.

Vázquez, A., <u>Posconcilio, Crisis de Estructuras</u>, Madrid 1973.

Vázquez, J.M., <u>Realidades Socio-religiosas de España</u>, Madrid 1967.

Vázquez, J.M. et al., <u>La Iglesia Española Contempor-</u> ánea, Madrid 1973.

Vincent, A., Anarquismo y Socialismo, Valencia 1895.

#### Various copies of the following diocesan bulletins:

Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Almería.

Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Cádiz-Ceuta.

Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado de Granada.

Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Guadix-Baza.

Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Jaén.

Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Obispado de Málaga.

Boletín Oficial Eclesiástico del Arzobispado de Sevilla.

# Various copies of the following publications:

ABC

Ayer

Boletín HOAC

Cambio 16

Cuadernos Para El Diálogo

Diario de Almería

Diario de Cádiz

Ecclesia

El Correo de Andalucía

El Ideal

El Pueblo

El Pueblo Gallego

El Socialista

Hoja Oficial de los Lunes

Informaciones

La Solidaridad

Mundo Obrero

Nueva España

New York Times

Sur

The Tablet

The Times

Ultima Hora

Ya

Yugo

# APPENDIX

# Bishops of Andalusia during the Franco regime.

ALMERIA			
	Agustín Parrado y García		
	(apostolic administrator)	1939-1943	
	Enrique Delgado Gómez	1943-1946	
	Alfonso Ródenas García	1947-1965	
	Angel Suquía Goicoechea	1966-1970	
	Manuel Casares Mervás	1970-	
CADIZ-CEUTA			
	Tomás Gutiérrez Díez	1943-1964	
	Antonio Añoveros Ataún	1964-1971	
	Antonio Dorado Soto *	1973-	
CORDOBA			
	Alfonso Pérez Muñoz	1920-1945	
	Albino González Menéndez-Reig	gada	
		1946-1958	
	Manuel Fernández-Conde	1959-1970	
	José María Cirarda Lachiondo	1972-1978	
	José Antonio Infantes Florido	1978-	
GRANADA			
	Agustín Parrado y García	1934-1946	
	Balbino Santos Olivera	1946-1953	
	Rafael García y García de Castro	1953-1968	
	Emilio Benavent Escuin	1968-1978	
	José Méndez Asensio	197 <b>8-</b>	
GUADIX-BAZA			
	Agustín Parrado y García		
	(apostolic administrator)	1939-1943	
	Rafael Alvárez Lara	1943-1965	

	Felix Romero Menjíbar	1965 (2 months)	
	Gabino Díaz Merchán	1965-1969	
	Antonio Dorado Soto	1970-1973 <b>*</b>	
	Ignacio Noguer Carmona *	1976-	
HUELVA			
	Pedro Cantero Cuadrado	1953-1964	
	(first bishop of new diocese)		
	José María García Lahiguera 1964-1969		
	Rafael González Moralejo	1969-	
JAEN			
	Agustín Parrado y García		
	(apostolic administrator)	1937-1943	
	Rafael García y García de Castro		
	(as Archbishop of Granada		
	continued as apostolic ···	.71	
	administrator until 1954)	1943-1953	
•	Felix Romero Menjíbar	1954-1970	
	Felix Martínez Cabrera		
	(canónigo doctoral)	1970-1971	
	Miguel Peinado Peinado	1971-	
MALAGA			
	Balbino Santos Olivera	1,935-1946	
	Angel Herrera Oria	1947-1966	
	Emilio Benavent Escuin	1967-1968	
	Angel Suquía Goicoechea	1969–1973	
	Ramón Buxarrais Ventura	1973-	
SEVILLE			
	Pedro Segura y Saenz	1937-1957	
	José María Bueno Monreal	1957-	
* No bishop appointed during these periods because			

<sup>\*</sup> No bishop appointed during these periods because of failure of Church and Government to agree over appointees.