Elsevier Editorial System(tm) for Infection,

Genetics and Evolution

Manuscript Draft

Manuscript Number: MEEGID-D-16-00808R1

Title: Natural recombination in alphaherpesviruses: insights into viral evolution through full genome sequencing and sequence analysis

Article Type: Review Article

Keywords: Keywords: Alphaherpesvirus; natural recombination; nextgeneration sequencing; attenuated live vaccine.

Corresponding Author: Mr. Carlos Andres Loncoman, DVM

Corresponding Author's Institution: University of Melbourne

First Author: Carlos Andres Loncoman, DVM

Order of Authors: Carlos Andres Loncoman, DVM; Paola Vaz; Mauricio Coppo; Carol Hartley; Francisco Morera; Glenn Browning; Joanne Devlin

Abstract: Abstract:

Recombination in alphaherpesviruses was first described more than sixty years ago. Since then, different techniques have been used to detect recombination in natural (field) and experimental settings. Over the last ten years, next-generation sequencing (NGS) technologies and bioinformatic analyses have greatly increased the accuracy of recombination detection, particularly in field settings, thus contributing greatly to the study of natural alphaherpesvirus recombination in both human and veterinary medicine. Such studies have highlighted the important role that natural recombination plays in the evolution of many alphaherpesviruses. These studies have also shown that recombination can be a safety concern for attenuated alphaherpesvirus vaccines, particularly in veterinary medicine where such vaccines are used extensively, but also potentially in human medicine where attenuated varicella zoster virus vaccines are in use. This review focuses on the contributions that NGS and sequence analysis have made over the last ten years to our understanding of recombination in mammalian and avian alphaherpesviruses, with particular focus on attenuated live vaccine use.

Highlights:

- Natural (field) recombination in alphaherpesviruses is linked with live attenuated vaccine usage.
- Natural recombination drives evolution and pathogenicity of alphaherpesviruses.
- Advances in next-generation sequencing techniques have helped to provide accurate data in regards to natural (field) recombination.

1	Natural recombination in alphaherpesviruses: insights into viral evolution through full
2	genome sequencing and sequence analysis
3	Carlos A Loncoman ^{1*} , Paola K Vaz ¹ , Mauricio JC Coppo ¹ , Carol A Hartley ¹ , Francisco J
4	Morera ² , Glenn F Browning ¹ , Joanne M Devlin ¹
5	
6	¹ Asia Pacific Centre for Animal Health, Faculty of Veterinary and Agricultural Sciences, The
7	University of Melbourne, Parkville, Victoria, 3010, Australia.
8	² Applied Biochemistry Laboratory, Institute of Pharmacology and Morphophysiology, Facultad de
9	Ciencias Veterinarias, Universidad Austral de Chile, Valdivia, Chile.
10	
11	*Corresponding author: Asia Pacific Centre for Animal Health, Faculty of Veterinary and
12	Agricultural Sciences, The University of Melbourne, Parkville, Victoria, 3010, Australia.
13	cloncoman@student.unimelb.edu.au
14	

15 Abstract:

16 Recombination in alphaherpesviruses was first described more than sixty years ago. Since then, 17 different techniques have been used to detect recombination in natural (field) and experimental 18 settings. Over the last ten years, next-generation sequencing (NGS) technologies and bioinformatic 19 analyses have greatly increased the accuracy of recombination detection, particularly in field 20 settings, thus contributing greatly to the study of natural alphaherpesvirus recombination in both 21 human and veterinary medicine. Such studies have highlighted the important role that natural 22 recombination plays in the evolution of many alphaherpesviruses. These studies have also shown that recombination can be a safety concern for attenuated alphaherpesvirus vaccines, particularly in 23 24 veterinary medicine where such vaccines are used extensively, but also potentially in human 25 medicine where attenuated varicella zoster virus vaccines are in use. This review focuses on the 26 contributions that NGS and sequence analysis have made over the last ten years to our 27 understanding of recombination in mammalian and avian alphaherpesviruses, with particular focus 28 on attenuated live vaccine use.

29

30 Keywords: Alphaherpesvirus, natural recombination, next-generation sequencing, attenuated live
 31 vaccine.

33 Contents:

34	1. Introduction	4
35	2. Natural recombination in human alphaherpesviruses	6
36	2.1 Herpes simplex virus-1	6
37	2.2 Herpes simplex virus-2	8
38	2.3 Varicella zoster virus	9
39	3. Natural recombination in other mammalian herpesviruses	12
40	<i>3.1</i> Equine alphaherpesviruses	13
41	3.2 Pseudorabies virus	14
42	<i>3.3</i> Feline herpesvirus-1	15
43	4. Natural recombination in avian alphaherpesviruses	16
44	4.1 Marek's disease virus	16
45	4.2 Infectious laryngotracheitis virus	17
46	5. Conclusions	18
47	Acknowledgements	20
48	Conflict of interest	20
49	References	20

50 **1. Introduction**

51 Viruses belonging to the order *Herpesvirales* have a double stranded DNA genome and have been 52 isolated from a wide variety of host including mammals, birds, reptiles, fish and invertebrates 53 (Davison, 2010). Three large subfamilies arose within the family Herpesviridae over 80 million years ago. One of these, the subfamily Alphaherpesvirinae, includes avian and mammalian 54 55 alphaherpesvirus lineages (Davison, 2010; McGeoch et al., 1995). The evolution of many viruses in this subfamily has been attributed, in part, to the process of recombination. The contribution that 56 57 recombination makes to the evolution and diversity of alphaherpesviruses is of particular 58 importance as these viruses have a DNA polymerase with a highly efficient proof-reading activity 59 and exonuclease activity (Javier et al., 1986; Lee et al., 2012; Thiry et al., 2005), resulting in low 60 point genetic mutation rates. In herpes simplex virus-1 (HSV-1) the mutation rate is as low as 0.026 61 to 0.0027 (Drake and Hwang, 2005).

62 Recombination is the process in which new genetic material (offspring) is generated by shuffling 63 two different DNA sequences from viruses infecting the same host cell at the same time. High rates 64 of in vivo intra-species homologous recombination have been demonstrated after experimental co-65 inoculation of different strains of HSV-1 into mice (Kintner et al., 1995), bovine herpesvirus 1 (BoHV-1) into calves (Schynts et al., 2003), and pseudorabies virus (PRV) into sheep and pigs 66 67 (Christensen and Lomniczi, 1993; Henderson et al., 1990). In vitro intra-species co-inoculation 68 experiments have demonstrated recombination in different alphaherpesviruses strains into cell 69 cultures, including HSV-1 (Kintner et al., 1995), BoHV-1 (Muylkens et al., 2009), varicella zoster virus (VZV) (Dohner et al., 1988), feline herpesvirus 1 (FeHV-1) (Fujita et al., 1998) and PRV 70 71 (Henderson et al., 1990). In vitro recombination has been detected at a lower rate than in in vivo 72 experiments, possibly due to the reduced number of viral replication cycles possible in cell cultures. 73 Therefore, factors that influences the number of viral replication cycles, such as latency/reactivation 74 and use of vaccines that replicate after vaccination, should be considered as factors that may increase the likelihood of recombination. Recombination occurs most commonly between different 75

76 strains of the same virus species (intra-species recombination) but inter-species recombination is

also possible and has been detected in experimental studies between caprine herpesvirus-1 and -2,

and also between BoHV-1 and bovine herpesvirus-5 (BoHV-5) (Meurens et al., 2004). In field

samples inter-species recombination has been detected between equine herpesviruses 1 and 4

80 (EHV-1 and EHV-4, respectively) (Pagamjav et al., 2005).

81 Many biological features of alphaherpesviruses, including their infection of epithelial surfaces,

82 rapid infectious cycle, establishment of latent infection with periodic reactivation and high

83 prevalence of infection in many host populations, create a favourable environment for co-infection

84 of host cells, and hence for recombination. The viral, host and cell conditions that influence the

85 likelihood of recombination *in vivo* and *in vitro* under laboratory conditions have been reviewed

86 previously (Thiry et al., 2005). The molecular basis of alphaherpesvirus recombination has also

87 been recently reviewed and is hypothesized to be similar to that described for lambda

bacteriophages (Lo Piano *et al.*, 2011; Weller and Sawitzke, 2014).

89 Early studies of alphaherpesvirus recombination used strain virulence as a marker to detect

90 recombinants (Wildy, 1955). Analysis of partial genome sequences were then used extensively to

91 study recombination in several alphaherpesviruses, using tools such as PCR followed by restriction

92 endonuclease cleavage fragment analysis of PCR products (PCR plus restriction fragment length

93 polymorphism [PCR-RFLP]), gene deletion mutants, PCR hydrolysis probe assays and

94 bioinformatic comparisons of partial genome sequences to detect recombination (Bowden et al.,

95 2004; Christensen and Lomniczi, 1993; Dangler et al., 1993; Dohner et al., 1988; Glazenburg et al.,

96 1994; Henderson et al., 1990; Javier et al., 1986; Kintner et al., 1995; Muylkens et al., 2009;

97 Norberg et al., 2004; Sakaoka et al., 1995; Sakaoka et al., 1994; Schynts et al., 2003; Umene and

98 Sakaoka, 1997). More recently, lower costs, improved technologies and greater access to next

99 generation sequencing (NGS) techniques (Capobianchi et al., 2013; Pareek et al., 2011), statistical

analysis (Bruen et al., 2006; Posada, 2002) and software to detect and estimate the likelihood of

101 recombination (Huson and Bryant, 2006; Kosakovsky Pond et al., 2006; Kuhner, 2006; Lole et al.,

102	1999; Martin et	t al., 2010; Martin d	<i>et al.</i> , 2011; Martin	et al., 2015; Pond	and Frost, 2005; Wilson
-----	-----------------	-----------------------	------------------------------	--------------------	-------------------------

- and McVean, 2006) have helped us to better understand recombination, and thereby provide
- 104 insights into the role of recombination in the natural evolution of alphaherpesviruses (Burrel et al.,
- 105 2015; Hughes and Rivailler, 2007; Kolb et al., 2013; Kolb et al., 2015; Lamers et al., 2015; Lee et
- 106 *al.*, 2013; Lee *et al.*, 2012; Newman *et al.*, 2015; Norberg *et al.*, 2015; Norberg *et al.*, 2007;
- 107 Norberg et al., 2006; Norberg et al., 2011; Peters et al., 2006; Szpara et al., 2014; Vaz et al., 2016a;
- 108 Vaz et al., 2016b; Ye et al., 2016; Zhao et al., 2015).
- 109 This review aims to summarise and update our understanding of natural recombination in
- 110 alphaherpesviruses and the influence of natural recombination on viral evolution, focusing on the
- 111 contributions that full genome sequencing and sequence analysis have made to this field over the
- 112 last 10 years. This review covers natural recombination in human alphaherpesviruses, other
- 113 mammalian alphaherpesviruses and avian alphaherpesviruses.
- 114

115 **2.** Natural recombination in human alphaherpesviruses

- 116 Herpes simplex virus-1, -2 and VZV are important causes of human disease worldwide. Infection
- 117 with HSV-1 is commonly associated with ulcerated oral lesions and HSV-2 with genital lesions,
- although both viruses can cause lesions at both anatomical sites (Lowhagen *et al.*, 2002).
- 119 Additionally, HSV-1 can cause keratitis and subsequent blindness, along with sporadic encephalitis
- 120 (Liesegang, 2001). Infection with VZV causes varicella (chickenpox) and herpes zoster (shingles)
- 121 (Zerboni et al., 2014). Evidence of natural recombination has been available since 2004 for HSV-1,
- 122 2003 for VZV, and 2007 for HSV-2. These studies have demonstrated that these three human
- 123 alphaherpesviruses show differences in recombination (Table 1).
- 124
- 125 2.1 Herpes simplex virus-1
- 126 Early HSV-1 studies in mice demonstrated that a high proportion of recombinant viruses were
- 127 generated following co-inoculation, and many of the recombinants had higher levels of virulence

128 than the parental strains (Brandt and Grau, 1990; Kintner et al., 1995). This potential for 129 recombination to result in increased virulence highlighted the importance of studying HSV-1 recombination in clinical settings. In 2004, Bowden et al., sequenced approximately 4% of the 130 131 HSV-1 genome in 14 clinical samples from the UK and Korea, performed phylogenetic network 132 analyses on the data to estimate recombination, and concluded that recombination plays a major role in generating diversity within HSV-1 (Bowden et al., 2004). In the same year, Norberg et al., 133 134 sequenced approximately 2.3% of the HSV-1 genome in 28 clinical samples from Sweden, also 135 detecting recombination (Norberg et al., 2004).

136From 2011 onwards, techniques shifted to detection of natural HSV-1 recombination by

bioinformatic analysis of whole genome sequences obtained by NGS, providing a higher level of
accuracy in identifying and characterising these phenomena (Kolb *et al.*, 2011; Kolb *et al.*, 2013;

139 Norberg *et al.*, 2011; Szpara *et al.*, 2014). In 2011 the genomes of ten clinical and two laboratory

140 HSV-1 strains isolated in 1972, were sequenced and analysed. Significant recombination was

141 detected, including recombination events between the HSV-1 field strains F and 17. Additionally,

142 the full genome sequences of these 12 HSV-1s facilitated classification of HSV-1 into 3 clades: A,

143 B and C (Norberg et al., 2011). Kolb et al reached similar conclusions about the number of HSV-1

144 clades (Kolb et al., 2011). In regard to recombination, Kolb et al., (2011) showed that some field

strains (TFT401 and CJ970) were unstable in their phylogenetic classification using the whole

146 genome sequence and identified cross over points using similarity plots in the UL1, UL11, UL43,

147 UL49A, US4 and US7 genes. Additionally, they found that some nucleotide sequences that code for

selected proteins resulted in variable phylogenetic groupings depending on the parameters used to

build the phylogenetic trees. They concluded that recombination was likely and that each viral

150 genome is a unique mosaic (Kolb *et al.*, 2011).

151

The most recent and comprehensive studies of HSV-1 genetic diversity, recombination and genome
evolution are those that have examined full genome sequences of HSV-1 from four continents. Kolb

154	et al., (2013) examined 31 full genome sequences as well as partial genome sequences obtained
155	from the NCBI reference database. Szpara et al., (2014) examined whole genome sequences
156	obtained by NGS of 20 field strains of HSV-1 obtained from China, Japan, Kenya and South Korea
157	and compared them with the genome sequences available for HSV-1 strains from the United States
158	(US), Europe and Japan. Both these studies confirmed that recombination in HSV-1 is widespread,
159	frequent, historical and ongoing (Kolb et al., 2013; Szpara et al., 2014). In addition, these two
160	studies found that the HSV-1 strains clustered into six groups, rather than the three groups
161	described previously. The clustering correlated with the geographic origin of the isolates,
162	highlighting the need to include isolates from different regions in order to comprehensively
163	examine phylogeny and recombination (Kolb et al., 2013; Szpara et al., 2014).
164	The high levels of HSV-1 recombination detected in these studies have been hypothesised to be due
165	to the co-existence of many different HSV-1 strains within the same geographical region (Norberg
166	et al., 2004; Schmidt-Chanasit et al., 2009) and to the high number of HSV-1 replication cycles that
167	which may arise from more frequent HSV-1 reactivation from latency, compared to HSV-2 or VZV
168	(Kaufman et al., 2005; Wang et al., 2010). This suggests that the latency and reactivation
169	characteristics of alphaherpesviruses are also factors that can influence recombination, with viruses
170	that establish and re-activate from latency more frequently having a higher likelihood of
171	recombination.

172

173 2.2 Herpes simplex virus-2

The first study to detect recombination in HSV-2 using bioinformatics analyses of partial DNA
sequences from clinical isolates was published by Norberg *et al.*, (2007). Approximately 3.5% of

176 the genome of 47 clinical isolates of HSV-2 from Norway, Sweden, and Tanzania was examined

177 and it was found that HSV-2 was clustered into 2 genogroups, rather than the 3 groups seen in

178 HSV-1 isolates using similar techniques. Isolates from Norway and Sweden were clustered into

179 only one genogroup. It was hypothesised that the lower level of genetic diversity seen in HSV-2,

180 compared to HSV-1, was directly related to recombination (Norberg et al., 2007). Importantly,

181 however, these conclusions were based on the analysis of only a limited number of samples, and of

182 partial genome sequences. Only three genes within the unique short (US) region of the HSV-2

183 genome were examined (US4, US7 and US8) (Norberg et al., 2007). Studies on HSV-1 had

184 detected variation in diversity across the whole genome, which can influence recombination

analysis (Szpara et al., 2014). Thus, in order to comprehensively examine recombination in HSV-2,

and also compare recombination between HSV-1 and HSV-2, an analysis of HSV-2 recombination

187 analyses at the whole genome level was required.

188 Prior to 2014 there were only two full genome sequences for HSV-2, one published in 1998 (Dolan

189 et al., 1998), and another one in 2014 (Colgrove et al., 2014). Kolb et al., (2015) determined the

190 complete genome sequences of an additional six HSV-2 clinical isolates. Bootscan analysis of the

191 eight complete genome sequences demonstrated that the HSV-2 genomes were mosaics, suggesting

192 frequent recombination randomly along the genome (Kolb et al., 2015). In a separate study, 34 near

193 complete genome sequences were determined for HSV-2 isolates from Africa, USA and Japan.

194 Bootscan and phylogenetic analyses of these sequences suggested that HSV-2 had five major

195 crossover points and that recombination in HSV-2 did not occur as frequently as in HSV-1

196 (Newman et al., 2015). Another recent study has reported that a new HSV-2 variant (HSV-2v) from

197 west and central Africa (mostly from immunocompromised patients infected with human

198 immunodeficiency virus) differed significantly from the classical HSV-2 prototype and contained a

199 UL30 gene (encoding DNA polymerase) that clustered closely with the chimpanzee herpesvirus

200 (ChHV), providing evidence of an inter-species recombination event (Burrel et al., 2015). Herpes

simplex virus 2 and ChHV have genetically similar genomes with 88.3% pairwise identity and

202 88.3% identical sites between ChHV (Genbank accession number JQ360576) and HSV-2,

203 (Genbank accession number Z86099) as determined using Multiple Alignment with Fast Fourier

204 Transformation (MAFFT) version 7 within Geneious V8.0.4 (Katoh and Standley, 2013). A high

205 level of identity between viruses has been shown to play a role in promoting recombination. This

level of identity is similar to what has been described for EHV-1 and -4, another pair of

207 alphaherpesviruses in which natural inter-species recombination has been detected (Pagamjav *et al.*,
208 2005).

209

210 2.3 Varicella zoster virus

211 Varicella zoster virus is the only human alphaherpesvirus for which live attenuated vaccines are in widespread use. These live attenuated vaccines (Takahashi et al., 1974) contain a heterogeneous 212 213 mixture of related VZV haplotypes (Depledge et al., 2014) and are used in several countries 214 including Japan, Korea, the US, Canada, Australia, Germany, Costa Rica, Uruguay, and Qatar 215 (Norberg et al., 2015). As VZV recombination has been observed in cell culture (Dohner et al., 216 1988) there is potential for natural recombination, including between vaccine and wild type viruses, 217 to occur (Quinlivan et al., 2009). This has been the focus of a number of studies examining VZV 218 recombination. VZV recombination has been investigated using partial and full genome sequence 219 analyses to identify viral groups (clades), and to detect recombination events (Norberg et al., 2015; 220 Norberg et al., 2006; Norberg et al., 2011; Peters et al., 2006). 221 Early studies used restriction endonuclease digestion profiles to examine differences between VZV genomes (Takada et al., 1995). Later, DNA sequencing and bioinformatic analyses were used to 222 223 classify, determine similarities and detect recombination events between VZV isolates. Single 224 nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) analysis (Wagenaar et al., 2003), heteroduplex mobility assays to 225 locate informative SNPs along the genome (Barrett-Muir et al., 2003) and targeted sequencing of different regions of the VZV were used to detect and compare SNP patterns (Loparev et al., 2004). 226 227 These studies showed that recombination occurs among VZV isolates and also enabled the classification of VZV isolates into different phylogenetic groups. Loparev et al., (2004) were able 228 229 to classify 326 VZV isolates from the six continents into the European (E), Japanese (J) and the

230 Mosaic (M) groups by sequencing and analysing approximately 0.3% of the full VZV genome

sequence. This study also sequenced and analysed approximately 6.9% of the full VZV genome

232 sequence of 16 isolates. Specifically, the M group was identified as carrying SNP patterns of both 233 the E and J group, and it was hypothesised that M strains resulted from recombination after mixed 234 infection (Loparev et al., 2004). A separate study classified isolates into four major clades, with 235 clade A containing European/North American (Dumas) isolates, clade B Japanese (vaccine-Oka) 236 isolates, clade C Asian-like isolates sharing some European/North American features, and clade D containing European/North American-like isolates sharing some features of the Asian strains 237 238 (Wagenaar et al., 2003). These classifications provided the first insight into natural recombination 239 in VZV, but more detailed understanding was later achieved by full genome sequence analyses. Complete genome sequence analyses were first used to detect natural VZV recombination in 2006 240 241 (Norberg et al., 2006; Peters et al., 2006). The two studies reporting these findings had different 242 foundations but both reached similar conclusions about recombination. One investigated recombination within the clades C and D (Asian-like and European/North American-like. 243 244 respectively) at the full genome level (Peters et al., 2006). This study determined the full genome 245 sequences of 11 VZV isolates that were considered representative for Canada and the USA, and compared them to seven other sequences that were publicly available (Peters *et al.*, 2006). They 246 247 detected evidence of recombination within a Canadian isolate (VZV-8) within clade C that 248 contained mixtures of genetic characteristics from clade A (Dumas strain from Europe/North 249 America) and clade B (pOka strain from Japan). It was hypothesised that this isolate arose as a 250 result of a recombination event between the vaccine strain vOka from Japan and VZV field strains 251 from Canada, as the vaccine strain is used in Canada (Peters et al., 2006). However, as the vaccines 252 contains mixtures of distinct genetic subtypes (Quinlivan et al., 2005; Vassilev, 2005) and the 253 sequences available at the time in 2006 did not include all the strains within the vaccine, it was not 254 possible to reach this conclusion definitely (Peters et al., 2006). 255 The second study (Norberg et al., 2006) determined the full genome sequences of two VZV strains

256 (DR and 123) that were classified previously into group M (mosaic) by Loparev *et al.*, (2004) and

thus contained genetic features from groups E (European) and J (Japanese). At the whole genome

258 level, the DR and 123 strains were shown to be well separated from each other and from groups E 259 and J. Thus, group M was further divided into M1, represented by the 123 strain, and M2, represented by the DR strain. Bootscan analysis suggested that that the DR and 123 strains contain 260 putative recombination dependent sites. Specifically, some genomic regions clustered with pOka, 261 262 while other regions of the VZV genome clustered with the European strains (Norberg et al., 2006). Subsequent phylogenetic network analysis revealed that the SVETA strain, which is a Russian 263 264 isolate and was thought to belong to clade 1 (European clade), had been involved in an intra-clade 265 recombination event (Norberg et al., 2011), and significant intra-clade recombination events were found among other VZV isolates (Zell et al., 2012). 266 267 After intra-clade recombination was observed, it was hypothesised that an increase in the number of 268 full genome sequences available for analysis would reveal a greater number of recombinants. Additionally, it was hypothesised that human migration, along with widespread distribution of the 269 270 attenuated VZV vaccine strains (Takahashi et al., 1974), may contribute to an apparent 271 disappearance of VZV clades as recombination events would result in isolates becoming genomic mosaics similar to HSV-1 (Norberg et al., 2004; Sauerbrei and Wutzler, 2007; Sauerbrei et al., 272 273 2008). However, recent studies that have included several isolates from different continents have 274 shown that the only clade to consistently display a relatively high level of recombination is the 275 clade that contains the pOka and vOka vaccine strains (Norberg et al., 2015). Detection of 276 recombination in the other clades appears to be dependent on the analytical method used to detect 277 evidence of recombination (Norberg et al., 2015). 278 The relatively low rate of recombination in VZV compared to HSV-1 may be due to the distinct 279 biology and epidemiology of VZV (Kaufman et al., 2005; Schmidt-Chanasit et al., 2009; Wang et 280 al., 2010) as well as geographical separations of strains (Norberg et al., 2004; Schmidt-Chanasit et

al., 2009). However, ongoing monitoring of recombination in field isolates of VZV is needed, as

- recombination between attenuated viruses such as vaccine strains has been detected, to create
- recombinant virulent progeny in other alphaherpesviruses (Lee et al., 2012), as well as in several

- other virus families (Becher et al., 2001; Camus-Bouclainville et al., 2011; Chong et al., 2010;
- 285 Cuervo et al., 2001; Dahourou et al., 2002; Holmes et al., 1999; Liu et al., 2003; Norberg et al.,

286 2013; Seligman and Gould, 2004; Wenhui *et al.*, 2012).

287

288 **3. Natural recombination in other mammalian herpesviruses**

289 Over the past ten years natural recombination has been assessed in alphaherpesviruses from five 290 non-human mammalian hosts; EHV-1, EHV-4, EHV-9, FeHV-1 and PRV (Greenwood et al., 2012; 291 Pagamjav et al., 2005; Vaz et al., 2016a; Vaz et al., 2016b; Ye et al., 2016) (Table 2). This 292 represents only a small proportion of the alphaherpesviruses of importance in veterinary medicine. 293 There have been, however, other efforts to better understand recombination in a wider range of 294 mammalian alphaherpesviruses using experimental in vitro and in vivo studies, including BoHV-1, 295 BoHV-5 (Meurens et al., 2004; Muylkens et al., 2009; Schynts et al., 2003), PRV (Christensen and 296 Lomniczi, 1993; Henderson et al., 1990) and FeHV-1 (Fujita et al., 1998). Live attenuated vaccines 297 are used extensively in veterinary medicine and there is clear evidence that attenuated live vaccines 298 can naturally recombine to generate more virulent and dominant progeny (Lee et al., 2012). 299 Therefore, the study of natural recombination in vaccinated and unvaccinated animals is of importance in improving animal health and disease control in the field of veterinary medicine. 300 301 3.1 Equine alphaherpesviruses

Equine herpesviruses 1 and 4 cause significant losses in horse industries worldwide (Allen *et al.*,
2004). Equine herpesvirus-1 and 4 are genetically similar (Telford *et al.*, 1998), but they differ

304 significantly in terms of their pathogenesis and epidemiology (Allen *et al.*, 2004; Patel and Heldens,

305 2005). Infection with EHV-1 causes respiratory disease in young horses, myeloencephalitis in older

306 horses, abortion in mares and systemic perinatal disease (Allen *et al.*, 2004; Patel and Heldens,

- 307 2005). Infection with EHV-4 also causes upper respiratory tract infection, but EHV-4 infection
- 308 rarely induces systemic disease or abortions in mares, probably because of its limited capacity to

309 infect mononuclear cells, and therefore produce viraemia (Patel and Heldens, 2005;

310 Vandekerckhove *et al.*, 2011). The differences in the epidemiology of EHV-1 and EHV-4 have

311 been well described (Allen *et al.*, 2004; Patel and Heldens, 2005). One key epidemiological

312 difference between these viruses is the substantially lower prevalence of infection with EHV-1

313 compared to that seen for EHV-4 (Gilkerson *et al.*, 1999).

314 Natural recombination in EHV was first reported by Pagamjav et al., (2005). The field isolate

315 EHV-1 B was shown to have arisen as a result of an inter-species recombination event between

316 EHV-1 and EHV-4, and then spread among horse populations to become a dominant strain

317 (Pagamjav et al., 2005). The recombination event described by Pagamjav et al., (2012) was the first

318 evidence of natural inter-species recombination involving EHV-1. In 2012 another natural

319 recombination event involving EHV-1 and equid herpesvirus 9 (EHV-9) was detected in a zoo in

320 Germany by Greenwood et al., (2012) following analysis of the sequence of six virus genes using a

321 distance based method within the Recombination Analysis Tool 1.0 (RAT v1.0). Interestingly, the

322 recombinant was isolated from a polar bear with fatal encephalitis, even though neither EHV-1 nor

323 EHV-9 naturally infect polar bears (Greenwood *et al.*, 2012). More recent work has suggested that

324 the recombination event involving these two viruses most likely occurred in zebras and was then

325 transmitted to the polar bear (Abdelgawad *et al.*, 2016). This recombination event has some

326 similarities to the one detected between the HSV-2 and ChHV (Burrel et al., 2015), as both reports

327 shown recombination within the UL30 gene (Burrel *et al.*, 2015; Greenwood *et al.*, 2012). The

328 significance of the UL30 gene as a site of recombination, and potentially as an influence on the host
329 range of the resultant recombinant viruses, warrants investigation in future studies.

330 The high level of genetic similarity between EHV-1 and EHV-9, and also between EHV-1 and

331 EHV-4 (Telford *et al.*, 1992; Telford *et al.*, 1998) are likely to have facilitated these inter-species

332 recombination events (Pagamjav et al., 2005). Alignment of EHV-1 genome sequences (Genbank

- 333 accession numbers: AY464052, KF644566, KF644567, KF644568, KF644570, KF644572,
- 334 KF644576, KF644577, KF644578, KF644579, KT324724, KT324725, KT324726, KT324727,

335 KT324728, KT324729, KT324729, KT324730, KT324731, KT324732, KT324733, KT324734,

336 NC_001491) and EHV-4 partial and full genome sequences (Genbank accession numbers:

337 KT324735, KT324736, KT324737, KT324738, KT324739, KT324740, KT324741, KT324742,

338 KT324743, KT324744, KT324745, KT324746, KT324747, KT324748, NC_001844) showed there

339 was 86.6% pairwise identity and 70.6% identical sites between EHV-1 and EHV-4. Alignments

340 between whole genome sequences of EHV-1 (Genbank accession numbers listed above) and EHV-

341 9 (Genbank accession number: NC_011644) showed 98% pairwaise identity and 87.9% identical

342 sites. Both alignments were done by using MAFFT version 7 within Geneious V8.0.4 (Katoh and343 Standley, 2013).

344 Recently, our laboratory has determined the complete genomic sequences of 11 EHV-1 and 14 345 EHV-4 isolates from Australia and New Zealand (Vaz et al., 2016a). Phylogenetic analysis of EHV-4 isolates revealed evidence of widespread recombination. In contrast, analyses of the 11 346 347 EHV-1 isolates from Australia and New Zealand, along with another 13 international EHV-1 348 isolates, detected limited or no evidence of recombination, depending on the method of analysis 349 used. Pathogenesis and epidemiology can influence recombination as both these factors have an 350 impact on the ability of viral infections to overlap in space (i.e. the same cell) and time (Thiry et al., 351 2005). Other factors that promote alphaherpesviruses recombination include similar high loads of 352 each co-infecting virus, similar levels of virulence and invasiveness, and similar tissue distributions of the co-infecting viruses (Thiry et al., 2005). EHV-1 and EHV-4 infections of the respiratory tract 353 354 of horses result in similar viral titres, replication kinetics and durations of virus infection (Allen et 355 al., 2004). A key difference between the pathogenesis of the two viruses lies in the ability of EHV-1 356 to efficiently penetrate the basement membrane of the respiratory mucosa (Vandekerckhove et al., 357 2011) and disseminate to other sites, including the vascular endothelium of the placenta and central 358 nervous system, via a leukocyte-associated viraemia (Gryspeerdt et al., 2010). This involves 359 additional episodes of viral amplification compared to EHV-4, which would seemingly increase the 360 opportunities for recombination in EHV-1 if all other factors were constant. However, the much

higher frequency of natural recombination in EHV-4 compared to EHV-1 suggests that other
factors, such as a lower prevalence of infection with EHV-1, may reduce opportunities for coinfection and may have a greater impact on natural recombination (Vaz *et al.*, 2016a). It is
interesting to note that, similar to the situation with HSV-1 and HSV-2, less recombination is
evident in the less genetically diverse EHV-1, compared to the more genetically diverse EHV-4, but
the relationship between the level of recombination and the level of genetic diversity requires
further investigation.

368

369 3.2 Pseudorabies virus

Pseudorabies virus is the aetiological agent of Aujeszky's disease in pigs and causes economic loss in the pig industry. Although PRV has been the target of eradication programs in some countries, it remains endemic in some regions including Asia, west/east Europe and South America. Pigs infected with PRV display a range of clinical signs, depending of the age of the affected animal, including neurological, respiratory and reproductive disease. Pseudorabies virus can also infect and cause disease in a wide variety of other hosts (Mettenleiter, 2008), including dogs, cats, cattle and small ruminants.

377 A live attenuated vaccine, Bartha-K61, has been used to control disease due to PRV infection in 378 many countries, including China. Despite vaccination programs, disease outbreaks caused by new PRV variants have been reported in China since 2011 (Luo et al., 2014). The first study using 379 380 whole genome sequence analysis to detect natural recombination in PRV has been published 381 recently (Ye et al., 2016). This study has shown that a historical Chinese PRV strain (SC) isolated 382 during the 1980s is a recombinant derived from an endemic Chinese PRV strain and a Bartha-like 383 strain (Ye et al., 2016). Experimental studies have shown that Bartha-K61 can induce protection 384 against the SC strain but not against the new variants (Luo et al., 2014). The SC strain has genomic 385 regions similar to the Bartha strain, so it has been hypothesised that these similar regions may 386 account for the capacity of the Bartha strain vaccine to protect against the SC strain, but not the new

variants, and that this difference in protective immunity may have permitted the new variants to
circulate in pig herds and cause disease (Ye *et al.*, 2016)

389

390 *3.3* Feline herpesvirus-1

391 Recombination between FeHV-1 isolates has been demonstrated in vitro (Fujita et al., 1998), but 392 only one study has investigated natural recombination in FeHV-1 using NGS (Vaz et al., 2016b). 393 Feline herpesvirus-1 is the aetiological agent of feline viral rhinotracheitis and also a common cause 394 of ocular lesions in cats (Maes, 2012). Inactivated and attenuated vaccines are used widely, but do not prevent infection (Jas et al., 2009). Previous studies using techniques such as restriction 395 396 endonuclease digestion of the genome, and analysis of partial genomic sequences suggested low 397 levels of diversity among several isolates (Maeda et al., 1995). Comparison of the whole genomes 398 of 24 historical and contemporary FHV-1 clinical isolates and 2 US-origin commercial vaccine 399 viruses in use worldwide confirmed that FeHV-1 isolates are highly homogeneous and has revealed 400 no evidence of recombination (Vaz et al., 2016b). This is the first alphaherpesvirus in which 401 recombination has been shown to occur under experimental (in vitro) conditions, but not under 402 natural in vivo conditions. Low rates of FeHV-1 recombination in vivo have been hypothesised 403 previously, as FeHV-1 is more homogeneous than other alphaherpesviruses (Fujita et al., 1998), but 404 analyses of a larger number of FeHV-1 clinical isolates, from more diverse geographical regions are 405 required in order to fully assess recombination during natural FeHV-1 infection.

406

407 **4. Natural recombination in avian alphaherpesviruses**

408 Natural recombination has been described in infectious laryngotracheitis virus (ILTV) and Marek's

409 disease virus type 1 (MDV-1, also called *Gallid herpesvirus-2*, *GaHV-2*) (Hughes and Rivailler,

410 2007; Lee *et al.*, 2013; Lee *et al.*, 2012) (Table 3). Marek's disease virus induces T cell lymphomas

411 in susceptible birds (Morrow and Fehler, 2004), while ILTV causes upper respiratory tract disease

412 in chickens (Garcia *et al.*, 2013). Both diseases are highly contagious and cause economic losses in
413 poultry industries worldwide. Live attenuated vaccines are widely used to help control both these
414 diseases.

415

416 *4.1* Marek's disease virus

417 Four complete GaHV-2 genome sequences (CVI988, GA, Md5 and Md11) were compared in 2007 418 and genes with unusually high degrees of synonymous divergence were identified, suggesting the 419 past homologous recombination events (Hughes and Rivailler, 2007). This study identified three 420 clusters of orthologous genes based on their patterns of synonymous substitutions in order to use 421 them for further recombination analysis (Hughes and Rivailler, 2007). Eight loci within the four 422 GaHV-2 genomic sequences were highly homogenous, suggesting homologous recombination 423 between the vaccine strain CVI988, the highly virulent field strain (Md5) and the virulent Md11 424 strain. Additionally, phylogenetic analyses of the GA, Md5 and Md11 strains found that the virulent GA strain generally clustered separately from the highly virulent Md5 and Md11 strains. but further 425 426 analyses of the UL 49.5 and RL ORF12 genes detected a high level of homogeneity between the 427 GA, Md5 and Md11 strains, suggesting that recombination had resulted in the transfer of virulence factors between these strains. The approach used in this study to detect recombination differed from 428 429 those used for other alphaherpesviruses, such as HSV-1, HSV2, VZV, EHV-1, EHV-4, FeHV-1 and 430 ILTV (Bowden et al., 2004; Hughes and Rivailler, 2007; Kolb et al., 2013; Kolb et al., 2015; Lee et al., 2013; Lee et al., 2012; Norberg et al., 2015; Norberg et al., 2007; Norberg et al., 2006; Norberg 431 et al., 2011; Peters et al., 2006; Szpara et al., 2014; Vaz et al., 2016a; Vaz et al., 2016b). Instead, 432 433 the method used was extrapolated from those used to detect sites of homologous recombination within bacterial genomes. This approach examines the synonymous substitution distribution 434 435 patterns among orthologous protein coding genes, with higher synonymous substitutions per site providing evidence of recombination (Hughes and Langley, 2007). 436

437	Analyses of GaHV-2 genome sequences for evidence of recombination, using methods similar to
438	those used for other alphaherpesviruses, would help to further explore these findings. To this end,
439	we examined the 15 GaHV-2 genome sequences publicly available at NCBI database (Table 4) for
440	recombination using the SplitsTree 4 software and RDP4 software packages, as detailed previously
441	(Vaz et al., 2016a; Vaz et al., 2016b). These analyses revealed evidence of recombination within
442	the unique short region of the GaHV-2 genome using the SplitsTree 4 software (Figure 1C) (Huson
443	and Bryant, 2006) and in all regions of the GaHV-2 genome using RDP4 software (Table 5).
444	Together these results provide evidence of recombination in GaHV-2 but further study into the
445	importance of recombination for GaHV-2 evolution and genome diversification is warranted,
446	including examination of a larger number of GaHV-2 field isolates.
4.47	

447

448 4.2 Infectious laryngotracheitis virus

449 Natural recombination in ILTV was first described by our laboratory in the context of attenuated 450 vaccine use in Australia (Lee et al., 2012). This study provided clear evidence of natural 451 recombination in ILTV, and also demonstrated safety concerns associated with the use of live 452 attenuated alphaherpesvirus vaccines, a risk that had previously only been hypothesised. Prior to the 453 detection of ILTV recombinants, two new genotypes of ILTV were shown to be dominant in 454 Australia. These new genotypes, named as class 8 and 9 ILTV, had similar PCR-RFLP patterns, and 455 clustered close to the Class 7 genotype (which includes the Serva vaccine strain) (Blacker et al., 456 2011). These studies, together with similar findings around the world led to the hypothesis that live 457 attenuated ILTV vaccines could displace wild type strains and cause outbreaks of disease (Garcia 458 and Riblet, 2001; Graham et al., 2000). However, the subsequent whole genome sequencing studies 459 showed that natural recombination between the vaccine strains in use in Australia was responsible 460 for the rise of the virulent Class 8 and 9 ILTV strains (Lee et al., 2012). These conclusions were 461 supported by the use of the BootScan algorithm within the SimPlot program, which revealed the 462 locations of breakpoints for intra-species recombination events involving the Serva and Australian

463 origin SA2 and A20 vaccine strains (Lee *et al.*, 2012). These findings echoed earlier studies that
464 showed that recombination between two attenuated HSV-1 strains could generate more virulent
465 strains in a mouse model of infection (Javier *et al.*, 1986).

466 In order to further investigate natural recombination in ILTV, full genome sequence data of other 467 Australian ILTV isolates, along with full genome sequences of isolates from the US, were compared. The analyses revealed extensive recombination networks between ILTV isolates from 468 469 both Australia and the US, and also uncovered new phylogenetic relationships between isolates 470 (Lee et al., 2013). The importance of recombination in the biology and epidemiology of ILTV was then demonstrated further in 2016 in a study showing that a new virulent genotype of ILTV (Class 471 472 10 ILTV) had emerged in Australian poultry flocks as a result of recombination and had become 473 dominant in some geographical areas (Agnew-Crumpton et al., 2016). These studies that have detected and characterised natural recombination in ILTV have provided new insights into the 474 475 epidemiology of the disease caused by this virus and have explained the continuing occurrence of 476 disease outbreaks associated with novel viral genotypes in Australia.

477

478 **5** Conclusions

Alphaherpesviruses have been shown to display a high rate of recombination in vitro and in vivo 479 480 under experimental conditions. However, under natural conditions, detection of recombination 481 varies from limited or absent, in FeHV-1 and EHV-1 (Vaz et al., 2016a; Vaz et al., 2016b) to 482 widespread, in HSV-1, EHV-4 and ILTV (Kolb et al., 2015; Lee et al., 2013; Lee et al., 2012; Szpara et al., 2014; Vaz et al., 2016a). These findings suggest that the contribution that 483 484 recombination makes to genomic diversification and evolution in alphaherpesviruses varies across 485 the different virus species. This highlights the importance of complementing studies that examine 486 recombination in experimental settings with studies that look into recombination in field isolates 487 from naturally infected hosts. The most comprehensive studies in this area have included analyses

488 of a large number of historical and contemporary whole genome sequences of field isolates from489 diverse geographical regions.

490 Most studies of natural alphaherpesvirus recombination have focused on human alphaherpesviruses. 491 However, attenuated herpesvirus vaccines are used in both human medicine (against VZV) and 492 veterinary medicine. Their use is particularly widespread in livestock species, poultry and pets. 493 Recombination involving vaccine strains has been described in VZV, MDV (GaHV-2), ILTV 494 (GaHV-1) and PRV, but the recombination events in these virus species have differed in their 495 nature and consequences. In ILTV, two vaccine strains recombined to produce a virulent 496 recombinant that became a dominant field strain (Lee et al., 2012). In PRV, recombination occurred 497 between a vaccine strain and a field strain, potentially contributing to vaccine-induced selection and 498 protection of another, genetically less similar, field strain (Ye et al., 2016). These studies provide 499 examples of how vaccines and recombination can have an impact on viral evolution and alter the selection pressure on a viral population to result in greater dissemination of more pathogenic 500 501 viruses. As live attenuated vaccines are favoured in veterinary medicine, their impact on viral 502 ecology and evolution should be evaluated and monitored at a population level. Targeted 503 monitoring of recombination after the introduction of new vaccine strains would be helpful for 504 detecting the rise of new, potentially more virulent strains. Consideration of recombination risks in 505 the assessment of vaccine safety during the process of registration could also be advantageous. 506 Currently, natural recombination has not been assessed in BoHV-1 or herpesvirus of turkeys (HVT) 507 but live vaccines using these viruses are in widespread use in the cattle and poultry industries, 508 respectively, with the latter being used as vaccine vector to express exogenous proteins from other 509 avian pathogens (Kapczynski et al., 2015; Li et al., 2011; Roh et al., 2016). Examining natural 510 recombination in these two viruses should be included in future research in order to determine 511 potential risks to animal health.

512 Over the last 10 years the development of new more sophisticated and accessible NGS techniques, 513 along with advances in computational and statistical analysis, has dramatically enhanced the study

514 of natural recombination in alphaherpesviruses. Detection of recombination using more than one 515 approach is recommended and can now be achieved using a number of different bioinformatic analysis software. Commonly used programs include the Recombination Detection Program (RDP), 516 517 SplitsTree software, the Genetic Algorithm Recombination Detection (GARD) program and 518 SimPlot software. The latest version of RDP (RDP4) was made available in 2015 (Martin et al., 519 2015) and includes nine non-parametric recombination detection methods (Martin et al., 2010). 520 SplitTree software uses phylogenetic and reticulate networks, in addition to the pairwise homology 521 test (PHI test), to search for the presence of recombination in a given set of aligned sequences (Huson and Bryant, 2006). The GARD program searches for evidence of segment-specific 522 523 phylogenies. GARD is a likelihood-based model selection procedure that searches multiple sequence alignments for evidence of recombination breakpoints and identifies putative recombinant 524 sequences (Kosakovsky Pond et al., 2006). SimPlot allows the analysis of sequence alignments, and 525 526 searches for breakpoint locations. This program ignores sites containing gaps, and produces a 527 similarity plot identifying the sequence position and the similarity value at each point in the sequence (Lole et al., 1999). The application of more than one method is desirable to increase the 528 529 robustness and consistency of the results, since a true recombination event should be independent of 530 the method of analysis.

531 Sequence quality is also crucial to the accurate detection of recombination events in full genome 532 sequences. Consideration of a measurement of quality such as Phred score and avoiding low 533 sequence quality and parental sequence uncertainty is strongly recommended, since detection of breakpoint locations, and thus recombination, may be unreliable in low quality sequences (Posada, 534 535 2002; Posada and Crandall, 2001). Inclusion of detailed information describing the methods used in recombination analyses is also desirable, specifically in regard to the preparation of the sequences 536 537 that are used for recombination analysis such as the trimming of short sequence repeats (SSR), tandem repeat regions (TRR), and terminal repeated regions (TR). It is recommended to remove 538 these sequences from analyses as they can bias recombination analysis (Dutch et al., 1995; Lee et 539

540 al., 2015; Newman et al., 2015; Vaz et al., 2016a). Finally, studies focused on natural herpesvirus 541 recombination should aim to include high quality information about the samples and virus isolates so that the results from recombination analyses can be considered in the context of relevant clinical 542 and epidemiological information. Pairing recombination analyses with an understanding of the 543 544 epidemiology and pathogenesis of the viruses offers the greatest potential to understand the importance of recombination and the role that it may be playing in virus evolution. Indeed, some of 545 546 the most important findings relating to recombination and the involvement of attenuated vaccines 547 have come from studies that have integrated recombination, epidemiological and viral pathogenesis. Maintaining such a focus in future studies will be important for achieving a comprehensive 548 549 understanding of alphaherpesvirus recombination.

This review has highlighted the significance of natural recombination in many viruses of importance to human and veterinary medicine and has demonstrated the power of using full genome sequencing and sequence analysis to examine natural herpesvirus recombination. It is likely that continued advances in technology and methodologies, further reductions in the cost of NGS techniques and improved bioinformatics tools to assess recombination will enable further developments in the field of recombination, in particular by facilitating the affordable examination of increasing numbers of clinical isolates from diverse widespread geographical regions.

Acknowledgements: Carlos A Loncomán is supported by the Comisión Nacional de Investigación
Científica y Tecnológica (CONICYT), Chilean Government. This work was supported by the
Australian Research Council (FT140101287).

560 **Conflict of interest**

561 The authors declare there is no conflict of interest in submission of this paper.

562 **References**

- 563 Abdelgawad, A., Damiani, A., Ho, S.Y., Strauss, G., Szentiks, C.A., East, M.L., Osterrieder, N.,
- 564 Greenwood, A.D., 2016. Zebra alphaherpesviruses (EHV-1 and EHV-9): Genetic diversity,
 565 latency and co-infections. Viruses.8. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/v8090262</u>
- 566 Agnew-Crumpton, R., Vaz, P.K., Devlin, J.M., O'Rourke, D., Blacker-Smith, H.P., Konsak-
- 567 Ilievski, B., Hartley, C.A., Noormohammadi, A.H., 2016. Spread of the newly emerging
- 568 infectious laryngotracheitis viruses in Australia. Infect Genet Evol.43, 67-73.
- 569 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.meegid.2016.05.023</u>
- 570 Allen, G., Kydd, J., Slater, J. 2004. Equid herpesvirus 1 and equid herpesvirus 4 infections, In:
- 571 Coetzer, J., Tustin, R. (Eds.) Infectious diseases of livestock. Newmarket, Oxford University
- 572 Press., 829-859. http://www.worldcat.org/title/infectious-diseases-of-
- 573 <u>livestock/oclc/61361674</u>
- 574 Barrett-Muir, W., Scott, F.T., Aaby, P., John, J., Matondo, P., Chaudhry, Q.L., Siqueira, M.,
- 575 Poulsen, A., Yaminishi, K., Breuer, J., 2003. Genetic variation of varicella-zoster virus:
- 576 evidence for geographical separation of strains. J Med Virol.70 Suppl 1, S42-47.

577 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jmv.10319</u>

- 578 Becher, P., Orlich, M., Thiel, H.J., 2001. RNA recombination between persisting pestivirus and a
- vaccine strain: generation of cytopathogenic virus and induction of lethal disease. J Virol.75,
 6256-6264. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.75.14.6256-6264.2001
- 581 Blacker, H.P., Kirkpatrick, N.C., Rubite, A., O'Rourke, D., Noormohammadi, A.H., 2011.

582 Epidemiology of recent outbreaks of infectious laryngotracheitis in poultry in Australia.

- 583 Aust Vet J.89, 89-94. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1751-0813.2010.00665.x</u>
- 584 Bowden, R., Sakaoka, H., Donnelly, P., Ward, R., 2004. High recombination rate in herpes simplex
- 585 virus type 1 natural populations suggests significant co-infection. Infect Genet Evol.4, 115-
- 586 123. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.meegid.2004.01.009</u>

- 587 Brandt, C.R., Grau, D.R., 1990. Mixed infection with herpes simplex virus type 1 generates
- 588 recombinants with increased ocular and neurovirulence. Invest Ophthalmol Vis Sci.31,
- 589 2214-2223. <u>http://iovs.arvojournals.org/article.aspx?articleid=2160399&resultClick=1</u>
- 590 Bruen, T.C., Philippe, H., Bryant, D., 2006. A simple and robust statistical test for detecting the
- 591 presence of recombination. Genetics.172, 2665-2681.
- 592 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1534/genetics.105.048975</u>
- 593 Burrel, S., Desire, N., Marlet, J., Dacheux, L., Seang, S., Caumes, E., Bourhy, H., Agut, H.,
- 594 Boutolleau, D., 2015. Genetic diversity within alphaherpesviruses: Characterization of a
- 595 novel variant of herpes simplex virus 2. J Virol.89, 12273-12283.
- 596 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.01959-15</u>
- 597 Camus-Bouclainville, C., Gretillat, M., Py, R., Gelfi, J., Guérin, J.L., Bertagnoli, S., 2011. Genome
- Sequence of SG33 Strain and Recombination between Wild-Type and Vaccine Myxoma
 Viruses. Emerg Infect Dis.17, 633-638. http://dx.doi.org/10.3201/eid1704.101146
- Capobianchi, M.R., Giombini, E., Rozera, G., 2013. Next-generation sequencing technology in
 clinical virology. Clin Microbiol Infect.19, 15-22. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/1469-</u>
- 602 <u>0691.12056</u>
- 603 Chong, Y.L., Padhi, A., Hudson, P.J., Poss, M., 2010. The Effect of Vaccination on the Evolution
 604 and Population Dynamics of Avian Paramyxovirus-1. Plos Pathog.6.
- 605 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.1000872</u>
- 606 Christensen, L.S., Lomniczi, B., 1993. High frequency intergenomic recombination of suid
- 607 herpesvirus 1 (SHV-1, Aujeszky's disease virus). Arch Virol.132, 37-50.
- 608 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF01309842</u>
- 609 Colgrove, R., Diaz, F., Newman, R., Saif, S., Shea, T., Young, S., Henn, M., Knipe, D.M., 2014.
- 610 Genomic sequences of a low passage herpes simplex virus 2 clinical isolate and its plaque-
- 611 purified derivative strain. Virology.450-451, 140-145.
- 612 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.virol.2013.12.014</u>

- 613 Cuervo, N.S., Guillot, S., Romanenkova, N., Combiescu, M., Aubert-Combiescu, A., Seghier, M.,
- 614 Caro, V., Crainic, R., Delpeyroux, F., 2001. Genomic features of intertypic recombinant
 615 sabin poliovirus strains excreted by primary vaccinees. J Virol.75, 5740-5751.
- 616 http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.75.13.5740-5751.2001
- 617 Dahourou, G., Guillot, S., Le Gall, O., Crainic, R., 2002. Genetic recombination in wild-type
- 618 poliovirus. J Gen Virol.83, 3103-3110. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1099/0022-1317-83-12-3103</u>
- 619 Dangler, C.A., Henderson, L.M., Bowman, L.A., Deaver, R.E., 1993. Direct isolation and
- 620 identification of recombinant pseudorabies virus strains from tissues of experimentally co-
- 621 infected swine. Am J Vet Res.54, 540-545. <u>https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/8387251</u>
- 622 Davison, A.J., 2010. Herpesvirus systematics. Vet Microbiol.143, 52-69.
- 623 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vetmic.2010.02.014
- 624 Depledge, D.P., Kundu, S., Jensen, N.J., Gray, E.R., Jones, M., Steinberg, S., Gershon, A.,
- 625 Kinchington, P.R., Schmid, D.S., Balloux, F., Nichols, R.A., Breuer, J., 2014. Deep
- 626 sequencing of viral genomes provides insight into the evolution and pathogenesis of
- 627 varicella zoster virus and its vaccine in humans. Mol Biol Evol.31, 397-409.
- 628 http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/molbev/mst210
- Dohner, D.E., Adams, S.G., Gelb, L.D., 1988. Recombination in tissue culture between varicellazoster virus strains. J Med Virol.24, 329-341. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jmv.1890240310
- 631 Dolan, A., Jamieson, F.E., Cunningham, C., Barnett, B.C., McGeoch, D.J., 1998. The genome
- 632 sequence of herpes simplex virus type 2. J Virol.72, 2010-2021.
- 633 https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC109494/
- Drake, J.W., Hwang, C.B.C., 2005. On the mutation rate of herpes simplex virus type 1.
- 635 Genetics.170, 969-970. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1534/genetics.104.040410</u>
- 636 Dutch, R.E., Bianchi, V., Lehman, I.R., 1995. Herpes simplex virus type 1 DNA replication is
- 637 specifically required for high-frequency homologous recombination between repeated
- 638 sequences. J Virol.69, 3084-3089.

- 639 Fujita, K., Maeda, K., Yokoyama, N., Miyazawa, T., Kai, C., Mikami, T., 1998. In vitro
- recombination of feline herpesvirus type 1. Arch Virol.143, 25-34.

641 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s007050050265</u>

- 642 Garcia, M., Riblet, S.M., 2001. Characterization of infectious laryngotracheitis virus isolates:
- 643 demonstration of viral subpopulations within vaccine preparations. Avian Dis.45, 558-566.
- 644 http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/1592895
- 645 Garcia, M., Spatz, S., Guy, J.S. 2013. Laryngotracheitis, In: Swayne, D., Glisson, J., McDougald,
- 646 L., Nolan, L., Suarez, D. (Eds.) Diseases of Poultry 137-152.
- 647 <u>http://www.worldcat.org/title/diseases-of-poultry/oclc/828715844</u>
- 648 Gilkerson, J.R., Whalley, J.M., Drummer, H.E., Studdert, M.J., Love, D.N., 1999. Epidemiology of
- 649 EHV-1 and EHV-4 in the mare and foal populations on a Hunter Valley stud farm: are
- mares the source of EHV-1 for unweaned foals. Vet Microbiol.68, 27-34.

651 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0378-1135(99)00058-9

Glazenburg, K.L., Moormann, R.J., Kimman, T.G., Gielkens, A.L., Peeters, B.P., 1994. In vivo

recombination of pseudorabies virus strains in mice. Virus Res.34, 115-126.

654 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0168-1702(94)90094-9</u>

- 655 Graham, D.A., McLaren, I.E., Calvert, V., Torrens, D., Meehan, B.M., 2000. RFLP analysis of
- 656 recent Northern Ireland isolates of infectious laryngotracheitis virus: comparison with
- 657 vaccine virus and field isolates from England, Scotland and the Republic of Ireland. Avian

658 Pathol.29, 57-62. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/03079450094298</u>

- 659 Greenwood, Alex D., Tsangaras, K., Ho, Simon Y.W., Szentiks, Claudia A., Nikolin, Veljko M.,
- 660 Ma, G., Damiani, A., East, Marion L., Lawrenz, A., Hofer, H., Osterrieder, N., 2012. A
- 661 Potentially Fatal Mix of Herpes in Zoos. Current Biology.22, 1727-1731.
- 662 http://dx.doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2012.07.035
- 663 Gryspeerdt, A.C., Vandekerckhove, A.P., Garre, B., Barbe, F., Van de Walle, G.R., Nauwynck,
- 664 H.J., 2010. Differences in replication kinetics and cell tropism between neurovirulent and

- 665 non-neurovirulent EHV1 strains during the acute phase of infection in horses. Vet
- 666 Microbiol.142, 242-253. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vetmic.2009.10.015</u>
- 667 Henderson, L.M., Katz, J.B., Erickson, G.A., Mayfield, J.E., 1990. In vivo and in vitro genetic
- 668 recombination between conventional and gene-deleted vaccine strains of pseudorabies virus.
- 669 Am J Vet Res.51, 1656-1662. <u>https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/2173449</u>
- 670 Holmes, E.C., Worobey, M., Rambaut, A., 1999. Phylogenetic evidence for recombination in
- dengue virus. Mol Biol Evol.16, 405-409.
- 672 <u>http://mbe.oxfordjournals.org/content/16/3/405.long</u>
- Hughes, A.L., Langley, K.J., 2007. Nucleotide usage, synonymous substitution pattern, and past
- 674 recombination in genomes of Streptococcus pyogenes. Infect Genet Evol.7, 188-196.
- 675 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.meegid.2006.08.003</u>
- Hughes, A.L., Rivailler, P., 2007. Phylogeny and Recombination History of Gallid Herpesvirus 2
 (Marek's Disease Virus) Genomes. Virus Res.130, 28-33.
- 678 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.virusres.2007.05.008</u>
- Huson, D.H., Bryant, D., 2006. Application of phylogenetic networks in evolutionary studies. Mol
 Biol Evol.23, 254-267. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msj030</u>
- Jas, D., Aeberle, C., Lacombe, V., Guiot, A.L., Poulet, H., 2009. Onset of immunity in kittens after
 vaccination with a non-adjuvanted vaccine against feline panleucopenia, feline calicivirus
- 683 and feline herpesvirus. Vet J.182, 86-93. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tvjl.2008.05.025</u>
- Javier, R.T., Sedarati, F., Stevens, J.G., 1986. Two avirulent herpes simplex viruses generate lethal
 recombinants in vivo. Science.234, 746-748. http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.3022376
- 686 Kapczynski, D.R., Esaki, M., Dorsey, K.M., Jiang, H., Jackwood, M., Moraes, M., Gardin, Y.,
- 687 2015. Vaccine protection of chickens against antigenically diverse H5 highly pathogenic
- avian influenza isolates with a live HVT vector vaccine expressing the influenza
- hemagglutinin gene derived from a clade 2.2 avian influenza virus. Vaccine.33, 1197-1205.
- 690 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2014.12.028</u>

- Katoh, K., Standley, D.M., 2013. MAFFT multiple sequence alignment software version 7:
- 692 improvements in performance and usability. Mol Biol Evol.30, 772-780.
 693 http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/molbev/mst010
- 694 Kaufman, H.E., Azcuy, A.M., Varnell, E.D., Sloop, G.D., Thompson, H.W., Hill, J.M., 2005. HSV-
- 695 1 DNA in tears and saliva of normal adults. Invest Ophthalmol Vis Sci.46, 241-247.
 606 http://dx.doi.org/10.1167/jours.04.0614
- 696 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1167/iovs.04-0614</u>
- Kintner, R.L., Allan, R.W., Brandt, C.R., 1995. Recombinants are isolated at high frequency
 following in vivo mixed ocular infection with two avirulent herpes simplex virus type 1
 strains. Arch Virol.140, 231-244. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF01309859
- 700 Kolb, A.W., Adams, M., Cabot, E.L., Craven, M., Brandt, C.R., 2011. Multiplex sequencing of
- seven ocular herpes simplex virus type-1 genomes: phylogeny, sequence variability, and
- 702SNP distribution. Invest Ophthalmol Vis Sci.52, 9061-9073.
- 703 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1167/iovs.11-7812</u>
- Kolb, A.W., Ané, C., Brandt, C.R., 2013. Using HSV-1 Genome Phylogenetics to Track Past
 Human Migrations. PLos ONE.8. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0076267</u>
- Kolb, A.W., Larsen, I.V., Cuellar, J.A., Brandt, C.R., 2015. Genomic, phylogenetic, and
- recombinational characterization of herpes simplex virus 2 strains. J Virol.89, 6427-6434.
 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.00416-15</u>
- 709 Kosakovsky Pond, S.L., Posada, D., Gravenor, M.B., Woelk, C.H., Frost, S.D.W., 2006. GARD: a
- 710 genetic algorithm for recombination detection. Bioinformatics.22, 3096-3098.
- 711 http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btl474
- Kuhner, M.K., 2006. LAMARC 2.0: maximum likelihood and Bayesian estimation of population
 parameters. Bioinformatics.22, 768-770. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btk051</u>
- 714 Lamers, S.L., Newman, R.M., Laevendecker, O., Tobian, A.A.R., Colgrove, R.C., Ray, S.C.,
- 715 Koelle, D.M., Cohen, J., Knipe, D.M., Quinn, T.C., 2015. Global diversity within and

- between human herpesvirus 1 and 2 glycoproteins. J Virol.89, 8206-8218.
- 717 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.01302-15</u>
- Lee, K., Kolb, A.W., Sverchkov, Y., Cuellar, J.A., Craven, M., Brandt, C.R., 2015. Recombination
 analysis of Herpes simplex virus 1 reveals a bias toward GC content and the inverted repeat
 regions. J Virol.89, 7214-7223. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.00880-15
- 721 Lee, S.-W., Devlin, J.M., Markham, J.F., Noormohammadi, A.H., Browning, G.F., Ficorilli, N.P.,
- Hartley, C.A., Markham, P.F., 2013. Phylogenetic and molecular epidemiological studies
- reveal evidence of multiple past recombination events between infectious laryngotracheitis
 viruses. PLos ONE.8, e55121. http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0055121
- Lee, S.W., Markham, P.F., Coppo, M.J., Legione, A.R., Markham, J.F., Noormohammadi, A.H.,
- Browning, G.F., Ficorilli, N., Hartley, C.A., Devlin, J.M., 2012. Attenuated vaccines can
 recombine to form virulent field viruses. Science.337, 188.
- 728 http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1217134
- 729 Li, Y., Reddy, K., Reid, S.M., Cox, W.J., Brown, I.H., Britton, P., Nair, V., Iqbal, M., 2011.
- 730 Recombinant herpesvirus of turkeys as a vector-based vaccine against highly pathogenic
- H7N1 avian influenza and Marek's disease. Vaccine.29, 8257-8266.
- 732 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2011.08.115</u>
- Liesegang, T.J., 2001. Herpes simplex virus epidemiology and ocular importance. Cornea.20, 1-13.
 https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/11188989
- 735 Liu, H.M., Zheng, D.P., Zhang, L.B., Oberste, M.S., Kew, O.M., Pallansch, M.A., 2003. Serial
- recombination during circulation of type 1 wild-vaccine recombinant polioviruses in China.
- 737 J Virol.77, 10994-11005. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JVI.77.20.10994-11005.2003</u>
- Lo Piano, A., Martínez-Jiménez, M.I., Zecchi, L., Ayora, S., 2011. Recombination-dependent
 concatemeric viral DNA replication. Virus Res.160, 1-14.
- 740 http://dx.doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.virusres.2011.06.009

- 741 Lole, K.S., Bollinger, R.C., Paranjape, R.S., Gadkari, D., Kulkarni, S.S., Novak, N.G., Ingersoll, R.,
- 742 Sheppard, H.W., Ray, S.C., 1999. Full-length human immunodeficiency virus type 1
- genomes from subtype C-infected seroconverters in India, with evidence of intersubtype
- 744 recombination. J Virol.73, 152-160.
- 745 https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC103818/
- 746 Loparev, V.N., Gonzalez, A., Deleon-Carnes, M., Tipples, G., Fickenscher, H., Torfason, E.G.,
- 747 Schmid, D.S., 2004. Global identification of three major genotypes of varicella-zoster virus:
- 748 longitudinal clustering and strategies for genotyping. J Virol.78, 8349-8358.
- 749 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.78.15.8349-8358.2004</u>
- 750 Lowhagen, G.B., Tunback, P., Bergstrom, T., 2002. Proportion of herpes simplex virus (HSV) type
- 1 and type 2 among genital and extragenital HSV isolates. Acta Derm Venereol.82, 118120. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12125939
- 753 Luo, Y., Li, N., Cong, X., Wang, C.-H., Du, M., Li, L., Zhao, B., Yuan, J., Liu, D.-D., Li, S., Li, Y.,
- Sun, Y., Qiu, H.-J., 2014. Pathogenicity and genomic characterization of a pseudorabies
- virus variant isolated from Bartha-K61-vaccinated swine population in China. Vet
- 756 Microbiol.174, 107-115. <u>http://dx.doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vetmic.2014.09.003</u>
- 757 Maeda, K., Kawaguchi, Y., Ono, M., Tajima, T., Mikami, T., 1995. Restriction endonuclease
- analysis of field isolates of feline herpesvirus type 1 and identification of heterogeneous
- regions. J Clin Microbiol.33, 217-221. <u>http://europepmc.org/articles/PMC227913</u>
- 760 Maes, R., 2012. Felid herpesvirus type 1 infection in cats: A natural host model for
- alphaherpesvirus pathogenesis. ISRN Veterinary Science.2012, 14.
- 762 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.5402/2012/495830</u>
- Martin, D.P., Lemey, P., Lott, M., Moulton, V., Posada, D., Lefeuvre, P., 2010. RDP3: a flexible
- and fast computer program for analyzing recombination. Bioinformatics.26, 2462-2463.
- 765 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btq467</u>

- 766 Martin, D.P., Lemey, P., Posada, D., 2011. Analysing recombination in nucleotide sequences. Mol
- 767 Ecol Resour.11, 943-955. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-0998.2011.03026.x</u>
- 768 Martin, D.P., Murrell, B., Golden, M., Khoosal, A., Muhire, B., 2015. RDP4: Detection and
- analysis of recombination patterns in virus genomes. Virus Evolution.1.
- 770 <u>http://ve.oxfordjournals.org/content/1/1/vev003.abstract</u>
- 771 McGeoch, D.J., Cook, S., Dolan, A., Jamieson, F.E., Telford, E.A., 1995. Molecular phylogeny and
- evolutionary timescale for the family of mammalian herpesviruses. J Mol Biol.247, 443-

773 458. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1006/jmbi.1995.0152</u>

- 774 Mettenleiter, T.C. 2008. Pseudorabies Virus A2 Mahy, Brian W.J, In: Regenmortel, M.H.V.V.
- 775 (Ed.) Encyclopedia of Virology (Third Edition). Academic Press, Oxford, 341-351.

776 http://dx.doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/B978-012374410-4.00480-5

- 777 Meurens, F., Keil, G.M., Muylkens, B., Gogev, S., Schynts, F., Negro, S., Wiggers, L., Thiry, E.,
- 2004. Interspecific recombination between two ruminant alphaherpesviruses, bovine
- herpesviruses 1 and 5. J Virol.78, 9828-9836. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.78.18.9828-</u>
 9836.2004
- Morrow, C., Fehler, F. 2004. 5 Marek's disease: A worldwide problem, In: Davison, F., Nair, V.
 (Eds.) Marek's Disease. Academic Press, Oxford, 49-61.
- 783 http://dx.doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/B978-012088379-0/50009-8
- 784 Muylkens, B., Farnir, F., Meurens, F., Schynts, F., Vanderplasschen, A., Georges, M., Thiry, E.,
- 785 2009. Coinfection with two closely related alphaherpesviruses results in a highly diversified
- recombination mosaic displaying negative genetic interference. J Virol.83, 3127-3137.
- 787 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.02474-08</u>
- 788 Newman, R.M., Lamers, S.L., Weiner, B., Ray, S.C., Colgrove, R.C., Diaz, F., Jing, L.C., Wang,
- 789 K., Saif, S., Young, S., Henn, M., Laeyendecker, O., Tobian, A.A.R., Cohen, J.I., Koelle,
- D.M., Quinn, T.C., Knipe, D.M., 2015. Genome sequencing and analysis of geographically

791 diverse clinical isolates of Herpes simplex virus 2. J Virol.89, 8219-8232.

792 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.01303-15</u>

- Norberg, P., Bergstrom, T., Rekabdar, E., Lindh, M., Liljeqvist, J.A., 2004. Phylogenetic analysis
 of clinical herpes simplex virus type 1 isolates identified three genetic groups and
 recombinant viruses. J Virol.78, 10755-10764. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.78.19.10755-</u>
- 796
 10764.2004
- Norberg, P., Depledge, D.P., Kundu, S., Atkinson, C., Brown, J., Haque, T., Hussaini, Y.,
- 798 MacMahon, E., Molyneaux, P., Papaevangelou, V., Sengupta, N., Koay, E.S., Tang, J.W.,
- 799 Underhill, G.S., Grahn, A., Studahl, M., Breuer, J., Bergstrom, T., 2015. Recombination of
- 800 Globally Circulating Varicella Zoster Virus. J Virol. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.00437-15</u>
- 801 Norberg, P., Kasubi, M.J., Haarr, L., Bergstrom, T., Liljeqvist, J.A., 2007. Divergence and
- recombination of clinical herpes simplex virus type 2 isolates. J Virol.81, 13158-13167.
 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.01310-07</u>
- 804 Norberg, P., Liljeqvist, J.A., Bergstrom, T., Sammons, S., Schmid, D.S., Loparev, V.N., 2006.
- 805 Complete-genome phylogenetic approach to varicella-zoster virus evolution: genetic 806 divergence and evidence for recombination. J Virol.80, 9569-9576.
- 807 http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.00835-06
- Norberg, P., Roth, A., Bergstrom, T., 2013. Genetic recombination of tick-borne flaviviruses among
 wild-type strains. Virology.440, 105-116. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.virol.2013.02.017</u>
- 810 Norberg, P., Tyler, S., Severini, A., Whitley, R., Liljeqvist, J.A., Bergstrom, T., 2011. A genome-
- 811 wide comparative evolutionary analysis of herpes simplex virus type 1 and varicella zoster
 812 virus. PLos ONE.6, e22527. http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0022527
- Pagamjav, O., Sakata, T., Matsumura, T., Yamaguchi, T., Fukushi, H., 2005. Natural recombinant
 between equine herpesviruses 1 and 4 in the ICP4 gene. Microbiol Immunol.49, 167-179.
- 815 Pareek, C.S., Smoczynski, R., Tretyn, A., 2011. Sequencing technologies and genome sequencing. J
- 816 Appl Genet.52, 413-435. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s13353-011-0057-x</u>

- 817 Patel, J.R., Heldens, J., 2005. Equine herpesviruses 1 (EHV-1) and 4 (EHV-4)--epidemiology,
- 818 disease and immunoprophylaxis: a brief review. Vet J.170, 14-23.

819 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tvjl.2004.04.018</u>

- 820 Peters, G.A., Tyler, S.D., Grose, C., Severini, A., Gray, M.J., Upton, C., Tipples, G.A., 2006. A
- 821 full-genome phylogenetic analysis of varicella-zoster virus reveals a novel origin of
- 822 replication-based genotyping scheme and evidence of recombination between major
- 823 circulating clades. J Virol.80, 9850-9860. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.00715-06</u>
- 824 Pond, S.L., Frost, S.D., 2005. Datamonkey: rapid detection of selective pressure on individual sites
- of codon alignments. Bioinformatics.21, 2531-2533.
- 826 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/bti320</u>
- 827 Posada, D., 2002. Evaluation of methods for detecting recombination from DNA sequences:
- 828 empirical data. Mol Biol Evol.19, 708-717.
- 829 http://mbe.oxfordjournals.org/content/19/5/708.long
- Posada, D., Crandall, K.A., 2001. Evaluation of methods for detecting recombination from DNA
 sequences: computer simulations. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A.98, 13757-13762.
- 832 http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.241370698
- 833 Quinlivan, M., Gershon, A.A., Steinberg, S.P., Breuer, J., 2005. An evaluation of single nucleotide
- 834 polymorphisms used to differentiate vaccine and wild type strains of varicella-zoster virus. J
- 835 Med Virol.75, 174-180. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jmv.20253</u>
- 836 Quinlivan, M., Sengupta, N., Breuer, J., 2009. A case of varicella caused by co-infection with two
- 837 different genotypes of varicella-zoster virus. J Clin Virol.44, 66-69.
- 838 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jcv.2008.09.004
- 839 Roh, J.H., Kang, M., Wei, B., Yoon, R.H., Seo, H.S., Bahng, J.Y., Kwon, J.T., Cha, S.Y., Jang,
- 840 H.K., 2016. Efficacy of HVT-IBD vector vaccine compared to attenuated live vaccine using
- 841 in-ovo vaccination against a Korean very virulent IBDV in commercial broiler chickens.
- 842 Poult Sci.95, 1020-1024. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.3382/ps/pew042</u>

- 843 Sakaoka, H., Kurita, K., Gouro, T., Kumamoto, Y., Sawada, S., Ihara, M., Kawana, T., 1995.
- Analysis of genomic polymorphism among herpes simplex virus type 2 isolates from four
 areas of Japan and three other countries. J Med Virol.45, 259-272.
- 846 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jmv.1890450305</u>
- 847 Sakaoka, H., Kurita, K., Iida, Y., Takada, S., Umene, K., Kim, Y.T., Ren, C.S., Nahmias, A.J.,
- 848 1994. Quantitative analysis of genomic polymorphism of herpes simplex virus type 1 strains
- 849 from six countries: studies of molecular evolution and molecular epidemiology of the virus.
- 850 J Gen Virol.75 (Pt 3), 513-527. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1099/0022-1317-75-3-513</u>
- Sauerbrei, A., Wutzler, P., 2007. Different genotype pattern of varicella-zoster virus obtained from
 patients with varicella and zoster in Germany. J Med Virol.79, 1025-1031.
- 853 http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jmv.20879
- Sauerbrei, A., Zell, R., Philipps, A., Wutzler, P., 2008. Genotypes of varicella-zoster virus wildtype strains in Germany. J Med Virol.80, 1123-1130. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jmv.21178</u>
- 856 Schmidt-Chanasit, J., Bialonski, A., Heinemann, P., Ulrich, R.G., Gunther, S., Rabenau, H.F.,
- 857 Doerr, H.W., 2009. A 10-year molecular survey of herpes simplex virus type 1 in Germany
- demonstrates a stable and high prevalence of genotypes A and B. J Clin Virol.44, 235-237.
- 859 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jcv.2008.12.016</u>
- 860 Schynts, F., Meurens, F., Detry, B., Vanderplasschen, A., Thiry, E., 2003. Rise and survival of
- 861 bovine herpesvirus 1 recombinants after primary infection and reactivation from latency. J
- 862 Virol.77, 12535-12542. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JVI.77.23.12535-12542.2003</u>
- 863 Seligman, S.J., Gould, E.A., 2004. Live flavivirus vaccines: reasons for caution. Lancet.363, 2073864 2075. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/s0140-6736(04)16459-3
- 865 Szpara, M.L., Gatherer, D., Ochoa, A., Greenbaum, B., Dolan, A., Bowden, R.J., Enquist, L.W.,
- 866 Legendre, M., Davison, A.J., 2014. Evolution and Diversity in Human Herpes Simplex
- 867 Virus Genomes. J Virol.88, 1209-1227. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.01987-13</u>

- 868 Takada, M., Suzutani, T., Yoshida, I., Matoba, M., Azuma, M., 1995. Identification of varicella-
- zoster virus strains by PCR analysis of three repeat elements and a PstI-site-less region. J
 Clin Microbiol.33, 658-660. http://jcm.asm.org/content/33/3/658.full.pdf+html
- Takahashi, M., Otsuka, T., Okuno, Y., Asano, Y., Yazaki, T., Isomura, S., 1974. Live vaccine used
- to prevent the spread of varicella in children in hospital. The Lancet.304, 1288-1290.
- 873 <u>http://dx.doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(74)90144-5</u>
- Telford, E.A., Watson, M.S., McBride, K., Davison, A.J., 1992. The DNA sequence of equine
 herpesvirus-1. Virology.189, 304-316. <u>https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/1318606</u>
- 876 Telford, E.A., Watson, M.S., Perry, J., Cullinane, A.A., Davison, A.J., 1998. The DNA sequence of
- 877 equine herpesvirus-4. J Gen Virol.79 (Pt 5), 1197-1203. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1099/0022-</u>
- 878 <u>1317-79-5-1197</u>
- 879 Thiry, E., Meurens, F., Muylkens, B., McVoy, M., Gogev, S., Thiry, J., Vanderplasschen, A.,
- Epstein, A., Keil, G., Schynts, F., 2005. Recombination in alphaherpesviruses. Rev Med
 Virol.15, 89-103. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/rmv.451
- Umene, K., Sakaoka, H., 1997. Populations of two eastern countries of Japan and Korea and with a
- related history share a predominant genotype of herpes simplex virus type 1. Arch
- 884 Virol.142, 1953-1961. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s007050050213</u>
- 885 Vandekerckhove, A.P., Glorieux, S., Gryspeerdt, A.C., Steukers, L., Van Doorsselaere, J.,
- 886 Osterrieder, N., Van de Walle, G.R., Nauwynck, H.J., 2011. Equine alphaherpesviruses
- 887 (EHV-1 and EHV-4) differ in their efficiency to infect mononuclear cells during early steps
- of infection in nasal mucosal explants. Vet Microbiol.152, 21-28.
- 889 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vetmic.2011.03.038</u>
- 890 Vassilev, V., 2005. Stable and Consistent Genetic Profile of Oka Varicella Vaccine Virus Is Not
- 891 Linked with Appearance of Infrequent Breakthrough Cases Postvaccination. J Clin
- 892 Microbiol.43, 5415-5417. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jcm.43.10.5415-5417.2005</u>

- 893 Vaz, P.K., Horsington, J., Hartley, C.A., Browning, G.F., Ficorilli, N.P., Studdert, M.J., Gilkerson,
- J.R., Devlin, J.M., 2016a. Evidence of widespread natural recombination among field
 isolates of equine herpesvirus 4 but not among field isolates of equine herpesvirus 1. J Gen
 Virol.97, 747-755. http://dx.doi.org/10.1099/jgv.0.000378
- 897 Vaz, P.K., Job, N., Horsington, J., Ficorilli, N., Studdert, M.J., Hartley, C.A., Gilkerson, J.R.,
- 898 Browning, G.F., Devlin, J.M., 2016b. Low genetic diversity among historical and
- contemporary clinical isolates of felid herpesvirus 1. BMC Genomics.17, 704.

900 http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/s12864-016-3050-2

- 901 Wagenaar, T.R., Chow, V.T., Buranathai, C., Thawatsupha, P., Grose, C., 2003. The out of Africa
- 902 model of varicella-zoster virus evolution: single nucleotide polymorphisms and private
- 903 alleles distinguish Asian clades from European/North American clades. Vaccine.21, 1072-
- 904 1081. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0264-410X(02)00559-5</u>
- 905 Wang, C.C., Yepes, L.C., Danaher, R.J., Berger, J.R., Mootoor, Y., Kryscio, R.J., Miller, C.S.,
- 906 2010. Low prevalence of varicella zoster virus and herpes simplex virus type 2 in saliva
- 907 from human immunodeficiency virus-infected persons in the era of highly active
- 908 antiretroviral therapy. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod.109, 232-237.
- 909 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tripleo.2009.08.037</u>
- Weller, S.K., Sawitzke, J.A., 2014. Recombination promoted by DNA viruses: phage lambda to
 herpes simplex virus. Annu Rev Microbiol.68, 237-258. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1146/annurev-</u>
- 912 <u>micro-091313-103424</u>
- 913 Wenhui, L., Zhongyan, W., Guanqun, Z., Zhili, L., JingYun, M., Qingmei, X., Baoli, S., Yingzuo,
- 914 B., 2012. Complete genome sequence of a novel variant porcine reproductive and
- 915 respiratory syndrome virus (PRRSV) strain: evidence for recombination between vaccine
- 916 and wild-type PRRSV strains. J Virol.86, 9543. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.01341-12</u>
- 917 Wildy, P., 1955. Recombination with herpes simplex virus. J Gen Microbiol.13, 346-360.
- 918 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1099/00221287-13-2-346</u>

- 919 Wilson, D.J., McVean, G., 2006. Estimating Diversifying Selection and Functional Constraint in
- 920 the Presence of Recombination. Genetics.172, 1411-1425.

921 http://dx.doi.org/10.1534/genetics.105.044917

- 922 Ye, C., Guo, J.C., Gao, J.C., Wang, T.Y., Zhao, K., Chang, X.B., Wang, Q., Peng, J.M., Tian, Z.J.,
- 923 Cai, X.H., Tong, G.Z., An, T.Q., 2016. Genomic analyses reveal that partial sequence of an
- 924 earlier pseudorabies virus in China is originated from a Bartha-vaccine-like strain.

925 Virology.491, 56-63. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.virol.2016.01.016</u>

- 26 Zell, R., Taudien, S., Pfaff, F., Wutzler, P., Platzer, M., Sauerbrei, A., 2012. Sequencing of 21
- 927 varicella-zoster virus genomes reveals two novel genotypes and evidence of recombination.
- 928 J Virol.86, 1608-1622. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/jvi.06233-11</u>
- Zerboni, L., Sen, N., Oliver, S.L., Arvin, A.M., 2014. Molecular mechanisms of varicella zoster
 virus pathogenesis. Nat Rev Micro.12, 197-210. http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro3215
- 231 Zhao, Y., Kong, C.C., Wang, Y.F., 2015. Multiple comparison analysis of two new genomic
- 932 sequences of ILTV strains from China with other strains from different geographic regions.
- 933 PLos ONE.10, 21. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0132747</u>
- 934 935
- 936
- 937
- 938
- 939
- 940
- 941
- 942

943

944 Figure captions:

Figure 1. Recombination network trees generated using SplitsTree4 from alignment of 15 945 946 publically available GaHV-2 genome sequences on Genbank. A) Alignment of complete genomes 947 excluding the terminal sequence repeats. B) Internal repeat region. C) Unique short region. The 948 multiple reticulate networks indicate recombination events between the isolates. The bar indicates 949 the rate of evolution in sequence substitution per site. P values for the PHI test for detecting 950 recombination, as implemented in SplitsTree4, are shown and were highly significant for the 951 complete genome and for the unique short region. D) Unique long region. Details about the 952 nucleotide sequences used in these analyses are shown in Table 4.

Table 1. Timeline and summary of key studies examining natural recombination in human alphaherpesviruses.

Year	Summary of study findings	Reference				
Herpe	Herpes simplex virus 1 (HSV-1)					
2004	Evidence of recombination in partial genome sequences (4% of the genome) from 14 clinical samples from UK compared with samples from Seoul and South Korea.	Bowden <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2004				
2004	Evidence of recombination in partial genome sequences (2.3% of the genome) in 28 clinical samples from Sweden.	Norberg <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2004				
2011	Whole genome sequencing and analysis of seven clinical isolates shows one isolate had variable phylogenetic features, potentially due to recombination.	Kolb <i>et al.</i> , 2011				
2013	Widespread recombination was detected following whole genome sequencing of 31 clinical isolates from diverse geographical regions.	Kolb <i>et al</i> ., 2013				
2014	Widespread recombination was found following whole genome sequencing of 20 field strains obtained from China, Japan, Kenya and South Korea and comparison with those available from the US, Europe and Japan	Szpara <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2014				
Herpe	es simplex virus-2 (HSV-2)					
2007	Analysis of partial genome sequences (3.5% of the genome) from 47 diverse clinical isolates shows HSV-2 has fewer genogroups than HSV-1.	Norberg <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2007				
2015	Whole genome sequencing and analysis of six clinical isolates, along with analysis of two other available genome reveals evidence of recombination.	Kolb <i>et al.</i> , 2015				
2015	Analysis of 34 near complete genome sequences from clinical isolates from diverse geographical regions shows that recombination is present but is less frequent than in HSV-1	Newman <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2015				
Varic	ella zoster virus (VZV)*					
2003	Analysis of SNP patterns from geographically diverse isolates classified VZV into four major groups and showed evidence of potential recombination	Wagenaar et al., 2003				
2004	Analysis of SNP patterns from geographically diverse isolates determined three major groups and showed evidence of potential recombination in one group/	Loparev <i>et al.</i> , 2004				
2006	Whole genome sequencing of 11 representative isolates from North America identified recombination potentially involving the VZV vaccine strain.	Peters <i>et al.</i> , 2006				
2006	Whole genome sequencing of isolates previously identified by Loparev <i>et al.</i> , (2004) detected recombination, potentially involving the VZV vaccine.	Norberg <i>et</i> al, 2006				
2011	Whole genome sequencing of a Russian clinical isolate showed significant intra-clade recombination events	Norberg <i>et al.</i> , 2011				
2012	Whole genome sequencing of 21 isolates revealed two novel genotypes and evidence of recombination	Zell, <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> ,2012				
2015	Whole genome sequences of 37 isolates from diverse geographical regions confirmed that viruses in the Japanese vaccine-like group consistently display higher levels of recombination.	Norberg <i>et al.</i> , 2015				

* Live attenuated vaccine is in use

Table 2. Timeline and summary of key studies examining natural recombination in other (non-human) mammalian alphaherpesviruses.

Year	Summary of study findings	Reference			
Equin	e herpesvirus-1*, -4* and -9 (EHV-1, -4 and -9)				
2005	Analysis of partial genome sequence detected the first natural inter-species recombination reported between EHV-1 and EHV-4.	Pagamjav <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2005			
2012	Analyses of partial genome sequences of an isolate from a polar bear in a zoo revealed inter-species recombination between EHV-1 and EHV-9	Greenwood <i>et al.</i> , 2012			
2016	Whole genome sequencing of 11 EHV-1 and 14 EHV-4 isolates from Australia and New Zealand, and comparison with other available genomes, showed widespread recombination in EHV-4 but not in EHV-1.	Vaz <i>et al.</i> , 2016a			
Pseud	orabies virus (PRV)*				
2016	Whole genome sequencing of isolates from China demonstrated recombination involving a vaccine-like strain, potentially altering selection pressures in vaccinated pig populations	Ye <i>et al.</i> , 2016			
Feline herpesvirus-1 (FeHV-1)*					
2016	Analyses of 24 whole genome sequences from clinical samples and 2 genome sequences of US origin vaccines found no evidence of recombination.	Vaz <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> ,2016b			

* Live attenuated vaccine is in use

Table 3. Timeline and summary of key studies examining natural recombination in avian alphaherpesviruses.

Year	Summary of study findings	Reference
Mare	k's disease virus (MDV)*	
2007	Four whole genome sequences were analyzed and recombination was identified between a vaccine strain and a highly virulent field strain	Hughes and Rivallier <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2007
Infect	ious laryngotracheitis virus (ILTV)*	
2012	Whole genome sequence analyses of newly emerged field isolates found that two attenuated vaccine strains had recombined to generate virulent viruses.	Lee <i>et al.</i> , 2012
2013	Whole genome sequence analyses of current and historical isolates in Australia and the US revealed extensive recombination networks	Lee <i>et al.</i> , 2013
2016	A newly emerged virulent field strain in Australia was sequenced and shown to be a recombinant virus.	Agnew- Crumpton <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> , 2016

* Live attenuated vaccine is in use

Isolate (GenBank accession number)	Year of isolation (Reference)	Country	Comments	Genome sequence reference
GA (AF147806)	1964 (Eidson and Schmittle, 1968)	USA	Isolated from ovarian tumour	(Lee et al., 2000)
Md5 (AF243438)	1980 (Witter <i>et al.</i> , 1980)	USA	Very virulent isolate from spleen of commercial broilers	(Tulman <i>et al.</i> , 2000)
Md11 (AY510475)	1980 (Witter <i>et al.</i> , 1980)	USA	Isolated and maintained in duck embryo fibroblast	(Niikura <i>et al.</i> , 2006)
CVI988 (DQ530348)	1972 (Rispens et al., 1972)	Worldwide use	Vaccine used since 1990	(Spatz et al., 2007a)
RB-1B (EF523390)	1982 (Schat <i>et al.</i> , 1982)	USA	Highly oncogenic	(Spatz et al., 2007b)
CU-2 (EU499381)	1973 (Smith and Calnek, 1973)	USA	Mildly virulent	(Spatz and Rue, 2008)
814 (JF742597)	1980	China	Isolated from healthy chickens	(Zhang et al., 2012)
LMS (JQ314003)	2007	China	Isolated from broilers with severe disease	(Cheng et al., 2012)
648A (JQ806361, JQ806362, JQ809691, JQ809692, JQ820250 and JQ836662)	1994 (Witter, 1997)	USA	Serial passages of isolate 648A (passages p11, p31, p41, p61, p81, p101)	(Spatz <i>et al.</i> , 2012)
GX0101 (JX844666)	2001 (Zhang <i>et al.</i> , 2012)	China	Isolated from layers with severe tumours	(Su et al., 2012)

Table 4. Publically available full genome sequences of GaHV-2 used in recombination analyses.

	Breakpoint (in alignment) Breakpoint Breakpoint beginning 99% CI* ending 99% CI*		Possible viruses involved in recombination event	Method of breakpoint detection in RDP4 software	
Genome region			R: Recombinant, M: Major parent, m: Minor parent		
Internal/terminal repeat	18291 – 19335	19926 - 21087	R: GA, M: unknown, m: GX0101	GENECONV, MaxChi, 3Seq.	
Unique long	7627 – 9282	9365 - 9689	R: 648a isolate_p101, M: 648a isolate_p81, m: unknown.	GENECONV, Bootscan, MaxChi, Chimaera, 3Seq	
	51568 - 73297	108359 - 3016	R: GA, M: unknown, m: Md5	MaxChi, Chimaera, SiScan, 3Seq.	
	91057 - 58003	91057 - 58003	R: GX0101, M: 814, m: unknown	GENECONV, MaxChi, SiScan, 3Seq.	
	82371 - 93738	93740 - 101624	R: 814, M: unknown, m: Md5	MaxChi, Chimaera, 3Seq.	
Unique short	2289 - 3999	5959 - 7480	R: CVI988, M: LMS, m:GX0101	GENECONV, MaxChi, Chimaera, SiScan, 3Seq.	

 Table 5. Recombination breakpoint analysis of GaHV-2 genome sequences using RDP4

*CI = confidence interval



B) Internal repeat (p = 0.05766)

GA

Supplementary Material Click here to download Supplementary Material: Review manuscript highlight.docx

University Library



A gateway to Melbourne's research publications

Minerva Access is the Institutional Repository of The University of Melbourne

Author/s:

Loncoman, CA; Vaz, PK; Coppo, MJC; Hartley, CA; Morera, FJ; Browning, GF; Devlin, JM

Title:

Natural recombination in alphaherpesviruses: Insights into viral evolution through full genome sequencing and sequence analysis

Date:

2017-04-01

Citation:

Loncoman, C. A., Vaz, P. K., Coppo, M. J. C., Hartley, C. A., Morera, F. J., Browning, G. F. & Devlin, J. M. (2017). Natural recombination in alphaherpesviruses: Insights into viral evolution through full genome sequencing and sequence analysis. INFECTION GENETICS AND EVOLUTION, 49, pp.174-185. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meegid.2016.12.022.

Persistent Link:

http://hdl.handle.net/11343/193002

File Description: Accepted version