AN INQUIRY INTO THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE VISUAL ARTS AND PSYCHOTHERAPY IN POST REVOLUTIONARY CUBA

MARGARET HILLS M.Ed

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in the discipline of International Health.

QUEEN MARGARET UNIVERSITY COLLEGE

MARCH 2006

Acknowledgements

> *"Para sobrevivir, planificar la esperanza, remedio para melancólicos".*
> (Enrique Pichon Rivière in a collage sent to Anna Pampliega de Quiroga)

Ya no seré feliz. Tal vez no importa.
Hay tantas otras cosas en el mundo;
un instante cualquiera es más profundo
y diverso que el mar. La vida es corta

y aunque las horas son tan largas, una
oscura maravilla nos acecha,
la muerte, ese otro mar, esa otra flecha
que nos libre del sol y de la luna

y del amor. La dicha que me diste
y me quitaste debe ser borrada;
lo que era todo tiene que ser nada.

Sólo que me queda el goce de estar triste,
esa vana costumbre que me inclina
al Sur, a cierta puerta, a cierta esquina.

Borges

Contents

Abstract

This thesis focuses on the relationship between the visual arts and psychotherapy in post Revolutionary Cuba. The material on which it is based was collected over a fourteen month period and three visits to Cuba between April 1999 and August 2001. The study opens with the presentation of two brief histories, that of Cuban Art and Art Education and that of Cuban Mental Health Care. In this context the Revolution is taken as a useful reference point in terms of thinking about change and historical developments in both fields.

Naturalistic Inquiry and Grounded Theory respectively were used to collect and analyse the data presented. These approaches allowed the researcher the degree of flexibility necessary to undertake research in a potentially delicate situation full of unknowns and to be able to modify and develop the course of inquiry as new evidence emerged. The main descriptive themes emerging from an analysis of the data pertain to the relationship between artists and mental health care professionals. These are (1) therapeutic work undertaken by artists, (2) artists working collaboratively with mental health professionals and (3) psychologists working with art as a therapy. The story which emerges pertains to a series of largely unrecorded histories spanning a forty year period. It begins with the work of Antonia Eiriz, who emerges as a key figure in the early development of art as a therapy and concludes with the work of the psychologist, Aurora García Morey, who takes centre stage in its continued development.

This snapshot of Cuban art therapy is specific and unique and demonstrates the development of a very particular Cuban practice. However an analysis of the analytic themes which emerge from the data suggests that certain concepts such as responsiveness and pragmatism resound within a wider picture. These themes are discussed in chapters 7 and 8 with reference to the wider international context and specifically to the development of the profession in the United Kingdom. In my conclusions I suggest that these themes may be applicable to other areas of research and practice outwith and beyond Cuba and that while the concept of art therapy cannot be narrowly defined when it is applied to understanding practices in other, social, economic and cultural contexts, there are common factors which can be identified.

Preface

> "Cuba is a country where politics, magic and religion are neighbouring provinces, at times without a dividing line". (Thomas, 1971, p. 824)

> "One evening in Regla, I was making my way towards the pier to take the ferryboat to the other side of Havana bay. The street was deserted. It was twilight. Looking up I saw a small figure walking towards me. As the figure approached I thought that it was a child coming from a party but it was not a child and neither was it man or a woman. It was a being, a tiny person, about four feet high dressed in a red skirt, a tightly fitting red jacket, white stockings and shiny black leather shoes. In his right hand he held a white staff and on his head was a straw hat adorned with red ribbons. His face was dark but not black and although I refer to him now as masculine I was then, not sure. As our paths crossed, we both stopped and he said to me *'Soy Eleggúa'*, and I replied, *'Soy Margarita'*. I took the boat across the bay to Havana Vieja. It was already dark. I knew who Eleggúa was; he is the son of the Yoruba god Obatalá and the owner of all the roads in the world".
> (Diary entry, May, 2000)

In the conviction that it is not possible to fully understand and appreciate the situation in post-revolutionary Cuba without reference to pre-revolutionary Cuba, I had originally envisaged a preliminary chapter offering a broad-brush account of Cuban social, economic, political and cultural history to serve as a backdrop to my discussion. I wrote this chapter but it later became clear that its inclusion pushed the parameters of the thesis beyond its limits and this material may be found in the appendices.

In the struggle to locate a point of departure, I am in good company. Although this thesis is obviously an infinitely more modest venture than that of Thomas's (1971) monumental tomb on the Cuban struggle for independence, he makes a similar point. Originally, he intended to write what was to be a short study of the events leading up to the revolution of 1959 and its immediate aftermath, beginning with Batista's coup in 1952. However, so many issues rose to the surface that he decided to commence the study in January 1899, on the morning that the last Spanish captain-general handed Cuba over to the North Americans. This also proved to be an unsatisfactory point of departure as it excluded the question of slavery and the sugar industry and how these factors decisively affected the character of Cuba. Thomas (1971) finally decided to begin his book with the English occupation of Cuba in 1762, reflecting that 'there are

many things which seem unclear in the contemporary Cuban scene but which become more comprehensible when they are compared with the experiences of the previous four or five generations' (Thomas, 1971, p.18).

I read Thomas's (1971) reflection with a certain amount of relief. My experience of attempting to document my experiences and of making sense of the material I had collected in Cuba seemed to demand a constant recourse to the past and to the historical antecedents that underlay what were often presented as givens. Without reference to the past this material would be diminished.

Perez-Stable (1993) makes a similar point when she argues that numerous specialists have analysed in different manners the social revolution and Cuban socialism but have often ignored the nature of the society which preceded it or have explained the origins of the revolution from a caricatured idea of pre revolutionary Cuba. The same argument stands for any discussion of Cuban art and of attitudes to and practices in mental health care. Both Perez-Stable's (1993) and Thomas's (1971) observations lend support to my decision to make reference to the pre revolutionary period.

This decision was subsequently reinforced by my review of the literature pertaining to the relationship between art and therapy. Historical antecedents are not always referred to in the more contemporary texts to which I have referred in the literature review; however they are informed or underpinned by them. Events, ideas, individuals and theories appear and disappear from the literature as history is continuously rewritten to serve the demands of the present or to support the dominant discourse.

Throughout this thesis I have drawn upon texts emanating from quite different sources in order to give as balanced a view as possible but am aware that accounts of events, or their omission, may be influenced by ideology and political persuasion. Just as Cuban history can be viewed from either side of the "great divide", of the Cuban Revolution, as described by Perez-Stable (1993) so can the literature describing these events, particularly after 1959. Texts emanating from the exiled Cuban population are often particularly virulent and focus on the short comings of the Revolutionary government and its abuses while accounts from within Cuba itself may be accused of being idealised; glossing over or simply omitting to refer to material that is not in line with

the Cuban Communist Party which controls the media. Where there are starkly conflicting accounts or interpretations of events I have attempted to present a multifaceted picture and provide as extensive a bibliography as possible. Cuban history and accounts of it are arguably not any more or less revisionist or ideologically driven than any other histories but what does emerge from a review of the material is that these accounts differ considerably in emphasis depending on when, where and by whom they are given.

It should also be noted that while this thesis is written in English the vast majority of literature that it draws upon was originally written in Spanish and pertains to the Hispanic world and to histories not familiar to the world in which this thesis is to be presented. I have assumed the responsibility of translating this material but this is not a simple matter of translating a Spanish word into an English word, or of searching for meaningful linguistic or metaphorical equivalents in an attempt not to distort the meaning of the original text. What Alejo Carpentier (1977) has described as the Baroque in Latin American culture and literature is not simply a literary or artistic device, it is the expression of a form of life. While my primary aim was to make this material intelligible I have not attempted to anglicize my translations even when certain passages have seemed odd or verbose when translated into English. A sense of the Baroque, which as Elkins (2002) notes, is often characterised in art history texts as the "curvilinear" or "dynamic" seems to me to aptly describe my own experience (Elkins, 2002, p.19). Meeting Eleggúa (or whoever it was) on the road to the harbour in Regla is as much part of my lived experience of that reality as any other event I have described. Perhaps Thomas (1971) also makes an oblique reference to this when he quotes the surrealist André Breton's comment to the Cuban painter Wilfred Lam:

"Ce pays est vraiment trop surréaliste pour y habiter"
that country is really too surreal to live there

In Chapter 1, I have taken as my point of departure a brief account of two histories, that is, of Cuban Art and of Cuban Mental Health Care, with reference to the main currents which I understand to have influenced the key figures that later emerge in my discussion of art and therapy. I have not provided any in-depth account of contemporary Cuban art as I did not encounter any interest or link between this new

generation of artists and anything that might be described as therapeutic practices. Thus my discussion concludes with the generation of artists who were active in the years preceding the revolution, supportive, at least initially, of it and is generally confined to a period spanning from the 1950's to the early 1990's. My account of developments in mental health care is more inclusive partly due to there being more literature available. This first chapter is intended to provide a backdrop to the more detailed and specific material presented in the literature review that follows.

In Chapter 2 the literature directly related to my research topic is presented. The material is uneven as some important developments have simply not been documented or received only a cursory acknowledgement. However, what is presented does reveal what has been written about and by whom. As such, the documentary materials provide an important contrast to the data collected and presented in chapters 4, 5 and 6, as absences or gaps in the published literature are highlighted.

In chapter 3, I outline my research methodology, Naturalistic Inquiry, and the methodology I have employed at the stage of analysis of the data, that is Grounded Theory. I present the case for my choice and employment of these methodologies with reference to their philosophical and epistemological underpinnings and with reference to the context of the research.

In chapters 4, 5 and 6, I present the interview data collected *in situ*. The task of organising this vast amount of material into some sort of manageable form demanded that certain decisions be made and this process is described in the concluding paragraphs of chapter 3. After much deliberation my final decision was to present the data under three broad headings, these are: data pertaining to art, artists and therapy, followed by data involving collaborative working and lastly art, psychologists and therapy.

In chapter 7, I outline my main findings with reference to the concept of reflexivity, as it is understood within Naturalistic Inquiry and attempt to evaluate the research with reference to its validity and applicability. In this context I also attempt to identify and discuss what possible utility this study may have for the understanding of or practice of art therapy in Cuba and consider any implications for further research in Cuba or

beyond. Here I make reference to the development of art therapy in other countries and particularly to literature emanating from the U.K. This is done in order to contextualise and situate my findings within the field of international art therapy and does not represent an attempt to generalise.

In chapter 8, I present some conclusions emerging from the study as a whole.

Chapter 1

Art and Mental Health Care in Twentieth Century Cuba:
Two Brief Histories

Introduction

Two histories emerge as being the most obvious point of departure in presenting the background to my research in this opening chapter, that is, the history of Cuban art and the history of mental health care in Cuba and their relationship to each other. However, these respective histories have evolved in a social, cultural, political and economic context of which a detailed description is beyond the parameters of this study. Ultimately, I am forced to restrict my discussion of this context to the minimum and in doing so decide which factors in terms of background are indispensable to an understanding of these two histories. In keeping with my general approach I have elected to present these factors thematically as opposed to presenting them as a series of chronological events.

The overarching themes to which I wish to draw my readers' attention are those of conquest, colonisation and transculturation which have been continuous and are in fact dynamic processes. These themes are evidenced in the histories of immigration, of slavery and indentured labour which in turn are replete with other histories of exploitation, social inequality and marginalisation, and their correlation with race (Entralgo, 1947, Thomas, 1971, Guanche, 1996). Similarly, while the triumph of the Cuban Revolution in 1959 serves as a reference point in thinking about change it cannot be envisaged as simply pertaining to a particular moment in time. In Marxist-Leninist philosophy a revolution is perceived as a process not as an event. As the populist slogan states:

'Esta Revolución está Eterna'
This Revolution is eternal

Conquest, Colonisation and Transculturation

Cuba was a Spanish colony for nearly four hundred years achieving independence from Spain in 1898 in the aftermath of the Second War of Independence (1895-98) and the ensuing Spanish American War (April 1898-December 1898) only to be immediately occupied by the US. The US occupation lasted until 1902 when Cuba became an independent republic. Its most enduring legacy was the Platt amendment of 1900 giving

the US the right to military intervention in Cuba's internal affairs whenever such intervention was felt warranted. The Cubans were given the choice of accepting the Platt Amendment or remaining under US military occupation indefinitely. In the end, they accepted its humiliating terms as the lesser of two evils. In 1903 the US used it to obtain a naval base, still in existence at the mouth of Guantánamo Bay. With the Republic came a long line of mostly ineffectual and corrupt governments and then, what is known in Cuba as the Triumph of the Revolution in January 1959 and with it, the Castro administration which to this day remains in power.

The struggle for Cuban independence from Spanish domination and latterly from US interference is intimately connected with the struggle for a Cuban national identity however the indigenous Cuban population were all but wiped out in the early days of the *Conquista.* As the number of native Indians decreased, the Spanish turned to African slaves as an alternative source of labour and from here onwards the story of the Spanish colonisation of Cuba is closely related to the main sources of production, that is, tobacco and sugar and the need for a labour force.

This leads me to the concept of transculturation which speaks to the dynamics of culture. The Cuban anthropologist, Fernando Ortiz situates his discussion of transculturation within the social and economic dynamics that arise out of the production of tobacco and sugar in Cuba. Ortiz (1940) coined the term 'transculturation' to undermine the homogenizing impact implicit in the term 'acculturation', which in his view obfuscated the true dynamics at work in colonial situations (Spitta, 1995, p. 4). According to Spitta (1995) Ortiz's suspicions of the term 'acculturation', which was first defined systematically by Redfield, Linton and Kerskovits in the 1930's, have been justified. The term 'acculturation' was initially intended to refer to a process of mutual interaction and change in cultures that come into contact with one another. However, it tended to stress the one-way imposition by a dominant culture and has been used synonymously with assimilation to signify the loss of culture of the subordinate group (Spitta, 1995, p.3). Certainly, Ortiz understood acculturation as a theory that described the one-way imposition of culture by the colonisers. As Spitta (1995) notes, Ortiz countered the one-way imposition of culture implicit in the term 'acculturation', attributing all the losses only to the subjected side, and defined 'transculturation' in Cuba as a three-fold process: the partial loss of culture by each immigrant group; the

concomitant assimilation of elements from other cultures; and the creation of a new Cuban culture. Since foreign influences were invariably present and continue to be so, the 'new' culture, is never achieved: it is forever in the making, inevitably deferred (Spitta, 1995, p.4).

In his seminal text *Contrapunteo* (1940) Ortiz situates the discussion of transculturation within the social and economic dynamics that arise out of the production of tobacco and sugar in Cuba.

> 'Tobacco, indigenous, dark and gendered male by Ortiz, is a labour intensive crop traditionally grown on small farms along the banks of rivers and tended by individual families. Sugar, imported, white and gendered female, is a product grown on immense *latifundios* (plantations) and requires a large labour force at peak times. An exogenous product, a white product, literally and figuratively, sugar was the reason why African slaves were brought to Cuba and why African culture became preponderant in Cuba' (Spitta, 1995, p.4).

Ortiz (1940) points out that the two crops give rise to two very different types of social and economic conditions. Tobacco is grown on a small scale, usually by one family, using few or no machines, and requiring continual care throughout the year. Conversely, sugar production is highly centralised, mechanised and depersonalised. Tobacco is one of the few vestiges of the original island culture, whereas sugar is imported and stands for foreignness; it is the 'agricultural equivalent of empire' (Ortiz, 1940, p.103).

Spitta (1995) suggests that the tension between them gives rise to and at the same time characterises Cuban culture and that, at a more general level, the history of each product is also the history of transculturation (Spitta, 1995, p.5). However Spitta (1995) also makes the important point that Ortiz, in his concern to counter the image of colonised people as passive recipients of a dominant colonising culture, overlooks imbalances of power. Just as his musical metaphor *contrapunteo* or counterpoint, meaning note against note, suggests equal power relations, Ortiz's use of gendered metaphors e.g. male tobacco, female sugar, also assume equality. Spitta (1995) reminds us that this is not the case.

> 'Women and men, however, are never equal when it comes to power particularly in a colonial context based on the violence of one race over another and one gender over another. Modern Latin America is not as Ortiz

seems to assume, the product of a happy marriage of differences' (Spitta, 1995, p. 6).

Colonisation was a long drawn out affair. The emigration process from Spain to Cuba took effect over four and a half centuries (Guanche, 1996).The use of black slaves as the backbone of the main means of production lasted almost as long and as Guanche (1996) points out this population today forms an indissoluble part of Cuban national culture as does the later influx of indentured labourers from China (Guanche, 19, p.71). Ortiz (1958) describes the Cuban population as being constituted of 'the black slave and the Chinese coolie, along with the Spanish immigrant, Jews, Italians and the occasional Englishman' (Ortiz, 1958, p.43). However, Entralgo's (1947) socio demographic study and Thomas's (1971) study of the Cuban socio-economic climate challenge Ortiz's (1940) view that it would 'be erroneous and futile to study Cuban human factors by their races' and that to understand the Cuban soul 'one must study not its races but it cultures' (Ortiz, 1940, p.36). On the contrary, there is considerable evidence to suggest that race informed where individuals were placed on the economic and social scale; where they worked and what they did (Domínguez 1996; Entralgo 1996; Guanche 1996; MacDonald, 1996).

Of the Revolution itself, much has been written (Thomas, (1971), Domínguez (1996), Lehmann (1971). The Cuban Revolutionary government has held power since it declared the advent of the Revolution on the 1st January 1959 when Ernesto 'Che' Guevara and his men entered Havana and the dictator Batista fled Cuba for the Dominican Republic. As Domínguez (1996) puts it:

> 'The old rules of the game no longer applied and the armed forces that had shaped the life of independent Cuba for so long had crumbled. The rebel army became the defender of the new revolutionary state, sweeping aside the parties that had structured political life in previous decades. Only the Communist party, *Partido Socialista Popular* (PSP) which had been banned by Batista in the 1950's but reappeared in 1959, was left intact. The fall of the old regime required that new norms, rules and institutions be devised to replace those that had collapsed or been overthrown. The history of Cuba during the next thirty years addressed the needs of revolutionary creativity, the persistent commitment to create order out of revolution, the need to uphold a revolutionary faith in the implementation of that new order'(Domínguez, J, 1996, p.95).

Domínguez (1996) is referring to the thirty years from 1959 to 1989 when the Soviet Block fell and the balance of power in the world changed. It was during this period that a series of events, arguably provoked by US policy, led Cuba into the arms of the Soviet Union and to Castro's open embrace of communism in late 1961. Against this political backdrop a sequence of radical social reforms were implemented by the Revolutionary government particularly in the areas of health and education. These reforms, as Feinsilver (1993) has pointed out, have a particular moral currency as symbolic monuments to socialism.

My own thesis refers to this same period of time and to ten or more years beyond it, following the collapse of the Soviet Block and the loss of Soviet economic subsidies in the form of above-market prices for Cuban exports totalling around US$5 billion a year. My discussion therefore extends to cover what Castro initially referred to in 1991 as a five year *período especial* or special period austerity programme; a programme from which Cuba has not yet emerged.

In keeping with my methodology, I have taken the view that there is no absolute history but only histories and that accounts and emphases will differ depending on the perspective of the author.

Under the general heading of Cuban art, I will describe developments in the fine arts, art education and culture. Under the heading of mental health care, I will refer to developments in the field of psychiatry, psychology and medicine. These two areas seem to have developed independently of each other in that no central figures which point to any formalised discourse between the disciplines of art and psychology, psychiatry or mental health care emerge until the 1970's and even then any discourse is partial. However, after 1970 several personalities surface and their contributions are discussed in detail in the ensuing chapters. The aim of the present chapter is to present the broad currents and influences at play in both areas prior to and during these developments. What emerges is an enormous diversity in the visual arts and culture which from the turn of the century continues unabated.

Conversely, within the area of mental health care, public sector services are minimal until the advent of the Revolution. A review of the literature from 1959 until the fall of

the Soviet Block in 1989 suggests a pronounced emphasis on Soviet psychology and reveals little published evidence of any interest in other approaches. However, here too, as Waller (1981) points out and numerous respondents report, there is evidence of diversity in the field, often informed by necessity and pragmatism.

Brief History 1 - Cuban Art and Art Education in the Twentieth Century

In the following section I will draw attention to what appears to be the salient themes influencing developments in Cuban art in the years leading up to the Revolution. I begin with a brief history of the Cuban art education system prior to outlining what might be termed major influences within the wider cultural arena, that is, the Baroque, *la cubanidad* and latterly International Modernism which, I suggest, span the divide between pre and post Revolutionary culture. I then describe developments in Post-Revolutionary Cuba beginning with an outline of Ernesto Che Guevara's ideas about the relationship between experimental art and the New Person that leads into a discussion of the concept of cultural democracy and its implementation.

Art Education in Pre-Revolutionary Cuba

Changes in the Cuban cultural panorama towards the end of the 18th century were mainly due to the growth in the sugar industry. The *Sociedad Económica de Amigos del País* (Economic Society of the Friends of the Country) was founded, schools and universities multiplied, the public library was expanded and advertisements by teachers of art and portrait painters appeared in the press. These artists were self taught, mainly mulattoes or blacks, who exchanged lessons with each other and were regarded as craftsmen. In 1818 Bishop Juan José Díaz de Espada Landa and Alejandro Ramírez founded the *Escuela Nacional de Belles Artes* (National Art School). This was the second academy in the Americas, after San Carlos in México, and had a pupil of the French artist David, Juan Bautiste Vermay as its director.

After the death of Vermay, the academy was headed for a short time by a Cuban, Camilo Cuyos, and then followed a French-Italian sequence of successors until the more permanent presence of Miguel Melero Rodríguez in the last five years of the century which coincided with the halcyon days of the Academy in Cuba. From that time onwards the directorship was to remain firmly in Cuban hands. This is the starting point for continuity in Cuban national painting. New initiatives were taken and changes were

made, such as the admission of women at a time when no other institution offered this opportunity.

According to the information offered in the web page Antillania (2005) the commercialization of art did not begin in Cuba until after 1916, with the Salón de Belles Artes. Previously there were no real exhibition rooms available. Only the Academy itself and exhibitions which were organised in the *Pabellón de Educación* in *Quinta de Molinos* existed as channels of distribution. The regional Spanish centres of Asturias, the Canary Islands and Galicia were exhibition venues for Spanish artists. Cultural institutions such as the Athenaeum and the Academy for Art and Literature (1910) developed with private support. The *Asociación de Pintores y Escultores Cubanos* was founded to defend and represent the work of Cuban artists and to organise the annual Salón de Belles Artes.

At the beginning of the 1920's a new generation of intellectuals surfaced in the conflict ridden political and social panorama. The magazine *Avances* (1927) was the place where new ideas and artistic debate were accommodated. Later came the publications *Verbum* (1930) *Espuela de Plata* (1940) and *Orígines* in the 1950's. In 1937 forward thinking artists founded the *Estudio Libre de Pintura y Escultura*, promoting such fields as woodcarving and mural painting which had been neglected by the Academy. At this point the first Salon of Modern Art was inaugurated.

According to Antillania (2005) 'as in other avant-garde movements, the artists tried to transform society through culture', and drew their inspiration from Mexican mural painting (Antillania, 2005, p.4).

In the 1940's and 1950's a new avant-garde developed. It coincided with trends in international art which were no longer focused on Europe but on North America.

Art in Cuba

An overview of artistic production in pre revolutionary Cuba suggests several diverse themes and influences which cannot be said to terminate abruptly with the Revolution. Rather these themes are expressed in art produced both before and after the Revolution. They can be described as follows:

The Baroque

Craven (2002) draws attention to the interplay between Western and non-Western forms that converge in Cuban Abstract Expressionism from the 1940's and 1950's. He makes this comment in relation to the work of the artist Rene Portocarrero and specifically in relation to a silkscreen poster *Soy Cuba* (I am Cuba, 1964) promoting the film of the same name by Mikhail Kalotozov which was a joint Soviet-Cuban production made at the Film Institute in Havana. I cite this, not as a preamble to a discussion of Portocarrero's work but rather to draw attention through the use of an example, to the complexity of influences at play in Cuban art. In the case of Portocarrero's poster, these include pre-Columbian elements, and the use of densely imbricate space rather than perspectival recession. Pre-Columbian elements are in turn synthesised with 'unlikely Western European design elements that include a boldly flat, hard edged format first used by the German Bauhaus and the Russian constructivists' (Craven, 2002, p. 96).

Craven (2002) chooses to describe this Caribbean variation as evidenced in Portocarrero's poster, as something approaching 'a pre-Columbian Bauhaus' or 'a pre-Colonial constructivism'. However, this eclecticism or juxtaposition of different design elements from the Native American to early Modernism is also reminiscent of the Cuban anthropologist Fernando Ortiz's description of Cuban culture as an *ajiaco* (a soup in which all sorts of things are added and mixed). The writer Alejo Carpentier also writing of Portocarrero's oeuvre refers to this tendency to synthesise as the Baroque. 'More than a style, the Baroque - or baroquism - is a manner for metamorphosing materials and forms, a mode of organising the disorganised, a means of transfiguration' (Carpentier, 1963, p. 24-25).

Regarding the Baroque, which is a re-occurring term in discussions of Cuban art (Craven 2002, Carpentier 1963) it is worth noting that art historians tend to use words like 'Baroque' and 'Classical' to describe the art of many times and places (Elkins (2002). Elkins (2002) draws our attention to the fact that art history is an essentially Western discipline and that art historians do not casually apply non-Western periods to Western art but rather it is a tell-tale sign of how deeply Western the discipline of art history still remains. He suggests that were he to avoid using the term Baroque to describe a non-European object created in a much earlier period and call it 'curvilinear'

or 'dynamic' instead; he would still be drawing on traits which are part of the Baroque. Despite his criticisms of this extrapolation of categories involving the imposition of Western cultural categories Elkins (2002) does point out that there *is* something Baroque about Medieval art, and there *is* something austere, intellectual and Classical about Modern art (Elkins, 2002, p. 27).

Craven (2002) suggests that this 'distinctive hybridity' or 'baroque modernism' is representative of the heterogeneous heritage of Cuba. In this his analysis is congruent with Carpentier (1963) and with that of the more general cultural thesis of Fernando Ortiz (1940).

Craven (2002) suggests that this *mélange* or mix included art forms or design elements from the Baroque colonial period as well as references to paintings of the first Cuban modernist painters of the 1920's, and to elements drawn from the Mediterranean tradition as embodied by Matisse. This is perhaps most clearly exemplified in the work of the neo-cubist painter Amelia Peláez who incorporated Spanish colonial architectural forms into her paintings. In turn it is worth noting, that many of these forms were originally introduced to Spain by the Arabs.

The architectural historian, John Loomis, makes a similar point.

> 'When the Cuban Revolution ushered in the New Year of 1959, both the context and future of Cuban culture were to change profoundly. Creating a revolutionary Cuban identity in all areas of culture became one of the major goals for the Revolution. Internationalist and socialist values were an important part of the developing discourse seeking to define Cuba's new cultural identity' (Loomis, 1999, p.1).

However, Loomis (1999) locates the origins of this discourse in an earlier revolutionary period.

La Cubanidad

During the late 19th century, the cultural debate concerning the nature of Cuban identity or *la cubanidad* had a political resonance with the movement for independence from Spain. José Martí, the most important intellectual figure in the struggle for independence from Spain, understood that establishing a clear sense of national identity

was an essential ideological component in creating a unified patriotic movement to liberate the island from Spanish domination. The idea of the regional specificity of Cuban culture, that is its otherness to Spanish culture, found some of it's 'most coherent expression in Martí's writings, though other intellectuals such as Félix Varela had been examining this in the earlier part of the century' (Loomis, 1999, p.1).

One of the salient aspects of Martí's writings was his progressive view of race which recognised African as well as Spanish contributions to a common Cuban culture. Loomis (1999) points out that after independence in 1902, what was referred to as *cubanidad* was still being defined and debated. However, despite the discussion of race being suppressed following the defeat of the Afro-Cuban insurgents who had rebelled against their disenfranchisement by the new independent government in 1912, the subject was revived in the 1930's as an unavoidable issue in the cultural debate.

One strand of this debate was referred to as *negrismo* or negro-ism. *Negrismo* was associated with other Latin American intellectual movements and was influenced by the *negritude* movement of the French-speaking Caribbean. It granted African culture equal status with Spanish culture in forming a *cubanidad* that was *mulata*, or mixed race. The Cuban ethnographer and historian Fernando Ortiz summed up this position with the words 'Without the Negro, Cuba would not be Cuba' (Ortiz, 1999).

Loomis (1999) also identifies another corollary which he describes as more Hispanic than Creole orientated, which recognised African contributions to Cuban culture but considered them secondary to Spanish influences in the creation of a *cubanidad* that was *criolla* or second generation peninsular. He identifies Alberto Arredondo as representative of this group of intellectuals who 'regarded contemporary interest in black culture as a passing European fad, like the Parisian infatuation with jazz and Josephine Baker, a fashion which had little to do with the reality of the Caribbean' (Loomis, 1999, p.2).

To some of these intellectuals 'Afro-Cuban' was an irrelevant concept. Loomis (1999) points to the slave rebellion known as the Little War of 1912 as well as the bitter legacy of slavery and its implicit racism as factors which in part explain the Negrophobia evidenced in the views of those who, as Loomis (1999) puts it, 'wanted to believe that

slavery had essentially erased African culture' (Loomis, 1999,p.2). This Creole orientated version of cubanidad was expressed in the advocacy of a process of *blanqueamiento* or whitening which was seen as means of achieving a unified national identity.

This debate was only part of a much more complex social and cultural picture. As Loomis (1999) notes it would be a mistake to view issues of cultural identity in Cuba simply in bipolar racial terms or as framed by North American experience. He points out the Negrista and Creole tendencies did not always function in opposition or in tension. They often co-existed or were intimately connected. Some intellectuals, such as the writer Alejo Carpentier, published in journals that represented different cultural positions regarding race and ethnicity. What almost all Cuban intellectuals had in common was a desire to articulate a distinctly Cuban cultural identity, within a strongly anti-imperialist, nationalist agenda (Loomis, 1999, p.2).

From the 1920's the arts became an important medium for the exploration of identity and the development of Afro-Cuban and other cultural themes and this of course included painting. The Cuban art historian Narciso Menocal emphasises this preoccupation within the visual arts.

> 'In Europe establishing new definitions of form and pictorial space were major concerns, as is evident in Cubism, German Expressionism or the *neue Sachlichkeit*…however different from each other these movements may have been and whatever their respective iconographical agendas were. In Cuban art, by contrast, establishing a national imagery through a search for the characteristic and exploring national identity were the major issues' (Menocal, 1996,p.187).

The centrality of *cubanidad* as a theme in the work of Cuban artists working in the 1930's and 1940's is well documented (Menocal 1996, Loomis 1999, Craven 2000). The artists most often referred to as exemplars are Amelia Peláez (1896-1968) who painted in what Craven (2002) has described as a neo-cubist idiom, drawing upon traditional Cuban architectural and decorative forms; Luis Martínez Pedro (1920-1989) who drew upon Afro-Cuban rituals and the indigenous Taino heritage and Rene Portocarrero (1912-1985) whose early work according to Loomis (1999) addressed populist themes in the tradition of the Mexican artist Diego Riviera. Loomis (1999) identifies Wilfredo Lam (1902-1982) as an artist whose work grew out of this period

and went on to transcend it. Lam, a longstanding Marxist closely identified with the Revolution despite having spent long periods working abroad, is of particular interest in any discussion of *cubanidad* because as Mosquera (1995) notes, his work directly addresses Afro- Cuban themes.

> '… (Constituting) the first vision ever of modern art from the standpoint of Africa within Latin America … (representing) a synthesis that might be endorsed by modernity, thus creating a non-Western space within the Western tradition, decentralising it, transforming and de-Europeanising it' (Mosquera, 1994, p.120).

This interest in Afro-Cuban cultural traditions was revived in the 1980's by the group of artists known as *Volumen Uno*. Craven (2002) notes that these young artists 'drew locally upon several unlikely sources' including the expressionist paintings of Antonia Eiriz whose work is discussed in some detail in chapters 2 and 4.

Internationalism: Abstract Expressionism and Modernist Architecture.

It is important to emphasise the 'internationalist' flavour of the decade of the 1950's as a counter balance to the Baroque, and the influence of *la cubanidad* and its preoccupation with a national cultural identity. This influence can be detected most clearly in architecture and, in the years leading up to and following the Revolution, of North American Abstract Expressionism.

Camnitzer (1994) demonstrates that the 'post-1945 style of organic all over images' from American Abstract Expressionism exercised considerable influence on a group of left-wing Abstract Expressionist painters in Cuba during the insurrectionary 1950's known as *Los Once* or the Eleven.

Los Once

The activities of this group were central to the period of transition between pre and post revolutionary Cuban art. A significant group of left-wing Abstract Expressionist painters they disbanded as a group in 1955, although they continued to exhibit together until their final exhibition in 1963. Loomis (1999) points out that 'their avant-gardist rebellion was connected to their political opposition of the Batista dictatorship' and that their refusal to participate in officially sponsored exhibitions and organisation of counter-exhibitions constituted acts of political defiance (Loomis, 1999, p.7). Similarly,

Craven (2002) argues that through its *Anti-Bienal* in 1954 and *Anti-Salon* in 1957, organised by former members, *Los Once* was instrumental both in opposing Batista and in helping to guide the artistic transition triggered by the Cuban Revolution of 1959.

However, '*Los Once*' were never eleven. Pogolotti (1999) points out that this unequal enigmatic number was imposed by chance. Pino-Santos (1999) also observes that exactly eleven artists actually exhibited in only one exhibition, 'Eleven Painters and Sculptors', in La Rampa between the 18th and the 28th of April 1953. According to Pino-Santos (1999) it was the critic Texidor who coined the name by which they became identified. The artists who exhibited in this and later exhibitions were not always the same. The eleven artists whom Texidor was referring to were Francisco Antigua, Rene Ávila, José Ignacio Bermúdez, Agustín Cárdenas, Hugo Consuegra, Fayed Jamis, Guido Llinás, José Antonio Díaz Peláez, Tomas Oliva, Antonio Vidal and Viredo Espinosa. Some of this number fell away rapidly. José Bermúdez, for example, only exhibited in the first exhibition, leaving for Washington afterwards, while others subsequently identified themselves with the group such as Antonia Eiriz who exhibited with *Los Once* on several occasions. Eiriz (1994) later stated that the 1950's had been for her one of the most 'Cuban moments of culture in every sense: fashion, music, in the visual arts as an expression of a Cuban ethos' (Blanc, 1994, p.1). However, this view is at odds with the general consensus. Anreus (2004) suggests that these artists wanted a wider vision than what was 'Cuban'. According to Anreus (2004) they were in fact rejecting the art of the earlier Cuban modernists, with the exception of Wilfredo Lam, as too picturesque and local.

Craven (2002) draws our attention to an interview undertaken by the US art historian Shifra Goldman with Raúl Martínez the most famous former member of *Los Once* pointing to their political convictions.

> 'We expressed our attitudes in the titles of our paintings. For example, when Fidel appeared (in 1953), we titled our paintings of vegetation Sierra Maestra…we (in *Los Once*) supported with our presence all activities against the tyranny. The paintings did not reflect this specifically… (But we) also discovered that abstract art was the only weapon with which we could frighten people. When we mounted an exhibition, people were left in a state of shock…then it seemed to us that our painting served as a means to raise consciousness….Within the context of the backward painting that existed in Cuba at the time, to do abstract painting was a revolution in itself.

The social revolution was being made by what we were doing with the work after it was finished' (Goldman, 1984, p.146-47).

Craven (2002) points out that the Cuban version of abstract expressionism was indebted to the New York School and to Spanish art and that it represented a pictorial negation of the established order. He goes on to argue that this 'negative art' provided the possibility to create a 'clean cultural slate' for the visual arts by opening up the cultural domain to the progressive developments which ensued after 1959. This statement deserves some attention as it goes some way towards explaining why social realism never took hold in Cuba as it did in Eastern European Soviet Block countries. Late Modernism, as exemplified in the work of *Los Once*, was not identified with capitalism but rather with social critique and more specifically with the revolutionary movement itself to which they allied themselves. Raúl Martínez makes this point quite emphatically.

'Abstract artists were strong as a movement when the Revolution took place, and they were supporting the Revolution; therefore, there was no negative identification with abstraction' (Martínez, 1984).

Los Once were also allied with a group of architects known as *Arquitectos Unidos* or United Architects which was formed in 1952 and headed by Humberto Alonso. The painter and architect Hugo Consuegra, who is referred to in the following chapter in relation to his appraisal of Antonia Eiriz's work in 1964, was a member of this group. Eiriz emerges as an important figure in the ensuing discussion and as such it is salient to note her association with *Arquitectos Unidos* because as Loomis (1999) points out 'of equal or greater importance to their built work, *Arquitectos Unidos* served as an intellectual forum, a scene of weekly tumultuous and uncontrollable *tertulias*', salons where current issues in architecture, arts and politics were debated (Loomis, 1999, p.11). Hugo Consuegra was a member of both *Arquitectos Unidos* and *Los Once* as was Guido Llinás who Eiriz cites as her mentor (Eiriz in Blanc, 1993). Another was Edmundo Desnoes who at that time was married to María Rosa Almendros who later in the 1970's was to work with Eiriz in community development. Many of the architects, artists, writers and filmmakers who participated in these weekly salons went on to assume positions of ministerial or academic importance within the Revolution or, conversely, to roles of prominence as dissident intellectuals in exile. In relation to painting it is interesting to note Loomis's (1999) comment that *Los Once* rejected the

'*tropicalism*' that characterised the art of the preceding decade in favour of an abstraction that assumed a more international perspective. He also notes that while Lam, Peláez and Portocarrero continued to work in the figurative tradition, their work assumed a more abstract elaboration of their culturally orientated themes during the 1950's.

Despite a conscious presence in art and literature which became prevalent from the 1920's, Afro-Cuban issues tended not to be expressed in the parallel debate that emerged in the late 1930's regarding architectural identity in Cuba. Loomis (1999) points out that this was partly due to the enormous physical presence of the Spanish colonial legacy and the comparative lack of African spatial legacy in Cuba. This Hispanic architectural legacy was first and most consciously documented by Joaquin E. Weiss y Sánchez in 1936 in his seminal text, *Arquitectura cubana colonial*. Weiss was an early proponent of the cultural value of the colonial architectural heritage and an advocate of historic preservation. However, as Rigau (1994) points out his text could today be reread as a text on Spanish influences, rather than as a testament to Cuban achievements.

> 'In the early decades of the twentieth century, Latin American intellectuals repeatedly validated their built heritage based on comparisons to the Old world, and Weiss, in keeping with the times, assumed affiliation to be sufficient clarification. Adjectives like Baroque, neochurrigueresque, and Andalusian – in spite of their imprecise, yet frequent application – were imported to dignify Caribbean architecture…this 'elsewhere-centered' cultural explanation has always stopped short of indigenous validation' (Rigau, 1994, p.55).

In these comments Rigau (1994) seems to be making a similar point to the art historian Elkins (2002) that architectural history like art history is an essentially Western discipline and that the extrapolation of categories referred to above indicate how deeply Western these disciplines remain.

Any in-depth analysis of international modernism as represented in Cuban architecture is clearly out-with the parameters of this thesis. It is also barely documented; the main text being that of Loomis (1999). However, there are a few points which are particularly salient to the wider cultural debate.

Firstly, although a few Cuban architects had studied abroad like Weiss at Cornell, most studied at the architecture school of the University of Havana, founded in 1900. In this conservative atmosphere there was according to Loomis (1999) little attention to issues of *cubanidad* until after World War 2. However in 1947, an event occurred referred to as '*quema de los Viñola*', involving a group of students led by Frank Martínez, Ricardo Porro and Nicolas Quintana, who burned a collection of books from the library of the architecture school as a symbolic act declaring their allegiance to modernism. Following this the school departed from its Beaux Arts origins to embrace a more modernist programme, while simultaneously seeking to reintegrate values from Cuba's *arquitectura criolla*.

Loomis (1999) suggests that there subsequently emerged 'a sincere desire amongst mostly younger Cuban architects to create a regionalist architectural language within modernist conventions that would reroute the universalising tendencies of the International Style' (Loomis, 1999, p. 6). He also emphasises that European and North American exemplars of the International Style were no strangers to the island. In this context it is interesting to note that in 1945, Ricardo Porro, one of the future architects of the National Arts Schools at the Cubanacán, along with Martínez and Quintana were responsible for inviting Walter Gropius the founder of the German Bauhaus School to lecture in Havana. He also notes at the advent of the Revolution how the eminent modernist architect, Mies Van der Rohe was engaged in a plan, never realised, to build offices for the Bacardí Company in Santiago de Cuba.

In summation, it is clear that there were multiple influences informing developments in the arts prior to the Revolution. These developments and the ideals that they embodied were not at odds with the Revolution. The Baroque in its celebration of the curvilinear and its juxtaposition of seemingly opposing elements is not unrelated to the literary genre 'magical reality', a term first coined by the eminent Cuban writer Alejo Carpentier, a dedicated Marxist and lifelong supporter of the Cuban Revolution. *La cubanidad* embodies the ongoing struggle for a Cuban national identity while Internationalism and its expression in both Abstract Expressionism and Modernism in architecture were allied both philosophically and in the activities of its protagonists to the Revolutionary struggle prior to the Revolution itself.

Cuban Art and Art Education after the Revolution

As Craven (2002) points out three historic revolutions in 20th Century Latin America stand out because they not only shook the whole world then, but also sent out long-term effects that stir us still (Craven, 2002, p.1). These revolutions were in Mexico (1910-40), Cuba (1959-89), and Nicaragua (1979-90). It seems pertinent at this point to offer a definition of the word 'revolution' which has, as Craven (2002) points out, continued to gain in complexity until it approximated the concept we know today, which he argues features at least two divergent overall directions. The first involves the reclamation of either, traditional, time-hallowed rights or the establishment of universal human rights that have never really been instituted by any social order to date. The second involves an idea that emerged only in the 19th century that meant giving birth to a new social order per se, and also to a 'New Person' (a 20th century idea most often associated with Che Guevara and the 1960's). All of this was to be done 'through powerfully programmatic actions that alter structurally the majority's traditional fate in relation to all earlier societies, no matter how equitable they might have been. This new order and the New People arising from it would no longer leave society's destiny up to the haphazard contingencies of a so-called 'wheel of fortune' or the purported predestination of any presumed 'natural order' unmediated by human intervention. Furthermore, sweeping popular mobilisation, not just a few good men, would sustain these new political ideas – ideals contingent on concerted theoretical aims, rather than being just 'spontaneous' reactions from below to repression on high' (Craven, 2002, p.8).

Craven (2002) draws our attention to another intermediary link between revolutionary movements in Latin America and their respective contributions to defining the word 'revolution', which was one established by Che Guevara with the triumph of the Cuban Revolution. In a monumental rereading of Marx and Marxism, Guevara discussed the process of reconstruction emphasising the connection between artistic production within a revolution and the revolutionary production of the New Person. He maintained that the creation of one presupposed an immediate creative engagement with the other. In stating that a revolution makes Marxists as much as Marxists make a revolution, Guevara (1965) posited an argument which constituted an opposition to Soviet-style economism, whereby revolutions do not first construct economic changes in order to change other spheres of society subsequently, but rather that revolutions produce the

New Person (aesthetically, ethically, and ideologically) simultaneously with the production of a new economic base and new workplace relations, all in relation to new political formations.

Guevara's opposition to the Stalinist doctrine of so-called 'socialist realism' a visual language, which the Mexican muralist Diego Riviera also subjected to withering criticism, was argues Craven (2002), of 'fundamental significance for the emergence of a new concept of 'revolutionary art' – or at least a revolutionary way of making art and had a noteworthy impact on the innovative cultural policies within both the Cuban revolution and the Nicaraguan revolution' (Craven, 2002, p.13).

He goes on to suggest that Guevara's conception of revolution was most analogous to the open-ended but clearly focused concept of artistic experimentation that alone could adequately forge an image of the New Person. Guevara's contribution to defining a modern 'revolution' along artistic lines involves a discussion of the relationship between experimental art and the New Person.

> 'Socialism is young and has made many mistakes. Many times revolutionaries lack the knowledge and intellectual courage needed to meet the task of developing the New Person with methods different from the conventional ones … The men of the (Communist) party …sought an art that would be understood by everyone, the kind of art that *functionaries* understand. True artistic values were disregarded, and the problem of general culture was reduced to taking some things from the socialist present and some from the dead past (since dead, not dangerous). Thus, Socialist Realism arose upon the foundations of the last century. But the realistic art of the nineteenth century is also a class art, more purely capitalist than the decadent art of this twentieth century which reveals the anguish of alienated people. Why then try to find the only valid prescription for art in the frozen forms of Socialist Realism? ...Let us not attempt from the pontifical throne of realism-at-any-cost, to condemn all the art forms that have evolved since the first half of the nineteenth century for we would then fall into the Proudhonian mistake of returning to the past, of putting a straight jacket on the artistic expression of the person who is being born and who is in the process of making himself … What is needed is the development of an ideological-cultural mechanism which permits… free inquiry…The probabilities that great artists will appear will be greater to the degree that the field of culture and the possibilities of expression are broadened' (Guevara, 1965, pp. 264-67).

Guevara's statement is important on three counts: his rejection of a social realist aesthetic; his reference to free inquiry or freedom of artistic expression; and his assertion that more great art will be produced if greater cultural opportunities and possibilities are created. There is considerable evidence to suggest that Guevara's ideas were in fact not only influential but implemented. On the first count, there appears to have been no sustained attempt to impose a Socialist Realism aesthetic in Cuban Art in the early years of the Revolution. However, Craven (2002) refers to the two 'Dark Periods', as they are called in Cuba, when there were 'bouts of stultifying orthodoxy with the temporary ascendancy of Soviet influence during 1961-62 at the time of the Bay of Pigs invasion and again from 1970-75' the latter of which corresponds to Eiriz's self-imposed censorship which I discuss in the following chapter (Craven, 2002, p.76). Cardenal (1972) whose research was based on two trips to Cuba in 1970 and 1971 interviewed Castro on his position regarding the arts. He quotes Castro as stating 'I am in favour of the search for all types of style, in music, in painting, in poetry, in drama and in dance' (Cardenal, 1972, p. 189). This statement begs the question as to what Castro's position was and is on content as opposed to form. He also asserts that in Cuba, as contrasted with Russia, there is no attempt made to create an art that can be understood by the people, rather the attempt is to educate the people to the point that they can understand art…'I was told that this has been the official policy of the Revolution…The socialist realism of the Russians was merely so much shit. Cuba, they said, found its true socialist realism in Pop Art' (Cardenal, 1972, p.189).

Craven (2002) emphasises the 'fresh New Left aesthetic of the 1960's' that the Cuban Revolution sanctioned in the face of orthodox opposition from the Soviet Block quoting Castro's alleged comment that the enemies of the Revolution were 'capitalists and imperialists , not abstract art'. He does however refer to a tension that existed between their respective social systems. This tension was expressed via the pro-Soviet PSC (Cuban Socialist Party) which had been an outspoken opponent of the 'ultra-leftist' insurgency in Cuba throughout most of the 1950's.

An uneasy truce in the 1960's between the July 26th Movement and the urbanised Soviet-backed party did not keep the orthodox Cuban communists from repeatedly attacking the 'revisionist' views and so-called 'pathological adventurism' of Che Guevara.

For the sake of clarity I will briefly outline this dynamic.

The *Partido Socialista Popular* PSP remained inconsequential in national politics until the Bay of Pigs invasion on April 17, 1961. When the Cuban Government appealed to the Soviet Union for help, but not for leadership, in the fight against imperialism the Soviet leadership made it clear to the Cubans that the price of their support would be a rehabilitation of the PSP and a prominent new role in public life for it under the then leader Escalante who was given the task of constituting a Communist Party along strict Leninist lines from a large 26th July Movement and a tiny PSP. This involved a purge from the new party of all the former guerrillas who were in high posts and replacing them with orthodox members of the PSP. When the vanguard party was reconstituted as the *Partido Comunista de Cuba* (PCC) in 1965 it still consisted overwhelmingly of ultra left members of the July 26th Movement, more aligned ideologically with the New Left, than the orthodox Left. However, as Craven (2002) points out this membership did not alter the fact that the PCC, as a Leninist vanguard party, was an extremely exclusive group with a disproportionate amount of power on the national level. This tension appears as an undercurrent or subtext in much of the discussion to follow. However, pertinent to the present discussion is the view expressed by Craven (2002) that the concrete make-up of the party in Cuba accounted for the absence of an official revolutionary style of art and for what he describes as the presence of a broad-ranging social pluralism from 1959 to 1989 (Craven, 2002, p.21).

Cultural Democracy

As previously noted, Guevara (1965) asserted that free inquiry was important to the development of the arts as was opportunity to create art. The question of artistic freedom is a contentious one which I will discuss in some depth in relation to the life and work of Antonia Eiriz in the following chapter. However, the socialising of artistic practice has been documented. The Revolution's commitment to socialising artistic practice, through what in Cuba is referred to as 'cultural democracy' is partly described by the Nicaraguan poet Ernesto Cardenal's (1972) observation that 'there is no attempt made to create an art that can be understood by the people, the attempt is to educate the people to the point that they can understand art' (Cardenal, 1972, p.189). It is more closely defined by Craven (2002) as a situation in which 'the populace has assumed a

more self-conscious and participatory role in the production of culture' (Craven, 2002, p.76).

In order to discuss the overall cultural dynamic of revolutionary Cuba in relation to the social transformation generated by it, several things must be addressed in addition to the analysis of specific artworks. Craven (2002) suggests that the concrete cultural agencies and national policies instituted after 1958 must be assessed, as well as the concrete basis for them in 'workplace democracy' or autogestion. In his view such a discussion involves an analysis of the nature of this democratisation of culture and also an analysis of the transformed public sphere it presupposed.

Craven (2002) proposes that the process of making art more accessible to the Cuban populace, as part of a decentralisation of political power on the local level, was also sometimes in structural conflict with the national centralisation of power by a Leninist vanguard. The latter's tendencies towards vanguardism were motivated by 'a desire for national self-determination in the international arena, rather than by a primary wish for grass roots based self-governance' (Craven, 2002, p. 81). What is beyond doubt is that considerable achievements were made and during the first decade of the Revolution numerous national cultural agencies were formed on a level without precedent in Latin American history with the exception of the revolutionary changes in Mexico in the 1920's.

In March 1959, three months after coming to power, the Revolutionary Government founded the Cuban National Film Institute (ICIAC). Several other institutions were also founded in 1959: the National Ballet, the National Folkloric Ensemble, the National Chorus and the Casa de las Americas. This latter institution was established as an 'International Centre for Latin American Art and Literature', published a notable journal, awarded prestigious literary prizes and has occupied a fundamental role in the intellectual life of the Spanish speaking world for over three decades. Under the direction of the author Roberto Fernández Retamar, this cultural institute was always an important defender of controversial artists and intellectuals whose critiques of the Cuban Revolution sometimes enraged high-ranking officials in some other government circles (Craven, 2002, p.81).

In 1971 and in 1983, the Casa de las Americas successfully sided with 'dissident' artists against those in the Cuban government who wished to censor them (Craven, 2002, p.82). Even during the 'dark period' of semi-orthodoxy from 1970 to 1975 this state agency was able to score victories against those who wrote for *Hoy*, a PCC publication and *Verde Olivio*, the official journal of the Cuban Army.

It is pertinent to note that these journals and two of their authors appear in the literature review that follows. The author of 'The Psychographic Development of the Child', Rolando Valdés Marín, served on the editorial board of *Hoy* and was one of the veteran communist leaders of the PSP (Dueñas Becerra, 2002, p.253). Similarly, José Portuondo, another old member of the original orthodox PSP and one of biggest representatives of the aesthetics of social realism in Cuba, published regularly in the magazine of the armed forces, *Verde Olivio*, under the pseudonym of Leopoldo Avila (Serrano, 2002, p.4). Portuondo features in the discussion of the censorship of, amongst others, the poet Herberto Padilla and the artist Antonia Eiriz. Conversely, Roberto Fernández Retamar, the director of the Casa de las Americas, reappears as a champion of freedom of expression as in the case of Antonia Eiriz.

In the early 1960's the National Symphony Orchestra was created and five provincial concert orchestras, following this *Cinematica de Cuba* was formed which today contains the largest collection of Latin American films in the world. In 1960 the National Council of Culture was created, which was replaced in 1976 by the Ministry of Culture under the direction of Armando Hart Dávalos. This latter organisation was according to Craven (2002) a more wide-ranging and flexible agency than its predecessor responsible for coordinating events among the various provincial centres of culture. It was also crucial for defending a 'critical' view and pluralistic practices in the arts of *el proceso* that is the revolutionary process. In 1983, Armando Hart Dávalos proclaimed that 'What we hope to achieve in the future …is for art to penetrate all spheres of life' (Hart, 1983, pp.12-13).

However it was by means of the National Literacy Crusade in 1961 that Cuba's cultural transformation was advanced most dramatically. Considered by UNESCO and other international organisations to be one of the most significant events in the modern history of education, this *Alfabetización* elevated Cuba's rate of literacy from 72% to 98% in a

little over two years. This was the best rate ever attained in Latin America and among the highest in the world according to the Quality of Life Index of the Overseas Development Group. Between 1961 and 1962 the number of schools increased in Cuba from 2,482 to 22,458. Since then, Cuba has set the standard for literacy throughout Latin America.

The pedagogical approach adopted by the Cuban government in the early 1960's is described by Craven (2002) as an eclectic amalgam of John Dewey inspired 'learning by doing', Soviet didacticism, New Left dialogism via the early work of Paolo Freire, who in turn was influenced by Cuba's literacy crusade, and a tight student-teacher relationship that resembled an Oxbridge university tutorial. However, the Cubans diverged from the approach recommended by Freire. While they used photographs to keep the discussion open, as Freire would recommend, the Cuban literacy *brigadistas* 'explained' the meaning of the photographs to their students, thus circumscribing the dialogue on which the whole dialogical educative process, outlined later by Freire, was to be based. The more directive role assumed by Cuban teachers (in their prior selection, for example, of a set of active or 'generative' words, rather than the slow discovery of such words, as in Brazil or Nicaragua) can, argues Craven (2002) be explained at least in part by the embattled posture of the Cuban nation. Nevertheless, he suggests that the 'frequent paternalism inherent in this approach would hardly free the popular classes from all pre-revolutionary student-teacher and citizen-leader relationships' (Craven, 2002, pp.81-82).

Despite this, a successful consequence of the literacy crusade was to end what Paolo Freire described as the 'culture of silence' by which he meant a condition of cultural disempowerment linked to the economic impoverishment and political disenfranchisement that afflicts the majority of people in the Third World, that is, the majority of the world population (Freire, 1968). In Cuba the literacy campaign contributed to cultural rejuvenation and as Craven (2002) points out just as there was a new type of writer, so there was also a new type of reader. Along with a quantitative increase in readership came a qualitative expansion in terms of what was read.

The National Art Schools

The mid 1960's saw a continuation of these earlier developments. In 1962 the National Institute for Radio and Television was founded as was the National Commission on Museums and Monuments. In the same year the National Recording Institute for Music was established and the National School of the Arts at Cubanacán. The team of architects employed to undertake this latter project was Ricardo Porro a leading member of the previously mentioned radical group *Arquitectos Unidos*.

Craven (2002) notes that the British art critic and educationalist Sir Herbert Read called the National School of the Arts the most advanced art school in the world when he visited it in the early 1960's (Craven, 2002, p.84). These buildings were never entirely completed but used nevertheless. Camnitzer (1994) notes that the Cubanacán later became more pedagogically conservative and also became, along with the San Alejandro Academy, one of Cuba's middle art schools in the mid- 1970's. In 1976 the *Instituto Superior de Arte* (Superior Art Institute) was created. Based at the old Havana Country Club and became the highest level school offering advanced training in all the arts. This immensely important experimental art school came into being as part of the new wave of experimentation and popular mobilisation that marked the period after 1975. It was established without any programmatic commitment to a 'normative style' in art. On the contrary, its charge was 'to stress critical thinking, detached analysis, and logical consistency in whatever style or aesthetic concepts the art student might decide upon using' (Craven, 2002, p.84).

The Cuban government also began sponsoring a great number of national and international art festivals including the International Festival of Ballet, the International Film Festival, and the Latin American Biennial in the Visual Arts. These events provided a far-reaching forum for the presentation of progressive cultural developments in the Third World. To this could be added an even longer list of national festivals celebrating popular and traditional dance forms such as the Rumba, Son, Salsa and numerous other art forms.

In quantitative terms alone, the advances made in the first thirty years of the Revolutionary government are notable. In 1958 there were only six museums and less than one hundred libraries in the entire island. By the mid-1980's there were over 250 museums and nearly 2,000 libraries (Saruski and Mosquera, 1979 p.25). In 1958 almost

one third of all Cubans were illiterate; by 1975 almost all were literate and one of every three was a student in some capacity. In 1959, there were three universities; by 1979 there were forty. Together these served a student population twelve times larger than before the Revolution. Of this number 46% were women, which was one of the highest rates in the world (Leiner, 1989, p.31). In 1959, Cuba published less than one million books a year; by 1980 it published over fifty million books a year, all of which were sold at less than production costs.

Casas de la Cultura

The socialisation or democratisation of art can also be demonstrated by referring to the Casas de la Cultura. In the mid-1970's there was a structural shift to what is known as '*Poder Popular*' or '*poder local*' which means popular or local power. With this development came the establishment of '*Casas de Cultura*' or houses of culture. The objective of the Casas de Cultura was according to Saruski and Mosquera (1979) to 'bring people into direct contact with art, to disseminate culture, to raise the educational level of the population, and to provide it with opportunities for leisure and recreation' (Saruski and Mosquera, 1979, p.25). By the mid 1970's around two hundred Casas had been established on a national basis. The majority had a library, a museum, an amphitheatre, an auditorium, conference rooms, music halls and art studios. It was here that young people studied dance, music and painting free of charge; local artists and artisans displayed their work; touring exhibitions were shown and where musical or dramatic performances by visiting professionals or amateur groups took place. As a direct consequence the *Movimiento de Aficionados* (Amateur Movement) was given impetus and there was an immense increase in the number of amateur groups involved in music, theatre, dance and the plastic and visual arts. In 1964 there were one thousand such groups. By 1975-76, shortly after the Casas were first established, this had risen to eighteen thousand groups, with the number of young people participating in the arts exceeding 6 million (de Armas, 1977, p.27).

These achievements represent the concrete products of the policy of 'cultural democracy' previously referred to and they are obviously considerable. However, important questions still remain, regarding the nature of this new public and to the extent that this 'socialisation of artistic engagement' shifts the public from passive consumption of art to critical engagement with art.

Craven (2002) argues that these questions are pressing because of the situation that prevailed in Western Europe and the US during the same time span. He refers to Bourdieu's (1984) study which demonstrates that cultural consumption in 'France and indeed the West as a whole continually generates ideological legitimacy for social differences' , differences which sustained what he termed the 'aristocracy of culture' (Bourdieu, 1984, p.7). Bourdieu's (1984) survey delineates the direct connection between educational level and class standing, and the nature, as well as the degree, of one's interest in the arts. Presenting his reader with some revealing statistics which suggest a correlation between an individual's degree of work place self-management and a sense of having access to the arts he demonstrates how only the dominant groups or classes in the West have, most often, felt entitled to 'the right to speak' on all substantive issues whether political, economic, or cultural (Bourdieu, 1984, p.411).

Given that Cuba was formerly a Western colony characterised by the cultural asymmetry associated with subservience to the West, Craven (2002) questions how it culturally transformed to enlarge the number of those who feel they have 'the right to speak' about the arts. He notes that it is one thing to eradicate the 'culture of silence', that Freire (1968) refers to, and quite another 'to foster a vigorous and enabling public discourse by the majority' (Craven, 2002, p.85).

In the light of Bourdieu's findings concerning the connection between class power and cultural empowerment, Craven (2002) argues that any examination of the formal devices for opening up public participation in the arts must also include a discussion of how this cultural development is, or is not, 1) grounded in a comparable progression within the sphere of political economy, and, 2) most specifically in workplace self-management. The socialisation of artistic engagement would be advanced only by a corresponding democratisation of the workplace. In other words, 'that *el proceso* or the revolutionary process, would be galvanised by a decentralisation of political power on the local level in relation to a re-enfranchisement of a largely 'silenced majority' in the cultural realm of society' (Craven, 2002, p.86).

Regarding the social dynamic of cultural self-representation and workplace democracy Craven (2002), points to the concrete avenues for expanding public discourse about the

arts that accompanied most cultural activities. These discourses or public debates were considered essential to the democratisation of culture and were attended by people from all sectors of society and led by recognised filmmakers, writers, musicians or visual artists. He then goes on to ask how such a move towards radical popular self determination did not create internal conflicts in Cuba and here he points to the manifest coexistence of various ideological tendencies within the Cuban national state as well as within the communist party which I have previously referred to.

It is Craven's contention that these dialogical tendencies in the construction of artistic meaning were inspired and were themselves subsequently advanced by the Brazilian Paolo Freire's theory of 'dialogical pedagogy' in the late 1960's. In Freire's (1968) view advanced culture must be arrived at through a dynamic interchange involving the majority. This contrasts with the hegemonic concept of culture as a closed set of exclusive values simply transmitted to the majority, a concept of culture, which Craven (2002) notes, is shared both by conservatives and certain sectors within the avant-garde.

An example of Freire's 'dialogical pedagogy' may be found in a statement made by Alfredo Guevara, the director of the National Film Institute in the 1960's. According to Guevara (1965) the major aim of Cuban film production was 'to demystify cinema for the entire population; to work, in a way, against our own power…to dismantle all the mechanisms of cinematic hypnosis… in favour of critical discourse'. This process was termed 'cultural decolonisation' (Guevara, 1965, p.53).

Such enhanced access to the arts would not have been possible without substantial changes not only in education in national terms but on a local level in terms of worker self-management. Craven (2002) attempts to explain the situation which allowed this worker self-management and consequent enhanced cultural access to evolve with reference to more general political developments. He suggests that the period in Cuban politics from the early 1960's up to and through the 1980's can be characterised by a 'peculiar form of leadership, at once unelected and yet characterised by considerable public accessibility' (Craven,2002,p.90).

Nevertheless, he refers to a disturbing tendency in the 1960's, in the early 1970's and again after the fall of the Soviet Block in 1989 towards 'an excessive centralisation of

power along orthodox Leninist lines' accompanied by a tendency towards state bureaucratisation. This was addressed in a series of national polemics in 1970 after which according to Craven (2002) the Cuban people generally embarked on a process of pronounced decentralisation up until 1989. This structural dynamic, which was spelled out in the new Cuban Constitution of 1976, led to a considerable shift in the distribution of political power, from the national level to local level. *Poder Popular* or local power was based on the popularly elected assemblies of the municipalities. According to Craven (2002), the result was an institutionalisation of a grass-roots democracy without a matching process in relation to parliamentary democracy on the national level.

It is beyond the parameters of this thesis to discuss the mechanisms of Poder Popular in any depth. However, it is salient given the proposed correlation between worker self management and increased cultural access to note that the purpose of Poder Popular was to introduce more participatory experiences through creating representatives who were answerable through elections and regular meetings to those whom they represented. Craven (2002) argues that this increased involvement in decision making affected not only production levels and workers conditions but also cultural activities within and out with the workplace.

To summarise, a broad overview of Cuban Art and Art Education in the twentieth century does not suggest the overthrow of any established order at the advent of the Revolution. On the contrary the most eminent artists and intellectuals of the day were at least initially supportive of the Revolution. It is also emerges that, within the arts prior to the Revolution, different influences were at play, and that these influences continued to be played out to a greater or lesser extent after the Revolution. Examples of this continuity might be the Baroque in the literature of Carpentier; *la cubanidad* in the painting of Lam; Internationalism in the work of Los Once, and international modernism in the work of Ricardo Porro, Roberto Gottardi and Vittorio Garratti as expressed in the National Art Schools. Secondly, where there is a marked change is in accessibility to the arts through what has been referred to as cultural democracy beginning with the National Literacy Crusade in 1961, continuing with the creation of innumerable public institutions and culminating with the opening of the Casas de la Cultura in 1976, creating a level of access to the arts and to education in the arts which

was unprecedented. It is suggested that the impetus behind this lies in the writings of Ernesto Che Guevara (1965) and Paolo Freire (1968).

Brief History 2 - Mental Health Care in Pre Revolutionary Cuba

In the following section I offer a brief outline of mental health care provision in pre revolutionary Cuba albeit that the bibliographic source material is limited and what has been published for the most part pertains to the discipline of psychology.

Cuban Psychology before the Revolution

Prior to the Revolution, Cuba's only public university was the University of Havana, which was in theory open to everyone, but real access was only possible to those who finished secondary education, a small minority of the population (García Averasturi, 1980, p.1090). However, this is not to suggest that psychology as a practice was non existent in Cuba before the Revolution. Accounts differ in their emphasis according to different writers' perspectives and the accepted norms at the time of writing. García Averasturi (1980) Head of the National Group of Psychology at the Ministry of Public Health in Havana, in an article published in the 'American Psychologist' offers an overview of the orientation and development of professional psychological services in Cuba since the 1959 revolution. The article was published and shortly after, responding to an invitation to participate in the Congress of the Cuban Society of Psychology of Health, the first group of 27 psychologists to travel from Miami to Cuba since the 1959 revolution arrived in Havana in March 1979. This occasion represented the reestablishment, after a lapse of twenty years, of collegial communications between psychologists in Cuba and the US.

Referring to the training and practice of psychologists before the revolution, García Averasturi (1980) points out that Cuba's few psychologists, trained overseas or in small private universities, most often served the profit-making interests of the private sector, in part by stimulating public consumption and by increasing industrial productivity (i.e., publicity campaigns, personnel selection, etc.). There were also some applications of psychology in personal, educational and vocational guidance and psychotherapy, in single or group practice. She asserts that, 'The most frequent setting for the clinical psychologist was the private psychiatrist's office, a situation that generated dependent professionals who spent their time doing psychological testing. No psychologists were

employed by public hospitals, which were few and inadequate' (García Averasturi, 1980, p.1091).

Writing in 1944, W.H.D.Vernon of Harvard University, observed that psychology in Cuba, like psychology in other Latin American countries had a very different history from psychology in the US. It had no status as a separate discipline and was seen as a part of philosophy, sociology and education. According to Vernon (1944) general experimental psychology had been taught at the University of Havana, the centre of psychological writing and research since 1881, but there was no laboratory for experimental psychology there until 1934. There were however, laboratories established earlier for training and research in educational psychology and mental measurement; the first of these being the *Laboratorio de Paidología*, School of Education at the University of Havana in 1916 by Dr A.M. Aguayo. Vernon (1944) notes that it is in the field of educational psychology that most thinking and writing has been done, and that the very early work in this field had been already summarised by Morales (1927). He suggests that of more recent historical importance are the names of Varela and of Luz y Caballero, both of whom, though not psychologists in the modern sense, had sufficient influence on the course of educational development in Cuba to find frequent mention in modern Cuban educational writings. Psychology, writes Vernon, as the word is understood in the US, begins with Varona (1849-1933). Varona was a philologist, poet, writer, orator and philosopher as well as a psychologist. He was professor of philosophy at the University of Havana from 1880 to 1915, honorary dean of the Faculty of Letters and Sciences, Secretary of Public Instruction during the period of the American administration in Cuba, and at one time the vice-president of the Republic and chief of the Conservative party.

In his survey of the state of psychology in Cuba, Vernon (1944) makes specific reference to the work of Dr A.M. Aguayo noting that although Aguayo's energies had been chiefly engaged in the exposition and application of the psychology of education he had not neglected clinical study and educational experiment. He also mentions the work of three other psychologists, Dr Bernal del Riesgo, Dra. Piedad Maza and Dra. Aurora García. A review of their publications demonstrates that they too were primarily concerned with educational psychology. In his view a review of Cuban psychology would be incomplete if the 'great number of occasional writings on psychological topics

scattered through a variety of journals were not mentioned'. He observes that the greatest number concern problems of the psychopathogical and subnormal, although the problem of instincts and instinctive behaviour has been of much interest. Educational methods and systems as well as topics in the philosophy of education receive attention as does suggestion and hypnosis, psychoanalysis, consciousness and unconsciousness, tests and measures of intelligence, intuition, behaviourism, memory, attention and so forth. He concludes his survey by suggesting that it is in the field of education that most of the original contributions of modern Cuban psychologists are to be found. However, he moderates this statement on two counts, firstly, by pointing out that 'as educational psychology is in Cuba highly integrated with general psychology, interest naturally extends into this wider field' and secondly by noting that 'this extension of interest manifests itself in scholarliness and sophistication rather than in experimental investigation' (Vernon, 1944, p.81).

These two accounts address an audience of American psychologists albeit that a considerable time span had elapsed between the dates of their respective publication i.e. 1944 and 1980. In so far as they both refer to the training and practice of psychology in Cuba prior to the Revolution, García Alverasturi's (1980) account is more critical and few references are made to antecedents of any worth. This may be partly explained by the majority of medical personnel including psychologists leaving Cuba following the Revolution.

MacDonald (1995) notes, that the total roll of physicians and surgeons in Cuba in 1959 was only 6,000 because medicine as a business occupation was finished. At just the time when Cuba's new legislation made medical care available to everyone, the number of doctors became half of what it had been when they had only been serving, in MacDonald's estimation, 10% of the population. Psychology, if we refer to García Alverasturi's (1980) account operated within this obsolete system and as such when the School of Psychology was established in 1962 it was effectively starting, in terms of staffing, from scratch.

Psychiatry before the Revolution
The state of the psychiatric services prior to the Revolution in 1959 was lamentable. Cuba built its first mental health hospital, *El Hospital de Dementes* (Mazorra) by the

order of the then Capitan General, Don José Gutiérrez de la Concha in 1854 (Calzadilla Fierro, 1998, p. 174). The objective, according to Ordaz Ducungé (1996) was to give asylum to senile black slaves, who because of their advanced age and mental disturbance, were no longer productive and had been abandoned by their owners. Shortly afterwards it became the custom to send vagabonds and criminals there. In the provinces the mentally ill were detained in prison until they could be transferred to Mazorra. During the Brook administration in 1898, at the advent of the US occupation of Cuba following the Second War of Independence, a memo from Dr Méndez Capote to General Brook noted, 'We cannot say that it is an asylum or a place to be cured; it is no more than a Spanish prison, with all horrors and attacks against nature, against morality, hygiene and life' (Méndez Capote in Ordaz Ducungé, 1996, p. 7). This Hogarthian hell held sway relatively unchanged until the triumph of the revolution in 1959. According to MacDonald (1995) it was known by a variety of uncomplimentary names and possibly suffered more spectacularly from corruption in its administration than any other enterprise on the island (MacDonald, 1995, p.104). Under Cuban law, once a person had been declared insane both they and their relatives lost all rights with respect to a further review of the case. A patient's fate, notes MacDonald (1995) was entirely in the hands of the hospital staff and/or the Council for Public Safety, who had to issue the documentation necessary to have someone admitted.

On the other hand, although far from the confines of Mazorra, one notable development within psychiatry which occurred in 1951 was the creation of the Cuban Psychotherapy Association. Individual and group psychotherapy was practiced, especially the former in private practice. According to Calzadilla Fierro (1998) although various schools of thought were represented, a North American model predominated whereby psychoanalysis, its derivations and psychoanalysts came from abroad to teach Cuban psychiatrists. He notes that a biological approach continued to dominate the treatment of the psychoses but calls our attention to the exception of Oscar Sagredo who employed Rosven's method of 'direct analysis' in the treatment of schizophrenia. There is no indication that any of these developments ever benefited the inmates of Mazorra which Calzadilla Fierro (1998) notes continued to operate 'like a warehouse for the mentally ill' (Calzadilla Fierro, 1998, p.177). In 1959, its entire senior staff, including several consultant psychiatrists, who had lucrative practices outside the hospital as well, fled the country and the hospital had to be restaffed. This task along with the complete

reformation of mental health provision in the province was undertaken by a new Medical Director, Doctor Eduardo Bernabé Ordaz Ducungé who held this post until his death in May 2006.

Mental Health Care after the Revolution

Developments in mental health care after the revolution were radical. In 1959, the Department of Psychological Investigations of the Armed Revolutionary Forces was founded, directed until 1961 by Comandante Doctor Ernesto 'Che' Guevara. This department was responsible for the psychological evaluation of professional '*cuadros*' or groups responsible for the management and administration of economic centres who were engaged in the process of nationalising the economy.

Following the massive exodus of health care professionals in 1959 there was an urgent need to train psychiatrists. In 1961, the Department of Medical Psychiatry and Psychology was formed within the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Havana. Amongst the teaching staff was Doctor José Pérez Villar who was later to become involved in supporting the use of art within the context of child psychotherapy groups.

In 1962, the first day hospital was founded by Dr Armando de Córdova based on the model of the Allen Memorial Institute in Montreal, which he had visited in 1957 and 1962.

In 1964, psychiatric services were established in general hospitals, the first being in Cienfuegos in the provinces. Various research institutions came into being and in 1967, and of particular interest to this study, a new Cuban psychotherapeutic method: *Cine Debate Terapéutico* or Therapeutic Cinema Debate was created by Profesor Carlos Acosta Nodal (Calzadilla Fierro, 1998, p. 179). In the same year psychiatry was incorporated into a programme of Community Medicine.

Calzadilla Fierro (1998) offers a useful summary of general achievements and trends in mental health care from 1959. He notes that within mental health the preventative aspect is as dominant as the therapeutic aspect and that an integrated bio/psycho/social approach is adopted in relation to the patient; that psychiatry is increasingly more community based; that areas of growth are teaching, research, social and biological

psychiatry and that information is received not only from the US but from Europe, in particular from the old socialist camp, and principally the ex Soviet Union. He also suggests that there has been a significant reduction in the influence of psychoanalysis and other psychodynamic currents but notes that while this theme merits a profound analysis it is outwith the scope of his study. Finally, but importantly he refers to the '*Glosarios Cubanos de Enfermedades Psiquiátricas I y II*', and informs his reader that a third edition will appear shortly. This project is part of a bigger enterprise which is to compile a Latin American glossary of psychiatry as an alternative to the widely used diagnostic manuals, DSM I-V whose history is entwined with private health care insurance in the US. Concluding his article, he notes the re-entry of Cuba to The World Psychiatry Association, which was abandoned in 1983 in solidarity with the ex Soviet Union who had been accused of committing psychiatric abuses against political dissidents and violating human rights (Calzadilla Fierro, 1998, p. 181).

Other published materials addressing mental health care in Cuba emanate from the Cuban Solidarity Campaign which states that its aim is 'to provide information and resources on Cuba, to promote positive links between the two countries and to develop solidarity' (Waller, J. 1993, p.25).

The CSC also raises funds to supplement the shortages caused by the US blockade. The origins of the blockade date back to June 1961 when following the attempted invasion of Cuba by exiled Cubans opposed to Castro's government known as the Bay of Pigs, the US declared a full trade embargo and in January 1962 conspired to have Cuba expelled from the Organisation of American States, followed by O.A.S economic sanctions. The US tightened the noose around Cuba with the 1992 Toricelli Act, which forbids foreign subsidiaries of US companies from trading with Cuba and bans ships that have called at Cuban ports for six months. Ninety per cent of the trade banned by this malicious law consists of food, medicine and medical equipment (Stanley, 1997).

These shortages include antibiotics, hypodermic syringes, anaesthetics for operations, vitamins and drugs for treating asthma and cancer. Following a Health Study Tour, Waller (1981) notes, that what we understand as the social worker's task in the UK is separated in Cuba into social welfare on the one hand, and psychology on the other. The social workers form part of the primary care team in polyclinics and their role is to

create a link between the bureaucracy, the mass organisations and the individual. Examples of their areas of work are cited as: placing children in institutions, responding to requests for admission to old people's homes and undertaking follow up visits. These functions are separated out according to place of work e.g. a polyclinic, day hospital, school or CDR (Committee for the Defence of the Revolution). In contrast the psychologist largely executes the casework function. This splitting of the task is, as Waller (1981) points out, similar to practice in the US, and to some extent indicates a hierarchical approach, as well as an assumption that economic or practical problems can be dealt with separately from emotional ones (Waller, 1981, p. 10c).

Psychology casework involves several elements:

- Direct therapeutic work, e.g. individual, family or group therapy using any one of a number of models: psychotherapy, goal orientated, art, sport or game therapy.
- Screening work alongside doctors to uncover problems.
- Educating other professionals.
- Doing research and intervention work around user/worker satisfaction in schools, polyclinics which entails researching how levels of productivity, efficiency etc. are related to psychological processes.

According to Waller (1981) Cuban psychologists would describe themselves as trying to develop a Marxist-Leninist psychology. However, he notes that they were 'wary of quoting particular theoreticians'. He suggests that they have not simply adopted a Soviet approach but are attempting an eclectic exercise of taking parts of various theories and approaches for their own ends, in the sense of 'it works we use it' (Waller, 1981, p.8).

Waller (1981) also points to a general orientation which is less focused on the individual. While individual factors are recognised such as divorce or bereavement, social and economic factors such as housing, poverty, organisational processes, sex role changes and the resulting confusion, are taken to be primary. The example he gives of this is the case of an underachieving child. In the Cuban context, the malfunctioning is more likely to be located in the school, rather than in the individual child or in his or her

family. In this instance, the psychologist would assess factors like the standard of teaching, the teacher's understanding of child development, progressive teaching methods and so forth. The child's emotional situation in the family and whether or not this aspect was also available to change would, according to Waller's (1981) analysis, be seen as important but as secondary.

He goes on to assert that when problems are located in the family, therapy does not dwell on process or the unconscious, but tends to adhere to a problem-solving approach, and an exchange of ideas with a heavy underlying emphasis on behaviour. He suggests that there is 'no clear theory of the self, except as a reflection of the forces and relationships within society' (Waller, 1981, p.10d). Therapy tends to be goal-orientated and short-term. This can be partially explained by the ambivalence to psychoanalytic psychotherapy, which can be traced back to 1959 when, with a few exceptions, almost all the psychoanalysts left the country (MacDonald (1995), Waller (1981). He does note however, that nevertheless this style of work is not totally rejected and that clearly much more work needs to be done on incorporating individual work and work with unconscious material into a Marxist approach. Cuban psychologists tend to elicit expression of present and conscious feelings and focus on teaching people to talk about their current problems rather than relating everything to the past. Thus, in the area of bereavement for example, no need would be seen to explore present mourning in relation to past losses.

It is important to note that Waller wrote this report in 1981. My own research was carried out between 1999 and 2001 during which time I worked as a supervised postgraduate student in a centre attached to and staffed by the teaching staff of the Faculty of Psychology of the University of Havana. I also worked on a voluntary basis at a psychiatric day hospital in the poor neighbourhood of Regla. In both settings I found approaches to be much more open and inclusive than Waller (1981) describes. Both individual and group work were prevalent and service provision highly responsive to the needs of patients. However, I did witness the devastating effects of what must at least be partly attributed to the US blockade; the lack of resources and particularly the shortage of medication. When anti-psychotic medicines ran out the consultant psychiatrist with whom I worked in Regla was forced to resort to prescribing herbal remedies and acupuncture. Whatever the merits of these alternative treatments the

impact of withdrawal from lithium, for example, cannot be underestimated in terms of human suffering.

In summing up the orientation of Cuban psychology, Waller (1981) suggests that there is a healthy wariness of the Western tendency to over-individualise problems and solutions. Groups play a prominent role in therapy provision both for inpatients and outpatients, and fit both philosophically and politically with the aims of the Revolution. They are used for all kinds of patient at every stage of treatment, and there seems to be a ready acceptance of participation in a group where Waller (1981) suggests, that relationships might appear to be more geared towards collective goals rather than individual advancement. In conclusion, his report indicates that Cuban psychologists see their ultimate goal as contributing to a comprehensive system of health care by encouraging certain behaviours and feelings which promote health and individual potential. This also involves modifying other behaviours and feelings which he suggests are more likely to have been informed by a pre-revolutionary ideology than by any revolutionary or collective ideals. Obviously, this poses the question as to who decides which behaviour and attitudes need modifying. As Waller (1982) notes, although psychologists claim it is not a problem as they are reflecting the values of the Revolution itself, their work is obviously open to interpretation and abuse; an example being the tendency to see homosexuality as a symptom of personality disorder. Regarding the ideology underlying these practices, Waller (1981) like Craven (2002) in his discussion of cultural democracy, points to Guevara's (1965) concept of the visionary 'New Man' under Communism. Waller (1981) sums up this new person as 'a hard working colleague who cares about others as much as about himself and who remembers from what the Revolution stems, and that which it has brought' (Waller, 1981, p.10f). He suggests that the commitment to the 'New Man' is an explicit attempt to express the ideals of communism and that the vision of the 'New Man', or the 'Exemplary Worker' has provided a large part of the incentive to create a new post revolutionary society. Those who are perceived as reaching this goal, like Ernesto 'Che' Guevara himself, are revered. Waller (1981) notes that the 'New Idea', is motivating people by emulation as opposed to competition, although he admits that the subtlety of this concept was sometimes so great so as to elude him altogether (Waller, 1981, 10f).

As an aside Waller (1981) mentions that Cuban tools for theoretical and practice developments were very meagre indeed.

> 'There are glaring omissions in for example, the type of literature which is available…they have traditional psychiatric journals but have not yet heard of 'anti-psychiatry' or 'critical practice'. Both these concepts would presumably inform their struggle more effectively, and with more political and social integrity' (Waller, 1981, p. 10d).

An overview of the articles published by the Cuban Journal of Psychology seems to confirm Waller's (1981) observations. Cairo Valcárcel (1998) points out that the Cuban Journal of Psychology was first published in 1984, twenty-two years after the first course in psychology at the School of Psychology of the University of Havana commenced in September 1962 at the instigation of, amongst others, Ernesto 'Che' Guevara, Carlos Rafael Rodríguez and the 'productive pressure' of Fidel Castro (Calviño Valdés Fauley, 1998, p.165). García Averasturi (1980) notes that both the School of Psychology in Havana and the School of Psychology established at the University of Santa Clara in the same year were located in their respective Faculties of Science. These developments were part of the general university reform that took place after the Revolution. In these universities, the Faculty of Science offered bachelor degrees in biology, chemistry, mathematics, physics, psychology and geography. In 1977, psychology became an independent Faculty.

The main source of published materials relating to psychology and visual art relate to child psychology and in particular to mental health diagnosis. These appear in the Cuban Journal of Psychology which, apart from textbooks, is the main organ of dissemination of knowledge in the discipline of psychology. Only one published text specifically addresses the relationship between art and psychotherapy. This article, '*Arte y Psicoterapia*' (1995) was written by Dionisio Zaldívar Pérez, who has held the position of Dean of the Faculty of Psychology at the University of Havana since 1995. It appeared in the Cuban Journal of Psychology in the first volume of the year of his inauguration; the same year as he became president of the editorial council. Apparently, the Dean in office always holds this position to ensure that 'the journal will be a

permanent platform for the thought, professional and scientific work of the teaching staff at the faculty' (Cairo Valcárcel, 1998, p.169).

This journal is the official organ of the Cuban Psychology Society. In the editorial preface to the second issue of volume 5 in 1988, authored by the Cuban Society of Psychologists, it states that 'the society consists of ten sections composed of psychologists of education, of the '*actividad de cuadros*', culture, publicity and the media, neuropsychology, acupuncture, methods and techniques and psychology and computation. Of these sections, the Section of Psychologists of Cultural Work was created first, formed by its own members on the 11th February 1982 and attributed to an interest in incrementing scientific research and to the numbers of psychologists working in this area (Editorial Note, 1988, Vol. 5, No.2, p.3).

According to Cairo Valcárcel (1998), since its beginnings the journal included a basic element which was the publication of research conducted by psychologists, who in addition to working as clinicians, taught at the Faculty of Psychology at the University of Havana. His analysis of the journals' characteristics published in 1998, forms part of a larger ongoing work of writing a history of the Faculty of Psychology at the University of Havana. A further paper (2000) provides us with information up to this date but also refers to his colleagues' response to the previous paper. Given that his paper refers to a journal in which 'the work of a representative group of psychologists, formed in our universities and constituting an important part of the specialists in this area of knowledge (psychology), is represented', his findings provide a useful backdrop to a discussion of the literature (Cairo Valcárcel, 1998, p.168).

Of particular significance to my discussion is his analysis of the bibliographies referred to in published articles as this gives an indication of the dominant psychological orientation in contemporary mainstream Cuban psychology and its development over a fifteen year period.

The most salient issues arising from these studies can be summarised as follows. Firstly, that during the period 1984-1996, the use of an English bibliography increased while that of its Russian counterpart had decreased, particularly in the last three years to which the research refers, that is, 1994 to 1996. Secondly, that the bibliographies cited

are far from being contemporary. The year where the most contemporary research was cited in the journal was in fact 1984 and even this was still very low. Another interesting statistic is the number of citations appearing without a date, which seems remarkably high, rising steadily from 21.97% in 1984 to 56.34% in 1996. Finally, over one third of all references referred to texts published more than ten years prior to them being cited.

Quite a number of inferences can be drawn from this data. The influence of Soviet psychology as a source of information is notable and includes some of its most significant representatives. Nine of the eleven most cited works are translations of Russian texts. The texts translated from the Russian were first published in Cuba in the years following the revolution e.g. Petroviski, A.V. (1973) La Havana Editorial, Pueblo y Educación; Rubenstein, S.L. (1966) Universidad de Havana. It is clear that Soviet psychology was, following the revolution until the early 1990's, the dominant influence in the development of psychology as a discipline in Cuba. Cairo Valcárcel (1998) comments, that the heavily weighted Russian bibliography corresponds with the education of the great majority of the authors, who at undergraduate level, studied texts of Soviet origin. Interestingly, Lev Vigotsky, the Soviet psychologist who wrote most about art, and who later emerges as an important figure in contemporary Cuban psychology does not appear until a series of articles beginning in the late 1990's.

Of the 'recentness' of the bibliography referred to, Cairo Valcárcel (2000) reflects:
'The analysis, drove us to reflect upon…if… we psychologists (at least) the authors of the published articles, are turning into historians?'(Cairo Valcárcel, 2000, p.19).

He concludes by stating the importance of trying to employ more recent scientific information as a base in order to make the required leap for survival in the face of the phenomena of globalisation. Writing in 2000 with reference to an updated version of the most cited authors which includes the years 1996 to 1998, Cairo Valcárcel (2000) remarks on the continuing preponderance of the representatives of Soviet psychology but makes no reference to the appearance of Freud. The fact that all the other authors appear in the earlier table (1984-96), although the order has changed, suggests that this is a recent development although at odds with Calzadilla Fierro's (1998) comments regarding the significant reduction in the influence of psychoanalysis and other

psychodynamic currents (Calzadilla Fierro, 1998, p. 180). One possibility here is that the answer lies in different trends within the professions of psychiatry and psychology.

Cairo Valcárcel (2000) suggests that the diversity of professional activity represents a 'very different spectrum' from the narrow frame of those authors published in the journal and he refers to themes such as experimental psychology, sport psychology and psychophysiology as being practically absent in the journal (Cairo Valcárcel, 2000, p.7). It is also quite clear from a literature review that therapeutic practices using art are similarly absent. Overall, there is more discussion of what is not included in the journal than what is actually included and it would seem that the task of identifying themes as they have arisen in historical context has yet to be addressed. An historical analysis of this scale is out with the scope of my thesis. However, several themes do emerge from the published material that pertains specifically to my research question. One of the most salient being the relationships between art, psychology and creativity.

Art, Psychology and Creativity
The earliest published article addressing the relationship between the arts and psychology appears to be that by Dr Mónica Sorín Sokolsky in 1988. The second issue of Volume 5 of the Cuban Journal of Psychology (1988) is devoted to culture. All of the contributions are made by members of the section of the Cuban Society of Psychology dedicated to working within culture. The editorial preface to this issue states that art and culture as objects of investigation pose multiple and complex questions, from the process of creation to the reception of works by the public. As such they are mediated by multiple social and psychological variables that demand, in order that knowledge can be obtained about them, the creative instrument of a theoretical team and a methodology which is derived from a psychology which has a Marxist-Leninist orientation (Nota Editorial, 1988, Vol.5, no.2, p.3)

The opening article is by Mónica Sorín Sokolsky. In her abstract she points to the relation between artistic and scientific activities by which she is referring to the science of psychology. In her view the links between art and science are multiple and various. She points to the fact that artistic expression has been used as a diagnostic and therapeutic instrument and as a means to modify behaviour by psychologists. However, she also notes that different psychological currents, in particular psychoanalysis, have

served as a 'suggestive source', for artists. She does not however, pursue this line of enquiry. Referring to the traditional dichotomy between art and science, Sorín Sokolsky (1988) asserts the following:

- That it is certain that science works with rational concepts and the artist works with images;
- That it is certain that science produces concepts and laws which fundamentally have a cognitive function while art produces imaginary works that fulfil a function and provide an aesthetic experience;
- That it is certain that the artist produces absolutely individual works, impregnated with subjectivity, while the scientist searches for objectivity and regularity.

Having said this, she points out that these truths are in fact half-truths; that everything which tends to dichotomise reality in this closed manner tends to be a half truth. Therefore, according to Sorín Sokolsky, from the theory of knowledge perspective, such statements or dichotomies are idealist approximations. With reference to Lenin (1964) she argues that in the real and alive dialectic of processes, these 'truths', tend to relate to and penetrate each other (Sorín Sokolsky, 1988, p.6).

This reading of Lenin's writings on Marxist dialectics provides Sorín Sokolsky (1988) with an epistemological stance from which she is able to reject the aforementioned reductive dichotomies and she suggests on the basis of Marxist-Leninist dialectics that the 'truths', to which she has referred, can be reformulated.

Her reformulations are as follows:

- That it is also certain that, in the case of the scientist, motivational, affective and ideological processes play a dynamic or an inhibiting role, depending on the individual case. In the artist, these processes also produce a conceptualisation and an elaboration which is mediated by their creation. The extent to which the cognitive and the affective interplay in the creative process of the scientist or the artist, depends on diverse factors: the creator's personality; their school of thought, and the object of creation, amongst others. Conscious and rational

processes are not absent in artistic activity just as unconscious and affective processes are not absent in scientific activity.

- That it is also certain that, science fulfils, in addition to a cognitive function, a productive, heuristic and hedonistic function just as art fulfils, in addition to an aesthetic function, multiple functions including cognitive and ideological.

- That it is also certain, that the individualism of the artist, in one or another manner, is impregnated by the norms of the time and place in which he lives and that the scientist introduces into his objective work a quota of subjectivity and singularity.

Given Cairo Valcárcel's (1998) bibliographic analysis these reformulations are remarkably contemporary. In her rejection of reductive dichotomies Sorín Sokolsky's (1988) formulations are in keeping with contemporary debate in visual theory, yet there are no references to this debate in either her text or her bibliography. At the core of her formulation is a critique of what Best (1992) refers to as the 'traditional and prevalent doctrine', which assumes that there is necessarily an opposition between feeling, creativity and individuality and cognition and reason - a view which not only is disastrous for the educational credentials of the arts, but which expresses a complete distortion of the character of other disciplines, such as the sciences.

It is pertinent to note that if Sorín Sokolsky (1988) has arrived at these formulations in the bibliographic vacuum described by Cairo Valcárcel (1998) she has arrived at these conclusions via an epistemology based on an understanding of Marxist-Leninist dialectics. This is important because it not a route commonly espoused by art therapy theorists or researchers represented in the anglophile bibliography. One exception is Skaife (1995, 2000, 2001) who refers to the dialectical process in relation to the tension 'between interactive verbal communication in art therapy groups and art-making' (Skaife, 2001, p.47). Skaife concludes that it is the therapist's task to keep both processes in mind and to work with the inherent tensions in a positive way.

In her discussion of the relationship between the functions of art and the object of study in psychology, Sorín Sokolsky (1988) notes that psychology studies psychic activity whose central and essential expression is the personality of the subject. The personality

is conceived of as the combination of the most diverse psychic processes: rational, affective, behavioural and motivational, which in a particular structure and dynamic expressed in a singular mode constitutes an actual man. She goes on to point out that while traditionally there has been a tendency to limit art to its aesthetic function, it fulfils communicative, hedonistic, ideological, cognitive and transformative functions, and here she cites the work of Kagan, Barabash and Sánchez Vázquez but without dates or references.

Following on from these two assertions she proposes that:

> 'If we accept this multifunctional character of art, is it therefore not implicit that all the said psychological processes and phenomena will be mobilised? An activity which mobilises all of these functions, is it not mobilising a man as a total personality? What other human activity mobilises a human being in such an integral way? Perhaps love, in its most complete expression. Because of this it is not strange that Pichon Rivière (1985) united both phenomena when he said that art is an action of love, a dazzling link that is established between men' (Sorín Sokolsky, 1988, p.7).

It was on the basis of these assumptions and to further develop them that Sorín Sokolsky and her colleagues established a research group in art and psychology. Four research projects are briefly outlined.

- **Experiment in the formation of social attitudes.**

This is a longitudinal study initiated in 1979 when the subjects were seven years old. The subject of study was how humanist, patriotic and internationalist attitudes could be developed in children via the theatre, literature, drawing and music. The first years of this study are described in detail by Sorín Sokolsky (1985) in a publication entitled '*Humanismo, patriotismo y internacionalismo en escolares cubanos*'. At the point of writing in 1988, she remarks that the study continues, that the subjects, now 16 years old, are seen annually, and that the data which continues to be collected has provided various psychology students with material for their theses.

According to Sorín Sokolsky (1988) this 'experience', shows the rich and productive mobilisation that the arts can produce in relation to three components of attitudes:

cognitive, affective and behavioural. Furthermore, it is claimed that in the conditions particular to Cuban society and to this actual psychological experience, artistic activity generated solidarity, cooperation and generosity.

This claim is tempered in the following paragraph and Sorín Sokolsky notes that of course art does not automatically or mechanically generate these effects. It may provoke the opposite; isolation and individualism. It is the 'peculiar', idiosyncratic relationships; social and between individuals she argues that determine one or another effect.

- **Experiments in the formation and modification of attitudes relating to the use of free time.**

Two psychology students (Martínez, 1982 and Robaina, 1982) for their graduating theses investigated the formation or the modification of attitudes in relation to the use of free time and artistic activities like drama.

Both experiments, undertaken with students 'de media enseñanza', (referring to high school pupils) demonstrated 'the enriching role of art on the spiritual world of the young people' and 'analysed the categories and methodological principles that need to be taken into account so that the artistic experience can be converted into a real factor of change and enrichment of the personality' Sorín Sokolsky, 1988, p.8).

- **Study into assessment and 'the scientific' in a group of researchers**

This investigation did not directly involve art but it is mentioned because the results relate to the heuristic role which aesthetic life plays in scientific activity. The investigation conducted with a group of scientists, from the social, natural and exact sciences was focused on the possible role of aesthetic experiences, in the process of seeking the truth. The social scientists tended, with some differences, to acknowledge this presence. However, all of the natural and exact scientists expressed aesthetic feeling or emotion as a constant component in the scientific process of searching and creation (Sorín Sokolsky, 1986).

- **Study into the creative process in visual artists.**

In another student project (Estevez, 1987) the stages of the creation process in a group of visual artists were studied. Amongst other results, 'a spontaneous yet incomplete closeness to their own creative activity was observed in many of the subjects studied'. It has to be pointed out that this is a somewhat baffling description even in Spanish and it is not explained within the text. However, Sorín Sokolsky goes on to state that the level of conceptualisation and self awareness, both as creators and cultural promoters, was limited and made evident the necessity to incorporate in a more active manner, social sciences and in particular psychology, in the formation of the artist. A note is added here, commenting that while this investigation was limited to visual artists, this affirmation extends to all artistic creation.

These statements are followed by an observation reputedly made by Albert Einstein:

> 'The most beautiful and profound emotion that a man can feel is the sensation of the mysterious. It forms the base of the most profound tendencies in art and in science. It seems to me, that he, who has not experienced this sensation, if not dead, is at least blind' (Einstein in Sorín Sokolsky, 1988).

In her concluding statement, Sorín Sokolsky restates her belief in the mutually enriching relationship which could be established between art and psychology. She acknowledges that not all artists or psychologists are convinced of it.

The lack of detail is a major difficulty in evaluating the research referred to in Sorín Sokolsky's (1988) article. In her description of the research, the methodology is not made explicit, although it is stated that the study into social attitudes is a longitudinal study. Research methods are not described and the results are outlined in very general terms.

However, her stated epistemological position is that of Marxist-Leninist dialectics and this leads her to reject what she describes as a 'reductionist positivist paradigm'. Sorín Sokolsky's (1988) rejection of what she refers to as the traditional tendency to establish a dichotomy between art and science is couched in terms of a rejection of 'dichotomies which are idealist approximations'. This is in keeping with Marxist materialism which is opposed to idealism as exemplified in Marx's departure from Hegelian dialectics.

It is from this epistemological position that she attempts to dissolve the reductive dichotomies imposed by positivism and argue that artistic activity involves a multiplicity of mental functions and processes. An activity which mobilises all of these functions must therefore, according to Sorín Sokolsky (1988) mobilise a man as a total personality. This assertion is not dissimilar to the thesis put forward by Herbert Read (1943) in 'Education through Art', where he proposes that art should be the vehicle through which all education could be transmitted. It is salient to note with Waller (1991), that Read's ideas on art education were influential in the early development of art therapy (which had its roots in art education) in Britain. She also draws attention to Read in her discussion of the joint campaign organised by The British Association of Art Therapists and the National Union of Teachers for improved salaries and structural improvements in the employment of art therapists in 1970. Read was at this time a member of the British Association of Art Therapist's advisory body. Waller (1991) notes that the views represented by BAAT and the Ministry of Health were philosophically quite different 'with BAAT aligning art therapy with 'education' in a broad sense as being to do with the development of a person's personality', as proposed by Read, and the Ministry of Health aligning it with art and craft activities as practiced by Occupational Therapists and their aides' (Waller, 1991, p.130). Sorín Sokolsky's (1984) conclusion that artistic activity involves a multiplicity of mental functions and processes that mobilise man as a total personality resounds with Read's basic thesis although he is not cited in her bibliography. It is however salient to note that in Read's defence of the Platonic thesis that art should be the basis of education, he too seeks to dissolve the false dichotomy between the arts and science (Read, 1943).'In the end I do not distinguish science and art, except as methods, and I believe that the opposition created between them in the past has been due to a limited view of both activities' (Read, 1943, p.11).

In her discussion of 'truth', and adoption of plural 'truths', Sorín Sokolsky's reformulations can be described as both/and rather than as either/or (Hudson, 1977). Hudson's notion of the composite nature of rationality is one in which it is suggested that the rational enterprise is a dialectical process; two things and not one. He posits that being rational is a matter of both conformity and criticism. That rationality is not 'either/or' but 'both/and', in tension. Sorín Sokolsky (1988) seems to be expressing a

similar view in her reformulations but locates her argument within a Marxist-Leninist framework by referring to Lenin (1964) who argues that in the real and alive dialectic of processes that 'truths', tend to relate to and penetrate each other (Sorín Sokolsky, 1988, p.6).

My reading of Sorín Sokolsky (1988) and subsequent questioning of her epistemological position is in fact mirrored in the Cuban Journal of Psychology particularly in articles published from 1998 in the year that Cairo Valcárcel took over as editorial director. The improvements which he refers to in his inaugural article appear to have been implemented and a considerable number of articles appear which directly address questions of epistemology and ontology e.g. Rojo González , M.D.(1998), López García, H. (2000), Calviño Valdés-Fauley, M. (2000), González Serra, D. J., (2000, 2002, 2003), Echemendia Tocabens, B. (2003), Rodríguez Mena García, M. (2003).

There are also two interesting series of articles on Vigotsky and Rorschach which begin to appear from 1998 and 2001 respectively. These articles are relevant in so far they indicate two developments which theoretically are of interest to those interested in thinking about the uses of art in mental health care settings. While Rorschach's work is based in psychodynamic principles and located in the projective test which is visual, Vigotsky's work on art, activity, the zone of proximal development and semiotics seems to offer substantial scope for developments in the practice of art therapy. While there is some acknowledgement of these possible links in the literature, there is no evidence of either systematic research or attempts to develop Vigotsky's ideas within the frame of art therapy practice, in Cuba or indeed elsewhere.

In 2001, Jesús Dueñas Becerra and Jorge Pardillo Palomino published an article entitled '*El Resurgir Del Rorschach En Cuba (1991-1999)*' or The Resurgence of Rorschach in Cuba (1991-1999). In this article the authors refer to the historical evolution of the Rorschach School in Cuba beginning in the 1940's. More specifically they refer to three recent stages the first from 1991-1993 when two consecutive postgraduate courses were offered to professionals working in the areas of neuroscience. A second stage, 1993-1996, saw the creation of a specialised consultancy in Rorschachian psycho diagnosis at the Department of Psychology in the polyclinic Marcio Manduley which disappeared as

a consequence of an administrative restructuring in the Department of Health in Central Havana. The third and current stage dates from 1997 when Dr Eduardo B. Ordaz, the Director of the Havana Psychiatric Hospital and President of the Latin American Psychiatric Association founded the Provincial Centre of Rorschachian Psycho Diagnosis. This department consists of one principal specialist and two collaborators who focus on three fundamental areas of work: clinical assessment, postgraduate teaching and research. Areas of research include organic brain damage and disease, psycho diagnosis and religious syncretism, common responses in sane subjects. Between January 2001 and September 2003 a series of fifteen articles appear in the Cuban Journal of Psychology - more than one article in almost every quarterly publication.

These developments are pertinent to the current discussion for two main reasons. Firstly, they represent a divergence from Soviet psychology and by definition, as Rorschach was a pupil of Freud, to a discussion of psychoanalysis. Secondly, Rorschachian psycho diagnosis is primarily visual, involving the use of picture cards and a psychodynamic interpretation of patients responses to them (Dueñas Becerra, 2001, p.180-183). However, Alonso Álvarez (2002) emphasises the importance of a qualitative interpretation of Rorschach's technique in relation to the content and to special phenomena. Of particular significance to this discussion is Alonso Álvarez's (2002) acknowledgement that:

> 'A universal, prefixed symbolism which permits the attribution of meanings to determined responses does not exist; each culture or group and each individual can have a particular symbolic system to signify emotions, characteristics and aspirations' (Alonso Álvarez, 2002, p. 38).

Another significant point is made in the same paper when Alonso Álvarez (2002) makes a link between free association, Freud's clinical technique, and the historical cultural approach associated with the Soviet psychologist Vigotsky.

'The free association of ideas, as posited by psychoanalysis (in this case between a graphic stimuli and a verbal content) is determined by factors of a motivational nature, and we would say more, by the personality. From our historical cultural conception, all psychic processes have a personalised character' (Alonso Álvarez, 2002, p.36).

The second series of articles are those focussing on the work of Vigotsky himself. Between 1998 and 2003 fifteen articles were published. One of the most interesting of these papers is by Febles Elejalde, Selier Crespo and Fernández (2000) in which links are made between the historical cultural theories of Vigotsky and humanistic psychology. In the context of this discussion, the concept of humanism is referred to. The authors cite Vigotsky's (1924) work 'The Psychology of Art'. They suggest that art plays a role in mediating and maintaining equilibrium between the subject and his environment. Although this brief statement about art is not elaborated upon it is cited as the first of four prepositions in support of the thesis that Vigotsky's historical cultural approach is in fact deeply humanistic.

These two areas, that of Rorschach psycho diagnosis and that of Vigotskian humanism, represent relatively new areas of research and debate within Cuban psychology. On both counts, the link with the past, that is Soviet psychology and Marxist-Leninist dialectics, is Vigotsky and in particular his theories of the cultural-historical development of higher mental functions and of consciousness. Given that both of these developing areas touch on the visual, art and language suggests a fertile area of future research in art as a therapy.

In summation, an overview of Cuban mental health care in the twentieth century reveals a stark contrast between the pre and post Revolutionary periods. The main factor at play is undoubtedly the implementation of a public health care system and the abolishment of private practice which in its sway took with it most of Cuba's psychoanalysts. In the aftermath came Soviet psychology and its predominance is evident from the early 1960's through to the fall of the Soviet Block in 1989 when a new eclecticism begins to emerge. There are however, clear attempts not to throw the baby out with the bath water and perhaps the plethora of publications relating to Vigotsky's work bear witness to this.

Of the two histories, that of Cuban mental health care reveals a radical break with the past, in terms of philosophy, provision and practice. The history of art and art education does not. On the contrary there is sense of continuity in the themes that emerge. Furthermore many of the key players in the years following the Revolution were

members of the avant-garde in the years preceding it. What both histories have in common is the move towards inclusion that is, towards universal health care and a cultural democracy respectively. However, Feinsilver (1993) makes the important point that Cuba's investment in health differs from its investment in other sectors because the creation of a national health system is in itself 'a material, psychological and symbolic monument to socialism' (Feinsilver, 1993, p.202). The symbolic importance of Cuba's investment in health has been explained by Castro as 'a challenge and a battleground between imperialism (the US) and ourselves…and this multiplied our efforts' (Castro, 1987, p.9). Elsewhere he has stated that if Cuba eventually surpasses the US in the public health field, it would be Cuba's 'historical revenge' for decades of hostility, and particularly the US initiated economic embargo that includes medicines, medical technology, and medical information (Castro, 1986, p.3). The symbolic importance of Cuba's investment in the creation of a cultural democracy is more opaque. If the Cuban government hopes for art in the future 'to penetrate all spheres of life', it begs the question as to what end (Hart, 1983, p.12).

Chapter 2

Literature Review

Introduction

In the previous chapter two broad 'histories' were presented; one of the arts and art education and the other of mental health care in pre and post Revolutionary Cuba. In this chapter I will present and review the published material pertaining to the relationship between these two areas. In keeping with my methodology and the aims and objectives of this study I will generally confine my literature review to that emanating from or pertaining directly to Cuba although I will highlight some parallels with material from a wider bibliography pertaining to art therapy. This is not an attempt to generalise but rather to situate and contextualise the bibliographic material. My rationale for doing so is that this particular work is to be presented as a PhD thesis and not simply as a Naturalistic Inquiry case report. As such I am required to locate my research within the corpus of knowledge emanating from the discipline. How this bibliography relates to the wider international picture will be addressed in greater detail in Chapter 7 where my findings are discussed in relation to this wider context.

A review of the literature draws attention to what has been published about and by whom. As there is very little published pertaining to the relationship between art and psychotherapy in Cuba I have drawn widely on what I understood to be relevant sources. Reference is made throughout to historical and contemporary texts and to the preceding chapter in order to elucidate context without which various commentaries are opaque.

In the first case, I shall discuss the limited literature pertaining to work instigated by artists and art teachers, where the practice of art making is recognised to be therapeutic in the broadest sense, although this was not always the primary aim. The main focus here is the work of Antonia Eiriz and those who worked with her. The literature pertaining to Eiriz's work, although intermittent, spans a fifty year period. Her life and work also tell a story about the Cuban Revolution and its repercussions in human terms. What emerges is that she made a considerable contribution to what Craven (2002) has

termed 'cultural democracy', and by implication if not intention, to the recognition that art making can be therapeutic.

Another artist whose work is mentioned in the literature, although minimally, is that of Ulises Cruz Grau. Trained as an art historian, Cruz worked closely with psychologists and psychiatrists in clinical settings, unlike Eiriz. However he currently works in the community of Havana Vieja where his work has a marked social emphasis. His early clinical work is referred to only indirectly through the writings of the psychologist Valdés Marín and his later work through the documentation provided by the City Historian, Eusebio Leal Spengler. I have elected to present the literature pertaining to his work under the same broad heading as Eiriz. Firstly, because the published material emphasises his work in the community albeit that his early community based work at the National Library involved some collaboration with a psychologist, and secondly, because the literature refers to him as an artist and not as a therapist albeit that the data collected *in situ* reveals a rather different picture.

I have not discussed the work Orestes González Rodríguez, the founder of the Cuban Association of Art Therapy because apart from the report he submitted to the International Network of Art Therapists Newsletter in 1997, which I refer to in Chapter 3, there is no published literature pertaining to his contribution.

Following on from this I discuss the literature emanating from the disciplines of psychology and psychiatry where art is discussed quite consciously in therapeutic terms.

A preliminary review of the literature in general seemed to suggest two broad currents; that of art as a therapy in the community as exemplified by the work of Eiriz and the later work of Cruz, and the use of art as a diagnostic tool in child psychology as represented by the work of García Morey in the clinical sphere. However a closer analysis suggests some degree of overlap and this is addressed in the summary and overview of the literature as a whole.

In Part 1, I discuss the literature pertaining to the community based work of Eiriz and Cruz under the heading Cultural Democracy and Community Arts. In Part 2, I present

the limited bibliography emanating from psychology and psychiatry under the heading The Use of Art as a Therapy in Mental Health Care.

Part 1: Cultural Democracy and Community Arts

Introduction

The bibliographic material available referring to the categories identified during the data collection and subsequent analysis, that is, the papier mâche movement initiated by Antonia Eiriz, and to the work carried out by Ulises Cruz at the National Library and latterly at the Study Centre José de la Luz y Caballero in Havana Vieja, is uneven.

A considerable amount of material has been produced in relation to the life and work of Antonia Eiriz whereas very little is available regarding the work of Ulises Cruz.

One of the central contentions of this thesis is that the work initiated and carried out by Antonia Eiriz from 1970 until her departure from Cuba in 1993 constitutes a unique blend of community arts, art education and an example of art as a therapy. I will describe her work with reference to these specific areas although I have used these terms descriptively reflecting how they are used in the available literature. As one would expect, these terms do not translate neatly to fit with their British counterparts where these terms have been appropriated to describe the activities of discrete professional groups.

In this résumé of the literature pertaining to Eiriz's life and work I will begin by presenting the literature pertaining to her involvement with *El Arte Popular* from 1970 to 1993 when she left Cuba. I will then present the literature pertaining to her earlier career as an artist. In this manner I hope to demonstrate that her involvement with the papier mâche movement was an extension of her creative work as she herself stated.

El Arte Popular: Papier Mâche

In this section I will review the literature pertaining to Eiriz's involvement with *El arte popular* and the papier mâche movement. There is considerably less written about this area of Eiriz's life and work although a short film commissioned by ICIAC, '*El Arte del*

Pueblo' (1974) by Oscar Valdés and Rebecca Chavez documents the early developments in the neighbourhood of Juanelo.

The art critic Eligio (1987) refers to Eiriz's involvement with 'the diffusion and promotion of popular art forms and popular artisan work: of papier mâche, jewellery, textile and enamel work' as beginning in 1972 (Eligio, 1987, p.40). He also mentions in the same context the theatre created for and by the children and adults of her neighbourhood pointing out that her work in this area had been central in the acknowledgment of these popular expressions both in Cuba and further afield.

He suggests that it is rare that a 'cultured artist maintains such a connection or closeness with the '*cultura del barrio*' or the culture of the neighbourhood or street and succeeds in connecting, with tremendous naturalness, the spheres of 'the cultured' and 'the popular'' (Eligio, 1987, p.40). In his judgement this reaffirms Antonia as 'that which she has always been: an artist of the avant-garde, the person who clears the path, for who the heuristic attitude involves, beyond the single work destined for the sanctified posterity of the museum, the maximum development of potential creators…without complicated poses or learned populist paternalisms, but with incomparable passion' (Eligio, 1987, p.40).

The first published article describing Eiriz's work in popular arts was written by Onelio Jorge Cardoso in 1973 and appeared in the October edition of the magazine Cuba. The article describes an exhibition of papier mâche work at the Museum of Decorative Arts in Havana.

Cardoso (1973) describes the setting of the exhibition at the mansion house which had once belonged to the Countess Revillacamargo in Calle 17 in Vedado making much of the contrast between the privilege of the previous occupants and the exhibition of work by the *papielistas* from the poor neighbourhood of Juanelo. Cardoso (1973) interviewed Eiriz who described how she began working with her neighbours. She related how Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo, then president of the local Committee for the Defence of the Revolution, wanted to make a party for the local children. Apparently, Eiriz suggested making puppets as an alternative to a sack race. The children themselves dictated the characters parts and Eiriz copied their dialogues. Amongst these pieces of theatre were:

Teo and his Friends, A Magician in Juanelo, The Mysterious Box, The Indecent Queen and The Little Clowns. None of these works were longer than four sheets of paper.

Cardoso (1973) describes how midway through his interview with Eiriz at least fifteen neighbours entered her patio. In what became a 'multiple interview' he reports a number of comments. Oziel, an employee of the Botanical Gardens is quoted as follows:

> 'Ay, when Ńiquita (diminutive of Antonia) suggested that I make these works…I almost had a nervous attack…Now, since I started it doesn't distress me making something new. And María Hermida has brought a new peacock which is better than the one in the museum'…We looked amongst the creators to the mother seated on the chair with her children on either side of her. Here she is and the verification was surprising for us: this woman had almost made a self portrait of herself… as a mother in papier mâche' (Cardoso, 1973, p.27).

Cardoso (1973) also interviewed Ulises aged seven whose works were on view at the Museum of Decorative Arts.

> 'I was making a giraffe but as I was making it… it became a swan, and I said to Ńiquita: Ńica, I think that this is going to be a swan. And she said to me: well a swan it will be; who knows what will come out of your hands' (Cardoso, 1973, p.27).

María del Carmen San Pedro, the director of the Museum of Decorative Arts, is referred to and it is acknowledged how helpful she was to the papielistas. Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo, who I was to interview twenty seven years later also, makes a contribution.

> 'I had studied design with Antonia before they made the puppets and the carnival for the children. The first papier mâche figures were made and the truth…I must confess…when Antonia started working with the neighbours I didn't want to be involved. Vaya! Because I felt superior to them and thought they were not going to make what I knew how to make. But when I saw the quality of what they were doing …those who I considered beneath me in terms of knowledge, I said to myself: Away! They have won and I started to work in the group as one more member' (Cardoso, 1973, p.28).

Cardoso (1973) concludes his article by re-emphasising the contrast between the decadence of a pre revolutionary Cuba as represented by the Countess Revillacamarga's

mansion and the exhibition of objects of art made by common people whose lives were so starkly different. In the catalogue of the retrospective exhibition following her death the American art critic Martínez (1995) also acknowledges the contribution Eiriz made as a teacher pointing out that by all accounts she was a dedicated teacher of 'fine arts' and 'crafts', which she taught to very different student bodies'. Referring to Eiriz's 'retreat to Juanelo' in the 1970's' he suggests that in this role she may have realised not only her greatest achievement but 'consciously realised what is perhaps the most revolutionary kind of art activity – reaching the impoverished, opening their eyes and mind to their own creativity and teaching them a liberating way of making a living' (Martínez, 1995, p. 2).

It is unclear why Martínez cites 1979 as the date of the exhibition as all other texts state that it took place in 1973 (Cardoso 1973; Lao'Izaguirre 1998).

In 1998, Miriam Lao'Izaguirre, the director of the Gallery of Art in San Miguel del Padron produced a document entitled 'Work and Influence of Antonia Eiriz in Cuban Papier Mâche: Stages and Attributes'. In this paper Lao'Izaguirre's aim is to offer a résumé of the work initiated by Eiriz in Juanelo from 1970 and document and evaluate the development of papier mâche work in Cuba.

In her introduction she describes the development of papier mâche, a technique as old as the fabrication of paper itself. She refers to its use in various parts of the US up until the 19th century. In this context she mentions a book entitled 'Art of the Family' published in 1954 by the Contemporary Art Museum in New York which was amongst Eiriz's collection. In 1954 Eiriz spent her honeymoon in New York at the home of her sister. This publication described various artisan techniques that could be practiced in the family including papier mâche. She also mentions the existence of various catalogues referring to artisan work conserved in famous museums and galleries and notes methods and projects in art education which Lao'Izaguirre suggests nourished her work both as a teacher and in the development of popular arts. Apparently this collection of materials, which was archived by Lao'Izaguirre following Eiriz's death, was 'carefully guarded amongst her most precious belongings' (Lao'Izaguirre, 1998, p.5).

Eiriz's signature appeared on the first copy page of 'The New Vision' and 'Review of an Artist' by Lázló Moholy-Nagy (1963). This caused Lao' Izaguirre (1998), trained as an art historian, to speculate about the link between Eiriz's art and ideas and the Bauhaus - a German school of design founded by Walter Gropius in Weimar in 1919 - which was based on the principle that art should serve the needs of society. This school propelled architecture and the applied arts in the first part of the 20th century and Gropius, its founder, emphasised the great educational value of artisan work. In Lao'Izaguirre's opinion Eiriz put into practice this philosophy arguing that this is clearly demonstrated by the development of popular arts in Cuba that Eiriz initiated. This thesis is quite plausible given that Gropius visited Havana in 1945 at the invitation of Ricardo Porro the architect responsible for the National School of Art at Cubanacán where Eiriz taught from 1965 to 1969. Furthermore, as noted in Chapter 2, *Los Once*, the group of artists Eiriz was linked with and with whom she exhibited in 1959 and in 1963, was allied with *Arquitectos Unidos* (United Architects). Guido Llinás who she cites as her mentor (Blanc, 1993) and Consuegra who wrote the introduction to her first solo exhibition in 1964 were both members of this group as was Nicolás Quintana who was involved with Porro in the '*quema de los Vinola*' in 1947, the event which the architectural historian Loomis (1999) cites as influential in ushering in a more modernist programme in Cuban architecture.

A significant number of these individuals associated with Eiriz chose to leave Cuba. Llinás left Cuba for Paris in 1963 the year in which Ricardo Porro resigned from the School of Architecture. Hugo Consuegra resigned from his faculty post in 1966 and subsequently left the country (Loomis, 1999, p.13).

In her discussion of Eiriz as an educationalist Lao'Izaguirre (1998) refers to the short documentary film 'Arte de Pueblo' (1974) the script of which was written and narrated by Eiriz. Here Eiriz locates herself within the new socialist reality.

> 'As the person responsible for education, I proposed a new perspective which could substitute disorganised games and take advantage of the children's natural talent and imagination. Through a creative game, educational and cultural results were obtained, not in an abstract way, but within the new socialist reality' (Eiriz, 1974).

The first puppet theatre performance written, created and performed by the children took place on the 21st September 1971.

Eiriz (1974) notes that 'The children were very enthusiastic, as is natural…the child approaches creative activity freely and without preoccupations. Children always have some idea about means of expression' (Eiriz, 1974). This approach, underpinned by a belief in the natural creative ability of the child, is reminiscent of the teachings of the art educationalist Franz Cizek in the 1920's and 1930's. Waller (1991) describes how Cizek believed that every child had the potential for creative expression and how he 'encouraged those who came to his studio to engage in 'free expression', with Cizek providing the materials and the support for their efforts' (Waller, 1991, p.17).

Another interesting aspect of her work is that she went to her pupils as opposed to her pupils coming to her. She outlines her rationale for this approach in the following extract.

> 'In order to guarantee the results of the incorporation of the children in that which, they as well as their parents, perhaps thought of as a simple training, it was necessary that the parents had a better identification and comprehension and this, I thought, could be best obtained by working with them directly in their own homes…This could only be obtained working directly within the nuclear family as an integral part of our community *cederista* (colloquial reference to the CDR or Committee for the Defence of the Revolution). In this way began a pedagogical experience which has been repeated in other social situations…' (Eiriz, 1974).

Technique

In 1975, Eiriz wrote a pamphlet for a course given by the Department of Public Relations of the Community Development Group in Buenavista which was the responsibility of María Rosa Almendros. In this publication, Eiriz explained the origin of the papier mâche technique and how she was inspired to pursue this work by a necessity which surfaced in her own CDR in Juanelo. Lao'Izaguirre (1998) offers a synopsis of this manual which provides an invaluable insight into Eiriz's approach.

Eiriz outlined how to prepare for the work, emphasising that the approach which she advocates is as appropriate for a rural community, as for an urban CDR. She suggests that the sharing of knowledge should take place within family groups or organised

encounters depending on the time available in each house. She notes that 'this is good because when people have to move to another place outside the home, many family members don't turn up because they feel shy or because they don't consider themselves able to realise this sort of work…the evening hours are the most convenient and allow everyone to be present: father, mother, children, integrated in a creative activity…the children most of all feel greatly stimulated by this cultural development' (Eiriz (1975) In Lao' Izaguirre (1998).

Lao'Izaguirre (1998) notes that Eiriz did not forget to refer to pedagogical factors in the manual. At the stage of decoration, she exhorts prospective teachers to encourage the most timid students and stimulate them to take initiative, adding that 'one should use the term decorate, not paint, already this term is more related with the painting of pictures and intimidates people who don't think of themselves as artists'. She also emphasises that 'the arrangement of colours does not have to be related to reality but with the concept and function of the decoration and ornamentation of the piece… in the case of children, how to use the materials should be explained to them and the form and positioning of the colours should be left to their free election' (Lao'Izaguirre, 1998, p.10).

Eiriz (1975) goes on to outline her adaptation of the traditional papier mâche technique which is informed by the shortage of materials.

Lao'Izaguirre (1998) points out that when Eiriz developed this initiative in the 1970's it was possible that amongst the materials at the disposal of most families would have been medicines that could be used as colours and waste paper. Other materials could be found, for example, old newspapers and magazines; fine wire (which could be found in old motors), fine rope or pieces of cloth to tie the armature; flour or maize or starch to make glue (which she notes doesn't need to be in a good condition); white paper of any type which could be pages of used jotters without lines or the residues from printers; scissors, varnish and coloured products from the pharmacy; and sticks of wood of different thickness padded with cotton at the ends, which could be used as paintbrushes. Aware of the social characteristics of her neighbours Eiriz suggested using everything possible that they would already possess.

Regarding the decoration, which is sometimes referred to as the 'Antonia Eiriz style', Lao'Izaguirre (1998) suggests that here this was inevitable as Eiriz was very much the artist. She emphasised the basic elements of decoration such as repetition, alternation, superimposition and geometry. Likewise, she drew attention to the distribution of elements in rows or lines, with defined rhythmic movements and the repetition and alternation of them.

The promotion of papier mâche

Lao'Izaguirre (1998) goes on to offer an analysis of the promotion of papier mâche in Cuba from the perspective of systematic institutionalised labour. Her analysis is based on data which represents over thirteen years of work in this area held at the Municipal Art Gallery of San Miguel del Padron. This institution came into being as a result of a plan to establish basic institutions in the community and according to Lao'Izaguirre (1998) genuinely reflects the idea of bringing such centres to the artists and intellectuals within their radius of action. The museum in San Miguel del Padron inaugurated in 1982 and the municipal gallery of art, inaugurated in 1985 have played an important role in the promotion of papier mâche work creating a permanent exhibition where works as early as 1972 are conserved and exhibited

Community Developments

Lao'Izaguirre's (1998) analysis of the promotion and development of papier mâche outwith Havana is based on guardianship of objects, exchange between artisans and the evaluation of objects sent to exhibitions. She suggests that Camaguey, Matanzas, Pinar del Rio and Guantánamo represent the areas of greatest development.

Future plans in 1998 involved holding courses in the provinces and the development of a workshop in Eiriz's house in Juanelo. The project 'Casa Taller de Papier Mâche Antonia Eiriz has received support from the National Art Council of Cuba and Oxfam.

This workshop opened in 2004. It is described by Abreu (2004) in Diario Granma, the official organ of the Central Committee of the Cuban Communist Party, as constituting an example of real cultural promotion and intense community work. It appears that the house is to be used as a gallery and also a workshop where classes are to be imparted to children, the elderly and handicapped people by Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo, Deisy

Castillo, and Silvia Fernández with the co-operation of Umberto Gutiérrez (Papo), using the techniques they received from Antonia Eiriz

Lao'Izaguirre (1998) goes on to list various courses which took place between 1973 and 1997. She also cites exhibitions both national and international where works by Cuban papier mâche artists have been exhibited. In conclusion she sums up Eiriz's work as an example of a 'convergence of cultural, social and educational values' Lao'Izaguirre, 1998, p. 24).

Miriam Lao'Izaguirre was more than generous in making materials available to me. Shortly after Eiriz's death in Miami on March 9, 1995, her house was opened and visitors came to pay their last respects. Miriam Lao'Izaguirre copied the pages of a book where visitors had written their thoughts. Most of these are addressed to Eiriz herself thanking her for having helped them. The shortest and most touching entry is by Ubaldo Gutiérrez (Papo) one of her most prolific pupils which reads 'Muchos adioses Antonia de Papo' which in translation means 'Many goodbyes Antonia from Papo'.

The published material on *arte popular,* often used synonymously with the term 'papier mâche movement', is minimal. However it does provide an example of cultural democracy initiated at grass roots level in action and indicates the recogntion this work received from the establishment. The literature pertaining to Eiriz's work as an artist emanates, in the main, from historians of art. This material not only provides the background to Eiriz's involvement in community based work but indicates continuity between her own work and her work with others.

Eiriz the Artist

One of the most balanced, thoughtful and most recent articles on the life and work of Antonia Eiriz Vásquez is by the art historian Alejandro Anreus (2004). Shortly after she died of a heart attack on March 9, 1995, in Miami, Florida Eiriz received countless tributes in newspapers and magazines in both Cuba and the US. Anreus (2004) draws attention to the irony that although both sides mentioned the harshness and tragedy of her paintings, drawings and prints, they avoided dealing directly with the critical essence of her work (Anreus, 2004, p.1)

'This 'critical essence' consists of an uncompromising neofigurative visual vocabulary, one in which all subjects - particularly 'sacred' ones referring to motherhood, leadership, and patriotism, among others – are up for an autopsy-like inspection' Anreus, 2004,p.1).

Anreus (2004) has the benefit of hindsight. In the following section I shall present a snapshot of the literature pertaining to Eiriz's work which for the most part emanates from Cuba and represents a bibliographic trail from 1952, when she exhibited for the first time, to 1995 when her obituary appeared in Granma (Capote, 1995). Articles published after 1995 (Martínez, 1995; Álvarez, 2002; Serrano, 2002; Anreus, 2004) have for the most part been written by Cuban Americans (Martínez, Anreus) or Cubans living in exile in Spain (Serrano) or Brazil (Álvarez).

In June 2000 I left Cuba with a handful of photocopies and several old magazines that people had given me; the most recent of these a photocopy of the catalogue of 'Antonia Eiriz: Tribute to a Legend' (1995). However I had a lot of interview material and a strong feeling that Eiriz was important. In 2000 when I returned to Edinburgh there was one reference to Antonia Eiriz on the internet from the Cuban National Museum of Modern Art which was closed for restoration throughout my residence in Havana (June 1999- June 2000). Five years later in Barcelona there are over 200 references, several of which point to commercial galleries in Florida, where her ink drawings are offered for sale at prices exceeding $4000.

Following the distinction made in the previous chapter I shall discuss Eiriz's career as an artist before and after the Revolution.

Eiriz in Pre-Revolutionary Cuba
In her introduction to the catalogue for Eiriz's exhibition, '*Ensamblajes*' or assemblages, held at the National Museum of Art in 1964, Bruzon (1964) offers a brief biographical outline. She notes that Eiriz was the sixth child of Spanish immigrants and that she entered the San Alejandro School of Art in 1951 graduating in drawing and painting in 1957, (although other references state that she graduated in 1958 (Blanc, 1994, Martínez, 1995)). Apparently, Eiriz never thought she would be a painter; a point she made towards the end of her life, in an interview with the art critic Guilio Blanc in

Miami in February 1993. As Anreus (2004) points out Eiriz's interest in art began with drawing dresses.

> 'I never thought that I was a painter. It was very difficult for me to paint. I wanted to be fashion designer. My sister paid to send me to a commercial design school. My sister Mercedes, who was in New York at that time, said that I should go to San Alejandro. I had a sort of scholarship of 29 pesos a month. It wasn't enough for materials. The avant-garde artists thought it a bit of a stigma to graduate from San Alejandro, that painters from there were rather mediocre. But I later learned that Amelia Peláez had also graduated from there' (Eiriz in Blanco, 1994, p.3)

Blanc (1994) notes, that Eiriz soon emerged as a new significant figure at a crucial time in Cuba's artistic and political history.

Even before graduating Eiriz had become involved with the emerging avant-garde, participating in group exhibitions with *Los Once*. In 1952, between May and June, she took part in *28 Dibujos y Gouaches* (28 Drawings and Gouaches) held in the Salon Permanente de Pintura y Escultura at the CTC where she exhibited work alongside Guido Llinás, her future husband Manuel Vidal, his brother Antonio Vidal and Fayad Jamís, all members of *Los Once*. Of the members of this group, Eiriz was particularly influenced by Llinás who she referred to as her 'teacher and mentor' in so far as he had introduced her to the most contemporary ideas in painting in the 1950's (Gómez in Anreus, 2004, p.2).

After a gap of five years Eiriz participated in 1957 in an exhibition of paintings at *la Iglesia de Paula* (the old Paula Church) in Havana Vieja sponsored by the Patronato de las Artes Plasticas, a pre-Revolutionary organisation set up to promote the arts. The artist and critic Antonio Eligio (Tonel) (1987) in his article for *Revolución y Cultura* suggests that it was the canvases exhibited in this exhibition which first called Eiriz's work to the attention of both the public and the experts (Eligio, 1987, p.38). In April 1959, her participation in the exhibition 'Thirteen Cuban Artists', at the Lyceum in Havana, brought her to the attention of the well-connected art critic Graziela Pogolotti whose shrewd appraisal of Eiriz's early work, has been borne out by the test of time.

> 'There is a new name that we must learn and I have left it on purpose until last: Antonia Eiriz Vásquez. I do not know her. But her 'Still Life with

People', multi-coloured, made with weariness and without concessions, makes you think of a rich, disturbing, interior world. Painting for her, is far from being an exercise: it is the violent necessity of expression' (Pogolotti, 1959, p.155-56).

Eiriz in Post Revolutionary Cuba.

January 1, 1959 was the beginning of a new phase in Cuba's history and as Anreus (2004) points out the majority of Cuban artists supported the revolution led by Fidel Castro believing that culture would be integrated and supported in the new agenda of radical change (Anreus, 2002, p.2).

During the first years of the Revolution Eiriz and her work received a great deal of attention and support. She was associated with the most radical and independent group of intellectuals, with *Los Once*, and with those who were part of the cultural supplement *Lunes*. Edited by the novelist Guillermo Cabrera Infante, the magazine was the Monday supplement of the newspaper *Revolución*, which had been founded and edited by the journalist and independent socialist Carlos Franqui. Anreus (2004) points out that 'both publications supported total experimentation and freedom in the arts, had a supportive and critical stance vis-à-vis the revolution' and 'rejected any form of social realism in aesthetics and Soviet style communism in politics' (Anreus, 2004, p.3).

However, in November 1961, during the first 'Dark Period' in Cuban cultural politics, and following the Bay of Pigs, *Lunes* was closed by order of the revolutionary government ostensibly due to the controversy over the film 'PM' described as a 'decadent' look at night life in Havana (Craven, 2002, p.89). The film, which was censored by the revolutionary government, was defended by the magazine in the name of artistic freedom.

According to Anreus (2004) tense meetings took place in the National Library in June 1961. It was during the second and final meeting between intellectuals, artists and the government's Cultural Council at the National Library that Castro pronounced the famous words: 'Within the revolution everything, outside the revolution nothing'. Soon after, in August, the First Congress of Cuban Writers and Artists assembled in Havana, and the Writers and Artists Union (UNEAC) was established. Leninist-style cultural management had arrived in the tropics; but still, socialist realism would not be officially

imposed. As long as artists were not negative, pessimistic or critical in any way regarding the revolutionary process, they would be left alone. By keeping to these guidelines, they were 'within the revolution' not outside it. By 1965 *Revolución* had been forced to merge with the Communist Party newspaper *Hoy* and, retitled *Granma*, which became the official cultural organ of the government (Anreus, 2004, p.3).

In 1962, following the closure of his magazine, Guillermo Cabrera Infante, estimated by Craven (2002) as easily the most gifted of Cuban authors to have gone into exile before 1989, left Cuba. In that same year, Edmundo Desnoes wrote about Eiriz's work in *Pintores Cubanos* (Cuban Painters). He suggests that in her work the 'idealisation of reality has lost all its relevance' and that her 'tortured and violent forms, have their origin in the state of being of our time' (Desnoes, 1962, p.47).

In the ensuing decade Eiriz's output was prolific. Following her participation in the group exhibition *Expresionismo Abstracto*, or Abstract Expressionism at the Gallería de La Havana in 1963, she had her first one-person show *Oleos y Ensamblajes* (oils and assemblages) in the same venue between January and February 1964.

I was able to study the catalogue of this exhibition at the National Council of Culture in Havana. In this first solo exhibition several of what have become Eiriz's best known works were exhibited, amongst them *La anunciación* (1963-64) (The Annunciation), *El vaso de aqua* (1964) (The glass of water) and *Ni muertos* (1964) (Not even dead).

 El vaso de agua (1962) and three versions of a later work *Los de arriba y los de abajo* (1966) (Those from above and those from below) are amongst those mentioned by Martínez (1995) as having 'crossed the line into the realm of political criticism'. However, these paintings appear to have travelled to Mexico in 1966 in a collection of eight oil paintings and three assemblages by Eiriz, accompanied by a collection of works by Raul Martínez. Under the auspices of the *la Direccíon General de Difusíon Cultural* (The General Office of Cultural Diffusion) they were exhibited at the Casa Del Lago, at the National Autonomous University of Mexico between October and November 1966. The catalogue contains two short introductions to Eiriz's work by Adelaida de Juan and by Roberto Fernández Retamar. Craven (2002) refers to de Juan as' perhaps the most important art historian within Cuba of the Cuban Revolution'

while Retamar, an eminent author, had become Director of Casa de Las Americas in 1961 (Craven, 2002, p.199). This seems to suggest that if Eiriz's work was viewed as critical of the Cuban regime it was certainly not seen in this light in 1966.

During this period of time Eiriz appears to have been inexhaustible. In addition to collaborating as an illustrator with the magazines *Lunes de la Revolution* and *Cuba* and realising various book covers, she had been employed since 1962 as a teacher at the School for Art Instructors in the section of artesanía or artisan work (Bruzon, 1964).

In her introduction to Eiriz's second one-person show at the National Museum of Art, where she was invited to exhibit her assemblages as 'Artist of the month', Bruzon (1964) writes:

> 'Meeting Antonia is the best introduction to an understanding of her paintings and assemblages; however, they themselves do not need a commentary to be understood, they are like an insult hurled in one's face' (Bruzon, 1964, p.1).

Bruzon's (1964) description of her interview is similarly intriguing. She describes visiting Eiriz in Juanelo.

> 'We found her building one of her assemblages, there was rotting wood, old tins, pieces of burnt cloth, rusty nails, climbing plants which mixed themselves with the assemblages and penetrated the intimacy of the house, children running armed with plastic bottles fulminating ants with jets of water. People enter and leave, they sit, speak of the heat, that for days there is no water in Jacomino, the children continue running, Antonia shouts…'(Bruzon, 1964, p.1).

Bruzon reminds Eiriz that she has to write something for the catalogue about the forthcoming exhibition and quotes Eiriz's response.

> 'Look, it is very difficult for me to say why I make assemblages or why I paint, I need to dedicate myself to meditate about these things and really I don't do it. A while ago, when we made the exhibition of abstract expressionism, we thought about realising one later on, the group, an exhibition of assemblages. Later it was left in the air and we didn't do it. At that time I didn't think myself capable of realising it. Later on, as I was running out of traditional painting materials, out of necessity I looked for elements of rubbish and worked with those. At the beginning those which I

had in my own patio, later I went out to look for them in the rubbish, clearly overcoming certain scruples, not because of the rubbish but the people who looked at me in a strange way and who asked me what 'herb' are you looking for' (Eiriz in Bruzon, 1964, p.1).

This is a particularly interesting extract because it clearly illustrates that making do or inventing materials was not new to Eiriz when in 1970 in a more difficult economic situation she adapted traditional papier mâche techniques which basically involved using rubbish or very cheap materials as alternatives. In the same interview she states:

'An assemblage is not a sculpture neither is it a painting rather it contains something of both techniques and of both disciplines. The construction of assemblages is nothing new and nowadays, all over the world, there are artists who make them from the most varied of objects. For me in particular making assemblages I have rediscovered the magical world of the everyday' (Eiriz in Bruzon, 1964, p.1).

These extracts are suggestive of what she later went on to do and belie the supposition that her later involvement in teaching papier mâche evidenced a complete break with her past and her own work. While she may not have made works herself after 1970, she was in her work with papier mâche drawing upon her own experiences. Bruzon concludes her article by reflecting on Eiriz's use of the seemingly unusable.

' After seeing the 'Assemblages' of Antonia Eiriz and going out into the street we cannot remain insensitive before those mountains of debris and the destroyed things which sometimes appear in our way; in the hands of an artist they recover new forms, as only he can elevate them from the 'vulgar' (Bruzon,1964,p.1).

It has since been drawn to my attention that there are striking parallels in Eiriz's work and approach to the Italian movement known as A*rte Povera* which emerged in the 1960's (Waller, 2006). Christov-Bakargiev (2001) notes that the term *arte povera* was first coined by the Italian art critic and curator Germano Celant in the summer of 1967 - appropriating it from the Polish experimental theatre director Jerzy Grotowsky's notion of 'poor theatre'- to define the work of a number of young Italian artists (Christov-Bakargiev, 2001, p. 21). Much of their work, according to Christov-Bakargiev (2001) could be described today as early examples of installation art. She also refers to the political nature of *Arte Povera's* resistance to the society of the spectacle it was born into, as well as the glorification of the consumer product implicit in much of the Pop Art

that preceded it. This latter observation is particularly interesting given Cardenal's (1972) research into the stance on the arts taken by the Revolutionary government in relation to Soviet style realism, previously referred to in Chapter 1, 'Cuba, they said, found its true socialist realism in Pop Art' (Cardenal, 1972, p.189).While there is no reference made in any of the interviews with Eiriz to *Arte Povera* her awareness of their activities is probable. She does however refer to the COBRA group in an interview with Blanc (1974) with whom Lucio Fontana, an artist of the older generation associated with the arte povera artists still highly influential in the 1960's, had links. Closer to Eiriz's work and aesthetic is the work of Alberto Burri cited by Christov-Bakargiev (2001) along with Fontana as being one of the precursors of Arte Povera.

Burri was a modernist. In 1949 he engaged in collage, combining old, worn out clothes, woods, plastics and other materials. Villa (1953) describes Burri's use of 'ordinary working-class materials defended with love, ennobled and made up as if in preparation for some superior book of etiquette' (Villa, 1953p.164). But the parallels between Eiriz's work and *Arte Povera* go further than the use of materials. Christov-Bakargiev (2001) refers to Burri's oeuvre as expressing the moral weight and burden of living in a post atomic and post-Holocaust world and Desnoes (1962) makes a similar point in relation to Eiriz's early work when he states that her pictures have a direct relation with the grotesque elements of our time. Like the *Arte Povera artists*, Eiriz's work is dense with social critique and always maintains a political edge (Martínez, 1995).

According to Martínez (1995), Eiriz had by 1964 developed a 'highly personal style and iconography, In Martínez's view her paintings 'in their ambitious scale, scarred surfaces, contorted figures, and raw emotionalism surpassed all forms of expressionism ever practiced in Cuba' (Martínez, 1995, p.1).

In the decade 1959-69 Eiriz exhibited widely both at home and further afield in both the Americas and in Europe. She was selected to represent Cuba in several international Biennial exhibitions (1961, 1961, 1963, and 1966). She also began a career as an art teacher at the School for Craft Instructors in Havana (1962-64) and later at the National School of Art of Cubanacán where she taught painting and colour theory from 1965 to 1969. In 1967 she was awarded a six-month travelling scholarship to Italy, Spain and France by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation.

According to Anreus (2004) she participated in forty group shows in those ten years both in Cuba and abroad. In short, her curriculum vitae from 1959-69 suggests an extremely successful career as an artist and teacher in post-Revolutionary Cuba.

Martínez's (1995) text, published after her death, emphasises Eiriz's preoccupation with what he refers to as the darker side of Cuban life in the 1960's and attributes her eventual abandonment of painting in 1969 as much to the 'negative official reaction to her tribune paintings' as to what he describes as her 'daily struggles of a more personal nature'. However, the evidence cited in the résumé of Eiriz's professional life in the catalogue of her retrospective exhibition in 1995 points to a woman participating fully in the life of the artistic community of her time.

Shortly before her death, Eiriz in an interview with Blanc (1994) reflected on what had influenced her painting. She cites the Cuban painters Amelia Peláez, Raúl Milián, René Portocarrero and Acosta León who she describes as an 'extraordinary painter of universal importance'(Eiriz in Blanc, 1994, p.2).

Of influences further afield, in Europe and North America, Eiriz's interest was in modernist painting.

> 'People have talked about the influence of Goya. I did not know Goya well. Perhaps his influence was transmitted to me through my Spanish roots. They have classified me as an expressionist, but I always wanted to be an abstract painter. I love De Kooning, Kline, Tapies, Miró and Dubuffet. Cezanne saved me from the landscapes in the academy. He eliminated everything that was superficial in painting. Orson Wells once said talking about cinema that was important for a director was not what he had to put in his film but what he had to cut out. This is also true for the painter. I admired abstract painters very much but in my case, the little heads and figures appeared almost in spite of myself. I was also interested in the COBRA group and would have liked to paint with their brilliant colours' (Eiriz in Blanc, 1994, p.3).

Álvarez (2002) notes in his discussion of Cuban art in the 1960's, that a proliferation of figurative art, which he also deems as 'official art', began to appear, which can be denominated ' marvellous reality', in accordance with the concept created by Alejo Carpentier in literature. He also mentions that in this period, Art Brut and *la Nueva Figuración* (the New Figuration) awakened the interest of young artists and counted

amongst its principal exponents, Antonia Eiriz, Acosta León, Humberto Peña, Chago Armada, Servando C. Moreno and ultimately Jesús de Armas (Álvarez, 2002, p.3).

Martínez (1995) locates Eiriz's influences further afield and regards her 1960's images as being in the best modernist tradition of Francisco Goya, James Ensor, Kathe Kollwitz, Jean Dubuffet, Clemente Orozco and Frances Bacon. In Cuba, what he describes as her 'works of biting political criticism', have, in his view, the drawings of Rafael Blanco (1885-1955) as their predecessor. Her more personal sombre works, he argues, have their forerunner in some of the paintings of Fidelio Ponce (1895-1949) and Raul Milián (1908-1984).He also cites the literature of the Cuban playwright Virgilio Piñera (1912-1979) as being in her 'immediate artistic family' in its mordant black humour (Martínez, 1995, p.1). Anreus (2004) echoes this opinion noting that many years later critics would find stylistic commonalities between Eiriz's work and those of Francis Bacon and the Mexican José Luis Cuevas. He notes however, that she did not encounter their work until after her own visual vocabulary had developed, and unlike their work, hers would be devoid of narcissism and always have a political edge. He goes on to comment that Eiriz does not mention in any of her interviews the Cuban expressionist painters Fidelio Ponce (1895-1949) and Rafael Blanco (1885-1955) as influences but expresses his own opinion that 'in their distortions and satirical visions of the society of their time, they are part of the same family'. In this reference to 'family', one senses an oblique reference to Roberto Retamar's article originally published in 1964 in which he refers to Eiriz's family in terms of a tradition of painters concerned with tragedy (Anreus, 2004, p.2).

Her black sense of humour was certainly remarked upon innumerable times during the many interviews I conducted with those who had known her. This sense of humour she had shared with, amongst others, her great friend and partner for some years, the writer and artist Julio Girona. In his brief essay for the catalogue of the 'Exposición Transitoria 25 Grabados de Antonia Eiriz' which opened in June 1987 at the Museo Municipal San Miguel del Padron he was to write:

> 'The first works that I saw by Antonia Eiriz appeared in the magazine Cuba
> in 1964. I was in New York. I was surprised at the force of her paintings. I
> confess that they didn't appear to have come from hands that make
> embroideries and delicate things associated with women…One of her

paintings that appeared in the magazine was entitled 'Christ Leaving Juanelo'. I thought in my ignorance of religious questions. I only knew the name of Jerusalem. I was ignorant of the existence of Juanelo. A little later I went to Havana and encountered the artist. The author of those enormous and vigorous paintings was tiny and fragile and it cost me work to associate her with her canvases that gave the impression of being made by mâchete strokes, fire and huge house painting brushes. Later I knew that you could go to Juanelo for five centavos on the Number 10 bus route, that it wasn't on the outskirts of Jerusalem and also I understood why Christ had marched away from Juanelo. There was nothing to do there'.
(Girona, J., 1987, p.7)

I met Julio Girona in Havana in April 2000 and he told me this story. It was Eiriz who had explained to him why Christ had left Juanelo. He was still laughing about it.

Anreus (2004) considers this painting, *Cristo saliendo de Juanelo* (1966) (Christ Leaving Juanelo), to be Eiriz's homage to the Belgian painter James Ensor as well as a satirical statement on salvation. He approaches his reading of the painting from iconography - a visual methodology which at the synthetic stage of interpretation offers an understanding of the painting drawing upon all available information pertaining to it. In his reading:

'Christ has left the crowd behind in modest, insignificant Juanelo, taking salvation with him. Crowds in revolutionary Cuba had (and have) an explicit meaning. They are the popular expression of democracy, the source of power for the leadership, but also the source of power to be manipulated by the leader (ship). Castro himself told Franqui as early as 1959 that it was in the revolutionary, populist crowds that he had his power and version of democracy. The revolution was seen as salvific, and its guerrilla leaders with their long hair and beards were perceived as Christlike. In this context Eiriz's painting can be read on at least two levels; as mocking a traditional religious narrative and the religious aura of the revolution. This crowd consisting of those left behind by a departing saviour, is not heroic or dynamic or a source of populist power; rather it consists of grotesque masks representing the artist's conviction of failed salvation, spiritual or political' (Anreus, 2004, p.5).

Censorship or Auto Censorship

The year 1968 was a contentious one in Cuban cultural politics. It was the year that Herberto Padilla (1932-2000) received the poetry prize from the Writers and Artists Union (UNEAC) for his manuscript *Fuera del juego* (Out of the Game), a collection of poems, described by Anreus (2004), as critical of life in post revolutionary Cuba. Padilla's book was published, but it contained a declaration from the Writers and Artists

Union attacking the book as counterrevolutionary and defeatist. The book contained a poem written about Eiriz and her painting in which the following line appears.

> 'Those demagogues she paints,
> Who look like they are going to say so many things
> And in the end do not dare to say anything at all.'

These demagogues or crowds of demagogues mentioned in Padilla's poem, who 'in the end do not dare to say anything at all', are the subject of Eiriz's most controversial painting, the 1968 work *Una tribuna para la paz democratica* (A Tribune for Democratic Peace).

In 1993 Blanc asked her why she had stopped presenting one-woman shows and in-group exhibits after 1968.

> 'When I began to hear remarks that my painting was 'conflictive', I began to believe them. 'The Tribune', for example, was criticised very harshly. It was about to be awarded a prize and then there was no prize due to the criticism. One day I saw all my pictures together for the first time in many years. I said to myself: this is painting which expresses the moment in which I am living. And if a painter can do that, then he or she is a real painter. Thus, I absolved myself' (Eiriz in Blanc, 1994, p.3).

Anreus (2004) offers a detailed description of this work which has been on permanent exhibition at the National Museum of Cuba since July 2001.

> 'Initially conceived as a painting with an installation component, the work was meant to be shown with a wooden platform below it, on which would rest two rows of folding chairs facing the painting. The elements within the panting are simple enough; in the centre foreground is a podium, the inside facing us, five microphones on the top, several wires below. Painted in blacks, browns and greys, the podium is a massive and sinister object. The middle ground is the collage element: a red rope on either side of the podium, holding seven small paper leaflets that each contains the following printed message: P.C.V. *por la paz democratica* …for democratic peace. The background is a crowd consisting of heads, heads and shoulders and partial torsos, painted in white, grey and black. They are related to the crowd in Christ Leaving Juanelo; sinister smiles, looks of idiocy, and horror abound. Throughout this work, Eiriz stains the paint, drags it, and rubs it on the surface, producing an overall look of roughness. Had the printed message read P.C.C. instead of P.C.V., it would have meant Cuban Communist Party. As it is, the initials are ambiguous enough to be troublesome. The platform and the folding chairs would have transformed

the viewers into the revolutionary leaders on the platform, about to speak for 'a democratic peace'. Eiriz's second husband Manuel Gómez, recalled this painting and its title, 'Many times I have thought how officialdom was as annoyed by her paintings as by her titles. Antonia never tried to change anything, because reality could not be changed. She would simply put in the painting what she would see. She was essentially honest in this. I remember bringing to her attention the title she had thought about for a painting just completed. I thought it would bring her problems. She thought about it for days and decided to call it A Tribune for Democratic Peace. The painting was really an installation that included a wooden platform with folding chairs' (Anreus, 2004, p.6).

Apparently the work was exhibited at the 1968 National Salon where it was considered for but did not receive the finalist painting prize. Shortly afterwards the work was publicly criticised at a meeting at the Writers and Artists Union by the literary critic, José Antonio Portuondo, also the union's vice-president. He considered the painting to be grotesque, defeatist and in essence counterrevolutionary.

By the end of 1968 Eiriz stopped painting and by 1969 she resigned from her teaching post at the Cubanacán art school. In 1968 her mother had died and Eiriz, whose brief marriage to Manuel Vidal had dissolved many years before, was alone with a fourteen year old son. As Anreus (2004) points out her painting was not only seen as conflictive and defeatist by the revolution's cultural establishment but also by fellow members of staff at the art school. She is reported to have stated 'If my painting is so problematic, I will stop painting, and it will be their loss' (Gómez in Anreus, 2004, p.7).

In 1969 she participated in several collective exhibitions; in Cuba, the US and Spain. There is then a sharp break and it is not until 1985 that she exhibited again and then, in Paris.

Eiriz was not alone in this purge of Cuban intellectual and artistic life and given what was to come, her 'self-imposed' retirement was timely. Álvarez (2002) suggests that 'the neo figuration of Eiriz and Peña …was criticised for not being in line with politically correct norms of their time' (Álvarez, 2002, p.3). He names Eiriz as being one of the artists who stopped painting under institutional pressure and suggests that her dedication to promoting the technique of papier mâche was 'a form of social expiation for her previous work' (Álvarez, 2002, p.4).

It is impossible to evaluate Álvarez's (2002) essay written from exile in Brazil. However, what is clear is that her retirement, self imposed or otherwise, took place at an extremely difficult time in Cuban cultural politics.

A central figure in this drama was the previously mentioned José A. Portuondo, an old member of the PSP *Partido Socialista Popular;* the pre 1959 Communist Party. (Serrano, 2002, p.4) As Álvarez (2002) points out Portuondo was one of the biggest representatives of aesthetics of social realism in Cuba. Amongst his published works are: Aesthetics and Revolution (1963); Lenin and the Problems of Culture (1970; and The Teacher, Former and Informer of the New Man (1970). According to Serrano (2002) Portuondo also published regularly in the magazine of the armed forces, *Verde Olivo*, under the pseudonym of Leopoldo Avila. He was also a key player in the infamous Padilla case in 1971.

On March 20, 1971, Herberto Padilla was detained (Serrano, 2002). Thirty eight days later, on April 27, 1971, the cultural and political turmoil that began in 1968 with the publication of Padilla's *Fuera del juego* culminated in his public confession at the Writers and Artists Union. Padillo called himself, as well as his wife and fellow writers, defeatists and integrates, concluding his confession by exhorting his audience to be optimistic soldiers for the revolution (Anreus, 2004, p.7).

The first institutional response to the Padilla case was made at the First Congress of Education and Culture celebrated between 23 and 30 April, 1971. In his closing speech Castro established the new cultural politics which would substitute his last message to the intellectuals, 'Art is an arm of the Revolution'. From this sentence followed the affirmation of culture as an activity of the masses; the acknowledgement of Marxist-Leninism as the only instrument for interpreting reality and the call for the creation of a highly ideologised art. What was to become known as 'The grey five year period', as named by the critic Ambrosio Fornet, was to last for a decade (Serrano, 2002, p. 4).

The worldwide reaction to Padilla's public confession was negative for the regime: intellectuals such as Pier Paolo Pasolini, Jean-Paul Sartre, Susan Sontag, Octavio Paz, Italo Calvino, Marguerite Duras, Heinrich Boll and others signed letters of protest

which appeared in leading newspapers in Europe and the Americas. As Anreus (2004) puts it 'the honeymoon between progressive intellectuals and the Cuban Revolution ended, even if an embrace of US opposition to the revolution did not follow' (Anreus, 2004, p. 7).

In the midst of all this turmoil Eiriz retreated to her native Juanelo, which in fact she had never left, and it was here that she began to teach papier mâche to children and neighbourhood groups. In the late 1980's and the early 1990's with the fall of the Soviet Union, Cuba went through a rehabilitation period or period of openness. In 1986, 1987 and 1991 Eiriz would be 'rehabilitated' with three exhibitions in and near Havana. In 1986 she exhibited a collection of ink drawings in at the Galería de la Fundación del Patrimonio Cultural in Havana. In June 1987 she exhibited 25 prints in the museum of her own municipality of San Miguel del Padron. The work exhibited in 1991, her last exhibition in Cuba, would range from the late 1950's to 1968, when she stopped painting.

Revision and Rehabilitation

In 1987, the same year as her exhibition of prints in San Miguel del Padron, a full colour photograph of Eiriz in her home, which was also her studio, graced the cover of the March edition of the magazine, *Revolución y Cultura* (Revolution and Culture). The leading article is by the art critic of the national press office, Antonio Eligio, otherwise known as Tonel. The four centre pages are dedicated to seven colour reproductions of Eiriz's early work. Amongst them is a reproduction of *Los de Arriba y Los de Abajo* (1963) (Those from above and those from below), one of the works mentioned by Martínez (1995) as representing the tribunes of the early 1960's crossing the line into the realm of political criticism (Martínez, 1995, p.1). Another is entitled, *Víctimas de la tiranía* (1962) (Victims of the tyranny).

The article begins with a résumé of Eiriz's career, stating unequivocally in the first paragraph, that Eiriz is one of the few, absolute and indisputable figures of 20th century Cuban visual arts (Eligio, 1987, p.40).

Eligio (1987) suggests that, within a greater or lesser range of coincidence, Eiriz shared discoveries and preferences with contemporary figures such as Raúl Milián and Manuel

Vidal. It is interesting that Eligio (1987) locates these discoveries within a range of coincidences given that Eiriz was married briefly to Manuel Vidal and he was the father of her only child, Pablo Vidal Eiriz.

In the catalogue of what was to be Eiriz's final exhibition in Cuba, *Reencuentro* (Re-encounter) in 1991, a title which retrospectively seems ironic, Roberto Fernández Retamar refers to Raúl Milián.

> 'In Lam we have a painter of myth, in Portocarrero one of rhythm and in Milián one of anguish, in Antonia we begin to have a painter of the tragic. That which Orozco was for Mexico and further back, Goya for Spain, and…everyone knows the family' (Retamar, 1991, p.2).

As Piñera (1995) points out it was Roberto Fernández Retamar who christened Eiriz a painter of tragedy (Piñera, 1995).

Eiriz and the Tragic

Carmen Paula Bermudez Graz (2003) writes of the recurrent theme of death in Cuban painting. Referring to the epoch of avant-garde painting in the republican period (1902-1958) she cites, Fidelio Ponce and Rafael Blanc as examples of artists who address this theme. She goes on to suggest that in the years immediately following the triumph of the revolution there began numerous allusions to death in the visual arts - a type of art which digressed with respect to the discourse that suited those in power.

> 'In the painting of Antonia Eiriz and Angel Acosta León flowered a tragic consciousness of existence that is found in bodily monstrosity and the oxidation of objects – respectively – their best correlations' (Bermudez Graz, 2003, p.1).

Eligio (1987) notes that at the beginning of the 1960's Eiriz's use of colour changed and that 'blacks and greys interlaced with light reds, oranges, sepias and yellows' discreetly began to appear in her work. He also refers to sketching competitions organised with regularity after the triumph of January 1959.

> 'Epic themes appear in her work: the militias, the gigantic popular concentrations, the peasants incorporated in the revolution. The continuity of her sketching work bore fruit; in 1962 a sketch of the procession of the 1 May seemed to organically conjugate, at last, the will to document the epic with the desire to do it as close as possible to her own personality' (Eligio, 1987, p.45).

According to Eligio (1987) this defining moment essentially characterises Eiriz's work in the particular way that she expresses the exceptional burden of violence and drama of that historic period. Eligio (1987) points out that other painters, immersed in the same reality, captured the external aspects of it. They documented it 'somewhat from the outside looking in…and this is not to say, of course, that the experience was lived more or less intensely in some or in others' (Eligio, 1987, p.45).

Eligio (1987) continues in what can be read as an extraordinary apologia for what has referred to as one of the 'dark periods' in Cuban history (Craven, 2002).

> 'Some, without noticing perhaps, softened in the extreme the image of this reality: they saw only doves there where there were also filthy things, hawks, barn owls; they put in the foreground, as a norm, love, and they forgot the hate that certainly had daily expressions and cost a price in blood and lives, in deficits and mutilations' (Eligio, 1987, p.45).

This natural disposition, notes Eligio (1987) of Antonia's to 'assume the daily as tragic, at times touched with black humour, and express it artistically, is not new in Cuban art and literature… it is what Fernández Retamar has defined as a particular sensitivity (by the artist) to be able to perceive the terrible' (Eligio, 1987, p.45).

This reference to Retamar is loaded. It is a reference to an another time and specifically to an earlier review written in 1964 in the catalogue of the collection of work of Eiriz and Martínez which travelled to Mexico under the auspices of the General Office of Cultural Diffusion at the height of the Revolution.

> 'Antonia has a particular sensitivity for the terrible: I did not only see it: I detected it, I denunciated it, I deplored it, I howled it, I roared with laughter, I suffered it, I flung it, full almost always with a peculiar black humour and of an art of 'thick brush' that finishes taking refuge in the assemblages of junk. And the terrible is the same thing, it is there every day, the everyday, the vulgar, the furniture, the face; the terrible is not to die in a grand accident but that death comes inexorably, in the form of diarrhoea or of vomit, to the seamstress' (Retamar, 1964, p.1).

Retamar concludes his piece by reminding us that agonising is not the same as dying, it is the contrary. It is to fight; to live fighting.

In January, 1991, on the occasion of the exhibition *Reencuentro* (Reencounter) held at the Galería de Galiano in Havana, Retamar reiterated these words in a longer eulogy. The exhibition was accompanied by a catalogue that reprinted the 1964 article by

Retamar (Anreus, 2004, p.12). However, the article is dated January 1991 and while the first part would appear to be a reprint of the earlier version, in part two Retamar states the following:

> 'It is more than a quarter of a century, for the purpose of an exhibition of *Oleos y Ensamblajes* by Antonia Eiriz that I wrote these last words, which appeared in number 33 of the *Gaceta de Cuba*, 20 March 1964. Even I wouldn't have conserved this number; but I think that the note could be republished now with the motive of a new exhibition of Antonia's; which at this point is something different. I only want to add that, in general, despite that many years have passed, I don't regret what I said then… if I am to ratify my invariable admiration for Antonia Eiriz, that she has left indelible traces in our art, in our life; including our daily life, with the fantastic, fabulous fauna that she taught many *cederistas (members of the CDR)* to make' (Retamar, 1991, p.4-5).

Martínez (1995) suggests that this exhibition was initiated by Silvia Margarita del Valle, Nelson Villalobos and other art students who convinced her to be part of a thesis project, which included a one-person show (Martínez, 1995, p.2). However Anreus (2004) notes that the exhibition was organised by Ana Margarita García who wrote her graduate thesis on Eiriz's work (Anreus, 2004, p. 12).

Martínez (1995), a professor of art history at Florida International University, makes no mention of Retamar's introduction to *Reencuentro.* His view of the encounter expressed in his essay 'Antonia Eiriz: Tribute to a Legend', makes a rather different emphasis. Martínez (1995) asserts that the exhibition 'represented the discovery of Eiriz by a new generation of artists, who themselves were taking a more independent and critical stance vis-a vis their social environment' (Martínez, 1995, p.2). He goes on to state that from the *Reencuentro* exhibition onwards, the last years of her life were quite eventful. Amongst other things, she moved to Miami in 1993 and returned with renewed energy to art-making and exhibiting. Of the tragic, Martínez (1995) reiterates what Retamar identified in 1964.

Eiriz in Miami

Anreus's (2004) version of events is rather different from that of Martínez (1995) at least in emphasis. His article also constitutes the only comprehensive account of Eiriz's life and work after her arrival in Miami. According to Anreus (2004) Eiriz suffered from acute depression in 1993 and was hospitalised for almost two months. Apparently,

her doctor suggested a change of scene and Eiriz and her husband Manuel Gómez applied for visas to visit the artist's family in Miami. In his article, Anreus (2004) quotes Gómez's response to a questionnaire.

> 'Within three months of being in Miami, Antonia returned to being the same optimistic and humorous person she always was. And she began to paint. With the help of Tomas Sánchez (Eiriz's former student) we found a gallery in Miami that mounted an exhibition: *Antonia Eiriz se expone* (Antonia Eiriz exhibits), which was successful. Later she received a Guggenheim Fellowship' (Gómez, 2003 in Anreus, 2004).

Anreus (2004) concludes his article by pointing out that the Miami exile that Eiriz arrived at in 1993, could be a difficult and intolerant place, where anti-Castro hardliners attacked moderates for being soft on communism; where the US embargo against Cuba was never questioned; and where the right-wing Cuban American National Foundation reigned supreme in its power and influence.

> 'In this environment, the goodwill and patriotism of Cuban-Americans who were not conservative or registered Republicans was always suspect. Beyond this closed political environment, the Miami Cuban American community culturally maintains a nostalgic connection with Cuba's past, with pre-1959 Cuba. Within this construct, the island is recalled as a tropical paradise where, before Castro, inequality and exploitation existed minimally. Music, cuisine, and even fashion help sustain the myth of Cuba before 1959 as a tropical paradise' (Anreus, 2004, p.7).

Anreus (2004) drawing upon information obtained from Gómez in 1993, notes that once in Miami, Eiriz kept her political opinions to herself; she stayed away from polemics and made clear to journalists who came to interview her that she would not discuss politics of the past or present, of Cuba or Miami. However, he suggests that her new paintings between 1993 and 1995 reflected and critiqued what she was not prepared to openly discuss.

> 'After twenty-five years of not painting (partly as a deliberate withholding for survival), Eiriz took up the brush with great intensity; between 1993 and her death in 1995 she painted over twenty-five large-format oils on canvas (the smallest being 50 x 40 inches, the largest 80 x 66 inches), and some fifty works on paper. Eiriz did not rehash past ideas or pictorial images; stylistically, these works display a great boldness of forms and a deeper, more dramatic understanding of colour, bringing to mind the colouristic range of late Velazquez and late Goya. Crucifixions, maternities, and descents are among her subjects, and in many the figures have severed limbs…for Eiriz these 'bonsai' (a title she used) represented the individual trimmed, pruned, repressed by society. Among this last batch of paintings

two stand out that can easily be interpreted as reflecting and criticising Cuban –American Miami, and even a particularly ahistorical reading of Cuban history; they are the 1993 *Esta gente* (These People) and *Vereda tropical* (Tropical Path)' (Anreus, 2004, p.8).

Apparently, *Vereda tropical* (Tropical Path) was among the last that Eiriz worked on. The title according to Anreus (2004) is derived from a popular song of the 1950's, in which a man remembers kissing a woman in the evening while walking on a tropical path toward the sea. While it is a romantic song intended to evoke a happy carefree life, it is in the context of Cuban-American exile, part of the narrative of nostalgia in which Anreus (2004) suggests the past is recreated as a lost utopia.

> 'Eiriz shows a grey and worn path moving toward the horizon line; on the left is some dark green shrubbery, but what fills most of the composition is a mound of shapes on the right of the path. On a closer look, the mound of shapes is a series of severed heads painted in ochres, purples, greys, and yellows. The sky is a cold Prussian blue with a light touch of orange at the horizon line…meant perhaps to evoke the glimmer of the sea or a disappearing sunset. The entire work is painted thickly, creating a rough, skin like surface at once beautiful and repulsive. Eiriz transforms the idyllic tropical path of the song into a bleak road on a desolate night, loaded with human remains. A work like this shatters the nostalgic baggage of the Cuban exile. Beyond this, it evokes contemporary Cuban history as a series of horrors and betrayals in which the human toll, both physical and spiritual, has been terrible…on both sides of the Gulf Stream' (Anreus, 2004, p. 8).

Anreus's (2004) rather brilliant essay replete with layered iconographic readings of Eiriz's paintings is by far the most comprehensive and least partisan account of Eiriz's life and work. There is no attempt to appropriate her as a martyr of the Cuban Revolution but rather to understand, what he refers to as the 'critical essence' of Eiriz's oeuvre, which he firmly places in the context of her times. 'Eiriz's work was not a tool of either Castro's or reactionary Miami; instead her pictures interrogate the ideological obfuscation on both sides' Anreus, 2004, p.1).

He argues the importance of restating the context of Eiriz and her work within the neofigurative trends prevalent throughout Latin America in the late 1950's and 1960's. In his view she belongs to what the critic Marta Traba (1973) described as 'a culture of resistance' against the aesthetics of internationalism and the Americanisation of Latin American cultures. Anreus (2004) makes this link on the basis of Eiriz's visual

vocabulary of distorting the human figure, of her 'action painting' brushwork and her bleak and biting observations on society which he argues connect her to the works by the Argentineans of *Otra* figuration and Antonio Berni, to the Venezuelan Jacobo Borges's oils of 1960-65, and the drawings of Carlos Alonso, Marcelo Grassman and Pedro Alcantara. All of these artists resisted the status quo, and their works can be read as 'question marks critical of official power' (Anreus, 2004, p.8).

Anreus (2004) argues that Eiriz's work must be seen in this light but acknowledges that unlike the aforementioned artists, Eiriz was not living in a right-wing military dictatorship or a corrupt democracy, but under a revolutionary and socialist regime in Cuba which was meant to change life for the better. Reflecting on this irony, he suggests that once in exile, Eiriz ostensibly found herself in a more open society where she could paint again, but one where other, more subtle forms of repression and group-think existed.

This final irony cannot have been lost on Eiriz and is perhaps most eloquently referred to in *Este gente* (1993) (These People) which Anreus (2004) describes as a horizontal composition consisting of areas of a curtain covered platform, the colours of which are red, blue and white; colours of the Cuban and the US flags and therefore symbolic of patriotism. In the foreground six black and grey figures seem to be laughing or screaming. In the upper right-hand corner of the picture is a large head with an expression of displeasure, painted in browns and black looking down on the six figures. Anreus (2004) reads 'these grotesqueries' as the patriarchs, the 'professional' politicians, and the masses of the Cuban exile all rolled into one. 'Paranoia and horror converge, subverting a possible image of civic affirmation into a hideous face of unalloyed negation' (Anreus, 2004, p. 8).

In its title and in its juxtaposition of elements *Este gente* (These People) also seems to refer to other times, crowds and paintings and in particular to that painting of another civic gathering in 1968 at the National Salon where *Una tribuna para la paz democratica* (A Tribune for Democratic Peace) was first exhibited. Perhaps the implication is that 'these people' or these crowds or masses are the same wherever they might find themselves.

Anreus (2004) points out that in exile her work is generally perceived as a reflection of the political situation in Cuba. The fact that her last body of work was created in exile and is therefore also a reflection of imperfect conditions in 'el Norte' (colloquial Cuban reference to the US) is, in his view, generally ignored. Similarly, in Cuba where since 2001 even her most controversial work *Una tribuna para la paz democratica* (1968) is exhibited in the refurbished National Museum, there is no mention made in the wall texts of the political contexts and controversies surrounding her work in the 1960's. The minimal texts make reference to her expressionistic style and emphasise her importance as an art teacher.

The notion that Eiriz's paintings will be read according to the perspective of the viewer is reiterated by Cantor (1995) who also suggests that they lead the viewer to discover multiple layers of meaning. Referring to an interview with Eiriz's niece, Susana Barciela, it seems this was just what Eiriz intended. 'She never would describe her paintings or interpret the paintings. She said that everyone saw different things in them, and what everybody saw was right' (Barciela in Cantor, 1995, p. 3).

Ulises Cruz and the Study Centre Casa de José de la Luz y Caballero
In the following section I briefly describe the work of Ulises Cruz Grau whose work appears to represent a bridge between community based social therapy and clinical work. As the published material is negligible I have drawn upon broader literature.

The published information on the work undertaken at the Study Centre Casa José de la Luz y Caballero in Havana Vieja is minimal. Of the work conducted at the National Library and the outreach work in which Cruz was involved there appears to be no specific written record other than a brief reference. However, what does exist in print is the work of Valdés Marín who worked alongside Cruz and who influenced and guided his work with children.

Valdés Marín (1979) in his book on the development of children's drawings dedicates the last two chapters to a brief discussion of child psychotherapy and to the role of art in extra curricular activities respectively. His writing is important because he refers not only to Cruz's work but to the wider context of Cruz's work which in some respects would seem to resemble what was known in Britain as the Child Art Movement which

first flourished in the 1930's and perhaps can be said to have endured until the late 1970's. This strand of influence or parallel has been previously noted with respect to the work of Sorín Sokolsky and Antonia Eiriz.

Valdés Marín (1979) who worked alongside Cruz employs the term *'pictoterapia'* or less correctly *'pictografía'* and suggests that in many developed countries this technique has appeared amongst the most modern treatments for the diverse anomalous manifestations of child behaviour. He mentions that *pictoterapia, as* part of a curative pedagogy, corresponds in all its elements to the principals enunciated by the eminent Soviet scientist D.N. Isaiev who drew a distinction between the principals of curative education and those of a psychology dedicated to mainstream education. In the latter case this consists of the need to 'establish correct relationships with society and work; to teach them and to help them form correct habits; to correct their self references and their inadequate references towards the environment, just like as in some behavioural disorders' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.147). In the context of this discussion, when referring to the use of colour in *pictoterapia* he refers to 'sessions of pictoterapia at the juvenile department of the National Library 'José Martí'. He discusses a particular case of a little girl who did not 'relate correctly to her environment' and who 'drew everything in black and dark purple or in sombre tones, to the point that she painted the sky black' which he observes is very far from the normal in children's graphic reproduction (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.151).

Valdés Marín (1979) contends that as this child recovered from her psychic disorder, she began to paint in less sombre colours and at the end of a few months used oranges, reds, greens and yellows. Her painting 'reflected her pathological state and on recovering relationships with the surrounding reality, she could reflect with greater exactitude the world, transmitting a tone of optimism in her drawings as one would hope for in a normal child…she was cured' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.151).

Child Art
In the following chapter he addresses what is termed as 'art in extra curricular activities'. Here he describes what he terms as the 'psychographic education of the child'. The objectives of these activities are principally directed at the expansion of the child's cultural horizon and are more specifically defined as 'awakening and

maintaining his interest in the visual arts'; to introduce the child to necessary knowledge so that he can manage elementary pictorial expression; and to initiate him in the appreciation of the work of the most distinguished painters (Valdés Marín, 1979, p. 154). He makes it clear that these activities do not claim to make each child an artist. Rather they are directed towards increasing and stimulating the child's sensitivity towards different art modalities. 'However, on occasions – and quite frequently – they emphasise evident capacities and inclinations towards art in the form and colour, so that they find (the children) in these extra curricular activities their proper orientation and channel' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.154).

Amongst the different groups working with children and art Valdés Marín (1979) singles out Rafaela Chacón Nardi and her work with the *Grupo de Expresión Creadora* or Creative Expression Group. According to Valdés Marín (1979) this group was founded in 1971 by the *Comisión Nacional Cubana* or National Cuban Commission of UNESCO and has participated in numerous exhibitions of child art in different continents, obtaining valued prizes and distinctions. He also mentions travelling exhibitions both nationally and internationally and emphasises the role of the *Casas de Cultura* (Houses of Culture) and public libraries in the countryside who through their juvenile departments developed ever increasing activities to encourage the artistic development of children (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.155).

He also refers to 'cultural groups' that are dedicated to developing activities in the countryside out with school hours. Artistic education is initiated and developed as 'a complement to the children's general formation' as a stimulus for 'the inclinations and capacities which the children manifest towards art activity'. In all of these different groups the emphasis is on the stimulation of children's creativity; in maintaining and increasing the spontaneity of the children's artistic expression; and in the elevation of their cultural level - artistic and ideological (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.155-56).

Activities and Techniques
Apparently, the activities practiced were very varied. Studio facilities or workshop facilities were available but children also worked outside.

'The children draw outside in contact with nature and with the direct stimulation of the social environment. An example we have of this is of an experience realised on the public footpath, where the children drew, individually or collectively, with chalk and charcoal on the pavement' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p. 156).

This 'technique' according to Valdés Marín (1979) permitted work to be undertaken in large spaces and allowed the participation of many children at the same time, opening up the possibility of dominating large surfaces, the massive participation of child painters, as well as child and adult spectators. It is a technique I witnessed on several occasions in various parts of the city.

Another technique which was used was that of *esgrafiado*, especially in the Juvenile Department of the National Library José Martí' led by the art instructor Ulises Cruz. There is no direct translation for *esgrafiado* but it refers to a well used technique involving covering the paper in a layer of wax colour of different tonalities and then covering this with black wax crayon. The surface is then drawn upon with a tool which lifts the wax to reveal the colours underneath.

Valdés Marín (1979) suggests that in this technique we are reminded of the first steps of engraving. While he is clear that this technique does not create engravers he argues that undeniably this practice prepares the child for its subsequent stage and the delight of this important and difficult artistic expression.

Another of the educational possibilities of these creative and expressive activities is their connection with literary materials and the illustration of experiences, united with the practice of typewriting - offering the child a wide frame for the development and exteriorisation of his ideas, attitudes emotions and feelings.

'The graphic expression inspired by a verse, a poem a story and other literary genres – as we have seen- develops the child's imagination and contributes greatly, that the children assimilate the essence of the work, through their own particular and childlike way' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.157).

He goes on to suggest that these illustrations of experiences, in which 'facts from daily life and social and political happenings are inserted, permit knowledge of what the child

knows of the natural and social world which surrounds him and makes a valuable contribution of knowledge to his education'. At the same time it gives the children 'an opportunity to express different conflicts through the graphic externalisation of them, as it has been evidenced with reference to the practice of child psychotherapy' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p. 157).

In his conclusions, Valdés Marín (1979) asserts that *psicografismo*, an inclusive term by which he is referring to the development of children's drawings and the externalisation of the child's world through their drawings, represents one of the most important aspects of child development and can be studied from early on in the child's life.

He asserts that from the study of different components of children's drawings - the line structure and content - we can observe an evolution corresponding to the age of the child, in which the different stages of development are manifested in a constant successive order, by their integrative character and related structure.

> 'As a product of child psychic development, these first graphic productions express the reality that children know and **not** apparent modifications of that reality for different causes beyond the essence of these objects' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.159).

According to Valdés Marín (1979) this particularity causes determined characteristics in children's drawings which it is necessary to know, and from this develop a psycho-pedagogic intervention capable of clearly achieving the transition from Intellectual Realism to Visual Realism; that which invariably affects the intellectual development of the child. Here he is referring to the stages in the development of children's drawing as postulated by Piaget.

Valdés Marín (1979) qualifies this statement by pointing out that 'in the same way and coinciding with what has been previously stated, we must deepen our understanding of the content of the child's drawing'. He proposes that how children draw and what children draw constitutes an 'indissoluble unity' which is evidenced in their close relationship throughout the child's development.

He emphasises that the child tends to reproduce in his drawings the objects which are closest to him and those which have affective meaning for him. From isolated personal objects he moves to the representation of the natural and social world surrounding him and projects the ideas, attitudes and feelings he has towards the objects and situations of this objective reality through graphic expression (Valdés Marín, 1979, p.160).

His final comments are particularly interesting as here he emphasises the importance of children's drawing within the broader context of education in Revolutionary Cuba.

> 'The drawing is not considered an adornment, as postulated by bourgeois educators in other epochs, but an essential aspect of the intellectual and affective development of the child and as a decisive element in his integral education' (Valdés Marín, 1979, p. 160).

The short bibliography in Valdés Marín's book reveal a considerable number of French texts as his sources - *La dessin d'un enfant* by Luquet (1913); *La reproduction de graphique des modéles cinétiques* by Lurgart (1971), *Le Dessin de l'Enfant* by Prudhommeau (1951), *El lenguaje grafico del niño* (translated from the French) by Rouma (1911). Of seminal texts it is surprising that only an article by Piaget, *La Formation des Connaissances* (1956) (The Formation of Consciousness), is cited and Goodenough's (1926) The Measurement of Intelligence by Drawings. There are only two references to Soviet texts and these are on child psychiatry.

Valdés Marín died on June 16, 2002. His obituary, which appeared in the Cuban Journal of Psychology in 2003, written by one of his close colleagues, Dr Jesús Dueñas Becerra is revealing. Apparently Valdés Marín studied in Paris in the 1950's where he was the pupil of Jean Piaget and Henry Wallon. He was a member of the Asociación Cubano-Francesa de Psicología y Psiquiatría (Cuban/French Association of Psychology and Psychiatry) which perhaps accounts for his reliance on French rather than anglophile texts. Valdés Marín worked at the Havana Psychiatric Hospital for three decades right up until his death at the age of 76. He also taught educational psychology at the faculty of psychology at the University of Havana and was closely involved in the publication of *Hoy*, the official organ of the Popular Socialist Party. He is described by Dueñas Becerra as a 'revolutionary and humanist' (Dueñas Becerra, 2003, p.253). Of his book and of his interest in art there is little mention apart from the fact that all editions were

sold out. There is no indication in Dueñas Becerra's account that Valdés Marín was involved in the arts in any other way.

Although there is no reference to Herbert Read in his bibliography his basic thesis, like Sorín and like Eiriz, is not dissimilar to Read's (1943). Similarly, while there is no mention of the child art movement, the ideas propounded by Valdés Marín are essentially the same in their emphasis on free expression and the notion that art should be an important element in an integral education. This suggests that these ideas were in circulation at the time and permeated educational thinking in post Revolutionary Cuba.

Valdés Marín's text reappears in relation to the systematised analysis of children's drawings developed by Dr Aurora García, which is partly based on his work. In the context of a review of bibliographic material pertaining to the work undertaken by Ulises Cruz at the National Library and his associated outreach work at various hospitals, Valdés Marín's text appears to be the only one which refers to these activities and to the thinking that underpinned them. Its value in the context of my research is in the provision of a background against which the data is made clearer.

José de la Luz y Caballero

The work undertaken by Ulises Cruz at the Study Centre José de la Luz y Caballero is similarly barely recorded. However, there are some relevant references in *Desafió de una utopía: una estrategia integral para la gestión de salvaguardia de la Havana vieja* (Challenge of an Utopia: a comprehensive strategy to manage the safe guarding of old Havana) published in 2000, by the city of Havana's historian office in which the plan to restore the old city to its former glory is laid out. From its inception Ulises Cruz Grau has been involved in this project at the City Historian, Dr Eusabio Leal Spengler's invitation. Like Eiriz's 1970s work in *los pueblos nuevos* (new towns), the object of intervention was the community itself at a time of transition and change.

Havana Vieja

What is referred to as Havana Vieja or Old Havana is the old, historic city centre around the area of *la bahía* or bay which provided a natural port. Unlike other Latin American cities Havana was distinguished by two fundamental features: its system of squares and

small squares, which together with an irregular urban fabric made up a singular urban layout; and its system of fortifications.

The decline of the historic centre began in the middle of the 19th century. The residential function of the old town was transformed with city growth to the west and the appearance of numerous select areas, such as 'El Cerro' or 'El Vedado', many ancient colonial palaces were sold becoming houses for rent or conversions into residential complexes.

Geographically, Old Havana remained at one end of the city. The ground floors of domestic buildings underwent transformations, adapted to serve as warehouses and workshops in relation to the port. New buildings were also constructed for this purpose as the new industrial function of the area began to make a felt presence.

Banking and finance flourished particularly within the inner-walled area of the city at the beginning of the 20th century with the establishment of the Republic and increasing North American influence. This in turn led to a new centrality, expressed in the so-called 'small Wall Street', with its tiny skyscrapers whose verticality accentuated the streets' narrowness. Meanwhile the city expanded. The system of party walls disappeared and trees were planted. Successive periods of economic bonanza and crisis influenced the appearance of new neighbourhoods - some more exclusive than others - but always low construction housing in keeping with the norms of the 'garden city'. In the 1950's the possibility of growth to the east opened up with a tunnel's construction under the bay, and Old Havana was to recover a central and therefore dangerous position in the advance of property speculation.

Profound social changes in 1959 Cuba put an end to this process not only in Old Havana but across all Latin American capital cities. Gradually the loss of extensive traditional zones and, in many cases, their historic centres took place. This 'scandalous speculative process' that devastated irreplaceable assets in Latin America did not happen in Cuba. Post Revolution, few interventions occurred in Havana and there were insufficient resources to guarantee systematic maintenance.

In 1980, the City Historian's office commenced intensifying public awareness in regard to the cultural value of the city and its historic centre. Periodically, articles appeared in the newspapers and magazines with the widest circulation. This in turn led to the creation of a hugely popular weekly television programme *'Andar La Havana'* or Walk around Havana.

In 1981, the State provided the City Historian's Office with funds to invest in the historic centre's restoration process. The Department of Architecture also came into being at this time. Rehabilitation activities based on Five Year Restoration Plans evolved receiving important funding from the state.

In 1982, Old Havana was declared a Cultural Heritage of Humanity by UNESCO, and placed 27th in World Heritage list. However, in 1990, having barely commenced the third of the five yearly plans, the impact of the socialist block fall began to be felt throughout the country with consequent worsening of the internal economic situation. This situation brought about a crisis. The Cuban state, which until that moment had subsidised centrally the recovery of the historic centre, found itself unable to continue financing this activity at the expense of other more sensitive sectors; and yet was aware of the responsibility to save a heritage that belonged not only to the Cubans but also to humanity.

Extreme measures were put into action.

> 'The grave economic situation, the commitments acquired and the will to continue with the rehabilitation work, meant that a decision of vital importance had to be taken, namely, to provide the Historian's Office with legal backing to allow it to continue with sustainable development; Decree Law 143 in October 1993, passed by the Council Of State of the Republic of Cuba, which considers the territory 'a priority zone for preservation'. From this moment the office was no longer an institution bound by the Provincial Government of the City but directly subordinate to the Council of State, which meant alacrity in decision making. The office was also given legal status allowing it to enter into partnership and to establish diverse types of relations with national and foreign entities, as well as to charge taxes on productive companies settled in the territory in order to pay for rehabilitation. A tourist company was also set up, Habaguanex, answerable to the Historian's Office, to develop and exploit the hotel, extra hotel and commercial potential of the Historic Centre' (Leal, 2000, p.32).

Some time later, in November 1995, the Agreement 2951 was accepted in the Council of Ministers declaring the Historic Centre 'a highly important zone for tourism' and the powers of the office were extended. Among other aspects it is now able to administrate everything concerning housing and even created its own estate agency, *Fénix*, for letting offices and providing various services. This economic autonomy granted continuity to the rehabilitation work still in the midst of economic crisis.

The changes previously described represent a move from a centralised economy and there is, as far as I am aware, no other example of economic autonomy at an institutional level in Cuba. The partnerships established with foreign entities is a complete departure from Cuban economic policy where after 1959, no foreign country could own property in Cuba.

Leal goes on to describe the social aspect of the rehabilitation project.

The rehabilitation work includes not only the recovery of buildings but also involves, and is aimed primarily at, the inhabitants of Old Havana. Leal explains that 'to the socio-cultural projection…was added an economic vision that made possible the acceleration of a process that acquired agility due to the nature and seriousness of the accumulated problems' (Leal, 2000, p.33).

Leal goes on to refer to the need to create a master plan as

> 'A dynamic, flexible and interdisciplinary entity that would not limit itself to a stage of study but would also be capable of guaranteeing the continuity of a process that based its development on two aspects: on the operating capacity of a flourishing investment (the Process Plan); and to generate instruments capable of managing it in the most efficient manner (the Document Plan). Another requisite of the Master Plan was to base its philosophy on the participation of all the citizens and entities with influence in the territory so as to ensure that a space could be guaranteed where all the 'actors' could converge' (Leal, 2000, p.33).

In order to manage these new responsibilities three large groups were established: guarantors of physical rehabilitation, socio-cultural projection and for the securing of financial resources.

The master plan is responsible for planning the comprehensive development of the physical and social sphere. One of its fundamental roles is that of articulating and facilitating interaction between the three guarantor groups. It is also the agent for various special and experimental projects; an example of this being the recovery work of traditions carried out by associations or congregations.

Of particular relevance to this thesis is the work carried out by the guarantor entities for socio-cultural projection.

Socio-Cultural Projection

Leal (2000) points out that for some years the Historian's Office has developed projects aimed at satisfying priority demands of the most vulnerable social groups. Prior to outlining these projects it is important to draw the reader's attention to the conditions in which the inhabitants of Old Havana live.

The Historic Centre of Havana covers an area of 2.1 square kilometres with a total of 3,500 buildings. A seventh of these buildings are highly valuable, holding a degree of protection I or II. The remaining constitute property of environmental value; an architectural setting making possible a homogenous interpretation within a diversity of styles and epochs.

The population is approximately 70,658 living in some 22,516 homes of which a third are apartments. More than half of these are situated in residential complexes and a similar number are what are known colloquially as *barbacoas (*barbecues) or more correctly as mezzanines. Basically a *barbacoa* is a room divided in half horizontally by creating a low ceiling to create another room and more accommodation. The average population density in the Old City is estimated at 600 inhabitants per square hectare. It is intensely overcrowded.

The Historian's Office is quite open about these conditions, quite bluntly stating that

> 'The habitat is characterised by bad housing conditions and the quantitative and qualitative lack of services. The overuse of buildings dedicated to housing with the consequent deterioration causes overcrowding and the development of slums. On the other hand there are a large number of people

in shelter who abandoned their homes for reasons of danger' (Leal, 2000, p.46).

Examples of social interventions appear to be quite diverse. Reference is made to the system of Museum Classrooms to which a new project has been incorporated, 'The Classroom and the Museum'. This new project was created to attend to improve the environmental conditions of the primary schools in the old town and involve children in the revival process. They were situated in different spaces in the museums of the Historian's Office. Like all the other schools in the old city they regularly receive school utensils, afternoon snacks. They also participate in a cultural programme giving instruction in local history and specialist subjects on the museum's collections in an environment favourable to the topic being taught. In the academic year 1998-99 over 1,975 school children benefited from this project.

Work with housewives, retired people and self-employed workers in recovering traditions is also reported upon in this section. Groups mentioned include the Association of Embroiderers and Knitters of Belen, carpenters, shoemakers and the Congregation of Silversmiths 'San Eloy'. The Historian's Office provides them with the working materials and instruments to carry out the work in benefit of the community and the collective.

Attention is given to senior citizens through clubs organised and controlled by general hospitals in the community. The guarantors of social-cultural projection liaise with these institutions and provide senior citizens with a contribution towards their diet, psycho-dance groups, film criticism and other activities.

This department also carries out a system of support to cultural and recreational services. A concert hall has been created in the old church and convent of San Francisco de Assisi which is also due to open as a conservatory for young people and as a library of Hispano-American music. The rehabilitation of the Amphitheatre of Havana offers rich cultural programmes, circus, films, concerts and drama for children and young people. Other projects include a toy library; an office for humanitarian affairs, a workshop school for training young people in restoration, an employment office relating to the work of the Historian's Office This also offers related training, an older person's

residence and hotel, a library and a Mother and Infant centre offering specialist attention to pregnant women at risk and the newly born.

In this context, the Study Centre José de la Luz y Caballero is referred to.

> 'The student house 'José de la Luz y Caballero' carries out a cultural programme for children and young people which includes 20 workshops for developing capacities and channelling worries, where young people are educated and acquire knowledge about plastic and applied arts, patrimony, literature, ecology, and stamp collecting, amongst others. Attending these activities are children from six primary schools and four general secondary schools in the town and other municipalities. Furthermore, five UNESCO Clubs have been developed, two of which work with children with Down's syndrome. During 1998 an average of 800 children a week attended the various workshops' (Leal, 2000, p. 40)

Despite these complex and varied strategies aimed at involving the local people in the rehabilitation of their community there is an acknowledgement of limitations imposed by the situation. 'The Comprehensive Development Plan' presents four fundamental policies that express the objectives to be fulfilled. The objectives of the second policy to preserve the residential nature of the Historic Centre, guaranteeing the perpetuation of the resident population according to the most appropriate parameters of habitability, densities and quality of life.

In this context the resident population is referred to as 'an indubitable protagonist in the process of urban recovery on the go'…and it is stated that 'the great challenge for us is the continuance of the local population under new parameters of habitability and conditions of life, and their interaction with the evolutionary process'. However, immediately following these statements is an interesting paragraph on the phenomena of gentrification.

> 'The expulsion of residents from other historic centres has caused the phenomena known as 'gentrification', that is, the creation of extremely high standard, tertiary-sector orientated centres, where the local population has been displaced and the popular type of home substituted by other luxury housing, occupied sporadically by their owners. As a result the vital central zones become areas of intense daytime activity but absolutely solitary at night-time and at weekends and in this way they are denied the very purpose for which they grew' (Leal, 2000, p.60).

It is then acknowledged that some expulsion of residents will be unavoidable in the process of rehabilitation.

> 'Assuming responsibly the housing problem, considering on the one hand, the overcrowding and growth of slums for which it is characterised, the overpopulation of buildings and the overexploitation of the service networks and on the other hand, the necessary functional recovery in favour of comprehensive and harmonic development of the territory, it will be necessary to relocate a number of residents' (Leal, 2000, p. 60).

While this seems reasonable if not unavoidable given the extremity of current overcrowding there is a sense in which this statement jars with the previous statement that 'the great challenge for us is the continuance of the local population under new parameters of habitability and conditions of life, and their interaction with the evolutionary process' (Leal, 2000, p.59).

Leal (2002) goes on to state that each family will be guaranteed an adequate home, but that solutions will be sought in other town councils within the capital, as it will impossible to satisfy the demand in the Historic Centre alone.

> 'It is our wish for all families to benefit from the access to a dignified home and a more efficient system of services. This will be obtained gradually insofar as the population in the recovery of their homes and in their immediate environment; and new relationship formulas are implemented that allow the state and the population to play more efficient roles' (Leal, 2000, p.60).

Implementation

Earlier on in the text reference is made to the area of San Isidro. Apparently, the rehabilitation of the historic centre is being implemented by recognizing the characteristics that differentiate different zones. 'Productive' and 'residential' sectors were defined so as to intensify, at the outset, actions that allow for a rapid securing of financial resources in the former to guarantee the necessary subsidy for the latter. Presumably these 'productive' zones are those where partnership schemes or tourist facilities are in operation as these would allow the Historian's Office access to necessary funding to subsidise work in the non profit making 'residential' zones.

It stresses that this action has already made possible the commencement of work of indubitable cultural and social value - the comprehensive rehabilitation of the neighbourhood of San Isidro, described as one of the most ambitious projects to date in addressing not only the in-depth recovery of housing and its related services, but also acting dynamically with the population, integrating them in the project that will directly benefit them.

There is no mention of art therapy or of psychotherapy *per se* in this text although the therapeutic activities which take place at the Study Centre José de la Luz y Caballero are obliquely referred to when described as a place where children and young people are involved in 'developing capacities and channelling worries'. This is not surprising given that the text is basically a manifesto outlining all aspects of the rehabilitation project. What it does however provide is information about the context and the underpinning philosophy at work in this quite exceptional situation illuminates the data collected *in situ*.

Part 2: The Use of Art as a Therapy within Mental Health Care.

In the following section I will discuss the limited literature specifically pertaining to art and mental health care in relation to its application in practice.

The Work of Aurora García Morey

Aurora García Morey's doctoral thesis entitled *Indicadores Para El Estudio Del Dibujo Libre Infantil* (Indicators for the study of children's free drawings) was presented for examination at the Faculty of Psychology of the University of Havana in 1995. It is an important work in representing the basis of what is currently taught at the University to undergraduate students and outwith the faculty to psychologists interested in gaining understanding into García Morey's approach to diagnosis and treatment.

Her opening chapter is of considerable interest in terms of art therapy history. Here she outlines her antecedents with respect to the interest demonstrated in children's drawings.

According to García Morey (1995) the French anthropologist Tardieu began in 1872 to study, by means of accumulating a collection, the characteristics of children's drawings realised in a spontaneous manner. From this first reference suggests García Morey (1995) other works appeared based on collections of children's drawings gathered from different primary schools in Europe leading to comparisons being made. Examples of publications based on the study and comparison of different collections cited by García Morey (1995) include Simon (1876) and Ricci (1887) in Bologna, Italy and Sully (1898) in Paris. She notes that in a similar way Barnes (1883) in California and Partridge (1897) in Great Britain developed survey methods using directed themes. Apparently L. Partridge (1897) conducted an investigation entitled 'Children's Art Expression' (the title may have altered in translation) based on a survey of the art work of 2000 English children between three and thirteen years old. It is unknown by what means this text found its way to a library in Cuba but García Morey's bibliography indicates that it was translated into Spanish. The date of translation and publication is omitted although the publisher *Editorial Pueblo y Educación* is Cuban.

García Morey (1995) goes on to assert that the development of investigations into children's graphic expression began with greatest force in France, Great Britain, Germany and the US but notes that some were greatly influenced by anthropology and conducted in the certainty of discovering racial differences. Furthermore these studies were not related to the psychological development of the subject nor does it appear that controls of any type were used in the research process (García Morey, 1995, p.14).

The beginning of the 20th Century saw a continuation of the employment of the methods mentioned above, collections pertaining to the free drawing and to given or set themes appeared, such as the studies of de Roumbier (1901) in Paris and Levinstein (1901) in Saxony. García Morey (1995) cites a study by G. Kerschsteiner published in Munich in 1903 as being the first piece of systematised and controlled research into the subject.

Following this she presents a résumé of the development of children's drawing with reference to various authors, different developmental stages and the psychological processes implicated in this. In chapter 3 she presents her empirical data based in the observation and interpretation of 1130 drawings executed by 260 children deemed 'normal' and by a further 285 who presented with psychological problems, all between

the ages of 7 and 12 years old. Of the group of 285 children with psychological problems, 91 were diagnosed as being developmentally delayed while the remaining 194 were deemed as having a variety of disorders of an emotional nature.

Each child was given paper and on an individual basis, to exclude the possibility of copying, asked to draw two pictures; the first on a freely chosen theme and the second of their family, with the condition that each figure was depicted doing something. This condition enabled the researcher to study the child's execution of the figure in motion and interaction with others. Colours were limited to blue, red, yellow, green, brown, black, violet and orange. Rulers were not allowed. The children were observed and questioned about their work in order to eliminate any erroneous interpretation about what they had desired to represent in their drawings.

García Morey's final work consists in the study, observation and classification of those characteristics repeated on a regular basis by different psychological groups. The definitions of these common characteristics are referred to the indicators. These selected indicators correspond to different aspects of the psychological development of the subject.

The indicators are:
- Formal or structural indicators. These are related to development, physical maturity, hand eye co-ordination, the energy and vitality with which the child takes up and realises the activities, impulsivity, concentration and the child's ability to express their ideas in a coherent and ordered manner. This group is related with the potential of the subject to express him self psycho-graphically. It includes the following indicators:
- Strength of line
- Muscular control
- Size of the figures
- Proportion
- Reinforcement
- Illogical distribution of elements
- Absurd elements

- Elements in the air

- Series of elements: ordered or disordered

- Movement: human or without animation

- Transparency

- Animism

Further categories of indicators are:
- Use of colour: pertaining to the emotional sphere of the subject.

- Thematic content: reflecting the child's experiences, desires, and the historical-social reality which surrounds it

- Development and execution of the human figure: level of conceptual elaboration, reflection of reality, intellectual capacity, emotional response to others.

Having established these indicators García Morey illustrates how they can be used to evaluate the child's intellectual development and its psychological development in general. She emphasises that the observation of their execution and the child's explanation of the drawing form part of this process and stresses that free drawing has an advantage over directed themes in showing us what the child desires to express. In concluding she notes that all child art expresses something - nothing is accidental or fortuitous. It is up to us, she notes, to decipher the message.

The indicators referred to in García Morey's thesis, which through necessity I describe in abbreviated terms, were in 2000 being taught at postgraduate level in the faculty of Psychology at the University of Havana where Dr García Morey is Head of the Department of Child Psychology. As such, this work constitutes an important diagnostic technique whose implications for further development and application are currently being developed by her supervised postgraduate students. What is important to point out is that unlike other pictorial diagnostic tests (but similar to the Rorschach tests previously described), the image is not analysed in a vacuum. Observations of the child and a subsequent interview constitute an important part of the process and this involvement with the subject is emphasised in both diagnostic processes (García Morey, 1995, p. 145).

Three further texts require mentioning. Zaldívar Pérez (1995) on 'Art and Psychotherapy' offers a good general overview of the distinct modalities by not collapsing all modalities under the one heading of 'arts therapies' (a Rogerian concept) but rather referring to a series of distinct disciplines including art therapy, psychodrama, sociodrama, music therapy and the two very Cuban modalities, cine debate terapéutico and psychoballet. In his discussion of art therapy he cites the American art therapists, Edith Kramer (1984) and Judith Aron Rubin (1984). He concludes that art not only constitutes a source of aesthetic pleasure but also a vehicle for self expression and self knowledge; that it facilitates the necessity to create residing in every individual, which in turn benefits wellbeing and human growth. This article was published in the year he was appointed Dean of the Faculty of Psychology at the University of Havana and is the only article published by the Cuban Journal of Psychology directly refering to art therapy in terms of a particular treatment approach or discipline.

Secondly, it seems important to refer to the prospectus issued by the Instituto Superior de Arte (2000) in which a series of courses are listed which suggest postgraduate study possibilities related to the uses of art as a therapy. This was subsequently confirmed during an interview with Dr Dolores Rodríguez Cordero, Director of the Department of Pedagogy and Psychology. The diploma course in pedagogy and psychology of art offers, amongst others, courses in group process, the psychology of art (with reference to art and mental health), and the psychology of creativity. Participants are mainly art teachers. I note this text as it indicates that some of the components constituting training programmes in art therapy in Britain and the US are in fact being imparted at postgraduate level in Cuba.

Lastly, in June 2000 I was able to obtain a copy of Dr María de los Ángeles Vizcaíno Londián's thesis in child psychiatry, supervised by Profesor José Pérez Villar and successfully submitted for examination in 1981. This paper refers to the group psychotherapy undertaken under the direction of Dr Pérez Villar at the William Soler Paediatric Hospital. The theoretical orientation of the group is explicitly stated as being Freudian and latterly psychodynamic with elements of Berne's transactional analysis and Moreno's psychodrama. The concepts of the dynamic unconscious, conflict, defence, transference and counter-transference are referred to. Although the group was

initiated in 1976, when it was held at the National Library, it was not, according to Vizcaíno Londián (1981), until 1978, when the group was relocated at the Casa de la Cultura in Plaza de la Revolución, that the painting workshop led by Ana María Erra was introduced. She does however mention pictorial representation in response to narrative storytelling in the earlier phase 1976-1978 as facilitated by Ulises Cruz.

In her resumé Vizcaíno Londián (1981) refers to clinical outcomes. She notes that of the seven cases she focussed on, five could be described as being free from pathologies, although this varied, and refers to periods of between six months and three years following discharge. Of the two who were readmitted for treatment one had been badly evaluated and the other represented with a minor situational disorder. The method of evaluation consisted in interviews with mother and child, other family members and teachers and psychiatrists where appropriate. Of the different interventions used, drama was considered to have been the most productive in therapeutic terms whereas art was seen as being useful in tracking the child's progress. As far as I am aware this is the only piece of existing empirical research on the evaluation of the efficacy of art as a therapeutic modality undertaken in Cuba.

Summary and Analysis of the Literature Review

In the first part of this review of the literature I have focussed on the material broadly pertaining to what I term Cultural Democracy and Community Arts. Under this heading I have presented the published work pertaining to the life and times of Antonia Eiriz Vásquez, her community based work and her contribution to what has been termed cultural democracy (Craven, 2002). Following this I have presented the work of Ulises Cruz Grau as it is referred to in the writings of Valdés Marín (1979) and Eusebio Leal Spengler (2000).

In so far as the life and times of Antonia Eiriz span the pre and post revolutionary periods in Cuban art and art education broadly described in the previous chapter, they provide a description of the transition between the pre and post revolutionary eras another and a glimpse of either side of Pérez Stable's 'great divide' (Pérez Stable, 1993, p.24). This material supports my original assertion that there was no radical break in the history of Cuban art at the advent of the Revolution and that what ruptures were to

occur occurred later, in the 'Dark Periods' to which Craven (2002) refers and of which Eiriz was a casualty. It also becomes clear that Eiriz's work as an artist was dense with social commentary and critique.

I have also contended, as she herself did, that her work in *el arte popular* was not a break with but a continuity of her life as an artist, the use of *assemblage,* being one concrete example. Thus it can be suggested that when both painting and teaching were untenable options for Eiriz in the early 1970's her involvement with *el arte popular* allowed her to pursue or develop these themes albeit in a different form. As Martínez (1995) contends, creating opportunity for the development of creative potential in others was perhaps the most revolutionary kind of art activity.

In this particular context I have drawn attention to some of the parallels which surface with reference to a wider bibliography. Of these I have mentioned some parallels in terms of approach with the art educationalists Franz Cizek and Herbert Read both of whom feature in an examination of the intellectual precursors of art therapy in Britain (Waller, 1991). I have also noted this same conceptual strand with reference to my discussion of Sorín Sokolsky's work in Chapter 1 and with reference to the work of Valdés Marín and Cruz. It is also worth reiterating in this context that when Read visited the National School of Art, where Eiriz taught from 1962-64, in the 1960's he referred to it as the 'most advanced art school in the World' (Craven, 2002, p. 84).

The published material pertaining to the direct relationship between art and psychology in terms of application and practice in Cuba is very limited indeed. At the point of data collection (1999-2000) neither Aurora García's text nor that of Vizcaíno Londián had been published and Valdés Pérez's (1979) work was out of print. On the other hand Eusebio Leal's (2000) work is beautifully presented in a publication replete with illustrations. This in itself represents a sign of the times and is perhaps indicative of a change in priorities in response to a particular situation, the Special Period, that is, Cuba post the fall of the Soviet Block. Another sign of changing times may also be identified in the rehabilitation of Eiriz. Her most important works, including her controversial installation *Una tribuna para la paz democratica* (A Tribune for Democratic Peace)

(1968), are now on permanent exhibition at the National Gallery of Modern Art while her home has been restored and remodelled as a community workshop (Abreu, 1995).

In thinking about the relationship between art and psychology, the bibliography seems to indicate a shift from an interest in art as a psycho-diagnostic tool in the clinical sphere (Valdés Marín, 1979) to a more recent emphasis, at least in the literature, on the role of art in social psychology, where the patient is not an individual but a community (Leal, 2000). However, in this respect the work of Leal and Cruz in Havana Vieja in the late 1990's can be thought of as a later manifestation of the work of Eiriz in the 1970's in so far as it is located in a community setting and has as its objective community participation, social inclusion and empowerment. Therapeutic benefits, in both these contexts, are by implication, as opposed to being defined as clinical objectives. On the other hand, the work of García Morey (1995) was in 2000 due to be published and as previously noted her *Indicadores* are currently being taught in the University of Havana. (I personally attended these classes) It therefore seems feasible to propose that the literature review reveals three distinct yet overlapping currents that appear more fractured than in fact they actually are due to gaps in the literature.

The first can be said to be that of artists working therapeutically in the community as represented by Eiriz and as documented by Cardoso (1973), Valdés and Chavez (1974), Eligio (1987), Martínez (1995), Lao' Izaguirre (1998), Abreu (2004), and the later work of Ulises Cruz in Havana Vieja as referred to by Leal (2000).

A second current is that of collaborative work where artists work as part of a team in Health Care settings. The early work of Cruz in the *Biblioteca Nacional* as referred to by Valdés Marín (1979) and that of Ana María Erra in collaboration with Pérez Villar as evaluated by Vizcaíno Londián (1981) are examples of this.

The third current is that of work conducted by psychologists which begins with Valdés Marín (1979) and continues with the work of García Morey (1995).

A review of these currents also highlights the fact that while psychologists have written about their involvement with art and psychotherapy and made reference to their collaboration with artists, artists have not published material. What reference has been

made to their contribution in the sphere of therapeutic work has been recorded by psychologists or art critics.

The dates of the publications cited suggest continuity in the area of artists working within the community, and in work undertaken by psychologists. Conversely, the dates of the texts referring to collaborative work, one of which is a doctoral thesis, pertain to a very restricted period of time (1979-1981) suggesting that whatever collaboration took place was short lived. However, what the literature review really reveals is what has been documented and published and by whom.

The bibliographies of published works should, one might hope, reveal what sources have been drawn upon by their authors. However, as pointed out in Chapter 1, this has not been the case in Cuba. As Cairo Valcárcel (2000) notes, with reference to a review of the bibliographies cited in the Cuban Journal of Psychology from 1984 to 1996 the number of citations appearing without a date is remarkably high, rising from 21.97% in 1984 to 56.34% in 1996. Obviously this makes the task of tracing and checking sources, and identifying influences extremely laborious and prone to conjecture. I have therefore drawn attention to parallels in order to contextualise and locate ideas that were in circulation at that time. It may be that Eiriz was familiar with Arte Povera and that Valdés Marín, Cruz and Sorín Sokolsky were familiar with Read's writings but it may also be the case that different people in different contexts reached similar conclusions and developed parallel practices through quite different routes.

Finally, Cairo Valcárcel (2000) notes that, 'the diversity of professional activity within psychology, represents a very different spectrum of activity from the narrow frame of those authors represented in the journal' (Cairo Valcárcel, 2000, p.7). This points to the need to explore *in situ* what people are actually doing and reinforces the appropriateness of my decision to adopt Naturalistic Inquiry as my research methodology.

Chapter 3

Methodology: From Naturalistic Inquiry to Grounded Theory

'What is laid down, ordered, factual is never enough to embrace the whole truth: life always spills over the rim of every cup'. Boris Pasternak

Introduction

The aim of this thesis is to describe in what ways the relationship between art and therapy are understood in present day Cuba and secondly, to describe in what sense and to what extent do these understandings inform practice.

In the preceding chapter I have made reference to the wider body of literature available on the subject. In this chapter I will outline the methodology which underpins and guided how I collected and made sense of the data collected *in situ*.

In order to answer a research question the researcher's primary task is to identify how the information required is to be acquired or collected. In practice this requires a methodology which is congruent with one's subject matter. A preliminary overview of the literature available made it clear that in my own case a great deal of this information would have to be collected in Cuba as a review of the published material that I was able to obtain in the UK produced very little that appeared to be of direct relevance. On the other hand, a preliminary trip to Havana in April 1999, suggested that there was sufficient material to warrant a research study although it was largely undocumented or documented but not published. It became clear that I would require a highly reflexive and sensitive methodology were I to gain access to these materials and that extensive interviewing would be involved.

Adopting Naturalistic Inquiry as a research methodology provided me with a necessary structure for my investigations while simultaneously allowing me sufficient flexibility to pursue and elaborate on themes as they emerged in areas previously not thought of.

Naturalistic Inquiry

What is referred to as Naturalistic Inquiry developed in the late 1960's out of a rejection of existing methodologies in the social sciences that perceived society as being understood by generalisations. These traditional methodologies are, as Vaillancourt Rosenau (1986) points out, underpinned by an identifiable set of epistemological commitments which are often taken for granted and not articulated. They tend to determine how method is understood, research defined and carried out, and knowledge claims defended. Research is rejected or accepted by others, at least partly by reference to the epistemological assumptions upon which it is based (Vaillancourt Rosenau, 1986, p.15). These traditional methodologies seek to establish a set of 'facts', thereby implying that there are a set of 'facts' to be discovered by the researcher following the appropriate technique or method. What unites these methodologies are their approaches which produce reliability; designed to allow different researchers to replicate their methods in order to confirm or deny previous research. They are valid in that they can be subjected to a form of recognisable measurement and are representative by carrying a significant amount of data. They provide sufficient 'facts' or evidence to sustain a testable conclusion. As Labovitz and Hagedorn (1986) have pointed out, a major goal of scientific research is to establish causal laws that enable us to predict and explain specific phenomena and to establish these laws a science, at a minimum must have reliable and valid information and facts.

> 'To obtain reliable and valid facts it is mandatory to follow explicit rules to determine the degree of relative truth of any item of information…it is important for the information to be reliable: that is, repeated observations of the same phenomena yield similar results; and that the observations actually yield measures of what they are supposed to measure' (Labovitz and Hagedorn, 1986, p. 18).

The domination of the belief that it is the quest of knowledge to seek out truths, and the extrapolation of the above approach from the natural to the social sciences, has deeply affected contemporary social science research. This can be thought about as the inappropriate imposition of the scientific method on research undertaken in the social world representative of a more general philosophical position known as positivism. However, in the social world what is true for one turns out to be false for another and what can be said to be known will only be an interpretation of the 'truth', determined by

the inquirer's cultural influence. As Tierney (1988) points out, by the 1960's the idea that social phenomena could be explained by law-like generalisations or that social science research could result in replicative situations and provide predictive power for future events, had come strongly under attack (Tierney, 1988, p.225).

Evaluators began to question their role in the process of research, its utility and whether it should be used to illuminate findings to a wider audience, or be the foundation of responsive exchanges between the community as a whole (MacDonald, 1974, Parlett and Hamilton, 1972, Stake, 1975). These researchers argued for a more open research which was less technical and agreed upon the title 'naturalistic inquiry'.

Whilst the origins of the formulation of naturalistic evaluation had some diversity, the technique did not, and an emphasis on idiosyncrasy was shared, thus ignoring generality, and a preference for biography as opposed to statistical data. Unlike anthropology which seeks to understand a culture by immersion, or ethnography which attempts to understand the social life of others by reduction to sub-cultures, these researchers were primarily interested in subjective human actions that occurred in particular circumstances.

First Principles

The establishment of first principles focused upon the purpose of theory and rejected the notion of the pre-existence of a theory which research had to verify. The naturalistic inquirer sought to generate theory with its continuous modification and replacement throughout the study, implying that theory was a process. This did not mean that research began without theory, for substantive theory was necessary. However, this evolved into formal theory through the addition of data. This process became known as the development of grounded theory. 'The discovery of theory from data, systematically obtained and analysed in social research, which we call grounded theory…fits empirical situations and is understandable to sociologists and laymen alike' (Glaser & Strauss, 1967, p.35)

In addition naturalistic inquiry introduced theoretical sampling and saturation.

Glaser and Strauss (1967) define theoretical sampling as:

'The process of data collection for generating theory whereby the analyst jointly collects, codes and analyses his data and decides what data to collect next and where to find them, in order to develop his theory as it emerges' (Glaser & Strauss, 1967, p.45).

Theoretical sampling emerges through the notion of the discovery of grounded theory where the evaluator cannot know the environment or the precise nature of the problem which is about to be studied. Sampling is therefore directed and limited by the evolution of grounded theory where the inquirer continues to sample until saturation, or until his theory is established. But since the theory is constantly evolving then research is not concluded but rather shifts to other problems. The consequence of this is that theoretical sampling does not seek to fill sampling quotas, and categories are determined as the study evolves following the data and not the opposite, where data are fitted into categories. None of the aforementioned implies that the researcher's ignorance about whom they seek to interview but that subject parameters have a wide boundary since each person is a subjective narrative.

From the late 1960's naturalistic inquiry has evolved into an interactive methodology based upon face to face, and principally idiomatic activity (Simons, 1980, Lincoln and Guba 1985). Naturalistic inquiry seeks to provide the inquirer with understandings of what individuals perceive to be their objective world, in which process the interaction influences the inquirer and their enquiries. The central aim of a research project which uses naturalistic inquiry is not the consensus of interpretation, thus illuminating majority views, but a search for the peculiar. The naturalistic inquirer assumes that change is ongoing and the dynamic of change, in humans, can potentially and initially be identified in the minority.

Normally, convention submerges peculiarities, but naturalistic inquiry searches for peculiarity, arguing that it is deviation that sparks alternative action and thinking whilst uniformity maintains the status quo. Also, naturalistic inquiry is concerned more with change and knowledge which is developed subjectively as the individual endures different experiences. This subjective or tacit knowledge is that gained by experience whereby each person has a great store of knowledge which they use to interpret the present.

Lincoln and Guba (1985) argue for the legitimisation of tacit knowledge.

> 'Intuitive, felt knowledge…in addition to propositional knowledge (knowledge expressible in language form)…because often the nuances of the multiple realities can be appreciated only in this way; because much of the interaction between investigator and respondent or object occurs at this level; and because tacit knowledge mirrors more fairly and accurately the value patterns of the investigator' (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p. 40).

Establishing Axioms

Lincoln and Guba (1985) have provided the first complete rendition of naturalistic inquiry by bringing together all the principal assumptions and main techniques. Firstly, it is important to emphasise that these most prolific advocates of naturalistic inquiry define it at a paradigm level (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.36). A paradigm can be defined as, 'Certain sets of basic or metaphysical beliefs (which) are sometimes constituted into a *system of ideas* that either give us some judgement about the nature of reality, or are a reason why we must be content with knowing something less than the nature of reality, along with a method for taking hold of whatever can be known' (Reese, 1980, p.352). Thus, 'Paradigms represent a distillation of what we *think* about the world (but cannot prove)…our actions in the world, including actions that we take as inquirers, cannot occur without reference to those paradigms: As we think, so do we act'. (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.15)

Lincoln and Guba (1985) hold that inquiry, whether in the physical or social sciences, has passed through a number of paradigm eras in which certain sets of basic beliefs guided inquiry in quite different ways. These eras or periods are described as pre-positivist, positivist and post-positivist each with its own unique set of basic beliefs or metaphysical principles in which its adherents believed and upon which they acted.

They outline substantially different assumptions about research requirements and explain the foundation upon which naturalistic inquiry is based. There are, they suggest, specific assumptions that naturalistic inquirers make about reality. Firstly, that there is no one single reality; but that multiple, socially constructed realities exist. What reality is seen to be is not a determined uniform perception beyond our will, but a human creation, in other words it is determined by us as social individuals.

'The way we think life is and the part we are to play in it is self-created. We put together our own personal reality. It is made up of our interpretation of our perceptions of the way things are and what has happened to us' (Emery, 1978, p. 39).

The naturalistic inquirer believes that people do not see the same world and therefore the establishment of a consensus is of less importance. What is more important are different positions which at best can be understood. That there is an objective reality, which traditional forms of realism argue can be discovered, given time and dedicated study, which will finally reach a consensus, needs for the naturalistic inquirer, to be qualified, recognising that people interpret experiences differently. Thus any movement towards a consensus by apparently independent researchers does not prove the consensus, but merely their sharing of the assumption that there is one. Consequently, assumptions about epistemology, what the problem is and which method is required to seek the truth are the same

'The fact that independent investigators, starting from different assumptions and different observations, tend ultimately to arrive at the same conclusion…is explained by the hypothesis that their different enquiries are directed toward one and the same reality' (Skagestad, 1981, p.87).

Individuals disagree about the nature of reality and attempts are made to understand this discord. There is no consensus to be discovered; only more questions that lead to alternative understandings. Hence the fundamental point about naturalistic inquiry is that knowledge is a process. Questions lead to understandings which points to more questions and the researcher can, at best, achieve only a snapshot that must continually be retaken.

Secondly, it sees humans as interactive, interdependent beings. This implies that the inquirer and those enquired into cannot prevent interaction. Neither can they remain disaffected by the study. This whole concept of interaction has come to the fore in recent years, not only in the social sciences but also in physics. The idea of a mechanical universe obeying determinate rigid laws of motion, as first promulgated by Newton, is now seen to be flawed. There is changed thinking about humanity's role - we are not witnesses of the mechanical world - but rather, by our actions we change,

shape and are shaped by the world. Even the act of studying phenomena is now seen as a disturbance and scientists observing movement understand that movement, in terms of their own assumptions. Hence they have not failed to interact and their conclusions are not unbiased.

> 'The tables have turned. The 'exact sciences' no longer study an objective reality that runs its course regardless of our interest in it or not, leaving us to fare the best we can while it goes its predetermined way. Science, at the level of subatomic events, is no longer 'exact', the distinction between objective and subjective has vanished, and the portals through which the universe manifests itself are, as we once knew a long time ago, those impotent, passive witnesses to its unfolding, the 'I's' of which we, insignificant we, are examples. The Cogs in the Machine have become the Creators of the Universe' (Zukav, 1974, p. 114).

These developments in the natural sciences are salient in any discussion of naturalistic inquiry, in that it too rejects the concept of our passivity and sees us as creators of our environment. The inquirer is not passive, even in the first instance, for the selection of the problem as a problem displays the researcher's involvement. It is contended that the inquirer and the inquired into will shape each others thinking and responses. So the inquirer's understanding does not come from the mere interpretation of responses but from the interaction. Thus the respondent's answer in itself is insufficient. It must be interacted with to draw out the understandings of what other realities mean. This does not mean that that the inquirer cannot be duped in the normal sense, but the interaction seeks to delve into the respondent's comments. A further point to be made is that naturalistic inquiry does not seek *the* truth although it might well seek *a* truth. The naturalistic inquirer maintains that truth is not a uniform perspective to which all humans adhere.

Since there is no consensus about reality, studies shift away from one reducible cause and effect to explain reality. But what occurs is that the inquirer's understanding continually changes as different realities are expressed. For many years the cause and effect approach to understanding society dominated research methodology. It was popular because it could apparently predict the outcome of observations, but it had serious shortcomings in its failure to explain situations where what might be expected to occur, did not. Conversely, naturalistic inquiry assumes constant change to be a fundamental feature of society. It also alerts us to changes in the subjective and

objective realms and therefore to possible insights into future effects. What the inquirer comes to understand in this snapshot process is therefore bound in space and time, and the same environment will yield different understandings in a different time. These understandings cannot be used to interpret different space.

Finally, naturalistic inquiry holds that all research is value bound. The concept of the value-free researcher, denies that the researcher has been shaped by his/her own culture and implies that he/she can switch his/her values on or off. To be able to suggest to inquirers that they can disregard their values, and yet interpret the values of their subjects, implies some impartial standard of judgement that exists in people without any explanation of its origin.

> 'It is time to confront the problems raised by the role of values in inquiry. It is half the battle to admit that one is sick, if one hopes for a cure. Without the admission that the inquiry is value bounded, there is no hope of dealing with the influences of values…we should be prepared to admit that values do play a significant part in inquiry…Such a course is infinitely to be preferred to continuing in the self-delusion that methodology can and does protect one from their unwelcome incursions!' (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p. 185).

In summary, the axioms of naturalistic inquiry are therefore:

- Realities are multiple, constructed and holistic.
- Knower and known are interactive, inseparable.
- Only time-and-context based hypotheses (idiographic statements) are possible.
- All entities are in a state of mutual simultaneous shaping, so that it is impossible to distinguish causes from effects.
- Inquiry is always value-bound

Epistemological Considerations

Before embarking on a discussion of method, it is important to clarify some further points regarding epistemology. Researchers pre-select their methodology; what then remains is for the inquirer to select technique. A technique to discover an individual's consciousness, their thoughts and how their actions could lead to change requires more than observation, it requires interaction. The methodology of naturalistic inquiry is

considered to be ethnographic. However, naturalistic inquiry is more than an ethnographic technique and therefore, while it may be another tool which ethnographers can add to their inventory, some naturalistic inquirers, such as Lincoln and Guba (1985), do not see their approach as an alternative technique to be used only under certain conditions. The approach of these two advocates is one of creating a new revolutionary paradigm and their writings tend to be polemical. What they believe is that peoples' behaviour, in accordance with the axioms of naturalistic inquiry and reality, whilst it exists, is subject to individual interpretation. The dynamic of change lies within the existence of individual perceptions of social experiences, making the potential direction of social action discoverable in the peculiar perceptions exposed by naturalistic inquiry.

Essentially, for Lincoln and Guba, the naturalistic inquirer is not applying a different technique, for what is being employed is a method derived from a different belief in the nature of individuals and society. Societies and their members have been perceived by naturalistic inquirers to be interactive social individuals who consciously make changes, and hence the method of inquiry to be used has flowed directly from these observations. Thus, for some naturalistic inquirers the methodology of naturalistic inquiry is not a useful and additional variation but the only way to do research. Consequently, they do not use other techniques.

Strengths and Weaknesses
The strength of naturalistic inquiry is its presentation of data in a non-technical form. It offers information to a much wider audience than those who commission the research, or who are technically proficient in understanding the information. To accomplish this, naturalistic inquiry provides data in the form of a story (Denny, 1978). These narratives provide possible bases for understanding, by people who can relate to the story through their experiences. Therefore, potential exists for users of information to be able to generalise with the theory established. Its attention holding approach to storytelling is also non-abstractive and through its information it is possible for readers to see themselves in the story.

A naturalistic inquiry can support and reject 'truths', display conflict and emphasise agreement. Therefore support can be given to alternative views, which surveys and

other quantitative approaches tend to dismiss as not part of the statistical majority. Another strength of naturalistic inquiry is that whilst bound by its own space and time its information can be used by others who are not knowledgeable about, or interested, in its focus. This is because the information is sufficiently rich in detail and generalisation and because stories are allowed to develop and not guided into specific regions by the inquirer.

Finally, since naturalistic inquiries are non-technical they can be made publicly accessible. MacDonald and Walker (1975) argue that this can make research a tool which can be used to support institutional and political positions, but more importantly for them, it can also be a mechanism that undermines such positions. Information is power for those who have it and it is the dominating political and institutional structures who have the finances to dictate collection, direction and provide information. If information can be collected and dispersed in a readily absorbed manner, such as stories or common experiences, to subjugated minorities then, in their opinion, naturalistic inquiry has the potential to be used as a weapon in times of struggle.

The weaknesses of naturalistic inquiry are establishing legitimisation as a new research methodology. Contemporary social science research techniques generally seek verification of a hypothesis through using representative sampling techniques, applying the notion of majority support. Naturalistic inquiry cannot compete on these terms for it is not trying to prove a hypothesis but establish a theory through the data. Williams (1986) draws our attention to this in his reflections on his study of year-round education programmes in San Francisco, where the sponsors required sixteen questions to be asked. He concludes that in this case naturalistic inquiry proved inappropriate because respondents were answering pre-determined questions which could be responded to in the affirmative. As previously noted, naturalistic inquiry relies upon interaction and negative comments that lead to the topic's development (Williams, 1986, p.91). Additionally, research generally needs to meet the requirements of sponsors who seek answers and solutions to particular problems which naturalistic inquiry cannot guarantee.

Hebert (1986) highlights another weakness in that naturalistic inquiry provides many 'truths' and conclusions with no mechanisms for weighting or evaluating any of them.

Hence, while these 'truths' do exhibit patterns of responses that can be categorised; they all take on the same importance. Greene (1987) addresses the same problem in her conclusions on the practicality of naturalistic inquiry in relation to her study of youth unemployment in New York. The research involved prospective employers being asked to formulate their criteria for employing young people. Greene (1987) was unable to find any way of highlighting one conclusion as more relevant than any other. Consequently, in this case the evaluator determined outcomes which is exactly what naturalistic inquirers suggest should not happen.

> 'Lacking any intrinsic ethical framework, the practical perspective provides general but not specific guidance on issues…the practical, naturalistic evaluator is well advised to publicly air his or her own preferences, values and beliefs' (Greene, 1987, p. 332).

Similar problems were encountered by Pearsol (1987) when working with a vast amount of data that had to be reported as impartially as possible. He reports that it was impossible to prevent his own conclusions being presented as a judgement and concludes that the validity of naturalistic inquiry lies not in the technical presentation of data, as with other methods, but in its evaluator's best efforts to reach conclusions within a framework of diverse opinions (Pearsol, 1987, p. 340).

The central problem with naturalistic inquiry would therefore appear its relativism and, if it is to gain credibility, its need to find a credible manner of presenting one set of conclusions as opposed to many. As Greene (1987) has pointed out:

> 'With its inherent relativism, among naturalism's prime challenges is the selection and justification of one set of evaluative conclusions from among the multiple interpretations possible' (Greene, 1987, p. 332).

It is exactly this 'inherent relativism' and its notion of multiple realities that has implications for the researcher/evaluator in his/her claims of one conclusion being superior to any other. If everyone's conclusion is as good as everyone else's then the consequence is that anything goes. Smith (1987) argues that, in order to reveal that participants in research are part of a society which has determined shared meanings and methods of understanding, naturalistic inquiry needs to embrace a general theory of objectivity as part of its analysis. He concludes that naturalistic inquiry must concede

that there is a world that exists 'out there' and that such a concession does not necessarily entail as a consequence the acceptance of any uniform or universal theory by which that world can be understood. Roberts (1999) makes the same point perhaps more eloquently when he states that there is furniture in the universe and if we do not acknowledge it we risk falling over it (Roberts, 1999, p.8).

These two main criticisms or weaknesses of naturalistic inquiry need to be overcome. Firstly, an evaluation must reach definite conclusions based upon the interpretation of the researcher, or the study will have no direction. This means that to justify his/her conclusions the evaluator must become the final arbiter. Secondly, because of the overtly subjective nature of naturalistic inquiry, the study must include an evaluation of the objective world or a general theory of the time and space under research to situate the study and acknowledge that meanings, while individual, are also socially derived.

Data Analysis: Grounded Theory

Grounded theory, that is, theory that follows from data rather than preceding it is a necessary consequence of the naturalistic paradigm that posits multiple realities and makes transferability dependent on local contextual factors. As Lincoln and Guba (1985) point out no *a priori* theory could anticipate the many realities that the inquirer will inevitably encounter in the field, nor encompass the many factors that make a difference at the micro or local level (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.205).

Grounded theory was originally developed by two sociologists, Barney Glaser and Anselm Strauss. Willig (2001) suggests that they were unhappy about the way in which existing theories dominated sociological research and argued that researchers needed a method which would allow them to move from data to theory so that new theories could emerge.

> 'Such theories would be specific to the context in which they had been developed. They would be 'grounded' in the data from which they had emerged rather than rely on analytical constructs, categories or variables from pre-existing theories' (Willig, 2001, p. 3).

Grounded theory was therefore designed to open up a space for the development of new contextualised theories.

Since the publication of the *Discovery of Grounded Theory* in 1967, its method has undergone a number of revisions. Furthermore, Glaser and Strauss have gone their separate ways and made quite different proposals about how grounded theory ought to be practiced (Willig, 2001, Melia, 1996). Major differences have subsequently been outlined by Glaser (1992) in his book *Emergence vs. Forcing: Basics of Grounded Theory Analysis* which addresses developments in grounded theory as presented by his former colleague Strauss and his collaborator Corbin in *Basics of Qualitative Research* (1992). It is outside the remit of the present study to detail this debate however several aspects of it are salient and, where these illuminate the present text, will be referred to.

Willig (2001) offers a comprehensive synopsis of the building blocks of grounded theory. She notes that it involves the progressive identification and integration of categories of meaning from data. Thus it is both the process of categorisation and integration, as method, and its product, theory. As a method grounded theory provides the researcher with guidelines on how to identify categories, make links between and how to establish relationships between them. Grounded theory, as theory, is the end-product of this process. A number of key strategies are used by its researchers to enable them to identify, refine and integrate categories and ultimately, develop theory. These include constant comparative analysis, theoretical sampling and theoretical coding.

Categories

A category can be defined as the grouping together of instances, events, processes or occurrences that share central features or characteristics with one another. Categories can be defined at a low level of abstraction, in which case they function as descriptive labels. For example, references to 'anxiety', 'anger' and 'pity' can be grouped together under the descriptive category heading of 'emotions'; or as the analysis progresses, at a higher level of abstraction. These more abstract categories are analytic rather than descriptive, that is, they interpret rather than simply label instances of phenomena. Thus, references to apparently quite diverse activities such as getting drunk, jogging, or writing poetry could be categorised as 'escape' if they appear to share the same objective of distracting the individual from thinking about a problem. Both descriptive and analytic categories are based upon the identification of 'similarity and difference' (Dey, 1999, p.63). In keeping with the general approach of naturalistic inquiry, this

involves an inductive rather deductive process, in that these categories emerge from the data, and are not constructed or determined in advance and then imposed as in content analysis, with which Willig (2001) warns us, it should not be confused.

Coding

Coding is the process by which categories are identified. In the early stages of the analysis coding is largely descriptive. Descriptive labels are attached to distinct phenomena and new low-level categories emerge as a result. As coding progresses, the researcher is able to identify higher level categories, and lower level descriptive categories are integrated into higher level or analytic categories. Category labels are never adopted from existing theoretical formulations but rather grounded in the data itself. Willig (2001) suggests that ideally category labels should be *in vivo* that is, they should use words or phrases used by the respondents themselves thus avoiding the importation of existing theory into the analysis. Theoretical coding involves the application of a coding paradigm to the data. According to Willig (2001) a coding paradigm sensitises the researcher to particular ways in which categories may be linked with one another and enables her to arrange her categories in a meaningful and hierarchical way, with some categories constituting the 'core' and others the 'periphery' (Willig, 2001, p.38). Here Glaser (1978) and Strauss and Corbin (1990) diverge from one another. Strauss (1987) and Strauss and Corbin (1990) propose the use of a coding paradigm which explicitly focuses upon, and draws the researcher's attention to, manifestations of 'process' and 'change' in the data. This is done by asking certain questions of the data, including questions about the context in which the category is embedded, and the interactional strategies utilised by respondents to manage the category and their consequences. This process is referred to by Strauss and Corbin (1990) as 'axial coding'. Others, such as Glaser (1978, 1992) are opposed to the use of a coding paradigm on the basis that it presupposes the relevance of particular constructs to the data. Glaser (1978) argues that any kind of coding paradigm should only be used if indicated by the data and that introducing preconceptions into the analysis is incompatible with the spirit of grounded theory.

As Glaser (1992) put it:

> 'If you torture the data enough it will give up! The data is not allowed to speak for itself, as in grounded theory, and to be heard from infrequently it

has to scream. Forcing by preconception constantly derails it from relevance' (Glaser, 1992, p. 123).

I have taken the view that axial coding is unnecessarily deterministic and incongruent with the naturalistic paradigm and have therefore not applied any pro-forma coding paradigm, axial or otherwise.

Constant comparative analysis

This ensures that the researcher does not just build up categories but also breaks them down again into smaller units of meaning. It ensures that the coding process maintains its momentum by constantly moving back and forth between the identification of similarities among and differences between emerging categories. Once a common feature is identified that unites instances of phenomenon, the researcher must refocus upon differences *within* a category in order to be able to identify any emerging subcategories. In my own research I elected to use the terms 'theme' and 'sub-themes'. Drawing upon the analogy of composition in music and in the visual arts I feel that these terms indicate fluidity in that a theme may emerge with different degrees of intensity at different points. This is entirely congruent with the ultimate aim of constant comparative analysis to link and integrate categories in such a way that all instances of variation are captured by the emerging theory (Willig, 2001, p. 34).

Negative Case Analysis

Having identified a category or theme, or a linkage between themes, the researcher must look for 'negative cases', that is, instances that do not fit. Identifying such instances allow the researcher to qualify and elaborate the emerging theory. Referring back to Lincoln and Guba's (1985) thesis, these instances may also be indications of the dynamic of change which naturalistic inquiry assumes is ongoing and which can potentially and initially be identified in the minority. Obviously, the negative case calls into question what has been postulated as a category and challenges the researcher to review the material. Kidder (1981) refers to this process as a 'process of revising hypotheses with insight' which facilitates the recognition of the full diversity and diversity of the data (Kidder, 1981, p241).

Theoretical Sensitivity

As Willig (2001) points out this is what moves the researcher from a descriptive to an analytical level. The researcher interacts with the material, asking questions of, making comparisons and looking for opposites within the data which in turn is modified by the emerging answers. This may lead her to modify or elaborate the original construct or it may involve her going back into the field to collect further data.

Theoretical Sampling

This involves collecting data in the light of categories that have emerged from earlier stages of data analysis. It involves checking emerging theory against reality by sampling incidents that may change or elaborate its developing claims. In the earlier stages, grounded theory requires maximum openness and flexibility in order to identify a wide range of potential descriptive categories; theoretical sampling however, is concerned with the refinement and, ultimately, saturation of existing, and increasingly analytic, categories.

Theoretical Saturation

The process of data collection and data analysis in Grounded Theory continues until theoretical saturation has been achieved. In practical terms this means that the researcher continues to sample and code data until no new categories can be identified, and until variations on existing categories no longer emerge. However, theoretical saturation is a goal rather than a reality because modifications of categories or changes in perspective are always possible. As Glaser and Strauss (1967) make clear, Grounded Theory is always provisional. 'When generation of theory is the aim…the published word is not the final one, but only a pause in the never-ending process of generating theory' (cited in Dey, 1999, p.117).

Having outlined the basic building blocks underpinning both naturalistic inquiry and grounded theory I will in the following section outline what implications these have for the actual doing of research and its analysis. As has been previously pointed out, unlike most other research methods, these are merged; the researcher moving back and forth between the two in an attempt to ground the analysis in the data with the aim of theoretical saturation.

Implications for Research

The naturalistic paradigm has certain implications for the doing of inquiry. As Lincoln and Guba (1985) point out naturalistic studies are virtually impossible to design in any definitive way before the study is actually undertaken (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.187). However, they do have a characteristic flow or development which I will summarise with reference to my research.

Naturalistic inquiry is always carried out in a natural setting since context is so heavily implicated in meaning. Such a contextual inquiry demands a human instrument; one fully adaptive to the indeterminate situation that will be encountered. The human instrument builds upon her tacit knowledge as much as if not more than upon propositional knowledge, and uses methods that are appropriate to humanly implemented inquiry: interviews, observations, document analysis, unobtrusive clues and the like.

Once in the field, the inquiry takes the form of successive iterations of four elements: purposive sampling; inductive analysis of the data obtained from the sample, development of grounded theory based on the inductive analysis; and projection of next steps in a constantly emergent design. The iterations are repeated as often as necessary until redundancy is achieved, the theory stabilised, and the emergent design fulfilled to the extent possible in view of time and resource constraints.

Throughout the inquiry, but especially near the end, the data and the interpretations are continuously checked with respondents who have acted as sources; differences of opinion are negotiated until the outcomes are agreed upon and minority opinions are well understood and reflected. The information is then used to develop a case report or a case study.

The case study is primarily an interpretative instrument for an idiographic construal of what was found there. It may, however, be tentatively applied to other, similar contexts, if empirical comparison of the sites seems to warrant such an extension. The entire study is bound by the nature of the research problem, the evaluand, or the policy option being investigated which are, however, themselves subject to revision and extension as the study proceeds.

Finally, trustworthiness is tested by four naturalistic analogues to the conventional criteria of internal and external validity, reliability and objectivity, which are termed 'credibility', 'transferability', 'dependability', and 'confirmability', respectively. This testing begins early in the study and continues throughout. (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.187-189)

As Lincoln and Guba (1985) note a major distinction must be made between types of studies in which the investigator 'knows what she doesn't know', and therefore can project means of finding out, and situations in which the investigator 'does not know what she doesn't know'. The naturalistic inquirer is almost always in the latter position and as such my initial research proposal was described in broad brush strokes.

In the following description of my own research I refer throughout to the four successive iterations of four elements: purposive sampling, inductive analysis of the data obtained from the sample; development of grounded theory based on inductive analysis; and projection of next steps in a constantly emergent design. The iterations were repeated as often as was possible given the restraints of both time and funding.

Doing Naturalistic Inquiry in Cuba

My aim from the outset was to describe the nature of the relationship between art and therapy in post Revolutionary Cuba. This research question was formulated following an initial visit to Cuba in April 1999 when the objective was to ascertain whether or not there would be sufficient material available to substantiate a doctoral thesis; if it would be of enough interest to me to devote myself to it; and to what extent could I be confident that I could gain access to that material. I returned convinced that there was sufficient material and established contact with a number of potential 'gatekeepers' without whom I could not have proceeded.

My initial interest in researching the relationship between the visual arts and psychotherapy in post Revolutionary Cuba was sparked by a report submitted to the International Networking Group of Art Therapists, based in Los Angeles, US, describing the practice of art therapy in Cuba. The author of this report Orestes González Rodríguez (1997) made substantial claims regarding art therapy practice

research findings on the outcome of art therapy treatments with specific groups. My correspondence and subsequent meetings with González Rodríguez and his network of colleagues in Havana during April 1999 convinced me that the research was worth pursuing. I was, however, made aware at this point that what was to be known or understood had not for the most part been documented and that I would require a methodology that would allow me to draw upon whatever resources were available, in a situation full of unknowns.

In thinking about the options with regards to an appropriate methodology I took the following factors into consideration:

- That I would be 'working', and researching in a different social, economic and cultural situation and in a second language and thus required a methodology which acknowledged the importance of context, time and space.

- That my data would probably include documentary, archival, visual and interview material and thus required a methodology which would encompass a variety of data collection methods; one which advocates 'a combination of methods, not a combination of paradigms'. (Erlandson et al., 1993, p.46).

- That at the point of committing myself to the research and to one year of fieldwork in Cuba I did not know nor could I have predicted what I would find. I therefore could not postulate any sort of hypothesis which could be proved or disproved and thus required a methodological approach which allowed for inductive data analysis. At the outset of my research, I did not know what I did not know. As I acquired more data I came to realise what I did not know and so was able, at different points and in relation to different areas of inquiry to adjust my focus. Thus the processes of collection, induction and analysis were constant.

Bearing these general considerations in mind and the expertise available to me in terms of supervisory expertise at the point of submitting a proposal, I selected, from the array of qualitative approaches currently available, Naturalistic Inquiry as being the most

appropriate to my area of investigation and in keeping with this and the aim of generating theory, Grounded Theory.

In this section I make these processes explicit by presenting a general description of how I implemented my methodology *in situ* in Havana between June 1999 and June 2000.

A visa is required to enter Cuba. My intention to stay for one year required a study visa and therefore enrolment at the Faculty of Psychology of the University of Havana, where I pursued supervised postgraduate studies under the direction of Doctor Aurora García Morey, Head of the Department of Child Psychology, for one academic year. An official status, other than that of tourist, was also necessary in order that my sixteen year old son could enrol at a Cuban State school. These factors, along with living with a Cuban family were, in terms of gaining access to Cuban society, of immeasurable benefit to me and my understanding.

The cyclical and integrated nature of both Naturalistic Inquiry and the Grounded Theory approach does not provide the researcher with a series of steps, which, if followed correctly will take him or her from the formulation of the research question through data collection and analysis and, finally, to the production of a research report. Instead the researcher is encouraged to continuously review earlier stages of the research and, if necessary, to change direction; even the research question in grounded theory is not a permanent concept (Willig, 2001, p. 36).

In my own case I had reached an impasse by Christmas 1999. 'What is the relationship between the visual arts and therapy in post Revolutionary Cuba?' was my original research question. However, I had come to realise that the claims made by my original gatekeeper, the self selected President of the Cuban Art Therapy Association were exaggerated. Although I do not doubt his involvement at different stages with psychologists in various projects, he was not to my knowledge, at any point during my stay, working in any capacity other than as an art teacher. My interviews with him, none of which were recorded, revealed very little other than the growing realisation that his interest in me and in art therapy were more than tinted with self interest. On the other

hand, he had introduced me to a number of psychologists and other parties who were later to prove helpful.

My connection to the University of Havana was similarly ambivalent. In order to pursue a year of supervised postgraduate study I had to enrol for a specific project. My supervisor was a child psychologist who had written her own doctoral thesis on the analysis of children's drawings. Given her interests she was keen that I learn how to use them in Havana with a view to applying them at a later stage in Scotland the final object being a cross-cultural comparative study. This was very far from my original research question; however, I complied, to the extent that for nine months I worked two days a week under Dr García Morey's supervision at a clinic for children with emotional and behavioural problems which was attached to and staffed by members of the Faculty of Psychology. In my capacity as supervised postgraduate student I was referred a number of cases with whom I worked as an art therapist. After making an initial assessment following the guidelines outlined by García Morey, based on an analysis of the child's drawing and what the child said about it, I would see the child for an indeterminate number of sessions, prior to evaluating any changes post treatment. The supervised aspect of this work was interrupted by Dr García Morey's frequent trips to Latin America and latterly by the highly publicised Elian González case during which she was involved in meetings with Fidel Castro and in numerous televised *mesas redondas* or round table discussions.

While I very much enjoyed this clinical work that allowed me a privileged insight into the life of Cuban children and their families, I have not included any detailed description of it, nor of my findings using García Morey's indicators. Rather there was a tacit understanding between us that while I would follow the programme of study my research interests were elsewhere, that is, in understanding the wider picture of the relationships between art and therapeutic practices. By accepting me as her student García Morey became an important gatekeeper, as my connection to her and to the University facilitated the establishing of other contacts. However, it also identified me as being linked to the establishment and it would be naive to conclude that this connection always worked in my favour. On the contrary, there were several occasions during which it was evident that I was being assessed by potential respondents in terms of being 'safe to talk to' and occasions arose when individuals either preferred not to be

taped or asked me to turn off the tape recorder. These latter incidents occurred when something was being said that could be construed or was critical of the regime.

As previously noted, by Christmas 1999 I had reached an impasse. I had witnessed that children's drawings were being used as a diagnostic tool following García Morey's schema but had collected no other concrete evidence to further my research. At this point I was introduced to Avelino Couceiro, who described himself as a community worker, although at that moment in time all the *Casas de Cultura* were closed due to material shortages - one of the seemingly never ending repercussions attributed to the *periodo especial* or Special Period following the collapse of the former Soviet Union. Couceiro, in turn, introduced me to the artist and art historian Jorge Nasser and it was from this point onwards that I began to access material that seemed relevant to my research interest.

My description of my work in the UK had reminded Couceiro of work undertaken by Nasser and although it transpired that indeed his past work with children resembled some known and more directive approaches to art therapy practice that I was familiar with, this was not the most interesting material that emerged from my interview. My primary aim was not simply to seek out practices that resembled those I was familiar with but rather to understand other understandings of the relationship between art and mental health care. At this point I realised that references to 'art therapy' were not only being interpreted in quite different ways by different people and probably impinging upon and possibly impeding my research but that the term itself implied that I was looking for a particular phenomenon. As Willig (2001) points out:

> 'The initial research question in Grounded Theory should be open-ended and should not be compatible with simple yes/no answers. It should identify the phenomenon of interest without making (too many) assumptions about it. It should never employ constructs from existing theories' (Willig, date, p. 37).

The very word 'therapy' or 'therapeutic' carries all sorts of implications and nuances depending on how it is used, by whom and in what context. I could not assume that what I was referring to in my use of these words resembled what was understood or shared by my respondents. The word 'art' is similarly heavily laden with its own

baggage. My research question was quite clearly focused on the relationship between art and therapy in Cuba but my working definition of therapy was intended to be wider than psychotherapy per se. Similarly, a definition of art need not be similarly circumscribed and could include the decorative arts and artisan work as examples of what has been called the applied arts. From this point onwards I made every attempt to clarify my terms, or avoid using terms, and reference to constructs drawn from my own limited experience. Instead I described what I was interested in, that is, examples of work in whatever setting, involving art, which had been helpful to people.

What struck me during my interview with Nasser were his references to his teacher the artist Antonia Eiriz Vásquez who had inspired the therapeutic work he had later become involved with. Nasser's later development of what he described as 'Psico-museo' seems to have begun and ended with him, albeit that I later identified some parallels with the work of other practitioners. However, Eiriz's work, addressed within the interview as an aside, struck me as important. This was partly because throughout the course of the interview with Nasser, I sat facing one of her drawings - one of a series where the human body has been pruned - which, I later discovered, she referred to as images of 'human bonsai'.

This may be understood as an example of tacit knowledge. As Heron (1981) argues, tacit knowledge becomes the base on which the human instrument builds many of the insights and hypotheses that will eventually develop and be cast in propositional form. According to Lincoln and Guba (1985) it is only the human instrument that can build on tacit knowledge; every instrument is perforce cast in propositional form and so is insensitive to tacit influences. They go on to assert that given the indeterminate initial form of inquiry pursued naturalistically, it is essential that the human instrument be permitted to use his or her tacit knowledge at full strength and in most explicit fashion (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.198).

Of course, none of this is to suggest that the inquirer be content to leave his or her knowledge at tacit level. This tacit knowledge must be converted to propositional knowledge so that the inquirer can think both about it explicitly and communicate it to others.

It may also be understood as an example of difference. Nasser's account of Eiriz's work struck me as quite different from any other account of art as a therapy that I had to date encountered in the field. As previously noted the central aim of a research project which uses naturalistic inquiry involves a search for the peculiar located in the assumption that change is ongoing and the dynamic of change, in humans, can potentially and initially be identified in the minority and that deviation sparks alternative action and thinking whereas uniformity maintains the status quo.

In this particular example, I was at the outset unclear as to why Eiriz was important. Possibly, as a trained artist, I was able to appreciate the quality and force of her image and perhaps recognise something of the tragic so often referred to in relation to her work. But at this point I did not know that she was to emerge as a central figure in my research.

Following my interview with Nasser and in the light of the information he shared with me I interviewed a series of people linked with Eiriz. However, I also pursued other avenues of inquiry. Through a link with a child psychologist María del Carmen Valls I made contact with Ana María Erra, who described herself as an art therapist and Ulises Cruz Grau, who had worked in art therapy groups with Erra and a psychoanalyst, Dr Pérez Villar in the 1970's and 1980's. Through my initial contact with Orestes González Rodríguez, I also gained access to Ada Bueno Roig and her colleagues. My continued presence on a weekly basis as a supervised postgraduate student on clinical placement ensured a familiarity with developments within contemporary practice and presented me with many opportunities to discuss and develop my ideas.

A process emerged congruent with that previously described by Lincoln and Guba (1985), that is that material from one interview, when analysed, demanded further investigation. One interview would therefore inevitably lead to another. This occurred quite naturally as interviewees suggested I contact other sources, on most occasions either contacting these sources on my behalf or by giving me the necessary information regarding the individuals whereabouts. I was never refused an interview but on two occasions I was asked not to record parts of conversations. This occurred when the material that was being shared was politically sensitive or could have been construed as such. I have only referred to taped material when permission was granted.

Simultaneously, as Willig (2001) notes, existing texts and documents can also be subjected to Grounded Theory analysis (Willig, 2001, p. 37). I therefore collected or photocopied what published materials were available and these have consequently informed my literature review and been referred to in my analysis and discussion.

In view of time and resource constraints, I could not pursue every line of inquiry to the point of absolute saturation nor report on every process. I am forced to make decisions about what I construe to be salient albeit that these decisions are based on the successive iterations of the four elements: purposive sampling; inductive analysis of the data obtained from the sample; development of grounded theory based on the inductive analysis; and projection of next steps in a constantly emergent design. In theory, these iterations are repeated as often as possible until redundancy is achieved, the theory stabilised, and the emergent design fulfilled to the extent possible in view of time and resource constraints. In practice, these constraints were a one year unpaid leave of absence granted to me by my employers and a limited budget. Therefore, what is presented in the data analyses and following discussion is what I was able to achieve in the fourteen months I spent living, working and researching in Havana.

Analysis of the Data

Organising data into some sort of manageable form demands that certain decisions be made. Originally, I divided the material into two broad categories, that is, community based work and work undertaken in clinical settings. However, this did not reflect the fact that several practitioners worked in both settings and that in some cases clinical work was undertaken in community settings for pragmatic reasons i.e. space and transport, and/or to avoid the stigma of hospital attendance. At the point of organising the data into chapters, any distinction was being made at a descriptive level rather than at an analytic level I therefore decided upon the very basic distinction of professional formation: that of artist and that of mental health professional. However, this distinction presented difficulties in terms of sheer bulk and manageability. I then sub-divided the data pertaining to art, artists and therapy into two separate categories. The first addressed work conducted by Antonia Eiriz referring to work conducted strictly outside the clinical realm, and the second to work conducted by artists in collaboration with psychiatrists, psychologists and other mental health professionals. This collapsing of categories is in keeping with the methodology of Grounded Theory and specifically

reflects the process referred to as constant comparative analysis by ensuring that the process maintains its momentum and does not simply build up categories but also breaks them down again into smaller units of meaning. The analysis of data will therefore be presented in three consecutive chapters that is art, artists and therapy, followed by data pertaining to art, artists and therapy: involving collaborative working and lastly art, psychologists and therapy.

Thus the material emanating from the data suggests three categories, that is:

- **Art, artists and therapy.**
- **Collaborative working.**
- **Art, psychologists and therapy.**

These categories or groupings are presented in three consecutive chapters.

These chapters do not reflect discrete or chronological phases of the data collection. Rather each chapter refers to a more or less distinct area of practice, that is to say, there is a limited overlap between them. Data was continually collected in all areas throughout the study and the distinctions I have made emerged from the data itself. Through the process of constant comparative analysis it emerged that there were in fact three distinct groups of respondents and that these respondents, with the exception of those involved in collaborative work, confined their commentaries to one area with little or no reference to the other.

The first chapter addresses the life and work of Antonia Eiriz and particularly her involvement in *el arte popular* as it is manifested in the papier mâche movement, its main form of expression. I have examined this in some detail because it was the most extensive area of practice and as such more information was available to me. All the respondents are artists, art historians or community development workers. A great deal of the information I collected was historical, that is, referring to a period of time from 1970 to 1993.

In this chapter I have identified three main descriptive themes:

Theme 1   **The particular influence of Antonia Eiriz Vásquez**

Theme 3   **The significance of the papier mâché movement in**

community development work

Theme 3   **Art as a therapy**

These themes are not postulated in any hierarchical order, however the order in which I have chosen to present them does reflect a move from the more general to the more specific in the analysis of the data, as I sought the clarification required to answer my research question. Thus in relation to the theme, art as therapy, I have identified a series of sub themes as follows:

- **The perception of papier mâche work as therapeutic.**

- **The perception of the aesthetic in relation to the therapeutic.**

- **The emphasis on the process of making in terms of activity.**

- **The limited role of verbal exploration.**

- **The importance of the notion of intention with respect to therapeutic work.**

- **The importance of making money.**

Moving from an analysis at a descriptive level to analysis at an analytic level the following themes emerged:

- **Eiriz as a Symbol of the Revolution**

- **Inventiveness**

- **Creative Engagement as Therapy and, Empowerment as a Therapeutic Outcome.**

In chapter 5, I present the data pertaining to art, artists, therapy and collaborative working. This data pertains to artists working quite consciously as therapists in mental health settings and focuses on three interviews with Jorge Nasser, Ulises Cruz and Ana María Erra Guevara.

I have included the interview with Ulises Cruz in this chapter because although I previously point to continuity between his later work in Havana Vieja and that of Eiriz, as referred to in the summary and analysis of the literature review, Cruz did collaborate with psychologists and had worked as a therapist as part of a team in Health Care settings. It could also be fairly stated that his current work in the community is collaborative in that it forms part of a larger project.

There are some similarities and also some differences between the themes that emerge in the different interviews.

In the first interview with Jorge Nasser, the descriptive themes which emerge from the data are as follows:

- **The precedence of practice.**
- **Responding to necessity.**

The abstract theme which emerges is that of:

- **Responsiveness.**

In the second interview with Ulises Cruz Grau, the descriptive themes are:

- **Multidisciplinary collaboration.**
- **Social Inclusion: Artistic Activity as a Social Therapy.**

The abstract theme elicited from these themes is:

- **An emphasis on social responsiveness and group therapy.**

The third and last interview was conducted with Anna María Erra.
The descriptive themes which emerge are more varied.

- **The importance of formative experience.**
- **Rejection of determinism in all its manifestations.**
- **Responsiveness and interdisciplinary collaboration.**
- **Opposition to institutionalisation of the profession.**

The abstract theme which emerges is:

- **Coherent Practice.**

In chapter 6, I present the data emanating from the category art, therapy and psychology in which I have subsumed psychoanalysis as a branch of psychology. The data represents material extracted from three interviews, with Elaine Cossio, Ada Bueno Roig and Aurora García Morey.

I begin by analysing my interview with Elaine Cossio a training psychoanalyst and co-ordinator of the Lacanian Group in Havana.

The main descriptive theme which emerged has been defined as:

- **Information sharing versus information withholding.**

The main abstract theme elicited from the analysis of the descriptive is:

- **Defensiveness.**

This followed by an analysis of an interview with Ada Bueno Roig a psychologist using art as a therapy with art students.

The descriptive themes which emerge are:

- **Different Arts, Different Problems**
- **An Established Methodology**
- **Liaising with Families and Teachers**

From these themes the abstract theme which emerges is:

- **Emphasis on Creativity, empowerment and a holistic approach.**

Finally, I present the data analysis of my interview with Dr Aurora García Morey who supervised my clinical work with whom I was associated throughout my year in Havana.

The descriptive themes which emerge are as follows:

- **Formation and Influences**
- **Indicators for the Analysis of Children's Drawings**
- **Cross Cultural Implications**
- **Analysis versus Interpretation**

An overview of these themes suggests the abstract theme:

- **Potential and Development**

Chapter 4

Art, Artists and Therapy
Data Analysis

Introduction

In January 2000, I was introduced by Avelino Couceiro, to Jorge Nasser, an artist and art historian living in Vedado, Havana. During my visit I commented upon a drawing hanging in his drawing room which struck me as particularly powerful. It was a drawing by the artist Antonia Eiriz. It transpired that Antonia Eiriz had introduced papier mâche work to Cuba in the 1970's and that this work had become known as *'el arte popular'*. The conversation which ensued suggested a link between this 'movement' and art therapy, in so far as it represented what Byrne (2002) has referred to as the democratisation of art-making in the wake of modernism. This re-evaluation of child art, non European art and what was previously regarded as primitive art and the acknowledgement of its value in aesthetic as well as expressive terms was an important step without which the development of art as a therapy would be unthinkable. It was this link and the fact that Antonia Eiriz's work was constantly drawn to my attention by respondents that persuaded me to pursue this avenue of investigation. This decision is in keeping with the methodology of Naturalistic Inquiry and represents an example of purposive sampling (Lincoln and Guba, 1985).

El arte popular

The term '*el arte popular*' can be literally translated as popular art but this rather distorts the meaning implying that it is art which is popular with people whereas *el arte popular* is art made by the people, that is, people who have not received training as artists. However, this is not to suggest they have not been taught but rather that what they have been taught is a particular skill or set of skills as opposed to receiving a broader artistic education. In other cultures what is known as *el arte popular* is referred to as 'folk art' but this is an inappropriate translation implying traditional art or artisan work which has its origins deeply embedded in the given culture expressing something of that culture. Whilst the latter is true of *el arte popular*, it has a relatively short history

in Cuba. Folk art, or art deeply rooted in tradition, is represented by the religious artefacts of *Santaría*, a religious cult whose roots are in the ancient religious practices brought to Cuba by the slaves during the colonial period. These artefacts are often embodied with magical and healing powers and used along with particular rituals by *Santeros* or practitioners of santaría to affect cures. This area of therapeutic practice has been addressed by ethnographers such as Ortiz (1940) and Guanche (2000). My contact with these practices and their practitioners was sporadic. Furthermore, the use of art in these contexts is confined to traditional symbols and objects as opposed to art being used as a form of more personal expression, and as such it lies outside the parameters of this study.

The aspect of *el arte popular*, which I have chosen to focus on, is the development of the work initiated by Antonia Eiriz Vásquez in the 1970's and is largely confined to works made of papier mâche. In one sense this is a narrow definition, however, it is representative of *el arte popular*, which is for the most part sculptural works, objects and artefacts made of papier mâche.

In relation to this material I have identified the following descriptive themes:
- **The particular influence of Antonia Eiriz.**
- **The significance of the papier mâche movement in community development work.**
- **Art as therapy.**

These themes are not postulated in any hierarchical order, however the order in which I have chosen to present them does reflect a move from the more general to the more specific in the analysis of the data, as I sought the clarification required to answer my research question. Thus in relation to the theme, art as therapy, which pertains most specifically to my research topic, I have identified a series of sub themes as follows:

- **The perception of papier mâche work as therapeutic.**
- **The perception of the aesthetic in relation to the therapeutic.**
- **The emphasis on the process of making in terms of activity.**
- **The limited role of verbal exploration.**

- **The importance of the notion of intention with respect to therapeutic work.**
- **The importance of making money.**

Descriptive Theme 1: The Particular Influence of Antonia Eiriz Vásquez

This represents a major descriptive theme in my research in which I will draw attention to the impact of her background and ill-health on her work; the question of self censorship; and the perception of Eiriz's work as oppositional to the regime. I will then present what I believe emerges as an analytic theme, which is, Eiriz as a charismatic individual whose life can be seen to personify something of a particular time and context, in this case the hopes and the contradictions of the Cuban Revolution.

Jorge Nasser (2002) graduated in art history from the University of Havana in 1978. In 1983 he was appointed curator at the museum in Juanelo in the municipality of San Miguel del Padron where he met Antonia Eiriz for the second time.

> 'When I had to make an exhibition of the history of the municipality, which didn't have a history, or rather there were no physical elements of that history; I remembered that it was there that papier mâche arose, headed by her in the 1970's. It seemed to me that that was the most interesting thing that had happened, not only in San Miguel del Padron, but in Cuba in the modern era, in so far as it was a popular movement'.[1]

Nasser proposed to establish a permanent exhibition of Cuban papier mâche work in the museum and Eiriz encouraged him as part of his research to practice the various techniques. Although he stated that she never gave him classes she acted as 'the censor' of his works. He also states that she invited him almost immediately to be her collaborator and auxiliary when she gave courses. This included what Nasser refers to as 'the theoretical part of the papier mâche movement in Cuba'. In return, as he puts it, she facilitated his access to all of the artisans who were working and who had been her students and this gave him the possibility to mount the first permanent exhibition of Cuban papier mâche work at the Museo Municipal de San Miguel del Padron and make him 'the curator of the papier mâche movement'. [1]

> 'It seemed to me that all of it had an extraordinary importance. Cuba is not a country in which *la artesanía* (arts and crafts) is the most brilliant; we do

not have a tradition of handicrafts like Mexico or Ecuador or Bolivia. The fact that that there has arisen, in full modernity, in the decade of the 1970's, an artisan movement so strong that it spread and was taken up everywhere, was for me very interesting… that this movement took several directions, that it didn't stay as the making of little souvenir objects… large works were made, utensils, and also art … and little by little I was converted into a papier mâche artist'.**1**

Through my contact with Jorge Nasser, who initially acted as my gatekeeper, I made further contacts with students, friends and contemporaries of Antonia Eiriz. Often, people would quite spontaneously reminisce about her and about their friendship with her. I therefore collected a considerable amount of biographical detail which became more than just background material. Eiriz was obviously an extremely gifted and charismatic individual who was well known in Cuba both as a teacher and as an artist. Her circle of friendships and acquaintances was wide as is evident from the diversity of the respondents and it seems that she was an effective communicator and net worker, capable of enlisting help for her project and open to being involved in projects proposed by others.

I have confined my discussion of the impact of her background on her work as an artist and as a teacher to material obtained in the course of interviewing. All of these interviews took place in the homes of the respondents with the exception of my interview with Dr Pogolotti which was conducted in her office.

Artist and Teacher

I was introduced to María Gutiérrez and 'Papo' Ubaldo Gutiérrez by María del Carmen Pérez Cernuda, the curator of the Museum of San Miguel de Padron, in April 2000. Most of the information about Antonia Eiriz's early life was provided by María del Carmen Cernuda or quite spontaneously by María Gutiérrez who had been Eiriz's neighbour from 1929 to 1993. This meeting with María Gutiérrez and 'Papo' Gutiérrez was an important one because apparently, although I was unaware of it at the time, I was being viewed with some suspicion as a foreigner, a '*yuma*'. I was later informed by the Director of the Museum of Art that the fact that I had established a warm rapport with Papo had impressed them and that they decided to help me as a result of this. This help was indispensable given Cuba's Soviet style bureaucracy and allowed me access to

materials, published and unpublished, which otherwise would have been impossible to access. At the time I was oblivious to the future implications of this scrutiny.

María del Carmen Cernuda informed me that Antonia Eiriz Vásquez was born on the 1st of April 1929 in her parent's house in the Juanelo neighbourhood of Havana, a poor working class area in the municipality of San Miguel Del Padron which grew in the first decades of the 20th century. This simple wooden house, in Pasaje Segunda, between Soto and Piedra, which her parents moved to in 1920, was to remain her home and her studio until she left Cuba in 1993. **3**

I interviewed María Gutiérrez in her home in Juanelo in April 2000, when she was 93 years old and completely blind. In keeping with the tenets of Naturalistic Inquiry I adopted an open interview format which allowed Señora Gutiérrez to tell me what she wanted to, rather than putting me in the position of asking her specific questions about what I thought I ought to know. She focused on her earlier memories recalling how she had assisted at Nica's birth in 1929. Antonia or 'Nica' or 'Nikita', as she was affectionately known by her friends and family, was the youngest of five surviving children. Her parents were both '*Gallegos*', immigrants from Galicia in North West Spain, who had arrived as settlers in Cuba during the first decades of the 20th century. Her father, José Eiriz, owned a horse and cart and according to neighbours (who joined in the interview) made his living transporting goods. Her mother, Esperanza Vásquez, was an expert seamstress and dress maker. She made all the family's clothes and Angelita, the eldest of her four daughters, owned two dress shops in San Miguel Del Padron before the Revolution. **10**

At some point after this, Angelita left Cuba to live in the US as did eventually all of her siblings. Nica remained in the family home. María Gutiérrez recalled how much 'Nikita loved drawing and painting' and how as a young woman the family sent her to the famous Escuela de San Alejandro de La Havan.**10**

María del Carmen Cernuda later confirmed that Eiriz had enrolled in 1951 and graduated in 1958 as a teacher of drawing and painting. **3**

Her early career as an artist and teacher in the Cuban art school system, from 1957 to 1970, is well documented and I refer in some detail to this in the literature review. As a painter she had clearly received considerable recognition despite the fact that she stopped painting in 1970. In April 2000, I interviewed Dr Graziela Pogolotti, Vice-President of UNEAC (Union of Cuban writers and artists). I anticipated a rather formal interview and prepared an interview schedule based on my reading of several articles in which she referred to Eiriz's work. Aware that Pogolotti had written with admiration of Eiriz's work as early as 1959, in a review of the exhibition' Thirteen Cuban Artists', at the Lyceum in Havana, I took this as my point of departure, and inquired as to whether she had followed Eiriz's career.

> 'Yes, after that, because that first work…well, it was quite different from what she did afterwards… it attracted my attention… it interested me…it seemed to me that she was an artist with a lot of talent…at that time I didn't know her personally…furthermore Antonia's painting was in a corner, it wasn't even standing out. Despite this, in that exhibition, which was by young artists, of less than 35 years of age, some of whom were already known, there were some of those who had been members of the group 'Los Once ' (The Eleven), but that which attracted my attention as something really new, original, strong, was that piece of Antonia's, a relatively small piece'. **8**

Pogolotti cast some light on Eiriz's relationship with the avant-garde group *Los Once.*

> 'She really didn't belong to the group *Los Once.* But I think she was connected for reasons of friendship, through contacts between common friends. I definitely think that overall that was in the final evolution of *Los Once*, at the time when they were developing a more expressionist tendency; there was also a community of ideas. But well, the tendency of Antonia was always in the line of expressionism, therefore when they exhibited for the last time, really Antonia already had a platform which brought her quite close to *Los Once* in their final evolution…' **8**

Pogolotti's view of Eiriz's place within Cuban art is clearly expressed; underlining that from the very beginning of her career Eiriz's talent had been noticed. It also makes clear her position as a major figure in the Cuban art world.

> 'Well, in my opinion she has a very important place, I think that she is… possibly of the 1960's, that is to say her generation, together with Raúl Martínez, the distinguished personality. I also think…that she was a very

individual figure, very original, who didn't have much relation with other artists… I think that she is a figure in the front line of Cuban visual arts'.**8**

María de Carmen Pérez Cernuda, the curator of the museum in San Miguel de Padron, knew Eiriz personally and spoke of her early career.

> 'Most of her work was made in the 1950's, in the 1960's up until 1970. The last that she made was a series, some ink drawings dedicated to Raúl Milián, a deceased Cuban painter which we possess…, it was a series of ten and we have seven of these drawings, it seems to me that this was the last work of the 1970's, but well her work was really centred at the end of the 1950's'. **3**

It seems that Eiriz drew upon her surroundings in San Miguel del Padron as subject matter.

> 'Everything about the life of Antonia is interesting, because her work… is the reflection, of her internal world. It is important to know, that she always, in her work, reflected the municipality of San Miguel del Padron, her neighbours, her neighbourhood, her friendships, the house, the furniture of the neighbours, that is to say it was always her environment. I don't know if you know her work '*La anunciación*' (The Annunciation), it is a reflection…, appearing in that work is the sewing machine of one of her friends, Mercedes Rodríguez…she always reflected in her work the world of her neighbourhood'.**3**

Between 1965 and 1969 Eiriz taught at the Escuela Nacional de Arte de Cubanacán. Amongst her pupils were Roberto Fabelo and Ever Fonseca who I interviewed in their respective studios in Havana in the spring of 2000. Both painters had in different publications mentioned the influence of Eiriz in their formation as artists and this provided me with a point of departure in the interviews.

Roberto Fabelo recalls his encounter with Eiriz in 1967 when he was seventeen years old.

> 'The National School of Art, as you know, was a school which had a really interesting team of teachers. Antonia was one of these teachers and when I began to receive classes in painting…the teacher of the classes in the first year of painting was Antonia Eiriz. Therefore just after I arrived, very young and without very many clear ideas about things, well…I encountered a tremendous personality in Antonia Eiriz. She inspired a lot of respect and at the same time a lot of appreciation, a lot of affection because she appeared

to be a dry personality, sharp, but not. She had a lot of respect for us, she wasn't exactly a person with much humour, of much good humour or at least her good humour was very refined and had something of the capricious, perhaps a little critical of her own nature, of her own vision of things. She was in those moments a notable creator, it was lucky for us to enter and at once have Antonia Eiriz as a teacher. She was not a very prolific person in terms of praising students; she was very correct, she possessed a tremendous culture and sensitivity and even though she wasn't much given to praising works, she was clear when she acknowledged the work…the work of one of us, who were hardly into their first year'.**12**

This excerpt from my interview with Fabelo describes his encounter with her thirty three years before when she was at the height of her painting career. It seems to describe a respected teacher who was in turn respectful of her students. In the following excerpt Fabelo acknowledges her influence on his painting and her place in Cuban neo-figurative painting. Both excerpts are interspersed with reflections on her character.

'There was always a possibility for dialogue with her, even although she was a little grave, perhaps there was something bitter, her physical disability could have had an influence in that…but at the same time she had a tender side which wasn't shown in a very expressive manner but it was appreciable, it was palpable…I have been drawing for many years and from the beginning I was drawing images which in some way brought me closer to the work of Antonia Eiriz. There has been a great apogee of neo-figurative painting, at least in Cuba, and amongst us Antonia was a creator who in some form affiliated herself to this neo-figurative movement with a very strong expressionist accent, her work always had a critical and defiant element, a sombre tone and a very corrosive humour'.**12**

The subject of Eiriz's disability was inevitably raised. María Gutiérrez recalled that 'Nikita' had contracted polio when she was two years old. As a child she was subjected to three operations and wore an apparatus on her left leg from early childhood for the rest of her life.**10**

They also suggest that her illness had made a strong impression on her, influencing both her character and her painting. Almendros indicates in the following extract that her disability may well have informed her sense of humour.

'She had the problem of poliomyelitis, which it seems was something terrible because she had a very macabre sense of humour, for example she was sitting in the '*guagua*' (bus) and a man was looking at her… (She was very beautiful, she was lovely, and she had large green eyes, very

beautiful)…when a man looked at her she said 'wait until I stand up and you see me with my foot'. Once, dying with laughter she told how in a bus a man said, 'let that girl with the phenomenon on her foot get in', and she said this dying of laughter. She had a sense of humour, she liked macabre jokes, black jokes…she was very witty'. **9**

In a previous interview, conducted in the presence of Avelino Couceiro, María del Carmen Pérez Cernuda, the curator of the museum in Juanelo, responded to his query as to whether or not her disability had affected her character, by referring to Eiriz's painting.

'I think so, up to a point, because well, up to a point she was a semi-invalid…all of her work always reflected these monsters, aggression, sadness, hopelessness… at least in those that we possess, 38 prints, 21 ink drawings… as well as two oil paintings which correspond to period when she was studying, more expressionist than impressionist, but you can see these traces there… that which we possess is all monsters, as we call them, those little or big monsters, deformed figures, mutilated, which don't have legs, which don't have arms…deformed eyes, very expressionist, very aggressive or at times pathetic or at times trying to distance themselves from the reality which surrounds them and this seems to me to be a reflection of her world, her life, in her work'. **3**

Referring to one of Eiriz's most well known works 'The Annunciation' she observes:

'…it is also a reflection of her illness, as I understand it, because she suffered when she was a child, she had poliomyelitis, she had to use an apparatus, she didn't walk well, therefore this interior world of hers of traumas, I don't know, (turning to Avelino Couceiro)… help me with the words because I don't know…'. **3**

Of the same painting Fabelo observes that Eiriz had a black sense of humour.

'When you see the painting 'The Annunciation', you can see it (her dark humour) it is a woman who is sewing, a Señora who is sewing and it appears (the angel) all of a sudden…and it frightens her, you can see that that the woman is frightened. All of these works that she made refer to diverse themes related to our own psychology and to our characters'.12

Despite the fact that Eiriz's work refers to Juanelo, it seems that she had some reservations about exhibiting it there. María del Carmen recalled that:

'…one thing I can tell you is that when we held an exhibition in 1985 of her prints she was a little obstinate about her work being shown here in San

Miguel, that is to say, that her neighbours, her friends in the neighbourhood, would know her work. She was somewhat hidden that other person…because here in San Miguel she was known for papier mâche, as the initiator of papier mâche, not as an artist…she was afraid, this fear of the reaction of the community'. **3**

It is possible that Eiriz's reservations were connected to a previous experience of exhibiting work in the 1970's when her work was apparently criticised. The circumstances around this appear to have been understood in different ways by different people. Her neighbour and former pupil, Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo, referred to a specific painting and to a specific exhibition.

'She was misunderstood. She had her own way of doing things, of thinking. In the 1970's she made a work of art which was seen as counter-revolutionary. That is to say, in one respect… I saw a painting that they brought I don't know if they were Mexicans…it was an international exhibition, I think that it was one of the first of the 1970's …that huge exhibition… it was Fidel with his olive green suit…here in the hand, some testicles hanging down like this.. No? The penis was hanging down to the bottom of the painting, it was a foreshortened figure, seen from here (indicates). You can imagine the size that it was…indecent, or something… the painting was called *'El caballo'* (the horse).When they started to call Fidel that…because it was the name that stuck with him. Anyway, the work of Antonia it was like all of the things of the dead. No? But it was a tribunal. Fidel speaking and all of the people speaking, but he was in the form of a cadaver, everyone was a cadaver. Anyway, they put as a title *'El demagogo'* (The demagogue). But she said that it wasn't called that…that the painting was never called that. But they wanted to put that title and they took it out of the exhibition. That was the greatest harm that they could have done to her in her life, because she was a woman who worked, even though apparently it didn't seem so, but she worked for the Revolution. I don't have to go and stand at the corner of the street and shout 'I'm a revolutionary'… if I am doing social work for the revolution. Do you understand me? It did her a great deal of harm, she never painted again on a large scale and she dedicated herself to teaching'.**4**

María Rosa Almendros, who collaborated with Eiriz in the 1970's, became a close friend, although acknowledging that Eiriz had been affected by criticism, she refutes the notion that the arts were subjected to any political pressure. On the subject of the repression associated with the 1970's she was muted.

'It was a little difficult, but look… in the visual arts it was never too difficult, it was always very open, artists painted what they wanted to while not meddling in the Revolution, they painted in the style that they wanted.

That which happened with Antonia… Antonia was a very susceptible person and also a little proud, it seems she received criticism; someone gave her a bad criticism, saying that her painting reflected the Revolution, but in reality what it reflected was her problem… she told me that when she was little they said… there is a Spanish song which says 'Where does the little cripple go that miruflí, that miruflá' (nonsense words) … or rather they laughed at her, they made fun of her, all of that… I don't know, in some way it is not the same having two healthy legs as having one lame. No?' **9**

Dr Graziela Pogolotti, the vice-president of UNEAC (Union of writers and artists) and an admirer of Eiriz's work did not refer to any specific event but to the more general attitude adopted by Eiriz when I asked her why she thought Eiriz stopped painting.

'Well, in reality I asked her many times why she wasn't painting. She gave me many pretexts. She said that at that time she was better dedicating herself to a type of artisan work. She worked with fabrics and she told me that her relationship with painting was a secondary thing, that what she had always liked was… work more like crafts. I think…that this…this explanation was a kind of pretext, she perceived that her painting was not going to be well received, precisely because it was very aggressive painting, very critical…very passionate. With much anguish in relation to the human being'.**8**

I put the same question to Julia González Fornés, a ceramic artist, who knew Eiriz from the early 1960's and who was able to describe Eiriz's early career in some detail.

'There were various factors. One of them was the death of her mother. Antonia's mother was the person who really resolved all the domestic problems in the house that is to say, the cooking… they brought in someone to clean, but she really resolved all of these problems… Antonia had a physical defect, she had a son…resolving these domestic problems was complex, to cook in the morning and in the evening. In the middle of the tremendous difficulties that we confronted in Cuba… and she lived in a very humble neighbourhood, where all these daily things were more difficult, because there was no gas, she had to cook with kerosene it was really… later this was resolved with a cooker and bottles of gas but materially they were difficult years for her. There were other problems, floods; everything came at the same time. There were criticisms as well for an exhibition, for a National Salon in 1970. She presented some works which evidently could have been criticisms of Cuba or of another country. But they were interpreted as if they were criticisms of Cuba and some words were said at the inauguration which I attended. She took it very much to heart, too much to heart, as if it had been a criticism of her and she felt that they should not have criticised her, but I don't think that that justifies her not painting. But as you know each person has his own way of seeing things'. **5**

Julia González Fornés stresses the multiple difficulties affecting Eiriz's daily life. She mentions 'floods', almost in passing. Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo also mentioned these floods in relation to Eiriz's house, which in 2000 was being rebuilt as a museum with funds received from a Swiss NGO and at that time resembled little more than a building site.

> 'This house which they are now making… there is a spring underneath. When *'las aguas'* (the rains) start here, this water begins to rise and it entered her house, all of the floors and the house was up to here in water (indicates approximately three feet). A woman who cannot walk and who has to use an apparatus… Can you imagine? To live life like that… she could not clear out the water; her neighbours came with buckets and cleaned it up for Antonia'.**4**

Julia González Fornés goes on to mention that in the 1980's Eiriz was able to dedicate herself to her art once more.

> 'She had better economic conditions, because in Cuba you could sell paintings. We had a very difficult period, in the first years of the Revolution…until the mid 1970's, in which you couldn't sell paintings. All of us worked as something else and painted in our free time. But when they acquired her work, the museum acquired a lot of work. Let's say, she had an economic status which permitted her… and I insisted with her… well, finally, she began painting, but she made ink drawings. There was not… she told me that for her… she felt that it would be very difficult for her to be able to paint in oils again. That is to say, already in the decade of the 1980's… she also did not feel physically well'.**5**

However, Migdalia Hernández Delgado, her teaching assistant from 1973, remembered that Eiriz stopped painting because it was said that she painted monsters.

> 'She stopped painting and she dedicated herself to impart this type of collective work. She said that that was a form of painting, on many occasions we said to her that she should continue painting, she always said no…that this work that she was doing was also a form of painting'.**6**

Fabelo suggests that the context and the time did in fact, at least in part, inform Eiriz's decision to abandon painting and the view he expressed is the most inclusive and comprehensive. He does not attribute her decision to a simple cause and effect but rather he acknowledges that there were probably a variety of reasons which we cannot ever really know.

'I don't know if it's risking too much trying to encounter the answer for her decision, it was her legitimate decision and it was a personal decision taken who knows for what reasons. The context, which was the 1970's, was a very difficult epoch, of certain incomprehensions, of intolerances and that could have been a factor, the opinion of some official could have had an influence; she was a very sensitive person, a person very loyal to her ethical and artistic principles, very consistent and perhaps she preferred to retire herself from that scenario and do something…which I believe has been very valuable and also important, which was all of the work that she did in the extension of culture, to work in Juanelo and involve so many people and to know how to make good use of it as well, which has a lot to do with it, the sense a little naive, a little primitive which the things that the people made had and that position, that situation of purity that there was in the people who had never entered into contact with work like that and she revealed a lot to these people of what they were capable of and extracted from these people their fantasies, a popular imagination that was revealed in these pieces with relatively very humble materials: papier mâche, which was a little, in the middle of the scarcity and the material necessities of this country. It was very prudent of her, very wise of her to find a humble medium which did not demand great resources, where they recycle materials; I think all of that is an act of creation, also on her part, but also it is an act of creation with something that has always been of great interest in this society and that is the extension of culture, to draw the people closer to art, the extension of culture in all areas…for me it was one of the most revolutionary things that was done in that moment…to activate a group in the direction of creation…I read that she had a magnificent relationship with the villagers, they loved her very much…I think that she retired herself, someone said, that phrase: 'A withdrawal at the right time is a victory'. No, I think that perhaps a number of factors could have had an influence, the context which wasn't very favourable perhaps, some…and luckily in the long term it was not successful, a certain tendency of some officials to impose some models, but in Cuba there is a strong tradition of modernism and it was very difficult to impose strange models which restricted the imagination because our culture is very rich, there is a tradition of cultural diversity amongst the people, all these factors together permitted…and the political will of intelligent authorities noticed that it was not a direction that could be allowed, and so the decade of the 1970's was very difficult in this sense and very closed, with a certain censorship and auto censorship by the people as well'.**12**

In the above section I have under the broad descriptive theme of 'The Particular Influence of Antonia Eiriz', described something of her life and background as perceived by those who knew her. Following Grounded Theory the analysis may now progress to a higher level of abstraction, albeit that following the axiom of constant comparative analysis, these more abstract themes or categories may in turn be broken down and reconstituted as new categories emerge.

Analytic Theme: Eiriz as a Symbol of the Revolution

A review of this descriptive category suggests that Eiriz captured people's interest and imagination. Enough was known about her to make her very real and tangible but the areas of ambiguity particularly around her experience of her disability and her censorship provoke speculation. When we speculate we are prone to fall back on our own experience and our speculations or guesses often say more about ourselves and our own perception of the world than they do about the object of our speculation. In the case of Antonia Eiriz there is a considerable amount of cross referencing amongst respondents. Fabelo mentions her somewhat grave character in relation to her teaching and in the same context mentions her disability. Cernuda refers to her disability in relation to her painting while Almendros, Lazo and González, at least in part, make mention of it in relation to censorship. This cross referencing, between artist, disability and censorship, seems to be underpinned by a search for cause and effect on the part of the respondents. It occurs to me that this search for understanding, which is couched in chronological terms by most respondents, can be said to represent something of the course of the Cuban Revolution itself. The descriptive theme of artist and teacher encompasses Eiriz's talent and potential as an artist but her contribution as a teacher locates her in the social world - a new post revolutionary world full of promise and idealism. Secondly, her status as a woman along with her ill-health and disability can be thought of as references to struggle, to fragility and to human vulnerability and this theme seems to represent what many continue to experience as the daily struggles of life in post Revolutionary Cuba, what is in common speech referred to as '*la lucha*', the struggle. Thirdly, the ambiguity around her censorship, self-inflicted or otherwise was not and is not an unknown phenomenon to my respondents. In Cuba one is careful about what one says and to whom. These themes can then be thought of as being metaphors of the Revolution itself; beginning with great promise, not all of which has been fulfilled, and at a human cost difficult to estimate. Finally, Eiriz remained in Cuba when many intellectuals and artists went into exile. Endlessly resilient and adapting to circumstance at every turn she displayed an extraordinary capacity for endurance against internal and external difficulties. These qualities or attributes, along with her sense of humour seem to me to describe something about the Cuban people themselves.

Descriptive Theme 2: The significance of the papier mâche movement in community development work.

Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo, another neighbour, became her student and collaborator. According to Rodríguez Lazo, Eiriz encouraged her interest in art and offered her classes; teaching her 'in one year what she taught the students at San Alejandro in four years'.**4**

She explained that both she and Eiriz were involved in the CDR (Committee for the Defence of the Revolution). These neighbourhood bodies were formed in 1960 to consolidate grassroots support for the Revolution. Later the CDR's played a decisive role in health, education, social and voluntary labour campaigns. In 1970, Rodríguez Lazo had the role of neighbourhood organiser for the local CDR in Juanelo, while Eiriz had responsibility for education and culture. Part of this role involved organising activities for the local children, as diverse as painting a mural to organising a sack race. Eiriz, however, wanted to do something different and proposed teaching the children how to make puppets and tableaux or scenarios. Rodríguez Lazo became her assistant.

> 'Between the two of us we began to make and teach the children how to make puppets with paper and we made clothes and dressed the puppets. The tableaux, we made with cardboard and coloured paper. For the puppet show, the children came and sat down and she encouraged them to speak amongst themselves, and make up stories, and she took notes. From this came the dialogue…from the words of the children… and afterwards the children with their puppets mounted the show. A great '*comparsa*' (reunion or meeting, sometimes a musical occasion) was prepared which won a prize, all dressed in newspaper…the clothes, the suits, everything made of paper. They paraded from here all over the neighbourhood. Afterwards they were invited to parade in Guanamacoa… all the children from the neighbourhood…and I, dancing in front of the procession with all of them with drums and everything. The people in the street, lighting matches to light up the clothes. It was tremendous, because imagine, this had never been seen before'.**4**

Rodríguez Lazo describes how they continued and started classes of papier mâche in 1970 and 1971. Eiriz simplified the technique. A form or shape was made of a figure, a bird or a fish in paper. It was so simple that according to Rodríguez Lazo 'anyone could do it'.**4**

According to Rodríguez Lazo, although they began working with children they soon were teaching families. Children would take their work home but their mothers would throw it out as rubbish. The children would then come crying to Eiriz and she then decided to integrate the parents in the activity so that they could appreciate their children's work. Every night a house in the neighbourhood was designated. A bucket of flour based glue was prepared and newspapers, paper and wire were taken there, and the whole family worked. The finished works were at that time painted with old tempera paint which was boiled up with water to make it usable. This old paint, which was Eiriz's own, was also used by the local housewives to paint the walls of the street with flowers and birds.

María Gutiérrez describes Eiriz's papier mâche classes in her own particular way.

> 'She fell in love, she married, and she had a son. She spent her honeymoon in New York...and then came the question of papier mâche. One Sunday night she came and said 'María, I'm going to give papier mâche classes'. I said, 'Ay no, no, I don't want any of that, I don't understand it nor want to learn how to do it'. She went to another neighbour and when she came back I had made a butterfly, in my manner, my own idea'.**10**

A later interview with María Rosa Almendros clarified how the work begun in Juanelo developed. Almendros, at that time worked for *'El grupo de desarollo de communidades';* The Community Development Group. This group were primarily involved in a very pragmatic form of social work, teaching the people of rural communities how to use basic utilities like running water, how to clean and so forth. As a trained artist, Almendros was interested in culture and in developing cultural activities.

> 'What we encountered in the villages… was that culture was a combo…do you know what a combo is? A musical group, they call them a combo when there is one who plays the drums, one who plays the trumpet and another who plays the guitar, but there was nothing else, anyway I began but there was no budget'.**9**

Almendros recalled how in 1971 she received a call from Eiriz, whom she knew but not very well, to invite her to the procession of puppets previously referred to. She went, preoccupied with *'el frente'*, (literally the front, a military term employed to describe

the continuing revolutionary activity in social development) in which she had the responsibility of developing cultural activities without a budget. When she saw the newspaper, she found her solution, for as she pointed out to me, at that time newspaper and flour were available. Paint could be found. Eiriz had used alternatives from the pharmacy; gentian violet, blue methylene, red aseptil and some pastilles for the kidneys which were yellow. Eiriz, observed Almendros, had found a solution for everything.**9**

At this time everything, Eiriz's activities with her local CDR were well underway and Almendros immediately saw the possibilities for rural communities and asked Eiriz to come and help her.

> 'She said to me 'yes, why not'; you know that she had polio, that she had special shoes and a walking stick, but she was used to suffering, a person who could bear a lot, and we went to the communities, we had three or four communities here between Havana and Varadero; Jibacoa, the new community not the traditional one, Flor de Itabo, Peña de Leon and another.'.**9**

These communities were Almendros and Eiriz's 'laboratory'. Here they tried things out which if they worked could be applied at national level. Almendros recounted how it started very well. She went on a weekly basis with Eiriz mostly to Jibacoa where they gave classes mostly to women, as at first men were reluctant to become involve, although finally some did. Eiriz was apparently surprised at how well things went, because as Almendros explained 'in the cities people are permeated by culture and we are speaking about subculture'. At that time there was no television in these communities; they were relatively isolated. However, according to Almendros they spontaneously made magnificent objects.

> 'It was a revelation for Antonia and for me, to see that people who had never used a brush…for example, when we gave the class we never said that we were going to paint or draw, we said we were going to decorate, because the people said no, 'I don't know how to paint, I don't know how to draw' but she taught them that you could make a border with a dot and a line and therefore gave them liberty'. **9**

Things went well and Almendros and Eiriz went further afield travelling to different parts of the island to give classes. In Havana, Almendros gave classes in one of the

CDR's in Havana, the Community Development Group, and in primary and secondary schools concluding that 'it worked with everyone'.**9**

Money was always a problem.

> 'The funny thing was that we didn't have paint, because we didn't have a budget…I went to the house of friends of mine, painters and I stole their brushes, I asked them for paint, I went to the Ministry of Culture and asked for paint, I went to the Ministry of Education and asked them for paint, I went to the Provincial Government, I told them lies, because they said to me 'Why don't you go to the National?'… when we saw that the thing worked and it was true every peasant could do it, every child, every woman and every old person, everyone… we decided to do it at national level but we could not go to every community…we went to some but there was not enough time, because there were many new communities, there were 300 or so at that time…therefore we decided to bring a person from each community here to Havana and make a course of 15 days, a little course, so that they could learn and afterwards go back and teach…these women (shows me a photograph) who more or less had a certain affinity with culture and with art or had a manual ability'.**9**

This short course took place in La Coronela, outside Havana, near the neighbourhood of Miramar at a house lent to them. The course started with art appreciation. A teacher came and showed slides, introducing the students to the history of art from cave paintings, classical art, and art from different cultures (including Chinese and Indian art), to modern art. Students were asked to draw something that they liked and the majority drew a Greek vase. María Rosa Almendros did not offer an explanation for this preference. However, it is interesting to note as these forms are admired for their structural simplicity and for their decoration which in the best examples achieve a unity, in the sense of a near perfect marriage, of form and decoration.

The students were also taken to the National Museum.

> 'We were in the gallery that held English painting…and one said to the other: 'Look well because probably they are going to make us draw something of these, concentrate'. Poor thing, but well all of them made wonderful work, they were very happy, I was too and so was Antonia. It was a beautiful course. Afterwards each one returned to their village and taught'.**9**

These students came from *los pueblos nuevos* or the new villages. María Rosa Almendros explained how these villages were constructed after the Revolution and

inhabited by *campesinos* or peasants. Previously the Cuban peasant had lived in relative isolation. According to Almendros they preferred to live this way – 'they did not like to cluster…living several kilometres apart from each other'. However, new villages were constructed in order to provide access to amenities, such as schools, doctors and so forth, Apparently, this change was difficult – 'people didn't like it…some liked it, the young people, they liked moving to a new village, because they had a cinema, everything, the children had the doctor, it had a *bodega* or shop'. **9**

Almendros recalled that in one of these villages, El Tablón, a museum was made in an old '*bohío*' or hut. These simple traditional buildings have thatched roofs and earth floors. They have one or two rooms, simply furnished, and an area for cooking with wood and coal. Large papier mâche figures were made; an old woman cutting wood, a peacock, a goat, a man. Some children and local people donated items from their own homes to depict the traditional lifestyle of the Cuban *campesino* (peasant). She also mentioned the participation of the *papielista (papier mâche worker)* in the theatres which were opened in the new villages, indicating their participation and that of musicians, actors and other artists which had made a significant contribution to helping consolidate these new communities by introducing a shared cultural life.

> 'The papier mâche people helped us with the theatre, and to mount exhibitions, they were already open to new things, because generally the peasant was a little backward, he had a fear of new things…the theatre people, the musicians, the papier mâche people , they all helped us'.**9**

In 1972 the first exhibition of papier mâche work was held in the neighbourhood of Juanelo and according to Rodríguez Lazo, everyone participated. Cardboard boxes were used to display the work. The exhibition was a success and was attended by many of Eiriz's artist friends.

Apparently, Eiriz herself never made anything of papier mâche nor did she ever paint any finished object apart from on one occasion.

> 'She never made papier mâche. She created the technique and she taught the people how to do it. But she never made papier mâche. I only remember one piece that Antonia made, which was the piece that she made for Pablo. She

made him a Russian soldier when Pablo was studying at the university. Her son studied Russian at the university'. **4**

María del Carmen Cernuda confirmed this, stating her unawareness of any work in papier mâche by Eiriz with the possible exception of a large jar or vase for flowers in the museum's possession which some people said she had a hand in making. **3**

Nasser differs in his interpretation based on a conversation with Eiriz.

> 'Antonia never made works of papier mâche, or rather, never signed a work. There are some, very few, that I know she made from the beginning to the end, but she expressed herself with other mediums, not making papier mâche. I think, from some conversations I had with her, that she did it because in the beginning, when people started to see the things that they were capable of making, the children, the old people, the common people, they said it was a lie that they hadn't made them and that it was Antonia who had made them. Because of this Antonia never made works in papier mâche, she never signed one work. But I know that there are two pieces, one in the Municipal Museum of San Miguel del Padron, which she begun and she finished because the people, who she gave the work to, I know, never had time to do it, but there are two pieces which if I didn't know about… nobody could know because she never signed anything'.**1**

Both Julia González and Jorge Nasser related how Eiriz had been a teacher at the Escuela Nacional de Arte, or National Art School for many years. González mentions that this had been a very good experience for her and for the students she taught.

> 'Many painters who today have a name in Cuba and out with Cuba passed through Antonia's classes. I found in her always, a great help with my later work in art teaching because she was always a pedagogue. She liked teaching; she liked to pass on her knowledge to others. She really was always open to teach to others everything she could'.**5**

Nasser described how she adapted the ancient technique of papier mâche to circumstances in Juanelo.

> 'Antonia began to give classes in papier mâche to the children of her neighbourhood; specifically to the children…she tried to give an occupation to the children so that they wouldn't spend their time in the street throwing stones. It occurred to her that they could make a puppet theatre and she thought that they could have sewn them, but it turned out that the mothers didn't know how to sew…and the mothers of the boys and the

fathers…because of Cuban machismo would not let the boys sew. Afterwards it occurred to her that they could make puppets with plasticine, putty, but that also wasn't possible in that moment and she remembered the ancient technique of papier mâche, an ancestral technique, that came from Egypt. The problem was that there were almost none of the classical materials that were used in papier mâche to make the paste, therefore she innovated a much more simple new technique and radically minimised the fundamental elements to glue, paper and a little paint. Sometimes not even paint, sometimes it was coloured liquids from the pharmacy'.**1**

Regarding the shortage of materials and specifically of paint, Nasser, like Almendros, mentions the use of red aseptil, iodine, chrome mercury, bijol, pigments and carpenters varnish at the stage of decoration. He notes that her work in papier mâche was a completely personal thing - that it did not follow a methodology, nor was it directed - drawing attention to the fact that she was 'a great teacher of art' but making no mention of her involvement with the CDR or the involvement, referred to previously, by Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo. He makes some interesting comments regarding the work.

'Often we do not take into account that a piece of papier mâche is a painted sculpture, that is to say, it involves sculpture and painting…when they started to decorate, to paint these pieces, she explained to them the basic elements of design. She explained the theory of contrast, therefore this had to be different from the rest of artisan work which had as a model ancestral forms, or rather, copied from other techniques o simply ancestral, inherited from ancesters'.**1**

María Rosa Almendros described Eiriz's simplified technique in some detail. Traditionally, a paste was made with boiled paper and glue and a sculpture was modelled. Eiriz didn't do this, she made a basic shape from twisted paper, and whatever was suggested by this shape became the basis of the finished object. With cord, grass, or telephone wire, which could be found in the rubbish in the street, the basic shape was secured forming an armature. Glue was made from flour; cornflour could be used but was stickier. It was melted a little with tepid water and then when boiling more water was added. An aspirin or boric acid was added in order to prevent the work being eaten by bugs, although this didn't always prove much of a deterrent. Paper soaked in glue was then applied onto the basic form and the object built up in a succession of layers. It was then dried in the sun. When dry, it was covered in white paper or coloured paper if preferred. This provided the base for decoration. Once painted, the object was

varnished. The finished pieces weighed very little unlike traditional papier mâche which is heavy and solid.

Rodríguez Lazo describes Eiriz's approach to teaching in some detail in relation to painting the papier mâche pieces. Apparently, Eiriz explained how to decorate by using a combination of coloured lines of 'brilliant colours, red, blue, violet and green; and a dot and a line...with this dot and this line…in the way they were laid down, a design was made'. In this way basic elements of design and decoration were taught, for example, a man's eye was made by painting two curved lines and placing a large dot in the centre. Vertical lines placed above the eye created eyelashes. Two horizontal lines placed one above the other, became a border with zigzags. If a dot was placed in the triangles created by each zigzag, one had another type of border. Colours were placed next to one another, which seems to have been more difficult to teach people, for while there was no prescription relating to colour, it was been difficult to teach people that two brilliant colours placed together, they would fight for attention. Mixing colours was taught; how to make a green from blue and yellow for example, but the use of tertiary colours was discouraged as this was seen as being 'too far away from popular art'.[4]

A later conversation with the artist, Antonio Vidal revealed that Eiriz had drawn upon the work of Fritz Winter, who had written a book on Eastern European Folk Art, called 'Art of the People'.[13] Vidal remembered Eiriz showing him this book and suggested that she had drawn upon it in her papier mâche work. The art historian, Dr Teresa Crejo, later pointed out to me that the expressionist movement in Eastern Europe had been deeply influenced by folk art and that it followed that Eiriz would have been interested in such art as she herself was very much an expressionist painter.

In 1973 Migdalia Hernández Delgado visited an exhibition of papier mâche work by Eiriz's pupils at the Museum of Decorative Arts in Havana.

> 'I was fascinated, when I saw that exhibition, and I heard stories of people who never had any relation with the arts that could make such marvellous things. I was very enthused. The writer Onelio Jorge Cardoso, a good friend of mine, said to me, 'Go to Antonia's house in Juanelo, she will teach you'. I went one night to her house and there I began to make figures of papier mâche. I left with euphoria, a great happiness, to see that I too could do it and a little time afterwards…some months later, she gave a course at the

museum of decorative arts for people who wanted to go and who were interested. Therefore, I began to attend the course…there were several people, they were chosen from different neighbourhoods, the matriculation could not be very extensive, but well, they chose a group of students and we started the classes. I loved it so much that before finishing the course I brought the neighbours from my building together and began to teach them. Well, with fear I told Antonia that I was teaching my neighbours. Imagine! Without having yet finished the course how I …dared to teach, if I hadn't even finished the course. But she saw it as a good thing. We finished the course…and I finished the course with my neighbours. She came to the inauguration of the exhibition of their work in my building and opened it, enchanted with the work that I had done'. **6**

Hernández Delgado recalls how she became Eiriz's lady companion. Every time Eiriz gave a course, Hernández Delgado accompanied and assisted her. They gave courses to art instructors and artisans from all over the island. As a teacher, she described Eiriz as a very special person who was very kind and generous; who 'shared all her professional secrets'; who saw each person as capable of being an artist or of realising an artisan work.

I asked Rodríguez Lazo if there was scope for students to express themselves or make more personal objects.

'Of course. For example…this depended on each of the individuals who were learning…or who learnt…because in those moments many people learnt. There are some who have to create and because of that they need to be a creator and there are others who don't, some make papier mâché to sell however they can't make art…because they are not creators…they are only making it as an activity. Because of that, of those left…there are very few creators of papier mâché…the rest are *papielistas* (papier mâché workers) who make papier mâché to sell'.**4**

Rodríguez Lazo went on to elaborate on this distinction between creator and papielista. She explained the enormous difference between the commercial and creative object. The commercial object was greatly simplified by the worker. Technically, these commercial objects are usually constructed over a base of cardboard, reinforced with wire and then covered with two or three layers of paper before being painted. In her opinion an artistic piece of work is different and she makes a clear distinction between one and the other based firmly in the manner of production.

'I always stayed much more in the artistic line than the commercial. I made very few commercial objects. It's the only thing that no-one asks me to do because it pains me very much to be repeating and making things to sell. I do it for necessity…I have to live…I have to eat…but it is the minority of the work that I do. I prefer to be commissioned. Many people commission me to make tables and chairs. Baúles (trunk or chest) I love to make chests, artistic, very big with many decorative elements. Making many images, I love images. Commercial work makes me hysterical when I have to do it. Therefore the difference (between the artistic and the commercial object, the creator and the papielistas) is that some create and others repeat'.**4**

Rodríguez Lazo, who continued to teach, elaborated on her concept of the creative in relation to teaching. 'I can teach you the technique, but create… that has to be you…I teach you how to do it, then you have to create, in your way and in your manner'.**4**

Nasser refers to Eiriz as not 'following a methodology' and it is worth noting that Almendros referred to the work undertaken in the communities as being her and Eiriz's 'laboratory', where they experimented; interested to discover if what they witnessed as being the benefits of the workshops might be applied on a national level. Her ability to improvise; to make use of whatever materials were available to her; in her non-directive approach to teaching and in what might described as her hands-off approach all imply a trust in the creative capacity of the other. Hernández Delgado refers to Eiriz's conviction of everyone's innate creativity when she states 'her thesis was that everyone is capable of being an artist'. Rodríguez Lazo discusses creativity when she makes the distinction between the creator and producer of papier mâché. Her distinction is firmly rooted in the activity production and she insists that while all may be capable of producing, only a few will go on to create. The producer or the *papielista* engages in repetition for the commercial market. The construction of the work is simpler and she seems to infer that there is no emotional investment. Conversely, the creator is engaged in the work, the construction more complex and repetition avoided. Rodríguez Lazo seems to offer a narrower definition of creativity than Eiriz based on what might be thought of as a level of engagement or emotional investment manifest in the creation process.

Abstract Theme: Inventiveness

The notion of inventiveness surfaces in relation to these extracts. What is clear is that Eiriz, Almendros and others were working with extremely limited material resources in

undeveloped communities. There are continual references to the need for adapting, as in using pharmaceutical materials when there was no paint, and or in a more abstract sense, as in teaching approaches. This notion of inventiveness within the context of community development seems connected to the idea of waking people up to what they can do with the resources they have at their disposal and to their own resourcefulness.

Descriptive Theme 3: Art as Therapy

In the following section I will explore the descriptive theme of art as a therapy with reference to the following sub-themes:

- **The perception of papier mâché work as therapeutic.**
- **The perception of the aesthetic in relation to the therapeutic.**
- **The emphasis on the process of making in terms of activity.**
- **The limited role of verbal exploration.**
- **The importance of the notion of intention with respect to therapeutic work.**
- **The importance of making money.**

Sub-theme: The perception of papier mâché work as therapeutic

Recalling Eiriz's other pupils; Rodríguez Lazo mentioned two extended families - the family of Patricio Fromeda and the large family of Fernández and Rodríguez. She also mentioned Ubaldo 'Papo' Gutiérrez who had suffered from schizophrenia. According to Rodríguez Lazo, Papo was a great creator.

> 'Antonia began to teach him. He was a great creator, but a creator…his works were for example, masks …like aliens. These beasts were horrendous, but very beautiful because of the colour. All the elements he used, antennae, eyes popping out, were what he saw in his internal world. But they are beautiful things. They like his work, more than anywhere else, in Spain. There are people who have collections of his masks in Spain. Friends of Antonia came and afterwards commissioned masks. They take his masks for the gallery, but few because he takes…up to three months making one of these masks because they are gigantic…what happened is that he is limited because he must take care of his mother and do everything in the house…he has very little time to work, but he is a great creator in his own way. He applies the technique that Antonia taught him, that yes, he maintains that technique, the dot and the line. He keeps that alive, because we for example… they asked us to include other elements. They asked us,

for example, a dividing line…the outlining of pieces, which he doesn't do. He puts the colour side by side and then fills in all the space with all the colours that occur to him. He never outlines a piece'.**4**

I asked Rodríguez Lazo if she thought that for Papo, papier mâche and the work he had done with Eiriz had been a form of therapy. Although on retrospect this question seems somewhat closed in that I used the word therapy which could have been construed in any manner of ways, Rodríguez Lazo replied without hesitation.

'Of course! It was an enormous therapy for him…when he has his moments of crisis, is when he works. When he works it is because it is a moment of crisis and therefore he unloads into the work he is making…in that moment of crisis. Because if not, he got angry, with his stepfather, in these crisis he got angry with his mother…however, when he had a crisis…he worked, making papier mâche making paper forms and adding things…and he unloaded everything…or rather, I consider this work to be an important therapy for people who have mental problems, but also for housewives, for children, I think for everyone, because everyone is stressed'.**4**

Papo's work also cropped up in my interview with María Rosa Almendros when she showed me a figure made and gifted to her by María Gutiérrez, his mother. Almendros was convinced that Papo's involvement in papier mâche, in becoming a 'creator' was not only therapeutic but verged on the curative.

'Papo's mother made marvellous things, but she lost her vision, she is almost blind…Papo was useless, he didn't speak to anyone, he spoke to himself all the time, or rather he was schizophrenic and didn't mix but through the papier mâche he became a normal person, of course he continued being a schizophrenic, he's half mad, but he works, he earns money. also he is very…he knows the value of his work, because he makes incredible masks, very strange masks, one time he had an exhibition in the Museum of Juanelo, in San Miguel de Padron…to announce it he made a complete human being, with legs, arms…but it didn't have a neck and Antonia said to him: 'Doesn't it have a neck Papo?' and he said to her 'They are like that'. Papo is an example of how to cure a person, he is not cured but he is a useful person and over more he speaks to you, has a discourse, argues…'.**9**

María Rosa Almendros described how Papo worked methodically using textbooks as sources of reference. In her opinion the work Eiriz did with Papo and with the Chilean women in Alamar was her greatest achievement.

I asked Migdalia Hernández Delgado if she considered any of the activities in which she had been involved as having a therapeutic aspect. She was convinced that they had albeit that they did not set out to give courses in papier mâché with this result in mind. The basis of her conviction was that she herself had found these activities therapeutic. She spoke of the pleasure of experimentation, and the satisfaction which one feels to be able to make something with one's own hands, 'a beautiful thing, an object which can transmit something to others…is a great personal satisfaction'.**6**

However, when I asked her if students ever expressed personal difficulty or conflict in their work she maintained that they did not and that the students who attended the classes only made beautiful things. I queried this by asking about the degree of liberty given to the student. According to Hernández Delgado there was 'a lot of liberty, in the colours, in the form, everything. She gave a lot of liberty. We could use whatever colours we liked best. Perhaps a psychologist could detect by the colours which each person employed…could detect whatever type of conflict. But in general terms one saw beautiful work'.**6**

The perception of the aesthetic in relation to the therapeutic.

The idea, implicit in Hernández Delgado's response is that the expression of conflict would not be by definition aesthetically beautiful. Thus if only beautiful things were made these could not be said to express personal difficulty. On the other hand, Rodríguez Lazo has no hesitation in referring to Papo's work as an expression of conflict which is at the same time beautiful. The question of beauty arose again quite spontaneously in my interview with María Rosa Almendros as did the notion of therapy in relation to her work with the Community Development Group.

> 'I had an experience with a doctor friend of mine who worked for the Community Development Group, an Argentinean. She was working with a group of Chilean women who had been in prison and whose husbands had disappeared…she asked me if I could go one afternoon to Alamar where they were living. They were women amongst who were some at the edge of suicide… and she saw that making these things (papier mâché) was a treatment, or rather, it functioned as a therapy, and it functioned very well'.**9**

The women that Dr Dina Dolinski treated in Alamar were refugees from Pinochet's dictatorship in the 1970's. Almendros described how one woman who had been in

prison gave birth. The child would not sleep because it transpired that the women, who had been tortured in prison, never put the light out.

She also referred to a colleague with whom she had worked at the beginning of the Revolution in *La Casa de las Americas* (House of the Americas). This colleague, the secretary to the executive, had to have an operation because she had a non malignant brain tumour. Almendros described how after the operation.

> 'She had to retire as she had changed very much, even her writing had changed, and she suffered from headaches…she retired from life, in the house, not doing anything…anyway, she came to my house two evenings a week and I taught her how to make papier mâche, not only did it wake her up but she made money from it, she sold and was able to earn money apart from her pension, a little more money, it was very positive for her, and she was content and happy…'.**9**

Following this I asked María Rosa Almendros if the woman she had described had spoken of her difficulties during the actual process of creating artwork.

> 'Yes, but the problem is that papier mâche is so passionate, that you don't speak much, or rather you speak about the work that you are doing, yes, afterwards, of course one speaks, afterwards she herself said to me 'Look, my handwriting is not the same as it was before, I have another handwriting… but I can paint'. She could do this manual work and she did it very well, with great rigour, she was very precise'.**9**

Almendros also mentioned the beautiful in relation to the work created by the Chilean women refugees when I asked if the women had shared their problems with her during the papier mâche workshop. 'Yes, they spoke, but little. They spoke more to the psychiatrist, but when one is making these things one doesn't want to speak about anything, one wants to make'.9

I then asked if in her opinion the Chilean women had expressed their difficulties in their actual work.

> 'No, no they made beautiful things. They tried to make beautiful things…something which is very gracious is that in Flor de Itabo, one of these communities…firstly, we taught them how to make a bird, which could be a peacock, which could be hen or a cockerel, afterwards we made

the turtle, which are easy things and afterwards the human figure…we noticed that a woman made a doll with no neck and I said to Antonia: 'Nica, it doesn't have a neck'. She said to me 'look at her and see if she has a neck'. She didn't have a neck either, that is to say, they reflected themselves in their work'.**9**

I queried as to whether this was done unconsciously.

'Unconsciously, that is to say, the canon of beauty for her is not to have a neck. Another thing happened …they made a bird which stood out as strange and we looked at it …it had four legs; someone said 'I'm going to take them off' and Antonia said: 'No, no if you want to make a bird with four legs make one with four legs, here you are like God and you can make whatever you feel like making, if you want a duck with four legs, make a duck with four legs'. **9**

The question of beauty is a theme which arose in my interviews with Almendros, Rodríguez Lazo and Hernández Delgado. In summing up their various viewpoints in relation to the expression of problems or conflict, Hernández Delgado seems to take the view that if something is beautiful it cannot therefore be said to express anything conflictual or problematic which is not to say that no difficulty existed in the artist but rather that it was not expressed at all or it that is not expressed as unbeautiful. She makes no mention of any of her pupils having any personal problems. Rodríguez Lazo has no difficulty acknowledging quite spontaneously that Papo's work expressed conflict but perceives his work as beautiful. When asked if the Chilean women expressed their difficulties in their actual work, Almendros replied in the negative, affirming that the works were beautiful. She appears to be in no doubt that the involvement with papier mâche was therapeutic albeit that no object was produced that was recognisable as representative of their terrible plight in the sense that Rodríguez Lazo describes Papo's work being clearly representative of his inner world.

There seems to be three points of view represented here:

- That **if** conflict or inner difficulty is in some way represented in the work of art it will **not** be beautiful **or** that while difficulty might be present in the artist it was not expressed **in a form** that is not beautiful **(Hernández)**

- That conflict and inner difficulty **can** be present but **not** represented in the work of art and yet the activity of making **can** be said to be therapeutic. 'They made beautiful things…they tried to make beautiful things…'.**9 (Almendros)**

- That conflict and inner difficulty **can** be present and **can** be represented in a work of art and **can** be beautiful and the activity therapeutic. 'All the elements he used, antennae, eyes popping out, were what he saw in his internal world. But they are beautiful things'.**4 (Rodríguez Lazo)**

I found these references to the aesthetic particularly interesting partly because in my own education as an art therapist I had learnt to suspend my own personal aesthetic responses and considerations in favour of a focus on what the client was trying to express. The following quote by Eiriz chimes with my own experience in its regard for the author of the art work.

'The canon of beauty for her is not to have a neck'.**9**

This comment reputedly made by Eiriz to Almendros, locates beauty in the eye of the creator; a notion that seems to have been championed, in this case, by Eiriz herself.

Sub-theme: The emphasis on the process of making and the limited role of verbal exploration.

All seem to agree that the activity of making papier mâche was therapeutic:

'I consider this work to be an important therapy for people who have mental problems, but also for housewives, for children, I think for everyone, because everyone is stressed'.**4**

'I am completely sure that the work with Antonia could be therapeutic, because it was in my own case'.**6**

'…making these things (papier mâche) was a treatment, or rather, it functioned as a therapy, and it functioned very well'.**9**

The language used here focuses on activity, making and work, implying that the process itself was therapeutic. It is notable that what is considered as therapeutic does not involve verbal exploration and that the emphasis is on the activity, the key words being 'work' and 'making'.

> 'the problem is that papier mâche is so passionate, that you don't speak much, or rather you speak about the work that you are doing, yes, afterwards, of course one speaks'.**9**

> 'Yes, they spoke, but little. They spoke more to the psychiatrist, but when one is making these things one doesn't want to speak about anything, one wants to make'.**9**

This emphasis on making, doing and work as opposed to verbal exploration might suggest an activity more akin to occupational therapy in its earlier incarnations than a form of psychotherapy. However to draw this conclusion would be to impose an *a priori* category upon the data, that is, to analysis it according to predetermined constructions. There is no mention in the data of these activities providing a distraction from any difficulty. Rather the data points to the activity as a form of engagement with the process which as previously pointed out was non-directive. There was no set task to achieve. Apart from explaining the basic procedures, the theory of contrast and some very basic elements of design Eiriz did not impose any restrictions on her pupils. On the contrary the data emerging in the previous category points to the fact that she encouraged each individual to create according to his own 'canon of beauty'; with or without necks and with as many feet as desired. What appears to be being communicated here is that the making of art itself is inherently therapeutic.

Sub-theme: The importance of the notion of intention with respect to therapeutic work.

Although all my respondents agreed that the work which Eiriz initiated was therapeutic they do so in a very general sense. There is no evidence that Eiriz set out to do therapeutic work although there is some evidence of therapeutic outcomes.

Julia González made this explicit in our interview when I asked her if Eiriz was interested in psychology or if she in any way saw herself as a therapist.

'I don't think it was really that which animated her or motivated her, yes, I think that she had…a feeling that all human beings had inside themselves this wealth of creativity and she enjoyed awakening this wealth of creativity, that is what I remember…it seems to me that she never worked linked to any hospital…I think that in the background, Nica, if she was interested in what you are asking about, that is to say, a work of that nature, what I think she did, perhaps unconsciously, that is to say, she wanted to wake up these sleeping faculties which according to her every human being has, to create, to express questions or doubts which he has deep inside himself and let it loose …from this point of view, although in the background, she could have had a psychological grasp of the problems. She was…a very natural person, in the sense…not at all affected …in the sense that she was very intuitive and perhaps in that way…she presented herself like that. There are people who go more concretely to achieve determined objectives…she may have achieved these same objectives almost without proposing them, that to say, helping to wake up nothing more than these…feelings, these sleeping faculties'.**5**

Julia González seems to be proposing that one of the implications in 'waking up' people's creativity is that they will then express themselves and that Eiriz was aware of this. This is an important point because she herself had abandoned painting when what she was expressing was regarded by others as unacceptable.

Another key point which emerges from González's commentary is the notion of context. When people came to participate in the workshops they were not going to see a psychologist or to receive therapy. Ostensibly they were attending a workshop in papier mâché. Any therapeutic benefit was achieved almost as a side effect of their engagement in the creative process because it seems quite clear that this was not Eiriz's stated objective. However, she did provide a context, materials, encouragement and an understanding that creativity and the expression of personal material were intrinsically linked. There is no evidence in any of the data that she tried to influence the direction of any of her pupils' expression.

'She said to me, laughing,' Now the artist and the creator is Papo'. 'Listen Julia, it is very curious because now it's turned out that it is as if I am acting for Papo. He comes and asks me, I need this and I need that…as if I were his supplier…of all the things he will need. Now he is the artist and I am something else'.**5**

In the above fragment there is some indication that Eiriz became aware that her role, in the case of Papo, had changed. She was no longer his teacher. Having 'awakened' his

creativity she assumed the role of facilitator or to use her own words his 'supplier'. Almendros also points to Papo's growing sense of autonomy when she states that 'he is not cured but he is a useful person and over more he speaks to you, has a discourse, he argues'. The implication here is that creativity, self expression and a growing sense of autonomy as a sign of health are being linked.

Ulises Cruz who of all my respondents was most familiar with the notion of art as a therapy knew Eiriz. His opinion regarding her intention was remarkably similar to that of Julia González. Interestingly, an analysis of the interview transcript revealed that I had asked him about Eiriz's intention in the form of a closed statement. I do not recall doing this intentionally although it appears page 24 of the transcript indicating that the interview had been going on for some time.

Margaret:

I don't think that Antonia Eiriz had a very psychological orientation; I think her work was more social.

Cruz:

'Yes, but the psychological part came into her work unconsciously, or rather, she studied each case and the things that could limit a person, their psyche, and without being aware of it she presented that without trying to'.**15**

Cruz's notion that she studied 'each case, the things that could limit a person, their psyche' and presented or projected this interest without being aware of it, is equally interesting and chimes with Julia González's observation that 'she was…a very natural person, in the sense…not at all affected …in the sense that she was very intuitive and perhaps in that way…she presented herself like that'.**5**

Interestingly, both respondents state that she assumed this role unconsciously, that is, without conscious intention.

These extracts raise questions about nomenclature and language.

Sub-theme: The importance of making money.

Julia González pointed out another important factor in relation to Eiriz's intentions.

'Another important thing was that she helped many of these people find a way of sustaining themselves economically, for example, these pieces which they made of papier mâche, were sold afterwards to a department of tourism in Cuba, to sell to tourists…this really was one of one of the things that I encounter…that was very important, one part the medium of artistic expression and the other part a possibility to create new sources of material revenue which were very necessary for these people'.**5**

Almendros makes a similar point in the same context as describing work which she considers to have been therapeutic.

'I taught her how to make papier mâche, not only did it wake her up but she made money from it, she sold her work and was able to earn money apart from her pension, a little more money, it was very positive for her, and she was content and happy…'.**9**

The issue of money is an important one and marks an important distinction between practices undertaken in what is referred to as the developed world and the realities of its underdeveloped counterpart. I am well aware that the idea that patients might make money from a therapeutic activity would be an anathema to some therapists, certainly those working in the psychodynamic tradition. In art therapy as it is practiced in the UK the art object is regarded as clinical material and usually held in safe keeping by the therapist, at the very least, for the duration of the therapy.

However, it is worth considering the possibility that quite apart from therapeutic considerations such as containment, confidentiality and so forth the idea of selling a work made in a therapeutic context is a practice that carries negative connotations. The sale of work is often associated with industrial therapy or occupational therapy workshops in the old state mental hospitals when objects, often assembled from kits, were made up by patients and sold. Calzadilla Fierro's (1998) account of Cuban psychiatry before the Revolution makes no references to such activities. My understanding when I visited a number of workshops, including basketry and pottery, at the Mazorra Hospital in 1999 was that they had been established under the new regime post 1959; as such they were viewed positively. Artefacts made by patients were sold to

visitors. The work was craft based and did not involve any menial or subcontracted work from any other agency. This suggests that there are no negative connotations connected to this practice as there may be in other contexts with different histories.

In my view the importance of money is relative to need and survival and must be contextualised.

Abstract Themes: Creative Engagement as Therapy and, Empowerment as a Therapeutic Outcome.

A review of these descriptive sub-themes as grouped under the broader descriptive theme of art as therapy suggests a very Cuban practice informed by a multiplicity of variables. Amongst these variables I would identify a focus on the activity of making papier mâche art works and the very process of making, as being therapeutic in itself. This is supported by the data emanating from three of the sub-themes:

- **The perception of making papier mâche as therapeutic.**
- **The emphasis on the process of making.**
- **The limited role of verbal exploration.**

These three sub-themes may therefore be collapsed and regrouped as the abstract theme Creative Engagement as Therapy.

Empowerment as a Therapeutic Outcome

The therapeutic outcomes as identified by several respondents are addressed in the three remaining sub themes:

- **The perception of the aesthetic in relation to the therapeutic.**
- **The importance of the notion of intention with respect to therapeutic work.**
- **The importance of making money.**

These outcomes appear to be increased personal autonomy and self esteem as a result of the emphasis on process and the realisation that people are able to create and create

beautiful things. The fact that these beautiful things can then be sold must be contextualised with reference to the impoverished economic situation of the participants. Arguably increased economic power may also lead to increased self esteem and autonomy and this is suggested by Almendros and González Fornés. From these latter sub-themes, that is, the perception of the aesthetic in relation to the therapeutic and the importance of making money, the abstract theme of empowerment emerges.

Summary

In this chapter I have presented and discussed the data emanating from a series of interviews with artists and community workers who had worked with Antonia Eiriz Vásquez. The bulk of the material pertains to work conducted in the 1970's and 1980's and represents one of the most important and best documented examples of Cuban cultural democracy that I am aware of.

I shall refer to this work as 'art-as-therapy' because the emphasis here is on the process of creativity and expression. This term has been used by Kramer (2000) to describe similar activities. I use this term descriptively and there is no intention to impose any *a priori* category. However, Wertheim-Cahen (2004) offers a definition of this term that does in part seem to describe Eiriz's approach. She notes that depending on the setting in which art therapy takes place, the focus can be merely on the images that evolve from the art making process or on the healing qualities of the art making process itself. In what she refers to as the 'art-in-therapy' approach, art making is often goal orientated and subservient to a stricter medical-psychological structure. According to Wertheim – Cahen (2004) the main focus here lies on articulation of the meaning of the image in order to help its creator gain better insight into his or her situation (Wertheim-Cahen, 2004, p. 421). Conversely, in the 'art-as-therapy' approach the emphasis is on the very activities of painting or working with clay. Here it is asserted that experimenting with materials will easily evoke all kinds of emotions as do the resulting images. Furthermore she makes the point that the meaning of these images does not necessarily have to be articulated, and it frequently remains implicit (Wertheim-Cahen, 2004, p.421). It is however important to point out that Wertheim-Cahen (2004) is referring to two named approaches which are in practice underpinned by psychological or psychotherapeutic theory and considerations. Thus the adoption of an 'art-as-therapy' approach may be indicated in certain contexts with certain client groups and/or at

certain stages in the course of therapy and should not be taken to suggest that meaning is not considered by the therapist. In the anglophile bibliography examples of such considerations are made explicit in the writings of Killick (1997) and Greenwood (1997) in relation to working with patients suffering from psychosis.

In the case of Eiriz's work such clinical considerations as informed by psychotherapy theory were clearly not at play and the adoption of such an approach was informed by other factors such as her deeply held belief in the potential creativity of the individual.

Chapter 5

Collaborative Working

Introduction

In the previous chapter I examined the data pertaining to the relationship between art and therapy where the primary intention was not to provide therapy but rather to awaken people's creativity. This work was undertaken by individuals who were primarily artists in settings that were community based. There is no indication of any collaboration with health care professionals apart from Dr Dina Dolinski at whose request Almendros and Eiriz worked with female political refugees from Chile. In this chapter I shall present the data pertaining to collaborative work, that is, work undertaken by artists in collaboration with mental health professionals with the stated intention of being therapeutic.

Psico Museo

In the following section I shall briefly refer to the work undertaken by Jorge Nasser, an art historian and former curator at the Museum of Juanelo. Nasser was my original 'gatekeeper', who facilitated my contact with the pupils of Eiriz. He had since become a papier mâché artist himself and it was he who raised the subject of further developments in the field. Nasser reported having developed a style of working which he refers to as *psico-museo*, or psycho-museum. He describes his early experiences as being mainly realised in the San Miguel del Padron and in the communities on the outskirts of Havana where he realised innumerable courses of papier mâché with children and adults. In the 1980's Nasser estimated that he probably ran something in the region of 300 courses in marginal neighbourhoods, residential homes for the elderly, nurseries and to nursery school instructors so that they could then teach. However, his later development of psico-museo he considers of greater consequence.

> 'Overall of the most consequence and that which for me was the most enriching was psico-museo…an activity perhaps invented a little by me which tried through various techniques…music, the arts papier mâche, games, yogic concentration, storytelling to engage in group therapy, children with different problems…of personality, conduct, hyperkinesia…, through in collaboration with a clinic for children and adolescents which

exists in the municipality of la Balear which went on for five years and which produced very satisfactory results'.**1**

Having never heard of *psico-museo* I asked for further clarification. Two descriptive themes emerge from his account. These are:

- **The precedence of practice.**
- **Responsiveness**.

Descriptive Theme 1: The Precedence of Practice

'It was an interdisciplinary group, or rather, there was a psychiatrist, a psychologist a social worker and an educational psychologist and I made the part of occupational therapy. The group dynamic was realised a little spontaneously, for the first two years we didn't really have a real methodology rather the methodology was founded or based in the practice'.**1**

Nasser then went on to offer some descriptions of the work undertaken.

'Anecdotes, there are very interesting anecdotes and overall those which I can tell you are those which interest me on a personal level, one very special case was a boy who was nine years old and who was behind at school by one grade (year). His younger brother had to help him with him studies. He was in the same class as his little brother and affected by the idea that he might be overtaken by him. He was very slow, he could not differentiate between the fingers of his hand, he had difficulty differentiating colours and when I saw him for the first time I thought that he was a sub normal child. The doctors with more experience said he was not but he seemed as if he was. We started work with him, with stories, modelling in papier mâche and one day I was telling the story of the Hanging Gardens of Babylon…a little novel…and I told them that 'Nebuchadnezzar' had been the one that had been sent by the others to see if the place from where the princess came from in the desert had flowers…the boy was listening, this child who could not differentiate his fingers from his thumb…in the next class I set out to carry on, or rather try to remind him of what we had been talking about in the previous class, I had sent them to do drawings…I pretended not to remember the name of the prince, and this child said to me 'Nebuchadnezzar'. He began to advance, later he told us his problem, his mother had left the country, and she had abandoned him. His father had never occupied himself with the boy, the father had been a bus driver, when the father was a bus driver, the boy never wanted to get into a bus, and afterwards when he became a taxi driver the boy never wanted to get into a taxi. We continued the occupational therapy; the boy advanced and achieved the necessary results to be in his class. He showed us that he wasn't a handicapped child, he was a normal boy'.**1**

In this description of psico-museo, Nasser mentions the term 'occupational therapy' twice. However, he did not appear to be referring to a particular professional practice as he made it quite clear that he had received no specific training and he had previously referred to this work as *psico-museo*. I was keen to clarify why he then used the term 'occupational therapy'. I questioned him in some detail. His responses seemed to suggest that he felt that he had learnt quite a lot about diagnosis and the use of terminology. 'I had a great interest in really understanding what I was doing and I concentrated on the terms they (the medical staff) were using'.**1**

It transpired that after each session there was an exchange of ideas and opinions amongst the team. In this way, according to Nasser 'I tried in these sessions to ensure they understood what I was doing, with art, with storytelling and they taught me terms, psychology, psychiatry…specifically… as presented by the children'.**1**

He may well as he reports have ensured that the medical team at La Balear understood what he was doing but in the course of the interview, he communicated this to me in only the vaguest of terms. An analysis of the transcript of the interview offers no description of a working methodology although he does state early on in the interview that 'we didn't really have a real methodology rather the methodology was founded or based in the practice'.**1** However, he did not go on to describe this 'methodology founded in practice'.

There is no real indication of what the practice of *psico-museo* actually involved. The anecdote cited is not illuminating as it makes little reference to the use of art materials and at no point refers to what sort of psychological thinking was underpinning his practice. He never makes explicit what he believes is actually happening in these sessions. In the case example he offers there is no attempt to explain why this change in the child took place.

I pursued the connection with papier mâche asking him if he taught the children the technique.

> 'Yes, the technique of papier mâche, in the case of occupational therapy it is
> not the most adequate because it's a slow technique and it requires muscular

control. The group only met once a week, I worked with three different groups and because of this I worked all week but each group only came once a week and the work and because of this there wasn't much continuity…I sometimes made pieces that they decorated afterwards, nothing more, because there was no time. Later, yes, they made some courses for the children and they went three times a week…and they could use it much better'.**1**

This last extract rather belies his previous claim to have been using papier mâche in the context of therapy. Following on from this statement he referred to his numerous experiences of different sorts of employment asserting that these activities had prepared him for what he was later to do.

'Almost all of the things that that I have done in life have served me in what I later did, because before being a museum technician, I was a literary assessor and before being a literary assessor I taught artistic expression in nursery schools and storytelling helped me a lot… but it is what I learnt in the psico-museo courses that helped me explain to the adults…'.**1**

At this point in the interview Nasser diverged completely from his previous description of the work undertaken at La Balear which he had consistently referred to as '*ergoterápia*' or occupational therapy. Without any prior introduction to the subject he began to describe classes which he gave in Havana Vieja to unemployed women and men who were resentful because they had lost their work in the printing industry. According to Nasser these unemployed workers were not able to appreciate that what they were trying to give them was an option 'so that they would not just go to their houses and do nothing'. However, apparently the workers felt that they were being forced to do something that they weren't interested in.

'With what I had learnt in those courses (*psico-museo*) I could treat them a little…psychologically… so that they wouldn't reject the technique and today many of them are artisans…others went back to their posts when printing was revitalised, but the great majority changed after these courses, they had another way of looking at art, another way of life as well, because almost all were helped to gain a living with what they learned'.**1**

Following this I felt quite unclear as to where the interview was leading and I made a further attempt at clarification. I made it clear that I did not fully understand how public services worked in Cuba and asked if he had been employed by a museum at the same

time as working for the ministry of health during the time he had been involved in psico-museo.

He explained that museums had an activity called *'animación cultural'* which literally translates as cultural encouragement. This activity basically tries to offer different cultural options to different groups in the community such as dance, music or storytelling. According to Nasser, The Balear Clinic was a small population in the municipality, related to his museum. The clinic had a necessity and the museum team responded to it. Here Nasser breaks off to note that 'I don't think that in Cuba there was an antecedent of *psico-museo*, I don't know if it exists in the world but in Cuba there was no antecedent of *psico-museo'*.**1**

Descriptive Theme 2: Responding to Necessity
Resuming his narrative he informed me that the first times the museum team went to the clinic they offered the children the same experiences as they offered the healthy population; clowns, storytelling, visits to the museum but they realised that this was not sufficient.

> 'We noticed that it wasn't sufficient, that that didn't represent a useful tool for them. The clown did a number which wasn't in any way related to the pathologies that the children resented neither did the singer. Anyway we tried to make the things adequate and that how it arose…*psico-museo,* trying to meet that necessity'.**1**

I did not follow up this interview with Nasser. His work in psico-museo took place between 1985 and 1990 and he was at the time of our interview working as a papier mâche artist undertaking commissions. It would probably have been possible to have interviewed members of the medical team at La Balear but as the subject of psico-museo was never raised by any of my other respondents I did not actively pursue it.

I cannot evaluate Nasser's work in *psico-museo* on the basis of my interview with him. He did not impart sufficient information on which to base any real understanding of his therapeutic enterprise. Reading between the lines I suspect that it was a one-off project as he never referred to any developments leading on from it. I include it in this study as an idiosyncratic example of community based practice which appears, whatever its

merits may or not be, to have been a response to a need to find creative ways of working with troubled children which in turn indicates openness on the part of the medical profession to consider interventions involving the arts.

Abstract Theme: Responsiveness

The two descriptive themes that emerged from this interview were the precedence of practice and responding to necessity. The former refers to a practice based on experimentation; the latter as a response to necessity. However although it is asserted that practice informed a working methodology this methodology is not made explicit. What then emerges is the more dominant overarching theme of responsiveness on the part of Nasser and on the part of the medical team in terms of being prepared to experiment with various creative modalities.

The Work of Ulises Cruz

Introduction

Nasser suggests that the involvement of museums in cultural, community and therapeutic activities has no antecedents in Cuba and possibly not in the world. This transpires to not be the case. In the following section I will outline the work of Ulises Cruz from the early 1970's to the present day.

Ulises Cruz began working in the National Library of Cuba when after a period of ill health and a prolonged convalescence he was unable to resume his studies in architecture mid way through the academic year. Unable to re-matriculate he commenced work at the National Library where he was assistant to the draughtsman. When this person resigned the director of the library offered the post to Cruz.

Cruz took up the post and completed his studies at night at the University of Havana in the School of Arts and Letters, graduating in History of Art. At first this work consisted of working on the museum's publicity. However, in 1968 or thereabouts, he refers to what was to be a significant development that arose as a response to necessity which I had by now identified as a familiar theme in discussions relating to innovation in Cuba.

The descriptive themes which emerge from an analysis of the data pertaining to Cruz's work can be identified as:

- **Multidisciplinary collaboration.**

- **Social Inclusion: Artistic Activity as a Social Therapy**

Descriptive Theme 1: Multidisciplinary Collaboration

The following extract demonstrates the descriptive theme of multidisciplinary collaboration which is often underpinned by responsiveness to necessity and which repeatedly emerges from the data.

> 'The director called me to see if I could work with children, something which I could never have imagined before…because there was a necessity in the country for nursery schools…the Casas de Cultura, or cultural centres, had not yet opened and therefore the mothers whose children were artistically inclined didn't have anywhere to take these children'.**15**

Cruz goes on to describe how from these beginning workshops and courses in theatre, literature and painting were organised for children. In this description he refers to competitions and juries on several occasions.

> 'In the work with children…began national and international competitions'.**15**

This is specifically mentioned in relation to '*los pioneros*' or pioneers a youth movement for young Cubans.

> 'The work of the National Library also became a methodology of the Ministry of Culture and the Organisation of Pioneers of Cuba…that is to say, assess them in visual arts…we went to events all over the country, judging a series of competitions'.**15**

He also reports having been involved in training and giving seminars to those who would later development similar work in the Casas de la Cultura. In this context he recalls Ana María Erra who in the 1970's was working at the Casa de Cultura in the neighbourhood of Playa.

> 'We assessed and gave many seminars together, also training people who were going to work with Valdés Marín…who wrote for the Revolutionary government of Cuba a book about psychology and the visual arts and how to detect a series of problems through painting'. **15**

In order to clarify what had happened, where and when, I asked Cruz if he had worked with children with problems. He replied that he had but that the work with Valdés Marín had been in assessment in relation to the work then being undertaken at the National Library. According to Cruz, Valdés Marin's work on the interpretation of children's drawings was based on his experiences at the National Library.

Cruz's work with children with problems although conducted initially in hospitals was organised through the juvenile department of the National Library where he employed continuously until 1994. He also mentions that on other occasions children were brought from hospitals to participate with other children in the library itself in order that they did not associate being ill or having pathology with cultural activities.**15**

> 'We started working with children in hospitals, who were suffering from different things. We went to the hospitals and did the greater part of the psychotherapy…and a thing that served much more than medicine was everything that they received through painting, literature, storytelling which they received through the juvenile department of the National Library'.**15**

It seems that in this work Cruz and his associates had the help of the child psychiatrist, Pérez Villar based at the hospital William Soler.

Cruz was involved with six different hospitals. It appears that the psychiatrists were involved with Cruz in analysing the children's drawings. In the following section my questioning became quite focused as I was interested in discovering to what extent paintings were analysed and on what basis.

> 'I have training in that, and there is a very curious thing, it is as if you write, you limit yourself in what you write, consciously or unconsciously, because people can always read it, but he who paints doesn't think that one can read his painting…it is one of the areas where one can detect problems in the child, we have an example which I always refer to…We had a little girl of four years old whose mother and father worked very late into the night, they had a neighbour, who was an old man he was like the child's grandfather and he took responsibility for collecting her from school. This man reached the age of senility and he started sexually interfering with the girl who developed a disorder. He didn't rape her because he couldn't but the girl was traumatised. It was a girl who stopped speaking, who didn't respond to anyone at school. She began psychiatric treatment and they sent her as

psychotherapy to 'pictotherapy'…at first this little girl painted the sheet of paper given to her completely black, later there appeared in the centre a space which she painted dark purple, this purple space began to get bigger, it became lighter, it was red, then it was lilac, a complete series of colours and then it began to look like a very rudimentary flower in the centre, later this flower began to have a face in the centre, and later it lost all of its petals and then she made the body of a child, this child was suffering a treatment through the painting to rid herself of all of what had happened. If not she would have reached that age…psychologically…the child hides it in his subconscious and when he reaches puberty which is another force which changes everything in the organism…it comes out, God knows with what deviation'.**15**

Following this example of Cruz's practice I sought to ascertain how Cruz had developed his method of reading paintings.

'Firstly, I know painting, which is my language… I was already analysing the works with the psychologists and the psychiatrists… I was acquiring these things and I brought things to them, because they didn't know anything about painting, the painting part, therefore I told them the meaning of each colour, it was the combination of concepts which was very positive. It went very well, because there are children who come to classes, normal children and you encounter pathologies that send one to call the parents, problems at home which are reflected in their paintings, therefore you notice that something has happened at home because (the painting) is the reflection of what happened'.**15**

I then asked Cruz his opinion on the use of colour, pointing out that some believe that certain colours represent certain emotions. Did he, I asked, think that there was a universal language or was it more specific to each individual child.

'There is indisputably a universal language, now there are social changes, changes in the world…as when psychedelics came in… art all over the world changed completely, because before that it was inconceivable to paint a sun that was not yellow and there… they started to paint blue suns, purple, orange, green…as if it were the most normal thing, this had an effect on the valuation of colour , but more than colours which have their meaning, is the palette that the child uses in his drawing…or rather, the conjunction of the drawing and determined colours which he employs to paint determined things, because there are things which one cannot paint, a father, a mother, can never be painted purple, if it is painted in these colours it can be seen that there is a problem with the mother or the father. Another thing is dimension, the size of things, because for example the child up until six years paints what interests him, if he is interested in a louse this louse will be the size of the page, but this is a proportion which up until this age, is something one has to respect because it is based in his sensibility.

Afterwards, one expects things from the child within the drawing, if he makes this head, he cannot have a body of this size, and it has to be in proportion but within the figure. When he reaches eleven years old, one has to demand that all the things need to be in proportion, because you cannot have a big man and a small house… There is one thing in painting that I never do…I have known many very good instructors…that make their pupils do what their teacher is doing, its horrible because it is a repetition on a small scale of what the man is doing, this completely violates the individuality of this being'.**15**

From this extract we can see that Cruz possesses knowledge and understanding on the subject of the development of child art. He considers development stages in drawing to be universal and indicative of cognitive development. He also expresses what is generally referred to as a child centered approach, that is, he considers it inappropriate to attempt to impose artistic mores upon the child that are beyond the age of the child's natural development. Throughout his account he emphasises that his work was undertaken in a multidisciplinary context involving consultation with mental health professionals. There is no sense of him presenting himself as a mental health professional but rather as an assistant to them on the basis of his specific expertise.

In the following section I will discuss Cruz's current work at el Centro José de la Luz y Caballero in Havana Vieja.

Descriptive Theme 2: Social Inclusion: Artistic activity as social therapy
Cruz's current involvement with the Study Centre José de la Luz y Caballero in Havana Vieja came about via a connection he had whilst working at the National Library with the office of the City Historian, Eusabio Leal. Cruz became involved in organising the documentation of the restoration of Havana Vieja through children's drawings. 'The children were painting the restoration of Havana Vieja…not using photography…how they saw the restoration of Havana Vieja'.**15**

Cruz confirmed that this project was Leal's idea as had been the idea of restoring the old city. He explained to me that the restoration of the old city has been supported by UNESCO. Apart from its value as a World Heritage site there is a need to regenerate the old city as a tourist attraction but there is a serious risk of alienating the local population who for the most part cannot participate in the advantages that this regeneration brings. Entry to all museums is in both currencies but access to some of these new facilities, for

example, restaurants and bars, is prohibitive because the prices, which are aimed at tourists, are in dollars. It is envisaged that as the economy recovers from the blow of losing financial aid from the Soviet Union and as tourism develops this situation will be alleviated. Other such measures include part ownership of resources with foreign companies. No foreign company is allowed to own more than 49% of a Cuban asset and this percentage of ownership decreases yearly so that eventually all assets return to the State. However, the current economic situation means that foreigners have access to facilities which most Cubans themselves cannot hope to enjoy. There is therefore a real risk of disenfranchising and alienating the local community in the painful process of renovating and restoring their environment from which they are being excluded. During my time there the presence of police in Havana Vieja in 2000 was notable. My understanding of the situation, as gleaned from Cruz and other conversations, is that the current situation is an interim solution and that with economic recovery will come social inclusion. Involving the local children in the documentation of this process is a move towards such inclusion.

> 'They drew three stages of each building, we took ancestral houses as showpieces, where people were living and we painted that, afterwards when these people had been moved, they brought micro brigades and we painted their work, the restoration work…and later after they had finished the work, so that everyone could see the force of it and how they achieved it'.**15**

An exhibition of this work was held at the Palace of the Captain Generals commemorating the foundation of Havana. Ulises Cruz indicated that these drawings and paintings constitute an archive of over 9,000 works.

Following the exhibition Leal allocated Cruz an empty but restored building in Havana Vieja.

> 'The idea of the historian's office more than anything else…was that we could raise the quality of life of all these children who live around the historic centre. They live in very precarious conditions, in nuclear families of a very low cultural and economic level…as a series of strategies, what they wanted was to train these children, to sensitize them so that they could feel that the museums were theirs to care for and protect…if not the restoration work is lost…because without a level of culture they are going to steal'.**15**

The idea here seems to be to instil in the young people of the community a pride and respect for their surroundings by allowing them access to and involvement in the process of change in a very concrete way by making them the archivists of that change. Cruz alludes to the initial fears in the community engendered by the restoration work. Seemingly people feared that they were going to be thrown out of their houses in order to make museums or that blacks wouldn't be allowed access.

> 'At the beginning they said that it (the centre) was racist and that blacks weren't allowed in'.15

> 'The reaction of the people was very good, because at the beginning they thought that they were going to be thrown out of their houses and that museums were going to take the places of their houses'.**15**

Cruz explained how on occupying their first premises in the old city the first thing that they set out to do was establish links with the local schools.

> 'The first thing was to establish a link with the six primary schools in the municipality, the four secondary schools and two schools for behavioural problems and start community work…to know the neighbours we had…how to put the worries we had…we matriculated children in workshops which we started progressively…these course were established annually, like a school course, coming once a week…we have arrived at twenty six different workshops which are: painting, literature, ceramics, puppetry, Spanish dancing, theatre, librarianship, history, protection of the environment, ecology, chess….'.**15**

The Study Centre at Casa José de la Luz y Caballero is housed in a restored colonial building. Groups for children are run free of charge and it is here that the extensive collection of drawings and paintings by children of the old city is held. The art groups and other activities offered at Casa José de la Luz y Caballero represent an attempt to involve young people in this process and to encourage them to take pride in and experience ownership and responsibility for the old city.

The description given by Cruz has all the elements of a community centre. I put this to him. His response was that it was 'it is a community centre, cultural, educational… and always forging… since its beginnings… the direction…to become a museum of Children's Art'. Eighteen months later they were offered another building. In these new

premises, at Casa José de la Luz y Caballero, Cruz established two groups for children with Downs's syndrome.

> 'They were children who were not affiliated to any of the institutions that we have in our country…they were making themselves stupid in their houses and a group was made for them…and these children began to develop at an incredible rhythm…because practically the only relationship they had had was with their mother…today we have two groups, one of thirty children and another of twenty… between five and fifty two years old'.**15**

I had never encountered the idea of grouping together one diagnostic category apart from in specialised services for autistic children. The idea of forming a group with such a wide age range on the basis of the diagnosis of a genetic disability was entirely new to me. I asked Cruz to elaborate his description.

> 'In Cuba one thing happens as in all of Latin America is machismo…when the classic *hijo bobo* or idiot son is born, well as we say…the idiot son…between commas, Down's syndrome, they are not stupid, they are much more intelligent than we are, but they have their problems…but when this son is born, the father abandons the mother or they start blaming each other…but generally the father abandons the mother and the mother recriminates the child without telling him that the father abandoned her because he (the child) was born stupid…no one is to blame but everyone blames everyone else…as a solution we introduce the parents to the creative process of the children, they see the work that their children can do despite their limitations…in turn they begin to value their child much more. Overall, it gets rid of a series of complexes that they have…the parents not the children who can in turn be super protective and this may limit the child…'.**15**

He also pointed out to me that children with Down's syndrome did participate in all the activities enjoyed by the 'normal children' in order to prevent regression.

> 'They are linked in all of the things with the normal children, the activities, the festivities so that they don't regress because if not a vicious circle is created and they don't get out of it…the normal children are spoken to so that they will not reject them…they are children, the same as you are but they have their problem which you can see, a little ugly with Chinese eyes but a good mentality and they are going to have fun with you…and we haven't had a problem because if you speak directly the children are perfectly able to assimilate all these things'.**15**

The basic ideas of social integration are here. Cruz doesn't mince his words in these extracts and there are none of the euphemisms familiar to those versed in political correctness. On the other hand I did not feel that he was trying to be particularly blunt rather I felt that there was a genuine lack of awareness of political correctness in relation to language or that it just wasn't an issue. However I remained unclear as to why Down's syndrome seemed to be perceived as a very particular group and sought still further clarification. 'They have peculiarities which other infantile pathologies don't have'.**15**

Cruz described a New Year party where he had been surprised by the level of participation from the Down's syndrome centre users but did not elaborate what these 'peculiarities' were apart from suggesting that it was easy to underestimate these people.

> 'There are some days when one laughs with them because one makes the error of thinking, that they don't have the level to respond, to react in front of something and they do react… outstandingly'.**15**

Abstract Theme:
An analysis of these themes suggests a more abstract theme:

- An emphasis on social responsiveness and group therapy.

This abstract theme which emerges from the descriptive categories is informed by several threads. Firstly, by that of responsiveness to necessity; a strong and continuing thread, running through both descriptive categories. All examples of practice given by Cruz appear to develop in response to a particular stated need rather than as territorial bids from a pre-existing professional group and these practices develop from the grass roots up. Also, from the account given, developments in art as a therapy are instigated by the medical or psychological professions, or in the latter case, from the City Historian. Secondly, the accounts of art therapy practice described by Cruz involve multidisciplinary working and inter-disciplinary collaboration with the artist/therapist working as a member of team. Thirdly, there are references to theoretical underpinning and to systematic investigations commissioned by the Cuban Government and undertaken *in situ* by Valdés Marín. All of these factors point to what I have called

responsiveness. By responsiveness I am referring to the idea that these practices emerged, gained momentum and developed as a response to a tangible need in particular contexts as opposed to being introduced from outside. The proposition underlying this is that these practices flourished because they served or fitted the given situations that they grew out of. In colloquial terms, there is no sense of anyone trying to fit a round peg into a square hole. It also emerges that socially orientated or group therapy is favoured as opposed to more individualised work. This orientation or preference emerges from the descriptive themes in several instances. Firstly, although from Cruz's account we can see that the individual and his particular circumstances and difficulties were closely considered, the actual art therapy sessions, in all of the settings described, took place in a group context. Secondly, the work undertaken in Havana Vieja is not only group orientated but community orientated. The emphasis on inclusion and integration addresses group consciousness but the therapeutic objective is the well being of the community members and the preservation of the environment which community members inhabit by means of encouraging identification with that environment. Indeed, in this latter case, I would venture to include the environment itself as a variable in the therapeutic process.

The Work of Ana María Erra Guevara

Introduction

I was introduced to Ana María Erra Guevara by María del Carmen Valls, a child psychologist, who was familiar with her work. In February 2000 I interviewed her at her home in the district of Miramar, one of the more salubrious areas of Havana. Erra was fastidious in reading and correcting drafts of the interview transcript. In keeping with my methodology, Naturalistic Inquiry, I always offered respondents a copy of the transcript of their interview which allowed them the opportunity to comment or elaborate any aspect should they wish to do so. Erra added notes to hers, giving additional information regarding specific persons, places and events. She was the only one of my respondents who expressed an interest in doing so.

The descriptive themes which emerge from the data which follows echo several themes which already emerged with respect to Antonia Eiriz, Jorge Nasser and Ulises Cruz. Others, such as her explicit rejection of all *a priori* categories as applied to the analysis of painting, are quite unique to Erra.

These descriptive themes are:

- **The importance of formative experience.**

- **Rejection of determinism in all its manifestations.**

- **Responsiveness and interdisciplinary collaboration.**

- **Opposition to institutionalisation of the profession.**

I opened the interview by asking Erra to describe what had influenced and informed her work as an art therapist.

Descriptive Theme 1: The importance of formative experience.

Erra trained as a teacher in Buenos Aires. She remarked that all the women in her family were teachers and that pursuing this career was something of a family tradition, as opposed to a personal preference. Since childhood she had drawn and painted. Her father made sculptures in wood and she recalled sitting at his side cutting wood from which she made woodcut prints. On completing her teacher training in 1956 she enrolled at the Academia de Bellas Artes 'Manuel Belgrano' in Buenos Aires where she specialised in printmaking. At the same time she studied psychology at the University of Buenos Aires. She did not graduate in psychology but followed a series of courses for teachers over a three year period which focused specifically on the application of tests and projective techniques including the Rorschach test.

> 'I wasn't that interested in a career as a psychologist but I was interested in the projection of the image as a way of interpreting the individual, the person from a base of what interested me, which was painting'. **2**

During this time she also worked as a teacher in a secondary school and as a kindergarten teacher, experiences which she regards as being extremely helpful to her in her later work.

> 'I have thirty years of experience as a teacher, afterwards I left formal education in order to dedicate myself to art teaching and within art education to psychotherapy, through art as a specialism, as something separate from the creative workshops'.**2**

Elaborating at my invitation on her formative years and influences she describes the Buenos Aires of the 1950's and 1960's as years of great euphoria.

> 'There was a great belief that thing were going to change, they were the heroic years of the fall of many Latin American tyrannies, the years of the triumph of the Cuban Revolution. The hope lay in the Latin American liberation movements which were brewing and they were bearing their fruits in almost all of America, they were the years of the guerrilla movement of Che'.**2**

Politically, she describes Argentina 'as always, between democracy and military dictatorship' oscillating between the benevolent democracies of Arturo Frondizi and Arturo Illia and subsequent military coups. She also describes a vibrant Buenos Aires - the arrival of abstract expressionism in the form of exhibitions at the Instituto 'Torcuato Di Tella', of the work of Rothko, Rauschenberg and Pollock, the break with classic academic painting and the beginnings of performance art and 'happenings'.

In the 1960's, which she describes as hopeful and optimistic, she began to work with missionary nuns in the *villas miseries* or shanty towns of Buenos Aires.

> 'There was a channelling of my work towards the social; I believe that it was part of the spirit of that moment… here they ask me many times, well you are on the left? I say, yes, but the left that I learnt with the missionary nuns and priests of the third world'.**2**

Erra became part of a puppet group travelling every Sunday to the different shanty towns to perform. She recalled that the adults were almost more enthusiastic than the children, shouting and clapping. These performances had a political and social subtext. 'We had one performance which really was very enjoyable especially created for the shanty town. '*El Sinverguenza*' (without shame) the descarado (shameless) as they say there…there was a puppet, a policeman. We made the puppet do bad deeds and escape …the police chased him but the public told him where the police were so that he could hide so that they wouldn't find him…and they felt themselves embodied in this puppet'.**2**

Descriptive Theme 2: Rejection of Determinism

I asked Erra if she had been influenced by the strong presence of psychoanalysis in Argentina. She replied that she had not had any contact with psychoanalysts in Argentina but that she had later in Cuba when she worked in child psychiatry. However, she reported having read widely around this theme.

> 'I am passionate about it, it interests me, it seems to me the only way to know ones self is to try to search in the interior from the psychoanalytic point of view…but I never tried to do this with art with respect to my treatment, with respect to the children …I left that to the specialists that is to say, I preferred not to be conditioned *a priori* about what I should see, read or find in that which the others made. I always prefer a spontaneous reading, the fresh reading, the reading of what it says to me…of what it says to me in an empirical manner…because there is a risk of classifying and classifying things as things that they are not. In the long term it is preferable to observe the little details, the little manners, forms in which each person manifests themselves in order to have an idea of what that person is'.**2**

From this extract it seems quite clear that Erra, although interested in psychoanalytic thought, did not incorporate these theories in her work as an art therapist. This decision appears to be based on two counts, firstly, she regards this as a specialised area, the domain of experts and secondly, a preference to approach the art work without being burdened with *a priori* notions of what she should be looking for. Erra was similarly critical of the use of projective tests.

> 'After studying tests for three years and applying them I noted that the variants were infinite…infinite because human beings are infinite…because of this I don't trust the tests. I don't trust these things that are already schematised. I think that experience is of much greater value and to try to capture the other person through other elements sometimes much more diffused, more subtle which are concerned with emotionality, with sensitivity which are concerned with that which is not spoken which has to do with looking, with a gesture which has to do with the form in which the person faces the group, with the form in which the person relates, with the form in which the person makes something when he thinks no one is looking at him…I think that this is the best manner of knowing someone, in addition I have always had, as a base in my work, a great respect for the other person, even although they might be a child of three or four years old…and a great love'.**2**

Erra emphasised that these factors constituted the basic principles of her work and that she never tired of repeating them in her teaching. She suggests that one must have 'love

and respect'; respect for the artwork of the other, for the form in which the other manifests himself, and love in order to be capable of understanding and accepting that which we normally dislike or reject. In her view this constitutes the only way in which to reach the interior world of another person.

> 'Disgracefully, many times, as we specialise more…it takes us further from the human being because we work with the psyche as if it were a liver, a heart, a lung, that is to say, as if one were a doctor who has to make a study, an analysis test or dissections in order to know what there is inside…in this manner we are never going to know the person we have in front of us'.**2**

In this context, of stating what might be referred to as a humanistic position, that of valuing and respecting the individual, as opposed to attempting to locate him in psychological categories forged a priori, Erra seems to be implicitly reiterating at least one of the basic tenets of Client Centered Therapy, that is unconditional positive regard, albeit that she does not refer to Rogers as a source. She elaborates on her basic position with reference to her teaching in art therapy.

> 'Many times, people come to course or a seminar, or a workshop, hoping that I will give them recipes. How do you do that? How do you do this? All of the games I use with children to develop their imagination…I made for myself, that is to say, I tried them myself and when I use them with children and adolescents I already know what could come out, what could appear, I know what I want to achieve. Afterwards, each one is going to do it differently. It is not a technology or a methodology of working which is very rule based'.**2**

Here she seems to be suggesting a responsive approach within the therapeutic context which is reflexive and not rule governed. She is also referring to the importance of having tried out various games herself, that is, of experiencing the process herself while acknowledging that each therapist will do things differently. She goes on to refer to the limitations of a teaching approach that is only based on learning outcomes.

> 'Sometimes it is a great fault of teachers who without being aware, wound, because they are based only in the programme they have to teach. That which is behind the person doesn't interest them. Perhaps, the fact that I have worked for years, many years in Argentina with children who lived in conditions of almost total affective neglect, with children who had many problems, misery, I am much more sensitised than someone who has not had this experience'.**2**

Here she emphasises her early experiences in community work as having been an important factor in her formation. She distinguishes between these sorts of experiences and those gained in the clinical situation where the child is seen out side of its habitual environment.

> 'Every day I confronted terrible problems, from delinquent parents to drunken parents, not to mention the sexual part which covers a range of problems which one can hardly imagine because promiscuity was total…this is very different from seeing people in a clinic…I was immersed in this world for twelve years'.**2**

She also emphasises the difference between first world and third world facilities and resources, making reference to the aesthetic.

> 'When I go to the Marie Langer Centre in Spain, which is a community centre, I find myself in a very different reality. Spanish society is a consumer society, it is a capitalist society and therefore the people who work there are used to good conditions, all the materials they need…we work with rubbish, with the things they throw out …one can make beautiful things with rubbish one can make aesthetically beautiful objects, the essential is what one oneself puts into them'.**2**

Here we find a find a similarity between the attitude of Eiriz and Erra in relation to the use of found objects.

In 1970 Erra visited Cuba for the first time. She had not gone with the intention of working but apparently when people became aware of her profession she was called and asked to give seminars. She organised a series of events for teachers at the National Library after which she was asked to hold a creative workshop for children similar to one she had run in Argentina over a period of ten years. She stayed for one year during which time she was also involved with training of staff for kindergartens, in the Makarenkos schools and in running the creative workshop for children previously mentioned. In 1971 she and her family returned to Argentina. However, three years later they were forced into exile and returned to Cuba.

> 'In this moment I was already married to Ernesto Guevara Lynch, who was the father of Che (Ernesto Che Guevara), he was my husband, the father of

my children…and for obvious reasons, political reasons…in 1974, Argentina was governed by Isabel Peron who was the widow of the general Peron and there was a foundation, a group which they formed which they called 'the Triple A'. The Triple A, which was the *Alianza Anticomunista Argentina* (Argentinean Anticommunist Alliance) the triple A was formed by groups of paramilitaries who kidnapped and disappeared people, the disappearances had already begun, we…already my first child María Victoria had been born and my second son Ramón, María Victoria was two years old, Ramón was four months old, we had been threatened with death and ordered to leave the country, something we had to do rapidly, practically in a few days. Of course, the open door we had was Cuba, for obvious reasons it was the place where we were going to be best received, furthermore, part of the family already had had to leave, already Ernesto's other son, Juan Martin, the brother of Che was imprisoned and we had to leave the country, these were the fundamental reasons'. **2**

In effect, Erra was the stepmother of Ernesto 'Che' Guevara the hero of the Cuban revolution who had been killed in 1967 in Bolivia while engaged in a guerrilla campaign. As such, she and her family were *persona non grata* in Argentina. Erra went on to describe how at the time they supposed that this exile would be brief because they thought that the government of López Vega and Isabelita (Peron) would not last. However, in 1976 there was a military coup.

'The military Junta assumed power which took things to the extreme, much worse than before, *los desaparecidos* (the disappeared), the tortures, they were 10 years of real hell in Argentina, in which the majority of the intellectuals, artists or professionals on a high level…were either disappeared or had to leave the country…30,000 is not a small number…it is horrific…also the sophistication of the torture…I was ten years without seeing my parents, without seeing my family, I had to abandon my work, an artistic career, friends…I had to abandon everything these things are irrecoverable years which one can never rescue again…afterwards when one goes back people are not there. Sometimes, I revise my telephone book and the majority of my friends are dead, disappeared or have left the country…it is as if they have rubbed us out, as if it were an epoch in which we stopped existing'.**2**

Erra describes how her third child was born in Cuba and how she dedicated herself to the care of her three young children. At this time her husband Ernesto Guevara Lynch was engaged in writing two books '*Mi hijo el Che*' (My son Che) and '*Aquí va un soldado de America*' (Here goes a soldier of America) and she assisted him in this.

Descriptive Theme 3: Responsiveness and interdisciplinary collaboration.

In 1977, the Casa de la Cultura de Plaza opened in Vedado and she began to give classes on Saturdays for children. These workshops lasted from 1977 to 1991 and during which time the work expanded to become almost full time. She describes running creative workshops, printmaking workshops specifically with adolescents and a workshop in psychotherapy.

'There the workshop of psychotherapy was born in Cuba'.**2**

At this point in the interview I sought clarification and detail. Apparently this workshop began in 1980. Erra describes it as a new experience because she worked in a direct relationship with the department of child psychiatry of the William Soler Hospital in AltaHavana which at this time was directed by Dr Pérez Villar. Erra describes him as a man who at that time was already a considerable age, a psychiatrist trained in Freudian psychoanalysis in the US where he had studied before the Revolution. She also mentions his colleague, Dr Juan Carlos Volnovich, an Argentinean psychoanalyst living in exile in Cuba who called her to invite her to work with them. It was Erra herself who suggested to Villar and Volnovich that the workshop should not take place in the hospital.

> 'I suggested to them that the art psychotherapy workshop should not take place in the hospital. Normally, the children with problems are taken to the hospital for a session with the doctors once a week and if the child also has another type of problem there are special teachers and speech therapists, that is to say that every disorder that the child presents is attended to in the hospital. It seemed to me that it was really some sort of type of battle …to add the creative workshop to the medical consultations of the hospital was to give them a medical character; it was to add another consultation to those to which the child was already taken'.**2**

Erra's reasoning here was that many of these children had a hospital phobia and did not want to go to the hospital. She pointed out that many of them had spent time as in-patients and they rejected hospitals in the same way as they rejected schools.

> 'Many children with conduct disorders, with problems of shyness, with family problems suffer from a lack of self esteem…they don't want to go to school, they look for excuses, they cry…I proposed that we separated the workshop from the hospital and from the school…this made it a little difficult because these children went with their families to the hospital in

school hours for which they were granted permission, we had to add another day to the permission to attend the hospital consultation so that they could come to the workshop…furthermore, the transport problem is not simple in Cuba because these children, who attended the Hospital William Soler were from the country outside Havana…there were children who came from very far away and then we had to mobilise the doctors…to the Casa de la Cultura'.**2**

While Erra was working with the children the doctors worked in group therapy with the parents. Erra sought authorisation from the Casa de la Cultura to use the same large room in which she was accustomed to work. Additionally, they were given the use of the library. The Casa de Cultura de Plaza in Vedado had once been the old Lyceum of Havana, dating from the 1920's it had, according to Erra, a marvellous library and a prestigious history. Some of the most famous Spanish and Latin American poets and writers had given conferences there including Pablo Neruda, Federico García Lorca and Antonio Machado. The workshops therefore took place in a setting strongly identified with the arts and culture and devoid of connections to either school or hospital. Erra reports that the staff were extremely supportive of the workshops as was Villar who in addition to being director of child psychiatry was a professor in the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Havana. Villar attended these workshops working with the parents, until his retirement when Dr Humberto Castelló replaced him. While medical staff worked with parents in the library area Erra worked with the children. She did not allow other staff into her group.

These workshops or groups involved a maximum of eight to ten children. The medical team selected the children who they considered would benefit most from this type of work although Erra did not mention what indicators were used in this process or if she was involved in selection. She describes a closed group, that is, a group of the same clients over a period of time conducted in the same setting.

> 'This was their space, they were the owners of everything, it was them who managed the materials, the tables, the chairs, it was them who chose what they wanted to do…it was a conditional freedom, a liberty in which I could do what I wanted within a diffused authority… which one didn't see but which is managed in order that it doesn't become an anarchic activity because an anarchic activity does not give us results…furthermore, it exhausts itself because the child is very unstable, the levels of attention especially in children with problems are very low…so if one allows a state

of general anarchy…let them do what they want…the child does not do what it wants'.**2**

Here Erra makes a distinction between thematic and directed work and a more dynamic approach which is directed but subtly.

'There are some workshops where they tell the child that he can use the materials that he wants and make what he wants and with this approach one runs the risk that…many times the children exhaust the possibilities and do not continue to work… a diffuse authority is required which plans more than anything else…almost without feeling oneself in the workshop…what is the expectation of what will happen, how does the child manifest himself, how does he relate…I make notes from the moment they come in…how they walk, how they look, which place they occupy in the workshop, because the space of the workshop is the world'.**2**

Erra emphasises the difference between this environment, the educational setting where programmes must be accomplished and medical settings where medication is prescribed and the child's behaviour reported to the doctors by the parents.

' I think that the doctor has between 40 and 45 minutes with the child in this time he is listening to what the parents say he cannot observe the child more than minimally…of what the child in reality feels or what he wants or what is happening to that child …what he is suffering'.**2**

Erra describes periods of negotiation with medical staff in which she needed to be quite explicit about her working methods and objectives in order to protect the therapeutic space she wished to create. Apparently, some of the medical team, educational psychologists, had at some point participated in one of her groups taken it upon them selves to instruct the children with regards to what colour to use, how to hold a pencil and so forth.

'I had a very open meeting with the directors, with the doctors with the psychologists…it was not my way of working nor was it the purpose of the workshop neither was it the basis of the workshop…the workshop was based in the opposite…not to make painting a way of expression through techniques. I wasn't giving techniques, it wasn't a work therapy as in many hospitals… as they do in many rehabilitation centres in which they give people some type of manual work to occupy their time or make something that which could be commercialised or help them in their daily life'.**2**

Having defined what her workshops were not, Erra went on to define what they were.

'The point of these psychotherapy workshops through art is to know the individual and how can you know him if you condition him, I cannot condition him, I have to leave him. I can give him tools with which he can manifest himself, I am referring to tools when I give him paper, pencils, when I am teaching a technique, I teach them techniques so that each class will be different…to express myself in the best way possible I must dominate a technique or at least know it or have experimented with it several times…once I have experimented I know how to manage it'.**2**

Here she emphasises the need to enable or facilitate artistic expression through teaching or demonstrating techniques which will allow the child a wider visual vocabulary with which to express himself. This is not to be confused with art teaching per se where there is also an emphasis on the aesthetic. She stresses that she does not direct the content, theme or form of the artwork.

'I must not tell him what he should do or what I hope that he will make…the sheet of paper, the white space with which the child is confronted is a type of coming out of oneself in order to enter exterior space…the same happens to a writer when they speak about *horror vacui* in front of white paper…it is a difficult moment in which I confront the exterior world, I am in front of the other and we are going to see how I can manifest myself…what will I show of myself to others? What do I have inside myself that I can show or that I can say?' **2**

Here Erra refers to her earlier studies in the use of tests. Without using the protocols of the test she refers to them in terms of thinking about how the child uses the paper, whether he fills it up or uses only part of it, the size of the figures and so forth. In terms of group planning she suggests that the preliminary weeks are an assessment period.
'I work for a month. In this month I had consultancies with the children weekly…never with the parents or with the doctors. I didn't want any influence…when the mother came and says to me 'You don't know this week this happened and that'…I would say to her, 'No, tell the doctor, don't tell me', that is to say; I didn't want to be contaminated with the subjective impression of the parents… or by the doctors. I didn't want anyone to influence what I read in what the children did'.**2**

Erra went on to describe how the body of children's work accumulated over the course of a month, and that in this manner each child had a 'type of history of his painting'. Simultaneously, she kept notes of her observations about the development of the group.

The children did not attend the last consultation of this first month. This meeting was confined to the medical staff, the educational psychologists, the parents and Erra herself. Erra then shared everything that had happened throughout the month. In discussing this procedure she mentioned the subject of diagnosis, expressing some doubt as to whether this was possible in such a short period of time.

> 'I don't know if one can base a diagnosis in only one piece of work, or in two or in five, it has to be developed, in some cases …years. In some special cases, three or four years in order to be able to identify the problem, confront it and overcome it'.**2**

In this reluctance to diagnose, Erra's approach differs from that of García Morey, whose work I go on to discuss in the following section. Erra describes how each child's individual case was presented in this meeting. This involved showing the child's work and referring to her detailed notes. In this she was accompanied by Mayra Navarra, a storyteller who attended her groups on occasion and Esther Navarra who worked with corporal expression. Apparently the storyteller would tell a story and the children would work on an interpretation. Erra notes that the most interesting aspect of this meeting was the contradiction between her observations of the child and what the parents said.

> 'But the most interesting of all was the contradiction between what the child manifested and what the parents said. Firstly, because generally the parents placed all the blame for the problem on the child, the difficult child, the maladapted child, the child with phobias, the child with millions of problems…we are speaking about people with not a very high cultural level, we are speaking about Havana campo (the countryside surrounding Havana) or rather, they were very simple people, very simple…it was always the child…they presented a story which did not coincide in any way with the story which the child presented through his drawings and generally the (child's) story accused the parents'.**2**

Elaborating on these discrepancies, with reference to the ten years of experience she had of working with the hospital, Erra estimated that overall 80% of the cases had their origins in the family. She also describes how often the work produced in the sessions and her observations provoked a new reading of the case.

> 'The majority of the cases were cases of children with family problems, at times it struck me as gracious how the situation was hidden from the doctor…one had to make a new reading of the case and I want to assure you

that we were never, never mistaken, that the children always told the truth, I was simply limited in reading it but the children…the smallest child when he goes to a psychologist or they take him to a psychiatrist…he doesn't know how to express his problem, therefore it is very difficult for the doctor to establish a diagnosis based on what the adult says…'.**2**

Erra asserts that workshops were highly valued by the medical staff.

'The workshop was very important because of this the doctors made such a sacrifice so that it would not close due to transport difficulties because they considered it as a fundamental element…also there was a doctor…María de los Angles Vizcaíno who made her thesis with us, she made her thesis specifically about the creative workshop'. **2**

I was later to make contact with Dr María de los Angeles Vizcaíno who kindly allowed me to copy her thesis which had been submitted to the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Havana as part of her specialised training in psychiatry.

I enquired whether, given the predominance of family problems underlying the children's difficulties, Erra ever worked directly with the theme of the family in the workshop. She responded in the affirmative but pointed out that one of the difficulties involved the child's inability to accept himself which resulted in him being unable to represent himself pictorially. She noted that she often looked for themes which would oblige the children to depict themselves but that they did not do so. I asked for an example of this phenomenon.

'For example, tell me where you went for your holidays? … Each one told me…and they drew the sea, the beach, a boat but they didn't draw themselves. If they had been to the zoo they drew the cage, the animals but they didn't draw themselves. I stressed to them that they had to have been there…How am I going to know that you were there? …lets see we are going to draw ourselves, first of all let us look at one and another…lets draw ourselves and now draw yourself with a mirror. They didn't draw themselves, they made a stereotype as if it were a figure that could have been anyone and is no-one…because until the child has acknowledged his problem he is incapable to reflect himself because he doesn't accept himself'.**2**

She then offered me some specific case examples one of which is the following.

'A girl had a hare lip. This girl had had five operations in order to close the palette, to regulate the face; she had a complete complex of ugliness because furthermore her little sister was very pretty and therefore the difference was more noticeable, but furthermore the teacher told her she was ugly, that she had teeth like a rabbit…this girl invariably drew her little sister, she never drew herself and the only time she drew herself she drew herself crying'.**2**

Erra then addressed the group as a working entity in a situation which allowed her to make further observations of individual children.

'One notices how they manifest themselves in the group, who is the leader, he who is subjugated, he who leaves the others to do everything… he who on the contrary apparently has great self esteem. He did not have self esteem because he was a boy who also had physical problems, very serious gastric problems he was hospitalised very many times and for many months and he considered himself a monster. Every time he entered a class he entered walking as if he was a monster and he liked to be the centre of attention. We directed him towards theatre, we also wrote little plays in which the other children took part and from this his difficulty was alleviated…this exacerbated individualism which he had… it wasn't necessary that he was a solitary monster who entered frightening the others'.**2**

Erra describes a situation in which this particular boy was encouraged to write a script which the other children in the group enacted, suggesting that his realisation of his ability to write and direct this piece of theatre alleviated his need to act out. In other words, what was perceived as unhelpful to him and the others, his behaviour which was symptomatic of his low self esteem, was redirected by channelling it into a creative production which enhanced his self esteem.

The workshops were closed in 1991 when what is referred to as the 'Special Period' began following the collapse of the Soviet block in 1989. As Erra pointed out 'there was practically no transport, not that there is much now but in those moments there was nothing'.**2**

Descriptive Theme 4: Opposition to the Institutionalisation of the Profession
Drawing our interview to a close I mentioned the fact that art therapy in the UK and in the US was recognised as a distinct profession and sought to elicit her opinion on the development of such a profession in Cuba. She replied that she was happy that it was recognised as a career but it also worried her.

'It worries me that the people who take up this career will not be artists or at least won't be sensitive… because if not, they are going to make another career amongst the many that already exist. We are always in the same thing…people who confuse art therapy with labour or work therapy and for me that it is fatal. Art therapy demands much more…a demand which begins with oneself and a capacity to reach out to others. When these things are converted into a profession it worries me, I think that they want to take on many cases, fill up the hours because the need to earn more, a little like doctors and they leave to one side the human being…the human factor, that is to say, for who am I working? Or what do I want… to know the other in order to help him or to fill up his time and mine? This is what really worries me'.**2**

Erra goes on to underline her position, reiterating her status which has always been as an independent worker and that she has never liked to be conditioned or controlled. She recalls the absolute liberty she was allowed by the nuns in Argentina. Regarding herself as a trainer or educator she comments that she would have liked to have trained more people in order to have ensured continuity of the work she began. Her concluding comments focus on the selection of trainees.

'I think the selection process is essential. What motivations do they have? and What do they want? It's like everything, but well there will always be the one who does it with more sense of vocation than the other, it's the same in teaching and in medicine. I think that when one is working with the human being, that that is our primary material, our clay, we have to have a very special vocation because if not it is very difficult. I have had people intent on working with me in workshops and they say to me after ten minutes, this is enough to drive you mad'.**2**

In these concluding comments Erra expresses considerable reservations about formalising what she describes as a vocation and making of it a profession which she seems to suggest may attract the wrong sort of people - those who do not possess artistic sensibility and those who see as many clients as possible as a means of making a living. Ultimately, she seems to perceive the practice of art therapy as a vocation.

Analytic Theme: Coherent Practice

A review of the descriptive themes emerging from my interview with Erra echoes similar themes to those arising in my interviews with Nasser and Cruz. However, it is with Erra that the overarching theme of responsiveness, which emerges in all three

interviews, is linked most explicitly to the art work itself as opposed to being limited to responsiveness as demonstrated through interdisciplinary collaboration in response to need, as in the case of Nasser and Cruz. This responsiveness to the child's art work is in part demonstrated by Erra's rejection of a deterministic or diagnostic approach based on *a priori* categories which she regards as reductive. It is Erra who sets the ground rules and in this respect one has a sense of her practice being more developed. Moreover, she perceives herself as an autonomous professional working within a multi-disciplinary team. She is the most vociferous and articulate of the three respondents and the only one who manifested an interest in viewing a transcript of my interview with her; which she assiduously corrected, adding a series of precise footnotes. Her description of her work is also the most detailed and her approach ultimately more coherent.

Summary

In this chapter I have presented and analysed a set of data under the general category of Art, Artists and Therapy: Collaborative Working, referring to material emerging from interviews with respondents who describe work undertaken from the early 1970's onwards where they have worked alongside mental health care professionals. I have focused on the work of Jorge Nasser and Ulises Cruz and Ana María Erra. The theme of responsiveness in response to need resulting in interdisciplinary work emerges in all three interviews as does the preference for group work which is not to say that the needs of individuals are neglected but rather that it is a preferred form of working. This echoes Waller's (1981) observations cited in Chapter 2.

As noted in the summary of the literature review it is this current or strand of practice which is least documented in the literature (Valdés Marín, 1979, Vizcaíno Londián 1981). This suggests that whatever practice took place was short lived. However, a review of the data presents a rather different picture. Nasser reports his involvement in collaborative work as taking place between 1985 and 1990, prior to this he was involved in running workshops with Eiriz. Cruz's work begins in 1968 in the National Library and extends to the work with which he is currently involved at the Centro de José de la Luz y Caballero where a psychologist María del Carmen Valls is also employed (Leal, 2002). Erra reports a continuing involvement in collaborative work which begins in Buenos Aires in the 1960's and is continued within the Cuban context beginning in 1977 and extending to 1991. Thus the bibliographic material does not reflect the same

reality as the data. As we can see an overview of the data suggests that these practices span a much longer period that is, from 1968 to the present day. However, what also emerges from the data is a lack of development in terms of the incorporation of other practitioners and the expansion of collaborative work. While Cruz refers to running various training courses and workshops no new figures emerge. Work locations change as does the focus of the work but the key figures remain the same.

Chapter 6

Art, Psychologists and Therapy

Introduction

In the previous chapter I confined my presentation and analysis of data to material pertaining to work conducted by artists working in collaboration with mental health professionals. In this chapter I will present the data which pertains to the relationship between art, psychology and psychoanalysis and to work undertaken in clinical settings by individuals who are not trained in art but in psychology. I have elected to include a discussion of psychoanalysis within the context of psychology as it is within this context what limited psychoanalytic practice is conducted.

In Cuba the links between art and general psychology are much stronger than those between art and psychoanalysis. This may be in part explained by the almost complete absence of psychoanalytic practice in Cuba from 1959 when with the advent of the revolution many doctors, psychologists and psychoanalysts left Cuba, following and followed by their wealthy clientele.

> 'In the first month of the revolutionary administration, a standing joke had it that Havana Airport was the most popular spot in Cuba. Long before the revolutionary administration had published details of exactly how it was going to remedy social injustice, large numbers of wealthy people saw the writing on the wall and left. Among them were all but five senior faculty members out of a staff of 480 at the Havana Medical School. Also included in the exodus were at least two thirds of the ordinary doctors practising in Havana and Santiago. This happened, of course, at the very time that Castro was stating as one of the primary objectives of the revolution 'universal access to medical treatment for all citizens' (MacDonald, T. 1995, p.55).

Thus, the relationship between art and psychology was established within a framework in which psychoanalysis, as a discipline which might have informed the theory and practice of art therapy, was basically absent with the exception of one or two psychiatrists who had trained in the US prior to the Revolution. Interestingly, it was one of these psychiatrists, Dr Pérez Villar, who was partly responsible for introducing art into the general practice of child psychotherapy as described in the previous chapter.

In 1989, psychoanalysis returned to Cuba in the form of the Argentinean psychoanalyst Eve Ravinovich who during a period of two years was resident in Cuba, for personal reasons, and who established a study group. However, an interview with Elaine Cossio revealed that art therapy or the use of art within the context of psychoanalysis had not been considered in any depth. I shall take the relative absence of psychoanalysis as an influence in the development of art therapy as my point of departure in the following presentation of the data collected. The main respondent is Elaine Cossio, a psychologist and training Lacanian psychoanalyst practicing from the polyclinic 'Rampa' whom I interviewed in Vedado in October 1999.

Art and Psychoanalysis in Cuba

Descriptive Theme 1: Information sharing versus information withholding.

Cossio's interest in psychoanalysis began when she was a student of psychology in the third year of her studies at the University of Havana.

> 'I began my career in 1989 and in 1991, that is to say when I was in the third year of the course, I heard about the existence of a group of some people who were studying psychoanalysis with an Argentinean psychoanalyst who was here in Havana. She was here in Havana for two years…and I became part of that group…it caught my attention because when I elected the career of psychology I elected it thinking of psychoanalysis, it was very shocking to arrive and see that psychology was another thing that it wasn't psychoanalysis' *10*

According to Cossio, this group was initiated by psychoanalyst Eve Ravinovich. When she left Cuba, the group named 'The Psychoanalytic Study Group of Havana' was formed although its origins were in 1989. This implies that Cossio joined the group at the end of Ravinovich's time in Cuba although she was not explicit about this.

> 'We met to study the texts of Freud and Lacan…if a psychoanalyst came (to Cuba) he gave us a seminar. In 1994 we began a contact with *el Campo Freudiano* (the Freudian School) and in particular with the president of the Freudian School who is Judith Miller the daughter of Jacques Lacan. The group entered a relationship with the Freudian School and was recognised as a group associated with the Freudian School. In 1995, we had our first conference here in Havana, the 'First International Conference of Psychoanalysis' which was called 'Psychoanalysis Today'.

Apparently this conference was attended by 'many psychoanalyst colleagues' from Venezuela, Ecuador and Argentina and the decision to hold an international conference of the *Campo Freudiano en La Havana* (the Freudian School in Havana) every two years was established at this stage. The second conference 'New forms of symptoms in culture' took place in 1997 and had, according to Cossio, an even better reception with representatives from Colombia, Venezuela, Argentina, France and Spain in attendance. In this same year a psychoanalytical practice or consultancy was established in the polyclinic '*Rampa*' in Vedado.

> 'In 1997 we achieved for the first time the creation of this consultancy which operates in coordination with the Provincial Group of Psychology of the City of Havana, that is to say, that this consultancy belongs to this Provincial Group of Psychology and to the Group of Psychoanalytic Studies of Havana and this is very important, that is to say, it is our biggest achievement so far…the power to practice psychoanalytic psychotherapy in Cuba, the only place where there is a psychotherapy with a psychoanalytic orientation, exclusively a psychoanalytic orientation and an orientation based on the teachings of Freud and Lacan' **10**

Thus, at the point of my interview with Cossio in October 1999, only one psychoanalytic practice existed in Cuba at the polyclinic '*Rampa*' and this practice had been established barely for two years. However, this practice, as noted in the above excerpt, belongs to the Provincial Group which by implication means that it is within the already existing system of public health - accepting the referral of non-fee paying clients. This information was supplied to me by Cossio within the first few minutes of my interview with her. The transcript of this interview is extremely interesting. Cossio decides where to begin the interview and takes as her point of departure her own interest in psychoanalysis. This is immediately followed by a résumé of the history of the Freudian or Lacanian School. My own interventions are minimal and at this point in the interview and only made in order to clarify what has been said. I ask how many psychoanalysts practice in the clinic.

> 'We are five, five people who practice psychoanalytic psychotherapy…psychologists…that was in 1997; of course we are continuing our personal analysis…from 1995 a Venezuelan psychoanalyst has been coming to Havana for our personal analysis and following the conferences…now in October we celebrate the third, which is called 'Psychoanalytic Practice: the particular cure', and colleagues will come not only from Venezuela, Colombia, Spain, France, Argentina but many

more…the participation was much more massive than the psychoanalysts and the public from here from Havana who were interested in psychoanalysis. The years that we didn't have a conference, 1996, 1998 and in 2000, we held study days of a local character…study days only for our group and some guests from here, from Cuba…the study day which we had in 1998 was called *'El psicoanalisis con boca'*… (Psychoanalysis with a mouth) which is a play on the words *'convocar'* (to organise, to call, to convene) and *'boca'* (mouth)…also, the Group of Psychoanalytic Studies of Havana (GEPH) every year since 1996, in the first semester of the year, organise an extension course in psychoanalysis, that is to say, an introduction course to psychoanalysis for those interested, a course which is called 'From Freud to Lacan'.**10**

On March 13, 2000 I enrolled and attended the first day of this course. The following extract is from my fieldwork diary.

'I am in 'Casa Juan Marinello' for the course in psychoanalysis. My name is not on the list and I can't go in. There is a problem because there are 63 names on the list and the capacity of the room is 40. I'm in the lobby waiting for Elaine….Eventually I was able to join the group. The subject was 'Introduction to the Unconscious'. I spoke to three speech therapists. The lecturer is an engineer. She certainly knows her material and gave a good clear concise outline of the subject with references. The students can use the library at the Polyclinic 'Rampa'. It seems that over 90 people expressed an interest in the course. I noticed some members of the military amongst the audience'.**12**

The number of people interested is quite remarkable. This second part of the introductory course (the first part took place between January 13 and March 9, 2000) was scheduled to run for 11 sessions between March 13 and May 18, 2000, on Thursdays between 2-5pm. This represents a considerable commitment on the part of participants because travel arrangements in Cuba due to the shortage of petroleum are at best difficult if not impossible. It also seems to indicate a certain 'openness' on the part of the participants' employers who had released them over an extended period to attend this course.

'The GEPH…as well as conferences, and study days, and the consultancy…we work around the texts of Lacan and Freud as well, the work that is called the work in cartels which is characteristic of the school of Lacan, five people working on the same theme with five individual themes as well as a general theme and at the end they produce something…they meet once or twice a month. As well as working in cartels we work on case presentations, or rather, internally we present clinical work

of the cases which we see in the consultancy, anonymously of course as in every presentation and we maintain relations with the Freudian Group, or rather, we are a group which belongs to the Freudian Group which embraces many countries'. **10**

As the interview progressed I was able to ascertain that there were twelve members of the GEPH: five psychologists, two doctors, an engineer, an individual dedicated to the theatre and three psychology students. The group meet twice a month to work 'around texts' or hold administrative meetings in order to prepare the extension course. The work of the cartels is quite apart from this. Cossio reported the existence of various cartels because apparently one does not need to be a member of the GEPH to be a member of a cartel 'there is someone from the group, but it could be only one person, with four more who don't belong to the group or three people from the group and two more or the five from the group, or whatever is the case'. This method allows those interested in a particular theme to participate and work on it from, for example, a psychiatric orientation but 'in relation with psychoanalysis and there (in the cartel) encounter a point of contact with psychoanalysis'.**10**

Further questions aimed at clarifying the above information seemed to lead to a certain distancing on the part of my respondent. In the following extract her answers became almost monosyllabic as I tried to clarify the situation with regards to clinical supervision of the clinical cases seen at the polyclinic.

Margaret: Do you have one person or is this also conducted in a group?

Elaine: No an individual supervisor.

Margaret: Another member of the group?

Elaine: No, an analyst.

Margaret: An analyst who comes here?

Elaine: Yes.

Margaret: And how many times does the analyst come?

Elaine: Every two months

Margaret: For some days?

Elaine: Yes.

Margaret: To conduct supervision?

Elaine: And personal analysis.

Margaret: Personal analysis is every two months?

Elaine:	No, that depends, but here in Cuba it is particular because of the situation we have.
Margaret:	Yes, There is no analyst living here?
Elaine:	No, no there are no analysts in Cuba, we hope to become them.

At this point I felt extremely uncomfortable as it felt as if I were attempting to draw water from a stone. I felt intrusive; however, I had made the purpose of the interview clear from the outset so I decided to persist.

Margaret:	Do you know why there are no psychoanalysts in Cuba?
Elaine:	Well, the little I know is that there was a group before the triumph of the Revolution, the same, psychologists, psychiatrists who were interested in psychoanalysis, but later this group dissolved, or rather, many of them left the country and … little by little they disappeared, or rather, little by little it ceased to be a theme, until 1989 when this group started to exist.
Margaret:	And why in 1989, why at that time?
Elaine:	Because interested people appeared, or rather it is explained because interested people appeared at that moment and not before, I don't know, I don't have an answer.
Margaret:	Because it was an important year, when the Soviet Union collapsed?
Elaine:	Yes, but it coincided with the visit of the Argentinean psychoanalyst to pass a period of two years here and therefore around her…

I have quoted this extract at some length for several reasons. Firstly, it was the most difficult interview I conducted throughout the whole period of time I spent in Cuba. I found this odd as because, at least theoretically, I had probably assumed that my own training and orientation as an art therapist would have had more in common with that of psychoanalytic trained practitioners than with mainstream psychologists. I am aware that I persisted in my questioning because I required the information and I didn't relish the idea of pursuing the contact with Cossio, who was hardly forthcoming. I was aware that as a new group they probably felt vulnerable or even threatened. My latter question regarding the previous absence of psychoanalysis in Cuba was probably clumsy, as it is

a profession whose practice, if not its theory, is closely correlated with the treatment of a privileged few.

The earlier exchange regarding personal therapy and supervision is also extremely stilted. In part it may have been due to my command of the language at that point in time which led me to being more concrete or blunt than I might otherwise have been. I also didn't know very much about Lacanian psychoanalysis and this led me to asking quite detailed questions and risk repeating myself for the sake of being clear about how GEPH functioned. A combination of these factors may well have made me appear rather ignorant which, of this particular subject, I admittedly was. On the other hand, when Cossio began the interview she was informative and it was only when I pressed for clarification that she seemed to close down. Of the first pages of the transcript several strands leap to the foreground. One of these is the fact that Cossio herself sets the point of departure, that is, by speaking about her own interest in psychoanalysis.

'Well, I'll begin by speaking about my own interest in psychoanalysis…'.**10**

This suggests that she is taking control of the situation from the outset and that she will decide how and where the interview will go.

There are also several references to colleagues from different countries coming to Cuba to attend the conferences.

'In 1995…many psychoanalytic colleagues came from Columbia, Venezuela, Ecuador and Argentina'.**10**

'In 1997… colleagues came from not only from Venezuela, Columbia, Spain, France and Argentina but much more…'.**10**

Cossio seems to be stressing the international flavour of these conferences and the fact that they attracted not only delegates from Latin America but from Europe. This reference to their presence seems to be being used to indicate not only of their interest in Cuban psychoanalysis but of the quality and importance of the conferences.

Later on in the interview, which seemed interminable, I asked about the client group and about the use of art as a therapeutic medium. Apparently, only individual work is undertaken and drawing is only introduced to children with the toys. No group work is undertaken and there is no work done with older adults. Regarding the arts, Cossio mentioned that 'many artists' attended the extension course but went on to briefly describe how drama students had participated in a seminar on Hamlet. Concluding the interview, I mentioned that Cuban psychology seemed fairly eclectic, mentioning a few of the approaches I had come across, I then asked her if there was a tolerance towards other orientations.

Elaine: I don't know it's not a question for me; it is a question for Psychology.

Margaret: But you are also a psychologist.

Elaine: Yes, but I am dedicated to psychoanalysis and therefore, if it is an eclectic psychology it will admit the different psychotherapies.

Earlier in the interview, I had asked her if any of the teachers in the faculty of psychology were interested in psychoanalysis.

Elaine: I don't know, you could put the question to them, ask them if they are interested in psychoanalysis, we invite them to all of our events so that they can participate…our teachers came.

In conclusion, this interview basically describes the activities of a small group of students of Lacanian analysis who have made some considerable achievements in having their practice recognised within mainstream psychology. More significantly, it represents a training programme which has been 'imported' from Latin America, firstly from Argentina and latterly from Venezuela which is being tolerated and it would seem supported by the State.

There is no evidence of any interest in the role of art as a therapy amongst this group apart from the use of drawings in work with children. Cossio did not elaborate how she worked with the images that the children produced or how she understood these images.

Abstract Theme: Defensiveness

There is no suggestion in the above data that Cossio, as representative of the GEPH was remotely interested in art as therapy or had considered it in any depth whatsoever. The interview consists of her recounting the origins and activities of the GEPH and there is very little evidence that she was prepared to interact with me. I suspect that in this interview my declared link with the faculty of psychology did not serve me well. This observation is based on her remarks regarding eclecticism and tolerance which suggest defensiveness as do her responses when I attempt to seek clarification regarding training. On the other hand it may be that she perceived my questions as naïve or invasive or that at a very basic level, I was simply unable to establish a rapport.

Others references to psychoanalysis in the data are few, scattered and only the response to a direct question by the interviewer.

Art and Psychology

The relationship between art and psychology is better established and interviews with Ada Bueno Roig and Aurora García Morey testify to a long standing interest and involvement with the use of art as a therapy.

Art Therapy for Art Students

Ada Bueno Roig's involvement has been primarily with art students.

> 'For twenty years I have worked in a consultancy, as part of an agreement which exists between the Ministry of Public Health and the students of the School of Art, through the Psychiatric Hospital of Havana'.**7**

Bueno explained that at the beginning she received students who presented psychological or psychiatric problems and attended to them in her role as a clinical psychologist. As she entered their 'psychological world' she became increasingly interested in the work that they enjoyed and in the development of their creative potential. She had been using the traditional techniques of individual psychotherapy with the students she saw but as time went on it seemed to her that it would be more interesting for them to use the same 'artistic manifestations in the development of the therapy'.**7**

'I began to work with groups of children, using drawing, using crayons, different elements of the visual arts, making small sculptures, from plasticine or clay and I noted how they enjoyed this activity, also music, dance, corporal movement and drama…in this way the child became enthusiastic about the activity…I did it in the form of a game …and they exposed all their problems and expressed their internal world'. **7**

Bueno Roig works at every level in all of Havana's National Art Schools, the School of Music, of Plastic Arts, of Ballet, of the Circus and Modern Dance. Children commence their studies at the School of Music at seven or eight years of age, at the Ballet School they begin aged nine or ten. Students entering the Schools of Visual Arts, Theatre and Circus do so, on completing basic secondary school education, aged fifteen. She pointed out that in the case of the younger children, they had not yet formed a vocation. Their interest in knowing more was motivated at the schools of ballet and music.

In this context she also mentioned that she liked to incorporate other children who did not attend these schools because she wanted to find out if children from normal schools could also benefit from these activities not just those who had already been identified as artistic and who were already being educated within an artistic milieu . She discovered that they did. Speaking generally of the use of art within therapy she noted that working with art had helped her better understand children.

'I have encountered children who are very shy, children who are very inhibited and this activity helps the child to break these emotional blocks, because he is interested in what he is doing… this is fundamentally the motive which I found interesting in the artistic part…that is to say, artistic expression, because it helped me greatly… to enter the world of the child and the adolescent'.**7**

The types of problems presented by the children are, according to Bueno Roig, extremely diverse. Amongst those referred to were: problems in concentrating; difficulties in reconciling dreams, a disorder which in Cuba is referred to *trastorno en el sueño (*disorder in the dream or dream disorder); anorexia, enuresis and encopresis; fear or aggression in conduct; or children from dysfunctional families, for example with an alcoholic father, or where family violence exists.

Bueno Roig suggested that at school these difficulties are manifested and that the teachers begin to detect a block in their learning.

'When one begins to investigate through these therapies, all the problems come out…and the very interesting conversations and dialogues that they produce in the home…they may be children who also have problems in communicating because perhaps they are very inhibited children…shy, quite the contrary of that which an artist needs to be, he needs to be a person who learns to project all of his personality outwards, it can be difficult and one has to provide them with resources, tools so that they can begin to learn how to manifest all their emotions…'.**7**

Three descriptive themes emerge from an analysis of Bueno Roig's transcript. These are:

- **Different arts, different problems.**
- **Emphases on methodology.**
- **Liaising with families and teachers.**

Descriptive Theme 1: Different Arts, Different Problems

I was interested in finding out if Bueno Roig had identified any differences between the types of problems presented by students of different artistic disciplines.

In Bueno Roig's experience the problems presented are different. Students of dance must be very directed towards their bodies and are continually working with their bodies. They must pay attention to their weight and this causes problems at the onset of puberty especially with girls when they develop adipose tissue.

'Great anxiety is felt, great fears of getting fat of putting on more weight than they should, because they must move in the space and if they are overweight it is will be more difficult for them to do certain exercises…therefore one often sees the girls with anxiety, fears, there are also eating disorders…anorexia nervosa and bulimia…'.7

Visual Art students seem to present different types of disorders.

'The student of visual arts doesn't search for his style in his body image…but in the style that he projects into his images …they wear themselves out searching for their own style which defines them…which identifies them…and simply what we use with them are techniques of self knowledge so that they can centre themselves in themselves and that they can search, in the development of their imagination, in the development of their fantasy, those images which they want to project…for this they must

be aware of their own personal identification and these techniques encourage this to do this and permit them to further develop their creative potential'.**7**

Bueno Roig also noticed that visual art students were more self absorbed and that in the moment of creation these students put themselves apart from their fellow students and sought their own environment in order to inspire themselves.

'The act of creation for them is more personal, individual requiring more hours of individual work…it can be that the experiences that he translates in the creative act…puts on canvas…takes from the experiences he has had in the group…but the creative act in itself…is more personal, therefore these young people are more solitary than the rest of the students…its true that one observes that the students of dance, ballet and music go about more in a group…I think that they have this characteristic because of their interior world where they work to search for that inspiration…sometimes I have encountered them in my consultancy, looking for that muse, that inspiration, because they lack it or they feel that it is finished, that the source of inspiration is exhausted…they look for other experiences in that inspiring source … I treat this simply…that they concentrate more in themselves, because in themselves they are going to find that inspiring source …and of course with the experience that they can have of their internal or external worlds, with their environment or with the type of relation that can establish…but certainly the visual arts student is more solitary. I think that this is linked with the manner that he processes the transmission of experiences and his creative act'.**7**

Descriptive Theme 2: Emphasis on Methodology
Bueno Roig works in two different ways.

Visualisation
In the consultancy, she has a sofa where she invites her client to repose. She plays music and verbal elements which provoke a state of half hypnosis and then works with visualisations beginning in the first sessions with very simple ones, for example, the observation of a colour, or a part of their body. After a few sessions she brings these visualisations closer to the internal and artistic world of the client. With art students, she encourages them to observe the objects they are creating and look for greater detail or better colour or distinct forms; with music students she and the client work on different rhythms and sounds. In other words, the focus of these visualisations will differ depending on the speciality of the student. She tries to put herself in their interior world but coherent with what they are studying.

Group work

Her other manner of working is with groups of children of different ages.

She described this work as having three phases. The first phase she describes as 'the explorative phase' during which she observes everything that is occurring in the group. During this phase she corroborates this information obtained from the child's teachers. In this phase the child has the opportunity to work with different media: art materials, music, dance or dramatic expression. A theme is given or suggested to the group or alternatively a piece of music is played and from this point of departure the child engages in a piece of creative work. Bueno Roig observes the personal characteristics of each child.

In the second phase, which she refers to as 'the corrective phase' in which she addresses through what she describes as 'determined orientations', or themes, the issues which appear within the context of the group.

> 'I try to manage all of the characteristics of the group…each child brings his own dynamic but the group also generates a dynamic over the course of time. There are children who participate more and others who participate less because they are more inhibited, more laborious…it is more difficult for them to communicate…there are others who are a little more rebellious or hyperkinetic and annoy the others…the group itself tries to control him…tries to contain this behaviour or this bad habit. It is not the adult who tries to control him…the child realises that the group will reject him for his behaviour because the group openly tells him or simply…he is not the child that they choose to make a representation or they choose him to represent a negative personality. Therefore the child experiences his problem indirectly and this is the real therapy'.**7**

Within this context she introduces elements of art therapy and drama therapy.

> 'I propose that they that they draw me their past, present and future in the form of a personal shield or coat of arms…in this shield they can project themselves and then I ask them to write a motto for their life …from this I can observe many diverse things…the use of colours provides me with some indications of their personality…independently of the content. I also use the free drawing in which they choose whatever gives them the most pleasure. Sometimes I have asked for drawings in which they make a mask with an expression representing well being…I propose that they go out into the garden and use elements from nature…they are in groups however, you can observe that despite this they are completely concentrated in the work that

they are doing...they come in and go out asking for colours or something…’.
7

Here Bueno Roig touches upon an issue raised by María Rosa Almendros and by Migdalia Hernández in their discussion of the work produced in the papier mâche workshops, that is, the aesthetic or the perception of the beautiful within the therapeutic context.

> ‘At other times I ask them to represent the opposite…the most ugly the most unhappy, the darkest…and other things are expressed. The projection here is distinct, some protest, some of them don’t like it and this gives me the opportunity to ask them what is it that they don’t like in this activity and why can’t they also represent something that makes them uncomfortable, why the can’t represent a negative feeling…this activity gives them the resources to exteriorise their problems and relieves them because communicating their problems makes them feel better’.**7**

At the end of each activity, which is based on a theme introduced or suggested by Bueno Roig, there is a group discussion.

> ‘We sit in a circle on the floor and they show what they have made during the activity, or share how they felt during the activity, all of the emotions that they experienced in that moment, if they felt well, what they liked most, what they liked least…often I ask for a phrase or a word to signify what the activity has meant for them and they themselves relate their experiences during the activity and interesting things always appear because as they are drawing they are processing memories, experiences, which come to light in these moments…things come out that they don’t remember and the activity makes them remember and this helps them to become conscious’.**7**

Bueno Roig describes this discussion as being group led rather than conductor led.

> ‘This part is very open, I am not the one who participates the most, I try to encourage them to ask and respond to each other…amongst themselves and this makes the participation richer…a basic norm that I suggest from the beginning is that they learn to listen…to that which the other is saying…because this is very important and they learn this and it enriches the activity’.**7**

From this discussion Bueno Roig identifies themes for the enactment of role plays or psycho dramas.

'Often anecdotes come out in these moments and I try to take advantage of an interesting anecdote by proposing to them that on the next occasion they can represent it and they chose, from amongst themselves, who are going to play the characters…it could be a model of the family or a conflict in the classroom…and they make a dramatic representation of this…something I do is that the person who tells the story goes out and participates from the outside…and I ask how could it have been different, if they had said a different thing or if the other person had said a different thing…and between all of us we reason and reflect on what has happened…and of course for him (the child who has shared the anecdote) this is very meaningful from an emotional point of view'.**7**

Thus, in the same group context, Bueno Roig uses elements of art therapy and psychodrama. She also reports working with the dynamics as they present themselves in the 'here and now' of the group.

'I try to manage all of the characteristics of the group…each child brings his own dynamic but the group also generates a dynamic over the course of time'.**7**

She also refers to boundaries in relation to containment and the development of trust.

'There is an empathy in the group…the group works as a group because there is trust, they recognise that there are established hours, that is to say, there is a discipline from the beginning and a motivation…I value very much the force of the group, their opinions and the interior dynamic that they create'.**7**

In the third phase, Bueno Roig begins to observe that the children have not only become more conscious of each others problems but are taking more interest in life and are managing their family relationships and studies better. There is an emphasis here on the child's relationships with others.

'How to help his father who is an alcoholic or how he can understand a sick person in his family, an old person who has difficulties or who is incapacitated'.**7**

When she sees that the problem with which the child has presented is beginning to improve and that there is a consciousness of this in the child she speaks to the other family members.

Descriptive Theme 3: Liaising with Families and Teachers

> 'I never forget the role of the family and the part of the teacher because the teacher spends a lot of time with the child…and it is also important that I share information with her and that I orientate her to the individual characteristics of the child. I interview the teacher and also the family…I do this in parallel with the work I am doing with the group but for me the most important work is with the group'.**7**

This work with families is on occasion further developed it would seem in two different respects, the first which seems to resemble parenting classes and the second which appears to based in family therapy.

> 'I sometimes speak with the mother or the father or sometimes the only person who helps me is the grandfather. Therefore, I speak to the grandfather and later try to integrate other family members. I have worked with families, parallel to the group (of children) in family meetings in which the child is not present…debating, discussing exchanging opinions around the child's conduct. I try to raise themes in which they can express their opinions…often they proceed (in their parenting) without orientation…I begin to understand how this family function …we call this '*Escuela de padres*' (Parents School)…but other family members can participate who are not parents…in others I like the child to participate and I think this is important because the child can listen to the parent's criteria which he hears in another form which is not the same as at home. Therefore we work with family dynamics'.**7**

Another activity, mentioned within the same context of family involvement is '*Cine debate terapeutico educativo',* (Cinema debate-therapeutic/educative). Here Bueno Roig shows a series of films or videos which address themes pertinent to the age group with which she is working. At the beginning she asks the participants to enjoy the film but also to observe in order to discuss the content afterwards. Examples were a film addressing adolescent pregnancy and a film addressing events following a divorce when the mother prohibited the father from seeing the children. Group discussion follows.

All of these groups begin in the October or November of the academic year and meet once a week. The school year begins in September and from then on Bueno Roig receives referrals from the teachers. She works with these groups throughout the year until the end of year or final examinations. In her opinion, this is sufficient time in which to produce a modification of behaviour in the student. She reports that she has the possibility to see that the students finish the course with better results and that they are

able to incorporate themselves much better in their daily activities as a consequence of incorporating the results of the therapy in their daily life.

Overall, Bueno Roig's work is confined to working with students of the arts with some degree of inclusion of students from mainstream education. Trained as a psychologist she has integrated approaches from the arts therapies as a means of treating blocks in learning, as described in her work with visualisation with individual children, and more general group psychotherapy where she works with children with various difficulties and of different ages within an educational context. Her descriptions of moving between modalities from drawing to drama to cinema debate suggest an integrated arts therapy approach although she at no point cited any theoretical base to her work. Despite this her description of group work and constant reference to group dynamics and inner and outer worlds, and to feelings becoming conscious, suggest an acknowledgement of basic psychodynamic principles.

Abstract Themes: Emphasis on Creativity and Empowerment and a Holistic Approach.

Bueno Roig's practice developed out of the work she was engaged in and as such reflects responsiveness to the needs of the children. Her use of different artistic modalities also reflects this in so far as she harnesses their preferred mode of expression as a potential therapeutic tool. In doing so she empowers the child. Working with what the children themselves bring to therapy is also reflected in her approach to group work. She reports minimal intervention from herself and describes how, within a framed or contained context, trust gradually develops allowing the children to function as a group addressing and resolving difficulties as they arise in the 'here and now' of the group setting. This approach can be thought of as empowering in that it introduces the notion that groups can be self determining and resourceful, and that solutions can be found within the group itself as opposed to being imposed from without.

References to blocks in learning and creativity are prevalent in the transcript. These are discussed in relation to referral and to some degree can be regarded as synonymous in so far as she is working with arts students. However, she refers to the integration of mainstream pupils and reports therapeutic benefits which suggests that the therapeutic benefits of her work extend beyond facilitating artistic creativity. Her holistic approach

is evidenced in her contact with parents, teachers and in her work with families. There is also an element of educational content in for example; her use of *cine debate terapeutico/educativo*. All of these factors indicate a bio/psycho/social approach, that is, an approach which takes into consideration all the factors at play that might affect the child's well-being, as opposed to locating the difficulty within the child per se.

The Incorporation of Art Therapy Approaches in Child Psychology

In the following section I will refer to the work of Dr Aurora García Morey in the area of child psychology and child psychotherapy. Her interest in Child Art has spanned over thirty years and is presented in her work *Indicadores por el analisis de dibujos infantiles* (Indicators for the analysis of children's drawings) which in 2001 was due to be published. At the time of interviewing her at her home in Havana in May 2000 I had known and worked with her for over seven months as a supervised post graduate student in a clinical practice attached to the University.

Given that art therapy as a profession does not exist in Cuba I was interested to record how García Morey first became interested in the use of children's drawings and their utility within child psychotherapy. In this context I expressed an interest in García Morey's background and theoretical orientation. The descriptive themes which emerge are as follows:

- **Formation and influences.**
- **Indicators for the Analysis of Children's Drawings**
- **Cross Cultural Implications or Transferability of Indicators.**
- **Analysis versus Interpretation.**
- **Theoretical Underpinnings.**

Descriptive Theme 1: Formation and Influences

She explained that the Faculty of Psychology at the University of Havana was created in 1962. Prior to the Revolution the only place where psychology could be studied in Cuba was at the Catholic University of Villanueva which was very expensive, class orientated, exclusive and white. García reflected during our interview that she herself, having come from a humble, working class family, could not have hoped to pursue such a career prior to the Revolution and the establishment of a meritocratic education

system. Despite the fact that she had attended a private primary school, she thought it likely that she might just have been able to train as a secretary.**8**

After the Revolution García was able to pursue her studies and she enrolled as a student at the Faculty of Psychology in Havana in 1967, the year in which the first group of students who had begun their studies in 1962 were graduating. The majority of her teachers were therefore drawn from the first group of graduates of the faculty, who on completing their studies were recruited to teach the students who followed them. Those teachers, who had remained in Cuba after the Revolution, came to the newly formed faculty from the faculties of philosophy and literature where they had previously taught psychology within the context of these other disciplines. Before 1962, with the exception of the faculty at Villanueva, psychology had not been established as an independent vocational training in Cuba.

> 'Our training was a very peculiar training, because as I told you we had very few professors. This meant that we students took on university teaching. We studied and those of us, who obtained outstanding grades in both academic and investigative work, because there was also a strong practical element to the training from the conception of the faculty, gave classes. We were then those who formed something that was called '*el movimiento de alumnos ayudantes*' (the movement of student helpers). **8**

The 'movement of student helpers' was therefore a group of high achieving students who under the supervision of a professor with more experience, or nobody in some cases, gave classes to the students in the years below them.

> 'It was something that was a characteristic of our formation. A formation where one mixed very closely with the student, very close to the problems that they had in that moment… from the social and from the community point of view. Eventually, along the way we became psychologists and we became teachers because that double condition was required, to be students but at the same time to be teachers and because of that our relationship with the students was a very close relationship'.**8**

García describes the early days at the Faculty as a time when many links were established with the wider social and cultural life of Havana. The first director of the Faculty was Bernal del Riesgo followed by Ernesto González Puí who as well as being a professor of general psychology was one of Cuba's most important primitive painters.

When García entered the Faculty in 1967 the director was Juan José Guevara. Her interest in children's drawings did not however develop as a result her relationship with the faculty but rather as a result of a personal problem.

> 'My closeness to drawing arose from a personal problem. That is to say, when my first daughter was born she had a congenital problem. That is to say, a congenital dislocation of the left hip that limited her movements and the power to develop by herself. She was in a plaster from her chest to her feet like an upside down Y, she could not sit, she could not walk and therefore the only position that she could adopt was face down. I had the task of thinking what she could do. She was one year old…a difficult time. It was a year…a very difficult time. I am speaking of the year…the year 1971. We had very few books for material reasons of famine. There were practically no storybooks like there are now, there were very few materials for the children with which to entertain a child in those conditions. But one of the few things that I could do with my daughter was draw'. **8**

García Morey's interest in children's drawings began to develop as a result of this experience. Like Ana María Erra Guevara, she reflected that she too as a child had painted and that at one time would have liked to have been a painter. From this point of departure García Morey became increasingly interested in art, not only from the point of view of learning or enjoying it but from a psychological point of view, as a therapeutic element and as an element in discovery of determined qualities and characteristics in children.

At this point in time after five years she had finished her studies in psychology. She continued teaching at the Faculty and took up clinical practice to which she had always felt inclined. This sort of work had been an important practical component throughout the initial three years of her training when she had undertaken a lot of short term work in social psychology.

Social Psychology
García Morey's definition of social psychology is particularly Cuban and her description of the work she undertook in the late 1960's has a unique flavour. However, the term social psychology was also adopted by the Argentinean psychiatrist and psychoanalyst Enrique Pichon Rivière who Sorín Sokolsky (1988) refers to in her article, as cited in Chapter 1. Pichon Rivière developed what is referred to as the Operative Group, an approach to working with groups which has elements in common

with the ideas proposed by Paolo Friere (Pampliega de Quiroga, 2001) and with the work of the British group analyst Foulkes (Pines, 2004).

'It was social psychology in the sense that we worked in rural and urban communities. That is to say, we moved to very distant places on the island and the most different places, mountainous regions or to communities with fixed characteristics…. the most closed or particular…and we made studies of these communities. Therefore, when I speak about this social work and of this social practice I am referring to the movement of our practice or our theoretical formation to a concrete work in a fixed place, in any part of the island. It was the same in Gran Tierra de Baracoa as in the furthest eastern part of the island that it was in San Andres de Caiguana or in a boarding school for primary school children…...but also with a characteristic of community studies; it could have been in Camaguey or any other part of the island. We did work that linked with the new…that is to say, the impact of the new technologies and the new advances that they were bringing to these communities…and with the preparation of the population for those impacts. I am speaking of places where they had never seen the cinema. Or places where they had never seen a television or had no idea what was a washing machine or a hairdresser. Our task was to study the community and prepare it for this impact and also to find out how the changes affected it'. **8**

García Morey explained that this work was undertaken so that women from rural areas could take advantage of the new technologies; incorporate them into their daily lives, thus making their work easier.

María Rosa Almendros, who was also involved in community work in underdeveloped areas of the island, recalls:

'The Communities Development Group…. at the beginning it was a little erratic…it began because sometimes the people ruined everything…they didn't know how to clean, they didn't know how to conduct themselves. We had to teach them all of that. I began that work because I had worked in a community before, I worked as a social worker, they called me '*la alcaldessa*' (the mayoress) because I told everyone what to do. I had to teach them the most basic things: wash a floor, light an oven, to not leave the lights on, to not leave the tap on…because just as the rivers flow they thought that the water should be on all the time'. **5**

The work that was undertaken at this time was, I believe, quite unique and there is no utility in attempting to define it with reference to any British counterpart. Basically, what both Aurora García and María Rosa Almendros were involved in was the mobilisation of groups of people, at a crucial point in the early years of the post

revolutionary government, who were motivated to take social action. These groups, or individuals, went to the isolated areas of the island principally with the aim of re-educating the people who lived there in the most basic aspects of modern living. In attempting to secure a definition of the work I put it to García that in so far as it involved a study of communities before and after a period of profound change there was a relationship between anthropological fieldwork and psychology. However, García declined this interpretation.

> 'To be honest with you, at that time, I am speaking of the years 1967, 68 and 69; we didn't know what was what. That is to say, when it was anthropology, when it was social psychology and when it was sociology. I am speaking about a group of young people, with one or two teachers. Sometimes we went alone, with work objectives, to study these communities, to collect information and to learn to be psychologists and to do this type of practical work, in the practical daily life, and evaluate it'. **8**

In short, their task was to identify the social problems in each community and devise means of helping the population. In psychological terms this was thought of as diagnosis and intervention.

It is well documented that the post revolutionary government's commitment to improving the peasants or campesinos 'lot' had its roots in the years of the guerrilla campaign in the Sierra Maestra. García Morey's account underlines just how different the life of the campesino was from the more popular and well known accounts of life in a cosmopolitan and decadent Havana.

> 'When I speak to you about Gran Tierra de Baracoa I am speaking about a place where now there is marvellous road that is called the Via Mulata and you can go there in a car. But when we went it was easier to go in a boat because no road existed. Communications, radio and television, did not reach there, they existed in Haiti and in Santa Domingo or in the base at Guantánamo, but not on our own island. They were very isolated places really set apart with very hard living conditions…in the mountains, they lacked everything…there were places which had no electricity, and the houses were of palm leaves and guano. Hygiene habits did not exist and therefore our work was in everything. We introduced elements of health, of hygiene…sexual education…think of the idea of very isolated communities, very closed because of lack of information which were soon to be opened up to the world, to begin to discover civilization, culture'.**8**

García Morey recalls how she and her fellow students learnt how to interview by interviewing, and write reports, by writing them. It was a training very much based in practice; working in the countryside, studying alone and returning to Havana to take exams.

> 'Not everyone was doing this, this rhythm, but a large number of students and practically all of the current professors at the Faculty took part in this history and this formation. It was very peculiar, but I think it was very interesting, very interesting in the formation of all of us'.**8**

These factors, her experience of her daughter's physical disability and her early formation in social psychology, are cited by García Morey as decisive influences in her professional development. Later she observed in clinical practice that there were differences between the drawings of so called 'normal children' and the drawings of children with some sort of altered psychology or psychological problem. With an awareness of this difference she dedicated herself to research and the investigation of case studies. Later still, she worked with groups in order to try to systematise her findings. This in turn led to her doctoral work, 'Indicators for the study of the child's free drawing' completed in October 1995.

Descriptive Theme 2: Indicators for the Analysis of Children's Drawings
She describes the evolution of this work in the following terms:

> 'The most difficult was…not only what the phenomena were but why they happened. That is to say, not only what the indicators were but what processes were implicated in each of these presented phenomena, or these peculiarities which were presented in the drawings of the different population groups. Later, when I had defined the indicators I dedicated myself to working not only to working with children with *alteraciones psicologicas* (psychological difficulties) but also with groups with peculiarities…Down's syndrome, with deaf and visually impaired children. Different populations, adolescents…finally…we are working, because there is a group of graduates doing their Masters in this theme…in hospitals linked to chronic illnesses. There is someone working in diabetes and also in problems of leukaemia and with cardiovascular conditions…using the indicators'.**8**

García Morey explained that in these settings the indicators were used as a form of evaluation, in diagnosis, as an 'evolutionary' method in assessing change and as a

therapy. I was especially keen to clarify these uses of the indicators because it seemed quite clear that their uses were not confined to diagnostic purposes. I suggested, by offering a synopsis which I reflected back to her, that the indicators could be used, in these situations, to better understand or know the internal world of the child suffering from the illnesses previously mentioned.

> 'Exactly, the way we use the drawing…is not only to think about the latent content or the projected or subjective contents…rather, for us the drawing is the elaboration of concepts, of ideas, experiences, thoughts, of course it is also part of the development of the child, of his conceptualisation, of his theoretical elaboration and also his personal elaboration'.**8**

This extract suggests an inclusive approach to the child's drawing and a view of the art object in its complexity, that is, an approach which views the child's artistic production as more than a simple projection.

García Morey identifies four important questions that she considers to be of importance.

> 'I always ask myself four questions when I have a drawing in front of me: What did the child want to say? What is his potential? What is he counting on in relation to psychological processes and formative processes to express that which he wants to express? What is his emotional response towards what he is expressing, in front of the impact and the environment which surrounds him? And of course what is his relationship to this environment with regards to his human relationships? That is to say, from these four big questions… that embrace practically all processes…cognitive processes, emotional and relational processes, one works on the psychological profile and also on the experience of the child in relation to his illness, his perception of himself and his perception of others'.**8**

At this point García Morey if she considered the indicators a sufficiently inclusive tool on which to base a diagnosis, mentioning the use of other tests used in COAP 'Alfonso Bernal del Riesgo' *Centro de Orientación y Atención Psicológica a la Población* (Centre for the Psychological Attention and Orientation of the Population) which I had used in line with the common practice there, for example, the completion of phrases.

> 'The drawing, for me, has a great deal of value. Of course, I have spent many years working with drawings. Or rather …of course, perhaps for others…they could think that it is an over valuation of a technique. I don't overvalue the technique but I try to systematise it and to make possible the

understanding of what there is on the paper. But I don't only work with the drawing (in isolation); I work with the free drawing (whatever the child elects to draw), I work with the drawings of the family, I conduct an observation, I discuss or interrogate this drawing with the child. I conduct an interview with the family. Or rather, a psycho-social interview which allows me to corroborate and reject or affirm hypothesises based on this interview or based on what I have observed in the drawing…but I believe that the interview with the child, the drawing in front of the child and the discussion of that drawing with the child…for me has a lot of value'.**8**

Non-Verbal Techniques

García Morey clearly states her preference for non verbal techniques. Referring to her use of other techniques she made the following remarks:

'When children are older than seven, six or seven years…yes, sometimes I use them…or rather I impart them to the students, from a teaching point of view…yes, I teach them to students, completion of phrases or the three rages, the three fears or whatever other verbal or non-verbal technique. But I prefer non-verbal techniques because in verbal techniques one says what one wants to say, that is to say, the other says to us what he desires. In non-verbal techniques it is not possible to control this, the person expresses…expresses themselves involuntarily, unconsciously, latently, the processes rebel. I do not make diagnosis only with the drawing, but what I make is a profile, I try to construct a psychological profile of the person and I make a hypothesis of the principal problems'.**8**

Following this García Morey makes it clear that not only does she not make diagnoses on the basis of drawings in isolation but that she does not consider the diagnostic interview to be purely for diagnostic purposes.

'This moment of drawing and talking about the drawing, is not only diagnostic, I also consider it to be therapeutic, because in fact this moment can also express and elaborate something that the person needs to express, it also…has a cathartic value, a therapeutic value because it is drawing out something that needs to be said'.**8**

The analysis of drawings takes place in a context of the relationship with the child, the interview with the child and what the child says about his drawing. All of this is further contextualised in relation to the concrete socio-cultural conditions of that child.

Later in the interview she offered a definition of graphic expression which appears to be tied to assessment.

'For me graphic expression is the representation on a surface of concepts, ideas, experiences, feelings and thoughts according to the perception and reflection of the environment of a person in a determined context, in a determined moment. Or rather, a socio-culturally determined moment so if each one of the indicators is thrown against this concept, the optimum power of the technique can be achieved'.

Presumably, what is being referred to here is that if each indicator is used to evaluate this socio-culturally determined moment in time then the indicator can be used to measure differences between different moments thus providing a tool for assessing change.

Descriptive Theme 3: Cross Cultural Implications or Transferability of Indicators

In order to clarify this further I asked García Morey her opinion regarding the analysis of drawings out with the clinical context and without knowledge of or discussion with the artist. In her opinion, this was possible but involved a risk. She suggested that it was possible for an experienced person to hypothesise about a case but that a margin of error would be involved. She also stressed the importance context in to applying the indicators cross culturally.

'We had an exchange with Brazil…I also used them in Peru…in general the indicators worked…from the point of view of content and themes there are variations according to the culture, or rather, the socio-cultural experience of those countries. Because the colour is different, in our country the colours are very explosive, the blue, the green, the contrasts are very strong. The people are very open to communication. In Europe it's not like this, in Europe the colours…the children are not going to…probably the same preferences in theme and content do not predominate. The colour is different, but also the characteristics of socialisation are different. That, which for us is normal, the physical contact with the child, probably isn't in other countries. There are differences and supposing that one is looking at a drawing blind one would need to have a minimum of information about that person, his gender age, the elemental conditions which surround him, where the test was done, the stimulation around him'.**8**

Here García Morey stressed the importance of the discussion with the child, pointing out that images that might appear to represent something to the viewer might represent something quite different to the child or the concept of an object held by the child might be quite different from that held by the viewer. Despite this and with reference to recent

cross cultural experience in Brazil, García Morey asserted that the indicators functioned and had the same diagnostic values as they did in Cuba although she noted that colour is used in a different form.

Differences in the Use of Colour

> 'I do not dare to make a generalisation. What we saw was effectively, the indicators are valid, but there are differences in relation to cultural characteristics even although Brazil is very like us…In our Havana Vieja blue and white predominate in the colonial architecture and the roofs are red…in Bello Horizonte the old capital is architecturally similar, the balconies, the roofs but instead of being two colours, they are all colours, or rather, it is an explosion of colour. Red, yellows, green, orange, violet…a very strong mix. Of course the children at the moment of reflecting or making their drawing use this mixture'.**8**

Socio-Cultural Differences

Another example given was Peru where García Morey noted the presence of the sun and the moon in the same drawing.

> 'In Mexico the conjunction of the sun and moon, day and night, is part of the indigenous philosophy and culture…in Peru it is very strong. There is very concrete religious thinking, very ancient and there appears the sun and the moon because the crucifixion began in the day, the night came and afterwards the day returned…Therefore in the Peruvian children's drawings, at least in the area of Arequipa, it is very normal that the sun and the moon appear in the landscape'.**8**

García Morey suggested that were I to use the indicators in Scotland some would be identical.

> 'You are not going to have a problem with the forms or the structures. You are not going to have a problem with the colour because it is a Western culture like ours. You're not going to have problems with the development of the human figure. Perhaps you will have problems with visual contact or physical contact between the figures represented in the drawings. Also, you will have to first carry out a general observation. A global application…look, only look at the drawings to see if some peculiarity jumps out which corresponds only and exclusively to the local culture, to the culture of the country. But this happens the same in thematic investigations when you investigate a theme and the theme is not free…the general indicators will work for you but you are always going to have to make a definition of the specific indicators referred to in the theme or the attitude of the person in relation to the theme…that is valid with the

adaptation or the adequacy or the definition of the specific indicators of your country's culture'.**8**

Thus in García Morey's view, the general indicators will stand but more specific indicators, such as the expression of physical contact will require a definition that is congruent with Scottish culture. Were I to use the indicators to investigate a particular theme, I would then need to identify a series of specific visual indicators pertaining to this theme.

García Morey stressed the importance of avoiding interpretations which depend on the specialist interpretations which, she fears may be personal projections and not characteristics of the subject. She avoids making interpretations which do not have an equivalent or are based in any process or any explanation more than the psychological profile of the person or the problem or that which the subject expressly states.

Working with Adults on Specific Themes

The indicators were originally designed to be used in work with children. However, García Morey has used them with adult populations to investigate specific themes of identity, or the perception of a determined problem. She reported that they had functioned well.

> 'The only thing is that in this case when they are thematic investigations about a specific theme, the drawing will be directed towards that theme and one always should have the condition, that the subject will make a free drawing which serves as a point of reference, in order to see…so that the qualities or personal characteristics… do not modify the opinions of the subject in relation to the theme'.**8**

It seems that what is being suggested here is that if the psychologist can distinguish what the personal characteristics of the client are in the free drawing she can then mentally separate these from what is depicted in the thematic drawing in order to ascertain what his opinion is.

In addition, as mentioned in the above section regarding their use in a different cultural context, it would therefore follow that the psychologist has to identify a series of specific visual indicators pertaining to this theme. In order to do this it was suggested

that 'when you investigate a theme and the theme is not free…the general indicators will work for you but you are always going to have to make a definition of the specific indicators referred to in the theme or the attitude of the person in relation to the theme…'.**8**

Thus, two elements must be identified: firstly, the client's personal characteristics from a study of the client's free drawing, and secondly, the specific indicators referring to the theme, which if we refer to García Morey's earlier comments would surface in a general observation of drawings. It is however, unclear as where this body of drawings would come from or how one establishes a one to one equivalency between an image or an aspect of an image and an attitude.

She is also involved in training psychologists and specialists in psychometrics to apply the indicators as a technique. She suggests that they require a different conception of looking at the drawing which is different from the traditional approach.

> 'The work of the indicators has nothing to do with psychoanalytic interpretation, or the interpretation of Goodenough, or HTP (house, tree, person test) or any of these projective tests. It is a different conception in the analysis of the drawing because of this the first thing one has to do is to overcome the resistances and formed habits of the person, in order that he confronts the observation and analysis of the drawing in a different manner, from a different point of view'.**8**

However she then goes on to state that while the use of the indicators requires training and practice the drawing has many things in common with other known techniques, for example, there are many meanings which are very similar to Rorschach.

> 'It will be much easier for the person who has training in Rorschach to understand what it is about. It will be easier for the person who is accustomed to think in concepts than the person who works within psychology in a more rational form, 'harder' so to speak. That is to say that flexibility or a sensitivity to try to see the codes and the concepts of other people…I think that this favours a better relation with the drawing from a diagnostic point of view and from a therapeutic point of view. Because it will permit greater flexibility…and…maintain a little more distance. That is to say, to not interpret what I see…but what the other wants to say and what are the conditions, the characteristics and his grade of interaction with that which he is trying to say. I think that this is the basis of this problem'.**8**

Descriptive Theme 4: Analysis versus Interpretation

Thus, García Morey seems to be representing a position which on the one hand seeks to systematise the analysis of drawings but on the other hand not interpret them. The distinction which she is referring to seems to rest upon the idea that an analysis will rest upon what can be seen and inferred from individual images and from what clients say about them while an interpretation will be more subjective. This distinction is perhaps best exemplified by a brief reference to her comments in relation to using the indicators in a context other than Cuba. I observed that the representation of the sun, for example, might be differently visually represented in Scotland because the sun in Cuba is much stronger.

> 'In Germany the sun is generically feminine and not masculine (in Spanish the word sun is el sol, that is masculine).There are interesting things but from that point of symbolic view we are going to see a psychoanalytic symbolisation or another type…they speak about the sun being the father…we enter into other terrains which as I already told you are dangerous because the capacity of interpretation enters that which is being examined'.**8**

It seems quite clear from this extract that interpretation is seen as subjective and allied to psychoanalysis whereas analysis is empirical, that is, it rests on what can be seen and what is said.

Despite her antipathy to interpretation, in so far as it is tied to predetermined theories of symbolic content, psychoanalytic or otherwise, she asserts that each thing which the client puts on the paper or the surface has a meaning. Concluding the interview, in response to an open question about the aesthetic considerations of the client, that is, his attempt to make something aesthetically pleasing, she offered the opinion that:

> 'Each thing on the paper has a meaning …the problem is in that we will be capable of deciphering that meaning. It's always for something, that which is beautiful, for the subject it has a meaning, because he needs it to be beautiful…who does he want to please? Himself, the other or is it part of his personal characteristics…nothing in the drawing is an accident. Everything has a reason…the problem is to know how to ask the reason and interpret the answer'.**8**

The reference here to interpretation refers to a different kind of interpretation that that previously referred to, that which was deemed as subjective or the imposition of a

predetermined meaning drawn from some theory such as psychoanalysis. In the above extract García Morey seems to be referring to the act on the psychologist part of formulating appropriate questions about visual images, which constitute a visual language, and translating or interpreting the response of the client.

Descriptive Theme 5: Theoretical Underpinnings

García Morey's stated orientation is historical cultural or Vigotskian.

> 'Basically Vigotskian…in the sense of working with elements which are in my opinion essential'.**8**

These elements, as identified and described by her are, firstly, the history of the subject or socio-cultural context of the subject. Secondly, the subject's strengths or the possibilities that exist for strengthening him and, at the same time, that he strengthens others. This interaction or interrelation is, according to García Morey, the concept of the zone of proximal development and all within that zone. The other basic concept is the social situation of development - the context of the subject - what has been his culture, his possibilities and how to work with this subject in this context. She stressed that this is as valid as the theoretical point of view in clinical practice.

> 'There are some who think that the use of Vigotsky in clinical practice is not valid, well, Vigotsky didn't work in clinical practice in a systemised manner but he also died young…and the concepts, I think as concepts are valid concepts because there is nothing more similar to the clinical history than the social situation of the development of the subject. There is nothing more similar to the exploitation, the strengthening of the subject than group work…nothing more similar than the utilisation of the concept of the zone of proximal development to the interaction between the psychotherapist, the group and the group in turn with the psychotherapist or in individual therapy'.**8**

This is a clear and powerful endorsement of Vigotsky's thinking in relation to clinical practice and particularly in relation to psychotherapy. However, García Morey goes on to point out that one of the characteristics of Cuban psychology training is an openness to use techniques or methods from other psychological orientations. In her own case she expresses a satisfaction and is comfortable with an historical cultural orientation which she feels also fits with her personal characteristics. In relation to her work with drawings she believes that the historical cultural approach is perfectly valid. On the

other hand she does not see herself or her colleagues as doctrinaire and believes that different theories have points in common. One difficulty she does point to is that each school sees man from a different perspective while the historical cultural model tries to see man from all of these perspectives.

Approach to Clinical Work

In the ensuing discussion regarding theoretical orientation in which I was attempting, rather clumsily, to elicit a distinction between a broad inclusive psychology and eclecticism, I suggested that perhaps some cases or particular problems were better treated by one or another approach for example, behavioural therapy in the case of persistent bedwetting.

> 'What is the danger Margaret? What is the danger of working with symptoms? I don't like working with cases symptomatically. I don't like it because it is like a little cure… putting a plaster on one part. It is definitive that children manifest their disturbances in a more varied form. If I get rid of his recourse, I will rid him of his symptom. The symptom will come out in another way, because until the problem is resolved the symptom will come out in different forms'.**8**

This is a clearly a criticism of some behavioural therapies that make no attempt to understand the problems underlying some symptoms.

> 'I prefer to work in a general manner so that the child will have his own resources…I prefer that the child has his own space, that the child will grow personally from that space …that is to say, working integrally, working from the historical cultural point of view…to make a study of this case, starting from this study …to find the space of this child, to see what were the causes, the mechanisms through which appeared these symptoms and not others and try to favour that this equilibrium that is broken…because the symptom is definitively a form of establishing an exchange. What is needed is an exchange which will not damage him and that is what one addresses. Or rather, to find mechanisms that will be healthier mechanisms…'.**8**

I decided at this point to seek García Morey's opinion on post Freudian approaches as these inform the main theoretical underpinnings of British art therapy. She was critical of several aspects including the focus on psycho-sexual development as opposed to the socio-cultural. On the other hand she is well aware that there are psychoanalytic currents which have a much more social orientation, and are more group based. When

meetings between Marxist psychologists and psychoanalysts had occurred, the first being some twelve years previously, she noted they had found points in common. Other criticisms included the lack of empirical evidence, the extreme lengths of treatment, and from an economic point of view, ethical issues.

Regarding the issue of personal therapy, in the case of art therapy students (who in Britain are obliged to engage in psychotherapy throughout the duration of their training) she was somewhat incredulous and thought it unnecessary in all cases. Referring to the situation in Cuba she pointed out that all potential psychology students were interviewed prior to admission. Placements begin in the first year of the five year training and students receive supervision in the clinical placement from a specialist.

In conclusion, these uses of art within diagnostic, assessment and therapeutic contexts as developed by Aurora García Morey are taught at undergraduate and postgraduate level in the Faculty of Psychology at the University of Havana where she is the Head of Child Psychology. As such, it is fair to state that the orientation described in the above interview constitutes the main approach to art therapy practice in Cuba at the current time, that is, an art therapy underpinned by Vigotskian historical cultural psychology.

Abstract Theme: Potential and Development

Aurora García Morey's work in the area of the analysis of children's drawings can be seen to be more complex and developed than the original thesis submitted in 1995 as described in Chapter 2. There have been numerous further research projects undertaken by her students extending the parameters of the indicators in terms of their evaluative possibilities. It also becomes quite clear that she is committed to the idea of art as a meaningful communicative medium and that her practice does not rely on the mechanical application of reductive visual categories. Her position within the Faculty of Psychology, coupled with the congruence between her psychological orientation and the recent resurgence of interest in Vigotskian psychology, which sits well with more contemporary international research in social constructivism and narrative psychotherapies, suggests that there is considerable scope for development in this area.

Chapter 7

Discussion

Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to review and discuss the material presented in the previous chapters, to evaluate it and to identify and to discuss what possible utility this study may have for the understanding of, and practice of, art therapy in Cuba, and, any implications for further research in Cuba or beyond. I will also discuss my findings in the light of a wider international context and with reference to the bibliography pertaining to this context. This is not an attempt to generalise but rather to locate and contextualise the material. My rationale for doing so is that this particular work is to be presented as a PhD thesis and not simply as a Naturalistic Inquiry case report. As such I am required to locate my research within the corpus of knowledge emanating from the discipline.

I will begin with a restatement of the aims of the study. Following on from this I shall draw attention to the most salient issues which arise from the study as a whole and summarise what I understand to be its main findings with reference to an international comparative context. Following this I will reflect upon and evaluate my research with reference to its reliability and comprehensibility. Finally, I will attempt to identify and relate some of my findings to possible further research.

Restatement of Aims

The original subject of this thesis was the relationship between art and therapy in post Revolutionary Cuba. As stated in the preface, given restraints that I could not have foreseen, such as the severe difficulties with public transport; amount of time spent negotiating access to both correspondents and archival material; and my commitment to the regular clinical work which had facilitated my original access and visa, I concentrated the collection of data in the city of Havana. However, much of the literature referred to and also the work itself, particularly of Antonia Eiriz and Aurora García Morey has been widely disseminated and relates to Cuba more generally. Thus the arguments set out within the thesis can be taken to apply more widely because the

influence of the key figures and movements that have been identified in the analysis are applicable throughout Cuba and their influence not confined to one location.

An Examination of the Integrated Findings with Reference to the International Comparative Context

In this section I will attempt to outline what I consider to be the main findings of this study and discuss them in relation to the international comparative context.

In Chapter 2, I suggest that the literature review reveals three distinct yet overlapping currents that appear more fractured than in fact they actually are due to gaps in the literature. This statement is subsequently supported by the material presented in the chapters presenting the data collected *in situ*. I will discuss these currents sequentially with reference to the data and with reference to a wider bibliography.

Art, Artists and Therapy

The first current or strand can be said to be that of artists working therapeutically in the community as represented by Eiriz and as documented by Cardoso (1973), Valdés and Chavez (1974), Eligio (1987), Martínez (1995), Lao' Izaguirre (1998), Abreu (2004), and the later work of Ulises Cruz in Havana Vieja as referred to by Leal (2000). This documentary material is supported by a series of at least fifteen interviews (See Appendix 1). In this context particular attention is paid to the work of Antonia Eiriz Vásquez who, it can be argued, emerges as a 'forerunner' of art therapy in Cuba.

Waller (1991) in her history of the development of art therapy as a profession in Britain (1940-1982) draws attention to this term as it is employed Ben-David and Collins (1966) to describe how a profession develops from the interests of a few people, the 'forerunners', who pave the way for a 'new idea' to emerge. This 'new idea' is developed by others who establish an 'interest group' and so 'found' a discipline; the 'founders' then teach the 'followers' (Waller, 1991, p.36). Gilroy (2006), referring to Waller's earlier work, also draws upon this construct in relation to reflecting on the development of art therapy around the world which suggests that it may be useful in thinking about the development of art therapy practice within an international comparative context.

Of particular utility is Waller's (1992) discussion of difference. Referring to the work of Ben-David and Collins (1966) she addresses the fact that art therapy means different things to different people. Waller (1992) shares their interest in 'knowing how it happens, that at a certain time the transmission and diffusion of ideas relating to a given field become strikingly increased in effectiveness and draws attention to their suggestion that 'the ideas necessary for the creation of a new discipline are usually available over a long period of time and in several places' (Waller, 1992, p.87). In the case of Eiriz the influences and variables at play are both explicit and implicit. Importantly and of relevance to the present discussion, Waller (1992) notes that only a few of these beginnings lead to further growth and that this occurs when people become interested in the new idea as a means of establishing a new intellectual identity and particularly a new occupational role. Both the data and the literature point to the fact that Eiriz developed the first initiative in the early 1970's when, following her retirement from teaching and decision to stop painting, she took on the responsibility for education and culture in the CDR (Committee for the Defence of the Revolution) in her neighbourhood of Juanelo.**4** Her ensuing involvement with Almendros, Hernández, Rodríguez Lazo and Nasser illustrates the development of the 'new idea' and its dissemination via differing trajectories. This process is known as 'role-hybridization' which involves the individual moving from one role to another, such as from one profession or academic field to another (Ben-David and Collins, 1966, p.459). Furthermore, the conditions or variables at play leading to this process can be identified and, it is suggested, used as the basis for eventually building a predictive theory (Waller, 1992). In the case of Eiriz these ideas have some resonance and it is possible to postulate that Eiriz constitutes what has been defined as a 'forerunner' of the trend of community based work more currently represented in the work initiated by Leal and Cruz in Havana Vieja. As noted in Chapter 4, Cruz knew Eiriz and was familiar with her work while Nasser who had worked closely with her went on to run workshops for redundant workers in Havana Vieja and viewed his intervention there as therapeutic.**1**

This construct fits with my previous decision, informed by the data, to locate Eiriz in one category - art, artists and therapy, and Nasser and Cruz in another, that is, collaborative working which in part reflects the chronological development of practice. It is also congruent with my observation of the continuity between Eiriz and Cruz with regards to their involvement in community work.

Similarly, with the exception of Tonel's (1987) article, a review of the literature suggests that Eiriz's work as an artist and her involvement with *el arte popular* are unrelated. However, here too it is possible to identify and demonstrate continuity with reference to her own statements and her early interest in assemblage and working with found objects in three dimensional forms (Bruzon, 1964) and to the data obtained from interviews with Graziela Pogolotti and Jorge Nasser. In doing so I have asserted that she perceived her work with *el arte popular* as a continuation rather than as a break with her previous work as an artist and teacher.

Regarding Eiriz's contribution to thinking about art as a therapy, the documentary materials relating to *el arte popular* tend to emphasise the community involvement aspect of the work but there is a notable lack of definition, little analysis and no mention of therapy. On the other hand, the data collected from correspondents between 1999 and 2000 suggests that she initiated what appears to have been an early flowering of art therapy practice in Cuba and that this contribution was much more substantial than previously assumed. Despite the fact that Eiriz did not set out with the stated objective of offering art as a therapy there is little doubt that she and those who worked with her were aware of the therapeutic implications of the work and this is demonstrated in chapter 4. As Waller (1992) notes with reference to Dalley (1987) 'some art therapists maintain that it is the involvement in the process of visual creativity itself that aids integration of the self and is, therefore, healing' (Waller, 1992, p.87). While it is doubtful that Eiriz would have defined herself as an art therapist her general approach reflects this concept.

It is also suggested that Eiriz was ahead of her time in offering workshops to entire communities and that this practice constituted social inclusion. The fact that work was facilitated in community settings may in part explain why the term therapy does not appear in any of the documentary material as such practices are generally thought of as clinical and the domain of health care professionals. There may also be a linguistic factor here as it is arguable that the word therapy in English is used more inclusively than in Spanish.

Finally, with reference to Ernesto Che Guevara's ideas on art and culture I have demonstrated that Eiriz very actively promoted and brought about the grass roots

movement which became *el arte popular* in a culture which did not have a strong tradition of artisan work and here I argue that this can be understood as an example of cultural democracy (Guevara, E. (1965), Freire, P. (1968), Craven, D.(2002).

Collaborative Working

A second current is that of collaborative work where artists work as part of a team in Health Care and other settings. The early work of Cruz in the *Biblioteca Nacional* as referred to by Valdés Marín (1979) and that of Ana María Erra in collaboration with Pérez Villar as evaluated by Vizcaíno Londián (1981) are examples of this. Cruz's later work, post 1994, may also be described as collaborative in that it forms part of a larger project and involves multi-disciplinary collaboration.

While the bibliographic evidence suggests that this current was short lived the interview data suggests otherwise. Cruz began his career in the *Biblioteca Nacional* in 1968. Prior to opening of the Casas de Cultura in the mid- 1970's Cruz became involved in child art education and it was from this basis that he came to collaborate with the psychologist Valdés Marín who collected most of his data on the development of children's drawing from Cruz's workshops at the *Biblioteca Nacional*. The interview data reveals this work continued until 1994. Throughout this time Cruz was involved with groups of children and undertook outreach work to six different hospitals. Similarly Erra's work spans from 1977 until 1991 in the Casa de Cultura de Plaza in Vedado when the Special Period brought them to a standstill as there was virtually no public transport. Thus Cruz's long career spans child art education, clinical work and community based work while Erra's begins with community work in the shanty towns and progresses towards the clinical. Both identify themselves as art therapists and have received some degree of psychological training. However, unlike Eiriz they do not appear to have attracted 'followers' nor formed an interest group and so, following Ben-David and Collins (1966) construct, can be thought of as 'founders' only in so far as they pioneered a new practice.

Ben-David and Collins (1966) distinguish 'forerunners' from 'founders' by whether or not they had students who followed them. Those who were not the students of a discipline (in the case cited, psychologists) but who trained their pupils as such are the 'founders' of the new discipline. Their disciples are the 'followers'. Thus in the case in

question only 'founders' and 'followers' can properly be thought of as art therapists (Waller, 1991, p.36).

Gilroy (2006) notes that in Britain, after the work of the 'founders' in the 1940's and 50's came their 'followers' in the 1960's and 1970's. The British Association of Art Therapists was formed in 1964, and in the late 1960's and early 1970's the first training courses were established. However, what emerges in an examination of the Cuban experience is that the 'founders,' Cruz and Erra, have not gone on to train anyone as art therapists and the 'followers' of the community based work inspired by Eiriz have not identified themselves as 'founders' of art therapy although they remain engaged in community based work with vulnerable groups and train others in the techniques of papier mâche. It then seems more appropriate to describe Eiriz as a 'forerunner' of art therapy in the same current as Cruz, and as a 'founder' of community art. The forerunners of community arts in Cuba would include figures like Freire, Guevara and others who promoted cultural democracy.

The most significant finding to emerge in this collection of material was the tension between diversity of practice and responsiveness. Rather than being theory driven, collaborative practices seem to have emerged very much in the process of doing and were primarily responses to need. If responsiveness is the unifying theme in this category, then diversity of practice is its counterpart. In other words, if practice is to be responsive then diversity is inevitable and desirable because each situation will be unique. Uniformity of practice might well impinge upon responsiveness. Initially I considered the possibility that this diversity might also go some way to explain why these 'founders' never developed a training programme, attracted followers or attempted to establish art therapy as a profession. Such a development demands concerted action and as previously noted an interest in developing a new occupational role, an interest which does not seem to have been generated by the founders with respect to a subsequent generation. However, Cruz and Erra were known to each other. Cruz refers to joint assessments and seminars given together and also to training people who were going to work with Valdés Marín. Conversely Erra does not refer to Cruz.

In thinking about the other possible variables at play I turned to the data where the Special Period emerges as a key event which led to the closure of Erra's workshops at

the Casa de la Cultura and the curtailment of activities at the *Biblioteca Nacional.* However, this only partly explains the phenomenon. Gilroy's (1998) points to another. In examining the development of the profession in Australia she points to several factors. She notes that between the 1940's and 1960's there existed local, individualised pockets of activity by people who could have become the 'founders' of art therapy in Australia, but they remained 'forerunners' (Gilroy, 1998). In the Australian context, two factors were at play - the tradition of artists working in hospitals and the lack of support from psychiatrists. As a result no 'interest group' was formed to develop an association and hence a profession. This occurred because of another set of factors: the sheer physical size of Australia and the difficulties incurred in maintaining communications; the absence of support from interested psychiatrists; the absence of psychoanalysts; and the dominance of the medical model and behaviourism in Australian psychiatry (Gilroy, 1998). The situation and its attendant variables are as one might expect quite different in Cuba however there are some parallels such as the problem with transport referred to by Erra. The absence of psychoanalysts is another common factor (MacDonald, 1996). It is therefore salient to note that both Cruz and Erra worked under the supervision of Pérez Villar one of the few remaining analysts in Cuba who was already quite elderly during this period and was in 2000 living in residential care. Pérez Villar represented one of the few psychoanalysts who stayed in Cuba after 1959. As the interview with Elaine Cossio demonstrates psychoanalysis was only revived as a discipline after the arrival of Eve Ravinovich in Havana in 1989 (with a Lacanian orientation) although my interview with Cossio gives no indication of any development in art therapy leading on from this. The only other named psychiatrists that emerge from the data are Dina Dinski who invited Eiriz and Almendros to work with the Chilean refuges; an Argentinean likely to have been familiar with psychoanalytic theory given the very high prevalence of psychoanalytic practice in Argentina and Juan Carlos Volnovich who worked with Villar and who was responsible for inviting Erra to facilitate a workshop. Volnovich an Argentinean exile like Erra worked in Cuba from 1976 -1984 (Hollander, 1997, p. 158). It is hardly a coincidence that the two main currents of development that involve artists are linked to the presence of these psychiatrists two of which were trained as analysts. As psychoanalytic and post Freudian psychodynamic theory have been concerned with art and culture where a more traditional medical model has not, the lack of support from this allied profession through its relative absence may possibly represent another variable to explain the lack of development. A further factor may be the absence of the

anti-psychiatry movement in Cuba referred to by Waller (1981) and identified by Wood (1991) as being influential in the development of art therapy.

Although I did visit all of the art schools in Havana, my research did not extend to asking young artists why they did not follow in the footsteps of these two founders and as the subject was never raised I have no specific data. However, at no point was it indicated over a fourteen month period that any other artists were working as therapists other than those I interviewed. My impression, gained from an immersion in the daily life and routine of Havana, was that there has been no concentrated attempt to create a new profession of art therapists because, it would appear, that there has been no call to do so. In part this may be explained by the socio-economic situation in Cuba which is quite unlike that of capitalist countries. As noted in chapter 1, there is considerable provision and support for the arts in Cuba. On the whole artists are highly regarded and being an artist also offers opportunities to sell work and to travel. This chimes with Gilroy's (2006) comments regarding developments in Italy where her understanding is that people who go to art school and become artists are a 'talented elite who wouldn't dream of doing anything other than being artists' (Gilroy, 2006, p. 15). Ben-Davis and Collins (1966) observations regarding mobility are of interest here. They suggest that the chances of major innovation occurring in a discipline into which there is mobility from a higher status discipline, for example from artist to art therapist, are considerably greater than in a discipline into which there is no such mobility, or which stands higher in status than the discipline from which the mobility takes place (Ben-David and Collins, 1966, p. 460). In the Cuban context the artist has status and the possibility of mobility, including access to the international art market. While the health care professional has moral status (Feinsilver, 1993) mobility is restricted due to shortages and lack of material resources amongst other factors.

The economic factors at play were brought home to me through my conversations with Nasser who had worked as a therapist but abandoned this to work as an artist, affording him opportunities to travel and to accept lucrative commissions from foreign owned hotels. Economically, there is not the same disparity between the salaries of health service professionals that there is in capitalist countries, and economic well-being may often depend on external factors such as having relatives in the States who periodically send money. Additionally, the growth of foreign interests in Cuba has meant that it may

well be more profitable to work for a foreign company as a hotel cleaner than as a university professor. One doctor I met earned more money as a taxi driver than as a health care professional. My best friend, a teacher, earned $11 a month, which is not as one might assume relative to the cost of living (a bottle of cooking oil costs 10 pesos or $1.) All in all, since the onset of the Special Period, the struggle for material survival has taken precedence over any other struggle. Other than the Cuban Art Therapy Association which transpired to revolve around Orestes Rodríguez González, there was no evidence whatsoever of any attempt to form a professional group at any point in any of the consecutive developments I investigated. This suggests that at this juncture any developments in art therapy in Cuba will occur within the all ready well-established and inclusive discipline of psychology and this appears to be confirmed by the data.

Art and Psychologists and Therapy

The literature review reveals that this third current begins with Valdés Marín (1979) and continues with the work of García Morey (1995).

At the onset of the Special Period we can see another development and an increasing systematisation of practice personified in the work of Aurora García Morey. It is also quite probable that I experienced some resistance to thinking of, what I consider to be my profession, being subsumed under the more powerful profession of psychology. Although it is arguable that this last area of work is the most developed in terms of theory and in terms of accessibility to evaluation I did initially experience some resistance to the indicators which I viewed as reductive. However, my later interview with García Morey reveals a greater complexity and depth and it becomes clear that the indicators are to be used only as a guideline - always in conjunction with an in-depth interview, that takes into consideration what the child has to say about his work and his historical cultural context.

I am optimistic about the development of this work because García Morey's approach is congruent with and compatible with other contemporary currents in Cuban psychology - . the work of Lev Vigotsky and the Historical Cultural approach. As such it is not as likely to be sidelined or dismissed as it might be if considered representative of another orientation - a psychodynamic orientation for example - although as noted in chapter 2, interest in this area is increasing within psychology (Cairo Valcárcel, 2000). Being

congruent with the dominant psychological paradigm, García Morey's work is more likely to attract multi-disciplinary collaboration albeit amongst mental health professionals as opposed to artists. Furthermore, it is proposed that the indicators may be used for both the evaluation of clinical work and for diagnostic purposes. Another important factor is that the indicators originate in the work of an already highly respected clinician who until recently was Director of the Department of Child Psychology at the University of Havana. They are being taught at various levels and as such are already being integrated into mainstream practice.

This description of art therapy as a practice within psychology emerges from the data and corresponds with Ben-David and Collins (1966) description of idea-hybridization which is distinguished from role-hybridisation referring to the combination of ideas taken from different fields to form a new intellectual synthesis However, as Ben David and Collins (1966) note, 'the latter does not attempt to bring about a new academic or professional role, nor does it generally give rise to a coherent and sustained movement with a permanent tradition' (Ben-David and Collins, 1966, p. 450).

On the other hand there is some evidence that there could be developments in this area as indicated in my discussion about the postgraduate courses taught at the Instituto Superior de Arte where Dr Dolores Rodríguez Cordero, Director of the Department of Pedagogy and Psychology is responsible for its post graduate diploma course in pedagogy and psychology of art. This course offers modules in group process; psychology of art, with reference to art and mental health; and in the psychology of creativity. Some of these courses are imparted by professors from Casa Fernando Ortiz; a foundation established in Vedado where courses in ethnography are imparted and where I undertook training in ethnography under the direction of Jesús Guanche a former pupil of Eiriz. Another of my former tutors Sergio Valdés Bernal a distinguished scholar, ethnographer and linguist also imparts classes in semiotics. Participants are mainly art teachers. Here I must admit a bias in that as an art therapist with a background in fine art and philosophy I find this area extremely interesting, that is, the potential for the development of a practice rooted in art itself. How it actually will develop remains to be seen. According to Ben-David and Collins' (1966) predictive theory will depend on a number of variables which at this time are clouded by

uncertainty given Cuba's precarious situation in October 2006 when news of Castro's ill health and fears for the future were uppermost in people's minds.

In conclusion, while there is no established profession and no indication of any development in this area, this is not to state that there are no developments in theory and practice; rather it reflects the very different social structure, a different set of priorities and at a basic level the lack of any clear benefit to be gained from carving out a professional identity as an art therapist at this juncture in the current context, where above all basic economic survival takes precedence. In the case of artists there are many other opportunities on offer while in the case of psychologists, who are plentiful, art as a therapy represents a development which offers possibilities for both research and practice.

These differences are of interest because they suggest that art therapy will develop in quite different ways in quite different contexts as informed by the innumerable variables existent in a particular time and place and dependent upon a number of quite diverse factors. This underlines the utility of the methodology employed which allowed me to study the relationship between art and psychotherapy from the inside, on its own terms, without attempting to impose *a priori* understandings of what art therapy is or isn't upon the data. It is also a conclusion which has parallels with the research findings of Waller (1991, 1992, 1998 and 2002) and Gilroy (2006).

Gilroy (2006) makes the point that the development of art therapy in the US and the UK is based upon a few hundred years of preparation that allowed art therapy to emerge, from the ground up. Here she is referring to their respective intellectual, political, cultural and visual forerunners followed by what one might think of as a 'founder' stage of theoretical, practical and political development congruent with their respective social and visual cultures. Other factors were the support from allied professions and, in the UK, strategic alliances with other arts therapies and the trade union movement. Of the UK context she also notes that our current position as a profession registered by the state may well have been aided by the fact that we are small, located on a couple of islands and have one public health system. This latter point of course chimes with the Cuban context.

Regarding the struggle for ownership Gilroy (2006) points to the fact that in the US and the UK the differing view about what art therapy was, were contained within the respective professional associations AATA and BAAT. This has not been the case in many other countries .Waller (1998) provides an overview of the European situation noting the extent of the diversity throughout the continent and the existence of several associations in some countries, for example Italy, where there are no less than three associations of art therapists all of whom adhere to quite different philosophies, orientations and practices (Waller, 1998, p. 132). This situation is paralleled in Spain as is the situation regarding the registration of psychotherapists which can only be practiced by those qualified in psychology or psychiatry. Such a situation excludes art psychotherapists who are graduates in art from registration and an example of this is documented from the Hungarian perspective by Vera Vasarhelyi in a personal communication to Diane Waller (Waller, 1998, p.119).

Gilroy (2006) suggests that social and visual histories that lead to a multi-disciplinary approach may inhibit the development of a discrete profession and this is salient in thinking about developments in Cuba where art therapy's most recent manifestation has been at the University of Havana within the Faculty of Psychology which is already a discrete profession with its own professional association. Therefore the notion of 'founder' and 'followers', cannot really apply to thinking about the work of García Morey and her students because there is no apparent attempt to differentiate themselves from psychology, and move from one profession or academic field to another because either an adequate professional role already exists or the moment has not come where there is a call to form one. Indeed, it may well be that with the passage of time, if some differentiation of professional role does occur that García Morey will emerge as a precursor.

That Cuba has developed its own particular forms of art therapy practice is to be expected as Gilroy (2006) points out 'the social and visual histories of different countries around the World produce different kinds of 'art therapy' practice' (Gilroy, 2006, p.23).Similarly, the American art therapist, Bobbi Stoll (2005) notes that 'there is no universal definition of art therapy and that differences in social and political contexts make it difficult to provide a universal understanding of what art therapy is, understanding how and with whom it is appropriately used and outlining ethical

practices for art therapists' (Stoll, 2005, p. 189). These observations are I believe well illustrated in the data that I have presented. However, time does not stand still and these histories visual, social, political and economic are forever in the making and will inform what art therapy practice in Cuba will become. It may be that art therapy as it is understood in the Cuban context will be subsumed by psychology within a broadly medical/psychological framework or it may develop as a specific visual practice alongside community arts or art education as a form of social inclusion.

Reflexivity and Evaluation

In this section I will attempt to reflect upon and evaluate the utility of the findings presented in this study. I began this study in April 1999 with a one month pilot study in Havana. This was followed by a prolonged period in the field from June 1999 to June 2000 and a follow up visit in August 2001. The study was entirely self-funded and involved a one year period of unpaid leave followed by a further period of very part-time employment in Barcelona from July 2004-August 2005 when most of the data analysis and writing up was done. This constitutes a major economic, professional and emotional investment and raises the obvious question as to whether I can be sufficiently objective enough to evaluate what I have achieved. In order to evaluate such a piece of work one has to set it against certain criteria. Lincoln and Guba (1985) suggest that these be the following:

Truth value: where the researcher must show that he or she has represented multiple constructions adequately. In so far as I am aware or able I have satisfied this criterion by interviewing to saturation point, that is, to the point where no new information emerged. The literature research was similarly painstaking and although beset by the fundamental difficulty of lack of photocopying machines is I believe exhaustive. I have also cited a number of unpublished texts such as the doctoral theses of García Morey and Vizcaíno Londián. I conducted 28 interviews in total and have cited extensively from a cross-section of them. Interview material was repeatedly transcribed and cross referenced for congruence and where there were discrepancies these were either followed up for clarification or, when quite different perspectives were represented, cited in the text. I consider myself extremely fortunate in so far as I was never refused an interview, only occasionally would respondents ask me to turn off the tape, which I did. I have respected their confidentiality throughout and in all cases made my interview transcript

available to correspondents in the event that they may have wished to modify or change anything. This offer was taken up by only one correspondent, Ana María Erra. Speaking Spanish was obviously indispensable as this allowed me access to the university, to undertake clinical work and to immerse myself in a way of life. Living with a Cuban family in modest circumstances, having a child at school and being followed everywhere by a small Cuban dog all helped and it seems that I was trusted. Indeed, I would describe my situation as privileged in terms of access to potential correspondents and to documentary material.

Applicability: here the concept of transferability is central and it is asserted that transferability inferences cannot be made by an investigator who knows only the sending context. I will therefore in my discussion of this criterion refer to more recent field work in the Republic of Georgia (September 2004 and December 2004-January 2005) and with victims of torture of the Pinochet regime in Chile (July-August 2006) as an exemplar of hypothetical applicability in the following section.

Consistency: in conventional studies consistency is usually demonstrated by replication, dependent on something tangible and unchanging 'out there' that can serve as a benchmark. Lincoln and Guba (1985) point out that the requirement that repetitions be applied to the same units (Ford, 1975) as indices of consistency, is precisely the condition of consistency that can never be met, 'just as one can never cross the same stream twice' (Lincoln and Guba,1975, p. 299).

Neutrality: refers to objectivity. In naturalistic inquiry the emphasis on objectivity is removed from the researcher and places it on the data itself where Lincoln and Guba (1985) argue it ought more logically to be. The issue is no longer the investigator's characteristics but the characteristics of the data and whether or not they are confirmable. In some cases a confirmability audit is performed, in others such as mine, processes of triangulation (Denzin, 1978) are more appropriate as well as keeping a reflexive journal. I have evidenced these processes throughout the text by cross referencing at the stage of analysis and by referring to my own inner processes in terms of tacit knowledge. Being a trained and experienced therapist was particularly helpful to me in this as I found it almost second nature to reflect on the impact I was having and the impact the setting or situation was having on me. I am also accustomed to

examining my own prejudices and blocks and am generally able to recognize them. I have referred to some of these where it has it been salient in the text.

Further Discussion and Future Work

I am convinced that Naturalistic Inquiry was and is the appropriate methodology for investigating sensitive contexts where little *a priori* information is available. It is sufficiently flexible to allow for all the unknowns that the researcher will encounter and it allows her to interact with and adapt to the context. Subsequently, grounded theory allowed the researcher to work with what in my case was a massive amount of collected material and, from the arising themes, attempt to theorise. In my own case the issue of reflexivity was central. Unlike classical ethnography, Naturalistic Inquiry incorporates the notion that both the investigated and the investigator will be changed in the process of inquiry, that reflexivity works in both directions. Other research interests have surfaced directly relating to some of the analytic themes and I have made tentative links in terms of applicability to other situations.

Applicability

The main applicability of the study lies in the proven use of Naturalistic Inquiry and Grounded Theory as methodologies appropriate to the study of art therapy in different cultural settings. Other than this I would suggest that the study illustrates how art therapy has developed in Cuba over a particular time span, from 1970 to 2000 and gives a sense of the main players and their various ways of working which I have argued have to be understood and considered in context.

Other issues are more broadly applicable and suggest further research. These are the perception of the aesthetic in relation to the therapeutic, which emerged as a descriptive theme in Chapter 4; the possibilities of further exploration of Vigotsky's cultural historical approach in relation to thinking about art therapy, which are beyond the parameters of this present text; and the links that have been drawn to my attention between the ideas of Paolo Freire and Enrique Pichon Rivière.

The Beautiful

Rosa María Almendros's words 'they tried to make beautiful things', when describing the work produced by the Chilean women refugees, have stayed with me. In September

2004 I was invited by the Georgian Centre for the Social and Psychological Rehabilitation of Torture Victims to spend a month working with their team in the Pankisi Valley with Chechen refugees. In this context, thousands of miles from Cuba, I believe I witnessed the same phenomena. Previously, I may well have attributed these phenomena to the one of the psychological defence mechanisms outlined by Anna Freud (1938) or Klein (1929), however I was loathe to make such an assumption as it seemed presumptive if not disrespectful. Later, in Barcelona I mentioned this to the husband of an ex. student, an Argentinean psychologist. He disappeared from the room and returned with a collection of letters which his mother had written to him during the last year of her five year imprisonment under the military dictatorship in the late 1970's. Each letter was illustrated; sometimes with a drawing and sometimes embroidered with threads which she had pulled from her blanket or that her cell mates had pulled from theirs. Yellowed and frayed at the edges they remained, more than thirty years later, extraordinarily beautiful. But what is it that is beautiful about them and what was beautiful about the duck with four legs that Eiriz's student made? These questions and the way they relate to the lived experience of survivors of torture have become my current research interest as has my ongoing interest in Latin America. In July 2006 I made a trip to Santiago de Chile at the invitation of the University of Chile.

During that time I made contact with the *Fundación De Ayuda Social De Las Iglesias Cristianas* (Foundation of Christian Churches for Social Care) and participated in an art group led by the psychologist Deyanira Corvalan Robert. This group of women were survivors of political repression and of torture, if not directly then indirectly through the execution or disappearance of a close family member; a husband a sister or a child. I attended this group on three occasions with their permission and was warmly welcomed by them. In explaining my presence and my interest I recounted what Rosa María had told me about the Chilean refugees in Cuba and I asked them what they found helpful about the art group where they were engaged at that time in fabric painting. I explained that this was not mere curiosity but that I wanted to understand in order to help others understand that this sort of work was valuable. Alicia Margarita Allende spoke for the group. She told me that the group was very important to the women. It provided them with a place to be where the painful past could be addressed and be understood but also a place where they could be together doing something creative. It would be impossible she said to only talk. The past was painfully present and many women approached me individually to show me photographs of their loved one and tell me their story. These

stories were told to me while the women painted. On my last day they elected to give me their testimonials, a practice associated with the bringing to justice of the perpetrators in the aftermath of the dictatorship and with the process of reparation. This material forms part of another study but it pertains to this one in that it illustrates how one story can speak to another.

Over and beyond this I am convinced that further research in an art therapy practice underpinned by a Vigotskian psychology located in the wider context of social constructivism could yield interesting results. Such an approach could also offer possibilities for developments in the UK where current trends in Evidence Based Practice have sometimes impeded research for the art therapies which do not easily conform to such a restricted evaluative paradigm.

In conclusion, while my findings are modest I have faithfully attempted to represent a 'snapshot' of a particular time as viewed through the eyes of the key figures involved in the development of art as a therapy in Cuba over a forty year period.

Chapter 8

Conclusions

In the preceding chapter the main themes emerging from the data and the literature review were discussed and the study as a whole evaluated in terms of its validity. In this section my aim is to present my conclusions.

My conclusions are modest. Firstly, I conclude that the term 'art therapy' need not adhere and indeed cannot adhere to a narrow definition when it is applied to thinking about and understanding other practices in other social, economic and cultural contexts. This assertion is in keeping with the literature emanating from the international comparative context (Waller, D. (1984, 1991, 1992, 2002), Stoll, B. (2005) Kalmanowitz, D. and Lloyd, B. (eds.) (2005), Gilroy, A. (2006). There is no monopoly on the term and any judgement of what does or not constitute therapeutic practice through art cannot rest upon an extrapolation of understandings or definitions which have developed in quite different situations and contexts. To do so would be to exercise cultural imperialism. I therefore conclude that it is perfectly valid to refer to practices where art is used to help people as therapeutic if these practices are regarded as such by respondents. The development of art therapy in Cuba is the story of another time and place and it emerges quite clearly from the data that there is no call at the present time for a closer definition, neither in terms of practice nor in terms of nomenclature.

I therefore conclude that the work of Antonia Eiriz Vásquez and her colleagues represents what I have referred to as an early flowering of art therapy practice in Cuba albeit that the conscious objective was not to provide therapy through art per se. It was an inspiring and revolutionary practice which allowed all sorts of people entry into a previously unknown world of artistic creativity and it allowed each individual to take what they needed from that world. For some it involved, as Martínez (1995) suggests, reaching the impoverished, opening their eyes and mind to their own creativity and teaching them a liberating way of making a living (Martínez, 1995, p.2). For others it was clearly psychologically therapeutic and the data provides numerous testaments to

this. Of these, two examples stand out, that of Papo Gutiérrez tortured by his inner world and that of the Chilean refugee women who had been tortured, quite literally, in this world. Both used art as a means of expressing these experiences in what would seem to be quite different ways, and yet which have in common something akin to transcendence. Papo's monsters become beautiful objects and the Chilean women in 'trying to make beautiful things' can be seen as an attempt to transcend the terrible reality of their predicament. To transcend implies to move beyond or to surpass and I would tentatively suggest that perhaps opening people's minds to their own artistic creativity may open them to their creative abilities in a wider sense and facilitate their ability to make sense of their experiences of both their inner and outer worlds by providing a bridge between these worlds. Making sense of experience through art may be to directly express that experience or to make something else of it by transforming it, as in Papo's masks. It may also be to move beyond that experience through the reaffirmation of the beautiful in art which may represent the beautiful in life. These experiences may be immensely empowering and it is my contention that Eiriz understood this very well.

Secondly, I conclude that it is possible to trace a development of overlapping strands or currents of practice in art therapy practice beginning with Eiriz where practitioners were mainly artists. This strand, I have argued, has continued in the work of Cruz in Havana Vieja. An interim stage emerges where the artists, Cruz, Erra and Nasser, worked in collaboration with psychologists, and although barely documented this too can be seen as continuing in the collaborative work in Havana Vieja. The present situation suggests art therapy is being almost exclusively practiced by psychologists and the exception again is Cruz. One factor which has remained constant is the preference for group work over individual work. Another is that of responsiveness which seems to be not only a recurrent theme suggesting a tolerance of diversity but an element related to resilience.

The work of Ben-David and Collins (1966) has been effectively used by Waller (1991, 1992) and Gilroy (2006) and has been extremely useful in thinking about the data in relation to both the international comparative context and relating this to developments in Cuba. Their schema of precursor, founder and follower, is flexible enough to describe and contextualise the data with reference to other contexts without distorting it or

forcing by preconception which as Glaser (1992) puts it constantly derails it from relevance (Glaser, 1992, p. 123).The data has I believe been allowed to speak for itself.

While it is beyond the parameters of this study to predict future developments there is some evidence to suggest that if art therapy is to develop in Cuba it will in the immediate future be within the discipline of psychology. One side effect of this may be less diversity of practice and this is to be regretted because it is argued that responsiveness and diversity of practice may be closely correlated. Conversely, recent developments at the Instituto Superior de Arte suggest other possible trajectories with links to philosophy, aesthetics and psychology within the context of art education. This trajectory does not feature greatly in the data but as I review the data as a whole it stands out and I am reminded of Lincoln and Guba's (1982) reference to the importance of difference. They suggest that the central aim of a research project which uses naturalistic inquiry is not the consensus of interpretation, thus illuminating majority views, but a search for the peculiar. The reason for this is that change is ongoing and the dynamic of change, in humans, can potentially and initially be identified in the minority. This can be said to be true of the Cuban Revolution around which most of this thesis revolves. It may also be true of what is to transpire in the development of art therapy practice. Ironically, and perhaps appropriately this note of difference emerges from the Instituto Superior de Arte where Eiriz taught and which Herbert Read referred to as the most advanced art school in the World.

Bibliography

Abreu, A. D (2004) De la rabia a la ternura, Diario Granma, Junio 17, 2004, Año 8/Numero 169.

Aguilar, L.E. (1993) Cuba 1930-1959, In Cuba: A Short History, Ed. Bethell, L., Cambridge University Press.

Alguilar León, L. (1994) La 'Decada Trágica', In La Havana 1952-1961: El fin de un mundo, el principio de una ilusión, Alianza Editorial.

Alonso Álvarez, A. (2002) La Interpretación Cualitativa En La Técnica De Rorschach, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol.19, No.1.

Álvarez, F. (2002) Los esplendorosos años sesenta, http://www.Havanelegante.com/Spring2002/Cafe.html.

Alverasturi, E. (1980) Psychology and Health Care in Cuba, American Psychologist, Vol.35, No. 12.

Anreus, A (2004) The road to Dystopia: the paintings of Antonia Eiriz, LookSmart's FindArticles–ArtJournal.
http://www.findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0425/is_3_63/ai_n6213161/print.

Ben-David, J. and Collins, R. (1966) Social factors in the origins of a new science: The case of Psychology, American Journal of Sociology Review, 31 (4), 451-465.

Best, D. (1992) The Rationality of Feeling, The Falmer Press.

Blanc,G.V. (1994) Art Nexus, July-September.

Bourdieu, P. (1984) Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste, Cambridge, Mass.

Brody, J. (1984) 'Cuban Culture Dances to a Popular Beat', International Herald Tribune, November, 23rd, pp. 9-10.

Burton, J (1986) Cinema and Social Change in Latin America: Conversations with Filmmakers, Austin, Texas.

Bruzon, M. T. (1964) Catalogue for 'Ensamblajes', Museo Nacional, Sept.10-30.

Cairo Valcárcel, E. (1998) Análisis Bibliometrico De La Revista Cubana de Psicología: Una Modesta Contribución Para La Tarea Mayor: Escribir La Historia De La Facultad De Psicología De La Universidad De La Havana, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol.15, No.3.

Cairo Valcárcel, E. (2000) Tres Lustros De La Revista Cubana De Psicología, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol.17, No.1.

Calviño Valdés-Fauley, M. (1998) Nacido En Los Sesenta E Inscrito A Los Treinta Y Cinco, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol.15, No.3.

Calviño Valdés-Fauley, M. (2000) La Bibliotecaria Ya No Es Una Vieja, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol.17, No.1.

Calviño Valdés-Fauley, M. (2000), Psicología, Marxismo Y Postmodernismo, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol. 17, No.3.

Calzadilla Fierro, L. (1998) Apuntes para la Historia de la Psiquiatrico en Cuba, Revista Del Hospital Psiquiatrico De La Havana, Ministerio De Salud Publica.

Camnitzer, L. (1994) New Art of Cuba, Austin Texas.

Cantor, J. (1995) Tales of the Macabre, Miami New Times, 5 October.

Capote, A. (1995) Sus Monstruos Se Tornaron Mariposas, Obituario, Granma

Cardenal, E. (1972) En Cuba, New York.

Cardoso, O. J. (1973) 'Arte Popular', in Cuba, pp.24-29.

Carpentier, A. (1963) 'Color de Cuba: Rene Portocarrero', Reprinted in Rene Portocarrero: Exposición Antológica (Madrid: Museo Español de Arte Contemporáneo, 1984).

Carpentier, A. (1977) Grande Personajes A Fondo, Entrevista con Joaquín Soler Serrano en Madrid, TVE.

Castro, F. quoted in Loomis (see below)

Chandrasekhar, C.P. (1999) Cuba: Dealing with the Dollar, Frontline, Vol.16, Issue 8.

Christov-Bakargiev, C. (2001) Thrust into the Whirlwind: Italian Art Before Arte Povera, In Zero to Infinity: Arte Povera 1962-1972, Tate Modern, London.

Clerc, J. (1994) 'Una democracia dos veces asesinada, In: La Havana 1952-1961: El final de un mundo, el principio de una ilusión. Alianza Editorial.

Clerc, J. (1994) Una democracia dos veces asesinada, In: La Havana 1952-1961: El final de un mundo, el principio de una ilusión. Alianza Editorial.

Cohen, L. and Manion, L. (1992) Research Methods in Education, Routledge, London.

Consuegra, H. (1964) Catalogue for 'Pintura y Ensamblajes', Galeria de la Havana, Jan.22-Feb.23.

Craven, D. (2002) Art and Revolution in Latin America 1910-1990, Yale University Press, New Haven and London.

Davies, L. (1996) Letter of July 23, http://www.henrygeorge.org/cultsex/72396.htm

De Armas, M. (1977) 'Casas de Cultura', In Revolución y Cultura, Vol.61.

De Juan, A. (1966) Catalogue for Exhibition with Raúl Martínez at Casa Del Lago, Universidad Autonoma de México, Dirección General de Difusión Cultural, Oct.-Nov.

Denny, T. (1978) Storytelling and Educational Understanding. Paper presented at the national meeting of the International Reading Association, Houston.

Dey, I. (1999) Grounding Grounded Theory: Guidelines for Qualitative Enquiry. London: Academic Press.

Domínguez, J. (1996) Cuba Since 1959, In Cuba: A Short History, edited by Bethell, L., Cambridge University Press.

Dueñas Becerra, J. (2002) Psico-diagnostico de Rorschach: Antecedentes Científicos y Artísticos, Revista Cubana de Psicología, Vol.19, No. 3.

Dueñas Becerra, J. (2003) Doctor Rolando Valdés Marín (1926-2002), Revista Cubana de Psicología, Vol.20, No.3.

Dueñas Becerra, J. y Pardillo Palomino, J. (2001) El Resurgir de Rorschach en Cuba (19991-1999), Revista Cubana de Psicología, Vol.18, No.1.

Echemendia Tocabens, B. (2003) El Surgimiento Del Enfoque Histórico Cultural Como Alternativa Marxista Al Problema De La Crisis De La Psicología, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol.20, No.1.

Eligio, A. (Tonel) (1987) Antonia Eiriz En La Pintura Cubana, in Revolución y Cultura, No.3, marzo, p.38-45.

Emery, S. (1978) Actualisations: You don't have to rehearse to be yourself, Doubleday, Garden City, NY.

Entralgo, E. (1996) Periódica Sociografica de la Cubanidad, Colección La Fuente Viva, Fundación Fernando Ortiz.

Erlandson et al. (1993) Doing Naturalistic Inquiry: a Guide to Methods, Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Febles Elejalde, M. Selier Crespo, Y. y Fernández, D.M. (2000) El Enfoque Humanista del Desarrollo: Posible Desde Vigotsky, Vol.17, No.1.

Feinsilver, J.M. (1993) Healing the Masses: Cuban Health Politics and Abroad, University of California Press.

Flood, R. et al, (2001) Zero to infinity:arte povera, 1962-1972, Tate Modern, London.

Freire, P. (1968) Pedagogy of the Oppressed, New York.
García(2005) Cuban Art: A Brief History,
http://www.antilliania.com/Cuba_Art_History.htm.

García Alverasturi (1980) Psychology and Health Care in Cuba, American Psychologist, Vol.35, No. 12.

García Morey, A. (1983) Selección de lecturas de la evaluación y diagnostico infantil, Universidad de la Havana, Facultad de psicología.

García Niubó, D. (1998) Vigotsky: Maldición e Irreverencia De Una Primavera, Vol.15, No.2.

Georgakas, D. (1985) 'Controversial Cuba Lejanía Opens', In Guardian, September 30, New York.

Gilroy, A. and Hanna, M. (1998) Conflict and Culture in Art Therapy: An Australian Perspective, In A Tapestry of Cross Cultural Issues in Art Therapy, Calisch, A. Hiscox, A. (Eds.) Jessica Kingsley Publications, London.

Gilroy, A. (2006) Histories, politics and visualities: The development of art therapy around the world, Keynote Speech given at Long Island University, New York.

Girona, J. (1987) Catalogue for 'Exposición Transitoria 25 Grabados de Antonia Eiriz', Museo Municipal San Miguel Del Padron.

Glaser, B. G. (1978) Theoretical sensitivity advances in the methodology of grounded theory. Mill Valley, CA: The Sociology Press.

Glaser, B.G. (1992) Emergence vs. forcing basics of grounded theory analysis. Mill Valley, CA: The Sociology Press.

Glaser, B. and Strauss, A. (1967) The Discovery of Grounded Theory, Aldine Publishing, Chicago.

Goldman, J. and Berry, J. (1997) The Challenge to Democracy: Government in America, Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Goldman, S. (1984) Painters into Postermakers: A Conversation with Two Cuban Artists (Raúl Martínez and Alfredo Rostgaard) in Dimensions of the Americas, Chicago.

González Rodríguez, O.J (1997) Art Therapy in Cuba, In the International Networking Group of Art Therapists Newsletter, Vol.9, Summer.

González Serra, D.J. (2000), La Psicología Del Reflejo Creador: Epistemología Y Ética, Vol.17, N0.2.

González Serra, D.J. (2002) Epistemología Y Psicología: Positivismo, Anti Positivismo Y Marxismo, Vol.19, No.2.

González Serra, D.J. (2002) Epistemología Y Psicología: La Dialéctica Materialista Y La Determinación Del Psiquismo Humano, Vol.19, No.3.

González Serra, D.J., (2002) Epistemología Y Psicología: La Unidad Dialéctica De Materia Y Conciencia, Vol.19, No.3.

González Serra, D.J., (2003) La Psicología Y El Futuro De La Humanidad, Suplemento No.1.

González Serra, D.J., (2003) Marx, Martí Y El Importante Rol De La Subjetividad, Vol.20, No. 2.

González Serra, D.J., (2003) Lógica Y Psicología, Suplemento No.1.

González Serra, D.J., (2003) Martí, Vigotski Y El Carácter Socio Histórico Del Ser Humano, Vol.20. No.3.

Greene, J. (1987) 'Justifying Conclusions in Naturalistic Evaluation: A Practical Perspective', In Evaluation and Program Planning, Vol. 10.

Guanche, J. (1996) Componentes Étnicos de la Nación Cubana, Colección La Fuente Viva.

Guevara, A. (1965) In Rosen, M. (1972) 'The Great Cuban Film Fiasco', Saturday Review, June 17.

Guevara, E. (1965) El socialismo y el hombre en Cuba, en Escritos y Discursos, Vol.8, Havana.

Hart, A. (1978) Del Trabajo Cultural: Selección de discursos, Havana: Editorial de Ciencias Sociales.

Hebert, Y. (1986) Naturalistic Evaluation in Practice: A Case Study, In New Directions for Program Evaluation, (Ed.) Lipsey, M.Jossey-Bass, US

Heron, J. (1981) Philosophical Basis for a New Paradigm. In Peter Reason and John Rowan (Eds.) Human Inquiry: A sourcebook of new paradigm research. New York: John Wiley.

Hollander, N.C, (1997) Love in a time of Hate: Liberation Psychology in Latin America, Rutgers University Press.

Hudson, W.H.D. (1977) Learning to be Rational, In Proceedings of the Philosophy of Education Society of Great Britain, Vol.XI, Blackwell.

IIyenkov, E. (1982) Leninist Dialectics and the Metaphysics of Positivism, New Park Publications.

Joravsky, D (1989) Russian Psychology: A Critical History, New York, Basil Blackwell.

Kalmanowitz, D. and Lloyd, B. (eds.) (2005) Art Therapy and Political Violence: with art, without illusion, Routledge, London.

Kidder, L.H. (1981) Qualitative research and quasi experimental frameworks. In Marlyn B. Brewer and Barry E. Collins (eds.), Scientific inquiry and the social sciences. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Labovitz, S. and Hagedorn, R. (1976) Introduction to Social Research, New York: McGraw-Hill.

Lao Izaguirre, M. (1998) Trabajo e Influencia de Antonia Eiriz en el Papier Mâche Cubano: Etapas y Precisiones, unpublished paper Galeria de Arte San Miguel Del Padron, Ciudad De La Havana.

Leal Spengler, E. (1995) Regresar en el tiempo, Imago Publicaciones.

Leal Spengler, E. et al. (2000) Desafío de una utopía: una estrategia integral para la gestión de la salvaguarda de la Havana Vieja, Oficina del Historiador de la Havana.

Lehmann, D. (1971) Review of Hugh Thomas's: Cuba, or the Pursuit of Freedom.

Leiner, M (1989) 'Cuba's Schools: Twenty-Five Years Later', in The Cuba Reader: The Making of a Revolutionary Society, ed. P.Brenner et al., New York.

Lincoln, Y.S. and Guba, E.G. (1985) Naturalistic Inquiry, Sage Publications.

Le Riverend, J. (1967) Historia económica de Cuba, La Havana, Editora Universitaria.

Loomis, J. (1999) Revolution of Forms: Cuba's Forgotten Art Schools, Princeton Architectural Press, New York.

López García, H. (2000) Metodología De La Praxis: Aproximaciones A La Dialéctica En Vigotsky, Vol.17, No.1.

Loynaz, D.M. (1995) Fe de Vida, Editorial Letras Cubanas, La Havana, Cuba.

MacDonald, B. (1974) Evaluation and the Control of Education, Centre for Applied Research in Education, University of East Anglia.

MacDonald, B. and Walker, R. (1975) Case Study and the Social Philosophy of Educational Research, In Cambridge Journal of Education, No.5.

MacDonald, B. y Walker, R. (1977). Case-Study and the Social Philosophy of Educational Research. En Hamilton, D.; Jenkins, D.; King, C.; MacDonald, B. y Parlett, M. (eds). Beyond the Numbers Game. A Reader in Educational Evaluation. Londres: Macmillan Education.

MacDonald. T. (1995) Hippocrates in Havana: Cuba's Healthcare System, Bolivar Books.

MacDonald, T. (1996) Schooling the Revolution, Praxis Press, London.

Marín Viadel, R. (1988) El dibujo infantil: tendencias y problemas en la investigación sobre la expresión plástica de los escolares, Arte, Individuo y Sociedad, no.1, julio.
Martínez, Juan. A. (1995) Antonia Eiriz: Tribute to a Legend, Museum of Art, Florida International University.

Martínez, F. (2000) Interview with author, 13th January, Havana.

Martínez, R. (1984) Interview with Sandra Levinson, Havana, 1984. On videotape at the Centre for Cuban Studies in New York City.

Martínez, R (1999) Los Once*, In Revolución y Cultura, No.1/99,pp.30-33.

Melia, K. (1996) Rediscovering Glaser, In Qualitative Health Research, Vol. 6, No. 3, 368-378.

Menocal, N. (1996) 'An Overriding Passion – The Quest for National Identity in Painting', In the Journal of Decorative and Propaganda Arts, Cuba Theme Issue.

Mosquera, G. (1995) 'Modernism from Afro-America: Wilfredo Lam', In Mosquera, ed. Beyond the Fantastic: Contemporary Art Criticism from Latin America, Institute of International Visual Arts, London.

Ordaz Ducungé, E.B. (1996) Terapia Ocupacional para la Rehabilitación Psiquiátrica, Hospital Psiquiátrica de la Havana.

Ortiz, F. (1940) Contrapunteo cubano del tabaco y el azúcar, Havana: Montero, J.
Ortiz, F y Deschamps Chapeaux, P. (1974) Contribución a la historia de la gente sin historia, Editorial Ciencias Sociales, La Havana.

Otero, L. (1991) Interview quoted in Castañeda, J.G. (1994) The Latin American Left after the Cold War, New York, Vintage Books.

Padilla, H. (1968) Antonia Eiriz in Fuera del Juego.

Padura, L. (2000) El viaje más largo, In Catauro: Revista Cubana de Antropología, Año 1, No.2, Fundación Fernando Ortiz, La Havana.

Pampliega de Quiroga, A. (2001) El Universo Compartido de Paolo Freire y Enrique Pichon Rivière, Universidad Popular Madres de Plaza de Mayo, Suplemento de Pagina 12.

Parlett and Hamilton (1972) Evaluation as illumination: A new approach to the study of innovatory programs. Occasional Paper 9, Edinburgh: Centre for Research in the Educational Sciences, University of Edinburgh.

Pearsol, J.A. (1987) Justifying Conclusions in Naturalistic Evaluations, In Evaluation and Program Planning, Vol.10, N°.4,1987, p.307 à 358.
Pérez, L. A. (1996) Cuba, c. 1930 - 1959, In Cuba: a Short History, edited by Bethell, L. Cambridge University Press.

Pérez-Stable, M. (1993) La revolución cubana: Origines, desarrollo y legado, Editorial Colibrí.

Pines, M. (2004) In Tubert-Oklander, J. And Hernández de Tubert, R. (2004) Operative Groups: The Latin American Approach to Group Analysis, Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Pino-Santos, C. (1999) Vidal, Corratge, Oraa: El Camino De La Abstracción, in Revolución y Cultura, No.1/99,pp.23-29.

Piñera, T. (1995) Antonia Eiriz - Obituary, Granma, March 10.

Pogolotti, G. (1959) Muestrario De La Joven Pintura Cubana, Nueva Revista Cubana, Año 1, No.1, abril-junio, pp.155-156.

Pogolotti, G. (1964) Antonia Eiriz: Arte Entre Dos Mundos, published in the magazine Union, Jan-March.

Pogolotti, G. (1999) Los Once En el Viraje De Los Cincuenta, in Revolución y Cultura, No.1/99.

Read, H. (1943) Education Through Art, Faber and Faber, London.

Reese, W. L. (1980) Dictionary of Philosophy and Religion, Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities.

Retamar, R.F. (1964) Catalogue for Exhibition with Raúl Martínez at Casa Del Lago, Universidad Autonoma de México, Dirección General de Difusión Cultural, Oct.-Nov.

Retamar, R.F. (1991) Catalogue for 'Re-encuentro' at La Galería de Arte de Galiano, La Havana.

Rigau, J. and Stout, N. (1994) Havana, New York: Rizzoli.

Roberts, R. and Holmes, J. (1999) Healing stories: narrative in psychiatry and psychotherapy. Oxford University Press.

Rodríguez-Mena García, M. (2003) La Calidad De Los Aprendizajes Como Problema Actual De La Educación: Bases Epistemológicas Y Psicológicas, Vol.20, No.2.

Rojo González, M.D. (1998) Epistemología, Constructivismo y Didáctica, Vol.15, No.2.

Ryan, D. (1999) Between State Socialism and Folk Medicine: the Cuban Medical Profession in the Special Period, Unpublished Paper.

Sarup, M. (1996) Identity, Culture and the Postmodern World, Edinburgh University Press.

Saruski, J. and Mosquera, E. (1979) Cultural Policy of Cuba, UNESCO, Paris.

Segre, R. (1968) La Arquitectura de la Revolución Cubana, Montevideo: Facultad de Arquitectura Universidad de la Republica.
Segre,R and López Rangel, R. (1982) Architectura e territorio nell'America Latina, Saggi I Documenti, Milan: Electra Editrice.

Serrano, P.E. (2002) Cuatro Décadas de Políticas Culturales, http://www.hispanocubano.org/revistahc/paginas/revista8910/REVISTA4/articulos/cu.

Sharlow, M. (2002) About Idealism: An Exploration of Some Philosophical Viewpoints that Put Mind Before Matter,
www.eskimo.com/~msharlow 'About Idealism'

Sharp, R. and Green, A. (1975) Education and Social Control, Routledge and Kegan Paul, London.

Skagestad, P. (1981) Hypothetical Realism. In Marlyn B. Berger and Barry E. Collins (Eds.), Scientific Inquiry and the Social Sciences. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Skaife, S. (1995) The Dialectics of Art Therapy, Inscape, Volume 1.

Skaife, S. (2000) Keeping the Balance: Further Thoughts on the Dialectics of Art Therapy, in Gilroy, A. and McNeilly, G. (Eds.) The Changing Shape of Art Therapy. London: Jessica Kingsley.

Skaife, S. (2001) Making Visible: Art Therapy and Intersubjectivity, Inscape, Volume 6, Number 2.

Smith, J. (1987) Commentary: Relativism and Justifying Conclusions in Naturalistic Inquiry, In Evaluation and Program Planning, Vol.10.

Sociedad De Psicólogos De Cuba (1988) Nota Editorial, Vol.5, No.2.

Sorín Sokolsky, M. (1988) Algunas Experiencias sobre el papel del arte en el desarrollo de la personalidad, En Investigaciones de la personalidad, Editorial Ciencias Sociales, Havana.

Spitta, S. (1995) Between Two Waters: Narratives of Transculturation in Latin America, Rice University Press.

Stake, R. E. (Ed.). (1975) Evaluating the arts in education: A responsive approach. Columbus, OH: Merrill.

Stake. R.E (1995) The Art of Case Study Research, Sage Publications.

Stanley, D. (1997) Cuba: a Lonely Planet travel survival kit, Lonely Planet Publications.

Stoll, B. (2005) Growing pains: the international development of art therapy, Arts in Psychotherapy, 32: 171-191.

Strauss, A.L. (1987) Qualitative analysis for social scientists. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Strauss, A.L. and Corbin, J. (1990) Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques. London: Sage.

Strauss, A.L. and Corbin, J. (1994) Grounded Theory Methodology: An Overview. In N.K. Denzin and Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.), Handbook of Qualitative Research, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Suárez, N. (1996) Fernando Ortiz y La Cubanidad, Colección La Fuente Viva, Cuidad de La Havana.

Tejeda del Prado, L. (1998) Creación Artística E Identidad Cultural, Revista Cubana De Psicología, Vol.15, No.2.

Thomas, H. (1971) Cuba: The Pursuit of Freedom, New York, Harper and Row.

Tierney, W.G. (1988) The Web of Leadership: The Presidency in Higher Education, Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.

Toomey, C. (2005) Fidel's Infidels, The Sunday Times Magazine, April 10th, pp.47-52.

Traba, M (1973) Dos décadas vulnerables en las artes plásticas latinoamericanas 1950-1970, México: Siglo XXI.

Tubert-Oklander, J. and Hernández de Tubert, R. (2004) Operative Groups: The Latin American Approach to Group Analysis, Jessica Kingsley Publishers.
Vaillancourt Rosenau, P. (1986) When Marxists Do Research, Greenwood Press, Connecticut, US

Valdés Bernal, S. (1998) Lengua nacional e identidad cultural del cubano, Editoriales de Ciencias Sociales, La Havana.

Valdés Marín, R. (1979) El desarrollo psicográfico del niño, Editorial Científico-Técnica, Ministerio de Cultura, Havana.

Valdés, O. and Chávez, R. (1974) El arte del pueblo, documental, ICIAC.

Vernon, W.H.D. (1944) Psychology in Cuba, Psychological Bulletin, Vol.41, No.2.

Villa, E. (1953) Alberto Burri, Roma Fondazione Origine, reprinted in Celant, G.
(1990) L'inferno dell'arte italiana: Materiali, 1946-1964, Costa e Nolan, Genoa.

Von Wright, G. (1971). Explanation and Understanding, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Waller, D. (1991) Becoming a Profession: The History of Art Therapy in Britain, Tavistock/Routledge, London and New York.

Waller, D. (1992) Different Things to Different People: Art Therapy in Britain – A Brief Survey of Its History and Current Development, in The Arts in Psychotherapy, Vol.19, pp.87-92.

Waller, D. (1998) Towards a European art Therapy, Open University Press, Buckingham.

Waller, J. (1981) Health Study Tour Report, Unpublished.

Waller, J. (1992) Health Study Tour Report, Unpublished.

Waller, J. (1993) Cuba: The Health of a Nation, Cuba Solidarity Campaign.

Weiss y Sánchez, J. (1936) Arquitectura cubana colonial, Republished as La arquitectura colonial cubana, Havana: Instituto Cubano del Libro, 1979.

Wertheim-Cahen, T., van Dijk, M. and Schouten, K. (2004) About a Weeping Willow, a Phoenix Rising from its Ashes, and Building a House…Art Therapy with Refugees: Three Different Perspectives, In Broken Spirits: The Treatment of Traumatised Asylum Seekers, Refugees War and Torture Victims, Eds. Wilson, J.P. and Drožđek, B, Brunner-Routledge, New York.

Williams, D. (1986) 'When is Naturalistic Evaluation Appropriate?' In New Directions for Program Evaluation, (Ed.) Lipsey, M.Jossey-Bass, US

Williams, M., & May, T. (1996). <u>Introduction to the philosophy of social research</u>. London: University College London Press.

Willig, C. (2001) In Introducing Qualitative research in Psychology: Adventures in Theory and Method, Buckingham Open University Press.
Wood, C. (1991) 'R.D. Laing and his influence on art therapy', In Inscape, Winter, pp. 15-18.

Xirau, R. (2002) Introducción a la historia de la filosofía, Textos Universitarios, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de México.

Zaldívar Pérez, D.F. (1995) Arte y Psicoterapia, Revista Cubana de Psicología, Vol.12, No.1-2.

Zito Lema, V. (1985) Conversaciones con Enrique Pichón Rivière, Editorial Cinco, Buenos Aries.

Zukav, G. (1979) The Dancing Wu-Li Masters, New York: Bantam.

Appendices

Appendix 1

List of Interviews referred to in Chapters 4, 5 and 6 in chronological order and numbered as cited in text.

1. Jorge Nasser González , 5th January 2000.

2. Avelino Couceiro, 12th January 2000.

3. María del Carmen Pérez Cernuda - curator Museo de San Miguel del Padron and Avelino Couceiro, 15th January 2000.

4. Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo - 21st March - papier mâche artist/pupil of Antonia Eiriz.

5. Julia González Fornés, 25th March 2000.

6. Migdalia Hernández Delgado, 25th March 2000.

7. Julio Girona, 4th April 2000.

8. Dra. Graziela Pogolotti, Vice President of UNEAC (Union of artists and writers) 12th April 2000.

9. María Rosa Almendros, 13th April 2000.

10. María, mother of Ubaldo Gutiérrez, 13th April 2000.

11. 'Papo' Ubaldo Gutiérrez, 13th April 2000.

12. Roberto Fabelo, 20th April 2000.

13. Antonio Vidal, 26th April 2000.

14. Ever Fonseca, 2nd May 2000, Playa, Havana - artist (pupil/friend of Antonia Eiriz.)

15. Ulises Cruz Grau, 9th May 2000.

Complete List of Interviews in Chronological Order

1. Jorge Nasser - 5th January - papier mâche artist - Interview 1.

2. Avelino Couciero - 12th January 2000 - General interview.

3. Felix Martínez - 12th January 2000 - Vedado - veteran of Angola

4. Salvador González - 14th January - artist - Callejon de Hammel.

5. Belkis Echemendia Tocabens - 17th January 2000 - Vedado (COAP) – psychologist

6. Aida Fondevila - 3rd February 2000 - Social Worker - Regla

7. Delia Torres y Ninio Fuentes 3rd February 2000- older people - Regla

8. Ana María Erra - 23rd February 2000 - Miramar - art therapist

9. Dra. María Milagros Febles Elejarde - 8th March - psychologist (COAP)

10. Avelino Couciero - 10th March 2000 – Vedado

11. María del Carmen Cernuda - 15th March 2000 - curator Museo de San Miguel del Padron

12. Mercedes Rodríguez Lazo - 21st March - papier mâche artist/pupil of Antonia Eiriz

13. Jorge Nasser - 23rd March 2000 - Calle Neptuno - Interview 2 - about Antonia Eiriz

14. Migdalia Hernández Delgado - 25th March 2000 - Linea, Vedado - pupil of Antonia Eiriz

15. Julia González Fornés - 25th March 2000 - Linea, Vedado - artist

16. Ada Bueno Roig - 27th March 2000 - Playa - psychologist at San Alejandro Art School

17. Graciela Hernández Fernández - 30th March 2000 - Regla - Especializacion: Oligofreno pedagogia y Logopedia

18. Julio Girona - 4th April 2000 - Vedado - (friend of Antonia Eiriz)

19. Dra. Graziela Pogolotti - 12th April 2000 - Vedado - Vice President of UNEAC.

20. 'Papo' - Ubaldo Gutiérrez - 13th April 2000 - Juanelo - pupil/nieghbour of Antonia Eiriz

21. María Rosa Almendros - 13th April 2000 - Vedado - (friend/colleague of Antonia Eiriz)

22.Antonio Vidal - 26th April 2000 - artist

23. Miriam Lao - 1st May 2000 - La Vibura - Directora de Museo del Arte

24. Ever Fonseca - 2nd May 2000 - Playa - artist (pupil/friend of Antonia Eiriz)

25. Minerva López - 8th May 2000 - Vedado - artist (pupil/fiend of Antonia Eiriz)

26. Ulises Cruz Grau - 9th May 2000 - Havana Vieja - art therapist/community arts

27. Aurora García - 20th May 2000 - Vedado - Head of Child Psychology, University of Havana.

28. Prof. Dolores Rodríguez Cordero - May 2000 - La ISA – Miramar

29. Elaine Cossio - psychologist - training Lacanian psychoanalyst.