Trapping method and quota observance are pivotal to population stability in a harvested parrot

3

4 Simon Valle¹*, Nigel J. Collar², W. Edwin Harris¹ and Stuart J. Marsden¹

5

¹ School of Science & the Environment, Manchester Metropolitan University, Chester Street,
 Manchester M1 5GD, U.K.

8 ² BirdLife International, Cambridge, UK

- 9 * Corresponding Author Email: S.Valle@mmu.ac.uk
- 10

11 Abstract

Wildlife trade is currently regulated mainly in terms of 'volume', i.e. the number of individuals 12 13 taken from the wild or numbers appearing on the market in a given year. To explore the possible 14 effects of other factors such as capture methods, variability in annual harvest, and habitat, we 15 built and validated a demographic model for a closed population of Grey Parrots (Psittacus 16 erithacus) on Príncipe, and ran 50-year simulations for the population under different harvest 17 scenarios. There was a fine line between capture volumes being robustly sustainable (11% 18 harvested) and dramatically unsustainable (15%). Population trajectories were highly sensitive to 19 changes in adult survivorship, such that the inclusion of even a small number of adults among 20 the harvest had a far greater impact than a similar number of juveniles. High annual variation in 21 capture rate (reflecting poor national management of trade), even if the mean matched the quota, 22 was more likely to be detrimental than a consistent annual harvest of the same decadal volume. 23 While these patterns may be common to large traded parrots generally, sufficient habitat and 24 secure nest sites exist on Príncipe to render the effects of habitat loss on the island less 25 important than in most other situations. If trade in parrots is to continue sustainably it will 26 require reliable demographic and harvest data and must eliminate instability in quota observance 27 (exceeded quotas are not compensated by shortfalls in other years) and, especially, the 28 indiscriminate capture of adults.

29

30 Keywords

31 Demographic modeling, Grey Parrot, CITES, Population dynamics, wildlife trade, P.V.A.

32

33 Introduction

34 The international trade in live animals and wildlife products is a constituent threat to around

35 one-third of all bird and mammal species (UNEP-WCMC 2015). Legal trade is estimated to be

36 worth over USD 8 billion a year globally (Zhang et al. 2008), and this figure is likely to double

- 37 when illegal trade is taken into account (Pires 2012). Parrots, and especially the larger species, are
- 38 the most traded wild-caught group of birds (UNEP-WCMC 2015), and there are serious
- 39 concerns about <u>the sustainability of current harvest levels</u> in many species (Beissinger and
- 40 Bucher 1992a). Such concerns arise not just from the sheer volume of <u>parrots</u> in <u>trade</u>, but also
- 41 from <u>the birds' poor resilience to overharvesting</u>-(Beissinger 2001; Pain et al. 2006; Wright et al.
- 42 2001), inadequate enforcement of trade regulations (Martin et al. 2014), and the paucity of
- 43 reliable population and demographic data to support harvest models (Marsden and Royle 2015).
- 44 The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora 45 (CITES) allows international trade in a taxon only if the proposed harvest has been scientifically 46 proven to be not detrimental to its survival (Rosser and Havwood 2002). Ideally, 'non-detriment' 47 findings should be underpinned by a robust demographic model that predicts a population's 48 long-term response to harvest (e.g. Beissinger and Westphal 1998). Such models have rarely been 49 built for parrots (Beissinger 2001; Bouzat and Strem 2012; Koenig 2008), and indeed for most 50 other traded species. Of course, the reliability of harvest models depends both on the availability 51 of appropriate data to support them, and on how well the interactions of parameters within the 52 model reflect the reality of population dynamics in the wild (Boyce 1992).
- Across the tropics, methods <u>of trapping parrots</u> range from <u>the particular</u> 'chick-only' harvest from nest cavities (e.g. Juste 1996), to indiscriminate <u>mass</u> trapping of individuals <u>of any</u> <u>age class</u> from aggregation sites, <u>usually by means of glue-traps or nets</u> (e.g. Ngenyi 2002, 2003). Moreover, annual CITES-reported imports/exports from range countries vary considerably (UNEP-WCMC 2015), reflecting supply, demand, and enforcement/trade management issues. Important questions in relation to demographic modelling of harvested parrot populations
- 59 therefore are:
- 1. How sensitive are long-term population trajectories likely to be to small changes/uncertaintiesin harvest volume which are inevitable under current trade management?
- 62 2. Do different trapping methods affect populations differentially for a given harvest volume?
- 63 3. What are the effects of variation in annual harvests on harvest sustainability?
- 64 4. What are the compound effects of habitat loss and trapping volume and method on long-term65 population viability?
- 66 To explore these issues, we built and validated a stage-classified female-based demographic
- 67 model -(Caswell 1989) for a closed (insular) population of Grey Parrots Psittacus erithacus (with
- 68 demographic rates typical of other large parrots) to examine the influence of important trapping-
- 69 related and habitat change variables on harvest sustainability and, as a broader case study, to
- 70 investigate the population dynamics of large parrots (mean body mass \geq 300 g).
- 71

72 Methods

- 73 Study area and population
- 74 The heavily traded Grey Parrot has suffered a dramatic global decline (Annorbah et al. 2016;
- 75 BirdLife International 2017),- As a result, its global conservation status has deteriorated from
- 76 Near Threatened through Vulnerable to Endangered in just five years (IUCN 2016), and calls for
- 77 <u>a ban on its trade have only recently been accepted, albeit not unanimously (CITES 2017).</u>

78 Nonetheless, the species remains relatively common in some parts of its range (Marsden et al. 79 2015). One such area is the small (136 km²) island of Príncipe (São Tomé and Príncipe, Gulf of 80 Guinea), which hosts a demographically isolated, relatively healthy, and well-studied population 81 (Fahlman 2002; Juste 1996; Marsden et al. 2015; Melo 1998; Valle et al. 2017). Grey Parrots were 82 harvested at an average rate of 600 birds per year from the wild in the 1990s (Juste 1996; Melo 83 1998) until a regional ban on all trade was put in place in 2005_(Valle 2015). Príncipe is broadly divided into two geographically and climatically distinct regions: a low-lying basalt platform in 84 85 the north, with hills below 180 m a.s.l. (around 65% of island), and a mountainous region in the south (Jones and Tye 2006). By the beginning of the twentieth century, the forest in the north 86 87 had been modified in many places by clear-felling, selective logging and the creation of cocoa, 88 coffee and coconut plantations (Exell 1973). After the country gained independence (1975) most

89 estates were abandoned and today the north is covered by secondary forest interspersed with 90 some commercial species (e.g. Oil Palm *Elaeis guineensis*). The south, owing to its inaccessibility,

91 remains covered in pristine forest with much floral endemism (Figueiredo et al. 2011).

92

93 Model implementation

94 The development and the implementation of the model were undertaken in R (R Core Team 2014; see Appendix A and B). Quantifying specific life-history traits in parrots is problematic, 95 96 mainly owing to the difficulties of marking birds individually and determining their lifespan, but 97 also because they range widely in groups and lack individual territories (Beissinger 2001). We 98 parameterized our model with data collected from Príncipe (Valle 2015), from elsewhere in the 99 Grey Parrot's range (i.e. Nigeria: McGowan 2001), from captive Grey Parrots (Taylor and Parkin 100 2008; Young et al. 2012), and from ecologically and morphometrically analogous parrot species 101 (Appendix C). Owing to Príncipe's isolation (>250 km from the nearest source population), its 102 Grev Parrots can be assumed to experience no immigration or emigration (Jones and Tye 2006), and therefore to form a closed biological population. We set the finite rate of population increase 103 (growth rate per year: Rockwood 2006) λ to 1.1, which we calculated using consistently designed 104 105 pre-breeding population estimates from 2012 (Marsden et al. 2015) and 2014 (Valle et al. 2017), according to the following formula: 106

107
$$\lambda = \sqrt[x]{\frac{N_{t+x}}{N_t}}$$
(1)

108 where N_{t+x} and N_t are the number of individuals in the population at two different times 109 separated by x number of years.

Grey Parrots, like most psittacines, form long-term monogamous pair-bonds (Forshaw 110 111 1989; Seibert 2006). We assumed all females to breed as long as nest sites were available. In captivity, the age of first successful breeding can vary greatly, depending on husbandry 112 113 conditions, but the median value (interquartile range) is 7.6 (5.4–9.5) (Young et al. 2012). 114 However, Grey Parrots usually reach sexual maturity between their third and fifth years of age 115 (de Grahl 1987; Lantermann 2000), as in other large parrot species (Young et al. 2012). We 116 assumed that the fourth year of age is the threshold of adulthood and that the subadult stage 117 comprises individuals in their second and third years.

Like most large psittacines, Grey Parrots are reported to breed once per year throughout their range (Benson et al. 1988), so in the model we assumed a single annual brood. We collected data on productivity for successful nests (fecundity) from 81 nests on Príncipe, which yielded a

121 mean \pm SD = 1.94 \pm 0.72 chicks per brood (Valle 2015); since clutch-size is negatively correlated 122 with longevity (Ricklefs 2000), this is likely to be similar in other equally long-lived large parrot 123 species. Inter-annual variability in productivity on Príncipe was low (Valle 2015), so we assumed an arbitrary low variance (SD) of 0.1 here. At birth, Grey Parrots have a ratio of 1 female to 1.17 124 125 males i.e. 46% ($n=3,892, \gamma^2=25.01, p < 0.001$: Taylor and Parkin 2008). This is also the same as 126 that in other large parrots (mean \pm SD = 46% \pm 5%, *n*=22; Taylor and Parkin 2008). Longevity 127 and age-specific survivorship of Grev Parrots in the wild are unknown, and such data are lacking 128 for most parrot species. Since longevity is positively correlated with body mass (Brouwer et al. 129 2000; Young et al. 2012) and adult survivorship (Lindstedt and Calder 1976), we used the mean 130 survivorship from three surrogate species whose mean body mass is closest to that of Grey 131 Parrots involving only comparable data (e.g. del Hoyo et al. 2017) -and for which such 132 information is available i.e. ≤ 60 g difference: Western Corella (*Cacatua pastinator*), Major 133 Mitchell's Cockatoo (C. leadbeateri) and Glossy Black-cockatoo (Calyptorhynchus lathami). Thus, we 134 assumed that (a) survivorship (\pm SD) is 52% \pm 0.8% for the first year of life, and 91% \pm 0.3% 135 for birds older than one year; (b) subadults, as fully formed and independent individuals, exhibit 136 the same survivorship as adults (Appendix C); (c) nest success (i.e. at least one chick fledged) rate 137 is 77%, based on all relevant and available literature on parrots (i.e. the mean percentage nest 138 success rate weighted by the number of nest years: see Appendix C); and (d) nest site availability 139 limits the annual number of reproductive pairs (Beissinger and Bucher 1992b). We inferred the 140 maximum number of available nest sites, i.e. $5,502 \pm 2,132$, from the mean minimum density of 141 nests (SD) for primary and secondary forest estimated on Principe, i.e. 72 ± 26 , and 17 ± 8 nests 142 km⁻² respectively (Valle 2015), and used a theta-logistic model to simulate nest site availability 143 (see Appendix A).

A factor likely to influence population growth and carrying capacity is food availability. This parameter is difficult to quantify and predict because it is heavily dependent on fine habitat characteristics (e.g. floristic composition and plantation quality), intra- and inter-annual climate variability, and the ability of Grey Parrots to adapt to them. However, since the focus of the analysis is to inform management of small and declining populations where intraspecific competition for food is not a limiting factor, we set no further carrying capacity to the model other than nest site availability.

In captivity, parrot lifespans vary greatly with the conditions in which the birds are kept 151 152 (in Grey Parrot: median = 8.2 years, IQR = 5.8-12.2, maximum = 48, n = 1,979: Young et al. 2012). There are virtually no data on wild parrot mortality, so we assumed an arbitrary maximum 153 154 lifespan of 45 years in the model, as adults are probably somewhat shorter-lived in the wild than 155 in captivity (Brouwer et al. 2000). Because no data are available on the effects of senescence on reproductive output, we assumed parrots to be active breeders until they are old, as suggested by 156 studies in captivity (Young et al. 2012); i.e. in our model, lifespan and age of last breeding 157 158 coincide. Owing to annual mortality rates, adults are very unlikely to reach such old age in the 159 wild anyway. The life-history traits used in the baseline model are summarized in Table 1. The 160 model was validated using the known population trajectory of Grey Parrots on Principe in the 161 1995–2014 period (Valle 2015; Appendix A).

163 Modelling population dynamics and the sustainability of harvest

164 To understand the effects of Grey Parrot harvest on Príncipe, we ran the model with and

without a simulated annual harvest \pm SD of 600 \pm 100 (which is the approximate number of

166 individuals harvested before the 2005 trade ban was imposed; Juste 1996; Melo 1998, Valle

¹⁶²

167 2015), 900 \pm 100 and 1,200 \pm 100 individuals. Traditionally on the island, Grey Parrots were

168 harvested only as chicks from the nests, leaving adults unharmed and the nest cavities intact to 169 be exploited again in the following years (Juste 1996; Melo 1998), unlike what happens in most

170

- countries where parrot chick harvest results in the destruction of the cavity (e.g. Beissinger and 171 Bucher 1992a; Brightsmith 2005). Although standard deviations were set arbitrarily, these values
- 172 were based on anecdotal evidence from Príncipe (Valle 2015).
- 173 Unless otherwise stated we initialized all simulations with a population size of 7,996 174 individuals, as estimated from the 2014 post-breeding Distance Sampling survey (Valle et al. 2017), i.e. 3,678 females based on the sex ratio of 46% given above. We performed sensitivity 175 176 analysis to explore how predicted population trajectories responded to sequential 5% decreases 177 in juvenile survivorship, and 2% decreases in subadult and adult survivorship.

In some countries, harvest pressure on Grey Parrot populations has been highly variable 178 179 over time, owing to supply/demand dynamics, changes in legislation, and inconsistent levels of 180enforcement (UNEP-WCMC 2015). We explored the effects of this variability by running simulations for a fixed annual quota of exactly 1,000 chicks, and for the same average annual 181 182 quota but with a variability of 67% (i.e. $1,000 \pm 670$ chicks), which mirrors that reported by 183 CITES for Cameroon, the world's major exporter of Grey Parrots between 1981 and 2013 184 (UNEP-WCMC 2015). After running a number of trial simulations, a quota of 1,000 individuals was arbitrarily chosen, as it best illustrated the difference between the presence and the absence 185 186 of variability. While this estimate of variation is based on the most relevant available data, it does 187 not account for pre-export mortality, which is almost impossible to quantify with any degree of precision i.e. 30-66% for Grey Parrots (Fotso 1998; McGowan 2001). 188

189 To explore the impact of different trapping methods, we simulated a critical yield of 900 \pm 100 individuals under three different trapping scenarios: (1) *chick harvesting*, where only chicks 190 are taken from nests, as was the tradition in Príncipe (Juste 1996; Melo 1998); (2) nest raiding, 191 192 where one adult is taken with every two chicks, as a simulation of the removal of a parent at the moment of chick harvest (e.g. as in Ghana: Dändliker 1992); and (3) indiscriminate trapping, where 193 194 individuals are taken randomly from the population (e.g. by trapping at aggregations in Cameroon or Democratic Republic of the Congo [DRC]: Marsden et al. 2013, Ngenyi 2003). 195

196

197 Modelling interactions between habitat quantity, habitat quality and harvest volume

198 We investigated the responses of the population to habitat loss or degradation simulating a 199 decrease in available nest sites (the most immediate limiting factor in parrots: Beissinger and 200 Bucher 1992b; Munn 1992), Thus, we modelled three possible scenarios of habitat loss using nest density data given under 'Model implementation': (1) 'low', where (as at present) 30% of 201 Príncipe is covered by primary and 70% by secondary forest, i.e. 4,553 nest sites \pm 1,821; (2) 202 203 'medium', where secondary forest has extended to 83% of the island and 17% is left protected, to comply with the target set by the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD), which 204 205 established protection goals for terrestrial and inland water areas by 2020, i.e. $3,570 \pm 1,498$ nest sites (Millennium Ecosystem Assessment 2005); and (3) 'high', where all suitable habitat has been 206 207 cleared apart from a protected (primary forest) area equivalent to 17% of the island, i.e. $1,674 \pm$ 606 sites. For each of these scenarios we ran the model for four different regimes: (1) chick 208 209 harvesting; (2) nest raiding; (3) indiscriminate trapping; and (4) no harvest. For each scenario involving some harvest, we modelled different harvest quotas, i.e. 600 ± 100 , 900 ± 100 and 210 211 $1,200 \pm 100$. All simulations were run for 50 years.

213 Results

214 The modelled population showed much greater sensitivity to variations in adult than in juvenile

- survivorship (Fig. 1). Juvenile survival could be halved (from 52% to 26%) without inverting the
 long-term population trajectory, whereas reductions of only around 12% in adult survival (from
 91%) were predicted to do so.
- When subject to annual harvest of chicks, population growth was unaffected to around a
 harvest equivalent to 11.3% (900 ± 100 chicks per year; Fig. 2) of the initial population.
 However, increasing the harvest by 300 individuals (to 15% of the initial population; Fig. 2)
 would most probably drive the population to extinction within decades.
- The impact of harvest was also sensitive to large inter-annual variation in capture rate (i.e. as shown by Cameroon between 1981 and 2013), which around a hypothetical quota of 900 chicks increased the extinction risk to the population over a fixed quota of the same volume (Fig. 3). If applied to the already critical harvest of 1,000 chicks per year (see above), variability in annual harvests both increased <u>the</u> chances of decline and accelerated the decline process (i.e. steeper negative trajectory; Fig. 3).
- Sustainability of harvests of a given volume varied greatly with capture technique. While an annual harvest of 900 chicks did not affect the natural population trajectory, trajectories were very different under the alternative trapping regimes (Fig. 4). If an adult was harvested with every two chicks, then trajectories were highly variable across runs, but most showed inexorable longterm declines to extinction. Trapping the same number of individuals indiscriminately across age classes was certain to cause extinction within a few years.
- The addition of incremental habitat loss to the models reduced carrying capacity and, consequently, accelerated the negative effects of harvest. Once again capture method and harvest quota were, in that order, the variables which most affected the long-term survival of the population (<u>Table 2</u>, Fig. 5).
- 238

239 Discussion

240 Our demographic models point to the crucial effect that capture method and, by extension, the 241 age of traded birds have on population stability in Grev Parrots. The implications of sex- or age-242 selective harvest have been documented in herbivores (Giles and Findlay 2004), large carnivores (Packer et al. 2009), birds (Hunter and Caswell 2005) and fish (Birkeland and Dayton 2005), and 243 indeed a consideration of age structure is recognized as being critical in sustainable harvest 244 management (Getz and Haight 1989). However, whilst CITES does not provide clear guidelines 245 on the matter, too often scientific authorities set quotas without consideration of population 246 dynamics (Smith et al. 2011). Certainly, as with most CITES-listed taxa (Smith et al. 2011), none 247 248 of the substantial export quotas for Grey Parrots has ever been based on population modelling 249 (CITES 2006, 2014). A change in this approach has been urged by the scientific community for 250 several taxa, where alternative age-based harvest regulations have been proposed (e.g. Balme et 251 al. 2012). Our study indicates that such a change is likely to be crucial in all medium and large 252 psittacines which have low annual reproductive rates and long lifespans, and in which trade is 253 permitted.

254 Differences in capture method may at least partly explain why Grey Parrot populations 255 have collapsed dramatically in Ghana and elsewhere on the African mainland (Annorbah et al. 256 2016; Martin et al. 2014) while at the same time remaining relatively healthy on Príncipe. When many mainland populations became depleted but demand remained strong, it is plausible that a 257 258 shift occurred from taking only nestlings to taking any bird possible. On Príncipe, by contrast, 259 owing to local tradition and the higher market value of chicks, adult parrots have been trapped only very occasionally, during times of high demand and low supply, e.g. outside the breeding 260 261 season (Valle 2015). This raises serious concern for the species in countries like DRC, Cameroon 262 and Congo where birds, legally or not, are indiscriminately caught with nets and glue traps at 263 natural aggregations such as saltlicks and roosts, inevitably involving considerable numbers of adults (Hart et al. 2016; Marsden et al. 2013). DRC is also the only range state to have entered a 264 reservation on the recent uplisting of Grev Parrot to Appendix I, thus effectively exempting itself 265 266 from the trade ban (CITES 2017).

267 Variation in parrot harvest volume across years also compromised the sustainability of a 268 given harvest level. Irregular spikes in numbers captured, as often reported by many exporting countries (Martin et al. 2014; UNEP-WCMC 2015), are more likely to be detrimental to the 269 270 survival of a population than are 'steady' annual harvests. In effect, individual years or clusters of years with particularly heavy harvests can send populations on negative trajectories which 271 272 subsequent years of lighter harvests do not reverse. Thus, if quotas are to be set for a population, 273 they are more likely to be sustainable if the harvest is uniform across years, and this can only 274 come from effective trade management. However, even if precise monitoring of bird numbers 275 within trade is possible, it is still likely to fall short of ensuring a uniform harvest, since postcapture mortality can be extremely high in parrots and it is also highly variable across 'shipments' 276 277 (UNEP-WCMC 2015).

Our model indicates that the negative impact of habitat loss on Príncipe was likely to be 278 279 far less immediately important than trapping volume or method, and acted mainly to dampen 280 population growth and reduce carrying capacity. This is consistent with what has been found for 281 other parrot species (Beissinger and Bucher 1992b; Munn 1992), and is more likely to be due to 282 the reduced availability of nest cavities than to a shortage of food (Newton 1994; Newton 1998). 283 Moreover, our results support the theory that, if food resources are not limiting, any management intervention aimed at increasing the number of available nest cavities (i.e. artificial 284 285 alternatives that are readily used by the species) has the potential of increasing the carrying 286 capacity of the habitat and, therefore, the maximum size of the population (Cockle et al. 2010). 287 In well-preserved forests such as those in Príncipe or parts of Cameroon, habitat loss may not be 288 as important as capture issues, but this may not be the case where availability of nest sites is 289 limited (e.g. Cornelius et al. 2008; Saunders et al. 2014). Indeed, in Ghana, loss of forest cover 290 generally, and felling of huge trees in particular, have probably greatly compounded the effects of 291 trade on Grey Parrots (Annorbah et al. 2016). Moreover, extreme habitat loss is likely to 292 exacerbate inter- and intraspecific competition for food resources, introducing a further limiting factor (Newton 1998), particularly in small and isolated populations (e.g. Echo Parakeet; Jones 293 2004). Although parrots are known for their dietary plasticity, the extent to which such 294 295 adaptability can withstand the pressure of global changes is understudied (Renton et al. 2015). 296 Interestingly, the Grey Parrot population on Príncipe spent a great proportion of their time 297 feeding on the fruits of Oil Palms Elaeis guineensis, an abundant source of food on the island 298 (Valle 2015).

The sustainability of parrot trade is managed by CITES through a system of quotas, i.e. through regulating harvest volume (Martin et al. 2014). These quotas are rarely based on those 301 'non-detriment findings' which are much sought after by CITES itself (Rosser and Haywood

- 302 2002). Our study reveals that the line between safe and ruinous harvest volumes is fine, and that 303 trapping method and quota observance are pivotal to the stability of harvested populations of
- 303 trapping method and quota observance are protat to the stability of narvested populations of 304 large parrots. Reliable data on such factors are hardly ever available for traded parrots (Poole and
- 305 Shepherd 2016). Thus, for a population model to yield a reliable 'non-detriment finding' for a
- 306 given harvest quota (Smith et al. 2011), in-country population monitoring and trade enforcement
- 307 systems would need to improve significantly. Indeed, if capture method, post-capture mortality,
- 308 occasional but high exceeding of quotas, and reliability of reported figures were all factored into 309 models of the sustainability of parrot harvesting, it is unlikely that recent trade in Grey Parrots
- 309 models of the sustainability of parrot harvesting, it is unlikely that recent trade in Grey Parrots 310 and many other psittacines of similar size could be judged 'non-detrimental' with any reasonable
- 311 degree of confidence.
- 312

313 Aknowledgements

314

Parrots International generously funded the research reported here. Eng. Arlindo Carvalho (National General Director of the Environment), Eng. Nestor Umbelina (Regional Secretary to the Infrastructures and the Environment), and Daniel Ramos (Director of the Parque Natural d'Ôbo do Príncipe) fully endorsed the project and facilitated our work. Here Be Dragons (HBD) investment group kindly provided invaluable logistical support during fieldwork. Satiro and Lynsey Crellin provided crucial assistance in the collection of the data. <u>Finally, four referees made helpful</u> suggestions which we gratefully followed.

322

323 References

- 324 Annorbah, N.N.D., Collar, N.J., Marsden, S.J., 2016. Trade and habitat change virtually eliminate
- 325 the Grey Parrot Psittacus erithacus from Ghana. Ibis 158, 82-91
- 326 Balme, G.A., Hunter, L., Braczkowski, A.R., 2012. Applicability of age-based hunting regulations
- 327 for African leopards. PLoS ONE 7, e35209
- 328 Beissinger, S.R., 2001. Trade of live wild birds: potentials, principles, and practices of sustainable
- 329 use, In Conservation of exploited species. eds J.D. Reynolds, G.M. Mace, K.H. Redford, J.G.
- 330 Robinson, pp. 182-202. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- 331 Beissinger, S.R., Bucher, E.H., 1992a. Can parrots be conserved through sustainable harvesting?
- 332 Bioscience 42, 164-173

- 333 Beissinger, S.R., Bucher, E.H., 1992b. Sustainable harvesting of parrots for conservation., In New
- 334 world parrots in crisis: solutions from conservation biology. eds S.R. Beissinger, N.F.R. Snyder,
- 335 pp. 73-115. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington, DC.
- Beissinger, S.R., Westphal, M.I., 1998. On the use of demographic models of population viability
- in endangered species management. The Journal of Wildlife Management 62, 821-841
- Benson, C., Benson, F., Stuart, S., Fry, C., 1988. Parrots, parakeets and lovebirds, In The Birds of
- 339 Africa. eds C. Fry, S. Keith, E. Urban, pp. 1-25. Academic Press, London, UK.
- BirdLife International, 2017. Species factsheet: *Psittacus erithacus*.
 http://datazone.birdlife.org/species/factsheet/22724813 (Accessed 10 October 2017)
- 342 Birkeland, C., Dayton, P.K., 2005. The importance in fishery management of leaving the big ones.
- 343 Trends in Ecology & Evolution 20, 356-358
- Bouzat, J.L., Strem, R.I., 2012. Population viability analysis of the blue-throated macaw (Ara
- 345 glaucogularis) using individual-based and cohort-based PVA programs. Open Conservation Biology
- 346 Journal 6, 12
- Boyce, M.S., 1992. Population viability analysis. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 23,
 481-506
- 349 Brightsmith, D.J., 2005. Parrot nesting in southeastern Peru: seasonal patterns and keystone trees.
- 350 The wilson bulletin 117, 296-305
- 351 Brouwer, K., Jones, M., King, C., Schifter, H., 2000. Longevity records for Psittaciformes in
- 352 captivity. International Zoo Yearbook 37, 299-316
- 353 Caswell, H., 1989. Matrix Population Models. Sinauer Sunderland, MA.

- 354 CITES, 2006. Twenty-second meeting of the Animals Committee, Lima, Peru. 7-13 July 2006 AC
 355 22 Doc.10.2 Annex 1.
- CITES, 2014. Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species. 27th meeting of
 the Animals Committee. AC27 Doc. 12.4.
- 358 CITES, 2017. Notification to the parties No. 2017/010 Reservations on Appendices I and II.
- Cockle, K.L., Martin, K., Drever, M.C., 2010. Supply of tree-holes limits nest density of cavitynesting birds in primary and logged subtropical Atlantic forest. Biological Conservation 143, 28512857
- 362 Cornelius, C., Cockle, K., Politi, N., Berkunsky, I., Sandoval, L., Ojeda, V., Rivera, L., Hunter Jr,
- 363 M., Martin, K., 2008. Cavity-nesting birds in neotropical forests: cavities as a potentially limiting
- 364 resource. Ornitologia Neotropical 19, 253-268
- 365 Dändliker, G., 1992. The Grey Parrot in Ghana: A population survey, a contribution to the biology
- 366 of the species, a study of its commercial exploitation and management recommendations. A report
- 367 on CITES Project S-30. CITES Secretariat, Geneva.
- de Grahl, W., 1987. The grey parrot. TFH Publications, Neptune City, NJ.
- del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A., Sargatal, J., Christie, D., de Juana, E., 2017. Handbook of the Birds of the
- 370 World Alive (Accessed 10 October 2017)
- Exell, A.W., 1973. Angiosperms of the islands of the gulf of Guinea (Fernando Po, Príncipe, S.
- 372 Tomé, and Annobón). Bulletin of the British Museum (Natural History). Botany 4, 325-411

- Fahlman, Å., 2002. African Grey Parrot conservation: a feasibility evaluation of developing a local
 conservation program in Principe, In Arbetsgruppen för Tropisk Ekologi. Uppsala University,
 Uppsala.
- 376 Figueiredo, E., Paiva, J., Stevart, T., Oliveira, F., Smith, G., 2011. Annotated catalogue of the
- flowering plants of São Tomé and Príncipe. Bothalia 41, 41-82.doi: 10.4102/abc.v41i1.34
- 378 Forshaw, J.M., 1989. Parrots of the world, 3rd Revised edn. Blandford Press Ltd, London.
- 379 Fotso, R., 1998. Survey status of the distribution and utilization of the grey parrot (*Psittacus erithacus*)
- 380 in Cameroon. CITES Secretariat, Geneva.
- 381 Getz, W.M., Haight, R.G., 1989. Population harvesting: demographic models of fish, forest, and
- animal resources. Princeton University Press, Princeton.
- Giles, B.G., Findlay, C.S., 2004. Effectiveness of a selective harvest system in regulating deer
 populations in Ontario. Journal of Wildlife Management 68, 266-277
- Hart, J., Hart, T., Salumu, L., Bernard, A., Abani, R., Martin, R., 2016. Increasing exploitation of
 grey parrots in eastern DRC drives population declines. Oryx 50, 16-16
- Hunter, C.M., Caswell, H., 2005. Selective harvest of sooty shearwater chicks: effects on
 population dynamics and sustainability. Journal of Animal Ecology 74, 589-600
- 389 IUCN, 2016. IUCN Red List of Threatened Species. Version 2016.3. <u>www.iucnredlist.org</u>
 390 (Accessed 10 October 2017)
- Jones, C.G., 2004. Conservation management of endangered birds, In Bird ecology and conservation: a handbook of techniques. eds W.J. Sutherland, I. Newton, R.E. Green, pp. 269-
- 393 293. Oxford University Press, New York.

- Jones, P., Tye, A., 2006. The birds of São Tomé & Príncipe, with Annobón, islands of the Gulf of
 Guinea: an annotated checklist. British Ornithologists' Union (BOU Checklist Series no.22),
 Oxford, U.K.
- Juste, J., 1996. Trade in the gray parrot *Psittacus erithacus* on the Island of Principe (São Tomé and
 Príncipe, Central Africa): initial assessment of the activity and its impact. Biological Conservation
 76, 101-104
- Koenig, S.E., 2008. Black-billed parrot (*Amazona agilis*) population viability assessment (PVA): a
 science-based prediction for policy makers. Ornitologia Neotropical 19, 135-149
- 402 Lantermann, W., 2000. Graupapageien: Artgerechte Haltung, Pflege und Zucht. Oerter und
 403 Spörer, Reutlingen.
- Lindstedt, S.L., Calder, W.A., 1976. Body size and longevity in birds. Condor 78, 91-94
- 405 Marsden, S.J., Loqueh, E., Takuo, J.M., Hart, J.A., Abani, R., Ahon, D.B., Annorbah, N., Johnson, R., Valle, S., 2015. Using encounter rates as surrogates for density estimates makes monitoring of 406 407 heavily-traded achievable Africa. Oryx 50, 617-625.doi: grev parrots across 10.1017/S0030605315000484 408
- Marsden, S.J., Loqueh, E., Takuo, J.M., Hart, J.A., Abani, R., Ahon, D.B., Showers, C., Annorbah,
 N., Johnson, R., Valle, S., 2013. A protocol to allow density estimation and monitoring of the
 heavily traded grey parrots across their huge African ranges, In Strengthening Capacity for
 Monitoring and Regulation of International Trade of African Grey Parrot. ed. CITES, pp. 1-18.
 CITES Secretariat, Geneva.
- Marsden, S.J., Royle, K., 2015. Abundance and abundance change in the world's parrots. Ibis 157,
 219-229.doi: 10.1111/ibi.12236

- 416 Martin, R.O., Perrin, M.R., Boyes, R.S., Abebe, Y.D., Annorbah, N.D., Asamoah, A., Bizimana,
- 417 D., Bobo, K.S., Bunbury, N., Brouwer, J., Diop, M.S., Ewnetu, M., Fotso, R.C., Garteh, J., Hall,
- 418 P., Holbech, L.H., Madindou, I.R., Maisels, F., Mokoko, J., Mulwa, R., Reuleaux, A., Symes, C.,
- 419 Tamungang, S., Taylor, S., Valle, S., Waltert, M., Wondafrash, M., 2014. Research and conservation
- 420 of the larger parrots of Africa and Madagascar: a review of knowledge gaps and opportunities.
- 421 Ostrich 85, 205-233
- 422 McGowan, P., 2001. Status, management and conservation of the African Grey Parrot, *Psittacus*423 *erithacus* in Nigeria. CITES, Geneva.
- 424 Melo, M., 1998. Differentiation between Principe Island and mainland populations of the African
- 425 Grey Parrot *Psittacus erithacus*: Genetic and behavioural evidence and implications for conservation.
- 426 Percy FitzPatrick Institute of African Ornithology, University of Cape Town, Cape Town.
- 427 Millennium Ecosystem Assessment, 2005. Ecosystems and human well-being. Island Press,
 428 Washington, DC.
- 429 Munn, C., 1992. Macaw biology and ecotourism, or when a bird in the bush is worth two in the
- 430 hand, In New world parrots in crisis: solutions from conservation biology. eds S.R. Beissinger,
- 431 N.F.R. Snyder, N. Collar, pp. 47-72. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington, DC.
- 432 Newton, I., 1994. The role of nest sites in limiting the numbers of hole-nesting birds: a review.
- 433 Biological Conservation 70, 265-276
- 434 Newton, I., 1998. Population limitation in birds. Academic press, San Diego, CA.
- 435 Ngenyi, A., 2002. African Grey Parrot Trade in Cameroon. PsittaScene 50, 2-3

- 436 Ngenyi, A., 2003. The African Grey Parrot status and commercial exploitation in Cameroon.
 437 WWF, Jengi SE project.
- 438 Packer, C., Kosmala, M., Cooley, H.S., Brink, H., Pintea, L., Garshelis, D., Purchase, G., Strauss,
- 439 M., Swanson, A., Balme, G., 2009. Sport hunting, predator control and conservation of large
- 440 carnivores. PLoS ONE 4, e5941
- 441 Pain, D., Martins, T., Boussekey, M., Diaz, S., Downs, C., Ekstrom, J., Garnett, S., Gilardi, J.,
- 442 McNiven, D., Primot, P., 2006. Impact of protection on nest take and nesting success of parrots
- 443 in Africa, Asia and Australasia. Animal Conservation 9, 322-330
- 444 Pires, S.F., 2012. The illegal parrot trade: a literature review. Global Crime 13, 176-190
- Poole, C.M., Shepherd, C.R., 2016. Shades of grey: the legal trade in CITES-listed birds in
 Singapore, notably the globally threatened African grey parrot Psittacus erithacus. Oryx FirstView,
 1-7.doi:10.1017/S0030605314000234
- R Core Team, 2014. R: A language and environment for statistical computing, ed. R.F.f.S.
 Computing, Vienna, Austria.
- 450 Renton, K., Salinas-Melgoza, A., De Labra-Hernández, M.Á., de la Parra-Martínez, S.M., 2015.
- 451 Resource requirements of parrots: nest site selectivity and dietary plasticity of Psittaciformes.
- 452 Journal of Ornithology 156, 73-90
- 453 Ricklefs, R.E., 2000. Density dependence, evolutionary optimization, and the diversification of
 454 avian life histories. The Condor 102, 9-22
- 455 Rockwood, L.L., 2006. Introduction to population ecology. Blackwell Publishing, Malden, MA.

- Rosser, A., Haywood, M., 2002. Guidance For CITES Scientific Authorities: Checklist to assist in
 making non-detriment findings for Appendix II exports. IUCN.
- 458 Saunders, D.A., Mawson, P.R., Dawson, R., 2014. Use of tree hollows by Carnaby's cockatoo and
- the fate of large hollow-bearing trees at Coomallo Creek, Western Australia 1969–2013. Biological
- 460 Conservation 177, 185-193
- Seibert, L.M., 2006. Social behavior of psittacine birds, In Manual of parrot behavior. ed. A.U.
 Luescher, pp. 43-48. Blackwell Publishing, Oxford.
- 463 Smith, M.J., Benítez-Díaz, H., Clemente-Muñoz, M.Á., Donaldson, J., Hutton, J.M., McGough,
- 464 H.N., Medellin, R.A., Morgan, D.H., O'Criodain, C., Oldfield, T.E., 2011. Assessing the impacts
- 465 of international trade on CITES-listed species: current practices and opportunities for scientific
- 466 research. Biological Conservation 144, 82-91
- 467 Taylor, T., Parkin, D., 2008. Sex ratios observed in 80 species of parrots. Journal of Zoology 276,
 468 89-94
- 469 UNEP-WCMC, 2015. CITES trade database. <u>http://trade.cites.org/</u> (Accessed 10 October 2017)
- 470 Valle, S., 2015. Population viability and conservation of Grey Parrots Psittacus erithacus on the
- 471 island of Príncipe, Gulf of Guinea., In School of Science and the Environment. Manchester472 Metropolitan University, Manchester.
- Valle, S., Collar, N.J., Harris, W.E., Marsden, S.J., 2017. Spatial and seasonal variation in abundance
 within an insular grey parrot population. African Journal of
 Ecology.http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/aje.12367

- 476 Wright, T.F., Toft, C.A., Enkerlin-Hoeflich, E., Gonzalez-Elizondo, J., Albornoz, M., Rodríguez-
- 477 Ferraro, A., Rojas-Suárez, F., Sanz, V., Trujillo, A., Beissinger, S.R., 2001. Nest poaching in
- 478 Neotropical parrots. Conservation Biology 15, 710-720
- 479 Young, A., Hobson, E., Lackey, L.B., Wright, T., 2012. Survival on the ark: life- history trends in
- 480 captive parrots. Animal Conservation 15, 28-43
- 481 Zhang, L., Hua, N., Sun, S., 2008. Wildlife trade, consumption and conservation awareness in
- 482 southwest China. Biodiversity and Conservation 17, 1493-1516

484

- 100
- 486
- 487
- 488 Tables

489 **Table 1.** Parameters of the model used to validate the population model for Grey Parrots on Príncipe.

Life history trait	Value used in the model
Number of iterations	1,000
Number of year modelled	20 (1995–2014)
Number of population modelled	1
Inbreeding depression	No inbreeding depression assumed
Immigration rate	N/A
Emigration rate	N/A
Reproductive system	Long-term monogamy
Age of first reproduction	4 years
Maximum age of reproduction	45 years
Maximum lifespan	45 years
Maximum number of broods/year	1
Maximum number of progeny/brood	3
Mean number of chicks per brood (SD)	1.94 (0.7)
Nest success	77%
Female : male ratio at birth	46%
Density dependence in reproduction	Availability of nest sites (SD)=5,502 (2,132)
Proportion of adult females breeding	All
λ - finite rate of increase	1.1
Juvenile survivorship (SD)	52 % (0.8)

Subadult survivorship (SD)	91 % (0.3)
Adult survivorship (SD)	91 % (0.3)
Initial population size	Various depending from simulation
Age distribution (%) of initial population	1:2:2.5
Carrying capacity	None
Number of juveniles harvested (SD)	600 (100)
Number of subadults harvested	0
Number of adults harvested	0
Table 2. Predicted probability of the population going ex	tinct within 50 years (percentage of model iterations that resulted

496 in extinction, n = 1,000) when the population is subject to different magnitudes of harvest within three hypothetical scenarios

497 <u>of habitat loss (see also Figure 5).</u>

		Low	Medium	<u>High</u>
No harvest		<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
Chicks harvest	<u>600 ± 100</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
	<u>900 ± 100</u>	<u>0.4 %</u>	<u>0.3 %</u>	<u>0.4 %</u>
	<u>1,200 ± 100</u>	<u>81.3 %</u>	<u>80.1 %</u>	<u>84.0 %</u>
Nest raiding	<u>600 ± 100</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
	<u>900 ± 100</u>	<u>53.5 %</u>	<u>54.8 %</u>	<u>59.0 %</u>
	<u>1,200 ± 100</u>	<u>100 %</u>	<u>100 %</u>	<u>100 %</u>
Indiscriminate trapping	<u>600 ± 100</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
	<u>900 ± 100</u>	<u>34.3 %</u>	<u>35.2 %</u>	<u>38.2 %</u>
	<u> 1,200 ± 100</u>	<u>100 %</u>	<u>100 %</u>	<u>100 %</u>

|- . .

- 505
- 506
- 507
- 508

509 Figure Legends

- 510 **Figure 1.** Sensitivity of the population trend to (a) an incremental 5% decrease in juvenile
- 511 survivorship (grey lines) from the current (SD) 52% (8) (black line); and (b) an incremental 2%
- decrease in subadult and adult survivorship (grey lines) from the original (SD) 91% (3) (black
 line).
- 514 **Figure 2.** Predicted population trend and individual simulations in response to no harvest (0%
- of the initial population); and an annual harvest (SD) of 600 (100), i.e. 7.5% of the initial
- 516 population, 900 (100), i.e. 11.3% of the initial population, and 1,200 (100) chicks, i.e. 15% of the
- 517 initial population, with associated finite rate of population increase (λ).- Light grey lines =
- 518 population trajectories resulting from each simulation; black solid lines = mean trajectory.
- 519 **Figure 3**. Predicted population trend and individual simulations in response to harvesting a fixed 520 (left) or variable (right) quota of 900 (top) and of 1,000 (bottom) chicks each year.

521 **Figure 4.** Difference in predicted 50-year trends when the population is subject to a harvest of 522 900 ± 100 harvesting chicks only, nest raiding (i.e. one adult is collected with every two chicks) 523 and indiscriminate trapping.

- **Figure 5.** Predicted 50-year trends (y axis expressed in thousands) when the population is subject to different magnitudes of harvest (SD), i.e. solid line = $600 \pm (100)$, dashed line = $900 \pm (100)$, dotted line = $1,200 \pm (100)$, yielded with a variety of techniques (chick harvesting, nest raiding and indiscriminate trapping), in three hypothetical scenarios of habitat loss, i.e. Low = 30% primary and 70% secondary forest (i.e. $4,553 \pm 1,821$ nests); Medium = 17% and 83% (i.e. $3,570 \pm 1,498$ nests); and High = only 17% primary (i.e. $1,674 \pm 606$ nests) low, medium and high (see Methods).
- 531
- 532
- 533
- 534
- 535
- 536

540 Figures



Figure 1



Year





Year







571 Figure 5