Doctorate of Nursing Practice Students' Impressions of Uses for Visual Thinking Strategies

Margaret Moorman, Desiree Hensel

1

Abstract

- 2 **Background:** Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS) is a structured art viewing technique designed to
- 3 teach critical thinking and aesthetic appreciation. Literature on how VTS might be used in
- 4 nursing is just emerging.
- 5 **Methods:** This qualitative descriptive study examined written responses to how 14 doctorate of
- 6 nursing practice students felt that they might use VTS in their practice after engaging in a
- 7 classroom session.
- 8 **Results:** Three themes emerged for how nurses might use VTS: as a teaching tool, changing
- 9 thinking in practice, and facilitating communication.
- 10 **Conclusions:** This study contributes to the growing body of literature which suggests that art and
- 11 VTS and can be used in nursing with practitioners of all levels to promote conversations that
- involve listening intently and considering others possibilities.
- 13 **Keywords**: Aesthetics, Nursing education, Doctorate of nursing practice education, Teaching
- 14 strategies, Visual Thinking Strategies,

15

.....

This is the author's manuscript of the article published in final edited form as:

The fundamental philosophy that nursing is as an art and a science has led some educators to look for ways to use art to help learners develop professional skills and attitudes (Moorman & Hensel, 2016). Grounded in social learning theory, Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS) is a structured art viewing technique of interest that can facilitate the development of aesthetic understanding and critical thinking skills (Housen, 2001& 2002). Much as nurses are thought to develop skills sequentially from novice to expert (Benner, 1982), Housen (2001) theorized that the ability to understand art images develops in five stages beginning with an accountive stage where novices make concrete observations gained from the senses (See Table). As skills develop, viewers move through constructive, classifying, and interpretive stages until finally reaching a re-creative stage where they are able to fuse personal with universal knowledge.

Under the guidance of a trained facilitator, VTS integrates fact-finding, questioning, speculating, and personal association to help individuals move to deeper levels of understanding (Yenawine, 1997). Using Housen's (2001) method, the facilitator typically selects three works of art mindful that more abstract pieces inspire a richer diversity of interpretation. Sessions traditionally have been held in an art museum but can also be successfully modified for use in the classroom using projected images (Moorman, Hensel, Decker, & Busby, 2016). Three standard open-ended questions are used to guide discussions: What is going on in this picture? What are you seeing that makes you say that? and What more can you find? According to the educational philosophies of Lev Vygotsky (1993), students are more likely to synthesize learning when engaging and socializing together, and Housen suggests that repeated practice with these

three questions in VTS sessions help leaners gain a new approach for discovering deeper meanings. The discussions that ensue provide a multitude of opportunities to work in groups and develop communication and observational skills. Maximum student participation and expansion of thought are enhanced through the use of techniques such as modeling mutual respect, listening intently, and paraphrasing (Moorman, 2013).

Originally created as an educational strategy for children, educators are beginning to recognize that VTS holds value in higher education including the health sciences (Hailey, Miller, & Yenawine, 2015; Ludwig 2006; Moorman & Hensel, 2016). VTS has been used to improve attention to detail during physical assessment, improve sensitivity and communication, and increase collaboration (Jasani, & Saks, 2013; Klugman, Peel, & Beckmann-Mendez, 2011; Miller, Grohe, Khoshbin, & Katz, 2013; Naghshineh et al., 2008; Reilly, Ring, & Duke, 2005). In the field of nursing, undergraduate students have reported that the techniques used in a VTS session created a safe learning environment and helped them see things differently (Moorman, 2015). Another study found that undergraduate nursing students perceived gaining observational, cognitive, interpersonal, and intrapersonal skills after participating in a single VTS session (Moorman et al., 2016). However, very little is known about how VTS might be used among experienced nurses in leadership positions. The purpose of this project was to explore perceptions of how nurses enrolled in a Doctorate of Nursing Practice (DNP) program perceived that they might use VTS in their practice.

58 Method

Fourteen DNP students, enrolled in a leadership-based program, participated in a classroom VTS session led by a trained facilitator. The group viewed three works of art and then were asked the three standard VTS session questions. Following the session the participants

voluntarily provided written feedback to two open- ended questions: 1. What was your impression of Visual Thinking Strategies? and 2. How might you use Visual Thinking Strategies in your nursing or leadership? All participants gave written consent to study their de-identified responses and the university's institutional review board deemed the project as non-human subject's research. Data were analyzed using the qualitative descriptive approach described by Sandelowski (2000) with Dedoose Version 7.5 software.

68 Results

The VTS session was generally well received as being enjoyable and having applications for practice. Three themes emerged for how participants might use VTS: as a teaching tool (N=13 excerpts), changing thinking in practice (N=7 excerpts), and facilitating interpersonal relations (N=14 excerpts).

Facilitating Interpersonal Relations

Review of the responses revealed 14 excerpts that reflected using VTS to address some aspect of interpersonal relations including using it as a way to improve communication. One participant wrote, "We would use these techniques to interview patients, to talk with students, or meet with other professional." Another wrote, "It (VTS) helps to engage others. From a leadership perspective, it is important to listen." Another participant felt that VTS could "tear down barriers to communication thus improve quality and safety." Using VTS as a method for socialization was mentioned twice. One participant described its use to begin an interdisciplinary activity, "I could see this as being a great ice breaker at the start of our simulation for the NICU team, MDs NNPs, RTs, RNs, etc."

Changing Thinking in Practice

Describing how VTS might be used in practice as tool to for problem solving or decision making was found in 7 excerpts exemplified in the statement, "It was an amazing way of thinking that I will try in my daily work." Another participant wrote that VTS could be, "Useful in being proactive and help leaders making right decisions. Useful for physicians and nurses to use visual cues and use clinical judgement better." Two excerpts reflected on how VTS might specifically be used for quality improvement. Specifically, one participant shared, "I believe this would be a great way to start a RCA (root cause analysis) initiative. If we could use this it might open up people to see things differently in the environment or process."

Teaching Tool

The use of VTS as a teaching tool was described 13 times exemplified in the comments "It was an interesting approach to learning. I can see VTS being useful in multiple learning environments" and included "Impactful teaching strategy especially undergraduate nursing students who have no clinical experience." Comment addressed the context of the VTS learning environment as well as the perceived outcomes. Much as Moorman (2015) found VTS created a safe learning environment on participant believed VTS could, "...be used for creating a shame free learning environment." Two participants specifically commented on how VTS could be used to generate out of the box thinking, "...helpful for clinical faculty to push students to think outside the box." One participant suggested, "I would like to use this in a classroom setting to help students develop their nursing sixth sense and clinical reasoning."

103 Discussion

The DNP students in this study perceived that skills learned in VTS had many practice implications including teaching and changing thinking. Other studies have found that pre-

licensure students perceived that VTS helped them learn to see patterns and develop their thinking skills in a nonthreatening way (Moorman, 2015; Moorman et al., 2016). There are striking parallels between how individuals learn to understand art and how Benner (1982) believed nurses gain clinical reasoning skills. Housen (2001) felt discussing art was an ideal way to facilitate the acquisition of critical thinking skills precisely because there are no one right or wrong answer to art interpretation. VTS works on the assumption that viewers are at different stages, and that they must move beyond being passive receivers of information to construct new meanings. Learning to be more open and attentive to others' opinions can help inform student's thinking, which can enhance learning. VTS teaches students to expand other's ideas supporting a group thinking mentality (Moorman et al., 2016). The findings of this study suggest that VTS techniques may be used with nurses of all competency levels to help them gain new perspectives.

Another application these DNP students saw for VTS was facilitating communication with patients, students, and colleagues. Pre-licensure students have also reported that they could apply the communication techniques modeled by the facilitator to help them better communicate with their patients and other team members (Moorman et al., 2016). Housen (2001) believed that the techniques used in VTS invited communication and generated motivational listening where participants genuinely wanted to hear other's ideas and incorporate them into their personal interpretations. As a VTS facilitator demonstrates an understanding of each student's response, they model mutual respect which in turn facilitates further communication (Moorman, 2013).

The term *facilitate* has been defined as "to make easier" or "help bring about"

(http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/facilitate). Core competencies for nurse educators

include facilitating learning and facilitating learner development and socialization (Halstead, 2007). As facilitators, nurse educators are expected to create a safe environment for students that promotes reflection and the achievement of learning outcomes while also coaching students solve problems and acquire professional values and behaviors (Benner, Sutphen, Leonard, & Day, 2009; Billings & Halstead, 2013; Halstead, 2007). Yet learning how to facilitate may be challenging for a novice educator. The key to student engagement with VTS may be successful facilitation. In depth interviews with undergraduate nursing students who had engaged in VTS found that the facilitator was key to their participation (Moorman, 2013). Students described how the facilitator guided the conversation and elicited conversation, never making them feel criticized or judged. The students reported that this way of interacting made it much more likely that they would participate and helped them go deeper into their own thinking. The findings of the current study suggest that one of VTS's greatest potentials may indeed be providing leaders and educators with an exemplar of how to facilitate. Future research is needed to understand if training in VTS facilitation techniques can improve general teaching abilities.

This study contributes to the growing body of literature which suggests that art and VTS and can be used in nursing with practitioners of all levels to promote conversations that involve listening intently and considering others possibilities. This study examined DNP student's perceptions but stopped short of assessing if the participants actually used any skills learned from the session in their practice. Future studies are needed to examine how skills learned in VTS translate to practice.

148 Web Resources

http://www.vtshome.org/

http://www.qsen.org/modules/module11/files/qsen_module11_part4/

152	References
153 154	Benner, P. (1982). From novice to expert. AJN: The American Journal of Nursing, 82(3), 402-
155	407.
156	Benner, P., Sutphen, M., Leonard, V., & Day, L. (2009). Educating nurses: A call for radical
157	transformation. San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons.
158	Billings, D. M., & Halstead, J. A. (2013). Teaching in nursing: A guide for faculty. St. Louis:
159	Elsevier Health Sciences.
160	Hailey, D., Miller, A., & Yenawine, P. (2015). Understanding visual literacy: The visual thinking
161	strategies approach (pp. 49-73). In D.M. Baylen and A. D'Alba (Eds) Essentials of
162	Teaching and Integrating Visual and Media Literacy. Cham, ZG: Springer International
163	Publishing.
164	Halstead, J. A. (Ed.). (2007). Nurse educator competencies: Creating an evidence-based practice
165	for nurse educators. New York: National League for Nursing
166	Housen, A. (2001). Eye of the beholder: Research, theory and practice. Visual Understanding in
167	Education (VUE), 1-26. Retrieved from
168	$http://www.vtshome.org/system/resources/0000/0006/Eye_of_the_Beholder.pdf$
169	Housen, A. C. (2002). Aesthetic thought, critical thinking and transfer. Arts and Learning
170	Research Journal, 18.1, 99–131. Retrieved from
171	http://educacaoartistica.dge.mec.pt/assets/aesthetic_thought.pdf
172	Jasani, S.K., & Saks, N.S. (2013). Utilizing visual art to enhance the clinical observation skills of
173	medical students. Medical Teacher. 35(7), e1327-1331.11.

174	Klugman, C. M., Peel, J., & Beckmann-Mendez, D. (2011). Art rounds: Teaching			
175	interprofessional students visual thinking strategies at on school. Academic Medicine, 85			
176	1266-1271. doi:10.1097/ACM.0b013e31822c1427			
177	Landorf, H. (2006). Perspectives on teaching: What's going on in this picture? Visual thinking			
178	strategies and adult learning. New Horizons in Adult Education and Human Resource			
179	Development, 20(4), 28-32. doi:10.1002/nha3.10267			
180	Miller, A., Grohe, M., Khoshbin, S., Katz, J.T. (2013). From the galleries to the clinic: applying			
181	art museum lessons to patient care. Journal of Medical Humanities, 34(4), 433-438.			
182	Moorman, M. (2013). The meaning of Visual Thinking Strategies for nursing students. UNLV			
183	Theses, Dissertation, Professional Papers, and Capstone, Paper 1946. Retrieved from			
184	http://digitalscholarship.unlv.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2947&context=thesesdisser			
185	tations			
186	Moorman, M. (2015). The meaning of visual thinking strategies for nursing students.			
187	Humanities, 4 (4) 748–759. doi:10.3390/h4040748			
188	Moorman, M., & Hensel, D. (2016). Using visual thinking strategies in nursing education. <i>Nurse</i>			
189	Educator, 41(1) 5-6. doi: 10.1097/NNE.00000000000185			
190	Moorman, M., Hensel, D., Decker, K., & Busby, K. (2016). Learning outcomes with visual			
191	thinking strategies in nursing education. Nurse Education Today.			
192	doi:10.1016/j.nedt.2016.08.020			
193	Naghshineh, S., Hafler, J. P., Miller, A. R., Blanco, M. A., Lipsitz, S. R., Dubroff, R. P Katz,			
194	J. T. (2008). Formal art observation training improves medical students' visual diagnostic			

195	skills. Journal of General Internal Medicine, 23, 991-997. doi:10.1007/s11606-008-
196	0667-0.
197	Sandelowski, M. (2000). Focus on research methods-whatever happened to qualitative
198	description? Research in Nursing and Health, 23(4), 334-340
199	Reilly, J. M., Ring, J., & Duke, L. (2005). Visual thinking strategies: a new role for art in
200	medical education. Family Medicine, 37(4), 250-2.
201	Yenawine, P. (1997). Thoughts on visual literacy. Handbook of Research on Teaching Literacy
202	through the Communicative Visual Arts. New York: MacMillan Library Reference.
203	Yenewine, P, (2013). Visual thinking strategies: Using art to deepen meaning across school
204	disciplines. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press.
205	Vygotsky, L. S. (1993). The collected works of L.S. Vygotsky (Vol. 2). New York: Plenum Press.
206	
207	

<u>*</u>

Stage	Nursing Skill Development	Aesthetic Stages	Common
	(Benner, 1982)	(Housen, 2001)	Themes
I	Novice: Use of context free	Accountive: Concrete	Context free
	rules to guide actions	observations gained from	concrete
		senses and personal knowledge	reasoning
II	Advanced beginner: Recognizes	Constructive: Building	Finding
	recurrent meaningful situational	frameworks for looking at art.	frameworks to
	components or aspects	Use accessible and logical tools and personal knowledge	guide thinking
III	Competent: Creating plans	Classifying: Adopting a more	Use of an
	based on analytical and abstract	analytical perspective placing	analytical
	contemplation of the problem	things within a historical	approach
		context	
IV	Proficient: Perceiving situations	Interpretive: Symbols emerge	Finding deeper
	as wholes using maxims to	and works meaning emerge as	meanings
	guide actions. Recognizes when	critical skills enhance the	
	picture does not represent the	personal encounter	
	expected		
V	Expert: Intuitive use of vast	Re-Creative: Merging of	Reasoning that
	personal experience	personal and universal	supersedes
		knowledge	logic