

LONDON  
SCHOOL of  
HYGIENE  
& TROPICAL  
MEDICINE



LSHTM Research Online

Gilligan, PH; Downey, DG; Elborn, JS; Flume, PA; Funk, S; Gilpin, D; Kidd, TJ; McCaughan, J; Millar, BC; Murphy, PG; +3 more... Rendall, JC; Tunney, MM; Moore, JE; (2018) "Pathogen eradication" and "Emerging pathogens": Difficult definitions in cystic fibrosis. *Journal of clinical microbiology*. ISSN 0095-1137 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.00193-18>

Downloaded from: <http://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/4648802/>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.00193-18>

**Usage Guidelines:**

Please refer to usage guidelines at <https://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/policies.html> or alternatively contact [researchonline@lshtm.ac.uk](mailto:researchonline@lshtm.ac.uk).

Available under license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/>

<https://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk>

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33

Commentary

*Pathogen eradication*” and “*Emerging pathogens*”:  
Difficult definitions in cystic fibrosis

Peter H. Gilligan<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Damian G. Downey<sup>3,4</sup>, J. Stuart Elborn<sup>4,12</sup>,  
Patrick A. Flume<sup>5</sup>, Sebastian Funk<sup>6</sup>, Deirdre Gilpin<sup>7</sup>, Timothy J.  
Kidd<sup>4,8</sup>, John McCaughan<sup>9</sup>, B. Cherie Millar<sup>10</sup>, Philip G Murphy<sup>11</sup>,  
Jacqueline C. Rendall<sup>3</sup>, Michael M. Tunney<sup>7</sup> and John E. Moore<sup>4,10</sup>

1 Pathology and Laboratory Medicine, University of North Carolina (UNC) School of  
2 Medicine, Chapel Hill, USA

3 Clinical Microbiology-Immunology Laboratories, UNC Health Care, Chapel Hill,  
4 USA.

5 Northern Ireland Regional Adult CF Centre, Belfast Health and Social Trust, Belfast,  
6 Northern Ireland, UK

7 Centre for Experimental Medicine, Queen’s University, Belfast, Northern Ireland, UK

8 Departments of Medicine and Pediatrics, Medical University of South Carolina,  
9 Charleston, SC, USA.

10 Centre for the Mathematical Modelling of Infectious Diseases, Department of  
11 Infectious Disease Epidemiology, The London School of Hygiene & Tropical  
12 Medicine, London, UK

13 School of Pharmacy Queen's University, Belfast, UK

14 School of Chemistry and Molecular Biosciences, The University of Queensland,  
15 Brisbane, Australia

16 Department of Medical Microbiology, The Royal Group of Hospitals, Belfast Health  
17 and Social Trust ,Belfast, Northern Ireland, UK

18 Northern Ireland Public Health Laboratory, Belfast City Hospital, Belfast, Northern  
19 Ireland, UK

20 Department of Medical Microbiology, Adelaide and Meath Hospital, Tallaght,  
21 Dublin, Ireland, School of Medicine, Trinity College, Dublin, Ireland

22 Imperial College and Royal Brompton Hospital in London, UK

34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45

**Corresponding author:**

Professor Peter H. Gilligan,  
Pathology and Laboratory Medicine,  
University of North Carolina (UNC) School of Medicine,  
Chapel Hill,  
North Carolina, NC27599-7525  
USA.

Email: Peter.Gilligan@unchealth.unc.edu

46 **Abstract**

47 Infection is a common complication of cystic fibrosis (CF) airways disease. Current  
48 treatment approaches include early intervention with the intent to eradicate  
49 pathogens in the hope of delaying development of chronic infection and chronic use  
50 of aerosolized antibiotics to suppress infection. The use of molecules that help  
51 restore CFTR function, modulate pulmonary inflammation, or improve pulmonary  
52 clearance, may also influence the microbial communities in the airways. As the  
53 pipeline of these new entities continues to expand, it is important to define when key  
54 pathogens are eradicated from the lungs of CF patients and equally important, when  
55 new pathogens might emerge as a result of these novel therapies.

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72 Predicted median life expectancy for people with cystic fibrosis (CF) is now reaching  
73 into the 5th decade (1). This dramatic rise is attributable to numerous research  
74 advances resulting in an improved understanding of the biology of CFTR (cystic  
75 fibrosis transmembrane conductance regulator) dysfunction and its consequences  
76 for innate immunity resulting in chronic infection, inflammation and lung damage.  
77 This knowledge has successfully translated into a variety of new treatments which  
78 have disease modifying potential.

79

80 Antimicrobial therapy to eradicate initial or repeated episodes of *Pseudomonas*  
81 *aeruginosa* positive sputum delays onset of chronic *P. aeruginosa* infection  
82 improving life expectancy (2,3). Other interventions that have contributed to  
83 improved life expectancy include: development of agents to help restore CFTR  
84 function; interventions to improve nutrition; using azithromycin as an  
85 immunomodulator; improving pulmonary clearance with ancillary mucoactive  
86 therapies such as hypertonic saline, DNase and/or inhaled mannitol; infection control  
87 strategies; and as a last resort, lung transplantation (2,3,4). However, median  
88 predicted survival for CF patients is still substantially lower than that of the general  
89 population. The destruction of lung architecture, secondary to inflammation in  
90 response to chronic infection, is the major contributor to this shortened life span.  
91 Although advances in antimicrobial therapy have contributed significantly to  
92 increased life expectancy, they have also resulted in the emergence of multi-drug-  
93 resistant organisms that currently limits the long term effectiveness of this important  
94 treatment strategy (5).

95

96 As additional solutions for the care and treatment of CF patients are studied, an  
97 international working group of CF care providers, epidemiologists, and medical  
98 microbiologists gathered to address two questions which are important in  
99 considering the implementation of new antimicrobial agents: (i). when has a specific  
100 pathogen been eradicated from CF airways in an individual?; and (ii) when has an  
101 organism emerged as a pathogen in people with CF either *de novo* or as a result of  
102 these novel therapeutic approaches?

103

104 **Defining “pathogen eradication” in individuals**

105 Much of the improvement in life expectancy in people with CF is predicated on  
106 understanding how to prevent the establishment of chronic pulmonary infection. The  
107 major respiratory pathogen is a distinctive phenotype of *P. aeruginosa* referred to as  
108 “mucoïd” (1). Mucoïd strains of *P. aeruginosa* are highly adapted to grow in the CF  
109 airway. Key features of mucoïd *P. aeruginosa* is a biofilm mode of growth that  
110 makes the organism refractory to innate immunity and antimicrobial therapy and a  
111 hypermutator phenotype which results in increased antimicrobial resistance (1, 6).  
112 The initial steps of the establishment of chronic infection with mucoïd *P. aeruginosa*  
113 is colonization/infection with a non-mucoïd strain (1,3). Genotyping studies suggest  
114 that initial colonization/infection is due to unique *P. aeruginosa* strains arising from  
115 the environment, although individuals may be infected with similar strains (6,7,8).  
116 However, what is less clear is whether individuals with similar strains obtained them  
117 from the environment or via cross-infection from another person with CF. Early  
118 studies showed that aggressive antimicrobial therapy of non-mucoïd strains delayed  
119 the establishment of chronic infection (1,3). Subsequently two large studies, EPIC  
120 (9) and ELITE (10) determined the efficacy of eradication of *P. aeruginosa* using  
121 aerosolized tobramycin in different regimens with (EPIC) or without (ELITE) oral  
122 ciprofloxacin. Both were able to show that 28 days of aerosolized tobramycin alone  
123 led to negative cultures in approximately 90% of patients and the median time to  
124 next positive culture for *P. aeruginosa* was 2 years (9, 10). Adding ciprofloxacin,  
125 treating for longer duration (56 days), and routine treatment every 3 months did not  
126 improve outcomes. Further data from the EPIC cohort shows that individuals that  
127 had sustained eradication of *P. aeruginosa* were less likely to develop chronic  
128 infection compared to those with early recurrence of infection (9). The finding of a  
129 mucoïd strain is a poor prognostic factor with a lower probability of eradication  
130 following therapy (11) and greater likelihood of having symptoms (2). Taken  
131 together, these data support the notion that regular culture of airways samples  
132 (surveillance cultures) beginning in infancy, with the express purpose of detecting *P.*  
133 *aeruginosa* during the early stages of infection, are an important standard of care for  
134 people with CF (2). When a positive airway culture occurs, the current practice is to  
135 use aerosolized antimicrobials for a fixed duration to eradicate *P. aeruginosa* (12).  
136 Registry data showing a striking decline in *P. aeruginosa* prevalence in a number of  
137 countries attest to the effectiveness of this eradication strategy (13, 14, 15). The  
138 optimal antibiotics and duration of treatment has not been fully established, but a

139 prolonged treatment duration of three months compared to one month and the  
140 addition of oral antibiotics (16, 17) are not superior to one month of inhaled  
141 tobramycin.

142 Other organisms that are pathogenic in the CF lung include members of the  
143 *Burkholderia cepacia* complex particularly *Burkholderia cenocepacia*,  
144 *Staphylococcus aureus* with methicillin resistant (MRSA) strains being observed with  
145 increasing frequency, and *Mycobacterium abscessus* (1,3). MRSA is the only  
146 organism for which a multi-center eradication study has been attempted (18). Here,  
147 a complex eradication scheme of oral antimicrobials, nasal mupirocin, chlorohexidine  
148 mouthwash and body wipes, and environmental cleaning including wiping  
149 environmental surfaces and weekly washing of towels and linens was employed. It  
150 was found that 54% of the CF subjects in the treatment arm remained free of MRSA  
151 after 12 weeks compared to 10% in the control population. Owing to their low  
152 prevalence and limited antimicrobial choices due to resistance, multi-center  
153 eradication trials are not likely for either *B. cepacia* complex or *M. abscessus* (19,20)

154  
155 Eradication presumes that a target organism has been eliminated from the airways.  
156 To understand how eradication might be defined clinically, it is first important to  
157 understand how chronic infection is defined. There have been a number of different  
158 definitions of chronic CF lung infection (21). These definitions are based on the  
159 persistent presence of a target organism e.g *P. aeruginosa*, and in some definitions,  
160 an antibody response to the organism of interest (21). Since antibody tests are not  
161 widely available or standardized (22), most definitions used in clinical trials of chronic  
162 infections are based on sequential culture findings (9,10). The most widely used  
163 definition of chronic CF lung infection is the Leed's criteria (5, 23). It has primarily  
164 been used to define chronic *P. aeruginosa* infection in CF children. CF persons are  
165 categorized as having no infection, being free of infection, intermittent infection, or  
166 chronic infection. The initial definition was based on "monthly" cultures but has  
167 evolved to one based upon the presence or absence of target organisms in four or  
168 more respiratory specimens collected in a 12 month period (21,23). Patients defined  
169 as having intermittent infection comprise those who have cultures positive for a  
170 target organism in <50% of samples, with those defined as chronically infected target  
171 organism culture positive in  $\geq 50\%$  of specimens.

172 Some investigators advocate for the use of qPCR as a surrogate for traditional  
173 culture for a specific target organism using the rationale that it is more sensitive than  
174 culture, especially in individuals who are unable to expectorate sputum (24, 25, 26).  
175 One study showed, however, that qPCR could not differentiate between subjects in  
176 whom eradication was successful and those who failed (25). As such, the utility of  
177 qPCR in eradication studies remains uncertain and requires further investigation.

178 It is important to recognize that the meaning of eradication in the research setting  
179 likely has different meanings for the research scientist compared to the research  
180 subject. The research subject should understand that eradication does not equal  
181 “cure” and that the primary goal of eradication treatment is to delay onset of chronic  
182 infection (9, 10, 11). Most subjects will “fail” eradication efforts at some point in the  
183 future. This failure may be the result of a recurrence of infection with the initial  
184 infecting agent or infection with a new strain of the same bacterial species (27).

185

186 In CF clinical trials, the definition of “eradication” varies widely from a negative  
187 culture at one week to three negative cultures over at least a six-month period after  
188 treatment cessation (10,11,12,18, 28). A definitive definition of “**eradication**”; would  
189 be valuable so that trials could be more easily compared. However, defining failure  
190 of eradication by a specific treatment is complicated by at least three factors. First,  
191 in non-sputum producers especially children under five years of age,  
192 oropharyngeal/deep throat swabs are often used for culture. Although these cultures  
193 tend to have good specificity, sensitivity is lacking meaning “false” eradication might  
194 be reported (29). Secondly, it may be difficult to differentiate “failure of eradication”  
195 with re-infection with a new genotype of the same target organism. Finally, the  
196 retention of indistinguishable genotypes in the oropharynx following successful lower  
197 airway antimicrobial therapy also raise important questions concerning upper airway  
198 reservoirs and how to best determine eradication in non-expectorating patients (7).  
199 Because oropharyngeal cultures are unreliable in reflecting what organisms are  
200 present in the lower airway, a second approach, a sinonasal washing may have  
201 value (29). Although a positive *P. aeruginosa* sinonasal culture has a strong  
202 correlation with the finding of the organism in the lower tract, it has a sensitivity of  
203 only 66% meaning one-third of individuals with *P. aeruginosa* in the lower tract will  
204 be culture negative. The accurate detection of *P. aeruginosa* in the lower respiratory  
205 tract using non-invasive techniques is challenging in the non-expectorating patient.



206

207 Eradication studies generally have not examined genotypes of the target organism  
208 prior to the initiation of therapy to enable comparison to the target organism isolate  
209 found post intervention. Moreover, they do not utilize multiple sampling strategies  
210 which assess both the upper and lower airway compartments. These approaches  
211 would be necessary for differentiating failure to eradicate (i.e. persistence of infection  
212 with the same strain) from re-infection either with the same or a different strain of the  
213 organism. This issue is further complicated by how many morphotypes should be  
214 genotyped pre- and post-intervention and what genotyping method should be used.  
215 Several PCR based methods have been used in molecular epidemiology studies of  
216 *P. aeruginosa* (7,8). The PCR-based method likely to offer the greatest  
217 discriminatory power is multi-locus sequence typing (MLST) (30). Another widely  
218 used method is pulsed field gel electrophoresis (PFGE) (30, 31) which has the  
219 advantage of being a widely accepted typing scheme that has been used for a  
220 variety of molecular epidemiology applications (32, 33). However, this technique is  
221 technically demanding and mutations, small insertions or deletions may cause  
222 organisms with the same genetic ancestry to appear to be distinct clones; whereas  
223 MLST is considered to be a more stable genotyping platform (30, 31). Overall,  
224 whole genome sequencing (WGS) is regarded as the most discriminatory of all  
225 typing methods (34). Ideally, as WGS becomes less expensive and more widely  
226 accessible, it will become the method of choice for bacterial strain typing. A major  
227 barrier to using WGS typing as epidemiologic tool is how to define if isolates belong  
228 to a specific clone. , The number of single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) that  
229 defines a clone varies from organism to organism. For example, Marvig et al (6)  
230 reported that *P. aeruginosa* isolates recovered from CF children and young adults of  
231 the same clone type differed by 122 SNPs, while different clone types differed  
232 >10000 SNPs. By contrast, isolates of vancomycin-resistant enterococci (VRE)  
233 found to be indistinguishable by PFGE showed a diversity of <10 SNPs,  
234 indistinguishable MRSA isolates differed by <100 SNPs; whereas, unrelated VRE  
235 and MRSA PFGE types showed a divergence of approximately 4,000 and 20,000  
236 SNPs, respectively (34). Before WGS method is adopted in clinical trials, clear  
237 definitions of what constitutes a clone and how many SNPs are necessary for  
238 isolates to be considered as unrelated clones needs to be determined.

239 As the development of novel CF therapies accelerate, a clear definition of what  
240 constitutes eradication will allow for the design of rigorous studies that measure the  
241 effectiveness of these therapies and differentiate recurrence from re-infection with a  
242 different strain of the same organism. For now, the following recommendations  
243 should be considered:-

- 244
- 245 1. Eradication is best defined by obtaining multiple specimens (minimum of 3),  
246 over an extended time period (six months), all of which should all be negative for the  
247 target organism.
- 248 2. Genotyping of multiple colony types` of specific target organisms should be  
249 done at enrollment by a highly discriminatory technique (preferably WGS but PFGE  
250 or MLST may be reasonable substitutes) and compared to any target organisms  
251 found post-intervention. The number of isolates to be typed should be based on  
252 what is economically feasible.

253

#### 254 **Defining population-level pathogen emergence**

255

256 The issue of when an organism “**emerges**” in a population has consequences for  
257 the use of novel therapeutics in CF patients. The term “**emerging pathogen**” is one  
258 that is greatly overused in the literature. This overuse most likely reflects the lack of  
259 a clear definition of what is an “emerging pathogen.” Mathematically based  
260 definitions of “emerging pathogen”, for example using segmented linear regression,  
261 are retrospective, but nevertheless offer a definition of greater precision (35). A  
262 widely used definition would be a “clinically distinct condition whose incidence in  
263 humans has increased” (36), but that suggests one should establish the time horizon  
264 over which this increase has happened, the population affected, and how much of an  
265 increase there has been when declaring “emergence (37).”

266 Pathogens that have emerged in CF patients according to this definition during the  
267 past four decades are members of the *B. cepacia* complex during the 1980s and  
268 MRSA during the first decade of this century. In the early 1980s, three CF centers in  
269 North America reported a new organism in CF patients called, at that time,  
270 *Pseudomonas cepacia* (19). This organism appeared to be truly novel causing a  
271 syndrome named the “cepacia syndrome” in which there was rapid pulmonary  
272 decline and in some cases bacteremia, a rare occurrence in people with CF,

273 resulting in death within months of infection but only rarely causing serious infection  
274 in other patient populations (20). This syndrome was found to be primarily due to a  
275 single species, *B. cenocepacia*, which is one of the 21 different species eventually  
276 characterized within the *B. cepacia* complex (19, 38). As molecular typing tools  
277 improved, centers where *B. cenocepacia* emerged were most often dominated by a  
278 single clone first recovered in a specific geographic locale (e.g. ET12  
279 (Edinburgh/Toronto), PHDC, and Midwest strains) (18,20). The ET12 strain has  
280 subsequently been found throughout Canada, the United Kingdom and Ireland (18,  
281 20,39). These *B. cenocepacia* strains, refractory to antimicrobial clearance, and able  
282 to be spread from person-to-person were eventually controlled by strict infection  
283 control practices.

284 The use of selective media to isolate members of the *B. cepacia* complex coupled  
285 with the use of genomic (DNA sequencing) and proteomic (matrix-assisted laser  
286 desorption/ionization time-of-flight mass spectrometry or MALDI-TOF MS) identification  
287 techniques has resulted in the recognition of a number of “emerging” organisms  
288 (19,20). With the use of aerosolized tobramycin, the frequency with which  
289 *Stenotrophomonas maltophilia* and *Achromobacter spp.*, two organisms resistant to  
290 tobramycin, are detected has increased (13,20). However, there is considerable  
291 debate as to whether either of these organisms are pathogens in chronic CF lung  
292 disease. Some studies suggest that *S. maltophilia* is a pathogen in settings where it  
293 can be proven that the patient is mounting a humoral response to the organism (40,  
294 41,42); however, a large population-based study suggested otherwise (43). Similar  
295 data exists for *Achromobacter spp* suggesting that the organism is playing a  
296 pathogenic role in patients who mount a humoral response to it (20). Other much  
297 less frequently detected organisms (<1% prevalence) include *Burkholderia gladioli*,  
298 *Burkholderia pseudomallei*, *Ralstonia spp.*, *Chryseobacterium sp.*, *Pandorea spp.*,  
299 and *Inquilinus spp.* (19,20). Insufficient longitudinal clinical data exists for people  
300 with CF infected with these organism in part due to the infrequency with which these  
301 organisms are recovered.

302

303

304 Another organism that has clearly emerged in CF persons has been MRSA in the  
305 United States during the first decade of this century. Chronic MRSA infection in CF  
306 is associated with declining lung function and premature death (44). Unlike *B.*

307 *cenoepectia*, the rise in MRSA in people with CF has paralleled the rise of MRSA in  
308 other US populations (13, 18, 45). Interestingly, MRSA has not increased in other  
309 countries with robust CF registry data such as the United Kingdom and Australia  
310 both of whom have been better able to control MRSA spread in the general  
311 population (15, 45)

312 Finally, the non-tuberculous mycobacteria (NTM) have also been described as  
313 “emerging” in people with CF. However the presence of NTM in people with CF was  
314 first described in the early 1990s based on data gathered in part in the 1980s (46).  
315 NTM found in people with CF predominantly comprise *Mycobacterium avium*  
316 complex and *M. abscessus* isolates. To say that an organism has “emerged,” there  
317 needs to be evidence of an increase in its incidence. The problem in describing  
318 these organisms as ‘emerging pathogens’ is that there are historic data suggesting  
319 that it has been present in adult CF persons for at least 30 years. Increasing  
320 numbers of NTM infected CF persons in this century have been reported in the US,  
321 Israel, and Germany (47, 48, 49, 50). In the US, data has been gathered in a  
322 systematic manner only over the past five years. These data are further complicated  
323 by the fact that there is little standardization in how these organisms are detected  
324 and identified, thus making the data available of questionable value (47). Part of the  
325 increased detection of these organisms is likely due to both increased clinical  
326 awareness and improved genomic and proteomic based identification techniques  
327 (20). Another interesting possibility is that the combination of aggressive  
328 antimicrobial therapy over many years coupled with general improvements in overall  
329 health has created a CF adult population that is “primed” to be colonized/infected  
330 with environmental organisms that are highly resistant to antimicrobials. Examples  
331 of such organisms include *M. abscessus*, MRSA, *S. maltophilia* and *Achromobacter*  
332 spp.(19,20)

333 There are two intriguing observation concerning *M. abscessus* in CF lung disease  
334 that should be noted. First, there is a developing body of evidence that indicates that  
335 *M. abscessus* is associated with declining lung function in CF populations (49, 50)  
336 with the rate of pulmonary decline greater than seen with other CF pathogens (51).  
337 Secondly, a recent study has shown that a specific clone of *M. abscessus* may have  
338 spread globally (52). Could this clone be analogous to the *B. cenoepectia* clones  
339 that emerged in the 1980s and the MRSA US300 clone that emerged in the early  
340 part of this century in CF patients? Animal and *in vitro* studies suggest that this

341 strain demonstrates increased virulence when compared to other unique *M.*  
342 *abscessus* strains; however, further clinical and environmental studies are needed to  
343 determine its significance and origins (52).

344

345 An important recent finding is the recognition that patients with chronic CF lung  
346 disease have a unique microbiome which is resilient to antibiotic treatment (53).  
347 Within the context of this observation are two important findings. First, anaerobic  
348 bacteria and streptococci are frequently important components of this microbiome  
349 and changes in their relative abundance may be associated with pulmonary  
350 exacerbations (54,55,56,57). Secondly, as lung function declines, there is a  
351 decrease in airway microbial community diversity with certain organisms  
352 predominating (54,55,56,57,). Not surprisingly, these predominant organisms are  
353 those considered the major CF pathogens and include *P. aeruginosa*, *B. cepacia*  
354 complex and *S. aureus*. The role of NTM in the CF lung microbiome is presently  
355 unclear as challenges exist in their detection by current microbiome analysis  
356 methods.

357

358 Microbiome analysis by next generation sequencing will provide greater  
359 understanding of CF lung microbial communities and should eventually provide  
360 information on how organism interactions result in lung pathology. In the short term,  
361 the recognition of increased recovery of specific target organisms known to be  
362 associated with CF lung disease such as *P. aeruginosa*, MRSA, *S. aureus*, *B.*  
363 *cenoecepacia*, and *M. abscessus* in patients receiving novel therapies will be  
364 important. Additionally investigators must be aware of the presence of organisms  
365 currently not associated with chronic CF lung infection which may be found with  
366 increasing prevalence in clinical trials of novel therapies.

367

368 The ability to accurately and reliably categorize CF patients, as having acquired an  
369 “emerging” pathogen or as having “eradicated” an existing infection, pivots on the  
370 intrinsic ability of clinical microbiology techniques to detect important shifts in patient  
371 microbiologic status. CF clinical microbiology laboratories are encouraged to follow  
372 best practice guidelines, as documented in the CUMITECH 43 guidelines (58), as  
373 well as the UK Cystic Fibrosis Trust Consensus Guidelines “Laboratory standards for  
374 processing microbiological samples from people with cystic fibrosis”(59). However,

375 application of these largely culture-based techniques may not be optimal to address  
376 issues of sensitivity and specificity to support microbiological status shifts, while  
377 other testing modalities (e.g. PCR or microbiome analysis) may allow greater  
378 precision.

379 As we move forward with clinical trials in CF lung disease it will be important for data  
380 safety monitoring boards to insist on the careful gathering of microbiology data.

381

382 1. Given the current technology and the understanding that specific organisms  
383 dominate the CF lung microbiome, predominant organisms even when they  
384 represent “normal flora” should be identified.

385 2. It will also be useful to establish reference laboratories similar to the national  
386 *Burkholderia cepacia* reference laboratories where organisms such as *P.*  
387 *aeruginosa*, MRSA, *M. abscessus* and perhaps others can be genotyped to  
388 determine if specific clones which may be more virulent are emerging as a result of  
389 specific therapies.

390 3. Microbiome analysis should be considered once a firm interpretative standard  
391 is available which can be used to determine if a particular therapy is associated with  
392 adverse alteration of the CF microbiome.

393

394

395 Acknowledgement

396

397 This working group was supported by an unrestricted medical education grant (ME-  
398 2015-xxxx) from Vertex Pharmaceuticals Inc, Boston, MA., USA .

399

## 400 References (1-59)

- 401 1. Parkins MD, Floto RA. 2015. Emerging bacterial pathogens and changing  
402 concepts of bacterial pathogenesis in cystic fibrosis. *J Cyst Fibros* 14:293-  
403 304.
- 404 2. Blanchard AC, Horton E, Stanojevic S, Taylor L, Waters V, Ratjen F. 2017.  
405 Effectiveness of a stepwise *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* eradication protocol in  
406 children with cystic fibrosis. *J Cyst Fibros* 16:395-400.
- 407 3. Elborn JS. 2016. Cystic fibrosis. *Lancet* 388:2519-2531.
- 408 4. Heltshe SL, Mayer-Hamblett N, Burns JL, Khan U, Baines A, Ramsey BW,  
409 Rowe SM, Network GlotCFFTD. 2015. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in cystic  
410 fibrosis patients with G551D-CFTR treated with ivacaftor. *Clin Infect Dis*  
411 60:703-12.
- 412 5. Doring G, Flume P, Heijerman H, Elborn JS, Consensus Study G. 2012.  
413 Treatment of lung infection in patients with cystic fibrosis: current and future  
414 strategies. *J Cyst Fibros* 11:461-79.
- 415 6. Marvig RL, Sommer LM, Molin S, Johansen HK. 2015. Convergent evolution  
416 and adaptation of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* within patients with cystic  
417 fibrosis. *Nat Genet* 47:57-64.
- 418 7. Kidd TJ, Ramsay KA, Vidmar S, Carlin JB, Bell SC, Wainwright CE,  
419 Grimwood K, Investigators AS. 2015. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* genotypes  
420 acquired by children with cystic fibrosis by age 5-years. *J Cyst Fibros* 14:361-  
421 9.
- 422 8. Winstanley C, O'Brien S, Brockhurst MA. 2016. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*  
423 Evolutionary Adaptation and Diversification in Cystic Fibrosis Chronic Lung  
424 Infections. *Trends Microbiol* 24:327-337.



- 425 9. Mayer-Hamblett N, Kloster M, Rosenfeld M, Gibson RL, Retsch-Bogart GZ,  
426 Emerson J, Thompson V, Ramsey BW. 2015. Impact of Sustained Eradication  
427 of New *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* Infection on Long-term Outcomes in Cystic  
428 Fibrosis. *Clin Infect Dis* 61:707-15.
- 429 10. Ratjen F, Munck A, Kho P, Angyalosi G, Group ES. 2010. Treatment of early  
430 *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* infection in patients with cystic fibrosis: the ELITE  
431 trial. *Thorax* 65:286-91.
- 432 11. Vidya P, Smith L, Beaudoin T, Yau YC, Clark S, Coburn B, Guttman DS,  
433 Hwang DM, Waters V. 2016. Chronic infection phenotypes of *Pseudomonas*  
434 *aeruginosa* are associated with failure of eradication in children with cystic  
435 fibrosis. *Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis* 35:67-74.
- 436 12. Smyth AR, Bell SC, Bojcin S, Bryon M, Duff A, Flume P, Kashirskaya N,  
437 Munck A, Ratjen F, Schwarzenberg SJ, Sermet-Gaudelus I, Southern KW,  
438 Taccetti G, Ullrich G, Wolfe S, European Cystic Fibrosis S. 2014. European  
439 Cystic Fibrosis Society Standards of Care: Best Practice guidelines. *J Cyst*  
440 *Fibros* 13 Suppl 1:S23-42.
- 441 13. Salsgiver EL, Fink AK, Knapp EA, LiPuma JJ, Olivier KN, Marshall BC,  
442 Saiman L. 2016. Changing Epidemiology of the Respiratory Bacteriology of  
443 Patients With Cystic Fibrosis. *Chest* 149:390-400.
- 444 14. Ramsay KA, Sandhu H, Geake JB, Ballard E, O'Rourke P, Wainwright CE,  
445 Reid DW, Kidd TJ, Bell SC. 2017. The changing prevalence of pulmonary  
446 infection in adults with cystic fibrosis: A longitudinal analysis. *J Cyst Fibros*  
447 16:70-77.
- 448 15. Anonymous. 2016. UK Cystic Fibrosis Registry Annual Data Report UK Cystic  
449 Fibrosis Trust.

- 450 16. Rosenfeld M, Emerson J, McNamara S, Thompson V, Ramsey BW, Morgan  
451 W, Gibson RL, Group ES. 2012. Risk factors for age at initial *Pseudomonas*  
452 acquisition in the cystic fibrosis epic observational cohort. *J Cyst Fibros*  
453 11:446-53.
- 454 17. Mayer-Hamblett N, Rosenfeld M, Treggiari MM, Konstan MW, Retsch-Bogart  
455 G, Morgan W, Wagener J, Gibson RL, Khan U, Emerson J, Thompson V,  
456 Elkin EP, Ramsey BW, Epic, Investigators E. 2013. Standard care versus  
457 protocol based therapy for new onset *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in cystic  
458 fibrosis. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 48:943-53.
- 459 18. Muhlebach MS, Beckett V, Popowitch E, Miller MB, Baines A, Mayer-Hamblett  
460 N, Zemanick ET, Hoover WC, VanDalfsen JM, Campbell P, Goss CH, team  
461 ST-ts. 2017. Microbiological efficacy of early MRSA treatment in cystic fibrosis  
462 in a randomised controlled trial. *Thorax* 72:318-326.
- 463 19. Lipuma JJ. 2010. The changing microbial epidemiology in cystic fibrosis. *Clin*  
464 *Microbiol Rev* 23:299-323.
- 465 20. Gilligan PH. 2014. Infections in patients with cystic fibrosis: diagnostic  
466 microbiology update. *Clin Lab Med* 34:197-217.
- 467 21. Pressler T, Bohmova C, Conway S, Dumcius S, Hjelte L, Hoiby N, Kollberg H,  
468 Tummler B, Vavrova V. 2011. Chronic *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* infection  
469 definition: EuroCareCF Working Group report. *J Cyst Fibros* 10 Suppl 2:S75-  
470 8.
- 471 22. Daines C, VanDeVanter D, Khan U, Emerson J, Heltshe S, McNamara S,  
472 Anstead M, Langkamp M, Doring G, Ratjen F, Ramsey B, Gibson RL, Morgan  
473 W, Rosenfeld M, Investigators E. 2014. Serology as a diagnostic tool for

- 474 predicting initial *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* acquisition in children with cystic  
475 fibrosis. *J Cyst Fibros* 13:542-9.
- 476 23. Lee TW, Brownlee KG, Conway SP, Denton M, Littlewood JM. 2003.  
477 Evaluation of a new definition for chronic *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* infection  
478 in cystic fibrosis patients. *J Cyst Fibros* 2:29-34.
- 479 24. Blanchard AC, Rooney AM, Yau Y, Zhang Y, Stapleton PJ, Horton E, Klingel  
480 M, Stanojevic S, Ratjen F, Coburn B, Waters V. 2018. Early detection using  
481 qPCR of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* infection in children with cystic fibrosis  
482 undergoing eradication treatment. *J Cyst Fibros* doi:10.1016/j.jcf.2018.02.008.
- 483 25. Hery-Arnaud G, Nowak E, Caillon J, David V, Dirou A, Revert K, Munck MR,  
484 Frachon I, Haloun A, Horeau-Langlard D, Le Bihan J, Danner-Boucher I,  
485 Ramel S, Pelletier MP, Rosec S, Gouriou S, Poulhazan E, Payan C, Ferec C,  
486 Rault G, Le Gal G, Le Berre R. 2017. Evaluation of quantitative PCR for early  
487 diagnosis of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* infection in cystic fibrosis: a  
488 prospective cohort study. *Clin Microbiol Infect* 23:203-207.
- 489 26. Boutin S, Weitnauer M, Hassel S, Graeber SY, Stahl M, Dittrich AS, Mall MA,  
490 Dalpke AH. 2018. One time quantitative PCR detection of *Pseudomonas*  
491 *aeruginosa* to discriminate intermittent from chronic infection in cystic fibrosis.  
492 *J Cyst Fibros* 17:348-355.
- 493 27. Jonckheere L, Schelstraete P, Van Simaey L, Van Braeckel E, Willekens J,  
494 Van Daele S, De Baets F, Vanechoutte M. 2018. Establishing the diagnosis  
495 of chronic colonization with *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* of cystic fibrosis  
496 patients: Comparison of the European consensus criteria with genotyping of  
497 *P. aeruginosa* isolates. *J Cyst Fibros* doi:10.1016/j.jcf.2018.03.004.

- 498 28. Zemanick ET, Emerson J, Thompson V, McNamara S, Morgan W, Gibson RL,  
499 Rosenfeld M, Group ES. 2015. Clinical outcomes after initial pseudomonas  
500 acquisition in cystic fibrosis. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 50:42-8.
- 501 29. Fischer N, Hentschel J, Markert UR, Keller PM, Pletz MW, Mainz JG. 2014.  
502 Non-invasive assessment of upper and lower airway infection and  
503 inflammation in CF patients. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 49:1065-75.
- 504 30. Kidd TJ, Grimwood K, Ramsay KA, Rainey PB, Bell SC. 2011. Comparison of  
505 three molecular techniques for typing *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* isolates in  
506 sputum samples from patients with cystic fibrosis. *J Clin Microbiol* 49:263-8.
- 507 31. Fothergill JL, White J, Foweraker JE, Walshaw MJ, Ledson MJ,  
508 Mahenthiralingam E, Winstanley C. 2010. Impact of *Pseudomonas*  
509 *aeruginosa* genomic instability on the application of typing methods for  
510 chronic cystic fibrosis infections. *J Clin Microbiol* 48:2053-9.
- 511 32. Tenover FC, Arbeit RD, Goering RV, Mickelsen PA, Murray BE, Persing DH,  
512 Swaminathan B. 1995. Interpreting chromosomal DNA restriction patterns  
513 produced by pulsed-field gel electrophoresis: criteria for bacterial strain typing.  
514 *J Clin Microbiol* 33:2233-9.
- 515 33. Goering RV. 2010. Pulsed field gel electrophoresis: a review of application  
516 and interpretation in the molecular epidemiology of infectious disease. *Infect*  
517 *Genet Evol* 10:866-75.
- 518 34. Salipante SJ, SenGupta DJ, Cummings LA, Land TA, Hoogestraat DR,  
519 Cookson BT. 2015. Application of whole-genome sequencing for bacterial  
520 strain typing in molecular epidemiology. *J Clin Microbiol* 53:1072-9.

- 521 35. Funk S, Bogich TL, Jones KE, Kilpatrick AM, Daszak P. 2013. Quantifying  
522 trends in disease impact to produce a consistent and reproducible definition of  
523 an emerging infectious disease. *PLoS One* 8:e69951.
- 524 36. Anonymous. 1992. *In* Lederberg J, Shope RE, Oaks SC, Jr. (ed), *Emerging*  
525 *Infections: Microbial Threats to Health in the United States*  
526 doi:10.17226/2008, Washington (DC).
- 527 37. Lloyd-Smith JO, Funk S, McLean AR, Riley S, Wood JL. 2015. Nine  
528 challenges in modelling the emergence of novel pathogens. *Epidemics* 10:35-  
529 9.
- 530 38. Martina P, Leguizamón M, Prieto CI, Sousa SA, Montanaro P, Draghi WO,  
531 Stammler M, Bettiol M, de Carvalho C, Palau J, Figoli C, Alvarez F, Benetti S,  
532 Lejona S, Vescina C, Ferreras J, Lasch P, Lagares A, Zorreguieta A, Leitao  
533 JH, Yantorno OM, Bosch A. 2018. *Burkholderia paraquae* sp. nov., a novel  
534 species of the *Burkholderia cepacia* complex isolated from hospital settings  
535 and agricultural soils. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 68:14-20.
- 536 39. Holmes A, Nolan R, Taylor R, Finley R, Riley M, Jiang RZ, Steinbach S,  
537 Goldstein R. 1999. An epidemic of *Burkholderia cepacia* transmitted between  
538 patients with and without cystic fibrosis. *J Infect Dis* 179:1197-205.
- 539 40. Waters V, Yau Y, Prasad S, Lu A, Atenafu E, Crandall I, Tom S, Tullis E,  
540 Ratjen F. 2011. *Stenotrophomonas maltophilia* in cystic fibrosis: serologic  
541 response and effect on lung disease. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 183:635-40.
- 542 41. Waters V, Atenafu EG, Lu A, Yau Y, Tullis E, Ratjen F. 2013. Chronic  
543 *Stenotrophomonas maltophilia* infection and mortality or lung transplantation  
544 in cystic fibrosis patients. *J Cyst Fibros* 12:482-6.

- 545 42. Dalboge CS, Hansen CR, Pressler T, Hoiby N, Johansen HK. 2011. Chronic  
546 pulmonary infection with *Stenotrophomonas maltophilia* and lung function in  
547 patients with cystic fibrosis. *J Cyst Fibros* 10:318-25.
- 548 43. Goss CH, Mayer-Hamblett N, Aitken ML, Rubenfeld GD, Ramsey BW. 2004.  
549 Association between *Stenotrophomonas maltophilia* and lung function in  
550 cystic fibrosis. *Thorax* 59:955-9.
- 551 44. Dasenbrook EC, Checkley W, Merlo CA, Konstan MW, Lechtzin N, Boyle MP.  
552 2010. Association between respiratory tract methicillin-resistant  
553 *Staphylococcus aureus* and survival in cystic fibrosis. *JAMA* 303:2386-92.
- 554 45. Bell SC, Flume PA. 2017. Treatment decisions for MRSA in patients with  
555 cystic fibrosis (CF): when is enough, enough? *Thorax* 72:297-299.
- 556 46. Kilby JM, Gilligan PH, Yankaskas JR, Highsmith WE, Jr., Edwards LJ,  
557 Knowles MR. 1992. Nontuberculous mycobacteria in adult patients with cystic  
558 fibrosis. *Chest* 102:70-5.
- 559 47. Adjemian J, Olivier KN, Prevots DR. 2014. Nontuberculous mycobacteria  
560 among patients with cystic fibrosis in the United States: screening practices  
561 and environmental risk. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 190:581-6.
- 562 48. Ringshausen FC, Wagner D, de Roux A, Diel R, Hohmann D, Hickstein L,  
563 Welte T, Rademacher J. 2016. Prevalence of Nontuberculous Mycobacterial  
564 Pulmonary Disease, Germany, 2009-2014. *Emerg Infect Dis* 22:1102-5.
- 565 49. Bar-On O, Mussaffi H, Mei-Zahav M, Prais D, Steuer G, Stafler P, Hananya S,  
566 Blau H. 2015. Increasing nontuberculous mycobacteria infection in cystic  
567 fibrosis. *J Cyst Fibros* 14:53-62.

- 568 50. Esther CR, Jr., Esserman DA, Gilligan P, Kerr A, Noone PG. 2010. Chronic  
569 Mycobacterium abscessus infection and lung function decline in cystic  
570 fibrosis. *J Cyst Fibros* 9:117-23.
- 571 51. Qvist T, Taylor-Robinson D, Waldmann E, Olesen HV, Hansen CR,  
572 Mathiesen IH, Hoiby N, Katzenstein TL, Smyth RL, Diggle PJ, Pressler T.  
573 2016. Comparing the harmful effects of nontuberculous mycobacteria and  
574 Gram negative bacteria on lung function in patients with cystic fibrosis. *J Cyst*  
575 *Fibros* 15:380-5.
- 576 52. Bryant JM, Grogono DM, Rodriguez-Rincon D, Everall I, Brown KP, Moreno  
577 P, Verma D, Hill E, Drijkoningen J, Gilligan P, Esther CR, Noone PG,  
578 Giddings O, Bell SC, Thomson R, Wainwright CE, Coulter C, Pandey S,  
579 Wood ME, Stockwell RE, Ramsay KA, Sherrard LJ, Kidd TJ, Jabbour N,  
580 Johnson GR, Knibbs LD, Morawska L, Sly PD, Jones A, Bilton D, Laurenson  
581 I, Ruddy M, Bourke S, Bowler IC, Chapman SJ, Clayton A, Cullen M, Daniels  
582 T, Dempsey O, Denton M, Desai M, Drew RJ, Edenborough F, Evans J, Folb  
583 J, Humphrey H, Isalska B, Jensen-Fangel S, Jonsson B, Jones AM, et al.  
584 2016. Emergence and spread of a human-transmissible multidrug-resistant  
585 nontuberculous mycobacterium. *Science* 354:751-757.
- 586 53. Fodor AA, Klem ER, Gilpin DF, Elborn JS, Boucher RC, Tunney MM,  
587 Wolfgang MC. 2012. The adult cystic fibrosis airway microbiota is stable over  
588 time and infection type, and highly resilient to antibiotic treatment of  
589 exacerbations. *PLoS One* 7:e45001.
- 590 54. Mahboubi MA, Carmody LA, Foster BK, Kalikin LM, VanDevanter DR, LiPuma  
591 JJ. 2016. Culture-Based and Culture-Independent Bacteriologic Analysis of  
592 Cystic Fibrosis Respiratory Specimens. *J Clin Microbiol* 54:613-9.

- 593 55. Flight WG, Smith A, Paisey C, Marchesi JR, Bull MJ, Norville PJ, Mutton KJ,  
594 Webb AK, Bright-Thomas RJ, Jones AM, Mahenthiralingam E. 2015. Rapid  
595 Detection of Emerging Pathogens and Loss of Microbial Diversity Associated  
596 with Severe Lung Disease in Cystic Fibrosis. *J Clin Microbiol* 53:2022-9.
- 597 56. Stokell JR, Gharaibeh RZ, Hamp TJ, Zapata MJ, Fodor AA, Steck TR. 2015.  
598 Analysis of changes in diversity and abundance of the microbial community in  
599 a cystic fibrosis patient over a multiyear period. *J Clin Microbiol* 53:237-47.
- 600 57. Zhao J, Schloss PD, Kalikin LM, Carmody LA, Foster BK, Petrosino JF,  
601 Cavalcoli JD, VanDevanter DR, Murray S, Li JZ, Young VB, LiPuma JJ. 2012.  
602 Decade-long bacterial community dynamics in cystic fibrosis airways. *Proc*  
603 *Natl Acad Sci U S A* 109:5809-14.
- 604 58. Gilligan PH K, DL, Appelbaum MD (ed). 2006. *Cumitech 43: Cystic Fibrosis*  
605 *Microbiology*. ASM Press,
- 606 59. Trust UCF (ed). 2010. *Laboratory standards for processing microbiological*  
607 *samples from people with cystic fibrosis*.
- 608