Strategies for Sustainable Food Programs in Ethiopia: Creating a Space for Sustainable Food Systems

by
Bethlehem Sahlu

Supervised by
Ellie Perkins

A Major Paper submitted to the Faculty of Environmental Studies
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree
of Master in Environmental Studies,
York University, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

31 July 2017

Table of Contents:

Acknowledgements ____ 1
Foreword ____ 2
Abstract ____ 4

Introduction ____ 5
Background of the research problem ____ 8
Research questions, goals, and objectives ____ 9
Methods of inquiry ____ 10

Part 1: Globalization and food sustainability in developing countries ____ 12
Food sustainability issues in Ethiopia ____ 14
Food insecurity in Addis Ababa ____ 15
Urban agriculture in Addis Ababa ____ 17

Part 2: Theoretical framework ____ 21
The influence of NGOs in developing countries ____ 21
Land ownership and accessibility ____ 24

Part 3: IFA school garden and nutrition program ____ 27
Background and history ____ 27
Program goals and objectives ____ 29
Volunteerism and operational challenges ____ 35
Discussion ____ 36

Part 4: Themes from the research ____ 37
Research impact, learning around capacity building,
and identifying opportunities ____ 37
Strategies for incorporating Environmental and Sustainability Education ____ 39
Government regulations of NGO activities ____ 43

Part 5: Conclusion ____ 47

References ____ 50

Appendices ____ 54

Notes ____ 55

Acknowledgments

I dedicate this work to my parents, my father Sahlu Areru and my late mother Tiruwork Tefferi: because I owe it all to you. Many Thanks!

There are a number of key people I would like to thank for the keen support they have provided me in my time in the MES program. I would like to thank my supervisor Ellie Perkins, and my advisor Ray Rogers, for their guidance and unwavering support.

A loving thank you to my family: My children, Mikyas Tessema, Kidus Tessema, Elama Tessema, and my spouse, Tessema Demmissie, for their unceasing encouragement, support and attention. They kept me going, and this paper would not have been possible without them.

My family back home in Ethiopia, my brothers and sisters, particularly Daniel Sahlu, for supporting me emotionally throughout writing this paper and my life in general. Your support is greatly appreciated.

I am also thankful to all my teachers, staff and fellow students at the Faculty of Environmental Studies (FES), for making this journey a memorable one. I am forever grateful for your support and compassion you have given me throughout the years.

Last but not least, I would like to express my sincere thanks to the International Fund for Africa (IFA) and the individuals who participated in the research: thank you for your openness and willingness to answer my questions and share your stories.

Foreword

My graduate studies at York University's Environmental Studies program has deepened my understanding and prompted a new look at my interaction with others and the environment. I came into the Masters in Environmental Studies program with a bachelor's degree in environmental politics and years of experience in sustainable food production, community organizing, green interior designing and environmental education. In joining the MES program, I feel fortunate to have advanced my studies in an interdisciplinary framework—one that allowed me to think out of the box and nurture my imagination. This program has helped me become a passionate environmental steward, eager to make a difference in areas where my input may be needed the most.

My Plan of Study (POS) focuses on food insecurity issues in the urban area of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, organised with three components: sustainable food production in urban agriculture; food security; and environmental education in Addis Ababa. I approached my POS using the framework of building food-sustained communities. My Major Research Paper (MRP) outlines workable strategies needed to address some of the impacts that the Components in my POS cover. My Learning Objectives were met through teachings from courses, especially in Community Organizing and Development, Popular Education and Environmental and Sustainability Education (ESE). Together, the MRP covers the history and background of NGO development practices and their relationship with urban communities for food sustainability and environmental education in Addis Ababa.

This research guided me to better understand the issues behind persisting food insecurity and foreign aid dependency in Ethiopia, and in developing countries more generally. Considering the current aid restructuring by the United States to significantly reduce aid to developing nations, I feel there is an urgency for developing nations to critically organise themselves to become less dependent on foreign aid and take ownership of their issues —now more than ever before.

As Dr. Maya Angelou once said, "when you know better you do better" (GoodReads 2017) With this epithet, I highlight environmental and sustainability education (ESE) as my main focus as it pertains to ultimately help create basic

environmental education that involves an understanding of the conceptions related to environmental issues. Using food as a tool for social change can yield empowered and healthy communities, sustainable growth, integration of cultural and indigenous practices, increase of local, diverse food production, as well as reduced dependence on foreign aid.

The forms and depth of pedagogies offered in the MES program far exceeded my expectations. My background as an Ethiopian American informs who I am and how I engage in the world. This program helped me unpack my identity and guided me to form the three components specific to my research experience. These components together explore community development as a multifaceted area of study and form of practice with significant potential force for social change. Community development is practiced to alleviate social, economical and environmental problems affecting society at large. To win the struggle for social change in the developing world is not easy. However, I recognised that when communities are organized to take control of their own development, they often take ownership of the process and the outcome is a concerted effort to create sustainability for all. I also have learned that grassroots urban agriculture has become increasingly popular around the world, often as a response to resist the neoliberal, hegemonic large-scale corporate agricultural practices.

Addressing development issues through ESE alone can be challenging. However, incorporating critical food and place pedagogies together with Paulo Freire's critical pedagogies can allow communities to organize and transform oppressive structures for greater equity through action and reflection, with the intention to co-create an equitable world by those who have been marginalized.

This paper contributes to the current discourses around sustainable food production and ESE. I use past experiences as a base to broaden an understanding of what food security looks like in foreign funded NGO based operations, and ask how these operations can be challenged or encouraged to foster a critical outlook on the aid industry. This research fits within my broader interest in a just global humanitarian/developmental system towards food and aid sovereign communities across Ethiopia and around the world.

Abstract

Food security is the ability to obtain consistent access to food needed for a healthy life. Access to food deeply affects the standard of living for countries, households, and individuals, and needs to be viewed as an important element of the geographical, economic, and political landscape of both the developed and the developing world. In Ethiopia, Addis Ababa represents an urban environment where issues of food security and sovereignty often surface in the debates around social development and urban renewal. While examining the case study of food security, this paper suggests that Environmental and Sustainability Education (ESE) represents a powerful tool to understand, and overcome food insecurity. However, will the current discourse around sustainable food and ESE recognise the power of organising communities to take control of their own development and take ownership of the process in a concerted effort to create a sustainable food system for all?

This paper explores issues behind persisting food insecurity and foreign aid dependency in Ethiopia, and in the developing countries at large. It begins by examining the links between poverty and food insecurity in today's globalized world, in the local context of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. It then discusses the state of sustainable development and environmental education, community engagement and issues of power and social justice. The analysis focuses on the activities of one non-governmental organization (NGO) as a case study, namely the International Fund for Africa's (IFA) Sustainable School Health and Nutrition program, and its plant-based school feeding program. It highlights the IFA's efforts to strengthen a community's ability to overcome poverty and achieve food security through its capacity building trainings. The paper demonstrates how community development and sustainable food production are practiced in urban agriculture, and where ESE fits into this process. It concludes with reflections on what can be done when trusting and lasting relationships are built, especially with local leadership in the NGO.

Introduction

> In the great African souls, community and selfhood through collective belonging is a powerful force, which feeds the imagination and motivates a profound communal responsiveness (Lessem, as cited in Nussbaum, 2003, p. 8).

Despite the current booming economic growth in Ethiopia in recent years, the country has seen an increase of foreign aid and a heavy presence of non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The Ethiopian government, like many other developing nations, has embraced neoliberal policies by offering low royalty rates and lenient regulatory regimes in its efforts to draw investment to the region, as well as to ensure the availability of external assistance (Haque, 1999). Historically, countries geographically located in the Horn of Africa have had to endure drought, famine, wars and long-term poverty. Ethiopia suffered major droughts during the period from the 1950s to the 1980s, which were often accompanied by political turmoil and/or environmental irregularities (Alcántara-Ayala, 2002).

As the world watched the heart-wrenching images of hungry children in Ethiopia, more and more countries from the West became engaged to raise money to help drought-stricken areas. For example, the mid-80s famine prompted the Irish singer-songwriter and political activist Bob Geldof to organize the 1985 Live Aid concert, which raised millions of dollars for famine relief. Subsequently, the famine triggered an influx of NGOs and donors into Ethiopia (Harrison, 2002). There is no doubt that Ethiopia has greatly benefited from this aid and the presence of NGOs. Their generosity has saved many lives and helped communities get back on their feet. However, despite the efforts of many NGOs and development experts to alleviate food scarcity, food insecurity remains prevalent. As a consequence, Ethiopia remains one of the most food-insecure countries in the world, with nearly half of its population considered under-nourished (Siyoum et al., 2012).

It is evident that prolonged handouts create dependency that adversely affects the ability of communities to address the root causes of social issues and food scarcity by themselves. Experts often state that dependence on external

funding and expertise impedes cohesiveness and affects the general health and well being of the community, and encourages people not to access their own local/indigenous knowledge for gaining sustainable livelihoods (e.g., Escobar, 2011; Lewis & Opoku-Mensah, 2006; Mathie & Cunningham, 2008). Academics, grassroots community organizers, food activists, and communities who have experienced the downward effect of abrupt termination of NGO funded projects, frequently state that Environmental and Sustainability Education (ESE) and better policies to govern NGOs can help address some of these issues. However, this raises questions around the purpose, praxis, and impacts of ESE, and its role in social change. Can ESE programs teach a critical perspective on the neoliberal ideology-influenced aid and humanitarian system? Or do they reinforce dominant paradigms of development while teaching only to certain groups particular aspects of food security and environmental protection?

The last few decades have witnessed a worldwide increase in the emphasis on home/community gardens, showing the importance of their actual and potential value in establishing of food security. In Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, according to Kebede (2011), "the cultivation of crops within or outside the immediate edge of the city is a common practice in most cities and towns" and in recent years, school and home gardens have become the new addition to urban food production. Traditionally, urban agriculture has been an indigenous practice, until the arrival of NGOs in the early '70s, a majority of whom imposed top-down technocratic approaches and overlooked the already-existing sustainable and equitable practices in place. This likely led to frustration amongst community members who increasingly felt a loss of ownership in these programs. As Harrison (2002) suggests, "In a true participation, local actors should progressively take the lead, while external partners back their efforts to assume greater responsibility for their own development" (p. 590). Further, The Food and Nutrition Technical Assistant (FANTA) stated in their review of the USAID School and Community Garden Program that, in Ethiopia, community based food production run by foreign aid actors must focus on locally appropriate, small-scale, agricultural techniques that are best suited to meet urban challenges (Jensen, 2013). Locally appropriate programs that build on existing knowledge and agricultural practices, and that empower communities to take on leadership roles could potentially move Ethiopia towards the 2025

Development Goals set by the United Nations (UN, 2015).

The work of USAID is well known in international circles as a major provider of food aid in Africa. But the experience they have had in some projects demonstrates what could happen when a major aid agency loses their funding, and community members are left floundering without aid and technical support. Experts tell us that the sudden termination of foreign-funded projects intensifies the impacts of famine and creates social breakdown, economic deprivation and health crises. These consequences are experienced by communities, and will require workable strategies to reverse the impacts, exacerbated by the dramatic increase in population.

This paper explores NGOs' influence in sustainable development and environmental education in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, while investigating the links between poverty and food insecurity in today's globalized world. It then focuses on a case study of the International Fund for Africa's (IFA) Sustainable School Health and Nutrition program, whose mission is to alleviate social difficulties through capacity building and women-centered empowerment projects rolled out in partnership with donors and the government (IFA interview, May 2017). My research methods consisted of interviews with IFA food related project leaders in Addis Ababa, followed by site visits, conversations with research subjects, for example, farmers, community leaders, and NGO workers, and literature reviews. My research findings suggest that IFA's projects are well coordinated and well received by the communities, demonstrating what can be done when trusting and lasting relationships are built, especially with *local* leadership in the NGO.

According to the Ethiopian Panel on Climate Change (EPCC), the Ethiopian population is projected to reach close to 200 million by 2050 (EPCC, 2015). Population pressure is significant in Ethiopia; according to the World Factbook of the Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), "as of July 2016, the Ethiopian total population was listed at 102.3 million and the capital city Addis Ababa at 3.2 million" (People and Society, 2016).

From my observations, the country is blessed with surplus labour and an abundance of fertile land and resources. The key to successful sustainable development in the urban areas of Ethiopia requires a critical questioning of the current model of organising communities for change. Systemic change and building partnerships with all stakeholders in development will help people examine economic, environmental, social and cultural structures in the context of sustainable development. In the conclusion, the paper offers recommendations for supporting Paulo Friere's critical pedagogy and explores the potential of incorporating best community development practices from around the world for social change, including sustainable food production methods like permaculture, together with successful practices of NGOs such as the International Fund for Africa (IFA).

Background of the research problem

This research project began with an interest in community based food production and NGOs' relations to bring about food sustainability in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. When I began my journey in this research, I wanted to know more about the influence of NGOs in community development to food sustainability and environmental education in Addis Ababa. In this journey, I explored food and environmental education, community engagement and issues of power and social justice. I also found a lack of literature on community development and food production in the urban area of Addis Ababa. Given the severity of poverty and food insecurity in the country, the absence of literature on community based food studies—and specifically the lack of studies carried out by native scholars—was quite a shock to me. However, in the area of the larger framework of environmental, agricultural and social issues, I found that Assessment reports, prepared by the Ethiopian Panel on Climate Change (EPCC) and organized by the Ethiopian Academy of Science, to be very informative. EPCC was established under the auspices of the Ethiopian Academy of Science (EAS), primarily to produce periodic assessments of climate change issues in Ethiopia and is a sub-project of the Environment Service and Climate Change Analyses Program (ESACCCAP), jointly run by the Ethiopian Academy of Sciences, the Climate Science Centre (CSC) and the Horn of Africa

Regional Environment Centre and Network (HoA-REC&N) of Addis Ababa University (EPCC, 2015). EPCC produces independent reports on climate change, with the objective of being recognized and incorporated in the report of the Intergovernmental Panel for Climate Change (IPCC). While on field research in Addis Ababa, I was fortunate to attend the International Panel for Climate Change (IPCC's) annual meeting as an observer at the Economic Commission For Africa (ECA), Addis Ababa, and witness the dynamic presentations and panel discussions on IPCC's Annual Report 2017. At this meeting, the first EPCC assessment report was presented by Dr. Bely Lemane, one of the co-authors of the First Assessment Report, titled "Agriculture and food security." The Report speaks to the main questions of my research and supports the broader theme of my topic for developing strategies and crafting new space for sustainable food systems. The report also proved a valuable resource in identifying key experts in the area.

Research questions, goals, and objectives

My goal in this study was to critically engage with one or more NGOs in Addis Ababa and analyze how they realize their stated objectives regarding food security and self-sufficiency in local communities. My choice of working with NGOs arose out of a curiosity from my observations of their presence and working in the country. Ethiopia has not shared a colonial past as some of its neighbours have. Therefore, seeing the substantial presence of foreigners working for NGOs such us Care, MSF, World Vision, Save the Children, who seemingly lived a life of opulence, while claiming to represent an "aid" agency made me want to know more about their organisational agenda and ethical outlook. It was not until I moved to the West that I learnt what they represent and what they stood for. Beside their plausible humanitarian and developmental work, I found out that NGOs sometimes also have a questionable side that needed further critical research. These observations and insights led me to further explore critical questions: Why and how, after all these years of aid, is Ethiopia still listed as one of the poorest countries in the world? And what is getting in the way of local communities to organise themselves in becoming

food secure? To find an answer, I chose to focus on the operations of the International Fund for Africa (IFA), an NGO run by Ethio-Americans with its head office in Huston, Texas. My intention was to seek an understanding about their vegan-based school food program, and their position in urban agriculture in Addis Ababa. Therefore, the methods of my field research was to pay visits to the International Fund for Africa (IFA) food-related project sites to gather information and build relationships with stakeholders for analysis on my return to Canada. The specific questions guiding my research inquiry were: How do IFA projects illuminate reasons why food insecurity persists after all the years of aid agency involvement in Addis Ababa? How are community development and sustainable food production practiced in urban agriculture? And where does environmental education fit into this process?

Methods of inquiry

I conducted fieldwork in Addis Ababa to explore the approach of local and international NGOs to food sustainability. My methodology included a mixed methods approach, which aimed to integrate various types of inquiry, including interviews with individuals and groups within the research subject organization (International Fund for Africa (IFA)). I followed Elwood's approach to engage in literature and discourse analysis in order to bring greater validity to my inferences, and to underline or supplement areas where there may have been variations or doubts in data collection and interpretation (Elwood, 2010, pp. 94-114).

The data analysis followed the guidelines outlined by Richard Sagor. First, I identified themes, issues, or factors that emerged from the data. These are generally of two types: (a) items that come up repeatedly or (b) idiosyncratic items that seem particularly noteworthy (Sagor, 1992). Identifying the apparent themes followed the intuitive practice most common with human observations, which is to get an overview of the phenomenon (Sagor, 2000). I uncovered issues that presented themselves to determine if they were unique to the westernized NGO model or if they belonged to those of an indigenous one. I

also examined whether the issues were specific to certain regions in Ethiopia or the entire country.

During the analysis, I provided interim reports to the subject NGO. On completion of my project, I intend to have a formal meeting with the stakeholders to present the story told by these data and discuss why it played itself out a particular way. Mixed methods with collaborative action research helped draw conclusions as to what actions are required for advancing the key areas in a sequential manner.

I came to this research with an understanding of famine and food scarcity. As a young girl growing up in Ethiopia in the 1980s, I vividly remember the horrific reality the country had to endure. These and other life experiences guided me to academically advance in environmental education and to consider pursuing a career in the humanitarian sector using Environmental and Sustainability Education as a component of possible solutions to problems of food insecurity. My research was focussed on the basis of IFA's effort to strengthening a community's ability to overcome poverty and achieve food security.

Part 1: Globalization and food sustainability in developing countries

> Development is a perception which models reality, a myth which comforts societies and a fantasy which unleashes passions (Sachs, 1997).
>
> A new perception of the earth as a single biosphere has eliminated the perception of developing countries' shortages of food and resources as a local or national problem (Miller, 1995).

The phenomenon of globalization is having a major impact on food systems around the world. Although access to food is by no means universal, food systems are changing, resulting in greater availability and diversity of food. Globalization is a process of interaction and integration among people, companies and governments of different nations, a process driven by international trade and investment and guided by information technology. This process has effects on the environment, cultures, political systems, economic development and prosperity, and on human physical well-being around the world. For instance, corporate globalization has influenced and affected the ideas and realities of food security and access by enabling capital to flow with less restriction over borders around the world by allowing corporations to expand into multi-national and trans-national entities. As a result, in recent years, in Ethiopia and other developing nations, the once subsistence-based economy has changed into an export-based one.

Currently under the Large Scale Foreign Investment Program, Ethiopian farmers are producing more food for export than for their country's own consumption, including crops to be used for biofuel and animal feed. Godfray et al. (2010) observe "The current diversion of food into the production of biofuels puts further pressure on food supplies" (p. 818). In addition, as a result of globalization, farmers are pressured to sacrifice the long-term sustainability of their crops for higher productivity and often opt to use modern industrial agricultural techniques. Higher productivity is often associated with increased and heavy use of fossil fuels, synthetic fertilizers, and harsh pesticides. While polluting the environment, synthetic fertilizers are also highly dependent on the

use of fossil fuels. Further, commonly used pesticides kill many non-target organisms living in commensal symbiotic relationships with crops.

Although also a rural problem, food insecurity and limited food access are most deeply manifested in urban areas, in both the developing and developed world. In this context, the processes of globalization have complicated the goals of world food security and have encouraged environmental destruction. Resource depletion, pollution and heavy commercial energy consumption are often tied to economic growth. The global economy, based on infinite growth of international trade is heavily dependent on recourse consumption (Kennedy et al., 2004.) This adversely affects rural populations, forcing people to migrate to urban areas. Globalization, therefore, encourages urban migration.

Urban migration suggests various things: the arrival of industrialization, food insecurity in rural areas, the search for refuge from conflicts and environmental destruction, and the search for jobs. According to EPCC, Ethiopia is becoming one of the most rapidly urbanized countries in the region. Studies show that in sub-Saharan Africa, much of the rapid growth in the urban population reflects a combination of flight from rural poverty, and high fertility rates in urban areas, due to access to maternal and infant care (Dubbeling, et al 2016). This stands in contrast to other parts of the world, for example in Latin America, where urban growth has been driven more by the pull of industrialization and economic opportunity (Godfray et al 2010).

Food security in both the developing and the developed world remains an important socio-economic indicator of quality of life, showing the ability of people, households, and countries to access and use a very important human right: food. Lang sees the goal of food security "in danger of being rendered meaningless by the economic forces of globalization and by the belief that all human needs are best met by market mechanisms" (as cited in Williams, 2001). The pressure on developing countries to enter the global market increases food insecurity at the local level. Even if food is available locally, it is often unaffordable and in many cases found to be culturally inappropriate and nutritionally inadequate to local residents.

> Sub-Saharan Africa's problem not only illustrates the multifaceted nature of food security, but also suggests that different dimensions require different approaches to successfully improve food security. For instance, making even more carbohydrates available is unlikely to further improve overall food security. Rather, new measures should focus on the ability of poor people to access balanced diets and on overall living conditions, to prevent negative health outcomes such as underweight, wasting and stunting in children (FAO, IFAD & WFP, 2015)

Globalization encourages the continuation of population and consumption growth, which according to Godfray et al. (2010), will increase for at least another 40 years. In a global context, "Growing competition for land, water, and energy, including the overexploitation of fisheries, will affect our ability to produce food, as will the urgent requirement to reduce the impact of the food system on the environment" (Godfray et al., 2010, p. 812). In this globalized world, to ensure sustainable and equitable food security for all, and to reduce the further threat of effects of climate change, a multifaceted and linked global strategy will be needed so the world can produce more food and can ensure that it is used more efficiently and equitably.

Food sustainability issues in Ethiopia

Global food insecurity is becoming a pervasive issue that needs to be addressed. In general, Sub-Saharan Africa is known for its debilitating poverty, low level of social and economic development and agricultural productivity, including a lack of adequate infrastructure that promotes overall change in development. Ethiopia, as one of the countries in the region, shares these broad issues and faces a significant food gap due to various reasons. Intensive cultivation, overgrazing, deforestation, soil erosion and water scarcity are some of the main factors that often interact with one another resulting in reinforcing the cycle of poverty, food insecurity and environmental degradation. This problem manifests itself in recurrent drought and famine affecting millions of people, particularly in the Ethiopian highlands. According to the Ministry of

Finance and Economic Development, agriculture is the most important sector in Ethiopia. It contributes 43% to the overall GDP, 90% of export earnings, employs 85% of the population and supplies 70% of the country's raw materials (MOFED, 2017). Smallholder farming dominates more than 90% of the total agricultural sector output and cultivates close to 95% of total cropped land, the rest being contributed by the livestock subsector (MOFED, 2009/10).

According to Dejene (2003), "the pressure of intense human activity and controlled land management practices poses serious threats to food sustainability, natural resources and maintaining ecological balance" (p.4). The current agricultural practices approach in Ethiopia puts heavy emphasis on accelerating production, using fertilizers and improved seed, without careful analysis of agro-ecological zones, markets, infrastructure, farmer's choice and other sustainable development options. This, coupled with the current land grab that is taking place in Africa (Lavers, 2012, p. 803), could result in mass displacement of peasants in the entire region, possibly leading to forced migration into urban areas, and putting pressure on the existing food shortages in urban areas.

Food insecurity in Addis Ababa

The city of Addis Ababa, with a population of 3.2 million, hosts inhabitants from diverse ethnic backgrounds and engaged in a range of economic activities. The majority of Addis Ababa's inhabitants are considered poor. They either live in sub-standard dwellings or slums, which lack basic amenities. The most important urban issues are unemployment/underemployment, migration from rural areas, including from neighboring countries such as Somalia, Sudan and Eritrea, and chronic food insecurity. These factors, coupled with issues of governance and environmental degradation, have created a complex set of interrelated factors, of which food insecurity is crucial. Addressing food insecurity through community based food production, therefore, should be considered a critical intervention.

Addis Ababa is also home to affluent communities. The changing food systems

brought about by the forces of globalization and characterized by increasing urbanization have lead to new challenges and opportunities. For instance, the well-to-do groups of urban dwellers are driven into the workforce by the overriding need for an increase in income to pay for food, shelter, clothing and other household expenses. With growing numbers of family members entering the workforce, working hours and commuting times are often long, leaving less time available to prepare food. According to Kennedy et al. (2004), due to "demands on time, increased exposure to advertising, availability of new foods and emergence of new food retail outlets," there is a greater desire and necessity to consume meals outside the home. This trend has shown that local culture and food traditions are disappearing, opening doors to what Regev et al. (2012) call "Nutrition Transition," which is "[a] descriptive term for shifts in dietary patterns, usually at the community or population level. It can be visualized as a shift from periods of famine, to those of receding famine, to those of nutrition-related chronic diseases of lifestyle resulting from increased affluence" (Regev et al., (2012).

This phenomenon brings about a gradual shift in food culture towards a more universal one, with subsequent changes in dietary consumption patterns and nutritional status that vary with the socio-economic strata, in turn leading to a changing relationship to food, and consumer deskilling. A diet comprised mainly of processed foods high in salt, fat, and sugar, is not only threatening the well being of these communities but also the existence of the local food markets supplied by urban farmers. Traditionally, small-diversified family owned and operated farms supplied food to their particular locality. Kitchen and community gardens were also the main source of fresh, culturally appropriate food. The current trend of accessing food does little taking into consideration indignity. As discussed by (Roberts, 2013) food relationships have been redefined as bringing together possessors and consumers rather than farmers and eaters, resulting in "a depersonalized food system." I believe that early intervention in consumer and citizen education about the negative effects of "industrial food" could prevent future health and environmental catastrophes in any developing nation, especially in Ethiopia, where the health care system is weak or practically non-existent in some areas of the country.

Urban agriculture in Addis Ababa

Urban agriculture may be defined as the production of crop and livestock goods within cities and towns and a major source of fresh food supply to urban residents. Hence, if given enough emphasis, urban agriculture may have a role to play in addressing urban food insecurity problems, which are bound to become increasingly important with the secular trend towards the urbanization of poverty and of population in developing regions (Zezza & Tasciotti, 2010, p. 1). The history of urban agriculture in Africa dates to the colonial era where farming flourished in urban areas, mainly to satisfy the needs of settlers and other elites. As mentioned before, Ethiopia was never colonized by a European power, but was occupied by Italians for a brief amount of time (five years). However, the state of urban agriculture in Addis Ababa in that era is not clear. In developing countries, households that engage in agriculture have some degree of market orientation, but more so in Latin America than in Africa (Maxwell, 1999).

There are long traditions of intense urban farming within and at the edge of the city of Addis Ababa, making production of fresh foods such as vegetables, fruits and certain animal products (eggs, milk), particularly suitable in areas located close to consumers, and minimizing the need for refrigerated transport and storage. As Kebede (n.d.) puts it, urban farming has been a major part of the urban division from the beginning of the city's development as the capital of Ethiopia. Traditionally, many of the city's early residents cultivated crops, raised chickens, and kept dairy animals in their homes. Well-to-do households raised cows for milk for domestic consumption. In Addis Ababa, less visible but present in large numbers, are gardens in which vegetable and medicinal plants are grown by city farmers. Urban farming has been a permanent feature of the city's riverine landscape for a long time. Akaki River is one of the most extensively used and significantly polluted rivers used for irrigating urban farms in the city. While localized food production may be a core interest in urban agriculture in Addis Ababa, societal, economic and environmental functions of the city food systems are often less likely to be considered equally important mainly due to the lack of public awareness.

Further, food systems are often the largest employment sector in a city, encompassing not just food producers, but also food processors and manufacturers, transporters, and restaurant workers. According to Dubbeling et al. (2016), research in East Africa indicates that as many as 80% of all jobs are affiliated with food systems, including 90% of all rural jobs and even as many as 60% of all urban jobs. Kebbede (n.d.), in his case study of farmers in Addis Ababa, stresses, "Although urban farming is the most important source of household income for the majority of the farmers, the activity is faced with a number of production problems and constraints." His research showed that farmers prioritized certain problems in urban agriculture over others. These problems (cited from Kebede, n.d., p. 11-13, see Box 1) were similar to what I found in my own study.

Box 1. Problems of urban farmers in Addis Ababa

Tenure insecurity: The farmers' most common concern is the fear of losing the land they cultivate, at any moment and without advanced warning or notice. Land is constitutionally a public good, and it can be taken away by the state or the municipality for residential or other urban uses.

High prices for inputs: The increasingly high cost of improved seeds and fertilizers is the most critical problem experienced by the farmers. Rural farmers have access to government- subsidized inputs, but urban farmers do not.

Shortage of irrigation water (particularly during the dry season): There are ten micro-dams on the Little Akaki River. Some were built during the Italian occupation and are in disrepair; others were made from simple materials such as sandbags, wood, branches, mud, and stone and are prone to breaking when the water level in the river rises. When the dams break, less water flows into the irrigation channels, creating a water shortage.

Contamination of irrigation water and pollution: The quality of irrigation water is also a major concern. Wastewater and chemicals dumped or leeched from nearby industrial sites pollute the rivers and streams used for irrigation. Irrigation channels are also filled with all kinds of wastes such as household solid and liquid wastes, leaves and twigs, discarded plastic bags, and eroded materials. Every year, farmers labor for days repairing dams and dredging irrigation channels: Because untreated effluents

discharged from industries pollute the little Akaki River, there are health concerns associated with the consumption of vegetables grown using the water. The farmers are worried that they might lose their source of livelihood if the public stops purchasing their produce due to health concerns.

Inadequate cultivable land: The previous generation of farmers farmed a much larger area of land than the current generation. Each subsequent generation received smaller and smaller pieces of land because of subdivision. In 2010, the average household farm size was only 1,538 square meters or 0.1538 hectare. Many farmers, especially the younger ones, said they would be more than willing to move if land was made available to them anywhere in or on the fringe of the city.

Lack of credit and extension services: Urban farmers lack access to formal credit services. Due to the small-scale nature of their operations, most require short-term finance, which is not available to them through conventional lending institutions. The Ministry of Agriculture and other formal institutions have never extended such services to urban farmers. This is because urban farmers are not considered real or full time farmers; they are simply seen as urban dwellers. They are thus forced to purchase inputs like seeds and fertilizers on the market at higher costs. Extension services are not extended to urban farmers for similar reasons.

Crop losses from pests/diseases: Farmers also complain about crop losses caused by diseases. The most common pest is a nematode (also known as *komata*), which attacks cabbage, cauliflower, and kale. This pest causes the root systems to swell and eventually die. There is no known remedy to this problem, but farmers are trying different measures to minimize the incidence of the pest. They often plant other resistant crops, rotate crops, or try spreading cow dung in the hope that the bad smell will scare off the pest. But according to those who tried it, the last measure did not work at all."

Cited from Kebbede, n.d., p. 11-13.

In addition to the problems listed above, "the clustering of populations in urban centers affects dietary patterns by changing the way that people interact with their environments, as well as by changing the environments themselves in ways that transform food production and distribution systems" (Kennedy et al., 2004, p. 55). According to EPCC, under the United Nations' Development Goals, major programs have been implemented, and still are under implementation, to

combat food insecurity. These include the Productive Safety Net Program (PSNP), Household Asset Building Program (HABP), Complementary Community Investment (CCI) project and Voluntary Re-settlement Program (VRP) (EPCC, 2015). The implementation of these programs is nationwide and from my observations, has helped address some of the current problems, especially in rural areas of the country. However, in the case of urban agriculture, coordinated efforts by government and NGOs is needed to design and implement a comprehensive set of food system interventions to guarantee the right to food and access to healthy food for all its citizens. This can be achieved by first recognizing that urban farmers are an important component of a healthy, sustainable urban food system, and important contributors to the welfare of urban residents and the environment in the long term.

Part 2: Theoretical framework

The influence of NGOs in developing countries

According to multiple sources, although NGOs are proliferating around the world, the phenomenon is especially significant in Asia, Africa and Latin America (Clarke, 1998, p.1)[1]. NGOs may be described as "private, non-profit, professional organizations, with a distinctive legal character, concerned with public welfare goals" (Clarke, 1998, p. 1). In the developing world, NGOs include philanthropic foundations, church development agencies, academic think-tanks and other organizations focusing on issues such as human rights, gender, health, agricultural development, social welfare, the environment, and indigenous peoples (Clarke, 1998).

Contribution of NGOs to development in Ethiopia: Resource mobilization

> In 2008, there were 2,020 on-going development projects in Ethiopia implemented with a total budget of Birr 9.976 billion, which was then equivalent to US$1.123 billion…In 2014 charities and societies were implementing 2,604 projects with a total budget of Birr 35.761 billion (US$1.788 billion) obtained principally from western donors. Between 2008 and 2014 the number of projects and the budgets earmarked to implement them have increased by 28.9% and 59.2% respectively. Figures from two regions illustrate the steady budget increment. The CSO budget in Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region (SNNPR) increased from Birr 2.2 billion in 2008 to Birr 4.3 billion in 2011 rising to Birr 6.7 billion in 2014 (Gebre, 2016, p. 13).

It is evident that NGOs on the ground often make the impossible possible by doing what regimes cannot or will not do. Some humanitarian and development NGOs have a natural advantage because of their perceived neutrality and experience. The most common NGOs in the developing countries are:

> *1. Humanitarian NGOs*: They operate over short time frames, deliver in disaster zones, and respond to catastrophic incidents or events, and are focused on saving lives.
>
> *2. Development NGOs*: They operate over the long term, provide development assistance, respond to systematic problems, and focus on economic, social and political development (Simmons, 1998).

In recent years, as major international government agency donors have cut back on aid going to developing countries, and new challenges crowd the international agenda, experts tell us that NGOs are expected to fill the breach, as the UN and nation-states are coming to depend more on NGOs to give assistance to the developing world. According to Lewis and Opoku-Mensah (2006),

> the particular flexibility of NGOs as an institutional form within neo-liberal policy agendas has ensured that non-governmental actors have remained prominent within international development and humanitarian policy in both North and South, and among post-socialist contexts (p. 666).

As a result, NGOs now have stronger global and national public profiles.

Development-oriented operations by NGOs arguably began in 1949, when the then United States President Harry Truman announced his concept of a "Fair deal" for the entire world, an appeal to the people of the United States and the world to solve the problems of the "underdeveloped areas" of the globe. As Escobar (2011) observes, "The Truman doctrine initiated a new era in the understanding and management of world affairs, particularly those concerning the less economically accomplished countries of the world." Also according to Escobar (2011), in Truman's vision, the main ingredients that would make this massive evolution possible were capital, science and technology and "only in this way could the American dream of peace and abundance be extended to all the peoples of the planet" (p. 4). Here is how Truman laid out his case:

> More than half the people of the world are living in conditions approaching misery. Their food is inadequate, they are victims of disease and their economic life is primitive and stagnant. Their poverty is a

> handicap and a threat both to them and to more prosperous areas. For the first time in history humanity possesses the knowledge and the skill to relieve the suffering of these people. I believe that we should make available to peace loving peoples the benefit of our store of technical knowledge in order to help them realize their aspirations for a better life. What we envisage is a program of development based on the concepts of democratic fair dealing. Greater production is the key to prosperity and peace. And the key to greater production is a wider and more vigorous application of modern scientific and technical knowledge (Truman, 1999).

Ever since, development has relied exclusively on discursive constructs and dominant knowledge systems exemplified by the statement cited above, namely that of the modern western state. The dominance of this knowledge system has dictated the marginalisation and disqualification of non-Western knowledge systems. Haque (1999) states that in recent years, "In the developing countries, the realisation of the notion of sustainable development has come under challenge due to the emergence of neo-liberal regimes and their pro-market policies." Further, according to Haque (1999), this is mainly because the priorities of neo-liberal policies are to expand market forces, facilitate market competition, enhance mass production, reduce the state's anti-poverty programs, attract foreign investment, and maximize consumption which creates negative impacts on the environment through generation of waste and overexploitation of natural resources.

Promoters of the neoliberal model tend to place an overwhelming emphasis on economic growth, in some cases "endorsing inequality as a prerequisite for growth" (Haque, 1999, p.156). Such global trends toward neo-liberal economic reforms, often designed and executed through international NGOs has affected almost all developing countries, making them dependent of aid and charities. As a result, in the past several decades, communities in the developing world have developed dependence on outside agencies for survival, as governments often fall short on providing direct assistance.

To be both effective and long lasting, community participation with NGOs must become a successful and integral part of the entire community's common experience, and not remain as a structure imposed by neoliberal ideology. NGO programs also must be rooted in the expectation of the community's ongoing access to much-needed traditional problem solving methods, realistic information, and better understanding of local matters, including genuine approaches by NGO professionals, government and the World Bank. In the end, mutual interaction, community leadership and ownership must be gained. As Escobar (2011) puts it, the field of neo-liberal influenced aid policies are plagued with Truman's failed ideologies and "to progress, we have to abandon the habit of reducing the poor to cartoon characters and take the time to really understand their lives, in all their complexity and richness" (Banerjee & Duflo, 2012). The power of NGOs is their influence on local government. This power is demonstrated through persuasion and action, but there are other ways of organizing social and political arrangements besides those currently in use in the common activities of NGOs. Examples include educating the public, advocacy, empowering people through local economic development and network construction, and monitoring international agreements (Ahmed & Potter, 2006).

Land ownership and accessibility

Land tenure issues and the politics around food security and access to arable land are complex matters, and have sparked endless debates around the world. In recent decades, agricultural land that was formerly productive has been lost to urbanization and other human uses, as well as to desertification, salinization, soil erosion, and other consequences of unsustainable land management, including the impacts of climate change (Godfray, et al. 2010). On the other hand, Godfray et al. (2010) stress that recent policy decisions to produce first-generation biofuels on good quality agricultural land have added to the competitive pressures. Thus, the most likely scenario is that more food will need to be produced on less land. EPCC states that the world population is

predicted to reach 9 billion in 2050 and these types of pressures on land use could possibly exacerbate global food insecurity (EPCC 2015).

In Africa, according to Toulmin (2009), rights to land stem from various sources, such as "first settlements, long conquest, allocation by government, long occupation or market" and that "rights to land often involve a series of overlapping claims, dependent on customary use, season and negotiation transaction"(Toulmin, 2009). Rights to land depend on different systems of authority for their validation, including community councils, patrilineal hierarchy, local government, traditional leadership, irrigation authorities, city councils and land agencies (Toulmin, 2009). In Ethiopia, land remains the property of the state, and farmers are allowed limited rights for its use, which is referred to usufructuary (Mathie & Cunningham, 2008). Ethiopia's 556 *Woredas* (districts) are autonomous self-governing units with elected councils, executive committees and administrations. Each *Woreda* has an average population of 100,000, and a host of responsibilities including primary education, primary healthcare, agricultural extension, infrastructure development, and the promotion of cottage industries (Mathie & Cunningham, 2008).

Ethiopia's abundant agricultural and natural resource base can be described under the following categories:

> The total area of the country is said to be about 1.17 million km^2 or 117 million hectares, over 60% of which can be used for some form of agricultural production activities. However, according to CSA's annual survey of land under crops by small-scale farmers over many years show that it has been in the range of 13-14 million hectares in any given year ... The overwhelming proportion (95 %) of the cropped area is under small-scale rain-fed farming that accounts for 95 % of the national annual crop production (EPCC, 2015).

Despite the reality of Ethiopia's food insecurity, it has been argued that the country has a great potential for increasing agricultural production and

productivity and thereby ensuring food security. Ethiopia is well endowed not only with potentially cultivable land resources, but "an immense untapped irrigation and hydroelectric potential, has diverse climatic features to grow a large variety of crops and sustain pastoral activities, and has the largest livestock population in Africa"(Demeke et al., 2004, p. 1). According to the literature, lack of access to cultivable land, tight land use regulations and lack of environmental and sustainability education (ESE) hinders the population's ability to reach its potential. According to a commonly used definition, food security is attained when all people at all time have the physical and economical access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life. Opening up of stringent regulations on access to unused land and amendments on existing land ownership policies can not only lead to food security but also help address growing unemployment in Addis Ababa.

> About 39% of the farming households in the country cultivate less than 0.5 hectares and about 89% cultivate less than 2 hectares. Only 0.75% of the farmers own more than 5 hectares of land. Small farm sizes under rain-fed conditions have reinforced subsistence production, in which production activities are guided by home consumption requirements. Small-scale farmers produce about 94% of food crops and 98% of coffee. State and private commercial farms account for the rest of production (Demeke et al, 2004, p. 35).

It is in this context that urban agriculture stands to play a strategic role in enhancing urban food security. Its activity is relevant to households and peripheral sub cities of Addis Ababa, which have relatively larger plots for farming on the one hand, and poor squatter households at the peripheries on the other. In the light of the rapidly changing urban environment, especially in the context of land ownership and access to land, it is dangerous to assume that because urban agriculture looks similar in different cities, or in different parts of the same city, that the motivations or the constraints are the same. School premises, for instance, provide a large space for food production but are not properly utilised. Therefore, when NGOs like IFA show an interest in utilising the land, access should be granted to enable activities of mutual interest.

Part 3: IFA school garden and nutrition program

Background and history

International Fund for Africa (IFA) is an international NGO with its headquarters in Houston, Texas, USA, and a country office in Ethiopia. It is co-founded and run by Ethio-Americans with professional backgrounds in health care and community organizing. IFA's work in Ethiopia started in 2007 and was legally registered with the Charities and Societies Agency in 2010. Its areas of operation are within the sub-city and *Woredas* (districts), directed to selected schools in the city of Addis Ababa by the city administration. IFA states that the current project duration, started in January 2017 will continue till December 2019 (a total of three years). Beside its well-received vegan based Sustainable School Health and Nutrition Program, IFA provides a School Eye Health Program (SEHP) and School Water Sanitation Hygiene WASH programs, acknowledging the overall benefit for the community it is serving. A majority of IFA's operational staff are native to the country, which in my view is an advantage in a country like Ethiopia, where English is foreign to most people, and cultural and social issues are complex in nature.

IFA's mission statement states:

> We first make sure it falls within our focal areas, which are: Sustainable School Health and Nutrition with the following components:
>
> - School feeding – providing plant based nutritious meals to vulnerable children (we have a quota of 100-120 children/school)
> - School Eye Health – vision screening of all students and the provision of medical treatment and eye glasses for those identified to need the intervention
> - School WASH – improving school hygiene and sanitation which includes menstrual hygiene management, where girls are taught to make their own reusable sanitary napkins

- Income generating activities – to ensure the financial sustainability of the program
- Capacity building – by delivering various trainings
- Vocational training for school dropouts

(IFA, 2017)

In executing its programs, IFA consults with its entire stakeholder base through the life of its projects. They describe the process of building relationships with the government as follows: "The government body that relates to NGO's in Ethiopia is the Federal Charities and Societies Agency which has officers at all levels and subdivisions of the government offices. The relationship is mainly a monitoring and evaluation based relationship. IFA submits quarterly reports to these offices, and an annual financial audit. They conduct annual visits of project sites and obtain feedback from beneficiaries in an independent manner. Based on these registrations to operate as an NGO is either renewed or cancelled" (IFA 2017). Furthermore, from their statement, "IFA's relationship with communities is mainly organised around schools. School community contribute their time and labour, IFA in turn provides various capacity building trainings and gives priority to members of the school community unemployed mothers when hiring for positions that didn't require formal training. Another group that is part of the school community is the teachers themselves who volunteer in the various projects, i.e. monitoring school lunches, screening for eye vision, etc." (IFA, 2017).

Figure 1. IFA sample meal at the Sustainable School Health and Nutrition Program (Photo credit: IFA website)

Program goals and objectives

According to IFA's statement, its goal is:

> to build a world where the wellbeing of every woman and child is a reality with a mission to ensure that every infant and child in Ethiopia has the chance to grow and realize his or her full potential. By saving lives at birth, treating sick children and adults, and working in partnership with families, communities, institutions, government and non-governmental organizations, IFA seeks to help people help themselves (IFA, 2017).

IFA's general objectives are to establish a Sustainable School Health Nutrition Program (SHNP) to selected primary schools in Addis Ababa, by focussing on reducing short-term hunger and malnutrition, by providing nutritious meals, and by delivering micronutrients and de-worming tablets to vulnerable students. 700 students currently benefit from the program, which is expected to expand its base to a lager demographic in the near future. IFA has also trained 20,250 schoolgirls in menstrual hygiene management, including production of reusable menstrual pads throughout the project period in 15 schools. It has also established the school WASH program with the objective of reducing diarrheal disease and infection among school children. IFA defines its models of sustainability thus:

> In IFA, we have two models of sustainability – financial and environmental. To ensure financial sustainability we are in the process of launching income generating activities – two bakeries and a mushroom production unit. To promote environmental sustainability, we are implementing a plant based school feeding program to reduce our carbon footprint (IFA 2017).

Some of the above-mentioned projects are currently running while IFA is still in the process of program expansion. IFA's representative quotes Jeffery Sachs, a renowned sustainability scientist, who once said: "We cannot have a secure food

supply unless that food supply is sustainable" (as cited in IFA, 2017). IFA's objectives on food sustainability are strongly influenced by Sach's ideology. My observations of their operations in the schools confirmed that their objectives and actions aligned well with this principle.

During my interviews with IFA staff, and based on my experience in Canada, I asked about the possibility of extending the community/school garden program through creating a garden in every school in Addis Ababa. Overall, my interviewees conveyed an interest in this initiative. Although they expressed their concerns with difficulties in implementation, they believed it would be possible with enough support and commitment. They explained to me their experiences with the first government-approved school mushroom garden, and talked about its benefit to the community[2].

I decided to focus on IFA as a research subject since the organisation was working on the issues that met my own research interests, and its members agreed to be interviewed. I identified the interview subjects through a snowballing approach (See Appendix 1 for sample interview questions). I first spoke to one of IFA's co-founders, who in turn directed me to contact the town office in Addis Ababa. After a few initial conversations with the office, I was able to secure their approval and proceeded to organise my interviews at the organisation. I traveled to Addis Ababa to conduct interviews and site visits over a period of one month. My first meeting was scheduled at the town office in Addis Ababa on the day of their weekly staff meeting. At this meeting, I was introduced to the Country Director, and the key program staff, including the Program Director, Project Coordinator, the Financial Administrator and the Fund Raising and Grant Mobilization Manager. After we discussed the objectives of my research, they outlined their program goals and objectives (elaborated in Part 3 of this paper). We then decided on a schedule for site visits where I would observe their programs in practice.

From my interview with the Program Director, I learned that IFA's decision to focus on child hunger and malnutrition issues in Ethiopia arose from the personal and passionate commitment of its members, whose previous experiences had helped them direct concerted attention to combating these issues. Furthermore, IFA recognised that these issues could not be addressed

outside of their social and cultural milieus, and that religion and tradition were important factors to take into consideration while designing programs. As a result, I observed that IFA stressed the importance of acknowledging indigenous knowledge and practices in the pursuit of food sustainability to ensure the success of their programs. For example, many Ethiopians belonging to the Greek Orthodox religious sect practice fasting for approximately 215 days a year, during which time they stick to a vegan diet (Greek Orthodox Archdiocese of America, 2017). IFA's food program takes this practice into consideration in its vegetarian-based food program. For a famine-prone country like Ethiopia, I believe that IFA's sensitivity to the existing religio-cultural practices marks a positive example of integrating externally supported projects that respectfully serve the community they intend to support. Speaking to the broader concerns of affordability and environmental impacts, the Program Director mentioned that IFA is heavily invested in the adoption of a plant-based diet across the continent and is actively working and supporting vegetarian/vegan organisations across Africa. I also learned that, seven administrative staff run and monitor the Sustainable School Health and Nutrition Program (SSHNP) in Addis Ababa, and the program uses some of the tools the (WFP) developed when calculating the calorie intake required per child. Beneficiaries are selected by considering the highest prevalence of food energy deficient households in the following order: Addis Ababa (50 percent), Amhara (49 percent), Dire Dawa (42 percent) and Tigray (42 percent). Based on these findings, IFA selects schools based on needs, and within each school, the program divides the children into three age groups based on the proportion of energy and micronutrient requirements (Table 1).

Table 1. Age group of children and energy and micronutrient requirements

Age group	Energy (Kcal) (60-75% of RDA)	Micronutrients %
Pre-primary: 3 to <6 years	780-975 Kcal	At least 80% of RDA
Primary: 6 to <12 years	1,110-1,390 Kcal	At least 80% of RDA
Secondary: 12 - <16	2050 – 2140 Kcal	At least 80% of RDA

IFA's objective is to target school feeding assistance to individual children on the basis of vulnerability. The vulnerability criteria used include one or more of the following factors:

- One or both parents deceased
- One or both parents without gainful employment
- Lack of access to sustainable source of food for the family
- Lack of access to more than one full meal per day on average
- Lack of social and/or economic support from within our outside the family
- High occurrences of absenteeism from school

Beneficiary targeting criteria is mostly context-dependent, and hence IFA believes selecting target individual students should involve inputs from multiple stakeholders. The Woreda (district) Education Office (WEO), along with its director, school teachers, and parents associated with Woreda Women and Children Affair Office (WCAO) participate in the selection of 700 of the most vulnerable students. Based on the above-mentioned criteria, the schools that have been selected include: Sibiste Negasi Primary School (SNPS), Agazian Number 2 Primary School (APS), Lafto Primary School (LPS), and Hana Primary School (HPS). Of the selected students, 60% are girls. 40% of the total beneficiary group is from the Kindergarten level. Additionally, children with special needs are also given priority (Interview, 2017).

School selection criteria

In order to be eligible for the program, the school has to be within a poor community where 35% of the most vulnerable children have no parents, and/or where one parent or both parents are not working. This data is made available from the Nefas Silk Lafto Sub-city office in Addis Ababa, Woreda Education Affairs (WEO), and the participating schools themselves. Based on this information, in 2014, IFA implemented the SSHNP at SNPS and APS; the program was introduced subsequently in two more schools in Nefas Silk Lafto

Subcity: Lafto Primary School (LPS) and Hana Primary School (HPS) (Interview, 2017).

Site visit at Agazian No. 2 Primary School

The feeding centre at the Agazian Number 2 Primary School (APS) operates through the day, serving children from Kindergarten to Grade 8. The meals include breakfast and lunch, and the food is freshly prepared on site everyday. The meals consist of a variety of vegetarian dishes. While sharing a meal with the students, I briefly got to ask them a few questions. When asked how they valued the feeding program, their reply was overwhelmingly positive. When asked what their meal looked like at home, some became emotional and kept their answers to themselves. Others said that their meals at home consisted of not even a fraction of what they got at the feeding centre. When asked about their health and how they experienced changes in their health after enrolling in the program, a few confirmed that their grades had improved and that they did not feel sleepy in class anymore. One student enthusiastically replied that he was now able to play soccer well. During the visit, I also walked outside the feeding centre and tried to observe the home packed lunches of those who had not qualified for the program. It became obvious to me that the nutrition-rich diet provided by IFA's program could benefit all children, and that it needed to be made available to all children, irrespective of whether or not they met the criteria for selection, and that it should be applied nationwide. IFA recognises that broad causes of under-nutrition in children are: low dietary intake, inaccessibility to food, inequitable distribution of food within the household, improper food storage and preparation, dietary taboos and infectious diseases. Further, micronutrient deficiencies result from inadequate intake or inefficient utilization of available micronutrients due to infections and parasitic infestations (Interview, 2017).

My site visit to Agazian No. 2 Primary School (APS) gave me an indication about how IFA's feeding project is crucial to these children. On a personal level, as much as I tried to keep my emotions in check, the cultural connection, and

filtering their situation through my own children's eyes made it a difficult task. It brought back memories of the 1985 famine, where food rationing and feeding centres were the only hope of survival for so many. Growing up in the King Haile Selassie's palace ground in Addis Ababa Ethiopia, where both my parents worked, had shielded me from the devastating consequences that befell many others—so often summarized in mere statistics in the country's history; but at the same time it made me realise my calling. Thirty years later, with 6 years of higher education in Environmental Studies, and conscious and active social interaction for social change, I went back to where my stories began, hopefully in the short term to be that "support" the people needed to help them organise in becoming food sustained.

It was enlightening to visit IFA's feeding site, including the upcoming bakery next door. I believe that it gives great hope to these communities and inspires people like me, who want to follow in their footsteps in bringing real change to these communities. However, IFA's effort to expand its projects is faced with a barrage of challenges. These include long delays in securing permits and obtaining approval for logistical operations, conflicts with stakeholders, for e.g., when they are unable to keep the promises they make, and more. The history of the government's suspicion of civil society organisations in Ethiopia is a long one. NGOs in particular are seen as competitors for resources from international donors. Some are perceived as politically motivated and unaccountable to a local constituency.

I conclude by reiterating what IFA addresses in its project document (IFA, 2017). The world over, numerous studies have shown that school feeding is helping eliminate hunger for millions of children and is contributing to their education, nutrition, health and future productivity as adults. IFA states that "school feeding also serves as a social protection system for vulnerable families and children. School meals have been shown to increase the nutritional status of school-age children in a variety of ways. For example, there is a notable reduction in malnutrition via diet diversification and an increased absorption of

micronutrients. Overall, the amount of kilocalories in a child's diet is expanded when they are given nutritional resources that they would otherwise have little or no access to" (IFA, 2017). By increasing the amount of nutrition a child receives at school, that child's family's nutrition status also increases as their familial demand and requirement for food is decreased. As well as directly addressing hunger, school meal projects encourage families to keep their children in school and so help them build better futures. If children are not hungry they will also concentrate better on their lessons. With a solid education, growing children have a better chance of finding their own way out of hunger.

Despite the importance of school meals for vulnerable and poor children, currently only 5% of primary school age children are beneficiaries of a school-feeding program in Ethiopia. IFA believes no child should attend school hungry, and is determine to expand its project to reach as many children as it can by extending its hand, one school at a time.

Volunteerism and operational challenges

According to my observations from field data, various common challenges with NGOs were expressed, but one that came up repeatedly was the absence of adequate funding and vested custom of volunteerism often practiced by most NGOs. When asked, what is getting in the way of volunteerism? an IFA staff member stated their concern saying, "there is an unhealthy culture of expecting some type of payment/ per diem from NGOs and monetary gains are used as incentives by many…IFA does not endorse these sorts of practices" (Interview, 2017). "The spirit of volunteerism is generally very low, therefore organizing communities is proven to be difficult" (Interview, 2017). IFA expressed other challenges such as lack of reliable water supply for promoting standard sanitation programs and in establishing school gardens. It also expressed its concern for the program's long-term sustainability. Its ongoing negotiation with relevant Sub-city departments, schools and the Federal Charities Agency is centered around who will take ownership of the Income Generating Activities (IGAs) to make programs sustainable (Interview notes, 2017). IFA staff added that these are unchartered waters for most stakeholders.

Discussion

Working through the lens of food activism, IFA's school feeding program and its upcoming school garden (e.g., mushroom garden) and bakery appear to have the potential to help address food insecurity. At the same time, its programs pursue multiple objectives surrounding food sustainability, capacity building and women's empowerment. Evidence shows that gender equality, women's empowerment and women's full and equal participation and leadership in the economy are vital to achieve sustainable development, and significantly enhance economic growth and productivity. The level to which IFA manifests this critical perspective will be further explored in Part 4.

Part 4: Themes from the research

Research impact, learning around capacity building, and identifying opportunities

During fieldwork, I tried to pay attention to the larger issue of food insecurity, the level of environmental stewardship by people around the city and the level of community organising in general. As discussed previously in this paper, in Addis Ababa the city population increases by a third every ten years, making it harder to provide sustained and meaningful work for the growing population. The Ethiopian government has responded to these challenges in various ways. However, the response that grabbed my attention was its investment in urban development. The city is currently experiencing a massive growth in urban real estate development, and includes large government housing projects comprising thousands of condominium units being built every year. Even though the quality of these units is highly debated, most building complexes appear to include green space and small common areas. However, the complexes that I visited during my fieldwork revealed that these areas are underutilized and not properly maintained or cared for. There is therefore a tremendous opportunity to organize residents in these highly populated areas and involve them in projects linked to food sustainability, environmental stewardship, and community service. Such an engagement can be facilitated and/or enhanced by involving NGOs who already have the requisite expertise, and the government's financial and administrative support. Cities, while enabling people to secure jobs and services, can also serve as spaces that provide an enriching cultural and political life. However, they do not come without challenges. Improving living conditions by relocating households to these developments without creating awareness in environmental sustainability and communal responsibility may come at the cost of public and environmental health. Traffic congestion, pollution and food scarcity are among many concerns that emerge as challenges in such a context. From my observations, during casual conversations, people frequently discussed the growing issue of homelessness in the city as a mounting concern. As discussed in previous chapters, a large effort by the UN

and its stakeholders is underway in the attempts to address these concerns, often in collaboration with international donors and NGOs like IFA, Care and USAID. However, more needs to be done to prevent these issues from escalating. The ongoing effort in partnership with local communities and community capacity building by NGOs like IFA gives them greater hope to overcome such challenges by themselves, and needs to be taken seriously.

Community capacity building is described as a process of developing and strengthening the skills, instincts, abilities, processes and resources that organizations and communities need to survive, adapt, and thrive in the fast-changing world (Shain, 2001). As the current cost of living continues to rise, one fear is that a significant amount of slum dwellers will end up losing their homes, adding to the number of homeless individuals and families in the city, exacerbating the socio-economic situation the city is currently facing. It is imperative, therefore, that efforts are directed towards organizing these particular groups of society. However, reaching out to them requires a careful collaborative approach, one that does not overlook or undermine the powerful informal forces at work in the social fabric of these sections of society, including the influence of crime lords and religious leaders, who often exert substantial control on community activities. IFA's saying that they "help communities help themselves" should be adopted by all development agencies in order to create a just food system and a sustainable environment that not only benefits urban dwellers, but the country at large, and also contributes to reducing its ecological footprint.

This may require a larger commitment in funding and expertise, but would also recognize the exiting potential within these communities for sustained engagement. Allowing local actors take ownership of their challenges and celebrate their victories can happen at the same time as more conventional community development actors (e.g., ministries, local authorities, non-governmental organizations, professionals and academics) monitor activities and provide support. These types of meaningful collaborations create possibilities for positive outcomes to emerge. As Harrison (2002) notes, "In a true participation, local actors should progressively take the lead, while external

partners back their efforts to assume greater responsibility for their own development" (p. 4). It is evident that changes in funding priorities by donors is the biggest challenge to the operation and sustainability of projects. However, if greater emphasis is put to promote indigeneity and organize communities through methods of popular education for social change, the result may be one that will lead to making the 2030 UN Agenda on Sustainability a reality.

I find IFA's overall approach to food security to be encouraging. There are several lessons that can be learned from IFA's projects in Ethiopia. For example, its promising plant-based diet provided to schoolchildren, while making use of local produce, is also far superior to the increasingly popular, but nutritionally deficient, western fast food diet that is taking over the food market in Addis Ababa. IFA also engages in community organizing, outside of its role as a provider in the school feeding program. Indeed, the beneficiaries enthusiastically praised IFA for its success in tackling the child hunger issue seriously. They themselves urged that other NGOs and government feeding projects in the city should learn from IFA's example. However, I make these observations with a degree of caution, as the statements of success have often been based on the information IFA itself provides, which may not be based wholly on empirically and objectively analyzed data.

Strategies for incorporating Environmental and Sustainability Education

> Education is key in the search for more justice in the world. The untapped excellence of the poor is being wasted in the need to survive (Kennedy et al., 2004).

The higher education reform agenda of the current administration is engaged in a highly ambitious effort to re-align its higher education system in more direct support of its national strategy for economic growth and poverty reduction (Saint, 2004). As a result, "Total tertiary enrolments in universities and non

university tertiary institutions, both public and private, surged from 43,843 in 1997–98 to 147,954 in 2002–03)" (Saint 2004, p.85). Saint (2004) further notes that enrolment rate had tripled in just five years, increasing annual enrolment by 28%, making it possibly the highest in the world during this period. The sharp increase in enrolment had its fallouts, including debates over the quality of education and job qualification of graduates.

The global discourse around poverty and food insecurity often focuses around these underlining issues. As discussed above, in addition to soaring unemployment, Ethiopia is currently overwhelmed by the surplus of graduates waiting for employment opportunities. In order to address these issues, one strategy to organize unemployed graduates can be to train them in ESE, preferably while still in school. These trained graduates could then be required to serve their immediate community for a requisite period of time. Such a strategy will in the long run contribute to help introduce 21st century volunteerism and produce environmental stewards equipped with the skills of critical thinking and group communication through activities such as service learning, and issue investigation.

When societies develop a community service-learning project and participate in the selection and design of their activity, they are likely to become more effective, empowered, and committed as they improve their communities. This sort of strategy will not only ease the burden on the government but also may be the prolific approach to sustainable development and food security. Organizing people for social change can possibly lead to a broader interest and demand for environmental education in general. In addition, in a larger context "Educating those currently at school about climate change will help shape and sustain future policy making, and a broad public and international debate will support today's policy-makers in taking strong action now" (Bangay & Blum, 2010, p. 15-16). Nurturing a shared understanding of the nature of climate change, and its consequences is critical in shaping behaviour, as well as in underpinning global action. I believe that ESE will do just that if added as part of the curriculum from Junior Kindergarten (JK) to higher education, not just in Ethiopia, but elsewhere too.

> Environmental and sustainability education (E&SE) is about healthy relationships between humans and the Earth's living systems. It includes the many and varied forms of education that help us appreciate and maintain the integrity of the biosphere, the transmission, growth and application of environmental knowledge across all sectors of society (EEON, 2017).

I believe that the lack of ESE contributes a fundamental factor associated with poverty, in particular chronic poverty. ESE helps communities gain basic knowledge, like the environment's vital role in determining quality of life, and the interwoven nature of environmental and social issues, while at the same time creating engagement and active citizenship leading to community action. When an ESE curriculum is created and implemented with a concerted effort to incorporate indigenous thought and practices in keeping with local capacity and needs, it can teach a critical perspective on sustainable development. Such a perspective can help challenge the current ESE teaching practice that in most cases reinforce dominant paradigms of development, where it teaches particular aspects of food security and environmental protection influenced by neoliberal ideology, raising questions around the purpose, praxis, and impacts of ESE.

The lack of overall education and inadequate social organization results in people remaining in chronically poor working conditions, in insecure or low return activities, unemployment, and in many cases homelessness. In Addis Ababa, a significant number of urban dwellers are chronically poor and have no formal education or are under-educated, especially in the area of environmental education. I observed this phenomenon through formal and informal discussions and careful observation of various communities in Addis Ababa. Educating communities to better understand their environment could be shared through critical pedagogies. As Horton and Freire (1990) state, "We cannot educate if we don't start--and I said start and not stay--from the levels in which the people perceive themselves, their relationships with the others and with reality, because this is precisely what makes their knowledge." Community based environment education programs, collaborative learning, and adaptive collaborative

management provide excellent models of social learning. Monroe, et al. (2008) suggest that urban areas of Addis Ababa lack these types of programs and strategies, providing a critical opportunity for NGOs and other developmental organizations to incorporate such practices, initiated through pilot programs. Monroe et al. (2008) expand their view on collaborative work by stating that when communities and their leaders acknowledge the limitations of their knowledge and seek new information, they are redefining and transforming the issue and their understanding of it.

Accomplishing the successful global implementation of ESE requires both the educator and the learner to jointly define goals and/or methods of the intervention. In other words, it requires methods of popular education. A pedagogy that trusts "at its heart the empowerment of adults through democratically structured cooperative study and action, directed towards achieving more just, equitable, and peaceful societies. Its priority is the poor, the oppressed and the disenfranchised people of the world"(Horton, & Freire, 1990). Popular education also encourages place-based education.

> Place-based education (PBE) immerses students in local heritage, cultures, landscapes, opportunities and experiences, using these as a foundation for the study of language arts, mathematics, social studies, science and other subjects across the curriculum. (PBE) emphasizes learning through participation in service projects for the local school and/or community (EEON, n.d.)

Place-based education, in an ESE-inspired framework, can serve as a model to develop understanding and appreciation of local foods and food-based practices. Projects such as IFA's school feeding programs, apart from meeting the immediate goal of providing nutritious food to children, can be infused with educational aspects of how and why local food production and well-balanced diets leads to better physical and mental health, environmental sustainability, and community self-sufficiency. Further, these programs should acknowledge traditional indigenous food and knowledge practices, highlighting those that meet social and environmental sustainability objectives.

Government regulations of NGO activities

As discussed throughout this paper, NGOs/CSOs have been engaged in humanitarian assistance, service delivery, development projects, human rights, policy advocacy and environmental protection, and play the role of the 'the third sector' in society, alongside government and business. It is equally important to note that CSOs /NGOs in many countries have been operating under restrictive regulatory frameworks. According to Gebre (2016), regulatory constraints are focused on three contentious issues in Ethiopia: the 70:30 directive, the 90:10 provision, and the IGA provision related to Proclamation (No. 621/2009) (elaborated upon below in Box 2). These constraints have resulted in mixed responses from stakeholders. Gebre (2016) observes that CSOs/NGOs have been operating under a restrictive law imposed by the government, and that these enforced guidelines impede their operation. For example, a requirement of minimizing expenditure on Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) of their projects by reducing their administration to 30% or less of total costs reduces the effectiveness of their programs. (M&E) expenditure is not the only cost which NGOs believe have been wrongly classified as administration; other activities such as capacity building, transport, staff salaries and various forms of training also fall within this category, making it impossible to operate within increasingly restricted budgets. However, it is worth noting that these regulations are appreciated by local NGO workers because it encourages NGOs to source local expertise.

Box 2. Three regulatory challenges on CSOs/NGOs in Ethiopia

The 70:30 directive

The directive on administrative and operational costs (commonly called the 70:30 rule or guideline) requires CSOs to allocate 70% of their budget for programme activities and 30% for administrative purposes. The logic behind the law stems from the pre Proclamation allegations that CSOs spent 60% of their budget on administrative matters and that their highly paid leaders allegedly advanced the interests of foreign agencies rather than the citizens. Many local authorities and ordinary beneficiaries of CSOs' projects reported to have witnessed noticeable improvements in accountability,

transparency and the flow of resources after the enactment of the law.

The 70:30 rule has been challenged on legitimate grounds. The argument is not that the 30% is unfair but that the items classified as administrative costs undermines the quality of CSO activities. The classification of transportation, training, research and monitoring and evaluation expenses as administrative costs (rather than operational costs) is considered mistaken and counter-productive. It is mistaken because these costs are part of the core activities of most projects and counter-productive in that CSOs loose the motivation to launch projects in remote areas, undertake baseline studies, provide training and engage in serious monitoring and evaluation.

The directive is also viewed as discriminatory in that it rewards financially strong CSOs. Organisations with very large budgets do not necessarily have the largest work forces, pay the highest salaries or spend proportionately more on research and training than smaller organisations. Indeed, they may not need to spend 30% of their budget on running costs. This is not the case for the resource-poor CSOs that may be required to exceed the 30% threshold. The proponents of this view call for the amendment of the provision to address the concerns of small CSOs.

The new law recognises the rights of charities and societies to establish consortia to coordinate their activities. The directive issued to regulate the establishment of consortia recognises the role that networks play: building the capacity of their members, voicing common challenges, facilitating experience and information sharing and enhancing the ethical and professional standards of their members. However, the 70:30 guideline considers all expenses incurred by a consortium as administrative costs stating that networks are not implementers and therefore they do not incur operational costs … The consortia are expected to transfer a minimum of 70% of their funds from donors to member CSOs effectively reducing their role to that of fundraiser. Consortia are expected to derive their income from membership fees and a percentage share of the 30% administrative costs of CSOs and this makes it difficult for them to carry out broader functions.

As a response to the advocacy efforts exerted by different donors and CSOs to improve the regulatory framework, the Charities and Societies Agency made some amendments to the 70:30 guideline. The changes apply to the salary and transport expenses of CSOs working on HIV, persons with disabilities, agriculture, access to clean water, environmental protection, capacity building, training and construction.

The amendment does not apply to all the CSOs and does not address the concerns of small CSOs and networks discussed above. Also, the request to reclassify research, monitoring and evaluation expenses as operational costs remains unaddressed. On a positive note, however, the government’s responsiveness to the advocacy efforts deserves to be viewed as a step in the right direction.

The 90:10 provisions

As indicated earlier, Article 2:2 of the new CSO legislation prohibits Ethiopian charities and Ethiopian societies from receiving more than 10% of their funds from foreign sources. As stated earlier, this provision rolled back the fledgling involvement of CSOs on rights issues. Rights organisations have been forced to change their mandates, scale-down their activities or terminate their operations.

Ethiopian charities/societies are expected to generate 90% of their funds through domestic resource mobilization: income generation, private donations, public collection and membership contributions. Although it is commendable to have local funds for local projects, it is not a viable and realistic option in the current Ethiopian context where even the government cannot function without foreign funds. Hence, the sharp international criticism levelled against this particular provision has some justification.

Recently, the government has created some exemptions to address the concerns of key donors. The European Union and the World Bank negotiated with the government to reclassify some foreign funds as domestic (to circumvent the 10% ceiling) so that Ethiopian charities and Ethiopian societies could access such funds. The reclassified funds have been channelled through the European Union Civil Society Fund II (EU- CSF II) and the Ethiopian Social Accountability Programme Phase 2 (ESAP2). Some rights organizations have expressed concerns that EU-CSF II and ESAP2 are temporary arrangements that might end anytime and the gains achieved so far cannot be sustained without the amendment of the 90:10 rule.

Income generation (IGA)

In Ethiopia, charities and societies are allowed to engage in IGAs (Proclamation No. 621/2009, Article 103). This provision is meant to enable CSOs to mobilise resources from within the country and reduce their heavy dependence on foreign funds. However, the provision contains restrictions that make engagement in IGAs rather difficult. CSOs wishing to engage in IGAs are expected to work on activities related to their 'core' mission, secure written approval from the Agency, obtain valid business licenses from the relevant government departments and maintain separate accounts for their IGAs. It appears that CSOs' 'businesses' are subjected to additional scrutiny that does not apply to the private sector. According to authorities, an IGA is a business activity that must be governed by the trade law, not by CSO law. Moreover, there should not be confusion between business and charity activities that would distort the market and put private businesses at a competitive disadvantage.

Representatives of some CSOs have argued that their IGAs are inseparable from their charity work and that their activities are not purely commercial. Typical examples

include donor-funded CSOs running schools and clinics. Such organisations provide affordable services (often of high quality) to non-target groups with the intention of supporting nearby communities, recovering part of their expenses and generating income that enables them to provide services for the poor who cannot pay.

The provision that IGAs must be directly related to the core missions of the CSO (Article 103:1) is particularly difficult for Ethiopian charities and societies. Officials explained the logic behind this provision in terms of enabling CSOs to promote their areas of interest and address business development gaps in those areas while avoiding overcrowding and market distortion in certain business areas and discouraging the establishment of CSOs with business as their primary interest. However, the logic works only for some CSOs. Organizations that are engaged in service delivery can easily identify IGAs (e.g., opening schools, clinics, bookstores, pharmacies, etc.) directly to their missions. In this regard, CSOs that receive 90% of their funds from foreign sources are in an advantageous position. The challenge is for Ethiopian registered CSOs working on rights issues and receiving only 10% of their funds from external sources. They find it difficult to identify business activities leading to marketable products and services that are directly related to their missions.

Proclamation No. 6 21/2009 forbids the distribution of proceeds from IGAs among the members or beneficiaries of CSOs (Article 103:1). This provision is inconsistent with Article 14:2h of the Proclamation that links 'charitable purpose' to "the relief of those in need by reason of age, disability, financial hardship or other disadvantage." The relief of those in need may require the distribution of proceeds. Representatives of CSOs working on HIV/AIDS noted that many organizations are established with the objective of providing economic and other types of assistance for their members.

(Gebre, 2016: P. 16-21)

Part 5: Conclusion

Ethiopia has placed a primary emphasis on rural and agricultural development. The country continues to urbanize, and a mosaic of economic activities are beginning to link and form passages of economic growth. In Addis Ababa, increased urbanization has had significant social, economical, environmental and cultural effects, both in urban and rural settings. The government of Ethiopia continues to struggle with central development challenges. It addresses these challenges in part by partnering with NGOs like International Fund for Africa (IFA) and other developmental organizations to adequately provide its people with basic services and food security. These efforts accompany a fast-increasing population, and the dominance of an increasingly globalized economy. Within this larger context, this paper has attempted to address the issue of food sovereignty and nutritional security as approached through an NGO's efforts. I am convinced that IFA's plant based diet sustainable school feeding program could be the key to reducing child malnutrition. Its model of the school bakery and school garden could encourage small scale food production that can lower the cost of food and encourage proper diet for the students and the urban poor, contributing to the larger fight for food security/sustainability. At the present moment, the issues of food insecurity and instability in Ethiopia are predominantly addressed through external food aid, food subsidies, and through programs with a top-down management approach with an emphasis on western expertise. IFA's feeding program's model, on the other hand, includes the local community, for example by enlisting teachers as volunteers in the program, to achieve self-sustainability and sufficiency by providing the local community with tools to empower themselves and take ownership of such initiatives. Through this research, I observed complementary activities such as urban agriculture, locally implementable food technology and food policies to reduce the cost of producing foods that are likely to be particularly important for urban livelihoods. The link between poverty and food insecurity is strongly associated with high food aid dependency and large household size. Even if some of these impacts are only cyclical, i.e., they surface only temporarily, their long-term effects persist over many years. The lack of education is another

fundamental factor associated with, and probably underlying, poverty—especially chronic poverty. This clearly needs further in-depth analysis to better understand the factors associated with chronic poverty. From my understanding, people living in chronic poverty sometimes tend to use the environment as a resource and an outlet for disposing of waste, without understanding the negative impact on their local environment.

Addis Ababa's current practice of community development and sustainable food production in urban agriculture is weak due to the lack of community leadership and community-driven initiatives. While it is important that Ethiopia set in place the policies needed to incentivize city growth, it is also important that it supports community based agriculture by allowing communities access to unused plots, free space to organize, and provide access to basic services for lasting food security. Ethiopia will do well to learn from the lessons that have proven successful in other parts of the world. One example is from Cuba. After the 1959 US embargo, Cuba's reliance on Soviet imports of oil was terminated abruptly and the country was forced to adopt alternative ways for survival to achieve greater food security and agricultural sustainability. Due to the significant impact of the event, according to Harrison (2002), people began to grow their own food, relying on local ingenuity, knowledge, resources and technology. What started initially on domestic/residential rooftops and balconies quickly took off and covered unused spaces such as old parking lots and neglected land. "As the authorities saw the success of these developments in meeting food needs they enacted institutional changes to place more land into the control of communities and to incentivize private enterprise in food production" (Harrison 2002, p. 172). Such developments have led to a significant variety of urban agricultural settings and forms, and a greater number and range of vending outlets for agricultural produce like street markets. Apart from providing long term food sustainability, this model also demonstrated that it was possible to achieve self-sufficiency, and not depend on external aid or expertise, a premise that is deeply rooted in a majority of foreign aid funded projects. If only many of the demands echoing from Ethiopia's cities and localities could be acknowledged, this will be a reality in urban Addis Ababa as well.

Historically, small-scale food production has been the agricultural backbone of the Ethiopian economy. My recommendation to IFA is to extend its efforts to the larger community, following Cuba's methods and ideas for achieving a larger impact in the food system. Furthermore, I trust that if land is made more easily accessible, IFA has the opportunity to further develop Environmental and Sustainability Education centers and create a green job sector that the country needs. This will directly respond to the demands for good ethical urban governance, cultural food production and processing, good practices and accountability.

Trickle-down economics, through the force of globalization, has done very little for the poor. When countries open up to trade through globalization, they tend to grow faster, and living standards tend to increase. This narrative of globalization in urban areas of the developing world is only reflective of a small section of urban society. To pinpoint how the poor benefit from the effects of globalization can be challenging as the stories change frequently. For the developed world, famines in the developing world no longer capture the headlines like they used to. These days, the focus of international philanthropy has shown a shift from disaster relief to more structural issues, particularly, economic development, anti-poverty development, and Third World debt relief. There are a lot of benefits that can be acquired by embracing these changes, but government policy needs to make sure that those usually left behind share in these gains. As is often the case at the sites of social and economic change, the most vulnerable sections of society tend to be excluded. There are many factors to food insecurity problems in the urban area of Addis Ababa Ethiopia. Irresponsible land-use practices, for example using empty plots as dumping grounds when they could be used for urban agriculture, is but one example of the problematic ways in which opportunities to create food-secure communities are lost.

References

Ahmed, S., & Potter, D. M. (2006). *NGOs in international politics* (pp. 14-15). Bloomfield, CT: Kumarian Press.

Alcantara-Ayala, I. (2002). Geomorphology, natural hazards, vulnerability and prevention of natural disasters in developing countries. *Geomorphology*, *47*(2), 107-124.

Awulachew, S. B., Merrey, D., Kamara, A., Van Koppen, B., Penning de Vries, F., & Boelee, E. (2005). *Experiences and opportunities for promoting small-scale/micro irrigation and rainwater harvesting for food security in Ethiopia.* International Water Management Institute Working Paper 98.

Banerjee, A., & Duflo, E. (2012). *Poor economics: A radical rethinking of the way to fight global poverty*. PublicAffairs.

Bangay, C. and Blum, N. (2010). Education responses to climate change and quality: Two parts of the same agenda? *International Journal of Educational Development 30*(4): 335-450.

Clarke, G. (1998). Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and politics in the developing world. *Political studies*, *46*(1), 36-52.

Clay, D. C., Molla, D., & Habtewold, D. (1999). Food aid targeting in Ethiopia: A study of who needs it and who gets it. *Food Policy*, *24*(4), 391-409.

De Schutter, O. (2014). UN Special Rapporteur on the right to food. *Report on agroecology and the right to food.*

Dejene, A. (2003). Integrated natural resources management to enhance food security. *The case for community-based approaches in Ethiopia. Environment and Natural Resources Working Paper*, (16).

Demeke, M. U. L. A. T., Guta, F. A. N. T. U., Ferede, T. A. D. E. L. E., & ABABA, A. (2004). *University. www. sarpn.org.*

Devi, K. L. (2006). Multi national corporations, development discontent and civil society. World Society Focus Paper Series.

Dubbeling, Bucatariu, Santini, Carmen Vogt & Katrin Eisenbei, (2016). City region food systems and food waste management-linking urban, Retrieved from www.rufa.org/…/city-region-food-systems-and –food-waste-management-linking-urban.

Elwood, S. (2010). *Mixed methods: Thinking, doing, and asking in multiple ways* (Vol. 1, pp. 94-114). D. DeLyser (Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Escobar, A. (2011). *Encountering development: The making and unmaking of the Third World*. Princeton University Press.

Ethiopian Panel on Climate Change (2015), *First Assessment Report, Working Group II Agriculture and Food Security*. Ethiopian Academy of Sciences.

FAO, IFAD & WFP. (2015). The State of Food Insecurity in the World 2015. Meeting the 2015 international hunger targets: taking stock of uneven progress. Rome, FAO.

Garau, P., E. D. Sclar & G. Y. Carolini (2005), *A Home in the City*, Task Force on Improving the Lives of Slum Dwellers, UN Millennium Project, Earthscan, London.

Gebre, Y. (2016). Reality checks: The state of civil society organizations in Ethiopia. *African Sociological Review/Revue Africaine de Sociologie*, *20*(2), 2-25.

Godfray, H. C. J., Beddington, J. R., Crute, I. R., Haddad, L., Lawrence, D., Muir, J. F., ... & Toulmin, C. (2010). Food security: the challenge of feeding 9 billion people. *Science*, *327*(5967), 812-818.

GoodReades. (2017). Maya Angelo Quots. Retrieved fromhttps://www.goodreads.com/author/quotes/3503.Maya_Angelou

Greek Orthodox Archdiocese of America. (2017). Fasting from iniquities and food. Retrieved from. www.goarch.org/ourfaith/ourfaith8125.

Haque, M. S. (1999). The fate of sustainable development under neo-liberal regimes in developing countries. *International Political Science Review*, *20*(2), 197-218.

Harrison, E. (2002). 'The problem with the locals': Partnership and participation in Ethiopia. *Development and Change*, *33*(4), 587-610.

Horton, M., & Freire, P. (1990). *We make the road by walking: Conversations on education and social change*. Temple University Press.

International Fund for Africa (2017). International Fund for Africa. Retrieved from http://www.ifundafrica.org.

Jensen, P (2013). Food and Nutrition Technical Assistance (FANTA): The urban garden program for HIV- Affected women and children. A Review and look to the future. Retrieved from https://www.fantaproject.org/sites/default/files/resources/Urban-Gardens-Program-Review-Apr2013.pdf

Kates, R. W., Parris, T. M., & Leiserowitz, A. A. (2005). What is sustainable development? *Environment*, *47*(3), 8.

Kebbede, G. (n.d.). Farmers in the City: The Case of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Retrieved fromhttps://www.mtholyoke.edu/sites/default/files/acad/.../FarmersinAddisAbaba.pdf

Kennedy, G., Nantel, G., & Shetty, P. (2004). Globalization of food systems in developing countries: a synthesis of country case studies. *Globalization of food systems in developing countries: Impact on food security and nutrition*, *83*(1).

Kent, G. (n.d.). Globalization and food security in Africa. Retrieved from http://www.toda.org/conferences/durban_conference/durban_papers/kent.html.

Lavers, T. (2012). 'Land grab' as development strategy? The political economy of agricultural investment in Ethiopia. *Journal of Peasant Studies*, *39*(1), 105-132.

Lewis, D., & Opoku-Mensah, P. (2006). Moving forward research agendas on international NGOs: theory, agency and context. *Journal of International Development*, *18*(5), 665-675.

Mathie, A., & Cunningham, G. (2008). *From clients to citizens: Communities changing the course of their own development*. Warwickshire, UK: Practical Action Pub.

Maxwell, D. (1999). The political economy of urban food security in sub-Saharan Africa, *World Development* 27, 1939–1953.

Miller, M. A. (1995). The Third World in global environmental politics.

Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MOFED 2009) Development. Retrieved from http://www.mofed.gov.et/English/Pages/Home.aspx.

Monroe, M. C., Andrews, E., & Biedenweg, K. (2008). A framework for environmental education strategies. *Applied Environmental Education & Communication*, *6*(3-4), 205-216.

Nussbaum, B. (2003). African culture and Ubuntu. *Perspectives*, *17*(1), 1-12.

People and Society. (2016). Central Intelligence Agency (CIA). Retrieved from https://www.cia.gov/index.html.

Regev-Tobias, H., Reifen, R., Endevelt, R., Havkin, O., Cohen, E., Stern, G., & Stark, A. (2012). Dietary acculturation and increasing rates of obesity in Ethiopian women living in Israel. *Nutrition*, *28*(1), 30-34.

Riely, F., Mock, N., Cogill, B., Bailey, L., & Kenefick, E. (1999). Food security indicators and framework for use in the monitoring and evaluation of food aid programs. *Nutrition Technical Assistance Project (FANTA), Washington, DC*.

Roberts, W. (2013). *The no-nonsense guide to world food* (2nd edition). Oxford: New Internationalist Publications.

Sachs, J. D., & Warner, A. M. (2001). The curse of natural resources. *European Economic Review*, *45*(4), 827-838.

Sachs, W. (Ed.). (1997). *Development dictionary: A guide to knowledge as power*. Orient Blackswan.

Sagor, R. (1992). *How to conduct collaborative action research*. Association for

Supervision and Curriculum Development, 1250 N. Pitt St., Alexandria, VA 22314.

Sagor, R. (2000). *Guiding school improvement with action research*. ASCD.

Saint, W. (2004). Higher education in Ethiopia: The vision and its challenges. *Journal of Higher Education in Africa/Revue de l'enseignement supérieur en Afrique*, 83-113.

Shain, C. (2001). Coral Mitchell and Larry Sackney, Profound Improvement: Building Capacity for a Learning Community. Journal of Educational Change, 2(4), 358-362.

Shor, I. (1999). What is critical literacy? *Journal for Pedagogy, Pluralism & Practice*, *4*(1), 1-26.

Simmons, P. J. (1998). Learning to live with NGOs. *Foreign Policy*, 82-96.

Siyoum, A. D., Hilhorst, D., & Van Uffelen, G. J. (2012). Food aid and dependency syndrome in Ethiopia: Local perceptions. *Journal of Humanitarian Assistance*, *20*.

Toulmin, C. (2009). Securing land and property rights in sub-Saharan Africa: the role of local institutions. *Land use policy*, *26*(1), 10-19.

Truman, H. S. (1999). Inaugural Address: Thursday, January 20, 1949 (p. 12). Western Standard Publishing Company.

UN, G. A. (2015). *Transforming our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*. A/RES/70/1, 21 October. Retrieved from https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/post2015/transformingourworld.

University of Toronto. (n.d.). ESE Environmental and sustainability Education (Definition of ESE) http://www.eeon.org/pdf/greeningsummaryint.pdf

USAID. (2017). Ethiopia/ U.S Agency for International Development USAID FANTA, RUFA July 14, 2017 Retrieved from http://www.usaid.gov.

Williams, D. (2001). Food security and access. *Geography*.

World Resources Institute. (1996). *World resources 1996-97: The urban environment*. World Resources Institute.

Zezza, A., & Tasciotti, L. (2010). Urban agriculture, poverty, and food security: empirical evidence from a sample of developing countries. *Food policy*, *35*(4), 265-273.

Appendix 1

Sample interview questions

- What are the main requirements to be considered for IFA funding?
- How are projects designed and by whom? Who makes decisions?
- What are the roles of government/communities in IFA project management and how do they view the relationship between NGOs and themselves?
- What is getting in the way of communities organizing themselves for action? What can be done to improve it?

Notes

[1] The phrase 'NGO' is contested terminology, and for many has been subsumed within a broader category of 'civil society organizations' or 'CSOs' and many aid actors, particularly among governments in developing countries. They refer to 'NGOs' and their role in international aid and development cooperation. According to this document, CSOs include a diverse set of
[1] The phrase 'NGO' is contested terminology, and for many has been subsumed within a broader category of 'civil society organizations' or 'CSOs' and many aid actors, particularly among governments in developing countries. They refer to 'NGOs' and their role in international aid and development cooperation. According to this document, CSOs include a diverse set of
organizations, ranging from small, informal, community-based organizations to the large, high profile, International NGO's (INGOs) working through local partners across the developing world (CIVICUS World Assembly, 2011) and have been working in a range of development sectors with large budgets.

[2] Although it was not made clear why they had opted to cultivate a mushroom garden instead of a vegetable garden at the Lafto school, I surmised that conditional funding for these types of programs often prescribed what types of gardens needed to be grown, and how the produce would be distributed and contribute to supporting and sustaining the project.