

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Investigating the Evolutionary Changes
in Crabtree-negative Yeasts
During a Long-term Evolution Experiment**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Genetics
at Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand.

Annabel Morley

2017

0.1 Abstract

The Crabtree effect is a metabolic strategy that allows yeast to ferment in the presence of oxygen. This is of interest as not all yeasts display this strategy, and nearly 100 years after its discovery it is still unclear what the overall benefit is. Two key theories attempt to explain the emergence of this phenomenon, the make-accumulate-consume theory and the rate/yield trade-off theory. The aim of this thesis was to investigate whether a trade-off between rate and yield develops in Crabtree-negative yeasts over the course of 1500 generations in a high sugar environment. Chapter Two demonstrates that growth rate is more likely to increase than decrease while growth yield is more likely to decrease than increase in the isolate-derived populations of yeast. We find that species that started out relatively fast, changed little while the slower species had more significant gains in growth rate. With growth yield, the species with initially high yield lost more significantly than the already low yield species. This could suggest there is an overall optimum growth rate and growth yield, that the species are evolving towards. In Chapter Three, ethanol production was measured using colorimetric tests and no change was observed to support the development of the Crabtree effect in these populations after 1500 generations. In Chapter Four growth yield was investigated using flow cytometry and it was found that several yeast populations both increased in cell size and decreased in growth yield. This is an interesting observation that has been observed in several previous experimental evolution experiments. In Chapter Five, as cell size is often associated with ploidy changes, DNA content was measured using DAPI and SYTOX DNA stains, detected by flow cytometry. This did not provide any statistically significant conclusions but highlighted the importance of employing further techniques to analyse the DNA content of these populations. This thesis has illustrated the importance of studying the competitive behaviours of microorganisms in isolation, where selfish traits appear to thrive.

0.2 Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Professor Thomas Pfeiffer for not only his supervision for this thesis, but for his endless help with mathematical models and data analysis using R. I would also like to thank Professor Paul Rainey, my secondary supervisor for his feedback throughout my studies. I would like to thank my examiners, Dr. Nikki Freed, Dr. Duncan Greig and Professor Jack Heinemann and my convenor Dr. Ralph Bathurst for reviewing my thesis and overseeing my viva.

I would like to extend a special thanks to Professor Mat Goddard for supplying the natural yeast strains, allowing use of his laboratory equipment for preliminary studies and for supporting me during my write up when I returned to England.

For training and helping me to hit the ground running in the lab, I'd like to thank Soon Lee, Dr. Matthew Woods, Dr. Catrin Gunther, Dr. Daniella Quintana, Danielle Kok, Jarod Young, Dr. Austen Ganley and especially Dr. Heather Hendrickson, for training me on and allowing me near her very precious fluorescent microscope.

For valuable feedback on my chapters, I would like to thank Dr. Georg Hochberg, Kay Evans, Matt Robinson, Catherine Cockfield and Dr. Freya Harrison, without you I would not have been able to submit. A big thank you is reserved for Dr Christopher Hoyland for valuable feedback throughout.

I'd like to take this section to say thank you to those people that, while may not have helped with the work itself, were there for me when I needed it most. To Colleen Keelty, for being the first person I'd see when I went to the lab every day, who kept me going when things got frustrating, I can't express my thanks to you. To Dr. Evelyn Sattlegger for all your help and understanding. To Hayley Prescott for helping me figure out how to deal with my health at such a key point in my studies, your insight was invaluable. Lastly to the friends that provided me with emergency gin, moral support and proof-reading (Bunni and V), the friends that tried to get me out of the house during my reclusive write up stages (Kate and Ash), and all those that believed in me when I didn't believe in myself (Shelagh, Andrea, Kay and Cai to name a few).

Finally, words cannot express how thankful I am to my partner, Simon Cooper. You have never complained about how much I had to work, have been there when my illness took most of my energy, when the stress got too much you were there to hold me. You have been dragged to Middle Earth and back again, having never protested and provided more support than I could ever imagine was possible. I just hope that now this is done I can support you as well as you have supported me.

0.3 Table of Contents

0.1	Abstract	i
0.2	Acknowledgements	ii
0.3	Table of Contents	iv
0.4	Abbreviations	ix
0.5	List of Figures	xi
0.6	List of Tables	xiv
CHAPTER ONE		1
Introduction		1
1.1	Introduction	2
1.2	Metabolism	3
1.3	The Crabtree Effect	4
1.4	Phylogenetic History	6
1.5	Mechanistic Origin	7
1.6	Theories Behind the Evolution of the Crabtree Effect	8
1.6.1	Make-Accumulate-Consume Theory.....	9
1.6.2	Rate/Yield Trade-off	10
1.6.3	Evaluation of Theories.....	12
1.7	Game Theoretical Considerations	13
1.8	Implications	16
1.9	Aims	16
CHAPTER TWO		18
Long Term Experimental Evolution of Yeasts in a High Glucose Environment		18
2.1	Introduction	19
2.2	Experimental Evolution	19
2.3	Experimental Designs	20
2.3.1	Mutation Accumulation and Adaptive Evolution	20
2.3.2	Experimental Evolution Disadvantages	22
2.3.3	Optical Density and Growth Rate and Yield	23
2.4	Aims	24
2.4.1	Predictions.....	24
2.5	Material and Methods	25

2.5.1	Starting Isolates.....	25
2.5.1.1	<i>Kodamaea</i> sp.....	25
2.5.1.2	<i>Issatchenkia</i> sp.....	26
2.5.1.3	<i>Candida railenensis</i>	27
2.5.1.4	<i>Pichia kluyveri</i>	27
2.5.1.5	<i>Kluyveromyces nonfermentans</i>	28
2.5.1.6	<i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i>	28
2.5.1.7	Summary	29
2.5.2	Methods for Experimental Evolution	30
2.5.3	Growth Curves.....	31
2.5.4	Statistical Analysis of Rates and Yields	32
2.6	Results.....	33
2.6.1	Events	33
2.6.2	Yeast Specific Results	34
2.6.2.1	<i>Kodamaea</i> A1.....	34
2.6.2.2	<i>Kodamaea</i> A8.....	35
2.6.2.3	<i>Candida railenensis</i> B3	36
2.6.2.4	<i>Pichia kluyveri</i> B5	38
2.6.2.5	<i>Issatchenkia orientalis</i> C10.....	39
2.6.2.6	<i>Kluyveromyces nonfermentans</i> F8	40
2.6.2.7	<i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i> SCE2	41
2.6.2.8	<i>Issatchenkia</i> A11	42
2.6.3	Summary	44
2.7	Analysis and Conclusions.....	47
CHAPTER THREE.....		50
Tracking Metabolic Changes in Yeasts Using Spectrophotometric Assays.....		50
3.1	Introduction.....	51
3.2	Understanding the Respiro-Fermentative Metabolism	51
3.3	Experimental Designs	52
3.4	Aims	53
3.4.1	Predictions.....	53
3.5	Ethanol	54
3.5.1	Sampling.....	54
3.5.2	Assay.....	55
3.5.3	Analysis.....	56
3.5.4	Experimental Evolution Ethanol	56
3.5.5	In Depth Ethanol.....	58
3.5.6	Summary	61
3.6	Protein Assay.....	61
3.6.1	Methods	62

3.6.1.1	Sample Preparation	62
3.6.1.2	Pierce™ 660nm Protein Assay.....	63
3.6.2	Results	63
3.7	YT MicroPlates GEN II for Yeasts	64
3.7.1	Methods	64
3.7.2	Results	65
3.7.3	Summary	67
3.8	Analysis and Conclusions.....	68
CHAPTER FOUR.....		71
<i>Using Flow Cytometry to Analyse the Physical Changes of the Population and Individual Cells</i>		71
4.1	Introduction.....	72
4.2	Measuring Populations.....	72
4.2.1	Optical Density	72
4.2.2	Flow Cytometry	73
4.2.3	Colony-Forming Units.....	73
4.2.4	Summary	74
4.3	Aims	74
4.3.1	Predictions.....	75
4.4	Methods	75
4.4.1	Sample Preparation for Flow Cytometry.....	75
4.4.2	Colony Forming Units	76
4.4.3	Statistical Analysis of Size and Counts.....	77
4.5	Results.....	77
4.5.1	<i>Kodamaea</i> A1	77
4.5.2	<i>Kodamaea</i> A8	79
4.5.3	<i>Issatchenkia</i> A11.....	80
4.5.4	<i>Candida railenensis</i> B3	81
4.5.5	<i>Pichia kluyveri</i> B5.....	83
4.5.6	<i>Issatchenkia orientalis</i> Kudrvtsev C10	84
4.5.7	<i>Kluyveromyces nonfermentans</i> F8.....	86
4.5.8	<i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i> SCE2.....	87
4.5.9	Summary	88
4.6	Analysis and Conclusions.....	92
CHAPTER FIVE.....		95
<i>Using Flow Cytometry to Analyse the Genetic Content and Fitness of Yeasts.....</i>		95
5.1	Introduction.....	96
5.2	Cell Size and Ploidy.....	96

5.3	Competitive Fitness	97
5.4	Experimental Designs	97
5.5	Aims	98
5.5.1	Predictions.....	99
5.6	Methods	99
5.6.1	DNA Staining.....	99
5.6.2	Cell Tracker	100
5.7	Results	102
5.7.1	DNA Staining and Quantification.....	102
5.7.1.1	<i>Kodamaea</i> A1.....	103
5.7.1.2	<i>Kodamaea</i> A8.....	104
5.7.1.3	<i>Issatchenkia</i> A11	105
5.7.1.4	<i>Candida railenensis</i> B3	107
5.7.1.5	<i>Pichia kluveri</i> B5	108
5.7.1.6	<i>Issatchenkia orientalis</i> Kudravtsev C10	109
5.7.1.7	<i>Kluyveromyces nonfermentans</i> F8	110
5.7.1.8	<i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i> SCE2	111
5.7.1.9	Summary	112
5.7.2	Cell Tracker and Fitness.....	114
5.7.3	Summary	119
5.8	Conclusion	120
CHAPTER SIX		123
Discussion and Synthesis		123
6.1	Introduction	124
6.2	Summary of Findings	124
6.3	Correlation of Results	125
6.4	Review of the Results	130
6.4.1	Relevance to the Field	130
6.4.2	Alternative Explanations	132
6.5	Limitations	132
6.6	Concluding Remarks and Future Research	135
BIBLIOGRAPHY		137
APPENDIX A		156
A.1	Metabolic Capabilities of Yeast Populations	157
A.2	Experimental Evolution Plate Plan	161
A.3	Events Database Visualisation	162

APPENDIX B.....	163
B.1 Biolog Results for Ancestors and Reference Species.	164
B.2 Biolog Results for A1.	165
B.3 Biolog Results for A8.	167
APPENDIX C.....	169
C.1 Yeast Population FSC Against Count.....	170
C.2 FSC to Size Conversion and CFU per 200µl Calculation	178
APPENDIX D.....	179
D.1 DAPI Signal Measurement Output	180
D.2 SYTOX Signal Measurement Output.....	183
D.3 A1 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	186
D.4 A8 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	189
D.5 A11 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	192
D.6 B3 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	195
D.7 B5 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	198
D.8 C10 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	201
D.9 F8 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	204
D.10 SCE2 DAPI and SYTOX Graphical Output and Statistical Output.	207
D.11 Cell Tracker	210

0.4 Abbreviations

ADH	Alcoholic dehydrogenase
ANOVA	Analysis of variance
ATP	Adenosine triphosphate
CFU	Colony-forming units
DAPI	4',6-diamidino-2-phenylindole
DMSO	Dimethyl sulfoxide
DNA	Deoxyribonucleic acid
ESS	Evolutionary stable strategy
FACS	Fluorescence activated cell sorter
FSC	Forward-scattered light
GTP	Guanosine-5'-triphosphate
HPLC	High-performance liquid chromatography
HXT	Hexose transporter
MAC	Make-accumulate-consume
NADH	Nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide
OD	Optical density
PBS	Phosphate-buffered saline
RPM	revolutions per minute
RYT	rate/yield trade-off
SM	synthetic minimal

TCA	Tricarboxylic acid
WGD	Whole genome duplication
YPA	Yeast peptone agar
YPD	Yeast extract peptone dextrose

0.5 List of Figures

Figure 1.1	Yeast Energy Metabolism	3
Figure 1.2	Rock-Paper-Scissors Game	15
Figure 2.1	Adaptive Evolution Experiments	21
Figure 2.4	A1 Evolutionary Changes Across 1500 Generations	35
Figure 2.6	A8 Evolutionary Changes Across 1500 Generations	36
Figure 2.8	B3 Evolutionary Changes Across 1500 Generations	37
Figure 2.10	B5 Evolutionary Changes Across 1500 Generations	38
Figure 2.12	C10 Evolutionary Changes Across 1500 Generations	40
Figure 2.14	F8 Evolutionary Changes Across 1500 Generations	41
Figure 2.16	SCE2 Evolutionary Changes Across 1500 Generations	42
Figure 2.17	Noise Effects Over the Course of the Evolutionary Experiment for all Yeast Lines	43
Figure 2.18	Changes of Rate and Yield from the Ancestor Across all Lines and Yeasts	45
Figure 3.1	Graphs of Each Populations Ethanol Concentration	57
Figure 3.2	Average Change in Ethanol Production (g/L) per Population	59
Figure 3.5	Biolog Results	67
Figure 4.1	<i>Kodamaea</i> A1 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	77
Figure 4.3	<i>Kodamaea</i> A8 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	79
Figure 4.5	<i>Issatchenkia</i> A11 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	80
Figure 4.7	<i>C. railenensis</i> B3 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	82

Figure 4.9	<i>P. kluyveri</i> B5 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	83
Figure 4.11	<i>Issatchenkia</i> C10 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	84
Figure 4.13	<i>K. nonfermentans</i> F8 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	86
Figure 4.15	<i>S. cerevisiae</i> SCE2 relative changes in CFU's, FACS counts and FSC	87
Figure 4.19	Estimated Cell Size Range for all Yeasts	91
Figure 5.2	Cell Tracker Experiment	101
Figure 5.3	Candidate A1 <i>Kodamaea</i> DAPI and SYTOX Stain Density Graphs	102
Figure 5.4	A1 Relative Change	104
Figure 5.5	A8 Relative Change	105
Figure 5.6	A11 Relative Change	106
Figure 5.7	B3 Relative Change	107
Figure 5.8	B5 Relative Change	108
Figure 5.9	C10 Relative Change	109
Figure 5.10	F8 Relative Change	110
Figure 5.11	SCE2 Relative Change	112
Figure 5.13	A8 Cell Tracker Experimental Data	115
Figure 5.14	B5 Cell Tracker Experimental Data	116
Figure 5.15	C10 Cell Tracker Experimental Data	117
Figure 5.16	SCE2 Cell Tracker Experimental Data	118
Figure 6.1	Observed Correlations	127
Figure 6.2	Summary of Relative Change of Evolved Lines of Each Yeast from the Ancestor	129

0.6 List of Tables

Table 2.2	Species Abbreviated Names and Origins	29
Table 2.3	A1 Mixed Effect Model Output	34
Table 2.5	A8 Mixed Effect Model Output	35
Table 2.7	B3 Mixed Effect Model Output	37
Table 2.9	B5 Mixed Effect Model Output	38
Table 2.11	C10 Mixed Effect Model Output	39
Table 2.13	F8 Mixed Effect Model Output	40
Table 2.15	SCE2 Mixed Effect Model Output	41
Table 2.19	Binomial Test Results	46
Table 2.20	Species Specific Binomial Tests	47
Table 3.3	Statistical Significance of Changes of Ethanol Concentration over 24 Hours	60
Table 3.4	Protein Content for Ancestor and Evolved in $\mu\text{g}/\text{ml}$	63
Table 4.2	A1 statistical analysis.	78
Table 4.4	A8 statistical analysis.	80
Table 4.6	A11 statistical analysis.	81
Table 4.8	B3 statistical analysis.	82
Table 4.10	B5 statistical analysis.	84
Table 4.12	C10 statistical analysis.	85
Table 4.14	F8 statistical analysis.	87
Table 4.16	SCE2 statistical analysis.	88

Table 4.17	Binomial Analysis for Counts and Size Results	89
Table 4.18	Binomial Analysis Individually for FSC	90
Table 5.1	Cell Tracker Stock Solutions	100
Table 5.12	Binomial Statistical Outcome for all Populations	113