An Economic Analysis of Dietary Diversification in the Developing World

By Samira Choudhury

THESIS

Submitted to the University of Adelaide

In partial fulfilment of the

requirement for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in Economics

November 2017

Table of Contents

Abstra	ct	IV
Declar	ration	VIII
Dedica	ation	IX
Ackno	wledgements	X
Statem	nent of Contributions	XIII
List of	Tables	XIX
	Figures	
List Oi	1 iguies	
Chapt	er 1: Introduction	
1.1	Literature Review	3
1.2	Research questions	13
1.3	Thesis outline	14
Refe	erences	16
Chapt	er 2: What drives Diversification of National Food Supplies?	
A Cros	ss-Country Analysis	28
Ahst	tract	20
2.1	Introduction	
2.2	Literature review	
2.3	Data and methods	
2.4	Descriptive results	54
2.5	Regression results	59
2.6	Robustness tests	63
2.7	Conclusions	68
Refe	erences	71
App	endix: Supplementary Table	86

Chapter	3: So	cio-e	conomi	c and	l geogra	phical	dete	rminan	ts of	dietary
I										J

sity among pre-school children in 39 countries	88
tract	89
Introduction	90
Literature review	93
Data	101
Methods	
Results	
Robustness Tests	128
Conclusions	
erences	
pendix	
ter 4: Household dairy production and child growth:	162
tract	163
Introduction	
Previous literature	169
Data and methods	178
Descriptive results	
Regression results	
Extensions	
Conclusions	
erences	208
pendix A: Additional descriptive statistics	220
ter 5: Conclusion	222
references cited in thesis	226
t i t	Introduction

Abstract

Child undernutrition, including micronutrient deficiency, is widespread in many parts of the developing world. Low dietary diversity is a major source of this problem. This occurs where diets are predominantly based on starchy staples with few fruits, vegetables and animal-sourced foods. Improving children's diets is therefore an important step towards solving the nutrition problem in low-income settings and reducing its debilitating symptoms such as stunting.

Despite the importance that nutritionists attach to early childhood dietary diversification, very little research has focused on the key question of how dietary diversification can be accelerated. Chapter 1 reviews an extensive multi-disciplinary literature on dietary diversification that nevertheless fails to systematically address the multidimensional drivers of diversification, particularly in low-income settings. This thesis aims to fill this knowledge gap by investigating factors that drive dietary diversification at a national level (Chapter 2) and at an individual child level (Chapter 3). Chapter 4 sheds light on the nutritional impacts of dietary diversification specifically in the context of dairy, a food group widely perceived to be especially critical for child growth (Chapter 4).

Chapter 2 of the thesis investigates the economic, social and agro-ecological indicators that drive dietary diversification of national food supplies (DFS) over time across countries and regions. The traditional economic view, stemming from Bennett (1944), is that economic growth is the major driver of the diversification of food supplies, but meso- and micro-level work point to many other drivers, and to potential agro-ecological constraints to diversification. This chapter addresses those questions through a cross-country analysis linking a simple measure of diversity of food supply (the share of calories supplied by non-staple foods) with various economic, social

and agro-ecological indicators. Using panel regression models, the analysis shows that while economic growth and other indicators of structural transformation (urbanisation and demographic change) explain changes in DFS within countries, time-invariant agro-ecological indicators also are significantly associated with DFS. In short, broader structural transformation processes do appear to drive diversification, but some countries face retarded diversification because of specific agro-ecological constraints as well.

In contrast to the global view on diversification in Chapter 2, Chapter 3 investigates the determinants of child dietary diversity specifically among pre-school children. Pre-schoolers are a crucial demographic, because most growth faltering occurs between 6 and 23 months of age. This chapter tests the various hypotheses emerging from the economics and nutrition literature by linking Demographic and Health Survey (DHS) data on child dietary diversity to household socioeconomic characteristics with community level indicators of climate and infrastructure. Using non-parametric and parametric regression models, the findings uncover strong support for linear effects of household wealth (again, in keeping with Bennett's Law) but also large and nonlinear associations with parental education, access to health services, infrastructure and climate, and modest associations with an indicator of women's empowerment.

Chapter 4 tests the importance of cow ownership for child growth in rural Bangladesh. Bangladesh is a country with unusually low levels of milk consumption by international standards and very high rates of undernutrition. Unlike previous papers in the literature, this chapter introduces a novel placebo test by distinguishing between lactating dairy cows that have produced milk over the past 12 months and those that have not. Using a rich nationally representative rural household survey,

the results show a robust positive association between ownership of lactating cows and child growth among young children (6-23 months). The empirical analysis also reveals an unusual positive association between ownership of lactating cows and wasting, and some evidence that household dairy production is associated with reduced rates of breastfeeding in the first 12 months of life. In short, the apparent linear growth benefits of increased household milk availability are qualified by adverse breastfeeding outcomes and a disconcerting association with child wasting. Efforts to promote increased dairy consumption arguably should be accompanied by interventions to improve nutritional knowledge and emphasize exclusive breastfeeding in early life.

The findings of this thesis have important implications for food and nutrition strategies that aspire to accelerate dietary diversification. Chapter 5 points to the results providing evidence that the impact of economic growth on dietary diversification is moderately strong; growth alone would yield only modest diversification without accompanying improvements in parental education, health infrastructure, physical infrastructure and broader demographic transformations. Reassuringly for the nutritionists, the results often suggest that nutritional knowledge may indeed be a critical determinant of dietary diversity, and one partly shaped by exposure to formal education and basic health services. However, more research is needed to determine how best to improve nutritional knowledge cost-effectively, and at scale. The demonstrated importance of agro-climatic and infrastructural constraints also provides support for the separability hypothesis. Resolving the problem of poor diets, especially in rural areas, will likely require significant investments in making markets more effective in delivering a diverse and affordable array of foods. More research is needed to determine how much more of such specific investments are needed to improve rural diets in particular settings.

Key words: Dietary diversity; Undernutrition; Child diets; Agriculture; Livestock; Dairy production; Animal-sourced foods

Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material that has been accepted for the award of any other degree

or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my

knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person,

except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work

will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any

university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and,

where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University library, being made

available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published work contained within the thesis (as listed

below) resides with the copyright holders of those works.

Choudhury, S. & Headey, D., 2017, 'What drives diversification of national food

supplies? A cross-country analysis', Global Food Security,

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.gfs.2017.05.005

I give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the

University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines,

unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed:

Data: <u>21/11/2017</u>

viii

Dedication

To my late mother, Samina Farhad Chowdhury

Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the support given by several people and organizations. It is certainly not easy to single out and thank everyone who matters. I genuinely hope I will not have missed anyone.

When I first started my PhD, the learning curve was much steeper than I had anticipated. All PhD candidates, more or less, go through various "crises" during their enrolled years. For me, most of the "crises" occurred early on and my external supervisor, Dr. Derek Headey, bore the brunt of it. Derek, it has been an honour to be your first PhD student and I genuinely cannot thank you enough for the time and the effort you put in (including prompt replies to my innumerable emails and providing detailed comments and suggestions on several drafts of my chapters). Thank you for believing in me because, without your guidance and positive encouragement, this thesis would not have come to fruition. Also, thank you for being a coauthor in several papers.

My sincere acknowledgement goes to my principal supervisor, Professor Kym Anderson for giving me valuable advice, good guidance and constant encouragement during the development of this thesis. Professor Anderson, I would like to thank you wholeheartedly for being such a positive inspiration throughout this long journey and especially during my difficult periods. To my co-supervisor, Dr. Terence Cheng, thank you for your support and helpful comments throughout the period of writing my thesis. I would also like to thank Professor William Masters for his support and his persistent confidence in me when writing Chapter 3 of my thesis and for being a co-author in this chapter. To the post-graduate supervisor, Dr. Stephanie McWhinnie, thank you for your support and giving me the opportunity to work as a teaching assistant in your courses. I have learned so much from you. I am grateful to the

previous post-graduate supervisor, Dr. Nicholas Sim, for his many helpful discussions and suggestions.

I would also like to thank IFPRI staff, and particularly Dr. Akhter Ahmed, Wahid Quabili, Esha Sraboni, Nusrat Hossain, Salauddin Tauseef, Aminul Islam and Shafiqul Karim, for sharing their data and providing excellent research assistance and support. My sincere gratitude goes to Dr. Akhter Ahmed, Dr. Ricardo Hernandez, Dr. Kaikaus Ahmad, Dr. Ferdousi Nahar, Dr. Julie Litchfield (my Master's dissertation supervisor), Professor Andy McKay and Professor Elia Kacapyr (my Bachelor's dissertation supervisor) for their support and encouragement, without which I might have never undertaken PhD studies.

On the financial side, I am extremely grateful for support from IFPRI and the School of Economics at Adelaide, as well as the support I have received for my research through the provision of an Australian Government Research Training Program Scholarship.

On a personal note, a big thanks also to my friends at the School of Economics, Wenxiao Wang, Kim Wu, Qazi Haque, Dessie Ambaw, Habtamu Tesfaye, Akwasi Ampofo, Weidong Liang, Farhana Abedin and Rafiqul Islam for supporting me. I am lucky to have met Aditi Roy here. Thank you for your friendship and always being there for me. I am deeply indebted to my father, Anam Chowdhury, for the tremendous sacrifices that he made to ensure that I had an excellent education: thank you for your continuous prayers and unconditional love. Thank you to my childhood best friend, Antora Anowar-Kamal for being the closest to me even when we were in separate time zones and being genuinely concerned with the outcome of my life and always listening, even when you're tired. A special thanks to my friend Aftab Rafiuddin for believing in me when I was too weak and exhausted to believe in myself. Thank you for always knowing who I am and reminding me of that when I forget. I could not have survived the last few years without

your help. Finally, to my pets Titan, Io (dogs) and Adele (cat), thank you for giving me the best years of my life.

Statement of Contributions

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Chapter 2: 'What drives Diversification of National Food Supplies? A Cross-Country Analysis'	
Publication Status	 ✓ Published ✓ Accepted for Publication ✓ Submitted for Publication ✓ Unpublished and Unsubmitted work written in manuscript style 	
Publication Details	Global Food Security: May 2017 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gfs.2017.05.005	

Principal Author

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	al Author Samira Choudhury				
Contribution to the Paper	Contributed to the planning of the article and the methodology, undertook literature review, collected and constructed data, performed analysis, interpreted the results, wrote the manuscript.				
Overall percentage (%)	75%				
Certification:	This paper reports on original research I conduling by Research candidature and is not subject to with a third party that would constrain its inclusion this paper.	any oblig	ations or contractual agreements		
Signature		Date	30/08/2017		

Co-Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that:

- i. the candidate's stated contribution to the publication is accurate (as detailed above);
- ii. permission is granted for the candidate in include the publication in the thesis; and
- iii. the sum of all co-author contributions is equal to 100% less the candidate's stated contribution.

Name of Co-Author	Derek Headey			
Contribution to the Paper	Assisted with study design; prescribed rea suggestions.	dings; pr	rovided editorial comment:	s and
Signature		Date	30/8/2017	

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Chapter 3: 'Socio-economic and geographical determinants of dietary diversity among preschool children in 39 countries'	
Publication Status	☐ Published ☐ Submitted for Publication ☐ Unpublished and Unsubmitted we manuscript style	Accepted for Publication
Publication Details		

Principal Author

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Samira Choudhury		
Contribution to the Paper	Contributed to the planning of the article and the methodology, undertook literature review, collected and constructed data, performed analysis, interpreted the results, wrote the manuscript.		
Overall percentage (%)	75%		
Certification:	This paper reports on original research I conduby Research candidature and is not subject to with a third party that would constrain its inclusion this paper.	any oblig	ations or contractual agreements
Signature		Date	30/08/2017

Co-Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that:

- i. the candidate's stated contribution to the publication is accurate (as detailed above);
- ii. permission is granted for the candidate in include the publication in the thesis; and
- iii. the sum of all co-author contributions is equal to 100% less the candidate's stated contribution.

Name of Co-Author	Derek Headey				
Contribution to the Paper	Assisted with study design; prescribed reasuggestions.	dings; p	rovided editorial	comments	and
Signature		Date	30/8/2017		

Name of Co-Author	William Masters		
Contribution to the Paper	Advice on hypotheses and regression specifications.		
Signature		Date	30 Aug. 2017

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Chapter 4: 'Household dairy production and child growth: Evidence from rural Bangladesh'
Publication Status	□ Published □ Accepted for Publication □ Submitted for Publication □ Unpublished and Unsubmitted work written in manuscript style
Publication Details	

Principal Author

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Samira Choudhury		
Contribution to the Paper	Contributed to the planning of the article and the methodology, undertook literature review, collected and constructed data, performed analysis, interpreted the results, wrote the manuscript.		
Overall percentage (%)	75%		
Certification:	This paper reports on original research I conducted during the period of my Higher Degree by Research candidature and is not subject to any obligations or contractual agreements with a third party that would constrain its inclusion in this thesis. I am the primary author of this paper.		
Signature	Date 30/08/2017		

Co-Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that:

- i. the candidate's stated contribution to the publication is accurate (as detailed above);
- ii. permission is granted for the candidate in include the publication in the thesis; and
- iii. the sum of all co-author contributions is equal to 100% less the candidate's stated contribution.

Name of Co-Author	Derek Headey		
Contribution to the Paper	Assisted with study design and statistical coocomments and suggestions.	les; presc	ribed readings; provided editorial
Signature		Date	30/8/2017

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Definitions of variables	50
Table 2.2 Descriptive statistics for key variables	52
Table 2.3 Trends in calories supply from non-staples for income groups, major regions and	
countries, 1961-2010	57
Table 2.4 CRE and fixed effects regressions of the semi-log DFS model	61
Table 2.5 Decomposing sources of DFS change for the full sample, 1961–2010	63
Table 2.6 CRE and fixed effects regressions of the semi-log DFS model using alternative	
indicator of diversity of food supply: protein share of ASF	65
Table 2.7 Fixed effects regressions of the semi-log DFS model using an alternative indicator of	
education	66
Table 2.9 Fixed effects regressions of the semi-log DFS model using alternative indicators of	
agricultural and trade policies	68
Table 3.1 Descriptive statistics	06
Table 3.2 Dietary diversity by child age (6-23 months, 6-11 months and 12-23 months)	26
Table 3.3 Wealth interactions for children 12-23 months of age	28
Table 3.4 Extensions to the use of a 7 food group indicator and a dummy variable of 4 or more	of
the 7 food groups rather than a 12-group indicator for children 6-23 months	29
Table 3.5 Dietary diversity (12 food groups) for children 12-23 months with disaggregated heal	th
variables1	31
Table 3.6 Dietary diversity (12 food groups) for children 12-23 months excluding GIS indicator	rs
1	33

Table 3.7 Dietary diversity (12 food groups) for children 12-23 months excluding socio-
economic determinants
Table 3.8 Testing heterogeneity of Dietary diversity (12 food groups) results for children 12-23
months across major regions
Table 4.1 Descriptive statistics of key variables for children 6–59 months
Table 4.2 Prevalence and levels of 24-hour recall of cow milk consumption by cow ownership
and milk production status, with t-tests of differences in group means ¹
Table 4.3 Association between HAZ scores and livestock ownership, by age groups 6-23 and 24-
59 months
Table 4.4 Association between HAZ scores and livestock ownership, by age groups 6-23 and 24-
59 months
Table 4.5 Association between WHZ scores and livestock ownership, by age groups 6–23 and
24–59 months
Table 4.6 Association between WHZ scores and livestock ownership, by age groups 6–23 and
24-59 months
Table 4.7 Association between livestock ownership and dairy consumption in the last 24 hours
among children 6-59 months

List of Figures

Figure 2.1 Calories supplied from non-staples across countries, 2010
Figure 2.2 Calories per capita and household income per capita
Figure 2.3 Calories supplied from non-staples and household consumption per capita 59
Figure 3.1 Distribution of the dietary diversity indicator (12 food groups)
Figure 3.2 Patterns of growth faltering and anemia by child's age (months)
Figure 3.3 Nonparametric estimates of the relationship between child dietary diversity score (12
food groups) and the raw wealth index scores
Figure 3.4 Nonparametric estimates of the relationship between child dietary diversity score (12
food groups) and years of education (mothers)
Figure 3.5 Nonparametric estimates of the relationship between child dietary diversity score (12
food groups) and years of education (fathers)
Figure 3.6 Nonparametric estimates of the relationship between child dietary diversity score (12
food groups) and GIS indicators
Figure 3.7 Nonparametric estimates of the relationship between child dietary diversity score (12
food groups) and child's age (months) by wealth quintiles
Figure 4.1 T-tests for differences in mean HAZ (Panel A) and WHZ (Panel B) scores associated
with household milk production in the past 12 months, for pre-school children
Figure 4.2 An lpoly graph of breastfeeding status by child age for households that have and have
not produced dairy

Figure 4.3 An lpoly graph of individual calorie intake (kcal) in past 24 hours by child age for	
households that have and have not produced dairy	. 203