INTERNATIONAL MICROBIOLOGY (2010) 13:195-206 DOI: 10.2436/20.1501.01.126 ISSN: 1139-6709 www.im.microbios.org

# Selection of a biocontrol agent based on a potential mechanism of action: degradation of nicotinic acid, a growth factor essential for *Erwinia amylovora*

# Thomas Paternoster,<sup>1,2</sup> Geneviève Défago,<sup>1</sup> Brion Duffy,<sup>3</sup> Cesare Gessler,<sup>1\*</sup> Ilaria Pertot<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Plant Pathology, Institute of Integrative Biology (IBZ), ETH Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland. <sup>2</sup>IASMA Research and Innovation Center, Fondazione Edmund Mach, S. Michele all'Adige (TN), Italy. <sup>3</sup>Agroscope Changins-Wädenswil, Plant Protection Division, National Competence Center for Fire Blight, Wädenswil, Switzerland

Received 16 November 2010 · Accepted 27 December 2010

**Summary.** This work describes a medium-based screening method for selecting microbial biocontrol agents against *Erwinia amylovora* based on the degradation of a specific growth factor. *Erwinia amylovora*, the causal agent of the devastating fire blight disease, requires nicotinic acid or nicotinamide as an essential growth factor. Potential biocontrol agents are either selected for antimicrobial production in plate or directly on immature pears or apple blossoms. In this work, we have attempted to streamline the selection of a new potential biocontrol agent with a lower risk of non-target effects by isolation based on the ability to degrade nicotinic acid in vitro, using therefore few plant materials. A total of 735 bacteria and 1237 yeast were isolated from apple blossoms and pre-screened for nicotinic acid-degradation. *Pseudomonas rhizosphaerae* strain JAN was able to degrade both nicotinic acid and nicotinamide. Mutants deficient in this ability were constructed. JAN, but not the mutants, controlled *E. amylovora* on pear slices. On detached apple blossoms, JAN colonized apple hypanthia and strongly suppressed *E. amylovora* growth. Under greenhouse conditions, JAN was more effective in controlling blossom blight than *P. fluorescens* A506, a commercial biocontrol agent of fire blight unable to degrade nicotinic acid and nicotinamide. **[Int Microbiol** 2010; 13(4):195-206]

Keywords: Erwinia amylovora · Pseudomonas rhizosphaerae · fire blight · biological control · ntrB, ntrC genes

# Introduction

The gram-negative bacterium *Erwinia amylovora* is the causal agent of fire blight, a disease affecting several species of the *Rosaceae* family. This disease is found in most of the

\*Corresponding author: C. Gessler Plant Pathology, Institute of Integrative Biology Swiss Federal Institute of Technology Universitätstrasse 2. CH-8092 Zurich, Switzerland Tel. +41-446323871. Fax +41-446321572 E-mail: cesare.gessler@agrl.ethz.ch

This article contains supplementary information online, consisting of two tables (Tables S1 and S2), at the journal website [www.im.microbios.org].

temperate regions of the world and can cause significant losses in important crops, such as apple (*Malus* × *domestica* Borkh.) and pear (*Pyrus communis* L.) [32]. Fire blight can affect all aerial parts of the plant, but blossoms are the most important site of infection for epidemic blossom blight. On blossoms, *E. amylovora* reaches the hypanthium—the cupshaped structure, typical of Rosaceae and other few plant families, on which the sepals, petals and stamens are born after an epiphytic phase on the stigma. Infection via nectarthodes—the opening at the base of the flower from which nectar exudes—in the hypanthium occurs when a large bacterial population and suitable environmental conditions (high relative humidity and/or rain) are present [30]. Expensive exclusion measures (quarantine) are commonly used to limit the spread of the disease, but when they are not successful and the pathogen becomes established, control can only rely on the application of antibiotics, prohibited in several countries, or on the use of copper and resistance inducers that control the disease only partially [32]. The use of microbial antagonists against *E. amylovora* is an alternative or complementary measure to the application of antibiotics [24]. Few species, mainly *Pseudomonas fluorescens* [4,34], *Pantoea agglomerans* (synonym *Erwinia herbicola*) [9,31,37] and *Bacillus subtilis* [2], are active against *E. amylovora*, and only very few isolates have been developed for field application [2,6,35].

To date, the selection of biological control agents against fire blight has been based either on the massive screening for efficacy of numerous isolates on immature pear fruit and/or apple stigma [4,25] or on screening for inhibition on artificial media [1,23,36]. These screening procedures, however, have the disadvantage of either being extremely time-consuming and subjected to the availability of blossoms and fruits or selecting for biocontrol agents able to produce antimicrobial compounds and therefore potentially having a higher risk of non-target effects.

*Erwinia amylovora* requires nicotinic acid (NiAc), nicotinamide (NiNH<sub>2</sub>) and/or 6-hydroxynicotinic acid (6-HNiAc) as an essential growth factor when cultured on minimal medium in the laboratory [21,29]. NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub>, but not 6-HNiAc, are present on the hypanthia of apple and pear blossoms [21]. The need for NiAc is not common in the *Erwinia* genus, and it has been proposed as a biochemical test for the identification of *E. amylovora* [7]. The selection of microorganisms that do not produce inhibitory compounds and can compete with *E. amylovora* for NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> could therefore represent an innovative method to select new biocontrol agents for the control of the disease with low risk of non-target effects.

The aim of our study was to develop a medium-based screening approach in which the ability of microorganisms to degrade NiAc (essential growth factor) would be the main criterion for the selection of a biocontrol agent candidate against *E. amylovora*. This approach consisted of an initial mass isolation of microorganisms from apple blossoms (microorganisms presumably well suited to the blossom environment), the selective screening on minimal medium of the NiAc-degraders, and the further selection of those most suitable for mass cultivation (quickly growing on the medium). For the selected microorganism, NiNH<sub>2</sub> degradation and the in vitro inhibition of *E. amylovora* through NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> degradation was assessed. Production of antimicrobial compounds active against *E. amylovora* was evaluated.

Biocontrol efficacy was evaluated on immature pear fruit slices, on detached apple blossoms and on apple trees maintained under controlled greenhouse conditions.

# Materials and methods

Isolation of epiphytic microorganisms from apple blossoms. Microorganisms were collected from three orchards, two located in Switzerland (St. Gallen, 43 samples; and Wädenswil, 100 samples) and one in northern Italy (Trento, 24 samples). Each sample was obtained by submerging the stigmas and styles of five randomly collected blossoms in 1.5 ml sterile saline solution (0.9% NaCl) in Eppendorf tubes and rotating them to dislodge the microorganisms. Serial decimal dilutions were prepared and plated on diluted (10%) tryptic soy agar (TSA; Difco, Detroit, MI, USA) and on potato dextrose agar (PDA; Difco) supplemented with kanamycin sulphate (50 µg/ml; Fluka, Buchs, Switzerland), to isolate bacteria and yeasts, respectively. After three days of incubation at 24°C, samples of individual colonies (at least one for each different colony morphology observed in each sample) were selected and transferred to 96-well microtiter plates, where they were cultured on diluted (10%) tryptic soy (TS, Difco) or potato dextrose broth (PDB; Difco). After two days of incubation at 24°C, sterile glycerol (AppliChem, Darmstadt, Germany) was added (30% of the final volume) to the wells and the plates were transferred to a freezer (-80°C) for storage.

Selective screening of quick-growing, NiAc-degrading microorganisms and evaluation of their activity against E. amylovora. We used a modified version of the method described by Wang et al. [33] to select microorganisms capable of degrading NiAc. A DF-NiAc salt minimal medium (pH = 6.0) was prepared, in which NiAc was added as the only N-source to DF salt minimal medium [5] to a final concentration of 2 mM. Isolates were transferred from the 96-well microtiter plates to DF-NiAc agar in Petri dishes in a  $6 \times 8$  pattern suitable for replica plating, and incubated at 18°C for three days. The 12 best-growing isolates (those whose colonies had the largest diameters) were selected and tested for their ability to degrade NiNH<sub>2</sub> on DF salt minimal medium and to control E. amylovora in a pear-slice assay. We used a modified version of the immature pear-slice assay described by Kearns and Hale [10]. Immature pears (cv. Conference) with diameters of 2-3 cm were harvested in Valais, Switzerland, during the first week of June. The pears were surface-disinfected (10 min immersion in 1% sodium hypochlorite, Fluka), washed three times in sterile distilled water, dried, and stored at 3°C in sealed plastic bags. Before use, pear fruits were surface sterilized with 70% ethanol and left to dry in a sterile hood. The 12 best-growing isolates were grown on TSA for 48 h at 18°C, gently scraped from the surface of the media, washed twice in 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer, and then resuspended in 1.5 ml of 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer. Bacterial suspensions at concentration 10<sup>6</sup> colony forming units (CFU)/ml were prepared. The pears were cut into 3 mm-thick slices and dipped in the bacterial suspensions for 10 s. Potassium phosphate buffer (0.1 M) was used in the untreated control. Five pear slices were placed in each sealed Petri dish on wet, sterile filter paper. After 24 h of incubation at 18°C with a 16-h photoperiod, the slices were inoculated with 10 µl of a 106 CFU/ml E. amylovora suspension and the Petri dishes were incubated at 18°C. Disease incidence, expressed as percentage of infected slices, was periodically assessed based on the appearance of bacterial exudate droplets on the slice surface. The efficacy of control was calculated using the following equation:

#### Efficacy (%) = $[(A-B)/A] \times 100$

where A is the incidence of disease on the pear slice samples pre-treated with 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer and B is the incidence of disease on the pear slices pre-treated with the biocontrol agent. Biocontrol efficacies were

evaluated 12 days after *E. amylovora* inoculation. Three independent experiments were carried out and each experiment included two replicates of five slices per each treatment.

Based on the results of this evaluation process, JAN was selected as the most effective microorganism against *E. amylovora* and subjected to further investigations.

Identification of the NiAc-degrading strain JAN. Total genomic DNA was extracted from an overnight suspension of JAN in 10% TS using the Wizard Genomic DNA Purification Kit (Promega, Madison, WI, USA) according to the manufacturer's instructions. A portion of the 16S rRNA gene was amplified with R1n and 1488r primers [11]. The PCR reaction mixture (20  $\mu$ l) consisted of 1 × PCR buffer (Amersham Biosciences, Piscataway, NJ, USA) containing 100 µM of each dNTP (Amersham Biosciences), 0.20 µM of each primer, 0.07 U/µl Taq polymerase (New England Biolabs, Beverly, MA, USA) and approximately 200 pg of the extracted genomic DNA. After an initial denaturation step of 5 min at 94°C, there were 35 cycles of 40 s at 94°C, 1 min at 55°C, and 1 min at 72°C, followed by a final elongation step of 10 min at 72°C. The amplification was performed in a PTC-100 thermal cycler (MJ Research, Waltham, MA, USA). The PCR amplicon was purified from the PCR mix using the Wizard SV Gel and PCR Clean-up System purification kit (Promega), suspended in 50 µl bidistilled water, and visually quantified on agarose gel (Sigma-Aldrich, Steinheim, Germany). Sequencing was performed with an ABI PRISM 3100 Genetic Analyzer (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA), using the ABI PRISM BigDye Terminator 3.1 ready reaction cycle sequencing kit (Applied Biosystems), according to the manufacturer's instructions.

The homology of the amplicon was evaluated using the BLASTN software provided by NCBI [http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/]. 16S rRNA gene sequences of JAN and of representative species of the genus *Pseudomonas* [obtained from the Ribosomal Database Project II, http://rdp.cme.msu.edu] were aligned with ClustalW implemented in the BioEdit software [http://www.mbio.ncsu.edu/BioEdit/BioEdit.html] and a phylogenetic tree was constructed using the unrooted neighbor-joining method implemented in the MEGA 4 software package [http://www.megasoftware.net].

Production of antimicrobial compounds against E. amylovora and in vitro inhibition of E. amylovora growth linked to NiAc degradation. The pathogen strain used in this and the following experiments was E. amylovora CFBP 1430 [20]. Assays based on pear diffusion juice were used. The pear diffusion juice was obtained using immature pear (cv. Conference) slices cut (3 mm-thick) from surface sterilized pears under aseptic conditions. To avoid problems of oxidation, the slices were immediately dipped into a Petri dish filled with cold (3°C) sterile Millipore water (Millipore, Bedford, MA, USA) and peeled. Twenty-five slices (corresponding to about 30 g) were immersed in 300-ml Erlenmeyer flasks containing 100 ml cold sterile Millipore water, and incubated for 24 h at 3°C (without shaking). The resulting solution (pear diffusion juice) was sterile filtrated with a 0.22 µm polycarbonate filter (Millipore). The pear diffusion juice (50 ml) was inoculated with 500 µl of a suspension of JAN (10<sup>8</sup> CFU/ml) in 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer and incubated with agitation (150 rpm) at 18°C until stationary phase was reached (about 36 h after inoculation). Cell-free supernatant was obtained by centrifugation at 4000 rpm for 5 min using an ALC multispeed refrigerated centrifuge PK121R (A-M10 rotor) (ALC, Milan, Italy), followed by sterile filtration.

To assess the production of antimicrobial compounds against *E. amy-lovora* by JAN, an overnight culture of *E. amylovora* was mixed with 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer to form a suspension with an optical density at 600 nm (OD<sub>600</sub>) of 0.4 (corresponding to about 10<sup>9</sup> CFU/ml). OD<sub>600</sub> was measured with a Genova spectrophotometer (Jenway, Dunmow, UK). Five-ml aliquots of a 1:1 mixture of JAN cell-free supernatant (pH = 7.9) and pear diffusion juice (pH = 6.7) were transferred into Falcon tubes (BD Biosciences) and inoculated with 50 µl of *E. amylovora* suspension prepared

as described above. As a control, 5-ml aliquots of a 1:1 mixture of Millipore water and pear diffusion juice were inoculated with *E. amylovora* as described above. The samples were incubated for one day at 27°C, with agitation (150 rpm). *E. amylovora* growth was then determined by measuring the OD<sub>600</sub> values of the samples. Three independent experiments were carried out and each experiment included four replicates of each treatment (one Falcon tube = one replicate).

To evaluate the capacity of JAN to inhibit *E. amylovora* growth through NiAc degradation, we eliminated traces of NiAc from the *E. amylovora* inoculum by incubating the bacterium overnight at 22°C, with agitation (150 rpm), in M9 minimal medium [27] supplemented with 0.01% thiamine-hydrochloride (Fluka). This *E. amylovora* suspension was diluted in 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer to a final OD<sub>600</sub> of 0.4. Then, 50 µl were used to inoculate 5 ml of a solution composed of JAN cell-free supernatant (prepared as described above) mixed (1:1) with M9 media with and without NiAc (0.01%). The control treatments were M9 media mixed (1:1) with pear diffusion juice, and M9 media with and without NiAc mixed (1:1) with M9 media water. The pH levels of all media were adjusted to 7.0. After 40 h of incubation at 22°C, with agitation (150 rpm), *E. amylovora* growth was determined by measuring the OD<sub>600</sub>. Three independent experiments were carried out and each experiment included four replicates of each treatment (one Falcon tube = one replicate).

Construction and characterization of NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> degrading-deficient mutants of JAN. JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, a spontaneous antibiotic-resistant derivative of JAN, was used as recipient strain in the mutagenesis. JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> was obtained by plating 100  $\mu$ l of highly concentrated bacterial solutions (approximately 10<sup>10</sup> CFU/ml) on LB agar plates supplemented with 100  $\mu$ g/ml rifampicin. No significant differences in the growth on the DF-NiAc salt medium and in biocontrol efficacy were observed between JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> and JAN.

JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> was mutagenized by insertion of transposon Tn5 in a biparental mating with E. coli BW20767/pRL27. Donor strain and JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> were grown overnight at respectively 37 and 27°C in LB medium added with kanamycin (25 µg/ml) and rifampicin (100 µg/ml), respectively. Each culture (1.5 ml) was pelleted by centrifugation (at 6000 rpm), washed three times with sterile saline solution (0.9% NaCl) and mixed at a ratio 1:1 and then collected by centrifugation (6000 rpm for 10 min). The cells were suspended in 50 µl of sterile saline solution, placed as single droplets on LB agar plates, incubated at 33°C for 5 h and suspended in 1 ml of saline solution. Transposon insertion mutants were selected after serial dilution on plates of DF salt minimal agar medium containing 2 mM of NH4Cl, 100 µg/ml of rifampicin and 25 µg/ml of kanamycin. After 2-3 days of incubation at 27°C, single JAN mutant colonies were picked and transferred to 96-well microtiter plates (Greiner Bio-One, Frickenhausen, Germany) containing 200 µl of DF salt minimal medium added with 2 mM of NH<sub>4</sub>Cl and 25 µg/ml of kanamycin in each well. Plates were incubated at 27°C for two days and 100 µl of glycerol were added before storage at -80°C.

Mutants were screened and selected based on the inability to grow on DF agar plates containing 2 mM of NiAc as the only N-source at 18°C. DF salt minimal medium added with the same amount of NH<sub>4</sub>Cl was used as control. The cloning of the transposon insertions was performed as reported in Larsen et al. [14], but using *E. coli* S17-1/ $\lambda pir$  strain for the replication of the circularized fragment and only the outward-directed transposon-directed primer tnpRL17-1 for the sequencing.

The ability to utilize NiAc or NiNH<sub>2</sub> as the only N-source was tested for JAN, JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, and the two selected mutants M3G7 and M40E5 on DF agar minimal medium. Traces of these compounds from the bacterial inocula were eliminated as described above for *E. amylovora*. The overnight cultures were then diluted with fresh M9 minimal medium to reach an OD<sub>600</sub> of 0.350 corresponding to about  $6 \times 10^7$  CFU/ml. For each strain, 2 µl of the prepared suspension was added onto DF agar plates containing 2 mM of NiAc or NiNH<sub>2</sub> as the only N-source. Then, DF agar plates containing 2 mM of

NH<sub>4</sub>Cl or without any N-source were used as positive and negative control, respectively. After 4 days of incubation at 18°C, the colonies were cut out together with the agar medium underneath the colony with a 10-mm cork borer and the plug inserted in a 2-ml Eppendorf tube containing 1 ml of 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer. Cells were resuspended by vortexing for 20 s and then the OD<sub>600</sub> of the bacterial suspensions measured with an Ultrospec 3300 pro spectrophotometer (Amersham Pharmacia Biotech, Piscataway, NJ, USA). The experiment was carried out twice.

Mutants (M3G7 and M40E5) biocontrol efficacy was assessed in the immature pear-slice assay as described above. Slices were treated with JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, M3G7 and M40E5 suspensions at concentration 10<sup>6</sup> CFU/ml, and biocontrol efficacies were evaluated 6 days after *E. amylovora* inoculation. Two independent experiments were carried out and each experiment included two replicates of five slices per each treatment. Populations of JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, M3G7 and M40E5 on the immature pear slices were evaluated after 1, 24 and 90 h of incubation. One plug per slice was excised using a 6-mm-diameter cork borer. Each excised plug was immediately placed in a sterile Eppendorf tube containing 1 ml of sterile saline solution. After vigorous vortexing for 20 s, decimal serial dilutions were prepared and plated on LB added with 100 µg/ml of rifampicin. The plates were incubated at 18°C, bacterial colonies in the appropriate dilution counted and the number of cultivable cells per square centimeter calculated. Four slices per treatment per experiment were used. The experiment was carried out twice.

**Efficacy against** *E. amylovora* on pear slices. The immature pear-slice assay was used to compare JAN with the biocontrol agent *P. fluorescens* A506 (A506) [15], which is a commercial biocontrol agent of fire blight (BlightBan<sup>®</sup> A506) unable to degrade NiAc, and with *P. fluorescens* TN5 (TN5), a NiAc-degrading strain already described in literature [8,18] that had never been tested for activity against fire blight. The assay was performed as described above. Pear slices were dipped into JAN, A506 and TN5 suspensions at three different concentrations ( $10^5$ ,  $10^6$  or  $10^7$  CFU/ml). Biocontrol efficacies were evaluated at days 7, 9 and 12 after *E. amylovora* inoculation. Three independent experiments were carried out and each experiment included two replicates of five slices per each treatment.

Efficacy against *E. amylovora* on apple hypanthia. To monitor population growth, spontaneous antibiotic-resistant derivatives of JAN and TN5 were used. JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> was obtained as above described. A TN5 derivative resistant to 1000  $\mu$ g/ml streptomycin (TN5 sm<sup>r</sup>) was prepared using the same procedure. A506 was resistant to rifampicin (100  $\mu$ g/ml). *E. amylovora* CFBP 1430 nal<sup>r</sup> (resistant to 75  $\mu$ g nalidixic acid/ml) is a nalidixic acid-resistant spontaneous derivative of *E. amylovora* CFBP 1430 with unaltered virulence (Duffy, personal knowledge).

We used a modified version of the efficacy assay on blossom hypanthium described in Cabrefiga et al. [4]. Apple blossoms (cv. Golden Delicious) with no dehisced anthers were collected early in the morning from an orchard in Wädenswil. Blossoms were maintained fresh by immersing the peduncles in 1.5 ml Eppendorf tubes filled with 10% sucrose solution and brought to the laboratory within 1 h of their collection. Suspensions (107 CFU/ml) of JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, TN5 sm<sup>r</sup> or A506 were prepared in 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer amended with 0.03% Tween-20. The concentration of each suspension was precisely determined by counting CFU in serial dilutions on LB agar plates amended with the respective antibiotic. Hypanthia were inoculated by placing a drop (10 µl) of a 107 CFU/ml suspension of JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, TN5 smr or A506 on each blossom, whereas the untreated control consisted of blossoms inoculated with an equal volume of 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer plus 0.03% Tween-20. The blossoms were incubated at 18°C under high relative-humidity conditions (in closed transparent plastic boxes) and with a 16-h light photoperiod (under 18 W/1300 lumen fluorescent bulbs at about 50 centimeter from the slices). After 24 h, part of the blossoms were inoculated (each) with one drop (10 µl) of a 106 CFU/ml E. amylovora CFBP 1430 nal<sup>r</sup> suspension, and the rest with 10 µl of 0.1 M potassium phosphate

buffer plus 0.03% Tween-20. Populations of the bacteria (biocontrol agents and/or *E. amylovora*) were estimated on five blossoms per treatment at 1, 24, 48, and 72 h after inoculation. Petals, stamens, sepals and stigmas were removed from the blossoms before bacterial re-isolation. After cleaning, the remaining part of each blossom was placed in a sterile Eppendorf tube containing 1 ml of 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer. The tubes were vortexed, briefly sonicated for 20 s, and vortexed again. Serial dilutions of the washings of each blossom were plated on LB agar amended with the respective antibiotic, and incubated at 18°C. After this incubation, CFU were counted. The efficacy of control was calculated with the above used equation, in which *A* is the *E. amylovora* population on apple hypanthia pre-treated with 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer plus 0.03% Tween-20 and *B* is the *E. amylovora* population on apple hypanthia pre-treated with the biocontrol agent. The experiment was carried out twice, and each experiment included 5 replicates per treatment per sampling time.

Efficacy against E. amylovora on apple blossoms and **shoots.** Erwinia amylovora is a quarantine pathogen in Switzerland. therefore the efficacy of JAN was assessed in three independent assays performed in the quarantine greenhouse at Agroscope ACW (Wädenswil) in 2007. Two- to 3-year-old apple trees (cv. Gala) planted in 50-cm-diameter plastic pots were stored in a cold room at 3°C till late spring (June 24 and July 9), when the plants were moved inside the greenhouse and induced to bloom. The temperature in the greenhouse was 18°C with some small variations correlated to the outdoor temperature extremes; some days at 24-26°C (experiment 1) and some days at 12-14°C (experiments 2 and 3). Blossoms were sprayed with a 107 CFU/ml suspension of either JAN rfmr or A506. Twenty four hours after this treatment, the blossoms were sprayed with a 106 CFU/ml suspension of E. amylovora. Disease symptoms on the treated blossoms (blackened petioles, non-dehiscing blossoms and/or exudates on the petioles) were evaluated nine days after pathogen inoculation. The symptoms on shoots carrying the treated blossoms (blackened leaf veins, exudates on leaf petioles and shoots) were evaluated 14 days after inoculation.

The efficacy of the treatment was calculated for each replicate with the above used equation, in which *A* is the incidence of disease on blossoms or shoots on trees treated with buffer alone (control) and *B* is the incidence of disease on blossoms or shoots on trees treated with the biocontrol agent suspensions. Three independent experiments were performed, each including three replicates (one tree = one replicate) per treatment. The number of blossom per tree spanned between 48 and 213, whereas the number of shoots per tree spanned between 17 and 59.

Statistical analysis. When the experiment factor was not significant, results of experiments were pooled. The results of the three experiments to check for antibiosis against E. amylovora and inhibition of E. amylovora growth through NiAc degradation, were pooled, and the average growth of E. amylovora (expressed as  $OD_{600}$ ) and the standard error of that growth calculated. Averages were compared using ANOVA and Fisher's least significant difference (LSD) test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). To evaluate the biocontrol efficacy on pear slices, the results of the experiments were pooled, and average efficacies and standard error of the averages were calculated. At each assessment time, average efficacies among the tested bacteria and the different concentrations were compared using ANOVA and Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). Biocontrol agents and E. amylovora populations were assessed on apple hypanthia, the results of the two experiments pooled and the average log<sub>10</sub> CFU per blossom per treatment calculated along with the standard errors of these averages. Analogously, in the evaluation of the populations of JAN and JAN's mutants on pear slices, the average log10 CFU/cm2 and standard errors were calculated. Averages were compared at different times using ANOVA and Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). In the greenhouse experiments, symptomatic blossoms and shoots were counted and the results of the different treatments were compared using ANOVA and Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). Statistical analyses were performed using Statistica 8.0 (StatSoft, Tulsa, OK, USA).

### Results

Isolation of epiphytic microorganisms from apple blossoms, selective screening of quickgrowing, NiAc-degrading microorganisms and evaluation of their effects on *E. amylovora*. A total of 735 bacteria and 1237 yeast isolates were collected from apple blossoms. When these microorganisms were screened on DF-NiAc salt minimal media, we found that approximately 10% of the isolates could degrade NiAc as the only N-source: 128 bacteria (17.4% of the bacteria isolated) and 92 yeasts (7.4% of the total isolated yeasts). Among them, we selected the 12 strains (11 bacteria and one yeast) that grew best on DF-NiAc for further studies.

The utilization of NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> was confirmed for all the 12 strains. The biocontrol efficacies of the twelve isolates were examined in the immature pear-slice assay. After 12 days from *E. amylovora* inoculation, the untreated control showed a disease incidence of  $93.3 \pm 6.7\%$  (average ± standard error). On the contrary, JAN and other three isolates showed 100% of efficacy against fire blight, whereas the other eight isolates showed an efficacy comprised between 70.8% and 96.7%. Since JAN showed the highest efficacy against fire blight and the highest growth on DF-NiAc, it was chosen as the biocontrol agent candidate for further study (Table S1).

**Identification and characterization of the NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub>-degrading strain JAN.** An amplicon of about 1.4 kb was obtained from the amplification of the 16S rRNA gene of JAN and sequenced (GenBank accession no. FJ668331). The sequence showed maximum identity (98% of identity, equal to 1406 identities over a fragment of 1421 bp) with the sequence of the type strain *Pseudomonas rhizosphaerae* IH5 (LMG 21640). Relations among JAN and the representative strains of the closest *Pseudomonas* species are illustrated in the unrooted phylogenetic tree presented in Fig. 1.



Fig. 1. Phylogenetic tree based on sequences of the 16S rRNA genes of JAN strain and of the more closely related members of the *Pseudomonas* genera (T = typestrain). The unrooted neighborjoining method (MEGA 4 software) was used. Nodal supports were assessed using 1000 bootstrap replicates and values are indicated. The scale bar represents 0.002 substitutions per site. Production of antimicrobial compounds against *E. amylovora* and in vitro inhibition of *E. amylovora* growth linked to NiAc degradation. The production of antimicrobial compounds against *E. amylovora* by JAN was assessed on pear diffusion juice. *E. amylovora* grew statistically better (P < 0.001) in a 1:1 mixture of JAN cell-free supernatant and pear diffusion juice than in a 1:1 mixture of Millipore water and pear diffusion juice (average  $OD_{600} \pm$  standard error of 0.95  $\pm$  0.03 and 0.62  $\pm$  0.01, respectively). This indicates that JAN produced no antimicrobial compounds against *E. amylovora* under assay conditions.

*E. amylovora* was unable to grow in 1:1 mixtures of M9 minimal medium supplemented with 0.01% thiamine-hydrochloride and Millipore water (average  $OD_{600} \pm$  standard error = 0.04 ± 0.01), but the addition of 0.01% NiAc reestablished the growth, which reached an  $OD_{600}$  of 1.38 ± 0.03 (3.96 ± 0.09 × 10<sup>9</sup> CFU/ml). In 1:1 mixtures of M9 medium and pear diffusion juice, *E. amylovora* growth reached an  $OD_{600} = 1.41 \pm 0.01$  (4.05 ± 0.03 × 10<sup>9</sup> CFU/ml). When M9 media was diluted 1:1 with JAN cell-free supernatant, *E. amylovora* grew to an  $OD_{600}$  of 0.55 ± 0.01 (1.56 ± 0.03 × 10<sup>9</sup> CFU/ml). The addition of 0.01% NiAc promoted growth to  $OD_{600} = 1.35 \pm 0.03$  (3.88 ± 0.09 × 10<sup>9</sup> CFU/ml). These results indicated that *E. amylovora* inhibition by JAN in vitro could be attributed to the degradation of most of the NiAc and NiNH, present in the pear juice.

Construction and characterization of NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> degrading-deficient mutants of JAN by transposon mutagenesis. Tn5 insertion mutants (10600) were generated by separate biparental matings between *E. coli* BW20767/pRL27 and JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, and screened for impaired growth in DF-NiAc agar. Table S2 shows the growth of JAN, JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, the mutants M3G7 and M40E5, and TN5 on DF agar medium added with 2 mM of NiAc, NiNH<sub>2</sub>, or NH<sub>4</sub>Cl as the only N-source. Mutants M3G7 and M40E5 showed this impairment and were further characterized.

Sequences of the genes disrupted in the two mutants were searched against the entire GenBank database for DNA sequence (BLASTN) and protein coding (BLASTX) features. The gene disrupted in mutant M3G7 had 89% homology to the nitrogen metabolism transcriptional regulator NtrC, Fis family, whereas the gene disrupted in mutant M40E5 had 88% homology to the nitrogen regulation protein NtrB. Using BLASTX, the translated sequences showed 98% identity to NtrC and NtrB proteins, respectively.

JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, M3G7 and M40E5 showed comparable capacity to colonize pear slices (P = 0.313) after 24 h of incubation at 18°C (time of *E. amylovora* inoculation). JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> reached a average value ± standard error of  $2.37 \pm 0.69 \times 10^6$  CFU/cm<sup>2</sup>, whereas M3G7 and M40E5 population reached values of  $1.30 \pm 0.40$  and  $1.76 \pm 0.28 \times 10^6$  CFU/cm<sup>2</sup>, respectively. After 90 h of incubation, JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, M3G7, and M40E5 populations were slightly, but sig-



Int. Microbiol

**Fig. 2.** Example of biocontrol activity of JAN on immature pear slices (cv. Conference) 7 days after inoculation with *Erwinia amylovora* (10<sup>6</sup> CFU/ml). The slices were treated with (**A**) 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer (untreated control) or (**B**) a suspension of JAN (10<sup>5</sup> CFU/ml) in 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer, and 24 h later inoculated with 10  $\mu$ l of a *E. amylovora* suspension (10<sup>6</sup> CFU/ml).



Fig. 3. Fire blight biocontrol on slices of immature pear fruits treated with suspensions of JAN, A506 or TN5 in 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer at three different concentrations:  $10^7$ ,  $10^6$  and  $10^5$  CFU/ml (white, grey and black histograms), before inoculation with 10 µl of a *Erwinia amylovora* suspension ( $10^6$  CFU/ml). Biocontrol efficacy was evaluated after 7 (**A**), 9 (**B**) and 12 days (**C**). Values represent the means of three independent experiments, with two replicates of five slices per each treatment. Standard errors are indicated. Treatment means marked with the same letter are not significantly different according Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

nificantly, higher (P = 0.009, P < 0.001, P = 0.008, respectively) than after 24 h of incubation. No significantly differences were found between JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> and mutants population (P = 0.568) (data not shown).

In the biocontrol efficacy test on pear slices, JAN rfm<sup>r</sup> showed 79.4  $\pm$  9.4% efficacy (average value  $\pm$  standard error) in controlling *E. amylovora* compared to the untreated control (infection incidence of 95.0  $\pm$  5.0%). The mutants M3G7 and M40E5 showed 15.0  $\pm$  15.0% and 21.7  $\pm$  11.7% of efficacy, respectively, values considerably lower (*P* = 0.034 and *P* = 0.045, respectively) than the efficacy value of JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>.

**Efficacy against** *E. amylovora* on pear slices. Droplets of bacterial exudate first appeared on pear slices four to five days after they were inoculated with *E. amylovora*. After seven days (Fig. 2), the surfaces of the infected slices were almost completely covered with exudate. Twelve days after inoculation, the slice surfaces were completely black and covered with large amounts of exudate. In the untreated control, 86.7% of the slices were covered with exudate, and this percentage did not increase from the seventh day after inoculation to the end of the experiment (12 days after inoculation). When pear slices were treated with JAN, A506 or TN5 before E. amylovora inoculation, they were mostly asymptomatic (Fig. 2). After seven days of incubation (Fig. 3A), JAN showed more than 90% efficacy in controlling E. amylovora. No significant differences were found when different concentrations of JAN were compared ( $10^7$ ,  $10^6$  or  $10^5$  CFU/ml). A506 and TN5 were as effective as JAN when used at the two highest concentrations (107 and 106 CFU/ml). However, when used at  $10^5$  CFU/ml, A506 showed a slightly lower efficacy (72.5%) than JAN (91.7%) (not statistically significant; P = 0.072),



whereas TN5 showed a statistically lower efficacy (53.3%) (P = 0.001). The efficacy of JAN did not vary between 7, 9 (Fig. 3B) and 12 days of incubation (Fig. 3C), indicating persistent biocontrol activity over this period. A506 was consistently effective when applied at the two highest concentrations (100% and 79.2% after 12 days, respectively), whereas a significant reduction (P = 0.031) in efficacy was observed after 12 days

**Fig. 4.** Size of bacterial populations on apple hypanthia. Dashed lines indicate bacterial populations in the absence of *Erwinia amylovora*. Solid lines indicate bacterial populations in the presence of *E. amylovora*. Values are the means of log<sub>10</sub> transformed population sizes (pooled data from two experiments, each experiment included five replicates per sampling time). Vertical bars represent standard errors. Means at 24, 48 and 72 h that are marked with the same letter are not different according Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). Symbols: A506 + *E. amylovora* (closed diamonds); A506 (open diamonds); JAN + *E. amylovora* (closed triangles); JAN (open triangles); TN5 + E. *amylovora* (closed squares); TN5 (open squares).

when A506 was applied at a concentration of  $10^5$  CFU/ml (46.7%). The efficacy of TN5 decreased over time for all three of the concentrations tested. After 12 days, the efficacy scores for TN5 were 69.2, 56.7 and 10% at  $10^7$ ,  $10^6$  and  $10^5$  CFU/ml, respectively. These efficacy rates are significantly lower than those of JAN applied at the same concentrations (P = 0.032, P = 0.002, P < 0.001, respectively).



**Fig. 5.** Size of *Erwinia amylovora* populations on apple hypanthia pre-treated with JAN (open triangles), A506 (open diamonds), and TN5 (open squares). Untreated blossoms (inoculated with 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer only) were used as a control (stars). Values are the means of the log<sub>10</sub>-transformed population sizes (pooled data from two experiments, each experiment included five replicates per sampling time). Vertical bars represent standard errors. Means at 24 and 48 h that are marked with the same letter are not different according Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

Efficacy against E. amylovora on apple hypanthia. The presence of *E. amylovora* did not significantly affect the sizes of the populations of JAN (P = 0.505), A506 (P = 0.770) and TN5 (P = 0.356). TN5 population was characterized by a significant reduction in population after 1 h of incubation (2.0  $\times$  10<sup>4</sup> CFU/blossom), corresponding to about 1 log unit less than JAN ( $2.9 \times 10^5$  CFU/blossom) and 0.5 log unit less than A506 population (9.1  $\times$  10<sup>4</sup> CFU/blossom). JAN, TN5 and A506 populations increased exponentially over the first 24 h, however TN5 population was still 0.5 log unit lower than JAN and A506 population. Maximal population sizes were reached after 48 h. JAN and TN5 populations were similar (5.5 and  $3.6 \times 10^6$  CFU/blossom, respectively; P = 0.545), whereas A506 population (2.6 × 10<sup>7</sup> CFU/blossom) was significantly higher (P = 0.029 and P = 0.007, respectively) (Fig. 4).

On the untreated blossoms, *E. amylovora* population increased rapidly, reaching  $1.8 \times 10^6$  and  $3.9 \times 10^6$  CFU/blossom at 24 and 48 h after inoculation, respectively. JAN inhibited *E. amylovora* growth on apple hypanthia similarly (*P* = 0.598)

to A506. On both cases, *E. amylovora* populations increased slightly on the treated blossoms, from  $3.5 \times 10^3$  at the time of inoculation to about  $1.5 \times 10^4$  CFU/blossom at 48 h after inoculation, corresponding to an efficacy of control of 99.73  $\pm$  0.01% for JAN and of 99.60  $\pm$  0.16% for A506, respectively. TN5 suppressed *E. amylovora* growth at 24 h (1.9  $\times$  10<sup>5</sup> CFU/blossom; *P* < 0.001) and at 48 h after inoculation (1.2  $\times$  10<sup>6</sup> CFU/blossom; *P* < 0.024), but did it less effectively (*P* < 0.001) than JAN and A506 (Fig. 5). Forty-eight hours after inoculation, TN5 showed an efficacy of control of 38.05  $\pm$  12.46%. This is in accordance with the statistical lower growth of TN5 compared to JAN on DF agar medium added with 2 mM of NiAc or NiNH<sub>2</sub> (Table S2).

Efficacy against *E. amylovora* on apple blossoms and shoots. In experiment 1, JAN provided about 84.4% of control on blossoms and 85.3% on shoots; levels slightly higher, but not statistically different (P = 0.112 and P = 0.139, respectively), than that provided by A506 (77.9 and 73.0%, respectively).

Strain	Biocontrol efficacy on blossoms $(\%)^b$	Biocontrol efficacy on shoots $(\%)^b$	
Expt. 1 <sup>a</sup>			
Untreated	$0.0 \pm 0.0 \ \mathrm{a}^c \ (68 - 366)^d$	$0.0 \pm 0.0$ a $(30 - 81)^d$	
A506	77.7 ± 3.7 b (446 – 544)	73.0 ± 7.7 b (118 – 140)	
JAN	84.4 ± 2.4 b (356 – 411)	85.3 ± 4.4 b (63 – 69)	
Expt. 2 <sup><i>a</i></sup>			
Untreated	0.0 ± 0.0 a (171 – 398)	$0.0 \pm 0.0$ a (20 – 93)	
A506	20.4 ± 7.3 b (119 – 228)	44.6 ± 10.1 b (45 – 77)	
JAN	72.0 ± 4.9 c (372 – 445)	76.3 ± 1.4 c (91 – 111)	
Expt. 3 <sup><i>a</i></sup>			
Untreated	$0.0 \pm 0.0$ a (72 – 270)	0.0 ± 0.0 a (15 – 65)	
A506	42.2 ± 3.2 b (144 – 256)	39.9 ± 13.6 ab (32 – 60)	
JAN	63.8 ± 4.9 c (321 – 446)	63.4 ± 11.5 b (74 – 99)	

**Table 1** Fire blight control provided by the biocontrol agent candidate *Pseudomonas rhizosphaerae* JAN and a reference strain (*P. fluorescens* A506) in apple plants under controlled greenhouse conditions.

<sup>a</sup> Three independent experiments (Expt.) were performed, each including three replicates (one tree = one replicate) per treatment.

 $^{b}$  For each experiment, values are expressed as average  $\pm$  standard error of the biocontrol efficacies calculated for each replicate. Disease symptoms on blossoms were evaluated 9 days after inoculation. Disease symptoms on shoots were evaluated 14 days after inoculation.

<sup>c</sup> Data with the same letter are not significantly different according to Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

<sup>d</sup> In brackets are indicated the healthy and the total number of blossoms or shoots assessed per treatment.

In experiment 2, JAN provided a higher level of disease control than A506 on blossoms (72.0 and 20.4%, respectively; P = 0.001) and on shoots (76.3% and 44.6%, respectively; P = 0.003). In the experiment 3, JAN provided a higher level of disease control than A506 on blossoms (63.8 and 42.2%, respectively; P = 0.020) and a higher, but not statistically different (P = 0.206), control on shoots (63.4 and 39.9%, respectively) (Table 1).

# Discussion

Selection of potential biocontrol agents against *E. amylovora* has been based on screening for inhibition on artificial media [1,23,36], which lead to biocontrol agents able to produce antimicrobial compounds and therefore with a higher risk of non-target effects, or massive screening on immature pear fruits or apple blossoms [4,25], which is time-consuming and subject to plant material availability. We developed an approach to streamline the selection process of a potential biocontrol agent characterized by a lower risk of non-target effects by pre-screening for microorganisms that can degrade an essential nutrient for pathogen growth.

Erwinia amylovora requires NiAc and/or NiNH<sub>2</sub> as essential growth factors when cultured on minimal media [21,29]. Based on this particular requirement, we developed a new, streamlined approach for evaluating isolates based on the hypothesis that an organism capable of eliminating or reducing the availability of NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> could effectively inhibit the growth of *E. amylovora*, thereby controlling fire blight. By focusing only on those microorganisms capable of degrading NiAc, we were able to dramatically decrease the number of microorganisms to be further tested (approximately 10% of the about 2000 isolates initially collected). Among these, we selected those NiAc-degrading isolates that showed faster growth, thus reducing the field of candidates to be tested on immature pear fruits to only twelve isolates. All these isolates showed ability to degrade also NiNH<sub>2</sub>. JAN, which showed the highest growth on DF-NiAc and the highest levels of biocontrol efficacy, was chosen as the final biocontrol agent candidate.

JAN was found to have high 16S rRNA gene sequence homology to *P. rhizosphaerae* IH5. This species was originally isolated from the rhizosphere of grasses growing wild in Spain [22] and selected for its capacity to actively solubilize phosphates in vitro. Krimm et al. [12] showed that *P. rhizosphaerae* is one of the prominent epiphytic bacteria of the phyllosphere of strawberry plants, where it significantly increases the permeability of the plant's cuticle. Our results indicate that *P. rhizosphaerae* is also an epiphytic inhabitant of apple blossoms. JAN mutants M3G7 and M40E5, with impaired capacity to degrade NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> as the only N-source, showed a strong reduction in the biocontrol activity compared to JAN. M3G7 and M40E5 were disrupted in *ntrC* and *ntrB* genes, respectively. NtrBC is a global two-component regulatory system controlling, together with the alternative sigma factor  $\sigma^{54}$ , the *ntr* (nitrogen regulated) response in many bacteria [17]. In many bacteria, the induction of the operons involved in the use of different N-sources requires activation by NtrBC [3,13,16]. These results provided an additional indication of the possible involvement of NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> degradation in the control of *E. amylovora* by JAN, and demonstrated that the capacity by JAN to degrade NiAc and NiNH<sub>2</sub> as the only N-source and its biocontrol activity against *E. amylovora* is regulated by the NtrBC regulatory system.

Biocontrol efficacy of JAN was evaluated in vitro and compared with the efficacy of P. fluorescens A506, a commercial biocontrol agent often used as reference strain in greenhouse and in field experiments aiming to test new biocontrol agents [28] and with the nicotinic acid degrader P. fluorescens TN5. The efficacy of JAN on pear slices and on apple hypanthia, could compare with the efficacy of A506. On the contrary, TN5 showed lower efficacy than JAN on pear slices and especially on apple hypanthia. In the last case, the lower efficacy could be explained by the fact that TN5 showed a lower capacity to use NiAc and NiNH, than JAN did (Table S2). Moreover, TN5 population size on apple hypanthia was significantly lower than JAN population size for the 24 h of incubation prior E. amylovora inoculation. One hour after its inoculation on the blossoms, the population of TN5 was about 1 log-unit (i.e.  $2.7 \times 10^5$  CFU/blossom) lower than the population of JAN. Twenty-four hours after its inoculation, corresponding at the moment of E. amylovora inoculation, TN5 population was about 0.5 log-unit (i.e.,  $2.0 \times 10^6$ CFU/blossom) lower than JAN population. This difference in population could be therefore linked to a minor degradation of NiAc and NiNH, and therefore a reduced control efficacy compared to JAN. Unlike JAN and A506, which were isolated from apple hypanthium and pear leaf, respectively, TN5 was isolated from a soil sample [19]. Its initial smaller population could be therefore related to a lower capacity of TN5 to adapt to the conditions present on the hypanthium.

When tested in greenhouse directly on blooming apple trees, JAN confirmed the high level of control showed in vitro and was consistent in controlling the disease across all the three experiments, whereas A506 showed a reduction in efficacy in experiments 2 and 3, which were characterized by some days at low temperature. A temperature of  $18 \pm 6^{\circ}$ C corresponds to the common temperatures registered in Switzerland and northern Italy during pear and apple blooms [http://www.meteosvizzera.admin.ch/web/it/clima/clima\_og gi/html; http://meteo.iasma.it/meteo/datimeteo/ricercadati. php]. The promising biocontrol activity of JAN against *E. amylovora* under these conditions suggests the potential of this isolate as biocontrol agent against fire blight in these regions. However, only repeated trials in different regions, under different environmental conditions, will provide the final confirmation of the efficacy of JAN as biocontrol agent against fire blight. A commercial biocontrol agent should not pose any risk to human health [26]. In this sense, valuable characteristics of JAN are the inability to grow at human body temperature (data not shown) and the fact that production of antimicrobial compounds was not detected.

In conclusion, with this streamline screening approach based on NiAc degradation, we were able to select a new effective biocontrol agent candidate (JAN) characterized by a lower risk of non-target effects, whose mechanism of protection is linked to the degradation of a specific and essential growth factor of the pathogen.

**Acknowledgments.** We thank S.E. Lindow and T. Nagasawa for providing strains A506 and TN5, D. Christen for providing immature pear fruits, and J. Wäspe and T. Cereghetti for technical support and scientific discussions. This research was supported by Safecrop Centre, funded by Fondo per la Ricerca, Autonomous Province of Trento, by Accordo di Programma 2009, and the Swiss Federal Office for Agriculture (FOAG BLW Fire Blight Biocontrol Project). It was conducted within the framework of the European Science Foundation funded research network COST Action 864.

## References

- Bazzi C, Biondi E, Vanneste JL (2006) Potential as biological control agents of some novel epiphytic bacterial strains isolated from Italy. Acta Hortic 704:329-336
- Broggini GAL, Duffy B, Holliger E, Schaerer HJ, Gessler C, Patocchi A (2005) Detection of the fire blight biocontrol agent *Bacillus subtilis* BD170 (Biopro) in a Swiss apple orchard. Eur J Plant Pathol 111:93-100
- Caballero A, Esteve-Núñez A, Zylstra GJ, Ramos JL (2005) Assimilation of nitrogen from nitrite and trinitrotoluene in *Pseudomonas putida* JLR11. J Bacteriol 187:396-399
- Cabrefiga J, Bonaterra A, Montesinos E (2007) Mechanisms of antagonism of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* EPS62e against *Erwinia amylovora*, the causal agent of fire blight. Int Microbiol 10:123-132
- 5. Dworkin M, Foster J (1958) Experiments with some microorganisms which utilize ethane and hydrogen. J Bacteriol 75:592-601
- Highland HB, Walgenbach P (2006) The use of Serenade MAX in commercial integrated systems to control apple diseases in the U.S. Phytopathology 96 (Suppl. 6):48
- Holt JG, Krieg NR, Sneath PHA, Staley JT, Williams ST (1994) Bergey's Manual of Determinative Bacteriology, 9<sup>th</sup> ed. Williams and Wilkins, Baltimore, MD, USA
- Hurh B, Yamane T, Nagasawa T (1994) Purification and characterization of nicotinic acid dehydrogenase from *Pseudomonas fluorescens* TN5. J Ferment Bioeng 78:19-26

- Ishimaru CA, Klos EJ, Burbaker RR (1988) Multiple antibiotic production by *Erwinia herbicola*. Phytopathology 78:746-750
- Kearns LP, Hale CN (1996) Partial characterization of an inhibitory strain of *Erwinia herbicola* with potential as a biocontrol agent for *Erwinia amylovora*, the fire blight pathogen. J Appl Bacteriol 81: 369-374
- Keel C, Weller DM, Natsch A, Défago G, Cook RJ, Thomashow LS (1996) Conservation of the 2,4-diacetylphloroglucinol biosynthesis locus among fluorescent Pseudomonas strains from diverse geographic locations. Appl Environ Microbiol 62:552-563
- Krimm U, Abanda-Nkpwatt D, Schwab W, Schreiber L (2005) Epiphytic microorganisms on strawberry plants (*Fragaria ananassa* cv. Elsanta): identification of bacterial isolates and analysis of their interaction with leaf surfaces. FEMS Microbiol Ecol 53:483-492
- 13. Kutsche M, Leimkühler S, Angermüller S, Klipp W (1996) Promoters controlling expression of the alternative nitrogenase and the molybdenum uptake system in *Rhodobacter capsulatus* are activated by NtrC, independent of  $\sigma^{54}$ , and repressed by molybdenum. J Bacteriol 178: 2010-2017
- 14. Larsen RA, Wilson MM, Guss AM, Metcalf WW (2002) Genetic analysis of pigment biosynthesis in *Xanthobacter autotrophicus* Py2 using a new, highly efficient transposon mutagenesis system that is functional in a wide variety of bacteria. Arch Microbiol 178:193-201
- Lindow SE (1982) Integrated control of frost injury and fire blight of pear with antagonistic epiphytic bacteria. Phytopathology 72:946
- Masepohl B, Kaiser B, Isakovic N, Richard CL, Kranz GR, Klipp W (2001) Urea utilization in the phototrophic bacterium *Rhodobacter capsulatus* is regulated by the transcriptional activator NtrC. J Bacteriol 183:637-643
- Merrick MJ, Edwards RA (1995) Nitrogen control in bacteria. Microbiol Rev 59:604-622
- Nakano H, Wieser M, Hurh B, Kawai T, Yoshida T, Yamane T, Nagasawa T (1999) Purification, characterization and gene cloning of 6-hydroxynicotinate 3-monooxygenase from *Pseudomonas fluorescens* TN5. Eur J Biochem 260:120-126
- Nagasawa T, Hurh B, Yamane T (1994) Production of 6-hydroxynicotinic acid from nicotinic acid by resting cells of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* TN5. Biosci Biotech Biochem 58:665-668
- Paulin JP, Samson R (1973) Le feu bactérien en France. II. Caractères des souches d'*Erwinia amylovora* (Burrill) Winslow et al. 1920 isolées du foyer franco-belge. Ann Phytopathol 5:389-397
- 21. Paternoster T, Vrhovsek U, Pertot I, Duffy B, Gessler C, Mattivi F (2009). Determination and confirmation of nicotinic acid and its analogues and derivates in pear and apple blossoms using high-performance liquid chromatography-diode array-electrospray ionization mass spectrometry. J Agric Food Chem 57:10038-10043
- 22. Peix A, Rivas R, Mateos PF, Martìnez-Molina E, Rodrìguez-Barrueco C, Velàzquez E (2003) *Pseudomonas rhizosphaerae* sp. nov., a novel species that actively solubilizes phosphate *in vitro*. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 53:2067-2072
- Psallidas PG, Vitas A, Tsiantos J (1993) Screening for potential antagonists to *Erwinia amylovora in vitro* and *in vivo* among the bacterial microflora of pear and apple. Acta Hortic 338:353-360
- Pusey PL (2002) Biological control agents for fire blight of apple compared under conditions limiting natural dispersal. Plant Dis 86:639-644
- Pusey PL, Stockwell VO, Mazzola M (2009) Epiphytic bacteria and yeasts on apple blossoms and their potential as antagonists of *Erwinia amylovora*. Phytopathology 99:571-581
- Rezzonico F, Smits THM, Montesinos E, Frey JE, Duffy B (2009) Genotypic comparison of *Pantoea agglomerans* plant and clinical strains. BMC Microbiol 9:204

- Sambrook J, Russell DW (2001) Molecular cloning: A Laboratory Manual, 3rd ed. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press, Cold Spring Harbor, NY, USA
- Sobiczewski P, Mikicinski A, Berczynski S, Pulawska J (2008) Biological control of fire blight on apple blossoms and shoots with epiphytic and soil bacteria. Acta Hort 793:409-413
- Starr MP, Mandel M (1950) The nutrition of phytopathogenic bacteria. IV. Minimal nutritive requirements of the genus *Erwinia*. J Bacteriol 60: 669-672
- Thomson SV (1986) The role of the stigma in fire blight infections. Phytopathology 76:476-482
- Vanneste JL, Yu J, Beer SV (1992) Role of antibiotic production by *Erwinia herbicola* Eh252 in biological control of *Erwinia amylovora*. J Bacteriol 174:2785-2796
- 32. Vanneste JL (2000) Fire blight: the disease and its causative agent, *Erwinia amylovora*. CABI Publishing, Wallingford, Oxon, UK

- 33. Wang C, Knill E, Glick BR, Défago G (2000) Effect of transferring 1-aminocyclopropane-1-1carboxylic acid (ACC) deaminase genes into *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain CHAO and its gacA derivative CHA96 on their growth-promoting and disease-suppressive capacities. Can J Microbiol 46:898-907
- Wilson M, Lindow SE (1993) Interactions between the biological control agent *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain A506 and *Erwinia amylovora* in pear blossoms. Phytopathology 83:117-123
- Wilson M (1997) Biocontrol of aerial plant diseases in agriculture and horticulture: Current approaches and future prospects. J Ind Microbiol Biotechnol 19:188-191
- Wodzinski RS, Clardy JC, Coval SJ, Beer SV, Zumoff CH (1990). Antibiotics produced by strains of *Erwinia herbicola* that are highly effective in suppressing fire blight. Acta Hort 273:411-412
- Wright SAI, Beer SV (1996) The role of antibiotics in biological control of fire blight by *Erwinia herbicola* strain Eh318. Acta Hort 411:309-311



DOI: 10.2436/20.1501.01.126

**Supplementary Table S1.** Growth on DF salt minimal agar medium added with 2 mM of NiAc as the only N-source and biocontrol efficacy of JAN and other NiAc degraders

Strain	Diameter NiAc (mm) <sup>a</sup>	Biocontrol efficacy $(\%)^b$
JAN	5.2	$100.0 \pm 0.0$
TSA3 E6	5.2	$95.8\pm4.2$
LB4 F7	4.6	$92.5 \pm 3.8$
LB4 H8	4.5	$100.0\pm0.0$
PDA SM A6	4.3	$100.0\pm0.0$
NONESI A3	4.2	$95.8\pm4.2$
JAN1 D6	4.0	$96.7 \pm 3.3$
SM-3 H4	4.0	$70.8\pm5.1$
SM-3 E2	3.8	$95.8\pm4.2$
TSA3 D5	3.8	$100.0\pm0.0$
LB4 E5	3.8	$90.0 \pm 5.7$
JAN2 H7	3.6	$85.8 \pm 8.7$

<sup>*a*</sup>Diameter of the colony after 3 days at 18°C.

<sup>b</sup>Biocontrol efficacy on pear slices after 12 days at 18°C. Values represent the means of three independent experiments, with two replicates of five slices per each treatment. Standard errors are indicated.



DOI: 10.2436/20.1501.01.126

**Supplementary Table S2.** Growth of JAN, JAN rfm<sup>r</sup>, the JAN mutants M3G7 and M40E5, and TN5 on DF salt minimal agar medium added with 2 mM of NiAc, NiNH<sub>2</sub>, or NH<sub>4</sub>Cl as the only N-source. DF salt minimal agar medium not amended was used as control

Strains	NiAc	NiNH <sub>2</sub>	NH <sub>4</sub> Cl	CONTROL
JAN	$0.644 \pm 0.040 \text{ a}^*$	$0.253 \pm 0.042 \text{ ab}*$	$0.418 \pm 0.011$ a*	$0.035 \pm 0.005 \ a^*$
JAN rfm <sup>r</sup>	$0.739 \pm 0.069$ a	$0.367 \pm 0.049$ a	$0.385 \pm 0.032 \ a$	$0.011 \pm 0.001 \; b$
M3G7 <sup>a</sup>	$0.005 \pm 0.000 \; b$	$0.050\pm0.000\ c$	$0.793 \pm 0.035 \ b$	$0.003 \pm 0.001 \ b$
M40E5 <sup>a</sup>	$0.007 \pm 0.000 \; b$	$0.152 \pm 0.052$ bc	$0.799 \pm 0.021 \text{ b}$	$0.004 \pm 0.000 \ b$
TN5	$0.099 \pm 0.052 \text{ c}$	$0.103 \pm 0.028 \ b$	$0.332 \pm 0.013$ a	$0.033 \pm 0.017 \text{ ab}$

\*The values (expressed as optical density at 600 nm of a suspension obtained cutting out the single colonies and resuspending the cells in 1 ml 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer by vigourous vortexing for 20 s) are the average of two independent measurements. Standard errors are indicated. Values within a column followed by the same letter are not significantly different according to Fisher's LSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). <sup>*a*</sup>M3G7 and M40E5 are rifampicin resistant.