Virulence 6:3, 223–228; April 2015; Published with license by Taylor & Francis Group, LLC

Aggressive Periodontitis: microbes and host response, who to blame?

Luigi Nibali*

Periodontology Unit and Department of Clinical Research; UCL Eastman Dental Institute; London, UK

Keywords: aggressive, bacteria, dysbiosis, genetic, pathogenesis, periodontitis

A paradigm shift several decades ago elucidated that aggressive periodontitis (AgP) was not a degenerative disorder but a rapid progressive form of plaque-induced inflammatory periodontal disease. Ensuing years of research have led to linkage analysis identification of specific genetic defects responsible for AgP in some families and to the finding that subgingival detection of A. actinomycetemcomitans JP2 clone is a predictive factor for disease onset and progression. However, rather disappointingly, these 'proven' risk factors are only detected in a small subset of AgP cases. Recent advances are leading to a new paradigm shift, with the realization that genetically-driven dysbiotic changes in the subgingival microbiota may predispose to a cascade of events leading to the rapid periodontal tissue destruction seen in AgP. This review tries to dissect the existing literature on the host response-microbial axis of AgP and to propose possible pathogenic pathways in line with current theories.

Introduction

In 1999, the American Academy of Periodontology (AAP) introduced the controversial term "Aggressive Periodontitis" (AgP) to define a group of destructive periodontal diseases with a rapid progression.¹ This definition aimed to encompass previous definitions of early-onset periodontitis, juvenile periodontitis and rapidly progressive periodontitis, using a terminology ("aggressive") rather unusual in the medical field. This put the emphasis on rapidity of progression (rather than necessarily on age of onset) and perhaps on the difficulty of treating it. Along with rapid progression, systemic health and familial aggregation were considered the main features, following concepts already described three decades earlier.² Among other secondary features, a microbiological element was introduced, in theory to help in the differential diagnosis with the more common chronic periodontitis (CP). The authors of the consensus statement reported

*Correspondence to: Luigi Nibali; Email: I.nibali@ucl.ac.uk

that "elevated proportions of Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans (now Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans) and in certain populations of Porphyromonas gingivalis" were typical of AgP.¹ This reflects the enormous efforts of previous decades to identify a microbiological culprit able to cause rapidly progressive periodontitis in young and healthy individuals. Identification of a specific disease-initiating microbe would help in the diagnosis and treatment of AgP, targeted at the elimination of the responsible pathogen. On the other hand, it was also thought that deficiencies in the host response could be at the basis of the rapid periodontal destruction. Aggressive periodontitis was further divided into a localized form (LAgP) typically affecting first molars and incisors, and a more generalized form (GAgP), not necessarily deriving from the former,¹ but possibly expression of a different pathogenic process. Although affecting a relatively small proportion of the population compared with CP, the rapidity of progression and high risk of tooth loss at a young age make AgP a very unique and relevant disease.³ The next sections will review the evidence to accept or reject the notion that AgP has a distinct microbiological pathogenesis from CP and to help decide whether microbiological or host response factors are more to blame for its onset and progression.

AgP- Microbiological Studies

The first term used to define cases of early-onset destructive periodontal diseases was "periodontosis."⁴ This should perhaps not surprise us, since no clear "inflammation" element can be macroscopically distinguished in many of these cases, with disproportionate periodontal destruction compared with the amount of local deposits, especially in LAgP cases.⁵ Hence, the emphasis was on a possible degenerative disease leading to bone resorption and tooth mobility. While the 1960s brought the evidence to confirm that dental plaque is the etiological factor of periodontal diseases,^{6,7} crucial studies in the 1970s investigated a possible microbiological cause of what we now call AgP. As "non-specific"⁸ and then "specific"⁹ plaque hypotheses for periodontitis developed, it was now becoming clear that AgP was also a plaque-induced gingival disease. Listgarten, by light and electron microscope analysis of teeth extracted from "periodontosis" cases, identified "small clumps of Gram-negative coccoid bacteria and neutrophils in varying stages of disintegration." He also observed fewer morphologic forms compared with CP.10 Newman and co-workers detected

[©] Luigi Nibali

Submitted: 09/22/2014; Revised: 11/06/2014; Accepted: 01/06/2014 http://dx.doi.org/10.4161/21505594.2014.986407

http://ux.uoi.org/10.4101/21505594.2014.96040/

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial License (http://creativecommons. org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/), which permits unrestricted non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. The moral rights of the named author(s) have been asserted.

Gram- anaerobic bacteria including Bacteroides, Campilobacter, Selenomonas, Fusobacterium with an additional 45% not identified.¹¹ A milestone in the microbial studies on AgP came with the discovery of the role of A. actinomycetemcomitans, found to have pathogenic abilities and characteristics which allowed its inclusion as a periodontal pathogenic bacterium.¹² In a large study in the United States, A. actinomycetemcomitans was detected in nearly all the analyzed LAgP patients, and in contrast in fewer healthy (16.9%) or chronic periodontitis subjects (20.8%) as assessed by culture and immunofluorescence serotyping.¹³ A more established role for A. actinomycetemcomitans became clearer with the evidence of a correlation of its elimination with treatment response ¹⁴ and the finding of an elevated serum antibody response to this bacterium in patients with LAgP.^{15,16} The next milestone was represented by the discovery, in a young case of LAgP, of the A. actinomycetemcomitans JP2 clone,¹⁷ characterized by a 530-base-pair deletion in the leukotoxin operon, associated with increased leukotoxic activity.¹⁸ A different pathogenic potential was also identified across the various A. actinomycetemcomitans serotypes.¹⁹ A. actinomycetemcomitans has shown clear association with onset of AgP in a 1-year prospective study in the United States, where patients with detectable A. actinomycetemcomitans at baseline had a higher risk of developing AgP compared with matched subjects who did not harbor it. In particular, 8 out of 38 A. actinomycetemcomitans-positive and none of 58 A. actinomycetemcomitans-negative subjects exhibited bone loss at the last study follow-up.²⁰ A similar association was found in a 15-year longitudinal study in Indonesian adolescents and young adults,²¹ while no predictive role for A. actinomycetemcomitans in disease progression was found in a German study on 105 young male soldiers followed up for 1 year.²² A prospective study in a Moroccan population of 428 adolescents showed a strong association between the JP2 clone and periodontal attachment loss over a 2-year period.²³ A more recently-published longitudinal study on nearly 400 Ghanaian adolescents showed a similar association between detection of the JP2 clone and attachment loss over 2 years.²⁴ Interestingly, also detection of highly leukotoxic non-JP2 A. actinomycetemcomitans clones was associated with increased diseased progression risk.²⁵

However, it also clearly emerged that A. actinomycetemcomitans is not universally detected in AgP sites ²⁶ and cases ²⁷ and it is also found in healthy individuals ²⁸ and in healthy sites of diseased individuals.²⁹ Furthermore, studies have often shown to have a similar prevalence of detection in AgP and CP cases.³⁰ Hence, A. actinomycetemcomitans, but also P. gingivalis, are certainly not the only possible pathogens predisposing to AgP. Recent technological advances have led to an improvement in microbiological detection techniques and metagenomic studies in AgP are starting to suggest the possible role of non-cultivable microbes in its pathogenesis.¹⁹ Among putative pathogens, based on increased detection in AgP vs. periodontal health, Filifactor alocis,³¹ Centipeda genus,³² Mitsuokella sp.,³³ Selenomonas genus,³² Actinobacter baumannii,³⁴ Treponema lecithinolyticum³⁵ and even the Archaea domain ³⁶ are emerging as associated with AgP. Their potential pathogenic role still needs to be elucidated and scrutinized based on Socransky's criteria,¹² once more literature

data become available. Nonetheless, a more variegated picture of AgP-pathogenic bacteria is emerging, which has to be carefully kept in mind in future research. In balance, it seems clear that *A. actinomycetemcomitans* (and particularly the JP2 clone) plays a role in the pathogenesis of AgP, especially LAgP. However, it may be possible that *A. actinomycetemcomitans* plays a strong role in disease initiation and is then replaced by other pathogenic bacteria, presumably obligate anaerobic, as the disease progresses.³⁷

The Differential Microbiological Profile of AgP and CP

As we endeavor to understand pathogenic and clinical differences between aggressive and chronic periodontitis, hoping to design more targeted management regimes for these conditions, an interesting insight is given by studies comparing the microbiology of AgP and CP. A systematic review over a decade ago concluded that detection of A. actinomycetemcomitans or P. gingivalis was not enough to discriminate between AgP and CP. In other words, albeit AgP cases were found to harbor A. actinomycetemcomitans with higher frequency than CP cases (62% vs. 28%), detection of these bacteria could not be used as a diagnostic criterion. During the last decade, even more studies have cast doubts on a different microbial profile between AgP and CP. Whether due to limitations in the microbiological techniques used or simply to our inability to clinically distinguish certain cases of AgP from CP, no differences in subgingival microbial detection emerged in several studies.^{35,37,38,40} We recently reported results of a study on polymerase chain reaction (PCR) detection of A. actinomycetemcomitans or P. gingivalis from subgingival plaque samples of 267 periodontitis patients (84 diagnosed with AgP and 183 with CP).³⁰ In this patient sample, CP cases had higher detection of both bacteria compared with AgP, although the differences were not statistically significant. However, this study did not provide quantitative measures of these bacteria subgingivally. Quantitative data on numbers of subgingival bacteria, different serotypes or clones and uncultivable microbes will certainly shed further light into the differential microbial profile of AgP and CP.

The Host Response in AgP

A substantial body of evidence has accumulated to suggest large inter-individual variations in the response to dental plaque accumulation, leading to different degrees of gingival inflammation.⁴¹ In line with this concept, already from the initial attempts into research on early onset forms of periodontitis, it became apparent that affected individuals suffered from a metabolic imbalance or from inherited host response defects.^{2,42} The first line of periodontal defense is provided by the innate immune response, in the form of neutrophils and macrophages, fibroblasts, epithelial and dendritic cells, which are normally continuously engaged in responses to bacterial plaque in a state of preclinical "physiological" inflammation.⁴³ When this response is not able to control microbial accumulation, complex

inflammatory cascades are activated and an adaptive immune response is called upon by antigen-presenting cells, with a progressive shift from a predominantly T-cell lesion to a B-cell dominated lesion typical of periodontitis.⁴³ As evidence of presence of neutrophils in gingival lesions and in root surfaces of AgP cases accumulated, 44,45 it emerged that neutrophils of AgP patients could be responsible for disease predisposition due to an array of suspected malfunctions, including increased adhesion, reduced chemotaxis, increased superoxide and nitric oxide production and reduced phagocytosis. 46-49 These neutrophil features would make individuals more susceptible to periodontitis upon subgingival microbial colonization. The 1999 Workshop also suggested among secondary features of AgP 'Hyper-responsive macrophage phenotype, including elevated levels of prostaglandin E2 (PGE2) and interleukin (IL)-1B'.5 Recently, an excessive local and systemic inflammatory response has been reported in AgP cases, specific to macrophage inflammatory protein (MIP)-1 α ⁵⁰ and to response to bacterial endotoxin in LAgP.⁵¹ A recent study investigated antibody response to periodontopathogenic bacteria in 119 patients (18 LAgP, 37 GAgP, 37 LCP, 27 GCP). Subgingival plaque samples were analyzed by checkerboard for 11 bacterial species, serum immunoglobulin G (IgG) levels against the same bacteria were investigated and 'infection ratios' (antibody level over the average bacterial colonization) were calculated for each patient. Interestingly, no differences in serum IgG levels to A. actinomycetemcomitans were detected. IgG levels to several species including P. gingivalis, Treponema denticola and Campilobacter rectus were highest in GAgP patients and significantly different from LCP and generalized CP, but not from LAgP. No differences in 'infection ratios' between GAgP and LAgP were detected, bringing evidence against the 'weak serum antibody responses' in GAgP patients. The authors concluded that serum IgG responses in GAgP are comparable to those in LAgP, but higher than in GCP or LCP for several species.⁵² However, it is important to point out that antibody responses are time-related and a positive titer may just indicate previous rather than necessarily present exposure.

Interestingly, even treated AgP cases exhibited an enhanced inflammatory response in an experimental gingivitis model, suggesting a possible constitutive hyper-inflammatory status. These clues lead to the understanding that, if chronically activated by certain microbial triggers, the host response could contribute to the extensive rapid tissue damage to the periodontium seen in these cases. Genetic studies investigating heritable AgP traits have focused on putative host response genotypes, which would cause constitutive neutrophil abnormalities or dysfunctions in other inflammatory/immune response pathways. Enthusiasm gained from linkage analyses and from the observation of single-gene defects leading to early onset forms of periodontitis has been dampened by the reality that AgP encompasses a large range of conditions clinically undistinguishable but possibly with different initiating factors. For example, the cathepsin C defects leading to a non-syndromic form of early onset periodontitis only affect a very small subpopulation of AgP cases.⁵⁴ Equally, the chromosome loci suggested by two separate genetic linkage studies 55,56 may indeed predispose to AgP, but probably just in

some sporadic cases or families. Promising putative single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) recently identified in genome-wide studies in the GLT6D1 and vitamin C transporter SVCT1 genes may increase the susceptibility to AgP^{57,58} in a complex genetic susceptibility profile interacting with environmental factors. Ethnic variations in the susceptibility to AgP and CP also need to be considered, as they have a strong impact on observed genetic associations (which change across different ethnic groups). Among other genetic variants, pro-inflammatory Interleukin (IL)-6 single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNP) 59 may act as risk modifiers by increasing the inflammatory potential upon microbial insults.⁶⁰ A moderate association between IL-6 genetic variants and increased detection of A. actinomycetemcomitans has been repeatedly shown in different periodontitis populations (both AgP and CP) by this author 12,61,62 and others, 63 underscoring the concept of infectogenomics and genetic dysbiosis.⁶⁴ In a study on 12 AgP patients selected based on their IL6 genotypes, we detected higher A. actinomycetemcomitans counts in IL6 'haplotype positive' subjects before treatment. Despite a reduction after treatment, these subjects tended to have a sharp increase in counts of A. actinomycetemcomitans again at the last study follow-up, 3 months after periodontal surgery, suggesting a strong genetic influence on pocket re-colonization.⁶⁵ Further examples of interactions between host genetic and microbial factors in AgP can be found in the A. actinomycetemcimitans-leukotoxin activation and secretion of bioactive IL-1B and IL-18 by human macrophages,⁶⁶ which might act in synergy with the IL- 1β polymorphism to cause an imbalance in the host response. Recently, gene expression analyses of gingival biopsies from 55 AgP cases identified overexpressed genes related to immune responses (esp B cells and Nk cells), apoptosis, and signal transduction when compared with gingival samples from 65 CP patients.⁶⁷ This suggests some possible differences in pathogenic pathways between AgP and CP. However, studies investigating differences between AgP and CP identified no evidence of differences in the inflammatory infiltrate 68 or in the cells and processes involved, only suspecting a possibly different shift from T-cell to B-cell lesion in AgP compared with CP.⁶⁹

A compelling example of early onset periodontal destruction is given by localized aggressive periodontitis (LAgP), characterized by a circumpubertal onset and a strong antibody response to periodontal pathogenic bacteria.⁵ LAgP affects first molars and incisors, the first teeth to erupt in the mouth at age 6-8. The disease progresses very rapidly, with periodontal attachment and alveolar bone loss but then it often stops even in the absence of therapy,⁷⁰ suggesting a possible host response adaptation or the mounting of an effective and 'mature' antibody response to pathogenic bacteria.^{71,72} Cementum hypoplasia and a possible role of Cytomegalovirus infection during root formation (causing malformation of attachment apparatus) have been hypothesized as a possible cause of LAgP.73,74 However, evidence for a possible role of viruses in AgP is still controversial.⁷⁵ Furthermore, owing to its relative rarity, not many investigations on LAgP have been produced in the literature especially with regards to possible genetic risk factors affecting the host response.

Conclusions

Subjects affected by AgP seem to suffer from a 'primed' host response status particularly susceptible to certain microbial triggers.⁵³ Within this context, in line with the polymicrobial synergy and dysbiosis hypothesis,^{76,77} potential keystone periodontal pathogens could lead to disruption of tissue homeostasis and the subsequent dysbiotic change in the subgingival biofilm may induce AgP. For instance, 'hyper-inflammatory' genotypes (as in IL-1 or IL-6 hyper-producers)^{59,78} might predispose to subgingival environments more conducive to the growth of bacteria which grow well in more inflamed area such as A. actinomycetemcomitans. This is still a theory, but is substantiated by the association between IL6 genotypes and detection of A. actinomycetemcomitans and re-colonization with this bacterium following periodontal treatment.^{30,61,62,65} The subgingival presence and pathogenic relevance of specific bacteria and strains such as A. actinomycetemcomitans JP2 clone is probably modulated by age but is under a strong host genetic influence, as testified by the prevalence of this clone in people of specific ethnicity, not necessarily dependent on their geographic origin.^{79,80} The JP2 has

References

- Lang N, Bartold PM, Cullinan M, Jeffcoat M, Mombelli A, Murakami S, Page R, Papapanou P, Tonetti M, & Van Dyke T. Consensus report: aggressive periodontitis. Annals Periodontol 1999; 4:53; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1902/annals.1999.4.1.53
- Baer PN. The case for periodontosis as a clinical entity. J Periodontol 1971; 42(8):516-20; PMID:5284178; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/jop.1971.42.8.516
- Albandar JM, Tinoco EM. Global epidemiology of periodontal diseases in children and young persons. Periodontol 2000 2002; 29:153-76; PMID:12102707
- Gottlieb B. The formation of the pocket: diffuse atrophy of the alveolar bone. J Amer Dent Assoc 1928; 15:462-476.
- Armitage GC. Development of a classification system for periodontal diseases and conditions. Northwest Dent 2000; 79(6):31-5; PMID:11413609
- Loe H, Theilade E, Jensen SB. Experimental gingivitis in man. J Periodontol 1965; 36:177-87; PMID:14296927; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/ jop.1965.
 36:3.177
- Theilade E, Wright WH, Jensen SB, Loe H. Experimental gingivitis in man. II. A longitudinal clinical and bacteriological investigation. J Periodontal Res 1966; 1:1-13; PMID:4224181; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/ j.1600-0765.1966.tb01842.x
- Macdonald JB, Sutton RM, Knoll ML, Madlener EM, Grainger RM. The pathogenic components of an experimental fusospirochetal infection. J Infect Dis 1956; 98:15; PMID:13295619; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1093/infdis/98.1.15
- Loesche WJ. Clinical and microbiological aspects of chemotherapeutic agents used according to the specific plaque hypothesis. J Dent Res 1979; 58(12):2404-12; PMID:41862; http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/00220345-790580120905
- Listgarten MA. Structure of the microbial flora associated with periodontal health and disease in man. A light and electron microscopic study. J Periodontol 1976; 47 (1):1-18; PMID:1063849; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/ jop.1976.47.1.1
- Newman HN. The apical border of plaque in chronic inflammatory periodontal disease. Br Dent J 1976; 141 (4):105-13; PMID:1067109; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1038/sj.bdj.4803800

- Socransky SS. Criteria for the infectious agents in dental caries and periodontal disease. J Clin Periodontol 1979; 6(7):16-21; PMID:295292; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1600-051X.1979.tb02114.x
- Zambon JJ, Christersson LA, Slots J. Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans in human periodontal disease. Prevalence in patient groups and distribution of biotypes and serotypes within families. J Periodontol 1983; 54(12):707-11; PMID:6358452; http://dx.doi. org/10.1902/jop.1983.54.12.707
- Mandell RL, Ebersole JL, Socransky SS. Clinical immunologic and microbiologic features of active disease sites in juvenile periodontitis. J Clin Periodontol 1987; 14(9):534-40; PMID:3316298; http://dx.doi. org/10.1111/j.1600-051X.1987.tb00996.x
- Ebersole JL, Cappelli D. Gingival crevicular fluid antibody to Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans in periodontal disease. Oral Microbiol Immunol 1994; 9 (6):335-44; PMID:7870468; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1399-302X.1994.tb00283.x
- Albandar JM, DeNardin AM, Adesanya MR, Diehl SR, Winn DM. Associations between serum antibody levels to periodontal pathogens and early-onset periodontitis. J Periodontol 2001; 72(11):1463-9; PMID:11759856; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/jop.2001.72.11.1463
- Tsai CC, Shenker BJ, DiRienzo JM, Malamud D, Taichman NS. Extraction and isolation of a leukotoxin from Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans with polymyxin B. Infect Immun 1984; 43(2):700-5; PMID:6319288
- Brogan JM, Lally ET, Poulsen K, Kilian M, Demuth DR. Regulation of Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans leukotoxin expression: analysis of the promoter regions of leukotoxic and minimally leukotoxic strains. Infect Immun 1994; 62(2):501-8; PMID:8300209
- Kononen E, Muller HP. Microbiology of aggressive periodontitis. Periodontol 2000 2014; 65(1):46-78; PMID:24738586; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/prd.12016
- Fine DH, Markowitz K, Furgang D, Fairlie K, Ferrandiz J, Nasri C, McKiernan M, Gunsolley J. Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans and its relationship to initiation of localized aggressive periodontitis: longitudinal cohort study of initially healthy adolescents. J Clin Microbiol 2007; 45(12):3859-69; PMID:17942658; http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/ ICM.00653-07
- 21. Van d, V, Abbas F, Armand S, Loos BG, Timmerman MF, Van der Weijden GA, Van Winkelhoff AJ, Winkel

shown strong evidence of association with disease initiation and progression.^{20,23} This association seems more evident than previously-reported associations between bacteria such as *P. gingivalis* and *T. denticola* and progression of chronic periodontitis.^{81,82} However, the jury is still out on whether JP2 clone may work as a classical exogenous bacterium or if it is involved in a dysbiotic process. Hence, host genetic variants may be responsible for the dysbiotic process or for an altered response to dysbiotic changes and cooperate with keystone bacteria and environmental factors in the onset and progression of AgP. However, it has to be borne in mind that AgP probably covers a range of etiologically diverse but clinically undistinguishable entities originating from a complex web of interactions between microbiological and host response factors.

Funding

This review was supported by the Periodontal Research Fund of the UCL Eastman Dental Institute and it was undertaken at UCL, which received a proportion of funding from the Department of Health's National Institute of Health Research (NIHR) Biomedical Research Centers funding scheme.

EG. Java project on periodontal diseases. The natural development of periodontiis: risk factors, risk predictors and risk determinants. J Clin Periodontol 2006; 33 (8):540-8; PMID:16899096; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1600-051X.2006.00953.x

- Muller HP, Eger T, Lobinsky D, Hoffmann S, Zoller L. A longitudinal study of Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans in army recruits. J Periodontal Res 1997; 32(1 Pt 1):69-78; PMID:9085245; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/ j.1600-0765.1997.tb01384.x
- Haubek D, Ennibi OK, Poulsen K, Vaeth M, Poulsen S, Kilian M. Risk of aggressive periodontitis in adolescent carriers of the JP2 clone of Aggregatibacter (Actinobacillus) actinomycetemcomitans in Morocco: a prospective longitudinal cohort study. Lancet 2008; 371(9608):237-42; PMID:18207019; http://dx.doi. org/10.1016/S0140-6736(08)60135-X
- Höglund Åberg C, Kwamin F, Claesson R, Dahlén G, Johansson A, Haubek D. Progression of attachment loss is strongly associated with presence of the JP2 genotype of Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans: a prospective cohort study of a young adolescent population. J Clin Periodontol 2014; 41:232-41; PMID:24304011; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/ jcpe.12209
- Höglund Åberg C, Haubek D, Kwamin F, Johansson A, Claesson R. Leukotoxic activity of Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans and periodontal attachment loss. PLOS One 2014; 9:e104095; PMID:25093857; http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0104095
- Moore WE, Holdeman LV, Cato EP, Smibert RM, Burmeister JA, Palcanis KG, Ranney RR. Comparative bacteriology of juvenile periodontitis. Infect Immun 1985; 48(2):507-19; PMID:3988344
- Faveri M, Figueiredo LC, Duarte PM, Mestnik MJ, Mayer MP, Feres M. Microbiological profile of untreated subjects with localized aggressive periodontitis. J Clin Periodontol 2009; 36(9):739-49; PMID:19637996; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-051X.2009.01449.x
- Albandar JM, Brown LJ, Loe H. Putative periodontal pathogens in subgingival plaque of young adults with and without early-onset periodontitis. J Periodontol 1997; 68(10):973-81; PMID:9358364; http://dx.doi. org/10.1902/jop.1997.68.10.973
- Gafan GP, Lucas VS, Roberts GJ, Petrie A, Wilson M, Spratt DA. Prevalence of periodontal pathogens in dental plaque of children. J Clin Microbiol 2004; 42

(9):4141-6; PMID:15365002; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1128/JCM.42.9.4141-4146.2004

- Nibali L, D'Aiuto F, Ready D, Parkar M, Yahaya R, Donos N. No association between A actinomycetemcomitans or P gingivalis and chronic or aggressive periodontitis diagnosis. Quintessence Int 2012; 43(3): 247-54; PMID:22299125
- Schlafer S, Riep B, Griffen AL, Petrich A, Hubner J, Berning M, Friedmann A, Gobel UB, Moter A. Filifactor alocis—involvement in periodontal biofilms. BMC Microbiol 2010; 10:66; PMID:20193074; http://dx. doi.org/10.1186/1471-2180-10-66
- 32. Drescher J, Schlafer S, Schaudinn C, Riep B, Neumann K, Friedmann A, Petrich A, Gobel UB, Moter A. Molecular epidemiology and spatial distribution of Selenomonas spp. in subgingival biofilms. Eur J Oral Sci 2010; 118(5):466-74; PMID:20831580; http://dx. doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0722.2010.00765.x
- Goncalves LF, Fermiano D, Feres M, Figueiredo LC, Teles FR, Mayer MP, Faveri M. Levels of Selenomonas species in generalized aggressive periodontitis. J Periodontal Res 2012; 47(6):711-8; PMID:22612405; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0765.2012.01485.x
- 34. da Silva-Boghossian CM, do Souto RM, Luiz RR, Colombo AP. Association of red complex, A. actinomycetemcomitans and non-oral bacteria with periodontal diseases. Arch Oral Biol 2011; 56(9):899-906; PMID:21397893; http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j. archoralbio.2011.02.009
- Riep B, Edesi-Neuss L, Claessen F, Skarabis H, Ehmke B, Flemmig TF, Bernimoulin JP, Gobel UB, Moter A. Are putative periodontal pathogens reliable diagnostic markers? J Clin Microbiol 2009; 47(6):1705-11; PMID:19386852; http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JCM.01387-08
- Matarazzo F, Ribeiro AC, Feres M, Faveri M, Mayer MP. Diversity and quantitative analysis of Archaea in aggressive periodontitis and periodontally healthy subjects. J Clin Periodontol 2011; 38(7):621-7; PMID:21539593; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-051X.2011.01734.x
- Dahlén G, Claesson R, Aberg CH, Haubek D, Johansson A, Kwamin F. Subgingival bacteria in Ghanaian adolescents with or without progression of attachment loss. J Oral Microbiol. 2014; 6(6); PMID:24834145; http://dx.doi.org/10.3402/jom.v6.23977
- Darby IB, Hodge PJ, Riggio MP, Kinane DF. Microbial comparison of smoker and non-smoker adult and early-onset periodontiis patients by polymerase chain reaction. J Clin Periodontol 2000; 27(6):417-24; PMID:10883871; http://dx.doi.org/10.1034/j.1600-051x.2000.027006417.x
- Lafaurie GI, Contreras A, Baron A, Botero J, Mayorga-Fayad I, Jaramillo A, Giraldo A, Gonzalez F, Mantilla S, Botero A, et al. Demographic, clinical, and microbial aspects of chronic and aggressive periodontitis in Colombia: a multicenter study. J Periodontol 2007; 78 (4):629-39; PMID:17397309; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1902/jop.2007.060187
- Gajardo M, Silva N, Gomez L, Leon R, Parra B, Contreras A, Gamonal J. Prevalence of periodontopathic bacteria in aggressive periodontitis patients in a Chilean population. J Periodontol 2005; 76(2):289-94; PMID:15974855; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/ jop.2005.76.2.289
- Trombelli L. Susceptibility to gingivitis: a way to predict periodontal disease? Oral Health Prev Dent 2004; 2 Suppl 1:265-9; PMID:15646584
- Orban B, Weinmann JP. Diffuse atrophy of the alveolar bone (periodontosis). J Periodontol 1942; 13:31-45.
- Kornman KS, Page RC, Tonetti MS. The host response to the microbial challenge in periodontitis: assembling the players. Periodontol 2000 1997; 14:33-53; PMID:9567965; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0757.1997.tb00191.x
- Fine DH, Oshrain R. Preliminary characterization of material eluted from roots affected by juvenile periodontitis. J Periodontal Res 1984; 19(2):146-51;

PMID:6231365; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0765.1984.tb00803.x

- Rams TE, Keyes PH. Direct microscopic features of subgingival plaque in localized and generalized juvenile periodontitis. Pediatr Dent 1984; 6(1):23-7; PMID:6592544
- 46. Shapira L, Borinski R, Sela MN, Soskolne A. Superoxide formation and chemiluminescence of peripheral polymorphonuclear leukocytes in rapidly progressive periodontitis patients. J Clin Periodontol 1991; 18 (1):44-8; PMID:1646239; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/ j.1600-051X.1991.tb01118.x
- Leino L, Hurttia HM, Sorvajarvi K, Sewon LA. Increased respiratory burst activity is associated with normal expression of IgG-Fc-receptors and complement receptors in peripheral neutrophils from patients with juvenile periodontitis. J Periodontal Res 1994; 29 (3):179-84; PMID:8207628; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1600-0765.1994.tb01211.x
- Shibata K, Warbington ML, Gordon BJ, Kurihara H, Van Dyke TE. Nitric oxide synthase activity in neutrophils from patients with localized aggressive periodontitis. J Periodontol 2001; 72(8):1052-8; PMID:11525437; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/jop.2001.72.8.1052
- Kantarci A, Oyaizu K, Van Dyke TE. Neutrophilmediated tissue injury in periodontal disease pathogenesis: findings from localized aggressive periodontitis. J Periodontol 2003; 74(1):66-75; PMID:12593599; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/jop.2003.74.1.66
- Fine DH, Markowitz K, Fairlie K, Tischio-Bereski D, Ferrandiz J, Godboley D, Furgang D, Gunsolley J, Best A. Macrophage inflammatory protein-lalpha shows predictive value as a risk marker for subjects and sites vulnerable to bone loss in a longitudinal model of aggressive periodontitis. PLOS One 2014; 9(6): e98541; PMID:24901458; http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/ journal.pone.0098541
- Shaddox LM, Wiedey J, Calderon NL, Magnusson I, Bimstein E, Bidwell JA, Zapert EF, Aukhil I, Waller SM. Local inflammatory markers and systemic endotoxin in aggressive periodontitis. J Dent Res 2011; 90 (9):1140-4; PMID:21730256; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1177/0022034511413928
- Hwang AM, Stoupel J, Celenti R, Demmer RT, Papapanou PN. Serum antibody responses to periodontal microbiota in chronic and aggressive periodontitis: a postulate revisited. J Periodontol 2014; 85(4):592-600; PMID:23725029; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/jop.2013.
 130172
- Trombelli L, Scapoli C, Tatakis DN, Minenna L. Modulation of clinical expression of plaque-induced gingivitis: response in aggressive periodontitis subjects. J Clin Periodontol 2006; 33(2):79-85; PMID:16441729; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-051X.2005.00873.x
- Hewitt C, McCormick D, Linden G, Turk D, Stern I, Wallace I, Southern L, Zhang L, Howard R, Bullon P et al. The role of cathepsin C in Papillon-Lefevre syndrome, prepubertal periodontitis, and aggressive periodontitis. Hum Mutat 2004; 23(3):222-8; PMID:14974080; http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/humu. 10314
- Hart TC, Hart PS, Michalec MD, Zhang Y, Marazita ML, Cooper M, Yassin OM, Nusier M, Walker S. Localisation of a gene for prepubertal periodontitis to chromosome 11q14 and identification of a cathepsin C gene mutation. J Med Genet 2000; 37(2):95-101; PMID:10662808; http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/ jmg.37.2.95
- Li Y, Xu L, Hasturk H, Kantarci A, DePalma SR, Van Dyke TE. Localized aggressive periodontitis is linked to human chromosome 1q25. Hum Genet 2004; 114 (3):291-7; PMID:14673644; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1007/s00439-003-1065-7
- Schaefer AS, Richter GM, Nothnagel M, Manke T, Dommisch H, Jacobs G, Arlt A, Rosenstiel P, Noack B, Groessner-Schreiber B, et al. A genome-wide

association study identifies GLT6D1 as a susceptibility locus for periodontitis. Hum Mol Genet 2010; 19 (3):553-62; PMID:19897590; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1093/hmg/ddp508

- de Jong TM, Jochens A, Jockel-Schneider Y, Harks I, Dommisch H, Graetz C, Flachsbart F, Staufenbiel I, Eberhard J, Folwaczny M, et al. SLC23A1 polymorphism rs6596473 in the vitamin C transporter SVCT1 is associated with aggressive periodontitis. J Clin Periodontol 2014; 41(6):531-40; PMID:24708273; http:// dx.doi.org/10.1111/jcpe.12253
- Fishman D, Faulds G, Jeffery R, Mohamed-Ali V, Yudkin JS, Humphries S, Woo P. The effect of novel polymorphisms in the interleukin-6 (IL-6) gene on IL-6 transcription and plasma IL-6 levels, and an association with systemic-onset juvenile chronic arthritis. J Clin Invest 1998; 102(7):1369-76; PMID:9769329; http:// dx.doi.org/10.1172/JCI2629
- Nibali L, D'Aiuto F, Donos N, Griffiths GS, Parkar M, Tonetti MS, Humphries SE, Brett PM. Association between periodontitis and common variants in the promoter of the interleukin-6 gene. Cytokine 2009; 45 (1):50-4; PMID:19084430; http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/ j.cyto.2008.10.016
- Nibali L, Ready DR, Parkar M, Brett PM, Wilson M, Tonetti MS, Griffiths GS. Gene polymorphisms and the prevalence of key periodontal pathogens. J Dent Res 2007; 86(5):416-20; PMID:17452560; http://dx. doi.org/10.1177/154405910708600505
- Nibali L, Madden I, Franch CF, Heitz-Mayfield L, Brett P, Donos N. IL6 -174 genotype associated with Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans in Indians. Oral Dis 2011; 17(2):232-7; PMID:20860759; http:// dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1601-0825.2010.01731.x
- Divaris K, Monda KL, North KE, Olshan AF, Lange EM, Moss K, Barros SP, Beck JD, Offenbacher S. Genome-wide association study of periodontal pathogen colonization. J Dent Res 2012; 91(7 Suppl):21S-8S; PMID:22699663; http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/ 0022034512447951
- Nibali L, Henderson B, Sadiq ST, Donos N. Genetic dysbiosis: the role of microbial insults in chronic inflammatory diseases. J Oral Microbiol 2014; 25(6); PMID:24578801; http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/00220345111413928
- Nibali L, Pelekos G, D'Aiuto F, Chaudhary N, Habeeb R, Ready D, Parkar M, Donos N. Influence of IL-6 haplotypes on clinical and inflammatory response in aggressive periodontitis. Clin Oral Investig 2013; 17 (4):1235-42; PMID:22918663; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1007/s00784-012-0804-3
- 66. Kelk P, Abd H, Claesson R, Sandström G, Sjöstedt A, Johansson A. Cellular and molecular response of human macrophages exposed to Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans leukotoxin. Cell Death Dis 2011; 2: e126; PMID:21390060; http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/ cddis.
 - 2011.6
- Kebschull M, Guarnieri P, Demmer RT, Boulesteix AL, Pavlidis P, Papapanou PN. Molecular differences between chronic and aggressive periodontitis. J Dent Res 2013; 92(12):1081-8; PMID:24122488; http://dx. doi.org/10.1177/0022034513506011
- Smith M, Seymour GJ, Cullinan MP. Histopathological features of chronic and aggressive periodontitis. Periodontol 2000 2010; 53:45-54; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1600-0757.2010.00354.x
- Bartold PM, Cantley MD, Haynes DR. Mechanisms and control of pathologic bone loss in periodontitis. Periodontol 2000 2010; 53:55-69; http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1600-0757.2010.00347.x
- Mros ST, Berglundh T. Aggressive periodontitis in children: a 14-19-year follow-up. J Clin Periodontol 2010; 37(3):283-7; PMID:20088981; http://dx.doi. org/10.1111/j.1600-051X.2009.01526.x
- Rylev M, Bek-Thomsen M, Reinholdt J, Ennibi OK, Kilian M. Microbiological and immunological characteristics of young Moroccan patients with aggressive periodontitis with and without detectable

Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans JP2 infection. Mol Oral Microbiol 2011; 26(1):35-51; PMID:21214871; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.2041-1014.2010.00593.x

- Kullarni C, Kinane DF. Host response in aggressive periodontitis. Periodontol 2000 2014;65(1):79-91; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/prd.12017
- Blomlof L, Hammarstrom L, Lindskog S. Occurrence and appearance of cementum hypoplasias in localized and generalized juvenile periodontitis. Acta Odontol Scand 1986; 44(5):313-20; PMID:3468742; http://dx. doi.org/10.3109/00016358609004739
- Slots J. Human viruses in periodontitis. Periodontol 2000 2010 June; 53:89-110; PMID:20403107; http:// dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0757.2009.00325.x
- Stein JM, Said Yekta S, Kleines M, Ok D, Kasaj A, Reichert S, Schulz S, Scheithauer S. Failure to detect an association between aggressive periodontitis and the prevalence of herpesviruses. J Clin Periodontol 2013; 40:1-7; PMID:23163882; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/ jcpe.12021
- Hajishengallis G, Liang S, Payne MA, Hashim A, Jotwani R, Eskan MA, McIntosh ML, Alsam A, Kirkwood KL, Lambris JD, Darveau RP, Curtis MA. Low-abundance biofilm species orchestrates inflammatory periodontal disease through the commensal microbiota and complement. Cell Host Microbe 2011; 10(5):497-506; PMID:22036469; http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.chom. 2011.10.006
- 77. Hajishengallis G, Lamont RJ. Beyond the red complex and into more complexity: the polymicrobial synergy and dysbiosis (PSD) model of periodontal disease etiology. Mol Oral Microbiol 2012; 27(6):409-19; PMID:23134607; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.2041-1014.2012.00663.x
- Bailly S, di Giovine FS, Blakemore AI, Duff GW. Genetic polymorphism of human interleukin-1 alpha. Eur J Immunol 1993; 23(6):1240-5; PMID:8099012; http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/eji.1830230607
- Yang HW, Asikainen S, Dogan B, Suda R, Lai CH. Relationship of Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans serotype b to aggressive periodontitis: frequency in pure cultured isolates. J Periodontol 2004; 75(4):592-9;

PMID:15152825; http://dx.doi.org/10.1902/ jop.2004.75.4.592

- Haubek D, Johansson A. Pathogenicity of the highly leukotoxic JP2 clone of Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans and its geographic dissemination and role in aggressive periodontitis. J Oral Microbiol 2014; 6; PMID:25206940; http://dx.doi. org/10.3402/jom.v6.23980
- Byrne SJ, Dashper SG, Darby IB, Adams GG, Hoffmann B, Reynolds EC. Progression of chronic periodontitis can be predicted by the levels of Porphyromonas gingivalis and Treponema denticola in subgingival plaque. Oral Microbiol Immunol 2009; 24:469-77; PMID:19832799; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1399-302X.2009.00544.x
- Charalampakis G, Dahlén G, Carlén A, Leonhardt A. Bacterial markers vs. clinical markers to predict progression of chronic periodontitis: a 2-yr prospective observational study. Eur J Oral Sci 2013; 121:394-402; PMID:24028586; http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/ cos.12080