

1 Moxifloxacin replacement in contemporary tuberculosis drug regimens is ineffective against
2 persistent *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: Novel insights from the Cornell mouse model

3 Yingjun Liu¹, Henry Pertinez², Geraint R. Davies², Stephen H. Gillespie³, Anthony R. Coates¹
4 and Yanmin Hu^{1*}

5 ¹Institute for Infection and immunity, St George's, University of London, Cranmer Terrace,
6 London SW17 0RE, United Kingdom. ²Department of Molecular and Clinical Pharmacology,
7 University of Liverpool, Liverpool L69 3GF, United Kingdom. ³School of Medicine,
8 University of St Andrews, St Andrews KY16 9TF United Kingdom.

9
10 Running title: Moxifloxacin regimens do not kill culture filtrate-dependent *Mycobacterium*
11 *tuberculosis*

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23 *Corresponding author. Tel: +44-2087255706; Fax: +44-2087250137. E-mail:

24 ymhu@sgul.ac.uk

25

26

27 Abstract

28

29 Tuberculosis (TB) caused by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* remains a leading killer worldwide,
30 and disease control is hampered by ineffective control of persistent infections. Substitution of
31 moxifloxacin for isoniazid or ethambutol in standard TB regimens reduces treatment duration
32 and relapse rates in animal studies and four-month regimens were not non-inferior in clinical
33 trials. Resuscitation promoting factor (RPF) dependent bacilli have recently been implicated in
34 *M. tuberculosis* persistence. We aimed to investigate the therapeutic effects of moxifloxacin
35 substitution in the standard drug regimen for eradicating colony forming count (CFU) positive
36 and RPF-dependent persistent *M. tuberculosis* using the Cornell murine model. *M. tuberculosis*
37 infected mice were treated with regimens in which either isoniazid or ethambutol were
38 replaced by moxifloxacin to the standard regimen. The efficacy of the regimens was compared
39 to the standard regimen for bacterial CFU count elimination and removal of persistent tubercle
40 bacilli evaluated using culture filtrate (CF) derived from *M. tuberculosis* strain H37Rv. We
41 also measured disease relapse rates. Moxifloxacin-isoniazid substituted regimen achieved total
42 organ CFU count clearance at 11 weeks post-treatment, faster than standard regimen (14
43 weeks), and with a 34% lower relapse rate. Moxifloxacin-ethambutol substituted regimen was
44 similar to standard regimens in these regards. Importantly, neither moxifloxacin-substituted
45 regimens nor the standard regimen could remove CF-dependent persistent bacilli. Evaluation
46 of CF-dependent persistent *M. tuberculosis* requires confirmation in human studies, and has
47 implications in future drug design, testing and clinical applications.

48 Key words: *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, moxifloxacin, Resuscitation promoting factors,
49 Cornell mouse model

50

51

52

53

54 INTRODUCTION

55 TB caused by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* remains a leading cause of mortality worldwide (1).
56 Current combination antimicrobial regimens require a prolonged 6-month treatment period.
57 This long regimen leads to poor patient compliance which gives rise to the emergence of drug
58 resistance and high relapse rates (2). Substitution of moxifloxacin (an 8-methoxy
59 fluoroquinolone) for drugs in the contemporary anti-TB regimen has shown promise for
60 improving treatment efficacy (3, 4). *In vivo*, replacement of isoniazid with moxifloxacin led to
61 shortened treatment duration (5, 6), reduced relapse rates (6, 7) and favourable outcomes in
62 BALB/c and granuloma-forming C3HeB/FeJ mice (8). In the recent REMox-TB trial, shorter
63 (four-month) moxifloxacin-replacement regimens (either for isoniazid or ethambutol) in human
64 clinical trials failed to achieve non-inferiority compared to standard regimens (3, 4), mainly
65 due to higher relapse rates (3, 4, 9). Persistent bacteria that are tolerant to drug therapy may be
66 implicated in the higher disease relapse (9).

67 *M. tuberculosis* persistence is the single most important hurdle hampering effective TB disease
68 control (10). *M. tuberculosis* has the ability to survive in a dormant, non-multiplying and
69 persistent state (11-14). These persistent bacteria do not grow on solid or liquid media and are
70 undetectable using the conventional diagnostic methods, however can be resuscitated using
71 resuscitation promoting factors (RPF) which are present in *M. tuberculosis* culture supernatant
72 (15). Recently, we found that using culture filtrate (CF) containing RPF (15), could induce
73 persistent bacteria to recommence multiplication, rendering them detectable once more in mice
74 (16-18). Moreover, these CF-resuscitated tubercle bacilli could be completely eliminated using
75 high-dose rifampicin regimens, shortening treatment duration with no disease relapses (16, 18).

76 In this study, we used the Cornell mouse model (19, 20) to investigate the therapeutic impact
77 of moxifloxacin replacement in standard TB regimen against both CFU count positive and CF-
78 dependent bacteria. We compared the regimens in which either isoniazid or ethambutol were
79 replaced by moxifloxacin to the standard regimen by measurements of the elimination rates of

80 CFU counts, the presence of CF-dependent *M. tuberculosis* in mouse organs and disease
81 relapse rates.

82

83 MATERIALS AND METHODS

84 **Bacterium and growth conditions.** *M. tuberculosis* strain H37Rv was mouse-passaged and
85 grown in 7H9 medium containing 0.05% Tween 80 and supplemented with 10% albumin
86 dextrose complex (ADC; Becton and Dickinson, UK) at 37°C without disturbance for 15
87 days. The culture was stored at -70°C for subsequent animal infection. To determine the viable
88 counts prior to infection, colony forming unit (CFU) counts were performed prior to freezing
89 and once again after thawing. The CFU counting was carried out by plating serial 10-fold
90 dilutions of the cultures on 7H11 agar medium supplemented with oleic albumin dextrose
91 complex (OADC, Becton and Dickinson, UK). Colonies were counted after incubation of
92 the plates at 37°C for 3 to 4 weeks. Viability was expressed as Log CFU/ml. The cultures were
93 subsequently diluted in PBS and used for inoculations in mice.

94 **Cornell mouse model.** Moxifloxacin (M) substitution for either isoniazid (H) or ethambutol
95 (E) in the standard TB drug regimen with rifampicin (R) and pyrazinamide (Z) was tested
96 using the Cornell mouse model (19, 20). The model was conducted using the experimental
97 design and procedure described previously (17).

98 Female BALB/c mice (6 to 8 weeks old, Harlan UK Ltd) were infected intravenously via the
99 tail vein with 1.2×10^5 CFU of mouse-passaged *M. tuberculosis* strain H37Rv per mouse as
100 described previously (16, 17, 20). The animal husbandry guidelines and all animal experiments
101 were performed according to the Animals Scientific Procedures Act, 1986 (an Act of the
102 Parliament of the United Kingdom 1986 c. 14) (Home Office Project licence Number 70/7077)
103 with approval from St George's, University of London ethics committee.

104 As shown in Table 1, control group consisted of 8 infected and untreated mice. The treatment
105 groups each contained 54 mice which were treated orally (0.2 ml) with RHZE, RHZM and
106 RMZE regimens, respectively, 5 days per week for 14 weeks. The dosages for the drugs were
107 R 10 mg/kg, H 25 mg/kg, Z 150 mg/kg, E 100 mg/kg and M 100 mg/kg. Rifampicin was
108 administered 1 hour before the other drugs to avoid drug to drug interactions.

109 For assessment of treatment efficacy, a sample of 4 mice was sacrificed at 2, 4, and 6 weeks
110 and 8 mice were sacrificed at 8, 11 and 14 weeks of treatment (Table 1). Mouse lungs and
111 spleens were transferred into 2 ml tubes each containing 1 ml sterile distilled water and 2 mm
112 diameter glass beads, followed by homogenizing using a reciprocal shaker (Thermo Hybaid
113 Ltd) for 40 seconds at 6.5 speed. The CFU counts from each lung and spleen were performed
114 using serial dilutions of the homogenates to plate on 7H11 agar plates.

115 At 11 and 14 weeks of treatment, the entire organ homogenates from the 8 mice were aliquoted
116 equally into three tubes which were used 1. The CFU counting by plating out the organ
117 homogenate suspension on 6 selective 7H11 agar plates. 2. culturing in 5 ml of selective
118 Kirchner liquid medium (21) by the addition of polymyxin B 200 U/ml, carbenicillin 100
119 mg/l, trimethoprim 20 mg/l and amphotericin B 10 mg/l (Selectatab, Mast Diagnostica GmbH)
120 for 4 weeks with subsequent sub-culturing of the entire culture onto Löwenstein-Jensen slopes
121 for a further 4 weeks and 3. resuscitation of persistent bacteria by culture filtrate. Kirchner
122 liquid medium was used to isolate different species of mycobacteria from human specimens.
123 Mitchison *et al* (21) showed that liquid Kirchner medium, made selective by the addition of the
124 antimicrobials, was more effective in the isolation of mycobacteria than other media tested.
125 Culture negative organs were defined as no colonies grown on 7H11 agar plates and no growth
126 in selective Kirchner liquid medium following inoculation on Löwenstein-Jensen slopes.

127 Immediately after termination of 14 weeks of chemotherapy, the remaining mice were
128 administered 0.5 mg/mouse of hydrocortisone acetate by daily oral administration for 8 weeks
129 to suppress host immunity, followed by CFU counting from lungs and spleens to determine
130 disease relapse.

131 **Resuscitation of *M. tuberculosis* in mouse lungs and spleens.** For resuscitation of *M.*
132 *tuberculosis* grown in mouse organs, culture filtrates containing RPFs were used as described
133 previously (15-17).

134 *M. tuberculosis* H37Rv was grown in 7H9 medium without disturbance at 37°C for 15 to 20
135 days until an optical density of 1 to 1.5 was reached. The culture supernatants were collected
136 by centrifugation at 3000 g for 15 minutes and sterilized by double filtration with 0.2 µm filters
137 (Sartorius). The sterilized culture filtrates were made selective by the addition of polymyxin B
138 200 U/ml, carbenicillin 100 mg/l, trimethoprim 20 mg/l and amphotericin B 10 mg/l
139 (Selectatab, Mast Diagnostica GmbH) and immediately used for broth dilution to count the
140 most probable number (MPN) of the bacilli (22).

141 Broth counting of lungs and spleens was performed as serial 10-fold dilutions in which 0.5 ml
142 of tissue homogenates were added to 4.5 ml of the culture filtrates. At 10-day intervals over a
143 2-month period of incubation at 37°C, the broth cultures were examined for visible turbidity
144 changes. Growth of *M. tuberculosis* in turbid tubes was confirmed by colonial morphology on
145 7H11 agar plates. The MPN of viable bacilli was then estimated from the patterns of positive
146 and negative tubes according to the method of US Food and Drug Administration (22). The
147 absence of microorganisms other than mycobacteria from turbid tubes was confirmed by
148 plating on blood agar medium (Oxoid) and Sabouraud dextrose agar (Oxoid). In order to assess
149 the sterility of culture filtrates free of *M. tuberculosis*, tubes containing culture filtrates were
150 incubated at 37°C for 2 months to ensure the absence of *M. tuberculosis* in the culture filtrates.

151 **Statistical analysis.** A simple model for mono-exponential bacterial growth and elimination
152 (17, 23) was fitted to the profiles of CFU vs. time obtained experimentally. As simultaneously
153 occurring exponential replication and death rates cannot be differentiated with this type of data,
154 a “knet” exponential rate constant was estimated separately before treatment began
155 (“knet_no_drug” where it would take a net positive value) and during treatment
156 (“knet_with_drug” where it would take a net negative value). During therapy, knet is a 1st order
157 elimination rate constant which can be interpreted as the slope of the modelled line fit through
158 the logarithmic-transform of the data (with units in these data of wk⁻¹). Parameter estimation

159 was carried out with nonlinear regression using the nonlinear least squares optimisation
160 function “lsqnonlin” as part of the “pracma” package in the R statistical software language,
161 with an objective function weighted by $1/(\text{predicted value})^2$. Standard errors of parameter
162 estimates were calculated using the method described previously (24) with the Jacobian of
163 model parameter sensitivities estimated using a numerical central difference method. The
164 datasets comprised from multiple individual subject animals were treated as a naïve pool for
165 data analysis purposes (25) rather than using the average of the data at each time-point. The
166 significance of differences between model parameter estimates under different therapies was
167 examined with pairwise Z-tests incorporating a Bonferroni correction of 3, where P values
168 <0.017 would be considered significant. The significance of differences between the relapse
169 rates was determined with pairwise Fisher’s exact tests also with a Bonferroni correction of 3,
170 with P values <0.017 considered significant.

171

172 RESULTS

173 **Treatment with moxifloxacin containing regimens in the Cornell mouse model.** In the
174 Cornell model, after three weeks of infection, mean CFU counts in the organs reached log 7.54
175 in lungs and 6.99 in spleens (Table 2).

176 When we investigated the substitution of moxifloxacin for either isoniazid or ethambutol in the
177 current drug regimen on the rate of bacterial CFU elimination, we found that the early
178 bactericidal activities were similar amongst the three drug regimens, which were 99% kill at
179 2.2 weeks for moxifloxacin replacing isoniazid regimen (RMZE), 2.7 weeks for standard
180 regimen (RHZE) and 3 weeks for moxifloxacin replacing ethambutol regimen (RHZM).
181 Treatment with RMZE increased the rate of bacterial elimination showing undetectable CFU
182 counts at 11 weeks compared to 14 weeks for the standard regimen and moxifloxacin replacing
183 ethambutol regimen (Table 2).

184 These observations coincided with bactericidal activities as assessed using the mono-
185 exponential bacterial elimination rate constants (Fig 1, and Table 3) where the exponential rate
186 constants (logarithmic base 10) for net bacterial elimination during treatment ($k_{\text{net_with_drug}}$) for
187 standard, moxifloxacin replacing ethambutol and moxifloxacin replacing isoniazid regimens
188 were -0.46, -0.50 and -0.65, in lungs and -0.46, -0.46 and -0.60 in spleens, respectively (Table
189 3). The higher the absolute value of this elimination rate constant (i.e. the steeper the slope of
190 the elimination on the logarithmic scale with units of wk^{-1}), the quicker the exponential
191 elimination rate of CFU counts in the organs. These values indicate therefore that compared to
192 the standard therapy, substitution of moxifloxacin for isoniazid gives a significant increase in
193 bacterial elimination in both lungs and spleens while substitution of moxifloxacin for
194 ethambutol makes a statistically indistinguishable difference.

195 In the CFU count free organs, no tubercle bacilli were recovered which was determined by
196 negative cultures of the organ homogenates in selective Kirchner broth for 4 weeks followed
197 by growth on Löwenstein–Jensen medium.

198 **Post-treatment level of CF-resuscitated MPN in the Cornell model.** In order to investigate
199 the effect of moxifloxacin containing regimens on the post-treatment level of persistent bacilli
200 through CF-induced resuscitation, lung and spleen homogenates at the weeks of treatment
201 when CFU counts reached zero for each of the regimens were incubated with culture filtrates.
202 As shown in Table 4, after 14 weeks of treatment with RHZE and RHZM, high levels of CF-
203 resuscitated bacilli remained in both lungs and spleens. For RMZE treatment, at 11 weeks post-
204 treatment, although CFU counts were zero, there were average 2.96 and 3.01 log of CF-
205 resuscitated MPN of bacilli per lung and spleen, respectively. At 14 weeks of treatment, there
206 were still 2-log MPN of the bacilli present (Table 4). The numbers of CF-dependent bacteria at
207 14 weeks amongst the three treatment groups were not significantly different ($p > 0.05$, $n = 8$).

208 **Relapse rate of treatment with the moxifloxacin containing regimens in the Cornell**
209 **model.** After 8 weeks of high dosage steroid immunosuppression, disease relapse rates for the
210 treatment with the three drug regimens were determined by the percentage of mice that
211 developed positive *M. tuberculosis* cultures (CFU counts) in lungs, spleens or both. As shown
212 in Table 5, treatment with the standard regimen RHZE gave rise to positive organs in 19 out of
213 21 mice (90% relapse rate) and RHZM led to 95% relapse rate after 14 weeks of treatment. In
214 contrast, treatment with RMZE resulted in 59% of relapse ($P = 0.03$ vs. RHZE, $P = 0.009$ vs.
215 RHZM, $P < 0.017$ significant at 0.05 level after Bonferroni correction for 3 pairwise
216 comparisons).

217 We also measured CF-dependent bacilli using culture filtrates in the organs which
218 showed CFU count negative after 8 weeks of steroid treatment. As shown in Table 5,
219 the negative organs in each treatment group contained high numbers of CF-dependent
220 cells. There are average 3.3, 3.51 and 3.05 logs of MPN per organ in the groups of
221 RHZE, RHZM and RMZE, respectively.

222

223 DISCUSSION

224 This is the first study, using the reliable Cornell mouse model, to characterize the therapeutic
225 efficacy of moxifloxacin-replacement *in vivo* against CF-dependent *M. tuberculosis* persistent
226 cells. Compared to standard TB regimen, we found that moxifloxacin replacement for
227 isoniazid: (i) failed to remove CF-dependent bacilli, despite having (ii) faster organ CFU count
228 elimination rates and (iii) lower disease relapse rates. In contrast, moxifloxacin replacement for
229 ethambutol failed to demonstrate any therapeutic benefits compared to the standard regimen.
230 These results of CF resuscitation need to be confirmed in human studies, but may provide a
231 novel mechanistic explanation for the results of moxifloxacin-replacement regimens in clinical
232 trials. Findings in this study also have important future implications in TB novel drug design,
233 diagnostic testing and clinical applications.

234 **Moxifloxacin-replaced drug regimens are ineffective against CF-dependent tubercle**
235 **bacilli.** The greater therapeutic efficacy and lower relapse rates achieved with moxifloxacin-
236 isoniazid replacement regimen, as compared to the standard regimen, in this study is consistent
237 with previous reports (5-8). De Groote *et al* demonstrated that moxifloxacin replacing isoniazid
238 in the standard regimen gave rise to 63% disease relapse (6). In other studies, Nuernberger and
239 colleagues showed that the same drug regimen produced a lower disease relapse at 33.3% (7).
240 Late studies using two pathologically distinct murine tuberculosis models demonstrated very
241 similar low disease relapses (8). Our study confirmed this interesting observation showing 56%
242 relapse, indicating the consistency of the drug regimen in different mouse models.
243 The underlining mechanisms that moxifloxacin replacing isoniazid was more efficacious than
244 the standard or moxifloxacin replacing ethambutol regimens were unknown. It has been shown
245 previously that when mice were treated with rifampicin-isoniazid-pyrazinamide, rifampicin-
246 isoniazid or rifampicin-pyrazinamide for 6 months, rifampicin-pyrazinamide treated group
247 demonstrated significantly lower relapse rates than the other two groups containing isoniazid

248 (26), suggesting that isoniazid antagonized the actions of rifampicin-pyrazinamide (26). It is
249 possible that replacement of isoniazid with moxifloxacin eliminated the antagonistic drug
250 interaction leading to the rapid organ CFU count clearance in mice.

251 The use of CFU counts as an end point reflects the clinical observations in patients to a large
252 degree, which is related to clinical endpoints such as sputum culture conversion in patients (3,
253 27, 28). The improved efficacy with moxifloxacin replacement for isoniazid compared to the
254 standard regimen reflected the clinical outcome in patients to some extent, for example, the
255 moxifloxacin-isoniazid substitution regimen showed an effective bactericidal activity which
256 was able to kill CFU count positive bacilli faster than the standard regimen, leading to the
257 higher sputum culture conversion rate in humans (3, 27, 28).

258 Despite the improved performance, moxifloxacin-isoniazid replaced regimen was ineffective
259 against CF-dependent bacterial cells, which has not been demonstrated previously. At 11
260 weeks and the end of the antibiotic therapy, despite the elimination of CFU count positive
261 bacilli, considerable MPN of CF-dependent bacilli remained in all the mice, which were
262 similar to those treated with the standard drug regimen or the moxifloxacin-ethambutol
263 replaced regimen. This indicated that although the moxifloxacin-isoniazid replaced regimen
264 was more bactericidal than the standard regimen, the drug regimen failed to show improved
265 sterilizing activity against persistent bacteria. After 8 weeks of immunosuppression with
266 steroid, there were 90% of standard regimen treated mice and 95% of moxifloxacin
267 replacement for ethambutol treated mice with CF-dependent cells which became CFU count
268 positive again. This high disease relapse rate can only be feasibly explained by the reactivation
269 of CF-dependent cells since the mice were CFU count-zero before immunosuppression. In
270 addition to a lower relapse rate, mice treated with moxifloxacin replacement for isoniazid
271 regimen contained similar MPN counts in their negative organs to the other two groups. This
272 indicated that certain drug regimens such as moxifloxacin replacement of isoniazid may induce
273 heterogeneously more diverse bacterial populations, therefore not all CF-responding bacteria

274 regain their ability to form colonies on agar plates at the time we determined relapse, showing a
275 lower disease relapse. Further studies are warranted on the induction of heterogeneity of bacterial
276 populations using different anti-TB drug regimens.

277 **Clinical trials and animal studies: different testbeds, same mechanism.** None of the two
278 moxifloxacin-replacement phase III clinical trials have demonstrated non-inferiority to
279 standard regimens for treatment duration and disease relapses (3, 4); the underlying mechanism
280 is unclear. An important finding of the REMoxTB trial is that there was a proportion of
281 patients who showed sputum conversion quickly but continued to relapse after treatment with
282 all three drug regimens (9). Our experiments suggest that the high relapse rates may have been
283 due to CF-dependent bacilli (9) which, till now, have remained undetectable using
284 conventional culture methods, including those used in the clinical trials (3, 4, 9). Persistent
285 bacteria are established causes of prolonged chemotherapy and disease relapse (10). It has been
286 repeatedly shown that in the Cornell mouse model, high relapse rate after treatment with the
287 standard drug regimen was due to the presence of CF-dependent persistent bacteria (16, 17).
288 Recently, we showed that drug regimens containing high doses of rifampicin (30 mg/kg or
289 higher) could eliminate CF-dependent persistent bacilli, which led to shortened treatment
290 duration from 14 weeks to just 6 weeks, without disease relapses (16, 18). The lesson learnt
291 from the REMoxTB trial is that more rapid culture conversion in the short moxifloxacin
292 containing regimens may not allow for shortened regimens due to the presence of persistent
293 bacteria (9). A previous study also showed that early bactericidal activities of certain novel
294 drug regimens were not necessarily predictive of any sterilizing effects (29). This may be
295 attributed to the inability of the drug regimens to eliminate the persistent bacilli which were
296 undetectable using the traditional microbiological methods. Therefore, in addition to the
297 conventional microbiological methods, evaluation of anti-TB regimens by assessing their
298 efficacies in eliminating RPF-dependent *M. tuberculosis* is important for providing a

299 comprehensive profile of novel drug regimens before proceeding to human clinical trials. The
300 combined data sets on CFU counts, broth growth and persister counts will strengthen any
301 claims to be made on a regimen, which will ultimately increase the confidence of advancing it
302 into humans.

303 **Clinical trials and animal studies: different testbeds and important considerations.** The
304 interpretation of the mouse results of moxifloxacin-replacement regimens compared with the
305 results in clinical trials requires careful consideration. In the previous animal studies for
306 example the burden of persistent bacteria had not been detected and assessed (5, 7) largely due
307 to the undetectable feature of the persisters (16, 17). Importantly, there are clear differences in
308 the pathophysiology of TB between humans and mice. Patients with active TB have persisters
309 residing in a milieu of different pathogenic states, including necrotic/caseating lesions, central
310 liquefactive lesions, open cavities, closed fibrotic granulomas (30, 31). Indeed, a patient over
311 time may develop a combination of these lesions (10). Consequently, these heterogeneous
312 persistent bacteria co-exist with fast growing bacteria at the time of the commencing antibiotic
313 treatment (10). In contrast, mice do not form granuloma structures after *M. tuberculosis*
314 infection (30) and persistent bacteria are generally low in absolute number (similar to the CFU
315 counts) at the beginning of the treatment (16). In addition, an important study has shown that
316 moxifloxacin does not diffuse into caseating lesions, which may also lead to reduced sterilizing
317 activities against persisters in human TB (32).

318 Treatment of TB persisters is complex and future clinical trials require careful consideration of
319 mechanistic *in vivo* studies, which can elucidate further insights into potential therapeutic
320 targets. The study reported here represents an important step in the right direction by showing
321 that RPF-dependent persisters may be a novel and important clinical therapeutic target.

322 In conclusion, moxifloxacin substitution in contemporary drug regimens was ineffective
323 against resuscitation promoting factor dependent persistent *M. tuberculosis*, despite having
324 favorable therapeutic efficacy against actively multiplying bacteria *in vivo*.

325

326 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

327 This work was supported by the Innovative Medicines Initiative Joint Undertaking resources of
328 which are composed of financial contribution from the European Union's Seventh Framework
329 Programme (FP7/2007-2013) and EFPIA companies' in kind contribution (grant number
330 115337). The publication reflects only the author's views. The European Commission is not
331 liable for any use that may be made of the information herein. The financial support of MRC
332 (MR/P011144/1) is gratefully acknowledged. We thank Alexander Liu for critical discussion.

333

334

335

- 337 1. **WHO.** 2010. WHO global tuberculosis control report 2010. Summary. Central
338 European journal of public health **18**:237.
- 339 2. **Mitchison DA.** 2005. Shortening the treatment of tuberculosis. Nat Biotech **23**:187-
340 188.
- 341 3. **Gillespie SH, Crook AM, McHugh TD, Mendel CM, Meredith SK, Murray SR,**
342 **Pappas F, Phillips PP, Nunn AJ, Consortium RE.** 2014. Four-month moxifloxacin-
343 based regimens for drug-sensitive tuberculosis. N Engl J Med **371**:1577-1587.
- 344 4. **Jindani A, Harrison TS, Nunn AJ, Phillips PP, Churchyard GJ, Charalambous S,**
345 **Hatherill M, Geldenhuys H, McIlleron HM, Zvada SP, Mungofa S, Shah NA,**
346 **Zizhou S, Magweta L, Shepherd J, Nyirenda S, van Dijk JH, Clouting HE,**
347 **Coleman D, Bateson AL, McHugh TD, Butcher PD, Mitchison DA, Team RT.**
348 2014. High-dose rifapentine with moxifloxacin for pulmonary tuberculosis. N Engl J
349 Med **371**:1599-1608.
- 350 5. **Nuermberger EL, Yoshimatsu T, Tyagi S, O'Brien RJ, Vernon AN, Chaisson RE,**
351 **Bishai WR, Grosset JH.** 2004. Moxifloxacin-containing regimen greatly reduces time
352 to culture conversion in murine tuberculosis. Am J Respir Crit Care Med **169**:421-426.
- 353 6. **De Groot MA, Gilliland JC, Wells CL, Brooks EJ, Woolhiser LK, Gruppo V,**
354 **Peloquin CA, Orme IM, Lenaerts AJ.** 2011. Comparative studies evaluating mouse
355 models used for efficacy testing of experimental drugs against *Mycobacterium*
356 *tuberculosis*. Antimicrob Agents Chemother **55**:1237-1247.
- 357 7. **Nuermberger EL, Yoshimatsu T, Tyagi S, Williams K, Rosenthal I, O'Brien RJ,**
358 **Vernon AA, Chaisson RE, Bishai WR, Grosset JH.** 2004. Moxifloxacin-containing
359 regimens of reduced duration produce a stable cure in murine tuberculosis. Am J Respir
360 Crit Care Med **170**:1131-1134.
- 361 8. **Li SY, Irwin SM, Converse PJ, Mdluli KE, Lenaerts AJ, Nuermberger EL.** 2015.
362 Evaluation of moxifloxacin-containing regimens in pathologically distinct murine
363 tuberculosis models. Antimicrob Agents Chemother **59**:4026-4030.
- 364 9. **Phillips PP, Mendel CM, Burger DA, Crook AM, Nunn AJ, Dawson R, Diacon**
365 **AH, Gillespie SH.** 2016. Limited role of culture conversion for decision-making in
366 individual patient care and for advancing novel regimens to confirmatory clinical trials.
367 BMC medicine **14**:19.
- 368 10. **Mitchison DA.** 1979. Basic mechanisms of chemotherapy. Chest **76**:771-781.
- 369 11. **Wayne LG.** 1994. Dormancy of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and latency of disease.
370 Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis **13**:908-914.
- 371 12. **Lipworth S, Hammond RJ, Baron VO, Hu Y, Coates A, Gillespie SH.** 2016.
372 Defining dormancy in mycobacterial disease. Tuberculosis (Edinburgh, Scotland)
373 **99**:131-142.
- 374 13. **Gold B, Nathan C.** 2017. Targeting Phenotypically Tolerant *Mycobacterium*
375 *tuberculosis*. Microbiology spectrum **5**.
- 376 14. **Dhar N, McKinney J, Manina G.** 2016. Phenotypic Heterogeneity in *Mycobacterium*
377 *tuberculosis*. Microbiol Spectr **4**.
- 378 15. **Mukamolova GV, Turapov O, Malkin J, Woltmann G, Barer MR.** 2010.
379 Resuscitation-promoting factors reveal an occult population of tubercle Bacilli in
380 Sputum. Am J Respir Crit Care Med **181**:174-180.
- 381 16. **Hu Y, Liu A, Ortega-Muro F, Alameda-Martin L, Mitchison D, Coates A.** 2015.
382 High-dose rifampicin kills persisters, shortens treatment duration, and reduces relapse
383 rate *in vitro* and *in vivo*. Front Microbiol **6**:641.
- 384 17. **Hu Y, Pertinez H, Ortega-Muro F, Alameda-Martin L, Liu Y, Schipani A, Davies**
385 **G, Coates A.** 2016. Investigation of Elimination Rate, Persistent Subpopulation

- 386 Removal, and Relapse Rates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* by Using Combinations of
387 First-Line Drugs in a Modified Cornell Mouse Model. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother*
388 **60**:4778-4785.
- 389 18. **Liu Y, Pertinez H, Ortega-Muro F, Alameda-Martin L, Harrison T, Davies G,**
390 **Coates A, Hu Y.** 2017. Optimal doses of rifampicin in the standard drug regimen to
391 shorten tuberculosis treatment duration and reduce relapse by eradicating persistent
392 bacteria. *J Antimicrob Chemother.* **73**:724-731.
- 393 19. **McCune RM, Jr., McDermott W, Tompsett R.** 1956. The fate of *Mycobacterium*
394 *tuberculosis* in mouse tissues as determined by the microbial enumeration technique. II.
395 The conversion of tuberculous infection to the latent state by the administration of
396 pyrazinamide and a companion drug. *J Exp Med* **104**:763-802.
- 397 20. **McCune RM, Jr., Tompsett R.** 1956. Fate of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in mouse
398 tissues as determined by the microbial enumeration technique. I. The persistence of
399 drug-susceptible tubercle bacilli in the tissues despite prolonged antimicrobial therapy.
400 *J Exp Med* **104**:737-762.
- 401 21. **Mitchison DA, Allen BW, Manickavasagar D.** 1983. Selective Kirchner medium in
402 the culture of specimens other than sputum for mycobacteria. *J Clin Pathol* **36**:1357-
403 1361.
- 404 22. **US Food and Drug Administration.** Bacteriological analytical manual, appendix 2:
405 most probable number from serial dilutions.
- 406 23. **Meagher AK, Forrest A, Dalhoff A, Stass H, Schentag JJ.** 2004. Novel
407 pharmacokinetic-pharmacodynamic model for prediction of outcomes with an
408 extended-release formulation of ciprofloxacin. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* **48**:2061-
409 2068.
- 410 24. **Landaw EM, DiStefano JJ, 3rd.** 1984. Multiexponential, multicompartmental, and
411 noncompartmental modeling. II. Data analysis and statistical considerations. *Am J*
412 *Physiol* **246**:R665-677.
- 413 25. **Ette EI, Williams PJ.** 2004. Population pharmacokinetics II: estimation methods. *Ann*
414 *Pharmacother* **38**:1907-1915.
- 415 26. **Almeida D, Nuermberger E, Tasneen R, Rosenthal I, Tyagi S, Williams K,**
416 **Peloquin C, Grosset J.** 2009. Paradoxical effect of isoniazid on the activity of
417 rifampin-pyrazinamide combination in a mouse model of tuberculosis. *Antimicrob*
418 *Agents Chemother* **53**:4178-4184.
- 419 27. **Conde MB, Efron A, Loredo C, De Souza GR, Graca NP, Cezar MC, Ram M,**
420 **Chaudhary MA, Bishai WR, Kritski AL, Chaisson RE.** 2009. Moxifloxacin versus
421 ethambutol in the initial treatment of tuberculosis: a double-blind, randomised,
422 controlled phase II trial. *Lancet* **373**:1183-1189.
- 423 28. **Jawahar MS, Banurekha VV, Paramasivan CN, Rahman F, Ramachandran R,**
424 **Venkatesan P, Balasubramanian R, Selvakumar N, Ponnuraja C, Iliayas AS,**
425 **Gangadevi NP, Raman B, Baskaran D, Kumar SR, Kumar MM, Mohan V,**
426 **Ganapathy S, Kumar V, Shanmugam G, Charles N, Sakthivel MR, Jagannath K,**
427 **Chandrasekar C, Parthasarathy RT, Narayanan PR.** 2013. Randomized clinical
428 trial of thrice-weekly 4-month moxifloxacin or gatifloxacin containing regimens in the
429 treatment of new sputum positive pulmonary tuberculosis patients. *PLoS ONE*
430 **8**:e67030.
- 431 29. **Andries K, Gevers T, Lounis N.** 2010. Bactericidal potencies of new regimens are not
432 predictive of their sterilizing potencies in a murine model of tuberculosis. *Antimicrob*
433 *Agents Chemother* **54**:4540-4544.
- 434 30. **Francis JMRCVS.** 1958. Tuberculosis in Animals and Man. A study in comparative
435 pathology. Cassell & Co., London.

- 436 31. **Bloom BR.** 1994. Tuberculosis : pathogenesis, protection, and control. ASM Press,
437 Washington, D.C.
- 438 32. **Prideaux B, Via LE, Zimmerman MD, Eum S, Sarathy J, O'Brien P, Chen C,**
439 **Kaya F, Weiner DM, Chen PY, Song T, Lee M, Shim TS, Cho JS, Kim W, Cho**
440 **SN, Olivier KN, Barry CE, 3rd, Dartois V.** 2015. The association between sterilizing
441 activity and drug distribution into tuberculosis lesions. *Nat Med* **21**:1223-1227.
442
443

444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456

457 Figure legend

458

459 Figure 1. Treatment profiles of *M. tuberculosis* H37Rv with regimens RHZE, RMZE and
460 RHZM in the Cornell mouse model. A. Elimination of CFU counts in lungs. B. Elimination of
461 CFU counts in spleens. The solid arrow indicates the treatment starting at 3 weeks of post
462 infection. The empty arrow indicates starting steroid treatment after the termination of 14 week
463 therapy.

464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477

Table 1. Mouse tuberculosis experimental design

Treatment groups ^a	Total No. of mice ^b	D0	D21	2W	4W	6W	8W	11W	14W	22W ^c
Control	8	4	4							
RHZE	54			4	4	4	8	8	8	22
RHZM	54			4	4	4	8	8	8	22
RMZE	54			4	4	4	8	8	8	22

^a Mice were intravenously infected at day 0. Treatment commenced at 21 days. Dosages for each drug were as follows: R 10 mg/kg, H 25 mg/kg, Z 150 mg/kg, E 100 mg/kg and M 100 mg/kg.

^b Total mice were infected and treated excluding natural death of the mice during the course of treatment

^c 8 weeks of hydrocortisone treatment post 14 weeks of treatment

Table 2. Organ CFU counts before and after treatment with experimental regimens

Time of infection and treatment	Mean Log CFU per lung \pm SD				Mean Log CFU per spleen \pm SD			
	Control	RHZE	RHZM	RMZE	Control	RHZE	RHZM	RMZE
D0 ^a	4.80 \pm 0.14				5.29 \pm 0.03			
D21 ^b	7.54 \pm 0.03				6.99 \pm 0.06			
2W ^c		6.09 \pm 0.03	5.92 \pm 0.14	5.70 \pm 0.12		5.43 \pm 0.08	5.54 \pm 0.12	4.77 \pm 0.10
4W		4.80 \pm 0.07	4.52 \pm 0.28	3.61 \pm 0.16		4.05 \pm 0.02	4.49 \pm 0.08	3.31 \pm 0.21
6W		4.08 \pm 0.11	4.00 \pm 0.09	2.53 \pm 0.29		3.49 \pm 0.16	3.81 \pm 0.06	2.27 \pm 0.20
8W		3.00 \pm 0	3.25 \pm 0.48	2.00 \pm 0		2.44 \pm 0.22	3.24 \pm 0.13	1.57 \pm 0.20
11W ^d		2.00 \pm 0	2.00 \pm 0	0		1.19 \pm 0.29	2.00 \pm 0	0
14W ^d		0	0	0		0	0	0

a. 2 hours post-infection. b. 21 days post-infection. c. week 2 post-treatment. d. CFU counts were derived from one third of tissue homogenate and limit detection was 3 CFU/organ.

Table 3. Elimination constant rates of different treatment groups

Treatment group	Elimination rate constant (wk-1) ^a			
	Lungs ^b		Spleens ^c	
	alpha	%RSE	alpha	%RSE
RHZE	-0.46	3.20	-0.46	4.76
RHZM	-0.50	8.57	-0.46	6.54
RMZE	-0.65	10.96	-0.57	6.40

a. Elimination rate constant equivalent to “knet_with_drug”

b. P = 0.008 RMZE vs. RHZE, P = 0.065 RMZE vs. RHZM, P = 0.384 RHZE vs. RHZM

c. P = 0.018 RMZE vs. RHZE, P = 0.011 RMZE vs. RHZM, P = 0.943 RHZE vs. RHZM
P < 0.017 significant at 0.05 level after Bonferroni correction for 3 pairwise comparisons.

Table 4. MPN of *M. tuberculosis* H37Rv in CFU count negative mouse lungs and spleens after treatment with different drug regimens

Treatment regimen	MPN/lung ^a				MPN/spleen ^b			
	11 week	95% confidence limits	14 week	95% confidence limits	11 week	95% confidence limits	14 week	95% confidence limits
RHZE	-		2.50 ± 0.19	2.35 - 2.67	-		2.56 ± 0.16	2.44 - 2.70
RHZM	-		2.55 ± 0.14	2.44 - 2.67	-		2.60 ± 0.09	2.52 - 2.69
RMZE	2.96 ± 0.15	2.86 - 3.08	2.30 ± 0.23	2.15 - 2.50	3.01 ± 0.14	2.92 - 3.11	2.35 ± 0.16	2.27 - 2.45

^adetermined by MPN of the diluted lung homogenates (n=8) with the culture filtrates. ^bdetermined by MPN of the diluted spleen homogenates (n=8) with the culture filtrates.

The CFU count zero organs showed no growth in Kirchner liquid medium following inoculation on Löwenstein-Jensen slopes.

Broth counts were derived from one third of tissue homogenate and calculated to represent the MPN of entire organ. The limit of detection was 30 MPN/organ.

-, Colony count positive and MPN counts not performed organs. The limit of detection was 3 CFU/organ.

Table 5. Relapse rates of mice after treatment with different drug regimens

Positive culture from	RHZE	RHZM	RMZE
Spleen only	3	5	4
Lung only	0	2	5
Both organs	16	13	4
Neither organs	2	1	9
Total mice	21	21	22
Relapse rate pn/N (%) ^a	19/21 (90)	20/21 (95)	13/22 (59)
MPN in CFU count negative organs	3.30 ± 0.13	3.51 ± 0.11	3.05 ± 0.18

a, Relapse rates include all lungs or spleens or both organs positive for bacilli. N, total number of mice. pn, number of mice with CFU count positive organs.

P = 0.03 RMZE vs. RHZE, P = 0.009 RMZE vs. RHZM, P = 1 RHZE vs. RHZM

P < 0.017 significant at 0.05 level after Bonferroni correction for 3 pairwise comparisons

