



This material has been provided by Asbury Theological Seminary in good faith of following ethical procedures in its production and end use.

The Copyright law of the United States (title 17, United States code) governs the making of photocopies or other reproductions of copyright material. Under certain conditions specified in the law, libraries and archives are authorized to finish a photocopy or other reproduction. One of these specific conditions is that the photocopy or reproduction is not to be *“used for any purpose other than private study, scholarship, or research.”* If a user makes a request for, or later uses, a photocopy or reproduction for purposes in excess of “fair use,” that user may be liable for copyright infringement. This institution reserves the right to refuse to accept a copying order if, in its judgment, fulfillment of the order would involve violation of copyright law.

By using this material, you are consenting to abide by this copyright policy. Any duplication, reproduction, or modification of this material without express written consent from Asbury Theological Seminary and/or the original publisher is prohibited.

Contact

B.L. Fisher Library
Asbury Theological Seminary
204 N. Lexington Ave.
Wilmore, KY 40390

B.L. Fisher Library’s Digital Content
place.asburyseminary.edu



Asbury Theological Seminary
205 North Lexington Avenue
Wilmore, Kentucky 40390

800.2ASBURY
asburyseminary.edu

*A STUDY OF SELECTED WESLEYAN-ARMINIAN LEADERS ON THE
HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT AND GIVER OF GIFTS*

*A Thesis
Presented to
the Faculty of
Asbury Theological Seminary*

*In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Theology*

*by
Edward LaVerne Bean*

May 1975

A STUDY OF SELECTED WESLEYAN-ARMINIAN LEADERS ON THE
HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT AND GIVER OF GIFTS

A Thesis
Presented to
the Faculty of
Asbury Theological Seminary

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Theology

Approved by:

William M. Arnett

Delbert R. Rose

by

Edward LaVerne Bean

May 1975

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research project has indebted the writer to several people. Professors William M. Arnett and Delbert R. Rose have contributed to making it a most profitable experience, both academically and spiritually. Their thoughtful comments, insights, and understanding were greatly appreciated. Mrs. Joyce Larson assisted by reading the first drafts and making helpful suggestions.

A special word of thanks is expressed to the writer's wife. Her words of encouragement, confidence, and understanding contributed to making this study a reality.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ii
 Chapter	
1. INTRODUCTION	1
STATEMENT OF PROBLEM	5
THE PURPOSE	6
Statement of the Purpose	6
Importance of the Study	7
LIMITATIONS OF THE SUBJECT	8
DEFINITION OF TERMS	9
ORGANIZATION OF THESIS	13
2. WILLIAM ARTHUR AND SAMUEL CHADWICK	15
THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT	16
Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts	16
The Holy Spirit's Work Before, At, and After Conversion	21
The Holy Spirit's Work At and After the Baptism with the Spirit	27
THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS	40
Nature of the Spirit's Gifts	40
Permanence or Cessation of the Gifts	51
Distribution of the Gifts	53
3. DANIEL STEELE	56

Chapter

Page

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT 57

Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts 57

The Holy Spirit's Work Before, At, and After Conversion 58

The Holy Spirit's Work At and After the Baptism with the Spirit 73

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS 84

Nature of the Spirit's Gifts 84

Permanence or Cessation of the Gifts 97

Distribution of the Gifts 97

4. *WILSON THOMAS HOGUE* 100

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT 101

Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts 101

The Holy Spirit's Work Before, At, and After Conversion 103

The Holy Spirit's Work At and After the Baptism with the Spirit 123

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS 129

Nature of the Spirit's Gifts 129

Permanence or Cessation of the Gifts 138

Distribution of the Gifts 140

5. *HENRY ORTON WILEY* 144

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT 145

Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts 145

The Holy Spirit's Work Before, At, and After Conversion 148

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Page</i>
<i>The Holy Spirit's Work At and After the Baptism with the Spirit</i>	172
<i>THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS</i>	182
<i>Nature of the Spirit's Gifts</i>	182
<i>Permanence or Cessation of the Gifts</i>	191
<i>Distribution of the Gifts</i>	192
<i>6. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION</i>	194
<i>THE DISTINCTIVENESS OF THIS STUDY</i>	194
<i>THE SUMMARY</i>	196
<i>The Holy Spirit as Gift</i>	196
<i>The Holy Spirit as Giver of Gifts</i>	203
<i>THE CONCLUSIONS</i>	209
<i>BIBLIOGRAPHY</i>	213

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION

There are three prominent views of the deeper experiences of grace.¹ The three recognized lines of teaching in this research are known as Wesleyan, Keswick, and Pentecostal.²

¹Three theological interpretations are acknowledged as being involved in the baptism with the Holy Spirit. First is the interpretation that the baptism takes place all at once in conversion. This is represented in the Reform tradition. Some representatives are: John R.W. Stott (The Baptism and Fullness of the Holy Spirit) and Merrill F. Unger (New Testament Teaching on Tongues; and The Baptizing Work of the Holy Spirit). The second interpretation includes three movements which teach that the Spirit's baptism is a second crisis experience for the fully regenerated. The terminology and emphases of these movements differ. The contemporary Wesleyan movement is represented in the works of H. Orton Wiley (Christian Theology). Some within the Keswick movement are represented in the writings of W.E. Boardman (The Higher Christian Life) and others, such as F.B. Meyer, Arthur T. Pierson, Andrew Murray, and D.L. Moody. The official contemporary periodical of the Keswick movement is the Life of Faith from London, England. Some others within the Keswick movement are of the Reformed view of the baptism with the Spirit (G. Campbell Morgan, The Spirit of God). The Assemblies of God, Springfield, Missouri holds to this interpretation with the addition of "tongues speaking" as the initial sign and evidence of the Spirit's baptism. Certain other Pentecostal groups share this view. A representative of this view is Ralph M. Riggs (The Spirit Himself). In addition, some Pentecostals hold to a third interpretation that the baptism is a third crisis experience only for those fully regenerated and sanctified. The Pentecostal Holiness Church as represented by Vinson Synan and his book, The Holiness-Pentecostal Movement in the United States, are representative of this position.

²Harry Jessop, We the Holiness People (Chicago: Evangelistic Institute, 1948), p. 21; cf. Leo G. Cox, John Wesley's Concept of Perfection (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1964), pp. 193-194; cf. George E. Failing, "Development in Holiness Theology after Wesley," Insights Into Holiness, comp. Kenneth Geiger (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1963), pp. 11-31.

Chronologically speaking, the first is the Wesleyan position, promoted during the second quarter of the nineteenth century in America by the National Camp-meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness, and later known as the National Holiness Association. It is currently called the Christian Holiness Association (hereafter referred to as the CHA). This movement traced its teachings back to John Wesley,³ who was influenced by Arminianism.⁴ With some modification of views, this Wesleyan-Arminian position emphasizes the baptism with the Spirit or entire sanctification as a second definite work of divine grace received after justification. This heart cleansing brings purity, power, and comfort into the believer's life.⁵ The threefold evidence of the Spirit's baptizing work is: the witness of the Spirit (Acts 15: 8, 9), the manifestation of the Spirit's indwelling presence imparting power in service (John 7:37-39), and the fruit of the Spirit (Galatians 5:22, 23). This threefold evidence forms the Wesleyan-Arminian doctrine of Christian assurance.⁶

The second view is promoted by the Keswick movement. This position exalts the person and passion of Christ, placing a strong emphasis on the lost condition or sinfulness of the human race, and

³ Delbert R. Rose, A Theology of Christian Experience Interpreting the Historic Wesleyan Message (Minneapolis: Bethany Fellowship, 1965), pp. 23-28.

⁴ John L. Peters, Christian Perfection and American Methodism (Nashville: Abingdon, 1956), p. 39; cf., Jessop, op. cit., pp. 22, 41.

⁵ Harry Jessop, Foundations of Doctrine (University Park: Chicago Evangelistic Institute, 1954), pp. 4-5.

⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 104-111.

stressing holiness of life. Those who abide in Christ partake of His holiness, but have two conflicting natures which remain until the hour of death. New divine life is imparted at conversion, but the believer must struggle with the power of the "self-life" until this mortal puts on immortality. This proclivity to sin, derived from man's Adamic heritage, is the believer's humiliation, but it registers no condemnation in the believer, because of the divine imputation of the blood of Christ which counts for righteousness. However, the sinful principle is to be kept in check by "counteraction,"⁷ not by eradication, whether instantaneous or gradual, as the divine way of sanctification.⁸

Evan H. Hopkins gave expression to this theory of counteraction when he said:

How can the tendency to sin exist in the presence of the indwelling Holy Spirit of God? By the law of counteraction. "The law of the Spirit of life in Christ Jesus hath made me free from the law of sin and death." The very fact that the "law of the Spirit of life" is in force, and is ever a continual necessity, is a proof that the law of sin and death is not extinct, but is simply counteracted; in other words, that the tendency to sin is still there.⁹

Some within the Keswick position hold that the Holy Spirit dwells in every child of God at conversion.¹⁰ To believe that

⁷ Steven Barabas, So Great Salvation: the History and Message of the Keswick Convention (Westwood: Fleming H. Revell, 1958), p. 79; cf. W. Ralph Thompson, "An Appraisal of the Keswick and Wesleyan Contemporary Positions," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 1:11-20, Spring, 1966; cf. Everett L. Cattell, "An Appraisal of the Keswick and Wesleyan Contemporary Positions," Insights Into Holiness, pp. 263-280.

⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 71-73.

⁹ Evan H. Hopkins, The Law of Liberty in the Spiritual Life (Fort Washington: Christian Literature Crusade, 1968), p. 27.

¹⁰ Barabas, *op. cit.*, p. 131.

Christians are to receive the baptism of the Spirit as a spiritual experience in a second blessing subsequent to regeneration is "utterly unauthorized by Scripture," according to some within the Keswick doctrine. When man is born again he receives the baptism with the Spirit or the gift of the Spirit.¹¹

The Keswick position, however, points out that it is one thing to "have the Spirit" and another "to be filled with the Spirit."¹² The Spirit-filled life is the normal condition of believers, but it is not a once-for-all experience. The Spirit-filled life results in a liberated personality so that it fulfills the purposes of God in Christian service. There is no need for a lapse of time after conversion before the fulness of the Spirit in sanctification of life and power for service is received. However, in the experience of a great majority of Christians, a personal knowledge of the Spirit's power comes at varying intervals after regeneration; but God intends that when a man is born of and baptized with the Spirit, he should also be filled with the Spirit and possess the full preparation for living and working as a child of God.¹³

The third view is held by the Pentecostal groups which represent a large segment of the charismatic movement. The common bond between these groups is the emphasis on tongues-speaking and divine healing.¹⁴

¹¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 131-132.

¹² *Ibid.*, p. 132.

¹³ *Ibid.*, pp. 128-147.

¹⁴ Ralph Riggs, *The Spirit Himself* (Springfield: Gospel Publishing House, 1949), pp. 138-142; cf., Cox, *op. cit.*, p. 193.

Nils Block-Hoell, in The Pentecostal Movement, outlines the basic teachings of the pentecostal groups. This movement maintains that the Spirit's baptism is for all believers and "normally evidenced by glossolalia." No member of this persuasion claims a Spirit baptism which is not accompanied by some "motoric manifestation of ecstasy."¹⁵

He states:

Pentecostal believers have sometimes claimed that the speaking in tongues is really subordinate in the movement, but such statements are apologetic. The speaking with tongues is emphasized in various ways as something unique, and it is stated definitely that glossolalia is the only biblical charisma which did not exist in the old covenant. Glossolalia is of greater importance than the other Gifts of Grace, and is, at the same time, evidence of the Spirit baptism, a means of gaining Christian assurance, and was also in the beginning believed to be necessary for mission work. There is no evidence that the early movement distinguished between glossolalia as a sign of the Spirit baptism and as a Gift of Grace. It appears that glossolalia, in connection with the Spirit baptism, was generally believed to be a permanent Gift of Grace.¹⁶

STATEMENT OF PROBLEM

There are two opposing views to the Wesleyan-Arminian teaching on the baptism with the Spirit. On the one side is the Keswick position with its "counteraction" influence. On the other side are the Pentecostalists and the revived charismatic groups with their distinctive claims for speaking in tongues and having spiritual gifts.

In the heat of these controversies, Wesleyan-Arminians are called to defend themselves. The past heritage established guidelines

¹⁵Nils Bloch-Hoell, The Pentecostal Movement (Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 1964), p. 132.

¹⁶Ibid., p. 142.

to assist Wesleyan-Arminian scholars in the formation and presentation of their views. The need of such a new study and clarification became apparent when Bruner and other scholars imply that pentecostalism is historic Methodism brought to its ultimate consequences.¹⁷ On the other hand, the birth of and baptism with the Spirit are upheld by Stott and others as taking place at one and the same time.¹⁸ In the light of such claims the need of this study is underscored. This research project is an attempt to deal with, and clarify these problems by studying the teachings of selected Wesleyan-Arminian leaders on the Holy Spirit, as both Gift and Giver of gifts. As a result of this study, the conviction of this writer is that the true scriptural teaching of the Spirit's ministry suffers more from those who have misunderstood it, than from those who oppose it.

THE PURPOSE

Statement of the Purpose

The church's continual task is to evaluate and re-interpret its theology for each new generation. Theological terms have changed in meaning from age to age. The church is continually challenged by the

¹⁷ Frederick Dale Bruner, A Theology of the Holy Spirit (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1970), p. 37; cf., Vinson Synan, The Holiness-Pentecostal Movement in the United States (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1971), pp. 13-54.

¹⁸ John R.W. Stott, The Baptism and Fullness of the Holy Spirit (Downers Grove: Inter-Varsity, 1971), pp. 28-29; cf., George A. Turner, "An Evaluation of John R.W. Stott and Frederick Bruner's Interpretations of the Baptism of the Holy Spirit," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 8:45-51, Spring, 1973.

necessity of clarifying and exploring more deeply into its theological tenets and truths. In spiritual hunger, each generation has looked to church leaders for additional biblical and theological illumination for the application of the Christian faith to daily life. The purpose of this study is to recapture the biblical and theological heritage of selected Wesleyan-Arminian leaders. The writer hopes this will shed light on the contemporary church situations which are the concerns of other writers (Romans 15:4).¹⁹

Importance of the Study

As already noted, the Keswick and pentecostal positions, along with the Wesleyan-Arminian views as developed within the CHA, raised conflicting issues within Christendom by their respective claims concerning the baptism with the Holy Spirit. This writer is concerned that the Wesleyan-Arminian heritage, as represented by the CHA, not be neglected in the present confrontation of these divergent views.

Present-day Wesleyans are the product of the American holiness revival of the last half of the nineteenth century. If, in the face of these rival views, this heritage is neglected, only confusion and disunity on this important teaching can be the result among Wesleyans. By a careful study of this heritage Wesleyans can discover anew the needed guidance for a proper assessment of the competing views. This researcher became persuaded that the American-Wesleyan heritage has much

¹⁹ Nobel V. Sack, "The Relevancy of History to Personal Christian Experience," The Sermon Builder, 20:5, 26, October, 1973; cf., William J. Martin, "Must Religionists Downgrade the Past," Christianity Today, 12:14-15, December 22, 1967.

to contribute in a contemporary evaluation of the conflicting claims among the Keswick and pentecostal movements.

LIMITATIONS OF THE SUBJECT

The central purpose of this study excluded the possibility of studying all the major leaders, British and American, who have helped shape the American-Wesleyan point of view as championed by the CHA. For this study two British-Wesleyan Methodists, William Arthur and Samuel Chadwick, were chosen, along with three Americans, Daniel Steele (a New England Methodist), Wilson T. Hogue (a nationally traveled Free Methodist), and H. Orton Wiley (a West Coast Nazarene).

Arthur and Chadwick were selected from among many British Wesleyans because of the outstanding influence of their writings upon American Wesleyans. Arthur's The Tongue of Fire and Chadwick's The Way to Pentecost have been especially influential in shaping the pneumatological views of the member bodies of the CHA.

Steele, Hogue and Wiley each ministered and published their views with such success as to be among the foremost thinkers influencing the progenitors and/or present promoters of the CHA.

The procedure was to research first-hand the principal writings of these selected thinkers. Other authors in the American holiness movement were studied and a cross-reference to their writings is made in the footnotes. Hopefully, this method will be of benefit to future researchers dealing with the important subject of pneumatology.

DEFINITION OF TERMS

On the whole the traditional American-Wesleyan theological terminology is used. The term "Gift of the Spirit," means, not the reception of the Spirit in regenerating grace, but the act of divine grace, through the baptism with the Holy Spirit (Acts 1:5), by which the heart is cleansed from all sin (Acts 15:8, 9), and filled with the pure love of God (Romans 5:5). It is subsequent to regeneration and is attested by the Holy Spirit (Acts 15:8, 9).

This definition is not a denial of the birth of the Spirit. A distinction is maintained between the Spirit's birth and baptism. The birth of the Spirit refers to the implantation of new spiritual life into the unregenerate soul which is dead in trespasses and sins (Ephesians 2:1-10). The Spirit implants new life into the unsaved heart creating a new being in Christ Jesus (II Corinthians 5:17). At the birth of the Spirit, the spiritually dead become the children of God. They receive the Spirit of God which constitutes them as heirs of God and joint heirs with Christ (Romans 8:15-17). As a child of God, one possesses life in Christ. However, there is reigning within the regenerate the carnal mind, inbred sin, or the principal of sin which prevents the child of God from fully entering the New Testament privileges found in Christ (I Corinthians 3:1-6; Galatians 2:20). The Spirit's baptism purifies the believer's heart from all sin, releasing all the physical, mental, and moral energies for service to a holy

Christ (Romans 6-8; Ephesians 3:16-20; 4:22-24; I John 1:7, 9).²⁰

A clear distinction is also made between this Gift of the Spirit and the gifts bestowed by the Holy Spirit. The Gift of the Spirit basically emphasizes the entire sanctifying work of the Spirit, within the believer's life in the baptism with the Holy Spirit (Matthew 3:10-12; Luke 3:9, 16, 17; 24:47-49; John 10:10; 14:12-26; 15:11-26; 16:7-16; 17:16-23; Acts 1:4-8; 15:8, 9).²¹ The gifts of the Spirit refer to special endowments by the Spirit as He wills (I Corinthians 12:11, 18) for Christian service (Romans 12:4-10; I Corinthians 12-14; Ephesians 4:8-16).²²

The phrase "the baptism with the Holy Spirit," unless defining contrasting views, refers to the baptism Christ bestows (Matthew 3:11; Mark 1:8; Luke 3:16; John 1:26-27; cf., Acts 1:5), which John the Baptist prophesied as the unique ministry of Jesus Christ. This baptism is synonymous with the Spirit's cleansing and filling the heart of the

²⁰ H. Orton Wiley, Christian Theology, Vol. II (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1958), pp. 322-324; cf., W.T. Purkiser, Sanctification and its Synonyms (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1963), pp. 25-37; cf., S.L. Brengle, When the Holy Ghost is Come (2nd ed.; New York: Salvation Army, 1911), pp. 13-19.

²¹ Samuel Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost (Berne: Light and Hope, 1937), pp. 28-32; cf., S.A. Keen, Pentecostal Papers; or the Gift of the Holy Ghost (Cincinnati: Cranston and Curts, 1895), pp. 33-45, 100-101; cf., W.T. Purkiser (ed.), Exploring Our Christian Faith (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1971), pp. 358-359; cf., L.R. Dunn, The Mission of the Spirit, or the Office and Work of the Comforter in Human Redemption (rpt. Apollo: West, n.d.), pp. 27-30.

²² Wiley, op. cit., pp. 315-321; cf., William B. Godbey, Work of the Holy Spirit (Louisville: Pickett, 1902), pp. 73-75; cf., Jasper A. Huffman, The Holy Spirit (2nd ed.; Marion: Wesley Press, 1944), pp. 167-177.

believer in entire sanctification.²³

The term "Wesleyan-Arminianism" means those basic teachings which James Arminius held and which John Wesley, in turn, built upon in proclaiming his own understanding of Scripture and Christian experience. These terms also refer to those generally accepted biblical and theological tenets among the members of CHA who trace their basic heritage to Arminius and Wesley.²⁴

The term "Keswick" goes back to Great Britain in 1873. Keswick is a small village of Cumberland, on the south bank of the Greta, about twenty-four miles from Carlisle in the area made famous by the poets of the Lake District School--Coleridge, Wordsworth, and Southey. The Keswick movement took its name from this small village and the religious conventions held there once a year. The concern of the Keswick Conventions is "the direction of a higher standard of personal holiness on the part of God's people."²⁵ These conventions emphasize Christian experience as a state of spiritual victory accomplished by the indwelling Christ and infilling of the Holy Spirit. It is the spiritual

²³ *Ibid.*, pp. 322-324; cf., Robert A. Mattke, "The Baptism of the Holy Spirit as Related to the Work of Entire Sanctification," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 5:22-32, Spring, 1970; cf., Jasper A. Huffman, Golden Treasures from the Greek New Testament for English Readers (2nd ed.; Marion: Wesley Press, 1951), pp. 84-88; cf., C.W. Ruth, Entire Sanctification Explained (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1955), p. 36.

²⁴ Mildred Bangs Wynkoop, Foundations of Wesleyan-Arminian Theology (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1967), pp. 46-69; cf. Wiley, *op. cit.*, pp. 107-109; cf. John Wesley, "What Is an Arminian?," The Works of John Wesley, X (1872; rpt. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1958-59), pp. 358-361.

²⁵ Arthur Tappan Pierson, The Keswick Movement (New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1903), pp. 13-17; cf. Wiley, *op. cit.*, pp. 462-463.

experience of "victorious power over sin, prevailing power in prayer, and witnessing power among men."²⁶ Basic to the Keswick teaching is the belief that the average Christian life lacks spiritual power and a spiritual mind because it is essentially carnal. It is the duty and privilege of every disciple who receives Christ to so live as to manifest the power of His resurrection in newness of life. Spiritual victory is by an appeal to faith and claiming victory in Christ.²⁷ The indwelling Christ counteracts the self-life in the pursuit of the higher life.²⁸

The term "pentecostalism" is used to designate the belief that the physical manifestation or evidence of speaking in tongues is the initial sign of the baptism with the Holy Spirit.²⁹ This belief entails the idea that the tongues-speaking experience is a valid expression of the Holy Spirit's activity in a spiritually anemic age.³⁰ The term "neo-pentecostalism" refers to the outbreak of tongues-speaking or glossolalia within the traditional non-pentecostal denominations.³¹ Neo-pentecostalism is here used as synonymous with the term "charismatic

²⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 64-68.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 67-69.

²⁸ F.B. Meyer, Calvary to Pentecost (1894; rpt. Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1959), pp. 53-58; cf., F.B. Meyer, The Christ-Life for the Self-Life (Chicago: Moody, n.d.), p. 66.

²⁹ Riggs, *op. cit.*, pp. 84-89.

³⁰ Oral Roberts, The Baptism with the Holy Spirit and the Value of Speaking in Tongues Today (1964; rpt. Tulsa: Oral Roberts, 1966), pp. 16-24, 52-58.

³¹ Synan, *op. cit.*, p. 210.

movement" or renewal.

The term "glossolalia" (tongues-speaking) is used by pentecostals and neo-pentecostals as the outward physical sign which imparts the evidence of receiving the baptism with the Spirit or is generally understood as being associated with the Spirit's baptism. The Spirit-filled life is so exceedingly important for the Christian that God has arranged that one can know very definitely that he has entered into this experience. There is no need of being deceived because God gives a physical and an audible proof for the Spirit's baptism. The speaking in other tongues is the initial sign and evidence that the Spirit has descended in His baptism.³²

ORGANIZATION OF THESIS

Chapter one introduces the three major, contemporary views concerning the Holy Spirit as Gift and Giver of gifts. This chapter is concerned with an investigation of the Wesleyan-Arminian heritage as found in the CHA and the competitive views it encounters today. This first section delimits the leaders to be studied in relation to the thesis topic and gives a statement of the problem and purpose of this study. The limitations of this study, the method of procedure, the definition of major terms, and the outline of the organization of this research are presented.

Chapter two develops the views of two British Methodist leaders.

³²Riggs, *op. cit.*, pp. 84-89; cf., R.A. Brooks, "Instruction About Tongues Speaking," Charisma Digest, 2:19-21, 1969.

William Arthur's and Samuel Chadwick's beliefs on the Holy Spirit as Gift and Giver of gifts in redemption are studied.

Chapter three concerns Daniel Steele's development of the Holy Spirit as Gift and Giver of gifts. His thoughts on the Holy Spirit as a Gift in soteriology are a representation of early American Methodist belief.

Chapter four is devoted to a study of Wilson T. Hogue and his teaching on the Holy Spirit as related to the thesis subject. He was a Free Methodist Church bishop and possessed a deep concern for the doctrinal teachings of the Holy Spirit.

H. Orton Wiley's soteriological teachings on the Holy Spirit as they relate to this research topic are developed in chapter five. Wiley was a member of the Nazarene Church and representative of recent Wesleyan-Arminian scholars.

Chapter six summarizes and evaluates the findings of the research project. Contrasts and comparisons of the selected British and American Methodist leaders are set forth. The chapter evaluates the three contemporary views of the Holy Spirit as Gift and Giver of gifts, and sets forth the interpretation which is believed to be the closest to an adequate biblical exegesis on the subject.

Chapter 2

WILLIAM ARTHUR AND SAMUEL CHADWICK

This chapter is concerned with two men of British Wesleyan Methodism. William Arthur (1819-1901) was a Wesleyan-Arminian Irish leader who greatly served the cause of British Methodism. He was a powerful preacher, author, keen linguist, and missionary to India and France. Some of the other leadership positions he served were: president of the British Wesleyan Methodist Conference; fraternal delegate from British Wesleyan Methodist Conference to the General Conference of Methodist Episcopal Church of U.S.A.; member of the first Ecumenical Methodist Conference; president of Belfast College; and a Missionary Secretary for seventeen years.¹ As an author, the British Museum Library has seventy-one entries by him, ranging all the way from tracts and pamphlets to serious introductions and books.² He wrote a book, A Mission to Mysore, which revealed his deep understanding of missions.³ Perhaps his greatest contribution as an author was his book, The Tongue of Fire,⁴ a defense of the doctrine and experience of

¹Roy Nicholson, "William Arthur: Unheralded Victor," The American Holiness Journal, 31:4-12, December, 1971. This article included a biographical sketch of William Arthur.

²*Ibid.*, p. 10.

³*Ibid.*, p. 7.

⁴*Ibid.*, pp. 10-11; cf., William Arthur, Addresses Delivered in New York by Rev. Wm. Arthur, A.M. with Biographical Sketch of the Author, ed. W.P. Strickland (New York: Carlton and Phillips, 1856), pp. 3-21. Here is a fairly detailed biographical sketch of William Arthur.

Christian holiness. It appeared in many of the Free Methodist and Wesleyan Church ministerial study courses.

Samuel Chadwick (1860-1932) was a friend of D.L. Moody, Sam Jones, and G. Campbell Morgan. As a speaker he was internationally known and contributed for many years to the cause of scriptural holiness. As an educator, he was principal of Cliff College,⁵ a famous school of British Wesleyanism. His lasting contributions in writing include: Humanity and God (1903), The Path of Prayer (1931), The Gospel of the Cross (1934), The Call to Christian Perfection (1936). He was perhaps best known for his book, The Way to Pentecost (1932).⁶ This valuable book was included for many years in the ministerial study courses of both the Free Methodist and Wesleyan churches of North America.

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT

Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts

William Arthur made a distinction between the Holy Spirit as a Gift and as the Giver of gifts. John the Baptist's pronouncement in

⁵ Norman G. Dunning, Samuel Chadwick (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1933), pp. 106-129, 188-208.

⁶ In addition, D.W. Lambert selected and arranged some of Chadwick's sermons and other materials in book form. These books included: Samuel Chadwick, Twenty-Five Sunday Evenings with Samuel Chadwick, comp. D.W. Lambert (London: Epworth Press, 1954); Samuel Chadwick, Twenty-Five Sunday Mornings with Samuel Chadwick, comp. D.W. Lambert (London: Epworth Press, 1951); Samuel Chadwick, The Testament of Samuel Chadwick 1860-1932, comp. D.W. Lambert (London: Epworth Press, 1957); Samuel Chadwick, Through the Years with Samuel Chadwick, comp. D.W. Lambert (London: Epworth Press, 1960).

reference to Christ was: "He shall baptize you with the Holy Ghost and fire" (Luke 3:16). Arthur believed that when John's two disciples followed Christ they were seeking Christ's baptism of fire. For months and years they travelled with the Son of God and heard His words. They saw His life and works of signs, wonders, and great miracles, yet they had not received the baptism of fire. Christ, just before His crucifixion, spoke to the disciples of the Comforter and His work (John 14-16). Just before His ascension, Christ further indicated the work of the Holy Spirit in His own grand kingdom--imparting spiritual power (Luke 24:44-53).⁷ This was the New Testament Pentecostal "tongue of fire." By "tongue of fire," Arthur meant: "a man's voice, God's truth; man's speech, the Holy Spirit's inspiration; a human organ, a superhuman power."⁸ Christ promised His disciples miraculous light and power by the Spirit (Acts 1:8), but it was not as a miracle-working power that the Spirit proclaimed His coming. Rather, it was by spiritual power. Christ, through the Holy Spirit, empowered the Lord's servants to bear witness before the most terrible adversaries, and to guide their lips in wise and convincing speech.⁹ Consequently, the spiritual effect of this baptism of fire was: "they were all filled with the Holy Ghost,"

⁷ William Arthur, The Tongue of Fire (rpt. Winona Lake: Light and Life Press, n.d.), pp. 1-6.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 28.

⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 30-31; cf., William Arthur, "The Divinity of Our Lord in Relation to His Work of Atonement," Present Day Tracts on Subjects of Christian Evidence, Doctrine, and Morals by Various Writers, VI (London: Religious Tract Society, 1885), p. 9. Arthur spoke of the Holy Spirit as being "poured out by the enthroned Jesus."

and proclaimed the Word of God in boldness (Acts 4:31; 5:42).¹⁰ This spiritual experience fills the believer with practical holiness. It is the Gift of the Eternal Spirit, proceeding from the Father and Son, filling the believer's heart with Himself and restoring the human spirit to its original and highest fellowship.¹¹

The "miraculous gifts" attending New Testament Pentecost, Arthur taught, were not the essence of a real Christian. The flames, the tongues, the outward signs were not the saving grace of the Spirit. Rather, the moral change produced within by receiving the promise of the Spirit made the early church holy and victorious. This was the true essence of Pentecost. Without this, even if they were speaking with "the tongues of angels and men" and worked all miracles, they were not true disciples (I Corinthians 13). The miraculous gifts were only separable attendants of a real Christian.¹² This promised baptism with the Holy Spirit and fire upon the disciples was not a miracle-working power. Rather, the promised Gift was a spiritual power.¹³

Perhaps Arthur best expressed his distinction between the Spirit as Gift (moral purity) and Giver of gifts (miraculous gifts) when he said:

So may the human soul be "filled with the Holy Ghost," having every faculty illuminated, and every affection purified, without any miraculous gift. On the other hand, the miraculous power does not necessarily imply the spiritual fullness; for Paul puts the supposition of speaking with tongues, prophesying,

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 29.

¹¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 36-37.

¹² *Ibid.*, p. 140.

¹³ *Ibid.*, pp. 30-31.

removing mountains, and yet lacking charity, that love which must be shed abroad in every heart that is full of the Holy Ghost.¹⁴

Like Arthur, Samuel Chadwick made a distinction between the Holy Spirit as a Gift and as a Giver of spiritual gifts. The Holy Spirit as Gift is the "promise of the Father" becoming the explicit Gift of the Son ("the Promise of the Son") and the all-inclusive Gift of the Son distributed to the community of believers as the "promise of the Spirit" (Luke 24:49; John 14:16-25; Acts 1:4-8). The Spirit, as the Father's and Son's Gift, is to the believer all that Christ Himself was and presently is. The only exception, Christ was with the disciples but the Spirit is in believers.¹⁵ As Jesus was the Revealer of God the Father to men, the Spirit as Gift dwells in the believer as the Revealer of Christ and His will.¹⁶

This Gift of the Spirit is received in what Chadwick believed is a personal and spiritual Pentecost.¹⁷ In a personal Pentecostal experience, the important thing is the moral transformation which remains and not the portents which may accompany it. The vital thing which happens is that the Spirit of Jesus comes to abide in the hearts of men. At Pentecost it was not the wind, fire, or gift of tongues, but rather, the possession of the Spirit by each believer.¹⁸ The symbols of

¹⁴ Arthur, The Tongue of Fire, p. 34; cf., p. 111.

¹⁵ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 18-22.

¹⁶ Samuel Chadwick, Humanity and God (rpt. Apollo: West Publishing, n.d.), p. 152.

¹⁷ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 23-27; cf., Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 157-173.

¹⁸ Ibid., pp. 26-27.

wind and fire revealed only the mission and quality of the Gift. But, the essential truth of the Pentecostal blessing is that they were filled with the Holy Spirit (Acts 2:4; 15:8, 9). This Gift of the Spirit is the distinguishing feature of the Christian religion. The Spirit's Gift is the very soul of the faith.¹⁹

Chadwick also referred to the receiving of this Gift of the Spirit by other names. He used such terms as: "The Spirit-filled life" (Ephesians 5:18);²⁰ "Christian perfection;"²¹ "The coming of the Spirit;"²² The baptism of fire or the "baptism of the Spirit;"²³ and "entire sanctification."²⁴

Chadwick was strong in his affirmation that the Holy Spirit is Himself the Gift.²⁵ Within the Gift of the Spirit, there are spiritual gifts (Ephesians 4:8-12; I Corinthians 12:4-7). He believed the Spirit divides these spiritual gifts to every man "severally as He will" (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). This is a sovereign selection by the Spirit of what gifts He chooses to bestow upon designated men. In contrast, the Gift of the Spirit is for all believers (Ephesians 5:18; Acts 15:8, 9).²⁶

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 117-121.

²⁰ Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 174-189.

²¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 190-205.

²² *Ibid.*, pp. 157-173.

²³ *Ibid.*, pp. 107, 164-172, 183.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 59-62.

²⁵ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, p. 105.

²⁶ *Ibid.*

He acknowledged this distinction between the Spirit as Gift and the Spirit as Giver of gifts when he said:

Spiritual gifts are no proof of spirituality. The New Testament nowhere makes spiritual gifts the sign of Holiness, and there were some greatly endowed of whom Jesus said that at the last it would be declared that He never knew them. There is no suggestion that the gifts were not genuine, but they were perverted to wrong ends or exercised in the wrong spirit. This is a serious difficulty to many, but the Scriptures make it plain that in a church that "came behind in no gift, waiting for the Coming of the Lord," there were carnalities that would have disgraced a decent pagan assembly. Gifts are not substitutes for Grace, and ignorance and carnality have made them a menace to holiness of heart and integrity of character.²⁷

The Holy Spirit's Work Before,
At, and After Conversion

Arthur acknowledged that before conversion man in his natural state has a sinful nature.²⁸ Sin blinds the human spirit (II Corinthians 4:3, 4) resulting in the unconverted man being possessed by a carnal spirit. The natural man's spirit is the servant of the flesh and carnal purposes which delight to command the soul.²⁹ However, the human spirit searches for happiness and finds it only in a return to God.³⁰ God's Spirit is constantly present and working in the universe even if undiscerned by the human spirit.³¹ The Spirit awakens or convinces the sinner of his spiritual need and of the divine mercies through Christ's atoning death for his sins.³²

Arthur held that the Spirit's work at conversion is healing and

²⁷ Ibid., p. 110.

²⁸ Arthur, The Tongue of Fire, pp. 78f., 81.

²⁹ Ibid., p. 42.

³⁰ Ibid., p. 37.

³¹ Ibid., p. 38.

³² Ibid., pp. 4, 40, 111, 138.

blotting out the sinner's transgressions through Christ's death.³³ The sinner is enslaved to sin and under God's judgment, and the only way to escape the death which sin and its correlative woes bring upon all sons of Adam is to be converted.³⁴ This conversion is the operation of the Holy Spirit in the quickening of the nature of man and imparting the divine nature within the soul. The Holy Spirit as man's Regenerator reverses the moral state of the natural man, resulting in a moral transformation of the life and actions.³⁵ Each sinner transformed into a saint is a new token of the Spirit's redeeming power among men and the evidence of His power to change man's nature by creating it anew. This creation of saints out of sinners is the demonstration of the divinity of the gospel convincingly displayed. Furthermore, the regeneration of individuals is the only way for the effectual regeneration of society.³⁶ This converting influence or power of the Spirit has been the church's function from the first age onward.³⁷

Moreover, Arthur was convinced that the Holy Spirit is active after conversion. Christ imparts a witness to the regenerated that the converting work is done. Arthur believed that of all the privileges for the soul of man, the most consoling and elevating by far is the sense of being adopted into the family of God. After the repentant heart is converted, the Spirit witnesses or lets the heart know of that

³³ *Ibid.*, p. 139; cf., Arthur, Present Day Tracts, p. 63. Speaking of John's development of Christ in Revelation, Arthur said: "Never once is Christ set before us without an express declaration of His death."

³⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 85-87.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 40-43.

³⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 91.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 193-211.

divine love and acceptance. This is the birthright of every child of God provided for in Christ's atonement. God is not only a pardoning God, but also an adopting God. The righteous man has the privilege of rejoicing in his forgiving God. This witness is essential for the justified believer to guard against delusion, to strengthen the soul's filial confidence in God, and to provide a constant stimulus to press forward in the things of Christ.³⁸

Arthur taught that this witness of the Spirit is supported by the work of the Spirit in producing the fruit of righteousness within the believer's life. The fruit is "love, joy, peace" or "righteousness and peace and joy in the Holy Spirit" (Galatians 5:22). The relation of the fruit to the witness of the Spirit is that the fruit is made consequent to the Spirit's witness. In other words, the Spirit's fruit in a penitent's life presupposes the witness of the Spirit.³⁹

Basic to Samuel Chadwick's theology of the Spirit's work before conversion was his view of man as a sinner. When Adam sinned, he involved the whole human race in sin. This disobedience by the First Head of the human race polluted or spread sin and death ("racial guilt") from Paradise onward (Romans 3:10, 23; 6:23). Every conception of religion and every organization of human life must begin with this fact of sin. Everyone shares in Adam's act of disobedience to God, resulting in man's sinning because he is a sinner. However, Christ as the second Representative and Head of the race, restored to men the privilege of justification through divine grace. He died for sinful man. The overflowing

³⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 116, 128-134.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 133-141.

mercy of God is provided in the Gift of His Son (John 3:16) to track sin to its innermost recesses and destroy its power (Romans 5:8; Hebrews 7:25). As the attitude and revolt of man against the authority of God, sin finds its destruction in His obedience unto death. Through the death of Christ, a man is "racially saved" but personally lost if he refuses a personal acceptance of Christ as his Saviour and Lord. There are two Adams, and every man has the personal responsibility of deciding which way he shall go.⁴⁰ The Spirit's work before conversion is awakening the sinner ("enlightening of the mind") to his spiritually dead condition (Ephesians 2:1-10). The Spirit also convicts the sinner of the need to accept by faith the grace provided through Christ's obedience and death for His deliverance from sin.⁴¹

At conversion Chadwick taught that the spiritual potential within a person becomes alive under the operation of the Spirit (John 3:1-8).⁴² The power of the Spirit in the new birth is necessary in the Christian religion. Without the Holy Spirit, the Christian religion becomes hopeless.⁴³ The Holy Spirit is both the Giver and Lord of the life that is in Christ. The Spirit's work covers the whole of spiritual life from first to last. He is the Spirit of life for regeneration (John 3:5, 7), the Spirit of adoption (Romans 8:15; Galatians 4:6), the

⁴⁰ Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 24-37.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 15-23; cf., Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 37, 78-82, 90.

⁴² *Ibid.*, pp. 45-49.

⁴³ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, p. 7.

*Spirit of holiness for sanctification (Romans 8:5), the Spirit of glory for transfiguration (II Corinthians 3:18; I Peter 4:14), and the Spirit of promise for resurrection (Ephesians 1:13; 4:30).*⁴⁴ When the soul is born of the Spirit, it dwells in the Spirit, walks, and prays in the Spirit. It is sphered in the presence of the Spirit. However, a man may be born again of the Spirit, but not baptized with the Spirit. In the birth of the Spirit there is imparted spiritual life. In the Spirit's baptism, there is imparted the gift of power by which the believer is equipped for service and endued for witnessing.⁴⁵

Chadwick explained that after conversion the Spirit bears witness to the accomplished fact of salvation. The possibility of being saved is a privilege of everyone through faith in Jesus Christ (John 3:16; II Peter 3:9). Moreover, every child of God is privileged to be conscious of his acceptance in Christ. If God is the Father of the convert, it is reasonable to expect that God will assure His children of their parentage (Romans 8:16-17; Galatians 4:6). This spiritual certainty is necessary to prevent perplexity, suspicion, resentment motivated by fear, and the destruction of filial instinct, love, and joy (I John 2:26-29; 3:19-22; 4:16-19). He believed that now all "evangelical churches" concede this witness of the Spirit to be the privilege of sonship.⁴⁶

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 71-74.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 34-36; cf., Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 174-177; cf., Samuel Chadwick, The Gospel of the Cross (London: Epworth Press, 1934), pp. 7-51, 64-81, 88-97.

⁴⁶ Samuel Chadwick, The Call to Christian Perfection (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1943), pp. 9-11; cf., Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 73-74.

Chadwick saw the Spirit's work after conversion mainly as a supportive and guiding ministry within the believer's soul. Before conversion, sin reigns in the sinner's life. After conversion, sinful habits cease reigning, but the principle of sin co-exists with the new life.⁴⁷ Because sin and the new principle of spiritual life are antagonistic within the believer's soul ("sin in believers"), a contest results between the flesh and the imparted new life (Romans 7; I Corinthians 3:1-3). The Spirit co-operates with the believer by supporting and preventing overt backsliding into sinful habits ("abiding in Christ") and guiding into an awareness of the need of entire sanctification.⁴⁸ After conversion the Spirit assists in the development of the graces or the fruit of the Spirit. The graces of the Spirit are the result of the Spirit's working in the regenerate soul in producing love, joy, peace, long-suffering, gentleness, goodness, faithfulness, meekness, and self-control. In a negative sense the Spirit keeps the believer from sinful practices after conversion. In a positive sense, the Spirit guides the regenerate into an awareness of the need of entire sanctification and the development of Christian graces.⁴⁹

As Chadwick expressed it:

The diffusion of Life is the work of the Holy Ghost, and the fruit by which the Father is glorified is the fruit of the Spirit. Apart from Christ there is neither life nor fruit, but

⁴⁷ Ibid., p. 65.

⁴⁸ Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 52-62; cf., pp. 174-177.

⁴⁹ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 99-104.

without the Spirit of Christ there can be neither union nor abiding.⁵⁰

The Holy Spirit's Work At and
After the Baptism with the
Spirit

Arthur thought that the Spirit's work at conversion is not the experience of being baptized or filled with the Spirit. The difference between receiving the Spirit and being filled with the Spirit is a difference not of kind, but of degree. In the divine work of receiving the Spirit at conversion, the light of heaven reaches the dark chambers of the soul bringing forgiveness of sins but does not remove the state of spiritual obscurity and deep shadows. In being filled or baptized with the Spirit, this spiritual light fills the whole chamber of the soul removing the principle of sin. Thus, man's duty and need is to be filled with the Holy Spirit (Ephesians 5:18). Whatever is man's duty and need must also be the will of God for all men.⁵¹

Arthur expressed this distinction as follows:

The apostles themselves had doubtless received the Spirit in some measure before the day of Pentecost; for our Lord had breathed upon them immediately after his resurrection, and said: "Receive ye the Holy Ghost." Yet in the time which intervened between that and Pentecost, whatever might have been the advancement of their spiritual condition beyond what it was before, it rested far behind that which immediately followed upon the baptism of fire. It was only then that they were "filled with the Holy Ghost."⁵²

According to Arthur, the Spirit's work at the baptism with the

⁵⁰ Ibid., p. 100.

⁵¹ Arthur, The Tongue of Fire, pp. 32-33.

⁵² Ibid., p. 32; cf., pp. 43-46.

*Spirit is cleansing and filling the believer's soul with the Spirit Himself which results in a spiritual state of being fully imbued with the divine nature.*⁵³ *This baptism of fire is not for those of the world, but for Christian believers.*⁵⁴ *The Spirit's baptism illuminates every faculty of the believer's soul and purifies every affection.*⁵⁵ *The real nature of the Spirit's baptism is especially seen in II Corinthians 9:8. Here is promised a double overflow, first of grace from God to the believer, and then, of the same grace from the believer into every good work. The human spirit by the baptism of fire is restored to its original and highest fellowship with God which in turn influences human relationships.*⁵⁶ *This baptism with the Spirit is the only source of real spiritual power.*⁵⁷

Speaking of the justified believer's need of this spiritual power imparted by the baptism of fire, Arthur said:

*There is not a beast of the field but may trust his nature and follow it, certain that it will lead him to the best of which he is capable. But as for us, our only invincible enemy is our nature. . . . Often, when we honestly meant to be good and noble, our miserable nature, . . . betrayed us again, and we found ourselves falling by our own hands, . . . We can defy circumstances, and resist the devil, if only our own breast become not a hold of traitors; if inclinations, silent, subtle, and strong as nature, do not arise to beguile us into captivity to evil.*⁵⁸

For Arthur, the way into the experience of the baptism of fire

⁵³ *Ibid.*, p. 43.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 31; cf., p. 36.

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 34.

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 34-37.

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 215.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 80-81; cf., pp. 33-37.

is by persevering prayer and secret waiting at the throne of God.⁵⁹ He outlined some hindrances to be avoided in seeking the Spirit's filling. These hindrances include: unbelief, neglect of prayer, misuse of the tongue in uncharitable or idle speech, sensual indulgence, and religious worship emphasizing its composition rather than its spiritual power.⁶⁰ Arthur was firmly committed to the position that the justified believer of his day, like the early church believers, could receive this baptism of fire.⁶¹

Arthur viewed the after effects of the Spirit's baptism in accordance with the recorded accounts of the New Testament and especially as seen within the Book of Acts. He believed these accounts were the norm by which a contemporary understanding of the Spirit's workings are to be understood. The coming of the Spirit at Pentecost was the affirmation that because Jesus was glorified the Holy Spirit was given (John 7:39; 12:16; 14-16).⁶² The ascension of Christ was necessary before anyone could experience this baptism with the Spirit,⁶³ and one of the instant effects of the cleansing and infilling of the Spirit is that people magnify God (Acts 2:46, 47; 10:46).⁶⁴ New spiritual power within the believer is another effect of the New Testament Pentecostal baptism (Luke 24:46-53; Acts 1:8). The Lord promised His disciples another Comforter. The Spirit comes as the

⁵⁹ Ibid., pp. 214-217.

⁶⁰ Ibid., pp. 218-229.

⁶¹ Ibid., pp. 124-127; cf., pp. 140-142, 196-201.

⁶² Ibid., p. 25.

⁶³ Ibid., p. 184.

⁶⁴ Ibid., p. 25

Comforter in His baptism bringing spiritual power, guiding into all truth, revealing the things of God, calling to remembrance the words of Christ, convincing the world of sin, righteousness and judgment. He is to embolden the Lord's servants to bear witness (Acts 1:8) before a hostile world by guiding their lips to wise and convincing speech (Matthew 10:19, 20; Mark 13:11; Luke 21:12-15; Acts 5:28-32; 6:10; 13:9-12, 46).⁶⁵

Repeatedly, Arthur underscored that the heart of the New Testament Pentecostal baptism is a "tongue of fire." The Spirit-empowered convincing speech at Pentecost were words like fire, melting and burning the spirits of men. The Spirit's cleansing and empowerment enabled the disciples to proclaim words like hammers, breaking in pieces the hearts of stone (Acts 2:37). They were words which rushed upon the congregation with an overwhelming force and resulted in a spiritual conquest of hardened hearts (Acts 6:10).⁶⁶ The tongue of fire is the church's instrument of spiritual aggression and with the baptism of fire it assails every existing system and every evil habit and curtails the opposition. This power of utterance referred to in the New Testament is the Gift of God and the great weapon of the church.⁶⁷ Consequently, the baptism with the tongue of fire is a necessary prerequisite in giving effective service to Christ and the church.⁶⁸

Arthur perceived the Spirit's ministry as imparting permanent

⁶⁵ Arthur, The Tongue of Fire, p. 31.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 57; cf., p. 71.

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 68-69.

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 157, 213.

benefits to the church. He believed the ministry of the Holy Spirit a necessity for the functioning of the church. Without the ministry of the Spirit, Christianity ceases to exist. These permanent privileges imparted to the church by the Spirit are not to be seen in the gifts of the Spirit. The permanent benefits granted to the church until the end of the age during the dispensation of the Spirit are the spiritual influences of the Spirit in conversion, religious certainty, the baptism with the Spirit, and the upbuilding of Christ's church and purpose through world-wide evangelism. In Arthur's view, it is important to see that the Spirit works within the believer and by the believer He ministers through the church as a spiritual influence upon the world.⁶⁹

Samuel Chadwick saw a distinction between the Spirit's work in regeneration and the baptism with the Spirit. Speaking of spiritual babes being delivered from the carnal to the spiritual, he indicated that this spiritual childishness is cured by being uprooted (I Corinthians 3:1-4). This carnality is uprooted only by the fulfillment of regeneration in entire sanctification (Hebrews 6:1; I Thessalonians 4:3-5; II Thessalonians 2:13). He explained that sanctification in a sense is "entire" in regeneration because the work of conversion is not one of laxity and defect. No Christian is to live in sin or knowingly be unconsecrated to the Lord. In conversion, the soul becomes the Lord's and is laid upon the altar of sanctification. However, even though sanctification in a sense is completed at conversion, the experience of believers and the purpose of God as revealed in the Bible

⁶⁹ Ibid., pp. 106-229.

show there is carnality which needs purging after conversion. Entire sanctification or the baptism with the Spirit completes the work of regeneration by pervading every part of the renewed nature. The soul is cleansed from the defilement of the old nature and its evil lusts (James 1:8; 4:8; Romans 6:6).⁷⁰

Chadwick expressed his distinction between regeneration and the baptism with the Spirit when he said:

The experience is distinct from that of Regeneration. Of those who had believed and been baptized in the Name of the Lord Jesus, it was said they had not yet been baptized of the Holy Ghost. It is evident, therefore, that a man may be born again of the Spirit and not be baptized with the Spirit. In Regeneration there is a gift of life by the Spirit, and whosoever receives it is saved; in the Baptism of the Spirit there is a gift of power, and by it the believer is equipped for service and endowed for witnessing. In the Corinthian Church there were many believers who were not filled with the Holy Ghost, though they were rich in the gifts of the Spirit. Nevertheless, it is the inheritance of every believer to receive the gift of the Spirit, to be baptized with the Spirit, to be filled with the Spirit; and to this definite experience thousands have testified.⁷¹

Chadwick taught that the unregenerate soul is reigned over by a nature of inborn proneness to evil. The unregenerate sin because they are sinners. The principle of sin reigns within their personalities resulting in evil conduct. In the regenerate, this principle of sin co-exists with the Spirit's imparted new life resulting in an inward spiritual warfare (Romans 7, 8). But, at the baptism with the Spirit or entire sanctification, the principle of sin is abolished (Romans 6:6; 8:5-14).⁷²

⁷⁰ Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 59-62.

⁷¹ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, p. 35.

⁷² Chadwick, The Call to Christian Perfection, pp. 64-65; cf., Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 52-62.

Chadwick was emphatic that the Spirit's work in His baptism is not achieved by growth or development. The Christian calling requires one to be holy (Hebrews 12:14). The Spirit's baptism is not an "emotional luxury" or a "spiritual fad." Those believers who refuse to seek after holiness barter their "spiritual inheritance." This accounts for some of the backsliding among believers. One must seek the Spirit's cleansing as an instantaneous act of faith and not through gradual growth. Growth involves a process of life. But, the baptism with the Spirit is the Gift of abundant life or a Gift of grace in the Holy Ghost. It implies a crisis and comes not by works but by faith (Acts 11:17; 15:8, 9; 26:17, 18; Galatians 3:14).⁷³

According to Chadwick, the nature of the Spirit's baptism is that the Spirit of God cleanses the spirit of the justified believer (Judges 6:34; Romans 6:11-13; Galatians 2:20).⁷⁴ The glory of Christ's work is not just that He died for all men, but that He imparts the very Spirit in which and by which He lived. This is the miracle of the incarnation repeatedly duplicated and perpetuated in Christ's believing people (I Corinthians 6:19). He indwells believers to work through them. Each believer ought to live and work as if Christ were in his place.⁷⁵ However, the Spirit dwells only where Christ rules and is honored.⁷⁶

⁷³ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 85-87.

⁷⁴ Ibid., pp. 30-31, 43-49, 87.

⁷⁵ Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 146-156.

⁷⁶ Ibid., pp. 164-165; cf., Chadwick, The Call to Christian Perfection, pp. 38-52, 68-81, 90-96, 104-110.

Chadwick defined what he meant by the nature of the Spirit's baptism in his teaching on Christian perfection. He advocated that no person attains absolute perfection in this life. God alone possesses this and all other perfection is relative.⁷⁷ He taught that there are three states of perfection: "initial," "progressive," and "final,"⁷⁸ illustrated in Philippians 3:12-16. In paradox form, the Apostle Paul posited the fact of pressing toward perfection while claiming to be perfect. The Apostle repudiated "final perfection" while engaged in "progressive perfection" and possessing an "initial perfection."⁷⁹

Chadwick believed this perfection relationship is seen in the New Testament by the use of two Greek words. The word for "final perfection" is teleios. This word refers to Christ and His redeeming work as being all perfect. It indicates the ultimate consummation of grace or perfect development.⁸⁰ The second word, katartizo, refers not to finality but fitness. This involves supplying that which is lacking or making the defective perfect (I Thessalonians 3:10). Like a broken machine, mending is done to repair and make fit for use again. Chadwick understood the Spirit's baptism or Christian perfection in the use of this latter word.⁸¹

Chadwick did not think this baptism with the Spirit produces

⁷⁷ Chadwick, The Call to Christian Perfection, p. 28.

⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 28-29.

⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 28-32.

⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 30-31. Two exceptions to this use of teleios are I Corinthians 2:6 and Philippians 3:15.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 28-37, 41-43.

infallibility or deliverance from all temptation.⁸² Rather, he thought that the baptism with the Spirit is the complete deliverance from everything which makes the soul unfit and unequal to do the will of God. It is the empowerment for obedience to every demand in the fellowship of God in Christ.⁸³

Chadwick believed that in seeking the Spirit's baptism certain instructions should be followed. First, know that you are seeking the definite Gift of the Holy Spirit. Second, follow the Word of God. The Spirit leads believers to the experience through the teaching of Holy Scriptures. Third, the experience is to be received by grace through faith and spiritual obedience to the Spirit's probing and revealing (Acts 15:8, 9; I John 1:7, 9). Fourth, follow the steps of faith in repenting, asking, receiving, and obeying.⁸⁴

The results after the Spirit's baptism were seen in the change of the disciples after Pentecost. The disciples were examples of the spiritual inheritance the baptism with the Spirit brings into the believer's life. There is deliverance from the moral impotence of the dual personality evidenced within the justified believer's life (Romans 7; I Corinthians 3:1-3). Also, anemic believers are changed into exuberant saints possessing abounding vitality (Acts 5:42). The Spirit of abundant life (John 10:10; 14:12-17; 15:11) dwells within the believer, permeating his being, vitalizing his mortal body, and

⁸² *Ibid.*, pp. 53-67.

⁸³ *Ibid.*, pp. 30-32; cf., Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 190-205.

⁸⁴ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 122-128.

radiating through his life. The Spirit's cleansing vitalizes the believer's latent powers. Likewise, the disciples received deep understanding or discernment of the truths of God. Christ said before His death that when the Spirit came He would "teach you all things" (John 14:26). The Spirit took the deep things of Christ and revealed them to those who received Him. Therefore, He is the Revealer of Christ and the Spirit of Wisdom. A new fellowship (Acts 4:32-37; 11:27-30) in prayer also resulted from the disciples' baptism. Repeatedly, the early church went to prayer (Acts 2:42; 4:31; 6:4; 8:15; 12:5; 13:3; Romans 8:26-27). Furthermore, the Spirit's baptism imparts spiritual power and the fire of God to believers (Acts 1:8a; Romans 8:37). The Spirit baptizes with fire and empowers believers with a love that glows (Romans 8:38, 39; I Corinthians 13:1-8). In addition, the Spirit's cleansing brings a passion for the souls of men (Luke 24:46-49; Acts 1:8b; Romans 9:1-3). Christ's baptism imparted by the Spirit is a redeeming passion. Spirit-filled hearts always see sinful men through the tears of a holy compassion.⁸⁵

Like Arthur, Chadwick taught that the experience of the Spirit's baptism is assured and verified by the inward witness of the Spirit. This cleansing of the Spirit brings a certainty of revelation to the soul concerning the life, death, and resurrection of Christ as it relates to the believer.⁸⁶ He candidly explained: "The Baptism of the Holy Spirit is a definite and distinct experience assured and verified

⁸⁵ Ibid., pp. 26-27; 33-42; cf., Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 157-205.

⁸⁶ Ibid., pp. 34-38.

by the witness of the Spirit."⁸⁷ Chadwick recorded that John Wesley was continually inquiring if the believers of the Methodist societies had received the Gift of perfect love. If there was not a definite assurance that the cleansing work of the Spirit had been done, the believers were encouraged by Wesley to groan after it.⁸⁸

Chadwick suggested the problems of the church are traceable to a neglect of the Spirit's ministry and mission. The church is always helpless without the presence and power of the Spirit. The church is the body of Christ begotten, unified, and indwelt by the Spirit. The beginning of the Christian religion is a new birth by the power of the Spirit. The Spirit is the Author and Revealer of the Bible--the source book of the Christian religion. Consequently, the church is helpless without the presence and working power of the Holy Spirit.

Moreover, Chadwick taught that the church lost its note of authority, the secret of wisdom, and the gift of power by wilful and persistent neglect of the Spirit's ministry. A dearth of conversions results when faith in the new birth as a creative act of the Spirit is neglected and the experience of the Second Gift of Grace is no longer preached and testified. This disbelief in the Spirit's work results in the death of the church's prayer-meetings.⁸⁹

Chadwick taught that the church's needs and problems are to be

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 34; cf., Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 172-173; 196-197.

⁸⁸ Chadwick, The Call to Christian Perfection, pp. 11-13.

⁸⁹ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 5-10.

met by an experiential baptism with the Holy Spirit.⁹⁰ When the atoning work of Christ was completed, the Spirit was given as God's Gift to the church of His Son. This body of Christ is the sphere of the Spirit's ministry, the agent of His purpose, and the place of His presence. The sphere of the Spirit is now in the church or the Living Temple of sanctified humanity. The Spirit seeks, wants, needs, and dwells in men. Christ staked His kingdom on men and gave His Spirit to men to quicken, empower, and guide them in carrying on His mission. The Spirit, in the Gift of Himself, is carrying out the Son's investiture in and through Christ's body (Acts 2:33; Ephesians 1:20-23; 5:23-33). Therefore, the Gift of the Spirit is necessary for the church to be everything Christ intended and provided for in His redeeming benefits (Hebrews 13:12, 13).⁹¹

Basic to Chadwick's understanding of the Holy Spirit's ministry and work was his view of the church. He saw the character of the church as centering in Christ. In the act of self-emptying (Philippians 2:1-11), Christ surrendered all but His Father and His church. This church is Christ's by the gift of God the Father (Matthew 11:27; 16:17; John 6:37; 10:29; 17:6, 9, 10, 11, 24; Ephesians 1:20-23). The Father gave the church as a gift to His Son. The church also belongs to Christ because He purchased it (Ephesians 5:25-27; Revelation 1:5, 6). All Christian believers belong to Christ by the conquest or purchase of His shed blood and by the will of the Father (John 3:16-21, 36; Romans 6:23;

⁹⁰ Ibid., pp. 11-17.

⁹¹ Ibid., pp. 28-32; cf., Chadwick, The Call to Christian Perfection, p. 38.

II Peter 3:9). The church is Christ's bride (Revelation 21:9) and Christ's heart is centered on her. Christ surrendered His all by giving His life for her possession and has devoted all the resources of His power and nature to her. The church is Christ's body (Colossians 1:18; Ephesians 1:20-22) and He dwells within His church through the Holy Spirit. Through His church He is revealed and by it He works. Because of its preciousness and value to Jesus Christ no person should despise the church. It is a community of people devoted to the spiritual mission of carrying on Christ's work. The church of Christ exists for Christ and its function is to fulfill His purpose and be always at the disposal of His will. Therefore, admission must be conditioned upon knowledge of His Person and confession of His name. It is this spiritual nature of the church which makes it an impregnable rock (Matthew 16:18, 19).⁹²

In Chadwick's view, Christ committed the keys of His kingdom and His authority to the church resulting in it having the keys of deliverance for sinful men (Luke 24:44-53; Acts 2). The world Jesus came to save is the sum total of humanity (Matthew 13:38; John 3:16-21). Christ turned over to His church the task of world evangelization (Acts 1:8), but the work of His kingdom cannot go any faster than His church is prepared to go. By its very nature, Christianity is a life that must be propagated. When the vitality of the church is low, the power of the Spirit is restrained and hinders the work of Christ's kingdom. Also, the authority of the church is conditioned upon Christ indwelling and

⁹² Chadwick, Humanity and God, pp. 206-215.

directing its counsels and labors. The works of Christ's church are the manifestation of Christ's mind and will. When the church displaces the things of God with worldliness, it ceases to be Christ's representative and becomes the servant of the devil. Chadwick's basic pre-supposition was that the Spirit's ministry and work in and through the church is imperative. Every true member of the church is a divine creation of the Spirit. Every soul is enlightened by the revelation of the Father through His Son and this is accomplished through the agency of the Spirit. Every believer is built of God into the community of Heaven-born souls through the energizing agency of the Holy Spirit. Consequently, the church's nature, purpose, mission, and authority is solely dependent upon the mighty working and ministry of the Holy Spirit.⁹³

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS

Nature of the Spirit's Gifts

William Arthur spoke of several types of gifts bestowed by the Spirit for Christian service: the ministerial gift, the gift of prayer, the teaching gift, and the miraculous gifts of tongues and prophecy.

By ministerial gift, Arthur meant the Apostle Peter's Spirit-bestowed ability to clearly state and argue the truth enabling the hearers to understand and be convicted of sin by the great revelation that God has sent His Son to redeem men from sin (Acts 2:37-40). In this gift, the Spirit bestows upon the speaker the ability to gain the favorable attention of the people and lead them to an understanding of

⁹³Ibid., pp. 212-220.

the truth and inclination to embrace it.⁹⁴

Arthur advocated that the gift of prophecy is basically the same as the ministerial gift. This gift is delivering a message from God under the impulse of the Spirit of God and by His aid.⁹⁵ In prophesying, the speaker has the double advantage of ascertained truth to declare (truth received by his understanding and enforced by citing the Word of God) and the direct aid of the Spirit in the proclamation of this truth.⁹⁶ This gift conveys no revelation of future events. It is a gift more of forthtelling than of foretelling. This is a gift of speech in the native tongue of the hearers and is different from the gift of tongues in this sense. The intellect and bodily organs act according to natural laws, though under a supernatural influence. The man exercising the gift works in cooperation with the Holy Spirit. His whole person is involved--the intellect illuminated with divine light, the moral powers quickened by divine feeling, and the physical organs speaking with divine power.⁹⁷

According to Arthur, the apostles placed the gift of prophecy as the highest gift. It stands closest in communion with God as His intelligent instrument for His hallowed work of calling prodigal sons back to divine sonship and training feeble Christians in spiritual strength and steadfastness.⁹⁸

Speaking of the high position of this prophecy (preaching) gift,

⁹⁴ Arthur, The Tongue of Fire, p. 76.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 64.

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

⁹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 67.

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

Arthur said:

*This gift was that which had the most direct utility, was capable of the most universal application, and was destined to be permanent; equally needful for the converting of sinners and the edifying of the church; and therefore to be kept in view by the church as a special subject of prayer; for, let this cease, and Christianity dwindles into a natural agency for social improvement; blessed with superhuman doctrines, but destitute of a superhuman power.*⁹⁹

In spite of the high regard placed upon this gift of prophecy, it was not the possession of every disciple. Not all of the disciples were like Stephen who possessed this gift of pouring out in clear and copious words the testimony which commanded the attention of hardened hearers (Acts 6:10). But each of the early Christians possessed in his own sphere and style a spiritual power (the tongue of fire) which distinguished him from his fellow-men. This is the power of fully sanctified believers declaring the deep things of God with spiritual words which cut deep into the sinful hearts of men. It is the church's great weapon which results in its advancement. This tongue of fire is, however, different from the gift of prophecy.¹⁰⁰

The gifts of prayer and teaching were only briefly mentioned by Arthur. In the New Testament, these two gifts are not to be elevated or set one above the other. Every minister who is sent by God is endued with the teaching gift.¹⁰¹ The gift of prayer is also part of the work and prerogative of the Holy Spirit. This prayer gift is the very essence of the church and one of the gifts of private members of the

⁹⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., pp. 69-74.

¹⁰¹ Ibid., pp. 93-94.

church. Some believers have this gift and not the ministerial gift or prophecy.¹⁰²

The miraculous gift of tongues, Arthur believed, is not unknown tongues.¹⁰³ He believed that speaking with unknown tongues was never heard of in the apostolic days. At Pentecost (Acts 2) these believers were not pretending to speak in unknown tongues. Rather, they were speaking foreign languages of the adjacent nations, from which individuals came to Jerusalem to celebrate the Jewish Feast of Pentecost. Even in the First Corinthian Epistle (12-14), the word "unknown" used in reference to tongues speaking is in italics showing that it was not taken from the original Greek manuscript, but added by the translators.¹⁰⁴

William Arthur perceived that the purpose of the gift of tongues at Pentecost was to make the representatives of all nations feel that God had spoken.¹⁰⁵ This gift was a miracle sign of God's adaptability and universal call to man. Only the wise God possessed the command of all languages and by one consentaneous impulse proclaimed His new message (Christ's redeeming work through the Spirit's ministry) to be the Word of God. This variety of languages in the tongues of all mankind gave the power of speaking the Good News in the languages of the adjacent nations.¹⁰⁶ This miracle was a sign that the Pentecostal message was of Divine origin and included a new sphere. This new sphere

¹⁰² Ibid., pp. 96-100.

¹⁰³ Ibid., p. 47.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., pp. 47, 49-51, 55-56, 65-66.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid., p. 52.

¹⁰⁶ Arthur, *The Tongue of Fire*, pp. 47, 50-53.

was a message from the Father of men to all men. Each of these various tongues were an additional witness of the gospel for every people under heaven. This gift was necessary for the fulfillment of our Lord's last words that the disciples were to be witnesses unto "the uttermost part of the earth" (Acts 1:8; Luke 24:44-53).¹⁰⁷ Its one use was a sign to unbelievers that God had spoken under exceptional circumstances. This gift functioned in producing the general impression that the disciples were empowered messengers of God. However, Arthur taught this gift was not adapted to edify the church and not designed to be either universal or perpetual. Upon the learned believer, it would be edifying because it would be understood, but the unlearned believer would not be edified. If unbelievers, they would be led to mock, but, where the population had become believers this sign ceased to be needed.¹⁰⁸

Arthur gave some basic conclusions concerning the general nature of spiritual gifts. First, at Pentecost, spiritual life was imparted to the human soul while spiritual gifts were bestowed. The imparted spiritual life and bestowed spiritual gifts were followed by the disciples entering upon the spiritual service of being active witnesses for Christ and for His cross (Acts 1:8).¹⁰⁹ In Acts chapter two, the baptism with the Spirit fell equally upon all the people. In contrast, spiritual gifts are bestowed upon all, but not equally.¹¹⁰ Furthermore, the Holy Spirit bestows or dispenses the spiritual gifts as He sees fit

¹⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 55-57.

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 66, 74, 107-108.

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 58.

¹¹⁰ *Ibid.*

(I Corinthians 12:11, 18).¹¹¹ Again, the fruit of the Spirit is to be distinguished from "spiritual gifts." By the fruit of the Spirit, he referred to the graces of love, joy, and peace which operate in the believers hearts indicating the Spirit's abiding presence. By spiritual gifts, he believed, the Spirit bestows a miraculous special ability upon the disciples to accomplish a divine purpose.¹¹²

In addition, a distinction was made by Arthur in his understanding of the "tongue of fire" and the "gift of tongues." By the first, he referred to the spiritual and moral power which the justified believer receives as a result of the Gift of the Holy Spirit in the baptism with the Spirit. This tongue of fire is the spiritual empowerment of entirely sanctified believers for witnessing in a way which results in the salvation of men from sin and submission to Christ as Saviour and Lord (Acts 2:37-38).¹¹³ This spiritual empowerment is the Spirit's permanent Gift to the church. Religion and the church cannot continue as a spiritual power without this tongue of fire.¹¹⁴

On the other hand, according to Arthur, the gift of tongues referred to the Spirit's temporary bestowment for gaining the attention of unbelievers under exceptional circumstances.¹¹⁵ It called all nations to know that God had spoken by proclaiming in many languages a new message of the Spirit's dispensation.¹¹⁶ The gift of tongues at

¹¹¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 58, 61.

¹¹² *Ibid.*, pp. 106-108, 111, 134-135.

¹¹³ *Ibid.*, pp. 28, 30-31, 56-57, 69-74.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 68-73, 111.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 106-108, 111.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 26-28, 50-53.

Pentecost prepared an audience or produced an impression that the disciples were messengers of God, but, it could not convert or instruct. It took the tongue of fire to do this effectively.¹¹⁷ This tongue of fire is greater than the gift of tongues because a moral miracle is greater than physical or mental miracles.¹¹⁸

Even though Arthur was not preoccupied with a systematic development of spiritual gifts, he posited an important biblical distinctive. He believed the test of the Spirit's bestowment of any gift is to be seen in the power of edification for the church (I Corinthians 12:11-31; 14:12-40; Ephesians 4:9-16). The gifts function as heralds of the real grace and blessing of the Spirit which enables the church to exercise a Spirit-empowered converting influence upon the world. The discussion of Arthur's views on spiritual gifts entails this understanding of the bestowment of gifts within the context of the church.¹¹⁹

According to Samuel Chadwick, there are nine graces of the Spirit. These graces or fruit are mentioned in various representative passages of Scripture (Galatians 5:22-26; II Peter 1:4-7). The condition for these spiritual graces or fruitfulness is by abiding in union with Christ through the indwelling Spirit. These nine graces of the Spirit are the Christian virtues resulting from the indwelling Presence of the Spirit. This fruit does not result from man's labour, but rather, it is God's work produced by His indwelling Spirit of life. The fruit refers to the character produced by the indwelling Spirit.

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 74.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 83-86, 140-143.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 106-111, 142-143, 219.

Chadwick saw these nine graces in three sections with three corresponding categories: in relation to God, there are love, joy, peace; in relation to others, there are listed long-suffering, gentleness, goodness; in relation to ourselves, there are listed faithfulness, meekness, self-control.¹²⁰

Chadwick advocated that spiritual gifts are not the fruit of the Spirit. He believed there are nine gifts of the Spirit. These gifts are for service and bestowed in the sovereign wisdom of the Spirit (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). These differing gifts are adapted according to the grace of God for the kind of service to which one is called.¹²¹ But these gifts are not the Spirit's fruit because they may exist apart from any great spirituality. The Corinthian believers were an example of people rich in gifts and poor in fruit (I Corinthians 3:1-11). Christ even spoke of some "who wrought wonders in His Name," but were not of Him (Matthew 7:20-23; 24:24; Mark 13:22). Furthermore, the fruit of the Spirit is for all, but the Spirit's gifts are given "to each severally as He will" (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). As the distribution of the talents are received each according to his several abilities, likewise the Spirit divides to every man as He will (I Corinthians 12:11). Therefore, spiritual gifts are bestowed as the Spirit wills upon all believers whom He selects. The fruit of the Spirit is sanctified dispositions for all believers. The Spirit's fruit is the perfecting of grace in heart and life, while gifts apart from the fruit do not

¹²⁰ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 99-103.

¹²¹ Ibid., p. 99.

glorify Christ. Chadwick thought that to be preoccupied with gifts brings a "snare" upon people. In contrast, a preoccupation with the fruit of the Spirit results in a sacrificial and sacramental spiritual state which brings glory to all.¹²²

Chadwick summarized his thoughts on the Spirit's fruit and gifts when he said:

Fruit and Gifts are not identical. Fruit belongs to character; gifts are enduements of power. Gifts are an evidence of the Spirit; but they are no proof of holiness. Gifts are according to the elections of the Sovereign Will of the Spirit of God; fruit is the manifestation of cultivated Life. Gifts are for service; fruit is for character. Gifts are functional; fruit is a quality of life. Gifts are bestowed; fruit is a manifestation. Gifts may be given immediately and completely; fruit is implanted and of gradual development. . . . The gifts of the Spirit are given to people who are elect according to the Sovereign will of God, who by His Spirit divides to every man severally as He will. Love, in which is included all the fruit, is not in the list of spiritual gifts. Fruit is for all; gifts are for those for whom they have been prepared. All may not prophesy, but all must love. We may covet gifts, but we must bear fruit. Gifts cannot take the place of fruit.¹²³

More directly, Chadwick outlined what he meant by some of the spiritual gifts. He listed these gifts: wisdom, knowledge, faith, miracles, healing, prophecy, discernment of spirits, tongues, interpretation of tongues. Even though distinct from, they are related to natural talents. For example, wisdom and knowledge are related to intelligence and learning, yet distinct from the natural powers of man. These gifts are given to the uneducated as well as the educated. The gift of healing is distinct from the skill of medical science. No one within the early church could heal indiscriminately. Paul had Luke as his physician (Colossians 4:14; II Timothy 4:11) and Trophimus was left

¹²² *Ibid.*, pp. 103, 105-106.

¹²³ *Ibid.*, pp. 108-109.

sick at Miletus (II Timothy 4:20). The Sovereign Lord is the Healer by His Spirit. The gift of tongues comes last on Paul's list, but first in controversy. This gift is given for a sign, perfecting of the saints, and building up the body of Christ. The gift of tongues is not acquiring an "unknown language" nor is it a substitute for such learning. The gift of prophecy is more than insight or foresight. Many of God's prophets had received this gift.¹²⁴

Chadwick suggested the function of spiritual gifts is service (Romans 12:6-8). These gifts differ according to the kind of ministry to be fulfilled with the occasion determining the function. There are times when special gifts abound, but some of these gifts are permanent and other gifts have been given for special vocations and exceptional occasions (II Timothy 1:6).¹²⁵ However, they function through the sanctified natural endowments causing ungodly men to see there is nothing in natural man to account for what is manifestly of God.¹²⁶ Not all members have the same gifts, and one of the determining factors in the selection of the Spirit is according to the ability of sanctified nature to receive and function with His gifts.¹²⁷

Samuel Chadwick placed his teaching of spiritual gifts within the theological context of his doctrine of the church. When Christ ascended into Heaven, He gave gifts unto men (Ephesians 4:8-12): apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors, and teachers. These gifts are bestowed for the purpose of edifying of the body of Christ and function

¹²⁴ Ibid., pp. 105-109.

¹²⁵ Ibid., p. 109.

¹²⁶ Ibid., pp. 106, 108.

¹²⁷ Ibid., p. 106.

through the sanctified powers of man or within the context of the church. The indwelling Spirit of Christ within the church distributes the gifts for the upbuilding of His church as He sees fit (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). Spiritual men receive spiritual gifts according to each man's several ability in the will of the Spirit. Chadwick affirmed that a careful study of the New Testament disclosed the place of the gifts to be among the enduements of the church. These gifts are for the purpose of Christian service and differ according to the kind of ministry to be fulfilled under the directions of the Holy Spirit. Moreover, among the safeguards against abuse of the gifts, Chadwick posited the loyalty to the fellowship in the body of Christ. This edification of the body of Christ is one of the safeguards in discerning true spiritual gifts (I Corinthians 12:20-31; 14:12-40). Therefore, Chadwick's development of spiritual gifts must be interpreted within the context of this understanding of the church.¹²⁸

Chadwick followed Paul's concern (I Corinthians 12-14) in warning of the abuses of spiritual gifts. He believed that within the early church the gifts appealed to unspiritual men who desired them for carnal purposes and commercialized them. The recorded results of this abuse were fruitful sources for rivalry, jealousy, and disorder (I Corinthians 3:1-4).¹²⁹ He advocated "loyalties of the faith" as a safeguard against these abuses. The first loyalty is to the Lordship of Christ (I Corinthians 12:3; I John 4:1-3). This is the first law of

¹²⁸ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, pp. 103-111.

¹²⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 110.

Christian discipleship and the continual standard of Christian life and service. The second is loyalty to the Word of God (II Timothy 3:13-17; Hebrews 4:12-13; I John 5:6-7). The Spirit of God and His Word are never in contradiction; the Word of Truth always attests the Spirit of Truth. The Spirit of God always interprets, corroborates, verifies, and confirms the Word. Wisdom from God is never found to be in disharmony with Holy Scriptures. The third is loyalty to the fellowship in the body of Christ (I Corinthians 12:12, 13, 18-27; 14:12, 20). Edification and orderly worship are the rules in safeguarding abuses of spiritual gifts (I Corinthians 14:5-19, 40). Superseding all gifts, the law of love (I Corinthians 13) is to be the governing rule.¹³⁰

Permanence or Cessation of
the Gifts

Concerning the permanence or cessation of spiritual gifts, Arthur stressed the priority of the Spirit's cleansing baptism over any of the miraculous gifts. He suggested that the gift of tongues is not one of the permanent privileges of the church.¹³¹ Because no consistent pattern was established within Acts in the use of the gift of tongues, he believed this gift was not an accompaniment of the first appearance of Christianity during the apostolic days. Believing that the Apostle Paul taught that this gift is not designed to be a permanent gift of the church, he concluded that the gift is destitute of any power of

¹³⁰ Ibid., p. 111; cf., pp. 88-92. Chadwick here (p. 88) states: "Love is the last word in religion. It completes the revelation of God and sums up the whole duty of man. Love is of God, and the Spirit of God is the Spirit of Love."

¹³¹ Arthur, The Tongue of Fire, pp. 106-108.

edification for the church (I Corinthians 14:5-19), and not a gift to be continued where the people are convinced of the truth of Christianity.¹³² In speaking of the permanent benefits to the church of the Spirit's baptism, Arthur indicated that the divine intent is to have ministers as instruments of the mighty power of God. This ministerial power is not to be expected in the gift of tongues or of miracles because these are not essential to the work of the ministry.¹³³ As Ephesians 4:11 indicates, he believed the miraculous gifts are only auxiliary to the ministry of the church.¹³⁴ These miraculous gifts are ranked and marked by the apostle (I Corinthians 12:28) as inferior gifts to those designated for edification, exhortation, and comfort. The miracle-working, healing, and tongues-speaking gifts are set as inferior gifts to those which constitute men as teachers or prophets of Divine truths.¹³⁵ The miraculous gifts, the tongues, the flames, and the outward signs are not the saving grace of the Spirit or the essence of a real Christian. They are only separable attendants of a real Christian and need not be continued.¹³⁶

Basically, Samuel Chadwick assumed the permanence of the Spirit's gifts. The occasion determines the function of these gifts, but there are seasons when special gifts abound. Some are permanent while others are given for special vocations and exceptional occasions. Chadwick's example of gifts for exceptional occasions was Timothy's gift

¹³²Ibid.

¹³⁴Ibid., p. 143.

¹³⁶Ibid., p. 140.

¹³³Ibid., p. 192

¹³⁵Ibid., pp. 142-143.

bestowed by the laying on of hands (II Timothy 1:6) and those special manifestations of power in times of the Spirit's special visitation.¹³⁷

Speaking in reference to the permanence of the gifts, Chadwick said:

There are no reasons why the gifts of the Spirit should be operative in one dispensation and not in another. They did not cease at the close of the Apostolic Age. They have been manifest in all ages of the Church, and there are abundant proofs that they are still available to the faith and need of the Church. There is no reason why they should not be more manifest, and perhaps there is a greater need for them now than in some other times. . . . A revival of spiritual gifts in the Church would bring to nought the mocking pretensions of the world.¹³⁸

Distribution of the Gifts

In relation to which gifts are bestowed, William Arthur contended that it is only those Spirit-empowered, preaching-witnessing, and converting graces which are the permanent blessings or gifts for the church. He held that the tongue of fire, the gift of preaching (prophecy), the gift of prayer, and the gift of teaching and fellowship are the permanent Pentecostal benefits for the contemporary church.¹³⁹

Arthur seemed to adhere to the view that the gifts are bestowed at and after the baptism with the Spirit. The tongue of fire was the resultant empowerment received by the disciples on the day of Pentecost and constantly needful within the church.¹⁴⁰ The gifts of prophecy, prayer, teaching and fellowship are part of the spiritual essence and

¹³⁷ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, p. 109.

¹³⁸ Ibid., pp. 109-110.

¹³⁹ Arthur, The Tongue of Fire, pp. 93-105, 111, 192-211.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid., pp. 68-71, 73, 251-253.

ministry of the church,¹⁴¹ and each of these are received at or after the baptism with the Spirit. Any miraculous gifts which may be bestowed are attendants to the church's spiritual ministry and service, dispensed as the Spirit wills, and received at or shortly after the Spirit's baptism of the tongue of fire.¹⁴²

Concerning which of the gifts are bestowed, Chadwick believed they may be given whenever the Spirit sees the need for them. They are given for the purpose of service and differ according to the kind of ministry to be fulfilled. These gifts did not cease at the close of the Apostolic Age; therefore, the sovereign Spirit of the living God may bestow any of them (within the context of the loyalties of faith)¹⁴³ whenever there is a need for them in the edification of the body of Christ (Ephesians 4:8-12; I Corinthians 12:4-7).¹⁴⁴

Concerning when the spiritual gifts are bestowed, Chadwick was somewhat indefinite. Because the natural man cannot receive the things of the Spirit, spiritual gifts are bestowed upon the spiritual man according to each man's several ability in the will of the Spirit (I Corinthians 12:11).¹⁴⁵ These gifts are given according to the elections of the sovereign will of the Spirit of God. Also, these gifts are to give a supernatural power to the works of sanctified natural endowments, so that ungodly men see God manifested.¹⁴⁶ He stated: "In the Gift of

¹⁴¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 93-105.

¹⁴² *Ibid.*, pp. 47-61, 192.

¹⁴³ Chadwick, The Way to Pentecost, p. 111.

¹⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 109-111.

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 106.

¹⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 108.

the Spirit there are gifts."¹⁴⁷ If this was what Chadwick meant, the gifts are bestowed after conversion or at and after the baptism with the Spirit. On the other hand, Chadwick acknowledged the gifts are not proof of spirituality and that some (non-spiritual people) are endowed of whom Jesus said that "He never knew them" (Matthew 7:17-23). Within the Corinthian Church, there were carnal people in possession of spiritual gifts who used them for carnal ends (I Corinthians 1:10-31; 3:1-3).¹⁴⁸ Here is the possibility of unbelievers and the unsanctified receiving the gifts.

¹⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 105.

¹⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 110.

Chapter 3

DANIEL STEELE

Daniel Steele (1824-1914) was an American schoolman whose life combined scholarship and piety. He was regarded in his day "as a foremost authority on the Greek New Testament."¹ As an educator,² he taught at both Syracuse University and Boston University. At Syracuse University, he occupied the professorship in Mental and Moral Philosophy. At Boston University, he was professor of Doctrinal Theology. He also was a professor of Ancient Languages at Genesee College. Steele had a ministry as a camp-meeting holiness preacher both within and without his own Methodist denomination.³

As an author, Steele was one of the best known among holiness writers not only within his own Methodist Episcopal Church, but within other Wesleyan-Arminian denominations. He wrote several books which have been prized as great classics in the area of teaching and defending

¹Delbert R. Rose, "Daniel Steele--The Scholar-Saint," The Herald, 79:18, March 27, 1968; cf., Daniel Steele, Mile-Stone Papers Doctrinal, Ethical, and Experimental on Christian Progress (rpt. Minneapolis: Bethany Fellowship, 1966), pp. 41-72.

²Dr. Steele held both a Doctor of Systematic Theology and Doctor of Divinity degrees. As an educator, Steele's influence was evident while he was at Boston University. One of his pupils from Boston University, Samuel Logan Brengle (1860-1936), became a well known exponent and contributor to the promotion of Bible holiness.

³Rose, "Daniel Steele," p. 18.

Christian perfection or the baptism with the Holy Spirit.⁴ This is reflected in some of his book titles: Love Enthroned (1875); Mile-Stone Papers (1878); Half-Hours with Saint Paul (1894); A Defense of Christian Perfection (1896); The Gospel of the Comforter (1897); Substitute for Holiness or Antinomianism Revised; or The Theology of the So-called Plymouth Brethren Examined and Refuted (1899); Jesus Exultant (1904); Half-Hours with St. John's Epistle (1908); Difficulties Removed from the Way of Holiness (n.d.).⁵

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT

Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts

Daniel Steele's pneumatological views included a distinction between the Holy Spirit as a Gift for believers and the Spirit as the Giver of spiritual gifts. He believed the Spirit's gifts or "extraordinary gifts" were evident in the Old Testament. Bezaleel was endowed by the Spirit to devise cunning works in gold, silver and brass (Exodus 35:30-35); Samson was supernaturally endowed by the Spirit with physical strength (Judges 13-16); Balaam and King Saul were endowed temporarily to prophesy even though they were destitute of Divine grace (Numbers 22-24; I Samuel 19:23-24). These are gifts of the Spirit but not the Divine grace imparted by the Spirit. These gifts are external

⁴Leslie D. Wilcox, Be Ye Holy (Cincinnati: Revivalist Press, 1965), pp. 317-318.

⁵E.L. Kletzing edited a book of Steele's responses to people's questions called Steele's Answers (1912). Steele also wrote articles for various periodicals such as The Christian Witness and Advocate of Bible Holiness.

endowments by the Spirit. Even in the New Testament at Pentecost, the outward gifts are arbitrarily bestowed (Acts 2:1-11). These gifts are not the chief gift; the chief Gift is the Spirit Himself permanently abiding in the soul as the Sanctifier and empowerment of Divine grace (Acts 15:8, 9). This Divine grace or Gift is especially seen in love which is superior to all the outward gifts (I Corinthians 13).⁶ Consequently, the Spirit Himself as Gift is entirely distinct from His supernatural gifts.⁷

Or, as Steele expressed this distinction:

We can but regard the modern eager desire for the gifts of the Spirit instead of the graces of the Spirit comprised in that charity (I Cor. 13), which has been aptly styled, "the greatest thing in the world," as a sign not of real spiritual progress, but rather of decline in divine life. St. Paul, after a full description of these extraordinary gifts in I Cor. 12, gives this command, "But desire earnestly the greater gifts. And a still more excellent way I show unto you." He then proceeds to give a panegyric of charity, or love, as that eternal principle without which all gifts are worthless; a principle superior in quality and dignity to all other cardinal Christian graces, and therefore infinitely superior to those miraculous gifts which may exist in the absence of love (Matt. 7:22, 23).⁸

The Holy Spirit's Work Before,
At, and After Conversion

In the Spirit's work before conversion, Steele based his teaching upon the depravity of man. When man's forefather Adam sinned, the

⁶ Daniel Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter (rpt. Salem: Convention Book Store, 1973), pp. 38-39, 87, 233, 258.

⁷ Daniel Steele, Love Enthroned (New York: Philips and Hunt, 1875), pp. 155, 174.

⁸ Daniel Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul and Other Bible Readings (rpt. Rochester: Rev. H.E. Schmul, 1959), pp. 250-251; cf., Harvey J.S. Blaney, "St. Paul's Posture on Speaking in Unknown Tongues," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 8:52-60, Spring, 1973.

whole human race became sinners as a sequence of his transgression (Genesis 3:6, 17; 5:3; 6:5; I Timothy 2:13, 14; II Corinthians 11:3). As offspring of Adam, all men are born spiritually dead and are classified as fallen men (Ephesians 2; Romans 3:10, 23). Even though men possess a "natural likeness" to God (personality, intelligence, moral sense, free-will), all men do not possess the "moral likeness" to God (holiness, love, justice, wisdom and truth) (II Corinthians 4:3, 4). Accordingly, two weak points result within the moral nature of fallen men: dull spiritual discernment and depraved desires.⁹ Although man is a sinner, he is endowed with the gracious ability to repent and receive Christ Jesus as Saviour and Lord through the convicting ministry of the Holy Spirit. Steele called this "prevenient grace" or "initial salvation."¹⁰ On another occasion, he called this "provisional salvation." He defined these terms as: "all the gifts of God's grace administered by Jesus Christ to men unconditionally."¹¹ These "unconditional gifts" of prevenient grace include: Christ's atonement as a conditional substitute for the punishment of sin; the ground of pardon for penitent believers; the gracious ability to repent of sin; the convicting agency of the Holy Spirit in the conviction of sinners.¹²

Therefore, Christ is the "Second Adam" redeeming the whole

⁹ Daniel Steele, Jesus Exultant; or Christ No Pessimist and Other Essays (1899; rpt. Salem: Convention Book Store, n.d.), pp. 11, 42, 130, 152, 202.

¹⁰ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 174.

¹¹ Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 66, 262.

¹² Ibid., pp. 261-266.

human family from sin. Sin discrowned the first Adam and his sons (Genesis 3; 5:3; 6:5). The Second Adam appeared on earth as the God-man to produce a new race (I Corinthians 15:20-23; John 1:1-18; Galatians 4:4-7). He alone is the norm or model from which a new creation of the human race will proceed (Hebrews 2:10; 12:1, 2; II Corinthians 5:17; John 1:12; II Peter 1:4).¹³ A gulf exists between these two orders which cannot be bridged by any human being (Romans 3:23). The broadness of this chasm is observed in ascertaining that sonship expresses life. The sons of God possess spiritual life while the sons of Adam are spiritually dead (Romans 5:12-18; 6:23; Ephesians 2:1-10; Galatians 2:16; I John 5:12). Only God through Christ as the Second Adam can bridge this chasm (Romans 6:23; Jeremiah 13:22-27; 17:9-10). Sonship implies likeness, and the sons of depraved Adam reflect his marred image (Genesis 5:3). In contrast, the sons of God possess His image through the righteousness imparted by the Holy Spirit (II Peter 1:4; Ephesians 2:18-19), and resulting in divine and holy characteristics (I John 3-5; II Corinthians 5:17). The all-comprehending moral attribute of God is holiness (Leviticus 11:44; I Peter 1:10-25) and all of God's sons are characterized as being made holy (Ephesians 1:4-14; Romans 12:1, 2; I John 3:5-10). This is the broad line of demarcation between the children of God and the children of the devil. Accordingly, permanent sonship and continued practice of sin are a contradiction. The children of God are holy in spiritual character

¹³Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 4-6; cf., Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 183-199.

(I John 2:1, 2; 3:9-10; 5:4-5).¹⁴

Moreover, Steele thought that the Spirit's convictive ministry before conversion is needful to awaken the sinner ("conviction of sin") to God's provision of redemption through Jesus Christ (John 16:7-14). Sinful men are incapable of comprehending the deep depths of sinfulness ruling within them (Jeremiah 17:9, 10); therefore the purpose of the Spirit's convicting ministry in unbelievers is to expose the ugliness of sin and cause it to be dreaded and avoided because of the divine punishment upon it. The Spirit probes and searches the unbeliever's heart by turning it spiritually "inside out," exposing the loathsome leprosy of sin harbored within. The Spirit as the divine Comforter is the Healer sent by God's mercy not to torment the sinful soul by forbidding his pleasures, but to bless him by turning him away from all iniquities and convicting him of ingratitude, unbelief, and rebellion against Christ. The Spirit exposes to the sinful heart his refusal to bow the knee to the personal revelation of God in Christ Jesus. This sin of unbelief which results in a rejection of Christ as personal Saviour is a denial of God's moral attribute of truth (I John 5:9-12). Gospel-hardened sinners call God the Father a liar by rejecting Christ as personal Saviour and Lord and refusing to acknowledge the Father's personal revelation of Himself in the life and Person of His Son (John 3:16-21, 36; 5:24-32; 6:33-58; I John 5:12). However, sinful man's eternal destiny hinges upon his disposition toward God's Son. God the Father is pleased to make Himself known to men through the witness of

¹⁴Ibid., pp. 6-10.

the Son and the Spirit (John 1:1-18; 4:23-24; 6:63) by convincing the unbeliever that present salvation and eternal life depend solely on faith in Christ (I Timothy 2:4-6; Acts 4:12).¹⁵

Steele further explained that the Spirit's conviction of sin is accompanied by the "conviction of righteousness." In the conviction of sin, the Spirit convinces the sinner of his sinfulness and prepares his soul for the conviction of righteousness. Steele believed this conviction of righteousness to be the Spirit's work in impressing upon the sinner the perfect model of righteous human character. Fallen man, without the Spirit's convictive ministry of righteousness, is unable to see what he ought to be in God's sight. The natural man knows nothing of a perfect attainable righteousness unless the Spirit reveals it (I Corinthians 2:9-16). The Spirit points sinful men to the God-man (Jesus Christ) as the perfect model of character within himself. The Spirit as the divine Comforter assists men in gazing steadfastly upon Christ and through faith receiving His imparted holiness (Philippians 2:5).¹⁶

Along with the Spirit's conviction of sin and righteousness, Steele believed the Spirit's convincing work involves the "conviction of judgment." The Spirit's convictive work is to impress upon sinners that a divine sentence is declared against all sin. At the incarnation and coming of the Saviour, an inward judgment is commenced in men's hearts of which the last judgment is only the outward manifestation. In

¹⁵Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 41-48.

¹⁶*Ibid.*, pp. 49-52.

the atoning death of Christ, God the Father declared His abhorrence of sin and His mercy to sinners and in this sacrificial death, Satan and all his usurping host were defeated and judged. Through Christ's redeeming death, all men are conditionally emancipated from satanic bondage (I John 1-3). Thus, because of Christ's redemptive death, all men are without excuse for their sins (John 15:22; Acts 17:30, 31; Romans 1-3), and must expect the satanic doom of God's judgment (John 3:16-21, 36; Revelation 20:10-15). On the other hand, all who respond to the Spirit's conviction will be led to conversion (John 1:12, 13; Romans 8:15-39). Therefore, the Spirit glorifies Christ by convincing the sinner of Christ's perfect power to save from the guilt of sin through faith in His death as a conditional substitute for the punishment of sin.¹⁷

Steele taught that man's depravity is of a two-fold nature. His definition of man's sinfulness indicates that sin is a state of the heart out of which acts flow or tend to flow.¹⁸ Steele called this state "the spirit of sin" or "inbred sin." Technically, he classified it as "original sin" because it is inherited from Adam. His view of the whole atonement is based upon this concept of man's depravity and Christ's work through the Holy Spirit in redeeming men from all sin.¹⁹

Before conversion, Steele warned that a person may commit the

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 53-58.

¹⁸ Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, p. 92; cf., Daniel Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection or a Criticism of Dr. James Mudge's Growth in Holiness Toward Perfection (New York: Hunt and Eaton, 1896), pp. 96-97.

¹⁹ Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 37-54.

irremissible sin of blasphemy against the Holy Spirit (Matthew 12:31, 32; Mark 3:28-30). This unpardonable sin is not an isolated sin, but sin in its full development. It is the result of a series of acts of known sin in which there is a deliberate rejection of light and defiant repulse of the Spirit's warnings concerning one's duty and destiny. This irremissible sin is not God closing the door of repentance but man finally and eternally shutting up his personality against grace and irreversibly expelling the Spirit as the Agent of God's mercy. God's mercy endures forever, but man's ability to appropriate His mercy is for a short time. The Spirit is not capricious or arbitrary in leaving a human soul to its own deliberate self-determined destiny, because the Spirit's ministry is that of a Comforter or Helper. The Spirit can no longer help a soul when its character becomes fixed in sin. All sin tends toward this state of final permanence in sin and Steele hinted that even a truly regenerated man can fall and commit this irremissible sin (John 5:16; Hebrews 6:4-8). The death of every lost soul has the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit as chief mourners.²⁰

If the Spirit's work before conversion is the awakening of the unregenerate to his deep seated depravity and the saving potential of Jesus Christ, Steele believed His work at conversion is dealing with these sinful acts. Regeneration introduces a spiritual power which checks the outbreaking of this spirit of sin into actual sin.²¹ Where

²⁰ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 267-271; cf., Brengle, When the Holy Ghost is Come, pp. 99-106; cf., S.L. Brengle, Resurrection Life and Power (London: Salvationist Publishing, 1925), pp. 171-178.

²¹ Steele, Love Enthroned, p. 37.

sin had uncrowned the first Adam, Christ as the "Second Adam" restores or redeems fallen man from his sinful practices and habits.²² The work of the Spirit at conversion is the rectification of the moral faculties weakened and marred by sin.²³

According to Steele, regeneration is the great transition from spiritual death to spiritual life (Ephesians 2), but it does not make the child of God complete in holiness. This is not to minimize the experience of regeneration, but rather to acknowledge that the Spirit does not baptize or entirely sanctify when He regenerates. Entire sanctification is subsequent to regeneration. The Spirit is unable to impart His baptism at regeneration because neither the consecration, nor the faith of the penitent sinner are adequate for this complete work. Moreover, the penitent sinner's spiritual knowledge and faith as a babe in Christ cannot comprehend the need of the Spirit's baptism (I Corinthians 3). Nor can the Spirit crucify the self-life or the principle of sin without the co-operation of the new man imparted by the Spirit in the new birth. No man has the spiritual power to recognize and deal with this propensity to sin without the imparted spiritual life which is repressive of depravity rather than being totally destructive. However, the Spirit's baptism is an entire eradication by the direct and instantaneous act of the Spirit conditioned upon the believer's special act of faith in Christ's sanctifying power.²⁴

²²Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 4-15.

²³Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 102.

²⁴Ibid., pp. 94-104.

Steele further clarified his distinctions between the Spirit's work at conversion and the subsequent work of entire sanctification. He listed nine distinctions: (1) The state of mind preceding each experience is different. In conversion a person's attention is fixed on past sin and its guilt, but in the Spirit's cleansing, the heart looks inward upon itself in a feeling of self-aborrence because of inward and unlovely tempers or dispositions. However, this self-aborrence is without a sense of divine wrath for sins committed. (2) The objects which the soul seeks are different. In conversion, the soul's object is pardon, but in entire sanctification the object is purity. (3) The manner of attaining these blessings is different although both divine workings are by faith. The penitent sinner lays hold of Jesus dying on the cross for his sins while the believer, as an aspirant after a clean heart, more distinctly apprehends Jesus living on the throne. The first thinks of Jesus' mercy while the latter thinks of His almightiness. (4) There is a difference in the blessings received. At conversion, the sinner receives the beginning of the new life by becoming a new creature in Christ Jesus (II Corinthians 5:17); it is emergence out of the spiritual darkness of sin or a spiritual resurrection from the dead (Ephesians 2). In purity of heart, a more excellent glory yet unattained is received (Ephesians 3:16-21). (5) Even the witness of the Spirit for religious certainty is different. In conversion the witness is intermittent while in entire sanctification it is abiding and excluding every doubt. (6) A difference exists between the sense of defilement which distresses the justified soul and the sense of inward purity felt when the Sanctifier makes His conscious abode within.

(7) In conversion and entire sanctification, there is a distinction in submission to God's will. In conversion because of a painful duality in the soul (Romans 7; James 1:8; 4:8), the believer finds it difficult to deal with the self-asserting force which opposes the will of God. Entire sanctification harmonizes the conflict by enabling the human will to acquiesce to the divine will. The sinner thinks of his own salvation and surrenders himself as a conquered rebel pleading--"God, be merciful to me a sinner." In contrast, the regenerate soul as a patriot gladly pours out to God all his possessions, body, mind, and soul, and prays--"Father, glorify thyself in me." The latter consecration is more intelligent, deliberate, and in detail, because of a superior self-knowledge by the illumination of the Holy Spirit. (8) The sanctified heart's joy in depth, solidity, richness, and permanency transcend the joy of the regenerate state. (9) An important distinction between the two states of Christian experience is seen in receiving Christ as the salvation Gift and the Giver of every good and every perfect gift. The new birth refers to receiving the salvation gift, while the fullness of love or heart purity refers to the latter state of Christian experience in receiving the Giver of all blessings.²⁵

After conversion, Steele believed that the Holy Spirit imparts a witness which forms the basis of the justified believer's religious certainty. It consists in the Spirit quickening the spiritual perceptions and giving certitude of God and spiritual realities (Hebrews 6:11;

²⁵ Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 27-33, 358, 384; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 94-104; cf., Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 44-46.

10:22, 26; Colossians 1:9, 10; 2:2; Philippians 1:9; II Peter 1:1-3, 8; 2:20; II Timothy 2:25; Ephesians 1:17; 4:13; Romans 8:16-19). The whole Trinity is involved in this witness. God the Father reveals Himself to the world through His Son, and in giving a direct and experimental knowledge of Himself He communicates to the believer spiritual intuitions through the Holy Spirit.²⁶ The believer's certitude consists of "two witnesses." The first is the divine testimony for every normal religious experience, and is an inner persuasion or "direct witness" by the Spirit in which the believer is notified that all is right between God and his soul. The witness comes in response to the prayer of faith as the regenerate prays and trusts in Christ. Then, there is the witness of the believer's spirit ("indirect witness"), which is inferential by noting the marks of conversion as found in the Bible and discerning these marks in the daily life. The result is an inference that the Spirit's work of regeneration and adoption into the family of God is accomplished because of the fruit of the Spirit. This second witness is self-judgment confirming the first. Both witnesses are necessary and should be constant. In some young Christians, the witness is intermittent. But after the Spirit's baptism, the witness is abiding.²⁷

After conversion, Steele taught that the Spirit imparts guidance for the development of a Christian conscience and the testings of the

²⁶ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul and Other Bible Readings, pp. 128-145; cf., Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 127-133.

²⁷ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 117-128; cf., Brengle, When the Holy Ghost is Come, pp. 32-42.

Holy Spirit. He believed that safeguards are needed against the danger of a fanatical conscience. The indwelling Spirit does not supersede the activity of man's reason, judgment, and moral sense in respect to decisions of practical Christian living. Neither is His guidance in the conduct of life designed to be the sole and infallible guide, but to be seen in connection with the inspired Word, common sense, divine providence, and the godly judgment of Christian people. No guidance given by the Spirit collides with the Bible inspired by the Spirit. The Holy Spirit is the Conserver of holiness and never leads into anything which constitutes sin. The Spirit never disparages Christ and His redeeming work, but rather glorifies Him (John 15:26, 27; 16:13, 14). It is the express work of the Spirit to convert and sanctify so that He never declares any substitutes for conversion and entire sanctification. To prevent the believer from mistaking the detours of Satan for the legitimate tests of the Spirit, Steele advocated a seven-fold test of religious impressions: following the best light derived from the indwelling Spirit, the Holy Scriptures, God-given common sense, personal abilities, circumstances, providential openings and shuttings, and the godly judgment of the church.²⁸

Steele outlined some positive distinctions when it came to the term "sanctification." These distinctions clarified his view of the Spirit's work after conversion. The Spirit's work after conversion is what he called "progressive sanctification" or "gradual sanctification." By this term, he meant the work of the Spirit in opening the heart of the

²⁸ Ibid., pp. 149-150, 181-184; cf., Brengle, When the Holy Ghost is Come, pp. 62-79.

newborn soul to receive the eternal truth as the instrument of its purification, imparting vigor to the spiritual life, strengthening the will to resist temptation, and diminishing the power of evil habits. It is the "repressive" or the restraining work of the Spirit rather than "totally destructive" or the cleansing of inward depravity.²⁹

Daniel Steele spoke of "provisional sanctification" as related to the Spirit's work after conversion. All men are "provisionally" saved, but actually only those sinners are saved who appropriate salvation by faith claiming Christ as personal Savior and His resultant transformation of character.³⁰ In a similar sense, all believers are "provisionally sanctified" in Christ Jesus. However, just as men are really saved only when through their faith in Christ they are born of the Spirit, believers are wholly sanctified only when they appropriate by faith the Spirit's work for the cleansing of their souls.³¹

He also mentioned "conditional sanctification" and "actual sanctification." By conditional sanctification, he referred to Christ's atoning and sanctifying power provided conditionally to all believers. In other words, Christ is conditionally all believers' Sanctifier, but not all believers have met the spiritual or moral conditions for being actually sanctified through the agency of the Holy Spirit. Thus conditional sanctification refers to the conditions necessary for the accomplishment of the Spirit's baptism (Acts 15:8, 9; 26:18). These

²⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 99; cf., Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 107-111.

³⁰ Steele, Jesus Exultant, p. 262.

³¹ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 243.

conditions are entire consecration ("entire self-surrender") and appropriating faith in the atoning power of Christ to sanctify through His representative Agent, the Holy Spirit. Along with provisional sanctification, conditional sanctification centers in Christ and what He has done in His death and resurrection for all Christians (Ephesians 5:26; I Corinthians 1:30; 6:11; Hebrews 2:11; 10:10-31; 13:12). On the other hand, the focus of effectual or "actual sanctification" centers in the Holy Spirit and His agency in conditionally applying Christ's atoning benefits and privileges to all believers (Romans 15:16; II Thessalonians 2:13; I Peter 1:2). The Spirit is the sanctifying Agent working through Christ the purifying Medium in effectually accomplishing the act of actual sanctification or the realized state of entire sanctification. Therefore, actual sanctification is that sanctification wrought by the Holy Spirit and secured by the believer's faith.³²

By "entire sanctification," Steele meant the completion of the seed-grain of holiness sown by the Holy Spirit at regeneration.³³ As the Greek aorist tense indicates, it is an instantaneous work of the Spirit imparted through faith in the atoning work of Jesus Christ.³⁴ It is the instantaneous and divinely appointed gateway into perfect love as a state where the believer loves God with all his heart, mind, and strength. It is the spiritual circumcision which Christ imparts through

³² *Ibid.*, pp. 105-116.

³³ Steele, Love Enthroned, p. 26; cf., Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 44, 46, 290.

³⁴ Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 41-72.

His mediation as the Gift of the Holy Spirit.³⁵

Steele believed that every believer is in need of the Spirit's conviction for the cleansing of entire sanctification after conversion. As the Spirit convicts the unbelievers of wilful sin, He also convicts the regenerate of the wrong state of the sensibilities lying back of the will. Even after conversion, there remain tendencies and propensities perilous to spiritual life and antagonistic to the new principle of love to God which has been enthroned within the believer (I Corinthians 3: 1-3; Galatians 2:20; 5:16-18).³⁶ In convicting the sinner of his sins, the Spirit shows the dark picture of wilful sin; but in convicting the regenerate of the need for cleansing, the Spirit exhibits the perfect model of righteous human character as reflected in Jesus Christ (Philippians 2:5).³⁷

Speaking of the Spirit's convicting ministry of the unsanctified, Steele explained:

The Spirit not only convicts unbelievers of wilful sin, but He also convicts the regenerate of "sin improperly so called" (Wesley), a wrong state of the sensibilities lying back of the will. Even after the will has, through the new birth, been brought into an attitude of submission to Christ, there remain tendencies and propensities perilous to the spiritual life and antagonistic to the new principle of love to God which is now enthroned within. This rendered many of the Corinthians "carnal" so that Paul hesitated to call them "spiritual," though they were, "as babes in Christ," possessing a feeble spiritual life instead of that more abundant life which Christ came to impart.³⁸

³⁵ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 165, 190.

³⁶ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 46.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 49-52; cf., pp. 53-58.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 45-46.

The Holy Spirit's Work At and
After the Baptism with the
Spirit

Steele hesitated to use the terms "the baptism with the Spirit," the "fullness of the Spirit," and "the coming of the Comforter" when he referred to the Spirit's cleansing of entire sanctification. He acknowledged that these terms were not used by John Wesley or the Wesleyan standard theologians. Wesley for "rhetorical reasons" used some twenty-five phrases in speaking of this state of grace, but Steele thought Wesley carefully guarded himself in speaking of this special blessing.³⁹

On the other hand, Steele equated the baptism with the Spirit and entire sanctification as basically synonymous. Entire sanctification is the negative aspect of the baptism with the Spirit in the extinction of sin in the believer's soul. The term Christian perfection speaks of the positive aspect of the Spirit's baptism in the fullness of love shed abroad in the heart. According to Steele, the terms "baptism," "anointing," "the fullness," "the abiding," "the indwelling," "the constant communion," "the sealing," and "the earnest" of the Holy Spirit were equivalent terms expressing this state of Christian perfection.⁴⁰

According to Steele, the Spirit's work at the baptism with the Holy Spirit is the imparting of Christ's spiritual grace which cleanses

³⁹ Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, p. 108; cf., Daniel Steele, Steele's Answers, ed. E.L. Kletzing (Chicago: Christian Witness 1912), pp. 130-131.

⁴⁰ Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 94, 101, 103-104; cf., Steele, Steele's Answers, pp. 36-37, 85-86; cf., Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, p. 247.

the justified believer from all inbred sin and fills the soul with perfect love.⁴¹ Within the regenerate, there is a spiritual struggle with the inward principle of sin (Galatians 5:16-26). When the saved soul would do the works of the flesh, the Spirit strives to prevent it. When the soul would follow the leadings of the Spirit, the flesh opposes. This religious warfare ceases when the flesh is crucified (Galatians 5:24) and this body of sin is destroyed (Romans 6:6).⁴² This is Christ's promised Gift of the Holy Spirit (Luke 24:45-49; John 14:12-27; 15:26-27; 16:7-14; Acts 1:4-8; 2:1-4; 15:8, 9).⁴³ Therefore, the Spirit's work in imparting the Gift of Himself is both subtraction and addition. The Spirit cleanses (subtraction) the inward spirit of sin and imparts (addition) perfect love.⁴⁴

Moreover, Steele established basic theological presuppositions concerning the Spirit's work at the baptism with the Spirit. First, he strongly stressed the Spirit's baptism as being rooted in the atoning merits or benefits of Jesus Christ.⁴⁵ The whole Trinity is involved in the plan of man's redemption. The Father originated the plan (John 3:16; I Thessalonians 4:3; II Peter 3:9), the Son through His atoning death provided the means (Romans 6:23; Hebrews 10:14; 13:12; I Corinthians 1:30; 6:11; Ephesians 5:26), while the Spirit conditionally

⁴¹ Daniel Steele, Difficulties Removed from the Way of Holiness, (London: S.W. Partridge, n.d.), pp. 7-8, 16, 47.

⁴² *Ibid.*, pp. 22, 47; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 97-104; cf., Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, p. 165.

⁴³ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, p. 190.

⁴⁴ Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, p. 36.

⁴⁵ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 105-116.

applies the atonement for the soul's purification from inbred sin (Romans 15:16; I Corinthians 6:11; II Thessalonians 2:13; I Peter 1:2). However, he maintained a distinction between the Son's and the Spirit's sanctifying work of purification. Christ does not enter the believer's heart for cleansing. Rather, Christ provides the purifying Medium in His own shed blood through the Agent of the Holy Spirit who accomplishes the indwelling and cleansing work (John 14:12-18; 15:26; 16:7-33). The Son's work is external or "objective"; the Spirit's work is internal or "subjective." The Son sanctifies or purifies in a provisional sense while the Spirit cleanses in an effectual sense. All believers are provisionally sanctified ("provisional sanctification") in Christ, but they have not all completely appropriated ("conditional sanctification") Christ's atoning benefit which is effectually applied by the Holy Spirit ("actual sanctification"). Christ's provisional sanctification is eternally efficacious and incapable of improvement and is ready in all ages to be applied by the Spirit for the inward cleansing of every believer. The only thing lacking for actual sanctification is the believer meeting the conditions for the Spirit's baptism (Mark 9:23b).⁴⁶

Steele summarized the continuous need of the atonement in the following statement:

I believe if any man says, however holy he may be at the present time, however the work of God by the divine Spirit may have purged him, soul and body, from all sin, if he says he can live half an hour without the atonement, he is a greatly mistaken man; if he says he can live one minute without the atonement, he is a mistaken man. That is where much of fanaticism comes in.

⁴⁶ Ibid., pp. 105-108; cf., Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 101, 105, 204, 261-277.

If the devil cannot ride a truth down, he will raise up various clouds of fanaticism and misunderstanding about it.⁴⁷

Secondly, Steele strongly affirmed that the Spirit's baptism is appropriated by faith (Acts 15:8, 9).⁴⁸ Faith is the only gateway by which God enters the soul, and creates and measures its' capacity for spiritual good. Jesus Christ in all His offices--prophet or teacher, priest, and king--is grasped only by faith. The Holy Spirit as Regenerator, Spirit of adoption, and Sanctifier (all benefits of the Spirit's presence) must also be specifically grasped by faith.⁴⁹ This faith is the human "sixth sense" and the only way of appropriating the great riches of Christ.⁵⁰

Steele further explained that there are conditions for this appropriating faith which result in the Spirit's baptism. Spiritual obedience is necessary for appropriating faith (I John 1:7, 9) and forms the root of this faith (I Samuel 15:22-23). Faith is also the seed of all spiritual knowledge (Hebrews 11:1-6). As the organ of spiritual perception the human will has the option of seeing its spiritual duty and accepting it in submission to God's will or refusing to follow God's way. If the latter is chosen, the unpleasant consequence is a dulled moral perception because rejected spiritual light hardens the soul's spiritual sensibilities (Hebrews 3-4; cf., I John 1:7, 9) hindering

⁴⁷ Steele, Difficulties Removed from the Way of Holiness, pp. 53-54; cf., pp. 7-8, 35; cf., Steele, Love Enthroned, p. 101.

⁴⁸ Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 161, 364-391.

⁴⁹ Ibid., p. 161; cf., pp. 207-214.

⁵⁰ Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 73, 161, 272-273.

appropriating faith for the Spirit's cleansing.⁵¹ There must be a persistent appropriating faith for the perpetual fullness of the Spirit.⁵²

Moreover, Steele advocated that sanctifying faith must have a "ground" and an "object." The ground of faith is the divine promises within the Bible for heart purity, and the object of faith is the blood of Jesus Christ (all spiritual truth centers in Him) which cleanses from all sin (I John 1:9). Sanctifying faith is God's gift of perfect trust in Christ's atoning death and His promises to give the Spirit to the believer for the crucifixion of the self-life. This faith involves the "subjective conditions" of a complete surrender of the self in entire submission ("entire consecration") to the law of Christ (Philippians 2:5) and asking in the name of Jesus for the abiding Comforter. Consecration involves receiving the Spirit for the promotion of Christ's glory. This kind of consecrating and sanctifying faith is far superior to a "tentative faith" or believing by way of experiment.⁵³

Steele's third basic presupposition was that the Spirit's baptism is an instantaneous divine work of complete deliverance from the principle of sin.⁵⁴ In his book, Half-Hours with Saint Paul, he presented a short Greek New Testament study showing the apostle's use of words to express the thoroughness of the Spirit's work in entire

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 278-294.

⁵² *Ibid.*, p. 131.

⁵³ Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 248, 364-391; cf., Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 114, 251.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 55-70; cf., Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 41-72; cf., Steele, Difficulties Removed from the Way of Holiness, pp. 7-8, 16.

sanctification.⁵⁵ He concluded that the Spirit's cleansing is to be received by faith, right now, and just as I am.⁵⁶ He concisely expressed the thoroughness and instantaneous working of the Spirit when he said: "The entire eradication of the propensity to sin is by the direct and instantaneous act of the Holy Spirit responsive to a special act of faith in Christ claiming the full heritage of the believer."⁵⁷

Therefore, according to Steele, the baptism with the Spirit involves three essentials in the Spirit's sanctifying work. First, there is a sanctifying faith. It is a faith which insists that God promises and will accomplish, through the blood of Christ and the agency of the Holy Spirit, the purifying work. Second, it is a faith which insists the cleansing baptism must be done now. The nature of inbred sin necessitates that entire sanctification become an established fact now. Third, it is a sanctifying work to be accomplished "just as I am." As Steele saw it, these three must always go together--faith, now, and just as I am.⁵⁸

Steele's fourth theological presupposition was concerned with religious certitude.⁵⁹ He believed three emphases constitute the essence of the Wesleyan understanding of the Spirit's baptism: it is a

⁵⁵ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 87-92; cf., pp. 93-104.

⁵⁶ Steele, Love Enthroned, p. 383.

⁵⁷ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 99.

⁵⁸ Steele, Love Enthroned, p. 383.

⁵⁹ Ibid., pp. 207-249; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 117-128; cf., Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 128-145, 307-323; cf., Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 127-133.

complete work of cleansing, an instantaneous work, a Spirit-certified work in the Spirit's witness to the believer and the resultant manifestation of the fruit of the Spirit.⁶⁰

Steele outlined what he believed to be the Spirit's work after Christ's promised gift of the Spirit. He taught that there is a witness of the Spirit for religious certitude after the Spirit's baptism.⁶¹ Basic to his understanding of Christian assurance was the direct and indirect witness of the Spirit. By the direct witness he agreed with John Wesley that it is an inward impression within the soul by the Holy Spirit witnessing that the spiritual work of cleansing is done (Galatians 4:6; Romans 8:12-32; Acts 15:8, 9). By the indirect witness, he meant reasoning from effect to cause or from the fruit of the abiding Spirit to the fact of His cleansing work in the heart. By full assurance for the believer, he meant a spiritual certainty received after the Spirit's baptism which excludes all spiritual doubt from the heart in its relationship to God. Doubt results in spiritual indecision and leans toward unholiness (James 1:8; 4:8).⁶² Incertitude is a spiritual paralysis of the soul's high faculties which hinders the believer's experience of perfect love (I John 4:12-21). Thus, according to Steele, the witness of the Spirit is a necessary part of the

⁶⁰Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, p. 112; cf., Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 167-193; cf., Delbert R. Rose, "The Wesleyan Message," The Asbury Seminarian, 22:3-11, October, 1968.

⁶¹Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 127-133; cf., Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 207-249.

⁶²Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 307-323; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 117-128; cf., John Wesley, "The Witness of the Spirit," The Works of John Wesley, V, pp. 111-134.

Christian's heritage after the baptism with the Spirit.⁶³ These evidences include an easy victory over sin because temptation greatly loses its power, a oneness with Christ where the inward schism between the Spirit and carnal forces ceases, and no apprehension of future ill or a perfect contentment with providential circumstances. Other evidences of perfect love are: insatiable longing to communicate Christ's love to unbelievers and imperfect believers, enlarged liberality, renewed insights and daily hunger for the Holy Scriptures, the motivation of Christian service changes from duty to delight, increased humility, abiding faith which permanently excludes doubt, and a new joy and spiritual power. Lastly, these evidences entail a vivid remembrance of the successive steps into the sanctified blessing. These successive steps are: awareness of it, spiritual hunger for it, seeking it by faith, and personally claiming it.⁶⁴

Speaking from his personal experience after the Spirit's baptism, Steele recorded some resultants which he called "constants." The Spirit's cleansing imparted to his life: salvation from doubt, the death of carnal and personal ambition or the desire for self-promotion and self-aggrandizement, a perfect rest from apprehension of future ill, a holy submission to and oneness with Christ, a steady faith as a living principle, and love and peace continually overflowing.⁶⁵

Steele taught that the believer both before and after the

⁶³Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 200-222; Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, pp. 128-130.

⁶⁴Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 250-267.

⁶⁵Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, pp. 213-223.

Spirit's baptism must continue in a spiritual process of growth in grace (II Peter 3:18).⁶⁶ Growth in grace before the cleansing-baptism discloses the revelation of the indwelling disposition of sin. This spiritual growth may be accompanied by increasing power to abstain from actual sin, but is not able to annihilate the spirit of sin. This depraved inclination of the justified believer is not outgrown by spiritual development, but rather, cleansed by the power of the Spirit through a specific act of faith. Spiritual development is a necessary preparation for the destruction of inborn sin by revealing the need for the Spirit's cleansing. However, there is no limit in time required for the work of entire sanctification. The moment of entire sanctification is accomplished when the believer's faith grasps hold of the desired blessing and privilege.⁶⁷

Steele classified this growth in grace process after the Spirit's cleansing as "progressive sanctification" or "gradual sanctification." This involves the progressive work of realizing or carrying into practice the instantaneous cleansing from all filthiness within the believer's life (II Corinthians 7:1; Hebrews 5:14). It is the state of perfecting holiness through prayerful cultivating of the intellect and receiving more spiritual light to see yesterday's mistakes and avoid them. Gradual sanctification applies to the power of moral discernment and is the reason for Christians to pray daily, "Forgive us our debts" (Matthew 6:12).⁶⁸

⁶⁶Steele, *Love Enthroned*, pp. 330-337.

⁶⁷*Ibid.*

⁶⁸Steele, *Mile-Stone Papers*, pp. 107-111.

Speaking of growth in the positive element of holiness, Steele explained:

After entire sanctification the normal order is a growth in knowledge and judgment, and a more and more perfect manifestation of the inner purity in the outer life; a progressive development in practical holiness, while the inner principle grows stronger and stronger.⁶⁹

In Steele's thinking, the Spirit's mission involves presiding over the church of Christ as a visible institution. Steele maintained a distinction between the spiritual body of which Jesus Christ is the Head and the visible organization of the church. The former, he called the "invisible church." His remarks in reference to the church were limited primarily to the latter reference of the "visible organization" of the church. Christ's desire is that His visible church should be holy. For the attainment of this goal, the Spirit as the indwelling Comforter resides in holy hearts and through them presides over the visible organization of the church. Under the Spirit's leadership saintly members are to exercise control of the visible organization for the promotion of holiness within its membership. The presidency of the Holy Spirit in a church is accomplished through its most spiritual members. Three things are necessary to maintain the Spirit's control over visible churches: the Gift of the Holy Spirit in a Pentecostal baptism, training in Christian beneficence or systematic giving, worldly men and nominal Christians exercising control of the church must be displaced by those filled with the Holy Spirit. Those churches governed by the Spirit have always existed and are witnessing, growing, evangelistic,

⁶⁹ Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, p. 56; cf., pp. 27-28; cf., Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 392-416.

and full of the missionary spirit.⁷⁰ When the Spirit presides over the visible church, He is the "Conservator of orthodoxy." He preserves and vitalizes the gospel truths within the life of the believer and through the believer He energizes, propagates, and preserves Bible holiness in the church.⁷¹

The Spirit delights in a free form of worship and works in a variety of manifestations in different believers. The Spirit in presiding over the visible church exercises an influence upon the singing in divine worship. The singing which pleases God and melts and moves men is inspired by the Holy Spirit, and is the spontaneous outflow of spiritual joy imparted by the cleansing Spirit. Preaching in divine worship is to be done in the demonstration and power of the Holy Spirit (I Corinthians 1:22-2:16). The Gift of the Spirit imparts to the preacher the power for effective preaching. It provides a Spirit-filled minister for the Spirit to speak through and gives needed insights into the depths of spiritual truths. The Spirit-filled preacher is enabled to perceive truth inspired by the Holy Spirit which is subordinate to Jesus Christ whom He glorifies.⁷²

Furthermore, Steele warned of the danger of dishonoring the Holy Spirit after being sanctified. The Spirit is dishonored when He is treated as a "thing" or an "influence," and not as a Person. He is disregarded when He is looked upon as a created Person or lacking in divinity. He is a divine Person (Matthew 28:19; II Corinthians 13:14),

⁷⁰ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 227-231.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 272-290.

⁷² *Ibid.*, pp. 191-214.

and is shown disrespect when anything is substituted for His office in the inspiration of spiritual life and the development of Christian character. He is dishonored by anything which hinders Him from carrying on His saving and sanctifying mission. Ministers and Christian workers dishonor the Spirit when they more earnestly desire His gifts than Himself. Disrespect is also shown to the Spirit when the Bible and other good holiness books are neglected for secular and fictitious literature. The Spirit of inspiration is grieved and disgraced when men with satanic ingenuity assail the writings of good men and destroy the faith of others. The divine Spirit is further dishonored when professing Christians live unholy lives. When a believer professes to be filled with the Spirit and lives an unworthy life, this dishonors the Spirit. Any disparagement of the Spirit's work is showing disrespect and grieves the Spirit. The masterpiece work of the Spirit is to create and conserve holiness, and anything which dishonors the Spirit prevents Him from accomplishing this spiritual work.⁷³

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS

Nature of the Spirit's Gifts

In establishing an evaluation of Steele's views on spiritual gifts, his distinctions on the Spirit's fullness must be ascertained. If Steele is to be properly interpreted, his belief on the threefold distinction of the phrase "the baptism or fullness of the Spirit" needs

⁷³Ibid., pp. 232-245; cf., Brengle, When the Holy Ghost Is Come, pp. 107-115.

to be developed.⁷⁴

Steele mentioned the "ecstatic fullness of the Spirit."⁷⁵ This he defined as "a temporary emotional fullness of the Spirit, leaving no permanent moral effect." The "slaying power" referred to by the early Methodists, is an example of this emotional fullness.⁷⁶ As a flood of divine power upon the emotions, this ecstatic fullness extends only to the emotions, the outermost, or more accessible currents of the soul's life. The seat of character or the will in its deepest roots is not completely subdued or the inmost life transformed. This superficial change is apparent with the dissatisfaction which follows in a change of externals such as the abatement of the excitement of the jubilant crowd on the removal from the contagious gladness of other Christians. In this solitude, it is discovered whether the Spirit's sin-destroying fire has cleansed the soul or it has been warmed by other people's fires.⁷⁷ This ecstatic fullness temporarily conceals, but does not remove the evils of the heart.⁷⁸ According to Steele, these uneven

⁷⁴ Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, pp. 108-111; cf., Delbert R. Rose, "Distinctions Which Clarify," The Herald, 79:17, 21, April 10, 1968. Dr. Rose developed the biblical implications of Steele's threefold distinction on the fullness of the Spirit applying it to the basic claims of the contemporary charismatic movement; cf., Delbert R. Rose, "Distinguishing the Things that Differ," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 9:5-14, Spring, 1974.

⁷⁵ Ibid., pp. 109-110; cf., Steele, Steele's Answers, p. 135.

⁷⁶ Ibid., p. 109.

⁷⁷ Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 226-227.

⁷⁸ Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, p. 109; cf., Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 175, 398, 407; cf., Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, p. 312.

ecstatic experiences possessed by a class of Pentecostal professors were a stumbling block to many Christians and a great hindrance to the experimental reception by the mass of believers of the precious Promise and Gift of the Holy Spirit.⁷⁹

By the "charismatic fullness" of the Spirit, Steele meant being "filled with some extraordinary gift or charism of the Spirit."⁸⁰ This charismatic fullness is entirely distinct from the promised Gift of the Comforter.⁸¹ Whether a person is a real Christian or not, he can be filled with some extraordinary gift or charism of the Spirit, however, the promised Gift of the Spirit is received only by Christian disciples (John 14:15-17). Christ, in the Sermon on the Mount discourse, taught a charismatic fullness when He spoke of those who can prophesy, cast out demons, and work miracles, but never inherit eternal life (Matthew 7:21-23). The Apostle Paul implied the possession of a high degree of miracle-working faith without the existence of perfect love (I Corinthians 13:1-3). Service can be rendered in the Kingdom of God without being born into the kingdom (i.e. Balaam--Numbers 22-24; 31:16; Saul--I Samuel 10:10; 18:10; 19:9, 18-24; Matthew 7:21-23). To the present day, there are occasional instances of men of high evangelistic power being a blessing to others and yet living in sin. Steele believed this is possible when possessing only the charismatic fullness of the Spirit. Steele's view of spiritual gifts fits into this category of the

⁷⁹ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 123-248.

⁸⁰ Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, p. 109.

⁸¹ Steele, Love Enthroned, p. 155; cf., Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 250-251; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 233.

charismatic fullness of the Spirit.⁸² As Steele explained: "The Spirit sometimes moves on the surface of the soul without making any great moral change; in some cases, as King Saul and Balaam prophesying, there is no change at all."⁸³

Steele's third distinction of the Spirit's fullness was an "ethical fullness." This is entire sanctification or the permanent gracious presence in the soul of the Holy Spirit in His sanctifying fullness. He understood the Gift of the Spirit as falling in this category of the ethical fullness of the Spirit.⁸⁴

As Steele explained, this fullness of the Spirit is to be seen

. . . not as an extraordinary gift, but as a person having the right of way through soul and body, having the keys to even the inmost rooms, illuminating every closet and pervading every crevice of the nature, filling the entire being with holy love. This we may call the ethical fullness, or fullness of righteousness, to distinguish it from the ecstatic and the charismatic fullness. "Blessed are they which do hunger and thirst after righteousness: for they shall be filled" Yet it is quite certain that the baptism or fullness of the Spirit--as a grace, not as a gift--never occurs till after the new birth by the Spirit. It is certain that it indicates a marked transition or uplift in the spiritual life which some call endowment for service, and others entire sanctification.⁸⁵

Speaking of this ethical fullness, Steele advocated that it manifests itself in certain life-characteristics after the Spirit's cleansing. A deep and intense devotion to Christ is seen, and within the believer's life a constant obedience and complete victory over sin

⁸² Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, pp. 109-110.

⁸³ Steele, Steele's Answers, p. 87.

⁸⁴ Steele, A Defense of Christian Perfection, p. 110.

⁸⁵ Ibid., pp. 110-111.

is experienced. Walking in the light of God's countenance is evident, and simple trust and uninterrupted and cloudless communion with the Father and the Son possesses the soul. Whether friends or foes, a deep humility of a self-effacing love reaches out to all in good deeds and prayers. The soul filled with the ethical fullness of the Spirit does not need to recur to dates, to sudden and memorable transitions, and spiritual uplifts. Rather, like Lydia, the Spirit accomplishes His regenerating and sanctifying work without outside observation (Acts 16: 14-15, 40).⁸⁶

Speaking of the nature of the ethical fullness of the Spirit, Steele taught that

. . . next to the mystery of the three Persons in the one divine nature is the habitation of the human spirit by the Holy Spirit interpenetrating its substance with his vitalizing presence, pervading all the faculties of the human mind, becoming the life of its life, the soul within a soul, in a sense to which no other union makes any approximation. "He that is joined to the Lord is one Spirit" (I Cor. vi. 17). This mystical union is symbolized by the human body united with the head, the branches and the vine, the union of husband and wife, the dependence of the temple on its corner-stone. Paul has a union with Christ by the Holy Spirit so intimate that he speaks of his own heart throbbing in the bosom of Jesus Christ. . . . (Phil. i.8)⁸⁷

Steele mentioned the "ascension gifts" as being foretold within the Psalms (Psalm 68:18; 45:7). By the ascension gifts, he meant the gifts imparted by the Messiah for all men. To the world, the gift is the "spirit of conviction," but for believers, the Gift is the "Spirit of adoption and sanctification, the Spirit of love made perfect, and the fountain of joy" springing up into eternal life (John 7:37-39). These

⁸⁶ Steele, Jesus Exultant, p. 227.

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 227-228.

gifts are a fulfillment of Old Testament prophecy in relation to the Messiah whose joyful and abundant effusion awaited the glorification of the ascended Christ (John 7:39; cf., Ephesians 4:7-16).⁸⁸

Steele also spoke of the Spirit's work in relation to the "unconditional gifts" and "conditional gifts" which flow from the unsearchable riches of Christ. By the unconditional gifts, Steele meant those atoning benefits received in Christ: the atonement as a conditional substitute for the punishment of sin, the gracious ability to repent of sin, and the convicting agency of the Holy Spirit. When he spoke of the conditional gifts, he referred to the forgiveness of sins, the new birth, pardon as the beginning of the reconstruction of the soul in loyalty and holiness of "initial purification," and the religious certainty of divine acceptance imparted by the Spirit of adoption. As previously observed, entire sanctification is one of Christ's conditional gifts. The only way in which the conditional benefits of Christ are to be appropriated is by the way of faith.⁸⁹

In relation to the Spirit's gifts, Steele's discussion centered more on the ethical fullness of the Spirit than the extraordinary gifts of the charismatic fullness of the Spirit. These extraordinary gifts of the Spirit, Steele believed, must be viewed as entirely different from the ethical fullness of the Spirit.⁹⁰

Using the "grace of faith" and the "gift of faith" as

⁸⁸ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 132.

⁸⁹ Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 261-277.

⁹⁰ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 258. Cf., Steele, Love Enthroned, pp. 318, 320.

contrasting examples, Steele developed his understanding of the nature of spiritual gifts. The grace of faith is morally obligatory upon every soul having a knowledge of Christ, and the absence of this grace of faith forms the ground of God's condemnation (II Thessalonians 2:12). The gift of faith is not required of anyone, but is sovereignly bestowed by the Holy Spirit severally as He will (I Corinthians 12:11, 18) and does not have God's condemnation or culpability for its absence. The grace of faith is grounded on the Bible, but the gift of faith does not rest so much on God's written Word as upon the revelation of the Holy Spirit made immediately to the human spirit. This faith-revelation may relate to a future event or be an inwrought conclusion that in answer to prayer someone will be healed. The grace of faith is conditional--"if it be thy will," but the gift of faith is the assurance beforehand that it is God's will. The grace of faith is spiritually indispensable and a permanent habit while the charism of faith is occasional and not permanent (II Timothy 4:20). The charism is not a requisite to the highest spiritual life any more than speaking with tongues or miracles are necessary. The grace of faith is saving, but the charism is not saving (Matthew 7:22; I Corinthians 13:2). The grace of the Spirit purifies the heart by love while the Spirit's gifts may exist without effecting any moral transfiguration of character (I Corinthians 13:2; Matthew 7:22, 23; Numbers 24:4-13; I Samuel 10:10-12; cf., Matthew 10:1-4; 26:24; John 17:12).⁹¹

⁹¹Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 245-249; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 258-266.

However, Daniel Steele specifically mentioned some of the spiritual gifts. He believed the gift of prophecy is preaching (I Corinthians 12:31; 14:39) and is one of the "best gifts."⁹² The gift of wisdom is needed after the work of entire sanctification to impart guidance for imperfect judgments in those areas where it is not the province of entire sanctification to render infallible. This gift of wisdom is the right use of knowledge or electing the best ends and applying the best means for the attainment of the unsearchable riches of Christ.⁹³ The gift of tongues is one of the extraordinary gifts of the Spirit (I Corinthians 12:4-11) but not one of the graces of the Spirit. Consequently, the tongues gift is not one of the marks that the Spirit permanently takes up His abode in the entirely sanctified heart. Steele believed the gift of tongues is no longer needed because Christianity has better proofs of its truth in the spiritual transformation of individuals and nations.⁹⁴ The "outward gifts" of tongues, interpretation, and healing are infinitely inferior to the graces of the Spirit ("internal gifts") and especially the chief Gift of the Spirit Himself.⁹⁵ When the inner life becomes spiritually extinct, the result is an excessive bustling activity in the externals of Christianity.⁹⁶

⁹² Steele, Jesus Exultant, p. 87.

⁹³ Ibid., pp. 272-273; cf., p. 202.

⁹⁴ Steele, Steele's Answers, p. 182; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 90-93; cf., Brengle, When the Holy Ghost is Come, pp. 20-31; cf., Brengle, Resurrection Life and Power, pp. 179-184.

⁹⁵ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 38-39, 196-200.

⁹⁶ Ibid., p. 204; cf., Steele, Steele's Answers, p. 137.

Therefore, any extraordinary emotional experience is not to be mistaken or construed for the deep and perfect work of the Sanctifier.⁹⁷ As Steele advocated, the externals of Pentecost associated with the Spirit's baptism are not a part of the "essential and inward grace" bestowed by the Comforter.⁹⁸

Steele recorded more on the gift of healing or faith healing than some of the other gifts. By this gift, he referred to the healing of the body from sickness by the impartation of the Spirit's extraordinary gift of healing (Acts 28:5, 9; I Corinthians 12:28, 30; James 5:15). This gift is the faith which results in the inward conviction that prayer is answered by God for a certain sick person and that he will be healed. This gift is not to be confined wholly to a word or a touch. It may be exercised through natural remedies.⁹⁹ James' use of oil (James 5:14-16) in the healing of the sick means using medical treatments and through prayer and calling upon the church invoking the divine blessing upon the remedies.¹⁰⁰ Naturally, prayer for healing will not be sufficient unless it is prompted by this extraordinary faith.¹⁰¹ However, the charisma of faith for a blessing or healing

⁹⁷ Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, p. 102.

⁹⁸ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 85; cf., Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 225-227; cf., Charles W. Carter, "A Wesleyan View of the Spirit's Gift of Tongues in the Book of Acts," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 4:39-68, Spring, 1969.

⁹⁹ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 245-249; cf., Steele, Steele's Answers, p. 62.

¹⁰⁰ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 264-265.

¹⁰¹ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, p. 247.

which is contrary to the Divine will is an impossibility. There may be attempted counterfeits to true faith, but true faith will never contradict the divine will.¹⁰²

According to Steele, the gift of healing is a temporary gift bestowed on various occasions as the Spirit wills (I Corinthians 12: 11, 18). The Apostle Paul healed on occasions (Acts 28:5, 9), but in the case of Trophimus, the apostle left him at Miletum sick (II Timothy 4:20). Steele believed Trophimus was not healed because the gift of faith for the healing was not then bestowed by the Holy Spirit. The apostle would have healed if possible because of the pressing need for fellow-laborers in his missionary work. The Spirit in His sovereign will withheld this gift. The apostle was not conscious of the inwrought conviction that it was God's will to heal.¹⁰³

The Apostle Paul exercised the gift of healing on rare occasions, but Steele advocated that he never gave it any prominence in his practice. He never mentioned it in his recorded sermons. His mention in the epistles is done in such a way as to relegate it to the rear of the beautiful procession of Christian graces. By inference from Holy Scripture, Steele believed the Apostle Paul had Luke travel with him as his personal doctor and friend to aid in times of sickness (Galatians 4:13; Colossians 4:14; cf., Acts 16:7-10).¹⁰⁴

Steele believed the atonement did not include the healing of all

¹⁰² Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 264; cf., Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, p. 250.

¹⁰³ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, pp. 248-249.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., pp. 252-254.

physical sicknesses. He thought the inference of the teaching that Christ's atonement includes all our physical sickness is to teach that a sick person, to a certain extent, must be an unbeliever and responsible for his own continued sickness.¹⁰⁵ He classified as "extreme faith-cure advocates" those who teach that Christ's atonement includes the healing of all physical sicknesses. He advocated that the teaching of Isaiah 53:4 is a cataloguing of the Messiah's humiliations, sufferings, and insults and not a reference to His healing miracles. Rather than "carried our sicknesses," he taught that a better translation of this verse would be "carried our sorrows."¹⁰⁶ He explained that the emphasis of Isaiah 53:4 should not rest upon the miraculous healings Christ performed, but upon the sufferings, the nervous strain, and the draft upon His sympathies as part of the evidence of His Messianic character and Sonship to God. He is the One who bears the burdens lifted from the shoulders of others. This verse expressed in a "poetical" and figurative way how Christ healed under circumstances which awakened a painful sympathy within His personhood.¹⁰⁷

Furthermore, Steele proclaimed some grave perils result in teaching the doctrine that the atonement conditionally covers all sicknesses. This view is perilous because it reads more into the divine promises than the Spirit of inspiration intended. It leads to spiritual confusion which can destroy some people's faith in their dying hour.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 243.

¹⁰⁶ Steele, *The Gospel of the Comforter*, pp. 261-262.

¹⁰⁷ Steele, *Half-Hours with St. Paul*, pp. 244-245.

Steele thought the only safe practice to prevent these dangers is to teach the sick to pray with an if it be Thy will restore my health because God sometimes answers yes and at other times no to the prayer for divine healing.¹⁰⁸

In his discussion of miracles, Steele believed the priority rests on the "spiritual miracles" rather than the "physical miracles." The physical miracles or those miracles in the realm of matter are temporal in their effects. The spiritual miracles in the transformation of human souls are enduring unto eternal life. Spiritual miracles are far more valuable than the physical. Steele thought Christ showed this in not placing the primary emphasis on physical wonders as His credentials for His ministry and work. Furthermore, the spiritual miracle of transforming a soul from sin to holiness requires a higher power than the accomplishments of physical miracles in the realm of matter.¹⁰⁹

As already observed, Steele believed the Holy Spirit presides over Christ's church through spiritual believers. Following the Apostle Paul (I Corinthians 12-14; Ephesians 4), he posited that the Spirit originates and keeps the essential unity of the church through spiritual believers. This unity is not ecclesiastical, sacramental, ceremonial, and theological (except on the "basal truths of orthodoxy"); rather, it is a "spiritual unity." When the church knows experientially the indwelling Spirit, dissensions cease and unity is insured (Ephesians 2:

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 253-254; cf., O.K. Armstrong, "Beware the Commercialized Faith Healers," Reader's Digest, 98:179-186, June, 1971.

¹⁰⁹ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 90-93.

13-22; 3:16-21). This is a vital church unity like a tree which possesses a mysterious inward force which we call life (John 15:1-8). A man-made unity of the church is what he called a "mechanical" unity and not worth praying for. There are to be no substitutes for the Spirit's work in producing this spiritual and vital church unity. As Steele categorically stated: "Where the Spirit is, there is the church." The Spirit dwells only in the hearts of men and women and works through them in carrying on the purpose and will of Christ, the Head of the church. The central bond of the Spirit's unity of Christ's church is in a Christ-like love for the brethren (John 13:34, 35; Ephesians 3:16-19; 5:2; I Corinthians 13; I John 2:8-11; 3:11-18; 4:20-21). This kind of Christian love (I Corinthians 13) within the church is only possible when believers allow the Spirit's baptism to submerge the self and restore Christian unity.¹¹⁰

Along with the context of the Spirit's sovereign work within Christ's church, Steele emphasized the sovereignty of the Spirit in the endowment of His gifts. The Spirit is sovereign not only in originating and keeping the church's unity and presiding over its affairs through spiritual believers, but He is also sovereign in the bestowment of gifts (I Corinthians 12:11, 18).¹¹¹ Consequently, Steele's views on spiritual gifts are within the context of his beliefs on the Spirit's presiding presence and unity within and through Christ's church and His sovereignty in bestowment of spiritual gifts.

¹¹⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 151-158.

¹¹¹ Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, p. 245; cf., The Gospel of the Comforter, p. 260.

Permanence or Cessation of
the Gifts

Daniel Steele taught a cessation of most of the spiritual gifts. As the centuries pass, there is no tapering of the graces of the Spirit. However, there is a designed withdrawal of the extraordinary and miraculous gifts of the Spirit. Steele believed that he did not live in the age of supernatural miracles.¹¹² The only possible exception to this is the gift of healing. Following Bengel's suggestion, he thought this gift continues to the present time as a specimen of the other gifts. As the Israelites retained a portion of manna in the ark as a proof of the ancient miracle so the gift of healing is the proof of these other miracle gifts. In New Testament times, the extraordinary gifts signaled the beginning of the Spirit's distinctive work as the Paraclete.¹¹³ Today these gifts are not needed because Christianity has better proofs in the transformation of individuals and nations than external signs.¹¹⁴

Distribution of the Gifts

According to Steele, none of the Spirit's gifts are to be the object of a believer's seeking. The believer should "desire Jesus only" and not be preoccupied with which of the gifts he desires to possess. When a believer seeks for a "delicious ecstasy," he is not seeking to glorify Christ to the utmost of his ability. One of the spiritual

¹¹² Steele, Jesus Exultant, pp. 59, 85.

¹¹³ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 258-259.

¹¹⁴ Steele, Steele's Answers, p. 182.

requirements for being a perfect believer is an absolute resignation of self and selfish desires in order to glorify Christ.¹¹⁵

In speaking of some believers Steele warned:

They are satisfied with the glitter of appearances. Simon Magus fixed his eye upon the worldly glory which the extraordinary gifts of the Holy Ghost would confer, and was baptized, and found that he was still the same pagan sorcerer. Christians who seek for ecstatic joys or showy gifts of the Spirit, or any thing else rather than the pure love of God, make the same mistake.¹¹⁶

Speaking in reference to the Corinthian believers' abuse of spiritual gifts, Steele again warned:

To prefer gifts to that fulness of love which St. Paul eulogizes is to recede from the highest spirituality, if not to fall from grace. These gifts were attended by various extravagances, excesses, and fanaticism, which gave St. Paul much solicitude.¹¹⁷

Because of these abuses and fanaticism resulting in seeking spiritual gifts and not the Giver of gifts, Steele concluded:

Hence I have never offered a prayer for the restoration of charisms, or extraordinary gifts. Following the apostle to the Gentiles as a guide, I have found the more excellent way, the way of love, and I am supremely blest.¹¹⁸

In relation to when the gifts may be bestowed, Steele advocated that before conversion the Spirit in His sovereign knowledge does bestow extraordinary gifts upon unbelievers. Jesus indicated this in His Sermon on the Mount (Matthew 7:22, 23). When Christ sent the disciples

¹¹⁵Steele, Mile-Stone Papers, p. 118; cf., Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 196-197.

¹¹⁶Steele, Love Enthroned, p. 407; cf., pp. 175-179, 298, 310, 312.

¹¹⁷Steele, Half-Hours with St. Paul, p. 251.

¹¹⁸Ibid.

out on the special missions, Judas also wrought cures and wonders (Matthew 10:1-4). Balaam and King Saul are other examples within the Old Testament of those receiving the extraordinary gifts but who showed signs of being unbelievers (Numbers 22-24; 31:16; I Samuel 10:10; 18:10; 19:9, 18-24).¹¹⁹ Steele explained that there are unconverted hearts who resist the Spirit's "saving power" and yet "welcome His working power."¹²⁰

Even though Steele strongly emphasized the bestowment of some extraordinary gifts before conversion, He also implied they were bestowed on occasions after conversion and the baptism with the Spirit. The Spirit in the Old Testament experiences was a strong outward influence, but not a conscious indwelling within individuals. The Spirit's gifts before Pentecost were largely external rather than internal and more gifts than grace. The skill of Bezaleel, the foreknowledge of the prophets, Samson's strength, the Judges administrative ability, and the kingly instinct of Saul are examples of these Old Testament external gifts. After Pentecost, the charismata or "outward gifts" have been arbitrarily bestowed or distributed by the Spirit severally to whomsoever He will (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). However, the permanently abiding and chief Gift is the Spirit Himself and not His extraordinary gifts (Acts 15:8, 9).¹²¹ Perhaps Steele's concern along this line is best summed up when he said: "Everybody wants power, few want God" (Acts 8:18-24).¹²²

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 249.

¹²⁰ Steele, The Gospel of the Comforter, pp. 260-261.

¹²¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 38-39.

¹²² *Ibid.*, p. 196.

Chapter 4

WILSON THOMAS HOGUE

Wilson Thomas Hogue (1852-1920), as one of the early American schoolmen, influenced the cause of Wesleyan-Arminianism in this country. As a member of the Free Methodist Church, he served as editor of his denominational magazine called The Free Methodist.¹ As an educator, he served his church as president of Greenville College,² a denominational school. As an administrator, he gave leadership to his church as one of its bishops from 1903 to 1919.³

In two of his books he spelled his name Wilson T. Hogg.⁴ Some of the books he authored or edited are: A Handbook of Homiletics and Pastoral Theology (1887); Revival and Revival Work (1890); A Symposium on Scriptural Holiness (1896); Hymns That are Immortal (n.d.); G. Harry

¹Wilson T. Hogue, History of the Free Methodist Church of North America, II (Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1915), p. 199.

²Ibid., p. 334.

³Leslie R. Marston, From Age to Age a Living Witness a Historical Interpretation of Free Methodism's First Century (Winona Lake: Light and Life Press, 1960), p. 426.

⁴A telephone conversation was held at the Free Methodist parsonage in Franklinville, New York on December 2, 1973 with Miss Mae P. Armstrong, a retired Free Methodist missionary and a hometown contemporary of Bishop Hogue. She had seen and heard W.T. Hogue speak, but never personally met him. Miss Armstrong reported that the bishop had his name changed from "Hogg" to "Hogue" because of the frequent association with the farm animal--the pig. As an educator, he held a Doctor of Philosophy degree. He is buried in Mount Prospect Cemetery, Franklinville, New York, his hometown.

Agnew, A Pioneer Missionary (1904); The Class Meeting as a Means of Grace (1910); History of the Free Methodist Church of North America (1915); The Believer's Personal Experience of Christ in the Processes of Salvation (1915); The Holy Spirit A Study (1916). His latter book on the Holy Spirit represents his mature thoughts.⁵ This subject of the Holy Spirit and His ministry was the preoccupation of much of Hogue's life and writings. Richard Taylor rightly describes him as one of the "greatest pulpit orators" and a "persuasive and eloquent" exponent of heart holiness within the American Methodist tradition.⁶

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT

Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts

Wilson Hogue, along with the other men of this research, posited a necessary distinction between the Holy Spirit's work as Gift and Giver of gifts. He believed the baptism with the Spirit is to be as distinctly apprehended in personal experience now as it was on the day of Pentecost. But, the Spirit's baptism does not come now as He did at the beginning on the day of Pentecost in those external phenomena or the material emblems of the Spirit's nature and work. The sound as of a rushing mighty wind or cloven tongues like as of fire were not the essential thing of the Spirit's baptism. The essence or essential thing of the Spirit's work at Pentecost and now is the personal enthronement of the

⁵ Wilson T. Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study (Chicago: William B. Rose, 1916), p. ix.

⁶ Richard S. Taylor, Preaching Holiness Today (Kansas City: Beacon Hill Press, 1970), p. 28.

Paraclete within those believers who with faith and earnest prayer wait upon His cleansing (Acts 2:39; 15:8, 9).⁷

Before His ascension when our Lord informed His disciples to tarry in Jerusalem and wait for the "Promise of the Father" or the baptism with the Holy Spirit, He taught they were to receive power after the Holy Spirit had come upon them (Luke 24:44-53; Acts 1:4-9). Hogue believed this promised power is not a reference to the extraordinary gifts of the Spirit. These gifts of the Spirit, such as miracle-working, prophecy, speaking with tongues, were bestowed upon the disciples previous to our Lord's crucifixion. Before the crucifixion the disciples were exercising these spiritual gifts in raising the dead, healing the sick, cleansing the lepers and casting out devils in Christ's name (Matthew 7:15-29; 10:1-15; cf., Mark 3:14-19; 6:7-13; Luke 9:1-10; 10:1-20). While the disciples possessed extraordinary gifts before Christ's crucifixion, before His ascension our Lord promised they were to receive the Giver Himself which is vastly better or a superior endowment of power. This promised Comforter is the Gift of the Holy Spirit as the indwelling and sanctifying Comforter. This Gift of the Spirit is a source of greater spiritual power than all the extraordinary or miraculous gifts of the Spirit.⁸ The striking and supernatural phenomena which accompanied the Spirit at Pentecost served

⁷ Wilson T. Hogue, The Believer's Personal Experience of Christ in the Processes of Salvation (Chicago: William B. Rose, 1915, pp. 46-47; cf., Myron F. Boyd, "The National Holiness Association 101 Years, Sane, Spiritual, Biblical," The Herald, 80:9-17, July 30, 1969; cf., Herbert T. Sebree, "Glossolalia," The Word and the Doctrine, comp. Kenneth Geiger (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1965), pp. 335-351.

⁸ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 127-130.

their purpose and disappeared. These supernatural phenomena only served to point to the Master's promise regarding the Gift of the Spirit-- "they were all filled with the Holy Ghost" (Acts 2:4; 15:8, 9). This cleansing and filling of the Spirit is the abiding Gift of the Holy Spirit.⁹

Hogue expressed this distinction between Gift and gifts when he said:

It should be noted by all, however, that there is a wide difference between the "gift of the Holy Spirit" and the "gifts of the Spirit." The former is the communication of the Holy Spirit Himself to the believer as the indwelling Comforter and Sanctifier; while the latter are special enduements of faith, wisdom, knowledge, power, discernment, healing, miracle-working, etc.; or, in other cases, special adaptations to varied ministries and functions for the edification of the body of Christ. The former is the blood-bought heritage and birthright of every believer; the latter are for the Church as a whole, but are distributed among its members by the Holy Spirit, who distributes them "to every man severally as He will" (I Corinthians 12:11).¹⁰

The Holy Spirit's Work Before,
At, and After Conversion

Hogue traced the Spirit's work before conversion from the dawn of creation. He believed the Spirit in Holy Scripture is closely associated with the works of God the Father and God the Son.¹¹ The God-head consists of three distinct and proper personalities in union by the same thoughts, volitions, actions, titles, attributes, and authority. The work of creation within Scripture is ascribed to each member of the

⁹ Ibid., pp. 97-98.

¹⁰ Ibid., p. 289; cf., pp. 85-98; 100-106; 322-324.

¹¹ Ibid., pp. 26-39.

Trinity. God the Father is described as creating the "heaven and earth" (Genesis 1:1). The work of creation is also described in relation to God the Son (John 1:1-3, 14). In the Bible, all things are classified as being made by Christ (Colossians 1:15-17), while other Scriptures describe the Spirit of God as the active Agent in the work of creation (Genesis 1:2; Psalm 33:6; Job 26:13; 33:4).¹²

Likewise, the Spirit is portrayed by the bishop as working in other ways with the Father and Son. The Spirit is active with the Father and Son in the works of providence (Psalm 104:27-30), and is ascribed as taking an active role with the Father and Son in the inspiration of the Scriptures (Hebrews 1:1, 2; I Peter 1:11; II Peter 1:21). In a similar way, the Holy Spirit also is associated with the Father and Son in the work of human redemption. Redemption was entrusted, accomplished, or wrought out by the voluntary humiliation and sacrifice of the Son (John 3:13-21, 31-56; 8:23-59; 10:10-42; I John 4:14; Ephesians 1:7; 5:25-27; I Timothy 2:6). The effectual application of redemptive grace to the children of men requires that Christ's earthly ministry be supplemented by the manifestation and ministry of the Holy Spirit (John 14:16-18, 26; 15:26-27; 16:7-15).¹³

Therefore, according to Hogue, the Spirit is the active Agent in the plan of human redemption by performing the divine work of spiritual conviction in the unregenerate world (John 16:8-11). The Spirit of God begins His convictive work in the human heart by producing a lively

¹²Ibid., pp. 18-19, 22-23.

¹³Ibid., pp. 18-22; cf., pp. 164-168, 237-242.

sense of what sin is as God sees it, and disclosing the true nature of sin as it relates to relationships between God and man. This divine conviction vividly demonstrates the horrible nature of sin which results in the unregenerate being filled with shame and the keenest compunction like fallen Adam when he realized that he stood in the presence of a holy God (Genesis 3:8-19). The convicting Spirit exposes sin in all the labyrinths of the heart. The Spirit unmask sin, not only just the overt acts of transgressions and its hideous expressions causing destruction among men, but also as it lies concealed and smouldering in man's bosom inflaming his passions, imaginations, affections, and desires, and corrupting the fountain of his thoughts and actions.¹⁴

In the convictive ministry of the Spirit before conversion, Hogue believed the Spirit works to convince the unregenerate world of its unbelief. He works as Comforter in enabling unregenerate men to make delicate moral distinctions. His enlightenment brings moral distinctions which society or civil laws fail to acknowledge. Society condemns as crime the outward expressions of sin; however, the Spirit convicts on a deeper level. A person may be respected and virtuous among his fellowmen, but when the Spirit convicts according to the perfect law of His judgment, this person may be a murderer or adulterer, or both, in the sight of God (I John 3:15). He reveals and condemns things which may never have found outward expression.¹⁵

The bishop explained that the Spirit begins His convincing work

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 143-144.

¹⁵ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 144-145.

at the fountainhead of evil. This fountain of all evil is the sin of unbelief (Genesis 3:3-5). The Spirit in conviction goes to the root of evil and exposes the criminality of unbelief (II Corinthians 4:4; II Thessalonians 2:11, 12) and the sin of rejecting Christ (John 3:16-21; 16:8, 9). This sin of rejecting Christ is a disbelief in the manifestation of God to fallen men in the person of Jesus Christ as the only Mediator between God and sinful men (Matthew 11:27; John 1:1-14; I Timothy 2:5; 3:16). God provides in the life, death, and resurrection of Jesus Christ the only provision for human redemption (Acts 4:12). In the person and work of Christ, the Godhead is manifested in such a way that redemption is within the reach of all men. Therefore, the entire unregenerate world is called by the Comforter to receive repentance and forgiveness of sins through Christ (Romans 5:8; I John 4:10). The soul-damning sin of the world is not believing in Christ and rejecting this convictive ministry of the Spirit (John 3:16-21, 36). The eternal salvation of all men hinges alone upon faith in Jesus Christ as Saviour and Lord (Romans 6:23; John 5:24; 8:23-36; 10:7-18; 12:46; 14:6). The sinful world is without a cloak or excuse for its sins (John 15:22).¹⁶

Hogue advocated that the Spirit's convincing ministry before regeneration is characterized by a denuding and disclosing process. Only the Spirit is adequate to produce this conviction in the hearts of men. The Spirit accomplishes this convicting work by convincing every man of his own utter sinfulness. The Spirit does not just convict the world in a general sense, but exposes the deep-rooted personal

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 145-153.

sinfulness according to a principle of individuality (John 1:9; 6:63; Hebrews 4:12). In convincing the world of sin, the Spirit discloses to sinful men the necessity of an atonement by revealing the need of an atoning Saviour to bridge the gap between sinful men and a holy God (Micah 6:6, 7; Job 9:33; Romans 3:10, 23). Correlated simultaneously with the conviction of sin, the Spirit also accomplishes the conviction of righteousness. When Jesus Christ was raised from the dead and ascended into heaven, a divine sanction was affixed to His character and doctrine making Him the divinely appointed standard of righteousness (John 16:8-10; Philippians 2:5; Jeremiah 23:6). Because of moral degeneracy, the human personality is incapable of having a true conception of righteousness (Psalm 14:2, 3; I Corinthians 2:14); therefore, the Spirit's work is to convince men of the sin of not believing in Christ and that righteousness is received through the instrumentality of faith in Christ (Ephesians 2:8-18; Acts 4:12; I Timothy 2:3-6). The Spirit's work involves convincing the world of the righteousness of Christ who came to redeem men and that Christ's righteousness enabled Him to offer unto God an acceptable sacrifice for the sins of the whole world. The Spirit persuades that only Christ's present priestly ministry can procure the remission of sins and the Gift of the Holy Spirit to renew and sanctify all who are willing to exercise appropriating faith (John 14:6; 14:6; I Peter 1:8-10; II Peter 1:4; I Thessalonians 5:23).¹⁷

According to Hogue, this conviction of righteousness must

¹⁷ Ibid., pp. 154-178.

precede the experience of righteousness.¹⁸ As he expressed it:

Before "the righteousness of God" can be wrought in us, however, there must be produced in us such a lively conviction thereof as shall give us the deepest sense of our own utter sinfulness, and the keenest realization that Christ is "the righteousness of God" for us--the only righteousness in which we can ever stand accepted before God. "For Christ is the end of the law for righteousness to every one that believeth." The Holy Spirit alone can produce this conviction, and because Christ has gone to the Father and the world seeth Him no more, the Comforter has been sent into the world to carry out this work of spiritual conviction in the hearts of men.¹⁹

Hogue believed in a three-fold and coexistent convictive ministry of the Holy Spirit within unregenerate hearts. As already studied, he taught the Spirit works in the "conviction of sin" and the "conviction of righteousness." Moreover, the bishop advocated the Spirit's convincing ministry includes a third phase in "the conviction of judgment." The Spirit works to fully convince all men that this sinful world rests under the judgment and condemnation of a holy God. This conviction of judgment makes the conviction of sin and righteousness more clear and complete. The conviction of sin and righteousness prepares the unregenerate heart for the conviction of judgment which is necessary to make men feel their own personal guilt to the degree they will be moved to repentance toward God (II Corinthians 1:9-10). The Spirit's job is to enlighten sinful hearts to God's judgment upon Satan and this sinful world (John 12:23-28; 14:30; 16:11; I John 3:8; Romans 8:3-4; I Timothy 2:3-6).²⁰

The Spirit accomplishes this ministry of convincing sinful men

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 178-181.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 178.

²⁰ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 182-191.

by relating God's judgment to the death and resurrection of Christ. The satanic powers of the world were defeated in the death and resurrection of Christ. When Christ arose from the dead, Satan was cast down from his seat of authority over the souls of men. In His resurrection, Christ laid the cornerstone of a new government and demonstrated His everlasting Kingship over the world. His government is based upon those righteous, spiritual principles which are enunciated by His teaching and illustrated by His life. Accordingly, the Spirit convinces sinful men that the judgment of this world involves the condemnation of all those selfish principles and forms of worldly life which are introduced by and characteristic of the reign of Satan. All who are under the dominion of Satan because of deliberate choice will face the same judgment and condemnation with the prince of darkness. The Spirit alone can produce in the souls of men the full conviction of this awful truth (Hebrews 10:27; Matthew 25:31-46).²¹

Hogue believed that in the Spirit's convictive ministry of sin, righteousness, and judgment the Spirit of God acts as Comforter. Even though the Spirit's exposing of personal sinfulness may be painful, the Spirit acts as a Comforter by revealing that deliverance is accessible by Christ's imparted righteousness (Acts 4:12; I Timothy 2:3-6; Philippians 2:5-11; II Peter 1:1-4). In the Person of Jesus Christ, divine righteousness came to earth and manifested itself amid the moral darkness and the universal wickedness of this world so that sinful people may be partakers of His holiness (John 1:14; 17:19; II Peter 1:4;

²¹Ibid., pp. 191-203.

Jeremiah 23:6). The Spirit not only demonstrates that Satan and all who serve him are judged (Hebrews 2:14), but also continues His convictive mission until sinful men are profoundly impressed with the eternal woes of repeated sinning by unbelief. Sinful men, unless convinced of judgment, will not repent. Therefore, this conviction of judgment is the motive to repentance in which the Spirit acts as Comforter by showing sinful men under the divine judgment how they may avail themselves of the divine provision (Christ's redeeming power) for reconciliation to God (Mark 1:15; Acts 3:19; 17:30, 31) and escape His eternal wrath (John 3:16-21, 36; Philippians 2:10-11).²²

Within Hogue's development of the Spirit's work before conversion, he included his understanding of the blasphemy against the Holy Spirit (Matthew 12:31, 32; Mark 3:28-30; Luke 12:10). Blasphemy signifies defamatory or injurious speaking, or an affront offered in oral or written language against God. The words of men's mouths are represented as expressing the disposition of the heart (Matthew 12:35-37). Blasphemy against the Holy Spirit is the "deliberate and final rejection" of the Spirit and His office work in the conviction for sin, righteousness and judgment. This deliberate and final rejection constitutes final impenitence and erects an impassable barrier in the way of the sinner's pardon.²³

However, the bishop thought this blasphemy against the Spirit is not to consist in just an isolated and independent act of transgression. Rather, it is a culminating transgression or a sin against culminating

²²Ibid., pp. 175-178, 199-203.

²³Ibid., pp. 377-381.

spiritual light (Genesis 6:3, 5; Romans 1:21-22). Every resistance of the Spirit's influence and drawing, every refusal to heed revealed spiritual light, every rejection of His testimony and wilful transgression of God's Law constitutes a step toward the final rejection and blasphemy against the Spirit. This unforgiven sin against the Spirit is the result of deliberate transgressions, rashly persisted in against the light, conviction, and gracious influences of the Spirit of God. It represents the final link in a long chain of malignant and rebellious acts against the Spirit. By this determined rebellion, the sinner is borne on in a hardening of soul, until at last he reaches a place where conscience is stifled and ceases to perform (Romans 1:18-32; I Timothy 4:1, 2). This leaves the wilful transgressor in a moral state of insensibility and darkness.²⁴

Hogue taught that this sin against the Spirit is unpardonable. The divine mercy is always extended toward sinful men and the atonement is always sufficient in its power, but the wilful transgressor despising the Holy Spirit in repeated acts of resistance and rejection reaches the state of permanent moral insensibility, which renders him incapable of repentance and faith which are the conditions of pardon and reconciliation.²⁵

Hogue explained this sin against the Spirit is manifested in spiritual indifference and insensibility. Those who commit the sin against the Spirit fully set their wills in rebellion to God. They are

²⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 381-388.

²⁵ Hogue, *The Holy Spirit a Study*, pp. 390-394.

indifferent and always resistant to the Spirit, and in their self-complacency and pride, they trample under foot the Son of God and deliberately and swiftly head for eternal judgment (Hebrews 3:7-19; 10:26-31). As a general rule, the hardened heart is unconscious of its state of moral suicide as a result of wilful and deliberate rejection of the Spirit. Consequently, the invariable manifestation of this sin is the utter absence of trouble, concern, or fear in relation to spiritual things.²⁶

Hogue summarized his view of those committing the sin against the Spirit when he said:

. . . we can readily see, that it is not in those who are distressed with an overwhelming sense of its enormity, and who sorrow on the verge of despair at thinking they may have committed it, that we are to look for the sin against the Holy Ghost. We may expect rather to find it among those busy multitudes who seem to have no thought or care in reference to their eternal destiny; who are so immersed in the secularities of life, or infatuated with the pleasures and vanities of the world, that their ears are constantly deaf to every voice that invites them to reconciliation with God.²⁷

Hogue expressed concern that his understanding of the sin against the Spirit not be the cause of spiritual harm to sensitive souls. He communicated this concern when he said:

These things are not said to alarm those anxious, timorous souls, who, crushed under the sense and weight of their sinfulness, are betimes "the victims of threatening possessions and torturing disquietudes." The fears of such persons should be soothed rather than excited. Those who have every reason to hope, and to comfort themselves with the assurance that they may be freely and fully pardoned, are often ill at ease; while those who should be disquieted and alarmed, comfort themselves

²⁶ Ibid., pp. 388-399.

²⁷ Ibid., p. 388.

to their own danger. Those who are truly concerned and troubled about their sinful condition, thereby give infallible evidence that theirs is not the unpardonable sin.²⁸

Hogue suggested that the Spirit's work at conversion is the communication of spiritual life to souls that are dead in trespasses and sins (II Corinthians 4:3, 4; Ephesians 2:1-9; John 1:13; 3:1-12; I Peter 1:23). Regeneration is the result of the soul's response to the Spirit's conviction and receiving by faith the impartation of regenerating life. Hogue taught that all New Testament Christians are "twice-born men." First, they are born of human parents; secondly, they are born of the Spirit. This second birth of regeneration performs a radical moral change within sinful men.²⁹

Hogue believed that some of the scriptural characteristics of this moral change are: through Christ becoming "a new creature" (II Corinthians 5:17), "passed from death unto life" (John 5:24), "quicken together with Christ" (Ephesians 2:5), "translated out of the kingdom of darkness into the kingdom of God's dear Son" (Colossians 1:13), "made partakers of the Divine nature" (II Peter 1:4), and "put on the new man, which after God is created in righteousness and true holiness (Ephesians 4:24). No person will ever enter the spiritual realm called the kingdom of God, or perform any of the functions of spiritual life, until this radical moral change of conversion is effected.³⁰

Consequently, Hogue advocated the necessity of conversion (John 3:1-10). Conversion is necessary because of the deep and desperate

²⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 395.

²⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 243-248.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 244.

depravity of human nature. Within the moral nature of man, there is a twist from the moment of conception inclining him to go astray as soon as consciousness dawns upon him (Psalm 51:5; Isaiah 53:6; Jeremiah 17:9, 10; Romans 3:10, 23). Man is unable to overcome this depraved condition by unaided effort of his own (Romans 8:7, 8; Ephesians 2:8, 9), because this depraved condition is so deeply ingrained in man's nature that he can not in his own merits please God. The condition of depravity is also compounded because of spiritual blindness (I Corinthians 2:14). Sin always blinds the moral vision and unless the Holy Spirit's quickening and illuminating power is present, the content of Scripture and the significance of spiritual truths are hidden to depraved men's understanding. Furthermore, not only does depravity darken the moral understanding, but it also renders the will perverse and the affections sordid and earthly (Ecclesiastes 8:11; Jeremiah 17:9, 10; Romans 7). Perversity of will and depraved affections set on fleshly things are signs of an unregenerate heart (John 5:40; Matthew 23:37; Romans 8:5). The whole life of the unregenerate is under the dominion and regulation of Satan (Ephesians 2:2, 3). Because of this spiritual condition, the need of the Soul is the converting work of the Holy Spirit to prepare it for eternity (Revelation 21:27; John 14:1-11).³¹

Hogue taught the whole Trinity is involved in redeeming men, but the Agent of conversion is the Holy Spirit. The converting work cannot be accomplished through human endeavors because redemption is of divine origin and initiative (Ephesians 2:8, 9). In this divine action of

³¹Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 248-251.

conversion, the whole Trinity is actively engaged: God the Father is the Source of conversion (John 1:1-18, 29-34; 3:13-21, 36; 4:34; 5:17, 36; 6:32-51; 7:16; 8:28-42, 54; 14:12-14, 28-31; 15:26; 16:23-30; 17: Acts 2:21-36; Hebrews 1:1-6), God the Son is the procuring Cause for regeneration (John 1:12-13; 12:28-33; 18:37- 20:31; Acts 4:12; Ephesians 1:10-12; 2:13, 18; Hebrews 7:25; II Peter 3:9; I John 1:1-2:7, 22-25; 3:1-10; 4:9-20; 5:10-12), and God the Holy Spirit is the efficient Agent in the accomplishment of conversion (Genesis 6:3; John 6:63; 7:38-39; II Corinthians 3:6, 18; Romans 8:2; Titus 3:5).³²

According to Hogue, the unregenerate also have a part to perform in securing their moral renovation. Men are created by God as volitional creatures (Genesis 2:16, 17; Proverbs 1:24-31; Matthew 23:37; John 7:17) and are responsible for their choices and moral destinies. In the work of redeeming men, God always works in harmony with the nature and faculties with which He endows men. Therefore, God does not save any unregenerate without his concurrence and cooperation (Philippians 2:12; Ezekiel 18:31; Genesis 6:3). Sinful men must perform their part in conversion or God is restricted in accomplishing the regeneration experience (Isaiah 59:1-8; Psalm 51; 66:18). Thus, the Spirit as the Author of conversion works within the volitional unregenerate world by awakening, illuminating, convicting, tenderly drawing Godward, leading in repentance, and receiving God's pardoning mercy and regenerating grace by faith.³³

³²Ibid., pp. 251-253; cf., Hogue, The Believer's Personal Experience, pp. 13-24.

³³Ibid., pp. 251-253.

Hogue further qualified the Spirit's converting ministry by what he called "the use of means."³⁴ God the Father as Spirit is the Center, Source, and Substance of all spiritual truth. God as the Heavenly Father can be known only as He chooses to reveal Himself. He has chosen to disclose Himself in nature (Romans 1:20; Psalm 19:1; 119:89; 121:2; 134:3; 148:3; Genesis 1), in His Son (John 1:14, 18; Hebrews 1:1; II Corinthians 5:19; Romans 5:8), in the Holy Spirit (I Corinthians 2:9-11), and through His written Word (I Peter 1:23; James 1:18, 21; John 8:32; Romans 10:17; II Timothy 3:15-17). The Spirit uses all these means in communicating spiritual truths for the saving of souls.³⁵

Hogue also indicated that the Spirit works instrumentally through man's faith.³⁶ Jesus Christ and what He accomplished in His death and resurrection are the objects of saving faith. This saving faith is not believing like Christ or as He believed. Rather, it is a faith in Him which changes the relationship to God and the moral center of our being by focusing upon God through Christ.³⁷ Furthermore, faith involved with the processes of salvation is a living faith. It is faith which leads to action in full compliance with the conditions of salvation as already discussed.³⁸

W.T. Hogue delineated some distinctions in relation to the

³⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 253.

³⁵ Hogue, *The Believer's Personal Experience*, pp. 13-18.

³⁶ Hogue, *The Holy Spirit a Study*, pp. 254-255.

³⁷ Hogue, *The Believer's Personal Experience*, pp. 13-18.

³⁸ Hogue, *The Holy Spirit a Study*, pp. 254-255.

nature of conversion. He mentioned the aspect of "forgiveness" (Ephesians 1:3-7). By forgiveness, Hogue meant the remission of the penalty for sin because of Christ's satisfaction of the demands of the moral law which the sinner breaks. The source of this forgiveness is the grace or unmerited favor of God poured out in the life-blood of Christ as the purchased price for redemption (Galatians 3:13; I Corinthians 6:19, 20). The trespasses of men against the holy and inflexible law of God result in spiritual and eternal death apart from the intervention of Christ as our Kinsman-Redeemer (Romans 6:23; Luke 24:47; Job 9:33). Although forgiveness is closely related, it is not "justification." Justification is God's act of imputing to the penitent sinner the righteousness of Christ which changes this believing sinner's relationship to God and His violated law (Romans 5:1, 2; 8:1). Justification along with pardon and adoption are acts which pass in the divine mind alone and are communicated to the soul by the Spirit (Galatians 4:4-6; Romans 8:17).³⁹

Hogue taught that forgiveness and justification are also accompanied by the Spirit's work of the "new birth" (John 3:1-21; II Corinthians 5:17). The new birth is a radical and spiritual change in the moral center of the sinner making him a new creature in Christ. In his thinking, the new birth is the equivalent term to "regeneration." The conditions of the new birth are repentance and faith (Acts 2:37-39; 16:30-34). Repentance consists in an utter abandonment of the old way of life. Faith as a condition of the new birth is the one final act by

³⁹ Hogue, The Believer's Personal Experience, pp. 25-29.

which the new sphere of life in Christ is begun. Repentance and faith constitute the human part within the Spirit's work of the new birth. Corresponding to the human part, God the Holy Spirit performs the divine act of imparting the new life through Christ (Titus 3:5).⁴⁰

Therefore, Hogue concluded that forgiveness of sins, adoption into God's family, justification, regeneration (new birth), and the witness of the Spirit to the spiritual work He has done are "concomitant experiences." These terms express distinct phases of the Spirit's work in the revelation of Jesus Christ to the human soul in the process of imparting spiritual life and constitute a genuine Christian experience.⁴¹

In reference to adoption and the witness of the Spirit after conversion, Hogue further developed his synopsis of Christian assurance. His basic presupposition was that the Spirit always assures men when their sins are forgiven and their hearts are renewed (Romans 8:16). He understood this witness of the Spirit in a two-fold sense. First, there is the indirect witness of the believer's own spirit that the Spirit's work of imparting new life is done. He believed this is a rational (reflection, comparison, deduction) conclusion from a careful study of the Bible marks which distinguish the true children of God. It is the witness or assurance of a clean human conscience, that the Spirit's regenerating life is imparted. Second, there is a direct witness of the Spirit to the sinner's soul that he is reconciled with God. Hogue termed this the "Spirit's testimony." This testimony is an inward

⁴⁰ Ibid., pp. 30-34.

⁴¹ Ibid., p. 34; cf., Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 243-255.

impression on the soul. No rational process can impart this direct witness of the Spirit. As an act which passes in the divine mind, only God can communicate this knowledge of pardon. This testimony, directly from God to the soul by the Spirit, precedes all other evidences. The fruit of the Spirit (indirect witness of our spirit) cannot be evidenced until the sinner becomes a child of God (direct testimony of the Spirit) because the divine work must be accomplished fact before there can be a witness to it. Accordingly, the indirect witness of the Spirit corroborates the direct testimony of the Spirit.⁴²

Hogue warned that care must be exercised to distinguish the Spirit's testimony from impressions arising from excited imagination or a delusion of Satan. He believed failure at this point leads many into errors and shipwreck of the faith. To prevent making shipwreck of the faith, Hogue outlined what he considered to be some safe guidelines. He taught genuine repentance must always precede the witness of the Spirit. Repentance is having a new mind which always results in a changed life style. To repent is to completely renounce sin and turn to the Lord with a consecrated heart (Isaiah 55:7) which results in an amendment of life. The Spirit's testimony is also always followed by the fruit of the Spirit. The Spirit's fruit is a cluster of spiritual graces which appear in the outward life of all who experience the inward testimony of the Spirit (Galatians 5:22, 23). The Spirit's testimony and the witness of the fruit substantiate each other and prevent satanic delusion. Furthermore, the Spirit's testimony is always attended by certain other

⁴²Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 255-257.

Bible evidences of a regenerate state. These evidences include: victory over the world (I John 5:4), victory over sin (I John 3:9), love of others (I John 3:14; 4:7, 8), and a righteous life (I John 1:5-10; 2:29; 3:7).⁴³

Hogue envisioned the Spirit's work after conversion as convicting the believer of the need of the Spirit's baptism.⁴⁴ According to Hogue, conversion is only "partial sanctification" or "potential sanctification." Sanctification begins at conversion when the newly converted believer receives the impartation of the principle of holiness. This potential sanctification received at conversion, he called "incipient but incomplete sanctification." He felt the Bible recognizes that potential sanctification is received when the Spirit imparts the regenerating power of Christ. Hogue was convinced the Bible recognizes the imperfect state of new converts (I Corinthians 3:1-4). The Spirit's ministry includes awakening the believer to this need of entire sanctification.⁴⁵

In the convictive ministry for entire sanctification, the Spirit convicts the justified of inbred sin by exposing the loathing plague within and the way of deliverance. According to Hogue, this convictive ministry of the Spirit for inbred sin is not a conviction of guilt for wrong doing, duties neglected, or having backslidden from God. Rather, it is a painful consciousness that, even though all past transgressions have been forgiven, there dwells within a principle of sin which clings

⁴³ Ibid., pp. 257-262.

⁴⁴ Ibid., pp. 268-270.

⁴⁵ Ibid., pp. 262-263.

to the thoughts, tempers, and desires continually seeking ascendancy in outward conduct which needs to be cleansed. However, this conviction for heart purity presupposes the present consciousness of walking in all spiritual light and enjoying forgiveness of sins through faith in the atoning merits of Jesus.⁴⁶

The Spirit accomplishes this convictive ministry in two ways. First, the Spirit sheds light upon the soul revealing the inner impurity remaining after the new birth. Second, the Spirit reveals the inward unfitness of the unsanctified to God's moral character by illuminating the Bible's commands, precepts, prayers, promises, and provisions which assure and teach the need and possibility of the Spirit's baptism (John 17:17; II Corinthians 3:18; I John 1:7b).⁴⁷

According to Hogue, after conversion the Spirit also promotes growth in grace. There is growth in grace before entire sanctification. This growth in grace guided by the Spirit is a gradual process toward the place of crisis sanctification. The Spirit leads the believer into a greater self-realization of inbred sin and intense thirsting after God's cleansing. Without this self-realization and spiritual hunger for holiness imparted by the Spirit, the believer would not realize his full privilege in Christ. The Spirit broadens, deepens, and clarifies the understanding of the believer concerning the kingdom of God and the Bible's teachings on self-abandonment (Romans 8:14; 12:1, 2; Philippians 1:6; II Peter 3:18). Once the believer is sanctified, growth in grace

⁴⁶ Ibid., pp. 264-271.

⁴⁷ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 269-271.

under the Spirit's guidance becomes more rapid and healthy.⁴⁸ This growth in grace concept, Hogue termed "progressive sanctification."⁴⁹

However, Hogue did warn that the believer can dishonor the Holy Spirit and His ministry (I Thessalonians 5:19). He thought that the Spirit is dishonored by being regarded as impersonal. This is looking upon the Spirit as an impersonal thing, object, or influence which is a denial of the divine personality of the Spirit. The Spirit is dishonored by regarding Him as less than God in disclaiming His supernatural agency and work. Another way the Spirit is dishonored is by reliance upon substitutes for His agency in church activities (Zechariah 4:6; John 6:63). Disrespect is shown to the Spirit by lightly esteeming His agency in the salvation of individuals and the advancing of God's kingdom through the work of the church. Ministers dishonor the Spirit when they depend upon their gifts, talents, learning, and abilities and not on the presence and power of the Spirit (I Corinthians 2:1-5). Furthermore, professing Christian people often dishonor the Spirit by quenching and grieving Him (Ephesians 4:30-32; I Thessalonians 5:19; Hebrews 3:10-19) with unholy temperaments, indifference, and shrinking from the Spirit's leadings. He is quenched by neglecting the Bible, uncharitableness, conforming to the world, foolish conversation, and refusing the Spirit's baptism. The Spirit can also be dishonored by being resisted (Acts 7:51) and vexed (Isaiah 63:10). Resisting the Spirit is neglecting His leadership while vexing the Spirit is

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 271-273.

⁴⁹ Hogue, *The Believer's Personal Experience*, p. 41.

challenging, annoying, and provoking Him.⁵⁰

The Holy Spirit's Work At and
After the Baptism with the
Spirit

In Hogue's thinking, God's Spirit leads the believer to that final and permanent act of self-consecration which makes possible the Spirit's cleansing-baptism. This self-consecration is a prerequisite to being wholly sanctified and is a yielding to God in utter self-abandonment like clay in the hands of the potter (Romans 12:1, 2). The Spirit of God enables the believer to make this complete abandonment to His cleansing will (Ephesians 3:16-21; I Thessalonians 4:3). This is the believer's act in the Spirit's baptism--a sense of separation and dedication unto God.⁵¹

In Hogue's theological development, faith is the final condition which makes possible the Spirit's cleansing. The Spirit as the Author of this faith sanctifies (John 14:16-27), stimulates, strengthens, and steadies the believer in this attitude of faith in the atoning power to sanctify now. His supportive ministry is aiding the believer in the realization that God is willing to cleanse now through the baptizing presence of the Spirit in response to obedient-trusting faith in Jesus Christ.⁵²

In clearer detail Hogue developed the nature of this sanctifying faith when he mentioned some of the necessary conditions which naturally precede this faith. First, the believer's understanding must be

⁵⁰ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 364-376.

⁵¹ Ibid., pp. 273-275.

⁵² Ibid., pp. 275-277.

divinely enlightened to perceive the spiritual necessities of this experience. Second, the believer must make an entire consecration of self and all its interests to God based upon the firm conviction that God, with infinite wisdom and goodness, knows what is the highest good for the believer (I Peter 1:20, 21). Again, the believer must by a rigid denial of carnal self and a perfect resignation to Christ's will exercise himself unto godliness by continually thirsting for a godly life. This sanctifying faith entails a belief that all conditions are met and accepting the Bible's promises for receiving it. This cleansing faith claims the teachings of the Bible that God wills this cleansing (I Thessalonians 4:3; Luke 24:47-53; Acts 1:5-8; 2:4, 33), is able to perform it (Ephesians 3:16-21; I Thessalonians 5:23), and will do it now (Romans 12:1, 2; Acts 15:8, 9; I John 1:7, 9). Consequently, this holiness experience, received by an instantaneous exercise of faith, is retained only by a momentary and habitual exercise of this sanctifying faith because the whole of Christian experience is based upon faith as the fundamental and essential element of all holiness (Hebrews 10:19-22; 11:1-6).⁵³ From the beginning to the end, redemption from sin is through the blood of Christ, by the power of the Holy Spirit, and appropriated by faith.⁵⁴

According to Hogue, the Spirit's work at the baptism with the Spirit is the actual cleansing of the principle of sin from the

⁵³Wilson T. Hogg, "Relation of Faith to Holiness," A Symposium on Scriptural Holiness, ed. W.T. Hogg (Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1896), pp. 63-69.

⁵⁴Hogue, The Believer's Personal Experience, p. 42.

justified soul. The new birth imparts "incipient sanctification." This regenerating-life is the beginning of sanctification making the believer a partaker of Christ's imparted life and holiness. However, the principle of holiness is largely embryonic because lurking within the regenerated soul is the principle of sin as a perpetual menace to spiritual life. Progressive sanctification or growth in grace helps in subjecting this inward foe, but the old self-life wages a continual war against the imparted new life. Inbred sin weakens and retards the development of the soul creating a downward spiritual drag (I Corinthians 3:1-4) which requires the experience of entire sanctification to effect an adequate cure (Romans 6:6-23; 8:5-14; I Thessalonians 5:23).⁵⁵

Hogue believed that Jesus was talking about this baptism with the Spirit when He spoke to His disciples of the Father's Promise (Luke 24:44-53; John 16:7-14; Acts 1:5-8; 2:33; 15:8, 9). Jesus' earthly mission in ascension into Heaven was that He might be the Baptizer with the Holy Spirit. Hogue understood Christ's redeeming office work as including both the Atoner for sin and the Baptizer with the Spirit.⁵⁶

Believing this Pentecostal baptism is a contemporary experience, Hogue explained some of the results in receiving the Spirit's baptism. The essential thing at Pentecost and now is the personal enthronement of the Spirit within the believer who exercises faith and earnest prayer (Acts 2:4; 15:8, 9; Ephesians 5:18). This personal enthronement by the

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 35-44; cf., Hogg, "Perfecting Holiness," A Symposium on Scriptural Holiness, pp. 90-93.

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 45-46.

Spirit instantly effects the believer by lifting him to a higher plane of personal holiness which results in a quickening and clarifying of the spiritual vision. Deliverance from the manifestation of carnal traits, frequently realized before the Spirit's cleansing, becomes a reality with the enablement to definitely know Christ, not just in an historic sense, but as the living Christ in you the hope of glory (Colossians 1:27; John 7:38). Moreover, the Spirit's baptism brings an endowment of power for the Master's commissioned service (Acts 1:8; 2:47). This timeless Gift of the Spirit (crisis sanctification) is the heritage of all believers (Acts 2:39; 15:8, 9).⁵⁷

Furthermore, the crisis experienced in the baptism with the Holy Spirit results in a special union or fellowship with the Father and Son (John 17:17; I John 1:3, 7). It is a personal union and communion with both the Father and Son accomplished through the agency of the Spirit. The Spirit consummates this union and fellowship resulting in victory over the world (I John 5:4), a disposition which allows patience its perfect work (James 1:4), a submissiveness to the divine will at any cost (Matthew 26:39), an undercurrent of holy joy (I Peter 1:8), and renewed strength in an ever increasing freedom in the power of prayer and fellowship with God's people. However, the effects of this fellowship do not exempt the cleansed believer from temptation, errors in judgment resulting in mistakes, afflictions and sorrows, temperamental

⁵⁷ Ibid., pp. 45-50; cf., Wilson T. Hogue, G. Harry Agnew a Pioneer Missionary (Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1905), pp. 132-139.

differences between believers, nor from many infirmities of mind and body.⁵⁸

Hogue indicated that the Spirit's baptism does not do certain things. It does not render the believer infallible because the absolute perfection of God, the perfection of angels, and adamic perfection are not received in the Spirit's baptism. Neither does the Spirit's cleansing supersede the possibility and necessity of growth in grace because the sanctified soul is better prepared for spiritual growth than the unsanctified. Furthermore, entire sanctification does not exclude the need of a Mediator. In this present life, no experience removes men from the continual need of the mediation of Christ. Heart purity is received only through the mediation of Christ and is continuously dependent upon faith in that mediation (I Corinthians 1:30; Revelation 1:5).⁵⁹

According to Hogue, the Spirit's work after His baptism is being the Author of assurance. The exercising of sanctifying faith results in the believer's assurance that the baptizing work of the Spirit is done (I Corinthians 2:9-12; I John 4:13; Hebrews 10:15). The Spirit witnesses with a certainty in entire sanctification as He does in justification and every seeker after holiness should claim this witness by faith and hold steadfast, until he receives the assurance that the

⁵⁸ Hogue, The Believer's Personal Experience, pp. 51-55; cf., S.L. Brengle, Heart Talks on Holiness (New York: Salvation Army Publishing House, 1918), pp. 94-105.

⁵⁹ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 278-280.

sanctifying work is done.⁶⁰

Hogue believed after entire sanctification the Spirit produces the fruit of holiness and growth in grace within the believer (Romans 6:22; Galatians 5:22, 23). A profession of holiness without any corresponding fruit is a wrong profession because abiding in Christ always results in the fruit of holiness (John 15). The sanctified believer is risen with Christ (Colossians 3:1, 2), rejoices in Christ (Philippians 3:3), walks in Christ (Colossians 2:6), glorifies in the cross (Galatians 6:14), does deeds in His name (Colossians 3:17), looks for His appearing to establish His holy kingdom (Titus 2:13; Revelation 22:20), and realizes the experience of being hid with Christ in God. The one fruit of holy character which comprises all the others is love (I John 4:16-18), and this love manifests itself in loving God with all the heart, mind, soul, strength, and one's neighbor as himself (Matthew 22:37-39; Mark 12:30, 31; Luke 10:27).⁶¹ Hogue believed love entails the whole of "Christian perfection." Consequently, greater growth in grace (progressive sanctification), is possible to the entirely sanctified soul because the carnal manifestations are removed and the fruit of holiness is imparted.⁶²

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 277-278.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 280-281.

⁶² *Ibid.*, p. 271-273.

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS

Nature of the Spirit's Gifts

Basic to Hogue's concept of spiritual gifts was his doctrine of the church. By the term "church," Hogue meant the whole body of believers in every age and place which refers to the unorganized body of believers united by the Spirit to Christ as the Head. Within his thinking, the church is an organic living whole (I Corinthians 12), the body and bride of Christ (Ephesians 5:25-32; 1:22), the household of Christ and God (Matthew 10:25; Ephesians 2:19), and the temple of the Holy Spirit (Ephesians 2:22; I Corinthians 3:16; I Peter 2:5). Occasionally, the word "church" within the New Testament means an association of Christian believers meeting together for worship (Romans 16:5). However, the church as a New Testament institution was established through Christ and the agency of the Spirit at the first Pentecost (Acts 2). It is an established church by the Spirit's agency with a glorious destiny (Ephesians 4:13; Romans 8:17; John 17:22; Revelation 21:9). Throughout the ages, Hogue advocated that the church's continual task is carrying on through the Holy Spirit the will and purpose of its Head (Ephesians 1:22, 23).⁶³

Within Hogue's doctrine of the church, he strongly stressed the role of the Holy Spirit. As already observed in Hogue, the Spirit was the Agent in the establishment of the New Testament institutional church; however, he believed the Spirit has a continuing ministry in and

⁶³ *Ibid.*, pp. 282-284.

through Christ's body. The Spirit is the life of the church (Romans 8:5, 6). Where the Spirit is excluded, the Christian assembly, even though remaining strictly orthodox, loyal to early traditions, and retaining faithfully New Testament forms of worship, is spiritually as dead as an "Egyptian mummy." The church continually needs the presence and workings of the Spirit (John 6:63; 15:26, 27; 16:7-14; II Corinthians 3:6; Ezekiel 37:1-10), because the Spirit is Christ's Agent in His Headship over His church (Ephesians 1:22, 23). Christ as Head of the church directs and supervises its affairs through the Spirit since His ascension (John 16:7-14; Luke 24:44-53; Acts 1:10-12). Christian worship is possible only because the Spirit is the Inspirer of true worship (John 4:23; I Peter 2:5), and Christian service is possible because the Spirit imparts the endowment of power for service (Acts 1:8). Christ, in exercising His Headship over the church through the Spirit, calls or appoints men and women to various ministries for the edification of His body as a whole (Ephesians 4:11-13; I Corinthians 12:28). The Holy Spirit as the Spirit of Christ carries on this mission of world evangelization (Acts 1:4-8) and the establishment of God's kingdom on earth through the bestowment of gifts (Matthew 6:9-15; Luke 11:1-4; John 6:63; 16:7-14; I Corinthians 12:11, 18). Also, the Spirit is the "Unifier" of Christ's church (Ephesians 4:1-14). This fellowship in the Spirit is "begotten of the Spirit" (Philippians 2:1; I Corinthians 1:9; I John 1:3, 6, 7; 2:20, 27; 5:6, 7). Therefore, Hogue believed whenever the Spirit is properly recognized and honored, He is the church's best security against false piety and doctrine (I John

4:1-3; 2:20, 27; John 14:26; Romans 8:5, 6).⁶⁴

In Hogue's thought, the pivot of the Spirit's ministry within and through the body of Christ, hinges on the Spirit's baptism. He believed a renewal of the Spirit's Pentecostal baptism is the church's imperative need. He taught that Pentecost is the seed to germinate on a vastly enlarged scale throughout the history of the church (Acts 2:19, 20; Ezekiel 47:1-12). He challenged that the church, through the agency of the Spirit, can be greater than primitive Pentecost by increased faith resulting in an enlarged vision of the church's privilege, opportunity, and responsibility if the church realizes its indispensable need of the baptism with the Holy Spirit.⁶⁵ This baptism safeguards the believers from all damaging error (I John 2:20, 27; John 14:26),⁶⁶ and is the basic requirement for the Christian ministry (Acts 1:4-8; 2:4).⁶⁷ Nothing short of this sanctifying-cleansing work imparted by the baptism with the Holy Spirit can equip and qualify for the manifold duties of the church and the ministerial office.⁶⁸

Within this context of the church, Hogue's view of spiritual gifts came into focus. He believed the Spirit's work also includes the

⁶⁴ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 282-299; cf., Howard A. Snyder, "Misunderstanding Spiritual Gifts," Christianity Today, 18:15-18, October 12, 1973.

⁶⁵ Ibid., pp. 299-300; cf., Hogue, The Believer's Personal Experience, pp. 35-50.

⁶⁶ Ibid., pp. 291-294.

⁶⁷ Ibid., pp. 301-320.

⁶⁸ Ibid., p. 308; cf., Wilson T. Hogg, "Holiness and the Ministry," A Symposium on Scriptural Holiness, pp. 94-98; cf., Wilson T. Hogg, A Hand-Book of Homiletics and Pastoral Theology (7th ed.; Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing, 1919), pp. 275-290.

bestowing of spiritual gifts upon believers within Christ's church for the purpose of effective Christian service and the edifying of His body (I Corinthians 12-14; Ephesians 4:9-14; Psalm 68:18). These gifts (not Gift of the Holy Spirit) are special enduements for the whole church and are distributed among the believers by the Holy Spirit "severally as He will" (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). Even though these special or extraordinary gifts are for the church as a whole, Hogue taught that no one of them is for every member of the church (I Corinthians 12:4-10, 28-31) because these gifts are conditioned by the sovereignty of the Spirit for their communication and distribution (I Corinthians 12:4-11, 18).⁶⁹

Nevertheless, while the Spirit sovereignly acts in the distribution of His gifts, Hogue further explained that the Spirit designs in some measure that every member of Christ's body should be endued with them. It is not as the believer wills, but as the Holy Spirit wills that these gifts are bestowed. However, the gifts are not reserved for any particular class of believers because all who have saving faith in Christ are equally eligible for their bestowment. The gifts are not just limited to the apostles and ministers, but attend those who believe upon Christ (Mark 16:17, 18). In the same way that Elijah was taken up and his mantle fell to Elisha with a double portion (II Kings 2:9-15), Hogue believed Christ ascended (Ephesians 4:9-14) giving the ministrations of His Spirit to His mystical body so that it might reproduce the marvelous works of the living Head (John 14:12). However, those

⁶⁹ Ibid., pp. 289-290.

spiritual gifts bestowed upon believers are always designed for the edifying of the body of Christ.⁷⁰

Hogue emphatically posited a distinct difference between the Spirit's gifts and graces. Both grace and gifts proceed from the same divine Spirit, but they arise from dissimilar attributes and depend upon conditions essentially different. Graces spring from divine benevolence while gifts, whether natural or spiritual, arise from the divine Sovereignty. Grace is dispensed equally to all without any respect of persons and based upon the same conditions for all men. Repentance toward God and faith exercised in the Lord Jesus Christ are the conditions for this saving grace (Acts 10:34-35; Romans 3:22; Philippians 3:9; Hebrews 11:1, 6; 7:25; Ephesians 2:8; Titus 2:11-14; John 3:16). In contrast, Hogue explained that spiritual gifts are not equally conferred, nor are there certain specified conditions for their bestowment. Gifts are conferred only according to the will of God, corresponding with the Divine purpose concerning each individual, and God reserves for Himself the right or prerogative of assigning each individual a place in the body of Christ. No man, because he is in a state of grace, can receive a bestowment of a particular gift by his own choice (I Corinthians 12:8-11, 18) because God as an independent Sovereign acts according to His own determinate counsel in the bestowment of spiritual gifts upon the various members of Christ's mystical body. The Spirit bestows severally as He will, assigning to each member a place as it pleases Him. Consequently, gifts are not any necessary

⁷⁰ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 322, 324-327.

evidences of superior grace, nor is the absence of gifts a proof that an individual is without saving grace (I Corinthians 13:1-3).⁷¹

Hogue enumerated what he believed the apostles considered to be the nine different kinds of gifts. These nine gifts of the Spirit include: the word of wisdom, the word of knowledge, faith, gifts of healing, the working of miracles, prophecy, the discerning of spirits, divers kinds of tongues, and the interpretation of tongues.⁷²

Hogue defined the word of wisdom as a particular supernatural endowment or revelation of wisdom in spiritual things as a qualification for preaching the gospel (I Corinthians 2:6-10). This wisdom gift is necessary for apprehending the mystery of redemption, the deep things of God, and the things God prepares for those who love Him. Mere reason can never apprehend these truths (I Corinthians 2:14-16). Hogue was persuaded that this wisdom gift is illustrated in the Bible, because of Christ's promise to the disciples that in times of persecution they will receive this endowment for the gospel's sake (Luke 21:14, 15). Stephen, when witnessing to certain leaders of the synagogue, received this endowment of wisdom just before his martyrdom (Acts 6:9-10). There are depths of wisdom in both the written and Incarnate Word of God which require this gift as an essential qualification for the gospel ministry.⁷³

Closely related to the gift of wisdom, Hogue developed his view of the endowment of knowledge. This "word of knowledge" as a gift

⁷¹Ibid., pp. 289, 322-324.

⁷²Ibid., p. 327.

⁷³Ibid., pp. 327-329.

refers to the clearness of spiritual insight which is essential for aptness and correctness in expounding the Word of God and the processes of salvation. On the other hand, the gift of wisdom is designed to qualify those who possess it for imparting judicious counsel concerning all spiritual matters. This endowment of knowledge is a more particular clearness of spiritual insight. Aquila and Priscilla possessed this gift of knowledge when they expounded the way of God more perfectly to Apollos (Acts 18:26). In contrast, Apollos, an eloquent man, mighty in Scriptures, exercised the gift of wisdom when he taught diligently the things of the Lord in Achaia convincing the Jews (Acts 18:24-28).⁷⁴

The extraordinary gifts of faith and healing were next mentioned by Hogue. The gift of faith is not the grace of faith. The faith exercised for justification and the baptism with the Spirit is the grace of faith, but the endowment of faith is the extraordinary power of believing for the accomplishment of certain results in the face of natural impossibilities because of a special divine interposition. This gift of faith is illustrated in a long array of examples in Hebrews the eleventh chapter. As miracle-working faith, it brings divine power to aid in prevailing over the elements and laws of nature and also triumphs over physical infirmities resulting from sin, subdues devils, and surmounts every Red Sea barrier. The endowment of healing is an extraordinary gift for the healing of sickness. During His earthly life, Christ had a two-fold ministry to men's spiritual and physical needs (Matthew 14:36; Mark 1:32, 34; Luke 4:40; 6:17; 9:11; John 6:2; Isaiah 35:4-6; Exodus

⁷⁴Ibid., pp. 329-330.

15:26; Psalm 103:2, 3). When Christ commissioned His "first ministers," He gave them the authority to heal, as well as preach, in His name (Mark 3:15; 16:17, 18; Luke 10:8, 9). Healing was also practiced in the early church (Acts 14:8-9; James 5:14-16). Therefore, Hogue concluded that the grace of salvation and the gifts of healing are separate but form a joint heritage of Christ's body.⁷⁵

The working of miracles is another gift of the Spirit that Hogue mentioned. He noted that the word translated "miracles" from the Greek came from the same root as the word "dynamite." He understood this endowment of miracles as that class of mighty operations under the divine direction which are manifested in the casting out of devils, in raising the dead to life, and in the performance of works requiring a contravention of some of the forces and laws of nature (Acts 12:5-19; 16:16-18; 19:11-18; 20:6-12).⁷⁶

Next in Hogue's order of listing was the gift of prophecy. He defined this gift in what he considered as the general New Testament usage of teaching and expounding the Scriptures, or to impart spiritual instruction under the extraordinary power and illumination of the Holy Spirit (I Corinthians 14:3). It is in this general sense that Hogue understood the gift of prophecy. Under the dispensation and baptism with the Holy Spirit as foretold by the prophet Joel, the sons, daughters, handmaidens, and servants in the church of Christ are to prophesy in this general sense. This gift is, therefore, the most

⁷⁵ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 330-332.

⁷⁶ Ibid., pp. 332-333.

useful and common of all the spiritual gifts (I Corinthians 12:31; 14:1). Those at Pentecost were filled with the Spirit and immediately began to declare the wonderful works of God by exercising this gift. This gift of declaring forth the wonders of God is so useful for the edification of the church that Hogue said it should be desired and sought by all believers (I Corinthians 14:39).⁷⁷

Discerning of spirits is also one of the Spirit's gifts which Hogue cited. This endowment is designed to enable the possessors to distinguish between true and false miracles, discern between false teachers, prophets, and mere pretenders to divine inspiration. It is the discernment between hypocritical professors and such as have unfeigned faith in Jesus Christ. Instances of this endowment are recorded in the New Testament: Peter possessed it when Ananias and Sapphira came before Him (Acts 5:1-11); Simon Magus offered money to Peter for the Spirit (Acts 8:9-24); Paul exercised it when he faced the sorcerer in Paphos (Acts 13:4-12); the angel or pastor of the church of Ephesus also illustrated its use (Revelation 2:2). The gift of discernment, Hogue designated as preventative to have "graceless men" in the ranks of the church's ministry (I John 4:1).⁷⁸

Speaking with divers kinds of tongues and interpretation of tongues completed Hogue's enumeration of spiritual gifts. He felt the gift of tongues refers to the ability bestowed on certain individuals through the immediate operation of the Spirit to speak in languages which they have never learned, for the instruction of those who belonged

⁷⁷ Ibid., pp. 333-334.

⁷⁸ Ibid., pp. 334-335.

to different nationalities. Pentecost illustrated this enduement of tongues (Acts 2:7, 8). The Corinthian church, Hogue cited as an example of gross perversions of this gift which required Paul to administer a reproof and almost speak disparagingly of this gift as a means of edification in the church (I Corinthians 14). However, Paul evidently exercised this gift at Lycaonia (Acts 14:11-15) and the Corinthian people were not to forbid it (I Corinthians 14:39). The enduement of interpretation is the ability to bring forth the deep truths out of the foreign and Aramaic languages.⁷⁹

Permanence or Cessation of the Gifts

Concerning the permanence or cessation of spiritual gifts, Hogue assumed the position that the gifts are designed to be permanent. In general, he taught these gifts are bequeathed to the whole church as a body and a perpetual inheritance. He believed the gifts are a perpetual inheritance because the Bible promises concerning them are unlimited (Mark 16:15-18; John 14:12-14; James 5:14-16). Hogue also felt that these gifts are designed as a permanent enduement for the church of Christ, because they continue in common exercise among Christians and never wholly disappear. There are references to the gifts in the writings of the early church fathers. Throughout the ages, whenever a great revival takes place, he contended that in some degree these endue-ments are manifested. Furthermore, Hogue affirmed these special

⁷⁹ Ibid., pp. 335-336; cf., Myron F. Boyd, "The Gift of Tongues," Light and Life, 107:6, February 5, 1974.

endowments of the Spirit are needful in all the periods of the church's history to preserve in the mind of the church the idea of the spiritual and the supernatural. It keeps the church aware of the danger of spiritual degeneracy and reminds the church of the pledge of the restitution of all things by Jesus Christ at His coming and kingdom. It keeps before the church the full scope of the Lord's redeeming work in the consummation of all things (Romans 8:21, 22). These gifts are also needful in the church's task of planting Christianity in heathen lands.⁸⁰

Speaking of the gifts in reference to "sincere" and "pious" believers, Hogue explained that they are often betrayed into extravagances which reproach the cause of truth. These believers often slip into extravagances because they are uninstructed as to the nature and design of the gifts and the principle and manner of these gifts' bestowment. Nevertheless, Hogue challenged that the abuse of the gifts by "impostors," the "extravagant claims and pretensions of novices," who puffed with pride seek to parade their faith before the public gaze, and the fanatical errors and excesses of ignorant souls are not to be allowed to discredit the Bible's teaching on the gifts of the Spirit.⁸¹

However, Hogue offered this clarification concerning the permanence of spiritual gifts:

We would offer no apology for the vagaries and the fanatical ravings which have characterized some in modern times, who, separating the doctrine for which we content from the general

⁸⁰ Hogue, The Holy Spirit a Study, pp. 338-363.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, p. 341.

system of revealed truth, have proclaimed it in an unbalanced and reckless manner; nor would we intentionally do ought to open the way for the admission of such extravagance and folly in the present discussion of this subject. We are not unaware that this doctrine, like other doctrines of revealed religion, may be prostituted to the basest purposes.⁸²

Distribution of the Gifts

Concerning which of the Spirit's gifts are bestowed, Hogue affirmed that in general all the extraordinary gifts are bequeathed to the whole church as a perpetual inheritance. By all the gifts, Hogue meant the nine gifts of the Spirit which he enumerated. As already observed, his understanding of the Spirit's gifts and their bestowment was always within the context of the sovereign mind and will of the Spirit (I Corinthians 12:11, 18) and the edification of the whole church (I Corinthians 12:12-31; 14:19-35).⁸³

In reference to when the Spirit's enduements are distributed, Hogue was not as precise as he had been in other areas of his pneumatology. His basic position was that the gifts are distributed at or after conversion and sometimes at or after the baptism with the Holy Spirit. Hogue made no mention of the possibility of unbelievers possessing the gifts of the Spirit, like some Bible passages suggested (Matthew 7:21-23; Numbers 22-24; I Samuel 10:6-10; 19:20-24; I Kings 18:16-46). According to Hogue, Christ in the exercising of His headship over His church through the Spirit distributes gifts, varied ministries, and functions to believers for the edification of His body. These gifts

⁸² Ibid., p. 340.

⁸³ Ibid., pp. 289-291; 336-363.

are for the church as a whole, but no one member possesses every gift.⁸⁴ Every believer in Christ's body receives the benefit of these gifts in some measure (I Corinthians 12:7).⁸⁵

On the other hand, Hogue stated the Spirit distributes gifts at the baptism with the Spirit. He mentioned that every one who savingly believes in Christ and receives the baptism with the Spirit has an assigned place under Christ's Headship within His body. There are various offices and gifts distributed by the Spirit under Christ's Headship resulting in the supplementation, unity, and edification of Christ's body (I Corinthians 12:4-31; Ephesians 4:10-16).⁸⁶

However, the bishop's teaching on spiritual gifts was to be tempered by a frank warning. He dreaded nothing more than a spirit of fanaticism.⁸⁷ Elucidating his concern, he said in reference to physical manifestations sometimes seen in revivals:

Certain dangers are to be carefully guarded against, however, in connection with those physical manifestations which purely religious excitement may naturally and legitimately produce. The first of these dangers is that of forgetting that precisely similar effects may be produced by causes which are very remote from religious excitement; and that, therefore, these bodily effects are of themselves no evidence that a so-called religious excitement is a genuine work of God. The second danger is that of substituting these physical effects for genuine piety. Such phenomena are by no means essential marks nor infallible tokens of spirituality. They can never be substituted for integrity of heart and righteousness of life. A third danger in connection with these bodily agitations is, that they are liable to become epidemic, and when

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 289-290, 322.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 324-325.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 325, 337.

⁸⁷ Wilson T. Hogg, Revivals and Revival Work (Buffalo: Wilson T. Hogg, 1890), p. 20.

they do they are generally regarded as supernatural visitations, thereby becoming a fruitful source of fanaticism in spirit and in practice. In view of these things it is certainly not wise to encourage such manifestations by placing any kind of premium upon them. Nor should they ordinarily be discouraged and resisted. If, however, they are in any case put in competition with true spirituality, those having the oversight of the Lord's work should with mildness and wisdom, but with courage and firmness, restrain them, and direct the erring ones into a more excellent way.⁸⁸

Speaking of false religious excitements, Hogue outlined five distinguishing marks in which a minister can recognize spurious religious excitement: (1) False religious excitement has an irresistible character. Spurious excitement, when once underway, generally becomes entirely unmanageable. The participants are possessed with an element of obstinacy which challenges all proper authority and resists every effort at persuasion. They misinterpret their own self-will as a divine impulse which is dangerous to resist. So, the intensity of a religious excitement is no proof of its genuineness. (2) Any excitements which deal principally or exclusively with the moving of the animal sympathies are spurious. This is represented in making appeals almost exclusively to the sympathies of the hearers rather than to their hearts and consciences. It unduly works upon the mere sympathies and passions of hearers but leaves no permanent impressions for good. (3) The subjects of false religious excitement generally profess to have a high degree of spiritual enjoyment. They are stony ground hearers who have no roots or real stability of character in themselves. (4) Religious excitements are to be regarded with suspicion which influence

⁸⁸ Ibid., pp. 19-20.

their subjects less in their private relations than they do in their social and public gatherings in the church. A genuine revival of the Holy Spirit drives men and women to their closets to mourn in prayer (Zechariah 12:10-14). (5) And lastly, spurious excitements make men careless or superficial in the matter of self-examination. When men are vain, conceited, boastful, or rude in spirit and behavior, reckless, extravagant and needlessly offensive in their methods of presenting the truth, and desirous of opposition and disappointed when it is not provoked, these are all marks of a spurious religious excitement.⁸⁹

Hogue rightly concluded:

. . . let it ever be remembered that nothing is to be more dreaded than a spirit of wild fanaticism. It is sometimes claimed that formalism is a greater evil; but such is not the case. It is easier to revive a whole church of formalists, than to control one genuine fanatic. Thoughtless persons sometimes assert that "wild-fire is better than no fire." The statement is utterly foolish. As well might we contend that a house on fire is better than no fire in the house. Who can fail to see the absurdity of such a statement? Where there is no fire a fire may be kindled that will be productive of much good and no harm; but where there is wild-fire or fanaticism it will destroy or seriously impair every prospect of good, and produce widespread confusion and disaster.⁹⁰

⁸⁹ Hogg, A Hand-Book of Homiletics and Pastoral Theology, pp. 410-414.

⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 410.

Chapter 5

HENRY ORTON WILEY

Henry Orton Wiley (1877-1961) was one of the most outstanding spokesmen of the Wesleyan-Arminian theological position. As an American church leader, he started his career in the Church of the Nazarene in 1906 when he was ordained as an early associate of Phineas F. Bresee (1838-1915). After pastoring for a time, in 1913, Wiley became the president of Pasadena College. In 1916, he accepted the call to Northwest Nazarene College, Nampa, Idaho where he remained until 1926. From 1926 until 1928, he served again as president at Pasadena College. At the end of this term, he was elected editor of his denominational periodical, Herald of Holiness. In 1936 he again returned to the presidency of Pasadena College, remaining there until his election to emeritus relationship in 1948.¹ During this last term at Pasadena College, Wiley wrote his three-volume Christian Theology distinguishing him as the acknowledged spokesman for the Wesleyan-Arminian position in the theological world.²

¹H. Orton Wiley, The Harps of God and Other Sermons, ed. Ross E. Price (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1971), p. 10; cf., Jack Ford, In the Steps of John Wesley the Church of the Nazarene in Britain (Kansas City: Nazarene Publishing House, 1968), p. 185; cf., Wilcox, Be Ye Holy, p. 329.

²Paul T. Culbertson has adapted and arranged a single volume from Wiley's three volumes on Christian theology entitled Introduction to Christian Theology (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1954). This book attempts to concisely state Wiley's theological views in one volume.

Wiley's ability as an able Bible expositor is apparent in his book, The Epistle to the Hebrews (1959). Several of his sermons and lectures have been compiled and published. The only book of sermons he officially published himself is a little volume called, God Has the Answer (1956).³ The Nazarene Publishing House at Kansas City, Missouri, printed a paperback pamphlet of two of his anniversary messages entitled, The Pentecostal Promise and We All Do Fade as a Leaf (1963). Ross E. Price compiled and edited a little volume of Wiley's sermons selected from his earlier preaching called The Harps of God and Other Sermons (1971).⁴

As a Wesleyan-Arminian leader, H. Orton Wiley's influence is wide-spread. He was: preacher, expositor, author, college administrator, educator, and Wesleyan theologian.

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIFT

Distinction Between the Spirit as Gift and Giver of Gifts

Wiley proclaimed the Gift of the Spirit is the purifying work in the crisis act of entire sanctification subsequent to regeneration. This is evident in his discussion of Pentecost. Within the Old Testament, the Passover marked the deliverance of the Hebrew people from Egyptian bondage and Pentecost celebrated the giving of the law.

³Wiley, The Harps of God, p. 7. Wiley was born in a sodhouse in Nebraska. In contrast with his birth, he earned the Doctor of Systematic Theology degree from Pacific School of Religion and also held the Doctor of Divinity degree.

⁴Ibid.

As Wiley saw it, the New Testament teaches that Christ is our Passover Who was sacrificed for us. Pentecost, which followed the Passover, marked the ushering in of a dispensation of inward law (Hebrews 8:10; 10:16). Within the New Testament, the significance of Pentecost is the giving of the Pentecostal Gift ("the Gift of a Person") Who records God's laws upon the hearts of believers. This Gift of the Paraclete or Comforter was promised by Christ to the disciples as the Agent through whom He would continue His office work in a new and more effective manner (John 14-17).⁵ This Gift of the Comforter is the Promise of the Father and the Gift of the glorified Christ. The Holy Spirit is Christ's sanctifying Gift to the church (Ephesians 5:25-27).⁶ This sanctifying work is wrought by the baptism with the Holy Spirit and embraces in one experience the cleansing of the heart from sin and the abiding, indwelling presence of the Spirit empowering the believer for life and service (Acts 15:8, 9).⁷

This was what Wiley meant when he said:

The Passover was a family rite, and signifies the new birth; Pentecost has a racial aspect, and is the purifying of the newborn soul from inherited depravity. The Passover is possession by redemption; Pentecost is possession by indwelling. Christ, our Passover, was sacrificed for us on Calvary; Pentecost marks the fulfillment of the provisions thus secured to us--the coming of the Holy Spirit in His sanctifying power, writing the law of God upon the minds and hearts of His people, and dwelling within them as an abiding Comforter.⁸

⁵Wiley, Christian Theology, II, p. 312.

⁶H. Orton Wiley, The Epistle to the Hebrews (Kansas City: Beacon Hill Press, 1959), pp. 70, 101, 207, 213, 333, 429.

⁷Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 466-467; cf., pp. 305, 321-324.

⁸H. Orton Wiley, "The Church Today Will Succeed Only as It

Separated from, but related to the Spirit as Gift, Wiley proclaimed the Spirit as a Giver of spiritual gifts. The Holy Spirit, as Giver or the Administrator of redemption, ministers under the Headship of Christ over His church, in two distinct though related fields. The first is in the impartation of the fruit of the Spirit. By this, he meant the communication to believers of the nine graces of the Spirit (Galatians 5:22, 23) and refers to the development of Christian character rather than qualifications for service. This fruit of the Spirit refers to the outflow of divine life which follows as a necessary consequence of the Spirit's abiding presence. In contrast, spiritual gifts are personal endowments for specific vocations bestowed by the Spirit as He wills (I Corinthians 12:11, 18) for the express purpose of the success of the church in her spiritual mission (Ephesians 4:8-16; Romans 12:3-10; I Corinthians 12:4-11). These gifts are the divinely ordained means and powers with which Christ endows His church so that it may properly perform its task on earth. These gifts, as divine bestowments upon individual members of the church, determine the believers' functions in the body of Christ (I Corinthians 12:21-25). Therefore, there is an internal connection between the graces and the gifts in the administration of the Spirit.⁹

Speaking in reference to this basic distinction of the Holy Spirit as both Gift and Giver, Wiley stated:

Experiences What Happened at Pentecost," Herald of Holiness, 43:10, March 10, 1954.

⁹Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 315-321.

As Christ was God's redemptive Gift to the world, so the Holy Spirit is Christ's sanctifying Gift to the Church (Eph. 5:25-27). As the One is received by faith, so also is the Other. To be made partakers of the Holy Spirit, then, is to receive Him as a personal, indwelling Spirit, the Promise of the Father and the Gift of the risen and glorified Christ. When received, the Spirit manifests Himself in us as a sanctifying Spirit, through us as a charismatic or gift-bestowing Spirit, and upon us as an anointing or empowering Spirit.¹⁰

The Holy Spirit's Work Before,
At, and After Conversion

In Wiley's thought, the Holy Spirit as the Third Person of the Godhead is from the beginning progressively unfolded in Holy Scripture as the Administrator of redemption. As the Son of God is progressively unfolded within Holy Scripture as the Redeemer of mankind by virtue of His atoning work, there is a corresponding revelation of the Spirit. The Holy Spirit certainly could not come as the Administrator of Christ's atoning work until Jesus' earthly ministry had been completed (John 7:39; 12:16). While the full dispensation of the Spirit did not begin until Pentecost (Acts 2:1-4), the Spirit was operative before the beginning of time. It was the Holy Spirit who brooded over the waters bringing order and beauty out of chaos in the creation of the world (Genesis 1:2). The Spirit breathed into man creating him a living soul (Genesis 2:7; Job 33:4). After the fall of man, the Spirit in His working relationship to mankind assumed four principal forms: direct striving with the consciences of man (Abel, Genesis 4:4; 6:3); working

¹⁰Wiley, *The Epistle to the Hebrews*, pp. 213-214; cf., Stanley D. Walters, "Spiritual Gifts," *The Preacher's Magazine*, 49:20-23, January, 1974; cf., Donald Metz, "The Gifts of the Spirit in Perspective," *The Word and the Doctrine*, pp. 317-333.

through a family (Abraham, Galatians 3:16; Hebrews 11:8-10; Romans 9:4, 5); giving the law (Galatians 3:19; Romans 3:20); and operating through the voice of the prophets (II Peter 1:21; Luke 1:70).¹¹

Furthermore, Wiley indicated that the Spirit assumed an active role in the life of Jesus and His earthly ministry. The incarnation was accomplished by the work of the Holy Spirit (Matthew 1:18, 20; Luke 1:34-35). The Spirit, as the bond of union between the Father and the Son, was the appropriate Person to effect this union between the uncreated and created natures in the One Person of Christ. Therefore, because the Holy Spirit was the Minister of this union, He became the highest expression of God's love for His creatures. Moreover, the Spirit, being the perfecting Person of the Godhead, prepared and perfected the Mediator (Jesus Christ) for His official work. The Holy Spirit guided and sustained Jesus in every experience of His earthly life. The Son of God as the Representative of man was under the immediate direction of the Holy Spirit (John 3:34). His entire earthly ministry was presided over by the Spirit. Dwelling in the God-man, the Spirit searched not only the deep things of God (I Corinthians 2:10-13), but also the full depths of human nature. As the Son became officially perfected for His mediatorial ministry through suffering (Hebrews 2:10-13), likewise, the Spirit became the prepared Agent as the Spirit of Christ to take hold of the whole being of man by its very roots.¹²

This subordination of the Son to the Spirit ceased when the

¹¹Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 303-307.

¹²Ibid., pp. 307-310.

Redeemer aided by the Spirit laid down His life as a sacrificial offering for all men (Hebrews 9:14). It was not until the session (Mark 16:19; Matthew 22:44; 26:64; I Peter 3:22; Ephesians 1:20-23) that the glorified Christ was restored to the full glory which He had with the Father before the world was (John 17:5). As the glorified and perfect Advocate (I John 1:1, 2) at the right hand of God the Father, He received the promise of the Holy Spirit. And by a divine reversal, the glorified Christ who was presided over by the Spirit during His humiliation (Philippians 2:5-13) is now in His exaltation become the Giver of that same Spirit to the church (Acts 2:33). The New Testament, according to Wiley, distinctly declares the Holy Spirit as the Comforter or Spirit which dwelt in Christ and also dwells in His people (Luke 11:13; John 7:37-39; 14:16, 17, 26). This Comforter, as the Spirit of truth, is the Revealer of the Person of Christ. As the Son of God came to reveal or glorify the Father (John 17), likewise, the Holy Spirit came to reveal the Son of God (John 15:26; 16:13-14; I Corinthians 12:3). As the Representative of the Saviour, the Spirit is the Agent of Christ, representing the atoning Saviour in the salvation of the individual soul, in the formation of the church, and in the witnessing power of the church to the world. However, the Spirit is not the Representative of an absentee Saviour (John 14:18; 16:7).¹³ As Wiley expressed: "He is our Lord's ever-present other Self."¹⁴

Wiley next directed himself to the question of how the Spirit who dwelt in Christ is going to dwell in sinful men. In partial answer

¹³ Ibid., pp. 309-311.

¹⁴ Ibid., p. 311.

to this question, he proclaimed his teaching of the Spirit's beginning ministry in sinful men before conversion. Christ's finished atonement for all men ("objective soteriology") is effective only when administered in men by the Holy Spirit ("subjective soteriology"). The working of the Holy Spirit in men is just as necessary as the work of Christ done for men. It is wrong to view the workings of the Spirit as superseding that of Christ. Rather, the Spirit's work is a continuation of Christ's redeeming benefits on a new and higher plane in a subjective application to sinful men's lives.¹⁵

As Wiley viewed it, the Spirit as the Agent of Christ makes known His divine purpose for the salvation of the world through a proclamation called a "vocation" or "call." This vocation is further distinguished as a universal and an immediate call. The universal call refers to the sacred influence exerted by the Spirit upon the consciences of men, apart from the revealed Word as found in the Holy Scriptures (Genesis 6:3; Romans 1:19; 2:15; Acts 14:17). The immediate call refers to the Spirit's influence in arresting sinful men's attention through the Word of God revealed for all mankind (Romans 10:12-21). This distinction is similar to general and Special Revelation.¹⁶

According to Wiley, the beginnings of salvation start with this vocation or the "gracious call of God" through the Holy Spirit. The vocation is God's universal offer of salvation to all men through Christ (John 1:9). In this call the Spirit works as a direct spiritual influence upon the hearts of men and as an indirect influence through

¹⁵Ibid., p. 334.

¹⁶Ibid., pp. 334-335.

the Word, providences, and various means of grace (Proverbs 21:1, 2; Psalm 51:10; 119:18; Luke 24:45; Acts 16:14). The Spirit is the Agent of the call and the Word is the instrument which He ordinarily uses in His operations of arresting the spiritual attention of sinful men. Moreover, the calling work of the Spirit involves three things: the proclamation of Christ as the Redeemer, the conditions upon which the offer of salvation is made, and the command to submit to the authority of Christ (Acts 5:32; cf., 13:38-41).¹⁷

In ascertaining Wiley's teaching of the gospel vocation, it is important to perceive his views of the general revelation of God. By general revelation, he meant that disclosure of Himself which God makes to all men. It is God unveiling Himself by means of the physical universe. The physical universe bespeaks of God because it is filled with the Divine Spirit in a like manner as the atmosphere is filled with the sunlight and reveals the sun. General revelation is a revealing of God in the nature and constitution of man. Man as a person possesses an intellect, feelings, and will, but ingrained in man's nature is a sense of duty or conscience. This Somewhat or Someone within man's nature pronounces itself concerning the rightness or wrongness of the choice of motives. God works through this conscience of men in revealing Himself. The progress of human history reveals the purposes of God and is part of general revelation. History is more than a disconnected series of events, because there is an inner directing Presence in it. History has an authoritative Will above it Who directs all events toward an

¹⁷Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 340-342.

expressed goal or a fullness of time. This goal is the coming of the incarnate Son of God on the plane of human history as God manifest in the flesh (I Thessalonians 4:12-18; 5:1-11; Revelation 19:11-21:27). Until the glorified Christ comes again, God's presence directs the course of history in spite of the darkness and antagonism of sin. This general revelation is basic and fundamental, but implies a revelation on a higher and personal plane. General revelation alone is not enough to lead men into a personal knowledge of Christ's redemptive benefits. Special Revelation or the redemptive purpose of God manifested in the Person of Jesus Christ must be added to lead sinful men into a personal union with God. However, general revelation is a source from which the Holy Spirit works in calling men's attention to God's gracious offer of salvation through the incarnate and glorified Christ.¹⁸

In his discussion of the gospel vocation, Wiley used certain terms to describe the Spirit's operation before conversion. He used the term "awakening" to define the operation of the Holy Spirit by which men's minds are quickened to a consciousness of their lost estate. As already noted in the preceding paragraph, Wiley cautioned that the Spirit in this awakening process not only works through the medium of objective truth (i.e., Holy Scriptures) but also by the direct influence upon the minds and hearts of men (Luke 24:45; Acts 16:14). To the idea of awakening, he added the term "conviction." By this term, he had reference to that operation of the Spirit which produces a sense of guilt and condemnation within men because of their sin. Not only does

¹⁸Wiley, Christian Theology, I, pp. 51-52, 125-135.

the Spirit quicken men's minds to a consciousness of their lost estate, but He also brings to their consciousness a sense of personal blame because of habitual sin (John 16:8-11). This divine work of conviction is more than just a mere convincing of the intellect; it is a moral demonstration which unveils sin as effecting the personal relations with Christ. It is a conviction which reaches the conscience as well as the reason, but this conviction is one of hope and not of despair. The Spirit purposes not only just to reveal the sinfulness of the human heart, but also the fullness and freeness of salvation through Christ's atoning benefits. He seeks to turn men from sin, and to lead them to a living faith in Christ. The Spirit's convictive ministry is one of hope for all who truly repent of their sins and believe on the Lord Jesus Christ.¹⁹

Wiley taught that the Spirit in His convincing ministry represents Christ to the world. In this preliminary stage of grace, the Spirit convicts the world of sin, righteousness, and judgment (John 16:8-11). The "sin" referred to is the formal rejection of Jesus Christ as the Saviour of the world. The "righteousness" of which the Spirit convicts is Christ's finished work of atonement as the only ground of acceptance before a righteous God. This "judgment" refers to the dethronement of Satan as the prince of this world and the final separation of all the righteous and wicked at the last day. Through the redeeming work of the glorified Christ, Satan and all his wicked followers will be dethroned and some day suffer eternal condemnation while

¹⁹Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 341-343.

the righteous inherit their eternal reward (John 3:16-21, 36; 12:31-32, 46-50; 16:11; I John 5:4). The Holy Spirit in calling sinful men to acknowledge Christ as personal Saviour and Lord convinces them of sin, righteousness and the judgment.²⁰

According to Wiley, man is a created self-determining personality who has the "element of contingency." This he believed must enter into the question of the Spirit's vocation and convictive ministries. The Spirit's gracious call of God to salvation, spiritual awakening, and conviction may be resisted or rejected. He believed that even those who have responded to the Spirit's ministry and accepted Christ's redeeming benefits may forfeit their obedience. To describe such forfeiting of obedience, he used the term "reprobation." By this, he meant those who do not retain the knowledge of God, or who finally resist the truth (II Corinthians 13:5). It is never to be understood in the sense of a "fiat or arbitrary decree" given by God. Rather, it refers primarily to failure under test. The divine intention is that all men (no matter how sinful) shall avail themselves of their eternal privileges in Christ Jesus, but God allows man the decision of determining his eternal destiny (Genesis 2:16, 17; Proverbs 1:24-31; Matthew 23:37; John 3:16-21 36; 7:17).²¹

Basic to Wiley's understanding of the Spirit's operation in the preliminary states of grace is his teaching of "prevenient grace." By the use of this term, he meant "grace which goes before or prepares the soul for entrance into the initial state of salvation." Not only does

²⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 331-332.

²¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 343-344.

the Spirit impart a call to salvation, awakening to the need of salvation and a convicting sense of guilt and condemnation because of sin, but He also exercises "preparatory grace" toward men helpless in sin. This is that manifestation of the divine influence which precedes the full regenerate life (John 6:44; 15:5; Romans 5:6, 8, 10; I Corinthians 12:3; II Corinthians 3:5; Ephesians 2:1, 8; Philippians 2:13; I Thessalonians 1:5; II Thessalonians 2:13; cf., I Peter 1:2; Titus 2:11, 12).²² This is the gift of righteousness or the unconditional diffusion of grace to all men as a first benefit of the universal atonement made by Jesus Christ.²³

Doctor Wiley suggested that basic presuppositions are necessary to properly understand the teaching of prevenient grace. First, man himself is totally depraved, powerless, and possessed with the inability of either thinking or doing any good thing. Holy Scripture affirms this presupposition (Genesis 6:3; Romans 3:10, 23; Ephesians 2:1-5), and the experience and history of mankind also confirm this affirmation of the Scriptures. Consequently, everything previous to divine regenerating-life called good must be attributed to the prior work of the Spirit of God. This is not a denial of natural conscience within men. Instead, anything good in man previous to regeneration is due to the universal influence of the Spirit. Second, although previous to regeneration all men are dead in sin by nature, man's nature in one sense is in a state of grace through the unconditional benefit of the atonement. No person

²² *Ibid.*, pp. 344-346; cf., pp. 108-109, 130-136.

²³ *Ibid.*, p. 130.

is completely devoid of God's grace nor entirely destitute of preventing grace or the universal influence of the Spirit. Third, there is what Wiley called a "continuity of grace." The Holy Spirit begins, advances, and perfects everything which can be called good in men. He leads sinners step by step in proportion as He finds response and a disposition of obedience in the heart. As the Spirit's promptings are heeded, the sinner will be led to awakening, conviction, repentance and saving faith. Fourth, there is a co-operation of divine grace and the human will. The Spirit operates with human co-operation or in accordance with the free will of men in securing compliance with the conditions of salvation. However, the Spirit's influence is inescapable. Men may resist the Spirit's influence, but they are unable to escape it. Fifth, salvation is completely of God's grace. Every movement of the soul Godward is initiated by divine grace and involves the co-operation of the human will. The grace of God is given to all men for the purpose of imparting salvation through Christ, but this grace may be resisted by the free will of man and rendered ineffectual.²⁴

Wiley further outlined the benefits which accrued to the race as a result of this free and unconditional gift of prevenient grace. This free gift preserves mankind from sinking below the possibility of redemption and brings about the reversal of the divine condemnation and the bestowal of a title to eternal life (Romans 5:12-21). The condemnation which rests upon the human race as a result of Adam's sin is arrested by Christ and changed into a conditional sentence (John 3:15-

²⁴Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 352-357.

21, 36; Romans 3:23-28; 4:24-25; 6:23). This free gift makes possible the restoration of the Holy Spirit to the race. The Spirit was the original bond of union between Adam and God before the fall. The absence of original righteousness after the fall was the result of the withdrawal of the Holy Spirit. However, because of Christ's atonement, prevenient grace restored the Spirit back to the race as the Spirit of awakening and conviction. These are the unconditional benefits purchased through Christ by the ministry of the Spirit in prevenient grace.²⁵ As a result of this universal atonement accomplished by Christ, there is this gift of grace through the Holy Spirit to all mankind. The free gift constitutes the basis of all salvation (Romans 5:16-18), and initiates all the steps in salvation--awakening, conviction, repentance and saving faith.²⁶

Therefore, the universal invitation through Christ to all men is what Wiley termed "repentance" (Matthew 9:13). By repentance he meant a state of godly sorrow for sin which leads to forsaking and turning away from sin (II Corinthians 7:10). Repentance presupposes man's depravity and the necessity of prevenient grace. The Spirit's work of conviction convinces men of their sinful condition and leads them to the awareness of Christ's free gift of prevenient grace which enables them to repent of their sins. Repentance is the result of this gracious work of the Holy Spirit (Romans 2:4), and involves contrition for sin which

²⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 134-136.

²⁶ H. Orton Wiley, "Some Aspects of Arminianism" (Part II), *The Nazarene Preacher*, 40:15, September, 1965.

is the Spirit directing the sinner into the moral consciousness of sin and God's attitude toward sin. The next resultant step in repentance is confession of sin in which the sinner accepts God's law and judgment of sin as being just. The sinner becomes convinced of his impotence and senses the utter helplessness of all hope in self for the present or future in dealing with sin. True repentance implies reformation, turning from sin to God and bringing forth fruit, meet for repentance. It is an act of the sinner in response to the conviction and appeals of the Spirit. The Spirit applies the salvation truth to the sinner's heart exposing sin and the everlasting wrath of God upon it, but the sinner must respond in resistance or acceptance. Consequently, repentance involves both the divine and human elements and is essential to salvation (Luke 13:3). The nature of sin as rebellion against God makes repentance a necessity because there cannot be salvation without a renunciation of sin. The sinner's experience of deliverance from sin is impossible without this act of repentance.²⁷

In Wiley's thinking, the result of true repentance is "saving faith." This saving faith is both the condition and the instrument of justification. It forms the link connecting prevenient grace and the initial state of salvation.²⁸ He concisely defined this faith as: "Saving faith is that act by which the prevenient grace of the Spirit passes over into the regenerate life of the believer."²⁹

Wiley analyzed this subject of saving faith by outlining some

²⁷Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 357-364.

²⁸Ibid., p. 364.

²⁹Ibid., p. 375.

basic presuppositions. He perceived both a divine and a human element in faith. Saving faith is a personal trust in the Person of the Saviour and involves that subjective and personal acceptance that Christ not only saves the world but also the individual sinner. This faith has a negative and positive aspect. In a negative sense, faith makes the soul empty, ready, and receptive to Jesus; in a positive way, faith becomes active, reaching forth with all the soul's power to embrace Jesus as a personal Saviour. Furthermore, faith is an act of the entire being under the influence of the Spirit. Saving faith is not just an intellectual assent to truth or the consenting of the will to an outward reformation. Rather, it is the work of the Spirit whereby the soul in firm reliance upon the atoning work of Jesus exercises a redeeming trust in God for personal salvation. The foundation of saving faith is based upon the truth revealed in the Word of God (Romans 1:16; 10:14, 15, 17; John 17:20; 20:31; II Thessalonians 2:13), and these divine promises are eternal and immutable. The Holy Spirit takes the Word of God and applies it to awaken, convict, and lead the soul to Christ. The operation of the Spirit in the sinner's life is the efficient cause of this faith. The instrumental cause is the revelation of truth concerning the individual sinner's need and possibility of salvation. Good works are vitally related to saving faith. Springing forth from the Spirit's work in prevenient grace will be good works which are performed according to God's will, wrought through the assistance of divine grace, and done for the glory of God (Ephesians 2:8; Galatians 3:6-15; James 2:8, 22, 26).³⁰

³⁰ Ibid., pp. 367-375.

Or as Wiley succinctly stated: "The act of faith by which man is saved, becomes the law of his being as saved; and hence good works flow from the principle of living faith."³¹

If the Holy Spirit's operations before conversion are calling, awakening, and the work of conviction, repentance, and leading into saving faith, Wiley believed that the Spirit's work at conversion is the subjective application of the redemptive work of Christ to men's lives. This need of the subjective application of Christ's atoning work to men's lives is underscored by the fact of sin. Wiley regarded the Genesis account of the fall of man from holiness and fellowship with God because of the heinousness of sin as an inspired record of historical facts (Genesis 3:1-24; II Corinthians 11:3; I Timothy 2:13, 14).³² Accordingly, the Bible connects the origin of sin with the abuse of freedom by free and intelligent creatures. Sin is due to the voluntary self-separation of man from God. Man as a self-conscious and self-determining person perverts himself by setting himself up in opposition to his Creator (Genesis 3).³³ Adam, the natural head and representative of the human race, involved all of his descendants in his act of sinful disobedience to God (Genesis 5:3; Romans 5:12-21). All men have sinned and exist under the penalty of divine wrath and condemnation (Romans 3:10, 23; 6:23). These two scriptural ideas, according to Wiley, are inseparable--the responsibility of the human race for the act of sin and the liability for the consequences of sin. Man sins because he is a

³¹ *Ibid.*, p. 375.

³² *Ibid.*, pp. 51-53.

³³ Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 73-76.

sinner; therefore, the subjective moral condition of man at birth in his natural state is that of depravity.³⁴

According to Wiley, the merits of Christ and the sin of Adam are to be regarded as coextensive with the righteous First (Christ) bringing about the reversal of the latter (Adam) (Romans 5:12-19). The redemption of Christ is not an afterthought created by Adam's apostasy; rather, redemption is God's provision from the foundation of the world (Ephesians 1:4, 5). When Adam fell from grace, he found God's justice tempered with mercy (Genesis 3:21; Romans 5:1-12).³⁵ This also involves Wiley's concept of "mitigation of inherited depravity." He taught that men are totally depraved through Adam, but this depravity is mitigated. It is mitigated by the atonement not in the sense of weakening it, but rather, that grace through Christ as free Gift is imparted by the Spirit to enable men to turn from depravity. In other words, through the initiation and assistance of the Spirit, all men have the privilege of being led from awakening, conviction, and repentance to saving faith. Grace is given by Christ through the Spirit to turn sinful men from this depraved condition to newness of life.³⁶

Closely related to Wiley's belief of mitigated depravity is his concise development of "voluntarily appropriated depravity." The universal atonement and the universal gift of grace provided by Christ for all men as a free gift delivers men from the guilt of inbred sin and brings every newborn child within the covenant of grace. As Wiley saw

³⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 119-134.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 133-134.

³⁶ Wiley, "Some Aspects of Arminianism" (Part II), pp. 15-16.

it, the church in the act of infant baptism testifies to this belief that a young child is in the covenant of grace; however, when a person comes to the age of responsibility and sins, then he brings upon himself by his voluntary act the guilt of inbred sin. This makes it obligatory that not only forgiveness of actual sins is needed, but also cleansing from all unrighteousness. Sin, whether in act or state, can never enter heaven.³⁷ As Wiley succinctly summarized:

*In infant baptism we testify to our belief that the child is in the covenant of grace. But when he comes to the age of responsibility, and sins, then he brings upon himself by his voluntary act the guilt of inbred sin. This makes it obligatory upon him, not only to be forgiven for his actual sins, but to be cleansed from all unrighteousness--for sin, either act or state (or condition), can never enter heaven. A child is in the covenant and sins out; /i.e., falls from the covenant's benefits\ and when he does so he becomes guilty, not only for his sinful acts, but for his sinful condition.*³⁸

*In other words, all men born into the world have a corrupt nature. They are far removed from original righteousness, averse to God, and inclined to evil, but men are not responsible for this depraved nature because of Christ's universal free gift given to all men to repent of sin. However, all men ratify this corrupt nature as their own when they reject God's provided remedy in the atoning blood of Christ to pardon and cleanse sin. Man voluntarily appropriates this depravity as his own.*³⁹

Wiley taught that the Spirit's work at conversion is turning souls from sin to salvation. He used the term "conversion" to express

³⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 16.

³⁸ *Ibid.*

³⁹ Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 137-140.

the initial state of salvation as including justification, regeneration and adoption in an undifferentiated manner.⁴⁰ Conversion in its truest scriptural meaning is the pivotal point wherein, through grace, the soul turns from sin and looks to Christ in order to receive regeneration.⁴¹

Basic to Wiley's understanding of the regenerating work of Christ is the agency of the Holy Spirit. The radical change of regeneration within man's moral and spiritual nature is wrought by this efficient Agent. Regeneration is an act of God and the means by which a soul is brought to Christ may vary, but the work itself is wrought solely by the direct, personal agency of the Spirit. The nature of regeneration indicates this. It is a divine new birth and not an act of human effort (Ephesians 2:8, 9); however, it is a divine act with human co-operation because the Spirit can exert His regenerating power only on conditions of repentance and faith. When the soul in co-operation with the Spirit turns to Christ in repentance and faith, the radical moral change becomes possible by the regenerating work of the Spirit.⁴²

At this point Wiley made a clarifying distinction. The Holy Spirit in His regenerating ministry employs the use of means (James 1:18). Regeneration is accomplished through the instrumentality of the Word. A theological error which is current in the church, he believed to be the teaching that the power of truth alone regenerates. It is not truth apart from the operation of the Spirit which regenerates, nor the action of the Spirit apart from and independent of the truth which

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 376-378.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p. 378.

⁴² *Ibid.*, pp. 418-424; cf., pp. 375-376.

regenerates. Rather, Scriptures teach that the Spirit uses the truth as the instrument in both regeneration and sanctification (Acts 16:14; Ephesians 6:17; I Peter 1:23; Hebrews 4:12).⁴³

Wiley further described the nature of this regenerating work of the Spirit. It is concomitant in experience with justification and adoption, but nevertheless, distinct from them. Justification is God's work done for us in the forgiveness of sins in a relational aspect. Regeneration is the actual infusion of life into souls dead in trespasses and sins or the renewal of the fallen nature through the bestowment of life on the basis of this justified relationship. Adoption deals with the restoration of the privileges of Christian sonship by virtue of the regenerating work of the Spirit. Therefore, the necessity of justification is to be ascertained in the fact of guilt. Regeneration is to be understood in the light of the fact of depravity. Adoption is to be viewed in relation to the loss of privilege of being a true son of God because of sin. While distinct in nature and perfect in their kind, nevertheless, these three are bestowed by the Spirit's agency in response to the same act of faith and consequently concomitant in personal experience.⁴⁴

Regeneration in its larger relations involves the whole Trinity in the administration of redemption. According to Wiley, each Person of the Holy Trinity is vitally involved. God the Father is the pattern of all true paternity (Romans 5:6-8; 8:32; Ephesians 2; II Peter 3:9; James 1:18; John 3:15-21; I John 4:9-20), and the Father's relation to His

⁴³ Ibid., pp. 422-423.

⁴⁴ Ibid., pp. 420-422.

eternal Son, in a sense, becomes the type of His relation to His created sons (John 1:12-14; Acts 4:12; 10:43; 16:31; Romans 5). The Divine Logos or God the Son provides the medium and the life through which souls dead in sin are regenerated (Luke 19:10; John 1:4-5, 9, 10, 27-29; I John 3:1-10; 5:10-12; Romans 5; cf., I Corinthians 15:22-28; I Timothy 2:5, 6; Hebrews 2:9; 7:25). The Holy Spirit imparts the life of Christ to the souls of men (John 3:6; 6:63; 14:26; 15:22-27; 16:7-14; Romans 8:9, 14, 16; I Corinthians 2:9-16; 6:19, 20), and in the truest and deepest sense is the Lord and Giver of life. Regeneration, then, makes the personal knowledge of God possible to mankind. The regenerated person experiences a change of a moral and spiritual quality which becomes the ground of a new personal relationship with God. This spiritual life communicated by the Spirit is a reproduction of the life of Christ in man. When a man becomes a partaker of this divine nature imparted by the Spirit, he learns through experience the kind of Person God really is. It is only through the character and quality of the life given by the Spirit in regeneration that men can have a positive acquaintance with God. Regeneration is vitally related to the revelation of God in Christ. In Jesus Christ the supreme revelation of God is seen, and in the Son's life, death, and ministry, the life and truth of God become accessible to men (John 1:14; Philippians 2:5-11). The gospel is more than just a system of ideas; it is Christ, the Source and Reality of all life and truth (Colossians 3:4; John 14:6). Christ must become more than an intellectual investigation because a man must possess by saving

faith a Christ-and-I relationship (II Corinthians 4:3, 4; 5:17). Regeneration is related to the enabling power and presence of the Holy Spirit, because no person can live the regenerated life apart from the Holy Spirit. The Spirit as Revealer reproduces the life of Christ in the regenerate, and is the Agent of enabling grace. The Spirit not only imparts Christ's regenerating life, but also Christ's power to live daily, free from the bondage of sin and always to triumph in Christ (I John 5:4).⁴⁵

Related to regeneration is the "witness of the Spirit." By this, Wiley meant the inward evidence of acceptance with God which the Holy Spirit reveals directly to the believer's consciousness. This doctrine of the witness of the Spirit was revived by John Wesley and his coadjutors. Within the Old Testament, there are illustrations of men who enjoyed this witness. There is the record of Abel (Hebrews 11:4), Knoch (Hebrews 11:5), Job (Job 19:25), David (Psalm 32:5; 103:1, 3, 12), Isaiah (Isaiah 6:7), and Daniel (Daniel 9:23). The New Testament also abounds with references to this teaching (cf., Acts 2:46; 8:39; 15:8, 9; 16:34).⁴⁶

Basic to Wiley's teaching of Christian assurance is his understanding of the two-fold witness of the Spirit as direct witness and an indirect witness. By the direct witness, he meant the witness of the divine Spirit to the believer's soul imparting assurance of Christian sonship. This witness of the divine Spirit is the inward impression on

⁴⁵Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 424-428.

⁴⁶Ibid., pp. 431-433.

the soul produced directly by the Spirit witnessing to the believer that he is a child of God. The value of absolute certainty in matters relating to the eternal salvation of the soul cannot be overestimated. This is why God has given His Spirit so that believers through Him may know the things that are freely given by God. By the indirect witness, he referred to the witness of the believer's own spirit to the fact of Christian sonship. This witness of the soul's own spirit consists of the consciousness that individually he possesses the character of a child of God. It is the witness or testimony of a good conscience toward God and results from reason and reflection on the moral change seen after conversion (II Corinthians 5:17). This witness is a subjective conclusion drawn partly from the Word of God and observation of personal Christian experience and refers to the immediate fruit of the Spirit possessing the believer's life. This indirect witness of the Spirit supplements and is confirmatory to the direct witness of the Spirit (I John 4:19); however, since filial love springs from the knowledge of filial relationships, the direct witness of the Spirit must precede the indirect witness. These two witnesses cannot exist without each other, and together, no higher evidences exist for authentic Christian experience. This full assurance of spiritual certainty is the common privilege of every Christian and none ought to rest short of his high calling in Christ Jesus (Colossians 2:2; Hebrews 6:11; 10:22).⁴⁷

The Holy Spirit's ministry after conversion also entails His work in and through the church. Wiley was committed to the belief that

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 431-439.

the work of the Spirit demands an objective economy. This new economy or sphere in which the Spirit presently works is the mystical body of Christ or the church. Created by the advent of the historical Christ and preserved by the perpetual indwelling of the Holy Spirit, the church represents a new order of spiritual life on earth. It is the sphere of the Spirit's operations, and the organ of Christ's administration of redemption. The church as a corporate body was founded by Christ and is invested with the attributes which are representative of His agency among men. The church of Christ is an assembly of called-out ones and is made up of the divinely adopted sons of God (John 1:12-14). This assembly of believers is more than a mere human organization. It is a living body with Christ as its Head. From Christ, His mystical body receives its life through the indwelling Spirit and performs the functions of being an institute of worship and a depository of the faith. As the body of Christ, it constitutes a mystical extension of His nature and requires its members to be partakers of His nature.⁴⁸

As Wiley summarized it:

*The relation between Christ and the Church is organic. As such, it embodies and affords on earth, the conditions under which, and by means of which, the Holy Spirit supernaturally extends to men, the redemptive work of Christ. In it and from it, Christ communicates to the membership of this body, the quickening and sanctifying offices of the Holy Spirit, for the extension of His work among men.*⁴⁹

Pentecost as the birthday of the Christian church, placed the Christian community under the jurisdiction of the Holy Spirit, who

⁴⁸ Wiley, Christian Theology, III, p. 103.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

represents the invisible Head of a body now visible. This community of believers is the creation of the Holy Spirit. Presently, the Spirit is administering the life of Christ to His church and at conversion makes believers members of Christ's spiritual body. In an active aspect, the church is the body of Christ or the organ of His manifestation in the world (Ephesians 5:23-33). In a passive aspect, it is the temple of the Holy Spirit, or the sphere of worship (Ephesians 2:21, 22; I Corinthians 6:15, 19; I Peter 2:5). The Spirit is actively present in the church through the mediatorship of Christ. As the Spirit dwelled in Jesus without measure, so the church as Christ's body is the temple of the Spirit, possessing spiritual life and power communicated to it through its living Head. As Christ is the image of the invisible God, likewise the church is to be the image of the invisible Christ through the agency of the Spirit (Ephesians 5:22-23; I John 3:1-3). Therefore, within the church is embodied the truth and conditions under which the Holy Spirit extends to all men the redemptive work of Christ.⁵⁰

After conversion, the Spirit also works through the means of grace. By the "means of grace," Wiley meant those divinely appointed channels through which the influences of the Holy Spirit are communicated to the souls of men. This includes the Word of God and prayer as the universal means of grace, and the fellowship of the saints and the sacraments as the economic means of grace.⁵¹

Within the structure of Wiley's thoughts after conversion, he included his teaching of "progressive sanctification." In ascertaining

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 107-111.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 150-151.

his view of progressive sanctification, his differentiation of the term sanctification is to be understood. First, he spoke of "initial sanctification" or "partial sanctification." By this term, he meant the work of divine grace which accompanies the other concomitant blessings of justification, regeneration, and adoption which made up conversion as a first work of grace. Initial sanctification refers to the cleansing from guilt and acquired depravity, as relating to actual sins, for which the sinner is himself responsible at conversion. It refers in its scope to all that acquired pollution which results from the sinner's own acts before conversion, and speaks of the Spirit's sanctifying work in the beginning stages of conversion.⁵² "Entire sanctification" is defined by Wiley as the instantaneous work of the Spirit subsequent to regeneration by which believers are made free from original sin, or depravity, and brought into a spiritual state of entire devotement to God and the holy obedience of love made perfect.⁵³ By "progressive sanctification," he meant the temporal aspect of the work of grace in the heart, as it takes place in successive stages. More specifically, progressive sanctification refers to the Spirit's gradual work, both preceding and following the act of God by which believers are sanctified wholly. As an instantaneous act, sanctification cleanses from all sin and brings the believer to a place of obedience. Walking in the light of spiritual obedience both before and after entire sanctification makes the believer

⁵²Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 476, 480-481.

⁵³Ibid., pp. 466-469, 474-478, 479-481.

a recipient of progressive or continuous sanctification" (I John 1:7).⁵⁴ Wiley carried back his definition of progressive sanctification to include the Spirit's preparatory ministry in awakening the hearts of sinners for conversions.⁵⁵

The Holy Spirit's Work At and
After the Baptism with the
Holy Spirit

As already noted, Wiley maintained a differentiation between the birth of the Spirit and the baptism of the Spirit. By the birth of the Spirit he meant the impartation of new life into the soul at regeneration in response to saving faith exercised in the atonement of Jesus Christ. Jesus spoke of this regenerated life as a birth from above (John 3:3-7). The regenerate receives the witness of the Spirit to adoption (Romans 8:15-17), but, even though he possesses new spiritual life and is a child of God, there still remains in the soul the presence of the carnal mind or inbred sin which hinders entering into the full New Testament privileges found in Christ (Romans 8:1-13; I Corinthians 3:1-3; James 1:8; 4:8). The way of deliverance from this inbred sin and the spiritual doubleminded condition is by submission to the baptism of Jesus. By Jesus' baptism, he meant the baptism with the Holy Spirit which purifies the believer's heart from all sin (I John 1:7, 9; 3:3; 4:17, 18), and inducts newborn individuals into the full privileges of

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 479-486; cf., William Burt Pope, A Compendium of Christian Theology Being Analytical Outlines of a Course of Theological Study, Biblical, Dogmatic, Historical, III (New York: Phillips and Hunt, 1882), pp. 28-99.

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 481-483.

the New Covenant (Hebrews 10:16-18).⁵⁶

Therefore, according to Wiley, the Spirit's baptism cannot take place at the birth of the Spirit. He taught there are two levels of Christian experience. The first level is characterized by life (Ephesians 2:1-9) which is given at regeneration or the new birth. This life is a holy life embracing all the graces of the Spirit and manifesting itself in love to God and man, but it is implanted in a soul which is infected with a depraved nature called inbred sin or the carnal mind. The second level of Christian experience may be summed up as love (I John 4:17-18), or the level of Christian experience where perfect love casts out the fear which produces spiritual torment and instability. This purification of the heart from the carnal mind follows a testing time after conversion to see whether or not the newborn soul will gladly and willingly surrender all to obtain the fullness of this blessing. The experience of perfect love is always wrought by grace alone and through the atoning blood of Jesus and the sanctifying power of the Holy Spirit (Acts 15:8, 9).⁵⁷ The first level of Christian experience resulting in life and the remission of sins, he called the "initial blessing" of the covenant of grace. The latter level of Christian experience which results in the writing of God's law upon the hearts and minds of His people and accomplishes the destruction of the carnal mind through the baptism with the Spirit he called the "central blessing" of the covenant.⁵⁸

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 322-324.

⁵⁷ Wiley, *The Epistle to the Hebrews*, pp. 31-32.

⁵⁸ H. Orton Wiley, *God Has the Answer* (Kansas City: Beacon Hill,

Moreover, this baptism with the Spirit is subsequent to the new birth; however, the birth of the Spirit is not to be considered an imperfect work. Rather, as the operation of the Spirit in bestowing divine life, it is complete in itself and the beginning of sanctification which comes to its perfection in entire sanctification. It is the beginning of sanctification in the sense that life bestowed in the new birth is a holy life. Regeneration can be classified as incomplete only in the sense that it is a part of the grace embraced in the New Covenant. However, God does not justify and entirely sanctify by a single work of grace. The Word of God reveals that sinners are to be converted (Ephesians 2:1-9) and Christians are to be entirely sanctified (Romans 12:1, 2; I Corinthians 3:1-3; Ephesians 5:18; James 1:8; 4:8). Furthermore, sinners are generally incapable of realizing their need of the Spirit's baptism. Those seeking the new birth are preoccupied with personal guilt and condemnation and their need for forgiveness of sins. Later, they become aware of the need for the Spirit's cleansing power and presence. Moreover, spiritual life must be imparted before the soul can perceive the necessity of the Spirit's baptism. The new birth and entire sanctification deal with different phases of sin. The former deals with sins committed or sins as an act; while the latter deals with sin inherited or sin as a principle. It is impossible to experience the latter without first experiencing the former. Wiley believed the elapse of time between these two works of grace depends completely upon the individual soul. Any delay beyond the necessary time to learn the

1956), pp. 81-82; cf., Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 137-140.

nature and conditions for attainment of the Spirit's baptizing presence is due to human weakness because God's time is the present. Furthermore, some through spiritual obedience to the Spirit's leadership enter the sanctified experience without a clear theological understanding of it.⁵⁹

Wiley outlined some basic definitions concerning the Spirit's work in the baptism with the Spirit. Basically, he understood the baptism with the Spirit and the consequent fullness of the Spirit as the means by which entire sanctification is wrought.⁶⁰ By the term "holiness," he meant man's moral or religious state; while the term "sanctification" meant the act by which man is made holy.⁶¹ He made a clarifying distinction between "entire sanctification" and "Christian perfection." By the first, he referred more to the aspect of cleansing from sin or making holy, and by this term emphasizes the act of cleansing. In contrast, he understood Christian perfection as emphasizing the standard secured to the believer by the atoning work of Jesus Christ, and with this term underscores the state of cleansing.⁶²

This baptism with the Spirit in a broad sense is twofold. Viewed in a negative sense, it is a purification from sin. Original sin must be viewed in its twofold aspect. Sin must be viewed in its influence upon the whole human race and also in its infection within

⁵⁹Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 470-478; cf., pp. 445-449.

⁶⁰Ibid., pp. 323-324, 466-469; cf., Wiley, The Epistle to the Hebrews, pp. 203, 417-419; cf., Purkiser, Sanctification and Its Synonyms, pp. 25-37; cf., William Greathouse, The Fullness of the Spirit (Kansas City: Nazarene Publishing House, 1958), pp. 81-86.

⁶¹Ibid., p. 464.

⁶²Ibid., p. 496.

individuals who compose the human race. It has a generic influence and an individual influence. In the generic sense, original sin will not be abolished until the time of the restoration of all things. Until such time, something of sin's penalty remains with the liability to temptation and susceptibility to fall which is consistent with a probationary state. Original sin viewed in its individualized sense is the carnal mind or the principle in man which has actual affinity with the acts of transgressions. This principle of sin is to be abolished by the purifying work of the Holy Spirit and to be kept pure by His indwelling Presence. According to Scripture, the extent of this cleansing is to include the complete removal of all sin. Wiley strongly advocated that this carnal mind must be cleansed thoroughly, purged, extirpated, and crucified (Galatians 2:20). He taught that any theory which makes a place for keeping inbred sin is unscriptural. He rejected the theories which teach the carnal mind is to be repressed, suppressed, counteracted, or made void. The cleansing power of Christ avails to completely remove all sin (I John 1:7, 9; Romans 6:6; 8:7, 13; II Corinthians 7:1; Titus 2:14; Ephesians 5:26; Hebrews 10:14; James 4:8; Galatians 5:24; 6:14; I Peter 1:22).⁶³

The baptism with the Holy Spirit is also to be viewed in a positive sense. It is an infilling of divine love or a positive devotion to God. The sanctifying presence of the Spirit not only makes possible a separation from sin but also a separation to God. This devotement to God is more than just human consecration to God. It

⁶³ Ibid., pp. 324, 487-496.

represents the Spirit's acceptance of the soul's consecration which results in a divine empowering or enduement. It is a divine possession resulting in holy love springing forth in spiritual devotement. This purity and perfect love constitute the state of holiness where the believer hates whatever a holy God forbids. It is the spiritual state of hatred of sin and love of holiness. It is a readjustment and renovation of man's whole nature filling it with love of righteousness. Therefore, the baptism with the Spirit is characterized in a negative sense as a purification from sin and in a positive sense as a full devotement to God.⁶⁴

Closely related to the second work of grace is the anointing and sealing ministry of the Holy Spirit. The anointing of the Spirit refers to the positive phase of the indwelling Spirit as empowering the believers for life and service. All sanctified believers have the Comforter as an ever-present Helper to confer authority and to supply the needed power for the accomplishment of every divinely appointed task (John 14:17; I John 2:20-28). The sealing with the Spirit refers to the seal of God's ownership and approval (II Timothy 2:19). This seal of the Spirit is given to sanctified believers for their present enjoyment until the end of this age as an earnest or guaranty of future perfection (Ephesians 1:13, 14).⁶⁵

Speaking of the birth of the Spirit, the baptism with the Spirit, and the anointing and sealing with the Spirit, Wiley made this

⁶⁴Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 491-496.

⁶⁵*Ibid.*, pp. 324-326.

clarifying differentiation:

In this connection, also, it may be well to note the close relation which the work of the Spirit bears to that of Christ. These four administrative acts belong at once to Christ and to the Spirit. It is Christ who quickens dead souls into life by the Spirit; it is Christ who baptizes men and women with the Holy Spirit; and it is Christ, also, who both anoints and seals His people with the Spirit.⁶⁶

There are some misconceptions envisioned by Wiley which are often associated with the baptism with the Spirit or Christian perfection. It is not absolute perfection because this belongs only to God (Matthew 19:17). Christian or evangelical perfection is a derived or relative perfection. It is not angelic perfection or the goodness possessed by angels, neither is it the receiving of Adamic perfection or the spiritual perfection shared by Adam before his sinful disobedience in the pristine state. The Spirit's cleansing is not a perfection in knowledge. Not only is man's will perverted and his affections alienated by the fall, but his intellect is darkened. Defective understanding as one of the results of the fall contributes to erroneous opinions and leads to false judgments. Furthermore, this Spirit-filled experience is not immunity from temptation or the susceptibility to sin. Temptation is essential to man's present probationary state and not removed by the baptism with the Spirit. These are all misconceptions which Wiley wanted to eliminate from the minds of honest hearts.⁶⁷

In seeking the experience of the baptism with the Spirit, Wiley advocated these pointers. One needs to be convinced of the Scriptural bases for Christian purity. A careful study of Holy Scripture taught:

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 326.

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 497-498.

God wills His people to be holy (Ephesians 5:17, 18; I Thessalonians 4:3; Hebrews 10:10). God promises to sanctify His people (Isaiah 1:18; Ezekiel 36:25; II Corinthians 7:1; Malachi 3:2, 3; Matthew 3:11, 12), and God commands His people to be holy (I Peter 1:16; Leviticus 19:2; Genesis 17:1; Mark 12:30; Deuteronomy 30:6; Romans 5:5).⁶⁸

He explained that entire sanctification is also applied to the believer's soul through divinely appointed means and agencies. The originating cause of this experience is the love of God (I John 4:10); the meritorious or procuring cause is the blood of Jesus Christ (I John 1:7); the efficient cause or agency is the Holy Spirit (Titus 3:5; I Peter 1:2; II Thessalonians 2:13); the instrumental cause for cleansing is truth (John 17:17; Romans 10:17; I Peter 1:22; I John 2:5), the conditional cause or proximate cause is the believer's exercising of faith (Acts 15:9; 26:18).⁶⁹

Therefore, the baptism with the Holy Spirit is to be sought only by regenerated believers, and the seekers must be convinced of the scriptural foundation for seeking this experience. One must be aware that it is provided for in the blood of Jesus Christ and that He is able to sanctify the trusting soul. The believer must understand that it is preceded by prayer and entire consecration. The thirsty soul must seek the experience now and understand it is wrought instantaneously by faith. The believer should exercise sanctifying faith until the witness

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 442-445.

⁶⁹ Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 478-479.

of the Spirit is received that the work of cleansing is done.⁷⁰

The Spirit's work after the baptism with the Spirit is a witnessing ministry that the sanctifying work is done. It is the uniform testimony of those who believe and teach the Wesleyan doctrine of Christian holiness that the Spirit bears witness to His purifying work in entire sanctification exactly as He bears witness in Christian sonship.⁷¹ The religious evidence of the sanctified heart is based upon the testimony of consciousness or the testimony of the believer's own spirit (indirect witness) and also the direct positive testimony of the witnessing Spirit (direct witness).⁷²

The sanctified Christian is not a person who has arrived at the ultimate in spiritual truths. The holy heart is the fundamental condition for holy living (Ephesians 2:10), but the heart still needs the progressive sanctifying work of the Holy Spirit in the daily life. This baptism with the Spirit requires a relationship maintained by faith to the atoning blood of Christ for continuous cleansing and the preservation of purity and holiness. The Spirit's ministry in the believer's life not only includes the instantaneous cleansing through the blood of Christ, but also, the continuous cleansing of all who walk in obedience to the Spirit's checks and leadings (I John 1:7). This certainly includes all the ethical relationships which are assigned by Wiley to

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 466-467, 511-514.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 514-517; cf., John Wesley, A Plain Account of Christian Perfection (rpt. London: Epworth Press, 1960), pp. 76-77.

⁷² *Ibid.*, pp. 467, 514-517.

believers in Christ.⁷³ Therefore, after the purifying work of Christ within believers' lives, the Spirit leads in living out the ethical implications which result from this imparted life of holiness.⁷⁴

Wiley also touched upon the Keswick and third blessing theories of the baptism with the Spirit. The Keswick movement does emphasize the necessity of an appropriation by faith and the power of God through Christ for both holy living and Christian service. He thought that the Keswick believers generally regard the baptism with the Holy Spirit as an endowment for service subsequent to conversion. However, this Keswick interpretation of the baptism with the Spirit in the strict sense is not a work of grace because the Keswicks hold there is no actual cleansing from inbred sin. As he understood it, they view inbred sin as part of the believer's humiliation which necessitates continuous suppression until delivered from this defilement. Within Keswick doctrine, the baptism with the Spirit counteracts the carnal mind and assists the believer in repressing the manifestations of inbred sin. As Wiley saw it, the problem with the Keswick view is that the power of the carnal mind is broken but not dethroned and cleansed as Wesleyanism maintains. He believed the Keswick view of the baptism with the Spirit is what Wesleyans teach takes place at conversion.⁷⁵

Wiley further taught that Wesleyanism needs equally to be

⁷³ *Ibid.*, pp. 479-486.

⁷⁴ Wiley, *Christian Theology*, III, pp. 7-100.

⁷⁵ Wiley, *Christian Theology*, II, pp. 462-463; cf., H. Orton Wiley, "Some Aspects of Arminianism" (Part I), *The Nazarene Preacher*, 40:34, August, 1965.

guarded from the erroneous third blessing theory. This view regards entire sanctification solely as a work of cleansing. They believe the baptism with the Holy Spirit is to follow entire sanctification as the added gift of power.⁷⁶

Concerning the baptism with the Spirit, Wiley imparted these summary words of caution:

This purifying of the heart from sin and the writings of the law of God within it is a conscious, personal experience, wrought in the soul by the Holy Spirit. But we do not rest in the experience; we rest in God, whom the experience of heart purity has enabled us to see, and with whom the indwelling Spirit of holiness brings us into conscious fellowship. Thus the heart so purified and renewed becomes the presence chamber of God, whom alone we worship and serve.⁷⁷

THE HOLY SPIRIT AS GIVER OF GIFTS

Nature of the Spirit's Gifts

In order to correctly ascertain Wiley's view of spiritual gifts, his interpretation of the church has to be comprehended. As already observed, the Spirit's ministry necessitates an objective sphere. This new mode of operation or function through which the Spirit presently carries on His ministry under the New Covenant is the church. The church is both the sphere of the Spirit's ministry and the organ of Christ's administration of redemption. The church is the corporate body founded by the historical Christ and invested through the agency of the Spirit with scriptural characteristics and tests through which it is

⁷⁶ Ibid., p. 496; cf., W.T. Purkiser, Conflicting Concepts of Holiness (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1953), pp. 63-81.

⁷⁷ Wiley, The Epistle to the Hebrews, p. 274.

representative of Christ among men. Consequently, the church's unity centers in Christ (John 17:21; Ephesians 4:3-8). Its growth is accomplished through the truth of Christ administered by the agency of the Spirit (Ephesians 4:15, 16), and the church's spiritual mission succeeds only through the various gifts and ministries which the ascended Christ bestows upon it through the agency of the Spirit (Ephesians 4:7-16).⁷⁸

In Wiley's thinking, there is a close relationship between the Holy Spirit's ministry and Christ's Headship and atoning work of His church. The Spirit was the Agent who formed the church at Pentecost. This He accomplished through the giving of a new law to be written upon the hearts and minds of the redeemed. Those believers who possess the divine law written upon their hearts and minds constitute Christ's church. As a natural body possesses common life that binds its physical members together in a common organism, likewise, the Spirit places these believers in Christ's church as it pleases Him. The Spirit unites them into a single organism under Christ the living Head. God never creates men to be a string of isolated souls; rather, God intends that all men be an interrelated society of mutually dependent individuals under Christ's Headship. Christ's purpose is not just the salvation of the individual, but also the building up of His church as a spiritual organism of interrelated and redeemed persons (I Peter 2:9, 10). It is an organic union of all Christian believers under Christ's Headship made possible through the agency of the Spirit; however, the church is not merely an independent creation of the Spirit. The church is an

⁷⁸Wiley, Christian Theology, III, pp. 103-117; cf., pp. 118-208.

enlargement of the incarnate life of Christ. Christ is the first begotten from the dead (Revelation 1:5; Romans 1:4; Colossians 1:15) and because of this, He is the seed (Hebrews 2:16) from which the church grows through the ministry of the Spirit. Christ as the last Adam is made a quickening Spirit (I Corinthians 15:45-47). By virtue of His death and resurrection a new humanity is created free from sin and accessible to a new and living way into the presence of God (Hebrews 10:19-22). Christ, as the Head of this redeemed humanity, carries on His work through the ministry of the Spirit.⁷⁹

Wiley concisely summarized this close relationship between the ascended Christ, His church, and the Holy Spirit when he said:

The Holy Spirit is therefore not only the bond which unites the individual soul to Christ in a vital and holy relationship; but He is the common bond which unites the members of the body to each other, and all to their living Head. The Spirit is the life of the body, and since His inauguration at Pentecost, has His "See" or seat within the church.⁸⁰

Within this context of the Spirit's ministry in and through Christ's church, Wiley proclaimed his interpretation of spiritual gifts. The Holy Spirit is both Gift and Giver. He is the Gift of the glorified Christ to the church and perpetually abides within it as the creating and energizing Presence. Since Pentecost, the Spirit is the Executive of the Godhead on earth and the Agent of both the Father and Son in whom these members of the Godhead reside (John 14:23) and through whom men have access to God. As Christ is the Advocate at the right hand of the

⁷⁹Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 329-331.

⁸⁰Ibid., p. 330; cf., Wiley, The Epistle to the Hebrews, pp. 395-398.

Father (I John 2:2, 3; Hebrews 7:19-8:7), likewise, the Spirit is the Advocate within the church (Romans 8:12-27; I Corinthians 2:2-16) mediated through Christ the living Head (Ephesians 1:5, 6). However, the Spirit as Administrator of redemption is also the Giver of spiritual gifts. These gifts are the divinely ordained means and powers with which Christ endows His church for the purpose of enabling it to properly carry on its work on earth. Accordingly, Wiley taught these gifts are personal endowments for specific vocations which are necessary for the fulfillment of Christ's commission to His church (I Corinthians 12:8-11; Ephesians 4:11; Romans 12:6-8). They are supernatural endowments for Christian service and the nature of the ministry to be fulfilled determines which gift the Spirit bestows (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). Without the proper functioning of the Spirit's gifts, it is impossible for the church to succeed in her spiritual mission.⁸¹

In explaining the nature of the Spirit's gifts, Wiley outlined several clarifying distinctives. According to him, these spiritual gifts are to be distinguished from natural gifts or endowments. The relationship between natural gifts and spiritual gifts may be close, but even though the gifts of the Spirit function through natural gifts, the Spirit's gifts transcend those natural gifts. These gifts of the Spirit even transcend sanctified human powers. The strength of the church does not rest in sanctified hearts, but rather, in the Person who dwells in the hearts of the sanctified. Wiley's focus was not so much on the sanctified believer as it was upon the Holy Spirit's cleansing and

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 315-321.

indwelling ministry within the believer and the church. He rightly concluded that it is the indwelling Spirit who divides to every man as He will (I Corinthians 12:11, 18) and pours His own energy into the organism of Christ's church. He advocated a God-centered view of spiritual gifts within the context of the church. Moreover, not all the members of Christ's church are similarly endowed. He believed the New Testament taught that not all members were apostles, prophets, teachers, and workers of miracles (I Corinthians 12:29, 30). Also, this diversity of the gifts is seen in the New Testament listing of nine spiritual gifts: wisdom, knowledge, faith, miracles, healing, prophecy, discernment of spirits, tongues, interpretation of tongues (I Corinthians 12:7-11). In the distribution of these spiritual gifts, the Spirit takes into account the ability of the sanctified nature and its capacity to receive and function spiritually. The energizing power for effective Christian service is not by the natural gifts alone, rather it is the empowering presence of the indwelling Spirit (Ephesians 1:19).⁸²

Wiley further explained that these gifts of the Spirit take their character from the positions which the various individual members occupy within the mystical body of Christ. He believed the Apostle Paul compared the church as a spiritual organism to the natural human body with its many and varied members (I Corinthians 12). In the same way that the functions of the various members of the physical body are determined by the nature of the organs, such as the eye for seeing and the ear for hearing, so it is in the body of Christ. The same Spirit

⁸² *Ibid.*, pp. 317-320.

who creates the spiritual body (Christ's church) also creates through Christ's atoning benefits the various members who compose that body (I Corinthians 12:14). In the same way that God created the physical body as it pleased Him, the Spirit creates the spiritual body of Christ's church as He will (I Corinthians 12:11, 18). Therefore, spiritual gifts are divine bestowments upon individual members which determine their role or function within the body of Christ. Consequently, the eye of Christ's body cannot say to the hand of His body that there is no need of the latter. There is to be no schism in His body and the members should exercise care for one another through the unifying and indwelling Holy Spirit (I Corinthians 12:20-27). Where there are divisions and schisms dividing Christ's body, the Apostle Paul classified them as carnal Christians (I Corinthians 3:1-6) and not possessed by the unifying and indwelling Holy Spirit.⁸³

Wiley continued his interpretation by stating that spiritual gifts are exercised in conjunction with, and not apart from, the body of Christ. The human body is incapable of functioning through maimed or lifeless members and cannot exist separated from the physical body. Neither does God bestow extraordinary gifts upon men to be administered by mere human volition and used for self-glory and aggrandisement. The true gifts of the Spirit are exercised as functions of Christ's body and always under the administration of the one Lord through the agency of the Holy Spirit. The distribution of spiritual gifts are always within

⁸³Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 319-320; cf., Wiley, God Has the Answer, pp. 82-86.

the context of the church and the sovereign will and purpose of the Holy Spirit.⁸⁴

Wiley indicated that these gifts of the Spirit are essential to the spiritual progress of Christ's church. As divine enduements for Christian service in Christ's body, the distribution of these gifts within the church is necessary for its spiritual mission to be carried forward. As physical ends and intellectual attainments are accomplished by physical means and mental effort, likewise, the church's spiritual mission can be accomplished only by spiritual means. This necessitates the gifts of the Spirit always being latent in the church.⁸⁵

Closely related to Wiley's teaching of the gifts of the Spirit was his viewpoint of the "extraordinary and transitional ministry" within the church (Ephesians 4:11). This category included: apostles, prophets, and evangelists. The church was founded by a special divinely chosen and qualified body of men. Their ministry was transitional, continuing for a short time with extraordinary ministrations of the Holy Spirit for the purpose of bringing the old covenant to its consummation in the service of the new covenant. First were the apostles who came under this category and were commissioned by Christ in person to bear witness to His miracles and His resurrection. Their mission through their witness was to establish the broad foundation of the church in doctrine and practice. To accomplish this mission, they were endowed with the gift of inspiration and given the gift of miracle-working power. Secondly, the prophets are appropriate for this category also. In some

⁸⁴Ibid., p. 320.

⁸⁵Ibid., p. 321.

instances, this includes those who foretold the future (Acts 11:28; 21:10, 11), but this office generally refers to that group of extraordinary teachers who were endowed by the Spirit for the purpose of establishing the churches in the truth until these believers received qualified and permanent instructors. Like the apostles, those prophets spoke under the immediate inspiration of the Spirit. They uttered the truth immediately revealed to them for the instruction of the whole church. From First Corinthians, Wiley believed it was evident this gift is exercised by both men and women occasionally, and frequently exercised in the congregation (Acts 21:9; I Corinthians 14:24, 25, 29-33, 37). He taught that the Apostle Paul defined this gift as speaking to men for their edification, exhortation, and comfort (I Corinthians 14:3). The apostle assigned a high prerogative to this office by asserting that the church is built upon the witness of the apostles and prophets (Ephesians 2:20; cf., 3:5); however, this office was only a foundational ministry and transitory. In the sense of it being a proclamation of truth, it remains in the church in the form of a regular ministry. Lastly, the evangelists were assistants to the apostles and performed the offices of preaching and founding churches. Their power was a delegated authority given by the apostles to whom they were amenable. Timothy and Titus were examples of this office. The evangelists were given the power to ordain bishops ("elders") but not authority to ordain their successors. Therefore, Wiley advocated that this office of the evangelist be regarded as temporary. This office passed away with the apostolate upon which it depended. However, these evangelists also had the gift of prophecy (I Timothy 1:18; 4:14). According to Wiley, this office of the

evangelist was not only related to the prophets, but also formed the transition to the regular and permanent ministry appointed by the Spirit for the care of the church. This meant the office of evangelist formed the transitional bridge into the permanent order of pastors and teachers embracing both the administrative and instructional functions of the church.⁸⁶

Although Wiley delineated the nature of the gifts of the Spirit in general terms, he did explain in more detail some of the individual gifts. He talked in more specific terms on the gift of prophecy. He believed the primary meaning of prophecy is "forth-telling."⁸⁷ Speaking of the New Testament church, he outlined its gift of prophecy as preaching God's message to the people with the attestation of divine power. This gift is the utterance of the divine voice within, resulting in speaking in the demonstration and power of the Spirit as a means of communicating truth to others. The church as a body of people indwelt by the Spirit, exercises this gift in speaking to others under His inspiration (Acts 2:37; cf., I Corinthians 2:4-16).⁸⁸

Wiley summarized this gift by saying:

True prophecy is the manifestation of the Spirit's presence and life within. It is the outgoing, the outflow of the life within. It is a communication of the truth to others in demonstration of the Spirit and power.⁸⁹

⁸⁶Wiley, *Christian Theology*, III, pp. 130-132.

⁸⁷Wiley, *Christian Theology*, I, p. 157.

⁸⁸Wiley, *The Harps of God*, pp. 36-38.

⁸⁹*Ibid.*, p. 39.

Wiley also more fully explained the gift of tongues. Speaking of this gift of tongues at Pentecost, he pointed out that this inaugural sign was the gift which marked the Spirit's coming and the actual beginning of the Spirit's operations in and through the proclamation of the gospel. This gift at Pentecost through the miraculous operation of the Holy Spirit enabled the disciples to declare the wondrous good news of God in such a manner that representatives from the various nations heard the message in their own languages. Therefore, Wiley concluded the nature of this gift of tongues is a rational utterance or an intelligible language.⁹⁰

Concisely stated, his position on the gift of tongues is:

It may and often does signify an ecstatic utterance, but never a mere jargon of sounds without coherence or intelligibility. The Church has always maintained that the true interpretation of the phenomena of Pentecost is that the "other tongues" referred to the miraculous gift of "divers languages."⁹¹

Permanence or Cessation of the Gifts

Wiley believed in the permanence of spiritual gifts. The gifts of the Spirit are essential for the spiritual progress of the church. From this, Wiley concluded the gifts of the Spirit are always latent in the church. These gifts did not cease with the age of the apostles, but are available to the church in every age for the purpose of advancing the Christian gospel.⁹²

⁹⁰Wiley, Christian Theology, II, p. 314; cf., Norman R. Oke, Facing the Tongues Issue (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1973), pp. 9-39.

⁹¹Ibid., pp. 314-315.

⁹²Ibid., p. 321.

Wiley taught that within Christ's church there is a continuous need for the permanence of the Spirit's gifts. These spiritual gifts are to be continuously exercised for constant renewal and revival. These gifts have a place to fill in Christian service. There needs to be a continual ingathering of souls. The ascended Christ imparts the gifts of the Spirit in His sovereign wisdom for this purpose.⁹³ Moreover, the church must build with sufficient breadth so it may include the true spiritual gifts and abilities of its members. To overlook or ignore the true spiritual gifts of the members of the church is to hinder the spiritual progress of the church and be disobedient to the Spirit of Christ. Sectarian narrowness hinders the progress of Christ's church. Therefore, according to Wiley, the church must structure itself so it will not squelch the true gifts and abilities of its members.⁹⁴

Distribution of the Gifts

Concerning which of the Spirit's gifts are bestowed, Wiley implied that they all are available to the church. These gifts did not cease with the age of the apostles. As already observed, the gifts of the Spirit are always latent in the church and available to the church in every age. According to Wiley, they are essential to the spiritual mission of the church. Even though all the members are not similarly endowed with gifts, all these supernatural endowments are necessary for the operating and functioning of the church in the success of her

⁹³Wiley, The Harps of God, pp. 36-37.

⁹⁴Wiley, God Has the Answer, p. 84.

spiritual mission.⁹⁵

In relation to when the gifts of the Spirit are bestowed, Wiley affirmed that the gifts are the divine means and power with which Christ supernaturally endows His church for a proper performance of its earthly task. These gifts are divine bestowments upon individual members for specific vocations within the church. The gifts are to be exercised in conjunction with the church and not apart from it. Therefore, Wiley apparently taught that the gifts of the Spirit are bestowed at or after conversion and possibly at or after the baptism with the Spirit.⁹⁶

⁹⁵Wiley, Christian Theology, II, pp. 319-321.

⁹⁶*Ibid.*, pp. 316-321.

Chapter 6

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

THE DISTINCTIVENESS OF THIS STUDY

In recent times, much contemporary literature has been devoted to a study of the Holy Spirit. Until recently, the teaching of the Holy Spirit's ministry has been largely neglected within Christendom. However, there is now an evident preoccupation with the work of the Holy Spirit. Some recent claims leave much to be desired. Much of this literature, purporting to be an exhaustive study of the Holy Spirit, raises many confusing and conflicting claims. There is a desperate need for a clarifying and authoritative voice to speak in the midst of this confusion. Wesleyanism, as reflected in the CHA, has a rich heritage devoted to the place, work, and ministry of the Holy Spirit within individual lives and the church. This heritage of Wesleyanism was established by men and women who knew and walked with Christ. Their spiritual insights can rightly enlighten this confusing age. One purpose of this study is to call Wesleyans back to their rich heritage.

A second purpose is to show a need for revived Wesleyanism within Christendom. For example, the engrossment of some within the Keswick counteraction theory underscores the need of Wesleyans to clarify their biblical interpretation of the nature of sin and the sanctifying work of the Spirit in the believer's life. Also, the claims

of Neo-Pentecostalism for some type of motoric manifestation to accompany the baptism with the Holy Spirit and its prepossession with spiritual gifts (i.e., tongues speaking) suggest the need for Wesleyans to clearly explain their position on the baptism with the Spirit, the witness of the Spirit, and to develop their teaching on the gifts of the Spirit. While it is true that some Wesleyan scholars are writing against the excessive claims of the Keswick movement and Neo-Pentecostalism, there still is need of an historical Wesleyan analysis in relation to these excessive claims. The historical literature of Wesleyanism can make a contribution in helping to remove present confusion resulting from the influences of the Keswick movement and Neo-Pentecostalism. This study seeks to provide an historical perspective of Wesleyanism in which a better evaluation of the conflicting claims of this current controversy over the Holy Spirit as Gift and Giver of gifts can be made.

The method employed in this investigation was to research the principle writings of five contributors to the Wesleyan-Arminian interpretation of Holy Scriptures. These selected five contributors are: William Arthur, Samuel Chadwick, Daniel Steele, Wilson Thomas Hogue, and Henry Orton Wiley. Two of these represent denominations which are members of the CHA. This permitted a representative understanding of what the past CHA's position may have been if confronted with these current controversial claims. Care was exercised to maintain the objectivity of these Wesleyan leaders and to preserve their original structures of thought. Their use of terms and definitions received special attention in order to distinguish the original thoughts of the

writers from contemporary theological concepts which are often unconsciously read into their usage. The constant concern of this study has been to allow these past contributors of Wesleyanism to speak their message for contemporary times. It has been an investigation to ascertain where Wesleyanism has been to help determine where Wesleyanism should be going in the midst of divergent views on the Holy Spirit's ministry within the present day.

THE SUMMARY

The Holy Spirit as Gift

Each of these Wesleyan leaders advocated that a distinction must be maintained between the Spirit as Gift and Spirit as Giver of gifts. By the Gift of the Spirit, they referred to the Holy Spirit as the Promised Comforter of the Father becoming the Gift of the Son to His church as the Promised Gift of the Spirit. This Gift of the Spirit is received in the baptism with the Spirit or entire sanctification. At that time the principle of sin is removed from the justified believer's soul. By the gifts of the Spirit, these leaders referred to external endowments given by the Holy Spirit for the equipment of Christ's church to carry out the Great Commission. Reflecting on Pentecost, they held that the gifts are not the essence of a real Christian. Rather, it is the promised Gift of the Spirit which produces the moral change within that constitutes a full-fledged Christian.

In the thought of these Wesleyan leaders, the Spirit's work before conversion is based upon a teaching of the depravity of man. Adam as the representative of the human race involved all men in his

fall from righteousness. As a result, sin spiritually blinds and makes all men dead in trespasses and sins. Sin effects the human race in a twofold way: an innate principle of sin and the resultant acts of sin. In other words, all men sin in conduct or actions because they are under the motivating control of the fountainhead or principle of sin. Consequently, the need of the atonement of Christ is to reach men in these deep recesses of sin.

Although man is sinful by nature, these past leaders are unanimous in their affirmation that God through Christ endows all men with the gracious ability to repent of their sins and be delivered from the power of sin. By the agency of the Holy Spirit, all men can be led into forgiveness of sins and reconciliation with God. Several of these men classified this as "prevenient grace."

In awakening sinful men to their privileges through the atonement of Christ, the Holy Spirit exercises a convictive ministry. In this beginning stage of salvation, the Spirit convicts the sinning world of sin, righteousness, and the judgment. The conviction of sin refers to the formal rejection of Christ as the only way of personal salvation. The conviction of righteousness refers to the Spirit's convincing ministry that Christ's redeeming work is the sole ground of acceptance and reconciliation before a holy God. The conviction of judgment is the Spirit convincing sinners of the truth that Satan and his followers are dethroned and judged. This judgment will someday be manifested in the final separation of the righteous and wicked. This threefold convictive ministry of the Spirit awakens the sinner to his need of an unlimited and atoning Saviour. However, Steele and Hogue warned that the

irremissible sin of blasphemy against the Holy Spirit can be committed by a Christ-rejecting person whose character becomes fixed in sin. The nature of this sin is not the Holy Spirit withdrawing from the sinner. Rather, the unbelieving sinner hardens his soul to the voice of the Spirit and becomes insensitive, calloused, and fossilized in habitual sin. The convictive agency of the Spirit is necessary to lead sinners to a place of repentance.

The Spirit's work at conversion is the impartation of spiritual life into a soul dead in sin. Conversion is conditioned upon repentance of sin and saving faith in Christ's atonement. Repentance is the godly sorrow over sin which leads to a forsaking of all habitual sin. It involves contrition of sin, confession of sin, and renunciation of all known sin. Saving faith forms the bridge between prevenient grace and conversion. The object of saving faith is the atonement of Christ. Christ is the procuring cause of conversion. This faith is also based upon the immutable promises of God's Word. The Word of God is the instrumental cause in revealing the sinner's need of appropriating these divine promises for conversion. The efficient cause of this faith is the operation of the Spirit quickening the soul dead in trespasses and sins.

At conversion, the Spirit's work has both positive and negative effects. Positively, the Spirit imparts Christ's regenerating life. Negatively, the Spirit as Christ's representative Agent forgives and pardons the sinner. The result of this positive and negative work by the Spirit is an outflowing of the graces of the Spirit and good works within the daily life of the regenerated.

Several of these leaders divided the Spirit's work at conversion into additional relationships for the purpose of clarification. "Justification" is the declaratory act of God in pronouncing the sinner free from the guilt and penalty of sin. This legal term describes what Christ has done for sinful men in procuring the remission of sin. "Regeneration" or the "new birth" is the actual infusion of divine life into a soul dead in trespasses and sins. This term describes what Christ through the Spirit does in repenting souls by a moral transformation from love of sinning to love of God. "Adoption" is a term used to explain that aspect of Christ's atonement which removes the penitent sinner from the family of Satan and fits him into the family of God. Hogue added a fourth term, "forgiveness" as distinct from justification. Hogue explained that forgiveness involves the remission of sin's penalty while justification refers to God's act of imputing Christ's righteousness to penitent sinners, changing their relationship to God and His violated law. Wiley treated these two words as basically synonymous terms.

The Holy Spirit's ministry after conversion is to impart Christian assurance. Adoption is a concomitant with justification (forgiveness), and regeneration. In order of thought it follows these other aspects of conversion. However, adoption into the family of God involves the benefits of being a child of God and a proprietary right in all that Christ has purchased for redeemed men. Closely related to regeneration is the witness of the Spirit. There is unanimous agreement among these Wesleyan men that the redeeming Christ is always a witness to what He, through the Spirit, accomplishes in the soul. They understood this witness of the Spirit as twofold in a direct and indirect

way. By the direct witness, they meant the inward impression upon the soul of the penitent sinner that he is an accepted child of God. The indirect witness of the Spirit is the witness of the believer's own spirit to the accomplished fact of conversion. It is a subjective and individual consciousness that Christ's redeeming work is accomplished. The indirect witness is a confirmatory evidence to the direct witness, but the direct witness precedes the indirect witness.

After conversion, the Spirit imparts establishing and supporting grace to the newly converted child of God. In conversion, new life is imparted. The Spirit through His supporting and guiding Presence assists in the growth of this new life. In conversion, the Spirit also assigns the new believer a place within the mystical body of Christ. As Christ's representative Agent in His Headship over His church, the Spirit assigns the believer a place within the church as He wills for Christ's continuing work among men. Through this fellowship of the church and the means of grace, the Spirit gives spiritual nurture. Moreover, the Spirit's supporting presence is seen in the believer's spiritual warfare with the principle of sin. Inbred sin is antagonistic to the new life imparted at conversion. By the new life implanted in the soul, the Spirit supports the believer in this internal warfare. The Spirit, then, leads the unsanctified believer into an awareness of his need of the baptism with the Spirit to remove this spiritually unstable condition.

All of these Wesleyan men were in complete agreement that the principle of sin is not removed at conversion. They consistently maintained a distinction between the birth of the Spirit and the baptism

with the Spirit. At the birth of the Spirit, all committed sin is forgiven and new spiritual life is imparted resulting in victory over the practice of sin and adoption into the family of God. Even though the regenerate possess life, there still remains in the soul the presence of inbred sin. This principle of sin is not removed at conversion simply because of the distinct nature of each divine work of grace. The soul must possess regenerating life before it can receive life more abundantly. The soul does not generally see the need of entire sanctification until after the regenerating life exposes the ugliness of inbred sin. The soul's object in regeneration is pardon and new life while the soul's object in entire sanctification is heart purity and perfect love. Therefore, the baptism with the Spirit is subsequent to regeneration. At regeneration the soul's faith is unable to become appropriating faith for the baptism with the Spirit because it does not comprehend the need of this sanctifying work.

The Spirit's work at the baptism with the Spirit is a contemporary experience in which the justified believer is instantaneously cleansed from all carnal impurities by receiving the Gift of the Holy Spirit. Christ's atoning death provides the purifying medium and the Spirit is Christ's sanctifying Agent applying to the believer's life the purifying power of Christ. Like regeneration, this cleansing has both a negative and positive relationship. Negatively, it is a purging from the heart all that is carnal and a separation from sin. Positively, it is the complete filling of the believer's soul with the love of God and a separation to God. The negative aspect of holiness must never be separated from the positive. Each implies the other and constitutes the

baptism with the Spirit. This crisis experience results in imparted purity and spiritual power for witnessing. Therefore, the experience always results in preserving the purity and orthodoxy of the church.

The conditions for this sanctifying experience are faith and complete consecration. The atonement of Christ is the object of sanctifying faith. This faith is grounded in the promises of God's Word that He wills this cleansing, Christ provides for it, and that the Spirit will apply Christ's promised baptism to all who claim it now. Closely related to sanctifying faith is the necessity of complete consecration. Sanctifying faith cannot exist without consecration; and consecration cannot exist without sanctifying faith. Each is dependent upon the other. Consecration involves the complete and full surrender of the believer's will to Christ with a confident faith in Him to purify the heart from all sin.

The whole plan of redemption is based upon divine and human cooperation as centered in the atoning blood of Christ. From beginning to end, these men believed that the work of salvation must have divine and human action. God provides the Gift of full salvation through His Son. As created free moral agents, all men either respond or reject the Spirit's redeeming ministry in their lives. These men taught that all men are in continuous need of the atoning benefits of Christ. Not only are regeneration and entire sanctification firmly rooted in the atonement of Christ, but both must be maintained by daily appropriating the atoning power of Christ to save and sanctify.

The Spirit's work after the baptism with the Spirit is that of imparting His witness to the sanctifying work and giving His continued

supporting grace for Christian growth. The uniform testimony of these Wesleyan men was that the Spirit bears witness in entire sanctification as He bears witness in regeneration. This witness is twofold. There is the direct positive testimony of the witnessing Spirit and the testimony of the believer's own spirit. The direct witness and the testimony of the believer's consciousness are corroborative. However, the sanctified Christian never arrives at a point of no additional Christian growth. Growth in grace for the Spirit-filled Christian is more rapid than in regeneration. The baptism with the Spirit necessitates a faithfully maintained relationship to the atoning blood of Christ for continuous cleansing and growth. After the crisis of entire sanctification, the Spirit's ministry is needed in living out the ethical implications of this imparted holiness in social situations.

The Holy Spirit as Giver of Gifts

These Wesleyan leaders placed the distribution of spiritual gifts within the context of their teachings of the church. The church is the objective sphere for the Spirit's ministry. The Spirit as Christ's Representative carries on Christ's work within and through the church. The Spirit places believers in Christ's church and unites them into a single organism under the Headship of Christ. Christ's purpose for His church is the salvation of the individual. However, through the agency of the Holy Spirit, Christ's objective is also to build up His church as a spiritual organism of redeemed persons who manifest the incarnate life of Christ to a needy world. Christ builds His church through the indwelling Spirit as both Gift and Giver of gifts. As Gift,

the Spirit indwells, purifies, and empowers the church for its fulfillment of Christ's will. As Giver of gifts, the Spirit bestows supernatural endowments in Christian service for building up the church. These gifts are endowments by the Spirit which transcend natural talents. The particular ministry to be fulfilled by the believer determines which gift the Spirit will bestow. Consequently, not all the believers possess all the same gifts. The Spirit distributes the gifts as He chooses for the purpose of advancing the multitudinous cause of Christ. The various gifts supplement each other in the outreach of the church.

The focus in the distribution of spiritual gifts is not upon the believer, but rather, the sovereign will of the Spirit and the place to be filled within the work of Christ's church. These Wesleyan leaders were unanimous in their affirmation that the distribution of spiritual gifts is always within the context of the sovereign will and mind of the Spirit and the evangelistic outreach of the church. These gifts are never distributed for personal glory and self-gratification. They are given only as the Spirit sees fit and for the edification of Christ's cause in and through His church. Spiritual gifts are to be God-centered and church-oriented and never person-centered. However, several of these Wesleyan men taught that it is impossible for the church to succeed in her spiritual mission without a proper functioning of the Spirit's gifts within the church.

Concerning the general nature of the Spirit's gifts these leaders basically held to a position which taught there are nine gifts of the Spirit: wisdom, knowledge, faith, miracles, healing, prophecy,

discernment of spirits, tongues, and interpretation of tongues. The gift of wisdom is an endowment of wisdom in spiritual things as a qualification for preaching the gospel. Closely related to wisdom is the gift of knowledge which imparts clearness of spiritual insight for correctness in expounding Holy Scriptures. The gift of faith refers to the extraordinary power of believing for accomplished results in the midst of natural impossibilities. The healing gift is the endowment for healing physical sickness. The gift of miracles is the endowment by the Spirit which requires the contravention of some law of nature. The gift of prophecy is one of the best gifts and is understood in general usage as teaching or expounding the Scriptures. It is the gift of declaring forth (forthtelling) the wonderful works of God under the extraordinary power and illumination of the Spirit. The discernment of spirits enables the person possessing this gift to discern between true and false miracles, teachers, prophets, and hypocritical professors. The gift of tongues speaking is the ability bestowed by the Spirit to speak in a definite language never before learned. The purpose of tongues speaking is that the different nationalities might receive spiritual instruction in their native tongues. Pentecost is an example of the need of this gift. The gift of interpretation is the endowment to bring forth the deep truths of God out of these foreign languages. There is a unity among the various gifts. Where there is division and schism in relation to the gifts, there is an absence of the unifying and indwelling Holy Spirit.

Concerning the relationship between the Gift of the Spirit and spiritual gifts, Steele outlined basic distinctions. He taught a

threefold distinction on the Spirit's fullness. He developed the ecstatic fullness of the Spirit as a temporary emotional fullness which leaves no permanent moral effect upon the soul. The charismatic fullness, he advocated, can be possessed even by non-Christians who prophesy, work miracles, and possess high evangelistic powers but never inherit eternal life. Ethical fullness is the sanctifying fullness of the Spirit cleansing the soul from inbred sin and filling it with imparted holiness.

The other writers also attempted to establish points of clarification on the Spirit as Gift and Giver of gifts. The Gift of the Spirit rests in the redemptive will of God. As the redemptive will of God, the baptism with the Spirit is the moral obligation of every justified believer, and the absence of this faith results in God's condemnation. In contrast, the gifts of the Spirit rest in the sovereign will of God and as such are not a moral obligation of the believer. The Spirit in sovereign wisdom bestows the gifts as He chooses with no specific conditions required for their bestowment. The Spirit as an independent Sovereign acts according to His own determinate counsel in the bestowment of gifts upon various members of Christ's church, but the Spirit can impart His purifying baptism only when the conditions of sanctifying faith and consecration are completed. Furthermore, the Gift of the Spirit produces a lasting moral effect upon the justified soul, but the gifts of the Spirit may be exercised apart from any moral transformation of character. The Gift of the Spirit is an evidence of superior grace, while the gifts of the Spirit are not an evidence of purifying grace. The Gift of the Spirit is spiritually indispensable and

necessary to be acceptable to God, but the gifts of the Spirit are not a requisite or necessary to attain the highest spiritual life. Consequently, the Gift of the Spirit is available to all who meet the conditions for receiving it while the gifts are distributed only as the Spirit in sovereign wisdom wills upon selected individuals within the church or upon others He sovereignly selects. To teach that believers are commanded to seek spiritual gifts is to contradict the Holy Spirit's principle of divine sovereignty in bestowing the gifts as He chooses. Within the interpretation of spiritual gifts, the area of responsibility is shifted from the individual believer to a Holy Sovereign God who bestows His gifts as He desires.

Within each of these Wesleyan leader's thought, there is a two-fold preoccupation. First, the end goal of all seeking in Christian experience is the Gift of the Holy Spirit. Anything less than seeking the purifying power of the Spirit and a positive devotement to God in perfect love is condemned by these men. Their preoccupation was with a systematic development of the sanctifying power of God rather than His bestowment of spiritual gifts. Their priorities were placed upon the sanctifying power of Christ rather than the ascension gifts bestowed by Christ through the Spirit. Second, there is a unanimous concern that a valid Christian experience be preserved from fanaticism. They placed proper limitations upon Christian experience which prevents it from becoming ensnared in religious subjectivism. The Christ of history and the Christ of religious experience are rightly safeguarded in these interpretations. Their restrictions upon religious experience are only those which God through Holy Scriptures and the history of the church

places upon Himself and Christian experience. Their concern was that Scripture, reason, religious experience, and redemptive history as revealed within the church become the guiding sources of religious authority.

There is disagreement on the question of the permanence or cessation of the Spirit's gifts. Samuel Chadwick, Wilson T. Hogue, and H. Orton Wiley are in basic agreement concerning the permanence of spiritual gifts. They believed these gifts are bequeathed to Christ's church as a perpetual inheritance for the outreach and building up of the church as the incarnate life of Christ. William Arthur and Daniel Steele basically taught the cessation of spiritual gifts. Arthur believed the gifts are not a part of the permanent benefits to the church. Steele adhered to the position that there is a designed withdrawal of the extraordinary gifts by the sovereign Spirit. The only exception is the gift of healing which continues according to the sovereign will of the Spirit as a testimony of the other gifts.

Again, there is disagreement as to which of the gifts are bestowed. Chadwick, Hogue, and Wiley concluded that the gifts bequeathed to the church as a perpetual inheritance are always latent within the church and available whenever needed. Steele taught no believer should seek gifts but desire only Jesus as the object of his religious seeking. Arthur's view was similar to Steele in his emphasis upon seeking the permanent graces of the Spirit.

Concerning when the gifts may be bestowed, there are also differing opinions. Chadwick, Hogue, and Wiley basically believed the gifts were bestowed at and after conversion, or at and after the baptism

with the Spirit. Steele's position was that some of the gifts are bestowed before conversion and on various occasions after conversion and the baptism with the Holy Spirit. Arthur's position was similar to Steele. Arthur taught the gifts of prophecy, prayer, teaching and fellowship are the permanent spiritual ministries of the church. These gifts are received at and after the baptism with the Spirit.

THE CONCLUSIONS

1. A distinction must be maintained between the Holy Spirit as Gift and Giver of gifts.

2. The Spirit's work before conversion is awakening the sinner to his need of Jesus Christ as Saviour and Lord. Sin has a twofold nature. The fountainhead of sin is the state of the heart from which all sinful acts flow. A distinction between the state of sin and the acts of sin must be maintained. The Spirit's work at conversion is to impart regenerating life and initial sanctification which deals with the acts of sin. The Spirit's ministry after conversion is to impart the witness of the Spirit for Christian assurance and growth in grace.

3. These Wesleyan leaders were sensitive and cautious to maintain a distinction between the birth of the Spirit and the baptism with the Spirit. At the birth of the Spirit, regenerating life is imparted to the soul and incipient sanctification begins. However, at the baptism with the Spirit, the believer receives the sanctifying power of the Spirit and abundant life or entire sanctification.

4. The Spirit's work at the baptism with the Spirit is to remove inbred sin from the justified soul and the perfecting of love

(entire sanctification). It is subsequent to regeneration and an instantaneous act of divine grace which deals with the sinful state of the heart. It is God's provision (provisional sanctification) for the complete purging of the principle of sin remaining in the soul after conversion. It is not merely a counteracting of inbred sin. It requires the conditions (conditional sanctification) of complete consecration and appropriating faith in the atonement of Christ. There are no additional conditions for the sanctifying presence of the Spirit such as tongues speaking. The Spirit imparts His witness that the sanctifying work has been done. Growth in grace (progressive sanctification) is more rapid after the Spirit's cleansing.

5. From beginning to end the whole plan of salvation is rooted in the shed blood of Christ and His atoning benefits for all men. Objective Christianity and subjective Christianity are supportive and never in opposition to each other within a valid Christian experience.

6. The Spirit's gifts are the result of the exercise of the sovereign will and purpose of God. Men are not under a moral obligation to God to seek the gifts because the Spirit will impart the gifts if and when He chooses. To teach that the gifts are to be sought by men is to contradict the sovereignty of the Holy Spirit in bestowing the gifts as He sees fit. The Spirit imparts these gifts upon selected people for the edification and advancement of Christ's church. The gifts refer to Christian service and not to the transforming power of the atonement. The unity of the gifts are indicative of whether or not a gift is genuine. None of these gifts are given for merely personal advantage. This includes the gifts of tongues and healing. However, graces and the

Gift of the Spirit Himself are in the redemptive will of God. As such, the Gift of the Spirit is the moral obligation of all men. This Gift of the Spirit refers to the moral transforming power of the atonement. It is a privileged provision in God's atonement to completely save all men from sin. All men are commanded to seek the Spirit in his sanctifying power. Therefore, the Spirit's gifts are secondary to the graces and sanctifying Gift of the Spirit.

7. The permanence of the gifts are for the sole purpose of building up the church under the Headship of Christ. There is disagreement among these leaders concerning the permanence of the gifts. This writer assumed the position of Chadwick, Hogue, and Wiley rather than the positions of Arthur and Steele. The reasons for this were: (a) The teachings of chapters twelve through fourteen of First Corinthians, chapter four of Ephesians, and chapter twelve of Romans and the language employed by these New Testament writers seem to underscore a continual latent need of the Spirit's gifts for the church's outreach. These leaders all placed the gifts in a relationship to the church or the evangelistic work of Christ. (b) There is unanimous agreement on the sovereignty of the Spirit in the distribution of spiritual gifts. To be consistent, this view requires that the gifts be always latent so that the Spirit in sovereign wisdom may bestow them when He wills upon chosen individuals. (c) The needs of the church for qualified leadership necessitates the Spirit's continual exercise in bestowing spiritual gifts as equipment for Christian service and the successful completion of the church's mission.

8. All of the gifts are latent within the church. These gifts

are available whenever the sovereign Spirit determines to bestow them upon selected persons to advance the cause of Christ through His church.

9. The Spirit bestows the gifts upon whomsoever in sovereign wisdom he selects.

10. A God-centered and church-oriented view of spiritual gifts prevents religious subjectivism which often results from an individual-centered view.

11. The Wesleyan leaders researched for this paper viewed the whole Bible as authoritative and the New Testament primarily as a normative pattern for valid Christian experience.

12. The Wesleyan leaders' high priority upon the Spirit as sanctifying Gift and a lack of preoccupation with His gifts must not be interpreted as grieving the Holy Spirit. Their preoccupation with the teachings of Scripture and deep insights into what constitutes a valid Christian experience indicates their deep sensitivity to the Spirit's leadership. Through their lives and writings the Spirit has blessed the Christian church with a rich heritage.

13. God has not raised up the Holiness movement primarily for the propagation of spiritual gifts, but for the purpose of spreading the message of scriptural holiness across this land. The priority must always rest on the redemptive will of God, that is, on the Spirit as the redeeming and sanctifying Gift of Christ to His church and not on spiritual gifts.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. Books

- Arthur, William. Addresses Delivered in New York by Rev. Wm. Arthur, A.M. with Biographical Sketch of the Author, ed. W.P. Strickland. New York: Carlton and Phillips, 1856.
- _____. "The Divinity of Our Lord in Relation to His Work of Atonement," Present Day Tracts on Subjects of Christian Evidence, Doctrine, and Morals by Various Writers. 6 vols. London: Religious Tract Society, 1885.
- _____. The Tongue of Fire. rpt. Winona Lake: Light and Life, n.d.
- Barabas, Steven. So Great Salvation the History and Message of the Keswick Convention. Westwood: Fleming H. Revell, 1958.
- Bloch-Hoell, Nils. The Pentecostal Movement. Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 1964.
- Boardman, W.E. The Higher Christian Life. Boston: Henry Hoyt, 1859.
- Brengle, S.L. Heart Talks on Holiness. New York: Salvation Army, 1918.
- _____. Resurrection Life and Power. London: Salvationist Publishing 1925.
- _____. When the Holy Ghost is Come. 2nd ed. New York: Salvation Army, 1911.
- Bruner, Frederick Dale. A Theology of the Holy Spirit. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1970.
- Burdick, Donald W. Tongues to Speak or Not to Speak. Chicago: Moody Press, 1969.
- Burtner, Robert W. and Robert E. Chiles. A Compend of Wesley's Theology New York: Abingdon, 1954.
- Chadwick, Samuel. The Call to Christian Perfection. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1943.
- _____. The Gospel of the Cross. London: Epworth Press, 1934.

- _____. Humanity and God. rpt. Apollo: West Publishing, n.d.
- _____. The Path of Prayer. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1931.
- _____. Twenty-Five Sunday Evenings with Samuel Chadwick, comp. D.W. Lambert. London: Epworth Press, 1954.
- _____. Twenty-Five Sunday Mornings with Samuel Chadwick, comp. D.W. Lambert. London: Epworth Press, 1951.
- _____. The Testament of Samuel Chadwick 1860-1932, comp. D.W. Lambert. London: Epworth Press, 1957.
- _____. Through the Years with Samuel Chadwick, comp. D.W. Lambert. London: Epworth Press, 1960.
- _____. The Way to Pentecost. Berne: Light and Hope, 1937.
- Chapman, J.B. The Terminology of Holiness. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1947.
- Cook, Thomas. New Testament Holiness. London: Epworth Press, 1948.
- Cox, Leo G. John Wesley's Concept of Perfection. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1964.
- Culbertson, Paul T. Introduction to Christian Theology. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1954.
- Dunn, L.R. The Mission of the Spirit or the Office and Work of the Comforter in Human Redemption. rpt. Apollo: West Publishing, n.d.
- Dunning, Norman G. Samuel Chadwick. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1933.
- Ford, Jack. In the Steps of John Wesley the Church of the Nazarene in Britain. Kansas City: Nazarene Publishing House, 1968.
- Geiger, Kenneth (comp.). Insights Into Holiness. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1963.
- _____. (comp.). The Word and the Doctrine. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1965.
- Godbey, William B. Work of the Holy Spirit. Louisville: Pickett Press, 1902.
- Greathouse, William. The Fullness of the Spirit. Kansas City: Nazarene Publishing House, 1958.

- Hogg, Wilson T. A Hand-Book of Homiletics and Pastoral Theology. 7th ed. Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing, 1919.
- _____. Revivals and Revival Work. Buffalo: Wilson T. Hogg, 1890.
- _____. A Symposium on Scriptural Holiness, ed. W.T. Hogg. Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing, 1896.
- Hogue, Wilson T. G. Harry Agnew a Pioneer Missionary. Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing, 1904.
- _____. The Believer's Personal Experience of Christ in the Processes of Salvation. Chicago: William B. Rose, 1915.
- _____. History of the Free Methodist Church of North America. 2 vols. Chicago: Free Methodist Publishing, 1915.
- _____. The Holy Spirit a Study. Chicago: William B. Rose, 1916.
- Hopkins, Evan H. The Law of Liberty in the Spiritual Life. Fort Washington: Christian Literature Crusade, 1968.
- Huffman, Jasper A. Golden Treasures from the Greek New Testament for English Readers. 2nd ed. Marion: Wesley Press, 1951.
- _____. The Holy Spirit. 2nd ed. Marion: Wesley Press, 1944.
- _____. Profile of a Modern Pentecostal Movement. Elkhart: Bethel Publishing, 1968.
- Jessop, Harry. Foundations of Doctrine. University Park: Chicago Evangelistic Institute, 1954.
- _____. We the Holiness People. Chicago: Evangelistic Institute, 1948.
- Keen, S.A. Pentecostal Papers; or the Gift of the Holy Ghost. Cincinnati: Cranston and Curts, 1895.
- Marston, Leslie R. From Age to Age a Living Witness a Historical Interpretation of Free Methodism's First Century. Winona Lake: Light and Life, 1960.
- Metz, Donald S. Speaking in Tongues: an Analysis. Kansas City: Nazarene Publishing House, 1965.
- Meyer, F.B. Calvary to Pentecost. rpt. Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1959.
- _____. The Christ-Life for the Self-Life. Chicago: Moody Press, n.d.

- Morgan, G. Campbell. The Spirit of God. New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1900.
- Oke, Norman R. Facing the Tongues Issue. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1973.
- Peters, John L. Christian Perfection and American Methodism. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1956.
- Pierson, Arthur Tappan. The Keswick Movement. New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1903.
- Pope, William Burt. A Compendium of Christian Theology Being Analytical Outlines of a Course of Theological Study, Biblical, Dogmatic, Historical. 3 vols. New York: Phillips and Hunt, 1882.
- Purkiser, W.T. Conflicting Concepts of Holiness. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1953.
- _____. (ed.). Exploring Our Christian Faith. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1971.
- _____. Sanctification and Its Synonyms. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1963.
- Riggs, Ralph. The Spirit Himself. Springfield: Gospel Publishing, 1949.
- Roberts, Oral. The Baptism with the Holy Spirit and the Value of Speaking in Tongues Today. Tulsa: Oral Roberts, 1964; rpt. 1966.
- Rose, Delbert R. A Theology of Christian Experience; Interpreting the Historic Wesleyan Message. Minneapolis: Bethany Fellowship, 1965.
- Ruth, C.W. Entire Sanctification Explained. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1955.
- Sanders, J. Oswald. The Holy Spirit and His Gifts. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1940.
- Shilling, Henry. Gifts of the Spirit God's Answer. Freeport: Fountain Press, n.d.
- Steele, Daniel. A Defense of Christian Perfection or a Criticism of Dr. James Mudge's Growth in Holiness Toward Perfection. New York: Hunt and Eaton, 1896.
- _____. Difficulties Removed from the Way of Holiness. London: S.W. Partridge, n.d.

- _____. The Gospel of the Comforter. rpt. Salem: Convention Book Store, 1973.
- _____. Half-Hours with St. Paul and Other Bible Readings. rpt. Rochester: Rev. H.E. Schmul, 1959.
- _____. Jesus Exultant; or Christ No Pessimist and Other Essays. 1899; rpt. Salem: Convention Book Store, n.d.
- _____. Love Enthroned. New York: Phillips and Hunt, 1875.
- _____. Mile-Stone Papers Doctrinal, Ethical, and Experimental on Christian Progress. 1878; rpt. Minneapolis: Bethany Fellowship, 1966.
- _____. Steele's Answers, ed. E.L. Kletzing. Chicago: Christian Witness, 1920.
- Stott, John R.W. The Baptism and Fullness of the Holy Spirit. Downers Grove: Inter-Varsity Press, 1971.
- Synan, Vinson. The Holiness-Pentecostal Movement in the United States. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1971.
- Taylor, Richard S. Preaching Holiness Today. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1970.
- Unger, Merrill F. The Baptizing Work of the Holy Spirit. Wheaton: VanKampen Press, 1953.
- _____. New Testament Teaching on Tongues. Grand Rapids: Kregel Publications, 1972.
- Wesley, John. A Plain Account of Christian Perfection. rpt. London: Epworth Press, 1960.
- _____. The Works of John Wesley. 14 vols. 1872; rpt. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1958-1959.
- Wilcox, Leslie D. Be Ye Holy. Cincinnati: Revivalist Press, 1965.
- Wiley, H. Orton. Christian Theology. 3 vols. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1958.
- _____. The Epistle to the Hebrews. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1959.
- _____. God Has the Answer. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1956.
- _____. The Harps of God and Other Sermons, ed. Ross E. Price. Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1971.

Wynkoop, Mildred Bangs. Foundations of Wesleyan-Arminian Theology.
Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1967.

B. Periodicals

Armstrong, O.K. "Beware the Commercialized Faith Healers," Reader's Digest, 98:179-186, June, 1971.

Blaney, Harvey J.S. "St. Paul's Posture on Speaking in Unknown Tongues," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 8:52-60, Spring, 1973.

Boyd, Myron F. "The Gift of Tongues," Light and Life, 107:6, February 5, 1974.

_____. "The National Holiness Association 101 Years, Sane, Spiritual, Biblical," The Herald, 80:9-17, July 30, 1969.

Brooks, R.A. "Instruction About Tongues Speaking," Charisma Digest, 2:19-21, 1969.

Carter, Charles W. "A Wesleyan View of the Spirit's Gift of Tongues in the Book of Acts," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 4:39-68, Spring, 1969.

Greathouse, Wm. M. "Who Is the Holy Spirit," The Wesleyan Advocate, 130:8-11, August 7, 1972.

Martin, William J. "Must Religionists Downgrade the Past," Christianity Today, 12:14-15, December 22, 1967.

Mattke, Robert A. "The Baptism of the Holy Spirit as Related to the Work of Entire Sanctification," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 5: 22-32, Spring, 1970.

Mercer, J.L. and George E. Failing. "Tongues Phenomena in Church History" (Part I), The Wesleyan Methodist, 124:7f, March, 1966.

Nicholson, Roy S. "William Arthur: Unheralded Victor," The American Holiness Journal, 31:4-12, December, 1971.

Rose, Delbert R. "Daniel Steele--The Scholar-Saint," The Herald, 79: 18, March 27, 1968.

_____. "Distinctions Which Clarify," The Herald, 79:17, 21, April 10, 1968.

_____. "Distinguishing the Things that Differ," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 9:5-14, Spring, 1974.

- _____. "The Wesleyan Message," The Asbury Seminarian, 22:3-11, October, 1968.
- Sack, Nobel V. "The Relevancy of History to Personal Christian Experience," The Sermon Builder, 20:5, 26, October, 1973.
- Snyder, Howard A. "Misunderstanding Spiritual Gifts," Christianity Today, 18:15-18, October 12, 1973.
- Thompson, W. Ralph. "An Appraisal of the Keswick and Wesleyan Contemporary Positions," Wesleyan Theological Journal, 1:11-20, Spring, 1966.
- Walters, Stanley D. "Spiritual Gifts," The Preacher's Magazine, 49:20-23, January, 1974.
- Wiley, H. Orton. "The Church Today Will Succeed Only as It Experiences What Happened at Pentecost," Herald of Holiness, 43:10, March 10, 1954.
- _____. "Some Aspects of Arminianism" (Part I), The Nazarene Preacher, 40:34, August, 1965.
- _____. "Some Aspects of Arminianism" (Part II), The Nazarene Preacher, 40:15, September, 1965.