

REFERENCES TO ST. AUGUSTINE IN THE WORKS OF JOHN WESLEY

—•••—
JOHN C. ENGLISH

As a person trained in the Anglican theological tradition, John Wesley often appealed to the authority and example of “primitive Christianity.”¹ He looked to the early Fathers as particularly reliable interpreters of the Bible, to the practice of the primitive Church as a model to be imitated by subsequent generations, and to a consensus among the Fathers as a doctrinal standard second only to the Scriptures. In recent decades, Wesley scholars, inspired to a considerable degree by the Methodist theologian and ecumenist, Albert C. Outler, have been exploring Wesley’s indebtedness to one or more of the Fathers.² So far Wesley’s references to Augustine have been neglected.³ This is rather surprising, since Augustine is mentioned by name forty or more times in a frequently quoted collection of his works.⁴ Some of these passages in which Augustine is mentioned were written by Wesley himself. Others were “extracted” (sometimes with little or no acknowledgment) from the books of authors with whom Wesley agreed. Most of these references to Augustine will be cited in this paper. An appendix lists all of them.

By referring to Augustine as frequently as he does, Wesley acknowledges the great esteem in which he was held. This cuts two ways. Sometimes Wesley turns Augustine to his advantage. He was a valuable resource who could be cited in debates and sermons to reinforce Protestant and Wesleyan doctrine. In other circumstances, however, Wesley tried to subvert Augustine’s authority. Wesley’s critics might depend upon Augustine, either directly or indirectly, for some of these ideas and arguments. In these situations, Wesley attacked Augustine as a way of weakening their cases. Support for these generalizations will be offered in the following paragraphs.⁵

John C. English is Professor Emeritus of History, at Baker University, Baldwin City, Kan. He has published widely on the religious history of early modern England and was the first American invited to give the Annual Lecture of the Wesley Historical Society of Great Britain.

THE ASBURY THEOLOGICAL JOURNAL

FALL 2005
VOL 60 • NO 2

The Confessions is the work of Augustine's which Wesley knew best. He read the book in 1730 and 1731, while performing his duties as a Fellow of Lincoln College, Oxford and again in 1745, during an exchange of correspondence with "John Smith." From time to time Wesley quoted a passage from the *Confessions* in his published works. The most famous of these is *Confessions* 1111 "Thou [God] hast made us for thyself; and our heart cannot rest until it resteth in thee." Wesley quoted this sentence three times and alluded to it on four occasions. "Ceasing from work, activity, or motion" is one way the dictionary defines "rest."⁷ Neither Wesley nor Augustine uses the word in this way. The "resting" soul acts continuously.⁸ The "eye" of the soul is "single;" it attends only to God, "the centre" of spirits and Author of happiness.⁹ Day by day the believer places his trust in Jesus Christ as Lord and Saviour.¹⁰ He offers thanks to God for the gift of salvation and seeks out ways of serving those around him. "Rest" can also refer to tranquillity of soul; in this way the term approaches the idea of ceasing from work. Both Wesley and Augustine use the word "peace" to describe the tranquillity which they have in mind. "Peace," Wesley writes, is "an unspeakable calmness and serenity of spirit," "the evenness of a mind stayed upon God."¹¹ Rest and peace are matters of degree. Wesley and Augustine distinguish between the peace and rest enjoyed by believers now and the total blessedness of the world to come. Wesley, always interested in "present salvation," tends to emphasize the first of these.¹² On the other hand, the Christian's hope for eternal peace and rest figures prominently in the *Confessions*. The way in which Augustine and Wesley treat Matthew 11:28-29 is worthy of note. Jesus says:

²⁸Come to me, all who labor and are heavy-laden, and I will give you rest (ἀνάπαυσω).

²⁹Take my yoke upon you, and learn from me: for I am gentle and lowly in heart, and you will find rest (ἀνάπαυσω) for your souls (RSV).

In the *Confessions*, Augustine refers to these verses one time only. He focuses upon the humility which becomes the genuine Christian.¹⁴ Wesley makes the same point in his *Explanatory Notes upon the New Testament*.¹⁵ Then he displays his knowledge of the Greek language. In his comment on "I will give you rest" (verse 28), Wesley offers this definition: "rest from the guilt of sin by justification, and from the power of sin by sanctification."¹⁶ The verb (ἀνάπαυσω) can mean "make to cease" or "relieve."¹⁷

Both Wesley and Augustine passed through a series of "conversions." In Wesley's case, these comprise (a) his dedication to a "serious" Christian life, upon reading the *Imitation of Christ* and Jeremy Taylor; (b) a commitment to "mysticism," probably a type of apophatic mysticism derived from Johannes Tauler and the *Theologia Germanica*;¹⁸ (c) the Aldersgate experience of May 24, 1738, in which he received an assurance from God that his sins had been forgiven;¹⁹ and (d) a re-affirmation that "faith works by love" (1741), against Luther's doctrine of justification, as interpreted by certain Moravians.²⁰ Augustine's conversions include (a) his decision to pursue "philosophy" as a way of life;²¹ (b) his conversion to the religion of the Manichees;²² (c) a vision of Divine Being,

conceived in Neo-Platonic terms;²³ and (d) his conversion to the Catholic faith, towards the end of August, 386.²⁴ Wesley never mentions this last conversion, Augustine's experience in the garden at Milan. This is surprising, since the book of Romans was decisive for each man. At Aldersgate, Wesley's "heart was strangely warmed" while an unnamed person was reading aloud Luther's preface to the epistle. Augustine's hesitation came to an end as he read Romans 13:13-14: "Let us conduct ourselves becomingly as in the day, not in reveling and drunkenness, not in debauchery and licentiousness, not in quarreling and jealousy. But put on the Lord Jesus Christ, and make no provision for the flesh, to gratify its desires" (RSV). Wesley quotes *Confessions* 7 10.16 (Augustine's vision of Divine Being), not 8.12,29 (the garden in Milan), to support his doctrine of assurance, the believer's "experimental" knowledge, wrought by the Holy Spirit, that he has been forgiven and adopted by God as his child.²⁵ Responding to "John Smith" on December 30, 1745, Wesley quotes Augustine at considerable length:²⁶

I entered into the depths of my soul, and this I was able to do because your aid befriended me. I entered, and with the eye of the soul, such as it was, I saw the Light that never changes casting its rays over the same eye of my soul, over my mind. It was not the common light of day that is seen by the eye of every living thing of flesh and blood, nor was it some more spacious light of the same sort. . . . What I saw was something quite, quite different from any light we know on earth. It shone above my mind, but not in the way .the sky hangs over the earth. It was above me because it was the Light that made me. . . . All who know the truth know this Light, and all who know this Light know eternity. It is the Light that charity knows.

Eternal Truth. .my God, you are, and it is to you that I sigh by night and day. When first I knew you, you raised me up so that I could see that there was something to be seen, but also that I was not yet able to see it. I gazed on you with eyes too weak to resist the dazzle of your splendor. Your light shone upon me in its brilliance, and I thrilled with love and dread alike. I realized that I was far away from you. . . . I asked myself 'Is truth then nothing at all? .And, far off, I heard your voice saying I am the God who IS, I heard your voice as we hear voices that speak to our hearts, and at once I had no cause to doubt. I might more easily have doubted that I was alive than the Truth had being.

The light symbolism in this passage, the description of Divine Being as Truth, and the references to the spiritual senses are Platonic commonplaces. They are reminders that Wesley was influenced to a considerable degree by various Platonists (Clement of Alexandria, Nicolas de Malebranche and John Norris, for instance). One may ask why he chose *Confessions* 7 10.16 to illustrate his interpretation of assurance. Wesley may have been trying to deflect the charge that assurance is a species of "enthusiasm," an individual's conviction that he has received "an immediate revelation from GOD."²⁷ Enthusiasm is a "warm" concept laden with emotional and subjectivist connotations. *Confessions* 7 10.16 is phrased in "cool" and intellectualistic terms. It generates more

light than heat. Wesley may have reasoned that language such as this would be more acceptable to "Smith" than other examples he might have chosen.

Wesley cites *Confessions* 5.1.1 in a sermon on Luke 16:2, "Give an account of thy stewardship, for thou canst be no longer steward." Wesley's point is that God has entrusted us "with our souls, our bodies, our goods, and whatever other talents we have received" on the condition "that we use them only as our Master's goods, and according to the particular directions which he has given us in his word."²⁸ He places under "bodies" health and beauty, the various senses, and certain members of the body, including the tongue, hands and feet. The tongue stands for the power of speech, which has been given to human beings "to be employed in glorifying" their Maker. Wesley reinforces this statement by quoting, very loosely, *Confessions* 5.1.1 "Thou hast given me a tongue that I may praise thee therewith."²⁹

With the emergence of "modern" philosophy and the rise of "modern" physical science, traditional conceptions of Divine Providence were placed in doubt. Wesley and his contemporaries inherited a distinction between "general" ("ordinary") and "particular" ("extraordinary") providence. These terms had been and were defined in various ways. Wesley felt that the notion of "general providence," had been subverted by certain deists, or "Epicureans," as he called them.³⁰ They limited Divine Providence to establishing the laws which natural philosophy studies, calling the universe (the "world machine") into existence, and starting the mechanism. The Protestant scholastics had defined "general providence" in a more generous fashion. For them, the phrase refers to a series of actions which God performs continuously, such as maintaining in existence the universe which he has created, enabling the actions of contingent beings, and governing the created order in light of his purposes.³¹ Wesley reacted against the "Epicureans'" moves by assigning to "particular providence" the work of conservation, concurrence and governance just mentioned, and rejecting general providence altogether.³² Particular providence, according to him, can refer to the performance of miracles and the rise and fall of nations, but in his sermon "on Divine Providence," Wesley emphasizes the benefits which God bestows upon each rank in the great chain of being. More narrowly, particular providence stands for God's care for each man and woman, guiding and protecting them and, if need be, subjecting them to discipline.³³ Augustine is introduced to illustrate particular providence as Wesley understands it. He cites a "fine saying of St. Austin," which in fact is a distant echo of *Confessions* 3.11.19.³⁴ Wesley's citation reads, *Ita praesides singulis sicut universes, et universes sicut singulis!*³⁵ He repeats this "quotation" on three other occasions, translating thus, "God presides . . . over the whole universe as over every single person, over every single person as over the whole universe."³⁶

Wesley is careful to define "providence" in a way which does not exclude human liberty, as he understands it.

All the manifold wisdom of God (as well as all his power and goodness) is displayed in governing man as man; not as a stock or stone, but as an intelligent and free spirit, capable of choosing either good or evil. Herein appears the depth of the wisdom of God, in his adorable providence; in governing men, so as not to destroy either their

understanding, will, or liberty. He commands all things, both in heaven and earth, to assist man in attaining the end of his being, in working out his own salvation, so far as it can be done without compulsion, without over-ruling his liberty.³⁷

Grace and predestination were hotly disputed topics in seventeenth-century England. In some quarters, these controversies persisted into the following century. Anglican "Arminians," such as Wesley, read Augustine on grace through the lens of the "Calvinism" which they knew. For them, Augustine and "Calvinism" went hand in hand, since Calvin and his successors cited Augustine's works in support of their doctrines of unconditional election and double predestination. "Arminians," on the other hand, rejected these doctrines. In Wesley's estimation, they rendered the Christian revelation unnecessary, called into question God's justice, and invited disrespect for law, both moral and civil.³⁸ He defined "election" as "a divine appointment of some men to eternal happiness,"³⁹ but hastened to add, "I believe this election to be conditional, as well as the reprobation opposite thereto. I believe the eternal decree concerning both is expressed in these words: 'He that believeth shall be saved; he that believeth not shall be damned'" (Mark 16:16, omitting the reference to baptism). A synergistic conception of human will and divine grace underlies this statement. While all human beings have inherited from Adam a diminished understanding and a diseased will, no one is left in "a state of mere nature."⁴⁰ God gives to each person born into the world a measure of grace, which enables him or her to know the Truth, however dimly, and to choose the right, however fitfully. Those who pursue the Truth and strive to do well receive "convincing grace."⁴¹ God helps them to know the depth of their sin, to turn from their wicked ways, and to pray for the grace which justifies. This alternation between Divine initiative and human response continues throughout the believer's life. Having been justified and born anew, he or she goes on "'from faith to faith,' 'from grace to grace,'"⁴² until perfection is attained.

Wesley borrowed from Josiah Tucker a genealogy of "predestinarianism" which connects Augustine and the Calvinists, by way of the medieval schoolmen. Writing to John Fletcher in 1775, Wesley remarks:

Does not he [Tucker] show beyond all contradiction that it [double predestination] was hatched by Augustine in spite of Pelagius (who very probably held no other heresy than you and I do now); that it spread more and more in the Western Church till the eleventh century; that Peter Lombard then formed it into a complete system; that in the twelfth century Thomas Aquinas bestowed much pains in explaining and confirming it; that in the thirteenth Duns Scotus did the same; that Ignatius Loyola and all the first Jesuits held it, as all the Dominican and Augustine Friars (with the Jansenists) do to this day; that Bellarmine was firm in it, as were the bulk of the Romanists, till the Council of Trent, when, in furious opposition to Luther and Calvin, they disclaimed their ancient tenets.⁴³

According to Tucker, the authentic doctrine of predestination is to be found in the Greek Fathers (perhaps he is thinking of Crigen and John Chrysostom); the “semi-Pelagian” critics of Augustine, such as John Cassian and Vincent of Léérins; the Christian humanists, Desiderius Erasmus, author of an anti-Lutheran defense of free will (*Diatribes de Libero Arbitrio*, 1524) and Philip Melancthon, the irenic and relatively moderate author of the Augsburg Confession (1530);⁴⁴ and the works of Jacobus Arminius. While Wesley had not read every one of these authors he would have found their views on grace and free will to be acceptable (granted that they did not agree with one another in every respect) One may ask why he chose to summarize parts of Tucker’s book for Fletcher’s benefit. Perhaps this was part of Wesley’s effort to repristinate the reputation of Pelagius, a theme to which I will turn in a later section of this paper. The anti-Catholic undertone of the summary deserves notice. Apparently Wesley was not above appealing to Protestant prejudice. The emphasis upon the Latin and Roman descent of unconditional predestination to a rhetorical device, intended to discredit the Calvinists’ doctrines.

Augustine’s views regarding predestination changed over time. During the 390’s, he began to study the letters of Paul intensively, perhaps in order to refute Manichean interpretations of the Apostle. As a result of these studies, his views regarding grace and human freedom changed significantly. He adopted the severe doctrine of predestinations for which he is best-known. In his earlier writings, however, Augustine had made statements with which “Arminians” could identify. For example, Augustine said that God “has chosen him whom he foreknew would believe in him and to whom he would give the Holy Spirit so that, by performing good works, he would obtain eternal life.”⁴⁶ “Arminians” could seize upon the differences between the early and the late Augustine, in order to claim his authority for their own point of view. Wesley makes this move in *A Dialogue between A Predestinarian and His Friend*.⁴⁷

The most important point separating Augustine and Wesley is, in all likelihood, the doctrine of Christian perfection. Jesus gave to his disciples the command, “Be ye perfect, even as your Father in heaven is perfect” (Matthew 5:48, KJV). Wesley takes this command with the utmost seriousness. For him, perfection, or entire sanctification, is “the grand depositum which God has lodged with the people called Methodists; and for the sake of propagating this chiefly He appeared to have raised us up.”⁴⁸ The perfection which Wesley has in mind is not the happiness which the saints enjoy in the world to come. He is thinking, rather, of the perfection which Christians can enjoy here and now. He describes perfection in a variety of ways. “In one view, it is purity of intention, dedicating all the life to God.”⁴⁹ “In another view,” “It is the renewal of the heart in the whole image of God, the full likeness of Him that created it. In yet another, it is the loving of God with all our heart, and our neighbor as ourselves.”⁵⁰ Elsewhere Wesley says, “a Christian is so far perfect, as not to commit sin,” defining “sin” as a voluntary transgression of a known law of God.”⁵¹

The controversy regarding Divine grace, named for the British ascetic, Pelagius, engaged Augustine’s attention for approximately twenty years. Augustine questioned, and then rejected Pelagius’ teaching on Christian perfection. Addressing the Synod of Diospolis (Lod) in 415, Pelagius declared that a man “having been converted from his

sins," "can be without sin by his own efforts and God's grace, yet not even by this means is he incapable of change for the future."⁵² In his early commentary on Jesus' Sermon on the Mount, Augustine had affirmed that Christians can attain perfection in this life.⁵³ Once the Pelagian controversy got underway, he continued to acknowledge that perfection on earth is possible,⁵⁴ but he began to ask if anyone had in fact reached this goal.⁵⁵ Sometimes he left the matter open,⁵⁶ but rather quickly he decided to answer the question, "no."⁵⁷ He maintained this position to the end of his life.⁵⁸

In a sermon entitled "The Wisdom of God's Counsels," Wesley offered his opinion on this divergence between Pelagius and Augustine:

I would not affirm that (Pelagius] the arch-heretic of the fifth century (as plentifully as he has been bespattered for many ages) was not one of the holiest men of that age, not excepting St. Augustine himself—a wonderful saint! as full of pride, passion, bitterness, censoriousness, and as foul-mouthed to all that contradicted him as George Fox himself.⁵⁹ I verily believe the real heresy of Pelagius was neither more nor less than this, the holding that Christians may by the grace of God (not without it; that I take to be a mere slander) 'go on to perfection;' or, in other words, 'fulfill the law of Christ.'

'But St. Augustine says'—When St. Augustine's passions were heated his word is not worth a rush. And here is the secret. St. Augustine was angry at Pelagius. Hence he slandered and abused him (as his manner was) without either fear or shame. And St. Augustine was then in the Christian world what Aristotle was afterwards. There needed no other proof of any assertion than ipse dixit—St. Augustine said it.⁶⁰

This is an extraordinary statement. Wesley was not given to hysterical outbursts such as this. The tone of his assertions suggests that more than the doctrine of perfection is at stake here. The man who preached "The Wisdom of God's Counsels" was a frustrated and apprehensive individual. His sermon gives voice to these anxieties and disappointments. I will offer support for this judgment in the sixth paragraph below. Meanwhile, some other features of Wesley's statement may be noted.

The passage quoted above illustrates Wesley's independence of mind. He was not willing to take on faith the usual interpretations of Pelagius' doctrines. Rather he was convinced that Pelagius' teachings had been misrepresented by his critics (these are the "slanders" to which he refers) and furthermore, that the authentic doctrines of Pelagius (or at least some of them) could be recovered. Several years before he preached on "God's Counsels," Wesley had made an effort along these lines. Writing to Alexander Coates in 1761, he stated that all of Pelagius' works have been lost, a remark which implies that he had made an effort to find them. He concluded that we cannot "know" a thing for sure about Pelagius' doctrines (since the primary sources have gone missing), but he conjectured that Pelagius was "both a wise and a holy man."⁶¹ If Wesley was pessimistic in 1761, he had changed his mind by 1784, the year in which he preached "God's Counsels." Something about Pelagius' teachings can in

fact be known; he had taught that Christians “may by the grace of God. ‘go on to perfection” (see above). How is this change of front to be accounted for? Perhaps 1761 did not mark the end of Wesley’s search for Pelagius’ writings. He may have pursued the matter and eventually his efforts were rewarded. Eighteenth-century scholars knew that some of Pelagius’ works had survived, albeit not under his name. Jeremy Collier mentions three texts attributed to Jerome but written by Pelagius, an extensive commentary on St. Paul’s epistles; Pelagius’ letter to Demetrias, a young woman who had taken vows as a virgin; and “A Confession of Faith to Pope Innocent” (also described as Jerome’s confession to Pope Damasus I).⁶² If Wesley had read Pelagius/Jerome’s commentary on Romans and the letter to Demetrias, he would have found in them references to the pursuit of holiness and perfection in this life.⁶³

Long before the arrival of our Lord and Saviour some are reported to have lived holy and righteous lives [Pelagius writes]. How much more possible must we believe that to be after the light of his coming, now that we have been instructed by the grace of Christ and reborn as better men . . . we ought surely to be better than those who lived before the time of the law, better even than those who lived under the law, since the apostle [Paul] says: For sin will have no dominion over you, since you are not under law but under grace.⁶⁴

Wesley’s conception of prevenient grace may help to account for his favorable opinion of Pelagius. In the latter’s judgment, grace comprises (a) the grace of creation, the capacity to choose between good and evil, which God has implanted in each human being; (b) the grace of revelation, including the law of Moses, and the teachings and example of Christ; (c) the grace of atonement, Christ’s sacrifice upon the Cross for the sins of the whole world; and (d) the grace of baptism, remission of the sins which an individual has committed, without regard to merit.⁶⁵ (According to some scholars, Pelagius also speaks of an interior grace which helps the believer as he strives to fulfill the law of God.)⁶⁶ I call attention to the resemblance between Pelagius’ grace of creation and Wesley’s prevenient grace. The latter believed that God enables every human being to distinguish between right and wrong—drawing these distinctions is the work of “conscience”—and to choose between the better and the worse.⁶⁷ If Wesley read Pelagius in terms of prevenient grace, as he understood it, this could be another reason for his positive judgment regarding him.

A suggestion made by Albert Outler, that Wesley is an heir of the “in se tradition,” supports this conjecture. This tradition goes back to the sixth and seventh centuries. Its slogan is *Facienti quod in se est, Deus non denegat gratiam* (“He who lives up to what is truly his best, God will not deny him a measure of graces” (Outler’s rendering)).⁶⁸ Outler connects Wesley’s ideas regarding creation and prevenience. The human “best,” that is, “humanity’s identity, freedom, and transcendental orientation,” is God’s doing.⁶⁹ This “natural image” of God, as Wesley sometimes calls it, is never canceled by sin, although sin can and does corrupt it.⁷⁰ Outler goes on to explain, “Whoever lives and acts according to the highest readings of his or her created nature (in se) is assured of the sustenance and sanctions of divine grace. This is the true meaning of God’s prevenience. . . .”⁷¹

Pelagius' conception of the Church is consistent with his doctrine of Christian perfection. He defines "church" in terms of purity of life.⁷² The Church is composed of persons of faith who have received in baptism the remission of sins and who are advancing towards perfection. As they go forward, both their actions and their inward dispositions are brought into conformity with the law of love.⁷³ Such a characterization of the Church resembles some of those which Wesley advocated. This may be an additional reason why he commended Pelagius. For example, in a discussion of the phrase, "the holy catholic church," Wesley declares that "the church is called 'holy' .because every member thereof is holy, though in different degrees, as he [Christ] that called them is holy. " Holiness is more than outward observance. "None that is under the power of anger or pride, no lover of the world—in a word, none that is dead to God—can be a member of his church."⁷⁴

Augustine opposed not only the Pelagians but also the Donatists, the North African rivals of the "Catholics." As I have indicated, Wesley spoke in favor of Pelagius and against Augustine. He also commended the Donatists and criticized Augustine's policy towards them. The link connecting the two groups is the description of the Church's "holiness" in terms of moral purity. Both Pelagius and the Donatists insisted upon the personal righteousness of each member of the Church.⁷⁵ However, the Donatists focused their attention upon the moral character of the clergy. In particular, a bishop who has committed the most grievous of sins, apostasy, is no longer qualified to ordain candidates for the ministry.⁷⁶ His sin touches those whom he "ordains;" the "sacraments" which they administer are not effective means of grace. Wesley rejected the idea that the fruitfulness of the sacraments is connected to the holiness of their ministers,⁷⁷ but he seems to have run together Donatist and Pelagian conceptions of the Church's holiness. While professing "ignorance" of the Donatists' views, he declared: "I suspect they were the real Christians of that age [4th-5th centuries], and were therefore served by St. Augustine and his warm adherents as the Methodists are now by their zealous adversaries."⁷⁸ Wesley has in mind the policy of coercion endorsed by Augustine and the "catholic" bishops of North Africa. They called upon the Roman government to bring its power to bear upon the Donatists. Emperor Honorius agreed to this request. In 405 the Donatists were brought under the imperial laws against heresy. Additional edicts against them were enacted in 412.⁷⁹ These events probably helped to shape Wesley's attitude towards Augustine. He repudiated coercion in religious matters and championed freedom of conscience, as he understood it.⁸⁰ Wesley's attitude was also affected by his own experience. From time to time Methodists were harassed by agents of the State and hostile magistrates declined to protect them from the mob.

I return now to Wesley's outburst against Augustine, to be found in his sermon of 1784, "On the Wisdom of God's Counsels." How is the vehement character of his remarks to be accounted for? I suggest that the reason for Wesley's agitation is not so much Augustine, although that is real enough, but the Calvinists with whom he had been contending for several decades. The Calvinists in question include "Methodists" who did not belong to Wesley's societies, persons such as George Whitefield and Selina, Countess of Huntingdon, and "evangelicals" who objected to Wesley's

teachings, men such as Richard Hill and A. M. Toplady.⁸¹ In railing against Augustine, Wesley was expressing the frustration which the Calvinists had caused him, a frustration which had been building for years. The flash points, theologically speaking, were predestination and Christian perfection. John Calvin, in supporting his doctrine of predestination, had quoted or referred to Augustine repeatedly.⁸² Later Calvinists whom Wesley had read, such as Hieronymus Zanchius, cited Augustine as well.⁸³ Calvin, with Augustine, had denied repeatedly that Christians can be perfected in this life.⁸⁴ As early as 1740, George Whitefield was rejecting conditional predestination and Christian perfection.⁸⁵ Wesley tried to convince the Calvinists that they had misinterpreted the Biblical passages describing perfection and predestination. He did not succeed. However, he still hoped that Arminians and Calvinists could agree to disagree and work together preaching authentic Christianity across Great Britain and Ireland. As it turned out, each side went its separate way. Eventually both Whitefield and Lady Huntingdon formed "connexions" of their own.

These failures must have been extremely disappointing to Wesley. But the fundamental reason for his distress is to be found at a still deeper level. He had been unable to convince the Calvinists that unconditional predestination encourages "antinomianism." Wesley was sure in his own mind that Calvinism is a threat to public order. It generates willful disregard for the laws of the land and the customs of civilized society. His faith in Divine Providence notwithstanding, Wesley was a troubled individual. He was apprehensive lest the bonds of society should snap and one faction of the population turn upon another. This was not an unreasonable fear, given the history of Great Britain and Ireland from the 1640's onwards. The Civil Wars, Jacobite conspiracies, and the risings of 1715 and 1745 illustrate the danger. The kingdom was poorly policed. Parts of it were unsafe, even under the best conditions. Riots were a common occurrence, when food was short, elections were disputed, or the Church was "in danger." Any sort of doctrine which fomented violence, even accidentally, and weakened the force of law, either moral or civil, was anathema to Wesley.

For the most part, the balance of Wesley's references to Augustine have to do with the doctrine of the sacraments. Several of these are to be found in *A Roman Catechism, Faithfully Drawn Out of the Allowed Writings of the Church of Rome. With A Reply Thereto*. This book is based upon a work published by John Williams in 1686.⁸⁶ In his polemic against the Roman Church, Williams, followed by Wesley, appealed to Augustine as an authority. He argued that Augustine's teaching supports Protestant rather than Catholic doctrine. For example, he wanted to make the point that the sacraments have no intrinsic power to effect change in the persons who receive them.⁸⁷ In order to do this, Williams emphasized the difference between the "matter" of the sacrament (water, bread, wine) and the grace which the material element signifies. He inferred that Augustine had drawn a sharp distinction between the two when he used the term "figure" to describe the sacraments.⁸⁸

Protestants teach that God has instituted two sacraments only, baptism and the Lord's Supper. Augustine confirms this doctrine, William believed. He translated a passage from Augustine, letter 54.1 in support of his assertion: "Our Lord Jesus Christ

hath knit Christians together, with sacraments most few in number, most easy to be kept, most excellent in signification as are baptism; and the Lord's Supper."⁸⁹ This translation has been tailored to fit the point which Williams was trying to make. Augustine said that baptism and the Lord's Supper are examples of "sacraments." He did not say that they are the only sacraments. Having cited baptism and the Eucharist in letter 54, he referred to "whatever else is recommended in the canonical writings."⁹⁰ Williams' desire to score a point seems to have gotten the better of him. He knew that Augustine applied the word "sacrament" to other "signs" as well, since he states elsewhere that Augustine holds the sign of the Cross to be a sacrament.⁹¹

John Wesley's father, the Rev. Samuel Wesley, Sr., wrote a number of works in prose and verse, among them, *A Short Discourse on Baptism*.⁹² In 1756 the younger Wesley published this essay for the use of the Methodists. (He did not name the author.) Samuel, Sr. had justified the baptism of infants by appealing, implicitly at least, to the Vincentian canon, "what has been believed everywhere, always, and by all." He named Augustine as one witness among others to the universality of infant baptism in the primitive church.⁹³

Wesley encouraged the members of his societies to be frequent communicants. If possible, they should receive the Eucharist every Sunday. In 1745 Wesley published an abridgment of Daniel Brevint's book, *On the Christian Sacrament and Sacrifice*.⁹⁴ Section VI of this work is entitled "Concerning the Sacrament, as it is a sacrifice." Brevint, followed by Wesley, acknowledges his dependence upon Augustine for his exposition of this theme. He writes that, according to Augustine, "The holy Flesh of Jesus was offered in three manners, by prefiguring sacrifices under the law before His coming into the world, in real deed upon His Cross, and by a commemorative Sacrament after He ascended into Heaven."⁹⁵ These ideas are taken from Augustine's book, *Against Faustus* 2.21



John Wesley referred to St. Augustine on numerous occasions. As this paper has shown, his attitude toward Augustine resists easy categorization. Occasionally he is quoted to illustrate Wesley's own experience. More frequently he is cited to support theological positions which Wesley advocates. But Wesley could also criticize Augustine severely, particularly with regard to his doctrines of perfection and predestination. He demonstrated his independence of mind, when he dissented from the condemnation of Pelagius by Augustine and his numerous followers.⁹⁶ Whether Wesley appreciated the subtleties of each man's theology is another matter. In any case, he recognized Augustine as an eminent authority who must be reckoned with.

NOTES

1 I would like to thank J. Patout Burns, Henry D. Rack and George Wiley for their comments on this paper.

2. For example, David Bundy, "Christian Virtue: John Wesley and the Alexandrian Tradition," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 26 (Spring 1991):139-63; Michael J. Christensen,

"Theosis and Sanctification: John Wesley's Reformulation of A Patristic Doctrine," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 31 (Fall 1996):71-94; John C. English, "The Path to Perfection in Pseudo-Macarius and John Wesley," *Pacifica* 11 (February 1998): 54-62; David C. Ford, "Saint Makarios of Egypt and John Wesley: Variations on the Theme of Sanctification," *Greek Orthodox Theological Review* 33 (1988):285-312; K. Steve McCormick, "Theosis in Chrysostom and Wesley: An Eastern Paradigm on Faith and Love," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 26 (Spring 1991):38-103; John G. Merritt, "'Dialogue' Within A Tradition: John Wesley and Gregory of Nyssa Discuss Christian Perfection," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 22 (Fall 1987):92-116; Albert C. Outler, "John Wesley's Interests in the Early Fathers of the Church," United Church of Canada, *Committee on Archives and History Bulletin*, no. 29 (1980-82):5-17; David H. Tripp, "Clement of Alexandria and the Wesley Brothers," *Proceedings of the Wesley Historical Society* 49 (February 1994):113-18; Gordon Wakefield, "La Littérature du Désert chez John Wesley," *Irénikon* 51 (1978):155-70.

3. A start has been made, however. See Ted A. Campbell, *John Wesley and Christian Antiquity: Religious Vision and Cultural Change* (Nashville: Kingswood Books, 1991); Seung-An Im, "John Wesley's Theological Anthropology: A Dialectic between the Latin Western Patristic Tradition (Augustine) and the Greek Eastern Patristic Tradition (Gregory of Nyssa)," Unpublished Ph. D. dissertation, Drew University, 1994.

4. *The Works of John Wesley*, 14 vols. (London: Wesleyan Methodist Book Room, 1872; Reprinted: Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1991). Wesley included some of his writings in the Arminian Magazine which he edited from 1778 to 1791; leaving these aside, the Magazine includes an additional forty-four references to Augustine. See the appendix to this paper.

5. The following abbreviations will be used in the footnotes to this paper and the appendix thereto.

AM	<i>Arminian Magazine</i>
JWJ	<i>Journal of The Rev. John Wesley, A. M.</i> , ed. Nehemiah Curnock, 8 vols. (London: Epworth Press, 1938)
JWL	<i>Letters of The Rev. John Wesley, A. M.</i> , ed. John Telford, 8 vols. (London: Epworth Press, 1931)
JWW	<i>The Works of John Wesley</i> , 14 vols. (London: Wesleyan Methodist Book Room, 1872; Reprinted: Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1991)
PL	<i>Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Latina</i> , ed. J. P. Migne
SER	<i>The Works of John Wesley: Sermons I-IV</i> , ed. Albert C. Outler, (Nashville: Abingdon Press. 1984-87)

6. Quotations: SER 3:189 (Wesley's translation, as above); 4:64 (same translation); JWJ 7:58 (slightly different translation). Allusions (no quotation): SER 1:148, 497; 3:35, 112.

7. *American Heritage Dictionary* (1982), definition 1

8. Some of the ideas in this section of my paper were suggested by G. P. Lawless, "Interior Peace in the *Confessions* of St. Augustine," *Revue des Etudes Augustiniennes* 26 (1980):45-61

9. SER 1:616; *Confessions* 4.12.18.

10. SER 2:143 ("a calm repose in the blood of Jesus"); *Confessions* 1 1.1

11. SER 2:143; 3:613; see also 3:172; *Confessions* 13.35.50.

12. SER 1.230, 481, 2:139; 3:613-14.

13. *Confessions* 10.30.42; 12. 16;23; 13.9.10.

14. *Confessions* 7.9.14

15. Note to Matthew 11.29; see SER 3:172.

16. Note to Matthew 11.28.

17. Liddell and Scott, *Greek-English Lexicon* (1961), 115; Lampe, *Patristic Greek Lexicon*

(1961), 116. Incidentally, Clement of Alexandria and Pseudo-Macarius, two Fathers with whom Wesley was familiar, define ἀνάπαυσις a noun related to ἀνάπαυω as “spiritual perfection.” Could Wesley have been thinking of this as well?

18. English, “Pseudo-Macarius,” 58-60.
19. JWJ 1:475-76.
20. JWJ 2:467 (June 15, 1741), 487f. (September 3, 1741); see also JWJ 2:174 (April 4, 1739).
21. *Confessions* 3.4.7-8.
22. *Confessions* 3.6.10.
23. *Confessions* 7.10.16.
24. *Confessions* 8.12.29.
25. SER 2:160-62.
26. Writing as one university man to another, Wesley quoted the Latin text. I give the English translation prepared by R. S. Pine Coffin. The ellipses are Wesley’s.
27. John Locke, *Essay concerning Human Understanding*, 4.19.10 (Nidditch ed., 701). Compare Joseph Butler’s conception of “assurance,” “extraordinary revelations and gifts of the Holy Ghost” (conversation with Wesley, August, 1739) (John Whitehead, *The Life of the Rev. John Wesley*, M.A., 2 vols. I Philadelphia: William S. Stockton, 18451, 2:75).
28. SER 2.285.
29. The Latin text reads: *Accipe sacrificium confessionum mearum de manu linguae tuae, quam formasti et excitasti, ut confiteatur nomini tuo* (PL 32:705).
30. Wesley uses Alexander Pope’s *Essay on Man* as an example, probably a sign that he wasn’t acquainted with many of the deists’ writings (SER 2:544, 545, 546, 549; *Essay on Man* 1.87-88; 4.35-36, 123-30).
31. *Concursus generalia*, “continuata creation” “providential” in Richard A. Muller, *Dictionary of Latin and Greek Theological Terms Drawn Principally from Protestant Scholastic Theology* (Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1985).
32. SER 1:580-81 Wesley mentions the “Epicurean god,” who sits at ease in the heaven, without regarding the poor inhabitants of earth” in his sermon “On Divine Providence” (SER 2:539, see also 2:549). This may be an echo of Cicero, *Nature of the Gods* 1.2.3. Wesley paraphrases Cicero, *Nature* 2.30.75 and 3.40.95 in the text of the sermon (SER 2:535, 536).
33. SER 2:542.
34. *O tu, bone omnipotens, qui sic curas unumquemque nostrum, tamquam solum cures; et sic omnes, tamquam singulos!* (PL 32:692).
35. SER 2:548.
36. SER 2:56-57; see also 2:372; 3:93-94.
37. SER 2:541
38. SER 3:548, 551-52, 555. For an early statement of Wesley’s objections to unconditional predestination, see JWJ 1:22-23 (July 29, 1725).
39. *Predestination Calmly Considered* (JWW 10:210).
40. SER 3:207
41. SER 3:204.
42. SER 1:124.
43. JWJ 6:175 (August 18, 1775). The book to which Wesley refers is Josiah Tucker, *Letters to the Rev. Dr. Kippis, Occasioned by His Treatise, Entituled, A Vindication of the Protestant Dissenting Ministers, With Regard to Their Late Application to Parliament* (Gloucester Isic): Printed by R. Raikes, 1773). Josiah Tucker (1712-99) was an early critic of Wesley and Methodism. He served as Vicar of All Saints’, Bristol and later as Dean of Gloucester. Tucker wrote extensively on economic matters and opposed the war against the American colonies.
44. The Confession does not mention election and predestination.

45. Tucker, 96, 97, 117
46. An Explanation of Certain Passages from the Epistle of the Apostle to the Romans 60 (translation by Mary I. Bogan). 47 JWW 10:265.
48. JWL 8:238 (September 15, 1790).
49. *A Plain Account of Christian Perfection* (JW 11:444).
50. JWW 11:444.
51. JWW, 11:396; see JWL 5:322 (June 16, 1772).
52. Excerpt from the Synod's proceedings, as translated by B. R. Rees, *Pelagius: A Reluctant Heretic* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1988), 136.
53. *On the Lord's Sermon on the Mount* 2.9; 3.10; In *Retractions* 1.19.2, Augustine qualifies the view he expressed in 3.10.
54. *On Punishment and Forgiveness of Sins* 6.7; *On the Spirit and the Letter* 35.62; *On Nature and Grace* 60.70.
55. Jesus Christ is not part of the discussion. Augustine affirms that he is Perfect Man (*On the Spirit and the Letter* 1.1).
56. *On Nature and Grace* 42.49; 44.51; 68.82.
57. *On the Spirit and the Letter* 35.62; *Against Two Pelagian Letters* 4.10.27; *On Punishment and Forgiveness of Sins* 7.8.
58. Note, however, that Augustine allows a "limited" or "relative" perfection here on earth (*On Grace and Free Will* 1.1; *Christian Instruction* 1.39.43; *On the Grace of Christ and Original Sin* 48.53; *Against Two Pelagian Letters* 3.7.19,23).
59. George Fox (1624-91) was the founder of the Society of Friends (Quakers).
60. SER 2:556. Wesley published a *Concise Ecclesiastical History* in 1781. It was based upon a book which he had read a few years earlier, Johann Lorenz von Mosheim (trans. Archibald Maclaine), *An Ecclesiastical History, Ancient and Modern, From the Birth of Christ, to the Beginning of the Eighteenth Century* (Mosheim's preface is dated March 23, 1755; I will be quoting the second edition [London, 1825]). The following passage appears in Mosheim's book (1:362). Did it influence or reinforce Wesley's judgment regarding Augustine? "A sublime genius, an uninterrupted and zealous pursuit of truth, an indefatigable application and invincible patience, a sincere piety, and a subtle and lively wit, conspired to establish his [Augustine's] fame upon the most lasting foundations. It is, however, certain, that the accuracy and solidity of judgment were, by no means, proportionable to the eminent talents now mentioned; and that, upon many occasions, he was more guided by the violent impulse of a warm imagination than by the cool dictates of reason and prudence." (Mosheim [1694-1755] helped to found the University of Göttingen where he served as professor of theology and chancellor. He is reputed to be "the first of modern ecclesiastical historians.")
61. JWL 4:158 (July 7, 1761).
62. Jeremy Collier, *An Ecclesiastical History of Great Britain. . . To the End of the Reign of King Charles the Second*, 2 vols. (London: Printed for Samuel Keble and Benjamin Tooke, 1708), 1:42. Collier adds to his list of Pelagius, writings the quotations from his books *On Nature and In Defense of Free Will*, to be found in Augustine, *On Nature and Grace*.
63. *Pelagius's Commentary on St. Paul's Epistle to the Romans*, trans. Theodore de Bruyn (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988), 97, 99 (Romans 6:7, 20); "To Demetrias" 8.4; 10.3; 24.2; 27.3.4 (*The Letters of Pelagius and His Followers*, trans. B. R. Rees [Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1991], 44-45, 48, 62, 67).
64. "To Demetrias" 8.4 (Rees, 44-45), referring to Romans 6:14.
65. Robert F. Evans, *Pelagius: Inquiries and Reappraisals* (London: Adam and Charles Black, 1968), 111; Rees, *Letters*, 7
66. Evans, 112; Rees, *Pelagius: A Reluctant Heretic*, 91.

- 67 *The Doctrine of Original Sin* (JWW 9:273); "On Working Out Our Own Salvation" (SER 3:203-4, 207-8); "On Conscience" (SER 3:481-82)
68. Albert C. Outler, "Pastoral Care in the Wesleyan Spirit," in *The Wesleyan Theological Heritage*, eds. Thomas C. Oden and L. R. Longden (Grand Rapids: Zondervan Publishing House, 1991), 181; in the same collection, see also "John Wesley as Theologian—Then and Now," 65; "Methodism's Theological Heritage," 196, 198-99.
69. Outler, "Pastoral Care," 182.
70. SER 2:188.
71. Outler, "Pastoral Care," 182.
72. Note that Wesley rejects the Augustinian conception of the Church's holiness, to wit, the Church is called "holy" "because all its ordinances [sacraments] are designed to promote holiness" (SER 2:55).
73. Progress toward perfection: "On the Divine Law" 10.1; "To Celantia" 32; inward and outward holiness: "To Demetrias" 12; "On the Divine Law" 1.2; "On the Christian Life" 10.2; Love of God and Neighbor: "On the Christian Life" 9.1,2; 10. 1; "To Celantia" 15 (all in Rees, *Letters*).
74. SER 3 :55-56.
75. Geoffrey G. Willis, *Saint Augustine and the Donatist Controversy* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1950), 117
76. Willis, 144-45. The Donatists have in mind the traditores ("betrayers") who handed over Bibles to be burned during the Great Persecution, inaugurated by Emperor Diocletian (303-13 AD).
77. SER 1:682-83, see 26th Article of Religion. In this regard, Wesley agreed with Augustine.
78. JWL 3:170-71 (March 12, 1756).
79. For summaries of this legislation, see W.H.C. Frend, *The Donatist Church: A Movement of Protest in Roman North Africa* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985), 263-64, 289. Notice the arguments against persecution, based on Scripture, given by the Donatist bishop, Petilian, and Augustine's replies thereto (*Answer to Petilian* 2.85.188-88.194).
80. John C. English, "John Wesley and the Rights of Conscience," *Journal of Church and State* 37 (Spring 1995):349-63.
81. Sir Richard Hill (1732-1808): Calvinist layman; M.A., Oxford, 1754; baronet, 1783; M.P for Shropshire, 1780-1806. Augustus M. Toplady (1740-78): Anglican clergyman; B.A., Trinity College, Dublin, 1760; Rector of Broadhembury (Devon); author of "Rock of ages cleft for me."
82. Some examples of Calvin's references to Augustine: *Institutes* 3.22.8 (letter 194, 8,35; *On the Gift of Perseverance* 19.49; *On the Grace of Christ and Original Sin* 1.46.51; *Institutes* 3.23.5: letter 186, 7.23, *Institutes* 3.23.8: *Literary Commentary on Genesis* 6.15.26; *Institutes* 3.24.13: *Literary Commentary on Genesis* 11.10.13.
83. *The Doctrine of Absolute Predestination Stated and Asserted...Translated, in Great Measure, From the Letter of Jerom Zanchius* [by A.M. Toplady] (New York: Printed by Hodge and Shober, 1773), 65, 68, 69 and elsewhere. Toplady's translation was originally published in London (1769). A pamphlet attributed to Wesley, which summarizes Toplady's translation, is the evidence for Wesley's knowledge of Zanchius' book (JWW 14:190-98; see editor's headnote, JWL 5:167 [December 30, 1769]. Hieronymus Zanchius (Girolamo Zanchi) was a Catholic and an Italian by birth. Converting to Protestantism, he left Italy in 1551. Among his other academic posts, he was professor of dogmatics at the University of Heidelberg, 1568-76.
84. *Institutes* 4.7.12.
85. *Letters of George Whitefield for the Period 1734-1742* (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth Trust, 1976), 209 (letter dated September 23, 1740). Whitefield suggested to Wesley that he read Elisha Coles' book, *A Practical Discourse of God's Sovereignty: With other Material points derived*

thence (London: Printed for Ben. Griffin, 1673) (*Letters*, 211 Idated September 24, 1740). Coles affirms unconditional predestination and rejects perfection in this life (239, 264). In fact, Wesley had begun to read Coles' book before he received Whitefield's letter (JWW 2:380 (August 27, 1740)). Elisha Coles (1608?-88) was a Calvinist layman and clerk to the English East India Company

86. *A Catechism truly representing the doctrines and practice of the Church of Rome, with an answer thereto* (London: R. Chiswell, 1686) John Williams (1636?-1709), an Anglican clergyman, was an Oxford graduate (M.A., 1658) who became Bishop of Chichester (1696).

87. *Roman Catechism*, in JWW 10:113, 118; see SER 1:382.

88. *Roman Catechism*, in n JW 10:118, 119. Williams' references are inexact. He cites in support of his conclusion Augustine, letter 23 (without further specification) and Against Adimantus 12.3. Augustine uses the noun "sign" in letter 23.2 and "to sign" and "to prefigure" in 23.4 (PL33:95, 96). In *Against Adimantus* 12.3 he says "sign," not "figure" (PL42:144).

89. *Roman Catechism*, in JWW 10:113 (Augustine to Januarius).

90. *Quid aliud in Scripturis Canonici commendatur* (PL33:200); translation by Wilfrid Parsons.

91. *Roman Catechism*, in JWW 10:127, citing *Explanations of the Psalms* 141.9. Other examples of "sacraments" (not given by Williams): creed and Lord's Prayer (sermon 228.3); taste of salt as part of the baptismal rite (*On Teaching the Uninstructed* 26.50); chrismation following baptism (*Answer to Petilian* 2.104,239); "tree of life" in the Garden of Eden (*Unfinished Work in Answer to Julian* 6.30); "sacrament of the ark" (*Against Faustus* 19.12).

92. Originally published as an appendix to *The Pious Communicant Rightly Prepared* (London: Printed for Charles Harper, 1700).

93. JWW 10:197, citing *Literal Commentary on Genesis* 10.23.29.

94. The abridgment formed the preface to *Hymns on the Lord's Supper* by John and Charles Wesley. It was published as a separate pamphlet in 1754. The abridgment is to be found in J. Ernest Rattenbury, *The Eucharistic Hymns of John and Charles Wesley* (London: Epworth Press, 1948), 176-93. Daniel Brevint (1616-95), an Anglican clergyman, was a Doctor of Divinity (Oxford, 1663) and Dean of Lincoln. *On the Christian Sacrament* was published originally in 1673.

95. *On the Christian Sacrament*, in Rattenbury, 187

96. For a recent appreciation of Pelagius, see J. Philip Newell, *Listening For the Heartbeat of God: A Celtic Spirituality* (New York: Paulist Press, 1997), chapter 1.

Appendix

The following list includes the places in JWW where Augustine is quoted or paraphrased, or he is mentioned by name. It corrects and extends the list given by Ted A. Campbell, *John Wesley and Christian Antiquity* (Nashville: Kingswood Books, 1991), 126-27

An Address to the Clergy (JWW 10:484)—recommends "some acquaintance" with Augustine's works *A Dialogue between A Predestinarian and His Friend* (JWW 10:265)—Predestinarian says that "our doctrine" "was maintained by St. Augustine;" Friend replies, "Augustine speaks sometimes for it, and sometimes against it."

The Doctrine of Original Sin, according to Scripture, Reason, and Experience (JWW 9:415, 429, 430)—Augustine is cited by name in the extracts from Samuel Hebdan which Wesley appends to this book. Pages 415 and 430 discuss the primitive tradition regarding original sin. The passage on 429 may be based on Augustine, *The Grace of Christ and Original Sin* 2.24.28.

Journal, 3:236 (March 9, 1746)—sentence quoted, alleged to be the last words of Augustine: "Lord, forgive me my sins of omission" (see also SER 1:344). Possidius, Augustine's first

biographer, was present when he died. He says nothing about Augustine's last words (*Sancta Augustini Vita Scripta A Possidio Episcopo*, ed. and trans. Herbert T. Weiskotten [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1919], 143) This sentence is a slightly garbled version of Archbishop James Ussher's last words, as reported by his domestic chaplain, Nicholas Bernard (*The Life and Death of the Most Reverend and Learned Father of our Church, Dr. James Usher* [London: Printed by E. Tyler, 1656], 110). After quoting the Archbishop, "But Lord in speciall forgive my sinnes of omission," Bernard goes on to say that Possidius' description of Augustine after his conversion "seemed to me to be the very picture" of Ussher. Then Bernard provides an extensive list of parallels between the two men (110-15), drawing upon Possidius. These circumstances explain the attribution of Ussher's words to Augustine.

Letters (references to Telford's edition).

John Wesley to Samuel Wesley, Sr., December 19, 1729 (JWL 1:45) - reference to Augustine's Manichean period; no quotation from him.

John Wesley to "John Smith," December 3C, 1745 (JWL 2:60) - extended quotation, in Latin, from *Confessions* 7 10.16.

John Wesley to "John Smith," June 25, 1746 (JWL 2:70-71) - Augustine mentioned by name; probable reference to *Confessions* 7 10.16 (see previous letter).

John Wesley to William Dodd, March 3, 1756 (JWL 3:170-71) - reference to Augustine and Donatists; no quotation from Augustine.

John Wesley to George Horne, March, 1762 (JWL 4:176) - reference to Augustine's doctrine of justification by faith; Anglican Homily on the Salvation of Man quoted.

John Wesley to William Warburton, November 26, 1762 (JWL 4:359) - Wesley attributes to Augustine the assertion, "I would not tell a wilful lie to save the souls of the whole world." Augustine wrote two books on truth and falsehood, *Lying (De mendacio)* and *Against Lying (Contra mendacium)*. The sentence which Wesley attributes to Augustine does not appear in either of them. Perhaps *Against Lying* 21 41 (PL40:548) is the source of Wesley's "quotation:" "Let no man disown and blaspheme Christ so that he may be able to make someone else a Christian" (translation by Harold B. Jaffee).

John Wesley to John Fletcher, August 18, 1775 (JWL 6:175) - reference to Augustine and Pelagius; no quotation from Augustine.

John Wesley to Sarah Wesley, April 12, 1771 (JWL 7:58) - *Confessions* 1 1.1 quoted.

John Wesley to Henry Brooke, June 14, 1786 (JWL 7:333-34) - Wesley "quotes" Augustine as saying, *Errare possum, haereticus esse nolo*. Perhaps the thought behind this sentence is to be found in Augustine, *The Grace of Christ and original Sin* 2.23.26 (PL44-397), but these are not the bishop's words.

Popery Calmly Considered (JWW 10:149) - states that, according to Augustine, God has instituted two sacraments only.

A Roman Catechism, Faithfully Drawn out of the Allowed Writings of the Church of Rome, With A Reply Thereto (JWW 10:86-128).

JWW 10:87-88: Holding to Christ the Head is "the one great note of the Church," according to Augustine, citing *Against the Donatists* 3.4. Augustine's teaching is being summarized here; the phrase in quotation marks does not appear in this passage.

JWW 10:90-91: referring to Augustine, *Against the Letter of Petilian* (perhaps 3.6.7) to show that "there is now no divine authority but the Scriptures."

JWW 10:93: quoting Augustine *On the Lord's Sermon on the Mount* 2.12.41, "The sheep should not cast away their skin, because wolves sometimes hide themselves under it."

JWW 10:94: quoting Augustine, *Against the Donatists* 3.6: "if I would have the Church demonstrated, it is not by human teachings, but by the divine oracles."

JWW 10:100-1: quoting Augustine, *Questions on the Gospels* 2.38, "The bosom of Abraham is

the rest of the blessed poor, whose is the kingdom of heaven, into which, after this life, they are received."

- JWW 10:111: quoting Augustine, *On Faith and the Creed* 7.14 to show that placing "an image in a Christian temple is abominable."
- JWW 10:113: citing Augustine letter 54.1.1 (addressed to Januarius), to show that God has instituted two sacraments only, baptism and the Lord's Supper. (The number of the letter, according to the *Roman Catechism*, is 118.)
- JWW 10:118: citing Augustine, letter 23 on sacraments as "figures." This is a vague reference; perhaps it refers to 23.4.
- JWW 10:119: citing Augustine, *Against Adimantus* 12.3 to show that the Eucharistic bread and wine are the "figures" of Christ's body and blood. Actually, Augustine uses the word *signum* instead of *figura* in 12.3 (PL42:144).
- JWW 10:127: reference to Augustine, letter 138.1.7, in which he states "that signs, when applied to religious things, are called sacraments." (The number of this letter, according to the *Roman Catechism*, is 5.)
- JWW 10:127: reference to Augustine, *Explanations of the Psalms* 141.9, in connection with the previous statement, "In this large sense he calls the sign of the cross a sacrament." Sermons (numbered according to Outler's edition).
29. "Sermon on the Mount, IX" (SER 1:635) - statement in Latin, with English translation: "Optimus Dei cultus, imitari quem colis - 'It is the best worship or service of God, to imitate him you worship.'" Outler suggests that this may be a garbled reference to Augustine, *City of God* 8.17.2 (religionis summa sit imitari quem colis [PL41:242]).
37. "The Nature of Enthusiasm" (SER 2:57) - paraphrasing in Latin (with English translation) Augustine, *Confessions* 3.11.19 (Augustine's text: *O tu, bone omnipotens, qui sic curas unumquemque nostrum, tamquam solum cures; et sic omnes, tamquam singulos!* [PL32:692]).
51. "The Good Steward" (SER 2:285) - paraphrasing in English Augustine, *Confessions* 5.1.1 (Augustine's text: *Accipe sacrificium confessionum mearum de manu linguae meae, quam formasti et excitasti, ut confiteatur nomini tuo* [PL32:705]).
54. "On Eternity" (SER 2:372) - paraphrasing and translating Augustine, *Confessions* 3.11.19 (see sermon 37 above).
63. "The General Spread of the Gospel" (SER 2:490) - inexact quotation of Augustine, sermon 169.11.13 (*Qui ergo fecit te sine te* [Wesley: *Qui fecit nos sine nobis*], *non te justificat sine te* [Wesley: *non salvabit nos sine nobis*] [PL38:923]), with English translation.
67. "On Divine Providence" (SER 2:548) - paraphrasing and translating Augustine, *Confessions* 3.11.19 (see sermon 37 above).
68. "The Wisdom of God's Counsels" (SER 2:556) - reference to Augustine by name; no quotation.
77. "Spiritual Worship" (SER 3:93-94) paraphrasing and translating Augustine, *Confessions* 3.11.19 (see sermon 37 above).
84. "The Important Question" (SER 3:189) - quotation in English from Augustine, *Confessions* 1.1.1 (Wesley's translation: "Thou hast made us for thyself, and our heart cannot rest until it resteth in thee").

85. "On Working Out Our Own Salvation" (SER 3:208) - inexact quotation from Latin, with English translation, from Augustine, sermon 169.11.13 (see sermon 63 above).
103. "What Is Man?" (SER 3.:459) - quotation in Latin, with English translation, from Augustine, *Confessions*, 1.1.1 (*aliqua portio creaturae tuae*).
120. "The Unity of the Divine Being" (SER 4:64) - quotation in Latin, with English translation, from Augustine, *Confessions* 1.1.1 (see sermon 84 above).
- Some Remarks on Mr. Hill's 'Review of All the Doctrines Taught by Mr Wesley'* (JWW 10:403) - comment on Hill's misuse of quotations from Augustine not relevant to the point he is trying to establish.
- Thoughts upon Necessity* (JWW 10:469) - reference to Augustine's Manichean period; no quotation from him.
- A Treatise on Baptism* (JWW 10:197) - citing Augustine, *Literal Commentary on Genesis* 10.23.39 in support of the following statement: "To baptize infants has been the general practice of the Christian Church, in all places and in all ages."

For completeness' sake, I am listing below three items which are not to be found in JWW Wesley, "Of the Weekly Fasts of the Church" (Ted A. Campbell, *John Wesley and Christian Antiquity*, appendix 1, 123) - reference to Augustine and the Donatists; no quotation from Augustine. *The Christian Sacrament and Sacrifice Extracted from Dr. Brevint* (John E. Rattenbury, *The Eucharistic Hymns of John and Charles Wesley*, 187) - reference to Augustine, *Against Faustus* 20.21 *Concise Ecclesiastical History* (1781), 1:174 - cool reference to Augustine.

Wesley founded a monthly publication, the *Arminian Magazine*, in 1778. He continued to edit the journal until his death in 1791 Wesley published in the Magazine a great deal of material which he had written himself or borrowed (sometimes silently) from others. If this material mentions Augustine by name, and it was included in Wesley's collected works, it has been cited in the body of this paper and/or listed in the first part of this appendix. However, the *Magazine* includes a number of other references to Augustine, which are summarized below.

- a. AM 1 (January 1778):viii - John Wesley, "To the Reader" (dated November 1, 1777): Thomas Aquinas added point to Augustine's doctrine of predestination.
- b. Wesley inserted three incidents from the *Confessions* in the Magazine. Presumably they were drawn from his own reading of the book. They are Confessions 9.9.19 (Monica proposed as a model for Christian wives to imitate); 9.8.17-18 (servant who trained Monica not to drink wine); and 3.4.7-8 (Augustine's desire for wisdom stimulated by Cicero) (AM 10 [July 1787]:379-80, 381).
- c. Allegations that Augustine's doctrines of grace and predestination were "novelties," and therefore untrue. AM 1 (1778):61, 307, 350; 12 (1789):339, 505, 506, 511
- d. Augustinian and Calvinistic doctrine of predestination not the doctrine of the Church of England, as stated in its formularies. AM 3 (1780):291, 302.

- e. Quoting Augustine in support of "Arminian" doctrines of grace, destination and freedom of the will. AM 1 (1778):395, 547; 3 (1780):302, 526; 11 (1788): 282-83, 284, 337-39, 395, 396, 450-51, 452, 506, 507; 12 (1789):508-9, 619-20.
- f. Other references to Augustine: AM 1 (1778):101-2, 304, 351, 391, 397, 435, 490; 2 (1779):403, 588; 4 (1781):386, 432, 494; 7 (1784):287; 10 (1787):379-80, 381, 11 (1788):260, 367; 13 (1790):1.