

COMMUNITIES OF HOLINESS, COMMUNITIES OF THE SPIRIT DEVELOPING AN ECCLESIAL CONVERSATION FOR DISCIPLESHIP¹

—◆◆◆—
DEAN G BLEVINS²

INTRODUCTION

When grandchildren and great-grandchildren gather at the family reunion, when they stare at one another around the dinner table or across the church campgrounds, one often experiences mixed feelings of curiosity and consternation. How in the world did the family name get around so much? And yet Wesleyan-Holiness scholars/ministers and their Pentecostal counterparts are being invited to the “table” during annual meetings and other professional gatherings where we (like many family reunions) acknowledge to some degree a common ancestor, John Wesley.³ We do, however, acknowledge that family lines have indeed diverged quite a bit since those early days of the Methodist revival due to a complex number of other influential family members, including leaders in the American Holiness movement and the African-Pentecostal movement.⁴ Nevertheless, much like children thrust toward one another by parents, Wesleyans and Pentecostals are ultimately discovering new friends and colleagues in spite of the differences. Perhaps all are discovering that, in spite of different terms like Holiness, Methodist, Pentecostal and Wesleyan, we still bear a family resemblance of sorts; perhaps one which no more than acknowledges that these very mixed metaphors apply describe our venerable “reasonable enthusiast” Wesley himself.⁵ So the differences today seem to coincide with the Methodist revival from which the movements sprang, and the task today, faithful discipleship, no different from Wesley’s vision. The question remains how this “playful” gathering might continue after beyond combined meetings: when the meals are complete, the games are done, the reunion goodbyes are said, and scholars and ministers return to respective homes.⁶ Can our combined efforts continue to engage in faithful discipleship for the sake of Christ’s kingdom?

Dean Blevins is Professor of Christian Education and Director of the Masters of Arts in Christian Education Program, Nazarene Theological Seminary, Kansas City.

THE ASBURY THEOLOGICAL JOURNAL

FALL 2005
VOL 60 • NO 2

The purpose of this article is to set forth a scheme for discussing discipleship which, hopefully, both affirms family resemblances yet also acknowledges our differences. Bringing Wesleyan-Holiness and Pentecostal folk together to forge linkages for faithful discipleship may not be an easy task considering our history has not always been so cordial.⁷ However, both groups may have a new beginning point for conversation by consulting grandfathers John and Charles Wesley. The Wesleys' desire to create a people, shaped by an emphasis on worship and a disciplined way of living, provides a "clue" to the conversation. Wesley's desire involves community practice as well as personal change; bridges both devotion and discipline to provide an understanding of how communities anchored in the Holy Spirit and communities focused on holiness of heart and life inform one another concerning discipleship.⁸

This article continues first by exploring the role of community context and practice as the best point of departure for dialog. The study then focuses on worship as one common community practice passionately shared by Pentecostals and Wesleyans as the best point of departure for understanding both transformed communities and persons. The article demonstrates how worship, broadly conceived, serves as a template for a comprehensive approach to discipleship anchored in three "liturgically shaped" processes known as formation, discernment, and transformation. At various points through this writing there is an intentional effort to connect the argument not only to Wesley but also to the Pentecostal experience through research resources from that tradition. While the author is more comfortable with the Wesleyan tradition, a real desire exists to demonstrate the faithfulness of both traditions.

BEGINNING WITH COMMUNITY

Forging a new way of fostering the conversation negates neither issues of doctrine nor interpretations of experience. However, following the work of George Lindbeck, this new method attempts to move beyond the impasse often created in these approaches. If Lindbeck is correct, arguments over doctrinal differences based on propositional assumptions often reach a point of limited returns.⁹ Framing arguments strictly in terms of religious experience may be equally problematic, particularly when experience is interwoven with communal shaping and interpretation.¹⁰ Instead, one might begin this alternative perspective by asking how both community culture and community language informs discipleship in our different traditions. Dialog over discipleship could begin with the communities we inhabit and the ecclesial notions that embody both "heavenly" transformation and the daily call to the Imitation of Christ, both notions resident within the Christian tradition.¹¹ Such an ecclesial approach affords a hopeful framework for exploring faithful practices in communities of the Spirit and communities of Holiness.

Determining the most appropriate method to encourage this ecclesial conversation is tenuous.¹² One should consider an approach that will guide both critical investigation and stimulate imaginative dialog. A point of departure may rest with a common passion within contemporary Pentecostal and Holiness movements (as well as our elder Wesleys): a passion for the transformative power of worship. Such a beginning point allows us to explore a sacramental hermeneutic of worship-centered

discipleship, which results in a broader conversation between Wesleyans and Pentecostals over the formative, discerning and transformative acts of discipleship.

WORSHIP AS COMMON GROUND

Whether high church Anglican or expressive Pentecostal, worship provides a common ground where all persons seek to celebrate "heaven below," and live in the alternative reality of the Kingdom of God. In Wesley's day this worship could not be separated from the sacramental celebration of the Lord's Supper; either through the actual practice of the Eucharist or through Methodist music that often embodied this sacramental reality in society gatherings and other celebrative events.¹³

Wesley envisioned this worship-filled life, one freed by the grace of God but also anchored in the devotion and discipline of day-to-day Methodist living. Doxology, for Wesley and others, emphasizes the corporate context of worship as praise to God.¹⁴ The broader liturgical setting that surrounded Holy Communion, generated a "world" for the participant, a culture inhabited by the God of the Eucharist. The creation of this world included ritual actions, the organization of space and ordering of time, as well as some degree of involvement by the participants.¹⁵ The arrangement of furniture, including the altar, and the order of the liturgy often determined who would and would not be a part of the "world" of the Eucharist. The Lord's Supper, in this interpretation, becomes a transformative event in which eschatology, the new heaven, becomes realized in the midst of the worshipping people.¹⁶ The arrangement of the worship "space" (from placement of the Supper, reception of the elements, and other actions) indicates something of the representation (even nature) of heaven on earth.¹⁷ In all worship, conditioned by the liturgical framework of the Eucharist, provides a different vision of reality; creating an alternative world that later fuels the broader discipleship of daily Methodist living.

Such a life of open celebration and alternative living seems evident in the radical evangelical expressions of the American Holiness Movement and Pentecostalism. As Grant Wacker notes, early Pentecostals desired to live as if they were in another world.¹⁸ According to Wacker, Cheryl Bridges Johns, Steve Land, and others, Pentecostal worship includes an oral liturgy.¹⁹ This liturgy includes embodied phenomenon, such as being slain in the spirit or speaking in tongues, which may well signify a Pentecostal desire to participate within and also live out an alternative, eschatological world of celebration in daily life.²⁰ Pentecostals, while resistant of formal expressions of liturgy, still maintain some semblance of structured worship, including ritual expressions of praise, proclamation and response reminiscent of other Christian traditions.²¹ It seems a fair assessment that the Pentecostal tradition shares a common desire with Wesley to participate in an alternative world through worship, an "otherness" to God's Kingdom.²² In addition, like Wesley, the eschatological vision extends throughout life so that the very holiness and power of God expressed in worship becomes the liturgical "logic" of everyday life practiced in faithful discipleship.

Methodist scholars have long noted the interrelationship between Wesley's emphasis of devotional practice conditioned by worship and his emphasis on disciplined living.²³ Similarly the radical expression of worship within Pentecostalism

evokes an alternative way of living as God's instruments within the world.²⁴ The combined desire of worship and daily discipline may well provide a hermeneutical approach to discipleship, one anchored in Wesley's sacramental sensibilities as well as in Pentecostal practice.

FORMATION, DISCERNMENT AND TRANSFORMATION

Liturgy and sacrament together define the gathered community's entrance into the Kingdom (during the act of worship) as well as the community's outward expression to the broader world as a "sign" or symbol of this alternative kingdom.²⁵ As such, the Lord's Supper provides the exemplar of the broader act of worship and sacrament, describing both the process and expressions of heaven below. Elsewhere I have argued that such a process may result in a "liturgically-constructed self" where Christian lives are formed via celebrative gratitude, self-sacrificial commitment and Spirit directed transformation.²⁶ Worship, in general, and Eucharistic celebration, in particular, are marked by doxology (praise and celebration of God's grace), oblation or sacrifice (evoked through the anamnesis or remembrance of Christ's self-sacrificial gracious act), and epiclesis (the call and discernment of the presence of the Holy Spirit both in the Eucharist and in the world at large).

Under-girded by a sacramental vision of the liturgically constructed self, Wesleyans and Pentecostals might anchor their discipleship practices in three equally complementary (and complimentary) approaches: formation, discernment and transformation. These approaches may be seen as discrete although they share features. However, the three approaches are better understood as liturgical "moves" within the life of the congregation as they participate in the construal of the liturgical self. The purpose here is to explore these three approaches, recognizing that the lines between them are not sharp.

Formation as Christian Discipleship

Formation as a specific subset of worship-centered discipleship assumes grace is mediated by intentional assimilation of persons into the Christian culture through a series of established Christian practices. Persons are formed doxologically as they participate in the total life of the faith community, often described by the discrete practices that identify that community. By faithful (i.e. intentional) participation, persons are shaped into Christian character and transformed by their new doxological identity.

Formation occurs as persons are socialized into the Christian faith through the life and practices of the faith community. People are transformed, personally and communally, through the traditional practices of the Christian faith.²⁷ As the entire sacramental life of the congregation is modeled to some degree in all of its practices, Christians are shaped into a doxological community. Christian mediating practices collectively shape a Christian's understanding of God. The practices provide a way of responding to God's active presence by rehearsing a way of life that is Christian.²⁸ The repetitive use of these practices could shape Christian character and provided continual transformation into holiness of heart and life. Each practice includes the sacramental possibility of ongoing transformation through knowing God. Formation is

not strictly behavior modification but includes “behavioral transformation” as well.

Obviously worship would stand at the center of Formation. This formative practice, however, is dynamic. Jean-Jaques Suurmond cautions that Pentecostals (and I would argue holiness folk) have struggled to find a *via media* between rigid “order” and complete lack of structure, neither of which allow for a “playfulness” that shapes our participation in God’s creative and re-creative act.²⁹ Worship shaped around doxology, oblation and epiclesis provides broad formative frameworks for congregants that center them in a Eucharistic life of holiness and Spirit. As such the practices of worship would shape the spirituality of its participants.³⁰

Worship, while a necessary beginning point, is part of a larger ecology of church practices, including the broader domains of ministry, discipleship, outreach and polity. Many specific practices might be understood either as means of grace or “body life” within the congregation.³¹ Each domain of congregational life includes a formative process and the collective interplay of all these domains reveals either a deliberate formative life or an eclectic dissipation of confusing, contradictory practices. An array of complementary practices, however, reveals the potential of shaping persons into a liturgical reality consistent with the themes already addressed.

Ministers and congregational leaders from both traditions would assess church activities in relation to their faithfulness to these larger frameworks of the sacramental life. All practices within the church, traditional or new, could also be examined for their formative potential. This exploration of church practices suggests a complementary educational approach, discernment, to formative discipleship.

Discernment as Christian Discipleship

Discerning which practices are truly formative involves both critical investigation and a constructive (or imaginative) appreciation of God’s ongoing activity through the epicletic movements of the Holy Spirit. As the Spirit of God both binds the congregation and sends persons into the world, discernment is both a critical and creative assessment of the faithful life of the congregation as it draws people from the larger social context yet engages that context both within and beyond the congregation.

Discernment, following its Latin root, *discerner*, is an activity of shifting and distinguishing. Theorists may associate this act of discrimination with visual imagery, as Charles Wood suggests, indicating distance and difference.³² Discernment may also be an aural activity, indicating a type of hearing that invites the person to closer attention in order to appreciate the intricate harmonies within a musical score. Congregants practicing discernment not only discriminate between options but also appreciate and harmonize many of the possibilities available. Discernment, in this sense, includes critical and constructive/imaginative components.

Fostering critical thinking can be a difficult task in our communities. It takes courage to release one’s control of knowledge and trust the Holy Spirit to guide both ministers and parishioners in the pursuit of truth.³³ This type of thinking begins by asking hard questions of the historical, cultural and psychological assumptions that influence Christian life and practice. This approach may include specific challenges to both traditions; particularly how scripture might be interpreted for use in congregations,

as well as how certain religious experiences might be reified into normative expectations. However, ministers and congregants may view such questions as less threatening when framed in the light of grace and our mutual search for God's ongoing guidance. Such discernment means encouraging parishioners to develop questions rather than always providing the answers.³⁴

Critical discernment occurs as practitioners investigate the possibility of any new practice contributing to the liturgical construction of the self. All practices do not automatically qualify as means of grace. God's transformative grace must be evident with the practice. Each practice, within its context, must be analyzed not only to determine if it mediates grace but also whether it impedes God's grace.³⁵ Approaches to liberative discipleship model this aspect of discernment when congregants challenge oppressive structures and practices in the world that impede God's gracious activity.³⁶ Pentecostal discernment acknowledges an ongoing radical reinterpretation of the world, often in the face of third world poverty and oppression.³⁷

Discernment is more than critical analysis; the approach includes a constructive thought and action (which is explored more fully in the next approach). Theorists practicing discernment must include imagination and constructive thought. The very process of critical discernment itself can become a sacramental act.³⁸ Theologically, creative discernment acknowledges the power of the Holy Spirit to empower new structures for the sake of conveying God's free grace, so that the presence of Jesus Christ might be revealed in the most remarkable places and during the most mundane practices. Creative discernment is an interpretive practice of naming God at work in the world and also seeking the means to God's gracious activity.³⁹ Eschatologically the practice of creative discernment is anticipatory of the promises of God that are themselves evident in practices.⁴⁰

Discernment becomes an ongoing task for discipleship within the Christian community. This approach invites an ongoing openness to contextual practices that might, for a time, reveal God's grace. Identifying such practices within the community reveals a form of constructive discernment and determining their validity requires critical assessment. Cultivating the capacity to discern God's activity in new practices also helps the participant to appreciate God's grace at work within the formative practices. Discernment increases the faithfulness of participants as they expectantly seek God's transforming grace in the means of grace. These means of grace also suggest activities that seek to create as well as identify transformation.

Transformation as Christian Discipleship

Transformation may be seen as the overall goal of Christian discipleship. However, it may also be seen as the *Imitatio Christi*, the Imitation of Christ, mirroring the oblation or sacrificial action of the liturgical self.⁴¹ As a form of discipleship, the purpose of transformation may well be healing and liberating not only persons and Christian communities, but also the larger society and all of creation.⁴²

Contemporary efforts to transform social structures and the environment include a number of liberative attempts, including Paulo Freire's conscientization.⁴³ Conscientization is an educational process that not only critically discerns the existing social order, but

also seeks to reform the order.⁴⁴ Pentecostalism provides its own form of transformation via empowerment by the Spirit. The vision (discernment) of the alternative, doxological, kingdom of God yields an approach that indicates (like Methodists of Wesley's day) an alternative way of living in the world. As Cheryl Bridges Johns notes "the cognitive restructuring and changes in self image result in behavior as if God is all powerful and in control in spite of the fact that the existing social order says otherwise."⁴⁵ This alternative "view" fuels the activity of the Christians, particularly the marginated, toward the transformation of their world.

Transformation, within our sacramental/communal setting, is never just for personal benefit; it is to redeem the broader creation. Persons participating in the liturgical moves of transformative discipleship are invited to "incarnate" the very sacramental practices they themselves engage; to become themselves a "means of grace" for others. A transformative approach to Christian discipleship mirrors this desire to be both transformed and transforming. Communal practices may problematize the current social condition, revealing activities that restrict the freedom of persons, particularly those on the margins of life. Communities then creatively adopt strategies that are more compassionate and just; and they seek to enact these strategies as an expression of responsible discipleship. These actions, often taken as communal forms, lead to ongoing praxis, the continual reflection-in-action on the various activities of compassion and justice. The power of this approach is that new learning emerges from the attempts to create transformation, which is used to re-energize and re-focus additional transformative efforts.

COMMUNITIES IN CONVERSATION

The three approaches of formation, discernment and transformation provide a broad understanding of discipling the liturgical self. It is an approach anchored in the worship of our communities but also extends to suggest ways the total life of our congregation, through devotion and discipline, seek to shape persons and transform our world into the "new creation." Obviously these approaches are interwoven, like strands on a rope, and mutually informative in their evoking a life that is heaven-filled, sacrificially shaped and Spirit empowered. Formative practices shape persons into new ways of discerning the world from a doxological perspective. Critical and constructive discernment invites participants not only to see the critical necessity for transformation but also to envision the creative possibility of a transformed world fueled by the power of the Holy Spirit. Transformative practices, which rely upon discernment, are themselves formative, socializing persons into a community that believes and works sacrificially for transformation. These three approaches include common tasks, though the approaches themselves are discrete enough to encourage a conversation on how our mutual communities disciple the liturgically constructed self. Collectively the approaches seek to form persons and communities into a new way of living and seeing "heaven below" in our social order.

Practices may manifest themselves differently both within and between our Christian traditions. Ultimately members of both traditions must ask how the ecclesial practices they engage in participate in the liturgical construction of the self. Their

criterion for assessment will be the transformative power of grace expressed and evident in the lives of congregants. There is always a danger that these practices will be obscured through some mixture of a lack of faithful formation, poor discernment and/or failed transformative praxis. The loss may result in an abandonment of any communal or personal identity.

Faithful participation and discernment, however, may encourage ongoing transformation both within the individual, among the community and beyond to society. Hopefully the utilization of these categories will draw us back to a worship-centered discipleship manifested through our mutual communities. The Lord's Supper informs this communal effort. Perhaps this is only natural, for family gatherings, for all their playfulness, always end up around the table. Whether today, the next time we gather, or at the end of the age. This sacramental hermeneutic for ecclesial discipleship may be a way by which communities of holiness and communities of the Spirit might continue our dialog and discipleship until that day.

NOTES

- 1 Presented at the Joint Meeting of WTS/SPS, March 21, 2003.
- 2 Professor of Christian Education and Director of the Masters of Arts in Christian Education Program, Nazarene Theological Seminary, Kansas City.
- 3 Donald Dayton, *Theological Roots of Pentecostalism* (Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press 1987), 35-60; Walter J. Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism: Origins and Developments Worldwide* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers 1997), 144; Vinson Synan, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1971, 1997), 1-21
- 4 Hollenweger 182-203, Steven J. Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1991, 1997), 47
- 5 Henry D. Rack, *Reasonable Enthusiast: John Wesley and the Rise of Methodism*. Third Edition (London: Epworth Press, 2002).
- 6 Jean-Jacques Suurmond, *Work & Spirit at Play: Towards a Charismatic Theology* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1995), 73-97
- 7 Nancy L. Eiland, "Irreconcilable Differences: Conflict, Schism, and Religious Restructuring in a United Methodist Church," in *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*, eds. Edith Blumhofer, Russel Spittler, and Grant A. Wacker (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 1999), 168-87; Grant Wacker, "Travail of a Broken Family: Radical Evangelical Responses to the Emergence of Pentecostalism in America, 1906-16," in *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*, eds. Edith Blumhofer, Russel Spittler, and Grant A. Wacker (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 1999), 23-49.
- 8 Qualification: I understand that both traditions have embraced the power of the Holy Spirit and the call to holiness of heart and life. I use these terms not to bifurcate our mutual desires but to acknowledge the distinctive traits each tradition seems to embrace in their pursuit of the Christian life. Recognizing dichotomistic thinking is endemic in our society, I prefer to think of these positions as an artificial but nevertheless useful dialogical construction.
- 9 George A Lindbeck, *The Nature of Doctrine: Religion and Theology in a Post-Liberal Age* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1984), 74-9.
- 10 Lindbeck 30-32; Ann Taves, *Fits, Trances, & Visions: Experiencing Religion and Explaining Experience from Wesley to James* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999), 348-60.
- 11 Margaret R Miles, *Practicing Christianity: Critical Perspectives for an Embodied Spirituality* (New York: Crossroad Press, 1990).

12. Dorothy C. Bass and Craig Dystra "Times of Yearning, Practices of Faith," in *Practicing our Faith*, ed. Dorothy C. Bass (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1997); Charles Foster, *Educating Congregations: The Future of Christian Education* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994); Maria Harris, *Fashion Me a People: Curriculum in the Church* (Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1989). One might begin with a broad look the various processes within the church framed in ecclesial categories such as Maria Harris' (1989) Acts 2 treatment of the "curriculum" of the early church: *kerygma*, *didache*, *diakonia*, *leiturgia* and *koinonia*. While helpful, these broad categories as aspects of discipleship may blur where Christian formation might begin yet another aspect of the church (say, evangelism) takes over. Another approach might attend to the outcomes of discipleship, such as Charles Foster's (1994) emphasis on eventful transformation, meaning making, community building and embodied hope. A third approach would begin with specific practices associated with the Christian life, asking how Pentecostals and Wesleyan-Holiness folk attend to such acts as offering hospitality, speaking the truth in love, honoring the body, as well as other practices that inform our understanding of discipleship (Bass & Dykstra). This approach in some ways mirrors Wesley's understanding of the means of grace and serves as a backdrop to this paper. More work in this arena needs to be done, however, before either tradition might utilize this method with any satisfaction.

13. John C. Bowmer, *The Sacrament of the Lord's Supper in Early Methodism* (London: Dacre Press, 1951); J. Ernest Rattenbury, *The Eucharistic Hymns of John and Charles Wesley* (London: Epworth Press, 1948); John Wesley and Charles Wesley, *Hymns on the Lord's Supper* (Bristol: Felix Farley 1745, facsimile reprint Charles Wesley Society, 1995).

14. Teresa Berger, *Theology in Hymns? A Study of the Relationship of Doxology and Theology According to a Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People Called Methodist* (1780), trans. Timothy E. Kimbrough (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1995).

15. Paul Bradshaw, *Early Christian Worship: A Basic Introduction to Ideas and Practice* (London: SPCK, 1996); Don E. Saliers, *Worship as Theology: A Foretaste of Glory Divine* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994).

16. Gregory Dix, *The Shape of the Liturgy* (London: A and C Black; reprint, New York: Seabury Press, 1945, 1982); Keith Watkins, *The Great Thanksgiving: The Eucharistic Norm of Christian Worship* (St. Louis: Chalice Press, 1995), 94-128.

17. Dix, 36-37; Edward P. Echlin, *The Anglican Eucharist in Ecumenical Perspective: Doctrine and Rite from Cranmer to Seabury* (New York: The Seabury Press, 1968), 50-69. The structure or "shape" of the liturgy appears to be fairly consistent since early apostolic times. It consisted of two major but separate parts, the synaxis (or gathering) followed by the Eucharist (thanksgiving), which fused into a single rite by the fourth century. Later both sections again began to separate into services of "Word" and "Table." Each service also developed its own particular structures, rites, and ceremonial actions. The BCP, following this general pattern across its development, included variations of Morning Prayer (Matins) or a Sunday litany followed by the Eucharistic service (Dix). Tension often occurred in determining who was able to participate in this new liturgical community. How persons were included or excluded (including rulers, enemies and even the dead) and how they were treated in the service indicated how they were or would be received in heaven (Echlin).

18. Grant A. Wacker, *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture* (Harvard University Press, 2001), 19.

19. Cheryl Bridges Johns, *Pentecostal Formation: A Pedagogy Among the Oppressed* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1998), 89-91, Land, 110-13, Suurmond, 22; Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 99-111.

20. Land, 93-94, 111 Land writes, "Tongues underscored the ineffability of God who was the source of wonder and delight. It was also a means to express the inexpressible in the

eschatological language of the human heart and heaven" (111).

21 Daniel E. Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit: A Ritual Approach to Pentecostal/ Charismatic Spirituality* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999), 150-76; Walter J. Hollenweger "The Social and Ecumenical Significance of Pentecostal Worship," *Studia Liturgica* 8 (1971-72): 207-15.

22 Land, 100-21; Suurmond, 96.

23 Raymond A. George, "The People called Methodists—The Means of Grace," in *A History of the Methodist Church in Great Britain*, Vol. 1, eds. Rupert Davies and Gordon Rupp (London: Epworth Press, 1965), 210-60; John Lawson, "The People called Methodists—Our Discipline," in *A History of the Methodist Church in Great Britain*, Vol. 1, eds. Rupert Davies and Gordon Rupp (London: Epworth Press, 1965), 183-209.

24 Johns, 97-100.

25 Catherine Pickstock, *After Writing: On the Liturgical Consumption of Philosophy* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1998), Alexander Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World* (Crestwood, N.Y.: Saint Vladimir's Press, 1963, 1973).

26 Dean G. Blevins, "We are the Church: The Liturgical Construction of the Self," *Doxology: A Journal of Worship* (2001) 18:175-95; Dean G. Blevins, "We Are the Church: A Wesleyan View of the Liturgical Construction of the Self" *Wesleyan Theological Journal*, forthcoming Fall 2003.

27 C. Ellis Nelson, *Where Faith Begins* (Richmond, Va.: John Knox Press, 1967); Philip Pfatteicher, *The School of the Church: Worship and Christian Formation* (Valley Forge, Pa.: Trinity Press International, 1995); John Westerhoff, "Fashioning Christians in our Day," in *Schooling Christians: "Holy Experiments" in American Education*, eds. Stanley Hauerwas and John Westerhoff. (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1992). Formation, as a contemporary approach to Christian education, is first associated with C. Ellis Nelson's thesis is that we live into the culture of the Christian faith through a series of practices (35-66). Socialization, much like the liturgical flow of worship, operates naturally within Christianity and should be used deliberately in communicating the faith (Phatteicher 1995, 90-107; Nelson, 67). John Westerhoff asserts Christian formation occurs through the intentional assimilation into the Christian worldview via eight aspects of communal life: 1) communal rites, particularly those repetitive, symbolic and social acts which express and manifest the community's sacred narrative along with its implied faith and life; 2) church environment, including architectural space and artifacts; 3) time, particularly the Christian calendar; 4) communal life, including the polity, programs and economic life as well as support behaviors; 5) discipline, including structured practices within the community; 6) social interaction via interpersonal relations and motivations; 7) role models (exemplars and mentors); and 8) language, which names and describes behavior (272-78). Through the intentional employment of these aspects in distinctly Christian ways, persons are inducted into a primary Christian community and culture that Westerhoff believes is the basic form of discipleship for Christians (269-71).

28 Bass and Dykstra 1997

29 Suurmond, 95-97

30 Albrecht, 196-250.

31 Henry Hawthorn Knight III, *The Presence of God in the Christian Life: John Wesley and the Means of Grace*, (Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press, 1992); Land, 113-17

32 Charles M. Wood, *Vision and Discernment* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1985), 67-69.

33 Thomas Groome, *Sharing Faith: A Comprehensive Approach to Religious Education and Pastoral Ministry: The Way of Shared Praxis* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991).

34 Tziporah Kasachkoff, ed., *In the Socratic Tradition: Essays on Teaching Philosophy* (Lanham, Md.: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, 1998).

35 Harold O. Rugg, *Imagination* (New York: Harper & Row Publishers, 1963). Self-

reflection becomes a part of the critical process as well. Ministers must also explore their own heritage and training. They must learn how to affirm the positive aspects of their history while becoming alert to poor influences and faulty assumptions. They must distinguish between their own "felt needs" (often desires) versus the real needs of their lives. Most of all they must become aware that thinking is an active process rather than a passive reception of knowledge, sometimes working both at a tacit but also imaginative level (Rugg 1963).

36. Matias Preiswerk, *Educating in the Living Word: A Theoretical Framework for Christian Education* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1987), 89-124; Daniel S. Schipani, *Religious Education Encounters Liberation Theology* (Birmingham, Ala.: Religious Education Press, 1988).

37. Johns, 94.

38. Michael Warren, "The Sacramentality of Critique and its Challenge to Christian Educators," *Christian Education Journal* 15, no. 1 (fall 1994): 42-52.

39. Jack L. Seymour, Margaret Ann Crain and Joseph V. Crockett, *Educating Christians: The Intersection of Meaning, Learning, and Vocation* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1993), 21-74.

40. Schipani, 68-100.

41. Miles, 21-42.

42. Runyon, 1998.

43. Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, trans. Myra Berman Ramos (New York: Continuum Publishing, 1988).

44. Alice Frazer Evans, Robert A. Evans and William Bean Kennedy, *Pedagogies for the Non-Poor* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1994); Maria Harris, Allen J. Moore, "A Social Theory of Religious Education," in *Religious Education as Social Transformation*, ed. Allen J. Moore (Birmingham Ala.: Religious Education Press, 1989); Mary Elizabeth Mullino Moore, *Teaching from the Heart: Theology and Educational Method* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), 164; Seymour, Jack L., Margaret Ann Crain and Joseph V. Crockett, *Educating Christians: The Intersection of Meaning, Learning, and Vocation*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1993. Christian education for the sake of transformation has a long history in Christian discipleship (Seymour, O'Gorman and Foster 1984). The most current expression finds its roots in the progressive education movement of Dewey as well as the reconstructionism of George Albert Coe and Harrison Elliot (Allen Moore, 9-13). These earlier movements sought to engage the public in order to transform educationally and religiously. On the contemporary scene there have been other approaches to transformative education other than Friere's explicit Latin American version of conscientization or *Conscientização*. Liberative teaching includes efforts for peace and justice, visits or relocations to impoverished areas for deeper understanding of the human condition, service learning and alternative Bible studies that explore real life situations in dynamic interplay with the Bible. Liberative teaching also includes feminist approaches that re-conceptualize the nature of God, humanity, sin, salvation, as well as the process of education and the nature of leadership (Harris 1988). Others adapt liberative approaches to educate the non-poor, oppressors who are also held captive to an unjust social order (Evans, Evans and Kennedy, 1994).

45. Johns, 107

REFERENCE LIST

- Albrecht, Daniel E. *Rites. Rites in the Spirit: A Ritual Approach to Pentecostal/ Charismatic Spirituality*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999.
- Bass, Dorothy C. and Craig Dystra. "Times of Yearning, Practices of Faith," in *Practicing our Faith*. Ed. Dorothy C. Bass. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1997
- Berger, Teresa. *Theology in Hymns? A Study of the Relationship of Doxology and Theology According to a Collection of Hymns for the use of the People Called Methodist* (1780), trans. Timothy E.

- Kimbrough. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1995.
- Blevins, Dean G. "We Are the Church: The Liturgical Construction of the Self." *Doxology: A Journal of Worship* (2001) 18:175-95.
- Blevins, Dean G. "We Are the Church: A Wesleyan view of the Liturgical Construction of the Self." *Wesleyan Theological Journal*, forthcoming Fall 2003.
- Bowmer, John C. *The Sacrament of the Lord's Supper in Early Methodism*. London: Dacre Press, 1951
- Bradshaw, Paul. *Early Christian Worship: A Basic Introduction to Ideas and Practice*. London: SPCK, 1996.
- Dayton, Donald W. *Theological Roots of Pentecostalism*. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press, 1987
- Dix, Gregory. *The Shape of the Liturgy*. London: A and C Black; reprint, New York: Seabury Press, 1945, 1982.
- Echlin, Edward P. *The Anglican Eucharist in Ecumenical Perspective: Doctrine and Rite from Cranmer to Seabury*. New York: The Seabury Press, 1968.
- Eisland, Nancy L. "Irreconcilable Differences: Conflict, Schism, and Religious Restructuring in a United Methodist Church," in *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*. Eds. Edith Blumhofer, Russel Spittler, and Grant A. Wacker. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 1999.
- Evans, Alice Frazer, Robert A. Evans and William Bean Kennedy. *Pedagogies for the Non-Poor* Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1994.
- Fowler, James W. *Stages of Faith: The Psychology of Human Development and the Quest for Meaning*. San Francisco: Harper & Row Publishers, 1981
- Foster, Charles. *Educating Congregations: The Future of Christian Education*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994.
- Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Trans. Myra Berman Ramos. New York: Continuum Publishing, 1988.
- George, A. Raymond. "The People called Methodists—The Means of Grace," in *A History of the Methodist Church in Great Britain*, Vol. 1 Eds. Rupert Davies and Gordon Rupp London: Epworth Press, 1965.
- Groome, Thomas. *Sharing Faith: A Comprehensive Approach to Religious Education and Pastoral Ministry: The Way of Shared Praxis*. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991.
- Harris, Maria. *Fashion Me a People: Curriculum in the Church*. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1989.
- Hollenweger, Walter J. *Pentecostalism: Origins and Developments Worldwide*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1997
- Hollenweger, Walter J. "The Social and Ecumenical Significance of Pentecostal Worship," *Studia Liturgica* 8 (1971-72): 207-15
- Johns, Cheryl Bridges. *Pentecostal Formation: A Pedagogy Among the Oppressed*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1998.
- Kasachkoff, Tziporah, Ed. *In the Socratic Tradition: Essays on Teaching Philosophy*. Lanham, Md.: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, 1998.
- Knight, Henry Hawthorn III. *The Presence of God in the Christian Life: John Wesley and the Means of Grace*. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press, 1992.
- Land, Steven J. *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1993.
- Lawson, John. "The People called Methodists—Our Discipline." In *A History of the Methodist Church in Great Britain*, Vol. 1 Eds. Rupert Davies and Gordon Rupp London: Epworth Press, 1965, 183-209.
- Lindbeck, George A. *The Nature of Doctrine: Religion and Theology in a Post-Liberal Age*. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1984.
- Miles, Margaret R. *Practicing Christianity: Critical Perspectives for an Embodied Spirituality*. New York: Crossroad Press, 1990.

- Moore, Allen J. "A Social Theory of Religious Education," in *Religious Education as Social Transformation*. Ed. Allen J. Moore. Brmingham Ala.: Religious Education Press, 1989.
- Moore, Mary Elizabeth Mullino. *Teaching from the Heart: Theology and Educational Method*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991
- Nelson, C. Ellis. *Where Faith Begins*. Richmond, Va.: John Knox Press, 1967
- Parks, Sharon. *The Critical Years: The Young Adult Search for a Faith to Live By*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1986.
- Pfatteicher, Philip. *The School of the Church: Worship and Christian Formation*. Valley Forge, Pa.: Trinity Press International, 1995.
- Pickstock, Catherine. *After Writing: On the Liturgical Consummation of Philosophy*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1998.
- Preiswerk, Matias. *Educating in the Living Word: A Theoretical Framework for Christian Education*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1987
- Rack, Henry D. *Reasonable Enthusiast: John Wesley and the Rise of Methodism*. Third Edition. London: Epworth Press, 2002.
- Rattenbury, J. Ernest. *The Eucharistic Hymns of John and Charles Wesley*. London: Epworth Press, 1948.
- Rugg, Harold O. *Imagination*. New York: Harper & Row Publishers, 1963.
- Runyon, Ted. *The New Creation: John Wesley's Theology Today*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1998.
- Saliers, Don E. *Worship as Theology: A Foretaste of Glory Divine*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994.
- Seymour, Jack L., Robert T. O'Gorman, and Charles R. Foster. *The Church in the Education of the Public*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1984.
- Seymour, Jack L., Margaret Ann Crain and Joseph V. Crockett. *Educating Christians: The Intersection of Meaning, Learning, and Vocation*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1993.
- Schmemmann, Alexander. *For the Life of the World*. Crestwood, N.Y.: Saint Vladimir's Press, 1963, 1973.
- Schipani, Daniel S. *Religious Education Encounters Liberation Theology*. Birmingham, Ala.: Religious Education Press, 1988.
- Suurmond, Jean-Jacques. *Work & Spirit at Play: Towards a Charismatic Theology*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1995.
- Synan, Vinson. *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1971, 1997
- Taves, Ann. *Fits, Trances, & Visions: Experiencing Religion and Explaining Experience from Wesley to James*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999.
- Wacker, Grant A. *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture*. Harvard University Press, 2001
- Wacker, Grant A. "Travail of a Broken Family: Radical Evangelical Responses to the Emergence of Pentecostalism in America, 1906-16," in *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*. Eds. Edith Blumhofer, Russel Spittler, and Grant A. Wacker. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 1999.
- Warren, Michael. "The Sacramentality of Critique and its Challenge to Christian Educators," *Christian Education Journal* 15, no. 1 (Fall 1994): 42-52.
- Watkins, Keith. *The Great Thanksgiving: The Eucharistic Norm of Christian Worship*. St. Louis: Chalice Press, 1995.
- Wesley, John and Charles Wesley. *Hymns on the Lord's Supper*. Bristol: Felix Farley 1745, facsimile reprint Charles Wesley Society, 1995.
- Westerhoff, John. "Fashioning Christians in Our Day," in *Schooling Christians: "Holy Experiments" in American Education*. Eds. Stanley Hauerwas and John Westerhoff. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1992.
- Wood, Charles M. *Vision and Discernment*. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1985.