

1 **Maternal Education and Child Health Outcomes in South Africa: A Panel Data Analysis**

2

3 **Abstract**

4 This study empirically assesses the relationship between mothers' education and child health
5 using continuous and binary proxies of child health outcomes. A panel, using four waves of
6 the National Income Dynamic Study and a battery of estimation techniques, was employed.
7 The results suggest that maternal education plays a large and significant role in explaining child
8 health outcomes in South Africa. Our results also suggest that maternal education is relevant
9 in respect to stunted growth (stunting). However, the effects of maternal education vary along
10 races, implying levels of inequality. The effects are stronger in the black and coloured
11 populations, possibly due to educational deficits. This suggests a need in improving the
12 educational opportunities for these groups. We suggest that maternal education can
13 significantly contribute to reducing the high degree of inequality in South Africa.

14 **Keywords: maternal education, child health, panel data, South Africa**

15

16

17 **1. Introduction**

18 Poverty and unemployment are critical issues in many developing countries, including South
19 Africa. Although remarkable progress¹ has been made in South Africa since the first
20 democratic elections in 1994, poverty and unemployment remain prevalent and persistent.
21 While poverty rates have marginally declined², unemployment increased from 20.0% in 1994
22 to 25.1% in 2014 (Statistics South Africa, 2015). In addition, the country grapples with
23 worsening levels of socioeconomic inequality with considerable disparities across racial
24 groups, which find their origin in the legacy of colonialism and the apartheid era³. Particularly,

¹Over this period, poverty rates have decreased by 10% and Real Gross Domestic Product per capita has increased by 3.2% a year on average (African Economic Outlook, 2014).

²This is measured using the food poverty line of R321 per month.

³This period in South Africa's history resulted in various laws being passed; like the Groups Area Act of 1950, which segregated the regions based on racial groups. While, policies have been put in place to address these inequalities, the impact lag is relatively slow.

1 significant human capital gaps in terms of education and health are observed⁴, which play a
2 key role in driving unemployment and hence, poverty (Woolard, 2002; Branson et al., 2012).

3 Health is particularly important because it affects the ability to acquire other forms of capital
4 including education. Interestingly, the health of children is a significant predictor of long-term
5 socioeconomic outcomes in subsequent adulthood (Case et al., 2002, 2005; Belli et al., 2005;
6 Black and Devereux, 2011). Moreover, empirical literature documents the existence of a
7 positive relationship between childhood and adult health. In effect, one's childhood health may
8 influence one's adult health and education and ultimately could have an impact on the future
9 employment prospects of the child.

10 The World Health Organization (WHO) indicates that half of the deaths of children under the
11 age of five years are caused by undernutrition. In addition, malnutrition in children's early lives
12 may lead to stunted growth (stunting); which is detrimental to cognitive ability, thus impairing
13 school and work performance⁵ (WHO, 2009). In South Africa, Shisana et al. (2014) find
14 survey-based evidence that the prevalence of stunting in children of under three years is about
15 26.5% for boys and 25.9% for girls. Furthermore, this appears to be more prevalent with boys
16 in informal rural areas (23.2%) than formal urban areas (13.6%). This is a possible indication
17 of the after-effects of educational segregation along racial lines, since the Black/ African group
18 mainly inhabits rural areas. Understanding the intergenerational implications of the
19 parents/children health overlap is therefore imperative for poverty alleviation.

20 Many parental factors⁶ that could contribute to the health of children under the age of five years
21 have been identified; the education of the primary caregiver being of particular consideration
22 (Salm and Schunk, 2008; Chen and Li, 2009; Lundborg et al., 2011; Aizer and Currie, 2014).
23 In South Africa, primary caregivers are mostly biological mothers and more than half of the
24 children below the age of 10 live in female-headed households (Statistics South Africa, 2013)⁷.
25 Given that other females often take on the role of caregiver; it is not only the biological
26 characteristics of mothers that matter for children's health, but also those of other female

⁴For example, only 31% of Black women are employed in comparison to White men at 73% (Department of Labour, 2011).

⁵ Although partial catch up is possible, the effect in developing countries due to poor socio-economic conditions is often more detrimental (Currie and Vogl, 2013).

⁶Other factors that can influence children's health include biological and environmental factors (like toxins being released and pollution being present).

⁷ This is as a result of previous apartheid policies, leading to male-labour migration, non-marriage, and, recently, HIV/AIDS.

1 caregivers in the family - including aunts, sisters, and grandmothers - as well as, in some cases,
2 those of non-biological custodians. In substantiating this, Chen and Li's (2009) analysis of a
3 large sample of adoptees in China is useful in that it concludes that education of non-biological
4 caregivers significantly influences children's health. For the purpose of this study, we argue
5 that the female primary caregiver's (the biological mother or non-biological custodian)
6 education represents an important driver of human capital for future generations. Hence, a
7 sound policy response to unemployment and/or poverty entails an understanding of the
8 relationship between maternal education and child health.

9 Maternal education levels can affect child health through two main channels (mechanisms or
10 pathways). Firstly, it is indirectly affected through increased income - through mothers being
11 in the labour force (Lindeboom et al., 2009; Aslam and Kingdon, 2012) – which could provide
12 better choices in terms of the affordability of care and increased prospects of better care.
13 Secondly, a child's health can be impacted directly through maternal health literacy
14 (Lindeboom et al., 2009). This knowledge can translate into correct nutritional choices being
15 made in the early years of children's lives, which have been found to affect not only physical
16 but also mental development (UNESCO, 2006). While these two channels are favourable to
17 the establishing of a positive relationship between maternal education and child health; a third
18 plausible channel exists, which, though less documented, cannot be ignored. Unlike the first
19 two - which demonstrate a positive relationship between a mother's education and a child's
20 health and future - the third alternative suggests that mother's education may negatively affect
21 child health through the unavailability of educated mothers due to school and/or work demands
22 (Glewwe and Desai, 1999; Case, 2001; Lesiapeto et al., 2010). Overall, a mother's education
23 could have far-reaching consequences on her child's future health, and, ultimately,
24 productivity.

25 The remainder of this paper is organised as follows: Section 2 presents a review of literature;
26 while Sections 3 and 4 present the methodology and empirical results, respectively; and Section
27 5 provides concluding remarks and recommendations in light of the findings.

28 **2. Literature Review**

1 Theoretically, Grossman's human capital theory⁸ provides the conceptual framework for the
2 relationship between maternal education and child health. The basic idea is that the productivity
3 and skills of workers can be increased by investing in them, particularly in terms of education
4 (Becker, 1975; Grossman, 1999). This implies that a higher educational qualification could
5 mean improved chances of employment and increased earnings. Furthermore, Grossman
6 argues, in the health capital theory⁹, that health, as a form of human capital, is distinct from
7 other forms of human capital as it contributes to earnings in the life cycle. Grossman develops
8 a demand for the health capital model, which has been used to empirically analyse the health
9 production function (Zhao, 2008; Ajaikaye and Mwabu, 2012). Consequently, this study uses
10 a reduced form of the health production function to examine the relationship between maternal
11 education and child health outcomes in South Africa.

12 The relationship between parental education and child health has been widely explored in
13 empirical literature, mainly based on cross-sectional studies (Ahmed and Iqbal, 2007; al., Chen
14 and Li, 2009; Lindeboom et al., 2009; Lundborg et al., 2011; Aslam and Kingdom, 2012;
15 Rawlings, 2015) and/or panel data methodologies (Lindeboom et al., 2009 Kemptner and
16 Marcus, 2013; Bhalotra and Clarke, 2013).

17 In terms of cross-sectional studies, Ahmed and Iqbal (2007) analyse the impact of mothers'
18 education on child health in Nigeria proxied by height-for-age z score. Their results indicate
19 that post-primary education exhibits a significant effect on child health, while the effect of
20 primary education, which is the first six years of formal schooling, appears insignificant.
21 Similarly, Aslam and Kingdom (2012), in a study in Pakistan, evaluate whether and how
22 parents' years of schooling affect child health outcomes measured as height-for-age z score.
23 Their results suggest that an additional year of a mother's education significantly increases a
24 child's health, irrespective of gender. Likewise, Gunes (2015) investigates the impact in
25 Turkey. He finds that, overall, the completion of primary education of mothers improved their
26 children's health. However, his results indicate mixed effects depending on geographical
27 characteristics and gender.

28 Conversely, some studies (such as Desai and Alva, 1998 and Lesiapeto et al., 2010) have found
29 no strong correlation regarding this relationship. Desai and Alva (1998) analyse the

⁸A further derivation of this theory is the human capital theory of health.

⁹The health capital theory is a derivation of the human capital theory by Grossman.

1 Demographic and Health Survey data for twenty-two developing countries (South Africa not
2 included) and report a statistically significant effect in only a few countries. Their empirical
3 investigation is based on three markers of child health, namely: the infant mortality rate;
4 children's height-for-age z scores; and immunisation status. These conflicting results might be
5 attributed to unobserved heterogeneities that cannot be accounted for within a cross-sectional
6 framework.

7 Panel data analysis is acknowledged for its ability to mitigate the issue of unobserved
8 heterogeneity. Within this framework, various studies report diverse findings, depending on
9 the contextual settings.

10 Findings differ in developed and developing countries. However, there are also differences
11 when looking at findings in individual countries, developed or developing. Lindeboom, et al.
12 (2009), for example, conducted a U.K based study using different child health indicators. They
13 found evidence that parental education, as proxied by schooling, improves economic
14 opportunities; whereas there is little evidence of a causal relation between parental education
15 and child health. Contrariwise, in another developed nation, Germany, Kemptner and Marcus
16 (2013) used a large panel dataset to investigate the causal linkages between maternal education
17 and child's health on the one hand, and schooling outcomes on the other. They reported mixed
18 findings. Their findings indicated that, while there is a positive effect of maternal education on
19 an adolescent son's health, they found no association between maternal education and health
20 in adolescent daughters.

21 In the context of developing countries, Bhalotra and Clarke (2013) employed a panel of 108
22 developing countries over a twenty-year period from 1990 to 2010. They found that the
23 increased level of a mother's education might have contributed to significant decreases in child
24 health proxies, as measured by child mortality. Likewise, Rawlings (2015) used the China
25 Health and Nutrition Survey (CHNS) for the period 1997 to 2011 to explore the impact of
26 parental education on child health in China. Her findings suggest that maternal education,
27 rather than paternal education, matters for child health measured by anthropometric proxies. In
28 addition, she concludes that an additional year of maternal schooling increases a boy child's
29 height by 0.16 standard deviation points in comparison with that of the girl child, which was
30 statistically insignificant. She argued that this gender bias could be as a result of the preference
31 for sons in China.

1 In Africa, Azeze and Huang (2014) analyse the effect of maternal education on chronic and
2 acute malnutrition with the use of the 2000 and 2005 Demographic and Health Surveys. Their
3 results reveal the importance of socioeconomic status in the relationship between maternal
4 education and child health. Overall, these panel data studies reveal that, although there is a
5 consensus on the importance of maternal education on children's health, there are mixed and
6 inconclusive results. This could perhaps be an indication that the relationship between maternal
7 education and child health may well require country-specific analysis.

8 In South Africa, Medrano et al. (2008) used the South African 1993 Demographic and Health
9 Survey data to investigate the relationship between mothers' education and child health. Using
10 a two-stage least square estimation, they discovered a significant effect of maternal education
11 on children less than two years of age, but not on older children. Similarly, Lesiapeto et al.
12 (2010) explored the use of anthropometric data in the rural districts of the Eastern Province and
13 Kwa-Zulu Natal in South Africa. While they assert that there is an association between
14 household income and children's stunting, they find no evidence between maternal education
15 and this. A possible explanation for this may be due to the income effect being more prominent
16 in the rural areas. Arguably, this could have implications for poverty and inequality, which are
17 still key persistent issues in South Africa more than two decades after the first democratic
18 elections. In spite of this, not much empirical evidence is available to address this and guide
19 policy makers.

20 Following the panel approach,¹⁰ this study allows us to control for unobservable time invariant
21 heterogeneity, which arises from the diverse socio-demographics, in terms of age and race, as
22 well as previous racial segregation. Therefore, South Africa offers a unique context in which
23 to analyse this relationship. In addition, we make use of two child health proxies: the
24 continuous anthropometric measure and the binary (stunting). To the best of our knowledge,
25 this is the first study to explore this relationship in a panel data framework in South Africa.
26 This has been made possible with the availability of the National Income Dynamic Study
27 (NIDS) dataset, which is currently available for the years 2008, 2010, 2012 and 2014.

28

¹⁰Panel data has many advantages, including: identification of unobserved effects, the possibility of estimating more dynamic models, and efficiency gains.

1 3. Methodology

2 The present study relies on both the continuous height-for-age z score (HAZ) and binary
3 (stunting) proxies of child health outcomes; thus motivating the use of both linear and non-
4 linear panel approaches.

5 3.1. The Model

6 The model is adapted from the reduced form of the health production framework of Grossman
7 (1972), as used by Aslam and Kingdon (2012) and of the form:

$$8 \quad CH_{it} = \alpha + \beta ME_{it} + \gamma X_{it} + \delta_i + \mu_{it} \quad (1)$$

9 where: CH_{it} is the child health outcome; ME_{it} indicates maternal education; and X_{it} is a
10 vector of demographic and other socioeconomic characteristics (age, gender and
11 immunisation); family background (household size) and community effects (area of residence
12 and race) for child i at time t ; and μ_{it} is the error term.

13 Following the literature (Thomas et al., 1991; Strauss and Thomas, 1998; Ahmed and Iqbal,
14 2007; Chen and Li, 2009; Aslam and Kingdon, 2012; Mani, 2014), we use the height-for-age
15 z score¹¹ (HAZ) as a measure of the child health outcome in the linear approach. Besides the
16 HAZ score, the health literature (see for example, Azeze and Huang, 2014) emphasises the role
17 of stunting in characterising the child health status. Hence, for the non-linear approach, CH_{it} is
18 a binary variable describing whether a child is stunted or not. Evidence of stunting is measured,
19 according to the World Health Organisation (WHO), as a z-score of less than two standard
20 deviations from the reference median (WHO, 2006).

21 3.2 Estimation Techniques

22 Equation (1) will produce consistent estimates of β , conditional upon the expectation that
23 maternal education (ME_{it}) and child health outcomes (CH_{it}) are uncorrelated, with the error
24 term (μ_{it}) (Wooldridge; 2002: 83). Though we undertake the Wald test for exogeneity under
25 the 2SLS approach, we are more comfortable in applying a set of estimation techniques for
26 robustness. We therefore apply: Pooled Ordinary Least Squares (POLS), Weighted Least
27 Squares (WLS), Fixed/Random Effects (FE or RE), and Instrumental Variable (IV) techniques

¹¹The z score shows the deviations from the referenced population. Other measures are weight-for height and weight-for-age z scores.

1 on our underlying model. The least squared estimates (POLS and WLS) assume no correlation
2 between regressors and the error term. This, however, does not hold in the presence of
3 individual heterogeneities (δ_i); resulting in biased and inconsistent estimates. Therefore, the
4 FE or RE is implemented, which is commonly used to mitigate the issue of heterogeneity, with
5 the Hausman test providing the formal selection method between the FE and RE estimations.

6 In complementing the continuous dependent variable (HAZ) approach above, the maximum
7 likelihood (ML) technique will be used for binary child health outcomes. This captures the
8 determinants of the probability of stunting, of which maternal education is one. The probit
9 model is specified below:

$$10 \quad Pr = HAZs = 1|HAZ = \Phi(\alpha + \beta ME_{it} + \gamma X_{it})$$

11 Where: Pr is the probability of stunting, (HAZ stunted/HAZ not stunted); Φ is the cumulative
12 distribution function; X is a vector of regressors; and β and γ are the parameters.

13 The ML technique estimates (from the probit approach) show the probability of children's
14 growth being stunted. Conditional upon the notion that the estimates are consistent, the
15 predicted conditional probability of their being stunted for an observation i is given by:

$$16 \quad \Phi(\hat{\alpha} + \hat{\beta} ME_{it} + \hat{\gamma} X_{it}) \quad (3)$$

17 Where Φ is the cumulative distribution function of the standard normal distribution and
18 $\hat{\alpha}$, $\hat{\beta}$ and $\hat{\gamma}$ are the estimates of the parameters. OLS, WLS, FE/RE and ML estimates are
19 consistent under strict exogeneity of the independent variables. However, given the plausibility
20 of ME_{it} being endogenous¹², the IV is used. In fact, our independent variable of a mother's
21 education is measured by years of schooling, which is not free from measurement errors.
22 Moreover, it can be argued that maternal attributes like education can be influenced by child
23 health, thus resulting in simultaneity. For example, a malnourished or undernourished child
24 increases his/her susceptibility to infections, and enhances the severity thereof, thus inhibiting
25 school attendance of the mother/caregiver. In addition, unidentified important causal factors
26 might have been omitted, which equally result in omission bias, which is a source of
27 endogeneity; hence justifying the use of the Instrumental Variable (IV) technique.

28

¹²Endogeneity could result from measurement error, simultaneity and omitted errors.

1 Because of such endogeneity, the estimation of the parameter β in equation (1), as well as the
2 other parameters of the model, may be biased by some measure of the degree of correlation in
3 the unobservable, affecting both ME_{it} and CH_{it} . The estimation of equation (1) is then
4 conducted simultaneously with the mother's education equation (2) - through the two-stage
5 least squared technique or the method of Limited Information Maximum Likelihood
6 (LIML) - for the continuous and binary dependent variables, respectively. Equation (2) is
7 specified as follows:

$$8 \quad ME_{it} = \sigma + \theta Z_{it} + \psi X_{it} + \delta_i + \varepsilon_{it} \quad (4)$$

9 Where ME_{it} is the mother's education, Z_{it} is the instruments, X_{it} represents a vector of
10 demographic and socioeconomic characteristics (age, gender and immunisation); family
11 background (household size) and community effects (area of residence and race) which is
12 uncorrelated; with the error term ε_{it} and correlated with ME_{it} .

13 The validity of the IV type estimates crucially depends on the quality of the instruments. While
14 it is often difficult to obtain truly exogenous instruments, we follow Aslam and Kingdon
15 (2012) in using the exposure to media as a proxy for information knowledge. Exposure to
16 media also serves as a pathway through which maternal education affects child health
17 outcomes. For example, an educated mother can better acquire health information useful for
18 child health enhancement, but this is conditional on ownership of information gadgets such as
19 radios and television sets. These gadgets can therefore be used as instruments for education in
20 order to circumvent the issue of endogeneity.

21 These instruments (radios and television sets) are expected to satisfy the following two
22 conditions: (i) being uncorrelated with the error term (that is $\text{Cov}[Z_{it}, \varepsilon_{js}] = \mathbf{0}$) and only
23 indirectly correlated to the dependent variable (CH_{it}); and (ii) strongly correlated with the
24 endogenous variable (ME_{it}). These exogeneity conditions are confirmed with the Sargan-
25 Hansen test. In addition to the exogeneity test, the statistical validity of the instruments must
26 be confirmed through the over-identification test when using more than one instrument.

27 **3.3 Data and Variable Description**

28 The data for this study is sourced from the four waves of the National Income Dynamics Study
29 (NIDS) dataset for the years 2008, 2010, 2012 and 2014. The NIDS is an ongoing longitudinal
30 nationally representative household survey. It is the first nationally representative panel survey

1 in South Africa and is conducted biannually by the Southern Africa Labour and Development
2 Research Unit (SALDRU). The first wave (2008) consisted of about 28,000 individuals in
3 7,300 households across the country. The initial respondents, which are referred to as the Core
4 Sample Members (CSM), are tracked over the years. After that, those who were present in the
5 initial sample, as well as their spouses and children, are re-interviewed, thus creating a balanced
6 panel. After having restricted the study to children under five years of age with female
7 caregivers (mothers and other female primary caregivers), our sample size is 9937.

8 *Dependent variable: Child health measure*

9 In line with the existing literature (Lindeboom et al., 2009; Aslam and Kingdon, 2012; Mani,
10 2013) and the objective of this study; our focus is on one aspect of anthropometric data of child
11 health, which is the height-for-age z score (HAZ)¹³. HAZ is an indicator of child health, which
12 measures both short- and long-term health statuses (Thomas et al., 1991; Strauss and Thomas,
13 1998; Behrman and Rosenzweig, 2005; Chen and Lin, 2009, Medrano et al. 2008). It is
14 measured as the number of standard deviations from the median height of the reference
15 population of the same age as charted by the WHO growth standards. Therefore, HAZ scores
16 closer to 0 indicate normal and well-nourished children. However, HAZ scores less than -2 are
17 classified as being stunted.

18 *Independent variable: Maternal education*

19 Education has been used in the literature, as a continuous variable in terms of either, years of
20 schooling; (Lindeboom et al, 2009; Rawlings, 2015) or as a categorical variable (Azeze and
21 Huang, 2014). The educational categories, range from no schooling to university qualifications.
22 For robustness, we adopt both approaches, which helps capture level and threshold effects. Our
23 education variable is restricted to all female caregivers.

24

25 *Control variables*

26

27 In this study, various demographic variables are controlled for details provided in Table 1,
28 and their summary statistics in Table 2.

¹³Other anthropometric indicators include weight-for-height z score (WHZ) and weight-for-age z score (WAZ).

1 **[Table 1 insert]**

2

3 From the descriptive statistics in Table 2 below, it emerges that the averages regarding educated
4 mothers in our sample are: about 8% without schooling; and 14%, 22% and 6% with primary,
5 secondary and tertiary levels, respectively. Table 2 (panel B) exhibits remarkable racial
6 distinctions in educational categories, affecting Black mothers. This is evident from the greater
7 percentage (about 21%) in our sample with no schooling, compared with White mothers (about
8 4%). Tertiary education is also the lowest among mothers, followed by Coloured mothers, and
9 highest among White mothers. This could possibly be attributed to the previous apartheid era
10 of unequal education systems in South Africa.

11

12 **[Table 2 insert]**

13

14 Furthermore, we use kernel density estimation (KDE) to estimate the probability density
15 function of HAZ as in Figures 1 and 2. Figure 1 shows the overall estimate of the sample. The
16 skewness of the density plots to the left implies deviation from the reference point of zero; the
17 implication of which is that there are more children who are below the reference category, and
18 who are, therefore, more likely to have poor health outcomes based on HAZ.

19 Disaggregating children by gender indicates that males have higher negative HAZ scores than
20 females of the same age group, as shown on the left of the kernel density graph. This suggests
21 that there are more male children with poorer health outcomes. This finding appears to concur
22 with the literature, which indicates that gender biases exist in terms of children's health. While
23 the descriptive analysis above provides some indication of this relationship, further meaningful
24 inference needs to be derived from the econometric analysis.

25

26 **[Figure 1 insert]**

27

28 **[Figure 2 insert]**

29

30 **4. Empirical Results**

1 The linear panel and non-linear panel results are reported in Tables 3 - 6 and 7, respectively.

2 **4.1 Linear Panel Analysis**

3 The linear panel results are in respect of the continuous HAZ variable. As discussed in the
4 methodology section, the Hausman test is the formal test on the choice between the FE and RE
5 models to determine if the individual effects are fixed or random. The null hypothesis of the
6 test is that the individual effects are random. The results of the test indicate a p-value of 0.3284,
7 which is greater than the cut-off significance point of 0.05; and, therefore, we do not reject the
8 null hypothesis. Hence, the RE model is well specified and selected.

9 **[Table 3 insert]**

10

11 **[Table 4 insert]**

12

13 **[Table 5 insert]**

14

15 Table 4 displays the regression results of education, measured as years of schooling and
16 educational categories, using POLS, WLS and RE and IV (for years of education). Table 5
17 shows the tests for the IV 2 SLS estimation, and Table 6, the overall results of POLS, WLS,
18 RE and IV models, as well as the Black and Coloured racial groups.

19 In Table 5, the LM test for under-identification shows that the regressor is not under-identified
20 (P-value = 0.000).The Cragg-Donald F-statistic is relatively high (146.602) in comparison to
21 the Stock-Yogo test critical values !We therefore reject the null hypothesis, thereby indicating
22 that the instruments are not weak. In addition, the Sargan statistics - with a value of 1.581 and
23 p value of 0.2087 - indicate instrument validity.

24

25 **[Table 6 insert]**

26

27 As shown in Table 6, after controlling for the key variables, all the models performed relatively
28 well with stable coefficients. For example, larger household size tends to be associated with

1 less healthy children. Older caregivers are generally better in transmitting health knowledge to
2 child health. This variable has a non-linear effect, implying that the rate of transmission tends
3 to reduce with age or with extreme values of age. As expected, immunisation is positive,
4 although not significant, across all the models.

5 In terms of the other explanatory variables, household size has a negative effect on health and
6 there is no significant distinction by gender. Older mothers have a significant negative effect
7 on female children's health and a weak positive effect on boys' health. A negative effect of age
8 on girls' health tends to be weaker at extremely high maternal age. This seems to lend support
9 to the findings of the disparate effect of education on boys and girls. Older mothers are more
10 likely to be in the labour market than younger mothers and extremely old mothers. This,
11 therefore, lends support to our postulated view that girls may be more vulnerable to mothers'
12 absence than boys and therefore the negative effect of lack of care from working mothers might
13 outweigh the positive effects - in terms of income and knowledge and use of health related
14 information - on the girls. This is worth investigating further and will constitute the topic of
15 further research.

16 Another control variable is the area of residence. Given the comparatively poorer
17 socioeconomic conditions, the rural populace - in traditional areas and those who are farm
18 dwellers - tend to perform lower in terms of child health compared to urban areas, which are
19 more affluent. Most of the South African farm dwellers are farm workers, working for large-
20 scale farmers. These constitute the poor racial groups, that is: mainly Blacks and Coloureds, as
21 well as poor migrant workers (Visser, 2013).

22

23 The educational variables carry significant magnitude, and theoretically have the expected
24 signs in all the regression models. An extra year of schooling gained by mothers' results in a
25 0.87 gain in standard deviation scores. However, there is non-linearity of education, suggesting
26 that, at higher values of education, the positive effects tend to be attenuated. This non-linearity
27 could be explained by the fact that at higher levels of education, more time is given to the
28 labour market at the expense of child-care.

29

30 There is some evidence that suggests that Black and Coloured children stand to benefit more
31 from further educational improvements in South Africa. However, the results are not robust
32 because of the limited sample size with respect to the Asians and Coloureds. We argue that,

1 given the apartheid history of South Africa, all that is to be gained regarding education of these
2 racial groups of mothers has not yet been gained. We suggest that the gender difference in this
3 relationship could possibly be that girls could be more sensitive to absent mothers than boy
4 children (Almani et al., 2012). The implication of this is that maternal education affects
5 children along gender lines, boys having an advantage over girls.

6 **4.2 Non-linear Results**

7 The results of the marginal effects are shown in Table 7 below.

8

9 **[Table 7 insert]**

10

11 The results of the marginal effects in the probit model indicate that one unit change in the years
12 of mothers' education decreases the probability of stunting by 1.83 for the overall probit model.
13 Moreover, gender and race are found to exert a moderating effect on such a relationship.
14 Particularly, in terms of gender, a one-unit change in years of maternal education decreases the
15 probability of stunting by 2.17 units for males and increases the probability of stunting by 1.85
16 units for girls. It is also interesting to note that instrumenting for years of education reduces
17 this probability comparatively for both males and females. In addition, the marginal effects of
18 a mother's education on Black/African children is higher (at 0.67) than other race groups,
19 suggesting that, when compared with Whites, Black children have a higher probability of
20 stunting.

21 Overall, the presented results confirm the theoretical view that maternal education has a
22 positive and significant effect on child health, as measured by HAZ. The findings are also
23 consistent with the studies of Medrano et al. (2008) and Aslam and Kingdon (2012), amongst
24 others. Furthermore, the results also indicate the fact that maternal education affects the
25 probability of stunting. In addition, we can infer that the results also vary along racial and
26 gender lines, implying levels of inequality. These effects are stronger for the Black and
27 Coloured populations than the White and Indian groups; possibly due to their educational
28 deficits. These findings concur with theoretical and previous empirical literature.

29

1 **5. Conclusion**

2 This study reassesses the relationship between mothers' education and child health in South
3 Africa using panel survey data constructed from the 2008, 2010, 2014 and 2016 waves of the
4 National Income Dynamic Study. Two proxies of child health outcome are employed, namely
5 the HAZ score and stunting. The empirical findings are consistent with the previous literature,
6 particularly when endogeneity is controlled for.

7 The results suggest that maternal education plays a large and significant role in explaining child
8 health outcomes in South Africa. Our results also suggest that maternal education is relevant
9 in respect of stunting. Furthermore, considering the importance of gender and racial differences
10 in South Africa, the evidence suggests that maternal education is more favourable for a boy
11 than a girl. In addition, in comparison with the White and Asian races, maternal education has
12 a more robust possible outcome for the Black and Coloured races. The key policy implication
13 of this paper is that investments in education of women, especially for the African racial group,
14 are likely to improve children's health. This could possibly assist in alleviating poverty, and
15 hence aid in eradicating inequality, which remains persistent in South Africa.

16 While non-formal education, in terms of health knowledge, might be immeasurable, this study;
17 focuses on formal education due to data availability. Likewise, the empirical set up could not
18 control for the possible differences in the quality of education between rural and urban areas
19 and across regions. A natural extension of this study might therefore consist of analysing the
20 extent to which such a relationship might be influenced by the existence of multi-level
21 characteristics.

22

23 **REFERENCES**

24 African Economic Outlook. 2014. Macroeconomic Prospects. African Development Bank.
25 Available from:www.africaneconomicoutlook.org/en/outlook. [Accessed 11/07/2014].

26 Ahmed, M. and Iqbal, K. 2007. Is There Any Threshold in Mother's Education and Child
27 Health Relationship? Evidence from Nigeria. *Carleton College Department of Economics*.
28 *Working Series*.

- 1 Aizer, A. and Currie, J. 2014. The intergenerational transmission of inequality: Maternal
2 disadvantage and health at birth. *Science*, 344 (6186), pp.856 - 861.
- 3 Ajakaiye, O. and Mwabu, G. 2012. Health Effects of Socioeconomic Status: Methods and
4 Findings. *African Development Review*, 24(4), pp. 291 - 301.
- 5 Almani, A.S., Abro, A. and Mugheri, R.A. 2012. Study of the effect of working mothers on
6 development of children in Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Social
7 Science*, 2(11), pp.164 - 171.
- 8 Aslam, M. and Kingdon, G.G. 2012. Parental education and child health - understanding the
9 pathways of impact in Pakistan. *World Development*, 40(10), pp. 2014 - 2032.
- 10 Azeze, A. and Huang, W.C. 2014. Maternal education, linkages and child nutrition in the long
11 and short-run: Evidence from the Ethiopia Demographic and Health Surveys. *International
12 Journal of African Development*, 1(2), p.3.
- 13 Black, S. and Devereux, P.J. 2011. Ed. O. Ashenfelter and D. Card. Recent Developments in
14 Intergenerational Mobility. In: *Handbook of Labor Economics*, vol. IVb, pp. 1487 - 1541.
- 15 Branson, N., Garlick, J., Lam, D., Leibbrandt, M. 2012. Education and Inequality: The South
16 African Case. A Southern Africa Labour and Development Research Unit Working Paper
17 Number 75. Cape Town: SALDRU, University of Cape Town.
- 18 Becker, G.S. 1975. Front matter, human capital: A theoretical and empirical analysis, with
19 special reference to education. In: *Human Capital: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis, with
20 Special Reference to Education, Second Edition* (pp. 22). NBER.
- 21 Behrman, J.R. and Deolalikar, A.B. 1988. Health and nutrition. *Handbook of Development
22 Economics*, 1, pp. 631 - 711.
- 23 Behrman, J.R. and Rosenzweig, M.R. 2005. Does increasing women's schooling raise the
24 schooling of the next generation? Reply. *The American Economic Review*, 95(5), pp.1745 -
25 1751.
- 26 Belli, P.C., Bustreo, F. and Preker, A. 2005. Investing in children's health: What are the
27 economic benefits? *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 83(10), pp.777 - 784.

- 1 Bhalotra, S. and Clarke, D., 2013. Maternal Education and Maternal Mortality: Evidence from
2 a Large Panel and Various Natural Experiments. Mimeo, Universities of Essex and Oxford.
- 3
- 4 Case, A., Lubotsky, D. and Paxson, C. 2002. Economic status and health in childhood: The
5 origins of the gradient. *The American Economic Review*, 92(5), pp. 1308 - 1334.
- 6 Case, A. and Paxson, C. 2001. Mothers and others: Who invests in children's health? *Journal*
7 *of Health Economics*, 20(3), pp. 301 - 328.
- 8 Chen, Y. and Li, H. 2009. Mother's education and child health: Is there a nurturing
9 effect? *Journal of Health Economics*, 28(2), pp. 413 - 426.
- 10 Currie, J. and Vogl, T. 2013. Early-life health and adult circumstance in developing
11 countries. *Annu. Rev. Econ.*, 5(1), pp. 1 - 36.
- 12 Department of Labour. 2011. Available from
13 [http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/documents/annual-reports/labour-market-bulletin-](http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/documents/annual-reports/labour-market-bulletin-report/2011-2012/lmb2012fullreport.pdf)
14 [report/2011-2012/lmb2012fullreport.pdf](http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/documents/annual-reports/labour-market-bulletin-report/2011-2012/lmb2012fullreport.pdf). [Accessed 12/10/2015].
- 15 Desai, S. and Alva, S. 1998. Maternal education and child health: Is there a strong causal
16 relationship? *Demography*, 35(1), pp. 71 - 81.
- 17 Glewwe, P. and Desai, J. 1999. Child health and mothers' education in Ghana. In: *The*
18 *Economics of School Quality Investments in Developing Countries* , pp. 295 - 326. Palgrave
19 Macmillan: UK.
- 20 Grossman, M. 1999. *The Human Capital Model of the Demand for Health* (No. w7078).
21 National Bureau of Economic Research.
- 22 Güneş, P.M. 2015. The role of maternal education in child health: Evidence from a compulsory
23 schooling law. *Economics of Education Review*, 47, pp.1 - 16.
- 24 Kemptner, D. and Marcus, J. 2013. Spillover effects of maternal education on child's health
25 and health behavior. *Review of Economics of the Household*, 11(1), pp. 29 - 52.
- 26 Lesiapeto, M.S., Smuts, C.M., Hanekom, S.M., Du Plessis, J. and Faber, M. 2010. Risk factors
27 of poor anthropometric status in children under five years of age living in rural districts of the
28 Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal provinces, South Africa. *South African Journal of Clinical*
29 *Nutrition*, 23(4).

- 1 Lindeboom, M., Llena-Nozal, A. and van der Klaauw, B. 2009. Parental education and child
2 health: Evidence from a schooling reform. *Journal of Health Economics*, 28(1), pp. 109 - 131.
- 3 Lundborg, P., Nordin, M. and Rooth, D.O. 2011. The intergenerational transmission of human
4 capital: Exploring the role of skills and health using data on adoptees and twins.
5
- 6 Mani, S. 2014. Socioeconomic Determinants of Child Health: Empirical Evidence from
7 Indonesia. *Asian Economic Journal*, 28(1), pp. 81 - 104.
- 8 Medrano, P., Rodríguez, C. and Villa, E. 2008. Does Mother's Education Matter in Child's
9 Health? Evidence from South Africa. *South African Journal of Economics*, 76(4), pp. 612 -
10 627.
- 11 Rawlings, S.B. 2015. Parental Education and Child Health: Evidence from an Education
12 Reform in China. *CINCH Working Paper 2015/11*.
- 13 Salm, M. and Schunk, D. 2008. The role of childhood health for the intergenerational
14 transmission of human capital: Evidence from administrative data. *IZA*. 39 p. *ZA Discussion*
15 *Paper; no. 3646*.
- 16 Shisana, O., Labadarios, D., Rehle, T., Simbayi, L., Zuma, K., Dhansay, A., Reddy, P., Parker,
17 W., Hoosain, E., Naidoo, P. and Hongoro, C. 2014. *The South African National Health and*
18 *Nutrition Examination Survey, 2012: SANHANES-1: The Health and Nutritional Status of the*
19 *Nation*. HSRC Press.
- 20 Statistics, S.A. 2013. Quarterly Labour Force Survey, 3rd Quarter. Pretoria.
- 21 Statistics, S.A. 2015. Employment, unemployment, skills and economic growth: An
22 exploration of household survey evidence on skills development and unemployment between
23 1994 and 2014.
- 24 Strauss, J. and Thomas, D. 1998. Health, nutrition, and economic development. *Journal of*
25 *Economic Literature*, 36(2), pp. 766 - 817.
- 26 Thomas, D., Strauss, J. and Henriques, M.H. 1991. How does mother's education affect child
27 height? *Journal of Human Resources*, pp. 183 - 211.
- 28 UNESCO. 2006. EFA global monitoring report. Strong foundations: Early childhood care and
29 education. Paris: UNESCO.

- 1 Visser, G. 2013. Looking beyond the urban poor in South Africa: The new terra incognita for
2 urban geography? *Canadian Journal of African Studies/La Revue Canadienne Des études*
3 *Africaines*, 47(1), pp. 75 - 93.
- 4 Woolard, I. 2002. An overview of poverty and inequality in South Africa. Unpublished briefing
5 paper. HSRC, Pretoria.
- 6 Wooldridge, J.M. 2002. *Introductory econometrics: A modern approach*. Nelson Education.
- 7 World Economic Forum. 2012. The Global Competitiveness Report 2012 - 2013.
8 http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GlobalCompetitivenessReport_2012-13.pdf. [Accessed
9 13/01/2015].
- 10 World Health Organization. 2006. *WHO child growth standards: Length/height for age,*
11 *weight-for-age, weight-for-length, weight-for-height and body mass index-for-age, methods*
12 *and development*. World Health Organization.
- 13 World Health Organization and Unicef. 2009. WHO child growth standards and the
14 identification of severe acute malnutrition in infants and children: A joint statement by the
15 World Health Organization and the United Nations Children's Fund. Geneva: World Health
16 Organization.
- 17 Zhao, S. 2008. Application of human capital theory in China in the context of the knowledge
18 economy. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 19(5), pp. 802 - 817.
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22