


2018

Historical Representation of Immigration in Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grade Trade Books

John Holden Bickford
Eastern Illinois University

Stephanie J. Meier
Eastern Illinois University

Follow this and additional works at: http://thekeep.eiu.edu/the_councilor

 Part of the [Curriculum and Instruction Commons](#), [Educational Methods Commons](#), [Elementary Education Commons](#), [Elementary Education and Teaching Commons](#), [Junior High, Intermediate, Middle School Education and Teaching Commons](#), and the [Pre-Elementary, Early Childhood, Kindergarten Teacher Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Bickford, John Holden and Meier, Stephanie J. (2018) "Historical Representation of Immigration in Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grade Trade Books," *The Councilor: A Journal of the Social Studies*: Vol. 78 : No. 2 , Article 3.
Available at: http://thekeep.eiu.edu/the_councilor/vol78/iss2/3

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at The Keep. It has been accepted for inclusion in The Councilor: A Journal of the Social Studies by an authorized editor of The Keep. For more information, please contact tabruns@eiu.edu.



Historical Representation of Immigration in Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grade Trade Books

John Holden Bickford, Stephanie J. Meier
Eastern Illinois University

Introduction

For immigrants choosing to leave and refugees forced to evacuate, the gravity of relocation is compounded by fervent responses from residents at desired destinations. The tensions appear both in contemporary American news and within primary and secondary source material from 19th and early 20th century America. Past and present refugees and immigrants, legal and illegal, both hope and want. The hope appears eager, frenzied, or somewhere in between; the want typically stems from search for betterment, political asylum, or shelter from war. The hope and want for historic and contemporary emigrants appear on the Statue of Liberty's inscription, "Give me your tired, your poor, your huddled masses yearning to breathe free, the wretched refuse of your teeming shore. Send these, the homeless, tempest-tossed to me, I lift my lamp beside the golden door!" Contemporary emigrants' experiences and residents' reticence have inexplicable connections to historical patterns of immigration, which could be captured in social justice themes emergent within social studies, history, civics, English, reading, or language arts course. Expectations of education initiatives provide space for such a topic within multiple curricular areas at virtually any grade level.

The Common Core State Standards Initiative (CCSSI) has no content mandates, but does prescribe discipline-specific, age-appropriate cognitive tasks. CCSSI requires curricula—including history, social studies, civics, etc.—to incorporate multiple texts of the same era to position students to consider diverse perspectives; English and language arts students read as much non-fiction as fiction (NGA & CCSS, 2010). The non-fiction requirement increases the importance of history within elementary school, where it has long been in the shadows, and bolsters its position in middle level English and language arts classes, which have traditionally been synonymous with fiction (Heafner & Groce, 2007; Lucey, Shifflet, & Weillbacher, 2014; McMurrer, 2008). The multiple texts requisite applies to all grades and prevents reliance on a social studies textbook or a single whole-class English novel; it increases literacy circles for differentiation or a twin text format to juxtapose diverse perspectives. Trade books, thus, are multipurpose curricular resources used to meet students' diverse needs and interests while addressing challenging new prescriptions of education mandates. Dozens—if not hundreds—of trade books cover most every historical topic, era, figure, and theme.

Trade books, however, are not without flaws. History-based trade books, like those targeting the Holocaust, slavery in America, and the Civil Rights Movement, have numerous yet unpredictable historical misrepresentations. Holocaust-based trade books, for instance, overlooked non-Jewish victims, the complicity and acquiescence of ordinary Germans, and economic and social features particular to 1930s Germany that facilitated Adolf Hitler's rise (Bickford, Schuette, & Rich, 2015). Slavery-based trade books minimized the pervasive violence, disregarded the prevalence of family



separation, and embellished both owners' kindness and slaves' attainment of freedom (Bickford & Rich, 2014; Schwebel, 2011; Williams, 2009). Trade books with Civil Rights themes celebrated social segregation's end but omitted the origins of segregation, political and economic segregation, the ubiquity of violence, and White Americans' complicity (Bickford & Schuette, 2016; Schwebel, 2011). Historical misrepresentations in trade books are unpredictable, yet common. Teachers do not intend to transmit fables or falsehoods onto unwitting students. Tracing the presence and patterns of historical misrepresentations is important, yet we found no research that examined immigration and immigrants' experiences in 19th and 20th century America.

Immigrants' experiences traveling to 19th and early 20th century America represents an historical era with contemporary reverberations. Immigration is a topic that could appear in history, civics, social studies, English, language arts, reading, or interdisciplinary class and in both Intermediate Elementary (3-5) and Middle Grades (6-8) curricula. Trade books likely detail reasons immigrants sought a life in America (Brownstone, Franck, & Brownstone, 1979; Cannato, 2009), but do they include the xenophobic, anti-Semitic, and nationalist sentiment manifest in 19th and 20th century America (Barrett, 1999; Bodnar, 1985; Schmidt, 2005, 2010)? The books probably feature the long, difficult struggle immigrants faced upon arrival (Daniels, 2004; Higham, 1978), but do they describe the political influence of industrialists who sought laborers willing to work for meager pay in undesirable conditions six days a week (Eynon & Friedheim, 1997; Gersuny, 1976; Kirschbaum, 2005; Nasaw, 2006; Thernstrom, 1964)? While Ellis Island is an expected feature, how are other sites—like Angel Island off California—represented (Barde, 2008; Lau, 2007; Lee, 2003; Lee & Young, 2010)? If the former is largely synonymous with European immigration and the latter with Asian immigration, what is implied if only one is included? Similarly, which ethnicities and nationalities were explicitly mentioned and which were disregarded? While the books will likely describe the positive outcomes of immigration, do they note the negative corollaries such as typical working and living conditions for new arrivals? Do the books connect historical and contemporary immigration? These historical elements more fully contextualize 19th and 20th century immigration. As immigration is a topic for various curricula in different grade levels, it is worthwhile to consider how it is historically represented in trade books, a likely curricular resource.

Methods

Qualitative content analysis methods were used to examine how immigration is historically represented in trade books and how patterns of representations change based on the intended age of the reader. The ranges of Intermediate Elementary (3-5) and Middle Grades (6-8) were selected because these students are likely more dependent on teachers and class texts than high school students; they experience more teacher-centered instruction than, and lack the historical background of, their older counterparts (Heafner & Groce, 2007; Lucey et al., 2014; McMurrer, 2008). Modeled after similar inquiries (e.g. Chick & Corle, 2012; Chick, Slekar, & Charles, 2010; Eraqi, 2015; Lindquist, 2009, 2012; Loewen, 2007; Miller, 2015; Roberts, 2015), this study strictly followed qualitative research methods beginning with the original data pool and continuing through final analysis (Krippendorff, 2013). While scholars have considered changes in representation over time



(Connolly, 2013; Eaton, 2006; Schmidt, 2013; Schwebel, 2011), current teachers would not likely seek or obtain a class set of out-of-print trade books so only in-print trade books were considered. To determine the data pool, the largest children's literature publishers and warehouses—Amazon, Barnes and Noble, Booksource, and Scholastic—along with NoveList, an academic site, were searched. Individual trade books' intended age-range was determined by considering Advantage/TASA Open Standard, Lexile, Grade Level Expectations, and Developmental Reading Assessment. To consider how the intended audience shaped patterns of representation, trade books were grouped by grade ranges—Intermediate Elementary (3-5) and Middle Grades (6-8)—that align with the aforementioned education initiatives (NGA & CCSS, 2010). Through *systematic sampling*, a sizeable, representative, and random data sample with equal parts Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grades was obtained ($n = 30/101$; 30%) (see *Data Pool References* for data sample).

Content analysis requires both open coding and axial coding, which are interrelated and sometimes repeated steps. During open coding, both reviewers individually recorded observations about content included and excluded. The researchers then shared notes, reconciled dissimilar observations through collaborative reexamination of the disputed content, and constructed a list of tentative codes to test during the second reading. During this discussion, the researchers recognized the need to consider *how* content was included because an adult writer could easily reference content a young reader might overlook. It is necessary to distinguish explicitly detailed historical content from vaguely included or minimized historical content. Expectancies for age-appropriate detail increase with students' age and grade. An Intermediate Elementary book with two or more sentences of particular content was labeled Explicit and Detailed (ED) and Minimized or Vague (MV) if the content was included in less than two sentences or in indefinite ways that an Intermediate Elementary student might not grasp. A Middle Grades book was deemed Explicit and Detailed (ED) with four or more sentences on particular content and Minimized or Vague (MV) if the content was included in less than four sentences or in indefinite ways that a Middle Grades student might not understand. This scale of age-appropriate detail was necessary to consider historical representation patterns between different age-ranges of books; it was used during axial coding, in which both reviewers individually scrutinized each book using the codes to ascertain their frequency. Multiple readings and revision to the content analysis tool align with best practice methods (Krippendorff, 2013) and are necessary because historical representation is difficult to determine (see Appendix A, *Content Analysis Tool*).

Findings

Teachers, students, and parents expect history-based trade books to incorporate age-appropriate, accurate, and historically representative content. Readers may assume authorial liberties were taken with historical fiction but likely do not question a book labeled non-fiction. Findings in this study, however, indicate historical omission and misrepresentation within both grade ranges. As students proceed through school, expectations rise for developmentally-appropriate, increasingly complex content; this is termed spiraling (Heafner & Groce, 2007; Lucey et al., 2014; McMurrer, 2008). In this study, ineffective spiraling appeared. Specific findings for each particular book can be found in



Appendices B and C. Findings are organized into two subsections: representative historical content with effective spiraling and misrepresentative historical content.

Representative Historical Content with Effective Spiraling

The 19th and 20th century immigration and immigrants' lived experiences are akin to a mosaic in that large patterns emerge yet nuanced distinctions appear; this is both difficult and necessary to convey to young learners. A review of the trade books' genre and incorporated primary source material indicates patterns dependent on the intended age of the reader. The data pool was intentionally split between Intermediate Elementary ($n = 15$; 50%) and Middle Grades ($n = 15$; 50%). Historical fiction, or literature, trade books were a proportionally small segment of the entire data sample ($n = 4$; 13%), yet appeared more frequently in trade books targeting Intermediate Elementary ($n = 3$; 20%) than Middle Grades ($n = 1$; 7%) students. This is likely because historical fiction involves a main character's story in narrative form and generally relies on fewer facts, dates, and names than non-fiction, or informational texts (Rycik & Rosler, 2009; Schwebel, 2011; Williams, 2009). Age-based patterns also appeared when considering the subgenres of non-fiction, specifically narrative non-fiction, biography, expository, and collections of annotated primary sources (Connolly, 2013; Eaton, 2006; Schmidt, 2013; Schwebel, 2011). Both samples included similar portions of expository, biography, and narrative non-fiction; Middle Grade trade books, however, had a noticeable portion of compilations of annotated primary sources ($n = 2$; 13%), which did not appear in Intermediate Elementary books. If historical fiction, or literature, is easier for younger students to grasp because it is a story set in the past, then a collection of annotated primary sources is more cumbersome because it is a bound compilation of contextualized historical artifacts. A post-hoc review of previous research on Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grades history-based trade books indicates this subgenre of non-fiction has not been identified previously, which is an admittedly small subset of this data sample. Immigration-based non-fiction trade books are the majority of both Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grades and are nearly all the books in the Middle Grades portion. This increase in non-fiction aligns with expectations for more non-fiction than has traditionally been expected in elementary and middle level English and language arts (Heafner & Groce, 2007; Lucey et al., 2014; McMurrer, 2008; NGA & CCSS, 2010).

Historical documents were included in more books than simply the aforementioned collections of annotated primary sources intended for Middle Grade students. A clear pattern emerged regarding the prevalence and type of primary source in books in both grade ranges. A majority of Intermediate Elementary trade books incorporated primary sources throughout the narrative ($n = 9$; 60%) and nearly all Middle Grades books did so ($n = 13$; 87%). This diversity of sources within a single text aligns with education mandates for various informational texts representing multiple perspectives of the same topic (NGA & CCSS, 2010). A conspicuous pattern appeared connecting the intended age of the reader with the types of incorporated primary sources. Stated differently, photographs, newspaper articles, letters, transcribed speeches, maps, diagrams, and other informational texts appeared in books in both grade ranges but not in equal portions. Intermediate Elementary books included more visual primary sources, like photographs and maps, and usually had no more than one on a page. When text-based sources were in Intermediate Elementary books, they were succinct,



like a newspaper headline, and usually in a single sentence or two, like an excerpt from a letter. Most every Middle Grade book had every imaginable type of primary source freely interposed within the narrative with one or more informational texts on a page. This pattern is likely due to authors' recognition that Middle Grades students are expected to read to learn, whereas Intermediate Elementary students are newly transitioned from a learning-to-read mindset (Lucey et al., 2014; McMurrer, 2008). With regard to integration of primary sources within the secondary narrative, there appeared to be effective spiraling as Middle Grade books included more complex content and diverse texts than Intermediate Elementary books.

All books incorporated immigrants' motivation to leave their home countries, friends, and families; most did so explicitly with age-appropriate detail. A conspicuous portion of Intermediate Elementary books, however, included only vague or minimized rationale ($n = 6$; 40%) (Bunting, 2000; Jacobs, 1990; Leighton, 1992; Maestro & Ryan, 1996; Peacock, 2007; Quiri, 1998), whereas just one Middle Grade book was vague (7%) (Conway, 2007) and all others were explicit and detailed. This pattern of detail about immigrants' impetus aligned closely with the intended age of the reader, yet was unexpected upon reflection. Immigration was easily a pivotal moment in every immigrants' life, yet the motivation to move was not explicitly detailed in almost half of the Intermediate Elementary books. The stimulus for the relocation – that literally disrupted the course of every immigrant's life along with the sense of desperation and hope – does not seem to be too complex for young readers. With regard to immigrants' impetus to leave, spiraling appeared as Middle Grade books included more complex content than Intermediate Elementary books.

Immigrants arrived in the 19th and early 20th century from most every continent, country, and culture, which trade books reported with accuracy. Every Middle Grade book ($n = 15$) and a majority of Intermediate Elementary books ($n = 10$; 67%) mentioned ten or more countries of origin. Few trade books intended for Intermediate Elementary students ($n = 5$; 33%) did not reference immigrants' diverse ethnicities; they were split among historical fiction or literature (Bunting, 2000; Leighton, 1992) and non-fiction or informational texts (Bierman & Hehner, 1998; Quiri, 1998; Wilkes, 2006). Regarding referenced ethnicities, there appeared to be effective spiraling as Middle Grade books included more nuances of immigrants' origins than Intermediate Elementary books.

Misrepresentative Historical Content

The trade books all mentioned the location of immigrants' arrival. Trade books overwhelmingly noted Ellis Island, which was the only arrival site in most books ($n = 25$; 83%) and mentioned in most every book ($n = 29$; 97%). One Middle Grade trade book (3%) referenced only Angel Island (Sandler, 2004); no Intermediate Elementary book centered on Angel Island. Just a few trade books ($n = 4$; 13%) included multiple arrival sites, specifically one Intermediate Elementary (Bial, 2009) and three Middle Grade books (Novotny, 1971; Wepman, 2002; Werner, 2009). It is historically misrepresentative and Eurocentric that most books disregarded multiple locations for immigrants' arrival and focused predominantly on Ellis Island, which disregards the infusion of Asian immigrants into the western US. This misrepresentative pattern privileges Europeans who arrived



in Ellis Island while marginalizing others, particularly Hispanics from the south, Asians from the west, and Africans who were forcibly transported.

Trade books historically misrepresented various other elements of immigration, like life after arrival. Immigrants encountered xenophobia that emerged in Eurocentric, restrictive federal policy and nativist social interactions with current residents (e.g. Barrett, 1999; Bodnar, 1985; Brownstone et al., 1979; Cannato, 2009; Schmidt, 2005, 2010). Tensions were not resolved after a few years of residence as various eruptions appeared at instances of international conflict, like war, threat of war, and during economic hardships (e.g. Barrett, 1999; Bodnar, 1985; Daniels, 2004; Higham, 1978). Immigrants, thus, struggled for decades to achieve normalcy as they confronted palpable, emergent nativism. Owners and investors of industry, mine, railroad, and factory sought a relaxed immigration policy and strict labor policy; the former benefited immigrants' arrival and the latter blighted their working conditions, living standards, and pay (Eynon & Friedheim, 1997; Gersuny, 1976; Kirschbaum, 2005; Nasaw, 2006; Thernstrom, 1964). These historical (mis)representation appear in the subsequent table.

Table 1
Xenophobia, Achieving Acceptance, and Owner Influence

	<u>Xenophobia</u>			<u>Achieving Acceptance</u>			<u>Owner Influence</u>		
	<u>ED</u>	<u>MV</u>	<u>OE</u>	<u>ED</u>	<u>MV</u>	<u>OE</u>	<u>ED</u>	<u>MV</u>	<u>OE</u>
Early Grades	6	2	7	4	8	3	0	0	15
Middle Grades	10	3	2	13	1	1	0	0	15

Note. ED denotes books that were Explicit and Detailed; MV signifies books that were Minimized or Vague; OE represents books that Omitted Entirely all content. See Methods for details on each denotation.

Xenophobic immigration policy and nativist social sentiment of the 19th and 20th century at times ebbed, flowed more frequently at other times, and largely prevented immigrants' sense of normalcy. These integral elements to life in America for immigrants can and should be explicitly included. Most books in both grade ranges included minimized or detailed accounts of both. It was startling that no books in either grade range had even vague or minimized references to the influence owners and investors of industry, mine, railroad, and factory had on immigrants' entry to and experiences in America. Such omission misrepresents a significant element of history.

The trade books also misrepresented both the implications of immigration and connections between historical and contemporary immigration. The positive effects include, but are not limited to, a pluralistic citizenry sheltered from oppression with freedoms of religion, expression, press, and others (Brownstone et al., 1979; Cannato, 2009; Daniels, 2004; Higham, 1978). Historians argue these positive outcomes contrast sharply with negative corollaries like, to name a few, the strains of an emerging American infrastructure, destruction that westward expansion caused Native



Americans, and lowered salaries and working conditions for labor (e.g., Barrett, 1999; Bodnar, 1985; Eynon & Friedheim, 1997; Gersuny, 1976; Kirschbaum, 2005; Nasaw, 2006; Schmidt, 2005, 2010; Thernstrom, 1964). These historical elements—both positive and negative—more fully contextualize 19th and 20th century immigration to America. They are also closely aligned to concerns with contemporary refugees' interests to immigrate to America.

Table 2

Corollaries to Immigration and Historical-Contemporary Connections

	<u>Positive Outcomes</u>			<u>Negative Consequences</u>			<u>Connections</u>		
	<u>ED</u>	<u>MV</u>	<u>OE</u>	<u>ED</u>	<u>MV</u>	<u>OE</u>	<u>ED</u>	<u>MV</u>	<u>OE</u>
Early Grades	5	10	0	2	4	9	1	1	13
Middle Grades	4	11	0	0	11	4	0	1	14

* ED denotes books that were Explicit and Detailed; MV signifies books that were Minimized or Vague; OE represents books that Omitted Entirely all content. See Methods for details on each denotation.

All books included positive outcomes to immigration but few explicitly referenced the negative consequences; taken together, this concealed problematic components that immigrants faced while celebrated their heroic acts. Such omission is a concern because it historically whitewashes the context in which immigrants lived. A near-complete disconnect between past and present appeared as few books made any semblance of an association between historical immigrants seeking opportunity and contemporary refugees seeking security. Historical significance is diminished when past and present are detached.

Discussion

This inquiry into immigration-based Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grades trade books revealed patterns of historical misrepresentation and some elements of effective spiraling. The findings and their implications, though, are not only the concern of education researchers and scholars of curricula and literature. They should inform teachers' practice. Three important considerations, not definitive conclusions, are offered.

First, a single whole class novel is not encouraged. Students have disparate abilities and a whole class novel does not allow for ability-based differentiation. Every trade book had some strong qualities, none appeared without flaws, and selecting one story overlooks so many. A whole class novel, like a textbook, will not alone meet the intent of education initiatives that expect each unit to include multiple texts representing divergent perspectives and angles. If teachers are considering a single whole class novel, they should consider the historical elements of each book within the targeted grade level or reading range (Appendix B and C). This assists selection of books based on historical representation of content educators' find most meaningful. Recognizing each book's



historicity allows educators to use more than reading range, prose, and syntax when selecting a single book as a whole class novel.

Second, literacy circles are an effective classroom organizational model and substitute for whole class novels. Teachers could allow students to select one immigration-based title based on students' interest from a variety of pre-selected books. While choice is certainly an important curricular ingredient for a democratic class, it does not consider students' reading abilities. Teachers might use books' reading levels to organize ability-based literacy circles. Whether the teacher selects three books for groups of ten, six books for groups of five, or something in between, there are many enticing possibilities.

Third, the most historically representative, evocative, and engaging books were not always the longer, more complex books intended for Middle Grades students. The literature, or historical fiction, entitled *Coming to America: The Story of Immigration* (Maestro & Ryan, 1996) and non-fiction, or informational text, entitled *Ellis Island: Doorway to Freedom* (Kroll, 1995) are historically representative and accessible for Intermediate Elementary students. The former notes patterns of European and Asian immigration and includes native peoples crossing the Bering Strait and Africans forcibly carried across the Atlantic; the latter includes every element of the content analysis save the influence of business and contemporary immigration-based events. These are two examples demonstrate that Middle Grades trade books were not the *only* historically representative books.

Some Intermediate Elementary trade books succinctly articulated abstract historical concepts for young learners. In accessible prose and syntax, Ellen Levine's (1993) *If Your Name was Changed at Ellis Island* conveyed how xenophobia, nativism, and nationalism appear, at times, in the seemingly objective language used to describe individuals who leave one land to live in another. In language that Intermediate Elementary students could grasp, Levine (p. 48-49) juxtaposes how the first Europeans who journeyed to the New World are typically termed *settlers* or *colonists*, which have no discernible negative subtexts, yet *immigrants*—with undertones of desperation—are used to brand the later, unwanted, and usually filthy arrivals. Levine explains how both terms characterize the same actions—a person leaving one land to live in another—and originate from European descendants' characterizations, yet the former suggests an entitled journey and predestined arrival while the latter has various negative connotations.

Some of the most evocative books were for Intermediate Elementary students. *Ellis Island: Ghosts of Freedom* (Wilkes, 2006) has haunting photography. The young reader, for instance, sees images of once-precious stuffed animals left by a similar-aged child likely scared and excited about one journey's end and another's beginning. A video montage, entitled *Ellis Island Ghosts*, complements the book to literally bring movement to poignant photographs; discomfiting undertones are likely intended to make young readers appreciate their first world privileges. Evocative and haunting are apt adjectives.

Many Intermediate Elementary books had highly engaging narratives and compelling stories. *Dreaming of America* (Bunting, 2000) documents Annie Hall's passage, who was literally the first



immigrant to pass through Ellis Island. The privileged Annie Hall had gold rings and rubies arrive on her birthday; she shared a private cabin with her brothers, danced frequently, ate good food throughout the voyage, and faced no threat of illness. It painted a distinctly rose-colored picture, yet its engaging narrative would captivate a young reader. *Dreaming of America* would juxtapose well with any of the previously mentioned books, which are more realistic and thorough in their representation of the voyage – the worst part for many immigrants – and Ellis Island, that the rejected travelers viewed as an unwelcoming prison. Intermediate Elementary trade books provide as much potential for engagement as the more complex Middle Grades books.

Middle Grades books told a more comprehensive and nuanced history. *Strangers at the Door* (Novotny, 1971) distinguishes how immigration immediately benefited the country, not only the individual who gained security, but that it would take a generation or more to obtain social stability and economic security. *Ellis Island Interviews* (Coan, 1997) and *Immigration* (Wepman, 2002) each complicate students' understandings about the Statue of Liberty's splendor when its figurative shadows include oral history testimony about verbal, physical, and even sexual abuse by Ellis Island attendants and medical experimentation, like shock therapy, by Ellis Island physicians. Figurative flashlights are shined into areas not usually considered, like *Forgotten: Ellis Island, the Extraordinary Story of America's Immigrant Hospital* (Conway, 2007), or contemporary issues, like the Supreme Court case involving Ellis Island's ownership involving New York and New Jersey.

Education initiatives push social studies, civics, and history teachers to include diverse narratives of the same era and English and language arts teachers to incorporate more non-fiction topics. Teachers should be aware of the trade books' historical oversights, especially for a curricular unit with social justice themes. Intermediate Elementary and Middle Grade teachers have ample curricular possibilities for immigration-based units.



References

- Austin, H. & Thompson, K. (2015). *Examining the evidence: Seven strategies for teaching with primary sources*. North Mankato, MN: Maupin House Publishing.
- Barde, R. E. (2008). *Immigration at the Golden Gate: Passenger ships, exclusion, and Angel Island*. Westport, CT: Praeger.
- Barrett, N. (1999). The struggles of women industrial workers to improve work conditions in the Progressive Era. *OAH Magazine of History, Spring*, 43-49.
- Barton, K. (1996). "Everybody knows what history is . . ." Research, instruction, and public policy in the history curriculum: A symposium. *Theory and Research in Social Education, 24*, 391-415.
- Bickford, J. (2015). Assessing and addressing the historical (mis)representations of the Civil Rights Movement within children's literature. *The History Teacher, 48*(4), 693-736.
- Bickford, J., & Rich, C. (2014). Examining the representations of slavery within children's literature. *Social Studies Research and Practice, 9*(1), 66-94.
- Bickford, J. & Schuette, L. (2016). Trade books' historical representation of the Black Freedom Movement, slavery through civil rights. *Journal of Children's Literature, 41*(1), 20-43.
- Bickford, J., Schuette, L., & Rich, C. (2015). Examining the historical representation of the Holocaust within trade books. *Journal of International Social Studies, 5*(1), 4-50.
- Bodnar, J. (1985). *The transplanted: A history of immigrants in urban America*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Brownstone, D., Franck, I., & Brownstone, D. (1979). *Island of hope, island of tears*. New York, NY: Barnes & Noble.
- Cannato, V. J. (2009). *American passage: The history of Ellis Island*. New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Chick, K., & Corle, S. (2012). A gender analysis of NCSS Notable Trade Books for the intermediate grades. *Social Studies Research and Practice, 7*(2), 1-14.
- Chick, K., Slekar, T., & Charles, E. (2010). A gender analysis of NCSS Notable picture book winners: 2006-2008. *Social Studies Research and Practice, 5*(3), 21-31.
- Connolly, P. (2013). *Slavery in American children's literature, 1790-2010*. Iowa City, IA: University of Iowa Press.
- Daniels, R. (2004). *Guarding the Golden Door: American immigration policy and immigrants since 1882*. New York, NY: Hill & Wang Publishers.
- Eaton, G. (2006). *Well-dressed role models: The portrayal of women in biographies for children*. Lanham, MD: The Scarecrow Press, Inc.
- Eraqi, M. (2015). Inclusion of Arab-Americans and Muslim-Americans within secondary U.S. history textbooks. *Journal of International Social Studies, 5*(1), 2015, 64-80.
- Eynon, B. & Friedheim, W. (1997). "It's all about people": Social and labor history in the classroom. *OAH Magazine of History, Winter*, 53-61.
- Gersuny, C. (1976). "A devil in petticoats" and just cause: Patterns of punishment in two New England textile factories. *The Business History Review, 50*(2), 131-152.
- Heafner, T. & Groce, E. (2007). Advocating for social studies: Documenting the decline and doing something about it. *Social Education, 71*(5), 255.
- Higham, J. (1978). *Strangers in the land: Patterns of American nativism, 1860-1925*. New York, NY: Atheneum.



- Kirschbaum, S. (2005). "Mill girls" and labor movements: Integrating women's history into early industrialization studies. *OAH Magazine of History*, March, 42-46.
- Krippendorff, K. (2013). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*, Third Edition. Washington, DC: Sage Publishing.
- Lau, E. (2007). *Paper families: Identity, immigration administration, and Chinese Exclusion*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Lee, E. (2003). *At America's gates: Chinese immigration during the Exclusion Era, 1882-1943*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press.
- Lee, E. & Yung, J. (2010). *Angel Island: Immigrant Gateway to America*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Lindquist, D. (2009). The coverage of the Holocaust in high school history textbooks. *Social Education*, 73(6), 298-304.
- Lindquist, D. (2012). Textbook coverage of the destruction of the Armenians. *Journal of International Social Studies*, 2(1), 26-37.
- Loewen, J. (2007). *Lies my teacher told me: Everything your American history textbook got wrong*. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Loewen, J. (2010). *Teaching what really happened: How to avoid the tyranny of textbooks and get students excited about doing history*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Lucey, T., Shifflet, R. & Weillbacher, G. (2014). Patterns of early childhood, elementary, and middle-level social studies teaching: An interpretation of Illinois social studies teachers' practices and beliefs. *The Social Studies*, 105(6), 283-290.
- McMurrer, J. (2008). *Instructional time in elementary schools: A closer look at changes for specific subjects*. Washington, D.C.: Center on Education Policy.
- Miller, J. (2015). Never a fight of woman against man: What textbooks don't say about Women's Suffrage. *The History Teacher*, 48(3), 437-482.
- Monte-Sano, C., De La Paz, S. & Felton, M. (2014). *Reading, thinking, and writing about history: Teaching argument writing to diverse learners in the Common Core classroom, grades 6-12*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Nasaw, D. (2006). *Andrew Carnegie*. New York, NY: Penguin Press.
- National Council for the Social Studies (2010). *National curriculum standards for social studies: A framework for teaching, learning, and assessment*. Silver Spring, MD: NCSS.
- National Council for the Social Studies (2013). *College, career, and civic life (C3) framework for social studies state standards: Guidance for enhancing the rigor of k-12 civics, economics, geography, and history*. Silver Spring, MD: NCSS.
- National Governors Association Center for Best Practices & Council of Chief State School Officers. (2010). *Common Core State Standards for English language arts and literacy in history/social studies, science, and technical subjects*. Washington, DC: Authors.
- Nokes, J. (2011). Recognizing and addressing the barriers to adolescents' "reading like historians." *The History Teacher*, 44(3), 379-404.
- NovelList. Retrieved from <https://www.ebscohost.com/novelist>
- Powers, C. (2003). Challenging the pluralism of our past: Presentism and the selective tradition in historical fiction written for young people. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 37(4), 425-466.



- Roberts, S. (2015). A review of social studies textbook content since 2002. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 9(3), 51-65.
- Rycik, M. & Rosler, B. (2009). The return of historical fiction. *The Reading Teacher*, 63(2), 163-166.
- Schmidt, G. (2013). *Making Americans: Children's literature from 1930-1960*. Iowa City, IA: University of Iowa Press.
- Schmidt, J. (2005). "Restless movements characteristic of childhood": The legal construction of child labor in Nineteenth-Century Massachusetts. *Law and History Review*, 23(2), 315- 350.
- Schmidt, J. (2010). *Industrial violence and the legal origins of child labor*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Schwebel, S. (2011). *Child-sized history: Fictions of the past in U.S. classrooms*. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press.
- Seixas, P. & Morton, T. (2012). *The big six historical thinking concepts*. Toronto, Ontario: Nelson College Indigenous.
- Thernstrom, S. (1964). *Poverty and progress: Social mobility in a nineteenth century city*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Tschida, C., Ryan, C., & Ticknor, A. (2014). Building on windows and mirrors: Encouraging the disruption of "single stories" through children's literature. *Journal of Children's Literature*, 40(1), 28-39.
- Williams, T. (2009). A closer look: The representation of slavery in the *Dear America* series. *Social Studies and the Young Learner*, 21(3), 26-29.
- Wineburg, S. (2001). *Historical thinking and other unnatural acts: Charting the future of teaching the past*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- Wineburg, S., & Martin, D. (2009). Tampering with history: Adapting primary sources for struggling readers. *Social Education*, 73(5), 212-216.
- Wineburg, S., Martin, D., & Monte-Sano, C. (2011). *Reading like a historian: Teaching literacy in middle and high school classrooms*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Wineburg, S., Smith, M., & Breakstone, J. (2012). New directions in assessment: Using Library of Congress sources to assess historical understanding. *Social Education*, 76(6), 290-293.

Web-Based References

- Amazon. Retrieved from <http://www.amazon.com>
- Barnes&Noble. Retrieved from <http://www.barnesandnoble.com>
- Booksource. Retrieved from <http://www.booksource.com/>
- Ellis Island Ghosts*. Retrieved from <http://ellislandghosts.com/>
- Library of Congress: American Memory*. Retrieved from <https://memory.loc.gov/ammem/index.html>
- Sapers, J. (2015 February 26). Common Core's unintended consequences? More teachers write their own curricula. *The Hechinger Report: Covering Innovation and Inequality in Education*. Retrieved from <http://hechingerreport.org/common-cores-unintended-consequence/>
- Scholastic. Retrieved from <http://www.scholastic.com/teachers/>

Data Pool References

- Berman, J. S. (2003). *Ellis Island: The museum of the city of New York: Portraits of America*. New York, NY: Barnes & Noble Books.
- Bial, R. (2009). *Ellis Island: Coming to the land of liberty*. New York, NY: Houghton Mifflin.
- Bierman, C. & Hehner, B. (1998). *Journal to Ellis Island: How my father came to America*. New York,



- NY: Hyperion.
- Bolino, A.C. (1985). *The Ellis Island source book*. Washington, DC: Kensington Historical Press.
- Britton, T. (2004). *Ellis Island*. Edina, MN: Checkboard Library.
- Bunting, E. (Illus by Ben F. Stahl) (2000). *Dreaming of America: An Ellis Island story*. New York, NY: Troll Bridgewater Books.
- Burgan, M. (2014). *Ellis Island: An interactive history adventure*. North Mankato, MN: Capstone Press.
- Coan, P.M. (1997). *Ellis Island interviews*. New York, NY: Checkmark Books.
- Conway, L. (2007). *Forgotten: Ellis Island: The extraordinary story of America's immigrant hospital*. New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Dunne, T. (1971). *Ellis Island*. New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company Inc.
- Fisher, L. E. (1986). *Ellis Island: Gateway to the new world*. New York, NY: Holiday House.
- Jacobs, W. J. (1990). *Ellis Island: New hope in a new land*. New York, NY: Atheneum Books.
- Jango-Cohen, J. (2005). *Ellis Island: Cornerstones of freedom*. New York, NY: Scholastic.
- Knowlton, M.L. & Anderson, D. (2002). *Arriving at Ellis Island*. Milwaukee, WI: Gareth Stevens Publishing.
- Kroll, S. (1995). *Ellis Island: Doorway to freedom*. New York, NY: Holiday House.
- Leighton, M. R. (1992). *An Ellis Island Christmas*. New York, NY: Puffin Books.
- Levine, E. (1993). *If your name was changed at Ellis Island*. New York, NY: Scholastic.
- Maestro, B., & Ryan, S. (1996). *Coming to America: The story of immigration*. New York, NY: Scholastic.
- Novotny, A. (1971). *Strangers at the door: Ellis Island, Castle Garden, and the great migration to America*. Riverside, CT: The Chatham Press, Inc.
- Peacock, L. (2007). *At Ellis Island: A history in many voices*. New York, NY: Antheneum.
- Quiri, P.R. (1998). *Ellis Island*. New York, NY: Children's Press.
- Rebman, R.C. (2000). *Life on Ellis Island*. New York, NY: Lucent Books.
- Reef, C. (1991). *Ellis Island*. New York, NY: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Reeves, R. (1991). *Ellis Island: Gateway to the American Dream*. New York, NY: Crescent.
- Sandler, M. W. (2004). *Island of hope: The story of Ellis Island and the journey to America*. New York, NY: Scholastic.
- Siegel, B. (1985). *Sam Ellis's Island*. New York, NY: Four Winds Press.
- Wepman, D. (2002). *Immigration: From the founding of Virginia to the closing of Ellis Island*. New York, NY: Facts on File, Inc.
- Werner, E. (2009). *Passages to America: Oral histories of child immigrants from Ellis Island and Angel Island*. Washington, DC: Potomac Books, Inc.
- Wilkes, S. (2006). *Ellis Island: Ghosts of freedom*. New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Young, R. (2001). *A personal tour of Ellis Island*. Minneapolis, MN: Lerner Publishing Group.



Appendix A – Content Analysis Tool

1. Bibliographic information of book
2. Genre:
 - a. Literature: Historical fiction
 - b. Informational texts: Expository, narrative non-fiction, biography, collection of primary source material
3. Reading range/grade level:
4. Did the book include primary sources?
5. Did it address the reasons for immigrants wanting to come to America?
 - a. Graphic and detailed
 - b. Implicit, vague, or minimized
 - c. Omitted
6. Did it address the xenophobia/racist/anti-Semitic/nationalist sentiment present in America in 19th and early 20th century?
 - a. Graphic and detailed
 - b. Implicit, vague, or minimized
 - c. Omitted
7. Did it address the long, difficult struggle new immigrants had in America in 19th and 20th century?
 - a. Graphic and detailed
 - b. Implicit, vague, or minimized
 - c. Omitted
8. Did it focus on one immigration site (like Ellis Island only? Angel Island only)? Or, did it incorporate multiple immigration sites?
9. Did it consider the influence political influence of big business and industry (e.g. steel, railroads, manufacturing), particularly their need of laborers willing to accept undesirable working conditions, 12 hour work days, and low pay?
 - a. Graphic and detailed
 - b. Implicit, vague, or minimized
 - c. Omitted
10. Which ethnicities or nationalities were mentioned as one-time immigrants?
11. Does the book include any references to contemporary/current issues with immigration?
12. Did the book characterize *positive* implications of immigration?
13. Did the book characterize *negative* implications—westward expansion, Manifest Destiny, Native American removal, or some else—of immigration?
14. Were there any problematic elements (historical, layout, format) of the book?



Appendix B – Genre, Reading Range, Primary Documents, Motivation to Immigrate, and Encountering Xenophobia or Nativism

Author	Year	Genre	Reading Range	PDs Included	Reasons to Leave	Xenophobia or Nativism	Struggle
Berman	2003	NF Exp	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Omitted	Detailed
Bial	2009	NF Exp	Interm Elem	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Vague
Bierman & Hehner	1998	NF Narr	Interm Elem	Numerous	Detailed	Omitted	Vague
Bolino	1985	NF Prim Docs	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Britton	2004	NF Exp	Interm Elem	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Bunting	2000	HF Lit	Interm Elem	No	Vague	Omitted	Omitted
Burgan	2014	NF Narr	Middle Grades	No	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Coan	1997	NF Exp	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Conway	2007	NF Exp	Middle Grades	Numerous	Vague	Omitted	Omitted
Dunne	1971	NF Exp	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Fisher	1986	HF Lit	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Vague	Detailed
Jacobs	1990	NF Exp	Interm Elem	Numerous	Vague	Omitted	Vague
Jango-Cohen	2005	NF Narr	Interm Elem	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Knowlton & Anderson	2002	NF Exp	Interm Elem	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Vague
Kroll	1995	NF Exp	Interm Elem	No	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Leighton	1992	HF Lit	Interm Elem	No	Vague	Omitted	Omitted



Levine	1993	NF Exp	Interm Elem	No	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Maestro & Ryan	1996	HF Lit	Interm Elem	No	Vague	Vague	Vague
Novotny	1971	NF Narr	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Peacock	2007	NF Narr	Interm Elem	Numerous	Vague	Omitted	Vague
Quiri	1998	NF Exp	Interm Elem	No	Vague	Omitted	Vague
Rebman	2000	NF Narr	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Reef	1991	NF Exp	Interm Elem	Numerous	Detailed	Vague	Vague
Reeves	1991	NF Exp	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Sandler	2004	NF Narr	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Vague	Detailed
Siegel	1985	NF Narr	Middle Grades	No	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Wepman	2002	NF Exp	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Werner	2009	NF Prim Docs	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Detailed	Detailed
Wilkes	2006	NF Narr	Interm Elem	Numerous	Detailed	Omitted	Omitted
Young	2001	NF Exp	Middle Grades	Numerous	Detailed	Vague	Vague

Note. PDs Included indicates primary documents included within narrative; NF denotes non-fiction (or informational text; its subgenre follows the NF denotation); HF signifies historical fiction (or literature); Prim Docs indicates primary source material included in narrative.



Appendix C – Location, Influence of Business Owner, Ethnicities, Current Events, and Positive and Negative Effects of Immigration

Author	Sites	Owner Impact	Ethnicities	Current Events	Positive Elements	Negative Elements
Berman	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Bial	Multiple Sites	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Omitted
Bierman & Hehner	Ellis Only	Omitted	Few	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Bolino	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Britton	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Bunting	Ellis Only	Omitted	Few	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Burgan	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Coan	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Conway	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Dunne	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Fisher	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Jacobs	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Detailed	Vague	Omitted
Jango-Cohen	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Vague
Knowlton & Anderson	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Kroll	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Vague
Leighton	Ellis Only	Omitted	Few	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Levine	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Detailed
Maestro & Ryan	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Vague	Detailed	Detailed



Novotny	Multiple Sites	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Vague
Peacock	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Quiri	Ellis Only	Omitted	Few	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Rebman	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Vague	Vague	Vague
Reef	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Omitted
Reeves	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Sandler	Angel Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Vague
Siegel	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Vague
Wepman	Multiple Sites	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Detailed	Vague
Werner	Multiple Sites	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Wilkes	Ellis Only	Omitted	Few	Omitted	Vague	Vague
Young	Ellis Only	Omitted	Numerous	Omitted	Vague	Omitted

Note. Owner Impact signifies business (railroad, mines, factories) owners' influence on immigration; Ethnicities denotes the frequency of reference to various races and ethnicities of immigrants (in which, Few indicates less than four and Numerous indicates four or more, of which the median was 14); Positive Elements signifies reference to positive effects of immigration; Negative Elements denotes reference to negative implications of immigration.