



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

PERCEIVED BARRIERS TO TRADE UNIONISM IN MALAYSIA

NAGIAH RAMASAMY

GSM 2010 7

**PERCEIVED BARRIERS TO TRADE UNIONISM IN
MALAYSIA**

By

NAGIAH RAMASAMY

**Thesis Submitted to the Graduate School of Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the
Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

January 2010

Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

PERCEIVED BARRIERS TO TRADE UNIONISM IN MALAYSIA

By

NAGIAH RAMASAMY

January 2010

Chair: Professor Raduan Che Rose, PhD

Faculty: Graduate School of Management

Although trade unions in Malaysia generally play an important role in protecting the rights of workers, the movement is facing a declining trend. This study has examined the perceptions of workers, employers and trade union leaders on factors contributing to the decline of trade unionism in Malaysia. The central theme of the study was to identify the perceived barriers to trade unionism. Data was obtained through a structured questionnaire survey involving 859 employees, 429 employers and 182 trade union leaders. Further, in-depth interviews were conducted with union leaders, employers and the state to triangulate the results. The findings suggest that trade union decline is inevitable and trade unions do not seem to appeal to a large segment of the workforce. They not only perceive that unions have a negative image, but also that union membership may damage their career prospects. Unions appear to have limited power to maintain strong bargaining relationships with management, to organise new workplaces and to influence the need for union membership among new workers in existing workplaces. The current economic and political climate is further challenging the relevancy of trade unions. This study further suggests that the

employer is a key determinant for trade union decline. Employers perceive trade unions as reducing their competitiveness. They also view trade union leaders and members unfavourably. While some employers appear to engage in union busting activities, a majority of employers attempt to influence workers' values and perceptions by shifting towards HRM-type practices. This study concludes that employer opposition to unionisation as well as internal weaknesses within the trade union movement will mean that trade unions will struggle to collectivise in Malaysia. Leaders in companies, trade unions and the government need to discuss issues related to formation of trade unions, competitiveness of industry and legislation. Accessibility and availability of certain data from trade unions and employers are the main limitations. Based on the research findings, the theoretical and practical implications have been discussed. Suggestions for further research are also presented.

Key Words: Trade unions, Employers, Employees, Barriers, Malaysia

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi sebahagian keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**PERSEPSI HALANGAN-HALANGAN TERHADAP KESATUAN SEKERJA
DI MALAYSIA**

Oleh

NAGIAH RAMASAMY

Januari 2010

Pengerusi: Profesor Raduan Che Rose, PhD

Fakulti: Sekolah Pengajian Siswazah Pengurusan

Walaupun kesatuan pekerja di Malaysia umumnya memainkan peranan penting dalam melindungi hak-hak pekerja, gerakan ini menghadapi trend menurun. Kajian ini meneliti persepsi pekerja, majikan dan pemimpin kesatuan sekerja ke atas factor-factor yang menyumbang kepada kemerosotan kesatuan sekerja di Malaysia. Tema utama kajian ini adalah mengenalpasti halangan-halangan ke atas kegiatan kesatuan sekerja. Data diperolehi melalui kajian soalselidik berstruktur yang melibatkan 859 pekerja, 429 majikan dan 182 pemimpin kesatuan sekerja. Selanjutnya, temuduga mendalam dilakukan dengan pemimpin kesatuan sekerja, majikan dan pihak kerajaan untuk pengesahan hasil kajian. Hasil kajian menunjukkan bahawa kemerosotan kesatuan sekerja tidak boleh dielakkan dan kesatuan sekerja nampaknya tidak lagi menarik bagi sebahagian besar pekerja. Mereka bukan sahaja melihat bahawa kesatuan sekerja memberi imej yang negatif, tetapi juga mendapati keahlian mungkin memberi kesan buruk kepada kerjaya mereka. Kesatuan sekerja kelihatan mempunyai kuasa terhad untuk mempertahankan kuasa tawar-menawar

dengan majikan, untuk mengelola di tempat kerja yang baru serta mempengaruhi keperluan untuk keahlian kesatuan sekerja antara para pekerja baru di tempat kerja sedia ada. Keadaan iklim ekonomi dan politik semasa menjadikan kesesuaian kesatuan sekerja lebih mencabar. Kajian ini, selanjutnya, menyarankan bahawa majikan merupakan faktor penentu kepada kemerosotan kesatuan sekerja. Kesatuan sekerja menganggap kesatuan sekerja sebagai mengurangkan daya saing mereka. Mereka juga melihat pemimpin kesatuan sekerja dan ahli-ahlinya sebagai sesuatu yang tidak menyokong. Sementara beberapa majikan menjalankan aktiviti-aktiviti pemusnahan kesatuan sekerja, majoriti daripada mereka cuba mempengaruhi nilai-nilai dan persepsi pekerja dengan mengalih kepada pendekatan dan amalan-amalan pengurusan sumber manusia. Kajian ini menyimpulkan bahawa halangan pihak majikan serta kelemahan dalaman di dalam pergerakan kesatuan sekerja itu sendiri bermakna kesatuan sekerja akan menghadapi rintangan besar untuk mengkolektifkan di Malaysia. Pemimpin-pemimpin di syarikat-syarikat, kesatuan-kesatuan sekerja dan kerajaan perlu membincangkan isu-isu yang berkaitan dengan penubuhan kesatuan sekerja, daya saing industri dan undang-undang berkaitan. Kebolehcapaian dan ketersediaan data tertentu dari kesatuan-kesatuan sekerja dan majikan-majikan ialah pembatasan utama. Berdasarkan hasil kajian yang diperolehi, implikasi teori dan praktikal telah dibincangkan. Cadangan untuk penyelidikan lebih lanjut juga dikemukakan.

Perkataan Utama: Kesatuan sekerja, Majikan, Pekerja, Rintangan, Malaysia

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This Ph.D. is a result of hard work, the product of a long and difficult journey, one that seemed overwhelming at times. Finally, when writing the acknowledgement part of the thesis, my feelings are one of great relief.

I want to express my warmest gratitude to two individuals who were instrumental in making this study possible: Mr. G. Rajasekaran, Secretary General of MTUC and Tuan Haji Shamsuddin Bardan, Executive Director of MEF. I also wish to thank MTUC president, Encik Syed Shahir, and MTUC education officer Mr. K. Somasundram for advise.

I am very grateful to my thesis committee chairman, Prof Dr. Raduan Che Rose, for his encouragement and patience throughout this process. I would also like to thank my committee, Associate Prof Dr Jegak Uli from UPM's Faculty of Educational Studies, Dr Mohmad Adnan Alias from UKM's Faculty of Business Management and Dr. Naresh Kumar at UPM's Faculty of Economics and Administration, for offering me valuable advice and exchange of ideas. My appreciation also goes to Prof A. Anantaraman (formerly at Multimedia University's Faculty of Management) and Prof P. Ramasamy (formerly at UKM's Faculty of Political Science), who early in my doctoral research offered me insights into the developments in industrial relations in Malaysia. Although a number of individuals provided assistance and guidance, I take personal responsibility for any errors of interpretations or conclusions.

The librarians certainly deserve my appreciations, notably those at Universiti Putra Malaysia, Universiti Malaya, National University of Singapore, Ministry of Human Resources in Putrajaya and MTUC. Thanks to the employer representatives, trade union leaders and employees who took the time to complete my survey questionnaires, for without your participation, this study would not have been possible. Thanks to all my friends and colleagues who have encouraged me throughout the years.

Last, but certainly not the least, I would like to thank the many members of my immediate and extended family. As most married doctoral candidates know, the spouse suffers as much as the candidate. Thank you to my wife Mages, and our children Thinesh Naidu (17) and Shasvini Naidu (13) for being ever so patient with the many moods that come with the ups-and-downs of the process that involves sharing their lives with a 100k word monster. Thank you, too, to my loving and most encouraging sisters (Rukumoney, Thavamani, Ananda, Letchumy and Chasah) and brother-in-laws, for always inquiring about my progress.

I dedicate this dissertation to my mother, Mrs. R. Papamma, and to my late father, Mr. P. Ramasamy, for instilling the value of a sound education.

I certify that an Examination Committee met on 25 January 2010 to conduct the final examination of Nagiah Ramasamy on his Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled “Perceived Barriers To Trade Unionism in Malaysia” in accordance with Universities and Universiti Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A)] 15 March 1998. The committee recommends that the student be awarded the relevant degree. Members of the Thesis Examination Committee are as follows:

Shamsher Mohamad, PhD

Professor
Graduate School of Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Mohamed Branine, PhD

Professor
Dundee Business School
University of Abertay Dundee
Scotland
(External Examiner)

Durrishah Idrus, PhD

Professor
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia International Campus
Kuala Lumpur
(Internal Examiner)

Balakrishnan Parasuraman, PhD

Assoc. Professor
School of Social Sciences
Universiti Malaysia Sabah
(Internal Examiner)

Raduan Che Rose, PhD

Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Representative of Supervisory Committee/Observer)

SHAMSER MOHAMAD, PhD

Professor/Deputy Dean
Graduate School of Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

This thesis submitted to the Senate of University Putra Malaysia has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the Doctor of Philosophy. The members of Supervisory Committee are as follows:

Raduan Che Rose, PhD

Professor
Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Naresh Kumar, PhD

Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Jegak Uli, PhD

Assoc. Professor
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

ZAINAL ABIDIN MOHAMED, PhD

Professor/ Dean
Graduate School of Management
University Putra Malaysia

Date:

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations, which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at UPM or any other institutions.

NAGIAH RAMASAMY

Date:

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT	i
ABSTRAK	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
DECLARATION	viii
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF FIGURES	xii
LIST OF APPENDICES	xii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
CHAPTER	
1. INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Research background	1
1.2 Problem statement	4
1.3 Research questions	10
1.4 Research objectives	11
1.5 Scope of study	12
1.6 Significance of the research	15
1.7 Organisation of the Thesis	21
1.8 Definition of key terms	22
2. LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 Introduction	25
2.2 Theoretical background of trade unions	25
2.3 Overview of models of labour law	31
2.4 Unionism in Asia	32
2.5 Malaysian trade unionism in context	41
2.6 Malaysian trade union growth and decline	56
2.7 Workers	59
2.8 Trade union problems (internal and external)	78
2.9 Employer	90
2.10 The State	98
2.11 Conclusion	126
3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DATA COLLECTION	
3.1 Introduction	128
3.2 Population and sampling criteria	130
3.3 Sampling	132
3.4 Data collection strategy	137
3.5 Questionnaire design	141
3.6 Data collection	144
4. FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS - EMPLOYEES	
4.1 Introduction	149
4.2 Respondents' Demographic Variables	150
4.3 Company and Employment Background	153
4.4 Recruitment channels	158

4.5	Reasons for not joining a union	161
4.6	Attitude towards the union	173
4.7	Reasons for joining the union	176
4.8	Reactions if union members were to leave the union	188
4.9	Union effectiveness/ability to protect workers' interests	192
4.10	Employer's attitude towards the union	197
4.11	Conclusion	200
5.	FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS - EMPLOYERS	
5.1	Introduction	205
5.2	Companies' profile	206
5.3	Role of trade union	207
5.4	Formation of trade unions	211
5.5	Government intervention in IR issues	233
5.6	Conclusion	234
6.	FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS – TRADE UNION LEADERS	
6.1	Introduction	239
6.2	Respondents' demographic variables	239
6.3	Union background	240
6.4	Union leadership	242
6.5	Union recruitment	246
6.6	Role of union leader	248
6.7	Employer's attitude towards the union	248
6.8	Union-management relations	252
6.9	Collective disputes and procedures	253
6.10	Attitudes to government intervention in IR	256
6.11	Conclusion	256
7.	CONCLUSIONS	
7.1	Introduction	260
7.2	Summary of results	260
7.3	Contributions to theory and body of knowledge	275
7.4	Implications of this research findings	276
7.5	Limitations	280
7.6	Suggestions for future research	282
	REFERENCES	284
	APPENDICES	311
	BIODATA	347