

[Final manuscript. Published at Oxford University Press]

WORKING FROM WITHIN

The Nature and Development of Quine's Naturalism

Sander Verhaegh

It is understandable [...] that the philosopher should seek a transcendental vantage point, outside the world that imprisons [the] natural scientist and mathematician. He would make himself independent of the conceptual scheme which it is his task to study and revise. “Give me που στω [a place to stand]”, Archimedes said, “and I will move the world.” However, there is no such cosmic exile. [...] The philosopher is in the position rather, as Neurath says, “of a mariner who must rebuild his ship on the open sea”.

W. V. Quine (notes for *Sign and Object*, November 5, 1944)

Table of Contents

Preface	xi
List of Abbreviations	xv
1. Introduction	1
PART I: NATURE	
2. Naturalizing Epistemology	25
3. Naturalizing Metaphysics	59
4. In Mediis Rebus	89
PART II: DEVELOPMENT	
5. Sign and Object	127
6. Analytic and Synthetic	169
7. Science and Philosophy	231
8. Conclusion	265
Appendices	269
Bibliography	311
Index	353

Extended Table of Contents

Preface	xi
List of Abbreviations	xv
1. Introduction	1
1.0. Summary	1
1.1. Historical background	1
1.2. Naturalism and analytic philosophy	5
1.3. Working from within	7
1.4. Reading Quine in historical context	9
1.5. Plan	11
PART I: NATURE	
2. Naturalizing Epistemology	25
2.0. Summary	25
2.1. Introduction	25
2.2. From certainty to straight psychology	29
2.3. Two strategies	35
2.4. Self-sufficient sensory languages	37
2.5. Quine's response to the sceptic	41
2.6. Reinterpreting "Epistemology Naturalized"	44

3. Naturalizing Metaphysics	59
3.0. Summary	59
3.1. Introduction	60
3.2. Internal and external existence claims	63
3.3. Two distinctions	68
3.4. Quine on metaphysical existence claims	72
3.5. Scientific sense and metaphysical nonsense	77
3.6. Conclusion	81
4. In Mediis Rebus	89
4.0. Summary	89
4.1. Introduction	89
4.2. Three commitments	91
4.3. A quirk of usage	97
4.4. Deflation, deflation, deflation	102
4.5. The bounds of science	105
4.6. Immanence and transcendence	108
4.7. Artificial languages	112
4.8. Conclusion	114
PART II: DEVELOPMENT	
5. Sign and Object	127
5.0. Summary	127

5.1. Introduction	127
5.2. Philosophical background	130
5.3. Starting at the middle	133
5.4. The nature of metaphysical judgments	135
5.5. A pragmatic interpretation of positivism	138
5.6. The philosopher's task	141
5.7. Two problems	144
5.8. "Two Dogmas"	148
5.9. Language and knowledge	151
5.10. Conclusion	154
6. Analytic and Synthetic	169
6.0. Summary	169
6.1. Introduction	169
6.2. Narrow and wide holism	172
6.3. Mathematical objects and mathematical knowledge	179
6.4. The principle of tolerance	181
6.5. A behavioristically acceptable definition	184
6.6. Triangular correspondence	189
6.7. Quine on asemiotism	191
6.8. "The whole of science"	198
6.9. Maximal integration	201
6.10. Universal revisability	205
6.11. Maximal inclusion	213
6.12. Conclusion	210

7. Science and Philosophy	231
7.0. Summary	231
7.1. Introduction	231
7.2. Ordinary language and the language of science	233
7.3. Philosophy and science; science and philosophy	240
7.4. The reception of Quine's naturalism	244
7.5. Adopting an 'ism'	248
7.6. Conclusion	255
8. Conclusion	265
Appendices	269
A1. Editorial Introduction	271
A2. Logic, Mathematics, Science (1940)	274
A3. Sign and Object; or, The Semantics of Being (1944)	282
A4. A Letter to Nelson Goodman (1949)	289
A5. The Present State of Empiricism (1951)	294
A6. The Sophisticated Irrational (1965)	306
Bibliography	311
Index	353

Preface

This book is the result of almost nine years of thinking and writing about Quine's naturalism. The project started with a term paper on the Carnap-Quine debate for Jeanne Peijnenburg's inspiring course on the history of analytic philosophy in 2008 and gradually evolved into a dissertation about the relation between holism and naturalism in Quine's philosophy, which I defended in Groningen in 2015. Encouraged by the warm support of my colleagues and a number of fellow Quine scholars, I spent the last two years revising and extending the manuscript. Having acquired a serious case of 'archive fever', a significant chunk of this period was spent at the W. V. Quine Papers at Houghton Library, Harvard University. Using his published corpus as well the thousands of letters, notes, draft manuscripts, lectures, grant proposals, teaching materials, and annotations collected at the archives, I have aimed to write a book that reconstructs both the nature and the development of Quine's naturalism. The notes, letters, and lectures that have most influenced my views about (the development of) Quine's naturalism are transcribed and collected in the appendix.

Parts of this book have been published elsewhere. I thank the respective journals for granting me permission to reprint these papers:

Quine's Argument from Despair (2014). *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 22(1), 150-173. (chapter 2)

Blurring Boundaries: Carnap, Quine, and the Internal-External Distinction (2017). *Erkenntnis*, 82(4), 873-890. (chapter 3)

Boarding Neurath's Boat: The Early Development of Quine's Naturalism (2017).

Journal for the History of Philosophy, 55(2), 317-342. (sections 4.1-4.2, 6.2, and 6.6)

Quine on the Nature of Naturalism (2017). *The Southern Journal of Philosophy*,

55(1), 96-115. (section 4.5)

Sign and Object: Quine's Forgotten Philosophical Book Project (forthcoming).

Synthese. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-018-1693-z>. (chapter 5)

Quine's 'Needlessly Strong' Holism (2017). *Studies in History and Philosophy of*

Science, Part A, 61(1), 11-20. (sections 6.8-6.11)

Setting Sail: The Development and Reception of Quine's Naturalism (forthcoming).

Philosophers' Imprint. (chapter 7)

Still, this book aims to be more than a collection of papers. Many sections have been revised, extended, and rewritten for the purposes of this book. Moreover, an introductory chapter, a conclusion, several new sections (i.e. 4.3-4.4; 4.6-4.8; 5.5; 6.3-6.5; 6.7), and seven appendices have been included to fill the gaps and to present a comprehensive account of Quine's naturalism.

Much of this research has been funded by The Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (grants 322-20-001 and 275-20-064). My research visits to Harvard University, Houghton Library, Bethel, CT, and the Harvard University Archives have been funded by a Kristeller-Popkin Travel Fellowship from the *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, a Rodney G. Dennis Fellowship in the Study of Manuscripts from Houghton Library, and a Travel Bursary from the Evert Willem Beth Foundation. I am very grateful for this financial support.

Finally, it is my great pleasure to thank the many people without whom I could not have completed this book: Jeanne Peijnenburg, Allard Tamminga, Lieven Decock, Gary

Ebbs, Hans-Johann Glock, Peter Hylton, Gary Kemp, Fred Muller, Martin Lenz, and two anonymous referees for Oxford University Press for their comments on earlier versions of this book; Harvard's Department of Philosophy, Nyasha Borde, Monique Duhaime, Juliet Floyd, Warren Goldfarb, Leslie Morris, Mark Richard, Thomas Ricketts, and the staff at Houghton Library and the Harvard University Archives for their warm welcome during my research visits; Douglas and Maryclaire Quine for welcoming me into their house to examine the remaining 57 boxes of unprocessed archive material; Hannah Doyle, Lucy Randall, Richard Risomaki, Leslie Johnson, and Tharani Ramachandran at Oxford University Press and Newgen for smoothly guiding my manuscript through the editing and production process; Jody Azzouni, Richard Creath, Fons Dewulf, Dagfinn Føllesdal, James Levine, Eric Schliesser, Andrew Smith, Serdal Tumkaya, Thomas Uebel, Wim Vanrie, the members of the EPS seminar in Tilburg, the members of the PCCP and the WiP seminars in Groningen, and audiences in Amsterdam, Athens, Bloomington, Bologna, Calgary, Chicago, Denver, Edinburgh, Groningen, Konstanz, Manchester, Milan, Modena, Munich, Rotterdam, Tampa, Tilburg, and Zürich for their comments on various papers and chapters in various stages; Reto Gubelmann, Frederique Janssen-Lauret, Gary Kemp, and Sean Morris for their wonderful Quine workshops in Denver, Glasgow, Manchester, and Zürich; and Douglas B. Quine (W. V. Quine Literary Estate), and Catherine Z. Elgin (Literary executor for Nelson Goodman) for granting me permission to publish some of Quine's and Goodman's papers, notes, and letters as appendices to this book. Of course, the above individuals do not necessarily agree with my conclusions and they are not responsible for any residual errors or omissions.

A note on citation and transcription: Unless specified differently, the unpublished documents I refer to in this book are part of the W. V. Quine Papers, collection MS Am 2587, Houghton Library, Harvard University. In the main text and in the footnotes, I refer to these

documents by citing dates (if known) and item numbers. A letter of Quine to the American Philosophical Association, for example, could be referred to as (January 1, 1950, item 31). For quick reference, the item numbers are listed in the List of Abbreviations (pp. xiii-xxii). The items' full titles and box numbers are provided in the bibliography. In transcribing Quine's autograph notes, drafts, and letters, I have aimed to minimize editorial interference and chosen not to correct ungrammatical shorthand. In referring to Quine's *published* work, I use abbreviations (listed in the List of Abbreviations) as well as the year in which the paper or book was first published. If the paper is incorporated in one of Quine's collections of papers, the page numbers will refer to this collection. The first page of "Two Dogmas of Empiricism", for example, will be referred to as (TDE, 1951a, 20). The details of Quine's published work cited in this book are provided in the bibliography.

In his autobiography, *The Time of My Life*, Quine argues that science and history of science appeal to very different tempers: "An advance in science resolves an obscurity, a tangle, a complexity, an inelegance, that the scientist then gratefully dismisses and forgets. The historian of science tries to recapture the very tangles, confusions, and obscurities from which the scientist is so eager to free himself" (TML, 1985a, 194). I hope this book accomplishes a bit of both; although I will show that Quine faced many tangles, confusions, and obscurities in developing his naturalism, I also hope to convey that the system he created is one of great clarity and elegance.

Sander Verhaegh

June 2018

List of Abbreviations

This section provides a list of abbreviations used in this book to refer to W. V. Quine's published and unpublished work. Detailed references can be found in the Bibliography. A complete list of Quine's publications up to approximately 1997 (including reprints and translations) can be found in Yeghiayan (2009). For an overview of papers, books, reprints, and translations after 1997, see Douglas B. Quine's website <http://www.wvquine.org>. Most of Quine's unpublished papers, letters, lectures, and notebooks can be accessed at Houghton Library, Harvard University. The documents' call numbers, box numbers, and item numbers are provided in the Bibliography. A finding aid for much of Quine's unpublished work can be found at <http://oasis.lib.harvard.edu/oasis/deliver/~hou01800>. Archival sources from Quine's Unprocessed Papers, Quine's Library, and the Papers of Nelson Goodman are not listed here because they are not properly itemized. Details about these sources are listed in the Bibliography.

Archival sources

- | | |
|----------|--|
| Item 31 | Correspondence with the American Philosophical Association (1936-1986) |
| Item 40 | Correspondence Ap- through As- (various dates) |
| Item 86 | Correspondence with Lars Bergström (1988-1996) |
| Item 96 | Correspondence with Evert Willem Beth (1947-1964) |
| Item 205 | Correspondence with the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences (1955-1979) |

- Item 224 Correspondence with Alonzo Church (1935-1994)
- Item 231 Correspondence with Joseph T. Clark (1951-1953)
- Item 234 Correspondence Co- (various dates)
- Item 248 Correspondence with Columbia University (1949-1970)
- Item 254 Correspondence with James Bryant Conant (1951-1979)
- Item 260 Correspondence with John Cooley (1932-1962)
- Item 270 Correspondence with Richard Creath (1977-1998)
- Item 287 Correspondence with Donald Davidson (1957-1997)
- Item 293 Correspondence with Grace De Laguna (1950-1954)
- Item 306 Correspondence Di- through Do- (various dates)
- Item 315 Correspondence with Burton Dreben (1948-1997)
- Item 336 Correspondence Er- through Ez- (various dates)
- Item 370 Correspondence with Philipp Frank (1951-1967)
- Item 420 Correspondence with Nelson Goodman (1935-1994)
- Item 471 Correspondence with Harvard University, Department of Philosophy (1930-1994)
- Item 473 Correspondence with Harvard University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences (1931-1998)
- Item 475 Correspondence with Harvard University, Grants (1931-1988)
- Item 479 Correspondence with Harvard University, President's Office (1937-1998)
- Item 499 Correspondence with Carl Gustav Hempel (1936-1997)
- Item 529 Correspondence with Christopher Hookway (1988)
- Item 530 Correspondence with Paul Horwich (1991-1992)
- Item 545 Correspondence with the Institute for Advanced Study (1955-1965)
- Item 553 Correspondence Ir- through Iz- (various dates)

- Item 570 Correspondence with the Journal of Symbolic Logic (1936-1996)
- Item 616 Correspondence with Imre Lakatos (1964-1974)
- Item 637 Correspondence with Michelle Leonelli (1966-1998)
- Item 643 Correspondence with Clarence Irving Lewis (1929-1996)
- Item 675 Correspondence with Joseph Margolis (1967 and undated)
- Item 724 Correspondence with Hugh Miller (1948-1952)
- Item 741 Correspondence with Charles W. Morris (1936-1947)
- Item 755 Correspondence with John Myhill (1943-1985)
- Item 758 Correspondence with Ernest Nagel (1938-1964)
- Item 885 Correspondence with Hilary Putnam (1949-1993)
- Item 921 Correspondence with the Rockefeller Foundation (1945-1980)
- Item 958 Correspondence Sc- (various dates)
- Item 972 Correspondence with Wilfred Sellars (1938-1980)
- Item 1001 Correspondence with B. F. Skinner (1934-1998)
- Item 1005 Correspondence with J. J. C. Smart (1949-1998)
- Item 1014 Correspondence with Ernest Sosa (1970-1995)
- Item 1200 Correspondence with Paul Weiss (1937-1972)
- Item 1213 Correspondence with Morton White (1939-1998)
- Item 1221 Correspondence with Donald Cary Williams (1940-1994)
- Item 1237 Correspondence with Joseph Henry Woodger (1938-1982)
- Item 1239 Correspondence with the World Congress of Philosophy (1952-1998)
- Item 1244 Correspondence with Morton G. Wurtele (1938-1997)
- Item 1263 Correspondence concerning requests to publish or for copies (1950-1959)
- Item 1355 Editorial correspondence with D. Reidel Publishing Company (1960-1982 and undated)

- Item 1391 Editorial correspondence concerning *Mathematical Logic* (1939-1940)
- Item 1401 Editorial correspondence concerning *Methods of Logic* (1947-1950)
- Item 1422 Editorial correspondence concerning *Ontological Relativity* (1968-1988)
- Item 1423 Editorial correspondence concerning *On Translation* (1956-1959)
- Item 1443 Editorial correspondence concerning *On What There Is* (1948-1975)
- Item 1401 Editorial correspondence concerning *Theory of Deduction* (1946-1949)
- Item 1488 Editorial correspondence concerning *Word and Object* (1952-1960)
- Item 1489 Editorial correspondence concerning *Word and Object* (1959-1980 and undated)
- Item 1490 Editorial correspondence concerning *Words and Objections* (1966-1974)
- Item 2388a Quine's Annotated Copy of Putnam's *Meaning and the Moral Sciences* (undated)
- Item 2441 *Epistemology Naturalized; or, the Case for Psychologism* (1968)
- Item 2498 *In conversation: Professor W. V. Quine. Interviews by Rudolf Fara* (1993)
- Item 2733 *Russell's Ontological Development* (1966-1967)
- Item 2756 *Stimulus and Meaning* (1965)
- Item 2829 *A Short Course on Logic* (1946)
- Item 2830 *Theory of Deduction* (1948)
- Item 2836 Foreword to the Third Edition of *From a Logical Point of View* (1979)
- Item 2884 *Questions for Quine* by Stephen Neale (1986)
- Item 2902 For Rockefeller Lecture (1968)
- Item 2903 For Symposium with Sellars (1968)
- Item 2928 The Inception of "New Foundations" (1987)
- Item 2948 *Kinds* (1967)
- Item 2952 *Levine Seminar Questions for Quine* (1982)

- Item 2954 Logic, Math, Science (1940)
- Item 2958 Mathematical Entities (1950)
- Item 2969 Nominalism (1937)
- Item 2971 The Notre Dame Lectures (1970)
- Item 2994 Ontological Relativity (1967)
- Item 2995 Ontological Relativity (1968)
- Item 3011 The Place of a Theory of Evidence (1952)
- Item 3015 The Present State of Empiricism (1951)
- Item 3102 Word and Object Seminar (1967)
- Item 3158 Philosophy 148 (1953)
- Item 3169 Early Jottings on Philosophy of Language (1937-1944)
- Item 3170 Erledigte Notized (various dates)
- Item 3181 Ontology, Metaphysics, etc... (1944-1951)
- Item 3182 Philosophical Notes (various dates)
- Item 3184 Pragmatism, etc... (1951-1953)
- Item 3225 Miscellaneous Papers (1925-1931)
- Item 3236 Papers in Philosophy (1930-1931)
- Item 3254 General Report of my Work as a Sheldon Traveling Fellow 1932-1933 (1934)
- Item 3266 Philosophy 148 (ca. 1947)
- Item 3277 Oxford University Lectures (1953-1954)
- Item 3283 Oxford University Lecture: Philosophy of Logic (1953-1954)

Published work

ANM	Animadversion on the Notion of Meaning (1949)
AWVQ	Autobiography of W.V. Quine (1986)
CA	Carnap (1987)
CB	Comment on Berger (1990)
CCE	<i>Confessions of a Confirmed Extensionalist and Other Essays</i> (2008)
CD	Contextual Definition (1995)
CGC	A Comment on Grünbaum's Claim (1962)
CLT	Carnap and Logical Truth (1954)
CPT	Carnap's Positivist Travail (1984)
CNT	Comments on Neil Tennant's "Carnap and Quine" (1994)
CVO	Carnap's Views on Ontology (1951)
DE	Designation and Existence (1939)
EBDQ	Exchange Between Donald Davidson and W. V. Quine Following Davidson's Lecture (1994)
EESW	On Empirically Equivalent Systems of the World (1975)
EN	Epistemology Naturalized (1969)
EQ	Existence and Quantification (1968)
FHQP	Four Hot Questions in Philosophy (1985)
FLPV	<i>From a Logical Point of View</i> (1953/1961)
FM	Facts of the Matter (1977)
FME	Five Milestones of Empiricism (1975)
FSS	<i>From Stimulus to Science</i> (1995)
GQW	Nelson Goodman, W. V. Quine and Morton White: A Triangular Correspondence (1947)
GT	Grades of Theoreticity (1970)

IOH	Identity, Ostension, Hypostasis (1946)
IQ	The Ideas of Quine. Interview by B. Magee (1978)
ITA	Indeterminacy of Translation Again (1987)
IV	Immanence and Validity (1991)
IWVQ	Interview with Willard Van Orman Quine. Interview by L. Bergström and D. Føllesdal (1994)
LAOP	A Logistical Approach to the Ontological Problem (1939)
LC	Lectures on Carnap (1934)
LDHP	Lectures on David Hume's Philosophy (1946)
LP	Linguistics and Philosophy (1968)
ML1	<i>Methods of Logic</i> . First edition (1950)
ML4	<i>Methods of Logic</i> . Fourth edition (1982)
MSLT	Mr. Strawson on Logical Theory (1953)
NEN	Notes on Existence and Necessity (1943)
NK	Natural Kinds (1969)
NLOM	Naturalism; Or, Living within One's Means (1995)
NNK	The Nature of Natural Knowledge (1975)
NO	Nominalism (1946)
OI	Ontology and Ideology (1951)
OME	On Mental Entities (1953)
ONAS	On the Notion of an Analytic Statement (1946)
OR	Ontological Relativity (1968)
ORE	<i>Ontological Relativity and other essays</i> (1969)
ORPC	Ontological Remarks on the Propositional Calculus (1934)
ORWN	Ontological Reduction and the World of Numbers (1964)

OW	Otherworldly (1978)
OWTI	On What There Is (1948)
PL	<i>Philosophy of Logic</i> (1970/1986)
PPE	The Pragmatists' Place in Empiricism (1975)
PPLT	Philosophical Progress in Language Theory (1970)
PR	Posits and Reality (1955)
PT	<i>Pursuit of Truth</i> (1990/1992)
PTF	Progress on Two Fronts (1996)
QCC	The Quine-Carnap Correspondence (1932-1970)
QD	<i>Quine in Dialogue</i> (2008)
QSM	Quine Speaks His Mind. An interview by E. Pivcevic (1988)
QU	<i>Quiddities</i> (1987)
QWVO	Quine/'kwain/, Willard Van Orman (b. 1908) (1996)
RA	Responses to Articles by Abel Bergström, Davidson, Dreben, Gibson, Hookway, and Prawitz (1994)
RC	Reply to Chomsky (1968)
RCP	Reply to Charles Parsons (1986)
RE	Reactions (1995)
RES	Responses to Szubka, Lehrer, Bergström, Gibson, Miscevic, and Orenstein (1999)
RGE	Response to Gary Ebbs (1995)
RGH	Reply to Geoffrey Hellman (1986)
RGM	Responding to Grover Maxwell (1968)
RHP	Reply to Hilary Putnam (1986)
RJV	Reply to Jules Vuillemin (1986)

RMW	Reply to Morton White (1986)
ROD	Russell's Ontological Development (1966)
RR	<i>The Roots of Reference</i> (1973)
RRN	Reply to Robert Nozick (1986)
RS1	Reply to Stroud (1968)
RS2	Reply to Stroud (1981)
RSM	Reply to Smart (1968)
RST	Reply to Stenius (1968)
RTD	Reply to Davidson (1968)
RTE	Responses to Essays by Smart, Orenstein, Lewis and Holdcroft, and Haack (1997)
SCN	Steps toward a Constructive Nominalism (1947)
SLP	<i>Selected Logic Papers</i> (1966/1995)
SLS	The Scope and Language of Science (1954)
SM	Stimulus and Meaning (1965)
SN	Structure and Nature (1992)
SSS	The Sensory Support of Science (1986)
STL	<i>Set Theory and its Logic</i> (1963/1969)
TC	Truth by Convention (1936)
TDE	Two Dogmas of Empiricism (1951)
TDR	Two Dogmas in Retrospect (1991)
TI	Three Indeterminacies (1990)
TML	<i>The Time of My Life</i> (1985)
TR	Truth (1994)
TT	<i>Theories and Things</i> (1981)

TTPT	Things and Their Place in Theories (1981)
VD	Vagaries of Definition (1972)
VITD	On the Very Idea of a Third Dogma (1981)
WDWD	Where Do We Disagree (1999)
WB	<i>The Web of Belief</i> (with J. S. Ullian 1970/1978)
WIB	What I Believe (1984)
WO	<i>Word and Object</i> (1960)
WP	<i>The Ways of Paradox and other essays</i> (1966/1976)
WPB	What Price Bivalence? (1981)
WRML	Whitehead and the Rise of Modern Logic (1941)
WW	The Way the World Is (1986)

Bibliography

Archival Sources: W. V. Quine Papers

The unpublished papers, letters, lectures, and notebooks listed below are stored at the Harvard Depository and can be accessed at Houghton Library. A catalogue of Quine's unpublished work can be found at <http://oasis.lib.harvard.edu/oasis/deliver/~hou01800>. The references are ordered by item number.

Quine, W. V. and American Philosophical Association (1936-1986). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 001, Item 31.

Quine, W. V. (various dates). Correspondence Ap- through As-. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 002, Item 40.

Quine, W. V. and Bergström, L. (1988-1996). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 003, Item 86.

Quine, W. V. and Beth, E. W. (1947-1964). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 004, Item 96.

Quine, W. V. and Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences (1955-1979). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 007, Item 205.

Quine, W. V. and Church, A. (1935-1994). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 008, Item 224.

Quine, W. V. and Clark, J. T. (1951-1953). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 008, Item 231.

Quine, W. V. (various dates). Correspondence Co-. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box

009, Item 234.

Quine, W. V. and Columbia University (1949-1970). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 009, Item 248.

Quine, W. V. and Conant, J. B. (1951-1979). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 009, Item 254.

Quine, W. V. and Cooley, J. C. (1932-1962). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 009, Item 260.

Quine, W. V. and Creath, R. (1977-1998). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 009, Item 270.

Quine, W. V. and Davidson, D. (1957-1997). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 010, Item 287.

Quine, W. V. and De Laguna, G. A. (1950-1954). Correspondence, W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 010, Item 293.

Quine, W. V. (various dates). Correspondence Di- through Do-. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 011, Item 306

Quine, W. V. and Dreben, B. (1948-1997). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 011, Item 315.

Quine, W. V. (various dates). Correspondence Er- through Ez-. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 011, Item 336.

Quine, W. V. and Frank, P. (1951-1967). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 013, Item 370

Quine, W. V. and Goodman, N. (1935-1994). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 016, Item 420.

Quine, W. V. and Harvard University, Department of Philosophy (1930-1994 and undated). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 018, Item 471.

Quine, W. V. and Harvard University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences (1931-1988).
Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 018, Item 473.

Quine, W. V. and Harvard University, Grants (1931-1988). Correspondence. W. V. Quine
Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 018, Item 475.

Quine, W. V. and Harvard University, President's Office (1937-1998). Correspondence. W.
V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 018, Item 479.

Quine, W. V. and Hempel, C. G. (1936-1997). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS
Am 2587): Box 019, Item 499.

Quine, W. V. and Hookway, C. (1988). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am
2587): Box 020, Item 529.

Quine, W. V. and Horwich, P. (1991-1992). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am
2587): Box 020, Item 530.

Quine, W. V. and Institute for Advanced Study (1955-1965). Correspondence. W. V. Quine
Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 020, Item 545.

Quine, W. V. (various dates). Correspondence Ir- through Iz-. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am
2587): Box 021, Item 553

Quine, W. V. and Journal of Symbolic Logic (1936-1996). Correspondence. W. V. Quine
Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 021, Item 570.

Quine, W. V. and Lakatos, I. (1964-1974). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am
2587): Box 023, Item 616.

Quine, W. V. and Leonelli, M. (1966-1998). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am
2587): Box 024, Item 637.

Quine, W. V. and Lewis, C. I. (1929-1996). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am
2587): Box 024, Item 643.

Quine, W. V. and Margolis, J. (1967 and undated). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers

(MS Am 2587): Box 025, Item 675.

Quine, W. V. and Miller, H. (1948-1952). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 027, Item 724.

Quine, W. V. and Morris, C. W. (1936-1947). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 027, Item 741.

Quine, W. V. and Myhill, J. (1943-1985). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 028, Item 755.

Quine, W. V. and Nagel, E. (1938-1964). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 028, Item 758.

Quine, W. V. and Putnam, H. (1949-1993). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 31, Item 885.

Quine, W. V. and Rockefeller Foundation (1945-1980). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 033, Item 921.

Quine, W. V. and Rodriguez-Consuegra, F. (1987-1994). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 033, Item 923.

Quine, W. V. (various dates). Correspondence Sc-. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 034, Item 958.

Quine, W. V. and Sellars, W. (1938-1980). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 034, Item 972.

Quine, W. V. and Skinner, B. F. (1934-1998). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 036, Item 1001.

Quine, W. V. and Smart, J. J. C. (1949-1998). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 036, Item 1005.

Quine, W. V. and Sosa, E. (1970-1995). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 036, Item 1014.

- Quine, W. V. and Weiss, P. (1937-1972). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 042, Item 1200.
- Quine, W. V. and White, M. (1939-1998). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 043, Item 1213.
- Quine, W. V. and Williams, D. C. (1940-1994). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 043, Item 1221.
- Quine, W. V. and Woodger, J. H. (1938-1982). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 044, Item 1237.
- Quine, W. V. and World Congress of Philosophy (1952-1998). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 044, Item 1239.
- Quine, W. V. and Wurtele, M. G. (1938-1997). Correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 044, Item 1244.
- Quine, W. V. (1950-1959). Correspondence concerning requests to publish or for copies. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 045, Item 1263.
- Quine, W. V. (1960-1982 and undated). D. Reidel Publishing Company, Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 049, Item 1355.
- Quine, W. V. (1939-1940). *Mathematical Logic*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 050, Item 1391.
- Quine, W. V. (1947-1950). *Methods of logic*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 051, Item 1401.
- Quine, W. V. (1968-1988). *Ontological relativity*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 052, Item 1422.
- Quine, W. V. (1956-1959). *On translation*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 052, Item 1423.
- Quine, W. V. (1948-1975). On what there is. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers

- (MS Am 2587): Box 052, Item 1443.
- Quine, W. V. (1946-1949). *Theory of deduction*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 053, Item 1467.
- Quine, W. V. (1952-1960). *Word and object*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 054, Item 1488.
- Quine, W. V. (1959-1980 and undated). *Word and object*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 054, Item 1489.
- Quine, W. V. (1966-1974). *Words and objections*. Editorial correspondence. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 054, Item 1490.
- Quine, W. V. (undated). Quine's annotated copy of Putnam's *Meaning and the moral sciences*. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 119, Item 2388a.
- Quine, W. V. (1968). Epistemology naturalized; or, the case for psychologism. Typescript with manuscript additions. Prepared March 1968. Presented at The New School of Social Research, April 28, 1968. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 085, Item 2441.
- Quine, W. V. (1993). In conversation: Professor W. V. Quine. Interviews by Rudolf Fara. Printout with autograph manuscript revisions. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 086, Item 2498.
- Quine, W. V. (1966-1967). Russell's ontological development. Autograph manuscript, typescript carbon. Presented at a symposium of the American Philosophical Association, June 29, 1966. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 090, Item 2733.
- Quine, W. V. (1965). Stimulus and meaning. Autograph manuscript. Prepared September 11-25, 1965. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 091, Item 2756.
- Quine, W. V. (1946). *A short course in logic*. Typescript mimeograph. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 097, Item 2829.

- Quine, W. V. (1948). *Theory of deduction*. Typescript mimeograph. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 097, Item 2830.
- Quine, W. V. (1979). Foreword to the third edition of *From a logical point of view*. Autograph manuscript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 098, Item 2836.
- Quine, W. V. (1986). Questions for Quine by Stephen Neale. Autograph manuscript, Manuscript, Typescript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 101, Item 2884.
- Quine, W. V. (1968). For Rockefeller lecture. Autograph manuscript. Presented at Rockefeller University, February 5, 1968. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 101, Item 2902.
- Quine, W. V. (1968). For symposium with Sellars. Autograph manuscript. Presented at the Summer Institute of Philosophy, Southampton, Long Island, July 11, 1968. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 101, Item 2903.
- Quine, W. V. (1987). The inception of "New foundations". Autograph manuscript. Presented at Oberwolfach, March 1987. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 102, Item 2928.
- Quine, W. V. (1967). Kinds. Autograph manuscript. Prepared September 22, 1967. Presented at Brooklyn College, October 17, 1967. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 102, Item 2948.
- Quine, W. V. (1982). Levine seminar questions for Quine. Autograph manuscript, Typescript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 102, Item 2952.
- Quine, W. V. (1940). Logic, math, science. Typescript. Presented at the Harvard Logic Group, December 20, 1940. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 102, Item 2954.
- Quine, W. V. (1950). Mathematical entities. Typescript. Presented at New York University, November 26, 1950. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 102, Item 2958.
- Quine, W. V. (1937). Nominalism. Autograph manuscript. Presented at the Harvard

- Philosophy Club, October 25, 1937. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 103, Item 2969.
- Quine, W. V. (1970). The Notre Dame lectures. Autograph manuscript. Presented at the University of Notre Dame, May 11-15, 1970. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 103, 2971.
- Quine, W. V. (1967). Ontological relativity. Typescript. Prepared March 1967, presented at the University of Chicago and Yale University, May 1967. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 103, Item 2994.
- Quine, W. V. (1968). Ontological relativity. Typescript with autograph manuscript revisions. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 103, Item 2995.
- Quine, W. V. (1952). The place of a theory of evidence. Typescript. Presented at Yale University, October 7, 1952. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 104, Item 3011.
- Quine, W. V. (1951). The present state of empiricism. Autograph manuscript. Presented at the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, May 26, 1951. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 104, Item 3015.
- Quine, W. V. (1967). Word and object seminar. Autograph manuscript. Presented at Ohio State University, January 9-13, 1967. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 106, Item 3102.
- Quine, W. V. (1953). Philosophy 148. Typescript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 107, Item 3158.
- Quine, W. V. (1937-1944). Early jottings on philosophy of language. Collection of notes. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 108, Item 3169.
- Quine, W. V. (various dates). Erledigte notizen. Collection of notes. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 108, Item 3170.

Quine, W. V. (1944-1951). Ontology, metaphysics, etc... Collection of notes. Box 108, Item 3181.

Quine, W. V. (various dates). Philosophical notes. Collection of notes. Boxes 108 and 109, Item 3182.

Quine, W. V. (1951-1953). Pragmatism, etc.... Collection of notes. Box 109, Item 3184.

Quine, W. V. (1925-1931). Miscellaneous papers. Collection of authograph student papers. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 110, Item 3225.

Quine, W. V. (1930-1931). Papers in philosophy. Collection of authograph student papers. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 111, Item 3236.

Quine, W. V. (1934). General report of my work as a Sheldon Traveling Fellow 1932-1933. Typescript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 112, Item 3254.

Quine, W. V. (ca. 1947). Philosophy 148. Autograph manuscript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 115, Item 3266.

Quine, W. V. (1953-1954). Oxford University lectures. Autograph manuscript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 116, Item 3277.

Quine, W. V. (1953-1954). Oxford University lecture: Philosophy of logic. Autograph manuscript. W. V. Quine Papers (MS Am 2587): Box 118, Item 3283.

Archival Sources: Quine's Unprocessed Papers

Quine's unprocessed archive is stored at Douglas B. Quine's house in Bethel, Connecticut. The will soon be added to the W. V. Quine Papers at Houghton Library. Unfortunately, there is no publicly available inventory of Quine's unprocessed archive yet. The references are ordered by box number.

Quine, W. V. (1924-1932). Correspondence between Quine and his parents. Box 21: Quine parents EasyClasp File: 1924-1932.

Quine, W. V. (1933-1965). Correspondence between Quine and his parents. Box 21: Quine parents EasyClasp File: 1933-1965.

Quine, W. V. (1933-1999). Datebooks. Box 45: Address Books, Datebooks, Diaries, Notepad.

Archival Sources: Quine's Library

Quine's library is stored at the Harvard Depository and can be accessed at Houghton Library.

A catalog of Quine's library can be found at

http://hcl.harvard.edu/libraries/houghton/collections/modern/printed_acquisitions_1213.cfm.

The references are ordered by call number.

Quine, W. V. (undated). Quine's copy of Dewey, J. (1925). *Experience and nature*. Item AC95.Qu441.Zz929d.

Quine, W. V. (undated). Quine's copy of Kuhn, T. (1962). *The structure of scientific Revolutions*. Item AC95.Qu441.Zz962k.

Quine, W. V. (undated). Quine's copy of Popper, K. (1962). *Conjectures and refutations*. Item AC95.Qu441.Zz962p.

Archival Sources: Papers of Nelson Goodman

Nelson Goodman's archive is stored at the Harvard University Archives. Unfortunately, there is no publicly available catalogue of Goodman's papers.

Goodman, N. and Quine, W. V. (ca. 1935-1994). Correspondence. Papers of Nelson Goodman. Accession 14359, unlabeled box, unlabeled folder.

Published Literature

Almeder, R. (1998). *Harmless naturalism: The limits of science and the nature of philosophy*. Chicago: Open Court.

Alspector-Kelly, M. (2001). On Quine on Carnap on ontology. *Philosophical Studies*, 102(1), 93–122.

Ammerman, R. R. (1965). *Classics of analytic philosophy*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Ariew, R. (1984). The Duhem Thesis. *British Journal for the Philosophy of Science*, 35(4), 313–325.

Arnold, J. & Shapiro, S. (2007). Where in the (world wide) web of belief is the law of non-contradiction. *Noûs*, 41(2), 276–297.

Baldwin, T. (2007). Pragmatism and analysis. In M. Beaney (Ed.), *The analytic turn: Analysis in early analytic philosophy and phenomenology* (pp. 178-195). New York: Routledge.

Baldwin, T. (2013). C. I. Lewis and the Analyticity Debate. In Reck (2013a), pp. 201-227.

Balfour, A. J. (1895). *The foundations of belief. Being notes introductory to the study of theology*. New York: Longman, Green, and Co.

- Barrett, R. B. & Gibson, R. F. (Eds.). (1990). *Perspectives on Quine*. Cambridge, MA: Basil Blackwell.
- Beaney, M. (Ed.). (2013a). *The Oxford handbook of the history of analytic philosophy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Beaney, M. (2013b). The historiography of analytic philosophy. In Beaney (2013a), pp. 30-60.
- Becker, O. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Philosophische Rundschau*, 9(1), 238.
- Becker, E. (2013). *The themes of Quine's philosophy: Meaning, reference, and knowledge*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Ben-Menahem, Y. (2005). Black, white and grey: Quine on convention. *Synthese*, 146(3), 245–82.
- Bennett, J. (1971). *Locke, Berkeley, Hume: Central themes*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bergmann, G. (1950). A note on ontology. *Philosophical Studies*, 1(6), 89-92.
- Berto, F. & Plebani, F. (2015). *Ontology and metaontology: A contemporary guide*. London: Bloomsbury.
- Bird, G. (1995). Carnap and Quine: Internal and external questions. *Erkenntnis*, 42(1), 41–64.
- Bourget, D. & Chalmers, D. (2014). What do philosophers believe? *Philosophical Studies*, 170(3), 465–500.
- Brody, B. A. (1971). Review: *Words and objections* by D. Davidson & J. Hintikka (Eds.). *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science, Part A*, 2(2):167-175.
- Büchner, L. F. (1855). *Kraft und Stoff. Empirisch-naturphilosophische Studien*. Frankfurt am Main: Verlag von Meidinger Sohn & Cie.
- Burgess, J. (2004). Quine, analyticity and philosophy of mathematics. *The Philosophical Quarterly*, 54(214), 38–55.

- Carnap, R. (1928a). *Der Logische Aufbau der Welt*. Weltkreis-Verlag, Berlin-Schlachtensee.
 Second edition (1961). Hamburg: Felix Meiner Verlag. Translated by R. George
 (1967). *The logical structure of the world*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Carnap, R. (1928b). *Scheinprobleme in der Philosophie: Das Fremdpsychische und der
 Realismusstreit*. Berlin-Schlachtensee: Weltkreis-Verlag. Translated by R. George
 (1967). *Pseudo-problems in philosophy: The heteropsychological and the realism
 controversy*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Carnap, R. (1929). *Abriss der Logistik, Mit Besonderer Berücksichtigung der
 Relationstheorie und ihrer Anwendungen*. Wien: Verlag von Julius Springer.
- Carnap, R. (1934). *Logische Syntax der Sprache*. Translated by A. Smeaton (1937). *The
 logical syntax of language*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner & Co.
- Carnap, R. (1935). *Philosophy and logical syntax*. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner &
 Co.
- Carnap, R. (1936). Testability and Meaning. *Philosophy of Science*, 3(4), 419–471.
- Carnap, R. (1937). Testability and meaning—Continued. *Philosophy of Science*, 4(1), 1–40.
- Carnap, R. (1942). *Introduction to semantics*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Carnap, R. (1947). *Meaning and necessity: A study in semantics and modal logic*. Enlarged
 edition (1956). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Carnap, R. (1950). Empiricism, semantics, and ontology. *Revue Internationale de
 Philosophie*, 4(11), 20-40. Reprinted in Carnap (1947/1956), pp. 205-221.
- Carnap, R. (1954). Quine on analyticity. In Creath (1990), pp. 427-432.
- Carnap, R. (1956). The methodological character of theoretical concepts. In H. Feigl & M.
 Scriven (Eds.), *Minnesota Studies in the Philosophy of Science*. Volume 1 (pp. 38-
 76). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Carnap, R. (1963a). Intellectual autobiography. In Schilpp (1963), pp. 3-84.

- Carnap, R. (1963b). Replies and systematic expositions. In Schilpp (1963), pp. 859-1013.
- Carnap, R. (1966). *Philosophical foundations of physics: An introduction to the philosophy of science*. Edited by M. Gardner. New York: Basic Books. Reprinted as *An introduction to the philosophy of science* (1974). New York: Basic Books.
- Carnap, R. & Quine, W. V. (1932-1970). Correspondence. In Creath (1990), pp. 105-425.
- Chomsky, N. (1959). Review: *Verbal Behavior* by B. F. Skinner. *Language*, 35(1), 26-58.
- Chomsky, N. (1968). Quine's empirical assumptions. *Synthese*, 19(1), 53-68.
- Coburn, R. C. (1964). Recent work in metaphysics. *American Philosophical Quarterly*, 1(3), 204-220.
- Coffa, J. A. (1991). *The semantic tradition from Kant to Carnap*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cohen, L. J. (1962). *The diversity of meaning*. London: Methuen.
- Comte, A. (1830-1842). *Cours de Philosophie positive*. Paris: Bachelier. Translated and condensed by H. Martineau (1853). *The positive philosophy of Auguste Comte*. London: J. Chapman.
- Creath, R. (1987). The initial reception of Carnap's doctrine of analyticity. *Noûs*, 21(4), 477-99.
- Creath, R. (Ed). (1990). *Dear Carnap, Dear Van*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Danto, A. C. (1967). Naturalism. In Edwards (1967), Volume VI, pp. 448-450.
- Davidson, D. & Hintikka, J. (1968). Editorial introduction. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 1-2. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 1-2.
- Davidson, D. & Hintikka, J. (Eds.). (1969). *Words and objections: Essays on the work of W. V. Quine*, Dordrecht: Reidel.
- De Caro, M. & Macarthur, D. (Eds.). (2004a). *Naturalism in question*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

- De Caro, M. & Macarthur, D. (2004b). Introduction: The nature of naturalism. In De Caro & Macarthur (2004a), pp. 1-17.
- De Caro, M. & Macarthur, D. (Eds.). (2010a). *Naturalism and normativity*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- De Caro, M. & Macarthur, D. (2010b). Introduction: Science, naturalism, and the problem of normativity. In De Caro & Macarthur (2010a), pp. 1-19.
- Decock, L. (2002a). *Trading ontology for ideology: The interplay of logic, set theory and semantics in Quine's philosophy*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Decock, L. (2002b). A Lakatosian approach to the Quine-Maddy debate. *Logique et Analyse*, 45(179-180), 249–268.
- Decock, L. (2004). Inception of Quine's ontology. *History and Philosophy of Logic*, 25(2), 111–129.
- Decock, L. (2010). Quine's antimentalism in linguistics. *Logique et Analyse*, 53(212), 371–386.
- Deledalle, G. (1962). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Les Études philosophiques*, 17(2), 278-279.
- Dewey, J. (1925). *Experience and nature*. London: George Allen & Unwin (1929).
- Dewey, J. (1944). Antinaturalism in extremis. In Krikorian (1944), pp. 1-16.
- Dewey, J., Hook, S. & Nagel, E. (1945). Are naturalists materialists? *The Journal of Philosophy*, 42(19), 515-530.
- Dieterle, J. M. (1999). Mathematical, astrological, and theological naturalism. *Philosophia Mathematica*, 7(2), 129–135.
- Dreben, B. (1990). Quine. In Barrett & Gibson (1990), pp. 81-85.
- Dreben, B. (1992). Putnam, Quine—and the facts. *Philosophical Topics*, 20(1), 293-315.
- Duhem, P. (1914). *La Théorie physique: Son Objet, sa structure*. Paris: Marcel Rivière &

- Cie. Translated by P. P. Weiner (1954). *The aim and structure of physical theory*.
Renewed edition (1982). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Dupré, J. (2004). The miracle of monism. In De Caro & Macarthur (2004a), pp. 36-58.
- Ebbs, G. (2011a). Carnap and Quine on truth by convention. *Mind*, 120(478), 193–237.
Reprinted in Ebbs (2017), pp. 57-94.
- Ebbs, G. (2011b). Quine gets the last word. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 108(11), 617–632.
Reprinted in Ebbs (2017), pp. 113-127.
- Ebbs, G. (2016). Quine’s ‘predilection’ for finitism. *Metascience*, 25(1), 31-36.
- Ebbs, G. (2017). *Carnap, Quine, and Putnam on methods of inquiry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Edwards, P. (Ed.). (1967). *The encyclopedia of philosophy*. New York: Macmillan.
- Einstein, A. (1935). *The world as I see it*. London: John Lane The Bodley Head Limited.
- Eklund, M. (2013). Carnap’s metaontology. *Noûs*, 47(2), 229–249.
- Eldridge, M. (2004). Naturalism. In A. T. Marsoobian & J. Ryder (Eds.), *The Blackwell guide to American philosophy* (pp. 52-71). Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing.
- Floyd, J. (2009). Recent themes in the history of early analytic philosophy. *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, 47(2), 157–200.
- Floyd, J. & Shieh, S. (Eds.). (1997). *Future pasts: The analytic tradition in twentieth-century philosophy*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fogelin, R. J. (2004). Aspects of Quine’s naturalized epistemology. In Gibson (2004), pp. 19-46.
- Føllesdal, D. (2001). Quine—The philosophers’ philosopher. *Dialectica*, 55(2), 99-103.
- Føllesdal, D. (2011). Developments in Quine’s behaviorism. *American Philosophical Quarterly*, 48(3), 273-82.
- Frege, G. (1884). *Die Grundlagen der Arithmetik: Eine logisch mathematische Untersuchung*

- über den Begriff der Zahl*. Breslau: Wilhelm Koebner. Translated by D. Jacquette (2007). *The foundations of arithmetic: A logical-mathematical investigation into the concept of number*. New York: Pearson Longman.
- Friedman, M. (1987). Carnap's *Aufbau* reconsidered. *Noûs*, 21(4), 521–545.
- Friedman, M. (1992). Epistemology in the *Aufbau*. *Synthese*, 93(1-2), 15–57.
- Friedman, M. (2007). Introduction: Carnap's revolution in philosophy. In Friedman & Creath (2007), pp. 1-18.
- Friedman, M. & Creath, R. (Eds.). (2007). *The Cambridge companion to Carnap*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Frost-Arnold, G. (2011). Quine's evolution from 'Carnap's disciple' to the author of 'Two dogmas'. *HOPOS: The Journal of the International Society for the History of Philosophy of Science*, 1(2), 291–316.
- Frost-Arnold, G. (2013). *Carnap, Tarski, and Quine at Harvard: Conversations on logic, mathematics, and science*. Chicago: Open Court.
- Galanter, E. H. (1961). Analysis of language with a behavioral bias. Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Contemporary Psychology*, 6(12), 430-431.
- Gallois, A. (1998). Does ontology rest on a mistake? *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplementary Volume*, 72(1), 263– 283.
- Gardiner, A. H. (1940). *The theory of proper names: A controversial essay*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Gaudet, E. (2006). *Quine on meaning: The indeterminacy of translation*. London: Continuum.
- Geach, P. T. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Philosophical books*, 2(1), 14-17.
- Giedymin, J. (1972). Quine's philosophical naturalism. *The British Journal for the*

- Philosophy of Science*, 23(1), 45-55.
- Gibson, R. F. (1982). *The philosophy of W. V. Quine: An expository essay*. Tampa: University Presses of Florida.
- Gibson, R. F. (1988). *Enlightened empiricism: An examination of W. V. Quine's theory of knowledge*. Tampa: University of South Florida Press.
- Gibson, R. F. (1992). The key to interpreting Quine. *The Southern Journal of Philosophy*, 30(4), 17–30.
- Gibson, R. F. (Ed.). (2004). *The Cambridge companion to Quine*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Glock, H. J. (2002). Does ontology exist? *Philosophy*, 77(2), 235–260.
- Glock, H. J. (2003). *Quine and Davidson on language, thought and reality*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Glock, H. J. (2008a). *What is analytic philosophy?* New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Glock, H. J. (2008b). Analytic philosophy and history: A mismatch? *Mind*, 117(468), 867–897.
- Godfrey-Smith, P. (2014). Quine and pragmatism. In Harman & Lepore (2014), pp. 54-68.
- Goldfarb, W. (2008). On Quine's philosophy. Centennial celebration and marker dedication honoring W. V. Quine at Oberlin College, June 25, 2008. Retrieved from <http://www.wvquine.org/GoldfarbOberlin.pdf>
- Goodman, N. & Quine, W. V. (1947). Steps toward a constructive nominalism. *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, 12(4), 105–122.
- Goodman, N., Quine, W. V., & White, M. (1947). Appendix: Nelson Goodman, W. V. Quine, and Morton White: A triangular correspondence in 1947. In White (1999), pp. 337-357.
- Goodstein, R. L. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Philosophy of Science*,

28(2), 217.

- Gosselin, M. (1990). *Nominalism and contemporary nominalism: Ontological and epistemological implications of the work of W. V. O. Quine and of N. Goodman*. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Grandy, R. E. (1973). Review: *Words and objections* by D. Davidson & J. Hintikka (Eds). *The Philosophical Review*, 82(1), 99-110.
- Greenlee, D. (1973). Relativity without inscrutability. *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 33(4), 574-578.
- Gregory, P. A. (2008). *Quine's naturalism: Language, theory and the knowing subject*. London: Continuum.
- Grice, H. P. & Strawson, P. F. (1956). In defense of a dogma. *The Philosophical Review*, 65(2), 141–158.
- Grize, J. (1965). Genetic epistemology and psychology. In B. B. Wolman & E. Nagel (Eds.), *Scientific psychology: Principles and approaches* (pp. 460-473). New York: Basic Books.
- Guttenplan, S. (Ed.). (1975). *Mind and language*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Haack, S. (1976). Some preliminaries to ontology. *Journal of Philosophical Logic*, 5(4), 457–474.
- Haack, S. (1977). Analyticity and logical truth in *Roots of reference*. *Theoria*, 43(2), 129–143.
- Haack, S. (1993a). *Evidence and inquiry*. Second and expanded edition (2009). Amherst: Prometheus Books.
- Haack, S. (1993b). The two faces of Quine's naturalism. *Synthese*, 94(3), 335–356.
- Hacker, P. M. S. (1996). *Wittgenstein's place in twentieth-century analytic philosophy*. Oxford: Blackwell.

- Hacker, P. M. S. (1997). The rise of twentieth century analytic philosophy. In H. J. Glock (Ed.), *The rise of analytic philosophy* (pp. 51-76). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Hacker, P. M. S. (2006). Passing by the naturalistic turn: On Quine's cul-de-sac. *Philosophy*, 81(316), 231–253.
- Haeckel, E. (1899). *Die welträthsel: Gemeinverständliche Studien über monistische Philosophie*. Bonn: Verlag von Emil Strauss.
- Hahn, L. & Schilpp, P. (Eds.). (1986). *The philosophy of W. V. Quine*. The library of living philosophers. Volume XVIII. Expanded edition (1998). La Salle, Ill: Open Court.
- Hale, B. (1999). Review: *Naturalism in mathematics* by P. Maddy. *The Journal of Symbolic Logic*, 64(1), 394–396.
- Haller, R. (1992). Alfred Tarski: Drei Briefe an Otto Neurath. *Grazer Philosophische Studien*, 43(1), 1–32.
- Harding, S. (Ed). (1976). *Can theories be refuted? Essays on the Duhem-Quine thesis*. Dordrecht: Reidel Publishing Company.
- Hare, P. H. (1968). Purposes and methods of writing the history of recent American philosophy. *Southern Journal of Philosophy*, 6(4), 269-278.
- Harman, G. (1967). Quine on meaning and existence, I. The death of meaning. *The Review of Metaphysics*, 21(1), 124–151.
- Harman, G. & Lepore, E. (Eds.). (2014). *A companion to W. V. O. Quine*. Chichester: Wiley Blackwell.
- Hempel, C. (1952). *Fundamentals of concept formation in the empirical sciences*. International encyclopedia of unified science, Volume II, number 7. University of Chicago: Chicago Press.
- Hickman, L. A. (Ed.). (2008). *The correspondence of John Dewey, Volume IV: 1953-2007*. Third edition. Electronic edition. Charlottesville, VA: InteLex Corporation.

- Hockney, D. (1973). Conceptual structures. In G. Pearce & P. Maynard (Eds.), *Conceptual change* (pp. 141-166). Dordrecht: Reidel.
- Honderich, T. (Ed.). (1995). *The Oxford companion to philosophy*. Second edition (2005). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hornsby, J. (1997). *Simple mindedness: In defense of naïve naturalism in the philosophy of mind*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Hookway, C. (1988). *Quine: Language, experience and reality*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Huxley, T. (1892). *Essays upon some controverted questions*. London, Macmillan.
- Hylton, P. (1990). *Russell, idealism, and the emergence of analytic philosophy*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Hylton, P. (2001). ‘The defensible province of philosophy’: Quine’s 1934 lectures on Carnap. In Floyd & Shieh (2001), pp. 257-276.
- Hylton, P. (2002). Analyticity and holism in Quine’s thought. *The Harvard Review of Philosophy*, 10(1), 11–26.
- Hylton, P. (2007). *Quine*. New York: Routledge.
- Hylton, P. (2014a). Quine’s naturalism revisited. In Harman & Lepore (2014), pp. 148-162.
- Hylton, P. (2014b). Significance in Quine. *Grazer Philosophische Studien*, 89(1), 113-133.
- Isaac, J. (2005). W. V. Quine and the origins of analytic philosophy in the United States. *Modern Intellectual History*, 2(2), 205– 234.
- Isaac, J. (2011). Missing links: W. V. Quine, the making of ‘Two dogmas’, and the analytic roots of post-analytic philosophy. *History of European Ideas*, 37(3), 267–279.
- Janssen-Lauret, F. & Kemp, G. (Eds.). (2016). *Quine and his place in history*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Jewett, A. (2011). Canonizing Dewey: Naturalism, logical empiricism, and the idea of American philosophy. *Modern Intellectual History*, 8(1), 91-125.

- Johnsen, B. (2005). How to read 'Epistemology naturalized'. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 102(2), 78–93.
- Johnstone, H. W. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 22(1), 115-116.
- Joll, N. (2010). Contemporary metaphilosophy. *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Retrieved from <http://www.iep.utm.edu/con-meta/>
- Katz, J. (1990). The refutation of indeterminacy. In Barrett & Gibson (1990), pp. 177-197.
- Kemp, G. (2006). *Quine: A guide for the perplexed*. New York: Continuum.
- Kemp, G. (2012). *Quine vs. Davidson: Truth, reference, and meaning*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kertész, A. (2002). On the de-naturalization of epistemology. *Journal for the General Philosophy of Science*, 33(2), 269–288.
- Kim, J. (1988). What is 'naturalized epistemology?'. *Philosophical Perspectives*, 2(1), 381–405.
- Kim, J. (2003). The American origins of philosophical naturalism. *Journal of Philosophical Research*, APA Centennial Supplement: Philosophy in America at the turn of the century, 28(s), 83-98.
- Kitcher, P. (1992). The naturalists return. *The Philosophical Review*, 101(1), 53–114.
- Klein (2017). Russell on acquaintance with spatial properties: The significance of James. In: C. Pincock & S. Lapointe (Eds.), *Innovations in the History of Analytical Philosophy* (pp. 229-264). Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kmita, J. (1971). Meaning and functional reason. *Quality and Quantity*, 5(2), 353-368.
- Koppelberg, D. (1987). *Die Aufhebung der analytischen Philosophie: Quine als Synthese von Carnap und Neurath*. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp Verlag.
- Koskinen, H. & Pihlström, S. (2006). Quine and pragmatism. *Transactions of the Charles S.*

- Peirce Society*, 42(3):309–346.
- Krikorian, Y. (Ed.). (1944). *Naturalism and the Human Spirit*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kripke, S. (1982). *Wittgenstein on rules and private language*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Kuhn, T. (1962). *The structure of scientific revolutions*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Kusch, M. (1995). *Psychologism. A case study in the sociology of philosophical knowledge*. London: Routledge.
- Lakatos, I & Musgrave, A. (Eds.). (1968). *Problems in the philosophy of science*. Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Co.
- Larrabee, H. A. (1944). Naturalism in America. In Krikorian (1944), pp. 319-353.
- Leiter, B. (2004). Introduction. In Leiter (Ed.), *The future to philosophy* (pp. 1-23). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Leonardi, P. & Santambrogio, M. (Eds.). (1995). *On Quine: New essays*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Lewes, G. H. (1874). *Problems of life and mind*. London: Trübner.
- Lewis, C. I. (1929). *Mind and the world-order: Outline of a theory of knowledge*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons.
- Lewis, C. I. (1946). *An analysis of knowledge and valuation*. La Salle, Ill: Open Court.
- Lieb, I. C. (1962). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *International Philosophical Quarterly*, 2(1), 92-109.
- Loeffler, R. (2005). Intertheoretical identity and ontological reductions. *Erkenntnis*, 62(2), 157-187.
- Loux, M. J. (1972). Recent work in ontology. *American Philosophical Quarterly*, 9(2), 119-138.

- Lugg, A. (2012). W. V. Quine on analyticity: ‘Two dogmas of empiricism’ in context. *Dialogue*, 51(2), 231–246.
- Lugg, A. (2016). Quine, Wittgenstein and ‘The abyss of the transcendental’. In Janssen-Lauret & Kemp (2016), pp. 198-209.
- Macarthur, D. (2008). Quinean naturalism in question. *Philo*, 11(1), 1–14.
- MacIntyre, A. (1984). The relationship of philosophy to its past. In Rorty et al. (1984), pp. 31-48.
- Maddy, P. (1997). *Naturalism in mathematics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Maddy, P. (2005). Three forms of naturalism. In Shapiro (2005), pp. 437-459.
- Maddy, P. (2007). *Second philosophy: A naturalistic method*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Malcolm, N. (1940). Are necessary propositions really verbal? *Mind*, 49(194), 189-203.
- Mancosu, P. (2005). Harvard 1940-1941: Tarski, Carnap and Quine on a finitistic language of mathematics for science. *History and Philosophy of Logic*, 26(4), 327–357.
- Mancosu, P. (2008). Quine and Tarski on nominalism. In Zimmerman (2008), pp. 22-55.
- Maxwell, G. (1968). Scientific methodology. In Lakatos & Musgrave (1968), pp. 148-160.
- Margolis, J. (1969). Some ontological policies. *The Monist*, 53(2), 231-245.
- Massey, G. J. (2011). Quine and Duhem on holistic hypothesis testing. *American Philosophical Quarterly*, 48(3), 239-266.
- Mill, J. S. (1865). *Examination of Sir William Hamilton’s philosophy*. London: Longman, Green, and Co.
- Moore, G. E. (1903). *Principia ethica*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Morris, S. (2015). Quine, Russell, and naturalism: From a logical point of view. *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, 53(1), 133-155.
- Morris, S. (forthcoming). Quine against Lewis (and Carnap) on truth by convention. *Pacific*

- Philosophical Quarterly*. <http://doi.org/10.1111/papq.12185>.
- Morrison, J. (2010). Just how controversial is evidential holism? *Synthese*, 173(3), 335–352.
- Moser, P. & Yandell, D. (2000). Farewell to philosophical naturalism. In W. Craig & J. Moreland (Eds.), *Naturalism: A critical analysis* (pp. 3-23). London: Routledge.
- Murphey, M. (2012). *The development of Quine's philosophy*. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Næss, A. (1938). "Truth" as conceived by those who are not professional philosophers. Oslo: I. Kommissjon Hos Jacob Dybwad.
- Nagel, E. (1954). Naturalism reconsidered. *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association*, 28(1):5–17.
- Nagel, T. (1986). *The view from nowhere*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Nasim, O. W. (2012). The spaces of knowledge: Bertrand Russell, logical construction, and the classification of the sciences. *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 20(6), 1163-1182.
- Oesterle, J. A. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *The Thomist*, 24(1), 117-120.
- Papineau, D. (2009). Naturalism. In E. Zalta (Ed.), *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring 2009 Edition). Retrieved from <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2009/entries/naturalism/>
- Parent, T. (2008). Quine and logical truth. *Erkenntnis*, 68(1), 103–112.
- Paseau, A. (2013). Naturalism in the philosophy of mathematics. In E. Zalta (Ed.), *The Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy* (Spring 2013 Edition). Retrieved from <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2013/entries/naturalism-mathematics/>
- Passmore, J. (1966). *A hundred years of philosophy*. Second Edition. London: Duckworth.
- Peijnenburg, J. (2000). Identity and difference: A hundred years of analytic philosophy. *Metaphilosophy*, 31(4), 365–381.

- Pincock, C. (2007). Carnap, Russell, and the external world. In Friedman & Creath (2007), pp. 106-128.
- Popper, K. R. (1962). *Conjectures and refutations: The growth of scientific knowledge*. New York: Basic Books.
- Presley, C. F. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, 39(2), 175-190.
- Presley, C. F. (1967). Quine, Willard Van Orman. In Edwards (1967), Volume VII, pp. 53-55.
- Price, H. (2007). Quining naturalism. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 104(8), 375–402.
- Price, H. (2009). Metaphysics after Carnap: The ghost who walks? In D. Chalmers, D. Manley & R. Wasserman (Eds.), *Metametaphysics: New essays on the foundations of ontology* (pp. 320-346). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Putnam, H. (1982). Why reason can't be naturalized. *Synthese*, 52(1), 3-24. Reprinted in Putnam (1983), pp. 229-247.
- Putnam, H. (Ed.). (1983). *Realism and reason*. Philosophical Papers. Volume 3. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Putnam, H. (2002). "Quine". *Common Knowledge*, 8(2), 273-279.
- Putnam, H. (2004). *Ethics without ontology*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1934a). *A system of logistic*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1934b). Lectures on Carnap. In Creath (1990), pp. 45-103.
- Quine, W. V. (1934c). Ontological remarks on the propositional calculus. *Mind*, 43(172), 472-476. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 265-271.
- Quine, W. V. (1936). Truth by convention. In O. Lee (Ed.), *Philosophical essays for A. N. Whitehead* (pp. 90-124). New York & London: Longmans. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 77-106.

- Quine, W. V. (1937). On Cantor's theorem. *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, 2(3), 120-124.
- Quine, W. V. (1939a). A logistical approach to the ontological problem. In Quine (1966a), pp. 197-202.
- Quine, W. V. (1939b). Designation and existence. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 36(26), 701–709.
- Quine, W. V. (1940). *Mathematical logic*. New York: Norton
- Quine, W. V. (1941a). *Elementary logic*. Boston and New York: Ginn.
- Quine, W. V. (1941b). Whitehead and the rise of modern logic. In P. A. Schilpp (Ed.), *The philosophy of Alfred North Whitehead* (pp. 125-163). Evanston, Ill: Northwestern University Press. Reprinted in Quine (1966b), pp. 3-36.
- Quine, W. V. (1943a). *O sentido da nova lógica*. Sao Paulo: Livraria Martins (1944).
- Quine, W. V. (1943b). Notes on existence and necessity. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 40(5):113–127.
- Quine, W. V. (1946a). Nominalism. Presented at the Harvard philosophical colloquium in Emerson B, Cambridge, MA, March 11, 1946. Transcribed by P. Mancosu. In Zimmerman (2008), pp. 3-21. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 9-23.
- Quine, W. V. (1946b). On the notion of an analytic statement. Presented at the University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, December 18, 1946. Transcribed and edited by G. Zanet. In Quine (2008a), pp. 24-35.
- Quine, W. V. (1946c). Lectures on David Hume's philosophy. Delivered at Harvard University, summer 1946. Edited by J. Buickerood. In Quine (2008a), pp. 36-136.
- Quine, W. V. (1947). Review: Contradiction and the presupposition of existence, by E. J. Nelson. *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, 12(2), 52-55.
- Quine, W. V. (1948). On what there is. *Review of Metaphysics*, 2(5), 21-38. Reprinted in Quine (1953a), pp. 1-19.

- Quine, W. V. (1949). Animadversions on the notion of meaning. Presented at the Philosophy Colloquium, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, December 6, 1949.
- Transcribed by G. Zanet & A. Quine. In Quine (2008a), pp. 152-156.
- Quine, W. V. (1950a). *Methods of logic*. First edition. New York: Henry Holt & Company.
- Quine, W. V. (1950b). Identity, ostension, hypostasis. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 47(22), 621-633. Reprinted in Quine (1953a), pp. 65-79.
- Quine, W. V. (1951a). Two dogmas of empiricism. *Philosophical Review*, 60(1), 20-43.
- Reprinted in Quine (1953a), pp. 20-46.
- Quine, W. V. (1951b). Ontology and ideology. *Philosophical Studies*, 2(1), 11-15.
- Quine, W. V. (1951c). On Carnap's views on ontology. *Philosophical Studies*, 2(5), 65-72.
- Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 197-202.
- Quine, W. V. (1952). On mental entities. *Proceedings of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences* (1953), 80(3), 198-203. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 221-227.
- Quine, W. V. (1953a). *From a logical point of view*. Second and revised edition (1961). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1953b). Mr. Strawson on logical theory. *Mind*, 62(248), 433-451. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 137-157.
- Quine, W. V. (1954a). Carnap and logical truth. *Synthese* (1960), 12(4), 350-374. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 107-132.
- Quine, W. V. (1954b). The scope and language of science. In L. Leary (Ed.). (1955), *The unity of knowledge* (pp. 231-247). New York: Doubleday. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 228- 245.
- Quine, W. V. (1955). Posits and reality. In S. Uyeda (Ed.). (1960), *Basis of the contemporary philosophy*. Volume 5 (pp. 391- 400). Tokyo: Waseda University Press. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 246-254.

- Quine, W. V. (1960). *Word and object*. Cambridge, MA: The M.I.T. Press, Cambridge.
- Quine, W. V. (1962). A comment on Grünbaum's claim. Letter to Adolf Grünbaum, June 1, 1962. In Harding (1976), p. 132.
- Quine, W. V. (1963). *Set theory and its logic*. Revised edition (1969). Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1966a). *The ways of paradox and other essays*. New York: Random House. Revised edition (1976). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1966b). *Selected logic papers*. New York: Random House. Enlarged edition (1995). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1966c). Russell's ontological development. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 63(21), 657-667. Reprinted in Quine (1981a), pp. 73-85.
- Quine, W. V. (1968a). Ontological relativity. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 65(7), 185-212. Reprinted in Quine (1969a), pp. 26-68.
- Quine, W. V. (1968b). Existence and quantification. *L'Age de la Science*, 1(1), 151-164. Reprinted in Quine (1969a), pp. 91-113.
- Quine, W. V. (1968c). Responding to Grover Maxwell. In Lakatos & Musgrave (1968), pp. 161-163. Reprinted in Quine (1981a), pp. 176-178.
- Quine, W. V. (1968d). Reply to Smart. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 264-266. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 292-294.
- Quine, W. V. (1968e). Reply to Stenius. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 270-273. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 298-301.
- Quine, W. V. (1968f). Reply to Chomsky. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 274-283. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 302-311.
- Quine, W. V. (1968g). Reply to Davidson. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 303-305. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 333-335.

- Quine, W. V. (1968h). Reply to Stroud. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 288-291. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 316-318.
- Quine, W. V. (1968i). Linguistics and philosophy. In S. Hook (Ed.). (1969), *Language and philosophy: A symposium* (pp. 95- 98). New York University Institute of Philosophy, 9th, 1968. New York: New York University Press. Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 56-58.
- Quine, W. V. (1969a). *Ontological relativity and other essays*. The John Dewey essays in philosophy. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1969b). Epistemology naturalized. In *Proceedings of the XIVth International Congress of Philosophy, Vienna, 2nd to 9th September 1968*, pp. 87-103. Vienna: Herder (1971). Reprinted in Quine (1969a), pp. 69-90.
- Quine, W. V. (1969c). Natural kinds. In N. Rescher (Ed.). (1970), *Essays in honor of Carl G. Hempel. A tribute on the occasion of his sixty-fifth birthday* (pp. 5-23). Reprinted in Quine (1969a), pp. 114-138.
- Quine, W. V. (1970a). *Philosophy of logic*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall. Second edition (1986). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1970b). Philosophical progress in language theory. *Metaphilosophy*, 1(1), 2–19.
- Quine, W. V. (1970c). Grades of theoreticity. In L. Foster & J. Swanson (Eds.), *Experience & theory* (pp. 1-17). Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1972). Vagaries of definition. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences*, 211(1): 247-250 (1973). Reprinted in Quine (1966a), pp. 50-55.
- Quine, W. V. (1973). *The roots of reference*. The Paul Carus lectures. La Salle, Ill: Open Court. (1974).
- Quine, W. V. (1975a). Five milestones of empiricism. In Quine (1981a), pp. 67-72.

- Quine, W. V. (1975b). The pragmatists' place in empiricism. In R. Mulvaney & P. Zeltner (Eds.). (1981), *Pragmatism: Its sources and prospects* (pp. 21-39). Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1975c). On empirically equivalent systems of the world. *Erkenntnis*, 9(3), 313-328. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 228-243.
- Quine, W. V. (1975d). The nature of natural knowledge. In Guttenplan (1975), pp. 67-81. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 257-270.
- Quine, W. V. (1977). Facts of the matter. In R. W. Shahan & K. R. Merrill (Eds.), *American philosophy from Edwards to Quine* (pp. 176-196). Norman: University of Oklahoma Press. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 271-286.
- Quine, W. V. (1978a). The ideas of Quine. Interview by B. Magee. In B. Magee (Ed.), *Men of ideas* (pp. 168-179). London: BBC Publications. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 5-17.
- Quine, W. V. (1978b). Otherworldly. *New York Review of Books*, November 23, 1978, 25(18):25. Reprinted as 'Goodman's *Ways of worldmaking*' in Quine (1981a), pp. 96-99.
- Quine, W. V. (1981a). *Theories and things*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1981b). Things and their place in theories. In Quine (1981a), pp. 1-23.
- Quine, W. V. (1981c). What price bivalence? *The Journal of Philosophy*, 78(2), 90-95. Reprinted in Quine (1981a), pp. 31-37.
- Quine, W. V. (1981d). On the very idea of a third dogma. In Quine (1981a), pp. 38-42.
- Quine, W. V. (1981e). Reply to Stroud. *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, 6(1), 473-475.
- Quine, W. V. (1982). *Methods of logic*. Fourth edition, revised and enlarged. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1984a). Carnap's positivistic travail. *Fundamenta Scientiae*, 5(1), 325-333.

- Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 119-128.
- Quine, W. V. (1984d). What I believe. In M. Booth (Ed.), *What I believe: 13 eminent people of our time argue for their philosophy of life* (pp. 69-75). New York: Waterstone/Firethorn Press. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 307-311.
- Quine, W. V. (1985a). *The time of my life: An autobiography*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1985b). Four hot questions in philosophy. Review of Strawson (1983). *New York Review of Books*, February 14, 1985, 32(2), 32. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 206-210.
- Quine, W. V. (1986a). Autobiography of W. V. Quine. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 1-46.
- Quine, W. V. (1986b). Reply to Geoffrey Hellmann. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 206-208.
- Quine, W. V. (1986c). Reply to Robert Nozick. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 364-367.
- Quine, W. V. (1986d). Reply to Charles Parsons. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 396-403.
- Quine, W. V. (1986e). Reply to Hilary Putnam. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 427-431.
- Quine, W. V. (1986f). Reply to Jules Vuillemin. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 619-622.
- Quine, W. V. (1986g). Reply to Morton White. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 663-665.
- Quine, W. V. (1986h). The way the world is. Presented at Harvard's 350th celebration, March 1986. In Quine (2008a), pp. 166-171.
- Quine, W. V. (1986i). The sensory support of science. In *Discursos pronunciados en el acto de investidura Doctor 'Honoris Causa' de los Profesores Diego Angulo Iniguez, W. V. Quine, Arthur M. Silverstein, J.D. Smyth*, pp. 29-60. Granada: Universidad de Granada. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 327-337.
- Quine, W. V. (1987a). Carnap. *Yale Review*, 76(2), 226-230. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 142-145.
- Quine, W. V. (1987b). Indeterminacy of translation again. *Journal of Philosophy*, 84(1), 5-10. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 341-346.

- Quine, W. V. (1988). Quine speaks his mind. Interview by E. Pivcevic. *Cogito*, 2(2), 1-5.
Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 21- 29.
- Quine, W. V. (1990a). *Pursuit of truth*. Revised edition (1992). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1990b). Three indeterminacies. In Barrett & Gibson (1990), pp. 1-16.
- Quine, W. V. (1990c). Comment on Berger. In Barrett & Gibson (1990), pp. 36-37.
- Quine, W. V. (1991a). Immanence and validity. *Dialectica*, 45(2- 3), 219-230. Reprinted in Quine (1966b), pp. 242-250.
- Quine, W. V. (1991b). Two dogmas in retrospect. *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, 21(3), 265-274. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 390-400.
- Quine, W. V. (1992). Structure and nature. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 89(1), 5-9. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 401-406.
- Quine, W. V. (1994a). Truth. In G. Fløistad (Ed.), *Philosophical problems today*. Volume 1 (pp. 1-20). Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 420-437.
- Quine, W. V. (1994a). Comment on Neil Tennant's 'Carnap and Quine'. In Salmon & Wolters (1994), pp. 345-351. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 216-222.
- Quine, W. V. (1994b). Interview with Willard Van Orman Quine. Interview by L. Bergström & D. Føllesdal. *Theoria*, 60(3), 193- 206. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 69-81.
- Quine, W. V. (1994c). Exchange between Donald Davidson and W. V. Quine following Davidson's lecture. *Theoria*, 60(3), 226- 231. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 152-156.
- Quine, W. V. (1994d). Responses to articles by Abel, Bergström, Davidson, Dreben, Gibson, Hookway, and Prawitz. *Inquiry*, 37(4), 495-505. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 223-234.

- Quine, W. V. (1995a). *From stimulus to science*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (1995b). Contextual definition. In Honderich (1995), p. 169.
- Quine, W. V. (1995c). Naturalism; Or, living within one's means. *Dialectica*, 49(2-4), 251-261. Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 461-472.
- Quine, W. V. (1995d). Reactions. In Leonardi & Santambrogio (1995), pp. 347-361.
Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 235-250.
- Quine, W. V. (1995e). Response to Gary Ebbs. In Janssen-Lauret & Kemp (2016), pp. 33-36.
- Quine, W. V. (1996a). Progress on two fronts. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 93(4), 159-163.
Reprinted in Quine (2008a), pp. 473- 477.
- Quine, W. V. (1996b). Quine /'kwain/, Willard Van Orman (b. 1908). In T. Mautner (Ed.), *Dictionary of philosophy*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 346-348.
- Quine, W. V. (1997). Responses to essays by Smart, Orenstein, Lewis and Holdcroft, and Haack. *Revue Internationale de Philosophie*, 51(4), 567-582. Partly reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 251-256.
- Quine, W. V. (1999a). Where do we disagree. In L. Hahn (Ed.), *Philosophy of Donald Davidson*. The library of living philosophers. Volume XXVII (pp. 73-79). Chicago: Open Court. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 159-165.
- Quine, W. V. (1999b). Responses to Szubka, Lehrer, Bergström, Gibson, Miscevic, and Orenstein. In A. Orenstein & P. Kotatko (Eds.). (2000), *Knowledge, language, and logic: Questions for Quine*. Boston studies in the philosophy of science (pp. 407-430). Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers. Reprinted in Quine (2008b), pp. 259-268.
- Quine, W. V. (2008a). *Confessions of a confirmed extensionalist and other essays*. Edited by Føllesdal, D. & D. B. Quine. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. (2008b). *Quine in dialogue*. Edited by Føllesdal, D. & D. B. Quine. Cambridge,

- MA: Harvard University Press.
- Quine, W. V. & Ullian, J. S. (1970). *The web of belief*. Second edition (1978). New York: Random House.
- Quinn, P. L. (1974). What Duhem really meant. In R. Cohen & M. Wartofsky (Eds.), *Methodological and historical essays in the natural and social sciences*. Boston Studies in the philosophy of science. Volume 14 (pp. 33-56). Dordrecht: Reidel.
- Quinton, A. (1967). The importance of Quine. *New York Review of Books*, January 21, 1967.
- Quinton, A. (1995). Analytic philosophy. In Honderich (1995), pp. 28-30.
- Randall, J. H. (1944). Epilogue: The nature of naturalism. In Krikorian (1944), pp. 354-382.
- Reck, A. J. (1968). *The new American philosophers: An exploration of thought since World War II*. Charlotte: Louisiana State University Press
- Reck, E. (Ed). (2013a). *The historical turn in analytic philosophy*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Reck, E. (2013b). Introduction: Analytic philosophy and philosophical history. In Reck (2013a), pp. 1-36.
- Rescher, N. (1960). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *American Scientist*, 48(4), 375A-377A.
- Richardson, A. (1990). How not to Russell Carnap's *Aufbau*. In A. Fine, M. Forbers & L. Wessels (Eds.), *PSA 1990: Proceedings of the Biennial Meeting of the Philosophy of Science Association*. Volume 1: Contributed Papers (pp. 3-14). East Lansing: Philosophy of Science Association.
- Richardson, A. (1992). Logical idealism and Carnap's construction of the world. *Synthese*, 93(1-2), 59-92.
- Richardson, A. (1997). Toward a history of scientific philosophy. *Perspectives on Science*, 5(3), 418-451.

- Richardson, A. (1998). *Carnap's construction of the world*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ricketts, T. G. (1982). Rationality, translation, and epistemology naturalized. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 79(3), 117–136.
- Ricketts, T. G. (1985). Frege, the *Tractatus*, and the logocentric predicament. *Noûs*, 19(1), 3–15.
- Romanos, G. (1983). *Quine and analytic philosophy*. Cambridge, MA: M.I.T. Press.
- Rorty, R. (Ed.). (1967a). *The linguistic turn: Essays in philosophical methods*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Rorty, R. (1967b). Metaphilosophical difficulties of linguistic philosophy. In Rorty (1967a), pp. 1-40.
- Rorty, R. (1970). Cartesian epistemology and changes in ontology. In Smith (1970), pp. 273-292.
- Rorty, R. (1982). *Consequences of pragmatism*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Rorty, R. (1984). The historiography of philosophy: Four genres. In Rorty, Schneewind & Skinner (1984), pp. 49-75.
- Rorty, R., Schneewind, J., & Skinner, Q. (Eds.). (1984). *Essays on the historiography of philosophy*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Rosen, G. (1999). Review: *Naturalism in mathematics* by P. Maddy. *British Journal for the Philosophy of Science*, 50(3), 467–474.
- Roth, P. (1999). The epistemology of 'Epistemology naturalized'. *Dialectica*, 53(2), 87–109.
- Russell, B. (1900). *A critical exposition of the philosophy of Leibniz*. Second edition (1937). Cambridge: At the University Press.
- Russell, B. (1914). *Our knowledge of the external world as a field for scientific method in philosophy*. Chicago: Open Court. Revised edition (1926). London: George Allen &

Unwin.

Ryder, J. (1994). *American philosophic naturalism in the twentieth century*. Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books.

Ryle, G. (1949). *The concept of mind*. London: Hutchinson.

Salmon, W. & Wolters, G. (Eds.). (1994). *Logic, language, and the structure of scientific theories*. Proceedings of the Carnap-Reichenbach Centennial, University of Konstanz, 21-24 May 1991. Pittsburgh-Konstanz series in the philosophy and history of science. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.

Santayana, G. (1923). *Scepticism and animal faith: Introduction to a system of philosophy*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons.

Schilpp, P. (Ed.). (1963). *The philosophy of Rudolf Carnap*. The library of living philosophers. Volume XI. La Salle, Ill: Open Court.

Schuldenfrei, R. (1972). Quine in perspective. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 69(1), 5-16.

Sellars, R. W. (1922). *Evolutionary naturalism*. Chicago: Open Court.

Sellars, R. W. (1924). The emergence of naturalism. *International Journal of Ethics*, 34(4), 309–338.

Sellars, R. W. (1927). Why naturalism and not materialism? *The Philosophical Review*, 36(3), 216–225.

Seth, A. (1896). The term 'naturalism' in recent discussion. *The Philosophical Review*, 5(6), 576–584.

Shapiro, S. (2000). The status of logic. In P. Boghossian & C. Peacocke (Eds.), *New essays on the a priori* (pp. 333-366). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Shapiro, S. (Ed.). (2005). *The Oxford handbook of philosophy of mathematics and logic*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Shatz, D. (1994). Skepticism and naturalized epistemology. In Wagner & Warner (1993), pp.

117-145.

Siegel, H. (1995). Naturalized epistemology and 'first philosophy'. *Metaphilosophy*, 26(1), 46–62.

Sinclair, R. (2012). Quine and conceptual pragmatism. *Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society*, 48(3), 335–355.

Sinclair, R. (2014). Quine on evidence. In Harman and Lepore (2014), pp. 350-372.

Sinclair, R. (2016). On Quine's debt to pragmatism: C. I. Lewis and the pragmatic a priori. In Janssen-Lauret & Kemp (2016), pp. 76-99.

Sluga, H. (1980). *Gottlob Frege*. London: Routledge.

Smith, J. E. (1969). The reflexive turn, the linguistic turn, and the pragmatic outcome. *The Monist*, 53(4), 588-605.

Smith, J. E. (Ed). (1970). *Contemporary American philosophy*, London: George Allen & Unwin.

Sober, E. (1999). Testability. *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association*, 73(2), 47-76.

Sober, E. (2000). Quine's two dogmas. *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplementary Volume*, 74(1), 237-280.

Spencer, H. (1862). *A system of synthetic philosophy: First principles*. London: Williams and Norgat.

Stenius, E. (1968). Beginning with ordinary things. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 27-52. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 27-52.

Strawson, P. F. (1950). On referring. *Mind*, 59(235), 320-344.

Strawson, P. F. (1955). A logician's landscape. *Philosophy*, 30(114), 229-237.

Strawson, P. F. (1966). *The bounds of sense*. London: Methuen.

Strawson, P. F. (1983). *Scepticism and naturalism: Some varieties*. The Woodbridge

- Lectures. London: Methuen (1985).
- Stroll, A. (2000). *Twentieth-century analytic philosophy*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Stroud, B. (1968). Conventionalism and the indeterminacy of translation. *Synthese*, 19(1-2), 82-96. Reprinted in Davidson & Hintikka (1969), pp. 82-96.
- Stroud, B. (1996). The charm of naturalism. *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association*, 70(2), 43-55. Reprinted in De Caro & Macarthur (2004a), pp. 22-35.
- Tamminga, A. & Verhaegh, S. (2013). Katz's revisability paradox dissolved. *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, 91(4), 771–784.
- Tappenden, J. (2001). Recent work in the philosophy of mathematics. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 98(9), 488–497.
- Taylor, C. (1984). Philosophy and its history. In Rorty et al. (1984), pp. 17-30.
- Tennant, N. (1994). Carnap and Quine. In Salmon & Wolters (1994), pp. 305-344.
- Tennant, N. (2000). What is naturalism in mathematics, really? *Philosophia Mathematica*, 8(3), 316–338.
- Thayer, H. S. (1967). Nagel, Ernest. In Edwards (1967), Volume VI, pp. 440-441.
- Thompson, M. (1964). Metaphysics. In: Chisholm, R. M., Feigl, H., Frankena, W. K., Passmore, J. & Thompson (1964, eds). *Philosophy*, pp. 125-232. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Urmson, J. O. (1961). The history of philosophical analysis. In Rorty (1967a), pp. 294-301.
- Van Fraassen, B. (1996). Science, materialism, and false consciousness. In J. Kvanvig (Ed.), *Warrant in contemporary epistemology* (pp. 149-181). Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Verhaegh, S. (2014). Quine's argument from despair. *The British Journal for the History of*

- Philosophy*, 22(1), 150–173.
- Verhaegh, S. (2015). *Rafts, boats, and cruise ships: Naturalism and holism in Quine's philosophy* (Ph.D. Dissertation). University of Groningen.
- Verhaegh, S. (2017a). Boarding Neurath's boat: The early development of Quine's naturalism. *The Journal of the History of Philosophy*, 55(2), 317-342.
- Verhaegh, S. (2017b). Quine's 'needlessly strong' holism. *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science, Part A*, 61(1), 11-20.
- Verhaegh, S. (2017c). Quine on the nature of naturalism. *The Southern Journal of Philosophy*, 55(1), 96-115.
- Verhaegh, S. (2017d). Blurring boundaries: Carnap, Quine and the internal-external Distinction. *Erkenntnis*, 82(4), 873-890.
- Verhaegh, S. (2017e). Review: *Carnap, Quine, and Putnam on methods of inquiries* by G. Ebbs. *Notre Dame Philosophical Reviews*. November 23, 2017. Retrieved from <http://ndpr.nd.edu/news/carnap-quine-and-putnam-on-methods-of-inquiry/>
- Verhaegh, S. (2018a). Quine's Dissatisfaction with 'Two Dogmas'. Guest blog at Eric Schliesser's *Digressions and Impressions*. February 6, 2018. Retrieved from: <http://digressionsimpressions.typepad.com/digressionsimpressions/2018/02/quines-dissatisfaction-with-two-dogmas-guest-post-by-sander-verhaegh.html>
- Verhaegh, S. (2018b). Review: *Quine and his place in history* by F. Janssen-Lauret & G. Kemp (Eds.). *The Philosophical Quarterly*, 68(271), 433-435.
- Verhaegh, S. (forthcoming-a). Sign and Object: Quine's forgotten book project. *Synthese*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-018-1693-z>.
- Verhaegh, S. (forthcoming-b). Setting sail: The development and reception of Quine's naturalism. *Philosophers' Imprint*.
- Verhaegh, S. (forthcoming-c). 'Mental states are like diseases': Behaviorism in the Immanuel

- Kant Lectures. In R. Sinclair (Ed.), *Science and sensibilia by W. V. Quine: The 1980 Immanuel Kant lectures*. London: Palgrave-Macmillan.
- Verhaegh, S. (forthcoming-d). The behaviorisms of Skinner and Quine: Genesis, development, and mutual influence. *Journal of the History of Philosophy*.
- Wagner, S. J. & Warner, R. (Eds.). (1993). *Naturalism: A critical appraisal*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Wang, H. (1986). *Beyond analytic philosophy: Doing justice to what we know*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Ward, J. (1896). *Naturalism and agnosticism*. The Gifford Lectures delivered before the University of Aberdeen in the years 1896-1898. London: Adam and Charles Black (1899).
- Watson, R. (1993). Shadow history in philosophy. *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, 31(1), 95–109.
- Weir, A. (2005). Naturalism reconsidered. In Shapiro (2005), pp. 460-482.
- Weir, A. (2014). Quine's naturalism. In Harman & Lepore (2014), pp. 114-147.
- Wells, R. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *The Review of Metaphysics*, 14(4), 695-703.
- White, M. (1948). On the Church-Frege solution of the paradox of analysis. *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 9(2), 305- 308. Reprinted (with postscript) in White (2005), pp. 112-115.
- White, M. (1986). Normative ethics, normative epistemology, and Quine's holism. In Hahn & Schilpp (1986), pp. 649-662. Reprinted in White (2005), pp. 186-198.
- White, M. (1999). *A philosopher's story*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- White, M. (2005). *From a philosophical point of view*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University

Press.

White, M. & Tarski, A. (1987). A philosophical letter of Alfred Tarski. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 84(1), 28–32.

Wilder, H. T. (1973). *Toward a naturalistic theory of meaning*. Ph.D. Dissertation. The University of Western Ontario.

Williamson, T. (2014). How did we get here from there? The Transformation of Analytic Philosophy. *Belgrade Philosophical Annual*, 27(1), 7–37.

Yablo, S. (1998). Does ontology rest on a mistake? *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplementary Volume*, 72(1), 229–261.

Yeghiayan, E. (2009). The writings of Willard Van Orman Quine. *Rivista di Storia della Filosofia*, 2009(1), 187–238.

Yolton, J. W. (1967). *Metaphysical analysis*. London: George Allen & Unwin.

Yourgrau, W. (1961). Review: *Word and object* by W. V. Quine. *Zentralblatt fuer Mathematik*, 53(1), 3-4.

Zimmerman, D. (Ed.). (2008). *Oxford studies in metaphysics*. Volume 4. Oxford: Oxford University Press.