

**University of New Mexico**  
**UNM Digital Repository**

---

Music ETDs

Electronic Theses and Dissertations

---

6-26-2015

# One of the Guys: The Experiences of Three Women Conductors in Collegiate Band Programs

Courtney Jones

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/mus\\_etds](https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/mus_etds)

---

## Recommended Citation

Jones, Courtney. "One of the Guys: The Experiences of Three Women Conductors in Collegiate Band Programs." (2015).  
[https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/mus\\_etds/16](https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/mus_etds/16)

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Electronic Theses and Dissertations at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Music ETDs by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [disc@unm.edu](mailto:disc@unm.edu).

Approval Page

Courtney Jones

*Candidate*

Music

*Department*

This thesis is approved, and it is acceptable in quality and form for publication:

*Approved by the Thesis Committee:*

Regina Carlow, Chairperson

Robin Giebelhausen

Eric Rombach-Kendall

One of the Guys: The Experiences of Three Women Conductors in Collegiate Band  
Programs

By

Courtney Jones

A Thesis

Submitted to  
University of New Mexico  
In partial fulfillment of the requirement  
For the degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

May, 2015

## Abstract

### “One of the Guys”: The Experiences of Three Women Conductors in Collegiate Band Programs

By

Courtney Jones

*For years women have fought for gender equality. Today women still struggle to be taken seriously in many fields dominated by men, including the music world. This qualitative study looks at the experiences of three women conductors in the collegiate band world.*

*Throughout history women have had to make their own way in this world dominated and ruled by men. They have struggled to receive positions of authority in politics and corporations, and administrative and collegiate positions in education. In the music world women are seriously underrepresented due to previous assumptions that only men could be proficient in musical positions.*

*The purpose of this study is to explore the lived worlds of women in the collegiate band world, to learn what their experiences have been, and implications for women wanting to work in that field and to determine how to better even the odds.*

*This study looks at three women conductors of collegiate bands and their experiences with gender bias. Themes were identified from interviews with each of the participants including their foundational experiences and their experiences with gender bias. The participants also gave their own personal advice for how to continue to close the gender gap in the future.*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would not have been possible without the help of several amazing people. First, I would like to thank the committee members of my thesis defense board, Dr. Regina Carlow, Professor Robin Giebelhausen, and Professor Eric Rombach-Kendall. I would like to especially thank Professor Robin Giebelhausen, my thesis advisor for her constant support and guidance throughout this entire process.

I would also like to thank the educators in my life that directed me to the path of music and helped me to develop into the person I am today. So thank you to my high school band directors, Mr. John Waage and Mr. Thomas Grandprey, who first inspired me to pursue music. Thank you to my college professors, Dr. Bruce Dalby, Dr. Susan Hadley, Dr. Stephen Hawk, Professor Stacey Steele and Professor Mechelle Hawk. Also, a special thank you to Ms. Michelle Morrison for all of her help editing. Again, I would like to thank Professor Eric Rombach-Kendall for providing me with so many amazing musical opportunities.

I am especially grateful to my parents for their constant support both financially and emotionally. My sisters also deserve my gratitude for their support. Finally, I would like to thank my amazing fiancé, Ron Taylor, for being everything I've ever needed and for constantly taking care of me throughout these past three years. Thank you for being so patient with me.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 – Rationale for Study.....	1
Introduction	
Rationale for Study	
Purpose and Problems	
CHAPTER 2 – Literature Review.....	7
Introduction	
Women in Leadership	
Discrimination in Education	
Women in Music	
Music Professionals	
Female Performers	
Gender and Instrument Selection	
Women Conductors	
Women in the Collegiate Band World	
Conclusion	
CHAPTER 3 - Method.....	24
Method	
Participants	
Trustworthiness	
CHAPTER 4 – Participants.....	27
Missy	
Brittany	
Brava	
CHAPTER 5 - Themes.....	37
CHAPTER 6 - Implications.....	50
Resources.....	60
Appendices.....	65



## Chapter 1 – Rationale for Study

### Introduction

I was a late bloomer when it came to music. When I was in the fourth grade I really wanted to play the trumpet in the band but the teacher made me play clarinet because I would eventually need braces. I had played the trumpet my parents owned for years and had always knew that was the instrument I wanted to play. I hated the clarinet. I hated the taste of the reed and the squeaking sound it always made when I tried to play it and I hated how much it hurt my right thumb. So after two weeks of playing an instrument that I had no interest in, I quit band. At the time I was also a competitive gymnast and spent 20 hours a week at the gym; I didn't want to waste my only free time practicing an instrument I hated. It was not until my freshman year of high school after moving to a new school district that I decided to give band another try.

My new band director asked me if I would be willing to play French horn, his reasoning being that the band did not have any French horn players at the time. It wasn't exactly the trumpet but it was close enough. I ended up falling in love with the instrument and with music in general. After a year of playing French horn my band director even let me play trumpet in the jazz band. Finally I was able to play the instrument I always wanted. I spent that summer working in order to save enough money to buy my own Bach Stradivarius. I loved marching band and jazz band and I loved being a part of the brass section. I was more than happy to be surrounded by all boys in the brass section; they were my best friends and in my opinion girls caused too much drama anyway. It didn't occur to me that the reason I was the only girl in the section could have to do with instrument selection being related to gender.



In college I was oblivious to how gender stereotypes influenced musicians' professions. All of the directors of the ensembles were men. The elementary music teachers were women as were the music therapy professors but this didn't strike me as anything out of the ordinary. Still being unaware of gender roles in music I paid no attention to it. My French horn section my first year included one boy and two girls other than me. Then for a couple of years it was just girls. By my last year in the ensembles, there were three girls and one boy. Our section was not determined by gender. The professor I looked up to the most was one of my music education professors. She couldn't have weighed more than 100 pounds but was still the most intimidating professor in the department. She was strict but fair and was everything I wanted to be as an educator.

After graduation, I was offered my first teaching job. I was the director of bands at a small city school where all of the gender roles were reversed in the secondary music department. I was the band director, the orchestra director was female and the choir director was male. Again, this was not something I really thought about at the time. The biggest issue I faced with discrimination was due to my age. I was only three months out of college and most of the students in the school looked at least the same age as me, if not older. This did come as an advantage sometimes because I could walk down the hallway without being noticed and catch the students saying things they shouldn't be saying. The kids told me that I should wear a bell so they could know when I was around but I told them they should always just assume I'm right behind them and only have appropriate conversations. I did, however, get kicked out of the teachers lounge a lot.

It wasn't until I decided to return to graduate school that I even truly thought about how unbalanced the band world was. During one of the graduate history classes we began discussing women orchestral conductors or rather the lack there of. An assignment that focused on Marin Alsop, Music Director of the Baltimore Symphony Orchestra and the Sao Paulo Symphony Orchestra, opened my eyes to the situation. During interviews she was asked ridiculous questions like, 'do you cook?' and 'do you interpret music differently as a woman?' (Women Don't Paint Very Well - It's a Fact, 2013; Conversations on Creative Leadership, 2013). These types of questions would never be asked in an interview with a male conductor.

When I was first thinking about going to graduate school I began talking to one of the conducting professors. He asked me if I was interested in directing a professional ensemble or if I wanted to teach at the college level and I told him, 'no, I want to teach middle school.' It was never my dream to be a college band director but if that had been my dream it never occurred to me that I might face obstacles, even with a conducting degree, simply because of my gender. Reimer says, "There is no more powerful way for humans to explore, embody, and share their sense of the significance of human life than through the making and experiencing of art" (1988, p. 67).

#### *Rationale for Study*

Susan Hadley in her book, *Feminist Perspectives in Music Therapy*, prefaces a definition of feminism by saying, "I grappled with whether or not to define feminism in this book because it is so diverse and has so many forms that I could not imagine doing it justice" (2006, p. 6). It should be taken into consideration that there are a myriad of definitions for feminism.

Susan Osborne quotes the definition of feminism given by the *Chambers Dictionary*, which says, “advocacy of women’s rights, or of the movement for the advancement and emancipation of women” (2001, p.8). The definition later given by Susan Hadley states, “One can say that feminism is an embodied, flesh-and-blood, socio-cultural, political, philosophical movement predominantly created by and for women’s liberation/emancipation from various forms of male hegemony” (2006, p. 7).

The Eastern Kentucky University’s Women & Gender Studies site defines feminism as follows:

Feminism is a multi-disciplinary approach to sex and gender equality understood through social theories and political activism... Anytime stereotyping, objectification, infringements of human rights, or gender- or sexuality-based oppression occurs, it's a feminist issue (Eastern Kentucky University’s Women & Gender Studies, 2011).

It wasn’t until 1920 that all women gained the right to vote throughout the United States (History.com, 2010). Since that time, the country has made great strides in regard to gender equality. This year there are 104 women in congress, which is four more than there were last year (Center for American Women and Politics, 2015). However, there are 535 total members of congress (Carson, 2011). That means that only 19% of the people running our government are women. Until the representation of women in positions of power are more equitable there will need to be people working towards the advocacy of women’s rights. The circumstances are quite similar in the music world.

Lucy Green’s book discusses feminist issues in music. In reference to music education Green says that women are underrepresented in music history textbooks

(Green, 1997). White, European men are the majority of the composers and musicians discussed in history classes even though women composers and performers did exist in history (Scott & Harrassowitz, 2004). The lack of women being taught in classes sends the message to young girls and women that music is not really a profession for them (Green, 1997).

In a 1994 article about composer Pauline Oliveros, Fred Maus asks about some of the articles she has written addressing feminist topics. In one question, Maus asks Oliveros about a point she made about women being directed towards more domestic roles, which is why it is difficult for women to even consider becoming a composer. Ms. Oliveros responds by saying, “There were important reasons for division of labor, depending on what the labor was. But what has come about in our society is different: the same reasons for division of labor don’t apply in these times” (Maus, 1994, p. 177).

Gosfield wrote about her experiences in an article published in *The New York Times*. In this article she wrote, “I’ve never felt like having two X chromosomes held me back” (Gosfield, 2013). Gosfield (2013) suggested that she was not aware of such bias. However, she wrote about how Jazz musicians would say she is, ‘pretty good for a chick’ and salesmen at music stores wouldn’t wait on her because they assumed that she was just waiting for her musician boyfriend. Ms. Gosfield affirmed that the music society will continue to have to deal with many issues including sexism, racism, and class issues. Her advice for when someone feels like they are being underrepresented or overlooked is to “not get discouraged, but to get mad, get composing and get even” (Gosfield, 2013).

Research centering on demographics of women in the collegiate band world. Many of the studies have examined the number of women in the field and/or looked for

reasons as to why the numbers of female band conductors were low (Hartley & Jagow 2007, Gould 2003 & 2005). Several studies cited the lack of female role models in the profession (Gould 1996, Grant 2000, Hartley & Jagow 2007, Payne 1996). There are still a small percentage of women working in this field. Despite the static representation, the last study to focus on this topic was done in 2007. While research has shown the representation gap is real and still occurring in the field, little progress has been made to close the gap. This leads to the question, what are the experiences of women currently conducting bands at the collegiate level and what could be done to cultivate more women in the profession?

### **Purpose and Problems**

The purpose of this study is to examine current situations of women in the collegiate band world, to explore their perception of their experiences and beliefs about women in band. The questions guiding this study are:

1. What are the experiences of selected female band directors at the collegiate level?
2. How have role models influenced their career decisions? Who were these role models? How did these role models affect future career decisions?
3. What measures can be taken to encourage more female wind band directors?

## **Chapter 2 – Literature Review**

### **Introduction**

Throughout history women have had to make their own way in this world dominated and ruled by men. They have struggled to receive positions of authority in politics and corporations as well as other important leadership positions. Even in the education world, women have been accepted as teachers but less so in administrative positions. In music, the struggle continues for women. History texts and classes have neglected to include female accomplishments in music, which has resulted in a lack of role models for the young women interested in pursuing careers in music.

### **Women in Leadership**

Throughout history, a masculine association has always accompanied leadership. “Long live the king,” “Wait until your father gets home.” These have been common phrases that connect leadership and authority to men (Kellerman & Rhode, 2007). Leadership positions have never been easily accessible for women. Historically there have been few leadership positions in society that were considered appropriate for women (Freeman, Bourque, & Shelton, 2001).

In the not-so-recent past, it was the woman's responsibility to run the home and take care of the children. In the 1980s there was a call from conservative politicians and the religious community for women to “return to the home to heal the wounds of national life” after women began to enter the workforce (Freeman, Bourque, & Shelton, 2001, p. 3). Keohane argued that it is no longer reasonable for people to assume that women are unqualified or ill equipped to fill leadership positions now that there are successful

women in politics, law, and have become corporate CEOs, and presidents of universities (Kellerman & Rhode, 2007).

Even though women have made great strides these past few decades, in 2001 “men still occupy 95% of the top corporate positions and 85 % of elected offices” (Freeman, Bourque, & Shelton, 2001, p. 4). One reason for why there is still a lack of women in positions of authority is because of the perception of others. Women have been judged more harshly than men when trying to exercise their authority. This is not only the perception of men but women as well (Freeman, Bourque, & Shelton, 2001).

Carlie and Eagly stated,

“Other research confirms that women using a self-asserting or threatening style have less influence than men using the same style, or than women using a communal, supportive style. Such agentic behavior is more acceptable in men than in women because agency is associated with the male gender role” (Kellerman & Rhode, 2007, p. 129).

### **Discrimination in Education**

In general, the world of academia has been filled with the same type of people: white men. Even though the focus of this thesis is gender it is important to note that race is also an issue. In 1954 the *Brown v. Board of Education* decision was responsible for ending segregation that was supported by the state in education facilities (Rai & Critzer, 2000) but not all problems were solved. Affirmative action was enforced in order to limit gender and race discrimination. People who were against affirmative action think that it has created a preference system. Without it, supporters argue, racial, ethnic, and gender bias would continue to be a problem (Rai & Critzer, 2000). Unfortunately, even with

affirmative action, data still shows that there is a decline in the rate of females achieving full professorships (Rai & Critzer, 2000).

In 1978 women made up 66% of elementary teachers but only 15% of the school principals. This is in contrast with the 55% of elementary principals in 1928 (*Taking sexism out of education* 1978) so the percentage only slightly improved. The U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Office of Education (1978) lists possibilities for this decline in numbers, including

- Outright discrimination against women in the promotion practices of many school districts;
- Informal male-preference policy by school boards, based on the belief that more men are needed in elementary schools;
- School board overreaction to criticisms that elementary schools lack male role models and authority figures;
- Little concern for sex imbalance in school principalships shown by colleges and universities that train education administrators, and these institutions' use of financial aid and recruitment practices that favor males (p. 52).

One of the main assumptions of this research was the scarcity of women band directors at the collegiate level (Rai and Critzer, 2000). "Women of any race or ethnic background historically faced numerous obstacles in obtaining such education or training.... Admission to graduate school was difficult, for women were viewed as future mothers rather than a possible educators or scholars in higher education" (p. 52).

Leathwood and Read (2009) wrote that women did not begin to receive higher education until the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.



The U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Office of Education suggested that a way for change is

“Access, Visibility, and Networking. Increased mentorship experiences are needed to facilitate and maintain access to career advancement opportunities for women. Benefits include greater professional visibility for women, access to local networks and contacts for information about jobs and career options, and opportunity for aspiring women administrators to develop their own support systems.”

Professional visibility means taking a dominant or authoritative role in a professional situation and thereby becoming a focus of attention. Women in education can become visible by volunteering for committees within their own school or university and by taking an active part in professional associations. By making the most of these opportunities, women can gain management skills, develop self-confidence, and overcome barriers to visibility, access, and career development” (The U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Office of Education, p. 62).

This might make progress sound simple, but there are still many obstacles to overcome.

Dating back to Colonial times, women were accepted as general elementary teachers (Hinely, 1984). However, continuing into secondary or higher education was and still is a difficult path for women. Atterbury suggests:

There is a clear preponderance of females teaching at certain levels and in certain specialties. Many people still believe, for example, that females should not conduct bands. Females who wish to pursue careers as band directors not only

have this perception to overcome, but they have, at the secondary or college level, few female role models to emulate. Indeed, fewer than 10 percent of the people teaching secondary music education methods courses in 1986-87 were women. (Atterbury, 1992, p. 27)

Once women are successful in joining the field of higher education they faced a new obstacle. McElrath claimed that scholars in the past have noticed a difference between male and female members receiving tenure (1992). In her study, McElrath found that out of all her participants only half of the women were tenured whereas 82% of the male participants were tenured. This study also noticed that the men achieved tenure quicker than the women and made about \$6,000 more per year (McElrath, 1992). Women experienced similar inequalities throughout all fields of music.

## **Women in Music**

### **Music Professionals**

It is a slow process to change the world's perception that conductors, composers, and brass players are supposed to be men (Atterbury, 1992). There has been an obvious lack of women in this field and one issue that has contributed to this issue is the lack of exposure women have had in the history of music, and this isn't because these women musicians didn't exist (Scott & Harrassowitz, 2004). Neule-Bates has an entire book dedicated to women in music that covers women composers and performers from as early as the middle ages (Neuls-Bates, 1996).

Consider the typical music history units or music appreciation class that are offered in elementary schools, high schools, even colleges. According to Scott and Harrassowitz (2004), the music that is discussed is written by white, European men.

“Females were seriously underrepresented in illustrations of music-related figures; furthermore, these illustrations tended to reinforce many traditional music-related sex stereotypes” (Koza, 1994, p. 165).

Green wrote that music textbooks send the ‘wrong message’ to girls who wish to pursue a field in music (Green, 1997). Wendel-Caraher and the participants in her study said that the lack of women in the music education courses contributed to their feelings of being silenced as women in music education (Wendel-Caraher, 1999). Atterbury adds that the lack of female representation in these education courses leads people to believe that women did not write music (Atterbury, 1992).

There was a time when performance of classical music, especially on keyboard or plucked string instrument, was actually considered a feminine activity (Green, 1997). Pucciani backed up this statement by saying that playing an instrument was considered a feminine achievement and that this discouraged the boys from wanting to take music lessons (Pucciani, 1983). You would think that this would suggest more female musicians and even more women private lesson teachers but since music professionals were associated with men, the students would study with male teachers instead. Neuls-Bates suggested this affected women music teachers is that the girls preferred to take lessons from male teachers but since the boys found these lessons to be feminine, they were unlikely to ‘return the favor’ and take lessons from the female teachers (Neuls-Bates, 1996).

Jones (2010) recounted difficult experience as a woman band director in secondary education perceiving that she was discriminated for her gender. Jones interviewed three other women in the same field and found that not having women in the

field to look up to made the women in her study question their own identity as band directors (Jones, 2010). Hinely stated that women composers were denied the chance to earn a living as teachers since most composers supported themselves by teaching (Hinely, 1984). “We studied music to strengthen our voices. During our study of music our voices were diminished” (Wendel-Caraheer, 1999, p. 93).

More recent studies suggest this is lessening somewhat. Kruse, Giebelhausen, Shouldice, and Ramsey (2015) compared the number of picture representations of women music educators in the *Music Educators Journal*, they found that between the years of 2002 and 2009 women and men were nearly represented evenly. This is one sign that women might have broken into these fields of music and suggests that women who want to pursue careers in music education and they might have more female role models from which to choose. Recent research also suggests:

Women that have had success in the secondary band-teaching field also have the chance to help other women entering the profession. By reaching out to young women and being a role model, offering mentorship, and building relationships with those women, they can have a profoundly positive influence on the professional and personal lives of future educators (Jones, 2010).

### **Female Performers**

Women also face challenges in the music performance field. Opportunities are still quite limited in this area. This harkens back to the notion that women could not perform as well as men. Penno’s (2013) research followed female jazz instrumentalists who were in the early stages of their careers. The stereotypes that surfaced in the study

included general biases about what musical instruments women could play and the idea that females had lowered performance proficiency expectations (Penno, 2013).

Penno (2013) found her participants did not perceive themselves as negatively affected by gender stereotypes in high school. It wasn't until they became more involved in the more social settings of higher education and the performance field that they perceived their gender had an influence on the way they were treated. Several of the participants felt that gender did have an impact on their relationships with other musicians and that because they were females they had to go to greater lengths to prove themselves and their abilities.

Osborne (1996) examined gender bias in international orchestras. Osborne describes the reason for this problem stating that a focus for many international orchestras is on gender and ethnic uniformity. These orchestras believe that it will produce 'aesthetic superiority' (Osborne, 1996). Osborne references an article that lists the percentage of women in orchestras. In the United States women during the time of this article, 1996, represented 36%, in the United Kingdom it was 30%, and in Germany is was as low as 16% (Allmendinger & Hackman, 1994). "It is a real social phenomenon, deeply and directly hurtful to the lives of many women" (Osborne, 1996).

Osborne writes that even if women are able to obtain a position within one of these orchestras they often have to deal with intimidation and exclusion. To make matters worse, their chances of promotion are not very high (1996). Osborne specifically focuses on the Vienna Philharmonic Orchestra. During the time of this article, 1996, this orchestra was quite open about wanting ethnic and gender uniformity in order to achieve aesthetic superiority.

Even as recently as 1993, Abelson Macleod claimed that if the genders were to work together in an ensemble setting that it could “threaten the virtue of even the most well-intentioned young women” (Macleod, 1993, p.296). Women at the time also did not want other women playing in the same orchestras as their husbands because they were afraid that these women would “lead their husbands astray” (Macleod, 1993, p. 297).

In his article, Osborne referenced an interview done by the West German State Radio in 1996. During this interview it was stated that male uniformity is better equipped with performing music since music has gender-defined qualities. Goettler, a sociologist in Vienna said during this interview:

And the women can also contribute to creating competition among the men. They distract men. Not the older women. No one gives a damn about the older ones. It is the younger ones. The older women are already clever, they run to you! But the 20 or 25 year olds... They would be the problem. These are the considerations. In a monastery it is the same. The altar is a holy area, and the other gender may not enter it, because it would cause disorder (Osborne, 1996).

This situation isn't exclusive to the Vienna Philharmonic. The Berlin Philharmonic, another one of the top orchestras in the world, has also been involved in gender discrimination (Osborne, 1996). Sabine Meyer was the first woman accepted into the Berlin Philharmonic in 1983 and she was only in the group for nine months (Osborne, 1996). By the time of Osborne's article there were still only six women in full time positions. An interesting statement in this article said, “some claimed that it is impossible for women to really play in unison with men, because they have different bodies” (Osborne, 1996).

Himmelbauer looked at orchestral websites to determine the number of women in European and American orchestras in 2005. What she discovered is no comfort to women interested in pursuing a career in orchestral performance. The orchestra with the highest percentage of women was the Orchestre National d'Ile de France with 42.86%. The American orchestra with the highest percentage is the New York Philharmonic Orchestra with 40.59%. Out of the 35 orchestras listed, the Berlin Philharmonic ranked 31<sup>st</sup>. Women only accounted for 13.01% of the orchestra, which is better than the 5% in 1999. The orchestra with the least amount of women was the Vienna Philharmonic with less than one percent. The average of these numbers brings the percentage of women in European and American orchestras to only 26.09% (Osborne, 2005). Even though things have been bleak for women in professional orchestras, Osborne believes that society will continue to grow in these fields.

It is certain that we are witnessing an historical movement that will continue.

Women musicians are assuming positions of leadership, and are creating a wide-reaching cultural metamorphosis. By returning the feminine to humanity, they are giving society a new identity, and a deeper understanding of human consciousness that is profoundly transforming the world of music (Osborne, 1996).

### **Gender and Instrument Selection**

Gender roles have influenced people's perception on what is considered appropriate for women in music, including what instruments to play. Abelson Macleod's article stated that it was only appropriate for women to play instruments that matched their femininity. These instruments included ones that had a similar range to the soprano

voice and which required an appropriate playing position that did not distort a woman's figure were considered suitable for women to play (1993).

A flute was deemed acceptable for women to play, as it does not require facial contortion in order to be played. Instruments, such as the trumpet, oboe, clarinet, etc. require the use of an embouchure, which was considered unattractive for women to produce (Macleod, 1993). These concepts had nothing to do with how women sound on those instruments; it only concerned their looks.

Studies done by Griswold, Chroback, (1981) Abeles, and Porter (1978) looked at sex-role stereotyping in reference to instrument selection. These researchers determined through their data collection that instruments considered feminine included the violin, flute, and clarinet, while trumpet, trombone, and drums were labeled as masculine instruments (Griswold, 1981). According to this study, undergraduate students linked instruments and occupations to gender.

Zervoudakes and Tanur (1994) took this concept a step further and looked to identify who actually plays which instruments. This study separated the instruments into hypothesized groups based on previous gender stereotypes. The instruments labeled as feminine included flute, oboe, clarinet, violin, and viola. The instruments labeled as male were bassoon, saxophone, trumpet, French horn, trombone, baritone horn, tuba, bass, and percussion. The cello and piano were listed as neutral. The study found that in high school and college the number of females playing instruments labeled as feminine increased while females playing instruments labeled as masculine remained the same or decreased.



Macleod (1993) included a chart that listed the percentage of female instrumental players in symphony orchestras in America from the 1940s to the 1980s. This chart showed that during this time, the percentage of women playing some of the ‘masculine’ instruments has actually decreased. Women playing the string bass went from 23% in the 1940s to 14% in the 1980s. Similarly, the percentage of women playing the trumpet and trombone decreased by 3%, women playing the tuba decreased by 5%, and female percussionists decreased by 7%.

### **Women Conductors**

Women conductors are one of the most underrepresented fields in the music world. “Of all the areas in music, the one in which it has been most difficult for women to gain acceptances has been conducting, for the obvious reason that it connotes the ultimate in forcefulness, leadership and control” (Macleod, 1993, p. 300). Toscanini was known as one of the great conductors in history but is also known as a tyrant. This behavior is more acceptable from men than it is from women (Hodgson, 1999).

In an article comparing the number of photographs in which women were represented they found that on average 79% of the 871 photographs throughout the 50 years were of male conductors (Kruse, Giebelhausen, Shouldice, Ramsey, 2015). Throughout history, if women wanted to conduct they had to create their own ensembles. In the 1920s and 1930s when all-women orchestras were forming, it gave opportunities for women to conduct (Macleod, 1993). Marin Alsop, music director of the Baltimore Symphony, created her own orchestra in order to practice conducting (Conversations on Creative Leadership, 2013). The gestures given by men and women, even if they are the

same, they are interpreted differently. (Women Don't Paint Very Well – It's a Fact, 2013).

In Maran's article she points out that both men and women have the ability to be good leaders, which she describes as having the ability to create the feeling of acceptance and involvement in a group. She even goes so far as to say that women are better at making members feel involved than men (Maran, 2009). A theme that occurs throughout Maran's paper is the lack of female mentors in this field; she states that the participants in her study were all trained by male conductors (Maran, 2009). Alsop worked to change that by creating a fellowship for women conductors. The winner gets the opportunity to follow Maestro Alsop around the world and conduct the opening pieces of the concerts.

Women are also guilty when it comes to gender bias. An American concert pianist wrote in a letter:

Did you read my letter to N.S., in which I told her about Alician Hund, who composed and conducted a symphony? All the men were highly disgusted because she was allowed to conduct the orchestra herself. I didn't think myself that it was a very becoming position, though I had no prejudice against it.

Somehow, a woman doesn't look well with a baton in her hand directing a body of men (Jagow, 1998).

Alsop stated in an interview that she doesn't think that it is completely just a gender issue but that we are so used to how things have been in the past that we just aren't used to seeing women in these kinds of positions. Alsop then told a story about one time when she got on a plane and saw that there was a female pilot and her first thought was that she needed to get off the plane (Conversations on Creative Leadership, 2013).

Sometimes gender roles are so ingrained inside us, we don't even realize when we are under its influence.

Alsop's experiences also included interesting attention from the media. Even though it is difficult to believe that there can still be first time occurrences for women, Alsop has had many conducting engagements, where she has become the first woman to do so. This gains a lot of attention from the press but even they talk to her differently than they would with a man. Alsop mentioned that she was once asked if she cooked. They also ask questions in regard to whether or not she interprets music differently as a woman. Her gender is the major focus of her career when it should be all of the great work she is doing with the orchestra in the Baltimore community (*Women Don't Paint Very Well – It's a Fact*, 2013).

Petrides wrote something I found to be so inspiring, I felt it was important to add to this section. She said:

When one pauses to consider the increasing numbers of young American women who are now studying or who aspire to study in the near future, the art of directing an orchestra, one's conviction grows stronger and stronger that the day is not far distant when the sight of women conductors will no longer evoke feelings of curiosity and surprise (Jagow, 1998, p. 135).

Overall the question isn't whether women have the ability. The question is whether society has the ability to change their way of thinking and accept women in these positions of authority.

### **Women in the Collegiate Band World**

The number of women in the collegiate band world, or rather the lack there of, has been a topic of interest in research. Several researchers have looked for the missing factor of female role models in the field of wind band conducting (Gould 1996, Grant 2000, Hartley & Jagow 2007). They speculate that because there have been a lack of women collegiate band directors there were fewer role models to encourage other female musicians to pursue the field of wind band conducting. During this study none of the participants, all of which were women, said they'd had any female band directors as a role model or an influence on becoming a wind band director.

The participants in Grant's study agreed that it is important for music students from an early age to have a musical role model to look up to (Grant, 2000). For many people in the band world, their high school band director became their musical mentor (Grant, 2000). Inspiration also comes at the college level from studio professors, ensemble conductors, etc.

In Grant's study (2000) very few of the women interviewed named women as mentors. There were some orchestral conductors named as role models but Mallory Thompson, Director of Bands at Northwestern University, was the only name mentioned by more than one participant. "It is important to the development of aspiring conductors, that their potential be identified early. Male directors may not recognize this passion in their female students because they have been conditioned to think there is no way this career is going to happen for them" (Grant, 2000, p. 117). In a study done by Jackson, she found that the participants in her study also did not have female role models: Jackson states that it was more important to have exemplary role models regardless of gender (1996).

In a 2003 study, Gould wrote that there was little more than 5% of college band directors in the United States that were women. Also, whether the women were as qualified as their male colleagues or not the salaries were less and the faculty ranks were lower for women. One of the reasons for the continued prejudice in bands is the fact that the band tradition began with military bands, which historically were made up of men.

In high school marching bands, women were excluded due to what band directors stated as uniformity purposes. At the onset of World War II, some band directors allowed women to join until the men came home. Some directors formed a separate band just for women, and other directors simply disbanded their groups until the war was over. With college marching band being such a crucial part of music education, how were women supposed to prepare for a position as a collegiate band director without ever having that experience (2003)?

In 2007 women still only made up about 10% of the directors of collegiate bands (Hartley & Jagow). Even compared to other areas in collegiate music, there are a lower percentage of females as wind band directors (Hartley & Jagow, 2007). Undergraduate students in the music education major were divided equally between genders but the percentage of women studying music education at the graduate level dropped to 25%; 10-15% at the doctorate level (Hartley & Jagow, 2007). These numbers show that younger students are more likely to have a female teacher in the music classroom, while the men are directing ensembles of older students (Gould, 2005).

Those percentages listed by Hartley & Jagow (2007) also bleed over into the number of women at the collegiate level. Title VII, which addressed the issue of sexual discrimination in the workplace, helped increase the percentage of females in university

faculty. However, most of the growth - approximately 75% - happened at the community college level (Payne, 1996). In 1972 a federal law, Title IX was created. This law was created to put an end to sex discrimination in federally funded education systems. Title IX affects all federally funded education systems such as colleges, universities, public schools, and education or training programs (U.S. Department of Justice, 2014).

Jackson makes a great statement in her article. She writes, “the qualities, attributes, or characteristics of effective college band directors include the following: (a) a high level of musicianship; (b) interpersonal skills; (c) leadership and organizational skills; and (d) enthusiasm. None of these qualities are associated with gender” (1996, p. 126).

## **Conclusion**

Women have overcome a lot throughout history but we still face a struggle to be accepted as equal to men. Women still fall behind in positions of leadership in politics, corporations and education. In music history literature and classes women are constantly underrepresented as performers, conductors, composers and even professors. This lack of exposure has left the wrong impression about women’s abilities in music and has therefore hindered women from pursuing such careers. The collegiate band field is still dominated by men; this fact is what prompted the idea for this thesis.

## **Chapter 3 – Methodology**

### **Methodology**

This qualitative study uses a narrative research design (Gay, Mills, & Airasian, 2009). Each participant will be asked a series of questions during one to three Skype interviews. The interviews will be constructed in three sections. The first set of questions will include background information in regard to their musical experiences. The focus of the second section will be their experiences with gender inequality. The final round of questions will ask about their thoughts about the future and how to involve more women in the collegiate band world.

Each interview will be semi-structured with a predetermined set of questions as well as any other question that may transpire during the actual interview. All interviews will be recorded through the Skype program and the audio will also be recorded through the GarageBand '09 program on an Apple MacBook Pro laptop. The information will be stored on a private laptop that is password protected and in Google Drive that can only be accessed by the writer and the writer's thesis advisor. All information stored on the Google Drive, which will be password protected, will use the pseudonyms of all participants. A file will be kept on the laptop with the original subject information that will be saved as an encrypted file. The consent forms will be kept in a locked filing cabinet.

### **Participants**

Two of the participants were selected from the College Band Directors National Association (CBDNA) website. Both participants serve on the CBDNA Gender and Ethnicity Issues committee and met the criteria for this study, which is that the

participants direct an instrumental band program at the collegiate level. The final participant was invited to take part in this study after I met her during a college marching band event. The identities of the participants and their corresponding colleges/universities have been changed for the purpose of anonymity.

The first participant, *Missy*, is an Associate Professor of Music and the Director of Instrumental Activities and Coordinator of Music Education at a small university. Missy directs the university athletic bands as well as the wind ensemble. In addition to her ensemble responsibilities she teaches all of the music education classes as well. Missy earned a doctorates degree in music before beginning her position at the university.

The second participant, *Brittany*, is also an Associate Professor in a performance focused music school. Brittany earned a PhD instead of a DMA with a conducting component in addition to music education. She is the director of the university's wind ensemble and teaches classes in conducting, wind repertoire, and methods classes.

The third participant, *Brava*, is an Associate Director of Instrumental Studies and is also the Music Education Coordinator. Brava directs the university's athletic bands, the symphonic band and teaches several music education courses including orchestra literature and supervises the student teachers. Brava does all of this while finishing up her doctorates degree.

### **Trustworthiness**

In order to achieve trustworthiness the technique called member-check (Gay, Mills, & Airasian, 2009), where the participants are given the transcriptions of the interviews to be reviewed, will be used for each interview. Each interview transcript will be reviewed several times and then grouped into codes. The codes are selected from stories, sentences,



and words relevant to the study. The codes will then be organized into relevant themes. Other graduate students as well as professors at the university will review the codes in order to ensure trustworthiness.

## Chapter 4 – The Participants

The focus of chapter four is on the participants and their stories. Each woman has had very different experiences both in music and life and even more diverse experiences in regard to gender bias. Each section, titled by their pseudonym, will focus on that individual and the topics that came up during our discussions.

### Missy

*\*The information in the following section was collected from an interview with Missy on March 3, 2015.*

Missy is a southern girl with an accent to prove it. Her quick wit and keen sense of humor is all part of her charm. Missy tells wonderful stories that focused on whimsy and wit above all but she is also a very serious musician. She approached the topic of this thesis with careful consideration but also with an optimistic attitude and once again, a hit of humor. Missy jokingly suggested being referred to as *The Maestra* for this interview to point out the ridiculousness of gender bias.

When it comes to her ensembles and teaching style, Missy is a firm director who doesn't sugarcoat things. "I don't flower things and call people sweetheart and stuff, I'm not that type at all" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). She often is asked if she comes from a military background, which she does not.

Missy is not a person with a large ego. When she introduces herself she leaves out the title 'Doctor' and focuses solely on the position she holds at the university. In reference to why she disregards the title Missy said, "I'm one of those that's kind of like, 'it's a piece of paper on the wall'" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Missy did not grow up in what she considers to be a musical home. Her mother worked briefly as a teacher assistant before transitioning to booking work at a local grocery store. While her professional work was not musical in nature, her mother participated in a church choir and later volunteered as director when the group suddenly found themselves in need. In reference to her mother's choral direction experience, Missy said, "she didn't even pick the music, the pianist picked the music and she was just kind of waving her arms" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

A school psychologist, Missy described her father's musical ability by saying, "my dad was great at playing CDS but that's about all he can do" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). However, she said that her father had a very nice voice but that he could never find the right notes. Missy also mentioned that her younger brother followed in his sister's musical footsteps by playing percussion in marching band. Despite these musical experiences Missy did not consider her childhood home a musical home.

Missy's musical experience began in an elementary school general music class playing the recorder. At a young age she was set apart from other students in her class when just a few students were picked to play their recorders with a symphony orchestra that was performing a concert at her elementary school. Before the orchestra came out to the school Missy remembers writing a letter to the conductor and she was surprised when the conductor wrote one back. "I guess those things shaped my future too but I didn't really know it at the time" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). To this day she still has that letter in a scrapbook somewhere.

In 7<sup>th</sup> grade Missy began playing the trombone and later switched to tuba in her junior year of high school because the band didn't have any tuba players. She participated in performance groups such as the marching band where she eventually became drum major. She even played E-flat tuba in a British brass band her senior year of high school, which of course led to a conversation with me about Ewan McGregor in the movie *Brassed Off*, a 1996 film about a British brass band.

During her junior year of high school Missy's band director went on sabbatical so the community brought in the former, retired band director to teach and conduct her high school band. Alumni would show up to the band class just to say hello and reconnect with him when he filled in as director. Missy said, "I was like, I kind of want that too. I want people to talk about me like that" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015) because she saw how these people were so moved by him and she saw what he did for them, "not just in band but as a person" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Missy said, "That's why I chose to do it, because before that I was going to be an astronaut or something" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

After teaching high school for three years, Missy received her master's degree and then she taught high school again for another seven years before going on for her doctorate. While this retired band director's impact on Missy was important in her initial career path, a different person directed her toward college teaching. It turns out that the 'what' was actually a 'who.' Jack Stamp is a very well respected collegiate band director and a name that appears several times in interviews for this paper. He is also the person who encouraged Missy to make the switch from high school to college band directing.

While having Dr. Stamp direct the All District Band in her area, Missy had several conversations with Dr. Stamp. During these conversations Missy said that Dr. Stamp must have recognized something in her because at the end of that week he said to her, “I don’t mean to be forward but you need to teach college” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Missy said, “So I took that as the green light to go ahead and do it” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Missy continued to have a friendship with Dr. Stamp throughout the years and even mentioned getting to see him soon. “It’s kind of fun to say, ‘hey I know Jack Stamp.’ I might not be anything special but I know Jack Stamp so it’s all good” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Now Missy is an Associate Professor of Music and the Director of Instrumental Activities and Coordinator of Music Education at a small university. At her current position with the university, Missy has many responsibilities since it is such a small program with 70 music majors, only seven of which are music education majors; the school student body is less than two thousand. She directs the wind ensemble, runs the pep band for football and basketball, and teaches all of the music education courses. These courses include instrumental band method classes, conducting, and rehearsal techniques/band literature classes. She is the advisor for all student teachers as well as the advisor for the incoming freshman music majors.

Outside of her university responsibilities, Missy conducts all-county bands and gives clinics at different middle and high schools. Missy is also asked to rehearse bands and give master classes before band festivals and adjudications. Currently Missy is preparing to host a middle school band festival at the university during their spring break.

Beyond working directly with various ensembles, Missy judges band festivals outside of her responsibilities with the university.

### **Brittany**

*\*The information in the following section was collected from an interview with Brittany on March 6, 2015.*

It was obvious to me during our interview that Brittany is a very serious music educator. While deciding on her alias, Brittany made sure that she didn't pick anything that "assumes importance or arrogance" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). She decided on the title *Brittany* because of the major impact that being a collegiate drum major had on her career choices and her life choices.

When introducing herself to others she said, "The first thing that usually comes out of my mouth is the teaching element" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). Brittany's focus is on education and later comes the title of 'wind conductor' or 'university professor.' Brittany had many insights into the issues of gender bias based on her own experiences and has risen above the obstacles put in her way.

Brittany grew up living with her mother after her parents divorced. She said, "my parents were divorced but my dad was still part of our lives and very much an influence. My greatest influence was certainly growing up with my mom and her background" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). Brittany's mother originally studied engineering but later began work as a secretary for a large company after the divorce. Musically, Brittany's mother had taken piano lessons and violin lessons as well as dance, which she passed on to her daughter.

Even though he wasn't a daily influence, Brittany's father was a music professor at a university. His specialties were keyboard and voice so in addition to his job at the university he was also a pianist and church organist and choir director. Brittany also has an older sister who played violin as a child. Now her sister is a professional singer and performing around the city as well as in the local symphony chorus.

Before joining band in 5<sup>th</sup> grade, Brittany was involved in dance from the time she was three years old. Her mother, who was also involved in dance, encouraged both her daughters to participate in dance because she believed they would greatly benefit from movement training. Once in 5<sup>th</sup> grade, Brittany joined the band and played trumpet.

Once in high school she participated in jazz band, marching band and concert band but continued to utilize her experience as a dancer by participating on stage her (high) school's musicals. Originally Brittany had not planned on going to college for music education. Her first plan was to go to New York City and try to get a job on Broadway in a chorus. However, Brittany realized that there wasn't much security in a job like that and by the age of 30 she might have a hard time finding a job. So she decided to go to college, but not for music.

Initially, Brittany decided to go to college for accounting. Then, during her senior year of high school, Brittany had the opportunity to participate in a school program where she was able to spend part of the day shadowing the band director. After spending her days with the middle school students, Brittany realized she enjoyed her time with the young musicians. The experience she enjoyed the most was, "engaging with those kids and seeing the light bulbs starting to go off and their energy and their excitement" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). By April she was contacting the

universities that she applied to and asked to be considered for admittance into their music school.

Between Brittany's sophomore and junior year of high school a new and younger band director came in and revitalized the program. He "added life to that program that had really been losing steam" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). It was that director who motivated her and got her excited and thinking about a career in music education. As a music major, Brittany found her home.

Currently Brittany is an Associate Professor in a midsized university (2,800 students) music program in central United States and the director of the wind ensemble. Brittany completed all of her degrees in music education including a PhD in music education. While working on coursework for her doctorate she completed a cognate in wind conducting.

Her current teaching responsibilities with the university include ensemble conducting, teaching classes (including undergraduate), conducting, undergraduate wind repertoire, music education methods, a graduate course in wind history and repertoire and also supervise student teachers. Outside of the school of music, Brittany is active in many other educational engagements. Brittany does several clinics for music groups that travel into the city and are looking for a clinic while on their trip. She participates in helping out local schools, conducts honor and all state bands, and even has conducted an intercollegiate band. Brittany has done adjudications in Singapore, Canada and around the United States.

As a feature conductor in Latvia at an international conducting symposium, Brittany was asked not only to conduct the feature group but also to present sessions at



the conference. The topics of her clinics and presentations have been on the Laban effort shape theory, “which is movement analysis and how we can apply this to the teaching of expressive conducting” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). She connects the Laban motions with breath and how it motivates the gesture. Other clinics have been on score study, rehearsal techniques, chamber music in the large ensemble, and a new clinic idea about creating a balance within a score and with an ensemble.

### **Brava**

*\*The information in the following section was collected from an interview with Brava on March 9, 2015.*

Brava is a very busy woman. She works well into the late afternoon with students continuously waiting to speak with her. A simple woman, when asked how she introduces herself she said, “I just introduce myself by saying, ‘hey I’m Brava.’ I’m not too deep I don’t think” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

Like the other participants, Brava did not grow up in a musical home. She did, however, mention having a cousin who is a professional pianist and Brava took lessons from her when she was younger. She also had an older sister who played the flute for a bit but it was never anything serious. Brava’s mother was a housewife and her father was an electrician, neither was very musical. Brava began piano lessons at the age of 4 with her cousin and played until she was 13 or 14 years old.

In fifth grade she began playing clarinet in the band. Once in high school Brava participated in marching band and concert band but never took lessons on the clarinet. Fortunately, the training she received in piano made her a strong clarinet player because she already had a background in reading music and theory. In jazz band, Brava played the

piano. Band wasn't something she was too serious about in high school; she just did it for fun.

It wasn't until undergrad when she had Mallory Thompson as a director that she began to change her mind. Originally Brava had gone to college for biology and was pre-med. While at school her extracurricular activities included working in a Veterans Administration hospital and playing in a wind ensemble directed by Mallory Thompson. Brava also took beginning conducting courses and was getting a minor in music but her focus was still pre-med. After a while Mallory Thompson asked Brava about her plan. She pointed out Brava was focusing on music like a music major, including playing a junior recital, subbing for the local orchestra, and working with a high school in her spare time. Mallory Thompson left Brava's undergraduate university before Brava's senior year but the university hired Dr. William Wiedrich, who completed what Mallory Thompson began: convincing Brava to major in music.

Brava received her bachelor's degree in music education with a minor in biology. After teaching for four years, Brava went back to get her masters degree in conducting and music education. Previous to her current position, Brava also worked with the New World Symphony with Michael Tilson Thomas. Currently, Brava is the Associate Director of Instrumental Studies and Music Education Coordinator at a Midwestern, medium size university. She is also working on her DMA and will be finishing up in May.

Brava has many responsibilities at the university including directing the athletic bands, conducting the symphonic band, and teaching classes. The classes she teaches include marching band techniques, orchestra literature, secondary methods, graduate

critical issues in music education, and seminar for the student teachers. Brava is also the advisor for the interning students.

When asked if she does anything outside of her university responsibilities, Brava said that she does judge at adjudications and conducts all state and honor bands and orchestras because she used to teach orchestra for 10 years. Because she is in the final stages of her doctorates program Brava said that she hasn't done as many all-state band engagements this year as she usually does but that she is scheduled for seven this year. Brava also said that she doesn't like to do too many outside engagements because "I feel like I neglect my students here and I think this is my priority and the other things are experiences" (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

Although each participant had very different experiences, they all went on to pursue the same career path. Being a woman in a male dominated field is not necessarily an easy task and in the next chapter I will address the themes that came up during our conversations.

## **Chapter 5 – Themes**

During my beginning research there were many themes that kept occurring such as role model influence, instrument selection, and assumptions. Two main themes emerged after the discussions with the participants and divided into (1) what were the foundational experiences of each participant and how were they common, and (2) the experiences they have had with gender bias. Within both of these themes I was able to identify categories that may have contributed to the path that the three participants took in becoming collegiate band directors. The categories that were found within the foundational experiences theme included early music experiences, familial background, advanced education, instrument selection, and professional influence. In the gender bias theme the categories were difficulty in identifying bias, advantageous position, assumptions and ignorance, experiences with students, discrimination, ‘would this have happened if I were a man’, woman vs. woman, participant bias.

### **Foundational Experiences**

#### **Early Music Experiences**

One theme that was common for all three of the participants is their early participation in music. Missy’s experience in elementary school playing the recorder alongside a symphony orchestra sparked her interest in instrumental music at a very young age. “I guess those things shaped my future too but I didn’t really know it at the time” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). While not strictly focusing on music performance, Brittany was expressing musical ideas at the age of three when she began dance classes. Brava’s early experience with music began with piano lessons at the age of four with her cousin. All three participants began playing a band instrument

between 5<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> grade depending on when their school districts began students on band instruments. Their participation in band later included such ensembles as marching band, jazz band, and concert band. Their musical experiences were diverse, but commenced early in their development.

### **Familial Background**

It was interesting to find that out of the three participants, two stated that they did not come from a musical family. Missy mentioned that her mother participated in the church choir and even took over as director but she said that her mother didn't make any of the musical decisions. "She was just kind of waving her arms but she didn't even really know how to conduct." (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). In reference to her father's musical ability Missy sarcastically said, "my dad was great at playing CDs but that's about all he can do" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Brava also stated that the only musical influence that came from her family was the cousin from whom she took piano lessons, though this was not necessarily specified as a positive or negative influence. Brittany was the only participant who came from a musical home. Her parents, who were separated, both had strong musical backgrounds. During our interview Brittany said, "my greatest influence was certainly growing up with my mom and her background" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). Her mother took piano and violin lessons in addition to her background in dance and her father was a music professor. All three participants had siblings who participated in music at some point in their lives. "My older sister played flute for a millisecond. She

played it here and there and everywhere but not really seriously” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

### **Instrument Selection**

In chapter two of this paper I made reference to research that looked into gender and instrument selection. In the research of Griswold & Chroback (1981) and Abeles & Porter (1978) instruments such as violin, flute, and clarinet were considered to be feminine instruments while trumpet, trombone, and drums were considered to be the masculine instruments. Brava played the clarinet, which is considered to be a feminine instrument but Missy played trombone and later tuba. She explained her shift saying, “We didn’t have a tuba and the band director was asking the worst trombone player to switch and I went over there and said, ‘we need a real tuba player’ so I switched” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Brittany also played what was considered by the research as a masculine instrument, the trumpet. Missy’s and Brittany’s experiences playing ‘masculine’ instruments in male dominated sections may have given them the necessary experience to pursue a male dominated profession.

### **Advanced Education**

All three participants either had their doctorate or will have their doctorate by the end of the school year. Missy makes the point in her interview that having a doctorate doesn’t make you a better musician or educator than people without a doctorate. She said, “you don’t need a doctorate to be awesome” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). However, all three women have dedicated themselves to becoming even more ‘awesome’ by getting the doctorate. Two of the participants, Missy and Brava, have received/are receiving a DMA while Brittany has a PhD.

## **Professional Influence**

Early musical experiences, familial support, instrument selection, and advanced education played an important role in their foundational experiences as a collegiate band director, but there is one final category that also played an important role. The final category to be explored in foundational experiences is professional influence. Out of the three participants only one participant, Brava, had a female band director in college. When asked about whether she thought having Mallory Thompson as a role model influenced her decisions, Brava said, “Absolutely. I never put much weight in that but seeing somebody who was aggressive about what they wanted and was very clear and concise and artistic, it certainly inspired me” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). None of the participants had a female director in high school and Missy and Brittany, did not experience the opportunity to learn from a female band director. Brittany mentioned Deb Sheldon as a strong influence in her life and on how she approached teaching but not as an influence in the band world. Speaking of Deb Sheldon Brittany said, “she is outstanding in the classroom... as a female role model for her ambition and her drive and commitment, conviction in what she did, she certainly made an impact on me as a female in that role” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015).

The majority of the influences listed by all the participants were men. Two of the participants mentioned Dr. Jack Stamp as a major influence in their careers. Missy got to know Dr. Stamp when he came to direct an all-state band. It was during one of their many conversations that he suggested that Missy become a college director. “At the end of that weekend he said ‘I don’t mean to be forward but you need to teach college’ and I

was like ‘...ok’” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). For Brittany, Dr. Stamp invited her to do a three day residency at his school after listening to the issues she was having getting tenured. “Just out of the goodness of his heart, he had no way of knowing whether I was qualified to do it or not” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). Brava listed the biggest influences in musical her life as William Wiedrich, Allan McMurray, Craig Kirchoff, and Brava Reynolds.

The three participants came from very diverse backgrounds even though they all pursued the same career path. The lack of female role models did not hold these women back from pursuing this career. The main connecting factor to this section was their passion for music and working hard for what they wanted despite not having many women come before them. The next section is on the major focus of this paper; gender bias.

### **Gender Bias**

Now comes the section that the inspiration of this thesis is based on. There were several categories that developed from the discussions with the participants. The first comment each participant made was that it wasn’t always easy to see gender bias. The other categories are about how being a woman was at times advantageous, assumptions and ignorance, experiences they have had with students, discrimination, issues that might not have come up if they were men, the competition between women and the bias of the participants.

#### **Difficulty in Identifying Bias**

When asked to consider gender bias in their professional life, all participants expressed difficulty in answering this question. Missy said in her interview that in her



current position she hasn't noticed any gender bias but said, "of course if there are underlying things that I don't know about, then I don't know about them" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Brittany's response to the question was, "you never actually know what might be going on behind the scenes" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). Brava said, "hindsight's 20/20. I think it's been happening all my life but I was oblivious to it until probably the last six years of my life" (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

### **Advantageous Position**

All participants were upfront about the fact that being a woman could sometimes be advantageous to their careers. Missy discussed how she took advantage of being a woman while filling out job applications. Since women are underrepresented in the collegiate world women can check the minority box on applications, which requires the search committee to give the application special attention. Missy said, "you take advantage of it when you can" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). The other point Missy made about taking advantage of being a woman was, "going to CBDNA is great, no lines at the restroom, just walk right in and it's the truth, it's so funny" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Brittany was invited to be the featured conductor in Singapore. When Brittany asked why they sought her out versus other conductors, they told her that they were looking for a female conductor and that she fit all of the qualifications they were looking for, the only qualification being that she was a woman. Brava agrees that being female may have also worked to her advantage while applying for jobs.

### *Assumptions & Ignorance*

One of the most inhibiting biases that these women faced came from assumptions and ignorance. Missy and Brittany had opposite experiences when it came to how they ran their ensembles. Missy considered herself to be a bit old school and rather strict with her ensemble. She said, “I don’t flower things and call people sweetheart and stuff. I’m not that type at all” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Since she is tough on her ensemble people have asked if she has a military background. Their assumption was that if a woman is tough then she must have a military background. Brittany, who does not consider herself to be a tough or strict person gets the comment that she isn’t tough enough with her ensemble. Brittany’s response to their comments is, “it’s just not part of who I am” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015).

A common occurrence for Missy while at conferences is that people would constantly ask her at what middle school she taught. At the time Missy was teaching at a high school but the assumption was that since she is a woman, she must be a middle school director. Missy’s response to these assumptions was, “Middle school is harder than high school so they really should rethink that” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

While guest conducting at a university a female student thanked Brittany for being an exceptional conductor. Through further investigation, Brittany learned that a boy in this female student’s section kept making comments about how he had never played for a good female conductor. This young female musician shared how the young man recognized Brittany’s talent and no longer made biased comments. Similarly, while in graduate school, one of Brittany’s peers said to her after seeing her conducting for the first time that he liked that her conducting wasn’t ‘prissy.’ This colleague meant his

comment as a compliment but his comments about Brittany's conducting may showcase a bigger issue about the role of masculinity in conducting in the instrumental ensemble.

Another assumption that was brought up in the interview with Missy, she said, "I will say one thing. Being a female band director who has short hair and who also happens to be athletic; people think you're a lesbian" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

In regard to ignorance, Brittany and Brava both mentioned situations where the people they were working with may have had a positive response to female conductors but hadn't had a lot of experience with them. For example, Brittany was a guest conductor in Lithuania. While telling this story she said, "I stepped up to do a piece and the buzz just starts going" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). She later learned that none of the members of the group she was conducting had ever performed under the direction of a woman. They weren't meaning to be rude, they were just surprised. When Brava was teaching high school in a school that was not at all diverse, students would ask to touch her hair because they've never seen hair like hers before. It wasn't something meant in a rude way, it was simply ignorance.

### **Experiences with Students**

For Missy and Brittany, their experiences with students have been mostly positive. Missy shared a particular interaction with male students who lived with their mother after their parents got divorced. These students would resist her and misbehave. She realized later that their behavior towards her was similar to the behavior towards their mother. Previously discussed, though equally applicable is Brittany's experience with the male student who didn't believe women conductors were any good while she was guest conducting. Brava, however, actually had an experience where students would say to her,

‘what do you know? You’re a woman.’ Brava said, “You had to prove yourself three times over” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). These students were so forward about their negativity towards women; it’s surprising how vocal they were about it. According to Brava, the band director that took over after she left is also a woman. “She’s also white. I hate to say it that way but it makes it a little bit easier. They aren’t chasing her down in banks and Wal-mart” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

### **Discrimination**

Assumptions and ignorance are unfortunate when it comes to gender bias but two of these women have experienced outright discrimination. At one of the universities that Brittany worked at she saw that the marching band had hazing issues, especially towards the women in the ensemble. Brittany said that when she tried to put a stop to the hazing “I also started to become the target” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). Fear of discrimination is another concern for these women. Brittany went through a pregnancy while working at her current university. She was afraid about how her co-workers and superiors would react. “That’s something that really scared me and really had me on edge” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). In this instance, it is not the reality of discrimination that is problematic, but rather previous experiences that lead to the fear of possible discrimination.

Brava has experienced gender discrimination outside of her professional life. During her time working at one college, she would be followed around Wal-Mart because they were afraid she might steal something. Then while trying to open a bank account; the teller would only speak to her husband. “They wouldn’t talk to me until my husband

said, ‘look, you need to speak to her, I’m leaving’ and he walked out. That’s the only way they dealt with me” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

**“Would this have happened if I were a man?”**

Another category in the gender bias theme that surround the question ‘would this have happened if I were a man?’ Missy discussed a former professor who ran his ensembles in a very ‘old-school’ way. He would yell and insult people and they would be intimidated and just take it. “If I had gotten on the podium and said those same things they’d all be like, ‘what kind of pill are you on today?’” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). There was another instance at a conference and after Missy listened to a premiere she went up to congratulate the composer. “He would reach around us to shake men’s hands” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

In the last section I mentioned Brittany’s fear of going through a pregnancy as a band conductor, which is a very visible profession in the community. It turns out that her fears were not misguided. Brittany’s co-workers for the most part were very supportive but the when she told the dean, the first thing he asked was whether or not there was a father involved. “I’m thinking, ‘you have got to be kidding me! Did you really just say that?’” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). This example perfectly summarizes the unnecessary questions that women are asked in a professional world.

Brava has complete respect for her professors but often times she was called ‘sweetie’ or ‘honey.’ “My DMA colleagues would never say that to them...because they were men” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). It is clear that women are asked different and often inappropriate questions in the collegiate band world. However, it is not only men who can present biased views of female band conductors.

### **Woman vs. Woman**

Two of the participants of this study experienced or witnessed bias from colleagues of the same sex. Missy is very adamant about not joining groups strictly for women. At a conference Missy heard some women say that they had just come out of their women's association meeting but were saying rude things about other women in their group that weren't there. Missy said, "it's like a sorority meeting just got out and they're over here bad-mouthing the people that aren't there" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Brittany has had personal experience about being held back in her profession due to another female colleague. While working at a university, Brittany was having trouble with the tenure process. Even though she was making progress with her ensembles and received excellent reviews from her students, she was constantly denied tenure. After receiving an opportunity to join a different university, Brittany learned through a colleague's wife that a female co-worker disliked her. Apparently, this woman felt threatened by Brittany. Brittany said, "I don't know if there is absolute truth behind that but it always seemed really crazy that I was having these negative reviews come back, especially in looking at my colleagues around the country who were doing less than me and having no problem in the tenure process" (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015).

### **Participant Bias**

One thing that became clear during these interviews is that everyone has some bias and sometimes we aren't even aware of it. During my interview with Missy she talked about her experiences watching and judging ensembles. If an ensemble that is directed by

a man is not prepared for the performance Missy says, “I hate it for the kids” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). However, if the ensemble is directed by a woman, “I’m mad at her because she makes the rest of us look bad” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Brittany admitted that she has never joined the women’s association for band directors because she was once told that the women in that group were not strong musicians. Brittany said, “I have a really biased view of this and I shouldn’t...but I do,” Brittany also said, “I should check it out and see what there is to offer and what could maybe be improved upon” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015).

Brava once participated in a study that looked at educators for bias. This study found that Brava had a positive bias towards males in general. “I learned a lot about myself and how I do things. I was very conscious after that. I was like, ‘OK, I picked a boy, now I have to pick a girl’ and then after a while it just became part of the way that I see things” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). Bias is natural but we should all take a lesson from Brava in that once we are aware of our bias we should address it and work to fix it.

The foundational experiences of the participants were quite diverse but each of the participants developed an interest in music at an early age. They also are professionally driven women, which is why they have gone as far as receiving their doctorates. Obviously there is a lot of progress that still needs to be made when it comes to gender bias. The experiences these women had are disheartening for young women interested in pursuing a career in this field.

## **Chapter 6 – Implications for Music Education**

Throughout this study we examined the experiences of the three participants and how role models influenced their career decisions. The participants also suggested valuable information on what measures could be taken to encourage more female band directors. Lucy Green (1997) wrote that music textbooks sent the wrong message to women interested in careers in music so this next chapter focuses on the opinions regarding role models for women and advice given by the participants for those interested in pursuing a career as a collegiate band director. This chapter also includes my own personal experiences related to the themes brought up in the previous chapter.

### **Personal Responsibility**

A major focus of previous research about women in the field of music, especially in the collegiate band world, was on the lack of female role models. This was a major topic in the research of Gould (1996), Grant (2000), and Hartley & Jagow (2007). The participants in this study are the role models for their students so this next section addresses their thoughts and opinions about that responsibility.

#### **Missy**

“I should be a role model for everybody wanting to be a band director” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Missy believes that it is not her responsibility to be a role model for just the women. Missy made the point that it is also part of her responsibility to be a positive influence and role model for the male students as well. She does hopes that she can be a good role model for women wanting to become band directors and has conducted at a summer music camp for girls.



When Missy recruits students to attend her university she says that she is recruiting everybody. “If I see a strong female musician than sure, I’m going to encourage her, but I’m going to encourage guys too” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Her focus is to find people that will be good in the profession and doesn’t think about gender.

Now that there are a few more female role models in the field, Missy believes that the numbers will increase. Thinking back to a time her local high school band came and performed at the elementary school she was attending, Missy saw a female clarinet player stand up to play a solo. Her thought at the time was, ‘Ooh, I want to do that.’ “I’m sure that if I had been sitting there as a 6<sup>th</sup> grader and the band director had been a female I probably would have wanted to do that even more” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Missy met with a prospective female music major who, while in high school, had played in the wind ensemble that Missy directed. “Maybe that’s part of her inspiration for doing that, who knows?” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Missy more specifically wants to be a role model for the women that are not reaching their full potential. “It grates on my nerves when a band comes out and plays and maybe they’re fundamentally not where they should be. If it’s a male director I hate if for the kids but if it’s a female director then I’m mad at her too” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Because of the bias against female band directors, if a female band director’s band is not prepared some people may think that it is because the director is a woman. “Dagonit, you need to be doing a better job to help make women look good in this field” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Another concern for Missy has is ‘proper attire’ for women directors. Missy discusses this in the classes she teaches and has been asked to present at conferences on the proper attire for both men and women conductors. “Guys can throw a tux on, it’s harder for women” (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

### *Brittany*

Brittany believes that you cannot help but be a role model. “I think being a role model doesn’t necessarily mean that you do anything differently” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). It is also important to note you also represent your gender whether you like it or not. “I can’t go in as a conductor and have it not be noticed that I’m female” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015). In regard to whether or not she has a professional responsibility to be a role model for young women, Brittany’s response was that it was not her original goal. Her first goal is to be at her best. However, she does believe it is also important to be a role model. “I think I’m a role model for the men as much as I am the women but you can’t help but identify with those female students” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015).

Due to her current position Brittany is unable to recruit conducting students. However, if she ever were in a position to do so, one of her goals would be to have a more diversified graduate population. Brittany makes sure to be supportive of the undergraduate women in the program. Her goal is to prepare her undergraduate women and ensure that they are just as strong and prepared as the undergraduate men.

While preparing to go through with a pregnancy in such a high profile situation, Brittany sought counsel from a colleague about her situation. This colleague was a female director who already had two children. The advice of her colleague was positive. She said

that having a child was going to enrich her life, and would also send a message to the next generation of female band conductors who want to have a family. “I hope I’m sending a message that you can be ambitious and you can have a successful career but if you choose to, it doesn’t mean that you have to not have a family outside of that” (Brittany, personal communication, March 6, 2015).

### **Brava**

While teaching high school band, Brava participated in a research group that studied the bias of educators. This study illuminated Brava regarding the bias she had against women. “I grew up Hispanic and Chinese, where the male is very dominant and so I was teaching that way. I had no clue” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). Brava became very aware of the students she chose to answer questions or play musical examples. She learned that after picking a boy then she had to pick a girl.

“If anyone ever tells you flat out that they want to be a role model, they don’t really understand what that means” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

While conducting an honor band, a young girl approached Brava and told her that Brava inspired her. The girl told Brava she never imagined becoming a conductor, but now that she witnessed Brava conducting and leading a band, the young girl saw that path for herself. “Even if you’re not thinking about it, all teachers are role models” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). Brava says that her focus is to be the best that she can be “just in case somebody repeats something that I say” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015).

### **Advice for the Future**

Each participant has built a very successful career in the collegiate band world. They crossed lines and broke barriers in a field mostly dominated by men. Therefore I thought it important that they share their advice for anyone interested in pursuing a career in collegiate band directing.

### **Missy**

Regardless of gender, Missy's advice to people pursuing this field was to be organized, take initiative, and "know that you're majoring in music, not band" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). She suggests that young professionals get advice early in their career by talking with older directors. With regards to women pursuing the field, Missy's advice to women is perseverance. If at some point you have an unsuccessful experience, either at a band festival or job interview, don't use your gender as an excuse (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

Missy also recommended not only joining the national band organizations but truly being involved. Missy is active on a couple of band committees and purposefully never joined the groups exclusively for women band directors. "I just don't think we should separate ourselves. By separating ourselves you're just creating more gender bias" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). Missy believed it is better for women to be active and equal to the men in national and local organizations so that we do not contribute to the gender gap.

There is another female director that started working in the collegiate band field around the same time as Missy. Missy said that she's doing clinics and moving up to larger universities and is just doing a lot of good work. "I'm proud of her just because she's taking it and running with it" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015). It

was during this time that Missy's humor was showcased. Her colleague has short hair like Missy, but Missy's responded, "She has a daintier figure though so people probably don't think she's a lesbian" (Missy, personal communication, March 3, 2015).

### **Brittany**

In order for there to no longer be gender bias in society Brittany believes there needs to be an increase in the number of women in highly visible roles. Brittany believes that it's beginning to happen. "I think our profession especially seems to have kind of taken on the view that Mallory Thompson is the one woman that is worth having anywhere" (Brittany, personal communication, May 6, 2015). Brittany goes on to explain that as talented as Mallory Thompson is, there are many talented women in the profession. Also, by understanding that there is more than one credible female in this profession, this understanding will help with the gender gap between male and female college band directors.

Brittany made remarks with regards to closing the gender gap in society. In one such remark she stated that if people had open minds about gender roles and what they could and should be, the gap could begin to close. Brittany then remarked on the European model for paternity leave. In Europe, men are allowed the same amount of leave time as women for the birth of their children. In Sweden 'maternal leave' was switched to 'parental leave' that is to be shared between the mother and the father (Wittenberg-Cox, 2015). The United States is the only "industrialized nation not to mandate paid leave for mothers of newborns" (Huffington Post, 2013). In general, Brittany believed that there definitely has been progress. She also believed that with younger generations there will be less of a gender gap. "So, being female in that role

could be pivotal in that you might change the way a young person thinks in gender biases” (Brittany, personal communication, May 6, 2015).

Regarding membership in women band director organizations, Brittany has experienced her own form of bias. When she was a younger conductor she advised against women’s organization. She was told that female music organizations were comprised of weaker musicians and that by joining this organization she risked being labeled a weaker musician. Brittany admits there is no basis of truth in this claim and is simply a bias. She feels she should check out the organization before making her decision. However, she also believes that the profession should all come together and avoid dividing between genders. “On one hand maybe I should be part of it to support the diversity but through CBDNA [College Band Directors National Association] I am trying to support the diversity” (Brittany, personal communication, May 6, 2015).

In general, Brittany’s advice for young female band conductors is to be the best you can be, and even if gender bias does emerge in professional life avoid dwelling on the issue. “You can’t view yourself as being necessary, important, employable, simply because of your gender. In fact, sometimes you might need to be even that much stronger” (Brittany, personal communication, May 6, 2015). Brittany suggests strengthening musicianship and to make sure that you are pursuing this career for what you believe are the right reasons. Whether you mean to or not, you will be influencing the students’ lives. “Men, women, whatever ethnicity, racial background they may come from, you’re going to be a pivotal figure in their lives” (Brittany, personal communication, May 6, 2015).

**Brava**

Since there has been an increase of women in collegiate band director positions Brava believes that these role models will help increase the numbers further. “I’d say there’s probably about 28 or 29 [women] out there that have an associate or director of bands job” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). When asked about removing gender bias from society altogether, Brava brought up a current issue that was in the news about a fraternity that was chanting racism (McLaughlin, 2015). Brava thinks that for bias to no longer exist, we need to obliterate ignorance. Even though she believes it will get better, Brava does think that some degree of gender bias is inevitable.

“Do what you love to do” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). Brava suggests that if conducting bands is the goal, then be tenacious and work hard. “It doesn’t matter if you’re male or female. You’re going to have to prove yourself anyway. So you might as well be so good that they forget what gender you are” (Brava, personal communication, March 9, 2015). In reference to women band director associations, Brava believes that membership is appropriate and more women should join these kinds of groups.

### **Personal Reflections**

The themes mentioned in chapter five are not exclusive to the participants in this study. In this next section I talk about experiences I have had that are similar to the experiences of the participants. As a female ‘Director of Bands’ in a city school district I was the subject of several assumptions as well as female competition.

#### **Assumptions**

Anna Penno (2013) wrote about the experiences of female jazz musicians and how they had to deal with the assumption that they could not play jazz as well as men could.

Missy was sardonic with regards to the assumptions people had about her. Many people made the assumption that just because she was a female band director with short hair and an athletic build, she must be a lesbian. Even though she told the story in a humorous way, an assumption like this can be hurtful because the label is made to feel like an accusation. While teaching high school, I experienced similar situations. At this time I had short hair and because I was not married there, rumors spread about my sexual orientation. One's sexual orientation bears no relationship to the strength of conducting ability or one's ability to lead or teach. Being unmarried and having short hair are pieces of demographic information and nothing more.

### **Women vs. Women**

Sometimes women can be just as biased against women as men. In Beth Macleod's article (1993) she writes about women not wanting other women to be allowed in the same orchestras as their husbands because they were afraid that these women would "lead their husbands astray" (Macleod, 1993, p. 297). During my student teaching internship, I experienced the competition that can arise between women in the same field. My cooperating teacher and I had very similar backgrounds. We both went to the same school for our bachelor's degrees, we both played French horn, and we did a double major in music education and music therapy. During my placement with this cooperating teacher, it was obvious that there was some competitiveness; if one of the male teachers cracked a joke and I laughed, she would laugh harder. Also, at 5 foot 10 inches the students would always comment on my height. After the sixth student commented on my height in a single class my cooperating teacher snapped at the students saying, 'I'm tall too, she's just skinnier than I am.' It was a very uncomfortable experience.



During this time, there was one male music teacher who worked part time who also caused some unintended ‘competition.’ After telling a joke I laughed. When my cooperating teacher heard me laugh she began to laugh harder. The reason this was especially uncomfortable was because of the power dynamic in this relationship; I wasn’t trying to compete with her but this rivalry got in the way of my learning process. How are women supposed to make their way to being equals in this world if we are constantly in competition with each other instead of supporting one another? This is something that I feel needs to change before any real progress can be made.

### **Final Thoughts**

Learning about the bias that these participants have experienced has been rather disheartening. It is disappointing that Brittany had to worry about having a baby as a wind conductor and that Brava could not open a bank account because the teller would only talk to her husband.

It is my hope that band directors read this study and become aware of their own biases and then address them. High school band directors have the responsibility to prepare all students for any musical career they wish to pursue without fear of gender bias. There shouldn’t be anymore students like Brittany who question going to school for music because they think that it is not a career for women.

However, there are significantly more women in positions of authority both in and out of the collegiate band world. Women still have a lot of work ahead of them in order to make themselves equal to men but in the end each of the participants said that they believe that things are slowly getting better and that we are on the right track.

## Resources

- Abeles, H. F., & Porter, S. Y. (1978). The sex-stereotyping of musical instruments. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 26, 65-75
- Atterbury, B.W. (1992). Old prejudices, new perceptions. *Music Educators Journal*, 78(7), 25-27.
- Brown Hinely, M. (1984). The Uphill Climb of Women in American Music: Performers and Teachers. *Music Educators Journal*, 70(8), 31-35. Retrieved December 28, 2015, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3400871>
- Conversations on Creative Leadership* [YouTube]. (2013). United States: George Washington University School of Business.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FNMXBkHFqNA>
- Eastern Kentucky University Women & Gender Studies. (2011, January 1). *What is Feminism?* Retrieved January 18, 2015, from <http://wgs.eku.edu/what-feminism-0>
- Eklund Koza, J. (1994). Females in 1988 Middle School Music Textbooks: An Analysis of Illustrations. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 42(2), 145-171. Retrieved December 28, 2014, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345498>.
- Erin, C. (2011, May 7). How Many Senators And Representatives Are There In Congress? Retrieved February 3, 2015, from <https://www.votetocracy.com/blog/how-many-senators-and-representatives-are-there-in-congress>

- Facts on Women in Congress 2015. (2015). Retrieved February 3, 2015, from [http://www.cawp.rutgers.edu/fast\\_facts/levels\\_of\\_office/Congress-CurrentFacts.php](http://www.cawp.rutgers.edu/fast_facts/levels_of_office/Congress-CurrentFacts.php)
- Freeman, S., Bourque, S., & Shelton, C. (Eds.). (2001). *Women on Power Leadership Redefined*. Boston: Northeastern University Press.
- Gay, L., Mills, G., & Airasian, P. (2009). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications* (9th ed.). Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Merrill/Prentice Hall.
- Gosfield, A. (2013, August 6). Confessions of a 'Composeres' *The New York Times*. Retrieved February 4, 2015, from <http://opinionator.blogs.nytimes.com/2013/08/06/confessions-of-a-composeres/>
- Gould, E. S. (1996). *Initial involvements and continuity of women college band directors: The presence of gender-specific occupational role models*. D.M.A. dissertation, University of Oregon.
- Gould, E. S. (2003). Cultural contexts of exclusion: Women college band directors. *Research and Issues in Music Education*, 1(1), Retrieved December 30, 2014, from <http://www.stthomas.edu/rimeonline/vol11/index.htm>
- Gould, E. S. (2005). Nomadic turns: Epistemology, experience, and women university band directors. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 13 (2), 147-165.
- Grant, D. E. (2000). *The impact of mentoring and gender-specific role models on women college band directors at four different career states*. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Minnesota.
- Green, L. (1997). *Music, Gender, Education*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Griswold, P.A. & Chroback, D.A. (1981). Sex-role associations of music instruments and occupations by gender and major. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 29(1), 57-62.
- Hadley, S. (2006). *Feminist perspectives in music therapy*. Gilsum, NH: Barcelona.
- Hall, K. (2013, February 4). Paid Parental Leave: U.S. vs. The World (INFOGRAPHIC). Retrieved April 3, 2015, from [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/02/04/maternity-leave-paid-parental-leave-\\_n\\_2617284.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/02/04/maternity-leave-paid-parental-leave-_n_2617284.html)
- Hartley, L. & Jagow, S. (2007). Past, current and future trends of the participation of gender and racial/ethnic minorities in band conducting.
- Hegg, S. (2015, January 29). Gender Gap on the Podium. Retrieved February 6, 2015, from <http://kcts9.org/programs/in-close/news/gender-gap-podium#.VMweF50ysbc.facebook>
- History.com Staff. (2010, January 1). 19th Amendment. Retrieved January 16, 2015, from <http://www.history.com/topics/womens-history/19th-amendment>
- Hodgson, A. (1999). Women Conductors - Why So Few? *Contemporary Review*, 275(1603), 77-77. Retrieved January 1, 2015, from <http://libproxy.unm.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=pwh&AN=2191439&site=eds-live&scope=site>
- Jackson, C. A. (1996). *The relationship between the imbalance of numbers of women and men college band conductors and the various issues that influence the career aspirations of women instrumental musicians*. Ph.D. dissertation, Michigan State University.

- Jagow, Shelley. (1998). Women Orchestral Conductors in America: The Struggle for Acceptance - An Historical View from the Nineteenth Century to the Present. *College Music Symposium*, 38, 126-145. Retrieved November 6, 2014, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdfplus/40374324.pdf?acceptTC=true&jpdConfirm=true>
- Jones, S. (2010). "Marching barbies": Influences of gender bias in three female high school band teachers. Masters thesis, Michigan State University.
- Kruse, A., Giebelhausen, R., Shouldice, H., & Ramsey, A. (2015). Male and Female Photographic Representation in 50 Years of Music Educators Journal. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 62(4), 485-500.
- Macleod, B.A. (1993). "Whence comes the lady tympanist?" Gender and instrumental musicians in America, 1853-1990. *Journal of Social History*, 27(2), 291-308.
- Maran, D. (2009). Leadership in Italian major symphony orchestra: Analysis of women careers on podium. *Gender and Behaviour*, 7(2), 2443-2456. Retrieved January 1, 2015, from [http://unm.worldcat.org/libproxy.unm.edu/title/leadership-in-italian-major-symphony-orchestra-analysis-of-women-careers-on-podium/oclc/4630575835&referer=brief\\_results](http://unm.worldcat.org/libproxy.unm.edu/title/leadership-in-italian-major-symphony-orchestra-analysis-of-women-careers-on-podium/oclc/4630575835&referer=brief_results)
- McElrath, K. (1992). Gender, Career Disruption, and Academic Rewards. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 63(3), 269-281. Retrieved January 31, 2015, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1982015>
- McLaughlin, E. (2015, March 10). 'Disgraceful' University of Oklahoma Fraternity Shuttered After Racist Chant. Retrieved April 2, 2015, from <http://www.cnn.com/2015/03/09/us/oklahoma-fraternity-chant/>

- Neuls-Bates, C. (Ed.). (1996). *Women in Music*. Boston: Northeastern University Press.
- Oliveros, P. & Maus, F. (1994). A conversation about feminism and music. *Perspectives of New Music*, 32 (2), 174-193.
- Osborne, S. (2001). *Feminism*. Harpenden, Herts: Pocket Essentials.
- Osborne, W. (1996, October 1). Art is Just and Excuse. Retrieved February 2, 2015, from <http://www.osborne-conant.org/excuse.htm>
- Payne, B. (1996). The gender gap: Women on music faculties in American colleges and universities 1993-1994. *College Music Symposium*, 36, 91-102.
- Penno, A. (2013). "As long as I get to be me": *The formative experiences of early career female jazz instrumentalists*. Masters thesis, Michigan State University.
- Pucciani, D. (1983). Sexism in Music Education: Survey of the Literature, 1972-1982. *Music Educators Journal*, 70(1), 49-71 73.
- Reimer, B. (1988). *A philosophy of music education* (2nd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall College Div.
- Rhode, D. (2007). *Women and Leadership* (B. Kellerman, Ed.). San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons.
- Scott, B., & Harrassowitz, C. (2004). Beyond Beethoven and the Boyz: Women's Music in Relation to History and Culture. *Music Educators Journal*, 90(4), 50-56.  
Retrieved December 28, 2014, from <http://mej.sagepub.com.libproxy.unm.edu/content/90/4/50>
- Tanur, J.M. & Zervoudakes, J. (1994). Gender and musical instruments: Winds of change? *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 42(1), 58-67.

- The Representation of Women in European and American Orchestras; Der Anteil an Frauen in europäischen und US-amerikanischen Orchestern. (2005, January 1). Retrieved February 2, 2015, from <http://www.osborne-conant.org/orchestras.htm>
- U.S. Department of Justice. (2014, December 31). *Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972*. Retrieved January 31, 2015, from <http://www.justice.gov/crt/about/cor/coord/titleix.php>.
- Wendel-Caraher, E. (1999). *Feeling Silenced as a Woman in Music Education*. Masters thesis, University of Western Ontario.
- Wittenberg-Cox, A. (2015, March 18). Parental Leave Can't Just Be for Mothers. Retrieved April 3, 2015, from <https://hbr.org/2015/03/parental-leave-cant-just-be-for-mothers>
- '*Women Don't Paint Very Well - It's a Fact*' [YouTube]. (2013). England: Southbank Centre. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=K29geX4uN9w>

## Appendix 1 – Interview Questions

### Introduction

-How you like to introduce yourself to others when someone wants to know more about you.

### Background

- What is your educational background? Undergrad/Graduate school
- What is your main instrument?
- What musical activities did you participate in while in high school?
- Did you grow up in a musical home?
- Were your parents/siblings involved in music?
- What did your parents do for a living?
- Why did you choose to become a band director?
- Who have been your role models in music/music education and how have they influenced you?
- When did you begin your musical training?

### Professional Life

- What is your current position title?
- What are your professional responsibilities?
- Do you have any outside responsibilities such as clinics, research, conducting engagements?
- Do you feel like gender bias has had an impact in your professional life?
- What obstacles have you encountered with students because of your gender?
- Are you ever referred to as Ms/Mrs. instead of Dr/Professor?
- Have you had experiences in which peers or administrators treated you differently (positive or negative) because of your gender?
- How do you relate to your peers? Do you have to talk/act differently around different peers?
- Do feel that a lack of female role models and mentors affected you?

### Future Women Collegiate Band Conductors

- How many women are currently enrolled in your institutions conducting class?
- Is there a conducting program at your school? If so how many women are in the program?
- Do you believe that it is part of your responsibility to be a role model for women interested in pursuing a career in the collegiate band field?
- Is there something you do as a professor to encourage more women to pursue careers in music or as conductors?
- Do you believe that now that there are female role models in the band-conducting world that the numbers will continue to increase?
- What do you think needs to happen in society in order for gender bias to no longer exist?
- What advice do you have for young women just starting out or wanting to pursue band teaching?



## Appendix 2 – Consent Form

I am requesting that you take part in a research study on the experiences of women conductors in the collegiate band world. I am requesting your participation because of your position as a professor and conductor in a collegiate band program. Please read this form carefully and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to take part in the study.

This study will look at the experiences of women conductors in the collegiate band world in regards to gender bias and inequality. As a participant you will be asked to be involved in 1-3 interviews about your personal experiences in music, your career, and your thoughts about how to improve the situation for the future. I do not anticipate any risks to you participating in this study other than those encountered in day-to-day life. There are no direct benefits to you as a participant. Your responses may increase awareness and support young women who aspire to become a collegiate band conductor.

Your answers will be confidential, in order to insure anonymity your names and places of work will be changed for this study. Only the researcher and the researcher's graduate thesis advisor will have access to your information. If you wish, you will be provided access to all findings of this research. Participation in this study is completely voluntary that you can stop participating at any time. If there are any questions during the interviews that you do not want to answer, you may skip it.

Please feel free to contact Courtney Jones with any questions before, during, or after your interviews. Feel free to contact Courtney Jones at [cjones6981@unm.edu](mailto:cjones6981@unm.edu) or 570-573-1130. You may also contact my thesis advisor, Robin Giebelhausen at [rgiebes@unm.edu](mailto:rgiebes@unm.edu) or 505-277-1959.

You will be given a copy of this form to keep for your records.

**Statement of Consent:** I have read the above information, and have received answers to any questions I asked. I consent to take part in this study.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

In addition to agreeing to participate, I also consent to having the interview recorded.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature of person obtaining consent: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_



DATE: April 20, 2015

REFERENCE #: 02315

PROJECT TITLE: [722884-1] The Experiences of Three Women Conductors in Collegiate Band Programs

PI OF RECORD: Robin Giebelhausen

SUBMISSION TYPE: New Project

BOARD DECISION: DETERMINATION OF EXEMPT STATUS

EFFECTIVE DATE: April 12, 2015

REVIEW CATEGORY: Exemption category #2

DOCUMENTS:

- Application Form - Project Info Sheet (UPDATED: 02/19/2015)
- Consent Form - Consent form.docx (UPDATED: 03/19/2015)
- CV/Resume - PI of record CV (UPDATED: 03/19/2015)
- CV/Resume - Curriculum Vitae.docx (UPDATED: 02/19/2015)
- Data Collection - Data Collection Tools.docx (UPDATED: 02/19/2015)
- Other - Departmental Review (UPDATED: 03/19/2015)
- Other - Project Team Packet (UPDATED: 02/19/2015)
- Protocol - Protocol.doc (UPDATED: 02/19/2015)

Thank you for your submission of New Project materials for this project. The University of New Mexico (UNM) IRB Main Campus has determined this project is EXEMPT FROM IRB REVIEW according to federal regulations. Because it has been granted exemption, this research project is not subject to continuing review. This determination applies only to the activities described in the submission and does not apply should any changes be made to these documents. If changes are being considered, it is the responsibility of the Principal Investigator to submit an amendment to this project for IRB review and receive IRB approval prior to implementing the changes. A change in the research may disqualify this research from the current review category.

Please use the appropriate reporting forms and procedures to request amendments for this project.

The Office of the IRB can be contacted through: mail at MSC02 1665, 1 University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, NM 87131-0001; phone at 505.277.2644; email at [irbmaincampus@unm.edu](mailto:irbmaincampus@unm.edu); or in-person at 1805 Sigma Chi Rd. NE, Albuquerque, NM 87106. You can also visit our website at [irb.unm.edu](http://irb.unm.edu).

Sincerely,

J. Scott Tonigan, PhD  
IRB Chair