

University of New Mexico
UNM Digital Repository

History ETDs

Electronic Theses and Dissertations

7-11-2013

Americanization, Language Policy, and the Promise of Education: Public School Formation and Educational Attainment in Albuquerque, New Mexico, and Nogales, Arizona, 1880-1942

Carlos Francisco Parra

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/hist_etds

Recommended Citation

Parra, Carlos Francisco. "Americanization, Language Policy, and the Promise of Education: Public School Formation and Educational Attainment in Albuquerque, New Mexico, and Nogales, Arizona, 1880-1942." (2013). https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/hist_etds/61

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Electronic Theses and Dissertations at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in History ETDs by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact disc@unm.edu.

Carlos Francisco Parra

Candidate

History

Department

This thesis is approved, and it is acceptable in quality and form for publication:

Approved by the Thesis Committee:

Linda B. Hall, Chairperson

Cathleen Cahill

Samuel Truett

**AMERICANIZATION, LANGUAGE POLICY, AND THE
PROMISE OF EDUCATION: PUBLIC SCHOOL FORMATION
AND EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT IN ALBUQUERQUE,
NEW MEXICO, AND NOGALES, ARIZONA, 1880-1942**

by

CARLOS FRANCISCO PARRA

**B.A., SECONDARY EDUCATION, UNIVERSITY OF
ARIZONA, 2009
M.A., HISTORY, UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO, 2013**

THESIS

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of

**Master of Arts
History**

The University of New Mexico
Albuquerque, New Mexico

May 2013

DEDICATION

Dedico ésta tesis de maestría a mis queridos abuelos, Francisca Bojórquez Saldívar y Francisco Saldívar Ruíz. Mi *nana* y *tata* han sido mi Estrella Polar a través de mis experiencias académicas y siguen siendo la fuente de mi inspiración profesional. Además de mis abuelos, dedico esta obra a mis padres, la Dra. María Atanasia Saldívar Parra y Carlos Parra, Jr., y a mi hermana Krystal Alexis Parra, quienes han sido mi más fuerte apoyo durante toda esta experiencia. Que la paz de Dios Todopoderoso los bendiga y proteja hoy y siempre.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank numerous individuals for their assistance in helping me craft this study on the sociocultural history of Hispanic youth and their teachers in Nogales and Albuquerque during the late 1800s and early 1900s. I would like to thank my committee members Professor Samuel Truett, Professor Cathleen Cahill, and my chair, Professor Linda Hall, for their dedication to helping me research, write, and revise my thesis investigation. Throughout all of my adventures in collecting the information for my study, my committee members were always my strongest supporters. My committee members built upon the foundation that my undergraduate mentors Dr. Kevin Gosner, Dr. Lydia Otero, Dr. Jadwiga Pieper-Mooney, and Dr. Katherine Morrissey established during my time at the University of Arizona when I initially began this research in the spring of 2009 under the auspices of the UA Ronald E. McNair Achievement Program. The high expectations that my advisors and mentors have held for me over the years have served to make my work as effective as possible, as well as to help me better develop into a scholar. I am also thankful for the help that Ms. Teresa Leal of the Pimeria Alta Historical Society in Nogales and the staff of the Arizona Historical Society in Tucson gave me during my long research hours. Additionally I am grateful for the assistance provided to me by the staff of the Arizona State Library, Archives, and Public Records (ASLAPR) in Phoenix and the University of New Mexico Center for Southwest Research. Finally, but not at all least, I am profoundly thankful for the unconditional support of my mother María, my father Carlos, my sister Krystal, and my *abuelos*. My family has been my

inspiration and my motivation throughout all of my adventures in building this work –
without them none of this would have been possible or worthwhile.

**Americanization, Language Policy, and the Promise of Education: Public
School Formation and Educational Attainment in Albuquerque, New
Mexico, and Nogales, Arizona, 1880-1942**

By

Carlos Francisco Parra

B.A., Secondary Education, University of Arizona, 2009

M.A., History, University of New Mexico, 2013

ABSTRACT

This study analyzes the nature of identity formation discourses and processes in terms of race, gender, citizenship, and educational attainment at the turn of the twentieth century in the communities of Nogales, Arizona, and Albuquerque, New Mexico. This study articulates the labyrinthine nature of the lived experiences of Hispanics with respect to how externally-imposed ideas of social interaction manifested themselves in these borderlands communities.

One of the themes of this work is the analysis of the role of early public schools in their effort to create a cohesive identity among their diverse students. In this analysis significant questions relating to identity come to the forefront. For example, how similar were the social interactions among different groups in these border towns with respect to the social interactions in other contemporary cities in

the U.S. Southwest region? What types of nationalist discourses accompanied the formation of early schools in Nogales and throughout the greater borderlands region? The effects of these discourses on the educational attainment of Hispanic students in Nogales and Albuquerque are examined and reveal low levels of high school graduation among Hispanic students when these graduation rates are compared to demographic statistics in their two cities.

This study explains the sociohistorical context of the formation of these cities' public schools in addition to exploring how Americanization shaped the educational attainment of Hispanic students therein from the 1890s until the early 1940s. This study also comments on the overall contradictions of the intercultural exchanges seen throughout the greater U.S.-Mexico borderlands region. Many complex factors played a role in the educational outcomes of the students considered in this investigation, but the Americanization rhetoric reflected in school pedagogies (and the general absence of Hispanic educators/role models) helped bring about the low educational attainment of Hispanic students.

This study primarily relies on primary source documents, including oral histories, available through archival sources in Nogales and Albuquerque, as well as elsewhere in Arizona and New Mexico. This study seeks to contribute to the discussion of the history of the education and citizenship identity of Mexican Americans in the borderlands.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1 – Introduction

Historical Problem of Identity Formation in the Borderlands	1
Methodology	7

Chapter 2 – Sociopolitical Context of Americanization and Cultural Assimilation in Arizona and New Mexico During the Latter 1800s

Introduction	10
Experiences With Education in New Mexico and Arizona Prior to 1880	12
Important Events Affecting Education in Arizona and Nogales 1860-1890	34
Conclusion	46

Chapter 3: Cultural Politics, Gender, and Educational Attainment in an Arizona-Sonora Border Town Community: Nogales 1880-1942

Introduction	48
Turn of the Century Historical Context and Background	51
Conditions of Early Schools in Nogales, Arizona	56
Nogales Students and Educational Attainment: Results of Americanization	69
Gender and Cultural Roles of Nogales Teachers	84

Conclusion	90
------------	----

Chapter 4 – Culture in Early Albuquerque Public Schools: Language Policy, Americanization, Educational Attainment, and Teachers 1879-1942

Introduction	95
--------------	----

The Albuquerque Academy 1879-1891	97
-----------------------------------	----

Students and Educational Attainment in the Albuquerque Public Schools 1891-1942	113
---	-----

The Social Position of Teachers in APS and in the North-Central New Mexico Region	130
---	-----

Conclusion	144
------------	-----

Chapter 5 – Study Conclusions

Review of Main Questions	149
--------------------------	-----

Forming the Institution of Public Schools in Arizona and New Mexico	153
---	-----

Americanization in the Public Schools of Nogales and Albuquerque	155
--	-----

Gender and Culture Among Teachers	160
-----------------------------------	-----

Final Conclusion	163
------------------	-----

Bibliography	167
---------------------	------------

Chapter 1 – Introduction

Historical Problem of Identity Formation in the Borderlands

In her celebrated book, *Borderlands/La Frontera: The Mestiza*, Gloria Anzaldúa wrote, “Like all people, we perceive the version of reality that our culture communicates.” Elaborating further, she wrote “Like others having or living in more than one culture, we get multiple, often opposing messages. The coming together of two self-consistent but habitually incomparable frames of reference causes *un choque*, a cultural collision.”¹ Anzaldúa’s quote vividly captures the ambiguities, dualities, and contradictions that define life in the U.S.-Mexico borderlands. Writing as a native of the U.S.-Mexico *zona fronteriza*, Anzaldúa’s articulation of the problems that border residents (particularly Mexican Americans) face when constructing their identity speaks to the historical questions that necessarily emerge when one analyzes the histories of the borderlands.

Speaking of the U.S.-Mexico borderlands in a broad sense, one may see the larger geographic zone where the different sociocultural norms and expectations of the peoples of the United States and Mexico come into *choque* as the de-facto borderlands of cross-cultural interchange. Depending on the period one is discussing, the zone of *choque* may move from point to point in a rather fluid style, though within the transnational context of human and cultural movements across legal boundaries at the outset of the new

1. Gloria Anzaldúa, *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza* (San Francisco, CA: Aunt Lute Press, 1987), 78.

millennium, the points of *choque* may very well take place far “inland” from the actual political borders of nation states. In this transnationalist discourse, the Lower West Side in Chicago is in essence just as much of a borderland or point of *choque* as McAllen, Texas. For the analytical purposes of this study, the geographic focus of this intercultural *choque* is narrowed down to include only Arizona and New Mexico, and the cultural focus of that *choque* is centered on the identity-formation processes and discourses associated with public education during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The history of the formation of public education in the border city of Nogales, Arizona, and the city of Albuquerque, New Mexico, a community more distant from the border, but with deep historical, cultural, and economic ties to Northern Mexico, demonstrates how the establishing of public schooling in these border towns took place within a sociocultural context in which the *choque* dynamics expressed by Anzaldúa were vividly manifest during the late 1800s and early 1900s.

This study seeks to determine and analyze the nature of identity formation discourses in terms of cultural, gender, and citizenship identities and their effect on educational attainment in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century in the communities of Nogales, Arizona, and Albuquerque, New Mexico. Specifically, the goal of this Master’s Thesis is to articulate the labyrinthine nature of expectations and lived experiences with respect to how externally-imposed ideas (from the national level) of social interaction manifested themselves in these borderlands communities.

In this sense, one of the strong themes of this work will be to analyze the role of early public schools in Nogales and Albuquerque in their effort to create a cohesive identity among their diverse Anglo and Hispanic students. The turn of the century project

of creating a strong U.S. identity among ethnic-minorities in the U.S. was known as Americanization and it was plainly evident in the borderlands schools considered in this study. In this analysis, significant questions relating to identity come to the forefront. For example, how similar were the social interactions among different groups in these border towns with respect to the social interactions in other contemporary cities in the U.S. Southwest region? What types of nationalist discourses accompanied the formation of early schools in Nogales and throughout the greater borderlands region? Besides considering the values of these discourses and their sociohistorical contexts, the effects of these discourses on the educational attainment of Hispanic students at Nogales and Albuquerque High Schools will be closely examined. What impact did the discourse of Americanization have on impressionable Hispanic students at this time? How might graduation lists from Nogales and Albuquerque High Schools help in answering this question?²

In addition, this study delves into the gender roles that were played out by the teachers in these schools in order to better understand the dynamics of gender relations

2. A wide variety of nomenclature exists regarding how to refer to persons of Spanish or Mexican ancestry. In this study, the term “Hispanic” is used in the broadest and is utilized as an identifier for persons of Spanish or Mexican ancestry regardless of their nationality, citizenship, or place of origin. “Mexican” is also used broadly in this study to refer to persons of Mexican ancestry, although when appropriate, the word “national” is added to specify the individual’s national origin. “Mexican American” is used specifically to refer to individuals of Mexican ancestry who were also U.S. citizens. “Hispana/o” and “*nuevomexicana/o*,” terms used by many researchers to refer to Hispanic persons specifically from New Mexico, are used in this study to specifically refer to New Mexican Hispanics. The commonalities between these identifiers are considerable (particularly when one considers that New Mexican Hispanics have ethnic and cultural roots in Mexico), but often it is necessary to distinguish between them by using more specific identifiers.

during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Although separated by hundreds of miles, the histories of education in Nogales and Albuquerque can both trace their roots to the hard work done by women as teachers. What can the history of the formation of public education reveal about the gender roles for educators at the time? How did service in the education sector – memorialized by historian Nancy Hoffman as “woman’s true profession” during the nineteenth century – promise opportunities for women during a time in which women were extremely restricted in terms of their professional aspirations? Did the early public schools of this borderlands region instead reinforce many of the same social patterns prevalent in the U.S. eastern states? Also, what was the role of female teachers in reproducing “mainstream” U.S. notions about culture and identity?

This research is aimed at explaining the sociohistorical context of the formation of the public schools in Albuquerque and Nogales in addition to exploring how the nationalist discourse about Americanism and Americanization shaped the educational attainment of Hispanic, Mexican-heritage students in the schools of those two communities from the 1890s until the early 1940s. In analyzing these themes, this study comments on the overall consistencies and contradictions of the intercultural exchanges seen throughout the greater U.S.-Mexico borderlands region. Many complex factors played a role in the educational outcomes of the students considered in this investigation, but amid the national rhetoric on identity and Americanization reflected in school pedagogies and the general absence of Hispanic educators/role models, the low educational attainment of Hispanic students was very much a reflection of the sociohistorical moment in which they lived at the turn of the twentieth century.

A variety of sources will be used to reconstruct the historical time period this study seeks to analyze. For the most part, it relies mostly on primary source documents available through archival sources in Nogales and Albuquerque as well as elsewhere in Arizona and New Mexico. Another aspect of this study seeks to utilize new oral histories conducted by the study author in order to complement and enhance the narrative extracted from the extant primary documents available in archival repositories. Prior work pertaining to this study has been based on oral history collections detailing the experiences of female teachers and their students at the beginning of the twentieth century in Nogales and greater Southern Arizona, as well as Central New Mexico with its main focus on Albuquerque.

While this study cannot claim to speak for the entire U.S.-Mexico borderlands region, it is hoped that the consideration of the two axis points this study will help promote discussion on patterns across the region. Nogales and Albuquerque are sufficiently different at the beginning of the twenty-first century that a direct comparison might appear to be a bit ill-suited. Albuquerque grew significantly enough during the period with which this study is concerned that it soon became the largest community in the state, while Nogales – a port of entry – lagged far behind Tucson and Phoenix. The immigration of families from the eastern U.S. to Albuquerque brought unto this city demographic and cultural changes that Nogales, a community directly on the Mexican border, did not have to face.

To be sure, the historical and economic development of the two communities is very different, but in their intrinsic differences and similarities the rationale for comparing them becomes evident. Though the communities were (and still are) very

different from one another, during the period in question both had very sizeable Hispanic populations. The Hispanic citizens of these cities were so many in number that they were not a small minority, so much as simply a bit fewer in number than Anglo and other European-heritage residents. However, the demographic changes that came upon Albuquerque in particular after the end of the Second World War makes a larger comparison after the early 1940s problematic. Therefore, this study will focus on the time period beginning with the formation of the early public schools in Nogales and Albuquerque in the 1880s and will conclude in 1942 at the very outset of the Second World War, prior to the demographic changes that significantly diminished the Hispanic aspect of Albuquerque's community identity. As this study will reveal, the similarities between an English-language learner attending an elementary school in Nogales and a Spanish-speaking student attending the Albuquerque Academy were more evident than the obvious differences in location.

By looking at both the contrasts and similarities between the experiences of Hispanic students in Nogales and Albuquerque, a larger story about public education and educational attainment history in Arizona and New Mexico, during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries can be reconstructed. It is in this sense that a historical analysis of education in the Grand Canyon State and the Land of Enchantment can serve as a point of departure for a broader regional discussion on the history of education throughout the U.S.-Mexico borderlands and the interaction of Hispanics in that system during this period in question.

Normalizing patterns experienced in Progressive-Era U.S. schools such as Americanization (with all of its rhetorical and physical manifestations) will be closely

examined in order to determine how these phenomena operated in the region of study. By combining a variety of primary documents and numerous secondary sources, this study will articulate the transnational complexities, ambiguities, and contradictions inherent in developing an individual *and* a collective identity among the various social and ethnic groups that lived in the borderlands during the early 1900s.

As can be seen in this discussion of the questions this study is aimed at answering, many topics and themes can be addressed. More and more it is becoming evident that the true challenge for this project will be to articulate the intersectionality of nationalist discourse (Americanization), race, gender, and the borderlands when contemplating the nature of the formation of schools in the borderlands community. The questions and themes raised here form a key component of this study on how schools in the border community of Nogales, Arizona, and the city of Albuquerque, New Mexico, formed racial, gender, and citizenship identities in the early twentieth century. Through archival work, oral history collecting, and exhaustive treatment of the existing literature on identity in the borderlands it is hoped that this still rather obscure but truly dynamic history can be reconstructed. In investigating and articulating the histories of these communities it is hoped that a more holistic, nuanced, and dynamic picture of the heritage of the borderlands can be presented – and perhaps force us to reconsider old assumptions and raise new questions.

Methodology

This thesis project began with an extensive search for primary documents pertaining to the lives of educators, students, families, and community members. Primary

source documents found in archival repositories in Arizona and New Mexico, such as the Pimería Alta Historical Society's Ada EKey Jones papers and oral history, the University of New Mexico's "And Gladly Did We Teach" project, and the UNM Center for Southwest Research's Charles Elkanah Hodgkin papers, serve as the foundation for this study. The latter collection, the Hodgkin papers, includes a notebook kept by the first superintendent of the Albuquerque Public Schools during the very first school-year in which APS operated after New Mexico passed funding and organizational legislation for public schools in 1891. In addition to these principal sources, this study makes use of information available in the Arizona State Library, Archives and Public Records (ASLAPR) repository in Phoenix, Arizona, and the New Mexico Library, Archives and Records Center in Santa Fe, New Mexico.

This thesis research is aimed at problematizing a variety of historical questions pertaining to the establishment of schools in the U.S.-Mexico borderlands. The geographic focus of this study in two distinct communities in the U.S.-Mexico border region gives this research an already complicated edge because of the rigidity *and* fluidity (an intentionally contradictory statement) of cultural norms and accommodations in this region. As indicated in the borderlands historiography of frontier regions across the globe, articulations of national/ethnic identities are constantly in flux at the meeting places of different cultural and politicoeconomic boundaries.³ Analyzing the establishing of public

3. Countless examples of the fluidity of identity in border regions exist, but some of the most notable works on identity formation in border zones include Richard White's seminal *The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650-1815*, (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1991), to James Scott's *The Art of Not Being Governed: An Anarchist History of Upland Southeast Asia*, (New

education in the borderlands vis-à-vis issues such as minority education, national politics, and racial/gender history adds another layer of nuance to each of these topics because of the unique realities of the U.S.-Mexico border zone.

Critical analysis of the epic story of identity formation in Nogales, Arizona, and Albuquerque, New Mexico, is a necessity in order to better appreciate the various individuals who made these borderlands communities what they are today. By studying the experiences of the students, teachers, and community members involved in turn of the century schools in these borderlands communities during a time when Americanization discourse was at new heights, the similarities, contrasts, contradictions, and incongruities of the complicated nature of identity formation in the borderlands and the greater U.S. Southwest will become manifest. This study vividly illustrates Anzaldúa's idea of a *choque* between cultures when it comes to the history of early public education in the borderlands through the comparative analysis of Nogales (Southern Arizona) and Albuquerque (North-Central New Mexico) educational histories. With all this in place, my research adds one more piece to the dazzling puzzle that is the vibrant mosaic of the sociocultural history of the U.S.-Mexico borderlands.

Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2010), and Kate Brown's discussion of changing nationalities, ethnicities, and individual identities in the Ukrainian-Polish-Russian border in *A Biography of No Place: From Ethnic Borderland to Soviet Heartland*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005).

Chapter 2 – Sociopolitical Context of Americanization and Cultural Assimilation in Arizona and New Mexico During the Latter 1800s

Introduction

With the ratification of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, the United States gained control of the territory that by 1912 would comprise the states of New Mexico and Arizona. The large area of land between Texas in the east and the Colorado River along the California boundary to the west was organized as the Territory of New Mexico. Even though the population of the large territory was large enough to merit statehood under the Northwest Ordinance of 1787, the U.S. Congress declined New Mexico's solicitation for statehood during the deliberations that saw the Antebellum-era's so-called Compromise of 1850. Though New Mexico's statehood bid was denied, California, still in the midst of its legendary Gold Rush, was elevated from territory to a state in the Compromise. Although both territories had only been part of the U.S. body politic for a very brief time, the influx of Anglo American settlers and miners into California during the Gold Rush gave the prospective Golden State not only the necessary population to successfully request statehood but it also gave the U.S. Congress the sense that California, which only three years prior had been a remote northern Mexican province, was sufficiently Americanized to merit full inclusion into the Union. This optimistic outlook did not apply to New Mexico or to Arizona.

For the next sixty-two years New Mexico – and after 1863, the separated Territory of Arizona also – would petition the federal government to gain statehood. As will be seen, one of the biggest challenges that political leaders in these two western territories

faced was convincing eastern U.S. politicians that the two territories were sufficiently developed economically, politically, and perhaps most important of all, socially and to be fully worthy of elevation to statehood. Though the two entities succeeded in their statehood goal in early 1912, the lingering suspicions about New Mexico and Arizona not being quite sufficiently American remained. As will be seen, the tensions resulting from the Mexican Revolution and World War I greatly impacted how American identity was constructed in the border community of Nogales. In Albuquerque, the effects of the 1848 U.S. incorporation of New Mexico as a territory began to be felt as the cultural assimilation of Hispanic families into “mainstream” U.S. society was evident in the growing importance of English instruction and the slow, gradual decline of Spanish proficiency in the Land of Enchantment. Despite the variations experienced between these two communities, the role of early public schools in relaying Americanism discourse, with all of its effects, in these two cities cannot be underestimated.

There are many facets to this historical odyssey lived between New Mexico and Arizona, two separate, but intertwined territories in their mutual struggle to achieve admission into the Union as well in the onset of the cultural drift that resulted from statehood. This chapter presents a base for the discussion of this issue of Americanization in order to establish the sociohistorical context of the Americanization practices in Albuquerque and Nogales schools during the turn of the twentieth century.

Americanization, as defined by contemporary writers and political commentators, will be evaluated amid the rhetoric that was used to shut out Arizona and New Mexico from statehood during the latter 1800s. The historical backdrop for the establishing of public

schools in New Mexico and Arizona will be established so as to promote a clearer comparative analysis between the two communities.

Experiences With Education in New Mexico and Arizona Prior to 1880

The Territory of New Mexico's unsuccessful statehood petition in 1850 was a tremendous disappointment for many political leaders in the former northern Mexican territory. For better or worse, residents of New Mexico, particularly the territory's long-time Mexican-heritage inhabitants, were seen as unworthy of full U.S. citizenship, by not yet being ready for inclusion in the Union as a fully-coequal state along with the already established states, that were almost all east of the Mississippi River. In preparing for statehood, New Mexico political leaders sought to essentially Americanize the territory through the assimilation of Hispanic residents as well as by increasing the immigration of whites into the territory. The U.S. economic penetration of New Mexico and Arizona during the early 1880s helped change the demographic and political status quo of these two territories and thus promoted better integration with the larger U.S. nation. However, it was in the area of public education that the two territories, particularly New Mexico, sought to better Americanize themselves. Thus public education arrived in New Mexico as part of movements encouraging the closer political and sociocultural integration of the United States in the latter nineteenth century.

Before further discussing the historical development of education within the region that would later form the U.S. states of Arizona and New Mexico, it is necessary to analyze what exactly Americanism and its associated policy of Americanization entailed during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries in order to fully understand the

significance of this discourse on the formation of schools systems. During the latter half of the nineteenth century, the United States experienced demographic changes brought upon the country by its territorial expansion and immigration from Europe. The large-scale arrival of immigrants from foreign lands caused many political commentators to try to determine what aspects of the U.S. society were essential to the national character and the country's identity.

During the animated discussions pertaining determining what U.S. national identity, or Americanism, consisted of, many writers and politicians suggested that the true strength of the American people stemmed from the national unity that led to the westward expansion and subsequent settlement of the western half of the continent. Many of these same commentators urged that the newly arriving immigrants and all ethnic U.S. residents adopt the common national identity of all, loosely identified as "Americanism," as well as their common language – English. In essence, persons who were of diverse background had to become "Americanized" in order to find their place within the greater body politic. This Americanization assimilationist rhetoric of Americanization and its ideology, Americanism, grew in popularity and credibility towards the end of the nineteenth century and had as one of its most prolific proponents Theodore Roosevelt.

In a series of essays published in 1900, the then-Vice President reflected the thoughts of many U.S. commentators of the latter half of the nineteenth century as he evaluated the role and purpose of Americanism. Reflecting specifically on the westward expansion of the nineteenth century, Theodore Roosevelt argued that all residents of the U.S. should strive toward a singular nationalism because of "the fact that the same flag flies from the Great Lakes to the Rio Grande, and all the people of the United States are

richer because there are one people and not many, because they belong to one great nation and not to a contemptible knot of struggling nationalities.”¹ Focusing on immigrants, Roosevelt exhorted his countrymen that they “must Americanize them in every way, in speech, in political ideas and principles,” and further commented “we do not wish German-Americans and Irish-Americans who figure as such in our social and political life; we only want Americans, and, provided they are such, we do not care whether they are of native or of Irish, or of German ancestry.” How would this Americanization be accomplished? Roosevelt wrote that “we stand unalterably in favor of the public-school system in its entirety. We believe that English and no other language is that in which all the school exercises should be conducted.”²

Roosevelt’s comments reflected the general perception of what constituted Americanism at the time. His comments heralded the coming problems that different communities in the U.S. would face during the early twentieth century as the

1. Theodore Roosevelt, “American Ideals” in *American Ideals and Other Essays, Social and Political* (New York: G.P. Putnam’s and Sons, 1900), 28. While the language-acquisition pedagogies that sought to replace Spanish with English did not always produce positive results, they existed as an aspect of the larger Americanism nationalist discourse gaining momentum in the United States at the time. Pushed in part by anxiety over the growing diversity of the United States resulting from the “century of immigration” from Europe in the nineteenth century, many U.S. political, business, and educational leaders called for the Americanization of immigrants and other non-white groups such as American Indians into mainstream U.S. nationalist discourse and civic identity. Beyond English-language proficiency, Americanism called for the adoption of Protestant, white, middle-class social mores and cultural values within an expression of patriotism that placed the U.S. before any other country. See also Leroy G. Dorsey, *We Are All Americans, Pure and Simple: Theodore Roosevelt and the Myth of Americanism* (Tuscaloosa, AL: University of Alabama Press, 2007), 16.

2. Roosevelt, “True Americanism” in *American Ideals*, 62-63.

conceptualization and manifestations of U.S civic and national identity gradually became more monolithic. As will be examined here, this discourse of Americanism deeply affected the statehood prospects of mostly-non-white New Mexico at a time when most New Mexicans were American Indians or Hispanic residents; Arizona, for its part, faced many of the same problems and scrutiny from eastern politicians as it underwent its own Americanization after it was separated from the original New Mexico Territory in 1863. Besides simply furthering their economic development, the political leaders of the Arizona and New Mexico Territories had to submit their residents to a lengthy period of Americanization in order to demonstrate their readiness to be prospective states in the Union.

The arrival of free public education in Arizona and New Mexico reflected the growing importance that education held before the body politic in the U.S. of the latter 1800s. The slow formation of public education policy in the U.S. coalesced gradually over time mainly in the U.S. Northeast. Based on visions held by Puritan leaders that desired for their children to be proficient in reading, the Massachusetts Bay Colony passed the Ye Old Deluder Satan Law in 1647 in an attempt to educate youth in the ability to read the sacred scriptures through the formation of town schools. The decree applied to towns of at least fifty students and made the communities responsible for educating their own youth.³ As time went on, the mission of education often reflected the larger shifts accompanying the formation of the United States.

3. Patricia Anthony, "Public Monies for Private Schools: The Supreme Court's Changing Approach," *Journal of Education Finance* 12, no. 4 (1987), 592-605. William

Following the rhetoric of men like Thomas Jefferson and others, policy-makers sought to keep the revolutionary republican spirit alive via public education. In Massachusetts the first distinctively public schools in the U.S., known as common schools, emerged within the context of the aforementioned Puritan religious spirit, though with the passage of time these schools combined the rhetoric of the early U.S. republic into their mission. Horace Mann, the noted Massachusetts educational advocate of the early nineteenth century wrote “never will wisdom preside in the halls of legislation,...and its profound utterances be recorded on the pages of the statute book, until Common Schools...shall create a far-reaching intelligence and a purer morality than has ever existed among the communities of men.”⁴ Thus the rationale for the emerging public school system was founded upon the principle of a free and appropriate public education reaching all members of the community, as the vitality of the democratic institutions of the United States depended on it. The permanence of a free, quality public education was not a settled affair in Massachusetts and the rest of the northeastern states until the middle of nineteenth century, by which point education advocates had convinced enough of the public about the value of investing in a system of education for all community residents. It should be noted that at that time the emphasis on the Bible as a medium of instruction, as well as sectarian religious instruction, in public schools had been lessened in lieu of teaching what Mann described as “broad religious principles common to all Christian

Hayes, *Horace Mann's Vision of the Public Schools: Is It Still Relevant?* (Toronto: Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2006), 1-5.

4. Hayes, *Horace Mann's Vision*, 20-21.

denominations.”⁵ The ostensibly non-sectarian, yet still Christian, moral education inherent in the public schools of the nineteenth century would serve as a major source of contention between Protestants and Catholics in starting up public schools in New Mexico. Nevertheless, in time the unique educational heritage of the old colonies of Massachusetts and other northeastern states spread westward across the Midwest, into the Rockies, and into New Mexico and the rest of the Southwest.

Prior to the arrival of U.S. rule, public education in New Mexico was very limited, though certainly present in the territory. Education historians John B. Mondragón and Ernest S. Stapleton cite the missionary schools of Fray Juan de Padilla and Fray Luis de Escalona as the first instance of formal western-style education in New Mexico. Both Franciscan friars stayed behind after Francisco Vásquez de Coronado’s 1540-1542 expedition into the area; both teachers were killed by angry indigenous men unhappy with their educational exploits.⁶ In 1721, following the re-establishment of Spanish rule following the Pueblo Revolt, the Spanish crown decreed the Franciscan Order would manage public schools for Pueblo Indians and Hispanic settlers in the territory with the payment for teachers emanating from “*los pesos de la tierra*”, that is, livestock and crops given to them by their communities. Private schools catering to *nuevomexicanos* who could afford it rose in towns like Albuquerque, Santa Fe, and Taos, but by the close of the Spanish period in 1812 local leaders “made a pathetic picture of the sad condition in

5. Hayes, *Horace Mann’s Vision*, 25-26, 29-31.

6. John B. Mondragón and Ernest B. Stapleton, *Public Education in New Mexico* (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2005), 3.

which educational matters were in New Mexico, and pled for royal support to educate the youth of the ‘forsaken province.’”⁷ Moreover, Mondragón and Stapleton attribute the slow development of schooling systems in New Mexico to the area’s poverty and distance from colonial centers and note “cornfields and crops were not enough to sustain schools and schoolmasters.”⁸

Following Mexican Independence in 1821, impetus for establishing a better educational system in New Mexico grew. In 1822 the provincial assembly in New Mexico established a law calling on local towns and villages to collect funds for the operation of schools; only six communities acted with regards to this legislation. At the onset of the U.S. period the territory’s sole public school was located in Santa Fe.⁹ Consequently, members of the Catholic clergy such as Padre José Antonio Martínez took the initiative. Padre Martínez’s college in Taos, opened in 1835, prepared many of the region’s young men for important positions in society – although well-to-do families had the option of sending their sons to schools in Mexico proper or to the eastern terminus of the recently-opened Santa Fe Trail in St. Louis, Missouri. The church’s preeminence in the educational matter bears witness to the spirit of the times in New Mexico. As two

7. Benjamin M. Read, “Education and its Relations with the Discovery, Conquest and Civilization of New Mexico. The Minister of God and the Teacher” (lecture, New Mexico Educational Association, Santa Fe, NM, November 15, 1911), 12.

8. Mondragón and Stapleton, *Public Education in New Mexico*, 7.

9. Read, “Education,” 13.

New Mexican historians have summed up the times, “Education in New Mexico during the Mexican period was primarily Catholic education.”¹⁰

Arizona, a geopolitical entity established only after the beginning of U.S. rule, largely lacked even the rudimentary level of education available in Mexican-era Nuevo Mexico. Spanish- and Mexican-era settlement of the future state of Arizona for the most part was reduced to a scattering of Catholic mission churches founded for the Tohono O’odham peoples of the Santa Cruz River Valley in Southern Arizona as well as the presence of a few isolated ranches located near rivers, almost all located in what is today the southern portion of Arizona. Mexican rule during the early 1800s essentially ended at the south bank of the Gila River, with all lands south of it administered under the State of Sonora, based in Hermosillo. Mining prospects and the possibility for ranching made far northern Sonora an attractive location, but the almost unending violence between Hispanic settlers and Apache warriors from the various nearby Apache bands made colonization of the area extremely dangerous. With economic development of the region largely impeded, most Hispanic settlers grouped together within the adobe walls of the Presidio de Tucson, Sonora, located along the banks of the Santa Cruz River.

The case of Tucson, the only Hispanic town in northern Sonora after the abandonment of during the early years of Mexican Independence, is emblematic of the situation seen in the region during the early half of the 1800s. The isolation and poverty of *los tucsonenses* was evident from the report of José de Zúñiga, a Spanish colonial-era military captain in 1804. Reflecting on the community’s conditions, Zúñiga wrote “We

10. Mondragón and Stapleton, *Public Education in New Mexico*, 9.

have no gold, silver, iron, lead, tin, quicksilver, copper mines, or marble quarries.” In fact, the only public work of real note in the small community of approximately 500 Hispanic settlers was the mission church at San Xavier del Bac south of Tucson along the Santa Cruz River.¹¹

Considering the circumstances in neighboring areas in Sonora proper and in Nuevo México, it is most likely that what little access to education existed was mostly within the confines of the local church. Further, the economic isolation of the small Sonoran presidio permeated all aspects of life, including the its military preparedness. During the invasions of U.S. forces during the U.S.-Mexico War, the Mexican garrison in Tucson was so small in number and so poorly-equipped that it let General Stephen Kearney’s Army of the West pass unmolested as it marched towards southern California alongside the Gila River in 1846. Later in December 1846, another group of U.S. troops, the Mormon Battalion, marched through northern Sonora. Outnumbered, the presidio commander ordered a temporary retreat from the city as the Mormon Battalion entered, bartered goods with the scared *tucsonenses*, and then left peacefully towards California to join the other U.S. forces there.¹² Faced with difficult living conditions resulting from its economic isolation during the mid-nineteenth century, the few educational institutions in Tucson and elsewhere throughout the area that would someday comprise Arizona were extremely difficult to establish and sustain. Even after future Arizona was annexed to the

11. Thomas Sheridan, *Arizona: A History* (Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona Press, 1995), 37-38.

12. Sheridan, *Arizona: A History*, 49-52.

U.S. Territory of New Mexico following the 1848 Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo and the 1853 Gadsden Purchase, the area's educational conditions would not change until the more populated Rio Grande area of New Mexico experienced some degree of integration into the U.S.

Much changed following New Mexico's annexation to the United States in 1848, but much remained the same. Owing to New Mexico's remoteness and distance from more developed urban centers to the east, the first common schools in the territory opened under the auspices of various Protestant denominations, initiating a gradual transformation of the territory's sociocultural setting that sought to better incorporate New Mexico into the larger nation-state of which it now formed a part. Baptist preachers arrived first and set up schools followed by the Methodists, the Presbyterians, and other Protestant denominations, but many of these early schools closed due to a serious lack of funding and the defensive actions of Catholic leaders.¹³ These early common schools taught basic reading, writing, and arithmetic skills in addition to imparting their specific sectarian tenets of faith, though in time many New Mexico leaders began calling for non-sectarian public education. The citizens of New Mexico would have to work to establish public schools in the territory on their own in the absence of concerted federal efforts to form public schools in the future forty-seventh state. It was in this long-lasting absence of taxpayer-funded public schools – an absence lasting forty-three years – that religious schools fulfilled the educational needs of the community.

13. Mondragón and Stapleton, *Public Education in New Mexico*, 16.

Despite the clear enthusiasm exhibited for Hispanic students in Protestant schools on the part of school administrators, the Catholic Church reacted in its own way to these advances. Archbishop Jean-Baptiste Lamy, the notable French clergyman who transformed many of the traditional Mexican traditions of Catholic observance in early U.S.-administered New Mexico, was significant in the opening of common schools in Santa Fe itself. In 1851, a response to the numerous factors bringing gradual cultural change to long-isolated New Mexico, Lamy “conducted a school for boys in his own home” and also opened an English-language school in Santa Fe that was available to the public at large. Lamy’s educational policies also promoted the formation of other schools with the help of the Sisters of Loretto, who opened their convent in Santa Fe in 1853. The Sisters of Loretto were followed by other religious groups who established schools serving the public such as New Mexico’s oldest charter college, St. Michael’s College in Santa Fe, now known as Santa Fe University of Art and Design. The archbishop considered these moves in support of education necessary in order to protect Catholic New Mexicans from “ignorance, prejudice, self-interest, and passion” characteristic of the anti-Catholic sentiments popular in many parts of the U.S. at the time.¹⁴ It is also important to note that Archbishop Lamy presided over an ecclesiastical see that included not only New Mexico proper but also Southern Arizona prior to the establishment of the

14. Dianna Everett, “The Public School Debate in New Mexico: 1850-1891,” *Arizona and the West* 26, no. 2 (1984), 108-109; Read. 17. St. Michael’s College was then renamed the College of Santa Fe from 1966 until 2010. For more information on the Catholic Church’s troubles in dealing with rising nativism in the eastern U.S., please consult Ward M. McAfee, *Religion, Race, and Reconstruction: The Public School in the Politics of the 1870s* (New York, NY: State University of New York Press, 1998).

Diocese of Tucson in 1897. The vast territorial scope of his ecclesiastical see made Lamy and his successors' comments about public education access relevant for both Albuquerque and Nogales.

Though these long-standing institutions served the public, they were not public schools in the sense that taxpayers funded them, nor did these schools serve an exclusively secular purpose: repeatedly, the Church sought to pre-empt the formation of a public school system in the territory by forming its own sectarian educational institutions. It's extensive educational efforts under Lamy were as much an attempt to hamper the successes of Protestant educators and missionaries as to present a progressive vision for underdeveloped New Mexico. As education historian Dianna Everett has documented, "from 1850 to 1891, the Territory of New Mexico was a battleground where Anglo-American Protestants and Native New Mexican Catholics fought over the issue of public education."¹⁵

Although the Catholic Church could often demonstrate an expansive vision in regards to the education question in the Land of Enchantment, its position gave it a considerable amount of power from which it could open or restrict access to education for devout Catholic observers. On numerous occasions the Church warned *nuevomexicanos* to avoid the worldly depravities found in the territory's burgeoning Protestant-denomination schools. During one Lenten season message in 1884, Archbishop Lamy went so far as to order the diocese's priests to "refuse the sacraments to all those who

15. Everett, "Public School Debate," 107.

prefer to educate their children in schools other than that of their proper religion.”¹⁶

Beyond threatening to bar devout Catholics from the sacraments if they enrolled their children in public school, the Church played a visible role in Santa Fe among legislators as well. In frequent debates before the territorial legislature over proposals to form a public school system, Catholic clerics cited the differences between the ethnic groups of New Mexico as a rationale for opposing the ostensibly non-sectarian program of public schools. “Be Mexican,” the Jesuit priest Donato Maria Gasparri admonished his flock and friends in the legislature, “let your policy be union in all that may be necessary for the development of the inherent interest of the country.” Gasparri, with the help of Lamy, put forth the idea that public schools diminished “parental authority over their children and suppressed the rights of families and communities to freedom of religion.”¹⁷ Moreover, the archbishop exhorted his fellow Catholics to decline sending their children to public schools and instead to allow Anglo New Mexicans to continue with their “godless schools and leave us in quiet with ours.”¹⁸

The arguments laid forth by Archbishop Lamy and Father Gasparri vividly illustrate the problems associated with education in nineteenth century education in New Mexico – namely that public education represented the Americanization (i.e., Protestant evangelizing) of Catholic *nuevomexicanos*. While many Hispanic families might not have agreed with the conclusions reached by the Catholic Church (as evidenced in the interest of many Hispanic families in sending their children to public schools in Arizona and New

16. Everett, “Public School Debate,” 126.

17. *Ibid.*, 119-120.

Mexico once they were available), the notion that public education equated with a transformation of one's identity was clearly laid out in the discourses surrounding the issue of education in New Mexico. While the literature for this topic with respect to Hispanic communities in Arizona during the early days of the Arizona Territory is very sparse, it is likely that some aspects of this debate also made it into discussions among Mexican families as to whether or not to send their children to schools when it was a viable option to attend school in rural Arizona. Though not always as evident as Father Gasparri's exhortation for devout Catholics to "be Mexican", it is clear that public education and Americanization went in hand and were seen as such by some contemporary observers.

For their part, Protestant proponents of schools considered the Catholic Church an institution that only intensified the "misery" of Catholic *nuevomexicanos*. "It appeals to their fears, enshrouds them in superstitions, stimulates feelings of dread and awe, and offers nothing to their spirit of inquiry," wrote Lyman Hood of the Congregationalist New West Educational Commission. After criticizing the backwardness of Hispanic New Mexicans in general, Hood homed in on the attack on the Catholic Church's social position in the territory. "Nor is it strange that under such unnatural conditions vices thrive, ignorance perpetuates itself, the spirit of progress is unattainable, and people stand in the way of their own prosperity. It will only be when the teacher and the school shall share with the priest and the Church the care of the young in New Mexico that better conditions will prevail, a truer life be attained, and the people become a worthy and

18. Everett, "Public School Debate," 124.

helpful portion of American society.”¹⁹ At least as far as groups like the New West Educational Commission were concerned, Catholicism stood in the way of the social and material development of the peoples of New Mexico. Hood’s suggestion that a public education would make *nuevomexicanos* into a more “worthy and helpful portion of American society” implies that Catholics in New Mexico – or in other words Hispanic New Mexicans – were not yet a genuine part of the larger U.S. community.

The Catholic Church’s strong opposition to public financing of public schools and compulsory attendance therein was a complicated issue. The Church’s position ranged from outright opposition to public schools that they believed would have been exclusively Protestant to opinions in favor of public support for education so long as it was divided between non-sectarian and Catholic schools. Perhaps the latter position was understandable. After all, as the respected education historian Joel Spring has written, “public schools in the United States in the 19th century were dominated by Protestant religious values.” Many Catholic leaders, like Lamy, wanted an alternative, and, given the ubiquitous presence of overt Protestant religious values in the emerging U.S. schools funded by all taxpayers, it is not a stretch to consider why Catholic groups wanted public funds to support their own schools (as will be discussed shortly, some New Mexico Catholic schools managed to receive some public funding by the close of the nineteenth century). Combined with increased immigration of Catholic groups into the U.S., the eventual public funding of Catholic parochial schools was a cause of much strife in many

19. Edmund Lyman Hood, *The New West Commission 1880-1893* (Jacksonville, FL: H. and W. B. Drew Company, 1905), 77.

U.S. cities in the mid-nineteenth century.²⁰ Considering the passions aroused by such debates in the U.S. east coast it is understandable that a similar drama would play in New Mexico, an area with far stronger Catholic roots than most of the urban centers where Catholic education was an issue.

Jean-Baptiste Salpointe, Archbishop Lamy's successor after 1885, argued that non-sectarian public education was merely a euphemism for Protestant teachings, and that religious liberty could best be supported if Catholic schools were also funded by public dollars. The new Archbishop of the Archdiocese of Santa Fe wrote "The whole work of education is a failure if it neglects to lead man to his creator."²¹

One further episode illustrates the nature of how intertwined Catholicism was with New Mexican identity at the time when many political leaders instead sought a more Americanizing school system for the territory. According to Mondragón and Stapleton, in 1878, Jesuit priest Donato Maria Gasparri wielded enough influence with the legislature that he was able to convince members to vote twice (once over the governor's veto) to grant the Society of Jesus the rights of a corporation as well as "general powers to establish educational institutions throughout the territory, as well as the right to own an indefinite amount of property, all forever free from taxation." The Jesuit Incorporation Bill was voided by the U.S. Congress the next year. One Protestant supporter of public

20. Hayes, *Horace Mann's Vision*, 31-33.

21. Everett, "Public School Debate," 129-131.

education, and an ardent opponent of Gasparri's ultimately unsuccessful bill, slammed the Jesuits for enjoying "a good fat living for a return of very poor service."²²

The Protestant-Catholic debate in New Mexico continued on with vituperations launched between the two camps as the question of the Americanization ideology appeared in the public debate.²³ In 1884, as the New Mexico territorial legislature passed legislation creating county superintendents of education (later abolished in favor of district-level superintendents), the *Las Vegas Daily Gazette* called on New Mexicans to support serious efforts at forming public schools. The *Daily Gazette's* non-Catholic Anglo editors stated the territory's "prosperity and well-being depend as much on the education of her youth as upon the development of her mines and the protection of her herds." The paper admonished recalcitrant opponents that having a public education system would entice the immigration of "eastern people" hailing from the "better circles of society" who would not accept their children growing to "manhood and womanhood in a country where that flimsy apology for the public school – the private and sectarian school – must be relied on for their education."²⁴ According to this view, New Mexico could only move forward and attract *better* elements of society – Anglo easterners – if it provided an ostensibly non-sectarian (non-Catholic) and Americanized education for all residents.

22. Everett, "Public School Debate," 119-122.

23. Mondragón and Stapleton, *Public Education in New Mexico*, 20-21.

24. Editorial, *Las Vegas Daily Gazette*, March 7, 1884.

Finally, with the passage of a law in 1891 granting school districts tax-levying power, public schools were provided with a strong funding mechanism, though Catholic clergy and religious orders still taught actively in public schools, receiving public funds for their labor. The New Mexico Supreme Court decision in the 1951 case *Zeller v. Huff* at last ended this long-running debate by banning religious orders from teaching religion with public funds during school hours.²⁵

The struggles over religious tradition played out in both the public and private spheres of New Mexican life. The effects of this interdenominational struggle could be seen as late as the early twentieth century, at which point the tension caused by this issue had vanished from the political sphere, but not quite so much from the private sphere of individual *nuevomexicano* reckoning of society and religion. Archbishop Salpointe's dire warning that public schools were "in reality either sectarian, non-religious, godless, or agnostic" continued to have an impact.²⁶ Mary Sanchez, an early teacher and principal in APS and other New Mexico schools, recalled the conflict her devout Catholic mother felt when she began attending a Protestant school in Albuquerque during the 1910s. "My mother thought she could never accept me going to a non-Catholic [school]" Sanchez recalled. Mary's father convinced her mother to talk to the local priest, who said that there was no problem in Mary going to a non-Catholic school on weekdays. But just to be

25. Everett, "Public Education Debate," 134. See also Jacobo D. Baca, "To Preach and Teach: The Dixon Case and Catholic Education in New Mexico," (M.A. Thesis, University of New Mexico, 2006).

26. Howard R. Lamar, *The Far Southwest, 1846-1912: A Territorial History* (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2000), 163.

safe, Mary's mother took no chances. "And you should have seen my mom, on Saturdays I had to pray the rosary."²⁷

Taking Mary Sanchez's experience into consideration, one can only speculate as to how often and how successfully the Church's influence could impel believers to avoid the influences of Protestant schools and the territory's emerging public schools. In this case the Church itself was not working to discourage Mary's education so much as it was the beliefs Mary's mother held. Mary's mother, who grew up in the heat of the Hispanic Catholic versus Americanizing Protestant public schools debate, feared the possibility that she might not be a good Catholic mother if she simply allowed her daughter to attend a Protestant school. Clearly many Hispanic families in territorial New Mexico did take seriously the Church's warnings and comments regarding public education such as Archbishop Salpointe's aforementioned condemnation of public schools as "godless or agnostic" institutions. Depending on how New Mexico schools were constituted, they could often be seen by more traditional *nuevomexicanos* as dangerous subversive elements that could serve to brainwash children and make them forget their religion, language, and culture.

The conflict that Mary Sanchez faced played out during a time when issues of Americanization, statehood, and cultural drift were important aspects of life in Arizona and New Mexico. Particularly in the case of the latter territory, forging a public school system throughout was a politically- and culturally-charged affair. Yet in 1911 Benjamin

27. Mary Sanchez, interview by Gonzales-Berry, March 20, 1992, transcript, Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project, Center for Southwest Research, General Library, University of New Mexico.

Read, a biracial Anglo and Hispano historian of New Mexican history, declared before the New Mexico Educational Association that throughout the territory's history "our people displayed a patriotism worthy of all praise by taxing themselves as they had done before, in order to organize a system of public schools." Despite Read's praise for the educational system established in New Mexico, the reality of the history of education in the Land of Enchantment was hardly as inspirational as he implied when one considers the controversy that consistently impeded the passage of legislation allowing the funding of public school districts before 1891. Even the issue of New Mexicans' collective "patriotism" is open for scrutiny when one considers the different patriotisms present in the Hispanic Catholic versus White Protestant debate concerning the very establishment of schools in New Mexico. The fact that writers like Lyman Hood of the New West Educational Commission could separate *nuevomexicanos* from more "worthy and helpful" Americans on the basis of their religion and position on the educational question also challenges Read's assertion that all New Mexicans were united in patriotic solidarity on the topic of public education. The formation of public in education in New Mexico, like the formation of a common "patriotism" or U.S. identity, was by no means a foregone conclusion at the time.

Although numerous factors played into this debate depending on who was concerned – be it territorial legislators seeking to enact laws to better develop and integrate Arizona and New Mexico into the larger U.S. or whether it was among individual families torn between the possibility for their children's cultural drift/assimilation and the promise of education – it is evident that competing notions of

patriotism, identity, and culture profoundly affected how school systems in the borderlands were established and maintained.

The aim of promoting English proficiency in schools in the Land of Enchantment (and the accompanying cultural implications that brought) was profoundly related to the territorial political leaders' quest for statehood. As seen in the history of the pre-public school era Albuquerque Academy, teaching English was always a priority in schools in early U.S.-administered New Mexico, but the territory's youth – and their families – were still seen as subpar by eastern politicians who considered the area excessively foreign and unprepared for statehood. One congressional committee in 1888 dismissed New Mexico's solicitation for statehood precisely because of the limited effects of education achieved by that point; historian Phillip B. Gonzales described the committee as unimpressed with a people that the congressmen considered “illiterate, superstitious, morally decadent, and indifferent to statehood.”²⁸

The passage of fourteen years' time apparently did not produce sociocultural changes significant enough for eastern congressmen to take a different stance on New Mexico's quest for statehood. The Beveridge Report – named for the subcommittee's titular figure, Senator Albert Beveridge of Indiana – declared that in New Mexico among the majority population (Hispanics) “practically all speak Spanish in the affairs of daily life, and the majority speak nothing but Spanish.” A demographic shift on the part of Anglo Americans, the report elaborated, would lead to “modifying work with the

28. Phillip B. Gonzales, “Las Juntas de Indignación: Hispano Repertoire of Collective Protest in New Mexico: 1884-1933” *The Western Historical Quarterly* 31, no. 2 (2000), 168.

‘Mexican’ element” to the point that “this mass of people, unlike us in race, language, and social customs, will finally come to form a creditable portion of American citizenship.”²⁹ English language acquisition in the territory’s children was crucial to solving the “educational problem in New Mexico” as well the key to full incorporation into the union.³⁰

In the turn of the century mindset of men like Beveridge and other Americanizers, New Mexico needed to first assimilate culturally in order to enjoy the benefits of full union with the U.S. body politic. Thus it can be understood why there was a prevalence of a curriculum that stressed English-acquisition and an imparting of middle-class U.S. values. As will be seen, the identity-forming themes which riddled the curriculum of study and the so-called “hidden” curriculum of school events like the Washington’s Birthday and Columbus Day pageants practiced in early Albuquerque Public Schools and the English-acquisition policies of the Nogales Unified School District sought to link the identity-building rhetoric of the day to actual day-to-day pedagogies and educational practices. These goals and the practices set up to achieve them can be understood as evidence of the policies which sought not only to instill a local “patriotism” or national identity among students in borderlands cities but also to better link these borderlands to mainstream U.S. society.

29. Gonzales, “Las Juntas de Indignación,” 169-170.

30. Lamar, *The Far Southwest*, 13; New Mexico Special Revenue Commission. *Report on the New Mexico Educational Institutions to the New Mexico Special Revenue Commission* (Santa Fe, NM: Santa Fe New Mexico Publishing Corporation, 1921), 14.

Important Events Affecting Education in Arizona and Nogales 1860-1890

It is now necessary to turn towards the formative events in educational history in Southern Arizona in general and Nogales specifically. The twin cities of Nogales, Arizona, and Nogales, Sonora –affectionately known as Ambos (or “both”) Nogales – were founded at a time of the growing economic importance of northwestern Mexico. Located in a natural pass surrounded by tall hills, Nogales not only offered a direct railroad route between the United States and Mexico, but also the revenue derived from customs houses that charged duties on the import and export of commercial goods.

Mexican President Porfirio Díaz bowed to the requests of Sonoran entrepreneurs on August 2, 1880, when he authorized the installation of a customs agency near the U.S. border. José Vásquez became the first permanent resident of the nascent Sonoran bordertown, while Jacob Isaacson opened a small trading post on the Arizona side. Thus Ambos Nogales was born. The New Mexico and Arizona Railroad arrived in 1882, connecting the border cities to their respective national economies. Citizens of the two Nogales developed their twin cities into an important trade center that, in time, became the most important crossing along the Arizona-Sonora portion of the international border. By 1920, Nogales, Sonora, boasted a population of about 3,865, while 5,119 people lived in neighboring Nogales, Arizona.³¹

Despite the two cities being divided between two countries, the border during the early twentieth century existed as more of a legalistic formality than an actual physical

31. Adalberto Monarque Alvarez, “Estudio cronizado del periodo 1916-1920” (H. Nogales, Sonora, Mexico: typescript, n.d.), 1; *Fourteenth Census of the United States – State Compendium – Arizona*. (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1924), 13.

barrier. Indeed, prior to the aftermath of a lengthy battle between Mexican civilians and U.S. army troops on the afternoon of August 27, 1918, no permanent physical fence or other barrier in Nogales existed to control the flow of human traffic between the U.S. and Mexico. The August 27 incident, known as the Battle of Ambos Nogales, was a one-day battle triggered by a Mexican border crosser, a carpenter named Zerefino Gil Lamadrid, who entered Mexico without being inspected by U.S. customs officials who then adamantly demanded that he return for inspection (this during a time in which the U.S. government wished to prevent smuggling of arms and food into Mexico in the midst of the Mexican Revolution). After a brief shouting match, a border guard (whether it was a Mexican or U.S. guard is unknown) fired a shot in the air and the Mexican border crosser dropped to the floor. Although he was actually unharmed, the Mexican guards believed that Gil Lamadrid had been shot and fired at the U.S. guards.

Zeferino Gil Lamadrid ran from the scene, but word quickly spread around the town as Mexican *nogalense* civilians ran into the streets with their firearms and fired into the U.S. Although overlooked in the limited U.S. historiography on the incident, the residents of the Mexican border town were angry at the lack of justice that took place when U.S. troops killed two Mexican border crossers in Nogales without any consequences in the year before the August 27 incident. Over the course of the battle U.S. army troops invaded Nogales, Sonora, exchanged fire with the armed civilians, and killed Mayor Félix Peñaloza (who had entered the crossfire in an attempt to stop the fighting) before agreeing to a temporary armistice prior to holding talks between high-level U.S. and Mexican military officials. As a result of the 1918 Battle of Ambos Nogales, the two respective national governments agreed to raise a small fence between the two cities as a

means of preventing smuggling, thus bringing an end to the open border in Nogales.

Nevertheless, prior to the hardening of the border between the two Nogales, all one had to do was cross a wide boulevard named International Street and one would enter into a different country. During this time, the only indication that International Street was actually a political boundary between two different countries was the presence of a binational border marker, the obelisk-shaped Boundary Monument 122.³²

The early twentieth century open manifestation of the border in Ambos Nogales – more a legal abstraction than an intimidating, monolithic, and visible reality – served as a sort of personification of the ambiguity of living in a border community. Over the course of the 1910s and 1920s this ambiguous border would slowly begin to take the shape most individuals now associate it with – a soaring fence emphatically demarcating the limits of Mexico and the United States, encapsulated in discourses of state control – but during the time that Boundary Monument 122 was unobstructed, the notions of identity and citizenship on either side of the marker were also notable for their relative level of fluidity. During the 1910s the physical international line itself hardened and became more monolithic. This decade saw the outbreak of the Mexican Revolution, Arizona statehood (and thus greater integration into the U.S. geobody), and the anxieties over the First World War. Unsurprisingly, the situation for Mexican American students in the early schools of Nogales also changed. Like the border itself, notions of identity in this border

32. Carlos Francisco Parra, “Valientes Nogalenses: The 1918 Battle Between the U.S. and Mexico that Transformed Ambos Nogales,” *Journal of Arizona History* 51, no. 1 (Spring 2010), 1-32.

town also hardened and the ability to simultaneously exist in a North American and a Mexican space became harder in practice and in discourse.

Americanization in Arizona was a significant force as this territory struggled to establish the institutions necessary for it to achieve statehood. Although the early school system in Arizona – and in Nogales specifically – is only one institution amid a complex web of social, economic, and political institutions that underwent different forms of Americanization during this time, the Americanizing of the school system vividly demonstrated the changing nature of the social composition of Arizona.

Although an act of the U.S. Congress established Arizona as a territory in its own right in February 1863, it was not until the 1870s that public schools in the new territory began to be formed. The first public schools in Arizona opened in 1871 in Tucson after local business leaders, led in part by Esteban Ochoa, organized Tucson School District #1 – Arizona’s first district – and established the first free public school in the territory.³³ Reflective of the early realities in territorial Tucson, most of the city’s early school supplies were shipped in from Hermosillo, Sonora.³⁴ Based on the population demographics of Tucson and the memoirs of early teachers, it is most likely that most of the students were of Mexican heritage. By the close of the 1870s the early schooling system, typically staffed by instructors who were not professional teachers (and who in

33. Ida Carter, “Rise of the Public Schools of Tucson: 1867-1936” (M.A. thesis, University of Arizona, 1937), 5.

34. *Ibid.*, 3, 8. Arizona’s early schools, in addition to depending largely on supplies from Mexico, also relied greatly on donations, such as those given by political leaders like Governor Anson P.K. Safford.

fact held other regular jobs), had succeeded in establishing themselves in the territory and soon more public schools were opened throughout Southern Arizona and the rest of the territory.³⁵

At first the use of Spanish as a language of instruction was not a controversial matter, particularly in Arizona's original schoolhouse in Tucson. The teacher at that early school, John Spring, recalled many years later that despite the stated wishes of the school district's board of trustees, instruction only in English would not have been an effective use of time or resources. Mr. Spring recognized the need to separate nationalist concerns from educational pedagogy and consequently engaged his Mexican American students as best he could given his own Spanish skills.³⁶ Besides demonstrating a pedagogical approach that later scholars such as George I. Sánchez of Albuquerque would explain was more effective in promoting student learning than the more prevalent English-language immersion model, Mr. Spring's flexibility showed the flexibility that marked life in the borderlands during the latter 1800s before identities and borders became more rigid.³⁷

Schools throughout the rest of Arizona, including Nogales, also had to deal with the realities of the linguistic gulf that sometimes existed between teachers and their

35. Carter, "Rise of the Public Schools of Tucson," 15.

36. The transfer of conceptual knowledge from one language to another has been carefully studied by Jim Cummins, leading to the formulation of his Common Underlying Proficiency Model of Bilingual Proficiency. See Cummins, *Negotiating Identities: Education for Empowerment in a Diverse Society* (Ontario, CA: California Association for Bilingual Education, 1996), 109-111.

37. George I. Sánchez, *Concerning Segregation of Spanish-Speaking Children in the Public Schools*. (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1951), 37.

students. When the first schools in Nogales opened during the 1880s, large class sizes numbering nearly sixty students defined the composition of the first classes. While not everyone might have comprehended English at the basic level, the dominance of Spanish in this border town made Spanish a type of *lingua franca* from which one could engage the less English-proficient students. While this is not to say that early Nogales schools, especially at the lower elementary levels, enjoyed full bilingual education, the usage of Spanish because it was simply a necessity echoed the experience not only of John Spring's bilingual Tucson classroom but also a greater acceptance of the ambiguity of the realities of the Arizona-Sonora/U.S.-Mexico border.

With the passage of time, examples of bilingual classrooms (even if these classrooms were of a more rudimentary nature) gradually faded away into memory in Southern Arizona. With the influx of Anglo immigrants into Tucson and the nascent city of Phoenix after the arrival of the railroads, inter-ethnic relations changed. Whereas before different visions of interrelated patriotisms marked life in the Arizona-Sonora borderlands, especially in communities like Tucson where Anglos were the minority until the arrival of the train, by the end of the nineteenth century visions of U.S. citizenship and national identity had so thoroughly changed that Spanish had at last come to be seen as a foreign language. In Nogales and elsewhere in the area the bilingual classrooms of early school days were replaced with separate language-proficiency classrooms where students were immersed into the English language. Noteworthy in this analysis is the fact that even as the border between the U.S. and Mexico became more defined, there were also, as evidenced in Theodore Roosevelt's writings, changes in the larger national rhetoric which by then stressed a more coherent and singular national identity defined by values of

Americanism. As will be seen in the following chapter, students in Nogales schools fully experienced the problems associated with this nationalist spirit when they faced policies of forced Americanization at school.

By the time that the First World War concluded, the spirit of Americanization was vividly evident in Nogales schools as Spanish was fully transformed into the language of the “Other” and mainstream instruction became an exclusively English affair. Although in New Mexico the long historical presence of Hispanic residents and the influence of the Catholic Church mitigated some aspects of Americanization during the infancy of public education in New Mexico, in Southern Arizona the lack of a strong numerical presence of Mexican-heritage residents as manifested in well-established civil and religious institutions allowed for the more abrupt disruption of the transmission of Mexican cultural and language identity between different generations. The segregation of limited English-proficient students in Nogales schools into English-immersion classrooms where English literacy and U.S. citizenship and white middle-class values were emphasized further illustrates the lessening flexibility along the border.

In addition to the identity-formation policies being enacted in the pedagogies of Nogales schools, many other agents of cultural change were at work in this border community. Besides the Anglicization of Hispanic names among many Nogales schoolchildren, many children who spoke Spanish on school grounds were physically punished for doing so by school staff. Despite the fact that Spanish was the lingua franca in this border community, schools in Nogales punished children for speaking Spanish at school. Indeed, by the time the U.S. entered the First World War, previously unencumbered border crossers between the two Nogales had to present a valid passport in

order to cross the line; this change brought about many problems in the daily lives of Ambos Nogales borderlanders. These Americanizing changes truly were indicative of an Anzalduan *choque* in Nogales and throughout Southern Arizona

In Nogales students of Mexican ancestry bore the brunt of the Americanization rhetoric more than any other group, but the community's significant population of African American schoolchildren also underwent some of the issues associated with hardening identities in the borderlands. For all of the problems that Mexican American students in Nogales experienced by being placed into segregated language classrooms, they all attended the same schools as Anglo children. All of the African American children of Nogales under the high school level were forced to attend classes in the community's only segregated school.

Whereas many Mexican American students faced a de facto form of segregation through language-tracking classes, African American students confronted de jure segregation in Nogales, Arizona, based on their race. This separation demonstrated the other facet of Americanization – the propagation of racial hierarchies and separate spaces. Although almost completely forgotten by the predominantly-Hispanic Nogales community by the beginning of the new millennium, Nogales, Arizona, formerly was the home of two different troop units belonging to the Tenth Cavalry and the Twenty-Fifth Infantry, units whose enlisted men were comprised entirely of African Americans. Stationed in the border town to protect it from spillover violence associated with the Mexican Revolution, these Black units – remembered in historical as the “Buffalo Soldiers” from the days of their participation in the American Indian wars of the latter

1800s – were tasked with fulfilling their duty to their country yet prevented from dining in certain Nogales restaurants as well being segregated into their own schools.

Under Arizona state law, a school district could open a separate school for African American students once there were twenty-five African Americans registered within the district, though high schools were exempted from mandatory segregation of their students on this basis, mostly because it was felt it would be too costly for segregated communities to raise funds for high schools “just” for their African American adolescents.³⁸ The law also stated that it was the responsibility of school boards to “segregate pupils of the African race from the Caucasian race” and to “provide all accommodations made necessary by such segregation.”³⁹ There were not enough African American pupils in Nogales to justify a separate high school exclusively for them, but in 1924 the Nogales School District opened the Grand Avenue School, an institution that exclusively served African American children in the elementary grade levels for the better part of the next thirty years.

The Grand Avenue School, referred to as “the colored school” by Nogalians, was the city’s only segregated school for African American schoolchildren, a reality that further illustrated the intensity and complexity of race, ethnicity, and culture in this border community as non-local visions of race were transplanted into Nogales by the

38. Powers, “Mexican American School Segregation,” 470.

39. Herman Robert Lucero, “Plessy to Brown: Education of Mexican Americans in Arizona Public Schools during the Era of Segregation” (Ph.D. diss, University of Arizona, 2005), 60.

effects of Americanization.⁴⁰ On a daily basis African American elementary school-aged children had to walk past closer schools on their way to their separate campus along the main road to Tucson; the students were by no means oblivious to their ostracized condition in the community.⁴¹ Administrator Doris Bynon McGuire recalled that the younger students “seemed fairly well adjusted, but the older ones felt the strain of segregation.” Although Nogales High School was not segregated, McGuire pointed out, the African Americans’ “segregation in the elementary grades would suffice to set them apart when they reached High School.”⁴² The fathers of these children swore an oath to defend the United States, but their own children were not allowed to attend the same schools that the other residents of Nogales did.

The renaming of Nogales’s segregated school prior to its final closure in 1952 artfully demonstrated the deep problems of the community’s inconsistencies and complex identity conflicts (and also reflected the larger incongruities associated with Americanization and identity development throughout the larger U.S.-Mexico borderlands). In 1943 the Grand Avenue School was renamed in honor of Frank Reed, an ostensibly African American alumnus of the school and the first resident of Santa Cruz

40. Bynon McGuire, “Desegregation of the Nogales Schools,” AHS.

41. Once at school, the Nogales community’s African American students were educated by three teachers, including the school principal; Mrs. Lena Martin was a teacher and principal at the school for the entirety of the institution’s existence.

42. Bynon McGuire, “Desegregation of the Nogales Schools,” AHS; Miller, interview, AHS.

County to die participating in World War II. Strangely, the late Frank Reed was not African American at all.

Though he was of full Mexican descent, Frank was considered black by the community because of his mother's marriage to a black soldier from Camp Little. Frank's mother, a native of Hermosillo, Sonora, was a single mother until Chester Reed married her. Chester Reed's marriage to Frank's mother was reflective of his options during a time when a prohibition against miscegenation between whites and African Americans was the law under the 1912 Arizona Constitution.⁴³ Chester Reed cared for his wife's son as his own and gave Frank his surname. Mexican women who married blacks in Nogales were known as "negradas," and it was for that reason that Frank Reed, a Mexican, was forced to attend a school reserved for African American children.⁴⁴ After its closure, the formerly segregated schoolhouse was razed and replaced with a motel, with only a small historical marker dedicated in 1996 commemorating this ignominious chapter of Nogales's educational and social history.⁴⁵

43. Richard E. Harris, *Black Heritage in Arizona* (Phoenix, AZ: Phoenix Urban League, 1977), 42; Ricardo Ojeda, "The Forgotten Color of a Brown and White Border: Black Soldiers in Nogales, Arizona 1918-1933" (University of Arizona, n.d.) 21.

44. Oscar Matthews, letter to the editor, *Nogales International*, May 24, 1989.

45. Segregated schools like the Grand Avenue School were established once there existed a sufficient number of African American students in a given community, but student enrollment did not necessarily make these institutions economically viable. Mrs. McGuire had long been troubled by the discriminatory nature of the school, but it was not until two teaching vacancies opened at other Nogales schools that she saw her chance to integrate these students. Arguing that the district could save ten thousand dollars in teachers' salaries if the school was closed and the students integrated, McGuire initially met resistance from the school board and community upon presenting her plan. However, McGuire presented her plan as a *fait accompli* and convinced concerned parents that "it

Although the schoolhouse itself is long gone and memories of this aspect of Nogales history has been largely forgotten through the passage of time and the gradual demographic decline of the community's African American community following the closure of Nogales's military post in the 1930s, the complexity of this event illustrates the profound problems with identity-formation in the borderlands and the racial hierarchies reinforced by the Americanization ideology. Though they were segregated in Nogales, Arizona, and often looked down upon by different members of local society, many *nogalenses* in Nogales, Sonora, welcomed the Buffalo Soldiers of the Tenth Cavalry and Twenty-fifth Infantry and gladly accepted their business whenever they could receive it. While it cannot be said that racism was not an issue in Mexican society during the early twentieth century, it did, however, lack the overt segregation and racial hierarchical discourses that defined mainstream U.S. rhetoric on race at the time. Americanization thus did not only affect the Nogales community's Mexican American community – it also affected conceptualizations of race so much that even a fully-Hispanic stepson of an African American soldier could be conceived of as simply black. This investigation mentions this aspect of Nogales's complex borderlands identity in order to place the experiences of Hispanic students into full perspective. Further analytical study and review of Nogales's and Arizona's African American heritage in the early twentieth century is key to unlocking the full scope of this saga.

was wrong to set children apart and [the parents] agreed to reserve judgment.” See Bynon McGuire, “Desegregation of the Nogales Schools” AHS.

Conclusion

The challenges existing in forming a public school system in such a demographically, culturally, and geographically diverse areas as in Arizona and New Mexico were exacerbated by differing opinions on the nature of possible sectarianism in public instruction content matter, the problem of public funding for parochial schools, and the issue of identity-formation in school pedagogies with the increased strength of the Americanization ideology. With the religious-political debate of the time inhibiting the formation of public schools, it was difficult to convince U.S. politicians back east that New Mexico and Arizona were more than the land of the subversive Spanish-speaking “Other”; these conceptions of difference as manifest in the education debate helped stall the two territories’ lengthy drives for statehood.⁴⁶ Looking past the political challenges that the Arizona-New Mexico borderlands region represented for their respective political classes, it is evident that conceptualizations of difference between the area’s different cultural groups fomented much of the controversies associated with the establishing and maintenance of public schools in the area. As seen in the generally positive reaction of *nuevomexicanos* and Mexicans/Mexican Americans in Arizona once public education was a viable option, Hispanic families valued the opportunities that an education could grant. However, concerns with the identity politics of public education between Hispanic families and the Anglo members of the educational-political establishment greatly affected how public education manifested itself in Arizona and New Mexico.

46. Everett, “Public School Debate,” 127.

As will be seen in the following case studies of Albuquerque and Nogales, the Americanization discourses from the turn of the century did indeed profoundly impact not only the educational pedagogies and practices used in these borderlands schools, but also the long-term educational attainment of Hispanic students. For all of their differences in location and cultural context, the communities of Albuquerque and Nogales both experienced a gradual but definite cultural transformation as both communities became better integrated into the U.S. geobody. The Mexican Cession of 1848, then, was but the beginning of a long process of cultural transformation as these two peripheral areas sought to Americanize themselves. Beyond the cultural drift, the passage of time, and demographic change wrought onto these two borderlands communities after the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo and the subsequent Gadsden Purchase, the similarities in the Americanization discourses they were submitted to as well as their similar results provide us with patterns that point to the broader cultural impact in this region of educational institution formation, identity construction, and the internal inconsistencies and points of collision existing in the identity dynamics of the borderlands.

Chapter 3 – Cultural Politics, Gender, and Educational Attainment in an Arizona-Sonora Border Town Community: Nogales 1880-1942

Introduction

On a cool March evening in 1913 Ada EKey Jones and her twelve-year old son walked across the line to Nogales, Sonora, Mexico. They hoped to witness the exciting events taking place on the other side of the United States border. All throughout that and the two preceding days bullets had riddled the Mexican border city, causing much fear and many deaths among the population as citizens of the North American border city witnessed the spectacle. Although many in Nogales, Arizona, were nervous about the abrupt arrival of violence in this quiet community, Mrs. EKey Jones, a former schoolteacher, and her son navigated through the crowds and managed to walk to the *Plaza Trece de Julio* near the Mexican customs house as local citizens stepped out of their homes for the first time in days now that the violence subsided. Standing on a bench, Mrs. EKey Jones witnessed one of the leaders of the armed men, Juan Cabral, ride into the plaza with his horse and countless other men. To her the act signaled the official capture of the town. Hurrying back across the line with her son, Mrs. EKey Jones rushed to her home to write an account of how Juan Cabral conquered Nogales, a fact all the more exciting for her because he had been one of her students years earlier. Mrs. EKey

Jones penned her account the same day she witnessed her former student take over Nogales in the midst of the Mexican Revolution. The date was March 13, 1913.¹

The unusual story of Mrs. EKey Jones and her relationship with Juan Cabral is one illustration of the ambiguous cultural and binational realities evident in Nogales, Arizona, schools at the onset of the twentieth century. Due to its border location and the dynamics of its demographics, the Nogales community celebrated its Mexican heritage while it also propagated North American values and customs. In few places were the contradictions in this community more striking than in Nogales's schools. Local schools played a part in the educational formation of two prominent leaders in the monumental Mexican Revolution, including Juan Cabral and Abelardo Rodríguez, who later became the President of Mexico. While important leaders like Cabral and Rodríguez could trace some of their early experiences to schools in the U.S., countless other Mexican students attended school in Nogales, Arizona, during a time when students were barred from speaking Spanish in public school grounds.

In this chapter the sociohistorical context of the formation of the public school system in the border community of Nogales, Arizona, is analyzed. Specific attention is given here to the binational and bicultural social situation existing in this U.S. border city during the turn of the twentieth century as ideals of Americanization manifested themselves in the manner in which local schools in this community addressed the needs

1. Ada EKey Jones, "Troublesome Days in Old Mexico," 13 March 1913, EKey Papers, Arizona Historical Society Library (AHS), Tucson, AZ. Mrs. EKey Jones spelled her maiden surname with an upper-case "e" and "k" and explained to her interviewer that her family traditionally spelled their surname in that way.

of English-language learners and recent immigrant students fleeing the ravages of the Mexican Revolution. The identity-formation experiences of students in this phenomenon are analyzed herein and provide the context from which the roles of their teachers during this time period can be evaluated. As an economic port and a border city situated immediately next to the Mexican Republic, the overall aspects of Americanization, identity-formation, and educational attainment in Nogales was of a unique nature. As a border city, the fluid and even ambiguous nature of national identities led to a deep-seated contradiction in terms of how Nogalians grasped their multicultural heritage – an attribute also seen in Albuquerque and elsewhere in the U.S.-Mexico borderlands. The nature of the border in Nogales impacted students in Nogales in numerous ways. Despite these obvious attributes in the circumstances in Nogales arising from the vigor of Mexican culture in this border community, many points of similarity with schools in New Mexico also become evident, particularly in how the same Americanizing rhetoric of the time permeated the school systems of both Nogales and Albuquerque as well as the larger U.S.-Mexico borderlands area.

Thus a binational North American community that celebrated *el dieciseis de septiembre* more than the Fourth of July also played host to powerful contradictions in terms of how far multicultural identity could be negotiated in a U.S.-Mexico border community in the early twentieth century.² The maelstrom of intercultural tension between the U.S. and Mexico leads to questions of how Nogales students – in spite, or because, of the city’s Arizona-Sonora border location – negotiated the clash of different

cultures and ideas of national identity. How did the experiences in Nogales's schools compare to broader regional trends in Arizona and the Southwest during the early twentieth century? As a community that celebrated its special binational character, unique even among many U.S.-Mexico border cities at the time, the Arizonan city of Nogales played host to profound and intense contradictions between tolerance and bigotry, interculturalism and xenophobia. Moreover, how did these discourses affect the educational attainment of Hispanic students (as determined by the graduation rate of Hispanic students from Nogales High School) in this small border town?

This chapter also includes a discussion of the role played by the teachers at Nogales High School during the turn of the century. Who were the early teachers in this border community's schools? Based on surviving documentary evidence and oral histories, how did these teachers view their students? What gender roles did these teachers illustrate during the course of their work? The following analysis will consider these diverse issues and lay forth conclusions in line with local realities and broader regional patterns across the U.S.-Mexico borderlands.

Turn of the Century Historical Context and Background

The Nogales community must be seen within the greater context of borderlands history. Anthropologist Robert R. Alvarez suggests that the U.S.-Mexico "borderlands" could best be described as "a region and set of practices defined and determined by this

2. Ada EKey Jones, interview with Don Smith, February 1955, oral history AV 0421-20, transcript, AHS.

border that are characterized by conflict and contradiction, material and ideational.”³ Owing to the Nogales community’s border location, questions of national identity – relating to questions of values, traditions and attitudes – are explored in this analysis of school experiences in this community.⁴ Borders often hold a peripheral relationship within the greater nation-state. It is precisely along the limits of a state’s territorial reach that personal notions of national-identity become murky. The flexibility of the borderlands and its resultant questions relating to cultural and national-identity can lead to marked contradictions in this region. According to Alvarez, “borders and borderlands graphically illustrate the conflicts and contradiction in a hierarchically organized world.” Moreover, “it is here that cultures, ideologies, and individuals clash and challenge our disciplinary perspectives on social harmony and equilibrium.”⁵ The history of public education, Americanization, and educational attainment in turn of the century Nogales certainly bears out this notion of the border in Nogales being a point of clashing and challenging of boundaries, much like Anzaldúa’s point of *choque*.

The history of Nogales’s schools began to unfold when the twin communities of Ambos Nogales were founded during the midst of the period in Mexican history known as the *porfiriato*. After serving as a respected and prominent military leader for many

3. Robert R. Alvarez, Jr., “The Mexican-U.S. Border: The Making of an Anthropology of Borderlands,” *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24, (1995), 448.

4. David Piñera Ramírez, *Historiografía de la Frontera Norte de México: Balance y Metas de Investigación* (Mexicali: Universidad Autónoma de Baja California, 1990), 88.

5. Alvarez, Jr., “Anthropology of Borderlands,” 449.

years, General Porfirio Díaz had a falling out with the leaders of the national government, compelling him to lead a coup in 1876 in which he seized power and embarked on a program of modernization for Mexico. Díaz formed close alliances with the nation's wealthy landowners and foreign businessmen, solidifying his power to the extent that his rule – the *porfiriato* – endured for the next thirty years.⁶ In the northern border state of Sonora, Díaz's dictatorship initiated a new era. While not all *sonorenses* were content with the political status quo of the period, the *porfiriato* saw the growth of industry and the region's integration into the greater Mexican state. Sonora rose in importance with the advent of the railroad network linking Mexico and the U.S. Southwest.⁷ The growing economic relationship between Mexico and the U.S. that was played out along the Arizona-Sonora border region greatly reflected a “coexistent” model of borderland interaction. Whereas the U.S. and Mexico were gradually forging economic ties at international levels, residents of these borderlands – particularly in Ambos Nogales – developed strong relationships amongst one another. With the arrival of the railroad network linking Mexico and the United States, Sonora shed its former periphery status as its importance in the Mexican economy grew.

In spite of the instability that would grip the Mexican nation during the Revolution and the Progressive Era's discourse of Americanization in the U.S., North

6. John Mason Hart, *Revolutionary Mexico: The Coming and Process of the Mexican Revolution* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 126.

7. Miguel Tinker Salas, *In the Shadow of the Eagles: Sonora and the Transformation of the Border During the Porfiriato* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 146-148.

American and Mexican borderlanders in Nogales maintained their close ties during this period. In a special tourist edition of the local *Nogales Herald*, the newspaper editors boosted the community. “Nogales, Sonora, stands in neighborly friendliness, shoulder to shoulder with Nogales, U.S.A. One moment you are in a typical hustling American city in the making – a city of pretty homes, bright shops and motorized activity.” Calling the northern Sonora border town the Paris of the Border, the *Herald* encouraged tourists once “across the street and you are in a another world – a world of charm and color, enchantment and glamour – a place that combines the care-free atmosphere of old world capitals of pleasure with a predominance of Spain.”⁸ Although the reality of day-to-day relations in the Ambos Nogales community did not always match the rhetoric of the *Herald*’s boosterism, the deep binational ties between the two cities cannot be underestimated.

As mentioned in a previous chapter, the economic activity the ports of entry and the railroad between the two Nogales fostered propelled the cities to grow to a fair size. By the period 1916 and 1920, Nogales, Sonora, boasted a population of about 3,865, while 5,119 people lived in neighboring Nogales, Arizona. Although the two Nogales had been divided by an international boundary since long before their founding in 1880, the lack of a physical border barrier stimulated the close coexistence between the two cities. In reality the two cities were one binational community.⁹ Students attending Nogales

8. “Nogales, Sonora: Paris of Border,” *Nogales Herald*, May 8, 1937.

9. Adalberto Monarque Alvarez, “Estudio cronizado del periodo 1916-1920” (H. Nogales, Sonora, Mexico: typescript, n.d.) 1; *Fourteenth Census of the United States – State Compendium – Arizona*. (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1924), 13;

schools during this period vividly recalled how life was like during this early period. “We didn’t have a fence where it is today, it was open,” recalled Louis Escalada, a member from one of the early graduating cohorts from Nogales High School. Escalada further reminisced, “We used to play right where the line is today.”¹⁰ As may be remembered, the only indication of the dividing line between the two cities was manifest in Boundary Monument 122 – a concrete obelisk demarcating the international border.¹¹ Along the area of the monument ran International Street, a wide boulevard that simultaneously divided, yet linked the two border cities. By the late 1910s, Boundary Monument 122 represented the only direct physical indication that an international border crossed the two Nogales. The ambiguous boundary in the center of the two Nogales was a perennial source of difficulty for U.S. authorities during the 1910s, particularly after the outbreak of the Mexican Revolution as seen in the August 27, 1918 Battle of Ambos Nogales.¹²

In time the area immediately beside Boundary Monument 122 changed as did in the sociohistorical context itself. The problems brought to Nogales by the ravages of the Mexican Revolution with the arms smuggling and the crossing of refugees and the

Daniel Arreola, “La Cerca y Las Garitas de Ambos Nogales: A Postcard Landscape Exploration,” *Journal of the Southwest* 4 (2001): 504-541.

10. Louis Escalada, interview, n.d., Pimeria Alta Historical Society (PAHS), Nogales, AZ.

11. Fred and Harriet Rochlin, “The Heart of Ambos Nogales: Boundary Monument 122,” *Journal of Arizona History* 17, no. 2 (Summer 1976): 161-180.

12. For more on the 1918 Battle of Ambos Nogales, please see Carlos Francisco Parra, “Valientes Nogalenses: The 1918 Battle Between the U.S. and Mexico that Transformed Ambos Nogales,” *Journal of Arizona History* 51, no. 1 (Spring 2010), 1-32.

paranoid hysteria that World War I engendered certainly changed the community, and in many ways the pedagogies utilized in Nogales schools illustrate the nature of the larger rhetorical discourses at hand during the turn of the twentieth century. In Nogales the open border running across International Street gradually hardened during this period and, along with it, notions of identity, Americanism, and education.

Conditions of Early Schools in Nogales, Arizona

Prior to the tensions unleashed during the turbulent 1910s, nascent educational institutions and expressions of identity in Arizona were more flexible, particularly during the early days of the territory. As a strong testament to this gradually changing discourse of cultural and identity-formation change in Arizona, John Spring, the first full-time schoolteacher in Tucson's first public school, recalled the realities he faced on the first day of classes when he started classes in 1871. In a class of 138 boys "of whom a few showed already a forthcoming beard, while others could barely manage to climb upon the benches, not one could express himself intelligently in the English language." Mr. Spring added "To attempt to speak English to them all at once and English only, as proposed and urged by a member of the board of trustees, and to teach them arithmetic and geography in English before they could understand a single word of that language would have been an utter loss of time."¹³ From the Americanization perspective, Mr. Spring's multicultural classroom in a small Tucson schoolhouse illustrated just how much the people of Southern Arizona were not yet Americanized; much work would need to be done to bring

all prospective U.S. citizens in line – and indeed, the ambivalence that marked the atmosphere of Mr. Spring’s classroom would eventually disappear.

Beyond the pedagogical implications of early teachers’ willingness to incorporate the Spanish language as a medium of instruction in Arizona’s earliest schools lay the nature of the glaring contradictions of the borderland experience at the turn of the twentieth century. Though early Arizona schools accepted the use of Spanish in the classroom as a means of engaging students, the territory’s (and by 1912 the state’s) values and understanding of identity had changed to the point that school personnel would punish students for speaking Spanish on the school grounds. In Arizona cities like Tucson and Phoenix the ambiguities related to self-identity and cultural interaction were largely displaced by the time Nogales schools came of age in the early 1900s as notions of national and cultural-identity became more rigid and defined. As Tucson and Phoenix better integrated with the greater United States, many aspects of their binational borderland character diminished.¹⁴ However, in Nogales, the principal border community in Arizona, the dynamics of biculturalism clearly existed before the turmoil of the 1910s brought about greater emphasis on Americanization and the forging of a singular citizenship identity.

Given the frontier context of the economically and politically peripheral nature of Nogales, the earliest schools in the community had modest origins. Although Nogales, Arizona, was founded in 1880, it was not until 1886 that the community’s first public

13. John Spring, “Teaching School in the Early Days,” *Arizona Citizen*, Feb 9-10, 1898.

school was organized. A forty by seventy-five foot adobe building served the North American border town's growing population of children.¹⁵ One of the students at this early school was a young woman named Ada EKey (who, it may be remembered, later witnessed her former student Juan Cabral capture Nogales, Sonora, from the Mexican federal forces in 1913). Born in 1871 in Joliet, Illinois, Ada was from an Anglo family that arrived in early Nogales in 1884. For Ada and her family attending school was a welcome respite since the family's ranch beyond the hills of Nogales was constantly vigilant against Apache raiding parties.¹⁶ In school Ada studied hard although the school's teacher, Mr. Philpin, often "imbibed a little too fully and fell asleep" during class. As the schoolteacher slumbered, his students would quietly stroll out. "I had a fear of being left alone," Ada claimed, "so I made my escape too."¹⁷

Despite the realities of this first Nogales school, other schools also served the community over the next few years, offering educational opportunities to the growing number of children in the border town. One formative event in local educational development was the opening of the Methodist Seminary School in 1889. Although not the first school in the city, the Methodist School had the novelty of including four

14. Sheridan, *Arizona: A History* (Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona Press, 1995), 123.

15. EKey Jones, oral history AV 0421-20, AHS.

16. Jane Jastram, "Know Thy Neighbor: Mrs. Ada Jones," *Nogales Herald*, January 26, 1951. Ada EKey Jones, whose maiden name is spelled with an uppercase "e" and "k", remembered that during her youth many rural residents of the Nogales area were fearful whenever coyote howling was heard in the distance. Often, Apache raiders – associated with the medicine-man Geronimo's Chiricahua Apaches – would communicate using animal noises as a means of subterfuge.

certified teachers from eastern states who clearly sought to impart mainstream U.S. values and English-language literacy, as opposed to earlier teachers in Nogales who were not certified and who often taught as much in Spanish as they did in English.¹⁸ As the 1890s got underway, the Nogales School District emerged when it began to “compel all of the Mexican children living on the Arizona side of the line to attend school” as a response to the large number of Mexican children “roving the streets.”¹⁹

With the arrival of professional, certified teachers in the Nogales community, the curriculum in the emerging school system began to step away from the flexibility seen in Mr. Spring’s Tucson schoolhouse, shifting instead to a more rigid expression of U.S. identity and citizenship. The contradictions evident in Nogales schools were best exemplified by the strict language policies practiced by Nogales school personnel amid an influx of Mexican students as a result of the violence of the Mexican Revolution. In the 1910s – amid the entry of the United States in the First World War – the ill-defined cultural border that separated Ambos Nogales in the early years of this nascent community became more distinguishable with the schools’ stronger emphasis on English language proficiency as an indicator of U.S. citizenship.

17. EKey Jones, oral history AV 0421-20, AHS.

18. J.B. Bristol, *History of Nogales: Facts Concerning Nogales and Santa Cruz County, Arizona* (Nogales, AZ: Nogales Chamber of Commerce, 1928), 5.

19. Ada EKey noted that the enforcing the attendance of Nogales’s Mexican schoolchildren was “the way our schools really started.” EKey Jones, oral history AV 0421-20, AHS.

Local teachers recalled how the violence of the Mexican Revolution caused an increase in Mexican pupils in the classrooms as many refugees fled to the relative safety of the U.S. This migratory phenomenon gave Arizona the third-highest rate of Mexican immigration after California and Texas.²⁰ The Mexican-immigrant youth of the 1910s in Nogales had to deal with the profound realities that exile from the violence in Mexico meant for them and their families in this rapidly growing border town.²¹ Educators faced these challenges in numerous ways.

One way in which Nogales schools managed the obstacles that refugee students encountered was in the very organization of the schools themselves. Whereas in the mid-1890s Nogales schools were still in their formative stages – with frequent changes in location and class sizes of nearly ninety students – by the 1910s the school system had begun to come of age with the opening of Elm Street Elementary School and Nogales High School, the latter of which opened in 1915.²² Having a greater number of schools enabled educators to seat numbers of students that they might not have been able to in previous years, but even then the facilities were insufficient. At the beginning of the 1915-1916 school-year, for instance, the Elm Street School, which had capacity for 500

20. Gladys Miller, interview by Don Smith, December 22, 1971, PAHS; Jeanne M. Powers, “Forgotten History: Mexican American School Segregation in Arizona from 1900-1951,” *Equity and Excellence in Education* 41 (2008), 469.

21. Bristol, “History of Nogales, Arizona,” 7. Also adding to the population growth was the arrival of hundreds of U.S. troops dispatched to secure the border in Nogales. The city’s population climbed from 1,761 in 1900 to 5,199 in 1920. See *Fourteenth Census of the United States*, 13.

22. Alma Ready, *Nogales, Arizona 1880-1980: Centennial Anniversary*, (Nogales, AZ: Nogales Centennial Committee, 1980), 58.

students, had an enrollment of about 600 on the first day. U.S. citizens were given preference in admission followed by “alien residents beginning with those of longest residence.”²³ When more refugees fled Mexico during the height of the revolutionary conflict, school administrators rented rooms from the city’s Masonic Lodge and held classes there.²⁴

The increased number of students was one issue that Nogales school leaders needed to address, but there was also the formidable task of teaching English to these Spanish-speaking refugee children and sufficiently Americanizing them. Reliable statistics showing the numbers of refugee students from Mexico are not available, but oral history interviews with educators and students from this time period in Nogales suggest that school personnel responded to this influx in numerous ways. Gladys Miller’s memories of teaching in Nogales during the mid-1910s offer a vital perspective into the manner in which teaching professionals addressed the challenges of instructing language minority students during this time period.

Ms. Miller, a teacher at Nogales High School from 1914-1916, later reflected on these times. A native of Virginia who had also lived in El Paso, Texas, for a time, Ms. Miller attended teaching school in Los Angeles and arrived in Nogales for her first assignment.²⁵ More than half a century later when she looked back at her experiences, Ms. Miller remembered well working with the almost exclusively-female faculty in Nogales’s high school and elementary schools. Ms. Miller usually had only ten students

23. Ready, *Centennial*, 59.

24. Miller, interview, PAHS.

in her home economics classes, all of whom were girls. In fact, Ms. Miller remembered that at this point most of the students in the high school level were girls since few of the boys at Nogales High School were planning to go [on] to higher education.”²⁶

Despite being a home economics teacher at Nogales High School, the shortage of teachers meant that Ms. Miller was also asked to teach music lessons in the lower grades, thus enabling her to gain a glimpse of what was taking place in other classrooms.²⁷

Switching between the high school and the Elm Street Elementary School allowed Ms. Miller to witness the manner in which educators in diverse settings in Nogales imparted instruction to the student body during the mid-1910s. Echoing classroom experiences stemming since the opening of Arizona schools, teachers in Nogales “tried to see that children talked English but it was an impossibility.” Ms. Miller recalled that many teachers took advantage of the knowledge that the English-language learner students already possessed in the other academic subjects, therefore teachers used pictures to teach core-subject concepts and help the students acquire the English language. “Each individual teacher,” Ms. Miller stated, “had to have her own way of teaching the particular class she had.”²⁸

The teachers in mid-1910s Nogales taught their students through various means, but at the lower elementary levels a strict segregation of language-minority students still

25. Miller, interview, PAHS.

26. Ibid.

27. Ibid.

28. Ibid.

existed. Doris Bynon McGuire, the Nogales school district's supervisor for elementary schools in the late 1940s, noted that the school system still utilized "a peculiar system of assignment in all of the elementary schools."²⁹ She noted that English language learners were placed in Grade 1-C, a grade in which they were given English immersion and instruction before continuing onto the actual first grade. Although this primer class was aimed at developing sufficient literacy in the English-language prior to allowing the students to participate in mainstream classes, the 1-C classroom's practice of language-ability segregation, which emphasized basic English skills and included a level of Americanization, slowed down the group of students in the 1-C classes by having these students at least one year behind their English-speaking peers. Noteworthy is that regardless of age, all students with low-English abilities were grouped together into the 1-C classes. The groups of students that attended the 1-C classroom would continue "with the same groups with whom they entered, thus perpetuating a class system in the schools." Evidence also exists that schools in Nogales were practicing this form of limited English-language proficiency segregation as early as the 1890s when the community's first schools opened.³⁰

The effects of the 1-C classroom went beyond the more apparent effects of retention in its creation of a class system in the Nogales public schools. Educational researchers have documented how significant the psychological effect of "being behind"

29. Doris Bynon McGuire, "Desegregation of the Nogales Schools," n.d., Places-Arizona-Nogales-Schools Ephemera File, AHS.

30. EKey Jones, oral history AV 0421-20, AHS.

in class can be among embarrassed second language-learners and their academically-achieving English-proficient peers, particularly when English proficiency is used “as an inappropriate proxy for measuring intellectual ability” in the classroom.³¹ The hidden cognitive implications associated with English-language learners no doubt affected how the former 1-C students integrated into the mainstream English-language classes once they left 1-C, but the fact that almost all of the students were of Mexican heritage also had its discursive implications within the Nogales community. In perhaps the most striking of all the details associated with the 1-C classroom, McGuire noted that teachers across the Nogales Unified School District cavalierly referred to these classrooms as the “Mexican rooms.”³²

Although the “official” terminology of the Nogales school district might not have referred to the 1-C classes as “Mexican rooms” all the time, the fact that these English-language acquisition classrooms were known as such demonstrates how the students in these classes were seen as foreign “others” who were not quite yet in line with mainstream Americanism. Beyond the obvious need for the students to develop English-proficiency as a student in a U.S. border town school system, the existence of this 1-C/Mexican room phenomenon illustrates how the notions of Americanism and U.S. citizenship identity could establish themselves as incongruent if not opposed to Hispanic identity even in a border city like Nogales during the early twentieth century.

31. Barbara A. Zsembik and Daniel Llanes, “Generational Differences in Educational Attainment Among Mexican Americans,” *Social Science Quarterly* 77, no. 2 (June 1996), 365.

32. Bynon McGuire, “Desegregation of the Nogales Schools,” AHS.

The tensions evident in having a dual-system of “Mexican rooms” and regular mainstream classes – a manifestation of the cultural conflict between U.S. and Mexican culture in Nogales – also appeared outside of the classroom. Allyn Watkins, a student at Nogales High School during the close of the 1910s, remembered the tribulations that his classmates faced when they were not proficient in English. “In those days when you went to school you were supposed to read and write and learn to speak English,” Watkins said, adding “They would not allow you to speak Spanish on the playground, during recess or at any school functions.”³³ While it may seem illogical for teachers to chastise students for speaking Spanish during recess, the attitude of Nogalian school personnel reflected the broader beliefs held by administrators and teachers throughout the Southwest that success in academic areas and other aspects of school life was “dependent on achievement in English.”³⁴ The Americanization paradigm that Theodore Roosevelt so vociferously promoted in his writings was evidently at work within borderlands schools during the turn of the century.

Although located in a border city with a great deal of bilingualism and bicultural interaction, Nogales schools practiced the language-based form of segregation that was manifest in other Arizona cities at the time, such as in the city of Tucson. Despite deep cultural, economic, and historical ties to Mexico, Tucson also experienced a strong manifestation of the Americanization phenomenon. Like border town Nogales, Tucson

33. Allyn Watkins, interview by Harriet D. Wilson, July 3, 1978, oral history AV 0421-39, AHS.

34. Sánchez, *Segregation of Spanish-Speaking Children*, 23.

schools also employed a strict segregation of non-English speaking students, almost all of whom were of Mexican heritage. The English language learners in Tucson's schools were also be referred to a 1-C Class for English immersion instruction.³⁵ By the time Tucson students reached high school, they were given intelligence group tests in English and then were placed into classes according to their ability, thus further accentuating the unequal educational opportunities in the classroom.³⁶ Similar to Nogales, students were also prohibited from speaking Spanish on the school grounds. In addition to having their mouths washed with soap for speaking Spanish, students also had to withstand administrators' admonitions to forget "every word of their mother tongue" if they wished to succeed in the U.S.³⁷

The language policies seen in Nogales and Tucson extended beyond the immediate border region as well. Phoenix area students also recalled receiving punishment for speaking their language at school, but as a contrast with Nogales and Tucson, the Valley of the Sun's language-based segregation entailed separation into completely different school facilities. In the West Valley community of Tolleson, for example, Spanish-speaking students were completely separated from their peers and enrolled at a different campus with dilapidated facilities. Administrators in Tolleson admitted in a lawsuit that even students with skills "above the average in the understanding and use of English" were grouped into "Mexican classrooms" until eighth-

35. Sheridan, *Los Tucsonenses*, 223-224.

36. Carter, "Public Schools of Tucson," 58.

37. Sheridan, *Los Tucsonenses*, 219.

grade.³⁸ Tempe also had a school exclusively for Mexican students and regularly dismissed Mexican parents' requests to transfer their children to the nearby Anglo school.³⁹ Similar accounts of separate facilities for Mexican students have been documented in Texas, California, and, as will be seen in the following chapter, in New Mexico, attesting to the large-scale nature of these ostensibly Americanization practices throughout the U.S.-Mexico borderlands that often revealed deeper problems in interethnic/race relations in the United States.⁴⁰ Despite the underlying similarities these communities shared in terms of being influenced by Americanism discourses, segregated schools for Mexican students seemed only to appear in locales further away from the border itself.

The segregation practiced in Nogales and other Arizona and Southwestern region schools exemplified an aspect of the period's discourse on the values of assimilation into the North American national identity.⁴¹ Proponents of cultural assimilation championed segregation based on language because of how they perpetuated "Americanism" or a self-identification with white, conservative middle-class values among ethnic-minority

38. Powers, "Mexican American School Segregation," 472-474.

39. *Ibid.*, 472.

40. Joel Spring, *Deculturalization and the Struggle for Equality: A Brief History of the Education of Dominated Cultures in the United States* (New York: McGraw Hill Higher Education, 2007), 95-97.

41. Robert L. Church and Michael W. Sedlak, *Education in the United States: An Interpretive History* (New York: The Free Press, 1976), 258-259.

students.⁴² Reflecting the Deweyian belief that schools represented greater society in general, contemporary educators held that the full potential of Americanization rested “largely in our public school – a school that is indeed a melting pot and a training ground for democracy.”⁴³ In order for Americanization to be successful, as Theodore Roosevelt and others of his time and since have argued, a linguistic assimilation was needed, which by extension also entailed cultural assimilation and a shedding of minority self-identity.⁴⁴

Furthermore, educators viewed students’ Spanish proficiency as a liability, giving Americanization and English immersion curricula an overt “language-as-problem” pedagogical orientation.⁴⁵ School personnel thus transformed the worth of a students’ first language, devaluing it from a resource to a “cultural deficit.” Not all teachers had bad intentions when incorporating the assimilation discourse into their curriculum, but at its heart Americanization in the schools was a manifestation of xenophobia as well as evolving ideas about national identity in the progressive era of the early 1900s.⁴⁶ When

42. Sheridan, *Los Tucsonenses*, 226; C. Ralph Tupper, “A Survey of the Arizona Public School System: A Study of the Elementary and Secondary Public Schools of the State (Phoenix, AZ: Gazette Print Company, 1925), 18.

43. Sánchez, *Segregation of Spanish-Speaking Children*, 38; Church and Sedlak, *Education in the United States*, 263.

44. Spring, *Deculturalization*, 97.

45. James Crawford, “Language Politics in the United States: The Paradox of Bilingual Education,” in *The Politics of Multiculturalism and Bilingual Education: Students and Teachers Caught in the Crossfire*, eds. Carlos J. Ovando and Peter McLaren (Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill Companies, 1999): 109; see Richard Ruiz, “Orientations in Language Planning.” *NABE: The Journal for the National Association of Bilingual Education* 8 (1984): 15-34.

compared with patterns across the U.S.-Mexico borderlands, the English immersion curriculum offered in Nogales very much reflected the desire for Americanism/assimilation to reach its full potential among Mexican and Mexican American students.

Nogales Students and Educational Attainment: Results of Americanization

Much has been said about the overall discourse of Americanization in Arizona, but how did it affect the educational attainment of the state's Hispanic students? Moreover, what were some of the experiences that Mexican and Mexican American students in early Nogales faced? What were the limits of how the Americanization rhetoric defined the nature of schooling in this border town during the turn of the century? As will be seen, Nogales's border culture showed that for all of the community's similarities with cities in the interior of Arizona, there were definite practical contrasts with the ways that citizenship and cultural identity formed in Nogales schools. The experiences of the schoolchildren who attended Nogales schools tell us much about the distinctive realities of the community while it was undergoing processes that were present

46. James Banks, *An Introduction to Multicultural Education* (Boston, MA: Pearson, 2008), 54-55; Carol Schmid "The Politics of English Only in the United States: Historical, Social, and Legal Aspects," in *Language Ideologies: Critical Perspectives on the Official English Movement*, eds. Roseann Dueñas Gonzalez, Ildiko Melis (Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English, 2000), 62. Beyond serving as impediments for full educational attainment and high school graduation, Americanization courses often served to restrict Hispanic students into vocational careers by way of the watered down curriculum they were exposed to as well as the way that Americanization classes often kept students at least one year behind their peers. See Herman Robert Lucero, "Plessy to Brown: Education of Mexican Americans in Arizona Public Schools during the Era of Segregation" (PhD diss, University of Arizona, 2005), 58-59.

in other borderlands communities, such as Albuquerque. Let us first evaluate the effects of Americanization and the 1-C classrooms.

As already established, at the beginning of the twentieth century many educators believed that grouping students with low English abilities was simply the best way to instruct them in the language and help them succeed in U.S. society. Yet even studies that ostensibly supported the goals of assimilation revealed the pitfalls of these practices.⁴⁷ A survey of Arizona schools conducted in 1925 lamented that the state had “one of the most difficult foreign-born problems found in any state” and reminded legislators and school leaders that “the American public school system is the one force capable of assimilating our foreign-born element.”⁴⁸ In fact, the same survey reported that 15% of all Mexican-heritage pupils were enrolled in the “pre-primary grade designed to care for the non-English speaking.”⁴⁹ Rather than simply incorporate many of these English-language learners into mainstream courses, school leaders throughout the state maintained their separation due to the fear that the English-acquisition students “would impede the education of English-language students.”⁵⁰

Despite the survey’s support for including assimilation within the educational curriculum, it also noted the Arizona school system saw its highest rate of promotion-failure in “the Pre-primary grade which is designed to care for non-english [*sic*] speaking

47. Sheridan, *Los Tucsonenses*, 219; Tupper, *Survey*, 53.

48. Tupper, *Survey*, 18.

49. *Ibid.*, 22.

50. Lucero, “Education of Mexican Americans in Arizona Public Schools,” 61.

pupils.” The failure rate for Mexican students across the state’s English-immersion programs in the mid-1920s was 31%, a staggering figure.⁵¹ The state’s survey itself noted that only a third of Mexican-heritage students reached high school as nearly half of the Mexican-heritage students dropped out in fifth grade.⁵² In many ways the systemic failure of Mexican American students in early twentieth century Arizona illustrated the societal subordination of Mexican Americans in the United States as well as the profound problems associated with Americanization and its English-only paradigms.⁵³

Considerable ideological and political support propelled the existence of separate language classrooms, but the segregation of Mexicans had its limits in Nogales. Precedent existed in Phoenix and other certain U.S. Southwest cities, but Nogales administrators did not use this rationale to segregate Mexican students from Anglo students into exclusive schools. Though the Mexican Rooms that Doris Byron McGuire documented were a stain in the community’s educational apparatus, they were at least within the same school grounds as the mainstream classes were. The 1927 Nogales High School *Adobe* yearbook described the east-side Lincoln Elementary School as “the most beautiful building in the city” and further stated “an Americanization Class is also held [there] for the benefit of those who come from our sister city, Nogales, Sonora, Mexico.”⁵⁴ Thus despite the very negative discursive implications of the 1-C classrooms and their overall poor results, the

51. Tupper, *Survey*, 33.

52. *Ibid*, 22-23.

53. Ruiz, “Orientations in Language Planning,” 221.

54. *Adobe* (Nogales, AZ: NHS Printshop, 1927), 9.

Nogales community's location and demographics may well have inhibited the rise of segregated schools for Mexicans while also cushioning the limited segregation that did exist within a somewhat friendlier rhetoric as compared to other borderlands locales.

The 1920 U.S. Census documents the demographic composition of Nogales, Arizona, after the tumultuous years of the Mexican Revolution began to wind down during the late teens. Accurate statistical figures based on specific ethnicity are difficult to ascertain from the 1920 Census since such figures were not reported for cities the size of Nogales, but the Census did report that "foreign-born white" (composed predominantly from Mexicans) numbered 2,570 persons out of a total city population of 5,199 that included 1,261 citizens of "foreign or mixed parentage."⁵⁵ Census figures for the period under discussion in this study, 1880-1940, reaffirm that these demographic statistics were characteristic of Nogales throughout the timeframe in question. In a community with at least half of the residents having Mexican ancestry the full segregation of Mexicans was impractical and undesired in this border town's schools. Ms. Gladys Miller, the aforementioned home economics teacher at Nogales High School, hinted at the community's distinctiveness when she called Nogales "a most interesting town." She added that Nogales was "different from the ordinary town that you'd find in the United States because it's right here on the border and [with] no river in-between."⁵⁶ Nogales's geographic setting and demographics acted as a point of *choque* but also as a place for

55. U.S. Bureau of the Census, *Fourteenth Census of the United States*, 23. Though the foreign-born or mixed parentage residents of Nogales, Arizona, were numbered at 1,261, it is likely that the actual number was far higher.

renegotiating and redefining cultural and national self-identity in a way that was different from other places in the U.S.-Mexico borderlands. The binational aspect of Nogales community identity most likely prevented this border town from adopting the worst aspects of Americanization seen elsewhere in the borderlands region.

Though Nogales's border location prevented it from experiencing the worst of the cultural tensions of Americanization and the narrowing interpretation of Americanism, it is still necessary to inquire as to how the effects of this nationalist identity discourse may have been reflected in the educational attainment of Mexican and Mexican American Nogalians who attended Nogales High School. The data for this information was determined from the graduation lists and district-wide staff lists printed by local newspapers such as the *Nogales Herald* and the *Nogales International* as well as the lists of candidates for graduation from Nogales High School in the school's annual yearbook, *Adobe*. First published in 1919, the *Adobe* presents history researchers with limited glimpses of life in Nogales's only high school and allow us to gauge some of the developments that may have occurred within Nogales schools during the early half of the twentieth century. In light of the limited documentary evidence and oral histories available from the students who participated in these schools, these brief peeks into Nogalian school life present us with material from which we may partially reconstruct the circumstances experienced by these students.

Although it is important to note that many divergent factors influenced how the boys and girls of Nogales met their educational attainment outcomes, it is critical that

56. Miller, interview, PAHS.

consideration be made for the impact that Americanization had on students in Nogales Unified School District. The impact of Americanization can be readily seen in the composition of Nogales High School's graduating classes. An analysis of the proportion of Hispanic students in each graduating class at NHS from 1915-1942 reveals that graduation rates at Nogales's only public high school were disproportionate to the demographic composition of the larger community. In other words, despite the fact that U.S. Census figures for Nogales during the period considered in this study indicate that Mexican nationals and people of Mexican ancestry comprised at least half (though perhaps even much more) of the population of this border city, the graduation rates for Hispanic Nogalians are significantly disproportionate in relation to the number of Hispanic Nogalians. For the twenty-seven years analyzed for the purposes of this study beginning in 1915 and ending at 1942 the overall average percentage of Hispanic students graduating from Nogales High School was 31.07%.⁵⁷

57. These statistics were determined by counting the number of candidates for graduation for each graduating class from Nogales High School for the years 1915-1942 (the year 1915 being the first year students graduated from NHS and 1942 being the cut-off point in this study because of difficulty of making strong comparisons between Nogales and Albuquerque beyond 1942 because of the demographic changes wrought by the Second World War). The ethnic composition of these classes was determined by reading the lists of graduating students published by either the *Nogales Herald* or *Nogales International* newspapers or the annual NHS *Adobe* yearbook. The number of Hispanic students in each class was determined by whether a student had a Spanish surname or even a Spanish given name depending on the case. The author recognizes the limitations of this approach and acknowledges that some Hispanic students with English names may have been missed during the author's survey of graduation statistics and that these figures may have missed Hispanic students that ought to have been included in this calculation on the basis of their not having a Hispanic surname. The 31.07% for overall annual Hispanic graduation percentages was calculated as an average of the yearly percentages of Hispanic students graduating from NHS from 1915-1942.

The annual percentages of Hispanic students in each graduating class varied markedly depending on the year. In contrast to the experience at Albuquerque High School in its first graduating class in 1892 where there were no Hispanic or male students, the inaugural commencement class from Nogales High School had one Mexican-heritage student, Araminta Castro in a five-person class that included three other young ladies and one gentleman. Araminta Castro was very much an exception to early NHS norms as no other Hispanic student graduated again in any of the school's single-digit-large classes until 1921.

Throughout the Roaring Twenties the sizes of the graduating classes from NHS grew, but they were disproportionately dominated by Anglo students. In the Class of 1924, for example, only two Hispanic students were listed among the nineteen candidates for graduation that year. Browsing through the eighth-grade section of that year's edition of *Adobe*, however, reveals that while Mexican American students comprised only 10.5% of the Class of 1924, they comprised 62% of the eighth-grade class (24 of 39 students). By the time that eighth-grade class had advanced to candidacy for graduation as the Class of 1928, Mexican-heritage students' proportion in that class had dropped to 38% (16 of 42 graduating seniors from NHS). This change cannot be attributed solely to the possibility that many of these Mexican families might have moved from Nogales. Instead this change strongly supports the notion that public schools in Nogales, like in Albuquerque and so many other locales in the U.S.-Mexico borderlands, sought to create a singular "American" citizenship identity among their students with English-acquisition taught at the expense of content knowledge growth and overall educational attainment.

Public schools in the borderlands simply were not serving the needs of the Hispanic community.

Over time the educational attainment of Mexican and Mexican American students in Nogales High School improved, though the evidence still suggests a statistical disconnect between the demographic realities of the community (where Mexican nationals and Mexican Americans demographically predominated) and the actual educational outcomes of the public school system. The Class of 1938, one of the relatively larger commencement classes analyzed in this study, saw fifty students receive their high school diplomas and in fact 56% of the class was of Mexican heritage. Graduation rates for Hispanic Nogalians were improving in the latter part of this study's timeframe, but it ought to be noted that the Class of 1942, with its fifty-eight graduates, consisted of only eighteen students of Mexican ancestry, dropping the percentage of Mexican students in the class down to 31%.

The ethnic composition of teachers at Nogales High School (and in fact in the larger Nogales Unified School District) also indicates the administrative priorities of the time. Similar to what will be demonstrated in the discussion and analysis of Albuquerque Public Schools, Hispanic-heritage teachers were a rarity within the Nogales school system. The first Hispanic teacher at NHS was not hired until 1928. Miss Magdalena Espinoza, a University of Arizona graduate, was hired during the 1928-1929 school year as a Spanish teacher and fulfilled that duty until the mid-1940s. Ms. Espinoza was the school's only Hispanic teacher until 1937 when Charlotte Luz was hired to teach English. Although *Adobe* yearbooks for the years 1943-1945 are sadly unavailable in any public repositories in Southern Arizona, the 1946 edition of *Adobe* reveals that neither long-time

veteran Magdalena Espinoza nor Charlotte Luz were on the faculty staff that year (nor were any other Hispanic teachers for that matter).⁵⁸

The fact that there were so few Hispanic teachers on the NHS faculty (and overall in the district as a whole) during the first half of the twentieth century indicates that NUSD administrators (much like their counterparts at APS who only hired the first Hispanic teacher in the 1920-1921 school year to teach Spanish) did not consider it important for Hispanic students to have positive and career-oriented Hispanic professionals as role models within the school environment. When Hispanic teachers were hired, they were more often limited to teaching Spanish than other subjects; while Ms. Charlotte Luz was an exception by teaching English at NHS, Ms. Magdalena Espinoza's teaching of Spanish is commensurate to how APS and other borderlands school systems relegated Hispanic teachers to instructing only Spanish. Although subtle, this discourse was very evident and reflected the social/racial hierarchies of the time. Undoubtedly, students and their families also recognized this as they went through NUSD schools.

Beyond the considerations that analysis of graduation statistics and faculty composition can provide, further insight into the challenges students participating within

58. The August 31, 1931, edition of the *Nogales Herald*, for example, included a story titled "Nogales Schools to Start Fall Term September 8" which listed the names of the school faculty in the Nogales Unified School District for the year 1931-1932 and included "F.E. Westerland, principal; Bruce Wallace, band-history; Lorena Dixon, phy. ed. girls; Edith Ward, art supervisor; Harold Stiles, manual arts; William Kerr, coach; Lemuel Harris, auto mechanics; James W. Haddock, science; Clarence Fiscus, mathematics; Gladden Elliot, commercial; Jane Forsythe, English; Jean Cave, English; Magdalena Espinosa [sic], Spanish; Lon Bellman, commercial; Sarah E. Wilson, domestic arts; Clara Morris, music supervisor."

this formative period of public education in Nogales is possible because of the experiences of Ada EKey, not only one of the early students in the community but also one of the first teachers, too. Upon graduating from the Methodist School, Ms. EKey immediately passed her teaching examination in Tucson in June 1892, and soon began teaching in her home community of Nogales.⁵⁹

She returned to the Nogales area and taught in rural schools outside of town, but within a year she was teaching in the city limits. In fact, the school district moved Ms. EKey around the city, placing her at different times in the northern outskirts of Nogales (on the future site of the Grand Avenue segregated school for African American children) and at other times at schoolhouses only a block away from the international boundary. Teachers were a scarce commodity in this community during this time period. Ms. EKey herself noted that one year during the first day of classes her classroom had eighty-four pupils. On the whole, resources were very limited in these schools. Later in life Ms. EKey commented on “how difficult it was with only a few books, and slates, a chart and a small blackboard to work with, and chairs and a few desks for the children.”⁶⁰

Despite their rudimentary nature at this point in their development and the lackluster educational attainment results that Americanization ideologies produced, Nogales schools still demonstrated a binational character – a condition reflective of the locale’s borderland nature and the sociocultural attributes of Nogales’s Mexican and Mexican American students. Magnifying this character is the fact that many of the students who used the opportunities that early Nogales schools offered were from across

59. EKey Jones, oral history AV 0421-20, AHS.

the line in Nogales, Sonora. Abelardo Luján Rodríguez, one of Ms. EKey's students from Mexico, especially shows how interconnected the people of the two Nogales were during the period of the 1890s even in the moment when notions of Americanism were coalescing in the community and throughout Southern Arizona. Abelardo's family moved to Nogales, Mexico, from Guaymas, Sonora, in search of work and better educational opportunities for their children.⁶¹ During the winter months Abelardo's mother Petra Luján made him and his little sister attend classes in the schoolhouse where Ada EKey taught. In the 1890s Ms. EKey could not have imagined the future that awaited the "quiet, timid little boy" who always sat next to his sister.⁶²

Abelardo Rodríguez's rising career in the first decades of the twentieth century illustrates many of the ambiguities that growing up along the border entailed. Rodríguez joined the Nogales, Sonora, police department in the early 1900s and then joined Mexico's revolutionary movement during the 1910s. His military career took him from battles in Nogales to the territory of Baja California where he served as governor in the 1920s. After amassing a sizeable fortune during his Prohibition-Era governorship of that border territory, Rodríguez was called upon to serve as interim President of Mexico from 1932-1934. "Little did I dream," Ms. EKey reminisced, "that Abelardo would be a future

60. EKey Jones, oral history AV 0421-20, AHS.

61. Abelardo Luján Rodríguez, *Autobiografía* (México, D.F.: Novaro Editores, 1962), 27, 35.

62. Jastram, "Know Thy Neighbor: Mrs. Ada Jones," *Nogales Herald*, January 26, 1951.

president of Mexico.”⁶³ Rodríguez returned to Sonora and championed educational opportunities for *sonorenses* as seen in his role in establishing the Universidad de Sonora in the late 1930s.

Noteworthy in this discussion on the fluid nature of border identity and the student-school power relationship were Rodríguez’s school experiences in Nogales, Arizona. Ms. EKey implied that young Abelardo and his sister were typical Mexican students who likely went through the same struggles as any student in this border city. In his *Autobiografía* published seventy years after these events, Rodríguez wrote about the bullying that he had to endure in school in Arizona, crediting it to the “animosity between Mexicans and North Americans which was evident during that time, particularly along the border.” Rodríguez’s memoirs implied that school officials did not try to prevent this type of bullying.⁶⁴

Besides these unpleasant memories, however, Abelardo Rodríguez wrote little about his day-to-day educational experiences in the U.S., though he briefly mentioned some of his schooling in Nogales, Sonora. Rodríguez may have downplayed his time in schools north of the border because the delicate issue of cultural identity in an Arizona border school might have diluted the integrity of his self-notion as a Mexican revolutionary participant and national leader. Rodríguez’s brief experience in the early schools of Nogales demonstrates the problems of identity-formation and educational attainment possible in those institutions at the time – particularly as he vividly

63. Jastram, “Know Thy Neighbor: Mrs. Ada Jones.”

64. Rodríguez, *Autobiografía*, 35.

remembered the bullying he experienced. Although it is difficult to recreate holistically the experiences of Mexican-heritage students in Nogales schools during the early twentieth century, these pieces of evidence allow us to perceive in the schools in Nogales a point of *choque* between cultures and ideologies.

Ms. EKey could only have dreamed about the heights which shy and quiet Abelardo reached at the culmination of his military and political career, but in yet another demonstration of the ambiguities of borderlands identity-formation during the rise of a more monolithic Americanism, she also recognized how many of her Mexican students went on to take prominent roles in the struggles associated with the Mexican Revolution of the 1910s. Juan Cabral, another one of Ms. EKey's former pupils, was heavily involved in dissent against President Porfirio Díaz, even participating in the landmark Cananea mining strike of 1906. Although the strike in Cananea was unsuccessful, Cabral remained active in the resistance against the *porfiriato* and took part in the military phases of the Mexican Revolution after 1913, including the capture of Nogales.

U.S.-educated Colonel Cabral along with Colonel Alvaro Obregón – a former schoolteacher – led an attack against Nogales, Sonora, on March 13, 1913, capturing the important border city from the government of Victoriano Huerta, who had been elevated to power in a bloody February 1913 coup. The insurgents, known as *constitucionalistas*, surrounded the city and captured it in plain view of Ada EKey, who was now married as Mrs. Ada Jones.⁶⁵ After witnessing these events, Mrs. EKey Jones wrote about all she had

65. Alvaro Obregón, *Ocho Mil Kilómetros en Campaña* (México, D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1959), 38-39; Ada EKey Jones, "Troublesome Days in Old Mexico," 13 March 1913, EKey Papers, AHS. The March 13, 1913, battle in Nogales

seen in those “troublesome days” and how she remembered being a younger Juan’s teacher in early Nogales. Although she did not know it at the time, Abelardo Rodríguez also joined the *constitucionalista* cause during the same battle, thus launching his military and political career.⁶⁶

The background of some of the participants in the March 1913 Battle of Nogales vividly depicts the transnational and ambiguous nature of border identity in early Nogales and its schools that existed despite the Americanization rhetoric of the times. Inasmuch as the actual physical border between the United States and Mexico was difficult to distinguish in Nogales, the examples shown by Juan Cabral and Abelardo Rodríguez exemplified how persons in Nogales could live in an ambiguous binational space that defied dichotomous points division between Mexican and American. In this entangled coexistence, these actors were formed (at least in part) by their experiences in two countries. While this is not to suggest that Cabral and Rodríguez (and other Sonoran youth like them) became who they were exclusively because of their brief time in Nogales schools, their experiences do point to the permeability of borderlands institutions as well as the ability of students in these schools to forge their own paths. The border and what it represented in Nogales was a phenomenon that went beyond clearly-defined divisions and dichotomies, even though the greater prevalence of an Americanization curriculum during

occurred as a direct result of the violent February 1913 coup against Mexican President Francisco I. Madero, one of the main instigators of the 1910 Mexican Revolution. General Victoriano Huerta, one of the leaders of the coup, took power after Madero’s assassination, causing many military and political leaders in Sonora and elsewhere to revolt against the new government.

66. Rodríguez, *Autobiografía*, 61.

this time perhaps made it seem that when living in Nogales, one needed to be either Mexican or American but not a complimentary mixture of both.

As will be seen in the discussion on Albuquerque school experiences, in Nogales a certain level of cultural drift and transformation also took place among students. The broader scope of the Americanization pedagogies and rhetoric can be seen in how students like Fidel Enciso (Class of 1937) could be nicknamed “Fiddle” in the *Adobe* yearbook for that year. In a further sign of the cultural drift evident in Nogales, names like Mary Ahumada and John Elias stand in contrast to names like Tiburcio Flores and Enrique Liñeiro. In Nogales a cultural shift was certainly taking place, but the presence of the U.S.-Mexico border only four blocks from the hillside yellow-bricked Nogales High School campus prevented too much of an overall cultural assimilation from taking place. Although not reflected in the pages of the annual *Adobe*, the ubiquitous presence of Spanish meant that a great deal of Nogalians were at least partially fluent in Spanish. Thus like in Albuquerque, a cultural shift in Nogales, Arizona, was present, but, owing to the presence of the Mexican Republic across from the Arizonan border town, it was not as well-developed as in Central New Mexico.

This spirit of ambiguity with respect to language and culture survived in Nogales and its schools throughout the twentieth century, but it is also important to note the gendered aspects of the public education system that the community’s teachers experienced in their work with the boys and girls of Nogales.

Gender and Cultural Roles of Nogales Teachers

Although the principal focus of this study is centered on the experiences of Hispanic students in the borderlands with respect to the Americanization discourse and its effects, the role of teachers in these institutions cannot be ignored. From John Spring in Tucson to Ada EKey and Gladys Miller in Nogales, the most prominent teachers in Southern Arizona were of Anglo heritage even when most of their students were of Hispanic background. As in New Mexico during the turn of the century, most of the city teachers were Anglo, and these teachers often had a professional teaching background of some sort. In New Mexico, particularly in the central and northern areas, teachers in outlying schools were often staffed by Hispanic teachers, particularly when the communities they taught at were predominantly Hispanic, as evidenced in the case of Fabiola Cabeza de Vaca, a schoolteacher in Guadalupe County. While statistics concerning the Nogales area and surrounding Santa Cruz County are difficult to determine based on the limited records surviving in the territorial period's records of superintendent of public instruction, it is very likely that many of small mining camps in the area that had schools and which were dominated by Mexican miners likely also had mostly young teachers of Hispanic origin whose main qualification was their high school diploma or some equivalent.

But as in the cases of Ms. EKey and Ms. Miller, teaching in the city (even if it was a relatively small one like Nogales, Arizona) carried more social responsibilities and expectations which may partially explain why there were so few Hispanic teachers in Nogales schools, particularly Nogales High School, during the period this study is concerned with. Additionally, this may also suggest that educational administrators did

not perceive Hispanic teachers as competent enough to carry out the program of Americanization in many instances. Whatever the case may have been, Hispanic teachers were clearly on a lower rung of the social hierarchical ladder in relatively more populous communities like Nogales.

Nevertheless, the memoirs of Ada EKey Jones and Gladys Miller, though representing only two out of the many teachers that came and went through the Nogales community at this time, exemplify the feminization of the U.S. teaching profession during the turn of the century. During the early 1800s, teaching was almost entirely the confine of men, particularly as they dominated not only the teaching posts themselves but also the administrator-level positions of schoolmasters and other administration posts. Following the advice of civic leaders such as Catharine Beecher, community leaders began to promote the training of women teachers and soon female normal schools opened in Massachusetts and Connecticut.⁶⁷

With the rise of the U.S. common schools, the prevalence of women teachers grew, signaling the feminization of the teaching profession. Horace Mann, the celebrated educational reformer from Massachusetts, strongly supported the hiring of women teachers, even if he also enthusiastically supported that their administrators were almost always male.⁶⁸ In a century when career opportunities were limited and when women were largely restricted to the space of the home, or the “private sphere”, teaching offered an opportunity for women to enter the public sphere of society. Nevertheless, the

67. Kathleen Weiler, *Country Schoolwomen: Teaching in Rural California, 1850-1950* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1998), 12-13.

feminization of the teaching profession sadly also signaled the loss of prestige that being a teacher itself formerly possessed. Wages for teachers went down as the rates of women in the profession went up. As teaching was expected to be a young woman's place only so long as she was not yet married, a lowering of wages and a commensurate lowering of respect for teachers resulted.

In the borderlands region and in the greater U.S. West, the lack of previously established deep-rooted educational institutions allowed for women, mostly Anglo in origin, to influence heavily the development of education in these territories due to their strong presence. Often these young Anglo women would help recreate the sociocultural institutions of the eastern United States in the scattering of new communities founded in the West. As education historian Kathleen Weiler has written, despite the localized, unique identities rural communities in the western U.S. sought to claim through their institutions, they “replicated the existing gender, racial, and class structures of the United States.” Weiler further wrote that “the hegemony of white and predominantly Protestant knowledge and values” were powerful factors that dominant society “transmitted by means of the schools among other institutions, and shared across class lines by the dominant white English-speaking population.” As the agents of this cultural transmission phenomenon, teachers played an important role in the Americanization project which the larger society sought to impose at all levels. These young Anglo female teachers became cultural gatekeepers between the peoples and lands of the West and the Americanized, sophisticated peoples of the East. Beyond fostering literacy, mathematical proficiency,

68. Hayes, *Horace Mann's Vision*, 24.

and basic civic identities, these early Anglo women teachers were transmitters of mainstream U.S. identity to the borderlands and U.S. West. Detailed analyses of this phenomenon can be found in the works of scholars such as Weiler, Gilbert G. Gonzalez, Madelyn Holmes, and Beverly Weiss; many of the identity-formation and ideological dynamics these scholars noted were at work when the first public schools were founded in Nogales.⁶⁹

As seen in Ada EKey's memories, becoming a teacher offered some opportunities for establishing oneself as an individual. Gladys Miller also reflects this phenomenon as she exhibited a high level of independence moving across different communities in order to teach. Like Ada before her, the experience she had growing up in a bicultural community, El Paso, helped her better interact with her students during her time as one of the inaugural teachers at Nogales High School. Yet it was a single woman's profession. Once Ada EKey became Mrs. Jones, her teaching ended as she was expected to devote herself to her motherly and wifely duties. The expectation that teachers needed to be young, single, and models of virtue was a common part of the teaching profession throughout the U.S. that had its origins in the nineteenth century and which still persisted into the early twentieth century.⁷⁰

69. The authors mentioned in the text are just some examples of scholars who, in varying ways, have treated the issue of public education and its underlying cultural discourses. Please see Weiler, *Country Schoolwomen*, 81; Gilbert George Gonzalez, "The System of Public Education and Its Function Within the Chicano Communities, 1920-1930" (PhD diss, University of California, Los Angeles, 1974); and Madelyn Holmes and Beverly Weiss, *Lives of Women Public Schoolteachers: Scenes from American Educational History* (New York: Garland Publishing, 1995).

For all of the opportunities that teaching could present to an educated and independent minded young woman, there were still cultural and societal limits to how far a woman teacher could progress. Society's appreciation of women during the early twentieth century was very much in flux (particularly by the mid-1910s when Ms. Miller was a teacher at Nogales High School). However, the teaching profession, with all of its promotion of women into the public sphere, still reinforced notions of women as nurturing caretakers with the profession's strong advocacy of republican motherhood in teacher preparation programs. The so-called private sphere of women's roles as nurturing, motherly individuals was still very much promoted even as women achieved a modicum of community leadership by entering in the public sphere as teachers.

The historical moment in which Ada EKey and Gladys Miller sought to educate the youth under their care was one in which opportunities for women, though gradually opening, were still very limited. Despite the problems that they faced in terms of how far either one of them could advance under the societal expectations of that period, Ms. EKey and Ms. Miller demonstrated that the larger regional themes of education were also at play in Nogales. Two young Anglo women, both of whom hailed from families not originally from the areas in which they taught, worked to make themselves into professionals and sought to reproduce the mainstream U.S. values during their time within their classrooms.

70. Redding S. Sugg, Jr., *Mother Teacher: The Feminization of American Education* (Charlottesville, VA: University Press of Virginia, 1978), 40-42.

Though not fully prepared to take on the complexity of the community in which they taught, they worked to function as best they could and to foster positive U.S. civic beliefs and customs in their students. In remarking that every Nogales schoolteacher had to “have her own way of teaching the particular class she had,” Ms. Miller articulated not only the sense of unpreparedness that many early Nogales teachers felt, but also the need for teachers to promote mainstream U.S. ideals in ways that would effectively engage pupils in a borderland town like Nogales.⁷¹ Though they might not have been entirely conscious of it, Ms. EKey and Ms. Miller and their associates worked to recreate the mainstream Protestant, middle class values and practices of the U.S. in the bordertown of Nogales, Arizona. Thus beyond providing women with an opportunity to be more than simple homemakers in a restrictive society, teaching allowed these women to serve as educators, community leaders, and – perhaps most poignantly from a borderlands identity-building perspective – as cultural brokers in an ambiguous community.

Lastly, Ada EKey and Gladys Miller’s work as teachers sheds tremendous light on the circumstances and conditions of the Nogales community during the turn of the twentieth century. Their oral histories – recorded at least two generations after their time as educators – contain insights into the conditions of Nogales schools that are impossible to gain from other documentary sources considering the dearth of written information on early Nogales in general. What historians of the Arizona-Sonora borderlands have to work with consists mainly of the experiences of political and economic leaders. The published literature reflects considerably on these topics; however, historiography on the

71. Miller, interview, PAHS.

social history of schoolchildren, their families, and their overall community expectations regarding education and social advancement is very limited. As incomplete as their memoirs are in terms of determining certain details, the oral histories of Ada EKey and Gladys Miller are still a treasure trove of information. Furthermore, their memoirs serve to reinforce these two women's work as teachers by demonstrating how, even many years after their passing, they still are teaching us, even if it is now about the meaning of their experiences.

Conclusion

In the community of Ambos Nogales at the turn of the twentieth century the ambiguous dynamics of the border defined played a critical, albeit contorted role in the development of identity. For the Arizonan border city the ambivalent and distinct nature of border identity played out in the city's first schools. Though Nogales schools could act as agents of learning to the extent that the community would later recall some of the experiences of its binational heroes as an indication of the unique character of this community, Nogalian institutions of learning also demonstrated some of the discriminatory practices that could be found anywhere in the U.S. Southwest at the time. Segregation based on language and race – inspired by the zeitgeist of Americanization – led to the existence of “Mexican Rooms” and even a “colored school” for African Americans in a Southern Arizona border community long known for its blend of cultures.

As a place where both cultural empowerment and discrimination coexisted side-by-side, it was obvious that the border city of Nogales was a place of deeply-rooted contradictions. The *choque* of cultures in Nogales – illustrated by draconian educational

policies of English immersion— indicated the manner in which Mexican Americans negotiated their identities in such a city. Nogalians’ identification with a particular form of national identity might have been ambiguous because of the city’s location and demographics, but Nogales’s border location in itself did not mean that schools would respect the heritage of Mexican-heritage students, particularly when a Hispanic schoolchild could face physical punishment for speaking Spanish in a playground in a city with a majority Mexican-origin population. The discriminatory educational policies in Nogales and throughout Arizona did not lead to beneficial results for the students, but rather a massive rate of academic failure as demonstrated in Mexican students’ overall disproportionate rate of graduation from Nogales High School. As stated earlier, it is very troubling that in a community where at least half (if not much more) of its residents were of Mexican-heritage the average percentage of Hispanic students in each graduating class from NHS was only 31.07%.

Reflecting on Mexican Americans’ social position in the early twentieth century United States, and Arizona in particular, the drop-out rates resulting in part from ineffective minority-language instruction reinforced Mexican Americans’ subservient status in society. Despite the politically-centered nationalist rhetoric that was at the core of the Americanization discourse, few educational researchers at the time could not see that Mexican American youth in Arizona schools including Nogales failed not because they were not yet fully Americanized in the 1-C programs, but rather because the Americanization curriculum did not promote learning in a conducive environment for English-language learners. In addition to their challenge in overcoming limited language proficiency in English, the participants in the Americanization classes also had to

confront talk from classmates and faculty that they were “behind” the rest and by extension not as fully cognitively-developed as the more fully proficient English speakers in class. With English-literacy and educational attainment not quite achieved as a result of the ideologically-driven Americanization discourses, the persons who fell between the cracks in this system could then be considered as the unsuccessful “Other” for not having effectively integrated into the larger U.S. social system. As Jean-Paul Sartre wrote, “you become what you are in the context of what others have made of you.”⁷²

Given that the community’s schools did not exist separated from local society and its values, the events that took place in turn of century Nogales classrooms largely reflected Nogalians’ own ambivalence about what it meant to be an Anglo or a Mexican American in a U.S.-Mexico border city in the early 1900s. In a city where different languages, cultures, and ethnicities intersected, it was important that the Spanish-language not be incorporated as a means of instruction lest the principles of Americanization become vitiated. Although Nogales’s binational roots have long been celebrated by local tourism boosters as a measure of the community’s unique persona, the diversity and “language-as-problem” policies seen in Nogales’s schools at the turn of the last century had much in common with the discriminatory practices of any U.S. Southwestern school system in the time period.

In a town defined by striking self-contradictions and ambiguities, the story of Nogales’s early schools reflected the conflicts that took place in the community overall.

72. Henry A. Giroux, *Ideology, Culture, and the Process of Schooling* (Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 1981), 57.

The obscure and shrouded story of multicultural educational experiences and problems in early twentieth century Nogales can be pieced together through the memories of teachers like Gladys Miller and Ada EKey Jones who recalled how difficult teaching was in a border town. Between teaching nearly ninety students in one classroom to finding methods of teaching English via an infrequent and limited utilization the Spanish language, Mrs. EKey Jones's and Ms. Miller's memories help portray of how sitting in any of Nogales's first schools might have felt. Though firsthand accounts of Nogalian students are lacking in the historical record, the memoirs of Abelardo Rodríguez point to the intertwined nature of the two cities of Nogales and their respective countries. Rodríguez's autobiography revealed the intimate, though often overlooked, binational connections on the border while his experiences still revealed the uncertainties and contradictions inherent in the transnational borderland experience, a dilemma made poignant by race- and language-based discrimination.

Beyond the insights that Ada EKey and Gladys Miller provide us through their memoirs, one can also identify the patterns of gender roles as they existed at the turn of the twentieth century in Nogales. Although their teaching careers took place with a gap of twenty years separating them, the social expectations of the 1890s and 1910s showed deep similarities. Teaching at this time provided an opportunity for women to work outside of the home in a professional capacity. While these opportunities showed a change in the societal conceptualization of women at the time, it also reinforced notions of women being caretakers by having republican motherhood and other motherly expectations at the center of what constituted good teaching. The very public teaching profession still reinforced private sphere ideals for women. Lastly, women like Ms. EKey

and Ms. Miller reinforced mainstream U.S. ideologies and values by transmitting them to their diverse Anglo and Hispanic students in Nogales. In this sense, Nogales's early women teachers – all Anglo until 1928 when Magdalena Espinoza was hired – helped reproduce the larger U.S. societal norms and ideologies of the times.

The complexity of identifying with a specific cultural and national identity in early twentieth century Nogales merits further research from both a local and greater U.S.-Mexico border city perspective. Further investigation is needed to ascertain the specific details associated with day-to-day academic experiences in this border community, such as the under-researched issue of African American segregation in Nogales and greater Southern Arizona. While comparisons to Arizona cities like Tucson and Phoenix are valid in ascertaining an understanding of how Mexican-heritage students interacted with public education systems in the Grand Canyon State, Nogales's border location also makes comparative studies with other borderlands cities important in order to articulate local uniqueness and broader regional patterns better. In this respect, an analysis of the historical background of schools in Albuquerque, New Mexico, and the Americanization policies played out therein in the following chapter will reveal much in terms of the larger similarities in identity-formation and educational attainment that the Americanism paradigm could bring to cities even as different from each other as Albuquerque and Nogales.

Chapter 4 – Culture in Early Albuquerque Public Schools: Language Policy, Americanization, Educational Attainment, and Teachers 1879-1942

Introduction

It was a warm September day in Albuquerque in 1891. Throughout the city's streets young children and adolescents walked with their parents to their schools as the freedom of summertime had come to a bittersweet end. As the students of the Albuquerque Public Schools (APS) took their desks, many of the children struggled to find enough seats as their teachers welcomed them into their classrooms for the next nine months. Roll was taken by pen and paper by those teachers who had such utensils, but not all of them had received their materials during the teacher orientations held the preceding weekend. Chalk was not available at all school sites either, though that problem paled in comparison to the daunting challenge of keeping order and discipline in some classrooms in which desks were in such short supply that ten, fifteen, even seventeen students would have to stand or sit on the floor. The APS Superintendent, Charles Elkanah Hodgin, ran frantically from site to site in each of the Albuquerque schools seeking to assess the situation and rectify it as best he could. Despite the initial hurdles the first day and week of school wrought, Superintendent Hodgin was able to relax in his small office by week's end. Using the first page of a brand new notebook, Hodgin wrote "One week is gone. Considering the circumstances, such as the beginning of a school system, the lack of books in many studies not yet adopted by the Territorial Board, the strange or new teachers not knowing the children, and things not wholly in readiness, new desks not on hand, etc., etc., the school [year] as a whole has started fairly well." The night Hodgin

penned his summary was September 11, 1891, culminating the first week of operations for the Albuquerque Public Schools.¹

In 1891 Hodgkin and his crew of exclusively female teachers sought to establish a permanent and long-lasting system of public education in Albuquerque – nicknamed in more recent times the Duke City – that would serve to strengthen the community’s incorporation into the greater United States’ political, economic, and cultural corpus. In many respects, the formation of an educational system in Albuquerque that could serve all its residents is illustrative of the larger story of consolidation and growth in this crucial sector that took place throughout New Mexico in the territorial period of the nineteenth century. Despite the ostensible mission of APS and its predecessor, the Albuquerque Academy, which had sought to educate all of the youth of Albuquerque, the reality of the early educational institutions in the Duke City consists of a record of low student achievement by Hispanic youth.

An analysis of the founding of the Congregationalist Church’s Albuquerque Academy and its successor system, APS, reveals that many eastern U.S. models of education were incorporated into educating Albuquerque youth without due consideration or integration of the local Hispanic culture into the curriculum. Emphasizing a national identity-construction discourse and rhetoric known as Americanization (i.e., assimilation into so-called mainstream U.S. society), the early schools of Albuquerque yielded poor results in a school system where positive Hispanic role models in the form of teachers

1. Charles Elkanah Hodgkin 1891-1894 APS Superintendent Notebook, Box 4, Folder 1, Charles Elkanah Hodgkin Papers, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.

were absent. This phenomenon of low Hispanic educational attainment, was largely repeated throughout the territory/state of New Mexico during the late nineteenth century/early twentieth century. The benign indifference of the educational establishment towards Hispanic underachievement prompted George I. Sánchez, an Albuquerque-area educator and intellectual, to lament that *nuevomexicanos* were essentially a “forgotten people.”²

In all of its contradictions, organizational challenges, and ultimate consolidation and growth, the story of public education in Albuquerque very much reflects the larger story of the general formation of education in New Mexico and the greater U.S. Southwest. The experience of education stakeholders in communities in Albuquerque will serve as a basis for a discussion and analysis of the broader historical patterns taking place in the territory in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, particularly within the context of turn-of-the-century New Mexico’s overall Americanization and stronger integration into the U.S. body politic.

The Albuquerque Academy 1879-1891

The first common schools in New Mexico opened under the auspices of various Protestant denominations, initiating a gradual transformation of the territory’s sociocultural setting aimed at better incorporating New Mexico into the United States. Though public in the sense that these schools were available for boys and girls in the

2. George Sánchez, *Forgotten People: A Study of New Mexicans* (Albuquerque, NM: Calvin Horn, 1970), 98.

community at large, these early common schools did not receive public funding as no legal mechanism for the raising of public school monies existed until 1891. As may be remembered, these early common schools also had a strong religious character. Baptist preachers arrived first and set up schools, followed by the Methodists, the Presbyterians, and other Protestant denominations. These early common schools taught basic reading, writing, and arithmetic skills in addition to imparting their specific sectarian tenets of faith. Nevertheless many of these early schools closed due to a serious lack of funding and the actions of Catholic leaders such as Archbishop Jean Baptiste Lamy. Citing the Protestant religious content of contemporary public schools – and evidenced in some of the writings of the famed educational reformer Horace Mann – Lamy argued that these schools were threats to the spiritual well-being of Catholic *nuevomexicanos* and instead promoted the establishing of Catholic schools, sometimes successfully securing public funding.³ It is in that context that Albuquerque, still centered in what is now Old Town, received its first schools with the Jesuit Order's school for boys in 1872 and the Catholic Sisters of Charity's Angels Private School and the St. Vincent's Academy for Girls opening in 1881.⁴

3. John B. Mondragón and Ernest B. Stapleton, *Public Education in New Mexico* (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2005). 16. For a more detailed discussion and analysis of the diverse issues that affected the debate over public education in New Mexico and the Catholic church's positions on these issues, please consult Dianna Everett, "The Public School Debate in New Mexico: 1850-1891," *Arizona and the West* 26, no. 2 (1984), 107-134.

4. Marc Simmons, *Albuquerque: A Narrative History* (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1982), 304-308.

The spirit of common schools inspired by Protestant ideals played a significant role in the formation of public schools in Albuquerque. The Congregational Church, based in Boston, Massachusetts, formed the New West Education Commission in 1879 in the hopes of promoting the rise of a non-denominational Christian education to communities in Utah and New Mexico “for the purpose of planting Christian schools in the Western territories, where Mormonism, Medieval superstition, and ignorance were found.”⁵ More than 2,000 Congregational Churches across the U.S. helped fund the New West Education Commission’s project.⁶

With the help of young teachers from Colorado College – a private liberal arts college located near Colorado Springs – the Albuquerque Academy sought to create scholars, impart Protestant Christian morals, and achieve the aforementioned dream of a single U.S. nationalism. Academy educators stressed they wished for their students to prepare themselves for higher education or “practical life” within a “Christian atmosphere.”⁷ It was hoped that the Academy could serve as an alternative to the area’s Catholic parochial schools, although the Presbyterian Church opened its own school – the

5. Catalogue of Albuquerque Academy 1890-1891, p. 19, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers.

6. Edmund Lyman Hood, *The New West Commission 1880-1893* (Jacksonville, FL: H. and W. B. Drew Company, 1905), 27. The New West Education Commission opened its first educational academy in Utah as an attempt to contain the growth of Mormonism; the commission then turned its attention to Albuquerque.

7. Catalogue of Albuquerque Academy 1890-1891, p. 21, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers. Though described as “non-sectarian” by persons involved with the school and its curriculum, the reality was that it was not quite a public school as it had strong elements of Protestant religious belief embedded in the curriculum.

Missions Menaul School – to the north of the community while the Methodist Church also opened the Harwood Schools for Boys and Girls, both in the 1880s. The Academy teaching staff was composed mostly of young women, although Indiana native Charles Elkanah Hodgin began his long teaching career in Albuquerque as a teacher in the Academy in 1886.⁸

The work of the New West Education Commission in Albuquerque initiated just as the Duke City began to be linked with eastern U.S. cities with the arrival of the Atchinson, Topeka, and Santa Fe (ATSF) Railroad. As was the case with so many other predominantly-Hispanic communities throughout the borderlands – such as San Antonio, Las Vegas, Tucson, and El Paso – once the railroads arrived in town, with all of their promises of economic and material transformation, so too did the transformation of the community's demographics and social order. In Albuquerque the historic center of the population since the 1706 founding of the Spanish town had been the town plaza (in what is today Old Town) and remained as such during the Mexican and early territorial periods with a large Hispanic population. However, the ATSF Railroad was routed nearly two miles east of the historic plaza; along the railroad's route a newer, more Anglo town emerged – New Town. The newer Albuquerque grew exponentially with the arrival of migrants from points east. With the growth in demographic size and economic clout, the newer, whiter Albuquerque to the east became an incorporated city and soon dominated the north-central New Mexico area. As Albuquerque became known more as an Anglo

8. Throughout his time at the school, Hodgin was usually the only male staff member on the Academy faculty list.

town in comparison to the more overtly Hispanic communities in Santa Fe and the Rio Arriba region. Beyond serving merely as the next step in the educational system in this community, the New West Education Commission's efforts heralded the beginning of a new social and cultural order in the life of Hispanic Albuquerque.

The Academy's informational pamphlets stated the school did not wish to "antagonize the public schools" not yet existing in New Mexico, serving as a transitional institution until government-organized public schools took root. On October 14, 1879, the Albuquerque Academy opened at its original site in Old Town Albuquerque "in the characteristic adobe" and "after two years with the peculiar surroundings of a Mexican village the school was moved to temporary quarters in the new town, then but a few months old."⁹ This detail from the Academy's relocation from the more Hispanic Old Town area to the predominantly-Anglo New Town along the railroad to the east is highly symbolic and demonstrates one aspect of the changing sociocultural conditions in Albuquerque and the rest of New Mexico.

Despite the cultural preferences the school demonstrated in leaving the "Mexican village", the Academy in Albuquerque was viewed with respect. The curriculum also included shop and industrial arts, while also teaching students reading, arithmetic, literature, and foreign languages such as Spanish, German, and French. For monthly tuition fees amounting to about \$3, the Albuquerque Academy sought to instill the best

9. Simmons, *Albuquerque: A Narrative History*, 308; Catalogue of Albuquerque Academy 1890-1891, p. 19, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers. The original location of the Albuquerque Academy was at the site now currently occupied by the La Placita Restaurant on the eastern edge of the main plaza in Old Town Albuquerque.

education it could in its students.¹⁰ However, with the founding of Albuquerque Public Schools in 1891, the Albuquerque Academy ceased to exist. Its facilities and staff were absorbed into the emerging APS system. The Academy's stated mission of serving as a placeholder for the public schools had been fulfilled.

In later years the Academy's Spanish teacher – a position always staffed by an Anglo woman as indicated by the Academy's annual reports – would also take on the role of English teacher as she was generally given charge of immersing monolingual Spanish-speakers into U.S. English. Pupils entering the Academy with a limited proficiency in English were required to take the immersion courses offered by the “Mexican Department” before being allowed to proceed to their respective grade in school. One annual report for the Academy stated these Mexican students “generally so neglected at home, are getting a taste of a more progressive life and many are appreciating the advantages.”¹¹ The subtle overtones in the Academy's annual report suggest that school officials saw their Mexican students as possessing a cultural and intellectual deficit due to their upbringing and home life – a problem that the Academy was supposedly able to remedy. The patronizing generalizations in this statement can only make one wonder about the day-to-day rhetoric that pupils may have been subjected to from their teachers.

10. Eldred R. Harrington, “History of the Albuquerque High School: 1879-1955” (Albuquerque, NM: Self-published, 1955), 7.

11. Catalogue of Albuquerque Academy 1890-1891, p. 20, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers.



Figure 4.1: In its seventh year of operation, the Albuquerque Academy photographed one of its classes belonging to the school’s English-language acquisition program, or the “Mexican Department.” (Albright, Emma L., Eddie Ross Cobb, William Henry Cobb, M.B. Howard, “Students of the Mexican Dept,” 1886. Courtesy of the Center for Southwest Research and Special Collections, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.)

One surviving picture of the Albuquerque Academy’s “Mexican Department” vividly illustrates the nature of the language immersion department in the city’s main common school. A sizeable group of students varying in ages composed this English-language immersion department during the time this picture was taken. Although it is difficult to determine the details of the “department’s” curriculum due to the dearth of information on this topic that has survived via documentation, it is clear from extant sources that Hispanic- and Mexican-heritage students had to develop their English skills in classrooms like these before being granted permission to advance through school

within their rightful grade-level.¹² Thus, many non-English-speaking youngsters would fall behind in their academic learning while struggling to acquire enough mastery of the English language before moving on. Recall that besides the late start that many students would thus get for many academic content areas many students would also be teased for their being “behind” and would be considered less cognitively capable of learning as a result of their Americanization class participation.¹³ Despite the problems with this language-acquisition policy, this model was widely used at the Academy throughout the 1880s. According to annual reports kept by the Academy’s administrators, enrollment at the main campus’s Mexican Department and its mostly-Hispanic south side school in the Barelás area, which replicated the Mexican Department’s pedagogical practices, totaled 60 and 78, respectively, within a larger school population of 475 students in 1891.¹⁴

The policy of segregating Hispanic students of different ages together in order to learn basic English communication skills later attracted critics. The noted researcher and Albuquerque High School Class of 1923 graduate George Isidoro Sánchez, for example, questioned the language acquisition benefits of learning English in a high-pressure immersion setting. “Children leave school not only without a mastery of subject-matter

12. First Annual Report of Albuquerque Academy with Catalogue of Officers and Students, p. 6, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers.

13. Barbara A. Zsembik and Daniel Llanes, “Generational Differences in Educational Attainment Among Mexican Americans,” *Social Science Quarterly* 77, no. 2 (June 1996), 365.

14. Catalogue of Albuquerque Academy 1890-1891, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers.

fundamentals, but without a mastery of language,” Sanchez wrote.¹⁵ Like many later educational researchers, Sánchez argued that bilingual education and integrating non-English-speakers with proficient English-speakers would achieve better learning results, as opposed to the prevailing practice segregating them and negatively affecting their language and content-area learning. George Sánchez’s criticisms were not directed specifically at the Academy but rather towards the larger prevalence of this model within the public education system of the U.S-Mexico borderlands. Guadalupe Baca Vaughn, a teacher in Rinconada, New Mexico, in the 1920s and 1930s recalled the English-only instruction she, as a public school teacher, was expected to impart and lamented that she “could not speak Spanish to the kids. And those poor little things, they would come and they didn’t know what you were talking about.”¹⁶

Nevertheless, the English acquisition pedagogy associated with “Mexican Department” at the Academy produced the sort of poor results that Sánchez condemned so vociferously in his writings. Indeed, the Academy’s annual reports make no mention of Hispanic-surnamed students participating in the Academy’s main school events, such as the prize-speaking functions the school occasionally held.¹⁷ Worse, none of the small graduating classes that emerged from the Albuquerque Academy – typically numbering only two or three female students – included Spanish-surnamed graduates. Within the

15. Sánchez, *Forgotten People*, 79.

16. Guadalupe Baca Vaughn, interview by Erlinda Gonzales-Berry, March 18, 1992, transcript, Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project, Center for Southwest Research, General Library, University of New Mexico.

Academy's Spanish Department the opportunity existed for people of Mexican ancestry to learn Spanish, but not until "after they have attained a good degree of efficiency in speaking, reading, and writing English." Moreover, the 1882-1883 annual report for the Academy stated "The better class of our Spanish-speaking population begin to realize the fact that not many years hence English will become the official language of the Territory. Hence they are very anxious to have their children learn English."¹⁸

The dearth of primary documents pertaining to the Mexican Department at the Academy makes it necessary to consider the nature of this separate classroom from the perspective of other examples of "Mexican Departments" and segregated classes throughout the U.S. Southwest. Schools playing host to "Mexican departments" or "Mexican rooms" in other Southwestern cities such as Tucson and Phoenix were known to combine students of different grades together because of their shared limited English skills. These so-called Mexican departments were known to utilize corporal punishment to deter students from speaking their native language; school officials also prohibited students from speaking Spanish outside of class while on the school grounds. In addition to having their mouths washed with soap for speaking Spanish on the playground, students often also had to withstand administrators' admonitions to forget "every word of

17. 1886-1887 Albuquerque Academy Annual Report, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgkin Papers.

18. Albuquerque Academy Annual Report 1882-1883, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgkin Papers.

their mother tongue” if they wished to succeed in the U.S.¹⁹ Josie Savage, a *nuevomexicana* resident from Albuquerque’s Old Town and a student in Albuquerque schools in the 1930s and 1940s, recalled that her teachers “were very strict with us and would not allow us to speak Spanish at all. They would punish us for it and therefore I learned to speak English very well.”²⁰

While the extant documentary evidence available more than a century after the closing of the Academy does not demonstrate that the more violent physical aspects of Americanization associated with other regional schools also took place in Albuquerque in the 1890s, the occurrence of these events throughout the U.S. Southwest helps contextualize the realities of the Albuquerque Academy (and later APS) within broader patterns. The underrepresentation of Hispanic students in the Academy’s higher grade levels and graduation lists is a stark aspect of this history that was matched by similar patterns of Hispanic underrepresentation in high-school level educational attainment throughout the U.S.-Mexico borderlands. The Albuquerque Academy’s attempts to promote English literacy and Americanism in its curriculum occurred at a time when the territory of New Mexico still lacked a public education system and an inherent coordinating governmental agency that directed curricula in terms of language

19. Jeanne M. Powers, “Forgotten History: Mexican American School Segregation in Arizona from 1900-1951,” *Equity and Excellence in Education* 41 (2008): 472-474. See also Rubén Donato, *Mexicanos and Hispanos in Colorado Schools and Communities, 1920-1960* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2007).

20. Josie Savage, interview with Benny Andrés, Jr., March 3, 1995, transcript, Oral History Interviews of the Voices: Old Town Albuquerque Oral History Project, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.

instruction; moves to compel English-language instruction and its accompanying ideal of Americanization in all of New Mexico's schools did not take place until 1907.²¹ In an age when New Mexico was still in the gradual process of integration into the larger U.S. political-economic scene, the rising pressures on English proficiency had a ubiquitous role in the formation of early public education. As mentioned previously, the pro-English language and Americanizing pedagogical orientation of the Albuquerque Academy (which included instructing the students in respecting the U.S. flag and honoring the pantheon of U.S. heroes such as George Washington) survived even after the Academy and its staff was absorbed into the Albuquerque Public Schools after 1891.

Before transitioning to the experiences of Hispanic students in the Albuquerque Public Schools system which arose after 1891, it is necessary to expand on how the experiences of Hispanic students at the Albuquerque Academy also fits into a larger interethnic/interracial perspective by briefly mentioning how American Indians in the borderlands, including New Mexico and Arizona, underwent education during the Progressive-era Americanization. In discussing the specific problems that American Indian schoolchildren experienced during the same time that Hispanic students had challenges in early borderlands public schools one can see the deep commonalities the two different groups faced amid their similar subjection to Americanization pedagogies. However, unlike the challenges faced by their Hispanic neighbors, American Indian

21. Erlinda Gonzales-Berry, "Which Language Will Our Children Speak?" in *The Contested Homeland: A Chicano History of New Mexico*, ed. Erlinda Gonzales-Berry and David R. Maciel, (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2000), 170-172.

communities in New Mexico underwent a forced policy of cultural assimilation into the White Anglo mainstream of the period.

Though the curriculum of essentially all U.S. southwestern schools was aimed at molding better citizens out of all attendees through the incorporation of the Americanization ideology and English-language literacy, schools designed for American Indian students were the most blatant in their attempts to instill dominant cultural norms among indigenous youth by depriving them of their home culture and language. One latter-nineteenth century leader in the Bureau of Indian Commissions saw commonality between the freed African American slaves and American Indians. “We could not fit the negro for freedom till we made him free,” the author wrote, “We shall never fit the Indian for citizenship till we make him a citizen.”²² The education of American Indians took many shapes and forms during the latter part of the 1800s, including reservation day-schools as well as the more infamous off-reservation boarding schools such as the Haskell Institute in Kansas and the Carlisle Indian School in Pennsylvania; this period also saw the establishment of similar schools in Santa Fe, Phoenix, and even in the Duke City with the Albuquerque Indian School.

Opening its doors beginning in 1884, this institution, known formally as the U.S. Indian Training School, followed a curriculum which stressed the need for Native youth to assimilate into the dominant culture by adopting English and white middle class customs to the furthest extent. The school’s industrial instructions promoted the

22. Cathleen Cahill, *Federal Fathers and Mothers: A Social History of the United States Indian Service, 1869-1933* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2011), 27.

development of work skills among young indigenous men such as carpentry and painting; roles of domesticity were strongly taught to young ladies at the school where they were expected to excel in sewing and cooking. Reflecting on the U.S. government's practice of forcing children to attend schools such as the Albuquerque Indian School, historian K. Tsianina Lomawaima has argued that policymakers enacted these subtractive Americanization practices because they "calculated these practices to achieve far-reaching social goals, to civilize and Christianize young Indian people and so draw them away from tribal identification and communal living."²³ Indigenous students at schools like the one in Albuquerque were "permitted to retain their traditional clothing only long enough to have a photograph taken (which might later be used to contrast with their 'civilized' look); new pupils were issued a uniform, school clothes, and work outfits, and were assigned a dormitory."²⁴ The militaristic sociopolitical agenda of these boarding schools often trumped the academic nature of schooling. One female Santa Clara Pueblo alumna recalled "we were drilled marching to breakfast and again drilled going back to the dormitory. And we were drilled in the school yard." Additionally, the *Santa Fe New Mexican* recently reminded readers in the new millennium that "During Sunday Dress

23. Margaret Connell Szasz, "Listening to the Native Voice: American Indian Schooling in the Twentieth Century," *Montana: The Magazine of Western History* 39, no. 3 (1989), 45; K. Tsianina Lomawaima, "Domesticity in the Federal Indian Schools: The Power of Authority over Mind and Body," *American Ethnologist* 20, no. 2 (1993), 227.

24. Robert A. Trennert, Jr., *The Phoenix Indian School: Forced Assimilation in Arizona, 1891-1935* (Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1988), 115.

Parade at the Albuquerque Indian School, each student carried a dummy rifle and was dressed up as in the regular army."²⁵

The experiences that Hispanic and American Indian students experienced in their schools were very different in terms of the degree of cultural violence unleashed against them through some of the more contemptible episodes in identity-formation politics in the U.S.-Mexico borderlands, but the underlying rationale for treating these students and their families was the same. For some policymakers American Indian, Mexican American, and *nuevomexicano* students simply weren't "American" enough because of their linguistic and cultural background and therefore needed to be incorporated into the nation by having subtracting the bad elements from their backgrounds and replacing it with a new and Americanized identity. Thus, as violent as some of these circumstances could become, it was necessary to transform them into more allegedly competent members of society in order to better serve the state, even if (particularly in the case of American Indians) the knowledge that was imparted to them was more of a vocational nature than that which might have been presented to Anglo students.

25. Marc Simmons, "Trail Dust: Indian Schools' History Militaristic, Checkered," *Santa Fe New Mexican* (August 21, 2009), <http://www.santafenewmexican.com/local%20news/indian-schools--history-militaristic--checkered>. (Accessed April 17, 2012). The other point of reference in this comparative analysis, Nogales, lacked a sizeable American Indian population and thus no Indian School existed in the history of that community. The Phoenix Indian School (administered by the U.S. government) and the Tucson Indian Training School (administered by the Presbyterian Church) educated the Tohono O'odham (Pápagó) peoples that lived north and west of the border town of Nogales.

Thus beyond merely teaching the de-facto language of the U.S. to young Hispanic children in Albuquerque, the Academy's Mexican Department also fit into a larger nationalist discourse with respect to the cross-racial/ethnic applicability of the Americanization pedagogical paradigm. When Albuquerque's Menaul School superintendent J.C. Ross wrote in 1911 that Hispanic American households lived in "comparative poverty" all the while lacking "any inspiring or uplifting influences," his comments were but one manifestation of a larger national discourse about the deficits ethnic minorities in the U.S. held vis-à-vis the dominant Anglo group's language and culture.²⁶ Combined with statements written by Albuquerque Academy staff in the school's annual report, it can be seen how Ross's statements and the attitudes of Albuquerque educators impelling students to learn the English language also subtly promoted the ideal of replacing, through the saving graces of Americanism, the less "uplifting influences" of the Hispanic and Mexican heritages of students. In this sense, the identity-formation discourse and curriculum espoused by national figures such as Roosevelt and educational leaders like Ross and Hodgins has been labeled by historian Carlos Kevin Blanton as "subtractive Americanization" for its attempts at removing a child's heritage culture and replacing it with dominant white middle class nationalistic values.²⁷ The object of these measures sought to promote the cohesiveness of a U.S.

26. J.C. Ross, "Industrial Education for the Spanish-speaking people," *New Mexico Journal of Education* 7 (Feb., 1911): 20-21, quoted in Lynne Marie Getz, *Schools of Their Own: The Education of Hispanos in New Mexico, 1850-1940* (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1997), 24.

27. For a greater discussion on the issues of subtractive Americanization and their effects on the Hispanic population of Texas, please see Carlos Kevin Blanton, *The*

national and civic identity among students in U.S. public schools with the aim of solidifying the demographic and cultural identity of the national U.S. body politic. As localized as the experiences pertaining to the Albuquerque Academy might seem, they were a component of a broader national pattern in which ethnic minority children such as Hispanic children – and especially American Indians – were brutally subjected to this nationalist pedagogy which sought to construct a collective identity by destroying individual cultural and linguistic diversity.²⁸

Students and Educational Attainment in the Albuquerque Public Schools 1891-1942

The English acquisition policies geared to students of Mexican ancestry seen in the former Albuquerque Academy continued to go hand-in-hand with the policies of promoting the ideals of Americanization in the Albuquerque Public Schools. Whereas the Albuquerque Academy could only take in so many students who could afford to pay the schools tuition, the publically-funded APS system finally allowed all residents of Albuquerque to attend classes at the primary and secondary levels. Because of the

Strange Career of Bilingual Education in Texas: 1836-1981, (College Station, TX: Texas A&M University Press, 2007), 60.

28. The odyssey that American Indian students and their families experienced was often of a more emotionally and physically violent nature than anything Hispanic students in the Southwest experienced which included the forced enrollment of indigenous youth at off-reservation boarding schools. For more on the experiences of American Indians in education and identity-formation in the U.S. West please see Tsiannina Lomawaima's important work *They Called it Prairie Light: The Story of Chilocco Indian School* (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1994) as well as David Wallace Adams's *Education for Extinction: American Indians and the Boarding School Experience, 1875-1928* (Lawrence, KS: University Press of Kansas, 1995).

increased access to education, the issue of educational attainment among Albuquerque-area Hispanic schoolchildren takes particular importance, given the rhetoric employed within these schools. As in the Albuquerque Academy, APS schools, including Albuquerque High School, functioned with the goal that all students acquire a common American identity.

Again, Americanization was not limited to only an Albuquerque context. Education historians L. Dean Webb, Arlene Metha, and K. Forbis Johnson write “Common schools were expected to create such conformity in American life by imposing the language and ideological outlook of the dominant group.” These historians go further. “By using English as the medium of instruction, the common schools were expected to create an English-speaking citizenry; by cultivating a general value orientation based on Protestant Christianity, the schools were expected to create a general American ethic.”²⁹ Indeed, as New Mexico Superintendent of Public Instruction James E. Clark wrote in 1907, “No greater advantage can be given by our public schools to the children of Spanish-American parents than a thorough training in English. Both parents and children appreciate this and the all-English elementary public school is becoming more and more popular in the outlying districts where the demand has been made heretofore for instruction in the Spanish language with the use of the Spanish text-books.”³⁰ As stated

29. Hayes, *Horace Mann’s Vision*, 31.

30. *Annual Reports of the Territorial Superintendent of Public Instruction to the Governor of New Mexico for the Years 1907-1908* (Santa Fe: New Mexican Printing Co., 1908), 77, quoted in Getz, *Schools of Their Own*, 21.

earlier, the goal of this subtractive Americanization was to form a single, cohesive unit in terms of U.S. nation-building among its varied ethnic groups.

In New Mexico this move towards Americanization did not go unchallenged by Hispanic residents concerned with a potential loss of culture. Hispanic political leaders wielded enough power at New Mexico's 1910 Constitutional Convention to ensure that the state *magna carta* protected the linguistic rights of Spanish-speaking *nuevomexicanos*, a key point of divergence from neighboring Arizona's constitution which lacked such a protection. Article XII of the New Mexico Constitution included a proviso mandating state legislators "provide for the training of teachers in the normal schools or otherwise so that they may become proficient in both the English and Spanish languages, to qualify them to teach Spanish-speaking pupils and students in the public schools and educational institutions of the State" (Section 8) as well as a proviso proclaiming the educational rights of Hispanic children (Section 10). Section 10 of Article XII specifically prohibited the segregation of Spanish-speaking students.³¹

These provisions laid the groundwork for future legislation that established bilingual education later in the twentieth century, but as unique and progressive as these provisions were, the legislature's lack of interest in fully funding Section 8 led to discernible problems in rural New Mexico schools. Also, despite the egalitarian language of Section 10 – again, a clear contrast to the Arizona situation where "Mexican schools" opened in places like Phoenix – the reality of conditions in New Mexican schools meant

31. "Constitution of New Mexico 1912," in *Foreigners in Their Native Land: Historical Roots of the Mexican Americans*, ed. David Weber (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1973), 247-248.

that while students might not have been segregated into separate school grounds, the popularity of the Americanization paradigm meant that a student's native culture might not necessarily be welcomed at school. The experiences of students in APS during the turn of the century exemplify the disconnect between the language of the New Mexico Constitution and the poor educational results achieved in schools throughout the state when the Americanization theme still received support from teachers and administrators.

Notable examples of this Americanization spirit played out in the very first school years of the APS. During the February 22, 1892, celebrations for Washington's Birthday, teachers in the district's fledgling schools had lessons pertaining to patriotism and the first president's life. During the ceremonies, special attention was given to the U.S. flag as a means of instilling national fervor among the students. Ms. Mattie Sharpe, one of the Spanish-language teachers, reported that she "found it difficult to explain the occasion of the flags to the Mexican children."

Later in the fall of 1892 the APS schools once again displayed the phenomenon of national-identity formation. This time the event in question was the quadricentennial of Columbus's 1492 landings in the Bahamas, marking another major opportunity of disseminating national pride. The pageant celebrated on October 21, 1892, made much ado about the implications of Columbus's "discovery" for the future United States with presentations titled "How Columbus Found America", "Columbia's Banner", "The Great Discoverer", "America", and "Three Ships." The content of these student and community-leader presentations (all given by Anglo residents) clearly extolled the civilizing nature of the Genoese navigator's journeys as a means of propelling the mythos of western progress acting as a force of enlightenment for a dark continent.

Commemoration of the event celebrated the region's Spanish conquistadors while celebration of Albuquerque's various pre-Columbian indigenous traditions was limited to presentations such as a costumed dance titled "Columbus Saw Ten Little Indians."³² While the celebration of Columbus Day had parallels in Latin American countries, the observance of this holiday in U.S. schools emphasized a westward-expansionist, European-centric understanding of the country. Therefore celebrations such as Washington's Birthday and the Columbus Day commemoration in early APS served to bolster U.S. identity-construction among students. These events vividly bear witness to the spirit of Americanization that manifested itself at the turn of the century, an effort only bolstered by the English acquisition policies of the day.

In the turn of the century mindset, New Mexicans needed to assimilate culturally in order to enjoy the benefits of full union with the U.S. body politic, thus the significance of American nationalistic school functions like Washington's Birthday, Columbus Day, and other similar culturally-relevant holidays celebrated in early APS and other New Mexican schools. Reflecting on this need for Americanization, one writer in the April 1907 issue of the *New Mexico Journal of Education* wrote "The mind of the native child resembles New Mexico's arid lands awaiting but proper cultivation to become fruitful and productive. After one or two generations have been under the influence of the present system of education, there will be no native child to teach." Heralding the de-Hispanicization of New Mexican children, the writer stated that the educational aspects of

32. Hodgin 1891-1894 APS Superintendent Notebook, Box 4, Folder 1, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers.

Americanization would make the typical *nuevomexicano* “an American not because he will be living under the American flag, not because he will be speaking the English language, but because having received the same education, he will have the same aspiration and the same American spirit.”³³ Perhaps then it is little wonder that many Hispanic family names during this time of Americanization became Anglicized from Martínez to Martin, for instance, or as in Josie Savage’s case from Josefina, to Josephine, to finally Josie. Often, as in Josie Savage’s case, a doctor would write an Anglicized name on a Hispanic child’s birth certificate while in other cases individuals changed their names “simply because it was easier for somebody else to write it down in another way.”³⁴ Thus not only was the struggle for identity-formation limited to the realm of ideology and citizenship, it was also waged through bureaucratic decisions and imposed cultural pressures that brought changes to the Hispanic community, even in the giving of names – this latter situation serving as a more overt manifestation of Americanization. Although eastern U.S. politicians like Albert Beveridge derided New Mexican society for being too foreign, the political reality of U.S. rule and local economic development propelled societal changes that led to cultural drift as seen in the substitution of Hispanic names for more Anglo ones in *nuevomexicano* families.

The Americanization/English-acquisition curricula in the early Albuquerque Public Schools certainly had its effect on local cultural drift, but how did these policies impact actual educational attainment for Hispanic youth? This effect, for the first half of

33. Gonzales-Berry, “Which Language Will Our Children Speak?” 170-172; 186.

34. Savage, interview with Benny Andrés.

the twentieth century, can be evaluated from the presence of Spanish-surnamed students in the lists of candidates for graduation from Albuquerque High School. As the only public high school in Albuquerque and surrounding Bernalillo County until 1949, a perusal of Albuquerque High School's annual yearbook, *La Reata*, reveals much about the successful retention of Hispanic students in APS during a time in which it operated under the Americanization/English-only pedagogical paradigm. In the 1960s the civic consciousness of Hispanic/Chicano activists in New Mexico brought about a paradigmatic change as bilingual education became a viable pedagogical option, but prior to that plain English-immersion was the norm. An analysis of the lists for candidates for graduation for the years 1892-1942, the first fifty-years of Albuquerque High School, documents the community's growth and greater accessibility to public education as well as the lackluster graduation figures for Spanish-surnamed individuals.³⁵

35. Albuquerque High School's *La Reata* was published beginning in 1909. Early volumes of *La Reata* include details of students' activities at school, their faculty, and even lists of Albuquerque High School alumni. The 1916 edition of *La Reata* is most helpful in piecing together this history as it includes a roster of graduates from the school for 1892-1915. Other early editions of *La Reata* also include lists of recent alumni and their whereabouts as of the publication time of the yearbook, but that practice disappeared in the early 1920s. The statistics determined from these lists do not include the figures for 1932 and 1933, years for which editions of *La Reata* are unavailable in public repositories. In calculating these statistics, Hispanic background was determined based on whether a student possessed a Spanish-surname, although when one considers the Anglicization of Hispanic names at the time and interracial marriage, this criteria becomes problematic and makes it highly likely that Hispanic students who did not have Spanish-surnames (but were still considered Hispanic for various reasons) were not included in study data when in fact. Every effort has been made to ascertain this data as accurately as possible based on the available information in copies of *La Reata* held at the University of New Mexico Zimmerman Library and the Albuquerque-Bernalillo County Public Library. For a list of early Albuquerque High alumni, please consult *La Reata* (Albuquerque, NM: Albuquerque High School Printing Department, 1916). The title of *La Reata*, meaning ropes or lasso in Spanish, is indicative of how many Anglo Americans

10,802 individuals graduated from Albuquerque High School between 1892-1942, with the majority of these students (5,774) graduating in the second half (1917-1942) of this specific time period. Graduating classes from the second half of this period averaged 231 in size, although some classes numbered as many as 693 students. During this time Spanish-surnamed students (many of whom undoubtedly went through the English language-acquisition and Americanization program if they were originally non-English speakers) numbered 1,067, comprising 18.4% of the total number of students graduating from Albuquerque High School from 1917-1942. Although the exact number of Hispanic residents of Albuquerque is difficult to determine from the ambiguous U.S. Census records prior to 1970, it is evident that the small number of Hispanic students graduating from Albuquerque High School was in no way representative of the large Hispanic population of the Duke City. These figures instead suggest that successful completion of high school study for Hispanic ancestry Albuquerque residents was very low.³⁶

in twentieth century New Mexico appropriated Spanish-language words, symbols, and other things into contemporary artistic products and similar other artifacts at a time when New Mexican Hispanos and Mexican people throughout the U.S. Southwest were generally being denigrated precisely on account of their cultural identity. For more on this, see William Deverell, *Whitewashed Adobe: The Rise of Los Angeles and the Remaking of its Mexican Past* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004).

36. The U.S. Census's documentation of race throughout its censuses demonstrates the census-takers' own reflection of changing societal conceptualizations of race and ethnicity. For example, race background data for censuses from 1790-1850 simply sought to determine whether residents were white or black (and slave or free); American Indians were completely ignored in most enumerations until the 1890s. With specific respect to data collection regarding persons that can be labeled as Hispanic or Latino in the new millennium, the paper trail is even more byzantine. Until the 1970s when persons of Hispanic or Latino ancestry were labeled under the term "Hispanic", Hispanics were usually grouped with "white" in the decennial enumerations although an attempt was made in the 1930 Census to identify Mexican Americans and Mexican

As stark as that data is, the discrepancy between the size of the large Hispanic population of Albuquerque and its limited educational attainment is even more pronounced in the first half of this period in question, 1892-1916. In this respect, the case of Soledad Chávez Chacón is particularly salient. Later serving as New Mexico's Secretary of State from 1923-1926 – including a brief two-week stint from June 21-July 5, 1924 during which she served as Acting Governor of New Mexico, the first woman to hold a governorship anywhere in the U.S. – Chávez Chacón was born in 1890 and studied in the early APS system. By the time Chávez Chacón graduated from Albuquerque High School in 1908, “Sallie,” as her mostly Anglo classmates called her, was one of only two Hispanic students (both women) to have graduated within that school's first sixteen commencement classes in the years 1892-1911.³⁷ Between the graduation of the first

immigrants by labeling “Mexican” as a race for the purposes of that census (it should be noted that this categorization only applied to Mexican-heritage individuals who were relatively more recent arrivals to the U.S., i.e., whose parents were at least born in Mexico). In the 1940 Census “Mexican” was no longer considered a race by the U.S. Census Bureau, but data was collected of “the White population of Spanish mother tongue” which some census analysts have seen as an indicator of the Hispanic population of the U.S. at the time. Although this is very helpful at the national and state levels, this data is not available for the county or city level which makes arriving at a precise determination of Albuquerque's Hispanic population extremely difficult. Please see Campbell Gibson and Kay Jung, “Historical Census Statistics on Population Totals By Race, 1790 to 1990, and By Hispanic Origin, 1970 to 1990, For The United States, Regions, Divisions, and States” in *Working Paper Series* no. 56 (Washington, D.C.: Population Division U.S. Census Bureau, 2002), <http://www.census.gov/population/www/documentation/twps0056/twps0056.html#gd> (accessed Feb. 12, 2013).

37. Dan D. Chávez, *Soledad Chávez Chacón: A New Mexico Political Pioneer, 1890-1936* (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Printing Services, 1996), 5-6. Soledad Chávez Chacón died at a relatively young age in 1936 while serving as state representative in the Roundhouse in Santa Fe. Despite her early passing, her prolific involvement in politics is a strong example of *nuevomexicana* political activism during

Hispanic Albuquerque High School alumna in 1898 and Soledad Chávez Chácon no other Spanish-surnamed individuals graduated from APS's secondary education institution. Four years passed after Chávez Chácon's commencement before Hispanic students again graduated from Albuquerque High School; the first male Hispanic did not graduate AHS until 1912.³⁸ In the period 1892-1916 Albuquerque High School graduated 308 students with the average graduating class numbering 15 students. Nevertheless, only 12 students with Spanish-surnames graduated during that time, representing only 4% of all graduates, a miniscule figure in a city with as large a Hispanic population as Albuquerque.³⁹

Besides these poor educational attainment and retention statistics, it should be noted that no Hispanic faculty member worked at Albuquerque High School until 1920 when the school hired two Hispanic teachers, J.C. Espinoza and Imelda Espinosa (wife of

the early twentieth century. For further Chávez Chacón information please also consult Mauricio Vigil, "The Political Development of New Mexico Hispanas," in *Contested Homeland*, 191-213.

38. The first Hispanic alumnus, Raymond Espinosa, graduated in 1912. By the time Soledad Chávez Chácon graduated in 1909 only fifteen men, none of them Hispanic, were among the High School's graduates. In many ways Chavez Chacon clearly was a statistical outlier at the time of her graduation as opposed to the norm; please see *La Reata* (1916).

39. Between 1892-1916 Albuquerque High School graduated 308 students, with an overall average of 14.6 students graduating each year (308 divided by 21, the number of years in which students graduated from AHS, which excludes the years in which there were no graduating classes); with only 12 Spanish-surnamed students graduating from AHS during that 21-year period, the yearly average of Spanish-surnamed graduates from AHS is 0.57. Taken as a percentage of the overall 308 students who graduates, Spanish-surnamed students made up only 3.9% of all Albuquerque High School graduates from 1892-1916. For 17 different graduating classes, there were no Hispanic students present

future congressman and U.S. Senator Dennis Chavez), to teach Spanish. By the 1937-1938 school year the number of Hispanic faculty at the high school rose to four, but all of them taught Spanish. Though many of these dedicated teachers, such as Anita Ayala, Dionisio Costales, and Elizabeth “Kitty” Montoya, taught for many consecutive years at the high school, they were usually locked into teaching only Castilian.⁴⁰ Hispanic faculty at Albuquerque’s largest public school were extremely rare between 1892 and 1942; when they did serve as teachers at the school, it was almost always in Spanish, suggestive that, just as in Nogales, APS administrators did not consider it important for Hispanic educators to teach the core content areas in a community with a very sizeable Hispanic population.⁴¹

whatsoever. In early years, the total number of graduating seniors for each class could be counted in the single digits.

40. This pattern of not hiring Hispanic educators to teach the core subjects seems to have gone unbroken until 1940 with the hiring of Fred Marela as a modern history teacher, although the author is unable to verify whether Marela is a Spanish-surname; please see *La Reata* (Albuquerque, NM: Albuquerque High School Printing Department, 1940). It should also be noted that Imelda Espinosa was listed as “Mrs. Dennis Chavez” in the 1921 edition of *La Reata*.

41. The 1929 edition of *La Reata* includes a list of the Albuquerque High School faculty. Its demographic composition was fairly typical of AHS faculties between 1891-1942. *La Reata* listed the faculty as follows: in the English Department, Florence Hickman, Florence Clemons, Helen O’Hara, Lila T. Brown, Eleanor Fairchild, Mary Spaulding, and Barbara E. Phillips as department head; in history, Margaret Fronson, Clara Speckman, Benjamin Sacks, and Mary Cole Dixon, Head of the Department and also Vice-Principal; in science, Jessie Spencer, Maud Spencer, and Paul Mozley as department head; in mathematics, Winnie Goodwill, Mareta Johnson, Charlotte Trusdell (who taught mathematics, as well as Latin and Physiology), Margaret McGunley, and Department Head Mareta Johnson; in the commercial department, Sarah Goddard, Jean Marsh, E.V. Carleton; in physical education Helen Harrison and F.M. Wilson; in music/band, Mary J. Snider and William Kunkel; in art, Lillian Shanks; in home economics, Helen Ester Goetz and Margaret Vierling, department head; Lester Hitchens

Not only were Hispanic students underrepresented in APS graduation lists, they were also less likely to have significant learning experiences with Hispanic faculty and educational mentors at the high school level. Clearly Americanization existed in an even subtler incarnation as positive Hispanic role models were almost invisible within the school environment. Josie Savage, who recalled seeing her classmates punished for speaking Spanish in APS campuses, also recognized the low number of Hispanic teachers. “What can I remember of school? I don’t remember having a single Hispanic teacher.” Rather, Savage recalled that her teachers were all “from the South, and they taught us about the Civil War and we didn’t have any good role models.”⁴²

Eldred Harrington, a science teacher at Albuquerque High School for more than thirty years, and a 1920 graduate of Albuquerque High, further illustrated Josie Savage’s point with his awe-struck reminiscing about the high school’s American Indian students. “Our student body included many real Indians. Some of the Indians made excellent football players as well as students.” Teacher Harrington continued “A couple of Indians in the writer’s day made the school’s honor roll when he could not.”⁴³ Harrington’s gawking comments should be seen with due consideration of his positive intentions and long-time dedication to his teaching work, but his back-handed praise of American Indian students underlie the sorts of stereotypes that Anglo educators at Albuquerque’s only high

in metal work; in Spanish, Arthur Campa, Mela Sedillos, Abrán Fernández, Jane Herron, and Maddine Hendricks who taught Latin and was head of the department; Thomas Benton in Manual Arts, department head; and A.P. Goodwill in auto mechanics.

42. Savage, interview with Benny Andrés.

43. Harrington, “The Albuquerque Public Schools,” 23.

school held for their students. As evident in Harrington's own words and the memories of Josie Savage, to achieve academically as a student of color was the exception. Beyond a low representation of Hispanic graduates of Albuquerque High School there was also a markedly low representation of Hispanic teachers who could serve as both role models and sympathetic instructors for the Albuquerque community's very sizeable Hispanic population.

The rather bleak relationship between Hispanic students in Albuquerque and their educational achievement within APS during the first half of the twentieth century also underscores the overall problems public education in New Mexico faced at the time (and in many ways continues to face in the twenty-first century). George I. Sánchez, the 1923 Albuquerque High alumnus, taught as a rural educator in Bernalillo County and then dedicated his early adult career to advancing educational access and attainment for all New Mexican youth, particularly isolated rural *nuevomexicano* youth. Using his position as a University of New Mexico professor, Sánchez admonished the state legislature to better fund poorer rural schools and encouraged educational leaders in the state to incorporate a culturally-relevant curriculum that acknowledged the native culture of the schoolchild. Sánchez also called for utilization of the Spanish language in instruction as a way of facilitating subject-area and English-language mastery.⁴⁴

44. Sánchez, *Forgotten People*, 78-79. In later years, Sánchez's model would be named transitional bilingual education by educational researchers; see Carlos Ovando, Mary Carol Combs, Virginia P. Collier, *Bilingual and ESL Classrooms: Teaching in Multicultural Contexts*, (Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill Higher Education, 2006), 39-41.

Besides the problems facing English-language learners in most schoolhouses in New Mexico, Sánchez also critiqued the teacher-training models used in most of the state's teacher-preparation programs as not being structured for the specific needs of the Land of Enchantment. Sánchez – who would later teach at the University of Texas, Austin, and participate in landmark desegregation lawsuits such as the 1947 Méndez vs. Westminster case – could see some positive aspects of teacher training in New Mexico, but felt a profound cultural reorientation in pedagogy was needed to help improve Hispanic student achievement. The usual English-only paradigms were still tacitly promoted in teacher-training programs across the state, causing Sánchez to dejectedly remark that teacher preparation in the state, with its overall low representation of Hispanic educators, was “sadly out of step with the needs of New Mexicans.”⁴⁵

Sánchez's lamentations support the notion that racial and ethnic disparities in educational achievement among different New Mexicans were only growing, but certainly not all participants of the state's educational apparatus supported the deculturization ideals of Americanization. Nina Otero-Warren, one of the most visible Hispana community leaders in the state during the 1920s, sought to use her position as Santa Fe County Superintendent of Public Instruction to promote bilingual education and the hiring of better-qualified teachers. The Los Lunas native argued in favor of a curriculum that included traditional Hispanic arts such as wood carving, blanket weaving, and wool dyeing as well as Spanish proficiency, stating that such a pedagogy would enrich the students by promoting their academic attainment and cultural pride by working

45. Sánchez, *Forgotten People*, 95.

with community mentors to learn these arts of the celebrated “Spanish past.”⁴⁶ And indeed, Spanish classes were always in high demand at Albuquerque High School and a Spanish Club was present on campus throughout much of the period concerned in this study, thus suggesting that Otero-Warren’s arguments did have some practical effect in the wider realm of New Mexico schools.

However it must be noted that Otero-Warren also recognized the changing social context in New Mexico. Though a prolific proponent of a culturally-relevant pedagogical paradigm, Otero-Warren also exhorted students and families to “acquiesce to the new order” of the Anglo world since “it is to our best interests that we become educated according to the standards of the nation. It has, for us, its distinct advantages, its definite protection.”⁴⁷ Furthermore, the unwillingness of the New Mexico legislature to fund the bilingual education initiatives it enacted into law in 1915 and 1919 – but then repealed in a 1923 education bill – illustrated the political realities of the state and the limitations of celebrating interculturalism and multilingualism.⁴⁸

Nonetheless, Otero-Warren’s important contributions notwithstanding, the overall trend in New Mexico was towards an undeniable emphasis on English. Although Albuquerque, like the rest of New Mexico, held deep historical ties to the Spanish

46. Charlotte Whaley, *Nina Otero-Warren of Santa Fe* (Santa Fe, NM: Sunstone Press, 2007), 107-109.

47. Whaley, *Nina Otero-Warren of Santa Fe*, 107-109.

48. For a more nuanced discussion of the changing educational politics in New Mexico regarding early bilingual education initiatives during the 1910s and 1920s, please see Mavel Moreno, “History of Bilingual Education: Spanish Inclusion in New Mexico Schools, 1890-1941” (M.A. Thesis, University of New Mexico, 2004), 70.

language, by the 1940s Spanish-proficiency in New Mexico was beginning to decline in favor of English. This trend would increase considerably in the post-World War II period with the rise of television usage in the Land of Enchantment. This reality should not suggest that Spanish-language usage in New Mexico was completely moribund. In 1941, after successful lobbying by state representative Concha Ortíz y Pino de Kleven (with the support of people such as George Sánchez), the New Mexico legislature enacted Senate Bill 3, a law which called for the educating of *nuevomexicanos* in the “proper academic function of their native language” as well as for the preparation of competent bilingual teachers. This important law was augmented by the 1973 New Mexico Bilingual Multicultural Education Act and the federal 1968 National Bilingual Education Act which sought to improve the learning conditions of English-language learners of mostly Hispanic origin, though the federal law soon applied to English-language learners of all cultural origins.⁴⁹

Without a doubt, there were clear limits to the extent to which the Americanization, English-only paradigm went. As evidence by these three education-related laws, with the passage of time a greater acceptance of bilingual education came to be accepted in the United States. With particular emphasis on this study’s comparative analysis, it is worth noting that Arizona did not adopt legislation similar to the bilingual education bills passed by the New Mexico legislature. As bad as many of the abuses and cultural shortcomings of New Mexico schools were, the situation in schools in the New

49. Moreno, “History of Bilingual Education: Spanish Inclusion in New Mexico Schools,” 38, 48-49.

Mexico borderlands were not as rhetorically and physically violent as the Arizona schools were.

Beyond the differences the two communities in this study experienced in terms of the severity of their Americanization policies, one may also see a point of divergence in terms of the preservation of Spanish proficiency in their communities. Combined with all the prominence of English-only pedagogies as well as APS's language-acquisition policies which resulted in students learning neither full English nor full Spanish, the linguistic shift was in full force in Albuquerque. Full Spanish proficiency in New Mexico in general was gradually being washed over by the rising dominance of English; in the Albuquerque this cultural transformation was more pronounced than in many other locations in the state due to the important economic position that the Duke City held as a crossroads of trade in the area. In this sense one may witness how the two different borderlands communities in this study – Albuquerque and Nogales – differed in terms of the distinct condition of the Spanish language in each city, a condition due to the geographical location of the two case studies.

In the labyrinthine interplay of factors affecting the educational outcomes of Hispanic students in Albuquerque schools the issue of Americanization has been established as a primary stumbling block for these students. Yet, how did teachers fit into this situation?

The Social Position of Teachers in APS and in the North-Central New Mexico

Region

The educational attainment of Hispanic youth in Albuquerque Public Schools was a complicated affair that demonstrates poor results when brought up for statistical analysis. Many complex factors play a role in the educational outcome of a student in any school, but one cannot ignore the relationship between the low educational attainment of Hispanic students and the absence of positive Hispanic mentors/role models at school along with the very real presence of the assimilationist discourse within the larger school system in late-nineteenth/early-twentieth century Albuquerque. Many well-meaning educators sought to edify the youth of New Mexico as best they could amid their own underlying cultural assumption of U.S./Protestant middle-class white expectations which included emphasis on traditional gender roles, as seen in the home economics and vocational education courses given to girls and boys, respectively, and a special focus on the inculcation of U.S. civic ideals and history. For New Mexico's unique populations, this curriculum was not conducive to high student achievement and long-term educational attainment. This discussion of public education history in Albuquerque now turns to the position of teachers in the area during the turn of the century in an attempt to reconstruct the roles played by the community's first teachers.

As observed in the Nogales, Arizona, schools, teachers in Albuquerque during the late 1800s and early 1900s wielded considerable influence and impact on their students by being agents of mainstream U.S. values by reproducing the social and hierarchical structures evident elsewhere in the country. Like in Nogales, the women who served as Albuquerque's first teachers tended to be young, unmarried Anglo women who hailed

from points far to the east of the Duke City. Charles Hodgkin, the first APS superintendent, often telegraphed colleagues in Indiana and elsewhere in the eastern U.S. whenever he needed help in filling teaching positions. Hodgkin usually expressed satisfaction with the women he hired at all levels of the emerging APS system, though often he confronted every administrator's worst expectation – teachers who were unable to control their classrooms. Less than a month into the inaugural 1891-1892 school year at APS, Hodgkin lamented the poor teaching abilities of a certain Ms. Cooper who taught at one of the district's elementary schools. The APS superintendent wrote in his diary that Ms. Cooper displayed a "lack of government and method in work, and of the general complaint being made by parents." As a further sign of Ms. Cooper's ill-preparedness, Hodgkin documented that she did not even know if her students were completing their homework assignments.⁵⁰ This episode notwithstanding, most of the teachers hired at APS apparently were sufficiently competent to return as faculty for at least two or three consecutive years; a perusal of different *La Reata* editions reveals the bonds that many outside teachers established in the community once they arrived to teach in it.

Returning to the fall 1891 saga of Ms. Cooper, one sees that gendered divisions of labor could crumple up under certain circumstances. After more problems with the young female teacher, Hodgkin had to step into the classroom and conduct his subordinate's class all day she called in sick. Wearied by his district-level duties and the additional teaching load that supplemented the course he already taught at Albuquerque High by having to

50. Hodgkin 1891-1894 APS Superintendent Notebook, Box 4, Folder 1, Charles Elkanah Hodgkin Papers.

substitute for Ms. Cooper, the superintendent paid his ill teacher a visit at her home. Hodgin reflected that he “told her frankly of her failure to give satisfaction, and recommend [sic] in a friendly way (not officially) of resigning and save herself the embarrassment of being asked to resign.” Ms. Cooper wept bitterly as her employer essentially fired her, but she promised to resign once a replacement teacher was found. The APS superintendent felt that his newly appointed teacher from Indiana State Normal School (modern Indiana State University in Terre Haute) was far better, but his new teacher also fell sick towards the beginning of winter and quit, news which “fell heavily” upon Hodgin.

The first APS superintendent provided no details as to why his new teacher quit, other entries from Hodgin’s notebook suggest that in addition to his teacher’s illness, overcrowding may have played a role, too, as other classrooms around the district featured highly-crowded conditions. Throughout the spring of 1892 more problems with staff being unable to control their classrooms – sometimes to the extent that Hodgin even wrote that things were “radically wrong” in one classroom – Hodgin struggled to keep his district’s faculty well-staffed. Often when teachers quit abruptly Hodgin would have no choice but to take on someone else’s students and their learning in addition to his regular teaching and administrative duties. Being the boss did not always have its advantages, as seen in Hodgin’s first-year tribulations.

These embarrassing anecdotes serve to personify the nature of gender relations in early 1900s APS schools, namely that of the power-relationship between the male administrator setting the young, vulnerable female teacher in order. During the course of this study on Albuquerque schools, women gradually rose to become principals at

elementary schools and for one year, 1921-1922, Mrs. Ella M. La Bar, originally a school librarian, managed to serve as principal before returning to her librarian duties in the next school years. Besides these notable exceptions, Anglo men dominated the administration of APS while Anglo women, joined by a handful of Hispanic educators, taught throughout the school district.

The gendered nature of the Albuquerque and Nogales public school districts was a characteristic both shared for much of the early twentieth century. Though women educators established a solid foundation for APS and the neighboring religious educational institutions and Indian school, men were more often the principals and superintendents of these female-dominated schools. In a trend cutting across APS, the Albuquerque Indian School, and the Protestant missionary schools, men acted as superintendents and principals (though, again, once APS grew in size, it was not so uncommon for women to be seen as principals of elementary schools).⁵¹ Also noteworthy in the differences between Albuquerque's teachers and administrators is the turnover rate between the two. Charles E. Hodgkin, for example, served as a higher level teacher and school principal at the Albuquerque Academy for ten years prior to serving as the inaugural APS superintendent for six years; one of his later successors, John Milne, served as APS superintendent for forty-five years between 1911 and 1956. At the Presbyterian Mission Menaul School a woman, Anna D. McNair, served as superintendent for one year in 1896 only to be replaced by a gentleman, John Chalmers

51. Amado Chávez, Annual Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, From March 1, 1891 to December 31, 1891, Roll 72, Territorial Archives of New Mexico, New Mexico State Records Center and Archives, Santa Fe, NM.

Ross, who led the school for nineteen years; his successor in turn presided as superintendent for the period 1916-1953.⁵²

Inasmuch as the early public schools in the U.S. Southwest sought to recreate the cultural norms of the day by seeking to perpetuate U.S. citizenship and identity values, the early schools in Albuquerque and greater New Mexico also bore witness to another type of gendered construction taking place inside the schoolhouse. As indicated by many of the anecdotes of the first generations of teachers in New Mexico and in Nogales, most of the educators in these schools were women. This phenomenon was in step with the feminization of the teaching career that had been seen since the days of Horace Mann. The early Massachusetts Secretary of the Board of Education was prolific in hiring women in the state's schools, arguing that women were of "purer morals" than men and that they were "more endowed by nature with stronger parental impulses, and this makes the society of children delightful, and turns duty into pleasure." Yet "while Mann championed women teachers, he did not hesitate to have men as his superintendents and principals." While extolling the advantages of women teachers, Mann also argued in a bit of a Freudian slip that women's "minds are less withdrawn from their employment, by the

52. Harrington, "History of the Albuquerque High School," 17; Menaul School Centennial Committee, *Menaul School Centennial* (Albuquerque, NM: Menaul School Centennial Special Committee, 1981) 5; "U.S. Statehood Education, 1912-1945," Albuquerque Historical Society, <http://www.albuqhistsoc.org/SecondSite/pkfiles/pk118stathoodeducat.htm> (Accessed May 1, 2012).

active scenes of life; and they are less intent and scheming for future honors and emoluments.”⁵³

At a point in which the public arena for women was still highly restricted, taking a career as an educator offered women a chance to leave the private sphere, even if for only a while in some cases once they married. This “separation of the spheres” came as a result of the nineteenth century’s industrialization in which emerging capitalist industry promoted a redefinition in gender roles for both men and women as wage labor developed in contrast to the former agrarian, independent farmers of before.⁵⁴ Even in the diverse areas of the Land of Enchantment, these feminizing patterns of educational employment were certainly manifest, just as they were throughout the greater U.S. West. It should be noted, however, that Anglo women predominated in the more relatively urbanized communities such as in Albuquerque and Santa Fe.

During the Spanish and Mexican periods the territory’s limited schooling was carried out, it may be recalled, by the male members of the various Catholic orders. By the time many of the post-Guadalupe Hidalgo missionary schools opened in Albuquerque and throughout the area, the focus slowly shifted towards women, beginning with Archbishop Lamy’s support for the educational programs of the Sisters of Loretto and the

53. Hayes, *Horace Mann’s Vision*, 24; Redding S. Sugg, Jr., *Motherteacher: The Feminization of American Education* (Charlottesville, VA: University Press of Virginia, 1978), 73-74.

54. Ronald Butchart, "The Frontier Teacher: Arizona, 1875-1925," *Journal of the West* 16, no. 3 (July 1977), 54; Nancy Hoffman, *Woman's "True" Profession: Voices from the History of Teaching* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press, 2003), 30-36.

Sisters of Charity.⁵⁵ In Albuquerque, Protestant missionary schools such as the Presbyterian Mission Menaul School and the Methodist Harwood Schools for Boys and Girls were staffed by females. The federal Albuquerque Indian School also consisted mainly of female teachers.⁵⁶ At the Albuquerque Academy the number of teachers in 1880 was three – two women, one man – all Anglo; by 1891 of the ten-member teaching staff, nine were women, and all ten faculty members were white.⁵⁷ After APS was formed in 1891, the city’s public school teachers almost entirely consisted of women in its first years. In fact, no male teachers appeared in Superintendent Hodgins’ annual report until 1894. Anglo women dominated the teaching profession in turn of the century Albuquerque at all levels in religious, public, and federal Indian schools.

Teacher turnover was very much an issue in early public schools in Albuquerque in greater New Mexico. Female teachers in Albuquerque schools could generally be expected to be more permanent educators than their counterparts in rural schools, reflecting what was said in the previous chapter about the level of prestige and responsibility that teaching in an urban setting held when compared to teaching in rural areas. Nevertheless, turnover was still frequent.⁵⁸ Often female teachers faced recriminations from men of authority when they moved to another school. Juanita

55. Everett, “Public School Debate,” 108-109.

56. Darryl Stevens, “The Menaul School: A Study of Cultural Convergence” (PhD diss., University of Houston, 1999), 186-188.

57. Catalogue of Albuquerque Academy 1890-1891, Box 3, Folder 5, Charles Elkanah Hodgins Papers.

Gallego, a teacher in Union County who changed schools at the end of the academic term in 1895, was denied the remainder of her already delayed salary by a superintendent angry at her moving to another school. With her superintendent refusing to sign her voucher, Juanita worried about how she would provide for her four children as she depended on her teacher salary to make ends meet in lieu of being “helpless and poor as my husband is in the penitentiary for life.” Stating that she was “perfectly entitled” to her denied pay, Juanita found it necessary to appeal to the territorial superintendent of public instruction, Amado Chávez, in order to receive a measure of justice. Determining the outcome of Juanita’s dilemma is difficult to ascertain as no record of a response seems to have been kept within the Superintendent of Public Instruction papers held in New Mexico State Records Center and Archives.⁵⁹ The power dynamics between male school administrators and their almost totally female teachers reflects how positions of authority and power still exercised by men even in a profession that was increasingly feminized.

As much as these realities played out, in actuality these Albuquerque schools served as a contrast to the rural areas to the north. Rural Hispanic women had the opportunity to leave their family’s home (and the traditional restrictions placed on Hispanic women) by earning a small living teaching their community’s children. Indeed for Josephine Cordova this work was the source for a sense of pride. Seeing her teaching work as an intimate affair that formed bonds and made her a respected figure in the

58. Brutchart, “Frontier Teacher: Arizona”, 54; Stevens, “The Menaul School,” 188.

59. Juanita Gallegos to Amado Chávez, 27 August 1895, Superintendent of Public Instruction, Territorial Archives of New Mexico, Roll 65.

community, Cordova recalled that people in the community seemingly “knelt before her.”⁶⁰ In rural communities like these in northern New Mexico requirements for professional teaching were not as hard and it was common for teachers to only need a high school degree in order to teach (a contrast to the certified teachers that taught in APS and in Nogales), though as teacher Fabiola Cabeza de Vaca recalled, “many of the teachers in the county did not have even an eighth grade education.” Poverty and limited educational access were undeniable in rural New Mexico.⁶¹ Despite that, many *Hispana* teachers who enjoyed the challenge of teaching often attended whatever classes they could at the New Mexico Normal School in Las Vegas or the smaller Spanish American Normal School near the Colorado state line at El Rito.⁶²

The predominantly Anglo teachers in Albuquerque Public Schools could count on reliable paychecks and mostly good working conditions at school as the predominantly Hispanic janitorial staff kept the school premises throughout the district clean and in functional order. Transmitting the ideals of mainstream U.S. identity and propagating academic knowledge for the young female Anglo teachers in APS thus occurred in a

60. Josephine Cordova, interview by Gonzales-Berry, March 7, 1992, transcript, Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project.

61. Fabiola Cabeza de Vaca, *We Fed Them Cactus* (Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1994), 154.

62. New Mexico Special Revenue Commission. *Report on the New Mexico Educational Institutions to the New Mexico Special Revenue Commission* (Santa Fe, NM: Santa Fe New Mexico Publishing Corporation, 1921), 29; Anita Dominguez Chaves, interview by Gonzales-Berry, June 24, 1993, transcript, Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project. The Spanish American Normal School was renamed Northern New Mexico Community College in 1977 and continues to serve rural New Mexican communities such as Española.

clean, well-supplied setting, but this pleasant environment was in contrast to what Hispanic teachers in rural New Mexican communities experienced. Outside of the city of Albuquerque, schoolteachers in rural north-central New Mexico had to build strong rapport with their students' parents as they often depended on them for help in supplying and maintaining the school, especially during the cold winter months. At other schools, teachers and students began the day at the schoolhouse by cleaning the school site from top to bottom. "We scrubbed the pine floor, washed the desks, cleaned the window and swept the yard," Fabiola Cabeza de Vaca wrote in her memoirs. "While sweeping the yard, we had the fright of our lives – close to the door was coiled a six-foot rattlesnake." Ms. Cabeza de Vaca flew into the schoolhouse as fast as possible "but soon the children had it under control – with a blow from the hoe the snake was decapitated."⁶³ Besides how the roles of power between teacher and students were vividly inverted in this slithery episode, Cabeza de Vaca's experience serves to illustrate the gulf that existed between the Anglo teachers in Albuquerque and the reality that rural Hispanic teachers faced.

For all of the gendered experiences that existed within the realm of teachers and their administrators in Albuquerque and throughout New Mexico, the teaching personnel also underwent episodes of cultural tension. English language learners, it must be noted, were not the only ones at the brunt of culture shock in early New Mexico schools. APS Superintendent Charles Hodgkin wrote in his official notebook that he "spent an hour or so getting the Mexican word 'chingona' interpreted" by his staff. Leon Gentry, a grade-schooler, used the epithet to refer to a female classmate. After a thorough investigation

63. Cabeza de Vaca, *We Fed Them Cactus*, 156-157.

that no doubt involved making rounds with district staff and consulting them on their knowledge of Mexican Spanish, Hodgin wrote “Most make it a vulgar expression but susceptible of two interpretations, one milder than the other.” The APS superintendent concluded that despite the ambiguity, the boy who used the word “chingona” likely meant no harm and “decided to give the boy the benefit of the doubt and let him return.”⁶⁴

Beyond consideration of the question as to whether the confused APS superintendent made the right decision in determining the context of Mexican profanity, this episode serves to illustrate the gulf existing between schoolmasters and their diverse students in New Mexico schools. For at least a few minutes in one afternoon in 1892 the highly-educated and experienced Anglo male superintendent of the Albuquerque Public Schools had to rely on his female Anglo and evidently Hispanic subordinates to help him understand what “chingona” meant and how best to adjudicate the situation. Roles of gender and race were briefly overturned between Hodgin and his workers in this instance (and likely countless other embarrassing ones too). It might not be possible to ascertain how many incidents of culture shock like Hodgin’s “chingona” conundrum took place in the early religious, non-denominational, and public schools of New Mexico, but this episode does vividly illustrate the larger gulf between the educational establishment’s perspectives, the lived reality of its students, and the problems that could often result from having a staff that was mostly not from Albuquerque.

64. Hodgin 1891-1894 APS Superintendent Notebook, Box 4, Folder 1, Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers.

It should be no surprise then that tensions between cultures could arise in early public schools in New Mexico. Josephine Cordova, a teacher in 1930s Cerro, New Mexico, recalled how one angry student prepared a nasty surprise for his Anglo teacher, Mr. Will Hickcome. The student in question, Virgilio, arrived to school early and placed an ammunition cartridge underneath the neatly-stacked firewood in the schoolhouse's chimney, hoping to blow up the school. Ms. Cordova, reminiscing many years later, left it open as to whether Mr. Hickcome's demeanor may have triggered the young man's pyrotechnic plan. Virgilio's plot was consequently thwarted by Mr. Hickcome noticing the neatly-piled firewood, leading to the boy's expulsion and his attendance at Ms. Cordova's nearby school.⁶⁵

It might not be possible to ascertain how many incidents of culture shock like the Virgilio-Will Hickcome feud recalled by an elderly Josephine Cordova – as well as scenarios like Hodgin's "chingona" conundrum – took place in the early religious, non-denominational, and public schools of the territory. Nevertheless incidents like these allow for us to grasp the gulf that could exist amid the diverse social environment lived in Albuquerque and greater New Mexico schools.

The advent of the civil rights and Chicano movements would bring to light many abuses inherent in the English-language education of New Mexican youth, such as corporal punishment for speaking Spanish in school, but many educators looked back on the cultural obligation they felt in instructing students in English. Anita Dominguez Chavez, a teacher in rural Ranchos de Taos during the 1920s and early 1930s, indicated in

65. Josephine Cordova, interview by Gonzales-Berry, March 7, 1992, transcript,

an oral history interview how she wanted to prepare English language learners for the rigors of successfully conducting business in cosmopolitan cities like Santa Fe and Albuquerque. “Here [in Ranchos de Taos] we did not need to know [English], but when I went to Santa Fe, or when my brother went to Albuquerque to the Menaul School, well we needed to know English.” Despite her understanding of the importance of English instruction, Anita Dominguez Chavez essentially spoke solely in Spanish when non-English-speaking parents visited school.⁶⁶ Perhaps this state of affairs may have not been fully to the state superintendent’s liking, but Ms. Dominguez Chavez recognized it as necessary if she wanted to form bonds between the school and her community’s parents.

Similarly, Virginia Gonzales, a teacher at Cerro, New Mexico, during the same period, also remarked that she would utilize Spanish in her language lessons when appropriate in order to guide students in their acquisition of English. Ms. Gonzales recalled taking her students outside their schoolhouse and giving them the names of specific objects and features pertaining to their school as a way of constructing English vocabulary. Communication in Spanish in New Mexico school grounds happened, though Mary Sanchez, mentioned previously in this study as the pioneering educator and administrator whose mother feared her attending a Protestant school, did sadly recall the humiliating experience of being spanked by school staff for speaking Spanish at school. “We just said something that the supervisor didn’t understand what we were saying.” When remembering the language restrictions on usage of Spanish she had to enforce as a

Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project.

66. Anita Dominguez Chavez, interview by Gonzales-Berry, June 24, 1993, transcript, Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project.

teacher and school principal, Ms. Sanchez stated the educational apparatus “never said ‘mustn’t’ but we knew that.”⁶⁷ While many teachers, particularly Hispana teachers, lamented the language politics of the day, they followed its expectations in order to better prepare their students for a social context in New Mexico in which Spanish was gradually washed over by the dominance of English.

Besides the historical documents left to posterity by Hodgkin, none of the early teachers in turn of the century Albuquerque left behind written memoirs about their experiences in these early schools. Reconstructing their experiences therefore depends on a reading of the surviving documents left by individuals like Hodgkin and a careful consideration of other contemporary teachers’ experiences throughout the region. The information that is available in the historical record demonstrates that teaching in Albuquerque Public Schools required that one have more than the high school diploma that was deemed acceptable for Hispanic women to teach in the isolated areas of northern New Mexico. Living and working conditions for APS teachers, most of whom migrated to the city with job offers as young, educated women, were appropriate for a growing urban setting, but they were a contrast to what many of the Hispanic teachers faced. Nevertheless, like their counterparts in the mountains north of Albuquerque, the teachers in APS most likely sought to impart the best instruction they could as they knew it, which in the early twentieth century context also consisted of the Americanization ideology with its inherent opposition to usage of Spanish in order to ostensibly promote English

67. Mary Sanchez, interview by Gonzales-Berry, March 20, 1992, transcript, Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project.

learning. Good intentions aside, the results for APS teachers were not the best when one looks merely at the educational attainment of Hispanic students. The Anglo educators, young women who sought to exercise a level of agency in their lives in a society where options for professional advancement were still very scarce, were tasked with essentially reproducing the models of middle-class U.S. values and customs when teaching and in that sense they worked arduously to meet that goal. The gendered experiences of these women reveals much about the overall experiences that took place in Albuquerque schools during the beginning of the twentieth century.

Conclusion

The story of the formation of public education in Albuquerque is a microcosm of the larger odyssey of early educational institution-building in New Mexico as a whole. Forming public education in New Mexico was a unique drama due to the particular circumstances of the area, but these events also represent localized manifestations of larger national trends pertaining to the issues of public support for public schools, the reality of minority education therein, and the constructions of national identity within the schoolhouse environment. From the first semi-publicly-funded parochial schools in Old Town Albuquerque of the 1860s and 1870s, to the Congregationalist Church's Albuquerque Academy of the 1880s, to the Albuquerque Public Schools of the 1890s and beyond, the manifestation of public education in the Duke City has undergone many different incarnations.

When the first public schools in Albuquerque opened, the city consisted of a population numbering 3,785 of whom 349 attended the inaugural school-year for APS; by

2010 New Mexico's largest city boasted 545,852 residents, with 93,300 students in attendance at the much-expanded APS, according to a 2004 study by the National Center for Education Statistics.⁶⁸ Much has changed as APS, one of the largest school districts in the U.S., struggles to meet the demands of modern-day expectations of quality education. Spurred on by New Mexico state-level Bilingual Multicultural Education Act of 1973, APS's multicultural curriculum seeks offers language and culture classes relevant for the diverse area youth, including bilingual education programs in nearly half of the district's 118 schools.⁶⁹ Despite many promising developments aimed at greater inclusiveness and educational attainment, the dropout rate for the 1996-1997 school year among Hispanic students in APS was still at 11.9% compared to 8.21% among white students.⁷⁰ Underachievement by Hispanic students caused some local parents to initiate lawsuit against APS in 1998 arguing that the district's pedagogies – which by then included a significant multicultural curriculum – put students on a path towards failure. The 1998

68. U.S. Bureau of the Census, "U.S. Census Bureau Delivers New Mexico's 2010 Census Population Totals, Including First Look at Race and Hispanic Origin Data for Legislative Redistricting," *United States Census 2010*, Bureau of the Census, Washington, D.C., March 15, 2011, <http://2010.census.gov/news/releases/operations/cb11-cn87.html> (Accessed April 2, 2012). Also please refer to "Table 89: Enrollment, Poverty, and Federal Funds for the 100 Largest School Districts, by Enrollment Size: 2003–04 and Fiscal Year 2006," *National Center for Educational Statistics*, http://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d06/tables/dt06_089.asp (Accessed April 1, 2012).

69. "Indian Education," *Albuquerque Public Schools*, <http://www.aps.edu/indian-education> (Accessed May 1, 2012).

70. Mariela Nuñez-Janes, "Bilingual Education and Identity Debates in New Mexico: Constructing and Contesting Nationalism and Ethnicity," *Journal of the Southwest* 44, no. 1, History and Community (Spring, 2002), 62-64.

suit, settled out of court, was noteworthy because of the significant role played by English-only/cultural assimilation activist Linda Chavez who contended against the very sort of pedagogies and institutional changes that educational experts such as George Sánchez argued would help lead to improvements in Hispanic educational attainment. By the dawn of the new millennium much had changed since segregated Mexican Department of the 1880s Albuquerque Academy and the violent Americanization classes of early twentieth-century APS, but for Hispanic students many gaps still exist in the public system and disagreements on how to resolve that challenge continue.⁷¹

The effects of Americanization in Albuquerque were numerous. While not all aspects of this cultural transformation were inherently negative, the data for Hispanic graduation rates from Albuquerque High School, with the discrepancy between these rates and cultural/ethnic demographics in the community, strongly implies that Hispanic students were not reaching high levels of educational attainment. Many factors influenced this outcome, but the role of Americanization, with its de-emphasizing of students' native culture and language, had a strong impact on this. In addition, the lack of significant numbers of positive Hispanic educators/role models within the APS system, and Albuquerque High in particular, underscored the disconnect between students' home culture and the school environment. Amid the existence of such a significant gulf, it is little wonder that many Hispanic Albuquerqueans felt frustration with their school.

71. Hailey Heinz, "Disturbing Numbers At APS," *Albuquerque Journal*, April 1, 2012.

In addition to the discourses of cultural assimilation seen throughout the borderlands, the history of public education in the Albuquerque area demonstrates the nature of gender roles and relations within the public sphere of schoolwork during the early twentieth century. Women had few opportunities for professional development and advancement during an era where the home and motherly duties were considered the rightful domain of women. Serving as an educator was a unique chance for independent-minded women to work within the public sphere and thus slowly push for a greater level of equality within societal structures, even if in their roles as teachers women were still conforming to a maternalistic social construction by providing young boys and girls with an education. Furthermore, women were ubiquitous in teaching positions, but older Anglo men dominated the leadership and administrative positions of schools and school districts, as seen in the tenures of Hodgkin and his successors at APS. Women of Anglo ancestry in New Mexico counted on relatively comfortable working conditions and reliable paychecks, whereas Hispanas in New Mexico were largely limited to rural schoolhouses. Over time women of all ethnicities gained greater representation in Albuquerque area schools and in principalships, but the divisions of labor within the context of gender at the turn of the century demonstrate the status of women at the time as actors slowly emerging into a more public setting of activity.

With all of this in mind, let us turn back to the first year of the Albuquerque Public Schools, on the warm evening of May 26, 1892, when APS Superintendent Charles Hodgkin picked up his pen and wrote one final entry in his notebook for the year. “The year’s work is over and the foundation is laid for the system of schools that shall

grow up in Albuquerque.”⁷² Relaxing on his armchair at the completion of his first school year as superintendent, Hodgkin reflected on the events of earlier that evening as the commencement exercises for the first three graduates – all young ladies – from Albuquerque High School took place. Attendance was so packed in the small building that attendees had to stand. One can only imagine the pride the Albuquerque community, particularly the Academy’s all-Anglo all-female teaching staff, felt at that important moment in the city’s history. One can only speculate, however, how Albuquerque’s Hispanic community as a whole saw the inaugural Albuquerque High School graduation ceremony when no Hispanic students or teachers were among those taking part in that critical moment though they were a demographic majority in the Albuquerque area. In the words of George Sánchez half a century later, much struggle still had to be undertaken in order for *nuevomexicanos* to “cease to exist as forgotten people.”⁷³

72. Hodgkin 1891-1894 APS Superintendent Notebook, Box 4, Folder 1, Charles Elkanah Hodgkin Papers.

73. Sánchez, *Forgotten People*, 98.

Chapter 5 – Study Conclusions

Review of Main Questions

The U.S.-Mexico borderlands collectively symbolize the complex workings of a vast plethora of different phenomena, not the least of which is the nature of identity formation. As the colliding point between two very different social systems, the U.S.-Mexican borderlands represent zones where notions of citizenship identity and the politics are in constant flux. Considerable ado has been made about the manner which the notions of cultural collision – Gloria Anzaldúa’s *choque* – reverberated in the political, economic spheres. The cultural negotiation struggle that took place during the Progressive-era popularity of Americanization with respect to Hispanic and Mexican identity formation in the school environment of borderlands communities merits significant attention.

This study partially reconstructed the experiences of school children in schools in the borderlands by focusing on two distinct communities in the borderlands – Albuquerque, New Mexico, and Nogales, Arizona. As previously explained, despite the level of differences between the two cities, an analysis of them is very poignant because of many of the similarities that they still shared. While distinct, the two communities were not so drastically dissimilar that a comparative analysis cannot be adequately sustained. The border town of Nogales is a community consisting of a town history dating only to the early 1880s when merchants arrived in the hope of striking it rich once the future New Mexico and Arizona (now Union Pacific) Railroad was routed through the sloping hills of the area, thus allowing for the creation of a “port city” where trade

between the U.S. and Mexico would be nurtured. Albuquerque, for its part, was founded during the in the early eighteenth century and existed as a community long before either the United States or the Mexican Republic existed as independent national entities. By the time the Atchinson, Topeka, and Santa Fe Railroad arrived in the area, the community of Albuquerque had already been a long-established, and fair-sized population center. The geographic location of Albuquerque – close to so many indigenous reservations, located in an area with a longer history of a sizeable Hispanic presence (with all of the unique social conditions that this signified) made the Albuquerque of the late nineteenth/early twentieth century very different from the Nogales of the same period.

Beyond the more overt differences between the nascent border town and a rapidly changing Albuquerque community (which became more and more Anglicized with the passage of time and immigration) there is also the need to consider the different sociopolitical context of north-central New Mexico and Southern Arizona. Because of its long Spanish and Mexican history and the perpetuation of the influence of much of the pre-U.S. conquest *nuevomexicano* aristocracy, persons of Hispanic ancestry in New Mexico overall fared better because of the lack of foreignness that being Hispanic within nineteenth century New Mexico implied among many, though not all, New Mexican political leaders. In Arizona – an entity existing only after U.S. congressional proclamation of the territory in 1863 – the social context was different. Although Tucson, just sixty miles north of Nogales, was the most populous city in Arizona until well into the twentieth century, the *mexicanidad* of the population meant that the “Old Pueblo” gradually lost political prominence in the face of the rapidly growing central Arizona city of Phoenix and other predominantly Anglo population center throughout the state. As

documented in this study, the position of Mexican American students in public schools in Tucson and elsewhere in the interior of Arizona certainly deteriorated over the passage of time.

Prior to the 1880s arrival of the “iron horse” by means of the Southern Pacific Railway, schools in Tucson openly used Spanish as a medium of instruction in order to educate Tucson’s Spanish-speaking *tucsonenses*. By the time the United States entered the Second World War, scenes where Spanish was taught in school as a means of promoting student learning of academic concepts (with an eye towards a later successful transition into English) were clearly a thing of the past as the new paradigm of Americanization demanded a strong and exclusive emphasis on English literacy. Overall Arizona was a generally hostile place for persons of Hispanic ancestry during the early twentieth century – a pattern that in many ways still manifests itself in the Grand Canyon State even in the new millennium as the ability of educators to teach about the history of Mexican Americans came under fire in the Tucson Unified School District during the early 2010s.¹

As a border community, Nogales’s circumstances were very different from those seen in Tucson and even more so those seen in Phoenix. Being located immediately next to the northern limits of the Mexican Republic, the demographic realities of Nogales meant that outright segregation of Hispanic pupils was simply unworkable on practical and social levels. The social reality of the Nogales community throughout the period of

1. Julio Cammarota and Michelle Aguilera, “By the Time I Get to Arizona’: Race, Language, and Education in America’s Racist State,” *Race, Ethnicity & Education* 15, no. 4 (September 2012), 485-500.

this study was such that to seriously consider a full segregation of Mexican American students in the community's schools would simply have been socially unacceptable. While this is not to imply that the Americanization pedagogy did not negatively affect Mexican American students in Nogales during the early 1900s, the fact that no ethnically-based segregation could exist in Nogales as it did elsewhere in Arizona is a testament to the realities of the community. Moreover this harkens back to the larger nature of social relations in communities like Tucson and Albuquerque before the penetration of the railroads and their connections to "mainstream" U.S. ideas about racial hierarchies.

It is in the geographic location of the cities of Albuquerque and Nogales that the issue of cultural change also comes into sharp focus in this analysis. With Mexico being simply "across the street" from Nogales via International Street, the vitality of Mexican cultural customs and Spanish proficiency were stronger than in Albuquerque where, despite its continuous strong population of Hispano and Mexican residents, the Spanish language gradually began to fade from prominence. The transmission of Spanish proficiency in Albuquerque waned as the economic and demographic changes of economic development transformed the nature of the city. While northern New Mexico would remain predominantly Spanish-speaking until well into the post-World War II generation, the cultural drift of the times meant that the realities for Spanish-speakers in New Mexico were changing. As George I. Sánchez noted, the fact that Hispanic students were learning neither proper English nor proper Spanish meant that many *nuevomexicanos* were becoming inarticulate in two languages as opposed to developing a strong proficiency in at least one language (even if it was their native heritage language). Signs of this change – particularly as one observes the Anglicization of Hispanic names

in Nogales and Albuquerque school rosters – indicate the cultural shifts that were taking place in these borderlands and the overall flexibility of cultures seen in the region.

A holistic study of the issue of education and public education in the borderlands would consider the experiences of a wide array of cities such as Los Angeles, Calexico, Phoenix, El Paso, San Antonio, Eagle Pass, and other U.S. borderland communities with strong Hispanic populations relatively adjacent to the international boundary. In this hypothetical study, communities like Nogales and Albuquerque would form a small part of a larger whole in order to gauge the differences and similarities that existed in the borderlands in general during the turn of the twentieth century. The wide breadth of a study like that would allow for local particularities to be more clearly articulated and it would also allow for larger, regional issues to be even more visible. This study compares and contrasts the educational history of Mexican Americans in Albuquerque and Nogales in order to identify patterns of commonality and difference between these two communities as a means of inferring larger conclusions about the general U.S.-Mexico borderlands. Further study on the region as a whole may yield more generalizable details on the dynamics identity formation in the greater U.S.-Mexico border zone; this initial work, for its part, seeks foment more discussion on this topic.

Forming the Institution of Public Schools in Arizona and New Mexico

As evidenced in this study, the process of creating a viable public school system for Nogales, Arizona, and Albuquerque, New Mexico, was a very challenging one. In New Mexico, the economic conditions of the Spanish and Mexican periods of rule prevented a strong public school system from emerging there. As in Mexico proper, the

persons who received an education at the time were generally persons of higher social class. Furthermore, the education these young men received was highly religious in nature and Catholic in particular. Following the U.S. conquest of New Mexico in the U.S.-Mexico War, the notions of the common schools, which were gaining popularity in the eastern U.S. at the time, also had a deep effect on New Mexico. Reflecting the sorts of interreligious tensions apparent in eastern U. S. cities, the main problem that many New Mexican education promoters faced was convincing *nuevomexicano* Catholics that the public schools which were desired for the territory would not serve to proselytize Catholic men and women into any of the Protestant denominations.

The bitter debate between Protestant and Catholics in New Mexico over education greatly hampered the consolidation of this institution when in neighboring Arizona the funding mechanisms for public school district emerged early in that territory's history, culminating with the establishment of the first school district in Arizona in 1871, Tucson Unified School District. As public school districts in Arizona struggled to establish themselves as permanent, stable institutions, many parochial and religious schools attempted to serve the needs of Arizona residents, such as the Methodist School in Nogales that Ada EKey attended during her youth. Similarly, in New Albuquerque, the Albuquerque Academy administered by the Congregationalist Church, imparted academic and ostensibly non-sectarian religious instruction prior to the establishment of the public schools.

In New Mexico the full push for public education funding did not succeed until 1891 when the legislature enacted laws providing for the funding of territorial schools. The Albuquerque Public Schools rose in the fall of that year as a consequence of those

lawd and began their mission of educating the youth of the city of Albuquerque. Nearly 500 miles to the southwest, the Nogales Unified School District also opened its doors with the aim of educating young Nogalians as a response to the large number of Mexican children “roving the streets.”² In Albuquerque, the only high school in the city and county for the next sixty years also opened in 1891. No such public high school institution opened in Nogales until 1915, perhaps as a sign of the population differences between the two cities. Nevertheless, the inaugural graduating class of 1892 from Albuquerque High School was three students while the first class from Nogales High School was numbered at just five students. In Albuquerque none of them were Hispanic, at least if Spanish-surnames are considered signs of ethnic membership, while in Nogales there was one among the five graduating seniors. In time, both cities saw increases in their graduation rates (again, both cities had but one high school throughout the period concerned in this study). As the graduation rates expanded, so too did the diversity and inclusion of Hispanic students in these graduating classes. However, in both high schools the number of Hispanic students reaching candidacy for graduation was disproportionate to the number of Hispanic inhabitants of their respective cities.

Americanization in the Public Schools of Nogales and Albuquerque

Recognizing that multiple factors influence the educational attainment of students, this study posits that the Americanization, English-only predisposition of educational

2. Ada EKey Jones, interview with Don Smith, February 1955, oral history AV 0421-20, transcript, Arizona Historical Society.

leaders in these two borderland communities greatly impacted the educational attainment of Hispanic students. During this turn of the century period, the Americanization paradigm that was associated with the Americanism ideology reigned in public schools and held that students needed to be molded into mainstream U.S. citizens. In the immigrant communities of larger U.S. cities this philosophy was accepted and seen as necessary by sociopolitical commentators such as Theodore Roosevelt as a way of creating a uniform Americaness that would transcend the barriers of different ethnic/national origins. In the U.S.-Mexico borderlands this same approach was used even though the history of Hispanics in the border region made them anything but foreigners. Despite this larger historical odyssey, political thinkers asserted that all U.S. children and their families had to be submitted to the same doctrine. In lieu of this ubiquitous paradigm, it cannot be denied that Americanization played at least some significant role in the educational outcomes of these students.

In Albuquerque the situation for Hispanic students was highly nuanced. The New Mexico State Constitution of 1912 proscribed educational leaders in the state from segregating Hispanic students on the basis of their race or language abilities, but that did not mean that separate classrooms for Hispanic students did not exist in schools in the area, particularly in the lower primary grades. Furthermore, the progressive spirit of pluralism (or at least Hispanic cultural preservation) espoused in the constitution did not prevent teachers of Anglo extraction from punishing Spanish-speaking students on the school grounds for speaking their native language. The graduation rates of Hispanic students throughout this period bear testimony to the poor educational outcomes that many of these policies engendered. Furthermore, the desire for teachers to recreate

mainstream U.S. institutions (with the social systems) also meant that many of them, however well-intentioned they might have been, viewed their Hispanic students with less respect that they often did for their Anglo-surnamed pupils. The discourses of the time favored one's transformation into a more Americanized individual and this is evident in the Anglicization of names, such as in Josie Savage Brown's case or as in the example of New Mexico's first female governor, Soledad Chávez Chacón who was routinely called "Sallie" by her classmates and teachers.

In Nogales many of these same phenomena were plainly at work. For example, the representation of Hispanic students in Nogales High School graduating classes was very low in the early years of the school and it did not significantly improve until the 1930s. In both NHS and AHS the number of Hispanic students in early graduating classes was vastly disproportionate to the size of the respective communities' Hispanic populations – particularly when many early commencement classes had no Hispanic students present whatsoever. By the close of this study those realities at least began to change. During the 1930s the graduation rates of Hispanic in Nogales outpaced those of the Duke City. From 1930-1939 the average number of Mexican/Mexican American students as a percentage of NHS graduating classes was 43.6% while for Albuquerque High School, the only high school in Bernalillo County, the average percentage of graduating Hispanics was 18.8% - figures based on data from newspaper and yearbook sources for both schools.³ In both communities the educational attainment of Hispanic students was very low and these

3. For further corroboration of this, please consult the graduation lists from the 1930-1939 editions of *La Reata* (Albuquerque High School) and *Adobe* (Nogales High School).

figures point to how both the APS and NUSD school systems failed to adequately prepare students to graduate from high school. Instead of promoting graduation from high school, the culturally-unresponsive educational apparatus in both communities seemingly steered many Hispanic students into vocational jobs by not adequately linking the home and school environments.

In a further similarity between the Albuquerque and Nogales experiences, the Anglicization of names in both cities seemed to imply a transition from the older Mexican past one possessed, to the newer, more successful American present one could attain if one gave it sufficient effort. Such changes indicate the level of the cultural drift that even the border town of Nogales experienced during the early half of the twentieth century and they problematize notions of border communities along the U.S.-Mexico border as being static and unchanging. Though occurring on a markedly lesser scale than in Albuquerque, the cultural changes that the Americanization rhetoric consisted of also had their effect in binational Nogales. The implications of these similarities thus suggest that many of these identity-formation phenomena were also present in other parts of the U.S.-Mexico borderlands.

When one considers the intricate contradiction that define many border communities, one can see that while Nogales retained many of its deep Mexican cultural roots owing to the vitality of the Spanish language and Mexican cultural heritage stemming from the community's location, it still exhibited many aspects of the racial hierarchical notions present in the mainstream U.S. at the time. The outright segregation of African American students – the children of the African American “Buffalo Soldiers” stationed in Nogales to protect it from violence originating from the ongoing Mexican

Revolution – demonstrates that Nogales, like Albuquerque, could repeat many of the same social ideologies that were present elsewhere in the United States. While Nogales might have been very different from a lot of other U.S. locales when it came to its treatment of its large Mexican American population, it could also be as racist as segregated Phoenix when it came to the issue of where the African American students of the community attended school. In Arizona conditions for the state’s Hispanic students in cities away from the border would not drastically improve until the 1960s when the Chicano and civil rights movements brought about a new consciousness in the position of Hispanic students.

In the neighboring Land of Enchantment, the prominence of the Americanization movement during the early part of the twentieth century also dominated language-learning and citizenship-building pedagogy. Despite Americanization’s ubiquity, civic leaders such as Nina Otero-Warren, George I. Sánchez, and others sought to reform the education system to make it an agent for positive U.S. citizenship identity-building by promoting a healthy self-respect for Hispanic culture among Hispano youth. While they did not call for bilingual education specifically using the words “bilingual education” – a phrase that entered common usage after the post-war period – Otero-Warren and Sánchez did advocate for the inclusion *nuevomexicanos*’s native Spanish language in order to help them attain content-area knowledge in math, science, history, and other fields as a means of better adopting the English language. For Otero-Warren and Sánchez, doing this would not only instill pride in one’s Hispanic background, it would also turn around the deplorable educational statistics of the *nuevomexicano* community and encourage them

into becoming full and equal members of the U.S. nation by virtue, and not in spite of, their personal heritage.

Leaders like Otero-Warren and Sánchez worked to promote bilingualism in English and Spanish in New Mexico schools along with a curriculum that promoted the transmission of cultural heritage such as blanket-weaving, wool-dyeing and the like in order to establish a firm bridge between the colorful past and the coming future. That these educational leaders did not fully succeed in their attempts to bring about a more wholesome “Spanish American” identity through means of government support from the territorial legislature and local educational leaders serves to show that New Mexico’s historical memory of its multicultural past is not without its problems.

Gender and Culture Among Teachers

This study’s focus on the Americanization pedagogies that Hispanic children in the borderlands were subjected to would not be complete without a careful consideration of the roles played by the teachers of these children. As the main transmitters of the social and cultural norms eastern U.S. Protestant, middle class values by means of their profession as teachers, the role of these educators cannot be underestimated. As may be remembered, Horace Mann of Massachusetts helped define a great deal of the identity of public school teachers when he helped foster the common schools movement and the emphasis on female teachers. Generally prohibited from working as a teacher if one married and raised a family, the majority of the Anglo women who worked as educators were young and single. In a marked illustration of the gendered divisions of labor at the time, schools administrators were predominantly, though not exclusively, Anglo males.

As evidenced in the composition of the teaching staff at Nogales and Albuquerque High Schools, women were very prevalent in actual teaching positions, but men were more likely to serve as high school principals, with openings for female administrators often restricted by design or accident to the elementary levels where women's maternal skills could emerge. Meanwhile men dominated the district-level administration of school districts, often for decades at a time.

In considering the nature of these gender relations it becomes apparent that the cultural character of the borderlands communities are not the only self-contradictory objects present in this study. In fact, the discourse of gender evidenced in the turn of the century teaching profession was just as self-contradictory. For young women of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, when professional opportunities were slowly opening, teaching offered many interested young ladies an opportunity to leave the home, experience a level of wage-earning, and participate in a "legitimate" fashion in the public sphere by working as schoolteachers. However, this new freedom was still limited and much of the liberties that teaching provided reinforced the gendered status quo of the day. Women could do the hard work of actually teaching large (if not overcrowded) classes of different boys and girls in a wide variety of conditions, but men would always be supervising these female teachers and, commensurately, earn better wages at the same time. The fact that only one woman served as principal in either of these case studies – and, let it be remembered, only for one year at Albuquerque High School before returning to her normal positions of being a librarian – speaks a great deal about the nature of social relations in these borderlands locales.

Turning to the

issue of cultural transmission as undertaken by these women, the Americanization of Hispanic children in Nogales and Albuquerque took place to the extent that it did because of how Anglo women dominated the teaching profession in Albuquerque Public schools and at Nogales Unified Schools District. In Albuquerque, still a predominantly Hispanic community throughout the 1880-1942 time period, Hispanic teachers did not appear on the AHS faculty lists until 1921 and even then Hispanic teachers were kept from teaching any of the core academic subjects by being relegated to teaching usually only Spanish, at least so far as the data up to 1942 is concerned.

In Nogales the situation was nearly identical with no Hispanic teachers on staff at NHS until the 1928-1929 school year and, just like in the Duke City, teachers of Mexican American heritage were typecast into teaching Spanish while Anglos took on the more ostensibly serious subjects of English, mathematics, and science. As seen in the anecdotes of the Hispanic women of northern New Mexico who braved low pay and difficult conditions in order to serve as teachers in their rural communities, Hispanics in the borderlands did consider education important and they did find it a suitable career to enter into. Some of the most vocal critics of the Americanization policies of the day did so based in large part because of their experiences as educators of youth, such as George I. Sánchez. Nevertheless, in the more relatively urban settings of Nogales and Albuquerque, teaching throughout the 1880-1942 period was dominated by white women.

As young professionals, these women sought to impart the best education that they could onto their students. An evaluation of Ada EKey Jones's memoirs in particular demonstrates her sense of pride in having taught, even if only for a little, two individuals

who played significant leadership roles in the Mexican Revolution, Juan Cabral and Abelardo Rodríguez, the latter of whom ascended to the highest place of power by serving as President of Mexico. That they were active agents of reproducing mainstream U.S. values and cultural assumptions might not have been even a self-conscious issue for these individuals. By being enthusiastic promoters of education, with the Americanization ideals that public education directly implied during the early 1900s, these women helped re-create many of the social systems of the eastern U.S. within the specific context of the communities they worked in. Thus it is evident that these young, aspiring, Anglo women were a key factor in the educational outcomes of the students that they taught and therefore key movers in the cultural transformation that took place in the borderlands during the rise of public education there. By better understanding the circumstances that these teachers experienced during this time we can also better grasp their overall role in a society and region where stable public education institutions were still very much a relatively new, yet influential part of the community.

Final Conclusion

In one final look towards the topics covered in this investigation, one can see that education was a very charged affair that held deep implications for the community. In turn of the century Nogales and Albuquerque, public education systems arose after many years of struggle in their respective territories over the best ways to properly establish a strong, publically-supported system for young men and women to receive an education. Owing to the larger nationalist discourses of Americanization that took place during this time, particularly with regards to the perceived foreignness of Arizona and New Mexico,

the political elites of these two areas sought to bring about a social transformation of the populace that would better integrate all Arizonans and New Mexicans into the U.S. body politic. The specific, local context for these experiences in New Mexico and Arizona was different enough that true comparisons can be sustained while still broadly similar enough that commonalities of themes and results can also be evident. Through their commonalities, commentary onto the prevalence of identity-formation phenomena in the borderlands can be made.

In Arizona, the Americanization of pupils meant segregation into other school grounds when it was possible – a marked contrast to the situation in New Mexico. However, in Nogales a separate campus for Hispanic students was an untenable proposition therefore students were simply placed simply into different classroom, much akin to the Mexican department of the early Albuquerque Academy. Similar Americanization discourses and pedagogies sought to culturally assimilate Hispanic students into mainstream U.S. identity ideals. In Albuquerque the results of this cultural drift are more evident when one considers the decline of the Spanish language in the Duke City and the Anglicization of names, two signs of a larger cultural transformation. Southwest in Nogales, the presence of the Mexican border and the long-standing binational-cross-cultural links of family and economic ties made *mexicanidad* a stronger factor and thus full Americanization of Nogales, Arizona, was less achievable and evident.

Nevertheless, the pedagogies of Americanizing students into the white, middle-class norms of the United States also meant that many abuses, such as being punished for speaking Spanish at school, took place. Through a careful analysis of the graduation rates

of Hispanic students one can distinctly see the way in which poor educational attainment was often a product of this Americanizing curriculum. When so many students were retained for one year so that they might learn basic English skills it is clear that the long-term effects of that cannot be under-estimated. Furthermore, the discrepancy between Hispanic pupils graduating from Albuquerque and Nogales High Schools with respect to their demographic place in the community serves to demonstrate that educational attainment was a challenge for many *nuevomexicano* and Mexican American families in these two cities. Recalling that in Nogales the Hispanic community comprised at least half, if not more, of the city's population, the low educational attainment of Hispanic students in this community – when Mexican American students sometimes only comprised a third of all graduates in many years – brutally demonstrates the vicious effects of the Americanization doctrine and the unresponsiveness of the educational establishment to the unique needs of the community. In both Nogales and in Albuquerque finishing high school was a considerable achievement at this time for persons of Mexican ancestry.

In conclusion, this study asserts that, while numerous factors affected the outcomes of Hispanic students in Nogales and Albuquerque, Americanization – as reproduced by the mostly Anglo teaching staff and administrators – greatly and negatively affected the intellectual and spiritual growth of these young men and women. This study bases this conclusion on the available statistics concerning these graduation figures and the contemporary criticisms of individuals such as Nina Otero-Warren and George I. Sánchez. Owing in part to the background of these students' mostly female and Anglo teachers, as well as these students' general lack of positive "mainstream" Hispanic

teacher role models at school outside of a handful of Hispanic teachers typecast into teaching Spanish, the discourse of Americanization was present in a critical way in these communities.

Further research may serve to establish better links between Nogales and Albuquerque and other borderlands communities in order to paint a more holistic picture of the complexities that were involved in late 1800s, early 1900s formations of citizenship identities in U.S.-Mexico border region schools. In the evaluation of evidence presented here it becomes clear that Gloria Anzaldúa's *choque* metaphor in many ways manifested itself in the realm of public education when young Hispanic men and women sought to develop their concepts of themselves. This cultural collision impacted these students' formation of their identity and greatly affected their academic outcomes as Hispanic students as they worked to define themselves at a time in which they were caught between two different, seemingly opposed cultures and nations.

Bibliography

Archival Sources

Albuquerque-Bernalillo County Public Library, Albuquerque, NM.

Archivo Histórico Municipal, H. Nogales, Sonora, México:

Monarque Alvarez, Adalberto. "Estudio cronizado del periodo 1916-1920,"
typescript, n.d.

Arizona Historical Society (AHS), Library and Archives, Tucson, AZ:

EKey Papers

EKey Jones, Ada. Interview with Don Smith, February 1955, Oral History AV
0421-20, transcript.

Places-Arizona-Nogales-Schools, Ephemera File.

Watkins, Allyn. Interview by Harriet D. Wilson, July 3, 1978, Oral History AV
0421-39, transcript.

Arizona State Library, Archives, and Public Records, Phoenix, AZ.

New Mexico State Records Center and Archives, Santa Fe, NM:
Territorial Archives of New Mexico – Records of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, 1891-
1911.

Pimeria Alta Historical Society (PAHS), Nogales, AZ:

Ada EKey Jones Collection

Nogales Schools Collection

Santa Cruz County Schools Collection

Escalada, Louis, Interview, n.d., transcript.

Miller, Gladys. Interview by Don Smith, December 22, 1971, transcript.

University of New Mexico, University Libraries, Center for Southwest Research and
Special Collections (CSWR), Albuquerque, NM:

Charles Elkanah Hodgin Papers

Gonzales-Berry, Erlinda, Maria Dolores Gonzales Velasquez, and Tey Diana Rebolledo, interviewers. Hispanic Rural Teachers Oral History Project.

Savage, Josie. Interview with Benny Andrés, Jr., March 3, 1995, transcript, Oral History Interviews of the Voices: Old Town Albuquerque Oral History Project.

Periodical Sources

Adobe, Nogales High School Yearbook
Albuquerque Journal
Arizona Citizen
La Reata, Albuquerque High School Yearbook
Nogales Herald
Nogales International
Santa Fe New Mexican

Secondary Sources

Alvarez, Jr., Robert R. "The Mexican-U.S. Border: The Making of an Anthropology of Borderlands." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24, (1995): 447-470.

Anthony, Patricia. "Public Monies for Private Schools: The Supreme Court's Changing Approach." *Journal of Education Finance* 12, no. 4 (1987): 592-605.

Anzaldúa, Gloria. *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza*. San Francisco, CA: Aunt Lute Press, 1987.

Arreola, Daniel. "La Cerca y Las Garitas de Ambos Nogales: A Postcard Landscape Exploration." *Journal of the Southwest* 4 (2001): 504-541.

Baca, Jacobo D. "To Preach and Teach: The Dixon Case and Catholic Education in New Mexico." M.A. Thesis, University of New Mexico, 2006.

Banks, James. *An Introduction to Multicultural Education*. Boston, MA: Pearson, 2008.

Blanton, Carlos Kevin. *The Strange Career of Bilingual Education in Texas: 1836-1981*. College Station, TX: Texas A&M University Press, 2007.

Bristol, J.B. *History of Nogales: Facts Concerning Nogales and Santa Cruz County, Arizona*. Nogales, AZ: Nogales Chamber of Commerce, 1928.

- Brown, Kate. *A Biography of No Place: From Ethnic Borderland to Soviet Heartland*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005.
- Butchart, Ronald. "The Frontier Teacher: Arizona, 1875-1925." *Journal of the West* 16, no. 3 (July 1977), 54-66.
- Cabeza de Vaca, Fabiola. *We Fed Them Cactus*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1994.
- Cahill, Cathleen. *Federal Fathers and Mothers: A Social History of the United States Indian Service, 1869-1933*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2011.
- Cammarota, Julio, and Michelle Aguilera. "'By The Time I Get to Arizona': Race, Language, and Education in America's Racist State," *Race, Ethnicity & Education* 15, no. 4 (September 2012): 485-500.
- Carter, Ida. "Rise of the Public Schools of Tucson: 1867-1936." Master's Thesis, University of Arizona, 1937.
- Chávez, Dan D. *Soledad Chávez Chacón: A New Mexico Political Pioneer, 1890-1936*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Printing Services, 1996.
- Connell Szasz, Margaret. "Listening to the Native Voice: American Indian Schooling in the Twentieth Century," *Montana: The Magazine of Western History* 39, no. 3 (1989): 42-53.
- Crawford, James. "Language Politics in the United States: The Paradox of Bilingual Education." In *The Politics of Multiculturalism and Bilingual Education: Students and Teachers Caught in the Cross Fire*, edited by Carlos J. Ovando and Peter McLaren, 107-125. Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill Companies, 1999.
- Cummins, Jim. *Negotiating Identities: Education for Empowerment in a Diverse Society*. Ontario, CA: California Association for Bilingual Education, 1996.
- Church, Robert L., and Michael W. Sedlak, *Education in the United States: An Interpretive History*. New York: The Free Press, 1976.
- Deverell, William. *Whitewashed Adobe: The Rise of Los Angeles and the Remaking of its Mexican Past*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004.
- Donato, Rubén. *Mexicanos and Hispanos in Colorado Schools and Communities, 1920-1960*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2007.

- Dorsey, Leroy G. *We Are All Americans, Pure and Simple: Theodore Roosevelt and the Myth of Americanism*. Tuscaloosa, AL: University of Alabama Press, 2007.
- Escandon, Arturo M. *La Huelga de Cananea: y tres semblanzas: Gilberto Valenzuela, Luis Carmelo, Juan G. Cabral*. Tijuana, Baja California: Imprenta Tijuana, 1949.
- Everett, Dianna. "The Public School Debate in New Mexico: 1850-1891," *Arizona and the West* 26, no. 2 (1984), 107-134.
- Getz, Lynne Marie. *Schools of Their Own: The Education of Hispanos in New Mexico, 1850-1940*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1997.
- Giroux, Henry A. *Ideology, Culture, and the Process of Schooling*. Philadelphia, Temple University Press, 1981.
- Gonzales-Berry, Erlinda, and David R. Maciel, eds. *The Contested Homeland: A Chicano History of New Mexico*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2000.
- Gonzales, Phillip B. "Las Juntas de Indignación: Hispano Repertoire of Collective Protest in New Mexico: 1884-1933." *The Western Historical Quarterly* 31, no. 2 (2000): 161-186.
- Gonzalez, Gilbert George. "The System of Public Education and Its Function within the Chicano Communities, 1920-1930." PhD diss, University of California, Los Angeles, 1974.
- Harris, Richard E. *Black Heritage in Arizona* (Phoenix, AZ: Phoenix Urban League, 1977).
- Hayes, William. *Horace Mann's Vision of the Public Schools: Is It Still Relevant?* Toronto: Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2006.
- Hoffman, Nancy. *Woman's "True" Profession: Voices from the History of Teaching*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press, 2003.
- Holmes, Madelyn, and Beverly Weiss. *Lives of Women Public Schoolteachers: Scenes from American Educational History*. New York: Garland Publishing, 1995.
- Hood, Edmund Lyman. *The New West Commission 1880-1893*. Jacksonville, FL: H. and W. B. Drew Company, 1905.
- Lamar, Howard R. *The Far Southwest, 1846-1912: A Territorial History*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2000.

- Lomawaima, K. Tsianina. "Domesticity in the Federal Indian Schools: The Power of Authority over Mind and Body," *American Ethnologist* 20, no. 2 (1993): 227-240.
- Lomawaima, K. Tsiannina. *They Called it Prarie Light: The Story of Chilocco Indian School*. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1994.
- Lucero, Herman Robert. "Plessy to Brown: Education of Mexican Americans in Arizona Public Schools during the Era of Segregation." Ph.D. diss, University of Arizona, 2005.
- Mason Hart, John Mason. *Revolutionary Mexico: The Coming and Process of the Mexican Revolution*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.
- McAfee, Ward M. *Religion, Race, and Reconstruction: The Public School in the Politics of the 1870s*. New York, NY: State University of New York Press, 1998.
- Menaul School Centennial Committee. *Menaul School Centennial*. Albuquerque, NM: Menaul School Centennial Special Committee, 1981.
- Mondragón, John B., and Ernest B. Stapleton, *Public Education in New Mexico*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2005.
- Moreno, Mavel. "History of Bilingual Education: Spanish Inclusion in New Mexico Schools, 1890-1941." M.A. Thesis, University of New Mexico, 2004.
- Núñez-Janes, Mariela. "Bilingual Education and Identity Debates in New Mexico: Constructing and Contesting Nationalism and Ethnicity," *Journal of the Southwest* 44, no. 1, History and Community (Spring, 2002): 61-78.
- Obregón, Alvaro. *Ocho Mil Kilómetros en Campaña*. México, D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1959.
- Ovando, Carlos, Mary Carol Combs, Virginia P. Collier. *Bilingual and ESL Classrooms: Teaching in Multicultural Contexts*. Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill Higher Education, 2006.
- Parra, Carlos Francisco. "Valientes Nogalenses: The 1918 Battle Between the U.S. and Mexico that Transformed Ambos Nogales." *Journal of Arizona History* 51, no. 1 (Spring 2010): 1-32.
- Piñera Ramírez, David. *Historiografía de la Frontera Norte de México: Balance y Metas de Investigación*. Mexicali: Universidad Autónoma de Baja California, 1990.

- Powers, Jeanne M. "Forgotten History: Mexican American School Segregation in Arizona from 1900-1951." *Equity and Excellence in Education* 41 (2008): 467-481.
- Read, Benjamin M., "Education and its Relations with the Discovery, Conquest and Civilization of New Mexico. The Minister of God and the Teacher." Lecture, New Mexico Educational Association, Santa Fe, NM, November 15, 1911.
- Ready, Alma. *Nogales, Arizona 1880-1980: Centennial Anniversary*. Nogales, AZ: Nogales Centennial Committee, 1980.
- Rochlin, Fred and Harriet. "The Heart of Ambos Nogales: Boundary Monument 122." *Journal of Arizona History* 17, no. 2 (Summer 1976): 161-180.
- Rodríguez, Abelardo Luján. *Autobiografía*. México, D.F.: Novaro Editores, 1962.
- Roosevelt, Theodore. "American Ideals" in *American Ideals and Other Essays, Social and Political*. New York: G.P. Putnam's and Sons, 1900.
- Ruiz, Richard. "Orientations in Language Planning." *NABE: The Journal for the National Association of Bilingual Education* 8, 1984: 15-34.
- Sánchez, George I. *Concerning Segregation of Spanish-Speaking Children in the Public Schools*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1951.
- Schmid, Carol. "The Politics of English Only in the United States: Historical, Social, and Legal Aspects." In *Language Ideologies: Critical Perspectives on the Official English Movement*, eds. Roseann Dueñas Gonzalez, Ildiko Melis. Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English, 2000: 62-86.
- Scott, James. *The Art of Not Being Governed: An Anarchist History of Upland Southeast Asia*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2010.
- Sheridan, Thomas. *Arizona: A History*. Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona Press, 1995.
- Simmons, Marc. *Albuquerque: A Narrative History*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1982.
- Spring, Joel. *Deculturalization and the Struggle for Equality: A Brief History of the Education of Dominated Cultures in the United States*. New York: McGraw Hill Higher Education, 2007.
- Stevens, Darryl. "The Menaul School: A Study of Cultural Convergence." PhD. diss., University of Houston, 1999.

- Sugg, Jr., Redding S. *Mother Teacher: The Feminization of American Education*. Charlottesville, VA: University Press of Virginia, 1978.
- Tinker Salas, Miguel. *In the Shadow of the Eagles: Sonora and the Transformation of the Border During the Porfiriato*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.
- Tupper, Ralph C. "A Survey of the Arizona Public School System: A Study of the Elementary and Secondary Public Schools of the State." Phoenix, AZ: Gazette Print Company, 1925.
- Trennert, Jr., Robert A. *The Phoenix Indian School: Forced Assimilation in Arizona, 1891-1935*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1988.
- Wallace Adams, David. *Education for Extinction: American Indians and the Boarding School Experience, 1875-1928*. Lawrence, KS: University Press of Kansas, 1995.
- Whaley, Charlotte. *Nina Otero-Warren of Santa Fe*. Santa Fe, NM: Sunstone Press, 2007.
- Weber, David J., ed. *Foreigners in Their Native Land: Historical Roots of the Mexican Americans*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 1973.
- Weiler, Kathleen. *Country Schoolwomen: Teaching in Rural California, 1850-1950*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1998.
- White, Richard. *The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650-1815*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Zsembik, Barbara A. and Daniel Llanes. "Generational Differences in Educational Attainment Among Mexican Americans." *Social Science Quarterly* 77, no. 2 (June 1996): 363-374.

Census and Other Governmental Sources

- Gibson, Campbell, and Kay Jung. "Historical Census Statistics on Population Totals By Race, 1790 to 1990, and By Hispanic Origin, 1970 to 1990, For The United States, Regions, Divisions, and States." In *Working Paper Series* no. 56. Washington, D.C.: Population Division U.S. Census Bureau, 2002.
<http://www.census.gov/population/www/documentation/twps0056/twps0056.html#gd> (Accessed Feb. 12, 2013).
- New Mexico Special Revenue Commission. *Report on the New Mexico Educational Institutions to the New Mexico Special Revenue Commission*. Santa Fe, NM: Santa Fe New Mexico Publishing Corporation, 1921.

U.S. Bureau of the Census. *Fourteenth Census of the United States – State Compendium – Arizona*. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1924.

U.S. Bureau of the Census. “U.S. Census Bureau Delivers New Mexico's 2010 Census Population Totals, Including First Look at Race and Hispanic Origin Data for Legislative Redistricting.” In *United States Census 2010*, Bureau of the Census, Washington, D.C., March 15, 2011.
<http://2010.census.gov/news/releases/operations/cb11-cn87.html> (Accessed April 2, 2012).

Unpublished Papers

Harrington, Eldred R. “History of the Albuquerque High School: 1879-1955.” Typescript, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, 1955.

Ojeda, Ricardo. “The Forgotten Color of a Brown and White Border: Black Soldiers in Nogales, Arizona 1918-1933.” Unpublished paper, University of Arizona, n.d., in possession of the author.