Developing music teacher identities: An international multi-site study
Julie Ballantyne, Jody Kerchner and José Luis Aróstegui

Version submitted to journal for publication.

INTRODUCTION:

It has long been argued that teacher practice is determined by much more than the intersection between teacher education and the teaching context. Indeed, *teacher identity* and *pre-service teacher identity* both arguably have a prominent role to play in teacher praxis (Beijaard, Meijer, & Verloop, 2004; Díez & Raths, 2007; Hallam, 2006; Knowles, 1992; Sachs, 2005). 'Teacher identity' as a construct, however, has been used to represent multiple things, from teacher perceptions of what they do in the classroom, to enacted pedagogies in the classroom, to observed teacher dispositions, to discourses among individuals as a "community" of professionals is established.

Teacher identity has also been associated (in music education) with multiple 'musical identities' – a quite different idea related to musical preferences, teacher skills, and the alternation between the roles of musician and educator (Hargreaves, Purves, Welch, & Marshall, 2007). Central to teachers' practices in the music classroom are their understandings of themselves in terms of their core identity (Gee, 2001) and the sub-identities they assume as music educators.

Negotiation and reconciliation of these perceived identities/selves may directly influence the quality of classroom music instruction employed by teachers (Hallam, 2006) and pre-service music teachers' (hereafter PSMTs) motivations for continuing in music

1

teacher education programs. The relationship between teacher identity and classroom

practice can be thus summarised:

> It provides a framework for teachers to construct their own ideas of
> 'how to be', 'how to act' and 'how to understand' their work and their
> place in society. Importantly, teacher identity is not something that is
> fixed nor is it imposed; rather it is negotiated through experience and the
> sense that is made of that experience. (Sachs, 2005, p. 15)

In much the same way, Lauriala and Kukkonen (2005) consider identity and self-concept to

be simultaneously stable and dynamic. Their model of identity formation includes three

facets: 1) the current, dominant self, 2) the self defined by society and culture as

"acceptable", and 3) the ideal self as defined by an individual as her or his goal "self."

Notwithstanding the various definitions and conceptions of 'professional identity',

this paper draws primarily on the work of Beijaard, Meijer, & Verloop (2004), in that it

emphasises the personal description of professional identity. Four aspects of this

conceptualisation are important to note – firstly, professional identity is not fixed, and the

interpretation and reinterpretation of events enables individuals to change their perceptions of

their professional selves. Secondly, context plays an important part in professional identity

formation, where individuals negotiate their way through particular professional contexts.

Thirdly, self-perception is socially legitimated, as it is influenced by expressed or

unexpressed perceptions and impressions of others. Fourthly, teachers' professional identities

may comprise many sub-identities (particularly towards the beginning of a career), which

then later combine to form a holistic conception of professional identity (Beijaard, et al.,

2004).

For the purposes of this paper, we (the authors) are interested in investigating how to

facilitate the development of teacher identity prior to graduation from university, based on

PSMTs' self-reports. Whilst we acknowledge that much literature suggests 'identity' is

largely a complex and unconscious notion, we are interested in the conscious identity – how

pre-service music teachers define their own identity and influences on their identity (as identified by them).

Previous work in music education (Bouij, 1998; Hargreaves, et al., 2007; Mark, 1998; Pellegrino, 2009; Scheib, 2006) reveals that pre-service teachers view their identities as either 'discipline expert' or 'teacher', largely depending on their experiences prior to teacher education. Much of this work has also focussed on the nature of teaching music – the skills and qualities required to teach music. It is likely, however, that the skills and abilities of teachers may differ from the ways they perceive themselves. That is, perceived identity is likely to have a large impact on the ways that the skills and abilities of the teacher are translated into practice: "developing a personal pedagogy results from the interaction between an individual's beliefs and skills" (Dolloff, 1999, p. 193). Ballantyne (2005) suggests that musical self efficacy (how a teacher perceives their own musical abilities) is likely to sway a teacher's professional identity – that is, the 'better' they feel they are at performing music, the more likely they will perceive themselves to be a 'musician', and if they perceive their musical abilities to be lacking, they are more likely to see themselves as a music teacher. Hallam, et al. (2009) similarly found that confidence in teaching music is dependent on the amount of musical training generalist teachers receive in their teacher education programs. Thus, a pervading idea in the literature is that the best music teachers are also capable musicians (Kerchner, 2006, 2010; Mills, 2004), and Bouij (2004) posits that the discipline (music education) translates this into the valuing of music-specific identities over pupil-centred teacher identities.

Extant research, therefore, would suggest that pre-service music teachers perceive themselves as somewhere along the continuum of teacher-musician, perhaps depending on their particular role, on how 'good' they are at performing music, on the model of

musicianship and teaching provided by their pre-service teacher education, and on the potential collision there might be between the actual and designated identities (Sfard & Prusak, 2005) as music teachers.

Methodology

This article explores pre-service teachers' perceptions of their own identity, across three continents. In so doing, it answers the call to more cross-cultural research in the area of developing music teacher identities (Austin, Isbell & Russell, 2010)

In this research paper, we discuss how pre-service music teachers (PSMTs) construct their professional identity within their unique institutional contexts, social backgrounds, and university experiences. This study might be considered a "qualitative multi-site study," as it uses multiple sites (in three different continents) to qualitatively (through interviews) explore the same issue (see Hallam et. al. for another example of this in the area).

We chose to investigate pre-service music teachers' perceptions in the countries where we, the authors, were teaching, since we had access to PSMTs who might be interested in participating in our study. We initially found considerable similarities between our contexts in terms of the types of students who were studying to be music teachers and were determined to find out the extent to which student's developing identities in our various contexts were similar and different. We therefore launched a study across three sites in order to examine how pre-service music teachers in these three contexts defined their professional identity.

The research questions were the same in every site, and were interpreted and adjusted sensitively to take account of any contextual differences. These similarities and differences across the sites are described briefly in Figure 1 and below. Crucially, it should be noted that all participants were students involved in university-level programmes designed to prepare

students to become music specialist teachers. Participants in this study are not, for example, generalist teachers who were interested in music education. We also endeavoured to ensure that the number of participants involved was similar in each of the research sites.

Whilst all of the students were music education students (studying to become music teachers), there were various permutations of length of study, emphasis on music performance, and education theory within the various degrees. The students from Spain came from a long-established university (of more than 500 years) with a solid international reputation. The music teacher education program is taught at the Faculty of Education where there are around 5,000 students, with about 350 of these being students enrolled in music education.

The students from the USA came from a small liberal arts college that hosts a Conservatory of Music, established in 1833. Music education, taught by four full-time music education faculty, is the only teacher education program offered on campus. Undergraduate music education students are required to take private voice or instrument lessons in seven of eight semesters of the degree program. Students are admitted to the Conservatory and music education programs based on their demonstrated music performance skills during an audition and students remain in the music education program based on the faculty's annual evaluation of the students' academic, musical, and pedagogical skills. All music education students incur experiences in their music education methods courses ("methods courses" are defined as those curricular courses and field experiences that directly teach music pedagogy, teaching presentational styles, and presentational skills in the areas of instrumental, choral, and general music rehearsals and/or music classroom music).

The students from Australia came from three universities, and were all studying to become Primary School music specialists. In order to be a qualified music teacher, the students were

required to complete at least four years of full-time undergraduate study in music and education. Amongst the participants, some were enrolled in concurrent music and education degrees (requiring advanced levels of knowledge and skills in both music and education), two were doing a one year diploma in education (following a completed music degree) whilst three were enrolled in a four year education degree with a substantial music major. Accordingly, whilst there were significant similarities across the sites, it is important to note that in Australia, the music component is located within a School of Music or Conservatoire, and the education component located within a School (or Faculty) of Education. Similarly in Spain, the music component occurs in a Conservatoire, except for the pre-service music teacher education, which occurs primarily in the College of Education. In the USA, both components occur in the Conservatory of Music. Most of the students in the USA and Australia have jobs related and unrelated to music teaching whilst studying, but employment is quite uncommon for students in Spain.

Figure 1: Demographic and methodological characteristics across the three research sites

	Number of students	Year of study	General description of participants
Spain	8	First and third (final) year of study.	All are music education majors. Most are between 18 and 21 years old. Four male, Four female interviewees. Seven are unemployed, whilst one has a job. Four are studying an education degree concurrently with a music degree at the Conservatory.

USA	8	All in final year of four-year degrees in music education.	All are music education majors preparing to become music teachers of classroom music and/or teachers of performing ensembles (N=2 general/choral music education emphasis; N=6 band and orchestral music education emphasis; N=3 completing a double major in music performance and music education). All 21 years of age. Two males, Six females. All live off-campus, but within walking distance of the college. All have jobs teaching music or other area while they were in the undergraduate programs.
Australia	9	All in final year of study prior to graduating as a qualified teacher. Studying at three different universities. Minimum 4 years of university study completed.	All have a major in music (some with a concurrent or prior degree in music). Most (N=8) are 21-24 years age although one is 45. One participant is male. Half of the students live with their parents, whilst the other half live out of home. One lives with spouse and two children. All (except 1) have jobs which engage them for around 20 hours/week.

At each site, semi-structured questioning techniques were employed in order to allow for the key questions to be asked, but not to negate the interview moving in new directions as it developed. The questions relevant to this paper were:

> What are pre-service teachers' perceptions of music teaching and music teacher education; and
> What is the nature of PSMT identities at the end of their university studies?

To probe deeper, the interview schedule also included these questions:

> How do you expect to learn how to teach?
> What do you see as the role of the university course in your development as a music teacher?
> How would you describe the job of a classroom music teacher to someone who is completely unfamiliar with what you do?
> What qualities do you possess that would enable you to become an effective music teacher?
> What do you understand by the term 'professional identity'?
> How would you describe your professional identity?

In Spain, a doctoral student carried out the interview with first-year students, because the investigator of that site was the participants' teacher, and wanted to avoid any undue influence on the results. The group interview was employed as a strategy to allow students to feel comfortable instead of conducting individual, private interviews. The data collection in the USA was similarly conducted via a single focus-group interview on campus, because the student participants expressed that they would feel more comfortable meeting as a group with the author as interviewer, and that they wanted to hear others' responses to the questions. In Australia, we used telephone interviews, because the students were all at different institutions, and were consequently unknown to one another (and to the interviewer). It was determined that individual telephone interview would best allow for sufficient detail to reflect the individual students' stories.

Comparison forms the foundation of this research study. While the differences in institutions, music teacher education programs, and interview processes provide slight variation in collection of data, this can be seen as a real strength of the project, allowing reflection on any golden threads of commonality among the PSMTs in various venues: "When the comparisons are acknowledged to come from tentative and evolving views of the evaluand and when the multiple realities of participating stakeholders are taken into account, then the misuse of comparison is diminished" (Stake & Schwandt, 2006, p. 412). Finding commonalities within three distinct programs might offer even stronger conclusions than if we had consciously sought similar programs to investigate.

The authors followed Creswell's (2005) stages of content analysis, in order to determine the key themes emerging in response to our research questions. Content analysis was conducted separately, and then compared across the research sites and re-considered until the two themes, which were consistent, clearly emerged. The researchers had access to and reflected on all transcribed (and translated) data, to ensure consistency of interpretation.

Further, the authors viewed the data in terms of the facets of teacher identity suggested by Beijaard, et al. (2004): teacher identity as dynamic, socially-legitimated, contextual, and comprising multiple sub-identities.

Findings and Discussion

In analysing the data across the three sites, we noticed that there were significant similarities in terms of the influence of pre-university experiences and expectations in each context, and the perception of the role of 'music teacher' in each context. These similarities will be detailed before the presentation of the data and analysis.

Across each of the three sites, it seems that students were enrolled in becoming music teachers largely because:

- They were oriented towards music, and because they loved it and wanted to continue with music as a career;
- They loved teaching and (largely due to experiences prior to university) wanted to emulate teaching mentors (mostly music teachers); and,
- Circumstances had dictated that music education was the best/most convenient option for them at the time when they enrolled.

There were, in most cases, variations across these orientations, yet the similarities in orientation across the sites are certainly interesting. The ways that students viewed their role as mostly passive in the development of their teacher identity, drawing largely on their pre-university experiences and then again passively from their university experiences, highlights the importance of university study in guiding students towards viewing themselves as shapers of their own identities and professional destinies. It confirms the generalisability of literature that has in the past focussed on single populations of students, and emphasises the importance in teacher education, of addressing the pre-university experiences and influences when preparing students to be teachers of music (Pellegrino, 2009; Scheib, 2006).

The PSMTs' perceptions regarding what it means to be a music teacher, certainly have an impact on their professional identities whilst as students, and then as teachers. Across the three contexts there were clear similarities regarding what the PSMTs understood 'music teaching' to be. While the realities of teaching music, and the structures of their pre-service programs across the three contexts differed, the PSMTs seemed to focus on behaviour management, and inspiring the students to enjoy and engage in music. Accordingly, even as the actual role of being a music teacher may differ across contexts, the issues that mostly concern these students seem to be fairly consistent.

Emergent from the data were two themes that clearly articulated similarities in the developing identities of pre-service music teachers. Overall, it seems that pre-service teachers across the three sites viewed their identities as dynamic - moving between 'discipline expert' and 'teacher'. This trend was influenced by their pre-university experiences, and they acknowledge that during their pre-service teacher education, their understandings of what it means to be a specialist teacher evolved from a narrow understanding (focussing largely on music), to a broader understanding (taking into account larger educational issues and approaches). These themes - "university experiences, evolving from narrow to broad" and the "dynamic relationship between the musician and teacher" - will be explored below, with a general discussion to follow.

Theme 1: **University experiences, evolving from narrow to broad -** *USA:*

At the time of the interview, each of the American study participants (five collegiate music education majors; three music education and music performance majors) had completed at least 400 hours of student teaching music in either an elementary- or secondary-school music setting in the local public schools. Prior to their full-time student teaching

semesters, study participants each experienced an average of 300 hours of practice teaching in teaching laboratories and in-class peer teachings that accompanied their music education methods courses.

As final-year students reflected on their perceptions about their learning to become a music teacher, the PSMTs agreed that "factual knowledge was secondary to field experiences." This was not the case in the PSMTs' first year in the music education program. PSMT 4 stated, "I thought most of it [learning] was going to be through observation. We would learn mostly procedural things, such as dealing with student behaviour." PSMT 2 continued, "I really expected that I would just be learning to teach by being spoken to in a classroom, which I was wrong about."

Contradicting their initial quest for knowledge about pedagogical technique as first-year music education students, the PSMTs in their final semester of the music education program relied more on their own practice teaching experience and constructed knowledge about teaching, rather than solely on their professor's imparted knowledge of teaching. The PSMTs saw themselves as active agents—self-informants—of learning, practicing, reflecting, and refining as they developed their personal teaching style and identity. They identified with being creators of their own knowledge rather than simply as a recipient of knowledge from an external source, thus demonstrating a dynamic shift (Beijaard, et al., 2004) in their understandings of their roles and responsibilities in the teaching-learning process.

Further, the pre-service teachers interviewed recognised that, while they all had experience teaching private music lessons to younger students, they needed pedagogical strategies in order to be able to nurture the musical abilities of diverse groups (music classes) of learners. Teaching private lessons was only one context (Beijaard, et al., 2004) through which they might navigate as music educators. These PSMTs recognized that teaching

classes of learners required them to develop different pedagogical strategies, presentational skills, and ways to manage the learning environment.

The PSMTs noted that their required collegiate liberal arts courses (24 credit hours), along with the music theory and music history courses (27 credit hours) also informed their teaching practice. About the importance of the liberal arts courses, PSMT 3 stated, "I saw them as a way to help broaden our horizons, because I personally feel that educators should not just know about…music. They should try to know as much as they can about art, science, math, English, and literature. You can help your students broaden their horizons, too, because of the way [teachers] can incorporate information from other subjects into the music classroom." PSMT 1 stated, "In addition, [teachers] can help the students make connections within the music class…"

Music education methods classes provided the pedagogical and theoretical underpinnings that supported the PSMTs' actual practice teaching. The PSMTs considered the collegiate music education courses to be important foundations for their teaching, since they provided factual "knowledge" about teaching. Yet, it was the field experiences and student teaching that became the PSMTs' primary sources for learning how to teach and interact with students.

Upon graduation, PSMTs at the conservatory of music are licensed to teach general, choral, and instrumental music, in grades pre-kindergarten through to Year 12. They recognized and appreciated the breadth and depth of preparation provided within the music education program. Consequently, the PSMTs stated they became more confident and knowledgeable as music teachers and musicians because of the curricular experiences in and outside of the music education program.

Theme 1: **University experiences, evolving from narrow to broad -** *SPAIN:*

The pre-service music teachers in Spain felt that their prior experiences in music and education really influenced their decision to study music teacher education as well as their understandings of what comprises 'music education'. One of the interviewed students shared their story, saying that they enrolled in the music teacher education programme because *"when I was a child my mother was very ill. I saw how music helped her a lot. This is why I'm here"* [PSMT 2]. By and large, the first-year students interviewed had a greater interest in music than in music education or in educational issues: *"I like music very much. I'm here because of the music rather than because of education"* [PSMT 3]. This affinity with music rather than teaching music (at least at the beginning of their degree) was consistent across all the students interviewed in this site.

As they progressed through their studies, the Spanish students increasingly seemed to change their minds about the balance that musical and instructional components should have in the lives of a developing music teacher. This was evident in final-year students' expanded interests in educational components of music teachers' roles, although the students still perceived themselves primarily as musicians: *"the educational side of music education is more important for me because I think I already have the basic music skills to be trained in Music Education"* [PSMT 6]. By their final year, students mentioned the importance of the educational side of their job more frequently than their first-year college-mates, prioritising instructional training or 'instructional training related to music' over music performance instruction. In the words of one of these students, "the most important thing for me is to know how to encourage other people by using motivation and how to attract their attention to music" [PSMT 8]. Some students even commented on the importance of courses such as Psychology of Education during their practicum period, although the majority of students' comments related specifically to music-education issues. By and large, it could be said that

over the course of their degree, the students in this site expanded their horizons about the mission and purpose of music education, but they did not forget their origins, nor relinquish their roles, as musicians.

As they were engaged in instructional issues, students gradually changed their identity, giving a more balanced attention to musical and educational aspects of their training as music teachers *("I think both [music skills and instruction] have the same value [in the programme]"* [PSMT 6]), than just developing skills as musicians. Yet, for most students being a musician is still a major focus. This is likely because of the model of music teacher supported by the degree program in which they are enrolled. Students' perceptions reflect the dichotomy between music teacher as specialist and music teacher as a general teacher.

Theme 1: **University experiences, evolving narrow to broad -** ***AUSTRALIA:***

The Australian interviews were rich with pre-service music teachers' changing perceptions of themselves as they grew into the role of music teacher, revealing both increased perceptions of confidence as their skills increased, as well as demonstrating a developing and more secure self-awareness and identity. The responses by the participants in this site showed that they were keen to learn the "tools of the trade" as they increasingly saw themselves taking on the role of music specialist.

> *"It's just developed from or evolved from just a general idea of having a goal at the end of the course where I'd be teaching to specifically having a clear idea of what is involved in teaching and exactly what my role is....After my last practice...I'd learnt an awful lot but it's let me realise that I'm just beginning. I still have got a lot to learn about just being comfortable in the classroom."* [PSMT 2]

Pre-service music teachers in this study context elaborated on this idea, explaining the importance of having the opportunity to put into practice the skills they consciously learnt

during their tertiary study as well as to experiment with "wearing" the role of teacher, modelling behaviours they see in their lecturers or supervising classroom teachers.

> *"I think I really started to develop my professional identity on practicum...[just] jumping in the deep end…[also] watching and interacting with lecturers at uni ...you think 'I've watched them and what they do, I might try that out'....I think it's been just modelling from lecturers and getting out there and trying it myself." [PSMT 4]*

A common response to the value of practicum placements is that they afforded the opportunity to learn about "managing" classroom environments and "engaging" the students. While not all respondents made the connection between these two, they were acutely aware that they needed to learn the non-musical skills to enable their students to share their own enthusiasm for music.

Students in this site revealed an awareness of the importance of practicum placements in developing specific skills. There were also many responses that suggest important changes were taking place for them in relation to less tangible, and perhaps less measurable, developments. Students' self reflection was clearly an important element in terms of clarifying their teacher identity as well as identifying the assumptions they made about music in their lives.

> *"I came to uni thinking that I would get all the answers and I would get everything that I needed but I think uni gives you like a really good foundation for…what you need and then it's really up to you to do the rest." [PSMT 6]*

Summary: **University experiences, evolving from narrow to broad**

The broadening effect of teacher education in terms of pre-service teachers' conceptions of their future professional lives is evident across each of the contexts investigated. The finding that students' understandings of the profession are firstly very focussed on the discipline (music), and then expand to incorporate many other aspects over the degree, provides credence to the argument that teacher education has the potential to impact positively on

developing professional identity. The broadening effect seen in these pre-service music teachers' perceptions of their professional identity reflects the *ongoing process* of teacher professional identity discussed by Beijaard et al. (2004), in that it allows for both interpretation and re-interpretation of the answers to questions such as "who am I?" and "who do I want to become?". It also reflects the balancing of sub-identities described by Beijaard et al. (2004), in that the students are gradually coming to understand the ways that their practice and personal identities as both musicians and educators can by 'harmonised'.

It is expected that this broadening would continue into the early years of teaching. Indeed, Sheib (2006) argues that the rapid broadening of identity that occurs in the early years of teaching has the potential to contribute to role stress (indicating a less positive outcome of the broadening effect). In particular, he noted that the lack of support for those teachers who find themselves in environments where the specific 'artist/musician' identity is *not* most valued (in contradiction to the many years of study that emphasise the importance of this identity – see Bouij (2004)), can contribute to burnout amongst early-career music teachers.

Theme 2: **Dynamic relationship between musician and teacher -** *USA*

As mentioned earlier, the PSMTs were about to graduate from a music education program situated in a Conservatory of Music, having an international performance profile and joined to a liberal arts college. How then did they come to terms with the conservatory expectations to develop their musicianship and performance skills and the music education program's expectations to develop their musicianship and pedagogical skills? PSMT 3 remarked that, although student teaching was the culminating experience that solidified her desire to teach music, it was not just that event that contributed to her identity formation as "teacher." In fact, she suggested that it was a "gradual process" over the course of four years in the music education program.

"Because we were in a certain professional program and because we were training for a specific type of job, I think we formed a more particular identity than being, say, a philosophy major. I doubt most philosophy majors leave here saying, 'I'm a philosopher.' Yet the music education program says that I'm going to be a music teacher. It really puts you into a very specific role, and you're taught that for all four years [of the music education] program." [PSMT 3]

Other PSMTs grappled with defining themselves as a teacher, a music teacher, or a musician; some suggested that their identity and teacher roles changed along a continuum. For most, the role assumption was fluid, depending on the situation in the classroom or ensemble and on the type of professional skills that the situation required of them. In light of Beijaard et al. (2004), the students spoke to the multiple sub-identities and the tension that can exist if they had to assume only one of the roles as "primary identity."

"For different classes, the role changes. In student teaching, I felt more of a student teacher. With the [less experienced music students], I was teaching the basics to this group. Not that I wasn't asking them to emote or to be expressive, because I was. That's what changes the teacher role into a music teacher. When it came to the school's most select ensemble, then I think the role starts to be pushed more on the continuum towards musician. I would say there is a continuum teacher-musician-music teacher… the role moves back and forth on the continuum depending on the skill and knowledge of the ensemble." [PSMT 1]

"I would say I teach music. I wouldn't want to pick either a musician, music teacher, or a teacher." [PSMT 6]

"I developed confidence in this program. There is no separation between musician and teacher in my thinking about myself." [PSMT 7]

Theme 2: **Dynamic relationship between musician and teacher - *SPAIN***

Initially, students in Spain perceived themselves more as musicians than teachers, so their interest in the programme was firstly in the development of their music skills, then the development of their pedagogical skills. Thus, a student in her last year said about her first-

year colleagues, "their music skills are really low. These pre-service teachers are potential 'music killers' [when in schools] [PSMT 7]." It is obvious that music teachers have to be proficient with music content knowledge and skill but, according to the role of music teacher supported by these students, it seems that, for them, being a skilled musician is equated with being an effective music teacher. The role of 'teacher' seems to be ancillary to the role of 'musician'.

This university's separation of musical and pedagogical courses is reflected in the students' perceptions of their professional identities. The students in this study felt that the perceived separation of 'musician' and 'teacher' could be addressed, in part, through addressing the university program's course structure: "I think they [music and education issues] should be more interrelated in the program" [PSMT 6]. At the end of the students' music teacher training, third-year students tended to desire greater access to instructional tools and strategies, as required by their work as music teachers:

> "There is always time to get training on technique. For this reason the instructional side of music education is more important for me because I think I already have the basic music knowledge to be trained in Music Education. Therefore, I require more information about how to teach rather than about the music-content knowledge necessary to be taught [PSMT 5]."

Theme 2: Dynamic relationship between musician and teacher - AUSTRALIA

In much the same way as in the other contexts, the relationship between 'musician' and 'teacher' was difficult for the Australian participants to define. Participants in Australia understood that there were certain "teacher specific" skills needed for their future role as music teachers, which shifts the "teacher role" to the forefront at certain times:

> "I think there [are] certain teaching skills that would go across any sort of specialty area or even general classroom teaching." [PSMT 2]

Relating these teaching skills to music-specific lesson content seemed to be quite easy for those pre-service music teachers who had had considerable experience with a diversity of music-making activities.

> "In my choir, I'm the conductor, in another choir I'm the accompanist. When I'm teaching my students, I'm their music teacher. When I'm teaching in a school environment, I'm a classroom music teacher....There [are] many different roles." [PSMT 9]

However, some participants recognised that the process of becoming a music teacher actually helped define and strengthen both their skills and identity as a musician. Some participants indicated that moving between both roles was not only advantageous but a necessary part of their work, helping to develop both their skills as a teacher as well as those of a musician in a continual cycle of learning.

> "Being a teacher is a part of who I am both at school and out of school as well….I'm a musician and I'm also a teacher....I do perform continually around the place and I certainly have a great love of music and I'm also a teacher in that I don't just teach music, I also teach children social skills and a whole range of other things that are overlapping other areas of their classroom. [PSMT 5]

> "I feel that I've come out a lot better musician by doing music education as opposed to music performance just because of the strong musicianship and, you know, having to teach what you've just learnt over the past few years at uni." [PSMT 9]

Theme 2: Dynamic relationship between musician and teacher - Summary

The negotiation of identities between 'musician' and 'teacher' was clearly seen in this enquiry across the contexts investigated. This theme also relates to the features of professional identity raised by Beijaard et. al (2004), in particular the relationship between person and context and the negotiation of sub-identities. As the students become more and more familiar with their future teaching contexts (through study, and through practicum experiences), they are more able to think about their identities as musicians and as teachers, and the ways that these sub-identities can be harmonized. The emphasis placed on music and the musician identity as being the most valued of these identities by some of the students is

interesting, and potentially problematic —the danger being that PSMTs who identify predominantly as musicians may "replicate past practices, including traditional notions of music teacher identity" (Woodford, 2002, p 676), as they undermine the importance of education knowledge and skills in comparison with music knowledge and skills.

It is also likely that the emphasis on music skills found in pre-service teacher education courses may result in the solidifying of the musician identity over all others. Whilst music skills and knowledge are unarguably crucial for the developing teacher (particularly when considering their relevance to the construction of adolescents and children's identities), pedagogical content knowledge and skills, as well as general educational knowledge and skills are vital components of effective teachers' practice.

This issue is reflected in the work of Bernard (2004) who explored the tensions between music making and music teaching for music educators. She was interested in exploring what she calls the "contentious topic" of the "artist-teacher" and questioned whether it is necessary to choose between the two roles, artist or teacher. She argues that artist-teachers do not describe themselves as being predominately an artist or a teacher, rather asserting that they are closely related. She asserts that, until recently, it was believed that a classroom music teacher must make a choice between a musician and teacher identity, whereas today the complementary nature of the two roles means that music teachers gain more credibility when students know the other roles they perform outside of the classroom. This view is supported by Sfard and Prusak (2005) who claimed that *"learning may be thought of closing the gap between actual identity and designated identity"* (p.14) which, in our case, means that music teacher training should close the gap for PSMT between being musicians and becoming teachers. Austin et al. (2010) similarly assert that "labelling oneself as 'musician' or 'teacher' may not be nearly as important as committing to habits of mind

and building meaningful relationships that optimize the teaching, learning, performing, and appreciation of music in all of its manifestations" (p. 17).

Teacher preparation programs have the responsibility to assist students in finding a balance between their roles as musical 'technician' and 'teacher' in the music classroom, negotiating the relative roles that the two sub-identities play in their professional work. Competent trained musicians who are also creative educators should be those who offer musical experiences to pupils in the schools. Opportunities for pre-service teachers to practise these roles during music teacher education courses might be a valuable way for students to become conscious of an "either-or" identity as music educator. After all, not every pupil these novice music educators will teach will have the intent of becoming a performing musician, as there are many viable ways to interact with musical sound. By assuming a "musician only" role, teachers can lock students out of the naturally-inclusive musical community.

Implications

The two themes (the dynamic relationship between musician and teacher, and the evolving/broadening identity) that emerged clearly across each of the three contexts confirmed that music teacher education has a distinct and crucial role in the development of positive music teacher identities. In particular, the developing identities of discipline specialists (i.e., music educators) may be preventing pre-service music teachers from valuing university subjects that do not focus specifically on their chosen discipline area. This discipline-specific focus may also prevent pre-service music teachers from being able to make 'links' between these general subjects and their future context as music teachers. On the other hand, developing the 'musician' side of music teachers' identities may ensure the depth of musical experience and content knowledge needed in developing confidence in

novice teachers entering the music education profession. Reflection on professional identity in the pre-service course may enable pre-service and early-career music teachers to become aware of the possible impact of identity on their ability to cope. It may therefore be desirable to guide pre-service teachers in deconstructing their professional identities. By engaging in such reflection, early-career music teachers will arguably develop the skills to reflect and consolidate their developing professional identities and therefore improve as effective classroom practitioners. Therefore our research suggests that:

- Students transition from self-perception as musicians to music teachers (broadening effect). Most of them still separate these identities at the end their studies, although this may be reflective of the structures of the programs and the emphasis of the studies during teacher education. According to Beijaard et. al. (2004) the harmonization of these sub-identities is desirable, and should be begun through reflection and self-discovery activities in the pre-service teacher education courses. It is possible that general arts courses may help PSMTs make connections for themselves (i.e., how music fits into the general education of a person) and can help PSMTs make connections for their own students (i.e., help students relate music to other areas of study or to their cultural situation);

- PSMTs rely on their experiences with performance to teach others about music, and vice versa, and to instill their passion about the art of musical performance. In learning to be an effective teacher, PSMTs became better pedagogues and musicians. Development of both areas is needed in music teacher education programs. An emphasis on the technical aspects of teaching alongside a strong development of musicianship/performance skills provides the opportunity to bolster PSMTs' confidence as music teachers, which will likely enhance their ability to be resilient in their years in the profession (engaging with the dynamic relationship between teacher and musician identities);

- It is important to assist PSMTs in transitioning from seeing their university instructors as the "givers of knowledge" about teaching, to having the PSMTs reflect on and construct their own meanings in collaboration with the "senior learner" (i.e., professor/lecturer). Lecturers need to validate and value curricular and extracurricular teaching experiences as vital to the development of PSMTs' identity. Further, teachers in higher education must acknowledge that changes in identity are slow, and sometimes painful and confusing, processes; and,

- The professional identity of students will change and develop before, and beyond music teacher education, and this window in the PSMTs life provides an opportunity to provide them with the skills to critique and respond to changes in their context, and in their perception of themselves, in a positive way. It is essential that university curricula acknowledges and builds on the preconceptions of music education that students bring with them into the music teacher education context. This acknowledgement allows students to begin to question and further develop their professional identities. Field experiences and opportunities to practice their teacher roles with "real" students are central to enhance pre-service students' abilities to confirm (or challenge) their evolving (and broadening) identities.

This project has highlighted areas of similarity and difference across three international sites. What is clear, at the completion of this project, is the importance of exploring the longitudinal development of teacher identity across multiple contexts. The developing professional identities of pre-service music teachers are arguably highly influential in determining the nature of their professional practice, once graduated (Beijaard, 2004; Flores & Day, 2006). What has also emerged is the ongoing importance of guided reflection of students' musical and pedagogical occurrences both within pre-service teacher education programs, but also continuing into the early years of teaching (Beijaard, Korthagen, & Verloop, 2007; Flores & Day, 2006; Pellegrino, 2009; Scheib, 2006).

References

Austin, J., Isbell, D., & Russell, J. (in press, published online 17 December 2010) A multi-institution exploration of secondary socialization and occupational identity among undergraduate music majors. *Psychology of Music.* 1-18.

Ballantyne, J. (2005). Identities of music teachers: Implications for teacher education. In M. Cooper (Ed.), Teacher Education: Local and Global: Australian Teacher Education Association Conference Proceedings (pp. 39-44). Gold Coast: Australian Teacher Education Association.

Beijaard, D., Korthagen, F., & Verloop, N. (2007). Understanding how teachers learn as a prerequisite for promoting teacher learning. Teachers and Teaching, 13(2), 105-108.

Beijaard, D., Meijer, P., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers' professional identity. Teaching and Teacher Education, 20(2), 107-128.

Bernard, R. (2004). A dissonant duet: discussions of music making and music teaching. Music Education Research, 6(3), 281-298.

Bouij, C. (1998). Swedish music teachers in training and professional life. International Journal of Music Education, 32, 24-31.

Creswell, J. W. (2005). Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research (2nd ed.). Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.

Díez, M.E. & Raths, J. (eds.) (2007). *Dispositions in Teacher Education.* Charlotte: IAP.

Dollof, L.A. (1999). Imagining ourselves as teachers: The development of teacher identity in music teacher education. Music Education Research, 1 (2), 191-207.

Flores, M., & Day, C. (2006). Contexts which shape and reshape new teachers' identities: A multi-perspective study. Teaching and Teacher Education, 22(2), 219-232.

Gee, J.P. (2001). Identity as an analytic lens for research in education. *Review of Research in Education,* 25, 99–125.

Hallam, S., Burnard, P., Robertson, A., Selah, C., Davies, V., Rogers, L., & Kokatsaki, D. (2009). Trainee primary-school teachers' perceptions of their effectiveness in teaching music. Music Education Research, 11(2), 221-240.

Hargreaves, D. J., Purves, R. M., Welch, G. F., & Marshall, N. A. (2007). Developing identities and attitudes in musicians and classroom music teachers. The British journal of educational psychology, 77(3), 665-682.

Kerchner, J. (2006). Collegiate metamorphosis: Tracking the transformation from female music education student to teacher. Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 169, 7-24.

Kerchner, J. (2010). Questioning the impact of collegiate music education methods courses on music teacher identity development. Paper presented at the International Society for Music Education World Congress Meeting, Beijing, China.

Knowles, J.G. (1992). Models for understanding pre-service and beginning teachers's biographies. In I.F. Goodson (ed.). *Studying teachers lives.* London: Routledge.

Lauriala, A., & Kukkonen, M. (2005). Teacher and student identities as situated cognitions. In P. Denicolo & M. Kompf (Eds.), *Connecting policy and practice: Challenges for teaching and learning in schools and universities* (pp. 199–208). Oxford: Routledge.

Mark, D. (1998). The music teacher's dilemma - musician or teacher? International Journal of Music Education, 32, 3-23.

Mills, J. (2004). Working in music: becoming a performer-teacher. Music Education Research, 6(3), 245-261.

Pellegrino, K. (2009). Connections Between Performer and Teacher Identities in Music Teachers: Setting an Agenda for Research. Journal of Music Teacher Education, 19(1), 39-55.

Sachs, J. (2005). Teacher education and the development of professional identity: Learning to be a teacher. In P. Denicolo & M. Kompf (Eds.), *Connecting policy and practice: Challenges for teaching and learning in schools and universities* (pp. 5–21). Oxford: Routledge.

Scheib, J. (2006). Policy Implications for Teacher Retention: Meeting the Needs of the Dual Identities of Arts Educators. Arts Education Policy Review, 107(6), 5-10.

Sfard, A., & Prusak, A. (2005). Telling Identities: In Search of an Analytic Tool for Investigating Learning as a Culturally Shaped Activity. Educational Researcher, 34(4), 14-22.

Stake, R.E. & Schwandt, T. (2006). On discerning quality in evaluation. In Shaw, I., Greene, J. & Mark, M. (eds.). The Sage handbook of evaluation. London: Sage.